**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 1**

***THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022***

\_\_\_\_

***PROCEEDINGS OF THE NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES***

\_\_\_\_

The Council met at 14:02.

The Chairperson took the Chair and requested members to

observe a moment of silence for prayers or meditation.

**ANNOUNCEMENTS**

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: In keeping with our tradition and

practice, allow me to begin by bowing to my right and bowing

to my left. Hon delegates, before we proceed I would like to

remind you of the following; that the virtual sitting

constitutes a sitting of the National Council of Provinces,

that the place of the sitting is deemed to be Cape Town where

the sitting of the National Council of Provinces is, that

delegates in the virtual platform enjoys the same powers and

privileges that apply in a sitting of the National Council of

Provinces, that for the purpose of a quorum all delegates who

are locked in the virtual platform shall be considered



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 2**

present, that delegates must switch on their videos if they

want to speak, that the delegates should ensure that the

microphones gadgets are muted and must always remain muted,

that the interpretation facility is active and that any

delegate who wishes to speak must use the “raise your hand”

function or icon. Having said that, now hon members, we move

to notices of motion.

**NOTICES OF MOTION**

Ms S SHAIKH: Thank you very much hon Chairperson and greetings

to yourself and hon members. Hon Chairperson, I hereby move on

behalf of the African National Congress that at its next

sitting:

The Council debates the success of the Asset Forfeiture

Unit in the past few years; and that the unit has made

confiscations to the value of R1,7 billion since 2002 in

48 matters referred to it by the Special Investigative

Unit.

Mr E M MTHETHWA: Thank you very much, hon Chairperson. I

hereby move on behalf of the African National Congress that in

its next sitting:



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 3**

The Council debates the numerous complaints about racist

practises in the property sector, including race specific

requests from landlords. The Western Cape seems to be a

hotspot of these racist practises with 15 complaints

already in the past few weeks.

Mr D R RYDER: Thank you very much, hon Chairperson. Before I

start let me say a happy Saint Patrick’s Day to you all the

members here and everyone watching. God bless all ...

[Inaudible.] ... I hereby move on behalf of the Democratic

Alliance that in its next sitting:

The Council debates the impact of inflation increases on

bulk water, bulk electricity supply on consumers and

municipalities and their financial viability.

Ms M N GILLION: Thank you, Chairperson and greetings to

everybody in the House. Chairperson, I hereby give notice on

behalf of the African National Congress that in the next

sitting:

The Council debates the impact of sex scandals and

accusations levelled against former member of executive

council, MEC; Albert Fritz, of the Democratic Alliance



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 4**

and the attempt to cover up by the premier and the effect

of this horrendous crime against vulnerable and poor

young women.

Mr S ZANDAMELA: Thank you, Chairperson. I rise to move on

behalf of the Economic Freedom Fighters that in its next

sitting:

The Council debates the inadequate provision of basic

services in rural municipalities, including the delivery

of water and sanitation of which it has been a clarion

call for our people for decades.

**MOTIONS WITHOUT NOTICE**

**TAXI VIOLENCE AND KILLINGS IN KWAZULU-NATAL**

(Draft Resolution)

Ms S A LUTHULI: Chairperson, I hereby rise on behalf of the

EFF to move without notice:



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 5**

That the Council-

(1) notes the high rise...

*IsiZulu*:

... yohlame nokubulawa embonini yamatekisi oluqhubekalayo

lapha KwaZulu-Natali; (T*ranslation of IsiZulu sentence*

*follows)*:[of taxi violence and shootings which continue

unabated in KwaZulu-Natal.]

(2) yazi ukuthi lezi zibalo zokubulawa kwabantu zandisa

izibalo lapha eNingizimu Afrika ikakhulukazi embonini

yamatekisi njengoba ziziningi izigameko kulesi

sifundazwe ikakhulukazi ezindaweni zasoTongaat eVerulam

okuyiNyakatho yeTheku ukubulawa kwabanikazi bamatekisi

kanye nabashayeli; (*Translations of IsiZulu paragraph*

*follows)*: [further notes that there exists a growing

crisis of contract killings in the country, especially

in the taxi industry, as there have been several

incidents in the province, in the North of Durban in

particular, Tongaat and Verulam, where either a taxi

owner or a driver was gunned down]

*English:*



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 6**

(3) acknowledges that this has generated a series of hitmen

available for hire, and when conflict in the taxi

industry is sparked, it spills over to affect the

safety of commuters, bystanders as well as local

government officials;

(4) further acknowledge that the rights and freedoms which

the Constitution entrenches for all citizens, are

threatened every time a citizen becomes a victim of

such crimes;

*IsiZulu:*

(5) ikubhekisise ukuthi lobu bugebengu buyanda lapha

eNingizimu Afrika njengoba kungajeziswa muntu; futhi

[*Translation of IsiZulu follows*: [recognises that

criminals triumph in South Africa as they go by

unpunished; and]

*English:*

(6) calls on the government to display leadership and put

an end to taxi violence.

Thank you, Chairperson.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 7**

Motion agreed to in accordance with section 65 of the

Constitution.

**CONGRATULATIONS TO JUSTICE RAYMOND ZONDO**

(Draft Resolution)

Ms A D MALEKA: Chairperson, I rise on behalf of the ANC move

without notice:

That the Council-

(1) notes with appreciation the appointment of Justice

Raymond Mnyamezeli Zondo as the Chief Justice of the

Republic of South Africa;

(2) further notes the general respect that Justice Zondo

enjoys among different quarters of South Africans for

his legal expertise; and

(3) congratulates Chief Justice Zondo in his appointment

and wish him well in his new leadership role.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 8**

Motion agreed to in accordance with section 65 of the

Constitution.

**XENOPHOBIA FUELLED BY CERTAIN NATIONAL GROUPS**

(Draft Resolution)

Mr D R RYDER: Chairperson, on behalf of the DA, I hereby move

without notice:

That the Council-

(1) notes the rise of nationalist groups in Gauteng

mobilising xenophobic sentiment;

(2) notes the opportunistic populism of certain emerging

political parties fuelling the xenophobia;

(3) acknowledges the long and co-operative relationship

that South Africa has with our continental neighbours;

(4) embraces the diversity of cultures that make up our

rainbow nation;



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 9**

(5) calls upon the Minister of Home Affairs to move swiftly

to eliminate red-tape, backlogs and corruption within

the department;

(6) further calls on all those living within our borders,

whether born here or not, to co-operate with one

another and pursue a life of harmony; and

(7) condemns the xenophobes and xenophobic organisations

for these senseless attacks.

Motion agreed to in accordance with section 65 of the

Constitution.

**AN INVESTIGATION OF CORRUPTION RELATED CASES IN FREE STATE BY**

**THE NATIONAL PROSECUTING AUTHORITY**

(Draft Resolution)

Mr M DANGOR: Chairperson, allow me to rise on behalf of the

ANC to move without notice:

That the Council-



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 10**

(1) notes the successes of the National Prosecuting

Authority, NPA, in hunting down and prosecuting

corruption related cases in the Free State;

(2) also notes that according to the report by the head of

the NPA in the Free State, Adv Navilla Somaru, there

are currently 8 cases involving the Departments of

Agriculture, Health, Education and Human Settlement

with strong prospects for successful prosecution; and

there are a number of cases already concluded with ten

people found guilty and sentenced;

(3) acknowledges that this demonstrates the successful

efforts of renewal of the criminal justice system; and

(4) congratulates Advocate Somaru and her team for these

successes and wish them well in their further

investigations.

Motion agreed to in accordance with section 65 of the

Constitution.

**CONGRATULATION TO SOUTH AFRICAN WOMEN CRICKET TEAM**



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 11**

(Draft Resolution)

Ms N NDONGENI: Chairperson, I hereby move without notice on

behalf of the ANC:

That the Council-

(1) notes with appreciation the good results achieved by

the South African Women Cricket team in the World Cup

currently being played in New Zealand;

(2) further notes that the South African team has won all

four games they have played so far, improving their

chances to play in the semi-finals; and

(3) congratulates the team for their good results so far

and wish them all the best in their upcoming matches.

Thank you, Chair.

Motion agreed to in accordance with section 65 of the

Constitution.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 12**

**SERVICE DELIVERY CHALLENGES IN SOL PLAATJE MUNICIPALITY**

(Draft Resolution)

Ms D C CHRISTIANS: Chairperson, on behalf of the DA, I hereby

move without notice:

That the Council-

(1) notes that during a Ministerial Briefing Session on

Water and Sanitation on the progress in eradicating

the gaps in the provision of water and sanitation, this

past week, the Minister, Senzo Mchunu indicated that

he was unaware of the infrastructure maintenance woes

of the Sol Plaatje Municipality, but would investigate

the matter promptly;

(2) notes that on 21 April 2021 Premier Zamani Saul

released a press statement on behalf of the provincial

government stating that they are concerned about the

service delivery challenges facing the Sol Plaatje

Municipality, and the resultant discomfort and anger

amongst residents in the city;



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 13**

(3) further notes the Premier indicated that an amount of

R500 million would be allocated as follows, amongst

others:

• R180 million for road maintenance to deal with

potholes;

• R 20 million to address water and sewage leakages;

• and R15 million towards cleaning the city

(4) notes with concern that none of the above has been

resolved;

(5) notes with further frustration that various national

stakeholders have tried to intervene in the city’s

further deterioration. The President has visited the

city indicating his disgust at the deterioration. The

Deputy President visited the city and added his

displeasure, and recently the Public Protector and her

deputy were in the city about the damaged sewer plant

infrastructure;

(6) also notes that the residents of Kimberley have now

taken to social media and are posting pictures of the

massive amount of potholes, fresh water leakages,



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 14**

sewage leakages and general dirt spread in and around

the city;

(7) further notes that during a recent Sol Plaatje Council

meeting the municipality’s CFO indicated that they

never received a cent of the R500 million, he further

indicated that if the Premiers office administered the

funds they should indicate what work and where it was

done in the city;

(8) also notes that a recommendation was made by the

municipality during this meeting to investigate what

happened to the R500 million, as no visible work had

been done in the city. During this meeting it also came

to light that R4,5 million was paid directly to a

supplier

who

was

not

registered

to

do

road

infrastructure work. Additionally, the municipality

owes Eskom R458 million and the water board R2 million;

and

(9) urges that the Premier of the Northern Cape, Zamani

Saul, be called before the Standing Committee on COGTA

with the necessary reports of the expenditure of the

R500 million. That the Premier give a full report on



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 15**

why the money has not been allocated to the

municipality for urgent infrastructure repairs in the

city and that he gives account to the residents of

Kimberley of the R500 million and the rapid further

decline of the city.

Thank you.

Motion not agreed to.

**NERSA APPROVES 9,6% TARIFF INCREASE FOR ELECTRICITY**

(Draft Resolution)

Mr A ARNOLDS: Chairperson, I hereby rise on behalf of the EFF

without notice:

That the Council-

(1) notes the recent decision taken by the National

Energy Regulator of South Africa, Nersa, to grant a

9,61% increase to the cost of electricity;



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 16**

(2) further notes that South Africans have a right to

access to electricity. Electricity has become an

integral part of daily life, is important for the

survival of citizens and has made daily living a

little more efficient;

(3) acknowledges that in the midst of high levels of

unemployment, a dwindling economy and unprecedented

increase to the cost of living, an increase in the

cost of electricity is a cruel addition to the misery

of the poor;

(4) further acknowledges that the hike in the cost of

electricity, is a source of frustration for many

South Africans who also have to navigate through

other price increases, including the cost of food,

water and petrol;

(5) recognises that the increase comes in a context where

the nation is still subjected to rolling blackouts

and insecurity around electricity supply; and

(6) calls on the government to protect the ordinary

citizens of South Africa, for it must not be the



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 17**

responsibility of ordinary people to rescue Eskom

from blatant mismanagement by paying more for a basic

need such as electricity.

Motion agreed to in accordance with section 65 of the

Constitution.

**ANGRY RESIDENTS FED UP WITH CRIME**

(Draft Resolution)

Ms M BARTLETT: Chair, I move without notice:

That the Council-

(1) notes that angry residents fed up with crime took the

law into their own hands when they attacked three

suspected robbers on Monday 14 March 2022;

(2) also notes that one suspect died on the scene and

another on the way to hospital while the third was

receiving medical treatment;



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 18**

(3) further note that the three men were attacked in Social

Distance informal settlement in Mfuleni, Cape Town

after they were found with stolen items; and

(4) calls on the community not to take the law into their

hands but instead work with the police to fight crime

in areas.

Motion agreed to in accordance with section 65 of the

Constitution.

