



**ELRC
RESEARCH
REPORTS**

2000-2006

TABLE OF CONTENTS

1. ELRC Consolidated Research Reports for the years 2000-2006
2. UK and Ireland Study Research Visit Report
3. Malaysia, New Zealand and Australia Study Research Visit Report

**ELRC CONSOLIDATION
RESEARCH REPORTS
FOR THE YEARS
2000-2006**

ELRC RESEARCH STUDIES

1. INTRODUCTION

This report provides summaries of the various reports on studies commissioned by the Education Labour Relations Council (ELRC) between 2000 and 2006. The commissioned studies and the agencies which undertook them are listed in Table 1.

Table 1: Research Studies Commissioned by the ELRC – 2000-2006

Study	Agency	Date
Career Pathing and a Post Grading System for Educators	Khulisa Management Services	June 2000
Educator Work Load in South Africa	Human Sciences Research Council (HSRC)	June 2005
Workplace Policies in Public Education: A Review Focusing on HIV/AIDS	HSRC & Medical Research Council (MRC)	2005
The Health of our Educators: A Focus on HIV/AIDS in South African Public Schools, 2004/05 Survey	HSRC & MRC	2005
Educator Supply and Demand in the South African Public Education System	HSRC, MRC, Mobile Task Team on the Impact of HIV/AIDS on Education, University of KwaZulu-Natal	2005
Post-Provisioning Challenges	Centre for Education Policy Development; Education Policy Unit, Wits; Paul Musker & Associates; Psybergate (Pty) Ltd.	December 2005
Report on International Study Tours	HSRC	2006

2. CAREER PATHING AND A POST GRADING SYSTEM FOR EDUCATORS

2.1 Introduction

The Education Labour Relations Council (ELRC) commissioned a research study on Career Pathing and a Post Grading System for Educators.

The data for this study came from extensive pan-national research with educators and educator stakeholders, feedback workshops of the research results with members of ELRC chambers in all nine provinces, and continuous, consultative workshops with the ELRC's Remuneration Task Team (RTT).

The main outcome of this study was a report recommending a post grading system that met the expectations of educators and other relevant education stakeholders, and the client's requirements for career pathing and salary progression. The consortium utilised the post grading system accepted by the client to grade educator posts. The consortium then entered existing educator personnel data into a financial model, making assumptions where such data was not available, to provide costs per province for various educator career progression scenarios.

The consortium conducted the research element of this project under eight research areas. The recommendations for these areas are summarised below.

In this section, the following symbols are used:

- A bullet precedes all recommendations; and
- An arrow precedes activities outside the scope of this project that should be completed to ensure that all recommendations can be fully implemented.

2.2 Entry Level Qualifications/Salaries

- An applicable and relevant M+3, or its SAQA equivalent, should be the minimum entry-level requirement for teaching.
- Individuals with an M+3 qualification should enter the profession at salary level A (6).
- The differential between M+3 and M+4 qualified, entry-level teachers should be about 20 percent to encourage educators to enter the profession at the M+4 level.
- The salary differential between teachers with M+3 and M+4 qualifications should not be life-long, and should cancel out by the end of salary level A (6).

- The initial differential should not directly affect promotion to the next salary level, which should take into account competencies gained since the degree, for instance through experience or in-service training.

2.3 Salary Progression

Progression within a salary level or for promotion from one post to the next should take cognisance of the following:

- Criteria for the assessment should be defined and could include competencies, qualifications and experience.
- In the interim, educators should be awarded a one percent annual increase based on their current basic salary. This annual increase is in addition to the annual centralised bargaining percentage increase and subject to satisfactory performance.
- Performance should be part of the criteria but implementation should be held off until a performance appraisal system is developed and accepted by all. Developing an objective system was a lengthy process and could take a number of years to implement. Ultimately a performance-based approach should form part of the *modus operandi*. This will best serve as a driver towards the implementation of identified competencies.
- For practical reasons and comparison purposes, the salary scale for educators should be aligned with the existing public sector salary scale.

2.4 Performance Management

Performance management is a means of motivating and rewarding educators for good performance. A performance management system should be developed to encourage acceptable levels of performance, to enhance skills and for individual incentives (monetary and non-monetary rewards). The manner in which performance is measured and rewarded needs to be resolved. Listed below are implementation options because of the long-term impact performance management has on education.

- Significant work has been completed to date on the Development Appraisal System (DAS). This system could be further enhanced by applying the key performance areas and objectives, developed during the job analysis process, to the assessment criteria.
- Training providers should incorporate competencies into their training programmes thereby linking INSET to career pathing.

- Provision should be made for rating scales. This will facilitate the determination of appropriate rewards.
- The competencies required for each job should be identified through a consultative process.
- Competencies for extra-curricular activities should be developed.
- Specific skills training should be provided to appraisers and “appraisees” to ensure objective assessment.

Incentives for good performance can be managed in several ways.

- A percentage of a fixed maximum bonus should be awarded on an annual basis as a **once-off bonus** (unrelated to base pay).
- An alternative approach could be to provide a bonus to schools (not to teachers directly). School bonuses could be awarded to enhance overall teacher motivation in a school and to encourage self-assessment and collective performance improvement within the school teaching staff. This bonus could be a non-monetary reward and include rewards such as books, computers, etc. A basket of performance indicators could be developed via a consultative process. The total points scored under the performance indicators would determine the extent of the bonus to be paid to a school. *[NB. A pupil performance improvement target could be determined individually for each school based on a targeted improvement over and above the previous year’s level of performance, taking into account the socio-economic context, funding levels, and the availability of educators and support staff].*
- Collective based rewards could encourage performing teachers to motivate non-performing teachers to improve since the bonus is dependent on the school's overall performance, and not that of individual teachers.
- Support should be built in to assist those schools that are not achieving their targeted performance. This support could include guidance, INSET training, and resourcing.

2.5 Career Pathing

The proposed career path structure has been developed to provide educators with opportunities to progress either laterally or vertically in the education system. The proposed career paths comprise teaching and learning, management, office based educators, and therapists/psychologists. The figure below illustrates the four career paths, and associated job titles and salary levels.

Salary/Level	I Teaching and Learning	II Management	III Office-Based Educators	IV Therapists/Psychologists
A	Teacher/Lecturer		X	Education Therapist
B	Senior Teacher/Lecturer		X	Senior Education Therapist
C	Education Specialist (Teaching and Learning)	Education Specialist (Management) Principal C	Education Specialist (Designation)	Education Specialist (Therapy and Psychology)
D	Senior Education Specialist (Teaching and Learning)	Deputy Principal Principal D	Senior Education Specialist (Designation)	Senior Education Specialist (Therapy and Psychology)
E	DCES	Principal E DCES	DCES	DCES
F	CES	Principal F CES	CES	CES
G	Director			

Legend:

	Institution-Based
	Institution/Office-Based
	Office-Based

The career path structure provides educators with the opportunity to move laterally into other career paths. In the Teaching and Learning, and Management career paths, the focus is on keeping educators in the classroom by providing institution-based progression opportunities.

- Educators wishing to change career paths should undergo appropriate competency assessment.
- Progression through salary levels A to B should be based on criteria such as competency acquisition and satisfactory experience:
 - Educators with an M+3 should have four years of satisfactory experience
 - Educators with an M+4 should have three years of satisfactory experience.
- Progression into salary level C and upwards should be vacancy-based according to stipulated criteria that includes qualifications and competencies.
- Job specific competencies should be more clearly defined for the purposes of Human Resource planning.
- The job descriptions for the career paths could be used for formal approval. Further work was required particularly on the office-based and management career paths as this project necessitated a broad description encapsulating a variety of posts.
- The workload of various classroom-based posts, in terms of teaching hours, required clarification.
- A detailed model of reporting structures should be developed and should consider issues such as the size of school.

- The Norms for post provisioning for the career path need to be developed
- Educators wishing to change career paths should undergo appropriate competency assessment.
- Lateral and vertical movement should be vacancy based and subject to application procedures except for movement from level A to level B.

2.6 Job Complexities

Under this research area, the focus was primarily on the various school positions.

- There should be no differentiation in salary levels for educator posts at different institutions, except for principals (the job of a principal has been graded to determine the difference in levels of principals).
- Criteria should be developed to determine progression from one principal position to the next. This may include, inter alia, school size, school type, number of staff, size of budget, number of learners, and a range of languages used as a medium of instruction.
- Educators should receive equal pay for work of equal value.
- A separate research project should be commissioned to determine the grading of schools.

2.7 Post Grading

The research findings showed that the criteria favoured by educators to grade posts were:

- Knowledge;
- Planning and Organising;
- Skills Application;
- Communication; and
- Initiative.
- The consortium recommended that a competency-based system is used to grade educator posts.

2.8 Salary Supplements/Allowances

- A research project should be commissioned to identify the specific learning areas that are short of educators and educator facilities. The

research project should map out an implementation plan to remedy the situation. Future activities could include INSET and improved facilities.

- The consortium did not recommend supplements or allowances for educators of scarce subject areas; however, bursaries should be provided at the tertiary level to attract educators to these areas.

An accepted definition of a rural/remote teaching post does not exist.

- A research project should be commissioned to develop a definition of a remote/rural teaching post and the identification of such schools.
- Being posted in remote areas could be considered as a step towards promotion for educators.
- The consortium did not recommend salary supplements or allowances for educators working in remote areas. However, bursary conditions should be widened so that upon completion of their studies, teachers are sent to work in rural areas.
- A research project should be developed to determine if a system of community service could help alleviate the uneven distribution of educators to rural/remote areas.

2.9 Extra-Curricular Activities

Extra-curricular activities are part of an educators regular duties.

- Extra-curricular activities should be part of the criteria used to determine post promotion and should be a pre-requisite for achieving a satisfactory level of service.

2.10 Financial Model

The financial viability of the proposed post grading system was tested via a financial model under various scenarios (described below). The post grading results of the proposed career path structure were correlated with the existing educator salary scales and post levels. It appears that many educators leave the system after they achieved salary level 7. Within the five scenarios listed below, the first two scenarios attempt to retain educators by providing more promotion posts at salary level 8.

Scenario A: Based on the actual distribution of educators, increase the posts at level 8 (C) from 12 percent to 20 percent and support the increase from lower levels.

Scenario B: Based on the actual distribution of educators, increase level 8 (C) from 12 percent to 25 percent and support the increase from lower levels.

Scenario C: Based on the actual distribution of educators, increase level 7 (b) from 36 percent to 50 percent and increase level 8(C) with 2 percent. Support the increase from lower levels.

Scenario D: Based on the actual distribution of educators, increase all levels by 1 percent. Support the increase from lower levels.

Scenario E: Based on the actual distribution of educators, increase level 8(C) from 13 percent to 20 percent, leave level 7(B) unchanged and decrease level 6(A) from 29 percent to 22 percent.

The figure below summarises the results of the financial modelling.

	<i>Current</i>	<i>Scenario A</i>	<i>Scenario B</i>	<i>Scenario C</i>	<i>Scenario D</i>	<i>Scenario E</i>
Description	As Is	Increase posts at level 8(C) by 7% (from 13% to 20%)	Increase posts at level 8(C) by 12% (from 13% to 25%).	Increase posts at level 8(C) by 2% and level 7(B) by 13% (from 37% to 50%).	Increase posts at all levels with 1%	Increase level 8(C) by 7% (from 13% to 20%), leave level 7(B) unchanged and decrease level 6(A) by 7% (from 29% to 22%).
Impact on posts		Level 8(C) +25 347 Level 7(B) -12 675 Level 6(A) -12 672	Level 8(C) +43 348 Level 7(B) -21 675 Level 6(A) -21 673	Level 8(C) +933 Level 7(B) +46 335 Level 6(A) -47 268	Level 11(F) +28 Level 10(E) +96 Level 9(D) +243 Level 8(C) +387 Level 7(B) +1 050 Level 6(A) +573 Level 5 -2377	Level 8(C) +25 401 Level 7(B) +889 Level 6(A) -26 290
Cost implication	Rm 31643	Rm 31941	Rm 32112	Rm 32314	Rm 31792	Rm 34029
Difference		Rm 409	Rm 688	Rm 671	Rm 149	Rm 585

- The budget per province should be verified to explain the differences between the budget and the modelled cost.
- A scenario should be implemented that allows for the maximum opportunity for promotion to levels 7(B) and 8(C).

If funding is not immediately available, the new structure should be phased in over a period of three to five years.

3. EDUCATOR WORK LOAD IN SOUTH AFRICA

3.1 Introduction

This study commissioned from the Human Sciences Research Council (HSRC) looked at the number of hours that educators spend on their various activities. It also provided an assessment of the impact of outcomes-based education (OBE), continuous assessment (CASS) and other factors that might have an impact on educator workload.

National policy on educator workload expects educators to spend a maximum of 1800 hours on their various activities. This translated into 195 school days for 2005, or 45 hours per week excluding week-ends and school holidays. An additional 80 hours is provided for professional development, and it is expected that this occurs outside school hours. The formal school day is expected to be 7 hours long, and the formal school week 35 hours long. This means that educators are expected to spend some time (12 hours over the week) outside formal school hours on their activities.

Heads of departments and teachers are required to spend 85% of their time teaching, and the rest of the time on preparation and planning, assessment, extra-mural activities, management and supervision, professional development, pastoral duties, guidance and counseling and administration. Workload would constitute those activities or issues that add to the quantity or intensity of work.

The results of this study are based on a survey of 900 schools selected on a representative basis from different types of schools across all provinces. It was preceded by a pilot study of the questionnaire and time-diary used in the survey. To validate the findings, in-depth case studies were conducted in 10 schools. The study reported on 3909 questionnaires and time-diaries returned out of 4714 as well as the case studies.

3.2 Findings

The main findings of the study in relation to the hours that educators spend on their activities are that:

- Educators in South Africa had an average working week of 41 hours – and not 45 hours, as was expected.
- Of these, an average of 16 hours per week was spent teaching, or 3.2 hours a day – out of an expected 35 hours per week and 6 hours per day, taking into account breaks.
- Educators spend progressively less time on teaching and other school-related activities as the week progresses, with very little teaching occurring on Fridays in many schools.

- During the formal school day, when the work of all educators is taken together, management and supervision, assessment and evaluation and extra-curricular activities were amongst the most significant activities that crowded out teaching.
- Significant differences existed between urban, semi-rural and rural areas – generally educators in urban areas spent more time on teaching and administration than their counterparts in rural areas; educators spent a total of 38.3 hours on their work in rural areas, 41.5 in semi-rural areas and 43.8 hours in urban areas; the general decline in time spent across the week was strongest amongst educators in rural areas, who also spend more time in professional development, pastoral care and breaks than those in urban areas. Educators in semi-rural areas spent more time on extra-curricular activities, while educators in urban areas spent the highest time on guidance and counseling.
- Significant differences existed between former white, Indian, coloured, African and new schools established since 1994 in terms of time spent on teaching and other activities – generally, educators in the former white schools spent more time on teaching (19.11 hours) and other activities than educators in the former African (DET – 15.18 hours) and new schools established since 1994; former Indian schools spent more time in preparation and planning and record keeping than other schools; educators in former DET schools reported spending more time on professional development than educators in other schools; and HoD educators spent more time than others in pastoral care; former HoA educators spent more time on extra-curricular activities.
- School size matters – the larger the school, the less teaching, and the more administration demands there were.
- Class size was significant. Educators with larger classes spent less time on their different activities than educators in small classes who spend more time on their different activities; educators in classes with over 50 learners spent noticeably less time on their activities than educators with fewer than 50 learners per class; educators with 40 learners spent less time than those with fewer learners in their classes; the decline over the week was strongest for those with larger classes; there was a general decline in hours spent on teaching, preparation and planning as class size increases. The smaller the class, the more administration was done.
- Females spent less time overall than men on their tasks, but more time than men during formal school hours in core activities of teaching, preparation and planning; males spent more time than females on non-core and non-administration-related activities.
- Significant differences existed in relation to age, experience and qualifications of educators.
- Phase was important. Foundation Phase teachers spent more time teaching, preparing and planning than teachers in the Senior Phase; more time was spent on administration-related activities in the FET phase.

- Significant differences also existed between the amounts of time spent by educators teaching different learning areas.

A comparison of hours that educators spent on their different activities with national policy showed that:

- There was a gap between policy and practice.
- Educators spent less time overall on their activities than the total number of hours specified by policy; whereas policy expects 1800 hours (translated into 45 hours per day) to be spent on all activities, educators on average spent 1599 hours per annum, 41 hours per week and 8.2 hours per day on all their school-related activities;
- Educators also spent less time in teaching than is specified in policy. Whereas policy expects educators to spend 85% of their time on teaching, the average was 3.2 hours, i.e. 46 percent of time during the formal school day or 35 percent of their time when taking all their school-related time into account.

About three in four educators felt that their workload had increased 'a lot' since 2000. The expectations of a number of policies crowded out teaching and intensified work. In terms of workload:

- The assessment, planning, preparation, recording and reporting requirements of OBE constituted a major burden on educators and needed serious attention.
- Too many learning areas and learning areas for which there are no resources added to the quantity of work and workload.
- Learner: educator ratios had a significant impact on whether and how workload was managed.
- The Integrated Quality Management System increased workload.
- Norms and Standards for Educators and ELSEN policy intensified work.
- Numerous departmental requirements added to workload, especially of principals.

In addition, a number of other official and unofficial activities, and the actual management and use of time, crowded out teaching time in many schools.

On an international comparison, South African teachers on average taught 624 hours per annum, compared with an average of 803 hours per annum in a study of countries that included Australia, Korea, Mexico, the Slovak Republic and Turkey. The 2004 UNESCO EFA Global Monitoring Report argued that a minimum instructional time of 850-1000 hours per year.

3.3 Recommendations

Changing policy would not necessarily solve the problem, but the following recommendations flowed from the conclusions:

- Protect teaching time and emphasize the role of teachers as teachers.
- Reduce class sizes.
- Improve administrative support to schools.
- Reduce number of learning areas in curriculum, especially where there are no trained teachers – e.g. economic and management sciences & technology.
- Reduce required assessment and recording and reporting procedures.
- Abolish IQMS and start from scratch; it is unimplementable as is.

4. WORKPLACE POLICIES IN PUBLIC EDUCATION: A REVIEW FOCUSING ON HIV/AIDS

4.1 Introduction

This report forms part of a series in a multi-study project on 'Factors Determining Educator Supply and Demand in South African Public Schools'. It focused on the review of HIV/AIDS and workplace policies that have been developed by the Department of Education (DoE) and their implementation in the public school system as well as HIV/AIDS policies developed by two of the four unions in the ELRC, namely SADTU and NAPTOSA. Moreover, the DoE as an employer had also developed other workplace policies some of which predate the issue of HIV/AIDS. These various policies have been implemented throughout the country over the past few years.

The HIV/AIDS and workplace policies concerned were mostly developed during the past decade in response to the challenge posed to the educational system by the HIV/AIDS epidemic that is devastating the country and also as a result of the human rights culture that has existed in South Africa since the 1994 democratic elections. Consequently, some intervention programmes were developed and implemented especially to control and reduce the spread of the disease among educators and learners alike and mitigate the impact among educators and learners who are living with HIV/AIDS and/or those who are affected by HIV/AIDS, as well as to extend internationally accepted labour practices to all educators in the country.

Within the DoE, the development and implementation of policy has always been a contentious issue. Among some of the most challenging issues has been the difficulty of developing and implementing policy, while trying at the same time to transform the education system under conditions of financial austerity. This tension also applied to the development and implementation of HIV/AIDS policies and other workplace policies and their implementation in educational institutions on the ground. These policies impact directly on their intended beneficiaries, who are educators and learners in the public school system. In order to assist the ELRC to evaluate the impact of the DoE's workplace policies on the supply and demand of (public school) educators, this study reviewed both the DoE's and unions' HIV policies as well as other workplace policies and their implementation among educators in educational institutions throughout South Africa.

The study had the following three main objectives:

- a) to critically examine the DoE policy on HIV/AIDS and the systems developed for its implementation;
- b) to look at the impact of HIV/AIDS on existing policies to assess whether these policies require further development; and

- c) to determine the impact on educators of the DoE's HIV/AIDS policies and other workplace policies.

A monitoring and evaluation conceptual framework was adopted. A triangulation of research methodologies was used for the analysis, encompassing both qualitative and quantitative research methods. First, several DoE workplace policies including HIV/AIDS were identified, with the help of the Technical Task Team (TTT) members, representing all stakeholders in the ELRC, and a workshop with HIV/AIDS and education research experts. In addition, HIV/AIDS policies of both SADTU and NAPTOSA were included in the list of policies identified for analysis. Secondly, the set of policies to be reviewed was distributed to a set of experts in the field. Each wrote a brief critique of the policies. These critiques were then analysed and combined into a single report. The emphasis for this methodology was on drawing on their wisdom and knowledge to provide an in-depth understanding, critique and recommendations. Thirdly, two workshops were held with senior managers from the DoE to discuss the implementation, and monitoring and evaluation of the DoE's workplace policies. An initial workshop was held from which a report was drawn up. This report became the basis for a second workshop allowing for a deeper level of discussion. Fourthly, and finally, a questionnaire-based cross-sectional survey was conducted among 24 200 state-paid educators in 1766 public schools throughout the country who were interviewed by 436 field workers who were mostly trained nurses registered with the South African Nursing Council (SANC).

4.2 Results

4.2.1 Evaluation of policies and implementation

The overall review of the policies can be understood in terms of the following categories:

(a) Successes of policy

It is important to recognize successes and in this light the transformation in the education sector needs to be noted. This involved the introduction of a vast array of new policy, the integration of the previously dispersed separate education departments, the setting of new syllabi, and beginning the process of equalizing resources and ending entrenched privilege. While there has been only partial implementation, the basis is there for more systematic work in the future and some policy objectives, such as establishing of school governing bodies (SGBs) have been achieved in virtually all schools.

(b) Review of policy by experts

The policies were generally positively reviewed for their attempts to promote equality in the education sector, their focus on human rights, the transformation

agenda that they establish, and the basis that they lay for an effective education system. The major critique of the policies centred around the difficulty in implementation. Many of the policies make extravagant promises, based on a vision of an ideal system, but these cannot be realized, especially given the current constraints on resources. In relation to HIV/AIDS, concern was expressed about a lack of theory of behaviour change in the National HIV/AIDS Policy, inadequate coverage of treatment issues, and the lack of coverage for educators who are affected by HIV/AIDS.

(c) Connection between policy and practice

Implementation of policy has been the major problem. The focus of the DoE until 2002 was on integrating and transforming the sector and maintaining system functionality. Problems in implementation seem to arise out of disjuncture between the national office and the provincial and district offices of the DoE, a lack of resources, inadequate planning for implementation and preparation on the ground for the introduction of policy, a lack of awareness of the technical problems in the context of the implementation of policy, and some resistance from educators and officials to the policy. Generally the relationship between policy and practice needs to be better understood.

(d) Monitoring and evaluation

The current structures for M & E appear to be largely disorganized within the DoE. There is a considerable amount of data that is collected and many of the policies include a M & E plan. However, these M & E structures have not been adequately implemented and there are considerable problems with using the data from multiple sources. Efforts have been made to address these problems, but a full review of the M & E system is required and suggestion for improvement made to make sure that it can begin to operate effectively. This system is essential to ensure effective implementation of policy and to ensure rapid feedback that would allow for the ongoing development of these policies.

4.2.2 Impact on policy educators

The response rate in the survey and the main findings were as follows:

(a) Response rate

In the 1714 schools that were visited, principals reported that there were a total of 23 754 educators registered. If the total number of reportedly registered educators is taken as the denominator for calculating response rates, then 88% of educators agreed to be interviewed. However, if only those educators who were present on the day of the visit to the school by the fieldwork team are taken as the denominator, then 97% agreed to be interviewed. Therefore, an excellent response rate was achieved and this makes the results highly reliable.

(b) Survey data

The following main findings were obtained:

- Most educators were aware of the DoE's HIV/AIDS policy but not their union's policies. They were however equally keen to find out about both types of policies. Among those who had read/studied the DoE's HIV/AIDS policy, they had found it very useful but felt that it did not address the issue of stigma adequately.
- Half of the schools had an HIV/AIDS implementation plan but fewer had an institutional AIDS committee.
- Most educators were aware of some workplace policies or directives such as giving sick leave to educators who were ill and prohibition of sexual relationships between educators and learners. However, only a minority of educators were aware of other policies and practices, such as taking care of educators with a drinking problem and the replacement of absent teachers. This was true mostly for white educators and those from some major urban provinces such as the Western Cape and Gauteng.
- Half of the educators had previously taught their learners about HIV/AIDS, especially those who had attended HIV/AIDS training and workshops, and had also read the DoE's HIV/AIDS policy. This was the case especially for educators who were senior, white, coloured, and those from some major urban provinces such as the Western Cape and Gauteng.
- Most of the educators were willing to teach their learners about human sexuality and safe sex practices. However, white educators were not so keen to teach learners about the use of condoms.
- Most educators had attended professional training programmes in the past two years. Most also felt that more HIV/AIDS education directed at educators would be useful, except for white educators who did not feel as strongly about the issue.
- Most educators, especially white and coloured educators, as well as those from some urban provinces, indicated that their schools had access to social work services.
- There were different sources of support of educators from various stakeholders with the SGB and unions being stronger supporters in their role as educators while the DoE, the unions, and faith-based organizations (FBOs) were stronger supporters in their role in HIV/AIDS education.
- Educators identified some specific needs from the DoE such as more programmes/workshops/manuals for themselves and free antiretroviral (ARV) treatment, as well as financial support from the DoE regarding their various roles.
- Finally, the educators were found to be relatively highly literate about ARVs.

