**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

# TUESDAY, 24 NOVEMBER 2020

***PROCEEDINGS OF THE NATIONAL ASSEMBLY***

The House met at 14:03.

The Speaker took the Chair and requested members to observe a moment of silence for prayer or meditation.

The SPEAKER: Hon members, in the interest of everybody else’s safety, please keep your masks on in the Chamber and sit in the designated places. We also ask you to sign your attendance slips. I thank you.

# TRIBUTES TO MR T K MAKWETU FORMER AUDITOR-GENERAL OF SOUTH AFRICA

Mr J N DE VILLIERS: Thank you, Speaker. Hon members, in 1966 a patriot and true leader of this country was born in Gugulethu, Cape Town. Against dismal odds, he raised himself to one of the highest offices in the state, that of the Auditor-General, AG, of South Africa.

Mr Thembekile Kimi Makwetu was a child of Gugulethu, and as a young boy already showed his talents as he was the designated accountant of the family business. As a student at the University of Cape Town, he showed the early signs of a leader in the making, taking up various roles on campus. After university, the student Kimi became the professional Mr Makwetu. He did his accounting articles at Deloitte, worked at various corporate companies but later returned to Deloitte to become the director of Deloitte’s forensic unit. It was during this time that he was approached by the then AG, Terence Nombembe, to join the AG’s Office as the deputy AG. And so, in 2007, Mr Makwetu joined the Office of the AG of South Africa.

It is perhaps worth pausing on this decision as it says much about the character of Mr Makwetu. In 2007, he was a qualified chartered accountant with a clear record of leadership and management ability. I think there can be no doubt that if he so chose, he could’ve joined any number of private-sector opportunities with great financial upside. Yet, that was not his choice. Mr Makwetu chose to join the AG of South Africa. He chose to be s civil servant. He chose to serve his country and her people above enriching himself.

Hon members, does this not remind us of the true duty and nature of being a public servant? Let this be part of the legacy of Mr Makwetu to us all; that we serve the public of this country. We are not here to serve our own interests.

Mr Makwetu took over the Office of the AG in 2013, and what I found notable about this is that, just as his predecessor Mr Nombembe identified a young Kimi Makwetu to fill the position of the deputy AG and rise to the position of AG, so too did Mr Makwetu identify and appoint a young Ms Tsakani Maluleke, who today is the first female AG of South Africa. Mr Makwetu knew that true leadership is not just about what you do while you are in the position but it is also about who you prepare to carry on your legacy once you are gone.

In a recent *Moneyweb* article by Prof Mills Soko, Mr Makwetu was described as a champion of public accountability; an exceptional and true civil servant. These words personify the Mr Makwetu we dealt with in Parliament’s committee work; those of an individual who was deeply committed to his profession, his office and the people of this country. Always the professional, I remember the only time Mr Makwetu showed some uncommon emotion was when we had to deal with issues of threats and intimidation towards the audit

teams. His genuine concern for his people was a testament to his character.

Mr Makwetu was an exceptional South African. He fought for this country and was an ambassador for accountability, good governance and ethical leadership. He never hesitated to raise the necessary red flags around corruption, and during the worst times of state capture, the Office of the AG stood firm and uncaptured as a watchdog that never hesitated to highlight the wrongdoings of state institutions and individuals.

It was during this time that the Public Audit Amendment Act was passed, commonly referred to as Kimi’s law, or some even call it, Kimi’s teeth. Kimi’s law gives the Office of the AG the ability to hold government officials personally liable for acts of corruption. I call upon Ms Maluleke and the current Office of the AG to honour the legacy of Mr Makwetu; to use Kimi’s teeth, that we may see those who stole taxpayers’ money become accountable.

I remind you again of the child of Gugulethu who rose to become the AG of South Africa. This is the South Africa that Mr Makwetu was fighting for; one where a child can rise from poverty to prosperity; where children from the poorest areas in South Africa have access to schools, hospitals, the police, roads, working

water and electricity, services and infrastructure that will help them to develop their talents and unlock their potential.

As we today remember a remarkable South African, let us live his legacy by building that South Africa and holding those that are stealing the future of our children, accountable.

Today we remember Mr Thembekile Kimi Makwetu; a champion of public accountability; a true civil servant and an exceptional South African. May his soul rest in peace. [Applause.]

Ms O M C MAOTWE: Hon Speaker, I will do the tribute on behalf of hon Ndlozi.

The SPEAKER: Please proceed, Ma’am.

Ms O M C MAOTWE: Thank you very much, Speaker. The EFF sends its deepest revolutionary condolences to the Makwetu family and his colleagues in the auditing fraternity. Today, we are paying tribute to a South African who embodied values of accountability, transparency and service to our people. He did this without seeking credit, fame or even publicity.

Mr Makwetu simply went on with public service at a difficult time

... it was fashionable to simply fold one’s arms and turn a blind eye to unimaginable levels of corruption co-ordinated by the ruling party across all spheres of government, including in state- owned entities. For this, we must be eternally grateful for Mr Makwetu’s contribution and dedication, and we must celebrate his life.

Mr Makwetu was able to demonstrate, with distinction and competence, that black managers can run and manage complex institutions, despite constant doubts ... [Inaudible.] ... being treated like a child and always, without fail, treated with suspicion. We are always made to believe that whiteness equals competence and black equates to incompetence. Today, as we celebrate the life of Mr Makwetu, we are indeed comforted that Mr Makwetu was competent.

For those that will come after him, while we continue to fight racism that makes black auditors and accounts get paid less than their white and Indian counterparts, for you the work is to continue to maintain the high standards that have been become synonymous with the AG of South Africa.

We also want to take this opportunity to congratulate the newly appointed AG, Tsakani Maluleke. We want to wish her well and encourage her to start from day one to tackle difficult audits without fear or favour. Emulate the former AG and do even more. Remember, yours is not political but technical competence. I thank you.

Mr M HLENGWA: Madam Speaker, in the book by Max Blumenthal entitled *The management of savagery* there are remarks delivered by the former US Deputy Secretary of Defence, Paul Wolfowitz to naval cadets on the 60th anniversary of the attack on Pearl Harbor.

These remarks made similar reference to the attacks in the US on 911 and I believe they are applicable to the current situation in which we find ourselves as regards corruption in our government and public services. Wolfowitz is quoted as saying,

Interestingly that these surprise attacks were preceded by an astonishing number of unheeded warnings and missed signals.

Surprise happens so often that it is surprising that we are surprised by it. Very few of these surprises are the product of simple blindness or simple stupidity. Almost always there have been warnings and signals that have been missed, sometimes because there were just too many warnings to pick the right one.

It is what we are witnessing today with all the numerous reports and warnings of the Auditor-General, AG that if we are not careful, did not listen and do not listen to the late AG, we may find ourselves in one way or the other faced with our own public service 911 or Pearl Harbor. We have to heed his warnings and this is the legacy of the late AG.

Coupled with this there are great concerns surrounding the fact that auditors are viewed as an enemy and as threats by government departments and entities. In fact, the auditors themselves are threatened and intimidated by government officials when carrying out their duties, and this has to stop. This gravely concerned the late AG as his team, in the daily course of their work, found themselves at the receiving end of the unrelenting corrupt elements. It must be an honour to his legacy then that we protect the auditors as they do their work.

Madam Speaker, the late AG did justice to the trust which was placed in him to head the Chapter 9 institution. He did honour to the Constitution and he reminded us that it is possible to be a South African who is actually about the Constitution, for the Constitution and lives the Constitution. The road ahead for the Office of the Auditor-General is going to be a difficult one, as they now have to implement the expanded mandate of the Public

Audit Act which has extended the role of the office beyond auditing and reporting. This is the legacy of the late AG where he gave the Office of the Auditor-General teeth. He gave it credibility and honour.

This is not the retirement we had imagined. We had wanted the AG to be around. His sudden passing has been one of great distress and we send our heartfelt condolences to Mrs Makwetu, Soso, Thando and Wandile and the rest of the Makwetu family. We have lost a patriot who died with his boots on and who only did for his country with everything that he had until the very end. We have to emulate his example and do justice to his work, moving forward. We wish the new AG all the best as she takes the Office of the Auditor-General forward. We know and believe that she is competent and equal to the task.

Madam Speaker, when the AG last appeared before the Standing Committee on Public Accounts, Scopa a few weeks ago, I said to him and in giving tribute as I communicated to the family last week, I would like to read an Irish blessing. I said then:

AG, may the rose rise up to meet you. May the wind be ever at your back. May the sun shine warm upon your face. May the rain

fall softly on your fields. Until we meet again, may God hold you in the palm of his hand.

In life and in death these words are ept. AG, all you have ever been is a patriot. Rest in peace! God bless you; and strength to your family. I thank you. [Applause.]

Mr W W WESSELS: Speaker, my apologies, I lost connection.

Mr W W WESSELS: Hon Speaker, I firstly want to extend, on behalf of the FF Plus, our sincerest condolences to the family, friends and colleagues of Mr Makwetu. Mr Makwetu was a true ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Wessels, please hold on. Hon members, if you are not given the floor, please don’t disturb the sittings! You may proceed hon Wessels.

Mr W W WESSELS: Speaker, Mr Makwetu was a true public servant; a dedicated and diligent auditor and Auditor-General. He fought against mismanagement, irregularities and corruption. He never kept quiet about poor political leadership, a lack of consequence management and repeatedly pointed to the total collapse of financial management of especially municipalities. He was a true

leader, leading the Office of the Auditor-General and its various business units to conduct impartial and credible audits under very difficult circumstances. He motivated and inspired his team. He made true the words of Dylan Thomas,

Do not go gentle into that good night. Rage rage against the dying of the light.

Whilst he battled cancer for more than two years, he conducted his task with diligence up until the end; and that we have to pay tribute to. Let his legacy be consequence management and zero tolerance to corruption and mismanagement. Let those who make themselves guilty face the consequences, as Mr Makwetu would have wanted. We pay our tribute and may he rest in peace. I thank you.

Mr A H M PAPO: Speaker, I rise on a point of order.

The SPEAKER: What’s your point of order, sir?

Mr A H M PAPO: There’s a photo of the NA virtual sitting which has an EFF background with member Shivambu. It was actually shown to the country and the rules don’t allow that any member should have a background of their political party behind them.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Shivambu, this is the sitting of the NA. Whether we are on virtual platform or in the House, no party symbols are to be shown. So, please remove that if you are still showing it. Thank you very much. Let’s proceed.

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: Speaker, you should have asked which rule is he quoting.

The SPEAKER: Hon Shivambu, you will remove ... [Interjections.]

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: You should have asked which rule is he quoting. And I’m not even on the list of speakers there today.

The SPEAKER: Hon Shivambu, you will remove your party symbols in the House. Let’s proceed.

Rev K R J MESHOE: Speaker, it is my honour and privilege to pay tribute and my respects to a truly honourable, respectable, decent, professional, brave and courageous man of integrity, former Auditor-General, Kimi Makwetu. Mr Makwetu did not only expose corruption, but he also focused on exposing and looking at the causes of corruption; and then offering clear solutions on what should be done to remedy what was at the root of corruption. Those departments that remained corrupt did so because they chose

to allow corruption to thrive in their departments and refused to restore good governance.

Mr Makwetu was truly an ethical leader who hated corruption with everything in him, and he fought it wherever it raised its ugly head. The ACDP salutes him. His dedication to his work and the country should be emulated by all public servants. He was a true servant of the people and served his country with great distinction and excellence.

In conclusion, I want to commend his parents who taught him how to be responsible and accountable with whatever has been entrusted to him. It was refreshing to hear that Mr Makwetu’s mother, Maureen Makwetu who is an entrepreneur herself, strongly influenced him with her good values so much that he chose him to look after the finances of the family business. He deserves a good rest for the good work he has done for the nation of South Africa.

And lastly, to his successor, Tsakani Maluleke, we wish you well in your endeavour to fill the big shoes that the late Makwetu left. You are privileged to have an excellent mentor in Mr Makwetu. We know that you will do as well as he did. May the Lord bless you; and give you grace and wisdom. I thank you.

Mr N L S KWANKWA: Speaker, on behalf of the UDM I would like to take this opportunity to express our deepest condolences to the family, the friends and all the loved ones of the late Auditor- General, Kimi Makwetu. Mr Makwetu was born or hailed from poverty stricken Cofimvaba in the Eastern Cape, to become one of the top Chartered Accountants in the country and respected throughout the world. As the person who has worked and interacted with the Auditor-General, in the course of my duty in Parliament. I can attest, and the party diligently sadly attest that Mr Makwetu carried out his service with humility and diligence throughout his career.

Mr Makwetu boldly faced a very difficult time when state capture and corruption have become rooted in the party gad stage. He carried out duties until the end, even though he was battling with cancer. He never wavered from speaking truth to power and demanding accountability from those who are tasked with responsibility of managing public assets. When he was appointed on December 1 2013 by former President Jacob Zuma, some in the public sect hood were concerned that he was a man of few words, but little did they know that he was a man of action.

This has been confirmed by many awards and accolades he has received during his exemplary life and career. He was an

extraordinary man who fought a brave and just battle. Mr Makwetu’s reports as we know, carried shocking findings of fruitless and wasteful irregular expenditure in all levels of government. Mr Makwetu as he left us, he departed at time when Parliament has granted his office more powers. He was given him more bite than just a mere buck to the Public Amendment Act, which gave him powers as the Auditor-General to refer irregularities for further investigations and to launch a process to recover monies misappropriated through the state agencies.

As we bid farewell to the Auditor-General we would like to say ...

*IsiXhosa*:

Siyabulela Zikhali. Lala ngoxolo Zikhali, Mazembe, Tiyeka, Butsolo Beentonga, Ngcolosi. Siyabulela.

# DISPLAYING PARTY SYMBOLS IN THE HOUSE

(Ruling)

The SPEAKER: Hon members, before we proceed I would like to make a ruling on a point of order which was raised. I ruled and I gave an instruction. Hon Shivambu asked me, on what rule the point of order was called. That point of order by the hon Papo was called

in terms of Rule 64(f) which says that members should dress in a manner befitting the dignity and the decorum of the House as may further be provided for in guidelines as approved by the rules Committee, provided that no party symbols may be displayed. I did instruct the hon Shivambu to remove the party symbols, I have just looked at footage which showed that he had not. If Hon Shivambu has not remove those symbols I am afraid that he will be removed from the sitting of this House.

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: Speaker I am standing on a point of order.

The SPEAKER: There is no pint of order I have made my ruling.

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: Speaker, but I want to address you on what you are ruling on.

The SPEAKER: Hon Shivambu, you won’t disrupt us I have made my ruling, for the second time.

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: I’m not disrupting you, you are disrupting yourself.

The SPEAKER: Please put that mic off. Remove hon. Shivambu from the sitting of this House. I have made the ruling. [Applause.] We

proceed hon members, and I invite the hon Marawu. on the virtual platform.

Ms T L MARAWU: Hon speaker the ATM bids farewell to a legend, a true hero, a principled man who stood for accountability.

Especially in a time, the moral fibre of the country is slowly reaching an all up unprecedented low. Hailed as a man who refused to be silent about maleficence his term year became one of the most historical in assuring that he uprooted the call for corruption and maladministration and to add to that no ordinary man will be able to do unless he was as principled and objective as uTata uMakwetu.

Even when his health was giving him challenges, he became an exemplary servant of the people who embodied the principle of ...

*IsiXhosa*:

... ijoni lifela emfazweni ...

*English:*

... that mentions resilience, patience, passion and best of all dedication at the task at hand. It is times such as this that we urge South Africans to follow in his shoes and adopt his patriotic culture, to ensure that we are all responsible members of the

Republic. The ATM heeds the call of genius belief to be implemented in all government sectors and to ensure that we root out all corrupt individuals once and for all.

The former Auditor-General was not only a principled man he was a beacon of hope for many South Africans who are awaiting service delivery in municipalities and for that South Africa truly a loss. We offer our heartfelt condolences to Makwetu family in an understanding that his teaching and signatory dance moves will forever remain in their hearts and that they may be contacted during this difficult time of the passing of their beloved.

In honouring his memory and his work we must all hold hands in the active pipe of corruption and ensure that there is accountability in government. We must ensure that our children and their children are in a clean state that is able to provide for its citizen.

*IsiXhosa*:

Lala ngoxolo tata, ugqatso ulufezile. Enkosi Somlomo.

The MINISTER OF PUBLIC WORKS AND INFRASTRUCTURE: Speaker on 11

November 2020 our country lost one of our most outstanding public servants and guardian of accountable and ethical leadership. I’ve always had great respect for the office of the Auditor-General and

worked extremely well with our Auditor General over the years. Over the many years I have worked with the Auditor General, I was always struck by his professionalism and inspired by his commitment to advance the work of the opposite Auditor General.

The Auditor-General was fearless and steadfast in his commitment to ensure that public money was tend to serve the people of the country. He was a true son of the soil and servant of the people, I always fondly remembered and agreed with his words when he would say “In tracing a good organisation for getting a clean audit, is like tracing a fish because a fish can swim.” This is after I received four consecutive a clean audit in the City of Cape Town and often, they think that this mantra to officials and said that, it is not an objective to get a clean audit, it is what we are meant to keep doing.

It is a moral obligation for government to spend the money for service delivery in a proper way. Kimi was an exceptional individual and will always be remembered as a principled, honest servant of the people, who was fully aware of his constitutional obligations and carried his duties out diligently till the end. The Public Audit Amendment Act which he fought for and introduced to public officials to account, is part of his legacy that we must implement. May we all honour Kimi’s leadership and carry the torch

forward by ensuring that we advanced the principles of accountability and ensuring that the public money is spent where it is meant to be spent.

To our new Auditor-General, Tsakane Maluleka, we have got faith in you and you will continue the big work. To Miranda, his wife and his three children I want to say thank you for sharing Kimi with us for so many years to serve his country. Condolences to his family, his friends and colleagues. May his soul rest in peace.

*IsiXhosa*:

Hamba kakuhle, mntakwethu.

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Thank you, hon Speaker, we have seen on the media platforms Mr Makwetu being referred to as an exceptional and a true civil servant. Mr Makwetu, whose first name is Thembekile, which means the one who can be trusted, clearly tells us that 54 years ago when he was born, his parents decided that this is the son that is going lead with integrity and dignity and that’s basically what he embodied during his tenure as the Auditor- General of South Africa.

When he joined the Office of the Auditor-General in 2007 as the deputy Auditor-General, he cited public interest consideration as

central to his decisions. He worked on to embody scrupulously the principles of professionalism, good governance, leadership, integrity and a significant consideration for public interests.

As an auditor by profession, Mr Makwetu emphasised the importance of the moral social contract that the auditing profession ought to uphold. Despite the threats that were made by various structures in government, that did not deter Mr Makwetu and his team from carrying out their responsibility to the highest level of integrity.

He assumed his position at the Auditor-General in South Africa in 2007. One of his close acquaintances said: “He did well to shape his role in ways that made him a visible champion of public accountability ...”

He also managed to cement the reputation of the office as a beacon of meritocracy and a training ground for ambitious and talented professionals who yearn to make a positive contribution to South Africa.

Although he was diplomatic in his public pronouncements about corruption, he was shockingly modified by the pervasive corruption that destroyed governance in the public sector and the country as

a whole. During his tenure, he championed for the amendment of the Public Audit Act to grant the office powers that authorise the Auditor-General to recommend remedial action against corrupt individuals and ensure that losses incurred by the state are recovered.

Through the amended Public Audit Act, the office can refer certain suspected irregularities for further investigation by the law enforcement agencies. Though these changes may be taken lightly by others, but it is a revelation to the public about the man who sought to leave a legacy and enhance that social and moral contract that the audit profession has with the public.

These changes show commitment to restoring governance and public confidence. He did so with a high level professionalism, integrity and ethical behaviour.

The NFP would like to urge public servants occupying esteemed positions in the public sector to follow suit. South Africa is in need of public servants who embody and uphold the principles which Mr Makwetu discharged. To restore nation, public servants need a paradigm shift and so much could be extracted from Mr Makwetu’s legacy. The NFP conveys its condolences to the family, friends and colleagues. Thank you.

Mr W M MADISHA: Hon Speaker, COPE expresses its sadness at the untimely death of the late Auditor-General, Mr Makwetu. He was still young. The COPE has no doubt that South Africans looked forward to his significant contribution in many more years to come although he was not going to be in the country because of the jobs he was going to do beyond our seas.

As we have all expressed, he occupied a very challenging position at the time when our country’s financial stability had literally collapsed due to corruption, particularly by those in positions of power, from the lowest to the highest levels of government; namely, local or municipalities, provincial level and the national level; includes that of bureaucrats who holds positions of responsibility from municipalities to the national government level.

Those of us who attended committee meetings whereat he presented audits and guidance reports have noticed the openness he displayed, the truthfulness he always indicated, the nonpartisan and nonaffinity approaches he followed and proved, the commitment to ensure the resolution of momentous challenges our country faces today, *inter alia* those that led South Africa to the past and present junk status and how all those practices would contribute

to nondelivery of essential services, joblessness and give birth to further corrupt practices.

His employment history, before he became the Auditor-General and further that the international finance institutions both in China and the new one that he was going to occupy, welcomed him, indicated that South Africa had a gift in him. I hope he will rest well and in peace. Thank you very much.

Mr M NYHONTSO: Speaker ...

*IsiXhosa*:

... nyana kaNolulamo wasemaQwathini, noVela uZikhali ...

*English*:

... you epitomised your name ...

*IsiXhosa*:

... wathembeka kubizo lwakho lokuphicotha iimeko ezigwenxa ekuphathweni kobutyebi belizwe loobaw’omkhulu.

*English*:

The learned streetwise Sgemusha, you carefully dribbled your way through polio and cancer to fulfil your obligation to live up to

the Auditor-General SA promise. You were steadfast in calling to order and financial accountability ...

*IsiXhosa*:

... aba vuk’engceni ...

*English*:

... who were hell-bent on depleting our wealth and economic growth.

*IsiXhosa*:

Bebesithi xa bezama ukumokola iincwadi zobutyebi belizwe, bafike uxhathisile, ungagungqi nakancinci.

*English*:

From the hustles and bustles ...

IsiXhosa:

... zaseNtayi, eSkomu ...

*English*:

... you were a true hard work combined with natural brilliance.

*IsiXhosa*:

ELuzuko, eSt Johns nakwiYunivesithi yaseKapa bayazingca ngawe Butsolo beentonga. Amakhankatha akuSabalele ayakwazi kwedini kaZikhali. eHoyita kulapho yombelwa khona inkaba yakho. Wena mzukulwana kaMina ozalwa ebukhosini kuTyali eGodidi, kuCentane emaTshaweni.

Ukulindile uyihlo uVela kwelemimoya. Hamba ke uye kumxelela ubawokazi wakho uMlamli Clarence Makwethu ukuba, idabi lenkululeko alikafezeki elizweni lethu. Uze umchazele ukuba asizimiselanga kubuya ngamva edabini lokulwela umhlaba woobaw’omkhulu.

Mabakwamkele ke wena, kuba eyakho indima uyidlalile. Mabakwambese ngeyakho ingubo ukuze ungafunyanwa yingqele apho ukhoyo. Ukhumbule ukuwuwela umlambo waseHoyita kuGaga, udlule kwivenkile kaMeveni xa ubuyela ekhaya eHoyita. Xa ufika kwelo cala, uZikhali noMamQwathi, uManase noNokulunga bazakukukhawulela ngezandla ezifudumeleyo.

Bazakukuthi jize ngolona ncumo nangothando olungazenzisiyo. Xa kumnandi, bekufudumeze ngeenceba zikaMdali, uze usikhumbule thina ubashiye ngasemva, udedise ubumnyama uvelise ukukhanya endleni yabantwana beAfrika. Camagu.

Mr M G E HENDRICKS: Hon Speaker, Al Jah-mah is profoundly saddened at the death of Mr Thembekile Kimi Makwetu who passed away on 11 November 2020, in Johannesburg. Mr Makwetu a son from the soil of Gugulethu, but the Southernmost of Africa succumbed after a brave

struggle against lung cancer. He had an immediate positive impact on the country’s fiscal system when he was appointed as Auditor- General, AG, of South Africa.

