30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 1 of 196

TUESDAY, 30 AUGUST 2016

PROCEEDINGS OF THE NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

The House met at 14:02.

The House Chairperson took the Chair and requested members to observe a moment of silence for prayers or meditation.

ANNOUNCEMENTS, TABLINGS AND COMMITTEE REPORTS - see col 000.

NEW MEMBERS

(Announcement)

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Thank you very much, hon members. Hon members, before we proceed with today's business
... Order! Can we be seated? Thank you very much.

Hon members, before we proceed with today's business, I wish to make the following announcements: The vacancy which occurred in the National Assembly owing to the resignation of Ms P

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 2 of 196

Ntobongwana has been filled by the nomination of Mr Lehlohonolo Goodwill Mokoena with effect from 25 August 2016. [Applause.]
You are welcome, hon member.

Vacancies which occurred in the National Assembly owing to the resignations of Mr A M Matlhoko and Ms A Matshobeni have been filled by the nominations of Mr Zolile Roger Xalisa and Ms Leigh-Ann Mathys respectively with effect from 24 August 2016. [Applause.] The members have made and subscribed to oath and affirmation in the Speaker's Office. Can the hon members stand up so that we can welcome them? [Applause.] Thank you, hon members. You may be seated. You are welcome to the National Assembly.

First to second orders of the day ... [Interjections.]

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: House Chairperson, I would like to address you in terms of Rule 29(b) of the Rules of the National Assembly, if I may.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): You may.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Rule 29(b) refers to the fact that members have to be sworn in, and at the earliest

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 3 of 196

convenience the Speaker needs to report that to the House.

During the course of the Joint Sitting on Thursday, I took a

point of order because - I don't know whether to call her hon or

not - Mabe had taken her seat in the National Assembly. I know

that the week before she has been sworn in as a candidate for

mayor in Mogale City. You have not reported today that she has

been sworn in. So, I would like to please - in terms of Rule

29(b) - establish whether in fact she took her seat up as a

sworn-in member of the House during that sitting or whether she

in fact was a stranger in the House and should not have been in

her seat on that particular day.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order, hon members! May I take advice from the office staff, and I will then respond to you.

Thank you very much, hon Steenhuisen, for bringing the matter up. I was just consulting, hon member. As far as the Table is concerned, they haven't received a resignation from the hon member. This therefore means she is still a member of the Assembly.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Madam House Chairperson, as you would well know, electoral regulations and the Local

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 4 of 196

Government: Municipal Structures Act of 1998, as well as Acts determining Parliament, prohibit you from being a member of two spheres of government at the same time. For her to have been put forward and nominated as a mayor in Mogale City, she would have to have been sworn in as a councillor. If she hasn't resigned from this House or attested resignation from this House, a fraud has either been committed in Mogale City or a travesty has occurred in this House in which a stranger has taken a seat. Could I ask that the Presiding Officers investigate this matter and report back to the House accordingly. Thank you.

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: Thank you, Chair. We wanted to record officially that this Parliament must immediately start investigations of a fraudulent act that has been committed by Councillor Peace Mabe, who has been sworn in as a councillor in Mogale City. You can't be a councillor and be a Member of Parliament at the same time. You automatically renounce your membership of Parliament once you take over the councillorship. So, as far as we are concerned, the last time she was sworn in as a public representative was when she was sworn in as a councillor in Mogale City. She must remain as such; she is no longer a Member of Parliament. I know for a fact that there was no other Member of Parliament that was sworn in except the three Members of Parliament from the EFF since the end of the local

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 5 of 196

government elections. So, she must remain a councillor; she must not enter here. She must hand in the access card like all members that resign from the Assembly. Thank you very much.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: Chair, we would like to agree with the request for investigation by your office on this matter. In fact the last time it was raised it was raised in a Joint Sitting. It is now formally raised in a National Assembly sitting. Therefore, we agree with the sentiment that this matter of hon Peace Mabe should be investigated by your office. Thank you very much. [Applause.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Thank you very much, hon Mthembu. Hon members, having listened to issues that have been raised with a request for an investigation into this matter, I will take the matter up and refer it to the Speaker for a request of an investigation. Thank you, hon member.

Hon member, Hlophe, I have noted your question for clarity, and I will answer duly. I did not take up office in Tshwane; I didn't. Thank you very much. [Interjections.]

Mr J S MALEMA: I wanted to check if it is parliamentary for mayors to chair Parliament? [Laughter.]

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 6 of 196

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): What a welcome. I can see that we missed one another very much during this period.

It is indeed not parliamentary. But as indicated, hon Didiza did not become a mayor of Tshwane. I think the wish of hon Steenhuisen was granted in a message he sent to me early in the campaign - that he would want to see me back here in Parliament. So, I'm back. [Applause.]

Hon Malema, you are correct. It is not parliamentary. So, the one sitting in front of you is hon Didiza - House Chair. Thank you.

Mr N SINGH: Thank you very much, hon Chair. Welcome back.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Thank you.

Mr N SINGH: While we are doing investigations and the Presiding Officers are investigating, can we also check the situation of the previous hon Masina. From correspondence we received, he resigned with effect from the 23rd. But he was sworn in on the 23rd as a mayor. So, can they check that and also report to the House at an appropriate time. Thank you.

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 7 of 196

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Thank you very much, hon member. Both issues will be brought to the Speaker for attention and the request by members for an investigation.

Thank you very much, hon members.

CHILDREN'S AMENDMENT BILL

AND

CHILDREN'S SECOND AMENDMENT BILL

(Second Reading debate)

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Chairperson, hon members, ladies and gentlemen, good afternoon. It has been just over six years since the coming into effect of the Children's Act, Act 38 of 2005, which makes it relatively a new piece of legislation in our statute books. During these years, the department has identified some practical challenges with regard to the implementation of the Act. The courts have had an opportunity to also, judicially, consider and review some of the provisions. The Act has provided useful guidance on how the department ought to interpret and implement such provisions.

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 8 of 196

In section 28 of the Constitution, the state ensures that children are protected from all manners of abuse. The Act was therefore promulgated as a means to ensure the realisation of the rights enshrined in section 28 of the Constitution. The Amendment Bills are a further step to ensure maximum protection of one of the most vulnerable groups of our society, which is our children.

The amendment seeks to introduce a damning provision in section 120 of the Act so as to make it easy and quick to find persons who commit certain offences against children and are unsuitable to work with children. However, a new provision is also introduced, which sets out a separate procedure to be followed when dealing with child offenders who are committing crimes against other children to bring the Act in line with the recent judgment in the matter of J versus the National Director of Public Prosecution and Others in 2014.

Furthermore, this amendment has presented a window of opportunity to align the Act with the Criminal Law (Sexual Offences and Related Matters) Amendment Act of 2007, most importantly with regard to the inclusion of child offenders in registers. The SA Police Service is the custodian of information related to convicts of crimes against children, yet there is

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 9 of 196

currently no obligation to submit this information to the department. The amendment therefore seeks to address this abnormality and broaden information sources for the register.

Hon members, a need has also arisen to review provisions related to decisions to remove a child from his or her primary caregiver without a court order. A new section 152(a) is introduced in this regard to ensure a speedy judicial review of cases where a child is removed without a court order to test the correctness of the decision, thereby affording extra protection to children from arbitrary decisions by officials.

Chairperson, the department is also taking an opportunity to address ... [Interjections.] [Time expired.] [Applause.]

Ms N CAPA: Hon Chair, hon members, our guests, and people in all cities and villages of our country, I also take this opportunity to further explain and inform this House how we have gone about in dealing with these very important amendments which were presented by the hon Minister Bathabile Dlamini to Parliament and subsequently referred to the Portfolio Committee on Social Development for consideration and adoption. Of course, a report of the committee on legislative processes it undertook when

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 10 of 196

considering the two Bills was tabled in the House for consideration and adoption.

For us to be able to move forward, I need to assist by ensuring that there are very important reasons why this Bill had to come in as already outlined by the Deputy Minister. The transformation agenda of our country during this term and the previous term of government enables Parliament to review and amend existing legislations that were mostly passed by the same Parliament during the transitional terms of this democratic government. This is necessary so as to improve the implementation of these legislations based on the challenges that were encountered in their implementation. That is why the department had to amend this Children's Act.

Due to the nature of the Act and the implementation challenges that arose, it was deemed necessary to amend therefore through separate Amendment Bills [B13 and B14]. It is also very critical to inform the House of the urgency and the need for the House to allow the state to implement this Act as amended. It will help a lot of children who, through their activities as young people, are charged and sentenced to an extent that they cannot go further for schooling because they will not be allowed to work with other children. Today, some of them are now adults, having

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 11 of 196

committed such crimes whilst they were still very young. They face a situation today of being in that register and therefore, prevented from working with children. When members of this House have adopted and passed this Law, such people will be able to have an opportunity to apply for their names to be removed from that particular register. It is therefore very important to make that information available.

On the issue of adoption, I do understand that during the public hearings a notion arose that sought to say that the duties that were being implemented by private sector adoption social workers on adoption cannot be done by state-employed social workers.

That notion was actually clarified by the SA Council for Social Service Professions, SACSSP that all social workers have the same the qualifications and are also registered. Therefore, it will not be wise to say that certain work can only be done by the private sector.

Let me also highlight the fact that it has become extremely expensive to go through adoption. Because it is very expensive, it is done by the private sector. There are many children who are supposed to have been adopted if there were many social workers doing that work. That is why we come to the House to suggest amendments and urge you to approve.

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 12 of 196

The process of adoption by the private sector social workers is very expensive and it is not very transparent. For example, poor people do not have funds to pay for the adoption process. When they are assessed they sometimes fail that assessment. Although that is the situation, many parents, aunts and uncles still look after their own relatives' children without necessarily going through that legislative approach.

Therefore, the passing of this Bill will ensure that even those poor people who are actually looking after their children's relatives will be able to make adoption. If a child is staying with a family and is not legally adopted, in many instances that child is likely to be exploited because social workers do not have data that allows them to supervise that particular family, and to provide the needs of that particular child. Many children lose their parents and end up with relatives and therefore, are not out for adoption. I think this Bill will assist us in that regard.

Inzima kakhulu le ndlela yokufaka umntwana kusapho ngokuseMthethweni (adoption) kuba kule mihla yethu kufuneka uyenze le nto ngendlela yasesilungwini. Nalo mntu ukwenzisa le nto uyenza ngendlela yasesilungwini babe abantu bona, kwelinye icala, benamasiko abo. Abantu baye bathande ukuba abantwana

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 13 of 196

abathe bakhuliswa ngabanye abantu, bakungabikho abazali babo, bakhule belusapho olunye kwaye bewazi namasiko abo.

Xa siwubeka lo Mthetho osaYilwayo phambi kwale Ndlu sinqwenela ukuba izizalwane (extended families) nazo zenziwe ziwazi lo Mthetho. Akusokuze kuthiwe oonontlalontle abaqashwe ngurhulumente abanakuwenza umsebenzi wokufaka umntwana kusapho ngokuseMthethweni. Kaloku ikwa ngurhulumente owenze uMthetho wokuba kufakwe umntwana kusapho ngokuseMthethweni ngoko ke oonontlalontle bakarhulumente bamele ukuba bawenze kuba ibihleli kakade ingumsebenzi negunya (mandate) labo.

Oku kuhlomela le Mithetho esaYilwayo mibini sikucelela kakhulu ukuba kwamkelwe yile Ndlu. Baninzi abantwana abakuluhlu lokuba banikwe ingqwalasela ukuze bafumane abantu abaza kubafaka kusapho ngokuseMthethweni baze babanike ubomi nemfundo engcono. Kuye kubenzima ukulandela inkqubo yokufakwa komntwana kusapho ngokuseMthethweni kwaye nezandla eziwenzayo zimbalwa kakhulu.

Xa kupasiswa lo Mthetho osaYilwayo kuthetha ukuba uMphathiswa ukwiphulo lokongeza oonontlalontle nokwenza abalungelelanisi bale nkqubo ukuze bakwazi ukuqokelela olu lwazi (data) kwenziwe lo msebenzi. Kungoko ke ndisithi, nokuba oonontlalontle bambalwa njengoko kusitshiwo, baya kubana besongezwa bade bafike

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 14 of 196

kwinqanaba elilindelekileyo. Ndibeka lo Mthetho osaYilwayo ndinesicelo kumalungu ahloniphekileyo sokuba masincediswe siwupasise. Enkosi. (Translation of isiXhosa paragraphs follows.)

[It is very difficult to adopt a child because today you have to follow the legislative approach. Even the officials who are employed to help people are using English while the families who adopt those children, on the other hand, are exercising their customs. The families who adopt the orphans would like them to grow up exercising all their customs as one family.

When we present this Bill in this House we wish that the extended families be educated about the Children's Act. There must be nothing that stops the social workers who are employed by government from performing their duties in respect of registering the adopted child using the legislative approach. It is the government that passes the law relating to the adoption of a child legally, and so it is the duty of social workers, who are government employees, to perform those duties and it is their mandate to do so.

We want this House to accept the amendments made in these two Bills. There is a long list of children who are waiting for 30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 15 of 196

legal adoption so that they may enjoy the opportunity of a better education and a bright future. The process of legal adoption of a child is not easy, and the manpower involved in doing that is not adequate.

When we manage the process of passing this Bill, this will mean that the Minister is busy with the programme of increasing the number of social workers and making sure that the work is done. That is why I am saying that if the number of social workers is not adequate, as they say, they must recruit more until they reach an acceptable number. I take this opportunity to enable the hon members to assist in the process of passing this Bill.]

Mr M WATERS: Chairperson, it's a pity that the Minister is not here for her own debate and I see she is speaking - I wonder where she is. I would like to thank my colleagues that serve on the Social Development Portfolio Committee for this opportunity to speak in this debate.

Back in July 2005 when we debated the Children's Bill, we introduced ... I see the Minister has arrived, rather late than never, just like the ANC service delivery ... [Interjections.] We introduced a Child Protection Register and part B of that register was intended to protect children from people who have

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 16 of 196

been found unsuitable to work with children. At present, the Act determines that such people include those convicted of murder, attempted murder, rape, indecent assault or assault with the intent to do grievous bodily harm. One notable crime that was inadvertently omitted from the Act and ought to have been added to the crimes listed was that of attempted rape.

This motivated me to introduce a Private Members Bill. However, when investigating the matter further it was evident that additional amendments needed to be tabled. For example the Act did not make provision for offences against children, which are contained in the Sexual Offences Act, Act 23 of 1957 and Sexual Offences and Related Matters Amendment Act of 2007. As the register came into operation on 1 April 2010, and was retrospective for five years, both the 1957 and 2007 Acts applied. These offences ought to have been added to the offences list of the Act, initially.

I am glad to say the Amendment Bill before us today includes all these amendments. Another important amendment that was needed was to do with current section 120(4) and (5), which states that "In criminal proceedings, a person must be found unsuitable to work with children when they committed a crime against a child." While the authors of the Act intention were to ensure automatic

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 17 of 196

finding of unsuitability, the courts interpreted it in another way. And, they interpreted in this following manner: That if in a court judgment there is no specific mention of unsuitability then that person can continue to work with the child - which was not the intention of the authors.

My Private Members Bill and now the proposed Amendment Bill is changing the wording from must to deemed. So, if an adult is convicted of a crime against a child they will be automatically deemed to be found unsuitable to work with children. This, hon members, is a gigantic leap forward in ensuring that child abusers can no longer work with our children.

Lastly, I would like to encourage all Members of Parliament on both sides of the House, to submit Private Members Bill when legislation needs strengthening. It does not matter if your Private Members Bill is passed separately or initiates the department to table its own Bill as in this case. What matters is that the legislation be strengthened for the betterment of our country. I thank you very much. [Applause.]

Nks N P SONTI: Sihlalo, lo Mthetho i-Children's Amendment Bill nguMthetho obaluleke kakhulu ohlahla indlela ekufanele ukuba kudala ihlahliwe, kwiinzame zelizwe lethu zokukhusela nokhulisa

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 18 of 196

abantwana bethu. Kwezi ziganeko zininzi zokuxhatshazwa ngokwesondo nebezikwingxelo yamapolisa eli kunyaka ophelileyo, isiqingatha sazo besijoliswe kubantwana, ngakumbi abangamantombazana.

Ezi ziganeko zibonisa elubala ukuba sisisizwe esidinga umthetho oza kukhusela abantwana kwezi ntswelaboya zabantu abaxhaphaza abantwana bethu. Aba bantu ikwangabantu abaziwayo ngaba bantwana babaxhaphazayo kuba bethenjwiwe ngaba bantwana ngoku basebenzisa oko kuthenjwa kwabo ukubaxhaphaza ngokwesondo. Ngamanye amaxesha aba bantu bazenza ngathi bayakhathala kanti bajonge ukuthenjwa ngaba bantwana.

Yaba yimeko enjalo ke imeko kaKhwezi noMnumzana uZuma. UKhwezi ukhule emthembile uMnumzana uZuma, emthatha njengomalume wakhe, umhlobo katata wakhe nomntu obenokumnceda kwiingxaki zakhe ezifuna izisombululo. Wayengayazi ukuba lo malume wakhe yingcuka eyambethe ufele lwegusha, ejonge nje ithuba elilo lokuba amxhaphaze ngokwesondo. Ngala madoda anje ngoTata uZuma la ekufuneka kuqinisekiswe kakhulu ukuba awasondeli nakancinci ecaleni kwabantwana bethu. [Uwelewele.]

Lo Mthetho oYilwayo uza nesisombululo sokukhulisa abantwana, ingakumbi abaziinkedama, nto leyo enganikwa ngqwalasela.

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 19 of 196

UMzantsi Afrika unabantwana abazizigidi ezinesiqingatha abashiywa ngoonina. Uninzi lwabo lujongwa zizihlobo nezalamane ezixhomekeke kwisibonelelo sabantwana esingama-R350 ngenyanga, mali leyo engabonelenga kwaphela. Abakwazi ukufumana isibonelelo esingama-R890 sokukhulisa abantwana abashiywa ngabazali kuba lo mba wokukhulisa abantwana abangenabazali asingomba obacaceleyo kakuhle abantu bakuthi.

Umntwana wodade wethu ngumntwana wam. Abantu bakuthi abayiqondi kakuhle into yokuba kufuneka baye nasezinkudleni ukuze bafumane esi sibonelelo sokukhulisa abantwana abangenabazali. Ngenxa yokunqongophala koonontlalontle, kunzima ukubona ukuba lo mthetho uza kusebenza njani kuba aba bantu bangawuqondiyo umcimbi wesibonelelo sokukhulisa abantwana abangenabazali badinga uncedo loonontlalontle.

Ngokwamanani aphuma kweli Sebe loPhuhliso loLuntu kudingeka oonontlalontle abangaphaya kwamawaka alishumi elinesibini.
Uninzi lwamakhaya anabantwana bangenabo abazali alubhaliswanga nokubhaliswa kwiSebe loPhuhliso loLuntu, nto leyo eyenza kubenzima ukufumana inxaso kurhulumente.

Siyabongoza bethuna kwisebe likaMama uBathabile Dlamini ukuba aqeshe oonontlantle. Lo mama makakhe athi xhaa ngapha, azamele

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 20 of 196

abantwana bethu bafumane umsebenzi. Aba bantwana banezidanga kwaye bafundisiwe kwaleli sebe, kodwa ngoku abafumani misebenzi. Nalo Mthetho oYilwayo oyiChildren Second Amendment Bill kuza kubanzima ukuba usebenze xa uphunyeziwe wanguMthetho kuba nawo uza kufuna ukuba kuqeshwe aba nontlalontle angabaqeshiyo, ohloniphekileyo, uMama uMphathiswa uBathabile Dlamini. Lo Mthetho uYilwayo unika igunya koonontlalontle abaqeshwe ngurhulumente ukuba nabo bakwazi ukwamkela abantwana njengamalungu osapho ngokusemthethweni, nto leyo eyongezelela uxinzelelo olumandla.

Siyawuxhasa lo Mthetho-sihlomelo oYilwayo siyi-EFF. Siyabulela. [Laphela ixesha.] (Translation of isiXhosa speech follows.)

[Ms N P SONTI: Chairperson, the Children's Amendment Bill is legislation that is very important in explaining the matter to be considered that was supposed to be amended long ago, regarding the efforts of our country in protecting and looking after our children. Amid the escalating number of incidents of sexual abuse that were mentioned in the report of the SAPS last year, a remarkable number of those abuse cases involved children, especially girls.

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 21 of 196

These incidents clearly show that we are a nation that needs to have a law that will protect children from those criminals who are abusing our children. These people are no strangers to the children that are abused and they take advantage of these children's trust. These children also rely on them whilst, on the other hand, they take them for granted and abuse them sexually. Sometimes these people pretend that they care for them whereas they do not; they just attract their attention.

It was like that in the case of the abuse of Khwezi by Mr Zuma. Khwezi respected and trusted Mr Zuma and regarded him as her uncle, a friend of her father who was supposed to help her when she was in trouble. She was not aware that this uncle was not a true uncle, that he had hidden ideas about her, and that he wanted to abuse her sexually. Those men who are like Mr Zuma must not come closer to our children because they are not good. [Interjections.]

This Bill is going to lay out the way in which we must look after our children, especially orphans, and that would be the reason for taking it seriously. In South Africa there are millions of children who are not staying with their biological mother. Most of them are under the control of their relatives and friends who get R350 in the form of a social grant each

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 22 of 196

month, and that amount is not enough for their needs. They cannot enjoy the R890 that is allocated to orphans who are adopted by other people. The reason for this is that people are not aware of this social grant.

