**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY - NATIONAL ASSEMBLY WEDNESDAY, 19 MAY 2021**

**VOTE NO 5 – HOME AFFAIRS**

***PROCEEDINGS OF MINIPLENARY SESSION – NATIONAL ASSEMBLY CHAMBER***

Members of the mini-plenary session met in the on the virtual platform in the National Assembly Chamber at 14:00.

The House Chairperson (Mr M L D Ntombela) took the Chair and requested members to observe a moment of silence for prayers or meditation.

**ANNOUNCEMENT**

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Hon members, before we proceed I would like to remind you that the virtual mini- plenary is deemed to be in the precinct of Parliament and constitutes a meeting of National Assembly for debating purposes only.

In addition to the rules of virtual settings, the Rules of the National Assembly, including the rules of debate, apply.

Members enjoy the same powers and privileges that apply in a sitting of the National Assembly. Members should equally note that anything said in the virtual platform is deemed to have been said to the House and may be ruled upon.

All members who have logged in shall be considered to be present; and are requested to mute their microphones and only unmute when recognized to speak. This is because the mics are very sensitive and will pick up noise which can disturb the attention of other members. When recognized to speak, please unmute your microphone and connect your video.

Members may make use of the icons on the bar at the bottom of their screens, which has an option that allows a member to put up his/her hand to raise points of order. The secretariat will assist in alerting the Chairperson to members requesting to speak.

When using the virtual system members are urged to refrain or desist from unnecessary points of order or interjections.

**APPROPRIATION BILL**

(Policy debate)

Debate on Vote No 5 – Home Affairs:

The MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS: Hon House Chairperson, my colleague, Deputy Minister of Home Affairs, hon Njabulo Nzuza, hon members of the Portfolio Committee on Home Affairs, hon members of the National Assembly, the Chairperson of the Independent Electoral Commission, IEC, Mr Glenn Mashinini, and the entire commission as well as the Chief Electoral Officer, Mr Sy Mamabolo, the Director-General of the Department, Mr Tommy Makhode, who is attending his maiden Home Affairs Budget Vote, we welcome him, Acting Commissioner of the Border Management Authority, Mr Gene Ravele, who is also attending his maiden budget speech the Acting Chief Executive Officer, CEO, of the Government Printing Works, GPW, Ms Alinah Fosi, and her team, members of the media, ladies and gentlemen.

Good afternoon to you all and thank you for your contribution in making the Department of Home Affairs the robust and responsive institution it is.

It is noteworthy that we meet today in a year when we are celebrating the life of the indomitable spirit of Mama Charlotte Maxeke, whose pioneering life was punctuated by encounters with the home affairs incarnation of her times; from her birth, to acquiring a passport to travel abroad, to registering her marriage and to recording her death.

It is worth remembering that Mama Maxeke was a political and social activist who championed women’s rights, culminating in her crucial role in the formation of organisation which ultimately delivered political freedom to South Africans.

That there are no records of her birth registration is an indication of a long distance we have travelled since then.

In its archives, the Department Home Affairs, today, has amassed an impressive 287 million records, spending as far back as 1895. But many a black person, would not be found in such records. This means that our work as home affairs to eradicate the scandal of invisibility and impose nonracism, needs to be expedited.

In celebrating her legacy, we are determined to increase our efforts in building an all-inclusive, caring, compassionate and enabling home affairs.

In this regard, the department has many initiatives in the pipeline, some are legislative and policy initiatives which will soon arrive in this Parliament for processing and enactment into laws. Among these, is the recently released Green Paper on marriage policy.

It is an incontestable fact that this country needs a new marriage policy based on three of the pillars of our Constitution, that is equality, nondiscrimination and human dignity.

At the present moment, to get married in South Africa you have to choose between three Acts of Parliament and decide under which one want to get married, firstly, the Marriage Act, Act

25 of 1961; secondly, Recognition of Customary Marriage Act, Act 120 of 1998; or thirdly, the Civil Union Act, Act 17 of 2006, which provides for same sex marriages.

These three Acts have many gaps, omissions and weaknesses. The three Acts do not cater or give recognition to Muslim marriages, Hindu marriages and marriages conducted according to Jewish rites.

Despite the enactment of Recognition of Customary Marriage Act by this very Parliament, traditional marriages taking place in many royal families, in terms of their traditions and rituals, are still not in the statute books of this country.

None of the existing laws prevent minor children from getting married; hence a girl below the age of 18 and a boy below the age of 17 can legally get married as long as their parents are prepared to send them off to such ill-conceived marriages by signing a consent.

Today, as I speak, we have many teenage widows and many teenage divorcees. This, of course, as you realize, has many unwanted social repercussions.

Out of every 10 marriages, four end in divorce before the 10th anniversary. It is disheartening that most of these divorces involve minors, they involve children.

This reality goes against the commitment we have made as a country through the Southern African Development Community, SADC, Protocol on Gender and Development which calls for an end to child marriages. In South Africa, we have not domesticated this agreement with SADC.

Today, 27 years after democracy, if you want your marriage solemnised, you have to either go to a minister of religion or an official working in the Department of Home Affairs who have been certified for such purposes. I am not against these, but my question is: What about other social groups? Why can’t a person in a far rural area go to Moshate or Musanda to have their marriage officially solemnised by a traditional leader, a king or a queen or any member of the royal family who is trained and certified by home affairs for such purposes? Why should we remain with a situation where other religious leaders cannot perform marriages according to their religious rituals?

The current marriage statute doesn’t recognise certain customary marriages that are conducted in some African communities, including royal families. It is because of these realities I have outlined above, which by no means are

exhaustive, that the department was prompted into action to start a discussion about marriage policy for the country.

Our starting point was to convene ministerial dialogues throughout the country, starting in August 2019. I, personally, attended and listened to religious leaders of various denominations; traditional leaders; Khoisan communities; academics; lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender, queer and intersex LGBTQI+ communities; gender activists; social activists and many more.

We recorded everything that stakeholders told us at this ministerial dialogues. We put out these proposals in the form of Green Paper to enable society to start a dialogue even before this is brought to Parliament.

It was with a deep disappointment that the envisage national dialogues turned into a war of words and cynicism about one, and only one of the issues that were raised in the ministerial dialogues, the issue of polyandry, which, like all others, as I have outlined above, was raised by some of the participants at the ministerial dialogues.

My deepest disappointment also was when even one media house - which I respect - or worse still, even members of this hon House in this Parliament, entered this dialogue in a completely misleading and destructive way. One respected media house even spoke of a Bill on polyandry which the Department of Home Affairs has placed in front of Parliament.

From the debates I’ve listened to, it became clear to me that many of such commentators did not even bother to read a copy of the Green Paper document that we have given to them.

Right at the beginning of that document, is written the following words:

The Green Paper is not the official policy position of government. It only articulates possible policy options or proposals that are based on inputs received from stakeholders during ministerial dialogues. These proposals will be subjected to public scrutiny [not public war].

We started with this preamble because that’s the actual meaning of the Green Paper.

The whole idea of a Green Paper is a British Westminster concept that we inherited through colonialism. Hence I will give you the Oxford English dictionary definition of a Green Paper:

It is defined as a “Preliminary report of government proposals published to stimulate discussion. Crucially, a Green Paper contains no commitment to action, it is more a tool of stimulating discussion, but it is often the first step towards changing the law.

On the other hand, a White Paper is issued by government as a statement of policy and often set out proposals for legislative changes or the introduction of the law. The proposals often emerge from a Green Paper process.

In short, Green is for consultation, White is for proposals; and there should be no confusing about that.

I am pleading that the national dialogues be constructive, responsible and in the true spirit of nation building. Please let’s lower the excitement and deal with very important issues which I’ve mentioned above, which our people have experienced

as hardships in their everyday existence, in their endeavour to build viable families, which every nation on earth strives for, for there is no nation without families.

So, Chair, we are eagerly waiting for your written and constructive inputs by the deadline of 30 June by this year.

The cornerstone of our efforts to improve security at our Ports of Entry and the borderline is the progressive implementation of the Border Management Authority.

We have already appointed the acting commissioner and we are working with the Presidency for a presidential minute to appoint a permanent commissioner together with two deputies.

We are also finalizing a presidential proclamation in terms of section 97 of the Constitution of the Republic that will start the process of transferring relevant border law enforcement functions and staff to the Border Management Authority.

We are intending that by the end of this financial year the Border Management Authority will be operational at least at 11 Ports of Entry as well as 10 segments of the borderline.

While we have suffered the well-known massive budget cuts, I am happy to mention that he initial budget to implement the Border Management Authority has been from R28 million to R120 million.

We also have the concept of One-Stop-Border Post, OSBP. As hon members may remember, in December 2020 we issued a gazette for the policy for implementation of the One-Stop-Border Post. The One-Stop-Border Post will be a public-private partnership, PPP, and it has now been registered as part of the Presidential Infrastructure Project. We are hoping to finalise this by this year, and all the contractual and financial arrangements for this model of a PPP.

On the issue of e-Gate implementation. We were able to pilot the roll-out of the Biometric Movement Control System at OR Tambo International airport. The department is working in collaboration with the Department of Transport and the Airports Company of South Africa, ACSA, to implement immigration e-Gates at three major international airports. Ten e-Gates are installed at Cape Town International Airport and testing taking place on South African travellers entering and departing the country.

