

UNREVISED HANSARD
NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 1

THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

PROCEEDINGS OF THE NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

The House met at 14:02.

The Deputy Speaker took the Chair and requested members to observe a moment of silence for prayer or meditation.

EXTENTION OF DEADLINE

(Draft Resolution)

Dr M C C PILANE-MAJAKE: Deputy Speaker, I move the draft resolution printed on the Order Paper in the name of the Chief Whip of the Majority Party, as follows:

That the House extends the deadline by which the *Ad Hoc Committee to initiate and introduce legislation amending section 25 of the Constitution* has to complete its task to 29 May 2020.

UNREVISED HANSARD
NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 2

Motion agreed to.

REVIVIFICATION OF THE AQUACULTURE DEVELOPMENT BILL

(Draft Resolution)

Dr M C C PILANE-MAJAKE: Deputy Speaker, I move the draft resolution printed on the Order Paper in the name of the Chief Whip of the Majority Party, as follows:

That the House revives the Aquaculture Development Bill and resumes proceedings on the Bill from the stage it reached on the last day of the sixth session of the Fifth Parliament.

Motion agreed to.

**THE CORONAVIRUS AND THE READINESS OF SOUTH AFRICA TO DEAL WITH
THE PANDEMIC**

Ms S GWARUBE: Deputy Speaker, panic has set across the world as the Covid-19 virus continues to wreak havoc in countries with some of the strongest health systems. The coronavirus has

UNREVISED HANSARD
NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 3

led to the near collapse of global markets which have suffered losses akin to the 2008 global financial crisis. It is clear that the world is gripped with fear as 81 countries have confirmed cases of those infected by the epidemic.

To date, over 3 000 deaths have been reported worldwide and over 95 000 infections. As of this afternoon, it has been confirmed by the National Institute of Communicable Diseases, NICD, that the first case of the coronavirus has been confirmed in the country.

Countries have gone into crisis a mode, imposed travel bans and enforced quarantine measures as they try to valiantly contain this virus. The disease attacks countries across the globe; therefore, we must understand the inherent weaknesses of the South African health system. We should never unjustifiably spread fear, however, we should prepare for the worst.

We know the state of our health care outside an epidemic outbreak. It is therefore not unreasonable to question our abilities in the absence of concrete plans to deal with a

UNREVISED HANSARD
NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 4

potential public health crisis. This is why the DA called for this debate of national importance.

Deputy Speaker, Parliament needs to assert itself as the main legislative arm of the state. We need to understand the role bestowed to us by the Constitution and take it seriously. In the midst of an epidemic that has been declared by the World Health Organisation, WHO, plans to deal with this matter should be tabled in this House for scrutiny, discussion and adoption.

It is important that when the President convenes an interministerial task team that decides to repatriate over 150 South Africans from Wuhan, China; the decision is tabled, scrutinized and adopted by Parliament.

It does not bode down well for the function of this House, which is enshrined in the Constitution, that issues of national significance are discussed in the press before the oversight arm has had an opportunity to engage these plans.

The fact that the President notified Parliament of the government's intention after the story was published

UNREVISED HANSARD
NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 5

undermines accountability and oversight. [Applause.] With that being said, this is not the time for executive arrogance. It is also not the time for decisions which are bound to affect 57 million people to be made under the veil of secrecy. It is, however, time for united and decisive leadership. If we get this wrong, there will be preventable loss of lives.

Deputy Speaker, there comes a time in any country where politics have to set aside politics for the benefit of all our citizens. [Applause.] That time is now. The coronavirus is a public health emergency that has the potential infect and kill thousands should the correct measures to screen, prevent, isolate and treat be inadequate. That is why the South African government should use this opportunity to take the nation into its confidence and table the plans here, today.

As a priority, the Minister of Health, Dr Mkhize, needs to appraise this House on the measures that his department has already started to take to screen, test and possibly isolate and treat cases, particularly at every airport, harbour and border post.

UNREVISED HANSARD
NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 6

We no longer can afford to just target certain areas. As the disease spreads rapidly across the globe, people that are at risk are no longer just coming from certain parts of the world. There are now eight confirmed cases on the African continent which emanates from various parts of the world.

We need assurance that sufficient resources have been allocated to conduct this mammoth task. We also need to ensure that our health care workers are supported during this strenuous time.

We extend our deepest gratitude to all health care workers for the work that they continue to do at every point that they are stationed at. [Applause.] A country is only as resilient as its workforce.

The DA will certainly be undertaking numerous oversight visits across the country to ensure that the protocols that have been developed and tabled in this House are being implemented.

Minister Mkhize, much to your frustration sir, the members of this House across all party political lines have a role to play. We have a responsibility to the people of South Africa.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 7

The health care facilities which have been identified as centres of treatment for this epidemic should be revised as the risk has increased exponentially. As an example, Tembisa Hospital, which saw the death of 10 babies due a hospital acquired infection, should not be part of that list.

Deputy Speaker, there is no room for errors. An epidemic of this magnitude requires planning and precise execution. That is why the DA is calling for a revision of the facilities which have been selected for this purpose based on capacity of each and every health facility.

Dealing with the coronavirus transcends the Department of Health. It requires a whole society approach. That is why we are also calling upon the public and private sector to collaborate on efforts to curtail the spread of this epidemic.

There will come a time where extra capacity is needed, whether it be in laboratories; isolation treatment facilities or long-term resilience strategies; every player in this field must report for duty.

UNREVISED HANSARD
NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 8

The entire South African government needs to construct plans on how they would deal with knock-on effects of an outbreak of this kind. Local transport routes, major events and the ability to attain certain medical supplies in places in the world that have shut down are just some of the elements which need and require urgent attention.

This past week, it was announced that 150 South Africans are coming home. A mission of this magnitude and a decision has far-reaching consequences and so, Minister, I hope that when you come up here, you'll tell us whether or not; when this mission is going to be undertaken; what arrangements have been made for those who will be landing in the country; how will the quarantine element that will be carried out by the SA National Defence Force, SANDF, work; and the readiness of each and every department in the interministerial task team with regard to executing all of their plans.

Also, regardless of whether or not you'll divulge the details of where people will be kept, we need to be assured of the suitability of the facility so that we can ensure that basic human rights are upheld.

UNREVISED HANSARD
NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 9

We can ill afford mass panic and the rise of fake news, and the only way we can beat that, Minister, is if we fill the vacuum as you have demonstrated this afternoon by providing accurate and the most updated information.

Our assurance to the people of South Africa is that the DA stands ready to support the efforts of this government to deal with this epidemic. We would do so for the people who have elected us to serve them. However, our support to you is conditional.

We will never abdicate on our obligation to hold this government to account. Every possible precaution must be taken to prevent the breakout and the spread of the coronavirus in the country.

When the time comes, as we have heard this afternoon that there may be South Africans who have contracted the illness, swift and meticulous action must be taken, as I am sure you'll announce later this evening. I have watched with great disappointment leaders across the globe tear each other apart as they seek to weaponize and politicize this issue. We dare

UNREVISED HANSARD
NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 10

not let our citizens down by doing the same. History will judge us harshly if we do so. [Applause.]

Dr S M DLOMO: Hon Deputy Speaker, hon Ministers, Deputy Ministers, all Members of Parliament present here and ...

IsiZulu:

... abahlali baseNingizimu Afrika ngiyanibingelela.

English:

The centres for disease control and prevention defines public health as the science of protecting and improving the health of people and their communities. This work is achieved by promoting healthy lifestyles, researching disease and injury prevention, and detecting, preventing and responding to infectious diseases.

In the South African context, the aforementioned is true given the role and successes of the national Department of Health which is constitutionally tasked to ensure health for all South Africans. In fulfilling this responsibility, the national Department of Health foresaw a need and established the National Institute for Communicable Diseases, the NICD, a

UNREVISED HANSARD
NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 11

division of the National Health Laboratory Service through the Act of Parliament, known as the National Health Laboratory Service Act 37 of 2000.

South Africa's investment in its public health system is evident in the foresight and the critical role of the National Institute for Communicable Diseases, which serves as a national resource of knowledge and expertise on communicable diseases not only to our country, but to the countries of the Southern African Development Community region as well as the rest of the African continent. Importantly, the NICD assists in the planning of policies and programmes to support and respond to communicable diseases.

In the year 2017 to 2018, South Africa experienced an outbreak of Listeriosis arising from food contamination from two food processed meat companies. The success the NCID provided its superior technical advantage and laboratory infrastructure to overcome the spread and provide conclusive evidence of the source of the outbreak.

In the same vein, during the Ebola outbreak in West African countries, South Africa was the first country to go to assist

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 12

with the intervention. This is one of the scientific acumen of South Africa's health infrastructure that has provided valuable service to the people of West Africa.

In anticipation of the arrival of novel coronavirus, the national Department of Health has embarked on important measures for preparedness to deal with the outbreak. These were preceded by the growing numbers of the infections in China and other countries. Post the World Health Organisation's declaration of coronavirus as a global health emergency, the national Department of Health announced the designated hospitals in all provinces for responding to the outbreak. The nature of the operations of this unit is a health matter, but has components of security and diplomatic relations as a national key area. It is commendable that no province resisted when three years ago the responsibility of port health was taken away from provinces and is at the national.

The Port Folio Committee on Health will be visiting OR Tambo health tomorrow to observe how they conduct operations in that area. We appreciate Minister Mkhize's facilitation with the Airports Company SA, ACSA.

UNREVISED HANSARD
NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 13

IsiZulu:

Kungakuhle ukuthi siqale ngokubongela uNgqongqoshe uMkhize ngokusukumela lolu daba, ngalendlela uholo alwenze ngalo noholo olwenziwe uMongameli uRamaphosa kanye neKhabinethi yonke luyancomeka. [Ihlombe.]

Sibhekene nembendukazwe wesifo esithiwa yi-Covid-19 kodwa ke abaningi basibiza ngokuthi yi-coronavirus. Ngomhla zinga-30 kuMasingana kulonyaka inhlango yezezifo ezizwe yezempilo nayo yakhipha isiqondiso sokuthi sisukumele lesi sifo njengomthwalo wonke wamazwe. Sisha ke lesi sifo ezweni lonke, isidleke saso sise-China. Sibhebhethaka okomlilo wequbula nakwamanye amazwe anjengo-South Korea no-Italy. Sibanengcindezi kakhulu le sifo kubantu abasebancane kakhulu, izingane, abantu abadala kakhulu nasebantwini abanemizimba ebuthaka ngenxa yezifo ezikhona njengomdlavuza, abadla imishanguzo yezifo njengegcwane lesandulela ngculaza, abangena emishinini mhlawumbe kanye ngeviki beyokwenza i-dialysis. Noma isiphi isifo esifika emzimbeni sisisha, umzimba usuke ungekabi nazo izihlungu zaleso sifo - kusinda abakwagwala.

Masibalekeni lesi sifo ngokuthi siqikelele ukuhlanzeka kwethu. Abathimulayo, abakhwehlelayo mabangavele nje basakaze

UNREVISED HANSARD
NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 14

amagciwane abo noma ikanjani. Beka iduku noma isandla, noma ushaye endololwaneni ingqiniba. [Ihlombe.] Masigeze izandla, hhayi nje kuphela uma siphuma endlini yangasese kodwa kube yiqhelo esijwayelekile leso.

Zizoncipha kakhulu izifo ezithathelwanayo ngaloluhlobo. Awukabibikho umjovo walesi sifo. Ngakho ke kufuneka siqiniseke ukuthi singasingeni. Sizwile ke usebekile umhlonishwa uGwarube, usazogcizelela uNgqongqoshe ukuthi sekukhona othintekile. Sibonga nokho uhulumeni ngendlela enze ngayo ukuvimba ezikhumulweni zezindiza nasezikhululweni zemikhumbi nanokuthi bonke abantu abangena ngezinyawo bahlale laphaya bashaye uhiqe baze bathole usizo ukuze bangahlehli bangene singakwenzanga konke lokho.

Kuyosiza ke Ngqongqoshe uMkhize ukuthi uqhubeke nokusabalalisa imiyalezo okufuneka siyazi ngalesifo. Engathi ingaqina ke imiyalezo eyizixwayiso ukuvikela imiyalezo okungeyona iqiniso. Kodwa ke nathi Malungu ePhalamende uma sithola izindaba ezingelona iqiniso sizithumele kulo Mnyango basiqinisekise ubuqiniso balowo mbono ukuze nathi silekelele ukuthumela imiyalezo eyiqiniso.

UNREVISED HANSARD
NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 15

UMongameli uRamaphosa wakhapha umyalelo wokuthi zamukelwe izicelo zabaseMzantsi abalaphaya e-Wuhan uma becela ukubuyela ekhaya. Abakangenwa nokho yilesi sifo. Kufana nje nokuthi babona umlilo wequbula usha ngaphesheya komfula. Sebethi mabaqale baqaphele, banyakaze.

Kubalulekile ukuthi sigcizelele ukuthi noma befika la ekhaya oNgobese, oThole, o-Williams, oMokoena abayi emakhaya, bazogcinwa endaweni lapho bezobhekwa khona ezinsuku ezingamashumi amabili nanye kuze kuqinisekise ukuthi akukho okubathintayo ngalesi sifo. Emva kwalokho ke sebeyovunyelwa ke ukuya emakhaya. Asikwamukele lokho bahlali baseNingizimu Afrika - iyona ndlela le ezokwenza singabi nakungabaza ukuthi izinhlelo zonke ezimisiwe ziyasisiza.