The child of my sister is my child. Our people do not take seriously the registration of these children so that they may enjoy the social grant in respect of foster parents of orphans. We have a limited number of social workers, and it is not easy to be sure that this law is going to fulfil its purpose if these foster parents don't know about the social grant in respect of adopting orphans, because they also need the services of the social workers.

According to the numbers from the Department of Social Development, there is a shortage of over twelve thousand social workers. Most families who have adopted orphans are not registered on the list of the Department of Social Development, and that cause difficulties for them in obtaining the government social grant.

We ask the Department of Social Development, under Minister
Bathabile Dlamini, to recruit social workers. The Minister must
try to create jobs for our children. These children have

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 23 of 196

degrees, and they were getting a bursary from this department, but subsequently they are not getting jobs.

It is going to be difficult for this Children's Second Amendment Bill to operate because when we accept it, that will mean that the hon Minister Bathabile Dlamini must recruit more social workers. This Bill is giving a mandate to social workers who are employed by the government, by way of the right of accepting these children as members of adopting families legally, and that in itself creates more pressure.

We, the EFF, support this Amendment Bill. Thank you. [Time expired.]]

Ms C N MAJEKE: Hon Chairperson, hon members, the UDM supports the Children's Amendment Bill as well as the Children's Second Amendment Bill. We also welcome the valuable contributions made by various civil society organisations and the public in general. We are certain that these amendments will make a difference in the lives of poor children, many of which are orphans.

The more than 1,4 million maternal orphans that South Africa has and mainly cared for by family members, the financial assistance

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 24 of 196

is a great intervention. The department will have to quickly respond to the shortfall of more than 3 700 social workers to be able to manage the implementation of the broader child protection system.

Secondly, the department, working with all civil society organisations and other role-players must immediately roll out an outreach programme to make citizens know these Bills.

Finally, Chairperson, this outreach programme must of necessity target the most vulnerable people in the rural areas and in the informal settlements. I thank you.

Ms L L VAN DER MERWE: Hon House Chairperson and welcome back, the struggle of South Africa's children and their wellbeing is something that is close to my heart, and to that of our party. The IFP, therefore, welcomes and supports the two Amendment Bills before us. Some of the changes to our legislation were absolutely critical needed, in particular, the requirement that all those who have been convicted of a sexual offences, be deemed to be unsuitable to work with children. I wish to thank hon Waters for taking the first steps which gave rise to the changes we are adopting today.

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 25 of 196

There have been numerous cases of convicted child sex offenders, who have been found teaching at schools in our country. And just yesterday, a teacher from Nqutu appeared in court, after sexual offence charges were brought against him, which he is alleged to have committed against his pupils. However, these are not isolated incidents. Clearly, recruitment processes must be improved at our schools and daycare centres. To assist with this, our government must ensure that our child protection and sexual offences registers are constantly updated, to reflect all those who are deemed unsuitable to work with children. However, a good policy will only translate into good practice, when there is follow through and monitoring.

As good as these amendments are, hon Chairperson, they fail to tackle one critical issue and that is the severe shortage of social workers in our country. South Africa has got more than 1,4 million maternal orphans, most of them are cared for by family members. These families need financial assistance. So, they try to qualify for a foster child grant, but it can take up to three years to access this grant. This is due to the fact that our country faces a severe shortage of social workers for example to reach the 1 million orphans whose families are not receiving a grant as yet, we need more than 11 000 social workers.

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 26 of 196

So, of course, the logical solution would be to fund these social workers, but the Department of Social Development has been unable to find this funding and Treasury has said no to them. So, clearly this is a crisis, hon Minister, both on your side and in terms of the Treasury. Ultimately, it is our children who are paying the price. When there are no social workers to investigate child abuse and neglect, children continue to be abused and killed. Research shows that if we had a well-functioning child protection system, we could have saved the lives of 500 children last year.

Finally, Chairperson, it is the duty of each one of us, to ensure that we intervene wherever children are threatened, harmed or discriminated against. I therefore wish to pledge the IFP's support for the learners of Pretoria Girls High School, who have spoken out against the abuse they've had to suffer due to racist practices in their school. We are distraught by their trauma, but we applaud their bravery. We support their call for the stronger action to be taken against those who have abused them, and infringed on their rights. There are many too many challenges still remain with regards to adoption processes and the message is clear. We need to do much more, much faster, to protect our children. I thank you.

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 27 of 196

Mr S C MNCWABE: Hon members, ...

... sibonge, Sihlalo, nathi siyakwemukela. [... thank you, chairperson, we also welcome you.]

Our late President Madiba once said and I quote: "There can be no keener revelation of a society's soul than the way it treats its children." The two Bills under consideration here today is another small step in our quest for a society that seeks to give effect to the principle of embracing the best interest of our children, and contributing to a society that is caring and protective of our children.

The NFP welcomes the amendments to the Children's Amendment Bill, which give effect to directives from the Constitutional Court and harmonises the Children's Act with the Sexual Offences Act. The amendments also seek to create a deeming provision which makes it easier to find adult offenders unsuitable to work with children, and in doing so, makes it more difficult for sexual predators to come into contact with children. Other proposed changes which the NFP supports include amending section 150 in order to clarify the requirements for finding an orphaned or abandoned child in need of care and protection; and amending section 152 to provide for a judicial review of a decision to

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 28 of 196

remove a child without a court order. We believe that these amendments will contribute to the efficiency of social workers in general, while many of the proposed amendments are necessary and are welcomed by the NFP.

The NFP shares the concern of civil society organisations that the law reform efforts fail to resolve a critical issue. The current crisis in the foster care system, foster care, hon members, is a crucial component of casting the net of protection, safety and security for our vulnerable children and orphans, as wide as possible. South Africa has an estimated 1,4 million orphans and the majority of these children are being taken care of by relatives with only a child grant to assist them.

We have seen a steady decrease in a foster care grant payments over the past five years, which indicates that the system is failing to accommodate a large proportion of our orphans and placing unnecessary and tedious burden on those family members who look after them. The NFP would like to see this matter being given consideration in future amendments to the Children's Act. The NFP welcomes and supports these amendments tabled today.

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 29 of 196

Ms D CARTER: Chairperson, the proposed amendments to the Children's Amendment Bill and the Children's Second Amendment Bill are necessary and have been welcomed by most. However, there are still deficiencies that will be dealt with and addressed, I suppose, in the third amendment.

The majority of the 1,4 million maternal orphans are cared for by families who, in turn, require financial assistance. The child support grant, at R330 per month, or R11 a day, is paid to around 1 million orphans or to the families. We all know that we cannot provide three meals a day to a child at the cost of food today. Those families are trying to formalise the care arrangement by obtaining a foster care placement in order to qualify for a foster care grant of around R880.

The current child protection system is not coping with the current numbers. How will it reach the additional orphans? Implementation will be key. According to the Department of Social Development, there is a shortfall of more than 3 700 social workers to manage the existing child placements. This means that for the 1 million maternal orphans, families are not receiving a foster grant. An additional 11 500 social workers will be required to reach them. How will we be able to deal with that?

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 30 of 196

The system must not come at the cost of abused and neglected children due to investigations not being instituted timeously. We all remember the sad case in Durban, where, after neighbours had reported the case on numerous occasions, a child was brutally murdered by her mother.

We also welcome section 152(a), which allows a child to be removed without a court order. However, I would also like to address the committee - and I am going to talk about Baby X. I want to call on the committee to ensure that, with the third amendment, a parent who has abused or inflicted harm upon his or her child should not get access to that child. Baby X looked like a newborn but was, in fact, a five-month-old baby. She had come in with a broken skull and broken arms when she was only four days old. She also suffered from shaken baby syndrome.

I am trying to find out about adopting Baby X. It was said that her parents have been put through rehabilitation and that that baby will be going back home. If they had not had the patience to work with a four-day-old baby and had inflicted that type of harm, what are they going to do when they now have a child who is mentally challenged? I thank you.

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 31 of 196

Mrs C DUDLEY: Chair, please excuse my voice. I seem to have picked up another bug. However, I want to take this opportunity to congratulate the committee on a job very well done.

This legislation had the potential to impact significantly for good or for bad on the lives of our children, and the committee left no stone unturned in interrogating the legislation in line with what we heard presented in public hearings. The committee also stayed open to constant feedback from stakeholders all along the way. Having spoken to some stakeholders, it is my opinion that their concerns have been adequately addressed and there is a general optimism that the legislation will improve the situation for many children.

The issue of foster care was just one area that took some time to get right, but it seems to have been adequately dealt with. Adoption processes should now be less onerous and more affordable. What was impressive was the commitment of the Chairperson of the Social Development Committee not to rush and miss the mark. She allowed members to be sure they understood the issues and that the solutions would not have unintended consequences, even when it meant missing deadlines. The best interests of children remained the priority.

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 32 of 196

Here, I would also like to thank stakeholders and, especially, those who made submissions and stayed vigilant throughout the process. Your dedication to our children is inspirational and very much appreciated.

Thanks also go to the hon Mike Waters of the DA. He worked on the Private Member's Bill, aspects of which are included in this Bill.

Last, but by no means least, I would like to thank committee staff and officials in the Department of Social Development, who bore the brunt of this process and who had to remain professional and accommodating in the face of, sometimes, unrealistic expectations. It has been a privilege and an honour working with you all, as I run between committees.

The ACDP will be supporting this Bill. Thank you.

Ms E R WILSON: Hon Chair, the amendment of Acts and the passing of legislation is the responsibility of this House. Some have been appalling and not at all in the interests of South Africa, as a whole. Some are good, and have gained approval.

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 33 of 196

The DA is encouraged by the amendments to the Children's Act and for the strengthened protection of children. We are thankful to the hon Mike Waters and to all the stakeholders who gave their valuable input to these amendments. However, this House can pass all the required Acts, whether good or bad, but if the infrastructure is not in place to ensure compliance with the Acts, including this one, then we have wasted a lot of time correcting the symptoms but not addressing the cause of many failures.

The mission of the Department of Social Development is to enable the poor, vulnerable and excluded in South Africa to secure a better life for themselves, in partnership with them and with those who are committed to building a caring society. Amongst the values of the department, it states that they will use the resources entrusted to them to deliver on the government's priorities in the most efficient, effective and innovative ways. It further states that they will be transparent and accountable for their decisions, actions and performance.

Somehow, along the line, these missions and wonderful values fell off the bus. Why is it, Minister Dlamini, that you will not effectively and timeously answer Questions for Written Reply? Is it the smolanyana [tiny] skeletons in your closet, or do you not

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 34 of 196

have the answers? [Interjections.] Why are you uncomfortable being transparent about your R12 million use of taxpayers' money on travel expenses in one year? [Interjections.] Letters to your office requesting meetings with you are ignored, outright.

We are advised, this week, that the Department of Social Development in KwaZulu-Natal underspent R100 million of their budget. An amount of R63 million was underspent on Programme 5, which funds nonprofit organisations, NPOs. Only 17% of the budget was used and NPOs have been forced to close. Many of them have had their subsidies cut, making sure that they are unable to deliver and support the communities that they care for. These are the very NPOs who supported the amendments to this Act, who offer care and counselling to the poor, and who often offer shelter and support to the very children this Act aims to protect. Many deal with statutory issues and now cannot function.

Surely, Minister, in your 30-plus nights at R11 000 per night in your plush Umhlanga hotel, you at least met with the KwaZulu-Natal Department of Social Development? [Interjections.] Perhaps not - because, if you had, you would have been aware that they are in disarray and obviously badly mismanaged - at the cost of those we seek to protect.

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 35 of 196

Minister, are you aware of the millions of fruitless and wasteful expenditure in your department in Limpopo - R14,5 million in irregular expenditure? Last year, there were 45 million illegal claims. There is a 40% vacancy rate, Minister. We receive constant complaints from people desperate to offer homes to abandoned or orphaned children, but who cannot get a response or clearance from the National Child Protection Register. Some have been waiting for six months.

Children are being raped at school, abused in their homes, neglected in orphanages, but there is only one social worker for 3 000 people. They cannot cope. All the while, you live in five-star hotels and travel the globe.

There are 2 400 unemployed graduate social workers. To make matters worse, some of those got a bursary to study at a university whose curriculum does not comply. In other words, their degree in social work is actually not realistic.

Three million children in this country are facing starvation. You advised that families can live on grants totalling R750 per month and can save, but when we ask you to come shopping with us, you duck and dive. It is time to catch the next rocket off

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 36 of 196

Planet Zuma and make your way back to Earth to the real world, Minister.

The DA supports these amendments, wholeheartedly, but we would also support a Minister who was prepared to be held accountable for her Ministry, was transparent and took her responsibilities seriously. I thank you. [Applause.]

Ms H H MALGAS: Hon Chairperson, hon Ministers and Deputy
Ministers present, Members of Parliament and the audience
watching this session of Parliament, I greet you.

Like the speakers before me, it gives me great pleasure to participate in this debate. We the portfolio committee — I am now referring to the whole portfolio committee — welcome these Bills. Because the entire committee participated, the Bills were quickly expedited.

The Deputy Minister and the Chairperson, hon Capa, briefly touched on the need for these amendments which was brought about by the enormous challenges that everyone mentioned when they spoke about what took place at schools recently, etc, and the enormous challenges faced by vulnerable children in South Africa

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 37 of 196

because of all forms of abuse they encounter due to the high crime rate and the violence committed against them.

We do have the Children's Act, Act 38 of 2005, in place to provide protection services to such children, but there were challenges that necessitated amendments. Therefore we have these two amendments before the NA today.

The ANC do realises that child sexual abuse in South Africa is endemic. It continues to be a societal problem. I will not expatiate on the statistics which are released annually, but. according to the SA Police Service 2014-15 statistics, there has been a decrease in sexual offences against children. This figure was not disaggregated or categorised according to age. But we are aware that these crimes are not always reported because of the way we were socialised by the society.

The ANC has made the protection of children and women one of its priorities in the 2014-19 Medium-Term Strategic Framework, MTSF, by developing policies and interventions that seek to ensure that all people in our country feel safe. This is one such intervention.

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 38 of 196

Despite the high prevalence of child sexual abuse, the number of persons convicted of sexual offences recorded in the National Child Protection Register has remained low. People pointed out that, according to the report of the Department of Social Development given to us in March 2016, there have been only 904 persons who were found to be unsuitable to work with children.

This low reporting has been attributed to the definition of "found unsuitable" found in the Children's Act in its current form. This interpretation of the Children's Act in the current form requires the courts of the Department of Justice and Constitutional Development to make a conviction. The request that these amendments had to be put into place has come from the Department of Social Development who also brought us the statistics.

The hon Walters spoke about the two processes — conviction and finding unsuitable — which will remain until the Children's Act Amendment Bill is passed, because they are dealt with separately. This has caused delays in reporting for the purposes of registering the convicted person on the National Child Protection Register. The amendment to this Bill proposed by the portfolio committee thus makes the finding of unsuitability automatic when an offender is convicted. This is an important

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 39 of 196

amendment as it will immediately prohibit an offender from working with children and thereby eliminates any chance of a person recommitting the same offence.

In preparation for the implementation of the amendment, what infrastructure do we have to put in place? The department has employed additional human resources to enhance its efficiency and to deal with the Child Protection Register entries once this Bill is passed. It has increased the number of social workers from two to eight, the number of data capturers from three to 13 and has employed nine additional registry clerks to help with the register.

According to the Children's Institute, there were 3,37 million orphans in South Africa in 2013. And the worrying factor for the department — which they related to the portfolio committee — is that, in the very same year, there was a total of 61 000 child-only households across South Africa.

Despite these statistics, the Department of Social Development in its 2015-16 annual report reported that where were only about 500 000 children in foster care. This clearly demonstrated to the portfolio committee and the department that there is a big gap between the number of children in need of care and those

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 40 of 196

receiving foster grant in the foster care system. This gap can be attributed to the various interpretations of the wording "visible means of support" by the courts.

The amendment Bill therefore — and we thank the department for it — seeks to remove barriers and eliminate backlogs currently existing in the foster care system by extending protection to children who are urgently in need of care. I will not speak about adoptions or the second amendment because it was broadly expatiated on by many of the hon members in this Chamber and also by the chairperson of the committee.

In conclusion, we must remember that South Africa is a signatory to a number of international and regional human rights instruments. It is therefore our legal responsibility to develop and implement legislation and policies that provide protection for all our children. I am not making an appeal to all parties because all parties, as I listened to them, adopted this amendment.

But I would like to say that I am not going to speak about any allegations that were made about our Minister. I feel that we have to respect each other in this Parliament. Respect goes a long way. If you don't respect me how can I respect you? And

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 41 of 196

when it comes to our taxpayers, they respect us and we respect them too.

We would like to thank civil society organisations for the valuable input they made to this Bill. I would like to thank all our opposition parties for supporting this Bill. We had our challenges in the committee. We discussed it and we sorted it out. I will like to thank the ANC for giving its support to this Bill. I thank you.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Chairperson, Ministers, members of Parliament thank you very much for the opportunity.

The Department of Social Development is taking this opportunity to address some unintended consequences of an adoption order in cases where the adoptive parent is married to or is a domestic life partner of the biological parent of the adopted child.

Hon members, the amendments further seek to empower social workers in the employ of the state to provide adoptive services in order to make the services more accessible and not a preserve of those who can afford to pay large amounts of money. Some of the agencies have been allowing only people with money to process the adoption of children.

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 42 of 196

As it is the case with section 152, there is also a need to strengthen provisions relating to removal of a child with a court order in order to ensure that the review process is conducted speedily and it is in the interest of the child concerned.

Currently a child can only be placed in foster care up to the age of 18 years. However, experience has shown that there is a need for continuation of support for persons who were placed in foster care whilst they were children even after reaching the age of 18. The SA Social Security Agency, Sassa, has been allowing children who continue studying after the age of 18 to stay in foster up until 21 years of age, but this has not been part of the law. This amendment is part of aligning practice and law because it is now legally binding that children that are in foster care and are 18 years are supported until the age of 21 as long as they are at schools, colleges or any other institution of higher learning.

Hon members, I would like to express my gratitude to the chairperson of the committee and the members of the committee.

And I am grateful to all members of the committee who tried to reach consensus on all the issues that we encountered during the committee's deliberations.

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 43 of 196

And one other issue that I think is important is to thank hon member Waters for agreeing to withdraw his Private Member's Bill because we had also started with the process ... [Inaudible.]

It's not rubbish, it's the truth. [Interjections.] We had already started with the process ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order, hon members! Let us allow the Minister to finish her input.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: ... of looking into the amendments.

Let me conclude by reiterating our continued determination to ensure that our children grow up in secure family life and enjoys the right and privileges they deserve as articulated in our Constitution as well as the UN instruments and the AU. We will continue to do everything in our power to ensure that every child enjoys maximum protection against any form of abuse. My appreciation also goes to all civil society organisations, individuals and officials from various state institutions who worked very hard to ensure that the amendments are processed up to this milestone. I thank you. [Time expired.]

Debate concluded.

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 44 of 196

Children's Amendment Bill read a second time.

Children's Second Amendment Bill read a second time.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): I wish to advise that the new Rule in terms of the time for declarations of vote is as follows: ANC, 6 minutes; DA, 4 minutes; EFF, 2 minutes; and all other parties, 1 minute. [Interjections.]

CONSIDERATION OF REQUEST FOR APPROVAL BY PARLIAMENT OF ECONOMIC PARTNERSHIP AGREEMENT BETWEEN THE SADC EPA STATES, OF THE ONE PART, AND THE EUROPEAN UNION AND ITS MEMBER STATES, OF THE OTHER PART IN TERMS OF SECTION 231(2) OF CONSTITUTION

Ms J L FUBBS: House Chair, it's great to see you back chairing the House again. I would also like to take this brief opportunity to congratulate the former Deputy Minister of Trade and Industry on his appointment as the new Mayor of Ekurhuleni. [Applause.]

With respect to the SADC EPA States which signed the economic partnership agreement with the EU. As far as South Africa is concerned, this is great news as it is before us. It does replace the chapter on trade in the Trade Development and Co-

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 45 of 196

operation Agreement, TDCA, and it focuses on how we can increase our exports of value-added products to the EU, which remains at the moment our largest trading partner.

It also addresses issues such as sugar. Sugar that all of you have been fighting for. Why? Because of the fact that it is labour intensive; others among you have fought for wine, flowers, fruit products and canned fruits. In all of these issues, the access has been improved because there has been an improvement on the duty preference for South African exports of flowers, fruit, canned products; and also with respect to the sugar and the import prices.

This is very important as we have a large sugar industry. We are now going to be allowed to have new duty-free market access for 150 000 tons of sugar, which equates to almost a R1 billion in market terms of the average African, Caribbean and Pacific, ACP, sugar import prices in the EU.

Again, the rules of origin have been simplified and that certainly assists us. Those of you who are passionate about rooibos tea that is now totally protected, and may not be used by other countries under their own trademarks. [Applause.] Now that is excellent news for us.

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 46 of 196

We have also fought for feta. Now we can use that. They have acknowledged, yes, it is okay, go ahead and use it. These will not again be banned purely because of the names.

The other aspect which I think is important is that, it is very important that the existing intellectual property rights of all South African producers are fully taken into account and this does so which the Trade Development and Co-operation Agreement, TDCA, signed in 2000, did not.

Yet one more issue is with respect to South Africa's industrial development objectives. Areas and components such as vehicles, aircrafts, transport equipment, and machinery and mechanical appliances, which contributed 24% and 11% in our exports; now this allows us to increase R374 billion in 2011 to R536 billion. I think this is a massive increase of 43% in one of our priorities.

Why is it a priority? It remains a priority because it addresses the unemployment situation. Every step of value addition creates more work, both skilled and unskilled along the way.

Furthermore, it harmonises the trading regime between Southern

African Customs Union, Sacu, and the EU and preserves the common external tariffs.