On the e-Visa, we have already piloted the e-Visa system in Kenya. We then added China, India and Nigeria because these three account for one-third of the world’s population. We have now added 10 more countries on the roll-out, these are: Cameroon, Democratic Republic of Congo, DRC, Egypt, Ethiopia, Mexico, Uganda, Saudi Arabia, Iran, Philippines and Pakistan.

Please remember that most of the countries which I’ve not mentioned here have a visa-free status into our country and hence they don’t need the e-Visa system. These will include the whole of SADC, most of Western Europe, North America, Brazil in South America and Russia in the East. Now, add the seven other visa-free countries which I’ve mentioned in my previous budget speech.

Let me go to the Independent Electoral Commission. In the previous budget speech, I announced that the IEC was planning to increase the reliability and integrity of the elections by using more advanced technology. This was at the aftermath of the infamous allegation of double-voting which nearly rocked the 2019 National and Provincial elections.

I am very pleased to announce that to prevent these allegations from being made, the IEC has recently concluded the process to procure 40 000 new Voter Management Devices, VMD, to replace the outdated zip-zap machines. These new devices will be a game-changer for the management of the election process and more importantly the election itself. This device will in real-time reflect in all the voting stations whenever you cast your vote, at any one voting station in the country. It means when you vote in one voting station, all the thousands of voting stations in the country will record that you have voted; because this device is in real time. This will preclude any voter trying to take any chances by voting twice. Even if anything happened to the ink as it was alleged ... [Interjections.]

Ms J TSHABALALA: Hon House Chair, my humble apologies for disturbing Minister. It’s just that he’s been fading away. So, we were not seeing your picture fully, hon Minister, we were only seeing your hands. I just thought, let me alert you.

Thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): It’s the network

problem, hon member.

The MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS: Hon Chair, I was saying this issue of the Voter Management Devices will preclude any chances of voting twice. Even if anything happened to the ink as it was alleged in 2019, the VMD will make sure that no voting twice is ever possible.

On the Constitutional Court ruling on independents, which many people believe we are not serious about. You are aware that I’ve appointed a very experienced team comprising of experienced multidisciplinary professionals to help the country to come up with a robust electoral system. The team is led by former government Minister, Mr Valli Moosa. They’ve already held dialogues and consultations with political parties and non-political youths. They have already started the work of a draft Bill. They intend to present a draft Bill to me early in the next quarter.

Government Printing Works is one to state entities which is self-financing and is able to have surpluses despite not getting a cent from the Treasury. Despite COVID-19, the Government Printing Works is still able to financially hold on and despite the numerous problems, which the members of the

Portfolio Committee on Home Affairs are aware of, it is still able, with their surpluses, to help us.

Chairperson, I want to report that this new Voter Management Devices bought by IEC, they bought it with money which was donated by Government Printing Works to home affairs which then sent it to the IEC.

Government Printing Works is now extending its footprint into SADC countries in a way of performing printing work for them.

The Government Printing Works artisan and graduate skills development programme has already trained and employment 30 graduates; mostly youth and women.

Earlier this year I was perturbed when Government Printing Works experienced a system down-time where the data centre was hit by a power surge that damaged critical hardware. These service interruptions and data loss affected the auditing process at the Government Printing Works and it frustrated the legal system of the country because gazettes could not be printed.

I have already taken steps to get to the bottom of this problem because the facts at our disposal points to the direction that this was not just a mere accident. I am going to report the steps I’ve taken to the portfolio committee.

In February this year, I put up a Ministerial Committee headed by the former Director-General in the Presidency, Dr Cassius Lubisi, to review all the permits issued since 2004; the year in which the immigration out came into effect. All the Permanent Residence Permits, corporate visas, business visas, professionals visa, retired persons’ visa, citizenship by naturalization and study visas, are going to be reviewed and I’m waiting for the first report by the end of this month because they promised me that they will give the first report in three months’ time.

Lastly, Chair ... [Time expired.]

But I was disturbed, Chairperson, somebody took my minutes.

I’m sure you’re aware of that.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): I’ve added a few

seconds, hon Minister. I wish I could do more than that.

The MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS: Can I use a few seconds of when

I’m going to close so that I close ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): I’ve already

afforded you 25 of it, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS: Okay.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Sorry about that.

Mr M S CHABANE: House Chairperson, members of the House, Minister and Deputy Minister, Chairperson of Independent Electoral Commission, IEC, chief executive officer, Acting Chief Executive Officer of Government Printing Works, fellow South Africans, as the legislative arm of the state Parliament is not only charge with the responsibility of enacting, amending and repealing the laws. It also charges with the responsibilities of overseeing and scrutinising the actions of the executive and approving the budget. In this regard, it gives me the pleasure to table before the House the report of the Portfolio Committee on Home Affairs Budget Vote No 5 for approval by this House.

House Chairperson, all South Africans are dependent on the Department of Home Affairs because of its sole mandate to secure official identities and status, including the international migration, refuge protection and population register.

The Department of Home Affairs services are divided into two broad categories, civil and emigration services. The Department of Home Affairs is the key enabler for national security, citizen empowerment, efficient administration and social economic development. This function Chairperson, must be managed securely and strategically. In this regard, the strategic registration to reposition the department of Home Affairs as a modern secure department which will provide our nation with the powerful tool for economic and social transformation. The Department of Home Affairs Bill becomes critical in this regard.

The Bill intended to be an anchor legislation in the form of how Home Affairs Act which is aimed to provide a coherent legal framework for repositioning the department to deliver on the mandate accrued for a sovereign state that has a

Constitution founded on democracy, inclusion, social justice, peace and security.

House Chairperson, Programme 2 aims of the Department of Home Affairs aims provide secure, efficient and accessible services for the citizens and lawful residents. It covers the activities of Civic Services branch at the national and provincial level as well as abroad in our mission where we service our diaspora. The Civic Services branch achieves two out of the plan three annual targets during the 2019-20 financial year which is translating to 67% of annual performance targets achievement.

During this financial year, the civic affairs programme was not successful in the achieving 33% of its annual target. For the 2021-22 financial year, the programme has been revised its annual target in response to the Covi-19.

House Chairperson, Programme 3 which is immigration affairs aims to facilitate and regulate the secure movement of people through the ports of entry into and out of the Republic of South Africa. This programme is also responsible for determining the status of asylum enabling affairs.

As reported in 2019-20 annual report, the Immigration Affairs Programme was the best performing in most improved branch in the department. It has planned six annual performance target for the 2019-20 financial year. And it has achieved all of its targets. This translate to 100% targets as achievement compared to two previous years and this has indicated an above average performance of the three consecutive years.

House Chairperson, as it has been highlighted by the Minister earlier on the committee appreciated the Department of Home Affairs progress on the formation of policy and legislative programme. That seeks to enhance and repositioning the department which will be tabled in Cabinet for approval this financial year. Amongst the policy which the Minister has highlighted is the one stop border post policy and over rolling of our citizen and immigration laws.

House Chairperson, over the medium term, the Home Affairs will focus on establishing an in crematory operationalise the Border Management Agency, BMA, to secure international migration in continuing with its IT modernisation programme to expand its interface and ensure a timeously permits and visas.

For the 2021-22 financial year, the department received an allocation of R8,7 billion compared to the R8,8 billion special adjustment allocation of financial year 2020-21

The adjustment budget including revenue generation include issuing of civil documents. In an annual term to the budget, the department budget decreases by 1,1% from the previous year. And this allocation translate decrease of R447,3 million in real rand value.

Chairperson, this is a concern given that the department responsibilities are decreasing considering the rollout of the of BMA once our border posts and the modernisation of its IT infrastructure.

Only two of the programme show a real increase in the current financial year. The Immigration Service branch shows a real increase of 7% while the institutional progress shows a slight increase of 1,2%.

Chairperson, as you noted that during the state of the nation address 2021 the Budget speech has indicated government dire fiscal constrain and this has led to budget cut and the

Department of Home Affairs has not been spared. While this is the case, it is critical Chairperson that the key strategic project such as Border Management Authority of our border ports, reposition programme and implementation modernisation must be implemented.

House Chairperson, the Independent Electoral Commission, IEC, is one of the important body of the Chapter 9 Institution which preside and conduct our election has been allocated R2,4 billion for the 2021-22 financial years which it shares amongst four programmes.

The IEC budget grows in nominal and real terms. This budget increase of R292,3 million in nominal terms and 199,3 million in real terms. Electoral operations received the largest share of the IEC overall budget. It has been allocated R1,3 billion which is equivalent to 57% of IEC overall budget.

This year 2021, is the year for elections of local government and the increase is thus consistent with the funding of activities which is underpin the delivery of elections. This budget Chairperson amongst others issues it has been earmarked for use, funding for preparation for general registration

confirmed for the weekend for 17 and 18 July. The upgrading for voter registration devices, the funding of events and election time table including administration for special votes, voting day activities, collision of announcement of election results.

House Chairperson, over the years, IEC showed a progress on its operation to manage our elections and recently Parliament has passed some pieces of legislation that gives effect to strengthen its capacity to carry its full obligations and the Chapter 9 Institutions.

The committee congratulate the commissioner Chairperson Mashinini and the entire administration led by Mr Mamabolo for the sound financial standing and good governance and the Minister has highlighted, Chairperson. The portfolio committee will collectively with the Minister and the task team led by Valli Moosa work hard to respond to time frame as outlined by Goncourt on electoral reform.

