**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY WEDNESDAY, 24 MAY 2023**

**VOTE NO 39 – TRADE, INDUSTRY AND COMPETITION**

***PROCEEDINGS OF HYBRID MINIPLENARY – GOOD HOPE CHAMBER***

Members of the mini-plenary session met at Good Hope Chamber at 17:19.

The House Chairperson Mr C T Frolick took the Chair and requested members to observe a moment of silence for prayer or meditation.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon members, before we proceed with the Order, I would like to bring to your attention that the hon Minister of Trade, Industry and Competition have requested permission from the Speaker to display articles in the Chamber which are of particular importance to his budget speech. In terms of the Rules articles are on occasion brought to the Chamber if there are none threatening objects and with prior approval by the Speaker. In this regard, the Minister was granted permission.

**APPROPRIATION BILL**

Debate on Vote No 39 – Trade, Industry and Competition:

The MINISTER OF TRADE, INDUSTRY AND COMPETITION: House

Chairperson, hon members, fellow South Africans, I stand before this House at a time of great uncertainty and crises – for the world and especially for the developing economies, such as South Africa.

Context always matters. And this context matters greatly to how we govern and how we think about our economy and about our place in the world. As the President of the World Bank described it, and I quote**:** “Rather than gaining ground, the poor are being left behind in a global tragedy of inequality. This drastic narrowing of economic and social progress is creating a time of upheaval in economics, politics, and geopolitical relationships”.

Hon members, we have to contend with very heavy headwinds. And despite the challenges, South Africa is making strides in its recovery from the impact of COVID-19: GDP has recovered from the heavy blow to economic output that the pandemic brought

and UCT research shows that 95% of the formal sector jobs have now been recovered.

This is good news. But the impact of the war in Ukraine and the energy shortages have had numerous negative consequences for trade, for the cost of living and for the investment environment.

And the impact of climate change is being felt more and more by people around the world, both in developed and developing economies.

This ‘poly-crisis’ – as some commentators describe it – requires a steady hand on the tiller, agility, and calm but determined resolve.

We have to put our heads down and find a way to battle through the storm.

In the past few years, our central mission at the Department of Trade, Industry and Competition has been to build on our country’s innate resilience, so as to nurture a more resilient economy – one that both grows and transforms.

What that means is that we need to grow our economy but to do so in a way that benefits the many and not just the few.

In the past, when the economy has grown, it has tended to favour those with existing wealth and privilege. That is unsustainable, the inequality gap gets wider.

We have to close it. We have to create economic opportunities for those who have not benefited in the past. They must not be left behind.

In this year’s budget speech, Chairperson, I want to tell the House that despite extraordinary headwinds and challenges, we have made considerable progress with pursuing the goals of growth and transformation, and have laid substantial foundations for economic recovery based on increased investment, industrialisation, localisation and trade.

This represents, hon members, a quiet revolution in the way that we, as government, contribute to and influence the market economy on behalf of the interests of all who live in South Africa.

This is not a technical exercise. The economy has a very human face. When the economy struggles, people suffer. When it grows and transforms, then more people can thrive.

Over the past 12 months, I have told Parliament the stories of South African workers, of entrepreneurs, of industrialists – young people, women, black and white compatriots whose stories illustrate the impact of our new way of doing things. These stories set out more than 150 case studies of real, tangible impact, stories of people like Nokwazi Mbele, a young vibrant program manager at a factory in Kwadukuza that makes wire harnesses for cars, supported by the auto masterplan.

Sanele Luthuli, a production analyst producing pulp that will go on to be used for making viscose and pharmaceuticals whose factory used a Department of Trade, Industry and Competition incentives.

Mike Nkuna and Rashid Gutta, who both run their own furniture manufacturing businesses and are examples of black industrialists now covered by a masterplan.

Neil du Preez of MellowVans and a team of innovators who design and produced a 3-wheel electric vehicle being sold on our roads and exported to other countries, supported by the Industrial Development Corporation, IDC.

nuclear engineer Dr Ramatsemela Masango who manufactures electrical inverters and who is also supported by the IDC. Disabled workers Kyle Turner and Thato Mbhele who works at a factory that makes plugs, which we supported to get offtake commitments from two large retailers.

Trainees Nwabisa Bavuma and Garrison Cotzee who work at a company that makes underwater LED lights and cameras that are used for the undersea cables that connect South Africa with the rest of the world and Janette Hilton-Gericke, the owner and Rozanne Heyns, a sewing machinist who work together in a the Department of Trade, Industry and Competition support factory, to make the jerseys for Bafana Bafana, the SA netball team, and I want to add, the Stormers supporters for the rugby match on Saturday against the Irish Munsters at the Cape Town Stadium.

Hon members, later today, Deputy Minister Gina will speak to the practical reforms in how the Department of Trade, Industry and Competition works to enable government to transform people’s lives, and we do this, Chairperson, because of people like those I have mentioned that we do what we do. That’s our purpose.

Tomorrow at the NCOP, Deputy Minister Majola will outline the partnerships with provinces and local government and with partner countries on the African continent showing how the Department of Trade, Industry and Competition is seeking to mobilise support within the country and across the African continent for a vision of growth and jobs.

I will set out the progress we have made over recent years and especially the past year, the obstacles that have held us back and what we need to address, and our plans for the coming years.

We are strengthening the foundations of growth and transformation through investment, industrial development and trade.

In 2019, hon members, we announced the reimagined industrial strategy. In 2020, we used it to focus on COVID-19 industrial products, manufacturing billions of rands of hand sanitisers, ventilators, vaccines, masks, anaesthetics, and other products for our own market but also for exports.

In 2021, we published our policies on trade, competition and localisation and we made significant progress with the masterplans and with sector pacts.

In 2022 in the first part of this year, we focused on investment, on localisation, on trade, onjob creation and on a just energy transition and its potential to catalyse what we regard as a whole economy transformation.

First, Chairperson, investment is the lifeblood of growth. We have reported to Cabinet a number of investment projects that had a significantly positive effect in the last year. They include, the opening of the Hesto Harnesses factory with 4 000 jobs in Kwadukuza. The launch of the new Isuzu D-Max bakkie produced in the Eastern Cape. The opening of the new Sappi Saiccor facility with R5,5 billion in expected output and exports and the connection of the new Google undersea cable

linking South Africa with West Africa and Europe, to enable businesses and personal communication, search functions, financial transactions and entertainment.

Through successes such as this, South Africa has exceeded its previous five-year target for investment, with R1,5 trillion in new investments announced over this period.

But if we are going to grow and transform, we need much more investment. Hence, we are setting a new annual stretch target of R400 billion in new investment pledges to be focused on by the Department of Trade, Industry and Competition group for this financial year, some I am happy to say which already we are already securing. And this is in support of the broader five-year plan, the President announced, to raise R2 trillion. The first investment conference to report against the new target will be convened by March 2024.

Of course, while South Africa welcomes investment, we are determined to act against misuse of our financial markets to hide the proceeds of corruption and crime. Today, I published a set of regulations that require companies to determine the real identity of shareholders who hold more than 5% of a

company’s shares. This is also a step in addressing the concerns that has resulted in South Africa being greylisted by the Financial Action Task Force.

Second, hon Speaker, localisation – increasing local production and innovation is key to expanding the productive economy.

Both investments and localisation require additional funding and other support. Last year, the Department of Trade, Industry and Competition group enabled R30 billion in various incentives and industrial funding to be made available to firms based in South Africa.

We are making progress with efforts to beneficiate our raw materials, a large new steel mill is under construction in Germiston that will use South African iron ore to produce flat steel products and bring competition to the upstream market, employing about 300 new workers from townships like Katlehong.

Ten new factories are in full production in the new Tshwane SEZ employing over 2 500 workers, and in March this year, we signed memorandum of Understanding, MoU, with the world’s 4th

biggest car-maker Stellantis, to explore possible local assembly of their vehicles.

A number of successes were also achieved last year in products such as pharmaceuticals, glassware, food products, clothing, car components and many others. A new cooking oil refinery will open in Richards Bay later this year. Building on this, we are setting a target of R40 billion in additional local output and commitments this year.

The foundation for achieving this is the public-private partnerships through which businesses are committing large sums of money to boost local procurement. Companies have made these commitments include Coca-Cola, Air Liquide, Shoprite- Checkers, Pepsico, Consol Glass, Heineken, Implats, Mercedes Benz, VW, BMW, Ford, Nissan, Toyota and Isuzu. Each and all of them deserve recognition and respect for showing such confidence in South Africa.

We have built up a significant localisation chest, made up of R4 billion in localisation and supplier development funds for our industrial sectors like green energy, equipment, food and medical devices, and R19 billion in commitments to procurement

in sectors such as auto components and mining supplies. These will all be actively used to help achieve the new goal for this year and beyond.

Hon members, these gains should not be under-estimated. As I say, such investment is essential if our economy is to grow and transform. The fact that we have attracted such investments, and built up this multi-billion rand localisation resource chest, is testimony to the fact that our investment appeal and economic potential remains clear and real, despite the challenges and the tough headwinds.

Contrary to the doom and gloom merchants who seem to revel in their despondency and despair, there are sound grounds for hope that our economy can revive and prosper.

Third, Chairperson, on the trade front there are further reasons to be optimistic.

Last year, South Africa crossed the R2 trillion export mark for the first time, selling agriculture and manufactured products and minerals that creates jobs. South Africa has access to a number of markets on preferential terms. Despite

the challenging global environment, we are setting a stretch target for this year of achieving R800 billion in global manufacturing exports, and R8 billion in global business services exports.

