**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY TUESDAY, 1 JUNE 2021**

**Watch video here:** [**Vote No 8 – National Treasury (State Security)**](https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=GWaqiPI_3z4)

***PROCEEDINGS OF MINI-PLENARIES – NATIONAL ASSEMBLY CHAMBER***

Members of the mini-plenary session met on the virtual platform at 11:00

House Chairperson Mr M L D Ntombela took the Chair and requested members to observe a moment of silence for prayers or meditation.

**ANNOUNCEMENT**

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Hon members, before we proceed I would like to remind you that the virtual mini- plenary is deemed to be in the precinct of Parliament and constitutes a meeting of National Assembly for debating purposes only. The Chairperson announced that the virtual mini-plenary sitting constituted a meeting of the National Assembly.

In addition to the rules of virtual sittings, the Rules of the National Assembly, including the rules of debate, apply.

Members enjoy the same powers and privileges that apply in a sitting of the National Assembly. Members should equally note that anything said in the virtual platform is deemed to have been said to the House and may be ruled upon. All members who have logged in shall be considered to be present; and are requested to mute their microphones and only unmute when recognised to speak. This is because the mics are very sensitive and will pick up noise which might disturb the attention of other members. When recognised to speak, please unmute your microphone and connect your video. Members may make use of the icons on the bar at the bottom of their screens, which has an option that allows a member to put up his/her hand to raise points of order. The secretariat will assist in alerting the Chairperson to members requesting to speak. When using the virtual system members are urged to refrain or desist from unnecessary points of order or interjections. We shall now proceed with the order, which is debate on Vote No 8: National Treasury of State Security. Hon Kodwa?

**APPROPRIATION BILL**

Budget Vote No 8: National Treasury (State Security):

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF STATE SECURITY: Hon Chairperson and hon members, chairperson and members of the Joint Standing Committee on Intelligence, Minister of State Security hon Ayanda Dlodlo, on whose behalf I have the honour to present this Budget Speech - we wish her a speedy recovery - the Inspector General of Intelligence, the acting Director-General of the State Security Agency, the principal of the Intelligence Academy, Veterans of the Intelligence Services, distinguished guests and members of the intelligence community, the Security Services of the Republic of South Africa comprise a single defence force; a single police service and intelligence services established in terms of the Constitution. The functions of these national security structures entail not only to protect and preserve national security as governed by constitutional principles in terms of Section 198, but are a critical component of our sovereignty, territorial integrity and our founding democratic values as enshrined in the Constitution of the Republic.

Our national security structures are obliged to shield themselves from threats aimed at undermining their capacity to

perform their functions and the capability of the state to fulfil its constitutional obligations. The ancient concepts of intelligence gathering, secrecy, discipline and security adopted during King Shaka’s time are even more relevant today to combat the security threats that our country is facing.

Our Constitution – the Constitution of the Republic, enjoins the state and the citizens to protect and preserve national security to ensure a free and prosperous South Africa. This national security imperative is informed by the history of apartheid that had placed the role of intelligence and security organs of the state as weapons of mass repression and mass oppression. It was also the very intelligence structures, both of the previous regime and the liberation movements that have played a central role in the negotiation process that led to the birth of the new South Africa.

The mission of our national security as guided by the principles prescribed in section 198 is to build a people centric national security doctrine which is based on the values of our Constitution. The battle of Isandlwana which took place on 22 January 1879 is a classical illustration of unity of purpose and adherence to values to protect and

preserve nationhood against hostile elements that seek to undermine the Republic and her people.

The defeat of the British colonial forces at Isandlwana was not accidental or magical, but was a calculation of greater military precision driven by the quality of intelligence and strategies employed by King Cetshwayo ka Mpande. It was also a culmination of the values of patriotism, sense of duty, sacrifice, loyalty and above all the consciousness and the discipline to protect and preserve national security and national interests, which must be an embodiment of our national security policy.

On 17 January 1879, addressing the regiments in the great military kraal of Nondwengu, King Cetshwayo issued commands for the enemy that had invaded Zululand to be crushed and defeated. And in so doing, he was informed by accurate intelligence on the enemy’s movement and the need to ensure a coordinated strategy of concealing and protecting the movements of his regiments. In attendance were the regiments of iNtontela, uMxhapho, uBulawayo, iNdlondlo, uThulwana, uDukuza, iNgobamakhosi, uDududu and other great regiments.

The military deployment of the horn formation flanking and disrupting the enemy allowing the chest - iNgobamakhosi to move closer to the enemy and deliver the final blow was informed by the principle of concealment and protection of the striking force. Aware of the striking capabilities of his regiments, King Cetshwayo underscored the protection of iNgobamakhosi, which was the core, or belly striking elite regiment that delivered the ultimate stroke to the heart of the British forces at Isandlwana.

Aware of the need to protect the children, the elders, the vulnerable and properties, King Cetshwayo deployed female regiments that comprised uThiyane, amaDludlu, amaDuku, amaQwathi and other great female regiments to maintain conditions of security and allay fears of the enemy’s invasion. While preserving and protecting national security is the mandate of national security structures, the leadership, like that of King Cetshwayo ought to inspire us to understand our critical responsibility in ensuring that national security structures are protected from hostile forces. South Africans of all walks of life also have a patriotic duty to protect the sovereignty, territorial integrity and the country against hostile elements that seek to undermine our hard-earned

democracy. Some of those hostile elements include the plethora of information peddlers, who in the words of a retired Ghanaian intelligence officer, Kofi Bentum Quantson, have become nation wreckers, whose mission is subversion and sabotage to destabilise legitimate governments.

The phenomenon of fake news is one other vehicle at the disposal of these hostile information peddlers. As a country, South Africa, we have not been immune from the hostile activities of these information peddlers who have been jumping from one administration to another seeking to engender a climate of plots and counterplots. This includes entrenching a culture dominated by conspiratorial tendencies leading to mistrust and divisions that undermine social cohesion in South Africa and elsewhere in the African continent.

Each time they manifested their hostile machinations, the South African intelligence community is left reeling from mandate disorientation, internal divisions, disruption of business and more of restructuring fatigue. We have a national duty and a collective responsibility to deal decisively with this phenomenon and in order for national security to reflect the resolve of South Africans as individuals and as a nation,

to live as equals, to live in peace and harmony, to be free from fear and want and to seek a better life, intelligence must be secured in order to perform its mandatory constitutional duties.

Our victorious history of the wars of resistance against colonial conquest teaches our current and future generations that our people have long understood the need to protect and preserve national security and to ensure discipline and loyalty amongst ourselves. As part of the consolidation of our national security doctrinal shift that embodies our constitutional values, Members of Parliament should be aware that the President re-established the National Security Council, NSC, in 2019. The role of the NSC is to advise and support the President and the executive on matters of national security and national interests. It is also charged with the responsibility to develop national security strategy, national interests and national security policy to give effect and expression to the governance of the new overarching security architecture of the Republic of South Africa.

In order for national security to reflect the resolve of South Africans as individuals and as a nation, to live as equals, to

live in peace and harmony, to be free from fear and want and to seek a better life, intelligence must be secured in order to perform its duties. Parliament and the national executive – in compliance with the law must ensure that our State Security Agency does not only protect and preserve national security, but also shields itself from hostile forces in order to perform its constitutional mandate.

The concealment and protection of intelligence operations is an ancient art that has been passed on us by our great warriors and kings who fought wars of resistance against colonial conquest and foreign agendas that were designed to subjugate our people into becoming subservient, dehumanised and subordinate to ruthless foreign powers. In line with the doctrine shift rebuilding intelligence capability involves improving systems and advancing our technological capacity to conduct intelligence, strengthening partnerships and collaborations with both our domestic and foreign counterparts and consolidating our human and financial resources. We have thus begun a change management process that focuses on our short term, medium term and long term priorities towards the achievement of a transformed intelligence agency.