4.3 Recommendations

The following recommendations were made on the basis of the above findings:

1. There are a number of successes in the policy arena. These need to be made known, as the policies in education are coming under high levels of criticism.
2. The use of policies to spell out a vision for education, without the immediate plan of implementation, creates confusion on the ground. This distinction and the role of the vision need to be spelt out, and specific plans developed for implementation, including the additional resources required.
3. The most important focus for the coming period has to be on the implementation of policies. A greater consideration of the links between policy and practice is also required. To achieve this, adequate implementation plans are needed, including action agendas and timelines and the context – educators in particular have to be prepared in advance. A more gradual approach to the implementation of policy is required, with focus falling on a small number of policies at a time to allow for adequate implementation.
4. The lack of resources to respond to the ambitious policies is the single biggest critique of policy development in the DoE. A more accurate assessment of resources needs to be developed and the implementation of policies planned to coincide with this. This needs to be a public document, as a response to the confusion generated by the policies at present.
5. The communication, co-operation, trust and support between the national, provincial and district offices need to be strengthened. One of the major breakdowns in implementation appears to be between those who develop the policy and those who implement it.
6. There is inadequate consideration of the impact of HIV/AIDS on educators, especially in schools that are likely to be more affected. Many respondents felt that there was generally a lack of awareness of the real context on the ground where the policy is being implemented. Likewise the impact of policy on educators needs to be considered. The identity of educators is challenged - in the policy their role and functioning are changed, their professional status is questioned and additional regulations are placed on their role. The policies have also meant extra administrative work and the mass of policies arriving over a short period of time has created exasperation and confusion. These factors need to be addressed or the policies themselves could contribute to attrition.
7. In many of the policies, suggestions are made of linking to other government departments and services. These links need to be established

- and guided from a national level. Too many assumptions are currently made about schools and districts being able to use these links.
8. The DoE's HIV/AIDS policy needs to look in more depth at theories of behaviour change, as the current policy recommends principally information sharing, which is inadequate for encouraging behaviour change. Social and contextual factors affecting behaviour should also be considered. Issues such as child abuse and gender violence also need to be covered in policy and constitute a significant gap. Issues such as treatment approaches and the role of ARVs get insufficient coverage and also required attention in the content of the report.
 9. A more concerted and directed approach to M & E is required, with emphasis being placed on addressing the confusion that is currently found around information gathering and the implementation of M & E strategies in the policies. Efforts are already underway in this regard. A full evaluation of the M & E system is also required to assess if it is capable of its prescribed role.
 10. All policies should be evaluated during the early period of implementation, both to assess effectiveness and to allow for any modifications that may be required. Each policy should have its own protocol covering the information that is required and how it will be analysed. Data sources can however be shared, as much of the data should be attainable from the annual surveys.
 11. Efforts need to be made to reduce the fears of evaluation and increase understanding and support for the process. All potential respondents, from the DoE national office to the educators themselves, reported bad experiences arising from evaluations. To be able to co-operate in the task of evaluation requires that there is trust in the system.
 12. There is a need to extend the advocacy about the DoE's policies to reach out to all educators. Even more importantly, the South African Council of Educators (SACE) and the educators' unions must also develop advocacy campaigns to inform their members about their HIV/AIDS policies.
 13. The Department of Health's HIV/AIDS policy needs to be revised to address other pertinent issues such as counseling and stigma. The issue of counseling is of growing importance as the number of orphaned and vulnerable children (OVC) increases throughout the country. Educators need to be well prepared in order not only to counsel the children who are affected by HIV/AIDS and must therefore be removed from both the communities and the educational institutions themselves.
 14. While educators in the urban sectors have been able to attend workshops, it will be important to encourage junior educators from mostly rural provinces, to attend HIV/AIDS training and workshops.
 15. Although attendance of HIV/AIDS training and workshops as well as professional training development programmes is relatively high, there is a need for white educators especially to be persuaded, perhaps from a cultural point of view, to be more willing to teach their learners about use of condoms and also for them to use condoms. It is essential that this be

- done so that the learners in particular, control and reduce the spread of HIV infection when they have sexual intercourse. As a matter of fact, the white educators themselves will need to be protected against HIV infections if the low prevalence found in the main study is to remain below 1%.
16. It is important that the DoE and the parents of the learners provide more support to the educators in their role as educators if they are to be encouraged to remain in the profession. Similarly, the SGBs and the parents of learners must also provide some support to the educators in their role of HIV/AIDS education.
 17. The DoE must provide the following to educators to ensure that their needs are catered for and hopefully reduce attrition:
 - More programmes/workshops/manuals with regard to preventing new HIV infections amongst educators and learners;
 - Treatment, medication, including ARV medication and financial support for the care of ill educators and learners.
 18. There is a need for more ARV literacy for educators, given the issue's newness and complexity. In addition, as there are schools throughout the country, educators could be useful for helping with an advocacy campaign about the use of ARVs to treat HIV/AIDS. This coupled with other community issues could see the idea of schools as a multi-delivery purpose centre come to fruition, something that the Department of Social Development has been piloting at some community centres in one province over the past two years.
 19. The DoE needs to begin working with educators to correct the negative impression that many hold of the DoE and their anger at the nature of some of the policies being introduced. If the above recommendations, especially the methods of implementation of policy and of preparing the ground for implementation, are followed this should go a long way to solving many of the problems associated with policies. Educators themselves need to be drawn into this advocacy.
 20. Care has to be taken that the overload of new policies and the additional workload that comes with these policies do not alienate the educators. Some were complaining of overload, a situation noted also by the experts and the workshops with the DoE, and that this contributed to them considering leaving.

5. THE HEALTH OF OUR EDUCATORS: A FOCUS ON HIV/AIDS IN SOUTH AFRICAN PUBLIC SCHOOLS, 2004/5 SURVEY

5.1 Introduction

This study was designed to yield information to assist the government and unions in the ELRC in planning educator supply at national, provincial and district levels. The specific objectives of this study were three-fold:

- To determine the prevalence of HIV and tuberculosis (TB) amongst South African educators in the public sector by age, sex of educator, race, qualifications, locality type, learning area and the phase/band of active teaching;
- To investigate the determinants of HIV amongst these educators by age, sex of educator, race, qualifications, locality type, learning area and the phase/band of active teaching; and
- To determine the attrition rate among educators and reasons thereof.

The study was commissioned to investigate the determinants of demand and supply of educators in the public education sector. Such a study was expected to answer several research questions such as:

- What is the prevalence of HIV/AIDS, TB, alcohol and drug use amongst educators in public schools?
- Do educators have higher HIV prevalence ratios compared with the general population of people aged 25 years and older?
- What are the factors driving the HIV and AIDS epidemic amongst educators?
- What is the prevalence of HIV, TB and alcohol use per district council?
- What is the attrition rate among educators, and what are the reasons for attrition?

The study employed a triangulation of several research methods. A formative research exercise was undertaken using focus groups and key informant interviews among educators throughout the country. The data collected informed the design of the questionnaire. A once-off consultation with HIV/AIDS educators, other researchers and experts from the consortium was held to acquaint the HSRC researchers with current and comparable research work in the country.

A cross-sectional survey among educators and student educators was undertaken, employing the second-generation surveillance method that combines the measurement of behavioural and biological indicators within the same study. A behavioral risks questionnaire-based survey was conducted currently with HIV testing to determine the association between the two. Finally,

the archival research method was used, where principals used existing school records to complete questionnaires on the institution.

Informed consent was obtained from educators who agreed to participate in the interview and provide a specimen for HIV testing. In addition, the result of the HIV test of each participant was linked anonymously to questionnaire data using bar codes.

To test the questionnaire, administration and HIV testing method, a pilot study was conducted among 438 educators. Three modes of questionnaire administration and three methods of collecting biological specimens were tested in 33 schools located in North West and Western Cape provinces.

The sample sites for the study were identified as public schools. For the schools sample, two data sets were available as potential sample frames from which a sample of educators could be drawn. The first was the DoE's School Register of Needs, which contained data from surveys in 1996 and 2000, and the second, a database extracted from the government's Personnel Salary System (PERSAL) system. The final schools sample of 1766 schools had a total of 24 200 state-paid educators as potential respondents.

Nurses registered with the South African Nursing Council were employed to conduct the interviews and collect specimen samples. In total, 436 field workers, including trained nurses, were appointed to conduct the fieldwork.

5.2 Findings

(a) Demographic and socio-economic characteristics of the study sample

The demographic and socio-economic profile analysis of educators in the sample revealed that 68% of the sample of educators consisted of females. The majority of the educators were married. Over three-quarters of the sample were Africans (77%) while less than 5% of the sample were Asians, which is a reflection of the demographic characteristics of South Africa. Self-reported socio-economic status and income distribution suggest that educators were generally well qualified, with a first degree or higher, and had many years of teaching experience, with 70% of educators teaching for at least ten years or longer. About 94% of educators reported that the DoE employed them with the rest being School-Governing Body appointments.

Only 27% of educators said they had a housing subsidy and 68% reported that they were members of a medical aid fund. The majority (89%) were members of a trade union. There were disparities in some of the demographic and socio-economic profiles of educators by race and province. The findings showed that there were proportionately more female and male African educators in the low-income category compared with educators in other race groups. On the other

hand, there were proportionately fewer male white educators in the medium-income category than male educators in other race groups.

(b) Prevalence of HIV

The results showed that 12.7% of educators who gave a specimen for HIV testing were HIV positive. This percentage includes educators in all provinces, and educators of all ages, sex and racial groups.

In this study, without considering age and race differences, the HIV prevalence was the same for the male and female educators. The results showed that HIV prevalence among educators was highest for those aged 25-34 years (21.4%) followed by those aged 35-44 (12.8%). Older educators (55 years and older) had the lowest HIV prevalence (3.1%). However, differences were observed when the analysis was restricted to women and men aged 25-34 years, with women having higher prevalence. Women were generally more vulnerable to HIV infection because of their biological makeup as well as their low socio-economic status.

Major racial differences in HIV prevalence were observed. Africans had a prevalence of 16.3% compared to whites, coloureds, and Indians who had a prevalence of less than 1%. It could be that other race groups knew their HIV status and hence did not give a specimen for testing, but this could not be substantiated. The differences in age distribution among the different racial groups may also account for why African educators had higher prevalence. African educators were more concentrated in the high HIV risk age groups, from 25-34 years, than other racial groups. Africans were also more likely than other racial groups to belong to the low socio-economic status. Educators who have low socio-economic status had a much higher HIV prevalence when compared to those in the high socio-economic group.

The study found that educators residing in rural areas and those working in rural schools had higher HIV prevalence than educators residing in urban areas and teaching in urban schools. Educators working in schools located in urban formal settlements had a significantly lower HIV prevalence (6.3%) than those working in urban informal settlement (13.9%) and rural areas (16.8%). Teachers in poorer rural areas fall in the high income group by local standards, suggesting that income may be an additional risk factor.

The study investigated the HIV prevalence of educators by province where they were teaching, and found significant differences. Educators employed in KZN and Mpumalanga had the highest HIV prevalence (more than 19%) when compared with all other provinces. The second group of provinces with high prevalence (more than 10% but under 19%) were Eastern Cape, Free State and North West. The provinces with HIV prevalence under 10% were Limpopo, Gauteng and Northern Cape. Western Cape had the lowest HIV prevalence at 1.1%.

One objective of the study was to estimate the HIV prevalence of educators in the district where the school was located. Only KZN, Mpumalanga and Eastern Cape had districts with HIV prevalence among educators that were higher than 20%, numbering 11 out of 54 – eight of these districts were located in KZN. Another 11 districts had an HIV prevalence among educators that was less than 5%; they were found in the Western Cape, Northern Cape and Gauteng. Overall, the metropolitan districts had low HIV prevalence among educators.

(c) Determinants of HIV/AIDS

A substantial body of literature has found a significant association between HIV/AIDS and having more than one sexual partner. The study investigated the sexual behaviour of educators and found that the majority of South African educators reported to have one current sexual partner, and about one in five educators reported not to have had a sexual partner in the previous 12 months. When data were disaggregated by race and sex of the educator, African males had a statistically significant higher rate of self-reported multiple sexual partnerships than all other sex and race groups. Overall, the rates of self-reported multiple partnerships for women in the past year were significantly lower than those reported by men.

Age mixing, where older persons have sexual partners who are significantly younger than themselves, is one of the frequently cited drivers of the HIV/AIDS epidemic. A significantly higher HIV prevalence rate (16.5%) was found among male South African educators who reported to have a sexual partner in the past six months who was more than ten years younger than themselves as compared to those who had a sexual partner who was within ten years of their age (12.4%).

(d) Awareness of HIV status

A large proportion of educators (59%) had undertaken an HIV test prior to this study and of these 92.4% were told their HIV status. Indians (68%) and coloureds (67%) had slightly higher rates of HIV testing than whites (63%) and Africans (56%).

(e) Condom use

This study found that generally the younger male and female respondents had high condom use compared to their older counterparts. The results showed that the older the respondents the less likely they were to use condoms. HIV prevention campaigns have generally neglected to include the older age groups, leading to the assumption that HIV is not common in this age group. If prevention

messages are not targeted to the groups with low prevalence of HIV, there could be a rise in HIV rates among these groups.

Condom use at last sex showed that among African females (38%) and males (36%), condom use was higher when compared to other groups. Whites were lowest users of condoms at last sex, with 9% of females and 11% of males reporting using condoms. Condom use was high among females and males from non-urban areas (males 36% and females 37%) when compared to those living in urban formal areas (males 26% and females 24%) and urban informal areas (males 30% and females 32%). While the rates are still low for all the locality types, accessibility seems to be improving as individuals from urban informal and non-urban areas have higher reports of condom use.

Being HIV positive and consistently using a condom was associated with non-regular sexual partners but not with regular partners. The latter is cause for concern.

(d) Health status

The study revealed that 11% of educators reported to have been hospitalized within the last 12 months prior to the study. The most frequently reported diagnoses educators received in the last five years were high blood pressure (16%), stomach ulcer (9%), arthritis (7%) and diabetes (5%).

A simple self-reported measure of TB was selected, and it was found that 0.9% of educators reported having been diagnosed with TB within the last five years and 3% reported having a cough that lasted more than two weeks, an indication that they might have had TB. The low percentage of educators reporting to have TB is likely due to stigma.

(e) Knowledge of HIV transmission

The level of knowledge was high among both female and male educators. There were areas of knowledge, however, where a few of the educators did not have accurate information or did not know about certain issues related to HIV. These included misperceptions about the mode of transmission such as through sneezing, anal sex, oral sex, and breast milk. Some educators also lacked knowledge of anti-retrovirals.

(f) Alcohol use

Alcohol abuse has serious health and social consequences. This study found that 75% of educators reported that they had abstained from alcohol in the past twelve months. Twenty percent of the educators were classified as low-risk drinkers, and 5% high-risk drinkers according to the Alcohol Use Disorder Identification test scores. Of all racial groupings, male coloured educators (18%)

and male African educators (16%) reported the highest levels of high-risk alcohol use. White male educators were most frequently low-risk drinkers (71%) when compared to male educators in all other racial groups. This may be a reflection of the culture of alcohol use in these communities. Furthermore, it seems that the younger the educator was, the more likely they were to use alcohol in a risky way. The age group 25-44 years among male educators reported the highest levels of high-risk drinking (16%) as compared to 45-54 year old male educators (13%).

Compared to educators who are non-drinkers or low-risk drinkers, high-risk drinkers reported a higher number of unhealthy days in the month prior to the survey, and more days of being absent from work in 2003. It is crucial to examine alcohol use and its relation to health-related quality of life. The rationale is that high-risk drinking may influence the health status of educators, which has an impact on quality of education.

(g) Potential for attrition

The study revealed that 55% of educators intend to leave the education profession with two-thirds of this group being technology, natural sciences, economics and management educators. Some of the reasons for wanting to leave the profession include low job satisfaction and job stress. If low job satisfaction and job stress can be addressed, in particular, potential attrition can be reduced. Furthermore, violence in education institutions may deter educators from coming to school and may contribute to attrition. The three major forms of violence experienced by educators in the previous 12 months included instances where a learner or educator had been found carrying weapons into the educational institution (22%), assault (18%) and fights involving weapons (14%). Violent events at the educational institution seem to have had an impact on the morale of educators and increased their probability of leaving the profession. Educators with a higher violence index score rated the morale at their school as lower than those with a low violence score, and educators with a higher violence score more often thought of leaving their profession.

5.3 Recommendations

The study was commissioned by the ELRC, comprising the DoE and the unions, mainly because of the lack of adequate information for planning in the education sector. The unions and the DoE had separate but overlapping terms of reference for the study. Through discussion it was possible to combine the terms of reference for the study into one comprehensive research investigation that was agreeable to all parties. For this reason, the recommendations are specific to either or both parties and yet their implementation would require participation of the key relevant stakeholders from parties, the Council and tertiary institutions, donor agencies and, where applicable, domestic and international scientists.

1. Behaviour change and HIV prevalence

The key behavioural determinants of HIV infection were lack of condom use, HIV-positive status, multiple partnerships, alcohol use and age mixing. It is recommended that the DoE, working with unions, and NGOs develop HIV prevention programmes targeted at educators, given that they are a captive audience. The messages should not only be about using condoms, faithfulness and abstaining but should increasingly address the issues of serial monogamy and HIV testing before engaging in unprotected sex, and having sexual partners within ones' age group.

2. Increase HIV prevention knowledge

The DoE, with the participation of the unions, should design educational campaigns that place more emphasis on anal sex and oral sex in prevention campaigns to ensure that this form of sex is not considered as safe because it is not mentioned frequently as part of HIV awareness programmes. Priority for HIV prevention should be targeted at districts with a high HIV prevalence of 20% or more.

3. Target districts with high HIV prevalence

The observation that the HIV prevalence among educators is highest in 11 districts implies that the DoE should target its efforts in this area. The intervention could include improvements of conditions that are unfavourable to HIV transmission.

4. Improve self-efficacy skills

It is crucial that educators be given the skills to prevent themselves from becoming infected. It is therefore recommended that the DoE and the unions work together to design an education programme that will equip educators with skills to negotiate safe sex, especially young recently qualified educators.

5. Prevent transmission of HIV from those already HIV positive

To prevent new HIV infections, it is recommended that the DoE work closely with unions, NGOs and scientists to design an intervention programme to prevent HIV transmission from HIV-positive educators, using the healthy relationship model that has been shown to reduce new infections.

6. Discourage migratory practices that result in separation from support/family structures

It is recommended that DoE and the unions develop a structured programme for deployment of educators to specific areas; this would entail a deliberate effort to place teachers near their homes rather than leaving it to chance. Where this is not possible, facilitate deployment by supporting educators and encourage them to migrate with their families.

7. Establish health workplace programme

It is recommended that the DoE and donor agencies establish and manage a workplace programme specifically to provide a comprehensive prevention and treatment programme for all illnesses (including HIV/AIDS and TB), but ensuring confidentiality for educators. Such a programme would include stress reduction and involve counseling, assessment of workload and adjustment thereof, blood pressure and diabetes screening and treatment.

8. Eliminate gender disparities

To reduce gender disparities and reduce the rate of spread of HIV it is recommended that the DoE, the tertiary institutions and the unions join hands with civil society to create a social environment that discourages men from engaging in risky behaviour that puts them and consequently women at risk of HIV. All parties should work towards capacity building and development of women through increased opportunities for promotion and improvement of educational qualifications.

9. Reduce alcohol misuse

With respect to alcohol use, it is recommended that the DoE work closely with the unions to develop an alcohol prevention campaign targeting male educators to reduce high-risk drinking.

10. End violence in schools

The study found that violence at school was common, with the problem differing by province. It is recommended that the DoE should work together with the South African Police Service to increase security at school for all educators and students.

11. Potential attrition

Low job satisfaction can be addressed through negotiations on conditions of service between the DoE and the labour unions in the ELRC. With respect to job stress, the discussion between the DoE and the unions may entail teaching

methods and administrative issues. The DoE should also consider providing support to educators, especially those who have not been teaching outcomes-based education who report having difficulty adapting to the new system.

12. Database management

To draw the sample for the study required access to information on the geographic location of schools and the number of teachers employed at each school. There were serious difficulties in developing a sampling frame for the study due to lack of unique identifiers allowing educators to be linked to specific schools, as well as duplicate records; thus it was not easy to compile the total numbers of educators at schools. It is therefore recommended that the South African Council of Educators develop a web-based system that will allow district managers to update information on school locations and attributes on a regular basis.

6. EDUCATOR SUPPLY AND DEMAND IN THE SOUTH AFRICAN PUBLIC EDUCATION SYSTEM

6.1 Introduction

The ELRC commissioned this study following anecdotal reports that indicated that educators seem to be leaving the education profession in large numbers. Some of the reasons that were suspected included low morale, job dissatisfaction, AIDS and premature mortality.

The study set out to explore the phenomenon of educator attrition and to understand various reasons why educators may be leaving the profession. In addition, the study sought to understand the system's demand for educators and the number of educators needed to meet this demand.

A series of seven reports were completed. This final report integrates these reports, published as part of the multi-study project focusing on the Factors Determining Educator Supply and Demand in South African Public Schools. The aim of this report is to integrate all these findings and give a more comprehensive picture of the determinants of supply of and demand for educators in public schools.

This integrated report includes a number of study components:

- (1) Qualitative educator school study: Focus groups and key informant interviews were conducted to gain an understanding of the meanings educators and students attribute to HIV/AIDS prevention, care and support.
- (2) Educator school survey: A cross-sectional survey of a nationally representative sample of educators was undertaken, employing the second-generation surveillance method that combines the measurement of behavioural and biological indicators within the same study. A behavioural risks questionnaire-based survey was conducted concurrently with HIV testing and CD4 count to determine the association between the two. For the estimation of AIDS deaths and the impact of antiretroviral therapy on AIDS mortality, the Spectrum model package was used.
- (3) Educator policy review: Review, expert review and workshops were used to analyse core workplace policies from both the Department of Education (DoE) and different unions in the sector. Policies directly related to HIV, TB, drug and alcohol use and attrition, as well as documents relating to implementation plans, current status of operation of the policies and monitoring and evaluation systems were identified for review.

- (4) Educator attrition and mortality study: Records from the National DoE PERSAL and EMIS data, and the Department of Home Affairs National Death Register were cross-referenced and analysed, including contract termination, sick leave and death for the financial period April 1997 to March 2004.
- (5) Student educator and FET lecturer survey: A cross-sectional survey in samples of student educators and FET lecturers was undertaken, employing the second-generation surveillance method that combines the measurement of behavioural and biological indicators (HIV testing) within the same study.

6.2 Results

6.2.1 Educator growth demand

Comparing learner population and learner enrolment, the potential learner population (6-18 year olds) increased from 1999 to 2003, but learner enrolment decreased from 1997 to 2003. The decline in learner enrolment may be attributed to different entry points at Grade 1, increased learner throughput, fertility decline, increase in the proportion of vulnerable children (orphans, girls) with restricted access to school and enhanced provincial EMIS systems.

Using population-based data, the school-age population aged 6-13 grew by 1.4% per annum between 1999 and 2001 and by 1.2% per annum between 2001 and 2003. During the period 1999-2001 the school-age population aged 14-18 grew by 0.6% per annum and by 1.2% during the period 2001-2003, taking estimates of the impact of AIDS into consideration.

In 2003 the learner to educator ratio, based on SNAP surveys, was 35:1 for both primary and secondary schools. This ratio has remained stable over the past five years. The maximum target from the DoE is 40:1 for primary and 35:1 for secondary schools.

6.2.2 Educator replacement demand

(a) Trends in the employment of educators

According to PERSAL, the total number of public educators declined from 386 735 in 1997/98 to 366 320 in the 2002/03 financial year. This represents a net change of educators of -5.3%. The number of permanent educators remained stable, while temporary educators declined from 61 206 in 1997/98 to 34 110 in 2003/04 which is a net change of -44.3%. The major decline is due to an

ongoing process in which long-term temporary educators are given permanent appointments.

(b) Demographics of educators

Based on the Educator School Survey of 2004, two-thirds of educators are women. This has not changed over the past seven years. Women educators dominate the primary teaching force in every province with 75% and more, except in Limpopo Province where 67% were women. Over three quarters of the educators were black Africans, while less than 5% were Indian/Asians. This mirrors South African society in which, according to the 2001 population census, 79% were black Africans. There was a slight increase of 4% in the black African educator workforce, while there was a slight decrease among white (3%) and coloured educators (1%) from 1997/98 to 2003/04. Further, the educator workforce is generally older than the general formal sector workforce; 29% of educators are 45 years and older but only 21% of the general workforce in the formal sector are 45 years and older.

(c) Attrition of educators

Government PERSAL data for state-paid educators indicate that the national gross attrition rate in 1997/98 was 9.3%, dropping to 6.4% the following year and declining to 5.5% in 2000/01 before beginning to rise steadily again to 5.9% in 2002/03. Rates vary significantly by province and have to be seen in the light of the large numbers of educators that left the departments during the years of amalgamation and rationalization, peaking in 1997/98 and 1998/99. The early years of this study were characterized by high numbers of severance packages and dismissals, whereas more recent years have seen rising proportions of mortality, medical retirement and resignation.

It was established that the third largest cause of attrition, after contract terminations and resignation, was mortality. The proportion of gross attrition due to mortality increased from 7.0% in 1997/98 to 17.7% in 2003/04. Similarly, the proportion of terminations for medical reasons grew from 4.6% to 8.7% over the same period, while the number of severance packages and transfers declined considerably. By 2003/04, resignations accounted for 53% of all educator terminations, excluding contract terminations.

Attrition rates peaked in 1997/98 and 1998/99, largely as a result of the unusually large number of educators that left during the early years of amalgamation and rationalization. Thereafter they dropped to 3.4% (5.5% permanent and long-term) in 1999/00 and 2000/01, and increased to 4.2% in

2002/03 (5.9% permanent and long-term). These data suggest that approximately 15 000 educators were needed nationally to meet replacement demand in the financial year 2002/03, with an additional 6 000 needed as substitute educators for those leaving the service for extended periods (such as maternity leave). It should also be noted that, if the analysis is based on permanent attrition alone rather than on permanent and long-term attrition, the proportion of attrition due to mortality rises significantly. The highest attrition in 2002/03 was 6.5% in the Western Cape, followed by 5.6% in Gauteng. The lowest rates were 2.9% in Mpumalanga and 3.2% in Limpopo. The data also show that there are two peaks in attrition: one among educators aged 55 and above (of which an average of 66% are accounted for by retirement and 18% by resignation) and another among educators aged 25 to 34 (where resignations accounted for 80% of terminations and mortality 15%). The lowest overall attrition rates were in 2000/01 - most age groups have experienced increased attrition since then.

Educator attrition rates are generally higher for females than males and peak at age 55 and above (due to the high numbers of educators in this age band who retire). Attrition rates throughout the study period have been highest for white educators, although they have declined significantly since 1997/98. The overall rate for whites in 2002/03 was 12.0%, close to three times that for black Africans.

(d) Morbidity

With regards to HIV/AIDS, 12.7% of all educators are HIV-positive. HIV prevalence is highest in the 25-34 age group (21.4%), followed by the 35-44 age group (12.8%). Those educators 55 years and older had the lowest HIV prevalence (3.1%). There are major racial differences in HIV prevalence: black Africans have a prevalence of 16.3% compared to the other race groups, whose infection rates were less than 1%. The key behavioural determinants of HIV infection among educators were lack of condom use given HIV-positive status, multiple partnerships, alcohol use and age mixing.

The study went on to determine how many HIV-positive educators would need ARVs. More than one-fifth (22%) of the HIV-positive educator population need ART according to the national criteria based on WHO (World Health Organization) conservative guidelines for the initiation of ART. This is a CD count of less than 200 cells per cubic millimeter of blood. This would suggest that at least 2.8% of all educators are eligible for immediate ART – 10 000 of the 356 749 educators in public schools. If the US Department of Health guidelines of a CD4 cell count of less than 350 cells per cubic millimeter were followed, this would increase the proportion of HIV-positive educators requiring ART to more than 23 500.

HIV/AIDS was not the only factor in the cause of morbidity. Other chronic diseases were found to play a significant role in the health status of educators, which appeared to be poorer than that of the general population. A total of 10.6% of educators had been hospitalized in the previous 12 months, compared to 7% of the general population, reported in 2002. It was also found that at least 75% of educators reported a visit to a health practitioner in the six months before the study. The most frequently reported diagnoses in the past five years were stress-related illnesses such as high blood pressure (15.6%), stomach ulcers (9.1%) and diabetes (4.5%), suggesting that educators may be exposed to high levels of stress.

The overwhelming majority of educators (75%) had not drunk alcohol in the past 12 months: 20% were classified as low-risk drinkers; and 5% were high-risk drinkers. Male educators (15%) were significantly more likely to be high-risk drinkers than females (0.7%). Alcohol consumption patterns seem to differ by race: male coloured educators (18%) and male black African educators (16%) reported the highest levels of high-risk alcohol use.

The study further looked at absenteeism as one of the factors involved in attrition. The results showed that absenteeism in the educator labour force was due mainly to high blood pressure, followed by tobacco use, HIV infection, stomach ulcers, arthritis or rheumatism and high-risk drinking.

(e) Mortality

Results from the death records indicate that a significant proportion of educators die between the age of 25 and 49 years. Male teachers in this age range die at a higher rate than female educators. The median age at death for black Africans (42 years) is considerably lower than other race groups (61 to 75 years). Using the Spectrum model package for estimating AIDS-associated mortality, the results suggest that 8.3% of HIV-infected educators, or 1.1% of the total educator population, died of AIDS in 2004. The HIV model estimates AIDS deaths to be 10.3 per 1000 educators. The key estimate – the proportion of HIV-infected educators dying of AIDS in 2004 (8.3%) – is in agreement with the results from empirical studies that were specifically designed to examine AIDS-related deaths in HIV-infected populations. The various mortality estimates suggest an alarming increase in mortality over the past years.

