**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**FRIDAY, 4 DECEMBER 2020**

# FRIDAY, 4 DECEMBER 2020

***PROCEEDINGS OF THE NATIONAL ASSEMBLY***

The House met at 10:00.

House Chairperson Ms M G Boroto took the Chair and requested members to observe a moment of silence for prayer or meditation.

# CONSIDERATION OF BUDGETARY REVIEW AND RECOMMENDATION REPORTS

*IsiZulu:*

USIHLALO WENDLU (Nk M G Boroto): Angiqale ngokuthi iMithetho ayishintshanga isesenjalo.

*English:*

Hon members, as members we are aware that the House has been considering Budgetary Review and Recommendation Reports, that is the BRRRs. Hon members would have noticed that there are committees that have not tabled reports yet. I should explain the context in which this occurred.

In terms of the Money Bills and Related Matters Act, committees must conduct an annual assessment of government departments and submit BRRRs. This process enables Parliament to influence the drafting of the Budget. Owing to the budget cycle, this review process and the compilation of the BRRRs must take place within a particular window period.

The Money Bills Act also determines that the BRRRs must, amongst other things such as in-year performance reports, also take into account departmental annual reports and audited statements. In terms of the Public Finance Management Act, PFMA, these are normally tabled in Parliament six months after the end of the financial year.

However, this PFMA does allow the Minister of Finance to exempt departments from such deadlines in extraordinary circumstances. Earlier this year, the Minister of Finance extended the deadline for departments to table their annual reports and audits, owing to the administrative challenges arising from the COVID-19 pandemic.

Following intervention by the Speaker, departments were requested to submit these documents by mid-November to enable Parliament to conduct its oversight mandate over departments. Some departments

managed to finalise and table those within this time. Others did not; in some instances ... provided reasons.

For reasons I have alluded to, in those cases where there have been delays, the respective committees have not been able to finalise their budget assessments and table BRRRs. I should state that while BRRRs are important, committees can nevertheless, through their oversight and other work, influence the drafting of departmental budgets, and if needed, call for corrective action in other ways.

This year, the COVID-19 pandemic has indeed posed new challenges for Parliament, and highlighted unforeseen procedural and programming issues which we may need to address moving forward. The consideration of the BRRRs is one such instance. The House Chairperson for Committees is attending to the matter of committees that did not finalise their BRRRs and everything possible is being done to ensure that Parliament’s oversight obligations are not compromised.

Having clarified this matter, we now have to proceed with the business of the day. Thank you, hon members.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: On a point of privilege, House Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Allowed, Chief Whip of the Majority Party.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: Thank you very much, House Chair. In accepting your explanation about the delays that occurred in respect of the presentation of the BRRRs, notwithstanding the PFMA prescript that those reports must be tabled six months before the end of the financial year, I want to propose a motion in this House that the National Assembly Programme Committee, NAPC, must consider convening a special two- day session before the state of the nation address, where all the outstanding BRRRs can be tabled in the House. Thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Thank you very much. I will allow parties ... to respond if there ... Hon Swart?

Mr S N SWART: Thank you, House Chair. The ACDP rises to support the motion. We understand that it is necessary for them to be considered. We would also just like to indicate that it is difficult for the smaller parties to cover all the issues ... even including today’s Order Paper, when the Announcements, Tablings

and Committee Reports, ATCs, were ... this week, and of course, the Order Paper was only issued last night. So, we support that motion so that the BRRRs can be considered at a later stage after the NAPC has decided.

Mr L M NTSHAYISA: Thank you very much, hon Chairperson. I think the motion by the Chief Whip of the Majority Party takes us a step forward. There is no way that we can do it because the reports are not ready. So, I support the motion.

Mr N SINGH: Thank you very much, hon Chairperson and good morning, colleagues. From our side, we support the principle that all BRRRs will need to be debated in the House. We understand that it cannot be debated now and that we will have to find the time, even before the state of the nation address, to do so. I don’t know if one can support a motion to that effect or the principle, because we don’t have a formal motion before us. However, having said that, I’m not objecting to the principle that we consider the BRRRs, based on the fact that legal opinion suggests that we could do that. So, that was going to be my proposal, hon Chairperson.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Thank you. Hon Hill-Lewis, acting Chief Whip of the DA?

Mr G G HILL-LEWIS: Thank you, Madam Chair. May I just ask ... I would prefer it if the hon Chief Whip could give us the motion in writing so that we could study it and then discuss it later in the day.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Okay, I think we can have space for that. We are all here. Thank you very much.

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: Chairperson?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Yes, hon Shivambu?

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: I honestly think it’s very lacklustre and reckless of the Chief Whip to just come and shock us with a motion in a sitting of Parliament, when there are so many platforms where she can consult with the Chief Whips. I had thought that the manner in which we take decisions in Parliament is that we first deliberate on them in the Chief Whips’ Forum and then we take them to the NAPC. Sometimes, even when we do not physically or virtually meet as Chief Whips, we ... there is a way of consulting on a process, instead of just coming with a shock motion, which has not been processed, in Parliament, and a clearer context is not given.

So, the manner in which the Chief Whip of the ANC has handled this is problematic and it’s unsustainable because that is not how Parliament is run. It’s a wrong tradition that must be objected

... like ... until these things are handled properly because it’s not the first time that BRRRs are not presented on time. Even when there were no COVID lockdowns, State Security always failed to present BRRRs and no consequences have accrued to them. But, the manner in which the motion is being tabled is problematic.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Okay.

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: It’s unprecedented and it’s not sustainable.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Thank you, hon Shivambu. Hon members of all parties, this was just a proposal and I understand that it has to come in a formal way. We will work with the office of the Chief Whip and the secretary to the National Assembly to make sure that this proposal is put in a way that will accommodate how we work as Parliament ... for everybody.

However, the proposal, as we understand it ... let’s be prepared that before the state of the nation address, it will go on. We will have our BRRRs and through the ... if we have to call a Chief Whips’ Forum before that, that will be done ... even the NAPC.

May I thank you, hon members, and leave that by saying that it’s work in progress and we will all participate in the final decision that will come out. Let me thank you and proceed to the day’s work, hon members. Okay. Hon members who are just logging in, please ensure that you log in with your microphones muted so that we don’t get disturbances, because some come in late and they just come in and the microphones are on and the videos are on. It disturbs the proceedings.

Hon members, the secretary will read the First and Second Orders of the day, together.

# CONSIDERATION OF BUDGETARY REVIEW AND RECOMMENDATION REPORT OF PORTFOLIO COMMITTEE ON COMMUNICATIONS ON DEPARTMENT OF TELECOMMUNICATIONS AND POSTAL SERVICES AND ENTITIES

**CONSIDERATION OF BUDGETARY REVIEW AND RECOMMENDATION REPORT OF PORTFOLIO COMMITTEE ON COMMUNICATIONS ON DEPARTMENT OF COMMUNICATIONS AND ENTITIES**

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: Hon House Chair, I move that the House adopt both reports of the Department of Communications and Postal Services and Entities. Thank you very much.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Let us just remind each other that each political party wishing to make a declaration will have two minutes to do so, on every Budgetary Review and Recommendation Report. Having got what we have to do with the reports, I will now call the DA because I have a request for declarations. Mr Mackenzie I am told you are on the virtual platform, you are allowed.

*Declarations of Vote:*

Mr C MACKENZIE: Good morning House Chair and the protocol observed. One could think SABC reckon Hlaudi Motsoeneng’s 70% happy news would still ...[Inaudible.] ... so some surprisingly good progress in governance, unqualified audits and even programmes that actually deliver real value rather than just tick some bureaucratic box on an annual performance plan. But where is the SA Post Office? It is in a crisis and the responsibility lies directly at the feet of the menaced Minister who shuffles board at a whim with an arrogant grin and the disastrous results are playing to see. Not in this case because the SA Post Office did not submit its annual report or we do know, thanks to recent High Court judgement but SA Post Office is here to date last of July 2020 was over a billion rand while only 35 operational branches out of over 1 400 are practicable.

When Mark Barnes left SA Post Office two years ago, it had apparently stabilised with no government guarantees and no brighter future. We even got annual reports. Then the meddling Minister Abrahams arrived, replacing boards; suspending executives; appointing new ones out ahead of the board and ultimately eventually purging the board and a spitefully showing Ministerial foot stamping. SA Post Office today is demoralised and broken with more executive actors than the Shakespearean tragedy, more drama than the *Generations* and more princes than the crown.

IT systems are down for months now, so there is no track in place; post offices are locked again for the non-payment of rent and where they are opened are dilapidated, dirty and shabby like we are the valley darkest...[Inaudible.] ... where there is more filth and there is post.

Having crushed and burned the post office to incompetence, interference and a lack of leadership. Instead of recognising the job is simple too big for her and moving on, Minister Abrahams digs in her Christian Louboutin’s heels and won’t budge as the post office withers away. We say to the Minister with all of the

...[Inaudible.] ... 400 years ago you have sat too long here for any good you have been doing. In the name of God, go. The DA supports the report, thank you Chair.

Mr V PAMBO: The EFF rejects the Budgetary Review and Recommendation Report of Portfolio Committee on Communications on Department of Telecommunications and Postal Services. It is all shock and disappointment Department of Telecommunications and Postal Services considered the proposed Budgetary Review and Recommendation Report without making an honest assessment on the impact of the Minister’s incompetence on the work of the department and its entities. A relation to the SABC challenges debated [Network challenges.] The report does not make any decisive recommendation. It does not say anything about the Treasury’s failure to bail out SABC while banks are sitting with R200 million they have no use of.

The cost of data has not fallen despite commitments after the market inquiry into the cost of data by the Competition Commission. Any Minister armed with that report should have made sure that the cost of data falls. The post office continues to deteriorate and our simple proposal was that all postal services of government should be done by the postal office through the memorandum of understanding.

The post office is sitting with a large network of infrastructure. It just requires modernisation to revive it and a guarantee client in government departments, state-owned entities and

municipalities. We promised that the post bank would have a banking licence to function as a fully-fledged bank. The EFF even assisted with amending the Banks Act to allow stat-owned companies to receive a banking licence and operate as a full bank. What is so difficult with getting a license for the post bank?

In the past we have made recommendation that Independent Communications Authority of South Africa, Icasa should be made a Chapter 9 institution like the Public Protector, Auditor General and the Independent Electoral Commission, IEC. This is the only way Icasa will play a decisive role in the communication, broadcasting and postal services sector and not what we see happening. [Time expired.]

Ms Z MAJOZI: Hon House Chair, hon members as you all know that on 01 April 2020 the Department of Telecommunications and Postal Services and the Department of Communications merged to form the Department of Communication and Digital Technologies. The mandate of this new department is leading South Africa’s digital transformation to achieve digital inclusion that must result in economic growth through creating ... [Network challenges.] and enabling policy and regulatory environment. This new department therefore must take the lead in ushering South Africa into the Fourth Industrial Revolution through innovative policies and

strategies as well as providing access to ensure digital infrastructure so as to create and transform digital society. All of these need to happen in an environment where change is the order of the day in particular for the employees of the various entities that will be merged under the new department.

The IFP therefore echoes the committee’s caution that the department considers the impact on the Public Service Wage Bill in the transfer of employees from the Department T P S and the Department of Communication into the newly established Department of Communication and Digital Communication so that the impact of Covid-19 on the economy has resulted in massive job losses. We, like the committee would hold the department to its commitment that no employees would lose their jobs as a result of the merger.

We further are in full agreement with the recommendation that the Minister should ensure that the department provides a separate reporting sheet in future representations and targets not achieved with a clear description of reasons and the work done to mitigate the non-performance. The IFP accepts the Budgetary Review and Recommendation Report of Portfolio Committee, thank you.

Ms T BREEDT: Hon House Chair, as we have seen time and time again, there are very few state-owned entities, municipalities or

entities of departments where the ANC is in control not being in need of intervention. The SA Post Office is no exception. From a once proud and fully functioning institution, the SA Post Office is now a mere wreck of entity that in the case of so many others cannot even pay over its staff spared for deductions.

The performance of the post office is extremely worrying and the additional pressure on its very limited and strained resources brought about by the additional R350 Social Relief of Distress, SRD grant payments will exacerbate this situation even more. Staff at the post office also works under immense strain with threats to their safety and security, uncertainty about their salaries and their medical aid and pension funds. Therefore, the post office is not only underperforming externally but also internally.

The same can be said with regards to the Department of Communications and its Entities. There is no need to even elaborate on this point. One can only mention the SABC crisis and the absolute chaos in which the public broadcaster is in due to breathtaking mismanagement and poor leadership shown by Minister after Minister and manager after manager.

No number of self set targets will turn around this department and its entities and an urgent return to the drawing board is necessary. I thank you, House Chair.

Mr W M THRING: Hon House Chair, understanding that some

R6,3 million of the budget was underspent from an adjustment budget of R1,6 billion. The ACDP calls for this particular department to have a careful look at how the spending is taken, taking into consideration that huge that huge amount of unemployment we have and every amount of underspending that we see in this particular department and others that we have interacted with, our jobs that could have been created in South Africa.

We also noted the unqualified report in the 2019-20. There might have been some improvements but the ACDP cannot settle for anything less than the clean audit. The ACDP has also express its concern about the report indicating that the Minister of Telecommunications intended to pass regulations which would allow for service providers to install telecommunications towers, potentially 5G towers on private property without the permission of property owners.

The Minister, in her written response to me from the question that I raised, assured the ACDP that 5G policy was still in the making

and that the department did not have 5-G policy. So, the ACDP finds this concerning particularly in the light that we are currently have service providers such as Rain, MTN and Vodacom that are rolling out 5-G infrastructure in South Africa as we speak. We ask where are the Environmental Impact Assessments, EIAs, where is the public consultation when these particular service providers are rolling out 5-G infrastructure potentially harmful to the communities.

Without a doubt our postal services are in need of drastic overhaul and the ACDP calls for data cost to be reduced and that the telecommunication entities that are failing to comply with the PFMA must face consequences. The ACDP does not support this report, thank you.

*Declarations of vote*: (*contd.)*

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Hon House Chairperson, the NFP notes the Budgetary Review and Recommendations Report, BRRR, of the Department of Communications and Technologies tabled here today. The department of telecommunications has irregular expenditure of R2,8 million incurred in the previous financial year. The department has referred R114,6 millions of cases spanning from the previous financial year to National Treasury for condonement after investigations were concluded.

Furthermore, the department is continuing with the investigation to address the irregular expenditure incurred. Effective and appropriate steps were not taken to prevent irregular expenditure amounting to R43,6 million as disclosed, we note 23 to the annual financial statements. The majority of the irregular expenditure was caused by noncompliance with supply chain management legislation.

Hon Chair ad it to this and my colleague alluded to this matter earlier on I see, is the issue of the cell phone mask and towers that have been put in communities in close proximity to where they live which is a health risk to them. There are various tabled here that indicate that these cell phone mask and in terms of the radiation that they produce, provides a great health risk to people that are living close by. It appears to be very little or no consultation at all. The ideal one is the community of Caledon who have highlighted this and this was brought to this House almost a year ago, despite all the evidence that was provided very little or nothing has been done about it. People on the ground just have to accept these things. Clearly we call on the Minister and the department to intervene in these matters and not put the lives of our people at risk.

The NFP also wants to add that the State Information Technology Agency, Sita’s, audit opinion to redress to a qualified opinion during the financial year, the Auditor-General ... [Time expired.]

Mr L M NTSHAYISA: Hon House Chairperson, the SA Broadcasting Corporation, SABC, is facing a lot of challenges. So, the efforts that are being made by the Minister Stella Ndabeni-Abrahams to save jobs at the SABC should be appreciated. Surely, more should be done to assist her and her department.

People are looking up to the SABC for service delivery. Therefore, hon House Chairperson, it cannot be correct that a lot of money be given to SABC and nothing is coming out of it. Therefore, a lot should be done and all the jobs should be saved. No people should be made to lose their jobs. As the AIC we do support this report.

Mr W M MADISHA: Hon House Chair, Cope accepts the Budgetary Review and Recommendations Report, BRRR. Our problem hon House Chair and hon members, is the issue of jobs. Alright the first point we want to raise is that yes, let us make sure that the Post Office does its best to or it is made to deliver to the poor of our country.

However, secondly, is this point that has been raised and we keep on raising each and every time, for example over the past few days and over the past five years on SA Broadcasting Corporation, SABC.

Please let us make sure that we implement. We come here and talk about this thing, yet there is no implementation all together.

Six hundred people and I know they now say 400, but 600 people are going to be without employment. I am saying to you that 600 people means 6 000 people are not going to eat and are not going to school. There are going to be problems in our country. Remember, one person particularly amongst the African people, one person feeds about 10 people. Now if we agree that these people must be without work it means that we are faced with a very, very serious problem and us having agreed that these people not be removed, it is for a month. It means after that month we are going to have a very serious problem. It means that yes, we agree that they must not be removed, but then say that for a month only, and after that month they should just be kicked out. Please I beg, let us stop that. Otherwise we are not getting anywhere at all and this Parliament must be blamed for that. Thank you, hon House Chair.

Mr M G E HENDRICKS: Hon House Chair, you cannot speak in the name of God and ask a Minister to go, unless you had to ... [Inaudible.] ... you had a dream in the morning. [Applause.]

We have seen the storming phase of the Minister and we have now seen the sickling down face and this Budgetary Review and

Recommendations Report, BRRR, triggers what we can expect in the future that will blow our mind as 5g artificial intelligence neurolinguistics programme rolled out.

I just want to ask the Minister to please ensure that when she awards the tender instead of giving people bribes and so on that those who get the tender must give the young people and vulnerable women free data. This must be spread out as much as possible to that they can participate in the economy.

The matter about the Post Office, I agree with the EFF that we should be an interest free bank. We are looking forward to the benefits that the Minister has been working hard for.

One of the hon members said that one person feeds 10 people in the African community, in the Coloured community one person feeds 20 people. Thank you very much, hon House Chairperson.

Ms A H MTHEMBU: Hon House Chair and hon members, in the past few weeks, the nation has been discussing the challenges at the SA Broadcasting Corporation, SABC. We must not forget that the SABC is a national treasure which touches the lives of every South African. In our villages, townships, cities and even our neighbouring countries. Thousands of hard working SABC journalists

and technical staff work every day to bring information programmes in our homes, in our cars and online.

Hon House Chairperson, information and knowledge are essential element of our project of transformation and the reconstruction and the recovery of the economy.

The Department of Communications and Digital Technologies has enormous responsibility to ensure that the entities in its portfolio are financially and commercially sustainable and able to fulfil their mandates. Based on the evidence before us, this new department is stabilising. It must build on the work of the two merged departments that received unqualified audits and address 94% of the audit findings.

The Government Communications and Information System, GCIS, and Media Development and Diversity Agency, MDDA, have achieved clean audits as they have done for a number of years.

The committee is concerned about procurement of some goods and services without obtaining some price quotation. The ANC supports the adoption of the Budgetary Review and Recommendations Report, BRRR. We further call on the department ... Applause.] [Time expired.]

Motion agreed to (African Christian Democratic Party and Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Report on Department of Telecommunications and Postal Services and entities accordingly adopted.

Report on Department of Communications and entities accordingly adopted.

# CONSIDERATION OF BUDGETARY REVIEW AND RECOMMENDATION REPORT OF PORTFOLIO COMMITTEE ON DEFENCE AND MILITARY VETERANS ON

**2019-20 ANNUAL REPORT OF ARMSCOR AND CASTLE CONTROL BOARD**

**CONSIDERATION OF BUDGETARY REVIEW AND RECOMMENDATION REPORT OF PORTFOLIO COMMITTEE ON DEFENCE AND MILITARY VETERANS ON 2019-20 ANNUAL REPORT OF DEPARTMENT OF MILITARY VETERANS**

**CONSIDERATION OF BUDGETARY REVIEW AND RECOMMENDATION REPORT OF PORTFOLIO COMMITTEE ON DEFENCE AND MILITARY VETERANS ON**

**2019-20 ANNUAL REPORT OF DEPARTMENT OF DEFENCE**

There was no debate

The Chief Whip of the Majority Party moved: That the Reports be adopted.

*Declaration(s) of vote:*

Mr S J F MARAIS: Chair, am I allowed to give my declaration?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): You are allowed, hon Marais.

Mr S J F MARAIS: Chairperson, the Budgetary Review and Recommendation Report, BRRR, of the department exposes the real threat that the SA National Defence Force, SANDF, will be embarrassed in the future by not being able to resource properly and fulfil the minimum obligations to comply with Section 200 of the Constitution to protect the integrity of South Africa and the safety of its citizens. This is due to poor management by both the Ministry of Defence and the Military Command Council by also not prioritising their money properly.

The Minister was unable to cut unessential costs, for instance, the flight of the ANC delegation to Zimbabwe, of which we now know there is no record of official government business. Also by allowing the irregular and illegal import of R215 million of COVID-19-related medicine from Cuba and also where she opposes the

application by the Khosa family after soldiers were involved in the killing of Collins Khosa. If there are no executive and political wills and support, we will see the borders being more porous in the future and we will become the focal point of the thugs of the world. I thank you, Madam Chair.

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: Chairperson, my member is struggling with the network, I will just take over.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Proceed, hon Mkhaliphi.

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: Chair, we have for the past decades had one report after another detailing the extent of the decline of our defence force. From the 2015 Defence Review Report that demonstrated the decline in the defence allocation year on year by approximately 5% per annum in real terms over the last 20 years to less than 1% of the gross domestic product resulting in the loss of essential defence capabilities.

The result of this has been terrible and the defence review noted the consequences as loss of significant impact on the capacity and the capabilities of the Department of Defence and the level of the Republic of South Africa’s defence ambition in support of its national interests in foreign policy. A properly thought

legislative mechanism ought to have dealt with the funding model of our defence force to ensure that the ambitions of the defence force and the resources available are not out of sync with each other.

On 27 until 29 November 2020, the portfolio went on an oversight visit to the borders of South Africa, Zimbabwe, Mozambique and partly Swaziland. The appalling conditions our soldiers have to endure are shocking and beyond comprehension. This alone is an indication of a department that has been run down by the leading ruling party in South Africa. So, therefore, we reject these reports. Thank you, Chair.

Inkosi R N CEBEKHULU: Hon Chairperson, the able, capable and effective defence of our nation, offering support if necessary to the SA Police Service, SAPS, and continental peacekeeping efforts remains a core mandate of the SANDF. In order to deliver upon this mandate, budgetary fundamentals and discipline are required.

Internal control deficiency raised by the Auditor-General OF South Africa in respect of leadership not exercising sufficient oversight responsibility regarding financial and performance reporting and compliance are totally unacceptable, and corrective action in this regard must be immediately taken.

In respect of military veterans, there remain many cases of which we are aware of deserving military veterans who remain unable to access benefits. In this respect, the department is urged to ensure a quick turnaround time on applications of all military veterans, and there should be an expanded deployment of resources in order to finalise the military veterans’ database. In respect of the Armaments Corporation of South Africa, Armscor, the IFP agrees that the entity should remain focussed on its primary mandate as an acquisition agency but additionally and importantly balance this with its specialised need for research and development to strengthen its commercial viability and revenue generation. The Armaments Corporation of South Africa can play a leading role in Africa and the rest of the world and must pursue commercial opportunities outside of South Africa. This will not only lead to the creation of much-needed employment opportunities for South Africans, but also ensure that South Africa remains at the forefront of research development and technological advancement in this area of expertise. The IFP actually supports the ... thank you. Thank you, Chair.

Mr W M THRING: Hon House Chair, the ACDP notes that the Department of Defence has, as one of its primary mandates, the responsibility of keeping South Africans safe. When one joins the defence force or one of its entities, one of the primary characteristics

instilled in its recruits is the construct or idea of discipline. This idea of discipline, this construct called discipline, must start from the top and in particular how senior members within the Department of Defence deal with public funds.

And when one looks at the reports given, the Auditor-General has found huge challenges within the department. The department has received a qualified report with findings. We’ve received irregular expenditure of some R2 832 000 000 and this largely as a result of the irregular expenditure including R2,6 billion for expenditure above the compensations of employee allocations. A R143 million was paid for assets verification project contracts, R34 million was paid for three contracts that were awarded by means of unfair bidding processes, R28 million was paid for ICT contracts not concluded through the State Information Technology Agency, Sita.

Clearly, this speaks of ill-discipline and this ill-discipline will continue to be passed on downwards, which then places your ordinary citizens under threat in South Africa. What the Defence was meant to do and called to do is to keep South Africans safe. They will fail to do that if there is no proper discipline in terms of how they handle the funding. We need boots on the ground in our borders. We need our soldiers to be able to keep South

Africa safe and they are failing. The ACDP does not support this report. Thank you.

*Declaration(s) of Vote contd:*

Mr M G E HENDRICKS: Hon House Chair, I agree that we need the defence force to keep South Africa safe. We don’t need the narrative of who they cast for, because that is antirevolutionary. However, the defence force need to adopt best practice as an employer, and one of the things that they need to do is to do an audit of its members. Some of them have title deeds. These members of the defence force, especially those that live in Simon’s Town, have a lifetime of service to the country. They have families, but they don’t have title deeds that they can hand over to their children and their grandchildren and title deeds to align to property.

Just like we are slow to address the issue of the 300 apartheid murder inquest, we need to do more for the veterans. Our veterans have been very patient over 25 years, and the country has not kept its promises. We support the report. Thank you very much, hon House Chair.

Mr V C XABA: Hon House Chair and hon members, the Portfolio Committee on Defence and Military Veterans has considered and

adopted its Budgetary Review and Recommendation Report, BRRR, on Vote 19, which incorporates the Department of Defence, the Department of Military Veterans, the Castle Control Board, Armscor and Military Ombuds. The ANC supports the report as moved by the Chief Whip of the Majority Party.

We wish to commend the Minister of Defence and Military Veterans for ensuring that the defence force is able to discharge its commitment to the Constitution, to defend and protect the territorial integrity of the Republic, despite the dwindling budget. We remain indebted to the men and the women in brown, who ensures that our borders are safeguarded, and we remain safe in this country. We welcome that in the year under review, the Department of Defence was able to clear four out of six recurring audit qualifications.

We are concern that the department has again qualified on the completeness of irregular expenditure in that, there is deliberate attempt not to disclose the full extent of incurred irregular expenditure. The irregular expenditure highlights the needs for strengthening preventative controls.

The Auditor-General reminds us that, maintaining the environment with sufficient preventative controls, is key to addressing risks

and ensuring compliance with legislation, thus guaranteeing that the allocated funds achieve the desired objectives and fulfil our commitment to the citizenry. More money is wasted into investigating transgressions that could have been avoided and mitigated had proactive measures such as ... [Interjections.] [Time expired.] Thank you.

Question put.

Motion agreed to (African Christian Democratic Party and Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Report on 2019-20 Annual Report of Armscor and Castle Control Board accordingly adopted.

Report on 2019-20 Annual Report of Department of Military Veterans accordingly adopted.

Report on 2019-20 Annual Report of Department of Defence accordingly adopted.

# CONSIDERATION OF BUDGETARY REVIEW AND RECOMMENDATION REPORT OF PORTFOLIO COMMITTEE ON HUMAN SETTLEMENTS, WATER AND SANITATION

There was no debate.

The Chief Whip of the Majority Party moved: That the Report be adopted.

*Declaration(s) of Vote:*

Ms E L POWELL: Madam Chairperson, in the year under review, the Housing Department only managed to achieve 62% of its targets, despite spending more than 91% of its budget. In the Human Settlements Delivery Programme, the department’s most important function, overall performance declined to a dismal 47%. That means, despite all of the Public Relations, PR, spin, from the Minister, the department achieved less than half of its housing targets.

Of the 17 000 hectares of land acquired during the previous Medium-Term Strategic Framework, MTSF, period, only 17% of this

land was rezoned. The department also only managed to achieve 1,2% of its council rental unit objectives for year one of the fifth year period, and 890 000 title deeds still remained outstanding.

For the entire financial year, the department did not even have a permanent Director-General, DG. Hon members, the Auditor-General, AG’s findings, were even more concerning. Continuing on from a

five-year trend under the ANC’s leadership, not a single entity obtained a clean audit.

Both the National Home Builders Registration Council, NHBRC, and the National Housing Finance Corporation, NHFC, continued to use contracts, after they have expired. The Community Schemes Ombud Service, CSOS, and Estate Agency Affairs Board, EAAB, both received a qualified audit opinion as a result of inadequate controls around revenue management. Yes, that’s a fancy way to say that they used state coffers to simply do what they felt like doing.

Neither entity had a permanent Chief Financial Officer, CFO, either. Madam Chairperson, this is what happens when cronies and cadres are rewarded for loyalty with top government jobs. Sadly, all we will be subjected to today from the ANC, is self- congratulatory praise for achieving so very little. I urge the House to let the facts speak for themselves.

Ms R MOHLALA: Chairperson, today, 26 years after attainment of freedom ... [Interjections.]

*Sepedi:*

MODULASETULO WA NTLO (Moh M G Boroto): Mma Mohlala! O dirile phošo. Tloša leswao le le lego ka morago ga gago goba o tswalele bidio.

*English:*

Ms R MOHLALA: Okay, let me do that.

*IsiZulu*:

USIHLALO WENDLU (Nk M G Boroto): Vala umboniso bhanya bhanya nje mama uqhubeke.

*English*:

Ms R MOHLALA: Okay, no it’s done. Thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Thank you. Continue.

Ms R MOHLALA: Chairperson, today, 26 years after attainment of freedom, over 5 million African people still live in informal settlements, and over 300 000 coloured people still live in informal dwellings. This is in addition to over 2 million people whose tenure to house security is precarious. Living on farms, they can be evicted from any day. There’s no running water, no ablution facilities and they share their homes with rats and

fleas. This is a daily reality of most of our people, despite many promises for ‘better life for all,’ since 1994.

The COVID-19 pandemic has laid bare a state of neglect for basic human rights and human dignity, that this neo-apartheid state has subjected our people to. We have seen with our own eye, thousands of people who lost their jobs during lockdown. Some were getting evicted by banks, even when their capital amounts have been paid. This is so because the property regulatory environment is hostile to poor people. Banks has been given excessive powers to harass poor people. We have proposed to the government that they must intervene to ensure a pending holiday for people who have lost their jobs. Had you done so, Minister, no one’s home would have been auctioned by the bank.

We must also make it illegal for banks to repossess houses from people who have paid off 50% of their bonds, and are unable to continue paying their bond instalments due to socioeconomic circumstances. The state must invest in building the capacity of the municipalities to employ artisans to repair damaged water infrastructure, to prevent leaks and also to ensure that water infrastructure is delivered to each and every corner, where there are human beings in this country.

This department has failed to secure our short to long-term future because of its inability to plan. The Auditor-General detected an irregular expenditure of R40 million incurred by National Home Builders Registration Council, NHBRC, Micro Housing Finance Corporation, MHFC, the Estate Agency Affairs Board, EAAB, and the Community Schemes Ombud Service, CSOS, in 2018-19 financial year.

*Declarations of Vote contd. IsiZulu*:

Mnu X NGWEZI: Siyathokoza, Sihlalo eNdlini, nabahlonishwa bonke, izidingo zabantu baseNingizimu Africa ziningi kakhulu kodwa esibaluleke kakhulu kunazo zonke ukuhlinzekwa kwamanzi aphephile nahlanzekile kanye nokuhlinzekwa kwezindlu ezinesithunzi kubantu bakithi abangenawo umhlaba.

*English*:

The committee report evaluating the department’s performance highlight major internal problems which impels vital and life- dependent service delivery. In fact, some of the internal problems at the department, if not addressed, will cause a further breakdown of the water security public confidence to address the shackles of social injustice and increase service delivery protests.

For instance, according to the Auditor- General, AG, this department does not sufficiently monitor performance information and reporting, which leaves us to wonder how this department will set its target and assess its progress in terms of addressing the needs of the people.

This issue even runs so deep as to cause misalignment between the way it spends its allocate budget and achieve on its targets. This department spends almost 99% of its budget and only achieves 60% of the target. This translated into the poor service of the department, underachieving its goals of informal settlements upgrades, all while irregular expenditure remains unacceptably high.

The department is celebrating bringing irregular expenditure down to only 14 million while people continue to live excessive poverty and have no access to their human rights to water. This is totally unacceptable.

Finally, the lack of planning by the department when it decides on the bulk infrastructure projects has really consequences on the people’s access to clean provision of water. Municipalities are mandated with water reticulation and bulk infrastructure projects are completed, but the department is neither communicating nor

properly planning with municipalities. As a result, this leaves critical water infrastructure dormant while municipalities play catch up in trying to meet the servicing. This mater must be address, like in Umkhanyakude and the Jozini Dam.

*IsiZulu*:

Noma kunjalo-ke, Sihlalo, kodwa, siyaweseka lombiko ola phambi kwethu njengeNkatha. Ngiyabonga.

Mr W W WESSELS: House Chair, what a shame! What a horror story it is when one reads this report. One of the many targets not met by the department once again is title deeds that are not registered. Only26 666 title deeds were registered against the target of 1,193 million. That is the achievement of only 2%. Why was it not achieved? It is due to corruption - awarding contracts to cadres who do not deliver on those contracts.

When one looks at all the scandals involving this department, it is really a shame. This department has been looted and has been a cash cow to the ANC cadres and to the ANC Secretary-General for years. The ANC cadres and their secretary-general got rich while the people are suffering. Water is polluted. Tax money stolen and wasted whilst the cronies are getting richer.

Water is polluted. Some municipalities do not even have water currently because our outstanding debt of municipalities to water boards – like Mangaung! Go and stay in Bloemfontein, Botshabelo and Thaba Nchu. Tell the people there that they have water – because they do not. Thank you, Chairperson.

Rev K R J MESHOE: Chairperson, although the ACDP welcomes the unqualified audit opinion received by the Department of Human Settlements. We are concerned that none of its entities achieved clean audits in this financial year. Furthermore, service delivery seems to have been even poorer than in 2018-19, thereby offering taxpayers little value for their hard-earned money.

Shockingly, Programme 3 achieved only 3 of its 13 targets. This explains why none of the 1 500 informal settlements targeted for upgrading by 2024 have been developed, and why only 150 Community Residential Units have been delivered, while the 2024 target is

12 000. This is an achievement of only 1%, which is disgraceful indeed.