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 47 of 196

You would remember that South Africa was really hard-pressed to explain to the Europeans that long before they thought of any tax regimes along the EU scale, Sacu was already in force. This remains a critical instrument in our intra-African trade, especially trade in the SADC areas.

One last aspect I would like to indicate is that the priority for all Members of Parliament remains job creation and this partnership agreement directly addresses that. I thank you.

[Applause.]

Mr N L S KWANKWA: House Chair, before you call the next speaker,
I didn't want to disturb the speaker that is why I waited for
her to finish before I could make my point of order.

[Interjections] ... no, no, no, it is not a point of order ...

[Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza) Hon member, you can take a seat.

Mr N L S KWANKWA: House Chair, the issue is really about this one minute in which we are expected to make a declaration within a minute. We ... [Interjections.] ... No, you are out of order;

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 48 of 196

you were not even in that meeting! I was in that meeting when we raised it as a concern.

It is unreasonable and unrealistic that we are expected to do a Notice of a Motion for one minute, where you would stand up here and say you move that at the next sitting the House must debate and then you are given a minute to do that. You are also given a minute to motivate and tell us the reasons why you either reject or support whatever is put in front of the House. It makes no sense. It can't be said in one minute. It is going to be a problem.

In the future, for instance, We know that you, House Chair, are not aware of these issues as you were busy campaigning in Tshwane, but the issue is during the next sitting, we are obviously going to take the matter up via the appropriate avenues but, if it is not resolved, we are not going to be able to do a declaration in one minute. It is impossible.

Andithethi IsiNgesi mna ... [I am not speaking English ...]

I am not a first language speaker of English and most of these things are written in English. That has to be taken into account as well. Thank you.

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 49 of 196

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon member, as you correctly indicate, I will raise the matter with the Speaker and also with the Chair of the Rules committee so that it can possibly be reviewed. Thank you very much.

Declaration(s) of vote:

Mr G G HILL-LEWIS: Madam House Chair, it's wonderful to see you back in the Chair today and we would like to congratulate you on a very honourably fought campaign.

We welcome the agreement that the House is ratifying today because it gives South Africa nearly unfettered access to what is definitely the world's biggest united trading bloc - the European Union, EU - for all our products, especially value-added products.

It gives us far greater access to cutting edge technology and machinery from the EU. The technological diffusion that comes with access to that technology gives our industries here at home greater competitiveness. Crucially, it gives us access to that massive bloc of wealthy consumers to whom we can sell our value-added manufactured goods. That is what is essential for South Africa's economic growth and job creation in the future.

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 50 of 196

We've got to export more and we've got to manufacture more. The bigger the markets we can have, the better for our industries.

This deal, in a nutshell, encapsulates the case for a more confident, open and outward-looking approach to trade policy. The economic argument for more open trade is unassailable but, in difficult times like we face at the moment, the temptation is to circle the wagons, to look internally and to become increasingly isolationist. That is exactly what this government is tending to do.

We have nothing to be isolationist about. We can confidently go to the global markets with the best entrepreneurs in the world. We have globe leading technology companies like Naspers - a Fortune 500 company based right here in Cape Town - and many others. We not only have the big companies, but also the best entrepreneurs and start-ups in the world. We therefore do not need to be isolationist at all.

The drift towards more protectionism that we see in South Africa is self-defeating and destructive. To be sure, we should definitely target protection for nascent industries. That is one thing, but blanket protectionism just invites retaliation from

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 51 of 196

our trading partners, which, in turn, shrinks the market for our entrepreneurs.

I see the communists shaking their heads vigorously. Don't worry, you won't be here very shortly, so ... [Laughter.]

As I said, blanket protectionism shrinks the market for our goods, making it more difficult for our entrepreneurs to sell South African products abroad. And ultimately, leaves South Africans poorer, and shrinks economic growth here.

We therefore don't need to be isolationist. We have nothing to be afraid of because we can confidently sell our wares on the world's markets.

That brings me to the National Regulator for Compulsory

Specifications, NRCS. It's becoming increasingly clear that

there is a complete collapse of service delivery at the NRCS. An

organisation that I'm sure many of us have never heard of, but

it is absolutely crucial to the smooth functioning of our

economy because it issues the letters of authority by which most

goods are imported into South Africa.

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 52 of 196

The meltdown of service delivery there is absolutely deliberate by the Department of Trade and Industry. It is nothing more than an attempt to raise a non-tariff barrier to prevent the trade in goods with South Africa. It is also becoming increasingly a crisis with many companies and employers in our country facing shutdown and collapse because they cannot even get the products needed to sell locally. We raise that as a serious concern, but we nevertheless very warmly welcome the passage of this deal today. Thank you very much. [Applause.]

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: Chairperson, you know the trade agreement which was supposed to have been agreed to by this Parliament has already been signed by the Minister of Trade and Industry. I think that Parliament should discuss how trade agreements are entered into and the role of the executive and Parliament thereafter because, currently, we are just reduced to rubberstamps. It's in operation and it's already functioning. There must be a total review of the trade agreements that we have, particularly with the EU because, I think that we have opened up a lot.

It's impossible, hon Hill-Lewis, to successfully and competently industrialise without strategically protecting certain sectors.

I think that we have opened up far much more to the EU than we

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 53 of 196

should have. We are supposed to catch up in terms of industrialisation. There must be rediscussions around all the trade agreements that we have with the developed economies, so that, we are able to build our own industries and, in fact, catch up more successfully. It is already operational; we are just rubberstamping the whole agreement. It's not like we are doing anything new. Sure!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Sure, indeed! I'm happy that hon Hill-Lewis, hon Fubbs and you are in the Trade and Industry committee. I also think that you are correct that the debate should start by asking how we should engage with trade agreements prior to them being made, and also prior to their ratification. I'm happy. [Applause.]

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Hon House Chair, the NFP is in full support of the recommendation contained in the report of the Department of Trade and Industry to approve the economic partnership between the SADC EPA and the EU tabled here today.

This agreement is essentially based on the principle of reciprocity and, if approved, will result in distinct benefit for South Africa and the SADC region as the whole. For example, the agreement provides for asymmetrical trade relations with the

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 54 of 196

EU and makes significantly larger trade concessions than the SADC EPA by allowing individual countries in the region to keep tariffs on products which are sensitive to international cooperation.

Further benefits of the agreement includes safeguards on imports, the possibility of flexible sourcing, fair conditions in the trade of agricultural products and, in our opinion, a very important provision that a SADC EPA state will extend any advantage granted to the EU to other SADC EPA states. The NFP supports it. Thank you.

Mr J A ESTERHUIZEN: Chairperson, the IFP wholly supports the economic partnership agreement between the SADC EPA states and the EU. South Africa, which is already the EU's biggest trading partner in Africa with the strongest Sub-Saharan economy, can only benefit from greater trade co-operation with the EU.

The founding principle of this partnership was to ensure that there is free and fair trade between South Africa and the EU. Although South Africa will greatly benefit from this agreement, as the hon Chairperson on the Trade and Industry Committee has already explained, there is still a lot more that can be done. For instance, wider accesses to agriculture and agro-processed

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 55 of 196

goods and products from certain geographical areas need to be marketed as such.

With South African wines being the biggest export to the EU, we support calls for South African winemakers to take advantage of this opportunity to further the brand of South Africa abroad. Thank you.

Ms J L FUBBS: House Chair, I was indeed very pleased that the issue about the processes in bilateral and agreements was raised. The issue is this, that it has indeed been signed. We have also repeatedly indicated as a committee that we would also like to have greater involvement. However, having said that, there still remains what is known as or termed, the ratification. Neither the Minister nor the Cabinet can ratify this; only a sovereign Parliament can. So, we are essential to the process of the recognition of this agreement, which is the process that is currently underway.

Just for the record, let me add that there is yet a further process which we are not always mindful of, and that is the actual depositing of the agreement. Now, that is very important. In the past, as we all know, South Africa was always eager to undertake these. We believed that when other countries and

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 56 of 196

parties said that they would do something, they actually meant what they said. So, we rushed in where angels feared to tread, while everyone else waited and said, we're sorry, we found a little impediment. By then we were there alone with no supporters around us. Well, frankly, we are no longer that naive.

Yes, we still have another process after this Parliament has ratified this agreement and this is the actual depositing. Yet something else that I would like to add: I am so pleased that all parties - and the ANC has said this repeatedly - all agreements will be signed only if they take account of our country's interests, of which the first priority is job creation. We are not entering into any agreements unless that issue is effectively dealt with.

The second thing that we are mindful of is how to make use of our processing and manufacturing - our value-addition principle. We are also mindful of the fact that we not only have the best tea in the world - Rooibos - we also have the best lamb - Karoo lamb. We have succeeded in protecting the Karoo lamb as well as the Honey bush.

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 57 of 196

Yet, something else that we are mindful of is the trade in wine and spirits. Only this morning, I had an engagement with the head of the EU delegation, who reminded me - of course, I had not forgotten - of their commitment to support our wine trade in this regard. But, as usual, they thought that we would simply accept that, but they now know that we not only want to hear that said in individual offices over cocktails and dinner, but we also want to see it in actual writing with timeframes attached.

However, South Africa is a very solid, reasonable partner and with respect to the recognition of our wine names, we have agreed to recognise their wine names as well. So, it has been a reciprocal process, but for us, that aspect has been very important.

With respect to other agricultural issues that have frequently come up, these issues are almost a hundred in nature. We would have liked to have it increased but, unfortunately, it has not yet been possible.

One of the final points I shall make in this regard is that, when it comes to harmonising this trading regime, this agreement, for the first time, the Trade Development and Co-

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 58 of 196

operation Agreement, TDCA, did not do that as effectively. It harmonises the trade regime in such a manner that it doesn't impact negatively on South Africa and our own interest in that regard.

Again, on the ethanol side - which you would know about if you are in agriculture - we are also trying to increase our production and make full use of all the products that arise out of the growth and the growing production of sugar.

So, I'm really very happy to state that this underpins the position of the ANC government, which is to grow an inclusive economy and to create jobs. [Interjections.]

I would hope that, having heard your colleague give his full commitment, you would revise that opinion. Thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Interestingly, the members of the committee have outlined their task in respect of agreement: the process before an agreement is made, ratification and depositing. So, you already have three agenda items to discuss in your next meeting.

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 59 of 196

Thank you, hon members for your participation in this debate.

Are there any objections to the approval by Parliament of economic partnership agreement between the SADC EPA States, of one part and the EU and its member states, of the other part, as it appears on the Order Paper? No objections.

Agreed to.

Economic Partnership Agreement between the SADC EPA States, of the one part, and the European Union and its member states, of the other part, approved.

SA TEAM TO RIO DE JANEIRO

(Draft Resolution)

Mr J L MAHLANGU: Hon Chair, I move without notice:

That the House -

(1) notes that a 45 star-studded South African team heads to Rio De Janeiro this week to take part in the Paralympics from 7 to 18 September 2016;

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 60 of 196

(2) further notes that the squad will be spread over 10 different codes, namely, archery, athletics, canoeing, cycling, equestrian, powerlifting, rowing, swimming, shooting and wheelchair tennis;

- (3) understands that the athletics code will have the strongest representation of 19 athletes, followed by swimming and cycling, both with six competitors;
- (4) believes the team is a blend of stars who have medals in various international events and have done South Africa proud on the international scenes before; and
- (5) calls upon all South Africans to rally behind this powerful team as they did to the SA olympic team.

I thank you, Chair.

Agreed to.

ZAMBIA NATIONAL ELECTIONS

(Draft Resolution)

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 61 of 196

Mr S MOKGALAPA: House Chair, I move without notice:

That the House -

- (1) notes that Zambia held its national elections from 11

 August 2016;
- (2) further notes that it was a tight race between President

 Edgar Lungu's Patriotic Front, PF, and opposition Hakainde

 Hichilema of the United Party for National Development,

 UPND;
- (3) acknowledges that the PF was declared winner by the Electoral Commission of Zambia, ECZ, with 50,35% of the vote while the UPND, received 47,67%, which led to the party filling a court challenge to the Zambian Constitutional Court, delaying the swearing in of the new President;
- (4) recognises that certain challenges were allegedly experienced with reports of political violence and intimidation occurring in the parts of the country;

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 62 of 196

(5) congratulates the people of Zambia for exercising their right to vote in their vibrant democracy; and

(6) encourages the South African government to take leadership as a member of the SA Development Community, SADC, regional body to ensure that democracy is always respected and that the rule of law is adhered to in Zambia.

Thank you.

Agreed to.

Ms N V MENTE: Chair, I move without notice:

That the House -

(1) notes the passing of members of the EFF ...

[Interjections.]

Mr B A RADEBE: Hon Chair! [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIPERSON (Ms MG Boroto): Hon! [Interjections]

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 63 of 196

Mr B A RADEBE: Can you please address what the hon Hlengiwe has

just said now?

AN HON MEMBER: What's wrong with you?

Mr B A RADEBE: Hon Chair, the motion of the EFF does not comply with new regulations. So, it cannot be read because it's only the Speaker of Parliament who can allow motion which does not comply with the regulation to be read in the House. Thank you. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon member ...

Mr N F SHIVHAMBU: Chairperson!

The HOUSE CHAIPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): ... the regulations, if you can clarify, I think it's on Rule book 123. My understanding says that it has to be five parties, including the majority party and the largest party. So, only two parties objected to the motion, and not five.

AN HON MEMBER: Sit down, German cut!

Mr N F SHIVHAMBU: Chairperson!

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 64 of 196

Mr B A RADEBE: Chairperson, but the same Rule 123(2)(6), says that the motion may not contain unbecoming or offensive expressions. [Interjections.] So, that one does contain that because it is claiming that the ANC has murder ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon Radebe, we have not had a chance ... Hon Shivambu, we have not had a chance to listen to the motion. Can we please do that? [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Continue, hon member.

Mr N F SHIVHAMBU: Chairperson, we wanted that to take that member through a quick workshop of the new Rules ...

THE HOUSE CHAIPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): No, come with your motion.

Mr N F SHIVHAMBU: ... so that he doesn't make the same mistakes again.

The HOUSE CHAIPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): No problem, just continue with your motion.

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 65 of 196

Mr N F SHIVHAMBU: The only basis upon which you don't read the motion it is when there are five parties objecting.

The HOUSE CHAIPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): I know

Mr N F SHIVHAMBU: So, you must not do that again. So, you have been caused into calling this point of order. Don't repeat it again.

The HOUSE CHAIPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Continue, hon member with your motion. [Interjections.]

PASSING OF MEMBERS OF THE EFF

(Draft Resolution)

Ms N V MENTE: House Chairperson, I move without notice:

That the House -

(1) notes the passing of members of the EFF through an uncompromising ground forces;

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 66 of 196

(2) notes that fighter Kenneth Mongomane and Tsietsi Mothibe were brutally killed in Tembisa ward 100 in Ekurhuleni, Sethokga hostel, by ANC members because of hooliganism and political intolerance;

- (3) further notes the passing of other fighters who passed on due to natural causes, fighter uMama Mabel, a staff member at the EFF headquarters and the councillor candidate, fighter Matlabe Francis from North West, Bolokang Moapa from Northern Cape, Brenda Mente from Eastern Cape, fighter Sekoto from North West and fighter Matlatsi from Gauteng;
- (4) recognises these outstanding ground forces as activists in their own rights;
- (5) encourages to raise our heads high, march forward in their undying memory and may their souls rest in perfect revolutionary peace.

[Applause.]

The HOUSE CHAIPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Are there any objections to the motion?

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 67 of 196

Mr B A RADEBE: The ANC objects to this motion. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): the ANC ...

[Interjections.] Order! Order, hon members! Order! Hon Malema!

Mr S J MALEMA: I wish to advice the Chief Whip of the ANC that if you start doing those things of objecting our motions; you are taking us right back where we were. We are going to oppose everything that you present in this House.

The HOUSE CHAIPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon member, unfortunately this is not the time. [Interjections.]

Mr J S MALEMA: You are creating a wrong precedence. There is a new Chief Whip now. Call the German cut to order. [Laughter.]

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: Can we respond to ...

The HOUSE CHAIPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon members, the motion has been objected to. Now, I want to put the question. Those in favour of the motion say ayes. [Interjections.] Those against say noes. [Interjections.]

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 68 of 196

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Sorry, on a point of order,
House Chair! I already think that they were following the wrong
path here - We are straying away from the agreed procedure. Can
I ask that with the concurrence to the Chief of the EFF that
this matter be referred to the Programming Committee to be
rediscussed because I think there is a problem with
interpretation of the Rules as I hear? I don't think we vote on
these things in the House generally. If there has been an
objection, it can't be put to the House.

The HOUSE CHAIPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): I have been advised. I actually questioned that and I have been advised by the Table that that's how the processes will be going. I don't disagree with what you are suggesting. I would also want these matters to be really clarified.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: Can we assist, Chair, that if the EFF ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon member, I think hon Shivambu's hand was first.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: I wanted to assist him as well. [Interjections.]

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 69 of 196

The HOUSE CHAIPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): If you agree hon Shivambu? Okay, hon Chief Whip, it's your time.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: All of us obviously would like to pay our condolences to EFF members killed. The only issue is when you say that when there is no court of law that says they have been killed by the ANC. If only that part is expunged, we will indeed agree with the motion. That's what I wanted to assist with.

The HOUSE CHAIPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon member, can I say that we put the motion and you objected. The issue that is raised by hon Steenhuisen - I am not going to deal with the issues of the content of the motion. The issue that is raised by hon Steenhuisen is one leading me to put the question. I was saying that's how I have been advised and that's how the guide goes. But I believe that you made a suggestion that it must go back and be clarified in the correct forum. That will be done. I am also not very comfortable with that, but we have to go back and understand all of us. [Interjections.]

Thank you very much. I think I have been advised by the Secretary to the National Assembly, who says, let's go where we have been. Let's not put the question. These are our motions

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 70 of 196

without notice. So, I pass on that and the motion without notice will now become a notice of a motion. Thank you.

[Interjections.]

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: House Chair, can we ask that it get brought to the National Assembly Programming Committee on Thursday so we can have a discussion and clarify again what the procedure is?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Yes, that is what should be done. Hon Shivambu?

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: Chairperson, just quickly, you must remember that during one of the Joint Sittings when the hon commander-inchief of the EFF said that the ANC-led government killed workers in Marikana, it was taken to court, and the court reaffirmed what he said - that it can be pronounced here in Parliament.

HON MEMBERS: Yes!

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: So, it is narrow thinking by the ANC caucus to just object to a condolence motion in the manner they have done now. It is not sustainable. We are advising the Chief Whip to

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 71 of 196

not enter into dangerous territory. It is a matter of fact that the people who killed our members in Thembisa are ANC members!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon member! Hon member! Alright.

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: So, don't just object to that in the manner in which you have done. It is not advisable. It is not going to gain you anything. That is one thing that you must take note of and then deal with differently because we are not going to go anywhere about it.

An HON MEMBER: You switch off the microphone! [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon members, thank you very much. Let's pass. Let's not debate the issues raised. What is important is there. Thank you. [Interjections.] We now go to the next party.

Mr J S MALEMA: Chair, on a point of order: That thing of switching off the microphone is not correct.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): No, hon members!

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 72 of 196

Mr J S MALEMA: I don't think it is acceptable because you are restricting the freedom of this hon member to speak in this Parliament.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon member, when you rise on a point of order and raise a point of order, I will agree.

The hon member is giving an explanation. [Interjections.] That deters me ... I asked him to sit down, but he did not. So, I get what you are saying, but let us all respect one another. It is not a ...

Ms H O HLOPHE: On a point of order, Chair ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Let met just explain this. If it is not a point of order but something that has to be debated and clarified, it can be done in that particular forum where those things are done. Allow me to take points of order and not explanations, clarifications and debates.

[Interjections.]

THOKO DIDIZA ELECTED CHAIRPERSON OF COMMONWEALTH WOMEN PARLIAMENTARIANS AFRICA REGION

(Draft Resolution)

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 73 of 196

Ms L A MNGANGA-GCABASHE: Chairperson, I move without notice:

- (1) welcomes the appointment of National Assembly House

 Chairperson Ms Thoko Didiza as the Chairperson of the

 Commonwealth Women Parliamentarians Africa Region on

 24 August 2016 in Mauritius;
- (2) notes that Ms Didiza was elected at the seventh Commonwealth Parliament Africa Regional Conference and will serve as the regional chairperson for a period of three years;
- (3) understands that she takes over from Ms Sophia Swartz of

 Namibia who had been the chairperson since 2013;
- (4) acknowledges that Ms Thoko Didiza previously served as the Africa Region vice chairperson and subregional representative of Southern Africa; and
- (5) congratulates Ms Didiza on her appointment and wishes her a successful term of office.

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 74 of 196

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Are there any objections to the motion?

Ms H O HLOPHE: We object.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): In light of the objection, the motion may not be proceeded with. The motion without notice now becomes a notice of motion on the Order Paper. [Interjections.]

MANY INJURED AND DEAD IN KWAZULU-NATAL BUS ACCIDENTS

(Draft Resolution)

Mr K P SITHOLE: Chairperson, I move without notice:

- (1) notes that a series of bus accidents occurred on the same weekend in the Durban and Underberg areas, one leaving three deceased and many more injured;
- (2) further notes that, on one of these buses, 50 children from the Umgungundlovu District team had been on their

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 75 of 196

way to the provincial Indigenous Games in Margate and, on the other, over 50 young girls from Durban Girls'

High School were on their way back from a soccer match against Port Shepstone High School;

- (2) extends its condolences to the families of the three people who lost their lives;
- (4) acknowledges that amongst those injured were teachers and coaches who all suffered minor injuries;
- (5) further acknowledges eight Durban Girls' High School pupils are still in hospital, three in a serious condition;
- (6) calls on the Department of Basic Education, together with the Department of Transport, to investigate the matter fully and to make sure that such accidents do not happen as they possibly may deter our youngsters from participating in sport;
- (7) appeals to all road users to exercise extra caution and observe all road signs to ensure that they reach their destinations in one piece.

