**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 1**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

\_\_\_\_

***PROCEEDINGS OF MINI-PLENARY SESSION - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY***

\_\_\_\_

Members of the mini-plenary session met on the virtual platform

at 14:00.

House Chairperson Mr M L D Ntombela took the Chair and requested

members to observe a moment of silence for prayers or

meditation.

**ANNOUNCEMENTS**

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Hon members, before

we proceed, I would like to remind you that the virtual mini-

plenary is deemed to be in the precinct of Parliament, and

constitutive the meeting of the national Assembly for debating

purposes only. In addition to the rules of the virtual sitting, the

rules of the National Assembly, including the rules of debate apply.

Members enjoy the same powers and privileges that apply in a sitting



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 2**

of the National Assembly. Members should equally note that anything

said in the virtual platform is deemed to have been said to

House and maybe ruled upon. All members who have logged in,

shall be considered to be present and are requested to mute

their microphones and only unmute when recognised to speak. This

is because the microphones are very sensitive and will pick up

noise which might disturb the attention of other members.

When recognised to speak, please unmute your microphone and

connect your video. Members may make use of the icons on the

bar, at the bottom of theirs screens which has an option that

allows a member to put up his or her hand to raise points of

order. The secretariat will assist in alerting the Chairperson

to members requesting to speak. When using the virtual system,

members are edged to refrain or desist from unnecessary points

of order or interjections.

Hon members, we shall now proceed to the First Order of this

mini-plenary session, which is a subject for discussion in the

name of the hon D M Stock: On expanding the comprehensive social

security system, in order to not leave anyone behind. I now

recognise the hon D M Stock from the virtual platform.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 3**

**EXPANDING THE COMPREHENSIVE SOCIAL SECURITY SYSTEM IN ORDER NOT**

**TO LEAVE ANYONE BEHIND**

(Subject for Discussion)

Mr D M STOCK: Hon House Chairperson, today we are debating the

critical aspect which is enshrined in the Constitution and its

Bill of Rights. A debate on expanding the comprehensive social

security system to leave no one behind. It directly speaks about

securing the socioeconomic rights for all South Africans. The

democratic dividends for all South Africans can only be brought

through the realisation of the promise and commitment of

creating a united and prosperous South Africa. It is critical

that we premise our debate with the correct conceptual

understanding of the comprehensive social security system. It is

comprehensive because it responds to the multiple deprivations.

The poor experience deprivations from access to basic services

such as water and sanitation, shelter, food and lack of income.

Those are some of the issues that the debate should be able to

deliberate around.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 4**

The National Development Plan states that by 2030, South Africa

should have a comprehensive system of social protection that

includes social security grants, mandatory retirement savings,

risk benefits and voluntary retirement savings. It emphasises

that part of our approach to social protection is through a

social wage which includes no-fee schools, free basic services

and subsidised public transport.

In addition to creating more jobs in the private sector, a

significant broadening of government’s public employment

programmes will also be able to help to ensure that fewer

households live above the poverty line. Addressing poverty

requires a multiple dimensional approach which a comprehensive

social security system responds to. Since the democratic

breakthrough, the ANC has placed a social wage at the centre of

transforming the lives of ordinary South Africans without

leaving no one behind. We have witnessed an increase in social

grants for the elderly and also broadened our social protection

system to include people with disabilities, child grants and

foster care grants which also brings about relief to the

vulnerable people throughout our country.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 5**

This is a commitment of the ANC to ensure that we eradicate

hunger in our nation. South Africa now pays grants to more than

46% of the population. For the current year government has

allocated approximately about R44 billion for a 12-month

extension of the R350,00 social relief of distress grant. The

legacy of apartheid has entrenched inequality and poverty in our

country.

In the process of addressing inequality and unemployment through

economic development and transformation, our caring ANC

government has ensured that the majority of poor are protected

and are being taken care of. As the ANC-led government, we went

further through the introduction of social relief of distress

grant which has demonstrated to bring about much-needed relief

for the unemployed, particularly the youth who are not covered

by the current grant payments. The grant has provided relief for

those with food security challenges. It has enabled the

unemployed to search for employment, whilst for others it has

alleviated poverty in their households.

We do not agree with the notion that we are building a welfare

state which creates a dependency syndrome on the state. This



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 6**

notion is devoid of the facts and ignores the comprehensive

nature of our social wage. The people of South Africa, black and

white pledged in the Freedom Charter that there shall be houses,

security and comfort. A major area which requires enhancement in

our comprehensive social security system is the integration of

the provision of social services in a systematic manner which

will actually be able to enable a developmental transition of

the poor to the mainstream economy.

This can be done through an integrated system which has

information-sharing capabilities which grants recipients into

educational opportunities, employment opportunities, as well as

other economic opportunities. Our social transformation seeks to

ensure that the development of our people is anchored by the

freedom to realise their potential and for them to be able to be

their own liberators.

A critical policy debate which requires Parliament’s Social

Development’s portfolio committee, in particular, to grapple

with, is to answer a question on the introduction of the basic

income grant. The level of income inequality in our country

contributes to the level of poverty. Asset poverty and landless



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 7**

for economic production are also part of the drivers of

inequality in our country. Restoring the dignity of all South

Africans is an imperative of the ANC government, in order to

improve their wellbeing of South Africans through access to

health care, access to education, skills development and a

provision of the safety net. These are democratic gains we

should continue to build on through expanding our system to

cover for the unemployed between the ages of 18 and 59.

We welcome the Expanded Public Works Programme and other

Presidential Employment Stimulus opportunities which will

support over 1 million unemployed South Africans. It will also

be able to bode well for the skills development and creating

economic opportunities, particularly for our youth and our

women. In order to address inequality, we need to all social

partners working government to enable the redistribution of

assets and income through transforming economic sectors and

creating equal opportunities.

The creation of an inclusive economy is also at the heart of

addressing the unequal economic patterns. The ANC remains

committed to advancing social policies which provides the safety



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 8**

net for the poor and also to place all South Africans on a

developmental path. I thank you, hon House Chairperson.

Ms B S MASANGO: Chair, the DA is cautiously encouraged to see

this very important matter being debated outside election season

as has been the case many times before. One wonders if the

magnitude and depth of the needs of the very vulnerable in South

African society has really resonated in these hallowed chambers

of the otherwise uncaring ANC government. The fact that we

debate this matter today, exactly 22 years since it was mooted

via a committee led by Prof Vivienne Taylor**,** proves that the

need has been in our midst and under our very noses for that

long. However, this ANC government has merely looked the other

way, hoping it would simply disappear or magically go away.

Among the sections of our population, the most neglected are

those who desperately stand to benefit from a comprehensive

social security system; those who shoulder the heaviest burden

and responsibility to provide for their families. However, this

is the group that is subjected to the most barbaric carrot-

dangling strategies during election times, primarily by the ANC

Ministers of Social Development, the ANC presidents and at times



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 9**

even the ANC Ministers of Finance, not because there were

concrete plans to implement the expanded comprehensive social

security system but because of the ANC’s need to be heard to

appreciate the struggles of millions of South Africa’s poor.

In the year 2000, the ANC government appointed Prof Taylor’s

committee to investigate ways for the state to reform the social

security system to provide comprehensive coverage for all. The

committee called for the introduction of a range of measures,

including a universal basic income grant of at least R100 a

month. The Taylor committee further noted that, as a developing

economy coping with the structural legacies of apartheid, South

Africa was unlikely to be able to create stable and meaningful

employment opportunities for all economically active adults in

the foreseeable future.

Twenty years later we are in no better a position than we were.

In fact, if we look at it empirically, we are substantially

worse off in 2022. With levels of unemployment reaching crisis

proportions due to gross corruption, the mismanagement of the

economy by the ANC government and the recent COVID-19 pandemic,

soundbites regarding a basic income grant abound. Yet, no



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 10**

concrete, reasonable plans have come forward. This display of

insensitivity to the plight of millions of South Africans is

concerning at best, and cruel and criminal at worst. Even those

who receive social grants are subjected to random annual

increases that do not begin to match the exorbitant electricity,

petrol, food and transport prices that are increased

exponentially. Households have to make do with a measly R350

grant to put food on the table.

The topic of today’s debate partly says, not leaving anyone

behind. It is a misnomer. It is the policies of the ANC

government that continues to leave millions of poor people in

South Africa behind, stuck in endless poverty with no hope of a

brighter future. These policies exclude those who need them most

to build a better life but are instead exclusive and lack

distributive capacity. They only create opportunities for self-

enrichment for the ANC-aligned elite and well connected. Those

card-carrying cadres are the sole beneficiaries of these

opportunities, while the impoverished majority languish outside

the boundaries.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 11**

The need for a comprehensive social security system in South

Africa is not in dispute. How it is done is what should be of

greater concern. According to a 2004 report of the Basic Income

Grant Financing Reference Group, which was entitled, *Breaking*

*the poverty trap:* “Nearly a decade after South Africa’s historic

transition to democracy, pervasive poverty and inequality pose

the greatest threat to human dignity and social cohesion”. This

was in 2004, and the threat posed then has continued to play

itself out in many protests by various sectors of our society.

This is a stark reminder that the ANC government left a huge

section of society behind a long time ago.

Unfortunately, government does not have the luxury of time to

ensure that it walks back to the people it has left behind. It

has no realistic solutions to what remains a real threat to

stability and cohesion in this country. It is curiously

interesting to note from the same report of 2004 that:

To date, government has yet to announce a formal position on

the basic income grant or indeed on any of the Taylor

committee recommendations. Instead, it has repeatedly

deferred a decision at successive Cabinet lekgotlas.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 12**

Given the situation we are confronted with today, it is no

wonder that this debate is not evoking the excitement and hope

it should, as history might just be repeating itself to the

detriment of so many that ought not and must not be left behind

if stability and social cohesion are to be preserved in South

Africa. I thank you, Chairperson.

Ms N N SIHLWAYI: Hon House Chair, restoring dignity of the poor

and the marginalised through the provision of basic services.

Hon Chair, we come from a very painful past where the majority

of South Africans, blacks in general and African people were

denied human rights in their country of birth. The oppressed

majority fought against colonialism and apartheid to establish a

society founded on the democratic values of social justice and

other fundamental human rights to improve the quality of their

lives and of all citizens to unleash their potential.

Hon Chair, ...

*IsiXhosa*:

... andimazi u-Taylor.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 13**

*English*:

The Nationalist Party, the Democratic Party ...

*IsiXhosa*:

... nale ngxubevange yanamhlanje ...

*English*:

... have caused an unforgettable human destruction in our

motherland. We will never forget. The new democratic South

Africa was founded within the constitutional principles

contained in the Bill of Rights as a cornerstone of our

democracy.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Connection problems.

Hon Sihlwayi, your line of connection is very bad.

Ms N N SIHLWAYI: Can I proceed, Chair?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Yes, please but your

line is bad.

Ms N N SIHLWAYI: Is it not audible?



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 14**

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Slightly you are but

you keep on breaking but you may continue or move away from that

place.

Ms N N SIHLWAYI: Okay, these rights affirm the democratic ...

[CONNECTION PROBLEMS.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): You are now gone hon

Sihlwayi, totally inaudible.

Ms N N SIHLWAYI: Let me change the position.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Hon members, patience

please.

Ms N N SIHLWAYI: Hon Chair, I was to say, the democratic state

therefore must respect, promote and fulfil these rights as

enshrined in the Constitution. In fact, Chair, it is proper to

mention their origin. The Freedom Charter policy statement of

the ANC articulates well a clear vision for our country, by

proclaiming equal rights for all who live in it. The closing

statement in the Freedom Charter reads as follows



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 15**

These freedoms we will fight for side by side throughout

our lives until we have won our liberty.

*IsiXhosa*:

Singangxanyelwa madoda, ama-350 eminyaka asiyondlwane iyanetha.

Siyeza sisendleleni, ningasingxameli.

*English*:

The social cluster therefore denotes the fundamental values of

the Freedom Charter towards the implementation of government

programme. Chair, just to raise the issues, which are these

rights that we believe are fundamental for our people that

should be protected by other institutions and by the state? The

Right to access to adequate housing, section 26 of the

Constitution. In the early 2000s a community was evicted from a

land which they had occupied under the then Oostenberg

Municipality, now known as Kraaifontein Municipality. The

community sought relief from the courts, and the Cape of Good

Hope found that the community were entitled to adequate shelter

as enshrined in section 21(1)(c) and both national and

provincial government had to intervene to rescue the community

and provide the necessary services.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 16**

*Government of the Republic of South Africa and Others vs*

*Grootboom and Others* showed that government had an obligation to

act positively in ameliorating the plight of hundreds of

thousands of peoples living in deplorable conditions throughout

their living. The court stressed with no certain terms that all

rights in the Bill of Rights are interrelated and mutually

supporting and the state must ensure that those rights are

progressively realised within the available resources. Typical

example hon Chair, that the Minister of Human Settlements is

unblocking the blocked projects because those people that have

blocked projects do not have adequate housing and therefore

government has got to see how best can it address the plight of

their people. This would ensure that no one who deserves

adequate housing is left behind.

