

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 1

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

PROCEEDINGS OF THE NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

The House met at 15:05

The Deputy Speaker took the Chair and requested members to observe a moment of silence for prayer or meditation.

The Deputy Speaker further requested members to observe a moment of silence in memory of those who had died as a result of the Covid-19 pandemic.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, the programme of the National Assembly have adopted a hybrid approach to House sittings. This means that members are physically in attendance in the Chamber as you can see and others are joining in through the virtual platform. Social distancing measures have been put in place and needs to be strictly adhered to throughout the meeting.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 2

In terms of the National Assembly Rule 6, the Speaker frame Rules to make provision for virtual sittings of the National Assembly. Rule 6 says that:

“The Speaker may give a ruling or frame a Rule in respect of any eventuality for which these rules or orders of the House do not provide.” In doing so the Speaker must “give due regard to the procedures, precedents, practices and conventions developed by the House and on the basis of constitutional values and principles underpinning an open, accountable and democratic society”.

A Rule framed by a Speaker remains enforced until the House, based on the recommendation of the rules committee has decided thereon. The Rules on virtual sitting of the House were published in the ATC on 15 April, supplement the Rules of the National Assembly which remains in force and applicable to all sittings of the National Assembly. These Rules were also endorsed by the National Assembly Rules Committee on the 19 May.

Hon members, in order to facilitate today's proceedings, the following measures have been implemented: Technology in the Chamber has been arranged such that members in the Chamber

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 3

will see and hear members who are virtually connected to the plenary just like we heard in the beginning. In future, there needs to be order than there was in the beginning. Similarly, members on the virtual platform will see and hear members who are in the Chamber and have been orderly up to so far. The Speaker and other presiding officers will be chairing this plenary from virtual platform.

All members are required to mute their microphones and only unmute when they are recognised to speak, and this is because the microphones are very sensitive and will pick up noise which might disturb the attention of other members. When recognised to speak, please unmute your microphone and connect your video. Only then, members may make use of icons on the bar at the bottom of their screens or at the top depending on the instrument they are using which will give you an option that allows a member to put up his or her hand to raise points of order. The secretariat will assist in alerting the Chairperson and presiding officers about members requesting to speak.

When using the virtual system and in the Chamber, members are urged to refrain or desist from unnecessary points of orders as we normally say in the House or the interjections. I also

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 4

wish to indicate that the group chat on the virtual platform is disabled. The matter was discussed by the Whippery and that was the agreement.

Hon members, I also wish to indicate that under current circumstances, our interpretation service is severely strained. However, limited interpretation will be available only when the floor language changes from English. On the virtual platform the following languages will be interpreted into English, IsiXhosa, IsiZulu, Setswana, Tshivenda, Sesotho, Xitsonga and Afrikaans. In the Chamber the following languages will be available: siSwati, Sepedi and Isindebele.

Hon members, the only item on the Order Paper are questions addressed to the Ministers in Cluster 2: Social Services and 3: Governance. There are four supplementary questions on each question as you know hon members. Parties have given an indication on which questions their members wish to pose a supplementary question on. Adequate notice was given to parties for this purpose. This was done to facilitate participation of members who are connecting to the sitting through virtual platform.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 5

The members who will pose supplementary questions will be recognised by the presiding officer. In allocating opportunities for supplementary questions, the principle of fairness amongst others has been applied. In other words, including and mixing as diverse a number of parties as possible in asking supplementary questions. If a member who is supposed to ask a supplementary question through the virtual platform is unable to do so due to technological difficulties, the party Whip on duty will be allowed to ask the question on behalf of their member.

When all the supplementary questions have been answered by the executive, we will proceed to the next question on the Question Paper. I am glad to remind members that in terms of Rule 142, the time allocated for questions is three hours.

The first question has been asked by hon M D Hlengwa to the Minister in the Presidency for Women, Youth and Persons with Disabilities. I have been informed that the Minister will be answering questions through the virtual platform. Before the Minister answers this question, I would like hon members in the Chamber to rise so that we observe a moment of silence for those who have lost their lives due to Covid-19; and to their families, we send our condolences.

[Moment of silence observed]

Thank you, let's be seated. Hon Minister in the Presidency!
Hon members as you know, the time allowed for each initial reply is limited to four minutes and an additional two minutes may be allowed if the presiding officer is of the opinion that the matter is sufficiently important and it requires additional time. Hon Minister, please proceed.

QUESTIONS TO MINISTERS

SOCIAL SERVICES - CLUSTER 2 and

GOVERNANCE - CLUSTER 3

Question 134:

The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY FOR WOMEN, YOUTH AND PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES: Chair, my name is Maite Nkoana-Mashabane, the Minister in the Presidency for Women, Youth and Persons with Disabilities. The coronavirus pandemic or Covid-19, beset us when we were already battling as a country ... [Inaudible.] ... it befell us when we were already dealing with a mammoth of a problem and equally a pandemic of gender-based violence in our country.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 7

When this coronavirus pandemic beset us, we had to find a way of mitigating so that we do not lose many of our people. We had to save lives and livelihoods. The lockdown became a choice in order to make sure that we do not have many people infected and dying all over the place and at the same due to coronavirus. However, it has had its unintended consequences as we saw the increase of reported cases of gender-based violence. Women and children became targets of frustrations related Covid-19 as we saw the increase of gender-based violence reports during lockdown period.

Across the country, civil society groups, gender-based violence advocacy organisations and other social justice groups have reported an increase in incidents relating to violence against women and children. This is time around if there is a case of gender-based violence in the lockdown; it is committed by family members. It is the father doing something wrong to his own children or his own relative in the same household.

Within the outrage of gender-based violence, since 2019, government has approved the National Council for Gender-Based Violence and Femicide as well as the National Strategic Plan on Gender-Based Violence. In 2020, an interministerial

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 8

committee was set to establish the national council and to implement the national strategic plan. The prevention and the response pillars of the national strategic plan is used by the department to create awareness on gender-based violence and to convert lockdown challenges that we come across and sharing information on the services offered.

The department monitors the implementation of the emergency response action plan in governance and ensures weekly reporting on pillars of the plan which is escalated to the President. The plan was meant to be executed within six months and reporting is extended to respond to challenges faced during lockdown in respect of gender-based violence. [Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you Minister, unfortunately your time has expired. You can continue when you are answering the supplementary question. Hon Hlengwa!

Ms M D HLENGWA: Thank you Chairperson, Minister what alternative alert measures ... [Interjections.] ... were considered by the department ... [Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 9

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay! M D Hlengwa. My apologies; go ahead hon member.

Ms M D HLENGWA: I am here. I am hon Hlengwa.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I made a mistake, please go ahead ma'am. I apologise for the disruption.

Ms M D HLENGWA: Thank you very much. Minister, what alternative alert measures were considered by the department taking into account that women and vulnerable children might not have telephones access or are afraid of the report abuse while being in close proximity to their abusers or might have been intimidated to report at the police station or few break-ins in the strict lockdown regulations? What did the department do to alert the public that the victims of domestic abuse are free to report to the police station? Were there any public announcements on radio stations, for instance, besides the formal publication of the regulations? I thank you

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Minister, but before you respond, could the Whips please remind members that they may only ask one supplementary question. It helps us to save time so that many members are able to also ask questions and

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 10

Ministers are also able to respond to as many questions as they can do within the given time. Let us do it. Hon Minister!

The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY FOR WOMEN, YOUTH AND PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES: Yes hon Hlengwa, we do have a ... [Inaudible.] ... which we share with ... [Inaudible.] ... social development so that those who do not have the means to call from their own households can sneak out and use those facilities. Also, we use all means of communication in all the languages, even on ... [Inaudible.] ... media. Where we can, we even remove children and families nearer or near the ... [Inaudible.] ... if it does not work. But remember, this would not have been if it was not for coronavirus.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay, the next supplementary question is asked by the hon K R J Meshoe. Reverend! ... You can speak from quarantine. [Laughter.] This technology allows you, I mean really. Hon Meshoe, are you there? Are you connecting? If he is not there, I will go to the third supplementary question asked by the hon Mahambehlala. Please go ahead hon member.

Question 134 (cont):

Ms T MAHAMBEHLALA: Hon Deputy Speaker, Minister how many victims of gender-based violence that have been helped during

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 11

this Covid-19 lockdown, especially women living with disabilities? If yes, what are the interventions offered to them? Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY FOR WOMEN, YOUTH AND PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES: Hon Deputy Speaker, I have just concluded my intervention. I may add if I still have more time that besides...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, no hon Minister there is a question asked by hon Mahambehlala. Did you hear it?

The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY FOR WOMEN, YOUTH AND PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES: No, hon Deputy Speaker not a word.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You did not hear it?

The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY FOR WOMEN, YOUTH AND PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES: Not a word.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, no, it is a supplementary question. It has been asked from the floor right now. Can I ask - no, no hon members this is a slight hitch, don't go to town about it. Hon Mahambehlala, ask your question, the Minister is now listening and then she will respond.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 12

Ms T MAHAMBEHLALA: Hon Deputy Speaker, my question is how many victims of gender-based violence have been helped during the Covid-19 lockdown especially women with disabilities? If yes, what interventions were offered to them? Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker, hoping you captured it now.

The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY FOR WOMEN, YOUTH AND PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES: Hon member, I might not be giving you figures as you are asking but we are working as the department with our fellow departments in all the shelters together with all the NGOs. Last week, I and the Minister of Social Development we met with the United Nations Population Fund UNFPA, UN Women to reach out to women here in Gauteng who were in need. We donated all that which women would need but not food parcels. You and I know that women in stress need more than just food parcels. So, that is just what we do and this is just the beginning. We will continue working in partnership with like minded organisation together with our government.

As I said earlier on we also formed InterMinisterial Committee, IMC, which is meant to implement the National Strategic Plan. This includes Ministers of Police, Justice and Constitutional Development, Social Development and Public

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 13

Service and Administration. We will form a committee or a council at the end which will include other leaders from the non-governmental organisations.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, I am still hoping to hear whether hon Meshoe is connecting. Hon members, we work on the basis of names that were given to us as per agreement. That is the procedure we are following. So, I have got names of those people before me. The next supplementary question is asked by hon Sonti who I guess she is doing so virtually because she is not in the House.

Ms N P SONTI: Minister, have been subjected to gender-based violence before and during the lockdown. Mrs Retabile Pakela was raped in her house in the early hours. Mrs Rebecca Simbane was burnt by her partner in Marikana and she could not report or open a case to the police due to the regulations that made it very difficult for everyone to go out of the house. What plans has your department put in place to protect our women? How do you ensure that they get justice? Thank you Deputy Speaker.

The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY FOR WOMEN, YOUTH AND PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES: We do work with women who are not in

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 14

government, the social sector who assist these vulnerable women and accompany them to report the cases. We became aware that while the lockdown is meant to protect the lives of the women it was almost like they were sent into the slaughter houses. Working together with those women in the UN which is a woman body gave us strategies on how to get these women out so that the case does not just become a case only reported by phone and that is all.

We will be meeting again next week in the IMC to make sure that we make progress in this regard. We prefer to rather get the perpetrator out of the home because wherever the mother is, she is with the children and family. So, we will be reminding colleagues that if the perpetrator is the one that is making life hell for this people who are not there not because they want to but because of the situation of life and death that was brought by this pandemic, it is the perpetrator who should leave the peaceful people alone. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you Minister. Hon members, I am told that hon Meshoe is ready to connect. Hon Meshoe, please go ahead.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 15

Rev K R J MESHOE: Hon Deputy Speaker, ... [Inaudible] unfortunately amongst other things is that it resulted in the loss of employment for many providers in the homes. That unfortunately led to hunger that would also cause or led to accusations of the provider failing to provide and thus resulting with the frustration that these providers have because they cannot provide for their families. The unfortunate thing is for these providers to unleash their frustrations on members of their families.

So, my question to the Minister is that besides advising the victims of domestic abuse to go and report cases of abuse does the department offer any counselling to the affected families to try and minimise the misunderstandings that leads to these frustrations because when a person has lost a job it is not only the provider at pains but the family also that cannot have provision is also at pains. So, I would like to know whether there is any form of help.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Meshoe, thank you very much your time has expired. Please hon members do not explain your questions because it takes all your time. Just ask your question. We hope that the Minister will be able to respond to you very effectively.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 16

The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY FOR WOMEN, YOUTH AND PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES: Hon Reverend Meshoe, it is an old adage that a man who feels inferior runs to punish women for whatever they have not done. So, please let the men who could not provide think. The only way he could do things is to beat or harm those who have done absolutely nothing wrong. It is those who actually expect love and care from him particularly at this time of the pandemic.

The Department of Social Development has been tasked by the government to distribute food parcels. Never mind the other existing grants but there is also the R350 to be given out, just for the time being to families that find themselves vulnerable. I really feel and plead with you, the man of the cloth that it should not come from that men who do not know what to do with them must go and vent their frustrations to their families.

Question 116:

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: Thank you Deputy Speaker, my department is not aware of the confusion that hon Groenwald is talking about because the regulations were clear and the regulations said that the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 17

business must possess a business license or permit to trade issued in accordance with the Personal Property Securities, PPS, Act 1991 or a business license or trading permit issued by the relevant municipality.

Now, after that the Minister of Small Business issued directions that further clarified what should happen and I'll read from some of those directions just to clarify.

Then, it says all enterprises must ensure that the absolute minimum numbers of staff necessary to safely operate the enterprise are at work during the lockdown period.

Furthermore, employees are encouraged to provide transport.

The grocery stores outlets who operate during the lockdown period irrespective of the nationality or their owner provided that they adhere to the following and it explains very clearly that all spaza shop owners and informal food traders must hold permits issued by their respective local municipalities allowing them to trade in line with the provision of the Business Act of 1991 as amended; no person may stay overnight in the grocery shop; only the sale of food stuffs and basis necessities is permitted; and a grocery store must uphold the health hygiene requirements maintaining a social distance among customers and between the trader of at least one meter.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 18

Now, it goes on, it explains very clearly what should happen so I don't know when hon Groenewald says there was confusion between the metro or local enforcers and municipalities. I don't know where the confusion is. Thank you Chair.