English:

It was a very heart warming to receive a message on the phone yesterday from one of the good South Africans who wrote the following and I quote:

I have just returned from a business trip in Italy and United Kingdom, UK, that was cut short due to Covid-19 travel restrictions. There were mandatory health checks at

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 16

every airport I transited, but the health checks and sophistication of technology used at Cape Town International Airport today raised the bar on every European airport I've encountered on this trip. Not to mention the professionalism and competence of the staff conducting these checks. Kudos team South Africa, and kudos Cape International Airport!

[Applause.]

IsiZulu:

Noma ke ungabathandi oNgqongqoshe bakahulumeni ophetheyo ngoba abaka-ANC kufanele kodwa nisebenzisane nabo. Ngiyabonga ke lungu elihloniphekile Gwarube ngoba uyasho. Le ndaba yokubuyisa abahlali baseNingizimu Afrika abase-China umcimbi lowo ophethwe uMnyango Wezokuvikela, uMnyango Wobudlelwano Namazwe Omhlaba kanye Nokubambisana, uMnyango WezeMpilo, uMnyango Wezasekhaya kanye noMnyango WezoBulungiswa.

English:

It is a military operation that has diplomatic processes. It is beyond the capacity of any one single Member of Parliament or a political party for that matter that is not in government to be able to conduct such an operation. There is only one

UNREVISED HANSARD
NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 17

commander-in-chief of the SA National Defence Force, SANDF and
I am raising this ...

IsiZulu:

... ngoba kuneqembu la ebelithembisa abahlali baseMzantsi
abase-China ukuthi bazobalanda. Cha, izinhlelo ezinjalo
zenziwa uhulumeni. Singabathembisi abantu into esingeke
sikwazi ukuyenza. [Ihlombe.] Ukubuya kwabantu bakithi abase-
China kuzokwenziwa uhulumeni, uholwa oNgqongqoshe nobaba
uRamaphosa.

English:

In conclusion, the Global Health Security Index for 2019
Report revealed that South Africa is ranked 34 out of 195
countries. It ranked above average of most of the indicators
used, namely ... prevention, detection and reporting, rapid
response, health systems and risk environment. This gives
confidence that the South African government through the
national Department of Health is doing all within its power to
strengthen its health systems to safeguard the public from the
outbreak of any other form of infections.

Sesotho:

UNREVISED HANSARD
NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 18

Marumo fatshe.

IsiZulu:

Uhulumeni kaKhongolose uphetha. Siyabonga. [Ihlombe.]

Mr D BERGMAN: Hon Deputy Speaker, on 27 January the Department of International Relations and Co-operation issued the following, "We are on the drive to inform people about the virus but not telling them to avoid travelling to that country." Very diplomatic, but at that stage we are only country with that message, probably paying credit to our relationship with China.

Around that time, Ambassador Lin Songtian holds a press conference and fills a void left by our President and Minister by trying to put the minds of our country at ease, by assuring us that China has this under control and that the South Africans are being treated very well.

It is at this stage that the DA, through the DA abroad, started getting frantic emails from concerned individuals, who want to return, but they cannot get hold of the Department of International Relations and Co-operation and/or the South

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 19

African missions. Some just want advice of course. However, it is very different to the pictures being painted in the press, especially by our Minister who is on record stating, for example, on Radio 702 that she has not heard of one South African wanting to return.

To cut a long story short: We tested the numbers at our mission; we tested the Department International Relations and Co-operation's emergency number; we wrote a letter to the Minister - I am talking about my Minister of International Relations and Co-operation - calling for back up for the staff in China; and offering our sympathies and empathy to the staff and all people in China.

Unfortunately, we are politically ignored. However, it becomes suspiciously clear that there is another power at play. The Free State province is known to have an agreement with China around the training of medical students. A whole host of them return. It seems the Free State has facilitated some agreement directly with China. Suddenly officials at the Department of International Relations and Co-operation start co-operating with us to assist us in compiling a list of people to evacuate.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 20

We thank ambassador Songtian for his proactiveness and we ask him to relay our message of hope that China can find a cure soon and that a sudden end to this tragedy is near. To South Africa: Thanks for taking the bold decision for bringing our people back and for taking the necessary health and welfare precautions with them and us, before and after their return. To the first South African victim: We wish him a full and speedy recovery.

To the Minister: The moral of the story is that things can work so much better if we drop the arrogance and the aloofness, and come together and work together. By now we should know that things should be controlled from this House, and not the Free State. I thank you. [Applause.]

Ms N N CHIRWA: Hon Deputy Speaker, greetings to the commander-in-chief, CIC, Julius Sello Malema, commissars and fighters. [Interjections.] In a country like South Africa, where access to health care is drawn upon race, class and gendered binaries, the threat of Covid-19 should have all of us concerned, as we can already tell who will experience the catastrophe on a greater scale - more so, because the first case has been reported today in KwaZulu-Natal.

Minister Zweli Mkhize is adamant that the Department of Health is ready to tackle the virus. We know that this is not the truth, as a mere seasonal flu in South Africa, claims the lives of 6 000 to 11 000 people per year. If your department cannot contain a mere flu from claiming the lives of our people, when there are preventative measures through vaccines and primary health care: What will you do to contain coronavirus?

The majority of South Africans still do not know what coronavirus is, and are subjected to fear mongering and lack of information. Yet, we have a supposedly functional and prepared Department of Health to counter a virus that has destabilised some of the strongest health systems in the world.

If coronavirus can make a country like China build a hospital in weeks and yet still claim thousands lives: What do you think it will do to South Africa that takes years to build one dysfunctional maternity ward? The very little of our populace that has access to internet and social media are subjected to the ignorance of Ministers who have no shame of wearing incorrect masks and tweeting about their ignorance with pride.

UNREVISED HANSARD
NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 22

However, as usual, the EFF is very magnanimous with solutions and we will share them with the department and the Minister with the hope that we will put and prioritise the lives of South Africans before your ego ... [Interjections.]

Dr M Q NDLOZI: Point of order!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, hon member.

Dr M Q NDLOZI: Hon Deputy Speaker, can the Minister listen? [Interjections.] Pay the attention and listen! Heeh? Please! [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Ndlozi!

Dr M Q NDLOZI: We are giving wisdom there and you are busy having chit chat. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Ndlozi!

Dr M Q NDLOZI: Please! This is great wisdom. Listen!

Sesotho:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 23

MOTLATSA SEPIKARA: Ntate Ndlozi, Ke kopa o sekebe wa e pheta ntho eo. Ha o ka e pheta, o tla kopana le pela di falla, ntate. Tswela pele, mme!

Ms N N CHIRWA: We hope that the Minister and the Department of Health will put the lives of South Africans first before your ego and the rush to claim nonexistent easy victories like other Ministers have done. The department must institute an immediate mass media campaign. This, on radios in clinics, schools, television and do door-to-door campaigns. We know that this is possible because it is done during elections.

The department and the Minister, together with the Minister of Human Settlements, Water and Sanitation must devise an emergency plan on how to ensure that clean water is accessible to everybody. You cannot teach people about hygiene as a preventative measure when some of our clinics, hospitals, schools, villages and townships have a water crisis at hand right now.

Primary health care workforce and community health care workers must be trained for detection mechanisms. It will be a huge disgrace for the country that the very same people tasked

UNREVISED HANSARD
NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 24

with easing health catastrophes will also be at the risk of infection and not be able to deliver primary health care.

Infrastructure preparation must extend to all hospitals and not just 13 hospitals, Mr Minister. People must not walk into our hospitals with physical injuries and leave with tuberculosis and coronavirus, as is the case because of the infrastructural inadequacies.

Testing ports must be extended beyond white dominated and elite spaces. The department cannot claim to be ready when the only entry testing ports we have are at airports. Majority of our people use alternative modes of transport, and our country borders do not start and end at O R Tambo International Airport - more so, because the coronavirus is not contained by the imaginary borders.

It was a huge embarrassment yesterday, hearing the Minister speak about the readiness of the surveillance team and making an example of instances of infections being picked up at the airports and people being called when there is somebody who got infected on the flight.

The question is: What tracking mechanisms have the department devised for townships and rural area public spaces? How will you track down taxi passengers and train passengers who were sitting next to an infected person?

Pillar Number 6 of the World Health Organisation's guidelines asserts that it is not just points of entry that must be prioritised, controlled and assessed but also those areas that pose a high risk of transmission and infection.

The Minister must conduct a comprehensive stakeholder and community engagement plan of action to inspire and co-ordinate a multisectoral and a multipartnered intervention with the private sector, business, NGOs, agriculture, travel and tourism. The department must also find out the possible monetary cost of dealing with coronavirus should it slip into the country, as we have learnt today that it already has.

Lastly, the entire country must be cognisant of the reality that such viruses are bigger threat for the poor people who will not have the means to buy food in bulk and lock themselves in their houses. And, not everybody has a liberty

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 26

to call in sick and take a day off at work because they have symptoms of flu and Covid-19.

We have people who are exploited workers and they do not have the liberty that most white, classist and rich people have. It is wise to hope for the best, but it is much wiser to plan and be ready for the worst, Mr Minister. I thank you. [Applause.]

Mr M HLENGWA: Hon Deputy Speaker, in the face of crisis panic is not a solution. Never before has the world been more compelled to maintain calm and resolve in the face of a rapidly expanding global health crisis such as this one. As countries all around the world grapple with responding to the new coronavirus it is incumbent upon us to ensure that we are not feeding into the frenzy but to ensure that we are ready to combat the spread within our own borders. As the confirmed number of cases escalate all around the world, the need for us to be fully prepared has never been more vital.

The IFP calls on the government to be transparent with the public, which is of crucial importance when managing a matter of national and international public importance such as this one. It calls to task those who are in leadership positions

UNREVISED HANSARD
NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 27

with public platforms to desist from fear mongering when we speak of the coronavirus. At this point, the public at large is fully aware of the existence of the virus and what is left is for us to change the language we use in order to help the citizens to be better prepared for the effects for once we have determined what it is that in fact will hit our shores as it has been confirmed.

Therefore government need to be transparent and ensure that information is publicly accessible to help educate citizens on the risks and necessary precautionary measures, as well as actively avoid panic or misinformation. A lack of reliable information can also give rise to baseless rumours and fake news. Singapore, for example, sends out daily briefings on coronavirus updates – how many new cases have been confirmed, how many patients have been discharged from hospital, and whether new clusters are appearing.

This transparency will help reduce hysteria and give other countries and international experts important information in understanding the spread of this virus. It is also our collective responsibility to change the stigma surrounding this virus. The coronavirus has proven to not discriminate. It

UNREVISED HANSARD
NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 28

has not targeted a specific race or ethnic group or even people of a particular fitness level therefore we need to ensure that we publicly denounce any association of the disease to any specific group of people to put a stop to the stigmatization. Government should look into launching public awareness campaigns. These have proven to be effective in some Asian countries, teaching people how to keep good hygiene as well as best practices. While the government and citizens should prepare us for the virus, it's also important not to panic.

There are practical things that need to be done now. The SA Broadcasting Corporation, SABC and eNews Channel Africa, eNCA and Newzroom Afrika, should ensure that they are giving information free of charge on the daily basis to their viewers, particularly during prime time news. We are calling on Mobile Telephone Network, MTN, Voice Data Communication, Vodacom, Telkom and Cyclic Executive Lower Level Computer, Cell C, to be giving our daily reminders to our people to make sure that are well informed.

A public-private partnership of efforts in this regard is very, very important. The same goes to the private hospitals,

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 29

which have got necessary resources and infrastructure to ensure that they give full assistance to majority of our health care centres particularly during this time; therefore ultimately what we need now is for leaders to lead. We have been granted a good head start as this country let us therefore not adopt a defeatist approach but confront this virus head on. Finally, hon Minister Khabazela, one health care worker whose information I will hand over to you, has contacted me about concerns that they have in their facility, so that we can be able to step in because this is also a facility in Kwazulu-Natal but let's stand shoulder to shoulder confront this virus, assist our people and run away from hysteria and the frenzy because is information that will help us. I thank you.

Afrikaans:

Mnr P A VAN STADEN: Geagte Speaker, die hoeveelheid mense wat alreeds weens die koronavirus gesterf het is nou meer as 3 000. Daar is nou reeds meer as 95 000 gevalle aangemeld in meer as 81 lande, waar mense positief vir die virus getoets het.

UNREVISED HANSARD
NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 30

Die Wêreldgesondheidsorganisasie, WGO, het gister aangekondig dat daar nie genoeg beskermde toerusting is om die verspreiding van die dodelike virus te voorkom nie. Die WGO het reeds 'n beroep op regerings en maatskappye gedoen om hul produksie met 40% te verhoog. Die Wêreldbank het ook aangekondig dat hul 'n bedrag van \$12 miljard beskikbaar stel om lande te help om die virus te beveg. Hier in Afrika het die virus reeds sy kop uitgesteek in Algerië, Senegal, Marokko, Nigerië en Egipte. Die virus is so pas in Suid-Afrika.

Iran het reeds 300 000 burgermaglede ontplooi om van deur tot deur te gaan om huise te laat ontsmet. Amerika oorweeg dit tans om die grens met Mexiko te sluit om die verspreiding van die virus te keer. Die Amerikaanse staat, Washington, het ook al verskeie gevalle van die virus aangemeld en die staat Kalifornië het vanoggend 'n noodtoestand weens die virus aangekondig. Die Britse Minister van gesondheid het reeds aangedui dat sy regering hom daarop voorberei dat die epidemie gaan vererger. Frankryk het 'n tydelike verbod geplaas op die samekomste van mense waar dit die 5 000 merk oorskry. Die eerste voorvalle is reeds in Katar, Ierland, Ekwador, Luxemburg en vandag in Suid-Afrika aangemeld.