Our latest report on the implementation of the organisation wide recommendations of the High Level Review Panel on State Security reveals that we are making steady progress in areas such as the establishment of governance structures, audit and risk issues, skills audit and issues involving capacity building and organisational culture change. Among others things where we have already established a Ministerial Advisory Council on Training; the Ministerial Implementation Task Team; the Ministerial Appeals and Adjudication Board; resuscitated the work of Audit and Risk Committee; and appointed a Task Team on Sexual Harassment and Bullying in the workplace.

From a technological advancement point of view, members would be aware about the rapid rise in organized crime, cyber-crimes and other forms of sophisticated crimes propelled by advancements in technology both at local and global level.

These type of crimes inevitably present complex challenges to intelligence and law enforcement authorities to effectively deal with.

The spread of new and smart technologies that enable a global information environment, empower people to see more, share

more, create more, and organise faster than ever before, brings about new threats and opportunities in the intelligence environment and community. Individuals and groups today have access to more information than entire governments once possessed. They can swiftly organise and act on what they learn, sometimes leading to violent change. It is upon this diffusion of technology and change in people’s behaviour that we need an ICT-enabled environment to ensure an integrated approach in guaranteeing that the Republic of South Africa is defended and protected in a co-ordinated and sustainable way.

In the past we have highlighted our concerns with regard to cyber security vulnerability for both the state and private sector. This has been compounded by the onset of the coronavirus pandemic which has created new challenges and opportunities for business and governments, as they adapt to operating models in which digital transformation and online communication has become the new normal. The increased dependency on technology such as the internet and cloud, among others, has led to a rise in cyberattacks, since the individuals working from home do not enjoy the same level of inherent protection or deterrent measures available in a normal working environment.

The increase in remote working calls for a greater focus on cybersecurity and vigilance against other sophisticated crimes presented by the accelerated use of technology. As such and as part of the digital transformation efforts, the agency has completed its technology audit with a view of replacing obsolete legacy technologies and leveraging on new emerging technologies. In the coming financial year, the agency will be developing an integrated technology strategy and roadmap which will revolutionise our organisation’s technologies, people and processes to fundamentally change our operations and performance.

Furthermore, our national communications component, in line with the national intelligence priorities relating to cyber threats, will provide information assurance services to organs of state in order to manage the cybersecurity risks related to the use, processing, storage and transmission of information. The national communications component will also provide continuous ICT security monitoring by detecting cyber threats that may put confidentiality and continuity of government operations at risk, and by alerting clients on cyber threats and incidents timely and supporting cyber security incident response teams.

In this regard, we will continue to provide ICT security services and solutions to clients to protect critical information assets. With increased reliability on technology, end-users are considered the weakest link in cybersecurity, and it is imperative that they understand security and ways of protecting themselves in cyber space. The agency, together with other government stakeholders will intensify cybersecurity awareness training and campaigns.

Due to global interconnectedness, South Africa and the global community continue to face the lingering cyber threats from various hostile elements exploiting the cyber space to advance hostilities aimed at undermining the financial sector, privacy of our citizens, organising and planning terrorist related activities and harming our national security. In dealing with these threats, the agency will ensure that the cybersecurity and cybercrime legislation and regulatory framework is completed during the Medium-Term Strategic Framework, MTSF, in order to provide legal protections to people using internet including government, businesses and private citizens.

The legislative framework will identify and enforce standards of acceptable behaviour in cyberspace and prevent harm to

people, data, systems, services and critical information infrastructure. In the past financial year our national communications completed training in various ICT security solutions, cyber response, artificial intelligence, technology hardware and management. In the medium term, we will look at the provision of foundational cyber training and cyber range.

In addition, we will also focus on the facilitation of cybercrime investigation, methodology and prosecution; public reporting mechanisms, situation reports, statistics and documentation of cases. All these efforts will be geared towards ensuring a well secured cyberspace**.** Threats to national security including cyber security threats, terrorism and violence, espionage, trans-national organised crime, drug and human trafficking, corruption, subversion, sabotage, spread of pandemic, degrading and undermining the sovereignty and territorial integrity of the Republic are active forms of threats that are transmitted through various platforms at home and abroad.

In this journey, part of our important assignment is to be able to capacitate government to respond to identified threats that may have the potential to impact on its ability to fulfil

its Medium-Term Strategic Framework undertakings as well as post COVID-19 pandemic recovery plans, as announced by the President. The last time we presented a budget in this august House we made a commitment towards the overhaul of the intelligence machinery in order to meet the security challenges of our times. Part of our priorities were and still are, informed by the recommendations of the High Level Review Panel on State Security. It is important that we also understand that, given the complexities and dynamics of our working environment, some of these recommendations can only be implemented incrementally, as short term, medium term and long-term priorities.

As we continue to reform the Intelligence capability of our country, we have decided to do so by imagining the future. Therefore, this budget takes on a futuristic posture based on the threats, opportunities and challenges facing the South African intelligence community in this century. Some of the threats and priorities we identified include socioeconomic vulnerabilities such as high levels of unemployment, cyber space security, regional security challenges, countering international terrorism, domestic political stability and economic prosperity. Responding to these threats and

harnessing opportunities where such exist, we believe that this requires a transformed intelligence capability and organisation responsive to the complex challenges of the 21st century.

Today marks the beginning of a historic moment in our country’s history, June month, where the youth confronted a powerful and racist regime in a struggle to free the country from the clutches of racism and under development. Since that historic moment, of 16 June 1976, the youth of our country have always defined and pursued the struggle for their emancipation as a strategic pillar of our democratic society.

In our change management journey to revitalize and reposition the agency into a dynamic and efficient organisation, we have embraced the strategic posture to bring the youth into the mainstream of our organisational mission. The inescapable reality is that ours is an ageing organisation whose median or average age is not in line with the country’s age demographic profile which is largely made up of young people.

This is further coupled with the challenge that the organisation is characterised by a high attrition rate which

far outstrips the rate of recruitment resulting in limited capacity to respond to the ever growing and changing security demands of the 21st century. To address this challenge, we have started with the implementation of a cadet programme which is aimed at rejuvenating the State Security Agency talent pool with young, capable and energetic youth.

This cadet programme is targeting Youth and particularly women in response to government’s call to address the unemployment and poverty challenge facing South African communities. The Intelligence Academy, IA, will be responsible for developing the curriculum for this programme so that the learning outcomes address the specific intelligence skills required. It is also anticipated that the cadet programme will address skills needs within the agency to build capacity and professionalise the intelligence environment.

Other skills development initiatives we will be implementing this financial year include the development of an intelligence officer or operator development programme; the establishment of a career mobility programme to allow for career mobility or progression through a variety of occupational streams; and the

development of a management development programme that embraces the new world of work methodology.

This will be directly aimed at capacitating emerging young leaders or managers within the State Security Agency with the necessary skills for their craft. We will also research the feasibility of implementing a digital learning process within the State Security Agency or blended learning solutions; and also finalise the draft Skills Development Framework that is couched in learner adaptability, future literacy and future skills.

In line with the rapidly changing Education, Training and Development sector, the Intelligence Agency is undergoing a major restructuring process. This is being done in order to review and realign its vision, mission, values, and operational disposition and product offerings as per the recommendations of the panel and a constantly changing environment.