House Chairperson, Government Print Works facilitate the implementation of the legislation that governs the production and management of identification, citizenship and travel which

are developed by the Department of Home Affairs. Government Printing Works has today managed to engage inside the country with the strategic intend of expanding its footprint into the SA Development Community, SADC, region. While the institution is good in financial position, the committee raised concerns with continues negative highlight that will contribute to destabilise its government.

We call the Minister to fast-track the appointment of the chief executive officer, the chief financial officer and strategic co-operation personnel

The portfolio committee will conduct oversight in the coming weeks so that we come closer to the challenges that the Minister has identified and which the committee has also identified. While this is the case Chairperson, we commend the department, the Government Printing Works and the IEC on what has been able to achieve despite the challenges that they faced during the Covid-19.

Portfolio committee will continue to play an oversight role over the executives and supporting its work to ensure that

South Africa is the better place for all. I thank you, Chairperson.

Ms T A KHANYILE: Thank you, House Chair. House chair, this budget does not demonstrate how it plans to improve the service at the Department of Home Affairs. The department’s performance keeps deteriorating and the citizens of this country are the ones who are being failed. A number of issues have been raised yet to date, they remain unresolved. The issue of long queues in different parts of the country and by various members of the portfolio committee have been raised on numerous occasions yet the situation remains the same.

Citizens of this country spend the days and weeks at the queues without being attended to and lose days of work because the department has not introduced the appointment system.

House Chair, around February 2021, we were advised by the Minister that the department has deployed the Extended Public Works, EPW, workers to Eastern Cape who were going to be trained on the Home Affairs system to assist in the fight against long queues and to date we have not received progress report to ascertain whether that intervention was successful and when it is going to be rolled out to other provinces to

ensure that members of the community get the service they deserve timeously. To mention a few, Councillor Mariette Preddy, has registered a number of complaints advising that officials are failing to deal with long queues at Nkomazi Home Affairs offices in Mpumalanga and that there is no queue marshal who’s ensuring that members of the community were maintaining social distancing as per the Covid-19 regulations.

We also conducted oversight at Benoni Home Affairs offices in Gauteng where an issue of long queues was raised by Councillor Sinethemba Matiwane. The DA reiterates the call for Home Affairs to introduce an appointment system to make the lives of South African citizens easier. While we await the implementation of Boarder Management Act, the budget is null on an immediate plan to deal with our porous borders. In November 2020, Mr Bushiri and his wife Mary, escaped to Malawi without anyone being able to detect how they left South Africa. The DA called on the Minister to account, he appeared before the portfolio committee and advised that he doesn’t know how the couple left our country and further told us that he will meet with other departments involved and provide feedback and to this date there has been no report from the

Minister. The Minister is failing the citizens of this country.

In January 2021, people and trucks travelling in and out of the country using Beit Bridge and Lebombo points of entry were not attended to. Travellers spent weeks at the border gates because of the department’s incompetency. It was only after the DA called on the Minister to intervene after the portfolio committee as well conducted an oversight that we saw progress. We also went to Mbuzini and we made a shocking discovery there is only a fence that separates South Africa from Swaziland. We also have a picture as evidence. We also saw people that were crossing at that fence and being transported by taxis into South Africa. We need an urgent plan to combat the issue of our porous borders. The DA will improve border management control by reviewing the number and size of border post and their management to increase the number of points of legal entry and exists.

The increased number of border posts with heightened serving policing will also serve to prevent criminality activity, illicit trade, poaching and stock theft and enable and improve the efficiency of ongoing inter-border and trans-regional

trade and investments to build businesses and create jobs. Ensuring effective, efficient and co-ordinated border security and border control through increased policing capacity at our border posts along our borders. Increasing 15 SA National Defence Force, SANDF companies protecting South Africa’s borders to the required 22 companies and ensuring that they are properly resourced and trained, making use of crime intelligence and combating all forms of crime and corruption irrespective of whether it is committed by foreign nationals or South Africans to prevent bribery and corruption by Home Affairs, Saps and Sars officials or staff. Decisively dealing with the poor border management and weak implementation of migration policy, the use of research and data from a well capacitated StatsSA.

In August 2020, during the debate vote the Minister stood on the podium and told the House that after I had been sued by the government ... [Inaudible.] ... acting chief executive officer, CEO, after allegations that she was not qualified for the CEO job she was shortlisted and interviewed for following a statement the DA issued calling for the CEO to be suspended pending the outcome of the investigation on a number of allegations levelled against her. Today in his response, the

Minister must tell us why did he re-advertise the Government Printing Works, GPW, CEO post in September 2020 and change the requirements to seemingly suit Miss Fosi.

Today House Chairperson, I speak on behalf of every woman that we do not want to be reduced to gender we want to be appointed based on merit. Albert Einstein once said, Chairperson, and I quote “The world will not be destroyed by those who do evil but by those who watch them without doing anything” House Chair, the DA will always ensure that it holds the executive accountable and fight for the rights of our voters. There is no amount of intimidation that will stop us from conducting our oversight role. Minister Motswaledi must step down before he leaves this department in the same state he left the Health Department. Thank you.

Mr M TSHWAKU: Thank you very much, House Chair. Chairperson, we reject the Budget Vote on the Home Affairs. The department is the most dysfunctional department of the state in this country and that can be directly attributed to the incompetence of the leadership that is there, especially, the Minister Motswaledi. The department has onerously improved and it was running efficiently when it was run by Minister

Nkosazana Dlamini-Zuma and it continued on that trajectory until Minister Motswaledi took over. When he took over, Mr Motswaledi declared war on the queues at the Home Affairs and then instead of dealing with the problems he’d rather seen that he himself is the problem and that he has not started any war against any long queues at the Home Affairs and he looks as if he is defeated already.

I wish that on his response that he is going to give he is going to give a proper answer in terms of when are the queues in that Home Affairs will be eradicated because that is the outcry in the whole country. That is actually the highest ... [Inaudible.] ... with calls, social media, the dissatisfaction in terms of the long queues and how the Home Affairs is processing and executing its duty. Over and above this the majority of the Home Affairs across the country suffer from a chronic problem of having the systems being offline almost all the time. For example, in Johannesburg and King Williams Town, they are forever offline and that no one actually knows what staff of Home Affairs are doing at these offices. Over and above this, the services offered by the department are simply not accessible to many people who are living in the rural areas. We’ve raised this a number of times.

People go to the Home Affairs early in the morning to find that the systems are offline and they travel miles and miles. a person from Cofimvaba going to Home Affairs and when they get there the systems are offline. How are those people going to pay so that they can come back again? So it is a system, Chair, that is always offline and Home Affairs not operating and it’s eating on the pockets of those who are poor to be able to go and get their things. Despite this, the department in their budget they have no plans of some kind of opening up satellite offices in remote areas where their services are needed the most. Now one thing that was confirmed by Sir, Mr Sihle Zikalala in the KwaZulu-Natal, - so that we don’t say that maybe we are accusing him - he said that, there are people who are arriving at Home Affairs at 4h00 in the morning and the Home Affairs opens at 10h00, well, it opens at 8h00 but the people start working at 10h00.

From 10h00 up until 12h00, and then after that you’ll find that they will say that the system is offline, they go to lunch and you will not know what is actually happening. It is happening, it was confirmed in the KwaZulu-Natal where Mr Sihle Zikalala did an oversight. So, it is not that maybe we are accusing him of not being able to do these things. So, we

are saying that, what is happening right now is a crisis everywhere. People are crying about the system being offline, not being helped on time by Home Affairs. So, in that budget we did not see a plan or money allocated to saying that this is what we’re going to make sure that we are going to channel the money that we are ensuring that these queues and also the system which are offline at Home Affairs are going to be eradicated.

Now let’s move to the government printing works. The government printing works is on the verge of collapse and that is due to the lack of leadership. There are a lot of people who are acting there as if there is some sort of soap opera.

The leadership is not able to engage the stakeholders so that an amicable solution is actually reached. The government works

- you find that we’ve just learnt now something very serious and it can be considered to be an espionage - is that the financial data has been lost and the Auditor-General is unable currently to carry out the 2021 audit. The data is lost. Boom! It’s gone and the question is that at the government printing works there was no back up system. In each and every department you must have what is called a disaster management policy. So, the question is, did the government printing works

have a disaster management policy? In the committee it was said that the Auditor-General cannot do their work, they cannot hold this department accountable, data is gone.

Chairperson, the government printing works has received a disclaimer audit opinion for the 2019 and 2020 financial year. The acting CEO and the Minister are refusing to sign that audit report. They must tell here, in this meeting, why are they not signing it. It has been delayed and delayed all the time I think there are some ... [Inaudible.] ... happening.

The letters are being sent left and right to try and avert that. So, there is a disclaimer happening in that place. At the government printing works there is a loss of morale as a result, a petition signed by employees outlining the alleged corruption. There is a lack of leadership at the government printing works, Chairperson. The relationship between the ex- co members has broken down to a point that maybe is even reconcilable. The relationship between the ex-co members and also the unions is not actually happening, plus minus 600 ex- co employees led by those unions, there is no relationship there.

So, the Minister must actually in his response, in saying that how is this thing going to make sure that is it done and also that government printing works is not going to collapse. On the Independent Electoral Commission, IEC, the IEC in cahoots with the leadership of the ANC, have said that we must go for local government elections this year, despite the fact that the country is ravished by coronavirus. To date, they have not indicated how they will safeguard the health of our people and to dealing with the voter registration. [Time expired.] Oh!