**THE RATE OF INCREASE IN CRIME**

(Draft Resolution)

Ms H S BOSHOFF: Chair, I move without notice:

That the Council-

(1) notes with concern the release of the quarterly crime

statistics in Mpumalanga which shows a highly

concerning incline of rape cases in the province;



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 19**

(2) also notes that three of Mpumalanga’s police stations

are now among the top 30 in the country with the most

cases of rape reported;

(3) further notes that according to the quarterly report,

for October to December 2021, the police stations in

Masoyi, Kabokweni and Pienaar are the rape capitals of

Mpumalanga;

(4) furthermore, notes that at the Masoyi police station,

45 rape cases were reported, at Kabokweni police

station, 45 cases were also recorded and at Pienaar

Police Station, 42 cases of rape were recorded;

(5) recognizes that the report has also placed Kabokweni,

Delmas and Mkhondo amongst the top 30 Police Stations

across the country which saw major increases in

reported cases of rape compared with October to

November 2020;

(6) notes that other serious crimes in Mpumalanga have also

increased; and



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 20**

(7) further notes that under a Democratic Alliance

government, the livelihoods of the citizens would be at

the forefront, and every necessary step would have been

taken to rectify these problems to allow for these

citizens to live in a safe and crime free country.

**DEBATE ON STATE CAPACITY: BUILDING A DEVELOPMENTAL STATE TO**

**TAKE THE LEAD IN BUILDING A BETTER LIFE FOR All**

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL

AFFAIRS: Hon Chairperson of the NCOP, Deputy Chairperson for

the NCOP, MECs here gathered, Chairperson and members of the

select, committee hon members, distinguished guests, thank you

for the opportunity to participate in this debate which seeks

to explore the measures we should undertake in building a

developmental state to take the lead in building a better life

for all.

This is an important debate that will contribute to enhancing

our understanding the role of the developmental state in

securing a better quality of life for all.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 21**

The need for the developmental state is best characterised by

the Reconstruction and Development Programme, RDP, which says

and I quote:

Our history has been a bitter one dominated by

colonialism, racism, apartheid, sexism and repressive

labour policies. The result is that poverty and

degradation exist side by side with modern cities and a

developed mining, industrial and commercial

infrastructure. Our income distribution is racially

distorted and ranks as one of the most unequal in the

world – lavish wealth and abject poverty characterise our

society.

According to the RDP, the South African developmental state

must and I quote:

Integrate growth, development, reconstruction, and

redistribution into a unified programme.

For the RDP, the key to these linkages is



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 22**

An infrastructural programme that will provide access to

modern and effective services as well as the training of

all people.

The South African developmental state, therefore, has the

obligation to meet basic needs whilst opening up previously

suppressed economic and human potential in urban and rural

areas.

In this outlook, the pursuance of basic needs and human

development spurs economic growth and not vice versa.

Therefore, the ANC believes in more state and not less state.

We are believers in the philosophy advanced by Professor Omano

Edigheji which holds that and I quote:

No development state, no development.

Our views are also aligned to the Constitution, which in part

says and I quote:

We, through our freely elected representatives, adopt

this Constitution as the supreme law of the republic so

as to – improve the quality of life of all citizens and

free the potential of each person.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 23**

Our Constitution further recognises that the three spheres are

distinctive, interdependent, and interrelated spheres of

government which need to collaborate, integrate, and co-

ordinate. Sections 152 and 153 assign developmental duties to

the local sphere, which are to provide democratic and

accountable government for local communities, ensure the

provision of services to communities in a sustainable manner,

promote social and economic development Promote a safe and

healthy environment, and encourage the involvement of

communities and community organisations.

Hon Chairperson, additionally, in Chapter 7, the Constitution

calls on the national legislature to provide legislation and I

quote:

For a role for traditional leadership as an institution

on matters affecting local communities.

In advancing all these objectives of the local sphere of

governance section 154 calls on and I quote:

the national government and provincial governments, by

legislative and other measures, to support and strengthen

the capacity of municipalities to manage their own



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 24**

affairs, to exercise their powers and perform their

duties.

However, that we aspire to be a developmental state, does not

mean we are one. We must fulfil four basic conditions and

criteria to become one. First, the developmental state, must

have a long-term vision and a plan by which it mobilises all

of society. As South Korean economist, Dr Ha Joon Chang, says

and I quote:

The Korean economic miracle was the result of a clever

and pragmatic mixture of market incentives and state

direction.

Secondly, the developmental state must be in possession of

sufficient legitimacy and mobilisation capacities to capture

the imagination and inputs of the citizenry. Thirdly, it must

be in possession of the necessary technical capacity and

capability as well as systems to implement its short - and

longer-term objectives. Finally, the state must be trusted,

ethical, and professional.

Chairperson, the National Development Plan, NDP, establishes

an overarching long-term developmental vision to eliminate



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 25**

poverty, reduce inequality and create jobs by the year 2030.

The plan is supported by medium-term objectives, as contained

in the Medium-Term Strategic Framework, MTSF, as approved by

the National Houses of Parliament.

However, in reviewing the NDP, the National Planning

Commission was of the view that the plan does not tackle its

objectives with sufficient rigour and detail. Taking that

into consideration, as well as the conclusions of the 25-year

Review of Democracy Report, which found a lack of horizontal

and vertical integration and co-ordination, government

developed the District Development Model, DDM, to enhance our

way of doing things. The DDM through the District and National

One Plan and Budget complements the Invest Rural Masterplan,

which we reported on in the strategy session of this House. As

we said then, this is an important and transformative

initiative driven by the national and provincial Houses of

Traditional and Khoisan leaders, which will radically change

the face of rural South Africa, if properly implemented.

In implementing the DDM and Invest Rural Strategy, we have

interrogated the endowments of each district and have found

commonalities such as talented people, land, sunshine and at

times unique endowments. We have also found that old practices



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 26**

such as breeding cattle, goats, and sheep, still exist in

rural South Africa. However, we must explore ways to modernise

these practices and make them more profitable and economically

viable for the people. We have also found that some old

practices are also dying, these include the growing food and

vegetables, if we see a loads of land lying farlow which used

to be productive. Again, we must modernise and encourage our

communities to return to the field as this is key to feeding

the nation and continent.

After all, the true measure of a developmental state is the

societal and transformative impact it has. In this regard, and

to address youth unemployment, we have partnered with the

National Youth Development Agency, NYDA, in Mpumalanga as a

pilot to remodel the Community Works Programme, CWP. Thus, far

we have enrolled 27 626 vulnerable and youth participants in

three districts and in 19 sites. These participants engage in

ventures such as agriculture, construction, maintenance,

teacher support, as well as homebased and auxiliary services

in the context of the CWP.

The developmental state cannot succeed outside a skills

revolution. Which is why we want to remodel the CWP, so that

it does give the young people who participate to gain portable



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 27**

skills which will allow them to get jobs or create jobs. The

developmental state cannot succeed outside a skills

revolution. It must therefore address the growing and

concerning 9,1 million young people who are not in education,

employment, and training. By addressing these, we can also

close the national skills gap and requirements of

municipalities. For instance, South Africa has one artisan per

2 000 citizens as opposed to the global norm of one artisan

per 30 citizens. So, we can still far just with artisans.

Therefore, we have deployed 94 professionally registered civil

engineers, electrical engineers, and town planners to the 44

district municipalities.

To complement this and promote youth empowerment whilst

supporting these deployed professionals in all the districts,

we have also enrolled 144 newly qualified and unemployed young

graduates, whom we inducted just two weeks ago. These young

professionals are in the fields of town planning, project

construction management, environmental management, as well as

civil and electrical engineering.

In addition to this, we have recruited 39 young people into

the Municipal Support Agent, MISA, Experiential Learning

Programme. These young people come from the provinces of the



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 28**

Eastern Cape, Free State, Mpumalanga, Northwest, and Western

Cape and will utilise this opportunity to earn technical

qualifications in areas such as plumbing, whilst also

supporting municipalities with operations and maintenance.

Through the MISA Apprenticeship Programme, we have recruited

an additional 89 young people from all the provinces, to give

them on-the-job training so that they too may qualify as

artisans. These graduates, experimental learners participants,

and apprentices are working with municipal officials to plan

and complete projects, so that they too may receive their full

qualifications and professional registrations. Some of the

municipal officials they are working with may have left the

education system long ago and due to work pressures, they

would have not had the time to learn or adapt to new

technologies.

In this regard, we have already trained 519 municipal

technical support staff, in all our municipalities, through

short-term and technical refresher courses. Given our history

as a country that deliberately undereducated and recruited

people as cheap labour, we have provided qualifications to 52

general workers under the Recognition of Prior Knowledge



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 29**

Framework, in the provinces of Kwa-Zulu Natal, Free State,

Limpopo and Northwest.

We are also conscious that we must close the long-term skills

gap in the municipalities as well as in the infrastructure,

built and environmental sectors, so that our nation may meet

its aspirations. In this regard, MISA is currently supporting

15 municipalities with the assessment of their technical

capacity gaps. This will result in finalisation of individual

and institutional capacity development plans.

As part of our contributions to the infrastructure sector, we

have this year, issued an additional 90 bursaries under the

MISA Bursary Scheme. The bursaries have been provided in the

areas of infrastructure management, engineering, town

planning, project management, and environmental management.

These students join the 160 students, we have recruited since

the start of the programme 2-years ago.

Chairperson, we are also acutely aware of the capacity

limitations of municipalities that are not strictly confined

to the technical areas. Thus, the department is currently

undertaking a nation-wide online skills audit for all

municipalities which incorporates the necessary competency



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 30**

frameworks for the different occupational streams for all

municipal staff below the management echelon.

As we have said before, the developmental state must drive a

particular agenda. At a local level we believe that agenda

must capacitate municipalities to play a greater economic

developmental role. This will enable municipalities to attract

the necessary capacities whilst raising sufficient revenues.

We must also deemphasize passive service provision. It must

promote active citizenry and locate the role of municipalities

in the active promotion of efficient local markets and

inclusive growth. For us this is the core subject of the

social compact exercise alluded to by the President in the

state of the nation, sona.

Gradually, we are working towards shifting the attitudes and

culture of those who serve the public, including public office

bearers. To create the will to serve and promote good ethics

in the three spheres. We are collaborating with National

School of Government, in the delivery of ethics training

modules. Already they have inducted the new councils. These

councils will also be subject to the revised and mandatory



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 31**

code of conduct, which insulates the local administration from

political influence.

To complement this, in September we promulgated the Local

Government Municipal Staff Regulations. These set uniform

standards and procedures for municipal staff establishment,

recruitment, selection and appointments, performance

management, and transfers of municipal employees. These

regulations also introduce a Competency Framework which is the

first step in ensuring that we have the right people in the

right jobs. Thus laying the foundations for a more

professional public service in all spheres in the co-operative

governance sector.

Chairperson, our history requires that South Africa develops

its own unique brand of a developmental state. There can be no

doubt of its utility and the societal leadership role it must

assume. It must have the capability and capacity to lead and

mobilise all of society behind a common agenda.

Our experiences at a local sphere tells us that such a compact

must have a local soul. Consequently, the role of the local

sphere is critical in delivering the promise of a better



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 32**

quality life. The local economic development dimensions of

that promise, are also critical.

It is therefore our firm view that our collaboration with this

House will enable us to consolidate our base, as we move

faster, with determination, towards securing a better-quality

life for all. To do this, we will this year undertake an

important and inclusive 21-Year Review of Local Government. It

is our sincere wish that this House will participate and guide

us as we undertake this exercise, for it is only a

developmental local government that can turn our aspirations

of a developmental state into a reality. I thank you for your

attention.

Mr X NQATHA (Eastern Cape): Hon Chairperson of the NCOP, hon

Ministers, Minister Nkosazana Dlamini-Zuma, Deputy Ministers

present, Members of the NCOP, my colleagues, hon MECs from

other provinces, Premiers, hon Members of the Provincial

Legislature, all government and parliamentary officials,

leadership of SA Local Government Association, SALGA, and

distinguished guests, on behalf of the home of the legends, I

wish to convey greetings to everyone on the plenary of the

NCOP.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 33**

It is our singular honour to take pride in this important

debate in building a capable developmental state to take lead

in building a better life for all. Hon Chairperson, this

debate is important in the context of renewing both our

country in the aftermath of the disastrous Coronavirus, like

global economic crisis that broke out in 2008, the end of the

global mineral commodity super cycling in 2011 and the global

shots, the aftermath of COVID-19 pandemic has worsened what

was fore ready a crisis high level of unemployment, poverty,

and the associated crisis of reproduction, where households

are barely able to meet their day to day needs.

Under these conditions, hon Chair, people cannot be

surrendered to the wills of the market. A developmental state

that asserts national interests that intervenes in the

interest of the majority, is a precondition for our country’s

ability to overcome the crisis; a developmental state is

usually associated with high economic growth, and an example

would be Japan, in the 1950s and 80s, South Korea in the 1960s

and 90s, and China since the 1980s, and Brazil since 2000.

All these are examples of developmental state, both of which

grew at phenomenal rates. Today, is perhaps an opportunity to

assess our progress once again about how far we have gone on



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 34**

the journey we undertook to build developmental state in South

Africa. We would like to argue, hon Chair, that for any

progress, it must be always be prime aged and be measured on

the basis of how the lives of the majority are improving. The

key question today is, whether our state has sufficient

capacity to achieve the inspiration of building a

developmental state.