Even worse, according to the Budgetary Review and Recommendations Report, BRR Report, one of the key Medium-Term Strategic Framework priorities, is to clear 893 222 outstanding title deeds for pre- 1994 houses and post-1994 houses, and process 300 000 new title

deeds for serviced sites. Only 26 666 title deeds have been registered against the combined Medium-Term Strategic Framework target of almost one million, which makes it only 2% achievement.

In conclusion, this department needs to clean up the financial management of its entities and start handing out title deeds now – not a month before the 2021 Local Government Elections. The ACDP will not support this report.

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: House Chairperson, the NFP notes the BRR report of the department tabled here today. We welcome the opinion that the department received. We note that there has been a reduction in the irregular expenditure. We must admit that the Minister in this particular case has inherited a department that was already in serious trouble before.

It appears that the Minister has added some value to this department and is making a difference, but like the NFP has always said there, hon House Chairperson. You can bring Ministers. You can change them. They can come with their brilliant ideas, their passion and commitment; however if you don’t deal with the problems lower down, which is the DG, DDGs and all the others that have a role to play, then of course you are going to sit with a problem which will go on and on.

The other problem is that the question we need to ask is: Is this system of these portfolio committees that we have, because my understanding is that portfolio committees have a responsibility not to just come here and be negative and find faults, but to over the entire period to be able to working with the department highlighting and identifying weaknesses and challenges, and dealing with them at the appropriate time so that is does not accumulate.

So, it’s either the system is not working. Therefore the portfolio committees are not doing enough. The department are being left without any oversight, and that is why we are sitting with a problem. I just want to highlight for the Minister very quickly what happened in Schaapkraal yesterday: How people were evicted, lights were cut, water was removed and police were not even able to intervene – this was an illegal eviction.

Let me tell you what is happening in Delft. There is a protest taking place today. There is one taking place on Monday. It has taken the last week. The City of Cape Town is not even willing to speak to the people – not even the community are part and parcel of the process of the housing that they want to build in that particular area. There is no engagement – no public participation

at all. [Time expired.] The department need to intervene in these matters. The NFP will support the report. Thank you.

Mr L M NTSHAYISA: Thank you very much hon Chairperson ... [Interjections.]

Rev K R J MESHOE: Did you email anything?

*Sepedi*:

MODULASETULO WA NGWAKO(Moh M G Boroto): Aowa Moruti Meshoe. Moruti! Moruti Meshoe! [Tsenoganong.] Moruti Meshoe, tswalela selo seo! [Tsenoganong.]

*Sesotho*:

SEPHADI SE KA SEHLOOHONG SA MOKGA WA BONGATA: Molimo o mo shebile!

[Ditsheho.]

Mor K R J MESHOE: Tshwarelo! Tshwarelo, Modulasetulo!

MODULA SETULO WA NTLO (Ms M G BOROTO): Re a leboha ntate!

Mr L M NTSHAYISA: Whenever I stand up to speak, someone would just come into disruption. I don’t know why. I am always disturbed. [Laughter.] Hon Chairperson, the building of houses for the people

of South Africa, especially women and youth, is what we want to see happening. The provision of water and sanitation to the people would be a great thing indeed.

These are the issues that should be attended to. We are very much concerned about the lack of water in some areas, like Ugu District Municipality and other areas like Empilweni - Libode, where they are just using water from the river, which is not clean. So, we want clean water now to be provided to the people.

This budget now should address those challenges. It is very much interesting for a ward councillor, when he is being approached by a person in the rural area, wanting to know about water. Then this ward councillor would say it is the competence of the district municipalities. So, the people on the ground do not know about that.

These ward councillors should show the way. They should not just say it is the competence of the district municipalities, because the people on the ground know them. They don’t know anything about the district municipalities. Those are the things that should be corrected.

Perhaps this district development – I am not referring to the hon D D Mabuza’s District Development Model. These initials are almost the same as D D M Mabuza. Ja, I like that Deputy President because I use to be the one, but now I am the acting president. [Applause.] [Laughter.] Hon Chairperson, this model perhaps will help us dealing with these issues. Thank you very much.

Mr W M MADISHA: Chair, those of us who were born in the deep rural areas more than six decades ago know the problems faced by South Africans in those areas. The majority of us know what apartheid did to our people in those areas in particular. It denied them clean water and sanitation while it gave those in townships very small pieces of land for the four-roomed houses.

When people rose to fight against those wrongs, apartheid even created townships, such as Soshanguve – particularly under P W Botha and others – for the Sotho, Shangaan, Nguni and Venda in order to separate them. It gave those in the townships small buckets of water - very expensive – and toilets that did not work properly. The creation of ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (MS M G BOROTO): Hon Hendricks, do you want to come in? Okay!

Mr M G E HENDRICKS: My turn now, hon Chair?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G BOROTO): No, no! Wait, hon

Hendricks; you just came in when somebody is in the podium. Continue, hon Madisha.

Mr W MADISHA: The creation of Bantustans, such as Bophuthatswana, Lebowa, Venda, Transkei, Ciskei, and so on, was to add to the separation and destruction of the African people. Today, not enough has been done. More has got to be done - truly. The councillors don’t know what they are supposed to do.

The budget is not enough. More must be given. Consider today, for example, the informal settlements - mekhukhu. They don’t have water there. They don’t have toilets. We are still faced with momentous challenges. We therefore will say let more be given so that our people can be able to survive. Thank you. [Applause.]

Mr M G E HENDRICKS: Hon Chair, I would like to commend the EFF who also highlighted the plight of the coloured community, which is part of the Khoi and part of the San. It looks like only when the EFF staged the Western Cape and the City of Cape Town, their plight will be addressed because no other political party is concerned about the housing needs of the coloured people. They

have Afrikaner DNA – they have white DNA, although the stiff upper lip has dominate. Then the Xhosa DNA is real family DNA in the coloured community, and yet, they are treated as Cinderellas here in South Africa. Hon House Chair, I wrote a book ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon Hendricks, please wait. There is a point of order. Hon Hill-Lewis?

Mr G G HILL-LEWIS: Okay! Will the member take a question?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Are you ready for the question, hon Hendricks?

Mr M G E HENDRICKS: No, hon Chair!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Okay! Continue, hon Hendricks.

Mr M G E HENDRICKS: I said that I wrote the book because our freedom would be fake: The African child continues to live in sewerage, to learn in sewerage and to pray in sewerage. That is why this department, together with the Department of Environmental

Affairs must make this a top priority, which I don’t see in this report. Thank you vey much.

*Sesotho*:

Mr M A TSEKI: Ha ke lebohe motsamaisi wa dipuisano!

English:

The ANC rises in support of the Budgetary Review and Recommendations Report of the Portfolio Committee on Human Settlements, Water and Sanitation. The provision of sustainable human settlements in ensuring an inclusive society in a county with historical exclusion policies continues to be a priority for the ANC, which is why we have heeded the call of breaking new grounds in doing away with historical spatial patterns and created comprehensive integrated human settlement.

We welcome the call of the portfolio committee for the department to use the District Development Model to ensure co-operation between the various spheres of government and collaboration for rendering service delivery for communities.

Chair, let me just make some comments. I think there is this question that the EFF and the DA continues to say that the department did not perform, in particular when they use the budget

percentages and the targets. Let’s explain this thing: I think the nation would want to hear, because the information that is being peddled here is that the department is not performing. We report on a complete house that has got a happy letter for a person to come in. [Applause.]

A municipality like the Western Cape is leading on not spending money on annual basis. That is why the department is not spending. We exactly know the separation of powers on different spheres of government. The EFF is just aloof on discussing critical issues that are affecting our people. [Time expired.] Therefore, as the ANC, we are saying: We are moving forward in transforming human settlements. Thank you. [Applause.]

Question put.

Objections noted.

Report agreed to.

# CONSIDERATION OF BUDGETARY REVIEW AND RECOMMENDATION REPORT OF PORTFOLIO COMMITTEE ON SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT

There was no debate.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY moved: That the Report be adopted.

*Declarations of Vote:*

Ms A L A ABRAHAMS: Well, the Department of Social Development, or DSD, obtained a clean audit and their entities, SA Social Security Agency, or Sassa, and the National Development Agency, or NDA, once again did not. Material noncompliance with legislation was found at the Sassa and the NDA, well, the NDA had further material findings on performance information. Both entities still cannot get the basics of supply chain management right.

It must be mentioned that the director-general position at the DSD is still not filled. It has been unfilled since the Fifth Administration. Filling this position is critical in getting the DSD ship on course.

The department reprioritised R33 million to employ 200 social workers to specifically focus on gender-based violence and R60 million from their goods and services budget towards the

Khuseleka One-Stop Centre project. However, this R90 million was shamefully returned from the National Treasury. According to the DSD, the National Treasury only responded in May, this year, to

the department’s request for this budget reprioritisation, which unfortunately was too late for them to implement.

While the 200 social workers for gender-based violence were employed for a period of four months on contract and subsequently absorbed into some of the provincial departments, more social workers could have been employed had the necessary urgency been given. It is an injustice to the over 9 000 qualified yet unemployed social workers.

Lastly, but important to reiterate, as there are still many South Africans who applied for the Sassa R350 grant and to this day have not received it for the various excuses made by the Sassa. There are government officials who incorrectly received this grant while the destitute languish in poverty.

Before we can even consider a basic income grant, the department and its entities must get this right. They must get the basics right. Thank you. [Applause.]

Ms L H ARRIES: Thank you very much, House Chairperson, the COVID-

19 pandemic and the socioeconomic disaster it has exposed in this country, should force us to rethink the state’s intervention in the lives of the vulnerable and the poor.

We welcomed the introduction of the COVID-relief grant, as millions of our people are languishing in poverty, with no hope of ever escaping because the economic environment just cannot create jobs. It is therefore tragic that thousands of people who qualify for this grant that are approved by the department – Sassa - are yet to receive this money.

While you have been dragging feet in ensuring poor people have access to the relief grant, you have been too quick as government to make money available to private companies.

It is also incomprehensible after we have seen the depths of poverty in this country, we can with a clear mind not continue with this relief grant on a permanent basis. So many households depend on it to put food on the table, and without it, so many would have been on the brink of starvation.

Lastly, it is a tragedy that we once again have to come here and bemoan the inadequacy of this department’s interventions on the issues of abuse and murder of women and men in the country. The department need to be able to work both with the police and the Department of Health to make sure that victims of gender-based violence are in a position to access both justice and quality health care.

The department must lead in working with other departments to create safe shelters for abused women and children. The department has failed in every conceivable way. Therefore, we reject this report.

Mr N SINGH: Thank you, hon House Chairperson, during the budget year under review, this department made little or no progress in a number of areas, one being entity oversight.

We have seen a regression in the Sassa’s service delivery. There has been a marked increase in the number of vulnerable people, especially the elderly who are forced to sleep in the cold and in the rain outside the Sassa office and not receiving the help they need. There seem to be no plan from the Sassa or SA Post Office, or Sapo to improve on the long queues which have become synonymous with our grant paypoints. Yesterday, I noticed a long queue outside the Post Office in the cold and the terrible weather

While communities battle poverty, substance abuse and gender-based violence, thousands of trained social workers remain unemployed.

In 2018, Cabinet instructed the government to absorb these critical frontline workers but allocated funding simply goes elsewhere.

The IFP, through hon Van der Merwe, has urged the Deputy President to intervene. The Minister must ensure that funds allocated to provinces TO employ social workers are ring-fenced.

The IFP also remains concerned that despite the much lauded National Drug Master Plan, we simply lack the necessary substance abuse treatment centres to make this plan a success.

For the most vulnerable, 2020 has been a devastating year. More so for the many women and children trapped in abusive homes without access to shelters because shelters in South Africa go underfunded and there are simply not enough of them especially in rural areas and areas which have been declared gender-based violence hotspots.

This department has also been plagued by corruption. Consider the families who had cold harsh winter while more than 43 000 blankets purchased by Social Development in KwaZulu-Natal stacked in a storage somewhere. Blankets that were bought for R600 each, in a corrupt deal costing R15,8 million. Consider the unforgivable theft of food parcels by government officials with not a single arrest.

The treatment of some NGOs by this department is simply unforgivable. Consider the 25 NPOs who depleted their funds

providing food, medicine and care to elderly South Africans during lockdown only to be denied payment by Social Development in the Eastern Cape for breaking lockdown regulations, leaving them in distress.

For many, this department stands between life and death. It stands between a meal and starvation. This department can and must do better. It is for that reason and because of the vulnerable people out there and so many who rely on what the department does, that we will support the department in any efforts to get things right. We will support the report. I thank you.

Ms T BREEDT: Thank you, Madam House Chairperson, lockdown proved how delicate the balance in this department and its entities is. This department and its entities were failing the people South Africa long before the lockdown and the pandemic. They tried their utmost to provide the necessary assistance to the millions of South Africans that were left homeless, jobless and without food during lockdown but are still lacking.

A 51% achievement of targets before the pandemic is not something to be proud of. It is a matter of grave concern for the coming years and especially this current year’s targets taking into

account the pandemic and the fact that for months the department could not do anything besides the most critical of tasks.

The Sassa reported an underspending of 90% on compensation of employees due to vacant posts and the moratorium on filling of these posts. Had these posts been filled with trustworthy, reliable and qualified people for the positions, I wonder what this entity would have looked like during this pandemic? I wonder if corruption would have been lower. Service delivery would have improved and the most vulnerable of our society would not have been left to fend for themselves. The answer would most probably be, yes. Had the department’s oversight over its entities been better, this picture might also have looked a bit different.

The continued decline in the budget for substance abuse assistance is also worrying. We are creating a society of dependants on the state and on substances. The times are hard, they are uncertain and they are terrifying. People are now more than ever, at risk of falling back into the pit of substance abuse or starting just to forget about the challenges of life as we know it in the pandemic.

Furthermore, the emotional and mental impact of the virus is uncharted. It is now necessary to have enough social workers on the ground. We need social workers that are trained to deal with

the challenges that we are facing. To make hollow promises and to grandstand is not going to address this.

I have said this in the past. I believe the current department with its current incumbents, like the acting director-general are trying their utmost under difficult circumstances but more needs to be done still. [Time expired.] I thank you, House Chairperson.

Rev K J R MESHOE: Hon House Chair, the ACDP welcomes the unqualified audit opinion with no findings obtained by the Department of Social Development, especially because in the previous two years, it received qualified audit opinions.

We also welcome the transition of the Sassa from Cash Paymaster Services to the SA Post Office. This is definitely a step in the right direction as we need to build our assets as a country. The conditions of our post offices are appalling. They should be improved.

We are very disappointed in the Sassa’s contravention of the National Treasury instructions during the COVID-19 lockdown period. The lack of punishment meted out to perpetrators including those who stole food parcels.

The social grant beneficiaries increased to over 18 million in the 2019-20 financial year, which already raised the issue of economic sustainability.

While the ACDP welcomes the food parcels handed out to those in need during the lockdown, the costs are huge, which is a concern in the light of our 43,1% of our expanded unemployment figures especially when competitive bidding processes are not followed. Another concern is the Sassa staff vacancy rate which is around 50%.

In conclusion, the Department of Social Development has not achieved over half of its target, which the ACDP finds to be unacceptable, for example, 70 000 of 231 000 nonprofit organisations, or NPOs, supported by the department are not legally registered. There legal issues with the backlog of child foster care orders.

In addition, there was no meaningful intervention with respect to fighting gender-based violence. It appears that some services for those living with disabilities have been neglected and in some cases, abandoned. The ACDP will not support this Budgetary Review and Recommendation Report. Thank you. [Time expired.]

*Declarations of vote:* (Cont...)

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: House Chairperson, the NFP welcomes and supports the report of the department as tabled here. We welcome the unqualified audit opinion that the department received and it is an improvement from the previous years. I think there is one thing we need to emphasise on and I hope the Minister is listening to this. There are so many nonprofit organisations, NPOs, that are springing up every day, but there are little control measures in ensuring that these NPOs who are very often funded by business and private sectors and by government are compliant but more importantly they are providing the service that they intended to provide. If you want to create a better society I think we all need to work together - the SA Police Service, Social Development, Department of Health, Department of Justice and all these NPOs and nongovernment organisations, NGOs. All need to work together. This is clearly not happening.

I will give you a good example of what happened yesterday while a parliamentary session was on. A former police officer kidnapped his child, went away and got caught for drunk and driving. What the SA Police do was to actually release the nine-year-child into the custody of the father. When the mother calls, the police officers told her that no, we cannot do anything because he is

entitled, he has the right because it is his child even though the child was being put at risk.

The problem which we are having is that even in police station we need co-ordination between the department and the other departments because I can tell you that what we see in practice and in reality is two different things. We have seen there are problems on the ground. There’s no doubt about that.

But we must also admit that the problem of the social ills in South Africa is not going to disappear. It is going to get progressively worse over the period of time with the high unemployment rate in the country, with businesses that are closing and other things. The department needs to improve and up its game and ensure that they put additional measures to try and overcome these challenges.

Regarding the issue of the R350 grant the department did a fantastic job. [Time expired] It’s not enough and people have not yet received money. The NFP supports the report. Thank you.

Mr L M NTSHAYISA: Hon Chairperson, we shall never stop crying about the money that was stolen or wasted on Cash Paymaster Services, CPS, in this department. This department has a very huge

load in terms of service delivery. Imagine when 17 million beneficiaries have to receive grants from it. One would image if these people were getting nothing. A total number of 17 million is a very big. It is nearly close to half million of the people of this country. We appreciate what the government is doing for these people otherwise would be suffering a lot.

This budget is not enough. Of course we need the department to address all these issues. We say half a loaf is better than no bread. So that are still getting must get so that we don’t have a lot of people suffering. We support this report as the AIC. Thank you very much.

Mr M G E HENDRICKS: Hon Chairperson, the F F Plus has acknowledges we have a Minister, a political will and the political class. So, there is some hope on the horizon. It looks like the DA and EFF are getting very close to the ruling party and from the range I won’t be surprised if in the future we have a second Deputy President like we had in 1994.

The President has redeployed 350 000 young people to schools. I would like to make an appeal that the social workers that have referred to in this debate also be redeployed urgently so that we can once and for all assist our learners. On the lighter note, I

have been married to a social worker for 40 years and I can see the benefit of social workers. Even the President has said [Inaudible.] for me. I hope that we take this issue of the shortage of social workers very seriously. Thank you very much. hon Chair.

Ms N K BILANKULU: House Chair, the ANC rises to support this budget review and recommendations report, BRRR. We welcome the improvement made by the entire Social Development portfolio in areas which have long been a challenge. These include improved audit findings of the department and the improvement in the reporting based on the evidence-based method.

Millions of South Africans are getting R350 SA Social Security Agency, Sassa, grant as we speak. But however, we are concerned about significant areas which need serious attention. These include, but not limited to the minimal reduction of irregular expenditure, weak oversight over the entities, employment of persons with disabilities, employment of social workers as well as the director-general.

The work that we have done thus far in this sixth administration with the entire Social Development portfolio has been underpinned by the evidence-based and outcome-based approaches. This is to

ensure that the entire portfolio tangibly moves from a social welfare to a developmental social welfare approach to practically make a mark in the lives of South Africans, especially the vulnerable and the poor.

We have made strict recommendations with time frames to the Minister. This will guide our oversight work to ensure that the entire portfolio progressively changes its approach to the one that practically, efficiently and effectively uplifts and empower all South Africans. The ANC supports this BRRR report. I thank you, Chair.

Motion agreed to (Democratic Alliance, African Christian Democratic Party, Freedom Front Plus and Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Report accordingly adopted.

# CONSIDERATION OF BUDGETARY REVIEW AND RECOMMENDATION REPORT OF PORTFOLIO COMMITTEE ON WOMEN, YOUTH AND PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES

There was no debate.

*Sesotho:*

SEPHADI SE KA SEHLOOHONG SA MOKGA WA BONGATA: Ha ke lebohe,

Motlatsi wa Sepikara. Ke tsitsinya hore tlaleho ena e amohelwe. Ke a leboha.

MOTLATSI WA SEPIKARA: Ke a leboha, mme, ka leleme la hao le thellang

*Declarations of Vote*:

Mr L MPHITHI: Deputy Speaker, the Budgetary Review and Recommendation Report, BRRR will not provide rapid and comprehensive responses to all forms of violence against women and children. It will not address the backlog of cases delays and the deoxyribonucleic acid, DNA testing and the availability of rape test kits in police stations. It will not aid the national strategic plan or the emergency action plan to respond to our communities.

It does not and will not provide a credible safety plan for victims of gender based violence. It will not provide any support to young people who are currently unemployed and are not going to be able to find work under this government. It will not mainstream youth development to provide for youth development co-ordination mechanisms at national, provincial and local levels.

It will not reach and meet the expectations of all youth, small, medium businesses who have suffered a serious blow because of the ANC lockdown. It will not assist with internships and learnerships to support entry level youth to find work. It will not help the unemployed youth in Sterkspruit, Zastron, Buhle Park and basically everywhere else. This BRRR will not provide a targeted support for micro entrepreneurs in the informal sector.

It will not expand support in incentives for youth owned businesses and co-operatives. It will not make any worthwhile strides around the data struggle for young people in this country. It will not ensure financial support for disability rights awareness. It will not aide and support special needs schools across South Africa. It will not advance the rights and freedom of persons living with disabilities in this country in any way. The department continues to fail South Africans. Not only that, it continues to receive millions and does absolutely nothing.

I would like to take this opportunity to shout out to all the Non- Governmental Organisations, NGOs who are doing the lord’s work in the devil’s playground. Who are doing the work that the department should be doing. We see you and we will continue to fight for you as the DA and the work does not stop here. We therefore reject this BRRR. Thank you. [Applause.]

Ms E N NTLANGWINI: Deputy Speaker, as a result of COVID-19, many people have lost their jobs and no sector of society has felt this more than women. It is women who must stay at home with their abusive partners, with their sons, who have been failed by society and turned into criminals. It is women who must find food for their households and it is women who get abused in this process by shameless men who demands sexual favours for jobs.

The greatest burden of poverty lies on the shoulders of women and it is these very same women who have been practically ignored, not only by the department but by society as a whole. Despite these grave dangers faced by women and persons with disabilities, the department named after them has offered nothing of substance to address the containing marginalisation and exploitations of persons living with disabilities in this country.

The frustration brought by COVID-19 pandemic is surely going to make matters worse for them. The unemployment, the difficulties with movement, the psychological trauma and the shortage of support services from government will make the lives of people living with disabilities difficult.

Persons living with disabilities continue to face numerous barriers to the full inclusion and participation in the lives of

their communities. They have been ... [Inaudible.] levels of poverty, lack of access of education, health services, [Inaudible.] employment and their under representation in the decision making and political participation compared to their able bodies counterparts.

We need more focus intervention to protect people with disabilities and promote their social and economic interest. We do reject this Budgetary Review and Recommendation Report, BRRR report. Thank you House Chair.

Mr N SINGH: Deputy Speaker, since we are dealing the Portfolio of Women, Youth and Persons living with Disabilities, let me start off by saying that the IFP is deeply distressed with regard to delays in appointment of people to the National Youth Development Agency, NYDA. We understand that there has been a process and there has been a sub-committee and we understand that there are certain people in that committee that wants their cadres to be deployed to the NYDA.

We as the IFP are not on that sub-committee and we do not like the fact that we are not on it but we would appeal to the hon Speaker that the whole process of the appointment of people to the NYDA be relooked at and if ... [Inaudible.] starts in January, by the end

of February there would be the possibility of the committee making recommendations to the President on a very open and transparent basis.

The IFP appreciate the department’s prioritization of young women and women with disabilities education attendance and retention in the public sector institutions. However, we have said that the department ought to consider programmes and platforms that will achieve sustainable equality through tackling illiteracy and poverty among all women. Women, especially rural women, are to be economically empowered as this is the foundation for their independence and dignity.

Deputy Speaker, you always say that I am a former MEC and I can tell you that when I was in 2005, I had a blind person being a switch board operator and he did excellent work. He used to come to work with his dog and one day I thought there was a snake under his table but meanwhile it was a dog’s tail that was moving. But as soon as I left, that gentleman ... [Inaudible.] ... for 15 years, and I have been battling with every Minister, has not got employment. So we must put our money where our mouth is in employing people with disabilities.

The IFP will accept this report but we believe that the department must do more. There must be more co-ordination with the commission for gender equality. For that reason; we will support the work of the department. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I agree with you hon member. Let’s call the FF Plus.

Ms T BREEDT: Deputy Speaker, although only 80% of targets were met by this department, it spent 98% of its budget with limited to no tangibles deliverables. It is an improvement of over 11% from the prior years, but if you take a look at what the improvements are, it is not that impressive. It is easy to improve and write a pretty report but what happens on the ground is what really counts.

This department is nothing other than a talk shop and a forum that pretends to be interested in empowerment of women, youth and persons with disabilities. Do they actually do this? I think not. What do you see in South Africa currently? We see gender-based violence, GBV running rise during this pandemic. We see no councillors as promised. No shelters as promised. No social workers as promised. Yet, the ANC wonders why women of South Africa are frustrated.

We see the Minister of Finance in the portfolio committee meeting earlier this week saying that the youth must not come here and debate with older people. They should take it outside. And then the ANC wonders why the youth are frustrated or surprised when the youth do take it outside in a form of a protest. We still do not have sign language approved as an official language of South Africa, five years after the latest request.

People with disabilities are discriminated against on a daily basis. They are promised empowerment and assistance to help drive change and end disability stereotypes, but no, nothing. And the ANC wonders why people with disabilities in South Africa are frustrated.

The department has not effectively implemented the Health and Safety Authority, HSA’s recommendations and continually have repeat findings. Yet, the ANC wonders why the opposition are frustrated with this Minister. Albert Einstein said:

“The definition of insanity is doing the same thing over and over again but expecting different results”

I think this absolutely describes this department and the way it goes about doing its business.

Deputy Speaker, fulfil empowerment of women, youth and persons with disabilities and not only window dressing. Get rid of this department. I thank you.

Mr S N SWART: Deputy Speaker, women, youth and people with disabilities play a key role in society. If they are strong, society is strong. Yet, we in the ACDP and I am sure that everyone across political parties still see the high levels of gender-based violence. We see high level of youth unemployment. We see substance abuse and gangsterism and of course, we see many challenges facing people with disabilities. Far more clearly needs to be done in this regard.

When one reads the report, you notice the committee pointing out a number of short comings. For example, it remains concerned about the limited number of tangible deliverables that the department has delivered. It also notes with concern that even though the department’s mandate has been inclusive of gender, youth and disability, the evidence provided to the committee was not convincing. This is the committee of oversight, the words in the report. And, it did not appear to translate to visible changes to those groups in the country.

So, we are in agreement across political parties that there is a substantial change that needs to be brought about and the ACDP agrees with the report in this regard.

Why are there such high levels of gender-based violence? Why are so many youth unemployed? Why do we have gangsterism and substance abuse? As the previous speaker indicated, why sign language is still not declared an official language in the country? I was part of the Constitutional Review Committee a number of years ago when we passed a resolution to that effect. Let’s ensure that this is done.

Lastly, the Sanitary Dignity Programme is very positive but again there are shortcomings in this regard. Let us ensure that this programme is also successfully rolled out. I thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Deputy Speaker, the UDM has indicated their absence for the report. So, you may not call them in the next order. Thank you.

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Deputy Speaker, the NFP notes and welcomes the report. Let me just start off by saying, Deputy Speaker, the percentage of the unemployed youth in South Africa is very worrying, and unless we address this problem, it is a ticking time

bomb waiting to explode. Now, women in South Africa continue to be marginalised, they continue to be regarded as second class citizens and they do not get equal pay for the work they do compared to men.

I have heard many political parties talking about persons with disability, but let me say this, Deputy Speaker, and let me give you disgraceful, let me repeat, disgraceful statistics. The ANC, yes, has persons with disabilities employed in Parliament, in the National Assembly, the DA has no one, the EFF has no one, the IFP has no one, the FF Plus has ... [Interjections.]

Ms E N NTLANGWINI: Deputy Speaker, I am standing on a point of order.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, hon member. Hon member, please just give us a moment. Yes, hon Ntlangwini.

Ms E N NTLANGWINI: That member must get his facts straight. He had no information because we even have one of our members with the disability. He must not come and mislead the public on that.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay, hon member.

Ms E N NTLANGWINI: Get your facts straight, please.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: It’s alright, hon member. You’re done, don’t overdo it.

Mr N SINGH: Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, hon member.

Mr N SINGH: I just want to ask if the hon member will take a question?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Will you take a question hon member from the NFP, hon Shaik Emam?

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Yes, I will when I have time and after I have finished.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay, go ahead.

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Thank you very much. Now, let me reiterate this. We need to lead by example. The other political parties who have large numbers present in the National Assembly and we talk about percentage of persons with disability, should ensure that

they walk the talk, and not just talk the talk. But let me give you the good news, Deputy Speaker.

We have decided to sponsor 25 women who would be qualifying in two weeks’ time as nail technicians, complete facials and eye lashes, and yes indeed, they will be graduating in two weeks’ time from today. All at our own costs. We did that just to empower the youth and women of South Africa. So, maybe that’s the direction we need to take. The NFP notes some of the concerns that have been raised in this report, and call on the department to address the issue of irregular expenditure that appears to be a repeat from year in and year out.

In addition to that, the unauthorised expenditure of R30 million, which is exactly the reoccurrence from last year as well, and 2,237 million due to overspending. The NFP believes that the department needs to address these reports in terms of the findings from the Auditor. However, a lot of work needs to be done to ensure that women are empowered in South Africa.

The NFP supports the Budgetary Review and Recommendation Report, BRRR, of Portfolio Committee on Women, Youth and Persons with Disabilities.

Mr W M MADISHA: Hon Deputy Speaker, you see, the problem is that we now have become a welfare state and we need to deal with that. That which I have put before the House in the gender-based violence, GBV, debate, is completely correct. Many politicians raised the issue of women, when the elections are near or when they want favour or support. More truly is needed, and what is needed is jobs. More must be done to move the country from being a welfare state.

We must create jobs so that poor women can be removed from the streets, where they are compelled to sell their bodies to buy food for their children, and to ensure that their children attains quality education. Let me emphasise this, I say this because women get ill because of being in the streets, and this has become a very serious problem, not only for their families, but for the entire country. More money is needed for the youth, in order for them to be developed.

What we are having at the moment is that, the people here and beyond this House knows that the youth is encouraged to attend universities, etc. But the truth is that, they don’t access skills, but the degrees that are no longer necessary today. So, thousands and thousands of the youth attend those universities but

they do not get anything whatsoever. Concerning the disabled people, they are in the worst position, and more must be done.

We have become a welfare state, but this is going to end. We already don’t have money now, and this is a problem. Therefore, we shall say that this is not enough, more has got to be given so that we can be able to move forward. More has got to be given in this regard. I thank you.

Mr M G E HENDRICKS: Hon Chair, is it my turn?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, go ahead, hon member.

Mr M G E HENDRICKS: Hon Deputy Speaker, the former President, Mr Zuma, when he was a President, he put the needs of people with disabilities in his presidential office, and we are very happy that they are still enjoying presidential support. Yesterday, the delegation of Al Jama’ah went to visit the former President, Mr Zuma, and I want to tell the House that he is in high spirit and he is in very good health. I am going to visit him very shortly.

Coming to people with disabilities, the government has 10 factories, reducing 11, the hospital requirements and furniture. most of the furniture, Deputy Speaker, was made by people with disabilities from these government factories, even the one that you’re sitting on. They can increase the capacity for 1000 to 5000, and 4000 of people with disabilities can then be employed. But, the contracts that are given to these government factories are not good, and they should not to close up those in charge.

When I was sitting at war in a trade union for them, I got them a provident fund of the trillion fund of labour.

The amount of R1 million went missing, but probably the oversight from this portfolio committee, will give relief and hope to people with disabilities. The portfolio committee can do the people with disabilities a favour and immediately place 4000 people with disabilities in government factories. They were custom made for people with disabilities after the war and they will give joy and hope to them.

I just hope that the portfolio committee will rise to the occasion. Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Deputy Speaker ...

*Setswana:*

... PAC e teng mo Ntlong. Ga ke itsi gore a le bone ba ka rata go bua.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I did call them, they didn’t respond. Ntate Nyontsho, are you okay?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Yes, Ntate, he’s alright.

*Setswana:*

Re ka feta.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ANC, please proceed.

Ms A S HLONGO: Deputy Speaker, the ANC supports this report. The Department of Women, Youth and Persons with Disabilities is to pay special attention to areas of concern that are noted by the Auditor-General for the 2019-20 financial year. As the ANC, we urge the department to critically examine areas of irregular expenditure, unauthorised expenditure, wasteful expenditure and fruitless expenditure. This is a growing concern in the department, as the department has incurred irregular, wasteful and fruitless expenditure.

The department should pay attention to compliance laws, regulations and procurement processes. We therefore urge the department to come up with effective solutions to curb the concerns raised by the Auditor-General, AG, report for 2019-20 financial year, and plead that the AG’s recommendations are out to be implemented effectively. Deputy Speaker, notwithstanding that the Department of Women, Youth and Persons with Disabilities along with its entities it’s a significant player of representing and advocating for the rights of persons with disabilities, youth, women and the members of Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Transgender,

Queer, Intersexed, Agender, Asexual, and Ally, LGBTQIA+, community.

The Commission of Gender Equality has done visible strides in promoting gender equality and have played a huge role in the fight towards gender-based violence, GBV, and femicide, through their community outreach programmes. The National Youth Development Agency, NYDA, is a critical structure in supporting and growing young entrepreneurs by providing the funding and providing young people with the relevant skills. Although there is a lot to be done to support women, youth and persons with disabilities, the department is a significant player in ensuring that the rights of the vulnerable are protected. The ANC supports this BRR Report.

Thank you. [Applause.]

Question put.

Motion agreed to (Economic Freedom Fighters, Freedom Front Plus, African Christian Democratic Party and Democratic Alliance dissenting).

Report accordingly adopted.