Thank you very much, Chairperson, but ke(nevertheless) we reject this budget. Thank you.

Ms L L VAN DER MERWE: House Chairperson, imagine waking up at 04:00am using your last bit of money on transport to go to your local Home Affairs office, hoping that today you’ll be able to get an identity document, ID, because that ID is what stands between you and a job; it is what stands between you and providing for your family; it stands between you and a brighter future. Then consider the mother who travels to her Home Affairs office in search of a birth certificate. That document stands between her and her SA Social Security Agency, Sassa, grant, without which she cannot feed her newborn baby.

For many, visiting a Home Affairs office means taking a day off work to queue for hours on end, only to be told to come back tomorrow because the systems are offline again. Systems that are perpetually offline have become synonymous with this department. This, despite a task team having been set up to resolve this issue, but little to no progress has been made in this regard. It is therefore absolutely baffling that Home Affairs still has no appointment system, more so, that its services have not been rolled out to all banks; banks which have been eager to assist our department.

This is simply a dysfunctional department. Call centre calls and emails go unanswered. Our borders are open to anyone willing to cross a river or to pay a syndicate. Lawyers for Human Rights estimates that, according to the statistics that they have from the World Bank, South Africa is home to

15 million undocumented migrants. If that is indeed true, it poses a massive risk to our state, yet this department has absolutely zero plan to address this crisis.

Then, our asylum seeker system has been abused to the point where economic migrants from all over the world have set up businesses, completely wiping out spaza shops that once

supported many South African families. Yet, on this issue, Home Affairs simply passes the back to the Department of Small Business Development which passes the buck back to the Department of Home Affairs, and ultimately on to municipalities. While lawlessness flourishes, our Ministers simply look the other way.

Our Minister is on record as saying, and he repeated it earlier, that his department has not yet lost the war against corruption. Yet, we know that corruption is eating away at the very heart and credibility of this department. Some will tell you with pride how they only need to save up a couple of rand to buy a South African document. This is a crime against the South African state and its people, yet it’s not clear whether a single official is currently in jail doing hard time for selling our documents.

Six months since the Bushiris escaped our country, we still don’t know which government official aided and abetted them. The Minister in charge of immigration affairs, Minister Motsoaledi, also seems to be none the wiser. While lawlessness flourishes, our Ministers simply look the other way.

The much-lauded Border Management Authority, supposedly being the panacea to our border management problems, has not been fully operationalised because it’s still not clear where the funds will come from. What we do know, through a Cabinet task team cochaired by the Ministers of Labour and Home Affairs, is that some sectors in our economy employ mostly, if not only, foreign nationals. This at a time when more than 30% of South Africans and 50% of our youth are unemployed. In our mines, in our restaurants, in the trucking industry and elsewhere, South Africans are overlooked for job opportunities. Yet, instead of fixing this, our government responds by calling on Cuban nationals to take up engineering posts while South African engineers are sitting at home.

This department is presiding over a full-scale immigration management crisis. For as long as this department fails to implement its own laws; for as long as it regulates South Africans to the unemployment lines and Sassa queues; and for as long as it makes no effort to correct all of this, we cannot support this Budget Vote. I thank you.

*Afrikaans*:

Mnr F J MULDER: Agb Huisvoorsitter, die werklike omvang van die skade wat swak regering, staatskaping en korrupsie aan die staat se vermoë aangerig het om die bepalings van die Suid- Afrikaanse Grondwet gestand te doen, is onberekenbaar. Soos wat die geval is met al die begrotingsdebatte in die Parlement, is die vermoë van die Departement van Binnelandse Sake selfs voor COVID-19 grootliks verswak en na die COVID-19 inperkings vererger tot op die rand van ineenstorting.

Indien die Departement van Binnelandse Sake gemeet word aan die voldoening van sy mandaat wat uit die Suid-Afrikaanse Grondwet voortpruit, naamlik om die Suid-Afrikaanse burgerskap en siviele status te bestuur; die identiteit van Suid- Afrikaanse burgers te bewaar; die land se bevolkingsregister te bestuur; en ook migrasie te monitor, kan ’n mens dan sekerlik met reg vra waarom daar soveel klagtes van die Suid- Afrikaanse publiek ontvang word oor geboortesertifikate wat nie uitgereik word nie; ID-kaarte wat onnodig lank neem om uit te reik; reis dokumente, en veral paspoorte**,** wat doodgewoon glad nie verwerk word nie.

Die antwoord is eenvoudig. Die Departement van Binnelandse Sake en veral sy kantore ooral in die land, is nie meer

toegerus om sy mandaat uit te voer nie en is dus grootliks disfunksioneel.

Selfs die befondsing aan politieke partye om veelparty- demokrasie te bevorder, is benadeel omdat die begroting vir die toedeling aan partye vir die 2020-21 finansiële jaar afwaarts van R33,2 miljoen na R21,9 miljoen aangepas is.

Die Onafhanklike Verkiesingskommissie, OVK, se vermoë om met Suid-Afrika se komende landswye munisipale verkiesing op

27 Oktober 2021 te deel is ook hierdeur benadeel en gaan daar byvoorbeeld vanweë ’n kleiner begroting, slegs een registrasie naweek plaasvind en nie twee soos wat die gebruik was met vorige algemene verkiesings nie. Die VF Plus verwelkom wel die verhoging in die OVK se operasionele begroting van

R1,3 miljard, wat met R169 miljoen of 15,4% meer is as die vorige finansiële jaar.

Suid-Afrika se jare lange poreuse grense bly egter onopgelos met groot getalle mense wat veral uit Zimbabwe en Mosambiek die land nog steeds binnestroom, ongekontroleerd. Die oorgrens smokkel van vee**,** sigarette en dwelms vind vir ’n geruime tyd reeds oop en bloot plaas naby Pella mond in die Noord-Kaap**.** Ek

was self op uitnodiging van Namibiese boere verlede week op

13 Mei in Namibië op die plek waar vee vrylik deur die Oranjerivier gejaag word en was selfs ’n getuie terwyl ’n trop perde deur die rivier gejaag word**,** terwyl die departement daarvan bewus is.

Die VF Plus bedank wel senior amptenare wat tot nou toe gehelp en bygestaan het om krisisse rondom paspoorte en grensbeheer aan te spreek. Die Departement van Binnelandse Sake sal egter onder hierdie buitengewone omstandighede, buitengewone maatreëls moet tref om aan sy grondwetlike mandaat te voldoen. Hierdie maatreëls ontbreek nog. Dankie Voorsitter.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS: Hon House Chairperson, the Minister of Home Affairs Dr Aaron Motsoaledi, members of the executive, the chairperson and members of the portfolio committee, the chairperson of the Independent Electoral Commission, IEC, the Director-General and the management team of Home Affairs, fellow countrymen and women, we are slowly but surely emerging out of a difficult period in our country. We have operated in times that were unforeseen. Even today we are still navigating our way. We are however not only hopeful but confident that the worst will soon be behind us as we move

forward to a better future. We would not be where we are today had we not been able to stand together as a nation, caring for each other and making sacrifices for each other.

Today, we pay homage to all those who have lost their loved ones, some of them who are our friends, family members and colleagues. The study by the *Government Communication and Information System,* GCIS**,** indicates that South Africans believe that government has managed the pandemic very well. Our focus is now on economic reconstruction and recovery, and our collective efforts are beginning to yield positive results. We must however remain vigilant in our fight against COVID-19, as most signals point towards a third wave.

As Home Affairs, we have embraced the challenges before us posed by the pandemic and we have continued to provide access to critical services, whilst maintaining a delicate balance to the adherence of COVID-19 regulations.

As the Department of Home Affairs, we have ensured that we keep our offices open to continue to provide services, in particular death registrations for those bereaved ... Our staff have weathered the storm, as 1 048 were infected while

32 have passed on from COVID-19 as of the 13th of May 2021. The rate of infections represented almost a fifth of our front- line staff of 5 562.

The impact of this has been seen in some provinces where we had to close our offices more than once, impacting on service delivery. However, we have put measures in place to mitigate the infection rate, such as procuring personal protective equipment, PPE, for all our staff; ensuring social distancing in our offices; providing sanitation stations at our offices; training our staff on adherence to COVID-19 protocols and regulations; and clearly marking areas outside and inside offices for social distancing.

We are happy to report back on how we have performed as a department towards the realisation of our exclusive mandate, which is to determine and affirm the official identity and status of all citizens and noncitizens who reside in our beautiful land. We derive our mandate from the Constitution, which stipulates that:

Firstly, we must ensure that no citizen may be deprived of citizenship;

Secondly, that every child has the right to a name and nationality from birth; and

Thirdly, that every citizen has the right to a passport.

By affirming citizenship, we are essentially building a single reputable national identity and enabling the state to provide access to administer services efficiently and securely. This key role ensures that individuals are able to access all rights as set out in the Bill of Rights.

Citizens who cannot affirm their official identity cannot access social services, participate in an election, legally cross a border, open a bank account, travel by plane or even sign a contract. They are also not added to the official statistics used to plan and provide services, and future generations will not know of their existence as they are not recorded on the civil register.

We have made good progress towards universal early birth registration, which is one of the key responsibilities of government and an essential component of security, good governance and sound administration. The department continues

its venture to ensure that all births are timeously registered and that no child’s birth is left not registered in South Africa. To optimise birth registration, the department continues to improve connectivity at health centres through its increased footprint plan as per the birth optimisation strategy.