Mr I M GROENEWALD: Thank you Deputy Speaker. Hon Minister if that is the case that the municipalities have been afforded to issue permits other than normal trading permits in terms of the bylaws, yet these municipalities have been issuing permits to businesses and individuals.

A form two of the addendum A was the example issued by Moqhaka Municipality that is supposed to be an essential service worker to a person to travel over municipal borders to go and see a doctor as stated in the permit, thus creates confusion.

The Minister's department had had the function and responsibility of cooperate governance did not communicate these relevant regulations properly to all municipalities and law enforcement. What is the nature due to ensure adequate communication between relevant departments, local government and law enforcement going forth especially when differentiated levels are implemented? Thank you Deputy Speaker.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 19

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: Well first of all when it comes to differentiated levels let's say it doesn't arise from the answer so I will not deal with that but what I want to say to hon Groenewald is that we work together in issuing the regulations, the Minister of Police and other Ministers. So, when we communicate everything is gazetted, everything I've read to you is gazetted.

Secondly, all the Ministers also communicate to the law, the Minister of Police and the relevant Ministers communicate to the people who enforce. So I really do not know where the confusion was but if there was, some of the issues that may have arisen were brought to our attention, I then bring them to the attention of the law enforcers and they get resolved. We must also remember that this is the first time we are in this situation. There may be confusion here and there but those issues must be raised as when they happened so that they are resolved. Thank you

Ms M O MKHALIPHI: Thank you very much Deputy Speaker, the regulations that were imposed during level 5 in terms of trade left out informal sector which comprises of women who sells fruits, vegetables, amagwinya, amanqina, you'll find these

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 20

women in many places Minister such as KwaMamba, eMtshebheni and all over South Africa. These regulations left them with no assistance. Focus was only on big businesses mainly whites, what is your department's plan to ensure that informal traders who lost income get relief?

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: First of all my department is not really treasury, it doesn't have money. The President announced the packages and relevant Ministers are dealing with those packages better to cushion either individuals or businesses.

But, let me also say to hon Mkhalihi, what I was reading is an amendment that was made part of the regulations of level 4 and these directions as I was reading it says all spaza shop owners, informal food traders so it doesn't leave other people except those who were selling cooked food because cooked food was not allowed at that level. Thank you

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mthenjane are you rising on a point of order, why is your hand up? Otherwise lower your hand. [Laughter.] Okay, let's move to the next... the member will lower his or her hand. You can't experiment today. The third supplementary is asked by hon Hoosen virtually.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 21

Mr M H HOOSEN: Deputy Speaker, thank you very much. There are many municipalities in our country that have introduced their permitting system and their different requirements. Now this made it very difficult for businesses and Non-Governmental Organisations, NGOs, especially when it comes to the distribution of food you'll also know that as a result of that the DA had to ... [Inaudible]... and in that case the court order that the government cannot prohibit NGOs and business is whether or not you will bring the order to the attention of municipalities and if you haven't done so by when can we expect that you will bring this to the attention of the municipalities? Thank you very much.

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: Hon Deputy Speaker, I lost hon Hoosen somewhere along the way can he repeat? Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: His connection was a bit... Hon Hoosen?

Mr M H HOOSEN: Thank you very Deputy Speaker, hon Minister what I was saying to is that there are some municipalities that have introduced their own permitting system especially when it comes to the distribution of food and businesses and

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 22

NGOS have been finding it difficult to distribute food because of that endurance and you'll know that as result of that the DA had to seek an urgent order from the court and in that case the court had ruled that government cannot prohibit NGOs and businesses from distributing food to communities. What I'd like to know from you is whether or not you have brought that court order to the attention of municipalities so that, that inconvenience can come to an end and if you haven't done so by when can we expect you to do so? Thank you very much.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister we can't hear you can you please unmute. Unmute hon Minister. You wouldn't have asked. The Minister will answer, let's just have that sorted out. We can't hear you still. Go ahead Minister.

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: Can't you hear me?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, we can.

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: I was saying that part of what hon Hoosen has asked as a supplementary question does not arise from what I've said but let me respond to part of his question that actually municipalities do have within their sphere rights to have

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 23

their own regulations. Not under the disaster but in their own laws and they can make bylaws and all that.

So, if they did, as long as it wasn't opposite to what the national regulations required. If it was opposite to what the national regulations required then obviously they were doing something but we have informed those that we were made aware of and clarified things to those made us aware that there were issues with municipalities. Thank you.

Mr L M NTSAYISA: [No sound.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is there anybody in the House who can do that on his behalf? Hon Nthsayisa are you there? If he's not there...

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: He's there but he's muted. He should unmute.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: It has to be a member from his party, his Whip, who's ready to do that? Hon members don't get involved in other people's affairs. It's none of your business whether they fight or not. [Laughter.] The hon member is struggling to connect. Who would like to take that slot so that we can move?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 24

Go ahead hon member. Where is he? Hon Hoosen go ahead. Hon Hoosen are you ready to take that slot?

Mr M H HOOSEN: Thank you very much Deputy Speaker. Hon Minister obviously didn't hear the previous question and I was referring in particular to the High Court ruling about the food distribution that the court ruled against government that was secured by the DA.

My concern Deputy Minister is that your department has not brought this High Court ruling to the attention of municipalities and there still many municipalities that are preventing NGOs and businesses and it's related directly to the question that there are also businesses that are being hindered from this, which is the reason why we had to secure that court order to prevent government from stopping businesses from distributing food parcels and food to poor communities.

What I want to know from you is are you going to make sure that the regulations and court orders in this regard are brought to the attention of all municipalities in our country so that there is consistency in the manner in which your regulations are being implemented? Thank you.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 25

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: Thank you very much, obviously...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order hon members, let the Minister answer you. You've asked a question so wait for the answer. Hon Minister please go ahead.

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: There was no reason for municipalities if they've blocked people distributing food even though the directions about distribution of do not reside with Cooperative Governance & Traditional Affairs, COGTA, but that would have been wrong. We will try if those court cases come to our attention inform the municipalities. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, thank you very much I've had fun with you. I'm now inviting the Speaker to connect. Madam Speaker connect so that you can release me from the chair. Madam Speaker are you connecting? There is no career here sir absolutely.

The SPEAKER: Hon members, we proceed to question 119, which was put by the hon Gungubele to the Minister of Social

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 26

Development. I have been informed that the Minister is ready to respond. Minister, please go ahead!

Hon members, we are at Question 119, which was put by the hon Gungubele to the Minister of Social Development. I now invite the Minister to respond. Is the Minister online?

Mr N SINGH: Hon Speaker, this is hon Singh here from the IFP!

The SPEAKER: Yes, Mr Singh!

Mr N SINGH: Could we not proceed to the next question while they try and locate the Minister, to save time? Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Singh. Hon members, we will do so: We will come back to Question 119 and we will then proceed to the next question which was put by hon Gwarube. It is Question 193. Is the Minister of Health available? The Minister of Health! Can we find out whether the Minister of Health is on; the Minister of Social Development is on; and all the other Ministers who have undertaken to be on this virtual sitting today.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Okay! Give me a few seconds. I am just sitting on a parliamentary session. So, what I will do ... No,

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 27

no, not at all. [Interjections.] What I will do: Let me just get my team to give me the last word so that I can see what is it that we can rule on, so that we can move it from there. I will then come to you because it was ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Yes, Minister, I know that we are taking you in the place of the Minister of Social Development. You still had a few minutes to tie up your business. We are now stuck because both you and the Minister of Social Development are saying we can't find you. I will give you a few minutes, hon Minister, and move on to the next Minister. I know that it is also unfair to go to this Minister because the Minister of Social Development should be here.

May I first start off by finding out whether the Minister of Basic Education is ready?

The MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION (Mrs M A Motshekga): Yes, Speaker, I am!

The SPEAKER (Ms T R Modise): Please, madam. Thank you very much for being ready. Can I then ask you to respond to the question which was put to you by the hon Meshoe?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 28

Question 117:

The MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION: Hon Speaker, Members of Parliament, indeed, we will provide personal protective equipments, PPEs, to all learners and educators in public schools. The other answer is that the provision will be made on arrival at schools for teachers. Everybody will receive their protective clothes upon arrival. The provincial education departments are the ones that are responsible for procuring these PPEs and the cost can be obtained from all different provinces.

What the national department did through the Department of Trade and Industry was to develop the specifications and the proposed prices for all the different specifications so that we don't have a situation where everybody buys at different prices. That is all we did, but all the procurement took place in provinces. So, how much they spend will be known by provinces; not by ourselves at national level. Thank you very much.

Rev K R J MESHOE: Hon Speaker, hon Minister, while we appreciate what the Minister has said, I want to know: Whether unions that have been complaining - such as SA Democratic Teachers' Union, that schools are not ready because they do

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 29

not have PPEs - are not honest in saying this, even when they say that PPEs are not in the actual individual schools, but are in district offices, and they don't believe that the offices will deliver those PPEs on time? So, my question is: Are they not honest in saying there are no PPEs at schools? Have they not seen them; or what is the problem?

The MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION: Speaker, I won't say that it honest or dishonest ... [Inaudible.] ... of other individuals. [Interjections.] I am stating facts as reported from each of different provinces. We are saying the protective clothing or those PPEs for learners would be available in schools upon arrival. We are saying we first sent the first stock in the first wave when we had your senior managers. They arrived.

This week, because they were expecting teachers, the teachers' PPEs are arriving. The learners' PPEs will arrive on time because what we were avoiding, which is happening in different schools, there are burglaries. If they know that there are valuable items in schools, there would always be burglaries. We already have many incidents of burglaries in schools.

Just this week, we even had deaths, where people were killed trying to break into our schools. So, the point on whether

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 30

they are honest or dishonest: I don't want to get there. I can only give you the facts of what would have been reported to me by MECs and I have no reason to doubt what they told me.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister. The second supplementary question goes to the hon Mashabela. Hon Mashabela!

Ms M R MOHLALA: Hon Speaker, I am going to take the supplementary question on behalf of hon Mashabela, as hon Mohlala. I am going to go straight to the question. My question is: What is on the list of the PPEs to be supplied to each school to be considered suitable for opening? In instances whereby learners have forgotten or misplaced their PPEs at home, is the department going to be able to supply all schools with surplus of PPEs? Thank you.

The MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION: Chair, every learner is going to be given two masks and will replenish later in the year in case there are losses or damages, but for the first round, we are going to give them two each. There are going to be sanitisers, which are going to be used to clean surfaces everyday. They are going to be hand sanitisers in every classroom, but there is also going to be your cleaning

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 31

material that we are sending and the soaps that are being sent, depending on the intensity of the spread of the virus.

For instance, you won't treat Bolobedu, where there is just no incident of any infection the same way we treat Joburg and Cape Town. So, in areas where there is high intensity, there are also double measures put in place. We are also supplying soap because they have to wash hands or sanitise. So, in case one of the two does not come in place, it is going to be there.

In terms of justice, the protocols are saying no child will be allowed into the school premises if they don't have their masks on. So, there is no way they would say they forgot them. This means they will have to be turned back at the gate to go and take the second mask. So, they can't declare that they would have lost or forgotten one when they are already in the school because they can't enter the school yard without a mask.

Mr N L S KWANKWA: Hon Speaker, in light of the fact that you are going to have more than roughly about 200 000 teachers and learners getting ready for school next week, and due to the fact that we have seen media reports that there are a number

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 32

or delays in delivering the PPEs: Have any interventions been undertaken to ensure that the correct protocols are followed in schools in so far as the PPEs are concerned, so that they don't end up becoming a major source of transmission for the coronavirus as well?

The MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION: Speaker, that part had three instructions given by the Ministry of Health when we announced that we want to reopen schools. They said priority number one is to make sure that schools don't become centres of infections; and number two, they are not centres for spreading the infection before even talking about saving the year. So those are the strict protocols that we were given and that is why there is a clear regiment about what happens from when you enter the school premises, in that there is going to be daily testing at any school.

So, if a school does not have a thermometer, it would not operate. If a school has not already demarcated by Monday for safe distance, it would not operate. If a school has not received its mask or anything, it will not operate. So, there are clear protocols under which schools can operate.

Otherwise, no school is going to be allowed to operate if it

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 33

does not meet all the set-up criteria that have been given to us by Health.

The SPEAKER: Hon members, we must thank the Minister. We go back to Question 119, which was put by the hon Gungubele to the Minister of Social Development. Minister!

Mr G G HILL-LEWIS: Sorry Madam Speaker!

The SPEAKER: The hon Minister of Social Development!

Mr G G HILL-LEWIS: Madam Speaker, on a point of order!

The SPEAKER: What is a point of order?

Mr G G HILL-LEWIS: You only had three follow-ups to that question. There is hon Tarabella-Marchesi on the list as well.

The SPEAKER: Ooh, I must apologise. Hon Tarabella-Marchesi, my apologies! Hon Minister of Basic Education, I released you too early. Hon Tarabella-Marchesi, your supplementary question, please!

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 34

Ms M N I TARABELLA: Hon Speaker, hon Minister, my question is this. Given the fact that this morning we woke up to the news that there were teachers that were infected with Covid-19, and in case that we do apply screening at school but then a learner is found to have contracted the virus, and it becomes asymptomatic, and that learner goes back home: What is it that you are doing to ensure that learners don't transmit the virus to their grandparents and also to parents with underlying conditions?

The MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION: Chair, we have been taken through the entire process of how to manage screening, testing and how to react when you have a child or a person with high temperature. So, those are protocols which are followed everywhere else. Even if we were to be in Parliament, the would be the same protocols that schools are going to follow.

In terms of children taking infections home, I think the member might be quite aware that the greatest risk is amongst adults, not children. Even in the case of the Western Cape, where we have had these two infections, it was about infected adults, not children. So, we are not saying children are not at risk, but we are saying that delete risky factors.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 35

So, our focus is really around senior people. We will be coming to the Western Cape because the Western Cape, especially Cape Town and the different regions are a major concern for us and they ... [Inaudible.] ... because two incidents come from the Western Cape.

So, we will be coming down on Sunday with the President to discuss with the province on how we can manage Western Cape in a way that does not ... [Inaudible.] ... so that the Western Cape would keep on having the infections that they have or spreading the infections.

