**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY WEDNESDAY, 24 MAY 2023**

**VOTE NO 17 – HIGHER EDUCATION AND TRAINING**

**PROCEEDINGS OF THE NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

The House met at 15:01

The House Chairperson (Ms M G Boroto) took the Chair and requested members to observe a moment of silence for prayers or meditation.

**APPROPRIATION BILL**

Debate on Budget Vote No 17 – Higher Education and Training:

The MINISTER OF HIGHER EDUCATION, SCIENCE AND INNOVATION: Hon

House Chairperson, Deputy Minister of Higher Education, Science and Innovation, hon Buti Manamela, Chairperson and Members of the Portfolio Committee on Higher Education, Science and Innovation, Director-General of the Department of Higher Education and Training Dr Nkosinathi Sishi, the director-general of my other Department of Higher education

and Innovation Dr Mjwarha, let me take this opportunity to greet my special guests who are today not here watching - the learners from schools I have adopted who are together here with their teachers and some of them because they are primary school are here with their mothers not just parents - mothers, I wish also to greet you hon members who are here, and all of those who have joined us through other platforms.

I dedicate our 2023-24 budget to the memory of our fallen heroes and heroines within the Post School Education and Training sector who recently passed on. I am talking about the likes of Mr David Niddrie, who was my Ministerial envoy responsible for advising me on the National Skills Development policies and strategy, working with the National Skills Authority, NSA. Niddrie was a stalwart of the liberation movements, in particular of the South African Communist Party, SACP, the African National Congress, ANC and the Congress of South African Trade Unions, Cosatu. My thoughts are also with Mboneli Vesele, Peter Roets family, Busiwe Notyawe, Sesethu

Dweba, Asanda Ngubo, Lesego Tsindo, Sydney Maseko, Thabang Ndlovu and Ntokozo Xaba as well as Professor Dan Kgwadi, to mention a few who we lost recently. All these individuals were either employees and or students within our sector.

Our budget vote is also taking place during South Africa’s year of hosting of BRICS. I held the 15th BRICS Academic Forum and I am pleased to say last week and I will also be hosting the 10th BRICS Meeting of Education Ministers on 14 July 2023 in Mpumalanga province. Hon members, the National Plan for Post School Education and Training has six goals and associated objectives and four ideas emerge as the new drivers for the system. First, the massification of the college system with 1 million enrolled in the Community Colleges and

2,5 million in public and private TVET colleges by 2030. We remain committed to that goal. Secondly, the diversification of the public universities based on their strengths and the needs of the communities in which they are located supported by a 1,6 million enrolment target. Of course, there will be challenges towards meeting these objectives, but we remain committed to them.

This is the reason that our immediate task as a department this year. I have asked my department and my DG to say tell us what is it that is needed between now and 2030 to radically change the size and shape of our PSET system. The time has arrived for us to drastically and apologetically increase intake in TVET and Community Colleges.

Hon members, through the Higher Health, we have reached over

2 million students in all our public universities, TVET and Community colleges by leading in confronting the COVID-19 pandemic. Last year, over 700 000 students were beneficiaries of Higher Health’s health and psychosocial support programmes. Our DM will talk more about this. I wish to say for now, in August this year, I will be hosting a Summit to mobilising all men in the post school education and training sector behind gender equality and women emancipation. This will be based on the UNESCOs programme of fighting toxic masculinities.

Hon members, on skills development in this financial year, we will be updating the national list of occupations in high demand and piloting for the first time the provincial lists of Occupations in High Demand in collaboration with two provinces of Mpumalanga and Western Cape. We are also working on the skills for the hydrogen economy project, in collaboration with the Department of Science and Innovation, the DSI.

Through our Sector Education and Training Authorities, Setas, combined, we have opened up 52 701 learnership opportunities to the value of R1,6 billion in the last financial year. We opened up 14 475 internships opportunities to the value of

R758 Million. We also opened up 14 954 TVET placement opportunities to the value of R726 Million. This was meeting the President’s target of 10 000 which we exceeded, and this year we aim to achieve a target of 20 000 placements of TVET graduates, those who need work placements in order to complete in particular their diplomas and other programmes. Our Setas combined opened up 7 095 university students work placements to the value of R311 million and we also awarded 13 169 bursaries in various fields on skills in high demand to the value of R970 million. We also opened up 34 514 skills program opportunities for the unemployed to the value of 278 million.

We also reskilled and upskilled 36 502 individuals in various sectors of the economy to the value of R494 million. I am also very pleased to say hon House Chair and hon members a sum of R1,7 billion was disbursed by the National Skills Fund towards its bursary programme in 2021-22, benefitting students enrolled in undergraduate and postgraduate programmes in scarce and critical skills.

In the current financial year, at least 5 000 students will receive NSF funding for undergraduate and postgraduate studies. For the 2023-24 financial year, we have set for

ourselves the following targets as part of expanding training opportunities: 110 500 workplace-based learning opportunities;

149 000 learners to be registered in skills development programs; 23 000 learners to enter artisanal programs; 21 000 learners to pass the artisanal trade test - our target is

30 000 per annum in 2030; 32 550 learners to complete learnerships; and 6 450 learners to complete internships. This we will do at the beginning of next year. We will report exactly on the progress we would have made this regard. Only this government is capable of doing this.

*IsiZulu*:

Nina sohlangana nani uma sesiya ebantwini.

*English*:

Hon members, on TVET, currently 26 of our colleges are engaged in entrepreneurial training through our entrepreneurship hubs. We are working to ensure that all our colleges are involved in some form of entrepreneurship training in the next three years. We have also expanded our centres of specialisation from 26 to 34 centres at 20 TVET colleges with a further investment of R68 million and 16 colleges now have 35 trade test centres. Now prior to 1994, there was only one National

Trade Test Centre for artisans which was olifantsfontein, the only one in the country because the apartheid government was only catering for white kids to be artisans. We now have 35 trade test centres. Good quality, good artisans, also artisans who are not blinded by racism more patriarchy. Currently, we need to say that these trade test centres by the way, have tested over 600 artisans of which over 500 have qualified have got their certificates. Last year, I hosted the first-ever centralised national artisan graduation ceremony for artisans qualifying in the top 13 of the trades in high demand.

As a department, we will also be hosting a TVET curriculum review and transformation seminar from the 28th-30th August 2023. We are standardising our registration and admission processes in our TVET colleges to do away with different processes which have been applied by our colleges. This will include standardisation in the processes of issuing certificates. This standardisation process will also help us in the migration from manual to online registration processes in all our TVET colleges. We have also witnessed student growth in several colleges that have now begun to embrace the use of technology in their enrolment processes and reducing the number of walk-ins at TVET colleges.

Hon members, through our Community Colleges, we have made the youth our important focus and a priority, particularly for the youth that is “Not in Education, employment or training, NEET. We have also created opportunities for our older generation who wish to enter our colleges. I am very pleased to say that we have also allocated R200 million from the National Skills Fund to ensure that we achieve our objective of increasing offerings of skills programmes in our Community colleges. It’s the first time we are doing this because we have moved from the old adult education system to a community college system now. So, we are not only focusing on those who want to continue with their schooling as adults. But also we are focussing as adults who are interested in acquiring a particular skill. We have set aside R200 million. This is the first that we are actually doing in expanding community college education. Through the National Skills Fund, we have allocated funds for capacity building of Community College lecturers, and we have introduced skills programmes, learnerships and non-formal programmes. We have also introduced now Civic Education in our community colleges so that we are able to train products, young people and adults who are conscious of their civil duties and civil

responsibilities. A far cry from the crime of the apartheid regime.

On University Education, to ensure that the entire public sector university system is developed, we are intensifying the implementation of the University Capacity Development Programme, UCDP. Over a period of seven years, we have allocated a total of 758 lecturer posts to universities and this is the *New Generation of Academics Programme*. These are the 758 lecturers we have identified from master’s level take them through to their PHDs and train them to be good academics. This brings the total of allocated posts. We have created new posts for them 843 by the end of the current financial year. Of the total of 583 lecturers participating in this programme, 58% are females and 42% are males; 569 are Black and 14 are White.

We are also continuing to roll out development programmes through the Professor Sibusiso Bhengu Development programme to strengthen our historically disadvantaged universities. I have also commissioned the Council on Higher Education to conduct a study on blended learning – mixture of online and physical contact. Since our publication of the draft Central Application Service Bill for public comments, we now have

received valuable comments which we are studying. Parallel to this process, we have initiated a pilot project of the Central Application Service for the academic years, 2023, 2024 and 2025.

