**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY TUESDAY, 23 MAY 2023**

**VOTE NO 35 – SCIENCE AND INNOVATION**

***PROCEEDINGS OF HYBRID NATIONAL ASSEMBLY – COMMITTEE ROOM M46***

Members of the mini-plenary session met at Committee Room M46 at 14:00.

Acting Chairperson Mr M G Mahlaule took the Chair and requested members to observe a moment of silence for prayer or meditation.

**APPROPRIATION BILL**

Debate on Vote No 35 – Science and Innovation:

The MINISTER OF SCIENCE AND INNOVATION: ... [Inaudible.] ...

Hon members, ... [Inaudible.] ... this is the 5th installation of the Department of Science and Innovation Budget Vote presentation in the 6th Administration. The theme for our Budget Vote today is “Using Science, Technology and Innovation to grow our country and together resolve its challenges.”

In the current financial year, we will continue to implement the Science, Technology and Innovation, STI, ... [Inaudible.]

... plan through the STI budget co-ordination mechanism to build a capable state and contribute to South Africa’s economic recovery. We will upscale the implementation of the Innovation Fund, in order to support the early development and expansion stages of technology-based South African firms. We also remain resolute to increase gross domestic investment in research and development as a percentage of gross domestic product, with the aim of achieving the National Development Plan’s target of 1,5%.

Through the Hydrogen Society Roadmap, we have unlocked the potential of new sources of clean energy to facilitate a just transition from a carbon-intensive to a carbon-neutral economy. We have also registered the Hydrogen Valley Programme with Infrastructure South Africa under Strategic Integrated Projects in December 2022. Through the CoalCO2-X project, we have supported a carbon capture and utilisation technology, which captures carbon dioxide from flue gas and then converts it into a fertiliser salt using ammonia. This technology was successfully demonstrated at a cement plant in Limpopo this year January 2023.

To date, we have invested R50 million in this project, which has allowed local small, medium and micro-enterprises to put in place partnerships to demonstrate the potential of flue gas conversion technology at the plant. We will be finalising our masterplan in the establishment of a National Solar Research facility that will support the development, commercialisation and deployment of solar-based technologies for application in both the solar power and fuel sectors in order to facilitate the movement of technologies from laboratory to market. We are also reviewing our Water Research Development and Innovation Roadmap with a view of improving our investments for greater impact in the water sector. One of our major preoccupations is to develop an STI roadmap towards a circular economy, given the pressure of finite natural resources and sensitivity to global warming risks.

In support of our indigenous knowledge systems, we are leading the research, development and innovation pillar of the Cannabis Industrialisation Master Plan. A total of 20 small, medium and micro-enterprises, SMMEs, received support for product development through the Council for Scientific and Industrial Research, CSIR, and its partners. We are also piloting the recognition of prior learning assessments through

the University of KwaZulu-Natal, the North West University and the University of Venda in order to redress and levelling the imbalances of the past where indigenous knowledge was not regulated nor recognised by our laws.

We are supporting several national demonstration and upscaling incubation facilities hosted by the CSIR through the Strategic Industrial Bio-innovation Partnership Programme. Our Research, Development and Innovation partnership with the Minerals Councils South Africa continues to receive R65 million from our Department and R32,5 million from the Minerals Council South Africa per annum.

I am delighted to report that through the Agriculture Bioeconomy Innovation Partnership Programme, we have supported agro-processing in rural communities and farmer development programmes benefited a total of 845 black emerging farmers in 2021-2022. We are also supporting the honeybush project and the marula value chain project in partnership with the Industrial Development Corporation and Technology Innovation Agency. We have also carried out innovative strategies to promote agro-processing, such as nixtamalization targeting women, youth and people with living with disabilities in

Limpopo, the Free State, the North West and Mpumalanga for them to start their own business.

We have also established a seed processing facility and are also piloting a seed development project in the Ncera area in the Eastern Cape to promote the local production and consumption of pulses and ensure food and nutrition security. Together with the Department of Agriculture, Land Reform and Rural Development we supported the launch of a National Biosecurity Hub to deal with national phytosanitary measures and assist South Africa to meet the requirements of international trade.

We also funded the development of a digital platform at Innovation Africa to support the piloting of tools and technologies, such as early warning systems for biosecurity threats, to assist government and producers. Hon Chair and members, our South African National Space Agency, SANSA, has been developing space capability in operational space weather over the last 10 years. Through SANSA, which is our National Space Agency, we have been appointed to host one of the designated International Civil Aviation Organisation Regional

Centres for the provision of space weather information to the entire aviation sector flying in African airspace.

As a department we provided financial support to SANSA for the construction of a 24/7 operational space weather centre in Hermanus. This is the only weather we have in the African Continent of this type. To date, SANSA has trained eight young, black space weather forecasters who will provide services to various clients, including the aviation sector.

Funded jointly by the Technology Innovation Agency and the Cape Peninsula University of Technology, we have also developed a machine-to-machine learning capacity for the cube satellite missions in the current financial year.

As a country, we have signed an agreement with the USA National Aeronautics and Space Administration, NASA, to build a deep-space vehicle tracking and communications ground station in the semi-desert Karoo region of Matjiesfontein, in the Western Cape. This new ground station will be helping to track history-making NASA missions to the moon and beyond by 2025. The partnership will also see continued skills development in space science and technology, which the DSI has been investing in for years. Hon Chair and hon members, as a

department, we have also contributed to the fight against COVID-19 by continuing with research, development and innovation in African natural medicines through the National Policy Data Observatory.

We have made significant progress – I am also pleased to say - in institutionalising the Indigenous Knowledge-Based Bio- innovation Programme, including high-level funding to improve research facilities at the Universities of KwaZulu-Natal, the Free State and Pretoria. As part of implementing the Bio- Products Advancement Network South Africa, we are piloting an indigenous project product programme fund in collaboration with the Technology Innovation Agency. We are therefore funding seven projects to the value of R36 million for high- end product development, agribusinesses and manufacturing of natural products.

We have constructed and equipped the new world-class African natural medicines laboratory at the University of the Free State to do research into HIV/Aids; Tuberculosis, TB; long COVID-19 and diabetes. We are planning a second laboratory for the University of KwaZulu-Natal. As a department, we are highly involved in the area of health innovation, particularly

in three critical areas of Medical Device and Diagnostic Innovation, Active Pharmaceutical Ingredient Technology Innovation and supporting health needs through vaccine research, development and manufacturing strategy.

In this regard, we will continue to support the consortium led by the World Health Organisation to develop and build the mRNA vaccine technology transfer hub locally. The aim of the hub is to diversify vaccine manufacturing and specifically accelerate vaccine production in Africa, through a consortium made up of the Medicines Patent Pool, Biovac, Afrigen Biologics and Vaccines, the Department of Science and Innovation, the SA Medical Research Council, SAMRC, a network of universities and the Africa Centres for Disease Control and Prevention. The strategy is premised on the need to ensure a viable local vaccine manufacturing industry and to address concerns about security of supply on the continent by building sustainable human vaccine manufacturing capacity in Africa.

We are also in the process of finalising a vaccine development, innovation and manufacturing strategy for South Africa. I want to say as South Africa now that, we have laid the foundation and we are ready to start building a local

vaccine manufacturing as strategy and capacity in our country. As a department, we are committed to implement our commitment to support the procurement of locally developed technologies through the Technology Acquisition and Deployment Fund. We are prioritising initiatives for inclusive development and intellectual property exploitation in information and communication technologies, ICT, sector being renewable energy and the circular economy.

Equally, we have developed mechanisms to support entrepreneurs by facilitating the commercialisation of grassroots innovation and access to publicly available intellectual property. This is based on our philosophy of ... [Inaudible.] ... In this current financial year, the Mobile Applications Laboratory or mLab, will be strengthening the Imbali precinct’s Fourt Industrial Revolution, 4IR, innovation system together with Innobiz, which is Durban University of Technology’s Midlands Centre for Entrepreneurship and Innovation. The Imbali Education and Innovation Precinct pilot will enable the Department of Science and Innovation and other players to align skills development and innovation strategies, which will facilitate innovation-led, skills-based, local economic growth and development. The mLab will also be establishing a

community-centred coding laboratory and start an ecosystem development programme focused on school learners and selected community members.

In partnership with local actors, our Living Labs Programme has established 11 community-embedded labs in rural villages and townships. The outcomes have included supporting 200 aspiring innovators through design thinking training, the development of 28 prototypes, 17 market-ready products and the registration of 14 businesses. To date our Grassroots Innovation Programme has enlisted over 140 young entrepreneurs and an additional 60 enrolled through collaboration with the Development Bank of Southern Africa, Innovation Competition, the Eskom Expo for Young Scientists, the insurance Sector Education and Training Authority, Seta, and the Department of Tourism. Over R10 million has been leveraged to support grassroot innovators. Our Grassroot Innovative Programme also launched 15 tourism technology products addressing various aspects of the tourism value chain, illustrating how youth unemployment could be addressed through the commercialisation of products and entrepreneurship. This is actually proof that we are developing scientific capabilities to address the needs of our youth.

We are also implementing the Innovation Champions for Local Economic Development, LED, programme in Vhembe and O R Tambo District Municipalities in partnership with the University of Venda, Walter Sisulu University and other LED actors. To date,

11 innovation champions have been deployed to municipalities and universities in the two districts to support LED managers to foster the innovation agenda. Our intention is to roll out this programme to all 44 districts in the country in support of the District Development Model to ensure that innovation is entrenched at grassroots level.