However, with other cases, children are the least at risk. The most people at risk are adults and that is why we are focused on teachers and workers, but we are not ruling out the fact that children can be infected. So, we will protect them if they are infected. So, there is no reason for them to say infections ... [Inaudible.] ... there are grannies because the schools ... [Inaudible.] ... So, there is safe distance, they will sanitise and they will wear masks. So, if they are not infected y the time they go schools, they shouldn't be infected by the time they live the school.

Ms N G ADOONS: Hon Speaker! Hon Speaker, it is hon Adoons!

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 36

The SPEAKER: Hon Adoons, what is it? Are you rising on a point of order? Because, all the supplementary questions are exhausted.

Ms N G ADOONS: Yes!

The SPEAKER: What is your point of order?

Ms N G ADOONS: A supplementary question by hon Malatsi. He was not noted.

The SPEAKER (Ms T R Modise): No, no, no, member. No! Hon member, any question has four supplementary questions. The first supplementary question comes from the person who put the question. Hon Tarabella-Marchesi was the last supplementary. So, we thank the Minister. She has dealt with the four supplementary questions, and therefore, we have dealt with the question.

We are now moving on to the question which was put by hon Gungubele to the Minister of Social Development. I did see that the Minister is on. Minister, please proceed. Minister of Social Development! I did see that the Minister is on.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 37

Minister, please proceed. Minister of Social Development!
Order! Hon Minister of Social Development! Is there another
problem? Hon members, we are back at Question 119.

Question 119:

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Speaker, I would like to
thank hon Gungubele for the question. The answer is that we
have learnt a lot of lessons from this. Firstly, the social
sector has untapped capacity to improve its deliverables to
the whole phase of our people. We can respond quickly and
efficiently to the challenges [Interjections.] [Inaudible.]

AN HON MEMBER: Hon Speaker, we can't hear.

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, please hold on. Hon members, can we
ask all the participants who are not speaking, mute their mics
please. Can all the hon members who are not on the floor of
this virtual sitting mute their mics.

Hon Minister, can we also ask you to take off your earphones
please.

Mr N SINGH: Hon Speaker, I think the fact that the hon
Minister doesn't know how to use these gadgets is very not

acceptable; and we, Members of Parliament, were taken to a briefing and I think they should also be taken to a briefing so that they don't waste the time of Parliament. Thank you, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Hon Singh ...

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: Where do we get recognised?

The SPEAKER: ... that point of order, I will not accept. I will accept that the Minister is having technical [Inaudible.] because they have been using virtual platforms and this particular Minister is very sussed with information technology, IT.

Hon Minister, can we pass whilst you still sort out IT problems and move on to the other Minister and the other question? You'd still going to have connectivity problems.

Hon Mkhaliipi, it's a point of order?

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: Yes. Speaker, there's a lot of echo, please ask the [Inaudible.] because [Inaudible.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 39

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: This thing is so noisy, we can't hear anything.

The SPEAKER: Yes. I have sent a message to the administration to mute everybody who is not on the floor.

So, whilst we are sorting what the difficulties are with the Minister of Social Development, can we move on to the Minister of Health?

Minister of Health, are you back?

Question 193:

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you very much. I am sorry about the earlier miscommunication. I was not aware that it was my turn, but I also had my side muted so I did not hear because there was some breakthrough noise. The question from hon Gwarube is about modelling. She is asking that through models what we expect the peak of COVID-19 infections will and what would be the death rate at that time. The response is as follows.

There are several modeling groups that have released their estimates publicly. There are three types of estimates that are currently being modeled: first, projections, which

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 40

estimate the number of new infections and deaths as well as resources that will be required for the response; second, interventions, if fully implemented that can flatten the curves; and third, spatial and motility models, these are models that can be used to identify hotspots. The estimates provided by these models are influenced by the assumptions used by the different models. The model presented in a recent virtual symposium which we hosted as the department, included projection models from the SA COVID-19 Modeling Consortium which is composed of modelers from National Institute of Communicable Diseases, Modeling and Simulation Hub Africa Unit at the University of Cape Town, Centre for Excellence and Epidemiological Modeling and Analysis at the Stellenbosch University, and the Health Economics and Epidemiology Research Office at Wits University. There was another one from Deloitte on behalf of Business for South Africa and the Actuarial Society of South Africa.

According to the SA COVID-19 Modeling Consortium the peak of infections is expected in mid-July in what is called the pessimistic scenario and mid-August in the optimistic scenario. This model estimates that provinces will peak at different times. The Actuarial Society of South Africa's, Assa, model predicts that the peak will be full in August. These

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 41

models should be considered dynamic and are dependent on the data available and as new data such as hospitalisations become available new estimates will be released by the modelers. As the outputs of these models are not cast in stone they should only be used as a guide of what may be possible so that we plan and take all those into account.

The different models that have been made public have different death rates at the peak. The SA COVID-19 Modeling Consortium estimated the number of deaths under the two scenarios to ranges between 34 000 and 50 000. The Actuarial Society of South Africa estimates it to be 48 000. The other one by Deloitte estimates up to 41 000 deaths by December. All of these figures have also been challenged by other academics. At the moment they are good just to keep note of them, but they are actually open for debates amongst those who are specialists in this area. We can only just indicate we look at them so that we have a sense of what is happening. Not necessarily all what is coming from models is actually taken into account. In our situation we just take those aspects that we believe may well be important. We keep watching. We do believe that the models will improve as time goes on and as more information and raw data from South Africa is fed into their assumptions. Thank you very much.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 42

Ms S GWARUBE: Thank you, Madam Speaker. Thank you, Minister. As it has been said before the points of the Risk Adjusted Strategy was to ensure that we delay the peak of the pandemic while we build health system capacity. We know that we have between 3 000 and 4 000 intensive care unit, ICU, beds across the country in both the public and the private health sector. However, we are also aware that not all provinces are at the same state of readiness for these peaks. Some hospitals like Frere Hospital in the Buffalo City Municipality have been deemed unsafe by the Department of Labour due to growing concerns around staff safety more so as it pertains to the availability of the personal protective equipments, PPEs. Then the question is how have we raised the line of the health system to ready ourselves for the pick of the COVID-19 infections? How many ICU beds did we start off with as a country in both the public and the private health care sector? How many new beds and related equipments have the government acquired in the past eight weeks?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you very much. Let me say that I couldn't be certain. I heard all the questions raised by the hon member. However, I do realise that she talking about the issue that was raised in the various scenarios about the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 43

possible situation of the ICU beds. Just to give you a sense we have been working on this matter. We must say that the pattern that was initially estimated was that we are likely to get the very worst peak case scenario close to July and probably from much later the best case scenario. So, all the provinces across all the different provinces have actually prepared additional beds. The numbers are staggered in the sense that the first load of beds are already in place in a number of areas and of course we got a lead time to put up additional beds. At the moment the estimated number of ICU beds was just over 5 000 and that number was combining both public and private but we also started looking at additional beds that are being fitted for, particularly for the provinces that were estimated to be going to be heavily hit, namely Gauteng and the Western Cape.

The work that we are doing is to ensure that when there is any problem we immediacy have an arrangement to be able to use private hospital beds. That has already started in the Western Cape and it is going to be like that in different parts of the country. There are issues that we are still cleaning up between ourselves and the private sector - the cost of the ICU beds. There is a team that is working on that.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 44

The availability of the PPEs has also been an issue because of the global shortage of supply. But we have actually ordered enough working with Business for South Africa. There is quite a lot of stock that has been brought into the country. We do believe that the major issue now is in monitoring and redistribution within a district. The country is by and large well served with available PPEs. It is just a matter of ensuring that in every hospital there is distribution and if there is a shortage the other part of the district should be able to make those PPEs available. Thank you.

Mr K L JACOBS: Thank you, Madam Speaker. Thank you, Minister. There are many institutions which develop models about epidemics in South Africa. South Africans can get a better understanding of the epidemic's trajectory through those models. The models also assist government to be able to prepare interventions to reduce the number of infections. Some common uncertainties that stand out in the models are the rate of asymptomatic infections. How infectious SARS-CoV-2 is, how infective various interventions are and the death rate itself? The question to you is can the models give us a full sense of security as we can only make educated guesses within a limited information at our disposal? Thank you.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 45

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker. The hon member is dead right. The real issue with the models is the fact that they came in as the outbreak was moving on. So their first assumptions were a little much wider in the sense that they took models from all over the world and they did not have direct data that was relating to what was going on South Africa. Over the past few weeks they have been trying to improve. The issue that is raised by the hon member about us uncertainty is one of the issues that is a challenge. The number of asymptomatic positive cases gives you a sense you estimate. If you find so many people with symptoms you need to have a sense of what percentage of the total number of infected people that is. It is a very difficult matter to clarify if you have not seen what the situation is in South Africa.

From the experience coming from different parts of the world the number would have ranged anything from 60% in some areas. In some instances they give you much larger figure and in some instances is much lower figure. It also does depend as well on the level at which people with mild symptoms might actually decide to go look for assistance. So it is a major issue of uncertainty that will make it difficult to be certain of what the models are telling us. That is why part of the debate that

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 46

has come from other academics has been whether we can deal with this. For example, in one case they have estimated that South Africa will have a many as 12 million. This was raised by some people and even by members of the media were questioning. If some of the countries that are ahead of South Africa that have much bigger population have not even gone beyond two million in their own population, how do they think that this will happen. So it is a very reach area of debate. With regard to the question of deaths at the moment we were looking at a death rate of 1,9%. It varies and it depends on country to another. But on its own as well it does depend on the nature of the testing, the accuracy of the testing and also ensuring that we are able to define the issue of death in a particular way.

Our ministerial advisory committee has now been tasked to sit down and align the definition of death so that we have a similar understating of deaths moving from the confirmed case to cases where they suspected and in some instances posthumous swaps that need to be taken. It does become bit completed making the uncertainty even wider. I think the point that the member is raising is correct. We can only say that we will watch and look at the figures and as we get closer to reality

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 47

as we check our own daily records, we will be able to know how reliable those models are. Thank you.

Mr M W THRING: Thank you hon Speaker. Hon Minister, the importance of modelling and data system used for COVID-19 cannot be overemphasised. The ACDP welcomes the recent announcement by President Ramaphosa hopefully based on accurate modelling to remove some of the restrictions imposed on the church, a call made by the ACDP president Rev Kenneth Meshoe in a letter he wrote to the Presidency. In the same vein we also salute the churches, nongovernment organisations, NGOs, and other religious organisation for the sterling work to assist the poor and the vulnerable during these trying times. Can the Minister also give us some clarity as to what directives, health protocols, hygiene protocols and restrictions will apply post the announcement of the President to ease the restrictions on worship in a carefully measured way? With regard to comorbidities will there now be an increased comorbidity reporting with regard to data? Thank you, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker. Indeed, we are working closely with the issue of modelling. The point we are making is that we need to understand the limitations that are in the models. We can't necessary take

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 48

everything as it stands. We need to keep a watch on it and see what the worst possible scenarios that are being predicted and also do everything we can to change that trajectory so that whatever in the model need not happen.

We must also salute the religious leaders for the way they have embraced the decision by the Cabinet to lockdown the country where they were willingly were able to participate in a programme to educate communities to refrain from large mass gatherings. That has actually assisted the country to avoid the huge explosion that would have happened in the early days of the infection. For that we are eternally grateful to the churches, mosques, synagogues and all the different faith groups because this is one area that would have been very difficult for us and it has really made a huge contribution in improving the slowing down on the infections.

There will obviously be a number of restrictions that we in our normal daily lives we have to put in place. The first instance we want to acknowledge the role of the various churches of coming forward to offer various constructive suggestions of how we can fight this disease. We take the church and the faith-based community as partners in the fight against COVID-19 particularly to ensure social behavioural

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 49

change by making sure that every body when you leave your house put on a mask, frequent hand washing, sanitisers and also ensuring a distance in keeping to the limited number of people in a place of worship so that at the end of the day on a day-to-day basis the culture of how we behave we hope that the church and the faith-based organisations will be in the forefront talking to people about what we need to be able to limit the spread of the infection.

From that point of view we will continue to work with the faith-baaed communities and also in the area of social relieve, and area when we utilise some of the facilities if we need to expand facilities into some of the places of worship this is opened and is acceptable. In the way the church and the religious practices are performed there is always an understanding of the spread of the infection with frequent wiping of the tables, the pulpits and so on so that whoever is in a place of worship does not go home having contracted the infection. Thank you very much, Madam Speaker.

Mr M D HLENGWA: Thank you, Madam Speaker. Minister, my question is regarding the shortage of the diagnostic material has been spoken about at length. In preparation for the alert

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 50

level 3 what contingency plans have the department put in place in this regard? I thank you.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thanks very much, Madam Speaker. The issue of testing has been a major weapon in our arsenal as we fight this pandemic. As we speak now South Africa has gone beyond 600 000 tests. This is quite a huge number considering that when we started we were doing about maybe 300 tests and so on. So the numbers have increases to appoint where we are very close to around an average of about 18 000 to 20 000 tests that we do overnight, and in some of the days we exceed and some of the days we are bit less.

The real thing that is hitting us is the issue of the global shortages in the supply. So have actually got the SA Health Products Regulatory Authority going all out to ensure that as many as possible diagnostic test kits are licensed so that there are available where we can. Where we are getting a challenge is that even if it is licensed it still has to go through validation processes. That is going on right now. As I have a similar question I may give you figures a bit later. But the point at the end of the day is that we doing everything that we can to ensure that we keep to the level of testing that we need to able to get a sense of the positivity

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 51

rates and manage the infection particularly the issue of ensuring that who is positive needs to be in hospital or at home. And those who were contacted must be tested and be put in quarantine. Everyone else must know that each one of us can contract the infection.

It becomes important for us to say that all that we are doing in increasing the numbers of testing is constraint by factors that are beyond our control which is what the global supply situation is. There are some of the countries that have decided on focussing on it as more of the resource nationalism is taking place. Every country is looking for what we are also looking for. Lack of our internal capacity is a challenge - lack of capacity to manufacture our own diagnostic kits. I think we need to in future invest on that as we go on as well. Thank you very much.

The SPEAKER: Thank you Minister that was your last supplementary question on this question. We will go back to Question 119, put by hon Gungubele to the Minister of Social Development. Minister, are you fine? Minister Zulu! Minister Zulu! If the Minister is not ready I will move to the next question.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 52

Hon Member: Chair, I suggest that we move. We have been trying to get hold of Minister Zulu, she is breaking.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, can we therefore move to Question 120. That question was put to the Minister of Basic Education by hon Adoons.