Mr Makwetu’s firm code of ethics and honesty applied to his work was that of a staunch of zero-tolerance to corruption. He remained vigilant against corruption following in the footsteps of his great uncle former President of the PAC, the late Clarence Makwetu was described as a vigilant leader. Leaders fighting for our liberation, no matter what the political affiliation who always have a respect as well as the family and even extended family.

Mr Makwetu not only left behind the legacy of honesty, but also lessons to our youth. As a young warrior helped his late mother Maureen Makwetu in the knit business and learnt how to manage money. He understood the meaning of job creation and as AG he continued to recruit, train and mentor young people in the accounting profession.

He will be remembered as an AG who did expose corruption and irregularities of the COVID-19 funds spending on the Personal Protective Equipment, PPE. Political parties and portfolio committees to get a clean audit was a cherry on top for him.

Al Jah-mah extends our deepest condolences to his wife, children, the extended Makwetu family, his colleagues and the people of South Africa. He was a public servant who was committed to guide the country on spending public money responsibly and without corruption.

The Sixth Parliament - I need to heed the call of the Office of the Auditor-General – a lurch of perhaps the other five Parliaments. His findings were as decisive as prime meat cuts. Thank you very much, hon Speaker.

*IsiXhosa*:

Nksz G N TOLASHE: Somlomo ohloniphekileyo weNdlu yoWiso-mthetho yeSizwe, maLungu ePalamente, bantu boMzantsi Afrika, molweni ngale mva kwemini. Ngokukhethekileyo masibulise izihlobo nezalamane zomzi wakwaMakwethu ezithe nazo zayinxalenye yalo msebenzi uhlonipheke kangaka.

Somlomo, usuku lomhla wesixhenxe kwinyanga yoMqungu ngowe-1966, lusuku olungenakuze lulityalwe kwimbali yakwaMakwethu, kumathafa aloo ndawo nakwisizwe sonke soMzantsi Afrika, kuba ngaloo mini ithole leduna lazalwa.

Somlomo ohloniphekileyo, mandiqale ndithi, njengoko sidibene apha ukuze sithi ndlela-ntle kuZikhali, sithi kula makhaya kuba ihlabe kubo yabinza, ngxee booZikhali, maQwathi nezihlobo, akuhlanga lungehlanga, thuthuzelekani.

Kaloku unyana kaMamQwathi noZikhali, naye ulandulele eli esiya kumanyange akowabo. Kungoko ke singumbutho i-ANC namahlakani ethu sisithi, makalale ngoxolo. Namhlanje sithi ndlela-ntle kweli thandazwe lakuHoyita, kuSabalele eCofimvaba. Siyabulela kananjalo Somlomo ohloniphekileyo ngokusipha ithuba lokuba nathi sibekunye nolu sapho bucala, ukuze sithethe nalo ngqo, sibathuthuzela.

Somlomo ohloniphekileyo, ukuba bendiyimbongi, ngale nyanga yeNkanga bendingamfanisa usingaye ongasekhoyo utata uMakwethu neentaka zezulu. Namhlanje sithi kuwe, ntinga njenge ngqwangi, intaka apha enqabe kahulu, entsiba zayo zisetyenziswa ngamakhosi. Wanga ungakhokelwa yintambanana, intaka yasendle emdaka ngebala, ntaka leyo ezisa amathamsanqa kubahambi xa intantazela phambi kwabo.

Ndivumele Zikhali, Butsolo Beentonga ndithi, nale ntakazana indwe entsiba zayo zibubuqholo kwiminqwazi yamakhalipha azibalule ngobugorha emfazweni, inga ingahamba nawe. Xa usithela usiya kumanyange, nathi sigxwala emswaneni sithi, anga amanyange akowenu

angakwamkela njengoko etshilo udade wenu uBelinda, akukhawulele, akwange, akuphulule izivubeko zehlabathi, akwambathise ngengubo emhlophe njengekhephu.

Kaloku nembongi kaMqhayi yatsho ibuza umbuzo omkhulu yathi:

Ngesi binge ngantoni ke kade? Idini lomzi liyintoni ke kade? Asi ngomathol’ amaduna omzi na?

Kuwe sithi, lala kakuhle Butsolo Beentonga.

*English*:

Hon Speaker, in 1994 Nelson Mandela as the first black President of the Republic of South Africa at the meeting of the African Union, AU, in Juice called a destruction of the city of Carthage by the generals of the earlier empire and he said I quote:

Where South Africa appears on the agenda of the Organisation of African Unity, OAU, let it be because you want to discuss what its contribution shall be the making of the new African renaissance. Let it be because you want to discuss what materials it would supply for the rebuilding of the African city of Carthage.

Hon Speaker, in a way we can say without fear of contradiction that our Auditor-General, Mr Thembekile Kimi Makwetu supplied building blogs here in South Africa of that city of Carthage. He stood unfreanchingly as an example of what we could be if we strive and work harder and indeed was an embodiment that hard work thus pays off.

Hon Speaker, with every inch of your life Zikhali and living breath you dedicated your entire life to the rebuilding of our city of Carthage here in South Africa Jojo. As the ANC parliamentary caucus we particular feel this immeasurable loss. As it was on 6 November 2020 that the AG, Mr Kimi Makwetu, Thembekile, was appointed to the United Nations Independent Audit Committee in its Fifth Conference in New York.

Your departure Zikhali therefore has not only robbed us of our diligence and excellence, but also stole from us a world class citizen.

It is indeed true that he who digs a well does not drink from it. You will no longer be able to drink from your wisdom ...

*IsiXhosa*:

... kuba wena awusekho. Hamba kakuhle Butsolo Beentonga

*English*:

It was on 11 November 2020 the ANC caucus Parliament leader learnt with sadness of your passing, AG, from lung cancer. At the time AG we were left with only 19 days before vacating the Office of the Auditor-General which you served with distinction since your assumption on 1 December 2013 since having being Deputy Auditor- General to Terence Nombembe. Your dedication and patriotism displayed to the South African people even when you were battling illness is the reminder of the values of selfishness as we should all emulate.

We are grateful of your commitment to the Constitution and put first South African people during your tenure. You worked very well and hard to get the government finances to be properly audited and ensured that measures were put in place to guard against wasteful and fruitless expenditure at all times especially during COVID-19.

You brought us innovations that enables audits to be conducted in real times. We will miss you Zikhali. Your sterling advocacy and support for women leadership. We are grateful that you led the way and laid a solid foundation for the incoming AG Ms Tsakani Maluleke to take over the reins of leadership.

As the ANC caucus in Parliament we all continue to hold high the values that AG, Kimi Thembekile Makwetu stood for and strengthen our capabilities as lawmakers in ensuring that public finances are utilised for the public good.

*IsiXhosa*:

Hamba kakuhle Mabomba, hamba kauhle Zikhali, hamba kakuhle Tiyeka, uze usikhonzele kwabakowenu.

*English*:

I thank you, hon Speaker. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members, this concludes the tributes. I wish to ask hon members to please rise for a moment in memory of the late Kimi Makwetu, Auditor-General of the Republic of South Africa.

Thank you very much.

Hon members, the condolences of this House will be conveyed to the Makwetu family.

# TRIBUTES TO PROF D PLAATJIES, FORMER CHAIRPERSON OF THE FINANCIAL AND FISCAL COMMISSION

Mr G G HILL-LEWIS: Thank you, Madam Speaker, on behalf of the DA, I extend our heartfelt condolences to the family, friends and colleagues of Prof Daniel Plaatjies, whose passing came as a terrible shock to all of us, who have worked with him for so long. Prof Plaatjie was a prolific writer and publisher, which is how I first came to know him when more than a decade ago, he asked for some research assistance for a book that he was working on. We immediately struck up a friendship and often kept in touch after that.

He went on to write other books. We worked together again. Our meetings usually involved very little work actually getting done and lots and lots of chatting about politics, leadership, South Africa and family. Over time, I came to admire the Prof very greatly. He was an intellectual, a writer, thinker, researcher, an inquisitive mind and an analyst. However, he was also undoubtedly an activist, not the so-called activist that we see today who do little but break things down and sow fear or division. That kind of activism would never have earned the blessing of a true builder like Prof Plaatjies. No, he was the kind of an activist concerned with building strong institutions and bedding down firm principles, putting one brink on top of the other, row after row relentlessly, day after day, year after year, to build, to edge, to prop, to push forward and to never break down.

In fact, his contribution to South Africa’s post democratic society is all the tributes that he needs. The SA Social Security Agency, Sassa, which he was instrumental in building, stands as testaments to his commitment to a society which cares for the elderly, disabled and for the less fortunate. After he joined the Financial and Fiscal Commission, our paths crossed again. I was by that time a member in this place and he was now a very regular presenter at portfolio committee meetings. Again, he distinguished himself in his willingness to say exactly what he truly thought, no matter how uncomfortable or inconvenience it was for those who were listening. He was never interested in collaring favour with those in power. He had the kind of quiet confidence in his own position based on deep reading and research that stood on in its own two feet and permitted little gainsay.

Most recently, Speaker, he applied and was interviewed for the position of head of the Parliamentary Budget Office. His interview which took place just days before his sad passing was a master class. He was at his absolute best, argumentative, unwilling to back down, provocative, insightful and brilliant. That interview was televised nationally and I am so glad that it was. We could not know at the time that it was the last time we would ever see him. I hope that many South Africans were able to see this

remarkable civil servant in action, telling the truth to those who needed to hear it, regardless of his personal ambition.

Today, the House pays tribute to two remarkable public servants who have both been taken from us at the prime. The tributes we have just heard for Mr Makwetu were very moving in particular the words shared by hon De Villiers. Both of these gentlemen spent their lives’ effort in the service of South Africa and her people. They have planted trees which without care and nurturing will sink deep roots and spread their canopies wide so that generations to come will long enjoy their shade. May we be reminded today to emulate this life of devotion and service and never to allow the destruction of that, which they have spent their entire lives in building.

I pay tribute today to Prof Daniel Plaatjies for his remarkable contribution to South Africa and his decades of devoted Public Service. I pay tribute to a wonderful conversationalist and a dear friend. We will all miss you Prof, farewell. [Applause.]

Ms E N NTLANGWINI: Thank you very much, Speaker, South Africa has lost one of the finest minds, an analyst and a true spirited public servant in Prof Daniel Plaatjies. In all the times, we interacted with the Prof and the Standing Committee on

Appropriations when the Financial and Fiscal Commission was there. He was always frank, kind and did not hesitate to share his knowledge. Prof was a professional and he has always given detailed and well-researched answers when we have asked him questions. He has taken his time and effort to research and even give us many a times written responses to the questions that we have asked as the EFF.

To Prof Plaatjies’s family and his former colleagues, on behalf of the EFF, we want to send our sincere and deepest revolutionary condolences. While many will remember and speak about Prof Plaatjies’s contributions to the public policy, his contribution to the field of good governance, the decentralised governance and including his doctoral thesis that focus on a co-operative governance. One area Prof Plaatjies contributions have left a lasting legacy his work on funding for basic education.

When we were transitioned into democracy, a democratic South Africa, government spending on behalf of students in former white schools was twice higher than that of students in the formal African schools. Prof Plaatjies is of the generation that made great strides towards equalising access to education. While there is still more work to be done, more pit toilets to be eradicated, more schools to be built, more teachers to be trained and more

qualified teachers to be improved. The work of the EFF government will continue to do so. Many of black children benefited from the contribution of Prof Plaatjies. This is something his family, particularly Prof Plaatjies holds dearly to his heart. Prof Plaatjies have many a times bragged to me about his children that are so fond of EFF and maybe can be EFF members undercover.

*IsiXhosa*:

Hamba kakuhle, Prof.

*Afrikaans:*

Rus sag, my broer. Baie dankie vir die dierbare contribution [bydrae] wat u aan my persoonlik op die Appropriations Committee [bewilligingskomitee] gelewer het.

*English:*

You have always listened carefully to all of my questions and have answered them with the greatest respect. With that my brother, farewell. Thank you, hon Speaker.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Hon, Speaker ...

The SPEAKER: Yes, Ma’am.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Hon Speaker, I didn’t want to interrupt the hon member whilst she was still talking, but I wonder if President Putin, the President of Russia has given a specific permission for the hon member to use a title commissar in the Parliament of South Africa.

Ms E N NTLANGWINI: Speaker, on a point of order, I really don’t know why this member is interrupting on such an important occasion of Prof Plaatjies. Maybe She must first go complete her schooling and then come back to Parliament. Can we not be interrupted by people that can’t even finish school, for heaven’s sake. Please!

The SPEAKER: Hon Ntlangwini, you have made your point. But now you are getting out of order, can we get back to being respectable and pay tribute to the late Professor, please. Hon members, I did see that and I am taking that on advisement. I wish us to go back and to pay our respects to the late departed Professor.

Mr N SINGH: Hon Speaker and colleagues, that is exactly what I want to do: I want to pay respect. It is quite unacceptable what has been happening in the House.

The IFP joins the nation in once again celebrating and honouring a patriot and the life of Prof Daniel Plaatjies who passed away unexpectedly in early October this year.

May I pause to pay my personal condolences to the Makwetu family as well, and to the Office of the Auditor-General and all who work there. I worked with Kimi Makwetu for the last 13 years – from when he was the Deputy Auditor-General – and saw his transition from Deputy Auditor-General to Auditor-General. He was a very, very dear friend.

Coming back to Prof Plaatjies, he was a loving father, husband, and friend to many. He was also, as we have heard, a revered academic, author and public servant.

Beyond that, the professor was a development activist, social justice warrior and fighter for the constitutional principle of nonracialism in our beautiful nation.

The professor’s activism translated into his public service. Having been an integral part of the establishment of the SA Social Services Agency, Sassa – an agency that has been at the forefront of providing relief for millions of vulnerable South Africans over the years, and even now during the Covid-19 pandemic – his memory

is one that demands of us as public servants to be more than office bearers, and to perpetuate the spirit of Ubuntu in every space we occupy.

Many of us gathered here today will remember him from interactions with committees and Members of this House. His insightful and honest contributions to debates will be remembered and missed.

When he was appointed to the Financial and Fiscal Commission, FFC, he injected energy and breathed life into that critical institution. In a country where the integrity of public servants is constantly being questioned, and sullied by the scourge of corruption and dishonesty, he was a bastion of accountability and financial transparency.

The FFC and truly the nation has lost an incredible leader. He set high standards which we hope will be attained by those who follow in his footsteps.

Prof Plaatjies served in numerous senior positions in national and provincial governments. His institutional memory, expertise and wisdom will sorely be missed. The IFP and its leader, Prince Mangosuthu Buthelezi, extends its condolences to his wife and children, and thanks them sincerely for sharing such a great mind

and man with the South African people. May his soul rest in eternal peace. Thank you.

Dr C P MULDER: House Chairperson, I would like to start by expressing our heartfelt condolences to the family and friends of Prof Daniel Plaatjies.

I also want to say that I would really like to associate myself with words expressed today by hon Hill-Lewis. It is quite clear that he knew Prof Plaatjies personally and that they were good friends. It was clear to me from the hon Hill-Lewis’s speech ... when he told us about all the wonderful contributions of Prof Plaatjies ...

Prof Plaatjies served as the chairperson of the FFC and he played a very important role in bringing that commission to where it should be in terms of our constitutional expectation of it. Prof Plaatjies is described by his peers as an outstanding intellectual and a South African patriot who dedicated his life to the cause of social justice and nonracialism.

*Afrikaans*:

Daniel Plaatjies is gebore in Bonteheuwel, het daar groot geword, en het ‘n groot bydrae gemaak tot sy gemeenskap. Hy het later groot spore getrap in Suid-Afrika.

Ten slotte wil ek aan sy vrou Lydia en sy drie kinders ons opregte meelewing oordra. Ons spreek die hoop uit dat hulle vrede in hierdie moeilike tyd sal vind. Dankie.

Mr S N SWART: Hon House Chair, the ACDP rises to pay tribute and to express its deepest condolences to the family and friends of the late Prof Daniel Plaatjies the Chairperson of the Financial and Fiscal Commission, FFC, who passed away on the evening of 10 October. A moving tribute is set out by the Chairperson of the FFC Mr Michael Sachs in this year’s annual report where he said the following and I quote:

Prof Plaatjies was a civil servant, a scholar, an educator, an activist for social justice, a nonracialism and an outstanding South African intellectual. He was both an architect of the South Africa’s democratic institutions and a fears critic of the short comments. His acute and a changing insight will be solely missed in Parliament and we agree with that sentiment and public deliberation. Sadly, the commission itself has lost

an able and an energetic chairperson who have lifted the commission to a new level.

Prof Plaatjies was appointed on 1 September 2013 as a commissioner and as chairperson, on 1 July 2017. When he was appointed the commission was waning. He brought passion, courage and strategic direction to the institution. It is an example we can only hope to build on. May he rest in peace. And that we end that quote.

The ACDP shares the sentiments expressed by Mr Michael Sachs. It also illustrates how fleeting life can indeed be.

In the Book of James, Chapter 4, we are asked the question: How do you know that your life would be tomorrow? He adds, “Your life is like your morning fog, it is here a little while, then it is gone.”

And James is right. Life is like the morning midst that soon vanishes. It is short and uncertain as indicated by the sudden passing of Prof Plaatjies. There are no guarantees about tomorrow let alone next year or in five or 10 years. If we ignore this lesson, we will not live our life according to the light of eternity. We need to make our plans and live our lives according

to Gods commands and purposes and to make sure that we are in the right relationship with the Lord Jesus. Life is short. Death is a certainty. Particularly in this time of COVID-19 when there is so much uncertainty with so many deaths. Make sure you spread love, forgiveness and reconciliation wherever you go. Our nation is desperate for this.

Lastly, we in the ACDP pray that our heavenly Father will comfort the late Prof Plaatjies’s family, his wife Lydia, his children Daniel, Ladion and Leandra and surround them with his love. I thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Thank you, hon Swart. Hon members, those who are logging in late, I realised that the disturbance is because of your logging. Please mute your mic before you connect to the audio. For even if you do not speak, there is disturbance taking place. Those who are not aware of what is happening with your gadget, just check if you have muted your audio. Please, let us continue that way. Hon Kwankwa.

Hon Kwankwa, I saw you coming in with the information and communications and technology, ICT, Ngema. Is he in? He was struggling and I saw his name coming on the screen. Alright. We

will try and come back to you, hon Kwankwa if ICT can assist you. Hon Shaik Emam.

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Hon House Chairperson, Prof Dan Plaatjies was described by his peers as an outstanding intellectual who dedicated his life to the course of social justice and nonracialism. He carried out his duties to with the high-level of excellence seen in his contributions in the engagement and participation in the parliamentary meetings. He was always sharp, well-prepared and articulated the position, the financial fiscal position regarding the equitable sharing of national revenue.

He contributed significantly to various South African institutions to democracy to allow South Africa’s democracy. He was involved in the establishment to SA Social Security Agency, SASSA, and many other prominent institutions that seek to advance our democracy.

The NFP wishes to convey its deepest and sincerest condolences to his family, friends and colleagues.

Hon Chairperson, I had the opportunity of working with him whenever he came in and made his presentation to the Standing Committee on Appropriations and found him to be cool, calm and collected, but articulated himself so well that you could

understand in the simplest of language, exactly what he was saying and the message he wanted to put through to us.

He was very argumentative, insightful and informative in his engagements during the parliamentary meetings.

Prof Plaatjies will be solely missed and we would like to encourage those who work with him to carry the button. The NFP wishes to encourage his family and friends and former colleagues to be strong during this difficult time. His contribution to the South African democracy will surely make its way to the history books of this country. Rest in peace. The NFP extends its condolences to all his family, friends and colleagues. Thank you.

Mr N L S KWANKWA: Hon House Chair, on behalf of the UDM, I would like to take this opportunity to extend our heartfelt condolences to the family and friends of the late Prof Plaatjies. For us Prof Plaatjies was a patriot and an outstanding intellectual who dedicated his life to the course of social justice and nonracialism in South Africa. He made a significant contribution in many areas of endeavours in South Africa. More importantly for us is that Prof Plaatjies was able to ... [Interjections.]

Chair there is an interruption again. So, now I do not know. Should I continue?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Please proceed. Hon Ceza, please mute your mic. Continue.

Mr N L S KWANKWA: Thank you. Prof Plaatjies – one of the outstanding achievements for us was when he elevated the role and the organs of the financial commission to a level where it became a respected institution in South Africa that was able to properly advice the finance cluster committees in Parliament about budgetary and economic issues.

We are aware that in the number of interactions that we had with Prof Plaatjies, he came across to us in particular as a social democrat of note. He was committed to the course of ensuring that the policies that government implements address the past imbalances and backlogs, address issues of inequality and poverty in South Africa. To that we give him a great deal of credit.

We would like to say that as those who are left behind we have to double our efforts and try and strengthen the Financial and Fiscal Commission and empower it with resources to effectively carry ... [Inaudible.] ... mandate. This would be the best way we can honour

the memory of the late Prof Plaatjies and to say thank you very much in order for South Africa to continue to implement the economic policies in that will improve the lives of the poor.

Thank you.

Mr M G E HENDRICKS: Hon House Chair, Al Jama-ah extends our heartfelt condolences to Prof Daniel Plaatjies on his sudden passing away at his home. Prof Plaatjies who served as the Chairperson of the Financial and Fiscal Commission since 2017 also had a passion to keep academic and political education alive. A man of many academic qualifications. He contributed widely towards social justice in South Africa.

He was known as an individual who always guided and supported others and he was held in high esteem for his role in fighting for democracy in South Africa.

He was passionate about making it possible for others to further their education and made significant contribution through scholarships in our country.

Prof Plaatjies was raised in Netreg, in Bonteheuwel will also be remembered as being committed to seeing improvement in the lives of the poor, weak and vulnerable people. He was an extremely,

efficient public servant who will be solely missed by many whose lives he touched. His wife Lydia and children, the husband and farther will be remembered as a man with outstanding quality who served as a public servant, intellectual, educator and a person of integrity. The Cape Flats and townships in Cape Town gave two of his best sons to serve South Africa. We really honour them all three tiers of government must give back to Gugulethu and Netreg in Bonteheuwel give back in terms of guarantying personal safety of those townships who produced leaders of excellence.

South Africa is proud of Gugulethu and Bonteheuwel and their sons. Thank you very much, hon Chair.

Ms E D PETERS: Hon Chairperson, I want to take this opportunity to recognise the Ministers and Deputy Ministers and hon members of this House. I also want to recognise Mrs Plaatjies and the children as well as the family who are on virtual platform; the commissioners, management and the whole staff of the Financial and Fiscal Commission.

Hon members, allow me to preface my tribute by borrowing words from an American poet, Albert Pike, “Whatever we do or whatever we have done for ourselves alone dies with us. What we have done for others and the world remains and is immortal.”

Prof Daniel Plaatjies belongs to the category of people who decided to do things not just for others but more important, he dedicated his knowledge, his expertise, his intellectualism for all the people of South Africa. He consciously and deliberately said:

My voice will not just be for the elite and the intellectuals but I will shout at my highest voice also to represent the downtrodden, the poorest of the poor, the rural women and all those whose voices are too feint to be heard.

Hon Chairperson, before I proceed allow me on behalf of the ANC to pass our heartfelt revolutionary condolences to Mrs Lydia Plaatjies, the children, Danelle, Lidian and Leandré, and the entire family. We will not claim by any stretch of imagination to understand the pain you are going through now. But what you must know is that we are feeling the pain and it is a sharp pain, your loss is our loss, your loss is the loss of the nation of South Africa.

South Africa is poorer without Prof Daniel Plaatjies. Yes, indeed, his deeds are immortal, they won’t die.

Prof Daniel Plaatjies was unique and effective in what he was doing, because he was advising about what he has done himself. His curriculum vitae, CV, which is very impressive, indicates that he invested in himself through many years that he used to study.

