***TUESDAY, 18 FEBRUARY 2020***

***PROCEEDINGS AT JOINT SITTING***

Members of the National Assembly and National Council of Provinces assembled in the Chamber of the National Assembly at 14:02.

The Chairperson of the National Council of Provinces took the Chair.

The Chairperson of the National Council of Provinces requested members to observe a moment of silence for prayer or meditation.

**PASSING ON OF MEMBERS OF PARLIAMENT**

(Announcement)

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon members, as we do so, let us remember all those who have since passed on including amongst

others Khetsi Lehoko who was in Cosatu and a former Member of Parliament and served many years in government.

Please be seated. The secretary will now read the order of the day.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon members, I have received a copy of the President’s address delivered at the Joint Sitting on the 13th February 2020, the speech has now been printed in the minutes of the Joint Sitting. Without further ado I will call upon the Deputy Chief Whip of the Majority Party.

Malibongwe! [Applause.]

**DEBATE ON PRESIDENT’S STATE-OF-THE-NATION ADDRESS**

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: Hon Chairperson

and Deputy Chairperson of the NCOP, hon Speaker and Deputy Speaker of the National Assembly, His Excellency, the President and Deputy President, hon Ministers and Deputy Ministers, hon members, our guests in the gallery I greet you all, this debate takes place few days after the commemoration of the 30th anniversary of the release of our revolutionary struggle icon and father of our democracy utata Nelson Mandela.

As the ANC, we also celebrate the centenary of our struggle heroes and stalwarts, just to mention the two, ubaba Raymond Mhlaba and ubaba Harry Gwala. The ANC welcomes the State of the Nation Address by the President on Thursday night last week, which gave hope to the citizens of this country. In this regard, we concur with the President’s injunction to build a capable state to place our economy on the path to recovery, to ﬁx the fundamentals, pursue critical areas of growth and ensure excellence in planning and execution at the level of government.

We also agree with the President’s address that there is an urgent need to bring together, government, the labour movement, business and communities in a social pact to accelerate economic growth and creation of jobs, which is of paramount importance for economic growth stimulation. We call on all South Africans to unite in an effort to root out corruption in both public and private sector. Corruption weakens government capabilities to function optimally in pursuit of the objectives and aspiration of the national democratic revolution.

In the 2019 state of the nation, the President promised the nation to vigorously embark on a deliberate path to strengthen

our law enforcement agencies capabilities in order to ﬁght the scourge of corruption and crime in the country. Post sona 2019, we have seen the National Prosecution Authority, NPA,’s Asset Forfeiture Unit AFU, recovering R12 billion from the proceeds of crimes. We have also seen the conviction rate increasing in cases of organised crimes. This demonstrates the undivided commitment by the government to eradicating corruption.

*SiSwati*:

Mhlonishwa Sihlalo Wemkhandlu Wetifundza, siyabonga kakhulu kuhulumende ngekucinisekisa kutsi balimi lebasafufusa kube malula kubo kutfola imvumo yekusebentisa emanti njengoba ticelo titawutsatsa tinyanga letintsatfu kuphela, kantsi phambilini, ticelo betitsatsa iminyaka lesihlanu nangetulo kutsi titfolakale noma tigcine tingakatfolakali.

Siyabonga nekutsi sebakhona balimi lesebatfole imvumo yokutjala umtfunti wetinkhukhu. Loko kukhombisa kona kutsi hulumende wenta taba kucinisekisa kutsi uniketa balimi emandla. Lomtfunti wetinkhukhu lotawutjalwa akusiwo lotawubhenywa kodvwa ngulotawusetjentiselwa kutsi kwakhiwe imitsi yekulapha.

Siyabonga kuhulumende ngekutibophelela ekulweni neludlame lolucondziswe kubomake nebantfwana. Siyati kutsi nabobabe bayashaywa futsi bayahlukunyetwa, ngakoke siyabakhutsata sitsi ke kubikeni loko emaphoyiseni. Ngoba kute sakhe sive lesicotfo nalesinekutfula kufanele kutsi sibe nekutfula futsi siphatsane ngendlela lefanele.

Siyabonga nakuLitiko Letebulungiswa kutsi kusukela hulumende wahlaba umkhosi kutsi asilwisaneni naletinhlobo teludlame letibhekiswe kubomake nebantfwana. Siyakubona kuyenteka ngoba babhebhetseli balomshopi bayajeziswa futsi baniketwa tigwebo letinkhulu. Loko kutawunciphisa kubhebhetseka kweludlame.