In relation to student funding, we now are working towards the finalisation of a new Comprehensive Student Funding Model, based on the considerations of the Ministerial Task Team which we now aim to submit finalisation to Cabinet before the end of this year. We aim through this also to introduce measures to support all the categories of students, including those who are not supported by the current NSFAS funding policy.

We are proud to say that the National Student Financial Aid Scheme, NSFAS, - listen here carefully - is now currently funding 1,1 million students with a budget allocation of R47,6 billion in the 2023 academic year. Of this amount, universities have been allocated R38,6 billion and TVET colleges R8,9 billion for the first time we have hit the

1 million mark. At its inception, by the way in 1991, at our first President Madiba insistence to the then apartheid President De Klerk we were supporting 7 000 students with R21,4 million. We are now at over R47 billion.

What is pleasing is that 49% of the NSFAS funded students were Sassa beneficiaries. To date, the scheme improved its student application portal and it has introduced a WhatsApp functionality to assist students with the tracking of applications for 2023 and to receive their responses directly. NSFAS, this is one of the biggest achievement of the ANC government in this country. NSFAS pays for the full cost of study which includes tuition, accommodation limited up to

R45 000 per annum, a measure we are introducing because we are being fleeced by some of the private student accommodation providers. It stands to reason, that NSFAS should be involved in the student accommodation space and introduce controls as it spends approximately R14 billion per annum as from this year on student accommodation.

In this regard, NSFAS has opened its accreditation portal to accommodation providers to apply for accreditation. Already,

8 196 beds have been accredited covering the Eastern Cape, Gauteng and KwaZulu Natal Provinces. NSFAS also pays living allowances in the sum of R 1750 per month and personal care for distance students to the value of R3 045 per academic year. Students not living in residences and private accommodation qualify for transport allowances of R7 875. On

average, each NSFAS student is funded to the tune of R95 552. Last year, NSFAS also introduced direct payments through the NSFAS bank card for TVET Colleges. The groundwork is being done to on-board universities in a phased in approach from the 1st of June.

On infrastructure and development, to date, the department has invested over R3,701 billion for the maintenance and repairs of TVET colleges’ infrastructure through the Capital Infrastructure and Efficiency Grant, CIEG, since inception of this grant in 2018-19 financial year. In addition to maintenance and repairs, this grant is also used for upgrading the information technology, IT, infrastructure in our institutions.

In relation to TVET college capital projects, a total of nine TVET college campuses, all of them in rural areas, have been completed at a cost of R2,6 billion, and we are going to be opening these campuses, one after the other, as we roll to expand TVET college education into rural areas. The total amount currently available for investment in infrastructure projects across all the 26 existing universities during the 2023-24-2025-26 MTEF period is R8,6 billion. Obviously not

enough, but is a huge advance to support student expansion with a necessary infrastructure.

We have completed feasibility studies for the establishment of the University of Science and Innovation in Ekurhuleni and also the Crime Detection University in Hammanskraal, as announced by the President a couple years ago. The new universities should see actual construction in the coming year or two. I am therefore pleased to report that the process for the allocation of the R182 million towards our pilot project of the Imbali Educational and Innovation Precinct has been completed. I am also pleased to say we have also commenced with a feasibility study for the establishment of the Giyani Education Precinct through the establishment of a University Campus with the Tshwane University of Technology.

*IsiZulu:*

Inyuvesi iyeza eGiyani.

*English:*

I am also pleased to report that the construction design phase for the Ulundi Campus of the University of Zululand will commence in this current financial year and that the actual

construction should commence in the 2024-25 financial year. We are expanding the footprint of university education into the rural areas as no child must be left behind if he is capable of accessing university education. The review of the existing Department of Higher Education and Training-National Treasury- Development Bank of Southern Africa partnership for the delivery of the student housing infrastructure programme, SHIP, is also reaching finality.

In the meantime, a total of 8 282 beds have been delivered across six institutions at a cost of R2,13 billion and the institutions include Nelson Mandela University, North-West University, University of Western Cape, Nelson Mandela University, University of Fort Hare and Vaal University of Technology. I invite hon members to go and see this infrastructure. It’s there, it exists. This is what this government is doing. Funding for Phase 2 SHIP projects at 4 institutions - Gert Sibande TVET college, Majuba TVET college, Tshwane University of Technology, and the University of KwaZulu-Natal have been approved and the planning of these projects has commenced. The total budget for the projects is R2,136 billion. You ask us what this government is doing, go and see these things. If you don’t go, I know you would be

deliberately closing your eyes because you don’t want to see progress.

We have also secured R1 billion, for the first time, over a three-year period for the construction of the first ever structures owned by our Community college. All along we have been using schools for community college education. Now we are beginning to build purposed infrastructure for our community colleges. This is history in the making as this is the first time as I’m saying that we are investing in infrastructure for Community colleges. The construction of the first three Community College Centres will commence in the current financial year.

The days of Adult Basic Education and Training, Abet and night schools are over. The time for Community colleges that offer a variety of programmes are here and starting with their own infrastructure facilities. We have also ensured that we refurbish our infrastructure and customise our teaching to cater for the requirements of the people living with disabilities. Not a single building, a refurbishment or construction we are doing without catering for our people who have disabilities. Hon Chair and hon members, our budget for

the 2023-24 financial year is R130,1 billion, with an annual average increase of seven per cent. Obviously, not enough, we are aware of that. We will work together with yourselves to ensure that we are able to get more resources.

In conclusion, I would like to thank the hon President, Deputy President, Cabinet colleagues, Director-General Sishi, and the members of the portfolio committee for their support and engagement. I also would like to thank the USAf, SAPCO, SAUS, SATVETSA and our trade unions for working with us to achieve the goals that we have set for ourselves.

Gratitude also goes to my wife, umama wekhaya, my staff in the Ministry and to the entire executive management committee and staff of the department, the Boards and executives of our entities, and everybody who has contributed toward the achievement of our mandate as the department.

*IsiZulu:*

Lo mnyango uzoqhubeka nokuguqula izimpilo zabantu bakithi, ikakhulukazi intsha ukuze ithole imfundo noma ngabe iqhamuka emindenini enjani. Ngiyabonga Mphathisihlalo.

Mr B S YABO: House Chairperson, hon Minister, Dr Blade Nzimande, hon Deputy Minister, Buti Manamela, Chairperson and the Whip of the portfolio committee, and all members in the House, greetings. The Post-School Education and Training sector has a crucial role to play towards the creation of a national democratic society. We are in an epoch, which we have characterized and a period of accelerating social economic transformation, because the structural inequality in our society, 29 years later persists. Reversing over 300 years of the legacy of colonial rule is no small feat. There are multiple factors which contribute to the perpetuation of inequality, poverty, and unemployment. There is a causal relationship between the educated versus the uneducated and the economic stratification based on ownership and income.

The level of skills and individual possesses remains a primary determinant of their ability to participate in the mainstream economy. Over the 29 years, we have taken decisive policy decisions which have prioritized education as an instrument to free the potential of the people so that they become their own liberators. It is therefore imperative that we continuously build a PSET sector which is stable by fostering collegial

working relations between various stakeholders in a university or a college that are focused on the best outcomes.

Various role players, such as the university management, the council, students, workers, alumni convocation, the Higher Education and Training department, and the community have a role to play in the governance of Higher Education institutions. We expect co-operative governance in the sector. The difference between institutions that succeed and those that fail obtains precisely in the quality of leadership that serves at the help. And I would further posit, that correct leadership is able to do more with little and inspire those who are led to aim for the stars. Correct leadership is solutions oriented and has little to no time for complaints.

However, the converse is true for weak leadership. Poor leadership creates a bottomless pit that wastes finite resources and creates A turbulent environment that spawns one crisis after another.

Over the duration of the Sixth Parliament, we have been steadfast as the ANC to contribute to resolving governance and leadership challenges in various Higher Education institutions. Hon Minister, institutional autonomy should not

be abused to negate our national development imperatives. The department should use available legislative instruments to intervene where required to support governance and promote public accountability. If you listen, hon member, you might learn something. We need to instil focus on curriculum transformation as shifts in this area have rather been gradual.

Our education system should develop graduates with strong critical thinking skills. Academic freedom also requires an inclusive academia which does not have philosophical bias to harness the different schools of thought as part of the generation of new knowledge and new understanding. The governance challenges in various higher education, and the negative reports detract from the positive impact of the PSET sector. We have seen the challenges that have emerged at the University of Cape Town, that incurring challenges in Unisa, the challenges facing the Vaal University of Technology, Mangosuthu University of Technology, and the problems in Fort Hare. This hon members, is to demonstrate that governance challenges impact several institutions.