About two weeks before his untimely death we had a privilege of being in the committee which interviewed candidates for the director of Parliamentary Budget Office.

We’ve always known he’s a quiet and an erudite person. But never knew that his education took him throughout the world. The interviews provided us with an opportunity to look at his resume more deeply.

He’s the product of the University of the Western Cape. That knowledge explained a lot of things to me in particular; the fact that he graduated in the 80s, comrade hope, at the height of repression. It was at the time when black universities were under siege from the apartheid government. It was at the time when students from these universities found themselves having to fight the system and study at the same time. It was at the time when soldiers camped in these black universities. It was at the time when the students were very clear with their call for equal education. Their call for unbanning of political organisations

like the ANC, the SA Communist Party, SACP, the Pan Africanist Congress, PAC and many others. It was at this time, hon members, when students at these universities called for the release of Nelson Mandela and all political prisoners.

I’m reminding the House of that era because it explains the passion that Prof had about the better med, of the lives of all our people, especially the poorest of the poor.

Prof Plaatjies obtained further education from universities of New York, Manchester, Birmingham and Wits. As I said, hon members, I never knew that until I had to look at his CV during interviews.

It was characteristics of this humble man not to parade that, but all that knowledge was due to help make South Africa a better country.

In the interviews we had in September, Prof Plaatjies was the last candidate, meaning candidate number five. The interviews were live on parliamentary channel and so candidates were not allowed to any gadget. He was technically detained for the whole day before turn, but he never complained a bit, he came in with the energy of a 10- year-old; he was still sharp as razor, he engaged the panellists, and I must say, House Chairperson, that, again, he did not disappoint, his views were forthright and well-thought, he did not

hold back. Sometimes he forgot that he was looking for a job. A man who believed in his conviction and indeed, we were all impressed. At the end of the interview he said...

*Afrikaans*:

Gee ...

*English*:

Because he was asking for his gadgets.

The Money Bills Act, ladies and gentlemen, hon members, enjoins the finance and appropriations committees to consult the Financial and Fiscal Commission, FFC, when it deals with the budget.

As I’m standing here, hon members, I can say without any fear of contradiction that the giant we are bidding goodbye today, performed that function with honour, humility and distinction. But even more important, it was with utmost professionalism and a pinch of humour at all times.

Sometimes as hon members, we can be very intimidating, but Prof Plaatjies was never intimidated. He will always present the findings of the FFC, always backed by rigorous research and analysis with confidence and belief. The questions from members

were always satisfactorily dealt with. When he and his team did not have answers, he was able to say “let us go and check that, we shall come back”. Despite all his accolades, he never claimed to know everything.

One of the things that Prof was not happy about was the fact that we do not have a system in government to measure the impact of the budget on South Africans. He would say “you may get clean audits, but can we say with confidence that indeed the budget we passed has desired impact on the recipients?” That was a rhetorical question because we knew that we don’t have.

The other matter was his concern that the recommendations of the FFC do not get the requisite support from politicians, especially Parliament and government.

Hon members, it is my humble submission to this House, amongst other things, what we must do in honouring Prof Plaatjies, we must find ways of evaluating and auditing the impact of the budget on the lives of South Africans; and how, especially the women, children and rural masses in this country benefit from this budget.

In his honour, SA Social Security Agency, SASSA, must be a true instrument to fight poverty and protect the most vulnerable of society.

We must find ways of establishing whether the budget we pass is resulting in better education, better health, better water and sanitation provision. We must have a better way of establishing and evaluating that a citizen in Musina, in Cofimvaba, in eKangala, ePongolo or in Pokwana or in Prieska and all over South Africa feels the impact of our budget.

I have no doubt, hon members, that we will be giving a most befitting gift that we can give him and his family for the time that he served this country.

On behalf of the ANC and the people of South Africa, once more, I want to thank the Plaatjies family for having shared their son, your spouse Mrs Plaatjies, as well as your brother and family member, with the whole country. His life was indeed dedicated to creating a better South Africa for all.

And I want to quote from the book of Romans 12:6-8 where it talks about the gifts that we have been bestowed as the grace that God has given us.

Prof, according to that text, has served, he taught, he encouraged, he gave off of himself generously, he led diligently and is at all times cheerful, brave and courageous to the end. He did exactly that which his maker expected of him to do.

Hamba kahle [Rest in peace] Comrade Prof Daniel Plaatjies...

*Afrikaans*:

*English*:

You will definitely be missed but your ideas and ideals are indeed immortal. I thank you. [Applause.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON: Hon members, that concludes the tributes. Will members please rise to observe a moment of silence in memory of the lat Prof D Plaatjies, the former Chairperson of the Financial and Fiscal Commission.

Moment of silence observed.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON: The condolences of the House will be conveyed to the Plaatjies family. Thank you, hon members.

# DEBATE ON 16 DAYS OF ACTIVISM FOR NO-VIOLENCE AGAINST WOMEN AND CHILDREN: WOMEN’S ECONOMIC JUSTICE - TOWARDS A NON-VIOLENT AND NONSEXIST SOUTH AFRICA.

The HOUSE CAHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): We will now invite the hon Tlhomelang to the podium.

HON MEMBER: Malibongwe.

*IsiZulu:*

USIHLALO WENDLU (Nk M G Boroto): Akwenziwa lokho, mhlonishwa uNdaba

*English:*

It’s a warning. If you press that button again, you’ll be removed from the platform.

*Setswana:*

Moh K B TLHOMELANG: Modulasetilo wa Ntlo e e tlotlegang, batlotlegi botlhe le MaAforikaborwa otlhe ka kakaretso.

*English:*

Fellow South Africans and hon members, allow me to remind you that, the ANC has been at the forefront of human struggle, by

putting forward a vision for a nonsexist society and institutionalising gender equality and women empowerment through its policies.

Its institutional arrangement and intervention measures, through the National Strategic Plan, NSP, against gender violence and femicide, government stake holders, civil organisation and development partners, adopted a plan to provide a multisectoral coherence strategic policy and programming framework to ensure a co-ordinated national response to the crisis of gender-based violence and femicide, GBVF, by the government of South Africa and the country as a whole.

The vision for the plan is a South African print from gender-based violence directed at women, children and lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender, queer, intersex, and related communities, LGBTQIA+, [Inaudible] in order to achieve a vision for the NSP and GBVF. The plan is structured around six pillars which are the following: Accountability, coordination and leadership; prevention and rebuilding the social cohesion; justice, safety and protection; response, care, support and healing; economic power; and research and information management.

The ANC believes in a nonsexist and equal society and the strengthening of social compact with civil society, uniting all progressive and conservative causes in society with the cause to come up with innovation programmes to eradicate GBV and violence against children. This is why as the ANC we fully support the National Strategic Plan as equality for all. Nonsexism and nonracialism are pillars enshrined within our Constitution.

As the ANC, we recognise that gender equality is a fundamental human right and essential prerequisite for achieving a gender equitable society. It is therefore paramount that we must critically and honestly examine our commitment to gender equality, noting that legislative change must be accompanied not only by policy measures that promote this constitutional principle, but they should also result in implementation of gender equity across all sectors of society, to ensure that we adopt worthy internalised gender sensitive attitude and practices.

Hon members, emphasis therefore, needs to be put on building the blocks of constructing a nonviolent and a nonsexist society.

Attention has to be assessed in the manner that we socialise our children, and in particular, the socialisation of boy children, to respect each other, to take on roles in a male gender stereotype manner. This will lay the foundation of addressing social ills,

and ensuring the mind-set change necessary for nonracism and social cohesion.

Patriarchy is a global cancer setting society for achieving gender equality and the society free of nonsexism. Custom, social and religious systems, including culture, have in the past promoted patriarchy and the oppression of women. The discrimination against women due to the above institutions, took a variety of forms, from the disenfranchisement to various forms of abuse. These institutions are still intact and still practising their culture.

Women’s existence insubordination positions within social relations and their families should be considered with the aim of restructuring society so as to eradicate male domination without eliminating the man. The equality should include both formal and substantive equality, to ensure a total eradication of patriarchy. While patriarchy is a distinctive substance, it does not exist on its own. It thrives on the basic political system under which it exists, becoming a way of life by all.

However, the onus to root out our society from patriarchy, cannot solely rest upon the state, the government alone or one organisation. It requires all the process of society particularly because it coexists with the survived and even under most

progressive political system. We need to decolonise our thinking, deconstruct the idea of patriarchy and begin to reconstruct a new way of thinking about the gender equality as a norm. In other words, we need to move to a total paradigm shift in our thinking, practices and perspectives. The struggle against patriarchy is therefore a struggle within the struggle.

Patriarchy must be urgently addressed by looking at the following areas: changing the environment so that women are in a position to access and exercise their rights, addressing the income gap between men and women, rich and poor; where women are the poor of the poorest, addressing the growing feminisation of poverty, addressing the skewed nature of the private sector and corporate world that reinforces male domination especially at decision-

making levels and accelerating the implementation of our policies and legislation in general.

If we are truly hon members and South Africans, to eradicate patriarchy from our society, we have to address male dominatory behaviour in our young boys, educate your girls on tolerable behaviour and which behaviour not to tolerate. Introduce a normalised gender behaviour in a normal school and challenge normalised sexist behaviour from children from a young age.

Patriarchy divides society and it must be combated in all its forms. Gender stereotype socialisation of girls and boys must be addressed to build social cohesion. Hon members and House Chair, I thank you.

Ms N K SHARIF: House Chairperson, Arch Bishop Desmond Tutu said, if you are mutual in situations of injustice, you have chosen the side of the oppressor. This does not read true than you put it in a context of protecting, advocating and standing on the rights of LGBTQIA+ community. The fight for sustained consistent equality, cannot be assigned for only those who are affected to speak out on, we all have the responsibility to ensure that LGBT community is protected under our Constitution, and the right afforded to every single human being, no matter your race, age, gender or sexual orientation.

We must always in all circumstances be protected. It is the responsibility of this Parliament to ensure that no person will ever be excluded in the attainment of equality. Just like Arch Bishop Desmond Tutu, I stand here today, as an ally to the LGBT community, to use this platform to advocate for the safety of this community. The senseless killings of too many people at the hands of the intolerant, hating and violent society that has no regard for human life, has to stop.

Let us remember and celebrate the lives of Zwelenkosi Zulu, axed and burnt in Eshowe, Liyabona Mabishi, brutally killed by three men in Khayelitsha, Kirvan Fortuin, stabbed several times by a teenage girl in Cape Town, Simangaliso Dyasi, shot several times in Soweto, Lindokuhle Cele brutally stabbed in a full view of a butcher in Umlazi and Portia Mtsweni, who was stabbed in Tweefontein. May Their Souls Rest in Peace.

The level of intolerance in this country is beyond shocking, it is lethal. South Africa continues to lead the African Continent in a legislation that recognises the LGBT community, it was the first to legalise same sex marriages and continues to lead the rest of the continent in the attainment of equality. But however greater the success is, we must never sit back and assume that the work is done, because those who identifies the LGBT, are being targeted by hate crimes every single day.

Mr President, 35% of hate crimes are reported by the LGBT community. This number is not only too high, it is indicative of the type of society we continue to cultivate, a society that makes mutual in situations of injustice, one that says nothing in the face of injustice and deprioritise this large amount of the people because of our own rigid belief of our systems, a society so caught up in the superiority of our own views and opinions, that

it consciously contributes and perpetuate to be a wager of millions of people’s identity, that takes away the right of choice and the right to exist. How dare we?

There is absolutely no person on this earth that can confidently say that they have a power of God, to determine how people live their lives. Imagine how narcissistic we have to be, to believe that we have the right to determine autonomy over others. History continues to teach and show us that when we are unable to be open ourselves to different beliefs, different ideologies, different ways of living and the infinite possibilities of who and what we can do and become, we automatically reject change and reject differences.

We must ensure that we do not stand on the side of the oppressors, and unapologetically without fear or favour, speak out against all types of oppression, regardless of your own belief system and ideology. Thank you, Chairperson.

Ms O M C MAOTWE: Chairperson, every year we come here and utter hollow words at the plight of women and children in this country; words that mean absolutely nothing to the women who were killed yesterday and those who would still be killed today. While we talk in the comfort of our homes, our daughters have no guarantee that

they will come back home alive. Our sisters working as domestic workers have no guarantees that they will not be violated in the taxi ranks as they make their way home.

Our siblings in corporate South Africa have to be content with male bosses who demands sex in order to secure their stay at these companies. Our compatriots in other political parties have to endure with leadership that treats women as positions, to be used and discarded as and when these leaders wish. Women in this country are surrounded by violence. We are engulfed in an ever ending battle just for a simple right to be.

On 02 June, Danielle Maistry, a 20year old, a final year Business Administration Student from Durban was beaten almost to death during an alleged argument. Her partner Steenkamp of 37year old allegedly had a hostaging in his Pinetown home until the police rescued her. On 06 June, Naledi Phangindawo, a 25year old and mother of three from Mosselbay Cape Town was hurt and stabbed to death with an axe allegedly by a partner when she tried to end their relationship. Her partner of 34years is also the father of her children. On 08 June, Tshegofatso Pule, a 20year old who was eight months pregnant and lived in Meadowlands Gauteng was found with stabbed wounds and hanging from a three in Roodepoort.

On 29 July three elderly women were killed in Embihli village in Sterkspruit Eastern Cape after being accused of witchcraft. Early in October, Duduzile Dlamini was murdered by her boyfriend in Orange Farm in Gauteng. There are thousands more cases like this which go unreported. These are ...[Inaudible.]... by a societal culture that refuses to see women as worthy of life, worthy of respect, worthy of dignity. Many of the perpetrators of these crimes are allowed to live freely in a society.

An ANC MEC in Mpumalanga was recently released on bail for raping his own twin daughters and members of his party were seen publicly supporting this MEC in court. We are seeing police beating up women and shooting rubber bullets at peaceful protesting women. We have seen a white man at Brackenfell assaulting a woman. Why is it easy to target women and children and apply maximum force on them? Year in year out, we hear of similar stories, year in year out, we come here only to tick boxes while women across the country are under siege.

We have previously submitted to this House that the scourge of women abuse in this country requires specialised attention. In this regard, we submitted that there must be a permanent portfolio committee tasked with providing oversight to the work done by criminal justice institutions in this country. As things stand,

many cases of rape and abuse go unreported because women will mistrust the police. Many of those that get reported never get prosecuted and only a few of those that eventually get to court and lead convictions.

This leaves women without any confidence in the police because more often they see their abusers walking on the street as free men. The police have lost the fight against gender-based violence, GBV, in this country and there seems to be nobody to have a will to tackle the challenges. We will occupy the space as the EFF. Our GBV desk will liaise directly with women who are victims of GBV. We will force law enforcement agencies to do their work.

No women should ever have to endure what South African women go through every day. No women should ever have to fear walking the streets of this country. It is government failure that has led us to where we are today. And it is up to us as citizens to reclaim our peace, our safety and our security. We must demand accountability from the police. We must agitate for active citizenship and reclaim our state from thugs who act with impunity because they are working with police.

We call on the government of the day to take serious the violations of women and crimes committed against women. It cannot

be business as usual when women and children are being abused, raped, tortured and murdered. Fifteen days of activism against women and children abuse will mean nothing if all we do is to come here and speak and debate with deep English, wearing beautiful suits, while there is no solution to the problems we are facing as a country.

The statistics show that 21 300 cases of murder were reported last year. Over 3000 of those cases are those of murder against women and children. This translates to 14% of murder cases in South Africa. How do we keep quiet when our women and children are killed like flies? Is a woman in South Africa not worth living?

The status quo has to change before it is too late.

Chair, we appeal with men in country to make safe and protect us and not become our perpetrators. We call on men in this country to stand up and say “Not in my name”. We call on men in this country to say “enough is enough”. May our women and children find peace and live normal lives full of joy and prosperity. May our women continue to soldier on despite all the challenges that we are faced with. May there be no woman who has to endure violence for the next 365 days and the next 365. I thank you.

Mr M N NXUMALO: Chair, hon members, as the government launches the

16 Days of Activism against Gender-based Violence, we once again hear of the horrendous reports of the gender-based violence and femicide which we once again hear about the desperate plight of women and children who found themselves confined with the abusers during the time of the pandemic.

We once again hear that the reported sexual offences in 2019-20 had increased. And that a woman was murder every three hours during this period. However, what we don’t hear about is what our government is going to do about this. We have a Gender-based Violence and Femicide National Strategic Plan**,** But how long are we take to implement it. We talk and talk about the establishment of the National Council on Gender-Based Violence and Femicide, but where are the resources to establish this?

In October 2020, the Minister in the Presidency for Women, Youth and Persons with Disabilities, reportedly admitted that there are not enough funds to establish this council. Should the people of South Africa simple accept this? We cannot simple keep talking about gender-based violence running campaigns while the women of this country and children of our country are being tortured by men. We need to enforce accountability, we need to enforce the

promises that were made and not tolerate any more excuses in the fight against gender based violence.

The covid-19 pandemic has undeniable worsened the fate of many vulnerable women and children in our country who still finds themselves at home with their abusers with little access to help. Instead of love and support many women children faced [Inaudible] anger and abuse at home. However, we cannot use this pandemic as an excuse for not providing support, assistance and care to these desperate women and children. We need to find practical and effective ways to reach these vulnerable groups.

In conclusion, the 16 Days of Activism against Gender-based Violence is a stark reminder that we need to do a lot more than what we are already doing. President Ramaphosa, in his latest newsletter, penned that “legislative and policy measures alone cannot read us of the scourge of gender-based violence and femicide.” Yes, I agree with the President, this will not be enough. We have plans in place to fight gender-based violence but we need to implement them. Now is the time for action from hon members, the President and the rest of us. Thank you very much.

Ms H DENNER: House Chair, these headlines from the past 7days read as follows:

Vaal community shocked after women is raped and set alight. Teen mother and boyfriend on the run after death of a toddler. Cape Town mother of two robbed and killed while waiting for a taxi. Another woman aged 80 found murdered in Upington. Parents appear in court for beating baby to death.

Tomorrow marks the start of yet another 16days of Activism against Women and Children Abuse. It is also a little more than a year after mass protest action against GBV took place outside Parliament and little has been done. Yes, there are additional sexual offences courts.

Yes, police officers have apparently undergone, yes toll free GBV helpline, yes action plan. Yes, more shelters, we hear that. But we do not see the drastic results we need to address this very serious situation. In fact, the only thing we do see are news headlines like this and I quote:

Man who kidnapped, raped and murdered six year old girl had raped a child before but got no jail time.

GBV is an endemic problem in our society like a disease that will not be solved merely by treating the symptoms and not the cause. Whether it be socioeconomic circumstances, psychology, substance

abuse socially harmful gender norms or gender stereotypes. If these causes are not addressed, all the shelters, budgets and plans in the world will make absolutely no difference.

Granted government doesn’t have control over the psychological make-up of individuals which is one cause of GBV. It does have control over other causes and factors like some socio-economic circumstances, substance abuse control and yes, gender stereotypes.

Through restricted labour legislation for instance, what started out as a crusade for inequality has turned into a cosmetic quota system that creates the wrong impression that all black people especially women of colour are not deserving of certain positions that are appointed to. This impression is detrimental to those who have worked very hard against many odds to get where they are. On the one side, the ANC-led government purports to be fighting for gender equality, but on the other side, it obstructs its own goal of economic justice for women through legalised discrimination based on race.

*Afrikaans*:

Die vertrapping van vroue van minderheidsgroepe se ekonomiese regte deur die ANC-regering deur minddel van beperkende en

diskriminerende wetgewing, wat veroorsaak dat vroue van hierdie groepe nie kan kwalifiseer vir onder andere studiebeurse, werk en tenders nie is dalk nie fisieke geweld nie, maar die vertrapping van tienduisende vroue en hul gesinne as direkte gevolge hiervan, is weersinwekkend.

*English*:

Before we talk to each other about women’s economic justice towards a nonviolent and non-sexist South Africa, the ANC-led government should sweep before their own door first. If you want to preach gender equality, you have to practice it. If you want to preach economic justice for women, you must practice it. Treat all of us as if we are equal, irrespective of race. Allow us to compete on the basis of merit.

We basically calling to men to say, we have the same qualifications and do the same jobs as us and protect us by doing your jobs. Ensure proper policing and a sound justice system.

Ensure proper service delivery and repair investor confidence, so that our economy can thrive and socio-economic circumstances can improve. Respect us as women and citizens of this country who are worth more than your justifications and excuses. I thank you, House Chair.

Mr W M THRING: House Chair, as we consider this debate, allow me to quote from Robert F Kennedy, who said:

Each time a person stands up for an idea, or acts to improve the lot of others, or strikes out against injustices, he/she sends forth a tiny ripple of hope, and crossing each other from a million different centres of energy, those ripples build a current that can sweep down the mightiest walls of oppression and resistance.

Within the ACDP, we inherently inculcate an environment and lifestyle of no violence against women, children and the vulnerable amongst us. For the ACDP and our members, this position against gender-based violence is not just a slogan for political point scoring, neither is it a media grabbing slogan, rather, it describes who we are and how we live daily, not just for 16 days. As we dare to adopt a zero-based tolerance for any amongst us, who would seek to take advantage of those physically weaker than they are.

It is for this reason that the ACDP supports the many “Boys to Men” programmes, which teaches young men that they are valued, that have purpose, that they are filled with potential and that their plans can become a reality, in the midst of persecution,

they must persevere in order to progress towards becoming productive members of society. We must teach our young men to use their physical attributes to honour, respect, protect the girl- child and the vulnerable amongst us.

Sadly, the vast majority of abuse against women and young girls is perpetrated by men, in the form of sexual violence including rape and sexual assault as well as systemic, institutional and culture based forms of violence. It is time to stop, time to stop the war, stop the battle and to stop the violence against women and children amongst us.

It was Plato who said, ‘Silence gives consent”. In this context, the lack of an appropriate response to violence against women and the girl-child, is a tacit approval of that violent action. We must together say, “Silent no more.”

The ACDP is on record for condemning the violence perpetrated against women and children through pornography. We have consistently said that pornography is the theory and rape, the practice. It is hypocritical to speak out against the act of rape, and sexual violence but not the source. We must be unashamed and bold to go to this source to stop the barbaric and immoral violence against women and children.

As we work towards women’s economic and social justice, we must dismantle the negative narrative of the battle of the sexes. Who created this battle? Who adds fuel to this discourse when clearly we were created equal, both male and female. The ACDP calls on all men to become protagonists and champions of the protection of women and children amongst us. Let the real men stand up and say loudly, boldly and clearly, “Not on my watch and not in my name!”. I thank you.

Mr N L S KWANKWA: House Chair, South Africa faces a myriad of challenges. Chief among these is the prevalence of gender-based violence that we need to deal with, as soon as possible.

Gender-based violence, GBV, is one of the most pervasive violation of human rights in South Africa and globally, with the third of women experiencing this kind of violence. Globally, even before the COVID-19 pandemic began, one in three in women experienced physical or sexual violence mostly by an intimate partner.

In 2020, the numbers increased. Since the outbreak of COVID-19 emerging data shows that all these types of violence had actually become a crisis. As devastating as it is, violence towards women and girls is often justified or sometimes ignored due to the discriminatory social norms, which are fuelled by patriarchy and gender inequality to the society. While campaigns in our hill by

the 16 days of activism are important, they should not be a once off event, because they play such an important role in raising the awareness about the negative impact of GDV on society and children in general.

These campaigns should be ongoing throughout the year, so that South Africa is able to deal with the scorch of gender-based violence in South Africa.

Another form of economic violence, is the gender pay gab, where there is a difference in wages between men and women for the same work of equal value. These are things that society has to deal with concretely as it seeks to address the gender-based violence.

We want the following proposals as the UDM, that: It is everyone’s responsibility to stand up in the fight against GBV inequality and sexism. We must do that is all humanly possible play to ensure a

safe environment for children, women and lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender, questioning (or: queer), intersex, LGBTQI, community.

