**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 8 MARCH 2023**

***PROCEEDINGS OF THE NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVIINCES***

The Council met at 14:23.

The House Chairperson: Committees, Oversight, Co-operative Government and Intergovernmental Relations took the Chair and requested members to observe a moment of silence for prayers or meditation.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon delegates, before we proceed I would like to make the following announcement. The hybrid sitting constitutes the sitting of the National Council of Provinces. Delegates in the hybrid sitting enjoy the same powers and privileges that apply in a sitting of the National Council of Provinces.

For purposes of the quorum all delegates who have logged on to the virtual platform shall be considered present. Delegates must switch on their videos if they want to speak. Delegates

must ensure that their microphones on their gadgets are muted and must always remain muted unless they want to speak.

All delegates in the Chamber must connect to the virtual platform as well as insert their cards to register on the Chamber system. Delegates who are physically in the Chamber must use the floor microphone and should switch on their microphones on when they need to address the Chairperson. All delegates may participate in the discussion through the chat room.

The interpretation facility is active. Permanent delegates, members of the executive, special delegates and the SA Local Government Association, Salga, representatives on the virtual platform are requested to ensure that the interpretation facility on their gadgets are properly activated to facilitate access to the interpretation services. Permanent delegates and members of the executive in the Chamber should use the interpretation gadgets on their desks to access interpretation facilities.

# NEW MEMBER

(Announcements)

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon delegates, ladies and gentlemen, before we proceed I would like to take this opportunity to announce that a vacancy which occurred in the Council owing to the resignation of hon Arnold has been filled by the appointment of the hon Mr J Magwala from the Western Cape. Hon Magwala from the Western Cape, you are welcome. Give him a round of applause.

I would also like to take this opportunity to extend our gratitude to the hon Arnold for the fruitful contribution he has made to the business of the Council during his tenure. We wish him well in his future endeavours. Hon Makwala, as I have indicated, you are welcome.

# NOTICES OF MOTION

Ms N NDONGENI: Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the Council I shall move on behalf of the ANC:

That the Council debates measures aimed at curtailing the spread of cholera before it becomes a pandemic in South Africa.

Mr D R RYDER: Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the Council I shall move on behalf of the DA:

That the Council debates the rising cost of the national debt at the post\_COVID-19 economy amidst the impacts of grey list by the Financial Action Task Force.

Mr E M MTHETHWA: Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the Council I shall move on behalf of the ANC:

That the Council debates the strengthening of initiatives geared at ending the killings of traditional leaders and izinduna threatening the stability of that institution which plays a critical role in stability and order of the society.

*Xitsonga*:

Ms B T MATHEVULA: Mutshamaxitulu, laha ndzi rhandza ku lemukisa Huvo leswaku eka ntshamo wa yona lowu landzelaka hi ku yimela vandla ra EFF:

Huvo yi va na njhekanjhekisano hi mayelana na ku tlakuka ka ku tirhisiwa ka swidzidziharisi eswikolweni.

Mr K M MMOIEMANG: Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the Council I shall move on behalf of the ANC:

That the Council debates the tightening of measures yet at stopping unscrupulous illegal loan sharks who are preying on our vulnerable and elderly by keeping their SA Social Security Agency, Sassa, bank cards or identification documents, IDs, without their authorisation using the cards as a guarantee or collateral for clients who had borrowed money from them.

Mr M S MOLETSANE: Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the Council I shall move on behalf of the EFF:

That the Council debates the deteriorating state of our municipalities and the negative impact it has on service delivery.

Mr K MOTSAMAI: Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the Council I shall move on behalf of the EFF:

That the Council debates registration crisis facing the institutions of higher learning where year in and year out poor black students are finally excluded, denied student accommodation and their right to education.

Ms C LABUSCHAGNE: Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the Council I shall move on behalf of the DA:

That the Council debates the rising cost of living for all South Africans and the impact thereof.

# DA CONCERN OVER THE SAPS STAFF SHORTAGES

(Draft Resolution)

Ms C LABUSCHAGNE: On behalf of the DA I hereby move without notice:

That this Council-

1. notes that one of our fundamental rights enshrined in Chapter 2(12) of the Constitution, namely the right to freedom and security of a person is being severely compromised due to the incompetence of the Minister of Police and the ANC government to effectively implement their mandates;
2. also notes that in the Western Cape specifically due to under-resourcing and staff shortages, policing has been brought to its knees;
3. further notes that the SAPS representatives admitted during a briefing at the Western Cape provincial parliament that the number of officers in the Western Cape province is currently below 20 000; and
4. the DA calls on the President and the Minister of Police to devolve the policing powers to the Western Cape to provide the citizens a capable and competent police force that they deserve as it clear that the current situation is either the result of poor management by the Minister of Police or is due to a lack of political will of the ANC as part of the failed

strategy to hold on to power at all costs, even the lives of innocent citizens.

Not agreed to.

# DA IMPLORES GAMAGARA LOCAL MUNICIPALITY TO PUT PLANS IN ACTION TO PROVIDE WATER TO OLIFANTSHOEK RESIDENTS

(Draft Resolution)

Mr W A S AUCAMP: Hon House Chairperson, I hereby move without notice on behalf of the DA:

That the Council-

* 1. notes with concern the failure by the Gamagara Local Municipality in the Northern Cape to deliver basic services such as the provision of water, as contained in Chapter 2 of the Constitution of South Africa to the residents of Olifantshoek;
  2. further notes that residents in Olifantshoek has been without water for prolonged periods of time and that

the reservoirs that provides water to the people of Olifantshoek is not being filled regularly;

* 1. Water tanks that have been placed in Olifantshoek two years ago as a temporary alleviation of the effects of the water crisis, are to date not being filled by the municipality on a regular basis;
  2. Also notes that no schools or clinics in Olifantshoek have got enough water to do basic sanitation;
  3. further notes that the DA has on numerous occasions called on this municipality to fulfil its obligation towards the delivery of water and other basic services to the people of Olifantshoek, but to no avail;
  4. notes that should the Gamagara Local Municipality not remedy the water crisis in Olifantshoek as matter of utmost urgency, it will not only be the quality of life of the residents of Olifantshoek that are being jeopardised, it will also be the lives of its residents that will be in jeopardy; and
  5. this House calls on the Gamagara Local Municipality to immediately put plans in action in order to provide water to Olifantshoek and its residents on a permanent basis.