To this end, the Minister of State Security, hon Ayanda Dlodlo has since approved the institutionalisation of the philosophical framework. This important intervention is in the

form of a guiding document that was approved on 16 March 2021. Essentially, the philosophical framework of the Intelligence Academy outlines a new values, vision and principles to be observed by all involved in the work of education, training and development within the South African civilian intelligence community.

It also informs the approach to product design, development and offering. This includes providing guidance on how internal and external relationships are to be managed. To the extent that the philosophical framework is to be given practical expression, internal consultations around the development of a turnaround strategy are ensuing, and the processes towards approving it will be completed in the current financial year.

The Intelligence Academy continues to coordinate corporate- related training based on the prioritised skills generated from the workplace skills plan**.** For purposes of coordinating the acquisition of the prioritised corporate related skills, the agency has since approved a proposal to start with the process of launching a School for Governance and Ethical Conduct.

As you may be aware of the disturbing findings and the recommendations of the high level review panel and the subsequent allegations and counter allegations of corruption and malfeasance at the Zondo Commission and in the media space, the public image of the agency has been compromised.

We continue to support all interventions and efforts to improve and professionalise the agency. In this regard, we support the process that is unfolding at the Zondo Commission and are also implementing the recommendations of the high level review panel to enhance accountability and transparency.

Among the crucial and significant the high level review panel interventions, is the need to secure the services of an independent forensic investigation that would probe allegations of corruption committed by some members of the agency. The agency is at an advanced stage in appointing an independent forensic firm to deal with the alleged misconduct. There are currently more than five cases that have been referred to the police for further investigation and prosecution.

We have also made significant progress in stabilising management of the agency and curtail the practice of prolonged, often illegal acting periods in line with the high level review panel recommendations. After a consultative process with management of the agency, we have finalised the permanent appointment of senior managers in line with the National Intelligence Services Act 65 of 2002, promotional policies of the agency and internal consultations with the management of the agency.

As part of this ongoing process, nearly 70% of vacant posts are now filled with the remainder currently in various recruitment stages. We are confident that this will bring much overdue stability and certainty with a spill-over effect on efficiency and optimal performance. In line with the above stabilisation efforts, the agency has established effective arrangements to ensure that public funds and resources are properly safeguarded and are used economically. The internal structures such as the internal audit, risk management office as well as management services, which are located in the office of the accounting officer, are key instruments towards ensuring good governance and internal administrative control.

Members should also note that the agency has a good working relationship with the Office of the Auditor-General of South Africa and the Audit and Risk Committee. The agency has come a long way in ensuring that systems that improve governance are developed and implemented, and the Office of the Auditor- General and the Audit and Risk Committee played a pivotal role in realising this goal. We are grateful for their continued

co-operation.

Notwithstanding these measures, corruption remains a threat not only to South Africa’s economy but is a challenge in some government entities and departments. The agency is not immune to this scourge. The agency had uncovered some elements of corrupt activities among its members. Unfortunately, corruption is a centre offence and in the past, weak oversight of governance and management systems have been identified as the main contributing factors.

We are encouraged by the ongoing process to prosecute some of our members who were allegedly involved in corrupt and fraudulent activities in the State Security Agency. We will continue supporting any initiative that seeks to root out corruption and fraudulent activities in the agency in order to

turnaround the institution and ensure the safety of our country and its people. In this regard, we are finalising the remodelling of our vetting capacity and integrity framework for both the Agency and organs of state. This will require extensive human and financial resources. As part of the intervention to improve its image and governance systems, the agency will strengthen its policy and compliance enforcement unit.

National security is an expression of the resolve of the Republic and her people to create conditions conducive to democracy, economic development, prosperity and the wellbeing of our people. At the same time, the agency is cognisant of the fact that the security of South Africa is intrinsically linked to the security of countries in the Southern African region, the African continent in general, as well as global security and stability.

As part of the global community, South Africa has also been impacted by the invisible enemy in the guise of COVID-19. The proliferation of infectious diseases such as COVID-19 have had a negative impact not only on the ways and means in which the agency pursues its mandate to protect national security and

advance national interests, it has also affected our economy and our ability to deal with poverty, unemployment and systemic inequality. Like any foreign invading force, COVID-19 has all the hallmarks of threats to our national security.

Southern Africa is experiencing growing threats of insecurity and these include transnational organised crime, threats of terrorism, displacement of people, humanitarian crisis, illegal migration, illicit mining and illicit flow of funds. The recent terror related violent attacks in northern Mozambique and southern Tanzania are some of the concerning emerging insecurities in the region. As hon members may be aware, our security services across the cluster acted swiftly in the evacuation of our nationals. We want to assure our citizens that we will continue to be seized with the situation in Northern Mozambique and monitor any potential threats to our security. We are also playing an active role in the current collective efforts from SADC aimed at finding sustainable solutions to the instability in the Mozambique region.

Africa as a continent is experiencing deteriorating stability that is unlikely to improve over the next few years.

Transitional arrangements, mounting public agitation over governance and economic mismanagement, contention over election outcomes and increased social protest on the continent contribute to the rise in military determined political outcomes. As a result, the agency continues to be concerned with the security developments in the Sahel and Maghreb region. The Israel-Palestine conflict, indiscriminate bombing of civilian targets, the ongoing conflict in Syria and the Middle East region in general continues to threaten global security and importation of such threats to South Africa.

In line with the theme of this budget policy statement “National Security is the patriotic duty and responsibility of the state and the citizens of the Republic”. Our strategic focus will continue to ensure that national security is the patriotic duty and responsibility of every citizen.

I would like to take this opportunity to thank senior management of SSA, support staff and members for their support throughout the year.

In conclusion, I have the pleasure to table this budget vote and policy statement on behalf of the Ministry and the agency

for the financial year 2021-22. I recommend the House to approve this Budget Vote. I thank you very much Chairperson for the opportunity.

Mr J J MAAKE: Chairperson, Ministers and Deputy Ministers, comrades and colleagues, firstly I would like the House to note that during these tough and trying times the committee lost two of its members, hon Mofokeng and hon Hermans.

Allow me to bid farewell to the retired chief of the South African National Defence Force, General Solly Shoke, together with other members of the Military Command Council, including the now retired Chief of Defence Intelligence, Lieutenant General Jeremiah Nyembe. We thank our generals for their dedication and good service. We also welcome the new MCC under the leadership of the newly appointed Chief the South African National Defence Force, SANDF, General Rudzani Maphwanya and our new Chief of Defence Intelligence, Lieutenant General Thalita Mxakato who is the first female to occupy this position and a member of the Military Command Council. We congratulate our new commanders who commence their term of office today and wish them strength in dealing with the challenges faced by our armed forces amid budget reductions in

the past few years. We also thank our Intelligence Ispector- General, Dr S I Dintwe, who is in his final year of his term. By the time we debate the budget of the SSA next year, he would have vacated the office. We thank him for the dedication in ensuring that he executes the mandate of his office in accordance with the Intelligence Services Oversight Act 40 of 1994.

Chairperson, the Constitution of this country, which by the way is one of the very best in the whole world, is the basic legislation that governs the security services. Chapter 11 of the Constitution lays out the principles governing national security and also provides for the establishment, structuring and conduct of the security services, encompassing intelligence, defence and police services.

Section 198 prescribes that the following principles among others govern national security in the country: National security must reflect the resolve of South Africans as individuals and as a nation to live as equals, to live in peace and harmony, to be free from fear and to seek a better life. The resolve to live in peace and harmony precludes any South African citizen from participating in armed conflict

nationally or internationally, except as provided for in terms of the Constitution of regional legislation or national legislation.