We are of the that the Department of Basic Education should consider introducing a subject in primary and high schools that will educate learners about the effects and consequences of GBV. Children must be taught while they are still young about all forms

of the abuse. That will not only prevent them from being perpetrators, it will enable them to speak out when faced with similar kinds of abuse.

We are of the view that, government must prioritise strengthening the capacity of law enforcement officials to do thorough investigation of GBV when reported and to provide the necessary support to survivors through the criminal justice process with access to health and social service.

Women’s equal economic and political participation must also be addressed with immediate effect. Women deserve equal participation and influence in economic decision-making. There should be more women present even now - yes we acknowledge the progress made

since 2019, however there is still room for improvement even in Parliament, local councils, provincial legislatures and community associations.

Lastly, the awareness around GBV, in our view – we want to reiterate this point that it should be a daily event, it should be an ongoing campaign that does not wait until the end of the year where we just make nice sound speeches without properly implementing programmes that we adopt. We thank you.

Ms T L MARAWU: House Chairperson, it is not for the first time that the ATM call for the government to prioritise lives of law abiding citizens by doing away with a perpetrators centric system. Overhauling the justice system to favour victims and to ensure that in all what we do, the dignity of victims is preserved at all the times.

At the Men’s Parliament, the hon Deputy Minister of the Department Correctional Services, declared horrific figures that one in every five women over the age of 18 have been exposed to gender-based violence. That number translates to 5,940 000 women who have been grossly violated.

Furthermore, the hon Minister Zulu, alluded to the fact that the financial dependency in women to their men counterparts is one of the many other reasons why women stay in abusive relationships. A loss of income will be catastrophic in their households.

It is for this reason that women empowerment agenda must always be a priority for all departments in government, so as to restore dignity of women.

The ATM is appealing to the Ministry of Small Business Development to ensure that women are participating or are benefiting from the

informal economy, township and inner cities economies, so that women are economically active, so that they are able to sustain themselves.

The private industry must be forced to comply with the Employment Equity Act of 1996, as to ensure that the set guidelines are implemented and recourse must be established for non-implementers of this Legislation.

The right to life as enshrined in the Constitution, cannot be the sole premise of gross violators of the law. If a person takes a life, he or she revokes his or her own right to life, it’s as simple as that. Failure to coexist peacefully in society will bring about turmoil, hence our call for the introduction of a death penalty for killers, murderers and violations.

On 03 September, the ATM wrote to the President that the President exercises his power in terms of section 84 (2g) of the Constitution by allowing public hearings on the introduction of the death penalty. A request which fell short of acknowledgement, yet it echoes the words of many South African women who are tired of hearing expression such as: “President is shocked, the President is concerned” and most recently “the President is worried”.

Let us all join hands and make the point that there are clear programmes that are implemented to save women of this country. We are tired of having a man face case every time a gender-based violence cases erupt. We cannot have adult Precious Ramabulana and Uyinene Mrwetyana who perished at the hands of merciless, repeat serial rapist and murderers. Let us have a new face case her name must be *Justice*. *Justice* must be our new name face case. I thank you House Chairperson.

Mr S N AUGUST: Hon Chairperson, there is no doubt that the physical, emotional and sexual violence against women and children continue to escalate at an alarming rate. No one is born with violence running through their DNA. We are born into a world that has become besieged with violence that we see within our families and our communities.

Unfortunately, there are no pills in the market that will stop sexual predators, disrespecting and attacking women and girls. There is no magic wand available to the state to stop the scourge either.

A seriously functioning criminal justice system would help. No number of police on the streets and prosecutors at the National Prosecuting Authority, NPA, can prevent a father attacking a

mother in the privacy of their home. All of us have to do it ourselves as individuals in our organisations, workplaces and as a society.

How do we do it? The first step is diagnosis. We must acknowledge that we are dealing with a pandemic that never sleeps 365 days per year. We cannot condense our response into 16 Days of Activism and hope it will have an effect for the rest of the year. Sixteen Days of Activism is not a vaccine.

The second step revolves around ownership. The pain of gender- based violence is brewed in our homes, our attitude towards each other and what our children learn from us. We are teaching them early to disrespect girls. Every single South African has a responsibility to question how structures and practices at home contribute to poisoning the minds of our children, specifically our boys.

It is an uncomfortable question. We can’t hide behind our cultures or traditions. If we continue raising our boys with the same set of values, our girls and women will continue to suffer. If you are a leader in your family and an outstanding member of your community, what are you doing to address violence against women and children in your own backyard? That’s where the state comes in

with its policing, criminal justice, education and social development functions.

The GOOD proposes that we redefine the role of police at police stations. They should become hubs of compassion and support, prioritising safety and security while ensuring that perpetrators get the message that if they cross the line, they are going to get caught.

The GOOD proposes that we revisit our prison system. Yes, harsher sentences should be implemented. But what happens after the sentences have been imposed? Are perpetrators being rehabilitated before being allowed back into our societies? Are there enough social workers to support families and communities to counsel victims and to rebuild shattered confidence? What stories are our teachers reading to our children in the early years? We have introduced curriculum changes to contribute to stopping the crisis.

Those are some of the things we can do to stimulate and support behavioural change every day of the year. When we are all swimming in the same direction, we will have banished this flow to history. Thank you, Chair.

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Hon House Chair, over 50% of women that have been killed in South Africa, have been killed by intimate partners. Thirty-six to forty percent of pregnant women have been attacked physically by the intimate partners.

Women continue to suffer physical, vocal, psychological, sexual, socioeconomic, sexual harassment, domestic violence through intimate relationships in South Africa. I want to quote from Prophet Muhammed, peace be upon him, who said:

Only an honourable man treats women with honour and integrity, and only a vile and dishonourable man humiliates and degrades women.

He went to an extent of ensuring that there was an entire chapter in the Holy Quran dedicated just for women and women’s rights.

Hon Chair, you can continue every year in this House to have discussion on gender-based violence but while we have this discussion, we talk about policies, we make a lot of pronouncements through the media, women continue to be raped and murdered. The question that I think we need to ask is that: Are the processes we put in place effective? Clearly, they are not.

It is a great melancholy that things continue to get worse. It is what we call the Red Queen’s race. The statistics ... the view that government’s gender-based violence and femicide command centre alone reported more than 120 000 victims in the first three weeks of the lockdown. By mid-April in Tshwane alone, the call centre was receiving between 5 00 and 1 000 calls a day.

Vodacom call centre saw a 65% increase in calls. Some women and children confined in their homes seeking urgent help. The question that we need to ask is: Are we doing enough? Is the SAPS the Department of Justice and Correctional services not underestimating the seriousness of gender-based violence in South Africa? Should we not go to the root causes of gender-based violence in South Africa?

What is making so many of these so-called men abusers? My colleagues have said previously; they are not born abusers. They become abusers. What has led them to? Should we not go to the root cause and deal with the societal problem of abuse and violence in South Africa. It is not just the abuse and violence on women, even men, to a very large extent are now being abused because we live in a very violent society.

Let’s look at the case of Wongeka Vimbayo, another victim of Khayelitsha who was killed and her eyes were gouged out. This woman’s family has a reason to believe that she was raped before she was even killed.

Just a week ago, in the *Cape Times* you read about a 22-year-old woman, Wendy Dyubeni from Nyanga was assaulted by her boyfriend with a hammer. These murders are becoming brutal. It means we live in a very violent society.

The NFP believes a lot needs to be done. Thank you very much.

Ms A L A ABRAHAMS: Thank you, House Chair, South Africa’s economy was already embattled before the pandemic and now even further downgrades, deeper into junk. Thousands more will trip into extreme poverty, this year.

Economic reconstruction and recovery plan has taken another devastating blow. In this plan, President Cyril Ramaphosa outlined mostly infrastructural measures and made relatively small mention to gender-based violence and femicide, which is filled by gender inequalities and economic disparities between men and women.

What is scary is that it now may be just a footnote since there will be even less money for schools, clinics, social services and gender-based violence.

Abuse is not a social development only problem. It’s not women, youth and persons with disabilities only problem. It’s a systemic and societal problem.

If government truly acknowledges that gender-based violence is a second pandemic and if it wants to strive to end the abuse of women and children, the 365-day campaign must be a whole of government approach. The solution is that every portfolio must work together. That is why the economic cluster must suggest financial independence and equal pay for women because economic justice for women is fixing the fact that for every one rand a man earns, a woman makes 69 cents in medium hourly rate.

We need a transport portfolio to support that young who supported a female only taxi service in Khayelitsha because women were getting abused and raped in taxis. I wonder how much of that supposed R1,3 billion will be for female owning taxis.

We need a Human Settlements Department to prioritise women exiting Victim Empowerment Programme, VEP, shelters because where else can they go if they have nowhere else to go but back to their abuser.

We need the peace and security cluster to protect us and combat corruption in the SAPS and the criminal justice to restore confidence and not let communities down time and time again, like in the case of Lauren Braiden from Bonteheuwel. Lauren, a young mother of two who was murdered while waiting for a lift after a night shift on Friday. Her toddlers are forever robbed of their mother now join the 12,7 million children receiving a Sassa child support grant because Lauren’s income is no more.

I learned at the bail hearing yesterday, the accused, in and out of prison is allegedly accused of murdering another woman 10 years ago. That woman’s 11-year-old daughter was at the court yesterday. Repeat offenders and murderers cannot become the norm.

I want to highlight the importance of building and strengthening the family unit, which is the most basic unit in the society. A stable family unit equals a stable society. A thriving family unit equals a thriving South Africa.

We achieve this not only through the Department of Social Development and nongovernmental organisations-run family strengthening programmes but again with a whole of government and the whole of society with the help of educators in schools and employee support in the workplace just to name a few.

By employing the 9 000 social workers, who are unemployed yet qualified in all of government portfolios as outlined in the 2018 Cabinet resolution. Every portfolio must play its part in gender- based violence.

Lastly, the top five of the 17 global sustainable development are: no poverty; zero hunger; good health and wellbeing; quality education and gender equality.

If the world can understand that we need to prioritise society first, people first, and surely South Africa can understand that too. Thank you, House Chair. [Applause.]

Mr S M KULA: House Chair, I must indicate that I have got a problem to start my video, the host is unable to disable me. If I can be disabled House Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G BOROTO): No you are not on video and we can clearly hear you clearly, you may proceed.

Mr S M KULA: Hon House Chair, presiding officers of Parliament, Ministers and Deputy Ministers, Members of Parliament, organisations dealing with women and children, special greetings to all women and children of our country, iimbali ezintle (beautiful flowers) and also special greetings to the Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Transgender and Intersex, LGBTI community.

The former President of FRELIMO in Mozambique, His Excellency Samora Machel once remarked in the opening speech at the first conference of the Mozambican Women on 4 March 1973, I quote:

The Emancipation of women is not an act of charity, the result of a humanitarian or compassionate attitude. The liberation of women is a fundamental necessity for the revolution, a guarantee of its continuity and a precondition for its victory.

Seventeen years before this particular address by President Samora Machel, in our own country on 9 August 1956, 20 000 women staged a march at the Union Buildings in Pretoria to protest against the proposed amendments to the Native Urban Areas Act of 1923 under

the capable leadership of mama Sophie De Bruyn, Hellen Joseph, Lillian Ngoyi and many other women. The significance of their march must dawn to this Parliament and this nation at this moment, as it did in 1956.

House Chair, it is therefore important to not acknowledge but congratulate mama Kamala Harris on her election as Vice-President of the United States of America. Her humble words of acceptance of the momentous task ahead should sound to inspire many young girls across the globe. Commenting on her election she said, I quote:

I may be the first woman of colour to be elected to such high office, but I will surely not be the last.

Women continue to play a critical role today as the ones did in the past to shape a South Africa, Africa and the world we can be proud of.

Gender based violence and femicide is a wide spread problem in our country negatively impacting in the life of women and children.

The crime against women in South Africa’s statistics reports shows that femicide is five times higher in our country that anywhere else in the world. It is entrenched in all facets of societal life.

The fight against gender based violence and femicide does not need cheap politicking, point scoring or out manoeuvring of political opponents. It needs us all as South Africans to stand in one voice and say, enough is enough.

House Chair, Through the eye of a needle? An ANC 2001 National Working Committee, NWC document says, I quote:

Those in leadership positions should unite and guide the movement to be at the head of the process of change. They should lead the movement in its mission to organise and inspire the masses to be their own liberators.

House Chair indeed, in President Cyril Ramaphosa and the leadership collective, we have such a leadership especially when it comes to dealing with the question of gender based violence and femicide. Under the capable leadership of President Ramaphosa, we have developed the Emergency Response Action Plan which has got the following focus areas:

Broadening of access to justice for survivors. Changing social norms and behaviour. The creation of more economic opportunities for women. This must also be coupled with equal pay for men and

women doing the same job. It also speaks to strengthening existing architecture and promoting accountability.

House Chair, this plan was developed with the buy-in of all the political parties in this Parliament after the President convened a joint sitting of Parliament to address gender based violence, GBV and femicide. Government departments rallied behind the plan sourcing around R1,6 billion trough budget reprioritising. This reprioritised budget allowed resources to be redirected to network of sexual offences courts, Thuthuzela care centres, SAPS family units, child protection and sexual investigation units.

House Chair as we speak now, evidence collecting kits are now available in all police stations across the country. Our hard working President; President Ramaphosa went further by introducing new Bills that will deal with the challenge of GBV and femicide namely, the Bill to Amend Criminal Law of Sexual Offences and Related Matters. The amendment of this act recognises sexual intimidation as an official offence which it had not done before. This means that, if you are threatened by somebody’s behaviour towards you, verbally or otherwise, you can report that baloka and seek legal action. The Bill also increased the reporting duty of those who suspect that the child is a victim of a sexual offence.

The second one is the Criminal and Related Matters Amendment Bill. With this Bill, those accused of GBV could only be granted bail under exceptional circumstances. If these circumstances were accepted, the court will then have to consider a number of things before granting bail including whether or not the survivor would feel safe with the decision.

Lastly, is the Domestic Violence Amendment Bill. The Bill would extend the definition of domestic violence to include victim of assault in those engaged to be married, those who are dating, those in customary relationship and those in actual or perceive romantic, intimate or sexual relationship of any duration. This means that, if you are hurt by someone that you have been casually dating, you would be able to make a case against them under the Domestic Violence Act.

The fight against GBV, femicide and child abuse cannot be left to government alone, for women or their organisation to fight alone or vulnerable children to fight on their own. It needs men and women of courage and resilience. House Chair, more importantly it needs us as young men of this country to stand up and be counted.

Generations before us have fought side by side with society to rid it of its problem. It was the founding generation of the Congress

Youth League in the late 1940’s that was instrumental in radicalising the ANC and compelling it to adopt a massed defence programme. It was the bold generation of 1976 who took on the brutal apartheid regime span killers of note and demanded the abolition of Afrikaans as a medium of instruction and demanded better education. It was the bold generation of Young Lions in the 1980’s who brought apartheid with needs, rendering its machinery unhackable and ungovernable.

House Chair, how can I forget the golden generation of the ANC Youth League that converged in Gallagher Estate under the leadership of President Julius Malema, which converged under the theme: Youth Action for Economic Freedom in our Lifetime, which called for nationalisation of the commanding heights of economy such as the expropriation of land without compensation, the nationalisation of mines, nationalisation of the SA Reserve Bank. It is not by accident that these resolutions were later some of them adopted by the 54th National Conference of the ANC.

What will our generation be remembered of when the nation grapples with GBV and femicide? We watched in awe ...[Interjections.]

Ms O M C MAOTWE: House Chair, House Chair, I want find out if the speaker can take a question.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G BOROTO): Hon Kula are you ready for a question?

Mr S M KULA: No, House Chair I am not going to take a question. Can I continue? Hon Maotwe, my e-mail address is SKula@parliament.gov.za, you will send your question there. [Applause]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G BOROTO): Thank you, proceed. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G BOROTO): Hon Maotwe please. Please hon Maotwe. Hon Kula proceed.

Mr S M KULA: House Chair, we watched in awe as the nation was grappling with COVID-19 pandemic for months, while the minds of many youth and young man in particular were preoccupied with peripheral issues. While some volunteered in the provision of much needed Personal Protective Equipment, PPE’s and basics, many sat on the side line as spectators in the game they should be playing.

Many of us knows our friends who are abusing their girlfriends, but choose to keep quiet out of disguise of protecting our friendship. You are not innocent; you are an accomplice in the

bashing of women. Many of us knows of our friends that force themselves on women using date rape drugs and alcohol, but we choose to keep quiet. Many of us knows of our friends and older men who are dating underage girls from poor and disadvantaged families, yet we keep quiet. Many of us knows of family members, relatives, village mates, street mates who are responsible for GBV, yet we keep quiet. Your quietness is quite quietening.

If it was your sister, were you still going to keep quiet? If it was your daughter, were you still going to keep quiet? If it was your loved one, were you still going to keep quiet? Being quiet is a crime against women and children’s existence in society.

We must also call on parents of children who are sexually abused or molested, to stop hiding perpetrators. Stop accepting dirty money of those responsible for ruining your child’s future. No amount of dirty money will buy the future of your child.

House Chair, the ANC’s Ready to Govern document declared that:

Women should be able to walk in the streets freely without fear of assault and should be able to feel safe and free from violence in their own homes.

Let me close my address by quoting what President Ramaphosa said:

The women of South Africa have had enough of lukewarm actions that do not address one of the most fundamental rights of all

– to live in freedom from fear.

President Mandela was correct that; our society needs to re- establish a culture of caring. We also want to call on the young students in universities that ... [Inaudible.] They must focus on education. Thank you very much House Chair.

Mr M G E HENDRICKS: Hon House Chair, South Africa will be a failed state if we cannot eliminate violence against women and children. The true sense of the 2019-2020 Crime Statistics have painted a very graphic picture of the state of crime and violence against women and children in our country. This indicates that we are a failed state.

However, I attended a meeting of global parliamentarians recently, and it seems as if this is a thing in many other countries. So, this in an international challenge. Hon House Chair, President Ramaphosa has taken the lead to tell men not to harm women, but nothing has changed. With the highlight, some of the possible witnesses, the Minister of Justice and Correctional Services has

fingered his own department as becoming more and more ineffective and has given us hope that when a permanent director-general is appointed, this will change.

Let us think of that as one of the things why President Ramaphosa’s plea to the nation has not been implemented. On a more practical level, we need women that are abused, there is a need for such, this has been echoed in this House several times. The problem is, is that the minimum standards for these has not been established. I think the reason is, if government established a minimum standard, they will have to provide funding to ensure that the minimum standards are implemented.

The delay in providing funding even if the minimum standards is being rolled out is a big problem. If we fail to protect women, at least when they hurt, we need to protect them with a safe haven. I want to think out of the box. I heard our respected Speaker talked about the standby force for Africa, and that force – to silence the guns, must be manned by at least one third of women. Maybe we need a standby force in every village, in every town, in every province in South Africa to deal with this particular problem and yes women then, to take a lead, maybe we won’t be classified as a fail state. Thank you very much hon House Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G BOROTO): Hon House Chair, can I – I am sorry to interrupt. The name of hon Madisha for COPE and hon Nyhontso for PAC unfortunately was not sent to you. They are available to participate. Thank you House Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T FROLICK): So, the next speaker id hon Madisha?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G BOROTO): Yes, followed by hon Nyhontso, PAC. Thank you.

Mr W M MADISHA: Hon Chairperson, limiting activism for no violence against women and children to only 16 days, is less significant and all important, that is because of where the real South Africa comes from and where it finds itself today. South Africa’ terrible path which has contributed to the horrendous challenges South Africans face today, require more than 16 days of activism. The horrendous challenges South Africans are forced to endure, require

365 days, not of one year, but of many, many years.

It is unfortunate that this intended action gets raised when many amongst us are faced with elections and want hang to be cleft and women become happy that they will get promotions, the jobs will be created for them, the violence shall stop, the children will be

safe and hunger will be ended. After elections, all the temporary required support, all promises are forgotten and the following five years are just wasted. When the support of the downtrodden and the poor is required for victory, we go back and say, women and children.

Now, looking at the children, those whose job it is to establish numbers of people who suffer from particular programme have emerged with empirical evidence that shows that, though the present government promised a free and quality for the children, the opposite is the cake. However, those who can send their children to expensive schools, such as the Model-C schools as an example, do so. Secondly, go to the villages and townships, where children are either in the streets taking drugs or in shebeen drinking, girl children are sold for sex, or even get abducted and taken beyond our seas by those who want to make money.

Look at women, yes, their rights are violated, extremely so. Let’s start here. How many parties are led by women? Is it not true that many women are denied jobs which pays equally occupied by us, men? How do women feed children as we men give children but do not care, post birth of those children? How many women occupy the streets at night to sell their bodies so that they can take children to school and eat? How many women must first go to bed

with men so that they can get jobs? Hon members, we all know this, but we repeat it every year and we say that 16 days have got to be taken forward.

I call on all of us, the 400 members of the National Assembly to change this, and truly, not just come here and say that we want this to happen. We’ve got to make sure that we implement this. You got the power. Please, do so. Thank you very much.

*IsiXhosa:*

Mnu B B NODADA: Sihlalo weNdlu, malungu ahloniphekileyo...

*English*:

...fellow South Africans...

*IsiXhosa*:

... molweni.

*English:*

I want to start by emphasizing the overdue call by the singer, Loyiso, when he said ...

*IsiXhosa:*

Ye madoda sabelani

Ye madoda nqandani Yilo le ngozi Sithi le ngozi

*English:*

... simply means, we need to answer a clarion call about our sisters, daughters, mothers, grandmothers and our women in the society to protect them from us men, because we are the danger to them. They are not feeling safe at home, schools, work and in the streets. I was raised by a single mother and the three brothers. She often lived her days in silent tears and despising anything that had to do with men, because of the abuse experience in the hand of men.

Meanwhile, my eldest brother was criminally imprisoned for 18 years, regardless, I was still expected to be an example to my little brother, grow up to be a gentleman of character, become a husband I have never seen, bare children and be a fatherly example I have never experienced. It sounds rather controversial, but the development of a boy-child is of utmost importance, for the moral etiquette of the society and safety of a woman. It all starts with us today, as men in this Parliament, by declaring 365 days of activism from all of us men in South Africa. [Applause.]

It’s hardly spoken about proactively, but immensely challenged reactively. Often, 16 days of activism is merged with slogans and condemnation, I am not one of those men. It’s not enough, gentlemen. It’s high time that we as men take tangible action, and it starts with acknowledgement that, the legacy of colonialism, apartheid and continued patriarchy, which saw the brutal and systematic oppression of black people and women in particular, has left our society with deep emotional and mental scars.

Some of the ways in which these deep scars manifest themselves, are seen through the senseless and brutal headlines that we as men continue to make. We live in a society of fatherless homes, abusive husbands, drug abuse and criminal men and men who generally run away from their responsibilities without any accountability. Young boys in our communities grow up exposed to such conditions, and yet expected to be outstanding citizens of the Republic, without having been equipped with necessary life schools and guardian to break the circle.

Men of character and principles that can be role models for future generations are few and far in between. Little proactive steps have been taken by us men, to address the consistent development of the boy-child, that immensely contributes to society’s atrocities like crime, rape, abuse, violence, absent fathers and

the cycle of breeding this immoral status quo, is not challenged with the vigour it deserves.

*IsiXhosa:*

Noko madoda zizinto zakudala ezo.

*English:*

Being a man should not be about how much physical strength you possess or how cool you are to your peers, but what principles and values guard your life and the examples you set thereof, coupled with a good character and the responsibilities from the society, the individual self and those that are a potential threat from collective peace. It is high time we exercise empathy, just the ability of walking in someone else’s shoe. Our daily actions moving forward, must be to challenge our status quo, with the vigour which enhances high masculinity and the vigour to challenge misguided patriarchy.

