MEETING OF THE SUBCOMMITEE OF THE PORTFOLIO COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORT ON THE PUBLIC PROTECTOR REPORT No. 37 OF 2018-19

- 1. When was the first Toyota Quantum Panel Van imported or manufactured in RSA:-
- March 2005

2. The number of imported and manufactured Toyota Quantum Panel Vans in RSA since introduction thereof into the market:-

> 16.735

Year	Panel Van	Crew Cab	Panel Van LWB	TOTAL
2005	654	-	592	1,246
2006	793	_	1,098	1,891
2007	1,037	_	1,268	2,305
2008	752	_	1,115	1,867
2009	350	-	521	871
2010	350	-	598	948
2011	416	-	619	1,035
2012	349	-	705	1,054
2013	338	-	581	919
2014	143	144	385	672
2015	170	93	467	730
2016	160	77	413	650
2017	163	55	353	571
2018	224	68	456	748
2019	104	146	533	783
2020	1	41	403	445
Total	6,004	624	10,107	16,735

3. What was the recommended retail price for Toyota Quantum Panel Vans vs Passenger Carrier minibus vehicles for each year since introduction of these vehicles into the RSA market or at least from 2005 to date :-

Panel Van

Year	Description	SMC	MSRP incl vat
2020	Quantum 2.8 LWB Panel Van 3-s	56D	501000
	Quantum 2.8 LWB Panel Van 3-s AC	56E	508700
	Quantum 2.8 SLWB Panel Van 3-s	56F	538500
	Quantum 2.8 SLWB Panel Van 3-s AC	56G	546100
2019	Quantum 2.8 LWB Panel Van 3-s	56D	501000
	Quantum 2.8 LWB Panel Van 3-s AC	56E	508700
	Quantum 2.8 SLWB Panel Van 3-s	56F	538500
	Quantum 2.8 SLWB Panel Van 3-s AC	56G	546100
2018	Quantum 2.7 Petrol S-Long PV	555	421900
	Quantum 2.5 D-4D S-Long PV	55P	442500
	Quantum 2.5 D-4D Panel Van	550	408300
	Quantum 2.7P Panel Van	55R	373300

Year	•• PROTECTED 寅1 Description	SMC	MSRP incl vat
2017	Quantum 2.7 Petrol -Long PV	551	413600
	Quantum 2.5 D-4D S-Long PV	55F	433800
	Quantum 2.5 D-4D Panel Van	55E	400300
	Quantum 2.7P Panel Van	55H	365900
2016	Quantum 2.7 Petrol S-Long PV	551	411600
	Quantum 2.5 D-4D S-Long PV	55F	431700
	Quantum 2.5 D-4D Panel Van	55E	398400
	Quantum 2.7P Panel Van	55H	364200
2015	Quantum 2.7P Panel Van	24X	308700
	Quantum 2.5 D-4D Panel Van	24U	337700
	Quantum 2.7 Petrol S-Long PV	24Y	348900
	Quantum 2.5 D-4D S-Long PV	24V	365900
2014	Quantum 2.7 Petrol S-Long PV	240	332400
	Quantum 2.5 D-4D S-Long PV	24E	348800
	Quantum 2.5 D-4D Panel Van	24G	321800
	Quantum 2.7 Panel Van	24P	293800
	Quantum 2.7P Panel Van	24X	296700
	Quantum 2.5 D-4D Panel Van	24U	324700
	Quantum 2.7 Petrol S-Long PV	24Y	335300
	Quantum 2.5 D-4D S-Long PV	24V	351700