National security must be pursued in compliance with the law, including international law. National security is subject to the authority of Parliament and the national executive. The Constitution goes further in section 199 to say that the security services of the Republic consist of a single defence force, a single police service and any intelligence services as published in terms of the Constitution. Other than the security services established in terms of the Constitution, armed organisations or services may be established only in terms of the national legislation.

No member of any security services may obey and manifest illegal order, or further in a partisan manner, any interest of a political party etc. In relation to the latter I can confidently stand on this podium and declare that in our committee we have gone beyond party political issues and all of us are genuinely dealing with issues of the security of our country in our deliberations, and I think our committee needs to be commended for that.

It is common knowledge that our security and intelligence services has serious problems. This is the reason why the President of the country even decided to establish a High Level Review Panel on State Security Agency to look into abnormalities that were manifesting themselves in this environment. The panel’s terms of reference provided 12 focus areas, among others, the panel’s work was to look into the impact of the amalgamation of the previous services into one agency and the appropriateness of this change.; the appropriateness of the current structure of the agency to its core mandates and to effective command control and accountability; the mandate and capacity of SSA and to examine the compatibility of its structure in relation to this mandate; the institutional culture, morals, systems and capacity to deliver on the mandate, the involvement of the members of the national executive in intelligence operations and measures to prevent this; the policy framework including legislation that governs operational activities conducted by members of the national executive; the development of guidelines that will enable members to report a manifesting illegal order as envisaged in section 199(6) of the Constitution; and the effectiveness and appropriateness of the

existing oversight mechanism in ensuring accountability and transparency.

The main question the panel asked itself was: What went wrong? In their findings, the panel found that the amalgamation of National Intelligence Agency, NIA, and South African Secret Service into SSA was in breach of the White Paper on Intelligence, and the at the very least should have been preceded by a similar policy process as involved in the original White Paper, including consultations in Parliament and with the public. Initial establishment of SSA through presidential proclamation was irregular due to the constitutional requirements that the President can only establish intelligence services through legislation. Stated intentions of amalgamating the previous services was not achieved, and in fact, created new and more serious problems, including amongst others, excessive concentration of power and excessive top-heaviness of management; lack of proper focus on foreign intelligence; duplication of certain functions such as analysis and dislocation of personnel; and lastly, the change of the name from National Intelligence Agency to State Security Agency was in breach of the human security philosophy

of our democratic dispensation contained in the Constitution and the White Paper.

The panel then came with the recommendations that we accepted and signed off by the President for implementation. Hon Chairperson, I thought it was necessary to give this background so that everyone could understand the job that the committee is faced with from its inception.

One other point raised by the panel was the key challenges faced by the intelligence services, the government and public that they serve is agreeing on the appropriate balance from those services between secrecy and transparency. In relation to the Joint Standing Committee on Intelligence, the White Paper proposes a mechanism for parliamentary oversight as a joint standing committee for parliament with functions and powers that will allow it to receive reports, make recommendations, order investigations and hold hearings on matters relating to intelligence and national security. The committee will also prepare and submit reports to Parliament about the performance of its duties and functions. It is obvious that a lot of people would be listening with one ear to the introductory part of this budget debate, but in actual

fact waiting for me to address what has been coming out of the Zondo Commission. Chairperson, I am sorry to disappoint them as everything that is said at the commission happened before this committee was established. All this committee can talk about is what we intend doing about this state of affairs.

The Joint Standing Committee on Intelligence is following the events at the commission and looks forward to the report.

However, rest assured that the Joint Standing Committee on Intelligence is aware of the challenges faced by the services and is proving oversight as per its mandate as contained in the Oversight Act. The committee is dealing with the challenges facing the intelligence services. One of the most important task is overseeing the implementation of the High Level Review Panel Report on the State Security Agency. One of the recommendations is the separation of the SSA into two separate agencies housing the domestic and foreign branches.

The High Level Review Panel Report identified most of the challenges faced by SSA, some which have been ventilated at the Zondo Commission. Overcoming these challenges will ensure that our intelligence services are playing the role they are mandated to fulfil. We are however concern that the

implementation of the High Level Review Panel Report recommendations or directives has been very slow. In this regard the committee will continue to engage the Minister of State Security and the management of the SSA to implement the recommendations without delay and continue reporting regularly as resolved by the Joint Standing Committee on Intelligence.

To many citizens of the country, the testimonies at the Zondo Commission are shocking. However, the committee is aware of these issues since some of the matters we identified when the Joint Standing Committee on Intelligence of the Sixth Parliament was established. The solution to all these problems that have been highlighted in the Zondo Commission is only one; to implement the High Level Review Panel report as it addresses all what was said as major problems in the commission of inquiry.

Hon Chairperson, the purpose of today’s debate is to talk about the budget of the agency. The actual fact in relation to the budget is that the budget for upgrading equipment and tools of trade, that is technology, must be increased exponentially if we want to avoid embarrassment in the immediate future or rather we are already an embarrassment to

the outside world. If technology and the equipment used by the State Security Agency is so obsolete that it can’t even trace simple WhatsApp, then we are in serious trouble. The only advantage is that we can’t go around telling everybody who we are as I just did now hoping no one heard me.

What the committee has done and continues to do will be contained in our first annual report of this parliamentary term which we considered recently. We are confident that the current leadership will deal with the challenges as well as consider and implement the recommendations of the committee. The committee supports the budget.

On a lighter note, the African Parliament on the very last day of Africa month. Maybe people will ask where was the intelligence when that happened. They should have seen what would have happened yesterday, which in anyways is not the function of the intelligence services. The committee supports the budget and I thank you, Chairperson.

Ms D KOHLER: Chairperson, before I begin, allow me to say that my thoughts and prayers are with the families of our two hon members, Nombulelo Hermans and Jacqui Mafikeng, both stalwarts

of the committee, level-headed, never sinking to attempt to score political points of us as colleagues. These women are much, much missed.

Out of the hundreds of pages Security Agency, SSA, there's a single line that sums up the issues faced in terms of the parliamentary oversight, coupled with almost daily revelations from the Zondo Commission and elsewhere:

There is a disproportionate application of secrecy in the SSA’s stifling effect of accountability and facilitating serious noncompliance with controls including blatant criminality.

Today, there are South Africans who duck while the hand grenades are tossed left and right out the Zondo Commission and the virtually daily headlines read like some spy versus spy cartoon series. Amongst all of this, there are those who began to call the High Level Panel report into question.

Some of the testimony given at the Zondo Commission claims that R59 billion went missing from the SSA. Another claim is that it was R9 billion looted, but the current Minister says

this is all a complete fabrication. Indeed, she, herself, said here in the National Assembly that, no, it wasn't R9 billion looted, it was only R9 million.

Of course, she has to rely on the information given to her about what happened before her time with the SSA and one has to ask whether or not the information given to her is perhaps not from the very people behind the looting. Certainly, not one rand has been recovered. No one person jailed in this regard.

We heard clearly in one presentation to the Zondo Commission that for example, R9 billion in so-called assets simply disappeared. Added to that, it seems if one's petty cash runs dry, there are always the safes locked in what is supposedly the most secure premises in the country, stroll in, walk out with 17 million in foreign currency and hand the money to who? Well, that's the multi-billion-rand question, isn't it?

The High Level Panel Report released to the public on 10 March 2019 was compiled by Dr Sidney Mufamadi and a team comprising nine other members with a wide range of senior-level experience and expertise in law, security studies, civil

society, academia, intelligence, and security communities, and other arms of government, extraordinary people, every one of them. But this is the team the Minister says got it wrong, that the billions looted weren't really.