# CONSIDERATION OF REPORT OF STANDING COMMITTEE ON FINANCE ON DETERMINATION OF REMUNERATION OF MEMBERS OF FINANCIAL AND FISCAL COMMISSION

Mr M J MASWANGANYI: Thank you hon Deputy Speaker. A letter dated

26 March 2020 was received from the Office of the President, requesting the National Assembly to consider a draft notice determination of list of salaries and allowances of the members of the Financial and Fiscal Commission, FFC amongst others. The draft determination is made in terms of Section 9(1) of the Financial and Fiscal Commission Act, Act 99 of 1997 as amended. In terms of the Independent Commission for the Remuneration of Public Office Bearers Act of 1997 as amended by, the Determination Remuneration of Office Bearers of Independent Constitutional Institutions Laws Amendment Act of 2014.

On 8 April 2020, part of the draft notice from the President on the Determination of Salaries and Allowances of members of the FFC was referred to the committee for consideration and report.

Section 9(1) of the Financial and Fiscal Commission Act, Act 99 of 1997 provides that members of the FFC are entitled to such remuneration allowances and other benefits as determined by the President, taking into consideration the recommendation from the Independent Commission for the Remuneration of Public Office Bearers.

The determination by the President must be approved by the National Assembly. Furthermore, the commission must consult with the Minister of Finance, when investigating or considering the remuneration, allowances and other benefits of members of the FFC. Sub section six of the Independent Commission for the Remuneration of Public Office Bearers Act of 1997, requires that the commission take the following factors into account when making recommendations as it did in the report:

1. The salary allowance and benefits of members of other constitutional institutions.
2. Affordability in relation to the responsibilities of the constitutional institution concerned, and lastly
3. The level of expertise and experience required of a member of the constitutional institution concerned.

On 13 February 2020, a report of the commission was published in the *Government Gazzette*. As indicated in the draft notice, the commission recommended after considering relevant legislation and factors that must be taken into account the following:

Three percent adjustment to the remuneration of all categories of all public office bearers, earning above R1,5 million. Four percent of all categories earning less than R1,5 million. The determination applies retrospectively form 1 April 2019. The Standing Committee on Finance has approved the Determination of Remuneration of Members of the ... [Inaudible.] I move that the report be adopted. Thank you Deputy Speaker.

*Declarations of Vote:*

Ms E N NTLANGWINI: Deputy Speaker, the biggest talking point in the current Medium Term Budget Policy Statement besides the attempts by the Minister of Finance to smuggle his rejected Economic Policy Document is the Public Sector Wage Bill. We are told that the Public Sector Wage Bill is out of the trail and needs to be reviewed.

Mr S N SWART: Deputy Speaker, we are not on that item, point of order.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: What is your point of order hon member?

Mr S N SWART: It is not that item yet; that is the Medium Term Budget Policy. We are still on the remuneration issue Chair.

Ms E N NTLANGWINI: It is Chair. Can that person hold his horses? He should learn to listen.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, no, hon Ntlangwini just proceed. Just let him go.

Ms E N NTLANGWINI: He is being foolish. In his heads of argument in the Public Sector Wage Bill disputes filed at the Labour Appeals Court of South Africa, the Minister of Finance who is a member of Cabinet, a Cabinet chaired by the President, argued that, any increase in the Public Sector Wage Bill will collapse the country’s economy.

The President here want us here to agree to approve the increase a remuneration of the Chairperson Financial and Fiscal Commission by three percent. This increase will put his salary from R1,8 million

to R1,9 million, while in the same breath, we are telling public servants that they cannot get an increase.

We do not object to the proposed recommendation as the report was without exception adopted by the committee. However, we want to point out the hypocrisy of politicians who tell workers that they cannot get an increase when they do not have a problem of increasing salaries of political appointees.

As the EFF, we will still maintain that, instead of the audacity driven salary increase across the board for public servants, the four percent increase for all categories earning R1,5 million determined by the Independent Commission for the Remuneration of Public Office Bearers should be ...[Inaudible] ... across the public servants ...[Interjections] to root out [Time Expired.]

Hon MEMBER: Deputy Speaker, point of order, Deputy Speaker. There is a point of order in the House.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, hon Maotwe, I’m listening.

Ms O M C MAOTWE: I think that hon member disturbed hon Natasha, I think you calculated that time. I think you should give her another 40 seconds.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No! No! You forget about it.

Ms J TSHABALALA: Deputy Speaker, my apologies, there is a point of order in the House.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, what is the point of order?

Ms J TSHABALALA: It is hon Tshabalala in the House.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, go ahead hon member.

Ms J TSHABALALA: Deputy Speaker, I did not want to disturb the member who just spoke from the EFF, but the point of order is that; that member was out of order to call another Member of Parliament, to say to him he is foolish. That is unparliamentary and that member must withdraw Deputy Speaker. I think that is very important. The decorum of the House must always be upheld; it cannot be correct. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, that one is within ... [Inaudible.] Why am I being muted now? It is now FF Plus, no it is IFP.

Ms E N NTLANGWINI: On a point of order Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, what are you saying?

Ms E N NTLANGWINI: I think the ANC must induct these new members on the decorum of the House. Thank you very much Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, No, hon member, that is not a point of order. You are out of order now, IFP!

Mr E M BUTHELEZI: Hon Deputy Speaker, in considering the committee report and taking into considerations that were conducted and recommendations made in so far as work done is outstanding on statistic requirements. The Financial and Fiscal Commission, FFC, performed a very difficult work and guides Treasury. It fulfils a critical political mandate and need to ensure that despite the tough political climate it receives adequate financial support in order to fulfil its mandate and to help motivate workers to continue delivering excellence.

Hon Deputy Speaker, as the IFP rather we are satisfied with the determination made by the commission. The IFP support the committee report and support the commission’s conclusion that we increase the remuneration of the members of the FFC. Thank you very much.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. FF PLUS!

Mr X NGWEZI: Mr Lechesa Tsenoli.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, Sir.

Mr X NGWEZI: May I please address you. It is Mr Ngwezi.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Go ahead, Sir.

*IsiZulu*:

Mnu X NGWEZI: Cha! Mhlonishwa, uma kuzokhuluma amakhosi kufuneka kungabikho ngxabano. Isiphatha kabi lento njengeNkatha ukuthi uma kuzokhuluma inkosi kuqale kube nezingxabano.

USEKELA SOMLOMO: Hhayi! Hhayi! Hhayi! Musa ukudlala ngathi, Ngwezi. Musa ukudlala ngathi, lungu elihloniphekile. Usudlala ngathi manje.

*English*:

FF Plus, please proceed.

Mr W W WESSELS: Hon Deputy Speaker, we are in support of the report. Thank you.

Mr S N SWART: Deputy Speaker, we support the report. Thank you.

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Hon Deputy Speaker, the NFP welcomes the recommendations that the Standing Committee on Finance and support its submissions. Thank you.

Mr L M NTSHAYISA: Hon Deputy Speaker, we support the report.

Mr M NYHONTSO: Hon Deputy Speaker, we support the report.

Mr M G E HENDRICKS: Hon Deputy Speaker, Al Jama-ah supports the report.

Ms L N MJOBO: Hon Deputy Speaker, it is important that we adopt any report in the Standing Committee on Finance and in this House unanimously. Perhaps the remuneration of the members of the Financial and Fiscal Commission is not a political matter but, I also see it a s a fitting honour to the late Chairperson of the Commission, Prof Daniel Plaatjies.

Prof Plaatjies’s untimely death exactly one month and three weeks ago has robbed Parliament and the country of one of the brightest minds and most principled intellectuals who believed in the potential of South Africa to become a great country. How I wish we

all shared his desire to make South Africa a winning nation and beacon of democracy, prosperity, stability and peace.

The ANC believes that the FFC plays a critical role of making recommendations to Parliament and other organs of state on financial and fiscal matters in line with the Constitution of our national legislation.

In doing it, the commission often says things that we do not particularly want to hear as political parties and as government.

Recently, the FFC was very critical on the 2020 Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement, MTBPS, and the Second Adjustment Bill tabled by the Finance Minister. In particular, they criticised government for taking money from the budget to finance state-owned entities, SOEs. Their concerns centred around the sustainability of the recapitalisation needed by many of the entities almost every financial year. Together with the Parliamentary Budget Office, the FFC was called for more coherence in the country’s economic and fiscal policies as we recover from the COVID-19 pandemic. They argued that the fiscal credibility of the South African government is under threat due to inconsistencies and the ambiguities of the budget relatives to the economic and fiscal position taken by the government.

They also believe that the National Treasury should develop and execute a clear coherent and comprehensive microeconomic framework that is in line with the government’s Economic Reconstruction and Recovery Plan.

The ANC in its 2019 election manifesto said that South Africa needs decisive political and policy intervention tool, to radically transform and support the transformation of the economy to serve all the people. This intervention must be accompanied by the development of the appropriate microeconomic framework.

Owing to the fact that there are robust debates among economics on the microeconomic framework necessarily to support these commitments. The committee has endorsed the initiative that Parliament must have its own Indaba ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, I think you have gone beyond your two minutes.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto) Hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes hon member, I am listening.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): We are no longer on the Budget Review and Recommendations Reports, BRRR. The minutes for declarations return to normal. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Oh Sorry. Sorry. Alright. Yes, you are right.

Hon member, go ahead and complete your good story.

Ms L N MJOBO: Alright. Thank you, Deputy Speaker.

Owing to the fact that there are robust debates among economic amongst the microeconomic framework necessarily to support these commitments.

The committee has endorsed the initiative that Parliament, must have its own Indaba on the matter of the Fiscal and Monetary Policy that supports the industrialisation and creation of jobs. The FFC ... [Inaudible.] ... the National Treasury and other experts must help Parliament to prepare this national dialogue. In the words of the founder of the modern Chinese state Chairman, Mou Zedong he said and I quote, “Let a hundred flowers bloom: let a hundred schools of thought contend.”

We hope that through dialogue informed by scientific evidence we will be able to find common ground and consensus on fundamental policy matters that will take our country forward. The members of the Financial and Fiscal Commission are drawn from a diverse school of experts who give off their time to serve South Africa. It is therefore normally correct that they are remunerated fully for the work they do. However, as we all know the fiscal situation in our country is tight.

Therefore, in the view of the ANC the recommendations of the report must be adopted by the National Assembly as presented in the report. They include 3% adjustment to the remuneration of all categories of public office bearers earning above R1,5 million and 4% adjustment of all categories earning less than R1,5 million per annum. The ANC believes that these adjustments are fair and equitable under the prevailing economic circumstances. I thank you. [Applause.]

Report adopted and Determination of Remuneration of members of Financial and Fiscal Commission accordingly approved (Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

# CONSIDERATION OF REPORT OF STANDING COMMITTEE ON APPROPRIATIONS ON 2020 MEDIUM TERM BUDGET POLICY STATEMENT

*Afrikaans:*

Die HOOFSWEEP VAN DIE MEERDERHEIDSPARTY: Baie dankie, agb

Adjunkspeaker. Ek stem voor dat die verslag aanvaar word.

*English:*

There was no debate.

Motion agreed to (Economic Freedom Fighters, Democratic Alliance and African Christian Democratic Party dissenting)

Report accordingly adopted.

# CONSIDERATION OF REPORT OF STANDING COMMITTEE ON APPROPRIATIONS ON SECOND ADJUSTMENTS APPROPRIATION BILL

*Xitsonga:*

XIMOKONKULU XA VANDLA LERI FUMAKA: Mutshamaxitulu, ndzi susumeta:

Leswaku Xiviko lexi xi amukeriwa hi Yindlu.

*English:*

There was no debate.

Motion agreed to (Economic Freedom Fighters, Democratic Alliance and African Christian Democratic Party dissenting)

Report accordingly adopted.

# DEBATE ON 2020 MEDIUM TERM BUDGET POLICY STATEMENT

**FIRST READING DEBATE – SECOND ADJUSTMENTS APPROPRIATION BILL**

Mr N S BUTHELEZI: Hon Deputy Speaker, Ministers, Deputy Ministers, hon members, ladies and gentlemen. The ANC supports the Second Adjustments Appropriation Bill and the Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement. During the public participation, the committee was briefed by Unicef on Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement, MTBPS. They summarised our government’s intervention to deal with Covid-

19 and its impact as follows, I quote:

The country has responded with remarkable alacrity to the challenges of the pandemic and set aside substantial public funds to dress the immediate social, health and the economic consequences of the pandemic.

This shows beyond any doubt that the intervention by the ANC-led government to deal with this scourge is recognised even by the

United Nations body. We therefore, hope that those who have been down playing the massive intervention will be forced to eat the humble pie and just accept that the ANC has done extremely well in this regard. The mini budget has made provisions for the appropriations of additional R10,5 billion to SA Airways towards supporting the plan of the business rescue practitioners. We note that for years now, government has continued to inject capital to SA Airways without the desired results. Should this not tell us that the problem is not only money? A critical ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): ... IT!

Mr N S BUTHELEZI: A critical review ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): ... sorry, hon Buthelezi

... IT, please, remove ... yes, thank you! Please, check the screens on IT. Sorry, Deputy Speaker and hon Buthelezi.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: It’s Okay.

Mr N S BUTHELEZI: A critical review of various policies governing the environment within which the SA Airways operates must be done. Such a review will require the collaborations among the Department of Finance, the Department of Public Enterprises, Department of

Transport, the Department of Tourism and the Economic Development and Competition. Capital injection alone without the accompanying policy and strategy ... [Inaudible.] ... will not do the trick.

We have seen the significant increase in the number of airlines landing on the SA airports in the period leading to and after the 2010 Fifa World Cup including the Emirates. Just before the lockdown it was announced that the American airlines will run the direct flights to Cape Town, all this, at the expense of the SA Airways. South Africa is a signatory to the Yamoussoukro Declaration and supported the principle of open skies. However, South Africa has her own unique challenges. It has a developed aviation sector, and has to manage the transition towards the open skies responsibly, protect the huge asset base as well as protecting jobs within the industry. In other words, the SA interests must not be compromised, charity begins at home.

I have listened with keen interest to some of the opposition benches saying that the SA Airways should not be saved. We indicated that about R2,8 billion is meant to pay the workers. Please, come out loud and tell these workers that their lives do not matter because that is what you are saying. Tell the workers that the fact that for eight months they never received any pay is correct. These are people who have families to feed, bills to pay,

etc. Are you saying that this is okay? As the ANC we cannot be part of the conspiracy against workers. If I repeat, we as the ANC cannot be part to the conspiracy against workers. We cannot turn our backs against these workers especially in their hour of need.

*IsiZulu*:

Khohlwani!

English Shame!

*IsiZulu*:

Asizi!

*English*:

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member! hon Buthelezi, just for a moment, please. Is there someone asking ... who is speaking?

Mr G G HILL-LEWIS: Yes, I am asking if the member would take a question.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Buthelezi, would you take a question?

Mr N S BUTHELEZI: Hon Hill-Lewis, just wait when I have finished, I still have time, I will entertain your question.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Buthelezi, in future you must talk to me, not to hon Hill-Lewis.

Mr N S BUTHELEZI: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker, I will do so.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ... [Laughter.]

Mr N S BUTHELEZI: What you must also tell the people of South Africa is that your friends are the ones who will buy SA assets. They won’t be paying markets price. These assets would be sold at auctions and would be bought to next to nothing.

*IsiZulu*:

Sinibhekile niconsa amathe. Nilindele ukuyicosha phansi impahla ka-SAA. Nazi kahle kamhlophe ukuthi uma sekudayiswa u-SAA ngeke

athengwe uMhlongo noma u-Mokoena kodwa kulindwe o-Botha no-Viljoen no-Mrs Smith no-Mrs Cree.

*English*:

That is reality of our country. Apartheid dividend continues raiding these assets. Let us not allow the greedy to feed on the

carcasses of our state-owned enterprises, SOEs. We are then calling on the members of the executive to ensure that the recapitalisation of SA Airways benefits its entire people. Hon members, it is easier to save a business than to start a new one. That is not brain surgery. It is easier to save jobs than to start new ones. That is not rocket science. Let us do everything to save the jobs.

The South African Broadcasting Corporation, SABC, jobs should be saved too. We also urge Sun International and all those who are trigger happy to reconsider the curling of jobs especially now. During the public hearings Cosatu bemoaned the inability of the banks to disperse R20 billion credit guarantee scheme, while companies are closing down. We agree with Cosatu we cannot understand why after about five months since the announcement of the scheme by the President, less than 10% has been dispersed.

Hon Minister, we have asked here that can you also consider using other outlets to assist the banks. You know that money in the bank volts is anathema to the enterprise resource planning, ERP. The money in the banks will not create jobs. In an economic parlance the velocity of that money must be increased. We suggested that consider using DFIs both nationally and provincially. You can also

consider ring fencing this money with its conditions if it is to be made available to the Development Finance Institutions, DFIs.

The state-owned entities are critical to the development agenda of our country and the attainment of the national development plan, NDP, goal. For instance; state-owned enterprises contribute

R220 billion adding the palliative multiplying impacts number grow exponentially. The state-owned enterprises have over the years played a big developmental role even under the apartheid government, although that was preserved for the minority. I want someone who can argue with a straight face that if Eskom was in private hands, it would still be possible to electrify more that 80% of households up from the less than 50% before 1994.

State-owned enterprises are critical for the attainment of the objective of the economic reconstruction and recovery plan.

However, hon members, let us correct what must be corrected, let us not dance to the music that want us to throw the baby out with bath water. When the President tabled the enterprise resource planning, ERP, one of the objectives of the plan was to create jobs primarily through the aggressive infrastructure investment and mass employment programmes. The Bill is making this possible. In pursuance of this objective, R7 billion is being availed to the

presidential employment intervention. R13,4 billion has been given to other departments as the presidential employment intervention.

We know that many of our people are out of jobs, especially the young people. We are, therefore, walking the talk. The National Treasury is getting about R7,5 billion, this is R500 million for direct food relief and R7 billion for the education employment initiative. These interventions are widening the safety net. The difference with this safety net especially around the presidential employment intervention is that; we want our people to participate in helping our country to get out of this economic impasse, hence employment opportunities are being created and funded. These interventions have a huge financial impact on the fiscal position of our country.

The economy is shrinking, revenue is declining, expenditure is increasing, and debt is exploding. The consolidated expenditure for the next three years rises from R1,99 trillion to

R2,139 trillion. All the economic indicators and ratios are going to the wrong direction. The ERP seeks to correct these. We are on the knife edge but as the ANC we have never run away from fiscal challenges. We confront them head on and we succeed.

As you know, the apartheid devil left us with twin devils of all round underdevelopment and huge debt. A debt which was incurred buying guns to kill the children in Soweto, KwaLanga, Mdantsane, KwaMashu and many other places which had been turned to war zones against black people. A debt incurred to kill sleeping children in Umtata, Maseru, Gaborone, Lusaka and Maputo. A debt incurred to preserve racism and white supremacy. This is the difference, the debt that we are incurring now, hon members, is the debt to save lives and livelihoods, not to destroy them, irrespective of race creed or gender.

We conquered then and we shall conquer now. A worrying factor has been the consistent decline in gross fix capital formation only turning around in 2022. The gross fix capital formation, GFCF, is a critical determinant of GDP growth also business confidence it is an important determinant of investment. Unfortunately, business confidence has been consistently very low. Business is quick to point fingers and refer to so-called inflexible labour laws, whatever that means. It points at governance failure to do this or that.

They should stop behaving like prefects by ticking what others are doing. They also need to critically look at themselves and deal with the following: first, who will invest in companies whose

financial statements cannot be relied on. Big companies like Steinhoff and Tongaat Hullets cook their books with collusion of auditors, defrauding unsuspected investors billions of rands, Euros and Pounds; and which investor will invest in companies that make a reckless investment like Sasol investing in adventurous projects in the Lake Charles chemical projects in the US while in the process share holders are loosing about R200 billion.

*IsiZulu*:

Mina ngifuna ukwazi ukuthi, babeyofunani e-Melika nemali yabasebenzi.

*English*:

The Public Investment Corporation, PIC, and Industrial Development Corporation**,** IDC, are big investors of Sasol. Hon members, who will invest in a company where even auditing companies cannot be trusted? They issue reports today, tomorrow they withdraw them. I am citing these examples to show that all social partners must put the shoulder to the wheel to get our economy back to growth trajectory and avoid debt crisis. Let no one be an armchair critic. Let us all work and defeat hunger, poverty and joblessness that have been accentuated by Covid-19 pandemic.

Let me close by wishing members of the Standing Committee on Appropriation; members of this House and the NCOP, our support staff, Minister Mboweni and Deputy Minister Masondo, Ministers and Deputy Ministers, team Treasury, Financial and Fiscal Commission, FFC, and public benefit organisation, PBO, a very safe and restful festive season and a happy new year. Lastly, allow me to thank my wife; Thandeka, my ailing mom, sister Thabi Mambatha and my family for being my reliable corner throughout the years. I thank you. I am giving my one and half minutes to hon Peters. Thank you. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: House Chair, we will invite the DA. I would request you to help me. I have a technical difficulty that will arise in the next three minutes. So, I do not want to disrupt the proceedings. Can you, please, take over the debate?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Uh, okay. For the coming speaker ... and you have been sent the speakers list hon ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ... I am requesting you to take over the debate ... uh ... hon House Chairperson, if you don’t mind. I will be having a little problem here which I can’t solve immediately.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Okay, alright.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much.

Mr J N DE VILLIERS: Thank you House Chair, the hardship endured as a result of the lockdown, a 50% quarter on quarter gross domestic product, GDP contraction, 43% unemployment rate in the third quarter including scourge jobseekers and tens of thousands of businesses, having gone bankrupt or shutting down. This tells a story of increased misery and an increased hardship, in a country that was already in a dire state before the pandemic.

Let us not forget the state of the COVID-19, rampant unemployment, rampant crime, rampant corruption, out of control government debt and an endless bailouts of state-owned entities, SOEs. Before the lockdown, we also had endless promises of economic reforms that never appeared, leading to downgrade and junk status and even higher debt servicing costs.

After the lockdown crisis, we have seen nothing but an acceleration in the decline of South Africa. The same antimisery multiplied at scale. We still have rampant corruption, except this time the theft was happening when people were locked down, and the relief they needed has been taken by the corrupt and the greedy.

We have government debt rates that will now burden multiple generations of South Africans. With the cost of paying for the corruption process of the ANC, we have new promises of economic reform, including the SA Economic Reconstruction and Recovery Plan which has inspired so little confidence, that South Africa has been cut even further into junk status.

We still have endless SOE bailouts including R10 billion for SA Airways, SAA. What makes these bailouts so outrageous is that, the government is willing to blow this money on a failing airline, but as the country found out yesterday, there was no payment made to secure access to a COVID-19 vaccine. The one chance we had of getting out of this pandemic, the ANC blew it at the first hurdle because they are too busy looting the SOEs than saving South Africa from the pandemic, and from the economic meltdown.

The general malaise and mismanagement, compounds a very simple fact, South Africa can only be saved by a real and meaningful reforms. Our debt to GDP ratio will soon exceed 80% and the hard choices that the ANC is refusing to make, will force even more sacrifice and hardship onto the South African people.

Will you continue to choose the demands of your union boss allies over the real needs of workers? Will you choose the endless thirst

of your core corrupt cadres and tenderpreneurs over legitimate small businesses? Will you continue to choose failing SOEs over infrastructure investment? And, the most fundamental question is, will you continue to choose misery over growth?

The enemies of growth had a champion for far too long. It is time that growth, job creation, business creation, poverty alleviating growth has a champion. It is not too late to change course. We implore the Minister and the President to choose the path of growth. Thank you House Chair. [Applause]

Ms O M C MAOTWE: Thank you very much House Chair. House Chair, a Medium Term Budget Policy Statement is presented in October and in November each year, and is meant to set out a policy framework for the main budget that will be presented in February, update National Treasury’s economic project, adjust the budget of government departments and also make changes to spending.

An overwhelming majority from our people from all sectors rejected Mr Mboweni’s Medium Term Budget Policy Statement and all its mumbo jumbos. Even Fitch and Moody’s downgrade of South Africa’s long term foreign currency debt ratings to junk status, is because of the National Treasury and Finance Minister’s shared incompetence to manage economic policy.

This is Treasury’s economic paper prepared by the world bank and International Monetary Fund, IMF with the American riding economies that wanted to privatise water, rail, energy, sanitation and basic services that were rejected by everyone, including government. Chair, it is extremely concerning that we invite the public, trade unions, activists, communities, researchers and practitioners who spend their time and resources to contribute to the process of revised and proposed fiscal framework, and their input was disregarded by Parliament.

There is no basis to reduce transfers to local government by R200 billion, when we have consistently argued that local government is underfunded, unable to raise its revenue and needs to deliver water, sanitation, road, housing and other critical services to our people. Chair, there is no basis to reduce conditions grants by R12,1 billion when they were put in place in the first place, when such services were neglected by different spheres of government.

There is no basis to reduce salaries budget by R310 billion from now and in the medium term, when we have an incapable state that depends entirely on the private sector to deliver even the most basic services. There is absolutely no need. Chair, there is no basis to reduce the provincial equitable share which funds most of

the health services, when we are in the middle of a pandemic and the public healthcare service have collapsed in the country.

There is no basis to reduce police spending by R5 billion when we are failing to deal with gender-based violence as a country.

Police stations without gender-based violence victims’ friendly rules and police officers who do not have cars. There is no basis to reduce spending in higher education and training by

R1,6 billion when hundreds of ...[Interjections.]

Hon MEMBER: House chair, House Chair!

Ms O M C MAOTWE: There is no basis to reduce spending in higher education and training by R1,6 billion when hundreds of students in higher education institutions are studying on empty stomach.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Borotho): Hon Maotwe. Hon Maotwe, just a bit. There is someone on his feet in the House. Yes, hon Tshabalala.

Ms J TSHABALALA: Hon House Chair, can the member who is being foolish take a question?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Borotho): Hon member you can’t say that. Hon member, you can’t say that.

Ms J TSHABALALA: Ok.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Borotho): Withdraw before you ask what you want to ask.

Ms J TSHABALALA: House Chair, I humbly withdraw. However, I request for the last Hansard to be checked and come to the House with same ruling because the member of the EFF did that, I called for order. Thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Borotho): Hon member we will deal with that. What is your point of order?

Ms J TSHABALALA: Can she take a question please?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Borotho): Hon Maotwe, are you ready to take a question?

Ms O M C MAOTWE: She is going to waste my time, I don’t have time

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Borotho): Thank you, continue.

Ms O M C MAOTWE: Thank you House Chair. There is no basis to reduce spending in higher education and training by R1,6 billion, but hundreds of students in institutions of higher learning are studying on empty stomach, sleeping in bathrooms and are excluded because of fees.

Parliament should reject the Medium Term Budget Policy Statement and Adjusted Appropriation Bill. We should not adopt a Medium Term Budget Policy Statement flooded with riding analytical foolishness with disguised as sense and reason. This is an unashamedly attack on the workers and the poor in the interest of profit, the advancement of private interest and the foreign handles in Goldman Sachs, Moody’s, Fitch, Standard & Poor's, S&P and the International Monetary Fund, IMF.

House Chair, even in the absence of functioning Parliament Parliamentary Budget Office, as members of the National Assembly, we should be decisive to reject Mr Mboweni’s directionless Budget Policy Statement. Workers, activists and people as a whole should not just stand and watch as the onslaught on worker’s income and basic services that the majority of our people depend on continue.

We need a solid proposal on how to manage the debt without collapsing the economy. We need a solid and concrete plan on how

SA Revenue Service, Sars could collect more taxes from e-commerce, curb illicit financial flows, improve the administrative efficiencies the and stop the incompetence. We need concrete plans on how we are going to use the fiscal policy to revive the economy, localised and government leverage on government procurement spending to boost the localisation.

House Chair, we do not need privatisation of Eskom, through the battle of power purchasing agreement and independent power producers. Access to affordable energy and energy security is a human right to be made available to all.

Lastly House Chair, we need to take serious note of the National Treasury and the interest that they serve. The revolving door between the National Treasury, central bank, IMF, World Bank, local and international banks, they have positioned the National Treasury’s as a central and integral part of recognition of South Africa’s economy. We must all start asking serious questions regarding the National Treasury’s conduct, their failure to look at alternatives engaging broadly. They come here with the attitude of, let’s just go and get on with it. It is troubling and must not be treated lightly.

House Chair, we will start correcting the conduct with Treasury and take the country forward as the EFF, like we are going to start by nationalising the Reserve Bank through Private Members Bill, which we have already tabled before this Parliament. We urge all South Africans to rally behind the Bill, so that we correct all the ills of the past. I thank you House Chair.

Inkosi E M BUTHELEZI: Thank you very much, House Chairperson. I repeat what I said previously in this House. Let us not use the COVID-19 pandemic as a scapegoat for the lack of funding, delivery and ... [Inaudible] ... to get our country out of economic misery. It’s one among many challenges that our country is facing. The IFP hopes that the government will ensure that these monies are appropriated and ... [Inaudible.] ... does exactly what it is intended for.

We support the measures outlined in the reconstruction and recovery plan in so far as ... [Inaudible.] ... social reforms that are necessary for the promotion of faster, inclusive growth, provision for skills acquisition and education, and more importantly, sustainable employment opportunities for South Africa.

Hon Chair ... [Inaudible.] ... we see budget cuts for very critical departments. How can we reduce funds for the department of ... [Inaudible.] ... education while ... [Inaudible.] [Interjections.]

*IsiZulu:*

USIHLALO WENDLU (Nk M G Boroto): Ima kancane Nkosi ... [Ubuwelewele.] Sibusiso? Ubani? uGumede noma ubani ...

*Afrikaans:*

Asseblief! Asseblief!

*IsiZulu:*

Siyacela, vala. Asifuni ukuzwa ukuthi kuthiwani. Siyaxolisa, Nkosi uButhelezi, ungaqhubeka. [Ubuwelewele.]

*English:*

Thank you, Chair. The IFP supports the ... [Inaudible.] ... plans in the reconstruction and recovery plan in so far as ... [Inaudible.] ... social reforms that are necessary for the promotion of faster inclusive growth, provision for skills acquisition and education, and most importantly, sustainable employment for South Africa.

It is unfortunate that the budgets for key departments would be cut. How can we reduce funds for the department of education while

... [Inaudible.] ... revive our economy when we can’t teach, develop and upskill our people?

Similarly, local government will suffer the same. This is the closet government to the people and they provide the most fundamental services such as access to clean water. They will no longer be able to do so with the reduction in Budget. This means that government is literally taking money from the hands of the people who need to benefit the most.

As the IFP, we encourage diligence in this time from Parliament as there is a high need to exercise oversight concerning expenditure. The adjustments demand more responsible spending and commitment to better service provision. Oversight mechanisms should look beyond finances and ensure that performance is measured against the target and the actual service that has been rendered.

We cannot applaud 100% budget spending but the final projects are 50% in quality and delivery. People must see the correlation between spending and quality service delivery ... [Inaudible.] Bang for the buck, as the expression goes.

We are in a time of economic despair. We can’t continue to reward poorly performing and corrupt entities such as state-owned entities, SOEs. I was happy that the chairperson of the committee, hon Buthelezi, mentioned that the problems of these SOEs are nonfinancial and therefore we cannot continue to throw in financial solutions on nonfinancial, what you call, problems. We need to do more with the little that we ... [Inaudible.]. As the IFP, we support the report. We support ...

*IsiZulu*:

... uShenge, into yakwethu.

*English:*

Thank you very much.

*IsiZulu*:

USIHLALO WENDLU (Nk M G Boroto): Sithokoze, Mhlonishwa.

Inkosi R N CEBEKHULU: Shenge! Sokwalisa!

USIHLALO WENDLU (Nk M G Boroto): Angizwa, baba uCebekhulu?

Inkosi R N CEBEKHULU: Ndabezitha!

USIHLALO WENDLU (Nk M G Boroto): Bba uCebekhulu? Oho! Hhayi, baba uCebekhulu, ungabe sayicindezela into leyo, uyiyeke kanjalo.

Ngizokubiza uma ngifuna ukuthi ucindezele. [Ubuwelewele.]

Inkosi R N CEBEKHULU: Basakhululekelana abaseNdlunkulu.

USIHLALO WENDLU (Nk M G Boroto): Baba uNgwezi, nguwe oqala lomcimbi engithi? Sizakukhipha kule nkundla. [Ubuwelewele.] Mhlonishwa u-Wessels?

Mr W W WESSELS: Hon House Chair, it is astounding that the ANC, which is the ruling party, is so content with this Appropriation Bill; that they are so excited about this Budget Policy Statement; and that they are clapping hands and are excited about a complete failed government, a completely failed Budget and a crisis that the country is in. It is astounding, and I wonder if the millions of South Africans out there who are unemployed, who are suffering and are living in dire circumstances due to failed municipalities, are also so content and excited.

It doesn’t help to clap your hands and to wish that the problems disappear. If you were a responsible government, you would’ve admitted to the problems. You say that you won’t fail the workers of SA Airways, SAA. Hon Buthelezi, you repeated that statement

which you made the other day in the previous debate as well. However, it’s your government that failed the workers of SAA for

26 years. Hon Buthelezi, you are correct that it is the greedy that fed off SAA, but the greedy are people like Dudu Myeni; your cadres. Those are the greedy that you appointed. It’s your government that created a situation of corruption; a situation of cadre deployment; a situation of mismanagement. Hon Buthelezi, then you come here and say you are walking the talk. Yes, you are. You are walking the talk of failure. You are walking the talk of failing the people of South Africa; of self-enrichment. South Africa has never had a Budget that contains costs. You have lived in luxury. Your Ministers have lived in luxury while you have failed South Africa but then you come here and you scapegoat. You blame the past and use rhetoric like white supremacy. No, it has gotten old. That is not the reasons for the failures. For 26 years you have stolen. You have stolen the money of the people. You have failed the people of South Africa. It has nothing to do with the past.

Live in the present. It’s not the past’s fault that this Appropriation Bill takes away more than R5 billion from Police, whilst crime is a pandemic in South Africa, and then gives

R6,8 billion to Public Enterprises. Explain that to the people of South Africa. You take away R245 million from municipal

infrastructure whilst water is being polluted and whilst people are ... [Inaudible.]

Mr Z MLENZANA: House Chairperson?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon Wessels? Yes, hon Mlenzana? What can I do for you?