The second right is the Right to Human Dignity, everyone has an

inherent dignity and the right to have their dignity respected

and protected. Chair, gender-based violence is a curse in our

country which needs to be addressed not tomorrow but today. In

2001 for example, two Ministers of the Safety and Security and

Justice and Constitutional Development were sued by a

complainant who was attacked and abused by someone who was



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 17**

released by courts charged with attempted rape. The woman

claimed that the two departments were negligent in releasing the

accused and that she had her dignity violated. It is a duty of

the state, therefore to protect women from all sexual violence

that they face.

The court considered a potential liability for both police and

prosecutor for releasing the criminal with such activities and

gave bail that this could amount to wrongful conduct. How could

the police and the courts release an accused who attempted rape,

without having proper measures in place to protect the

complainant? The conduct by the police and court officials

constitute negligence and should result in consequences. Now,

because of negligence of some officials, the government is now

liable for wrongful conduct. We must ensure that our police and

the courts protect those that are vulnerable and marginalized,

in particular women and children. No one should be excluded from

the basic services.

We salute the ANC-led government that in this coming financial

year, has prioritised the implementation of the national



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 18**

strategic plan of gender-based violence and femicide to further

promote and empower women in our society.

Three new pieces of legislation have been enacted and signed

into law by President Ramaphosa to strengthen the criminal

justice system and by putting in place measures to assist the

survivors of gender-based violence and femicide. We commend that

no one should be left behind, should be excluded and no one

should be erased from benefiting in basic services. Thank you

very much.

*IsiXhosa*:

Bendibuza ukuba imizuzu le yam ibilahlekile iphelele phi?

*English*:

Thank you very much.

*IsiXhosa*:

USIHLALO WENDLU (Mnu M L D Ntombela): Hayi khange ilahleke mama

ibikhona.

*English*:



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 19**

Thank you very much.

Ms P MARAIS: Hon Chairperson, allow me this opportunity to wish

my Commander-in-Chief and President, Julius Sello Malema a happy

revolutionary birthday. You are loved by South Africans because

you care for all. I also wish to greet the officials of the EFF

under the capable leadership of the President and Commander-in-

Chief who is appearing before the East London Magistrate Court

for a frivolous case by AfriForum, a racist organisation. We

will not surrender the EFF to racists because the EFF is the

only weapon in the hands of poor people. The EFF is the only

organisation fighting for the increase of social grants.

We must increase social grants for older persons from R1 890 to

R3 780 per month. We must increase social grants for people

living with disability from R1 890 to R3 820 per month. We must

increase social grants for our War veterans from R1 890 to

R3 820 per month. We must increase child support grants from

R460 to R920 per month, and we must double all other social

grants.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 20**

We cannot talk about expanding the comprehensive social security

system when the current system continues to subject many poor

people to perpetual poverty. All 12 million beneficiaries in the

SA Social Security Agency system must afford decent food and not

be visited by hunger now and again, as is the case today. To be

hungry is to live side by side with death. Black people will

continue to be death-bound subjects unless we double their

social grants.

While we continue to fight for an increase in social grants,

social grants in themselves are not the solution. Grants are

supposed to be a means to an end. While we appreciate and

acknowledge the big difference that social grants make in the

lives of our people, it is not the solution. Our people want

decent housing. Our people need food security. Our people need

to live closer to work, school, places of worship, and

recreational facilities.

We will not give our people a decent standard of living and pull

them out of poverty through social grants. The only way to

alleviate poverty is to be a country that produces what it

consumes and exports anything that we produce, a surplus.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 21**

Therefore, all Sassa beneficiaries on social grants must be

active members of the economy and must be able to earn a living

and not rely on social grants, except children, orphans, war

veterans and foster care families.

There is a clear relationship between a productive economy, a

growing economy, an economy that employs people, and poverty.

But we know that the ruling party does not have a practical or

believable plan that combines social security and economic

policy. Currently, SA Social Security System is merely a payment

system. There is no long-term plan to lift people out of

poverty. To simply add more unemployed and struggling people

into the Sassa database will not solve our problems.

While we continue to advocate for some form of grants for all

who are struggling, including unemployed people who spend a lot

of money to look for work without any assistance. As the EFF, we

maintain that a practical and sustainable solution is economic

redistribution, economic growth and industrialisation of South

Africa as a whole. We should not trust the Treasury that

continues to cut social grants budget and come here every year

to mock our people with R20, R30 and R90 increases. The sooner



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 22**

we remove the parasitic, incompetent and corrupt ruling party

from power, the better. Thank you Chair.

Ms L L VAN DER MERWE: Thank you very much Chairperson, I’ll

leave my video off, I’ve got connection issues. Hon House

chairperson, our country is on its knees under the stewardship

of the current government South Africa has been crippled by

unethical leadership, illegal migration, the disintegration of

the rule of law and other ills.

When the leaders of our country fought for freedom, they dreamt

of just that. A country free of poverty, free of fear, free of

despair and free of injustice. Sadly 28 years after the dawn of

democracy, we are far from free. Our people are trapped in

poverty, almost half of South Africa’s population counts on some

type of grant alone as their only form of income. They walk the

narrow road between hunger and starvation daily.

Our youth have relegated to the unemployment lines; they have

been relegated to the R350 Sassa pay out lines while millions

more are now discouraged job seekers.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 23**

In the phase of this devastation Chairperson, the ruling party

tables a debate on expanding the comprehensive social security

system today. Yet despite what the hon Stock said, South Africa

is already a welfare state.

Where is the ruling party’s much needed solutions? Expanding the

social welfare system is only a plaster on a gaping wound. How

are we going to lift our people out of poverty and despair and

restore their dignity? Chairperson, that is what we should be

debating today.

Let me state this as I’ve done that the IFP supports the basic

income grant yet it is very clear that government keeps dangling

the carrot that they cannot afford. South Africa’s current debt

burden is at R4,35 trillion. South Africa’s debt over the next

year or two will be projected to be R5,4 trillion, debt

servicing fees will be at R268 billion per annum alone thus

economic recovery and big might just be a distant dream.

This week a number of Ministers were implicated in corruption

and the third Zondo Commission Report. If our Ministers

alongside criminals didn’t devoir the money in our state coffers

through corruption, there would be more than enough basic income



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 24**

grants. We need as a matter of urgency to recoup money from all

those even our Ministers that stole from the state and by

extension stole from the poor.

Chairperson, expanding the social welfare system should first

and foremost focus on the child support grant with whatever

increased cost of food, caregivers are often forced to skip

meals because they cannot afford sufficient food.

It is against this background that IFP calls for an increase of

the child support grant which currently stands at R480.00 per

month well below the food poverty line of R624 per person per

month.

Expanding the social also comes with strengthening the Sassa

system. For far too long, millions have been side lined from

Sassa by criminals both within and outside government.

If we could remind ourselves that today to date, not a single

government official has paid back a single cent stolen when they

collected a R350 grant and other grants unlawfully.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 25**

Chair, finally, our immigration system has collapsed due to the

failures of the Department of Home Affairs. Far too many non-

citizens have taken employment without being legally permitted

to do so.

The IFP has proposed changes to the employment services

Amendment Bill through Private Members Bill. We would like to

see South Africans, especially young prioritised in the low

skilled market. We are happy that government has heard our

please and the Department of Labour is piloting similar

legislation which looks to get South Africans to work.

Let us change our thinking from wealth estate to a state that

considers the welfare of its people and puts them first. Thank

you Chairperson.

Ms T BREEDT: Thank you Chairperson. Chairperson, the

continuation of the R350 SRD grant will cost South Africa

R44,4 billion in the coming financial year. It means that in all

spending of social grants for 2022/23 will increase to an

unprecedented R364,4 billion.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 26**

In other words, 3,9% of our GDP or 48% of this coming year’s

budget will be spent on social wages. The Minister of Finance

was very clear last week that the R350 SRD grant will only be

extended for the next 12 months even when taking Cat into

account, it is still estimated that over the next three years,

the social wage will take up 59,4%, that’s almost 60% of the

government’s entire non interest spending.

Then the hon Stock wants to expand the comprehensive social

security system to where, with what money, how, where will we

get the money from? We currently have to borrow money to be able

to afford our current needs.

The question of today’s discussion of is in essence incorrect

and is a testament to what is wrong in South Africa today and

the government style of the ANC. The focus should not be having

more people dependant on social security but less.

The topic of today’s discussion should have been; what reforms

are made necessary to not leave anyone behind but ensure self -

sustainability.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 27**

The Minister of Finance preaches pension reform but we should be

careful when as Parliament we consider this. We do not want to

create a situation where more and more people will be reliant on

government in their old age because they spent their pension

funds during these current tough times. This will create a

vicious cycle. As is currently the case with our current old age

recipients do not even receive the minimum wage and can

therefore not even afford the most basic of needs. If they do

not have family or children to support them, they are as good as

dead.

What will then happen to our parents and our grandparents if we

do pension reforms that the Minister preaches if we allow this

to happen.

And to to add to the gloom Chair, it has recently been announced

that the teacher retention rate in basic education is worsening.

That means the student, teacher ratios will be greater in

future. Further meaning a greater percentage of unemployed

teachers but also the greater number of students not receiving

the necessary attention in schools to ensure proper employment



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 28**

in future. This of course means more people reliant on

government and of course you understand the rest of that cycle.

The hon Stock in his comments will most probably not see

anything wrong with this because that would mean an increase in

the welfare estate which they think is good.

Chairperson, the focus should be that of education, empowerment,

self-sustainability and a conducive environment for the private

sector to create jobs. We should move away from thinking that

welfare is the only option to our citizens in the current

devastating position. We should start thinking of prosperity,

wellbeing and success. It is then and only then when we will

realise what needs to happen that our focus needs to shift, that

laws need to be created to encourage job creation and

entrepreneurship and not to start entrepreneurship economic

growth and

I will conclude with age old saying, give a man fish and he eats

for day but teach a man how to fish and he eats every day.

Chairperson, I thank you.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 29**

Ms M E SUKERS: Thank you hon Chair. I wish to state that the

ACDP supports temporary relief for those in need. We cannot

however make it permanent state that disables individual agency

and human development of the young, healthy and able body. It is

important to refer back to the report of the high level panel on

the assessment of key legislation and the acceleration of

fundamental change.

One of the key recommendations referred to building human

capabilities to enable economic participation, social cohesion

and engage citizenry. Government must not do what the individual

and community can do for themselves. We have to with urgency

attend to barrier that exist for adults to enter skills

programmes and further learning.

The continued delay in implementing the nation senior

certificate for adults is one such a barrier. There is not one

person in the House that does not agree on the need for an

effective and holistic security safety net for the vulnerable.

However, we face the challenge of an untransformed sluggish

social development system.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 30**

In addressing social security and the expansion thereof, there

is a very important element that must be discussed and it is the

element of goodwill. Government should not and cannot go with it

along in providing an effective plan to address the deepening

crisis of poverty and its devastating impact on the psyche of

our people.

Goodwill has been eroded and it led to the resistance of plain

exhaustion of the taxpayer and serious social development

partners. This is a challenge in creating a comprehensive social

security system that is not only government dependent.

The second challenge is the misuse of capacity programmes aimed

at upliftment, patronage and the ever expanding supply chain

network to repair votes and buy loyalty is bankrupt political

strategy that abuses EPW programmes and NPO funding and here in

the Western Cape to Limpopo right nationwide.

Remove corruption and the perverse political strategy from

funding and social development programmes, transform the civil

service, and this is project that must be embarked upon before

you talk expansion. A corrupt system will deepen the crisis and



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 31**

exhaust the badly needed goodwill in order to create temporary

safety nets for the poor and those who need it the most. We have

to break generational cycles of poverty by transforming the

system. Thank you Chair.

Mr B N HERRON: Chairperson, the level of inequality is South

Africa’s greatest existential threat. It is not only unjust,

given the history from which our democratic country emerged, it

is wholly unsustainable. It has created a social tender box that

of deprivation and division, and last July we witnessed the ease

with which this box could be ignited.