Not agreed to.

# EFF SENDS HEARTFELT CONDOLENCES TO THE FAMILY OF THE SLAIN

(Draft Resolution)

Ms S A LUTHULI: Chairperson, I hereby move without notice on behalf of the EFF:

That the Council-

1. notes ...

*IsiZulu:*

... ukuthi ngomhlaka-25 Februwari 2023 umama nezingane zakhe ezintathu batholakale befile ekhaya KwaNtombazane eMkhondo eMpumalanga beklajwe ngembazo.

*English:*

1. further notes ...

*IsiZulu:*

... umama ube neminyaka engu-47, abafana bakhe ababili abangamawele bebeneminyaka engu-11, kuthi indodakazi yakhe ibineminyaka engu-6;

*English:*

1. acknowledges that South Africa is indeed a crime scene and ...

*IsiZulu:*

... futhi abantu besifazane baphila ngokusaba nokuthuka kanye nabantwana;

*English:*

1. further acknowledges that violent acts are committed against women and children on a regular basis and that gender-based violence remains one of the most pressing issues ...

*IsiZulu:*

... kuleli lizwe la kuthinteka khona ikakhulukazi abantu besifazane nabantwana;

*English:*

1. the EFF sends our heartfelt condolences to this family and may their souls rest in peace.

Motion agreed to in accordance with section 65 of the Constitution.

# HEARTFELT CONDOLENCES SENT TO THE FAMILY OF SUV OCCUPANT SHOT DEAD

(Draft Resolution)

Ms B M BARTLETT: I hereby move without notice on behalf of the ANC:

That the Council-

1. notes with concern that a woman riddled with bullets tried to drive herself and her passenger to safety after they came under fire on Monday, in Durban;
2. also notes that the two occupants of an SUV were shot at between Mansfield and Berea Road on Monday;
3. further notes that the driver of the vehicle was able to drive the vehicle to a nearby service station where they were assisted by emergency services, who declared the passenger dead and rushed the driver to hospital;
4. therefore passes our heartfelt condolences to the family of the deceased and wish the injured driver a speedy recovery; and
5. also calls on the police to leave no stone unturned in their pursuit of the perpetrators.

Motion agreed to in accordance with section 65 of the Constitution.

# SPEEDY RECOVERY WISHES TO PEOPLE INJURED ON THE M41 IN UMHLANGA

(Draft Resolution)

Ms L C BEEBEE: I hereby move without notice on behalf of the ANC:

That the Council-

1. notes with concern that a truck slammed into 46 vehicles on the M41 near Umhlanga on Monday, 6 March;
2. also notes that at least 16 people, including a pregnant woman who had to be airlifted from the scene, had been caught up in the carnage;
3. further note that the Durban North police are investigating a case of reckless and negligent driving against a 23-year-old suspect who handed himself over to the police; and
4. we therefore wish all those injured a speedy recovery and call for a speedy investigation and finalisation of the case.

Motion agreed to in accordance with section 65 of the Constitution.

# SA REVENUE SERVICE COMMENDED FOR SEIZURE OF 300KG PURE COCAINE WORTH R1,3 BILLION AT DURBAN HARBOUR

(Draft Resolution)

Ms S SHAIKH: Chairperson, I rise on behalf of the ANC:

That the Council-

1. commends the SA Revenue Service, Sars, and other security organs for the seizure of 300kg of pure cocaine estimated to be worth R1,3 billion from a container ship at the Durban harbour on Friday, 24 February 2023;
2. notes that the 300kg of cocaine and what appeared to be cellular tracking devices, was found in one of the containers aboard the ship, after a week-long intelligence operation led by the SA Revenue Service’s National Targeting Unit;
3. also believes that the proliferation of drugs in South Africa pose a serious threat and are the cause of the violent crimes that wreak havoc in our communities;
4. further commends Sars for not tolerating the illegal activities but continue to fulfil its mandate of facilitating legal trade to further economic development of our country, and
5. calls upon all South Africans to work together with government to fight the scourge of drugs and drug trafficking.

Motion agreed to in accordance with section 65 of the Constitution.

# DIRECTORATE PRIORITY CRIME INVESTIGATION APPLAUDED FOR SEIZURE OF R30 MILLION WORTH OF ILLICIT CIGARETTES ON A FARM IN LIMPOPO

(Draft Resolution)

Mr M E NCHABELENG: House Chair, I hereby move without notice on behalf of the ANC:

That the Council-

1. notes that the Directorate for Priority Crime Investigation team seized R30 million worth of suspected illicit cigarettes on a farm between Musina and Beitbridge port of entry in Limpopo, on Saturday,

25 February 2023;

1. also notes that a multi-disciplinary sting operation seized the contraband after receiving a tip-off about illicit cigarettes that were kept at a farm waiting to be transported to different destinations in the country;
2. recalls that five suspects, aged between 26 and 44, were arrested for contravening the Customs and Excise Act;
3. applauds the Directorate Priority Crime Investigation in Limpopo for their resolve and determination and efforts to combat the smuggling of illicit cigarettes in the country by paralysing the syndicate operations; and
4. also applauds the members of the public for working with law enforcement agencies by reporting crime.

Motion agreed to in accordance with section 65 of the Constitution.

