

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

01 DECEMBER 2015

PAGE: 1

TUESDAY, 1 DECEMBER 2015

---

*PROCEEDINGS OF THE NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES*

---

The Council met at 10:09.

The Chairperson took the Chair and requested members to observe a moment of silence for prayers or meditation.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon members, I have been informed that the Whips has agreed that there will not be any Notices of Motion or Motions without Notice today, except for the motion on the Order Paper. We now come to the motion on the Order Paper as printed in the name of the Chief Whip.

**SUSPENSION OF RULE 239(1) FOR PURPOSES OF CONSIDERATION OF BILLS**

(Draft Resolution)

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE NCOP: Chairperson of the Council, the motion reads as follows:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

01 DECEMBER 2015

PAGE: 2

That rule 239(1) which provides *inter alia* that the consideration of a Bill may not commence before at least three working days have lapsed since the committee's report was tabled, be suspended for the purposes of consideration of the following Bills:

- a) Taxation Laws Amendment Bill [B 29B - 2015] (National Assembly - sec 77);
- b) Tax Administration Laws Amendment Bill [B 30 - 2015] (National Assembly - sec 75);
- c) Finance Bill [B 31- 2015] (National Assembly - sec 77);
- d) New Development Bank Special Appropriations Bill [B 32 - 2015] (National Assembly - sec 77); and
- e) Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 28 - 2015] (National Assembly - sec 77).

I move accordingly Chair. Thank you.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Thank you. Hon members as there is no speakers list I shall now put the question and the question is that the motion be agreed to. In accordance with Rule 71, I shall allow provinces an opportunity to make a declaration of vote, if they so wish. You have three minutes for declarations.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**01 DECEMBER 2015**

**PAGE: 3**

Question put: That the motion be agreed to.

IN FAVOUR: Eastern Cape, Free State, Gauteng, KwaZulu-Natal,  
Limpopo, Mpumalanga, Northern Cape, North West.

AGAINST: Western Cape.

Motion accordingly agreed to in accordance with section 65 of the  
Constitution

**CONSIDERATION OF TAXATION LAWS AMENDMENT BILL [B 29B - 2015] AND  
REPORT OF SELECT COMMITTEE ON FINANCE THEREON**

**CONSIDERATION OF TAX ADMINISTRATION LAWS AMENDMENT BILL [B 30 -  
2015] AND REPORT OF SELECT COMMITTEE ON FINANCE THEREON**

Mr C J DE BEER: Thank you, hon Chairperson. Hon Minister for  
Finance, hon members, today is a very important day in the calendar  
of the world. 1<sup>st</sup> of December called International World Aids Day and  
we support that campaign under the title to be free of aids. We must  
go back to our constituencies this afternoon and be part of that  
campaign.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**01 DECEMBER 2015**

**PAGE: 4**

Hon Chair, National Treasury proposed a range of tax amendments in the 2015 budget review. The tax proposals reflect government's commitment to stabilise the fiscus while ensuring that the tax system remains fair efficient and progressive.

The proposals aim to increase tax revenues, limit the erosion of the corporate tax base, increase incentives for small businesses and promote a greener economy. The Taxation Laws Amendment Bill and Tax Administration Laws Amendment Bill 2015 forms part of the second set of tax legislation. Giving effect to the tax proposals that were announced in the 2015 budget review. These Bills were preceded by the Rates and Monetary Amounts Amendment Bill that was adopted by Parliament in this year.

The Taxation Laws Amendment Bill proposes amendments to the Personal Income Tax, called PIT, and savings retirement reforms, general business taxes, taxation of financial institutions and products, tax incentives internal taxation and value added tax or as we know it, VAT. The first dealt with the rates and the thresholds and this Bill contains the more complex and substantive tax amendments from the 2015 budget review. It's a very important document, hon members, that must stay on your desk. It's a reference document to work with.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**01 DECEMBER 2015**

**PAGE: 5**

Some key proposed amendments of the Bill include closing the tax loopholes to protect the estate duty regime. Replacing a tax credit for withholding taxes imposed by other countries and services provided from South Africa with a tax deduction. Thereby protecting the corporate income tax base and adjustments to the taxation of insurance companies to be in line with the new solvency assessment and management regulatory initiative as announced by the Minister on 27 October.

The Bill further seeks to consider amendments on the timing of ... [Inaudible.] ... for provident funds. These changes were initially scheduled to be implemented on the 1 March 2015 and the implementation date will now be the 1 March 2016. The objectives of the retirement reform and tax provisions sought to simply and align the tax treatment of contributions to retirement funds, improve tax equity by allowing the same tax deductions across all retirement funds and imposing a limit on the allowable deduction. Improved transparency and debt collection by deeming contributions by employers on behalf of members as a taxable fringe benefit and protect retirees, persons that go on pension against old age poverty by extending the requirement to purchase an annuity to provident fund members.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**01 DECEMBER 2015**

**PAGE: 6**

What is the benefits. The reforms, limited tax deductibility per annum to 27,5% up to a maximum of R350 000. These reforms are meant to achieve the following important objectives and benefits. All provident fund members for the first time, a tax deduction for their own contributions thereby increasing their take home salaries. SARS data shows that there are over 2,5 million provident fund members who contribute to a provident fund. Around 1,25 million are above the tax threshold and would receive an increase in their pay.

Encourage workers to save and save more for retirement because of the higher tax deductions that limits contributions.

Protect retirees against old age poverty by extending the requirement to purchase an annuity to provident fund members.

Improve vertical equity between the high and low income tax payers by imposing a limit on the total allowable deduction to high income tax payers and reduce the scope of structuring the tax affairs and thereby benefiting excessively from the tax deductions.

Improve horizontal equity by harmonising the same deduction across all retirement funds and hence allowing equal treatment for all retirement funds. Improved transparency and data collection by deeming contributions by employers on behalf of members as a taxable fringe benefit. This will enable better administration and

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**01 DECEMBER 2015**

**PAGE: 7**

enforcement by SARS. Also to simplify the tax treatment of contributions to retirement funds. Vested rights are protected resulting in the impact and neutralisation taking longer to be felt by provident fund members and this will come into effect on the 1 March 2016.

I'm now turning to the Tax Administration Laws Amendment Bill because the two Bills go hand in hand. This Bill amends 11 Acts totalling 137 amendments. The key amendments to the 2015 Tax Administration Laws Amendment Bill aimed to provide a framework for gathering financial information for an automatic exchange with a growing number of countries around the world.

The changes assist in creating an overall tax regime for South Africa that is internationally competitive and consistent and ensures that tax receipts are not undermined and that the tax burden is fairly distributed. An extensive consultation process has been followed to allow all stakeholders to provide inputs and comments on the Bills, if I'm correct since June this year. The Select Committee for Finance jointly with the Standing Committee for Finance held public hearings on the 10 November 2015.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

01 DECEMBER 2015

PAGE: 8

The National Treasury under the leadership of the hon Minister has consulted with the relevant parties including NEDLAC, members of the public, trade unions, tax practitioners and companies as well as insurance companies. The majority of the stakeholders supported the amendments. The Select Committee for Finance having considered and examined the Taxation Laws Amendment Bill, B29B - 2015 Section 77, and the Tax Administration Laws Amendment Bill, B30 - 2015 Section 75, reports that it has agreed to both Bills although the DA voted against the bills. Thank you Chair.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Thank you Sir. That concludes the debate. I shall now go to the question in respect of the first order and the question is that the Bill be agreed to. In accordance with rule 63 I shall now allow political parties to make their declarations, if they so wish. Does any party wish to make a declaration? The ANC, the DA, hon Essack. Hon Motara?

*Declaration(s) of vote:*

Ms T MOTARA: Thank you Chairperson. On behalf of the ANC we would like to state that the Taxation Law Amendment Bill seeks to address a phenomenon that has affected all of us in the global economy. One is of tax base erosion. The alignment of taxes, limits of allowable deductions and protection of retirees are just some of the reforms.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**01 DECEMBER 2015**

**PAGE: 9**

We have impressed upon all parties concerned to ensure that extensive education and communication around how the laws affect their pension funds will have to be meted out. This is imperative so that we don't see a removal or a withdrawal of those who are in current pension funds.

All of us agree that in order for the economy to grow there are some active measures we will have to put in place in order to stimulate the economy. One measure is to give citizens more spending power. By increasing their take home salaries this will ensure citizens have more spending power and thus also boost the economy. Over and above taking care of our domestic tax interests we also will have to align with those that which is happening globally as we are a global player and our tax reforms and these Bills seek to achieve this. Having said that the ANC does support both the Tax Amendment Law Bills. Thank you.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Thank you. The hon Essack?

Mr F ESSACK: Hon Chairperson, thank you for the opportunity. On behalf of the Democratic Alliance I would like to make two declarations seeing that the hon De Beer covered both.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**01 DECEMBER 2015**

**PAGE: 10**

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: We are dealing with the first order.

Mr F ESSACK: Are we dealing with the first one now? Alright good.

Hon Chairperson I'd just like to correct, before I start my declaration, hon De Beer where he said that the DA voted against it. I just want ...

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: It will be part of your time of your declaration.

Mr F ESSACK: Ja, that's fine. I just want to put it on record that we reserved our right but did not vote against it. Okay. So firstly if I might just start I would like firstly to congratulate our hon members for not buckling to the demands of COSATU. This report covers a very arduous process which very nearly had significant benefits for members of provident funds highlighted by COSATU. Might I add COSATU is presently at Parliament but is unfortunately being kept out of the precinct.

Never mind that COSATU members will benefit from the implementation of the retirement funding reforms, many COSATU members will be taking more money home on payday from the 1 March 2016 and yet COSATU tried to block these benefits to it's very members. Despite

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

01 DECEMBER 2015

PAGE: 11

the ill-informed commentary including from COSATU the implementation of the Act does not enforce the preservation of the invested funds nor does it allow the retirement funds and pensions to be raided by the state. This false commentary is dishonest and does not serve a productive goal for South Africa. The DA will therefore support the Bill. Thank you.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Thank you. Hon members we shall now proceed. Order. We shall now proceed to the voting on the question. Members will vote by pressing in favour, against or abstain buttons. Are all members ready to vote? Hon Hattingh?

Mr C HATTINGH: I have not yet been registered on the system. I here have a card that tells me I am Y C Vawda belonging to the EFF.

[Laughter.]

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Thank you, hon Hattingh. How does he vote? Okay. Hon Mtileni, he's clearly not the hon Vawda, you can see.

Mr V E MTILENI: We are happy if, you know, as hon Vawda is not around, he can be Vawda for today only. [Laughter.]

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**01 DECEMBER 2015**

**PAGE: 12**

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Thank you. Hon members please proceed to vote. The hon Hattingh you will be given an opportunity to indicate. Have all members voted. Have all members voted? Hon Gaehler you will be given an opportunity to vote. Hon Van Lingen please take your seat. Please take your seat. Hon Gaehler and hon Hattingh will indicate their votes. Hon Engelbrecht have you voted? Thank you very much. Hon Gaehler, do you want a staff member to go and take your vote privately? Please do. Can the hon Hattingh be attended to. You vote in favour? It's in favour.

All the members have voted. Thank you, hon members. Hon members, the members have voted. Those who voted in favour are 34. Those who voted against are 2. No member has abstained.

Declarations of vote made on behalf of the African National Congress and Democratic Alliance.

Question put: That the Bill be agreed to.

Bill accordingly agreed to in accordance with section 75 of the Constitution.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

01 DECEMBER 2015

PAGE: 13

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: I shall put that question and allow hon members in terms of rule 63 to make declarations if they so wish. Is there any hon member wishing? Hon Essack? Hon Essack you have the floor.

*Declaration(s) of vote:*

Mr F ESSACK: Hon Chairperson, I thank you again for the opportunity. The Taxation Administration Laws Amendment Bill deals with making it easier to run a business or it can make it more difficult. Yes, it's legal framework and regulation is designed to ensure the maximum collection of tax revenue. Unfortunately, it does not encourage businesses to grow the economy and also to create more jobs for the millions of unemployed South Africans. Take for example the provisions that allow SARS to raid taxpayer's bank accounts in order to recover allegedly outstanding tax debt.

Some tax payers have suddenly found themselves without funds to live on and businesses without notice have already had their tight cash flows destroyed and in some cases not been able to pay wages and salaries. This provision is amended in the Bill and will now include that a 30-day final demand must be sent to a taxpayer before the third party tax debt provision may be activated. The draconian proposal by the Minister that only gave taxpayers six months in

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**01 DECEMBER 2015**

**PAGE: 14**

which to request corrections to tax returns has been removed from the Bill and the three-year period in the Act will now be retained.

The need for corrections of submitted tax returns has become far more important now that the majority of tax payers have either directly become data capturers for SARS or have to pay considerable amounts to tax practitioners to capture their data and to submit their tax returns via E-filing. The proposed and inordinately long extension of the prescription period in favour of SARS has been reduced to two years. Furthermore, the determination of what constitutes a complex matter has now been more clearly stated. Given that the Bill does go some way to address the concerns of the public the DA supports the Bill. Thank you.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Thank you. The hon Motara.

Ms T MOTARA: Thank you Chairperson. I think for us to be able to address tax law in this country there can't be an open ended system. Opened ended window of opportunity for businesses especially to be able to defraud the system and that's exactly what the Bill seeks to achieve. Is to close the gap not have a five-year or protracted period of where you come in and request for reviews. We don't support a fraudulent system. We need to be able to address and it's

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

01 DECEMBER 2015

PAGE: 15

incorrect that we have to pay a tax practitioner to do your tax, you can do it by E-filing yourself. It is not a very difficult process.

So this Tax Law Amendment Bills seeks to just tighten that which has allowed for tax erosion in this country and that's what we seek to achieve. As repeated the ANC does support the Bill and we further support being able to control what it is that our country deserves and must receive. Thank you.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Thank you. Order members.

We shall now proceed to the voting on the question. Members shall vote by pressing in favour, against or abstain buttons. Have all members voted except the hon Hattingh who has an identity crisis? Have all the members voted? Hon Hattingh do you need to whisper or are you declaring?

Mr C HATTINGH: In favour.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: In favour. Hon Gaehler has it worked this time?

Mr L B GAEHLER: Ja.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**01 DECEMBER 2015**

**PAGE: 16**

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Can I have the results please. Hon members two members did not vote. We do not know whether it is the systems or whether they did not wish to vote. Hon Ximbi you're outstanding. Hon Engelbrecht you're outstanding. We do not know whether it is your exercising the choice not to vote. Order members. Okay thank you very much. Honourable members all members have now voted. Those in favour 34, those against 2.

Declarations of vote made on behalf of the Democratic Alliance and African National Congress.

Question put: That the Bill be agreed to.

Bill accordingly agreed to in accordance with section 75 of the Constitution.

**FINANCE BILL [B32 - 2015]**

**And**

**NEW DEVELOPMENT BANK SPECIAL APPROPRIATIONS BILL [B32 - 2015]**

(CONSIDERATION OF REPORT OF SELECT COMMITTEE ON APPROPRIATIONS  
THEREON)

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**01 DECEMBER 2015**

**PAGE: 17**

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: The hon Mohai?

Mr S J MOHAI: Thanks very much, hon Chairperson and also the Minister of Finance and hon members. Chairperson, as we indicated I'll make a statement on both Finance and New Development Bank Special Appropriation Bill. On 27 October 2015 the Minister of Finance tabled two Bills. The Finance Bill and the New Development Bank Special Appropriation Bill.

The committee received briefings on the 25 November 2015 from National Treasury on the two Bills before the Bills were tabled in the National Assembly. This was done as part of the committee's preparatory work to ensure compliance with the tight timeframe faced by the committee. This was however done with the understanding that in the event that the National Assembly passes any of the Bills with any amendments, the committee will call the National Treasury again for further briefings. But however that was not the case.

The Bills were passed in the National Assembly without any amendments. The Finance Bill proposes for the approval of unauthorised expenditure in four departments. The Bill is aimed at implementing the recommendations of the Standing Committee On Public Accounts on unauthorised expenditure and funding mechanisms. The

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**01 DECEMBER 2015**

**PAGE: 18**

departments concerned experienced overspending due to a number of factors that were found by National Treasury to have been beyond of the departments concerned.

The SCOPA recommendations were adopted by National Assembly on 23 June 2015. The Finance Bill has been considered by the committee in terms of procedure provided for in Section 75 of the Constitution and it doesn't require negotiating or final mandates from Provinces. The Bill was agreed to by the committee. On the New Development Bank Special Appropriation Bill, one of the highlights of the sixth BRICS summit in Brazil in July 2014 was the agreement to establish The New Development Bank aimed at financing of infrastructure projects and sustainable development in emerging economies in developing countries.

The bank also provides contingent reserves arrangement which has the goal of promoting mutual support amongst BRICS members in situation of instability in their balance of payments. The banks further aim to provide sustainable development projects in member countries and other emerging economies and developing countries to complement the existing efforts of multilateral and regional financial institutions for global growth and development. The BRICS bank initiative should

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**01 DECEMBER 2015**

**PAGE: 19**

be welcomed, particularly in the view that countries in partnership with South Africa are highly industrialised economies.

The kind of partnership has potential to address structural deficiencies within the South African economy such as the need for industrialisation as well as reducing the persistent negative balance of payments. The establishment of the bank will further address developmental bottlenecks that make it increasingly difficult for sub-Saharan Africa to achieve its growth potential. The New Development Bank Special Appropriation Bill appropriates funds to enable the country to honour its first payment on time for the operationalisation of the bank.

The Minister has already indicated that future instalments will be subjected to normal budgetary processes. This will go a long way in stimulating productive capacity of South Africa's economy. It will address growth on more sustainable basis and thus have economy that is resilient and able to provide productive jobs. The Bill has been considered by the committee in terms of the procedure provided for in Section 75 of the Constitution and the Bill was agreed to by the committee. I thank you, Chair.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

01 DECEMBER 2015

PAGE: 20

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Thank you Sir. Hon Members that concludes the debate. I shall now put the question in respect of the third order and the question is that the Bill be agreed to. In accordance with rule 63 I shall allow political parties to make their declarations of the vote if they so wish. The hon Essacks's finger is up. Hon Essack, you're on the floor.

*Declaration(s) of vote:*

Mr F ESSACK: Thank you again, Chairperson. Just to confirm the third Bill, would that be the Finance Bill. Right?