Dismantling the deeply entrenched divisions that keep South

Africans apart must be our single overarching priority. The

truth is that our economy is unable to generate enough jobs to

reduce, let alone, eliminate unemployment. This leaves millions

of South Africans without an access to an income. A combination

of unemployment and poverty has led to increased and

indescribable hardship where poor families are starving and

scavenging for food.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 32**

The country cannot afford not to address these people’s plights.

South Africa has a well-established social assistance programme

of cash transfers but the programme excludes millions who are 18

to 59 years old the assumed age of economic activity. Section 28

of our rights based Constitution guarantees every person the

right to sufficient food, water and social security.

It is in this context that the debate about a basic income

guarantee or grant must be understood. When an economy is unable

to provide enough jobs for people to earn an income and take

care of themselves financially, then the state has a duty to

provide some social security. This is not a gift nor a handout;

it is a right.

The social relief grant that has been providing nearly 10

million beneficiaries with some cash transfers is welcome, and

we welcome the extension of it as a first step bur we need to

progress from here and provide a permanent safety net for those

who need it.

The question of the quantum of that safety net is continuously

challenging. The most recent data published by Statistics SA



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 33**

shows that the food poverty line is R624 per month per person.

This is the amount of money a person needs to purchase the

minimum daily food required to live. So, the fastest way to

achieve a comprehensive social security system is to start with

a basic income grant at least the food poverty line.

Obviously we must address affordability. Chairperson, if you

start from the premise that no adult can be expected to live

without any income, then you stop asking how we can afford it

and start asking how we can afford not to. We are not unaware of

the current financial constraints — it is a matter of

prioritisation. If the Minister of Finance follows through on

the plan to introduce zero base budgeting and identifying our

absolute priorities, it will free up significant savings. The

introduction of a basic income grant is the only way to directly

address the growing epidemic of deprivation, hunger and

malnutrition. Thank you.

Mr K L JACOBS: Hon Chairperson, in order to create a prosperous

society with a sustainable and equitable economic development

and to improve productivity for growth, the health of the

citizens is the wealth of the nation.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 34**

The aspirations of the 2030 Agenda are based on inclusiveness

and ensuring that no person is left behind which is in line with

the theme of this debate. In the same breath, the vision for the

health sector is to ensure a healthy nation for all South

Africans. This further emphasises the importance of achieving

universal health coverage by ensuring that every South African

has access to health care services regardless of their

socioeconomic status.

At the essence of human development there are three principles

that are directly linked to economic development; to live a long

and healthy life, to acquire knowledge and to have access to

resources needed for a descent standard of living.

South Africa has a comprehensive social security system as a

response to imperatives of human development. Over the

democratic order we have expanded basic services in both the

urban and the rural areas, particularly for the marginalised.

Health and economic development are interdependent, presenting

an important opportunity through the National Development Plan,

NDP, to integrate health within goals of broader socioeconomic

development.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 35**

The NDP goals are aligned to the Sustainable Development Goals

and to the AU Agenda 2063 aimed at millions of South Africans

having improved living conditions in a context where, for

historical reasons, South Africa is amongst the most unequal

societies, but much progress has been made in critical areas

such as the provision of clean water, electricity, sanitation,

education and health.

Despite this progress the poorest and most vulnerable people are

left behind. This means that there remains a need for investing

in the poorest and most marginalised towards universal health

coverage. In 2016 the World Health Assembly, WHA, issued a

ground breaking revolution together with the Rio Political

Declaration on Social Determinants of Health which commits

countries to build momentum or speed for the development of

dedicated national action plans and strategies to deal with

exclusion, in access and social determinants of health in order

to reduce health inequities.

The WHA Rio resolution recognises the fragmentation that offer

resource public health system. It underscores ... [Inaudible.]

... that leaves many people behind, underscores the African



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 36**

Charter on Human and People’s Rights, the Declaration of ...

[Inaudible.] ... and the World Health Organisation’s

constitution. All of which call for ... [Inaudible.] ... take

full responsibility for the health of the people.

Hon Chairperson, the universal health coverage then becomes of

paramount importance. It seeks to provide a preventive health

scheme shall be run by the state. Provision of free medical care

and hospitalisation for all with special care for mothers and

young children. This is what guides the ANC on the realisation

of the National Health Insurance. It is in this context that

South Africa is currently in the process of reforming its health

systems through the NHI to achieve the following outcomes. An

improved access to quality health services for all South

Africans, irrespective of whether they are employed or not. Pool

risks so that equity and social solidarity would be achieved

through the creation of a single fund. Procure services on

behalf of the entire population and efficiently mobilise and

control financial resources and to improve health systems

performance and for everyone to experience universal health

coverage.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 37**

South Africa’s ... [Inaudible.] ... the implementation of the

Sustainable Development Goals through the Domestic Developmental

Agenda and Policy. To have a good health is essential to

sustainable development and the 2030 Agenda reflects the

complexity and interconnectedness of the two. It takes into

account widening the economic and social inequalities, effort

urbanisation, threats to the climate and the environment, the

continuing burden of HIV and other infectious diseases and

emerging challenges such as COVID-19 and noncommunicable

diseases.

South Africa has made great progress in developing health

outcomes, for example, increasing the life expectancy of South

Africans such as decrease in the leading causes of death ...

[Inaudible.] ... reducing maternal mortality rate, under-five

mortality rate, neonatal mortality rate ... [Inaudible.] ...

Decrease in new HIV infections and incidents of ... [Inaudible.]

... A lot still needs to be done to realise the number of ...

[Inaudible.]

In conclusion, Chairperson, research has shown that achieving

the SDG targets depends on collaboration between stakeholders,



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 38**

government, private sector, civil society, academic research

institutions and international organisations working together

with all stakeholders and partners we can ensure that the goals

that South Africa has already met are sustained and that the

progress made before the pandemic does not roll back. Out health

care system has demonstrated its capacity through the

coronavirus pandemic which is a security health risk to the

nation.

Finally, Chairperson, we call on all people who have not

vaccinated to please be vaccinated. Remember that vaccination

saves lives. Thank you.

Mr M G E HENDRICKS: Al-Jama-ah congratulates the hon Marais on

the revolutionary maiden speech on the birthday of her

commander-in-chief – happy birthday hon Julius Malema.

In his first Sona address, President Ramaphosa announced that

every family will get a warm plate of food and no one will be

left out. After his third Sona, this has been done.

Congratulations, President Ramaphosa. Well done. President

Ramaphosa to expand the social security system, launched the



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 39**

Expanded Public Works Programme, EPWP, matriculants helping out

in schools, and Home Affairs using graduates to do scanning.

These are not decent jobs but expanding the social security

system.

To expand the social security jobs, President Ramaphosa must get

call centre jobs in our 10 000 villages. The first step is to

get successful bidders for the spectrum to provide free data to

the villages and the Department of Communications and Digital

Technologies to launch a satellite internet where the towers

cannot reach. The bidders who have satellites must be given

preference in allocating the spectrum.

Village children can work as call centre agents from home to

expand the social security system by this employment scheme so

that no one is left out. No one must be left out from earning a

living, even just to put a loaf of bread on the table. Mpame

village, where I also live, is also ready for a call centre

poverty alleviation scheme. Thank you very much, hon Chair.

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Thank you, House Chairperson, I must agree

with Dr James that, in fact, a lot of progress has been made in



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 40**

the last 27 or 28 years in the country, but at the same time,

hon House Chairperson, we must admit that with 46% of South

Africans on some form of social assistance, we cannot expect not

to leave anyone behind. When there is 34,9% unemployed and ...

[Inaudible.] ... about 42% unemployed, we cannot expect not to

leave anyone behind. When 70% of our youth in this country are

unemployed, we cannot expect not to leave anyone behind. When

seven million people go hungry to bed, we cannot expect not

leave anyone behind.

What South Africans are not looking for is a handout. What South

Africans are looking for is an opportunity to be part of an

inclusive economy. What South Africans are looking for is a

position to be able to find themselves suitable jobs so that

they do not depend on our handouts.

I have heard people talking about one thing – to increase grants

and some particular amounts of money – the question is: Should

we not be concentrating on how we must reduce the number of

people in this country dependent on social assistance and make

the rest of them, particularly the younger generation, more



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 41**

productive? That is basically what we should be concentrating

on.

House Chairperson, 79 cents estimation – and this is an old list

– out of every rand in this country is debt service books and

public sector wage bill, which means 21 cents is spent. Of that

21 cents, 11 cents are on corruption and looting, which means we

spending 10 cents in this country on delivering services to the

people on the ground.

How are you going to have a more inclusive government economy if

you are going to spend only 20 cents out of every rand on

improving the quality of lives of our people? The question is:

Is it sustainable to have ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Hon member.

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Is it my time?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): No, you can continue,

hon Emam. Somebody was disturbing us.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 42**

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Thank you, House Chairperson. I have been

doing some homework, particularly on some of the major changes

... [Inaudible.] ... particularly from the 20th of the month. If

you look at the exorbitant increases in the price of goods and

every supermarket you go to - I can name a whole lot of them –

you’ll find the prices are the same ... [Inaudible.] ... With

food prices and fuel price rising ... and remember, many of our

people - like the previous speakers have said – rely on public

transport to get to work. If a great percentage of ...

[Inaudible.] ... what have they got to live on? Thank you very

much, House Chairperson, I have run out of time.

Ms N T MKHATSHWA: Good afternoon House Chair. May I just please

kindly have an indication whether or not the ANC has any

remaining minutes from our previous speakers.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): I will check, the

will inform me, for now up to so far I am not very sure. The

staff will indicate then.

Ms N T MKHATSHWA: Thank you very much. Hon House Chair and

members, and most importantly fellow South Africans



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 43**

sanibonani(greetings). We are gathered this afternoon to debate

the motion on the expansion of a comprehensive social security

system, and ensuring that no single South African is left

behind. We debate this motion in the month of this young

democracy of ours, commemorating the Human Rights Day on 21 of

March. I find it rather symbolic as at the core of social

security systems, is the protection of citizen’s human rights by

acknowledging the need to uphold the dignity of citizens,

considering the socioeconomic, political disparities and

inequities that confront them.

Looking at the context of South Africa in particular, our

comprehensive social security system exists with an appreciation

of the need to address the structural inequities, deeply rooted

in the apartheid regime, total disregard for the basic human

rights of black people in this country.

The Background Paper on Social Protection issued by the

Presidency reminds us that, government social protection

framework is built on the principle of comprehensiveness and

thus income support social services, social insurance and the

provision of free basic services to vulnerable households



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 44**

constitute governmental holistic approach to addressing poverty.

The right to social security must be appreciated within a

broader context of government striving to alleviate immediate

vulnerabilities. However, with the medium to long-term goal for

the realisation of self-sufficient citizens.

Hon members, and I'd like hon Breedt and a number of other hon

members who spoke earlier to listen attentively to what I am

about to say. In advancing a comprehensive social security

system we must appreciate as alluded to in the National

Development Plan, NDP the importance of access to education in

empowering citizens to be active participants of the economy.

The Bill of Rights of Africa states that the right to education,

education which the ANC has resolved remains an apex priority of

government’s ... [Inaudible] ...policies and an essential pillar

of our fight against the triple challenge of poverty, inequality

and unemployment. The ANC further notes that, failure to

accelerate inclusive access to education and training, directly

threatens the achievement of this key objective.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 45**

Hon members, key elements of our comprehensive social security

system must include free education for those who cannot afford

which it does, as education is one of the cornerstones of

development. The acquisition of skills and knowledge through

education enhances citizens’ capabilities in advancing equality,

poverty reduction and economic growth, thus breaking the chain

of poverty across generations.

Inclusive access to education can be realised when free-fee

education in this country, fee waivers in this country,

scholarships, block grants, supported by nutrition feeding

schemes, scholars’ transport, free textbooks and educational

resources, student allowances and stipends to mention but a few.

Appreciating that education as part of the comprehensive social

security system, is an investment to the country’s developmental

state agenda, South Africa has allocated in this year alone, a

significant budget of R441,5 billion towards learning and

culture.

In the basic education sector, government has attempted to

create safety nets through free education, fee waivers, feeding

schemes, scholar transport free textbooks and learning materials



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 46**

to mention but a few. A comprehensive social security system

appreciates the school nutrition programme, in the fact that it

assists in ensuring the nutrition of children but also increases

school attendance. This is supported by a budget allocation of

R26,7 billion over the medium term for 19 950 schools.