Trade with the rest of Africa has a great potential to expand the economy. Our target is to export at least R330 billion in manufactured goods to other African countries as the minimum goal and we hope we can achieve more.

In this past year alone, South Africa hosted the first African Continental Free Trade Area, AfCFTA, Business Forum in Cape Town bringing together businesses across the African continent. Two trade-related protocols were completed. Eighty- eight percent of tariff lines have agreed rules of origin and the Southern African Customs Union, Sacu, finalised an offer for South Africa and four neighbours of products where we will open our markets under the new AfCFTA preferences.

And, in the course of this financial year, we plan to start trading under the AfCFTA, building on the foundations laid in the past year. This is the next vital step in the project that will occupy a generation of compatriots to fully implement.

These are important developments because they can boost our efforts to industrialise and beneficiate our minerals, create jobs for young people and diversify our export markets in a turbulent and polarising world. Our prosperity, Chairperson, is inextricably linked to that of the continent.

State visits are now used to address economic opportunities more actively. Since last year’s Budget Vote, 12 business forums with heads of state and investors were held, covering relations with countries to which we export about R300 billion worth of goods, sustaining almost 60 000 direct jobs. More than 1 000 delegates from South African firms participated in these forums, and this year, a further 10 new business forums will be held, with greater focus on follow up opportunities for South African firms.

We need to open more market access for our products and will engage trading partners to open up those markets on citrus fruit, on horses, on game meat and we will seek to expand exports to the European Union and to the United Kingdom.

In August, we will host the Brazil, Russia, India, China and South Africa, Brics – Business Forum to explore value-added exports and higher levels of investment.

Given the importance of our relationship with the United States, we will step up our engagement with senior US government and business representatives, to retain preferential access to trade under African Growth and Opportunity Act, Agoa. This is an extraordinarily important opportunity, to boost trade and jobs in spite of the challenges of the current environment.

South Africa is well-positioned to benefit from these different trading relationships. All of them are important to us, and each of them brings different kinds of value to our economy and to our people. Hence, we must ensure that they are all valued and respected, and nurtured appropriately.

In addition, in the past year, hon members, we have adjusted trade tariffs to address the concerns of a number of sectors, in product such as fridges, rubberised textile fabrics, chemicals and many others.

At times the evidence leads us to decline a tariff increase application, as we did for frozen foods, and when it is needed, we increase the level of protection, as we did in the case of cement, where dumping threatened large numbers of local jobs and firms.

Critics sometimes claim that we intervene too much in the economy. Well, hon members, if this is what ‘intervention’ means, then I am happy to plead guilty. We intervene to preserve fair trading relationships, to save businesses and protect livelihoods.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon Minister, I see there is a hand I want to recognise it. Hon member, why are you rising?

Mr G K Y CACHALIA: Chair, I want to ask if the Minister will take a very short question on something he has just raised. It’s very short.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon Minister, are you prepare to take a question?

The MINISTER OF TRADE, INDUSTRY AND COMPETITION: Happy to do

it right at the end if there is time.

The MINISTER OF TRADE, INDUSTRY AND COMPETITION: And let me

then continue, Chairperson. Fourth, I want to come to jobs – which is where the need to grow and transform matters most.

While our efforts have focused on protecting existing jobs, given the size of the unemployment challenge, our industrial policy also seeks to identify new sectors with potential to grow, including in the medical value chain, with medical devices, vaccines, cannabis for medical treatment and other products. In the green value chain, with solar and wind energy components, battery manufacturing and electric vehicles. In the digital value chain, with artificial intelligence applications, 3-D printing, higher-end call centres and in attracting digital migrants, and in the food value chain, covering fruit, meat, nuts, oils and processed foods.

For this year, the Department of Trade, Industry and Competition - group will have a target of mobilising

R35 billion incentives, supplier development and industrial funding to back firms that seek to modernise, to grow and to

expand their businesses. This is the foundation of sustainable job creation.

We will seek to cover one million current workers with various Department of Trade, Industry and Competition measures, covering from trade support, master plans, industrial incentives or competition settlements. And we have set a target of 100 000 new jobs, through the Social Employment Fund and in manufacturing and productive services.

To improve the ease of doing business, we are finalising amendments to the Companies Act and changes to the International Trade Administration Commission, ITAC, processes, making it easier for companies to comply with legislation or access services so that we unlock more investment and growth.

We spend a lot of time and energy listening to business representatives across our economy and we have heeded criticism that in some cases there is too much regulation or the wrong type of regulation.

Our job is to balance the needs of particular businesses and sectors, with the wider public interest, and to strike the right balance, so that the rules of the game serve both the need to grow the economy and to transform it.

Fifth, Chairperson, energy is the foundation of modern industrialisation and sustainable development. Energy shortages are extracting a high price in the short term. We recognise the hardship to businesses and to livelihoods. We have to put the electricity crisis behind us as quickly as possible. But if taken on with focus and vigour, the energy sector provides historic opportunities for a green transition and for an injection of capital and innovation in the economy. This is what we call a ‘whole economy’ approach.

The just energy transition focuses on three main areas, electricity, green hydrogen and electric vehicles. These represent three major areas of our economy – they are three big levers.

But the potential for a whole economy transformation goes beyond them. If we get the transition right, we will create new industrial value chains across our economy, benefiting

people in parts of the country that have hitherto not had access to such development.

That’s the grand prize. We must align our strategy and our plans, we must remain loyal to the underlying principle of a ‘just’ transition, we must rally many different sources of finance, local and international, public and private, and, we must safeguard the investments with sound governance, as well as robust and credible transparency measures.

To address the challenge, we are supporting the national action plan on electricity, but we also bringing in the Department of Trade, Industry and Competition capacity skills and networks to support it.

Today, I published two block exemptions for energy users and energy suppliers, to enable collaboration to address energy shortages and share facilities, to coordinate maintenance and to work together to increase supply of energy. I also published new energy standards today that will require energy efficient light bulbs to be used in homes and offices.

By the end May, we will launch both an energy resilience fund of R1,3 billion in support available to enterprises including SMMEs to mitigate the impact of loadshedding, and the new energy one-stop shop in the Department of Trade, Industry and Competition to assist with speeding up regulatory processes to accelerate private sector investment in electricity generation.

And to support the transition to electric vehicle manufacturing, considerable technical work is being done and engagements held with National Treasury to expeditiously finalise an affordable and effective strategy, and we are confident we are close to completing that roadmap.

This will be complemented by a new project we are launching next month, to identify opportunities for battery production in South Africa. In support of this, we will be working with partners – Finland, the United States, China, Belgium, Germany, Zimbabwe, Zambia and the DRC – on battery production value chains.

We are playing our part in achieving the ambitious vision of the just energy transition, and we will continue to serve its

reform agenda so that it can realise its full transformational potential.

Chairperson, hon members, this year’s Annual Performance Plan of the department sets out the key elements of the South African reimagined industrial policy that seeks to deepen the domestic market by growing jobs, increasing productivity and undertaking other measures to improve equity and income distribution. But also to widen the market for South African goods and services through a stronger focus on exports to the rest of the African continent and other rapidly growing economies. And it comes with supply-side measures that seek to improve competitiveness, build resilience and strengthen the agility and innovation at firm level.

The APP is a significant step change that has been introduced, with an industrial policy framework, clear targets on jobs, on investment, on exports, on localisation and to galvanise the department on these important drivers of growth. I have announced stretch targets today, higher than that set out in the APP. The master plans, already yielding good results in areas such as autos, clothing and poultry, will be expanded with a stepped-up implementation of the furniture master plan.

And to complement these, we will focus on greater economic inclusion. We will achieve this with five focused steps, addressing inequality and extend worker ownership, confronting spatial inequity, promoting black industrialists, advancing to a more open and competitive economy and protecting consumers.

Firstly, we will address inequality through greater worker shareholding in the firms that they work at and finalising the Companies Amendment Bill in Cabinet within 3 months, which deals with disclosure of wage differentials.

Mandy Mtilwa, Kim Williams and Mbatha Maphela are workers at Pepsico who are now shareholders in the company, with thousands of other workers in the same company, following the agreement reached with the Department of Trade, Industry and competition in merger proceedings.

This past year alone, more than 100 000 workers became shareholders in the companies they work for, receiving dividends from the company, and with shareholding worth more than R20 billion at no cost to them.

For this year, we setting ourselves a target of 20 000 more workers to be covered by worker ownership schemes, and we also targeting R7,5 billion in incentive support for programmes in labour-absorbing sectors. And we are hosting a Worker Ownership Conference and promoting worker directors on the boards of companies.

Secondly, we will address spatial inequity through approving R15 billion in industrial incentives outside the five main metros. We publishing our intention to establish an SEZ in Namaqua in the Northern Cape, which will open beneficiation opportunities in an area with large deposits of zinc and which is in the proximity of the new green hydrogen hub of Boegoebaai.

We are undertaking outreach visits to every district and metro in South Africa, taking the Department of Trade, Industry and Competition and partner departments’ facilities to communities, including funding facilities, registering a company, tax registration and small business support.

And every senior Department of Trade, Industry and Competition official will be allocated a district to champion, so that the

work of the department more strongly reflects the needs of communities and businesses.

Thirdly, we will promote black industrialists through enabling R40 billion in annual industrial output and 23 000 total jobs to be sustained by black industrialists. We will host the next Black Industrialist Conference by February. We will target

R8 billion in support programmes for SMMEs, and firms owned by black South Africans, women and youth and we will mobilise support through new agreements with the private sector that secures funding for economic inclusion.