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Third order, yes.

Mr F ESSACK: Good. Hon Chairperson, yes in terms of this Bill every year departments from across government must appear before SCOPA and explain why their mistakes led to an inability for them to abide to their budgets and why they incurred unauthorised expenditure. SCOPA must decide to accept or reject these platitudes for extra funding. What this means is you have spent outside the parameters of your budget. That means your daily, weekly and monthly planning and of course tracking of expenditure has been poor and that you have not catered for emergencies.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**01 DECEMBER 2015**

**PAGE: 21**

An example is the Presidency which incurred R42,9 million in unauthorised expenditure made up as follows. R2,7 million because of the poor planning of a national orders ceremony. R5,13 million to cover the shortfall on the legal costs to defend the hon President against criminal charges. R4 million for the President to travel to Zimbabwe. A junket to the United Nations at the cost of R1,3 million. The creation of two new ministries to add to an already bloated Cabinet at the cost of R8 million. Fruitless mediation with dictators in Libya and Zimbabwe at a cost of a further R7 million. The Presidential hotline which has cost taxpayers of this country R5,7 million.

In the Department of Trade and Industry unauthorised expenditure totalled R37,3 million. This included writing off of staff debts for R125 000. Payment of R6 million due to a default on a very valid trade agreement and R31 million lost in the GEIS sanctions busting scheme of the pre 1994 regime. The DA cannot agree to reckless and irresponsible expenditure. Therefore, we do not support this Bill. I thank you.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Thank you Sir. Any other party? None. We proceed hon members to the vote on the question. Members will vote by pressing in favour, against or abstain buttons. Are members

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

01 DECEMBER 2015

PAGE: 22

voting? Voting has been closed. Is there a technicality Hon Tlake? Hon Hattingh votes against. Can I have the results please. Hon Members the votes are in. Those who have voted in favour are 25, those who voted against are 11, one member has abstained.

Declaration of vote made on behalf of the Democratic Alliance.

Question put: That the Bill be agreed to.

Bill accordingly agreed to in accordance with section 75 of the Constitution.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: I shall now proceed to put the question in terms of the fourth order and the question is that the Bill be agreed to. I shall once more in terms of rule 63 first allow political parties that wish to make declarations of their vote to do so. The hon Essack?

*Declaration(s) of vote:*

Mr F ESSACK: Hon Chairperson I thank you again. The purpose of the New Development Bank Special Appropriation Bill is to appropriate money for the first instalment of the paid in capital towards the

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**01 DECEMBER 2015**

**PAGE: 23**

capitalisation of the New BRICS Bank. While this payment is budget neutral for this financial year it will not be the same for future years.

Unequivocally South Africa cannot afford the first R2,2 billion instalment towards the New Development Bank which is now due in January 2016, some 30 days from now. South Africa should first focus its attention to financing our very own urgent needs. The New Development Bank is definitely, I repeat is definitely, not a priority. South Africa's total contribution to the New Development Bank is, and I ask you to listen carefully, South Africa's total contribution to the New Development Bank is 13,5% of its national budget compared to 2,2% for Brazil, 2,4% for Russia, 4,7% for India and only a paltry 0,8% for China. 13,5% of our national budget.

In terms of the Bill the payment of the amount of 150 million US as a first capital instalment to the bank is subject to the payment into the National Revenue Fund which is then dependent from the sale of state assets. This payment is not a once off cost. It is the first of seven capital payments which in total will cost a minimum of 2 billion Dollars. This excludes a possible callable amount of 8 billion Dollars. Now Cathy Dlamini will not understand much of

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**01 DECEMBER 2015**

**PAGE: 24**

what I'm talking about. That gives a total possible commitment of some 10 million Dollars, Chairperson.

We must also keep in mind the vulnerability of the South African Rand which continues to plummet. While the purpose of the bank is to mobilise resources for infrastructure and sustainable development projects in BRICS and other emerging economies and developing countries, there is and remains no guarantee of funding by the bank to South Africa. The funding could be allocated to other founding countries or to other developing countries who approach the bank. Furthermore, the funding is in the form of loans, guarantees, equity participation and of course other financial instruments. The DA therefore, does not support the Bill. I thank you.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Thank you. The hon Motara?

Ms T MOTARA: Thank you Chairperson. The DA never supported the formation of the BRICS Development Bank. They never supported that South Africa even be a member of BRICS in the first place because I don't think they support the coming together and the unity of emerging markets to support each other and to support growth in those countries. We need to be able to be in a position to support each other because we have the same economic problems, we have the

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**01 DECEMBER 2015**

**PAGE: 25**

same economic challenges. We have the same debt crisis and we have to be able to share the burden.

We have the same types of population dynamics which is majority poor, which is and this development bank seeks to achieve support as well as infrastructure development as you have rightly said. I'm really surprised by hon Essack's assertion or his even pre-empting that we will not be able to afford number 1, number 2 he's saying that we will not even be able to borrow or there's no guarantee. Do you really think that we will fund a bank that we will not be able to use? It's not going to happen. As if we are donating to friends almost, that's what you want to say.

Had we been borrowing from emerging markets you would not have the same, you would not feel the same but because we borrowing from those that share the same situation, that share the same interests and the same values and possibly the same ideological perspectives that's why we as the ANC are going to support it and we currently support it, we support the development of BRICS countries, we support the ongoing capitalisation and industrialisation as well as infrastructure development within the BRICS countries. Thank you Chair.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

01 DECEMBER 2015

PAGE: 26

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Thank you. Is there any other party that wishes to make a declaration? None.

Therefore, hon members we proceed to the voting. Members will press the in favour, the against or abstain buttons. Thank you very much. Have all the members voted? The hon Hattingh.

Mr C HATTINGH: Vote against.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: The hon Hattingh votes against. May I get the results please. Thank you very much. Hon Members those who voted in favour are 26, those who voted against are 11. We have no abstentions.

Declarations of vote made on behalf of the Democratic Alliance and African National Congress.

Question put: That the Bill be agreed to.

Bill accordingly agreed to in accordance with section 75 of the Constitution

01 DECEMBER 2015

PAGE: 27

CONSIDERATION OF REPORT OF JOINT STANDING COMMITTEE ON INTELLIGENCE  
ANNUAL REPORT OF JOINT STANDING COMMITTEE ON INTELLIGENCE FOR  
FINANCIAL YEAR ENDING 31<sup>ST</sup> OF MARCH 2013 INCLUDING THE REPORT UP TO  
FEBRUARY 2014

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Thank you. The hon Parkies?

Mr J P PARKIES: Hon Chair, hon members of the House. We stand here to submit and present a report, annual report of the Joint Standing Committee on Intelligence which was meant for the fourth Parliament to dissolve. The report therefore includes material which falls outside the annual reporting period. Therefore, some matters reported on this includes the period until February 2014.

The legislative mandate of the Joint Standing Committee on Intelligence, it's functions are set out in Section 3 of the Intelligence Services Oversight Act 40 of 1994. Some of these functions however are to be received from the auditor general, an audit report compiled in accordance with the Public Audit Act 25 of 2004. Any judge as defined in the draft Regulation Interception of Communications; the minister's responsible for the services and intelligence services entities to consider and make recommendations on the report and certificates transmitted to it in terms of the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

01 DECEMBER 2015

PAGE: 28

section 7, subsection. To consider and make recommendations on all proposed legislations regarding to a service and any other intelligence and intelligence related activities; to review and make recommendations on the regulations made under section 6 of National Strategic Intelligence Act; to refer any matter in relation to the service and intelligence activity which comes to its attention; to consider and make recommendations regarding any matter falling within the purview of this Act; to deliberate upon hold hearings subpoena witnesses and make recommendations on any aspect relating to intelligence and national security including administration and financial expenditure. We hereby submit the report for adoption.

*isiZulu:*

Siyabonga Sihlalo.

*English:*

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Members that concludes the debate. I shall now put the question and it is that the report be agreed to. In accordance to Rule 71 I shall first allow Provinces the opportunity to make their declarations of their vote if they so wish. Does any Province want to make a declaration? None.

Question put: That the Report be adopted.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**01 DECEMBER 2015**

**PAGE: 29**

IN FAVOUR: Eastern Cape, Free State, Gauteng, KwaZulu-Natal, Limpopo, Mpumalanga, Northern Cape, North West, Western Cape.

Report accordingly adopted in accordance with section 65 of the Constitution.

**CONSIDERATION OF REPORT OF SELECT COMMITTEE ON SOCIAL SERVICES  
OVERSIGHT VISIT TO MANGUANG LOCAL MUNICIPALITY IN THE FREE STATE  
PROVINCE FROM 7 TO 11 SEPTEMBER 2015**

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Thank you. The hon L C Dlamini.

Ms L C DLAMINI: Chair, I'm intimidated throughout the House. Thank you very much Chair. Hon Chair, my greetings to the hon members and special delegates if there's any. The background of this report is that the Select Committee On Social Services did an oversight visit to the Manguang Local Municipality which is in Free State. I must say upfront that we got a maximum support from the National Department provincial legislature as well as provincial government and the ward entities.

The constitutional stipulation of this report is that it is to have access to dignified sanitation, it's a basic human right. This is in

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**01 DECEMBER 2015**

**PAGE: 30**

line with the National Development Plan, Medium Term Strategic Framework, priorities of the fifth administration and the mandate of the committee. According to the NDP, water is a strategic resource for critical socioeconomic development. Further it is acknowledged that South Africa is a water scarce country, hence greater attention should be paid to water management and use. Moreover, it is acknowledged that water supply and sanitation services are vital for community health development, cohesion and continued economic activities.

The focus areas of the oversight of the committee. The committee conducted an oversight visit to Free State on the 7 to 11 September focusing on the following areas: Bloemwater's Conduit Hydropower facility at the Brandkop Reservoir; Kopanong Local Municipality for the Bucket Eradication Programme; Rustfontein Dam and Water Reservoir which is managed by Bloemwater.

The purpose was to assess progress in the implementation of identifying programmes and project. The committee focused on the following imperatives, bulk potable water supply to the citizens of Free State through local municipalities. The successes and challenges in bulk potable water supply, water infrastructure management, compliance with second National Water Resource Strategy,

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**01 DECEMBER 2015**

**PAGE: 31**

status of Bucket Eradication Programme and the beneficiaries who had received these services.

The findings of the committee in terms of the bucket eradication - we learned that Free State is one of the provinces that had the biggest bucket system in the country, but it was interesting to note that the Province had made tremendous progress in terms of the eradication of the bucket system. The following areas are where the project was implemented - Meriteng and JB Mafora wards in Manguang Township and also in Botshabelo, to mention but a few.

At the end of the visit, the committee learned that the municipality with the support of the department, as well as the provincial government, had eradicated 10 748 buckets within the three years that Bloemwater was given to implement the project. There were also challenges that were affecting the project in terms of eradicating the bucket system. One of the biggest challenges was the bulk water supply, because in order for the communities to have flushing toilets you have to have bulk water in their areas. There has been a lot of delays in terms of that and also the aging infrastructure, vandalism and cable theft affected the department in terms of the implementation.

01 DECEMBER 2015

PAGE: 32

In terms of the Bloemwater Conduit Hydropower Plant, it is located within the Bloemwater Board precinct. Considering the energy challenges facing South Africa currently, these research programmes was done collaboratively with various stakeholders to investigate and demonstrate the potential of extracting the available energy from the existing and newly installed water supply and distribution.

The aim of the project was to enable the owners of the administration and the administrators of the bulk water supply and distribution systems to install small-scale hydropower systems to generate hydroelectricity for on-site use; and to supply energy to isolated electricity demand clusters or even to the national electricity grid, depending on the location, type and size of the installation.

The Conduit Hydropower taps into an unutilised source of hydropower by using excess energy in pressurised conduits to the produce clean and renewable hydroelectric power.

In terms of the Rustfontein Dam and Water Reservoir: When the committee visited the area, the issue of Free State as one of the scarce water province's there was realised, because we found that the dam at the time of the visit of the committee was at 25% which

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**01 DECEMBER 2015**

**PAGE: 33**

is a percentage that is not acceptable. There were a number of challenges that were reported, but there were also strategies that were put by the Department of Water and Sanitation in getting water to supply those communities. The committee deliberated and concluded that in the main, the following are crucial in strengthening the project visited: The local municipality together with the department should have awareness campaigns to educate the communities on the cleanliness and hygiene, because what we found, is that after those clinics or toilets were built, they were vandalised and they were not cleaned, which was the responsibility of the owners, not the government. So there must be awareness. Auditing of financial statement, as well of debts being paid is crucial in providing efficient services to clients.

The issue there was that the municipalities were not paying the Bloemwater, therefore there were challenges in terms of the implementation. Hon Chair, with all the recommendations made by the committee, the committee appreciates that the Department of Water and Sanitation is already driving the process in addressing and realising this. We therefore present the report to be adopted by the Council. I thank you, Chair.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**01 DECEMBER 2015**

**PAGE: 34**

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Thank you. That concludes the debate and I shall now put the question and the question is that the report be agreed to. I shall allow Provinces if they so wish an opportunity to make their declarations. None.

Question put: That the Report be adopted.

IN FAVOUR: Eastern Cape, Free State, Gauteng, KwaZulu-Natal, Limpopo, Mpumalanga, Northern Cape, North West, Western Cape.

Report accordingly adopted in accordance with section 65 of the Constitution.

**CONSIDERATION OF REPORT OF SELECT COMMITTEE ON SOCIAL SERVICES,  
OVERSIGHT VISIT TO THE RUSTENBURG LOCAL MUNICIPALITY IN THE NORTH  
WEST AND THE WESTERN RAND DISTRICT MUNICIPALITY IN GAUTENG FROM 17  
TO 21 OF AUGUST 2015**

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: The hon Dlamini.

Ms L C DLAMINI: Thank you very much, hon Chair. The Select Committee on Social Services did an oversight visit to the North West Province focusing on Rustenburg local municipality which is in the North West

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**01 DECEMBER 2015**

**PAGE: 35**

from 17 to 21 August 2015. This was planned and was agreed upon during the planning session and it is also the mandate of the committee. During the week of 17 to 21 of August 2015, the committee undertook a joint oversight visit with the Select Committee On Education and Recreation to two Provinces, that is North West and Gauteng.

Again we got maximum support from both provincial legislatures and provincial governments of those two and our national departments. The focus was in three areas. One was the visit of Human Settlements, the second one was in line with Home Affairs visiting Lindela and the third one was focusing on the houses of the military veterans. I do want to say that in terms of the findings of the committee in terms of human settlements we started from Thusanang Housing Project, Bokamoso Extension 1.

The committee reviewed the show houses at the Bokamoso Extension 1. The project caters for five informal settlements in the area. From phase 1, 1 600 units are expected by the communities. The units are semi detached, 45 square metre houses with two bedrooms. The committee felt that there must be a reconsideration of the houses because it looks very small for traditional African families, which is not less than five family members in a community.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

01 DECEMBER 2015

PAGE: 36

We also visited a very exciting project at Marikana Extension 2 whereby Lonmin donated 50 hectares to build houses for the communities around there, including the miners who are working there. Those project, the committee, we all agree that that was a story, good story to tell. In fact, it accommodated almost everyone.

Even though, we felt as a committee, that there must be a revisit of the policy because at the time of the implementation or handing over of those houses it was discovered that some of the mine workers who initially qualified to have those houses got promotions and they were now not qualifying. We're recommending that the department must relook at the policy and see how best it accommodates everyone. But we must say Chair ...

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon Dlamini, there is a point of order. Hon Essack?

Mr F ESSACK: Thank you, hon Chair. I just wanted to check on a point of clarity. What is the average size of an RDP in terms of square metres?

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon Essack that is not a point of order.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

01 DECEMBER 2015

PAGE: 37

AN HON MEMBER: She is saying it was small.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: That is not a point of order.

Mr F ESSACK: While I was on the topic ...

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Please hon Dlamini, please proceed.

Mr F ESSACK: Sorry Chairperson.

Ms L C DLAMINI: Thank you very much, hon Chair. The committee recommended that projects time frames be maintained to ensure completion and handover takes place during the end of the financial year as the project was delayed by a number of issues in terms of the implementation. We therefore, indicate that we were promised as a committee that the project will be handed over.

In terms of the houses ...

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Order!

Ms L C DLAMINI: ... built for the military veterans, I must say that the committee was disappointed because we were not given an

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**01 DECEMBER 2015**

**PAGE: 38**

opportunity to see those houses. Reasons that were put forth were that they do not have a database for military veterans and also the question of land. The recommendation of the committee was that the office of the Premier should assist in trying to identify military veterans so that those houses are built. In terms of land the committee is recommending that municipalities should make sure that there is land to build those houses for military veterans.

The third project was Lindela. No before I move to, from North West, in our meeting, a joint meeting with Education it came out that the Department of Education and Department of Health are under administration by the Provincial Government. We therefore, recommended that the committee meets with the department, including with the office of the Premier, as well as National Department, to see what are the issues because we have a report that says for the past three years the department has been getting unqualified audit opinion. Just to support the Province the committee is recommending to meet the department.

Coming to Lindela, as a collective, as a committee we came to the conclusion again that it is one good story to tell, well managed and there was only one thing that we had an issue with, two issues. The first issue, was a question of a clinic, not that it is badly

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**01 DECEMBER 2015**

**PAGE: 39**

managed but the space is very small. We had already discussed that with Department of Health as well as Department of Home Affairs that that must be corrected.

At the time of the visit the people who were there, I think it was also the contribution of Operation Feyela, was 3 962 people, but in terms of food and everything the Centre was well managed. We therefore present this report to the House for consideration. Thank you, Chair.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Thank you. That concludes the debate. I shall now put the question and the question is that the report be agreed to. In accordance with Rule 71 I shall first allow Provinces an opportunity to make declarations if they so wish. Is there any Province that wishes to make a declaration? None.

Question put: That the Report be adopted.

IN FAVOUR: Eastern Cape, Free State, Gauteng, KwaZulu-Natal, Limpopo, Mpumalanga, Northern Cape, North West, Western Cape.

Report accordingly adopted in accordance with section 65 of the Constitution.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**01 DECEMBER 2015**

**PAGE: 40**

**CONSIDERATION OF REPORT OF SELECT COMMITTEE ON SOCIAL SERVICES  
SUBSTANCE ABUSE ROUND TABLE HELD AT TOWNHOUSE HOTEL ON 28 JULY 2015**

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: The hon L C Dlamini?