Our department, through the strategic support from the National Treasury, is implementing a third phase of the Sector Innovation Fund Programme. We have invested approximately

R36 million in the 2023-2024 financial year in order to be matched by industry over four years. Through our 17 technology stations at 13 of our Higher Education institutions, we have provided technological support, including for small batch production and the development of prototypes to thousands of the small, medium and micro-enterprises, SMMEs, and other potential entrepreneurs.

Hon Chair and hon members, I am also delighted to report that we now have begun with the construction of the Square Kilometre Array project in South Africa. Our construction together with that of Australia forms the biggest ever radio telescope array, at a cost of $2,2 billion. It is estimated that these two sites will together create 710 petabytes of science data when fully operational in 2029. It is therefore expected that astronomers can get 50 years or more of transformational science through the Square Kilometre Array.

In South Africa, 133 dish antennas will be added to the existing 64-dish MeerKAT precursor telescope, totalling nearly

200 dishes, to form the Square Kilometre Array’s mid-frequency telescope array. The single largest astronomy science infrastructure in the world. [Applause.] A total of 1 400 students have been supported through the Square Kilometre Array bursary programme to date. We are also educating young people; junior degrees, masters and PhDs in astronomy. Let me also indicate that South African companies and the South African Radio Astronomy Observatory will benefit immensely from the rolling out of this infrastructure, which includes the building of the Square Kilometre Array Exploratorium in Carnarvon in the Northern Cape.

The initiative is expected to boost science awareness and outreach, stimulate science tourism in the region and create employment. All those members who have not yet been to Carnarvon, I invite them to accompany me to the Square Kilometre Array so that they see what we are talking about. It is infrastructure that is being built and every cent meant for that infrastructure has gone in there. [Applause.] Chair, the MeerKAT telescope, built by South Africans does world-class scientific work and will continue to do so until it is fully integrated into the Square Kilometre Array in the next five to seven years.

Among the ground-breaking results of this work and research the discovery of “Nkalakatha” meaning “big boss” a powerful radio laser, the most distant of its kind, with the faint radio waves now detected in the Karoo emitted in colliding galaxies before the earth was even formed. You ask me! That’s the achievements of the African National Congress. [Applause.] Hon Chairperson, on Brazil, Russia, India, China and South Africa, BRICS, South Africa assumed the Chair of BRICS on 01 January 2023, under the theme “BRICS and Africa: Partnership for Mutually Accelerated Growth, Sustainable Development and Inclusive Multilateralism”. Under this theme, the Department

of Science and Innovation will be hosting the BRICS ministerial meeting and BRICS Young Scientist Forum on Science, Technology and Innovation from 31 July to 4 August 2023. Led by the National Advisory Council on Innovation, we will also host the first BRICS, Science, Technology and Innovation, Policy and Foresight Symposium.

The Department of Science and Innovation will also be hosting the BRICS events on photonics, research infrastructure and megascience projects, marine and polar sciences, water research and innovation, technology foresight and Science, Technology and Innovation policy, astronomy, biotechnology, human health and neuroscience. Hon members, before I conclude, I do need to say that we are really providing an example as South Africa in terms of uses of Indigenous Knowledge Systems.

*IsiZulu:*

Sisebenza nezinyanga zakithi, nabo bonke abantu bakithi abazi amakhambi ukubheka ukuthi kulawo makhambi abo yini into esingayithola ukuqhubezela phambili ukwelapha ngoba vele imithi eminingi iqhamuka emakhambini ezinyanga zakithi.

Siyasebenza nabo bonke ukwenza isiqiniseko sokuthi siyafinyelela kule ndawo. Yilo hulumeni owenza lezi zinto

futhi awukho omunye uhulumeni oyokwenza lezi zinto ngaphandle kwalo kaKhongolose. [Ihlombe.]

*English:*

Hon members, the Department of Science and Innovation’s total budget for 2023-2024 is R10,8 billion, obviously not enough, up from R9,1 billion in 2022-2023. Of course, most of the department’s budget goes to transfers and entities. As I conclude, I would like to extend my gratitude to the hon President, the Deputy President, my Cabinet colleagues, the Deputy Minister, and members of the portfolio committee for their support and robust engagement. Gratitude also goes to my wife ...

*IsiZulu:*

... umama wekhaya ...

*English:*

... my staff in the Ministry ...

*IsiZulu:*

... musani ukuzenza sengathi aninabo omama bekhaya nobaba bekhaya. Uma ngabe kukhona izishimane akuyona inkinga yami leyo yinkinga yenu. [Uhleko.] Izishimane ezingaganiwe.

*English:*

I also wish to thank our Director-General, Dr Phil Mjwara, and the entire executive management committee, the staff of my department, the staff in my Ministry, all our boards of entities, executives and staff of all our institutions and everybody who contributed towards the achievement of our policy mandate. Through science we will continue deliberations and the deepening of development in our country with and for our people, especially the working class and the poor. Thank you very much. [Applause.]

Ms N T MKHATSHWA: Hon House Chairperson, hon members, hon Members of the Portfolio Committee on Higher Education, Science and Innovation, Members of the National System of Innovation ... [Inaudible] ... good afternoon. It is ... [Inaudible] ... that I debate the budget of the Department of Higher Education, Science and Innovation for the year 2023-24 and its entities. [Inaudible] ... admit that we are inspired by the work that has been presented to us ... [Inaudible] ...

question that the greatest theme that has come through in the work of this committee in the last four years has been the need to have a transformed, inclusive and ... [Inaudible] ... national system of innovation. Our understanding is that research that has been produced by this department, innovation that has been invented by this department and its entities ought to respond to the daily lived realities of the people of this country. Therefore, the National System of Innovation, NSI must look and feel like those it seeks to serve.

One of the greatest tools towards an impactful of National System of Innovation is what has been recently adopted and finalised which is the decadal plan. The decadal plan will have a direct impact in ensuring that inclusivity, impact and the transformation we would like to see in the National System of Innovation will be there. Hon members of this portfolio committee I want to lodge you for the hard effort you put on in ensuring that the department finalises the ... [Inaudible]

... and now our efforts must be directed towards the implementation of this plan.

What makes it the Decadal plan an important tool in the transformation and impact of science and technology is that,

firstly the Decadal plan seeks to ensure an inclusive and coherent National System of Innovation. The key word there being, inclusive. It seeks to expand and transform the research system. The key word there being, transform. It seeks to increase and ensure future human capabilities. The key word there being, future capabilities. Think about future skills.

We want skills that will be relevant to the future and therefore the Decadal plan seeks to ensure future human capabilities. It also seeks to create an enabling environment for innovation. Lastly, the Decadal plan seeks to achieve increased funding for the NSI and I know that the issue of funding is one that concerns many of us in the NSI.

Looking at the aspirations for this committee for the NSI and the impact it ought to have on the lives of ordinary and all South Africans, the implementation of the decadal plan becomes

... [Inaudibe.] The ANC in its 55th National Conference resolved that there be a deliberate plan for science, technology, innovation with industrial and socioeconomic development, and the decadal plan becomes key in achieving this. It will propel the Department of Science and Innovation, DSI and its entities to drive the contributions that they can make and want to meet in various departments and various

spheres of government. The DSI and its entities ... [Inaudible] ... we really have ... [Inaudible] ... of solutions, research, innovation, technologies that can respond to challenges such as the energy crisis, water insecurity, climate change, human settlements, food insecurity, cyber insecurity, and many other challenges facing many departments and spheres of government.

Allow me to share a few of these plans that people will be impacted with in the development of our country. Firstly, there is no foundation without skills. There is no future without skills. When we speak about skills need to start at basic education. We note the work that the department plans on doing in ensuring that at basic education level we invest in science, technology, engineering and mathematics. We see the work of the National Research Foundation, NRF ... [Inaudible]

... wants to do. Whet the Council for Scientific and Industrial Research, CSIR through the Centre for High Performance Computing wants to do is to support science, technology, engineering and mathematics by training educators in running ... [Inaudible] ... activities in schools.

When we move from basic education towards universities, we also need to strengthen all universities and their academic agenda hence we welcome the NRF developing a funding programme specific to historically disadvantaged institutions, to support the improvement of their research infrastructure and to provide effective research development opportunities for their academics. This will also address the concentration of research ... [Inaudible] ... in the so-called top five universities in our country. When we move from universities, we then need to go towards the TVET colleges. You cannot speak about technology, new technologies or 4IR, innovation, impact, inclusivity without reaching out and incubating TVET colleges. That is why we welcome the plans of the CSIR to establish 18 learning factories and TVET colleges across the country to ensure that the 4IR skills development and adoption takes place in TVET colleges as well.

Hon members, TVETs are an integral component in bringing life to research. We believe that once in research and once the research has to be done, that research must lead into innovation that can be produced and manufactured by TVET colleges. That is why we welcome plans on the department to expand their locations of the technology stations to TVET

colleges and not only to existing universities. Now, commercialisation of innovation, ensuring that when a person

...

*IsiXhosa*:

... phaya ezilalini zaseMzantsi Afrika ...

*English*:

... or in the townships of our country has innovated a product and wants for it to be brought into the market, we need to support them to be able to commercialise that particular innovation from a grassroot level, and we also speak about large scale deployments. We welcome the intentions of Technology Innovation Agency, Tia to support 3 100 SMMEs cooperatives and grassroot innovatives through science, engineering, technology and enterprise development support. We also welcome the establishment of additional technology and innovation support centre.

We also want to while still speaking to this issue around supporting the commercialisation of innovations, welcome what the CSIR will be doing to support the work of Tia by putting in place a R100 million ... [Inaudible] ... fund that will

deal with technologies into commercially ready prospects. Now, this is really something that is marvellous to watch. One entity of the department which is CSIR is working on commercialisation. Tia is also working on commercialisation.