It is perhaps important to start from the beginning and ask

ourselves, how we shall see when we have achieved this noble

goal of building a developmental state. At early stages of

this debate, we upgrade on common features of the

developmental state as a country. Our own organisation’s 52nth

Conference of the ANC, agreed on the features which the

developmental state must have.

The first of those is that, the developmental state must have

necessary intellectual capacity to plan and monitor

socioeconomic transformation, must articulate vision and

engender and analyse the balances of processes for the same

possibilities and option, that is the state that values

education, which is an opposite of what happen during the

state capture period, where there is an erosion of the value

of education. Secondly, the developmental state must have the



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 35**

coherence, planning and capacity to ensure an integrated

strategies and priorities are resourced and implemented.

Thirdly, a developmental state must have administrative and

technical capacity to implement policies and strategies.

Fourthly, it must have the capability of mobilising and

disciplining capital in the national interest, that is

asserting national interest against the whims of the market in

the interest of the majority. The other fifth pillar is that

it must be embedded in the alliance with progressive popular

forces to avoid capture by narrow political elites and

parasitic elements, and avoid drifts towards authoritarianism.

These are the key features of the developmental state that we

agreed to on our 52nd Conference of the ANC. It goes back

therefore that, as we measure how far we have gone, as we

renew our country to deal with the damages of state capture

network, we have got to build on these elements, we have got

have mobilised people to be part of changing their own

condition, we have got to have the ability where the cross

section of the South African population and are mobilised

behind this vision.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 36**

A few years ago, our country, South Africa, adopted the

National Development Plan, NDP, Vision 2030, which constitute

a broad framework around which development must be taken.

According to the NDP, I quote:

The national plan must attack the plight of poverty and

exclusion, while nurturing economic growth, at the same

time, creating a virtuous cycle of expanding

opportunities, building capabilities, reducing poverty

involving communities in their own development and

dealing with the rising standards.

The NDP provided a broad vision of overall economic and social

development, which integrates the economy geographic, social,

environmental and government’s element into their coherence

framework, with the NDP’s vision, the critical instrument

which drives government medium-term policy agenda, include the

new growth path and the associated national infrastructure

plan, and the industrial policy action plan. These are the

instruments that seeks then to drive the vision of the NDP.

Therefore, the NDP is the economy strategy designed to shift

the trajectory of the economic development, including true

identified jaguars of job creation, which includes the



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 37**

industrial policy action plan to guide the reindustrialisation

of South Africa’s economy, to ensure that we reverse, in our

case, the outward migration of our people in the Eastern Cape

to other areas because of it being rural.

Therefore, this strategy must help us to reverse the legacy of

migrant labour system, to ensure that the people of the

Eastern Cape will create conditions through the

industrialisation of our province, to thus compels the people

of the Eastern Cape who want to go home, and leave Gauteng,

and leave the Western Cape and other provinces, because

conditions have been changed because of the interventions of

our government.

The NDP, therefore, is a critical pillar in building the

developmental state, as it is required to have a coherent plan

in the coordinating capacity, to ensure an integrated strategy

and to ensure that, priorities are resourced. It is quite a

very important thing that we would like to highlight in the

debate, the importance of developmental state, that priorities

are reversed, that some of the developments, as we deal with

the crisis, are not contributing positively, whether it is

about austerity measures, whether it is about parties and



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 38**

social expenditure, that will not be a solution to the crisis

that we are facing.

The NDP is calling the mass resource priorities, not cutting

on expenditure on these priorities. The local sphere of

government is playing its part to ensure that its quorum in

the planning and mobilised various sectors of society to

achieve the broad national goals, and therefore, achieve

developmental state. President Ramaphosa, in the state of

nation address, pronounced the need, a year ago or so, to

pilot the District Development Model, DDM, and one of the four

municipalities which were identified, including our own

district municipality, O R Tambo, here in the province.

In terms of the DDM, the districts and metros are the land

rescripts for all government plans and private sector

investment where they are landed, and DDM is designed,

therefore, to increase the scale and the space to

intergovernmental planning coordination through cooperative

government and IGI. Among other things, it seeks to achieve

the following, it enables rational and justification for

priorities, projects or action intervention, one budgeting and

spend in a single space a long-term trajectory.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 39**

Also, it makes it possible to agree on one plan that will

elaborate on transformative areas that will also inform the

master plan, for instance now, in case of the new coastal

African city in the part of Port St Johns, which we refer to

as the eastern sea board initiative, under the leadership of

Dr Nkosazana Dlamini-Zuma. It also seeks to mobilise

stakeholders to commit funding on agreed commitments and

projects in a particular defined area.

Hon Chairperson, one plan of all districts are visionary and

transformative framework, population in each district and the

backlog ... [Interjections ... Oh, hon Chair, it is privilege

for us for having participated in this debate as we take

forward the work of the developmental state, let us be

reminded of the wise words of Amilcar Cabral that:

We must always bear in mind that the people are not

fighting for ideas, for the things in everyone’s head,

they are fighting to win material benefits to live better

and in peace, to see their lives going forward, to

guarantee the future of their children.

Thank you, hon Chair.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 40**

Mr I M SILEKU: Hon Chairperson, hon Minister, hon members,

fellow South Africans, contrary to what the Ramaphosa faction

in the ANC wants us to believe, the collapse of good local

governance did not commence with the Zuma era. In 2009, the

Dinokeng Scenario team, led by Mamphela Ramphele, Archbishop

Njongonkulu Ndungane, Bob Head, Graça Machel, Vincent Maphai

and Rick Menell, stated in its conclusion, and I quote: “We

have a weak state with declining capacity to address our

critical challenges.”

They warned that, and I quote: “The ANC did not understand

what was needed to run a democratic state and that leadership

across all sectors became increasingly self-interested,

unethical and unaccountable.”

Make no mistake, those were signs of state capture and

systemic corruption and whilst most sectors became concerned,

not the ANC; they committed to cadre deployment, cronyism and

tenderpreneurship.

The ANC extended the gap between rich and poor and weakened

the vital abilities and honest intensions of municipalities to

serve the people with good municipal services. As a result,



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 41**

we, the good people of this land, are reaping the sour fruits

of local government implosion where the ANC governs.

Over the years, there were good plans, facilitated by the ANC.

I ask the state capturing political elite, what happened to

the RDP, Gear, Asgisa, the New Growth Path, NGP, and the NDP?

The ANC loves to show off a shiny new policy every few years,

a shiny election tool that brings no tangible long-term

benefits for the millions of desperate South Africans. Now

they still blame apartheid, Covid-19 and even the war in

Ukraine for South Africa’s governance decline and the

subsequent lack of funding to govern municipalities properly.

The theme of this debate is, building a developmental state to

take the lead in building a better life for all. I remember

when this was an ANC election slogan and it seems these days,

the only ones enjoying this better life is ANC cadres. And

then we have the Minister of Cogta, who has tasted absolute

power and now does not want to relinquish it. There is no

justification for extending the State of Disaster when we are

recording single digit deaths. The time has come for you to

step out of the Covid-19 limelight, Minister.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 42**

*Afrikaans*:

Die enigste lig aan die einde van die tonnel, is dat die ANC

besig is om homself te vernietig, deur sy praktyk van

baantjies vir boeties en die verryking van sy eie elite en dat

hy in 2024 met die volle mag van die mense se woede en

verwerping, gestraf sal word.

*English*:

Is it possible for the new government of 2024 to turn

municipalities around and to rescue municipalities? Is it

possible to once again, serve the people with good services?

It is, and yes we will. I read a brilliant article by Dr

Michael Falkow: Good local governance at a time that it is

needed most. He speaks about the four pillars of effective

local governance: values and ethics, transformational

leadership, innovation and co creation and strategic planning.

These pillars will result in public trust, civic oversight,

transparency, accountability and sustainability. These pillars

are embedded in the DA and these pillars form the backbone of

good local governance in municipalities where the DA governs.

*Afrikaans*:



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 43**

Gaan kyk maar na die Wes-Kaap en spesifiek ook na

munisipaliteite soos Mosselbaai en Midvaal.

*English*:

A key reason why municipalities fail is that incompetent

cadres and politicians do not understand the real problem, ie

the structural collapse in local governance. The report, The

end of the road, compiled by Dr Tracy Ledger and Mr Mahlatse

Rampedi notes that the actual problem in municipalities are

structural.

Capacity building is a pie in the sky as the cadres have no

will to be developed as real municipal functionaries. In 2018-

19, R100 million was spent on consultants in a frantic last

attempt to correct accounting failures in municipalities.

Dr Ledger and Mr Rampedi pointed out that limited attention

was paid to structural impediments, indicating that fiscal

frameworks cannot be funded as the good people cannot afford

the basic cost of services such as electricity and water.

This is a vicious cycle. Consumers, rich and poor, cannot

afford services as the prices of these services include the

cost of state capture and corruption.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 44**

As a result, municipalities cannot raise sufficient income and

become less dependent on the National Treasury. But, here is

the thing, National Treasury is actually cutting transfers to

provinces and municipalities in a frenetic attempt to reduce

the budget deficit, which can expose the country’s fiscal

framework as useless.

We can create a capable network of local governments if we

restore values and ethics, transformational leadership,

innovation, co-creation and strategic planning.

*Afrikaans*:

Voor dit kan gebeur, moet die volgende egter gedoen word: ons

moet fokus op oplossings vir strukturele gebreke; die praktyk

van kaderontplooiing moet gestop word; korrupsie moet gestop

word; die gebrek aan munisipale kapasiteit moet gestop word;

en in 2024 gaan die ANC gestop word. Ek dank u.

Mr T S C DODOVU: Hon Chairperson, can I request that I be

muted in respect to my video, please?

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Yes, we want to hear you, yes.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 45**

Mr T S C DODOVU: I wanted you to see my face. The host has

disabled my video. Can the host correct that please?

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: ... [Inaudible.] ... well the

Table will have to assist but in the meantime please switch

... [Inaudible] ... video.

Mr T S C DODOVU: ... [Inaudible.] ... see you on, hon Chair.

Hon Chairperson of the NCOP Hon Amos Masondo, hon Minister of

Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs, CoGTA,

Nkosazana Dlamini-Zuma, hon MECs from different provinces,

Chief Whip of the NCOP hon Seiso Mohai, representative from

the SA Local Government Association, Salga, permanent and

special delegates, ladies and gentlemen, on 19 June 2019 at

the start of the sixth democratic Parliament when President

Cyril Ramaphosa delivered the state of the nation address. He

identified seven key priorities for the sixth administration;

building a capable, ethical, and developmental state was one

of these seven priorities. It is our firm belief that the

achievement of these priorities will constitute an important

milestone in addressing the triple challenges of unemployment,

poverty and inequality, and to put our country on a trajectory

of sound political stability, economic prosperity and social

justice.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 46**

In the context of what the ANC stands for, our primary role

must remain to mobilise all of our people for fundamental

change and social transformation. We, as the living bearers of

an unbroken legacy, are more than 110 years of struggle for

unity, non-racialism, nonsexism, democracy, and prosperity in

our land. We must continue to advance this cause in order to

realise these strategic objectives of our struggle.

To achieve all of this, the government has, during the sixth

administration, adopted a district-based approach to

development called the District Development Model, focusing on

the 44 districts and eight metros to speed up service delivery

and ensuring that municipalities are properly supported and

adequately resourced. As we assess the state’s capacity to

fulfil the developmental objectives of our society.

The focus of my debate this afternoon will be all about local

government where the stumbling blocks are glaringly exposed.

Indeed, it is in this sphere of the government where the task

of social transformation has proven to be complex, protracted

and stubborn than was initially anticipated. Therefore, all

spheres of the government must build on the work that has

already begun to address the problems of poor governance,

inefficiency, and financial sustainability.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 47**

The building of a capable, ethical and developmental state is

one of the cornerstones to deal with these challenges and to

realise the vision encapsulated in our National Development

Plan. To date, as we speak, there are many challenges facing

our municipalities requiring urgent attention. These

challenges, if left challenged, will not only make us a failed

state but will destroy the moral fabric of our society and the

solid foundation we have built since 1994.

Central to these challenges are political governance and

leadership problems with lead to financial instability, and

always costs service delivery to our communities, leading to

further instability, protests and the collapse of the

municipalities. In its assessment on the state of the

municipalities in 2021, the national Department of Co-

operative Governance and Traditional Affairs found that

infighting in councils, intra-political divisions in caucuses

and external political interference in councils led to the

vulnerabilities and even the collapse of the municipalities.

And when the municipal councils are not meeting regularly,

when they take unlawful decisions, when there is a lack of

oversight by the councils on the administration, when the

council committees are dysfunctional and when you have

councillors unduly interfering in administration, especially



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 48**

on staff appointments and tenders, these governance problems

in municipalities are exacerbated.