We expect universities to represent the highest levels of professionalism and governance, but there are instances of maladministration. We condemn the violence which has broken out at the University of Fort Hare. However, we applaud the vice chancellor for being steadfast in steering the governance of the institution in the correct direction. We need to decisively deal with vested interests that lead to instability in the higher education landscape.

Emphatically, we also want to see more women leaders appointed in the top echelons of the PSET sector, given adequate support as well. Our universities continue to make a significant contribution in the knowledge economy for human development.

The University of Johannesburg, for example, specializes in artificial intelligence as part of adapting to the changing world which will impact the mode of production. We need to continue to support research intensive institutions as they contribute to scientific developments and innovation.

We appreciate the work done and to be further done by the department on key planned infrastructure support for the Higher Education sector. We will be monitoring and overseeing all progress and developments by the department. We take this

very seriously. We are not intending on being found lagging behind and procrastinating oversight. We trust our department to fast track these planned deliverables.

In the current financial year, the department will finalize the concept designs of the two new universities in Ekurhuleni and Hammanskraal in Tshwane, both in Gauteng. And the department projects that the construction of the universities will be at a 30% completion stage by 2024-25. This is a significant development that we should accelerate in the final year of the Sixth Administration. This is a legacy to be realized in the near future as part of expanding access in the Higher Education sector.

Specialized Higher Education institutions can catalyse specialization and sector knowledge and innovation. The department presented to the committee that it had plans to build eight Tvet colleges over the Medium Term Expenditure Framework. Two of which will be built in 2023-24, and these are campuses. One at Umfolozi college at Bambanani campus, another at Umgungundlovu Tvet college at Greytown campus.

The committee appreciates the planned support from the department to work with the Durban University of Technology to complete the engineering project as part of the Imbali Progressing Project, as mentioned by the Minister. These strides by the department are progressive and we wish to see them being implemented in other universities of technology.

Concept designed for the multi-purpose centre in Giyani in the Limpopo Province and a satellite campus in Ulundi KwaZulu- Natal, are under development.

We hope to create an environment to nurture the dreams of our youth, like the example given by the President in the state of the nation address. Making an example of the technological prowess of these industrialists, where one of the award winners at a recent industry conference was Astrofica Technologies, a company co-founded by a black woman, Jessie Ndaba, that provides data solutions.

It is encouraging to see that the department is planning to build 12 community learning centres over the MTEF. The committee from the presentation of the budget got that the department is set to start with three community learning centres in the 2023-24 financial year. In Tswinyane in

Heidelberg, which is in Gauteng, KwaGuqa in Emalahleni, Mpumalanga, Eerste River in Western Cape.

Furthermore, that the committee supports greatly the increment of first-time students entering university by 2,1% from

204 000 in the 2024-25 years to 208 200 by 2025-26. We need a Higher Education sector that will be able to create opportunities for our people to gain knowledge and skills for a knowledgeable and skilful nation. The department has presented to the committee that they intend on increasing the completion rate of students completing university qualifications - which is essential for a skilled and knowledgeable workforce - from 232 000 in 2023-24 to 249 509

by 2025-26.

The first deal with the crisis of space, the department has set aside R6,1 billion over the medium term for universities to deal with the alleviation of overcrowding and upgrading ... [Inaudible.] ... infrastructure. For the Tvet sector, the amount for the medium term is R1,7 billion. We believe the immediate progressive establishment of the two new universities and secondly, the expansion of access in terms of increasing enrolment targets, will need a model to increase

infrastructure for learning, to realize the success and efficiency that the department is concerned with.

With an increase in demand for higher education, infrastructure development becomes a must to increase supply. We would like to encourage the PSET sector to also prioritize equitable participation of local businesses in the infrastructure projects that are both underway and being planned. We support the Budget Vote, as it prioritizes infrastructure development, which also have possible positive social economic impact. Thank you, Chair.

Ms K L KHAKHAU: House Chairperson, when Hector Peterson and many others bled and sacrificed their lives 47 years ago, they did so to afford young people a meaningful and unobstructed access to quality education. They did so to rid themselves of the shackles of a meaningless and oppressive education system. They did so just so to ensure that every young South African would have a fair shot at making something out of themselves. Theirs was a fight for dignity; a fight for a fair opportunity to put food on the table for themselves and their families.

Theirs was a fight against generational poverty. Theirs was a fight to ensure that no student is left behind.

Sadly, President Ramaphosa’s ANC democratic government and Minister Blade Nzimande’s lack of compassion and leadership have shown us that Hector Peterson’s death and every young person who died for education meant nothing. They have and continue to show us that those deaths were in vein.

How? Well, 17 143 days later, in 2023, students remain locked out of the doors to tertiary education.

Under Minister Blade Nzimande’s watch, students have to, every single year, perform their poverty and desperation in order to be considered or not for access through these doors.

Minister, under your leadership poor students wake up and go to bed hungry in dilapidated residences praying that the roof does not fall over their heads while making friends with resident rats and cockroaches.

Under your leadership, students spend every day anxious of when those financial and academic exclusion letters and eviction notices will land in their mail because National Student Financial Aid Scheme, NSFAS, either has no record of their application, suddenly, is not sure if it will still be

able to fund them or whatever other ridiculous excuse they are able to think of. All while the same entity enjoys a monthly million rands’ rental of office spaces overlooking the ocean; it must be nice.

Under your leadership, Technical Vocational Education and Training, TVETs are treated like unwanted step children with poor funding for basic necessities such as up-to-date and labour market relevant curriculum for academic offerings such as mechatronics.

Basic funding for Wi-Fi, workable and disability-friendly infrastructure, back-up generators to save students from the enemy of our progress that is loadshedding, and safety in and around campuses to protect us from being raped and murdered by today’s modern-day vultures.

Under your leadership, tertiary qualifications are sold to the highest bidder while you turn a blind and actively sweep matters under the carpet.

You are bold and destructive enough to oppose Special Investigating Unit, SIU’s and proclamations like you did with the University Fort Hare.

Yes, Minister Nzimande, under your leadership these sit on your desk for a whole nine months with absolutely no shame. Because your primary focus is to protect the rot capturing of our institutions of higher learning.

So, one thing is clear, Minster Nzimande and the ANC government do not care about our futures. Dignity for students is an unimaginable offering for you. You do not care about what it means for a poor young person in South Africa who is their family’s only shot out of poverty to get that qualification.

And I dare say to you, Hector Peterson and everyone’s death are mere history stories that mean nothing ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Order! Order, members.

Proceed, mma [ma’am].

Ms K L KHAKHAU: ... see, to you, Hector Peterson and everyone’s death are mere history story that mean nothing for your conscience and oath to serve. You simply do not care! You never did! And students and young people deserve better. Thank you, Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Order, hon members. Order. Rre [Mr] Letsie!

Don’t start, hon Chirwa. Don’t start. Just keep quiet until they are quiet.

Please. Hon members, don’t shout. You are seated somewhere very far, you want your voice ... order, order. You can’t sit that far and expect your voice to be heard her. How many people are making noise to, as your voice passes? ... [Interjections.] ... no, don’t do that.

Ms N N CHIRWA: House Chair, greetings the Commander-In-Chief of the EFF, Julius Sello Malema, the Deputy President, Nyiko Shivambu, all the officials, commissars and committed ground forces of the only emancipation movement in South Africa, the EFF.

The celebration of the 10 years of the July 26 movement on African soil is sadly also a reminder of how millions of destitute young people in this country were lied to by the ANC government.

Not only did you promise free education and failed to deliver it in its true essence for three decades. But you have also failed to make the saying: Education is the key to success, a reality.

Thousands of our graduates and hundreds of thousands more, by the end of this very year, must prepare themselves for the life of realizing that a degree means nothing under the ANC government.

Minister Blade Nzimande, like his colleagues, is another piece of evidence of the failures of the people we are forced to call leaders. You have failed to lead this nation to the realization of your own National Development Plan, NDP, that was to see the post-schooling system to meet the needs of the economy and the society.

You don’t even bother to account on why for over 20 years it is impossible for you to ensure that post-schooling system is responsive to our economic and social needs as per the aspiration of the so-called NDP.

And no matter how many times you try to mislead the nation, the 200 000 graduates from last year who are sitting at home right now are the living proof of your political infancy.

Your age can no longer guarantee you respect you don’t deserve because you have led this department for a very long time but you have only let the young people of this country to total darkness, hopelessness, depression and wondering around ion street corners of our townships hopeless because one is either too poor to access education or there’s no space in higher education in higher education, or that one can’t even find a job even with the competitive qualification post their education. That, Minister Blade Nzimande, is your true legacy.