# PROPER RESOURCING OF DISASTER MANAGEMENT STRUCTURE ENCOURAGED DURING FLOODING

(Draft Resolution)

Mr D R RYDER: House Chair, I hereby move without notice on behalf of the DA:

That the Council-

1. notes the recent heavy rainfall across South Africa and the devastating impact of flooding in various places, affecting South Africans from all walks of life;
2. further notes the impact of a lack of government planning across the spheres and how this has exacerbated the impacts of the floods;
3. also notes the poor response from disaster management structure which are a district municipality competency; and
4. this House therefore use our close involvement with provincial and local governments to encourage regular maintenance of stormwater systems, prevention of littering and illegal dumping, maintenance of watercourses, proper resourcing of disaster management

and strong inter-governmental co-ordination of such efforts.

Motion agreed to in accordance with section 65 of the Constitution.

# CONGRATULATIONS TO EXCEPTIONAL PERFORMANCE BY THE PROTEA WOMEN’S CRICKET TEAM IN T20 WORLD CUP

(Draft Resolution)

Mr M R BARA: House Chair, I hereby move on behalf of the DA:

That the Council-

1. notes the exceptional performance of the Protea Women’s cricket team in the recent T20 World Cup;
2. commends the exceptional passion and fortitude with which our team approached the tournament;
3. while acknowledging the overall achievements, share the disappointment of the team at the final result, noting the brilliance of our opponents on the day; and
4. moves that we send our congratulations to the team emphasising our gratitude for their nation building efforts at a time when it is needed.

Motion agreed to in accordance with section 65 of the Constitution.

# MOTION OF CONDOLENCCE

(The Late Mr Tate Makgoe)

Ms M L MOSHODI: Hon Chairperson, I hereby move without notice on behalf of the African National Congress:

That the Council–

1. notes with great shock the tragic death of Free State Education MEC, Tate Makgoe, and his bodyguard, Warrant Officer Vuyo Mdi, in a car crash on the N1, outside Winburg, on Sunday,05 March 2023;
2. recalls that MEC, Makgoe was sworn in as a member of the Free State Provincial Legislature in May 1994,

where he served as the MEC for Education since May 2009;

1. acknowledging that as MEC he has successfully led Free State’s basic education sector, and enabling it to achieve South Africa’s best matriculants results for four consecutive years;
2. believes that his immense contribution and success in the education in the Free State province is attributed mainly to his leadership, dedication, understanding of the sector and the innovation which has yielded great results;
3. convey deepest condolences to the family, friends and colleagues of Comrade Makgoe and his protector, and wish the surviving driver a speedy and full recovery.

Agreed to.

# CABLE THEFT DURING LOADSHEDDING A MAJOR CONCERN IN THABA CHWEU LOCAL MUNICIPALITY

(Draft Resolution)

Ms H S BOSHOFF: Hon House Chair, I hereby move without notice on behalf of the DA:

That the Council–

1. notes that the DA in Thaba Chweu Local Municipality is concerned about the increase in cable theft and the municipality’s ageing infrastructure that keeps on prolonging load shedding;
2. also notes that even though load shedding is a national crisis, this municipality should not only blame Eskom, but should take action to combat cable theft;
3. understands that the continuous awareness campaigns on social media platforms does little to nothing to stop these criminals from committing this crime;
4. recognise that Thaba Chweu Local Municipality’s lack of action and lack of concern regarding this issue most definitely poses an unprecedented threat to the towns economic development which will only lead to

more jobs being lost, as businesses will be forced to close down;

1. realises that Thaba Chweu Local Municipality cannot expect businesses and households to carry the burden of these additional power cuts because they have not come up with long-term solutions;
2. acknowledge that Thaba Chweu Local Municipality leadership needs to step up and review their ageing infrastructure to allow for the implementation of changes in order of priority; and
3. appeals on the Executive Mayor, Friddah Nkadimeng to come out of hiding and not follow in the steps of her President and oversee the sustainable provision of decent services to the communities of Thaba Chweu. The DA will continue holding this municipality to account.

Not agreed to.

# LACK OF WATER SUPPLY AFFECTS MAQUASSI HILLS MUNICIPAL AREAS

(Draft Resolution)

Mr S F DU TOIT: Hon Chairperson, I hereby move without notice on behalf of the FFPlus:

That the Council –

1. notes that the Maquassi Hills municipal areas that include Leeudoringstad, Makwassie and Wolmaransstad have been struggling with water supply issues for months;
2. also notes that certain areas have been without water for up to 12 continuous days and that constant load- shedding is contributing to the problem;
3. understands that this House has been informed of the water supply issues in this municipal area on a previous occasion; and
4. urgent intervention is required.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J NYAMBI): I have been very generous. I have accommodated as many as I possibly can.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE NCOP: Thank you very, House Chair. I move that the motion in the Order Paper which seeks to establish an Ad Hoc Joint Committee on Flood Disaster Relief and Recovery of the two Houses, to deal with the matter of the devastating floods that has extended to deal with seven of out of nine provinces at the current moment. That the Committee be established as it is proposed in the Order Paper.

Voting:

[TAKE IN FROM MINUTES]

Report accordingly adopted in accordance with section 65 of the Constitution.

# CONSIDERATION OF REPORT OF SELECT COMMITTEE ON FINANCE — 2023 FISCAL FRAMEWORK AND REVENUE PROPOSALS

Mr Z MKIVA: Good afternoon, House Chair. Allow me to acknowledge the Chairperson of the NCOP, the Deputy Chairperson as well as the Chief Whip of the NCOP. I extend my greetings to the members of this august House. Allow me as well, House Chair, to add my voice on the untimely departure of one of our colleagues. We are really taken aback, but we

want to say to the family that our condolences are in order and we are with them during this tough time in their lives.

House Chair, I have been mandated by the Select Committee on Finance under the stewardship of the veteran parliamentarian who is a member of our own ANC, the hon Carrim Yunus, to table this report of the select committee on the 2023 Fiscal Framework and Revenue Proposals dated 7 March 2023.