Question 120:

The MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION: Hon Speaker, the question was about school infrastructure. Our response is that, addressing school infrastructure is a continuous process that we have as a sector. [Inaudible]... we had to COVID-19, the different provincial education departments are currently implementing more than 2000 projects to focus on addressing water and sanitation challenges. These projects are mainly funded from provincial education infrastructure grants.

The national department with the same programme also has a programme to eradicate infrastructure backlog through Accelerated Schools Infrastructure Delivery Initiative, ASIDI. In this regard, we have almost 854 sanitation projects underway which have reached practical completion and currently we have 991 projects which are also almost complete and are meant to provide water.

The national department is also assisting in eradicating pit latrines at schools through the same programme. In this regard contractors that have been appointed are on the ground to implement 1076 projects. In liaison with provinces, the department has identified an additional number of 3500 schools with critical water challenges. In compliance with the procurement processes under the state of disaster, we have entered into an implementation protocol with the Department of Human Settlements, Water and Sanitation and Rand Water. Under this initiative, water is being delivered at different schools to address shortages in these 3500 schools. Thank you very much Speaker.

Ms N G ADOONS: Hon Speaker and thank you Minister for the response. Can the Minister provide a breakdown per province of the 3500 schools identified for water tanks, and also confirm if these water tanks have been installed in those schools. I thank you Speaker.

The MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION: It is not possible to have figures if they have not been asked before because I needed them to have brought real figures. I just know that there are 3459 in different provinces. The majority being in Limpopo,

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 54

Eastern Cape and KwaZulu-Natal but there are some schools in Gauteng. Now to ask me to give a breakdown of figures when it was not part of the question will be difficult to be able to respond to.

The SPEAKER: You are right Minister. Hon members should know that if they want statistical responses they should ask the question to be in written form. Thank you for trying Minister. The second supplementary question will be put to the Minister by the hon S S Thembekwayo on virtual platform.

Dr S S THEMBEKWAYO: Minister, I took it upon my shoulders to verify the following facts and I would like you to respond as to which are found to be true. Dalton Primary School in Umgungundlovu District Municipality in the KwaZulu-Natal Province, Mahumani High School in Shamavhunga Circuit in Mopani District Municipality in Limpopo, Ubuhle-Bemvelo Primary School in Mtubatuba Local Municipality KwaZulu-Natal, Utjane Primary School in Limpopo Province including Kgopong Primary School in Dikgale, Limpopo Province has had problems of lack of toilets for more than a decade.

To date nothing has been done and you have only four days to rectify or improve the situation. Yet you expect schools to

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 55

reopen. Referring to Mahomane High School specifically which had four classrooms blown away by the wind on 24 November 2019. It is the same school that still has one toilet which caters for 606 learners. The school was all over the media last year

The SPEAKER: Hon member, your supplementary question.

Dr S S THEMBEKWAYO: Minister, what is your urgent contingency plan within these four days that will improve this problem?

The MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION: It is the same thing, if I am to confirm or deny. I also need to go and verify. The member should have given me all the questions, all the names to go and verify with provinces and come back give back. What I know as a generic issue is that, in instances where we are unable to respond and COVID-19 compliant, we will send temporal structures. I am not sure whether they are on the way because I do not know which schools she is talking about of the 3000. That is one of the measures that we have put in place.

The other measure that we put in place for instance is we are phasing in opening, if there are situations which we find completely impossible for us to operate, we will transport

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 56

learners to other schools because as I said, the Department of Health and the National Command Centre will not allow us to operate in a school which is risky for learners. The specific ... [Inaudible]... were supposed to be given ... [Inaudible] so that I check and confirm. We have agreed with MEC's on plan B's in case plan A's are not in place by the want learners to go to school.

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: On a point of order Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you Minister. What is your point of order hon Shivambu?

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: Supplementary questions are not sent to the Minister in advance and we cannot say that we cannot ask questions that specifically relate to specific schools because we ... [Inaudible] a press conference that all the schools are going to be ready. Now bringing up these challenges in the following schools, she says she cannot respond to that. She is the one who gave an assurance that there is going readiness of all the schools. Also this thing of saying that she does not know where the schools which have got challenges are spread is problematic.

The SPEAKER: Hon Floyd your point has ... [Inaudible.]

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: The supplementary questions are not sent in advance.

The SPEAKER: We know. Hon Floyd, hon Shivambu

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: Yes!

The SPEAKER: Your point is taken. The Minister acknowledges that and I think what needs to be done is - hon Thembekwayo can you please send a written question to the Minister specifically on this. Hon Shivambu, she also said that where they are not compliant, those schools will not be opened because they are subject to the same regulations that they expect everybody else to follow.

Can we then move on to the next member putting a supplementary? That person is hon Ntshayisa. I hope this time hon Ntshayisa is in the House. Is hon Ntshayisa in the House? He is not. If hon Ntshayisa is not in the House is there any other member from any other party who is able to make the next supplementary.

Mr A M SHAIK-EMAM: Thank you Chair, NFP.

The SPEAKER: The NFP?

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Yes, thank you very much Chair.

The SPEAKER: Please identify yourself and go ahead.

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Thank you very much hon Speaker, it is A M Shaik Emam, NFP. Minister, as much as you are telling us that everything is okay at the schools and you are asking the learners to go back to school, that is not the message that we are getting from many governing bodies throughout South Africa. One ideal example is the Evergreen School where they have highlighted and advised the department that they do not have the capacity, the manpower and the resources.

It appears that this thing of sending the children back to school is being pushed down the throats of people, particularly parents many of whom are opposing this. Can you tell us, have taken into consideration what the Department of Health, scientists and specialists have said in terms of social distancing with children being vulnerable to the flu as we are entering the flu season now? If they get infected with

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 59

COVID-19, we do not know what is going to happen. Do you think you are taking the right decision Minister?

The MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION: Hon Chair, we are very confident that we are taking the correct decision. We have made a case. We have explained why we have taken decisions to send children to school. In terms of social distancing, that is why we are phasing in because we do not have adequate capacity to accommodate all learners at the same time. That is why we are phasing. We are quite confident that we will be able to space.

The other two that was given to us that we have to make sure that learners or everybody must wear a mask that we have also put in place. That we can clean surfaces at all times, that children have wiped hands but to also use sanitisers, we have put that in place. We are quite confident that in terms of the guidance that not only are we getting from our own Department of Health but also experts in the area hon Shaik-Emam are saying there is no reason why we must keep children at home.

We have also said because we are dealing with the very difficult environment where people are rightfully anxious, for the first time we are allowing - sometimes not in the law saying to parents who are anxious, no one is forcing anything

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 60

down their throats. They must keep their children at home. There is no one who says bring your child to school if you are anxious. We are saying we understand that you are anxious. On the other we are your anxiety should not determine the future of other children whose parents do want them to go to school.

We are supporting you to keep your child at home, we are not forcing anything down your throat, but we are saying do not stand in the way of the children and the parents who want to come to school. Those are the parents I am speaking to. You are speaking to the parents who feel that they are being forced, advise them by saying they must keep them from school because the parents that I am speaking of and the children I am speaking to also want to come back to school. We know schools are good for children.

They are playing on the streets now, they are fine. It cannot be cold when they go to school and it is warm when they are home. It cannot be safe when they are playing in the streets and it becomes extremely unsafe when they come to schools.

The SPEAKER: Thank you Minister. The last supplementary question on this question will put by the hon D Van der Walt through virtual platform. Hon Van der Walt.

Ms D VAN DER WALT: Hon Speaker, can I go on?

The SPEAKER: Yes please.

Ms D VAN DER WALT: Hon Minister, your department is facing severe budget cuts as we know and it will of course result in severely affecting many of the projects, infrastructural projects, even those you referred to earlier today. With regards to these 3475 schools that were identified with critical water supply challenges, one would think that if you are identified as critical you would be first on the list, that it has already started to deliver the requested either borehole water to these 3475 schools. If not, what was the point of listing them as critical? By when will these schools then prioritised to get water? Will it be done by first of June?

The MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION: Indeed, the member is correct that the current challenge that we have with the virus has affected budgets. We have had to reprioritise these budgets as departments. We had to cut off many other things which are not necessarily critical or urgent so there are quite a number of areas we had to reduce. Fortunately there are other areas

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 62

which we could not implement or other programmes could not be implemented because of the problem. We did not have athletics, we did not have music. All other social projects have been brought to a halt.

Those resources have been channelled to assist ourselves and provinces to prioritise programmes which will make us COVID-19 compliant. So, how will we identify the critical schools? We have taken the Education Infrastructure Grant, EIG resources which were meant for building new schools. We are taking that money to help us supplement water as I said we have a contract with the Department of Water and Sanitation. We agreed with them on, on time delivery. We did not want to deliver water on the fourth and come back and find our tanks stolen or taken away.

What is currently happening Madam Speaker is that the Department of Water and Sanitation in provinces is busy rolling out and delivering those tanks? It was deliberate that the deliveries will only start on 25 May when we are close to opening and when there is activity in schools especially with the current violence or even distraction of our infrastructure. It would not have been wise to go into schools when it was still very quiet.

Now that there is activity from this Monday, we are rolling out infrastructure that we think is vulnerable and that process is going on even over the weekend we do expect them to have deliveries. It was deliberate not to deliver even before the 25 to protect those assets.

Question 140:

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF SPORTS, ARTS AND CULTURE: Speaker, the Legacy Trust has indicated to us that it did not receive R1 billion from the FIFA World Cup, rather they had received R450 762 816 million; and this money was paid to them in three tranches: the first amount was paid in September 2011, the second one was paid on 26 September which was twenty million and the last one was paid on 16 April 2012 and it was about one-seventy... [Inaudible.]

Now, this amount, in total, of course, it was then paid to SA Football Association, SAFA: nationally, regions and local. It was also used for bursaries, it was also paid to the local football associations and it was also used for the development through football organizations; health and education.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 64

But the details ... they have given us the full details of the breakdown and we can submit that [Inaudible.] Thank you very much.

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Deputy Minister, that does not appear to be a true account of exactly what the situation is. You know that SAFA is bankrupt; hundreds of millions of rands was spent on equipment including compressors and things, generators and other stuff that had not been accounted for; there's been no development of sports in South Africa whatsoever.

Deputy Minister, would you consider initiating an inquiry into this matter and bring in the officials and employees of SAFA to account? Leave the politicians out of it so we can see exactly where this R1 billion that was supposed to have been invested and the interest of that money was supposed to go to development in sports throughout the country.

And you will agree with me ... and that reminds me of President Zuma, whenever Bafana Bafana scored a goal he celebrated, it tells you there's no development of sports in South Africa at all.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 65

So, can we get the details and would you then consider an inquiry ... a commission of inquiry into this? Thank you.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF SPORTS, ARTS AND CULTURE: Speaker, definitely, this is public money and we have a responsibility to account; and also SAFA and the ... *fast* ... have got the responsibility to account.

So, with pleasure hon Emam, we will look at the matter and obviously, through the portfolio committee as well, in Parliament, they can look at this matter. But, if then, what is found needs a commission of inquiry, we will consider it. Thank you very much.

Mr B S MADLINGOZI: Deputy Minister, we are worried that too many sports facilities are used as soccer fields but are not properly developed and were never utilised for the Legacy Project; like the one in NY7, Gugulethu, next to Gugulethu Sports Centre Complex and the one behind the old [Inaudible.] of NY6.

What is the criteria selecting these facilities? Does the department consult the communities and what's the plan of the department about these places mentioned? Thank you.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 66

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF SPORTS, ARTS AND CULTURE: Hon Madlingozi, the stadiums that you talking about, obviously we talking about those that would have been funded by this funding from the Legacy Trust; and as you know hon Maglingozi this is an independent body which works with SAFA, it doesn't work with the department, but obviously there is a relationship between us and them in terms of giving us that report.

What we will then have to do, because I know you serve in the committee of the sports, arts and culture, we will provide you with the detail of what then has happened in provinces and in districts in terms of this Legacy Trust funding and where it was used. Thank you very much.

Mr W F FABER: Chair, am I audible? Okay.

After years of silence, SAFA Chief Executive Officer, CEO, Dennis Mumble, came clean with a damning report on Danny Jordaan, involving R80 million from the 2010 FIFA World Cup Legacy Trust Fund that was supposed to further the professional development of young people in South Africa.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 67

Previously it came to light that a 10 million dollar bribe was paid to FIFA officials by voting for South Africa to host this 2010 FIFA World Cup. The then Sport Minister, Fikile Mbalula, covered up with Mr Jordaan to say it was a donation not a bribe to Warner's Caribbean football union.

A suitcase filled with 10 000 dollar stacks of United States, US, currency was also paid to Mr Warner's son in a Paris hotel by a South African, SA, high-ranking official called co-conspirator 15 in the US Attorney-General outcome on the Federal Bureau of Investigation, FBI, investigation.

Co-conspirator 16, another SA high-ranking official, was implicated with Mr Warner junior when he was found guilty on bribery, fraud and money laundering.

My questions are: Who are these two conspirators? If you know, will you name their names or will you get it from the US Attorney-General and present it to this Parliament? And investigate this bribe paid to FIFA officials through this Diaspora Fund which was covered up by government directive, so called by Mr Mbalula.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 68

The SPEAKER: Hon Deputy Minister, I hope you got the supplementary clearer than I did.

The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY: I did not... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF SPORTS, ARTS AND CULTURE: I couldn't. I tried to listen; I couldn't get it at all.

The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY: I also did not hear.

The SPEAKER: Hon Mthembu, mute your mic. Mute your mic.

AN HON MEMBER: Mjekejeke, you're not being... [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Faber, can I ask you to repeat!

Mr W F FABER: Chairperson, the question? Who was the

The SPEAKER: Hon Faber!

Mr W F FABER: Yes, Chairperson. These two conspi...

The SPEAKER: Please repeat.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 69

Mr W F FABER: Can you hear me now, Chair? Who are these two co-conspirators in the FBI report that the US Attorney-General [Interjections.]

Mr M A TSEKI: Can hon Faber remove the mask please; we can't hear anything.

The SPEAKER: Hon Tseki, I suppose you are the one who interjected, please mute your mic.