Ms L C DLAMINI: Thank you very much, hon Chair. The Select Committee on Social Services hosted a Round Table on Substance Abuse at the Townhouse Hotel on 28 July. The theme of the Round Table was: "implementation of the National Drug Master Plan 2013-2017, reflections on capacity and support".

The purpose of the Round Table, the objectives of the roundtable was as follows: To provide members of the Select Committee on Social Services with better understanding on substance abuse policy making and policy implementation; To provide a platform for public participation to stakeholders from civil society and government to discuss challenges or issues of concerns and possible solutions around implementing substance abuse policies and programmes in our country; To provide understanding to Members of Parliament of the challenges within the substance abuse sector - through the lens of non-profit organisations (NPOs) and Local Drug Action Committees (LDACs); To hear responses from the central drugs authority concerning issues raised by NPOs and Local Drugs Action Committee.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**01 DECEMBER 2015**

**PAGE: 41**

The substance abuse which includes the misuse of alcohol and drugs abuse is of national and global concern. This scourge is national wide and it seems that everyone is affected directly or indirectly. In 2014, hon Chair, his Excellency, the President Jacob Zuma engaged with the community of Eldorado Park in Gauteng to address the compelling issues of drug trafficking and adolescent drug use in that community. Moreover, the problems of substance abuse continue unabated.

It is worth noting that we had a number of civil society who attended the Round Table and it was very interesting to note the different perspectives from government and the civil society.

The presentations that we have, were first blessed by having the MEC of Social Development in the Western Cape and the Western Cape South African National Council against Alcohol and Drugs Abuse, Cape Town Drug Counselling Centre, Eldorado Park Local Drug Action Committee, National Health and Development Foundation Alliance. Those were the organisations that made presentation. But I must say that we had a number of organisations that attended the Round Table.

In terms of discussions and recommendation all participants agreed that a collaborative effort is needed to address the scourge of

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**01 DECEMBER 2015**

**PAGE: 42**

substance abuse in the country. Treatment centres should be established in all Provinces such as, and not because I'm the Chairperson, such as Mpumalanga.

NGOs must work together and mentor each other where the need exist because we learned that the services are not the same in different centres. Local Government should assist NGOs across all Provinces. Public policy regarding the criminalisation of the addicts should be relooked at. Different treatment centres are necessary to facilitate treatment for children and adolescents.

National awareness campaigns are necessary. It was noted that most services are subsidised. Increasing taxation on alcohol drinks and using these funds to fund treatment centres may be something for exploration.

We therefore present this report to the Council for consideration with the final resolution that there is a dire need to have another Round Table to see how far have they progressed in terms of the implementation of the recommendation. I present this report to the House for consideration. Thank you Chair.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**01 DECEMBER 2015**

**PAGE: 43**

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Thank you. Hon members this concludes the debate. I shall now put the question and the question is that this report be agreed to. Is there any Province that wishes to make a declaration? None.

Question put: That the Report be adopted.

IN FAVOUR: Eastern Cape, Free State, Gauteng, KwaZulu-Natal, Limpopo, Mpumalanga, Northern Cape, North West, Western Cape.

Report accordingly adopted in accordance with section 65 of the Constitution.

**CONSIDERATION OF REPORT OF JOINT COMMITTEE ON ETHICS AND MEMBERS  
INTERESTS - REPORT ON 2015 DISCLOSURES**

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: The hon Singh.

Mr A S SINGH: Thank you, Madam Chairperson, for allowing me to present the report of the Joint Committee on Ethics and Members' Interests, Report on the 2015 disclosures.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**01 DECEMBER 2015**

**PAGE: 44**

At the tabling of the 2015 Register of Members' Interests, the committee adopted the 2015 Members' Interests in terms of paragraph 9.2.0.2 and the publication of the register in terms of the paragraph 9.2.0.2 of the Code of Ethical Conduct of Members. The register must publish the public part of the register after adoption by the committee in the manner determined by the committee.

The code stipulates in paragraph 9.2.0.1 that any person has access to the public part of the register on working days during office hours. The register is now publically available.

Late disclosures. The extended deadline for the submission of disclosures was the 31 July 2015. On the 7 August members whose submissions were not received were sent correspondence by the Chairperson requesting that they submit their outstanding disclosures.

The committee agreed that the late submission at this stage was a minor breach of the code in terms of paragraph 10.7.7. The Committee may, in the event of a minor breach, order the member to rectify the breach and be counselled on requirements of the code.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**01 DECEMBER 2015**

**PAGE: 45**

It was agreed that members communicate to members counselling them on the importance of submitting disclosures within the deadline for disclosures. It was also recommended that in line with previous practices of the committee, namely in 2013, the names of members who submitted late be contained in a committee report and submitted to both Houses.

Outstanding apologies received on 7 August 2015, as reported at the meeting were: with apologies from Nqakula C (ANC), Bogopane-Zulu H I (ANC), Khoza N P (EFF), Nesi B A (ANC). Received with explanation Samka P (ANC NCOP), Mabudafhasi T R (ANC), [Inaudible.] N A (ANC), Tongwane T M A (ANC) and [Inaudible.] L G (EFF NCOP).

Number of no submissions due to illness. The committee condoned the non submission of the following members due to illness. The committee agreed that members should submit 30 days after the return from the sick leave. These members were Bonhomme T J (ANC), Dirks M A (ANC) and Zondi W P (ANC NCOP).

Madam Chair, I call on this report to be adopted by the Council. I thank you.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**01 DECEMBER 2015**

**PAGE: 46**

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Thank you. That concludes the debate and I shall now put the question. The question is that this report be agreed to. Does any Province wish to make any declaration on this report? None.

Question put: That the Report be adopted.

IN FAVOUR: Eastern Cape, Free State, Gauteng, KwaZulu-Natal, Limpopo, Mpumalanga, Northern Cape, North West, Western Cape.

Report accordingly adopted in accordance with section 65 of the Constitution.

**CONSIDERATION OF VOTES AND SCHEDULE - ADJUSTMENTS APPROPRIATION BILL**

**[B28 2015]**

**AND**

**CONSIDERATION OF ADJUSTMENTS APPROPRIATION BILL [B28 2015] AND OF  
REPORT OF SELECT COMMITTEE AND APPROPRIATIONS THEREON**

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Thank you. The hon Mohai?

Mr S J MOHAI: Thanks very much, hon Chairperson, and also continue to acknowledge the Minister still with us here. Colleagues the

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**01 DECEMBER 2015**

**PAGE: 47**

Adjustment Appropriation Bill was tabled on the 21 October by the Minister of Finance. During the tabling of the MTBPS, the committee had a number of engagements, joint briefings first with the NA Standing Committee. Also had various stakeholders and public hearings.

We had an opportunity as a committee to have very intense discussions with the finance fiscal commission and the Parliamentary Budget office and of course of the National Treasury and I must say on behalf of the committee we do appreciate hon Chair and Minister quality of the presentations that were made by these stakeholders and also led by our National Treasury.

So, the Minister presented the Adjustment Appropriation Bill or when the Minister presented rather, he emphasised the fact that the proposed allocations are a demonstration of a challenging circumstances that the country is facing and still call for a need to make tougher choices.

The Minister further reported that the cost containment measures that the government announced in 2013 have led to a reduction in government consumption. He indicated that across all national and provincial departments in the first year a 3% decrease was achieved

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**01 DECEMBER 2015**

**PAGE: 48**

in spending on consultants, 6% decrease in travel and subsistence and 47% decrease in catering, entertainment and events expenditure.

This Adjustment Appropriation Bill provides for the following adjustment that is required due to significant and unforeseen economic and financial events affecting the physical targets set by the annual budget. Unforeseeable and unavoidable expenditure, use of funds for emergency situation and money to be appropriated for expenditure already announced by the Minister during the tabling of the annual budget. The shifting of funds and also utilisation of savings. The rollover of unspent money.

The Adjustment Appropriation has been considered by the committee in terms of the procedure provided for in Section 75 of the Constitution and all of us know that it doesn't require final and negotiating mandates. The Bill was agreed to by the committee when the committee was dealing with this it really accepted this.

The MTBPS identified a need for structural reforms in the economy for higher growth. Achieving higher growth rates seems to be the only viable option mitigating against negative impact of raging economic crisis that has been with us since 2008 and it doesn't seem that it will go away any time soon.

01 DECEMBER 2015

PAGE: 49

What we're doing here, we must caution when you look at the Adjustment Budget. Do not look at the Adjustment Budget outside the context of the Medium Term Budget Policy Statement that the Minister presented, looking into the domestic and the global factors. Most prominent economists are agreed that we are in for a long term period of slow growth in the global economy. So we need to be considerate of these facts.

The effort should rather centre on ensuring that such a higher growth is inclusive, redistributive and create jobs on a larger scale. The implementation of the industrial policy action plan is going to be key in creating a growth plan that has jobs on a large scale. We need to increase our efforts in building industrial production systems that produces products that can compete on global markets without having to rely on captured markets. And also we need to build a sovereign industrial production system which will also force us to protect our local products against unfair competition from powerful global players.

This will also force us to invest in technology and skills on a large scale. The implementation of the IPAP plan is a way that builds a sovereign industrial production system. It is the only sustainable way of creating jobs on a large scale. Creating and

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**01 DECEMBER 2015**

**PAGE: 50**

building a large skills base for a competitive economy is related with the need for expanding access to further and higher education.

That's why the demands by student for free education should energetically be attended to, as the democratic government has demonstrated in many ways. And how it is responding currently to our Department of National Treasury and Higher Education in dealing with this matters.

Hon members, I am happy to report that the committee approved the Adjustment Budget and I want to thank members of the committee for their consistency and always being available in dealing with this matters which in many ways do not require narrow populism but understanding of country's priorities. Thank you Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Thank you. That concludes the debate. I shall now put the votes in the order in which they appear on the Schedule to the Bill. Before I do so, firstly, I'll remind members that doors will be closed. Secondly, is that we are not going to vote electronically because we are mindful of time. So if there is a division we are going to sort the issue of seating arrangements. So that we can be quick. I now put Vote 1, any objections? Hon Van Lingen?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

01 DECEMBER 2015

PAGE: 51

Vote No 1 - Presidency - put.

Ms E C VAN LINGEN: Chairperson on Vote 1 we would like to oppose and we would like to call for a division and a declaration.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Let me see the support. Okay. As I've indicated let's sort the seating arrangement. It will make us very efficient, effective and quick. Let's have those that are objecting be on the other side and then we can reserve the back one for those that will be abstaining.

I have noted the objection and the call for the division.

Order members! Let's have two tellers from this side and that side. It will be very quick. Let's have a person that will be assisting with counting that side and the other one that will be assisting this side and in that way it will be very quick.

Hon Mokoena, you are supporting?

Let me verify first. It's only one party that is calling for the objection and is that the case, let me have the three minutes

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

01 DECEMBER 2015

PAGE: 52

allocated to the person that will be doing the declaration as there was that request.

*Declaration (s) of Vote:*

Ms E C VAN LINGEN: Hon Chairperson, thank you for the opportunity. Already the hon members Stock here next to me is calling on the DAs voting schedule for guidance. South Africa must take note of the fact that the President and his over soft office, has decided the ANC comes first above the country and the President is more important than the people of this country. The Presidency has become the seat of a lavish lifestyle rather than an office of responsibility and accountability for a nation needing strong leadership away from a fiscal cliff and a shrinking growth rate.

Only economic growth can create the much needed jobs. The President's nine-point plan announced in his SONA address in February 2015, this year, is still hanging in the air and has done nothing to turn around the economy.

South Africa is at a point of being downgraded to junk status. This will prohibit foreign investment for at least two years and an unfortunate situation that is most difficult to escape. The

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**01 DECEMBER 2015**

**PAGE: 53**

appointments by the President have in many cases become an embarrassment to him, his office and South Africa.

It should be clear by now that South Africa cannot afford shameful cadre deployment when South Africa needs capable administrators to manage state owned entities and assets. The President has the largest Cabinet and countries with much larger economies have much smaller cabinets such as the US, Germany and Japan. The cost of it is estimated over a billion Rand.

The President is now purchasing a new VIP aircraft for his personal use at a cost of up to R4 billion. It is over the top expenditure like this, it is over expenditure like this that keeps our economy lagging when people need a real dignified job to care for their own families. The DA therefore cannot support this office triage at the cost of economic growth, real jobs and education for the poor.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Any other party? Hon Mohai?

Mr S J MOHAI: Thanks very much, hon Chairperson. Much of the issues raised are not related to this budget but rather let me put to perspective the significance of a Presidency of a democratic country like South Africa. Serving as a centre of strategic leadership and

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**01 DECEMBER 2015**

**PAGE: 54**

coordination in improving government programmes to improve quality of life of the people of South Africa.

Improving accountability. Elected representatives, first and foremost, have accountability to work with and be found amongst communities. Improving this accountability also relates to ... [Inaudible.] ... the Presidential hotline, monitoring programmes. Allowing ordinary South African citizens to ask questions, to raise issues around their frustrations and their concerns.

To advance nation building and social cohesion. To ensure that non South African even if they are geographic allocation puts them have got a right to arrange the affairs of a democratic country like South Africa.

Earlier on an issue was said opportunistically that the Presidency cannot talk about, an issue of unauthorised expenditure which in fact is an issue that is unforeseen. The Presidency of South Africa deals with issues of national importance such as hosting events and mediation process to a country like Zimbabwe and to the rest of the other countries in Africa. To ask first the issue of continental peace and stability is important and the issue of placing ourselves in the national, in the international arena of issues is very

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

01 DECEMBER 2015

PAGE: 55

significant. South Africa is a nation amongst states. So to our President must assert his authority among other nations. I thank you Chair.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Thank you. We now come to the voting. Hon Motara will be the teller this side. Hon Labuschagne will assist me that side. Then hon Mtileni, you'll assist me with those that are abstaining so that we can be quick. Let's do that.

Declarations of vote made on behalf of the Democratic Alliance and African National Congress.

AYES - 29: De Beer, CJ; Dikgale, M C; Dlamini, L C; Gaehler, L B; Khawula, M; Makue, E R; Manopole, G M; Mateme, H E; Mhlanga, M T; Mlambo, E M; Modise, T R; Mohai, S J; Mohapi, M J; Motara, T; Mthimunye, S G; Mthetwa, J M; Nthebe, B G; Ncitha, Z V; Nzimande, L P M; Parkies, J P; Rayi, M; Samka, P C; Singh, A S; Stock, D; Thobejane, S G; Tlake, M F; Wana, T; Ximbi, D L; Zwane L L.

NOES - 9: Engelbrecht, B; Essack, F; Faber, W F; Hattingh, C; Julius, J W W; Labuschagne, C; Mpambo-Sibhukwana, T G; Terblanche, J; Van Lingen, E C.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

01 DECEMBER 2015

PAGE: 56

ABSTAIN- 2: Mokoena, L G; Mtileni, V E.

Vote agreed to (Democratic Alliance dissenting).

Vote No 2 - Parliament - put.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): I now put vote 2. Honourable Van Lingen.

Ms E C VAN LINGEN: Hon Chairperson, we wish to object, oppose declare and divide.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Let me see. Okay. No. What is good now is that we have sorted the seating arrangement there is no need for us to do that again. Thank you, we have heard it and we can get to the declarations or do we have any party that has got an objection so that it can be noted.

*Declaration(s) of vote:*

Ms E C VAN LINGEN: Hon Chairperson, thank you for the opportunity. In June this year we declared our concerns on the budget vote for Parliament specifically referring to the legislative mandate of the NCOP and the execution thereof. The flouting of the prescribed

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**01 DECEMBER 2015**

**PAGE: 57**

legislative process in the NCOP select committees where specific pieces of legislation are concerned is a disgrace.

The Dora bill is a typical example of how the Chairperson of the Select Committee for Appropriations forced provinces to submit negotiating mandates before any public participation could take place. Only two provinces fulfilled their public participation obligation namely the Northern Cape and the North West.

The Dora Bill was presented by the permanent delegates of this select committee to Provinces on the 12 November. At least six of the nine Provinces declared their negotiating mandates on the same day and called it their date of deliberation. The DA opposed the Dora Bill because of the flouting of due process.

In fact, we believe that the handling of the Bill by the NCOP as well as several provincial legislatures was inconsistent with the Constitution and the law. The Bill cannot be ascended to for this reason. We therefore requested the President to exercise his powers under Section 79 of the Constitution and to refer the Bill back to the NCOP for reconsideration.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**01 DECEMBER 2015**

**PAGE: 58**

The Protection of Investment Bill was bulldozed through the NCOP with questionable due process. When the constitutional mandate of the NCOP is specifically one of a legislative role the ANC's political interference of poor processes and poor legislation should be addressed. The DA is firmly set to uphold the Constitution and our mandate.

Last year, we recorded the lack of information on finances of Parliament. We have to commend our Chairperson, hon Thandi Modise, of the NCOP for being open and transparent and by making this information available to all political parties. The DA has been the only party to implement the people's mandate in our provincial and local governments. We oppose this Vote. I thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Any other party? Hon Parkies?

Mr J P PARKIES: Chair, as the ANC we want to, firstly, we support the Bill and from our own vantage point we want to say this is very ridiculous. Just to oppose the Bill on a mere pure administrative processes without delving into the essence of the process. Because as the NCOP it is our duty to secure public participation of our people in any given process that deals with any piece of legislation.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**01 DECEMBER 2015**

**PAGE: 59**

But, this is an opportunistic approach by the DA which we have dissent as the African National Congress and obstruct, and obstructionist tactic to retard development in our society and they have been asserting this mimicry of transparency from the office of the Chairperson of the NCOP, which they fail dismally to give the substantive issues about the transparency that they are talking about.

We have got a responsibility as the NCOP to deal with issues of governance. We've got responsibility to deal with issues of, or experience issues that affects our people, their interest and aspirations and central to what we represent in our politics, in our society is to make sure that direct democracy is implemented and is secured and it's our duty as African National Congress. And any processes that seeks to involve our people it is us as collective that will secure that process, because we are a people's Parliament, we are an activist legislature and we want to say as the African National Congress we support this Bill.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Thank you.

Declarations of vote made on behalf of the Democratic Alliance and African National Congress.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

01 DECEMBER 2015

PAGE: 60

Division demanded.