Year	Description	SMC	MSRP incl vat
2013	Quantum 2.7 Petrol S-Long PV	240	322700
	Quantum 2.5 D-4D S-Long PV	24E	338600
	Quantum 2.5 D-4D Panel Van	24G	312400
	Quantum 2.7 Panel Van	24P	285200
2012	Quantum 2.7 Petrol S-Long PV	240	317700
	Quantum 2.5 D-4D S-Long PV	24E	333400
	Quantum 2.5 D-4D Panel Van	24G	307600
	Quantum 2.7 Panel Van	24P	280800
2011	Quantum 2.7 Petrol S-Long PV	24F/24O	296400
	Quantum 2.5 D-4D S-Long PV	24E	311200
	Quantum 2.5 D-4D Panel Van	24G	287000
	Quantum 2.7 Panel Van	24H/24P	262000
2010	Quantum 2.7 Petrol S-Long PV	24F	287700
	Quantum 2.5 D-4D S-Long PV	24E	302100
	Quantum 2.5 D-4D Panel Van	24G	278600
	Quantum 2.7 Panel Van	24H	254300

Year	Description	SMC	MSRP incl vat
2009	Quantum 2.7 Petrol S-Long Panel Van	12L	286300
	Quantum 2.5 D-4D S-Long Panel Van	12K	300600
	Quantum 2.5 D-4D Panel Van	125	267100
	Quantum 2.7 Panel Van	12T	253000
2008	Quantum 2.7 Panel Van	13К	215100
	Quantum 2.5 D-4D Panel Van	13N	227200
	Quantum 2.7 LWB Panel Van	13M	243300
	Quantum 2.5 D-4D LWB Panel Van	13P	255500
2007	Quantum 2.7 Panel Van	13K	191700
	Quantum 2.5 D-4D Panel Van	13J	202400
	Quantum 2.7 LWB Panel Van	13M	216700
	Quantum 2.5 D-4D LWB Panel Van	13L	227500
2006	Quantum 2.7 Panel Van	TRR	175000
	Quantum 2.5 D-4D Panel Van	KDR	185000
	Quantum 2.7 LWB Panel Van	TRM	203000
	Quantum 2.5 D-4D LWB Panel Van	KDM	213000

Year	Description	SMC	MSRP incl vat
2005	Quantum 2.7 Panel Van	TRR	175000
	Quantum 2.5 D-4D Panel Van	KDR	185000
	Quantum 2.7 LWB Panel Van	TRM	203000
	Quantum 2.5 D-4D LWB Panel Van	KDM	213000
	Hiace 2200 Panel Van	S51	198,788

<u>Taxi</u>

Year	Description	SMC	MSRP incl vat
2020	Hiace Ses'fikile 2.7 16s	CYC	437,000
	Hiace Ses'fikile 2.5D 16s	CXC	463,000
2019	Quantum 2.7 Petrol 16-s Ses'fikile	CYA	405,300
	Quantum 2.5 D-4D 16-s Ses'fikile	СХА	425,300
2018	Quantum 2.7 Petrol 16-s Ses'fikile	CYQ	401,300
	Quantum 2.5 D-4D 16-s Ses'fikile	CXQ	421,100
2017	Quantum 2.7 Petrol 16-s Ses'fikile	QCY	356,700
	Quantum 2.5 D-4D 16-s Ses'fikile	QCX	374,300
2016	Quantum 2.7 Petrol 16-s Ses'fikile	QCW	339,500
	Quantum 2.5 D-4D 16-s Ses'fikile	QCV	356,300
2015	Quantum 2.7 Petrol 16-s Ses'fikile	QCW	312,100
	Quantum 2.5 D-4D 16-s Ses'fikile	QCV	327,600

Year	Description	SMC	MSRP incl vat
2013	Quantum 2.7 Petrol 16-s Ses'fikile	QBK	296,900
	Quantum 2.5 D-4D 16-s Ses'fikile	QBH	311,700
2012	Quantum 2.7 Petrol 15-s Ses'fikile	24J/24Q	283,100
	Quantum 2.5 D-4D 15-s Ses'fikile	24К	297,300
2011	Quantum 2.7 Petrol 15-s Ses'fikile	12U	272,400
2010	Quantum 2.7 Petrol 15-s Ses'fikile	12U	272,400
2009	Quantum 2.7 P Ses'fikile	131	226,500
2008	Hi-Ace Siyaya (12S)	S67	179,500
2007	Hiace 2200 Siyaya 16S	S64	169,104
2006	Hiace 2200 Siyaya 16S	S64	169,104
2005	Hiace 2200 Siyaya 16S	S64	142,334