(f) Intention to quit

Educators were asked if they had ever considered leaving their profession. More than half the sample (54%) indicated that they had thought about leaving, with 29% of the sample indicating that they thought about leaving very often, and 25% indicating that they thought about it from time to time. Forty four percent of the sample stated that they did not want to leave. Two-

thirds of the educators stating their intentions to quit fall in the technology, natural sciences, economic and management fields. High predictors for leaving the profession were low job satisfaction (in particular: lack of career advancement and recognition, teaching conditions in terms of working hours/load/policies, and lack of discipline and respect); a changed career choice after three years of teaching; high job stress (in particular: problems with teaching methods and administration and problems with the educational system); being white, coloured or Indian/Asian; five to 19 years teaching experience; and the urban location of the school. Medium predictors were being male; low morale at school; and high violence experienced at the school in the past 12 months. Low predictors were low educator support and high educational qualification, and high annual income.

(g) Productivity

Educators from combined/intermediate schools (14%) were more often, more than 10 days absent from work in the past year than educators from secondary (13%) and primary schools (12.6%). Educators from primary schools (15.3%) more often reported more than five unhealthy days in the past month than educators in secondary (14.2%) and combined/intermediary schools (12.2%).

All chronic conditions including HIV, tobacco use and high-risk drinking were associated with higher rates of self-reported absenteeism. The proportion of educators absent for more than ten days was highest among those who had been diagnosed with TB in the past five years, high-risk drinking, lung or breathing problems, heart disease, diabetes, cancer and anaemia. Among HIV-positive educators, 17.1% reported missing more than ten days compared to 13.8% of HIV-negative educators. The burden of absenteeism in the educator labour force was highest due to high blood pressure, followed by tobacco use, being HIV-positive, stomach ulcers, arthritis or rheumatism and high-risk drinking.

Results further showed that negative productivity was highest among educators in primary schools (0.92) compared to secondary (0.84) and combined/intermediary (0.84). Provinces with the highest negative productivity among educators were KZN (1.03) and Free State (1.00).

6.2.3 Supply of Educators

There has been a decline in students taking the Initial Professional Education of Teachers (IPET) qualifications, namely the undergraduate Bachelor of Education (Bed) and the Postgraduate Certificate in Education (PGCE). Self-reported data from the Dean's Forum in 2004 indicated that education

institutions are producing at best approximately 9 000 graduates of whom at least about 3 000 may already be practicing educators.

The decline in enrolment is significant among black Africans. Improved career opportunities for black applicants have not only reduced the number of applicants who enter the education sector, but have also had an impact on the supply of educators because even the small pool of education graduates may not necessarily end up teaching. They are likely to seek employment in other fields where their teaching skills are valued, such as in training-related careers or marketing.

It was also found that the older patterns of oversupply in urban schools and undersupply in rural schools have persisted and newly trained educators have difficulty in finding posts (even in rural schools).

6.2.3.1 HIV status of students and FET lecturers

Third- and fourth-year education students were tested for HIV in this study and 8.2% were found to be HIV-positive. The third-year students were less likely to be HIV-positive (7%) when compared with the fourth-year students whose prevalence was 15.5%. The HIV test results show that females had a much higher prevalence (9.9%) than males (4.8%). Black African students had a prevalence of 13.2% compared to the other race groups whose prevalence was less than 1%. Examining HIV distribution by age revealed that HIV prevalence was highest among those aged 25-29 years.

The majority of the FET lecturers have so far escaped the HIV epidemic; only 3.9% are HIV-positive. However, there is a gender disparity in HIV prevalence among FET lecturers, with men having a prevalence of only 2.9% compared with 5.0% among women. The highest HIV prevalence among FET lecturers are among black Africans (9%), those aged 25-34 (8%), those who are unmarried (8%), those who are poor (7%) and urban dwellers (4.3%).

6.2.3.2 Unqualified and under-qualified educators

In 2000, 76 839 (22%) educators were considered unqualified or under-qualified, which is a decrease from 122 459 (36%) in 1994. In 2004, based on the School Educator Survey, the percentage of unqualified or under-qualified educators further declined to 8.3%; this was higher in primary (11.1%) than in secondary (2.8%) schools; higher in rural (9.0%) than in urban schools (7.5%); higher among coloured (13.8%) than white (2.2%) educators, and more than 10% in North West, Free State, Northern and Western Cape provinces.

6.2.3.3 The pool of educators

Sources other than newly qualified educators could enter the teaching profession, including educators on leave and unemployed or temporary educators. PERSAL data show that among employed educators, the number of temporary or contract educators has significantly declined over the past five years. Trends from labour force surveys show that the number of those unemployed who are qualified in education has declined significantly. PERSAL data show that the employment of older educators (35 years and above) has dropped from 56% in 1998/99 to 31% in 2002/03, indicating that fewer educators from an educator pool (returning to teaching) and more newly qualified educators (being less than 35 years) are being employed. In other words, the educator pool is decreasing and therefore the employment of educators depends more on the availability of newly qualified educators.

A DoE survey showed that a current figure of 11 000 unemployed educators, of which a significant number trained prior to the introduction of the Revised National Curriculum Statement (RNCS). These educators will have to attend training courses to acquaint them with the new curriculum.

Looking at international migration, there are more educators leaving the country than coming into South Africa since 1999. Overall, the net loss of educators increased except during the period 2001 and 2002. When looking at the internal mobility of educators, the Educator School Survey found that mobility and deployment to rural areas is associated with higher HIV prevalence.

6.2.4 Growth and replacement demand and supply projections for educators

Two sets of projections were made. The demographic and epidemiological inputs are the same in both models except the initial base population. Whereas the initial base population in Model 1 was based on an estimated age-sex population of South Africa, Model 2 was based on Statistics SA's 2001 census population estimate but using the estimated age-sex distributions in Model 1 to obtain the estimated number of people in each age group.

Maintaining the current standard learner to educator ratio of 40 and 35 in primary and secondary education respectively, a net enrolment ratio of 97% would require about 319 704 (Model 1) to 336 159 (Model 2) educators in 2008. If the past and projected trends continued, and the projected demand for educators in 2008 is taken into consideration, there would be a shortfall of around 15 090 educators by 2008. If the learner to educator ratio was 35 for both primary and secondary school educators, the projected demand for

educators would imply a shortfall of around 32 000 to 34 000 educators by 2008.

Data on newly qualifying educators are lacking, and it is assumed that some 6 000 new educators are currently graduating and that not all will go into teaching (in South Africa). The supply from the pool of educators (on leave or unemployed) has been decreasing so that over the coming years the supply of educators will not meet the demand.

6.2.5 Moderators of replacement demand for and supply of educators

Moderators of replacement demand for and supply of educators can be divided into (1) supply-side policies and programmes; (2) demand-side policies and programmes; and (3) data tracking. Supply-side policies and programmes are further divided into (1) job satisfaction; (2) educator recruitment and preparation; (3) educators in key learning and rural areas; and (4) the impact of HIV and ARV treatment.

6.2.5.1 Supply-side policies and programmes

The educator supply problem is both a problem of quality and quantity. Attracting and retaining high quality educators is influenced by job satisfaction. Recognition of the teaching profession, the promotion of teaching as a career, professional development and career advancement should be promoted. This forms the pillar of a strategy to ensure adequate supply and retention of educators. In order to accomplish this, the attractiveness of the teaching profession should be increased. The professional development of educators should be done through upgrading and broadening educators' existing skills base.

Although salary increases alone may not have a long-term impact on attrition and may not provide the answer to all the challenges that educators face in the classroom, they are the most direct and powerful way to demonstrate the value accorded to the education profession. While salary increases might be expensive to implement, they must be considered against the risks and costs associated with educator dissatisfaction and attrition, the recruitment of educators who no longer practice their profession, and re-training.

Benefits for job satisfaction discussed by educators were sick leave, medical aid, pension, disability and medical boarding. Generally, there was a good awareness of the sick leave policy among educators. An overwhelming majority of all the educators (86.7%) were aware of the fact that the DoE supports educators who are ill by giving them sick leave. With medical aid, the one-third contribution that educators have to pay towards a medical aid scheme puts medical aid coverage out of reach for some people. Pension benefits were also critiqued as it will most probably not cover the high costs of

HIV/AIDS treatment and is unlikely to be paid if the dependants have access to other grants such as child or foster care grants or an old-age pension from the Department of Social Development.

With regards to classroom environment, it is clear from both the formative research and main survey results that stress associated with new curricula and OBE should be addressed by improving practical training. The paperwork burden should be reduced, and the discipline and safety at schools improved.

Stress within the classroom environment is also increased by violence. Based on the Educator School Survey, the three major forms of violence experienced by educators at their educational institutions in the past 12 months included learners or educators carrying weapons in the educational institution (22%), assault (18%), and fights involving weapons (14%).

With job conditions, issues that educators raised included high workload, performing tasks that are not in their job-description, redeployment and job insecurity.

In April 2003, a National Recruitment Drive was launched to recruit for the profession. The lack of interest shown will not disappear unless the working conditions of educators improve. This can be achieved by allowing for incentives, better work environment and opportunities for further development.

Initiatives are needed to increase the number of educators in key subject areas. In curriculum areas such as mathematics, science and technology, recalling educators who have resigned and offering incentives to young graduates in these areas could be considered. Incentives can be used as a method to both attract and retain educators. If special rural and mathematics and science allowances are paid, this will inevitably encourage student educators who are originally from rural areas to remain in rural areas rather than opt for teaching in urban areas. Similarly, if special mathematics and science allowances are also paid, this will inevitably encourage more student educators to train in these key subject areas for which there is a great demand nationally. The individual and/or pooled effects of the two types of incentives will ultimately lead to an improvement in the supply of educators.

The impact of different levels of ART coverage on AIDS mortality shows a substantial decline in deaths as coverage increases. It is estimated that by 2010, AIDS deaths will have decreased by almost 50%, assuming 90% coverage compared with no treatment. The model shows that a relatively high ART coverage would be needed to ensure a substantial impact of ART on HIV/AIDS associated mortality.

6.2.5.2 Demand-side policies and programmes

Demand-side policy tools are not as widely implemented and have been reported to be less effective than supply-side policy tools. Examples of these tools include reducing class sizes, tools to decrease teaching loads, the use of teaching assistants and other support staff and the structure of curriculum and educational programmes.

6.2.5.3 Data tracking

Educator demand and supply needs to be tracked to ensure that the pool of educators does not run out. The Ministerial Committee on Teacher Education (MCTE) in its National Framework for Educator Education suggests that collecting data from higher education institutions/providers around initial educator education could be modeled on an information system that is being used in the Western Cape Provincial Department and that is currently being extended to Gauteng. The MCTE believes that this information system for educator supply is a national responsibility and therefore should be managed nationally, collating data from higher education institutions (HEIs) / providers about educator supply. The MCTE proposed that this should be the responsibility of a national Educator Career and Recruitment Centre, as sub-unit of the Systems Planning Branch of the national DoE.

6.3 Recommendations

The following recommendations are specific to the ELRC and its parties. Implementation of these recommendations would require participation of all the key stakeholders from the unions, DoE and the Council of Higher Education.

1. Production of more educators

Considering the continued demand for educators, more need to be trained than current numbers. The implication of this is the current significantly improved employment opportunities, such as the availability of employment or possible incentives for working in rural areas, if initiated, for education graduates should be made clear to prospective student educators.

2. Attracting more students to education and retaining educators in the teaching profession

The DoE can intensify its programme of attracting students and retaining high quality educators. Part of this process will include strict implementation plans

for several issues including an improved career path structure, and adequate resources allocated to improve conditions of service for educators and loans for student educators. To further improve job satisfaction among educators, the DoE needs to consider decreasing additional roles and duties that take educators away from their core job of teaching and address the issue of lack of discipline at schools as well as redeployment.

3. New education graduates

The DoE, together with higher education institutions, should establish a separate tracking system to follow all new graduates entering their first year of teaching until they leave. It is also critical to examine the distribution of students across the different learning areas. It is recommended that the departments of education in the various provinces make available a list of vacancies in schools in the different provinces and send this out to HEIs at the end of each year. This will allow students to see where particular specializations are needed.

4. Educator recruitment and preparation

More emphasis should be placed on the induction of new educators into the profession. Entry into teaching should be re-examined from the educator recruitment and preparation stage. Educator preparation should be designed in a way that supplies the demand for educators, taking into account the demographics and needs of communities. Therefore, educator recruitment and preparation should consider the following: placing as much emphasis on curriculum knowledge as on teaching methodology and practice; an internship at a school catering for curricular areas of the trainee's specialization; induction programme for beginner educators; mentor programmes for beginning educators spanning a reasonable period to ensure that these educators gain the necessary experience and knowledge base; and less contact time and more time with mentors.

More control over educators that are emigrating to Commonwealth and other countries to take up teaching positions should be exercised. Perhaps a community service for newly qualifying educators could be introduced, as is the case for other scarce professions in South Africa.

5. Roles of educators

The DoE needs to ensure that effective support structures are established for educators to enable them to focus on teaching. There is a further need for the education system to institute formal social support structures serviced by dedicated school social workers. This could be structured to service a cluster of schools. Another possibility is to appoint teaching assistants who can assist the educator in various non-core aspects and reduce their workload. In

addition, training in basic counseling skills should be available to student educators, educators and FET lecturers to equip them to provide first-line support to colleagues, learners and acquaintances affected by HIV/AIDS.

6. Improve class environment and job satisfaction

With regards to the new curriculum, it is suggested that the DoE improve training and practicals on OBE to relieve the stress associated with curricula and reduce the paperwork burden, as well as administrative tasks and other activities that increase educators' workload.

Further, the DoE needs to enforce its policies on school safety to ensure that schools are safe havens for children and educators. This should include zero tolerance towards sexual harassment and other inappropriate or criminal behaviour particularly by educators and school officials. Since the incidence of violence differs by province, the DoE should work together with educators to prioritize life skills education around substance abuse, conflict resolution, gangsterism and violence in schools. This needs to be undertaken in collaboration with the community surrounding the school, the SA Police Service and the Department of Social Development.

Recognition of the teaching profession, the promotion of teaching as a career, professional development and career advancement should be further promoted. The professional development of educators should be done through upgrading and broadening the skills base. The DoE has already recognized career development as a priority. Ongoing professional development has been intensified as part of the introduction of curriculum revisions.

Salary increases are the most direct and powerful way to demonstrate the value accorded to the education profession. While salary increases might be expensive to implement, they must be considered against the risks and costs associated with educator dissatisfaction and attrition, the recruitment of educators who no longer practice their profession, and re-training. Salary increases should be structured and distributed in relation to a career to ensure that educators do not remain at any one level without prospects of improvement.

The process by which an employee decides to leave her/his job is complex. For the purpose of future workforce planning, more research is needed on the impact of these factors on job satisfaction and attrition, as well as on the career decisions of students. Educators who have left the profession should be traced in order to enhance our understanding of actual attrition and the factors and processes that lead to attrition.

7. Review of policies

Although there were many useful HIV/AIDS-related policies already developed by both the DoE and two of the educator unions, SADTU and NAPTOSA, over the past decade, the major concern was that of poor implementation of the policies concerned, and the monitoring and evaluation of their impact. There are, however, some important additional immediate policy recommendations (and some important policy implications) that authorities should be urged to act on:

- Action to improve the health status of current and future educators, especially HIV prevention and ARV treatment;
- Improving the attractiveness of teaching as a career;
- Providing some specific incentives and initiatives for educators in rural schools;
- Attention to appropriate deployment for critical subject specializations such as science and mathematics; and
- A fairly urgent action to increase intakes of student educators.

Finally, a more focused advocacy programme surrounding these and other policies is recommended. Clearly, all these policies in many respects form the core of the support structures that the DoE can put into place to support educators in dealing with the added personal burden brought on by the HIV/AIDS epidemic.

8. Health of Educators

HIV prevalence among educators was 12.7% and among student educators 8.2%. The key behavioural determinants of HIV infection among educators were lack of condom use given HIV-positive status, multiple partnerships, alcohol use and age mixing. It is recommended that the DoE, working with unions and NGOs, develop HIV prevention programmes targeted at teachers. The messages should not only be about using condoms, faithfulness and abstaining but should increasingly address the issues of serial monogamy, HIV testing before engaging in unprotected sex, and having sexual partners within one's age group.

Further, it is recommended that the DoE and donor agencies establish and manage a workplace programme specifically to provide a comprehensive prevention and treatment programme for illnesses (including HIV/AIDS and TB), but ensuring confidentiality for educators. Such a programme would include stress reduction and involve counseling, assessment of workload and adjustment thereof, blood pressure and diabetes screening and treatment.

It is recommended that the HEIs work with the Department of Health to implement a comprehensive prevention and treatment programme for all students, addressing all illnesses including HIV/AIDS and TB. However, it is important that confidentiality is ensured in such a programme. Further a joint strategy which involves the DoE, HEIs and the DoH is recommended to provide an ART programme for all students who need it.

9. Antiretroviral treatment/therapy (ART)

The study concluded that a minimum of 10 000 educators would need ART according to current government guidelines. The findings of this study are reason enough for the DoE to take urgent measures to develop a targeted intervention that provides ART and treatment of opportunistic infection for HIV-positive educators. As long as demand for ART is exceeding available supply, a phasing in of the programme will be necessary. Given the relatively favourable environment for treatment in South Africa, we recommend that the DoE should initiate a comprehensive programme consisting of prevention, treatment of opportunistic infections and ART.

10. Encourage teaching in rural areas

It is critical to review the DoE's policy of providing incentives for educators who work in rural areas. The DoE may consider offering loans for rural students to take up teaching as a career, with the idea that they return to their rural environment. Extended and supportive field experience in rural schools for student educators would also be important - this would require active support from rural communities to help student educators with accommodation and to help them enjoy and understand rural life outside the school and their formal duties.

10. Create a dynamic data tracking system

The DoE should establish a dynamic database containing information on the demographic needs of different provinces and districts, including learner needs, vacant posts and educator shortages. According to the Minister of Education, unemployed qualified educators have been invited to register with the department. Further to this, it is recommended that this database of unemployed qualified educators record their areas of specialization in order to determine whether there is an oversupply or shortage in certain subject fields. This information will allow HEIs to understand where the training needs are. The database should be established at national level and then updated regularly at provincial and district levels. In addition, the HEMIS data system should record the required IPET qualifications including the newly graduating educators plus their specialized learning or subject areas as well as phases each year.

7. INVESTIGATION TO ADDRESS POST PROVISIONING CHALLENGES

7.1 Introduction

This report is based on a literature review, fieldwork in two provinces, and various desktop analyses of post-distribution.

The analysis of the current post distribution model (PDM) began with the literature review which dealt with resource distribution generally as well as the centrality of educators in achieving equity and quality. The review concluded that a 'vertical equity' or 'adequacy' approach is most appropriate in the South African context. This suggested that **unequal** inputs were required to achieve **equal** outcomes. The inequality in terms of inputs would, under this approach, be biased in favour of learners who are disadvantaged in any way, for example, because of poverty. The review formed the basis for the subsequent analysis of the PDM.

7.2 Implementation of the PDM at Provincial Level

The analysis of operational problems experienced with the current PDM was based on fieldwork conducted in two provinces (KZN and Mpumalanga), and dealt with PDM implementation issues, the perceived effects of the PDM and issues of principle. Important implementation issues were:

- Lack of familiarity with the 'mechanics' of the PDM and the 'insular' nature of its implementation within the head office of the provincial Departments of Education (PEDs);
- General concern about the quality of EMIS data, and about delays in the data becoming available;
- Lack of monitoring of the effects of the PDM; and
- Attempts to approximate equality in post distribution (in terms of learner:educator ratios) rather than redress.

Respondents' perceptions of the effects of the PDM were not always accurate. However, the perceptions (in italics) included the following:

- *The PDM caused staffing problems at schools.* The authors' conclusion was that the PDM could be a factor in causing staffing problems if errors were committed in its application. Errors in the application of the PDM were found in the course of the study: some were a result of the software used, others occurred because of the quality and accuracy of the input data. Contrary to the principles of the PDM, equalization of learner : educator ratios was used as a criterion for success in one of the PEDs examined.

- *Large classes could be attributed to the PDM.* The authors' conclusion was that this problem arose as a result of the circumstances of particular schools and problems experienced in the internal school-level distribution of educators. Large class sizes could be attributed to a shortage of classrooms in many instances.
- *The PDM resulted in greater workloads and increased stress, and impeded the implementation of OBE.* The conclusion by the authors was that these phenomena were not related to post distribution. Any workload stress experienced was more likely to be related to factors such as the size of the provincial pool of educator posts and to curriculum transformation (and other policy requirements) than to the PDM.
- *Periodic adjustments in the allocation of posts caused instability in the staffing of schools.* The conclusion here was that such adjustments are justified in terms of current policy to address learner mobility. They were not justified if they arose out of errors in the initial post allocations, as they often do. However, in both cases (reasonable and unreasonable adjustments to post allocations), any instability in staffing was likely to be more directly caused by delays in appointment and transfer processes.
- *The PDM did not address the distribution of skilled educators.* The PDM was not designed to address the distribution of skills. This is a key issue of quality and equity.
- *Schools were offering a narrower curriculum because they no longer perceived benefits from PDM subject weightings.* This perception was justified. The effect of subject weightings was minimal, although posts shift from primary to secondary schools as a result of these weightings.
- *The PDM did not facilitate curriculum transformation.* This perception was justified, because the PEDs visited are not using the mechanisms in the PDM that were curriculum-related, such as significant manipulation of subject weightings or setting minimum and maximum enrolments. It was shown in this study that quite extreme values would have to be applied to achieve any impact on the curriculum.
- *The weightings did not take into account the need for ECD posts, the special circumstances of dual/parallel medium schools and focus schools, or the impact HIV/AIDS.* Several of these issues were beyond the scope of the study. In the judgment of the research team the slight lowering of learner : educator ratios in these schools as a result of the PDM was unlikely to have a significant impact on classroom practice or learning outcomes.
- *The weightings did not take into account LSEN needs in mainstream schools.* A study of LSEN needs was required once these needs had been integrated into the PDM. It should be noted that KZN respondents presented the opposing view that the LSEN weighting for mainstream schools was substantial and that some schools are using this as a 'loophole' to obtain more posts.

- *The impact on management capacity in small schools was negative.* The effect of the PDM on small schools was more accurately described as minimal rather than negative.
- *Schools that built additional classrooms would receive more posts.* This reflected a misunderstanding of the PDM, which does not contain any parameter related to school infrastructure.
- *The number of posts in a provincial ad hoc pool was insufficient.* The ad hoc pool was primarily, but not exclusively, intended to address fluctuations in learner enrolment. It was beyond the scope of this research to conduct a detailed study of learner mobility. However, it did not seem to be the case that schools suffered as a result of the PDM in terms of learner : educator ratios.

Perceptions regarding issues of principle (in italics) included the following:

- *The model was budget-driven rather than needs-driven.* The size of the provincial pool of educator posts was a major cost driver and was treated as such in a macro-economic context of fiscal discipline. The study showed how the needs of particular groups of learners – such as poor learners – were addressed in relatively minor degrees and how such needs could be addressed more progressively.
- *Former Model C schools continued to be advantaged.* This perception was substantiated by the analysis of post distribution in the study, as is the related perception that the allocation of poverty redress posts makes “little difference”.
- *Schools had been given an incorrect poverty ranking.* It was beyond the scope of this study to assess this perception.
- *The existing divisions between the personnel and non-personnel budget, between office-based and school-based staff and between educator and non-educator staff were inappropriate.* It was beyond the scope of this research to examine the rationales for these ratios.
- *The PDM was like a balloon filled with water; if you squeezed it in one place, the water merely moved to another place.* This analogy was accurate, since the PDM distributed a fixed number of posts. A post gained in one school was lost in another. There were subtleties underlying this analogy.

The perceptions expressed by respondents of the PDM and its impact on schools were justified in some cases and in others not. The authors noted that only a small number of personnel had engaged with the model and its effects. It was important, however, to bear in mind that the unjustified perceptions might be as important as those that were borne out in the desktop analysis of post distributions, since they were grounded in an assessment of real conditions in schools. It was important for key personnel who worked in and with schools to have an accurate understanding of the causes of any problems experienced, and the authors recommended that an information campaign be designed and

implemented to familiarize key school sector personnel with the PDM and with any proposed alternative models.

7.3 The Outcomes of the PDM

The analysis of the outcomes of applying the PDM in Mpumalanga and KZN demonstrated that the PDM was generally consistent with the principles outlined in the Government Gazette of 15 November 2002. Although the model was fairly complex and the outcomes of parameter choices were difficult to anticipate, the PDM provided a degree of transparency and fairness in the allocation of educator posts.

However, the actual outcomes of the PDM application in 2004 (effective 2005) were not very different from an allocation of educators based on a simple ratio of the two provinces' learners to the pool of funded educator posts. Across the two provinces studied, 83 percent of the schools received a number of posts that was the same or only increased or decreased by one post compared to a simple division of all funded posts in the province divided by the number of learners. Most of the parameters analysed resulted in changes consistent with the underlying principles of the PDM, but the effects were generally modest when analyzed in terms of how they change LE ratios. For example, in the case of Mpumalanga the intended poverty redress lowers LE ratios by about 2 learners in the lowest two quintiles and raises LE ratios by between 1.8 and 2.0 in quintiles 3, 4 and 5. In KZN, the application of a 5 percent poverty redress lowered LE ratios in the poorest schools (deciles 1 and 2) by just over one learner per educator while raising the LE ratios in the top deciles by just over one learner per educator. Once estimates of the number of SGB-remunerated educators were included in the calculation of LE ratios in Mpumalanga, the LE ratios in the poorest quintile (1) and the richest quintile (5) differ by only 0.3 learners per educator. Quintile 3 and 4 LE ratios are about five learners per educator greater than the quintile 5 ratio. In KZN, the incorporation of SGB-remunerated educators results in LE ratios for deciles 1 through 9 that differ by 1.5 learners per educator or less. The concentration of SGB-remunerated educators in the richest schools (decile 10) lowers LE ratios for that group of schools to 3.4 learners per educator less than the schools in the poorest decile (1).

The PDM allocated a fixed number of posts across all the schools rather than allocating an 'adequate' or 'required' number of educators based on the needs of the particular mix of learners in a school embodied in the model itself. Subject weightings are the best example of this contradiction. Increasing the weight for a subject – either through lowering the 'ideal maximum class size' or raising the 'promotion factor' – applies broadly across the province and ends up in competition with posts for dual medium of instruction, with posts at the primary school level and with posts for other prioritized subjects. With this principle of

'competition' underpinning the distribution of posts, the outcome becomes very difficult for planners to anticipate.

The above findings were supported when the authors examined the effects of varying the PDM parameters on the distribution of educator posts within a small 'hypothetical province', constructed for the purpose of examining the effects of the PDM on a manageable scale. This investigation confirmed that quite extreme parameter values have to be applied, in some cases beyond the permitted PDM values, to achieve substantial redress.

7.4 The Distribution of State Investment in Educators

Because the PDM allocated posts rather than educators, it was indifferent to how various types of educators (for example, by qualification level) were distributed in a province. An analysis of investment in state resources for educators showed that there were inequities in the distribution of educator characteristics in the provinces that favour advantaged schools. The mean salary of educators in both provinces was positively correlated with quintile/decile (mean salary rises as the quintile/decile rises) with the difference between the mean salary in the highest grouping being about 20 percent higher than the mean educator salary in the lowest grouping. When private resources (SGB-remunerated educators) were included in the estimation of investment per learner the differences between the highest and lowest levels of investment reached about 27 percent in Mpumalanga and 40 percent in KZN.

In order to verify the relationship between salary and the qualification levels and experience of educators, a Mincerian earnings function (a standard econometric technique for estimating the relationship between human capital characteristics and earnings) was fitted to the data for state-remunerated educators in Mpumalanga and KZN. The results indicated that educator training, experience and gender explained nearly 80 percent of the variation in educator salaries, that salary was an unbiased indicator of educator qualification and experience, and that comparisons of salary levels across groups of educators - by quintile for example - were unbiased measures of differences in qualification and experience across those groups.