Hon Faber, you are on the floor.

Mr W F FABER: Chairperson, I would like ... who are these two conspirators in the FBI report? And if you don't know, will you get their names from the US Attorney-General and present it to this Parliament and investigate this bribe that was paid to FIFA officials through this Diaspora Legacy Fund? Which was cover up as government directive by the then Minister of Sport, Fikile Mbalula. Did you get that?

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF SPORTS, ARTS AND CULTURE: Speaker, I could catch part of the conspirators and the inquiry but I couldn't get the whole ... I would suggest and I would ask humbly if hon Faber can probably present that question in

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 70

writing and then we can be able to respond in writing because I think it is a question that is very important but I can't hear him properly right now.

The SPEAKER: Order, members! Order! Hon Faber, there must [Interjections.]

Mr W F FABER: Chairperson, with due respect. Everyone can be heard except me, apparently, when I ask relevant questions.

The SPEAKER: Hon members! Hon Faber, it is very difficult to hear what you were saying. I would suggest that we either have it in writing or we try and get a new question from you on the same issues the next time.

Mr G G HILL-LEWIS: Speaker!

The SPEAKER: Who is addressing me? Hello?

Mr G G HILL-LEWIS: This is hon Hill-Lewis in the chamber.

The SPEAKER: Identify yourself please, hon member; and address.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 71

Mr G G HILL-LEWIS: It's Geordin Hill-Lewis.

Mr Faber's question can be summed-up in one sentence: Who is co-conspirator 15 and 16?

Maybe this microphone is clearer than his.

The SPEAKER: Order, order! Order, members! Hon Deputy Minister, did that interjection help you or should we agree that the question must be put in a different form next time?

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF SPORTS, ARTS AND CULTURE: Madam Speaker, I would humbly request that the question must be put to me next time in another form.

The SPEAKER: Yes. And that question, hon Faber ... order, members! Order! That question, hon Faber, will not lose the elements you want it to follow; all the shenanigans that the question asserts happened and the cover ups.

We move to the last supplementary, that supplementary ... no, order, members! Order!

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 72

AN HON MEMBER: Can you call bouncers in Parliament. Call bouncers for...

The SPEAKER: Will all the mics that are not supposed to be on be muted!

Ms Y P MALOMANE: Madam Speaker, to the Deputy Minister ... hello?

The SPEAKER: Hon Malomane, hold on. Hon members in the chamber! Hon members in the chamber do not disrespect the House; do not disrespect the member who is on the floor.

AN HON MEMBER: Call bouncers.

Ms Y P MALOMANE: Madam Speaker, my question to the Deputy Minister is this: Looking back with the benefit from inside, how has the contribution made to the Legacy Trust assisted in the shaping and transformation of soccer in this country?

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF SPORTS, ARTS AND CULTURE: Speaker, one of the reasons why we had agreed to host the world cup in 2010 was to make sure that we are able to have the legacy that can go as far as the rural areas that normally wouldn't benefit.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 73

If you listened to the [Inaudible.] and sixty million that I had spoken about, that was given to us by FIFA, the majority of that money has gone to the district and regional [Inaudible.] football associations to make sure that we are able to have soccer reaching out to as far as [Inaudible.]

Of course, how then the effect of that happened, depends on the members of the House to be able to do that oversight where we are so that we can be able to see and be able to say "Yes, indeed, from what we have hosted, if the benefit has been seen on the ground." But the report that we have received from the provinces and the districts and from SAFA itself, the hosting has actually helped to make sure that we had ... the legacy has moved to as far away to [Inaudible.] Thank you very much, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Deputy Minister, towards the end you were breaking so I hope that the members heard you. Thank you, Deputy Minister.

Question 121:

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you, Madam Speaker. Question 121 put by hon Gela, he asked about what are the factors

determining and the reasons for specifically declaring parts of the country as centres of Covid-19 infections and what work has been done by the department in relation to containment strategies. The first response is that these determining factors will be as follows: any geographic area which has recorded five or more positive cases per 100 000 population during a period under consideration is labelled as epistemological hotspot. This is informed by the weekly rate of change in the percent active positive cases per 100 000 population per geographic area.

Secondly, epistemological hotspots may occur because of importation of the Covid-19 virus into geographic areas or due to community transmission.

Thirdly, epistemological hotspots require that monitoring of the number of actual cases is undertaken and not only just the proportion of infections per population.

Fourthly, epistemological hotspot may include a ward, a sub-district or a cluster of wards, a district and or a metropolitan region. On the wake of the 16 to 22 May 2020, the following districts and metropolitan municipalities had five or more active positive cases per 100 000 population.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 75

The City of Cape Town in metropolitan municipality in Western Cape, 117,2 cases per 100 000, Buffalo City in the Eastern Cape at 43,5 cases per 100 000 population, Nelson Mandela Bay Municipality in the Eastern Cape, at 26,1 cases per 100 000, Cape Winelands District Municipality in the Western Cape at 22,2 cases per 100 000, iLembe in KwaZulu-Natal, 21,3 cases per 100 000 and in Chris Hani District Municipality in the Eastern Cape at 13,6 cases per 100 000. Ekurhuleni Metropolitan Municipality at 13,2 cases per 100 000, eThekweni Metropolitan Municipality at 12,1 cases per 100 000, West Coast District Municipality in the Western Cape at 10,6 and Overberg District in the Western Cape at 9. At Garden roads District in Western Cape at 5,4, City of Johannesburg in Gauteng at 5,3, Oliver Tambo at 5 per cases per 100 000 and Mangaung at 5 as well.

In some of the hotspots, cluster outbreaks have been identified and these have occurred in the agri-processing factories, supermarkets and farms and other processing areas.

With regard to the second question, work has been done by this department in relation to the containment strategies to address the exponential rise in the Covid-19 in specified

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 76

areas. The department is undertaking active surveillance in the epistemological hotspots through spatial monitoring action rate from screening and testing people by scanning up scale testing. Of course, as they test, the test will become available. Testing in healthcare facilities increased in other areas where we are investigating outbreaks. We have priorities them. Quarantine facilities have also been mobilised or people under investigation.

Provinces have been urged to continue identify quarantine sites, accommodate positive patients or contacts so that anyone who is not in a position for self quarantine. Each province have established tracing teams and full time teams of experience personnel including epistemologist, family practitioners, nurses and community health workers, laboratory and public health experts. Emergency Medical Service, EMS, has been dispersed to the epistemological hotspots. This will be supported by the Cuban in national department, experts and also those from the military health services and Institute for National Institute for Communicable Diseases, NICD, and the National National Health Laboratory Service, NHLs. The Partner Institutional Viability Assessment, Piva, clinics has also been established to ensure that the stringing of visits in health facilities and system have been put in place to manage

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 77

staff exposed to infections include the availability of the personal protective equipment, PPE. Thank you very much.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister. We allowed you to take a little bit longer because you also dealt with ...

Ms A GELA: Thank you Madam Speaker. Minister, over the weekend we saw the deployment of Cuban doctors to one of the hotspot province, the Western Cape. How will the work of the Cuban doctors strengthen the health response in the province to ensure the epidemic is contained and for us to start seeing a reduction in the higher numbers of positive cases, particularly in the Western Cape? I thank you, Madam Speaker.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you. Madam Speaker, indeed we are very grateful for the support of the Cuban doctors who have come all the way from Cuba. We have almost 217 of them who have joined us in South Africa to give us reinforcement. Over the weekend, they were distributed to all the provinces. Indeed there is a group of 28 who have been dispatched to the Western Cape. I must say that they have been highly warmly received. You will see in some of the photos where the staff and the MECs were actually receiving them. They are coming to reinforce the work that has been in the Western Cape.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 78

I must say this team in the Western Cape, they are doing their best to try and contain in fact the outbreak of the infection. Therefore, they will be focussing on the public health side focussing on sub districts and the metro in the Western Cape.

Cape Town has been subdivided into about 8 zones where they will be getting teams focussing into a catchments area of a cluster of wards. So, these teams are already in place. Right now, they have been deployed to go into the pildo hospital so that they can assist in the management of the patients who have already been tried and are being put aside for the treatment of Covid-19.

We remain very grateful for the support. We also are very pleased to see that they are seamlessly integrated to the teams in the Western Cape. A lot of work is going on in the Western Cape. We are giving lot of support and reinforcement because South Africa has to contain the pandemic in the Western Cape. We must succeed everywhere else. We need to stop the rapid increase in the Western Cape so that we can use the experience to go to other parts of the country. Thank you.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 79

Ms M E SUKERS: Thank you, Speaker. Hon Minister, dealing with inequity in hospitals services across the health platform, our poorer crowded areas is going to be hardest hit and overwhelm the drainage hospitals. How will we ensure that a sick person or sick patient needing a bed will get a bed regardless of where they live? Is there a standard decision making tool that all clinicians will use to decide which patient what level of care and how will those decisions need change as resources add more stress?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker. Let me indicates indeed that there are constraints in our health systems but that the President has announced additional resources to assist us to augment the additional needs that we have decided upon.

So, every province is now increasing the number of beds putting up field hospitals in stadiums, in exhibition centres and also putting up old facilities that are being renovated. So, additional beds are being made available. We have had additional human resources being employed.

So, in the case of the Western Cape, they have employed over 800 nurses in the past two weeks and the Eastern Cape has done

the same, just under a thousand nurses because we see the need.

We have also made a call to say the doctors who are unemployed who are registered with the Health Professions Council of South Africa should come forward so that we can increase our human resources.

So, we want to guarantee that every one will receive care on the basis of need not on the basis of means. As we go along, we will make sure that everyone follows the protocols, the Ministerial Advisory Committee together with the specialist team and the clinical society of the department are looking at all the protocols that will determine what treatment each person get not as to whether anybody will be judged on basis of whether they can afford or not afford. It will not be possible to deny anyone any assistance just because they are poor. That we will make sure does not happen. Thank you very much.

Question 121 (cont):

Mr N L S KWANKWA: Speaker, I think the key issue here Minister is being able to juggle resources for different regional peaks

UNREVISED HANSARD
NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 81

in the infection rate so that we are able to respond appropriately but the problem, Minister ...

IsiXhosa:

... mandiyibeke kakuhle ngesiXhosa kuba ndithetha nabantu baseMpuma Koloni kulo mxholo. Kukho amaphondo afana neMpuma Koloni apho umntu xa ethe wavavanywa kwabhaqwa ukuba unale ntsholongwane ufumanisa ukuba ...

English:

... is almost like a death sentence. That is what we are going to have to change in the system.

IsiXhosa:

Yintoni ekufuneka uyenzile kuba ...

English: ... other people go and test and as soon as they are quarantined in health care facilities ...

IsiXhosa:

... ufumanisa ukuba bagcinwa nje benziwe amakheswa bade bazifele apho kuba kungekho ...

English:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 82

... health care workers that want to serve them. There are many of those instances, even yesterday; I was on the call about a different case in King William's Town, which happened along the lines of what happened to my aunt.

IsiXhosa:

Isebe lakho liza kwenza njani ukuqinisekisa ukuba xa abantu bathe bafunyaniswa benentsholongwane kwezi ndawo zonyango bangazithathi ngokungathi bagwetyelwe ukufa baphele besifa abantu. Mphathiswa, nceda yithethe le nto yalo mhlonyane kwaye kuyafuneka ukuba siyithethe ngendlela eyiyo, singayiwangazelisi, umhlonyane uyasebenza ekulweni umkhuhlane. Nalapha eNtshona Koloni kukhona umntu obenale ntsholongwane egcinwe e...

English:

... Lagoon Beach Hotel, which is a health care facility for the province here ...

IsiXhosa:

... othe wasebenzisa umhlonyane kangantsukwana nje ezintandathu ukuya kwisixhenkxe emva koko intsholongwane yanyamalala. Loo nto ithetha ukuba kufuneka uqwalaselwe lo

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 83

mhlonyane ukuba uyasebenza kusini na ukuze singazisokolisi ngokufunana namachiza asentshona sinawo awethu.

English:

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, I am not sure whether you got everything that the hon Kwankwa was putting to you.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: I didn't get everything, but I have got some semblance of the issue he was raising. I can respond to them but if hon Kwankwa is not satisfied he can send the question in writing but to the things I have heard, I think I can comment.

The SPEAKER: Yes, because ... [Inaudible.] ... he kept on breaking so please proceed. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: The first issue, Madam Speaker, relates to the challenges of resources in various provinces with regional inequities. Those are realities that we accept and concede to. We will seek to support any part of the country where there is a district where we can see that it needs additional assistance. We are in daily contact with all the provinces, the MECs and the heads of departments to make

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 84

sure that when we pick up any shortages in our own system, we intervene to get them to be assisted.

A few weeks back I landed in the Eastern Cape and realised some of the challenges with the protective personal protective equipment, PPEs. I actually stepped out to get an immediate reinforcement of additional PPEs to support the MEC whilst she had indicated their constraints in the matter. We were also able to deal with the challenges that she had faced in the employment of some professionals and all of those were solved. So, what the hon member is talking about are issues that we acknowledge that they exist and when they get pointed out we really do everything to try to resolve them. The other issue relates to challenges in quarantine. Here again we have worked closely with the province to make sure they provide the adequate number of beds to quarantine a number of people who need to be quarantined.

And in that regard we do also realise a number of people who have a lot of anxiety that would not want to subject themselves to quarantine really out of anxiety and fear. I have got stories of people who had gotten into taxis, drove away to the nearest town because they did not want to be

quarantined. This is a matter of information that we need to share so that people do not fear quarantine as such.

IsiZulu:

Bese le enye-ke ayichazayo eyomhlonyane. Hhayi, ifuna ukuxoxwa nje kahle ngesintu indaba yomhlonyane ukuthi umhlonyane yikhambi elidala elikade silisebenzisa, sakhula ngalo kwathina. Ngikhula mina angizange ngiye esibhedlela.

Ngangilashwa ngoMhlonyane ... [Ubuwelewele.] ... uma kukhona uma kukhona umkhuhlane. Ngakhoke akekho ozosiphikisa ukuthi umhlonyane ukhona usizo onawo uma uphethwe umkhuhlane kodwa ukuthi umhlonyane uyaliqeda na leli gciwane le-Covid-19, i-coronavirus, cha asinabo lobo bufakazi kodwa ngeke simuphikise umuntu ozozisebenzisela umhlonyane, ngeke simuphikise umuntu ozothatha elinye ikhambi noma unsukumbili noma umunyane noma eliphi ikhambi. Uma ufisa ukulisebenzisa ulazi ukuthi liyasebenza asizukuphikisa.