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 76 of 196

Agreed to.

CRIMINAL CASE OPENED AGAINST TYITYABA GAME RESERVE MANAGER FOR HUMAN RIGHTS VIOLATIONS

(Draft Resolution)

Mr M L W FILTANE: Chairperson, I move without notice:

- (1) notes that, on 24 August, two men were allegedly forced to eat their dog by a man who believed they were illegally hunting in a private game reserve in Komgha in the Eastern Cape;
- (2) further notes police spokesperson Capt Nkosikho Mzuku confirmed that Lwando Folokwe, 25, and Akhona Dyantyi, 35, had opened a case of attempted murder, pointing a firearm, assault and crimen injuria against Karl Krull, the manager of the Tyityaba Game Reserve;

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 77 of 196

(3) recalls that Krull allegedly fired shots in the direction of the men who he thought were hunting illegally in the reserve owned by his father;

- (4) further recalls police said that Folokwe and Dyantyi, covered in blood, were taken to the Komgha police station in the back of a bakkie by Krull and his labourer on Friday and, after being quizzed about the blood, said they had been forced to eat their dog, which Krull had shot and also alleged that Krull kicked them, punched them, and hurled racial comments at them;
- (5) recognises that a case has been opened and postponed to 13 September; and
- (6) condemns this gross human rights and racist violation and calls for justice against Karl Krull.

Agreed to.

DEADLY EARTHQUAKE IN ITALY

(Draft Resolution)

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 78 of 196

Mr J L MAHLANGU: Chairperson, I move without notice:

- (1) notes with great shock the death of 250 people after an earthquake of 6,2 magnitude struck central Italy in the early hours of Wednesday, 24 August 2016;
- (2) further notes that more than 2 500 people were left homeless in the local community of 17 hamlets;
- (3) understands that many of those killed or missing were visitors;
- (4) recalls the last major earthquake to hit the country struck the central city of L'Aquila in 2009, killing more than 300 people;
- (5) understands the pain all affected families are going through at the loss of their loved ones, their homes and property;
 - (6) extends our condolences to Italian President Sergio

 Mattarella, the government and the people of Italy; and

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 79 of 196

(7) wishes the injured a speedy recovery.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Are there any objections?

Ms H O HLOPHE: I object, Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): There is an objection. In light of the objection, the motion may not be proceeded with.

The motion without notice now becomes a notice of motion on the Order Paper.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: Chair, I respectfully raise an issue of importance. Tomorrow, we have a Chief Whips' Forum meeting, and on Thursday we have a National Assembly Programming Committee meeting. [Interjections.] All of us have to provide leadership in this House. [Interjections.] I therefore request that in relation to ... except to the other parties, for my party and if the DA also agrees, any motions without notice from the DA and the EFF, that we go and discuss those matters in the Chief Whips' Forum and in the programming meeting so that when we come here, we are all able to give leadership on these matters and our understanding of the Rules as adopted. That is what I would like to request this House to engage with, Chair.

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 80 of 196

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): That is what I was going to propose, but you referred to a matter of importance. That is why I allowed you. Hon Malema?

Mr J S MALEMA: Hon Chairperson, I rose here and warned the Chief Whip of the Majority Party. I did warn you because the new Rules were trying to deal with this problem. The Chief Whip of the EFF even qualifies it and says that the court has gone to the extent of saying that your concern can be addressed in a manner in which we did here. Even when he further gives that clarity, you still do not move. You still do not move even when the court has provided clarity on that aspect. Therefore, later on when it comes now to bite, we are told of the Chief Whips and all types of meetings.

I asked for leadership from you, hon Jackson, and said to you specifically that you are a new Chief Whip of the Majority Party, do not allow the guy who was sitting next to you, the hon Gina, he has been doing that to the previous Chief Whip of the Majority Party. He is doing that to you and you are allowing it. Do not allow that please.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Thank you, hon Malema.

Can we continue? Hon members, I think the proposal here will

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 81 of 196

bear fruits that in the Chief Whips' forum these matters are discussed so that when we come to the House we have a smooth session with one understanding. Thank you very much.

Mr P G MOTEKA: Hon Chairperson, the Chief Whip of the Majority Party just does that without being recognised.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): I recognised him, hon member maybe you did not check. Thank you very much. I will not allow that.

XOLISA BANGANI AND ATHENKOSI NDULULA, ORGANISED A HEALTH FOOD MARKET DAY

(Draft Resolution)

Rev K R J MESHOE: House Chair, I move without notice on behalf of the ACDP:

That the House -

(1) notes that two unemployed men from Khayelitsha have started a health market in the area to combat what they

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 82 of 196

call "one of the most critical issues in their
community";

- (2) further notes that what spurred them to start a health market was what they believed was a lack of healthy eating in townships;
- (3) recognises that Xolisa Bangani and Athenkosi Ndulula, organised a healthy food market day called "Impilo Market" in Khayelitsha this past Saturday, and they invited a few local gardeners and chefs to showcase their talent to the community;
- (4) believes that this initiative should be supported by government and encouraged in all townships where healthy eating and healthy lifestyles are not promoted enough; and
- (5) applauds the initiators from Khayelitsha, who, rather than ask what could be done for them, decided to charter the way forward and by starting a project that has the potential to lower diseases prevalent in townships such as diabetes, which results from, among other things, poor eating habits.

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 83 of 196

I thank you.

Agreed to.

CONGRATULATING AGRICULTURE, FORESTRY AND FISHERIES FOR WINNING STANDARD BANK TOP WOMEN AWARD

(Draft Resolution)

Ms L A MNGANGA-GCABASHE: Hon Chair, the ANC moves without notice:

- (1) notes that the Department of Agriculture, Forestry and
 Fisheries won a Standard Bank Top Women Award in the
 category of Top Gender Empowerment Government Department
 at the gala dinner event at Emperors Palace on Thursday,
 18 August 2016;
- (2) further notes that the prestigious award goes to the government department that clearly and effectively demonstrates the highest level of gender empowerment, from staff to suppliers, through its programmes and policies;

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 84 of 196

(3) believes that the department has done South Africa proud and has demonstrated government's strides in serving its citizens with the outmost dedication;

- (4) further believes that this further encourages both the public and private sector to remain committed in working towards the success and empowerment of women in our country; and
- (5) congratulates Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries for winning the prestigious award and for making the country proud.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Thank you very much. Is there any objection?

Mr N S MATIASE: Madam House Chair, there is nothing that we can be proud of from that department.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon member, are you objecting?

Mr N S MATIASE: We object to that motion.

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 85 of 196

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): The motion is objected to.

SOUTH AFRICAN MILITARY TEAM

(Draft Resolution)

Mr C H H HUNSINGER: Hon Chairperson, I hereby move on behalf of the DA without notice:

- (1) notes that between 20 July and 6 August this year, the
 South African military team, under the leadership of
 Lieutenant Colonel Uys van der Westhuizen, participated
 in the annual International Military Skills competition;
- (2) further notes that the competition was held in Spain this year, and we saw our military team compete against teams from around the world in disciplines testing their ability and combat readiness in a competition style of extreme events;

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 86 of 196

(3) acknowledges that the South African military team did exceptionally well, clinching several first and second positions;

- (4) further acknowledges that one such remarkable achievement by our soldiers, was that of Colonel Hlophe who competed in target shooting with a strange rifle where he scored an extraordinary 174 out of 180;
- (5) recognises that the team received a standing ovation during the prize giving and closing ceremony, and that particular mention was made of the good behaviour and professional conduct of team South Africa;
- (6) thanks Lieutenant Colonel Uys van der Westhuizen, a fellow resident of Malmesbury in the Swartland, Western Cape, for his leadership and dedication, which also earned him a special award for his contribution as a member of the international judging panel;
- (7) further thanks the entire South African team for their hard work and for flying our flag high on the international stage; and

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 87 of 196

(8) congratulates the South African military team for their remarkable achievements.

I thank you.

Agreed to.

PASSING ON OF SINGAPORE'S FORMER PRESIDENT

(Draft Resolution)

Mr J L MAHLANGU: Hon Chair, the ANC moves without notice:

- (1) notes with sadness the passing on of Singapore's former

 President Sellapan Ramanathan Nathan, on Monday, 22 August
 2016;
- (2) further notes that he was Singapore's sixth, and the longest serving President, and he served that country from 1999 to 2011;

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 88 of 196

(3) recalls that President Nathan started his career in the civil service in 1955, as a medical social worker, and was transferred to the Ministry of Foreign Affairs in 1966 as assistant secretary, and where he rose to be the deputy secretary;

- (4) further recalls that he also served in the Ministries of
 Home Affairs as well as Defence before his return in 1979
 to the Foreign Ministry to become its first permanent
 secretary until 1992;
- (5) recognises that President Nathan is credited, and will be remembered with launching Singapore's President's Challenge charity initiative in support of his vision of a compassionate Singapore; and
- (6) extends its most sincere condolences to the government and the people of Singapore.

I thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Thank you very much. Is there any objection?

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 89 of 196

Ms N R MASHABELA: Please note the objection of the EFF.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): The objection is noted. Thank you.

WOMEN ACKNOWLEDGED

(Draft Resolution)

Mr J M K MAHUMAPELO: Chairperson, I move without notice:

- (1) notes that we are reaching the end of the Women's Month,, August 2016, which marks 60 years since the historical women's march, where more than 20 000 remarkably brave women of all races and backgrounds marched to the Union Buildings to register their rejection to all forms of oppression;
- (2) acknowledges the following remarkable women: Caster

 Semenya who has won the Spar Athlete of the Year award,

 and she also won a gold medal at the 2016 Rio Olympic

 Games; and Sheana Abrahams, the top female beach

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 90 of 196

volleyball athlete who has appeared on prestigious TV life style shows, who is also a biokineticist by profession where her job entails developing exercises to help people improve their health and fitness; unfortunately she could not represent South Africa at the Rio 2016 because the South African volleyball team did not finish the qualifying process; and

(3) congratulates these remarkable women for flying the South African flag high.

Agreed to.

JOHANNESBURG ANC COUNCILLOR DIES

(Draft Resolution)

Ms L A MNGANGA-GCABASHE: Chairperson, I move without notice:

That the House -

(1) notes with great sadness the untimely death of the ANC

Johannesburg Councillor Nonhlanhla Mthembu, who died

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 91 of 196

during the first sitting of council on Monday, 22 August 2016;

- (2) further notes that she had just celebrated her 50th birthday, when she collapsed shortly after mayoral candidates were nominated;
- (3) recalls that Nonhlanhla Mthembu was a long standing member of the ANC, and she was an active member since the 1980s;
- (4) further recalls that she has been a Johannesburg councillor in the 2011 to 2016 term of office, and have been re-elected to serve another five years when she passed on;
- (5) Ms L A Mnganga-Gcabashe believes that she devoted her life to serving her community, and that her departure is a huge loss to them;
- (6) further believes that her untimely death will be a loss to the new council, and to the City of Johannesburg; and

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 92 of 196

(7) conveys its condolences to Nonhlanhla Mthembu's family, relatives, friends and to the ANC.

Ms H O HLOPHE: No, Chairperson, we don't object, but we, as EFF, send our condolences to the family of Nonhlanhla Mthembu.

Agreed to.

BUSY WEEK FOR CAPE TOWN METRO POLICE

(Draft Resolution)

Mr Z N MBHELE: Chairperson, I move without notice:

That the House -

(1) notes the string of successes achieved by the Metro

Police Department of the City of Cape Town last week as

part of its fight against crime, in particular the

recovery of a hijacked vehicle during operations when

officers manning a vehicle checkpoint at Mew Way in

Khayelitsha stopped a motorist and noticed that his car

licence disc and number plate did not correspond;

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 93 of 196

(2) further notes the arrest of a 24-year old suspect in

Hanover Park for possession of an unlicensed firearm and
ammunition by members of the Metro Police Gang and Drug

Task Team, as well as the arrest of another suspect in

Parow after Metro Police officers received a tip-off
about an illegal firearm being kept at the premises;

- (3) also notes the arrest of five suspects for possession of stolen goods and housebreaking implements in Hanover Park, Ravensmead, Uitsig and Eureka Park by the city's law enforcement Social Housing Unit;
- (4) acknowledges that these incidents are proof of the quality of policing that Metro Police in Cape Town is delivering, in conjunction with tip-offs from the public; and
- (5) congratulates the Cape Town Metro Police for the work they are doing on a daily basis and calls on the public to appreciate their efforts to make our communities safer.

Agreed to.

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 94 of 196

ARCHBISHOP DESMOND TUTU HOSPITALISED

(Draft Resolution)

Ms L A MNGANGA-GCABASHE: Chairperson, I move without notice:

- (1) notes with great concern the news that Archbishop Emeritus

 Desmond Tutu has checked into a Cape Town hospital, on

 Wednesday, 24 August 2016;
- (2) further notes that he is hospitalised for a recurring infection, a bug that put the former cleric in hospital for a week last year;
- (3) understand that he is expected to remain in hospital for some time, probably a week or two;
- (4) wishes Archbishop Emeritus Desmond Tutu a speedy recovery; and
- (5) urges all South Africans to keep the Archbishop in their prayers during this time of need.

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 95 of 196

Agreed to.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon members, that concludes motions without notice. Before we go to members' statements, last week hon Nkwankwa raised an issue on the motions without notice that all the smaller parties should be included. Indeed, we have tried to get clarity on that matter and I wish to inform the House that the matter will be taken to the Rules Committee for further consideration. Thank you very much. We now proceed to members' statements.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: House Chairperson, I would like to address you in terms of Rule 132(5), if I may. Last week during the members' statements, I made a point of order that this is the most poorly attended session by the Ministers. I think in the history of the Fourth and Fifth Parliaments we only had Deputy Ministers available to respond. I note again today that there are only eight or nine Ministers in the House to answer members' statements. There are some portfolios that members would make statements and there will be no response from the commensurate Ministers.

The Speaker undertook to take it up with the Leader of Government Business and I would like to request you that, at the

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 96 of 196

next meeting of the Rules Committee, there is feedback given to this House about what we are going to do to ensure that Ministers are in the House to answer to their responsibilities in terms of the Constitution.

There is no point for dumping this to the end of he programme where Ministers are not here to take them. I think we will be wrong to pick out the Ministers that are here and I think we should proceed. We thank them for being here and for showing diligence. It is the errant Ministers who are never here for members' statements that need to be taken care of. Hon Zulu can scream and shout as much as she want, but that is the truth [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon member, I think you have made your point. As the Speaker has promised ...

[Interjections.] I'm talking to you, hon Steenhuisen. You raised a matter and I am trying to respond. [Interjections.]

Yes, listen to me. Hon members, that will be taken care of and your proposal is accepted. Thank you very much.

Mr N L S NKWANKWA: House Chairperson, grant my atonement for disturbing you. The issue here, once again remember, is the matter about the motions without notice and the cycles, and the

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 97 of 196

fact that we spoke about it that it has to accommodate smaller parties. We are discussing it for the second week. This whole matter has turned me, if not a spokesperson for smaller parties, to be an activist for smaller parties.

The principle is very basic. We can't allow a situation where both the intent and the confusion around the new dispensation of Rules only seem to be affecting smaller parties and not other parties - it can't be; it is unfair. As a result I heard about the confusion in so far as the notices of motions again. Actually, my office and staff were told that you are going to follow a certain statement cycle or whatever. I have a notice of motion, Chair. While I agree with you when you say that we must take the matter to the Rules Committee in terms of dealing with it, but I would like to be given an opportunity to pass my notice of motions when the time comes, and I would like that to be the practice from today until we deal with the matter in the Rules Committee. We can't have a situation where we must understand all the time. This confusion is affecting us as smaller parties. If there are smaller parties today in the House that want to move a motion without notice, they must be allowed to do so. If there are smaller parties that want to move a notice of motion must also be allowed to do so until we resolve the matter.

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 98 of 196

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon Nkwankwa, I believe with notices of motion that is covered. The only confusion was in the motions without notice. If you look at the guide, all parties are included in the notices of motion. I get what you are saying. For now, because we have been given this, you cannot propose to me that I continue with motions without notice. I have closed that and we are now on members' statements. Hon Nkwankwa, please!

Mr N L S NKWANKWA: No, thank you. I am not going to take you back to the motions without notice. We have already done that as the UDM by the way. But the issue is that the communication to my office was different from what you have in front of you in terms of notices of motion, even though I do have it here.

Batoyitoya nje bethetha into engekhoyo, bebengekho kwezi
ntlanganiso kwaye bayacaphukisa. Le nto iyasichaphazela thina
singamaqela amancinci. [They are making a noise for nothing;
they did not attend these meetings and they are making me angry.
This affects the smaller parties.]

... what must we say? Yes, we can't.

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 99 of 196

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Can I just assure you that on notices of motion all parties are included.

Mr N F SHIVHAMBU: Chairperson, as a matter of principle we will agree tomorrow in the Chief Whips' Forum that all political parties that are represented in this Parliament must have at least one opportunity to give a motion without notice in a spirit of multiparty system of democracy. I think that is what we are going to agree tomorrow. I am sure we are going to agree with the hon Chief Whip of the Majority Party. It was a mistake that was agreed upon that smaller parties can come on certain days and or not on certain days. It then declares them to be nonentities which is wrong and this undermines the Constitution. I think we will handle it tomorrow and on Thursday in the Programming Committee.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon Shivambu, I really understand you. Let's not continue to emphasise. I think we are agreeing that this matter will be dealt with.

MEASURES MAKING BBBEE MORE ACCESSIBLE AND ROBUST

(Member's Statement)

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 100 of 196

Ms J L FUBBS (ANC): House Chairperson, the ANC welcomes the measures being put in place to make the Broad-Based Black Economic Empowerment, BBBEE, Commission more accessible to communities and businesses not only in urban areas but also in rural areas. The BBBEE Commission is actively reaching out to ensure that this legislation achieves its goals. Many of the misunderstandings and complaints will now be more effectively dealt with through a variety of communication platforms which have kicked off through an information roadshow.

Hundreds of companies, verification professionals, government officials and auditors have taken advantage of the road show aimed at raising awareness about BBBEE and the role of the commission. The Director of Compliance at the BBBEE Commission, Ms Busisiwe Ngwenya, highlighted this accessibility measures which include not only a hotline but a variety of communication platforms enabling the ordinary person to have easy access. Regular meetings, workshops, distribution of educational material and newsletters will underpin the roadshows which began in Bellville in Cape Town last week.

The threshold on major BBBEE transactions that qualify for registration with the BBBEE Commission will be issued by the Minister of Trade and Industry, Dr Rob Davies. I thank you.

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 101 of 196

DEMOCRATIC ALLIANCE LAUNCHES AN ATTACK ON DEPUTY MINISTER, KEBBY MAPHATSOE

(Member's Statement)

Mr D J MAYNIER (DA): House Chairperson, now you know you are doing something right when MKMVA's chief cook and bottle washer, the hon Kebby Maphatsoe, attacks you. And that is because we all know that hon Kebby Maphatsoe says what President Jacob Zuma really thinks.

Yesterday, the hon Kebby Maphatsoe, supported by the hon Des van Rooyen, the shortest serving Finance Minister in the history of our country ... [Laughter.] ... attacked the Minister of Finance because he said, and I quote, " ... people should rise up to defend him because there are people who are about to loot the money of the people."

Now we all know why the hon Kebby Maphatsoe attacked the Minister. And that is because the minister has decided to stand up against looting, principally by the Guptas. I have called the hon Kebby Maphatsoe an idiot in the past and I will call him an idiot here today because we all know that in the end ... [Interjections.]

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 102 of 196

Mr B A RADEBE: On a point of order, House Chair.

Mr D J MAYNIER: ... the hon chief cook and bottle washer is an
idiot. [Interjections.]

Mr B A RADEBE: House Chairperson?

Mr D J MAYNIER: He knows it is the truth ... [Interjections.]

Mr B A RADEBE: House Chairperson, on a point of order.

Mr D J MAYNIER: ... we know it's the truth and he cannot retreat from that fact. [Applause.]

Mr B A RADEBE: Hon Maynier has just called the Deputy Minister an idiot. That is offensive language. Can you rule on that?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon member, did you call the Minister an idiot?

Mr D J MAYNIER: House Chairperson, I am surprised that the hon member raised the question because nobody knows better than him that the hon Kebby Maphatsoe is an idiot.

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 103 of 196

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon Maynier, did you call the Deputy Minister an idiot? That is what I want. Yes or no?

Mr D J MAYNIER: House Chairperson, I did call the hon Deputy
Minister ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Can you withdraw that?

Mr D J MAYNIER: ... an idiot.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Can you withdraw that because we know that offensive language is not allowed in the House. Hon Maynier?

Mr D J MAYNIER: House Chairperson, with respect, I cannot withdraw the statement because the Deputy Minister ...

[Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon Maynier, please, we know that offensive language is not allowed in the House. Would you please withdraw?

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 104 of 196

Mr D J MAYNIER: House Chairperson, with respect, I will not withdraw my statement that the hon Kebby Maphatsoe chief bottle washer and chief of MKMVA is an idiot.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon Maynier, we do not want the House to degenerate; and you know that offensive language is not allowed in the House. I will ask you again for the last time; please withdraw calling the Deputy Minister an idiot in the House.

Mr D J MAYNIER: House Chairperson, with respect, I refuse to withdraw.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon Maynier, you give me no option but to ask you to leave the House.

Mr D J MAYNIER: House Chairperson, I will respect your ruling and leave the House.