At face value, the Minister is a very charming individual. Although of course there've been endless well-publicised claims that she has a tendency to ride roughshod over senior staff at the SSA. Indeed, she's facing a myriad of accusations and I'm quite sure it's all part of the job that she's a gambling addict, that she's married to the CIA operative that she's allied to the Zuma camp. The mudslinging just goes on and on.

And then like a bad episode of *Isidingo* came to the shenanigans surrounding this very Minister, an affair, a coup in a foreign country that has South Africans shaking their heads in disbelief. And who but President Ramaphosa would think he had the right to allegedly sent her to Botswana to try and strong-arm their President into dropping charges of money laundering and the financing of a coup attempt, all of this against his sister-in-law Bridget Motsepe-Radebe.

Of course one would still be more inclined to dismiss the accusations out of hand against the Minister if she hadn't brought back Arthur Fraser’s right-hand man, Graham Engel, who is suddenly the general manager of operations in the Domestic Intelligence branch. In a country reeling from the daily revelations, she brought back a man from a three-year suspension and promoted him, Minister, seriously.

How was South Africa supposed to take this whole step aside? Not step this way into a prison cell, I might add, just the step aside situation seriously when there's a distinct feeling that the looters are on their way back if indeed they're ever left. I'm sure the ANC would like us to swallow this whole pre-election revelation that criminality is a really bad thing. So bad that they'll ask those with a barrage of criminal charges against them to step aside.

But it seems every time someone inside tries to dish the dirt on their particular division and to turn off the looting taps, they quickly get the boot. Let's look at Mr Jafta, a former Acting Director-General of Intelligence who testified at the Zondo Commission. Now, we heard in detail how the SSA funded the Zuma-aligned ANC factions and election campaigns. When the

Minister learnt of his intent, she attempted to block him from testifying but he did and out he went. Was she trying to hide the wrongdoing in the agency during the Zuma years?

Of course, she denies it, but that moved naturally threw fuel on the whole, she's a member of the Zuma campfire. It's not as if these revelations have come from a single source because the Jafta revelations are closely followed for example, and amongst many others, by those of the Inspector-General of Intelligence, Advocate Dintwe. He too has had the SSA in a flurry by baring all to the Zondo Commission, not all of it flattering to the Minister as he announced that she had appointed 26 managers without following proper procedures, ignoring employment regulations, as well as the director- general’s refusal to recommend the appointments.

Additionally, he claimed the SSA at 40 operatives employed without any criteria whatsoever and that she was seriously peeved that they will not be given the positions that they were assured that they would receive. He said that the recruitment procedure was now abused by politically connected people and that nepotism had crept in.

I'm shocked, smoke mirrors, plots, and paranoia. Reports over the years have always claimed that every Minister of Intelligence has hired cadres, rather as Richard Mdluli did when he hired seven if not many more unqualified members of his immediate family into crime intelligence. Advocate Dintwe confirmed this stating that both the Ministers and officials recruited and appointed agents loyal to them personally. He referred to the manipulation of the judges, to the pressure put on Robert McBride, previously, infamously kicked out as head of the Independent Police Investigative Directorate, Ipid, not to investigate within the SSA, and also confirmed wholesale looting by giving an example that lots of money, up to €200 000, at a time, was stolen in suitcases from the SSA, and then used to fund a faction of the ANC. €200 000 is nearly R3,5 million.

With the State Security Agency, by all accounts, knee-deep and unaccounted for untraceable cash, it was hardly a surprise that even the Minister of Finance was moved to threaten or not to pay their budget should they not recover the monies stolen from their various impregnable safes? One doesn't want to believe this because to think that the looters will be put back into positions of power right at the very moment the

Zondo Commission was sitting and revealing all, the audacity of it all is unimaginable.

Sadly, all indications are that as the Zondo Commission tightens the state capture noose, so the looters are repositioning and looting perhaps even faster than before. The Joint Standing Committee on Intelligence is by law tasked with oversight over agencies that remain invisible on the whole.

The strictures are that we may bring in nothing to the meetings, leave with nothing and say nothing. Or we, as hon members face jail. Frankly, the newspapers are writing it all for us these days. One must ask if we don't perhaps glean more from those reports than we do inside the committee. This is how the billions were stolen by keeping committee members in a dungeon of darkness because that is what those that are in the intelligence agencies are apparently trying to do and then blame our colleagues of the former Parliament for not doing their job while the billions were stolen.

The High Level Report says there are excessive levels of secrecy, and as committee members, while we may not even be emailed so much as an agenda over the past year, barely a day has gone without a headline revealing more spy versus spy

antics while the Zondo Commission has pretty much stripped the State Security Agency bare.

Top of the charges against Arthur Fraser is that he ran an illegal, parallel intelligence structure called the Principal Agent Network, Pan, as the then director-general of the SSA. Now, the High Level Panel report found that Pan was involved in serious criminal behaviour under the guise of conducting covert work. And the behaviour may have involved theft, forgery and uttering fraud, corruption and bordered on organised crime.

The current President didn't fire Fraser, he shifted him over to, of all places, Correctional Services Director-General, in which position he has sat untouched by the investigation to this very day. Now that was, one supposes, the first of these step aside exercise and a jolly, highly paid step it was. Now, his chum, his lieutenant, is back where the looting took place and reports are that his reinstatement was on the orders of, wait for it, the President. What next? Is Fraser on his way back?

For the information of those who are perhaps unsure of what exactly this murky state security business entails, it's a three-legged pot that stands on the State Security Agency, Crime and Defence Intelligence. It is supposed to be the frontline force tasked with protecting every civilian in South Africa.

Now, if you imagine that the looting has only been happening at the SSA, you've just not been listening. A decade ago I spoke out about Mdluli looting from the Crime Intelligence, CI slush fund. And now the latest set of CIs has been suspended on what I believe to be a manufactured cloud hang over the heads of those trying to stop the looting, rather like the hatchet job they did on General Johan Booysen. We've watched as General Jacobs, who had finally turned off those looting taps in Crime Intelligence was himself perhaps inevitably stitched up, removed and dumped where he can do no harm.

And from all, I'm told the looting taps are switched on full again. Richard Mdluli, if they can find him, must be so pleased, yesterday a draft internal audit report revealed that R1,6 billion had been looted in personal protective equipment, PPE, procurements over just six months yet the man with the

letter from the Treasury giving him permission is the only one suspended.

Moving on to the third leg, the military, slim, fit, the cream of the crop. One might've imagined that Defence Intelligence was too principled to loot, well you will be wrong. In December we were startled to hear of weapons being stolen 19 R4s manufactured for extreme warfare taken in a robbery from a supposedly highly protected military facility. Of course, it was an inside job and was a stark reminder of an earlier theft of similar weapons. Oddly enough, weapons exactly like those, that have been used in various bank and cash-in-transit heists recently.

And there's more, a leaked investigation report has revealed a veritable looting spree of R4 billion from the SA National Defence Force, SANDF. The investigation implicates the Defence Intelligence bosses but has never been officially made public.

So the State Security Agency, Crime and Defence Intelligence, all involved in looting on a grand scale. What we need in each of these three entities is a drive to create modern, fully trained organisations led by extraordinary people able to

perform in this fast-paced world, not unqualified friends, lovers, and children.

We need an intelligence environment free of scandal and inefficiency. And as the High Level Panel Report states, we need to move away from the highly secretive intelligence milieu and look for the quality of the output rather than the quantity of the plundering. Of course, this government should focus primarily on the terrible situation the majority of South Africans find themselves locked into.

And what we as a country certainly do not need is this bloated expensive, secretive network. The High Level Panel Report gave crystal clear direction two years ago, but today all we see is infighting. We need clear priorities and visibly move away from that big man driven doctrinal shift, world-class training and a review of the legislation, bringing it in line with international best practice.