Into nje engayisho ukuthi abantu abaningi abatholakala benalo igciwane le-coronavirus le baye bangabi nazo izimpawu zokugula bazithole ukuthi bayaziphilela nje bawumqemane. Noma omunye abenazo izimpawu zingabi ezisinda kakhulu kube yizimpawu nje ezilula. Mhlawumbe-ke usungathola omunye othi noma ngabe ubengezokugula abe esencoma ikhambi lakhe abekade elidla ngoba

ulidlile kodwa thina siyazi ukuthi baningi abantu abasindayo bengazange balale esibhedlela, bengazange babe nezimpawu, bengakaze bagule, noma begulile babe nezimpawu ezincane basinde.

Ngaleyondlela-ke asifuni ukuba siqophisane ngokuthi umhlonyane uyasebenza noma awusebenzi kodwa-ke sikulindele ukuthi uma kukhona ofisa ukuba sikulekelele siwucwaninge umhlonyane sizokwenza lokho. Sakhuluma nabase-Madagascar sathi nathi izandla zivuliwe uma befisa ukuthi sibalekelele ukuphenya ukuthi umhlonyane uyasebenza siyokwenza lokho. Ngakhoke, ophuza umhlonyane angawuphuza kodwa asingabi ubufakazi obuqondene ngqo. Siyavuma nje ukuthi kukhona la usebenza khona umhlonyane kodwa akuyona into esingangena kuyo ngempikiswano ezinhlelweni zezindaba ukuthi umhlonyana ufanele noma awufanele yini. Ngiyabonga.

Ms S GWARUBE: Minister ...

IsiXhosa:

... kha ukhe usincedise kancinci kuba ingathi kukhona ukubhideka okuninzi.

English:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 87

This Sunday the President announced that the country would be moving to level 3 from 1 June with the targeted focus on hotspots which happen to be most of the metros in the country. Yesterday during a presentation you made in the NCOP you stated that hotspots would not be moving to level 3 but would rather remain on level 4. This afternoon you once again ... [Inaudible.] ... back and sought to clarify by stating that hotspots will in fact remain on level 3 sighting an outdated presentation for the confusion.

It seems the Minister of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs also had outdated information because it was also in her presentation that hotspots would in fact not be moving to level 3. Now, my concern is with four days to go before 1 June many South Africans remain uncertain about what level 3 regulations will mean for them and what it will mean for their lives and their livelihoods.

Minister, is this confusion an indication of genuine incoherence in government or is this just another direct contradiction of the President? [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Gwarube, you are done?

Ms S GWARUBE: Yes Speaker, I am done. Thank you.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Hon Madam Speaker, the hon member has pointed out an issue that we have tried to correct. I think we should state categorically that at the high speed at which we are working some such errors may happen. It is not more about what the error is, more than the fact that we correct it as soon as it is pointed out.

Now, the issue of the announcement by the President stands. The whole country is moving to level 3, then the hotspots have also been identified as part as part of what we call the differentiated approach. In this manner we have identified three possibilities. The first possibility are areas which we call low-transmission areas where the transmission of the virus is recorded as less than five positive cases per 100 000 and in which case we have an approach where we say, here we have got vigilance, surveillance where we encourage behavioural change but we also ensure that those districts must identify and find cases, as soon as possible, isolate, quarantine the contacts and in the process make sure that we keep the mortality low, the case numbers low, reduce the level of the spread of the infection.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 89

Secondly, there are areas which we have called the hotspots. I have just defined what hotspots will be. It is true that yesterday that I did not say that the hotspots will remain at level 4 but the slide was actually an old slide that I do regret that it got included in the preparation for the presentation. But, having sported it, we just want to make it clear that the difference between the hotspots and the other areas is that we are putting up intensive health interventions of experts, permanent teams, that I just described in the earlier question and also ensuring that in those particular areas we keep an option where there will be additional containment measures and restrictions where necessary to reduce the rate of infection, then those will be considered. Having said therefore, I think it is important to indicate that yesterday's slide should have been corrected, and we did send a statement out to correct it.

IsiZulu:

Ngakhoke, ngiyafisa nje ukuthi sikwamukele lokho ukuthi akukho nkinga, uma kukhona ukudideka, ngiyacela ukuba sikuqondise. Kodwa ekugcineni izwelonke ... [Akuzwakali.] ... kwalokho ... [Ubuwelewele.] Kuthi kwakhona ... [Akuzwakali.] ... lapho siqinisa khona imithetho yokunciphisa ukuthi igciwane lingaqhubekeli phambili ikakhulukazi ngokufaka ochwepheshe

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 90

abazobe bengena bephuma behlezi kuleyo ndawo eyiqoqo lamawadi ekuzokwenzela ukuthi wonke umuntu akwazi ukuthola ukuthi uyabonwa. Abagulayo abanegciwane sibabeke ezibhedlela ezifanele, abahlobene nabo abathintekile sibabeke ezindaweni lapho bengeke bethelele omunye umuntu.

Bese sibheka abanye abanezinye izifo ezihambisanayo nalesi sifo ukuze bathole imishanguzo yabo besemakhaya, bangaguli, bengakhandleki ngoba bengayanga ezibhedlela. Ngakhoke lokho kuwukuqinisa uhlaka lokulwa nalesi sifo. Ngaleyo ndlela-ke, lapho-ke kukhona ukudideka siyacela ukuthi sikuqondise. Ngiyabonga.

English:

AN HON MEMBER: We should accept that there is no problem but if there is a challenge we should resolve it and over and above that there will be

The SPEAKER: Hon members, we move on to Question 194 ...

[Interjections.]

Mr N SINGH: Hon Speaker, on a point of order: I raised my hand ... members ... I would like to know if the Minister of Social Development is available to take the earlier question?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 91

[Interjections.] It would be a real pity if the only member available in the House will be unable to ask a follow-up question. Thank you.

AN HON MEMBER: I am battling ... [Inaudible.]

IsiZulu:

... angikwazi ... [Akuzwakali.] ... Angimuzwa ...

[Akuzwakali.]

English:

The SPEAKER: I said I am not ... the same question hon Singh; I have not yet been given the list ... also whether her technical problems have been sorted or not and that is why we have been moving on. We will come back to you before the end of this sitting with a response on that one.

Question 194:

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Madam Speaker, the question from the hon Gwarube is referring to the national targets of tests, 17 000 to 30 000 per day, and the response is as follows: To date, more than 596 000 tests have been conducted in South Africa during the first week of the response which was on 8 March, the average was around 35 000 tests done per week.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 92

During the past four weeks, the average number of tests done per day has increased to 15 756. While there is a need for increased testing, the current laboratory capacity is constrained by global demand for tests kits which has resulted in shortages in South Africa, especially in the extraction kits.

In addition, the lack of aircraft movements - that is aircrafts that are allowed to fly out of countries which are manufacturers of these kits means that the supply can be erratic. As more kits become more available in a consistent manner, the number of tests done per day will increase because we have capacity to be able to do as much as the targets that were set.

In addition, as soon as serological antibody detection tests are validated and approved by SA Health Products Regulatory Authority, Sahpra, these tests can then be used to assess prevalence of the virus, that is the number of people who are infected at some point and now they carry antibodies.

Currently, the SA Health Products Regulatory Authority has licensed an additional 20 polymerase chain reaction, PCR, test kits, that is in the past two weeks. It is the fastest ever

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 93

number of approvals that they have done and that is because they wanted to make sure that we get as much access as possible. Those tests are now awaiting validation and therefore that is where the delay is in increasing them. With regard to the others that are already validated, the delays are caused by the global shortage which I have referred to above.

SA Health Products Regulatory Authority has also licensed another 6 tests, which are serological antibody tests; they are also waiting for validation. In total, Sahpra has examined almost 50 products at a really high rate - at a fast pace, in order to ensure that we have adequate supply of diagnostic kits. We have actually attached a table, hon Madam Speaker, which will be send to the members, just to indicate that we are not far from the target. These are 24-hour numbers - tests that were conducted in a single day. On 19 May we did 18 000 tests; on 20 May we did 18 726 tests; on 21 May we did 17 458; on the 22 May, 21 000 tests; on 23 May, 19 000 tests and on 26 May we did 21 000. Figures that will be released today will also show a much higher figure. This is also to indicate that we have done everything that was necessary to increase the numbers of tests based on the targets that we have set. Thank you very much hon Madam Speaker.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 94

Ms S GWARUBE: Madam Speaker, I am glad Minister that we are exploring alternative means to be able to ramp up our tests over and above what we have targeted. And I agree with you that we have seen a steady increase but experts in the field, Minister, including the World Health Organization, WHO, has made it clear that testing, tracking and tracing is a crucial element to the fight against Covid-19. Delays in obtaining tests results hampers the health system's ability to be able to track, trace and isolate those who need it and to help those who need medical attention quite quickly.

As you know, a typical example of somebody who test for Covid-19 and lives in a house where it is impossible to isolate, if it takes that person a week to get their test results back, it means that they could very well be infecting others during that period. Considering that there are international challenges which we have referred to, which are over and above what you are able to do, it means that we have to think and be very careful about what cluster outbreaks have been doing in this country. We saw right at the beginning of this outbreak what happened in the Free State. On what health basis was the resumption of the religious gatherings made, considering what we know about cluster outbreaks and what they can do?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: May I ask the hon member not to repeat the whole question, but just the last part of the question because that is the part I didn't get. I got most of what she was saying. Can she repeat the question that starts with, "On what basis ..."

Ms S GWARUBE: On what basis have we made the decision to resume with religious gatherings, considering what we know about cluster outbreaks in provinces when it comes to Covid-19?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you hon member. Indeed what the hon member has stated is true that the WHO has insisted that we need to find or identify and test people who are positive and put them in isolation and make sure that all those who came into contact with them can be quarantined. Delays in this case affect the issue of early management but let me say that what we have discussed with various provinces, particularly the Western Cape - because of some of the challenges we encountered where there are certain constraints - is that we need to balance between a PCR test and a clinical diagnosis so that we are able to manage without necessarily being constrained by the availability of test results.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 96

I think that there is another issue that is going to become important as we move into the future. In most of the cases, the diagnosis as to whether the person has Covid-19 or not is a clinical decision that the doctor should confirm. We are going through the guidelines in order to improve them so that the delays in the tests will not compromise the treatment of the individual or even the ability to contain the infection - so we are looking at that issue.

Now, the question with regard to churches and the concession for opening them is based on the fact that when the first case of Covid-19 was diagnosed, we were asked that there should be a reduction of a number of people at gatherings and we put up a number of containment measures. In this case we have said that with regard to churches, there should not be more than 50 people gathering and also at funerals there should also be not more than 50 people gathering. Over the past few weeks, there was everything happening with the lockdown. Once we start resumption of activities, we need to understand that there is a problem with economic activities that have to be resumed. There are also issues regarding resumption of social activities which are very critical for some of the people's lives, particularly the aspect of spiritual ministry in areas

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 97

of supporting people spiritually and psychological counselling - these are very important.

Moving forward, we need to understand that we will be having this Covid-19 for the next year or two, therefore it would be impossible to say that there would be no religious activity allowed. In the course of all of this, we have protocols that are now being developed based on the co-operation and consultation with the religious leaders where they will be party in ensuring that the behavioural changes are improved.

If you compare that with the situation that arose in the Western Cape where we had a problem and it was found that, about 25 people were tested positive for Covid-19 in supermarkets and in another supermarket, about 30 to 40 people tested positive. The key issue is more about how we can bring in the culture of containment of social distancing, wearing masking, and so on. This is what I think we should focus on - for example, we should ensure that at the funerals people are aware of what they need to do to avoid being infected and even in churches - that should be the case.

In a number of areas we have mines where hundreds and hundreds of miners are being allowed to go back to work. We cannot say

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 98

it is difficult to allow 50 people to attend a church or a synagogue while it is possible to allow 2000 people into a mine. I think that balance is needed; we need to understand that there is a degree of fairness in trying to balance the social and economic issues. Thank you.

Ms N N CHIRWA: Minister, in the UK, race-based statistics were able to bring to the fore that black people were four times more likely to die from coronavirus than white people. And in the US, race-based statistics were able to expose the divide when it comes to access to health care. In Canada, race-based statistics were used to pre-empt and predict hotspots.

Unfortunately we have not received such a breakdown of ...

[Inaudible.]. Can the Minister please kindly give us the numbers? We want the racial breakdown as it is just as important as the geographic and age breakdown. We want the racial breakdown of how many black people are infected and how many have died; and how many white people are infected with corona virus and how many have died. Thank you.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you very much ... I am sorry about that interruption. Let me say that the issue of the spread of Covid-19 is a lot more about the social conditions under which people live, for example if there is social

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 99

distancing; if people are wearing masks and so on. Those issues are critical in as far as the spread of coronavirus infection is concerned. If you look all over the world, there is no country now that has not suffered the Covid-19 infections. Actually, 213 countries have coronavirus infection. In all of these countries the infection goes to literally everyone, irrespective of the racial composition of that particular country. What we have seen as being factors that are important is more of the question of comorbidities and is also access to quality health services. Therefore where there is inequality ... [Inaudible.]

Ms N N CHIRWA: My question was simple, we want numbers. How many black people has been infected and how many have died ...

The SPEAKER: No, hon Chirwa, you want a ...

Ms N N CHIRWA: This was done with HIV; it is done with TB; it is done with other illnesses. Why not with coronavirus ...

The SPEAKER: Your microphone will be muted because you have put a question - a question which in fact is being attended to, and you interrupt the response to your own question. That is out of order. Minister, may you please conclude.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 100

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: So, the issue of quality of health services and equitable access is a big factor in this coronavirus infection and other diseases. In the case of the US and the UK, it is linked to black people suffering most - many of them being part of the high rate of mortality. It is largely linked to the fact that their living conditions and their access to health care is compromised. Therefore, in any country where people have a problem of inequality, that will become a factor. We haven't conducted all these tests based on racial terms when this infection started. We never put any racial tags on it; we will not put it either this week. However, we do recognise that the issues of inequality, poverty, unemployment, comorbidities, other infectious diseases - all of those multiple factors that affect people, particularly when it comes to those who are in overcrowded areas among which most black people in this country fall under are crucial. At the end of the day, the pattern of morbidity would not be necessarily different from other countries, but at the moment we haven't put up all those figures based on racial classification.