GUPTA FAMILY'S INTENTION TO LEAVE SOUTH AFRICA

(Member's Statement)

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 105 of 196

Ms H O HLOPHE (EFF): House Chairperson, the EFF notes the statement by the Gupta family which wants to run away after we, as EFF, exposed their shenanigans including state capture. The zupta criminals have enriched themselves, stolen our tax money and rendered key state-owned institutions useless. The Passenger Rail Agency of South Africa, Prasa, crisis has Gupta at the centre of it.

Batyile aba bafo kodwa bona basiphathela ipleyiti enokutya okutshisayo kuphela. [These men have eaten but they have given us a plate with hot food.]

They toppled Denel's previous board to replace it with a group of directors approve by them to loot without disturbance. These are just few examples among a trail of destructions zupta has left behind in many more state-owned companies. We call on the relevant authorities to accelerate the investigation before they run away.

There is a prima facie case and sufficient evidence for relevant authorities to seize all their assets, their cash in particular, before they start, in fact they have already started: They illegally move billions of rands to Dubai with the assistance of Jacob Zuma. These are the people who must ... [Interjections.]

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 106 of 196

Mr B A RADEBE: Hon House Chair, on a point of order: We have His Excellency, the President and not Zuma. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon Hlophe, a point of order with regard to the name, Jacob Zuma. This is not accepted. Can we please refer to all members as hon members or Mr President.

Ms H O HLOPHE: They move billions of rands to Dubai ...
[Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon member, please.

Ms H O HLOPHE: Yes, I am doing that House Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Okay.

Ms H O HLOPHE: They illegally move billions of rands to Dubai with the assistance of Mr Jacob Zuma. These are people who must be arrested.

Mr B A RADEBE: On a point of order, House Chair.

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 107 of 196

Ms H O HLOPHE: The state must do everything possible to recover the stolen money ... [Interjections.]

Mr B A RADEBE: The member must provide a substantive motion for that, because ... [Inaudible.]

Ms H O HLOPHE: ... by the Guptas. The people they have placed in various state-owned companies and government departments,

Ministers in their pockets and their business associates must be arrested before they leave the country too. We cannot allow

Mzansi Africa to become a banana republic over a plate of curry.

[Time expired.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon members, you know very well that if you are going to raise issues like that you need to have a substantive motion.

ANC WELCOMES SIGNIFICANT AND TIMELY INJECTION OF R16,2 BILLION INTO INCENTIVES TO PROMOTE MANUFACTURING

(Member's Statement)

Mr A J WILLIAMS (ANC): The ANC welcomes the significant and timely injection of R16,2 billion into the incentives to promote

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 108 of 196

manufacturing, small business and co-operatives. This financial injection together with the maximum increase of tariffs underpins the ANC-led government's determination to respond realistically and robustly to everything that still pose as a critical challenge to industrialisation in South Africa, specifically in the production, manufacturing and processing sectors.

The ANC further wishes to encourage the private sector to increase its investment in South Africa because only working together we can do more. I thank you.

ANC WANTS RERUN OF LOCAL ELECTIONS AT JOZINI AFTER LOSING

(Member's Statement)

Mr M HLENGWA (IFP): Hon House Chairperson, during the campaign we were bombarded with people saying we are not scared of dabbing!

Post elections there was uvalo [nervousness] after the major drubbing and that is the case at Jozini where the ANC, on three occasions, requested the caucus and left because they do not want them ... [Inaudible.] ... there to be constituted. I hope

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 109 of 196

the people of Jozini know that the people who are a roadblock to service delivery is the ANC. They request five minute caucuses and leave and never come back because they know that uvalo [nervousness] is living amongst them on a daily basis. At Jozini and uMkhanyakude there is a drought and a problem of water. The municipality ... [Inaudible.] ... could not be constituted without Jozini being constituted. The ANC now wants a rerun of those elections. The message is very clear: you can run but you cannot hide. If you want a rerun you will get it. We are going to drub you again because the people know ...

... ukuthi nikwenza ngoba nifuna izikhundla. Anifuni ukuthi umkhandlu ukhethe. Abantu bayahlupheka, amanzi awekho.

Niyabaleka. Amagwala eniyiwona kuyasabisa ukuthi senaba yiqembu lamagwala hhayi elomzabalazo. (Translation in isiZulu follows.)

[... that you are in it for positions. You don't want the council to elect people. People are suffering, they have no water. You are running away. You are cowards, it is scary that you have now became a party of cowards and not a liberation movement.]

Get back into the chamber of Jozini and let us elect a council.

But, if you want a rerun, rest assured you will find us waiting

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 110 of 196

for you. You cannot continue to do this at the expense of the people, compounding their poverty and suffering, all because you ... [Interjections.] ... [Inaudible.] ... [Time expired.]

CHALLENGES IN TRANSFORMING THE CONSTRUCTION INDUSTRY

(Member's Statement)

Mr M L W FILTANE (UDM): Hon House Chair, the transformation of the construction industry remains a challenge for our economic development. This fact was confirmed by the Construction Industry Development Board, CIBD, and the small emerging contractors during the stakeholder liaison meeting held four days ago in East London.

The CIBD reported that the fragmented prescriptions for construction procurement are a problem. Government departments failed to co-operate on updates. Current legislation limits the CIBD's legal scope for dealing with fraud, collusion and corruption. The current Act does not assist the transformation agenda of the sector.

The Social Media Marketing Contractors, SMMC, added the following concerns, amongst others, that CIBD has limited the

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 111 of 196

scope of the opportunities in the industry by giving less attention to manufacturing and supply; lack of key performance-guided monitoring from CIDB; and a lack of capacity building programmes targeting small and emerging contractors so that they are able to grow within the industry and poor contractor support from the regional offices of the CIDB.

These challenges point to a poor or lack of decisive political support from the relevant Ministry. In fact, it appears that many, if not the majority, of similar state institutions are not getting the necessary political support from government to deliver on their mandates. Consequently, a whopping sum of R13 billion meant for infrastructure development was returned to the national fiscus due to lack of capacity and co-operation by other government departments in this sphere. They are created and left alone without effective monitoring and evaluation. This tendency has cascaded down to similar institutions in the local sphere of government. Thank you [Time expired.]

PROGRESSIVE YOUTH ALLIANCE WINS ALL COUNCIL SEATS AT WITS UNIVERSITY'S STUDENT REPRESENTATIVE COUNCIL

(Member's Statement)

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 112 of 196

Ms C SEPTEMBER (ANC): Chairperson, the ANC congratulates the Progressive Youth Alliance, PYA — composed of the ANC Youth League, the South African Students Congress, SASCO, the Young Communists League of South Africa, YCL, together with the Muslim Students` Association, MSA — at Wits University on their decisive victory in the Wits University Student Representative Council, SRC, elections, taking 100% of the council seats. The Progressive Youth Alliance claimed all 15 seats on the 2016-2017 SRC, thrashing the EFF-DA Coalition which could not even manage a single seat.

This is a clear demonstration of the student's continued confidence in the able and progressive leadership of the Progressive Youth Alliance. We are certain that the PYA-led SRC will continue with its selfless service to the students.

We congratulates other universities such Fort Hare for choosing the PYA as their SRC during their centenary celebration. The resounding victory by the PYA at one of Africa's biggest and influential institutions of higher learning is an unambiguous testament to the fact that the ANC continues to be the only hope and future for the young people in this country. I thank you.

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 113 of 196

CONCERN ABOUT ONGOING CONFLICT BETWEEN THE MINISTER OF FINANCE MR PRAVIN GORDHAN AND THE HAWKS

(Member's Statement)

Rev K J R MESHOE (ACDP): House Chairperson, the ACDP is gravely concerned about the ongoing conflict between the Minister of Finance, Mr Pravin Gordhan, and the Hawks. We believe that this conflict is having a devastating impact on our economy, with the rand weakening significantly against other currencies and the prospect of sovereign credit downgrade looming large.

We believe Minister Gordhan and the National Treasury need to be supported at the time as attempts at state capture and attempts at looting the state's coffers continue unabated.

There is a need to stand firm in refusing further guarantees for bankrupt state-owned enterprises — including South African

Airways who are seeking R16 billion in extra funding — until good governance is restored. The scandals surrounding Prasa and Eskom also need to be looked at. It is clear that there are sinister forces afoot who want Minister Gordhan removed and who seek to control National Treasury.

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 114 of 196

South Africans need to rally behind Minister Gordhan and National Treasury at this time to avoid further state capture and looting and prevent an economic disaster from taking place in our nation.

Further, the ACDP believes that Parliament needs to play a far greater oversight role in the governance of and awarding of a multibillion rand tenders by state-owned companies. Thank you.

ALLEGED RACISM TOWARDS BLACK LEARNERS AT THE PRETORIA HIGH SCHOOL

(Member's Statement)

Ms N R MOKOTO (ANC): Chair, the ANC is concerned about the alleged racist conduct directed at black learners at the Pretoria High School for Girls. This is after a pupil who presented an assignment highlighting inequality in South Africa was unfairly treated and was allegedly taken to the principal's office and reportedly threatened with suspension. Moreover, fellow black pupils protested against the school's hair policy and for being questioned whenever they were in groups of two or more. They also claim they were barred from using their home languages in private discussions.

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 115 of 196

It is very disappointing that this incident happened after more than 21 years of our country's concerted efforts at nation-building and reconciliation, which saw discriminatory laws abolished and segregated institutions replaced by unified ones.

The ANC calls upon the school to step up its efforts at changing some of the rules in its code of conduct that have kept many girls oppressed.

The ANC further wants to commend the interventions made by the Gauteng provincial MEC for Education, as well as parents, pupils, the governing body and the management for their cooperation and commitment to investigate and find an amicable solution which can lead to the end of racism at the school. I thank you.

CORRUPTION IN HOUSING ALLOCATIONS IN THE MOOKGOPHONG MUNICIPALITY

(Member's Statement)

Ms D VAN DER WALT (DA): Hon House Chair, when voters rejected the ANC in the Mookgophong Municipality in the local government elections, it was not just because of the R112 million owed to

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 116 of 196

creditors. It was also because of blatant ANC corruption in housing allocations.

I have here several affidavits from residents of Extension Three who say they were told they were not on the housing list because they could not prove they were members of the ANC. To get on to the list all of them had to give proof that they were ANC members by having an ANC sticker placed in their ID books like the one I have here with me. No sticker meant no house. I have here — I can show it to you — an example as of such an ID with a sticker on the back.

Minister Sisulu, it is actually the time that you swop the Jimmy Choos for takkies and get on to ground and investigate this. I have the evidence here. If you are interested I will gladly give it to you.

From our side, the newly elected DA councillor will approach the province to redo the housing list so that houses are allocated to those who deserve them, not just ANC party members.

THE UDF'S 33RD ANNIVERSARY COMMEMORATION

(Member's Statement)

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 117 of 196

Ms B ABRAHAMS (ANC): House Chairperson, on Saturday,

27 August 2016, the ANC in the Western Cape commemorated the

33rd anniversary of the United Democratic Front, UDF, at the

historic Trafalgar High School in District 6. This event was

attended by UDF veterans, activists, leaders and representatives

of mass democratic and progressive formations, fraternal

organisations, alliances and league structures, ordinary members

and supporters of the ANC.

The ANC's national chairperson, Baleka Mbethe, addressed the event.

The UDF was launched nationally at a meeting at Michelle Plain on 20 August 1983 as a force against the apartheid regime. It played a crucial role at a critical moment in our history, entrenching and deepening the struggle whilst other political organisations were burned and unable to organise.

After its formation, the UDF declared it wanted to establish a true democracy in which all South Africans could participate and create a single, nonracial and unfragmented South Africa. The ANC is proud of the role played by the UDF during this time in our country. Thank you.

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 118 of 196

BIGGEST CRISIS FACING OUR COUNTRY

(Member's Statement)

Mr M A PLOUAMMA (Agang SA): Hon Chair, Agang SA believes that the biggest crisis facing our country is an economy that still remains unchanged in the hands of white capitalists for almost 350 years. What these white capitalists have managed to do since 1994 has been to absorb a few freedom fighters into their circle while keeping the status quo and the economy as it was.

Our country is vulnerable to these economic monopolies. We must hasten the process of handing over the economy to the majority of South Africans. For South Africa to have real stability we cannot continue to have our natural resources in the hands of a few families. The process of handing over the economy to the majority of South Africans cannot be postponed; it must happen now. We cannot have a country where indigenous people are beggars, landless and reduced to hopelessness.

Our people are facing hardships and humiliation caused, in most instances, by the same people who used to oppress them. If we don't act, our democracy will soon turn into a fake. It will be painful to embark on this journey but we have no choice. We are

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 119 of 196

the last hope of freeing Africa from economic domination. I thank you.

A BOOST FOR TOWNSHIP BUSINESSES

(Member's Statement)

Ms Z S DLAMINI-DUBAZANA (ANC): Chairperson, the ANC welcomes a new initiative, the EZASE-KASI Business Fridays: National Campaign which was launched at the Century City conference centre on Friday, 26 August 2016.

This initiative is geared at boosting township economies and saving small businesses, and is the brainchild of local entrepreneur Siyanda Mtulu in conjunction with the National Development Plan and the Department of Tourism. This initiative envisages inviting a couple of companies every Friday from the corporate sector, and taking them into the townships to experience local businesses first hand. The initiative will also get them to see how they can be involved in developing black communities.

The ANC views this initiative a step in the right direction and believes that it will go a long way towards scaling up support

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 120 of 196

and expanding the number and viability of co-operatives and small businesses to achieve the country's development vision. We therefore call upon big business and corporate to support this initiative. I thank you.

ILLEGAL SALE OF SOUTH AFRICA'S STRATEGIC FUEL STOCK

(Member's Statement)

Mr M BAGRAIM (DA): Chairperson, an international oil trader says the sale of South Africa strategic fuel stock amounted to the theft of R2,2 billion. The trader says the way the sale was conducted in December last year meant it was structured solely to enrich the parties involved. The sale by the Central Energy fFund was made without permission of Treasury and thus contravenes the Public Finance Management Act, PMFA.

Minister of Energy, Ms Joemat-Pettersson, initially tried to fob this off by saying it was rotation of stock, and that the Central Energy Fund can buy back the fuel at any stage. It has since come to light that it was in fact not a rotation but an actual sale. If this were a rotation, the fuel would have been replaced simultaneously.

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 121 of 196

The decision by Ms Joemat-Pettersson to order the investigation of this deal is merely an attempt to distract attention away from her in this affair.

True investigators will have to ask this question, why did Minister Joemat-Pettersson approve the sale? The sale was at the rock-bottom price of \$28 a barrel with a murky tender process that was by invitation only. The Auditor-General has agreed to our request to investigate the sale in the normal way. This smells like another case of an ANC cadre enrichment scheme with the possibility that some of the huge profits were channelled into the failed ANC election campaign. Thank you.

ALLEGED COP KILLERS ARRESTED

(Member's Statement)

Mr M A DIRKS (ANC): The ANC commends the Hawks and Tactical Response Team for the arrest of two men aged between 25 and 32 years on Friday, 26 August who allegedly stabbed and killed police constable Johannes Putsoeli in the Free State earlier this year.

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 122 of 196

This arrest should serve as a lesson to criminals that there is no room for those who threaten the security of the country by waging war against police officers, and that the killers of police officers will be removed from society and brought to justice.

The ANC appeals to the community to work with the police to apprehend police killers. The ANC, for its part, will continue to provide greater support for the SAPS, especially to combat the attacks on the members of the SAPS - including through introducing legislative measures to protect law enforcement officials in the execution of their duties. I thank you.

CHALLENGES IN TRANSFORMING THE CONSTRUCTION INDUSTRY

(Minister's Response)

The MINISTER OF PUBLIC WORKS: Hon Chairperson, the hon Filtane from the UDM knows that the issues he is raising about the Construction Industry Development Board, CIBD, are in the programme that is moving into all the provinces to invite all contractors especially the small contractors to attend workshops on issues of grading and so on.

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 123 of 196

The hon member knows that, that is a problem we are dealing with. And that is part of the fundamental restructuring of these regulatory bodies which did not have any teeth from the side of the Ministry. They were more like regulatory bodies. Earlier attempts to restructure these regulatory bodies were resisted. People threatened to go to court whence trying to protect the privileges of the past. So, we are now fundamentally restructuring them. And we are inviting all the members who are interested in the construction industry to attend these workshops so that when we bring to this House legislation that seeks to change the operations of those entities, you do not resist but move with us. Thank you very much.

ANC WANTS RERUN OF LOCAL ELECTIONS AT JOZINI AFTER LOSING

(Minister's Response)

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS:
Hon House Chair ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Order, hon members!

Continue, hon Minister.

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 124 of 196

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS:
... in response to the question raised by the hon Hlengwa about
Jozini and uMkhanyakude District Municipalities, our noble
Constitution under section 139(1)(a)(b) and (c) provides for the
executive authority to intervene in municipalities that are
unable to execute their executive obligations as stipulated in
the Constitution. Now, Jozini and uMkhanyakude, as we are
speaking ... [Interjections.]

HON MEMBER: Uyabheda wena. [You are crazy.]

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS:
... the relevant MEC is currently working together with our Back
to Basics Crack Team to resolve the situation there.

However, I must indicate that we are not going to hesitate to effect the provisions of the Constitution if the situation is not appropriately resolved in the two municipalities.

I must indicate that it is in our interest that service delivery is provided to our people in Jozini and uMkhanyakude. Thank you very much. [Applause.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Order, hon members!

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 125 of 196

CORRUPTION ON HOUSING ALLOCATIONS IN THE MOOKGOPHONG MUNICIPALITY

(Minister's Response)

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Hon House Chair, to the hon Jimmy Choles from the DA, the issue on housing, especially on allocation, is something that we have been dealing with over a long period of time. The matter that you have come across, if indeed the facts that you have there are true, is very common. On one occasion when we, together with the President, also accompanied by the MEC for Housing in the Western Cape, attended a public meeting with the N2 residence, everybody who stood up to speak in that meeting complained about the very same thing that you are also raising in as far as the DA in the Western Cape is concerned. We then took the decision ... [Interjections.] ... It is true. By the time when you bring your file, I will give you the one that is from the media because it covers those complains. [Applause.] You can actually ask the MEC to elaborate on this in your caucus whether it is perception or not. What we have done is that we took the powers of municipalities and established a centrally-based housing allocation system. We took this decision a long time ago. [Interjections.] It means you must have been sleeping and

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 126 of 196

dreaming about your takkies while we were dealing with this matter. [Laughter.]

It is a matter that we took a decision about, because we were very concerned. We have a central data base. [Interjections.]

Well, I will give you a file from the Western Cape as well.

However, that is exactly why we took a decision because we encountered the same problems that you are bringing to me. Bring that to me and we will make sure that, just as much as the kwaLanga in the Western Cape is a priority for us, this issue becomes a priority for you as well. However, it is a common problem ... [Interjections.] ... It is fine. Thank you for bringing it to my attention, I am advising you that it is a common problem across the country, including and especially in those areas where you govern. [Time expired.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Thank you, hon Minister. Hon members, I did indicate about the issue of clocks here. But mine is correct, so I will stick to it. Hon Deputy Minister Surty.

ALLEGED RACISM TOWARDS BLACK LEARNERS AT PRETORIA HIGH SCHOOL

(Minister's Response)

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 127 of 196

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION: Hon Chairperson, the Constitution which is the supreme law of the country is underpinned by values and those values are human dignity, equality and freedom. The Constitution further entrenches and embeds 11 official languages and enjoins us to treat all of them with equal parity and esteem.

Furthermore, the Constitution allows for freedom of expression, the Bill of Rights in particular, and it also protects diversity of religious, cultural and other believes.

I raise these issues within the context of the fact that when integration took place post-1994, the codes of conducts of schools that were previously homogeneous, had not been aligned to the integrated environment as was created by the new dispensation. Consequently, those codes of conduct had not been consistent with the Constitution.

Therefore, in the three issues that we raised: One, in relation to the censorship that occurred in addressing the issues of socioeconomic inequality, which is something that was certainly unconstitutional and incorrect.

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 128 of 196

With regard to the issue of hair, previously the environment was homogeneous but now that we have diversity there should be tolerance. The hon members are reminded of the case in KwaZulu-Natal where the school was taken to the Constitutional Court because the school's code of conduct prohibited a learner from wearing a nose stud. The Constitutional Court felt that that was a cultural expression and should indeed be respected. The same would apply then to the manner in which hair is worn.

With regards to the language itself, I have clearly indicated that the Constitution says there should be parity of esteem of the languages and therefore, there should be tolerance and learners should be allowed to promote multilingualism. [Time expired.]

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Hon Chairperson, I am sorry.

My understanding from the Table earlier was that we agreed that
there would be six ministerial responses. Is that correct?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Yes, it is correct.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): We have used four opportunities. Is that correct?

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 129 of 196

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): I know.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Okay. I just wanted to check. So, only four opportunities have been taken.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Yes.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Thank you.

NOTICES OF MOTION

Ms J L FUBBS: House Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the ANC:

That the House debates how the tools of industrialisation such as localisation, public procurement, designations, and Broad-Based Black Economic Empowerment, BBBEE, which encompasses the Black Industrialist programme can drive, promote and advance higher value-added manufacturing to develop and sustain an inclusive economy.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: House Chairperson, following the Western Cape High Court's embarrassing judgement condemning

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 130 of 196

the terribly unethical conduct of this Parliament's Ethics Committee, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the DA:

That the House debates reconstitution and de-politicisation of the committee which will allow for an unbiased approach to holding all members of this House accountable.

Agreed to.