Mr Z MLENZANA: I just want to check if the hon member is ready to take my question. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon members, there is heckling ... but no drowning out of a member at the podium, please. Hon Wessels, would you like to take a question?

Mr W W WESSELS: No, Chairperson.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Thank you. Continue.

Mr W W WESSELS: You take away R376 million from Health but you give R555 million to Sport. This Budget is full of the wrong priorities and that is the bottom line. To be excited about it and to be content is really astounding. It is a shame! It really is a shame!

*Afrikaans*:

Die agb lid verwys na die Vrystaat. Wie het die Vrystaat in die grond in bestuur? U Sekretaris-generaal, Ace Magashule, wat sy sakke vol geld geprop het en gesteel het. Gaan kyk wat oor Estina getuig is. Kyk wat het met Vrede-suiwel gebeur, terwyl u sê u stel belang in ... [Tussenwerpsels.]

*English:*

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Order!

*Afrikaans:*

Mnr W W WESSELS: ... landelike ontwikkeling. Terwyl u sê u stel belang om vir mense grond te gee, steel u Sekretaris-generaal en gee die geld vir die Guptas om by Sun City te trou. Dit is onaanvaarbaar en u moet skaam wees! Elkeen van u moet skaam wees! [Tyd verstreke.] [Tussenwerpsels.]

*English:*

Hon Chairperson?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Yes, hon Wessels?

Mr W W WESSELS: Although words do not hurt me at all, there are Rules in this House. Is it parliamentary for an hon member to call me an ostrich?

*Afrikaans:*

Die HUISVOORSITTER (Me M G Boroto): Wie het so gese?

*English:*

Hon members, who is that? [Interjections.] Okay. Hon members, can we proceed?

*Afrikaans:*

Nee! Nee!

Mr S N SWART: House Chair, I suppose as long as this is not a foolish ostrich. [Laughter.]

The tabling of the 2020 Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement, MTBPS, was preceded by government’s adoption of the economic recovery plan; and this plan was agreed upon by business, labour, government, civil societies.

However, the plan sadly received emphatic thumbs down from ratings agencies, with both Moody’s and Fitch downgrading the country

deeper into junk status. And this is indeed painful, to use the words of the hon Minister of Finance, and will undoubtedly come at high cost.

If it results in a higher cost of borrowing, government will have to cut social spending or raise taxes and this will clearly be unpalatable.

The ACDP trusts that these downgrades will be a wake up call to all of us; and National Treasury has been warning about the fiscal risks. These downgrades must serve to galvanise the country into taking urgent action.

And the question can rightly be asked “Why has the money run out?”

Well, more 2,2 million South Africans have lost their jobs during one of the world’s longest and hardest lockdowns, thousands of businesses have closed, that has impacted revenue collection.

There should be an outrage about this. Bailouts and corruption and state capture to this situation.

It is clear that the country’s deep challenges are not been dealt with at the requisite speed. Many in government, we would submit,

fail to appreciate the fully negative impact of business sentiment of these downgrades.

National Treasury is aware and has pointed it out in the medium- term statement where the following risks are highlighted: uncertainty about the speed of economic recovery including the medium-term effect of the hard lockdown; implementation risks, that is what the ratings agencies have highlighted, particularly relating to the wage bill and additional spending pressures from the state-owned companies, SOCs.

This very appropriations committee earlier on the DOHA amendments expressed very strong views on the R1,3 billion reduction in provincial conditional grants to provide the SA Airways, SAA, business rescue plan.

Let’s just remind ourselves what the committee said; it said it sends the wrong message to South Africans, taxpayers in particular, that all costs for business rescue funding will be funded through uniform budget cuts across government programmes. And it’s repeated in this report as well, where the committee agrees that the reduction in health expenditure is unacceptable. The committee went further when the municipal deduction was also

made; it said it is incomprehensible, why this was done to fund an SAA business rescue plan.

And so, Chair, there are some major concerns with this Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement and regrettably the ACDP will not support it. I thank you.

Mr S N AUGUST: Hon Chair, the South Africa’s economy was growing in the late 90s and 2000s. Government squandered the opportunity to use the money wisely to narrow the gap between privilege and poverty; to ensure that no South African should live in the mud without dignity or to go to bed without food in their stomachs.

The covid pandemic of 2020 struck us at just about the weakest point. With the economy already humbled by the ratings agency and on its knees, millions more jobs lost, millions of parents struggling to feed their families, the only thing showing any sings of growth is the poverty gap. It is in this context of crisis that we need to debate policy budget today.

Our people have lost faith in government, they have lost faith in justice, they have lost faith in Eskom and they don’t believe SAA will stop hem gearing money.

It is our greatest task to restore their faith and to rebuild trust despite the little we have to procure building materials. If we are going to restore citizens’ faith and our self-believe as a country it has to begin here today. Either we sink further into the quicksand or we fight our way out with the new recipe of pragmatic policy, professional project management and implementation, and wise administration.

Good has maintained since its formation that the time for talking is over and that government must start implementing its plans. The virus has not changed this view.

In short, we believe that all budget adjustments aimed at improving service affecting the daily lives of citizens are good. We must prioritise helping the poorest and most vulnerable citizens, introducing good quality healthcare and quality education for all including disabled and rural citizens, developing a crime-fighting force that does its job supported by integrated social and community support systems, and most of all, job initiatives. Integrity doesn’t cost money, it’s real wealth must begin. Thank you, Chair.

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: House Chairperson, the NFP supports the report of the Standing Committee on Appropriations.

Let me start off by reminding hon Wessels that what you’re saying is not entirely true and let me correct you. What you not telling South Africans is this, that when South Africa [Inaudible.] in the new dispensation inherited a bankrupt state. The previous regime left South Africa in the bankrupt state which meant that current government had two choices, either we pay debt and a high interest rate at the time or we address the needs of the people. The apartheid regime left a huge backlog when it came to providing the quality services to the people in this country. What the current government chose to do is, first of all, to pay off the debt and that’s why the debt had come down in that very short space of time; but at the expense of that they did not build the power stations and things, which was already anticipated that, that state was going to become a problem many years later, because they had to pay off those debts.

If you talk about corruption, yes, indeed it is here; it started then. The evergreen contracts of Eskom and SA Airways and the SAA problems started long before 1994 and continued to the new dispensation. Now, let us not forget about old these things.

So, what the current government blindly accepted was a country that needed a lot of attention with limited resources and high expectations from the people; and that’s what actually happened.

So, under the circumstances, you know, you can’t expect too much too soon. With the vast size of this country, what government is trying to do is address the needs of the people from the length and breadth of this country, which the previous apartheid failed to do; let us be honest, it took away the dignity of our people.

Now, when hon Buthelezi talks about charity beginning at home, he’s correct. You want SA Airways, which of you if you had your own business will go and support the opposition; it doesn’t make sense, on all of us here will want to fly opposition but not fly with your same SA Airways; give more airline routes to the opposition, allow more airlines to come in; and you expecting SA Airways to survive. [Applause.] Clearly, it cannot survive. I’m not saying there are no challenges there, yes, indeed there is a problem of management. But I think we need to be honest that not everything is as a result of the failure of the current government; but you were receiving a country that you had to deal with the challenges that were enormous.

So, what we should be doing is coming together and finding solutions. What we are doing here is looking for ... scoring points [Time expired.] [Applause.]

Mr O M MATHAFA: Hon House Chair, on the 15th of October 2020 the Commander in Chief of the South African National Defence Force, President Cyril Matamela Ramaphosa when presenting the economic reconstruction plan as in intervention to the hardship cost to the country’s economy and its citizens and the following to say:

“As even the darkest of clouds have a silver lining. We need to see this moment as a rapture with the past and an opportunity to drive fundamental and lasting change”.

House Chair this is the prism through which as the ANC we have looked at 2020 Medium Term Budget Policy Statement, MTBPS and the 2020 Division of Revenue Second Adjustment Bill. We deliberately moved away from the argument by some who record as only dealing with budget cuts, the rescuing of South African Airways, SAA and nothing else. We chose to rather appreciate the silver linings in the MTBPS and second adjustments.

There’s no question that the arrival of Covid-19 presented more economic misfortunes to the country as well as serious threats to the livelihood of the majority of South Africans.

Now, to EFF, this is the basis for the adjustments so it is not correct to say that there are no basis for the adjustments that

are being made on this particular amendment Bill. As a response to this reality, the MTBPS proposed programmes aimed at income protection and social welfare with a view of mitigating effects of jobs losses and increasing poverty.

One of the silver linings Madam Chair is the additional

R6,6 billion allocation to the Department of Social Development to extend the R350 social Covid-19 social relief of distress grant which is expected to reach six million South Africans for a better three months until 31 January 2021.

In addition, R1 billion is allocated for vulnerable households. This allocation represents R500 million for direct food relief and R5,88 728 million to sustain social workers and early childhood development workers as well as for the employment and community development practitioners and unemployment youth.

This intervention is part of the 12% plus increase or more than

25 billion additional allocation to the 2020/21 budget baseline allocation to the Department of Social Development, moving the total main allocation from R198 billion to more than R223 billion in the first adjustment followed by a proposed R978 billion over the 2021 medium term expenditure framework.

Madam Chair, I think hon Shaik did justice to respond to hon Wessels. For some stage I’ll be forgiven to think that Eugene Terreblanche is back and is a member of this House. But, to deny the fact that hon Shaik has put forth is indeed a protection and defence of white supremacy as we see unfolding in front of our very eyes.

House Chairperson, safety nets are also provided for within the Second Amendment Bill. Pupils in government learning institutions and the most vulnerable members of our society are beneficiaries from these allocations. The first is the provincial allocation of R243 million for learners with profound intellectual disabilities allocated in the original budget experiencing a zero reduction.

The second is the national school nutrition programme with an allocation R7 billion also experiencing no downward adjustment. This interventions hon members are squarely in congruence with the call of defining a bigger basket of social security benefits and to make this easier to access while addressing the exclusion of orphans, children, people with disabilities and the aged in rural areas and farms as contained in the ANC 2019 manifesto. More proof that the ANC led government is a caring government.

As the ANC, we further welcome the increase in the provincial allocation for early childhood development in the social development. This allocation sees an increase of R496 million taking it to the total R1,411 billion. The above development shows that it is not correct for the opposition to claim that all the cards are geared up solely for the rescuing of SAA and its rescue plan.

Another misinformation that the opposition is that Bill is moving away from the President’s pronouncements as contained in the South African economic reconstruction and recovery plan. Facts are that one of the four key priority interventions of the SA Economic Reconstruction and Recovery Plan, SAERRP is infrastructure investment. In this regard, the Bill keeps the provincial allocation for the public works infrastructure grant at the original allocation of R834 million. Furthermore, the basic education school infrastructure backlog grant under the indirect conditional grants receives an additional R679 million of which R540 million in the first and second adjustments respectively, thereby taking the total to R1,734 billion to R2,415 billion.

In conclusion the ANC welcomes the submission received during public processes. One submission is a letter from Mr Chipane Selwane representing various youth formations in Centurion in the

Gauteng province. They take issues with the high vacancy rate in the public sector. Mr Selwane and other youth job seekers can take comfort in the fact that the Bill makes provision and efforts by proposing zero allocation and cuts to the Expanded Public Works Programme, EPWP allocations to provinces and local government at R421 million and R781 million respectively as per the original budget.

The social sector expanded public works programme allocation remains at R414 million also with no downward adjustment. We also agree with the submission of Mr Selwane that more effort is required in the public sector to reduce the number of funded vacant posts with the youth prioritised when filling these particular vacancies.

House Chair, the employment stimulus is also supported by an additional R7 billion to the equitable share baseline as part of the R12,6 billion proposed allocation for the presidential employment interventions to address unemployment especially as it affects the youth.

It is therefore our submission that the Bill before us is responsive to the difficult conditions presented by Covid-19 that it also provides much needed relief to those who are affected by

effects of unemployment and poverty and is line with the ANC manifesto commitments and most importantly Chair, it is very much aligned to the President’s commitment to guiding the country into a path of inclusive and sustainable economic recovery as per directive of the President of the Republic.

As the ANC we the support the report before us. If I still have any time Chair, I donate this time to hon Dipuo Peters. Thank you very much for the opportunity Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Unfortunately your screen is red, no more minutes left. Hon Ntshayisa.

Mr L M NTSHAYISA: Thank you very much hon Chairperson. Three minutes is just like saying good morning and then go home. The Medium Term Policy Budget is meant to ...

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: We cannot hear House Chair. We can’t hear. Sorry. We can’t hear.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Continue.

Mr L M NTSHAYISA: The Medium Term Policy Budget is meant to bring the economic reduction ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): What is happening? Hon Mcola, can you assist us, what is happening?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: House Chair we can’t hear you. House Chair we can’t hear you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Okay. Hon members. IT we are disconnected from the virtual platform, are you assisting? Continue hon Ntshayisa.

Mr L M NTSHAYISA: Thank you very much hon Chair. This Medium Term Policy Budget is meant to bring the economic recovery and consolidate the fiscal framework. The budget deficits can only be narrowed by the reductions in the Wage Bill. The Wage Bill which is the bone of contention between the unions and the treasury.

It’s very much unfortunate.

To assist the growing of our economy, the Covid-19 must be contained so this means now the people have got to follow all the protocols so that we all contain or fight against the Covid-19 because it’s sort of a disturbance to our economy.

Due to Civid-19, the South African GDP will only grow by 2.1% on the average. The second wave of Covid-19 infections has in the

case of Nelson Mandela is a great threat to both lives and the growing of our economy. Covid-19 challenges as a result, a lot has been paid to more than 10 million beneficiaries and more people now lost their jobs.

The economic recovery has been assisted by the working with the business social partners, the labour and civil society as the President did suggest. The keeping and working together during these difficult times will really assist the growth of our economy. Chairperson, the building of infrastructure and the expansion of electricity generation will help the economic recovery in a short term. It is therefore expected that the economy can be raised to over 3% over a period of ten years and one million jobs would be created.

This may sound not assisting but the economic growth means a lot in terms of growth of the economy would have been done. The resort is known as operation vulindlela in permeation unit that will be manned by the full time people with expertise and capacity.

Chairperson it is a great concern to note that the state owned companies and municipalities are struggling to pay salaries to their employees due to Covid-19 and due to the fact that they can’t raise their own revenue. The government aims at having

reductions on the conversations and the other non interest spending items not to pay. Chairperson this can be something that is unfortunate but it is for the purpose of increasing or growing the economy of our country. Thank you very much

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon members allow me to suspend the proceedings for lunch. I know that we are behind schedule, we should have gone out at 1 o’clock but we really have to return at 14:00, we can’t change that. So, bear with us and when we return we will proceed with the debate starting COPE and then we finish and proceed to the other Orders. We should be back by 14:00, pardon us but it’s business unusual and we have to act that way. Thank you very much hon members.

BUSINESS SUSPENDED AT 13:12 AND RESUMED AT 14:02.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Thank you. You may be seated. Hon members, thank you for your understanding. We proceed with the work of today as we call on the hon Hendricks of Al Jama- Ah to proceed

Mr M G E HENDRICKS: Hon Chair, it is nice to be first and not always last. [Laughter.] Hon Chair, division of powers and provision of budget from national government to provincial

government including provincial grants is a concerned that we have especially if Ministers and the Minister of Education delegate this powers when the powers is used to promote all apartheid tricks to harm sometimes school committees.

Hon Chair, what is very concerning is that the Western Cape Education Department under the Western Cape Provincial government is using the old apartheid dirty tricks to destroy the good character of a much respected school Principal Mr Neumann has decision to black and eyes with sometime ago and we have lost two of the greatest educationist in our community especially at the Cape Flats. In this fight it has come to light that the Western Cape Education Department official has approached an educator at Heathfield High School to force to testify against the principal in exchange for his employment contract to be extended for 2021. This is an act of corruption and defeating the ends of justice and bribery. The principal and a delegation which includes two deputies on the school, two school governing body members and four learners laid criminal charges against the Western Cape Education Department official and we have the case number.

Ms Shreuder’s, the head of education has condemned his officials has been subjected to the investigation. We are concerned the school had been trend institution and the Western Cape is wasting

much needed resources on disciplinary hearings of teachers with critical thinking.

During the apartheid struggle many of our teachers play a critical role in guiding educating students in the fight of justice.

Teachers are not simply an employer of the state but also community activist. In a remarkable the community has the right to raise concern to make conflict with the state and other state apparatus.

Mr Neumann was in his full rate to take the concerns of the consideration reported to community. He calls for students at the height of the pandemic to stay at home in order to save lives.

This Parliament gave everyone in South Africa the assurance that they won’t be victimised. Fifty thousand learners, hon House Chair, did not go back to school and the hard line attitude of the Western Cape Education Department goes against the assurances that Parliament gave to the people and we are concerned that the National Education Department are using the excuse that the division of powers and division of budget are not taking action

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Unfortunately, your time has expired, hon Hendicks. Your time has expired.

Mr M G E HENDRICKS: Thank you very much, hon Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Thank you.

Mr G G HILL-LEWIS: Chairperson, every October we have a Medium Term Budget Policy Statement and few are particularly memorable but this one will be the exception. For years to come this budget is going to haunt the government and not all of the garlic in Magoebaskloof can get the demons away for reason in this budget that the Ramaphosa government showed that it is not credible and that it does not care for the poor.

On credibility: how can anyone tryst this government. What it says when it keeps flip flopping on its key reform pledges? No more bailout, say the Minister of Finance emphatically at this podium. Before he announced another massive R10,5 billion bailout of South African Airways, SAA. We are committed to debts stability by 2023, say the Minister before he borrowed R770 billion more and abundant that commitment shifting the timeline out to 2026.

We are going to get the Wage Bill under control he said before the government offered a R27 billion bonanza to public sector workers just to make the problem go away. On all of the most crucial

reforms, the Treasury has promised that back tract flip flopped or delayed.

Certain rating agencies don’t believe them anymore. Why should anyone believe what they say anymore? Now it is emerged that the government has already paid yesterday R1,5 billion to SAA before this budget is passed in Parliament today and before it becomes law. This shows cross disrespect for Parliament and disregard for the law. It is quite possible illegal. The DA is taking legal advice right now on whether it can be stopped. Every ANC MP, every person in this House should be outraged that the disrespect shown to Parliament.

Secondly, in this budget the ANC shows it does not care for the poor and can never again be trusted by the poor and the unemployed of our country to represent their best interests. The ANC has shown it is prepared to cut almost any basic service to take health care and policing away from communities as the point was made in the excellence speech from Mr Wessels to take water literally out of people’s cups in order to pay for SAA.

We have said all through this budget process and we repeated again to today that the decision to cut essential services to fund SAA is immoral. Not a government with the conscious for the poor would

ever do this. But it gets worse as my friend Mr De Villiers said in his excellence speech and in Mr Swart speech. This government missed the deadline to pay for the Covid-19 vaccine. They missed the deadline, meaning we go to the back of the queue globally. So, that the choice the government is make. If you Chair you scarred of Covid-19 and need the vaccine, you can wait. The government misses that deadline but certainly it doesn’t miss the deadline to pay SAA before Parliament even passes the budget. That’s the choice.

We are pleased that the DA government in Western Cape has petitioned President Ramaphosa in terms of section 79 of the Constitution to bring his attention to serious concerns about the constitutionality of this budget. The President should hear this concern and return the Division of Revenue Bill to Parliament. But we won’t hold a breath, House Chairperson. We doubt he is going to do it. Nearly one in every Two ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Thank you very much, Hon Hill-Lewis, check your screen. It is red.

Mr G G HILL-LEWIS: No, Chairperson, I have six and a half minutes. That is three minutes.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): What happened because I am relying on them? What did you do, honourable, I mean ...

Mr G G HILL-LEWIS: It is six minutes and 30 seconds that I had. That started at three minutes.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): No, I don’t dispute what you are saying. I just want clarity from the Table Staff. [Interjections.] Okay, it is the mistake of the Table Staff. They gave you three minutes instead of six. You may proceed. Can you reset because I am watching the clock. Thank you.

Mr G G HILL-LEWIS: It is other three and a half. Okay, thank you, no problem. The Table Staff do a wonderful work. Nearly one in every R2 that this government spends this year is borrowed. We have the highest deficit in the developing world. We have just been downgraded deeper into junk status and nearly one in every two working age South Africans is unemployed.

South Africans are poorer today than they were a decade ago, Shaik Emam. We need a clear and urgent change in direction spare by wide ranging economic reform. But this divide and dysfunctional Cabinet cannot do it. They cannot even get themselves together, never mind

the country. This government has got South Africa on a one way track to national bankruptcy and it cannot change direction.

Every where the ANC government governs bancruptsy ensured to follow. That means the poorer left poorer and more people are unemployed. Look at local councils across the country. It the ANC cannot be trusted to run the economy of a tiny town, it sure can’t be trusted to turn around national economy in decline. This is the future in the ANC office, more debts, high taxes, more people are unemployed and a country that must go cap in hand begging international lenders, broken, bankrupt, and embarrassed but the choice is not between one government and one opposition party, hon members, it is between two governments.

Just look at the difference where the DA governs. [Interjections.] Ours are not the government of borrowing and bancuptcy but of saving and investment. Ours are not the government of collapsing services but of the very best services to the poor of anyway in South Africa, better health care, better education, pure in government are respect for public money. That is the fundamental choice. That is why we are attracting investment wherever we govern. Global companies like Mdek, Capita, Lactalis, Terico have committed R7,8 billion in new investment in DA government.

[Applause.] You know what, hon members? We throw that even Google has announced R2,2 billion new investment in Cape Town’s economy.

So now if anyone in the ANC wants to know how to grow an economy they can just goggle the DA. [Interjections.]

Ms E D PETERS: Thank you, hon Chairperson. Let me start by indicating that it will be a disservice to this House if I don’t quickly respond to hon Hill-Lewis and hon Wessels. They spoke about ... having messed up a government. You will always speak about the Western Cape, where the ANC laid the foundation. You will always talk about the City of Cape Town, again where the ANC laid the major foundation. Look at the mess that you have created in a well-functioning municipality called Tshwane. What have you done to Nelson Mandela Bay? What have you done to Johannesburg? [Interjections.] The ANC is trying to resuscitate these municipalities because of the mess that the DA made with their partners in the marriage that they had with the EFF and their bridesmaids, which created the situation that we are in right now.

An HON MEMBER: This is a joke. A joke!

Ms E D PETERS: Hon Wessels, you talked about white supremacy. If you want to see white supremacy in action, just look at the DA.

Today, here we are standing with hon De Villiers and hon Hill- Lewis speaking in this debate, yet the background work ... the backroom work is done by hon Joseph and hon Sarupen. If that is not white supremacy, I don’t want to say what it will be. The other thing that I want to say to you, hon Wessels, is ...

*Afrikaans:*

... jy praat van die diewe. Wat van die grootste diewe in die land wat die grond gesteel het? Ons sit vandag in ’n nagmerrie waar ons die grond aan die mense moet teruggee. Hoeveel geld moet die regering van die ANC aan die mense terugbetaal vir die grond wat julle gesteel het? Jou oupas en oumas sit nou met groot streke land.

*English:*

You are fighting against the amendment of Section 25 of the Constitution because you know that your people are sitting with tracks and tracks of land, that is actually even lying fallow, that they are living ... for generations and generations, primarily because they don’t even know its value because they didn’t pay for it. So, I want to say to you today, if you want to speak about ...

*Afrikaans:*

... diewe, kyk op jou eie plaas. [Tussenwerpsels.]

*English:*

I want to say, you talked about cadre development. Look at the FF Plus. You don’t even see a coloured or an African person working in the FF Plus’ offices which are being maintained by public funds. So, I want to quote from the late Prof Daniel Plaatjies when he was asked a question about cadre deployment. He said, “Do you think that President Obama will appoint a member of the Ku Klux [Klan](https://www.collinsdictionary.com/dictionary/english/klan) in his administration in the USA?” That tells you that

all over the world it is important that you consider those that have a common understanding, to implement your manifesto, and to implement your policies and your programmes.

However, it is also important that we deal with those who run astray. So, I want to say to you today that cadre development will always be there because we want to change the image of a South Africa which was lily-white and that the DA wants to return it to.

I also want to say that these parties come into this House and want to say that they are not going to support this Budget — the one instrument that government has to be able to change the lives of our people. A government is an instrument to implement that which you have committed to the people. I want to say that as we

speak, the DA, the FF Plus and the EFF are busy lobbying our communities to vote for them on the 9th, as they did, even in past by-elections. Yet, they want to go out and vote against the Budget, saying to the very people that you won their votes so that you can remain in government ... I mean in Parliament and in the councils, but not necessarily making sure that they get services. The ANC supports the 2020 Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement, MTBPS, and the Second Adjustments Appropriation Bill.

Let me start by paying tribute to the thousands and thousands of women who are victims of gender-based violence, GBV. Needless to say, GBV is a wake-up call to all of us, that we should spare neither strength or effort in eliminating this form of oppression and exploitation. Our former President and Nobel Peace Prize winner, uTata Nelson Mandela observed, “Freedom cannot be achieved unless women have been emancipated from all forms of oppression”. These sentiments were echoed by the former AU Commission

Chairperson, Dr Nkosazana Dlamini-Zuma when she said:

The face of poverty is feminine, especially in South Africa because women suffer triple oppression. We are oppressed because we are poor, black and female.

I decided to preface my input with these words because of two reasons. The MTBPS and the Second Adjustments Appropriation Bill must take this reality into account. The COVID-19 pandemic has been more vicious to women in many ways, including their hunger and that of their children. The ANC understands this reality. The interventions to deal with the COVID-19 pandemic to protect lives and livelihoods, which are now common cause, were first and foremost aimed at these most vulnerable sectors of society.

You will remember that during the first Adjustments Appropriation in July, the Department of Health received an additional

R2,9 billion, increasing its budget from R59,5 billion to

R58 billion. This was aimed at providing COVID-19 laboratory tests and to pay for the Cuban doctors that had proven their worth in Italy and China. These funds are also meant for contracting with private hospitals to increase the capacity of hospitals and to buy personal protective equipment, PPEs.

The ANC puts the lives of hardworking health workers at the fore. This Bill adds R393,6 million to the Health Department. This is part of the Presidential Youth Employment Intervention. This will help in the recruitment of community health workers and outreach team leaders. Even more importantly, it will assist with the appointment of enrolled and auxiliary nurses.

The ANC welcomes the funding to build the Tygerberg Regional Hospital and the Klipfontein Hospital in the Western Cape from 2021 to 2022. These hospitals will alleviate pressure on health facilities in areas such as Kraaifontein, Gugulethu and other areas in the City of Cape Town, where the population is growing rapidly.

The ANC also echoes the concern of the committee on the slow progress of the implementation of the National Health Insurance, NHI. We need assurance from the ANC government that it will be able to meet its target of fully implementing NHI by 2024. The skewed distribution of resources in our health system in favour of the middle strata and the rich that have medical aid, is unsustainable.

Co-operative Governance received a net increase of R10,9 billion in the first adjustment, which is 11,4%. This took the main budget allocation to R107 billion. This was for the provision of basic services, including shelter for the homeless and other interventions.

The Second Adjustments Appropriation Bill adds another

R50 billion. Again, this is part of the Presidential Youth Employment Intervention. The focus here is to improve municipal

infrastructure while providing employment opportunities to our young people.

We know that during this pandemic, starvation and levels of hunger have been heightened, especially in rural areas. This means that food security has been negatively impacted. An additional

R1 billion has been made available for the subsistence producer relief fund to subsistence producers, to retain self-employment and to support food value chains. This is in addition to the

R1,2 billion that was announced and ring-fenced by Minister Didiza to mainly distressed small-scale farmers in certain agricultural sectors.

We agree with His Excellency President Cyril Ramaphosa, when he emphasises the importance of agriculture, in saying:

By depriving our people of their right to own and work the land on which they depended for sustenance and livelihood, this great injustice effectively engineered the poverty of black South Africans.

I’m mentioning these agricultural interventions to show that the ANC’s approach in this sector is holistic; to deal with the past of land deprivation but also to ensure that it continues to spur

economic growth. I also want to say that this too is an important matter that we should not play small plan politics with. Again, the majority of the people that work in this sector of agriculture are women. Yet, that’s not where it should end. Let women also own the land.

The ANC welcomes the R630 million ... to the Department of Transport for expanding labour-intensive projects to provincial roads maintenance. We hope that this intervention by the President will deepen the culture of maintenance because it is important that we maintain the roads, and a lot of job opportunities will be created, especially for young people.

Allow me to wish the new board of the Passenger Rail Agency of SA, Prasa, well in its endeavour to resuscitate the company. Owing to apartheid spatial design, where the majority of our people stay furthest from their places of employment, Metrorail plays a very critical role under the stewardship of Comrade Leonard Ramatlakane**.** We hope that they will focus on the business of transporting millions of our people that depend on this mode of transport.

As the ANC, we have learnt with heavy hearts that this year Prasa again received a disclaimer from the Auditor-General for the

second year in succession. This follows years of underspending of capital expenditure, capex, at Prasa. When this House appropriates money, it is for service delivery; it is for economic growth; it is for employment. The ANC supports. [Time expired.] [Applause.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Thank you, hon Peters.

[Interjections.]

Hon Kula, don’t do that again. We now invite the hon Minister of Finance, uTata Mboweni.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Hon Chair of chairs, hon members from across the benches or aisle, let me start off by thanking the Portfolio Committee on Appropriations under the able leadership of hon Sfiso Buthelezi for the sterling work which they have done since we tabled the Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement and the Second Appropriations Amendment Bill. I think they have done well.

Despite the differences among the political parties in Parliament, we have now eventually reached this point in the House. People watching us from home must not underestimate the amount of work that the committee members have done and also the work that has been done by all hon members in the House. When we say this is

Parliament at work, an activist Parliament, this is what we mean. People hard at work despite their political differences which is to be expected in a democracy. Ours is a living democracy and we should continue to be thankful to the founding mothers and fathers of our nation for having bequeathed unto us this wonderful Constitution which gives democratic rights to all to speak including those who previously denied the majority of the people the right to speak or the right to enter this Chamber. We accommodate all in pursuit of our vision that South Africa belongs to all who live in it - black and white; men and women; and young and old.

The second point is to bring this House and the population at large to what is it that we are debating. Political polemics aside, what are we talking about? Principally, we are talking about a view into 2022 to 2023. Where are we today and where do we want to go? And as I have explained before and I bear the burden again to explain this today, we are living in a totally-changed global environment, and a totally-changed economic environment.

Therefore, we have had to adjust our own plans from February to where we are today; where we are today being totally different from where we were in February; and again significantly different from where we were in June. That’s why we have had to present this

Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement in October in the manner that we did.

We indicate that global growth has declined; domestic growth has declined; and *ipso facto*, the revenue collection has also declined because of weak economic performance. Because of this and other factors such as the pandemic, we have had to revise our revenue projections down by some R322 billion. When the revenue projections are down, by that very fact – *ipso facto* – it means we have to adjust our expenditure projections as well. This is what we have sought to do and presented before this hon House. That’s why we have had to engage in an exercise of reallocations of budgets to meet certain needs and demands. In fact, it is true that we have had to reduce certain budget projections which we had made in February and June in order to deal with the current situation.

Material conditions are very important because they do dictate what we need to do. But it doesn’t mean that we just sit by and say the material conditions are dictating everything, and there is nothing we can do. There’s nothing like that. That’s why we have come up with the Economic Reconstruction and Recovery Programme.

It is through the Economic Reconstruction and Recovery Programme that we can resuscitate the economy and get revenue collection

improving. Therefore, as things improve, our fortunes as well can improve. That is a primary thing we should focus on - the protection of our fiscal framework so that our fiscal stance is fully understood by all and sundry including members of the hon House, the population at large, the rating agencies, investors and everybody else. They must understand our fiscal framework which we have presented before this hon House.

Hon Chair of chairs, it is in that context that I think we should now proceed to exercise our democratic right by approving the Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement and also the Second Appropriations Amendment Bill. Having said all of that, I would like to thank everybody in this hon House for the role they have played. Political polemics here and there – it’s okay. It is part of the democratic process but our focus should be on the fiscal framework and the Medium-term Budget Policy Statement which I hereby submit to be adopted by this House.

Finally, let me say that, on the polemic side, it is of no use whatsoever for the opposition political parties to think that they would score any political points against the ANC at all. Recent

by-elections have demonstrated that the majority of South Africans have full confidence in the ANC and this can be verified by the by-elections that we have won. The ANC is ready, able and willing

to lead this country through the Economic Reconstruction and Recovery Programme. To that extent – you can shout, hon Wessels, here and there. From time to time, I think you lapse into the past which I thought General Viljoen had helped you to cross the Rubicon. But clearly, you have not crossed the Rubicon. Hon Hill- Lewis keeps on talking about the bailout of SAA and so on. It looks like his thinking process is stuck like a broken record around SAA. We have gone past that and we are now into the Economic Reconstruction and Recovery Programme. Join us if you are able to do so. If not, history is going to judge you as somebody

... [Interjections.]

Mr G G HILL-LEWIS: Can you take a question, sir?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... who pretends to be liberal but at the same time goes back to a ‘verkrampte’ approach.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon Minister ... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Thank you very much. I recommend the report to the House.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon Minister. Okay, hon Hill-Lewis, what is it?

Mr G G HILL-LEWIS: I would like to know if the hon Minister would take a question on SAA.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): The hon Minister has said, thank you. He has concluded his speech.

Mr G G HILL-LEWIS: He ran away.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: I can take the question if needs be.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Do you want to take the question, hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Yes, please!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Okay. Hon Hill-Lewis, pose your question.

Mr G G HILL-LEWIS: Minister, thank you for taking the question. That’s good of you. How do you justify missing the deadline to pay

for the Covid-19 vaccine but paying the SAA bailout before that appropriation has even been approved by this House today?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Hon House Chair of chairs, I think it is very important that, when you are an adult person, you must first inform yourself of all the facts before you open your mouth. The fact of the matter is that we have sufficient time until approximately 15 December to do the payments. So, we have not missed the date or deadline at all. [Interjections.] And the Solidarity Fund stands ready to pay the R500 million that have been promised. We have not missed the deadline at all. Don’t go around misleading people because you are misinformed. I don’t know who misinformed you. Maybe it’s hon Steenhuisen who misinformed you. [Interjections.] I feel sorry for you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Thank you, hon Minister. Hon members. Hon members, order!