<u>Bus</u>

Year	Description	SMC	MSRP incl vat
2020	Hiace 2.5D GL Bus 14's	55V	571,900
	Quantum 2.5 D-4D 10-s bus	55K	537,800
	Quantum 2.7 Petrol 10-s bus	55M	501,000
	Quantum 2.7 Petrol 14-s bus	55N	520,000
	Quantum 2.5 D-4D 14-s bus	55L	541,500
2019	Quantum 2.5 D-4D 10-s bus	55K	537800
	Quantum 2.7 Petrol 10-s bus	55M	501000
	Quantum 2.7 Petrol 14-s bus	55N	520000
	Quantum 2.5 D-4D 14-s bus	55L	541500
2018	Quantum 2.5 D-4D 10-s bus	55K	517,600
	Quantum 2.7 Petrol 10-s bus	55M	482,100
	Quantum 2.7 Petrol 14-s bus	55N	500,400
	Quantum 2.5 D-4D 14-s bus	55L	521,000

● PROTECTED 関係者外秘

Year	Description	SMC	MSRP incl vat
2017	Quantum 2.5 D-4D 10-s bus	55A	507,400
	Quantum 2.7 Petrol 10-s bus	55C	472,600
	Quantum 2.7 Petrol 14-s bus	55D	490,500
	Quantum 2.5 D-4D 14-s bus	55B	510,700
2016	Quantum 2.5 D-4D 10-s bus	55A	457,700
	Quantum 2.7 Petrol 10-s bus	55C	426,200
	Quantum 2.7 Petrol 14-s bus	55D	442,500
	Quantum 2.5 D-4D 14-s bus	55B	460,700
2015	Quantum 2.7 Petrol 10-s bus	245	398,300
	Quantum 2.7 Petrol 14-s bus	24T	413,500
	Quantum 2.5 D-4D 10-s bus	241	427,700
	Quantum 2.5 D-4D 14-s bus	24R	430,600
2014	Quantum 2.7 Petrol 10-s bus	245	382,900
	Quantum 2.7 Petrol 14-s bus	24T	397,500
	Quantum 2.5 D-4D 10-s bus	241	411,200
	Quantum 2.5 D-4D 14-s bus	24R	413,900

Year	Description	SMC	MSRP incl vat
2013	Quantum 2.5 D-4D 10-s bus	24A	396,400
	Quantum 2.7 Petrol 10-s bus	24M	368,900
	Quantum 2.5 D-4D 14-s bus	24C	399,000
	Quantum 2.7 Petrol 14-s bus	24N	383,100
2012	Quantum 2.5 D-4D 10-s bus	24A	390,300
	Quantum 2.7 Petrol 10-s bus	24M	363,300
	Quantum 2.5 D-4D 14-s bus	24C	392,900
	Quantum 2.7 Petrol 14-s bus	24N	377,200
2011	Quantum 2.5 D-4D 10-s bus	24A	364,200
	Quantum 2.7 Petrol 10-s bus	24B/24M	339,000
	Quantum 2.5 D-4D 14-s bus	24C	366,700
	Quantum 2.7 Petrol 14-s bus	24D/24N	352,000
2010	Quantum 2.5 D-4D 10-s bus	24A	353,500
	Quantum 2.7 Petrol 10-s bus	24B	329,000
	Quantum 2.5 D-4D 14-s bus	24C	356,000
	Quantum 2.7 Petrol 14-s bus	24D	341,700