Mr M HLENGWA: House Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the IFP:

- (1) That the House debates the continuing scourge of racism in our schools following the most recent Pretoria Girls High hair incident;
- (2) Steps required to completely eradicate such apartheid style Codes of Conduct from our schools irrespective of whether they are private or public schools.

Agreed to.

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 131 of 196

Mr S C MNCWABE: House Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the NFP:

That the members deliberate on the escalation and cost associated with Ingula Pumped Storage Scheme, which is estimated to rise from R8,9 billion to R36 billion and the delay in completion which was scheduled for 2013.

Agreed to.

Ms N R MOKOTO: House Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the ANC:

That the House debates the impact of pro-poor programmes in enhancing the performance in education.

Agreed to.

Ms E N LOUW: House Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the EFF:

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 132 of 196

That the House debates the need to appoint a new South African Airways Board before the end of September and the reluctance of the South African Airways to submit a financial statement to be audited.

Agreed to.

Mr N L S KWANKWA: House Chairperson, in light of the poisonous and deadly fight for the control of state-owned enterprises by fears factions of the ruling party and the extent which this undermines efforts to resuscitate the South African economy, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the UDM:

That the House debates the role and function of state-owned enterprises in economic development in South Africa.

Agreed to

Ms C SEPTEMBER: House Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the ANC: 30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 133 of 196

That the House debates improving basic services especially to poor residing in backyards and in informal settlements.

Agreed to.

Ms Z S DLAMINI-DUBAZANA: House Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the ANC:

That the House debates the effectiveness of capable state.

Agreed to.

Mr M S F DE FREITAS: House Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the DA:

That the House debates the current shambolic state of the Passenger Rail Agency of South Africa, the attempt by the Minister to stop investigations into Prasa and what needs to be done to get Prasa back on track.

Agreed to.

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 134 of 196

Mr A J WILLIAMS: House Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the ANC:

That the House debates enabling the creation of a conducive environment and support services for small and medium enterprises.

Agreed to.

Dr P MAESELA: House Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the ANC:

That the House discusses ways to improve Primary Health Care as the foundation for Universal Health Coverage to benefit and improve the health status of the people.

Agreed to.

Dr M J FIGG: House Chairperson, I hereby give notice that in the light of the fact that the economy's focus to grow at 0% in 2016 and that 8,9 million people do not have jobs or have given up

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 135 of 196

looking for jobs, on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the DA:

The House debates the plans to boost economic growth and create jobs in South Africa.

Agreed to.

Mr M DIRKS: House Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the ANC:

That the House debates interventions to address the effects of drought in regard to food security.

Agreed to.

The House adjourned at 16:54.

ANNOUNCEMENTS, TABLINGS AND COMMITTEE REPORTS

FRIDAY, 26 AUGUST 2016

ANNOUNCEMENTS

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 136 of 196

National Assembly and National Council of Provinces

The Speaker and the Chairperson

NOTE: The following entry replaces the entry on page 2 of the ATC of 24 August 2016:

- 1. Bills passed by Houses to be submitted to President for assent
 - (1) Bill passed by National Council of Provinces on 24 August 2016:
 - (a) **Immigration Amendment Bill** [B 5 2016] (National Assembly sec 75).

COMMITTEE REPORTS

National Assembly and National Council of Provinces

1. REPORT OF THE JOINT COMMITTEE ON ETHICS AND MEMBERS'
INTERESTS AS AGREED AT ITS MEETING HELD ON 18 MAY 2016 AT M315.

REPORT (1) ON COMPLAINT PERTAINING TO MEMBERS' VOTES IN REPLY TO THE RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE AD HOC COMMITTEE ON THE REPORT OF THE MINISTER OF POLICE

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 137 of 196

The Office of the Registrar received a complaint dated 7 April 2016 which requested that the Joint Committee on Ethics and Members' Interests investigate a complaint pertaining to all members (See attached schedule of Members) who voted in favour of the *Report of Ad Hoc Committee on the Report of Minister of Police; in reply to recommendations of the Ad Hoc Committee on Report by the President regarding security upgrades at Nkandla Private Residence of the President (as tabled in the Announcements, Tablings and Committee Reports of 7 August 2015, p 3034)*.

It is alleged that because the Constitutional Court ruled in the matter of the EFF v Speaker of the NA and others (2016) ZACC11 that the resolution was invalid, consequently all members who voted in favour of the resolution are complicit in flouting the Constitution.

Consequently, the vote in favour of the resolution is a breach of Clause 4 as set out in the Code of Ethical Conduct and Disclosure for Assembly and Permanent Council Members (Code).

On the instruction of the Chairperson, a legal opinion was sought from the Parliamentary Legal Services. The legal opinion concludes that the Joint Committee on Ethics and Members' Interests have no jurisdiction to interrogate a decision of the House, or to question how individual Members voted on a specific question, or to hold Members responsible for their vote.

As the Committee has no jurisdiction to interrogate a decision of the House, the Committee is unable consider the complaint against all the Members named in the attached schedule.

REPORT (2) ON THE COMPLAINT AGAINST MINISTER N NHLEKO AND MINISTER T NXESI

On 16 February 2016, the Joint Committee on Ethics and Members' Interests ("the Committee") received a complaint in which it is alleged that the Minister of Police (Mr Nathi Nhleko) and the Minister of Public Works (Mr Thulas Nxesi) misled Parliament in their Report to Parliament on the Security upgrades at the Nkandla Residence of the President.

The complainant alleges that because President Zuma has conceded, in the Constitutional Court, that not all security upgrades were security-related and that he further stated that he is prepared to repay a portion of the costs, the Ministers misled Parliament in their report by finding to the contrary.

The allegations in the complaint referred to facts which formed part of the legal proceedings, and therefore at the meeting of 16 March 2016 the Registrar recommended that the Committee defer this complaint until the courts have made a ruling in respect of the matter, and when the facts have been established.

On 31 March 2016, the Constitutional Court handed down its judgement in *Economic Freedom Fighters v Speaker of the National Assembly and Others; Democratic Alliance v Speaker of the National Assembly and Others* [2016] ZACC 11. The Court ruled, *inter alia*,

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 139 of 196

that the findings of the Public Protector are binding and that her remedial action must be implemented.

In considering the matter, the Committee considered whether it has jurisdiction in respect of a complaint related to a Member's conduct in the House in the course and scope of fulfilling their role and obligations.

Section 57(1) of the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, regarding "Internal arrangements, proceedings and procedures of National Assembly", provides:

- (1) The National Assembly may-
 - (a) determine and control its internal arrangements, proceedings and procedures; and
 - (b) make rules and orders concerning its business, with due regard to representative and participatory democracy, accountability, transparency and public involvement.

The Rules of the National Assembly govern the conduct of Members during parliamentary proceedings including during the proceedings of committees.

The Joint Committee on Ethics and Members' Interests is established in terms of rule 121 of the Joint Rules of Parliament. Rule 124 of the Joint Rules sets out the functions of the Committee:

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 140 of 196

- (1) The Joint Committee on Ethics and Members' Interests must -
 - (a) implement the Code of Conduct for Assembly and permanent Council members set out in the Schedule;
 - (b) develop standards of ethical conduct for Assembly and Council members;
 - (c) serve as an advisory and consultative body, both generally and to members, concerning the implementation and interpretation of the Code;
 - (d) regularly review the Code and make recommendations for its amendment; and
 - (e) perform the other functions and exercise the other powers reasonably assigned to the Committee in the Code and in terms of resolutions adopted in both Houses.

In terms of the Code of Ethical Conduct and Disclosure of Members' Interests, the purpose and scope of the Code include to 'provide a framework of reference for Members of Parliament when discharging their duties and responsibilities"; to outline "the minimum ethical standards of behaviour that South Africans expect of public representatives, including upholding propriety, integrity and ethical values in their conduct"; and to "create public trust and confidence in public representatives and to protect the integrity of Parliament".

The Committee agreed that the allegations against the Ministers relate to conduct that occurred during proceedings of the National Assembly and its committees. Such conduct is governed by the Rules of the National Assembly. Accordingly, this matter would fall outside the jurisdiction of the Joint Committee on Ethics and Members' Interests. The complaint falls outside the scope of the Committee.

PAGE: 141 of 196

N A Masondo

A Singh

Co- Chairperson

Co-Chairperson

Schedule

Abrahams. BL

Adams, F

Adams, PE

Bam-Mugwanya, V

Bapela, KO

Basson, JV

Bekwa, SD

Beukman, F

Bhengu, NR

Bhengu, P

Bilankulu, NK

Bongo, BT

Booi, MS

Boroto, MG

Brown, L

Capa, N

Capa, RN

Carrim, YI

Cele, MA

Chikunga, LS

Chiloane, TD

Chohan, FI

Chueu, MP

Cronin, JP

Davies, RH

Didiza, AT

Dlakude, DE

Dlamini, BO

Dlamini-Dubazana, ZS

Dlomo, BJ

Dlulane, BN

Dunjwa, ML

Frolick, CT

Fubbs, JL

Gamede, DD

Gcwabaza, NE

Gigaba, KMN

Gina, N

Gumede, DM

Hanekom, DA

Holomisa, SP

Jeffery, JH

Johnson, M

Kalako, MU

Kekana, CD

Kekana, E

Kekana, HB

Kenye, TE

Khoarai, LP

Khosa, DH

Khoza, MB

Khoza, TZM

Khunou, NP

Kilian, JD

Koornhof, GW

Koornhof, NJJ

Kubayi, MT

Landers, LT

Lesoma, RMM

Letsatsi-Duba, DB

Loliwe, FS

Luyenge, Z

Luzipo, S

Mabasa, X

Mabe, BP

Mabe, PP

Mabija, L

Mabilo, SP

Madella, AF

Madlopha, CQ

Maesela, P

Mafolo, MV

Magadla, NW

Magadzi, DP

Magwanishe, G

Mahambehlala, T

Mahlalela, AF

Mahlangu, DG

Mahlangu, JL

Mahlobo, MD

Maila, MSA

Majola, FZ

Makhubela-Mashele, LS

Makhubele, ZS

Makondo, T

Makwetla, SP

Malgas, HH

Maluleke, BJ

Maluleke, JM

Manana, DP

Manana, MNS

Mandela, ZMD

Maphatsoe, ERK

Mapulane, MP

Masango, MSA

Masehela, EKM

Maseko, LM

Mashego-Dlamini, KC

Mashile, BL

Masondo, NA

Masuku, MB

Masutha, TM

Maswanganyi, MJ

Mathale, CC

Mathebe, DH

Matlala, MH

Matshoba, MO

Matsimbi, C

Mavunda, RT

Maxegwana, HM

Mbalula, FA

Mchunu, S

Mdakane, MR

Memela, TC

Mjobo, LN

Mkongi, BM

Mmemezi, HMZ

Mmola, MP

Mmusi, SG

Mnganga-Gcabashe, LA

Mnguni, D

Mnguni, PJ

Mogotsi, VP

Mokoto, NR

Molebatsi, MA

Molewa, BEE

Morutoa, MR

Mosala, I

Mothapo, MRM

Motimele, MS

Motsoaledi, PA

Mthembu, JM

Mthembu, N

Mthethwa, EM

Mudau, AM

Muthambi, AF

Nchabeleng, ME

Ndaba, CN

Ndongeni, N

Nel, AC

Nene, NM

Nesi, BA

Ngcobo, BT

Ngwenya-Mabila, PC

Nkadimeng, MF

Nobanda, GN

November, NT

Ntombela, MLD

Nxesi, TW

Nyalungu, RE

Nyambi, HV

Nzimande, BE

Oliphant, GG

Oliphant, MN

Pandor, GNM

Patel, E

Peters, ED

Phaahla, MJ

Phosa, YN

Pikinini, IA

Pilane-Majake, MCC

Radebe, BA

Radebe, GS

Radebe, JT

Ralegoma, SM

Ramaphosa, MC

Ramatlakane, L

Ramokhoase, TRJE

Rantho, DZ

Raphuti, DD

Scheepers, MA

Semenya, MR

September, CC

Shabangu, S

Shope-Sithole, SCN

Sibande, MP

Sisulu, LN

Siwela, EK

Sizani, PS

Skosana, JJ

PAGE: 149 of 196

Skwatsha, M

Smith, VG

Sotyu, MM

Surty, ME

Thomson, B

Tleane, SA

Tobias, TV

Tom, XS

Tongwane, TMA

Tseke, GK

Tseli, RM

Tsoleli, SP

Tsotetsi, DR

Tuck, A

Van Schalkwyk, SR

Williams, AJ

Xego-Sovita, ST

Yengeni, LE

Zokwana, S

TUESDAY, 30 AUGUST 2016

ANNOUNCEMENTS

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 150 of 196

National Assembly and National Council of Provinces

- 1. Classification of Bills by Joint Tagging Mechanism (JTM)
 - (1) The JTM in terms of Joint Rule 160(6) classified the following Bill as a section 75 Bill:
 - (a) **Liquor Products Amendment Bill** [B 10 2016] (National Assembly sec 75).

TABLINGS

National Assembly and National Council of Provinces

- 1. The Minister of Justice and Correctional Services
 - (a) Second Report of the National Forum on the Legal Profession, tabled in terms of section 98(4) of the Legal Practice Act, 2014 (Act No 28 of 2014).
- 2. The Minister of Tourism

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 151 of 196

(a) Report and Financial Statements of Vote 33 – Department of Tourism for 2015-16, including the Report of the Auditor-General on the Financial Statements and Performance Information of Vote 33 for 2015-16 [RP 123-2016].

(b) Report and Financial Statements of South African Tourism (SAT) for 2015-16, including the Report of the Auditor-General on the Financial Statements and Performance Information for 2015-16.

3. The Minister of Trade and Industry

- (a) Report and Financial Statements of the National Gambling Board (NLC) for 2015-16, including the Report of the Auditor-General on the Financial Statements and Performance Information for 2015-16 [RP 306-2015].
- (b) Report and Financial Statements of the National Lotteries Commission (NLC) for 2015-16, including the Report of the Auditor-General on the Financial Statements and Performance Information for 2015-16 and the Financial Statements of the National Lottery Distribution Trust Fund (NLDTF) for 2015-16, including the Report of the Auditor-General on the Financial Statements and Performance Information for 2015-16.

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 152 of 196

(c) Report and Financial Statements of the National Credit Regulator (NCR) for 2015-16, including the Report of the Auditor-General on the Financial Statements and Performance Information for 2015-16 [RP 49-2016].

- (d) Report and Financial Statements of the National Consumer Tribunal (NCT) for 2015-16, including the Report of the Auditor-General on the Financial Statements and Performance Information for 2015-16.
- (e) Report and Financial Statements of the Companies and Intellectual Property Commission (CIPC) for 2015-16, including the Report of the Auditor-General on the Financial Statements and Performance Information for 2015-16 [RP 283-2016].
- (f) Report and Financial Statements of the National Consumer Commission (NCC) for 2015-16, including the Report of the Auditor-General on the Financial Statements and Performance Information for 2015-16 [RP 190-2016].
- (g) Report and Financial Statements of the Companies Tribunal (CT) for 2015-16, including the Report of the Auditor-General on the Financial Statements and Performance Information for 2015-16.
- (h) Report and Financial Statements of the National Metrology Institute of South Africa (NMISA) for 2015-16, including the Report of the Independent Auditors on the Financial Statements and Performance Information for 2015-16 [RP 181-2016].

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 153 of 196

(i) Report and Financial Statements of the South African National Accreditation System (SANAS) for 2015-16, including the Report of the Independent Auditors on the Financial Statements and Performance Information for 2015-16 [RP 228-2016].

- (j) Report and Financial Statements of South African Bureau of Standards (SABS) for 2015-16, including the Report of the Auditor-General on the Financial Statements and Performance Information for 2015-16.
- (k) Report and Financial Statements of the National Regulator for Compulsory

 Specifications (NRCS) for 2015-16, including the Report of the Auditor-General on
 the Financial Statements and Performance Information for 2015-16 [RP 277-2016].
- (l) Report and Financial Statements of Export Credit Insurance Corporation of South Africa (ECIC) SOC Ltd for 2015-16, including the Report of the Independent Auditors on the Financial Statements and Performance Information for 2015-16.
- (m) Report and Financial Statements of the National Empowerment Fund (NEF) for2015-16, including the Report of the Independent Auditors on the FinancialStatements and Performance Information for 2015-16 [RP 147-2016].

COMMITTEE REPORTS

National Assembly

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 154 of 196

1. Report of the ad hoc Committee to Nominate a Person for Appointment as Public

Protector, dated 30 August 2016

The ad hoc Committee to Nominate a Person for Appointment as Public Protector (the

Committee), having considered the request by the National Assembly to recommend a suitable

candidate for appointment as Public Protector, reports as follows:

1. On 24 May 2016, the National Assembly resolved, in accordance with section 193(5) of

the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, 1996, to establish an ad hoc Committee

to Nominate a Person for Appointment as Public Protector to recommend a suitable

person for appointment as Public Protector when the term of office of the present

incumbent, Adv. T Madonsela, expires in October 2016. The Committee is mandated to

exercise the powers in Rule 138 that it deems necessary to perform its task; and to report

to the House by 31 August 2016.

2. The Committee is composed of a total of eleven members, as follows:

African National Congress

- Khoza, Dr M
- Bongo, Adv. BT
- Masondo, Mr NA
- Koornhof, Mr NJJ
- Tseke, Ms GK
- Mothapo, Mrs MRM

• Maesela, Dr P [Alternate]

PAGE: 155 of 196

Democratic Alliance

- Breytenbach, Adv. G
- Van Damme, Ms PT
- Selfe, Mr J [Alternate]
- Horn, Mr W [Alternate]

Economic Freedom Fighters

- Malema, Mr JS
- Shivambu, Mr F [Alternate]

Inkatha Freedom Party

Msimang, Prof CT

African Christian Democratic Party

• Swart, Mr SN

National Freedom Party

- Mncwabe, Mr SC [Alternate]
- 3. The Committee has held seven meetings as follows:
 - Election of Chairperson: 27 May 2016.

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 156 of 196

• Discussion of process to follow: 1 June 2016.

• Shortlisting: 13 July 2016.

• Interviews: 11 and 12 August 2016.

Deliberations: 18 and 24 August 2016.

• Adoption of report: 30 August 2016.

4. Legal framework and process

4.1. The Committee's process is guided by the relevant constitutional and statutory provisions, as well as the Rules of the National Assembly:

4.2. In terms of section 193(4) of the Constitution, 1996, the President must appoint a Public Protector on the recommendation of the National Assembly. Regarding the role of the National Assembly, section 193(5) of the Constitution, 1996, provides that:

"The National Assembly must recommend persons -

- (a) nominated by a Committee of the Assembly proportionally composed of members of all parties represented in the Assembly; and
- (b) approved by the Assembly by a resolution adopted with the supporting vote of at least 60 per cent of the members of the Assembly if the recommendation concerns the appointment of the Public Protector ...'.

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 157 of 196

4.3. The Committee notes in this regard that Parliament has yet to develop comprehensive guidelines for committees that are similarly tasked. The Committee considered the method of previous ad hoc committees mandated to nominate a person for appointment as Public Protector and found that although they had developed their own processes, these were of little assistance to the Committee.

4.4. The Committee, therefore, has developed its own process to complement the applicable constitutional and legal framework and has made use of a range of tools to establish the suitability of candidates.

5. Public participation

- 5.1. The Committee is acutely aware of and has welcomed the intense public interest that its work has attracted.
- 5.2. Section 193(2) of the Constitution provides that the involvement of civil society in the recommendation process may be provided for as envisaged in section 59(1) of the Constitution. Section 59(1) of the Constitution provides for public access to and involvement in the National Assembly. Broadly, the provision states that the Assembly must facilitate public involvement in its legislative and other processes and conduct its business in an open manner and hold its business/ meetings in public.

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 158 of 196

5.3. To facilitate public participation, the Committee agreed to an open and transparent process:

- 5.3.1. The advertisement requesting nominations or applications for the position of Public Protector from members of the public appeared in all officials languages in various newspapers throughout the country. The advert also appeared on Parliament's website. The closing date for nominations or applications was 24 June 2016. The Committee received a total of 78 applications or nominations, of which 16 were declined.
- 5.3.2. On 28 June 2016, the Committee published the names of all candidates with their accompanying *curriculum vitae* on Parliament's website. Members of the public were given until 8 July 2016 to make submissions on the candidates. The Committee received more than 100 submissions from members of the public.

6. Selection criteria and shortlisting

6.1. Section 193 of the Constitution, 1996, and section 1A of the Public Protector Act 23 of 1994 set out the applicable criteria for appointment as Public Protector: The Public Protector must be a South African citizen and a fit and proper person to hold the position. Section 1A(3) of the Public Protector Act 23 of 1994, adds that the Public Protector shall be:

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 159 of 196

"...a South African citizen who is a fit and proper person to hold such office, and who-

- (a) is a Judge of a High Court; or
- (b) is admitted as an advocate or an attorney and has, for a cumulative period of at least 10 years after having been so admitted, practised as an advocate or an attorney; or
- (c) is qualified to be admitted as an advocate or an attorney and has, for a cumulative period of at least 10 years after having so qualified, lectured in law at a university; or
- (d) has specialised knowledge of or experience, for a cumulative period of at least 10 years, in the administration of justice, public administration or public finance; or
- (e) has, for a cumulative period of at least 10 years, been a member of Parliament; or
- (f) has acquired any combination of experience mentioned in paragraphs (b) to (e), for a cumulative period of at least 10 years".
- 6.2. Before shortlisting took place, all candidates were requested to complete a questionnaire that was based broadly on the questionnaire that the Judicial Services Commission makes use of in the case of judicial appointments and also contained disclosure provisions.
- 6.3. In addition, the Committee agreed that the academic qualifications of those shortlisted would be verified and that Parliament should be asked to facilitate

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 160 of 196

screening of the candidates. The Committee is of the view that screening is important as it affords candidates the opportunity to refute any allegations that might arise.