This means that there is symmetry and procurance within the National System of Innovation. The only thing we push in this regard is for the department to ensure that there is no duplication of some of these particular initiatives.

I then now want to move towards SA National Space Agency, Sansa. Sansa like many other entities is really doing a lot of work around science and innovation. They intend on engaging

45 000 young people in the country to ensure they know about the space industry. This will also have a direct impact on ensuring that the space industry is transformed and inclusive because young people will know that the space industry does exist in South Africa.

My other concern Minister and Deputy Minister is that, you know it really – and have got no problem with National Aeronautics and Space Administration, NASA, but you know seeing South African kids wearing NASA T-shirts, hats and everything. I really wanted people to know about Sansa. I

wanted them to know that they have South Africa’s first agency, that they can be part of it too. They can also be part of a team that they put together a satellite that will be launched into space, that will help us to monitor or remote sense and support the country in terms of agriculture, food security, water resource management, spatial planning, infrastructure monitoring, but also to help us plan better for disasters like those that we saw in the Eastern Cape, KwaZulu- Natal and the Free State last year.

What also becomes important is that, once all this data has been collated through ... [Inaudible] ... that data will remain meaningless if we are not able to use it to protect the livelihoods of all and in particular the most vulnerable.

That’s why it is important that we welcome the plans of Sansa to have more trainings for government departments at all spheres of government, particularly those who ought to be key users of space related products and services. So, from the National Department of Agriculture, Land Reform and Rural Development to local municipalities, the incorporation of the use of space products and services has direct impact on our capacity to protect livelihoods and sustainably develop our communities.

We also must acknowledge the plans that the department has not detached from our national strategic objectives in terms of the District Development Model, and the Economic Reconstruction and Recovery Plan, but also these plans speak to what the President wants us to address. For an example, Tia has a lot of strategic initiatives toward the just energy transition and will provide energy innovation centred on an energy mix ... [Inaudible] for our country.

I want to take a moment to really welcome the new chairpersons of boards and of various councils, the new chief executive officers and I want to make a particular mention to the women who have come to the fore in this particular moment. Sarah Mosoetsa who is now the Chief Executive Officer of the Human Sciences Research Council, HSRC and Nompumelelo Obokoh who is now the Chief Executive Officer of the SA Council for Natural Scientific Professions, Sacnasp.

*IsiXhosa*:

Sithi, malibongwe igama lamakhosikazi.

*English*:

Let us also wish the director-general and his team for the best of this financial year. We look forward to receiving the reports on the implementation of these plans and the utilisation of this budget. Director-general ours is not an obsession on the clean audits in order for this department and its entities to bring us relaxed the best of audit reports, but that will mean nothing for a clean audit does not translate to hope, to change and progress for the people of South Africa. Let us ensure that the successful implementation of these plans and the clean audit that will follow will bring sustainable water to ...

*IsiXhosa*:

... oomakhulu eSiyabuswa.

*English*:

Will bring safety to the people of the L=lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender, queer or questioning, intersex, asexual LGBTQIA community, will bring accessibility innovations to my friend Megan, who lost her eyesight at the age of 21 and will bring along all the bright minds of this country like the brightest class of ... [Inaudible] ... College. Despite a mere increase of 13,4% in the budget of the DSI from 2022-23 ...

[Inaudible] ... 2023-24, the committee knows that more resources are needed for greater impact. [Inaudible] ... on resources and the lack thereof impacts on target settings in infrastructure development but also how it impacts... [Inaudible] ...skills.

One of the more concerning financial realities is that the NRF that funds postgraduate students can currently only fund 35% of those that qualify for their funding. This government has successfully increased the demand for postgraduate studying and for the NRF to hand over R2 billion to fund all those who apply for it and actually qualify. The committee has been implored over the years as a starting point for the departments to look into co-ordinating all postgraduate funding in government as a starting point, and we still really want to emphasize that once again we should do this, co- ordinate funding and have it administered by the NRF.

We note the issues around private sector not investing enough for ... [Inaudible] ... international investments and we say please let us make that objectives of this country are not compromised in the way they are. We also know on budget issues deputy-general that the decadal plan is being the greatest

tool for us to be able to better co-ordinate ... [Inaudible]

...departments. Therefore, we again want to emphasize that the decadal plan really is an aiding tool for us to push forward the science of innovation agenda of this country to its greatest heights leaving no one behind, and ensuring that the national strategic objectives of this country are supported.

House Chair, with this department being the beacon of hope ... [Inaudible] ... and the catalyst of innovation of this country, we move for the adoption of Budget Vote 35. I thank you.

Ms K L KHAKHAU: House Chairperson, the Department of Science and Innovation is supposed to be this country’s solution to all that plagues our nation. From this department we should have long seen innovative and sustainable solutions to our electricity generation and maintenance mess. But, dololo! [nothing!]

To date, there remains no synergy between this department and either of President Ramaphosa’s three-electricity Ministry and the Planning and Monitoring Presidential Ministry, making them all four. Firstly, because President Ramaphosa’s plans are

dull and, secondly, because Minister Blade Nzimande lacks the creative imagination and political will to break those silos.

From this department we should have long seen modern proposals on how to broaden access to tertiary education. By now you would think that this department, given that we are 12 years into the 4th Industrial Revolution, would have at least handed Minister Nzimande a digital tertiary education plan that would achieve four very basic things:

Firstly, more students getting access to tertiary institutions of their choice, with those who do not need to be physically present on campus being able to study from South African institutions from wherever in this world. Because one’s geographic location must never be a reason that hampers their ability to future their studies.

Secondly, freeing up accommodation spaces for those who do not have any means of studying at home and depend on university and technical vocational education and training, TVET, student accommodation to further their studies. This would result in less need for off-campus reses [residences] that charge an arm and a leg for a single bed and toilet space.

Thirdly, focusing on making education more affordable for middle class and missing middle families while increasing government’s funding for more poor students. Because fundamentally, we believe that no student should be left behind.

Fourthly, affording young people the freedom to work and study at institutions of their choice with a competent academic workforce. Because young people should never have to choose between putting food on the table and acquiring education that is practically attainable, especially in faculties such as humanities and law. And we should be able to do both and it is this department’s job to ensure the how.

The bottom line here is that not only do we have a lot of catching up to do with the current technological and industrial trends to meet the needs and demands of our nation, but the thinking in this department is just not scientific and innovative enough ... [Interjections.]

Mr W T LETSIE: Chair, the ... [Interjections.]

The CHAIRPERSON (Mr M G Mahlaule): No! Order, hon members! Order! [Interjections.] Hon members, order! Hon Letsie, please don’t do that. Can you make your point!

Mr W T LETSIE: House Chair, I was reminding the speaker on the podium that we are debating science and innovation, she’s been on higher education ...

The CHAIRPERSON (Mr M G Mahlaule): No, no, no. You are out of order, hon Letsie.

Hon Khakhau, just a bit.

Mr W F FABER: Chairperson, just on a point of order. This hon member ...

The CHAIRPERSON (Mr M G Mahlaule): Hon members, can we have order? Hon Letsie, I can’t hear the point that is being raised here! Can I listen to the speaker?

Mr W F FABER: Chairperson, the hon member should know by now, educated to know that we should address the speaker ...

[Inaudible.] ... if you could please just educate him I’ll appreciate it. Thanks, Chair.

The CHAIRPERSON (Mr M G Mahlaule): I have rebutted him.

Hon Khakhau, can you proceed!

Ms K L KHAKHAU: Hon Letsie is proof that the ANC’s thinking lacks innovation and leadership.

The bottom line here is not only do we have a lot of catching up to do with the current technological and industrial trades to meet the needs and demands of our nation, but the thinking in this department is simply not scientific and innovative enough. And this is also seen in their inability to fund 75% of qualifying National Research Fund applicants. The reason is simple, Minister Blade Nzimande and the ANC’s thinking and leadership around innovation are poor, irrelevant and are costing us our futures. Thank you, Chair. [Applause.]

The CHAIRPERSON (Mr M G Mahlaule): Hon members, the House is very small; very, very small. So, if you shout we are not going to hear each other.

Mr T MOGALE: Hon House Chair, greetings to our commander-in- chief, officials of the EFF ... [Inaudible.] ... welcome to the members of the central command team and fighters.

House Chairperson, I’m delighted to finally get to see the Minister of Higher Education present here today. Hon Blade has been absent from the committee for a very long time, so, we are delighted to have him. And his absence happens while the department is responsible ... [Inaudible.] ... he’s faced with a range of issues form student protests to the nepotism in Stellenbosch University and the ANC-led ‘degrees for sale’ corruption at Fort Hare University. So, we are very happy to see the Minister, finally, after a very long time.

The only time we get to see or hear of the Minister speak is when he’s throwing tantrums over the publicity that his Deputy Minister seems to be enjoying. So, he has graduated from being a Minister of government to become more of a reality TV star who wants cameras around him 24/7. So, maybe the cameras can focus more on the Minister now.

Science and innovation are powerful catalysts for progress, enabling societies to address complex problems, improve living conditions and create a brighter future.

Continued investment in scientific research fostering a culture of innovation and promoting collaboration across disciplines are crucial for leveraging their potential to move society forward.

House Chairperson, when the Chief Executive Officer, CEO, Energy and Water Sector Education Training Authority, EW-Seta, came to the committee to present the strategic plan and annual performance plan she lamented the lack of black players in the hydrogen economy that the Minister was speaking about. Her observation was that it was a ‘white boys club’; those were her exact words.

Hydrogen has been hailed as a new gold rush, with the potential to contribute between R70 billion to R160 billion to our economy.

However, the structural barriers and systemic inequalities contribute to the lack of diversity in various scientific and technological fields, including the hydrogen fuel cells.