UNREVISED HANSARD
NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 31

Hier in Suid-Afrika is die uitbreking van die koronavirus 'n gevaar vir ons, omdat ons land se grense tussen buurlande oop lê en daar nie voldoende beheer oor die daaglikse toestroming van mense oor die grense is nie. Ons sal baie vinnig die voorbeelde van ander lande moet begin volg, om ons grense te sluit.

Mense kan ongesiens by ons buurlande se grense deur kom. Oop grense en slegte grense moet opgeskerp, gesluit en gemonitor word. Dit is nie 'n maatreël om teen iemand te diskrimineer nie, maar ons moet na die mense van ons eie land kyk.

Dit is nie goed genoeg om net ons lughawens en hawens te beskerm nie. Meer maatreëls moet dringend ingestel word, omdat hierdie virus maklik die land binnegedring het, soos ons gesien het.

Talle sportgeleenthede oor die wêreld is alreeds afgestel of uitgestel. Een hiervan is die Olimpiese Spele wat moontlik in die slag gaan bly. Hier ook sal ons dringend die voorbeeld van ander lande moet volg, om ook sportbyeenkomste te kanselleer, totdat die virus onder beheer is en dit veilig is vir internasionale spanne om Suid-Afrika te besoek en andersom.

UNREVISED HANSARD
NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 32

Ons moet ons atlete en landsburgers beskerm. Ons moet ook ons kinders beskerm.

English:

Mr P A VAN STADEN: On these two matters I am looking forward to meet with the Minister in the next week. It was reported on 24 February that the Harvard University is predicting that the coronavirus will ultimately not be containable and within one year it will infect between 40-70% of humanity. This is how serious this matter is. With still no cure worldwide for this virus we have no choice but to do what is necessary to do, to safe the lives of our citizens and of our children.

It is very clear that the South African public is worried about the assignment of the 13 state hospitals to manage and treat patients who will be infected with this virus. It is clear that our public health system is not sustainable and healthy to address this problem. It is also worried that the public is being kept in the dark around the matter of where the quarantine areas will be and how it will be managed and administrated. Yes the Minister did explain yesterday to the committee what the reason is not to announce where these places will be but the South African public must know what is

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 33

going on and not to be kept in the dark. Security measures can be so strict but nobody can enter but the public must know what is going on. Thank you.

Mr S N SWART: Deputy Speaker, the ACDP would like to dedicate this speech to the brave doctor from Wihun in China, who first exposed the truth about the coronavirus Doctor Li Wenliang. Sadly, he passed away in February, a victim of the very virus he exposed. So the question we are facing is whether we are adequately prepared as a nation. The ACDP want to thank all members in government, health workers who are doing their very best, very best under very difficult circumstances.

Across the world, we see authorities scrambling hold the virus to spread, schools being shut, major cultural and sports events suspended and work hours even being cut back. We see members are being encouraged, our citizens in Italy and Iran avoiding physical contact, sports being closed down and of course now we see the first case in South Africa. So we from the ACDP side would encourage the government to be more proactive in its public awareness campaigns, about the symptoms and where one can get help and the preventive measures that can be taken.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 34

We also need to be mindful that some South Africans can be more susceptible to respiratory diseases, given the higher levels of Tuberculosis in our nation and bearing in mind that many of our people are in overcrowded trains and taxis for example. WE would urge the involvement of churches and faith-based organisations to communicate awareness of this disease and we need to be praying. Many of us are believers, let's pray, we need pray and we need action in encouraging a sense of calm in this situation.

We will also want to warn against any misinformation, false news, fake news that is being spread around about the virus creating unnecessary fear and panic. We would support measures of daily updates. If Eskom can give daily update about load shedding, surely we can and should be giving updates about this pandemic. We don't need fear or panic but we must be properly prepared. We from the ACDP side will come along side government to do whatever is necessary but we also exercise our oversight responsibilities.

We will urge all South Africans to take collective responsibility, where we each do what we can to ensure that we

stay safe and contain any potential threat as quickly and as efficiently as we can. Let's bear in mind Psalm 91 says:

As we trust in the Lord no pestilence would come near our habitation.

So again to conclude, we need prayer and we need action and Minister everything on the very best as we do but...let's be open, let's be frank, and let's be accountable, let us no hide information that citizens need to know about this as much as possible. The ACDP would assist wherever is necessary and possible. I thank you.

IsiXhosa:

Mr N L S KWANKWA: Yhini Sekela Somlomo ude ubize neli lobukhoboka Thixo wam!

English:

Hon Deputy Speaker and hon members, the UDM is of the view that the SA government is not handling the Covid-19 outbreak in China and the impact thereof on all South Africans very well. Yes, statements have been issued by the national department saying that measures are in place to detect, manage

UNREVISED HANSARD
NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 36

and contain any cases of Coronavirus should it come to our shores, and unfortunately, yes, it has now come to our shores.

Yes, the National Institute for Communicable Diseases keeps updating their website or keeps the website up to date about the latest developments that directly affect citizens, which is good thing. Yet, being in possession of correspondence that was sent, especially to the SA Embassy in China, in Beijing, where most of the responses from the Embassy were either unhelpful and at times, showed signs of panic, at times.

Minister, we are a bit insensitive, and over the top, we have failed to show sensitivity to the concerns of some of the South Africans who were locked in China at the time. However, Minister ...

IsiXhosa:

... kunzima kuba kuqala siza kumana siyikhumsha le nto sisithi Coronavirus, abantu bakuthi bakhona bahleli phaya. Siza kuyazi njani ukuba uMaDlamini oseKhayelitsha, uMamCirha oseMdantsane kunye noMaMokoena oseSoweto bayayazi ukuba ezi mpawu zomkhuhlane banazo aziyiyo intsholongwane yeCorona? Abasokuze bayazi kwabona kuba kaloku...

UNREVISED HANSARD
NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 37

English:

...public awareness campaigns and regular updates...

IsiXhosa:

... azenziwa ukuze abantu bazi ukuba kwenzeka ntoni na.

Kwakhona kubanzima, sicela usixolele mhlawumbi ke sesineentandabuzo ezininzi kuba kaloku ikwangulo rhulumente lo uphantse ukubangela ukuba uMzantsi Afrika ubulawe yipolony. Nicinga ukuba siza kunikholelwa njani ngoku xa ningekho ...

English:

... transparent about your actions especially on this issue of the Coronavirus...

IsiXhosa:

... nithi niyilungele? Inyaniso emsulwa nengangxengwanga yile yokuba sasixakene nepolony apha sigilana. Intsholongwane yeCorona yohlula iChina eneendlela zokuyilwa (resources) ezininzi. Thina sasixakwe yipolony kodwa sicinga ukuba sinayo indlela...

UNREVISED HANSARD
NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 38

...to co-ordinate and deal with it properly and effectively without communicating it. The other issue is, as the Chair of the African Union, we should not be ...

English:

... parochial in our approach. What we should endeavour to do is that, since there are incidences and cases of Coronavirus here in Africa as a whole, we need to look at the disease broadly to say what would be the continental response in a more co-ordinated approach to the question of Coronavirus.

This will be done so that in South Africa we can be able to provide a template that can be also used by some of the countries who that are affected by Coronavirus, and which have less resources than us. By so doing, we will be able to provide leadership to on this disease in question. These are important issues ...

IsiXhosa:

... ngokuthi xa bebuya abantu bakuthi aba nithetha ngabo bali-151, zeziphi na izicwangciso-nkqubo enizibekileyo ukuze uluntu luyazi. Ndiyakhathazeka ke kuba...

UNREVISED HANSARD
NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 39

English:

... at the time when you were saying that there are 34 citizens that were locked in Wuhan, the Embassy was in possession of the correspondence that showed that they were 78 at that time. [Time expired.]

Mr S N AUGUST: Hon Deputy Speaker, it is extremely scary that as I stand here today the first case of Coronavirus has just been confirmed in South Africa. Yet, I have very little idea on how to protect my family from it or what to do if any of us were to become infected. If I don't know what to do as a member of Parliament, living in a modern city with access to the full range of available information, what chances do South Africans have if or when the virus strikes their communities?

Education is a key management tool in any health crisis. We know that from our experience with HIV, but we are failing to provide crucial information to our people about Coronavirus. Crucial information such as what the Coronavirus is, what the symptoms are, how it spreads, and what to do if you suspect you have been infected? Hon Deputy Speaker, where are the pamphlets, the posters and the public service announcements?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 40

What information is being conveyed at our hospitals, schools, government buildings, businesses and public spaces? If we are taking the World Health Organisation's global warning of a pandemic seriously, public education is not just the responsibility of the Department of Health, but it is a national priority. In Japan and Italy, schools have closed to stop the spread of this virus.

Does our education department have a plan in place if the virus begins to sweep across South Africa? What plans have the retail and public health sectors put in place to stock up on hand sanitizers and face masks, among other clinical products to stop the virus? Where will we house those who should be quarantined? What are media companies doing to stem the flow of false information and fake news?

The correct and the good approach would be to begin working on the basics immediately. There is no vaccine to prevent Coronavirus, but there are ways to reduce your chances of becoming infected. The best way to prevent infection is to avoid being exposed to the virus. Our people need basic information on how to do this urgently.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 41

Can the virus be transferred through shaking hands? Why is it important to cover your mouth and nose when you sneeze? What should we do with used facial tissues? How best do we disinfect our hands and our homes? There are nearly 500 parliamentarians in South Africa. Coronavirus is said to kill more than 3% of people who it infects, so some of our lives are literally at stake.

But, if it is to cause mayhem in our country, it's not the likes of us who are most at risk; it is poor, elderly and vulnerable South Africans, such as those living with diabetes, who will shoulder the biggest burden. It is our responsibility as parliamentarians to protect them, beginning today. Thank you.

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Hon Deputy Speaker, let me start off by saying that the NFP has done some research into the Durban International, meaning King Shaka International, O R Tambo and the Cape Town International, and we are quite satisfied with the measures that have been put in place in these airports. Let us be honest about it. [Applause.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 42

Having said that, we have not done any research or investigation on the Coronavirus itself, but I'm hoping that the Portfolio Committee on Health, which is here, should conduct some oversight into this matter, particularly on the different borders and where there are lots and lots of influx of people from foreign nationals and things that are coming into our country, or our own people that are going out and coming in.

As far as the airports, I can tell you that we have done some homework on it. The only one challenge that I think we have found was the lack of consistency in the quality of the mask that was provided. I am told that the accepted standard is the N95, but some of them don't have the actual N95. So, I think that the Minister and the department must take cognisance of that to just check that all of these masks have the same high quality in order to try and prevent any infection, particularly, on time.

Yes indeed, I think that we must also commend our staff and officials that are on duty in all these ports of entry because they are putting their lives at risk. They are working consistently and are doing their best. I am told that every

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 43

single person entering our country, South African or foreigner, goes through a test at the moment, their temperatures are checked, the quarantine facilities are available, medical service emergencies are available at the airports and ports of entry.

This is the information I have done my research into, believe me. But like I said, we have not done research in the border controlled and the other areas, and I think that's what the portfolio committee should do. So, instead of the political parties offering to go to do these checks, that's what the site committees are for. We have them at national level and provincial level.

Therefore, let's go out there to see if there's any challenge that needs to be addressed. It's as simple as that. I hope that the sudden rising to make this a big issue recently, is not motivated by the fact that we are repatriating a lot of our South Africans. That we must do because those are our people, they have to be brought back here. Yes indeed, with all measure.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 44

Now, looking at our history of how we dealt with Ebola and Listeriosis, let's be honest about it, I think that we have conducted ourselves professionally. We did a fantastic job in maintaining and preventing those diseases. So, let's work together, if we do, I'm quite sure that we will be able to handle this epidemic as well. Thank you very much. [Applause.]

Mr M P GALO: Deputy Speaker, there are few preliminaries that we must highlight in this global discussion. Firstly, there is no functional purpose in continuously spreading misinformation about the matrix of the coronavirus. Secondly, two South Africans who tested positive for the coronavirus while on a cruise ship in Japan have now been tested negative after been quarantined in Japan.

Thirdly, the World Health Organization has issued a standard recommendations guide to prevent the spread of the virus and these include regular hand washing, covering mouth and nose when coughing and sneezing, thoroughly cooking meat and eggs. The data we have gathered from a simple desktop research indicate that, of the 78 000 reported cases globally, 2 744 people have died. In Africa, only Nigeria has confirmed the first case of the virus. We are also aware that a 38-year-

UNREVISED HANSARD
NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 45

old South Africa man who recently returned from Italy with his wife has tested positive for the deadly coronavirus. There is no doubt that this disease implicates the political, social and economic orders of the world. It is daunting and nerve-wracking.

The process of repatriating South African citizens from Wuhan city in Hubei province, China, must be embraced by all South Africans. We should support the work of the Health Ministry, and continue to invest our resources to innovative medical research programmes geared towards devising ways to manage and ultimately cure the virus. The AIC sincerely support the work of the Ministry. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Madisha?

Sepedi:

Mna W M MADISHA: Ke dumedišitše ntate.

Sesotho:

MOTLATSI WA SEPIKARA: Ke dumedisitse le nna ntate.

English:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 46

Mr W M MADISHA: Okay, our Bill of Rights accords everyone the right to health care, yet 84% of the nation's 58,8 million people have no medical insurance and rely on a public health system with very few doctors and dilapidated facilities, resulting in delayed or inadequate treatment.

The country's poorest people have access to free treatment at about 3 800 public clinics and hospitals, but these facilities are all too often plagued by broken equipment and shortages of medicine. Only five of 696 facilities covered in the Office of Health Standards Compliance's most recent report met 80% of their required performance criteria in areas such as drug availability and proper infection control. South Africa also has insufficient medical personnel, with a doctor-patient ratio of 0,9 per 1 000, lower than in Brazil and others. The biggest reason cited by doctors leaving the public sector is poor working conditions.