7.5 Alternative Strategies for Post Distribution

The authors noted that evaluating alternative strategies or evaluating the current model required the identification or definition of some type of benchmark as to the 'correct' level of redress. Without such a benchmark, evaluating any alternative could be viewed as subjective. It was argued here that the use of a 'before and after' 1994 benchmark was not relevant to the discussion. The overwhelming majority of South Africa's poor learners still attended schools

located in poor communities. The perverse allocation of resources favouring the minority prior to 1994 was now much less inequitable; however, redress was still a policy goal that had not been achieved despite the dismantling of the apartheid system.

It was noted that alternative 'headcount' strategies, whatever their nature, were not very different from the current model and that the latter had several desirable characteristics that should be maintained in order to achieve vertical equity. The authors first modeled the effects of 'pushing' the current PDM beyond its maximum permitted values, for example using 10% and 20% values for poverty redress rather than the permitted 5% maximum. When the current limit on redress was doubled to 10%, the two lowest deciles had LE ratios some 4 to 6 learners per educator lower than the richer schools in the higher deciles. When the 20 percent redress was applied the schools in the poorest deciles enjoyed an LE ratio 8 to 10 learners per educator lower than the richer schools. However, once the advantage in the ability to contract private educators was included in the analysis the magnitude of the on-the-ground effect of the higher levels of redress was diminished. Since a benchmark was lacking, it was difficult to evaluate whether these differences were substantively meaningful in terms of effective redress; however, significantly raising the ceiling for the poverty redress parameter would place the poorest schools in a favourable position with respect to their richer counterparts, even though these were able to pay for additional educators. A 20% poverty redress did not seem excessive if it was considered that it would only amount to an 'advantage' of two educators in a 400 learner school once SGB-remunerated educators were considered. It was noted that the PDM was a 'zero-sum game' and no improvement in terms of redress was possible without significant movement of posts and educators. This means that some level of 'instability' was inherent in a redress strategy; full stability could only be justified once a desired level of 'vertical' equity had been achieved.

A possible strategy for ensuring that the allocation of resources for educators was consistent with the principles embodied in the PDM as well as being sensitive to the differences in educator characteristics was to apply the PDM weights to a distribution of funds for educators rather than educator posts. This approach (referred to here as the 'resource model') produces a result which is progressive and incorporates educator characteristics in the distribution of posts. Another resource model simulation illustrated how the additional funds that become available for poorer schools could be used to provide one year of additional training (and substitute educators) for educators with low qualifications.

Finally, the authors examined 'mixed models' for managing the impact of the allocation of financial resources rather than posts. These models required that provincial, district and school officials make appropriate choices about the trade-off between more educators at lower qualification/salary levels and more highly qualified educators with higher salary levels, or whether to provide teachers with low qualifications in the poorer schools with additional training. Alternatives are

modeled with the assumption that there was no change in the provincial budget for educators. This kind of decision making framework would require training of provincial/district and school officials as well as monitoring on the part of the provincial and national departments of education.

A final mixed model approach utilized a national 'redress corps' of educators. This corps would recruit a cadre of highly qualified educators for deployment in the country's most disadvantaged areas. Possible criteria for inclusion in the redress corps could include a minimum REQV level, a score on a qualifying examination, and/or a minimum number of years of successful teaching experience. Fully modeling this strategy would require the use of national level data; incentive systems would also have to be explored and modeled.

7.6 Recommendations

Recommendation 1 relates to the need for a PDM 'information campaign' to familiarize key school sector personnel with the model and with any proposed alternative models.

Recommendation 2 relates to the need for strategic long-term cooperation across PED units such as HR, Curriculum and EMIS.

Recommendation 3 relates to the need to improve EMIS data and data availability, taking cognizance of the need for data on the distribution of educator quality, using proxy measures if necessary.

Recommendation 4 relates to the establishment of a benchmark as to the 'correct' level of redress that is expected, to support the evaluation of redress-related achievements.

Recommendation 5 relates to the need to monitor and evaluate the equity-related achievements of the PEDs in post distribution using the benchmark referred to in recommendation 4.

Recommendation 6 relates to the need to provide support to PEDs to reduce errors and deviations in the implementation of the model, facilitate the intra-departmental cooperation, and help the PEDs to use the PDM to achieve curriculum-related goals.

Recommendation 7 relates to the need to conduct further studies in areas identified through this study.

Recommendation 8 relates to the need to consider all education inputs (not only human resources) in equity-related research in order to arrive at a useful

assessment of progress in achieving equity, and comprehensive strategies to achieve more progressive results.

Recommendation 9 sets out a short-term recommendation (raising the permitted parameter values of the PDM) and a medium-term recommendation (distributing resources rather than posts) regarding alternatives to the PDM. These alternatives were based on the current PDM drivers.

8. REPORT ON INTERNATIONAL STUDY TOURS

8.1 Introduction

The Education Labour Relations Council (ELRC) commissioned the HSRC to provide research support in the undertaking of a series of international study visits aimed at distilling lessons on improving education quality through implementable policies for public educators.

The methods of data collection consisted of desk-top research, involving the review of various research reports and policy documents; and country site-visits and interviews (using a semi-structured data collection instrument) with education ministry, department and teacher union officials. In addition various documents collected during the course of the visits were analyzed.

Thirteen countries were visited: Botswana; Brazil; Cameroon; Chile; Cuba; Ghana; Jamaica; India; Mexico; Tanzania (including Zanzibar); Thailand; Togo and Zimbabwe.

8.2 Main findings

8.2.1 Policymaking and implementation

In most of the 13 countries visited, it was found that policy making is highly centralised. Although the centralization of policy making seems to be the norm, there were exceptions where considerable policy decision-making powers are devolved to lower levels. Policy decentralization, however, is not without its problems as the lack of national guidelines often leads to sub-national governments (states, provinces, local governments) formulating their own policies depending on the availability of financial resources and the level of organization of educators (strength of unions). In many countries, there is a high level of involvement of teacher unions in policies relating to salaries and conditions of service. However, in education policy areas more broadly, such as curriculum and teacher education, the picture is more diverse. There is also a strong shift towards recognising the role of research in education in many countries.

8.2.2 Human resources management

A key finding was that teacher provisioning is determined largely by budgetary considerations using teacher-pupil ratios as a criterion. Teacher education, that is pre-service training, constitutes an important dimension, and most countries devote considerable resources to this aspect. However, it is in the area of professional development (in-service training) (PD) that some of the countries visited appear to be making considerable advances. Distance education, in

particular ICTs, is the preferred mode of delivering PD services to teachers. This delivery mode is quite effective in countries such as Mexico, Cuba and India.

8.2.3 EMIS

Countries with well-developed information management systems are able to monitor the performance of the education system far more effectively. However, a key challenge is the maintenance and updating of EMIS systems and its associated cost implications.

8.2.4 Employee relations

In most countries, employee-employer relations are governed by some form of legislation, but not all countries have formal mechanisms to facilitate collective bargaining and/or consultations between government and teacher organizations. With regard to salaries and benefits, in some countries the Public Service Commission plays a role in determining salary levels and conditions of service for all public servants, including teachers. Mexico appears to have the most comprehensive set of criteria for determining salaries. This includes teaching hours per week, an upgrading system to adjust salaries by level of qualification, and a responsibility bonus on top of existing 'educator' level salary for principals, and the use of economic zones. There are several lessons for South Africa with regard to teacher incentives, particularly incentives for the retention of rural teachers, which range from free housing or implementation of a national housing scheme, additional salary notches and the use of solar energy as a substitute for electricity.

8.3 Recommendations

8.3.1 Policy making and implementation

A more purpose-driven and structured stakeholder participation in education policy processes is recommended. This should be underpinned by an articulated, shared vision of success around which all stakeholders align. The value of SACE and the ELRC as forums for policy consultations should be strengthened. Further, the establishment of the National Education and Training Council, envisaged in the National Education Act of 1996, should be reviewed.

The inter-sectoral approach in service delivery characteristic of the Southern African countries visited, and reinforced in Mexico, Jamaica and Cuba, wherein various departments, such as health, welfare, local government and education play a role in the delivery of education services through greater alignment and cooperation of their interventions, should be pursued.

Effective policy making and implementation strategies should prioritize rural education and education in other difficult-delivery contexts, and the development

and use of indigenous languages as part of the country's multilingual language policy framework.

The role of Public Service Commissions in determining the Conditions of Service of educators should be investigated. Part of the usefulness of these commissions is that they have both an administrative and a monitoring role.

8.3.2 Improving education quality through ICT innovations

Countries such as Cuba, Mexico and Brazil have seized the opportunities that are associated with accessing the information highway. In Mexico, the Encyclomedia initiative, with its Public Libraries Network has facilitated free access to a worldwide network and the internet to support study programs from basic to higher levels; and

Similarly in Brazil, video-conferencing and the Internet form an important part of teacher development programmes, which focus on both educators that are teaching with no formal qualifications (proformacao) and those that are qualified (National System for Further Training of Teachers in Basic Education). In addition, the Network of Research and Development which is a joint initiative of 20 universities across 14 states, has pooled together resources and expertise, to offer cutting-edge teacher professional development services.

The above initiatives have had a positive impact on the quality of teaching and learning in the two countries, and suggest that South Africa could also benefit from greater use of the benefits of ICT and planned cooperative ventures to improve educational activities and services.

8.3.3 Post provisioning

The following factors emerge as the most important in the making of teacher post provisioning decisions:

- Class sizes;
- Teacher-pupil ratios, with an average ratio of 1:30 in primary schools and 1:35 in secondary schools is regarded as a norm;
- Excluding the principal from post provisioning equations; and
- Making optimal use of competent/senior/master teachers, for example, to teach in double shifts (morning and afternoon), and remunerated appropriately; this practice has led to significant improvements in education quality.

It is also recommended that a comprehensive database of public educators be maintained, including a directory on unemployed teachers. This could contribute to a situation where the supply of teachers exceeds demand. This would facilitate

appointment of the most competent educators, which could go a long way in promoting the quality of teaching.

8.3.4 Teacher retention and incentives

Specific strategies should be considered to address teacher retention in rural schools and other difficult delivery contexts. The principles of the CONAFE rural education programme in Mexico could be considered as a possible model for South Africa. This needs to be clearly articulated to rural communities and other difficult delivery contexts so that it culminates in the retention of teachers and learners in rural areas. More specifically, the following should be considered:

- Ring-fencing part of the education budget at the national level to address post provisioning for rural schools and schools with less than 3 teachers or 100 learners;
- More centralized government control of teacher education, through the provision of bursaries as a tool to attract prospective teachers;
- In areas of serious teacher shortages in rural schools and other difficult delivery contexts, priority be given to recruiting educators from the same communities rather than appointing teachers from urban or other external areas;
- Appointing beginner teachers for specific periods (between 2 to 5 years) before they can request transfers or be allowed to apply for promotion posts. This will ensure a degree of continuity and stability at schools in rural areas or in difficult-delivery contexts.
- Use of senior pupils/trainee teachers;
- A teacher transport allowance for qualified educators teaching in rural areas;
- Reducing the time trainee teachers spend in pre-service education, for example, from three to two years, without in any way compromising issues of quality;
- Additional remuneration/rural allowance;
- Involvement of local government through the building of houses and provision of solar electricity; and
- Relaxing of promotion criteria for educators/principals in rural areas, for example, the lowering of years of experience required for particular post levels.

These recommendations should be considered as part of a comprehensive rural strategy to address teacher retention and performance and hence enhance education quality provision. In order to do this, it is recommended that the DoE establish a Rural Education Unit to oversee the development and monitoring of policies relating to public educators in rural schools.

8.3.5 Teacher education and professional development

The use of teacher training institutions to serve as both sites of pre-service teacher education and as sites of teacher professional development in close collaboration with teacher centres (as is the case in Mexico through the Institute for Assessment and Innovation of Education (INEVAL)), should be considered.

Greater use of distance education and information communication technology (ICT) should be promoted in the delivery of teacher education and professional development.

The applications of competency examinations to assess teacher trainees' potential to become good teachers should be explored in all teacher education programmes in SA.

It is important that teachers are unambiguously committed to the profession thus signaling a willingness to remain in the profession. This is critical to addressing the education quality challenge, which requires committed, qualified, competent and effective educators at all levels of the system. One way of facilitating this is to have high entry-level qualifications for joining the teaching profession.

Teacher training should be aligned with the content for the utilization of the 80 hours set aside for professional development. All educators have opportunities to attend training workshops for a certain number of days during school holidays to keep them abreast of the latest curriculum, HR and IT developments. The DoE should provide guidelines to provinces in this regard.

8.3.6 Performance management, promotions and career pathing

Consideration should be given to linking educators' performance with learner achievement. This is regarded as key to improving the quality of teaching and learning and constitutes one of several teacher assessment factors in Cuba and Mexico.

Performance management should be made fundamental at all levels of the education system. This should include performance evaluation measure for educators as well as school managers.

Consideration could be given to establishing an independent education evaluation centre that monitors and evaluates the health of the education system, including the performance of teachers;

The practice of "Opening the Doors of the Classroom" which allows parents, during a designated week, to visit schools and observe teachers teaching a lesson to their children should be promoted. Overall, a greater community role,

especially by parents, in supporting and encouraging teachers to perform optimally, is recommended.

Performance rewards/incentives should be provided for all teachers, with specified criteria.

Career pathing in Jamaica and Mexico provides for progression from teacher, to senior teacher to master teachers. The creation of a non-professional category of educators to teach where professional educators are not willing to teach may be considered.

8.3.7 Employee relations and conditions of service

Key lessons relating to employee relations that could benefit educators' contribution to quality education include:

- Greater emphasis on educators' social commitment to the profession, including a strong work ethic. Teacher unions should take the lead in fostering a cooperative and non-antagonistic relationship in the provision of providing quality public education; and
- Instituting a more compact, time and output-based based collective bargaining and negotiations process. For example, it could be specified that all negotiations be concluded within 1 month, with the option to extend negotiations for a maximum period of 1 week. Thereafter, the negotiating parties may opt for appropriate action within the labour legislation guidelines to force a resolution.

It is further proposed that the overall service packages for teachers be strengthened by considering the following possibilities:

- Special housing allowances for teachers based in rural schools;
- A teacher transport allowance for educators who have to commute long distances;
- More attractive study leave benefits;
- Increasing government's pension contribution;
- Increasing government's medical aid contribution or making it more responsive to teachers suffering with HIV/Aids and other chronic diseases; and
- Introducing government cover for funeral/ burial costs of educators in poor communities.

8.3.8 EMIS

It is recommended that the Department of Education establish an integrated education database with information on educators that could be accessed by a range of stakeholders, particularly school management, teachers and organizations such as the ELRC and SACE. As reported in the study on Factors Determining Educator Supply and Demand (2005), the methods of collecting and managing EMIS data need careful evaluation to assess their effectiveness.

Further, the DoE should consider:

- Expanding its EMIS department to include research and policy components to enhance overall policy formulation and implementation with regard to public educators;
- The development of an EMIS master plan;
- The establishment of a Center of Educational Technologies to strengthen the use of information technologies throughout the education system;
- The development of both macro- and micro- (school-based) indicators to monitor and evaluate the performance of the education system; and
- The organization of a 'technical' visit to SA by a team of EMIS experts, for example, from the Mexican EMIS department to strengthen the development of SA's own Education Management Information System.

UK AND IRELAND STUDY RESEARCH VISIT REPORT

2

REPORT ON ELRC STUDY TOUR TO ENGLAND AND IRELAND: OCTOBER 2008

1. Introduction

2. England

- 2.1 Introduction: The Education System**
- 2.2 Teacher Salaries**
- 2.3 Quality Assurance**
- 2.4 Further Education**
- 2.5 Teacher Education**

3. Ireland

- 3.1 Introduction: The Education System**
- 3.2 Teacher Salaries**
- 3.3 Quality Assurance**
- 3.4 Further Education**
- 3.5 Teacher Education**
- 3.6 Teacher Development**
- 3.7 The Teaching Council**

References

**Appendix: Attracting, Developing and Retaining Effective
Teachers: Findings from the Country Report for
Ireland, OECD, April 2003**

1. Introduction

In 2005, the ELRC prepared a proposal for utilizing its budgetary allocation for the period 2005 to 2008. A number of key policy development areas were identified to enable educators to enhance education quality, including improved career opportunities, performance rewards, incentives, social support and counselling services, retraining educators in mathematics and science and improving human resource management capacity. In reviewing current policies and practices, it became apparent that local solutions and innovations were inadequate and that there was a need to capitalise on international experience and expertise to give fresh impetus to engaging on the issues to be addressed. As a result, it was agreed that a series of study visits would be undertaken, to amongst others, England and Ireland.

The need for the study visits were also underlined by the ELRC agreement on the Framework for the Establishment of an Occupational Specific Dispensation (OSD) for Educators and notably the ELRC/HSRC studies on Educator Workload in South Africa.

The study tour to England and Ireland was undertaken by a joint delegation of the Employer and Unions. In both countries there were meetings with Government Departments and Unions. This document reports on the impressions of the group and the key findings with respect to, inter alia, teacher salaries, quality assurance, teacher education, further education, and vital institutional arrangements and mechanisms in both countries.

2. England

2.1 Introduction: the Education System

In England the following Government Departments and Unions were visited:

- Department for Children, Schools and Families (DCSF) and the Department for Innovation, Universities and Skills (DIUS);
- Learning Skills Council
- Training and Development Agency for Schools
- National Association of Schoolmasters Union of Women Teachers (NASUWT) – also known as “The Teachers’ Union”; and National Union for Educators (NUT)

2.1.1 The English Education System

Up to the beginning of 2007, public education was being governed by a single department. In 2007, with the appointment of Gordon Brown as Prime Minister (PM), one of the first things that he did was to split the current education department into three, namely the (a) Department for Children, Schools and Families, (b) the Department for Innovation, Universities and Skills (DIUS) and (c) the Department for Business, Enterprise and Regulatory Reform (DBERR).

At local level, the local authorities take responsibility for implementing policy for public education and state schools. There is also a strong tradition of independent schooling.

In 2007, the Secretary of State for Children, Schools and Families, launched the 'Children's Plan' - a long term vision to improve schools and a step-change in the way parents and families are supported to deal with the new challenges faced by young people in the 21st century.

The plan was established to identify the need to adapt to the world that is changing rapidly, presenting new and exciting opportunities, but also risks and challenges. New technology and the internet offered countless exciting opportunities, but the bewildering pace of change leaves many parents nervous and poses various challenges.

The creation of the DCSF, and this Children's Plan, is the Government's response to these challenges. The plan sets out the commitments for how Government is going to ensure that by 2020, England is not just a good place to be a child but the best place in the world to grow up.

The Government believes that this plan will herald a radical change in the range of positive activities for young people and a revolution in the way parents are involved in the education of their children.

Schooling in England is compulsory between ages of 5 and 16. However, current government proposals are to continue with some form of education or training to age 18. The entitlement is also applicable from the age of 3 years. The Government is even considering reducing the entitlement to the age of 2 years.

Primary education is normally conducted through Infant and Junior schools or a combined Primary School. Below are the key stages of Primary education:

- Foundation Stage (in a pre-school / childcare environment)
- Full-time Foundation Stage 2 (in an Infant or Primary school)
- Key stage 1: Years 1 -2 (in an Infant, First or Primary school)
- Key stage 2: Years 3 - 6 (in Junior, Middle or Primary school)

Secondary education in England normally takes place in secondary schools, which cover the two secondary key stages namely:

- Key stage 3: Years 7 – 9
- Key stage 4: Years 10 – 11 (end of compulsory education)

Many secondary schools make provision for post-compulsory study to include years 12 and 13.

The maximum class size is 30 students per class. However, each school can also appoint additional teachers based on its budget.

Teachers work 1265 hours per annum over 190 days. They are required to be at school for 6 hours and 24 minutes that including 5 hours contact time. Teaching Assistants were introduced in 2000 in order to free teachers up to concentrate on more teaching time.

Further education is from the ages of 17 to 18 years of age.

Children are required to remain in education until the age of 18 years. Even though they may leave school at the age of 16, they are required to remain in some type of formal education. For example the company that they are working for is also regarded as a training ground and should put mechanisms in place to train them until the age of 18 years. From the age of 19, they become the responsibility of the local authorities.

Where families are poor and children cannot afford to remain in education, the Government pays them an Education Maintenance Allowance (EMA) of up to £30 per week. They also receive a bonus of up to £50 should they complete their course. Initially, they were paid the grant to only be in school. However, since 2006, the grant was linked to results.

2.2 Teacher Salaries

Each school receives a budget from the Government based on the number of learners at a school. The Governance Structure of a school recruits and selects teachers. In other words the governance structure can determine the number of teachers it wishes to employ. Schools advertise individually and compete with one another for the best teachers.

Classroom teachers start on the ‘main pay scale’ (Table 1). Teachers working in inner or outer London are are paid on separate pay scales, which reflect the higher cost of working and living in London and surrounding areas. Teachers usually start on M1. But if they have other teaching experience they may start higher up the scale. Schools may also award discretionary points for other relevant experience. Each school’s pay policy explains how these points are awarded.

The salary scales from September 2008 for teachers in England and Wales (outside London) are set out in Table 1.

Table 1: UK Teacher Pay Scales – September 2008

Spine Point	Annual salary in pounds sterling
M1	20 627
M2	22 259
M3	24 048
M4	25 898
M5	27 939
M6	30 148
Threshold – Upper Pay Range	
1	32 660
2	33 870
3	35 121

The starting salary depends on the number of ‘spine points’ allocated by the school governing body on the following grounds:

- **Qualifications:** there are no longer any extra points given for qualifications. The minimum starting point for new entrants is therefore M1.
- **Experience:** The relevant body has discretion to award additional points on the main pay scale for years of relevant experience other than teaching experience, which attract mandatory experience points. This may include teaching in independent schools, or in schools in Scotland, Northern Ireland, the Channel Islands, the Isle of Man or overseas, or non-teaching experience, whether paid or not, which the relevant body considers of value to the performance of the teacher’s duties. The relevant body can decide what should count as relevant experience in this context, and how many such points to award. Each case should be considered on its merits. Once awarded, experience points, whether originally mandatory or discretionary, may not be taken away, regardless of whether the teacher remains in the same school or obtains a post in another school. No teacher can be paid more than five points for experience.

Before local management of schools, local authorities (LAs) had standard formulae to calculate the discretionary increments for experience other than as a teacher. This usually took the form of one increment for each three years of service which were deemed to be relevant to teaching. In some cases, for example, where industrial experience was

particularly relevant to the post in which the teacher was appointed, the teacher could be awarded one increment for each year of service.

It is now for the governing body to determine whether to award discretionary experience points, and if so, in what circumstances and at what level discretion will be exercised.

Discretionary additional payments: Governing bodies and LAs may whatever payment they see fit to a teacher for:

- a) continuing professional development undertaken outside the school day;
- b) activities relating to the provision of initial teacher training (ITT) as part of the ordinary conduct of the school; and
- c) participation in out-of-school learning activities.

The relevant pay policy sets out the criteria by which the governing body determines the nature and level of such payments. There is no requirement on the part of teachers for them to undertake any of the above activities outside the school day and that to do so is the choice of the individual, not the school, governing body, or LA. Similarly, teachers who undertake school-based ITT activities do so on a voluntary basis, unless s/he is an Advanced Skills Teacher (AST) for whom this is a professional duty.

Salary rises: Teachers receive a salary rise when pay scales and allowances are updated. In addition, each September, teachers who are not already at the top of the main scale move to the next point on the scale subject to satisfactory performance – but they may advance by two points, in total, if their performance is excellent.

Upper pay scale: Qualified teachers who reach the top of the main pay scale may apply to be assessed against the post-threshold standards. If they meet the standards, they cross the “threshold” to the first point on the upper pay scale. The threshold provides an opportunity for good classroom teachers to progress to a higher salary range. Teachers on the upper pay scale receive the usual salary rise when the pay scales are updated. However, progression on the upper pay scale is performance based. Governing bodies make the decisions on progression, based on recommendations from heads. Teachers will not normally move through the upper pay scale more frequently than every two years.

Other payments: Classroom teachers who take on a significant responsibility that is not required of others, may be awarded a Teaching and Learning Responsibility (TLR) payment. Schools can also make extra payments or offer other benefits to teachers for recruitment and retention purposes and can decide the amounts themselves. These may be awarded for a fixed period not exceeding three years. In exceptional cases awards for retention purposes may be renewed.

Advanced Skills Teachers (ASTs) have their own 18 point pay spine. Each AST is paid within a five point range which is based primarily on the nature of the work to be undertaken, the scale of the challenges to be tackled, the professional competencies

required and any other recruitment considerations. ASTs receive an increase when the pay scales are updated and may also be awarded one or two pay points each September for high quality performance. The AST grade offers excellent classroom teachers the opportunity to continue teaching and use their skills to enhance the performance of other teachers both within their school and others within the locality. The pay spine reflects the fact that the grade is an alternative career path to taking up a leadership or management post.

Excellent teachers: Excellent teachers have a set salary. ETs must have been on U3 for a minimum of 2 years when they take up post. Although there are similarities between ETs and ASTs, ETs use and share their skills in classroom teaching for the benefit of professional development of other teachers within their school. ASTs disseminate good practice to schools other than their own, by working in other schools.

Leadership group: Head teachers and other school leaders are paid on the 43-point leadership spine which extends from about 35 000 pounds in 2007 to 98 000 pounds. Heads' pay is normally related to school group size, but governing bodies may pay more where necessary to recruit and retain head teachers of the most challenging and largest schools. Deputies and assistant heads are paid on a five point range below that of the head teacher and above the pay of the highest paid classroom teacher. Members of the leadership group all receive an increase when the pay scales are updated, but may also be awarded one or two pay points in September each year, provided their performance is of high quality.

Pay progression: Under the revised performance management regulations, which came into force in September 2007, there is no change to the arrangements for pay progression. Annual increments continue to apply as set out in the School Teachers' Pay and Conditions Document (STPCD) for classroom teachers on the main scale. Therefore reviewers do not need to make a recommendation in support of an annual increment. The only exception to this is where the reviewer, in accordance with the school's pay policy, is considering a discretionary additional point (e.g. double jumping) where provided for in the STPCD.

Performance-related pay: All performance related pay recommendations are based on a review of overall performance. Reviewers will only need to make a performance-related pay recommendation where the reviewee is on: (a) the pay scale for post-threshold teachers; (b) the pay spine for members of the Leadership Group; or (c) the pay spine for Advanced Skills Teachers. Reviewers' pay recommendations are passed to the head teacher as part of the planning and review statement and the head teachers passes the pay recommendation on to the governing body.

Unqualified teachers: Unqualified teachers are paid on a ten point scale. The governing body decides where on the scale an unqualified teacher should start, and may also pay an additional allowance on top of this. Trainee teachers following an employment-based route to qualified teacher status may be paid on the qualified or unqualified teachers' pay scale.

Discretionary recruitment incentives: Governing bodies and LAs may make such payments or provide other financial assistance, support or benefits to a teacher as they consider necessary as an incentive for the recruitment of new teachers and the retention in their service of existing teachers. A recruitment incentive that consists of periodic payments can only be paid for a maximum of three years and cannot be renewed.

2.3 Quality Assurance

The government body responsible for quality assurance in England is Ofsted – the Office for Standards in Education, Children’s Services and Skills. Ofsted was established by the Education and Inspections Act and is the non-ministerial government department of “Her Majesty’s Chief Inspector of Schools in England” (HMCI). This body inspects and regulates care for children and young people, and inspects education and training for learners of all ages.

Ofsted reports directly to Parliament instead of government ministries, thus ensuring impartial information and findings.

Ofsted strives to promote service improvement, ensuring that services focus on the interests of the users, that services are efficient, effective and promote value for the taxpayers’ money.

Hundreds of inspections and regulatory visits are conducted each week. Findings are then published on its website for all to see.