The only needs you have met in this industry of higher education and training are the needs of thugs masquerading as service providers in our universities and TVETs. The only people who can you a leader with a straight face are the

tenderpreneurs you have empowered with the money that was meant to empower the children of the working class.

You have, however, put a very good fight, to be honest with you, with your obsession of wanting to be a media darling and competing with your equally just as useless Deputy Minister.

Your entities are underperforming. They are myriad in fraud and corruption and mismanaging of funds.

Your department keeps reducing its own targets and still fail to achieve them. There is a gradual and constant regression in the department you are leading and as an alleged leader you have even failed to ensure accountability ...

Mr B A RADEBE: Hon House Chair, on a point of order. I’m rising on Rule 84. The term useless had been declared as unparliamentary and the person on the platform has just referred to the Deputy Minister as useless. So ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Thank you very much. You are ... hon member, please. You are not going to rule; I’m going to rule.

Hon Radebe, your order is sustained. Rule 84 speaks to that unparliamentary languages.

Just withdraw the useless to the Deputy Minister, hon Chirwa.

Ms N N CHIRWA: I withdraw, House Chair.

Your entities are underperforming, they are myriad in fraud and corruption and mismanaging of funds.

Your department keeps reducing its own targets and still fails to achieve them.

There is a gradual and constant regression in the department that you are leading. And as an alleged leader you have even failed to ensure accountability for the most menial of administrative features like paying suppliers on time, prioritising transformation and dealing with appeal cases of NSFAS.

President Ramaphosa has definitely found a dependable comrade in you, Minister Blade Nzimande, because you both insist to

applaud yourselves despite the glaring evidence that young people in this country are suffering under your leadership.

We, once again, plead with the Minister of Higher education to incentivise innovation in agriculture and animal husbandry, healthcare and pharmaceuticals, energy, transport, aerospace and ... [Inaudible.] ... bio-technology, industrialization and manufacturing, robotics, artificial intelligence and big data; not as observers, but active participants by also investing in the possibilities of the futures of these industries.

Increase the spaces in higher education, TVETs, small medium and micro enterprises, SMME mentorship and vocational training programmes.

It actually should be a criminal offence that Minister Blade Nzimande still gets away with failing to absorb all matriculants into the post-schooling system, 20 years into his leadership.

Truly provide free accommodation for students, repurpose unused and abandoned municipal buildings for this purpose and

quadruple the number of accommodation rooms available by the end of 2023. This is doable.

Synchronise the goals and the needs of the economy with the number of places available in each institution of higher learning. Align skills and development of industrial sectors. Align the generation of qualifications to our economic aspirations and tangible efforts of moving in this particular direction.

We are all exhausted of listening to you talk left but walk right.

Introduce a new scholarship that will provide educational training opportunities for South African youth that are studying overseas.

Fast track the digitalization institutions of higher learning according annual targets. Make it a requirement for all universities in the country to do degrees and coding computer hardware development, artificial intelligence, robotics, the internet and bio-technology by the end of 2023

Establish satellite campuses as various universities. One being the University of Limpopo’s School of Physical and Mineral Sciences in Phalaborwa, which will focus on mining and mineral protection and beneficiation. And one being at the University of Pretoria’s Faculty of Natural and Agricultural Sciences in eHlanzeni, which will focus on agriculture and agro-processing.

Respond to the needs of society by establishing a satellite campus of the University of Cape Town’s Faculty of Engineering and Built-Environment in the Z F Mcgawu District Municipality that will focus on renewable energy.

We have constantly offered the department and the Minster workable solutions since the formation of the EFF in 2013.

The EFF turning 10 years old this year should also be a reminder to the Minister of the amount of many years he has failed to implement workable solutions that will emancipate the youth of this country from his visionless leadership.

We reject this report. We reject Mr Blade Nzimande. And in 2024 the young people of this country who make up 70% of the population will definitely reject the government of the ANC.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Order! Order!

*Afrikaans*:

Gee hom ’n kans asseblief. Gaan aan, agb lid.

Mr S S ZONDO: Hon Chairperson, as a nation we ought to always keep these words of former President Nelson Mandela with us whenever we are taking important decisions such as this one we are taking today, open quote:

Education is the great engine of personal development. It is through education that the daughter of a peasant can become a doctor, that the son of a mineworker can become the head of the mine, that a child of farmworkers can become the president of a great nation.

It is through quality education that the social and economic justice struggles of this generation can be achieved but we seem to be very far from doing so. The department had set 47

targets for itself for the 2022-23 Third Quarter, but out of these, only 21 were achieved, albeit poorly. There is a dire need to develop and coordinate policy and regulatory frameworks which encourage and allow an effective and efficient university education system whilst providing financial support to universities, the National Student Financial Aid Scheme, NSFAS and national education institutions.

*IsiZulu:*

Ngqongqoshe kuyethusa ukuzwa uncoma kangaka uNSFAS, ungasakhulumi lutho ngezimali eziphelela ezipokini lezi ezingabafundi ezilaphaya ezenziwa kwaNSFAS. Siyafisa ukuthi sikubone kunezijeziso ezibhekana nalabo abatholakala benza lobu bugebengu obenzekayo kwaNSFAS ngoba uNSFAS uwona oyimbangela yeziteleka nokusha kwezakhiwo zezemfundo ngenxa yokungenzi kwawo kahle kubafundi belizwe lethu.

Nyakenye kugwetshwe umfundi ngenxa yokufakelwa imali ngendlela engafanele ngaye uNSFAS. I wonder ukuthi leyo mali umthetho wakhona yayiqondiswe kobani njengoba yabe isibuyela ngephutha kulomfundi owagcina eseyisisulu salezi zenzo.

*English:*

This department has continuously failed dismally to fulfil its own set objectives such as amongst others, failing to reach its minimum quota of students annually enrolled at public universities, the number of graduates in the science, technology, engineering and mathematics, STEM field, as well the number of masters graduates.

We have noted some contributing factors to the department’s failures in delivering its plans such as delays in the finalisation of the comprehensive student funding policy for higher education, whilst the lack of strong dedicated financial assistance to meet the learning needs of the missing middle students has a significant impact on their success or the lack thereof.

Community Education and Training remains under-resourced ... [Inaudible] ... remain relevant despite the growing demand for short-term skills in our communities. The department in allocating only 2% of its budget towards this programme, does not inspire much confidence that this will change in the next academic year and beyond.

As a party, we believe that all hope is not a loss because willingness from the government to implement actionable solutions can turn things around, but this requires political will. The filling of vacancies and critical posts in TVET colleges should be fast-tracked under ... [Inaudible.] I require protection Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon Zondo, there is something in this House called heckling. What I don’t like is when they are over or with loudness. But I can’t stop people from doing that. Proceed and ignore Inkosi Mandela. Hon Zondo take your seat. Why are you rising hon Deputy Minister?

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF HIGHER EDUCATION, SCIENCE AND

INNOVATION: Hon House Chair, it is not us who are disturbing, it is the people to him ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): No, no, no, no how sure are you? That is not a point of order. Proceed hon Zondo.

*IsiZulu:*

Ungabalaleli qhubeka ngenkulumo yakho.

Mr S S ZONDO: Unfortunately, consequence management is one aspect that cannot be ignored. It is necessary because its implementation is needed against officials that fail to meet their targets in accordance with their job descriptions. Over the years, we have seen the government failing to address issues that are affect students. In turn, this has caused disruptive and consistent student protests in institutions of higher learning throughout the country which has several impacts such as the delay in the commencement and conclusion of the academic year, destruction of infrastructure, teaching and learning disruptions and subsequent underperformance.

*IsiZulu*:

Ngqongqoshe njengezizwe siyadinga ukuholwa ngabantu esibathembayo futhi esingabathemba ukuthi bazothatha inqubomgomo ezokwazi ukusiqinisekisa ukuthi izwe lethu lizoba yizwe elincono. Kunesigaba lapha uNgqongqoshe wasolakala ukuthi unesijumbana atholakale naso semali ayesishushumbisa ngaso ngopulastiki omnyama. Ngiyafisa Ngqongqoshe usibe ekutheni sikwethembe ukuthi ngempela akukho okuyovela eduzane kusasa ukuthi leso sijumbane ngempela waqinisekisa ... ngoba izimpendulo zakho asenelanga ngazo. Siyafisa usibeke ekutheni sikwethembe.

*English*:

I always carry the spear given to us by the statement by His Excellency Umntwana wakwaPhindangene when it was not fashionable to do so. He said: “Education first and liberation later.”

*IsiZulu:*

Yilokho esikubonayo njengamanje.