I am happy to announce that an hour ago, the Chief Executive Officer of Citi Bank confirmed that they will make a grant of R200 million available for black industrialists in the Vaal area as part of their equity equivalent investment programme. And what all of these does, hon members, is repositioning the BEE strategy to focus on enabling higher contribution by black industrialists to growth and to job creation. These firms are already involved in space technology, in food, in engineering, in car components, in poultry and sugar production, in clothing, in skincare, in pharmaceuticals and in other sectors.

And fourthly, we will promote a more open economy, by addressing the challenges of competition, high economic concentration and the effects of market dominance and we will do so by releasing the results of the market inquiry on online services shortly. We are conducting new market inquiries into fresh food produce, media and the steel industry and we are gazetting block exemptions for small businesses from certain terms of the Competition Act from 1 August 2023.

Today, we published new Competition Tribunal Rules for market inquiries.

And fifthly and finally, we will promote and protect consumers’ interests and address excessive pricing through actions by the competition, trade and consumer regulators, combining their resources where it is necessary to do so. Conditions will be put to trade measures to address pricing challenges. Competition and consumer regulators will pursue cases against firms who charge excessive profits.

Now hon members, I have spoken of the actions in the economy, of cars and food and pharmaceuticals. But the Department of Trade, Industry and Competition work is also about building

the South African narrative, of telling our wider story, contemporary and historical. One film series supported by the Department of Trade, Industry and Competition, Shaka Ilembe, is due to be released shortly, it sets out the story of an extraordinary man and an early nation builder.

That spirit is what should inspire us now – with heads down, we can settle through the storm and emerge stronger, yet more resilient, and with a sustainable and sturdy economy.

In conclusion, Chairperson, despite all the obstacles in our path, and the global headwinds that we face, we are making solid, steady progress. We are building a stable platform for our national revival in which the economy will both grow and transform. And given the tough context, I am especially proud of the efforts of our officials in partnership with businesses and workers, and the Deputy Ministers and I commend this Budget Vote to the House. I thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): No, the Minister does not have any time left. He used his 30 minutes very effectively.

*IsiXhosa*:

Nksz J HERMANS: Igama lamakhosikazi.

*English*:

Hon House Chairperson, Ministers, Deputy Ministers, Members of Parliament, distinguished guests, team Department of Trade, Industry and Competition, DTIC sitting at the back and fellow South Africans. We are meeting here today on the eve of Africa day. This year we celebrate the 60th anniversary of the Organisation of African Union, OAU now the African Union, AU under the slogan: “Our Africa our future.” During this month, we take the opportunity to celebrate our African diversity and successes and the wealth of opportunity this continent possesses.

The theme of 2023 is: “Accelerating the implementation of the African Continental Free Trade Area to bring greater prosperity to the continent.” The Portfolio Committee on Trade, Industry and Competition is tasked with overseeing the department and its seven entities. It also oversees the BBBEE Commission, which is a trading entity under the department.

The committee has engaged the Department of Trade, Industry

and Competition on its allocated financial resources and how these will be utilised in the 2023-24 financial year.

During its engagement with the department, the committee scrutinised the R10,92 billion budget allocation for the 2023-

24 financial year. It focused on the allocation for the department’s operations, incentives for business and transfers to entities to carry out their mandates. The committee welcomes to continued use of the three ... [Inaudible] ... outcomes introduced in 2022 namely, industrialisation to promote jobs and rising incomes, transformation to build an inclusive economy and thirdly, a capable state to ensure improved impact of public policies.

These outcomes seek to address the country’s long-standing challenges of slow economic growth, high unemployment, income inequalities and high levels of poverty. Furthermore, the annual performance plan, APP now also focuses on contributing towards the energy action plan as the Minister had indicated. The committee notes the plan to establish the energy one stop shop which will assist power generating companies to navigate different processes that apply in law and increase turnaround times, by assisting investors to submit applications through a

single window process to obtain all necessary government approvals. Unblocking teams are being established to assist invest investors.

For the 2023-24 financial year. the Minister has responded to the committee’s call for a more targeted and impactful approach, to ensure that the triple challenges of unemployment inequality and poverty are addressed. In this regard, the department has amended its approach to target performance targets and formulation. With a new approach the outcomes should be more explicit and allow the committee to monitor the effect of the department’s work more easily on the on the economy and job creation.

In addition, the approach seeks to reduce silo behaviour within the department and between the department and its entities. This should assist in facilitating a more efficient use of resources and coherent formulation and implementation of policies. In this regard, the department has formulated 45 output targets which the relevant department programmes and entities jointly contribute to. For example, the department in conjunction with its entities such as the Industrial Development Corporation, IDC and the National Empowerment

Fund, NEF would be jointly responsible to achieve the target of facilitating 23 000 jobs in black industrialist firms.

We acknowledge Mr Nkanyiso Mkhize from ARTsolar who went from being a general worker to a warehouse manager through attending training courses. This appointment enabled him to fulfil a dream of buying a house for his mom and buying his first car. There are people with dreams and aspirations behind the numbers we are talking about today.

Amongst the output targets there is a target to support

1 million jobs through master plans as the Minister has indicated. The committee acknowledged the important role played by government business and organised labour in developing seven master plans to support industrialisation and implementation of the reimagined industrial strategy. The master plans cover the following sectors, automotive, retail clothing, textiles, footwear and leather, furniture, poultry, steel and metal fabrication and Global Business Services.

These collaborations have been largely successful in developing a roadmap to stabilise and grow the seven targeted industries. The committee noted the success stories in the

implementation of the automotive and Global Business Services Master Plan. Part of the retail, clothing, textiles, footwear and leather master plans seeks to curb illicit trade, illicit imports and illegal imports of clothing particularly misinvoicing of imported goods. In this regard, the committee welcomed the department’s collaboration with SA Revenue Service, Sars in addressing illicit trade. One of the successes has been a recent court ruling by the Supreme Court of Appeal in favour of the SA Revenue Service regarding the seizure of important clothing that had been under declared.

As part of building a capable state to ensure improved impact of public policies, the department and its entities must be able to effectively use its available resources to fulfil their mandates in a transparent and accountable manner. The committee noted that for the 2021-22 financial year, the Auditor-General had audited the department and six of its entities and the remaining entities were audited independently.

The committee has been consistently overseeing the performance of the National Regulator for compulsory specifications over several years and has welcomed this improvement in its

governance. The Minister has done significant work in addressing several governance challenges particularly within the SA Bureau of Standards and the National Lotteries Commission. There have also been several high-level appointments in the department’s regulatory entities, such as the Chairperson of the Companies Tribunal, the Commissioners for BBBEE Commission, the Competition Commission, the International Trade Administration Commission of South Africa and the National Lotteries Commission.

The committee has been focusing on overseeing efforts to address corruption at the National Lotteries Commission. It has had regular engagements and reports from the National Lotteries Commission and the Special Investigating Unit on its investigation into alleged corruption and maladministration at the National Lotteries Commission. It welcomed the appointment of the new board and the commissioner, as well as the progress made in establishing systems to root out corruption in the granting of lottery funds.

The committee noted that certain entities have unfunded mandates, given legislative changes. In addition, transfers to most entities have not substantively increased over the last

few financial years. Given the ongoing fiscal constraints, the committee urged DTIC to review the prescribed income sources, such as levies or fees for services rendered available to entities to ensure that they are able to effectively fulfil their legislative mandates.

The committee will continue to oversee the implementations of programmes funded through this budget. The committee supports the 2023 Budget Vote, Trade, Industry and Competition and recommends that the House adopts Budget Vote 39 Trade, Industry and Competition. I thank you.

Mr D W MACPHERSON: Hon members, cast your mind back to November 2017. South Africa was at a low point. We were told that the choice was between a continuation of the Zuma presidency and more State Capture under Nkosazana Dlamini-Zuma or a new dawn under Mr Cyril Ramaphosa which would focus on growing the economy, creating new jobs, safer neighborhoods, and better education.

The nation was nervous, its future lay in the hands of 4 500 delegates at Nasrec on that fateful December day. Mr.

Ramaphosa won narrowly, and even non-ANC supporters celebrated

his victory. Business popped champagne, people were relieved. The country was saved, so we were told.

However, what really happened on the 20th of December 2017 was one man pulling off the biggest con South Africa has ever seen. Ever since that day, life has got a lot worse for a lot more South Africans.

The average growth rate has been 1% and this year we will be closer to zero. Unemployment has worsened every single year under President Ramaphosa. More black South Africans are unemployed than ever before. Eighty percent of our children cannot read for meaning. Violent crime is at record levels. We have had more blackouts in 2023 than in all of 2022.

Corruption is out of control. This was not the new dawn we were promised.

At the heart of these economic, growth and job creation ambitions promised by President Ramaphosa is the Department of Trade, Industry and Competition. However, every single year since Minister Patel was appointed as the Minister, the department has very little to show from its crucial mandate.

From its entities, to regulations, to being an advocate for businesses, almost everything they have touched, they have broken. There can be no argument that the economy is worse today than when Minister Patel came into office, and only him and President Ramaphosa can take responsibility for that.

Things have got so bad, that even big businesses has given up on the President and the Minister.

In a recent interview, Investec Group CEO, Fani Titi said:

“We are going nowhere fast. The government is disorganized. Totally disorganized.”

And this best sums up the mood of South African in general. Disorganized, chaotic and with no leadership.