Historical inequities, unequal access to education and resources, limited opportunities for mentorship and professional development, and incautious biases, all play a role in perpetuating the underrepresentation of black people in this new and an exciting field. So, we are creating an industry which is dominated by white people.

The decline in research and development expenditure by big business is a clear indication of their lack of confidence in the current government because of their corruption and coal stand, power outages.

Loadshedding has a negative impact on research projects; makes it difficult to access data and equipment and increases costs. It also makes it difficult to attract and retain top talent as researchers are not willing to work in an environment where their work is constantly being interrupted by loadshedding.

There are some of the labs [laboratories] which are spending millions, millions which were supposed to be spent towards research and development are now being used to procure diesel because of loadshedding.

A reduction of the health innovation research allocation, from R95 million to R55,2 million, will lead to fewer research opportunities. This is means that fewer studies can be conducted, limiting our understanding of diseases and healthcare practices. This may impede exploration for innovative ideas and discovery of breakthrough therapies or intervention.

The vaccine apartheid that we experienced following the outbreak of COVID-19 highlights the importance of ensuring that we are self-reliant and we are not at the mercy of the western world when it comes to our health.

Indigenous knowledge is recognized for its value in promoting sustainable development, conservation and resilience in the face environmental and social challenges. It offers alternative perspectives, insights, approaches that can complement and enrich western scientific knowledge.

Decreased funding for indigenous knowledge, which the Minister was speaking about, which has moved from R13,8 million to

R6,8 million, will accentuate and perpetuate the inequalities, hinder inclusive decision-making processes and lead to underrepresentation of indigenous perspective in research policy and developmental agenda.

In line with the Andries Tatane clean-up campaign led by the EFF, we call for innovative ways of dealing with the problem of waste across the country.

South Africans generate almost 130 million tons of municipal solid waste per year. Of this waste, a maximum of 10% is recycled or recovered for other uses, while at least 90% is taken to landfill or dumped illegally.

We are running out of landfill space and we are going to lose the fight against waste. Therefore, a waste to energy plant, which generates 1 megawatt per hour of energy from 2 tons of waste and has the potential to generate 60 million megawatts of energy.

Pollution will be controlled by air pollution control device such as clabbas. So far we will be able to resolve two problems, which is waste to energy model, that is dealing with our waste and energy challenges.

But there’s more. As ash in the combustion process, which has been successfully used in the construction ... solving yet another legacy of the ANC misgovernance, that of potholes.

In 2019 China became one of the prominent countries that installed the world’s largest insaration [Time expired.]

EFF rejects the proposed budget for science and technology. [Interjections.] [Applause.]

The CHAIRPERSON (Mr M G Mahalule): Order, hon members! Hon members, there’s speaker on the podium.

Mr S S ZONDO: Hon Chairperson, as a country, we have set a number of goals through the National Development Plan, NDP, in order to eliminate poverty and to reduce inequality by the year 2030. There have been three main priorities identified which are: increasing employment through faster economic

growth, improving the quality of our education, skills and innovation as well as building state capacity to play a developmental and transformation role. Unfortunately, we are far from achieving these as what we have seen is not a development at all and economic regression.

We have considered the annual reports of a number of entities such as the National Skills Fund, NSF, Services Seta, Insurance Seta, INSETA, and the Construction Education and Training Authority, CETA, and even though they are all equally important, I have focused on just a few policy areas above.

After assessing these reports, we would like to bring to the attention of the Minister of Higher Education, Science and Technology concerns such as the development of some kind of a monitoring strategy in assessing the impact of the NSF’s skills development interventions on beneficiaries so to assess whether they get employment opportunities after these training programmes.

There should be consequences imposed against officials who are responsible for recurring underperformance relating to financial management and supply chain management processes.

Concerning the Ceta, we are of the view that a service provider that has failed to deliver on contractual agreements should be barred from doing any other business with any other Setas. The department must prioritise the capable, respected and empowered audit units within the department to help get it on track on its financial flaws. The audit units should not merely pay leap service but all employees must work, meet and achieve its findings.

To ensure smooth operation of these entities, common solutions apply such as swift actions being taken against senior managers who occupy positions without the necessary qualifications and more effective systems being put in place to ensure that performance information is supported by credible records. Hon Minister, we are concerned about 73 vacancies that exist within the NSF and that needs to be prioritised. With such large number of vacancies what obvious plans do you have of meeting this target to improve this inefficiency. One major concern of the IFP is the call for the quarterly reports as the common thing of the most entities as well as obvious shortcomings with the achievement of its target with regard to the audit action plan. The IFP supports the Budget Vote. I so wish the ANC ...

*IsiZulu:*

...ukuthi ulungise izinkinga zayo noEFF ungazulokhu usiphazamisa thina sisebenza. [Ubuwelewele.]

The CHAIRPERSON (Mr M G Mahlaule): Thank you very much hon members. Hon Boshoff, I have not recognised you. Hon members, the next speaker will be hon Boshoff.

Dr W J BOSHOFF: Hon Chair, the Department of Science and Innovation has wide-ranging functions. From the National Research Foundation, which is nearly a department on its own to the Technology Innovation Agency which provides finance for innovative technology-based enterprises to the Human Sciences Research Council which makes sense of human responses to a fast-changing world, this department has an essential task. It gazes into space, sends rockets into space and facilitates radio signals out of space — literally messages from the very

... [Inaudible.]

Generally, when one considers the activities of this department, it creates enthusiasm. The committee is also young and vibrant. In Vhembe, we saw the difference science and innovation can make. We saw how the college empowers its

students and alumni, not only to acquire the knowledge and skills to participate in the global economy, but it enables them to do it right there from outside Thohoyandou.

This department is an economic generator. The nature of technology is sometimes to equalise the playing field. These days it is not important anymore whether a village in Limpopo is connected to either the power or the telephone grid, because off-grid electricity is a reality and cellular communication has made telephone lines obsolete. However, this generating department’s budget has been cut. It must do more with less. Does government take the department seriously? It seems not. Without the human faculty of innovation, technology is dead and worthless.

*Afrikaans*:

In hierdie veld is die grootste bate kundige mense. Kennis, kommunikasie, finansiering en toerusting kan alles beskikbaar wees, maar dit kry eers betekenis as daar mense is wat dit hulle eie maak, wat dit toepas en wat die dryfkrag het om iets daarmee te beteken wat vir ander mense iets beteken.

Waarmee ’n land, ’n besigheid of enige stelsel ook al besig is, jy pas jou grootste bate op. Kom ons aanvaar net vir die argument die mees ongunstige verduideliking vir hoekom wetenskap en innovasie ... [Onhoorbaar.] ... a white boy’s choir or club. [Onhoorbaar.] Daardie wit mans wat in 1994 vir die staat gewerk het, was die staat se bate. Sedert

27 April in 1994 is daardie staat binne die ANC se regering.

Met ander woorde op ’n manier gesê, die ANC se bate.

Die regering kon vir hulle gesê het, julle is hier. Julle is hier omdat julle onregverdige voordele ontvang het. Nou gaan julle hier bly tot elkeen van julle twee of drie swart mense opgelei het wat julle werk kan oorneem, wat weet hulle is ... [Onhoorbaar.]

Maar dit is nie wat gebeur het nie. Kwotas en transformasieteikens het kundigheid laat uitvloei soos water. Eintlik nie soos water nie, want water is waardevol. Watter entiteit ons ook al ontmoet, is daar vakante poste en vinnige omset van personeel ... [Onhoorbaar.]

*English*:

Then we have the Square Kilometre Array, SKA, which is highly impressive but still the newly established national park is not fenced, at least 18 months after we heard costing was done and only execution remains. We were told that locals would get access to superfast internet connection. My information is that it has been denied them to this day. [Inaudible.]

Valuations done to put a price on servitudes which need to be acquired did not consider the socioeconomic impact on farm dwellers, whether employers or employees. Hon Deputy-Minister Manamela said in a ... [Inaudible.] ... it did not need to do so, but I have a document which says it did.

Hon Minister, we visited the infrastructure and we were impressed. Now I want to invite you to accompany me when I visit farms in the area. Don’t let liaison officials tell you what they think you need to hear. We like the department and its work. [Inaudible.] ... but sometimes we don’t like its style. I thank you.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF HIGHER EDUCATION, SCIENCE AND

INNOVATION: Hon House Chairperson; our Minister Dr Blade Nzimande; Chairperson of our portfolio committee, Ms

Nompendulo Mkhatshwa, together with members of the committee; our Director General, DG, Dr Phil Mjwara; Dr Sishi, together with all the officials and entities of the Department of Science and Innovation.

I join the Minister in presenting this Budget Vote Speech under the theme ‘Using Science, Technology, and Innovation To

Grow Our Country and Together Resolve Its challenges’.

Mrs E N NTLANGWINI: House Chairperson, I just wanted to check are all of the cameras in tune and focused on the Deputy Minister, because all of the cameras must totally be focused on him ... [Inaudible.] ... portfolio of evidence, please man.

The CHAIRPERSON (Mr M G Mahlaule): Hon Ntlangwini, that’s not a point of order. Please proceed hon Deputy Minister.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF HIGHER EDUCATION, SCIENCE AND

INNOVATION: This is the last budget of the term of the Sixth Administration, and the penultimate before we observe the 30th Anniversary of our liberation as a country.

We are also presenting this budget two days before the commemoration of Africa Day, and in doing so, we locate our department and its agencies within the broader context of moving Africa’s Agenda 2063 forward within the framework of science, technology, and innovation.