Even at this stage, if there is no consequence management,

especially on corruption, maladministration, nepotism and poor

performance, the crises afflicting the municipalities shall

not be resolved. The municipalities are also vulnerable as a

result of the increasing, accumulated and unauthorised,

irregular, fruitless at wasteful expenditure. What compounds

these problems is that some municipalities are able to collect

revenue while others continue to adopt legally unfunded

budgets where their expenditures explain exceed their incomes.

The municipalities in the rural parts of our country are the

most affected by all of this. They are cash strapped because

of a low tax base and lately because of the COVID-19 pandemic,

which continues leaving dire consequences for all of us. As a

result, such municipalities are unable to provide the minimum

basic services to the people, and also are unable to pay

timeously their creditors, including Eskom and water board

utilities. To compound these problems, corruption, and other

acts of financial malfeasance have generally collapsed

municipalities. As such, these municipalities are unable to



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 49**

implement infrastructure projects, leading to delays,

incomplete projects and municipal grants diversions.

As a result, all of these communities experience neglected and

rundown infrastructure, potholes, sewer spillages as well as

water and electricity losses. Therefore, as a result of this,

the need for fundamental renewal and rebuild of local

government has gotten bigger. And the demand for accountable,

responsive and efficient local government has escalated. We

need to consolidate development through reliable and quality-

based services such as water, electricity, better roads and

houses, and increase the state’s capacity to address the

devastating incidents such as uncollected waste, sewer

spillages, potholes and water flows from pipe bursts.

The government must engage other partners to support key

infrastructure backlogs and maintenance. There is a plan to

maintain an equitable share of resources in line with

constitutional and intergovernmental mandates to support the

stabilisation of local government finances. In addition, the

following must be addressed as a matter of urgency, the

government and co-ordination framework offered by the District

Development Model and the resourcing of local government

structures to be taken forward urgently. Also to address the



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 50**

uneven state capacity leading to an uneven performance in

local, provincial and national government. As President

Ramaphosa accepted the forewords of the ANC election

manifesto, we faced a moment in history where we must choose

between the path of division, conflict, destruction,

inequality, and exclusion, and the path of unity, hard work,

development, inclusivity and shared prosperity. We choose the

path of unity, hard work, development, inclusivity and shared

prosperity.

In order to strengthen the capacity of local government, as

the ANC, we have adopted the Local Government Barometer as a

quarterly monitoring and evaluation instrument. A report card

to have an update on the degree to which we are monitoring our

commitment made in our local government manifesto. Also to

record progress and address the challenges in governance. But

we are using this Local Governance Barometer, as well, to

monitor whether the ANC councillors and the local government

leadership are living up to the pledge to ... [Inaudible.] ...

outside before the local government elections. In conclusion,

we say, the communities need councillors who will be fiercely

committed to fulfilling their aspirations. They need

councillors who understand the demands of the revolution

without needing clarity and, therefore, work selflessly for



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 51**

the betterment of local communities. These communities need

councillors who will never lose sight of their people, their

beliefs, fears, joys, aspirations, dreams and hopes.

And taking this particular way forward, it will be quite

important to ensure that we strengthen the capacity of the

government to achieve all these particular objectives that we

have set for ourselves.

Standing here. Bickering here, like hon Sileku is doing, will

never take our country forward. It is their agenda to ensure

that they identify whatever they think in their own

imaginations that are problems afflicting the ANC. We are

committed to what we are saying. Even the plans we and the

councillors have adopted clearly demonstrate that, as the ANC,

we will forge ahead. We will resolve whatever problems we are

experiencing and ensure that, indeed, and genuinely so, we

present a better life for all of our people. This politicking,

as I indicated, is nothing but a waste of time, and to ensure

that they deal with the ANC. And they will fail as they have

failed in the past. Hon Chairperson, thank you very much.

Mr M A DUKWANA (Free State): Hon Chairperson of the NCOP, hon

Masondo and other Presiding Officers. Hon Minister, Dr



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 52**

Nkosazana Dlamini-Zuma, Chief Whip of the NCOP, hon Seiso

Mohai, Deputy Ministers present, MECs, other representatives,

hon members and delegates from provinces.

The NCOP represents a central focal point from whence to

direct the work of the democratic state, both through

legislation and various accountability mechanisms enshrined in

our Constitution. The NCOP has the ultimate possibility to

propel the march towards building a better tomorrow for all

our people, to improve the quality of their lives and to

ensure that the executive operates within the purview of

existing legislative framework, brought about by years of

struggle.

In a sense, members of the NCOP symbolise the collective

aspirations of the people of our country; majority of whom

live in dire conditions borne out of centuries of systematic

exclusion and oppression. Our people look to this institution

and other interventions which centre their plight, and

privilege their socioeconomic advances.

The responsibility that resides here extends beyond what any

other South African could shoulder in a lifetime. The people

of our country expect all of us to crack the whip, in order



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 53**

for the rest of us to do right for them. They expect this hon

House to ensure the executive delivers on its mandate of

securing better lives for our people. The NCOP remains a

tribune that protects the rights of our people against

economic deprivation, gender oppression and racism. It is thus

unsurprising that not many people live to contribute towards

the country’s developmental path at this level. For me

personally, as indeed many of our people, there could be no

better place to participate in the debate on South Africa’s

developmental trajectory than in these chambers.

I must indicate from the onset that participating in this

debate, is arguably one of the most unnerving challenges in my

life as an activist. Perhaps in part because there is no

universal understanding of what constitutes a developmental

state. And so one traverses a heavily contested terrain

characterized by many competing ideas and indeed,

contradictory conceptual apprehensions. At a basic level,

there is universal agreement that the developmental state is

charged with the responsibility of directing economic activity

in such a way that the endowments of the country, both human

and capital benefit the people as a whole.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 54**

With the assistance of a multiplicity of stakeholders, the

developmental state must use legislation and various

mechanisms to leverage economic opportunities in ways that

combat poverty and put all our people in good stead as

envisaged in the Freedom Charter. Of necessity, all social

formations like government, business, organised labour and

civil society must be mobilised into a coherent whole to

achieve developmental objectives.

However, some quarters insist out of sheer convenience that,

the state must not play a central role in marshalling economic

opportunities, in order to defeat poverty and build a better

tomorrow for our people. Interestingly, this sentiment is

limited only to countries in the Southern Hemisphere. It would

seem there are standards for developing economies and the rest

of the world. As Gunnar Myrdal argues I quote:

The prior existence of advanced nations changes the

context of late comers. It can produce backwash effects

that retard development in the latecomers or it can

provide very useful lessons for the late comer.

For us in the ANC, the most invaluable lesson we learn in the

context of struggle is that all challenges, no matter how



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 55**

mighty can be overcome if there is unity of purpose. Because

of our colonial and apartheid past, this unity of purpose must

take shape across the diverse racial and ethnic formations,

class backgrounds and within cultural and religious groups.

The idea of a developmental state is not a completely new

concept on the African soil. What constitutes the content of a

developmental state is captured succinctly in the ideas of

former President of Tanzania Julius Nyerere, who located the

genesis of social progress within the context of an attitude

of mind. He argued that it is an attitude of mind that

determines the success or otherwise of any country more than

the lofty and well sounding ideas we often bog ourselves down

with. Thandika Mkandawire argues that:

Developmental states are not an end in themselves, but an

instrument for attaining particular goals in this case

catching up, rapid economic transformation and growth.

So, what matters in the collective aspiration and intent

to develop.

From the standpoint of the ruling ANC, the 2007 Strategy &

Tactics located the South African developmental state within

the context of four important and interrelated features;

interstate in our conditions should be its strategic



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 56**

orientation: an approach premised on people-centred and

people-driven change, and sustained development based on high

growth rates, restructuring of the economy and socioeconomic

inclusion.

The second attribute should be its capacity to lead in the

definition of a common national agenda and in mobilising all

of society to take part in its implementation. Therefore, such

a state should have effective systems of interaction with all

social partners, and exercise leadership informed by its

popular mandate.

The third attribute should be the state’s organisational

capacity: ensuring that its structures and systems facilitate

realisation of a set agenda. Thus, issues of macro

organisation of the state will continue to receive attention.

These include permutations among policy and implementation

organs within each sphere, allocation of responsibilities

across the spheres, effective intergovernmental relations and

stability of the management system.

The fourth attribute should be its technical capacity. The

ability to translate broad objectives into programmes and



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 57**

projects and to ensure their implementation. This depends

among others on the proper training, orientation and

leadership of the public service and on acquiring and

retaining skilled personnel. But what do these mean in

practical terms hon Chair? It is thus unthinkable that any

human and social progress can obtain without singlemindedness

which galvanises our society into a common vision. We shall be

doomed to fail as a society if we fail to give meaning to our

developmental trajectory and locate our people at the centre

as key drivers. It is the people as a whole who wield the

necessary temperament and strength to sail this beautiful

country of ours to the pinnacle of development path.

Whereas, our government has since 1994 channelled enormous

resources towards resolving apartheid legacy challenges of

poverty, indecent accommodation, degrading sanitation, second

rate healthcare and general exclusion from modern life; we

need to appreciate the necessity of building sustainable

growth for future generations. There is a correlation between

thorough economic growth and meeting service delivery needs of

our people, who are growing impatient of delays in improved

quality of life.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 58**

It is necessary to reverse the legacy of the apartheid past

and restore the humanity of our people. On the other hand, we

need to be build a resilient economy that contributes towards

growth. In a sense, we must ensure the living standards of the

poor are improved immediately by providing basic services such

as water, sanitation, housing and so on; whilst at the same

time ensuring there is sustained economic growth. In this

regard, educating our people should decidedly be an apex

priority. The importance of this balance cannot be

overemphasized.

In its effort to achieve a developmental state, the ANC

historically committed itself to a reconstruction and

development programme, at the centre of which was a drive to

fundamentally transform the economic complexion of South

Africa. The ANC government understood that without directing

the tempo of economic transformation, it would have failed to

use its electoral support to change.

*IsiXhosa*:

Ndiyabulela mhlekazi.

*English*:

Thank you.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 59**

Mr M S MOLETSANE: Chairperson, hon members and the Minister,

the EFF have, since inception, stood at the forefront of the

struggle for state development and the building of our country

to its fullest capacity so much that the development of the

state ... [Interjections.] [Inaudible.] ... seven cardinal

pillars of the EFF ... [Interjections.] ... for the state is

well-placed to drive the economical and industrial development

of its people.

Chairperson of the session, we have to acknowledge that as a

country we are at an all-important turning point of our

democracy. We face a number of challenges which should point

us towards the direction of a developmental state.

For ours, is a state heading for failure. Our country stands

far removed from our concept of development state. It has

swayed away from the direction of economic development and our

capacity continues to deteriorate.

Government has failed to create jobs, increase skills levels

or tackle poverty. We live with large income inequality which

are worsened by settlement patterns, which sees the poor

communities living on the outskirts of town in informal

settlements and in remote rural areas.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 60**

The current condition of our people is of a society where

thousands face severe problems in accessing even the most

basic services such as water, sanitation, electricity and

refuse removal; with public services worse among those areas

where the majority of our black population resides, causing an

ever-rising tide of protests.

Under the leadership of the ruling party we have struggled

with these structural challenges, which require socioeconomic

and industrial change. The Zondo Commission findings bear

testimony to this.

As our inequality is widening, racism and xenophobia are at an

all-time high.

With graduates sitting at home unemployed, corruption remains

a serious challenge as it cripples the ability of a state to

pursue its commitments to economic development by draining

resources away from economic development goals.

The loss of revenue has had tremendous consequences for the

economy including negative impact on economic growth, lost

jobs and the explosion of public debt. These consequences

affect the most economical marginalised and poor.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 61**

These conditions, which we speak of, are not surprising as the

former liberation movement has surrendered its developmental

responsibility to the private sector; which has, on countless

occasions, demonstrated that it has no obligation to develop

South Africa and has long proven this. Yet the ruling party

remains hell-bent on the privatization of South Africa as it

continues to sell off key stakes of state-owned enterprises,

SOEs.

We know this from the most recent opportunistic move to

finalise the partial privatization of SA Airways and from

their deliberate collapsing of state-owned enterprises such as

Eskom, the Post Office, Denel and Transnet.

It is, therefore, of utmost importance that we commit to

building and maintain much needed infrastructure for the

social and economic development of any nation is facilitated

by the provision of adequate and functional infrastructure.

Such development can only come about through placing the state

at the centre of its development; for states by their nature

shape the development.

The development of a state, therefore, cannot be left to

market forces as the leader of the ruling party has suggested,



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 62**

but rather the state should be built to such capacity that it

does not fall victim to state capture.

It is important that now, more than ever, for the state to

play a central role in the socioeconomic development of the

country so we may transform our country from poverty to an

advanced economy as the structure of our economy has not

changed much since democracy.

What is needed is a needed shift to a capable state which will

improve the quality of work and use its capacity to drive

local industrialisation and development of the economy.