Just yesterday, the International Trade Administration Commission, ITAC, shot down the Ministers flagship damaging policy of banning scrap metal exports for a period of 6 months. In announcing this policy last year, Minister Patel said:

“The most effective way to dampen demand for scrap metal is to prohibit exports for a period.”

ITAC, however, told the portfolio committee that there is no clear evidence that this ban had done what the Minister said would happen. In fact, ITAC went further to agree with the DA that the Minister’s policy of localization and tariff protection had made life worse for South Africans, admitting that this had added to the country’s inflations problems and the cost-of-living crisis. Nothing that the DA had not forewarned the President and the Minister about.

Hon members, master plans were supposed to be an economic catalyst and yet they have delivered so little because the very entities that are supposed to support economic growth, are the same ones choking businesses and making goods more expensive.

Astral Foods released their financial results this week and what they had been warning the government about for months, has now become a full-blown catastrophe which threatens food security in our country.

What it comes down to for Astral is that ANC sponsored blackouts and lack of water supply, have cost their business three-quarters of a billion rand in just the last 6 months. This is forcing the group to reallocate R400 million to supply water and electricity to their operations, which ultimately you and I will pay for in the price of chicken.

Ironically, it is the very same taxes that Astral pays government every year that are used to bail out Eskom which in turn is destroying their business. It is why 80% of the 1 517 businesses surveyed by the Social Research Foundation said that the country was moving in the wrong direction.

One month ago, the President and Minister held another iteration of the so-called investment conference in a continued attempt to sell South Africa as a globally relevant player and partner in trade and investment.

Columnist Ed Stoddard described the conference as a theatre of the absurd and I think that was rather generous considering what was to come a few weeks later. And the rhetorical question was simply asked, what exactly are we selling to the world?

It can’t be clean and accountable government. You can’t suggest it’s a stable economic environment. Or a country that can supply water and electricity to your factory. And certainly not a government that doesn’t support Russia in a war against Ukraine.

An article by journalist Claire Bisseker in the Financial Mail punched massive holes in President Ramaphosa’s claims that these conferences are a success. In fact, she claimed it is nothing than hot air to fool South Africans.

In detail she explains how these pledges amount to

R100 billion per year, just 1.5% of gross domestic product, GDP, and how fixed investment in the economy has dramatically declined from 22% of GDP in 2008 to just 14% today. In other words, and after inflation, capital expenditure is lower today than it was five years ago when President Ramaphosa was first elected.

This is the backdrop for the theatre of the absurd and one which is the true story of investments in South Africa. Matt Gertken, Chief Geopolitical strategist at benefit-cost analysis, BCA research recently commented:

“Ramaphosa is not considered a positive leader by financial markets going forward.”

He went on to say:

“He is old and suffering from scandals, he failed to implement significant structural economic reforms, he failed to mend divisions in the ruling party and now his credibility will suffer due to his foreign policy”.

Hon members, for many years, the ANC have tried to convince the public that Mr. Ramaphosa is above the problems of his party, that he is an astute businessman, and that the ANC can renew itself. All of these have turned out to be a lie now.

It’s clear now that we don’t just have an ANC problem, but we also have a Ramaphosa problem.

However, what is really beyond any comprehension, is the treasonous lengths that the ANC government have gone to risk our exclusion from the African Growth and Opportunities Act, AGOA.

The South African government has behaved in the most appalling way by continuously supporting Russia, and at the same time claiming it is non-aligned. They have done everything possible to lose our AGOA status from hosting Russia’s foreign Minister to abstaining on every single United Nation, UN, resolution condemning the war against Ukraine, even when every other Brics’s country did so recently, to sending waves of Ministers and officials to Moscow.

There is no length that the ANC will not go to in attempt to appease Mr Putin and keep the money flowing to Luthuli House. The worst act of sabotage by this government has been the scandal around the Lady R. There can be no doubt that instruments of war were loaded onto the Lady R, a sanctioned Russia ship in the dead of night at a South African Naval Base.

That no one claims to know what was on board, from the President to the Minister of Defence is an example of how insipid, week and pathetic this government has become.

Two weeks later, the President has still not appointed a judge to head the judicial inquiry into this debacle. Why is no one

able to pick up the phone and ask someone in Simonstown what was on that ship is an embarrassment to our nation?

And all of this has come at great cost to our country and our investor status. The Rand has fallen to historical lows, and we are stand at the precipice of losing R400 billion worth of exports. Is it worth it?

Is supporting Russia, aiding a sanctioned ship, and agitating our trading partners really worth it, for a country where even Mozambique provides more trade with us? The answer surely has to be no.

And where has Minister Patel been in all of this? What has he done in Cabinet and in public to push back against this kamikaze attack by his government on our economy? Where is your patriotism, Minister Patel? Why are you not speaking up for your constituents in business and manufacturing?

Hon members, while the ANC has given up on South Africa, the DA will not. That is why the Leader of the DA recently travelled to Washington to meet with United State of America

law makers and had one simple message, the ANC is not South Africa.

We cannot allow South Africa to be punished for the ANC’s reckless approach to our economy, and we will continue to lobby and fight for our country. Next week, Western Cape Premier, Alan Winde will make the same trip and repeat the same message America. Do not punish South Africa because of the ANC.

Hon members, next year, we have every opportunity to rid our beautiful country of this unpatriotic, Russian captured, parasitic organization, the ANC. I know that change is just around the corner, and we can save what we have and rebuild what the ANC has destroyed. I thank you.

Ms K N F HLONYANA: House Chairperson, greetings to the commander in chief president Julius Malema, officials of the EFF, commissars, fighters, and ground forces.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Order, hon members.

Ms K N F HLONYANA: The EFF will be celebrating 10 years of unbroken promises this year. We would like to take this opportunity to invite all South Africans to join us in celebrating a political party that has brought change to the lives of the people and the marginalized. A political party that in its 10 years, have held the corrupt ANC government to account. A political party that fights gender-based violence and have raised awareness of the scourge that faces South Africa, where women are killed daily.

On the 29 of July, the EFF will be hosting the festival of the poor at the FNB stadium. You are all invited. We call on the ground forces to fill up the FNB stadium inside and out.

Doomsayers said we will never make it. They said we will never grow. But today, the EFF is turning 10 years old, and we will deliver the commander in chief, Julius Malema as the President of South Africa, come 2024.

The Department of Trade, Industry and Competition could have been in the forefront of the creation of major industries that are seen in other countries like China, Russia, and South Korea. All these three countries combined created millions of jobs directly and indirectly for their citizens. and their

government plays a central role in the growth of their industry. The industries that we once seen as small businesses and medium, today are dominating the world market. All this within the last 30 years. Sadly, this cannot be said about South Africa. Unfortunately, we do not have such stories to tell Minister, as we have no major industries which have been created by this ANC government in the last 29 years. Your government keeps on telling us about hope. That is ...

IsiZulu:

... siyaqhuba. Niliqhubelaphi lelizwe?

*English*:

To where exactly when the industries in all sectors big and small continue to collapse? Minister Patel, there is a 31- year-old named Mondlane Thabang from Pienaar outside Mbombela in Mpumalanga who has been compelled to close down his poultry business he has been running for four years, due to load shedding. He’s been specializing in producing eggs, hatching them and also selling broiler chicken for the living after being funded by the City of Mbombela. The incubation machine used for the hatching of eggs must always be on for production to be successful. He tried to use diesel during the times of

lower stages of load shedding, but he was now working at a loss. Unfortunately, Mr Thabang had to close the businesses and had to let go of his two employees. It is a shame that when it comes to SMMEs development, the ANC government creates and destroys at the same time. Absolutely madness!

Minister, as you and your ANC government continue to daydream and do the minimum, the reality is that only the EFF government can be able to industrialize at a large scale in order to promote job rising income for our people. It is only the EFF that can protect and transform, build an inclusive economy, a capable state, because we are not daydreamers like you.

Minister, in a short space of time, our MMCs both in Johannesburg and Ekurhuleni, have already demonstrated good governance and service delivery just to show how quickly EFF can turn things around. The EFF welcomes the African continent

... Chair, can I be protected, please?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon member, I protect you against your own members. It’s them that's making a noise.

Ms K N F HLONYANA: The EFF welcomes the African continent ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon members of the EFF and the DA. You are interrupting the speaker at the podium.

Thank you. Order, hon members. Order!

Ms K N F HLONYANA: ... trade agreement and it is providing opportunities to increase trade with other African countries and to develop new sectors in the economy. We too Minister Patel, like you, hope this increases South African trading partners within the African continent. The EFF has always called for one Africa, and we feel this is the right steps in achieving that. We hope that the creation of inclusive economy continues without hindrance and that the R9 billion which is earmarked by the Industrial Development Corporation to invest in women-led businesses become a success. We will be watching the space.

Minister, the truth is we will not attract major investment opportunity as a country where we have no stable electricity, and it is not the secret that our grid can collapse at any moment. Who will want to invest in such a country, let alone in a government that is famous for corruption? We do not see

the new Minister of Electricity resolving our country’s problems, Minister Patel. Instead, we see him touring the country. Maybe they should have made him the Minister of Tourism. You should have a word with him and make him understand that a country that cannot produce its own electricity is a country that cannot run its industries, as businesses close shops every time we have load shedding.

Even franchises like KFC have closed some of their shops, and we fear our beloved Nando’s might follow soon. Minister, this is our country, and we must build it. The factories you have spoken about at the beginning of your speech will die because of load shedding. There are no real gains. We are simply going backwards. The issue of our trading partner, especially the European Union and the United States, is shameless. The trade agreement must benefit both parties equally. At the moment, the scale tilt better to them than us. Their behaviour and attitude towards our citrus will only cripple this industry, and it may lead to job losses as well.