The World Health Organization has already declared the coronavirus outbreak a global health emergency - largely because of fears that poorer countries such as us may not be able to cope with the outbreak. The health system in South Africa is already struggling with the existing workload, and

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 47

Cope believes many public hospitals can't deal with another outbreak of a highly infectious disease.

Many cases may go undetected and as a result of this, there is a problem - The Minister announced that Tygerberg Hospital will be one of the major hospitals to deal with the virus. Minister, Tygerberg Hospital is faced with financial problems as it has recently spent R700 million to upgrade its facilities. Cope's concern is that hospitals like Tygerberg will not be ready to serve the hundreds of citizens coming back to South Africa from China and elsewhere.

President Cyril Ramaphosa approved the budget of R25 million to repatriate 151 South African. The concern is where will these citizens be quarantined, and will they be able to afford the medical expenses? This is worrisome to Cope. [Time expired.]

Ms E R WILSON: Minister Mboweni must be so pleased that his little friend, Aloe Ferox, is so hardy and can overcome many hardships. He must be even happier that little Ferox is not reliant on the South African public health system for survival, especially now that coronavirus has hit our shores.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 48

The Minister advised that 13 hospitals have been identified to handle the treatment and quarantine of patients diagnosed with the coronavirus.

Today, we speak for all South Africans, and you should understand that we are weary. The Minister was not present at the public hearings to witness the stories we were told. We were asked to please visit, and I quote, "the hospital of horrors" or "the hospital of death". Where are our ambulances, there are no ambulances. Over the last year we have visited many hospitals across South Africa and what we have witnessed has been disturbing.

In Mafikeng, maternity patients with newborns were sleeping on the floor on mattresses. Medical waste, gloves and vials were lying on the grass outside; mould was growing on the walls. The boiler was not working, and there was no hot water. There was a severe shortage of doctors and nurses. The toilets were filthy; there was no soap and no towels. An outbreak there is going to be devastating.

In the Mankweng hospital, more recently, I found much of the same but with animal faeces in the hospital. I could not

fathom it, until one evening I found goats wondering through the hospital. I have the pictures. Ten babies died in Tembisa over two months. A drug resistant bacteria has been blamed. If we cannot prevent those kinds of basic incidences, how are we going to manage and control the hundreds of patients who will contract coronavirus. It is here. Coronavirus targets those with vulnerable immune systems and we have the highest numbers of HIV and TB patients in the world.

Our national health laboratories do not have the best track record and we are doubtful that they will cope when the numbers of patients escalate. It is time for transparency, Minister - for urgency. We need to know and must see where our patients will be treated to confirm that we are indeed ready. It is time to work together and ensure the safety of every South African. You need to assure us.

And in closing, we will pray and uplift all those health professionals who are going to have to deal with this as it escalates. I think they have a tough time going and we must uplift them and support them where we can. I thank you.

[Applause.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 50

Mr T B MUNYAI: Deputy Speaker, maybe one should not join the chorus of those that are spreading the political virus through the barrage of propaganda - we will attend them later. Let us focus on what is very important to the nation and the world. In a globalised community which is interconnectedness and also interdependent, the virus has no borders. Logistics don't only move goods and service, but also spread virus. To this end we extend our deepest condolences to the Communist Party of China, CPC, leadership under the leadership President Xi Jinping at the core of leadership of those who lost their lives. At the very same time we salute the leadership of the Chinese under the CPC Ambassador Cui said:

Turning a blind eye to the fact that the Chinese people have been effectively mobilised under the CPC leadership and that the party members are leading the work, these people are provoking ideological biases and clamouring for unnecessary overreactions while we are doing the work.

Here at home the Department of Health puts in place comprehensive co-ordinated response hence one of the positive person has been detected. To South Africa and the ANC, that's a great success and it demonstrates the state of readiness. I

know we have collectively been briefed about the state of readiness at the portfolio committee including members of the portfolio committee who were playing at the gallery. We know that other measures that are put forward by the department are to educate the country's population about the virus prevention actions. Everyone can protect her or his health and protect others by frequently washing hands, maintain social distance from someone sneezing or coughing, seeking medical care early when have coughing or breathing problems, expand surveillance to find and isolate and care for every case and to trace everyone contact. These have already begun - to take on all government and society's approach. This is not the job of the Health Ministry alone, but as South Africans and collectively we need to work together.

The world is experiencing an outbreak epidemic virus called coronavirus referred here as Covid-19, and of course I won't go to the symptoms because they are well known thus far. The World Health Organisation has raised its assessment of the risk and spread and also the risk impact of Covid-19 coronavirus to very high on the global level. They even declared this a global emergency. This means it should and must be a top priority for all member state countries

UNREVISED HANSARD
NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 52

including South Africa as declared by the multinational institution, the World Health Organisation.

It is also an undisputed fact that this morning, for instance, in the outbreak of the novel coronavirus, referred to as Covid-19 in the global community, we saw the unprecedented comprehensive co-ordinated intervention by His Excellency President Xi Jinping who is also the general-secretary of the Communist Party of China, CPC, and the central committee and the chairman of the central committee and the military commission. It also remains undisputed fact that coronavirus dramatically declined in both Hubei province and the city of Wuhan where some municipalities have been cleared of coronavirus. Therefore, it is also important as part of education to share what President Xi Jinping has reflected:

At the moment, winning the people's war against the epidemic still requires hard work, Xi said, stressing more efforts to seek solutions through science.

It is not rhetoric as members have tried to do earlier.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 53

Based on the principle of building a community with a shared future of human kind, China is a responsible nation for the Chinese's safety and health. It has a duty to safeguard the global public health. It is very much important that South Africa should as well join the world of nation in terms of sharing the capability. Maybe the hon members from the opposition are not aware that we have a very important high tech testing lab which has been given the status of Biosafety, BS, Level 4 by the World Health Organisation. We have no doubt that South Africa is combat-ready despite the fact that there is a lot of criticism by the opposition who doesn't take it serious because they are not in government. [Interjections.]

We know that it has a very serious impact. Coronavirus can also seriously impact on the public health, the economy and the jobs. We should not place the geopolitical matters on social issues.

Like the Ebola outbreak years ago, as my colleague said earlier, South Africa played a meaningful role that really helped us to make sure that we push back the virus. We have full hope and confident with our government because we know that they can play a meaningful role in playing this global

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 54

epidemic by collaborating with other departments as they are doing it with coronavirus.

It is also very important to indicate that we know that some of the propaganda that is put forward is trying to indicate that it is the government that took a resolution alone. The members of the leadership of Cabinet resolved it out of the request of they themselves and family members. So, we should not even indicate. Hon Minister, it does not worth your time to indicate the venue because it must be declared a national key point. Otherwise when these members arrive they may find the venue occupied by journalists rather than the family members who are supposed to see their next of kin. Thank you very much.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you House Chairperson. Hon members of this House, I want to start by thanking you for the debate. I want to thank the hon Gwarube for raising the matter. It's a matter that is very important. However, I also want to thank the members because you have taken a great sense of responsibility in dealing with this matter. It is the one matter where we cannot afford to be politicking and point scoring, and I think that the approach that you have largely

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 55

taken has been very responsible. I really want to thank you. I think we owe it to the people who have elected us to this House to be very responsible and sensitive in the manner that we deal with this issue.

As you have heard, we have already confirmed the first case that has tested positive for the coronavirus or Covid-19, in KwaZulu-Natal, South Africa. I was informed this morning and I have already briefed the President. This is a person who had travelled to Italy. They were a group of 10 and they returned a few days ago. However, the patient had consulted a general practitioner who, because of the level of collaboration, was aware of the protocol that we have to take. The patient presented with fever, headaches, malaise and sore throat, with not much of a cough. In the process they took a specimen and then they informed the laboratory. This has tested positive. In the meantime, the patient was asked to stay on voluntary home quarantine and now we have a whole team of our emergency operations centre that has gone to identify all the contacts, and to interview the patient and the doctor. A tracer team has landed in KwaZulu-Natal. They are with epidemiologists and clinicians from the National Institute for Communicable Diseases, NICD. The doctor has also self-isolated. So, we have

actually descended on this particular case. We are now tracing the others who may have come back so that we can start widening the net to reach out to all those who could have been exposed and are at risk. We will be testing them, as we have been doing in the past few weeks. Already more than 120 tests have been done on cases where the doctors or the history suggested that we need to do so. Up to this point all of them have been negative.

Therefore, I think it's important that we don't allow panic to set in because the spread of this virus is indeed worrying. In January it was declared a public health emergency of international concern by the World Health Organisation, WHO. That allowed us to activate our emergency operations centre which was working with extra lines for the public as well as the doctors and clinics to be able to get advice. In the context of all of this, we actually said that it would be working from 08:00 to 16:00 but now that the first case has been identified we are going to be running on a 24 hour basis. Therefore, we will be ensuring that very strong contact tracing is in place.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 57

As has been indicated by members, I think we are all aware that at this point about 95 000 people have been infected with this infection, 80 000 of whom are in China, while the other 5 000 are spread in 86 countries plus one territory which is the *Diamond Princess* cruise ship. The major countries that are of concern to us, beyond China, are South Korea which has gone beyond 5 000 members, Italy which is over 2 000 and similarly Iran. The last two are of concern for two reasons. They have more people infected than those that were infected in China at the time it was declared a matter of public emergency, and then of course both Iran and Italy are at that kind of level.

We've seen that there have been drastic actions taken, with a number of countries withdrawing travelling flights into various countries, like into China. However, we've also seen the temporary closure of schools in Italy and some in the UK. All of these are measures also associated with the cancellation of some public events.

In the case of Africa we have noted that of the cases we have got ... about 11 ... 12 with South Africa now ... or as I said in five of those countries people have a history of contact with Italy. So, it's Nigeria, Egypt, Algeria, Morocco,

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 58

Senegal, Tunisia and now South Africa. This is actually important as well because as we looked at the way the pattern of the disease has been going, of the 160 cases in the US, 48 of them had been imported from outside. However, only three came from China with 45 coming from the *Diamond Princess* ship. We have also seen some of those going to different parts of the world.

Now, in our case we have two of our South African citizens on the *Diamond Princess* cruise ship who have tested positive. They have actually been treated and they are now negative. They will be coming back and we said they'll do so via normal commercial airlines. We would like people to accept that they have been treated of the disease. There shouldn't be panic about it. That is the way it's going to happen. The other 10 are going to be left in quarantine for 14 days and when they test negative they will actually all be coming back. If they are positive they'll actually be treated in Japan. We are in daily contact with them, including the doctors that are working with them.

With regard to those that will be coming from Wuhan city and Hubei province, 151 of them are South Africans. We have taken

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 59

the decision to get them to come back mainly because of their request. Included in that team are people who were students who had completed their studies and needed to come back. However, because of their pleas the President and Cabinet have agreed that we must actually bring them over. We said seven to 10 days, so within the next few days they should be coming back. They'll be put in quarantine in South Africa but on takeoff from China they will actually be given protective clothes. There will be the necessary protection like clothes, masks, gloves and so on, to ensure that we test them, and we will be able to look at their things ... their tests as they come back. They will be put in quarantine in a way that will allow us to avoid any further spread. If there were families or groups sharing dormitories they will be together. If not, they will be separate. We are going to be making those details known when they are here. However, the point of the matter is that we have not announced a lot of specifics because we would like the team to get to China and come back, and while they are sorting out all the contractual issues we think it's not necessary to disclose a lot of information.

We are working with the support of the WHO and our scientists here have partnered with the Africa Centres for Disease

UNREVISED HANSARD
NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 60

Control and the Regional Collaborating Centre in Zambia to support the diagnosis of Covid-19 in the Southern African Development Community, SADC, across the continent to facilitate the community practice of clinicians; to share preparedness plans ... [Interjections.] ... relevant ... common to solutions; to participate in the training offered by the ... [Inaudible.]

Dr M Q NDLOZI: House Chairperson? [Inaudible.] Thanks Chair. Can the Minister take a question?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon Minister, are you prepared to take a question?

Dr M Q NDLOZI: With the greatest respect.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: When I'm done with my presentation.

Dr M Q NDLOZI: No, no, no! Now!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): No hon member, the Minister has indicated ...

UNREVISED HANSARD
NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 61

Dr M Q NDLOZI: When are the South Africans from Wuhan coming? When? [Interjections.] Date and time.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon member, take your seat. Continue hon Minister.

An HON MEMBER: Point of order!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: I have said that when announce we have a seven to 10 days' horizon within which that must be done. So, the issue ... I've given seven to 10 days. I think the member must just be patient.

An HON MEMBER: From where?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Colleagues, the next issue we need to address are some basic issues. This issue of Covid-19 is not going to be a matter of government and health services only. The landing of any of the cases in South Africa is not because of the weakness of our health system. It's because of the social interactions that we have with the world, and therefore, when people come into South Africa we just need to

know there are certain basic precautions that we need to take into account.

Firstly is the issue of personal hygiene. Coughing and the controlling of droplet infections become very important. Those issues are quite important. Now, members have raised the very important issues about the shortages of staff and the underfunding on health. We acknowledge all of this but I think we need to understand that our readiness to deal with this is in a matter of emergencies. When cases arise they will be taken to 11 of the hospitals. We have removed Tembisa from these. We will actually be increasing the numbers as we prepare for more patients to come in. So we are ready to deal with those when they land.

However, as we move into the future, I think what is important is to look at the resilience of how we are going to be living with endemic coronavirus that will be in our country. So, all of us must be alert.