- 6.4. Further, members of civil society undertook their own evaluation process and made the results of their findings available to the Committee for information purposes.
- 6.5. In addition to the formal legal requirements, the Committee identified a number of key focus areas to guide it when evaluating candidates: "character"; "knowledge"; "experience"; and "skills".

7. Shortlisting and Interviewing

- 7.1. On 13 July 2016, the Committee shortlisted a total of 14 candidates. Of these, a total of eight were female and the remaining six were male. Those shortlisted were as follows:
 - Judge Sirajudien Desai
 - Judge Sharise Erica Weiner
 - Adv. Kevin Sifiso Malunga
 - Adjunct Prof. Narnia Bohler-Muller
 - Ms Jill Claudelle Oliphant
 - Adv. Mamiki Thabitha Goodman
 - Adv. Muvhango Antoinette Lukhaimane
 - Adv. Chris Madibeng Mokoditwa

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 161 of 196

- Adv. Busisiwe Joyce Mkhwebane
- Adv. Michael Mthembu
- Mr Willam Andrew Hofmeyr
- Ms Kajaal Ramjathan-Keogh
- Adv. Nonkosi Princess Cetywayo
- Prof. Bongani Christopher Majola
- 7.2. The interviews were conducted at Parliament on 11 August 2016, beginning at 8.00 am and ended on 12 August 2016 at 3:10 am.
- 7.3. As the interviews were being broadcast live on Parliament's television channel, the Committee agreed to interview all candidates in one sitting. This was to ensure that no candidate was able to gain an unfair advantage by following others being interviewed on television.

8. Deliberations

8.1. The Committee had received a confidential letter, dated 4 August 2016 from the State Security Agency in response to its request to Parliament to facilitate screening of the candidates. The Committee put the information contained in the letter to the relevant candidates during the interviews. Nonetheless, some Members of the Committee felt that the information contained in the letter was prejudicial to these candidates and, for this reason, the Committee agreed that it would not use the results

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 162 of 196

of the screening when deliberating. Further, the Committee is of the view that there is a need for Parliament to look into developing an appropriate mechanism to screen candidates that are nominated for appointment as public office-bearers to independent constitutional institutions.

- 8.2. The Committee began its deliberations on 18 August 2016, agreeing that the following candidates would remain on the list for further deliberation at its next meeting:
 - Judge Sharise Erica Weiner.
 - Judge Sirajudien Desai.
 - Adv. Busisiwe Joyce Mkhwebane
 - Ms Muvhango Antoinette Lukhaimane
 - Prof. Bongani Christopher Majola
- 8.3. At its next meeting on 24 August 2016, the Committee deliberated on the five candidates listed above and agreed to nominate Adv. Busisiwe Joyce Mkhwebane for appointment as Public Protector. The Democratic Alliance reserved its position.

9. Recommendation

9.1. Having considered the request of the National Assembly for the Committee to nominate a person for appointment as Public Protector, the Committee recommends, with the Democratic Alliance reserving its position, that:

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 163 of 196

9.1.1. The National Assembly recommend Adv. Busisiwe Joyce Mkhwebane to the President for appointment as Public Protector.

9.1.2. The National Assembly look into establishing comprehensive guidelines for committees of the Assembly when dealing with appointments of public officebearers to independent constitutional institutions.

10. Appreciation

- 10.1. The Committee would like to thank all candidates for making themselves available to be considered for appointment as the Public Protector.
- 10.2. Further, the Committee would like to acknowledge the active involvement of members of the public and of civil society in this process.

Report to be considered.

2. Report of the Portfolio Committee on Tourism on 2016 Tourism Indaba, dated 19 May 2016

The Portfolio Committee on Tourism, having attended the 2016 Tourism Indaba in Durban at Chief Albert Luthuli International Convention Centre from 6-9 May, reports as follows:

1. Introduction

Indaba was invented in 1979 and was held for the 37th time from 6th - 9th May 2016 at the Inkosi Albert Luthuli International Conventions Centre in Durban. Since its humble beginnings in 1979, Indaba has remarkably grown over the years to become the number one tourism trade and consumer show in Africa with a Pan-African flair. The event showcases the widest variety of Southern Africa's best tourism products and attracts international buyers and media from across the world. This show is owned by South African Tourism and organised by Pure Grit Project and Exhibitions Management (Pty) Ltd. Amongst its accolades, Indaba has won the awards for Africa's best travel and tourism show. This award was presented by the Association of World Travel Awards.

However, the show has stagnated as both exhibitor and visitor numbers are declining and this is a cause for a major concern for the Committee. The industry has over the past few years raised a concern that Indaba is becoming outdated as it is not keeping up with international standards and trends. Indaba needs a complete overhaul and that is why the Committee has made recommendations to South African Tourism over the years to upgrade Indaba to match international standards of similar shows. The process is currently underway to appoint a partner that will assist South African Tourism to plan and manage Indaba with an aim to modernise it and make it relevant to the fast-paced changing tourism trends.

2. Delegation

The delegation to 2016 Tourism Indaba consisted of the following Committee members and support staff:

Status	Name of Member	Party
Attendance	Hon. B.T Ngcobo	African National Congress (ANC)`
	(Chairperson)	
	Hon. E.K.M Masehela	
	Hon. P.E Adams	
	Hon. S.D Bekwa	
	Hon. J. Vos	Democratic Alliance (DA)
	Hon. G.R Krumbock	
	Hon. A.G Whitfield	
Apologies	Hon. L Makhubela-Mashele	African National Congress (ANC)
	Hon. T.S Xego	
	Hon. A. Matshobeni	
	Hon. R.N Cebekhulu	Economic Freedom Fighters
		Inkatha Freedom Party

3. Opening Address by Minister of Tourism

The Indaba delegates were welcomed by the Ministers of Tourism and these included Ministers of Tourism from Burkina Faso, Ghana, Lesotho, Namibia, Seychelles, Swaziland, Uganda, Zambia and Zimbabwe. Amongst the delegates were the MECs for Tourism from all provinces. Remarks were made that the presence of these delegates at Indaba indicated that the countries are united to build and brand Africa as a continent of unparalleled opportunities and join hands to make tourism a sector of hope and progress for people. The focus of Indaba was on concrete actions to achieve the set aspirations.

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 166 of 196

Indaba is the premier African travel and tourism show, with exhibits from 18 countries on the continent in 2016. It expresses what the soul of Africa is all about. This is what it means to share what the continent has, and to work together to get what is needed in the sector. The gathering at Indaba was to forge business partnerships between product owners and buyers. The great work after Indaba was about how governments throughout the continent partner with industry and communities, and how to join forces to receive the next wave of tourists.

Indaba is all about partnerships. In 2015, the Ministry announced intention to find a partner to make Indaba even more impactful and that process was said to be at an advanced stage of negotiations with a prospective partner.

Inkosi Albert Luthuli Convention Centre reflected the vibrant culture of Africa. Indaba was a great way to commemorate Africa Month, when the 1.2 billion people of Africa get together to celebrate cultural heritage, arts and music, and the creativity of the people. Africa Month is an appropriate time to pay tribute to Albert Luthuli. His life story may be well known to many, but for the benefit of visitors from abroad, he lived his life in pursuit of universal freedom. Inkosi Luthuli once said: "Our interest in freedom is not confined to ourselves only. We are interested in the liberation of the oppressed in the whole of Africa and in the world as a whole." He was the first person in Africa to be awarded the Nobel Peace Prize. As one of the leaders of the African National Congress, he contributed to making South Africa the nation it is today, and the continent is making steady headway in achieving Albert Luthuli's aspirations. Africa is vibrant melting port for tourism: the diverse cultures, customs and traditions of the people, merged with

the endless variety of the landscapes, blended with unique biodiversity, and fired by spirit of freedom and equality.

As tourism succeeds, the continent succeeds, and millions of people benefit from this success. Tourism in South Africa, and in Africa is on the brink of a new success story. Some of the challenges experienced in South Africa last year resulted in dwindling tourism numbers. That is now behind, and South Africa is experiencing spectacular growth in tourist arrivals. All indicators are that 2016 will be a bumper year for tourism in South Africa. In fact, tourism is poised for growth across Africa.

The United Nations World Tourism Organisation estimates that international tourist arrivals will grow by 4 percent this year. Tourist arrivals in Africa are expected to reach 130 million by 2030. This is more than double the 50 million arrivals currently received.

Investment in tourism across Africa is making tourism a key economic driver. Emerging economies are shifting away from their reliance on commodities, and moving towards innovation and the services sector. Tourism on the continent is built on the enduring value of natural assets and the authentic cultural experiences offer. It also depends on the capacity to provide excellent infrastructure, facilities and service.

Africa is a massive continent. The sheer scale of deserts, forests and plains is a wonder in itself, let alone their beauty. South Africa has the most amazing natural splendour. Landscapes and biodiversity are unmatched in the world. The World Heritage Sites that reveal the earth's secrets

and relate the story of humanity. But all attractions and facilities would stand idle without the people, the genuine people of Africa, welcoming tourists warmly, catering for their needs professionally, share culture in memorable ways.

The world's tourists want authentic, meaningful experiences. They still want leisure, wildlife and adventure, and they continue to come to Africa for this. But, more and more, tourists want to meet real people in their homes and communities. They want a taste of local traditions and customs. This provides opportunities for many people from indigenous communities to become involved in tourism. South Africa is investing in key sites, and training people to enhance the visitor experience at these destinations and has started fitting selected attractions with solar energy to reduce their reliance on the national grid and to lower their operational costs.

More attention is paid to the image and reputation of Africa, not only through effective marketing, but by putting on a really great show when tourists arrive. Their word of mouth will do marketing for the country when they return home. Across the continent, similar challenges are faced by different countries which share similar potential for sustainable growth. African countries stand to benefit from working together, instead of competing with each other. Indaba provides the ideal platform to do this. A successful Indaba contributes to the success of tourism in all countries.

Exhibitors are the key to unlocking this potential, they are the product owners, and they represent continent's diverse offers. The interaction between exhibitors and buyers is central to the success of any travel trade show. Buyers are looking for a one-stop show that offers a wide range of

tourism products and services. In 2016, buyers at Indaba have were sourced from key global markets.

Africa is a continent of unparalleled opportunity, and tourism is where the greatest untapped opportunity lies. It is the fountain of hope that promises progress for people. Countries are addressing their visa policies, their infrastructure, health and hygiene standards, and the protection of their natural resources. Mobile bookings are on the rise in Africa. About 15 percent of room nights are now booked on a mobile phone. This allows product owners to attract many more customers at a far lower cost.

It is also significant that the SADC Tourism Ministers have agreed to transform the Regional Tourism Organisation of Southern Africa (RETOSA) into a dedicated marketing organisation, which will make joint marketing efforts more efficient and effective. The National Department of Tourism (NDT) has hosted workshops to share best practice with several sister countries on the continent. However, despite positive development like these, the continent still faces impediments to growth. Air transport services remain a key constraint. Many major airlines fly to Africa from North America, Europe, and Asia, but, once visitors reach the continent, they encounter difficulties in travelling from country to country within the continent.

If one quarter of the African countries were to implement the Open Skies for Africa decision and facilitate greater air access between countries, an additional 155,000 jobs and USD 1.3 billion in GDP could be generated, with obvious benefits for tourism.

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 170 of 196

A total of 575 national and international media people were welcomed to Indaba 2016. Their presence was immensely valued in sharing the success story of tourism in Africa with the world. Tourism offers an opportunity for media to cast the narrative of Africa in an entirely new light, one that brightens up the future of the continent and contributes to the African success story.

4. Third Indaba Ministerial Roundtable Discussions

The Committee had an opportunity to attend the Third Indaba Ministerial Roundtable Session. The Theme of the Ministerial Session was: "Brand Africa: Realising Africa's Tourism Destination Potential." The intention of this theme was to explore and discuss the perceptions and realities associated with Africa and their impact on tourism growth in the region. The session looked at various challenges facing the region and how to change those into solutions that benefit all countries in the region. It included the attendance of Tourism Ministers and representatives from countries such as Namibia, Swaziland, Seychelles, Mozambique, Uganda, Zimbabwe, Angola, Kenya and others

The session provided a platform for policy makers and key industry players, whose mandate is to grow and develop travel and tourism on the continent, to deliberate on emerging tourism trends, opportunities and challenges facing the tourism sector in the continent. The discussions focussed on a number of issues that affect the region. Central to this was the brand of the various countries as tourist destinations, as tourism is seen as gift in the region that creates employment opportunities and investment attraction. The region should determine the investment direction with regard to how countries use tourism to maximise economic development. Tourism could be

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 171 of 196

used for trade stimulation, SMME development, skills training, conservation, cooperation, and competitiveness. The intention is to create a momentum for delivery, shared image, and to ensure that the image of the region is correct, consistent and clearly communicated. There were three presentations made in line with the theme as follows:

4.1 African perspectives on tourism

Ambassador Abba Omar of the Mapungubwe Institute for Strategic Reflection presented an African perspective on tourism. His input focussed on positioning and promoting the continent globally and promoting each country internally. The United Nations World Tourism Organisation has forecasted that in less than 15 years tourism in Africa would more than double from 56 million to about 130 million. The reality is that Africa could do better than this. The disjuncture is that Africa has 5 percent of global arrivals but only 3 percent of tourism receipts. Africa should aim to at least have 5 percent of global tourism receipts by 2022 to ensure that the continent is competitive.

4.2 Perspectives on branding

In dealing with brand issues in Africa, Mr Thebe Ikalafeng who is a Founder and Chairman of Brand Leadership Group presented the African Case Studies on Image Building and Branding. Challenges and proposed strategies were presented. The challenges of Africa were suggested to have started in 1884 in Berlin when Africa was cut out into different sections that regulated European colonization and trade in Africa during the New Imperialism period. Since then, the

African stories and "branding" were told from a European perspective. The continent was seen as a hopeless continent and world renowned magazines such as The Economist published negative stories about Africa as "the hopeless continent". This is also evident in the prominent business adverts such as when Korean Airlines launched its route in Kenya two years ago where they said "Fly to Nairobi with Korean Air and enjoy the grand African savannah, the safari tour, and indigenous people full of primitive energy". This shows how other nations perceive Africans and this is not a positive brand perception about the continent.

It is only recently that Africa is seen as a continent with potential in a 360 degrees turn on perceptions by Time Magazine and The Economist whereby headings such as "Africa Rising" have been published. The challenge facing Africa is that the world looks at Africa as one country. The challenge for the tourism practitioners is to send messages that reflect Africa as a continent with 54 countries. Brands are about perceptions, what people think about the country and its people become a reality. Tourism branding should be about showing diversity and presenting the truth about Africa and its countries.

The important fact to bear in mind is that the brand is not a logo. The logo is just an entry point to the brand, and more work should be done to create a brand and image of a destination. Every country is competing for the share of tourists that come to Africa and the experience the people have when they visit the country is important as it becomes the brand they take home and form opinions about our destination. A brand is a person's gut feeling about the product, service, or company. It is not what one says it is and more what tourists say it is. It is also prudent to always keep in mind that whether we like or not, the world forms an opinion about us as a country every

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 173 of 196

day, either through the media, interaction with other people, their own experiences or simply due to preconceived notions. The work of tourism agencies is therefore rooted in managing the perceptions visitors form about the country and shape their opinions into positive brand messages about the country. In building the brand, there are crucial aspects to consider. These are:

- Clarity the brand should be clear and specific, such as "Incredible India". This is used in India for tourism, business and investment.
- Credibility the brand should deliver what it promises.
- Compelling the brand must be compelling and draw people to the destination.
- Cohesive the brand should take into consideration all aspects of the country, including exports, governance, investment and migration, culture and heritage, people, and most importantly tourism.
- Consistency brand messaging should be consistent and not confusing to the intended target market.
- Leadership is a critical player in how the brand is created and sustained. Africa
 therefore needs leadership with clear plans and priorities to overcome structural
 problems.
- Creativity creativity in countries will raise the awareness about the country and improves its perceptions globally. Innovations such as M-Pesa have raised the country profile of Kenya.

All these aspects should be integrated and work together to work best for the destination.

Branding must however start with Africans loving their own countries and the essence of the

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 174 of 196

brand should stay the same. The outcome of positive brand will sustain Africa's growth, creativity, collaboration, pride in citizenship and culture.

4.3 The international perspective

The international perspective presentation was delivered by Dr Christopher Rodrigues who is the Chairperson of Visit Britain. He emphasised that countries should not downplay the importance of domestic tourism as this is the pillar of a healthy tourism industry. Some successful countries have a strong domestic tourism compared to international tourism. If a country does not have a strong domestic tourism they obviously don't have anything to sell to the international market. Destinations should therefore understand that domestic and international tourism work both ways.

The importance of a good relationship between the industry and government was emphasised in the presentation. The industry needs to understand the economic goals of tourism and work with the government on issues such as job creation. The government on the other hand should provide an enabling environment for the industry to flourish. It is also important for the government to understand that they control the levers of tourism, and that tourism is a domain for the private sector. It takes a huge amount of collaboration for government to get positive outcomes from the private sector and therefore tourism should be at the centre of policy-making and not an afterthought by the government.

The minimum standard for a robust destination development should include freedom to travel, Visa processing, security, infrastructure development, place making and the people of the destination. The national branding is also key and countries should decide what kind of destination they want to be. This should be a decision between high value added and low volume, or high volume and low margin. Beyond country borders, African states should decide if they want to develop and promote a pan-regional brand. If this notion is embraced, countries should work towards ensuring that the brand is complimentary, find a common ground for branding, and sell experiences not destinations.

5. Ministerial Media Talk

The Committee attended the Ministerial Media Talk, which followed the official opening of Indaba. This was a frank facilitated panel discussion on issues relating to open skies policy and implementation thereof, interdepartmental collaboration during policy formulation, and trust between government and the industry. The panel included the Minister of Tourism, Derek Hanekom; Deputy Minister of Tourism, Tokozile Xasa; the Chief Executive Officer of the Tourism Business Council of South Africa, Mmatšatši Ramawela; and Gillian Saunders of Grant Thornton. The panel was moderated by Mr Richard Quest of CNN.

The panel addressed the strategic economic importance of tourism, threats and opportunities associated with it, such as job creation, foreign direct spend and social development. A key part of the discussion was the need for collaboration and engagement of other government departments by the National Department of Tourism when taking decisions on issues that have

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 176 of 196

far reaching consequences for the sector. This was highlighted by the recent announcement by the Minister of Sport revoking the privilege of four of South Africa's sporting associations to host future events because of their failure to meet their agreed upon transformation targets. As good as this decision is in expediting transformation in sport, it poses negative consequences for the tourism sector. The Minister acknowledged that consultation is needed in such instances in order to balance doing the right thing for the country, without negatively affecting tourism, and indicated it is his job to promote tourism, so he will engage with the Minister of Sports.

The panel agreed that there is an opportunity to learn best practices from the continent and the world, a sentiment especially emphasised by the Tourism Business Council. The panel was challenged on the veracity of tourism growth figures for South Africa, and the panel moderator suggested that the quoted figure of 15 percent was misleading as it was based on growth off a low base after South Africa had "shot itself in the foot", in relation to the visa requirements that included unabridged certificates. In providing clarity, the Minister indicated that the effect of the Ebola outbreak on tourist arrivals could also not be underestimated in the tourism performance of 2015. According to Grant Thornton, taking a two-year view, the arrivals growth was three percent below the global average of four percent. It was noted however, that the industry was significantly rescued by the depreciation of the rand despite the fact that studies could not find a direct correlation between currency depreciation and tourist arrivals.

Another heated discussion was in regard to South African Airways and its role in tourism. The moderator questioned the governance model of SAA and raised issue about the Low Cost Carriers being the global trend in driving tourism. Though they differed on a number of issues,

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 177 of 196

the panel agreed on the importance of SAA as a national carrier and its importance to South Africa as a developmental state in driving tourist arrivals. They also agreed that the trust between government and private sector was essential to the growth and development of the tourism industry.

6. Information sharing session of KwaZulu-Natal Province

The Committee had an opportunity to attend the information sharing session of the Department of Economic Development and Tourism of KwaZulu-Natal Province. The purpose of the session was to share with Indaba delegates the connectivity of the City of Durban and KwaZulu-Natal to the rest of the world, and planned tourism projects for the province. The MEC of Tourism, Mr Michael Mabuyakhulu, highlighted that the national Minister of Tourism reiterated that South Africa must be counted amongst the top 20 tourism destinations by 2020 hence the Province of KwaZulu-Natal responded by developing the Provincial Tourism Master Plan. The province is renowned for its all- year-round warm climatic conditions, magnificent beaches, scenery, diverse cultural and heritage tourism resources, as well as being home to two world heritage sites in the form of iSimangaliso Wetland Park on the north coast and uKhahlamba Drakensberg Mountain Ranges in the north west. Tourism potential of the province should be enhanced in order to continue to remain competitive with other provinces and the world.

The Provincial White Paper on the Development and Promotion of Tourism identified the need for the development of the Tourism Master Plan that sets out the key strategic objectives and the plan to grow the sector. The plan is a comprehensive long-term strategy to provide a structural framework for success in the development, management and monitoring of the province's

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 178 of 196

tourism industry while pre-empting problems and possible mitigation actions. The Master Plan is aligned to the KZN Provincial Growth and Development Plan in that the targets are set for 2030, with five year interval indicators that assist in the process of monitoring and evaluation of the progress made. The government had recognised that accessibility is a key feature needed to achieve sustainable economic growth and prosperity and it is in that spirit that the province continues to provide services and improve the provision of world-class transport and logistics infrastructure.