The False Codling Moth regulations passed by the European Union's mid-season, was not good for the citrus industry, and 2023 will be a very bad year for this sector. The European

Union's decision will collapse our economy. This is a typical of example when one trade partner does not care for another trade partner. First, it was the regulations with the citrus black spot. Now it’s the moth. Absolutely nonsensical!

Minister Patel, you are busy speaking about electrical vehicles without electricity. You may continue to daydream, Minister. The EFF rejects this Budget Vote. Thank you very much.

Ms Z MAJOZI: House Chairperson, this government has proven time and again that it is not capable of creating the kind of stability required for a stable and attractive trade and industry environment in South Africa. Across the board whether it be mining, food, health care, and most other industries, business is extremely concerned that failed statehood is now fast becoming a foregone conclusion. Grid collapse being the straw that is set to break the camel’s back. It is reported that last year power cuts cost between 7-8% of Gross Domestic Product. The South African rand plummeted to its lowest levels against the British pound in three years last week, nearing R25 to 1 GBP.

Private enterprise is throwing its hands up in exasperation as the situation worsens daily leaving private enterprise to find solutions and alternatives to growing government incompetency and ineptitude. The challenges are many and varied, but the main ones remain that of power, crime and transport logistics. These are all key to current and future business growth and foreign investment. If we add South Africa’s grey and unclear stance on certain international issues such as the situation in the Ukraine, Israel/Palestine, and the continued membership of the International Criminal Court, matters only become bleaker with South African business and its citizens becoming the net losers.

Agreements such as the United African Growth and Opportunity Act, swings precariously in the balance due to the above and is placing billions of Rand worth of preferential trade between the United States and South Africa at risk. Is this the time domestically to be fence-sitting internationally?

Diplomatic disagreements will definitely hurt more than help our domestic trade situation at this juncture, and government should be doing all it can to restore good relations with all international partners.

Global investors did not respond well to the Presidents possible stepping down in December 2022, and this still worries business as it could happen again. What is being done to assure foreign investment that it won't? This crisis has given rise to impact investing which are cross sectoral initiatives aimed at the deployment of capital that optimises financial, social, and environmental returns. As with many great initiatives in South Africa, we are met by a government that consistently shows its slow and disinterested approach to seeing through the success of programmes.

The African Free Trade agreement, we hope will not be one of these, but we won’t hold our breath. The African Free Trade Agreement is something that is supposed to unite and get Africa working, yet South Africa is struggling to get working. According to a 2014 World Bank report, approximately 80% of poverty reduction is due to a nation’s economic growth through free trade and free markets. Free trade and free markets are also what halved global poverty between 1981 and 2005.

This weak commitment from government in bringing those to book over fraud, bribery, corruption and state capture, leaves us with little hope that we have the institutions strong enough

to stave off the opportunistic criminals from other continental countries. We are concerned with how SARS will be capacitated to manage illicit financial flows and monitor monies owed to the revenue collector from foreigners who conducted business in South Africa.

The budget of this department does not sufficiently address these concerns which we fear is but another missed opportunity for South Africa to rebuild, reclaim and extend its economic development. For example, there is no dedicated funds to address the lack of infrastructure support for industrial zones of South Africa so that once free trade opens up between fellow African countries, we must be in a position to capitalise on the benefits of opening up borders to other African countries for trade so that our people are the ones to benefit.

Will Eskom be able to service increased economic activity from free trade? Whether we have sufficient police judicial services to deal with foreign criminals? Do we have agreements from other countries for these prosecutions? We ask those questions Minister, but the IFP supports the budget.

Mr F J MULDER: Hon Minister and hon members, the budget report and annual performance plan before the House today is indeed presentable, and through you, Chair, to hon Minister Patel, I wish to thank him for sharing the good news stories with us.

It’s good to hear and to recognise that. However, many of the preconditions for economic recovery are political in nature.

Today, I want to focus on the economic growth path of the department and through you Chair, I want to share this with the hon Minister. Not enough and possibly too late, and I will tell you why with the specific focus on economic growth and economic recovery.

South Africa's future economic prosperity is linked to political conditions and policy revisions. Current ANC policies have failed to deliver the growth South Africa needs to eradicate unemployment, poverty, skewed income and wealth distribution. A particular challenge is the restriction of South Africa's growth potential which has deteriorated over time from 3% per annum to around 1% per annum. South Africa's lack of political will and capacity to implement economic recovery plans that were either not implemented with speed and urgency or were not implemented at all, are serious

impediments. More rapid economic growth would have placed South Africa in a much-improved fiscal position with higher gross income product per capita and a substantially lower unemployment rate.

The South African government and the department should therefore focus on the removal of growth limitations in its short-run attempts to ensure economic recovery and economic growth. The South African economy is overburdened by regulation. It should be made easier for business to continue with its activities, rather than to focus on meeting all prescriptions.

Broad-based black economic empowerment, BBBEE, has run a failed course in South Africa and does not serve the best interests of the country. In many instances, it became a veil for state capture and corruption, and has developed into tokenism and favouritism.

Special economic zones are too fragmented and should be consolidated. In the current form, these zones do not reach sufficient critical mass to make any difference in the economic performance of South Africa.

Despite the many serious impediments and obstacles to sustained economic recovery in South Africa, two basic aspects should be resolved expeditiously. The two most important impediments are uninterrupted power supply, and I think we all agree on that, and service delivery by municipalities.

There is no doubt that the economy was already in difficulty before the first COVID-19 lockdown of March 2020 due to poor governance; state capture and corruption; falling productivity and low consumer and business confidence arising from structural rigidity in the public sector; policy uncertainty; a regulatory environment that hampers private fixed investment; inefficiencies in state-owned enterprises; increasing the costs of key inputs in production because of Eskom; a rising cost of capital; labour market rigidity; insufficient competition in product markets; and a general lack of maintenance at local government level, resulting in infrastructure neglect.

The current world economic outlook is unfavourable for the South African economy and signed trade agreements like the *African Growth and Opportunity Act,* Agoa, should be cherished. If the Agoa agreement is cancelled or not renewed in 2025, the

detrimental effects on our economy would be too much to contemplate.

African countries opened their markets on 1 January 2021 for free trade in terms of the African Continental Free Trade Area and bottlenecks such as border post delays should be removed, to ensure that the country reaps the full benefits of this agreement.

I wish to extend an invitation to hon Minister Patel on behalf of the FF Plus to receive and discuss the economic recovery plan that we put forward as a contribution towards the economy and the economic recovery plan of our country. South Africa deserves better. Thank you, Chair.

Mr W M THRING: Hon Chairperson, the ACDP notes the mandate of the Department of Trade, Industry and Competition to facilitate the creation of a conducive environment for companies and people to grow, consequently creating jobs.

Using corollary logic, it could be argued that because jobs are not being created, evidenced by our high unemployment rate of 32,9%, this department is failing then to create an environment conducive for economic growth.

The ACDP welcomes the improved ability to measure the department’s programmes as this facilitates and bolsters the oversight role the committee must play. We have generally given support to the department’s master plans as potential catalysts for economic and industrial growth within their respective sectors, while simultaneously calling for structural reform.

The work of the Department Of Trade, Industry and Competition is aligned to Aspiration 1 of the AU’s Agenda 2063, calling for a prosperous Africa, based on inclusive growth and sustainable development. Now, if we are to see inclusive growth and sustainable development, then South Africa and her citizens must come first above political ideology, race, race- based and cadre deployment policies. The worker empowerment objective must be used to provide equity for workers, irrespective of their race.

When looking at the failures of Eskom, the SA Airways, SAA, Denel and the Passenger Rail Agency of SA, Prasa, to name a few, we realise that merit and not race-based policies is what is needed to grow our industrial base. In this regard, the Employment Equity Amendment Act does not bring equity. It is

discriminatory, divisive, a relic of the apartheid job segregation law and contradicts the declaration that South Africa belongs to all who live in it, black and white. It also falls foul of Chapter 2(22) of our Constitution.

The ACDP will continue to promote the beneficiation of its extracted minerals, where beneficiation transforms a mineral or group of minerals into a higher value product which can be consumed locally or exported.

I wish to conclude with a plea from an ordinary South African. I plead with you to please join forces with other political parties in Parliament and make a plan to reduce the levels of load shedding. Businesses are failing, even large companies.

The company that I work for is now in millions of rand overdraft and a thousand families’ income is under threat, all as a result of load shedding.

What we need is an alternate; an alternate caring government that provides solutions to the problems faced by its citizens. That’s what is needed. The ACDP is that alternate. Thank you.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF TRADE, INDUSTRY AND COMPETITION: House

Chairperson, chairperson of the portfolio committee, hon members and fellow South Africans, we are presenting this Budget Vote during the hardest of times for our country. As highlighted in Minister Patel’s opening address, the current economic environment has taken a huge strain – and our overall economic outlook is subdued because of factors such as the energy – as everyone has been alluding to - and the European geopolitical conflict.

All of these factors account significantly into the backfoot with which we find ourselves, especially with regards to the low growth and the high unemployment figures. Hon members, despite all these headwinds that are foundational to our current shocks, we are not in despair. We are confident that we will pass this phase and return to a higher growth path and accelerated rate of reindustrialisation, the result of which would be the rising employment rate, upliftment of our people and the improvement of the social standards for our society.