Science, Technology, and Innovation remain critical in dealing

with these major challenges. As the pollical leadership, we have to answer the question: How has the democratic state used

science, technology, and innovation to improve the people’s

quality of life, especially our young people?

Informed by the National Development Plan and our White Paper on Science, Technology and Innovation and our Science,

Technology, and Innovation Decadal Plan, over the period under review, we have made several interventions that are aimed at

improving our people’s lives.

These include those that the Minister has mentioned: 24/7 fine space ... [Inaudible.] ... but over and above, championing the development of local diagnostics products in response to

COVID-19, ultimately approved by South African Health Products Regulatory Authority, SAPHRA, and made by CapeBio, which spun

out of Council for Science and Industrial Research, CSIR, and also Medical DiagnosTech.

Our investment in BioEconomy focused on indigenous innovations, including supporting a Women Co-operative,

Setsong Tea Crafters, in Sekhukhune, which now has an off-take agreement with retail giant Food Lovers Market.

Last year we were able to launch four nanosatellites dedicated

to our Oceans and Coastal Information Management Systems,

supporting our economic sovereignty.

In 2021, we were given the responsibility to support the building of vaccine manufacturing capacity in low- and middle-

income countries that the Minister mentioned, through the mRNA Technology Transfer Hub, and in a short space of time we

developed the vaccine candidate that is undergoing various

pre-clinicals.

Last night in Geneva, on the side-lines of the World Health Assembly, this as it was reported to the news, was celebrated by the international community, signalling our readiness to manufacture life-saving vaccines if the next pandemic hits.

As part of modernising manufacturing through advance manufacturing initiative, we were able to manufacture locally the life-saving ventilators during COVID-19, relying on our technology stations and to utilise our project management capabilities of the SKA programme.

By all accounts these are remarkable achievements for a

democracy that is less than 30 years old and located in a continent condemned for doom.

One of the objectives of the colonial project was to entrench the falsity that, when the European encountered Africans, we

as Africans had no concept of science or capacity to engage in higher forms of thought such as philosophy, mathematics, or

logic.

To counter what is now known as the coloniality of knowledge,

over the years, our department put in place policy and institutional mechanisms that are deliberately aimed at protecting and promoting our indigenous knowledge systems.

One of the ways we continue doing this is the roll out of our Bachelor of Indigenous Knowledge Degree at the universities of Venda and the University of Northwest.

To date, approximately 300 students have graduated in this

field. We will continue to ensure that indigenous technologies in mining and astronomy are promoted within our communities,

including a Smart Village pilot in Nyandeni, Eastern Cape, the project that earned itself recognition from United Nations

Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization, UNESCO,

earlier this year.

By ensuring that we have the requisite number of scientists, researchers and innovators is by deliberately producing a

class of young black and women scientists and researchers. To this end, in 2021-22, a total of 5643 honours and master’s

students, and 2527 Doctorate of Philosophy, PhD students were

supported.

We remain steadfast to meet our target of awarding 12000 PhD bursaries in the 2019-2024 Medium-Term Expenditure Framework, with 7 253 PhD students already achieved.

In a budget debate that is likely to shun good news, it may be important to note that by end of June 2022, we had had supported 17 211 master’s and honours students, seven thousand short of the 24 000 target that we committed at the beginning of this Medium-Term Expenditure Framework.

This is not all, in the 24th years and we are only half year

with mathematics, I mean maths, science not things you are very good at but just listen. In the 2021 academic year, we

commenced with the implementation of the DSI-NRF full-cost-of-

study support for three categories of postgraduate students, benefitting more than two thirds of first time funded

postgraduate students.

After the floods that swept parts of the Western Cape, KwaZulu-Natal, KZN, and Eastern Cape, and the role that space

science played in geo-mapping and helping disaster management

interventions with efficient response capacity, we cannot over emphasise the role that agencies such as the South African National Space Agency, SANSA, play in impacting the lives of our people.

Through SANSA, we have supported 285 postgraduate students at Honours, master’s and PhD level, during the period 2018 to date, with a total of 58 in 2023 alone, so that we can beef up their capacity, so look out for these opportunities.

With the advent of COVID-19, just as is the case with any pandemic, the proliferation of disinformation through fake

news became entangled with scientific knowledge, and in some parts of the world, conspiracy theories triumphed taking

advantage of people’s lack of grasp in scientific knowledge.

This was perpetuated by the mainstream media’s lack of

appreciation of the importance to understand science and present it in such a way that everyone can appreciate its

value and therefore and saves lives. We are working hard to reverse this.

One of the facilities that is central to our work of promoting public understanding of science, technology and innovation is the Albertina Nontsikelelo Sisulu Science Centre in Cofimvaba, Eastern Cape, which has revolutionised the way science centres engage with the public.

Scientists from the CSIR are working with 25 learners from St James and Cofimvaba Secondary Schools to monitor the performance of technologies at the science centre. The learners from these two schools are collecting and uploading data on the performance of technologies at the science centre,

bridging the gap between scientists and citizens.

As part of our work in the continent, we have recently signed a memorandum of understanding with the Democratic Republic of

Congo’s Ministry of Scientific Research and Technological

Innovation, covering areas such as Space Science and the Hydrogen Economy.

Further to this, through our bilateral and research

cooperation between the CSIR and the Ugandan Industrial Research Institute, there will be an up-scaling of the

essential oils project. This Project has resulted in two

demonstrator farms and 40 people in Uganda receiving training on the essentials oil value chain.

Together with Ghana and Ethiopia, we participated in the United Nations Economic Commission for Africa study on advancing entrepreneurial universities in Africa through our

participation in the Alliance of Entrepreneurial Universities in the continent. The Durban University of Technology, Nelson Mandela University, NLU and Stellenbosch University are part of this project.

We are proud to announce that South Africa is the coordinator of the Alliance Working Group, and more than 30 institutions

in the continent have become members.

Working with United Nations Women, International

Telecommunications Union and the African Union Commission, we are implementing the African Girls Can Code Initiative.

This is a four-year programme that aims to expose and equip

young girls with digital literacy, coding and personal development skills, targeting a minimum of 2000 girls between

17 and 25 years by the end of this year.

In conclusion, behind all these figures and statistics we have shared here today, are human beings, families and communities, whose expectation is that this budget will indeed impact their lives in a fundamental way.

Yet, some of our the political parties here tell you that they oppose this budget, then there can be only one conclusion: such political parties are opposed to the people, they do not understand the impact that science have on the people, and are bent on undermining the transformational and reformative

impact that the budget has on the future of our country.

This Budget embodies the needs, interests and aspirations of the people. Most importantly, through this budget, we seek to

help restore the hope among our people that, despite our

challenges, we must continue to believe that tomorrow can be better than today. And hopefully tomorrow some of will bring

the right speeches. Thank you very much.

Mr S NGCOBO: House Chairperson, the mandate of the Department of Science and Innovation is to boost socioeconomic development in South Africa through research and innovation by providing leadership, an enabling environment and resources for science, technology and innovation. This is an extremely important function, and if we are to enhance the wellbeing of South Africans we need ground-breaking science and innovation.

Sadly, however, the ANC-led government has lost billions of rand in corruption over the years, leaving such an important department such as the Department of Science and Innovation seriously underfunded. While cadres have been enriching themselves, their families and friends, departments like Science and Innovation have been neglected. The DA recently discovered that over a period of just two years, the ANC-led government spent R93 million in maintaining 97 mansions for Ministers and Deputy Ministers. Imagine what the Department of Science and Innovation could’ve done with this money. The Department of Science and Innovation could’ve used the

R93 million to increase its allocation to various institutions for health innovation research from R55 million to

R148 million. Or it could’ve spent the money on increasing its allocation to various institutions for hydrogen innovation research from R43 million to R136 million.

We note the initiative by the SA Council for Natural Scientific Professions to track the unemployment of natural science graduates in an effort to gain insight into areas where the state can intervene. We will be monitoring this initiative closely.

The government needs to start seeing science and innovation as the key enabler of service delivery. It is undeniable that advancing technologies and innovations will result in improved education, health care and even Public Service. Minister, you need to ensure that entities like the National Research Foundation, NRF, are properly funded. You must come up with a plan to provide the funding required by the NRF in order to fund all qualifying bursary and research grant applications and the R575 million which is required by public research institutions to support technology development and commercialisation. Minister, you must not just talk. You must act. You need to show your commitment to advance science and innovation in this country and you can only demonstrate this commitment by making sure that the Department of Science and Innovation is properly funded. There is no doubt that with enough funding, this department can go a long way in addressing a number of challenges facing our country.

After next year’s general elections, the DA-led moonshot pact government will ensure that departments like Science and Innovation have enough budgets to carry out their mandates.

This is what our country needs. This is what will take South Africa forward. I thank you.

The CHAIRPERSON (Ms R M M Lesoma): Order, hon members! Hon members, order! I now recognise hon D P Sibiya. Over to you, ma’am.

Ms D P SIBIYA: Hon Chairperson, hon Minister and Deputy Ministers, hon members ...

*IsiZulu:*

...ngokukhethekile ...

*English*:

... members of the Portfolio Committee on Higher Education, Science and Innovation ...

*IsiZulu:*

... ngiyanibingelela.

*English*:

It is for this reason that development has had various industrial revolutions to transform the mode of production from the First Industrial Revolution to the Second Industrial Revolution and the third, and we are currently in the Fourth Industrial Revolution, which is largely driven by artificial

intelligence, with the fifth already in the research and development phase.

A focus on indigenous knowledge systems is critical to advance the decolonisation of knowledge and also to reclaim our indigenous knowledge systems. Indigenous knowledge systems will be supported by the Department of Science and Innovation. As we support the ... [Inaudible.]