During the 2020-21 financial year, the department set a target of registering 750 000 births within 30 days. I am happy to report that the department managed to register 1 019 582 births, of which 751 087 were births registered within

30 calendar days. In this current financial year, the plan is to optimise birth registrations at 210 health facilities immediately as births occur, to achieve 90% birth registrations within 30 days by 2024.

The optimisation of birth registrations at health facilities will see an incremental increase of 182 additional health facilities in the 2022-23 financial year and 1 012 in the 2023-24 financial year, leading to a total target of

1 445 health facilities countrywide. In achieving this strategy, the department has begun with the project of a paperless automation of birth registrations to embrace

technological advancement with the view of eradicating statelessness and curbing fraudulent birth registrations. This automation project is currently completing its pilot at

24 offices and will see a staggered roll-out with required updated infrastructure in the current 2021 financial year.

The 2020-21 financial year started out with an annual identity document, ID, smart card target of three million ID smart cards issued to persons 16 years of age and above. However, with the advent of the COVID-19 pandemic, the department was faced with a huge challenge in the way that we normally deliver our services.

During the national state of disaster alert level 5**,** in which the movement of people was restricted, the department also had to implement measures to adhere to the call to limit the spread of the pandemic whilst making sure that citizens in need of documents receive such services.

The department managed to issue 17 million ID smart cards since inception in 2013. For the 2020-21 financial year alone, the performance stood at more than 1,2 million ID smart cards issued to citizens 16 years of age and above, which is an

overachievement by 324 935 against the set target. A total of 622 539 ID smart cards were issued to first-time applicants comprising mainly of the youth and 611 144 were reissues, which is the replacement of the green ID books or ID smart cards that have been lost by citizens.

As of the 30th of April 2021, we had a total of

429 994 uncollected IDs that are currently in our offices nationwide. We therefore urge applicants to visit their local Department of Home Affairs immediately upon receiving notification that their documents are ready for collection.

During the month of June 2020, all Home Affairs offices across all provinces embarked on a campaign to assist learners in obtaining ID smart cards, to ensure that they remain eligible to sit for their matric exams without the need to disrupt the learning programme. This initiative coincided with the important milestone in our history of June 16, which led to the dedication of the month of June to the youth. As a build up to national Youth Day, each province identified schools with learners that were without IDs and who were eligible.

These learners were assisted with applications for ID smart cards.

On Youth Day, we then officially launched the learner ID smart card programme in Mpumalanga, with each of our provincial offices around the country assisting learners without IDs to obtain their ID smart cards. Indeed, this led to an overall issuance of 622 539 ID smart cards to first-time applicants, which were predominantly the youth.

Concerted efforts were made to ensure that mobile offices have all the necessary equipment to ensure functionality. In October 2020, this programme was intensified and became focussed on those individual learners who registered for the 2020 National Senior Certificate. Out of 15 551 learners that were identified, 8 187 learners were South African citizens who had no IDs and we had to make sure that they get their IDs, whilst 7 364 were found to be non-South African citizens.

During this financial year, the Department of Home Affairs will continue with this programme in partnership with the Department of Basic Education, to ensure that every qualifying Grade 12 learner is not without an ID, and those who are foreign nationals are provided with study visas.

The pandemic has emphasised the need to fast-track innovation in respect of how we render services, as well as revolutionising our back-office functions. Many of our clients are already using the e-HomeAffairs service channel launched in 2016, allowing them to pay online, schedule an appointment, and apply for ID smart cards and passports at 25% ... bank branches that are participating in this project. Thus far, approximately 212 101 ID smart cards and more than 222 406 passports have been obtained through the existing participating branches, and to a smaller extent at online offices, which is a huge success. The Department of Home Affairs will finalise the triple P with the banking sector and National Treasury to roll this out across the country before the end of this financial year.

In the current financial year, we will conclude a memorandum of understanding with participating banks, which include Standard Bank, First National Bank, Nedbank, Absa, Discovery Bank, Capitec and UBank, to extend e-HomeAffairs to

20 additional bank branches, prioritising Durban, Pietermaritzburg, East London, Nelspruit and Polokwane. So, indeed Chair, as many members have been saying, we are expanding the footprint when it comes to banks.

We are steadily moving forward towards positive progress in implementing our Automated Biometric Identification System, which is known as ABIS. That will enable advanced identification and verification through fingerprints, palm prints, iris, facial recognition and DNA.

As of the 1st of April 2021, the project has been reactivated through a new service provider and the first phase is expected to be completed by no later than November this year. The ABIS will form the backbone of the future national identity system, NIS, which will replace the currently disintegrated systems which are the National Population Register, the Enhanced Movement Control System and the national immigration system.

When it comes to information technology, IT, we must not just talk and complain but we have set systems in place to improve our current IT infrastructure.

As we work towards improving our operational efficiencies, the department has partnered with Statistics SA with the aim to digitize the most crucial records. Thus far, more than three million records have been digitized through this partnership.

In 2013, the Department of Home Affairs embarked on a modernisation programme for the production of ID smart cards and passports, in which front offices were gradually equipped with a live capture system that is needed to perform these services. Thus far, 195 out of 412 Department of Home Affairs offices were equipped with the live capture system.

Furthermore, the system was rolled out to 26 banks, which I have mentioned. This brings the total number of live capture offices to 221, which is an increase of six additional service locations compared to the previous financial year.

In addition to this, 96 mobile units were deployed to provinces to increase accessibility for citizens in order to fast-track the replacement of green ID books with ID smart cards.

Furthermore, a network enhancement project between the Department of Home Affairs and the State Information Technology Agency, Sita, is ongoing to ensure that network connectivity within the mobile units is addressed and resolved. We have already started with the implementation of the backhaul upgrade for the mobile units.

Officials of the department have the responsibility to serve our clients with pride and distinction. They must be dedicated and committed to the cause, must implement Batho Pele principles, must be ethical, free from corruption and malfeasance, be security conscious and be able to handle all different types of clients.

Despite the declaration of the state of disaster regulations in the financial year 2020-21, the Learning Academy has managed to train 385 Department of Home Affairs officials on the professionalisation programme and we intend to increase these numbers in the new 2021-22 financial year.

In conclusion, working together we can ensure that all our people have access to our services fully in order to participate in democracy and the economy, and access government services. We all have to work hard and in unison to achieve this. Let us remember today the teachings of President Thabo Mbeki when he teaches us that:

Those who complete the course will do so only because they do not, as fatigue sets in, convince themselves that the road ahead is still too long, the inclines too steep, the

loneliness impossible to bear and the prize itself of doubtful value.

We dare not tire nor give up. Let us hold strong and focus on delivering on the task at hand. I thank you.

Mr S N SWART: Hon Chairperson, the allocated budget is R8,69 billion with the severe reduction of the medium-term.

The ACDP is concerned about the impact this will have on the department. The services rendered by the department are critically for society to function effectively. We share concerns about poor service delivery with the systems constantly being down. This needs to be resolved. Service delivery must be improved. Death registrations, while tragic are also very important particularly during a pandemic.

In this regard the hon Minister reported that 443 551 people had tragically died of natural causes in the country by the end of December last year. At that time there were 28 469 COVID-19 related deaths. While not detected from the seriousness of COVID-19 more than 415 000 people then died of natural causes including other deceases such as HIV/Aids, TB

and other chronic diseases. That is more than a thousand people per day and every day for a year.

In this regard the ACDP will urge an analysis of the death certificates issued to establish the true nature of the deaths recorded. We look forward to the updated Statistics SA report on mortality and causes of death as well as the information provided by the SA Medical Research Council. The right of balance must be struck between the treatment of COVID-19 related illnesses and other diseases and the department can play the key role in this regard given the information at its disposal.

Chairperson, the ACDP will also engage in the Green Paper process on marriages as referred to by the Minister. We understand the consultative process, but our position on certain issues is well known. We will continue to formulate them in the public debate.

The ACDP also look forward to the local government elections later this year. We trust that the electoral commission will be able to ensure free and fair elections. Voter apathy is regrettably growing with citizens becoming disillusioned with

politics particularly the shocking levels of corruption being exposed. Including this Personal Protective Equipment, PPE, tender scandal.

Voter concerns about contracting COVID-19 will also need to be addressed. Branch introductions will impact on a number of voter registration on weekends as well as the training of staff. Staff will need to be trained to use the new voter management devices which are important to prevent double voting.

There are many challenges, but we believe the elections should proceed given the shocking state of our municipalities. It is time for change. It is time for councillors who understand honesty and integrity, while civic leaders are not just there just to line their own pockets. We wish the commission everything of the best in this regard. I thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Thank you very much, hon Swart, Is the Acting Chairperson, Joemat-Petterson ready? I would like to hand over.

The ACTING HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms T M Joemat-Pettersen): Thank you very much House Chairperson. Hon members, the next speaker is from the UDM. Do we have an indication that the speaker from the UDM is in the House? If not, thank you very much. I therefore call upon the following from the NFP the hon Shaik Emam.

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Hon Chairperson, I think the UDM is having difficulty with connection, as his name is coming up in another committee at the same time. However, allow me Chairperson from the onset to thank the department for the report that they have released. I want to say from the very outset that the NFP will support this Budget Vote of home affairs tabled here today.