As we are making a call not to despair, we are taking our strength from Jodi Ann Bickley, the British writer, who once advised us that, I quote: “When you are in the middle of a

storm cloud, it’s hard to think outside of it, but the only way out of the storm is to ride through it and things will be a lot clearer on the other side.” We have chosen to ride through and address these challenges and things will be clearer on the other side soon.

One of the biggest challenge we are confronting is the import/export balance impacting on our economy. South Africa’s import to GDP ratio is too high for an economy which needs to speed up its growth and a country desperately in need for job creation. The World Bank figures cites that in 2021 our imports were 25% to GDP which is inconsistent with our peer countries. Some of these products imported can justifiably be produced locally. To illustrate this point, on the 5 April 2023, I opened a black-owned footwear factory in Stanger, the Light House Footwear Factory, the department supported them through the Clothing and Textile Footwear Leather Growth Programme to buy machineries for about R6 million.

In that launch, I was informed that South Africa consumes almost 300 million pairs of shoes annually. The 75% of those are imported and only 25% are produced locally. Just imagine the impact that we can make in job creation and growth if we

can be intentional about driving import substitution and build small and middle-sized shoe factories across various districts. This factory I am referring to, already has an offtake with Jam Stores supplying 118 stores nationally. That is where we are getting into as the Department of Trade, Industry and Competition, DTIC, and we are intentional making sure that we open up those factories.

Minister Patel has spoken extensively about boosting local production and exports. Our vision as the Department of Trade, Industry and Competition we do not think only about large- sized manufacturing and factories, but also the small emerging ones because we strongly believe that a lot of opportunities there. I have a proud story of the young Jacobs couple in Ceres, in the Western Cape, which I visited in 2021 as part of inspecting the postCOVID-19 economic recovery in various factories. The Jacobs family manufactures jam and were under strain after the hard lockdown. We co-ordinated government assistance. We sent them to our trade mission in Dubai, in Durban for Inter-African Trade Fair.

The Department of Agriculture, Land Reform and Rural Development gave them a grant of R3,3 million. In Durban Trade

Fair, they have secured an offtake to Zambia, in Dubai they secured an offtake to the United Arab Emirates, UAE. Today, they supply Shoprite in Western Cape and are negotiating with Spar. If we can remember on 21 May 2023, their story was featured in eNCA and we are proud. Those are just but one examples where we are saying that we are trying to make a change and make sure that people get into the economic ... [Inaudible.] ... of our country.

As the department, we have decided to put a mirror against ourselves, to interrogate our inner workings, capacity and approaches in achieving all the systemic trade and industrial advances. We have accepted that a new approach in how we implement, give us much better results and this new approach is underpinned by a clear theory of change. At the centre of the re-imagined industrial policy are three apex outcomes agreed to in 2022-2023 financial year for the Department of Trade, Industry and Competition group and its entities to contribute on.

These three apex outcomes are: Industrialization to promote jobs and rising incomes; transformation to build an inclusive economy and a capable state to ensure improved impact on

public policies. These three outcomes have six underlying pillars: The first one, is to combine growth with transformation; to boost local production; to grow exports and expand African trade; to increase levels of investment; establish a more reliable and low-cost energy system while greening the economy overall and to grow employment. These six pillars shape the core objectives of the 2023-2024 annual performance plan, APP.

The Department of Trade, Industry and Competition group in previous annual performance plans, targeted inputs and activities that would have a beneficial outcome and impact on jobs, industrial outputs, exports and investment. This was done because many external factors driving the outcomes were outside the control of the department such as global economic and geopolitical developments, shock events including climate change and SA energy problems, transport and logistics and crime. This year, however, a significant step-change has been introduced. The new approach focuses on meaningful outputs, referred to as targets.

Hon members, ten core targets have been set that represent the real impact we aim to achieve in the economy and measure

crucial indicators like local output, job creation and performance of black industrialists. To demonstrate this with regards to the black industrialist, we have moved away from a broad-based black empowerment, which was more about securing shares from existing white companies, our policy levers have shifted towards expanding the number of firms and companies which are started and owned by black south Africans. We have very good successful stories when it comes to this black industrialist scheme.

Of course, there are still challenges in the policy and funding regime for black industrialists but we are determined to address those areas. The growth and transformation pillar can also be seen in our determination in the promotion of worker-ownership regime in the companies with board representations. While our targets are important, these core targets are the apex priorities of the department and all programmes of the Department of Trade, Industry and Competition are expected to contribute to the achievement of these essential outputs. In total 45 outputs targets have been set and shared with Parliament last month.

Chairperson, in this approach, Minister Patel has announced the stretch targets today higher than that set out in the annual performance plan. The purpose is to galvanise the department on these important drivers of growth. We are introducing clear targets with weekly reports by staff managers. We want a problem-solving approach to work, instead of a bureaucratic mindset. We are committed to integration of work between the Department of Trade, Industry and Competition entities.

We have started to target districts in the form of Imbizos with all our agencies needed by the public. We are taking the Department of Trade, Industry and Competition to the people. We have resolved that all our senior officials will be the ambassadors or champions for districts to ensure that we work with them to materially change the people’s lives. In the same vein, we are strengthening partnership with business and labour and social compacting. Internally, we have commenced with the project on the “fit for purpose” structure. The roles and responsibilities identified through “fit for purpose” structure will assist in addressing the working in silos, streamline business processes, reprioritise resources and reduce administrative burden.

All of the above measures are geared towards improving internal departmental capacity to deliver in driving reimagined industrialisation policy in the quickest possible way with good attitude and without red tapes. Hon members, I want to remind you of one of the English cleric and writer, Charles Caleb Colton, who once said: “Times of great calamity and confusion have been productive for the greatest minds. The purest ore is produced from the hottest furnace. The brightest thunder-bolt is elicited from the darkest storm.” That is exactly where we are. Thank you very much. [Time expired.]

Mr C N MALEMATJA: House Chairperson, Minister, Deputy Ministers, Members of Parliament, guests, everyone on the virtual platform, the ANC support the Vote. The ANC strategy and tactic highlight to us the relationship between the state and private capital. It reads as follows: The relationship between the national democratic state and all private capital, including the monopoly capitalist is one of unity, struggle, co-operation and contestation. The hon President Ramaphosa has gone broad and unpacked the correct proposition. The private sector has a co-operation role to play with the public sector to transform our economy and create necessary jobs for the vast majority of unemployed South Africans.

Since the start of the sixth administration, the ANC-led government introduced investment conferences to mobilise private sector to contribute towards the development of our country. The investment conference has since raised

R1,3 trillion in investment pledges in different sectors of our economy such as manufacturing, mining, infrastructure, retail and service centre. There are currently 169 projects that are either finalised or under construction.

With regard to building a capable state, it is critical to have a well-functioning relationship between the state and the private sector. The state cannot operate in isolation. The reimagined industrial strategy recognised the importance of leveraging the strength of the private sector in organised labour, as private sector is the key driver of economic growth in recognising the role of private sector.

*Sepedi*:

Taba ye botse ke ye. Tulong ya Tshwane go la Vlakfontein moo go bego go le lesodi, go se na le tshepho ya gore go ka direga selo, go ile gwa fihla Tona a sepela le Mopresidente. Ba ile ba dumelelana gore ba tla thoma seo se bitiwago Lefelo leo le Kgethegilego la tia Ekonomi ka Tshwane. Ke bolela se re na le

Ntate James Mlambo wa mengwaga ye 56, ke yo mongwe wa bao ba bego ba ioma go boradikontraka. Bjale ebile o rekile koloi ye e dirilwego moo. O latetiwe ke Agnes Kekana. Agnes Kekana ke mme yoo a ikgodiietiago bana a le tee ka ge a se na monna. Le yena o be a mpotia gore ke yo mongwe wa 12% ya bomme bao ba iomago moo. Le yena o rekile koloi ya Ford, yeo e dirilwego gona moo.

Ka re ke sa eme bjalo, gwa ba le Thabo Nkuna, yoo a bego a kratiueitile a se sa na tshepho ya gore a ka ba le bokamoso bjo bobotse. Ge ke mmotiiia o ile a re o na le mengwaga ye 23. O ile a tiea tsela ya bodiintasteri ba bathobaso. Ke motho yoo a sego a itekanela mmeleng. Le yena o rekile koloi, ebile ya gagwe ke ye tihweu. E dirilwe gona moo – ke ya Ford. Batho ba Tshwane re boile ra ba fa tshepho ra re meiomo yeo re tlilego go ba fa yona gona mola Vlakfontein – gona moo e bego e le lesodi – e tla fihla 10 000. Batho ba Tshwane ba bopane ngata e tee ka ge ba rata tiwelopele ya bona. Ba ioma ka tsela ye – ba re ga go na le di-construction mafia yeo e ka tsenago magareng ga bona ya senya moiomo wo mobotse wa bona. Batho ba Tshwane ba ile ba nthoma go Tona le Mopresidente ba re ke ba botie le go ba tshephiia gore ka 2024 ba tla e leboga ANC. Ga go na mmuio woo o ka iomago bjalo ka ANC.

*English:*

The continual power outages are having an advantage impact on the broader economy ability.

*Sepedi:*

Re le mokgatlo wa ANC, re lemogile gore seo ke hlobaboroko. Ke ka moo re rerago ka ga ...

*English:*

... the establishment of one-stop shop to assist power generating companies to navigate the different legislation process and improve turnaround time, assisting investors to submit applications through a single window process.

*Sepedi:*

Re le ANC ...

*English:*

... we are hard at work to find lasting solution to the energy crisis. We are confident that the bold approach by the APP will continue to solve contradictions. We are continuing as a society. Thank you so much.