*IsiZulu*:

... le ngane yakwaSayensi ngoba izositakula kulenhlupheko esikuyo.

*English*:

... we create jobs ... [Inaudible.]

*IsiZulu*:

...hamba uye eNorthern Cape noma kwezinye izifundazwe ukuthi yesekele kanjani ...

*English*:

... with community even as ... [Inaudible] ... and ...

*IsiZulu:*

... ulalele. Lalela!

*English*:

The improvement of quality efficiency of processes at various indigenous knowledge system documentation centres ...

The CHAIRPERSON (Ms R M M Lesoma): Hon Sibiya, please ... [Inaudible.] Hon members, there has been a plea that we must mind when we heckle ... [Inaudible.] ... it’s small when we heckle in the ... [Inaudible.] No, hon ma Khawula? Hon ma Khawula, I’m sure you are not referring to me in what you are saying. You may proceed, hon member.

Ms D P SIBIYA: The focus on indigenous knowledge systems will truly empower communities and develop their knowledge and systems. Our leading key strategies in a ... [Inaudible.] ... changing world focusses on being able to achieve social and economic development through inclusive economic growth and sustainable development. [Inaudible.] ... it is one of the department’s crucial entities ...

Mr T MOGALE: ... [Inaudible.] ... will the member take a question?

The CHAIRPERSON (Ms R M M Lesoma): The hon member who is throwing his voice, don’t do that. Raise your hand to be recognised by the presiding officer. Hon Sibiya, you may proceed.

Ms D P SIBIYA: The ANC is focussed on the implementation of the National Development Plan as a central policy framework for addressing South Africa’s high unemployment, poverty and inequality.

The department has presented that it expects that R100 million will be spent on local small, medium and micro enterprises, SMMEs, for employment creation, training and skills transfer, and the implementation of community ...

The CHAIRPERSON (Ms R M M Lesoma): Take your seat, hon member. Hon Ntlangwini?

Ms E N NTLANGWINI: House Chair, I was just wondering if the hon member will take a question.

The CHAIRPERSON (Ms R M M Lesoma): Hon member, are you ready to take a question? Respond ... [Inaudible.] ... hon Sibiya.

Ms E N NTLANGWINI: You will see it’s an easy one.

The CHAIRPERSON (Ms R M M Lesoma): No, hon member, the member is not prepared to take a question. Proceed, hon Sibiya. Hon Sibiya, take your seat. Hon member ... [Inaudible.]

Ms K N F HLONYANA: Chair, I just want to understand why the ANC did not clap when we spoke about the R100 million but they clapped when we spoke about two billion? Why did they not clap? Is it because there’s no chance to eat? Is it because there’s no chance for tenders? They must clap.

The CHAIRPERSON (Ms R M M Lesoma): No, hon member, you have raised a point of order so you don’t go on and on, unless you want to leave the room. That’s not a point of order.

Mr T MOGALE: Hon Chairperson, I just wanted to ask, with regard to the Fourth Industrial Revolution that the hon member is speaking about ...

The CHAIRPERSON (Ms R M M Lesoma): No, hon Mogale, don’t do that. You raise your hand and ...

Mr T MOGALE: No, I did.

The CHAIRPERSON (Ms R M M Lesoma): No, no, no, let me proceed. No, don’t assist me. Hon Ntlangwini did it correctly by saying that she wanted to pose a question. Then she was disallowed.

You don’t ask ... in the same sentence ... [Inaudible.] Hon Sibiya, are you prepared to take a question? You may proceed.

Mr T MOGALE: We just wanted to check if the blazer is Fourth Industrial Revolution compliant like Stella Ndabeni. [Interjections.] In the ANC, the Fourth Industrial Revolution is fashionable. We know it by ... [Inaudible.] [Interjections.]

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: No, no, no, we cannot allow insulting ...

Mr T MOGALE: It’s fashionable. So, we are checking if the blazer is compliant with the Fourth Industrial Revolution.

[Interjections.] Stella Ndabeni came with her blazer of the Fourth Industrial Revolution. [Interjections.]

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: Point of order, hon Lesoma. Point of order, hon Lesoma.

The CHAIRPERSON (Ms R M M Lesoma): Hon Mogale, I’ve called you three times. The first time is a warning. The second time is a warning and the third time, can you leave the room please?

Thank you very much. I’ve called you three times. I followed the rules. Hon Mogale, please leave the room. Hon Mogale, please leave the room. Are you also hon Mogale? I’ll call you three times, hon members. Hon Mogale? Hon member, there’s a hand ... [Inaudible.]

Mr W T LETSIE: Chair, we appreciate that hon Mogale is going to walk out ... is going to be moved out. The point is, I think maybe we should bear with them. For those in red, this is the only time they have to speak. [Interjections.] When you are there, Idi Amin does not allow you to speak like this. [Interjections.] [Inaudible.] When Malema is here, you can’t speak like this. This is the only chance you have.

[Interjections.] Go ahead! Go ahead! This is the only chance they have.

An HON MEMBER: Chair, please protect us. Protect us, Chairperson. Please protect us, Chairperson. [Interjections.]

Ms E N NTLANGWINI: We won’t be threatened by a fool. We won’t be threatened by a fool.

THE CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: Throw hon Ntlangwini out as well. [Interjections.] Let Letsie follow.

The CHAIRPERSON (Ms R M M Lesoma): Hon Ntlangwini? ... [Inaudible.] ... I’ve called you three times ... [Inaudible.] Are you engaging with me now? Are you? No, are you engaging with me? You’re not allowing me to rule? Hon Mogale? I’ll come back to you, hon Letsie. Hon Mogale? Serjeant-at-arms, assist me to ... [Inaudible.] [Interjections.]

*Sesotho*:

Mong T MOGALE: Ha ke utlwe, ke kopa o e bue ka Sesotho. Ha ke a utlwa hantle. Mohlomomg ha o ka e hlalosa ka Sesotho ke tla utlwa. Ke kopa o e hlalose ka Sesotho. E hlalose ka Sesotho.

*English*:

The CHAIRPERSON (Ms R M M Lesoma): Hon Letsie? Hon Letsie? Hon members, allow me to attend to hon Mogale. [Interjections.]

Mr M N PAULSEN: {Inaudible.]

Ms E N NTLANGWANI: I’ll point at you. Who the hell do you think you are? Who the hell do you think you are?

An HON MEMBER: You are a useless human being. You are a useless human being.

Ms E N NTLANGWANI: Who the hell do you think you are?

An HON MEMBER: You’re a useless human being.

Ms E N NTLANGWANI: Who the hell do you think you are? Who ... [Inaudible.] ... Who do you think you are? Who do you think you are?

Mr M N PAULSEN: Come here! Come here!

Ms E N NTLANGWANI: Who do you think you are?

An HON MEMBER: Chairperson, I rise on a point of order.

Ms E N NTLANGWINI: Who do you think you are? Go and tell your wife ... [Inaudible.] ... wena man! Who do you think you are? You think you are special ... [Inaudible.]

The CHAIRPERSON (Ms R M M Lesoma): Hon members, order! Hon Ntuli! Hon members, let me just assist you. When I call a member three times ... Hon Ntlangwini, can I just ... Hon Ntlangwini?

Ms E N NTLANGWINI: We are not scared of you. That guy threatened me in the House. You leave him to threaten me and then you want to come at me. You leave him to threaten me and then you want to come at me because I’m giving him a response. Why?

The CHAIRPERSON (Ms R M M Lesoma): Okay, hon Ntlangwini. Hon Letsie! Hon Ntlangwini, you may scream. I’ve called you three times. I’ve explained what the calling of a name three times means. Serjeant-at-arms and the protection services, assist hon Mogale to leave the room.

Mr M N PAULSEN: But what about that guy over there?

An HON MEMBER: Chairperson, can I please ...

The CHAIRPERSON (Ms R M M Lesoma): I’m not taking any hands for now. I’m just waiting on hon Mogale to leave the room.

An HON MEMBER: Chair, if there’s a point of order, you are supposed to take it.

Mr T MOGALE: I’m being ejected for asking a question on the Fourth Industrial Revolution? We know that in the ANC the Fourth Industrial Revolution is special. It’s a fashion statement. It’s a blazer.

The CHAIRPERSON (Ms R M M Lesoma): Serjeant-at-arms and the protection services, assist the member.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: No, but we cannot be undermined and have such anarchy in the House.

An HON MEMBER: Chair, I think we must continue because I think the security is very far today. Let’s continue. We will deal with that matter when they come here.

The CHAIRPERSON (Ms R M M Lesoma): Thank you very much. Hon Letsie, I’ve called you three times. Can you leave the room? I’ve called you three times. {Interjections.] Hon ma Khawula, I will call you three times. You will follow them. Thank you.

Hon Ntlangwini? Hon Ntlangwini? Hon Ntlangwini? Hon member, I’m trying to be nice by not calling your name. Hon Ntlangwini, I’ve called you three times. Can you please leave the room? No, let me finish with hon Ntlangwini.

Ms E N NTLANGWINI: Chair, because I’m responding to an abuser, to a person who made threats towards me, and that is why you are throwing me out? You can’t protect me.

Mr X N MSIMANGO: Please go.

Ms E N NTLANGWINI: You can’t protect me. You can’t protect me. You can’t protect me.

Mr M N PAULSEN: {Inaudible.]

The CHAIRPERSON (Ms R M M Lesoma): Hon Ntlangwini?

Ms E N NTLANGWINI: You are throwing me out because I responded to a person that attacked me and made threatening remarks towards me.

The CHAIRPERSON (Ms R M M Lesoma): Hon Ntlangwini, I’ve called you three times. Hon Ntlangwini, I’m calling you ... [Inaudible.]