Year	Description	SMC	MSRP incl vat
2009	Quantum 2.5 D-4D 10-seater bus	12F	341,500
	Quantum 2.7 Petrol 10-seater bus	12G	327,400
	Quantum 2.5 D-4D 14-seater bus	12H	354,200
	Quantum 2.7 Petrol 14-seater bus	12J	340,000
2008	Quantum 2.7 14-seater Bus	13D	285,500
	Quantum 2.5 D-4D 14-seater Bus	130	297,400
	Quantum 2.7 10-seater Bus	13B	274,800
	Quantum 2.5 D-4D 10-seater Bus	13H	274,800
2007	Quantum 2.7 14-seater Bus	13D	255,700
	Quantum 2.5 D-4D 14-seater Bus	13C	266,400
	Quantum 2.7 10-seater Bus	13B	246,200
	Quantum 2.5 D-4D 10-seater Bus	13A	256,900
2006	Quantum 2.7 14-seater Bus	TRL	237,350
	Quantum 2.5 D-4D 14-seater Bus	KDL	247,450
2005	Quantum 2.7 14-seater Bus	TRL	235,000
	Quantum 2.5 D-4D 14-seater Bus	KDL	245,000

Crew Cab

Year	Description	SMC	MSRP incl vat
2020	Quantum 2.7P Crew Cab	55T	450,700
	Quantum 2.5 D-4D Crew Cab	55Q	472,300
2019	Quantum 2.7P Crew Cab	55T	450,700
	Quantum 2.5 D-4D Crew Cab	55Q	472,300
2018	Quantum 2.7P Crew Cab	55T	433,700
	Quantum 2.5 D-4D Crew Cab	55Q	454,400
2017	Quantum 2.7P Crew Cab	55J	425,100
	Quantum 2.5 D-4D Crew Cab	55G	445,400

Year	Description	SMC	MSRP incl vat
2016	Quantum 2.7P Crew Cab	55J	383,500
	Quantum 2.5 D-4D Crew Cab	55G	401,800
2015	Quantum 2.7P Crew Cab	24Z	358,700
	Quantum 2.5 D-4D Crew Cab	24W	375,700
2014	Quantum 2.7P Crew Cab	24Z	344,800
	Quantum 2.5 D-4D Crew Cab	24W	361,200

4. Under what circumstances or for what alternative use would Toyota approve Quantum panel van conversions:-

The NRCS recognises conversions by Body Builders and Toyota has no control or influence over the applicable regulatory compliance process between Body Builders and the NRCS.

Toyota has approved a panel van conversion to an **Ambulance** for the **Department of Health**. The approval process is rigid and is a follows:

4.1 Specification:

Ambulance conversion specification is given to TSAM via the RT57, the specification defines the ambulance requirements (Oxygen tanks/stretcher/cabinets etc.) Once this specification is received TSAM will appoint a service provider (accredited Body Builder) to convert a panel van to ambulance as specified on the RT57.

4.2 TSAM Verification:

TSAM will conduct verification tests to confirm the conversion quality and to ensure that the conversion does not impact base vehicle strength.

4.3 Regulatory verification:

Parallel to the activity mentioned above in 4.2, the Body Builder will conduct regulatory tests as stipulated in the NRCS standards for passenger safety (seat belt anchorage/seat strength etc.)

4.4 Certification:

The Body Builder will then submit the Manufacturers test reports together with the Regulatory test reports to the NRCS and apply for the vehicle classification to be changed from goods carrying to passenger carrying. Once NRCS has approved the conversion a new E-Natis code will be issued to the body builder which enables the converted ambulance to be classified as a passenger carrying model.

The E- Natis code that is issued to change the classification of the Panel Van to Ambulance is applicable to only that specific conversion by that specific converter & not a general use Natis Code.

Once all the above steps are completed, Toyota can sell a converted ambulance to the **Department of Health**. Currently, Toyota has only has 1 (one) approved ambulance conversion and only 1 (one) accredited Body Builder to do the conversion for the **Department of Health**. 5. When did Toyota first become aware of Quantum panel van conversions in RSA for use in the minibus taxi industry:-

> In 2005 – as submitted to the Public Protector

6. What steps did Toyota take to inform government, the DoT and/or DTI, SABS/NRCS, MIBs and/or the financial sector of these conversions as well as the view of Toyota on the safety of such conversions: -