Mr S M JAFTA: Chairperson, this budget must be viewed against the department’s goal of achieving local production increase in the trade and inclusive growth. It must also be viewed against the role of the Competition Commission, and whether it has been able to caution small businesses against price fixing, collusion and uncompetitive conduct. The Department of Trade, Industry and Competition is central to our industrial manufacturing capabilities. Without a thriving industrial and manufacturing sector, our trade potential can never be harnessed. Harnessing our trade potential equally entails transforming and diversifying our commodity products.

It is no common cause that the South African economy is still concentrated. In our 2019 manifesto, we made a compelling case for the adoption of an import substation strategy which was to map out our resolve to capacitate small and medium-sized enterprises through targeted seed funding, preferential procurement and supply development. We advise that the strategy was to be implemented through a import substitution agency.

Empirically, a case can then be made that the nonexistence of an import substitution strategy and agency is behind our trade

deficit. It is also the main drive of the overconcentration of dominant firms at the top levers of our economy. Competition settlements have been antipoor and inconsistence with the very purpose of including competition in the trade and industry portfolio. Dominant firms still dominate markets. They still hike prices and they often get away with it. Where penalties have been preferred, they are of antiunity. The budget must respond to all these issues. Accordingly, we will support this Budget Vote. I thank you.

Dr J C NTWANE: Hon House Chairperson, Minister, Deputy Ministers, Members of Parliament, distinguished guests and fellow South Africans, the ANC supports the Budget Vote 39. It is indeed an honour to stand before this honourable House to represent the people of the Northern Cape, and South Africa in driving the developmental agenda of our country. The ANC has a historic task of transforming the structure of our economy for the benefit of the people. Industrialising our economy is important in achieving this.

However, we cannot separate industrialisation from localisation. Localisation is one of several tools adopted in the economic reconstruction and recovery plan to improve the

buoyancy of the economy, promote investment, develop new markets, transform the economy, advance equitable special development and contribute to the development of a capable state. It is pivotal in stimulating growth and transformation, and it is about morphing into an enabling environment for inclusive growth, deepening the country’s industrialisation base and creating targeted transformation measures broadly.

Localisation expands the economy to include more participants and to ensure that more parts of the population, including women, young people, black South Africans and the rural poor can contribute to and benefit from growth.

The ANC-led government has already seen some success with its recent localisation policies, including in the textile industry where it is now a requirement for entities such as the SA National Defence Force to purchase all its uniforms from local producers. Since signing the Retail, Clothing, Textile, Footwear, and Leather Master Plan in November 2019, the industry has invested more than half a billion rands to expand local manufacturing facilities, including small, medium and micro-sized enterprises, SMMEs.

The work of the National Empowerment Fund and the Industrial Development Corporation has been an instrument in providing support to SMMEs to drive local production. There is further investment in the agricultural and manufacturing sectors including an investment of R1,7 billion by the SA Poultry Association as part of the Poultry Master Plan. South Africa now produces an additional 1 million chickens every week. A R3 billion investment by Ford Motor Company of Southern Africa

and a R10 billion investment by Mercedes Benz to expand plants in Gqeberha and East London. Komatsu SA has made a R3 million investment in an engine remanufacturing plant.

Localisation is not merely a policy of this department, but has resounding support amongst South Africans who recognise the need to industrialise local economy. The approach to localisation has been unanimously endorsed by the National Economic Development and Labour Council, Nedlac, that represent a large number of firms and entrepreneurs and workers in different sectors of the economy and organisations made up of representatives of various community interest.

To enhance our localisation drive the vote to disburse funds to Proudly South African campaign to support sectoral work and

master plans and projects that aim to improve industrialisation and competitiveness and increase localisation. Localisation will significantly expand our productive economy and this is linked to expanding our trade agenda on the African continent through the African Continental Free Trade Area, ACFTA, by eliminating barriers to trade in Africa. The agreement will reshape the South African economy already and exports to the African countries comprise of 250 000 South African jobs and it is the fastest great part of our manufactured exports. It goes without saying that the ACFTA has huge potential to harness the power of women and youth to realise its true potential.

According to the World Bank, it will lift 30 million from extreme poverty and another 68 million from moderate poverty. The interventions are only a fraction of the work being done by the ANC-led government in the face of limited resources and the increase in more demand to grow our economy and change the lives of the people of South Africa for the better. I thank you.

Mr S H MBUYANE: Chair, greetings Minister, Deputy Ministers and Members of Parliament, MPs, guests, fellow South Africans.

We are gathered here today on the occasion of the debate on Trade, Industry and Competition. And we are also celebrating the first state of the nation address by the former President, uMandela.

We are celebrating also the International Day for Peace and Disarmourment.

Our point of departure as the ANC is that the budget is an instrument to finance the implementation of the policies of the majority party which are aimed at structural transformation of our economy. And in this case the majority party is the ANC.

The ANC vision for the South African economy is guided by the Freedom Charter, the injunction that the people shall share in the country’s wealth. This informs the ANC government’s position and the approach in the manner in which that the growth enhancing, but it ensures that the pace and the patterns of growth are inclusive and they transform our society.

Where is the Shadow Minister? ... [Interjections.] ... ya [yes], I see the shadows.

Our approach in the economic transformation is guided by, amongst other things, creating decent employment for all South Africans, eliminating poverty and dealing decisively with the extreme inequalities of our society. That is very much extreme. You must listen!

We must also democratise ownership and control of the economy by empowering historically oppressed Africans and the working class in particular to play a leading role in the decision making, restructuring the economy so that it meets the basic need of South Africans and the people of the region, especially the poor.

In order to structurally transform our economy, it is important to reindustrialize our economy so that we are moving from the global productive value chain.

This, in turn, needs to be supported by massive infrastructure development and transformation of the education and training

system, among others, to align with the support of a development and productive of our economy objective.

The budget vote and the annual performance plan clearly articulate a practical unique approach to respond to the structural transformation of our economy.

This is informed by the creation of opportunities for all South Africans. This involves the deconcentrating of our economy and open inclusive product and service market for participation by all.

It is also about enduring commitment to support black industrialists and workers who were previously denied access to opportunities for the economic ownership and participation.

Furthermore, the budget vote is also about ensuring that the spatial strategy that informs how we build and support the new model of Special Economic Zone, SEZ, industrial parks and in secondary and also in rural areas.

Our state-owned entities must be at the forefront of complying with the localization and also beneficiation policies. Through

localization, our transformation agenda will find practical expression.

Transformation is about building an economy that works where our people are, bringing development to rural provinces and districts.

The revised approach to spatial industrial policy informed by the District Development Model, DDM, will see government supporting a project that creates jobs, infrastructure and innovations in the 52 districts across the country.

We are taking steps to raise the profile of the black industrialists programme as part of our overall transformation objective.

The black industrialists scheme addresses the low representation of black industrialists with the majority ownership and provides the support they need to transform their organizations into viable, sustainable enterprises to address the twin national priorities in local economic development and economic inclusivity.

The Black Economic Scheme Incentive invested more than

R4 billion in projects owned by black industrialists; about 20% of which were accessed by black female industrialists. This illustrates the success of this scheme.

Let me highlight one of the support black industrial scheme over this period. A Toronto Group Pty Ltd, the group manufactured charcoal for export market in Europe and has activated carbon for water treatment and purification.

We are encouraged by Budget Vote 39’s substantial allocation to the Broad-Based Black Economic Empowerment, BBBEE, to execute its mandate and build necessary capacity to ensure the enforcement of the BBBEE.

Pastor, BBBEE is a policy of this government!

For a long time, our people have been taken for a ride in transformation agenda of our government.

In terms of the need to advance the quest for inclusivity across our economy, we acknowledge the catalytic role of the National Empowerment Fund, NEF. It has championed a catalytic

role, an agent for government mandate to grow meaningful black economic participation.

We are pleased with the strides the NEF has made in attracting over R8,8 billion in third-party funding, demonstrating the entity capacity as a catalyst for unblocking economic value chain.

The industrial park process has a huge potential that requires unlocking so that we become strategic nodal points for different economic activities.

I think my time ... let me rush to deal with these elements

... these unbecoming elements.

There are real examples of black economic beneficiation of the AND-led government’s revitalised programme, and one of them, Ms Mayor Roofing, that develops some roofing and also sheeting, in a region in Limpopo.

[Interjections.] ... what? ... [Interjections.] ... okay.

The people of South Africa must know that the opposition parties that reject this vote are rejecting industrialisation, they are rejecting creations of jobs, they are rejecting transformation, they are rejecting localisation.

They wish for the important entities like the Competition Commission, the BBBEE Commission, the NEF and the Industrial Development Corporation, IDC, to collapse and all other transformational programmes aimed at changing the imbalances of the past.

They wish for the poor African majority to remain poor, they want our economy to remain untransformed and the spatial inequality to continue ...

The CHAIRPERSON (Mr S O R Mahumapelo): Just hold on, hon member. just hold on.

Hon Tobias, this thing that you are doing is not on. Because it’s clear now, you’re consistent in switching-on your mic when the debates on. It’s clear that it’s not a mistake. So, please stop that, hon Tobias.

Proceed, hon member!

Mr S H MBUYANE: This kind of ... and I did not finish my statement ... they want the economy to remain untransformed and spatial inequality to continue. Yet, they want the African majority to vote for them. This kind of mediocracy, opportunist opposition that people of South Africa are cursed. This is the simple, no validity, no soundness in their articulation and the approach to solving the structural challenges.