AN HON MEMBER: Malibongwe!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): No, no, don’t do that!

Debate concluded.

Question put: That the Bill be read the first time.

Division demanded.

The House divided.

The House Chairperson, Ms M G Boroto announced that, the Speaker had determined that, in accordance with the Rules, a manual voting procedure would be used and that the Whips would conduct a headcount of members in the Chamber and on the virtual platform for the purpose of ascertaining a quorum and voting.

A quorum being present in terms of Rule 98(1), voting commenced.

AYES – 208: (ANC – 191; IFP – 10; Good – 2; NFP - 2; AIC – 1; Cope

– 1; Al Jama-ah - 1).

NOES – 108: (DA - 63; EFF - 34; FF Plus - 9; ACDP – 2).

Question agreed to.

Bill accordingly read a first time.

# CONSIDERATION OF VOTES AND SCHEDULE: SECOND ADJUSTMENTS APPROPRIATION BILL

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): I wish to thank the different political parties for advising the Table staff on which votes they will record the objections and on which they intend dividing. This information will greatly assist the process for the session.

Hon members the proceedings will initially take the form of a question and answer session. I shall put each vote in respect of which adjustment have been made and in turn members will have the opportunity to ask questions to the relevant Ministers in respect of these adjustments. Each party has been allocated global time for all the votes and members of the executive have up to two minutes to respond to questions per vote.

Hon members, there have been requests from parties that in some instances they will use the allocated time to make a declaration instead of asking a question. This will be allowed. Naturally when a declaration instead of a question has been made there will be no expectation for a member of the executive to reply. Once a party’s time has expired, its members will not be allowed to put further questions. Members who are in the chamber may put a question from

the floor microphones or the podium and those on the virtual platform will e recognised based on the list that has been submitted by the parties.

After the question and answer session, I will put the votes for decision. Hon members should please wait until I recognise them before they put their question. And may I make a special appeal to members on the virtual platform not to interrupt the proceedings unnecessarily because that will cause additional time to be added to the process this afternoon. I now put Vote number 1, the Presidency. Are there any questions?

Vote No 1 – The Presidency - put

Question put.

Division demanded.

The House divided.

AYES - 227: [TAKE IN FROM MINUTES]

NOES - 64: [TAKE IN FROM MINUTES]

Question agreed to.

Vote accordingly agreed to.

Vote No 2 – Parliament - put

Agreed to.

Vote No 3 – Co-Operative Governance - put

Mr B M HADEBE: Hon House Chair his Excellency the President, Cyril Matamela Ramaphosa has highlighted the need to strengthen public employment programme. Hon Minister what is the department doing to reinforce community works programme so that it provides skills and exerts strategies for participants? Thank you.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL

AFFAIRS: Thank you hon House Chair. HOn Hadebe, thank you for the question. The community work programme is a critical initiative that seeks to alleviate poverty once assisting in providing services. One of the critical areas that have been identified for improvement is skills development.

When you look at our annual performance plan in this cycle, a key focus area has become skills development so that the participants can be able to generate the appropriate skills. Furthermore, the department working with the Department of Agriculture has worked on a programme to ensure training of young people in skills particularly with regards to agriculture so that we are able to enable participation in that sector. Thank you very much.

Vote No 4- Government Communication and Information System - put

Agreed to.

Vote No 5 – Home Affairs - put

Mr A C ROOS: House Chair the DA welcomes the allocation towards e- Visas to boost tourism. However, this project has been dragging on for years for the benefit of Visa Facilitation Services, VFS. Our economy needs the system finalised with urgency. We welcome the additional mobile units to reach our rural areas but the only people that are helped by mobile units that are not connected are the connected people who get the tender. We need these units fully operational and on the road now.

This and the complete lack of urgency the system of line problem at least people stranded at Home Affairs offices show that you don’t care about these people. Ten and half billion has been allocated to SAA but only R1.6 billion to Home Affairs to run immigration and deal with the massive problem of our cross borders. This shows where the priorities of the ANC government lie.

Minister the honeymoon is over, it’s time for delivery!

Mr N SINGH: Hon Minister your department’s budget has been cut by R564 million to assist our corruption riddled Covid-19 response and another SAA bailout. Yet, we submit as IFP that your department needs more resources and not less considering the boarder management authorities went to take as much as 15 years to setup and considering the reduced budget, what is your department’s plan to secure the boarders in the interim which in its current state is putting at risk the safety and security of our entire nation and what is the update on how far have you gone in trying to ascertain if any Home Affairs officials were involved in the great Bushiri escape? Thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon members, this is not going to assist us. All party leaders or whips must communicate

with the Table and indicate before hand whether you want take a question or not. I am not going to call all the names of the parties. You have been requested to submit this information. You cannot just at the last minute decide that you will now ignore the arrangement that’s in place and you’ll start asking questions. I will allow the NFP in this instance. The NFP.

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Thank you House Chairperson. Minister, the quality of service at Home Affairs Department appeared to be unsatisfactory, what could you perhaps do ensure that the greater level of compassion when dealing with the public and what measures can you put in place to ensure that we public representatives are able to communicate to and engage with your department when concerns are raised by the members of the general public?

The MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS: Hon Chair, may you allow me to respond while my video is muted because my system is not working very well Chairperson?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): That’s in order hon Minister you may just proceed. Proceed hon Minister

The MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS: Chairperson on the e-Visa, I’m sure the hon member knows that we report this repeatedly to the

portfolio committee. The e-Visa problem is not the problem created by any living human being. You are aware of our programme of starting to test the e-Visa system in India, China and Nigeria and we stopped those problems when Covid-19 struck and we are preparing to restart that.

On the issue of mobile units, it is true that the mobile units will work if you put them in the centre of Johannesburg, Pretoria, Cape Town or Durban. When you take them to rural areas where they are needed the most, they don’t work and the reasons are simple.

Networks are efficient in the cities and not well in the rural areas. So, what we are trying to do is to equip the trucks with all the networks, MTN, Vodacom, Telkom, and Cell C so that they pick whatever coverage is available in that particular area. In that regard, we believe they’ll be able to work.

On the issue of boarder management authority, it’s true that everybody is struggling under the budget cuts but we understand the background behind which the budget cut happened. So, an interim measure or as a mitigating factor, we have divided the 4471km boarder environment all the land into ten segments and are looking at the segments that very problematic and have identified about four segments and are planning to deploy the boarder

management guards to do four segments with the little money that we have got up to so far.

NFP, the issue regarding compassion, I think we need to accept that the majority of Home Affairs workers are compassionate that’s why we were able to issue 810 000 birth certificates out of the

1.2 million that our target was. That’s why we are able to issue so may IDs and so many passports because the majority of Home Affairs officials are compassionate.

Vote No 6 – International Relations and Cooperation – agreed to (Democratic Alliance, Freedom Front Plus and African Christian Democratic Party dissenting).

Vote No 7 – National School of Government – agreed to (Democratic Alliance, Freedom Front Plus, African Christian Democratic Party and Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Vote No 8 – National Treasury – agreed to (Democratic Alliance, Freedom Front Plus, African Christian Democratic Party and Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Vote No 9 – Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation – agreed to (Democratic Alliance, Freedom Front Plus, Economic Freedom Fighters and African Christian Democratic Party and dissenting).

Vote No 10 – Public Enterprises

Mr G K Y CACHALIA: Chairperson, this Budget Vote is in direct contradiction with The Presidency’s economic recovery plan. In its ineptitude it cuts slack at our expense. It is a celebration of corruption, a mandate for the mendacious and a lifeline for the loosh. It supports duds and deadbeats in a dirge of dying, with scant recognition of what needs to be done.

Lenin – hero of many over there – famously asked, what is to be done. He said there was an absence of consciousness that failed to recognise the signs of failure and the remedies required.

But there is no acceptance of public sector market failure – from Alexkor through Eskom via SAA to Transnet – and no recognition of the value of privatisation. If the shoe were on the other foot and Steinhoff or Enron were being addressed, the remedies would be painfully clear.

Alas, it is not so with the authors of this. So, the question remains: Why bury us in bankruptcy?

Mr N SINGH: Chair, SOEs are increasingly becoming some of the largest debtors to the Auditor-General, with the Auditor-General scheduled to take over the auditing of Transnet and Eskom.

How is the Minister going to ensure that SOEs pay their financial obligations to the Auditor-General?

Secondly, does the Minister intend seeking public-private partnerships as a mechanism to recapitalise the reformed SAA and any other SOE which may find itself in the future in need of business rescue?

Ms J TSHABALALA: Chairperson, ...

Ms E N NTLANGWINI: House Chair! House Chair!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon member, why are you rising?

Ms E N NTLANGWINI: House Chair, we definitely signed for this one. So, we are curious: Why are we not noted? And we have definitely sent to the Table staff for this Vote ... to do a declaration.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon members, I rely on the information given to me. The latest document given to me was at 13h30 this afternoon. I will look into the matter here. In the meantime, I will ask the ANC to continue since they have the floor.

Ms J TSHABALALA: Thank you, House Chair. Hon Minister, we have heard enough complaints about SAA from the DA tonight – the right wing who wants to privatise state-owned enterprises. We heard they have even approached the courts.

The question becomes: Who is their funder? Who is funding this thing? Clearly, they have a funder. They have a private person who really wants it.

But you are not going to get it.

Let me ask the question, Minister: SOEs have commenced with a process of restructuring in terms of government and financial recoveries from contracts marred by corruption during the state-

capture period. However, the operation and commercial recovery of SOEs requires more focus. Restructuring of the business model will lead to better results for operational and commercial recoveries.

Denel has a critical role to play in the defence industry and has been unable to pay the salaries of workers, resulting in protests.

The SA Forestry Company, Safcol, has great commercial potential and can develop downstream manufacturing if there is a resolution to the land issue.

How will the issues of Denel and Safcol be addressed? Thank you.

Ms O M C MAOTWE: Chair, for as long as the Department of Public Enterprises is leaderless, strategic entities will continue to be undermined so as to advance narrow profiteering that only benefits Whites and some Indians.

Arrogance, racism and undermining of Africans masquerades as competence, but there has not been any material improvement in any of the state-owned companies. Eskom has renamed load shedding “load reductions”, but we still don’t have energy security. The only thing that is progressing at Eskom is the sale of public assets and the misguided guide of privatisation. The CEO denounces

the capacity of the institution which was entrusted to him to revive and directly invites the public sector to do what will eventually collapse the business he is supposed to revive.

Transnet is being dismantled to allow for the smooth sailing of private companies who are given access to railway lines. The chairperson of the board, Dr Popo Molefe, takes money from ... [Inaudible.] ... and we are told there is no corruption! Is that not criminal?

Safcol is on the verge of collapse. The company is bankrupt due to poor management and no strategic direction. This is the same with Alexkor. It is also on the verge of collapse and nothing is being done.

SA Airways and SA Express are both under business rescue and their workers have not been paid in eight months despite government’s cash injections into the business rescue. If workers are not getting the money first, then who is?

Denel could not pay salaries.

The department itself is no better. People are appointed without qualifications or without any process being followed. Anyone who

disagrees with the Minister is purged. Why is it that, everywhere Jamnadas goes, everything is done through adjudication ... [Inaudible.]

Mr B A RADEBE: Chair, on a point of order!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon member, allow me to take the point of order. Hon Radebe, what is the point of order?

Mr B A RADEBE: Chairperson, I rise on Rule 82 which states very clearly that we do not call each other on our first names. Thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): That’s correct, hon member. One would have thought that hon members would know this by now.

Hon member, you must address the hon Minister as mister or hon Minister, but you may not address him by his given name. Please correct that behaviour before you continue.

Ms O M C MAOTWE: Good, Chairperson.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): You must correct that.

Ms O M C MAOTWE: [Inaudible.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon member, you must correct that. You must address the Minister properly

An HON MEMBER: Call him “mister”. Call him “mister”.

Ms O M C MAOTWE: May I continue, Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): You may.

Ms O M C MAOTWE: If everything that Mr Gordhan does is through adjudication of some sort, then why do we have rules? The EFF rejects the adoption of Budget Vote 10 of the Department of Public Enterprises and calls for the removal of Minister Gordhan.

Mr Cyril Ramaphosa, we have asked you nicely to remove this man. Please remove the man from your Cabinet. Thank you. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES: Thank you chairperson and hon members.

In relation to hon Tshabalala’s question, as we have reported to Parliament on many occasions, the operational and commercial recovery of those SOEs under the charge of the Department of Public Enterprises is taking place. But, because of the extent of damage caused by state capture and real rogue elements who have been running these entities for so long – which is duly always defended by the EFF and their hon members who are less than honourable – it takes time to put these SOEs on the right kind of footing. [Interjections.]

So, on the question of Denel and Safcol ... in the case of Denel, there is going to be a change in the business model as we go forward and we are working with the board in that particular … [Interjections.] [Inaudible.]

In relation to Safcol ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon Minister, there seems to be someone from the EFF who wants to raise a point of order.

The MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES: I’m not surprised.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Will that member please raise their point of order.

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: ... [Inaudible.] ... rogue unit and rogue elements and state capture. Where does he get that from? Now that he is exposed he wants to throw the fire on the EFF ... [Interjections.] [Inaudible.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): That’s not a point of order, hon Shivambu. [Interjections.]

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: He’s a liar, a person who has been misleading the people of South Africa. As a person who has been ... [Interjections.] [Inaudible.] He must stop ... [Interjections.] [Inaudible.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon Shivambu, that’s not a point of order. [Interjections.]

Mr B A RADEBE: Point of order on the point of order. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES: Ask VBS; they will tell you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): No! Hon Shivambu ... [Interjections.]

Ms N V MENTE: Where in the report? Where is the report ... On the report that we are implicated ... in the report that VBS ...

Interjections.] [Inaudible.] Jamnadas! Aah, Jamnadas!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): May I request the Serjeant at Arms to remove hon Shivambu from the platform.

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: Where does VBS ... [Interjections.] [Inaudible.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): I also ask that the hon Mente be removed from the platform. I also ask for the hon Mkhaliphi to be removed from the platform. [Applause.] I also ask for the hon Maotwe to be removed from the platform. [Interjections.]

Ms O M C MAOTWE: You can remove us, we don’t care, Chairperson! [Interjections.]

Ms H O MKAHALIPHI: Jamnadas must fall! [Interjections.]

Mr P SINDANE: You are doing this to protect Jamnadas! You are defending Jamnadas!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): I am asking for the hon Patrick Sindane to be removed from the platform. [Interjections.]

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: You can’t remove all of us. You can’t just do that, Chair. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES: Chair... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): I’m also asking for the hon Ceza to be removed from the platform. [Interjections.]

Ms E N NTLANGWINI: You can’t just do that! [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): I also ask for the hon Dumisane Mthenjane to be removed from the platform.

Mr N S MATIASE: Chair, whenever it is heated, that man ... [Inaudible.]

An HON MEMBER: You are scared of that man!

An HON MEMBER: This is pure bias!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Serjeant at Arms, I am expecting you to remove these members whose names I have mentioned with immediate effect from the platform.

Hon Minister, you may continue. [Interjections.]

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: [Inaudible.]

Mr M N PAULSEN: House Chair! House Chair!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon Shivambu, you have been removed from the platform. [Interjections.] Hon Paulsen will be removed from the platform. [Interjections.] The hon Mashabela will be removed from the platform. [Interjections.] The hon Motsepe must be removed from the platform. [Interjections.]

Hon Minister?

Mr W T I MAFANYA: That Jamnadas must go!

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: Chair, you must rule on the point of order! [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon Shivambu, you did not raise a point of order. You should not even open your mic. I expect the Serjeant at Arms and the ICT services to immediately remove a member from the platform when they are instructed to do so! You do not have discretion!

Mr M N PAULSEN: Point of order, House Chair! Point of order! [Interjections.] [Inaudible.] ... irrational!

Mr K CEZA: This Jamnadas must be removed with all of them!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon Ceza is still on the platform. He must be removed! [Interjections.] Hon Chief Whip?

Mr K CEZA: [Inaudible.] ... Why? Because we know ... [Interjections.] [Inaudible.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): The hon Ceza must be removed from the platform. [Interjections.]

Hon Chief Whip?

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: Thank you, House Chair. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES: Chair...

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: Thank you, House Chair. [Interjections.]

Mr M N PAULSEN: Point of order, House Chair! Point of order!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): I am first recognising the Chief Whip of the Majority Party.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: Thank you, House Chair. We will not allow ourselves every time to be abused by one party.

When a ruling has been made by the Presiding Officer for one to be removed, let ICT do that and save us from this emotional abuse of everybody from one party all talking at the same time. We cannot accept that. Let us maintain the decorum of the House.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Yes. Thank you, hon Chief Whip. I see the hon Paulsen is also still on the platform. I said he must be removed. [Interjections.]

Mr M N PAULSEN: But House Chair, how can you just want us to ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Remove the hon member from the platform! Thank you. Hon Minister? [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES: Thank you, Chairperson.

As I was saying, Denel is currently undergoing a change in its business model ...

Ms E N NTLANGWINI: House Chair, on a point of order.

The MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES: ... and we will announce that early in the new year ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon Minister, let me take the point of order from the hon Ntlangwini.

Ms E N NTLANGWINI: House Chair, I just want to check the way you remove members. You didn’t even note which members. Hon Paulsen never even spoke. You removed him. So, you are just blindly removing EFF members.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Are you challenging my ruling, hon member?

Ms E N NTLANGWINI: Secondly, hon Chair, the Minister, Mr Gordhan, makes harsh allegations against the Deputy President of the EFF, or against the EFF on the VBS matter, when he knows himself ... [Inaudible.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon member, I am not entering into a debate with you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): [Inaudible.] So, I don’t know ... [Interjections.] Take your seat, hon member. Take your seat.

Ms E N NTLANGWINI: ... why can’t you let ... [Inaudible.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon member, I’m not going to entertain you any further. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: You are not a chairperson!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): The hon Msane must be removed from the platform. [Interjections.]

Am HON MEMBER: For what?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): The hon Nolutshungu must be removed from the platform. The hon Sindane must be removed from the platform.

Ms E N NTLANGWINI: But House Chair, you don’t remove the ANC members. Why?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon Ntlangwini, you were earlier asked also to be removed from the platform, and you stayed on the platform, and now you want to address the House.

Ms E N NTLANGWINI: No! No, Chair! When? Who asked me to be removed? Nobody asked me! No, Chairperson! [Interjections.] Nobody asked me! I never even spoke!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): I asked for hon Ntlangwini to be removed from the platform.

Ms E N NTLANGWINI: Who asked me to remove me? Please! Check your ruling. Who asked that I must be removed?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): The Serjeant at Arms ...

An HON MEMBER: Point of order!

Ms E N NTLANGWINI: No!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): No, I am not taking points of order.

An HON MEMBER: On a point of order, Chair. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon members, if all of you want to jump up on points of order, it is going to be impossible to proceed. I have made a ruling, and I am waiting on the Serjeant at Arms and the ICT officials to remove those members from the platform. What is so difficult about that?

If members want to challenge my ruling, they must approach the Rules Committee.

Mr P SINDANE: Remove people for what?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): The hon Sindane is also still on the platform!

Mr P SINDANE: Removed for what?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): The hon Sindane must be removed from the platform.

An HON MEMBER: He is being obstreperous!

Mr P SINDANE: You must remove Jamnadas!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): The hon Dumisane Mthenjane must also be removed from the platform. We really require your co- operation. [Interjections.] Just wait, hon member! Just wait.

An HON MEMBER: I rise on a point of order. I had my hand up.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): No, I can’t recognise you now. I want to address the staff. Yesterday we had a similar problem. It’s as if you disappear somewhere and leave your workstations unattended. You should be at your workstations so that you can implement whatever decision is taken in the House.

That applies to the NA Table, the Serjeant at Arms, as well as the ICT officials.

It is unacceptable.

Hon member from the EFF, what is your point of order? I hope it’s not a point of order that I have ruled on already, because I will not change a ruling that I made earlier. You may continue, hon member from the EFF.

An HON MEMBER: Hon Chair, hon Shivambu made a point of order. You did not rule on it. Furthermore, the House has descended into chaos and anarchy because of your reckless ruling. Why do you resort to this domkrag mentality? Who taught you ... [Inaudible.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon member, you are now challenging my ruling. May I ask that this member also be removed from the platform. [Applause.]

Let us proceed. Hon Minister, you have about one minute left to complete your response.

An HON MEMBER: On a point of order, Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): What is your point of order, hon member?

An HON MEMBER: The point of order is that the inconsistency in the removal of people being from the platform. You have generally been

saying EFF members must be removed. The Rules of Parliament say individuals are to be taken care of, unlike where you say all members of the EFF, irrespective of whether we agree or disagree with them. Thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon member, why do you think you are still on the platform? You are a member of the EFF. I asked for specific members who did not obey the Rules and were not following the Rules to be removed from the platform. Any member that challenges a ruling and continually interrupts a session will be removed from the platform. It doesn’t matter which party they belong to. So that is ...

An HON MEMBER: On a point of order, Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): I have ruled on the matter.

An HON MEMBER: Is it necessary for me and you to have a dialogue on the matter?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon member ...

An HON MEMBER: Will I be removed if I have dialogue with you on this on this matter?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon member, are you challenging my ruling?

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Well, hon member, you must follow the process as laid out in the Rules of the National Assembly. We can send you a copy, so that you can follow the process of taking this matter to the Rules Committee. We can’t deal with it here. I made that ruling, and I stand by it.

Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES: Chair, let me rush through my response.

I said that the operational and commercial recovery of many of these SOEs is impacted because of the state capture issue and the kind of damage done to these institutions that today, very conveniently, political parties and some in the trade unions, some lawyers and other associated members see fit to defend.

Secondly, in relation to Denel and Safcol ... I agree with hon Tshabalala that Safcol has a huge amount of potential. It is not in any financial difficulty, as one hon member attempted to indicate. It has great potential to work with the private sector in that regard.

Denel will have to change its business model. Currently, the board is busy at work in that regard.

On SAA, the hon member from the IFP has, regrettably again, got it wrong. If I may correct that. It’s only because of the DA’s narrative on this matter. The money that is allocated by the Minister of Finance is to pay workers their retrenchment packages, to pay creditors and other obligations arising from business rescue.

So, as hon Tshabalala says, there seems to be some interests that are persuading or driving the DA to consistently plug the SAA line.

In relation to hon Cachalia – I suppose that’s a speech. He wanted to expose how much he knows about Lenin but probably, in the process, exposed much less about Lenin and much more about ... [Inaudible.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon Minister, your time has expired.

The MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES: In relation to all the questions that Ms Maotwe was asking, that’s all part of the racist narrative that one expects from this political party. Thank you.

Vote No 11 – Public Service and Administration – agreed to (Democratic Alliance, Freedom Front Plus, African Christian Democratic Party and Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Dr L A SCHREIBER: House Chair, this question is actually in relation to Vote 11. I hope that is in order.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): No, we have passed that vote!

Dr L A SCHREIBER: Okay, Chair, I will still ... [Interjection.]

... to Minister Mchunu.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): You can rephrase it.

Dr L A SCHREIBER: For more than a year, the Minister of Finance has promised that the country that the state would not increase

public sector wages. He went as far as to freeze wages, not only for this year, but also for the next three years. Yet, this week, you Minister Mchunu, offered to buy off ANC cadres in the unions by offering them a R27 billion wage increase at the direct expense of basic services.

This budget is in direct contradiction to President Ramaphosa’s economic reform plan. Hon Minister, why are you committing this fiscal treason against the 60 million people of South Africa?

Thank you. [Applause.]

The MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION: Chair, I don’t

know what the hon member is talking about. I don’t know anything about the treason. I don’t know about anything about the offer that he is talking about. What I know is that there were discussions with the unions based on fixed four principles: The first one was that whatever we could settle on outside court, must be in line with the principle of not affecting the baseline in anyway, which is in line with the current fiscal framework; secondly, we said provided it also does not in any way expand our borrowing margin in any way; but then there were also two other principles – stability; and, the fourth one was that it should enable us to settle down with labour to discuss the new dispensation in public service.

So, what he is talking about – I am sure – is something that he hears here and there. However, what we discussed is exactly what I am telling you about, and this is what is written down. Thank you.

Ms M T KIBI: Hon Chair, the hon Minister, relative to the wage bill, has the department considered the implications the wage bill and public servants’ strike has on service delivery, particularly during the time of crisis of the second wave of coronavirus, Covid-19? I thank you.

The MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION: Chair, I am not

sure whether I follow exactly what the member is looking for, but she is talking about the wage bill and the strike. [Interjections.] Now, I am not aware of that. [Interjections.] I am not aware of the strike that relates to the wage bill in any way. So, I am unable to answer the question. Thank you.

Vote 12 – Public Service Commission – agreed to (Democratic Alliance, Freedom Front Plus, African Christian Democratic Party and Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Vote No 13 — Public Works and Infrastructure — put.

Ms S J GRAHAM: Thank you, Chair. This budget is taking

R234 million from Public Works and Infrastructure for the SA Airways, SAA, and another R44 million for the National School of Government. The bulk of that funding comes from the Independent Development Trust’s, IDT’s, nonstate sector nonprofit organisation, NPO, Expanded Public Works Programme, EPWP, which has still not been implemented, and as a result, 55 000 people have not worked for nine months of this year. No doubt, they will be more than thrilled that the money they should’ve earned is being used to bail out an ANC vanity project like SAA and a school for politicians.

If you add the R40 million washing line at Beitbridge and an abject failure to create thousands of promised job opportunities, that is the sad legacy of the Department of Public Works and Infrastructure for 2020. This budget is in direct contradiction to President Ramaphosa’s economic reform plan and the DA cannot support it.

Mr X NGWEZI: Thank you very much, House Chairperson. Hon Minister, the government actually approved the Beitbridge border fence project in March earlier this year to try and slow down the spread of the COVID-19 virus. Given all the information that we have now about the project, does your department have any idea of the

rippling effects of the failure to effectively erect this border fence as it directly relates to the spread of the virus, and what exactly has been done to mitigate the situation?

Mr X NQOLA: Chair, the department has received an unqualified audit but some entities within the department received the opposite. What is the Minister going to do to improve the situation, and equally, what is the future of the EPWP within the Department of Public Works and Infrastructure? Thank you.

The MINISTER OF PUBLIC WORKS AND INFRASTRUCTURE: Thank you, hon

Chairperson and hon members. With regard to the first question by hon Graham, we have explained everything in the portfolio committee. We have explained the progress reports of the EPWP and the implementation of the COVID-19 projects, including the request by the Department of Health to assist with about 25 000 workers for COVID-19. That was all explained. That is separate from the NPO sector programme as a whole.

The IDT has signed contracts with the NPOs. The Deputy Minister and I will be meeting with the NPOs next week because it is not correct to say that there is no money to continue or to meet the contractual obligations of the NPO programme. Once we have had

that meeting with the NPO sector, I will certainly inform the hon member.

Hon member of the IFP, the 700 km fence, that’s the border between Zimbabwe and South Africa, the Beitbridge border contract was to repair and replace 40km of that. Yes, I will admit that the borders are very porous, and that even that fence that was installed during the COVID-19 period was not of quality ... [Inaudible.] ... value for money. The case is now before the Special Investigating Unit, SIU, as far as the presidential proclamation ... and we will certainly wait for the outcome of that.

With regard to the question from the hon member of the ANC, yes, only one of the entities received a clean audit. The others received unqualified audits for the previous financial year. We are now signing service-level agreements, with clear targets and delivery, and as part of the key performance areas of the entities we have now included that the chief executive officer, CEO, and the board ... we will assess them in terms of their performance.

But for the coming financial year, their key performance areas ... they must at least have a clean audit or an unqualified audit ... [Time expired.]

Vote agreed to (Democratic Alliance, Freedom Front Plus, African Christian Democratic Party and Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Vote No 14 — Statistics South Africa — put and agreed to. (Democratic Alliance, Freedom Front Plus, African Christian Democratic Party and Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Vote No 15 – Traditional Affairs – put.

Mr N SINGH: Thank you, Chairperson. Hon Minister, given that the department acknowledges that there are many governance challenges at poorly capacitated provincial Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs’ offices, what is the department doing to bolster the role of traditional leaders as is enshrined in our Constitution so that service delivery to the citizens is effectively delivered?

Mr B M HADEBE: Thank you, hon House Chair of Chairs.

*IsiXhosa:*

Baphume belandelelana kwatsho kwaphola kamnandi.

*English:*

COVID-19 has impacted negatively on the global economy, particularly small businesses and rural areas. What role can traditional leaders play in boosting the local economy by using available resources, and what is the department doing to assist traditional leaders in this regard?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): The hon Minister or the Deputy Minister of Traditional Affairs? Is the hon Minister or any of the Deputy Ministers on the platform? The Minister of Finance? Is the hon Minister of Finance on the platform so that he can respond to these questions? May I request the hon members of the executive; the guide is freely available in terms of the Votes as we follow it. It is clearly indicated. The parliamentary liaison officers should’ve received a copy of this guide so that the Ministers and Deputy Ministers know exactly when the Votes come up and if a question will be asked. You must follow this guide because you are accountable to the House to answer these questions as we go through the different Votes.

Although we make provision, where we are informed that the Minister or Deputy Minister is not available, then we will call on the Minister of Finance to reply to that question. However, in this instance I will request the Table staff to immediately interact with the Minister of Deputy Minister of Traditional

Affairs so that they can come and answer these questions. There are two questions that have been posed.

The MINISTER of FINANCE: House Chair, I’m here.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Can you assist, hon Minister of Finance?

The MINISTER of FINANCE: Could they repeat the questions because I was not informed about this ... [Inaudible.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): That’s fair. I will ask the two members to repeat the questions. The IFP, can you repeat the question that was posed to the Minister on Vote No 15 — Traditional Affairs?

Mr N SINGH: Thank you, Chairperson. Hon Minister, given that the department acknowledges that there are many governance challenges at poorly capacitated provincial Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs’ offices, what is the department doing to bolster the role of traditional leaders as is enshrined in our Constitution so that service delivery to the citizens is effectively delivered?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): The ANC?

Mr B M HADEBE: Thank you, hon House Chair. COVID-19 has impacted negatively on the global economy, particularly small businesses and rural areas. What role can traditional leaders play in boosting the local economy by using available resources, and what is the department doing to assist traditional leaders in this regard?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: I regret that I am not in a position to answer these questions. [Laughter.] I will try to get hold of my colleagues to make sure that they are on the platform to answer the questions. I might ... [Inaudible.] I regret that I’m ... I’m very sorry about this.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): No, we understand. Thank you, hon Minister.

Mr N SINGH: Hon Chairperson, it’s Singh here. I think, perhaps just to get your guidance on this, you know we have not decided whether unanswered questions will be answered in writing, particularly during these sessions. Now, you rightly said that all these questions have to be answered when we are considering the Vote and the decision on the Vote. I wonder if you can give us

guidance in that regard ... to unanswered questions because the time is restricted to two minutes and in a case like this where the Ministers are not available to answer. Thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): I’ll come back to you now, hon Singh. Yes, hon member?

Mr A H M PAPO: Chair of chairs, from the office of the Leader of Government Business, the majority of Ministers confirmed that they will be on the virtual platform to listen to the responses. It’s very surprising that suddenly people are not on the platform. We are discussing a very, very important issue. To me, the budget is a priority. Other departmental matters must stand aside and all Ministers who confirmed that they are going to be on the platform have to be on the platform. We cannot run around like this when Ministers have confirmed that they are going to be there.

What is more of a priority than a budget ... than actually doing that? So, that’s what I want to raise from our side. There were confirmations and we can give you the list of those confirmations.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Yes, thank you, hon member. Hon Singh, I understand that the Deputy Minister is now on the platform to respond to the questions posed to Vote No 15. I’ll

come back in terms of written replies to these questions that have been asked. [Interjections.] Hon Tozama Mantashe, switch off your microphone otherwise you will be removed from the platform. The hon Deputy Minister?

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL

AFFAIRS (Mr M F P Tau): Hon House Chair, can the questions be repeated? I was in the ablution facility.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Now you see, this is exactly what the hon Papo was referring to. We understand that you are not Deputy Minister specifically for Traditional Affairs, so may I request the hon Singh and the hon Hadebe to repeat their questions please? This is really unacceptable! [Interjections.]

Mr N SINGH: For the third and last time. Hon Deputy Minister, given that the department acknowledges that there are many governance challenges at poorly capacitated provincial Co- operative Governance and Traditional Affairs’ offices, what is the department doing to bolster the role of traditional leaders as is enshrined in our Constitution so that service delivery to the citizens is effectively delivered and that the offices of traditional leaders are properly resourced?

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL

AFFAIRS (Mr M F P Tau): Thank you very much, hon ... [Inaudible.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon Deputy Minister **...** [Inaudible.] **...** there is another question from the ANC. I will expect you to respond to both at the same time. Hon Hadebe?

Mr B M HADEBE: Thank you. Third time lucky, Deputy Minister Tau. COVID-19 has impacted negatively on the global economy, particularly small businesses and rural areas. What role can traditional leaders play in boosting the local economy by using available resources, and what is the department doing to assist traditional leaders in this regard?

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL

AFFAIRS (Mr M F P Tau): Once again, thank you very much hon House Chair, and once again, my apologies.

The questions are probably related because the programmes that we have been working on in this regard are related.

The first is in relation to partnership development. The department has developed partnerships with a whole range of private-sector partners to implement agricultural development

programmes in rural areas, particularly in areas that are ... [Inaudible.] ... under traditional leadership. These partnerships are beginning to yield results and we can make those details, with regard to the results, available.

The second area of focus has been on ensuring that, through the Community Work Programme, CWP, we are able to support traditional leaders in developing programmes, including the debushing of sites and the creation of job opportunities and agricultural development initiatives. So, it’s a relationship between the Department of Co- operative Governance and that of Traditional Affairs, which are two distinct departments, but in this regard implementing the CWP.