Allow me, House Chairperson, to say that this is a 39 page dossier and we have shared it with the members in advance so that they have a full appreciation of what is entailed in this document. This document is a well detailed document that talks to all the matters that affect us in so far as the finances of the country are concerned. Most importantly, at the bottom of this document we have put together very and progressive proposals for the consideration of the NCOP.

As you all know the Minister of Finance on 22 February, in terms of section 27 of the Public Finance Management Act 1 of 1999 as well as section 7 of the Money Bills Amendment Procedure and Related Matters Act of 2009, tabled the national Budget. The Minister, the Deputy Minister and senior officials

from the National Treasury briefed the committees on finance on 23 and 28 February 2023.

The committees received post budget tabling input from the Parliamentary Budget Office, PBO, and the Financial and Fiscal Commission on 28 February 2023. Most importantly, the committees held public hearings on 1 March 2023 and received

15 written and oral submissions from a number of organisations including Congress of South African Trade Unions, COSATU, Fiscal Cliff Study Group, FCSG, South African Institute of Chartered Accountants, SAICA, the South African Institute of Tax Professionals, PricewaterhouseCoopers, the Healthy Living Alliance, the Institute of Economic Justice, Amndla.mobi as well as many other institutions, including institutions of higher learning like the University of Johannesburg, University of Cape Town and other associations.

The reason why I am foregrounding and mentioning these organisations is because we had a very good and a robust engagement with these organisations amongst others. There were also organisations that come from the margins of society which were then allowed to engage with the committee. The spirit of those engagements were very constructive. If there were few people who were destructive I would say those ones were quite

minor issues and their contribution as well. Noted destructive as it may be but it helps us to sharpen our thinking and thoughts so that as we come up with proposals we come up with something that is all encompassing.

The National Treasury gave us an overview of the Budget, and as you know the Minister’s briefing with the committees of finance provided this overview on the basis of giving us an indication that our economy at some point is going to be slow because it is informed by what is also happening in the economic activity of the globe, but the gross domestic product, GDP, growth is now projected at an average of 1,4% for this current financial year as opposed to last year where the projection was 1,6%. Between now 2023 to 2025 we are looking at a 1,4% kind of growth which we are projecting as informed by the National Treasury.

The National Treasury says that there is no other way to look at enhancing the growth of our economy other than looking at the instrument which we have already established in order to stabilise our macroeconomic policy framework, and this is based on the policy implementation of reforms through Operation Vulindlela as well as the Economic Reconstruction and Recovery Plan.

*IsiXhosa:*

Siyafuna ukutsho kubantu bakuthi ukuba inkqubo esele ithathiwe liSebe lezeMali yokuvuselela ulwakhiwo loqoqosho lwelizwe lakowethu ihamba kakuhle ukuza kuthi ga ngalo mzuzu. Imicimbi echotshelwe liSebe lezeMali iquka umngeni wokuwa kombane.

Sithi urhulumente ekhokelwa yi-ANC uyawuqwalasela lo mcimbi kwaye utshotsha entla ekuqinisekiseni ukuba uyayitshintsha le nyewe ukuze izibane zihlale zikhanya kumakhaya ethu.

Siyafuna ukutsho kwakhona ukuba iSebe lezeMali liza kuthi gqolo, rhoqo, qho linika inkxaso kwiSebe lezoThutho ukuqinisekisa ukuba uhlahlo-lwabiwo mali luyangenelela.

Siyaqinisekisa, ngamxhelo mnye, ukuba siyaqubisana nobuhange bobugebenga bokurhwaphiliza iimali zabantu kweli lizwe.

*English:*

The National Treasury explained that the government’s medium term fiscal strategy aims to achieve fiscal stability by narrowing the budget deficit and stabilising debt and supporting economic growth.

*IsiXhosa:*

Ngaphandle kokuthingaza, kumele siqinisekise ukuzinzisa ubume bezezimali elizweni lethu ukuze sakhe ikamva eliza kuba

luqilima lokususa abantu bethu endlaleni. Siqinisekisa kwakhona nokuba sivelisa amathuba emisebenzi elizweni lethu ukuze sivale lo msantsa ukhoyo phakathi kwabantu abazizityebi nabantu abangamahlwempu. Loo nto, iya kwenza ukuba ulusu lwelizwe lethu lukhangeleke ilulusu lwelizwe labantu abalinganayo.

*English:*

The National Treasury attributed higher than expected revenue to positive growth in most major tax base despite intensified load shedding and weaker global economic conditions. As a result, the gross tax revenue estimate for 2023 is projected to be R93,7 billion higher than projected in 2022 budget.

Partly supported by the improved tax compliance and tax administration, the medium term revenue estimates are also expected to be marginally better than projected previously.

*IsiXhosa:*

Kuyacaca, Sihlalo, njengoko senditshilo ukuba umsebenzi esiwenzayo uyawuvelisa umahluko ebantwini bakowethu, neSebe lezeMali liyasixelela ukuba siphakamise kakuhle ukususela kunyaka ophelileyo ukuza kuthi ga ngalo mzuzu.

*English:*

The South African economy is expected to decelerate from 4,9% in 2021 to 2,5% in 2022. National Treasury expects the GDP growth at an average of that 1,4% for the next three years as I have already indicated.

House Chairperson, allow me to now go straight and focus into the recommendations and observations which we have made, but I must hasten to say that out of those deliberations as well as the contributions that we have received from people at grassroots level, including their institutions, this has not only enriched our proposals as well as our observations, but it has helped us to come up with robust proposals that are going to make even more improvements going forward.