Over the medium term, R6,7 billion is allocated to

infrastructure grants. In the higher education sector,

government has attempted to create safety nets through the state

funded interventions, such as the National Research Foundation,

Funza Lushaka Bursary Scheme and the National Student Financial

Aid Scheme to mention but a few. An estimate of R4,1 billion has

been allocated to Funza Lushaka with the aim of providing more

than 36 000 bursaries over the medium term. One hundred and

forty-three point three billion has been allocated to National

Student Financial Aid Scheme, Nsfas over the medium term,

benefiting an estimate of 2,5 million students over the next

three years.

So, contrary to the notion that the government recklessly aims

to create state dependent citizens, these safety nets within the

border education system aim to empower citizens with skills and



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 47**

knowledge to participate in the alleviation of deeply rooted

social conditions, such as widespread poverty, significant

levels of income disparity, vulnerability and exposure to risk.

However, this is not expressed loosely without an appreciation

of a high unemployment rates, including the high graduate

unemployment rates in this country. The Green Paper on

Comprehensive Social Security and Retirement Reform 2021

articulates that, unemployed adults aged 18 to 59 account for

about a quarter of those living in poverty. It further states

that social assistance does not currently address the need for

those who are unemployed without any means of support. The paper

recommends active labour market interventions with allowances

linked to skills development, and the Expanded Public Works

Programme, further education and training and youth unemployment

programmes. The biggest challenge we have is that, whilst the

state attempts to address systemic inequities through the

provision of skills and knowledge, the economy is not receptive

to the increasing numbers of skilled and knowledgeable citizens.

This is concerning as it may exacerbate income and opportunity

inequalities, increase poverty and possibly lead to the false

idea that there is no value add on educational investments.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 48**

This is where we must act as taught by President Cyril Ramaphosa

on ensuring that industry plays its part in job creation, whilst

the state coordinates plans and guide the development of the

economy. This must be supported by a continuous audit of the

skills need of a country’s economy, and complements thereof in

the curricula of both basic and higher education. This must be

appreciated with an understanding that modern social security

system must be designed to support job creation, by eliminating

measures that discourage labour market participation and

establishing mechanisms that promote social integration.

Hon members, President Cyril Ramaphosa reminded us in the state

of the nation address and in his response to the debate thereof

that, we ought to leave no one behind. That is why it is

important for us to see the progressive expansion of our

comprehensive social security system, that will respond to

society’s varying levels of risk. We must also state that in

order for citizens to feel that they are not left behind, we

must ensure that safety nets are easily accessible, and that

there are measures put in place for them not to be abused.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 49**

There must be modern technology, strengthen the master social

security registry and build on the consolidated Social Security

fabric interface. That is why we welcome the collaboration

between SA Social Security Agency, Sassa and Nsfas to ensure

that a student coming out of basic education, who is a Sassa

beneficiary does not have to be subjected to the dignity

stripping exercise or perpetually having to prove their

indigence, but rather the Nsfas system will automatically

identify the application and grant them a real time offer. In

leaving no one behind, we must commit ourselves to improving

access coverage, administrative efficiency, delivery and

transparency and expansion of a comprehensive social security

system.

Hon members of the DA, hon Masango, you say you want your

cautiously encouraged. I want to implore on you to decide

whether or not you are coming or going. I think the President

hon members ... and listening to many members that are

contradicting themselves as well as colleagues from hon Van der

Merwe you speak about it being a plaster but at the same time

you’re advocating for these grants and also advocating for an



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 50**

increase in funding allocation, even hon Breedt. Members are

seemingly coming or ...

*IsiXhosa:*

... andiyazi nokuba niyeza okanye niyahamba ...

*English*:

... you are coming or going, I don’t know what's going on there.

What I mean to say to you is that, we must be reminded by the

President’s state of the nation address when he said:

There are moments in the life of a nation when old

certainties are unsettled and new possibilities emerge.

The President says: “In these moments, there’s both the prospect

of great progress and the risk of reversal”. Let members be

reminded that, the path we choose now will determine the cause

for future generations.

I want to appreciate the healthy engagements, that hon ...

[Inaudible] ... have articulated. I mean, he clearly state that

social securities are not a gift, they are rights. Therefore,



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 51**

anyone who seeks to undermine the importance of social security

and want to loosely allude to them as us as the ANC government,

creating a ...[Inaudible] ... estate in fact ...[Inaudible]...

on the point of, of class privilege. We understand the

importance of these social security systems ... [Interjections]

... that colleagues will in future engage more healthily in

these debates. I thank you House Chair.

Ms A L A ABRAHAMS: Chairperson, this topic of debate is

something of déjà vu. It is a topic debated in this Parliament

before with consensus the social security system must be all

inclusive. The reality for those who live in situations of

excruciating poverty and deprivation is that the values and

rights enshrined in the Bill of Rights and Constitution such as

freedom, equality and human dignity have not yet been fully

realised under the ANC. Far too many destitute South Africans

are still excluded from receiving grants, government services

and unable to fully participate in the country’s economy and

society despite 28 years of democracy.

Millions of South Africans are already left behind such as our

vulnerable children not yet old enough to vote invisible to the



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 52**

ANC. An amount of 17,5%, over 1,8 million eligible children

cannot access the child support grant. One in four children, 27%

under the age of five is stunted. It has been like this since

1999. What of these children left behind all while the ANC

donates R50 million to Cuba?

An estimated 3,4 million children aged 0-6 years cannot access

an early childhood development programme, ECD. They too are left

behind by the Department of Social Development, with little hope

the Department of Basic Education will see much improvement. Not

to mention the Department of Social Development’s inability to

pay the R496 million ECD Presidential Stimulus Relief Fund

announced two years ago. An amount of R351 million already

rolled over from last year hangs in the balance as we draw to

the end of the financial year.

The Social Assistance Act was amended two years ago and I was

relieved to hear the Finance Minister make mention of the child

support top-up in his Budget Speech. However, if the measly

increases to grants is anything to measure by, the value of the

top-up may not serve it’s desired purposed. Perhaps Cabinet

should take a stroll down the baby toiletry isle or the



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 53**

stationery and school uniform section to get a realistic idea of

the cost of raising a child in South Africa today.

The DA maintains its position that the child support grant must

be in line with the food poverty line. The ANC at the wheel for

28 years has left government institutions incapable of

delivering an all-inclusive, all access social security system

with the ANC themselves the primary obstacle.

Government is fragmented in the delivery of the basket of

services to the destitute. Before one can access the SA Social

Security Agency, Sassa, grant, tertiary education or employment,

a birth certificate or ID is required, a known failure of Home

Affairs. The bankrupt SA Postal Service, further burdens the

poor with increased travelling expenses to the next service

point as more offices close.

We speak of a social security floor, but the only floor many

know is the concrete payment outside of SASSA. The absence of a

central information management system, a one stop shop, sends

South Africans into a maze of nondelivery, leaving people

behind. Social security cannot be looked at in isolation and



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 54**

requires a whole of government and society approach. In times of

crisis South Africans open their hearts and donate generously.

Nongovernment organisations, NGOs, in particular are on the

frontline shouldering the burden of government service delivery

failures yet are first on the chopping block when it comes to

budget allocations.

The 2021 Social Security Peer Review shows South Africa is rich

in civil society partners who should play the dominant role is

shaping the policy space for social security. I just hope

Minister Zulu takes the recommendations to heart and it was not

just another annual performance plan, APP, tick box exercise.

South Africa is a signatory to range of international treaties,

declarations and conventions on the issue of social security and

poverty alleviation. The ANC’s own National Development Plan has

a vision for a comprehensive social protection floor by 2030.

But without concrete implementation plan South Africans will

continue to languish in poverty with nondelivery the only

certainty.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 55**

The social contract which the President spoke about in his state

of the nation address, Sona, address, can only be built on the

foundation of trust. The ANC has time and time again broken this

trust. Therefore, the only way to honestly leave no one behind

is through a new government in 2024. The DA once again invites

all to read our offer and solution to addressing inequality in

our economic justice policy. A sustainable development goal

model. A plan for South Africa to beat the past and build the

future. I thank you, Chairperson.

Mr W M MADISHA: Chair, we need a comprehensive social security

system that has the capacity to create a set of benefits that

are guaranteed for larger sections of vulnerable South Africans.

I here refer to millions of the poor and the unemployed. I must

remind you that South Africa is considered to be number one in

the whole world when it comes to unemployment and yet only 1% of

South Africans owns 41% of our country’s wealth.

The presently proposed social security system lags a coherent

inclusive platform for a restructured system that involves

especially millions of vulnerable South Africans. It lags an

inclusive and comprehensive system which is long overdue. It



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 56**

lags a clear vision of how a government will counter what

already overflow in the department, namely, maladministration,

corruption, loss of public confidence, individual greed and many

more challenges. It is more interdepartmental and multitier. It

lags the capacity to create a set of benefits that are

guaranteed for larger sections of the vulnerable South Africans.

I must emphasise that the issue of joblessness that you have

sited goes very far beyond what’s purported and something must

be done. The majority of people who are given jobs are non-South

Africans because those who employ them can exploit them very

easily. The employers do not follow the Labour Relations Act and

all those particular laws that are supposed to be followed. One

supposes the objective of implementing the child support grant

and the basic income grant. It is a fact that in the milieu

which we exist South Africans will continue to die unless they

are implemented. But the question that we must ask is, when will

this be done because our people are swimming in a very serious

sea of poverty and death? Thank you very much.

Mr D M STOCK: Thank you very much, hon Chairperson. We have

heard from different debaters of this motion: Expanding the



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 57**

comprehensive social security system. We all agree that we need

to improve and transform the conditions of the majority who have

been marginalised by colonialism and the apartheid system, which

ensured that it deprived the blacks and Africans in particular.

All these deprivations are the legacy of apartheid which should

be addressed by the ANC democratic government, to equalise the

inequalities that we find throughout our country.

The ANC from the Reconstruction and Development Programme to the

National Development Plan, NDP, has placed the provision of

social services and expansion of a comprehensive social security

at a high level, which is very consistent. As the ANC, we have

made an imprint in the fibre of the nation, we entrench ubuntu,

by being the caring government. The government has walked with

all the social partners from business, labour, civil society

organisations, traditional leaders and the people of South

Africa in general, to build a society which guarantees a

wellbeing and social protection of all its people.

Hon members and House Chairperson, Dr Kenny Jacobs has actually

clearly outlined the efforts of government in ensuring access to

healthcare for all South Africans and also a National Health



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 58**

Insurance, NHI, for all South Africans. This is going to

guarantee access to quality healthcare and various

specialisation for the poor, which will actually be market

driven. There is a progressive policy which the ANC has

committed itself to realise in the near future.

Hon Mkhatshwa has also outlined the intervention in education

and skills development to improve the nation’s human

capabilities in order to build developmental state and inclusive

society. We must never tell untruths to the people of South

Africa, and claim that nothing has not been done to change the

living conditions of the poor. We can also not claim that all

the challenges affecting our people, have been resolved.

But what is a fact and a least reality for many South Africans

is that, we have changed a lot of systemic social and economic

variants which reproduced poverty throughout our people’s lives.

Our programme of social transformation for self-liberation is

indeed on course. We need to ensure that we radically transform

the economy of the country in order to build an inclusive

economy which will address the racial nature of distribution of

assets and income.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 59**

Socio-economic transformation is imperative to guarantee the

socio-economic rights of all South Africans. Economic growth

should be redistributive through growth of labour intensive

industries and high productive centres. The government has

expanded social wage, and the private sector working with

government and labour, can increase job opportunities and

reinvest in the economy for the economic growth to increase our

tax revenues and to further expand the social protection.

The President of South Africa, hon His Excellency Mr Ramaphosa

has called on all social partners to engage on a Base Income

Grant, BIG. Hon Masango from the DA, does not tell the people of

South Africa that the ANC government has ensured that nearly

half of the population currently receives at least one social

grant from the state implementing imperatives in the tailored

report which was commissioned by the ANC government. The

household income of the poor is secured through our

comprehensive social security system.

This hon member from the EFF who has actually participated in

the debate through her maiden speech, has actually made

contributions, but because it’s her maiden speech, I will



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 60**

actually not respond to what she has said in the debate. We will

actually be able to attend to those issues in the next debate.

Hon Breedt from the DA, our comprehensive social securities

anchored by education and expanding skills development, is not

limited to grants, ours is empowering the poor for self-

liberation.

We have largely agreed in this debate that we need to provide a

safety net through a Basic Income Grant for the poor, except

from the FF Plus, for obvious reasons, of course. As the

legislative arm of the state, we need to continue engagement and

mobilise social partners in forging a pathway for Basic Income

Grant to transition grant recipient into a labour market in

education and also skills development opportunities. We should

also play our oversight function to ensure that government

programmes achieve their outcomes, because fiscal allocation by

government can bring about a change and also leave no one

behind.