Lastly, is in relation to broadly supporting through legislation, facilitating the traditional leaders are able to actively assume their role, and this we have been working on in terms of ensuring that legislation is passed that would enable, not just recognition of traditional leaders, but ensuring their capacitation, support and institutional development so that they are able to undertake their responsibilities.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Thank you, hon Deputy Minister. Hon members, I also wish to remind you that your follow up question or the question that you are asking must be in terms

of the adjustment that has been made. It cannot be a general question, and that is why the hon Minister of Finance could not really answer because he deals with the adjustments in the Budget. So, please restrict your questions to the adjustments. We are dealing with the Adjustment Budget that has been introduced by the hon Minister.

Vote No 15 agreed to (Democratic Alliance, Freedom Front Plus, Inkatha Freedom Party, African Christian Democratic Party and Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Vote No 16 – Basic Education

Mr S L NGCOBO: Thank you, Chairperson. When will the Minister address the nation and give information on which papers have leaked, when rewriting will take place and how much time learners will be given to prepare themselves for rewriting?

Ms N E MOTAUNG: Chair of Chairs, as the ANC we welcomed the Presidential Youth Employment Intervention, which allocated funds towards creating 300 000 opportunities for young people to be engaged as education and school assistants at schools throughout the country. This opportunity will provide skills and experience for our youth and for the unemployed. Minister, how will this

support enhance the effective functioning of schools under the pandemic and what type of support will these young people provide? Thank you very much.

The MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION: I’m here. I’ll just pull off the road. To the IFP, Chair: The reason I’m still in the car is because I’ve come from directly announcing that we will have a matric rewrite because of the leaked papers. I just had a press conference now. The maths paper will be written on the 15th and the physical science paper will be written on the 17th of this month. The learners have less than five days to prepare, but there was nothing we could do because we had no other time that we could allocate. So, indeed, we have taken a decision and we have just announced that there will be a matric rewrite.

Regarding the question from the ANC in terms of the young people who are going to assist us in schools, we are currently training and inducting them. We have been working with a company that works with young people to help screen and identify them to get those young people for us while working with the Setas to make sure that we can skill them accordingly. The janitors are being skilled through our Seta programme and also through our infrastructure programme. For instance, regarding the teacher assistants, we are also working with a number of nongovernmental organisations, NGOs,

to help us train them and prepare them for next year. Indeed, that is going to help us claw back the time that we have lost in terms of teaching and learning because we couldn’t teach properly. That will help us with the recovery programme, and the janitors will also help us with the programmes of fixing our infrastructure so that when schools reopen next year we would have improved our infrastructure. Thank you very much, Chair.

Vote No 17 – Higher Education and Training

Dr W J BOSHOFF: Hon Chairperson and hon Minister, this department’s budget was cut by nearly R10 billion ... [Inaudible.] This means more cost-effective ways of ... free higher education is becoming essential. That is why your ministerial task team on the University of South Africa, Unisa, is so important. The demise of Unisa could be more damaging than ... [Inaudible.] ... triple standards, sir, at poor scale. You mentioned this with inclusive full-time students. Management problems ... [Inaudible.] ... technikon ... [Inaudible.] ... and instability in senior management. Clearly, the future of Unisa is at stake and this corresponds with the informal information. This is ominous, but does not apply to people of that calibre, because ... well, it is something nasty at the braai(??).

Hon Minister, we all look forward to the report, but ... [Inaudible.] ... purses, what exactly ... [Inaudible.] ... troubled you so much that these eminent persons were involved? Thank you.

Ms N T MKHATSHWA: Hon Chairperson, the post-school education and training sector has been significantly affected by the first and second appropriation adjustment. The second appropriation adjustment will have an impact on infrastructure investment in Technical and Vocational Education and Training colleges, or TVET colleges, Community Education and Training Colleges, or CET colleges, and at universities.

Noting the impact of the adjustments, what impact will they have on the student housing infrastructure programme? Will we be able to meet our target of having 300 000 beds over 10 years and in terms of us meeting our targets in implementing the various infrastructure projects within the timeframes we have set? Thank you very much, hon Chair.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF HIGHER EDUCATION, SCIENCE AND INNOVATION:

Thank you, hon House Chairperson. This is Buti Manamela, Deputy Minister of Higher Education, Science and Innovation. I’m going to be responding to the questions.

Firstly, the Minister has received the report from the task team on Unisa and he is considering the report and the recommendations that have been made in the report. Part of those recommendations include, amongst other things, the appointment of an independent assessor and all of that. The Minister is doing everything, together with the department, to ensure that we stabilise the situation at Unisa. We are aware of the concerns that have been raised.

Secondly, regarding the student housing infrastructure programme, obviously, all the departments and government in its entirety have been affected by the budget cuts. But we are hoping that over time we will be able to get back on track with the student housing infrastructure programme and the targeted 300 000 beds in the next

10 years. We are quite hopeful that all of those targets will be met. Thank you very much for those questions.

Vote No 18 – Health

Ms S GWARUBE: Minister Mkhize, we have seen a rising number of COVID-19 cases around the country. The worst affected area is the area with the least amount of capacity to deal with this crisis, the Nelson Mandela Bay area. The President has announced some

stringent measures to help curb the spread of the virus, which is modelled on some kind of lockdown.

The reality is that we need to start looking at long-term solutions for dealing with this pandemic and part of that is a comprehensive procurement and rolling-out plan for a vaccine. Reports have indicated this week that South Africa may have missed the deadline for the first part of the COVAX vaccine procurement process. If this is the case, who dropped the ball – is it you or National Treasury? What is the process that needs to be followed and what were the timeframes for South Africa to receive a vaccine to protect its front-line workers and the most vulnerable people?

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Thank you, House Chairperson. Minister, based on the adjustments that were made in the budgets allocated to the Department of Health as a result of COVID-19 and with the second wave that is hitting us right now, what are the challenges you are expecting your department to experience in terms of financial resources, and, very importantly, how did we identify only Nelson Mandela Bay as a hotspot and not areas on the Garden Route and in the Free State, of course, where there is a very high infection and fatality rate?

Ms N GANTSHO: Chair, the ANC rises in support of the Second Adjustments Appropriation Bill. The important role played by our front-line health-care workers during this pandemic cannot be overlooked. The ANC welcomes the additional allocation of funds towards Programmes 3 and 6. Under Programme 3, an additional R213,371 million is allocated for the appointment and training of community health care workers and outreach team leaders. Under Programme 6, an additional R280,2 million is allocated for the appointment of enrolled assistants/auxiliary nurses.

Minister, how will this additional allocation assist the department’s fight against the COVID-19 pandemic, given the possibility of a second wave? Thank you.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you, hon Chairperson. I hope I can be heard and seen. This is Deputy Minister Phaahla here.

Firstly, on the question from the DA: I don’t know whether the hon Gwarube was listening. I think that the Minister of Finance did deal with this matter earlier on about the issue of the vaccine.

Indeed, the information that we have missed the boat is not correct. We are still in time. Financial resources have been allocated through the Solidarity Fund, and the Director-General of Health has already, together with National Treasury, finalised the

agreement which will be signed with COVAX. That door remains open, and indeed we have the deposit from the Solidarity Fund. We are still in time to get our place to access the COVAX vaccine.

Regarding the NFP’s question, it was not only the Nelson Mandela Bay area that was identified. As hon members would remember, last night, when the President spoke, he mentioned that the Garden Route in the Western Cape was also a hotspot. There is some work that needs to be done. As we speak, Minister Mkhize is in the Garden Route area assessing the capacity and the situation there so that, when measures are undertaken, they will be in line with the situation on the ground.

Lastly, regarding the ANC question: Indeed, the allocation to community health workers and enrolled nursing assistants is very important, both in fighting COVID-19 and having an integrated approach, because we are moving forward with an integrated approach: screening for COVID-19 and community education. We’ll combine COVID-19 and screening and education together with other communicable diseases and noncommunicable diseases.

The enrolled nurses will be working with the professional nurses and also with the doctors to look after the quarantined sites and the isolation sites and also to look after people in the hospitals

where people are quite sick. That is our response, hon Chairperson. Thank you very much.

Vote No 19 – Social Development:

Ms A L A ABRAHAMS: This Budget is in direct contradiction to President Ramaphosa’s economic reform plan as the welfare system is not sustainable and insufficient to break the cycle of poverty. Our country cannot reform when 55% of the country is trapped at Maslow’s hierarchy of needs level 1 focussing on basic needs of food, water, shelter and safety surviving on less than R33 a day.

Oh well, the ANC is salivating at level 5 focusing on self fulfilment with the desire to become the most it can be. Minister, do you honestly believe that this Budget reflects meaningful social protection which is needed for vulnerable groups, individuals and communities to become capable and self reliant as per the Department of Social Development, DSD, new mandate?

Rev K R J MESHOE: Thank you Chairperson. While the importance of social grants for the poor and vulnerable among us cannot be overstated, what is government planning to do to ensure that this programme of social grants remains economically sustainable given

the fact that the number of needy people continues to increase while budget are also being reduced? Thank you.

Ms J MANGANYE: Thank you very much, Chair.

*Xitsonga:*

Holobye, ku ya hi ku hungutiwa ka mimpimanyeto ya timali, ku ringana R700 wa timiliyoni yi tekiwile ku ya pfuneta eka social relief of distress, SRD, hi kombela leswaku mi byela vaaki va AfrikaDzonga swipimelo leswi nga kona na ku va tshembisa leswaku timali ti ta kumiwa hi vanhu lava nga hlahluviwa va tlhela va ringanerile ku kuma mali yo tano. Xana mi endla yini ku sivela vanhu lava nga nghenisa mavoko ya vona hi vukungundzwana eka timali leti? Xana mi nga hi tshembisa laha vanhu vo tano va nga ta helela kona? Ndza khensa.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Chairperson, my apologies the network is very bad. I am in Calvinia, I have been trying to move a bit. I could not hear the question of the ACDP at all.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): May I ask Rev Meshoe of the ACDP to repeat his question so that the hon Minister can hear it?

Rev K R J MESHOE: Okay, Chairperson, I will do so. While the importance of social grants for the poor and vulnerable among us cannot be overstated, what is government planning to do to ensure that programme of social grants remains economically sustainable given the fact that the number of needy people continues to increase while budgets are being reduced? Thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon Mvana, switch off your microphone.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you very much ... [Network challenge.] ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon Minister, we can’t hear you. Hon Minister, what I suggest you can do is to try to get into a place where you are where the connection is better and ...

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: ... I requested that I stay off the video because the network is very bad, I am in Calvinia but I hope that ... [Inaudible.] ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): No, you are very ... [Inaudible.] ... hon Minister. You may continue. Hon Minister, we will come back to you for Vote No 19. Get into a place or get the

hon Deputy Minister to respond on your behalf. We will come back for Vote No 19. Get into a place where there is a better connection.

Vote No 20 – Women, Youth and Persons with Disabilities – agreed to.

(Democratic Alliance, Freedom Front Plus, African Christian Democratic Party and Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting)

Vote No 21 – Civilian Secretariat for the Police Service – agreed to.

(Democratic Alliance, Freedom Front Plus, African Christian Democratic Party and Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting)

Vote No 22 – Correctional Services – agreed to.

(Democratic Alliance, Freedom Front Plus, African Christian Democratic Party and Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting)

Vote No 23 – Defence:

Mr S J F MARAIS: Chairperson, this was an embarrassing year for the defence force and it must be taken into account in considering the Budget Vote. It is not all about your money but whether it is the best value and the highest defence priorities for the little available, or whether the Minister as the executive, physically and morally are putting the best interest of South Africa. This Budget is directly in contradiction with President Ramaphosa’s economic reform plan.

Minister, your ANC visit to Zimbabwe ... [Inaudible.] ... for which we now know that no ... [Inaudible.] ... of an official government meetings exist. Your defence against the Khoza family after the killing of Collins Khoza, the wasteful and illegal R250 million that import of useless Covid-19 medicines from Cuba, certainly questions your executive commitment and competency.

Given all of these, how would you convince us that this Budget entrusted to you, your management and the managing command council should be supported? I thank you.

Ms T I LEGWASE: Thank you very much, hon Chair. Hon Minister, this week the media reported that South African National Defence Force, SANDF, is partnering with AgriSA to sharpen its approach to the roll out of Koba-Tlala. Is the Minister in position to give us the

details on the programme and what it seeks to achieve? Thank you, Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): I have been informed that both the Minister and the Deputy Minister are incapacitated. The hon Minister of Finance will reply to these questions. Hon Minister of Finance, can you assist us?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Thank you very much, House Chair. Fortunately, on the defence matters I am a bit more informed. In the first instance concerning the Zimbabwe issue, I think the President has dealt decisively with this matter. He has reprimanded the Minister and that is a common course.

As far as whether our defence force is ready to protect the country, to the extent that I am aware from the conversations that I’ve had with the higher ranking officers in the defence force, yes, they are ready. There are constrains but they are working on those issues. As far as the operations to farm and grow our own food for the defence force, I understand as well that the programme has been well thought out and discussions are going on with the most competent private sector agencies in agriculture. To the best of my knowledge that is what I can say, House Chair.

Thank you, hon Minister.

Vote No 23 – Defence – agreed to.

(Democratic Alliance, Freedom Front Plus, African Christian Democratic Party and Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting)

Vote No 24 – Independent Police Investigative Directorate – agreed to. (Democratic Alliance, Freedom Front Plus, African Christian Democratic Party and Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: House Chair, sorry, if I may, we skipped very fast past Vote 20. I’ve just checked with the Table. The DA did indicate that we had a speaker listed for Vote 20. I know it’s very unusual to request this of you. I should have picked it up earlier but I did not. Could I nonetheless ask you to take us back to Vote 20 for my member to ask a question?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): I’ll consider doing so, suffice to say on the copy that they’ve given me now, there is no indication that the DA wanted to put a question to the Minister, otherwise we would have called it. But let’s proceed with Vote 25

- Justice and Constitutional Development – and then we will return to that.

Vote No 25 – Justice and Constitutional Development:

Mr G MAGWANISHE: Chair and Minister, to build a capable, developmental and ethical state, it is important to tackle corruption and build strong state institutions such as the National Prosecuting Authority, the NPA.

We welcome the filling of critical vacancies and the commitment to instate the full Aspirant Prosecutor Programme of the new recruits

that will be coming in. Will the NPA be absorbing them after completion of the programme in order to strengthen prosecutorial capacity and maintain stability within the NPA? Thank you, Chairperson.

The MINISTER OF JUSTICE AND CORRECTIONAL SERVICES: House

Chairperson, I request to answer without video, as my network is very weak. Yes, indeed, the programme will strengthen the pipeline for the NPA to develop top-notch prosecutors that will enable us to continue with effective services for the NPA. And, indeed, the aspirant prosecutors that will be recruited will be absorbed within the institution of the NPA as a layer of a new generation of prosecutors that will continue to infuse new life into the NPA. This programme, as you are aware, House Chair, will further benefit the NPA because it will also enable them to recruit from among the best students at universities across the country, which

they were denied at some point. We believe this will do a lot to revive this programme. Thank you.

Ms N N CHIRWA: Chair ... Point of order, Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): What is the point of order, hon member?

Ms N N CHIRWA: I’m asking to make a declaration on Health because my name was sent, but I have not made my declaration.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): No. I called for the EFF and you were not there. I did recognise the EFF. We have gone past that Vote now. The Deputy Minister has responded, and we unfortunately ...

Ms N N CHIRWA: It’s not a question, Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): No; whether it is a declaration or whatever you wanted to do, we have gone past that Vote. The Deputy Minister has responded, and, according to the procedure and the Rules, we then go to the next Vote.

Vote 25 – Justice and Constitutional Development – agreed to

(Democratic Alliance, Freedom Front Plus and African Christian Democratic Party dissenting).

Vote 26 – Military Veterans – agreed to (Democratic Alliance, Freedom Front Plus, African Christian Democratic Party and Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

VOTE 27 - Office of the Chief Justice – agreed to (Democratic Alliance and Freedom Front Plus dissenting).

Vote No 28 – Police:

M. Gen O S TERBLANCHE: Chairperson, my question is: Considering the budget cuts and, obviously, the adjusted budget, how do the police now plan to tackle underperformance in the following areas of their responsibility: crime prevention, the noneffective rural safety plan to curb farm attacks and farm murders, the betrayal of victims of gender-based violence by their dismal performance to test DNA samples and their inability to fix the Central Firearms Control Register? Thank you, Chairperson.

Mr H A SHEMBENI: Chairperson, the dysfunctionality of the Police Service has been laid bare for all to see over the past year. It has been shown that the SA Police Service has never been, at any

stage, capable of resolving policing problems in this country. It is under the watch of the Police Service that we have seen the escalation in gender-based violence in this country. The police are woefully incapable of investigating and bringing the perpetrators of gender-based violence crimes to justice. Many of these cases go unreported, because women in this country have little faith in the police and, in some instances, it is the police themselves who perpetrate these heinous crimes.

While our approach to fighting crime must take into consideration that crime is a socioeconomic consequence and should be fundamentally uprooted by economically developing our communities and providing criminals with quality jobs and careers, there must be actions taken daily to make criminals pay.

There must be certain police stations that will be open 24/7 in every ward of the country where, currently, there are no police stations. This would allow the police to zoom in on criminal hotspots and apprehend criminals much more quickly. Every police station must have officers with specialised skills to deal with cases of sexual violence against, and the abuse of, women and children and to support victims.

There is a need to retrain all police officers so that they are able to process and investigate sexual violence and intimate- partner-violence crimes in a way that takes cognisance of the short-term and long-term mental and physical health of the victims.

The police are unable today to deal with organised crime in an effective manner because very many of them are in the pockets of druglords. There must be a thorough audit of the lifestyles of police, more especially of those serving in drug-infested areas, such as on the Cape Flats. We reject this Vote. Thank you very much.

Rev K R J MESHOE: Chairperson, what is the average national response time for alpha complaints received from the public at 10111 centres compared to what is on the government website, and how does the reduced budget impact on 10111 centres and their response times? Thank you.

The MINISTER OF POLICE: Chairperson, I’ll start with the last question of the hon umfundisi. The response time is different in different areas. For instance, there can be a greater distance from a police station to the point where the matter is raised. The average time is between 19 minutes and 21 minutes for places that

are far away. The average time is between 16 minutes and 17 minutes where police stations are closer.

Regarding the second question, hon member of the EFF, we are specialising in the issue of gender-based violence. That’s why we have 5 534 people who are serving life sentences – not just in prison, but serving life sentences – owing to this speciality that the police is showing there. There are many other cases that have been solved by the police including that of Palesa Madiba. In this case, the perpetrator was found guilty only yesterday. There are cases that have been solved, so it is not true that the members of the police are not really up to the job when it comes to those matters.

Regarding training, it cannot be of all the police. We are specialising, and certain police will be trained in certain matters. Indeed, there will be police that will be corrupt, but many, many police members – thousands of them – are good men and women and prove that are doing their work.

When it comes to the first question, what we do regarding the matters of the DA ... the member from the DA that asked the question. You know that we will have put the new board in place, chaired by capable senior counsel, and we have given timeframes

within which these things are going to be fixed ... with the budget that is there. So, the member is just repeating because ... He is repeating, but all those answers are well understood by the portfolio committee of which the member is a part. In terms of the budget, we will work with what we have and we will work within the budget we have to give the answers to all other questions. Thank you very much, Chairperson.

Vote No 28 – Police – agreed to (Democratic Alliance, Freedom Front Plus, African Christian Democratic Party and Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon members, I want to return to Vote 20. The Minister is on the platform and the Minister is ready to respond. The DA?

Vote No 20 - Women, Youth and Persons with Disabilities:

Mr L MPHITHI: House Chair, the Department of Women, Youth and Persons with Disabilities continues to be a reminder to all South Africans of the failure of government to address the urgent challenges of gender-based violence in the country. Now, I would like to ask the Minister, who has recently approved the appointment of one of her directors’ wives for the position of

director of rights of peoples with disabilities - who is the wife of one of the officials within her department – if she believes that it is correct that an official in her department appoints his wife to a position using his powers? Thank you very much, House Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Is there a question from the ANC on Vote 20 – Women, Youth and Persons with Disabilities? Hon Minister, you may respond ... the hon Minister of Women, Youth and Persons with Disabilities?

Ms T MGWEBA: ANC. Sorry, House Chair. ANC.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (M C T Frolick): Proceed, hon member.

Ms T MGWEBA: Thank you very much, House Chair. Yesterday marked International Day of Persons with Disabilities. Persons with disabilities often feel ostracised and lack proper care. Hon Minister, other than the awareness programmes on the day, has the department allocated resources and considered having a partnership with the Department of Social Development to conduct clinical visits to persons with disabilities in less privileged communities and remote areas? Thank you very much, House Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Thank you, hon member. The hon Minister ... ? The hon Minister of Women, Youth and Persons with Disabilities? Hon members, we have checked that the Minister is on the platform and the Minister, indeed, is on the platform.

There may be a problem. I will return to Vote 20 as well.

Vote No 29 – Agriculture, Land Reform and Rural Development

Ms N CHIRWA: Point of order House Chairperson.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon member of the EFF, what is your point of order?

Ms N CHIRWA: Why are we able to return to other votes but you can’t return to the health vote which I have asked for?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon member, your vote that you wanted to participate in was completed in full. The Minister also responded...[Interjection.]

Ms N CHIRWA: I had not spoken, that’s why I have asked us to return because, I had not spoken... [Interjection.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): No, hon member, I have ruled on the matter... [Interjection.] not the same hon member, we have completed that vote and we are on vote number 29 and that’s why I am recognising the DA.

Ms B M VAN MINNEN: Thank you, House Chairperson, the importance of the agricultural sector was clearly demonstrated during the

COVID-19 period. Despite this excellent effort by the sector, the Department of Agriculture, Land Reform and Rural Development continues to fail the farmers. Only it achieved 69% of its annual targets.

Worse than this, the Department of Agriculture, Land Reform and Rural Development could not even submit the annual report. The department blames COVID-19 for its poor performance, shame on you.

The cuts in the budget is in varied contradiction to President Romaphosa ’s economic reform plan to ensure a thriving agricultural sector. Could the Minister confirm that all staff without comorbidities is back at work? What is being done to ensure that the department functions to its full capacity, in the level of the President’s economic reform plan? Thank you Chairperson.

Ms T BREEDT: Thank you, Chairperson, under programme three the presidential employment intervention is added. The Department of Labour has [Interjection.] [Inaudible.] ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon member from the EFF, do you want to participate in this vote?

Mr M K MONTWEDI: Yes.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Ok, I will come back to you. The hon member from the FF Plus is on the floor as soon as they are done with their input then I will get back to you. Thank you. The FF Plus, you may continue.

Ms T BREEDT: Thank House Chairperson, the Department of Labour has been tasked with the job creation for many years, has the standard mandate since the start of the Sixth Parliament to create jobs and have not succeeded. What would this addition in turn for the Department of Department of Agriculture, Land Reform and Rural Development have sustainable jobs be created at the department’s task effort could not. Although the department employ temporary workers and calls it a job created- because hon Minister no government can create employment sustainable, it should however create conducive environment for job creation. This intervention

programme is a waste of valuable funds. I thank you House Chairperson.

Mr M K MONTWEDI: Thank you very much, House Chair, it is no accident that today, 26 years after the attainment of political freedom only less than 10% of the land has been transferred back to black people, the rightful owners.

The constitutional of the dispossessor, at the right of the dispossessed. It for this reason we argued vehemently that we must amend section 25 of the Constitution as the matter of urgency in order to correct this historical injustice grant.

Even within [Inaudible.] spectacularly after the [Inaudible.] of tenure’s right of those whose tenure to land is perilous. As a results many of those living and working of farms are evicted on a daily basis.

In 24 years later, there’s no comprehensive land redistribution policy or Legislation, as a result of that we have been leaping from one land distribution policy to another, which have led to the enrichment of those in the leadership of the ruling party more than widespread redistribution of the land, when land is given through network of patronage.

We need swift changes in the way we conceptualise land reform and [Inaudible.] must come from the department with a vision for any determination to return back the land to those from whom it was stolen. We reject this budget vote. Thank you very much.

Mr Z M D MANDELA: Thank you, House Chair, the hon Minister, the budgetary review and recommendations report of the Portfolio Committee on Agriculture, Land Reform and Rural Development noted that the fact that lack of adequate funding has on the implementation of the department’s programmes. There is a specific recommendation on reprioritisation of unused funds within the department, to address the sectoral disasters, such as droughts and diseases outbreaks, rather than surrendering the funds to national revenue.

Can the hon Minister explain how the department intents on initiating engagements with the Minister of Finance on the reprioritisation of unused funds and what is the possibility of extending the application of this unused funds towards funding agriculture rural infrastructure programmes? I thank you.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, LAND REFORM AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT:

Thank you very Chairperson, hon members and in particular those members who have raised questions and made comments from the

Portfolio Committee on Agriculture, Land Reform and Rural Development. Some of the statements have actually been the reflection that being made by parties on their own assessment of what is working or what is not working.

For instance, the issue raised by hon Steyn with respect to the capacity in Parliament. Yes, that we are working on and I’m sure she appreciates that this department is one of those that have been reconfigured after 2019, national and provincial elections. So, it’s work in progress, that doesn’t mean we are not doing and delivering on the mandate that we have.

The specific question the hon Steyn asked is; whether all the members of staff are back at work? Yes, they are and actually even during COVID-19, there were members of staff, they were working particularly in the deeds registry, some of them within the departments, veterinarian services, in accordance with regulations that were there, level by level.

The issue raised by hon Breedt, in respect of the mass employment stimulus that had be announced by the President, clearly when it comes to agriculture if hon Breedt noted in the speech of the President. That allocation of one billion is for support to subsistence farmers who actually has... she knows that farmers are

actually self-employed, they also employ those additional workers, those who can have the capacity to do so, but at subsistence level, which is really family farms and not of those people are not just working for food security but it’s self-employment and therefore contribute to the food security of the country as well as economy. So, that one billion will go towards subsistence farmers support.

With regards to the issue raised by hon Montwedi, of speeding up the amendment of section 25 of the Constitution. Indeed, we are waiting for the Legislature including himself, as a Member of Parliament, will do what it’s necessary - after the consultations that have been finished, so that as they finalised the Legislation, and all uphold the Legislation. We will then be able to implement but I must say that on the side of government through the ministry of Public Works and Infrastructure the Expropriation Act has actually been tabled in Parliament and is now in the portfolio committee, who will actually ensure that there is a clearer framework on how expropriation [Inaudible.] of section 75.

In respect of the issue raised by hon Mandela about the need for the department to engage Ministry of Finance around reprioritisation of fund for disasters. In terms of our own system as a country that has been approved, actually the work on disaster

in terms of appropriation and allocation of funds, lie with the Ministry of Local Government with whom we actually collaborate. What we do as the department is to work with various farmer organisation and farm workers those who are affected by disasters that have impact on agriculture and actually use the necessary systems, that are allowed in terms of our legislated framework to appeal for resources, where that is necessitated, [Interjection.] unless Parliament want to change this [Inaudible.] [Interjection.] Thank you very much. [Time expired.]

Vote No 30 – Communications and Digital Technologies – agreed to (Democratic Alliance, Freedom Front Plus, African Christian Democratic Party and Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Vote No 31 – Employment and Labour

Dr M J CARDO: Chairperson, the official unemployment rate is a staggering 30,8% — the highest in 12 years. Yet, this budget is in direct contradiction to President Ramaphosa’s economic reform plan. The budget takes away money from the one functioning entity in the department’s orbit, the CCMA, it continues, unproductively, to pour money down the sinkhole of Productivity SA. If this government wants to enable the private sector to create jobs, then it should put its budget where its mouth is.

Minister, are you prepared to: One, exempt small firms from extended collective bargaining agreements? Two, make it easier for companies to hire workers and tackle youth unemployment with a real youth wage subsidy? Three, let individual economic sectors set their own minimum wages? In the absence of such reforms, the DA cannot support this budget. Thank you.

Ms H DENNER: House Chair, to the hon Minister, as the previous colleague has mentioned, our unemployment rate is north of 30%. The department’s mandate was expanded to include employment creation. There has been no meaningful progress on this front. Productivity SA have concerns about their status as a going concern. The director of the CCMA all back played with the portfolio committee over the immense strain on their resources and commissioners. The Compensation Fund is under intervention with the turnaround strategy, and you yourself refuse to extend UIF TERS to 15 November, citing strain on the UIF funds.

In light of this, how do you envisage the department giving effect to this expanded mandate of employment creation amidst our unemployment crisis with a reduced budget to their disposal when they are already struggling to deliver on their responsibilities? Thank you, House Chair.

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: House Chairperson, to the Minister, I am sure you have picked up during the course of COVID-19 the serious challenges on the number of companies that have not been registering their staff over and above the fact that foreign companies in South Africa are employing foreigners and give pay them a very low rate not registered. What measures will you out in place together with the local municipalities and authorities to have some kind of links so that when licenses are issued to these businesses your department is able to pick up this and ensure that these employees that are working there are all registered? Thank you.

Mr S S SOMYO: House Chair ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF EMPLOYMENT AND LABOUR: Thank you, hon House

Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Who is now saying thank you? Is it the Deputy Minister? Deputy Minister, can you just allow the ANC to ask their question.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF EMPLOYMENT AND LABOUR: My apologies, hon

House Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): We will get back to you. Continue, hon member.

Mr S S SOMYO: House Chair, to the Deputy Minister, about

4,7 million South African workers have received income support to the tune of approximately R53 billion through the temporary employer/employee relief scheme. We have been informed that the need is still great amongst workers who have been laid off due to their companies being forced to close and unions have demanded an extension of the temporary scheme. There have also been allegations that the UIF is not financially sustainable. The questions are: What is the state of the finances of the UIF currently? Secondly, why does government not consider extending the temporary employer/employee relief scheme in order to meet the needs of workers who are still in economic dire strain? That you, Chair.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF EMPLOYMENT AND LABOUR: Hon House Chair, my

apologies once more; I was too fast. Let me start with the last question posed by hon Nontshele. I think at this point in time the UIF is liquid; there is still some funds that we can go ahead to pay our normal UIF benefits to those who qualify. But I must also indicate the fact that the forecast of our actuaries warned that should we continue beyond the agreed or declared timeframe and

timeline we will not be able to cope with additional claims, and we cannot perpetually continue paying claims. At some point we need to stop. Remember that when workers are retrenched we have to pay them benefits for at least a period of 12 months, and during that period the UIF loses income from both the worker’s contributions and the employer’s contribution. So, it is really unsustainable to continue TERS money indefinitely.

If I come to the question that talks to the business licenses that was raised by hon member from the NFP. The issue of the business licenses, and I think we need to agree that through the District Development Model, some of these issues should be channelled to local government through this model. We also need to work together not only as the Department of Employment and Labour but there are many other departments that need to be included in this whole thing. Through us and through other departments, the Department of Home Affairs and though ... [Inaudible.] ... within various municipalities and through the District development model. So, we will not be able to, on our own, come and finalise the issue of business licenses because it should come from the local municipalities. Remember, there is no national office where we are supposed to be operating but we have to be operating through our municipalities.

On the issue raised by the hon member from the DA on the issues of CCMA. Firstly, hon members, for a lack of a better word, it is not true; it is totally false that only the CCMA is functioning and operating well. As much as we delighted about the vote of confidence to this particular entity from the DA I need to also indicate that all the decisions that are taken by government are decisions that are induced by conditions and we are operating in conditions that are not on our own choosing. We do not choose the material conditions, and it is mine and the department’s wish that as much as it is everybody’s wish, instead of taking money away from entities like the CCMA we must inject more money on the CCMA, we agreed on that one. But COVID-19 has forced government to adjust its budget and there is really nothing that we could do there. We had not actually foreseen such a pandemic coming. We allow ... [Time Expired.]

Vote No 32 – Environment, Forestry and Fisheries

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: House Chairperson, to the Minister, I have highlighted this problem previously particularly it is the insolation and the erection of the cellular mast and the rolling out of the 5G and there is enough ample evidence to show the risks to one’s health and these things continued to be rolled out with no engagement, very little or no participation with communities.

What is your department willing to do address this problem so that communities are involved in this and are not put at any risk?

Mr M P M MODISE: House Chair, to the hon Minister, it is important to build a sustainable and environmentally friendly economy. The same is true for post-Covid-19 economic recovery plan. The chemical and waste management achieved only 50% of its target, and the environmental programme only about 27%. What are the challenged experienced by the department that led to poor performance in these two programmes, and what are the plans to help create jobs for young people and women of this country? Thank you very much.

The MINISTER OF ENVIRONMENT, FORESTRY AND FISHERIES: Hon House

Chair, thank you to the hon members for the questions. Let me start with the issue of the 5G. I think I have indicated to the hon member in the past that this is matter falls under the Health portfolio but as I can see that he is deeply concerned about it, I will write to the Minister of Health in this regard.

With regard to the issue that has been raised on environmental programmes and the chemicals and waste branch, I share the concern of the hon members that we need to see all government departments and particularly branches in my portfolio achieving at least an

80% achievement rate. I don’t regard it as being adequate to say by way of explanation that over 60% of the targets were work in progress. I don’t think it is adequate. In this regard I have recently recruited a new deputy director-general for environmental programmes who started at the beginning of November and we are in the process of recruiting a new deputy director-general for waste management branch. I think that these new leaders will assist us in terms of achieving the requisite standard of performance. One would want to say, however, that with regard to environmental programmes, work opportunities created were 73 000 against a target of 67 000. In that regard I think we did better than projected. With regard to youth beneficiation from environmental programmes 53 000 youth benefitted from this programmes as opposed to a target of 44 000. Thank you very much, hon House Chair.

Vote No 33 – Human Settlements

Mr S N SWART: Chairperson, while the National Housing Finance Corporation was commendably leverage funds of R1,1 billon from the private sector resulting in the delivery of 2972 housing units, clearly much more needs to be done but we appreciate the budgetary constraints as pointed out by the adjustment budget we are dealing with today.

One of the impacts of the budget is that the majority of the disclosed fruitless and wasteful expenditure for the current year was caused by interest and penalties charged on late payments to creditors at the national housing finance corporation. Clearly, this can be avoided and the question is; Minister, what is going to be done going forward to ensure that the creditors are paid in due time to avoid interest and late penalties that will save the department a lot of funds? I thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Thank you. The ANC!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS, WATER AND SANITATION: Thank you

Chairperson, ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon Minister, can we just give an opportunity to the ANC to ask the question and then you can respond to both questions at the same time. The ANC! Is there a question from the ANC? Hon Minister, you may respond.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS, WATER AND SANITATION: Thank you

very much House Chair. To the hon member, National Housing Finance Corporation, NHFC has had its difficulties. This is largely due to the fact that we in the legislature have not quite completed the legislation that provides them with statutory regulation and

support to make them an independent bank, to do what is required. So, we have been limping along waiting for the legislation to kick in place.