Here are some of the summaries which have been made: For instance, the PBO commented on the economic impact of the 2023 budget as follows: The National Treasury projection of GDP growth over the medium term illustrate how fiscal consolidation hinders GDP growth and that projected government consumption expenditure, which is expected to decline by an average of 0,6% annually over the medium term, will make a negative contribution to the GDP growth predicted. The PBO’s view is that the focus depends on the recovery in investment and that the National Treasury investment projections have

consistently been too high and again seem unjustifiable in the 2023 budget.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Mkiva, try to round up. I am affording you a minute to round up.

Mr Z MKIVA: House Chairperson, given the fact that this presentation for this report has been shared with all the members, allow me on behalf of the ANC to ask this august House to consider this report and adopt it as per the list of those recommendations and the observations we have made. The ANC has confidence in both its policy trajectory and also on the proposals that are coming from the grassroots. I wish to ask this House therefore to accept this report and consider that those proposals form part and parcel of the way forward as we chart the recovery of our economy. Thank you very much, House Chairperson.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Labuschagne, you are recognised.

Ms C LABUSCHAGNE: House Chair, I rise on a point of order. A chairperson of any committee has 10 minutes to speak. They should read the report. It is not a privilege for the

chairperson to do a declaration on how the House should vote. I really don’t want this to become a precedent in this House. It is not part if the report of the committee.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Thank you. Order, members. You are raising a valid point. It is an issue that we have to seriously consider moving forward. Hon delegates, I put the question that the report be adopted.

*Declaration of Votes:*

Ms C LABUSCHAGNE: House Chair, fiscal policy is underpinned by the identification of risks and responses to mitigate these risk. There are five dominating risks starring South Africa in the face. Firstly, is our obvious electricity generation deficiency, a situation brought about by the ANC policy dating back to decisions made back by the then President Mbeki and exacerbated by the cadre deployment policy that has eroded the organization.

Secondly, is the national debt, paying off the plundering of the state by the ANC not only under Jacob Zuma, but before his tenure and is still continuing today. Our debt repayments are crowding out spending on government services. We are paying off the drunk uncle’s credit card, and are not able to put

food on the table or pay children school fees as a result. Our debt position is now made worse by the Eskom debt swap, and the conditions of the swap are woefully inadequate to ensure positive outcome for South Africa.

Thirdly, and dominating risk, is the greylisting by the Financial Action Task Force, FATF, which will impact our exchange rate, reduce availability of capital, and increase the cost of doing business. This is not unrelated to the first risk. The spiral to greylisting began years ago with the abolishment of the Scorpions, the lack of co-ordination amongst the Financial Intelligence Centre, FIC, other responsible bodies, and the erosion of our prosecuting capabilities, all of which result in the ANC covering the tracks of those involved in state capture.

Fourthly, and big risk, is the obvious partisan position that the ANC government is taking in Russia’s war against Ukraine whilst fiercely denying our stance. We are trying our hardest to return to our position as the skunks of the worlds.

Lastly, and big risk, is the public wage bill. Cadre deployment being what is it, the comrades need to be kept happy in the run up to the elections.

The summary is that South Africa currently faces financial and economic ruin with the ANC government consistently taking bad decisions. The ANC policies are responsible for bringing us to our knees. This report kowtowing to the executive fiscal policy, and re-entrenching failed policies is not a solution to South Africa’s problems. Our only hope, is the DA-led government with our economic justice policy underpinning our fiscal framework.

*IsiZulu:*

Woza 2024!

Mr Y I CARRIM: House Chairperson, the only thing the member forgot to mention is that the ANC is responsible for the intense heat in my province, KwaZulu-Natal, and it is responsible for the rain that is taking place today. [Laughter.] For the rest, if a grandchild is going to have a birthday party on Saturday, and it rains, guess who is going to be blamed, House Chair? The ANC. Now – somebody says Jan van Riebeeck. I think they ... [Inaudible.] ... before using that name than the ANC – We are not as powerful as she makes out and that we are also powerful that we can do all the things she said. And quite frankly, the question is: Has she read the report? All the things she said are covered there. We

have committed ourselves as a parliamentary committee to attend to them.

Let’s start with the electricity crisis, we have said, in fact, the ANC leadership has said, and as the committees of Parliament, we have said we are mainly responsible for the crisis. We haven’t run away from it. We have to deal with, and only we can deal with it as we are the majority party. We can work with other parties. Apart from privatisation, what answer has she got? We have said we need public-private partnerships. We need a variety of private sector participation forms. It doesn’t have to be privatisation, House Chair. Water and electricity are as necessary as air. We cannot hand over fundamental rights that are in our social economic rights in our Constitution to the private sector. Yes, we can work with them, but they are not going to take over, House Chairperson. That would be undermining the liberation struggle that many people fought for over decades, and many people sacrificed for, not to hand it over to the private sector. Yes, the private sector is most welcome to participate.

She talks about greylisting, true, we brought this upon ourselves. We brought it down though, in a mere six months, from 67 objections the FATF have had to eight. We still have

to go further. Some of the issues you raise are right, they don’t belong to our committee. They deal with the justice in KwaZulu-Natal ... [Inaudible.] ... they deal with the police, in case of a Select Committee on Police, and we need to work with them. In fact, we said Treasury should come with an overall report that we want to interrogate. We won’t suggest a meeting as generic as many committees. You are the power that be in this Parliament, you have a programme to deal with some of these issues, and you should encourage us to work together.

On the issue of debt, it’s there literally, hon member, calm down, but there also by looking at the report. The report is clear. It breaks down the budget deficit. Not enough, it does so without necessary ... that’s what the committees must preoccupy themselves with. But just our committee, Human Settlements, Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs, and so on. Let’s have the budget deficit but not at the expense of the poor and the disadvantaged.

Then, we ask her, listen, we understand you are talking about

... yes ... [Inaudible.] ... over three years. What do you want? We are doing exactly that, but we are not sacrificing the poor and the disadvantaged. No.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Thank you. Order. We shall now proceed to voting.