The aim, therefore, must be to achieve more etiquette. It is about learning, unlearning and relearning. Therefore, I am calling, that Parliament and the President of South Africa, must launch an action-based 365 days of activism, led by men, with specific, tangible change targets in law, in policy and government implementation, and call those men in business and society, to

launch the same campaign. In closing, I want to say, gentlemen, it starts today, where we challenge this vigorous gender-based violence and femicide, with 365 a year, seven days a week and 24 hours a day. It starts by joining women and children now in this

16 days of activism to fight this evil scourge. I thank you. [Applause.]

Ms M C C PILANE-MAJAKE: Hon Chairperson, from the speeches of the political parties, it’s quite evident that the scourge of gender- based violence in South Africa has really reached high levels of frustration, but some of the political parties are of course actually indicating and advising us what can be done, but to some extent you hear some of the political parties like the EFF with what hon Mente is saying, those utterances are hollow.

It’s a message that is pessimistic under a very difficult situation, and I do agree with hon Shaik Emam to say that, we need to understand that the society is very violent and the hon members of Al Jama-Ah indicating that there must be some kind of armies.

You know, it’s ideas that we knew in the moment like these, in order for us to manage and proceed with the measures of dealing with this scourge of gender-based violence. It is really frustrating the country.

Hon Chairperson, as we begin to commemorate the United Nation’s programme on 16 days of activism against gender-based violence, we do it with an understanding that, the onus of addressing gender- based violence can never rest with government alone. It is our duty as public representatives, to strengthen our oversight mechanisms as law makers, it is our responsibility to assess on continuous basis the impact of implementation of legislative framework put together to promote peace and development for better life for all.

Public representatives must infuse gender-based violence in the parliamentary constituency programmes to popularise gender measures put in place to combat gender-based violence and communicate progress made in dealing with this scourge per sector. Socioeconomic factors that negatively influence the situation of women are being exacerbated by COVID-19 pandemic. Statistics illustrates that women on ... [Inaudible.] ... are most impacted by the devastating effects of COVID-19 such as job losses.

This occurrence, further widens inequality gap and increase vulnerability already faced by women in our society. Studies also reveal that most of unemployed persons in the country are women, due to lack of educational skills. It is therefore paramount to continue to expedite education and training for women, as a

redress mechanism for the difficult past that denied most women globally the right to education. Education, training and skilling of women should not be an ... [Inaudible.] ... but the means to an end that leads to peaceful and prosperous life for women and children, in a world where women have equal access to opportunities and life resources.

The ANC believe in a social compact with stakeholders such as community leaders, cultural leaders, interface organisations and traditional leaders, to create a pool of ambassadors and advocates against gender-based violence and violence against children and femicide. This belief re-emphasises the importance of establishing the national gender machinery historically used as a spectre stakeholder platform to co-ordinate mainstreaming and monitoring of gender issues in accordance with prescripts of the National Gender Policy Framework.

We continue to rely on the broad mandate of the Commission for Gender Equality as a constitutional body that should be adequately well-resourced to ensure that the struggles of women at all levels, are properly monitored. This is what is quoted in Pilane- Majake’s Doctoral thesis. Community policing and safety forums must be strengthened, leading in government in Parliament.

The ANC is the only leading party in South Africa with progressive gender equality policies. We will continue towards eradication of patriarchy.

The Women’s Caucus in Parliament is anxiously waiting for the reintroduction of Women Empowerment and Gender Equality Bill, and will address these concerns. As the ANC we welcome and appreciate every effort of men who come together to find solutions and to put an end to gender-based violence. As the ANC, we are alive to the fact that the lives of women and children in South Africa are under siege. In line with the ANC 54th Conference Resolution on peace and stability, security systems must be stepped up, to improve public safety.

The task is mammoth, but the peace and security cluster is on an ongoing basis engaging on this intent, with efforts put in place to strengthen already available protection mechanisms to women and children, there should be no longer be women who die with the protection order in the hand, this is an extent on which law and order is undermined in South Africa. Responsible citizenry must be ignited for the sake of advancement of this that we all love, our country South Africa.

There should no longer be a woman who doubly victimised by how she is treated at the police station when she opens a case against the perpetrator. We welcome the Domestic Violence Bill before Parliament. The Bill reintroduces obligations to relevant functions to respond responsibly. There should no longer be easy bail conditions for someone who has blatantly murdered a woman or a child. We welcome the Criminal and Related Matters Amendment Bill, that is currently before Parliament.

There should no longer be a woman who finds it easy to withdraw a case once she is back with the perpetrator who will most likely at a later stage ... [Inaudible.] ...in some cases to gather her children. The pattern is the same. There should no longer be a woman who remains in a violent relationship because she is financially dependent. As public representatives, we will continue to push for all developmental plans to be inclusive of women.

There should no longer be repeat offences against women and children, because the perpetrator has been allowed to go back to society and protected.

We welcome the Criminal Law Amendment Bill, that is currently before Parliament. Offenders should remain in register for longer periods and the register will be publicly available. As we move into the Fourth Industrial Revolution, we must continue to make

technology mandatory in planning high prevention. When we talk harsher sentences, it should be because, high cases are brought before the courts.

The political parties in Parliament, are in agreement with collective efforts towards the eradication of gender-based violence. The Portfolio Committee for Women and the Multi-Party Women’s Caucus will continue to drive such initiatives in Parliament. Providing oversight is the work of ministry for women, as an implementing arm for policies and plans towards eradication of gender-based violence.

In the wise words of Tata Nelson Rolihlahla Mandela, I quote: “For every woman and girl violently attacked, we reduce our humanity.” Let us work together to become a better society and a better world. I thank you.

The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY FOR WOMEN, YOUTH AND PERSONS WITH

DISABILITIES: Hon Chairperson, hon members, distinguished guests, ladies and gentlemen, “dumelang” [greetings]. This year marks the 22nd year since South Africa joined the global community in intensifying the activism to challenge the violence by men against women and children and to prevent and eliminate the scourge. In the 22 years since joining the campaign of no violence against

women and children, South Africa has been lauded by the UN for the work we have already done, but COVID-19 has opened up the wounds that we plastered on about the realities of where real black women are and what they are still suffering from. They are still unemployed; they are still facing the scourge of poverty, homelessness and hunger.

Your Excellencies, we mark the 16 Days of Activism campaign not only to raise awareness about negative impact of violence that have beset women and children, but most importantly to take decisive steps against the abuse of women and children because they suffer these abuses from men who are inferior. We are making a call that real men can stand up, ‘kha vha takuwe vha yime” [stand up] so that we work together. The work starts right here in Parliament. Let us say, no, to violence against women and children, no, to rape and, no, to human trafficking particularly children. Let us ensure that perpetrators of these crimes are punished by our courts. Say, no, to the so-called corrective rape against our lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender and queer (or questioning) and others, LGBTQ+. The empowerment of women cannot be achieved without the socioeconomic transformation of society to accelerate socioeconomic growth and to overcome the triple challenges that women have faced over the years as they were struggling for freedom.

The 16 Days of Activism for No Violence Against Women and Children campaign commences tomorrow 25 November. The theme for this year is: Economic justice for a nonviolent and nonsexist South Africa. This reminds me of one of our forebears, our mother, Charlotte Mannya-Maxeke, and I quote:

This work is not for yourselves. Kill that spirit of self and do not live above your people but live with them, and if you can rise, bring someone with you.

The theme which I read earlier on is timely and relevant because women’s economic empowerment is integral to the achievement of gender equality and the eradication of gender-based violence and femicide and building a non-sexist South Africa. It releases women not to get stuck in relations that don’t work but because they will have nowhere to go from here to shelters it not killed in between.

Economic empowerment recognises that the link between women enduring abusive situations due to their financial positions and the important of empowering women to be educated and stand independent citizens participating in the wellbeing of the society of South Africa particularly now as we are folding up our arms and pulling up our socks to revitalise our economy. Some male hon

members like hon Nodada was suggesting that maybe we need some organisations of men. There are many groupings and civil society organisations that are out there, but our need is to focus on the implementation of the national strategic plan which came with the civil society and adopted by Cabinet. It is now being brought to Parliament so that we fully legislate the formation of the council.

We have six pillars which are very important. They remind us that women don’t die in the sky, but they die in their bedrooms, they die in the street corners and they die in the localities they know very well, and sometimes by people who are supposed to love them. So, “sithi kwanele” [hence we say, it’s enough]. Let us have one focus. We are implementing a national strategic plan which is not a government’s plan, which is not a civil society’s plan, but a call to the nation that all of us from traditional leaders, healers, priests, bishops, chiefs of any sorts let us come together including this big church, Parliament. Let us eradicate this scourge which is not COVID-19. Yes, working together we can get rid of this scourge that can only be claimed by patriarchy.

South Africa is ready to work with other nations and also continue to be a multilateralist. That’s why we have signed on the International Labour Organization, ILO, Violence and Harassment

Convention, 2019, C190, which establishes global standards for the protection of women in the world of work. A commitment to earmark 40% of preferential procurement to women who own business nationally as well as capacitating women business through registration, compliance, procurement, regulatory provisions, financial literacy, marketing tools and access to markets and access to finance and opportunities. We fought for freedom and we were not bystanders. I’m talking about South African women from generation to generation.

The campaign targets South Africans at national, provincial and district levels with the following three objectives: firstly, to strengthen the implementation of the national strategic plan by all social partners; secondly, to expand the call for action to real men - our partners - and boys to stand against rape and sexual abuse of women and children; and thirdly, to increase awareness and drive change in relation to negative social norms and behaviour through multiple platforms, sectors and activism. Yes, I agree that we are just but 26 years old and South Africa has seen too much violence during the most difficult times when we were fighting for the nation’s freedom.

The official commemoration of the 16 Days of Activism starts on 25 November 2020. It will commence at the Union Buildings during the

early hours of the morning at 5:30 by hoisting the flag half-mast. The event will signify five days of remembrance of the loved ones we have lost and children who lost their lives through gender- based violence and femicide and COVID-19. In the afternoon from 17:00 to 19:30, the President, His Excellency, Cyril Matamela Ramaphosa will hold a dialogue with South Africans on gender-based violence. This will be a virtual dialogue and will be broadcasted on TV and social media platforms. This is in line with the original commitment of South Africa after joining the 16 Days of Activism that we will do what the nations of the world through the UN do, but we shall also stick to what we have already committed to, the 365 days of no violence against women and children. Don’t look the other way. If a woman screams next door, it is your business; if a child is found dead in the street, it is your business; and it is our business. We are our brothers and sisters’ keepers.

On the gender-based violence and femicide, GBVF, national strategic plan you are aware that we have five pillars. Because of time I will focus on just two. One of our hon members read them out one-by-one to the House. Pillar 2 talks about prevention and restoration of social fabric of our society. We have spoken for many years about after the effect where the incident has already happened. This time around we are making a call that we focus on

prevention. We are out and about signing memorandums of understanding, MoUs, that work with every sector of the society that raise its hand and say, count me on, from taxi associations, faith-based organisations, traditional leaders and so on as I said earlier on. We will continue on that theme.

This year our focus, as I said earlier on, is on Pillar 5, the economic empowerment and economic justice designed to redress the inequalities with regards to access to economic opportunities for the majority of the population in pour country, which is women.

This morning Oxfam confirmed that talking about economic participation South African women are found right at the bottom of the ladder. This is something we cannot leave for a day after. We need to address this now. All the undertakings that government makes should move from national to province to districts to local municipalities. To all of us in Parliament let us champion the six pillars of the national strategic plan, NSP.

In conclusion, I am calling dear brothers and sisters and hon members that let us commemorate our fallen heroines and those who passed on because of COVID-19 by wearing black for the coming five days starting from tomorrow if you can. I am calling upon the nation to repair social fabric of our nation to eradicate all the ills in our society and make sure that morality rebuilds. We need

society all of us and government to work together to break the silence, to not look the other way, and for men and boys to be partners as we work for the society that is free from gender-based violence and femicide. Siya quva [We continue]. Let us go and correct our wrongs. I thank you, Chair.

Debate concluded.

# CONSIDERATION OF BUDGETARY REVIEW AND RECOMMENDATION REPORT OF PORTFOLIO COMMITTEE ON TOURISM

There was no debate.

The Deputy Chief Whip of the Majority Party moved: That the Report be adopted.

*Declarations of vote:*

Mr R A LEES: House Chairperson, the Budget Review and Recommendations Report, BRRR, report for Tourism paints the sombre picture of the ravenous damage done to the sector about the COVID-

19 pandemic - and also about the hardest and longest lockdown in the world, exacerbated by readjust the strategy that had a devastating impact on travel and tourism. The report again recognises tourism through the National Development Plan, the New

Growth Path and various state of the nation addresses as one of South Africa’s six economic pillars as labour intensive sector with the wide value chain. And yet, despite this, tourism remains underfunded - something that was recognised as early as 1996 in the White Paper and constantly highlighted by the DA since.

Unsurprisingly, the report confirms the committee’s dissatisfaction with Treasury’s response to calls to reprioritise the Tourism budget in the light of the villagers, towns and small towns focus, and indeed, Tourism’s contribution to the GDP and labour-intensive focus. Tourism is the hardest hit of all sectors in the pandemic. The BRRR therefore correctly reflects the industry and committee view that the R1 billion deducted from its budget be reimbursed, especially since the report confirms that the industry has successfully balanced lives and livelihoods through industry safety protocols.

The 2020 state of the nation address amplified tourism as the multi-disciplinary sector which can only succeed to a whole government approach. Lastly, we welcome undertakings by Home Affairs to move forward on the ... [Inaudible.] ... but remain deeply concerned as to what the report describes as the shallowness of safety and security’s response to tourism sector initiatives. Equally, the report once again describes poor project

planning and implementation which does many tourism projects. If Tourism is to make any inroads into our unemployment crisis, where

13 million people are out of work - collectively, we are going to have to do better than this. Thank you, House Chairperson.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Thank you, hon member. Hon members, those who followed the hon member should have noted that he has set a very good example because the declarations are only two minutes, and he spoke two minutes on the spot. The EFF?

Mr P G MOTEKA: House Chairperson, the EFF rejects the budget review recommendation report of the Portfolio Committee on Tourism. Just a week ago, South Africa lost one of the most outstanding patrons, Auditor-General Kimi Makwetu. He left behind a mountain of work detailing what is wrong with financial management of government work in this country. The Department of Tourism and its entity have never taken seriously any form of recommendations from the Auditor-General and from the portfolio committee in the previous years.

Since the 2018-19 financial year, the Auditor-General has made recurring findings against the department and its entity. Amongst the issue he raised, he indicated that the internal financial control systems which are in place were not applied and monitored

and as a result, the irregular expenditure of about R8,4 million was incurred by the department. The South African Tourism and entities of the department incurred about R49 million in irregular expenditure. This is in regard of the recommendations by the Auditor-General to fix administrative and accounting irregularities in the department so that those who are in power can still keep the taps of corruption open. Besides this, the tourism sector is one of the least transformed sectors in the country. It is dominated by the white people who own tourism destinations; who own hotels and B&Bs, and who pays the majority of black workers peanuts. We reject this department sheer inability to make tourism a growth opportunity to black people in this country. I thank you, House Chairperson.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Thank you, hon member. You have done very well. The IFP?

Mr K P SITHOLE: Hon House Chairperson, tourism during this particular period was ... [Inaudible] ... the industry is still struggling and will continue to struggle for a number of years for it to recover due to the pandemic. Fortunately, tourism both international and domestic is now open and we look forward to the industry seeking positive results during this summer season.

In this respect, it is vital that all tourism in South Africa should be opened subject, of course, to the necessary COVID-19 protocols in place. This must extend to and include domestic-based passenger ocean cruise liners for both local and international cruise lines. Destination development would be critical in years to come and it is essential that all department entities such as the Department of Environment, Forestry and Fisheries and its entity Sanparks environmental programme from a sustainable tourist viewpoint.

Irregular expenditure remains an issue and must be done collectively in this regard will be provided so that it will not be a repeat finding next year. Procurement and contract management as well as departmental vacancies hampers service delivery and must be addressed. As tourism is highlighted as a good sector and an economic pillar of South Africa must not done to ensure that all departments’ targets are met in future. The IFP supports the BRRR report. Thank you very much.

Mr I M GROENEWALD: Hon House Chair, the tourism sector was commissioned in the New Growth Path as one of the six economic pillars of South Africa is welcomed by the FF Plus, but the intention thereof is wrongly placed. Transformation of the sector should not be ... [Interjections.] [Inaudible.] ... Tourism is not

a hero of our economy but it is truly a great start in rebuilding our economy. Stop working so hard to keep whites out of the sector, but rather focus on how to get young black entrepreneurs that would think out of the box into the comparative market.

Tourism has the potential to uplift all communities because this is the one sector where the contributions of the communities are appreciated.

This is a type of sector that put interests on the rich cultures that South Africa has. Is the ANC not contributing to what South Africa has to offer by excluding certain group of people, like that of the Khoisan’s contribution to the rich South African culture. Money earmarked for different projects disappeared across all spheres of government. The President said a year back that corruption cost South Africa close to R1 trillion, but only

R200 million is given to the tourism sector as a COVID-19 pandemic relief.

It is one of the sectors that is the greatest hit with the reduction of almost 40% of the markets and with the great number of lost job opportunities - let us put this into perspective. For every R10 spent on recovery from the COVID-19 relief fund, a R500 disappeared due to corruption. The ANC ... [Inaudible] ... this market or ... It sounds nice to the ear but it lacks true

inclusion of all people in South Africa, yet the communities again will succeed where the government lacks. Will the communities again get the tourism sector going? Communities will come out of the top because they do it themselves.

Let us not just talk about working together and building again, let’s start and act on it. And I want to give a message to all communities in South Africa, “Stop working for government to save you from these dark economic times, start doing it yourself.

Government fiscus is the only focus of the ANC government. Work together and take hands and disregard the ANC rhetoric and politics. They won’t be able to help you, and you know they have the political will”. Thank you, House Chair.

Mr S N SWART: House Chair, the ACDP is very aware of the severe impact that the hard lockdown has had on the tourism sector with COVID-19 pandemic and with the closure of the international borders. We are grateful that those borders have not been opened, although there were some medical doctors that said they should not be, but it is very clear that the tourism industry needs stimulation.

We from the ACDP’s side initially supported the hard lockdown, but we felt it went on too long and has a devastating impact on

livelihoods and lives. It is significant that the domestic and international tourism sector has been identified as one of the sectors that can create large numbers of jobs, and it has been my personal experience, travelling to some of the hotels now during the lockdown period that it is absolutely devastating to see the impact that the lockdown has had on staffing and on the tourists or people staying at those hotels.

From our perspective, we would look forward a greater stimulation to the tourism industry so that jobs can be created and revenue can be collected to help balance our books. I thank you.

Ms L S MAKHUBELA-MASHELE: Thank you, House Chairperson, this year was the most challenging year for most sectors in the economy in the modern era. Worldwide lockdowns in response to the coronavirus pandemic have hit the tourism industry, especially hard. Many airlines have been grounded for months. Hotels were empty, tour busses were parked and unused.

In South Africa this recovery would be difficult because stimulus measures to protect the livelihoods are unlikely to address the deep structural problems, which were weighing in on the industry before this crisis. This includes the slow pace of transformation

and the concentration of business opportunities around the big metros.

Hon Members, when the tourism industry came to a complete halt, the government provided a R200 million tourism release fund to the sector that was disbursed to the South African tourism. The ANC in support of this report and its recommendation is calling for government, Treasury and the national Department of Tourism to ring-fence funding to provide tourism a development for villages, townships and small “dorpies”.

We also call upon the Minister and the Department of Tourism and its only entity South African Tourism, SAT, to respond timeously to all committee recommendations on all reports, to assist the committee in conducting effective oversight on the issues we raise. To also ensure that the expenditure of the budget appropriated is used effectively and efficiently, and that the achievements of the predetermined objectives are always corresponding to their expenditure.

We also call upon the department to strengthen internal controls and internal audit, to improve the effectiveness and efficiency to eliminate organisational deficiencies. In supporting this report, hon members, we also call upon the Treasury to provide and

reimburse the national department the R1 billion that was returned to the national fiscus in the time of the pandemic. We thank you, hon members. [Applause.]

Declarations of vote made on behalf of the Democratic Alliance, Economic Freedom Fighters, Inkatha Freedom Party, Freedom Front Plus, African Christian Democratic Party and African National Congress.

Question put.

Motion agreed to.

Report accordingly adopted.

# CONSIDERATION OF BUDGETARY REVIEW AND RECOMMENDATION REPORT OF PORTFOLIO COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION, SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY - 2019-20 ANNUAL REPORT OF DEPARTMENT OF HIGHER EDUCATION AND TRAINING AND ENTITIES

There was no debate.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: Hon Chairperson, I move: That the Report be adopted.

*Declarations of vote:*

Mr B B NODADA: Chairperson, the Department of Higher Education has been in a continuous decline where most entities such as National Student Financial Aid Scheme, NSFAS, sector education training, authorities, Setas and Technical and Vocational Education and Training, TVET, are failing to deliver on their mandates to an important stakeholders of young people student. The department has achieved 78 of its target, a drop from 95% in the previous financial year. The NSFAS has failed to account to Parliament and the Auditor-General, AG, on the second consecutive year on the over R30 billion taxpayer’s money allocated to them. While there are further corruptions level against Minister Nzimande and the Administrator Dr Carollison on the R2,5 billion laptop’s tender.

Till today, thousands of students during exam time sit without these devices. Setas only achieved four of 17 targets producing less than 2 000 artisans of the 30 000 targets.

...[Inaudible.] furthermore has increased irregular expenditure by 8,9 million. Worse of all, many of them have been failing to pay students stipends, only to find that monies desperately needed by these students are stolen by staff members. We urge the Auditor-General to get to the bottom of the rot at the NSFAS and all these Setas on outstanding audits and holds those found guilty

of stealing taxpayer’s money to be personally liable. The worst performing is the TVET branch only achieving 29%

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): I think, there’s a disturbance on the line. Hon Roos, will you switch off your microphone, please. You are disturbing your member. Continue, hon member.

Mr B B NODADA: The worst performing is the TVET branch only achieving 29% of their targets, failing to spend millions on desperately needed infrastructure, maintenance, which are critical for expansion of access and the development in the TVET space. The failure to achieve system’s targets by the department has resulted in certification backlog. Furthermore, the D Head must tell us what happened to the R9 million fraudulent payments to lecturers. The DA does not support this report. I thank you so much, Chair. [Applause.]

Mr S TAMBO: Thank you very much Speaker, the EFF has noted the Budgetary Review and Recommendation Report for Higher Education and Training Department. We note particularly the perennial problems confronting the sector and its entities in terms of delaying the appointments at critical leadership positions. Of greater concern to us, is the budget reduction which has been

enforced and adverse impact this will have on the sector and its entities.

It is a thousand of students who sleep in the libraries, studying without meals, struggle for accommodation and textbooks that will move harshly being affected by the budget cuts which will impact to the National Student Financial Aid Scheme. This is a NASFAS which is led by a corrupted Administrator, who has confessed to have flouted the employment and procurement process at the entity making the environment hostile for the staff in it. It is the very same NSFAS which has failed to submit their annual financial statements within the legislated timeframe.

We have further noted the law expenditure by TVET colleges in terms of much needed infrastructure development. This has been a result of a tedious tender system which we have long condemned as unsustainable. All of these delays would have not occurred if the department had led at the policy development level and the establishment of a state construction company. The failure to implement free education signifies the lack of leadership. This is marked by the drive regulatory framework to university fees which proposes a central fee increase for a period of three years to increase stability of the institutions.

We reject the notion that stability of institutions of higher learning must be based on extracting money from the students. It is the position that perpetuates the concept of education as a commodity. Speaker, we must declare our opposition to the planned retrenchments at the South African Qualifications Authority, SAQA. The entity has expressed distress countlessly, Mr Minister, on its current financial position to no abeyance. The planned retrenchments of 71 employees will harm the entity’s ability to conduct its work, which is dependent on human resource.

Furthermore, and finally, financial stability and prosperity in the Higher Education and Training Department cannot be achieved through austerity, retrenchment and extraction money from stakeholders. As such, the EFF rejects this report. Thank you very much.