The Council divided:

AYES - 29: De Beer, CJ; Dikgale, M C; Dlamini, L C; Gaehler, L B; Khawula, M; Makue, E R; Manopole, G M; Mateme, H E; Mhlanga, M T; Mlambo, E M; Modise, T R; Mohai, S J; Mohapi, M J; Motara, T; Mthimunye, S G; Mthetwa, J M; Nthebe, B G; Ncitha, Z V; Nzimande, L P M; Parkies, J P; Rayi, M; Samka, P C; Singh, A S; Stock, D; Thobejane, S G; Tlake, M F; Wana, T; Ximbi, D L; Zwane L L.

NOES - 9: Engelbrecht, B; Essack, F; Faber, W F; Hattingh, C; Julius, J W W; Labuschagne, C; Mpambo-Sibhukwana, T G; Terblanche, J; Van Lingen, E C.

ABSTAIN - 2: Mokoena, L G; Mtileni, V E.

Vote agreed to.

Ms C LABUSCHAGNE: Are we allowed to walk in and out while we're voting? The doors are supposed to be blocked.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

01 DECEMBER 2015

PAGE: 61

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): We are not allowed when we are voting. That is why when we are voting we recorded the abstention very correctly. I was very clear that the abstention is 1. But when we are voting the doors must be locked. Make no mistake, when we are voting let's please assist and lock the doors. We now come to vote 3. I put vote 3. Communications.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): We now come to, I put now vote 3. Communications.

Vote No 3 - Communications - put.

Ms E C VAN LINGEN: The DA objects.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): It's only an objection?

Ms E C VAN LINGEN: Yes.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Okay. Any other objection? I note the objection. I therefore declare Vote 3 as agreed to.

Vote agreed to (Democratic Alliance dissenting).

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

01 DECEMBER 2015

PAGE: 62

Abstain: United Democratic Movement and Economic Freedom Fighters.

Vote No 4 - Co-Operative Governance and Traditional Affairs - put.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): I now put vote 4. Yes, we now come to Vote 4, Co-Operative Governance and Traditional Affairs. Hon Julius. Let me see ... [Inaudible.].

Ms C LABUSCHAGNE: No, is it a division? I don't think it's a division.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): No let me see it, I don't want to assume. Okay. Let me give the opportunity to the Democratic Alliance to do their declaration. Hon Julius?

*Declaration(s) of vote:*

Mr J W W JULIUS: Thank you Chairperson. It should be no surprise that the DA is objecting to the Cogta Budget Vote. Money that should be spent on the delivery of basic services is instead channelled to funding the gravy train of the ANC fat cats. When municipal infrastructure grant funding in excess of R750 million is put in the hands of unqualified and improperly appointed companies such as the ANC aligned Siyenza Group, who then have to be dismissed when the

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**01 DECEMBER 2015**

**PAGE: 63**

noncompliance is exposed or when equitable share funding which has as its primary function providing basic services to indigent class consumers, is instead utilised to buy luxury vehicles and cattle for traditional leaders in Mpumalanga. You can be assured that the ANC is buying votes and lining its own pockets.

Similarly, when provinces, like Limpopo, receive 45% more of the division of revenue adjustments than the Western Cape, a significantly larger province, it is clear that the ANC favours its own and undermines those governments where it is not in charge. But these are just the tip of the iceberg.

Deputy Minister Nel in reply to a question in this House admitted that 20% of all municipal expenditure could not be properly accounted for. That amounts to R30 billion per annum and let's not forget about the R25 billion irregular expenditure. The R2,5 billion fruitless and wasteful expenditures and the R2,3 billion in unauthorised expenditure at National and Provincial departments.

The problem, as verified by the Auditor-General, lies in both the ANC's cadre deployment policy whereby unqualified, incompetent and blatantly self serving officials are appointed to loot municipalities and the lack of accountability and consequences when

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**01 DECEMBER 2015**

**PAGE: 64**

their misconduct is invariably uncovered. And all of this on Minister Gordhan's watch and this is why the DA is objecting to the Vote. Thank you, Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Any other party to do declaration? Hon Mohapi?

Mr M J MOHAPI: Chairperson, thank you very much for the opportunity. I think as the ANC we support the 2015 Bill for the simple reason that it represents a historic milestone of 21 years of freedom and democracy. Considering what we have inherited in 1994, the progress that this ANC government has made since then is truly remarkable. Even the blind can see.

Here the question of how to address the remaining challenges it's a critical one not merely for the marginalised but also for our shared future as a nation. Chairperson, to date we can confirm as the ANC government people who are without water can today access water. People who were without houses can today access houses. People who were without electricity can today access electricity.

This has never happened in the history globally where most of our residents are merely accessing basic services and more worst

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**01 DECEMBER 2015**

**PAGE: 65**

indigent communities are accessing free basic services simply because the ANC government has ensured that we introduce the policies that would ensure that we cater for the less fortunate.

The ANC is the only Party that would ensure that we restore the dignity of our communities. The ANC is the only Party that would ensure that even the hon member Julius would access the freedom of speech to date. And I want to say it as the ANC we fully support this Bill for the simple reason that back to basic is there to ensure that we monitor elements of corruption. We monitor and address challenges at the basic levels of the municipalities and ensure that the sustainability in our own respective municipalities. Watch the 2016 the ANC is still going to emerge victoriously. Thank you very much, Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Thank you. We shall now proceed to the voting. Let the doors be locked. Can I be assisted by the two, three tellers?

Declarations of vote made on behalf of the Democratic Alliance and African National Congress

Division demanded.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

01 DECEMBER 2015

PAGE: 66

The Council divided:

AYES - 30: De Beer, C J; Dikgale, M C; Dlamini, L C; Gaehler, L B; Khawula, M; Makue, E R; Manopole, G M; Mateme, H E; Mhlanga, M T; Mlambo, E M; Modise, T R; Mohai, S J; Mohapi, M J; Motara, T; Mthimunye, S G; Mthetwa, J M; Nthebe, B G; Ncitha, Z V; Nzimande, L P M; Parkies, J P; Rayi, M; Samka, P C; Singh, A S; Stock, D; Thobejane, S G; Tlake, M F; Wana, T; Ximbi, D L; Zwane L L.

NOES - 9: Engelbrecht, B; Essack, F; Faber, W F; Hattingh, C; Julius, J W W; Labuschagne, C; Mpambo-Sibhukwana, T G; Terblanche, J; Van Lingen, E C.

ABSTAIN - 1: Mokoena, L G.

Vote agreed to.

Vote No 5 - Home Affairs - put.

Mr C HATTINGH: Hon Chair, the DA will object to the motion, do a declaration and at the end, when the time comes, we will ask for a division.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

01 DECEMBER 2015

PAGE: 67

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Are you calling for a division?

Mr C HATTINGH: Yes, when the time comes. First, we object, and we will make a declaration.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): You are putting your objection. Is there any other party that is doing the objection?

Mr C HATTINGH: I've got some support.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Let me see the support. You have it. You can take a seat. Can you go on and do the declaration?

*Declarations of vote:*

Mr C HATTINGH: Thank you Chair. Your hand up for a point of order if you want to. I must say that listening to the previous speaker, I think that's about as credible as the Tlokwe by-elections.

Hon Speaker we must recognise that the Department of Home Affairs has made some very positive progress over the last months and years. In particular, the rollout of smart IDs and the delivery of passports are on track, and must be commended. Likewise, the rollout

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**01 DECEMBER 2015**

**PAGE: 68**

of 70 additional offices to facilitate the issuing of smart ID cards and passports is commendable.

But, there are massive policy weaknesses in this department that contribute to making the lives of our citizens very miserable - or should I say, in the case of this department, horrible. Immigration regulations, for example, continue to cause havoc in the tourism industry. Although the Deputy President has announced some positive amendments, we still await the changes to the regulatory framework to correct these problems. It is very unfortunate that our government and, particularly, the Minister of Home Affairs - may I say, stubborn Minister of Home Affairs - did not listen when we stood here and warned him of the consequences of the absurd immigration regulations.

There has been very little change in the manner in which finances are allocated in this department. Both the Minister and the director-general are very well aware of the faults and failings of the department and the massive shortages of both human and financial resources in the immigration department. Yet, they still make no attempt to increase its allocation, and if they do, the increases are insignificant to bring about meaningful change.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

01 DECEMBER 2015

PAGE: 69

Failings of the department, i.e. being offline for hours during office hours and sometimes, in some places, even for days, are being blamed on the failures of the SITA. The reality is that the department should take responsibility, should take ownership of its problems. No public institution, bank or insurance company, etcetera would still have been in business if they had the attitude of the Department of Home Affairs. They would have been bankrupt.

An HON MEMBER: Your time has expired.

Mr C HATTINGH: It's not for you to say that. So hon Chair, unresolved issues continue to beleaguer the department, year in and year out. It is for this reason that Home Affairs has adopted the nickname, among the public, of the Department of Horror Affairs. The DA cannot support Vote 5. Thank you, Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Any other political party to do the declaration?

Mr C HATTINGH: I so move.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon Dlamini? Hon Motara?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

01 DECEMBER 2015

PAGE: 70

Ms T MOTARA: Point of order Chair. It was a ruling in the House that there is no Department of Horror Affairs in South Africa. Can the member please withdraw that?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Can you please withdraw your referring to the Department of Home Affairs as "Horror Affairs"?

Mr C HATTINGH: Hon Chair, I referred not to the department as "Horror Affairs". I said that is why the public is calling this department the "Department of Horror Affairs". It's not me.

An HON MEMBER: Yes, it's the public.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Can you withdraw referring to the Department of Home Affairs as "Horror Affairs".

Mr C HATTINGH: Hon Chair, I withdraw that the public calls ...  
[intervenes].

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon member, I'm not ...  
[Interjections.]

Mr C HATTINGH: I withdraw ...

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

01 DECEMBER 2015

PAGE: 71

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Order, members! Order, members! Order!

Mr C HATTINGH: I withdraw ... [intervenes].

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Thank you for acceding to the request.

Mr C HATTINGH: I withdraw the words "that the public refers to the ... [intervenes].

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): I don't need an explanation.

Mr C HATTINGH: But that's what you requested me to do.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): You've withdrawn. That is good. Now, take your seat.

Mr C HATTINGH: I want to say what I withdraw. I withdraw that the public refers to the department as the "Department of Horror Affairs".

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Thank you.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

01 DECEMBER 2015

PAGE: 72

Mr C HATTINGH: It's not me that's saying it. Thank you.

Ms C LABUSCHAGNE: Chair, on a point of order ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Members. Order, members!

Ms C LABUSCHAGNE: Chair, on a point of order: According to the Rules, there are three ... [intervenes].

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Labuschagne.

Ms C LABUSCHAGNE: Chair, on a point of order.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): I haven't yet recognised you. I am still calling for order in the House so that you cannot be drowned out. I want to hear you. You are now recognised, hon Labuschagne.

Ms C LABUSCHAGNE: Thank you, Chair. On a point of order: There is a Rule that says there is freedom of speech in this House. What is the basis that this member has to withdraw that the public is saying a department, he is referring to a department? He is not referring to

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

01 DECEMBER 2015

PAGE: 73

a judge and he's not referring to any specific member in this House. So, what is the point of order that he has to withdraw.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Can you take your seat.

Ms C LABUSCHAGNE: Thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Thank you. Take your seat.

Hon members, hon Labuschagne, you have made a point of order. I have made a ruling. If ever you are not satisfied with a ruling, you know the procedure not unless you want to subject the sitting to challenging my ruling. I have made a ruling. You know the procedure and what is to be done. Hon Dlamini, make your declaration.

Ms L C DLAMINI: Thank you very much, hon Chair. The DA must not lie on behalf of the public because they are lying on behalf of the public. Hon Chair, the African National Congress support the Bill ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Dlamini, hon Julius the point of Order.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

01 DECEMBER 2015

PAGE: 74

Mr J W W JULIUS: Can the member please withdraw the "lying" part - that other members of this House are lying? It's unparliamentary. Can you rule on that and I suggest that she withdraws it unconditionally? Thank you Chair. Or the bouncers must take her. Thank you, Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Dlamini, hon Dlamini. No. Allow me to make a ruling. You have made a point of order. Did you refer to an hon member or did you refer to the DA? [Interjections.]

Ms L C DLAMINI: Honourable Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Julius, you can't be calling a point of order and be shouting. Hon Dlamini, if you have referred to an hon member as "lying", withdraw that.

Ms L C DLAMINI: Hon Chair, I said "the DA". That's what I said.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Can you take your seat? Let me deal with her. Let me deal with her. I don't want to be assisted about what she did and didn't say but the point of order from the hon Julius was very clear. If you said an hon member was lying, you are supposed to withdraw that. But because now we are changing it

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

01 DECEMBER 2015

PAGE: 75

now - you are saying that you referred to the DA - I am going to ascertain that by going through the Hansard. So, allow me to come back and make a ruling on this. Hon Julius ... [intervenes].

Mr J W W JULIUS: Would you please allow me, Chairperson?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Yes.

Mr J W W JULIUS: I think it is very unfair. There are no DA dogs in this House. We are members. We are members, and you know what she meant. You heard it clearly. The previous point of order you didn't ask for clarity ... [intervenes].

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Let me ... [intervenes].

Mr J W W JULIUS: I think it is biased on your part, Chairperson. Why didn't you ask for clarity? Why didn't you ask for clarity in the first place?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Let me clarify it for you, so that you understand why I asked. Order, members! Hon Julius, I asked because even the clarification I got from the Table was that she

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

01 DECEMBER 2015

PAGE: 76

said DA. That is what they heard. That is why I wanted her to confirm.

Mr J W W JULIUS: In the House.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Dlamini, can you continue with your declaration?

Ms L C DLAMINI: Hon Chair, the African ... [intervenes].

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Sorry hon Dlamini. Hon Labuschagne?

Ms C LABUSCHAGNE: Hon Chair, I raised on the previous point of order and you said after you ruled there is a procedure to refer. Then the hon Dlamini stood up. She also argued on a point of order and then you said you would listen to the Hansard. So, you are inconsistent.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): No.

Ms C LABUSCHAGNE: And that is not prescribed in a Rule.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): No. Let me ... [intervenes].

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**01 DECEMBER 2015**

**PAGE: 77**

Ms C LABUSCHAGNE: Chair, I want to refer you to Rule 46 - unbecoming language referring to a party in this House in an unbecoming way. We referred to a department and you said that is the Rule. You are absolutely inconsistent and you don't know your Rules.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): No.

Ms C LABUSCHAGNE: No, hon Chair, this is the Rules, and you have to rule according to the Rules in this House. This is now for the past three months the application of the Rules in this House, it is becoming more and more not being applied in this House. Especially when the ANC makes a point of order. We can't, this is at the end of the year. We can't end this year in this way. You made two rules ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Can you take your seat? You have made your point. Can you take your seat?

Ms C LABUSCHAGNE: I will take my seat if you can rule according to the Rules, Chair. Otherwise we will, there's also a procedure to follow if you are not ruling in the way you should rule.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Yes. Hon Labuschagne, when the hon Julius raised the point of order in relation to what was

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

01 DECEMBER 2015

PAGE: 78

raised by the hon Dlamini, before I could even make a ruling, the Table staff assisted me on what the hon Dlamini said. I can't ignore the advice that I got. That is why I wanted to verify it, because it was contrary to what was said by the hon Julius. Not that I don't know my Rules and refrain from making such utterances, hon Labuschagne. Let's allow ... [intervenes].

I have made my ruling about this issue. Now, let's allow hon Dlamini to do her declaration. Let me repeat it. I will be very slow. I know my Rules. I said I am going to go through the Hansard and verify whether what was raised as a point of order by hon Julius it's what the hon Dlamini is denying, so that I am able to make a proper ruling. That was my ruling. Hon Dlamini do the declaration. Sorry, hon Dlamini. Hon Khawula?

Mr M KHAWULA: Chairperson, I think the hon Chairperson is subjecting the House to turmoil. There have been rulings on this very terminology in this House before. Now, if the Chair cannot be consistent and rule out that "lying" is a terminology that is unbecoming then you are subjecting the House to turmoil, Chair. It has happened before. "Lying", as a terminology, has been ruled as out of order in this House.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

01 DECEMBER 2015

PAGE: 79

AN HONOURABLE MEMBER: But that is not the point that is ...  
[intervenes].

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Honourable, no take your seat. Hon Khawula, you are correct. If a member would refer to another member as "lying", that is correct. But that's not the issue here. That is why, let's respect the ruling and we are going to have a proper one. Hon Dlamini, do the declaration. Sorry, hon Dlamini. Sorry let me not ignore the hon Mokoena. Hon Mokoena? Let's hope ...  
[intervenes].

Mr L G MOKOENA: Chair, on the issue of consistency and inconsistency here, on the basis of what Rule can a member not refer to the Department of Home Affairs as "the Department of Horror Affairs"? On what Rule? I just need to be clear because we seem to send out Rules here that, can you clarify it for us? On what Rule that is based?  
Thanks very much.

An HON MEMBER: You are out of order, wena.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): No. No, it's not a point of order, but it is a valid question. But let me address the question that is being asked by the hon Mokoena. Hon Mokoena, just because we

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

01 DECEMBER 2015

PAGE: 80

have now made a ruling, of course towards the end of January, all members are going to get an opportunity to be subjected to vigorous training in terms of Rules, as induction will assist us and get to the details of what we are discussing now - not unless we want to review the Rules. Hon Dlamini, can you do the declaration?

*isiZulu:*

Mr L G MOKOENA: Sihlalo, kanti kwenzakalani la?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Mokoena?

Mr L G MOKOENA: I don't think I'm not sure if I heard you correctly, Chair, but you didn't answer the question. On what Rule are you ruling that the Department of Home Affairs cannot be referred to as "the Department of Horror Affairs" in this House? On what Rule? Can I get the answer to that question and then we can then deal with those orientation issues later?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): That is why I am saying that what you are raising its not a point of order. You want the Rule. If you go and read Rule 46 about unbecoming language, you will get the details of what we are dealing with. We are not reviewing Rules now.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

01 DECEMBER 2015

PAGE: 81

So allow me to allow the hon Dlamini to go on with the declaration.  
Hon Dlamini. Hon Julius?