A capable state as envisioned by the EFF is, therefore, not a

minimal state indifferent to the suffering and injustices

faced by its people, but rather it is a state which intervenes

and provides for conditions which shall guarantee the

fundamental right of all its people.

But above all, what is required in South Africa is a shift in

leadership to a decisive one which understands how state

procurement and service can boost the creation of jobs; a

leadership which will rescue state-owned companies from the

control of the private sector.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 63**

For it is the state which should act as a vehicle through

which to transform the economy, create jobs and provide long

denied needs, including the land and housing. It is the state

which should play a leading role in strengthening growth and

spreading prosperity for all South Africans. It is the state

which should deliver on jobs and basic services. It is the

state that must deliver houses, roads, schools, hospitals,

dams, airports, railways and sewerage disposal plants.

For the development of public infrastructure would improve the

standard of living of our people as infrastructure promotes

economic growth, reduces poverty and improves service

delivery.

We ought to unite to build state capacity and free the ruling

party from the chains of privatization.

For building a state capacity through a capable state is one

of the many steps towards economic development of our people.

I thank you, Chair of the session.

Mr S HLOMUKA (KwaZulu-Natal): Thank you very much, Chair of

the session, greetings to yourself, greetings to Minister Dr

Nkosazana Dlamini Zuma, greetings to leaders of the NCOP, hon



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 64**

members, Deputy Ministers, MECs, we want to observe the

protocol. It is widely accepted that there is a deep and

worsening problem with state capacity and that this is having

a significant impact on our society and economy,

reconstruction and development, the effectiveness of every

government department and entity and, ultimately, on the

delivery of basic services of communities.

The Medium-Term Strategic Framework of 2019 to 2024 defines a

developmental state as one that:

Aims to meet people’s needs through interventionist,

developmental, participatory public administration

The definition also states that:

building an autonomous developmental state driven by the

public interest and not individual or sectional

interests, embedded in South African society and leading

to an active citizenry through partnerships with all

sectors of society.

This definition indicates that, in order to build the capacity

for an effective, efficient and accountable developmental



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 65**

state, we need to ensure that leaders and senior officials of

state institutions are able to plan and implement sustainable

development projects, use research methods and collect and

analyse data to assess the priority needs in each community.

Ensure that their institutions maintain a focus on the public

interest and not individual or sectional interests. Use a

participatory approach to planning and implementation and

develop an active citizenry.

To maintain good intergovernmental relations and practice co-

operative governance and integrated development planning in

all spheres, which the President launched and the Minister

have already spoken about the District Development Model, DDM,

which was launched by the President. Even here in KwaZulu-

Natal, the President launched the DDM and the Minister. There

is a number of districts to ensure that we launch this DDM and

also the implementation of it. Also, to enter into effective

and appropriate partnerships with all sectors of society, from

small private sector enterprises to large international

corporations.

Each sphere of government in South Africa has different

responsibilities in building the capacity of a developmental

state. While national government is seized with the



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 66**

responsibility of setting the agenda through various

instruments including the National Development Plan and most

recently the District Development Model with its focus on

integrated development planning, budgeting and implementation.

All the spheres of government must stand together and must

budget together and also implement. It is important that one

sphere must know what is happening in another sphere. That is

why we are encouraging that we implement the District

Development Model.

The provincial government of KwaZulu-Natal has a distinct role

to play in ensuring that while building its own capacity it

also supports the building of capacity in local government or

municipalities. Local government is at the coalface of service

delivery and is very often regarded as the government,

particularly in the not so affluent communities. It thus

becomes critical that both the administrative and political

leadership is well capacitated to deliver on their mandate.

As the Department of Cooperative Governance and Traditional

Affairs in KwaZulu-Natal, we have conceived a robust capacity

building programme to ensure that our local government sphere

in the province is equal to the task bestowed upon them. This

started with the skills audit which sought to understand the



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 67**

level of education of our councillors and officials with the

experience in local government and training needs amongst

those officials and councillors.

As at 4 March 2022, a total of 1 230 which constitute to 78%

of councillors were audited. The department has commenced the

data analysis and report writing phases. Further to that, we

have partnered with SALGA and other stakeholders in rolling

out sector based councillor orientations workshops aimed at

inducting and orientating new and returning councillors about

their responsibilities as well as the pertinent legislation in

the local government space, as the hon Dodovu has indicated

that the division in the caucus has also serious implications

in the administration. After these workshops we even brought

down even further by capacitating the municipal portfolio

committees including Municipal Public Accounts Committee, MPAC

Chairs and committee members as well as speakers through peers

of our programme of ... [Inaudible.]

The sector based councillor orientations workshops commenced

on 8 to 10 March 2022 at the Zululand District Municipality

and the surrounding local municipalities under Zululand. There

were 148 councillors and four Amakhosi that participate in



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 68**

this programme and we are very grateful that at least 90% of

councillors of Amakhosi have attended this workshop.

A Provincial Capacity Building Plan for 2021-22 was developed

and implementation thereof is monitored. There are 102

programmes being implemented for municipal officials,

councillors and traditional leadership, through the Provincial

Capacity Building Plan as indicated earlier. About eight

stakeholder engagements were held where the whole 54

municipalities have been visited by myself and senior

officials of the department and other department of the

provincial government. Just to come there and we will take

them through on how government works and to capacitate them.

Stakeholders engagements were also entered into during the

2021-22 financial year. Namely; the memorandum of agreement

with the National School of Government was finalized and

signed. The implementation plan was drafted. The memorandum of

understanding with University of KwaZulu-Natal has been

finalized and signed as well. The partnership includes the

capacity building projects, and the capacity assessment of the

districts to implement the District Development Model was

conducted and 10 district reports were prepared, including the

metro, which is eThekwini.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 69**

An implementation plan was developed and the following

capacity building initiatives were undertaken: DDM workshops

were held in districts to enhance the understanding of DDM. I

have already indicated that the Minister has visited more than

three districts in KwaZulu-Natal in ensuring the

implementation of DDM in all municipalities.

The District Development Model Integrated Development Planning

alignment sessions were held in 10 districts as I have already

indicated. Further capacitation of councillors on DDM is

currently underway through the Integrated Councillor Induction

Programme and sector based councillor orientation workshops,

as I indicated earlier.

The department has implemented peer learning sessions for

municipal administrators. A total of three sessions covering

areas such as sound financial management, Unauthorised,

Irregular, Fruitless and Wasteful Expenditure, UIFW and

governance and critical areas of their roles and

responsibilities of senior management and all also the roles

of the process administrators.

Through the stakeholder engagement with the National School of

Government, 178 municipal officials have enrolled for the free



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 70**

open e-learning programmes. These programmes include

Introduction to Strategic Human Resources Management,

Introduction to Financial Management and Budgeting,

Introduction to Leading change, Introduction to Policy

Formulation and Implementation Introduction to Strategic

Planning, writing for government and Know and Live your

Constitution.

We have also employed experts in various fields to the

municipalities to hold the hand of municipalities. We have

deployed financial experts. We have deployed project managers.

We have deployed engineers to assist all 54 municipalities in

KwaZulu-Natal. We are grateful that most municipalities have

welcomed that.

We must raise the disappointment that recently we have

received a letter from the Deputy Mayor of Zululand to happens

to be an EFF ... who registered with the provincial government

that he was mistreated by the Mayor of Zululand by calling the

drivers to say that they must drop the Deputy Mayor on the

road. And we feel like that will cause another division in

that municipality and it means that the district will not be

able to function very well because there will be instability

which will also cascade to administration. This is why we are



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 71**

calling for all political parties to ensure that they tolerate

each other, especially those who are ... [Inaudible.] ...

Thank you very much, Chair and thank you for your time. [Time

expired.] [Applause.]

Mr N D MASEMOLA (Limpopo): Chairperson of the National Council

of Provinces, Madam Chairperson of the session, hon Minister,

Dr Dlamini-Zuma, MECs from various provinces of our country,

representatives of SA Local Government Association, Salga, hon

members of the National Council of Provinces, comrades and

colleagues and fellow South Africans, we are sent to this

great platform for debate today, and as such is our

appropriately occasion for profound engagement on matters of

policy and legislative progress made towards building a

developmental state positioned to respond to the needs of our

people.

We do so, Madam Chair, just over a month since His Excellency,

the President of our country, Maṱamela Cyril Ramaphosa

reminded the nation that building a capable, ethical and

developmental state means and contains to be a priority of

this government. Continuously therefore is provinces in this

regard honestly assess and rollout programmes to give impetus

to the cause of national significance thus sharpening the



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 72**

livers of power to serve the people better. Through that we

continue to provide the people with the services they so much

expect from their democratic government. Similarly, we are

pushing hard and rolling out social and economic

infrastructure programme for the benefit of the people on

whose behalf we are speaking here today as their public

representatives.

Madam Chair, the inclusive political institutions based on the

political power obtained by the ANC is hard to resist or deny

its impact on the social transformation agenda. There is a

broad coalition of mines and front for creative endeavours and

efforts in building a developmental state, which is not a

conjuncture to be announced.

And that is understood as a dynamic process characterised by

confluence of factors, including interplay between existing

institutions opportunities to be created for the people

notwithstanding challenges related there to which of course

are subjected to significance contingences develop for the

purposes of the outline plans because the state institutions

exist precisely to serve the people of our country.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 73**

Understandable, therefore Madam Chair, from the articulations

made at various platforms by the President, the Ministers and

premiers, all that emphasise are resolved and work will

continue to do instantly and in capacity of the state, and

therefore, advance unapologetic learn agenda towards

realisation of a developmental state.

Clearly, the essence of developmental state finds its primacy

in the overarching known to the public and particularly the

values enshrined therein, which obligate government to ensure

complete and comprehensive attention to the socioeconomic

conditions ... [Inaudible.] ...

Actually, Madam Chair, a Freedom Charter remains the

fundamental document that shapes our philosophical and

concrete political approach on matters of policy and

legislation, therefore, directing our national efforts to the

transformation of the state so that its capabilities would be

used in the interest of development and progress and decisive

intervention to better the lives of our people in the country.

Beyond any reasonable doubt, therefore, Madam Chair, the

developmental state to display: Firstly, strong state

intervention and have effective regulation an impactful



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 74**

planning based on technical capabilities and all what it is

required to make sure that all the agreed plans find

expression completely on the ground. It should have strong

political leadership that is oriented towards growth and

development and continued to combat the gracious extractive

features in the economy because they retard prosperity and it

tore the nation from an inclusive path of development. Hence

the ANC is hard at work to pursue reconstruction and

development of this country through important programmes for

reconstruction and development of our country.

Political and executive leadership is required characterised

by dialectical thinking for appropriate management of complex

matters confronting society. Existence of relevant structures

handled by capable bureaucracy to advance its development

goals at significant, cohesiveness and effectiveness so much

primary for the efficiency of the entire system. Unambiguous

calls clarity on legislative frameworks and centrality of the

people which foreground the legitimacy of the state.

This developmental state to the cleaning and design model that

enforces and promote integrative approach and ensure resilient

physical strength for the success of its plans and progress

hence the President launched a District Development Model at



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 75**

an important platform for integrative processes at a level of

planning implementation and as well as monitoring.

Prudent management of fiscal resources and stabilisation of

the monitoring policy contend to be an important process that

the developmental state would have to display without any

failure. Heightened professionalisation of the public service

has professional continuous development of our provincial

administrations across the country. And of course, including

in our provinces as well continues to remains a fundamental

plan to peruse without any failure.

A dynamic engagement and involvement of the citizens an organs

of civil society on matters of their government remains

essential and continues to be at a centre of this democratic

state that perused an agenda towards development of this

aspired state characterise by this important attributes. Hence

a capable state is expected to have human resource capacity,

institutional strength, sharpen business processes and proper

technological platforms to deliver on the macroeconomic

strategy of the country.

The capacity to fight maleficence leads and emulsification and

direct resources accordingly for maximum input and as well as



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 76**

development of our people. This developmental state should

make sure that it continues to provide quality education,

adequate healthcare services, safety and security,

comprehensive social services and of course, safety and safe

social spaces advance the agenda for social cohesion and build

the nation that is characterised by nonracialism and

nonsexism, prosperity and as well as unity.

The attention and support that is so much required by

municipalities given their strategic location in the equation

of leadership and as well as service delivery. Their

capacities and effectiveness paramount to the successful

implementation of economic programmes and economic

development, and therefore, provide opportunities for the

people of our country to actually survive and mitigate their

socioeconomic difficulties.

This developmental state would have to ensure strengthening

implementation of public procurements strategy essential for

the promotion and development of value chain system that will

advance a redistributive agenda for the people of this country

to enjoy the services without any failure.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 77**

Hon Chairperson, we fully understand the intransigent

contradictions inherent in society and a threats to the

national democratic revolution being poverty, unemployment and

as well as inequality. These challenges require relentless

efforts to rebuild the economic position of the state

accordingly to grabble with all that in the interest of

prosperity. Evidence of public debate brought in the last

quarter of 2021 brought positive outlook of the country’s GDP

as shown resilience physical capacity and as well as

monitoring strength amongst serious difficulties.