What we get is muddied waters, backstabbing on a brutal level and zero legislation to the extent perhaps committee Bills are the only way to go. Surely losing the court case to Amabhungane, which now prevents your bulk surveillance was a

wake-up call. We all know the rot goes much deeper than the six areas of unclear constitutionality identified by the court. We need these three agencies to provide unique insights into threats and trends, which will protect South Africa and all who live in it. We have just a flimsy washing line between us and war across the northern border. But let me repeat. No one has been jailed, not a single cent recovered.

Does the DA believe the looting has stopped? No. Does the DA believe the ANC wanted to stop? No. Does the DA know what claims were made by the Deputy Minister at the Zondo Commission? Yes. Does the DA believe the three agencies can be saved and enabled to do the crucial jobs they are mandated to do? Yes. And when we run South Africa, we will ensure that happens.

Dr M Q NDLOZI: Chairperson, it is important to immediately inform the people of South Africa the annual performance plans of State Security Agency were actually never processed with the Joint Standing Committee of Intelligence, JCI. On several occasions we witnessed the complete breakdown of working relations between the Minister and the agency, between the State Security Agency SSA acting chief financial officer and

those presiding over the national communication centre. In addition, we can count at least three different occasions in which the agency presented annual performance plans, APPs, which the Minister dismissed in front of the committee. Yet again demonstrating complete collapse of lines of communications and authority.

To bring this budget which was half baked in the final hours just to gain parliamentary approval, is dishonest and in complicity with the dysfunctionality of the SSA. We have never over the last 12 months received any strategic briefing that relates to the work of safeguarding national security from the SSA. Not ones have we ever been presented with any credible intelligence product. The work related to Cabo Delgado, for example, is much has to do with Defence intelligence. Each time we have interacted with the agency, it is either being to explain contravenes already in the media or to hear internal fights and squabbles.

They are so dysfunctional they cannot adequately perform their constitutional functions. Moreover, there is a massive resistance and sabotage of all efforts to have the National Communications Centre, NCC, responsible for interceptions to

find independent standing outside the SSA. This is achieved through budgetary sabotage mechanisms. Our own interaction with the judge for interception revealed how SSA does not comply with the required attempts to submit reports timeously and requests for interception. Another sign of either dysfunctionality or that they are actually engaging in illegal interception activities since they are not submitting any request.

Therefore, as JCI we cannot at least say what the money is being used for and under what conditions in the SSA.

In the past we could blame the secrecy of the institution which provided cover over corruption through a [Inaudible.] network of pretentious operations. Today, it is utter dysfunctionality.

We must further inform the people of South Africa about our own enquiry into why former acting director-general, DG, jafta went to testify in the Zondo commission without the Minister’s blessing. Jafta told us as a committee that he received instructions directly from the President of the Republic. He even indicated how the morning before his appearance at the

commission he had breakfast with the President to finalise or to touch on the presentation at the commission. This is all while the Minister of the same President went to court in an attempt to stop Jafta from going to the commission.

Apparently, also under the direct instruction of the same President.

We must tell the people of South Africa this to demonstrate the kind of madness we are dealing with - the kind of dramatic dysfunctionality which characterises the civilian intelligence operations. This is why we say the greatest threat to national security today is the SSA itself. The agency has to be forced to stabilise, take action on all those who have defied codes of practices and implicated in the abuse of state resources.

To this date despite evidence there is no single individual that has been fired or is being prosecuted for corrupt activities of the SSA. Since the appointment of the Minister and the Deputy Minister in 2019, the SSA has not improved.

We must also inform the people of South Africa the High Level Review report submitted by, amongst others, Mufamadi and others, has been internally discredited by the SSA. An example of this is that our own quest to find evidence supporting the

testimony led by Mufamadi and other SSA people like Jafta in which they claim that judges or people in the judiciary were in the SAA payroll. To this day, we have not seen evidence. The SSA/s own response is that the High Level Review Panel Mufamadi and Jafta are information peddlers or at least they are driven or were misled by information peddlers. Dangerous claims can be made in this country about an important institution like the judiciary by highly placed individuals in the civilian intelligence community without any evidence in whatsoever whether to ask as a committee or even to the Zondo commission. And there are no implications.

This is the evidence of the danger that the national security poses to the stability of South Africa. For if all of us were to believe that the judges of this country are on a payroll, it is a direct threat to the stability of our country since the courts [Inaudible.] the centre of resolving all types of disputes. And they must be trusted by all.

We must therefore reject this budget. Unfortunately, the role in stabilising SSA no longer lies with this executive. Their own President, the siting President of the republic, seems important and complicit to the instability of the State

Security Agency. The only solution is that we reject the budget, they go stabilise or the ANC government must be removed from power for a completely set of political leadership that will destabilise the over politicisation of the SSA and have it perform its function in line with the Constitution and the legislation. Thank you very much.

Mr M N NXUMALO: Hon Chairperson, this department has a critical mandate to provide our government with intelligence on both domestic and foreign threats to enable our government to respond to such threats timeously and decisively.

This department is a pillar of our democracy. It does not exist to serve the executive in whose control it is but to serve the people of South Africa, regardless of who is in charge at any point.

Properly executed the mandate of this department can assist this government in keeping ahead of threats to our sovereignty. However, this department cannot deliver on this mandate at this time. Instead of helping the government to understand security threats, this department has been mired in

gross irregularities, if not outright corruption, in the expenditure of public funds.

We are here today to discuss the budget for a Department which operates in the shadows and whose expenditure of public funds is not accounted for. Those of us who care to follow revelations in various platforms will note that this department does not properly account for its assets and does not have checks to prevent the plunder of our hard-earned taxpayers’ money.

Given the current climate of corruption in this government, this department has become a cash cow - not only for rogue intelligence operatives, but also for politicians.

We should ask ourselves where the plunder of this department’s funds will take this nation. Are we deriving value for money from the current model of funding of this department? Do we really know whether the funds allocated to this department will be used for their intended purpose?

Do we intend to keep this funding model, whose legitimate reasons for secrecy are being abused for the enrichment of a select few individuals, to the detriment of this country?

Hon members, we need to relook this. We need to respond to the threats posed to this department so that this Department can help us to respond to threats posed to this country.

Aside from the corruption in this department and the abuse of our funds for clandestine operations, which occur or do not occur, this department has let this country down. As we speak today, our railway infrastructure is in tatters, underworld criminal figures are running amok and public funds are looted by private entities in partnership with rogue elements in this government.

If this department was truly committed to its mandate, it would pay greater attention to these issues, which not only deprive our people of services by destroying critical infrastructure, but which may in the long-term, encourage a culture of impunity by eroding our democratic institutions.

Hon members, the IFP reiterates that in doing the little that it can, this department must focus on serving the people, not politicians or other members of this government.

This department must steer clear of invitations to participate in frustrating the will of the people by aiding one political outfit over another. The IFP believes that our political and legal systems are designed to work smoothly without any aiding and abetting by this department. We hope that the department will use its budget for its intended and lawful purpose. The IFP accepts this budget. Thank you.

Mr S N SWART: Thank you very much, House Chair. The ACDP shares the deep concerns about evidence given at the Zondo Commission relating to the high-levels of fraud and corruption at State Security Agency as referred to by various speakers today. The commission received testimonies from various members of the State Security Agency, SSA. They alleged even former President Zuma used intelligence service as a personal protective force. According to these allegations the agency even attempted to disrupt negative presentation in the media and recruit members of the judiciary of favourable court outcomes for President Zuma.