Ms E N NTLANGWINI: ... and you still throw me out alone with that guy. What if he attacks me outside? You’re still throwing me out alone with that guy. What if he attacks me outside?

The CHAIRPERSON (Ms R M M Lesoma): Hon Ntlangwini, you are not assisting. You are not assisting.

Ms E N NTLANGWINI: What if he attacks me outside? But, I can tell you now that he dare not raise a hand towards me. He will meet his maker.

The CHAIRPERSON (Ms R M M Lesoma): Hon Ntlangwini, please leave the room. Serjeant-at-arms, assist hon Ntlangwini to leave the room. Hon Ntlangwini? Serjeant-at-arms, kindly ask the protection services to assist hon Ntlangwini. Order still has to be maintained. Order, hon members! Hon Mmutle, you had your hand up.

Mr T N MMUTLE: Hon Chair, hon Paulsen made threats when hon Letsie left the House. That must be looked into. He said the hon Letsie will die. Those are very serious threats that hon Paulsen made. Can you look into that and make a ruling?

The CHAIRPERSON (Ms R M M Lesoma): Yes, I will look into that and make a ruling in the immediate future. Hon members from both sides, can we have order? Thank you very much. Hon Sibiya, you may proceed.

Ms D P SIBIYA: The number of grants awarded per year directed towards science engagements is targeted annually at 120. We wish that the Department may also increase this number for better strengthening of science engagements and growth as well. Operations per year are at an estimation of

RI71 million. This is a significant amount for this research

and development project and in turn this will contribute to the economic development of the country through practical deliverables from our produced workforce.

The department has plans for transformation and will maintain the number of research infrastructure grants at 30 over the medium term and increase the total available broadband capacity provided by the SA National Research Network.

*IsiZulu*:

Ngiyacela sihambe sonke ... neScience and Innovation njengoba eyingane encane.

*English*:

Let’s focus on the recommendation as recommended. We must implement that. If there are problems, let’s all go and support that. Let’s support this department please, even if you are not in the ANC but you are from another party, let’s focus and support them.

As the ANC, we support the budget. We believe in a country that can support and advocate for the generation of knowledge and skills.

Ms C V KING: Chairperson, exactly what took place today is what is warning the world and the country about this doom setback that it is not benefiting South Africa as we move on into this country. All these gains that have been talking about here today is of mini-skew nature for any meaningful South Africa in this country.

We cannot have bragging rights for our success in innovation when in reality loadshedding is raising questions on our ability to translate innovation into practice, our e-health systems are failing the vulnerable people of Pefferville from quickly accessing health care, when the postal and communication services do not have the technology for the SA Social Security Agency, Sassa, beneficiaries at Enoch Mgijima Municipality to access much needed funds, when children still die in pit toilets, and when agricultural technologies do not quickly translate into sustainable food security.

These inconsistencies are as a result of decades of under- funding, incoherent and fragmented governance, corruption and political support undermining the country’s National Systems of Innovation, NSI. The NSI is even more under threat from structural challenges and declining human capital in this

sector, culminating into disinvestment from the private sector.

In 2022, Africa’s investment in Research and Development, R&D, was a mere 1,3%, with an output of only 2%. South Africa’s investment into R&D a dismal 0,62% of GDP. Meaning performance indicators will not be met, projects will not be completed and upcoming doctoral students will not receive funding.

The key question is whether in a middle-income country riddled with unemployment there is a political will to address deep fragmentations and the lack of policy coherence to ensure that we have got an innovative science and innovation system.

Yet, when we look at all of these we cannot advocate for foreign direct investment because R93 million has been spent on Ministers houses for maintenance and yet we need to be thankful for this ANC.

The Minister, you need to ensure that the National Advisory Council on Innovation, NACI, is in the Office of the Presidency to ensure fit for purpose scientist and direct innovative policy initiatives to every sector in our economy

to give true meaning to economic recovery and renewal. NACI’s position in the Presidency will decisively look at leveraging R&D to develop human capital capacity from grassroots level, increase R&D to 1% by 2024 and integrating science outputs to attract private sector investments through collaborative engagements with structural deficiencies.

The Western Cape is clear on their mandate to be the innovative hub in South Africa, with Cape Town having the largest telecommunication market and the most venture capital activity in South Africa. They know to be a smart city, will opening the door to more startups to boost economic growth and decrease unemployment rate.

The City of Cape Town has launched a R1,2 billion solar plant project for green and just energy transition. Ultimately, a step closer to be self-reliant on the way to have their own energy mix and away from the darkness of loadshedding.

There is no magic bullet to fast-track innovation without growth investment in R&D and a strong political will to put science and innovation at the heart of economic development, leaving no one behind in the process.

Minister, we cannot solve problems with the same thinking we used to create them. Survival is for the ones who are adapting to change. Change is coming whether you like it or not. Under the new government in 2024, science and innovation will be the focus of South Africa’s social and economic trajectory and racial quotas will not be driven to deter minority groups from activities actively participates in the country of their birth like hon Pillay and hon Sibiya.

Just like in 1969, the impossible was made possible with the first moon landing, in 2024 these naysayers on my right will experience the wrath of South Africans at the moonshot elections when the impossible becomes possible. I thank you.

Mr K B PILLAY: Hon House Chairperson, hon Minister and hon Deputy Minister, hon chairperson of the committee, fellow hon members, our young scientists and all South Africans in all platforms, good afternoon. [Sanibonani.]

His Excellency the President, in His state of the nation address, said that as a nation, at this time more than any other, we need to reveal our true character. This was on the backdrop of the impact of the corona virus pandemic on the

economy which requires the implementation of the Economic Reconstruction and Recovery Plan. Therefore, the nation’s resilience amid economic stagnation is paramount. Science and innovation play the biggest role in response of the threat of the corona virus pandemic which negatively impacted on the livelihoods of our people. Science and innovation, became the greatest of needs, more than ever.

Now, we must ensure that we support and promote science and innovation to make a societal impact. Science and innovation should be understood as an international phenomenon which stems from the local. Therefore, our programmes should always have the local impact as an objective.

Hon Chairperson, as a country, one of our developmental objectives is trough international co-operation. We believe that our strategic interests in science, technology and innovation can be advanced through the promotion and transformation of an inclusive and coherent national system of innovation.

The Budget Vote is set to support 129 projects with donor funders that are target for an acceleration of a coherent

system of scientific innovation. The department has a goal of getting 1 270 South African students, listen hon member, you may learn something, to participate in international programmes, over the medium-term with a target of 55% women and 60% being youth, to increase the number of scientists we produce for the country and to provide these students with international exposure.

China, for example has over 290 000 students, studying in the United States of America, USA. This is a strategic move to harness the country’s competitive advantage. We are encouraged by the plans to hold engagement with 36 science, technology and innovation leaders. This is important as part of promoting science dialogue and encouraging innovation. The department strides in ensuring that we produce key plans for science and innovation for the benefit our country through engagements are crucial.

We need to increase science journalism in our country. To demonstrate the groundbreaking work done in our country. This will also assist in promoting maths and science amongst children and amongst the girl child in particular to address the gender inequality in the sciences.

Hon Minister, our science, technology and innovation leaders, should be deployed to our communities to be role models for our children in the basic education system.

Hon House Chairperson, we support the Sector Innovation and Green Economy which is a subprogramme for the provision of policy strategy and direction for growth. The strategic sectors of the economy, in the midst of our energy crisis, we need to leverage our science capabilities in our entities to aid the nation’s load shedding response and the just energy transition to a green economy for science and innovation.

South Africa and the continent can position themselves as producers of the green economy products by leveraging natural mineral resources which are critical for the green economy such as hydrogen platinum and other minerals that are critical for the green economy.

Hon members, the department’s entities play a key and strategic role in science and innovation. As we believe through the monitoring of their progress, as a committee, we have set to have intended outcomes and impact. The entity of the academy of science in South Africa is a base for the

promotion of brilliance and progressive achievements in the fields of scientific enquiry. It assists in the provision of evidence-based advice concerning science for our government and other important government stakeholders. The academy is set to produces 15 lecturers on scientific topics elements, enhance the level of research and development of science.

These 15 lecturers will be coming from 12 strategic partners with players in the science community that will be able to publish journal tittles on scientific electronic library online open access platform.

As the committee that is not only been concerned with science in isolation, but as well with technological advancements for science. We welcome the fact that these lecturers will be accessible digital. Knowledge which is not accessible can be redundant. Therefore, we disseminate research not only for scientists, but we ensure it is accessible for persons with different literacy levels as we apply sciences in our daily lives.

Hon Chairperson, the department has key priorities and programmes for the practical implementation and sustainable development of socioeconomic innovation growth in areas

specific to aerospace. The advance manufacturing of chemicals, advanced metals as well as information communication and technology, ICT, facilitated in the development of new targeted industries led by research and development is important.

We note that the department has committed to funding 600 interns, train and set ready to transfer the knowledge to practicals. Over 60 unemployed young people in various provinces were successfully trained by the Department of Higher Education, Science and Innovation in qualitative data collection methods as well as the technology use to document. The department seeks to have 145 knowledge in innovation products in South Africa’s intellectual property portfolio.

The committee noted further that the department is set to fund

15 instruments in support of increased localisation, competitiveness and industrial development led by the priority of research deliverables and the developmental outputs. Research should benefit local economic development and leverage our competitive advantage as a country to compete globally.

Hon Chairperson, the Council for Science and Industrial Research, CSIR, an entity of the department, has been crucial in the process of research resource for fostering improvement of the country’s ability to efficiently deliver basic services in fields such as health, education, energy for the people and in so doing, be able to deal with inequalities.