Mr J W W JULIUS: Chairperson, in order for us to proceed in this House as honourable members, we need to be satisfied that you are not biased, and on this fact, I want to ask for a fact from you. Can you please explain the two rulings? The difference between the two rulings. The one that says DA and the one that says department? It's not referring to a person in either. Can you please explain the difference? Can, can, eish, weet jy! We even have a Table that's with you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Yes. Let me assist you. On the DA issue, there is no ruling.

An HON MEMBER: So what's the ruling?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): On the DA issue, there is no ruling.

Mr J W W JULIUS: Why can't you make a ruling? Chairperson, you can make a ruling! Based on the previous one, you can make a ruling. Why didn't you make a ruling?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

01 DECEMBER 2015

PAGE: 82

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): It's because we are going to consult Hansard.

Mr J W W JULIUS: You, you, Chairperson.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): And then ... [intervenes].

Mr J W W JULIUS: Chairperson, you were informed, by the Table that they said DA. They said DA and this was department. It doesn't matter to a member. I am not referring to a member, but if you heard, it's the DA. DA and department - that's my issue Chairperson.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): No take your seat.

Mr F ESSACK: All we ask is ... [Inaudible.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Take your seat. Can you take your seat? No, hon Essack. Hon Mpambo-Sibhukwana, take your seat. You can take your seat. No. Take your seat. Take your seat. Hon Julius, I'm making an appeal. I will always, there is no way that I am not going to recognise you. If you raise your hand, I will recognise you, and when you pose a question. I was very clear, I said I am going to satisfy myself by going through the Hansard.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

01 DECEMBER 2015

PAGE: 83

HON MEMBERS: Yes.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): From there, I will make a proper ruling. That's what I said, and I am very consistent with it, let's not subject it to a discussion. Hon Dlamini, can you do your declaration. We are done with that ruling. Hon Dlamini do your declaration.

Ms L C DLAMINI: Thank you very much, hon Chair. The African National Congress supports the Bill as ... [intervenes].

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Alright. Wait, hon Dlamini. If it's a new matter then I'll give you an opportunity but if it's on the same matter, we have exhausted it.

Mr C HATTINGH: Hon Chair, it's about consistency. I was involved. [Interjections] We are all hon members here. You asked me what I said.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon member ... [intervenes].

Mr C HATTINGH: I said ...

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

01 DECEMBER 2015

PAGE: 84

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Member.

Mr C HATTINGH: ... why can't you ask another hon member what was said? Why should you ... [intervenes].

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): I said if, no. Can you take your seat, Manopole? I said if you have got a new matter, you are going to be recognised, you know that is not a new matter. It's about your matter, because you are affected. Can you please take your seat?

Mr C HATTINGH: But Chair, you have brought the debate into this House. Now, you must allow the debate.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Can you take your seat? Hon Dlamini, make the declaration.

Ms L C DLAMINI: Hon Chair, just to serve the House ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Order, members!

Ms L C DLAMINI: Chairperson just to serve the House ...

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

01 DECEMBER 2015

PAGE: 85

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Khawula? Hon Khawula, before you speak, I want to be very consistent. If it's about the very same matter we are dealing with ... [intervenes].

Mr M KHAWULA: It's a new matter, Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): If it's a new matter, you may go on.

Mr M KHAWULA: Yes. Can the hon Chair, respectfully, then withdraw, so that we proceed smoothly, because the Chair did make a ruling? The ruling was that if the lying part refers to the DA, it is correct. If it refers to a person, it is wrong. Can you withdraw that one and then put a new one on the Table?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Withdraw what?

AN HON MEMBER: Call the bouncers!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Khawula, hon Khawula. No, hon Zwane, can you take your seat? Can you take your seat, Hon Khawula? I respectfully submit that before you even speak I asked you whether it's on the same matter or if it's a new matter. Then

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

01 DECEMBER 2015

PAGE: 86

you are taking us to the very same matter. So, you know what you are doing. Hon Dlamini, do the declaration.

Ms L C DLAMINI: Thank you very much, hon Chair, the ANC supports the Bill as a responsible organisation that caters for the lives of ...  
[Intervenes].

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Dlamini, sorry. Hon Gaehler, hon Gaehler, you'll have the opportunity if you are introducing a new matter but not the ruling.

Mr L B GAEHLER: Chairperson, I want to make a proposal.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Ja.

Mr L B GAEHLER: It is very clear that you are inconsistent and every time you're presiding there are always problems in the House. Can you recuse yourself, please?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Your proposal is not going to be entertained. Hon Gaehler, as the presiding officer, I take your utterances very seriously. Refrain from making such utterances. Continue with your declaration.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**01 DECEMBER 2015**

**PAGE: 87**

Ms L C DLAMINI: Thank you very much, hon Chair. The African National Congress supports the Bill as a responsible organisation that caters for the lives of its citizens and making sure that they are taken care of from birth until the last day of their lives. We care for the security of our people moving in and out of the country.

Most importantly, because Home Affairs is one department that has improved as a department as said by the DA earlier in terms of performance, those who oppose are the people who don't care for South African people. Whether you talk about security or women issues, coming in and out of the country, they just don't care, because they are not affected. All they care about is money. They prefer to have money, rather than supporting our people.

They only want the votes of our poor people but when it comes to protecting them, they will prefer tourism than human trafficking. That is what they are doing today. Hon Chair, as the ANC, we therefore support the Bill because we love our people. Thank you Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon members, can I request, can I request the two tellers, three tellers to assist with the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

01 DECEMBER 2015

PAGE: 88

counting. Hon Labuschagne, hon Motara and hon Mokoena. No we are counting.

Declarations of vote made on behalf of the Democratic Alliance and African National Congress.

Division demanded.

The Council divided:

AYES - 30: De Beer, CJ; Dikgale, M C; Dlamini, L C; Gaehler, L B; Khawula, M; Makue, E R; Mampuru, T K; Manopole, G M; Mateme, H E; Mhlanga, M T; Mlambo, E M; Modise, T R; Mohai, S J; Mohapi, M J; Motara, T; Mthimunye, S G; Mthetwa, J M; Nthebe, B G; Ncitha, Z V; Nzimande, L P M; Parkies, J P; Rayi, M; Samka, P C; Singh, A S; Stock, D; Thobejane, S G; Tlake, M F; Wana, T; Ximbi, D L; Zwane L L.

NOES - 9: Engelbrecht, B; Essack, F; Faber, W F; Hattingh, C; Julius, J W W; Labuschagne, C; Mpambo-Sibhukwana, T G; Terblanche, J; Van Lingen, E C.

ABSTAIN - 1: Mokoena, L G.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

01 DECEMBER 2015

PAGE: 89

Vote agreed to.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): I now put vote 6.

Ms T MOTARA: Chairperson, I'm just saying, hon Labuschagne is misleading me, it's nine. Because it can't be 10 because hon Julius went out, now I check he's in. So they have replaced each other. It can't be 10, it's 9.

Ms C LABUSCHAGNE: No but we, no, no, no, ag stop this lying business. Chair, a point of order. We rectified it.

Ms T MOTARA: You speak the economical truth here. You are misleading the Chairperson.

Ms C LABUSCHAGNE: We rectified it.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Okay.

Ms C LABUSCHAGNE: They rectified it, they've got it as nine.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Nine members voted against. I now put vote 6. Hon Faber?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

01 DECEMBER 2015

PAGE: 90

Vote No 6 - International Relations and Co-Operation - put.

Mr W F FABER: Thank you, hon Chair. The Democratic Alliance we vote, we object and we ask for a division.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Okay. Let's see the support and also a declaration. No declaration. Okay. Can, thank you. Can the three tellers assist me with the counting as there are no declarations. Hon Labuschagne, hon Motara, hon Mokoena.

Division demanded.

The Council divided:

AYES - 30: De Beer, CJ; Dikgale, M C; Dlamini, L C; Gaehler, L B; Khawula, M; Makue, E R; Mampuru, T K; Manopole, G M; Mateme, H E; Mhlanga, M T; Mlambo, E M; Modise, T R; Mohai, S J; Mohapi, M J; Motara, T; Mthimunye, S G; Mthetwa, J M; Nthebe, B G; Ncitha, Z V; Nzimande, L P M; Parkies, J P; Rayi, M; Samka, P C; Singh, A S; Stock, D; Thobejane, S G; Tlake, M F; Wana, T; Ximbi, D L; Zwane L L.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

01 DECEMBER 2015

PAGE: 91

NOES - 10: Chetty, M; Engelbrecht, B; Essack, F; Faber, W F;  
Hattingh, C; Julius, J W W; Labuschagne, C; Mpambo-Sibhukwana, T G;  
Terblanche, J; Van Lingen, E C.

ABSTAIN - 1: Mokoena, L G.

Vote agreed to.

Vote No 7 - National Treasury- put.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): I now put vote 7. National  
Treasury. Hon Essack.

Mr F ESSACK: Hon Chairperson, we object and we call for a division.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Let me see the support.

Mr F ESSACK: The declaration, yes.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): No division, it's just  
declaration.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

01 DECEMBER 2015

PAGE: 92

Mr F ESSACK: We're calling for a declaration. I apologise Sir, I looked at the wrong line. Okay nothing serious. I mean you're on top of it. I mean you are a reasonable man and you're a man of transparency after all. [Laughter.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Okay. You are just calling for declaration?

Mr F ESSACK: Yes, Sir.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): No division. Can you do the declaration? Can I, who is doing the declaration?

Mr F ESSACK: Hon Chairperson, we'd like to move that we are against this Bill and that we would not be supporting it.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): It's just an objection.

Mr F ESSACK: Hon Chairperson we are objecting. We are objecting. Yes.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Order members. Hon members, let's not drown him so that we get what he's saying. Initially you

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

01 DECEMBER 2015

PAGE: 93

said you are calling for a division and declaration and then you corrected it but now I thought you were going to just ...  
[intervenes].

Mr F ESSACK: Hon Chairperson, if everybody calms down, get their blood pressure down. I will just make it very clear to you that we, on item number 7 which is the National Treasury Bill we are objecting.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Only on objecting?

Mr F ESSACK: Yes. Now what is so complicated about this?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Okay. Let's note the objection of the Democratic Alliance. Any other party doing the objection? I therefore declare vote 7 as agreed to.

Vote agreed to (Democratic Alliance dissenting).

Vote No 8 - Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation - put.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**01 DECEMBER 2015**

**PAGE: 94**

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): I now put Vote 8. Vote 8 - Planning Monitoring and Evaluation. No. Let's note the objection of the Democratic Alliance. I therefore declare Vote 8 as agreed to.

Vote agreed to (Democratic Alliance dissenting).

Vote No 9 - Public Enterprises - put.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): We now come to Vote 9. Vote 9? There is an objection from the Democratic Alliance. I therefore declare Vote 9 as agreed to.

Vote agreed to (Democratic Alliance dissenting).

Vote No 10 - Public Service and Administration - put.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): We now come to Vote 10. Let's note the objection of the Democratic Alliance. I declare it as agreed to.

Vote agreed to (Democratic Alliance dissenting).

Vote No 11 - Public Works - put.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**01 DECEMBER 2015**

**PAGE: 95**

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): We now come to Vote 11. Let's note the objection of the Democratic Alliance. I declare Vote 11 as agreed to.

Vote agreed to (Democratic Alliance dissenting).

Vote No 12 - Statistics South Africa - put.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): We now come to Vote 12. No there is no objection. I therefore declare Vote 12 as agreed to. There's no objection.

Vote agreed to.

Vote No 13 - Women - put and agreed to.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): We now come to Vote 13. We are now on Vote 13 - Women.

Ms C LABUSCHAGNE: The DA objects.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Let's note the objection of the Democratic Alliance. I therefore declare Vote 13 as agreed to.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

01 DECEMBER 2015

PAGE: 96

Vote agreed to (Democratic Alliance dissenting).

Vote No 14 - Basic Education - put.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): We now come to Vote 14.

Mr C HATTINGH: Hon Chair, the DA objects. We would like to make a declaration and we would like to ask for a division when the time comes. If the peanut gallery can just quiet, please. Thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Let me see the support. Okay. Hon Stock.

Mr D STOCK: Thank you very much, hon House Chair. I'm rising on a point of order. The member just said to us that, he referred to these members of the House as the peanut gallery. Can the hon member withdraw that statement? The peanut gallery.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): No, I missed that. Did you say that?

Mr C HATTINGH: Hon Chair, ...

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

01 DECEMBER 2015

PAGE: 97

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): No I'm posing a question?

Mr C HATTINGH: Okay. But this is my question to you. Why are you not consistent in asking the questions, because you don't trust...? I referred to some noises and I don't know whether it was up there or down here. I referred to the peanut gallery not to members.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): No let, Order members! Hon members let me... take a seat. Hon members I don't want to be part of your discussions and you'll make my presiding to be very difficult and let's refrain from anything that will create problems. Let's have the declaration.

Mr C HATTINGH: Thank you, no it's on. Hon ... [intervenes].

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Come again?

Mr F ESSACK: The Chairperson is in the House.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): She has been throughout in the House. Since we started the Chairperson was in the House. I'm surprised you are seeing her now. No she was in the house, throughout.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

01 DECEMBER 2015

PAGE: 98

Mr F ESSACK: Please carry on with your business of the day.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Essack. Continue hon member. Do the declaration.

*Declarations of vote:*

Mr C HATTINGH: Hon Chair, yes I really appreciate that the hon member recognises military veterans like myself and hon Modise. Hon Chair, here is another horror story. HORROR, horror. It's a great pity that this Department of Basic Education has failed to spend its budget in key programmes resulting in the cutting of the overall Basic Education Budget.

According to the department the adjusted budget, the department under spent by R224 million over the last six months. That's a quarter of a billion under spent and this resulted in massive cuts to key education programmes. For example, R12,3 million has been cut from the HIV/AIDS Education Grant. R18,3 million has been cut from the National School Nutrition Programme. R30,2 million has been cut from the Maths, Science and Technology Grant. R163,1 million has been cut from the Education Infrastructure Grant.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**01 DECEMBER 2015**

**PAGE: 99**

It appears that proper management and clean administration, efficiency and the will to deliver on the department's mandate is evading and increasingly so this department. Our view is supported by the AG, Auditor-General for those who perhaps do not know. In his latest consolidated report tabled in Parliament last week he said: The Department did not take reasonable steps to prevent irregular and fruitless and wasteful expenditure. In addition, the Department did not take reasonable steps to prevent unauthorised expenditure.

This finding was also reported in the previous year. The following areas are still of serious concern. Reduction of the HIV/AIDS Education budget when so many young people remain at risk of infection. The reduction of School Nutrition Programme when poverty and malnutrition affects so many people. Specifically, in the rural areas.

The cutting of Maths and Science Grants when South Africa is spiralling downward in our rank in the world for Maths and Science Education. The underspending and reduction on the budget for school infrastructure when children still learn under trees and in mud buildings. The lack of motivation and political will to curb under spending on education when so many schools are underperforming. The DA will not be supporting Vote 14. I so move.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**01 DECEMBER 2015**

**PAGE: 100**

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Thank you, hon Hattingh. Any other political party? Hon Zwane?

Ms L L ZWANE: Thank you Chairperson. Ever since 1994, the delivery of quality education for all South African learners has been the goal of the ANC led government. Education in quintiles 1 and 3 are almost free because those schools are categorised as schools that are no fee schools. And then the allocation of the budget in this country, a large chunk of the budget addresses issues relating to education.

The issue of ... [Inaudible.] ... that the hon member of the DA is referring to is an issue that arises out of the fact that when tenders are awarded they will always be contestations thus delaying the progress of actually implementing infrastructure in schools. But, the same programme has also ensured that in 381 schools across the country water has been received for the first time ever; in 371 schools there has been sanitation or proper sanitation provided for the first time ever; in 289 schools the schools have been connected to electricity for the first time ever. Apart from that, the Department of Basic Education has seen to it that the curriculum and assessment policy statement has been fully implemented and has been amended for the first time ever to include the following subjects

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**01 DECEMBER 2015**

**PAGE: 101**

between Grades R and 12. Civil technology, electrical technology, mechanical technology, technical mathematics and technical sciences. Something that we would not have dreamt of during the apartheid government, this for the first time ever under the ANC led government.

The provision of capacitation and the development of teachers is also something that has never been done to this extent before. We have seen 28 410 principals and deputy principals given capacitation programme in order for them to be able to run the schools in a manner that is correct in terms of management and leadership of those institutions. The Funza Lushaka Scheme, where teachers in mathematics, science and technology have been capacitated to ensure that we increase our performance and we increase the quality of performance in mathematics, science and technology.

The issue of HIV/AIDS education, teachers are not nurses, teachers are teachers. Before teachers undertake the HIV/AIDS education they have to undergo training because when they deal with this subject matter they must do the genuine stuff. So it's better for the money to be used somewhere productively than to be used to do work that is shoddy and not up to standard. [intervenes].

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

01 DECEMBER 2015

PAGE: 102

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Zwane ... [intervenes].

Ms L L ZWANE: For that reason, the ANC supports the budget.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Thank you. The declaration is for strictly three minutes. Can I have my three tellers, the three tellers assisting with the counting. We now come to the voting. Hon Labuschagne? Yes, we are dealing with the division. We have dealt with it. No I dealt with it when it was doing that part.

Ms C LABUSCHAGNE: We're now on 15. We're on 15.

Mr C HATTINGH: It's just for transparency, Chairperson.

Ms C LABUSCHAGNE: We're on 15. The DA objects and we call for a division on Vote 15.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Ja, you are. I thought you call for a division for 14. So I was requesting the tellers to do the counting and we have to have the results announced.

Ms C LABUSCHAGNE: Ten.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

01 DECEMBER 2015

PAGE: 103

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): For record purposes. Then hon Motara? 30. Hon Mokoena?

Mr L G MOKOENA: It's 1.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): 30 Members voted in favour, 10 members voted against and we have 1 abstention. The majority of members voted in favour, I therefore declare Vote 14 agreed to.

Declarations of vote made on behalf of the Democratic Alliance and African National Congress.

Division demanded.

The Council divided:

AYES - 30: De Beer, C J; Dikgale, M C; Dlamini, L C; Gaehler, L B; Khawula, M; Makue, E R; Mampuru, T K; Manopole, G M; Mateme, H E; Mhlanga, M T; Mlambo, E M; Modise, T R; Mohai, S J; Mohapi, M J; Motara, T; Mthimunye, S G; Mthetwa, J M; Nthebe, B G; Ncitha, Z V; Nzimande, L P M; Parkies, J P; Rayi, M; Samka, P C; Singh, A S; Stock, D; Thobejane, S G; Tlake, M F; Wana, T; Ximbi, D L; Zwane L L.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

01 DECEMBER 2015

PAGE: 104

NOES - 10: Chetty, M; Engelbrecht, B; Essack, F; Faber, W F;  
Hattingh, C; Julius, J W W; Labuschagne, C; Mpambo-Sibhukwana, T G;  
Terblanche, J; Van Lingen, E C.