Mr Y I CARRIM: On a point of order, House Chair. Is it parliamentary for somebody to take a position on a report that she hasn’t read? I think you know who I am referring to. Is it parliamentary?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): [Laughter.]

Ms C LABUSCHAGNE: On a point of order, House Chair.

An HON MEMBER: House Chair, we should not be upfront with Mr Mkiva’s lack of reading the paper.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Labuschagne.

Ms C LABUSCHAGNE: Through you, House Chair, I want to remind the House Chairperson to read the Rules of the NCOP, then you’ll see that reports are voted on by provinces. So, as ... [Inaudible.] ... Rules, you’ll get something different.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): It is not ... provinces have done declarations. We are done. We are doing it in alphabetical order.

Debate concluded.

Declarations of vote made on behalf of the Western Cape, KwaZulu-Natal.

Question put: That the Report be adopted.

Voting:

[TAKE IN FROM MINUTES]

Report accordingly adopted in accordance with section 65 of the Constitution.

# ORATION OF CONDOLENCES ON THE PASSING OF HON MS MAURENCIA NA- TALIE GILLION

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon members, greeting to everybody.

*Sesotho*:

Dumelang.

*Afrikaans:*

Goeie middag.

*English*:

House Chairperson of the Committees and Oversight, hon Jomo Nyambi, the Gillion family, as well as the extended family, leaders of faith-based organisations, the NCOP Chief Whip, hon Seiso Mohai, eminent and special delegates, representatives of the South African Local Government Association, Salga, ladies and gentlemen, programme director, it is with a sad and heavy heart that I deliver a message on this occasion of the oration of condolences on the passing of hon Maurencia Natalie Gillion, a member of this House, who passed on last week

The unexpected and sudden nature of her death in the course of her work traumatised many of us, who were in her company when she took her last breath. It is a moment that will be difficult to forget. Her death left us in a state of grieve, inexplicable shock and anguish, as we continue to reflect after she has passed on.

We realised that nothing could prepare us for what happened, as she succumbed to death, while we were hoping that she would respond positively to the attempts to resuscitate her.

Hon Gillion’s role in the NCOP, as well as that of the two Houses of Parliament, the NCOP has a constitutional responsibility to represent the interest of the provinces. It also provides for the representation of the different categories of municipalities in Parliament and plays an important role in overseeing co-operation among the different spheres of government, namely national, provincial and local government.

The late hon Gillion was deployed by a political organisation, the ANC, to represent the people of the province of the Western Cape in this House. She had the responsibility to serve in this organ of the people’s power, to assist with the critical role of the transformation of our society – a responsibility that was close to her heart.

Since her appointment to the NCOP in 2019, she has served amongst other roles as the Chairperson of Select Committee on Health and Social Services. The committee deals with some of the key functional areas of concurrent national and provincial

legislative competence. These are areas which are at the heart of the country’s transformation agenda.

As part of her duties, she led the committee of the NCOP, which oversees the important service delivery areas, such as health, social development, women and youth development, and persons with disabilities. Given her role, she was central in the building of the new society. She, as an activist, was central at the building of a better life for all and ensuring that we accelerate our march towards a truly reconstructed, transformed, unified and developed South Africa, whose citizens, black and white, equally enjoy better and fulfilling lives.

The mission of building a new society is born out of the realisation that our society was severely impacted on by colonial oppression, racial discrimination and violence, including violence associated with systemic social and economic exclusion.

Therefore, our late colleague was in pursuit of a goal of transforming our society. The nation’s agenda, in this regard, includes prioritising the rights of women, children and people with disabilities, as well as the previously disadvantaged and

to work tirelessly to eradicate discrimination and violence against women and children.

Many would agree that hon Gillion was cut out for this great task and political colleagues from the ANC in the Western Cape have praised her for standing for the poor and the downtrodden.

They have expressed appreciation for her activism for farm dwellers and farmworkers. They have acknowledged her passion for rural development and her contribution to the struggle for women empowerment.

What did hon Gillion stand for? While her passing was a moment of deep shock and frustration, it however reminded us once more of how incredibly fragile life is and that life is too precious to be taken for granted.

Like a brave and true activist, who was rooted in her community in the Overberg region, hon Gillion died with her boots on. Perhaps it is in the manner of her unexpected and shocking death that we must find solace. She died serving the people of South Africa, particularly the previously disadvantaged and the poor.

Those who worked closely with her in the country say that she was always there to pick up the struggle on behalf of the weak. She was always there when perseverance was required. She was always there to speak her mind against injustice. She was always there ready to strike when circumstances demanded it and that she was always there to provide guidance as a leader, a sister, a mother and a comforter to those in pain and grieve.

We will always remember her in the NCOP for always being ready to pull the punches. She did not think twice to set proverbial cat among the pigeons. Although she would not say it, it was clear to some of us that she would not mind a temporary suspension of the Rules, when a debate got heated. However, she accepted the importance of maintaining the decorum of the House. She accepted and understood the importance of upholding the dignity of the House.

The death of hon Gillion robbed us of a great soul, as Maya Angelou wrote, and I quote: “A great soul serves everyone, all the time. A great soul never dies. It brings us together again and again.”

In conclusion, thank you for an opportunity to lead the oration of the condolences on the passing of hon Maurencia Natalie Gillion – a great soul of the NCOP and the people of the Western Cape, indeed, of the people of South Africa. We are all pained by her passing, however in the end, we are comforted by the fact that she passed on with her sleeves rolled up.

We do not pretend to understand the pain that her family is going through at the moment but we wish them all the strength to go through this period of grieve and to find ways of coping with this monumental lost. On behalf of the NCOP, we extend our heartfelt condolences to the members of the Gillion family, the relatives, the friends and indeed, the colleagues.

*Afrikaans*:

Mag jy verstroosting vind.

*English*:

Please, find comfort.

*Afrikaans*: Baie dankie.