Mr S L NGCOBO: Thank you, hon Chair and hon members, education is one of the government’s most vital priorities. It is concerning, therefore, that the actions by the Department of Higher Education does not seem to live up to these ideals. For instance, there are vacancies for critical positions, which have contributed to unacceptable levels of underspending. Underspending is the message to parents, children and teachers and others that the department has too much money, to be able to use, ... for bettering their

good. During the period under review, underspending increased by R26,92 million from R2,33 million in 2018-19.

*IsiZulu:*

Imali ayisetshenziswanga kodwa kuhlushekiwe.

*English:*

The increase of underexpenditure highlights one indisputable fact that the government does not care about good governance. Then, underspending when compared to the pitiful consequence management for poor performance and misconduct is utterly unacceptable. Even the Auditor-General’s office emphasised the disgraceful oversight mechanism at the department.

The IFP calls for more conscientious control systems and accountability at the department and those particularly problematic of its entities. The IFP is also worried about the consistent failure to meet targets on the part of certain department entities. Yet, they expect to remain adequately funded. Once again in this regard, there does not appear to be any evidence of consequence for responsible officials. The IFP accepts the report.

*Afrikaans:*

Dr W J BOSHOFF: Agb Huisvoorsitter, om geleerdheid te kry was vir geslagte arm Afrikaners die enigste manier om uit die kloue van armoede te ontsnap. Daar was sosialoë wat die verskynsel van arm blankes daaraan toegeskryf het dat ’n kleiner ... [Onhoorbaar.]

... sodanig ... [Onhoorbaar.] ... Afrikaners in die 20ste eeu was eenvoudig sonder die intellektuele vermoeë om in ’n moderne ekonomie te presteer ... [Onhoorbaar.] ... Dit is verkeerd bewys deur geleerdheid na te jaag. Wat die student na die tafel moes bring is ywer; wat die staat na die tafel kan bring is instellings van opleiding, oorsig oor die gehalte daarvan en maniere om dit te finansier.

*English:*

That is what the present BRRR reports of. In the year under consideration, Parliament voted for some R89 billion for the department only 18 billion was debited from employers. This was spent by the Setas. Let us start by saying that this money had to be levied because nobody would contend that the Setas deserved it with diligence and effectiveness. The university sector received R73 billion of the other R89 billion and TVET colleges

R12 billion. This inequality is mirrored in the NSFAS among unequal payments of stipends where university students received more than TVET students. While the department includes some

entities which do outstanding work. There are others which do not live up to the reasonable expectations.

*Afrikaans:*

Om in ’n hoër onderwys en opleidingomgewing te werk is ’n roeping. Dit is ’n omgewing waar selfveryking en pligsversuiming, die jeug se toekoms steel. Ongelukkig gebeur dit.

*English:*

One area of hope is that the Portfolio Committee of Higher Education takes its task of oversight seriously. Perpetrators are taken to task and no problems are winked away.

*Afrikaans*:

Die VF Plus ondersteun die verslag.

Mr S N SWART: House Chair, the ACDP shares the concerns about deplorable state of the NSFAS. It must surely be deeply concerning to all of us in Parliament that this institution, not only failed to submit financial statements in time, but even more concerned about the budget cuts that have been announced. This has resulted in severe hardships for many students, who already come from very impoverished backgrounds and have to struggle. So, budget cuts cannot be acceptable under these circumstances, given that

education is critical for the economic and social development of our nation.

Now, the Auditor-General has highlighted a number of concerns of the department and its entities. These need to be addressed and it is encouraging for the ACDP to learn that the portfolio committee is exercising greater oversight and holding the department and the entities to account. The ACDP will support this report. I thank you.

Mr W T LETSIE: Thank you very much, House Chair, the BRRR makes key recommendations to address the capabilities of the Department of Higher Education and Training through the filling of key senior management vacancies and financial and infrastructure management, capacity-building of TVETs. The portfolio committee had taken a keen focus on the implementation of the audit plans to address financial irregularities in the Setas, NSFAS, CETs and in TVET colleges to address financial mismanagement through ensuring investigations are expedited and the implementation of consequence management resulting from forensic investigations and findings by the Auditor-General.

The portfolio committee has ensured that all critical issues identified and reported by various stakeholders are addressed

through recommendations of specific actions, to improve the capability of institutions, to achieve the objective of the postschool education and training, PSET, sector, which plays a pivotal role in skills and human development. The portfolio committee has ensured accountability, in instances, of financial mismanagement and poor governance in institutions like NSFAS, to ensure increased access and consistent financial support for allowances, accommodation, transport and address inequality within the PSET sector.

We shall continue to steer the portfolio committee to address challenges of students, workers and all stakeholders in the PSET sector to meet the objective of the National Development Plan. The ANC, therefore, supports the report as education remains an apex priority for ourselves and the people of this country. Thank you very much.

Declarations of vote made on behalf of the Democratic Alliance, Economic Freedom Fighters, Inkatha Freedom Party, Freedom Front Plus, African Christian Democratic Party and African National Congress.

Question put

Motion agreed to (Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Report accordingly adopted.

# CONSIDERATION OF BUDGETARY REVIEW AND RECOMMENDATION REPORT OF PORTFOLIO COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC ENTERPRISES

There was no debate.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: Thank you House

Chairperson. I move that the report be adopted.

*Declaration(s) of vote:*

Mr G K Y CACHALIA: By the report’s own admission, the financial performance of state-owned enterprises, SOEs, is likely to deteriorate in 2021. It calls for the usual slew of reforms at SOEs in the hope that they can become efficient and financially sustainable.

The trouble is that this mantra has been repeated so often over so many years in the vain yogic belief that the sounds made through the repetition of a mantra are vibrations that can have great power. By repeating the same phrase, it is believed that the sound of the words can create a pathway to deeper and deeper awareness.

This fiction; this mankad madness must be exposed for what it is. All it involves is to take from Peter to pay Paul, which for your edification Mr Minister, originated in St Peter’s church in Rome and refers to it as neglecting the Peter tax in order to have the money to pay the Paul tax.

The reality is that while the combined budget for these programmes is expected to decrease from 56 billion to 1,9 billion in 2023, it is due to the additional 56 billion allocated now to settle state- owned companies, SOCs, debts and provide working capital. There is no deeper awareness here; just deeper debt and spiralling bankruptcy while public goods are more expensive and less attainable.

The committee recommends a diet word salad for the Minister. Capacitation, implementation, consequence management, revenue enhancement, cost containment, and the like — more contradictory mantras while it seeks to improve controls and systems to ensure that the department achieves an unqualified audit outcome.

And so, the mere acknowledgement of financial putrefaction becomes an end in itself. Never mind taking from Peter to pay Paul; this is fiddling while Rome burns.

Ms R N KOMANE: Thank you, Chair. The EFF rejects the report of the Portfolio Committee on Public Enterprises and we do so for the following reasons.

Firstly, as the Portfolio Committee on Public Enterprises, we agreed in the past that the Department of Public Enterprises serves no purpose and would not assist to reorganise, fix state entities under its custodianship and build state capacity.

The EFF has made proposals to say that Eskom must go to the Department of Minerals and Energy ... [Inaudible.] ... because that department is the one that deals with coal and mining which remains the largest source of our energy, and it also deals with the energy policy.

Denel must go back to the Department of Defence. Transnet and SA Airways, SAA, must go back to the Department of Transport and SA Forestry Company Limited, Safcol, must go to the Department of Environment, Forestry and Fisheries. This is long overdue; a realignment of SOEs that must be at the forefront of industrialisation if we are serious about reviving and reorganising South Africa’s economy.

However, we know that this will not happen because prime minister Jamnadas is in charge and untouchable. He does as he pleases, appoints incompetent ... [Inaudible.] ... and corrupt people who treat the department as if it is a family hiring agency.

We know that you can organise a mob of politicians who masquerade as journalists to attack political opponents, and this has been the modus operandi. We are not surprised that this long-time servant Adrian Lackay is according ... a politician with access to media positions to do prime minister Jamnadas’ dirty work.

There is nothing that the now fired spokesperson will say that will shock us and we also know that there is nothing that Cyril Ramaphosa will do about any of these revelations. It is only the EFF that is prepared to confront these masters and we will beat the dog until the owner comes out.

Inkosi E M BUTHELEZI: Thank you, hon Chairperson. Firstly, I want to say that South Africa is not an island of isolation. We are not the only country facing economic challenges due to the outbreak of COVID-19. Yes, indeed, we couldn’t have foreseen that an outbreak of this magnitude would sweep the world over. Its deadly and destructive spread has certainly caused many governments to introspect and to prioritise what is important.

However, if our country’s economy was on track and had our state resources not been sapped by failing SOEs on a yearly basis, we would be in a better position financially as a country. However, I must reiterate that the extent to which the global pandemic has been used as a scapegoat by the department and government for the many years of failure in leadership, poor management and corruption, is simply no excuse. It is no excuse for more bailouts. It is no excuse for more borrowing. In fact, the sober reality is that what COVID-19 has brought to light is that it offers the ... [Inaudible] ... opportunity for us as a country to change the course and to change the way we think about the SOEs.

As the IFP, we have said this before and I’m saying it again to this House, that we must privatise or partially privatise all SOEs that are failing to deliver services to our people. Privatisation is not a swear word. All ... [Inaudible.] ... now need to ... [Inaudible.] ... public-private partnerships as the only way in which we fix what is broken at failing SOEs. It is the only way in which we will be able to make progress.

What this department requires is bold, strong and decisive leadership. In order for us to move forward, we must address our problems head-on and root out the elements which hold us back as a

country in making the right decisions; not popular decisions that suit the ideological narrative.

Our people cannot eat, drink and keep their lights on. They can’t feed their families; even grow their small businesses, when the very same SOEs which exist primarily to serve the people do the opposite. While the department may be ticking the right boxes ... [Time expired.]

Mr W W WESSELS: Thank you, House Chairperson. The essence of this report is the repeated observations of operational challenges, report at a loss, concerned about sustainability, financial challenges, concerned about debt, and so forth when it comes to all the state entities.

*Afrikaans:*

Elke jaar maak die komitee aanbevelings wat nie uitgevoer word nie en die finansiële posisie van entiteite verswak terwyl hierdie entiteite ... [Onhoorbaar.] ... moet ... [Onhoorbaar.]

*English:*

We need to privatise these SOEs. We are in a fiscal crisis and we cannot afford to sustain unsustainable and completely bankrupt SOEs that were mismanaged and are still being mismanaged.

Mr S N SWART: Thank you, House Chair. The ACDP recognises the significant risks posed by SOCs to public finances, as stated by the Minister of Finance and as contained in this report which states that the sustainable risk remains the following for the department: Unsustainable business models of SOCs; failure of SOCs to deliver on their mandates; corruption, fraud and maladministration; the composition of the boards not providing independence for value chain oversight; and a negative turnaround sentiment.

Now, there is nothing new in this report and this is as a result of years of state capture and corruption of many of these SOCs. We see evidence of this on a daily basis before the Zondo Commission with billions having been stolen but very little being recovered.

One of the SOCs covered in this report is SAA and it is important to note that the Appropriations Committee expressed itself very strongly against using provincial and local government conditional grants to fund the 10,5 billion SAA business rescue plan. This, the committee says, sends the wrong message to South Africans that SOCs will at all costs be funded through uniform cuts across government programmes. The ACDP agrees and would implore the Committee on Public Enterprises that it should’ve expressed itself far more strongly on this issue.

Mr M G E HENDRICKS: Hon Chair, thank you very much. We engaged with the Minister of Finance, together with other political party leaders, at Tuynhuys, and the point that Al Jama-ah made was that in many of their budgets there is 30% fat. It would be nice to scrutinise those budgets line by line to remove the fat because that will be a considerable savings as we try to get out of this nightmare that the country is faced with. There has to be a road map for them to be financially self-sustainable and I think we all should work towards that in some way or another.

Mr S N GUMEDE: Thank you, House Chair. Am I audible? Hello?

The ACTING CHAIRPERSON (Mr Q R Dyantyi): Go ahead, baba Gumede.

Mr S N GUMEDE: Thank you. The ANC supports the report. The department received an unqualified audit and strides are being made to improve governance at SOEs. The tide to reverse state capture and corruption is succeeding. The SOEs are on a steady course of recovery and much work still needs to be done.

Eskom has commenced divisionalisation into generation, transmission and distribution. Transnet, which has remained financially self-sustained, commenced with plans for the expansion of logistics infrastructure in terms of the Port of Durban and

freight rail. The destruction of rail infrastructure must stop for further investment to be successfully rewarded. The progress made at ensuring the survival of SAA’s growth bodes well for the economic recovery of the country. Safcol has critical plans to

improve the business and develop downstream. This progress begs for deeper implementation and oversight of the programmes of the department.

The report contains many important recommendations, amongst which are the preservation of jobs at SOEs, legal action be taken on corruption at Alexkor and the recommendation of the forensic ... be implemented. The funding of SAA must be utilised for the intended purpose.

It is incorrect to suggest, as the opposition does, that government walks away when faced with problems, as these problems have solutions. Upon solving governance issues, the department will focus on improving the business model of SOEs. I wish to welcome the views by the IFP but, however, note that ... [Time expired.]

Question put.

Motion agreed to (Democratic Alliance, Economic Freedom Fighters, Freedom Front Plus and African Christian Democratic Party dissenting).

Report accordingly adopted.

# CONSIDERATION OF BUDGETARY REVIEW AND RECOMMENDATION REPORT OF PORTFOLIO COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC WORKS AND INFRASTRUCTURE ON DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC WORKS AND ENTITIES

There was no debate.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: House Chairperson, I

move that the report be adopted.

*Declarations of vote:*

Ms H DENNER: House Chair, the Department of Public Works and Infrastructure is not a service delivery department; it is an enabling department that provides the platforms and mechanisms for other departments to meet their service delivery obligations. When the Department of Public Works and Infrastructure fails, it impacts everyone.

Sadly, the mandate remains blurred as yet another year has passed with absolutely no progress on the Public Works Bill; there has been little to no progress from the reworking of the Construction Industry Development Board, CIDB, and council for the Built Environment Act, transformation in the built environment remains relatively static; zero improvement has been made on the immovable asset register; Expanded Public Works Programme, EPWP, has been beset with problems and has fallen desperately short of its work opportunities targets; and the Minister has gas lighted the Independent Development Trust, IDT, to the point where the entity is in a state of complete paralysis; an amount of R423 million in irregular expenditure while 98% of the budget was spent to achieve 50% of the department’s targets; the director general is suspended; a number of senior posts remain unfilled; allegations of corruption, political meddling and nepotism have docked Minister de Lille for the past year.

It is like the department is stuck in an endless holding pattern. While Minister de Lille focuses her attention on her shiny new toy, Infrastructure South Africa, the Department of Public Works and Infrastructure and its entities are being left behind. It appears that the real work of this department is being ignored in favour of the quick wins guaranteed to get maximum political mileage.

What the Department of Public Works and Infrastructure needs now is policy direction, actual consequence management and committed leadership focused on delivering a public service and not just lip service delivered as an afterthought. I thank you.

Ms C C S MOTSEPE: Chairperson, from the misguided and highly corrupt Beitbridge fencing fiasco to the premature tabling of the Expropriation Bill. From the inhumane termination of the functions of contractors here in Parliament which left tons of workers without jobs in December to the ongoing fights between the Minister and the DDG, the department of public works is truly a leading contender for the most corrupt and the most out of touch with the needs of the country department in this country.

Instead of leading massive programmes for building and maintaining infrastructure, the state even rents basic buildings such as police stations from private landlords. Instead of building the capacity of the state to manufacture its own requirements for infrastructure building across the country, the department promotes the importation of building material from outside the country.

Instead of leading a programme for the establishment of a state construction company, the department is intensifying dishing out

tenders to the cronies to build schools, hospitals and prisons. This lines up the pockets of big white-owned businesses because this department has no confidence in emerging black businesses. The misdirection of this department is one of the most serious stumbling blocks towards the growth in this country. We reject this BRRR.

Ms L L VAN DER MERWE: Chairperson, let me read this on behalf of the hon Nxumalo. Hon members, in considering the portfolio committee’s report, the IFP remains concern about the fact that the department only achieved 18 of its 36 targets and the irregular expenditure of a R119 million as reported by the Auditor-General.

It appears the full extent of the irregular expenditure incurred by this department has not yet been finalised. It is undeniable that the cause for noncompliance, lack of governance and weak financial management speaks directly to the lack of effective leadership. Ultimately, the buck stops with the Minister for these gross failures.

It is also of great concern that there are still vacancies in senior management positions within the department. The IFP, therefore, wishes to stress the committee’s recommendation that

there is an urgent need for a full report to be delivered by the Minister on her efforts to address the leadership instability and to report on recruitment projects.

Chairperson, the greatest bungle by this department this year has been the Beitbridge border scandal, and investigation into the Beitbridge fence project has found that government has paid

R17 million more than a market related cost for this controversial project. The investigation led by the Department of Public Works as well as the Special Investigating Unit, SIU, uncovered a ton of irregularities and wrongdoings by Public Works officials.

This border fiasco not only amounts to a national scandal, but has left our compromised boarders further compromised, placing at risk the safety and security of our nation, and is possibly one of the reasons why the Bushiris could simply escape without a trace. A principle agent, the main contractor, and the identified officials must face jail time for what is just another government corruption scandal.

Chairperson, the implementation ... [Inaudible.]... should be carefully monitored. It remains our constitutional duty to the people of South Africa to oversee and ensure that this department

lives up to its mandate which it’s not currently fulfilling. I thank you.

*Afrikaans:*

Mnr P A VAN STADEN: Voorsitter, die VF Plus kan nie ’n verslag van ’n departement en sy entiteite ondersteun, wat gekenmerk is deur ’n jaar van uiterse korrupsie en die misbruik van die Rampbestuurswet nie. Dit is ’n jaar waarin die agb Minister De Lille in die sogenaamde beskuldigdebank staan, weens die ongemagtigde uitgawes van die Beitbrugskandaal, waar ’n bedrag van nagenoeg R18,5 miljoen van ide belastingbetaler gesteel is. Dit is ’n jaar wat gekenmerk is deur die departement se ongemagtigde uitgawes van nagenoeg R261 miljoen asook onreëlmatige uitgawes van R423 miljoen, om nie eers van die gemors oor die kwarantynsfasiliteite, wat hierdie jaar vir groot konsternasie gesorg het, te praat nie. Hier is netso baie geld gesteel. Dit is waarom daar ’n onafhanklike ondersoek rondom hier die voorvalle uitgevoer moet word, en hierdie probleme mag en kan nie onder die mat ingevee word nie.

*English:*

This department and its entities are in very, very serious trouble and the current situation cannot continue. Something must be done to stop this madness. People must be held accountable. The

Minister must be held accountable and there must be consequences. Stop blaming COVID-19 for everything and start facing the music. Stop stealing the tax payers’ money and stop being corrupt.

*Afrikaans:*

Voorsitter, die VF Plus kan nie hierdie veslag ondersteun nie. Dankie.

Mr W M THRING: The ACDP gives that one of the primary purposes for the Budgetary Review and Recommendation Report is for the committee to provide an assessment on the effectiveness and efficiency of the department’s use and forward allocation of available resources bearing in mind that the department is responsible for the official accommodation of all national departments.

Hon House Chair, the ACDP also notes the numerous challenges within the department and will mention just a few: Firstly, the department underperformed and underspent by some R146,8 million of the total appropriated budget, achieving only 18 of its 36 targets. This is unacceptable and inexcusable in the light of the high unemployment and poverty rates we are experiencing as a nation.

Secondly, despite the establishing of the government’s risk and compliance branch to deal with malpractice and corruption, both the department and PMTE continue to be exposed to such practices with the Beitbridge border fence being a typical example. Thirdly, the malpractice revealed itself in the report of the Auditor- General which puts the value of irregular expenditure at a

R190,9 million though this value is still incomplete.

The second consequence of malpractice and irregular expenditure is the warning by the AG that the Department of Public Works and Infrastructure might cease to be a going concern given financial and material conditions. Additionally, the ACDP together with other political parties, has consistently called for the updating and completion of the asset register because the department will not be able to oversee and maintain that which they do not know they have. Unless these and other serious concerns are addressed, we may have another SAA or Eskom on our hands. The ACDP will not accept this report. I thank you.

Ms L N MJOBO: Chairperson, the ANC supports the BRR committee report with its associated findings and recommendations. Our support does not underplay the challenges of the Department of Public Works and Infrastructure and its entities. Showing persistent challenges such as keeping an accurate assets register,

property recording if receivable, maintenance expenditure poorly managed, leasing and contract management persistent with its challenges.

We support the committee report not trivialising the challenges of PMTE business case which remains incomplete, rising and stubborn unauthorised expenditure. Our support of the committee report is to correct exactly those challenges and continue with the progress operationalisation Property Management and Trading Entity, PMTE, ensure the functionality of the governance, risk and compliance branch and to fill the vacancies of top management in the department and its entities.

Our support of this report is to ensure that the department does not abandon but suspends the establishment of the academy which will be important in skills generation for the department and the country at large. We will continue to play our oversight role in ensuring that the department and its entities improve in their performance of predetermined objectives and manage the financial resources economically, efficiently and effectively.

The construction policy research and regulation branch did not perform optimally; they failed to review the white papers and draft a Public Works Bill. This had the effect of the weakening

mandate of the department also to thrive and transformation in the construction industry and built environment. The CBD and Council for the Built Environment Act need to be amended. The portfolio committee will continue to play its oversight and monitor the work of the department and its entities as dictated by the Rules of this Parliament. The ANC supports the BRR committee report. Thank you.

Declarations of vote made on behalf of the Democratic Alliance, Economic Freedom Fighters, Inkatha Freedom Party, Freedom Front Plus, African Christian Democratic Party and African National Congress.

Motion agreed to (Economic Freedom Fighters, Freedom Front Plus and African Christian Democratic Party dissenting).

Report accordingly adopted.

# CONSIDERATION OF BUDGETARY REVIEW AND RECOMMENDATION REPORT OF PORTFOLIO COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION, SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY - DEPARTMENT OF SCIENCE AND INNOVATION

There was no debate.

The Deputy Chief Whip of the Majority Party moved: That the Report be adopted.

*Declarations of vote:*

Mr B B NODADA: Chairperson, the DA will firstly like to congratulate the Department of Science and Innovation for winning the Excellent Award for the Best-run Department with the utmost financial prudence even though their budget has been cut. They have achieved 87% of their targets. However, they still have a bit more challenges. I think the Minister and Parliament must support to make sure that the Department of Science and Innovation gets an allocation of more budget for them to contribute to the service delivery of our country, making science for service delivery. In areas such as certification backlog they can partner up with the Council of Scientific and Industrial Research, CSIR to make sure that the graduates from the TVET sector don’t have to wait up to eight years just to receive the certificates. To work with the Department of Home Affairs on biometrics to make sure that we advance our innovation big data, as well as ICT challenges that we face in the country.

Secondly, we need to also make sure that we put more money to fund the post-graduate programmes to lead these particular programmes for this department to contribute much more when it comes to

service delivery. We must now declare that there must not be any more deductions in terms of their funding. However, do enhance the funding of the Department of Science and Innovation. I think many departments can learn how to appropriately use taxpayer’s money not for their own pockets and their stomachs but for the service of the country. The DA supports the report. I thank you.

Mr M N PAULSEN: I agree with the American astrophysicist, LemonGrass Tyson when he says:

The problem in society is not kids knowing science. The problem is adults not knowing science.

We outnumber kids at five to one; we wield power; and we write legislation. We you have scientifically-illiterate adults, you have undermined the very fabric of what makes a nation wealthy and strong.

Chairperson, the contribution of science, technology and innovation at this time of the pandemic, and the policies and institutions that promote them, is not limited to prevention and the treatment of the disease. We have to bring science, technology and innovation closer to the productive sectors such as in the case of manufacturing medical supplies, diverse products for

health protection, tests to detect the virus and critical medical equipment such as medical ventilators amongst them.