Hon Chairperson, let me thank all the members who have actually

participated to the debate, and who have actually made positive

contributions in the debate. Unfortunately, to those who came to



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 61**

the debate to play politics and to just and to just flirt their

party line, I’ve got nothing to say to them, but I just hope

that they will change. Next time, when issues if this magnitude,

issues that are before us which are very important, they must be

able to put their party line aside and be able to build on an

issue at hand. Thank you very much to all those who have made

contributions, and I also thank you very much, hon Chairperson.

*Setswana*:

Ke a leboga.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Thank you, hon Stock.

Hon members, that concludes the debate. We shall now proceed to

the second session of this mini-plenary session, which is the

subject for discussion in the name of hon K J Milleham, on the

negative impact of the rising costs of electricity and other

forms of energy on the Republic. I now recognise the hon K J

Milleham.

**THE NEGATIVE IMPACT OF RISING COSTS OF ELECTRICITY AND OTHER**

**FORMS OF ENERGY ON THE REPUBLIC**



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 62**

(Subject for Discussion)

Mr K J MILEHAM: Chairperson, South Africa and her people are

suffering. It’s not just the days and weeks without electricity

that affect us, but also the spiralling costs. We are expected

to pay, and pay, and pay, and pay, for an entity that can only

keep the lights on and its generation plants running 59% of the

time, according to the latest Eskom System Status Report.

Eskom’s tariff has increased by 9,61% over last year’s tariff.

And while that was significantly lower than the 20,5% Eskom had

requested, it is still more than double the country’s official

inflation rate. It was only through the sustained efforts of the

DA, the various municipalities where we govern, and civil

society organisations, that Nersa heard the call to limit

Eskom’s increase.

And yet, given that Eskom and Nersa are once again in court

arguing over the tariff determination methodology, we await the

court’s judgement to hear whether a further R59 billion will

have to be recovered. If so, consumers and businesses will once



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 63**

again be expected to foot the bill for ANC mismanagement,

incompetence and corruption over many years.

One only has to look at the mess that are the Medupi and Kusile

coal plants, to see what happens when comrades and cadres are

permitted to loot freely. Let us not forget that much of our

electricity pricing issues arise from Eskom debt incurred to

build these two power plants, and facilitated by the likes of

Chancellor House and Hitachi Power Systems for the benefit of

the corrupt and thieving ANC. And it was done on the watch of

one Samson Gwede Mantashe, our esteemed Minister of Energy, who

at the time was the Secretary-General of the ANC, and intimately

familiar with the dealings of Chancellor House. These two mega

plants which were supposed to end load shedding, have an energy

availability of just 63,3% at Medupi and a shocking 24,5% at

Kusile according to the most recent data available.

Chairperson, the price of 95 Octane petrol has increased by 44%

since January last year. In the same period, diesel has

increased by 13% and illuminating paraffin by 20%. At the time

that the Basic Fuel Pricing model was introduced in 2003, South

Africa was a net exporter of refined petroleum products.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 64**

Over the past two decades, however, that situation has changed

dramatically, and the country is now a net importer, and given

the recent closure of four of South Africa’s refineries in the

past two years, the situation has only worsened. As a result,

the Basic Fuel Price Model is no longer the appropriate

methodology to determine the price of liquid fuels. It is

absolutely unacceptable that a full third of the price we pay

for petrol goes into government coffers, not to secure our

energy future, but rather to pay for general government’s

expenses.

This is not a caring government. It is a government that is

robbing consumers to pay for its own flagrant excesses,

wastefulness and corruption. [Interjections.]

AN HON MEMBER: Where is the robbery?

Mr K J MILEHAM: Sorry, Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Hon member, please

don’t do that.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 65**

Mr K J MILEHAM: Don’t do what, Chair?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): No, there’s a person

who has just disturbed us. Please go on, hon Mileham.

Mr K J MILEHAM: Thank you, Chair. In this regard, we are pleased

that Minister Mantashe has heeded our request to comprehensively

review both the pricing of liquid fuels and electricity. We

welcome his acknowledgement on Tuesday that high energy prices

are perpetuating energy poverty, and that the formula used by

Nersa to determine the price of electricity is, to quote the

Minister, “backward”. Yesterday on Radio 702, Dr Dale McKinley,

a noted political economist said, speaking of the war of Russian

aggression in Ukraine:

It’s not just at the fuel pump that we are going to feel

this immediately. There is a huge range of knock-on

effects. It goes across the board and it hits the consumer

very hard. It seems we are far away from this political war

in Europe. Economically, it’s a global issue and

particularly for South Africa, it’s going to hit us very



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 66**

hard, and it’s going to hit most obviously those who are

least able to afford it.

The reality is that we have not yet begun to see the impact of

the despicable Russian invasion in Ukraine in fuel pricing. That

will only really impact on next month’s prices and one aspect

that has not been considered is the impact that this will have

on electricity pricing. Remember that we use diesel to fuel

Eskom’s peaking plants, many of which now run almost 24/7 at

great expense to keep the lights on and minimise load shedding.

In fact, Chairperson, if we were to allow more competition, ease

the difficulty of doing business, and reduce the heavy-

handedness of government price setting, we would undoubtedly be

in a far better position economically. Instead, government takes

its cut on every litre of fuel and kilowatt of electricity, and

as a result, businesses are closing their doors, citizens are

becoming unemployed and more South Africans are seeking greener

pastures. This government has a lot to answer for.

The rotating door of Ministers of Energy has done little to

resolve the crisis, whether of generation capacity or



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 67**

electricity and fuel pricing, because the Ministry is captured

by the same disease that affects everything the ANC touches: a

complete lack of accountability and willingness to accept the

consequences of their actions.

Nearly every entity in the Department of Energy is in the red.

The Auditor-General has repeatedly highlighted supply chain

management issues and irregular expenditure. The department and

its entities fail to meet the most basic of key performance

indicators, and yet somehow, life goes on and no one is held

responsible.

In the meantime, it is ordinary South Africans who continue to

suffer. And so we get to the nub of the matter: What is to be

done? We need to address the affordability of refined fuels and

electricity in a manner that ensures meaningful systemic change,

and does not merely pay lip service to resolving this issue.

When the prices of fuel and electricity increase, every other

product and service becomes more expensive as a result of the

knock-on effect.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 68**

Ordinary South Africans struggle to satisfy their daily needs,

whether that’s transport, heating, cooking, lighting,

manufacturing or countless other activities. The cost of living

in South Africa has become unaffordable, primarily because of

above inflation increases to fuel and electricity prices; costs

which are, if not totally in the control of government, are

certainly far more susceptible to government manipulation and

management than in a deregulated economy.

The DA has been clear and unequivocal in its call on national

government. Unbundle Eskom and create a truly independent grid

operator; open up the grid to competition, and remove the cap on

renewable energy generation in the Integrated Resource Plan;

make it easier, through a concerted red-tape reduction

programme, for municipalities, businesses and consumers to

either generate their own electricity or to procure directly

from independent power producers; and incentivise the

importation and local production of electric vehicles to reduce

the reliance on refined fuels; deregulate the fuel sector and

allow the free market to determine pricing and more

specifically, get rid of the unaffordable taxes and levies that

government use to cover their incompetence and corruption; and



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 69**

abandon all plans to purchase Sapref or other refining capacity.

Government has proven over and over again that it cannot run

businesses effectively, and a massive investment would be

required to bring this plant up to the proposed clean fuel

standards.

Chairperson, South Africa cannot afford to wait for another

government talk shop, indaba or task team to address the crisis

of affordability it now faces. If Minister Mantashe is not up to

the task of addressing the problems in our energy sector, he

must go! Thank you, Chair.

Mr T B MUNYAI: Point of order, Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): What is your point of

order, hon member?

Mr T B MUNYAI: Sorry Chair, he has already finished and is

already off the floor. I wanted to clarify this matter, hon

Chair. The price of petrol ...



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 70**

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Hon member, I have

not given you ... [Interjections.]

Mr T B MUNYAI: Oh, no problem!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): ... to do that.

Mr T B MUNYAI: Thank you, hon Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Thank you very much.

Hon members, may I make you aware that, as I call the hon Magaxa

to the platform, hon Mina Lesoma will be taking over. Are you

ready, hon Mina?

Ms R M M LESOMA: Yes, hon House Chair, Ntombela.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Okay. Hon Magaxa, go

for it.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Hon House Chair, the country’s electricity demand

has grown since 1994. As the ANC-led government, we have

systematically supplied electricity to communities who were



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 71**

historically deprived of basic services under apartheid. This

means that the majority of the population suffered from energy

poverty, which deprived people of a dignified, modern and

civilised style of living.

The ANC-led government sort to transform the lives of the

majority by providing basic housing, water and electricity. This

supply of the basic services also extended itself to indigent

and poor households receiving free electricity units and water.

This was part of its campaign of creating a better life for all.

The economic growth and development in the country, since 1994

has also increased the demand for electricity. I think it is

important for the previous speaker to take that into

consideration. The country has an electricity supply shortfall

due to growth in demand and not timeously increasing generation

capacity.

The Sona 2020, addressed this matter of increasing the supply of

electricity through increasing generating electricity through

renewable energy projects.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 72**

Accordingly, regulatory measures for the development of this

project have been promulgated. The expansion of green energy

also created opportunities for industrialisation and job

creation.

The economic thinking of that sort come from the black, green

and gold economic book of the ANC, not from some unutilised and

untested blue book. Based on our energy demands, South Africa

has traditional multiple energy carrier such as renewable, coal,

hydroelectricity and nuclear. This multiple energy carriers also

contribute to security of supply.

The largest supplier of cheap electricity in South Africa has

historically occurred through coal generation. This has served

as the backbone of the developments of mining, agriculture and

industry.

However, with the high global level of carbon emissions and

climate change, the country has international commitments to

reduce its carbon footprints.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 73**

The ANC-led government has declared that this will occur through

a just transition. The rational for just transition is to ensure

that the country is able to effectively supply its electricity

demand to ensure the economic growth and development as well as

ensure ...

[Interjections.]

Mr N M PAULSEN: Where is your tie and your jacket?

Mr K E MAGAXA: More over the government must address energy

poverty if the majority of the people are able to participate in

the Fourth Industrial Revolution. The country has an energy mix

that is contained in the integrated resource plan. Government

seeks to expand all energy resources to ensure that the

country’s electricity demand is met and enabled at an economic

reconstruction and recovery plan which includes beneficiation,

organisation and industrialisation. This is aimed at job

creation and a reduction of triple challenges of poverty,

inequality and unemployment.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 74**

In the case of coal generation, it is imperative that government

continue pursuing clean coal technologies and carbon capture and

storage with other countries such as China, Germany, etc among

others.

Nuclear energy generates cheap electricity without the mission

associated with coal fired plants. Natural gas is another clean

source of energy. The recent finds along the coast of the

country and in neighbouring countries is an energy source which

need to be utilised to power the economies of the region and

creating the standard opportunities for beneficiation.

It is also pleasing to note that the President in Sona 2022

highlighted the development of the KwaZulu-Natal Water Project

which included a hydroelectric plant which is clean source of

energy which will provide cheap electricity.

Expansion also include growing the renewable energy industry to

supply electricity. However, the renewable sector has well-known

limitation which it has not yet overcome. Namely power storage

capacity, power generation and lack of the economy of scale.

Experts have already estimated that only 30% of the country’s



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 75**

overall electricity demand can be supplied through renewable

energy. This means that while clean energy is the future it will

not be fully supplied through a renewable energy as the hon

Mileham is obsessed with in his recent article.

The cost of electricity in South Africa is graduated through a

transparent formula and is determined through an arm’s length

process by National Energy Regulator of SA, Nersa. Therefore,

the cost is not determined by the government. Increases are

based on input costs, assets and revenue requirements. The

process is very rigorous as Eskom’s circular recently applied

for a tariff increase of nearly 20% which Nersa declined and

reduced it to 9,61% based on its formula and calculations.

Therefore, Nersa’s approved tariff increase balanced the

interests of all stakeholders, namely government, Eskom,

business and ordinary poor residential communities. The Nersa’s

guidelines also determine municipal tariffs to improve the

current distribution model as all municipalities apply for

tariff approval.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 76**

This is an area of concern as the level of profit which some

municipalities make from electricity and water is a grave cause

of concern especially for the poor and the working class.

This also negatively impacts on the middle strata as it erodes

disposable income and reduce savings.

It is very concerning that in some parts of the country such as

the Western Cape, the cost of electricity and water to the

people is extremely high. In addition to the high electricity

tariff, there is a supplier surcharge and connection fees that

are paid every single month as if there are monthly connections.