The current system of inspection (since September 2005) is that of short notice inspections. Under this system, the senior leadership of each school is required to complete a Self Evaluation Form (SEF) on a continual basis, which requires them to be aware of strengths and areas for development. Inspections take place every three years with a key focus on how well the school is managed, and what processes are in place to ensure standards of teaching and learning improve. A school’s performance is judged by the accuracy of self-evaluation combined with evidence and strategic policies for development and improvement.

A school could be placed under special measures if it is judged as “inadequate” in one or more areas and if the inspectors have decided it does not have the capacity to improve without additional help. Schools placed into special measures receive extensive support from local authorities, additional funding and resources and frequent re-appraisal from Ofsted until the school is no longer deemed to be failing. Furthermore, the senior managers and teaching staff can be dismissed and an appointed executive committee may replace the school governors. Schools which are failing but where inspectors consider there is capacity to improve are given a “Notice to Improve”.

Performance Management Policies within schools also ensure quality education. The Government has published new performance management regulations for schools. These regulations require school governing bodies to establish performance management policies and classroom observation protocols and to review them annually. Head

Teachers can either themselves conduct performance management reviews of their teacher colleagues or delegate this responsibility to identified teachers who will conduct performance reviews of other teachers. For Head Teachers, the school governing bodies have been designated as reviewers.

Each school governing body must consult all teachers within its school and seek to agree on a performance management policy with the recognised trade unions, having regard to the consultation with all teachers. The performance management policy must contain the school's classroom observation protocol.

In practice, it will be Head Teachers who consult all teachers in schools and seek to reach agreement with recognised trade unions. Further, it is Head Teachers who formulate draft performance management policies and present them to governing bodies for approval.

It is required that Performance Management Policies contain the following:

- Results the policy is intended to achieve and how these will be measured;
- Outlining how the school's arrangements for school teacher performance management link with those for school improvement, school self-evaluation and school development training;
- How the school will seek to achieve consistency of treatment and fairness between those teachers with similar experience or levels of responsibility;
- The timing of the cycle;
- A classroom observation protocol (Some unions have even developed classroom observation protocols to assist schools);
- Provision for performance management training to be made available as the need arises;
- The arrangements for monitoring and evaluating the policy; and
- Specifics on any ancillary or supplementary procedures necessary for the operational performance management of teachers at the school.

The new performance management regulations for schools were published in 2002. Revised regulations came into effect on 1 September 2007. In summary, they require school governing bodies to establish performance management policies and classroom observation protocols and to review them annually. As part of this requirement, Head Teachers can conduct performance management reviews of their teachers themselves or delegate this to other identified teachers (reviewees). For Head Teachers, school governing bodies have been designated as reviewers. Each school's governing body must consult all teachers and unions in the school to agree on a performance management policy. The policy must include classroom observation protocol. Performance management is much the same as in South Africa. Teachers were evaluated annually from 2002. Key features of this process include the following:

- The aim is to establish a professional conversation between educator and observer (viewer and the reviewee).
- It is linked to salary progression.

- At least 3 hours of classroom observation per annum.
- Final decision lies with governing body.
- Principal is the observer of all teachers unless he delegates.
- Observer is responsible for the whole process.
- Enough time must be made available for observing so that it aids the observer in the proper execution of his task.
- Each school has its own performance policy, compiled by the governing body and staff of that school.
- Although there are approximately 10 aims, it is acceptable if you only meet the requirements of 3 to qualify for progression.

Once assessed, a teacher will move to the upper pay structure of performance related pay, i.e. U1, U 2, U3. This is based on a one year cycle. Assessment is not perceived to be a punitive instrument. It is the only source of evidence linked to pay progression. The reviewer makes a recommendation and the Head Teacher may not amend the recommendation. However, the final decision lies with the governing body. Classroom observation is undertaken by inspectors and officials.

2.4 Further Education

There are close to 400 further education colleges with about five million learners catering for all levels of education, including degree courses, ranging from reading and writing, all skills including nursing, hospitality, travel, horticulture, mechanics, construction and design.

Sponsorship of the further education service, including general further education colleges and training providers, rests with the Department of Innovation, Universities, and Skills (DIUS). The Skills Funding Agency is responsible for delivering key elements, such as taking account of the overall goals for the service and supporting strategies for meeting those goals. It maintains oversight of the pattern and range of institutions, their performance and viability, covering their work with both young people and adults.

The Skills Funding Agency is responsible for managing the performance of FE colleges and providers. The system is increasingly self-regulating, as funding follows choices made by customers, but the SFA is responsible for intervening where performance does not meet the nationally agreed minimum standards. A framework for such intervention has already been established, and in such a situation the SFA is responsible for deciding the appropriate course of action.

FE colleges are autonomous, and responsible for developing their own strategy to respond to government priorities and other demands. This is likely to lead to the structure and composition of FE provision evolving as a result of strategic decisions taken by colleges and changing demand. The Skills Funding Agency maintains an overview of the developing institutional pattern, supports colleges as they respond to change, and ensures such changes take relevant interests into account.

Since 2001 Further Education (FE) in England has been funded through the Learning and Skills Council (LSC), the largest government agency funding education provision. The LSC has a budget of some £13 billion and is organised on a regional basis through around 47 local councils. The LSC has a particular mission to improve and expand further education provision, particularly in skills-based vocational provision in FE colleges. Recent government-driven LSC and Department for Education and Skills policies, such as Success for All and the Skills Strategy, articulate this vision.

Colleges in England that are regarded as part of the FE sector include:

- General FE and tertiary colleges;
- Sixth form colleges;
- Specialist colleges (mainly colleges of agriculture and horticulture and colleges of drama and dance);
- Adult education institutes.

From September 2007, teachers working in FE in England are required to gain professional status, known as Qualified Teacher Learning and Skills (QTLS). The first stage of QTLS is an initial “passport to teaching” module. The second stage is full teacher training, which would typically take up to five years to complete. The qualification covers both taught and practical skills, and also requires teachers to undertake 30 hours of continuous professional development per year. Good quality teaching is indicated by the award of the Training Quality Standard – an initiative to improve the quality of provision for vocational education, while all colleges and FE providers are subject to regular inspections by Ofsted. Lifelong Learning UK is the independent sector skills council responsible for the qualifications and standards for teachers working in FE. The trade unions for FE staff are the University and College Union and the Association of Teachers and Lecturers.

In England, further education is often seen as forming one part of a wider learning and skills sector, alongside workplace education, prison education and other types of non-school, non-university education and training. Since June 2007, the sector is overseen by the new Department for Innovation, Universities and Skills, although some parts fall within the new Department for Children, Schools and Families.

2.5 Teacher Education

All teacher education takes place in universities. Minimum requirements for a qualified teacher comprise a degree plus post-graduate training.

The Training and Development Agency for Schools (TDA) was established in 1995 to address teacher shortages in maths, science, technology and commercial subjects. The TDA provided bursaries for post-graduate students, £6000 per annum in 2000 for 20 000 post-graduate students.

A qualified educator is someone with a degree followed by post-graduate training as teacher at a university. The last teacher's training college closed in 2005. Allocations from the TDA enabled teachers training to compete, with other occupations, but money was clearly not the only driver. Educators actually want to become maths and science teachers for the love of it. Incentives were given to those graduates who wanted to become teachers. Once they completed their studies and a period of probation, another incentive was paid. However, it was found that incentives lose their impact as time goes on. Students were also trained in skills to work with parents, colleagues, all in preparation for the job. The incentives also assisted in getting teachers into schools with the greatest challenges for recruitment, for example, secondary schools like those in difficult socio-economic contexts.

As described earlier, the *Teachers Development Agency* was started in 1995 with its main target the recruitment of teachers. The TDA has control over the expenditure for teacher training at universities and monitor standards via inspections. Money is allocated to advance teacher training. Schools release teachers for 56 days pa for full time training as required at universities for updates on training. Substitute teachers are appointed. Schools are also responsible for school training programmes. They determine what training universities must deliver, they focus on quality of output.

Unqualified teachers coming from private sector can sit for exams. To become qualified, they are assessed by service provider at his discretion.

A new programme is to be launched from 2009, the *Master Education Teaching and Learning* level. A massive rollout of the program is on its way and 2500 educators are projected. The course is offered to all newly-qualified educators in England.

It was observed that there appeared to be no link to needs at schools and in/outputs at universities for teacher training. Money is allocated for whatever number of educators is enrolled for training and it appears as if there is always a fair supply of educators.

To be eligible for a training bursary, an ITT (Initial Teacher Training) trainee must meet eight criteria:

- Meet entry requirements onto post-graduate ITT course
- Not already a qualified teacher
- Not already employed in a school as teacher
- Not undertaking any other ITT training
- Be an 'eligible' student for provision of student support
- Have been notified by provider that they are eligible
- Be taking a qualifying ITT Course

- Comply with terms and conditions of the new bursary scheme

From 2009/10, Teacher Trainees will be charged for teacher training but can apply for a tuition fee loan. In the past it was free.

Recruitment premiums are paid to increase chemistry and physics specialists, incentives are provided for service providers (£ 2000) and for Modern Foreign Languages, Design and Technology, £ 1000 per student).

A new framework of professional standards for teachers came into effect on 1 September 2007. This includes standards for induction, which a newly qualified teacher is required to meet. They are expected to function fully by the end of their induction period and are subject to inspection for confirmation of their appointment.

2.6 Key Institutional Arrangements

2.6.1 Department for Children, Schools and Families

The new Department for Children, Schools and Families (DCSF) was established to enable all children and young people to reach their full potential.

The DCSF intends building on the successes in education and children's services that have been seen over the last decade. It focuses on the significant challenges that remain – raising standards so that more children and young people reach expected levels, lifting more children out of poverty and re-engaging disaffected young people. The new structure will also allow it to respond to new challenges that will affect children and families: demographic and socio-economic change; developing technology; and increasing global competition.

In addition to its direct responsibilities, the department will lead work across Government to improve outcomes for children, including work on children's health and child poverty.

The purpose of the DCSF is to make England the best place in the world for children and young people to grow up. Their aim is to:

- make children and young people happy and healthy;
- keep them safe and sound;
- give them a top class education; and
- help them stay on track.

The DCSF intends achieving this with the implementation of a Children's Plan that consist of the following:

- strengthen support for all families during the formative early years of their children's lives;

- take the next steps in achieving world class schools and an excellent education for every child;
- involve parents fully in their children's learning;
- help to make sure that young people have interesting and exciting things to do outside of school; and
- provide more places for children to play safely.

It also means a new leadership role for Children's Trusts in every area, a new role for schools as the centre of their communities, and more effective links between schools, the National Health Service (NHS) and other children's services so that together they can engage parents and tackle all the barriers to the learning, health and happiness of every child.

2.6.2 Learning and Skills Council (LSC)

The LSC was created by the Learning and Skills Act 2000 and amended by the Further Education and Training Act 2007 to 'modernise and simplify' the planning, funding and delivery of education and training for people over the age of 16 in England, other than those in universities. It began its work in April 2001.

The LSC is a non-departmental public body which began work in 2001, taking over the roles of the former Further Education Funding Council and Training and Enterprise Councils.

The LSC is responsible for planning and funding high quality education and training (further education) for everyone in England other than those in universities. There is a national office in Coventry and nine regional offices overseeing the work of the local partnership teams throughout the country.

The LSC's major tasks are to:

- raise participation and achievement by young people;
- increase adult demand for learning;
- raise skills levels for national competitiveness;
- improve the quality of education and training delivery;
- equalize opportunities through better access to learning; and
- improve the effectiveness and efficiency of the sector.

The LSC research and evaluation team manage several projects which provide the LSC and its partners with robust understanding of the skills and training needs of employers, the key future skills challenges in England, and the extent to which the provision that we fund in all areas of learning meets the needs and requirements of learners. These projects are:

- National Employer Skills Survey, commissioned by the LSC, the DIUS, and the UK Commission for Employment and Skills to provide information on the extent, causes and implications of recruitment problems, skills gaps, and training behaviour in England.
- Skills in England 2008: The Skills in England report has been published annually since 2001, and using secondary analysis synthesizes the latest research and analysis. The report is a collaborative publication undertaken with a range of key partners. This year the report will include a series of chapters on a variety of important skills issues facing the economy.
- Working Futures 2007-2017: This is an established and respected series of employment projections for the UK. The results are intended to provide a sound statistical foundation for the consideration of all those with an interest in the supply and demand of skills, including individuals, employers, education and training providers as well as the various agencies and departments of government. The results are based on the use of multi-sectoral, regional macroeconomic model, combined with occupational and replacement demand modules from secondary data.
- National Learner Satisfaction Survey 08/09: The survey of learners provides a national overview of delivery and satisfaction with education and training in England among LSC-funded learners aged 16 or over. The survey captures their perceptions on various aspects of their learning as well as establishing benchmarks against which to monitor trends in earners' levels of satisfaction. This provides invaluable insight into learners' perceptions of what is already working well and what might need to be improved so as to help the LSC and its partners understand and respond better to learners' needs.

The LSC also runs a Learner Support Programme that has a number of strands targeting those learners most in need of financial help, namely:

- Education Maintenance Allowance. To help learners from low income households;
- Care to Learn. To help parents with childcare costs;
- Dance and Drama Awards. To help talented individuals;
- 16-18 Discretionary Hardships. To help young learners most in need;
- Residential Schemes. To help learners who need to study away from home;
- Adult Learning Grant. To help adults on low income achieve their first levels 2/3
- Career Development Loans. Loans to help meet the cost of learning that improves career prospects;
- 20+ Childcare. To help adults with childcare costs while they learn;
- 19+ Discretionary Hardships. To help adults learners most in need;
- Residential Schemes. To help learners who need to study away from their homes; and
- Contracts and e- Delivery Team. Backroom services for learner support.

In order to track a learner and to ensure that he/she receives the required education, the LSC has implemented a connection service that tracks children in the system

LSC research also supports the development of the National Apprenticeship Service through a series of projects designed to inform the understanding of the supply and demand for apprenticeships, through:

- expanding apprenticeships in the public sector;
- identifying sectors for expansion in the number of apprenticeships; and
- demonstrating the benefits to learners of completing an apprenticeship.

The Skills Funding Agency is responsible for ensuring that the overall environment or ‘trading conditions’ in FE created by Government are highly supportive of upskilling to meet the nation’s needs. The SFA is therefore responsible for the performance management of FE colleges.

As a key part of creating a genuinely demand-led system, the SFA will lead the development and management of the new England-wide adult advancement and careers service. It will play a vital role, with Jobcentre Plus, in boosting individual demand for skills and guiding people to the right training to meet their needs and help change their lives. The agency will, in the long term, be responsible for all programmes of financial support to help adult learners meet the additional costs of learning in FE that could otherwise prevent them from participating.

2.6.3 The Training and Development Agency (TDA)

The TDA was established since 1995. The Agency was set up to provide a focus on recruitment and training of teachers. The TDA is independent of the Government.

The TDA also provides assistance and guidance, inter alia, on the following: ways into teaching; the route to teacher training; finding a training provider; applying for teacher training; funding for teacher training; induction for newly qualified teachers; professional standards for teachers; performance management; continuing professional development guidance; returning to teaching; national occupational standards; school improvement planning; and training for support staff;

3. Ireland

3.1 Introduction: the Education System

The following Government Departments and Unions were visited:

- The Department of Education and Science
- The Teaching Council of Ireland
- The Institute of Technology
- The Teachers Union of Ireland

3.1.1 The Education System

Education has always been highly valued in Ireland. Even in historic times of great political, economic and social difficulty, the desire for education was very much in evidence. Prior to the establishment of a national system of primary education in 1831, there was already in existence a vast network of schools, the great majority of them provided by a people who had been dispossessed of their lands and who were experiencing harsh penal legislation.

Education is now regarded as a central plank in the economic, social and cultural development of Irish society. Governments and the social partners view it as strategically interlinked with national planning. There is a high level of public interest in educational issues, which has been further developed by the consultative approach adopted by the Government in the formulation of education policy. Irish pupils perform in the top sectors in international studies such as the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD) PISA evaluations. Employers, both national and international, affirm the quality of graduates from the Irish education system.

Education in Ireland is compulsory from age 6 to 16. While there is no national provision for pre-schooling in Ireland, first level schools accept children on or after their fourth birthday.

The vast majority of schools are State funded, while privately owned "all-through" schools, catering for pupils from 4 to 12 years of age. The curriculum followed is a child-centred one and it allows for flexibility in timetabling and teaching methods.

The great majority of pupils transfer to second level school when they have completed the full first level course – generally at about 12 years of age. For registration in a second level school, students must be aged 12 on 1 January in the first year of attendance. The second level education sector comprises secondary, vocational, community and comprehensive schools.

The second level school span is predominantly a six-year cycle, taken from ages 12 to 18.

Apart from internal school tests, there are two key public examinations taken by students – the Junior Certificate (age 15/16) and the Leaving Certificate (age 17/18). These are external examinations set by the State Examinations Commission.

Third level education in Ireland is provided mainly by universities, institutes of technology and colleges of education. In addition, a number of other third level institutions provide specialist education in a number of professions such as medicine and law. Most third level education institutions are supported substantially by the State.

3.1.1.1 First Level Education (Primary)

There are over 440,000 children in first level education. Although children in Ireland are not obliged to attend school until the age of six, almost all children begin school in the September following their fourth birthday.

The general aims of first level education are:

- to enable the child to live a full life as a child and to realise his or her potential as a unique individual
- to enable the child to develop as a social being through living and co-operating with others and so contribute to the good of society
- to prepare the child for a continuum of learning.

The curriculum is divided into the following key areas:

- Language
- Mathematics
- Social, Environment and Scientific Education
- Arts Education, including Visual Arts, Music and Drama
- Physical Education
- Social, Personal and Health Education.

3.1.1.2 Second Level Education (Post-Primary)

The second level education sector comprises secondary, vocational, community and comprehensive schools. Secondary schools are privately owned and managed. The trustees of the majority of these schools are religious communities or Boards of Governors. Vocational schools are State established and are administered by Vocational Education Committees (VECs) while community and comprehensive schools are managed by Boards of Management of differing compositions.

second level education aims to provide a comprehensive, high-quality learning environment which aims to prepare individual students for higher or continuing education or for immediate entry into the workplace.

Second level education consists of a three-year Junior Cycle (lower secondary), followed by a two or three year Senior Cycle (upper secondary), depending on whether the optional Transition Year is taken. It is usual for students to commence the Junior Cycle at age 12. A State Examination, the Junior Certificate, is taken after three years.

The Senior Cycle caters for students in the 15 to 18 year age group. It has undergone significant restructuring in recent years.

During the final two years of Senior Cycle students take one of three programmes, each leading to a State Examination – the traditional Leaving Certificate, the Leaving Certificate Vocational Programme (LCVP) or the Leaving Certificate Applied (LCA).

3.1.1.3 The Leaving Certificate

The long established, traditional Leaving Certificate examination is the terminal examination of post-primary education and is taken when students are typically 17 or 18 years of age.

In 2003, over 53,000 students took the Leaving Certificate Examination. The Leaving Certificate is the main basis upon which places in universities, institutes of technology and colleges of education are allocated.

3.1.1.4 Third Level Education

Traditionally the system of third level education in Ireland has comprised the university sector, the technological sector and the colleges of education, all of which are substantially funded by the State. In recent years, a number of independent private colleges have been established which offer a range of courses complementing the existing provision in the sector.

The 35 year period from 1965 to 2000 saw the number of students in third level education grow from 18,200 to almost 120,000. These rapidly growing numbers reflect increasing retention rates at second level, demographic trends and higher transfer rates into third level education.

3.1.1.5 University Sector

The seven universities in the State are autonomous, self-governing institutions. The Irish university system offers degree programmes – at Bachelor, Masters and Doctorate level – in the humanities, in the sciences (including technological and social) and in medicine.

3.1.1.6 Technological Sector

The Department of Education and Science has overall responsibility for the technological sector of third level education.

Institutions in the technological sector provide programmes of education and training in areas such as Business, Science, Engineering, Linguistics and Music to certificate, diploma and degree levels.

3.1.1.7 Colleges of Education

There are five Colleges of Education, which specialise in the training of first level teachers. They offer two courses – a three-year Bachelor of Education Degree and an eighteen-month Post Graduate Diploma.

The role of the Department in relation to the Colleges of Education is to ensure that the supply of teachers for first level schools is in accordance with identified needs. For second level teachers, training usually involves completing a primary degree in a university or other third level institution, and a one-year Higher Diploma in Education. There are also teacher training colleges that specialise in the training of second level home economics teachers, teachers of religion and physical education.

3.1.1.8 Further and Adult Education

The term "Further Education" embraces education and training which occurs after second level schooling but which is not part of the third level system. This includes programmes such as Post Leaving Certificate courses, the Vocational Training Opportunities Scheme (second chance education for the unemployed), programmes in Youth reach and Senior Traveller Training Centres for early school leavers, adult literacy and basic education, and self-funded evening adult programmes in second level schools.

3.1.1.9 Special Education for Students with Disabilities

The Education Act, 1998 sets out the responsibility of the Minister for Education and Science to ensure 'that there is made available to each person resident in the State, including a person with a disability or who has other special educational needs, support services and a level and quality of education appropriate to meeting the needs and abilities of that person'. At present, special educational provision for students with disabilities ranges from additional support in mainstream schools to specialist support in special schools. Essentially there are three models of provision. The student with a disability may be enrolled in

- a mainstream class with additional support
- a special class in a mainstream school
- a special school which

3.1.1.10 Promoting Science and Technology in Education

As Ireland develops as a knowledge-based economy, a key challenge for education is to develop the necessary mix of creativity and skills to respond to the needs of a changing labour market. Research, development and innovation are critical elements in achieving and maintaining economic competitiveness and securing continued prosperity. The availability of an adequate number of graduates skilled in the fields of Maths, Physical Sciences, Biological Sciences, Technology and Engineering will be a critical factor in supporting this strategy.

For Ireland, future economic growth relies on the ability to attract and retain higher value activities and higher skills with an emphasis on research, design and innovation.

This involves moving from technology based development to innovation based development which is less vulnerable to competition from lower cost economies.

The report on the Education System in Ireland will focus on combined learning in the meetings with the above-mentioned bodies and will provide interesting figures and statistics on the learning institutions and educators.

3.1.2 The Administrative Framework for Education

3.1.2.1 The Minister for Education & Science

The Minister for Education and Science, who is a member of the Government and responsible to the Irish Parliament has specific responsibility for education policy issues ranging from pre-school education, through first level, second level, third level, adult and further education.

3.1.2.2 The Department of Education & Science

At the head of the Department is the Secretary General, who acts as Chief Executive Officer. He has overall responsibility for implementing and monitoring policy and delivering outputs, and for providing policy advice to the Minister and Government. In managing the Department, the Secretary General is assisted by the Management Advisory Committee representing the most senior officials in the Department.

3.1.2.3 The Legislative Framework

Many aspects of the administration of the Irish education system are centralised in the Department of Education and Science. The Department sets the general regulations for the recognition of schools, prescribes curricula and establishes regulations for the management, resourcing and staffing of schools, and negotiates teachers' salary scales.

The Education Act of 1998 ensures formal provision for the education “of every person in the State, including any person with a disability or who has other special educational needs”. The Act governs "primary, post-primary, adult and continuing education and vocational education and training". It sets out the functions and responsibilities of all key partners in the schooling system. It seeks the establishment of Boards of Management for all schools. It requires schools to engage in the preparation of school plans. Schools are required to promote parent associations. Accountability procedures are laid down. Attention is paid to the rights of parents and pupils. The Act also includes statutory provision for the National Council for Curriculum and Assessment (NCCA) and it sets out roles for the regional Education Centres. The majority of schools are privately owned and managed institutions, which, although funded by the State, enjoy a large degree of autonomy

3.1.2.4 Partnerships

Changes in education policy and practice in recent years have been characterised increasingly by an intensive process of consultation between the Department and the partners (parents, teacher representative organisations, Boards of Management) in education. The overall aim of this partnership approach is to have broad agreement on major areas of development in the education system.

3.1.2.5 Regional Offices

Many aspects of the administration of the Irish education system are centralised in the Department of Education & Science. The concept of the Regional Offices emerged from two concerns – the need to make the Department more accessible to the public and the need to free the Department from excessive preoccupation with details of the operation of the education system.

The Regional Offices will facilitate a two-way information flow between the educational users in the regions and the Department as well as promoting networking between the different educational partners.

3.2 Teacher Salaries

Teachers are paid on a “Common Basic Scale”. This is an incremental scale – a teacher progresses to the next point on the scale on the basis of satisfactory service. In effect this means that all teachers receive one increment annually. In addition there are allowances for qualifications for other factors. The scale is 25 points and qualified teachers start at point 2 or 3. Credit is given for part-time teaching experience or other relevant experience.

The scale consists of 25 points and qualified teachers start at point 2 or 3. Credit is given for part-time teaching experience or other relevant experience such as industry.

Merit pay is opposed by the unions because of the following:

- difficulty in measuring teaching quality;
- concerns about fairness of application of measurement; and
- divisiveness among staff.

How is teacher performance evaluated? If there are perceived difficulties these are identified in the first instance by the Principal and an improvement plan is prepared. Before any disciplinary action is taken there must be an independent evaluation by an Inspector of the Department of Education and Science. Before dismissal for inefficiency or incompetence there is an appeal process.

Allowances are paid for rural science teachers; teaching through Irish; island allowances; special allowances for teachers in Comprehensive schools; and teachers with 35 years service.

Promotion to “Posts of Responsibility” is available in four categories, namely:

1. Special Duties Teacher – a teacher within the particular school receives additional duties from an agreed list;
2. Assistant Principal – a teacher within a particular school receives additional duties from an agreed list;
3. Deputy Principal – this post is open for competition;
4. Principal – this post is open to competition.

The Special Duties Teacher as well as the Assistant Principal will receive additional allowances. These posts are advertised by way of closed competition within the particular school and these teachers must render services to these specific posts for 22 hours a week. The Deputy Principal and Principal posts are advertised openly. The salary for these posts depends on the number of teachers at the school. Seniority plays a role for promotion to these posts.

Teachers / Lecturers at the third level progress through 6 levels namely:

- Assistant Lecturer;
- Lecturer;
- Lecturer (Structures);
- Senior Lecturer 1;
- Senior Lecturer 2 – Head of Department;
- Senior Lecturer 3 – Head of School

An Assistant Lecturer will progress to the grade of Lecturer automatically after achieving the required qualification (Masters Degree or equivalent) and a “merit bar” test.

Promotion to the other grades is by way of recruitment by external competition. On appointment as a teacher or lecturer, the placement on the scale depends on experience – either teaching or other relevant experience.

Pay, in practice, is not related to teacher performance. However, a teacher can lose a salary increment as a result of a disciplinary sanction.

Student performance does not have any role in the salary of a teacher. Both the Department of Education and the unions resist this.

3.3 Quality Assurance

Quality learning outcomes are vital for the achievement of active citizenship, employment and social inclusion. In Ireland, there has been a growing recognition that quality in schools is best achieved when a range of measures work together to improve learning and teaching, and where everybody involved in the education system is focused on improvement. Schools themselves take some of these measures while other initiatives, such as curriculum development and support for teacher education, are organised by the Department or other agencies. External evaluation makes a further critical contribution, while system wide evaluations, sometimes undertaken in co-operation with other countries, provide valuable data and assist in policy development.

The role of the Department's schools Inspectorate is outlined in the Education Act, 1998. The Inspectorate is closely involved with many of the initiatives to improve the quality of teaching and learning at first and second levels. Together with the Higher Education Authority (HEA), the National Qualifications Authority of Ireland (NQAI), Further Education and Training Awards Council (FETAC) and the Higher Education and Training Awards Council (HETAC), the Department has a role in quality assurance in further and third level education.

The Irish Education system strives towards continuous school and system improvement through the following:

- National and international reporting on outcomes;
- The State Examinations Commission;
- Quality of external evaluation;
- A continuum of teacher education;
- Curriculum development and review (NCCA);
- The Teaching Council;
- Leadership Development in schools;
- Support for schools through planning and curriculum; and
- Additional supports and services to pupils.