Mr M R BARA: Thank you House Chair. Members of the Gillion family, hon Chair, hon members and fellow South Africans, good day. This is one of the most difficult speeches that I have had to participate in since joining parliament in 2016. I have known hon Gillion since I joined the National Council of Provinces in 2019 and have maintained congeniality since then.

It is with great sadness, but also great joy that I am able to address you today. Great sadness at losing a stalwart in the political arena but great joy in knowing that I have served with Hon Gillion in efforts to be the change we want to see for many South Africans, particularly the youth and women of our country.

Hon Gillion was sitting right behind me when she collapsed and her life came to a tragic end. However, this is an opportunity to pay tribute to her for the work she has done for the betterment of people’s lives in South Africa and the Western Cape where she was a delegate.

I served under her leadership in the Select Committee on Health and Social Services since the beginning of the 6th Parliament in 2019. In that select committee, we served and participated as equals, always ready and eager to make our

contributions. At no stage would we find any of us not allowed to make his or her contribution in the deliberations with different departments.

I could hear her agreeing with the presentations and deliberations made by our support staff during the workshop. That’s an indication of her commitment and interest in pursuing the betterment of our service delivery to the people. Something that she displayed until her last day of life and something I hope more members take upon them. She leaves us at a point when we are all attempting to find endeavours and different ways of ensuring that we provide the best services to South Africans.

This is a huge loss to the committee, and the entire struggle for policy making and ensuring implementation, to lose such a dedicated leader. Indeed, death comes like a thief, for I witnessed such incident on the 28th February. Rest well ...

*IsiXhosa:*

... qhawekazi. Ngenene ukufa lutshaba kodwa kuya kubhangiswa nako ngemini yokugqibela.

On behalf of the Democratic Alliance, we send our sincere condolences to the Gillion Family and relatives, and the ANC. Thank you Chairperson

Ms S A LUTHULI: Chairperson, greetings to hon Gillion’s family and friends. Chairperson, on behalf of the EFF, I wish to extend our deepest and heartfelt condolences to hon Gillion’s family, friends and colleagues.

Hon Gillion dedicated her life to our people, in particular the people of the Western Cape province whom she was representing in this House and in so doing, provided us all with an example of what a true servant of the people is. As the chairperson of Select Committee on Health and Social Services, hon Gillion chaired with dignity and commanded the respect of all Members of Parliament and the public.

She was fair and during engagements allowed all parties the space to engage and express different views without being oppressed by the opposition. She was a woman of integrity and was committed to an ethical government.

Today we remember her efforts in the social development of our people in uprooting poverty and removing structural

inequalities in society. We remember the passion she displayed in developing the people of Western Cape and in particular those of Overberg District Municipality where she once served as a mayor.

Chairperson, hon Gillion envisioned a country which looks after all its people especially those living in the rural areas, so much that we must acknowledge that she must have been disappointed by the direction which the party she represents is taking. She must have been hurt by the lack of transformation provided to the poor, vulnerable and those with special needs and by how the poor continued to suffer the efforts of mismanaged economy which is a result of the ruling party’s incompetence which fails the poorest of the poor.

Chairperson, she must have been pained by the promise of a better life for the poor and the vulnerable. The excluded people in our country have not materialised of anything and how there has been no redirection in poverty. She must have been saddened by the tragic state of our education system which year in and year out displays the same failures which absolutely nothing is being done to address these failures, in how the country continues to lack far behind on how the

developing infrastructure for schools as laid in our norms and standards for school infrastructure.

Chairperson, hon Gillion dedicated her life to our people’s freedom. Her determination and efforts to help others brought hope to ordinary South Africans and demonstrated values that we as public representatives treasure and are aspired to.

Our select committee meetings will not be the same without her. She will be dearly missed. As EFF we will keep her memory alive by picking up the spear and continue the war for economic emancipation of our people by prioritising poor people at provincial and local government level. May her soul rest in peace and may her family and friends be comforted.

*IsiXhosa:*

Hamba kakuhle, ulale ngoxolo.

Mr N M HADEBE: Hon Chairperson and the Gillion family, the IFP would like to express its sorrow and sympathy on the unexpected passing of hon Maurencia Natalie Gillion. I am very grateful to have served with her in bettering our country. May we never forget her dynamic persona and dedication to our line

of work as we carry the batten to a more developed and progressive country.

Losing hon Gillion is a blow to the entire House and our democracy. Having served as a mayor in the Overberg District Municipality during the period between 2006 and 2010 then moving to join the Western Cape Provincial Parliament for the period between 2014 and 2019 and then joining the NCOP.

Hon Gillion resembled a committed individual in her political quest to contribute to the country the best way she knew. We implore all members to not let hon Gillion and all other fallen colleagues’ efforts through the House and the country in vain. We need to continue building a House of representatives which is trustworthy, reliable and making a difference in the lives of those we represent on a daily basis.

I would also like to wish everyone who saw the events leading up to hon Gillion’s loss of life well. It may not be easy to experience a beloved colleague losing their life in that way and more so be there to experience it. May you all find a helping hand through living with the trauma.

In closing, we as the IFP would like to extend our heartfelt condolences to her family, friends and all loved ones whom she shared her heart with. May you hold the memories you had with her close and we wish you all the strength in healing. Thank you hon Chairperson.

Mr S F DU TOIT: Hon Chair and the Gillion family, the passing of the late hon Gillion was indeed an unexpected shock to all. Our heartfelt condolences to her family, friends and colleagues.

Serving on the Select Committee of Health and Social Services, she always debated in favour of the community she represented and served; advocating for better services to the young and vulnerable.

Health and social services are two very important portfolios that form, among others, the foundation of a community. South Africa, currently, has tremendous challenges as a result of service delivery issues in the health sector. And the past week the health sector was brought to a standstill as a result of union protest action that is taking place to the detriment of the country and its people.