The CSIR, has set targets of 56 registered ... [Inaudible.]

... and will be able to publish 960 journal articles over the medium-term. The CSIR is set to implement a range of research development and innovation programmes in areas such as health, energy, defense and security for an estimated budget R8,4 billion. Now we hope that this will yield more positive results for job creation and the development of industries due to innovation for the country.

Now let me respond.

Hon Chairperson, let me remind hon members that this debate is actually on science and innovation and tomorrow is higher education. It is a pity that you use up your small allocation of minutes to be off the topic. It is most unfortunate that it

took a black child to believe that in 29 years you can deal with 300 years infrastructure that has only benefitted a few.

You see the difference. It is not that we are not innovative. This government has actually provided electricity to the millions of South Africans.

The CHAIRPERSON (Ms R M M Lesoma): The hon Pillay.

Mr K B PILLAY: That your masters deprived for years!

The CHAIRPERSON (Ms R M M Lesoma): The hon Pillay.

Mr K B PILLAY: The demand for electricity, became more, because we provided electricity to communities that were not electrified!

The CHAIRPERSON (Ms R M M Lesoma): The hon Pillay.

Mr K B PILLAY: Sadly!

The CHAIRPERSON (Ms R M M Lesoma): The hon Pillay, just take your seat. There is a point of order.

Ms C V KING: Hon Chairperson, will the hon member take a question?

The CHAIRPERSON (Ms R M M Lesoma): The hon Pillay, will you take a question?

Mr K B PILLAY: Hon Chairperson, they will waste my time. I have allocated minutes.

Ms C V KING: Hon Chairperson, anyway, he needs to explain to us are you ... [Ianaudible.] ... as an Indian?

The CHAIRPERSON (Ms R M M Lesoma): The hon Pillay is not taking a question, hon member.

Mr K B PILLAY: Thank you, Chairperson. We use our minutes constructively.

Sadly, there are those and sadly, please listen to this carefully, there are those who are hell-bent on keeping us as a country bound by chains of the past. They do not want to see the African child develop and become better than them!

I have news for you. Not in our name! We will become successful and we will develop! We will occupy the space and we will claim victories!

The hon member of the EFF, indeed you were not going to see this Minister as you were sitting in a different committee. Just to remind you, he is the Minister of Higher Education, Science and Innovation. Now that you have joined this committee, you will see him. You cannot expect to go to Nandos and want to find Kentucky fried chicken, KFC.

Further hon member, can you share this knowledge that you have on 6 million megawatts of energy that can be produced from turning waste to energy? We would love to hear about this.

How do you not support a budget of this nature? It can only mean hon member, hon member, it can only mean that you are not progressive and do not want to see the expansion of science and innovation.

Ms K N F HLONYANA: On a point of order, hon Chairperson.

The CHAIRPERSON (Ms R M M Lesoma): Hon member, what is the point of order?

Ms K N F HLONYANA: Hon Chairperson, my point of order is: I want to understand that is a member allowed to say to another member that they are not progressive?

The CHAIRPERSON (Ms R M M Lesoma): Hon member.

Ms K N F HLONYANA: Hon Chairperson, can you rule on that and not you hauling. Respect the Chair.

The CHAIRPERSON (Ms R M M Lesoma): Hon member, *awua*. [No!]

Hon member, it is unfortunate the hon member did not direct that to any member, but he just generalised his thoughts. No, I am referring to what you asked and I am responding.

The hon Pillay, you may proceed.

Mr K B PILLAY: Hon Chairperson, as a progressive member of this House, let me say that for some of us, the role is just

to oppose. Oppose, oppose and oppose! Just living up to the tittle of opposition and never constructive!

The hon Ngcobo, all we ever hear is corruption. Can you provide us with just one case number that you have reported? It seems you have this information, but do nothing with it. I have to remind you, hon members that your rise to fame and your moonshot pact has already failed before you even took off. You have been removed from Joburg, and you are soon going to be removed in Nelson Mandela Bay.

Hon Chairperson, the ANC supports this budget with no doubts that our government’s work and efforts for our country are centered on the people and a creation of a better life for all. Come 2024, we will still be the ruling party in these Chambers! Thank you. [Applause.]

Ms K N F HLONYANA: Hon Chairperson, may I please address you.

The CHAIRPERSON (Ms R M M Lesoma): hOn members, order! There is a point of order.

Ms K N F HLONYANA: Hon Chairperson, my point of order is: It is unpaliamentary for members of this House to take photos of the opposition. I did not want to disturb you, because I can see that already that three of my members have been evicted. The hon April, there at the back was busy taking photos with his device. Can you please rule on that?

The CHAIRPERSON (Ms R M M Lesoma): Hon members, order! Hon members, hon members from both sides of this House, you are reminded that and thank you hon member for raising that point. Hon members, order!

*IsiZulu*:

Cha, nihluphile kodwa!

*English*:

Hon members, order. Hon members, unfortunately, I cannot send you out all of you, I will be left alone here.

Hon members, be careful that I do not call you three times.

Hon member, you are correct by raising that issue. That reminds all of us that we are not allowed to take pictures in the House. I have given a warning to all of you.

Hon members! Hon MaKhawula, are you pointing at me and want to say something or are you being bold?

Hon members, you will not like it if I apply the rules.

Hon MaKhawula, this is for the second time and one more.

Hon members, I now recognise the Minister of Higher Education, Science and Innovation. Over to you, Sir.

The MINISTER OF HIGHER EDUCATION, SCIENCE AND INNOVATION: Hon

House Chair and hon members, let me start by thanking all the members who supported this Budget Vote.

*IsiZulu*:

Siyabonga kakhulu. Izindlela zenu ziyohlala zikhanya njalo ngoba izinto ezinhle niyazibona nezinenqubekela phambili. Abangazifuni lezinto abasalele emuva.

*English*:

I also just want to address this issue of the hydrogen economy. There are two quick things: One, we agreed a lot in the hydrogen space to begin to actually pilot with hydrogen fuel cells at 1 Military Hospital. We have also deployed fuel cells in iLembe district to power some of the rural parts of that district. Also, in the area of training, we do indeed recognise that the racial and gender balance in terms of the hydrogen economy is ... [Inaudible.]

We have a skills plan, I passed the two digit by the way - of Higher Education, Science and Innovation to come up with the skills plan to actually support the hydrogen economy. We are also having a skills masterplan, some or parts of the skills masterplan is to ask how do we develop more skills in areas where there is a shortage. By the way, hon Boshoff, when we say we need to affirm blacks and women, it’s because you can’t build a non-racial society without affirming black people, even our ... [Inaudible.] You can’t build a non-sexist society without affirming women. But to do so ... [Inaudible.]. That is what is very important to do. You can’t have a nonracial society if you still exclude the majority. It does not mean that we do not appreciate those white compatriots who have

committed themselves to actually do good for South Africa. That is very important, that is why we are saying that on our part.

We also want to emphasise that ... Let me welcome what the hon Sibiya was saying. The importance of science in ... [Inaudible.] ... that is precisely what our message was this time, and especially if you also focus on ... [Inaudible.] Also, the hon Pillay has emphasised the important point that has made a sore point for me. You know when I tell some of the journalist ... [Inaudible.] ... they measure... [Inaudible.] Most of those media houses measure my work but they do not have one science journalist amongst them – none whatsoever. In fact, in South Africa, we are short of science journalism and it’s a very serious matter. It’s a pity that the public broadcaster is not doing enough, though we are working with them now to do that so that we are able to create science where it actually belongs.

*IsiZulu:*

Izinto abazithandayo ezoBester yibo abagijima nazo. Ngeke ubezwe begijima nezinto eziyinqubekela phambili ukuthi senzani la kuloMnyango wezoBuchwepheshe.

*English:*

So, that point that we are making is a very important point. We also want to say this to the hon King. Hon King, don’t come and prescribe to us what we should do with NASFAS. Come and engage us. And I also want to say to the hon Boshoff you have raised this matter by the way – about the Square Kilometre Array, SKA, and whether it’s making the mind of a contribution. I am now requesting my chief of staff to please help me and appoint ... [Inaudible.] When we sit down I would like to engage so that we actually debate these things. And I am also able to point out what we are doing and indeed you will feel free to point out where you think we are doing okay and we could be doing better. By the way this is an offer to all other members and to all other political parties.

*IsiZulu:*

Kodwa ke Sihlalo uma sengiqeda i-EFF ...

*English:*

... I thought they started better today. They were debating and talking about science was forcing them to debate. Even if we are disagreeing.

*IsiZulu:*

Hawu kodwa uma senigcina ngalento eniyenzayo njalo zingane zakwethu. Yazi ukube angikho nje ePhalamende ngabe ngithi anive niphoxa kodwa. Siqale kahle mam’uKhawula senigcina nenza le nto eniyenzayo zonke izinsuku ukuthi ...

*English:*

... you have to throw your toys out of the court ...

*IsiZulu:*

... noma ngabe sesikhuluma ngezinto ezibalulekile kanjani. Yizinto zabantu lezi. Abantu abafuni ukuzonibona ngezingubo ezibovu ukuthi niyagxuma noma nenze njani. Nibe njalo niqgoke noLouis Vuitton ngaphansi kwalezo zingubo. Siyakwazi lokho.

Siyabonga mphathi wohlelo.

*English:*

Thank you very much.

The CHAIRPERSON (Ms R M M Lesoma): Hon members, order! Hon members are reminded that the debate on Public Enterprise Budget Vote will take place at 16:00 in the Good Hope Chamber

and the debate on Public Works and Infrastructure Budget Vote will take place at 16:15 at M46.

Debate concluded.

The mini plenary rose at 16:02.