*English:*

Considering all of these facts, the lives of millions of our students ... [Interjections] ... are dependent on this budget. The IFP supports the Budget Vote.

Dr W J BOSHOFF: Hon House Chair, this is always a very interesting debate because the Minister is ... [Inaudible.] The Deputy Minister calls me brother and I call him boetie. But just to save both of our careers, I should say he has never called me brother and I call him hon boetie. This huge department is responsible for all formal learning which doesn’t happen in schools. Practical skills for adults, training for artisans, technicians, and professionals encompass all public colleges and universities. A huge budget

of R134 billion is expended on this department, R111 billion voted by Parliament and another R23 billion levied from salaries.

Indeed, the mechanism to finance sectoral education and training authorities and the National Skills Fund through a direct levy on all remuneration is an interesting idea, the higher the employment rate, the more funds are available and vice versa. On the other hand, it has emerged that throwing money at problem is not enough. The National Student Financial Aid Scheme for instance, found it hard to adapt to the much larger scale of its operations, when turned from a loan agency to a grant disbursement institution.

Some universities seem unable to stay out of administration. In a recent study Prof Jonathan Jansen ascribes it among others, to the flow of billions of rands to institutions where a strong commitment to the academic project, and the distinction between management and governance is not entrenched. Then money adds to the problem, rather than solve it. The answer is a better culture, not less money. Just to confirm.

This debate annually regresses into an exchange of blame. The opposition complain about bad audits at Sector Education and Training Authority, Setas, NSFAS and the National Skills Fund, NSF, bad performance at universities, and the phasing out of Afrikaans as an academic language. Then the government hits back, the opposition is against transformation and wants to entrench historic privilege. Language is used as a means of exclusion. White people feel oppressed when they don’t oppress.

Hon Minister, we should talk with each other, not to each other or worse, at each other. Let us get something out of the way. The FF Plus wants to see designated groups to rise and reach their potential, young people, black people, female people. If I could quote from yesterday’s debate with a small alteration: The fact that we promote Afrikaans does not mean we are opposed to other languages. We want to discuss Afrikaans with you; what it means to us; especially if it fades and disappears. I wish I could discuss it with you in IsiZulu, but I can’t, English will have to do.

I want to discuss the past with you. History is never objective. The danger is when a partisan narrative is

presented as objective history, the only truth. Those with other views are then regarded as enemies, not opponents. I know that because such views were widespread in my community. Learning and accepting a more nuanced reality was traumatic for many.

Real understanding can only be formed if we give and take respect; and if we are prepared to attend to one another’s narrative. Learning from opposing idealism is good for any idealist. Your experience of the struggle hon Minister will be educational to me. Maybe, if you hear my lived reality regarding the past, you may be less suspicious about my view on the present.

I wish we could visit the Square Kilometre Array, SKA together, like you said yesterday. Roads in the Northern Cape are long, affording enough time for long and thorough discussions. You see Minister and hon members on this side, I prepare to see you in the opposition benches next year and a good understanding with the opposition is good. I thank you.

THE DEPUTY MINISTER OF HIGHER EDUCATION, SCIENCE AND

INNOVATION: Hon House Chairperson, our Minister, Dr Blade

Nzimande, Chairperson of our Portfolio Committee, Ms Nompendulo Mkhatshwa, together with our portfolio committee, all of them, our Director-Generals, DGs, Dr Nkosinathi Sishi and Dr Pill Mjwarha, together with official from our two departments, I want to join the Minister in presenting this Budget Vote Speech under the theme, “Transforming Postschool Education and Skills Development for the Future.”

I think context in this case is important. Budgets are not only about numbers, figures and money, but are also about people, they are about human beings and how we use decisions of this Parliament to transform the lives of those people.

Next year, it will be the 30th anniversary of our freedom. In many regards having listened to particularly, to the Members of Parliament representing the DA and the EFF, one would actually be mistaken to think that our higher education institutions are in a crisis. And that in the last 30 years or so nothing has been done.

Since budgets are about numbers and about figures, I want us to note the following numbers and figures because I think that the idea that nothing has been over the last 30 years needs to

be dismissed with the contempt it deserves. Four hundred thousand students in 1994 both at universities and at Technical and Vocational Education and Training, TVET, colleges in this country. This year, when our Minister made a statement on the state of our postschool education and training, 1,2 million students will be attending at our universities. Just under 600 000 students will be going to TVET colleges. That is a huge transformation that has been done over the last 30 years.

More importantly, two more universities have been built over the last 30 years. I think the Minister also spoke about plans to build more universities. Two more universities that have been built. For us this constitutes a significant lip in terms of progress and development as it relates to our postschool education and training sector.

Now I hear earlier today we were engaging with young people who are beneficiaries of the National Skills Fund bursaries. Part of the questions that we are always confronted with and I had it here in this august House this afternoon as part of this debate that we are basically training students towards unemployment. I do not understand what that logic is. That

because the economy is depressed, because there is high unemployment out there which is obviously also a challenge globally, does it mean that we should shut down our universities and our TVET colleges to wait for the minute the economy starts spanning out jobs?

Now evidence shows that students and graduates have a better chance of getting employment compared to anybody else, hon Chirwa. Currently and I think you chant out some numbers that you got from your head, about a 100 000 or so graduates who are sitting at home who are unemployed? This, which is the highest rate of unemployment as experienced over the last 30 years. There is 10% graduate unemployment and yes, this is problematic. It means our economy has to work, but we cannot stop training students merely because there is high unemployment rate. In fact, at its highest, graduate unemployment has been robbing anywhere between 3% to 6%. At some point when our economy was growing quite significantly.

In 1994, because sometimes when this microphone is on and people are here at the podium they begin to imagine things and say things like nothing has happened over the last few years. In 1994, the number of students who were been funded by

government in universities and TVET colleges, was zero. There was no National Student Financial Aid Scheme. There was no any form of bursary that is particularly targeting as students.

Yes, you would remember that as to when I am talking about. Thirty years later, 1,2 million students are being funded by the National Student Financial Aid Scheme, NSFAS.

Over the last few years, yes there have been protests in our universities and in our TVET colleges, particularly on the question of student funding.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Order! I want to hear what the hon Deputy Minister is saying.

THE DEPUTY MINISTER OF HIGHER EDUCATION, SCIENCE AND

INNOVATION: These challenges have obviously been born about some of the problems that the postschool and training sector has been faced with. However, today as we speak, yes there are some problems, as they relate to student funding, there are some challenges that NSFAS is trying to resolve, but the reality is that most of our higher education institutions are stable. Most students who are part of the 1,2 million who have been granted bursaries by the NSFAS have been funded. That is

why most of the universities have been this stable. The hon Chirwa speaks about us introducing robotics, 3D printing and all sorts of things. The fact that you do not know that this things are being done does not mean that they exist. They exist. If you go to the Vhembe TVET College, these programs robotics 3D printing and all of that are being provided. If you go to all our universities of technology all of these things are being provided.

However, obviously, if you come here for purposes of electioneering, if you come here to speak for purposes of pleasing the Holy Spirit who is the commander in chief who is being bowed upon even in his absence, you will create things and complain about things that are nowhere to be found.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Order!

THE DEPUTY MINISTER OF HIGHER EDUCATION, SCIENCE AND

INNOVATION: So, over the last 30 years, this government has cared about its youth, about its future and has centred education as a pillar towards transformation in this country. As it relates to curriculum review as the Minister indicated, we will be hosting the Curriculum Review Transformation and

Seminar. However, one of the key things that we want to achieve out of this seminar is obviously to ensure that we continuously align curriculum at both our universities and our TVET colleges in line with industry demands. We have seen how the demand particularly for TVET college students have been on the rise as a result of these interventions.

Now the hon member there was talking about the fact that we have not done much in terms of empowering particularly black business. I think the numbers as it relates towards we are doing speaks for themselves. For the financial year, we have extended procurement target so that 60% procurement for business goes to businesses that are owned by black people. Forty percent to women-owned businesses, 30% businesses owned by young people and also 30% businesses owned by small and medium enterprises. This is action towards ensuring that the postschool and training sector economy works for particularly the marginalised sector.

In support of the Presidential Employment Stimulus, we have set aside R90 million which was allocated to universities to appoint 3 000 graduates for the 2020-21 financial year. This will be continuous. Our universities as it relate to language

are at a different stages of the development and promotion of all languages including the Khoi, Nam and San Languages.