The Irish have developed a system of ensuring quality in schools through a centralised Inspectorate for both the primary as well as secondary level teaching. This Inspectorate is a division of the Department of Education and Science and is a statutory remit under the Education Act of 1998.

The statutory duties of the Inspectorate include:

- to introduce and implement programmes of inspection in schools;
- to promote compliance with regulations and legislation;
- to provide an advisory role for schools as well as the Department; and
- to contribute to policy development.

The Inspectorate consists of more than 150 inspectors under a Chief Inspector and is organised into two subdivisions, namely Regional and Policy Support

There is a focus on evaluation in order to provide a review of how well schools are meeting their objectives. The Inspectorate is seen as a service provider to schools in terms of providing:

- support for leadership and management;
- critical analysis and commentary on teaching and learning and on the operation of the school in its context;
- realistic recommendations for action planning;
- a strong message about things that must be done better (where necessary); and
- findings that affirm professionalism and foster development.

The evaluation models used are Whole-School-Evaluation (WSE) and thematic / focused evaluations. In primary schools there is also a focus on looking at the performance of teachers on probation whereas in the secondary school level, there is bigger focus on subject inspection.

In terms of WSE, there are 5 areas that are evaluated namely:

- The quality of the school management;
- The quality of school planning;
- The quality of curriculum provision;
- The quality of learning and teaching; and
- The quality of support for students.

The *modus operandi* when evaluating schools to ensure that quality teaching and learning take place is to look at a school's planning documentation, assessment records and the school's Information Form. Furthermore, there are various observations of the teaching, learning and the interactions taking place with the students. There is also a discussion with all school personnel.

All evaluation reports of schools are published on the web / internet so that there is a wider audience looking at how schools perform. The implication hereof, one would think, is that schools strive to perform at the best of its ability because the evaluation findings it receives, not only have implications for the school itself, but also for services and agencies supporting schools.

Schools and systems are supported where areas for development are identified. There is currently a Literacy and Numeracy in Disadvantaged Schools Thematic Evaluation

Project running involving 12 of the 100 most disadvantaged schools (in the urban areas). The purpose of this project is to report on the quality of the provision for literacy and numeracy, to identify the school variables that impact on literacy and numeracy development and to recommend strategies and policies that can contribute to the improvement of the children's literacy and numeracy achievements.

3.4 Further Education and Training

Vocational education takes place at various levels – in schools, dedicated VEC (vocational education curriculum), FE (further education or post-school) colleges; and through adult education services; in training centres operated by the National Training Agency and other training agencies in specific remit areas such as tourism, fisheries, agriculture; and finally through an apprenticeship system – through on and off job training, the latter in training centres and Institutes of Technology for later stages.

The Further Education and Training Awards Council (FETAC) is the national awarding body and has a key role in guiding and monitoring quality assurance of learning programmes of the various service providers. The Council was established in order to determine National Standards for Awards; validate providers' programmes; validate access, transfer and progression routes; monitor the quality of programmes & assessment processes; and make, promote and recognise awards.

The Council interacts with and monitors the following training: government agencies; Dept. of Education & Training Centres; Adult Education; Workplace Training - private and public; Institutes of Technology; Special Schools and Community Centres; E-Learning and Distance Learning

The FETAC determines policies and procedures for service providers on : communication; equality; staff recruitment and development; access, transfer and progression; programme development, delivery and review; fair and consistent assessment of learners; recording learner achievement; protection for learners; sub-contracting/procuring programme delivery; and evaluation of programmes and services

The philosophy of the Institutes of Technology is outlined as follows:

- recognise and credentialize prior learning.
- under- and post graduate programmes with strong emphasis on the needs of the workplace and the individual.
- A research ethos that recognises the role it plays in the development of both society and the individual.
- Curricula that support the philosophy by making extensive use of cooperative education, work based research projects, problem based learning, etc.

- Seamless access, transfer and progression.
- Graduates who are skilled in the application of discipline knowledge, principles and concepts; reflective practitioners in the totality of their lives effective communicators; life-long learners; and culturally and socially aware.

Key aspects of Adult and Further Education and Training Policy include the following:

- to meet the needs of young early school leavers
- second-chance education options for those who left school without qualifications
- training options for unemployed people and other recipients of welfare benefits – for labour market entrants and re-entrants
- training and education options for those in employment;
- streamlined progression pathways – into HE or employment.

The Irish system is notable for the quality and relevance of what is on offer:

- Establishment in 2001 of National Qualifications Authority; Higher Education Awards Council (HETAC); and Further Education Awards Council (FETAC)
- NQF launched in 2003 with 10 levels, levels 1-6 for further education.
- Establishment of a National Office for Equity of Access to Higher Education.

The Irish National Framework of Qualifications

It has been recognized that learning does not have to end at a specific age and that people need and want to continue learning for life. To support this, a new NFQ has been developed and has been operational since 2006. The framework creates new and different opportunities for many including:

- people considering taking up education or training opportunities;
- learners already in education or training;
- teachers, tutors, and trainers involved in delivering education or training;
- organizations providing education and training; and
- employers who need clarity as to what different qualifications mean.

Until 2001 there were different awarding bodies involved in certifying programmes of education and training. All of these bodies offered opportunities for learners to get qualifications – yet it was not always clear how one award or qualification related to another. This made it more difficult for learners to get access to a particular programme, or to transfer from one programme to another as their learning progressed. The NFQ reduces these barriers for learners.

The Qualifications Act 1999 established three new bodies, namely National Qualifications Authority of Ireland, FETAC, and HETAC. The NQA is responsible for

developing the NFQ. The Further Education and Training Awards Council (FETAC) is the awarding body for all further education and training. The Higher Education and Training Awards Council (HETAC) makes awards for learning in a range of higher education and training institutions, including the Institutes of Technology.

There are a number of other awarding bodies which make awards within the new framework:

- The Dublin Institute of Technology (DIT) and the Universities which provide programmes and are awarding bodies in their own right.
- The State Examinations Commission (Department of Education & Science) awards the Junior Certificate and Leaving Certificate.

The NFQ comprises 10 levels and contains an initial set of 15 award types. Each level is based on specified standards of knowledge, skill and competence. A key feature of the new awards is that they will be made on the basis of 'learning outcomes', i.e. what a learner knows and can do. This is achieved by assessing the learner's abilities in the chosen award and recognizing the level and range of those abilities.

Who benefits from the framework?

Learners who:

- follow a course and get a nationally recognized qualification
- undergo training in their workplace and receive recognition
- achieve an award and use it to progress further.

Providers of education and/or training courses who want:

- all learners to have their achievement recognized nationally;
- to offer quality assured courses leading to national awards
- to create opportunities for progression in education and training

Employers who want:

- to understand and compare different types of qualifications
- to facilitate their staff in upskilling and improving their qualifications.

Further education and training in Ireland offers more opportunities than ever before and FETAC has become a unifying force for the sector. Since its foundation in 2001 FETAC has made over 100 000 quality assured awards every year to learners at all ages and stages of learning, opening doors to new or better jobs, further education or contributing to personal development.

With over 1 300 registered centres nationwide, FETAC gives people the opportunity to gain recognition for learning in education or training centres, in the community and in the work place. There are hundreds of FETAC awards available including everything from

childcare to catering, fishing to floristry, and the craft apprenticeships. All FETAC awards are quality assured, nationally and internationally recognized and form part of the NFQ.

The NFQ is a system of ten levels which incorporates qualifications for all kinds of learning, wherever it is gained. The framework brings greater clarity to the Irish education and training system, making it possible for learners, employers and providers to understand and compare different types of qualifications – nationally and internationally.

3.5 Teacher Education

For post-primary schools, teachers are trained in universities. This training entails a primary degree in a specific subject plus a one year post-graduate program. Training of primary school teachers takes place in colleges of education affiliated to a university.

There are five colleges of education specialising in the training of first level (primary) school teachers.

There are two models for teacher education, namely:

- The Consecutive Model: A University degree (3-4 years) followed by a post-graduate Diploma in Education;
- The Concurrent Model: A four-year university degree.

The Colleges provides undergraduate and postgraduate programmes in Education and the Humanities, including B.Ed, BA, MA, M Ed, Graduate Diploma in Education (Primary Teaching), Graduate Diploma in Special Educational needs, and continuing professional development courses for teachers.

The Graduate Diploma in Education (Primary Teaching) is an eighteen month full-time course enabling third level graduates to qualify as primary teachers. The Department of Education and Science makes the decision to run this course, in conjunction with the College, on a year-to-year basis. Persons who successfully complete this course may be registered by the Teaching Council as fully qualified for service in the country's primary schools

The three-year Education course aims to prepare students for their professional work as primary school teachers.

First year courses are orientated towards the earlier years and second year courses towards the later years of primary schooling. The final year is a more reflective one in which the previous work is reviewed, extended, depend and consolidated. Each of the three years includes work in the foundation education disciplines of history, psychology,

philosophy and sociology; the study of school, teaching and curriculum; and substantial periods of practical teaching in schools.

Working with teachers and children in schools is an integral part of the education course. Over three years students spend between seventeen weeks on teaching practice. In addition a number of courses involve work with children either in College or in schools.

From the beginning of their practical teaching students are encouraged to implement the child-centred primary curriculum. They are expected to evaluate and reflect on their teaching experience in school.

During all teaching practices students are supervised by College staff. Whilst in schools they teach under the guidance of the classroom teacher. Students have the choice of undertaking some of their teaching practices in all-Irish schools.

Entry requirements are the same for all teacher education programmes. Students to this profession must be in the top 15% of the Leaving Certificate (final examinations before finishing school as a learner) cohort to gain entry to the teacher education programme.

The role of the Teaching Council of Ireland is to review and accredit the programmes of teacher education (see section 3.7).

About 2 400 – 3 000 graduates apply for only 800 places on the Post-graduate Diploma in Education annually. Graduates need an honours degree. All students must complete 100 hours of teaching practice. Pedagogical studies form the basis of teacher education / training.

3.6 Teacher Development

An important focus of teacher education and development is the establishment of the In-Career Development Unit, now Teacher Education Section. In terms of infrastructure, there are 21 full-time and 9 part-time Education Centres for this purpose and a partnership approach is used in terms of its design and implementation.

In-Career Development focuses on support for curriculum change and strives towards a linkage between curriculum development, professional development support, curriculum implementation and evaluation. A range of Support Services were established in terms of specifically curriculum and programmes. The staff in these Support Services are seconded teachers. The activities run at the In-Career Development Centres are mainly organised during school (contact) time, which unfortunately causes some disruption to schools.

There is however a new model in the process of being developed which will amalgamate the existing services. There is also a greater focus on meeting identified school needs, linking school self-review, school development planning, outcomes of evaluation and profound “bottom-up” development.

Much is done for the development of teaching as a profession through the role of the Teaching Council and codes of professional practice, standards and induction. The professional development of teachers are seen and implemented as a right as well as a personal responsibility. Comprehensive policies are in place to address and enhance teacher quality.

3.7 Teaching Council

The Teaching Council Act, 2001 promotes teaching as a profession through:

- promoting the professional development of teachers;
- maintaining and improving the quality of teaching;
- providing for the establishment of standards, policies, and procedures for the education and training of teachers and other matters relating to teachers and the teaching profession;
- providing for the registration and regulation of teachers; and
- enhancing professional standards and competence.

The TC promotes teaching as a profession through, inter alia, newsletters, information booklets, websites, promotional events (e.g. college career fairs, conferences, exhibitions), developing effective relationships with guidance counselors and careers officers, through corporate events, and media relations.

Section 7 (2) (b) of the Act requires the TC to establish, publish, review and maintain codes of professional conduct for teachers which shall include standards of teaching, knowledge, skill and competence.

The content of the codes of professional conduct include the following:

- affirming statements – based on the reality of teachers’ work;
- values
- code of professional practice, which explores the complexity of teaching; and
- a code of professional conduct – upholding standards of professional behaviour.

Section 7 (2) (c) of the Act calls for the establishment and maintenance of a register for teachers. The Register provides for the recognition of qualifications; registration and entry on a data base; registration of certificates; and annual renewal of registration.

The TC is also required to conduct or commission research on matters relevant to the objects of the Council and, as it considers appropriate to publish in such form and manner as the Council thinks fit the findings arising out of such research.

The establishment of the Register of Teachers marked the beginning of a new era for the Council and for the teaching profession. The benefits of registration include the following:

- protection of professional standards of teaching;

- promoting best practice in continuing professional development;
- promoting and supporting research related to educational matters;
- enhancing the teaching profession's reputation and status;
- influencing national policy;
- acting as a professional network; and
- representing the teaching profession on education matters.

References

1. Study tour reports by S Fakir and J P Joubert
2. Documents collected by study tour participants

Appendix: Attracting, Developing and Retaining Effective Teachers – Findings from the Country Background Report for Ireland, OECD, April 2003.

Ireland's Country Background Report on 'Attracting, Developing and Retaining Effective Teachers' comes against a background of twelve years of unprecedented appraisal, analysis and formulation of educational policy. All aspects of the education system have been reviewed from "the cradle to the grave", within a lifelong learning paradigm. In

1991, the government identified education as a strategic force for the social, economic and cultural development of the state. Since then, a formal review of the system was conducted by the OECD, the issued two green papers and three white papers. The approach taken was a highly consultative one with all the stakeholders, the highlights of which were a National Convention on Education (1993), a National Consultative Forum on Adult Education (1996) and a National Forum on Early Childhood Education (1998). Outcomes of the process included curricular reforms of all stages of the school system, as well as a raft of major educational legislation including the Universities Act (1997), the Education Act (1998), the Education (Welfare) Act (2000), the National Qualification Authority Act (2001), the Teaching Council Act (2001). The period was also one during which Ireland experienced remarkable economic growth, well ahead of the OECD average. In the view of both international and national commentators, the quality of Ireland's education system has been a key causal factor in the socio-economic change involved.

To help sustain Ireland's position within the emerging knowledge society, a major agenda of educational change and reform has now been put in place. It is realized that the teaching force is a crucial agent for the implementation of this agenda. Traditionally, the teaching career in Ireland has enjoyed high social status and regard. In all policy documents of the nineties, the government paid generous tribute to the work of teachers, affirmed the significance of their roles and proposed a proactive series of measures in support of the teaching career. Teachers retain the confidence of the public, entry to teacher education is still highly competitive from well-qualified candidates, teacher education, both pre-service and in-service, is well regarded. Teaching is an all graduate career, with a common salary scale, and it has become more diversified in recent years. Teachers are highly unionized in Ireland, with the teacher unions projecting both a concern for professional issues as well as a traditional union approach. They have been partners in a sequence of national partnership agreements since 1987, relating to economic and social planning.

While many positive features exist, there is also a realization that it is timely to establish a more comprehensive policy approach to teacher education and to the teaching career so that they can fulfill the challenging roles which current policy and social change present. Major reviews of primary and post-primary teacher education were commissioned by the Department of Education and Science and have been presented to it in the recent past. The recommendations of these reports arise from analysis of the interface between the current extensive education reform agenda and the preparedness of the teaching profession to meet it. It is expected that these reports will pave the way for policy initiatives in the period ahead. The first major research study on gender attitudes to the teaching profession was completed in July 2002, and it recommends a comprehensive range of policy responses. Another major research study on the provision of in-career education and training of teachers was completed in 2001, and it recommends the development of a more comprehensive strategic policy on the topic, with a stronger partnership dimension. A landmark development of the recent past was the passing of legislation in 2001 to establish a Teaching Council, giving wide-ranging responsibilities to the teaching profession on entry standards, training courses, in-service education,

research and professional conduct. Thus, the elements for a developmental, rather than a serious remediation, policy drive on the teaching career are in place. Problems and difficulties do exist, and the great value of this OECD research project is the stimulation it provides to diagnose and reflect on these from a policy perspective, enriched by some best practice procedures from international experience.

Ireland experiences no problems at present in attracting high level recruits to the teaching profession. However, recruitment is not without its problems. Due to changing employment patterns and conditions of work, as well as a recent increase in the primary school population, Ireland has a shortage of about 1 000 qualified primary teachers. Increases in recruitment to teacher education courses have been instituted. The current shortages may put a brake on the recommendations of a review body to extend the primary teacher education course to four years. There is also a great imbalance in the nature of recruitment between men and women candidates, with about a nine to one ratio in favour of women. Research indicates that complex causes are involved here, but it would seem that the image of primary teaching is one of involving “women’s work”. In the past, no special initiatives were undertaken, or perhaps needed, to promote the image of primary teaching, but this now requires attention. The very long incremental scale of 25 years is also regarded by some commentators as inimical to the image, particularly for males. The recent review body on primary teacher education has also urged the re-introduction of interviews as supplemental to academic achievement, for selection into teaching.

In an increasingly multi-cultural society, another problem is the lack of recruitment of trainee teachers from minority groups and immigrant groups. It has been recommended by a recent national forum on the disadvantaged that positive discrimination measures should be applied as one way of addressing the problem. While there has been an increase in mature student entry to teacher education, it is recognized that the teaching profession could be enriched by a greater influx from personnel with varied work experience. A major disincentive for such personnel at present, however, is they get no credit for such work experience, and they have to begin at the bottom of the teacher salary scale. The consultative processes, held as part of this project, and research indicates that there are shortages in a number of subject areas in post-primary schools. It is desirable that more attention be paid to this issue. The value of introducing some subject quotas on recruitment to post-primary teacher education should be explored.

There have been no expressions of public dissatisfaction or controversy with regard to existing processes of educating, developing and certifying teachers, and teacher educators have been involved in course development and reform. Yet, it is recognized that it is desirable, periodically, to analyse, in a more comprehensive way, what is being done with a view to restructuring and modernizing in line with evolving needs and new thinking and research. Accordingly, reviews by ministerially-appointed committees on both primary and post-primary teacher education have been presented over the last two years to the Minister. While the reviews endorse both the concurrent and consecutive models which exist, they each make a series of recommendations which should guide policymakers in the years ahead. Among key priorities for policy development in educating, developing

and certifying teachers are the extension of the pre-service teacher education courses, the restructuring of some course content to give a greater sense of cross curricular integration, foster a reflective practitioner approach, and provide closer links with school personnel on teaching practice.

While there has been a great expansion in the provision and variety of in-service teacher education since the early nineties, the recent reviews also urge improvements in this area, regarding the 3I's of initial teacher education, induction and in-service education as interconnected, and as vital supports for the teaching career in an era of lifelong learning. Recommendations include the establishment of a national induction system with appropriate financing for timetable provision and the support of school mentors, a more strategic policy agency which would more overtly develop a coherent partnership between all relevant agencies for INSET and more direct financial support or recognition for teachers undergoing certificated in-service courses. It is also recommended that more flexible support structures should be put in place whereby other career personnel might be attracted to teaching. Other analyses of in-service teacher education have also been conducted in 2000-01, which urge a more strategic, comprehensive, connected policy approach. These studies and the establishment of the Teaching Council early in 2004 should prove of great value in bringing about improvements to existing practice. Action on these issues would greatly enhance the teaching profession's preparedness for the challenges which lie ahead, and position it well to build for the future on the solid foundations which exist. There would be strong support among stakeholders for such policy options. Many of the issues involved have been widely discussed, and the initiatives would seem to be timely and appropriate. The main difficulty would appear to be the provision of the necessary financial resources to bring them about, rather than any sectoral opposition. There will be need to prioritize lines of action within an implementation plan, over a time period, for the teaching career.

Teachers are not assigned by a central agency to schools. The Department of Education and Science determines the number of teachers a school can employ, linked to teacher pupil ratios. However, it is the school management board or the vocational education committee, as the appointing body which makes the arrangements for appointment, and is the employer of teachers. Thus, a great deal of freedom exists for teachers and school managements regarding appointment. Despite the pattern of employment at local level by individual school managements, to date, there has not been a significant difficulty in securing teachers for schools throughout the country, whether urban or rural. The teachers' union indicates that in recent years some schools have difficulty recruiting qualified teachers, probably linked to the current shortage of such teachers. It is also acknowledged that some schools in disadvantaged areas experience high turnover of staff. Consideration is being given for preferential recruitment of trainee teachers from disadvantaged contexts.

Both primary and post-primary teachers are required to serve a probationary year. The inspectorate evaluates the probationary experience at primary level, but at post-primary level it is more informal, with the school principal certifying the satisfactory completion of probationary service. If, following probation, a teacher secures a permanent position,

then tenure follows. In the event of school amalgamation or declines in pupil population, a panel scheme exists for primary teachers, and a redeployment scheme for teachers in voluntary secondary schools which secures employment for teachers surplus to requirements, under certain conditions. Mobility of teachers within the school system is limited, partly influenced by the significance of retaining seniority in a particular school for promotion purposes. Neither does mobility exist for teachers between primary and post-primary schools.

Among areas for policy concern in the area of teacher employment are the processes for evaluation of probation at post-primary level, the difficulties for newly-qualified post-primary teachers in obtaining permanent teaching positions, up-skilling of teachers to meet the needs of pupils, better training for extra support staff introduced into the system. The issue of a satisfactory redeployment scheme for all post-primary teachers is likely to become more urgent in the light of the projected significant decline of post-primary pupil numbers.

The retention of effective teachers in schools needs to be a key policy concern in any country. International research indicates that teacher retention can be affected by an interconnected range of factors, over a career span. Ireland does not appear to have a serious problem in retaining effective teachers. Some of the factors which are operative in countries experiencing high teacher attrition rates seem to be less evident in Ireland. When a range of relevant issues such as image and profile of the job, public confidence in and affirmation of teachers' work, the quality of pre-service teacher education, the opportunities for continuing professional development, the opportunities for partnership and input to policy, the conditions of work, opportunities for diversification, worker-friendly leave arrangements, modes of teacher appointment, security of tenure, support in times of difficulty, general salary scales, scope for promotion and appraisal, they reflect a mainly positive framework regarding the teaching career. Of course, there are difficulties and problems among which are teachers' views that salaries are inadequate, the lack of teacher induction systems, the unsatisfactory condition of some school buildings, inadequate investment in teaching resources and equipment, the need to implement recommended reforms in teacher education, high teacher pupil ratios, the stress levels in some teaching contexts, the need for better management of career breaks and secondments. A particular problem, emerging from the policy of pupil integration, is the training of classroom teachers, as well as learning support assistants for the needs of pupils with disabilities.

It was stated above that Ireland does not appear to have a problem in retaining effective teachers, but it is also the case that Ireland does not know enough about the issue. In recent years, efforts have been made to build up a data base on teachers, but it is still inadequate, leaving many gaps in our knowledge of different features of teacher trends and attitudes. More precise data is needed on the qualifications of teachers, on the fit between their qualifications and their teaching duties, on the age range patterns, on the retention patterns in teaching, on the pool of former teachers, on the attitude of student teachers, on the attitudes of former teachers, on male perspectives on the teaching profession, on the needs of teachers at different stages of the teaching career, on teacher

attitudes to varying forms of teacher in-service education, on the attitudes of teachers to engaging in formal teacher induction, on the views of teachers on qualification allowances, on the attitudes of teacher unions to incentives for teacher retention in difficult teaching contexts, on the views of school management groups regarding aspects of the deployment of teachers, on exploring ways to improve teacher deployment arrangements within a changing demographic scenario.

The issues relating to teacher retention are multi-faceted and impinge on almost aspects of policy on teaching career. Teachers in the era ahead will be operating in fast-changing circumstances. The future configuration of schooling is uncertain. One thing which is certain is that quality in the teaching force will be of pivotal importance. It is also clear that high quality statistical and attitudinal on the teaching profession will be essential for enlightened policy on the teaching profession in the years ahead. In Ireland, there is scope for improvement in these regards. As well as policy measures aimed at ensuring the retention of effective teachers in schools, their effectiveness also needs to be supported and sustained if teachers are to sustain a high quality, vibrant and effective school system throughout their teaching careers.

This study tour was undertaken by the following delegates/persons:

Salome Sithole	CTU- SADTU
Mompati Galorale	CTU-SADTU
David Moreothata	CTU-SADTU
Johan Koekemoer	CTU-SAOU
Allen Thompson	CTU-SAOU
Paddy Padayachee	Department of Education
Zoleka Makina	Department of Education
Salie Faker	Department of Education
Jaco Joubert	Department of Education
Silas Sebola	Department of Education

**MALAYSIA, NEW
ZEALAND AND
AUSTRALIA STUDY
RESEARCH VISIT
REPORT**

3

REPORT ON RESEARCH STUDY TOUR TO MALAYSIA: 22/09/2008

INTRODUCTION

The ELRC as an independent statutory body established in terms of section 37(2) of Labour Relation Act, comprising of representatives from 2 unions (CTU SADTU & CTU SAOU) and the state as represented by DOE, agreed to embark on a research in a form of a study tour in 3 countries (Malaysia, Australia and New Zealand). The reasons for selecting these 3 countries are that, there is an increasing desire amongst all stakeholders to develop policies for revitalizing the teaching profession. This includes reward systems that are more effective in giving incentives for accomplished educators, retention of good/ excellent educators in classrooms, recognizing experience and awarding good performance.

PURPOSE OF THE VISIT/STUDY TOUR

The purpose of the research was to enhance the policy formulation (OSD) that is practical, contributes towards improving the lives of educators and improve the quality public education in the country. The study will therefore enable participants to better understand the policy and implementation challenges posed by OSD.

OBJECTIVES AND AIMS

The specific aims and objectives were to do comparative study on the following:

- To gather information on the recruitment and retention of educators
- Career pathing of teachers (senior and master teachers)
- Teacher education and development
- Educator information management systems

DEVELOPMENT OF DATA COLLECTION INSTRUMENT

The development of the instrument was based on the focus areas outlined above, and it was in the form of questionnaires. The instrument served as a conventional data collection, however it must be noted that in some other countries it was not possible to gather all the information as the project leader limited/ channeled the group into asking certain questions of which his main focus was FET and Teacher education conference to be held in November 2008.

PRE DEPARTURE BRIEFING OF DELEGATES

A briefing session was held prior to the departure and information packs were distributed including an overview of visit itinerary and use of data collection instrument. In spite of this briefing session, the logistics in the host countries turn out to be contrary to the initial information provided by the travel agency and the General Secretary.

COUNTRY OVERVIEW

In order to objectively evaluate the findings of the group, it is necessary to look at the socio-economic environment of the country.

1. BACKGROUND

- **National demographics**

- **Population profile**

- Total population = 26.12 million
 - 13.41 million are between ages 24 and below
 - 1.73 million aged 60 years and above
 - 10.98 aged 25 – 59 years
 - Average family size is 4.60

- **Population profile**

- Bumiputera = 16.20million
 - Chinese = 6.1million
 - Indian = 1.80 million
 - Other = 0.30 million
 - Non Malaysian citizen = 1.80

- Source of information: Department of statistics 2006(Malaysia)

2. EDUCATION SYSTEM IN MALAYSIA

- **Primary education** covers a period between 1 -6 years of schooling; it is targeted at children aged 6 – 11 years. Primary education is free and compulsory. There are three categories of primary education schools namely:

- National
 - National type (Chinese)
 - National type (Tamil)
 - Remove class for a period of one is provided for children who struggle in either of the grades in the primary education level.

- **Lower secondary education** starts from form 1 -3, targeted at children aged 12 – 14 years of age.

- **Upper secondary education** is the level where emphasis is on academic performance of learners, and it starts from form 4 – 5 targeted at learners aged 15 – 16 years. Categories of upper secondary education schools are:

- Technical and vocational
 - Academic
 - Religion
 - Sports
 - Arts

- **Post secondary education** is targeted at children aged 17 to 18 and the categories of schools are:

- Polytechnic (FET Colleges (technical & Vocational)
 - Matriculation

- Colleges (teacher training institutes)
- Form 6 – level that prepares learners who aspire to further their degree studies at Universities.
- Higher education or employment is the last level. In this case learners who don't want to study further can venture into employment at this level.