At the end of the day, the issue is that there are many factors that are important and a lot of them would affect

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 101

black people as well. We have a lot of factors that we have taken into account. As we approach management of these diseases, we are taking all of that into account. Those who are poor; those who have challenges; those areas which have a rapid spread of the infection; those who have challenges with access to health services would be identified and would be supported to make sure that their conditions do not translate to poor access to health services.

Question 194 (contd):

The SPEAKER: Thank you Minister. Minister, the third supplementary...

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: ...on a point of order, on a point of order...

The SPEAKER: ... will be put to you by the hon Singh...

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: ... on a point of order...

The SPEAKER: ... but on a point of order your hon Floyd, what's your point of order?

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: Yes...we have raised ... the Minister has been giving statistics in terms of the age and the areas where

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 102

the people have been infected by the coronavirus. What is difficult with giving us the racial composition, so that we can ...

The SPEAKER: ...hon Floyd...

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: ...get a clear proper analysis? We have written a letter...

The SPEAKER: ... hon Floyd...

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: ... to him and he has not responded...

The SPEAKER: ... your point is not sustained, please...

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: ... can we be given a clear response of how many black people ...

The SPEAKER: ...hon Floyd, your point is not sustained...

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: ... and how many white people have been ill and [Inaudible.] ... the results ...

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 103

The SPEAKER: ... I have ruled on this question, that mic must be muted now ...

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: ...is simple question ...

The SPEAKER: ... hon Floyd, hon Chirwa the question was put, the Minister has responded to this question, he has actually said towards the end of his response, that, they did not necessarily look at the numbers which will distinguish the infections from black and white. If you want those numbers, ask Health Minister to come back to you on a specific racially differentiated infection rates ...

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: ...we have done so...

The SPEAKER: ... [Inaudible.] ... who are ruled out of order and that mic of yours will be muted, hon Floyd. Can we proceed ...

The MINISTER OF HEALTH ...can I come in...

The SPEAKER: ... [Inaudible.] ... matter, please and the hon Singh is on the floor.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 104

Mr N SINGH: Thank you, hon Speaker...

Dr N Q NDLOZI: ...eh, eh, Speaker, on a point of order...

Mr N SINGH: ... let me...

Ms H O MKHALPHI: ...Speaker ...

The SPEAKER: ... no I am not taking any other point of order on the last supplementary, I am very sorry ...

Dr M Q NDLOZI: ...Speaker, you will like be explained ... [Inaudible.]...

The SPEAKER: ... I am not taking any other supplementary on this one...

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: ... Madam Speaker, may I explain something, Madam Speaker ...

Ms H O MKHALPHI: ...Madam Speaker, you ... [Inaudible.]

...make sure that members got answers; you can't just shut us down like that...

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 105

The SPEAKER: ...because the answers we given hon Mkhaliphi, the Minister specifically states...no, no point of order is not sustained hon Ndlozi, I am on the floor...

Dr M Q NDLOZI: ... you have to hear it first before you dismissed it, Speaker...

The SPEAKER: ... no, let me finish what I am saying; you can not interject when saying...I am on the chair.

Dr M Q NDLOZI: Ok Chair ...

The SPEAKER: Hon Mkhaliphi ...

Dr M Q NDLOZI: ... can you please recognise me?

The SPEAKER: ... hon Mkhaliphi, I did not sustain the question, the point of order of hon Floyd ...[Inaudible.] ... because that response was given, he was simply adding onto what the hon Chirwa - who did not wait even wait until the end of the response to her supplementary question was made. So, I do not want to entertain any other supplementary question on a supplementary question, because that will be out order. Hon Minister, I don't know what you want to say, but am closing

this, I want to go the next supplementary question and that is the hon Singh.

Ms H O MKHALPHI: Speaker, what is the use of this...

Dr M Q NDLOZI: ... Speaker...

Ms H O MKHALPHI: ... [Inaudible.] ...if you not are going to allow members to ask the executive?

The SPEAKER ... because hon Mkhalihi, the rules governing the question sessions apply, whether you are in Covid-19 situation, in the House, virtual or whatever. You allow a response to be given, if you are not happy with that response, there are other ways of dealing with it, and you do not howl the Minister, you do not bombard the Minister, you allow that to happen. Hon Ndlozi, you said you have a point of order; I will listen to you now.

Dr M Q NDLOZI: Thanks Speaker, you see it is this attitude that made you to be complicity when Marikana massacre was occurring - of refusing to press out, proper information from those in authority ...

UNREVISED HANSARD
NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 107

Siswati:

LILUNGA LELIHLON...hhayi suka...

AN HON MEMBER: ...on a point of order, point of order Speaker, Speaker, Speaker on a point of order...

Dr M Q NDLOZI: ... [Inaudible.] ... if you can give statistics of race on Tuberculosis, TB, Immunodeficiency Virus, HIV ...

AN HON MEMBER: ... Speaker on a point of order...

Dr M Q NDLOZI: ... why are you not giving statistics of race when comes to Covid - 19?

HON MEMBERS: ... [Inaudible.]...

The SPEAKER ... hon Ndlozi...

AN HON MEMBER...hey, on a point of order...

Dr M Q NDLOZI: ... [Inaudible.]... you people are doing now, that made you completely ...

HON MEMBERS: ... [Inaudible.]...

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 108

Dr M Q NDLOZI: ... [Inaudible.]...black people, that is what it's happening even now ...

AN HON MEMBER: ... on a point of order...

Dr M Q NDLOZI: ...that is what is even happening now; you are denying ... [Inaudible.]...recognition our people that have been killed by the virus ...

HON MEMBERS: ... [Inaudible.]...

Dr M Q NDLOZI: ... which is what happening now ...

AN HON MEMBER: ... on a point of order...

The SPEAKER ...hon Ndlozi ...

HON MEMBERS: ... [Inaudible.]...

AN HON MEMBER: ...hon Speaker ...

Dr M Q NDLOZI: ...this is the same attitude Speaker, why is the Minister, afraid ... [Inaudible.]...protecting tea ...

UNREVISED HANSARD
NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 109

HON MEMBERS: ... [Inaudible.]...

Dr M Q NDLOZI: ...like you are protecting savannah...

[Inaudible.]...

The SPEAKER: ... hon Ndlozi, you are ruled out of order, that mic is muted.

AN HON MEMBER: ... yah, mute it...

The SPEAKER: ...hon members, I was not complicity in Marikana massacre and this is not the platform to try and justify it...

AN HON MEMBER: ... exactly, huh...

The SPEAKER: I have nothing to do with Marikana massacre; the provinces have no jurisdiction at mining and therefore you cannot even drag my name into this thing. Hon Sing, you have the floor.

AN HON MEMBER: Yoh!

The SPEAKER: Hon Sing, hon Singh!

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 110

Mr N SINGH: Hon Speaker, it seems that the host has muted me as well, but I think you can hear me now. Firstly, we would like to compliment the hon Minister for the leadership that that have shown ever since Covid - 19 pandemic emerged on our shores, but having said that, he said that Covid - 19 is here for one or two years, so we are in for a long haul. I am bit concerned that reports suggest that the national health laboratories are using certain manufacturers of these test kits only and that hampers the availability to get tested here, so having said that, what are we doing to accelerate the manufacture of test kits in our own country, so that we can provide economic opportunities and employment for people ... [Inaudible.], because we have to have our own product and I understand it will take time to validate that, but what is going to be done Minister, to accelerate that process? Thank you.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Madam Speaker, I didn't want to get into the issue, but there is a separate question, that is being process which has been asked by the EFF, which is exactly the question that the hon member interposed on top of a different question. Is a separate question which is being worked on, so what they have just raised now is a two

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 111

questions, asking one question and then went to ask another question which is on a paper. The question that is raised by hon Singh - there is no favouring of a particular company, it's a matter of which company has got kits that are available, it's matter of which kits we can actually get access to. We are currently even evaluating kits that have come from Korea and Russia, we will take kits from any parts of the country as long as they can be licensed properly and they be validated so that we know what to expect out of those results. Having said so, it's an issue that is under discussion in terms of what of capacity we can get to build in the country, to be able to get our own sense of self sufficiency on various kits that are possible, so now we have to liaise with various companies to try and get them to be in South Africa to manufacture those, at the same time we are aware that they were some initiatives that we have discussed with Cabinet around what Central South African Railway, CSAR, to do, to get us to a point where we could find some kits that we can make available for ourselves. So the search for our own internal capacity will continue and we will certainly support it and we belief that the lessons from Covid - 19 has been that not only on diagnostic sets but on pharmaceutical products, on personal protection equipments, ppes, all of these we need to make sure that have got our own capacity in

the country. When we look at stocks available in the country we were shocked to discover that only 10% is manufactured inside the country, so some work now has to focus on increasing our own capacity so that should a similar situation arise in the future, we are able to sustain ourselves through our own manufacturing capacity. Thank you.

Dr S M DLOMO: Thank you very hon Speaker, the hon Minister of Health has noted that passive case finding contributes 76% of all tests conducted to date, meaning that patients who have symptoms landed themselves to health facilities for testing. Despite the global shortage of test kit, the number of tests conducted by the Department of Health is commendable; of course we note that there has also been a contribution from the public sector.

IsiZulu:

Umbuzo wami-ke Mavovo uyafana nombuzo kababa u-Singh kusho ukuthi usungawuphendula ngoMageba nje ukuthi bayazama abahlanganisayo abala eNingizimu Afrika abazakhayo lezi zizinto ozidingayo eMnyangweni Wezempilo ... [Akuzwakali.] ... nithenge ukuze sibone ngathi nomnotho wabo bandla uyasukuma nakhu sibuya nakwi-Covid. Besithi asibheke lokho, niyathenga yini nakubona noma bakhona yini abangase basilekelele kodwa

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 113

phela nilandela imigomo yawo i-World Health Organisation.

Ngiyabonga, Somlomo.

UNGQONGQOSHE WEZEMPILO: Bengiyocela ilungu elihloniphekile like liphinde lithi sithenga kobani, akubanga kusavela lokho. Okunye ngikuzwile. Uma engaphinda leyo ndawana nje.

The SPEAKER: Hon Dlomo, can you just repeat that part.

IsiZulu:

Dkt S M DLOMO: Ukuthi, bakhona yini abalana ekhaya eNingizimu Afrika nabo mhlawumbe abazakhayo lezi zinto ozidingayo emnyangweni enike nahlongoza nokuthenga nakubona kodwa phela nilandela imigomo ye-World Health Organisation ukuze nomnotho wezwe bebekwazi ukuthi basidayisele nithenge nakubona. Ngiyabonga.

UNGQONGQOSHE WEZEMPILO: Somlomo ohloniphekile, umbuzo welungu elihloniphekile uthi, sesiqalile ukubhekisisa ukuthi kulaba abakhona eNingizimu Afrika banganani abanazo lezi zinto eziyizidingo ezivela ngenxa yalo mkhuhlane we-Covid-19. uma sibala sithola ukuthi kubantu noma ezintweni ezingamaphesenti ayikhulu, yishumi kuphela elitholakalayo lwamaphesenti elitholakayo eNingizimu Afrika. Lokho-ke kusinikeza umthwalo

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 114

wokuthi sekufanele siqinise kulaba abaseNingizimu Afrika okuyibona abakhiqizayo ... [Akuzwakali.] noma izinsiza zokwenza ama-test okuhlola ema-laboratory noma labo ababheke nezimpahla zokwembatha zokwenza ukuthi kuvikeleke ukuthi igciwane lingasuleleki kulowo ohlengwayo.

Lokho kukonke kukhomba ukuthi kulaba abaseNingizimu Afrika konke abanakho sizokwazi ukuthi sikuthenge kodwa okubalulekile manje ukukhulisa izimboni zokukhiqiza kulabo ikakhulukazi abaseNingizimu Afrika, sivule futhi nethuba lokuthi mabande nabo osomabhizini abamnyama okuyibona abekade bengekho emathubeni kusosonke lesi sikhathi nabo kucace ukuthi kulo mkhankaso nabo baneghaza abalibambayo ukuthi babe nezinto abazozikhiqiza, babe nezinto esizozithenga kubo.

Okwamanje inani elikhulu lezinto esizithengayo sizithenga kubantu esibabiza ukuthi ngo-middlemen ngoba baya-supplyer kodwa bakuthatha kwamanye amazwe konke. Ngakhoke ngokunye kwezinto esizibhekile ukuthi kubekhona ukuguquka kwesimo somnotho ngokuthi babe nengxenye abamnyama nosomabhizinisi abancane yokuthi kubekhona abakwazi ukukuzuza kulolu hlelo. Ngezinye zezinto esizisebenzayo-ke kodwa sisifundise okuningi lesi sifo se-Covid ukuthi singayekeleli ukuthi likwazi ukuzenzela okuningi eliyokudinga mhla isimo sixakile ngoba

namhlanje amazwe ahluhahlukene asefuna ukuthi agodlele ngakuwona. Imishini esiyisebenzisayo yokuhlola eNingizimu Afrika ikakhulukazi iqhamuka e-Melika, manje i-Melika ivele yavala ngakhoke sigcine sisizwa ngelinye ifemu elise-Sweden. Ngakhoke sesizama ukubheka-ke ukuthi ngobani abakhona abase-China, abase-Russia, abase-Korea, kuyacaca ukuthi uma besikwazi ukuzimela ngabe namhlanje asikhali kakhulu kukhokonke esikudingayo kulesi sifo.

Ngakhoke umbuzo wakho uyiwona ukuthi kufanele sibheke ngale kwesifo sibheke ukuthi izwe liyakwazi yini ukuzinza ngokuzimela ezintweni lapho kuzoba nezidingo eziphambili uma sixakwa yizifo ezixakile njengalesi. Siyabonga.