Therefore, the blue book is based on dubious market economics if

this is the practice. Electricity and water is for the common

good and not of something where municipalities should be seeking

super profit, as it is the case in the City of Cape Town. This

causes structural inflation in the economy and discourage

investment in the economy as basic inputs costs are high.

Take a real life example, of a renewable energy project in the

Western Cape such as Darling Wind Farm which was a project



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 77**

located here. It supplied electricity to the City of Cape Town

at 48 cents a kilolitre, while at the time the retail cost of

prepaid electricity was 129 cents per kilolitre, which is

criminal. This indicates a profit margin of over 200% the

breakeven cost for production by the Darling Wind Farm was 68

cents a kilolitre and when the company attempted to negotiate

with the DA-led City of Cape Town to pay the breakeven costs,

the city refused even though it would have still made a 100%

profit.

This real life example forced one of the earliest renewal

project in fact forced that particular company to be liquidated

due to the intransigence of the City of Cape Town.

Those who stay in the glass house must not start violence of

throwing stones. In fact, hon Chairperson, it is important that

an audit must be conducted on the level of profit which

municipalities make from electricity and water as this certainly

require regulation to prevent high earned costs. The DA in the

Western Cape especially the City of Cape Town is still charging

people those charges when there was drought, despite massive



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 78**

rains taking place on daily bases. People are still paying

triple.

Services in the Western Cape are supplied to selective parts of

the province not the majority. Increasing costs is the only way

the City of Cape Town engages in selective supply in order to

undermine and press down the poor. For they are obsessed with

inequalities. The City of Cape Town only works on high costs.

That is how they continuously create inequalities and bringing

back the apartheid system. These increases in costs translates

into high tariffs and in turn erode disposable income and places

hardship on the working class, the poor as well as the middle

strata in the city.

This neoapartheid is not a mistake, as it is designed to

increase poverty, inequality and unemployment.

In conclusion Chair, as I am sitting here, in my area, we do not

know when the dustbins were last taken by the City of Cape Town.

While people here in Cape Town are paying almost triple R1 200

per month, but still those people are still suffering the poor

services of the DA-led government. Thank you. [Time expired.]



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 79**

Mr M J CUTHBERT: Hon Chairperson, the decision by National

Energy Regulator, Nersa, to hike electricity tariffs by 9,61%,

coupled with a petrol price increase of R1,46 per litre and

diesel price increase of R1,48 per litre is a punch to the gut

which South Africans can ill afford.

Recently, the South African Local Government Association, Salga

has reported in the *Citizen Newspaper* has electricity prices

have increased by an astronomical 307% since 2009.

If the fact that more than one in three South Africans find

themselves unemployed wasn’t bad enough, those who are fortunate

enough to have a job have seen their income eroded by 5,1% since

December 2019, according to the BankservAfrica Take Home Pay

Index. According to the latest Household Affordability Index, by

the Pietermaritzburg Economic Justice and Dignity Group. Year-

on-year basket prices have increased by 8,9% outstripping

headline inflation. The cost of the average household food

basket increased by R354,52 from R4001,17 in February 2021 to

R4355,70 in February 2022.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 80**

The moral of the story is each time you raise input costs,

businesses pass these costs into the consumer and South Africans

become poorer. There is little doubt that a large proportion of

the input cost passed to consumers are as a result of the

incessant energy hikes meted out to them year after year.

Instead of focusing on bringing more generating capacity on to

the grid, introducing competition into the energy market and

investing in alternative sources of energy government has set on

its hands. All the while both businesses and consumers have been

forced to purchase the electricity through the state-owned

monolith Eskom, that is of course contingent on its ability to

deliver on its commitment to supply you with electricity.

As we know, hon Chairperson, it’s been more a case of lights out

than lights on since 2007. Despite the limited reprieve offered

by government in allowing 100megawatts of self-generation during

2021 and symbolic movement towards splitting up Eskom up Eskom

into three separate entities, energy reform has never been a

priority for this government. That is where the DA enters the

ring, hon Chairperson. Having recently adopted our revitalised

energy policy at the sitting of our federal council this past



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 81**

week. We can criticise the government until we are blue in the

face but, if we fail to table alternatives then we are not

serious about the business of government.

Some of the key interventions we aim to implement when we form

part of the governing coalition are as follows. Realising a just

energy transition by investing in the reskilling and retraining

of workers for the green economy, incorporating renewable energy

into the market at a faster pace by removing restrictive caps on

the uptake of renewable energy, containing energy prices and

expanding capacity by removing Eskom from the electricity

generation business and creating a more competitive and

diversified energy market, improving energy efficiency by using

evidence-based interventions such as time-of-use tariffs, load

shifting, solar geysers and mixed forms of generation, setting a

more ambitious emissions reduction target that would more

closely align with the Paris Climate Agreement and, finally,

allowing municipalities to generate, consume and sell their own

electricity.

The fact is South Africans have been left punch-drunk by the

price hikes over the last few years and only the DA has a



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 82**

tangible path forward towards realising an energy secure future.

I thank you.

Ms P MADOKWE: Thank you very much, House Chairperson. In the

not-too-distant past, South Africa was one African country that

was repeatedly projected to be a world-class participant with

similar standards to developed countries. However, our beloved

country has sunk into chaos and darkness, both figuratively and

literally during the last decade or so.

With each passing year, it is marked by all of the traits that

characterise underdeveloped countries. Growing unemployment,

exponential job losses, high crime rates, decreasing education

standards, absurd minimum wages, an unrepentantly corrupt

leadership, and so on.

As expected, our government’s recent state of nation address,

sona, and Budget Speech show no hope of rescuing the economy or

creating jobs, as our government has dismally failed to produce

plans for economic recovery or fiscal sustainability, is hell-

bent on auctioning off our state-owned enterprises, SOEs, and is

tying us and future generations to paying debts rather than



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 83**

developing our country by raking in debt from the International

Monetary Fund, IMF, the World Bank, and other global loan

sharks. The average South African household is taking in less

money, after numerous job losses. The cost of living, especially

for basic necessities such as electricity, fuel and other forms

of energy generation has become unbearable.

The recent increases in electricity and fuel prices are a cruel

addition to poor people’s agony. Low-income households can

barely make it as is, young people are sinking into depression,

small businesses are still grappling with the consequences of

COVID-19, and the consequent increase in food prices, transport

prices and further limited access to basic goods and services

does not make things easier.

The privatisation of Eskom through the introduction of

Independent Power Producers, IPPs, instead of building internal

capacity, as projected, has had no impact on electricity

generation or access for disadvantaged households. Instead, it

has assured profit maximisation and that access to electricity

is limited to the wealthy, as a result of these price hikes.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 84**

The EFF has long warned against giving a massive and critical

duty like guaranteeing a reliable and inexpensive electricity

supply to a clueless De Ruyter, whose entire strategy has

revolved around sucking Eskom dry and then selling it off for

next to nothing.

The government must implement an elaborate energy strategy based

on a broad energy mix that balances the use of fossil fuels and

renewable energy resources ... [Inaudible.] ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms R M M LESOMA): Proceed hon member. You

have muted yourself again.

Ms P MADOKWE ... Apologies for that Chairperson. The government

must implement an elaborate energy strategy based on a broad

energy mix that balances the use of fossil fuels and renewable

energy sources while taking climate change and the country’s

developmental needs into account. South Africa must not allow

itself to be bullied by Western nations which emit the most

carbon and whose development pathway was on the backbone of

fossil fuels.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 85**

The line between environmental imperialism and environmental

protection is razor-thin, and the West’s newly discovered

environmental consciousness of convenience must not dictate how

South Africa should manage its energy generation. Communities,

on the other hand, must not be bullied into surrendering their

homes and livelihoods. The concerns raised by communities about

foreign fuel firms such as Shell, conducting seismic surveys on

our coasts are reasonable and should be taken into account,

rather than the arrogant dismissal that has dominated the

discourse.

The government’s failure to deregulate the fuel price, saying

that South Africa is not market ready for deregulation, has

resulted in repeated and significant fuel price spikes. The

petroleum industry is highly monopolised, with little to no

support for emerging local and black-owned businesses, and the

government has failed miserably to level the playing field

between wholesalers.

Notwithstanding some of the international variables beyond our

control that influence the basic fuel price, the government has

been unable to account for the highly unjustifiable 15% freight



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 86**

premium or its failure to engage freight companies on this

ridiculous amount.

If the freight premium was introduced at a time when the

Southern African coast was considered dangerous and plagued by

piracy and that is no longer the case, why has our government

allowed for the extortion of South Africans for so long?

The inclusion of Road Accident Fund, RAF, levies which have been

poorly managed over time, in the basic fuel price makes no

sense, and as a result, all local factors that affect the basic

fuel price should be reviewed, and a more equitable and rational

pricing model should be implemented. There is no justification

for such frequent fuel spikes since inland countries such as

Lesotho and Botswana, which buy fuel from us, can sell cheaper

fuel than us.

The EFF has long warned against the dangerous concoction of the

private sector’s exploitative nature and a government that has

relinquished its basic responsibilities of service delivery and

policymaking to the private sector.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 87**

We should all be concerned about this year’s state of the

nation’s address, sona, over-praise of the private sector and

the dangerous decisions that followed, including price hikes.

Having said that, we applaud the Department of Mineral

Resources, DMR,’s commitment to safeguard PetroSA from private

sector vultures yearning for its demise, and we hope that a

similar amount of effort will be put towards exploiting

challenges faced by refineries and developing existing

facilities into a South African mega refinery through

collaboration by relevant departments. Such measures should

result in lower energy generation costs and thus ensure fairer

and more regulated prices for our people, particularly those

from low-income communities who should always be at the centre

of all government initiatives. Thank you very much, Chair.

Mr S S ZONDO: Hon House Chair, South Africa, in its current

state, has one of the worst energy policies and strategies in

the world. Our energy needs as a country are met with

inconsistent access, poor quality and harmful impacts to our

citizens. However, the lack of attention paid to the energy

crisis in South Africa has a marked impact on all citizens of

this country, especially the poor.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 88**

In late February 2022, the National Energy Regulator of SA,

Nersa, awarded Eskom the right to increase electricity rates by

9,61%, after it had initially requested almost double that.

Already our people are struggling to pay the current electricity

rates, and for what? We regularly see load shedding, so it

cannot be for the reliability of the system. The high rate

increase also cannot be justified by Eskom’s ability to provide

universal access, as many South Africans still cannot access

electricity in their places of residence.

The truth of the matter is that our policies on energy are at

least 10 years behind the rest of the world. Therefore, we are

observing illegal electricity connections in townships and other

informal dwellings, as there is no alternative and electricity

is unaffordable. Ironically, we are meant to be progressing at a

fast rate to a just energy transition, where we start giving

local communities affordable access, stakeholdership and

sustainable power so that they may develop their communities.

In this sense, His Excellency, our President Emeritus, Prince

Mangosuthu Buthelezi’s words ring true, when he voices his

“concern with the political will, and the ability, of the ruling



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 89**

party to do everything the President has committed to do in his

state of the nation address”.

In our current situation, electricity is a real obstacle to

employment in South Africa. With the ever-escalating tariffs and

persistent load shedding, small businesses cannot afford to keep

their doors open. Small businesses require constant turnover in

order to survive and pay employees. Eskom must be held directly

accountable for its contribution to the half-million job shed

last year.

The absurdly high cost of energy has a devastating effect on

addressing youth unemployment in South Africa. The struggling

youth find it increasingly difficult to find jobs in an already

declining economy, yet their energy demand remains valid, albeit

unaffordable. Added to this are the numerous fuel price

increases, the most recent attributed to the inhumane Russian

invasion of Ukraine, further preventing the youth to go out and

actively seek jobs.

The reality of the expense when taking a taxi or any other type

of unreliable public transport provides a life-or-death choice



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 90**

of whether to seek employment or let their families starve. The

high cost of electricity tariffs also means that staying at home

and doing desktop work is now a luxury.

The increase in the overall energy, electricity and fuel costs,

will further slow down our economy and entrench the ongoing job

losses we have become used to. This will happen as a result of a

slower tourism and transport sector, as people are less inclined

to travel locally and support local businesses.

If we do not address the escalating costs of energy ... [Time

expired.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms R M M Lesoma): Hon member, your time

is up! In future, you must learn to time yourself. Thank you.

*Afrikaans*:

Dr W J BOSHOFF: Agb Huisvoorsitter, ...