You have all been informed as to the issues that relates to precautions at airports. We actually get our Port Health teams to go onto the planes to check all individuals and take

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 63

further training. Those who were alleged to have left their line of duty in Beitbridge have been suspended. We want to send a very serious message that the issue of taking the screening and the prevention of infection is very serious.

The chances are that more people are going to land in South Africa than in most of ... particularly of SADC, and therefore we have to be the ones who are vigilant. We don't have the infection spreading within the local community yet. Therefore, the issue of concerns around transport and the people inside the country is something that we are going to continue watching. However, right now we actually believe that most of the major entries are going to be at the international airports. That is why it's going to be important to deal with that.

Our laboratories are well equipped, and they are reference laboratories able to test and therefore as reference laboratories, we know we will not miss any case. So, at the end of the day we believe we should make sure that we send as much information. I take the member's comment about massive information increasing right now. We are giving daily updates but we are going to increase that quite a bit so that

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 64

information is easily available and that people have the right information. We must fight against fake news and we must fight against the politicisation of this issue. We need to make sure that South Africans are united behind the fight against this particular problem.

We are going to be meeting with clinicians, virologists and epidemiologists in the next three to four days to actually look at how to prepare for the resilience of our system into the future. We also intend to meet with the churches, sports bodies and the hospitality industry because we have to talk about how to approach large gatherings where the possibility of a spread might arise. All of these issues are going to be important for us to deal with.

Therefore, all of the issues that the members are raising ... We have said for example, to Members of Parliament, give us your ideas. Do you believe that South Africa should ban all international conferences into South Africa and stop our members from going all over the world? It's up to you. You need to give us guidance on that because some of the countries have reacted in a way that hasn't necessarily helped in their situations.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 65

However, at the moment we are taking a very responsible approach, guided by the guidelines of the WHO. We are aware of the challenges that our staff are facing. We are going to be addressing that as much as possible. However, we want South Africans to work with government and use the information we share so that they can take responsibility for prevention and ensure their own safety in this kind of outbreak. It is therefore important for the members in this House to go and visit these facilities ... our ports of entry. You are welcome to go and look at these. You are welcome to do that. I'm aware that the portfolio committee is looking at that.

So, I take all of the issues with regard to weaknesses in the system. You bring to our attention what needs to be corrected. At that point we will all be working together to fight coronavirus. Like all the other countries, we are going to live with coronavirus. I think we need to be upfront about it. Like all the other countries, our system will be tested by the impact of coronavirus. Like all the other countries, we have to work together and unite to fight against this new infection. Not much is known about it but the more we unite the better we will be able to fight it. Thank you very much.

[Applause.]

UNREVISED HANSARD
NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 66

STRENGTHENING LOCAL GOVERNMENT FOR GOOD GOVERNANCE

(Subject for discussion)

IsiXhosa:

Mnu G G MPUMZA: Sihlalo weNdlu yoWiso-mthetho yeSizwe, ndikahlele nakumalungu ahloniphekileyo eNdlu. Sihlalo, silapha size kothula udondolo nolwamvila lokuhlangula, luhlasele, luciciyele iimbandezelo, iinzingo nemiceli-mngeni elibazisa ncakasana urhulumento gabalala norhulumento lwaseMakhaya, ukuze iinkonzo zikhawuleze ukuza kuluntu lwaseMzantsi Afrika.

Ndivumele ke Sihlalo ukuba kule ntetho yam ndicaphule kwenye yeengwevu zomzabalazo eyaphuma iimpondo, ubawo uNelson Mandela,

English:

I have taken a moment here to rest, to steal a view of the glorious vista that surrounds me, to look back on the distance I have come. But I can only rest for a moment,

UNREVISED HANSARD
NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 67

for with freedom come responsibilities, and I dare not linger, for my long walk is not ended.

The ANC-led government has in the past year taken that glorious vista and diagnosed service delivery challenges which often deprive society of quality and meaningful service delivery.

In line with addressing these challenges, President Cyril Ramaphosa has, in October 2019, launched the District Development Model, DDM, to accelerate service delivery and job creation. This system will be piloted in 44 district municipalities and eight metros; and it has already been launched in three district municipalities: OR Tambo, Waterberg and Ethekewini. The model of the system requires planning, alignment across all spheres of government to drive a developmental local government indeed. This means that national, provincial and local government must develop one plan and one budget for each district across the country.

The ANC, therefore, appeals to society and traditional leaders to support the District Development Model and be integrally

UNREVISED HANSARD
NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 68

involved with community processes that will drive local development.

Last week the President met with the premiers of the nine provinces and mayors of 44 districts and eight metropolitan municipalities to assess the progress of District Development Model. The ANC is pleased that the meeting received a report on the pilot projects currently underway and adopted the programme of action to launch the model in a further 23 districts during the 2020 calendar year.

The implementation of this model will critically assist local government in striving to achieve the maximising social development and economic growth; as well as the better promise of the White Paper in continuing to democratise development, empower and redistribute within communities and across sectors. So, it is, therefore, paramount and important that as this model is being rolled out, leading and learning must characterise the processes in that area so that, indeed, we might say we are creating a democratic cohesive society.

If South Africa is to address the triple challenges of poverty, inequality and unemployment, it needs a state that is

capable of playing a transformative and developmental role; and indeed, the development model is the way. For South Africa to realise the vision 2030 it requires collaboration between all sections of society and a strong leadership by government to discharge and implement this particular model.

The model will go a long way in strengthening the existing intergovernmental relations in this way: there's a need for strengthening and alignment of the already existing intergovernmental co-ordination and collaboration. South Africa needs a more predictable and co-ordinated system of how macro policies and priorities are set, and indeed translated into integrated planning instruments and how budgets are developed, deployed and implemented within and across spheres of government.

A clear and progressive strategy is needed to address weak vertical macro policy co-ordination across spheres of government and strengthen the horizontal collaboration across departments and agencies of government so that we dismiss the myth of misunderstanding.

UNREVISED HANSARD
NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 70

Co-operative governance legislation must be enacted to deal with issues relating to: the efficiency of the provincial and national government support to local government and provinces.

Chairperson, as I have indicated earlier on that ...

IsiXhosa:

... siza nodondolo nolwamvila, lokuciciyela, luhlasele, lubulale zonke iimbandezelo ukuze urhulumente abaleke ngesantya esiphezulu ukusa iinkonzo ebantwini.

English:

There's an urgent need to address issues of capability and capacity of the state; and these should be understood separately. Of course, capability of structures, processes, systems as well as governance instruments at macro levels, would assist us to bring about a matrix of required skills to ensure that, indeed, the machinery of the state is moving with speed.

Chairperson, the challenges faced by local government will, indeed, be defeated in a matter of time and very soon they're going to be matters of the past. I thank you. [Applause.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 71

Mr M H HOOSEN: Hon Mpumza, your party has been in governance for 25years and you didn't fix it and you want us to believe you are going to fix it very soon. Chairperson, it is going to take much more than a 90 minutes debate to reverse the 25years of decline and corruption if we want to strengthen local government in our country. Notwithstanding the fact that more people today have access to basic services than they did 25years ago. There are some harsh realities that we must all be faced up to. The first reality is that local government in South Africa is in a mess. Even the word crisis I am afraid is being polite. It is mostly because of the following three main factors. Poor management, lack of accountability and internal political party dynamics and infighting.

Most of the 257 municipalities are in a disastrous financial state, many of them cannot collect revenue nor can they even pay their bills or staff salaries on time. More than a third of our municipalities are not financially viable and technically bankrupt and as a result, they cannot provide basic services like the delivery of clean water. Who would have thought after 25years of democracy that they would still be communities in our country that still do not have access to water. But the rot starts at the top.

The Department of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs, Cogta, has once again received a poor audit outcome from the Auditor-General, not only was that Report late but, it also reads like a horror movie.

Let me tell you about the Community Work Programme, CWP, that the department has implemented 10 years ago. It spends billions of rands every year, and the intended purpose of providing basic employment and support opportunities for the poor was a very good one initially. But like most government programmes, the CWP, has also created an opportunity for vultures to feed. Billions of rand have been siphoned off through the CWP where thousand of people are being paid to sit at home and do nothing.

If you think that is bad, listen to this. The department also pays people in the CWP who have died a long time ago. Someone has been recruiting unemployed people in the graveyard. Then there are government employees who are also cashing in on the programme and are being paid every month as CWP workers but they do nothing. They just sit and collect cash every month. If you ask Cogta to give you a report on the benefits of this programme over the last decade, after investing billions of

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 73

rand, they will tell you that they haven't even done such an analysis, they just hand out cash to dead people every month.

The CWP must be scrapped because it is not achieving its intended purpose. We also know that the governing party uses this programme to employ their field workers so that the governing party can use them in the elections. When they choose not to work, they are threatened that their stipends will come to an end. But to be fair, the Minister of Cogta has been honest about some of these shortcomings and we look forward her interventions to bring this madness to an end.

Chairperson, every year without fail, the AG points out billions of rands that are wasted by our municipalities and over the last ten years the situation has worsened. Although many municipalities have been making some progress expanding the delivery of services to more communities, we would have been able to achieve much more if politicians and officials were not stealing billions of rands through tender fraud and corruption.

Just this week, Cogta presented a sample of forensic report under investigation in municipalities across the country. That

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 74

amount under investigation is more than one and half billion rand. There are cases where people have received hundreds of million of rands for delivery of basic service, infrastructure and nothing has been delivered. Yet they have been paid in advance. We have a massive problem with local government in our country and most municipalities cannot manage their finances. Fraud and corruption has become an institutionalised culture, human waste is flowing on the streets in many towns and cities, water pipes are bursting on a daily basis because they have not been maintained, rural communities still have to use the bush for toilets and all because city officials and politicians are colluding with business to steal our money. While all this is happening, officials are receiving performance awards in cash. Instead of being fired, people are receiving handsome bonuses.

Whether my colleagues in the governing party like to admit it or not, the fact remains that they are struggling to manage our municipalities in our country. Whether they like to admit it or not the DA-run municipalities do a much better job.

[Applause.] Because we don't steal people's money and we take action when people fail. This is proven by the AG when he revealed - I will tell you where, listen - out of the 18

UNREVISED HANSARD
NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 75

municipalities that received a clean audit, 12 of them come from the DA.

In about a year from now, South Africans will once again have an opportunity to elect the government of their choice. Its an opportunity to correct the direction we are moving and we are appealing to people in South Africa not to vote this corrupt ANC into power again because you will get the same result as you did for the last 25years. Thank you very much. [Time Expired] [Applause.]

Ms O M C MAOTWE: Chairperson, there is no DA that is doing anything good. Take a look at Tshwane and Johannesburg, they have failed!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Order, hon members order!

Ms O M C MAOTWE: Chair, allow me to greet the Deputy President ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Order hon members!

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 76

Ms O M C MAOTWE: ... of the mighty EFF commissar Floyd Shivambu, who is leading the battalion of the EFF, at the centre of the crisis of local government in South Africa ...
[Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon member, will you just stop there please. Hon members to my left you are allowed to interject but you are not allowed to drown the speaker at the podium with your noise. Give the speaker at the podium the necessary opportunity deliver her speech, continue hon member.

Ms D M C MAOTWE: ... howling is all they know Chair. But at the centre of the crisis of local government is poor conceptualisation of the local state. The manner in which local government is conceived, conceptualised and implemented is at the centre of why the local government is in the state of perennial underdevelopment.

The local state, its institutions and funding model place local government as the hated step-cousin of the South African state. In all budgets and divisions of revenue, the local state is the recipient of less than 10% of the entire budget,

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 77

despite the fact that local government is the cold face of service delivery and provision of basic services.

The reason why total government receives less than 10% of the budget is based on the Western nations developed practice and phenomenon that local municipalities can and should generate their own revenue. The reality is that an absolute majority of municipalities cannot collect their own revenue because there is no revenue base. In many areas, more than 70% of South African economy and revenue base comes from three provinces. The conditional grants method of infrastructural development is inadequate and cannot cover the massive infrastructure backlogs in many municipalities.

Chair, black people continue to live in squatter camps and space less townships created as labour concentration camps, and the ruling party has failed to change any of these places into decent places of resident for our people. With the current shape of local government, our people will remain absolute poverty.

The talk about District Development Model is hot air that is why the Minister of Finance in his budget said nothing about

it. As long as local government continues to receive less than 10% of the budget, the local state and communities will remain in permanent underdevelopment and poverty. We have raised this matter since the arrival of the EFF in Parliament at the beginning of the 5th Parliament and every time the Minister of Finance tables the Division of Revenue Bill, we stand here and raise the matter. The Minister of Finance stood here last year and tabled yet another Division of Revenue Bill and continues to present the same budget. Local government continues to get less than 10% of the revenue raised nationally. There is no other way of fixing and strengthening local government without fixing the allocation of the Revenue Bill.

Within the 90days, people of Tshwane where I come from, are going to be electing the new municipality and the EFF is going to come out victorious. We welcome the dissolution of the City of Tshwane Metropolitan Municipality, it is long-overdue. The City of Tshwane Metropolitan Municipality has been long directionless, so the EFF is going to give direction to the running of the business in Tshwane. The EFF is going to be in governance in the in City of Tshwane Metropolitan Municipality the 90days. Minister, whether you like it or not the people of Mandela Village, Marikana, Mamelodi, Soshanguve, Ga-Rankuwa,

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 79

Atteridgeville, the students in Sunnyside, Hatfield, Centurion are going to vote for the EFF and the mayor of EFF, since the municipality council has been dissolved.

We want to put it on record that the EFF is ready to govern and the people of Tshwane are going to attain economic freedom in the next 90days. In our first 100days as the governing party in Tshwane, we are going to do the following and listen carefully! We are going to buy 70% of everything that the municipality uses from local suppliers, from manufactures in Rosslyn, Silverton and factories in Gezina. We are going to pass a council resolution to make sure that all clinics in Tshwane are open 24 hours a day.