Finally in terms of gender-based violence, we want to ensure that all students graduate and graduate alive. We have put in place policies to this effect in empowering institutional capacity to be able to respond to gender-based violence. We are working together the Deputy Ministers of Police and of Justice and Correctional Services and of all the institutions to make sure that there is zero tolerance towards gender-based violence. I think more importantly is that conversations which we are co-ordinating amongst students, because we have to engage with how students engage in compasses. We have to challenge the mentality of male entitlement and toxic masculinity if we are to really deal with gender-based violence. This budget is about changing the lives of our students and it has to be supported. Thank you very much.

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Hon House Chairperson, you know hon Minister, if you have to issue certificates in this House to politicians for mastering the art of telling people on the ground what they want to hear, you will have a very busy schedule. I hear many people and the emphasis seems to be on

giving, giving and giving. However nobody seems to be talking about what we are getting back in return. I do not hear anybody talking about the 60% dropouts in the first year at Technical and Vocational Education and Training, TVET, colleges despite all the money that we are allocating to them. Right. Sixty percent of those and another 30% that did mathematics dropout in the first year too.

So, can you imagine the amount of money, not your money and not my money, but taxpayers’ money that is getting wasted! We think there is nothing wrong about it. Hon Minister, what we need here is some level of oversight or compliance to ensure

That those that are receiving these funds are good for purpose that they are fit to be in these TVET colleges, that they do justice to those taxpayers money and they come out and graduate and be an asset to society. That is what we need to do. Otherwise we would be wasting money all the time.

There is a perception here that government is giving and must continuously give, but surely those students that you are giving must give something back in return. It is not happening. It is clearly not happening.

The other important thing I want to draw your attention to is this that there is a problem in terms of what the TVET colleges are offering. It is not in line Minister with what the skills needs of this country. Maybe when you are now going to be giving funding, it should be based on the skills needs of this country, because what is the point in giving funding to thousands of students who are going to graduate after that 60% of the dropout? They are all going to sit at home.

However, yet we have many skills that are short. We do not have the skills in this country.

If you saw the latest report of the information technology, IT, sector, we do not have. We do not have the skills in the country. So, I think we need to be mindful of that.

However, I also want to tell you that we are very fortunate in South Africa. Look what happens in Israel. In 2014, they destroyed three universities and 140 schools and continuously bomb all the infrastructure making it very difficult to acquire university education. That is the conduct of the barbaric Israel government.

I also want to talk about Minister, that there needs to be some level of engagement with basic education because the students that are coming there are ... [Inaudible.] ... us why. The NFP supports this Budget Vote. Thank you. [Time expired.

Mr W T LETSIE: House Chairperson, Hon Faber we know you’ve never been to university, please listen. You may learn something. Hon Minister Blade Nzimande, Deputy Minister Buti Manamela, Committee Chair, Nompendulo Mkhatshwa and all chairs present, Whip J Mananiso and all whips present, hon members good afternoon. In order to transform any economy and to build human capabilities to support social and economic development, the skills levy is a progressive distributive, taxation system which contributes to reinvesting in human capacity of the country.

The State Information Technology Agencies, SITAs play a critical role in skilling the youth or graduates to develop various experimental training in the sector of education. Many of the student who have been supported by SITAs, are today participating in the mainstream economy. Transitioning in

training beneficiaries to sustainable work opportunities is fundamental for their livelihoods.

House Chair, since the beginning of this administration, new artisans registered for training since 2019 to date is just above 59 000. And the department plans to register 23 000 in the current financial year, which is an increase from the previous yearly targets.

The number of artisan learners qualifying per year since the beginning of this administration stands at 83 706. This is part of developing much required technical skills, to support the various industries. In fact, this administration has over

35 Technical Vocational Education and Training, TVET, colleges as the Minister said, who are now ... [Inaudible.] ... places.

A critical approach we should infuse in our higher education system is work base learning. We need to change the thinking of the youth to recognise hard skills as critical for industries. The denial of university education for black by colonialism and apartheid has led to many parents propagate a false understanding on the significance of technical training, thus a high demand for education.

Through work-based opportunities the youth can also develop entrepreneurial skills as they have the know-how and ease of transition to a workplace.

Since 2019, the department has created just over 526 000 work base learning opportunities. And for these 110 500 opportunities will be created. As this portfolio committee we will continuously monitor the efficiency and the impact of these programmes, to ensure they empower young people. We will continue to scrutinise governance challenges in the SITAs, as they derail the commitment of the ANC.

During Sona, the President affirmed that the government plan to finalize the comprehensive student funding model, Minister, for higher education, particularly for student who fall outside the National Student Financial Aid Scheme, NSFAS, criteria, reaching those who are known as the ‘missing middle.’

Furthermore, to produce the skills our country needs, the government plans to expands vocational education and training system through the implementation of the approved curriculum for the three-stream model.

We zoom in on the budget at focus, tabled in on the Budget Vote because that’s what we are here for, hon King. The NSFAS is set to receive ... now I want to speak about those things of numbers, R163,7 billion over the Medium-Term Expenditure Framework, MTEF. It will use this fund hon ... [Inaudible.]

... to provide for those like me, who did have financial assistance to go to university. And this year is 1,1 million, university student and this is estimated that over the MTEF, it will be 1,3 million university students and 1,2 million TVET college students from poor and the working class, Bagraim. This is the rapid increase since the beginning of the Sixth Administration.

And to put it into context, Mrs King, NSFAS had a budget of R5 billion in 2015 and today, the ANC-led government has increase that to R47 billion as the Minister indicated. This illustrates our commitment as the ANC-led government, making education an apex priority. I am going to response to you because we know your ANC views.

When we assess the presented plans by the department to committee concerning their expansion of access. We are pleased to ... I told you, university trains people to listen, so

please. We are pleased to see the plans achieved and anticipated to be achieved for the future. You will not know; you’ve not been there.

The department in terms of increase of the university enrolment, the increment of the enrolment in relation to the expansion access will need facilities increase and an increase of funding through NSFAS bursaries and ensuring that NSFAS committed in ensuring that the increment is monitored and evaluated efficiently, hence we are now building two universities in Ekurhuleni and Hammanskraal.

The Economic Reconstruction and Recovery Plan has placed infrastructure as a key catalyst for economic growth and development. The department state that with infrastructure building, it is important to also cater for appropriate infrastructure to accommodate students who access higher education for skills and knowledge.

Student accommodation has been a crisis, and this has left higher education sector facing many problems of poor facilities to accommodate our students. A further R300 million is allocated to provide students accommodation at universities

and TVET colleges. We therefore need to pause and reflect on what has and is continuous contributing to this crisis.

Universities and private student accommodation providers can’t continue to charge students exorbitant fees for their small rooms with small beds and in some instances, like here in Cape Town some beds cost as much as R9 000 per month.

We welcome NSFAS new policy of actively playing part in accreditation of student accommodation. We welcome and support the implementation plan of the department, nine projects through the student housing infrastructure programme for the provision of the 28 00 students’ beds over the medium term ... [Interjection.]

The CHAIRPERSON (Mr F D Xasa): Hon member, you are competing with the speaker, please continue hon member.

Mr W T LETSIE: Three thousand beds are planned for this year by the end of this current financial year. We shall continue to monitor the efficiency of NSFAS in providing support for student accommodation, through the accreditation of private student accommodation service provider. We call on the

department to support NSFAS in ensuring that students are not exploited by this private student accommodation. I think maybe we are not surprised Minister that some people came here and made this Nzimande budget vote. This a Budget Vote of Higher Education, but we are not surprised.

We are not surprised that these ones on my left, like these ones who did not go to university at all, do not support the budget. In fact, to them a support for this budget which is pro poor Minister ... any support for this budget goes against their unwritten policy of making sure that blacks in general and Africans in particular are left without skills to take themselves out of poverty. That is an unwritten policy of the DA in far as education is concerned.

In fact, we have heard them saying this in the committee from, may her soul rest in peace Prof Bozzolli to hon King and now the new one is also following into the footsteps of these ones. In their imagination, this people, they believe that their moon-shot packs coalition agreement will take the ANC out of power. Somewhere in their imagination, that’s what they think. And that is why they believe that should that happen, they believe that they are going to close down NSFAS, because

that is the unwritten policy. But what will that mean, it will mean that the dreams of an African child of being skilled must go down the drain.

So, we want to appeal to all South Africans, when you vote for these ones and their moon-shot, those ones, you are voting for the black child in going out. You are voting for a black child of not having meals, the 1,1 million who are funded now ... [Interjection.]

The CHAIRPERSON (Mr F D Xasa): Hon members, you are drowning the speaker please.

Mr W T LETSIE: ... we want to send a clear warning, hon Nodada, we want to send a warning to yourselves, there that bro John and madam Zille, very soon we will send you to Harvard.