It is worth noting, Madam Chair, that contributions of key

sectors of the economy in the context of Limpopo remains

mining, agriculture, manufacturing amongst other sectors of

the economy.

The provincial economic recovery plan is articulated by the

hon Premier, Chupu Mathabatha, focusses the province amongst

other things on agro-processing and industrialisation,

infrastructure rollout, implementation of mega

industrialisation projects, Musina-Makhado SEZ and peruse bulk

SEZ as well. Establishment local government complex in

Sekhukhune, completion and extension of agro-processing and

pack houses across the province, an expansion of



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 78**

commercialisation ... [Inaudible.] ... as activities that will

bring opportunities for the people of our province. With these

few words, we are more than very certain, hon Madam Chair,

that as a province, and as a country, capable state truly

ensures credibility and respect for the people, and therefore,

deepening an understanding of what constitute government and

as well as government. I thank you so much.

Mr N M HADEBE: Hon Chairperson, the hon Minister for Co-

operative Governance and Traditional Affairs, Dr Nkosazana-

Dlamini-Zuma, MECs, members of the National Council of

Provinces, the Chief Whip of the NCOP, for too long we have

looked at South Africa in isolation and not to how external

forces are influencing the development of South Africa.

For us colleagues, the fact is that at the grass root level

our people are suffering due to the ill-gotten gains and

decisions taken by individuals in government. For instance, if

you look to the crisis between Russia and Ukraine, we as

government have an increase of the cost of living, which is

hitting the most vulnerable hardest. Given the current debt

that the government has accumulated which accounts for almost

20c per rand that is spent there is little retrieve that

government can offer in the way of lessening the burden of all



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 79**

South Africans and continue our growth. And let me state

before government commits to more loans that money is given

through loans are not properly allocated out through

programmes. The difficulty is that information of the flow of

money is a very highly guarded secret. This provides the

breeding ground for networks and associations of corrupt

officials which has lasting effect on our communities.

Communities often do not see at all or sometimes in a very

small part the benefit of these loans but are committed to

paying for them.

It is very unfortunate that certain Members of Parliament have

sought to misconstrue the outcry of the IFP when raising our

concerns regarding the fragile state of our socioeconomic and

political climate. There is in fact, and I quote from the

IFP’s National Spokes Person, hon M Hlengwa, and I quote:

“Need of recovery and newness.” Then why colleagues we

tolerate an unnecessary strain on our economy when government

itself has admitted that we are struggling to come out of the

burden imposed by Covid-19.

It is only rational that such a decision taken by Russia to

invade Ukraine was not taken into consideration with impact it

may have of building the economy and state capacity of its



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 80**

Brics partners. Our public officials in government have

abandoned their own party believes and act levels of treason

when they offer a defence and do not condemn violence or

agendas that have real hash consequences of the citizens of

South Africa, especially the poor and vulnerable.

As we have seen ... [Inaudible.] ... the state has captured

and so has our development. If we are serious about our

development, we must not shy away of the uncomfortable

decisions that have been taken. If we are able to reconcile

our differences when it comes to service delivery and

development, we will ensure that South Africa take its own

development for the people of this country. I thank you, hon

Chair.

Mr D R RYDER: Before I became a councillor I served on the ward

committee where I lived. What I saw then was provincial

government reaching out with a project to build a much needed

taxi rank in the neighbourhood. There was great fanfare, and

a ribbon was cut. The politicians posed for photographs and

everyone walked away.

Except that there was this one problem. The taxis didn’t like

where the rank was situated. It was away from their normal



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 81**

route and inconvenient for them. The commuters also didn’t

like it. It was away from the busiest shopping area and

necessitated walking and exposed people travelling at odd

hours to crime and criminals.

The result was a white elephant. A useless project, costing

millions, conceptualised and delivered by the state with no

real understanding of what the people wanted. With no real

understanding that, no matter how much the state tries to push

its ideas, the market, the people will decide.

This is the inherent problem with a Developmental State Model.

The state thinks that they know what people need and want. But

the state is made up of conservative officials, informed by

outdated thought, and guided by questionable politicians with

questionable agendas.

The state should not be centralising control to drive

development. The state should be making sure it creates an

environment where development can happen through

entrepreneurship, through opportunity makers and through

hustlers.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 82**

This week the auctioning off of broadband spectrum or

bandwidth finally opened. The auction has been in the

pipeline since 2010, and the broadband rollout has been

mentioned in each of the past 11 State of the Nation

Addresses. Go back and check. I did!

Let me emphasise the importance of the auction. Internet

access and connectivity are key drivers of the economy.

especially in rural areas, Hon Mkiva. Access to the internet

enables more and more people to participate in the economy.

Regional GDP can jump by 8% upon the introduction of cell-

phones. Doubling broadband speed adds up to 3% to GDP. It

broadens access, it brings opportunity and it creates wealth.

There are numerous studies confirming that increased access to

the internet and faster speeds work together to reduce

inequality.

And so we see that the much mentioned Gini-co-efficient has

been exacerbated by government’s ineptitude. And let no person

stand here and blame the other role-players. It has been

government itself that blocked and delayed the release of

spectrum for years.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 83**

The Communications Ministry (Telecommunications and Postal

Services) has been the key procrastinator. And then of course

the terms of the auction when it was finally released was

designed to be so controversial that there would undoubtedly

be legal challenges.

Conspiracy theories abound that this was done on purpose to

allow time to migrate TV signal from analogue to digital.

process that is still not complete, and is now also being

A

challenged legally because government has not procured enough

set top boxes in sufficient quantities to cater for the

demand.

Hon members, we are frankly sick of hearing from each other

the phrase “Am I audible?” The impact of the Covid-19

pandemic on our economy could have been partly mitigated had

we had sufficient internet connectivity and cell phone access

across the country. Instead, people were forced to work from

home, with poor network, and poor productivity and work

outcomes as a result. We have all experienced this.

So instead of doing the basics to drive development, the state

has bungled the project from the start.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 84**

This is not a developmental state. It is quite the opposite.

Policy uncertainty and the inability to implement plans have

been proven to be non-developmental.

The most frightening words a person in the private sector can

hear is “Hi, I’m from the government and I’m here to help.”

Now we want to further entrench the developmental state, as if

the poor people of South Africa deserve more hardship and more

inequality.

Just look at the infrastructural decay around cities and towns

throughout South Africa. The Deputy President admitted it

yesterday. Our infrastructure is going backwards. How can you

even contemplate development when you cannot even cope with

current demand?

Let the state concentrate on its constitutional imperatives.

Focus on building roads, providing clean drinking water and

electricity supply that is consistent and reliable. These are

the basics. Make sure your people are housed and healthy. Let

us to protect the fruits of our labour by reducing crime. Then

you will find that development will follow without the need



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 85**

for the state to drive it. Create a conducive environment.

That is the role of government.

As South Africa looks to a deepening economic crisis we need

real support from government. The only developmental plan

that the ANC had was development through state sponsored jobs.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms W NGWENYA): As you conclude hon

member. I’m not saying conclude now, I’m saying as you

conclude, continue.

Mr D R RYDER: The only developmental plan that the ANC has was

development through sponsored. The only development that the

ANC has achieved effectively over the past 28 years is the

development of a Public Sector Wage Bill that even the Unions

agree is unsustainable and the development of monstrous debt

that we are struggling to service.

Get back to basics government. You cannot afford to be

reaching outside of anything beyond your mandate. I thank you.

Ms S SHAIKH: Hon Chairperson, the Minister of COGTA, MECs, hon

members of the NCOP, fellow South Africans, allow me to

contribute to this debate on the very important aspect of



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 86**

gender equality and the economic inclusion of women within a

capable developmental state.

The legacy of economic exclusion in South Africa bears the

imprint of colonial and apartheid policies. Equally, the

effects of decades of economic and racial exclusion are still

evident today in our society. As a result, South Africa has

become one of the most unequal societies in the world.

The exclusion of millions of black people and women in

particular from owning land, property and meaningful

participation in the economy, was structural in order to

maintain the foundations of apartheid and entrench the system

of patriarchy that has oppressed women of all races, but more

severely black women.

These structural challenges and their consequences are evident

today and have given rise to many of the socioeconomic crises

that South Africa faces today. There is a correlation between

the effects of the historical exclusion of women from the

economy, and the high levels of unemployment.

The inability to find a job increases the vulnerability of a

black woman in Heideveld, in Cape Town. It makes her more



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 87**

prone to be involved in a dependant relationship which in many

circumstances may be abusive leading to incidences of gender-

based violence and femicide. The exclusion of millions of

women in townships, small towns and villages from the

mainstream economy has given rise to many challenges that our

children and youth are facing.

Women’s economic exclusion gives rise to high levels of

inequality, denying women equal opportunities to empower

themselves and support their families, many of which are

headed by single parents. Research indicates that in South

Africa there are approximately over 45% single mother-headed

households. All of these factors aggravate the second pandemic

that we are faced with as a country: the scourge of gender-

based violence and femicide.

But, it is not all doom and gloom. Guided by the philosophy of

the developmental state, which is an activist state that

intervenes strategically in the economy and society; the ANC

government is hard at work is changing the reality faced by

millions of women and children in our country.

The developmental state is characterised by the creation of

initiatives and pathways to end economic exclusion of people



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 88**

in general and women in particular. Government is hard at work

in creating this environment to transform society to be more

inclusive and truly democratic.

Through legislation such as the Employment Equity Act, to

which the DA and Freedom Front Plus are opposed to for obvious

reasons, aims to mitigate the disparities created by apartheid

in the economy. We have already made progress in government in

the mitigating of the gender parity gap by employing more

women in senior management position.

Today, there are more women that occupy senior management

positions in government than before. However, we note that

there is still more to be done particularly in the private

sector. Government departments such as Employment and Labour

should intensify their efforts to enforce greater compliance

with this and other transformative legislation.

In 2021, our gender parity gap was 0,78 placing us 18th out of

156 countries globally. While this is a welcome improvement

from 2016 figure of 0.76, it is only a slight reduction. Much

more still needs to be done in this regard. Statistics South

Africa revealed that the labour market in South Africa was

more favourable to men than women, and black women were the



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 89**

most affected with an unemployment rate of 41% in Quarter 2 of

2021.

This was partly due to the impact of Covid-19 lockdown

measures which impacted women dominated sectors most severely.

It is thus important that we use our oversight mechanism as

parliamentarians to ensure that legislation such as the Women

Empowerment and Gender Equality Bill are properly implemented

in the private sector as these pieces of legislation promote

equality between men and women in the work place.

Noting that Gender Based Violence and Femicide is a

consequence of economic exclusion of women, South Africa has

made progressive strides in addressing this scourge. As South

Africans we have to challenge the shameful narrative that our

country is the most unsafe country for a woman to live.

We cannot accept the situation where our country’s

Constitution promises equality and justice for all, and

Parliament has made progressive laws such as the Criminal and

Related Matters Amendment Act of 2021, Domestic Violence

Amendment Act of 2021, the Criminal Law, Sexual Offences and

Related Matters Amendment Act of 2021, among others, which are



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 90**

all aimed at fighting the scourge of gender-based violence and

femicide in our country

Fellow South Africans, the onus lies with each and every one

of us to challenge toxic masculinity behaviours and norms in

our workplaces and communities. If we are to truly deal with

the challenge of GBV&F, we cannot tolerate that each and every

year the statistics of GBV rise and women grow more fearful in

society. A democratic developmental state as envisaged in the

National Development Plan cannot flourish if so many of its

citizens live in fear and in real danger of being harmed by

their fellow citizens.

A democratic developmental state understands that women

empowerment is critical in restoring the agency of women and

giving women back their power. When a woman is able to sustain

herself and her family her agency is restored. She has the

power to provide for herself and her family. She has better

chances at accessing healthcare for herself and her family. We

therefore must call on government to ensure that women and

children have access to health care and that their needs are

catered for.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 91**

The vision of the Freedom Charter has always been that of a

healthy nation, nourished and well educated youth, high levels

of human development, including health and education services.

Those of us from the African National Congress are committed

to see this vision being realised in our lifetime. We call on

government to continue with creative initiatives and

programmes that support public mass employment, such as the

Presidential Employment Stimulus, which has created over

500 000 (five hundred thousand) employment opportunities.

We are proud that 54% of these opportunities were taken by

women and 84% percent were taken by youth. Government must

continue to bring about structural reforms to support both

women and youth. It must continue to mainstream women

empowerment in all sectors of the economy including

agriculture, technology, construction and entrepreneurship to

name a few.

Government must continue to create funding for women owned

SMMEs in partnership with the private sector such as the Women

Empowerment Fund, Seda, and South African Women in

Construction. We understand that the most disadvantaged women

in our country are women in rural areas. If we are to achieve

economic inclusion, people from various corners of our country



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 92**

must have access to opportunities where they live. The

empowerment of rural women therefore becomes imperative.