We rely on this department to drive our nation’s quest for re- industrialisation. For example, if we just take Strategic Objective 2 of the CSIR which states “collaboratively improve the competitiveness of high-impact industries to support South Africa’s re-industrialisation.” Yet, 50% of the indicators for this category has not been met. It includes the more important component - the number of joint technology agreements being implemented for industry.

This department has some of the brightest minds in the country and they are not the problem. The problem is that SACP cadre deployed to lead this department and those really vital entities. In solidarity with those brilliant scientists, subject to Bra Blade’s poor leadership, we cannot support this report. Thank you very much.

Mr S L NGCOBO: Hon Chairperson and hon members, each department has a role to fulfil to ensure South Africa’s continued well-being and none more so than the Department of Science and Innovation, which is responsible for the very building blocks that will determine the country’s ability to navigate the Fourth Industrial

Revolution. Although the department has notably achieved a clean audit for a third consecutive year and achieved 87% of its performance indicators, the management of human capital is of concern. For example, in Programme 4: Research, Development and Support, the targets not achieved equated to 109 PhD students and in excess of 2 000 honours, BTech and Masters not receiving bursaries. What this tells us is that there are now missed opportunities for innovation.

In addition, entities such as the Council of Scientific and Industrial Research also showed a decline in scientific leadership due to the loss of key research staff. The IFP would like to draw attention to the fact that South Africa’s investment in RND as a percentage of gross domestic product, GDP stands at around 0,8% and has been stagnant over the last few years. This needs to change.

As the report rightly acknowledges, when a country or in the case of Covid-19 pandemic, the world faces unprecedented challenges.

The solutions come from the science, technology and innovation sector. We therefore commend the committee’s pledge to source additional funding for this essential portfolio. The IFP would also like to commend the portfolio committee for its commitment to prioritise inclusion and participation of disabled persons in all

areas of science, technology and innovation sector. The IFP will support this report. Thank you.

*Afrikaans*:

Dr W J BOSHOFF: Agb Huisvoorsitter, wanneer ’n huishouding swaarkry is die versoeking groot om bydraes tot pensioenfondse en spaarplanne te kanselleer, die motor nie te diens nie en geute en dakplate wat aandag kort, te ignoreer. Dan is daar darem geld om uit te eet en mooi speelgoed vir die kinders te koop. Niks gaan regtig fout nie tot die dag dat iets fout gaan, dan is daar groot fout.

*English*:

That is the reality happening at the Department of Science and Innovation where the budget has declined in real terms for the past few years and nothing seems to improve for the coming years. From the many institutions in this department this I’ll specifically deal with the Council of Scientific and Industrial Research, the Academy of Sciences of SA and the SA Council for Natural Scientific Professions. What is repeated in all these institutions ... [Inaudible.]

The ACTING HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr Q R Dyantyi): Has the hon member finished? Thank you.

Dr W J BOSHOFF: The host has muted me all this time.

The ACTING HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr Q R Dyantyi): I am sorry. Proceed.

Dr W J BOSHOFF: Thank you very much, Acting House Chairperson. What is repeated in all these institutions’ reports is a lack of money. Key performance indicators are not met because of budget cuts. Staff members are not retained for the same reason and it is difficult to award bursaries or appoint good candidates because they [Inaudible.] bursaries at more lucrative appointments.

*Afrikaans*:

’n Land met min hulpbronne moet op sy belangrikste hulpbron staatmaak – sy mense. As daardie mense kundig, ywerig, vaardig en kreatief is, maak hulle planne. Planne bou hul eie welvaart, maar ook die wat naby hulle is en uiteindelik die hele gemeenskap.

Die geleerdes noem dit ’n kultuur van innovasie. Sulke mense moet gekoester word, maar dis nie wat Suid-Afrika doen nie. Elke instelling in die department moet in werklikhied aandui hoeveel wit mans al afgetree het ... [Onhoorbaar.] ... sonder om die kultuur van innovsie en die kweek daarvan in ag te neem, selfs in die Departement van Innovasie. Mens kan eintlik sê dat Wetenskap

en Innovasie niks met die VF Plus se beleid van selfbeskikking te doen het nie. Dit is verkeerd.

Ruimtes geografies en ... [Onhoorbaar.] ... waar minderhede vry van ... [Onhoorbaar.] ... is, kan hulle steeds hul bestes gee. Indien nie, onttrek hulle dalk na hul eie klein wêreldjie waar hulle niks meer bydra nie of dalk na die buiteland waar verwelkom word.

*English:*

The FF Plus supports this report not because it’s a good reality but because it’s a good report.

Mr W M THRING: Hon House Chair, the ACDP acknowledges the crucial role that science, technology and innovation play in the creation of wealth, building our economy, creating jobs and improving the quality of life of all South Africans. Because of this intrinsically-pivotal role that science, technology and innovation have to play in transforming the lives of our citizens, it is critical that the public resources allocated to this department be utilised efficiently, transparently and within the ambits of necessary legislation. It is in this regard that the ACDP welcomes the clean audit received by the Department of Science and Innovation.

The ACDP does express its concern at the underspending of some R119,8 million as these funds could be used to increase our employment levels particularly unemployed graduates relative to the functioning of this department. The other concern which flows from the under expenditure is the failure of this department to reach its targets. In international Cooperation and Resources only 642 students participated versus the target of 680. In Research and Development, 2 991 PhD students were awarded bursaries against the target of 3 100; and 8 632 pipeline post-graduate students were awarded bursaries against the target of 3 100. Three thousand two hundred and five researchers were awarded grants against the target of 4 500.

In conclusion, in supporting the recommendations of the committee, the ACDP supports the concerns of South Africa’s low investment of 0,8% of GDP in research and development as it has been proven that during times of fiscal strain economies that significantly increase their investment in science, technology and innovation are able to respond faster and more comprehensively to fiscal improvements. I thank you.

Ms N T MKHATSHWA: Hon House Chairperson and all members, good afternoon. It is with pride that we congratulate the Director- General, Dr Phil Mjwara for being awarded the sixth national Batho

Pele Excellence Award 2020 for the Best Director-General (National) of the Year. The great work of the department is reflective of his great leadership. So, we are very concerned why the EFF would then go against this particular report. But nonetheless, the Portfolio Committee on Higher Education, Science and Innovation has made critical recommendations in the Budget Review and Recommendations Report for more funding for the Department of Science and Innovation to enable its entities to continue doing the ground-breaking work they have been doing; to increase their capacity and progressing their impact in the economy; and creating a competitive edge for South Africa.

The portfolio committee also concerns itself with the impact that Covid-19 has had on various targets and plans of the department and such, equally concerns itself with finalisation of the decadal plan as the implementation plan of the white paper; as well as the reprioritisation of the budget has had on post-graduate funding particularly in terms of the role that the funding should be playing in increasing the number of women academics. The implementation of the Indigenous Knowledge Systems, IKS Act remains central to the priorities of the portfolio committee as it aims to promote, protect and streamline indigenous knowledge systems in transforming contemporary knowledge systems which by

and large have historically promoted western knowledge systems, thus relegating all other knowledge systems.

Hon members, it is without a doubt that the Department of Science and Innovation has demonstrated their capability and capacity to manage public funds in a prudent manner as reflected in the department’s clean audit. So, whilst there are concerns that Academy of Sciences of SA has regressed to an unqualified audit with findings, it is however pleasing to note that its entities such as the CSIR, HSRC, the NRFNT have all received clean audits.

With all the great work being done by the department and its entities as indicative during the Covid-19 pandemic, we must continue to advocate for the importance of meeting and going beyond targets that seek to ensure the representation and intersexnality in the sector as well as ensuring the reach of the rest of the sector to all parts of the country. Hon Chairperson, the ANC supports the BRRR Report for this department has demonstrated the traits of an ethical and capable developmental state. I thank you.

Question put: That the Report be adopted.

Motion agreed to (Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Report accordingly adopted.

# CONSIDERATION OF BUDGETARY REVIEW AND RECOMMENDATION REPORT OF PORTFOLIO COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC WORKS AND INFRASTRUCTURE ON DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC WORKS AND ENTITIES

There was no debate.

Declarations of vote made on behalf of the Democratic Alliance, Economic Freedom Fighters, Inkatha Freedom Party, Freedom Front Plus and African National Congress.

The Deputy Chief Whip of the Majority Party moved: That the Report be adopted.

*Declarations of votes*:

Mr K J MILEHAM: Chairperson, we will remiss if we did not acknowledge that this Budget Review & Recommendations Reports, BRRR, does not represent a true reflection of the state of the department’s performance and financial situation. As a significant number of entities were unable to present their annual reports.

For a change, this was not the fault of the department or its entities, but rather reflects a lack of capacity in the office of

the Auditor-General, AG, who were unable to complete their audits of the Central Energy Fund, South African Nuclear Energy Corporation, Necsa, National Energy Regulator of South Africa, Nersa, National Radioactive Waste Disposal Institute and the South African National Energy Development Institute.

This is the potential to significantly change the outcomes of the departmental annual report. While the Department of Mineral Resources, DMRE, did reasonably well in achieving its performance targets, the same cannot be said with the Department of Energy.

The latter only achieved 17 of its targets out of a planned 33 or approximately 52%. In 2018-19, it only achieved 13 out of 41 targets. Significantly, the energy policy planning programme two, only achieved two of its 8 set targets after failing to achieve any last year. Given that this programme is central to the departmental mandate, it is a shocking indictment on the management and leadership of the department.

We remain extremely concerned about irregular unauthorised and fruitless and wasteful expenditure, which were all relatively small, is seemingly under-reported. For example, we are aware of the missing fallen miners statue for which the department has paid R6 million, but it has not been installed.

Our committee recently conducted oversight on the Solar Water Heating programme has been stuck in limbo for years. Despite repeated promises from departmental officials, we are seemingly no further along in getting them installed than they were a year ago.

We remain concerned that mine rehabilitation is not taking place at speed and while a visible large scale mines are monitored closely, the same cannot be said of smaller mining producers.

Thank you, House Chair.

Ms C N MKHONTO: Chairperson, in addition to the fact that reports from some entities were not processed and we are unable to assert the full status and overall performance of this department, we still maintain that it does not make sense for us to accept reports from this department when Eskom, which is our main power provision utility, still falls under the Department of Public Enterprise.

The EFF has been calling for Eskom to fall under the Department of Energy for the past five years; instead, it has been left under the care of an incompetent Minister who has reduced it to a personal *spaza* shop. Secondly, the Minister of DMRE over a year ago confirmed that the Independent Power Producers, IPPs, which the EFF rejected from day one, were expensive and committed in

this House that he would negotiate. To date, we still pay the same price. Why did the Minister mislead this House and the country?

The EFF still maintains these IPPs purchasing power must be cancelled. After all, the department went into this arrangement fraudulently.

Thirdly, the entire value-chain of energy is controlled by foreigners. They manufacture, install and even have absolute monopoly over the technology to maintain all equipment used. Why has the department not collaborated with the Department of Higher Education and Training, Department of Science and Innovation, to establish a university of technology? Or even a satellite campus whose focus would be to equip the thousands of unemployed graduates and young people with the necessary skills; so that the department could fully localise the ownership of IPPs, similar to the Postgraduate Certificate in Education programme, PGCE, for teachers.

Lastly, we have a state-owned mining company yet, mines owned by Eskom are still mined by foreign companies. To save Eskom from collapsing, these mines must be fully controlled by the state- owned mining companies. The EFF therefore, rejects the BRRR Report of mineral resources and energy. Thank you.

Mr M N NXUMALO: Chairperson, in assessing the effectiveness and the efficiency of the department’s use and forward allocation of available resources in order to evaluate budgetary needs and shortfalls in respect of departmental operations adeptness, the IFP remains concerned as regards to the following issue:

Firstly, on energy, 52% of targets achieved is wholly unacceptable, even though it is an improvement in performance over the period from 2014/15 – date. Mediocrity and sub-standard service delivery in any form can never, and will never be tolerated.

Secondly, The Energy Policy and Planning Programme and Nuclear Energy remain of serious concern with an abysmal record as regards achievement of targets.

The Department of DMR is performing well with 85,8% of targets achieved although there is concern with aggression in in respect of financial administration which failed to achieve four of its planned targets. ICT infrastructure issues must be addressed.

Compliance with supply chain management legislation is still problematic and this must be addressed so as to avoid further irregular and fruitless and wasteful expenditure.

Initiatives such as the first Men’s’ Dialogue for the Mining Sector on 16 Days of Activism for No Violence Against Women and Children and children on the 29 of November 2019 in Mpumalanga and the establishment of the prevention of Interim Steering Committee on Gender-Based Violence is commendable particularly as GBV is now acknowledged as the second pandemic in our country and requires immediate action by government in all the sectors.

The non-grid programme must receive greater impetus now that impediments to same caused by hard lockdown are no longer a factor, and lost ground must be regained in this project. The IFP supports the BRRR Report. Thank you.

Dr W J BOSHOFF: House Chair, The Department of Minerals and Energy has a relatively low budget. With less than R10 billion, it is far less than, for example, social development at R180 billion or police and higher education, both at around R100 billion. This is only surprising until one remembers that the department does not in fact conduct mining or generate energy. It only regulates mining and supply of energy.

Considering this, it is surprising how many aims could have been missed, especially with energy. Energy policy and planning progressed from 0 out of 12 in the previous year to 2 out of eight

– be thankful for small mercies! Speaking of surprises, if that is the performance of policy and planning, confused implementation should not surprise anyone either.

What I find even more surprising is how many things about the renewable energy the EFF [Inaudible]? But that is beside the point of this debate? The nuclear scene is a possible nightmare. While it would be erroneous to reject nuclear energy out of hand, a government which reaches 1 out of 4 targets in this regard clearly puts the country at risk. The critical part of nuclear is not the generation of energy, but dealing with the waste for centuries to come.

Where the Auditor-General reports on five entities in the department which have not yet been audited, it remarks that it is not necessarily due to late submissions, but “challenges between the audit teams and management of these entities”. Is this code language for corrupt individuals who do not take kindly to being sidelined?

While mining and energy supply needs to be regulated, it should not be controlled by the state. Especially in the field of energy, matters should rather be left to the market and the grid should be opened. Every single consumer, big or small, should be encouraged

to be a producer as well as a consumer. That will not only stimulate energy generation, but also distribution of wealth.

The FF Plus rejects this report. The FFPlus rejects this report. Thank you.

Mr M G MAHLAULE: House Chair, the ANC supports the BRRR committee Report. The mining and energy sector under the leadership of the department played sterling under difficult conditions during covid-19 pandemic. The department is critical for the economic recovery of the country. The second gas find on our east coast is a game-changer for the development of local gas industry.

The survey of the mineral resources of the country by the Council for Geoscience is significant for the revival of the mining sector and will enable beneficiation of the resource base. This is the basis for industrialisation on a verified resource. The launch of the pharmaceutical company for nuclear medicine is a critical part of economic development.

The important recommendations in the report which speaks to the need to achieve performance targets and now that the Department Of Mineral Resources and Energy have met, this should become possible. Financial controls and process in the department should

improve in the next financial year and the AG’s recommendations be implemented.

Mine, health and safety in gold and coal mines are a critical area as a zero harm to worker’s target has been set. This is crucial for the mining sector. We are sure that the department will reach the heights required for the delivery of its different programmes. The ANC supports the BRRR report and request that the House approves the report from mineral resources. I thank you.

Motion agreed to (Economic Freedom Fighters and Freedom Front Plus dissenting).

Report accordingly adopted.

# CONSIDERATION OF PRELIMINARY BUDGETARY REVIEW AND RECOMMENDATION REPORT OF PORTFOLIO COMMITTEE ON COOPERATIVE GOVERNMENT AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS

Ms N T MKHATSHWA (ON BEHALF OF THE DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP OF THE

MAJORITY PARTY): House chair, on behalf of the Deputy Chief Whip I move for the motion to be adopted.

Declarations of vote:

Mr M H HOOSEN: Hon Chairperson, this budget is yet another opportunity to reflect on the desperate set of affairs in the Co- operative Governance and Traditional Affairs, Cogta. Chairperson, billions of rands of irregular and wasteful expenditure through fraud and corruption have been wasted and the poorer communities are the ones who suffer the most.

The DA has consistently spoken out against the poor management of municipal finances, and yet there appears to be no political will whatsoever from the governing party to [Inaudible.]. Politicians who are stealing from the public purse remain in office at the tax payer’s expense instead of being thrown into jail. Such is the case of the 52 ANC councillor’s in Enhlanzeni Municipality who are accused of fraud and corruption. While the money is being [Inaudible.] by corrupt officials and politicians, commissions who report to Cogta are struggling to meet their constitutional mandate of building social cohesion in our country. They receive less money than [Inaudible.] municipalities. This tells you just how seriously our government takes the importance of building unity in our country and delivering services to the poorest of our communities.

Chairperson, unless there is going to be an immediate and urgent intervention in the way municipalities manage public finance, more

municipalities are going to be placed under administration in the next few years, and the levels of service delivery in town and cities across the country will be reduced to even worse levels than they already are. Thank you very much.

Mr K CEZA: Chairperson, we reject the Budgetary Review and Recommendations Report of the Portfolio Committee on Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs, Cogta. The report itself is very critical about the role of the department; its inability to resolve many of the traditional leadership disputes across the country.

We have recently seen the destabilisation of the Gcaleka royal family after the death of King Mpendulo Sigcawu. The abaThembu kingdom has been destabilised since King Buyelekhaya was imprisoned. Not damning, however, to the work of the department is its inability to reign in municipalities in this country.

South Africa’s municipalities are dysfunctional. Year after year the Auditor-General paints a very sad picture of the state of governance in local government in this country. None of the people responsible for the mismanagement have ever been taken to task and very few of the recommendations have ever been implemented. As a

consequence, millions of people are left with no services at all because monies meant for services get misappropriated.

These problems are structural; local government sphere is not getting sufficient funding from the National Treasury. This leaves rural municipalities with little money other than money to pay salaries. Only metropolitan municipalities are favoured by the current funding model because they have the capacity to generate their own revenue. The Department of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs has done nothing to resolve these structural challenges. This is over and above the fact that the municipalities are used as dumping grounds for the most of corrupt and incompetent cadres of the ruling party. We reject this report. Thank you very much.

Mr N SINGH: Hon Chairperson, I am going to represent Amakhosi today and hon Luthuli in particular who serves on this committee. After the recommendations have emerged, it is the view of the committee that the Department of Traditional Affairs must appear before us and extensively engage on the key issues central to its mandate.

We, as the IFP, hold the view that issues of traditional leadership should be looked at comprehensively with the focus

being on the communities. The department should consider adopting this approach as they prepare to engage the committee. One of the resolutions that emanated from the 2017 traditional leaders’ indaba was the provision of equitable support. These traditional institutions cannot fulfil their mandates if they are not given support, in particular, women in traditional leadership face a plethora of challenges and need to be capacitated to solve the problems.

Chairperson, the Department of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs needs to tackle rampant corruption that has gripped municipalities. Leadership within the department appears to be suffering from a lack of political will to cure the malice that have set in many of our municipalities. The true cost of this, as said by the hon member before me, as always falls on the most vulnerable of citizens, particularly those residing in rural communities.

It is concerning, hon member and Chairperson, that the department is still experiencing problems in defining the role it should play in terms of section 139(7) of the Constitution. In 2019 the department made presentations to the NCOP on this matter. Moving forward, we can all agree that the department should utilise the

observations and recommendations made to tackle this issue. The IFP will accept this report. Thank you.

Mr I M GROENEWALD: Hon House Chair, it is a fact that municipalities are one of the ANC’s greatest failures with corruption, collapsed infrastructure, poor planning and even worse, fiscal management. And the result is even worse — poor service delivery, greater debt and an unwillingness to pay taxes. This will lead to lower income and the spiral will continue until there is a political will to turn around the spiral.

Audit report is consistent in the findings by the Auditor-General in respect of mismanagement of funds, irregular, fruitless and wasteful expenditure and noncompliance with legislature, but the only intervention is a section 139 intervention that is failing communities of South Africa. There is little to no record keeping in the resolutions that is taken by councillors or the implementation of such — ANC councillors that believe that they cannot be held hostage by their laws.

The ANC-led government is looking to increase revenue by revenue enhancement by giving no value to such taxes. The ANC wants to increase local government revenue by taxing rate payers even more rather than to put a viable debt collection strategy in place in

fear of losing votes. Rate payers who do pay their taxes get rewarded by notifications of Eskom and Water Boards threatening in stopping services in municipalities due to non-payment.

Therefore, the FF Plus wants to propose the strategy that the strategy is developed to strengthen implementation of legal framework of local government of real action by missing mayors and municipal managers that are responsible for implementing such legislation; table tender contracts and [Inaudible.] councillors after it has been signed and start to govern with transparency.

Local government have to look after their tax paying citizens and give them value for money by rendering services, curb corruption and establish responsible spending or else local government has to start retrenching people because they won’t generate enough income to pay their wage bill. Thank you, Chair.

Ms D R DIREKO: Chairperson, the ANC supports the BRRR of the Department of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs. However, our support does to trade to acknowledge the challenges that we have within the department, especially on local government where we are having the challenges of poor service delivery, fraud and corruption, and also failure to exercise good governance. We are working very hard to resolve these challenges through

necessary intervention and additional powers of the Auditor- General.

The ANC calls on the Department of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs to strengthen the Community Work Programme, CWP, to ensure proper instilling an exit strategy. The administration of CWP should be in line with the Public Finance Management Act in order to address the challenges regarding this programme which were raised by Auditor-General, and also the department should avoid delays on stipend payment which causes unnecessary protests.

The department should also make use of the district development model to reinforce service delivery. The ANC calls on all municipalities to redouble their effort in order to intensify the fight against corruption and fraud in the local municipalities. It is worth noting a central feature of our democratic system is that government representatives and officials should remain in touch with the communities through community meetings, izimbizo and public participation.

We congratulate the Department of Traditional Affairs for obtaining a clean audit. We also note the fact that there as an urgent need to close the existing gap between the rural and urban

areas and also to provide ongoing support to the traditional leaders in promoting nation building and social cohesion.

The ANC will also like to congratulate Department of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs entity, Municipal Infrastructure Support Agency, for obtaining a clean audit for the second consecutive year. The ANC calls on this entity to improve its support and development of technical capacities in the municipalities in order to accelerate provision of service delivery to our people. Thank you, Chair.

Declarations of vote made on behalf of the Democratic Alliance, Economic Freedom Fighters, Inkatha Freedom Party, Freedom Front Plus and African National Congress.

Motion agreed to (Economic Freedom Fighters and Freedom Front Plus dissenting).

Report accordingly adopted.

# CONSIDERATION OF PRELIMINARY BUDGETARY REVIEW AND RECOMMENDATION REPORT OF PORTFOLIO COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENT, FORESTRY AND FISHERIES ON FOURTH QUARTER REPORTS FOR 2019/20 FINANCIAL YEAR OF DEPARTMENT OF ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND ENTITIES

Ms N T MKHATSHWA (ON BEHALF OF THE DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP OF THE

MAJORITY PARTY): Chair, on behalf of the Deputy Chief Whip of the Majority Party, I move that the report be adopted.

*Declarations of vote:*

Mr J R B LORIMER: Chair, the first point to make is that COVID-19 is not an excuse. Lockdown started at the end of March, almost a month after the financial year ended. This report talks about the challenging conditions of the COVID-19 epidemic that the country started experiencing. Most people never heard about COVID-19 epidemic before February, and to try and blame poor performance on possible concerns during the last month of a twelve-month period is simply searching for an excuse for bad performance, and performances were bad.

Remember that performance targets are set by the departments and entities not by any outside agency, so when they are not met it’s doubly damning. South African National Parks, SANParks, missed a third of its objectives, Isimangaliso missed half, the weather service missed a quarter, the Biodiversity Institute missed a third. All in all, the department missed a third of its targets.