ABSTAIN - 1: Mokoena, L G.

Vote No 15 - Higher Education and Training - put.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): We now officially come to  
Vote 15 - Higher Education and Training. Hon Hattingh?

Mr C HATTINGH: We object. We wish to make a declaration and we will  
call for a division.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Okay.

Mr C HATTINGH: I think I've got some support there. There is another  
member there.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): No let me see the support of  
the division. We noted the objection. Hon Hattingh, are you the one  
doing the declaration?

01 DECEMBER 2015

PAGE: 105

*Declaration (s) of Vote:*

Mr C HATTINGH: Thank you Chair. I don't, I'm not going to ...  
[intervenes].

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Members.

Mr C HATTINGH: I'm not going to refer to ... [intervenes].

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Let's not drown him.

Mr C HATTINGH: ... the peanut gallery again in this House, I won't do that. Hon Chair, ... [Interjections.] I think some of us were oblivious of what happened outside Parliament all over the country in the past weeks. This is when we talk about higher education. Certainly the Minister didn't take cognisance because it's not reflected in the budget.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mr C HATTINGH: Now, we know that there must be, there has to be some serious reprioritisation of funding when it comes to Higher Education. We have not seen it here. Promises were made, yes, in the heat of the moment but now is the time to walk the talk. Now

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

01 DECEMBER 2015

PAGE: 106

statements by the Minister Blade Nzimande already indicated that the government has not got the capacity, political will or the budget to support political promises made during the height of the student unrest.

To suggest that the private sector should simply provide the 80 billion per annum of additional funding that the sector needs is simply ridiculous. He followed this up proclaiming to the Communist Party, yes and I believe at least in name they still exist, that the private sector has trillions which should immediately be put on the table to fund Higher Education.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mr C HATTINGH: Hon Chair, there is hard work of persuading rather than extorting the private sector to come on board. For the Minister to continue to regard business as the enemy reminiscent of his trade union days will be counterproductive. He should rather live up to the challenge and forge strong and sustainable partnerships with business. Business is not a dirty word.

He should look also inward and heed to the findings of the Auditor-General if he is serious to address the escalating crisis in higher

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**01 DECEMBER 2015**

**PAGE: 107**

education and let me quote; this is the department that we now have to provide additional funds for. The department is unable to perform all required verification and monitoring functions for its entities in higher education institutions. About a 100 of them there are.

Due to in some instances a lack of appropriate skills within the department and insufficient human resources capacity because of funding constraints. The department cannot lead, cannot fulfil its mandate in its current situation. That's why we've got a higher education crisis. Obviously lack of capacity and failures based on that comes hand in hand with the notorious cadre deployment practices of the ANC, something that this department has also become notorious for. The DA will not be supporting this Bill. Thank you.

Mr F ESSACK: Well done.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Stock?

Mr D STOCK: Thank you very much, hon House Chair. The Freedom Charter stipulates that the doors of learning and culture shall be open to all. The ANC led government is committed towards ensuring that the education shall be free and Higher Education and technical training shall be open to all.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**01 DECEMBER 2015**

**PAGE: 108**

By means of state allowances, bursaries and scholarships awarded on the basis of merit. The ANC led government has made progress since 1994 in regard to education. So, since 2009 some of the progress that were made by the Higher Education Department it's actually enormous. I've actually calculated and made just a synopsis of some of the progress that were made since 2009 and those progress that were made is in relation to the student head count enrolments in universities which actually increased by 12%. The first time enrolments at universities which increased by 9%. The graduates from university which increased by 11%. The research master's graduates programme which has actually increased by 26%.

Then NSFAS student bursary funding at FET colleges which has actually increased from 318 million in 2010 to 1,9 billion in 2013, which is actually meant to target about 222 817 students. The education remains an apex priority for the ANC led government. So we do not agree to this populace tendency of actually reducing the apex priority government of education to mere cheap politicking grandstanding and populism.

As the ANC led government we support this Bill of Higher Education, because it is an important thing to do and it will also improve and

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

01 DECEMBER 2015

PAGE: 109

deal with the challenges that confronts the education sector throughout the country. We support this budget vote. I thank you.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Thank you. We shall now proceed to the voting. Let the tellers assist. Hon Motara, hon Labuschagne, hon Mokoena.

Declarations of vote made on behalf of the Democratic Alliance and African National Congress.

AYES - 30: De Beer, C J; Dikgale, M C; Dlamini, L C; Gaehler, L B; Khawula, M; Makue, E R; Mampuru, T K; Manopole, G M; Mateme, H E; Mhlanga, M T; Mlambo, E M; Modise, T R; Mohai, S J; Mohapi, M J; Motara, T; Mthimunye, S G; Mthetwa, J M; Nthebe, B G; Ncitha, Z V; Nzimande, L P M; Parkies, J P; Rayi, M; Samka, P C; Singh, A S; Stock, D; Thobejane, S G; Tlake, M F; Wana, T; Ximbi, D L; Zwane L L.

NOES - 10: Chetty, M; Engelbrecht, B; Essack, F; Faber, W F; Hattingh, C; Julius, J W W; Labuschagne, C; Mpambo-Sibhukwana, T G; Terblanche, J; Van Lingen, E C

ABSTAIN - 1: Mokoena, L G.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

01 DECEMBER 2015

PAGE: 110

Vote agreed to.

Vote No 16 - Health - put.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: I now put Vote 16 - Health. Hon Labuschagne. No, hon Van Lingen.

Ms E C VAN LINGEN: We object, hon Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): I note the objection. I therefore declare Vote 16 as agreed to.

Vote agreed to (Democratic Alliance dissenting).

Vote No 17 - Social Development - put.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): We now come to Vote 17 - Social Development. Hon Mpambo-Sibhukwana.

Ms T G MPAMBO-SIBHUKWANA: We object with a declaration. We support and with a declaration.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

01 DECEMBER 2015

PAGE: 111

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Support and do a declaration? Okay. Order members!

Ms T G MPAMBO-SIBHUKWANA: The acting presiding officers should be shut down. Please I need your protection. Chairperson, do your job.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): I'm, no you are not recognised. You are not recognised. Hon Mpambo-Sibhukwana, I'm doing exactly that. I'm calling them into order. So that they must not drown you.

Ms T G MPAMBO-SIBHUKWANA: Yes, thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): We are supporting, just doing declaration. Okay. Hon Mpambo-Sibhukwana, order members! Let's have the declaration. Can you go on with the declaration?

*Declaration (s) of vote:*

Ms T G MPAMBO-SIBHUKWANA: Hon Chairperson ... [intervenes].

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): No it's supporting but doing a declaration.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**01 DECEMBER 2015**

**PAGE: 112**

Ms T G MPAMBO-SIBHUKWANA: We as the Democratic Alliance are in agreement with the adjustment budget for social development. As we believe that such changes would accommodate the vulnerable members of our society as well as alleviate economic pressures in various communities which would enable efficient functioning.

It is a cause for concern that at present the country faces the issue of shortage of social workers. Given our country's socioeconomic situation the government should be sensitive to the communities and need for the employment of more social workers. Currently, as we speak, we are looking at a figure of 2 500 unemployed social workers. They are South Africans who possess the necessary skills and qualifications to respond to these vulnerable people, yet, we are still with a deficit which could influence an increase in crime and fails to respond to the societal health of the communities.

The heightened levels of vulnerability in our society can only be effectively combated by deploying more social workers, both in government and the NGOs. The budget is consistently being increased within the dysfunctional of the South African Social Service Agency. Additionally, some 5 million was requested for ministerial travel,

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

01 DECEMBER 2015

PAGE: 113

that is a concern, when the department used 12.8 million on overseas travel and 98 million on local travel last year alone.

The DA says more money should be spent in funding the rural ECD programmes rather, in order to do justice to South Africans who are so much deserving, the government needs to realign and breathe life into its mandate of ensuring protection for vulnerable South Africans and to provide a comprehensive integrated and sustainable social development service.

*isiXhosa:*

I-DA iyawuxhasa, Sihalo loMthetho. Maz'enethole!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Thank you. Any other political party? Hon Mampuru?

*Sepedi:*

Ms T K MAMPURU: Ke a go leboga modulastulo. A ke bontšhe gore masogana ga a rwešane dihloro. Re na le responsibility bjale ka African National Congress yeo e eteletšego pele. Badudi ba South Africa gore re hloka 62% e ba re fileng yone re le ANC gore re tšwele pele re ba hlokomela. Ga ke tlo go bala ka šia modulastilo ka lebaka la gore mohlala o mo kaonekaone o bonwago le ke sefofu sa

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

01 DECEMBER 2015

PAGE: 114

Jeriko ke gore ga go na motho a lego maswanedi mo South Africa, ya qualifayang gore a hwetše grant, a ka e hlokago. Gone jwale bagologolo ba re tšhiwana ya fepega, ga ba sa re tšhiwana ga e sa fepega. Akere bjale ge ke hlokofaletšwe ke motswadi wa ka nna ke tlo hwetša masheleng ale a gore ke kgone go tšwela pele ke phela. Le skolong ke kgona go ya ka baka la mmušo. Kgoro ye ya re thuša, ya re fepa, e re hlokometše. Re bolela ka morithi wa korobidi. Yo a gananago le budget ye ga re tsebe gore na o dua kae ka gore mo South Africa gona Social Development ra bona gore ya re berekela.

Re e thekga re holofetše, re tiišitše. Kwa ga gesho kua Limpopo [ga a kwagale botse] ka lebaka la gore bana ba ba rena ba ba ineetšego mabaka le tše dingwe ditagi, rehabilitation centre e gona, is under way, ba thušana gammogo le Department of Health. Ga go se sengwe se re ka se bolelago. Sa rona re le ANC ke gore re a qoba, re ya pele, morago ga re ye. Matla re a filwe ke bakgethi ba mo South Africa. Ke a go leboga modulastilo.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Thank you. I therefore declare vote 17 as agreed to.

Declarations of vote made on behalf of the Democratic Alliance and African National Congress.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

01 DECEMBER 2015

PAGE: 115

Vote agreed to.

Vote No 18 - Correctional Services - put.

Vote agreed to.

Vote No 19 - Defence and Military Veterans - put.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): We now come to vote 19.

Ms C LABUSCHAGNE: DA objects.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): We note the objection of the Democratic Alliance.

Vote agreed to (Democratic Alliance dissenting).

Vote No 20 - Independent Police Investigative Directorate - put.

Vote agreed to.

Vote No 21 - Justice and Constitutional Development - put.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

01 DECEMBER 2015

PAGE: 116

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): We now come to vote, I now put vote 21. We note the objection of the Democratic Alliance.

Vote agreed to (Democratic Alliance dissenting).

Vote No 22 - Office of the Chief Justice and Judicial Administration  
- put

Mr L G MOKOENA: We would like to make a small declaration.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): On Vote 22.

Mr L G MOKOENA: Yes.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Vote 22. Okay. No, it's very clear, he's just saying he's going to make a declaration. Let's allow hon Mokoena to do the declaration.

*Declaration (s) of Vote:*

Mr L G MOKOENA: Chair, the EFF would like to support this Bill for the budget adjustment of the Chief Justice Office. We feel that the judiciary is the only organ of state which upholds the rule of law and democracy which we feel are the two pillars which, if they were

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

01 DECEMBER 2015

PAGE: 117

in the hands of government and Parliament which are ANC dominated, this country will be a failed state. We support this Bill. Thank you very much.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Thank you. Any other party to do the declaration? No.

Declaration of vote made on behalf of the Economic Freedom Fighters.

Vote agreed to.

Vote No 23 - Police - put.

Mr O S TERBLANCHE: Chairperson, thank you. Hon Chairperson we want to object. We ask for a division and we want to make a declaration. Thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Let me see the numbers for the division. Okay. Thank you. Yes, you can take your seat. Hon Terblanche, you can go on with the declaration.

*Declaration (s) of vote:*

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**01 DECEMBER 2015**

**PAGE: 118**

Mr O S TERBLANCHE: Thank you, hon Chairperson. Hon members, as indicated the DA does not support the adjustment for Vote 23 because it does not reflect the budgetary priorities needed to make a turnaround in the SAPS. The suggested adjustments do not empower the SAPS to become more effective in crime fighting and crime prevention.

The main reason for this statement is the fact that visible policing benefiting the community loses more the 410 million while the protection and security services, the executives, private VIP police is gaining almost R100 million. Again the people of South Africa are paying in certain instances with even their lives for benefit of well connected politicians.

This budget is unfair and self serving on the side of high placed politicians and not to the benefit of ordinary South Africans. The Minister of Police needs to address the low level of service delivery from the police in its entirety on a comprehensive and systemic level.

South Africans will not be safe while police stations are understaffed, under resourced, under equipped and even worse under

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

01 DECEMBER 2015

PAGE: 119

trained. Police management needs to get their priorities right. I repeat the DA cannot support this budget. Thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Thank you. Any other political party to do the declaration. Hon Ximbi?

*isiXhosa:*

Mr D L XIMBI: Ndiyabulela, Sihlalo. Thina singuKhongolose we-ANC siyayixhasa le budget. Ngaphandle kwamapolisa eli lizwe alikho ntweni. Siyayazi ke into yokuba i-DA isoloko icinga into yokuba ukuze kuthethwe ngamapolisa kufuneka sicinge ngalaa mapolisa akudala. Amapolisa esinawo Sihlalo, sibusy sizama ukuwatransforma and abeprofessional. So le budget Sihlalo siyayisupporta singu-ANC. I-DA ke mayincame iye kwelo lizwe lingenamapolisa. Enkosi Sihlalo.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Thank you. We now come to voting. Let the tellers assist. Hon Mokoena?

Mr L G MOKOENA: Still 1.

Declarations of vote made on behalf of the Democratic Alliance and African National Congress.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

01 DECEMBER 2015

PAGE: 120

Division demanded.

The Council divided.

AYES - 28: De Beer, C J; Dikgale, M C; Dlamini, L C; Gaehler, L B; Khawula, M; Makue, E R; Mampuru, T K; Manopole, G M; Mhlanga, M T; Mlambo, E M; Modise, T R; Mohai, S J; Mohapi, M J; Motara, T; Mthimunye, S G; Mthetwa, J M; Nthebe, B G; Ncitha, Z V; Nzimande, L P M; Parkies, J P; Samka, P C; Singh, A S; Stock, D; Thobejane, S G; Tlake, M F; Wana, T; Ximbi, D L; Zwane L L.

NOES - 10: Chetty, M; Engelbrecht, B; Essack, F; Faber, W F; Hattingh, C; Julius, J W W; Labuschagne, C; Mpambo-Sibhukwana, T G; Terblanche, J; Van Lingen, E C.

ABSTAIN - 1: Mokoena, L G.

Vote agreed to.

Vote No 24 - Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries - put.

Ms E C VAN LINGEN: Hon Chairperson, we object.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**01 DECEMBER 2015**

**PAGE: 121**

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Let's note the objection of the Democratic Alliance.

Vote agreed to (Democratic Alliance dissenting).

Vote No 25 - Economic Development - put.

Ms E C VAN LINGEN: Chairperson, we object to it.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Note the objection of the Democratic Alliance.

Vote agreed to (Democratic Alliance dissenting).

Vote No 26 - Energy - put.

Ms E C VAN LINGEN: Chairperson, we object to it.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Note the objection of the Democratic Alliance.

Vote agreed to (Democratic Alliance dissenting).

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

01 DECEMBER 2015

PAGE: 122

Vote No 27 - Environmental Affairs - put.

Vote agreed to.

Vote No 28 - Labour - put.

Ms E C VAN LINGEN: Chairperson, we object to it.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Note the objection of the Democratic Alliance.

Vote agreed to (Democratic Alliance dissenting).

Vote No 29 - Mineral Resources - put.

Ms E C VAN LINGEN: We object to it, hon Chairperson.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Note the objection of the Democratic Alliance.

Vote agreed to (Democratic Alliance dissenting).

Vote No 30 - Science and Technology - put.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

01 DECEMBER 2015

PAGE: 123

Vote agreed to.

Vote No 31 - Small Business Development - put.

Ms E C VAN LINGEN: Chairperson, we object to it.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Note the objection of the Democratic Alliance and the IFP.

Vote agreed to (Inkatha Freedom Party and Democratic Alliance dissenting).

Vote No 32 - Telecommunications and Postal Services - put.

Ms E C VAN LINGEN: Chairperson, we object to it.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): We note the objection of the Democratic Alliance. We also note the objection of the IFP.

Vote agreed to (Inkatha Freedom Party and Democratic Alliance dissenting).

Vote No 33 - Tourism - put.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

01 DECEMBER 2015

PAGE: 124

Vote agreed to.

Vote No 34 - Trade and Industry - put.

Ms E C VAN LINGEN: Chairperson, Vote number 34 we object to. Vote number 34 we object to.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): We now note the objection of the Democratic Alliance.

Vote agreed to (Democratic Alliance dissenting).

Vote No 35 - Transport - put.

Ms E C VAN LINGEN: Chairperson, we object to it.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): We note the objection of the Democratic Alliance.

Vote agreed to (Democratic Alliance dissenting).

Vote No 36 - Water and Sanitation - put.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

01 DECEMBER 2015

PAGE: 125

Ms T G MPAMBO-SIBHUKWANA: We object, Chairperson and we call for a division. And a declaration.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Thank you. The numbers are fine. Hon Mpambo, we are now going to allow you to do the declaration.

*Declaration (s) of vote:*

Ms T G MPAMBO-SIBHUKWANA: Thank you Chairperson. Hon Chairperson, whilst we must ensure that water is a basic human right we need to restore the human dignity of our people with sanitation, by providing safe and clean water to every South African citizen as a government. On this day we mark that it's World Aids Day where South African citizens are in desperate need of water and in some rural areas there's a definite need for this.