Question 163:

The MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION: Hon House Chair, the pretender estimated for the supply and delivery and complete installation of the 5010 tanks and 41 420 taps for drinking purposes was at about R280 million. Due to the urgency of supplying water to ... [Inaudible] occasioned by COVID-19 emergency the Department of Basic Education decided to participate in the procurement arrangements between the Department of Human Settlement, Water and Sanitations and Rand Water in accordance with the Treasury instruction No 5 of

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 116

2020-21 which is read with Treasury Regulations ...

[Inaudible] as well as the Treasury Practise Note of 2007-08.

Thank you, hon House Chair.

Mr N M PAULSEN: Hon Minister, through you Chair, at schools in areas such as in Umkhanyakude District Municipality in KwaZulu-Natal tanks were delivered and were just left on the ground. There is no water in the tanks and are not installed. What is the reason for dumping these tanks and who takes responsibility for the wasting of taxpayer's money? In addition Minister, could you just tell us in terms of the price per tank so that we have an idea as to what each of these tanks cost that has been lying wasted on school grounds. What is the criterion used to identify schools that are given these tanks? Thank you very much.

The MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION: He said there is no water. Water is going to be brought by the water tankers, all we have to do in the first phase was to deliver those water tanks and install the taps. I am repeating the point that it had to be on-time delivery goods because we are going put taps and by the time we go to those schools, those taps are not there. So, the water will start being filled in over the weekend by the tankers. That is the arrangement we had at the Department of

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 117

Water Affairs. That is what I heard but the other things I did not hear.

He talked about the tanks lying there. Well, tanks arrived and have to be installed and so it is another team installing the tanks. So, if the tanks are not installed it means the team installing may not have arrived. So, you first deliver the tanks, installed them and then filled them with water. That is what I understand but I am sorry I did not get the member's question fully. It was not very clear, so I did not hear him properly.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr N L D Ntombela): Hon Paulsen, I am sure that covers your question although you were not audible enough. I think the Minister had tried her level best.

Mr N M PAULSEN: Hon House Chair, I also asked the Minister the unit cost per tank.

The MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION: Hon House Chair, the question says what is a pretender estimation for the supply, delivery and complete installation of the 5010 and I said it is R280 million. So, if you divide this it would be in the ranges of R10 000 per tank. That is the answer I can give you if he

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 118

wants now details per tank. Even the price is the overall price as it is going to be determined by the distance on how many taps will be there. But the distance also influences because a tank delivered in Gauteng will not be the same price with the tank delivered to Mhlabuyalingana. Those also determine the different pricings in terms of what it would cost us to purchase the tank.

Mr N L S KWANKWA: I am covered Chair, in the last follow up question. Thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr N L D Ntombela): I did not hear you hon Kwankwa. What did hon Kwankwa say?

Mr N L S KWANKWA: I am saying the response to the cost breakdown answered my question because that was our interest. We will follow up with another question in writing about the other details that we want when we want to say cost per unit. This is because we do not want estimates and that is the information that the Minister unfortunately cannot provide at this point in time. Am I clear?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr N L D Ntombela): Thank you hon Kwankwa, there is a complete breakdown and I cannot hear you what you are saying.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 119

Mr E K SIWELA: Hon House Chairperson, at the expected number of tanks and water taps deliveries do you Minister have an idea of what percentage has been delivered and installed in schools to date?

The MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION: Hon House Chair, as I have indicated that we have ordered 5 000 tanks with more than 43 000 taps. I am aware as I said earlier that conscious and deliberately we have said that delivery should start from the 25 and all the deliveries are on the way. So, I am going to get a reconciled final tally from the independent auditors on Friday. What I know is that some tanks have arrived, some are on their way and the reconciled figure will be available on Friday. So, if the member is so interested I will give him a reconciled figure that I am getting from MECs in our Council of Education Ministers, CEM on Friday.

Mr S N SWART: Hon House Chair, the ACDP is concerned about the allegations of corruption with COVID-19 expenditure. In this regard there have been issues surrounding the provision of water to communities. What steps is the hon Minister taking to eradicate any corruption in this tender? Will various departments of government be co-ordinating the purchase of

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 120

water tanks given that R306 million has been allocated to municipalities in the indirect regional bulk infrastructure grant to fund the roll out of water tanks to communities? One could save money if we were working together as different departments to ensure that the same amount of money is paid per tank. Thank you House Chair.

The MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION: Hon House Chair, we are equally concerned that after all these procurements which are happening at short notice because of the emergency. We do not end up with problems of procurements which have not been done properly. I was happy that we were working with the Department of Human Settlements, Water and Sanitation and provinces themselves were procuring and the Department of Human Settlements, Water and Sanitation has been procuring tanks even for us before we even ordered or joined on their tender.

The advantage of this process was to manage the cost so that we do not buy water tanks for R15 000 and somebody buys it for R10 000. The price that we are receiving is the price that has been agreed across the government. I can say it here House Chair that different provinces have made very good arrangements with their municipalities so that we are not going to be sending water from the Department of Basic

Education. Mostly, the Department of Basic Education and their municipalities have the arrangements of delivering water to the communities will include the schools to make sure that we can save costs if there is a tank going into an area to supply water and can also provide water for school. So, all those matters that the member has raised have been considered to make sure that we can manage the cost; ensure that there is no duplication but make sure that there is uniformity. More importantly this is to make sure that by the time we finish the process we do not come back with lots of difficulties about wrong procurement or corruption.

Question 122:

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: Hon House Chair, some of the municipalities have complied, but the lockdown is still continuing so we haven't done a comprehensive assessment of whether every single one of them has complied. We must also remember that there are different things: there are things that they can't have complied with because part of regulation 6.7 talks about revenue collection, and part of that revenue collection includes licensing for drivers' licences, renewals and all that.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 122

Transport is only going to open that service on 1 June, so municipalities could not have complied with that part, even though that falls under revenue collection. A lot of them would have complied, but we have not received responses from every province in terms of compliance. Most provinces have said that the municipalities have complied. Thank you.

Mr B M HADEBE: Thank you, hon Chair. Hon Minister, do you have any timeframe particularly with regard to those provinces and municipalities that have not given you a formal response, so that we ensure compliance in the implementation of regulation 6.7?

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: Hon House Chair, I can't hear the hon Hadebe.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr N L D Ntombela): Hon Hadebe ...

IsiZulu:

... ngicela uphakamise izwi kancane khona uNgqongqoshe ezokuzwa kahle bese eyakuphendula.

English:

Could you raise your voice please?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 123

Mr B M HADEBE: I will remove part of my PPE. The question, Chair, is: Given the fact that not all provinces and municipalities have submitted a formal response in terms of compliance with regulation 6.7, does the Minister have a timeframe for those municipalities and provinces so that we ensure compliance with the regulation? Thank you.

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: Does the hon member want me to speak to those who have responded? I don't know whether this is my connection ... I couldn't hear him very well.

Mr B M HADEBE: Hon Minister, in your response you indicated that there were 13 municipalities in Limpopo and two in the North West. So the question is: Do you have any timeframe in terms of ensuring that you get a response with regards to the implementation of regulation 6.7? This is so that all of us are on the same page, whether or not all municipalities across the country have been able to implement regulation 6.7.

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: I think I got the question now about whether I have timeframes for those who haven't responded. Well, we will give them another week to respond, but, as I said, the majority of

them have responded and have said that they have mainly complied.

Mr C BRINK: Thank you, Chair. If the Minister can't hear this I am willing to repeat it. Regulation 6.7.1 of the Disaster Response Directions refers to the legislative functions that municipalities have to continue fulfilling during lockdown, in particular, revenue collection is mentioned. From presentations by the SA Local Government Association and some of the metros, it is evident that municipalities suffered a collapse in revenue collection during the first month of lockdown.

The question is: Did the Minister, or the Command Council, take into account the inability of businesses to pay municipal rates before deciding on the government's lockdown strategy and, in particular, before deciding to promulgate the restrictions that apply under Level 4 lockdown? Thank you.

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: Thank you very much. First of all, I think we must all remember that the lockdown was not something that was planned in that there would have been plans for the lockdown, because the lockdown was occasioned by the fast rate of infection. You would have heard the Minister - not, maybe

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 125

today, but some other time - saying before the lockdown that our figures were doubling between two days and three days - the numbers were doubling. So, that occasioned the lockdown, and there was no time to plan for all these things in terms of what would happen if lockdown were to happen. This was really about trying to make sure that we were not overwhelmed by the infection when our health services were not quite ready. But we have acknowledged that the municipalities are not going to be able to collect revenue as they would have done had there been no pandemic. This is because it is not just the lockdown, but also the fact that everyone ... I mean, even some of the malls were saying that they were not able to pay because some of their tenants were not working. So we have acknowledged that municipalities are not going to be able to pay or to collect sufficient revenue. Also, even people who have not been at work will probably not be able to ... [Inaudible.] ... for electricity ... [Inaudible.] ... they were not working. It is for that reason, for instance, that we went to government and pleaded that there should be some way of looking at municipalities in the package that the President was going to announce, and then he announced that.

Mr S N SWART: Thank you, House Chair. Arising from your response, hon Minister, the Auditor-General has revealed the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 126

shocking state of municipalities and the regression in financial reporting, with only 18 municipalities producing quality financial statements and performance reports, as well as complying with all key legislation. And, whilst we are speaking about compliance, given that the National Treasury will be making more than R20 billion available to municipalities to assist them in responding to the Covid-19 crisis, what steps, hon Minister, will you take to ensure that procurement irregularities in Covid-19 expenditure do not take place in municipalities; and would the hon Minister support real-time auditing in emergency procurements, given the huge amount involved: R20 billion? Thank you, House Chair.

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: That question ... the member is asking a new question, which is still coming. It's part of the questions that are being asked today. So, I don't know whether I should answer it now or whether I'm still going to answer that question.

Mr S N SWART: House Chair, may I ask the Minister to answer it, because, as I see it, we have run out of time? We've just run out of time.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 127

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr N L D Ntombela): Okay, hon member. You can, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: Basically ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr N L D Ntombela): Hon Minister, are you still there?

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: Yes, I am here, Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr N L D Ntombela): I was saying that you can take the opportunity to shed light if you can.

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: Okay. I was saying that we are working with Treasury on the matter of the R20 billion, because we haven't got the R20 billion, but we are also worried that since the financial controls in the municipalities don't seem to be up to scratch. We are working with Treasury to see if we can put in some checks and balances about how this money should be spent, but, at the same time, we have met with the Auditor-General. And, in terms of the question that I said was coming - whether we

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 128

would be willing to work with the Auditor-General to do real-time auditing - of course we would be willing to do real-time auditing. That would be great. So, if he could help us, we would be willing to work with him and to talk to Salga and to the municipalities in that they should do real-time auditing on those funds. Thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr N L D Ntombela): Thank you very much, hon Minister. Hon members, the time allocated to questions has expired, and the outstanding replies received will be printed in Hansard.

Mr N SINGH: Hon Chairperson ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr N L D Ntombela): Could you please allow me to make ... Hon Singh?

Mr N SINGH: I think there is one more follow-up question from the EFF, if I am not mistaken.

Mr K CEZA: Yes, there is a follow-up question, Chairperson.

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: [Inaudible.] ... last supplementary question from the hon Ceza. Sorry about that.

Mr K CEZA: Thank you very much, Chairperson. My question relates to municipalities, Minister, such as Amahlathi in the Eastern Cape where they cannot pay workers, let alone services ... [Inaudible.] ... are lagging behind in terms of revenue collection, yet you find big businesses that owe municipalities and nothing is done by your department. What urgent plans does the department have in place to propel municipalities to adequately collect revenue from businesses and private corporations for necessary services provided by the municipalities?

Also, what plans do you have for the people who have lost their jobs as a result of Covid-19, and for the people who are not able to pay for services? Thank you very much.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr N L D Ntombela): Thank you, hon Ceza. Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: Firstly, I don't think that follow-up question arises from my question. Secondly, it has to be the whole of government that looks at ... [Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 130

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: Answer, Minister, please. Could you answer the question ... [Inaudible.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr N L D Ntombela): Hon MkhaliPhi ... [Interjections.] Hon MkhaliPhi, could you give the Minister a chance to reply before you object? [Interjections.] Go on ...

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: ... [Inaudible.] ... must not say that is a new question. She must answer the question that has been posed to her ... [Inaudible.] [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr N L D Ntombela): [Inaudible.] ... it's not your fault. The hon Minister is answering. Could you please give her a chance?

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: [Inaudible.] ... and stop protecting the Minister, Chairperson. Just facilitate. You must know your job as well. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr N L D Ntombela): [Inaudible.] ... at the moment the Minister should answer, so do not disturb her, hon MkhaliPhi. Hon Minister, could you continue?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 131

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: Thank you, House Chair. I was saying that the questions that are being asked are questions that relate to government as a whole, not to the department. First of all, the department is working with the President in the committee that is looking at some of the issues around the payment of ... [Inaudible.] ... either by municipalities to Eskom or by departments that owe municipalities.

But the hon member knows that there is no law that gives me the power to force businesses to pay municipalities. If I had, I would have used it already. So it has to work with other departments to see what can be done. It's not for the department only.

Secondly, your hon member - as he is asking this question - knows that there is not one department like Cogta that can make provisions for people who have lost their jobs. We know that the government has announced a package. Some of the people must apply to UIF ... There is a whole package ... some through Social Development. So, Cogta cannot singlehandedly deal with those things. We deal with them through the other relevant departments. But, clearly, what we need to do as Cogta is to ensure that the government works through the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 132

district development model ... [Inaudible.] ... now as we deal with Covid-19 so that we know and that work is done in every district, both in terms of service delivery and in terms of ... That's why, for instance, with Water Affairs we know what has happened in a district. Also ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr N L D Ntombela): Thank you ...

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: Also, government has taken a decision ... Oh, I must stop. Okay.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr N L D Ntombela): Okay. [Inaudible.] Thank you very much, hon Minister. I think you've tried your best to answer that question. Hon Minister, thank you so much. Hon members, the time allocated for questions has expired and that the outstanding replies received will be printed in Hansard.

However, I need to make an announcement. I need to make an announcement ...

Mr N SINGH: You have been disturbed by somebody, Chairperson. Who is this?

UNREVISED HANSARD
NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
WEDNESDAY, 27 MAY 2020

Page: 133

[Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr N L D Ntombela): Hon members, what is the problem? Time is up. The meeting is adjourned. Thank you.

The House adjourned at 18:19.

UNREVISED HANSARD