However, we have restructured the NHFC and the board and we have put all three previously independent banks together and it is in this process of pulling together this bank that we have had some of the glitches that we are dealing with. Wasteful expenditure is indeed part of the problems that we are trying to deal with, especially when it accrues from late payment. The legislation is very clear that all payments should be done within 60 days.

We promise that when the legislation is in place and the bank is fully functional, we will be launching it and thereafter we will not have most of the glitches that we have experienced in the past.

But we are glad that there has been some surplus that has been provided to us and we have been able to build the 2172 units. We hope that next year we will be recording three times more than that. But the biggest straw back in the establishment of the NHFC as a bank is with the legislature as we await the Bill. Thank you.

Vote No 34 - Mineral Resources and Energy

Mr K J MILEHAM: Chairperson, our country is crippled by electricity sought ... [Inaudible.] laid firmly at the feet of the ANC government because of policy uncertainty, irregularly and licensing quagmire and a dysfunctional and mismanaged public electricity entity named Eskom.

There is broad consensus on the need for a properly independent transmission and system market operator. Yet, earlier this year when the DA gave you an opportunity to put such a structure in place, with the e-Mobile, you and your colleagues rejected our proposal and I quote; “with contempt”. You didn’t seriously engage it or seek to find a compromise, and now you are pursuing a nuclear agenda at a time when we can least afford it.

Minister, we have been down this road before. Instead of going for quick win to secure South Africa’s electricity supply, you are seeking the ones which lie in your own pockets. This budget is in direct contradiction to President Ramaphosa’s economic reform plan.

Minister, will you commit to opening our grid to independent power producers as a matter of urgency instead of spending billions we can ill afford on a nuclear boondoggle?

Mr A H M PAPO: Chairperson, on a point of order!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Yes hon members, what is your point of order?

Mr A H M PAPO: The member said the Minister is pursuing a nuclear approach to lie in his pockets. Now, I am surprised because he has not submitted a substantive motion to expatiate the fact that the Minister wants to lie in his pocket through that nuclear energy approach.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon member did you say that?

Mr K J MILEHAM: House Chair, can I read you the line I said?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Yes please, do

Mr K J MILEHAM: I said; instead of going for the quick wins to secure South Africa’s electricity supply, you are seeking the ones which can lie in your own pockets.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): You must withdraw that remark.

Mr K J MILEHAM: I withdraw Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Thank you.

Mr S M KULA: House Chairperson, a while there was an explosion at the Cape Town refinery. This morning there was an explosion at the engen refinery which fortunately did not result in the loss of life. However, will this explosion be potentially linked to an increase in the importance of refined petroleum products in the country; creating pressure on the balance of payment and what is the government’s plan to discuss plant reliability with the owners of domestic refineries? As domestic refineries plays an important economic role.

And to hon Chirwa, I think she must make an urgent call to Papa Bushiri in Malawi to pray for her so that she is recognised next time. Thanks, House Chair. [Laughter.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon members, I have been told that the Minister of Tourism will respond to the questions.

The MINISTER OF TOURISM: Thank you very much House Chair. Let me start with the matter that has been raised by hon Mileham.

Firstly, in terms of the IRP, all energy technologies are being

reflected there. It is a policy. There is policy certainty so the issue of nuclear was not an issue that Minister Mantashe has issued a tender or anything. It is a request for information to test the market if indeed there is an interest in the market.

But if you look in terms of other technologies such as renewable

... [Inaudible.] you are saying that the Minister and the Department of Mineral Resources and Energy has not responded to the President’s economic reconstruction and recovery which is not true. If you look at the commitment of economic reconstruction and recovery plan, you would know that in terms of the work that needs to be done to fast track the P-generation and licence for own use that has been implemented. You look at implementation of the framework agreement for social compact for supporting Eskom.

Minister Gordhan has finalised that work and we are waiting for a date for the social partners to sign. To ensure operational and financial sustainability at Eskom work has been done. We can tell you of the work in looking at the capacity beyond 2021-22, financial year. Also, Eskom is implementing a generation recovery plan which is in the process of procuring additional capacity to balance the system.

So, there is work that has been done. If you look in diversifying of energy resources within the [Inaudible.] in context, the Department of Mineral Resources and Energy released the request for information or proposal for emergency risk mitigation Independent Power Producer Procurement Programme for 2000 megawatts in September 2020. All this is in line with what the President has announced in terms of the economic reconstruction and recovery plan. I am not sure which plan are you reading hon member. Please read the correct plan and then we can be able to account as government in terms of the programme.

Actually, we commend Minister Mantashe and his team in the work they have done so far in terms of the progress around the request for information, around additional generation capacity and around own use in terms of the work. So, do look at what National Energy Regulator of South Africa, NERSA is doing terms of the issues ... [Time expired.]

Vote No 35 – Science and Innovation

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): The next Vote is Vote 35 – Science and Innovation and there is no question.

Vote No 36 – Small Business and Development

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): The next Vote is Vote 36 – Small Business. Al Jama-ah!

Mr M G E HENDRICKS: Al Jama-ah is covered hon Chair.

Vote No 37 – Sports, Arts and Culture

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): The NFP! May I remind the hon members that we deal with the adjustments and not general questions that are put to the Minister. I am going to rule you out of order if you do that. The NFP!

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Chairperson, the NFP is covered. Thank you.

Vote No 38 – Tourism

Mr M S F DE FREITAS: Chair, this government is excellent at practising double speech as it is done in tourism when it preach that tourism is a key economic driver and job creator but does nothing about it. In fact, it does the very opposite by making it difficult for this underfunded sector to flourish. It has been a direct cause of thousands of jobs losses this year.

Of all sectors, it is tourism that was hardest hit, thanks to this government’s economic destructive and job destroying lockdown. To make it worse, government deducted a million rand from its budget. It is clear that all this and the slashing of the budget is a direct contradiction to President Ramaphosa’s economic reform plan. Tourism can still contribute to economic recovery and job creation if a reformed plan is indeed implemented.

What is the Minister doing to ensure that the tourism sector grows and reforms in such a manner that jobs are also created in the sector? Thank you.

Ms M M NTULI: Hon House Chair, the President in absentia and the speakership, hon Chief Whip, the hon members of this august House, I greet you in the name of the ANC and it’s ... [Inaudible.] this afternoon. Hon House Chair, the ANC is in support of Vote 38.

However, my question on the Vote directed to the Minister is as follows: Hon Minister, recently you had meetings with the tourism industry representatives to device a plan of action for reviewing the industry in ... [Inaudible.] of lifting most of the travel restriction.

As we believe that there has to be signage between the industry and the government in order for South Africa to become a

competitive destination of choice, hon Minister, how is your department support the industry; not only to get back on its feet but to also transform it? Secondly, how will the cuts in the second adjustment budget impact the work of your department? And, how are you planning to mitigate the impact of these budget cuts? Thank you very much, hon Chair.

The MINISTER OF TOURISM: House Chair firstly, let me indicate that as the Department of Tourism and government, we remain committed to the growth of tourism sector and also ensuring that we retain and save lives and livelihoods. It is not correct to say that government was irresponsible in making sure that we had lockdown because we had to save lives. We are seeing what is happening globally in terms of retention of lives or where there are no restrictions, we find that lives are lost.

The other issue that we have done as the tourism sector and the tourism department was to work on the tourism recovery strategy that speaks in making sure that we grow our domestic tourism and we have been going across the country ensuring that South Africans hit our call in support of the tourism sector by visiting various establishments and; we have seen in September the growth of tourism in domestic tourism. And, we are looking forward to South Africans supporting us even during the festive seasons. That is

why we have the summer campaign that is enriching in making sure that South Africans know where to go and what is offered in the country.

Indeed, we note that we have cuts but these cuts are part of the programme as government ensured that we can be able to have a fiscal sustainability environment that is sustainable. We have reprioritised our programme. We have not compromised transformational work as we note that we would have naturally taken some of the Small, Medium and Micro Enterprises, SMMEs to global platforms as part of market access. Because there are no exhibitions globally, therefore that money would not been spent so that is why the money has been taken back to Treasury to be redirected to other areas.

The understanding is that once the market opens in terms of exhibition and global participation, we will be able to go back and participate. So, that is how we have redirected the money and that is why it makes sense to be able to take out of that. It is not out of an area of neglect or even us not knowing what we are doing.

The other issue in terms of the work is that we continue to finalise our tourism equity fund programme. We will be launching

it in January as part of the ... [Inaudible.] transformational programme that we have. ... [Inaudible.] ... resources remain within our portfolio and we will be able to implement.

Just to give assurance to the nation that government remains committed to the growth of tourism as part of one of the greatest pillars of the economic development. That is why you would see in the economic reconstruction and recovery that tourism is one of the priorities for us to grow our economy and save jobs. Thank you very much Chair.

Vote No 39 - Trade, Industry and Competition - PUT

*Declaration of vote*:

Mr M J CUTHBERT: House Chairperson, I believe it is prudent to state upfront that this budget is in direct contradiction to President Ramaphosa’s economic reform plan. This government has talked tough, but it has shown no follow-through in making the tough decisions necessary to turn around the ailing economy.

The truth is, South Africans cannot eat aeroplane tickets. The truth is, the average civil servant earns more than the average South African will ever earn in their lifetime. The truth is that

the ANC is not pro-poor; it is a party of the elite and a party for the elite.

This is why; we as the DA cannot support this budget in good conscience. Can the Minister please explain why he and his government have remained silent when he knows full well that this decision will push us closer to the door of the International Monetary Fund? I thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Al Jama-Ah? Al Jama-Ah, do you have a question on Vote 39? No.

Mr M G E HENDRICKS: Al Jama-Ah is covered, hon Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): The ANC? Vote 39, Trade, Industry and Competition, there is no question.

The MINISTER OF TRADE, INDUSTRY AND COMPETITION: House Chair, may

I start by respectfully disagreeing with the member of the opposition, this budget, under very difficult circumstances, seeks to address a capacity for us to grow our economy. It enables – among others – that we have the resources to drive a partnership at sector level to have master plans in the auto, clothing and

textiles, poultry, sugar, furniture, steel industries and others so that we create jobs.

It helps us to ensure that we have the resources to promote the African Continental Free Trade Area which is critical to our long- term future, unlocking a market of 1,2 billion people at a summit that President Ramaphosa will be chairing tomorrow of heads of state and government.

It enables us to defend our markets in respect of trade policy to put in place the kind of measures that we did earlier this year. I’ll give the example of the tariff changes we made in the poultry industry that have resulted in a million additional chickens being produced in South Africa every week. So, from our point of view, these are real, practical, concrete steps that enable us to rebuild the economy, to recover, to reconstruct and to ensure there are jobs for young people and jobs for South Africans. I thank you.

Agreed to (Democratic Alliance, Freedom Front Plus, African Christian Democratic Party and Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting)

Vote No 40 – Transport – put

*Declaration(s) of vote:*

Mr C H H HUNSINGER: House Chair, in the past financial year, the Passenger Rail Agency of South Africa, Prasa, only spent

R2,4 billion of its R10,2 billion budget. In the previous financial year, even less than this was spent of the R12,5 billion budget. Combined therefore, more than R20 billion was banked and not used to improve plane and rail infrastructure, thereby undermining the economic reform ordered by President Ramaphosa.

Twenty billion rand not spent while commuters and passengers rely on trains to get to work, school, and home. Minister Mbalula must explain to the nation how, under his watch, Prasa ended up having more motor vehicles for Prasa staff than moving trains for citizens. I thank you.

Mr K P SITHOLE: Chairperson, with regard to Prasa’s announcement early this year that it will insource 3 100 new security officers, can the Minister provide an update on the recruitment process for the security officers given that no security officers have been updated as yet. What security plan does Prasa have in place in particular, given the higher crime rate during the festive season? Thank you very much, Chairperson.

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: House Chairperson, Minister, this budget does not provide for the additional money that you have promised the taxi industry, if I understand it’s about R2 billion, and you have given them a date as by when you will give them this money. Can you tell us how you are going to get this money and where are you getting this money from? And what is going to be the consequences if you are not able to give them this money?

Mr L K MANGCU: House Chair, Minister, we congratulate firstly for the sterling job you are doing to turn around Prasa. We are fully behind you as the ANC and we fully support Vote 40 of this department. However, can you share with us what your immediate plans are to turn around the situation at Prasa? You have already appointed the new board of which we commend you.

Secondly, on road transport, there has been a reduction of money, especially from the non-toll roads to the toll roads as a result of the late decision on Gauteng Freeway Improvement Project, GFIP, commonly known as e-tolls. Minister, can you tell this House when we can expect a decision finally of GFIP or e-tolls? Thank you, Jola. Qhuba [Forge ahead] Merry Christmas.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF TRANSPORT: House Chair, I will be responding on behalf of the Minister as the Minister is held up.

Let me indicate, starting with the last question on the e-tolls, we are still awaiting the Cabinet, we can be able make a pronouncement as to how we will be dealing with the GFIP matters and non-toll ones but also to indicate that the new board of Prasa has come in and there is an action plan and an agreement that they have signed with the Minister as to how they will be taking issues of Prasa forward. I must also indicate that with the advent of the arrival of the new board, they have already started working in the Mabopane Sector Line, an indication that there is work going on.

They have been to the Gibela Rail Transport Consortium to go and check on the trains and hence there will be probably an indication from the board as to how to increase the locomotives but also the coaches which we have actually seen in the past three years being burned by the vandals and the vandalism that has been happening.

But I also need to indicate that Prasa has had a challenge. A challenge in the sense that there has been a massive handover with respect to the board and therefore no proper decisions have been taken and hence there was no utilisation of the funds as the hon member has rightfully said that the money was banked without being utilised is precisely because there was no board that could be able to take decisions so that we can be able to guide the executive and we believe that now that we’ve got a board that has

been appointed we will see a speedy handover in terms of the programmes and processes that Prasa has put in place.

Let me indicate to the hon member of the IFP that there has been over 2 000 security officers that have been insourced to date and have been deployed to critical stations where we believe in the interest of making sure that there is safety particularly of the passengers we see those security officers. Remember, hon member, in the portfolio committee the Minister had indicated that there will be 3 500 security officers that will be insourced so that we can be able to make sure that the investment that has been done by the government of the Republic of South Africa is secure. But also, hon member, we need to indicate that it shouldn’t be the work of government only, let us also all work towards making sure that these economic saboteurs we are able to deal with because it is very important that we preserve and make sure that our infrastructure is well looked after.

Hon member let me indicate that the Minister had outlined how the relief fund is going to be given to the taxi industry. The only snag that has been there which is not a challenge on the part of the department is the fact that there has not been a quite an agreeable approach by the taxi industry as to how that money should be apportioned out to the relevant members of the taxi

industry. And as soon as the associations have agreed to how the money is going to be allocated to individual operators, that money will definitely be allotted to the members which are supposed to get that money. I thank you, Chairperson.

Agreed to (Democratic Alliance, Freedom Front Plus, African Christian Democratic Party, Inkatha Freedom Party and Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting)

VOTE No 41 – Water and Sanitation – put

*Declaration of vote:*

Mr N SINGH: Hon Chairperson, sorry I think we omitted to indicate that we would ask a question and I believe we have some time left. Could we ask the question?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Since you have time left, I will allow you to ask the question.

Mr N SINGH: Thank you very much; water is life, hon Chairperson. Minister, the COVID-19 has emphasised the necessity for water to be provided to the citizens of South Africa. We all talk about washing hands, clean hands, etc but it’s subject to water being available. Are you satisfied, hon Minister, that your programme to

provide water to all corners of South Africa particularly in the deep rural areas is on track?

Secondly, what findings have been made in regard to the delivery of water by trucks and the corruption that was exposed there? And lastly, this department – before you took over – was one that had a number of governance issues, of corruption; changing of director-generals, etc can you give South Africans comfort that under your watch these matters are being attended to? Thank you very much, Chairperson.

Ms N N SIHLWAYI: Chair, the ANC rises in support of the Second Adjustment Appropriation Bill. The Department of Water and Sanitation, through you Minister, has been at the forefront in the implementation of water of water supply, hygiene and personal protective equipment projects as well as emergency drought and water services intervention across the country in response to the COVID-19 pandemic.

We’ve noted with concern the underperformance of Programme 3:Water Infrastructure where R306 534 000 in a ... [Inaudible.] funds is rolled-over for national COVID-19 and drought emergency intervention. What plan does the department have in place to ensure that these roll-over funds are going to be spent and

provinces and municipalities are going to execute this mandate effectively? Thank you very much.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS, WATER AND SANITATION: House

Chair, in relation to the first question I want to indicate to the members it also covers the question that is asked by the hon chair of the portfolio committee. I want to indicate that we have put together a new programme which we call the master plan for water and sanitation which takes us through what it is that we have not being able to deliver on and what it is that we need to do as South Africans. And I want to underscore this point that is found in the first section of the master plan which has been unveiled has been distributed widely and will now be introduced to Parliament that everybody should understand that South Africa is an arid and semi-arid climate with an average rainfall which is half of what the world gets on an annual basis. This means that in the plan that we had we would like to sensitise people to be mindful of wastage of water and be very prudent in the way that they use their water.

We also want to remind the House that in terms of the Constitution, both we and the municipalities have a responsibility for the delivery of this and in line with that we have been meeting regularly with the Minister of Co-operative Governance and

Traditional Affairs to improve on any problems that we would have had. We are aware of the fact that trucks and corruption have been linked together because of the lack of oversight over this problem.

We had a joint Minister and Members of Executive Council, Minmec with the Minister of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs and we decided that we were going to outlaw trucks that do not belong to a municipality. So, trucking has been outlawed, we just haven’t put in law but in terms of the intent we have communicated this to everybody. The other governance issues that you are talking about we have been working at them largely in relation to the water boards you’ll have seen a great deal of spectacular utterances from those water boards that we have cracked down on because we are quite determined to make sure that there will not be any corruption in any water board. There will be no corruption in the Department of Water Affairs. We’ve established a commission that will look at the disciplinary cases that have been brought to us by the Auditor-General and we are proceeding with that.

We want to send a strong message that water and corruption do not go together. And the underperformance and rolled-over funds I think that there is an explanation. We’ve had an unfortunate

drought and we are going to make sure that we redirect the resources in a way that is most beneficial to everybody. Thank you very much, Chairperson.

Agreed to (Democratic Alliance, Freedom Front Plus, African Christian Democratic Party and Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting)

Vote 19 – Social Development – put.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon members, I now wish to return to Vote 19 where you can recall the hon Minister of Social Development was in an area where connectivity was very poor. She could not respond to the questions that were asked. I now recognise the hon Minister of Social Development. The hon Minister of Social Development.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hon Chair, it says here the video is not available and I sincerely apologise to the hon members. I am in the far flung area of the Northern Cape and the network kept going up and down. I am not sure where did I disappear, but I could not respond to the question that was asked by the hon Abrahams of the DA and respectfully would like the member to please repeat the question.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon Abrahams would you repeat your question please?

Ms A L A ABRAHAMS: Hon House Chairperson, this budget is in direct contradiction to President Ramaphosa’s Economic Reform Plan. As the welfare system is not sustainable and insufficient to break the cycle of poverty. Our country cannot reform when 55% of the country is trapped at Maslow’s hierarchy of need Level 1, focussing on basic needs of food, water, shelter and safety surviving on less than R33 a day. All while the ANC are salivating at Level 5 focusing on self-fulfilment with the desire to become the most it can be.

Minister, do you honestly believe that this adjusted budget reflects meaningful social protection which is needed for vulnerable groups, individuals and communities to become capable and self-reliant as per the Department of Social Development’s new mandate?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon Minister I am also going to request the other parties to repeat their questions so that you can respond to all of the questions when I indicate so.

The IFP.

Mr N SINGH: Hon Chairperson, we have passed on that one. Thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Alright. Al Jama-ah also said that they are covered.

The ACDP.

Mr S N SWART: Hon Chair, Rev Meshoe indicated that he had connectivity issues, but he raised it. I do not know if the Minister got the question. He repeated it twice.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): No the Minister did not hear the question. She only heard part of the question. That is why I am giving you the opportunity.

Mr S N SWART. Alright. We will pass maybe she does recall. For he did repeat the question twice maybe she has got it.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Alright. Maybe the hon member can just submit the question in writing to the Minister and then she will be able to respond.

The ANC.

*Xitsonga:*

Man J MANGANYE: Muchaviseki Holobyenkulu, ku ya hi ku ncinca ka mimpimanyeto ya timali, ku vile na R7 wa timiliyoni leti nga yisiwa eka mitirho yin’wana. Ndzi vutisa leswaku tanihi Holobye, xana mi nga swi kota ku byela vaaki vaAfrika-Dzonga leswi mi nga ta swi endla ku herisa vukungundzwana eka vanhu lava nga nghenisa xandla eku tirhiseni ka timali swi nga fanelanga. Xana mi nga swi kota ku va fikelela vanhu lava nga endla vukungundzwana bya timali leti? Ndza khensa.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon Minister, you may now respond to those questions.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you very much, House Chairperson. I really would apologise to the last question that was asked by the hon member of the ANC. I am not very eloquent and even understand the language and I sincerely apologise. If I get the question I will be able to answer the member adequately when that question is translated for me because I did not understand.

If I go back to the question that was asked by the hon Abrahams, I think she knows very well through our presentations even in the portfolio committee that as a department we are entirely dependent on the overall budget that is presented because we do not only

look at ourselves as the Department of Social Development when it comes to the budget. If we could, and we have a number of times repeated that if we could we could get more budget to make sure that we address the needs and the felt needs of the people of South Africa, particularly the most vulnerable.

Hon House Chairperson, as I am in the Northern Cape I am where the poorest of the poor are. I am where the women and children in particular need most of our services. However, hon Chair, I am aware that we are extending ourselves with this little budget that we have we have extended ourselves as much as we can which can also be seen even in this time of COVID-19 where we extended the normal social grants and we have extended them obviously for a very short of time

However, the President also extended the Social Relief of Distress SRD, grant to R350 up until January. We are as a department continuing to push and look for other avenues of assisting our people in making sure that people not entirely depending on social grants, but we can also work together with other departments, assist in the creation of a conducive environment for people to work for themselves and help themselves.

Hon Chair however, at this point in time when we all appreciate and understand that the economy is not doing very well and therefore we also need to contribute towards ensuring that as the President has put together a package that is supposed to help us with the economic development, we are hoping that engaging with the Department of Small Business Development and for instance all other departments that can be able to assist us in the creation of jobs our people would be better off. I would keep on saying it Chairperson, the budget is not adequate, it is not enough, but we are not working in isolation, we do understand the current conditions which the country is facing. Thank you very much, Chair.

Vote 19 – Social Development – agreed to (Democratic Alliance, Freedom Front Plus, and African Christian Democratic Party dissenting).

Vote No 20 – Women, Youth and Persons with Disabilities - put.

The MINISTER OF WOMEN, YOUTH AND PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES: Hon

Chair, thank you very much for your patience. At the advent of the Sixth Administration, which I had an honour to serve under, as now the Minister of Women, Youth and Persons with Disabilities, I do this for the honour of knowing that we share the responsibility of

taking care of the people with disabilities with the Minister of Social Development who has just spoken before me.

Yes, yesterday I had the honour to preside with the President over the third Presidential Working Group on disability where in the issue of staffing was raised again. We made an undertaking that the post of the deputy director-general, DDG, in our department that will look after the advocacy not the distribution of welfare which SA Social Security Agency, Sassa, and the Minister of Social Development is doing very well will make sure that that is a person with disabilities.

When we were given this responsibility, we accepted this responsibility with full appreciation that we should not compartmentalise because you will find women who are disabled and who are abled. You will find youth who are abled and those who are disabled. There will be people who just live with disabilities, multiple and they need our love and support. However, they say themselves they can take care of themselves, all they need from us is support.

As for the appointment of an official that was raised earlier on, I was asked this question in a portfolio committee and I responded in a form of a letter in writing. On a follow-up meeting, I read

my response in writing because I had to accompany the President to a bilateral meeting on the day when the question was raised for the first time.

Yesterday when the people who represented the people with disabilities in the Presidential Working Group raised this in a very, very patriotic manner that: Can we please that on the position that is still remaining vacant get a person with disabilities? We agreed to that request. [Time expired.]

Vote 20 - Women, Youth and Persons with Disabilities - agreed to (Democratic Alliance, Freedom Front Plus, African Christian Democratic Party and Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

# UNPARLIAMENTARY LANGUAGE

(Ruling)

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon Minister, your time is now expired. Thank you. Hon members, that concludes the question and answer session on the Votes. Hon members, before I proceed to the next item, I want to make the following ruling: You will recall, hon members, that during the question and answer session on Vote No 10 - Public Enterprises, earlier this afternoon. During

his response the hon Minister of Public Enterprises made remarks which I could not hear at the time. The hon Shivambu stood up on a point of order, but instead of addressing the point of order when they had and also made certain remarks towards the Minister.

Subsequently, the hon Shivambu and a number of EFF members were removed from the virtual platform because of their conduct that fall foul of the Rules of the House and I stand by their decision.

At the time it sounded like the hon Minister said Members of the Economic Freedom Fighters were and I quote: “less than honourable.” We have within the limited time check the audio to listen to the remarks of the Minister. I can now confirm that the Minister did indeed refer to members of the EFF as, and I quote: “less than honourable.” This hon members, is unparliamentary and I will now ask the Minister of Public Enterprises to withdraw the remark that members of the EFF are, and I quote: “less than honourable.” I now recognise the hon Minister of Public Enterprises. The hon Minister of Public Enterprises!

The MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES: House Chairperson, I just missed your comments.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Do you want me to repeat the Ruling, hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES: If you don’t mind please.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Yes, I said earlier today during the question and answer session on the Public Enterprises Vote No 10, the hon Minister made remarks which I did not quite hear at the time. The hon Shivambu stood up on a point of order, but also proceeded to make remarks against the hon Minister.

Therefore, subsequently, a number of the EFF members joined in and the action in conduct fall foul of Rules of the National Assembly. I decided to remove these members including the Chief Whip of the EFF, the hon Shivambu, from the platform and I stand by the Ruling.

At the time it sounded like the hon Minister said Members of the Economic Freedom Fighters were and I quote: “less than honourable.” We have within the limited time check the audio to listen to the remarks of the hon Minister. I can now confirm that the Minister did indeed refer to members of the EFF as, and I quote: “less than honourable.” This hon members, is unparliamentary and I will now ask the Minister of Public Enterprises to withdraw the remark that members of the EFF are, and I quote: “less than honourable.” The hon Minister!

The MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES: I have no hesitation in following your guidelines, House Chairperson. Safe to say that ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon Minister, will you just withdraw the remark, please.

The MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES: Yes, sure, I withdraw. [Applause.]

# SECOND ADJUSTMENTS APPROPRIATION BILL

(Consideration of Votes and Schedule)

Discussion on Votes and Schedule concluded.

Vote No 1 - The Presidency - put.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): For the sake of the record of the House, I will identify the parties that object and also call for a division but, may I with respect request the Chief Whips. If you intend calling for a division say so upfront so that I don’t have to go to all the other parties and then return to us for a division. Therefore, I’m recognising you now for Vote 1.

Hon members, before I ask the bells to be rung, we will follow the following procedure because this can take quite a bit of time. It is only for the first Vote that I’m going to ask the bells to be rung for 10 minutes. That is to allow that all members are locked in and Chief Whips must kindly instruct their members who are on the virtual platform and in this House to remain in the House because it will make the work of the Chief Whips easier as the process unfold.

According to the record in front of us there will be 24 divisions that will be called for. Therefore, I request your co-operation otherwise it can be a late evening and it is Friday by the way.

Hon members, the bells will now be rung for 10 minutes.

Hon members in the Chamber, will you take up your sits, please. Hon members, and I’m going to read this division guide for you only once, I will not read it with each Vote, hon Chief Whips if you agree to that. Hon members, the Speaker has determined that in accordance with the Rules a manual voting procedure will be used for each division. Firstly, in order to establish a quorum, I will request the Table to confirm that we have the requisite number of members physically present in the Chamber and on the virtual platform to take this decision. Party Whips will then be given an

opportunity to confirm the number of the members present and also to indicate whether they vote for and against the question.

A member who wishes to abstain or vote against the party’s vote may do so by informing the Chair. Hon members, having confirmed that we have the requisite quorum we will now proceed. The question before the House is that Vote No 1 be agreed to. Voting will now commence, the doors to the Chamber will be locked and members will not be allowed to enter the virtual platform until voting is concluded. Whips can confirm the number of your members present in the Chamber and on the virtual platform and indicate if they vote for or against the question.

Question put.

Division demanded.

The House divided.

Ayes-227: (ANC – 211; IFP – 10; Good – 1; NFP - 2; AIC – 1; Cope –

1; Al Jama-ah - 1).

Noes-64: (DA - 54; FF Plus - 9; ACDP – 1).

Question agreed to.

Vote accordingly agreed to.

Vote No 2 – Parliament – agreed to (Democratic Alliance and Freedom Front Plus dissenting).

Vote No 3 – Co-operative Governance – agreed to (Democratic Alliance, Freedom Front Plus and African Christian Democratic Party dissenting).

Vote No 4 – Government Communications and Information System – agreed to (Democratic Alliance, Freedom Front Plus and African Christian Democratic Party dissenting).

Vote No 5 – Home Affairs – put.

Division demanded.

The House divided.

AYES – 216: (ANC – 211; Good – 1; NFP - 2; AIC – 1; Al Jama-ah - 1).

NOES – 73: (DA - 53; IFP – 10; FF Plus - 9; ACDP – 1).

ABSTAIN – 1: (Cope – 1).

Question agreed to.

Vote accordingly agreed to.

Vote No 6 – International Relations and Co-operation – agreed to (Democratic Alliance, Freedom Front Plus and African Christian Democratic Party dissenting).

Vote No 7 – National School of Government – agreed to (Democratic Alliance, Freedom Front Plus, African Christian Democratic Party and Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Vote No 8 – National Treasury – agreed to (Democratic Alliance, Freedom Front Plus, African Christian Democratic Party and Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Vote No 9 – Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation – agreed to (Democratic Alliance, Freedom Front Plus, Economic Freedom Fighters and African Christian Democratic Party and dissenting).

Vote No 10 – Public Enterprises – agreed to (Democratic Alliance, African Christian Democratic Party, Inkatha Freedom Party and Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Vote No 11 – Public Service and Administration – agreed to (Democratic Alliance, Freedom Front Plus, African Christian Democratic Party and Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Vote No 12 – Public Service Commission – agreed to (Democratic Alliance, Freedom Front Plus, African Christian Democratic Party and Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Vote No 13 – Public Works and Infrastructure – agreed to (Democratic Alliance, Freedom Front Plus, African Christian Democratic Party and Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Vote 14 – Statistics South Africa – agreed to (Democratic Alliance, Freedom Front Plus, African Christian Democratic Party and Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Vote No 15 – Traditional Affairs – agreed to (Democratic Alliance, Freedom Front Plus, Inkatha Freedom Party, African Christian Democratic Party and Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Vote No 16 – Basic Education – agreed to (Democratic Alliance, Freedom Front Plus, Inkatha Freedom Party, African Christian Democratic Party and Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Vote No 17 – Higher Education and Training – agreed to (Democratic Alliance, Economic Freedom Fighters, Inkatha Freedom Party, Freedom Front Plus and African Christian Democratic Party dissenting).

Vote No 8 – Health – agreed to (Democratic Alliance, Freedom Front Plus, Inkatha Freedom Party, African Christian Democratic Party and Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Vote No 19 – Social Development – agreed to (Democratic Alliance, Freedom Front Plus and African Christian Democratic Party dissenting).

Vote No 20 – Women, Youth and Persons with Disabilities – agreed to (Democratic Alliance, Freedom Front Plus, African Christian Democratic Party and Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Vote No 21 – Civilian Secretariat for the Police Service – agreed to (Democratic Alliance, Freedom Front Plus, African Christian Democratic Party and Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Vote No 22 – Correctional Services – agreed to (Democratic Alliance, Freedom Front Plus, African Christian Democratic Party and Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Vote No 23 – Defence – agreed to (Democratic Alliance, Freedom Front Plus, African Christian Democratic Party and Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Vote No 24 – Independent Police Investigative Directorate – agreed to (Democratic Alliance, Freedom Front Plus, African Christian Democratic Party and Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Vote No 25 – Justice and Constitutional Development – agreed to (Democratic Alliance, Freedom Front Plus and African Christian Democratic Party dissenting).

Vote No 26 – Military Veterans – agreed to (Democratic Alliance, Freedom Front Plus, African Christian Democratic Party and Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Vote No 27 – Office of the Chief Justice – agreed to (Democratic Alliance and Freedom Front Plus dissenting).

Vote No 28 – Police – agreed to (Democratic Alliance, Freedom Front Plus, African Christian Democratic Party and Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Vote No 29 – Agriculture, Land Reform and Rural Development – agreed to (Democratic Alliance, Freedom Front Plus, African Christian Democratic Party and Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Vote No 30 – Communications and Digital Technologies – agreed to (Democratic Alliance, Freedom Front Plus, African Christian Democratic Party and Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Vote No 31 – Employment and Labour – agreed to (Democratic Alliance, Freedom Front Plus, African Christian Democratic Party and Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Vote No 32 – Environment, Forestry and Fisheries – agreed to (Democratic Alliance, Freedom Front Plus, African Christian Democratic Party and Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Vote No 33 – Human Settlements – agreed to (Democratic Alliance, Freedom Front Plus, African Christian Democratic Party and Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Vote No 34 – Mineral Resources and Energy – agreed to (Democratic Alliance, Freedom Front Plus, African Christian Democratic Party and Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Vote No 35 – Science and Innovation – agreed to (Democratic Alliance, Freedom Front Plus, African Christian Democratic Party and Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Vote No 36 – Small Business Development – agreed to (Democratic Alliance, Freedom Front Plus, African Christian Democratic Party and Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Vote No 37 – Sports, Arts and Culture – put.