*English*:

... the economic activity is equivalent to the use of energy. It

is not money that makes the world go round, but energy.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 91**

Therefore, use of fossil fuels has been central to the

industrial revolution. It extended available labour beyond that

which humans and draught animals can metabolise. In short,

fossil fuels ended slavery and turned animals into pets.

As fossil fuels are concentrated and mostly buried, the cost of

energy became monetised. Pre-industrial existence was built on

evenly distributed energy in the form of food, feed and

firewood, which was free, but scarce. It was replaced by

concentrated and mostly imported energy, which was costly, but

abundant. The net effect for industrialised societies, as well

as those near the sources of energy, was highly beneficial.

South Africa was endowed with abundant coal, quite a bit of

uranium, little gas and no crude oil. Coal is ideal for

stationary applications and we built huge power stations and a

national electricity grid. We even turned coal into liquid

petroleum, which worked surprisingly well, although we never

even approached self-sufficiency. In fact, if it wasn’t for

recurring oil crisis since 1973 with ever increasing crude oil

prices, this project might never have been feasible.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 92**

The ever weakening rand contributed to the same result. Energy

supply was ensured by refining of imported crude oil, which was

done on a scale sufficient for the local economy. The capacity

to store a large oil reserve was created. We even entered the

select club of nuclear powers, in order to become energy self-

sufficient.

In 1994, the prospect of an internationally acceptable political

dispensation held the promise of a great energy and therefore

economical future. Cheap, dependable electricity was generated

domestically, while an end to sanctions meant that crude oil

could be had at market price.

Little did one know that Eskom as well as the rand would implode

due to bad policy, driving up energy prices. In fact, the rand

fell from around R3,50 per dollar in 1994, to the current

R14,50.

Fortunately, technology is not stagnant. While the impact of

fossil fuels on the climate became known, the ability to harness

sun and wind energy at affordable prices developed. Concurrent



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 93**

is the development of batteries, as well as green hydrogen, as

storage systems for fluctuating renewable energy.

Transition from one energy dispensation to the next, especially

a just transition, is easier when the old one is in crises. In

other words, if Eskom was in excellent shape and if a strong

rand could buy lots of crude oil, and if South African

refineries did not burn down or were closed, it would have been

difficult to justify transition to an alternative still ridden

by uncertainties.

Currently, South African businesses and consumers implement

renewables not for the sake of some transition, but for

survival. The 25 giga watt of dependable coal generated

electricity left, buys time to solve problems of the transition.

While being a huge dark cloud, rising energy prices might have a

silver lining. In future, international conflict – very hot or

very cold places - and fluctuating currencies may have less

impact on communities in South Africa. Even an ANC government

might not be able to devastate the economy anymore. I thank you.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 94**

Mr B N HERRON: Chairperson, the rising cost of electricity is

certainly stifling economic growth, but I’d like us to focus on

its impact on families and social cohesion. We can debate about

the build quality and the continuing spatial injustice, but the

democratic state has built millions of subsidised homes,

connected millions of people to the electricity grid and

provided millions of people with access to water.

These deliverables should have contributed towards reducing the

level of inequality, but the people living in these homes cannot

afford electricity nor can they afford water. No one should be

denied access to these services because they are unaffordable.

They are essential to our development as human beings and they

are essential building blocks if we are to develop a just and

inclusive society.

If this House is to have an honest debate, we need to discuss

how to achieve complete transparency in the electricity supply

chain, how to reduce the price of bulk supply and how to put an

end to the profit-making by municipalities who are literally

throttling consumers. Many municipalities are now using,

illegally in my view, prepaid electricity meters as a debt-



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 95**

collecting tool. I recently met a disabled resident in Mitchells

Plain who hasn’t had water for over a year. Her situation

mirrors that of many across our country. Her water is

disconnected but she is still charged the fixed-pipe levy and

other water charges. The City uses her prepaid electricity

payments to collect, what it says, is an unpaid water account.

And when she is able to scrape R10 together to buy electricity,

she gets 2.6 units. They take R3.10 from her R10 as a repayment

fee.

The hon Mileham and the DA must acknowledge that part of the

unaffordability problem are the huge mark-ups on electricity -

the profit-making by municipalities. While the woman in

Mitchells Plain battles to survive, the DA’s flagship

government, Cape Town, collected R8,2 billion in electricity

revenue in the first half of this financial year, for which it

paid R5,4 billion. That’s a whopping R2,8 billion profit in just

six months.

For the full financial year, the City projects revenue of

R15,7 billion and bulk purchases of R11,2 billion, with a gross

profit of R4,5 billion and a projected net profit of



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 96**

R2,6 billion. Imagine R2,6 billion in the hands of a consumer or

a small business? This leads us to the necessity of

transparency. We get to interrogate and oppose Eskom’s tariff

increases, but we cannot say the same for the National Energy

Regulator of SA applications, or Nersa applications, by

municipalities.

When I did a Protection of Personal Information application, or

Popi application, recently for the City of Cape Town tariff

application to Nersa for the current financial year, my request

was refused by the City, with the City claiming that it falls

within commercial activities. Perhaps the hon Mileham and the DA

can explain why a municipal Nersa application is regarded as

confidential and in whose interests this is. Thank you.

Dr M J CARDO: Hon Chairperson, the rising cost of fuel and

electricity is crippling this country; and, as always, it’s the

poor and unemployed who bear the brunt of surging prices.

Petrol has just gone up by R1.46 per litre. Diesel increased by

between R1.44 and R1.48 per litre. Illuminating paraffin shot up

by R1.21 per litre.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 97**

Our economy is hamstrung by high energy costs. What does this

mean for the beleaguered citizens of our nation? Firstly, more

expensive petrol means more expensive food and transport.

For those South Africans lucky enough to have a job and earn an

income, they will spend more money on getting to the workplace.

Their rands and cents will drain away faster. But for the 7,6

million unemployed South Africans actively searching for a job,

the price hike will hit them harder. When the price of petrol

goes up, taxi fares rise. This makes it much more onerous for

workseekers to afford the taxi which takes them into town in

search of a job, and which takes them home at the end of the

day. So they abandon all hope; they stop looking for work; and

they join the ever-growing pool of 3,8 million discouraged

individuals convinced they will never find employment.

Meanwhile, higher transport costs ultimately lead to higher food

costs, which means that more and more people who are poor and

unemployed go hungry.

Secondly, more expensive paraffin means more expensive fuel for

our most vulnerable households.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 98**

Millions of poor South Africans rely on illuminated paraffin as

their primary source of cooking fuel. The costlier it becomes,

the more difficult it is for parents to keep themselves and

their children warm and fed.

Thirdly, more expensive electricity means household budgets get

stretched to breaking point. Whereas a fixed rand value of

electricity used to last the whole month, now it’s gobbled up

within a matter of weeks or even days. Bigger electricity bills

mean there’s less money for everything else, from bare

necessities to small luxuries. Every single line item of

household expenditure has to be cut to the bone. Savings are

depleted faster. In short, sky-high energy prices are placing an

intolerable strain on the most vulnerable South Africans.

The government wrings its hands and comes up with excuses.

“COVID-19 has devastated the economy, and driven up inflation”,

says the ANC. “We are facing global headwinds”, is another well-

worn line. But most of the headwinds started blowing before the

pandemic struck. They were whipped up by the ANC’s own economic

mismanagement, policy incoherence and incompetence.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 99**

Two things are true of the ANC. One, it produces a lot of hot

air. Two, its talk is cheap. Now, if only there was some way of

bringing these two facts into harmony and harnessing their

combined potential, then South Africa would have the largest and

cheapest energy supply in the world.

In the meantime, let’s start with the basics. Let’s break

Eskom’s monopoly and the year-on-year electricity tariff

increases inflicted on South Africans. And let’s review the fuel

pricing model, which benefits the state but punishes the most

vulnerable. If we can do those two things, we will be helping

the poor and unemployed. Thank you.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES: Thank you very much

House Chair, my apologies. May I request that I take off the

video. My network here is not so good. With your permission,

House Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms R M M Lesoma): Please, you may.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES: Thank you very much

House Chair. We are meeting today at a time when the world is



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 100**

faced with the challenge of war between Russia and Ukraine. A

war which can end up creating many more economic hardships and

the myriad of other crisis for the entire globe if things are

not managed properly.

House Chair, we must never fear engagements, dialogue and

negotiations. It is for this reason that we must continue

calling for engagements to resolve even the most difficult of

problems facing humanity. The President in his state of the

nation address, highlighted plans in place to put Eskom in a

correct path and a proper pedestal by making the assessment of

progress when all these entities experienced paralysis against

the backdrop of the five-year Medium Term Strategic Framework.

In February 2019, the ministry of Public Enterprises announced

bold initiatives towards fundamentally restructuring Eskom and

the electricity supply industry. Where emphasis was placed on

securing a safe, reliable and affordable entity supply industry

for the country. The department published a roadmap for Eskom in

the reformed electricity supply industry in October 2019.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 101**

This roadmap recognised that South Africa was blessed with an

abundance of energy sources which we wish to drive economic

growth, social development to benefit all its people. It also

identified the importance of electricity supply security and

pricing that is geared towards promoting competitiveness of the

South African economy and to boast our industrialisation.

For purposes of this debate, it is important for one to

underline the following key outcomes that ought to be achieved

in terms of that roadmap. Firstly, transitioning from the

existing dependants on fossil fuels to a mixed of energy sources

as the integrated resource plan of 2019 dictates. Secondly, the

restructuring of Eskom into different subsidiaries, generation,

transmission, as well as distribution. Thirdly, an intensive

focus on radical improving the current operations and

eliminating inefficiencies in generation, and the greater

requirement for transparency in the governance of both the Eskom

holdings, as well as its subsidence.

Of course, also having a rigorous approach to cutting wasteful

costs optimising revenue and resolving the debt burden, as well

as the just transition which will involve all the stakeholders.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 102**

House Chair, Eskom plays a critical role in the South African

economy through the provision of electricity. It is therefore

imperative that its tariffs enable it to find its operations

through the revenues derived from the sales thereof.

Eskom is operating in a regulated environment and their tariffs

are determined by the National Energy Regulator of South Africa,

NERSA, through a multi-year priced termination methodology. The

Electricity Regulation Act requires NERSA to ensure that all

licences, including Eskom, recover the efficient cost of

electricity and the fair return. Cost reflective tariffs are a

prerequisite to enable Eskom to provide the economy with

reliable electricity at affordable prices. Migration towards

cost reflective tariffs as envisaged in the electricity pricing

policy has not yet happened.

The cost of service approach is a common feature of the

regulatory pricing frameworks and is employed by NERSA in other

sectors by other regulators within South Africa and by utility

regulators globally. The recent NERSA decision to approve a

tariff increase of 9,61% - I think I need to explain this

because a lot has been said around this and some of it factually



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 103**

inaccurate - for which only 3,49% tariff was against Eskom’s

application of 14,58% for the year 2022-23. The other 6,12%

increase was for the previously approved under recovery from the

regulatory clearing account mechanism. This regulatory clearing

account mechanism deals with previous revenue under over

recoveries.

The implementation of this revenue recovery account was part of

the court order with 2022-23 revenue requirement. So in reality,

the approved 3,49%, excluding the regulatory clearing account is

not only less than Consumer Price Index, CPI, of 5,9% presently,

but also less than the Independent Power Producers Procurement

Programme, IPPPP, cost increase of 5,85% in 2023.

The government appreciates and welcomes the tariffs by NERSA

because they will be balancing customer affordability whilst

supporting Eskom’s sustainability. Eskom’s constrained financial

position is having a negative impact on the entity’s ability to

execute result maintenance on their plans which results in high

unplanned capability loss factor. But in order to caution the

indigent customers and distressed companies, Eskom is

implementing free basic electricity of 50 Kilowatt-Hour subject



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 104**

to be reviewed, as well as a negotiated pricing agreement

respectively so as to support those indeed who are in serious

need.

As the ANC, we are a caring government that sympathises with the

plight of our people, and we understand that Eskom is one of the

vital tools of their livelihood. Eskom continues to connect the

previously disadvantaged households to the grid through the

electrification programme funded by the Department of Mineral

Resources and Energy. For the financial year that ended 2021, a

total of 106 669 new connections were completed. This

demonstrates the ANC-led government’s commitment to redress in

correcting the sins of the part.

Contrary to the DA that makes so much for the energy costs

through these tariffs, just visit them in their backyard, the

contrary is true as the cost they subject the poor in those

municipalities that are under their control. In fact, hon Magaxa

as well as hon ... [Inaudible.] ... make real in exposing their

hypocrisy.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 105**

A financially sustainable Eskom is crucial for recovery of South

Africa’s economy. Further cost reflective tariffs are essential

for the entity to be able to execute its mandate which is the

provision of reliable, operating and affordable electricity. Of

course the operating model is no longer fit for purpose and thus

the turnaround plan to enable the entity to execute its mandate.