The failure is evidenced in KZN. Where there are the following shortages in Hazelmere dam area. The government was supposed to have completed the raising of the dam by 2014 September however, construction on this project only started one year after the promised implementation date. Despite Minister Mokonyane saying water shedding shall never occur, the DA has visited Kraaipan,

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

01 DECEMBER 2015

PAGE: 126

Vaalwater, uMkhanyakude and 42 other towns where South Africans are experiencing water shedding on a daily basis.

Suffering reaches its zenith in areas such as Madibeng, where a 67-year-old woman, who lives in a township called Lethlabile, has to roll a 200-litre drum full of water from a borehole for 2 kilometres to her home where she had running water for just two years and this is happening during the 16 Days of Activism.

In my own village in Sterkspruit, Chairperson, ...

*isiXhosa:*

... ekhaya eHerschel, kwilali yaseBakanini, eSterkspruit ...

*English:*

I experienced this when I was burying my nephew, Mxolisi. People had no water for two weeks until I had to intervene for bulk water services in Senqu district. This is also happening in Kwakeba.

*isiXhosa:*

Ibuhlungu into eyenzekayo eSterkspruit ...

*English:*

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

01 DECEMBER 2015

PAGE: 127

... with the ANC government not delivering basic service, ...

*isiXhosa:*

... ngelo xesha kukho abantu abagulayo with HIV on this day.

Abantwana neemveku, ...

*English:*

I had to go to the municipal managers to get the service and I had to tell them of my oversight role and that I'm checking that this basic need is getting the water. I did not have to do that. People do not have to identify themselves to get the basic service.

The DA run City of Cape Town indicated that it's water losses stood at 6,4%, the lowest in the country. We want to deliver these basic services to more and more places across South Africa. The DA cannot stand by and let another Eskom scenario unfold.

A large scale water crisis will cause suffering and should be avoided at all costs and this is also impacting on the health of poor South Africans. This is a cause for concern ... [intervenes].

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Mpambo-Sibhukwana ... [intervenes].

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

01 DECEMBER 2015

PAGE: 128

*isiXhosa:*

Ms T G MPAMBO-SIBHUKWANA: I-DA iyayixhasa kodwa Mhlali-ngaphambili.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Mpambo-Sibhukwana, I want to confirm the *i-DA iyayixhasa*.

Ms T G MPAMBO-SIBHUKWANA: It's a negative for me, dis 'n negatiwe ontkennde vorm. Asixhasi. Negatiwe ontkennde vorm. Aridumli kayona kaseSotho. Are dumeli ho hang.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Nthebe, hon members. No, take your seat. I thought I heard you saying uyayixhasa, but if you had made a mistake there's no problem. Any other political party to make a declaration? Hon Dlamini?

Ms L C DLAMINI: Thank you very much, hon Chair. As African National Congress we do support the Bill on Water and Sanitation as a basic need. Now I must be good in selecting my word. Chairperson, I wanted to say there is no normal organisation that will not support water provision and sanitation, except during the apartheid regime, whereby in terms of water only people in towns were given access to water. People who were not in towns were not given access to water.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**01 DECEMBER 2015**

**PAGE: 129**

In terms of sanitation, in fact, our people in rural areas had to use bushes to relieve themselves. I do want to say in terms of access in water during this time of apartheid, it is estimated that about 15 million people were without clean water. About 20 million people were without adequate sanitation.

Now, during the ANC led government, we are talking about 87% of South Africans having access to clean water. There is a big improvement in terms of sanitation and we also refer to the report that was presented earlier. We, therefore, as a responsible organisation, the African National Congress, do support the Bill.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Thank you. Hon Khawula?

Mr M KHAWULA: Thank you, hon Chairperson. Hon Minister, the IFP acknowledges that the drought is a natural phenomenon. But our concern is, has been the poor response to the drought by the government. Especially at provincial level. At the beginning of the year funds were allocated to provinces like KZN for relief measures. Districts like Ugu and others ordered trucks to be delivered to them so that they can be able to supply water to the communities.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**01 DECEMBER 2015**

**PAGE: 130**

We are all shocked on our visit to Ugu in September to find out that trucks that were ordered in February had not been delivered by September. Which was very, very bad and that has to be attended to. Secondly, it's also a matter of concern that there is gross underspending in this department which is very unfair. People need water there but the department is not prepared to give water to people in accordance with the budget. That also has got to be looked into because it is a resistance of giving a service that people need. Thirdly, the water boards also have to be strictly monitored. They also grossly underspend. The reports that we have received in the select committee show that the water boards underspend grossly.

It's an underspending in an area where there should not be any underspending, because people do need water. People who are given money to supply water to the communities, are not doing that in a manner that is satisfactory. Thank you, Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Thank you. We now come to voting. Let the tellers assist.

Declarations of vote made on behalf of the Democratic Alliance, Inkatha Freedom Party and African National Congress.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

01 DECEMBER 2015

PAGE: 131

Vote agreed to (Democratic Alliance and Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Vote No 37 - Arts and Culture - put.

Vote agreed to.

Vote No 38 - Human Settlements - put.

Ms E C VAN LINGEN: We object, hon Chairperson.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): We note the objection of the Democratic Alliance.

Vote agreed to (Democratic Alliance dissenting).

Vote No 39 - Rural Development and Land Reform - put.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): We note the objection of the Democratic Alliance.

Vote agreed to (Democratic Alliance dissenting).

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

01 DECEMBER 2015

PAGE: 132

Vote No 40 - Sport and Recreation South Africa - put.

Vote agreed to.

Schedule put and agreed to.

Agreed to.

**CONSIDERATION OF ADJUSTMENTS APPROPRIATION BILL [B 28 - 2015]  
(NATIONAL ASSEMBLY -SEC 77) AND OF REPORT OF SELECT COMMITTEE ON  
APPROPRIATIONS THEREON**

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): I shall now put the question in respect to the 11<sup>th</sup> Order. The question is that the Bill be agreed to. In accordance with Rule 63, I shall first allow political parties to make their declaration of vote if they so wish. Hon Terblanche.

*Declaration (s) of vote:*

Mr O S TERBLANCHE: Thank you, hon Chairperson.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): You want to do a declaration.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

01 DECEMBER 2015

PAGE: 133

Mr O S TERBLANCHE: Come again.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): You are doing a declaration.

Mr O S TERBLANCHE: Yes, I am doing a declaration.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Okay, thank you.

Mr O S TERBLANCHE: Chairperson, thank you. The Division of Revenue Amendment Bill is more than just equitable division of revenue to national, provincial and local sphere of government. It deals with real people. It deals with their lives, it deals with their jobs, education, health but it is also affected by negatives like crime, corruption, etc.

The DORA Bill is forwarded to provinces for action, following due process but it is clear from the outset that the ANC has shown very little regard for due process, legal prescriptions, timeframes, etc.

Obviously then the question arises: Can the ANC Government really be trusted with the taxes of South Africans? [Interjections.]

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**01 DECEMBER 2015**

**PAGE: 134**

Money that came from and is coming from honest men and women, working hard day in and day out to make ends meet and to provide for their families. Take for example the process it has followed thus far during this process. The ANC stream-rolled this entire process throughout. Stream-rolling has apparently become one of the trademarks of the ANC. Concerns were raised by the DA regarding the flawed final mandates based on the dates of the liberation and conferral of authority by the provincial legislatures.

How can the Bill stand constitutional master, if it is invalid against the mandating procedures and Provinces Act? The DA submitted an alternative budget in a select committee that reprioritise its focus. In it we list how to curb the increasing unemployment rate of 26,4, invest in integrated energy, transport, ICT infrastructure for job creation, give people the education and skills that they need to get a job, provide direct incentives for job creation and create a nation of entrepreneurs by making it easier for South Africans to start and grow their own small businesses.

We are currently on the brink of a fiscal cliff and that is due to irresponsibility of the ANC around the budgeting process and obviously also expenditure. May I remind this House, that the National Development Plan set a high level of numeric targets for

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**01 DECEMBER 2015**

**PAGE: 135**

sustainable and inclusive growth which includes a fall in the unemployment rate from 25% to 14% in 2020, to 6% by 2030 and about 11 million additional jobs by 2030. I repeat, once again, the DA therefore does not support this DORA Bill. I thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Thank you. Hon Motara.

Ms T MOTARA: Thank you Chair. Chair by voting against the Bill, they are in essence voting against long term fiscal guidelines that links South Africa's growth and expenditure with the long term economic growth. They are voting against sound progressive fiscal management. They don't mention that the GDP has grown to R4 trillion from R200 billion. [Applause.]

You don't mention that more than a trillion rand has been spent in investment on infrastructure. That you don't mention, because by mentioning it, you would have to equally concede that there is something that the ANC Government is doing correctly. The DA is extremely short sighted in its approach, not to mention populist to say the least.

They have tabled a different proposed amendment for this process that stipulates diverting monies from different government

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**01 DECEMBER 2015**

**PAGE: 136**

departments to the crisis in higher education. We have a crisis in higher education amounting to more than a trillion rand but your so called budget reforms only takes R183 million to address a trillion rand challenge. It is not going to work. [Interjections.]

We have heard throughout the year that the so called threats of South Africa' credit rating falling to junk status. It hasn't happened. We have also been warned, by yourselves, that the South African economy is going to plunge into recession. It also didn't happen. I am sure that the DA's press release probably entitled: "We Told You So ANC", had to be urgently withdrawn.

The reality is that since 1994 the number of university students has doubled. The increase in financial contributions has not matched the increase in student numbers. [Interjections.]

The struggle for access to quality education is a struggle against poverty and inequality. Chairperson, let me put it on record that the process undertaken by the Select Committee on Appropriations and Finance in dealing with the Appropriations Bill was both in line with the Money Bills Amendment Act, which clearly stipulates the process that has to be followed in dealing with this Bill. If the DA

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**01 DECEMBER 2015**

**PAGE: 137**

is so convinced that the process was flawed from the onset, why do you table a different appropriation budget? [Applause.]

There was a stampede by yourselves to produce an alternate budget which we don't accept and which we will not approve. Had we approved your different process, we would have been voting on a process that you agreed to. So because you have been beaten, defeated from the first process to the last process, you now want to come and state that the process in all provincial legislatures was flawed. It was not. [Applause.]

If you were so, so, so convinced and so determined and so sure of your assertion that all nine or 8, let me say 8 provinces that had undertaken the process on the Appropriation Bill in line with the Money Bills Act that governs this process, go and test it in the Constitutional Court. Thank you Chair. [Applause.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Motara, I am afraid your time has expired.

Mr J W W JULIUS: No, hon Chairperson, I am almost covered. I just want to know whether the member was actually present.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**01 DECEMBER 2015**

**PAGE: 138**

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Okay. Hon Khawula. Order members! Let us allow hon Khawula.

Mr M KHAWULA: Thank you, hon Chairperson. Whilst the IFP supports the Bill, we do so with concerns. We wouldn't of course like to hold the country to ransom because not supporting the Bill means the country should come to a standstill. But, this does not mean that there are no problems and this does not mean that these problems are new. The biggest concern is that these problems have always been with us but it seems like government is not willing to attend to problems.

We have got a problem of leadership. We have got a problem of corruption. We have got a problem of cadre deployment and the biggest problem, the issue hon Minister of our slow growth in the economy vis-à-vis the bloated government that we have, vis-à-vis the not so willingness in the government departments or the ministries to tighten the belt like the Minister of Finance has asked them to do. Those are areas that have to be attended to.

The Minister of Finance asked the departments not to buy too expensive vehicles for the ministries. That is still going on. The president promised to do an assessment and take action. That has not

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

01 DECEMBER 2015

PAGE: 139

happened. There are no consequences. In local government people stand irregularly like the auditor-general was saying last week, there is wasteful expenditure. There are no consequences. Those are all the issues that government must begin to attend to. So we hope, hon Minister, that government is going to begin to want to attend to all these issues so that at least we can have value for money in South Africa. I thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Thank you. We now proceed to voting. I will also request the 3 tellers to assist me. Hon Mokoena, hon Motara and hon Labuschagne. No, no, hon members we are not going to use the machine. Let us do as we have been doing throughout. Hon Labuschagne.

Ms C LABUSCHAGNE: 10 I am not sure about the other party. Ja.

Declarations of vote made on behalf of the Democratic Alliance, African National Congress and Inkatha Freedom Party.

Question put: That the Bill be agreed to.

Bill accordingly agreed to in accordance with section 75 of the Constitution.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**01 DECEMBER 2015**

**PAGE: 140**

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Order hon members! I will afford members an opportunity to bid farewell to each other. Hon Chief Whip of the NCOP, hon Matime.

**FAREWELL SPEECHES**

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE NCOP: Chairperson of the Council, hon Deputy Chairperson in absentia and the hon rotating Chairperson also in absentia, permanent absentia, hon members, special delegates, if any ladies and gentlemen, some of the movies we used to be shown at school, one of them was titled - The Magnificent Seven. I am very proud at the end of this year to have worked with members who I feel proud to dub the magnificent 54 permanent delegates. [Applause.]

Chairperson of the Council, special appreciation to leaders of delegations, when the management of the NCOP requires them to jump, they don't complain, they just say how high. Thirdly, members of this House, Chairperson of the Council, I want to believe, it is a feature that distinguishes the 5th Parliament from all other parliaments before it, the fact that we are not party political Chairperson of the Council. We don't emphasise that. Emphasis in this House as the Constitution enjoins us is provinces, is service to the people. As we conclude yet another very momentous year in our

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**01 DECEMBER 2015**

**PAGE: 141**

5<sup>th</sup> Parliament, allow me to convey a profound appreciation to each and every one of our hon members of our Council for their resilience and utmost commitment throughout the year. Chair it's indeed an honour to be part of a leadership collective whose loyalty to serve our people is truly immeasurable. We would like to sincerely thank all our hon members and political parties for their commitment to our national agenda to ensure that our people enjoy a better quality of life. The work of our committees and plenary sessions attest to the dedication and loyalty and commitment that our hon members continue to demonstrate. Since the establishment of our Council on 23 May, we have ensured that the issues facing our people receive utmost attention from the government.

We have also worked continuously to create space for our people to raise their challenges and give true meaning to the concept of an activist people's Parliament. Our Council has been consistent in its message to be the voice of our people. Indeed, throughout its work, the NCOP has helped to bring practical meaning to participatory democracy and representing issues that our people are confronted with on a daily basis. We also continued with our work to hold the executive accountable. We have done so because we are aware that accountability and a high sense of responsibility in the governance of the affairs of the people is the back rock of our democracy. It

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**01 DECEMBER 2015**

**PAGE: 142**

is also our collective duty as the representatives of the people to protect and defend our democratic ideals.

Chairperson, I would like to thank our presiding officers. I would also like to thank house chairpersons. I would like to thank the Whips, chairpersons of our committees and all our hon members for the outstanding work that our Council has done. Out there in the communities, the people there say the NCOP is the shining guiding light of Parliament of the Republic of South Africa. [Applause.]

The conduct and character you have all demonstrated showed your utmost commitment to work tirelessly and with utmost dedication to leave a lasting legacy of our Parliament and more specifically of the NCOP. Your dedication hon members and hard work is reflected in the important role that our Council continues to play in the evolution of our young nation. You have truly entrenched the NCOP as one of the most important institutions of our democracy.

I know that while we have come to the last day of our official sitting this year, many of our hon members will be hard at work in their constituencies, serving our people and campaigning for their various political parties. As we continue to communicate the message of hope and service to our people as members of this NCOP, we must

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**01 DECEMBER 2015**

**PAGE: 143**

take some time to rest. Please members take some time to rest. Recuperate and reenergise your rigour and spend time with your families, quality time with your families. We would like to thank the staff of the Council for their utmost dedication and commitment. We are aware some of them are singing at the gate but we do appreciate the support that they did give us during this year. You have all demonstrated that you are true servants of the people.

Chairperson, as we depart from the precincts of Parliament and drive to our various destinations, let us be safe and continue to preach the gospel of safety in our roads. I wish all of us around here and our families a happy festive season and a prosperous new year. I thank you. [Applause.]

THE CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Thank you ma'am. The hon Van Lingen.

Ms E C VAN LINGEN: Hon Chairperson, today we reach another end of term. This under tumultuous circumstances as we are currently experiencing right outside the parliamentary precinct. Equally the NCOP has also become robust with debate and challenges particularly as we hold each other accountable. Like every other year, the DA has certainly worked hard, something only a few of the other MPs can assert to.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**01 DECEMBER 2015**

**PAGE: 144**

We are on the brink of the 2016 Local Government elections and now, more than ever, the ANC is flexing muscle and using Parliament as a play pen because they know that they are losing their grip on key municipalities like the Nelson Mandela Bay and Tshwane and a few others more. Having looked at the past few weeks, it is not surprising how the ANC has undermined the Constitution by ramming the DORA Bill through this House. This is a complete disregard for the process both within the provinces and national Parliament. Need I remind this House that as the National Council of Provinces are the vanguards of our provincial and local interests. This means that we have to put their needs first.

Taking Parliament to the People for the first time, planned to have a feedback session in 2015. Unfortunately, this did not happen due to a lack of preparation based on the strikes in Parliament. It is a pity that we did not have this initial test run in order to improve on it in the next year.

THE CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon Van Lingen just give me a second. Hon members this is a farewell speech. It is not a debate. In the tradition of Parliaments, the world through, it is supposed to be bantering. It is not, that is why I want to democratically suppress all points of orders because we are closing. We are supposed to be

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

01 DECEMBER 2015

PAGE: 145

wishing each other well and ntoni-ntoni please. Please don't make parliamentary work so sour that even the closing speeches lose their ends in tune. Hon Van Lingen you are protected. Please continue.

Ms E C VAN LINGEN: Thank you, hon Chair. This year the Democratic Alliance excelled in using parliamentary processes. In 2014 we gave the Ministers the message that the NCOP is an independent House in this Parliament, even in this House they must account. And in 2015 we showed them how unyielding we can be. The DA submitted 353 questions this year while the other parties only submitting a mere 37. Of that, ... [Interjections.] ... only 62% of our questions were answered, but then it is very easy to answer the questions, 95% of 37. Hon Chairperson, rest assured in 2016 we will be back to follow up in true DA style.