However, Minister allow me through you Chairperson, to highlight some of the challenges that our people still face particularly at home affairs one of them being the very long queues you find at home affairs offices. Very often of course they find systems are down and I think employees at home affairs branches are attempting to do their best. I think given the difficulties they experiencing its making it very very difficult for them.

The other problem that I want to actually highlight is that the problem that exist at the border control continues.

Minister I would like to invite you to come with me and I will show you how a person leaves South Africa without any documentation at all.

The ACTING HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms T M Joemat-Pettersen): My apologies for interrupting you hon Shaik Emam. Could you maybe improve your lighting? We can hardly see you. It is very dark

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Is very dark!

The ACTING HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms T M Joemat-Pettersen): We cannot see you. We cannot see your face. I will give you extra minutes.

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Can you see me now?

The ACTING CHAIRPERSON (Ms T M Joemat-Petterson): Perfect. Thank you, hon Shaik Emam. You may continue. You can continue.

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Thank you. I was just highlighting hon Minister at some of the challenges that are existing are

continuing at our border posts particularly, how foreign nationals are leaving and entering the country. All they are doing is to pay a certain amount at the border posts. I will like to invite you to go together and I would show exactly how they are doing it. It continues over despite you know all the efforts that are being put in place in trying and get stringent conditions put in place.

Now the other thing that I would like to know hon Minister: Can you tell us of what is happening with this VFS? Why do we need applicants to go and pay these large amounts of money to VFS? Should this not be included and should not be directly done with home affairs? I am also being informed that it belongs to the Guptas. I am not certain about that, but I would like you to intervene.

I would like to also draw your attention to the fact that many many foreign nationals in South Africa and who are to a very large extent involved in criminal activities are undocumented. I would urge you to work together with labour, the SA Police Service, SA Revenue Service, Sars. We need to clean up the country. Anybody who wants to be in the country must be a law- abiding citizen, must comply and must have the necessary

documentation. If they are not, I think they should not be in the country.

The other problem that I think many people are experiencing, I think particularly permanent resident application, work permits that is taking a lifetime. Two, three or five years after having been in the country for over 10 years and they are still experiencing great difficulties.

However, let me say that the NFP understands home affairs you inherited the department that had already been in trouble and that had a lot of good work that has been done in some of your offices and many of your branches like Bericht Ndongeni Road that is very very helpful. The NFP support this Budget Vote.

Thank you very much.

Ms T I LEGWASE: Hon House Chairperson, members of the executive, members of the House, fellow compatriots, good afternoon, this year marks the 25th of a much celebrated and internationally acclaimed Constitution. Our Constitution is one of the most progressive in the world, containing the three generations of rights. Therefore, the DNA of three ANC cannot be removed from the Constitution and in particular, the Bill

of Rights. The ANC was composed of African intellectuals who oppose the colonial system and the advocated liberation of Africans and respect for human rights.

As such the ANC was and remains both the liberation movement and the human rights movement. In 1923, the ANC conference in Bloemfontein adopted the African Bill of Rights. The central themes in the African Bill of Rights were the demand for land, freedom, the equality of all citizens before the law and justice. Two decades after the adoption of the African Bill of Rights, another Bill of Rights was drawn. It was entitled Africans Claims in South Africa, which was adopted by the ANC on 16 December 1943. The founding provisions in our final Constitution express the resolutions of the Africans Claims.

Therefore, it is clear that the ANC committed to the founding constitutional values four decades before the adoption of the transitional Constitution.

It is the ANC that declared that the people shall govern. It declared that the Bill of Rights would guarantee South Africa in a multiparty democracy. It is in this light that the Independent Electoral Commission, IEC, is critical. In terms of section 190 of the Constitution, the electoral commission

must manage the elections of national, provincial and municipal legislative bodies in accordance with the national legislation, and ensure that those elections are free and fair. They must also declare the results of those elections within a period that must be prescribed by the national legislation, and that should be as short as reasonably possible.

In 2019, the IEC delivered yet another free and fair general elections, making the ten successive general elections, five national and provincial elections, and five local government elections since the dawn of our democracy in 1994. Among the highlights of that particular elections includes the largest number of votes that were registered. In 2019, we saw the highest number of contesting parties. The largest number of special votes were granted, translating into a turnout of 73% for special votes. We saw the largest number of voting stations and the lowest number of spoilt ballots. The highest percentage of women were elected to National Assembly, opposed to the 42% in 2014. While the voter turnout declined from previous elections, these highlights are indicative of our vibrant democracy.

The coronavirus pandemic changed our world drastically. The electoral commission was not spared from feeling the impact. As the ANC we show appreciation for the hard work and dedication of the IEC which continues to work tirelessly amidst the challenges in order to fulfil its constitutional mandate. The IEC has successfully managed the 2020 by- elections amidst the pandemic. In the elections, the people of South Africa reaffirmed their trust and confidence in the oldest liberation movement, the ANC, and gave it the mandate to govern.

While the pandemic is still with us, we do have faith that the IEC will be able to deliver on its constitutional mandate on

27 October 2021. We welcome the commitment made by the IEC to replace the zip-zip devices that have previously been to embrace the new generation technology. We will allow for enhanced voter registration and monitoring voter participation in real time, including the ability to capture the address or place of residence during registration and to verify the address against the ward boundaries. To serve as online real time voters’ roll on election day and to further prevent multiple voting and to provide demographic details of voter participation.

In the case *New Nation Movement NPC & Others v President of the Republic of South Africa & Others*, the Constitutional Court declared the Electoral Act unconstitutional in so far as it does not allow individual candidates to contest national and provincial elections. Parliament was given 24 months to amend the applicable electoral legislation to bring it in line with the Constitution. The court has not prescribed an electoral system; it is Parliament that must decide on such a system. Whatever system parliament may decide on, the results must in general be proportional.

We welcome the swift response by the Minister in appointing the Ministerial Advisory Committee on the electoral system. A joint electoral workshop was held on 16 march 2021. We agreed that the electoral system adopted must keep up with our constitutional order, including accountability and fairness – and that the outcome of the elections is proportional. Other constitutional principles to be adhered to include national unity, transformation and the centrality of voters and citizens.

As the ANC we are committed in adhering to the court judgment and implementing it within the given timeframe. The Department

of Home Affairs has presented in its annual performance plans and budget and emphasised its underfunding and the challenges that COVID-19 has brought. The department spoke about the critical challenges it faces such as lack of funding, inadequate staff, solely relying on the State Information Technology Agency for information technology, IT, services. As a country we are encountering severe economic challenges. Our President and the Minister of Finance have alluded to this fact.

The Department of Home Affairs baseline would be reduced by R3,2 billion over the Medium-Term Expenditure Framework, MTEF, period. This includes the R2,4 billion cut in the compensation of employees. This will have a detrimental impact on critical areas. The Department of Home Affairs own revenue collection fell sharply in 2020-21 financial year and it reduces its revenue projections by 505 to R621 million. The importance of that is that the self-financing expenditure is limited to the revenue collection. The compensation of employees ceiling have also been reduced over MTEF, resulting in Home Affairs department not able to fill vacancies. While this is the case, it is important that the modernisation programme be completed. The modernisation programme of the Department of Home Affairs

can reduce fraud and the cost of doing business, enabling e- government which will attract more investment into the country. The department has been able to automate its business process and products. Most efficiently, this has made capturing information images, digitisation of supporting document and issuing enabling document more effectively and efficiently. The department will continue with the modernisation programme and has allocated R3 billion over the MTEF. The ANC definitely supports this Budget Vote. Thank you, Chairperson.

The ACTING HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms T M Joemat-Pettersen): Thank you very much, hon Legwase. We will now go to AIC ... If we do not have the speaker from the AIC, we will now move to the hon member from the PAC.

Mr M NYHONTSO: No, continue hon Chair. I am here but I am not speaking.

The ACTING HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms T M Joemat-Pettersen): Thank you very much. The following speaker will be from Al Jama-ah, the hon M G E Hendricks. You may continue.

Mr M G E HENDRICKS: Thank you very much, hon House Chair, the budget that Al Jama-ah is keen to support is this Home Affairs budget. Where it counts, this department under the leadership of a very active Minister, service delivery only gets better. Just try and get an ID, it is a breeze, I tried it. Even try and apply for a passport, it even gets better.

However, Home Affairs has let Parliament down by not complying with the Supreme Court of Appeal order that Muslim managers must have recognition in law by no later than November 2022, and legal consequences in terms of the tarnish of their faith. This will now only happen in 2024 – two years later. And we know of the decades of indignity that Muslim wives had to suffer, and that is why the Supreme Court of Appeal made that order.

This department does not make the cutting deal in the recognition of marriages and now has come up with granting recognition with legal consequences that violates religious freedom. What does it have against religion? What does it have against facts? When it comes to marriages, the Constitution has flexibility and accommodation clause to accommodate different ... [Inaudible.] ... of religion.

In drafting a green paper, Home Affairs ignored these provisions. The draft seems to want to satisfy everyone and while getting many submissions, which they cannot accommodate, they throw the cat amongst the pigeons and choose to include in the green paper a provision that women can marry more than one husband.

Minister, you cannot say and use a dictionary definition of the green paper, this includes ... [Inaudible.] ... goes against the ANC’s policy on the family – goes against Ubuntu – religious and cultural values, and actually smears the green paper. The draft has treated traditional leaders in contempt and ignored their protest.