We are going to clean all townships in particular entrances and central points because the city is very dirty, the DA can't even clean - the simplest thing to do, hygiene! They are putting the lives of people Tshwane in danger.

We are going to build day-care centres in all the wards that do not have day-care centres including abandoned municipal buildings that are just a waste. We are going to make sure that the people of Tshwane, Hammanskraal receive clean and

UNREVISED HANSARD
NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 80

drinkable water, something that the ANC failed to do in the 25years in government.

We are going to build proper dumping sites for people of Mamelodi, we are going to put proper security to deal with cable theft in Soshanguve and Hamanskraal for the smooth running of all the trains. We are going to formalise Mandela Village, Mooiplaas, Marikana, Temba, Winterveld, Mbokozi and all the informal settlements. We are going to make sure that there is water, roads, sanitation and housing. We are appealing to all the people of Tshwane to vote the EFF in the next 90days. Thank you, Chair.

Dr M Q NDLOZI: House Chair, you can entertain that irrelevant point of order. You can come now.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): All I can say is that I can see that the next 90days in Tshwane will be very eventful.

IsiZulu:

Mnu B N LUTHULI: Ngiyabonga Sihlalo, iNingizimu Afrika yizwe elinezinhlanga eziningi futhi ezahlukene ngokwamasiko

UNREVISED HANSARD
NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 81

nangokomnotho. Ngenxa kwalokho kuqondakala ukuthi kube nendlela eqinile yokuphatha lezi zinhlanga. Lokhu kuyosiza ukuba izinguquko namaphupho kuleyo miphakathi ...

[Ubuwelewele.]

Lo Mnyango unguMnyango ukuba uthuthukise ukusebenza kohulumeni basekhaya nezindawo ukuze balethe izinguquko ngempumelelo ngoba yilowo kanye umsebenzi wohulumeni basekhaya. Lokho sikugcizelela ngoba yibona ohulumeni abasondele kakhulu ebantwini.

Uma sikhuluma ngokuqiniswa kohulumeni bezindawo zasemakhaya kumele sikugcizelele ukuthi i-IFP selokhu kwathi nhlo iyakwesekela ukunikezwa kwamandla ezinhakeni eziseduze nemiphakathi kanye nokuvumelana ukuthi ukuba lolo nalolo hlanga lubuswa ngendlela ehambisana namasiko alo. Lokho kusemqoka kakhulu kuhulumeni basekhaya ngoba yileyo miphakathi esiqonda kangcono isimo ephila ngaphansi kwaso.

Izidingo zalowo nalowo mphakathi zincike ikakhulu kubaholi bomdabu, njengoba abantu abaningi abasezabelweni bakhe ezindaweni zobuholi bomdabu. Ngakho ke siyacela kuNgqongqoshe ukuba anike abaholi bomdabu amandla ngoba amandla mancane

UNREVISED HANSARD
NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 82

okuba bafake isandla kohulumeni basekhaya ikakhulukazi komasipala.

Kuyamangalisa ke ukuthi le ngxoxo siyixoxa ngesikhathi lapho kunemibiko evele ekomidini, esibikela ngokusetshenziswa kwezimali okungalandelwanga umthetho komasipala. Bahlanu ke omasipala abahlonzwe njengomasipala ababi kakhulu. Asebe ... [Kwaphela isikhathi.]

Afrikaans:

Mnr I M GROENEWALD: Agb Huisvoorsitter, die sukses van plaaslike regering is 'n regering wat logiese benadering het met eenvoudige oplossings.

English:

Local government has two main concepts: Responsive and accountable local governance as key development actors and nodal point for the delivery of services to the poor; and a vibrant civil society that includes the private sector, that is enabled to play its dual role as partner in development and as countervailing force with the capacity to demand rights, transparency and accountability.

UNREVISED HANSARD
NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 83

To establish responsive and accountable local government you need ingredients to the likes of existing and quality of accountability mechanisms; institutional and organisational set ups for the local governance process; improvement of local finances and that includes the willingness of citizens to pay taxes; and lastly, mechanisms for exchange of information and dialogue.

Therefore, can local governance be defined as the way in which power and authority are exercised at local level? The Freedom Front Plus is of the view that the only way to achieve this is to bring the power and authority closer to the people through smaller community driven municipalities.

In South Africa we lack in all ingredients. There is none to little responsiveness from any municipality, and when we look at the Auditor-General's reports on municipalities all over South Africa it is found that there is little consequence management.

Municipalities are not a player in developing the economy, but rather an obstacle. South Africa's municipal financial management is rotten and getting even worse. The best people

for the job that are qualified and able, prefer to work in the private sector, not because of better salaries because in the public sector they would have received double the norm, it is rather because they do not want the stigma of "corrupt official" to cling to them.

Municipal expenditure does not give value to the taxpayer and it is starting to create a resistance from taxpayers to pay for services. There are mechanisms in place for exchange of information, but the employees of municipalities are not willing to do the necessary to assist in giving the information. They rather send the taxpayers from one point to the next until they are fed up.

Therefore, some of the municipal staff lack basic work ethics and a real commitment to serve. The taxpayer is, after all, the one that pay their salaries through paying for services.

Municipalities are inaccessible and unresponsive to the needs of their taxpayers. An example of this is where the Matlosana Local Municipality in North West sent to residents service accounts that are difficult to understand and do not comply with the Consumer Protection Act.

UNREVISED HANSARD
NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 85

When complaints are laid at the Consumer Commission for investigation, the commission does not even make an effort in responding to such claims. Taxpayers that are being sucked dry by municipalities are not being treated like clients to whom a service must be rendered. They are abused and mistreated. What a disgrace that is!

We can have a lengthy discussion on strengthening local government due to all the flaws and non compliance. There are laws and prescripts in place, but according to the Auditor-General, there is a lack of political will to bring culprits to book like the fact that the Minister of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs, Cogta, is not even in the House today while we debate local government.

There is only one change that will bring about great improvement in the local government sphere and that one change is to remove the ANC from power. Thank you. [Applause.]

Ms T MARAWU: Thank you very much, Chairperson. The local government sphere is one of the very important spheres of government. It is where the tyre touches the tar. The last report by the auditor-general, Mr Kimi Makwetu, for the

THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 86

financial year 2017-18, reported yet another regrettable set of municipal audit results that showed an overall decline in audit results. The auditor-general made some scathing remarks lamenting the undesirable state of deteriorating audit outcomes which shows that various local government role players have been slow in implementing and in many instances even disregarded the audit office's recommendations.

Consequently, the accountability for financial and performance management continues to worsen in most municipalities. The ATM awaits the 2018-19 results with trepidation given the rampant corruption in the municipalities, some of which had to be put under administration. We fully support the investigation which is done by Special Investigating Units, SIUs, in different municipalities but the unfortunate situation is that no one is monitoring the recommendations from the SIUs offices. So, the recommendations are just gathering dust in municipal managers' offices or the mayors' offices.

The ATM welcomes the new amendments of the Public Audit Act, which became effective on 01 April 2019. However, we are making a special plea that the sooner the better that office is capacitated so that it has enough personnel to roll out

UNREVISED HANSARD
NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 87

these amendments. The earlier the better that this is implemented cutting across all municipalities that will save us all. In addition, the ATM supports the call by the auditor-general that the portfolio committee should identify preventative controls and monitor them on quarterly basis. We are therefore recommending to the committee to have at least quarterly meetings with all municipal financial oversight bodies; your Municipal and provincial executive councils, Mpecs, your internal and external audit committees so that it can get early warning signs on any corrupt activities that may take place in that municipality.

Again, at least once per quarter that committee must monitor the implementation of all the recommendations from the SIU. That can at least ease one of the problems the municipalities are experiencing. More stringent oversight will ensure that the public purse is protected. Thank you.

Mr B M HADEBE: Thank you, hon Chair. Let me start with the EFF, in Tshwane we are in this mess because of your unholy alliance with the Democratic Alliance. After the 2016 local government elections you said that you will choose the better devil, a white liberal party, to you is a better devil. You

UNREVISED HANSARD
NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 88

entered into a devil alliance with the Democratic Alliance.
All because of your uncontrollable desire for power.

That was when I realised that you are suffering from what we call "identity crisis" In fact, they had a multiple choice of principle, you were to choose from (a) to (e), (e) being none of the above. If I were to summarise you in a song, the relevant song for you is that of Trompies, *Madibuseng*; ... sometimes you green sometimes you red sometimes you orange...

Township lingo:

... uyasidrayisela [you blow hot and cold.]

English:

Let me come to you ... [Interjections.] ... that was just in passing. Let me deal with the DA ... [Interjections.] ...

Dr M Q NDLOZI: ...hey Chair ... Chair!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Hon member, Hadebe
...

Mr B M HADEBE: Yes.

UNREVISED HANSARD
NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 89

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Hon Hadebe, can you take your seat.

Mr B M HADEBE: Thank you, Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Hon member, why are you rising?

Dr M Q NDLOZI: I am rising on a point of order, Chairperson. Young people must quote high literature not songs, man.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): ... hon member!

Dr M Q NDLOZI: ... Trompies! ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): ... hon member, hon Ndlozi! That is not a point of order, seat ...

Dr M Q NDLOZI: ... quote high literature, show us that you are well read ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): ... hon Ndlozi ...

UNREVISED HANSARD
NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 90

Dr M Q NDLOZI: ... not Trompies! Aaa ...

IsiXhosa:

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): ... hlala phantsi.

AN HON MEMBER: House Chair ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): ... that's not a point of order... that is not a point of order ...

IsiXhosa:

... hlala phantsi.

AN HON MEMBER: House Chair ...

Mr B M HADEBE: I am not shaken nor threatened ...

AN HON MEMBER: House Chair!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): There is a hand ... hon Hadebe, can you please, take your seat. Hon member ...

UNREVISED HANSARD
NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 91

AN HON MEMBER: Will the member take a question after his speech?

Mr B M HADEBE: Yes. No, hon Ndlozi, I am not threatened nor shaken.

IsiXhosa:

NgesiXhosa kuthiwa, zikhonkotha ehambayo.

English:

So, you have to stand up and ...

IsiXhosa:

... ukhonkothe.

English:

Hon Hoosen, I didn't know that you can be economical with the truth. I was expecting you to stand up and tell this august House that the hon Minister of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs, Cogta, hon Nkosazana Dlamini-Zuma, has taken the bull by its horn and placed the director-general under suspension. In the next two months we will be appointing the new director-general in the department. Secondly, Cogta

UNREVISED HANSARD
NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 92

took a conscious decision to remodel the programme. You are not telling the committee that, you are economical with the truth.

Let me go back to my speech. That was just by-the-way. ...
[Interjections.] ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Hon members, give the speaker on the podium a chance.

Mr B M HADEBE: Hon Chair, despite enormous gains that have been made since the inception of democracy in 1994, the ANC acknowledges that South Africa is still faced with immense challenges when it comes to service delivery. The ANC as the political party that derives its approach to state power from the Freedom Charter has always encouraged and expected those that are deployed in the public offices to put concerns of the people first. In this regard the ANC expects nothing less than progressive quality service delivery. Sadly, things are not where the ANC would want them to be. Pockets of poor service delivery still continues and the above has led to service delivery protests in municipalities like; Maluti-a-Phofung Local Municipality, Enoch Mgijima Local Municipality, Makana

UNREVISED HANSARD
NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 93

Local Municipality and Dr J S Moroka Local Municipality to mention but a few.

Chairperson, section 139 of the Constitution prescribes the manner and instances on which the provincial executive may intervene in municipalities when a municipal council or the municipal administration fails to execute their executive obligations in terms of the Constitution or legislation, as the case in Tshwane. Hon Chair, to this end, more than 24 municipalities have been placed under administration since 2016 local government elections. As the ANC ...

IsiXhosa:

... ndithe ngesiXhosa, zikhonkotha ehambayo.

English:

As the ANC we welcome and support the steps taken by the provincial executive in relation to section 139. Tough and harsh lessons are being learnt along these processes. They range from weak internal controls, poor supply chain management systems, poor internal audit, lack of consequence management and lack of sound financial management.

Chairperson, responding to the above challenges and dealing firmly and decisively with corruption while enhancing good and corporate governance, the Public Audit Amendment Bill was signed in into law by His Excellency; President Cyril Ramaphosa, and was subsequently gazetted on 29 March 2019.

The law gives the office of the auditor-general more powers to act on officials and employees who waste taxpayers' money as well as those who deliberately refuse to act against the culprit.

Key highlights of these amendments ranges from: the auditor-general may now refer any suspected material irregularities to relevant public body for investigation; the auditor-general has powers to issue remedial actions when recommendations are not implemented; the auditor-general can issue directives to accounting officer and accounting authority to determine and recover losses, and most importantly, the auditor-general can now issue a certificate of debt to accounting officers and accounting authorities for repayment, the certificate of debt must also be issued to relevant legislation in this regard.

This is a very clear and unequivocal message that this

UNREVISED HANSARD
NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 95

administration will stop at nothing in dealing firmly with corruption.

Hon Chair, since the signing of the proclamation by President Ramaphosa, more than 72 criminal cases were opened either by municipalities or provinces with the SA Police Service, SAPS, and the Hawks for further processing. The disciplinary actions instituted on more than 57 forensic reports and 86 cases are already in court. Chair, poor financial management undermine the capacity of local government to provide quality services to all residents, especially the poor.