3. EDUCATION SYSTEM IN MALAYSIA: EXAMINATIONS

- Primary education; year 1-6
 - UPSR : Primary school assessment
- Lower secondary; form 1-3
 - PMR: Lower secondary assessment
- Upper secondary; form 4-5
 - SPM: Malaysian Certificate of Examination
- Post secondary; form 6, matric, college and polytechnic
 - STAM: Malaysian High School Certificate – Religious Education schools
 - SPM: Malaysian Higher School Certificate
- Higher education (Continuation with Bachelors degree studies at Universities) or employment.

4. ENROLMENT IN PRIMARY STUDENTS IN PUBLIC SCHOOLS (2003 - 2007)

Year	Enrolment	Enrolment Rate	Class size	Student per teacher ration
2003	3 005 173	93.82%	31.1	17.6
2004	3 044 368	94.19%	31.0	17.2
2005	3 044 977	94.31%	31.0	16.5
2006	3 030 351	94.44%	30.2	16.1
2007	3 035 177	94.24%	30.2	16.1

5. ENROLMENT IN SECONDARY SCHOOLS (2003 – 2007)

Year	Lower secondary schools		Upper secondary schools		Class Size	Student per teacher ration
	Enrolment	Enrolment rate	Enrolment	Enrolment rate		
2003	1 259 332	81.76%	732 777	71.66%	32.5	16.4
2004	1 272 977	82.00%	750 911	72.45%	32.5	16.3
2005	1 322 212	84.41%	751 473	71.66%	32.2	16.2
2006	1 345 010	84.76%	752 769	71.00%	32.1	16.2
2007	1 362 811	85.05%	777 484	72.47%	31.3	16.2

6. NUMBER OF SCHOOLS 2003 – 2004

Year	Primary schools	Secondary schools
2003	7504	1902
2004	7562	1976
2005	7601	2028
2006	7616	2047
2007	7621	2057

7. EDUCATION INSTITUTIONS BY PRIVATE AGENCIES

Type of institution	Number of institutions	Number of teachers	Enrolment
Expatriate	14	243	2 089
Pre school	43 77	15 542	306 731
International	34	1 171	11 982
Tuition centre	1955	9 643	167 230
Language centre	236	1 067	33 738
Special education	10	170	995
Skill training center	545	1 954	25 874
Correspondence school	1	20	1 170
Computer training center	351	1 278	20 910
Chinese private secondary	60	2 763	52 060
Religion primary & secondary	37	943	12 391
Academic primary & secondary	142	3 123	33 144
Total	7762	37 916	668 314

8. CURRICULUM

- **Primary subjects**
 - **Grade 1 - 3**
 - Malay Language
 - English Language
 - Chinese (Language & Communication)
 - Tamil (Language & Communication)
 - Communication Arabic
 - Iban (starting from Year 3)
 - Semai (starting from Year 3)

- Mathematics
- Islamic Education
- Moral Education
- Science
- Music Education
- Visual Arts Education
- Physical Education
- Health Education
- **Grade 4 – 6**
- PLUS
- Social Studies
- Civics & Citizenship Education
- Living Skills
- **Secondary subjects**
 - **Core subjects**
 - Bahasa Malaysia
 - English language
 - Science
 - Mathematics
 - Islamic education
 - Moral education
 - Geography
 - History
 - Visual art education
 - Music education
 - Physical education
 - Civics & citizenship education
 - Living skills
 - Health education
 - **Additional subjects**
 - Chinese language
 - Tamil language
 - Communication Arabic
 - Iban language
 - French
 - Japanese
 - German

9. TEACHER SUPPLY

- **Primary school teachers**
 - Male: 135 442 (68%)
 - Female: 63 452 (32%)
 - Graduates: 33 074 (16.6%)
 - Non graduates: 165 820 (83.4%)

- By 2010 Ministry of Education target is that 50% of primary school teachers are graduates.
- **Secondary school teaching**
 - Male: 91 678 (65.03%)
 - Female: 49 310 (34.97%)
 - Graduate: 122 074 (86.6%)
 - Non graduate: 18 914 (13.4%)
 - By 2010, MOE target is that all secondary school teachers are graduates

10. POST PROVISIONING

- **Post provisioning in Malaysia is driven by the needs of the country and not the budget.**

Findings:

- Teacher classroom ratio and teacher learner ratio = 1: 1.5 meaning that 10 classrooms will have 15 educators (this number of 15 is made up of 10 classroom teachers, and the other five is administration staff and school counselors)
- Counselor learner ratio of 1: 500
- Principal per school ratio 1:1
- The ratio of 1:1.5, i.e. one class is to 1.5 teacher's means that Malaysian teachers teach about 28 periods per week (one period equivalent to 35 minutes in primary schools and one period equivalent to 40 minutes in secondary schools). The Education system has a total of about 42 periods per week (this varies across schools). 42 periods divided by 28 periods gives us 1.5 teachers – this means that teachers teach an average of 28 periods per week.
- As to the number of learners, the average class size in urban areas is 40 - 45 students per class. In the rural areas the average class size is lower i.e. between 35 to 40 students per class.
- The ration of Educator: learner refers to 1 teacher is to a certain number of enrollments. If that's the case, at schools there is 1 teacher is to 15.3 pupils in primary schools and 1 teacher is to 14.9 students in secondary schools – that's the exact ratios based on 2008 figures. To round up, it can be assumed that the post provisioning norm ratio is of 1 teacher to 15 students in the entire Malaysian school system from primary to secondary level.

11. PROJECTIONS OF EVERY YEAR TO AVOID OVERSUPPLY

In Malaysia there is always shortage of teachers if one looks at the overall picture. However the shortage is mainly prevalent in specific subject options such as science (general science, physics, chemistry and biology) and English language teachers. Excess teachers are mostly in Islamic religious knowledge, history, and Malay. One

way of dealing with excess teachers is to “retrain” or “reassign” teachers to teach a subject other than their specialisation. For example, Malaysian education ministry can convert English language teachers to teach general science at the lower secondary level and primary level. We also transfer teachers from schools with certain types of excess teachers to other schools which need them. When there are excess teachers service of temporary teachers will be terminated. In Malaysia the services of permanent teachers cannot be terminated unless permanent teachers have been convicted in a court of law, via disciplinary action (this must be thru a rigorous process) or on medical reasons.

The new demand for teachers is met through systematic planning and educational projections are done every year (for the next 10 years) to ascertain the demand and supply factors and intake/appoint the required number of teachers based on specific options/specialisations. In this way the actual number of teachers needed for a specific subject in a certain year is known. But sometimes the universities do not follow the Ministerial projections and produce teachers with certain subject options not required by the school system, however this practice is perfectly normal for free enterprise system like Malaysia’s. In other words Malaysia will never have perfect supply and demand conditions – this explains the reason for shortage of teachers.

12. TEACHER EDUCATION

- **Higher Education institutions in Malaysia**
 - 27 teacher training Colleges now called higher education institutes due to the introduction of Bachelor of Education Degrees
 - 17 Universities offering certificates, diploma, bachelors degrees, masters and qualification qualifications
 - ELSEN institution
- **Categorization/types of educators in Malaysia**
 - Certificate educator
 - Diploma educator
 - Graduate educator
 - Excellent educator
 - **excellent principal**
- **Career pathing for educators**
 - Competency assessment conducted upon request by an educator wishing to be promoted or **earn a higher salary up to a director whilst remaining in class**. This assessment is conducted by the office of the inspectorate and includes classroom observation, additional competency and professional association. Role and function of the office of the inspectorate
 - a. quality assurance
 - b. annual competency assessment

- c. promotion of successful educators to higher grade **and the decision is final and no moderation is done by the ministry**
 - Upgrading of qualification from certificate to diploma and from diploma to degree **will award educator a higher grade**
 - Work experience linked with a good annual appraisal score allocated by a principal or supervisor **will give educators 5% of their salaries**
- **Salary structure and pay progression**
 - Grades are called P1 – P3, for a grade progression, educators undergo a voluntary special PTK test conducted by MOE annually. If outcomes or good score is achieved, an educator will grade progress from either P1 – P2, or from P2 – P3.
 - Notch progression is movement from one notch to another within a particular grade (e.g. P1). Notches range from T1 – T7
 - It is important to note that the pay progression of educators in salary grade P1 is less than those in grade P2 and the same applies for P2 which is less than those in P3
- The maximum teacher salary is as follows:
 - Non-graduate teachers (teachers with qualifications at the diploma level and mostly teaching in primary schools): Ringgit Malaysia (RM) 3036.21 at P1; RM 3235.80 at P2; and RM3441.59 at P3. P1, P2, P3 denotes the level of salaries. All teachers start at the P1 level. They must take a competency test to move to the P2 level and then take another competency exam. At the P2 level to move to the P3 level. Perhaps for interest sake our teachers with diploma qualifications start with a salary of RM 1405.71 at P1, RM 1494.95 at P2 and RM 1587.21 at P3. Teachers move the T1 (beginning salary point) to T23 (end of salary point) which means that they will take 23 years to reach their maximum if they are not promoted. If they are promoted then they will move to the DGA 32 grade (beginner teacher's start at DGA29) which is the lowest Head teacher's position – a promotional position. Primary school head teachers can be promoted from DGA32 to DGA34 (excellent head teacher's position) or even DGA 38 (special grade for head teachers).
 - Graduate teachers (teachers with degree qualifications and can be teaching in primary or secondary schools): RM 4645.85 at P1; RM 4924.12 at P2; and RM5226.19 at P3 level. They must pass the competency exams to move from one level to the other. Beginner graduate teachers start off

with RM 1695.85 at P1; RM 1790.47 at P2; and RM1889.27 at P3. The beginning salary point is T1 and end at T27, meaning they will take 27 years to complete the cycle if they are not promoted. If teachers with university degrees are promoted, they will move to the DG44 scale after passing the competency exam. Thereafter to DG48. Most secondary school principals are at the DG48 scale. Some are at the DG52 (excellent school principals). They can even be promoted to DG54 and Super scale “C” if they are really “excellent”.

- o The cost of the actual salary package for teachers amounts to RM 17,124,530,000 in 2008. In US rates (US\$1 = RM 3.3) this would be US\$5,189,251,515.

13. TABLE WITH SALARY SCALE FOR DIFFERENT CATEGORIES OF TEACHERS

DGA29: Beginner teacher with Diploma qualifications and this is the lowest head teacher positions salaries. It takes 23 years for beginner teachers to reach their maximum. All teachers start at P1. They must undertake a competency test if they want to move to P2

	T1	T2	T3	T4	T5	T6	T7
P1	1405.71	1470.75	1535.79	1600.83	1665.87	1730.91	1795.95
P2	1494.95	1563.01	1631.07	1699.13	1767.19	1835.25	1903.31
P3	1587.21	1658.30	1729.39	1800.48	1871.57	1942.66	2013.75

	T8	T9	T10	T11	T12	T13	T14	T15	T16	T17	T18	T19	T20	T21	T22	T23
P1	1860.99	1926.03	1991.07	2056.11	2121.15	2186.19	2251.23	2316.27	2381.31	2446.35	22546.86	2542.97	2741.28	2839.59	2937.90	3036.21
P2	1971.37	2039.43	2107.49	2175.55	2243.61	2311.67	2379.73	2447.79	2515.85	2618.70	2721.55	2824.40	2927.25	3030.10	3132.95	3235.80
P3	2084.84	2155.93	2227.02	2298.11	2369.20	2440.29	2511.38	2582.47	2689.86	2797.25	2904.64	3012.03	3119.42	3226.81	3334.20	3441.59

DGA32: This teacher is promoted from DGA 29 – DGA 32 based on promotion.

	T1	T2	T3	T4
P1	2416.06	2514.37	2612.68	2710.99
P2	2626.30	2733.69	2841.08	2948.47

DGA34: Excellent head teacher position. This teacher is promoted from DGA 32 – DGA 34 based on promotion.

	T1	T2	T3	T4	T5	T6	T7
P1	3005.94	3104.25	3202.56	3300.87	3399.18	3497.49	3595.80
P2	3216.18	3323.57	3430.96	3538.35	3645.74	3753.13	3860.52

DG41: Beginner teacher with degree qualifications. Beginner teacher's salary starts from T1 –T27. It will take beginner teacher who is a graduate teacher 27 to reach maximum. To move from P1 –P2 a competency test must be taken and move from DG41 – DG44 or even DG48, on promotion. Most graduate secondary school principals move from DG 52 – DG54

	T1	T2	T3	T4	T5	T6	T7	T8	T9	T10	T11
P1	1695.85	1786.30	1876.75	1967.20	2057.65	2148.10	2238.55	2329.00	2419.45	2509.90	2600.35
P2	1790.47	1885.09	1979.71	2074.33	2168.95	2263.57	2358.19	2452.81	2547.43	2642.05	2736.67
P3	1889.27	1988.07	2086.87	2185.67	2284.47	2383.27	2482.07	2580.87	2679.67	2778.47	2877.27

	T12	T13	T14	T15	T16	T17	T18	T19	T20	T21	T22	T23	T24	T25	T26	T27
P1	2690.80	2781.25	2871.70	2962.15	3052.15	3143.05	3293.33	3443.61	3593.89	3744.17	3894.45	4044.73	4195.01	4345.29	4495.57	4645.85
P2	2831.29	2925.91	3020.53	3115.15	3209.77	3365.62	3521.47	3677.32	3833.17	3989.02	4144.87	4300.72	4456.57	4612.42	4768.27	4924.12
P3	2976.07	3074.87	3173.67	3272.47	3435.28	3598.09	3760.90	3923.71	4086.52	4249.33	4412.14	4574.95	4737.76	4900.57	5063.38	5226.19

DG44: School Principal with experience

	T1	T2	T3	T4	T5	T6	T7	T8	T9	T10	T11	T12	T13	T14
P1	2982.99	3133.27	3283.55	3433.83	3584.11	3734.39	3884.67	4034.95	4185.23	4335.51	4485.79	4636.07	4786.35	4936.63
P2	3301.65	3464.46	3627.27	3790.08	3952.89	4115.70	4278.51	4441.32	4604.13	4766.94	4929.75	5092.54	5255.37	5418.18

DG48: Graduate teacher promoted from DG44 – DG 48

DG48: Secondary school principal

	T1	T2	T3	T4	T5	T6	T7	T8
P1	4355.00	4558.16	4761.32	4964.48	5167.64	5379.80	5573.96	5777.12
P2	4786.37	5006.23	5226.09	5445.95	5665.81	5885.67	6105.53	6325.39

DG52: Excellent school principal with degree qualifications

	T1	T2	T3	T4	T5	T6	T7	T8
P1	4900.47	5103.63	5306.79	5509.95	5713.11	5916.27	6119.43	6322.59
P2	5365.23	5585.09	5804.95	6024.81	6244.67	6464.53	6684.39	6904.25

DG54: Excellent school principal with degree qualifications promoted from DG52 – DG54

	T1	T2	T3	T4	T5	T6	T7	T8
P1	5167.64	5370.80	5596.22	5821.64	6047.06	6272.48	6497.90	6723.32
P2	5624.05	5868.95	6113.85	6358.75	6603.65	6848.55	7093.45	7338.35

○ **Incentives and or allowances**

- Rural allowance provided for educators in rural areas. There are three levels of allowances within the category of rural allowance, these are allocated based on how rural,

remote or poor the area is in which a school is located and **educators are provided with quarters to live in**

- Hardship allowance is given to educators who provide learning and teaching to children with special needs
 - Critical allowance is given to educators who specialise in mathematics, science and English
 - Traveling allowance for educators who teach in remote areas
 - All educators qualify for housing allowance, IT allowance, and car allowance and for attendance of training geared towards upgrading of qualification and continuous development of educators
 - Educators qualify for 7 days of training per year and it is compulsory for educators to utilise these days for continuous training and development
 - Over and above these, educators get free medical cover at government hospital; in addition they also get loans to buy computers and car loans directly from the treasury at a rate of 4% interest
- **Promotion of educators**
 - Educator's promotion is informed by annual appraisals and work experience. Qualification also has a major influence
 - Only educators deemed to be promotable may apply for assessment which will result in their promotion
 - **Recruitment and Confirmation of educator**

The recruitment of newly appointed educators takes into consideration the grades that one has achieved in the training institutions as well as the interview process. If one does not make it through the interview then one is not appointed.

 - Newly appointed educators serve probation for duration of between 1 -3 years. Minimum 1 year pending knowledge and skills as well as outcome of an external appraisal by the head master of a school, and upon successful outcomes of the interviews conducted by the teachers education commission (is this the same as the inspectorate?)
 - **Teacher Continuous Education**
 - Teacher Education, comprise of in-serve and pre-service training programmes. All training programmes are subject to the quality assurance requirements and standards of the Malaysian Qualification Agency (MQA). The Malaysian qualifications framework is based on accreditation of curriculum and maintenance of standards for qualifications and is subject to quality assurance through various audit processes which could be bi annual internal auditing by curriculum unit, annual audits conducted by international

audit institutions and government audits which culminate in the awarding of audit ratings. A four star rating was bestowed on the education department in 2007. education system also recognizes compliance to ISO 900 standards

- Pre - service education is regarded as a teacher recruitment strategy and takes place through the following interventions:
 - a. Bachelor of education – B education
 - b. Post graduate diploma in teaching (PDT)
 - c. Post diploma course in teaching
 - d. B. ed TESL twinning programme with local and overseas universities
 - e. Excellent students overseas programme
- In - service programmes targeted at educators already employed in the education system
 - a. Special certificate programme
 - b. Special degree programme
 - c. Short courses
 - d. Masters programme for lecturers
 - e. Malaysian training development programme
 - f. Degree programme for foreign language programmes
 - g. SMART school programmes
 - h. Professional development courses in Malay, Math's, Science, English and ICT.
- Recognition of Prior Learning
 - a. Educators can use certificates obtained from short courses and transfer credits towards the upgrading of qualifications
- Targets for upgrading of educators
 - a. All current diploma holding primary school educators are being encouraged to upgrade their qualifications to a Degree. The Malaysian government sponsors training programmes costs in totality, age of registration as degree student also increased in order to ensure greater access to degree programme by older educators
 - b. Same applies to secondary school educators with diplomas are also encouraged to upgrade accordingly.
 - c. The reason for the upgrading to degree courses is aimed at harmonization of salary structures and recognition of diploma educators with extensive experience who are currently disadvantaged in terms of salary in comparison to new entrants holding degree qualifications.

- Department allocates 7days of training for each employee per annum, from educators to administrators. Training is attended both during holidays and normal school hours. Challenge with regards to teacher attending training during normal school hours creates challenges such as disturbances in schooling and remedial intervention is appointment of temporary staff.
- Training for in service purposes if fully funded by government whereas for pre service it's a combination but government is major sponsor through bursaries, loans, text book loans, accommodation,
- Upon completion of the in service training programme a certificate is conferred and it can lead and carried forwards towards a qualification.

REASERCH SUDY TOUR TO NEW ZEALAND: 06 – 09 OCTOBER 2008

1. TEACHER EDUCATION

Pre – service teaching programmes

- The University has a total of 37 000 B ed undergraduate students registered for the 2008 academic year
- 70% are studying towards a degree qualification in secondary education, and 30% in primary education

In service teaching programmes

- Various options exists for studies in specialization for example advance certificates courses in Math's, science, technology and aboriginal studies are regarded as priorities for the ministry of education in NZ, and as a result a large number of scholarships are availed for teachers who wish to further their studies in these areas.
- Programmes to upgrade qualifications of primary school teachers with a Diploma towards the achievement of degree qualifications are implemented through various study options such as part time, distance study, school holiday programmes and evening classes.

2. TEACHING THAT MAKES A DIFFERENCE

- According to Dr. Graeme Aitken- Acting Dean, Faculty of Education, research has moved away from judging teachers against or according to how well students score in exams, because they are variable contextual factors that affect how well a child does and not necessarily how good/excellent the teacher is. However, the research does not necessarily suggest that a teacher does not have an effect on student's scores.
- Secondly, research has also moved away from judging teachers against a long list of behaviour (actions) such as assessment, engagement of learners, learner individual learner centered approaches, group participation, use of visual aids etcetera
- According to Dr. Graeme Aitken what research does reveal, is that effective teachers engages in a constant inquiry between what they are doing (their actions) and student outcomes (what students are thinking, their knowledge, motivation and interest)
 - If teachers think that the outcomes of their students are not good, they will then reflect on their (teachers) actions and subsequently decide on what else they could do to make the student effective. For example a teacher will examine the amount of time spent on a students studying math's and spent an average of 160 hrs annually, which is fourty hours a week on this learner
- There are three basic ways in which time is lost in class and ways to improve. These are:

- Misalignment (time lost to activities/teaching that is not related to mathematical practices): which means the teachers information to the learner is either
 - Easy
 - Difficult
 - Irrelevant
 - Teacher is simply filling time other than imparting knowledge to learners
- Disengagement of students: students in this case are
 - Not connected to the subject/topic
 - Not motivated to learn
 - Subject irrelevant
 - Subject is of no interest to students
- Lack of success which is constant in nature, learner achievement is poor.
- Therefore, effective teachers try to enquire into how to reduce the amount of lack, due to loss of time, disengagement, and develop plans to improve the success of each learner with difficulties based on their individual needs.
- Measurement of performance in this case will be done through a Rubric model, that will evaluate a teachers capability to bring about learner success (learner achievement), and a teacher will be rated as either poor, satisfactory and strong. The purpose of this performance evaluation is not meant to reward teachers an additional salary but is purely based on doing the right thing, which is to advance the education and learning outcomes of all children in New Zealand.
- In summary, teaching as an inquiry involves
 - Teaching inquiry – what strategies (evidence – based) are most likely to help a student learn this?
 - Teaching and learning
 - Engagement and success
 - Learning inquiry – what happened as a result of the teaching, and what are the implications for future teaching?
 - Alignment
 - Is there something else a teacher need to change?
 - Focusing inquiry
 - What is important (and therefore worth spending time on), given where students are at?

3. EDUCATION SYSTEM IS NEW ZEALAND

- The education system is devolved, in other words there is a direct relationship between the Ministry of Education and the schools in NZ. Schools are managed and administered by a board of trustees and school principal. The functions of the board include the hiring and firing of teachers, financial and operational management of schools and

performance management of school principal. Ministry of Education is responsible for the overall funding of schools, and 60% of the budget is for appointment of educators based on the need of the school as identified by the board of trustees, 19 – 20% is meant for the operations within schools and appointment of support staff and other 20% is meant for maintenance of school buildings. Funding is allocated according to a deciles system based on socio economic environment of the area in which a school is located. There are 10 deciles levels, and the poorest school is a decile 1 (receive additional operational funding about \$7000 per learner in addition) and better of school is a decile 10 (less operational funding from ministry). Decile system is loosely linked to the allocation of teachers especially in areas where there is difficulty to recruit. Salaries of educators are centrally determined by the ministry of education and board of trustees in each school is expected to comply with prescribed salary scales and collective agreements that exist between employers (ministry of education) and labour (Unions). School boards are allowed to appoint additional educators, but in this case the board will have to use its operation funding to cater for the salaries of additional posts. Schools are allocated a budget of at least \$1billion dollars per annum.

4. TEACHER SUPPLY

- In 2006 there were more than almost 50 000 teachers employed in New Zealand state and state integrated schools.
- In 2006 the average age of the teacher workforce was 44
- Major challenge in education is the gender disparities between teachers and principals, and the changing age distribution of the teacher workforce.
- Ministries role in teacher supply consists of:
 - Monitoring and projecting student numbers – estimate number of teachers
 - Sets teacher pupil ratios for funding purposes
 - Negotiate collective employment agreements (which define pay & working conditions) with teacher unions
 - Pays teachers
 - Provide scholarships for people to train in hard – to – staff areas (Math’s, Maōri – medium)
 - Funds teacher professional development
 - Promotes teaching as a career of choice
- Teacher supply problems are:
 - Graduates from ITE programmes are variable in quality
 - Schools provide variable quality advice & guidance
 - Geographic spread of teachers not well matched to demand – especially in Auckland, rural school
 - Shortage of Maōri – medium teachers
 - Very few fluent speakers to recruit from
 - Inconsistent quality of Maōri – medium ITE

- Secondary subject shortages – Math's, science, technology, te reo Maōri
 - Smaller class sizes for Y1 students policy (class size of 1:15, reduction in contact time) & increasing primary rolls putting pressure on supply of primary teachers.
- Teacher qualifications
 - All NZ teachers must hold a tertiary qualification
 - Huge range of programmes, qualifications and providers
 - All NZ universities offer one or more ITE programmes, wananga 7& private tertiary providers also offer ITE
 - Currently a ministerial moratorium on new ITE programmes.
 - Typical primary teacher = 3-4 year teaching qualification (e.g. Bed)
 - Typical secondary = 3-4 year non teaching qualification (e.g. BA, BSC), 1 year teaching qualification
 - Practicum of 8 weeks per annum for each year of study
 - New Zealand qualifications authority sets standards for the accreditation of universities and is responsible for the national qualification framework which articulates nine different qualification levels and credits/points for different qualifications, including qualifications offered by universities
- Beginning teachers
 - 1st 2 years of teaching = last 2 years of teaching training
 - (Probation and provisional registration). Principal must attest that they meet standards before they can gain full registration
 - Schools required to provide advice and guidance programme for beginning teachers
 - Schools receive extra funding for advice & guidance
 - 0.2 FTTE for each 1st year beginning teacher
 - 0.1 FTTE for each 2nd year beginning teacher
 - Teachers who mentor beginning teachers receive:
 - \$ allowances in primary, time allowance in secondary
 - Secondary school teachers work a maximum of 20hour per week and enjoy a maximum of 5 hours non contact time. School starts from 09h00 – 15h00.
 - Primary school teachers work 48 hours a week, and enjoy less non contact time in comparison to secondary school teachers.
- Teacher registration council
 - Teacher registration council started in 2002 in order to;
 - provide professional leadership in teaching
 - enhance the professional status of teachers in schools and early childhood education, and
 - Contribute to a safe and high quality teaching and learning environment for children and other learners.

- This purpose is achieved through;
 - professional leadership & encouragement of best teaching practice
 - Teacher registration functions including establishment of standards. Untrained teachers can also apply and be granted with limited authority to teach, on condition that they have a clean criminal record, certified to be competent to work with children, and that these teachers are involve and able to teach and earn a salary. A beginner teacher who applied for accreditation will be given provisional accreditation, full accreditation will be withheld by council until such time that he/she had completed a 2 year probation period and has been certified as competent to teach by a school principal.
 - approval of initial teacher education programmes
 - maintenance of professional standards re conduct and competence
 - identify research priorities
- organisational structure to support functions
 - council (headed by chair) elected member
 - council committees (e.g. professional leadership, complaints assessment)
 - advisory groups (Maōri medium, early childhood education)
 - council staff: (led by director)
 - registration
 - maintenance of professional standards – administer competence and conduct functions (compliance with professional standards, adviser teacher practice and investigates competence complaints, disciplinary tribunal))
 - teacher education – set standards for qualifications for initial teacher education (graduating teacher standards), criteria for approval and re-approval of initial teacher education programmes, carry out approvals of programmes in panels (with other assurance agencies), provides information to graduates regarding requirements for registration, professional leadership role in initial teacher education
 - policy, strategy & communication – responsible for policy development and review, including standards, support for development of strategic direction, stakeholder communications, research programme to support professional leadership role and statutory functions of the council, develop and promote code of ethics, approval of settings for gaining/maintaining full registration
 - corporate services

- What does registration as a teacher mean?
 - registered teacher is a legally protected title
 - it is illegal to practice as, or employ teachers who do not have a current practicing certificate
 - a current practicing certificate may be in one of three categories:
 - provisional
 - subject to confirmation
 - full
- strategic vision 2006 – 2009
 - to provide credible professional leadership that enhances the quality and aspirations of the teaching profession in New Zealand
 - working in partnership with stakeholders
 - to identify, promote and enable high quality teaching
 - so that our learners may excel in safe, nurturing educational environments
- Remuneration of teachers
 - Based on national collective agreements and is negotiated between the teacher unions.
 - Pay parity for kinder garden, primary and secondary teachers
 - It takes a beginner teacher six years to reach maximum salary, thereafter a teacher will have to bid for a management or administration post if he/she wishes to progress further. (There is limited career pathing for teachers who wish to remain in the classroom).
 - High attrition rate of teachers within their 1st five years of teaching, and this is attributed to:
 - Lack of career pathing after six years
 - Quality of training and support during probation period
 - Workload in relation to variations in socio economic background of children
- Allowances
 - Hard to staff schools (isolated or low decile (socio – economics))
 - Maōri medium
 - Units for responsibility
 - Beginning teacher time allowances
 - Study awards
 - Relocation allowance

5. PMDS

- No standardized tool to evaluate the performance of teachers, because of the devolved system each school designs its own performance management tool in line with the objectives set by the board of trustees in

collaboration with the school principal. Performance management not linked to pay, but towards improvement in the quality of education. The motto of education in NZ is, “the child matters”

RESEARCH VISIT TO AUSTRALIAN MINISTRY OF EDUCATION & AUSTRALIAN CENTRAL TERRITORY 29 SEPTEMBER – 3 OCTOBER 2008

1. BACKGROUND

Australia is a federal country divided into 5 states namely:

- Western Australia
- Northern territory
- Queensland
- South Australia
- New South Wales, each state is further sub divided into territories.