The late Zulu queen worked hard to instil cultural values and in the line of ... [Inaudible.] ... traditional leaders told them that it is “ufebe” Am I pronouncing it wrong? We don’t want to encourage ... “ufebe” must not be encouraged. ...

[Inaudible.] ... the draft must have studied the ...

[Inaudible.] ... history when ... [Inaudible.] ... was an outcast in society. Marriage certificate was not needed but now Home Affairs wants a legislature on moral issues. Al Jama- ah supports the adoption of the budget.

Ms M A MOLEKWA: Thank you, hon House Chair, members of the executive, members of the House, fellow compatriots and friends, good afternoon. As we debate on Budget Vote 5, we do so in a period that has become known as the new normal, like as we knew it. It changed drastically just over a year ago.

The economy of most countries, including our own, were ... lives were lost.

We wish to convey our deepest condolences to everyone who has lost loved ones deadly through coronavirus. We need to continue fighting the virus as a collective. Chairperson, the ANC’s 54th Conference affirms a mandate as outlined in the National Development Plan of 2030. South Africa’s borders are effectively safeguarded, secured and well managed.

The conference accepted the security assessment which identified four categories of threat base in South Africa; which are threat to the territorial integrity of the republic, threat to the authority of the state, threat to the safety and wellbeing of South Africans and threat to the country’s economic development.

Therefore, the conference reserved the Border Management Bill must be expedited and implemented in order to address the question of irregular migration and border management. The ANC government took a decision to establish a Border Management Authority, BMA, to take responsibility for all functions relating to the management of borders in an integrated manner.

The authority will be responsible for border law enforcement functions at ports of entry and all the borderlines. The Border Management Authority will ensure more efficient processing goods at the country’s ports of entry. The Border Management Authority will also strengthen our capacity to address border threats that could undermine the country’s security, social and economic development.

If borders are ... [Inaudible.] ... and do not fulfil their function of separation control, protection, danger to the state come in, the form of transitional organised crime. The operation of arm violence groups, the movement of illegal and hazardous goods or communicable diseases. Where the prevalence of insecurity or the lack of development in nice local economy and social benefit and access to services.

Legitimate economic activities may be replaced by illegitimate undertakings. Members of the communities becomes vulnerable to opportunistic petty crimes, both as victims or as well as perpetrators. Offence specific to border era such as smuggling, trafficking or even the participation transactional organised crimes and arm violence. When and where institutions between countries do not co-operate, criminals can exploit the priorities of borders. The BMA was assented by the President and became effective as of the 1 January 2021.

The department’s annual target for the 2021-22 financial year is to ... rollout the BMA to 11 land ports of entry by integrating frontline immigration, border law enforcement function, excluding related functions in relation to South African Revenue Services.

Given the importance of the BMA, we welcome that the BMA budget increases to R40 million in the current financial year from the previous allocation of R28 million. This is an increase of R12 million if inflation is not considered and R10,4 million or 31,7% ... [Interjections.] [Inaudible.] ...

The portfolio committee conducted an oversight visit to Beitbridge and Limpopo ports of entry, in Limpopo and Mpumalanga from 11-15 January 2021. The Beitbridge port of entry is the busiest land ports of entry between South Africa and Zimbabwe, followed by Limpopo port of entry between South Africa and Mozambique. The purpose of the oversight visits to Beitbridge and Limpopo ports of entry was to assess the impact of the congestion by migration entering South Africa.

Therefore, the portfolio committee amongst others recommended that the Department of Home Affairs take responsibility for co-ordinating with other government department and organs of state operating at the border environment.

The committee further recommended that there should be a political will to resolve the challenges faced at the port of entry. There should also be the commitment by the South African government to fund and operationalise the BMA. The implementation of the BMA ... [Interjections.] ... should be forwarded as soon as possible. Thank you very much, Chair. The ANC supports the Budget Vote. [Time expired.]

Mr A C ROOS: House Chairperson, in 1952, Mandela and Tambo Attorneys opened its doors. It was:

A place of a person regardless of skin colour, could find a sympathetic ear with competent ally. A place where they will neither be turned away nor cheated.

This how government department should be and the DA will like to take this opportunity to thank those few dedicated Home Affairs officials, that still manage to serve the citizens of this country with fairness, dignity and respect. In Home Affairs where citizens are regularly turned away or cheated.

Instead of this budget focusing on the war of ques, urgent action of getting more mobile units out to rural communities and schools, opening offices on Saturdays, when people don’t have to take off from schools or school and delivery on the promise of securing our borders. This budget focuses on the risk of Wage Bill and various projects being cut to save the Wage Bill.

We are where we are to today, not because of COVID-19, but because the ANC stopped caring about the people of South Africa, a long-long time ago. And the put their deployed cadres and million managers first at all cost.

The department claims that Home Affairs is under staffed and I have a word, internalise decade, Home Affairs wages have gone up just under 9% per year, but the number of documents processed every year has gone down, dramatically. How can this be? Do wanna know why service delivery is so unbelievable bad at Home Affairs? Why is it going backwards? It is because business is good. Why work on the day job, when site gig makes you so much money? Why fix the system, when the broken system drives people to alternative channels to get documents they disparately need to function.

The DA is calling that Home Affairs implement a tracking system on all Home Affairs processes, to detect deliquesce who are not their job and allow members of the public to easily access the status of their applications, so that they don’t have to beg for it. The DA will implement such a system as a top priority to redress the rot and welcome the committee’s decision committee to call on the department to implement such a system in a medium term.

The 2016 Corruption Watch report shows one of the most significant forms of corruption occurs when officials of Home Affairs demand bribes, to issue documents. And that report to

the ... [Inaudible.] ... bribe of approximately R5000. So today the retention of citizen service is closed, but you get it for R8000.

Passport application from overseas used to take six months, they are now taking 18 to 24 months, unless you pay between R9000 and R12000. Unabridged birth certificate, one and half to two and a half thousand rands. Now, why would you want me to be part of the solution if prolonging the problem is so rewarding.

Hundreds of millions of rands have been added to government printing wage budget, for consultancy, despite less money coming in. It’s unclear what be these army of consultants will be doing, but once you add large consulting budgets but no related projects, then it certainly presents some path for cadre deployment of the Wage Bill.

Despite all of these, the number of arrests for corruption of Home Affairs is extremely low. Officials under investigation resign and no criminal action is taken. Have the criminal charges been laid against the Chief Director of Permitting, who was caught for irregularly issuing immigration permits?

The DA will implement a minimum 15-year sentence for corruption.

In mean time, we are saying immigration services, only manage to carry out two operations, per province per year. On traders and businesses employing undocumented immigrants. Two, the Border Management Authority or BMA, was going to solve the problems of porous borders, but as predicted the millionaires’ managers have been hired with no long term funding or implementation plan. If the BMA is the answer to our border control problem, then the fact that the Home Affairs unable to produce a credible long term funding and implementation plan for the BMA should be deeply concerning to us all.

Stock thief cross the border with ease, while school learners crossing Eswatini Border to go to school are victimised. The DA will implement a lean migration agency that will coordinate border agencies. Instead of wasting money in reproducing them, put the money where it’s really needed. Funding border maintenance, intercepting irregular migration, trafficking and smuggling.

Minister, you were saying you were tired, well the people of South Africa are tired. South Africans are tired of being turned away or cheated by Home Affairs on a regular basis.

The DA has an immigration plan that will grow investment and create jobs. That will implement the E-Visa system as a matter of urgency to make South Africa an attractive destination and boost local jobs in the process and providing a channel for foreign investors, to overcome high ... [Inaudible.] ... investment huddles. They come with a business plan on how they will create jobs for our citizens.

Minister, it’s time to implement reforms to drastically improve service delivery to citizens. And put forward a budget focused on service delivery to our citizens or step aside and make a way for real change and real hope. Thanks, House Chair.

Mr K B PILLAY: Hon House Chairperson, members of the Executive, members of the House, fellow compatriots and friends, good afternoon. The continent of Africa commemorates the founding of the African Union. The establishment of the Organization of the African Union, OAU was a pioneer in being the first continent to focus on continental unity and to

encourage nation building to unity and freedom from oppression.

While in exile in 1980, our visionary leader, President OR Tambo said;

A long cherish dream of the ANC came true when the formation of the OAU in 1963. The continent has torn almost every chain of colonial bondage and join the world community of nations as a full and equal member, contributing with the great effort to the solution of international problems. Southern Africa has gone geo political transformation and social upheavals in the course of which colonial foundations some led decades ago have been reduced to a heap of ruins.

The AU agenda 263, identified free movement of persons, as key ingredient for achieving other development aspirations. Free movements of persons in Africa is expected to deliver several key benefits; including boosting intra Africa trade... [Inaudible.] ...and tourism. Facilitating mobile mobility.

Intra-African knowledge and skill transfer. Promoting a Pan

African identity. Social integration and promoting the rule of law, human rights and public health.

The protocol to the treaty establishing the African economic community relating to a free movements of persons to which South Africa is signatory, envisages three specific rights; 1 the right of entry, 2 the right of establishment and 3 the right of residence. The adoption of this and other instruments reflect our commitment to agenda 263 and the African unity.

The ANC has consistently communicated this message. Movement and integration in the country is welcomed when this are done on the basis of our legal frameworks.