Now, let me deal with the DA, this notion that the City of Cape Town is a well-governed city it only exists in the figmentation of your imagination. Tell no lies and claim no easy victories. The last time City of Cape Town received a clean audit outcome was under the hands and the administration of the hon Patricia De Lille.

Hon Chair, for the financial year of 2018-19 the City of Cape Town recorded material underspending on its capital budget worth R2,4 billion. On their capital budget which is supposed to be the infrastructure investment, the City of Cape Town was

UNREVISED HANSARD
NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 96

unable to spend R1,3 billion - can I continue? The City of Cape Town incurred more than R900 million of irregular expenditure. These irregular expenditures were due to noncompliance with supply chain management. The auditor-general further highlighted that, there were no reasonable steps taken by the City of Cape Town to prevent these irregular expenditures. You know why? Some family members of the City of Cape Town ... [Interjections.] ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): ... are you raising a hand, hon member?

Mr G G HILL-LEWIS: Will he ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): ... no, hon member, have you raised ... I can see you are raising a hand, I just saw you standing. Hon Hill-Lewis, why are you ...

Mr G G HILL-LEWIS: ... will he take a question?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Hon member, would you take a question?

UNREVISED HANSARD
NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 97

IsiXhosa:

Mnu B M HADEBE: Ndiyaqhuba ngoku khawume kancinci

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Thank you, he will not take it, hon member. Hon members ...

IsiXhosa:

... phantsi.

Mr B M HADEBE: The auditor-general further highlighted that, no reasonable steps were taken to prevent these irregular expenditure precisely because some family members of the City of Cape Town employees were awarded contracts and they are doing business with the with the city and they have failed to disclose such interests.

Secondly, bid specifications of some tenders were drafted in a biased manner and did not allow all potential suppliers to offer their goods or services, which is in contravention with the bid regulations. The worse part of all is that this similar noncompliance was also reported in the previous financial year. It is clear that in the City of Cape Town led by the DA ...

UNREVISED HANSARD
NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 98

IsiXhosa:

... kukwavula zibhuqe nje,

IsiZulu:

... uthelawayeka, umhlambi kazalusile.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): ... hon members, order! Do not drown the speaker, please.

Mr B M HADEBE: I told you I will expose you. There is a saying that goes: "You can fool all the people some of the time and some of the people all the time, but you cannot fool all the people all the time"

Hon Chair, we are not fabricating stories when we say DA is a white-male dominated liberal party that does not cater for the working class and the poor. In the City of Cape Town under DA administration, the top and senior management levels are still hugely over represented by white males. I have the Employment Equity Act Report, which speaks to that, yet, according to the demographics of Cape Town whites constitutes only 15,7% of the population but when ... [Interjections.] ... the devil is in the details. Top senior management, the report signed by the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 99

City of Cape Town indicates that black females are underrepresented in this occupational level.

Senior management level; African males, African females and Coloured females are underrepresented. The third professional level - professionally qualified middle management African males, African females and African Coloureds are underrepresented. White males show a huge degree of over representation. I am not done.

Skilled technical and academically qualified junior management, all females are underrepresented, African and Indian males are underrepresented. White males are over represented. The figures and numbers don't lie. Hon Chair, in the City of Cape Town, the vacancy rate is shocking and alarming. As of the end of February 2020, the total permanent number of vacancy fully funded posts, they were sitting at 3 424 worth R1,5 billion. You did not fill 3 424 posts. Let me break down these posts to you; 1 274 are in the Directorate of Water and Waste, 713 posts are in the Directorate of Safety and Security, 424 posts are in the Directorate of Community Service and Health.

UNREVISED HANSARD
NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 100

All these above directorates are meant to service the working class and the poor; yet, you have safety and security that contributes 713 vacancy rates while according to the latest police crime statistics, six out of 10 worse murder areas are in Cape Town, Nyanga and Gugulethu. Yet, you are ...

Mr G G HILL-LEWIS: ... oh! Please, would you take a question?

Mr B M HADEBE: ... yet you cannot fill vacancies ...

Mr G G HILL-LEWIS: ... take a question ... blatant lies. Won't you take a question on blatant lies?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Hon Hill-Lewis ...

Mr G G HILL-LEWIS: ... won't he take a question on his blatant mistruths?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Hon members, I can not hear what hon Hill-Lewis is saying because of the noise.

Could you, please, lower your voices? Hon Hill-Lewis, what is your point of order?

UNREVISED HANSARD
NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 101

Mr G G HILL-LEWIS: Won't he please take a question on his blatant untruths?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Hon Hadebe, would you take a question?

Mr B M HADEBE: Chair ...

IsiXhosa:

... ndiyaqhuba ngoku...

English:

... I will leave these with you, for ... [Inaudible.] ...

Mr G G HILL-LEWIS: ... you are a coward, coward!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): ... please, please, take your seat, hon Hill-Lewis.

Mr B M HADEBE: Chair, lastly to demonstrate the skewed allocation of resources and that the City of Cape Town is a tale of two cities; the one for the rich and the one for the poor, in Khayelitsha and Nyanga combined with more than 12

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 102

wards, they only have 30 closed-circuit television, CCTV, cameras. Compare that with only two wards in the city centre, wards 77 and 115, with 118 CCTV cameras. Nyanga, the number one crime ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): ... thank you, hon member. Your time has expired.

Mr B M HADEBE: Thank you. [Applause.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Hon Hadebe, there was a request from hon Papo, whether you would take a question ... whether ... [Interjections.] ... no, no, just a second ... whether you would take a question at the end of your speech? So, I just want to bring it to the attention of the House that, a member cannot take a question after his speech. It can only be during his speech or not at all. I just wanted to bring that to your attention.

Dr M Q NDLOZI: Chairperson, I really want to thank you. I want to appreciate the orientation you are giving to comrade Hope. He doesn't learn ...

UNREVISED HANSARD
NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 103

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): ... hon Ndlozi! ...

Dr M Q NDLOZI: ... comrade Hope! He is hopeless.

Mr S N AUGUST: Hon Chair, while corruption at national departments, state-owned entities and in the criminal justice system has hogged the state capture limelight, captured municipalities have largely flown under the radar.

Yet, just about every week, we read stories of the collapse of service delivery, and the devastating impact this has on the day-to-day lives of ordinary South Africans – in particular on the poor.

Those of us fortunate enough to have jobs can mitigate the impacts of disservice on our lives. We can afford to buy solar lighting, install water filtration systems and employ people to pick up our trash. But those on the margins have no such shock absorbers.

They live at the mercy of a system which is letting them down. Soon after establishing GOOD, we set up a simple corruption hotline for people to report suspected irregularities.

UNREVISED HANSARD
NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 104

Every day, we receive new allegations about politicians and government officials more intent on lining their own pockets rather than serving their people and Constitution. This information does not just relate to ANC-led municipalities, such as eThekweni, as the DA would have us believe.

In the DA-led George Municipality, in the Western Cape, we have seen cases of electricity theft by councillors, cadre deployment and a family member of a councillor benefiting from the transfer of municipal funds. We took this dossier to the Public Protector and await action from that office.

In Johannesburg, we have asked the City's Integrity Committee to establish the reasons for the under-valuation of commercial property and loss of rates revenue.

GOOD has proven that good governance is possible. Our leader Patricia de Lille has implemented practical steps in her capacity as Minister of Public Works and Infrastructure to demonstrate integrity, accountability and transparency.

In her previous position as Mayor of Cape Town, she demonstrated that consistent clean audits are not

unachievable. That is good governance in action. There is only one goal for local government, and that is to equip municipalities with the capacity and resources to enable effective service delivery that upholds the dignity of South Africans. Citizens are not powerless bystanders: They must use next year's vote to red-card councillors, mayors and parties lacking the honesty and integrity to pursue people's priorities.

We have seen in Tshwane that the raw sewage flows into the rivers of Tshwane. We have seen that the waste water treatment only works at 40%.

We have seen in Giyani that there is no water in Limpopo.

We have seen that many municipalities throughout the country uses government funding not on projects or EPWP, but to pay salaries for officials. Thank you. [Time expired.]

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Thank you, hon House Chair. I think what is very clear here, what we have heard today is political parties bashing each other about the challenges that we face at local government level. It's correct that all political parties

wherever you govern there are challenges. So, coming here and insulting one another in the expense of the other does not solve the problem.

You know, coming back to what you were as the EFF, they are correct and give them credit for this, when they say they will clean up the streets, they are correct because they are already on those overalls. [Laughter] [Applause.] Now, they are already on those overalls. [Interjections.]

Now remember, it's this EFF that is talking to you about the corruption, right. They are talking about it. But yet the VBS Bank, the bankrupt state of Limpopo province which was caused by the leadership. Let me tell you why they have a dispute with the DA, because they want to get their hands on the resources in this area. That's why they are fighting the DA. That's why they are not willing to work with the DA anymore. Remember, they didn't ask for a position of the mayor, they ask for a position of the municipal manager. Ask yourselves why they ask for these things. Why do they want the position of the director? That is the cracks of the problem.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 107

But coming back to the problems we have in the country.

[Interjections.] Thank you. The solutions are as follows: They need to be greater oversight particularly by the Department of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs. You need to ensure that those who employ have the capacity and the capabilities to do it, highest level of integrity. The budget process should start from the ground not a top down approach, but from down to top approach so that you can listen to the needs of the people and prioritise accordingly.

Let me just say something very quickly about clean and unqualified audit. More often it's not even worth the paper it's written on because if you know how to manipulate your books you will get an unqualified and clean audit every year. So, let us be mindful of that. If you are a master in that you will know how to do it. So, let us not go there. But let's talk about the delivery of services to the people who need to benefit from this thing. So, the other thing we are saying is, local government and the structures that are there, you are all aware of the high pricing that takes place particularly with tenders. You need to play a role and ensure there is transparency that the prizes are market related, that not

UNREVISED HANSARD
NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 108

escalated ten times and twenty times. There is a lot more that you can deliver to the people on the ground.

So, I think what it calls for, the fact that we have admitted here that there are challenges all over, let us work together and address those challenges so that we could put measures in place that will create a better society for our people.

Ms G OPPERMAN: Chairperson, according to the Auditor-General, the overarching reason for the continuously poor local government performance is lack of accountability, coupled with poor leadership, without any appetite and blatant disregard to implement these recommendations. Yet at the root of this culture of non accountability, lies the Achilles heel of local government, the cantankerous culture of political patronage and cronyism called cadre deployment. [Applause.]

If we are serious about finding the cure, we should treat the cause not the symptoms.

Afrikaans:

Reeds in 2008 het die Hoogeregshof oor die onwettigheid en ongrondwetlikheid van kaderontplooiing uitspraak gelewer.

UNREVISED HANSARD
NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020
Page: 109

English:

Leave to appeal was denied and no petition to appeal was ever launched, so the ruling stands! Yet the practice of cadre deployment continues unabated, but now qualifications criteria will be implemented for the ANC loyalists on the list. What blatant disregard for the rule of law when you continue to act as if you are above the law.

The state of regress, distress, and dysfunctional within local government is a national crisis. It is a national crisis when the state owes itself more than R10 billion.

It is a national crisis when non compliance with key legislation is at a record high since 2011-12. It is a national crisis when 24 municipalities are currently under administration and that is nothing to brag about. It's a national crisis when 128 municipalities need urgent national intervention.

It's a national crisis when 18 out of the 257 municipalities received clean audits, and very interesting that 12 of the 18 clean audits comes from the DA governed Western Cape.

[Applause.] Hon Hoosen already mentioned that more than

UNREVISED HANSARD
NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 110

R600 000 was paid out to diseased participants but discipline still on the payroll of CWP.

But even more shockingly, more than R5 million was paid to non-qualifying government employees who are beneficiaries on this programme.

Afrikaans:

Hulle sê 'n vis vrot van sy kop af, daarom kom dit as geen skok dat ses senior amptenare binne die nasionale Departement van Samewerkende Regering, insluitende die waarnemende direkteur, die adjunkdirekteur, die hoof-finansiële beampte en die senior staatsrekenmeester, miljoene aan 'n verkeerde entiteit oorbetaal het nie. Twee het reeds skuldig gepleit, en sal nou beloon word met 'n pos in n ander staatsdepartement.
[Tyd verstreke.] [Applous.]

Mr M P GALO: Thank you, hon Chair. Local government is the heartbeat of service delivery in our country. It is the pulse of our creative spirit. South Africa's 44 districts municipalities and eight metropolitans must not only be strengthened but also synergised to achieve a common purpose. The district development model is but one of the raft measures

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 111

we can use to improve significantly local governance. What must underpin sound local government economic planning should be a model which will address the lack of co-ordination, planning and coherence of the local government structures. To begin with, municipalities must be vetoed from making investments without approval from the Minister of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs, Cogta. The Venda Building Society, VBS, corruption has, somehow, taught us gainful lessons.

The enforcement of the Public Audit Amendment Act must start in the local government. Municipal managers, as accounting authorities, must be issued with certificate of debt in cases related material irregularity in their municipalities. The Audit Amendment Act defines what these irregularities are. We need to bolster sound and accountable local governance.

In conclusion, the practice of gerrymandering where municipal wards are manipulated to favour some political parties who have lost popular support must be ripped on the bud.

Increasing the rate at which local government performs, we must close all the loopholes in the system. I thank you.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 112

Mr W M MADISHA: Thank you very much, Chair. Without doubt, the local government is extremely important to all the people of South Africa. Of course, I believe we all agree. It is there that the delivery must take place, *inter alia*, the issue of electricity, water supply, roads, cleanliness, etcetera. The question that I put is, is that happening? I want to say that in very many areas that is not the case. Therefore, we who are here, the 400 of us, are extremely lucky to be sited here given some advantageous to really discuss this thing and say how we move forward to ensure that the people of South Africa are able to gain and get that which they are supposed to.