2. STATE AND TERRITORY GOVERNMENTS ROLE IN EDUCATION

State and Territory Governments are responsible for provision of school education to students in their state/territory and also

- Student assessment and certification
- Curriculum and course accreditation
- Resource allocation
- Teacher employment and professional development

3. AUSTRALIAN GOVERNMENTS ROLE IN EDUCATION

- National leadership in school education issues
- Supplementary funding to government and non-government schools
- Support for effective transition beyond school education
- Funding for Indigenous students

4. AUSTRALIAN GOVERNMENT AGENDA: EDUCATION REVOLUTION

- Digital Revolution
- Trade Training Centres
- Early Childhood
- Indigenous Education
- Social Inclusion
- National Curriculum
- Languages Program
- Student Assessment

5. TEACHER EDUCATION IN AUSTRALIA

- Teacher education takes place in universities or accredited colleges.
- Generally teacher qualifications lead to a four-year Bachelor degree qualification or a postgraduate professional qualification.
- Teacher education includes: professional and curriculum studies; and practical training.

- Teacher registration is the responsibility of State and Territory registration authorities such as the New South Wales Institute of Educators.

6. AUSTRALIAN GOVERNMENT QUALITY TEACHER PROGRAM

- Established in 2000 as a program for improving the quality of teaching and school leadership
- Delivered under agreements with state and territory governments and non-government education authorities
- Support for the Digital Education Revolution through professional development in ICT
- Three objectives and three elements, including funding for Teaching Australia

7. CHALLENGES FACING THE TEACHING PROFESSION

- Schools struggle to attract and retain experienced teachers and leaders (after nine years of service teachers don't get salary increases, they are said to have reached their ceiling and are forced to get out of the teaching stream and enter administration in pursuance of further career mobility)
- Teacher shortages in critical subject areas (same as world wide phenomenon, Australia experience teacher shortages in Maths, Science and technology, including teachers with experience to teach the aboriginal population)
- Teacher workforce is ageing (currently the average age of teachers is between 40 – 55)
- Attrition rates are high (teachers teaching for fifteen years don't receive any pay rise)

8. TEACHER RECRUITMENT

- Recruitment manager and other HR staff attend markets and University career affairs to promote ACT as a destination for new educators.
- Recruitment targeted at students in their last year of study at Universities and a new educator (recently appointed) invited along to give own impressions of the system and address areas where support for new educators is given (New educators support program)

9. STRUCTURE OF THE AUSTRALIAN EDUCATION

Pre-Compulsory Education (Pre-school)

- Children aged 4-5 years

Compulsory Education

- Primary (students aged 5-6 years to 12-13 years)
- Secondary (students aged 12-13 to 16 years)

Post Compulsory Education

- Years 11 – 12 (students aged 16 – 18 years)
- Vocational education and training

- Higher Education

10. NUMBER OF SCHOOL AND LEARNERS IN AUSTRALIA (This information was presented by officials employed at the Department of Education Employment and Workplace Relations.)

Type	Schools	Students
Government	6853	2 277 436
Private(Mainly catholic)	1703	691 242
Independent	1025	458 339

Source: Data ABS Schools (2007) 4221.0, table 1.16

11. CLASS PER LEARNER SIZE

- 1:21

12. NUMBER OF FULL TIME EQUIVALENT TEACHERS (FTE) AT PRIMARY AND SECONDARY LEVELS IN GOVERNMENT & NON – GOVERNMENT SCHOOL SECTORS: 1987 & 2007 (The data below was obtained from a presentation made by a research lecturer employed at the faculty of education University of Canberra)

	Primary		Secondary		Total	
	1987	2007	1987	2007	1987	2007
Government	74 103	88 142	74 869	72 650	148 972	160 791
Non - Government	20 876	35 624	28 667	47 943	49 543	83 567
All	94 979	123 766	103 536	102 592	198 515	244 358
Government as % of All)	78%	71%	72%	60%	75%	66%

Source: 1987 data: DEET 1989, tables 3.1; 3.2 & 2007 data: ABS 2008, table 17.

VISIT TO AUSTRALIAN CENTRAL TERRITORY: CANBERRA

1. ORGANISATIONAL CAPACITY

- The organisational capacity unit is located within the Human Resource Directorate
- Number of schools 100, include both primary and secondary school
- 4000 educators are employed in ACT and the number include permanent, temporary and contract employees
- Class size, 1 teacher to 21 learners in both primary and secondary schools
- 2500 administrative staff employed
- All staff members are employed under the Public Management Act

- Employees serve a period of two years probation before being confirmed as permanent employees. An appraisal is conducted prior to confirmation as permanent employee. Contract employees are subjected to a contract assessment
2. CATEGORIZATION OF TEACHERS (as contained in page 61 of 125 paged Collective agreement of the Canberra Education Department and Australian Educators Union)
- Stage 1(Graduate teacher) – New Educators in the first three (3) years of professional practice
 - Stage 2(Professional Competent teacher) – Experienced Educators with four (4) to six (6) years of teaching experience
 - Stage 3 (Professional Accomplish teacher & professional leadership) – Expert Educators with developing or emerging leadership skills and seven (7) or more years of teaching experience.
3. STRATEGIES TO RECRUIT EDUCATORS IN AREAS OF SCARCE AND CRITICAL SKILLS
- wide recruitment in overseas countries
 - interstate recruitment
 - Canberra second highest in terms of teacher salaries within Australia
 - Number of posts advertised is informed by data retrieved from the HR information system, from age profiles (teachers near to retirement), resignations and needs raised by principals in different schools.
4. RESPONSIBILITIES OF CLASSROOM TEACHERS
- Stage 1: The main responsibility for Stage 1 teachers is to develop their classroom teaching skills. Stage 1 teachers receive appropriate support including induction and orientation. For Stage 1 teachers undergoing their probation (which is a one year probation period), the probationary assessment process is done through what is called a professional pathway plan which focus largely on continuous development interventions for these educators. Stage 1 teachers are not allowed to mentor other stage 1 teachers or supervise University Interns or students. With the agreement of the principal a Stage 1 teacher may host students undertaking in-school observation.
 - Stage 2: It is expected that Stage 2 teachers will take on broader professional responsibilities within the school as part of their professional pathways plan. This may include (but is not limited to) supervision of University students undertaking professional experience, mentoring new educators, responsibility for school wide tasks, collaboration with colleagues to develop programs and resources. For Stage 2 teachers undergoing probation, the probationary assessment process will be their professional pathways plan. In the event that the teacher and their

supervisor choose to include additional goals these are to be recorded separately from the probationary assessment process and will not inform that process.

- Stage 3: It is expected that Stage 3 teachers will take on additional responsibilities within the school and may take some system-wide responsibilities as part of the professional pathways plan. This may include (but is not limited to) supervision of Interns, participation in and co-ordination of student teacher supervision within the school, active mentoring Stage 1 teachers, and responsibility for school wide tasks such as coordinator roles. Teachers on the top of the classroom teacher salary scale are expected to demonstrate greater capacity to take on further professional responsibilities than those teachers not at the top of the scale. For Stage 3 teachers undergoing probation, the probationary assessment process will be their professions pathways plan. In the event that the teacher and their supervisor choose to include additional goals these would be recorded separately from the probation assessment process and will not inform that process.

5. PMDS

- The aim of PM is to empower employees to achieve professional and personal goals that align with objectives of the Department and the ACT public service. There are three streams of performance management programmes, namely:
 - Professional pathways
 - Administrative staff performance management scheme
 - Principals professional appraisal
- Performance Management is the primary responsibility of the Supervisor/principal and employee/teacher
- Performance management is not linked to pay progression, but it is used to contribute to productivity and it also serves as a basis for employee development and discipline in the event of under performance.

6. SALARY STRUCTURE

- Ordinary hours of work for full time teachers and administrative services officers are 7hours 21 minutes. All permanent and temporary employees accrue four weeks (20days) annual leave (pro rata for part time) for each year completed. Permanent teachers and school assistants access their annual leave, in conjunction with public holidays and Christmas shutdown over December/January school vacation period.

7. CAREER PATHING, PROMOTION AND PAY PROGRESSION

Teaching staff basic pay rates (office based and class room teachers)

	Current Salary	Dec- 2006	July – 2007	July - 2008
		4%	4%	3.5%
1(3Yr Exp)	\$43,073	\$44,796	\$46,588	\$48,219
2(4 – 6 Yr Exp)	\$46,565	\$48,428	\$50,365	\$52,128
3	\$48,894	\$50,850	\$52,884	\$54,735
4	\$51,222	\$53,271	\$55,402	\$57,341
5	\$53,551	\$55,693	\$57,921	\$59,948
6	\$56,460	\$58,718	\$61,067	\$63,204
7	\$59,370	\$61,745	\$64,215	\$66,463
8	\$62,282	\$64,773	\$67,364	\$69,722
9	\$66,353	\$69,007	\$71,767	\$74,279

It was further mentioned that school principals receive a salary scale above level 9; the assumption is that their salary level is pitched at level 10. No detailed data on salary structure of principals was available for review by the research team.

8. ALLOWANCES

- Hard to staff schools (isolated or low decile (socio – economics)
- Aboriginal medium
- Beginning teacher time allowances
- Study awards
- Transfer incentives

9. UNION PERSPECTIVE

The Australian Education Union (AEU) is in the process of proposing a professional pay scheme to reward experienced teachers through recognition of their teaching knowledge and practice. This scheme would establish a set of professional standards for teaching beyond current processes. Teachers would be assessed by an independent and fair process and rewarded through salary increases, not once off bonuses. Teachers would be required to demonstrate how their teaching experience and professional development is contributing to the improvement of educational outcomes for students. The main challenge confronting the AEU is the fact that funding for salaries of the Educators comes from Federal Government, and not the State Department of Education were negotiations and collective bargaining takes place

Casual Teacher – All inclusive packages

	Current Daily Rate	Dec- 2006	July – 2007	July - 2008
		4%	4%	3.5%
Casual Teacher	\$234	\$243	\$253	\$262
Exp Casual Teacher	\$255	\$265	\$276	\$286

The salaries of university lecturers are reported to be slightly lower than that of school teachers in Canberra.

10. POST PROVISIONING

- Educator: learner ration equals 1:21 in both primary and secondary schools

11. TEACHER DEVELOPMENT

- **Pre service training**
 - Minimum qualification for a teacher in Australia is a 4 year Bachelors Degree in Education
 - Interns in their last year of study have to undertake compulsory class practice exercises. to achieve this Universities collaborate with schools for the placement of learners and identification of mentors who will supervise and support interns
 - University provide a liaison person to observe a complete lesson conducted by the interns in order to provide additional support in areas of need
- **In service training**
 - All full time teachers are required to participate in a minimum of 5 days per year of approved employee professional learning. Where appropriate, professional learning will be reflected in a teachers professional pathways plan.
 - This professional learning is allocated as follows:
 - One day devoted to a whole of system/ whole of sector priority as determined by the Department and conducted in designated stand down periods. By the end of October each year and the Department will advise whether this system day is required for the following school year.
 - Two days identified by the school based professional learning activities and conducted in designated stand down periods
 - One day identified by the school for whole of school professional learning activities which may be conducted outside of regular school hours in accordance with agreed Flexible Professional Learning Guidelines (full day, half

day and two hour blocks where approved by the Director);
and

- One day (or equivalent) professional learning in their own time. This professional learning may be acquitted in full day, half day or two hour blocks
- School leaders will participate in additional five days of professional learning in order to undertake
 - Strategic planning and professional development for the school cluster or system
 - Planning and organisation of professional learning for other school employees
 - Attendance at educational conferences or meetings, and
 - Personal professional development
- Professional pathways is a dynamic, forward planning development tool aimed at providing teachers with meaningful feedback and advice in a supportive and confidential environment. A teacher and their supervisor will negotiate the teacher's professional pathways plan, which will be signed off by the teacher, their supervisor and principal. The supervisor will be responsible for monitoring implementation, reviewing progress, and providing feedback to the teacher. A teacher may choose to have a professional mentor to support and encourage them as part of their professional pathways. This mentor may be a peer at same level or above. The mentor does not undertake the role or responsibilities of the supervisor. Principals/managers are responsible for implementing professional pathways in line with agreed guidelines, and ensuring that the process is conducted in a professional, objective and fair manner. Where areas of improvement are identified it may be appropriate to resolve these through pathways to improvement process, which is an early intervention program to assist teachers, improve their professional practice and work performance in a positive, constructive and non threatening climate and manner. Pathways to improvement may be initiated at any stage in the professional pathways process. Pathways to improvement will normally be implemented for up to one school term or equivalent.

VISIT TO NEW SOUTH WALES: SYDNEY

1. PROFESSIONALISATION OF TEACHING PROFESSION

- Teacher accreditation body was established in 2002 in NSW, and is governed by two boards
 - Governance board: five member board that oversee the financial side of the Institute (9 budgets and spending)
 - The twenty one person council called quality teaching council which is responsible for taking education decisions. This board consists of one chairperson, ten elected members and ten appointed members (these include parents, communities, labour movement, and professional teaching associations). Council members meet six times a year and board members meet four times a year
 - Federal government funded an amount of \$20 million over a four year period as start up funding to the Institute. Currently the Institute is dependent on self funding generated from the annual accreditation fee paid in by teachers
- The Institute is charged with the responsibility to develop professional teaching standards, (these standards contain seven elements that give a logical organisational structure for consistent presentation of the standards within each key stage. The elements are:
 - (1) teachers know their subject/content and how to teach that content to their students,
 - (2) teachers know their students and how they learn;
 - (3) teachers plan, assess and report for effective learning;
 - (4) teachers communicate effectively with their students;
 - (5) teachers create and maintain safe and challenging learning environments through the use of classroom management skills;
 - (6) teachers continually improve their professional knowledge and practice;
 - (7) teachers are actively engaged members of their profession and wider community) and to monitor accreditation decisions and assure the quality of initial and continuing teacher education courses (undergraduate) and programs and based outcomes of teacher accreditation report the Institute will register teachers as competent for the teaching profession. These are regarded as core activities for all professions
- All new scheme teachers must be accredited and a person is a new scheme teacher if;

- Employed as a teacher in NSW for the first time after 30 September 2004
 - Returning to employment as a teacher following a period of at least 5 years during which time a teacher was not employed to teach in NSW.
 - All new scheme teachers (whether full time employed, casual, part time or temporary employed) are liable for payment of the annual fee of \$20. the fee is payable from the date a teacher becomes available to teach, regardless of whether employed or not
- The accreditation authorities are Director Human Resource in state department of education and principal in a school. Accreditation takes place through school based processes and the new scheme teacher to be accredited is fully involved. The critical aspect of the accreditation of new scheme teachers is the need to put them through a six week induction programme, coupled with ongoing mentoring and supervision. The new scheme teacher is expected to collect evidence against prescribed standards and at the end of the accreditation period, an accreditation report is written by the principal. Portfolio of evidence for each standard will be attached to the report and submitted to Director who is an accreditation authority for review and comment who will subsequently submit the final accreditation report to the Institute for consideration.
 - The Institute then hands the report to a team of external assessors for further engagement, and who will write another report based on their findings or impressions from the report. Based on the report and feedback from the external assessors the Institute will write back to the accreditation authority.
 - Appeal processes are provided for in the event where disputes and doubts are arising

2. CATEGORISATION OF TEACHERS

- Graduate teacher: graduate teachers are beginning their teaching career in NSW. They have undertaken an approved program of teacher preparation or its equivalent elsewhere, and possess the requisite knowledge, skills, values and attitudes to plan for and manage successful learning. These teachers are equipped to engage in and negotiate a process of ongoing professional learning. They identify their development needs and seek advice and support from colleagues. They have high expectations of themselves as professional learners and for learning of their students. Their commitment to students and student learning is reflected in their desire to support students achievement of the highest possible education outcomes

- Professional competence: professionally competent teachers have demonstrated successful teaching experience. They have met the standards for professional competence. They effectively monitor, evaluate and plan learning. They are able to tailor teaching programs to meet needs of individuals and groups within the class. These teachers have a record of effective and ongoing professional learning. They take responsibility for collaboration with others to identify and address their own learning needs. They work collegially and in teams to further enhance their professional practice.
- Professional accomplishment: they are highly accomplished and successful practitioners. They are recognized by other teachers as having in-depth subject knowledge and pedagogy. They keep abreast of and contribute professional learning and educational discussions as well as contributing to professional learning of others. These teachers are advocates for the profession and their school. They communicate effectively to diverse audiences. They interact professionally with the community
- Professional leadership: these teachers have a record of outstanding teaching and are committed to enhancing the quality of teaching and learning. They are committed educators who can articulate a vision of education to their students, peers, the profession and wider community. They may be employed in formal leadership positions within schools. They are knowledgeable about the latest developments in pedagogy and can apply those developments to improve student learning. They have outstanding interpersonal and leadership skills. These skills are underpinned by principles of fairness, compassion and integrity. They recognize the talents of others and encourage those people to achieve their potential. They apply critical analysis and problem solving skills to educational matters. They engage in professional learning and assist and support the professional learning needs of others, particularly induction programs for beginning teachers. They communicate effectively with community to support the development of the school and promote student learning.

3. SALARY STRUCTURE

- Common incremental salary scale: per annum (\$) based on satisfactory rating of performance appraisal conducted by school principal. This cycle fits into political cycle (when elections occurs) and annual budget cycle
- Classroom teacher's salary starts at step 5 (entry) and end at step 13(maximum). It takes a beginner teacher nine years to reach maximum.

- Once a teacher had reached step 13, the annual pay progression/incremental steps will not apply. If a teacher is certified as being promotable through an assessment and successfully bids for a promotion post in management (for example a principal post) and leadership, a promotion will be granted which will then place such a teacher on new salary scale. In the event where no promotion took place, a teacher will only benefit through multi - term salary agreements negotiated and agreed to (in Collective agreement) between employer and labour.
- Salaries of principals is based on the number of learners per school, and their salaries are agreed to in the form of a collective agreement between employer and labour
- Step 1 - 4 used to be the entry level of teachers with diploma qualifications, and has since been phased out now that minimum requirement or qualification for a teacher is a degree

Salary scales and annual incremental steps

Steps	1.1.07 (1st January 2007	1.1.08 (1st January 2008)
Step 1	Does not apply to educators	Does not apply to educators
Step 2 2YT	Does not apply to educators	Does not apply to educators
Step 3 3YT	Does not apply to educators	Does not apply to educators
Step 4	Does not apply to educators	Does not apply to educators
Step 5 4YT	49,050	50,522
Step 6 5YT	51,574	53,121
Step 7	54,103	55,726
Step 8	56,632	58,331
Step 9	59,158	60,933
Step 10	61,685	63,536
Step 11	64,211	66,137
Step 12	66,742	68,744
Step 13	72,454	75,353

Promotions classifications in the education teaching service (teachers with responsibilities than transcend classroom teaching)

Per annum (\$)	1.1.07 (1st January 2007)	1.1.08 (1st January 2008)	1.7.08(1st July 2008)
Senior Assistant in schools	74,337	77,310	77,310
Assistant principal primary school	79,662	82,848	86,716
Primary school principal Grade 6 (PP6) (1-25)	83,044	86,366	86,716
Head teacher high	83,381	86, 716	86,716

school; head teacher central school; district guidance officer (e.g. Head of curriculum)			
Primary school deputy principal; deputy principal (primary) central school	87,783	91,294	101,248
Primary school principal grade 5 (PP5) (26-159)	92,746	96,456	101,248
High school deputy principal. Deputy principal (secondary) central school	97,354	101,248	101,248
Primary school principal grade 4 (PP4) (160 – 300)	99,579	103,562	103,562
Central school principal grade 4 (PC4) (26-159)	100,552	104,574	104,574
Primary school principal grade 3 (PP3) (301 – 450)	103,034	107,155	107,155
Central school principal grade 3(PC3) (160 -300)	104,043	108,205	108,205
Primary school principal grade2 (PP2) (451 – 700)	107,386	111,681	111,681
Central school principal grade 2 (PC2) (301 – 450)	108,436	112,773	112,773
High school principal grade 2 (PH2)	119,308	124,080	124,080
Primary school principal grade 1 (PP1) (701+)	116,451	121,109	121,109
Central school principal grade 1 (PC1) (451+)	117,590	122,294	122,294
High school	124,525	129,506	129,506

principal grade1(PH1) (900+)			
---------------------------------	--	--	--

Teachers in chare of environmental centres and hospital schools

Per annum (\$)	1.1.07	1.1.08	1.7.08
Grade 1	88,044	86,366	86,716
Grade 2	92,384	96,079	96,428

Non – school based teaching service

Per annum (\$)	1.1.07	1.1.08
Senior Education Officer Class 1	83,381	86,761
Year 1	83,381	86,716
Year 2	86,829	90,302
Year 3	90,272	93,883
Senior Education Officer Class 2	97,840	101,754
Principal Education Officer	108,559	112,901

4. POST PROVISIONING

- 1 x School principal
- 2 x Deputy Principal
- 6 x Head of Department(s)
- 40 x Teachers
 - In Primary schools, the Principal decides on how classes are to be formed, and this decision is based on learner numbers within a school
 - However for children aged 3 – 6 years, maximum number of learners per class is 30
 - In the case of secondary schools, with children aged 7 – 10yrs, maximum number of learners is 30, whilst those aged 11 – 12 years don't exceed 24.

5. PMDS

- There is a perception created to de - link performance management from pay progression, however the annual January 1st pay progression is subject to annual appraisal of teachers by principal and upon attainment of satisfactory performance rating.

6. TEACHER RECRUITMENT

- More than adequate supply of primary educators in NSW
- Shortages of teachers are mainly in secondary education, specifically in areas of Math's, Science and Technology
- Universities in ACT and NSW are main supplies of Teachers for the education system, 2600 primary education graduated qualified in 2007 and 800 in secondary education. Specialization of secondary teachers is fairly equal however the majority of graduates qualified in physical education as a specialization.
- All teachers must meet the requirements of the Institute of teaching for accreditation and registration as a competent teacher with no criminal record at all.
- State department of education in NSW employs 50 000 teachers, for 2500 schools across NSW.
- The teacher workforce is ageing and average age of teacher is about 47yrs. There is no compulsory age of retirement in NSW.
- The state department acts as a recruitment agent for schools, and is responsible for putting together a data base of teachers who are suitable to teach in line with requirements of Institute for teachers. In addition the DOE will advertise posts in national media and on line, but school principal will put together a panel that will interview candidates that are recommended by the principal from the DOE list. Teachers are at liberty to choose the school in which they would like to work, but a transfer will only become possible after six years of service in that particular school.
- Management of excess teachers is the responsibility of the school principal who will have to base his/her decisions firstly on curriculum needs of schools, and lastly apply the principal of last in, first out to remove an excess educator(s) from a school. In August of each year, school principals are expected to submit to the state department of education the anticipated number of learner enrolments, name(s) excess teacher(s) likely to be nominated or replaced in cases where learner numbers drop. Excess teachers are usually removed from a school at the end of the 1st term, and will subsequently be placed in another school within reasonable distance from his/her home, through consultation with the teacher in question and without effecting any changes to their conditions of service
 - Incentive packages for service transfers;
 - i. Rural and remote schools
 - ii. Genuine compassionate transfer
 - iii. Excess teachers

7. TEACHER DEVELOPMENT

- **Pre service training**
 - 230 students have received scholarships to study B ed with specialization in 170 (mathematics, science, technology)and (60) in aboriginal education
 - Scholarships are advertised in October each year and offer is usually promulgated in December to all successful candidates who passed the vigorous screening tests that included criminal record testing, ability to work with people (personality), physical health fitness tests.
- **IN SERVICE TRAINING**
 - 1 year post graduate certificate course for teachers with other degrees, to assist them in becoming qualified teachers
 - 1 year specialization courses in Mathematics, Science and Technology
 - upgrading programmes for primary school teachers with diplomas to assist them in obtaining degree qualifications

8. FURTHER EDUCATION AND TRAINING COLLEGE: VOCATION AND TECHNICAL

○ **Background**

Technical education in can be traced back to the Sydney Mechanics school of Arts 1833. The TAFE system is defined as Technical and Further Education. TAFE NSW is the largest training organisation in the southern hemisphere. TAFE in Australia comprises campuses grouped by geographic area into ten institutes. Institutes stay in touch with local business, industry and community needs (66 TAFE institutes, 5 multi – sectoral universities, 513 community providers, and 140 private providers). There are 1.68 million students, 1.33 are studying at TAFE. TAFE delivers 85.6% of all courses, private providers deliver 14.4%. 1 in 9 Australian aged 15 -64 years participate in VET. 397,400 (24%) are apprentices and trainees, and 89% study part-time. TAFE provides crucial skills to enable the community and economy to function across a broad range. TAFE caters particularly for students from disadvantaged and working class backgrounds and has a tradition of access/remedial/2nd chance programs (ABE, Outreach, pre-vocational programs, aboriginal education, disability support, gender equity, counselling services, migrant and refugee programs, libraries unlike private providers.

○ **TAFE NSW course delivery**

- Full – time (FT): a weekly study attendance of between 12 and 30 hours
- Part – time (PTD): a weekly day study attendance of less than 12 hours. This day study pattern may include attendance on weekends

- Part – time (PTE): a weekly evening study attendance of less than 12 hours. This evening study pattern may include classes starting from midday through to the evening
 - Flexible attendance (FX): flexible attendance allows for learning and assessment in a variety of modes. This include on campus, off campus, distance learning, online learning, and combinations of any of the above.
- **TAFE NSW consultants**
 - Disability
 - Multicultural
 - Aboriginal
 - Business
 - Outreach
 - Correctional
 - Juvenile justice
 - **Recruitment of TAFE lecturers**
 - TAFE lecturers do not necessarily hold a teaching degree qualification, but are recruited on the basis of their company and trade experience. 80% TAFE lecturers (in particular engineers responsible for trade courses) are employed on a part time/casual basis whilst the other 20% staff are full time employees responsible for lecturing and some are providing support services
 - Permanent teachers are needed for stability, however to achieve this, there is a need for salaries and working conditions to be improved such that the TAFE system is able to attract quality teachers and able to compete with other employers.

This study tour was undertaken by the following delegates/persons:

Joanna Peane	CTU-SADTU
Robyn Makhubedu	CTU-SADTU
Medwin Jacobs	CTU-SADTU
Cecil Scorgie	CTU-SAOU
Magdeline Makgoba	CTU-SAOU
Marpene Maropeng Seshibe	Department of Education
Nosisi Mzondeki	Department of Education
Cynthia Modise	Department of Education
Gugulethe Madlala	Department of Education