There are many women that are dependent on the informal

economy to make a living. Supporting this economy is crucial

so that women can be able to sustain themselves and provide

for their families. The Township and Rural Entrepreneurship

Programme supports people in these sectors and the programme

aims at supporting small enterprises to participate in the

rebuilding and restructuring of the economy; improve quality

and competitiveness of small enterprises for both domestic

supply and export markets, and seize opportunities in various

sectors availed by the COVID-19 pandemic through the entire

value chains.

As we commemorated International Women’s Day earlier this

month, we must continue to struggle for an equal opportunity

country for all, a country and an economy that are inclusive.

The inclusion of women benefits the entire nation and brings

us closer towards attaining our goal of a developmental state

as envisioned in the NDP. I thank you.

Mr I MEYER (Western Cape): Hon Chairperson, good afternoon

everybody. Hon Chairperson of the NCOP, hon members, hon



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 93**

Minister and hon MECs from other provinces, ladies and

gentlemen, for 27 years we have been debating the topic of a

developmental state in South Africa. Now, we have the results

and the evidence of the developmental state. It is a captured

state. South Africa is increasingly becoming a failing state.

Chairperson, how civil servants milk the state? There is

R60 million grab. These are the headlines that greeted South

Africans on 13 March 2022. The story of the extent to which

more than 1 500 civil servants, officials were enriching

themselves at the expense of the taxpayer took me back to

another media report, this this time the *Financial Mail* dated

24 August 2020. President Cyril Ramaphosa’s letter to ANC

members about corruption and I quote from the *Financial Mail*:

Today, the ANC and its leaders stand accused of

corruption. The ANC may not stand alone in the dock, but

it does stand as accused number one.

It is clear from the letter that the President of South Africa

and the ANC, recognises the scale of corruption, often

associated with cadre deployment. He admits that the capture

of state institutions by public interest facilitated by



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 94**

politicians and officials at the highest level had indeed

occurred in South Africa.

However, he also states that based on the evidence of the

Zondo Commission:

There was a disturbing level of grand corruption, where

individuals were placed in various institutions to

manipulate procurement and other processes to siphon off

massive amounts of funds for a network of politicians,

public servants and business people.

The President then describes the effects of a wide scale

corruption in South Africa as devastating and detrimental to

the general South African public who have been robbed of money

that may have been allocated to improve public transport,

better infrastructure for the poor, the reliable and

affordable electricity, the emerging black farmers and the

broader development of our country.

With reference to South Africa’s castro state-owned

enterprises, the President admitted that many of them had been

left and I quote:



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 95**

Dysfunctional and some virtually destroyed. It has caused

huge damage to the economy and the capacity of the state.

It is against this background that I rise to participate in

this debate on building a developmental state to take the lead

in building a better life for all.

Hon Chairperson of the NCOP, the premise of this debate is

that the state has the capacity and the requisite skills to

lead. This cannot be further from the truth. We do not have a

capable state in South Africa. The sixth building blocks of a

capable state are just not present.

There is more than enough evidence to show that we have

expediently aloud standards of governance to drop. The proud

vision of a capable state is under threat and in fact it is

destroyed.

A capable state has the rule of law, competent,

accountability, integrity, innovation and has a deep respect

for the citizens of South Africa.

Hon Chairperson, none of these pillars appear to be solidly in

place.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 96**

The President’s letter highlights that we do not have the rule

of law, but the rule of lawyers in South Africa. That is why

the President appoints commissions of inquiries. That is not

the rule of law, that is the rule of lawyers. We do not have

competence, instead we have cadre deployment. We do not have

accountability, but Ministers failing to appear before

standing committees, portfolio committees and select

committees. They avoid accountability.

We do not have integrity, but gross dishonesty. We do not have

innovation, but banality, the inability to fix our ports to

build a profitable SA Airways, SAA, and establish a Home

Affairs Department that embrace the Fourth Industrial

Revolution is testimony to the malice that has crapped into

our state institutions.

The government that does not respect for its citizens, but

contempt. The ANC places its interest ahead of the citizens.

The party’s interests. The citizens do not matter. Their

attitude is one of the party first and the citizens last.

Hon Chairperson of the NCOP, if we can imagine for a second

that the state is a car, a fully functional and well

maintained. A roadworthy car has a steering wheel and a



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 97**

competent driver. A steering wheel is of no value if its

ability to respond to the driver is hampered by the driver’s

inability to point the vehicle in a clear direction.

Likewise, the lack of a clear policy direction affects the

state’s ability to deliver services to our people in a

coherent way. A vehicle without direction becomes a weapon of

destruction when its breaking system is failing. No matter how

much the driver may try to bring the directionless vehicle to

a stop, it will continue to gain momentum and create havoc.

This is what corruption and incompetence are doing to the

state. Unfortunately, no matter the number of investigations

to dish the reports, threats and promises, the driver of this

vehicle, the President of the Republic of South Africa and the

ANC, are incapable of stopping this runaway train of

corruption and a network of patronage.

The situation is worsened because the runaway vehicle’s

windscreen is covered in mud. The window wipers are not

working. The driver has no vision. Without window wipers, he

cannot clear his windows.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 98**

The state under the leadership of the ANC is visionless and

cannot rectify the situation. The blind is being led by the

blind.

Hon Chairperson of the NCOP, the state, is led by a

directionless, visionless, brakeless, incompetent ANC

government. It is creating devastation and destruction at its

headless downhill taking the economy and jobs with it.

The ANC-led state is incapable of building a developmental

state to take the lead in building a better life.

As the editor in chief of the *Mail and Guardian* recently put

it and I quote:

South Africa is not a failed state, but we certainly are not

passing, at the moment. If no one is up for the “shock”

therapy, it will take to jolt us out of our current

trajectory, it will not be very long before we are one.

Until we do so, the notion of a developmental state is

nothing, but wishful thinking. As Paul Dennis Ryder just

mentioned that just like the delusional notion that the ANC

will rule until Jesus Christ comes.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 99**

Hon Chairperson and hon members of the NCOP, we cannot provide

a continuation of that journey, but we can provide a jewel

required to put South Africa on a new path. Do so, by

supporting the DA motion of the no confidence against the

Cabinet on 30 March 2022. If you support or motion of no

confidence in the Cabinet of President Ramaphosa, you will

prevent South Africa from becoming a failed state.

If you oppose this motion of no confidence in the Cabinet of

President Ramaphosa, you are responsible for supporting a

failing state. Now is the time to save South Africa. For 27

years, this House has listened to speeches of a developmental

state. It is now or in ashes. The burning of Parliament is the

state of the nation.

South Africa is now a failing state. Many municipalities under

the ANC are a failed state. Let us stop talking about the

developmental state and start fixing the basics as the hon

Ryder said. Fix the water problems in Limpopo. Fix the

sanitation problems in the North West. Fix the electricity

problems across South Africa and fix the refuse collection all

over South Africa. These have all collapsed in the ANC

municipalities. Stop talking. Stop cadre deployment. Stop



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 100**

corruption. Stop the ANC in 2024, as the hon Isaac Sileku has

just mentioned.

Hon members, this is the time, there are moments in history

where you need to be historically correct and not politically

correct. So, I call on the members of the NCOP to do the right

thing and support the motion of the DA.

As I conclude, I call on members of this NCOP to do the right

thing. Do not be politically correct, become historically

correct and stand with the people of Ukraine and stand with

the DA motion. Please vote in our motion of no confidence to

remove an incapable state. Thank you, Chairperson.

Mr M A P De BRUYN: Hon Chair, by definition, a developmental

state needs to focus primarily on economic growth, quality

education and investment in industries, which sounds all good

on paper, but unfortunately, it is far from normality in South

Africa. Economic growth is not near expectations, educational

standards are worsening yearly and our industries are

suffering under unrealistic policies such as BBE and

affirmative action, altering growth and job creation.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 101**

According to the NDP, the aim is or was to illuminate poverty

and inequality by 2030, but clearly, this objective failed, as

poverty and unemployment is on the rise yearly. This is

clearly showing that the governing party is cannot fulfil its

mandate to ensure development in South Africa.

State-owned enterprises that is supposed to be one of the

biggest pillars of expanding state capacity and development in

South Africa have changed into a mountain of debt of almost

R700 billion in mid-2021, due to corruption, a lack of skills

and incompetent officials in top positions, as a result of

cadre deployment.

*Afrikaans*:

As die ANC regering werklik ernstig is om ’n ontwikkelde Suid-

Afrika te bewerkstellig, in belang van elke burger, sal hy

dringend op die basiese beginsels van goeie en verantwoordbare

regering moet fokus, in plaas daarvan om net op sy eie interne

belang te fokus.

Miljoene Suid-Afrikaners, wat tot beskikking en bereidwillig

is, is desperaat vir werksgeleenthede en voortuitgang, maar

krepeer as gevolg van die regering se onvermoë om die

poteniaal van ontwikkeling te benut.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 102**

*English*:

If you truly want to better the lives of all, start investing

in our citizens, empower them with skills and quality

education, ensure economic growth, so that industries and the

private sector can thrive, in order to create jobs and wealth.

Root out corruption and ensure a public service that is

accountable and productive, invest in service delivery and

infrastructure, so that the economy can heal and attract more

investors that can contribute to the development of our

country.

*Afrikaans*:

As daar voldoende fondse in die ontwikkeling van industrië

belê word, korrupsie en kaderontplooiing uitgeroei word en

genoegsame samewerking met die privaatsektor is, sonder om

hulle te kniehalter met onrealisties beleide en wetgewing sal

daar werklike hoop vir ontwikkeling en voortuitgang in Suid-

Afrika wees, sodat almal daaruit kan baat. Ongelukkig gebeur

die teenoorgestelde tans.

Ontwikkeling ten bate van almal in Suid-Afrika staan gebuk

onder ’n oneffektiewe en korrupte regering, te danke aan die

ANC.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 103**

*English*:

Government needs to admit its failure in this regard and step

up to the plate, to put its citizens’ needs before the needs

of the ANC. Until then, developing South Africa in the best

interest of all will remain a distant dream, at the cost of

all in South Africa. Thank you.

Mr T J BRAUTESETH: Hon Chairperson, hon Minister, hon members,

and fellow South Africans, we are pleased to note that the

Minister addressed us without sunglasses or a mask. Maybe it

is an indication that the State of Disaster nearing an end. We

will never know. The hon Minister Dlamini-Zuma is correct in

saying that this debate is founded on the premise that somehow

South Africa can replicate the Asian miracle of the late 1970s

and 1980s in realising the pipedream of the developmental

state.

A close analysis of the Asian Tiger countries before they

embarked on this path some 45 years ago reveals that the

following elements were present: clear policy and objectives;

independent institutions; a strong, competent bureaucracy; a

weak civil society; efficient management of state and nonstate

economic interests; elevated levels of education and training

to give these countries a competitive edge; a cohesive social



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 104**

compact; a subdued labour force; economic stability and; the

prudent use of state assets positioned to target certain

industries identified to create competitive advantages.

On the polar opposite, and conveniently not mentioned by the

Minister, the following is the reality in South Africa: we

have policy uncertainty with officials floundering between

Gear, the New Growth Path and the ambitious NDP; as

highlighted in the Zondo Commission, state capture has

permeated every strata of government machinery; due to the ANC

policy of cadre deployment, we have a weak bureaucracy,

lacking the competency required and deeply involved in

politics due to loyalty to the mother ship that deployed them;

we have a powerful, well-resourced civil society, the

government has failed to manage the economy properly and thus

have failed to pick winning sectors and create collaborative

relationships between the state, SOEs, big business, and

labour; the government has failed to create an optimal human

capital pipeline; the governing party has allowed racial

mobilisation, resulting in ever increasing civil unrest and

labour protest action; and all of the factors above have led

to disastrous macroeconomic instability.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 105**

The proponents of the developmental state here today argue on

an aspirational basis, much like the speeding bullet trains

and the new shining cities that the President is so fond of

contemplating.

What South Africa needs now is an enterprising state, not a

developmental one. We need a state that is inclusive and

eradicates the divide between insiders and outsiders; reduces

the size of the state, in order to reduce the fiscal drain on

the state; focuses on horizontal industrial policy that

creates an investment environment; formulates an economic

empowerment policy benefit the greatest number of people not

the politically connected; emphasizes welfare which helps

people out of poverty, and not trapped by the state; includes

the voices of the unemployed in labour policy; deals with

corruption decisively; enables provisions for lifestyle

audits; develops a skilled civil service is developed

underpinned by merit-based appointments and enables businesses

to provide goods and services in traditionally government

monopoly areas.

This is the course we should take. Not pipedreams that will

never reach fruition.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 106**

There is little credibility in the hypothesis that the

developmental state model can be made to work. This lack of

credibility is highlighted by some of the speakers here today.

Whilst the DA speakers, hon Sileku and hon Ryder have, during

their time as deputy mayors and councillors produced 11 clean

audits between them, the ANC are not so fortunate.