Division demanded.

The House divided.

AYES – 227: (ANC – 211; IFP – 10; Good – 1; NFP - 2; AIC – 1; Cope

– 1; Al Jama-ah - 1).

NOES – 84: (DA - 54; EFF – 20; FF Plus - 9; ACDP – 1).

Question agreed to.

Vote accordingly agreed to.

Vote No 38 – Tourism – agreed to (Democratic Alliance, Freedom Front Plus, African Christian Democratic Party and Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Vote No 39 – Trade, Industry and Competition – agreed to (Democratic Alliance, Freedom Front Plus, African Christian Democratic Party and Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Vote No 40 – Transport – agreed to (Democratic Alliance, Freedom Front Plus, African Christian Democratic Party, Inkatha Freedom Party and Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Vote No 41 – Water and Sanitation – agreed to (Democratic Alliance, Freedom Front Plus, African Christian Democratic Party and Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Schedule put and agreed to (Democratic Alliance, Freedom Front Plus, African Christian Democratic Party and Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

15TH ORDER / LB: 10/12/20 at +-7:40pm / TAKE ENDS AT 18:07 TAKE 1248 STARTS AT 18:07

# SECOND ADJUSTMENTS APPROPRIATION BILL

(Second Reading debate)

There was no debate.

Bill read a second time.

# FAREWELL SPEECHES

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: House Chairperson, what a pleasure it is for me to rise tonight, look around this House, see so many people and say to you 2020. Who would have thought? Who could have imagined that we would be in this House having to pinch ourselves thinking that we are living through a real life pandemic? It is not a movie; it is not a drill; this is actually real. I think it would only be correct for us to remember with great fondness those who sat with us and are no longer with us in this House. May they sit alongside the divine and may they rest in eternal power? Their lives will always be remembered, their contributions will never be forgotten and they will always be missed.

We also give great thanks to those who were ill and who fought the battle and who now sit back with us. We are delighted and relieved that your health is restored and we give thanks to the Almighty that you sit alongside with us. Colleagues, there are some of us who are still fighting the battle. Many of our colleagues are ill at the moment. Please know that our thoughts are with you, we are fighting alongside you, we are sending you our love and our best wishes and all we want is to see you back in the House next year.

To our fellow South Africans, we are all in this together. Only behavioural changes will make that we can beat this virus. We must make sure that the elderly and the vulnerable are kept from unnecessary contact, that public transport is continuously sanitised, opened windows and masks are always worn. In public we must make sure that we mask up. We must distance and avoid large gatherings, constantly sanitise.

Fellow South Africans we have the power to beat the spreading of this virus. We have to stop the spreading of this virus.

As Parliament, we have an absolute obligation to ensure that our government ensures that payments are made on time for the vaccine. We have an absolute obligation to ensure that those who committed corruption that has cost lives to South Africans are caught then

charged and then thrown into jail and that we make sure that the keys to those jail cells are flushed down the toilet.

A pandemic brings out the worst in humanity but it also brings out the best. We have seen South Africans come out and cleaned, clothed and feed the poor and we have seen South Africans fight for rights and we have seen South Africans really showing what Ubuntu means in everyday life. We have managed to laugh during this pandemic and through all our pain. This year, 2020, I think will always be remembered as the year that we had the following phrases more than any other: can you hear me; am I audible; you are on mute; I will turn off my camera; please mute; my system is faulty and let us not forget having to scream to our computers, turn your video off. [Laughter.]

In this House, we have seen some members in their cars; we have seen some members going shopping; some going to the bathroom and almost going to the toilet. All in all we have done a pretty good job. Parliament had to adapt and adapt very quickly to what has become the new normal but let us be honest friends and colleagues; to assist human beings is not normal. It is not normal for us not to want to be together. People were scared and certainly tempers were very short and very afraid. I have certainly lost my temper

more than a few times, far too many times, quite frankly, over issues that normally would not have bothered me.

If you have been on the receiving end of my unusual snap, I apologise unconditionally and I completely blame on me. We have to fight it. The scourge of hate is being paddled by the extreme left and their extreme right and the rational centre has to hold. I have every intention to focus all my efforts to nation-building and to eradicating hate. No one is born hating, hate is taught.

Let us, as Parliament be the example of how this particular hate is eradicated.

To the staff of Parliament, thank you all for your exceptional service during this ridiculous time. Always a smile and always a phone call away. Your actions have not gone unnoticed and we appreciate you all tremendously. To my fellow Chief Whips, thank you for all your hard work, for the laughs, sometimes they were tears, for the overall camaraderie especially to the hon ANC Chief Whip. Allow me to say this:

*IsiXhosa*:

Ndiyabulela ngobubele bakho. [Kwaqhwatywa.]

*English*:

Colleagues, the DA wishes you joy, happiness, safety, good health, time with your family, time to relax, time to reflect, time to pray, time to come together safely and above all we wish you everything of the best for the Christmas season and for 2021.

Allow me to end by saying something highly unparliamentary. Futseek 2020, may God bless you all. [Applause.]

Ms S TAMBO: Hon Speaker, I will be taking a speech in place of hon Mente.

The SPEAKER: Please Proceed.

Ms S TAMBO: Hon Speaker, as a point of departure we would to congratulate the EFF Students Command at the Mangosuthu University of Technology and the Durban University of Technology for successfully pick and retaining the SRC power in those institutions of higher learning. Indeed, we have ended as the EFF the year on a high note by showing that we have expression among the youngest and the most intelligent in our country’s institutions of higher learning.

The EFF takes this opportunity to bid farewell to all Members of Parliament except those who do not believe in the Expropriation of

Land without Compensation and definitely except those who uphold white supremacy, capitalism and racism. We take this opportunity

to wish all the people of South Africa a safe and sound festive season. A festive season is a period upon which families must spend time with their families, members must spend time with their families, go to holidays, attend weddings and other festivities.

In South Africa however and for a considerable amount of time, the festive season also comes with a lot of unavoidable deaths with road accidents and due to increased alcohol inspired violence. The year 2020 was very difficult for many people due to the outbreak of the Covid-19 pandemic. More than two million South Africans lost their jobs as a result, meaning that the levels of poverty particularly to black people deepened.

The people of South Africa are poorer in 2020 than they were in 2019 and the previous years. What is evident about the activities and developments of 2020 is that the ANC-led government does not have the capacity and the will and determination to safeguard the lives and the livelihoods of the black people. Instead we have assembled all available and that time scarce resources. Public representatives from the ruling party chose to steal money meant for personal protective equipment, PPE and they chose to steal

food parcels. They chose to create friction and temporal hospitals so that they can be paid in bribes.

On the contrary the EFF and all its public representatives sacrificed 33% of our salaries to contribute to the efforts to fight the Covid-19. As a result the EFF is number one in terms of all payroll contributions to the fight against Covid-19 towards the Solidarity Fund. The EFF contribution far exceeds the contribution of the entire government inclusive of the President, Cabinet members, premiers, MECs, mayors and members of the mayoral committees. This is again the demonstration that the EFF is a truly and genuine and the only organisation that cares about the people of South Africa.

The EFF has demonstrated genuine love to the people of South Africa and the people of South Africa should always bear in mind that the EFF is the only organisation that cares and has built capacity, provide quality, alternate governance to the mediocrity that is currently subjected to our people. We take this opportunity to wish all South Africans and all Africans in the continent and Diaspora a happy Christmas and a merry New Year.

Our simple and consistent message is that the people must share and must share with those who do not have. Our simple message is

that those who help those who do not have must not do so because they want to generate contents of camera for Facebook, Twitter and Instagram. When you give, let the left hand not know what the right hand is doing.

In the beginning of 2021 hundreds of thousands of students will be going to the universities of technology and Tvet Colleges to study their post secondary education. We call on all the first-year students to visit the help desks of the EFF Students Command because that is where you will find dependable assistance and induction in their areas of study.

Hon Speaker, in 2021 the EFF is going to rescue the majority of the municipalities from misgovernance of different corrupt ruling parties and coalitions in all parts of South Africa. We call on all members of the EFF in all branches and in all communities to appreciate that their government in waiting. Our members must from January interact with communities and provide them with whatever form of assistance that they need.

In conclusion, we wish to remind that all of our people that Covid-19 pandemic is still with us and we must all do everything in our power to avoid contracting the disease. The reality is that, we as people of South Africa cannot depend on government to

safeguard our health in the realities that we are on our own. The people must avoid unnecessary gatherings and must instead stay at home with their families. Our people can still listen and dance to *John Vuligate, amanikiniki, uthando, mali eningi, uLazi, Jamani* and all sorts of songs and premium songs by our artists in their homes instead of huge gatherings and parties that will compromise their health.

Let us stay and cautious from this dangerous disease and will once again take this opportunity to wish all South Africans and Africans in the continent a merry Christmas and a happy New Year. We further wish to reiterate our message to the government of Uganda to stop persecuting its political opponents, particularly Bobby Wine in efforts to retain power at a despotic and corrupt regime. We must take a stance against violence all across Africa. All forms of terrorism ranging from the north of Nigeria and in Mozambique. We call for a free and peaceful elections in Ghana and demand that President Yoweri Museveni must stop using violence to suppress political opponents. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Before I call you hon Singh, may I just remind you hon members? Farewell speeches are supposed to be about you, are supposed to be merry, are supposed to reflect on what we have done and what we are going to do.

Mr N SINGH: Hon Speaker, I can’t say I agree with everything said by the last hon member except to that knowledge is good wishes as part of the speech. I think today’s plenary adequately encapsulated the parliamentary year of 2020. It was a tumultuous and unprecedented year filled with uncertainty and many surprises. It certainly exposes many shortcomings that we face as humanity most notably our collective greed for economic gain over everything else, particularly in this instance as regard the expectation of [Inaudible.] which appear to have been originating cause of the first outbreak of COVID-19 in a wet market in Wuhan, in China.

It has also exposed an inability of our greatest mind in medical science and technology to timeously deal with and find solutions to these kinds of pandemics. However, at the end of the day this is the position that we find ourselves in. Did we rise to the occasion and find solutions to the many difficult challenges we face? I am asking. The answer is twofold. Some in the scientific and political world may say, yes, we immediately locked down our respective territories. However, this is cool comfort to the families of the 1,5 million victims who succumbed to the viral world wide thus far despite the best efforts of our global medical institutions. Many of our colleagues and thousands of citizens

lost their lives to this dread virus. We reiterate our heartfelt condolences to their loved ones.

Hon Speaker, the global economy is in tatters and will take years to recover. Companies have been shut down and millions have lost their jobs. This is a hard but veritable truth that we all need to take responsibility for.

Closer to home and as Parliament we could ask ourselves, did we rise to the challenge? In many ways the answer is, yes. We were all forced to adapt to ways of conducting our parliamentary oversight duties from a hybrid physical virtual platform. In the main this worked out pretty well and we have been able to hold the executive to account. But we could have done better. In the beginning of the lockdown the executive had a much appreciated consultative approach, but as the year progressed this became less and less the case. There must be greater degree of accountability by the executive to Parliament. Parliament must be included in the process. If we do not include the people’s political representatives, then you do not include the people in your decision-making processes.

We remain on the presumption with regard COVID-19 and we do not know if a second wave is on the horizon and we do not know what

will happen to us come winter 2021 as COVID-19 could thrive in the colder weather. The year 2020 can be described as an annus horribilis and is most certainly not a year any of us will look back upon with any sense of calm and peace. However, let us have faith and proceed into the new year with a sense of optimism that solution will be found and the global crisis averted.

Our special thanks must go to you, hon Speaker, and all the presiding officers and staff of Parliament for performing exceptionally well particularly those in the information and communications technology, ICT, division tasked with the ensuring our rapid transformation to a virtual platform.

On behalf of our leader in Parliament, His Excellency Prince Buthelezi, and all IFP Members of Parliament, MPs, I wish you all a very happy festive period with your families and look forward to see you all in the new year. I thank you, hon Speaker.

Dr C P MULDER: Hon Speaker and hon colleagues, once there was a military parade and there was this huge battalion of thousands of soldiers marching by. In the pavilion was one mother that was very that was very enthusiastic and supportive. Then she said look my son is the only one that is in pace. All the others are out of pace. I think I heard a speech just now that young person was and

what that mother said. This is time for everything. Today is the time to say goodbye to everybody and to say thank you for the year. It is not a time to score political points. We can all do that, but it’s not the opportunity.

The hon Mazzone started off by bringing to us all the different things that were said and new phrases used because of the situation we are in this year. I can associate with all of them but she forgot one, there is an important one that she did not remember. I hear that one quite often. That was the one that said, my gadget is not working. I think that was one that we also heard on the social platforms during this period.

Colleagues, we are living in the most extraneous year and I would almost say probably in a century. It is the most extraneous year probably in a century. My own mother is 93 –years-old. She has never experienced a pandemic like this - none of us had. It’s absolutely extraordinary times that we have gone through and I think it is an absolutely wonderful situation that we did manage to keep Parliament going and setting an example in that fashion.

Today, I want to say to our colleagues that the colleagues that attended Parliament here physically, I think we should also honour them for being here and for doing what was needed to be done.

[Applause.] We have all set an example in that fashion. I would like to say thank you to the staff of Parliament who also had to co-operate and continue with their work under these absolutely difficult situations. Thank you for everything that they have done.

I want to say thank you to the presiding officers. It was a completely new situation to deal with - having members in the Chamber, having members on virtual platforms and having the executive and people at different places. But we have gone through these process, and I want to say thank you to the presiding officers.

To my colleagues in Parliament, all of you, thank you for “komradarie” [ ]for the way that we’ve conducted ourselves. We have set an example of, I think, how it should be done.

To the Chief Whips also, Chief Whips of whom I had to co-operate from my side and whom we have to work together. I had a look at the hon Chief Whip of the ruling party, and as always she surprised us in the perfect and beautiful way that she dress herself when she come to Parliament also today. Thank you very much for that. [Applause.]

Colleagues, we’ve come to the end of a very difficult year and I think we all have earned a time to rest, go home, think about things and to recuperate in terms of charging our own batteries. Next year is going to be a difficult year. We all know, it’s politics and we are all politicians. It’s going to be lecture year and it’s not going to be easy. But the fact of the matter is that we will continue all of us. I want to say to our colleagues, go home, rest, recuperate, and enjoy time with your families. Have a wonderful blessed time, Christmas time. Come back safely next year.

Last of all I want to say let us not forget our own colleagues who were with us here when we started this year 2020, and we didn’t know what was going to happen. Let us not forget anyone of them.

Thank you. [Applause.]

Mr S N SWART: Speaker, I’ve been looking forward to this year and my scripture for the year was 2 Chronicles 20:20, and it speaks about a great multitude coming against you. But verse 20 says:

Believe in the Lord your God, and you shall be established; believe His prophets, and you shall prosper.

Yes, we have experienced this virus and yes, we are standing today strong.

It’s been a time of standing and believing and as one of the first to be tested positively for COVID-19, I was deeply moved by the many messages of support I received from members across political parties. Thank you, Chief Whip from the ANC, the DA and across party lines for your wonderful message. Almost everyone was saying that they were praying for us in the ACDP. I really, really appreciate that and this gives one hope. It shows there is a deep reservoir of faith and hope in this nation that we can draw on in difficult times which can and should bind us together. The nation looks to us as leaders for hope. We have a ministry of reconciliation and a ministry of love and let us not forget that.

So sad and important to stop and reflect on the lives that have been lost in the nation including a number of our colleagues. I am still shocked about Advocate Hishaam Mohamed from the Justice committee. He has just passed away so quickly. He has been speaking to me here. I would urge there is a remembrance pluck in the gardens here and I would urge the Speaker that the names of all members are put there and we go and just spend a bit of time there in reflection and prayer to remember those members. Let us not forget that. let us remember all those in a nation that are

struggling at this time due to financial, psychological, family, health and other reasons. But let us also be grateful for those that have recovered from COVID-19, from other illnesses and for all the health and doctors at the frontline at this time.

Speaker, it is very important to take a rest. We know as Christians that there is one of the 10 commandments to keep the Sabbath rest. It is a commandment, and it is not a suggestion. Jesus says come to me, all you that are weary and are carrying heavy loads, and I will give you rest. So, let’s do that; let’s have a time of rest.

I wish to thank the Speaker and all staff members, the Whips that are involved, all the staff we appreciate you, we appreciate the ICT section and all the media. It is so important for us to remember and be grateful for each one.

Lastly, I would like to just wish everyone on behalf of the ACDP a very blessed Christmas, a time of rest with our families. May I just conclude with praying a blessing on each of you and it is an ironic blessing which says, may the Lord bless you and keep you, may the Lord make his face shine upon you and be gracious to you, may the Lord lift up His countenance upon you and give you peace.

“Malibongwe igama le nkosi” [Praise the name of the Lord]. “Prys die Here se naam” [Praise the name of the Lord]. Amen

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Hon Speaker, 2020 has been a very difficult year for us, but with that difficulty, it taught us how we could do more with less. I remember sitting here with three different devices on trying to attend three different meetings at the same time and Of course sometimes making a mistake having the audio on and the Chairperson in the other committees were busy speaking but I don’t want to hear hon Dhlomo. These are some of the challenges that we have faced but I think it taught us a hell of a lot.

This pandemic also had a very psychological effect on many of us and many of the people on the ground as well. Despite our differences in the House and yes indeed we attack each other but we always agree to disagree and rose to the occasion.

Millions of people in this country have lost their jobs, businesses have closed down and they now need more than ever direction and leadership from us as Members of Parliament and public representatives.

Hon Speaker, I must admit that the parliamentary staffs have done exceptionally well. I know have been calling some of them even at

late hours of the night checking on the programme of the next day and other things but I must admit that they had really been exceptionally in that.

On behalf of the NFP, my leader Zanele kaMagwaza - Msibi and all us here, we want to extend to you hon Speaker, the Deputy Speaker, all the presiding officers, my colleagues in this House I want to apologise for the mistakes that we have, caught on your nerves but I must admit that was only in the days work. My prayer to the Almighty God is to protect each and every one of you. Let us not forget during this time that much more people will be vulnerable and going hungry so we will donate. Let us donate abundantly to many others that are less fortunate on the ground. We will also be able to share and enjoy this festive season and we wish that all of us will be back in the New Year ready to do another piece of work.

But I think what is very important, we need to take stock of what we have done in 2020, what we have achieved, what we have not achieve, what we could do differently to what we have done today to achieve a lot more. God bless you all and thank you very much to the parliamentary staff. Thank you. [Applause.]

Mr L M NTSHAYISA: Thank you very much, hon Speaker. Also thank you for the guidelines that you have just given otherwise I would have come with the different speech here if got them earlier on. The year 2020 has appeared to be very long and difficult due to the Covid-19 challenges. Thanks God that we have come so far up to here.

Let me on behalf of the AIC to bid the farewell to each and every hon member as we are going home and meet our families. In the mist of the Covoid-19 challenges as Member of Parliament we had to soldier on and carry out the mandate that was given to us by the people who voted us.

I also wish all members a Merry Christmas, good New Year and they should enjoy the festive season. In particular hon Speaker, I wish to say I did enjoyed the work that you were doing with the committees on which I am serving, the Committee of the Department of Higher Education, Science and Innovation which is the only committee that gave me chance to go on oversight to Gauteng, not even one besides this one. So being an alternate member indeed under hon Chairperson Mapulane, also the Committee of Sports Arts and Culture under hon Beauty Nomvuzo Dlulane, Committee on Basic Education under hon Bongiwe Pricilla Mbinqo-Gigaba, then the one

Committee Agriculture, Land Reform and Rural Development under Nkosi Zwelivelile Mandla Mandela.

I cannot leave out the Chief Whips Forum under the ethical and good leadership of hon Chief Whip of the Majority Party, hon Pemmy Majodina. I remember, she had to invite me to come closer to Parliament as I had a problem now with connectivity athome. That was a sign of good spirit and hospitality. I did appreciate that.

I also did enjoy working with all the members in Parliament. Let us go home. Let us behave. Let us follow the Covid-19 protocols. Let us protect women and children against violence. Let us not drink and drive. Take care and enjoy until we meet again. Thank you very much. [Applause.]

Mr W M MADISHA: Hon Speaker, we are all here because we were sent by the people of South Africa. The day DA had given what we all promised we would do for them although the majority faced terrible problems they did not send one political party to this people’s assembly. They send 14 political parties which all promised the people that they would do something to alleviate whatever problems the people have.

Yes, as different parties and members, we actualise to the best of our ability that which we promised South African people. We debated and agreed. We confronted each and owe one another and became angry. We mimicked and had angered other people but we shared the same thing, and that is a common deployment to this House.

We shared a success of the people’s struggle and that is a democratic, I emphasise the democratic elections. Will be it they come after every five years. We also share a major failure and that is the non delivery of services to the poor. The majority of course, a very close, a friend of mine whom I actually have never met in person was correct when he analysed the consequences of a revolution and he ascertain that consequences of inequality would be concentrated in the hands of the few and productive power in the hands of the many. I say this because he was correct. Yes, we do have power ourselves here but then the people who have the actual power are the minority, the minority who are those, they are the people who sit in the offices. You here, you make laws. We come up with laws but then the people who must actualise those particular laws are the people who are the bureaucrats who are sited in the offices.

Now when we meet next year, we need to say how we make sure that everything moves on properly. I want to thank all the members, all the chairs who have make sure that everything moves properly. But above all I want to thank you, hon Speaker; many I know amongst us were in the country, they don’t know that you were the first smallest little girl in the bush who was there fighting for the liberation of our people. I want to thank you. I know we do box some of the times when I was a professional boxer myself but then I do recognise the fact that you are here to carry that big machine to make sure that you contributed to where we are at this particular moment. “ke a leboga"[Thank you.]. [Applause.]

Mr M G E HENDRICKS: Hon Speaker, while I was waiting for the chair of chairs to call my name that we are a bit slower and you had to press your button very quickly otherwise she moves on to the next speaker. I had a call from my physician to give me the good news that there are antibodies of Covid found in my blood. I remembered our own President asked us in the last day of this Parliament to remember all those who died and all those who are still being treated and all those who are recovering. I just hope that those members of this House who had Covid that they also have antibodies to help us especially if the second wave comes.

The year 2020 is a year that all of us will remember for many years to come. Al Jama-Ah hereby thanks everyone in the House irrespective of political affiliation for the pleasant and warm manner which we have conducted proceedings of Parliament.

All members’, Speaker and staff of Parliament have worked hard and now deserve a break. What some colloquies were affords opportunity to service in committees and really get to know each other and learn and discovered that all have common goals which is close to their hearts. We all love our country and have wishes to improve the condition of our people. We have shared the right moment, admits the shouting, disagreements, political scoring debates across the floor and visual platforms. These disagreements were done in different ways and to say how we think is best to serve our people.

We disagree sometimes in a robust manner to get to our political across to highlight the challenges that we can face and ensure that a voice of the voiceless are being heard and act on.

I want to congratulate this Parliament for opening itself to the streets. I think that is very important that we have achieved. I had seen the hard work that political parties are doing when we have our constituency breaks. In fact this week many of them like

he FF Plus have indicated that they have programme of taking Parliament to the streets. We thank the President for the co- operation and paving the way to unforgettable year. We thank you Speaker, hon Thandi Modise, the Deputy Speaker and the Secretary of Parliament and all staff for the hard work and also the head of government business, the hon Deputy President

Lastly, despite 2020 being a year of challenges to all of us, we wish to extend our prayers to those who lost their dear ones due to Coronavirus. We wish all citizens infected by the virus a speedy recovery. While we are spending quality time with our dear families and friends, we urge every South African to wear a mask, sanitise our hands and adhere to social distancing, stay safe, healthy and a joyous festive season to all. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: Thank you, hon

Speaker, hon Members of the Executive, hon members, good evening. On the eve of the new year, in 2019 we were all looking forward to the new year 20 Plenty. We even sent each other messages wishing everyone all the best for the year 20 Plenty. Little did we know that this year will bring us pain and sorrow. Little did we know that the year 2020 will plunge the global community to crisis.

Little did we know that millions of people globally will succumb

to this pandemic. Little did we know as South Africans that three months down the line, will on the hard lockdown.

Our government did this in order to preserve lives and save lives. We applaud our government for thinking highly of us, as South African people not to put the economy before lives of our people. Economy, you can rebuild it but the lives of people you will not rebuild it.

While we are steal on the pandemic hon Speaker, we echo the same sentiments, echoed by our State President Cyril Ramaphosa ...

*Siswati*:

kutsi asichubekeni, kuba sesigabeni 1, akusho kutsi ikhorona ayisekho, siyabona kunehlasela kwesibili, bantfu bakitsi bayafa. Asichubekeni sitifake letifonyo, asichubekeni sichelelane, asichubekeni sigeze tandla ngemanti nangensipho, kanye nawo lamasanithayza asiwasebentiseni.

*English*:

Hon Speaker, we were not spared as this Parliament as well. We lost our colleagues through this coronavirus pandemic. Coronavirus will be with us for some time to come. We are forced to live

within our new normal, which is the social distancing, sanitizing, washing of our hands and putting on our mask at all times.

Hon Speaker, a special thanks goes to our Chief Whip, hon Pemmy Castelina Majodina [Applause.] Who was always there with the families of those hon members, who lost their lives. She was there physically in all the provinces to comfort them. She was also there for those Members of Parliament who were infected, and who have recovered from this coronavirus. She has been with us through our pains, through our difficult times. Hon Speaker allow me to send a special thanks to our Chief Whip, comrade Pemmy Majodina [Applause.]

Don’t expect us to thank you, hon Chief Whip, its only God who will reward you. Keep that caring spirit of yours and also keep up that caring nature of yours. God will bless you and your family abundantly. Thank you very much. [Applause.]

Hon Speaker, let me also thank our government for creating the solidarity fund, that is created to receive funds which will assist our frontline workers with personal protective equipment, PPEs, our vulnerable societies who lost their jobs because of this coronavirus, our vulnerable societies who are poor, who are receiving the coronavirus special grant from our government.

Let me thank all hon members and parties in this House who donated, through their kindness to this solidarity fund. May our God, Almighty bless you all, for your kind-heartedness.

Let me also thank all South African citizens, who also kind- heartedly so, donated to this coronavirus solidarity fund, thank very much.

*Siswati*:

Siyabonga kakhulu, siyabonga.

*English*:

Let me also thank my party, hon members of this House, who also contribute to this solidarity fund. As the ANC Members of Parliament, MP, we contributed R5,3 million to the solidarity fund [Applause.] and also thank Members of the Executive who each one of them contribute one third of their salaries for three months to the solidarity fund [Applause.]

It is sad though hon Speakers, that when these contributions were made, they were made out of the goodness of the hearts of these members of Parliament and South African citizens, unfortunately some people, saw a gab in which they can get into this funds, to enrich themselves. Those people will burn in hell, they will not

be blessed, they will not be blessed because they stole from the poor and vulnerable. These funds were meant to assist during these difficult times of coronavirus.

We therefore applaud abo*-JOHN VUL’IGEDI,* the Hawks and Special Investigating Unit, SIU, for investigating and arresting those who are implicated into defrauding the state of this solidarity fund [Applause.] Thank hon Speaker.

*Siswati*:

Sibonga bonkhe bantfu baseNingizimu ne-Afrika labaye batibophelela kutsi banikele kulesikhwama kute kusitakale bantfu baseNingizimu ne-Afrika. Sitsi Nkhulunkhulu abusise lapho nikhipha khona.

*English*:

Hon Speaker, let me take this opportunity also to remind this House that coronavirus was not the only pandemic and is not the only pandemic that plunged crisis into the country, the

gender-based violence and femicide is the second pandemic as the President has said so – which plunged us into crisis as a country.

We are therefore calling for all faith-based organisation because when we are faced with this kind of crisis, we need also to fight the spiritual war because the war is spiritual. We need all the

faith-based organisation to join hands with our government. Join hands with women of this country and children of this country to fight this pandemic, we want also to see, real men stand out there and saying *not in our names*. Let’s not wait until it happens to your family members, this is for all of us, to fight this

gender-based violence and femicide.

We want as South African women and children to walk the streets of our country free.

The SPEAKE: You are wrapping up mam.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: Thank you very much, Hon Speaker, let me applaud yourself, your leadership hon Speaker, as the presiding officer and all the House Chairpersons for ensuring...and with the Parliamentary staff members let by Ms Tyawa, that you made it possible for us, as Members of Parliament that we are safe in this Parliament, you adhere to all health protocols and also the regulations that are there. We are screened, sanitized and also we are given masks when we come this House. Thank you very much hon Speaker, and thanks to the presiding officers, hon Speaker led by yourselves for tolerating us even when we are childish in this House. You tolerated our

nonsense in this House... my apologies to use that word but you have always been tolerating our bad behaviour.

Thanks also to the table staff... I am wrapping hon Speaker

...[Interjection.]

*Siswati*:

The SPEAKE: Vala manje.

*English*:

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: ...I am left with two

minutes.

The SPEAKER: No.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: ...hon Speaker, I am

wrapping up. Thanks to the National Assembly, NA, table for always supporting us. Thanks to all our political staff, our caucus staff members. Without you we wouldn’t be able to do our job in this House.

In conclusion, hon Speaker, I want us to rise all of us in this House and observe a moment of silence in remembering the hon members of this House who passed on, during this year, hon

Speaker. Hon Dorah Dlamini from KwaZulu-Natal, KZN, member of ANC, hon Phindile Mola from Mpumalanga, ANC, hon Zanoxolo Peter from Easteen Cape, Hisham Mohamed from the Western Cape, all ANC members and hon Thandi Mpambo Sibhukwana from the Western Cape, a member of the DA. Let’s rise hon members and observe a moment of silence in remembering these hon members. May their souls rest in peace. Hon Speaker... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Let us be seated, look at the clock again hon member.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: ...[Interjection.]

while we enjoy our Christmas and festive season...

The SPEAKER: Hon Deputy Chief Whip...

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: ...let us remember

those who are poor and vulnerable. It’s Christmas, it’s about giving, let’s give to those in need. I thank you, hon Speaker. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members, I think we join hands today, we have had a very difficult year, it was also a challenging year, but it was not a hopeless year. Because when you get into difficulties ... hon Madisha is right, those of us who have been in the bush, if

you get into the bush, an unknown terrain with anybody and if you survive with that person you do know that you have a very long journey throughout life with that person. You may always differ, you may talk against each other, you may be hopeless together, but you do know that you have to survive together. Because once you’ve done it once, you do know that it becomes a habit.

So, I want to say that Covid-19 has shown us its backside, it might still turn around and show us the other side, but we do know that we will be resourceful, we will have each other’s back; we also know we will do what the Deputy Chief Whip said we must do, we will stand together against those who are base, those who do not deserve our sympathy, those who steal from the poor, those who steal from the dead; we cannot be associated with them, we don’t care who they are, where they come from, they do not deserve to be called true South Africans.

So, we must stand resolute as this House against anybody who does corruption without fear or favour.

I think that we must say thank you to you because, difficult as it was, I must thank the members of this House who were of assistance, who were co-operative, but you don’t always thank people who are positive towards you; sometimes you must thank the

people who stood against you, sometimes the people who were offensive towards you, because they force you to think, they force you look at all the other angles.

In our case it was good that we did not always agree because in that way we could represent the different views of all South Africans, those agree with all of us here and those who disagree with all of us here, but those voices need to be heard sometimes, uneasy, uncomfortable, they are South Africans. And sometimes even if they are not South Africans, they reside behind our houses, in our houses sometimes unbeknown to us, it is good for us to differ but it is also good for us to know when to stop differing and to put this country first.

Ntate [Mr] Mulder, I don’t know about you but it is in the last 25 years that some of us have spent a full month in our own beds. So, Covid-19 was not all that bad, it actually allowed people to re- bond; those of us who came here with babies and now they are adults, to re-bond and re-know our children and rebuild family structures.

I do know that there are male members of this Parliament who actually found a way to quickly find somewhere to go because the domestic government was just getting too much. [Laughter.] I know

a professor who said to me: Thandi, now I’ve even learned how to cook outside, just so that ...

*IsiXhosa*:

... ndifumane ithuba lam.

*English:*

But it was good because in surviving together, families have been reborn, we have re-bonded.

I want to say that the Presiding Officers, the staff, we enjoyed even though we messed up now and then, we enjoyed your support and we didn’t just not do well, we have had over a thousand committee meetings and oversight visits. [Applause.] We have had 46 virtual sittings of this House. So, we have learnt, even those of us who couldn’t ... who though we would not master getting on to the system, we have done so; we have done so good, but we know that we still have other challenges even though we were able to reach out.

When it comes to public participation we know that there are gaps, we know that we need to do something in case this thing drags on, to make sure that we do not have shortcuts when it comes to public hearings.

We, of course, still have to worry about the work that has not been done, section 25 of the Constitution, we need to be getting on and all the other stuff that is lying there. We need to make sure that when people look at us they look at their Members of Parliament, MPs.

And I want to say that I am very proud of the members who had contributed here, but I also know a lot of members who privately gave and gave privately to people who were suffering without waiting for us to take out the horns to say “hey, hey”. So, that is good because that is what we should be.

I think that we need to go home and do what Madiba used to tell us to go and do. He used to say “Go home now, it is Christmas and go and be productive”.

Hon members, don’t be too productive because we still need you, not overexerted, we need you with energy levels that are just right at the beginning of the year, we need to finish the business that we did not finish; but we need also to guard against some of the bad things that we experienced.

We need this unity of this House precisely because in our differences we cannot allow this country to degenerate into racial

acrimony, we can’t allow that; we can’t allow this House to degenerate any further than we have done in the last three years, so, we must guard against that.

So, let’s go home, let’s continue looking after these families, let’s get rested, let’s know that we have to help rebuild a country; castigate each other but you’ve got only one country. And the joint energies of members of this House, the shrill voices of the people out there can only be calmed by them seeing us focusing on them and not on us.

So, I wish to wish you a happy, happy Christmas; masked; sanitized; frequently, frequently making sure that, that social distancing does not disturb the productivity that Madiba referred to. [Laughter.]

So, go home, hon members, enjoy your time with the families. As I said, let us get reenergised.

This concludes our business for today, this concludes this sitting and we wish you goodbye. The House is adjourned. [Applause.]

Business concluded.

The House adjourned at 19:05