These ones of the EFF are pleasing the masters, greetings to the commander-in-chief, when they are waiting here with the narrow nationalist agenda and the mentality of day-dreaming taking the country in 2024.

And the ones of the ... the Shadow Minister is not here; the DA Shadow Minister. They are always gossiping about the ANC. they don’t have their issues and their neo-liberal agenda and the Cachala ... this one is an embarrassment to the family.

It’s serious embarrassment, this one, to the family of Cachalia.

They have the FF-Plus economic growth and the recovery plan should focus on releasing ...

The CHAIRPERSON (Mr S O R Mahumapelo): Just hold on, hon member. Just relax. Just hold on.

Hon member, what are you standing on?

Mr G K Y CACHALIA: Chair, I’d like you to rule on that statement that was just made about me and my family, whether that’s parliamentary. Thank you.

The CHAIRPERSON (Mr S O R Mahumapelo): Okay.

That’s unparliamentary, hon member. Withdraw the statement.

Mr S H MBUYANE: I withdraw to the family; unconditionally withdraw.

FF-Plus, you should be ... I mean ... focusing on the issue of releasing our land in Orania, not coming here and talking of BBBEE, because this policy tried to regrade the redress and try to address issues of the past.

The ACDP, Pastor should focus on the word of God and not coming here and talk politics, rhetoric and also coming here and give us church sermons. We are here ... we are governing the country as the ANC.

We ... [Interjections.] ... no, I’m okay ...

The AIC, we are in agreement in terms of the concentration of the economy. We are in agreement; the economy is much concentrated on my left here. We are still trying to find solace because we have a Competition Commission that we are supporting its report that the economy is very concentrated to the white and now we need to deal with the report. So, I think the Minister will also allude to all those issues.

The ANC supports vote 39 and I thank you very much.

The MINISTER OF TRADE, INDUSTRY AND COMPETITION: House

Chairperson and hon members, we are now wrapping up a Debate on Trade, Industry and Competition. If I were to characterize the contributions, there three types of contributions. The first set of contributions were from the members of the ANC, hon Malematja, hon Ntwane and hon Mbuyane. Getting concrete

examples of progress of the kind of things that have been done.

The second one is contributions from some members of the opposition. I will put they were hon Majozi, hon Mulder hon Thring and hon Jafta, who all engaged with the issues. They supported some of what we put forward, some of what is in our annual performance plan, but not all of them, but they also had some challenges with what we were doing. And I would like to say that we’ve taken care note of those.

Any government that is always open to new idea and feedback and improve service delivery to South Africans. And so all of those ideas, even where we don’t fully agree we are going to give considerations. And hon Mulder, I would love to take up your invitation to come and speak to you about the economic recovery plan.

The third kind of contribution was made from the DA speaker. And how I would characterize it, it was a simple a preelection speech. Not a very good one but a preelection speech. It was predictable, it was tired, it was hopeless, it was filled with despair. I know that hon Macpherson can do better and I would

him to try to lift his game a little bit. What did he offer? He offered slogans, he offered criticism, and he offered rhetoric.

The DA bakes slogans, we don’t have that luxury we have to bake bread. And so, what is it that hon Macpherson has raised, he says the department has little to show for what it’s done and the investment conferences, is a simple smokes and mirrors. I want to give you ten reasons why hon Macpherson is wrong.

Reason one, Ford Motor Company announces that they will put money into South Africa, $1 billion. They then put that money in, ten factories are built before the start of this administration, it was an open fact today, there are ten factories. In fact, it was such a good success, it was such a good success that hon Steenhuisen decided to jump immediately into the podium, go to the SCZ and say we did this, as the DA.

Now, I can give you a number two, Consol Glass, if I had a glass here now to drink from and I don’t have glass here, chances are five years ago, three years ago or even a year and

half, it would have been imported glass, because all our drinking glasses are imported.

Consol, took a decision to invest, to invest in bottles and in glasses. And so, we now have greater capacity to make bottles and glasses in South Africa. They made it an announcement in the investment conference.

Thirdly, Sigma, Sigma is a call centre. It’s a call centre in the Western Cape. Sigma made a commitment investment conference, chaired by the President that they will open up call centre, it’s opened today, provides jobs for young people from Mitchell’s Plain and Khayelitsha.

Fourth reason why you are wrong, Royal tyre manufacturing, it’s a tyre manufacturer that’s expanding its production in South Africa, replacing imports and it’s open up, there’s new facility in Bronkhorstspruit.

Fifth reason why you are wrong, South African Pulp and Paper Industries, SAPPI, ... [Inaudible.] ... plant in

KwaZulu-Natal, it takes trees that are grown on the plantation, then through a sophisticated process, it turns it

into pulp, that pulp in turn is turned into viscose fabric, the tables that you take when you are ill, that company came to the investment conference and made a multibillion-rand commitment. Today the plant is open they are exporting significant quantities.

Sixth reason, number six why you are wrong. Defy is a company that is based in eZakheni, they make white goods, fridges, stoves, those kind of things, are white goods. They made a commitment in the investment conference. We had the opportunity to now see the new production rolling of the line, workers employed.

Seventh reason and the seventh reason, I am going to say are really 4000 reasons, 4000 workers in the factory that made a commitment in the investment conference. The factory’s name is Met Air, the facility in Hesto Harnesses and they produce ... [Inaudible.] ... for the industry. Young people, mainly women are working there, I went to this factory, it’s massive. You could fit it five Parliaments, five sittings of the four Parliament and they will be space over.

Eight reason, number eight why you wrong, Google the global company, comes to South Africa makes the commitment in the investment conference, saying we can see where your growth trajectory is, we can do bold an undersea cable, laying undersea cable from South Africa to West Africa to Europe. That will allow members of Parliament to also do their financial transaction, watch the Netflix if they want to watch Netflix, do the zoom meetings and all of that was a commitment in the investment conference. Today that undersea cable has landed in South Africa.

Ninth reason, Aqua Power, today 100mw of power generation is being built in the Northern Cape, because of the commitment that was made by Saudi investor at the investment conference.

And the tenth reason is Mercedes Benz. When you see a Mercedes Benz, a C Class almost anywhere in the world, it’s only made of three places, it’s made in Bremen, in Germany or it’s made in Beijing in China or it’s made in Buffalo City in South Africa. That commitment was made at the investment conference, ten reasons.

Now, hon Macpherson goes further and says well the economy is very challenged, can you show us how you’ve grown since 2019 and so on. Let me make this point. The ... [Inaudible.] ... goes back to 2019. And I had to address Parliament and I had to say to Members of Parliament, in the next three, four years we are going to have the biggest epidemic that we’ve had since 1918, that will kill a large number of people, 100 000 South Africans, millions globally. That will lead to the greatest recession, the biggest recession since the Second World War, that would physically close economies, they wouldn’t believe me.

If I have to go further and say, in addition to that, you are also going to have the biggest social unrest that we’ve had in democracy, here in South Africa, factories burned, shops burned, physical infrastructure destroyed, you would be surprised, you will say unlikely.

If I said to you also have the biggest floods in living memory that swept out lives and livelihood, you will say, now you are perhaps smoking something, Minister that you shouldn’t be smoking.

And finally, if had to say they would a war in the heart of Europe, that would hiccup fuel prices and fertilizers prices and food prices, you will all say this man needs assistance. All of that has happened, that had an impact on our economy. And in the International monitory Fund, IMF, in fact I heard a little hackle saying, well why are we the only country with this problem. Actually, not the International Monitory Fund in April released its world economic outlook, in that world economic outlook they say that by last year, which was 2022, which is the latest data they had available, a quarter of the world economy has still not recovered to the level that it was by 2019. Because they had a problem of COVID-19 and the war in Ukraine.

We also had floods, we also had civil unrest and so we can play politics, but what South Africans are looking to us, members of the opposition, members of the ruling party are concrete solution, are constructive ideas and what we’ve seen today, from one political party is nothing of the sort.

What we’ve seen is an interesting debate by others and we going to certainly take on board all of the good comments. We can play politics, we can say for an example that when the ANC

was in power in the Western Cape, early 2009 before the election. The unemployment rate was in 18%. Remember that 18% today it’s 22% under DA rule. We can say that because the statistics show us that. But what we must do, is we must be able show the South Africans that, this is not point scoring. This is about building the economy, creating jobs, promoting transformation.

I have in front of me and have I ask the permission of the House for a bowl of Proteas to be put here. And what this is, is part of the cape floral kingdom, the fynbos. It’s something that we can be enormously proud of. It’s an industry that has worth one and a half billion rands. We export huge quantities of this. And we’ve seen now that other countries are emulating us, Australia and others. So, yesterday we gazetted a protection for the trademark of cape flora, so that we can begin to build a pride on what we do in our people, in our flowers, in our businesses. That is what we need to do.

So, I would liken conclude the debate by thanking the Deputy Ministers, the Director General, Mutshinyalo Thompson, the previous Director General, ... [Inaudible.] ... I would like to thank our also Chief Financial Officer, CFO, and the team

at the Department of Trade, Industry and Competition, DDIC, all of the agencies, we have a number of agencies present here today, thank you very much. You are taking on responsibility of working hard for South Africa, that is going to make a difference. That is how we are going to get forward as a country. That is how we are going to create jobs. Thank very much.

The CHAIRPERSON (Mr S O R Mahumapelo): Order hon members, on that critical note, this brings to the end the debate of today and the Mini-Plenary now rises. Thank you very much.

Debate concluded.

The Mini-Plenary rose at 19:23.