Including, without limitation the following actions were taken by Toyota:-

- 6.1 On **20 May 2009;** TSAM issued a directive to the SABS, NRCS and the DoT clearly confirming that *"TSAM has not and will not issue letters of authority for:- Conversions of Toyota Quantum Panel Vans into Toyota Quantum Ses'fikile or other passenger carrying variants. This is due to the fact that the Panel Van is a Commercial vehicle and designed to carry goods".*
- 6.2 **On October 2009;** Toyota informed its Dealers and other role players, namely the SABS, NRCS and International Vehicle Identification Desk (IVID), that it did not **in any way support** any illegal conversions.
- 6.3 Toyota continued to reiterate its stance from the period 2005 to 2009 that it **condemned the practice** of illegal modifications.
- 6.4 A Press Release was issued on **08 March 2010**; wherein Toyota again confirmed that it in no way condones the conversion of Panel Vans into taxis,
- 6.5 It is submitted that Toyota's position has always been **clearly communicated** since the first incidents of illegal conversions being detected in **2005**.

- Toyota's actions within its control pursuant to becoming aware of illegal conversions confirms that it strongly condemned such practice.
- Toyota took steps that were necessary and within what it was legally allowed to address.
 Toyota is not a Regulator for the purposes of Registrations and this view was acknowledged by The Public Protector.
- The onus is on the DoT and NRCS to monitor and check that the registration of these vehicles are in accordance to the classification of the vehicle. Regulatory and other primary loopholes identified were also submitted to the Public Protector at the time of the investigation.
- The above was included in Toyota's submission to the Public Protector in 2012 wherein Toyota further identified certain Regulatory deficiencies that needed to be investigated to ensure that adequate guidelines and systems are in place to prevent illegal conversions.

7. What steps did Toyota take after learning that some of these converted vehicles were being approved for retrofitment:-

- 7.1 Firstly; a communication was issued to TSAM Dealers dated **12 December 2005** wherein it was clearly stated that "*This modification is not acceptable to TSAM and therefore the warranty terms will be cancelled on all vehicles modified*.....".
- 7.2 TSAM issued a further notice on **09 October 2008** confirming an **extensive investigation** being conducted and that illegal conversions shall **not be condoned**.
- 7.3 Toyota highlighted to all stakeholders that the illegal conversions did not comply with standard homologation and / or registration requirements for the vehicle to be used as a commercial taxi.
- 7.4 Toyota further communicated to all stakeholders that it not endorse the sale of Quantum Panel Vans to companies or operators that seek to convert panel vans into taxis by non approved MIB's All Toyota dealers were also alerted to this practice.
- 7.5 In the interest of safety; Toyota offered engineering support for vehicles that could be converted according to TRP specifications.

- 8. Indicate what measures were put in place to mitigate the illegal conversion of goods carrying vehicles into passenger carrying ones, or to ensure that such incidents do not take place at all:-
- 8.1 Toyota from 2005 to 2009 **specifically communicated** and actioned what was **reasonably** expected at the time. The expectation to "do better" in informing the public during that period was acknowledged to the Public Protector.
- 8.2 Toyota is **not in a position to consent** to the general conversion of goods carrying vehicles into passenger carrying vehicles **unless approval** from our parent company is obtained such approval was never obtained.
- 8.3 In **support of mitigating** illegal conversions; Toyota ensured that it did not provide the **Manufacturers approval documentation** (Letter of Authority) to the NRCS to **facilitate** and **enable the registration** of the conversion of the vehicles in question.
- 8.4 Toyota **ensured that Dealers were fully aware** of their **obligations** and are **evaluated** by the terms and conditions of the Dealer Agreement between the parties in place to **ensure compliance.**
- 8.5 The Dealers were also made aware that breach of their obligations in terms of the Dealer Agreement resulted **in disciplinary action** which may lead to termination of the Dealer Agreement.
- 8.6 In general, Toyota continued to **support** the DoT and NRCS with any queries raised.

9. Indicate whether Toyota has a monitoring mechanism to ensure that this practice does not recur:-

- 9.1 Toyota has taken every precaution and is **committed** to ensuring compliance with the Legislation and Regulations applicable in ensuring safe and reliable transport.
- 9.2 Toyota **continues to make every effort** in ensuring that the Dealers do not participate in illegal conversions and are continuously evaluated to ensure compliance.