The earlier testimony of Dr Mufamadi who led the High-Level Review Panel into State Security as well as the then Acting Director-General, DG, Jafta both broadly collaborated evidence of the two ... [Inaudible.] ... that allegations are substantial true. What is of grave concern is millions of rands having slush funds were unlawfully paid to former President Zuma for his personal use according to allegations. State Security projects were also set up to influence factional battles within the ANC and anomaly to favour the ANC against opposition parties during election campaigns. Monies were also prioritised set aside for bribing of judges that is not beyond circumstantial evidence when the ANC such bribes were actually paid.

Now, Mr Jafta also disclosed that the ANC could not account for some R9 billion worth of assets causing Deputy Chief Justice Zondo to say: “How can a government not account for R9 billion.” With R9 billion imagine what you can do for the people. The ACDP agrees. In addition, the commission has also learned further evidence from Inspector-General alleged for his finance regarding the legal use and the flow of money within the intelligence services. Therefore, it is of grave concern to all of us ... [Inaudible.] ... serve under joint

standing committee. What he says is deeply concerning, such that our finance uses these monies for other things that, in fact, could affect our national security adversely, for example, South Africa’s money could be used to fuel your political tensions and even used to finance terrorism. This is deeply, deeply alarming, particularly when our country faces new threats of ... [Inaudible.] ... from Mozambique, possibly within our country itself.

The solution as many speakers have indicated is the urgent implementation of the Mufamadi High-Level Panel Report.

Indeed, as President Ramaphosa earlier said, in August last year, the ANC may not stand alone in the dock, but it does stand as an accused number one. The ACDP will regrettably and under this circumstances not support this Budget Vote. I thank you, House Chair.

Mr C H M SIBISI: House Chair, can I speak without the video my network is bad.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Okay, you’re

welcome, hon member.

Mr C H M SIBISI: Hon House Chair, when the High-Level Panel Review into the State Security Agency published its findings, it was clear about one concerning matter that the growing contagion by factionalism in the ANC had progressively worsen from 2009. With the revelations from the Zondo Commission what remains very clear is that the State Security Agency has been nothing but a cash cow made by factionalism within the ANC. Now, we have to come here and vote on its budget when so many revelations about corruption have taken place in that institution. This in a way makes us complicit to the corruption that has taken place in that institution and the biggest ... [Inaudible.] ... is that no one maybe charged or had to account.

That sums of money were stolen to fund nefarious activities that had nothing to do with the Intelligence Agency. The Inspector-General of Intelligence, Dr Dintwe, told the commission that monies were used for other things that, in fact, would affect our national Security Agency. Some of those monies could be used to fuel political tensions and there is evidence in our opposition that sum of those monies were used to finance a particular faction within the governing party.

With all these revelations the SSA allocation has increased

and will do so even in the outer years. The uMkhonto weSizwe, Mk, veterans have also alleged received funds from the SSA.

Surely, hon House Chair, where there’s smoke there’s fire. We cannot be comfortable approving budget for institutions that are poorly governed or governed by individuals who have no desire to serve South Africa, but to benefit themselves through taxpayers’ money. To say the least some of the allegations are disturbing, hon House Chair, the fact is we can sit here and debate this Budget Vote, but the bottom line is that the budget will be approved and looting of funds from the SSA will continue.

We, as the National Freedom Party state categorically that we do not support this Budget Vote due to the serious of allegation of corruption that we have learnt from the Zondo Commission. We refuse to allow monies to be pumped into this institution, in fact, we propose that the State Agency overall the High-Level Panel Review findings point to this direction. Thank you, House Chair.

Ms M C DIKGALE: Thank you very much, hon House Chairperson. Hon Ministers and Deputy Ministers, hon Members of Parliament,

compatriots, ladies and gentlemen, let me join my Chairperson and bid farewell to the retired Chief of the SA National Defence Force, General Solly Shoke together with other members of the Military Command Council including the now-retired Chief of Defence Intelligence, Lieutenant-General Jeremiah Nyembe. We thank our generals for their dedication and good services. We also welcome the new Military Command Council, MMC, under the leadership of the newly-appointed Chief of the SA Defence Force, General Rudzani Maphwanya, and our new Chief of Defence Intelligence, Lieutenant-General Thalita Mxakato, who is the first female to occupy this position and a member of the MMC. We congratulate our new commanders and wisdom strength in dealing with the challenges faced by our armed forces amid budget reductions in the past few years.

House Chairperson, defence intelligence is faced with several challenges related to budget cuts. The challenges faced by the Denel impact on the performance of our military intelligence, the failure of the Denel will lead to the erosion of our sovereign capabilities. When we visited Defence Intelligence headquarters in March this year, we were pleased with the work being done amid the challenges they faced, one of each including aging equipment in the ... [Interjections.] ... the

failure of Denel will lead to the erosion of our sovereign capabilities. When we visited the Defence Intelligence headquarters in March this year, we were pleased with the work being done and the challenges they faced, one of each including aging equipment in need of replacement.

If Denel is unable to provide the much-needed equipment, it means procurement would be done from private companies, mainly foreign which would then know the equipment capabilities used by our forces. This will compromise our defence capability.

Therefore, Denel perform should and must be saved to ensure the territorial integrity of our Republic. The budget cuts also impact on human resources for Defence Intelligence. Due to ceiling on compensation for employees as said by National Treasury, Defence Intelligence is unable to have all its staff compliment coupled with inadequate human resources is the challenge of vetting. Many of our soldiers are not vetted due to limited personnel in the vetting structure of Defence Intelligence. The recent years have seen the reduction in the recruitment of young people through the military skills development system programme.

House Chairperson, one of the greatest challenge faced by the Defence Intelligence is the location of its head-quarters. The Joint Standing Committee on Intelligence is aware of this challenge and has resolved to intervene by engaging the relevant Ministers to ensure that the situation is resolved.

We are pleased to note that Defence Intelligence will co- ordinate with other services to cure the defect found in the regulation of interception of communications and provisions of communication related information at Regulation of Interception of Communications Act, Rica, number 70 of 2002.

As it pertains to the unlawfulness and invalidity of ... [Inaudible.] ... interception as contained in the court judgement of AmaBhungane vs the Minister of Justice and Correctional Services.

Despite the challenges and budgetary constraints, we are pleased to indicate the following achievements: Achievement number one, Defence Intelligence has collaborated with other intelligence services and continue to monitor the situation in Mozambique, Cabo Delgado region; achievement number two, Defence Intelligence supported the SA Defence Force deployment in the Western Cape in an effort to suppress the unrelated violence; three, Defence Intelligence has successfully

commended with its Bachelor of Military Science Degree in January 2021, at the Faculty of Military Science, Stellenbosch University, located at South African Military Academy in Saldanha, this will equip our future intelligence officers will adequate skills and knowledge to safeguard our country and protect its people; four, Defence Intelligence supported our efforts by deployees personnel as part of the South African Defence during lockdown to curb the spread of the Covid-19 pandemic; and the last achievement, Defence Intelligence continues to deploy military attaches to various countries for Defence Diplomacy.

Given additional resources, House Chairperson, including adequate budget allocation, we believe that most of the challenges identified will be eradicated to ensure that South Africans are and feel safe. Although we wish for additional resources we fully support the budget and which more can be done for our security forces in general. The African National Congress fully supports the Budget Vote. I thank you, House Chairperson.

Mr M G E HENDRICKS: Hon Chairperson, I was a member of the Joint Intelligence Committee that approved the current budget

for this department. Al Jama’ ah will once again support your next budget. I personally used your service Deputy Minister, and I would like to commend your team service in Stanger and Durban. I have not met more professional and dedicated public servants. They are extra ordinary. I was doing oversight in the bush and the operators spotted the spider and stripped me to remove it. That shows their vigilance and attention to detail.