To our Chairperson, thank you for your role in the House. Your contribution and consistency is unwavering and appreciated. Through the many additional responsibilities you have taken on, you have shown leadership, integrity and the importance for us to stick to the rules without fear or favour. We also appreciate the contributions of the other presiding officers, hon time minus one minute, hon Nyambi, who would take Hansard, hon Dikgale, who I hope I is getting better and the Chief Whip, hon Mateme, who has just

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**01 DECEMBER 2015**

**PAGE: 146**

parked the whole story. To the NCOP Secretary, our table staff and those working in the House, we also thank you. Our Select Committee secretaries, researchers, content advisors, committee assistance, thank you. With the leadership of the hon Chairperson, we hope all grievances of those on strike will come to a compromise and that in 2016 we will be back in full force, with full complementary support staff all year to make Parliament work for the betterment of the people of South Africa

Then, we so often forget our provincial liaison teams and our links to our provinces. Their support is highly appreciated. The DA has even proved with the DORA Bill that we can work together with provinces even if it is to hold MPs accountable as we have done in this term or the last few weeks.

To our DA support team, we also say thank you very much. You are really a fantastic bunch and without you we have certainly done an excellent job. But, on a more serious note, we also lost a colleague this year, hon Eugene von Brandis left us on 27 May, after a long battle with cancer. It was an honour for us to have him with us in Parliament. His commitment in the NCOP will be missed. We thank his family for allowing us the time with him.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**01 DECEMBER 2015**

**PAGE: 147**

Today, on behalf of the Democratic Alliance, I say well done NCOP. Make the most of this holiday season, rest well and spend every moment with your families and loved ones. Next year will be another election year, the 2016 Local Government Election. I plead that we all keep in mind that we need to work towards a free and fair election. We wish you all a blessed festive season and pray to meet you all here early in 2016 refreshed, in good health and ready for another year in Parliament. Thank you, hon Chairperson.

THE CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Thank you ma'am. The hon Mokoena.

Mr L G MOKOENA: Thank you Chair. Let me thank the presiding officer and the presiding officer-ship for the work that you have done in this past term that we have spent here in the NCOP. We appreciate the work that you have done, although we note with concern the increasing onslaught on, particularly, the Economic Freedom Fighters in this office.

We also want to thank the leaders and chairpersons of Select Committees on the work that you have done there. We thank you for the engagements that we have had throughout this term and we note that the debate is going to increase, will become more fervent as the EFF grows in that space. Let me also say that the EFF is not

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

01 DECEMBER 2015

PAGE: 148

resting. We understand very well that we are a small party at this point in time but we recognise as well that the work that we have done throughout this year, I think has grown us immensely in society and that we understand that we will come back a better, fitter and stronger party after next year's elections in 2019. We will definitely not be resting through December. We will be working hard as we always do. We will be on the ground and I certainly hope that all of us here will be on the ground because the mandate of the NCOP comes from the ground. Thank you very much, Chair.

THE CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Thank you, Sir. The hon Khawula.

Mr M KHAWULA: Hon Chairperson thank you for declaring that there will be no time limit for this item. Firstly, on behalf of Inkatha Freedom Party and on behalf of the leader of the IFP, Prince M G Buthelezi who is also the traditional Prime Minister of the Zulu Nation, ...

*isiZulu:*

... ngifuna ukuqala ngokuthi ngikhuleke indlunkulu yakwaZulu. kwiSilo Samabandla nendlunkulu yonke ngithi wena kabhushu obukhali, ubhejane odlabakayise, namazinywana wonke esilo, indlunkulu yonke

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

01 DECEMBER 2015

PAGE: 149

nabantwana basendlunkulu sithi umenjalo nje, unwele olude Mageba.  
Ngibuye ngize kumongameli wezwe, ...

*English:*

... the President of South Africa and his family, the Cabinet of South Africa, on behalf of the IFP and on behalf of umntwana, I want to say to you enjoy the festive season. Keep rested. We need you back here in full force in 2016 and also as a federalist, we also say that to all the premiers of our country and also all the provincial governments of South Africa and local government of South Africa.

Coming to your House, Chairperson, I do want to say on behalf of the hardest working party in Parliament and also the most disciplined party in South Africa, Inkatha Freedom Party we want to say to you, hon Chairperson, thank you very much for your leadership. For now, for now, whilst the IFP is not yet there, you remain the best, for now.

So we do want to say to you thank you for your guidance and your leadership, we appreciate it. And, what we like the most about you, is that you are always very fair Chairperson and you are always very

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

01 DECEMBER 2015

PAGE: 150

exemplary, even to other office bearers. So, thank you very much, keep it up Chairperson.

Chairperson, Chairperson, hon Chairperson, [Laughter.] the Chief Whip and the whole whippery, hon Chairperson, Chairperson, thank you Mama Chief Whip. [Laughter.] Thank you very much. You know, my children at home enjoy that one very much. So whenever they watch what is happening at the NCOP and they look at the Chief Whip speaking, she remains their favourite. I do want to say hon Chief Whip you also remain my favourite. Thank you very much, for your guidance in the whippery and also for being yourself. You know, having people like you in the institution is a blessing. Some people may not realise that but we do need people of your calibre. Thank you very much.

And, also to all our colleague leaders in different parties and also all members of the NCOP, having come here from our different backgrounds, having come together to do the kind of work entrusted to us by South Africa and having found one another, the IFP says we appreciate that and wish that the spirit of working for South Africa keeps on growing day by day. Like my colleague in the EFF was saying, leaders of the IFP out there don't get fooled by these people. When they say they are going to rest, no they are just

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

01 DECEMBER 2015

PAGE: 151

saying it here. We are not resting in the IFP, it's local government elections next year, I want to also express gratitude to the new mayor of Ntambalala, a municipality that the IFP has just regained from the NFP and ANC. Mayor, thank you very much. Do your good work. There is more that is coming to the IFP next year but it will come if we don't rest.

Let's go and work. It is not a holiday for us. We are going to work and work and work. Lastly, we do want to thank all the staff in Parliament, starting from your staff Chairperson, the staff of Parliament and also the caucus staff of all the parties. IFP says to you, keep it up. We are here. You are behind the scenes but whatever you do and we project here as parties, it is through the hard-work that goes on behind the scenes out there. So we want to say to you thank you very much. Lastly the leader of the ANC, hon Parkies, thank you for confusing everybody in the House. [Laughter.] You even confuse your own caucus whenever you speak, you know, I always say to myself, hon Chairperson, if we were to write an exam on what hon Parkies is saying here, we would all get the Malema symbol, all of us, [Laughter.] because it gets so confusing.

THE CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon ...

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

01 DECEMBER 2015

PAGE: 152

Mr M KHAWULA: I withdraw Chairperson.

THE CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: You are not watching your clock today, my friend.

Mr M KHAWULA: I was teasing Mokoena, but hon Chairperson he confuses all of us, you end up not knowing what he has said, even his own caucus. Thank you very much, Chair.

THE CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Thank you. Hon members I must say, that today for the first time, the hon Khawula has broken his record. He usually keeps to his time. The hon Gaehler. Order!

Mr L B GAEHLER: Hon Chairperson, thank you for this opportunity. Today is the last day of this House, the National Council of Provinces. All of us are preparing to celebrate the end of the year, and the advent of the new year 2016. This past weekend has already warned us that there are many of our fellow citizens who will not be with us as we celebrate. The road carnage of this weekend must be an early wake-up call to all citizens to take extra care when travelling to their various destinations. The three ... [Inaudible.] ... points: Do not drink and drive, do not speed, drive carefully, take care of other people on the road.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

01 DECEMBER 2015

PAGE: 153

I do not only refer to those who died as a result of the many accidents on the roads but as well as others who died as a result of various accidents of assaults. I make a special mention of women and children. This time of the year should be the time of joy when together with our families we celebrate festive season and count achievement. The beginning of the year should be a time to look forward with hope.

The year 2015 was indeed a great year for this House. We carried our constitutional responsibility with great success as a team, as a team. The oversight visits to various communities exposed us once more to the reality that as a country we still need to do more to end poverty, create work opportunities, end inequality and corruption. In this regard, our work to hold the executive accountable on the implementation of developmental programmes as approved by the House, is what must always bring us together. This we must always do irrespective of our political backgrounds. Of our political backgrounds, ...

*isiXhosa:*

...ungabe ucinga into yokuba into ethile ...

*English:*

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**01 DECEMBER 2015**

**PAGE: 154**

... it's about the country and the people.

We have much to do as this House in order to guarantee proper education to our children, as well as the necessary training for skills to meeting our economy demands. Equally we must also conduct our work and continue to use this House to confront the challenges of high level of crime, including the violent crime committed against the police and most vulnerable members of our communities such as women and children and the elderly.

As we approach the end of the year and are getting ready for Christmas and the new year, often amongst our loved ones, let me convey my heartfelt thanks to the presiding officers led by you, hon Chairperson of this House. My colleagues, when I talk of my colleagues I talk of everybody in this House here. Indeed, the staff of the NCOP led by Mr Mgidlana and Advocate Phindela. It was nice working with you, continue with it. Without your outstanding leadership and commitment to our work, we would not have made it possible without you.

As we get ready for the ensuing year, 2016, approaching the local government election, it is important to always put the people of this country first, not the party, the people of this country first.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

01 DECEMBER 2015

PAGE: 155

Let us go out and ask them to vote for our different parties but as we do that, let us never forget that everything and anything we do must be about South Africa and its citizens.

*isiXhosa:*

Okokugqibela mama siyabulela kakhulu ngokuba usiphathe kakuhle kule ndlu. Apha we come from different backgrounds. Abanye bakhule ngeendlela ngeendlela. Asinoyibaleka leyo mama but you were able, your leadership, ukwazile ukusidibanisa sizintlanga ngeentlanga. Abanye bayathukisela, abanye bayathini but uyenzile into entle yokubana usidibanise, siphuma kwimizi ngemizi, sibeyile unit ikhoyo. [Applause.]

*English:*

As a unit of the NCOP, have a happy Christmas with your family mama, your presiding officers, our comrades here. Oh yes, Mohai mhlobam, sizodibana ke eBloemfontein. I wish the citizens of this country a happy Christmas. The police, the nurses abazakube besebenza during this festive season abazakube bejongene nathi, nabo we wish them a very happy Christmas and a prosperous new year. I also wish, as I wish South Africans, I also wish the UDM Members will be conveying to Bloemfontein to elect their leadership. Thank very much mama. Thank you everybody. [Applause.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

01 DECEMBER 2015

PAGE: 156

THE CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Thank you very much. The hon Parkies.

*isiXhosa:*

Mr J P PARKIES: Sihlalo, masiyibulelele indawo, andnoSotswebhu Omkhulu Weqebu Elibusayo engekho.

*English:*

Oh she is here. That was not intended to confuse you. Hon Chair and hon members, I have got a mandate to talk on behalf of the ANC to these members of this important august House. We want to say as the African National Congress, we are the defenders of the frontiers of democratic principles and values and abhorrence of anything opposite to that. The tedious task to find expression on the needs and wants of our people, we stand as this, hon members, as exponents of such aspirations. This alone should be the guiding thread to all of us as members of the legislature, calling themselves public representatives.

It was never meant to be easy nor smooth but convulsive to execute our mandate. Albeit, we consciously understand that Parliament is the theatre of politics with partisan ideological depth. What counts most is the needs of our people. We must never lose sight of that. the needs of the masses of our people. Certainly, we did not spare

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**01 DECEMBER 2015**

**PAGE: 157**

each other on these issues that affects our people. And we want to affirm that again that we will not spare each other henceforth on principled political and ideological issues. But, what is fundamental is the impact of the work that we do as members of the legislature. Its impact on the lives of ordinary people. And, it is just good that the Chairperson of the NCOP always emphasise this from the inception of this Fifth Parliament.

Now, this convergence in terms of the vision of this institution, there is no confusion and what becomes important is to note and understand that the Chairperson of this NCOP has led in the movement. Structures of the movement from different layers, from different levels and we say thina as revolutionaries. A revolutionary will acquire experience in the process of struggles of our people. Now, that is the context where we should locate the experience, the understanding, the depth of the content that she possesses. Now, together with the members of the ANC and other members of the presiding officers, we learn from each other and as members of this legislature, we must continue to learn from each other.

From the opposition parties, hon Khawula, it's never intended to confuse anybody when we take or we speak on this platform. And, we

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**01 DECEMBER 2015**

**PAGE: 158**

want to say it is important that in whatever we do as hon members, I thought hon Chair that I must say this, in whatever we do we must understand that the national sovereignty of this country is not something that we are prepared to trade or to exchange of anything. We will never be gelatinous about that. It is one point that must be accentuated.

Hon Chair, in whatever institution that is best performing, efficiency, professionalism existing, we must never forget that there are backroom thinkers in any institution. Now convey our message as the ANC that all those members of staff who are dedicated, focussed with steel discipline to perform and discharge the responsibilities in this institution that will never pass unappreciated and unnoticed. Now, opposition parties we will be here even next year until 2019 and we will continue engaging with yourselves. You will learn from us because we are a big party, the majority party and we are an experienced party. And, we will also learn from you as opposition parties. That is why we always say in our collective leadership, when you lead you must make sure that you protect the integrity and what we shall do and continuously do is to protect the integrity of this institution and precisely because we have integrity. Yes, there is no doubt about that. We will not wait for somebody to tell us that we have integrity and you will not lead

01 DECEMBER 2015

PAGE: 159

any institution with integrity if you don't have integrity. That is very fundamental.

*isiXhosa:*

Sihlalo siyabulela.

*English:*

Let us go back and have our own holidays with our families and tell our husbands and wives that we appreciate your support because as Members of Parliament and members of the legislature, you will never have strength and power to perform your task if your wife does not support you or your husband do not support you. Yes, we might appear as individuals here but a family is a system, is a support system to every one of us. We are members of Parliament but before we are members of Parliament we are mothers and fathers and even to our kids we must say thank you.

*isiXhosa:*

Siyabulela Sihlalo, siyabulela kakhulu ngobunkokheli bakho.

Siyabulela [Applause.] I can take another 10 minutes. Thank you.

THE CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Thank you very much. Hon members, we join millions of people today on World Aids Day, to remember the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

01 DECEMBER 2015

PAGE: 160

departed and to protect those who are vulnerable. We are also in the middle of the 16 Days of Activism Against Women and Children Abuse. We have been saying it since last year in this House, we must begin to monitor the laws that we pass. See whether they are implemented or whether they are indeed implementable and do something about that.

I take the opportunity to acknowledge the support of the presiding officers, the Deputy Chairperson, hon Tau, who is not well today, the House Chairpersons, hon Dikgale and hon Nyambi. Without them the load would have been too heavy and the pace a lot slower. We want, hon members, as presiding officers to thank the sterling work of the Chief Whip of the NCOP, individually and collectively the whippers for making sure that we are on work, working. We want to thank select committee chairpersons because the select committees and portfolio committees are mini Parliaments, for the work that happens in those committees, for ensuring that we deliver to the people as we should.

We also want to ... perhaps start off with the IFP and the UDM. You have often times provided the voice of reason in the House.

[Applause.] You have, during the difficult times, been able to steady this ship and bring us back to order. I want to thank the

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**01 DECEMBER 2015**

**PAGE: 161**

EFF. We have been agitated, we have been stressed but we would also not be telling the truth if we have not said that you have given us giggling moments in this House. [Applause.] We must say that, in the course of politics, every action, if you are a true politician, forces you to think and to learn, to strategize and to analyse. That goes also to the DA. You have ensured that you keep us on our toes and I must say that, overall, to all the political parties, it's been a proud year of 2015. If you look at our performance from last year, the quality of debates hon members, has improved tremendously in our House. [Applause.]

We must thank the executive because as we scrutinise the records, and yes I know that we are always complaining about certain ministers but actually in the history of the NCOP we have had improved attendance, attendance physically and attendance to the work and speeches of the executive in this House. [Applause.]

I want to acknowledge that it has been a very, very busy year for us. We have had to review our strategies to reprioritise. We have several times looked at our own capacities, whether we were really able to do what we were brought here to do. In some areas we have done exceptionally well, in others we are hoping 2016 will provide us with that opportunity. The important thing is that the men and

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

01 DECEMBER 2015

PAGE: 162

the women of this House, who have worked sometimes behind us and sometimes in front of us, the parliamentary staff has been there, sometimes to call us into the right direction, sometimes to remind us of the duties that we have to do but most of the times to give us that support and therefore we want to say through the Secretary to Parliament and to you Acting Deputy Secretary of Parliament, that through to all the ranks of staff of Parliament, say a big thank you. [Applause.]

We would be remiss as the NCOP, hon members, not to accept that some of the great debaters have come from the special delegates from the provinces, all our provinces and therefore we say thank you and we hope that the provocative debaters will be there next year, in full force, to keep us again alive as this House. Because these voices have helped us always to remember these different constituencies that we serve that are South Africa.

Hon members, it has been a long year. We have lost hon Von Brandis, we have lost family members but it has also been a wonderful year. We have found love. We are smiling and I am hoping that certain members of this House will soon tell us to attend to some weddings. [Applause.] We have ensured that the House is working. We have heard members on their toes screaming at the top of our voices. We have

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**01 DECEMBER 2015**

**PAGE: 163**

also heard complaints from the hon members that in fact they have not been properly protected. Where we have messed up, accept our apologies. Where we have been too hard on you, accept the scars that we have inflicted in you but we apologise nonetheless. We have also gained new members from these exchanges. Of course, we have lost hon Groenewald and Masango to the National Assembly but we have gained 2 members in their place. Every time we meet up with new people, we have potential friends and that is how I always look at life. The enemy of yesterday is a potential friend of tomorrow and if we are going to build this country, we need the energy, we need to see how we always balance things out.

Hon members, I am hoping that you are as tired as I feel. The negotiations are continuing hon Van Lingen. At 4 o'clock I will be there to ensure that we bring these matters of the strike to a conclusion before we all rise for Christmas. We are tired. Some of us are no longer spring chickens. Let's go home, remember the loved ones at home. Go and rest. Don't be too productive hon members because we need all your, we do need the future but we also need all your attention here next year. We must get back into our communities to educate but importantly to listen. I hope that you will travel safely. I hope that we will find peace and I hope that the joy of Christmas will also bring some more peace into our hearts.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**01 DECEMBER 2015**

**PAGE: 164**

Before I conclude, I wish to invite you for a little drink and a snack outside before we all go home. It has been a lovely year working with you. Members, this concludes the business of the day. No bonus for you. Please remain standing as we vacate the House. The House is adjourned. [Applause.]  
The Council adjourned at 14:08.