It is disturbing the Fisheries Department will escape scrutiny by having become a shell of an entity still on the largely unstudied

books of what is now the Department of Agriculture, Rural Development and Land Reform. Nobody cares about it there which is perhaps convenient as it is one of the worst run parts of the new Department of Environment, Forestry and Fisheries. This report is content to let that happen without comment.

To be fair to this report it does label the overall performance “unacceptable”. But I don’t think this report has got to grips with the malaise affecting this department.

Poor performance and governance and accountability issues have been getting worse over the years and now amount to a millstone which will be difficult to remove.

Our advice to the Minister is, forget the internal ANC politics which protect officials and start holding people accountable or the millstone will drag you down. Thank you.

Mr M N PAULSEN: Chair, the importance of the fishery sector in the economic development of the country has always been underrated. It plays a major role is the sustainable livelihoods and poverty reduction in certain households and communities. The fishery sector is a major contributor to South Africa’s gross domestic

product. Fish is the preferred cheapest source of animal protein. About 75% of total annual production of fish is consumed locally.

However, there is a recognised lack of understanding or appreciation of the impact that the small scale of artisan and fisheries sector has an effect on the South Africa, SA, economy. This lack of understanding is one factor that has led to the small scale of fishery sector having a low profile on the political agenda and hence the lower level of attention it receives in the policy formulation process.

There’s a case for arguing that the contribution of the small scale fisheries sector to the national economy is not adequately reflected in the official GTP’ statistics.

During COVID-19 small scale fisheries were at the frontline of hardship. [Inaudible.] on big business on marketers and exporters. They found themselves strangled by not having access to markets. They had mercy of Legislation and remedial interventions by government and fisheries. There’s a lot of suffering because policy favours an industrialised and commercial sector.

There’s hope, but it will take a complete mind shift and political will to explore fully other opportunities available. South Africa

has suitable environmental condition for aqua culture development and opportunities for commercial production of various cultured species.

The local aqua culture sector has performed below its potential and remains a minor contributor to the national fishery products and the country’s GDP.

This department and Minister should prioritise removing the major constrains that have been limiting aqua culture growth. Constrains such as access to water and land, access to technology, high transaction cost, lack of supporting policies and Legislation and barriers to marketing, needs urgent attention. Until this department [Interjection.] [Time expired.]

Mr N SINGH: Chairperson, I understand at the outset that in my term as a politician from 1994, I have never encountered what we are doing now. A preliminary[Inaudible.] therefore, you will appreciate that I can only speak to what was before us committee and reserve my support otherwise disregard the information that is still outstanding.

We were informed in the committee that the annual report will be table on 16 November with annual financial statements, that was

not be. However, from what was before us, they are areas of concern and one is that the 67% of target achievement is simple unacceptable. Outsourcing of departmental work is unacceptable.

We must prioritise the protection of all our rivers, with biodiversity in our great African cut falls areas must receive greater protection. An area of concern of late and in the past is the question of illegal hunting and poaching, which continues unabated across our country. We disparately require greater enforcement capability and specialist [Inaudible.] course. Just last week, four rhinos were killed in Hluhluwe Game Park. We find the incidents of dog hunting, hunting with use of dog, increasing considerable in KwaZulu-Natal.

What is commendable though is the swift response I received from the Minister in arranging a mediatory meeting between water sports organisations and SANParks in the Langebaan Lagoon area. Water sport as may know draws approximately R400 million per annum to the town and the Minister’ swift action will hopefully ensure that much needed tourism revenue will be generated in the area of Langebaan during summer period.

As for the bulk recommendations we await the Minister’s detailed response and in conclusion [Interjection.] [Inaudible.]

information before me, will support this preliminary budget report. Thank you, Deputy Speaker.

Mr S N SWART: Deputy Speaker, safe to say that we share the concerns expressed about the status of preliminary budget report. The ACDP will leave it like that but we will like us to establish as to what is the status of the preliminary report. Thank you.

Mr F D XASA: Deputy Speaker, hon members, the Portfolio Committee on Environment, Forestry and Fisheries had examined the fourth quarter performance and the expenditure reports of the department and its entities for the year 2019-20 financial year, to produce this preliminary budgetary review and recommendations report. This was done in order to meet the requirements as prescribed by Monitory Bill procedures and related matters, Amendment Act for the Budget Review and Recommendations Report, BRRR, to be tabled in October every year.

The committee is of the view that the department as assisted by its entities works well, to ensure the protection of South Africa’s environment and the conservation of natural resources balanced with sustainable development and the equitable distribution of the benefits derived from natural resources for the benefit of current and future generations.

Notwithstanding the above, there are areas of concern that were noted but the portfolio committee has provided pertinent recommendations to overturn associated challenges on the basis of that, the ANC supports the adoption of the report as well as the portfolio committee, we all adopted the preliminary report.

Thanks.

Question put: That the Report be adopted.

Motion agreed to (Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Report accordingly adopted.

# CONSIDERATION OF PRELIMINARY BUDGETARY REVIEW AND RECOMMENDATION REPORT OF PORTFOLIO COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION ON DEPARTMENT OF PLANNING, MONITORING AND EVALUATION AND BRAND SOUTH AFRICA

Ms N T MKHATSHWA (On behalf of The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP OF THE

MAJORITY PARTY): Deputy Speaker, on behalf of the Deputy Chief Whip, I move:

That the Reported be adopted

There was no debate.

*Declarations of vote:*

Mr M S MALATSI: Deputy Speaker, at the outset we would like to express our disappointment with the consistent underwhelming performance by this department. The Department of Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation has, amongst its key deliverables, the finalisation of the performance agreements for Ministers and Deputy Ministers. Despite this having being a presidential commitment, up to date we have been given different reasons for the failure to meet deadlines that were set by the Presidency and by the department. The latest excuse in that series excuses was that due to COVID-19 it was not possible to finalise the signing of those performable agreement before the deadline of October. Now recently, we have been told through the portfolio committee that the performance agreements for Deputy Ministers have not yet been finalised simply because Ministers have not finalised their delegated powers to Deputy Ministers. It is completely unacceptable that such a major key deliverable that informed and forms part of the President’s [Inaudible.] for a new era of good governance, political accountability and transparency has not been met.

Secondly, the department is still to have a breakthrough with regard to the finalisation of lifestyle audits for members of the executive and senior government officials. This again speaks to this era of overpromising and underdelivering and constantly manufacturing accuses that justify the failure to meet commitments.

When we look at entities for the department, particularly Brand SA, it is still beset by the uncertainty over the theoretical questions that have affected the suspension of the CEO. To this end we still have an acting CEO while we haven’t finalised the in investigation that continues into the malpractices that happened under the current board. It is for this reason that we believe that we need to refresh and regalvanise the leadership ... [Time expired.]

Ms C C S MOTSEPE: Chairperson, the EFF rejects the budget review and recommendations report by the Portfolio Committee on Public Services and Administration. To support this report is to support job cuts in the public sector. The Finance Minister announced the budget cut of R160 billions of public wage bill over a period of three years. This is a misguided policy by the National Treasury in a desperate attempt to deal with fiscal policies that they have mismanaged over the past decades chasing after [austerity paloisis.](https://www.google.com/search?sxsrf=ALeKk02Ieyg3dnIojSsZ8K8-MKPlGWa4IQ%3A1606653540360&source=univ&tbm=isch&q=austerity%2Bpaloisis.&client=firefox-b&sa=X&ved=2ahUKEwjfgbPs4qftAhWSVBUIHSdHDu0QjJkEegQIARAB&biw=1920&bih=951)

In the process the National Treasury has undermined the wage bill agreement that was negotiated by government and labour. This reduction was simply translated into job cuts. To the Monoester of Public Services and the Minister of Finance these are simple numbers but there are dedicated public servants whose only sin is being led incompetent collective in a Cabinet. Estimates are that more than 300 000 public servants will lose their jobs. Given the high levels of unemployment the government is supposed to be at the forefront of creating jobs.

We have a dysfunctional Public Service Commission without credible leadership and cannot even investigate a simple complain about an irregular appointment.

The so-called National School of Government is nothing but a way for consultants to continue to milk state resources. There is no value the National School of Government, NSG, is adding and the fact that the Minister refuses to investigate all claims of corruption by procurement officials at NSG suggests to us that the Minister may be benefitting from this corruption. We still do not have a concrete plan on whom to... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, hon member! Hon member!

Ms C C S MOTSEPE: To deliver basic services... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I am talking to you.

Ms C C S MOTSEPE: ... which can be printed any document... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon, Siwisa! I am talking to you. Hon member, withdraw your statement about the Minister benefiting from corruption. You cannot make such statement. Withdraw that statement, hon member. Hon Siwisa! Hon Siwisa!

Ms E N NTLANGWINI: Hon Deputy Speaker, which statement is that?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, no, no, the hon member made a statement and I have told her just now to withdraw that statement and I am not repeating that. She will withdraw that statement she made about the Minister. She knows she cannot do that as it is against the Rules. You don’t make statements of that nature without substantiation. She must withdraw.

Ms C C S MOTSEPE: I withdraw, Chairperson.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you! Thank you!

Mr N SINGH: Deputy Speaker and hon members, one wonders whether if the ANC government is truly committed to accountability when it lags behind in the appointing of accounting officers. Through the report provided by the Department of Department of Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation and Brand South Africa, it remains evident that failure to fill strategic vacancies impacts the department’s ability to fulfil its mandate. We simply cannot afford mediocre performance. As South Africa works to recover from the negative economic impact of the COVID-19 pandemic, the Department of Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation will have to work even harder to ensure that government departments are on track to achieve development targets. We will also have to rely heavily on strategic branding efforts by Brand South Africa to position South Africa as a preferred trading partner and tourism destination. These efforts will require an all hands on deck approach where the capabilities, skills knowledge and expertise of all staff members are utilised.

The IFP therefore calls upon the Department of Planning, Mentoring and Evaluation and Brand South Africa to prioritise the recommendations made by the committee and to urgently resolve issues pertaining to the accounting officers and senior management within their organisations. We support the report, Deputy Speaker. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, please, watch your time. I am saying this because it is appropriate to stay within the allocated time. This is an agreed procedure. When we ask you to stop do not try and take more seconds than you deserve. You are not more equal than any other member in the House. Let’s be fair to all other members who have taken their three minutes.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: Hon Deputy Speaker,

the member is on virtual platform.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Can someone in the House do it?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: Yes, hon Lesoma will

do it.

Ms R M M LESOMA: House Chair, my apology for the delay. Ignore the others from my left. The ANC supports the adoption of the preliminary budgetary review and recommendation report of portfolio committee on public service and administration on department of planning, monitoring and evaluation and Brand South Africa, however, we would like also to stress the point as per the recommendations of the committee that the Department of Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation must ensure that Brand SA must ensure that all critical posts which are...[Interjections.]

Ms N E NTLANGWINI: On a point of order, Deputy Speaker: What is this now? Why are we reducing the House to somebody that is not

... Can the ANC stop embarrassing them. They are embarrassing... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: House member, you are embarrassing yourself. Why should we listen to you in the first place? This is not a point of order. You are absolutely out of order.

Ms R M M LESOMA: We are saying Brand SA must fill up the vacancies of the CEO and the chief financial officer, CFO, which are critical issues which need to be filled.

Secondly, we are saying that Brand SA in terms of the preliminary report of the Auditor-General, AG, in terms of fruitless and expenditure must be dealt with and be complied with the regulations of good corporate governance. Thirdly, we are saying that the Department of Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation must ensure that... [Time expired.]

Motion agreed to (Economic Freedom Fighters, Democratic Alliance and Freedom Front Plus dissenting).

Report accordingly adopted.

# CONSIDERATION OF PRELIMINARY BUDGETARY REVIEW AND RECOMMENDATION REPORT OF PORTFOLIO COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION ONDEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION, ENTITIES AND PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

There was no debate.

Ms N T MKHATSHWA: Deputy Chairperson, I move that the report be adopted.

*Declarations of vote:*

Dr L A SCHREIBER: Hon Deputy Speaker, it seems clear than ever that the government and in fact this very House are actively sabotaging one of our country’s most important public sector watchdogs. The Public Service Commission, PSC, was created by Chapter 10 of our Constitution as the custodian of good governance in the state, but the PSC has never enjoyed the independence and the power it needs to ensure that the state serves the people, rather than the political elite. That is why the PSC has not been able to stand the tide of corruption, and that is why the PSC looks on helplessly as service delivery collapses.

As we slide ever closer towards outright state failure, President Cyril Ramaphosa can still not be bothered to fire the director– general of the PSC who illegally appointed his mistress as the head of ethics. It has now been nearly 120 days since the investigation first confirmed the allegations. During that time, the director-general has been paid close to R500 000. But this Parliament is also deeply complacent in the collapse of the PSC.

The Constitution directs the National Assembly to recommend for the appointment of five commissioners, yet one of the five positions has now been vacant for 18 months. After the DA prevented the ANC from appointing a corrupt cadre to the position last year, the ANC has simply refused to bring the matter back to this House so that we can vote on the DA’s preferred candidate. [Interjections.] The ANC would literally rather cripple the PSC than admit that they were wrong to try and appoint a disgraces cadre. But the sabotage of the PSC doesn’t ... and you there, relax ... Just this morning, the ANC and the EFF jointly voted to appoint a person with zero experience in law, human resources or public administration as a PSC commissioner. Even worse, this person currently works as a so-called political analyst and regularly heaps praise on the ANC and the EFF. His name is Somadoda Fikeni - google him.

They truly are no limit to the depravity of these political parties who shamelessly abuse this Parliament to sabotage and undermine good governance and service delivery. As always, the DA will be the only party that holds the line against this. We reject this report. Thank you. [Interjections.] [Applause.]

Ms R N KOMANE: Deputy Speaker, the EFF cannot support this report. The Department of Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation does not have the interest of the vulnerable and poor masses of the community who continue to turn a blind eye and keeping mum on the public servant who enrich themselves with taxpayers’ money. The Department of Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation cannot pride itself by claiming 161 learners who enrolled and completed the programme yet the unemployment rate is high and accountability is minimum.

How can South Africa champion the National School of Governance in other countries if the ruling party fail to monitor or champion

... [Inaudible.] We have people who ... [Interjections.]

AN HON MEMBER: Hon member, please pause. Deputy Speaker there is point of order in the House.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: What’s the point of order?

Ms A H M PAPO: The point of order is from me. The member is talking about the Department of Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation when we are discussing matters of a different department. We are not discussing the Department of Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation matters, we are discussing the Department of Public Service and Administration and its entities plus the Public Service Commission. She is presenting a speech for a wrong department.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The member will correct herself.

Ms R N KOMANE: Thank you very much Deputy Speaker. The EFF rejects this report with the contents that it has. Thank you very much. [Interjections.]

Mr N SINGH: Deputy Speaker, I will represent the hon Ink Cebekhulu. Let me at the outset say that the IFP would support the good professor for the post that is available in the Public Service Commission. Coming back to the report, the level of brazen incompetent and corruption that we have witnessed in the past few months, has made our task of administering oversight more important than ever. However, in order for us to carry on, report needs to be tabled in the specified period to grant us enough time to diligently evaluate them. It is commendable that the department

and its entities have been able to attain most of its performance targets with no cases of unauthorised fruitless and wasteful and irregular expenditure in all quotas.

However, it remains the view of the IFP, that the public wage bill remains bloated. Tangible and principled steps need to be taken to reduce the wage bill to curb corruption, negligence and restore faith in the public sector. The scope of the office of standards and compliance needs to be expanded to allow it to conduct lifestyle audits for government employees. The Public Service Commission achieve all its targets reflected to integrity and anticorruption but this is questionable, given the rampant corruption that has been revealed through whistleblowers and proceedings at the Commission for State Capture. The IFP lays a challenge at the feet of the department and entities to work with their counterparts and the Justice and Police departments to co- ordinate and share information as well as track progress of criminal cases brought against government employees. Such a system will allow the department to timeously close disciplinary cases and save the government and the taxpayer millions. The IFP supports the report. Thank you.

Ms H DENNER: Deputy Speaker, we know that the portfolio committee’s Budgetary Review and Recommendation Report, BRRR’s,

conclusion that states that the Department of Public Service and Administration has in the 2019-20 financial year continue to implement and co-ordinate interventions and achieving efficient, effective and development orientated public service which is an essential element of a capable and developmental state. The department and its entities were able to spend almost all the allocated budgets and achieved clean audits, which is commendable. But with all due respect, while the Department of Public Service and Administration seems to function quite well, the same cannot be said of the rest of the public service.

The COVID-19 pandemic has not only exposed devastating shortcomings in our health system, but has also illustrated that there is definite and a clear lack of ethical moral conduct in the public service. By August of this year, government has spent around R10 billion on personal protective equipments, PPEs - since the start of the COVID-19 pandemic. And since then a score of unqualified, barely qualified and undercapacitated companies have dug into the PPEs tender pie, often with the help and through the benefit of certain public service officials.

*Afrikaans*:

Die trog waarby Covid-19 verkrygingskripvreters eet, is, ten spyte van vele vermanings deur die Minister van Staatsdiens en

Administrasie oor morele en etiese optrede, steeds aan die oorvloei van belastingbetalerseld. Daar is geen einde in sig nie.

Totdat alle departmente kan rapporteer dat hulle geen vrugtelose en verkwiste uitgawes getoon het nie, sleutelbestuursposisies gevul is, die staatsdiens se salarisrekening onder beheer is en ’n produktiewe diensgeoriënteerde, volle funksionele openbare administrasie daar gestel is, is hierdie departement se werk nie behoorlik gedoen nie, ongeag hoeveel selfopgestelde tyd moes beruik word nie. Ek dank u.

Mr M G P LEKOTA: We do not support this report.

Ms M M NTULI: Hon Deputy Speaker, the Portfolio Committee of Public Service and Administration has considered the fourth quarter of the annual performance plan of the 2019-20 financial year for the Department of Public Service and Administration and its entities as well as Public Service Commission. The committee made the following findings and recommendations: One, the Department of Public Service and Administration should swiftly and fully establish the office of standards and compliance and expand its scope to conduct lifestyle audits for government employees in three spheres of government. Two, the Department of Public Service and Administration should develop an inclusive strategy over the

medium term by regularly consulting with organised labour unions when making decisions affecting the conditions of service in the public service. Three, the National School of Governance, in consultation with the National Treasury should develop a lasting solution for the sustainability of the school. The school should be permitted to use training funds for the learners who are unable to attend training for a longer period. Four, the National School of Governance, in collaboration with the Department of Public Service and Administration should ensure that all senior managers in the public service become aware of the mandatory training courses freely offered by the school. Five, the Public Service Commission should investigate reasons causing delays in closing disciplinary cases in the public service as the situation cause government millions of rands whilst suspended officials are idling at home.

The committee will make comprehensive analysis of the department annual performance plans for the 2019-20 financial year when tabling the Budgetary Review and Recommendation Report. I thank you.

Question put.

Motion agreed to (Congress of the People, Democratic Alliance, Economic Freedom Fighters and Freedom Front Plus dissenting.)

Report accordingly adopted.

# CONSIDERATION OF PRELIMINARY BUDGETARY REVIEW AND RECOMMENDATION REPORT OF PORTFOLIO COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION ON STATISTICS SOUTH AFRICA

There was no debate.

Ms N T MKHATSHWA (ON BEHALF OF THE DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP OF THE

MAJORITY PARTY): Deputy Speaker, I move that the report be adopted.

*Declarations of vote:*

Mr M S MALATSI: Deputy Speaker, the DA is concerned by the increasing decimation of Statistics SA due to the chronic underfunding that has beset the entity for the last 10 years.

We are now even more worried by recent developments that indicate that over 116 staff members left the entity in the current financial year due to the fact that Statistics SA cannot compete to retain the skills that it has because many of its highly

skilled ethnographers to statisticians are highly sought out by other entities across the world and simply because this government refuses to increase the budget allocation for Statistics SA. We are losing the little talent that is left in the organisation.

This is beginning to have a devastating impact Statistics SA’s ability to work and the volume of the work that it does in producing evidence-based research that is used by the private sector, academia, nongovernmental organisations, NGOs, and even us as legislatures in order to inform the decisions that we need to make in our resource allocation.

It is even more worrying to the extent that the Statistician- General, Mr Risenga Maluleke indicates that in many capacities he has current staff members acting in more than two positions in order to make up for the staff deficiency that is faced by the Statistics SA. We have already indicated that because of these shortages, the organisation has decided to discontinue some of its critical work which include the estimates of poverty, which is a crucial study that it conducts annually.

It makes no sense as to why the ANC continue to this; perhaps it indicates the ANC’s lack faith in fact-based evidence research to guide its policy-making because in the ANC, it is rhetoric that

guides policy rather than evidence-based research. Thank you, Deputy Speaker.

Ms R N KOMANE: Thank you, Deputy Speaker, if we want to fully understand and appreciate that the ruling party has neither the intention to deal with poverty, inequality, unemployment and all other social ills including gender-based violence, one must not look further than what is happening at Statistics SA.

This House has sat down and watched as the executive destroy the Statistics SA. For the longest time, the former and current Statistician-General have shared with all of us that if we do not do something about financing Statistics SA properly, we will soon have nothing but an institution in paper.

The vacancy rate remains high, Statistics SA continue to lose valuable skills and its budget continue to be reduced annually without regard or consideration of the work that the Statistics SA must do.

To make matters worse, in the past two budget adjustments, the Finance Minister has reduced Statistics SA budget by more than R326 million. This was done without analysis or scientific evidence. This means that we will not have a study on South

Africa’s levels of poverty, we will not have a full study on gender-based violence and we will not have too many other studies that should form the basis of policy decision-making.

The ruling party is Statistics SA and the National Assembly is standing by and just watching. For that, the EFF rejects this budget. Thank you very much.

Inks R N CEBEKHULU: Deputy Speaker and hon members, it must be noted that the committee has consolidated four quarterly reports the preliminary Budgetary Review and Recommendation Report, BRRR, citing COVID-19 for their inability to table an annual report for consolidation which is cause for concern.

According to the preliminary report, Statistics SA publishes more than 200 statistical releases per year, which inform, amongst others, NDP and the MTSF. It therefore critical that Statistics SA has the necessary resources and staff to fulfil the its essential function timeously and efficiently.

The IFP echoes the concerns expressed in the high vacancy rate resulting in middle and senior management being overstretched, which poses a high risk that might hamper data collection and the analysis imparting on the reliability and quality of statistics.

The IFP supports the recommendation that Statistics SA should prioritise the filing of critical funded vacancies so as to address the critical concern. The IFP is further pleased to note that the department has prioritised Census 2021 project and earmarked an allocation of R145,2 million in the 2019-20 financial year.

We echo the committee in highlighting the importance of field works that are able to communicate with households in their home language. I thank you and the IFP supports the report.

Mr T H JAMES: Hon Deputy Speaker, the Portfolio Committee on Public Service and Administration has considered four quarters of annual plans for 2019-20 financial year for Statistics SA. The committee made the following findings and recommendations: Statistics SA should fast-track the finalisation of the legislative amendment and table it to Parliament timeously; Statistics SA should prioritise the filling of funded critical vacancies with additional budget allocated to fund historical budget shortfall of the compensation of employees; Statistics SA should report on the progress of filing vacancies in March 2021; in the process of filing critical vacancies, Statistics SA should prioritise and balance each gender equity to ensure that more women are appointed in senior management; Statistics SA should

continue to make nationwide awareness about Census 2021 and communicate its strategy of collecting data during the COVID-19 pandemic to guarantee participants safety and adherence to National Disaster Act regulations pertaining to coronavirus; and that Statistics SA should also ensure that enumerators are fully supported with personal protective equipments, PPEs, during 2021 when physically collecting data.

The committee will make a comprehensive analysis of the department’s annual performance plan 2019-20 financial year as we will be tabling the Budgetary Review and Recommendation Report, BRRR, later this week. We support the report. I thank you, Comrade Deputy Speaker. [Applause.]

Question put.

Motion agreed to (Democratic Alliance, Economic Freedom Fighters and Freedom Front Plus dissenting).

Report accordingly adopted.

The House adjourned at 19:28.