The King Shaka International Airport services both domestic and international flights, with regularly scheduled services to Dubai, Istanbul, Doha, Addis Ababa, Mauritius, Harare, Lusaka and Maputo, as well as 8 domestic destinations. The airports' position forms part of the Golden Triangle between Johannesburg and Cape Town, which is important for convenient travel and trade between the three cities. The City of Durban is also accessible by sea, rail and road. The new international links will create an avenue for Durban and KZN to connect to all six continents which guarantee an upsurge in the tourist, business and general passenger numbers to arrive through King Shaka International Airport (KSIA). The partnerships will add value to the campaign of building sustainable air connectivity from KSIA to the rest of the world, which would ensure that KwaZulu-Natal becomes a key regional aviation hub. It was important for Durban to secure more direct flights to the City and the Province to increase economic activity and tourism. Durban is the gateway to Africa and will increase visitors and investors if there is more direct routes to the City. The City of Durban is an investment destination which presents a lot of opportunities for investors to tap into the Southern Africa market and the entire African continent for investments.

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 179 of 196

A panel discussion including the MEC and two developers was also held. This session provided insights into the planned tourism projects that aim to enhance and diversify product offering of KwaZulu-Natal. Major amongst these were the prospects of beach resorts and a mixed use shopping complex that houses international brands, with a hotel and residential areas.

7. Women in Tourism

The Deputy Minister of Tourism, Tokozile Xasa, hosted the successful Women in Tourism initiative at Indaba. This annual event is fast becoming a sought after event to attend during Indaba. The establishment of the Women in Tourism (WiT) forum is aimed at addressing the economic inequalities and challenges faced by women within the sector. The WiT agenda is centred on 'Commanding Respect, ascertaining Recognition of women contribution in the sector, encouraging representation in economic activities and leadership, and producing results which will enhance the supply and demand for domestic tourism.

Tourism has been recognised as a pillar of economic growth as well as a social unifier. Within the industry, women make up nearly 70 percent of the workforce. However, there is a marked under-representation of women in senior positions, with women holding less than 40 percent of all managerial positions, less than 20 percent of general management roles and between 5-8 percent of board positions. According to the South African UN representative, women in Ghana contribute almost 56 percent to the GDP, whilst South Africa is at about 30 percent. It is no longer negotiable that the economic empowerment of women to 50/50 representation beyond 2030 should be considered a priority. As a result of the size and relevance of the sector within the global economy, there is a wide range of stakeholders that have a strong commercial interest

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 180 of 196

in enabling its continued growth and development, and associated with this, in enhancing the talent pipeline in order to unlock the potential of women in the workplace. These stakeholders encompass private and public sector players, education and training providers as well as the communities in which the sector is active.

In the 2015 report, the WTTC highlighted the consequences of talent imbalances and talent shortages in global tourism, focusing on serious business and profitability consequences. Of the talent challenges faced by hospitality, perhaps the major issue is that of a failure to utilise talented women to the best effect within the industry, particularly at senior levels. Opportunities for women development and funding options available were highlighted at this event. These opportunities include:

- The Executive Development Programme for Women was launched in March 2016 by the NDT working with the BEE Charter Council. It is targeting 20 women that will be identified from the industry and will go through a selection process in partnership with the selected Higher Education Institutions.
- The newly established Enterprise Development Programme by the Department shall focus on more than 50 percent of its efforts on Women Development through the Incubator process as well as formal business development studies.
- The programmes of support offered by the departmental Tourism Incentive Programme remain open for women in Tourism to tap in.
- Many of the skills development programmes offered by the department especially
 through the SRI funding, provide a leeway for women to venture into new areas such as
 being chefs and Food Safety Assurers.

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 181 of 196

 CATHSSETA formal training and development and bursaries focusing on women development to a PhD level.

• Women of Value South Africa (WOVSA) is a non-profit organisation formed in 2011 whose mission is to impact on the lives of women and youth to be part of the mainstream socio and economic development in SA. Their role is to mobilise, advocate, lobby, facilitate, monitor and evaluate as well as do research and develop programmes that respond to the mission of the organisation. WOVSA partners with government, private sector and other social partners in programmes that impact lives of women and youth in a sustainable manner.

Recognition was given to women that have invested their resources in breaking barriers and advancing the course of inclusive participation. The volunteers driving the chapters were acknowledged for the commitment and sacrifice. The 2016 event also included the attendance of ministers and delegations from other African countries which is evidence of advancing the Africa agenda.

8. Hidden Gems Networking Session

The Deputy Minister hosted a Hidden Gems session which included 70 tourism SMMEs from all over the country. Holding this networking function or having the development zone at INDABA was meant to cater to the upliftment of small, micro and medium sized enterprises (SMMEs). Their performance in a few years will be what transformation and inclusivity targets in tourism will be measured against.

People of Africa have a destination that is abundant in natural beauty, and diverse heritage and culture. Products and services range from mainstream tourist attractions such as the 120 World Heritage Sites in Africa, to excellent business tourism and conferencing facilities, and the more niche products such as adventure tourism, culture and heritage tourism and social tourism. There is no reason why the people of the continent should not explore these opportunities and make a living from this vast offering of a destination. What happens at the Indaba Development Zone, is the way of illustrating the support and belief in tourism changing lives.

The Minister launched the Tourism Incentive Programme (TIP) in March of 2015 with the overarching policy rationale rooted in the National Development Plan (NDP) and the New Growth Path (NGP) that recognises tourism as a labour intensive and tradable service sector and a catalyst to support a faster and more inclusive economic growth. The Department of Tourism has also established an Enterprise Development Project Management Unit (PMU) which will focus on the following areas:

8.1 Enterprise Development Online Information Portal.

The purpose of the online information portal is to increase access to business related information and online tools by tourism SMMEs countrywide. The department's IT Unit is leading the design of the portal. The negotiation with Business Partners to share information on SME Toolkit is underway and launch of the Portal is expected to take place in the first quarter. The portal will provide information in the following areas: Tourism Incentive Programme (TIP), service excellence, request for support, current tourism business news, e-learning tools, start-up advice,

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 183 of 196

inline surveys, events calendar, compliance requirements, grading information, Lilizela awards campaign, profiling of success stories; and opportunities listing.

8.2 Business Advisory Services

The Department has expanded the number of service providers to seven which will allow for a wider reach and diverse expertise that they can tap into for comprehensive support to SMMEs.

8.3 Tourism Incubator Hubs Establishment

The Department will establish two tourism incubators in two thriving tourism destinations in the country, namely:

- Pilanesberg in the Moses Kotane Local Municipality, North West Province to be launched in the second Quarter od 2016/17; and
- Manyeleti in Bushbuckridge Local Municipality, Mpumalanga Province to be launched in the third Quarter of 2016/17.

A stakeholder engagement roll out was underway starting in the North West Province where the Department had engaged Government and Community of the Pilanesberg cluster, and the private sector representative body TBCSA. The Small Enterprise Development Agency (SEDA) was to work with the Department in the two pilot tourism incubators. This initiative is a definite priority pillar underpinning South Africa's 2030 vision. As the country has witnessed the recent economic climate, the growth in the tourism sector has been steady, silently churning in the background while the rest of the economy has been volatile. There is no surprise therefore that

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 184 of 196

tourism is one of the six key growth sectors in the New Growth Path, with its contribution to the GDP which measures 3.9 percent, which is more than most labour-intensive sectors.

This growth is encouraging and galvanises the Department support and invest in the sector in any way possible. This was another reason for having the development zone at Indaba 2016. Without the support and the investment, there will be no sustainability in the tourism sector. There will also be no inclusivity nor will transformation occur in the sector.

9. National Tourism Careers Expo Breakfast Meeting

The Deputy Minister, Hon Thokozile Xasa, hosted the National Tourism Careers Expo Breakfast meeting. The last National Tourism Careers Expo (NTCE) was held at the Performing Arts Centre of the Free State (PACOFS) in Bloemfontein on 1-3 October 2015. It marked the first part of a three year cycle, where the Free State would host this national event. The Deputy Minister thanked the Free State Team led by the Premier and MEC Mashinini for a job well done in their successful event held last year. In its seventh consecutive year, NTCE is the largest tourism education event in South Africa and was initiated in 2007 to address challenges in the supply of skills to the South African tourism industry. It was used as a lever to advance strategies to promote investment in human capital in this sector and in doing so, was aligned to objectives of the National Tourism Sector Strategy and the National Tourism Sector Skills Strategy. The NTCE represents ideas, initiatives and active engagements between education, curriculum developers and the private sector, who share the common goal of taking skills development in tourism to the next level. It also seeks to improve the training of tourism educators by providing seminars to empower educators. This is augmented by the annual Tourism Teacher Awards,

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 185 of 196

presented at the NTCE to reward those who make remarkable contributions in the teaching of tourism subjects. The inaugural annual Tourism Teacher Awards presented in 2015 were the first of kind in tourism and will continue in 2016 and other years to come.

The Deputy Minister focused on what this initiative does for the youth, for the industry and the government. Firstly, the youth in the NTCE refers to high school (grades 9 - 12) and TVET College learners, university students and unemployed tourism graduates or youth. This is the primary target group for the NTCE as they are the people the primary objective talks to when the Department promotes tourism (inclusive of hospitality, travel, conservation, gambling and other related sub sectors) as a career, profession and business (entrepreneurship) of choice. The various interactive platforms that translate this objective into reality include the industry speakers' platform where engagements with young people take place on what the industry is all about and has got to offer. The exhibition platforms and other youth engagements with industry actually serve this purpose. That is the reason why industry stakeholders are important to be part of the NTCE. Their participation ensures that young people can acquire the necessary exposure on who and what the industry is made composed. In that way, the youth is enabled to make informed decisions to continue studying tourism as well as committing themselves to a profession in the industry. NTCE ensures that their commitment to serve in the industry therefore does not happen by default as it happened with most people in the sector. It must be by design that a young person decides to take tourism as a career and profession because of exposure to the industry and opportunities that exist. That will ensure attracting the right people for the right job at the right time. This will then enhance service excellence from a position of understanding, positive attitude informed by the urge and passion to work in the industry.

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 186 of 196

Secondly for the industry, referring to all industry product owners, captains and value chain participants, the NTCE offers an opportunity to sell themselves to young people, especially in the face of unfavourable perceptions that young people have about the sector. As industry, stakeholders sell themselves in terms of what their businesses are all about and offer, as well as their overall contribution to the industry and the economy individually or collectively. In that way, they present a positive picture to young people that negates the negative perceptions they harbour, and instead presents them with a host of exciting and real career and professional opportunities that exist. This is done with the background understanding that young people are not only a source for future labour but they are potential entrepreneurs and tourists of the future. The tourist element in this regard also plays its part even with the current situation, in that if a young person is sold on a tourism product and goes back home with a positive perspective about the product, the parents will definitely know about it, to an extent of even be convinced to buy and consume the services of the product. Therefore, there is also a commercial value in selling tourism products to young people in this regard as the latter benefit is surely derived through direct product marketing to young people.

Thirdly for government, by government referring to all three spheres of government and their related public entities, their role at the NTCE is to present programmes arranged or organised from a demand and supply perspective that are in place to benefit young people from an educational, career and professional perspective. Their programmes are expected to be presented through exhibitions and presentations at the various relevant platforms in place at the NTCE. The government sector includes the education and training institutions that are preparing young people as future tourism professionals and entrepreneurs. They therefore need to engage with

industry stakeholders at the NTCE to establish latest trends in terms of skills needs or gaps. The NTCE usually presents a platform in this regard that provides the supply side (education and training institutions) and the demand side (industry players) with an opportunity to engage on how they can reach equilibrium on demand and supply of skills. Educator Seminars also fall in this category and other platforms that are policy and regulations related. The NTCE therefore presents a captured audience for government to engage its stakeholders on relevant tourism matters.

Most of these activities will be succinctly outlined in the commissioned Tourism Human Resource Development Strategy (THRD) and its implementation plan that the department in partnership with CATHSSETA. The THRD strategy and the skills audit process is conducted by the Human Science Research Council (HSRC). The skills audit report will be in place by end of May 2016 and THRD strategy will be in place by end of September 2016. The NDT will probably share some information with the industry on it at the NTCE event this year, 2016. Therefore, government urges the industry stakeholders to cooperate with the researchers from HSRC in providing the necessary information as requested.

The Deputy Minister also reported that the NTCE 2014 produced business ideas through two young people who participated in its Youth Business Zone platform and these two young people are busy completing a programme of shaping their business into bankable real businesses with South African Bureau of Standards Design Institute. The two young people from Eastern Cape will present their final businesses at the NTCE 2016 as part of NTCE Legacy Projects.

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 188 of 196

10. Committee observations

The Committee made observations based on all the activities conducted by the Committee as a collective and by individual Members as they interacted with various stakeholders who attended Indaba 2016. The observations are as follows:

10.1 The impact of the Ministerial Networking Session

The Committee observed that the Ministerial Networking Session makes Indaba a true Pan-African Tourism event. In the 2015 Ministerial Session the session concluded that the African Union (AU) should strive to include tourism on its agenda, in order to elevate tourism as an economic driver in the continent. The 2016 session re-emphasised the need for a cohesive African collaboration on tourism matters. One of the issues raised was that African states should consider putting systems in place to advance Univisa regime on the continent; and that Africa should strive to harness its cultural and historical resources to market and present a truly unique and authentic destination for the world to visit.

10.2 Business focused event

Over the years Indaba has been opened through a glittering opening ceremony that featured music and speeches. This was traditionally followed by a beach party which cost a lot of money and lasted until late hours, causing delegates to be late in their exhibition stands the following morning. The delegates always raised a concern that the opening ceremony and the beach party,

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 189 of 196

as much as they were enjoyable, were not meaningful and wanted a more business-oriented interaction. The Committee noted that the opening ceremony for the 2016 Indaba was much improved. It had short speeches followed by an intense interaction about pertinent issues affecting tourism in the country and the region. Instead of a beach party, there was a cocktail event that provided a platform for business networking.

10.3 Increased support for emerging tourism enterprises

The Committee has always called for more support and exposure of emerging tourism enterprises to platforms that expose them to markets and assist them for competitiveness. The Committee was pleased to observe that in the 2016 edition of Indaba, South African Tourism brought a total of 70 exhibiting SMMEs under the "Hidden Gems Zone". These were selected for their uniqueness and authentic representation of South Africa as a destination. Of these, 20 focussed on the adventure experience offered by the country. A total of 14 included those who had won the Lilizela Tourism Award. In interacting with some of the SMMEs, they were satisfied and thankful that South African Tourism had made it possible for them to attend Indaba. The costs included exhibition space, travelling and accommodation during the entire show. Some of the SMMEs indicated that they had signed some deals with the potential of sustaining their businesses. South African Tourism made this possible through a collaboration with the Tourism Enterprise Partnership (TEP) and the National Department of Tourism's Tourism Incentive Programme (TIP).

In the Committee interaction with some of the emerging tourism enterprises hosted by South African Tourism at Indaba under the Theme "Hidden Gems", and the following issues were raised as challenges

10.3.1 Access to market

SMMEs expressed experiencing challenges with regard to access to market as some of the exhibition shows are expensive for them.

10.3.2 Requirements to access the Tourism Incentive Programme

SMMEs raised a concern that the requirements for the Tourism Incentive Program are not friendly for emerging businesses in rural areas as they are too high. Some of the requirements are the B-BBEE certificate, audited financial statements, business insurance, registration with SATSA, membership of TBCSA, and TOMSA levy collection. Mr Mbulelo Kafi of Sakhisizwe Tours in Colesburg, Northern Cape, for example, said he runs a tour operating business and it is difficult for him to meet all the criteria. He alluded that the condition of paying for himself to attend shows and claiming later to be reimbursed is challenging for him as his company does not make much profit. He also said it was for the first time for him to hear about SATSA and the TBCSA. The other challenge is that a company needs to comply with all the criteria otherwise the application is rejected.

The Committee is aware that the Department has the two regions, Northern and Southern Regions, with officials assigned to these areas. The challenges cited by Sakhisizwe Tours point to lack of information and awareness about various components of the industry and different structures in which different types of businesses should belong to. The Department is urged to work closely work with provinces, targeting emerging businesses in rural areas to ensure they are fully aware of the industry and all its related structures.

10.3.3 Income leakage

Emerging enterprises cited a challenge with their capacity to deal with the volume of business, particularly during the peak season. An example was made of transport used to take the tourist to attractions. The emerging tour operators are struggling to service large tour groups and they have to outsource their business to big operators or hire vehicles. This creates income leakage as their businesses lose the valuable possible income to big businesses and rental companies. An appeal was made by emerging enterprises that the Department considers a small business support programme through the Tourism Incentive Programme to assist them with business expansion.

10.3.4 Capacity building programmes

Another issue was raised with regard to skills training. Emerging enterprises indicated that they need empowerment training such as Advanced Customer Care which is offered by the Culture, Arts, Tourism, Hospitality and Sport Sector Education and Training Authority (CATHSSETA). Some of them do not have any background in business and they would appreciate assistance with business management skills.

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 192 of 196

10.4 Indaba as a Hallmark Event for Durban

The Committee noted that Indaba was successfully held for the 37th time in Durban in 2016. The trend globally is that such events are held and hosted in one city and they become synonymous with the city in what is referred to as "Hallmark Events" in the field of event management. The examples include the ITB held in Berlin which has been held in the same city for 50 years since its inception in 1966; the World Travel Market (WTM) that has been hosted in London for 37 years since 1980; Fitur which has been hosted in Madrid for 36 years. The city of Durban has demonstrated that they have a capacity to host this event successfully.

10.5 Prospects of Agri-tourism in Northern KwaZulu-Natal

The Chairperson had a meeting with KwaZulu-Natal Department of Economic Development, Tourism, and Environmental Affairs on the Marula Factory operated by Isulethu Cooperative in Umhlabuyalingana Local Municipality. It was observed that the Project falls under the Department of Agriculture in KwaZulu-Natal and that it was initially conceptualised purely on agricultural grounds. However, there are possibilities of economic linkages with tourism through Route 22 and the East3Route. The harvesting of the Marula fruit is seasonal and there are opportunities of extending the factory to include other primary agricultural activities that may keep the factory afloat to the next Marula harvesting season. The factory could also diversify to include production of oil, jam, and small souvenir products that could be sold to tourists. It was acknowledged that there might be a value added to the project by engaging the Department of Small Business Development to assist with the expansion and diversification of the factory. The

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 193 of 196

diversified factory may also supply agricultural products to the tourism business in the area. This may have a mutual benefit for both the factory and tourism business in complying with the new Tourism B-BBEE Sector Codes.

11. Recommendations

The Committee recommends that:

- 11.1 The Minister should ensure that the Ministerial Networking Session at Indaba grows to incorporate more tourism ministers from the African continent to ensure that the issues raised have attention of many Member States of the African Union to raise the profile of tourism and collaboration amongst countries.
- 11.2 The Minister of Tourism becomes proactive in interacting with his Cabinet counterparts on the proposed or tabled policies in their respective departments, and highlight the potential negative impacts such policies could have on the tourism industry.
- 11.3 The Minister of Tourism champions a coordinated brand management campaign that provides proper brand positioning, disseminates correct and positive messaging about Africa, and potentially grows the global market share and tourist spend in the region.
- 11.4 The Minister of Tourism should, in Cabinet, emphasise the role played by South African Airways as a National Carrier in growing and sustaining tourism in South Africa and

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 194 of 196

work closely with the airline to identify lucrative and direct routes that connect the country with tourism source markets.

- 11.5 The Department considers reducing the red tape and find ways and mechanisms that could make the Tourism Incentive Programme more user-friendly and accessible to emerging tourism enterprises.
- 11.6 The Minister, once the process of appointing a service provider that will partner with South African Tourism to organise and host Indaba has been finalised, considers a possibility of declaring Indaba as tourism Hallmark Event for Durban, as it is the norm with many tourism events of its kind that are hosted in particular cities all over the world.
- 11.7 The Department considers conducting tourism business workshops with emerging tourism enterprises to assist them in complying with all the industry related legislations and requirements needed to access departmental programmes.
- 11.8 The Minister of Tourism engages the Minister of Small Business Development in conceptualising programmes that may benefit rural communities through agri-tourism and the Enterprise and Supplier Development element in the new Tourism B-BBEE Sector Codes that may assist local suppliers and the tourism industry to comply with transformation imperatives.

30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 195 of 196

11.9 The Minister ensures that South African Tourism conducts a cost-benefit analysis of Indaba to ascertain to what extent it adds value to private sector exhibitors and municipalities. In particular, all municipal exhibitors should be canvassed to ascertain to what extent tourism was increased in their areas of jurisdiction as a result of Indaba and compare this to the cost of exhibition.

12. Conclusion

Indaba 2016 was a success and the Committee was satisfied that the Department and South African Tourism are doing everything possible to put South Africa on the international map and assisting tourism businesses to flourish. Most noticeably was the involvement of the 70 tourism SMMEs that were afforded an opportunity to attend Indaba free of charge to expose their businesses to international markets or buyers. The partnership between the Department, South African Tourism, and the Tourism Enterprise Partnership is commended in that regard.

The growth of Indaba to be a Pan-African tourism event is evident as the show was attended by a number of African tourism ministers. Indaba has become a platform for discussing African tourism issues and the Committee would like to see more participation of African countries in the future.

The Committee notes that a company will be appointed soon to partner with South African Tourism (SAT) to plan and host Indaba. This will relieve SAT staff of the tedious process of planning for Indaba and afford them time to concentrate on marketing the 30 AUGUST 2016 PAGE: 196 of 196

country and driving business tourism. The Committee awaits the outcome of this process and looks forward to a better and improved Indaba that meets international standards and competes globally.

Report to be considered.