It is frankly quite laughable to have hon Dodovu, hon Masemola

and hon Hlomuka participate in this debate. Hon Doduvu hails

from the Northwest where he was previously the MEC for Cogta.

How many section 139 interventions have there been in the

North West? Anyone? I will tell you - 13 municipalities and 10

provincial departments have been placed under administration.

Hon Doduvu could not develop his way his way out of a paper

bag.

Hon Hlomuka has done absolutely nothing to improve the lot of

residents in Msundusi, also under administration, and has been

utterly missing in action during the water crisis in the Ugu

district, much to the dismay of the residents there. I doubt

hon Hlomuka can spell developmental state, much less implement

it.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 107**

Finally, the hon Masemola is more concerned with humiliating

elderly residents of Leeuwfontein on social media, than do his

actual work relating to roads and infrastructure.

With actors like these, it is no wonder that little progress

has been made. The ANC should simply submit defeat, move aside

and allow the DA to implement a plan that will work. I thank

you.

Mr Z MKIVA: Chairperson, let me start off by saying good

afternoon to you and good afternoon to the members. Thank you

for the opportunity. I want to set the tone by saying

following from what the speaker has just said. There is policy

certainty in our country. This policy certainty is informed by

the ANC’s position. That certainty is informed by our

thinking, the way we act and the way we do. It is important to

tell the opposition quite clearly that we are not in

government and in office because of love of power, but because

of the power of love. Our people have given us the

responsibility to serve and service them because of the trust

they have in us.

The ANC remains committed to the vision of building a capable

and developmental state as articulated in the National



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 108**

Developmental Plan, NDP, described as a state that is

inundated with the capacity to formulate and champion social

compacts mobilising different stakeholders, both market and

nonmarket based and lead them towards a developmental path to

resolve the triple challenges of unemployment, poverty, and

inequality.

We are fully aware that the project of building a

developmental state has been most elusive in the local sphere

of government. The 2019 General Household Survey, amongst

other things, confirms that while there has been an overall

improvement in access to basic services there were still some

notable challenges that needed the state to respond. For

example, it said that access to water in the period from 2002

to 2019, had grown from 84,4% to 88,2%. This increase was much

more notable in the Eastern Cape which is one of the most

rural provinces in our country. Despite these notable

improvements, access to water in Mpumalanga, Limpopo and Free

State had in fact declined. This is confirmed by the

experience of the people of Moluti-A-Phofung Local

Municipality in the Free State. For the past decade the

community has had to rely on water tankers for the supply of

water. They also travel long distance to fetch water from the

river. This water crisis has drastically raised the cost of



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 109**

doing business in this municipality, and as a result had a

negative impact on job creation.

In Limpopo, the water crisis is more vivid in Vhembe District

Municipality which supplies water to Makhado, Collins Chabane

and Musina Local municipalities. In these areas there is a

visible lack of water infrastructure and this has had an

impact on health care facilities and made it difficult to

respond to the COVID-19 pandemic.

The ANC supports the ongoing interventions which have been

instituted by the departments of Water and Sanitation and Co-

operative Governance and Traditional Affairs. In many

distressed municipalities these departments are making these

interventions including those that we are not mentioning

today. In line with the approach proposed in our theory of the

developmental state, we should ensure that all stakeholders

are mobilised to ensure that no one is left behind in the

provision of water and other basic services.

Hon Chair, at the heart of our programme for economic

transformation must be a strong emphasis on integrated and

inclusive rural economy. Rural areas are still characterised

by the apartheid-colonial spatiality where they were meant to



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 110**

be economically inviable spaces and many households are still

trapped in a vicious cycle of poverty. Today, rural

communities still face challenges that reinforce their

marginal status, these include communal land tenure system, a

degraded natural resource base, limited resources, reliance on

rain for agriculture, lack of access to capital, poor

supporting infrastructure, limited access to information and

knowledge of how to manage a business and limited access to

markets in general. The ANC has always been consistent in the

perspective that a vibrant rural economy has many carry over

effects on employment, reduction of inequality and poverty and

food security. In order to achieve transformation in our rural

economies, we must first acknowledge the indigenous

communities that live in those spaces, their resilient

knowledge systems or African wisdoms and the objectives of the

developmental state.

As part of the social compacts that must be formed with

stakeholders of development we must tap into the social

infrastructure in indigenous communities. This will obviously

through working relations with traditional leadership ensure

that we move to the next step. Traditional leaders still play

a crucial role in most of our rural communities as custodians

of land and water resources of indigenous communities to



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 111**

ensure fair and equal access. It is undeniable that

traditional leaders possess the required social capital to

bridge the gap between government and various community

organisations such as churches, traditional medicine

practitioners and small farmers. All these stakeholders attend

izimbizo and deliberate on issues of resource management, co-

operation between the institution of traditional leadership

and government. A lack of understanding and co-operation as

well as ignorance about the culture and traditions of all

South African people could result in our transformation agenda

being frustrated in the rural areas. We are trying to say here

that the rural communities of our country are pretty much part

and parcel of our society. Therefore, we should always try to

strike a balance between what we do in urban spaces and in

rural spaces so that no community of South Africa is left

behind when we talk transformation. This is why we must strive

to harmonise relations in municipalities between local

councillors, traditional leadership and the indigenous

communities.

In 2019, the Traditional and Khoi-San Leadership Act was

promulgated into law in this country which is a very positive

step. This was a milestone for our democracy because it was

premised on rectifying the historical marginalisation of the



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 112**

Khoi-San indigenous communities who suffered as a result of

colonial oppression. You will recall that oppressors or

colonisers arrived in the Western Cape and the first people

that they interfaced with were the Khoi and San people.

Therefore, thois is indeed a milestone that for the first time

now they will be part and parcel of the mainstream institution

of traditional leadership. That is a positive that has been

gained through the positive leadership of the ANC. This Act

provides a code of conduct for members of the national house,

provincial houses, local houses and traditional and Khoi-San

councils. It ensures that our traditional leaders conduct

themselves in a manner that in sync with democratic values and

the Constitution. Furthermore, the Act ensures the

participation of traditional leaders in municipal councils.

This we hope will go a long way in harmonising relations

between elected representatives and traditional leadership.

Following the 2021 local government elections there is a lot

of subsequent things that have happened wherein tradition al

leaders will still be constituted as part and parcel of te

municipalities. They are expected to play a very critical

role. We are already seeing traditional leaders participating

in these councils and playing a role in shaping the

developmental agenda together with elected representatives.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 113**

Hon Chairperson, the ANC supports the ongoing interventions

aimed at improving service delivery across the country. Our

priority is turning around the situation in the identified 64

dysfunctional municipalities and ensure that good governance

and service delivery are restored. Access to water and proper

sanitation is one of the critical areas of intervention in

these distressed municipalities. We are focused on building

water infrastructure as it can already be seen in

municipalities such Moluti-A-Phofung, where the Sterkfontein

Dam Water Treatment Works is being upgraded from 10 to 20

Mega-liters per day. This project is expected to be completed

by end of April this year.

The ANC calls for the prioritisation of the municipal

infrastructure grant in the 2021-22 budget of the Co-operative

Governance and Traditional Affairs, COGTA. We believe that

addressing infrastructure backlogs in water and sanitation,

roads and community lighting will able us to cement a very

good foundation upon which municipalities can be able to drive

economic transformation.

We should also promote agricultural development through land

reform. The ANC-led municipalities are already releasing land

parcels to widen access for small scale and household farming.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 114**

The state should provide support for farmers to ensure that

they are able to access markets for their own communities and

community produce. The state must also provide support to

ensure the development of skills in agriculture which in the

long run will allow for the upscaling of production. This

should be strategically done through the Community Works

Programme among other programmes. We welcome the new re-

modelled Community Works Programme which address the

challenges which had previously dampened the effectiveness

such as delays in the payment of stipends, poor financial and

project management and the undue removal of participants. The

Community Works Programme remains one of the most strategic

interventions put in place to ensure that we fight off poverty

in the most impoverished communities of our country, create

employment safety net and empower participants to acquire new

and useful skills which will allow them access better

employment opportunities. The importance of the Agrarian

Revolution Programme in the Eastern-Cape, Kwa-Zulu Natal,

Limpopo, North West and Free State should be emphasised in the

context of rural development.

Hon Chairperson, in order to ensure that we transform the

economy and make it more inclusive we need to ensure that all

sections of society participate in the digital space,



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 115**

irrespective of whether they be located in the rural or urban

areas. In the era of the Fourth Industrial Revolution new

economies are emerging. It is therefore a source of inequality

that internet access is skewed in favour of the urban areas.

The 2019 General Household survey confirmed this when it

revealed that 64,7% of South African households had at least

one member who had access to or used the internet either at

home, work, place of study or internet cafés. Access to the

internet using all available means was highest in Gauteng, 74,

6%, Western Cape, 72% and Eastern Cape, 55%. We need to change

this by enhancing telecommunications in the rural areas as

this will allow them to participate in new economy and even

access global markets. We cannot overemphasise that. We need

to invest in the infrastructure so that we can begin to lay

way leaves in the rural spaces of our country. We must not be

shy when we talk about the rural communities. That is our

added advantage as a country. We should use it as a blessing

rather than a curse. That is our antiquity, that is our

uniqueness and the sooner we begin to invest in the manner

that we are doing as the ANC government, the better we are

going to see even better results so that we can have a balance

of smart cities and smart villages. Thank you so much,

Chairperson.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 116**

The MINISTER OF COOPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL

AFFAIRS: House Chairperson, I would like to thank all the

participants who have made inputs. And in my five minutes, I

will just deal with a few. One of the members was asking what

happened to the Reconstruction and Development Programme, RDP.

The RDP is being integrated even in the Greater Tzaneen

Municipality, GTM as we speak, so the RDP is still alive.

And, let me just educate a bit, hon member who says, I enjoy

absolute power. In the ANC we work as a collective. In the

ANC-led government we take decisions as a collective. So, the

process of dealing with the pandemic, there’s the National

Coronavirus Command Council, NCCC, then from the NCCC matters

go to the Presidential Coordinating Committee, which also has

premiers who participate in that and then eventually go to

Cabinet which takes the final decision.

Let me also say that when we say that the taxi drivers did not

use taxi rank that was built for them. That’s precisely what

apartheid was doing, thinking for the people, giving them

inferior education, inferior housing and telling them where

they should live, where they should do what. That time is

gone, we consult with the people. The taxi drivers were

teaching you how a developmental state, how a democratic state



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 117**

must behave. You can’t just build a taxi rank without

consulting the people who are going to use that taxi rank. So,

I hope the lesson that they taught you, will leave with you

and will improve what you do in future.

I also want to just say that we are being told that in the

Western Cape, there is honey and milk and we being told it’s

the best place. But let me just give you one example. In the

Western Cape, the Nyanga Township in 2019 had a population of

200 332 people, but the police that were deployed there were

only 161 per 100 000. And then Camps Bay, which had 5524

people, the deployment there was 887 per 100 000 people and

you can’t tell me that, that’s good governance. That’s racism,

it’s not good governance. Of course the people who live in

those areas, like Camps Bay, Hout Bay, you name it they may

agree with you. But people who live in Khayelitsha, Mitchells

Plain and other places have a different story. So, the

developmental state seeks to give a better life for all

without discriminating.

So, I think you must disabuse yourself of this thing of cadre

deployment. You think we don’t know what’s going on in the DA.

And you were very quick to deny when the letter came out,

showing how you do your deployment. So please just give us a



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 118**

break. People who are deployed, they must have a

qualification, must be interviewed, must have competence. If

thy happen to be cadres, why not? So, as long as people are

competent, it shouldn’t matter that they are cadres, but it’s

only when people who are not competent, who are not qualified,

who don’t have a capacity, then we can talk about that. Not

that the person is a cadre per se, there’s nothing wrong with

that.

Let me also thank the ANC speakers who have highlighted a lot

of progress but at the same time saying - because we are not

shy to say where things are not right. Because, we are the

governing party and we don’t have the monopoly of ideas,

that’s why we are embarking on the district development model,

DDM. Because the DDM is not only the three spheres of

government but it involves everyone. It involves the

traditional leadership, it involves business, it involves

women, youth – everyone has a say in how development should

happen in their area, how the economy should grow in their

area and DDM brings everyone in the DDM forum. It’s not

exclusive of government [Interjection.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): As you conclude

Minister.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 119**

The MINISTER OF COOPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL

AFFAIRS: Yes, as I conclude, thank you very much. And I just

want to say to the DA, they must go and fix what’s going on in

Khayelitsha, Nyanga, Gugulethu, Cape Flats and stop making

noise here, where there are lot of problems in their own

areas. Thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon members, that

concludes the debate. Allow me to thank the Minister, Dr

Dlamini Zuma, Minister of Cooperative Governance and

Traditional Affairs and all our Members of Executive Council,

MECs, for availing themselves for this very important debate.

The House officially adjourned. Thank you very much.

Debate concluded.

The Council adjourned at 17:04.