When they are done using you, they will send you to Harvard like they’ve done with those who came before you. Ask pastor Musi, ask Van Damme and ask meLindiwe Mazibuko, amongst many others, amongst your benches, they will send you to Harvard

don’t say we did not warn you ... [Inaudible.] ... don’t say we did not warn you.

A friendly warning must go to the youth league of the DA which is the EFF, the veterans league of the DA, the woman’s league of the DA which is the ACDP and many others, that once the DA is done with you, you will not have any base. If you don’t believe me, you must ask Patricia De Lille what happened to Independent Democrats. They made her a mayor and then swallowed that thing until she was ... by the way I want to say ... the only thing you said [Interjection.] ... in your seven minutes, was to say I withdraw to the Deputy Minister.

We recommend that you speak to your Idi Amin of the EFF, hon Malema about anger management. He attended anger management classes and I think that will help you. The ANC supports the Budget Vote of the department as it responds to the challenges affecting higher education and training. Thank you very much.

Ms C V KING: Three months of absence in counting, Minister Nzimande’s attendance of committee meetings is woefully inadequate, to say the least. Instead of the Higher Education

Minister briefing us, Ministers Stella Ndabeni and Nxesi to stand in for the Minister as per his request.

These are the actions of internal petty squabbles between the Minister and his deputy that screams erosion of trust not only between them but in the post school education and training, PSET, sector. A good example of TikTok masculinity is this tension between the Minister and his deputy.

How do we hold the executive accountable when this Minister cannot fulfil his role and mandate as accounting officer for the post school and education sector? We have a PSET sector under siege. Students are pounding on the doorsteps of Parliament, their institutions turned into a battleground.

They were sold a dream of free education for all.

Today all student bodies took to the streets to National Student Financial Aid Scheme, NSFAS, offices resolute in their pursuit for funding. As I walked to the footsteps of Parliament this afternoon, I met with students who expressed the anxiety of NSFAS funding outcome delays and scared if they will be allowed to write exams.

These students are not playing to the gallery or grandstanding. They are expressing their anguish frustration and anger of being sold a dream. Yes, Deputy Minister, these are people. We cannot blame them for taking such drastic actions.

They are losing hope and going hungry while waiting on funding outcomes from NSFAS. They are still waiting on appeal outcomes since 2022. They are waiting for answers on the 40 credits that is excluding them from accommodation.

Just a few weeks ago, NSFAS deliberately did not honour a longstanding commitment with the committee and on postponing this meeting they had the audacity to present us a half-cooked report on their performance thus far.

Clearly the NSFAS board is not taking the oversight role of the committee seriously as well as that of the Auditor-General when submitting their strategic and annual performance plans after the due date.

A rogue unit being law unto themselves who’s play ping-pong with the lives of poor and working-class students. This entity

who claims to have distributed 96,6% of student funding and yet we saw students at Cape Peninsula University of Technology, CPUT, University of Western Cape, UWC, and Nelson Mandela University, NMU, taking to the streets. What a contradiction.

Our oversight visit to the University of Fort Hare was a warning signs of political allegiance posing a threat to institutional autonomy. We were met by the brave vice chancellor, Dr Buhlungu, his deputy, and university spokesperson. They were concerned that a once proud institution is being infiltrated by a syndicate of politicians and officials of the university.

They are concerned that the university is being captured and this syndicate is trying everything in their power to intimidate and victimize them for standing up to corruption at the institution.

A glimmer of hope is that the Special Investigating Unit, SIU, investigations will shed light on Mayor Faku, Minister Kiviet and Premier Mabuyane’s qualifications, as well to the deep-

rooted political infiltration of ANC politicians at the University of Fort Hare.

Minister, we will expect you to be the first one to stand up and tell these charlatans to step aside. It will be a true test of your integrity. Out of the almost 13 million applications for the social relief of distress grant at the end of January this year, 716 000 tertiary graduates applied.

I am bringing this to your attention, Minister. Just consider for one moment, how fundamentally different their career prospective would have been if TVET colleges and institutions of higher learning curricula was in line with trends in the job market; if it took less than six months for Seta and Quality Council for Trade and Occupations, QCTO, to issue certificates; if some of these missing middle students had the means to clear their student debt to have access to their certificates to look for employment; if they were students who were victims of unaccredited courses at Walter Sisulu University, WSU, or just victims of the impact of load shedding when their place of employment or businesses had to close down, their dream of entrepreneurship folded, or just

maybe if they are coloured and Indian graduates, excluded on the basis of their race.

Underfunded entities, inconsistent and poor governance in the PSET sector has a cascading impact on the lives of students, academia, and the mandate of institutions, even more so, the behaviours of the vice chancellors of University of Cape Town, UCT, and Unisa taking the transformational agenda of senior black female academics a step back.

Minister, just because you are doing a lot more does not mean you getting a lot more done. Don’t confuse movement with progress. If the basic fundamental principles of oversight, transparency and accountability are not in place, then you are certainly planning for failure.

The reports from your department scream of systems and procedural failures. Policy direction and implementation has never been and never will be the ANC’s strong point. They are planning these youth for skills programme for a country and society which they are not willing to provide them.

Our governance in the Western Cape, uMngeni and Kouga shows policy direction easily translated into lived realities of employment opportunities through upskilling and reskilling young and old.

Time is too precious and limited to waste it living under the ANC’s dream, we will not be trapped by dogma. This governing party who throughout all these years could not get the skills development trajectory of the PSET sector right now comes here and talks about the skills master plan.

Well, Minister, first getting the President to promulgate the national qualifications framework Bill which has been gathering dust on his desk since 2018 to ensure SA qualifications Authority, SAQA, and QCTO, have proper legislative mandate to give meaning to the strategic plans and annual performance plans.

Our tenure in office after the 2024 moon-shot elections will give public and private education a fighting chance to create a knowledge economy driving innovation at the centre of social and economic growth. We remain clear, no one will be left behind including myself as a coloured.

*Sepedi:*

Moh J S MANANISO: Modulasetulo, ke dumediia le batho kamoka. Ke rata gore mamohla ...

*English:*

... my budget speech be based on the people, not you as Members of Parliament because you have an opportunity to deal with these issues through portfolio committees. This budget aims to expand access to improve success and efficiency on the post-school education and training opportunities, to improve quality of the Post-School Education and Training, Pset, provisioning, make the Pset sector responsive and lastly, to ensure the excellent business operations within the department.

We are supporting this budget with the message to those who are tasked with the responsibility of implementing these plans and budget so that institutions work for the better for good if individuals trusted with authority can execute their mandatory tasks without irregularities. We want those who are tasked to do so that they must practice good governance, that they must plan budget and do programmes accordingly. And we hope that they will actually implement the SMART principle as

elaborated by the Auditor-General. We can review all plans, strategies and budget, however, if individuals do not understand the importance of agility, nothing will change.

We have seen that the COVID-19 pandemic has adversely impacted some of those efforts, however, post-COVID-19 all hands are on deck. The technical and vocational education and training and the community education and training sectors are key subsectors in education. These sectors are required to respond to skills development needs across the sector, the society, including social needs, economic development needs industry and the public sector at large.

For the 2023-24 financial year, the Technical and Vocational Education and Training, TVET, and Community Education and Training, CET, programmes have received a budget allocation amounting to R12,7 billion and R2,6 billion respectively. We would like to have significant increases in the budget of these two sectors. These budgets will go towards expanding access to TVET and CET colleges. The bulk of this budget goes to funding compensation of employees in both sectors. In expanding access to TVET and CET colleges, the department

targeted to enrol 520 000 and 321 410 students in TVET and CET colleges respectively.

In improving success efficiency of the sectors,

R41 200 students are targeted to complete the general education and training certificate. I think here hon Steenhuisen can be accommodated, because this is the only sector that can actually accommodate your leader. This is the only department. Student support services should be strengthened, including support services to students with disabilities. The college sector has a challenge of underqualified lecturers. We commend the department for putting in place mechanisms to mitigate the challenges in ensuring improved quality of the TVET sector.

In relation to the responsiveness of the sectors, the department plan to have 75% of TVET colleges lecturers and professional qualification. Additionally, 300 TVET college lecturers holding appropriate qualification supported to acquire professional qualification and 200 lecturers participating in project-based lecture capacity building programmes in engineering - electrical, plumbing and mechanical.

Technical and Vocational Education and Training and CET colleges are required to be responsive and relevant on qualifications offered to ensure that the graduate are employable or be self-employed. Thirty-five TVET colleges will offer Fourth Industrial Revolution, 4IR, aligned with skills training, 4 500 TVET lecturers will participate in digital literacy programme. All colleges will implement student- focused entrepreneurial development programme without partnership, including industry partnership, colleges will not be able to respond to the skills needs and make the desired impact.