However, I want to say even before I go on, Chair, that you go to some of those municipalities and you will find that some of the mayors, etcetera, get higher wages than even you who are here as sited. Now, what do we say and what do we do? Those are the kind of things which are there.

Accountability and transparency remain the fundamental principles that ensure the proper functioning of government administration, be it at the national or local level. Both principles are central to good governance and continue to be pivotal in ensuring that those in power discharge their

UNREVISED HANSARD
NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 113

functions and duties honestly and legitimately. The manifestations of poor governance include poor financial management, ill-advised appointments and misguided patriotism in service delivery.

Sepedi:

Se njela letsogo sekgowa ... [Disego.] ... se a subelela.

English:

Now, I therefore want to say that the majority of these things, really, this service is not happening. Why? Because of the highest levels of corruptions that are taking place at those particular levels of government. Therefore, the question is, what do we do as this majority of the people who are here as sited. We need to find a way and together say what we do to move forward and ensure that as a matter of urgency we stop these things from happening. I want to emphasise that the majority of those people are still in the majority of them and are getting even salaries and a whole lot of things even more than yourself who are sited here. [Time expired.]

Mr C BRINK: Chair, a lot has been said here today about section 139 of the Constitution that allows a municipal

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 114

councils to be dissolved, and re-elections to happen, if exceptional circumstances warrant such a step. There are plenty of dysfunctional municipalities, but let us consider a tale of two municipalities to see how this provision is being implemented. The Makana Local Municipality in the Eastern Cape has a string of qualified audit, a massive Eskom debt, and a growing water crisis. The municipality has persistently refused to implement a financial recovery plan.

Last year residents of Makana had to approach the Eastern Cape High Court to get an order to force the provincial government to intervene. The court judged the circumstances in Makana to be exceptional, ordered the municipal council to be dissolved and now it has to be re-elected. The ANC Eastern Cape government is fighting this judgement tooth and nail. In papers filed on appeal, the Eastern Cape Head of the Department, HOD, for Cogta says that Makana should not be dissolved because its collapse is not exceptional. According to the HOD the perilous state of Makana is, in fact, the norm across the province and the country. What a shocking double standard is revealed when this is compared to today's decision of the ANC Gauteng government to dissolve the municipal

UNREVISED HANSARD
NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 115

council in Tshwane. Did I mention that Makana was governed by the ANC?

In 2016, the people of Tshwane voted out the ANC, the city is only just recovering from 16 years of cadre deployment, corrupt contracts, and absolute looting and deterioration of service infrastructure. The DA-led city government has certainly made its mistakes, but compared to Makana those are completely different in nature and extent. Unlike Makana, Tshwane has no arrear Eskom debt; it has a financial recovery plan in place. Nearly R2 billion in an operating deficit inherent from the ANC has been turned around. [Applause.] Moody's has upgraded the city two notches. The main problem in Tshwane is that the ANC and the EFF councillors keep on breaking quorum and preventing the council from making decisions. [Applause.]

It is this that provided the pretext for the Gauteng government to do its premature and heavy-handed intervention. Spot how the ANC is sneaking in the back door to grab back the power that it lost in the election. In Makana the people have lived the gut-wrenching reality of 20 unbroken years of the ANC rule. In Limpopo the depositors of the VBS Bank, the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 116

pensioners, know exactly what the EFF means when it says that it will take direction. [Applause.] However, in Tshwane, Mr Chair, the DA will fight at the ballot box, and we will fight in court if necessary, to keep the raiders of Makana and give ... [Inaudible.] ... I thank you. [Applause.] [Time expired.]

Mr S S SOMYO: Hon Chairperson, ...

Dr M Q NDLOZI: The DA should have just kept the Mayor of Tshwane Metropolitan Municipality out of office from doing the things that he was supposed to do in the bedroom.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): I did not acknowledge you hon Ndlozi.

Mr S S SOMYO: Hon Chairperson and hon members, today we are dealing with a very important debate which is indicative of how local government is positioned in the South African government's arena. It is time for all South Africans to take strength to the fact that our forefathers have foresaw that South Africa belongs to all who live in it. That assertion has been expressed fully in the paragraph of the Freedom Charter which is indicative of the fact that people shall govern. In

UNREVISED HANSARD
NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 117

governing, their own interests should be respected and be dealt with repute.

An English adage says, "No honour among thieves". People who go together grab and steal the power of the people to seek to govern big metropolitan municipalities in our country. All of those led to failure. What we see today and experienced is that the provincial government of the Gauteng province has taken that stolen power away from the two who thought they have that right. [Interjections.]

IsiXhosa:

Alubiwa ulawulo lwabantu; lulwelwa ngephetshana lokuvota. Siyayibona into yokuba ngoku niyalunikwa elo lungelo ukuba niphume etshatshalazeni. Ninikwe iintsuku ezi-19 kuphela ukuba nizilungiselele kodwa niza kubuya nibone ukuba uKhongolose uhlala ehleli.

English:

It is indeed within that strain of observation how you have faltered in governing the City of Tshwane Metropolitan Municipality. You faltered deliberately; stealing from the

UNREVISED HANSARD
NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 118

people of the municipality through your own actions.

[Interjections.] We are here to give that account.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Hon Somyo, can please take your seat? Hon members, the volume of interjections and heckling or interruptions must not prevent a member from being heard. I cannot hear what he is saying because of the level of noise. Could you please...

IsiZulu:

... niyishayele phansi uma ngabe nifuna ukuyishayela phansi?

English:

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Hon Chairperson, I rise on a point of order: Chair, I just want to show that you missed absolutely nothing.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): I beg your pardon?

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Hon Chair, when you said you could not hear the member, I just want to show that you missed absolutely nothing. [Laughter.]

UNREVISED HANSARD
NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 119

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Hon members, order. Can you please take your seat hon Somyo?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hon Chairperson, I rise on a point of order: Hon Chair, we cannot accept what is being said across because it is an insult. Despite the fact that we can talk about the noise but you cannot undermine other members when they are standing on the podium, talking and say you have missed nothing. That is being racist, undermining and you should never do that again. [Intejections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Hon members, can we allow the debate to flow uninterruptedly? [Interjections.] I said heckling is allowed but not at a point where it is disturbing. Please, continue hon member?

Dr M Q NDLOZI: Hon House Chair, but the truth is that he did not say anything and he said nothing with a lot of confidence. [Laughter] That is the reality Chair. You really did not miss anything and for the next five more minutes you will also miss nothing.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Hon Ndlozi...

UNREVISED HANSARD
NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 120

IsiZulu:

... hlala phansi.

English:

Mr S S SOMYO: Tshwane Metropolitan Municipality spent only 40% of its Capital expenditure, Capex so far according to Treasury reports. Treasury is contemplating taking away about R3 billion unspent on Human Settlements and Transport grants from Tshwane Metropolitan Municipality. The biggest irregular expenditure has been reported to Tshwane Metropolitan Municipality is to the value of R2 billion. Half of that amount has been spent already on a contract that went to a cited individual who is a beneficial of that amount.

Already three mayors in 42 months were appointed by the DA in this municipality. Is that stability which they are crying about? Atteridgeville is the dirtiest township as we speak which initially has gained acclamations for its own performance on cleanliness because it is in the hands of the DA. Winterveld in Tshwane Metropolitan Municipality is currently with no electricity for a period of 12 months where you ruled. [Interjections.] Hammanskraal -

UNREVISED HANSARD
NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 121

DA MEMBER: Where is that?

Mr S S SOMYO: You do not even know where it is? It is in Tshwane Metropolitan Municipality.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): You better address me, hon Somyo. Better address me, Sir. Hon members, please, I am appealing to you again not to drown the speaker on the podium. Hon member on the podium please address the Chairperson.

Mr S S SOMYO: Yes, indeed there is no honour among thieves. Today they will be together and tomorrow they will run to kill one another. In Gauteng they are talking about Community Work Programme, CWP. In Gauteng, where they rule, have appointed 1 500 police officers whom they took for training and they gave them guns. These officers received training that is not accredited and that has to be inherited by the ANC.

[Interjections.]

Mr G G HILL-LEWIS: Hon House Chairperson, will he take a question?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 122

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Hon member, will you take a question?

Mr S S SOMYO: I will take a question after I have finished.

[Interjections.]

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: Hon House Chair, I rise on a point of order: The Presiding Officer that was here, I do not know whether it was you or someone else, said the rules say you cannot take a question after the speech. You can only take a question during the speech. We ask this member to take a question but he says he will take it afterwards. [Interjections.] Honestly speaking he is not coherent and we cannot understand what he is saying. Maybe the question could guide him in terms of what he wants to say.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Hon Shivambu, please take your seat and let the member continue.

Mr S S SOMYO: Johannesburg Metropolitan Police Department has about R5,7 billion as a budget and the entire budget has no contract against it but it is spent. You look into how the DA has performed in Johannesburg and how 5 000 people ought to be

UNREVISED HANSARD
NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 123

serviced on emergency related services. The budgeted amount with only five fire engines was meant to service 5 million people. You paid upfront R177 million and you never received the goods that you have purchased and but you are an ethical organisation. No man, tell us something else but not this DA. [Interjections.]

Colleagues, we are led by the fact that you must hide nothing from the people. The ANC is the custodian of the Constitution. We acknowledge section 41 1(c) which says:

All spheres of government and all organs of state within each sphere must provide effective, transparent, accountable and coherent government for the Republic as a whole.

It is through this that we have encouraged the formations of ward committees in every municipality. The ANC has done so effectively and you can go to any DA-led municipality where they shied away from the formations of such institutions because they are afraid to have our people in the centre of delivery of services of local government.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 124

The ANC appreciates participatory democracy and calls on government to strengthen ward committees so that they are able to play strategic roles in society. The exclusion of communities in planning and development leads to unnecessary tensions between communities and those who are in power. These committees are institutionalised channels of communication and interaction between communities and municipalities.

Community members must at all material times be encouraged to take opportunity to express their needs, opinions on issues affecting their lives and to have them heard at municipal level via the ward councillors. They must play an important role in giving meaning to the notion of "the people shall govern" as local government is regarded as the level of government closest to the people.

Traditional leaders must be involved on issues affecting their people particularly when government implements a local government programme focusing on service delivery and infrastructure. The ANC calls on traditional leaders to voice their concerns on legislation that they think is not in line with their traditions as they have always done so.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 125

The ANC is not saying all is well; it acknowledges the challenges local government is going through and dealing with them decisively. That is why we have the Special Investigating Unit, SIU which does its investigations in the areas that have been identified with corruption.

Hon Chairperson, six years ago a Khayelitsha Commission of Inquiry into Policing in the township was launched. This commission of inquiry found that a lack of adequate street lights contributed to crime in the area. Sadly, in the City of Cape Town's R62,5 million is spent on public lighting in the 2019 - 20 financial year, whereas Khayelitsha, where a lack of lighting had been highlighted as a risk to safety, is not getting any lighting, as we speak.

This is happening while in Tshwane Metropolitan Municipality service delivery is at stand still due to DA's incompetency that led to the resignation of the mayor. [Applause.] [Time expired.]

Mr G G HILL-LEWIS: What about my question? He did not take my question.

UNREVISED HANSARD
NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 126

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): The time is up hon member.

IsiXhosa:

Mnu G G MPUMZA: Mandibulele kwakhona Sihlalo.

English:

Indeed hon Hoosen, we as the ANC have indicated that we have done an assessment and arrived at a point that indeed there are challenges. That is why we are bringing in here the District Development Model. You are highlighting that we can't, after 25 years, be still indicating that we are bringing this model whilst there are no services in some areas in the municipalities and in South Africa.

May I remind you that the fact that there are still no services in some areas in the country are an outcome of your policies of segregating and excluding the citizens of South Africa from accessing the services, by your own party. Indeed, hon Opperman, the District Development Model is underpinned by the capabilities of accountabilities that systems and structure that we will put in place would ensure that

accountability is prime in implementing this particular programme.

We are of the view as the ANC that perhaps it will be important ... listen ... it would be important to indicate to you, hon Brink and hon Groenewald, that the ANC is combat ready in terms of its National Democratic Revolution to liberate ... listen ... to liberate you guys from [Inaudible.] psychosis that is imprisoning you of supremacy.

[Interjections.] That is why you can't understand this District Development Model that is underpinned by democratic principles of allowing communities to fully participate in the affairs of their own.

Because you are rules based, you still think in the form of controlling people not to actively participate in the affairs of their own. Hon Marawu, maybe if you were consisted in your committees you would understand that the Special Investigating Unit, SIU, is being monitored. And in the interaction, the SIU has brought a progressive report. There are a number of referrals that were sighted here by hon Bheki; that indeed the law is biting on the thieves and the law is going to bite on the thieves.

UNREVISED HANSARD
NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
THURSDAY, 5 MARCH 2020

Page: 128

That is part of this District Development Model in ensuring that clear strategies of anti corruption plan will be in place and will be rolled out in the area of the District Development Model to ensure that there is stability in government and to ensure that there is integrity in the functioning of government.

IsiXhosa:

Ndifuna ukunqinisekisa apha, ukuba awuva, iintsimbi zisakhala. Ndithe le ndlela siza nayo lulwamvila lokuncothula zonke iimbandezelo ezibamba lo rhulumente weANC ekufikeleleni eluntwini. IANC izakuqhuba ngale Nkqubo yoPhuhliso lweziThili (District Development Model) ukuze abantu baseMzantsi bayikholelwe bayiphindise kulawulo. Enkosi[Kwaqhwytywa.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D NTOMBELA): Hon members, we have been all well behaved today. Thank you very much.

Debate concluded.

The House adjourned at 16:53.