It cannot be that in Delft 22, people including the children were killed this past weekend. This budget must not allow this. I want the Deputy Minister to say it will never happen again. Like we say apartheid will never happen again, although some hon members in this House cannot wait for apartheid to return. That is why they must support Jainism which is inherently discriminatory and we hope it will be outlawed when the Protection Against Discrimination Bill becomes law.

We hear that the DA wants to run South Africa while every South African who hates apartheid says never again.

Once again, the official opposition bring to spouses of hon members into their debates. It happened to me not long ago

soon after I made a statement that Israeli ... [Inaudible.]

... occupy us. My wife was positioned as the only woman in South Africa against polyandry. Now we hear that the Minister’s spouse is a Central Intelligence Agency, CIA, operative. This must rank as the lowest level one can get in a debate and the biggest joke of the year. The DA needs to edit the speeches of their members.

The lack of personal safety, in our home, in our streets, in our schools and in our shopping malls is a matter of national security. This means that Deputy Minister you must zoom in at grassroots level. Use the budget to sort this out, otherwise return our money. We want your department to have robots ... [Inaudible.] ... fitted with artificial intelligence so you can anticipate threats to personal safety. Don’t expect us to approve your budget next year when we have not seen dramatic progress for personal safety.

National security - I hear operate outside the borders of the I want to know if you have enough money from this budget to save Africa from a regime change because of our position on Palestine, Cuba and Western Sahara. Do we have operators monitoring the 40 operational centres in Africa or America and

other countries to bring a regime change in South Africa? Why do you think Mozambique don’t want your help? It is because the conglomerates in America is sceptic on Mozambique. Hon House Chair, Al Jama’ ah supports the budget for approval and feel the country is in very good hands.

Mr J J MAAKE: Hon Chairperson, I will be reading the speech on behalf of hon Radebe. The Crime Intelligence Division suspension the committee hopes that all the plans will be implemented as presented to us. We have recently met with the leadership of Crime Intelligence led by the National Commissioner General Sithole, when they presented the Strategic Plan, Annual Performance Plan and the Crime Intelligence Budget in Pretoria.

We are pleased that work continues. Some of the challenges currently faced by the Crime Intelligence include the following. The inadequate budget which is a huge hindrance in terms of optimal functioning of crime intelligence. That is a major challenge. The issue of a budget makes it difficult to combat crime in the country without the maintenance of Crime Intelligence capability which include recruitment,

infiltration, handling and support of informants, police agents, co-workers and contracts.

The Auditor-General of South Africa has made several findings with regard to performance and financial management such as insufficient evidence not provided for achieved targets.

Irregular expenditure on sensitive projects, targets not specific and measurable as per the National Treasury regulations, lack of compliance with regulations, some deviations not approved by National Treasury and supply-chain management policies not aligned with legislations.

The committee is pleased that management is resolving some of these challenges and will report progress on quarterly basis. The vetting backlog is also a challenge. It was previously reported that some of the senior managers did not have the required security clearances. We are pleased to report that the vetting capacity has increased and is monitored continually.

With regard to border intelligence, Crime Intelligence was tasked to do an analysis on the impact of foreign nationals as either victims or perpetrators concerning crime. That work

continues. Vacancies are also a challenge. We note with concern that there are vacancies in some operational positions due to human resources constraints coupled with budget cuts.

Despite the challenges mentioned, we are pleased to indicate that Crime Intelligence has recorded achievements such as the following. Crime Intelligence has collaborated with other intelligence service `in monitoring the situations in Mozambique particularly as it pertains to links to some individuals located in our borders. Lifestyle audits for all south African Police Services, SAPS, members is currently underway. This has been a challenge in the past. And it will ensure that police officers who cannot explain their living above their means are investigated and if found on the wrong side of the law are dismissed from SAPS.

Several interventions to fight crime have been made with regard to cash-in-transit, gangsterism, kidnappers, terrorism on extensions that is on the construction sites, illegal land invasions and illegal smuggling of cigarettes that increased dramatically during COVID-19 lockdown. The committee support the budget. I thank you, hon Chairperson.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF STATE SECURITY: Thank you very much once more House Chairperson, thanks to the members for the comments they made, we welcome the fact that the members have supported the budget, including those who have made very constructive comments about the work of the agency, I think it is effectively in line with the theme of our Budget Speech, for example, where we say that national security is a responsibility for all of us. Even those who sounded like not agreeing, they do support the fact that you need a very vibrant and active agency in the context of national security and national structures, because, for example, a member of the NFP spoke about the need to go back to overhaul whilst not supporting. But you still need a budget to go back and overhaul. We welcome those constructive comments in that context.

Thanks a lot to the chairperson of the committee, J J Maake, for the kind of comments you made in the introduction. Let’s just respond to a few comments, chairperson, that you have made. Firstly, is that we are making a steady progress in implementing the recommendations of the High Level Review Panel Report and we indicated that in the report. Amongst others, for example, we are strengthening the policy and

compliance unit in the organisation so that we can deal with issues of accountability. I can assure members that what would probably be the fear in the past, we are now strengthening the issue of oversight and accountability in the organisation, including, amongst others, the good working relations the organisation is now re-establishing with the Joint Standing Committee on Intelligence in spite of difficulties that members have alluded to. We won’t allow a situation where, for example, the bad image of the past remains with this good organisation, including a suggestion that the organisation is literally only appointing corrupt people, infiltrated, people who are responsible for sabotage, espionage, and so on.

We must indicate as we said before to the Joint Standing Committee on Intelligence a number of times that in the organisation, there are many good men and women who make us as South Africans to sleep. If there may be one or two individuals ... I think time will come and show how much we have demonstrated our ability and capability with those individuals, including the five cases ... [Inaudible.] ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Deputy Minister, the line is becoming too bad. ... [Interjections.] ... Hon Minister. We seem to have lost him.

An HON MEMBER: They are very dysfunctional these people of State Security, Chairperson.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Hon Deputy Minister. I will give the hon Minister a chance.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF STATE SECURITY: I am back House

Chairperson; can you hear me?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): I can hear you. Go ahead hon Minister.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF STATE SECURITY: The point I just made about R9 billion that the Office of the Auditor-General has confirmed that no such amount appears on the audited statement, it confirms that when allegations are made, it is important to hear the other side because there could be an explanation for all allegations that are made. As members of

Parliament, who upholds the Constitution, it is important to respect and always remember that point.

The ministerial implementation task team, amongst others, which oversees the of the High Level Review Panel Report is dealing with the issue of separation, that is why, amongst others, the process which is before Parliament - the separation of SSA into a domestic and foreign branch – the process in this regard is to an extent that a draft Bill that will legislate the separation i.e. the General Intelligence Laws Amendment Bill has been drafted, a business case has also been drafted with the separation expected to be effected as early as next year, 2022. I am just highlighting this because a lot of this has been reported to the Joint Standing Committee on Intelligence. I must indicate though that we are also worried about some of the allegations that continue to be made at the Zondo Commission. We are monitoring them. We are putting in place structures to make sure that what is reported and had happened few years ago, never happens again within the state agency.

I must assure members, Chairperson, that members of the agency are hard at work; credible men and women, because sometimes

when you talk about few individuals we do make reference as though that the entire members agency are themselves corrupt, are involved in illegal operations, but there are men and women who keep our South Africa awake on a daily basis and keep us assured. That’s why we welcome the call that all Members of Parliament, including those in this House must continue to play a patriot duty to ensure that they are active participants and ensure that our national security is secured. Thank you very much, Chairperson.

Debate Concluded.

The mini plenary rose at 12:42