Through our oversight we visited colleges at Vhembe in Limpopo, and we have seen how that college is defying its rural locality. The college is going all out to seek partnership funding and developing social compacts with other colleges. So, we encouraged the department to make sure that there is social compact within these colleges.

We have seen the 4IR in action when students told us that they don’t have to go to Japan to train for the 4IR skills. The college uses coding in design and patterns in clothing production and engineering and related programmes. We have in

TVET sector, colleges that serves as models of bad practices. Let me call on the department to encourage colleges to partner with each other again. It will not help the sector to compete but if they collaborate and partner, the whole sector will flourish. We have witnessed at TVET colleges and Industry Partnerships Summit that was held in 2022 that interest and good outcomes will come out of if we walk together. We have hoped that the department in particular, the TVET branch, will follow up ... [Interjections.] ... summit resolution are implemented.

The CHAIRPERSON (Mr F D Xasa): Who’s that now? [Interjections.] Masondo must be kicked out. He is disrupting us. Continue.

Ms J S MANANISO: Thank you, Chairperson for the protection. There are some budget reduction in the baseline, where some allocation for Infrastructure and Efficiency Grant were shifted out of Vote No 17 to the Department of Basic Education to fund the early childhood development, ECD. Hon Shaik Emam, I hope you are listening. At least now, the department has a plan for ECDs to be included so that there is articulation from all levels. While some is ...

The CHAIRPERSON (Mr F D Xasa): There’s another one who was disturbing. I think I am actually saying that she must take note because next time we will remove her.

Ms J S MANANISO: Chairperson, while some is deferred to 2024-

25 and 2025-26 financial years, R1,1 billion is prioritised from the university’s Infrastructure and Efficiency Grant to CET over the medium term. What may look like a loss for higher education and training, it’s actually a gain for the whole education sector and society. We believe that the funds shifted from Higher Education and Training will enable the Department of Basic Education to put systems in place for the provision of ECD, as this will in the long term that the Pset sector enrol quality learners from Basic Education and completion rates increases.

The allocation of R1,1 billion over the Medium-Term Expenditure Framework, MTEF, period will enable the reconstruction of the basic skills centres and teaching and learning facilities in the CET sectors. We welcome these initiatives. This really shows that the recommendations we have made as a committee in the past budget and BRRR did not fall on deaf ears. We actually want to acknowledge that as we

speak - as the portfolio committee, at least the department is listening to us. We can see on their plans, the reflection of whatever that we have recommended. We pleaded with the department to ensure that CET colleges are all prioritised.

Ninety-five per cent of the CET learning centres are housed in Basic Education schools and this comes with its own challenges and identity. The ANC government implements what it has promised its people. The doors of learning are continuously opening – it’s a fact. We also welcome the plans of the Department to build eight TVET college campuses over the MTEF period of which two will be constructed in 2023-24. We commend the department for the development for safety and security minimum norms and standards for TVET and university. We hope this will assist institutions on putting safety and security measures in place. We are concerned that CET colleges are not included in the norms and standards. The CET colleges are going to receive funds from infrastructure development which will attract infrastructure mafias. We implore the department to be proactive and ensure that CET colleges are also included.

As I conclude, let me state that good governance is key to the success of any organisation. The department must ensure that 95% of CET colleges meets standards of good governance. We want all TVET and CET colleges to meet standards of good governance, notwithstanding that we have excellent colleges.

We also have colleges that are worrisome. Few colleges were placed under administration while others are going through governance and management challenges, like at Buffalo City TVET colleges.

We implore the department to ensure that the audit outcomes of some of our colleges are of great concern to us. The areas of noncompliance, identified by the Auditor-General should be addressed. It is also the responsibility of the department to strengthen its oversight over the colleges to ensure that they develop and implement their audit action plan. We will also invite some colleges to appear at the portfolio committee to account on the work done in terms of ensuring that they actually implement their annual performance plan as planned.

As the committee, we have engaged with four CET colleges in the Northern Cape, KwaZulu-Natal, Limpopo and Mpumalanga and all what we got were issues of governance and management.

As I conclude, I want to address the hon King. I think what you have done today it has really showed why you are appointed or elected as the chair. Hon Chirwa, we knew that in this particular platform, you are going to insult – it is your order of the day. We know that you will keep exposing your weaknesses on a daily basis. Hon Boshoff, what I want to acknowledge is the fact that you are always present when we do oversight. However, let us stop playing the man and play the ball. We are here as politicians to make sure that we must execute our tasks as public servants. Hon Letsie, thank you for addressing other issues that I wanted to address ... [Time expired.] ... as my time is up. Thank you.

THE MINISTER OF HIGHER EDUCATION, SCIENCE AND INNOVATION: Hon

House Chair. Thanks to all those who have supported this budget; the hon Mananiso, hon Letsie, hon Yabo ...

*IsiZulu:*

... siyabonga nakuwena Mthiyane kwi-IFP ukuthi nibuye nihambe nihambe nilibone ilanga la lingakhona ...

*English:*

... hon Shaik Emam, thank you for your support. I just want to make a correction, hon Chair, in the figures that I presented when I started. Our budget is R133,8 billion with an average annual increase of R5,3%. So, I want to correct that. I am sorry for the wrong figures at the beginning. Hon Yabo, I want to agree with you. There can be no autonomy from transformation. That is something that is very important. The issues we are raising about challenges of governance, we accept them. That is why, as the department, we want to increase our capacity on governance oversight in our institutions.

You know, the DA, it is not right that when you want to argue, you say things that are not there. The majority of graduates from our universities are with the National Student Financial Aid Scheme, NSFAS ... [Interjections.] ...

The CHAIRPERSON (Mr F D Xasa): ... [Inaudible.] ... you are being warned. Sorry, Minister. Continue.

THE MINISTER OF HIGHER EDUCATION, SCIENCE AND INNOVATION: You

can see them in your YouTube and television how excited and happy they are. So, to actually try and project ... in fact,

our own research tells us that on average, the NSFAS students perform better than none NSFAS students. We also want to say

... [Interjections.] ... don't say something, where did I oppose the Special Investigating Unit, SIU, to actually investigated Fort Hare? I never did that.

Also, to hon king, it is not right to say to project NSFAS first as if it excludes Coloured and Indian students. It is not true, the NSFAS is open to everyone. Don’t take the problems of exclusion that you have in the DA and try to project them here onto us. It is just not true. Also, hon Boshoff, you know, I said to you yesterday and I am repeating it. I would really like to engage with you. You know, when we were negotiating the Constitution with the late General Viljoen and Dr Pieter Mulder, they invited me to the FFPlus offices, took me a long lesson on the history of the Africana. From their point of view, I didn’t agree with some of the things they said. One thing that I agreed with them was that, Afrikaner were actually pursuing some form of socialism, but its defect was that it was for the white Afrikaner minority.

To have fought for poor whites. It was for a noble cause. This is what we are doing as South Africans today. We are fighting

for poor black South Africans who were actually excluded before.

So, I am happy to continue. We are not against Afrikaans. What we were against that time was to use Afrikaans to try to keep Stellenbosch as a whites only university and some of the schools to actually remain only white. Hon Shaik Emam, we are doing a lot. I would invite you to come with me to our TVET colleges, honestly, to see some of the revolution we are doing there, curriculum innovation and all that. As our Deputy Minister was saying, you go to Vhembe - by the way, I won't respond to the EFF, they are not even worth responding to. I have got better things to actually say rather than that.

Comrade hon Letsie is right. If the DA were to take over, they will shut down NSFAS, they will shut down school feeding, they will shut down all these things because they are against them now every day. Every progressive measure that we are taking, they are actually against those. I do want to say that as I end, the problem at Fort Hare must be investigated. However, you must distinguish between corruption that have taken place or might have taken place at Forte Hare from the principle of

recognition of prior learning. Recognition of prior learning is important.

If you have been a Member of Parliament for 10 years and you didn’t have a degree, but your experience equals a degree, you must be given that degree that is at the heart of Post School Education and Training. That I will defend by all means, it was correct for the Eastern Cape government to enter into an arrangement with Fort Hare based on recognition of prior learning. Thank you very much.

The CHAIRPERSON (Mr F D Xasa): Members are reminded that the debate on Trade, Industry and Competition Budget Vote will take place here at 17:15. That concludes the debate and the business of this mini-plenary session. The mini-plenary will now rise.

The Mini-Plenary rose at 16:58.