Eskom is implementing a turnaround plan which is aimed at

increasing efficiencies within the business.

The restructuring of Eskom is one of levers of the plan which

will improve transparency, agility and promote competition in

the energy sector. In December 2021 Eskom has established a

separate transmission subsidiary. A separation of generation and

distribution is anticipated on 31 December 2022. This we do, not

at the instance of the DA because we have determined so in the

roadmap as I have outlined.

The end state of this restructuring of Eskom is to have an

independent transmission system marketing operator that will be

able to buy electricity from all the producers based on the

least cost and this will increase competition and decrease the

price of electricity. Of course to improve operational



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 106**

performance, the entity is implementing a Nine-point plan

focusing on fixing Medupe as well as Kusile defects, fixing full

and partial load losses and long term outrages.

In addition, Eskom is implementing its reliability maintenance

recovery programme. The President did make mention of the need

to procure the 400 Megawatts that will be procured to enable the

entity to create space for its plans to meet the growing demand.

This will be filled by renewables and other energy sources such

as gas and nuclear. There is a need to invest on energy

infrastructure to ensure that the country has adequate supply of

energy at an affordable price.

As I conclude, the entity is recovering from the phenomenon of

state capture and through the implementation of the turnaround

plan and the restructuring process, this will go a long way to

achieve operational efficacy. The department will be monitoring

the recommendations of the commission on Eskom and will work

with various law enforcement agencies to ensure those who are

implicated are brought to justice.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 107**

It is against the above that Eskom must be supported in its

renewal journey. We are beginning to see green suits here and

there and when this process is completed we are sure Eskom is

... [Inaudibled.] ... provide reliable electricity for the

economy. I thank you.

Mr S M JAFTA: Thank you, hon House Chairperson. May I leave my

video off please? Hon House Chairperson, as we schedule this

debate for discussions the National Energy Regulator of South

Africa approved a 9,6% tariffs increase for Eskom. We also know

that Eskom just as we were planning our programme for this

received a guarantee of R21,9 million from the Minister of

Finance in his Budget Speech. To make matters worse we have a

super Minister of Mineral Resources and Energy who is blocking

every effort to diversify our pool of electricity generation. It

was the same Minister who declared in 2015 that, I quote: “The

crisis that Eskom was a positive crisis.” It took much

convincing for this Minister to bring on board embedded

electricity. Despite the White Paper on energy published in

1998, declaring his commitment to promoting a new model of

development and a new paradigm for the development of the energy

sector the fixation on coal by the Minister is the real crisis



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 108**

we must confront. Even the central funds ... [Inaudible.] ...

itself in securing a reliable and affordable diversified energy

securing solutions for South African economy by 2030.

Hon House Chairperson, I digress the latest fuel adjustment for

March 2022, exposes the ANC’s dismissal approach to energy

security not only the adjustments set to deepen the plight of

the poor, they equally will have a significant impact on basket

of goods and services that are used to measure inflation. This

adjustment will have an inflammatory effect and will also erode

consumer purchasing power for household food consumption living

many poor South Africans forced to opt for fuel over food items.

Changes for March in petrol prices were very high.

Hon House Chair, these prices are not a fisher of a

developmental state, they are not aimed at social justice and

just order for the poor of masses. In restructuring the entire

regime of energy security we must start with the Minister.

Central energy fund and National Energy Regulator of South

Africa, Nersa, must leave politics behind and focus on their

mandate. It cannot be business as usual. I thank you, hon House

Chair.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 109**

Ms C M PHIRI: Thank you, hon House Chair, Mme Lesoma. Allow me

also to request to switch off my video for a better reception if

you give a permission, may I do so. Thank you, House Chair. Hon

members and fellow South Africans, even this was a DA motion I

nearly brought the speech on sexual harassment in the Western

Cape provincial government by the former Chair of the DA in

Western Cape. This is a motion which needed to be brought to the

House for the debate in the near future.

However, House Chair, allow me to focus on the motion at hand.

This is something not only wrong, but profoundly shaming when a

motion sponsored by the concern of white minority comes to

dominate the national debate 28 years after the ushering in the

democracy. The underlying implication of this debate is that

high electricity tariffs are an aberration in the history of

South Africa because the ANC-led government and that the very

same government has become a milestone around the efficient

energy industry in the country. Ironically, history shows that

between 1976 and 1989 Eskom has involved large investment in

generation capacity expansion that led to large increases in

electricity’s tariffs. Moreover, between 1979 and 1982, the

oppressive apartheid regime experienced a growing electricity



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 110**

demand that led to the load shedding even when Eskom was

supplying electricity to a selected few to the exclusion of the

majority of black people.

Therefore, the misreading of experiences in the sponsored debate

does not only throw the infamous baby out of the bathwater, but

also peddles prejudice that makes understanding Eskom strength

and weaknesses particularly difficult. House Chair, we are not

surprised that the motion for this debate was sponsored by hon

Mileham. Few weeks ago he published an article arguing that

renewables energies are the future of this country regardless of

the fact that renewable does not provide a baseload energy

needed to guarantee uninterrupted electricity supply.

House Chair, excuse me for saying this, but hon Mileham’s

argument is probably the most ... [Inaudible.] ... idea in the

world. For example, Eskom mid-term report as of the 30th

September 2021, showed that the installed electricity capacity

was 46 000 megawatts excluding the planned and unplanned

capability loss factors and that coal rather than renewables was

responsible for the lines shares of the generation capacity.

Moreover, the unit cost of using coal to generate electricity



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 111**

was cheaper relatives to renewables. This does not however mean

that the cost of renewables has not dropped in the past 10

years. Thus, seen if we were to leave the supply of electricity

solely to the renewables today they will not meet the current

electricity demand on the one hand, and there would be repress

rather than enable access to energy justice for the poverty

stricken households on the other hand.

This indicate that political economy of energy in South Africa

is not something that hon Mileham and the DA with their

technical tool kits that particularly well equipped to comment

on, but I would give them the benefit of the doubt since John

Locke once remarked that human beings are roughly equal in their

mental capabilities.

House Chair, hon Mileham and the DA would argue that the market

must be free to allow renewables to show their full potential

contrary to the popular belief a free market is an illusion.

Markets are proposed by rules that determine who can participate

and regulations including common reporting standard, CRS,

regulations. For example, the Electricity Regulation Act and the

electricity pricing policy have been amended by the ANC-led



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 112**

government to allow competitive electricity market to drive

affordability through fair competition.

Secondly, Nersa’s decision to approve Eskom’s tariffs the

increase of 9,6,1% took into account the prevailing

socioeconomic condition when determining electricity tariffs.

For instance, if market forces were left alone to determine

prices amid the growing electricity demand price will be higher

because producers will be taking advantage of economies of scale

in a small market by international standard, but large in Sub-

Saharan African terms. The two examples I’ve just highlighted

indicate that the ANC-led government is neither a demonise nor a

dysfunctional institution in terms of the management of

affordable access to the electricity.

House Chair, breaking away from the DA’s ideological clock that

pretend to be an objectively economic ... [Inaudible.] ... is

the first step towards understanding the complex energy industry

in South Africa. The DA’s ideological clock that advocates for

free market suggests that Eskom’s natural monopoly is not fair,

instead we should have a free market in the energy industry

where different producers compete for customers while the ANC-



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 113**

led government supports a competitive market in the energy

industry. It rejects disputes argument that prohibits the

exploitation of coal for electricity generation and exports led

economic growth in the short term.

Coal is one of the biggest contributors to job opportunities and

economic growth and free market economies that the DA has

immersed in self and cannot assure us in advance that the job

losses in coal sector will be compensated by increase in the

renewable sector. Moreover, the country generates electricity

through other energy carriers which it will not abandoned. The

DA’s distorted ideological clock has serious implications as it

will result in the misguided use of South Africans abandoned

natural resources. This is the reason why President Ramaphosa

emphasised in 2022, state of the nation address, the importance

of empowering the aging coal power stations to save more jobs

and utilise coal as it will put a downward pressure on the high

cost of independent power producers, IPPs, in the short term.

This needs to occur on clean coal technologies and carbon

capture sulphur dioxide from flare gas must be captured and the

sulphur extracted and monetise for the manufacture of fertiliser

and dynamites for mining and therefore provide industrialisation



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 114**

opportunities and job creation opportunities rather than

pollution. The current technology captures 97% of the sulphur

dioxide.

House Chair, the motion for debate sponsored by hon Mileham

concentrates more than it is necessary on Eskom’s failure to the

neglects of the trial and error nature of the performance even

in the most successful cases. Factors other than operational and

financial performance do not account for success in hon

Mileham’s world view. Consider for the example, the Statistic

South Africa, Stats SA, has revealed that more than 90% of South

African households have access to electricity. Thanks to the

Department of Mineral Resources and Energy integrated national

electrification programme and nongrid connection.

Eskom is responsible for largest component of this connections

and the ANC-led government continues to provide targeted

subsidies of 50 kilowatts per hour electricity per household per

month for the vulnerable households to narrow the gap between

physical access and affordability access to electricity. Without

targeted subsidies the increase of electricity prices is above

the inflation rate over the past decades will increase poverty



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 115**

levels and energy poverty to the level of avoidance in the daily

lives of our citizens. Aside from targeted subsidies there are

mechanisms put in place to minimise the burden of electricity

price. For instance, Eskom and IPPs pay taxes that are used by

ANC-led government in areas of public expenditure with procure

incidents like social grant. Social grant in turn offset the

burden of high electricity prices on the poor.

Of course, the DA will argue that social grants are pertinent.

However, it is natural that what is a low wage in the eyes of

the DA is a handsome wage in the eyes of a black poor people due

to the historical injustice of the past. For yet, another

example, municipalities are allowed to procure electricity

directly from Eskom ... [Time expired.]

Mr G K Y CACHALIA: Chair, electricity used to be cheap. However,

over the course of some 13 years, the price of electricity has

increased by 460%. Last year, the electricity price went up by

15%, with another hike of 10% this year.

Now, let’s do what economists do and hold everything constant.

When you do this, you see that a 1% increase in electricity



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 116**

prices causes economic growth to drop by 0,036%. Now remember

that the economy is expected to grow by 1,9% this year.

Even the ANC should be able to understand the importance of

finding a balance between low supply and high demand, and that

the only solution is to allow more players into the industry

rather than increasing prices.

And, unless you’re thick as mince, you will realise that price

controls should never be used to rule demand because, even if

managing price causes a decrease in usage, the decrease in

electricity demand results in a decrease in economic activity.

Hon Herron and hon Minister, it’s time to remove price controls

and implement a windfall profits tax on producers to capture a

portion of any electricity price increases above a benchmark and

return the proceeds to consumers through tax reductions that

moderate the impact on the poor, small businesses and other

consumers. That’s how you do it.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 117**

Electricity must be available and affordable. It is currently

neither and the only credible solution is to fix the baseload

issues at Eskom, and open up the playing field to competitors.

While government finally appears to be moving in this direction,

albeit at a snail’s pace, the model has to change.

Hon Phiri, the crisis is now deep into its second decade.

Loadshedding hovers like a dark ANC cloud. It is unlikely that

there would be any reprieve from steeply rising tariffs.

Surely it’s time for sense to prevail and institute the

commission of inquiry that the DA has called for – as was done

in 1983, resulting in major organisational and institutional

changes.

It’s time again, no, isn’t it, hon Phiri, instead of

regurgitating false techno-babble.

The hon Magaxa says that shortage in supply is due to increased

demand.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 118**

Ms J TSHABALALA: No, no, no! It is hon Magaxa, and you must

breathe “Magaxa”. Spell it right!

Mr G K Y CACHALIA: Can I please get this time back?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms R M M Lesoma): Okay.

Mr G K Y CACHALIA: The hon Magaxa says that the shortage in

supply is due to the increase in demand. [Interjections.] He

should know better. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms R M M Lesoma): No, hon members! We

must allow the member to proceed.

Mr G K Y CACHALIA: ... [Inaudible.] ... the economy, and

therefore demand, and the shortage, as we all know, is due to

successive ANC governments’ strangulation of the economy and

energy sector with the dual hands of mismanagement and theft.

Let’s get real here!

Debate concluded.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (VIRTUAL)**

**THURSDAY, 3 MARCH 2022**

**Page: 119**

The mini-plenary rose at 16:37.