Now, this is happening, Chair, in the shadow of the recent health provision challenges that occurred during the covid state of disaster period.

The hon member advocated strongly against gender-based violence and femicide, GBVF, and debated with vigour, with every opportunity presented. Crime is rife in South Africa.

The fact that unemployment, joblessness and hunger and stunting is on the increase, more and more strain is placed on social services in the country. Social services not only need to focus on the physical needs of communities, but more importantly, on the emotional and psychosocial needs that needs to be addressed.

Let’s focus on the objective. No two people will take the same route on the journey of life, even if they need to reach the same destination. The people you touch in a positive way, while you’re on route, give your journey purpose. The milestones you lay while you’re on route, sets the parameters for others to follow. And the challenges you overcome on your way, paves the way to success; and when you reach your goal, your proverbial top of the hill, the fire you light must be a

beacon of hope, honesty and humble success, a statute of achievement. May her soul rest in peace. Thank you, Chair.

Ms D C CHRISTIANS: Hon Chairperson, members of the Gillion family, hon members and fellow South Africans. Today we gather in a deep state of sorrow and mourning on the passing of Maurencia Natalie Gillion, a respected member of our community and a devoted public servant; she was also a beloved friend to many. Her untimely death has left us all in a state of grief and shock.

Hon Gillion was a well-known figure in the ANC Western Cape, particularly in rural parts of the province; and during the select committee meetings you would often here her speak on behalf of those communities.

She served in the Select Committee on Health and Social Services where she made a significant impact on the lives of many South Africans.

Hon Gillion’s contributions to her community extended far beyond her political career. As we remember her life and legacy we must take comfort in the knowledge that hon Gillion made a profound difference in the lives of those she touched,

especially her family, friends and also in her community. Her contributions to the ANC, to the Western Cape Provincial Parliament and to the National Council of Province will be remembered with great fondness and admiration.

Hon Gillion was a diligent member and Chairperson of the Select Committee on Health and Social Services. She was committed to ensuring that government departments were held accountable for addressing the challenges faced by communities.

She consistently demonstrated her dedication to this cause by posing tough questions to Ministers and departments during committee meetings, as well as insisting on receiving satisfactory responses. Her efforts were aimed at ensuring that the needs and concerns of South Africans were addressed effectively and her contributions, in this regard, will be remembered with gratitude.

We extend our deepest condolences to hon Gillion’s family, friends and colleagues in the National Council of Provinces. We cannot begin to imagine the depth of loss, but we hope they can take some comfort in the knowledge that she made a significant impact on the lives of many South Africans during

her time with us. We also extend our heartfelt condolences to the ANC, who have lost a valued member and a true leader.

In closing, we offer our prayers and also our support to those who are grieving hon Gillion’s passing. May her memory be a blessing to all who knew her. Thank you, House Chairperson.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE NCOP: ... [Sound overlapped.] ... of the colleagues and officials, especially those who witnessed her collapse and the ultimate passing on that fateful day, 28 February 2023.

This day will forever remain on the history of the National Council of Provinces in the Sixth Democratic parliament as one of those that are most memorable for many generations of Members of Parliament, MPs, to come, not only because hon Maurencia Gillion was one of our own, but because of diligence, hard work and ability to manage group dynamics that made every voice to be heard. These are among the special and rare qualities of hon Gillion which made a lasting impression to many of her colleagues across party political lines.

Comrade Gillion knew when to facilitate consensus and allow every voice to be heard, and she also knew when to pick up a

fight. All of us would agree she was very fearless; when such moment arrives, she would speak up her views without fail.

Hon Chairperson, I’m sure hon members will agree that one of the attributes we’ll remember her for is high modicum of respect and humility with which she would always express her disagreement, especially with the members, even in engagement with the members of the opposition parties. She understood that we are all South Africans defined by common desire to rid our country of the apartheid colonial legacy of poverty, unemployment and underdevelopment. We are not enemies despite our different ideological and political affiliation.

Her loyalty to her party, the party of choice to the democratic majority to lead a project of transformation in this country, the ANC, was unparalleled. This, she did, not to blind her, as it is usually common temptation to many politicians to elevate the party interest above the interest of the people of South Africa.

We can rightfully argue that this is perhaps what inspired her untiring patience and ability to listen to different views, including those she did not like. This is the Maurencia

Gillion that we know, have worked and lived with till her last breath on that fateful day of her passing.

She has left a big void in the select committee she was chairing, and other committees where she was a member. The only honour we can bestow to her legacy is by emulating her exemplary work ethic and conduct by renewing and reinvigorating our collective efforts to accelerate the realisation of a better life for all; the ideal that she lived and died for.

Hon Chairperson, allow me on behalf of the ANC and, indeed, the people of South Africa to express our gratitude to the family of Comrade Gillion for their generosity of sharing a mother, a sister, an aunt and grandmother with the ANC and the people of South Africa in service of a better future for all.

We, therefore, extend our heartfelt condolences to the family of the late hon Maurencia Gillion, her friends, comrades, provincial leadership of the ANC, which she was serving in this august House.

We will miss you, dear sister and a comrade. We will miss you as a reliable soldier for reconstruction and development. Let your spirit rest in eternal peace.

Long live the fighting spirit of hon Gillion, long live! Thank you, House Chairperson.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon delegates, that concludes the oration of condolences. We will now observe a moment of silence. [Moment of silence observed.] May her soul rest in eternal peace. Thank you.

Once again, on behalf of the leadership of the NCOP as correctly elaborated by Ntate [Mr] Masondo, the Chair of the NCOP, we would like to thank the family for borrowing and allowing us and also joining us in this day when we are celebrating a life well-lived. All of us in one voice are saying: her beautiful soul must rest in eternal peace.

Hon delegates, that concludes the business of the day. The House is adjourned. Thank you.

The Council adjourned at 15:47.