House Chairperson, the Southern African Development Community, SADC ... [Inaudible.] ...on the facilitation of movement of person was adopted in 2005, to facilitate the free movement of people, encompassing the right to visa free entry to residence, temporary and permanent and establishment incoming generations. The protocol makes provisions for member’s states to conclude bilateral agreements for visa exemptions. South Africa has adopted visa free entry for nationals from 11 SADC

countries. It also offers special requirements to irregular migrants from neighbouring Zimbabwe and Lesotho.

Recently the ... [Inaudible.] ... started piloting E-Visa regime with countries such as Kenya, which will be extend to Nigeria during 2021, to facilitate the efficient flow of ... [Inaudible.] ... between countries.

The African Continent of Free Trade Area, ACFTA, is the free trade agreement adopted by the African Union in 2018 and effect on 1 January 2021. The main objective includes creating a single market in the continent, deepening the continent economics’ integration, establishing a market for multiple round negotiations and aid the movement of capital and people among others.

A construction of the one stop border post has been reprioritised and the Boarder Management Act has been acted into law by the President and will be incrementally implemented. The one stop border post will promote intra- regional trade between our countries and reduce illicit trade as well as illegal movement of people within our borders. This supports the National Development Plan to adopt a more open

approach to immigration, in order to expand the supply of high skills, in a manner that contributes economic goal.

It will also ease cross border movement, enabling African citizens and providing a legal permitting route

...[Inaudible.] ... One of the common features in the OUA and SADC protocol is the importance of the law or the rules of the state.

House Chairperson, the purpose of legal routes is to regulate relations between the members of the community equitable so that they live together in peace and in good order. A legal system must be effective to ensure peace and order. Rules of law and illegal system are ... South Africa constitutes ... [Interjection.] ...

The ACTING HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms T M Joemat-Pettersen): My apologies hon ... hon members, could you please mute your mic, please. Hon members, could you please mute your mic. You may continue, my apologies, hon Pillay.

Mr K B PILLAY: Thank you, hon House Chairperson, rules of law and legal systems are never neutral of value free. The South

African Constitution provides that as a sovereign state, the republic is founded upon the following values; human dignity, the achievement of equality and the advancement of human rights and freedoms, non-racialism and non-sexism and the supremacy of the Constitution and the rule of law.

According to LexisNexis rule of law, in its basic form is a principle that no person is above the law. The rule follows from the idea that law is based upon fundamental principle which can be discovered but which cannot be created to an act of will.

The most important application of the rule of law is the principle that governmental authority is the legitimately exercised only in accordance with the written and publicly disclosed laws. These laws are adopted and enforced in accordance with the established procedural steps that are referred to as due process.

The principle is intended to be a safeguard against arbitory governance, whether by a totalitarian leader or by a ... [Inaudible.] ... thus the rule of law is hostile or to dictatorship or to anarchy.

House Chairperson, we reiterate, that all who come to our country are bound by our laws, as is the case with everyone. The laws of the Republic of South Africa apply to everyone, equally and must never be undermined.

We welcome the department’s efforts in addressing the situation of refugees in Cape Town. The protesting refugees were given the options of reintegration or repatriation; time frames have been given. We must emphasize the fact that, there are no refugee camps in South Africa. The tents which were erected on two sites were as the result of the COVID-19 pandemic.

House Chairperson, Government Printing Work facilitates implementation of the Legislation that governs the production and management of identification, citizenship and travel, which are developed by the Department of Home Affairs. The Government Printing Work GPW managed to engage SADC countries

... [Inaudible.] ... of expanding its footprints in the SADC region. The following countries; Eswatini, Democratic Republic of Congo, AU Commission and Namibia have already been engaged in the past financial year for printing of their security

documents. We encourage the GPW to continue engaging with our sister countries and to strengthen relations.

Hon House Chairperson, one of my colleagues in the EFF has raised challenges at GPW. I must thank him for hailing the applause for GPW. I must also place on record the Home Affairs Parliamentary Committee knows and has discussed National Education, Health and Allied Workers’ Union, NEHAWU and ... [Inaudible.] ... letter and we are conducting an oversight visit next week.

I must say that I take strong exception to the comment that was made that Independent Electoral Commission, IEC, and the ANC is cohorts. This is not true. As the IEC derives its mandate from Parliament, as Chapter 9 institution and this must really be condemned, when a comment can be made that the IEC and ANC is cohorts. Hon Chairperson of the House, the ANC supports the Budget Vote.

The MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS: Thank you hon house Chair. Hon Khanyile from the DA, it is a matter of record not debate that, you are being sued for defamation of character by the Acting CEO of Government Printing Works in case number 8096 of

2020. What is surprising is: Why do you bring that into Parliament all the time? Why do you want to debate cases between you and an individual in this Parliament? It has got nothing to do with Department of Home Affairs. Why don’t you go to court to answer for yourself?

It is on record again that, wherever we talk about Government Printing Works you use a lot of innuendo, misinformation and outright hatred. I am really appealing to you, this a case between yourself and the person you have defamed, please don’t drag us into it.

Hon Tshwaku, if you have got any hope or believe that Government Printing Works will ever collapse, you are going to live in perpetual disappointment, because that is not going to happen. You have been given figures of the excess amounts that the Government Printing Works has got, that it even helped the Independent Electoral Commission, IEC to purchase machines that are going to be a game changer in our elections.

I am not sure whether with this story of collapse you are trying to subvert government business when all of the Southern African Development Community, SADC are now looking for

Government Printing Works to come and print, as these countries have been mentioned here, Namibia, Eswatini, Democratic Republic of Congo, DRC. They are all looking forward to printing their documents in Government Printing Works. When now a member of Parliament who is a South African Shouts that, it is collapsing, are you trying to chase them away? Please don’t do that.

Hon Shaik Emam, we have heard rumours that Visa Facilitation Services, VFS belongs to the Guptas. We have tried our best to investigate. All we know is that, this is an international company that is servicing many other companies. It so happened that it has offices in United Arab Emirates, UAE mainly because the Guptas ran there. People believe that there is a coincidence between the Guptas running there and the ownership of VFS. We don’t have that proof. We have been looking for it because this allegation has been made many times. We are unable to prove it.

Hon Swart let me explain how death certificates work. The Statistics SA is definitely at the end of the year going to give statistics about the cause of death of each and every individual who dies in South Africa. In Department of Home

Affairs, all you we know is the number of people who came to collect death certificates. In each one of them, the only thing we know at Department of Home Affairs, is whether the person died naturally or unnaturally or is still being investigated.

All the information from the doctor, what is the actual cause of death of a person is sent to Statistics SA, not to Department of Home Affairs. Just wait for Statistics SA at the end of the year, they will give you the statistics because they are busy working on it.

Hon Hendricks, all I was emphasizing was that, what you see on the Green Paper on Department Home Affairs is all the proposals that people make. It is not proposals from us. Now, what I am hearing is that, we should have screened the proposals and net sent them to the public for the public to see how other people think. I think that will be unfair because we would be hiding from the truth. There are people who thought about these things and we have put them there.

As far as traditional authorities are concerned, we have heard a lot from them because we met Congress of Traditional Leaders

of South Africa, Contralesa and the House. Their proposals are all on the Green Paper. What you must wait for is the White Paper, then you will definitely know what government thinks.

For now, the Green Paper is for people to come together and to talk.

The last issue about school kids, there is no way that as South Africa we can turn away school kids from neighbouring countries from attending school in South Africa. They do and we have even given them special dispensation, we can’t turn them away. That will be grossly inhuman. That is why even the foreign nationals that are in the country, even if they don’t have documentation yet, because maybe their parents came illegally, we can’t stop kids from going to school. That is not what we are going to, it is not in the nature of South Africa.

That is why we even make a plea to those people who were holed up in the church, who took their children from school and are now sitting in tents in Paint City and Wingfield. They have taken their kids from school and we have pleaded with them that this is evil. No parents must take their kids away from school and Department of Home Affairs, we will not stop them.

That is why we even discussed and agreed with the Department of Basic Education that, they must allow all the kids to go to school, then us adults will deal with the documentation.

If you go to Lesotho in Maseru, at the Maseru Bridge Border Post, you will find a lane that is painted green. That lane is specifically for school kids from Maseru, who attend school in the Free State. We don’t demand passports from them, they have a special document which we stamp every day because their passports will be full ...[Interjections.]

The ACTING HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms T M JOEMAT-PETTERSEN): Hon

minister, you have one minute left.

The MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS: ... yes, because they cross the border twice per day. We will never stop them because they are border communities.

Chairperson, when you listen to the Deputy Minister announcing statistics of the identity documents, IDs that we have issued, firstly 400 000 IDs which are uncollected and then he gave statistics of all the others. When you listen to the members of the opposition parties talking about Department of Home

Affairs and documentation, you would think that everything in Department of Home Affairs – I mean all the offices are closed, there is no work. The challenge about downtime which we have experienced from State Information Technology Agency, Sita, we have mentioned it in the portfolio committee. We have got a plan and a programme to deal with that. It is also disappointing us, I must say and I am not going to hide it. We have reported it to the portfolio committee ... [Time Expired.]

The ACTING HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms T M JOEMAT-PETTERSEN): Thank

you hon Minister, your time is up. Thank you hon Minister, Deputy Minister, hon House Chair, hon members who participated in the debate. Hon members who attended the House, I wish to thank you. The House is now adjourned.

Debate concluded.

The Mini Plenary rose at 15:57