Hulumende angeke akwenta ayedvwa loko, kudzingeka kutsi abambisane nesive sonkhe natotonkhe tinhlangano letikhona eveni, phindze kubanjiswane netinhlangano tetenkholo letifana neSouth African Council of Churches kanye nenhlangano yekuvuselela similo lebitwa nge-Moral Regeneration Movement.

*English*:

As we celebrate the 65th anniversary of the Freedom Charter this year, we ought to give effect to the profound statement that “South Africa belongs to all who lives in it, black and white”. We urge all South Africans to combat the looming racial tensions which are perpetrated by counter revolutionary

forces. We must work with a greater effort to bridge the divides between South Africans whether economic, social, political or culturally.

Hon Chairperson, the statement that was made by the second former Deputy President, Mr F W De Clerk, in the government of national unity, was unfortunate, insensitive and reckless. As the former head of the state during apartheid era, he should have known that the United Nations declared apartheid “a crime against humanity”. Such statements have a tendency of sowing seeds of hatred, racialism, divisions and promotion of superiority amongst the citizens. We call upon all leaders to refrain from making statements, which are not in line with the preamble of our Constitution.

Hon Chairperson, we congratulate His Excellency the President for being elected as the Chairperson of the African Union.

This shows that the African nations have confidence in South Africa. We therefore urge all South Africans to support our leaders in their quest to also lead in this continent.

Let us also commend the Presiding Officers for erring on the side of caution by exercising the utmost patience in the face of aggravation last week. Your tolerance and determination to

endure, even when the majority of us were egging you to end it all, reminded us of the resilience of our leaders and nation, that has made us overcome what others thought insurmountable. Allow me to thank Members of this august House except for one party, those members who exercised patience and discipline during the sitting last week Thursday. In particular, members of the ANC. We applaud you for remaining calm and also making sure that you remained the disciplined force of our movement. This behaviour showed that the ANC is the leader of society.

We really applaud these members for their behaviour because they knew that the joint sitting was called by the President through the Presiding officers... [Interjections.]

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Your time has expired hon member!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: ...I am still

left with two minutes. The joint sitting was called by the President to address the nation. That was not a platform for the EFF to grandstand and to make sure that they disrupt the sitting. The platform is today where all parties will have a chance to debate the state of the nation.

Hon Presiding Officers, as the ANC, we urge you that there is a need to relook into the rules and make sure that we tighten them in a way that our rights as Members of Parliament are not trampled over by a minority group. I thank you. [Applause.]

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: I would really like to apologise to the hon member. There are two watches, one of which is on my table here, and one which is down there. We will try to do our best to concentrate on the time there and not here. Thank you very much. The next speaker is the hon Leader of the Opposition. [Applause.] Please proceed.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Mr Chairman, hon President, hon members, we stand here today, in this august House, with the weight of expectation on our shoulders. Our country is at a turning point and all of us here can feel it. But there can be no excuse for what transpired in this House here last Thursday evening. I think that most of us were deeply embarrassed by the scenes that we witnessed before the President’s speech. [Applause.]

Hon members, we don’t have to agree with each other. We don’t have to like each other, and we don’t even have to be that

nice to each other. But we do have to respect the Rules of this House.

Collectively, we represent 58 million South Africans; people who dream of a better life and of a better country; people who need us to work together to find real solutions to their problems – and not grandstanding for television cameras. [Applause.] They demand better of us.

As Rodney King famously said after the race riots in Los Angeles: “We all can get along. I mean, we’re all stuck here for a while. Let’s try to work it out.” We are going to have to find a way of working it out. We can’t have a repeat of Thursday ever again.

Now, I understand the frustrations. We come from a difficult history, we feel disappointed about the present and we face an uncertain future. And we are all disappointed in the state of our nation.

Hon members, do you remember the mood of just two years ago? It’s hard to imagine now, but we had hope. We had just closed the book on a terrible chapter in our country’s history, and we stood at the start of what we thought was a brand new

journey. Yes, our challenges were greater than ever before, but there was a real sense of “We can do it”; to reinforce that slogan: We were alive with possibilities.

Hon President, I was one of those people who had had hope. I had had real hope that you were just maybe the one who was going to lead us out of the darkness and into the New Dawn that you promised us, through our turbulent times and in a direction of prosperity. And I was not alone. You had a nation behind you, willing you on to succeed every single day. You had more support and trust than any leader who has stood at this podium since Nelson Mandela.

Your position in your own party was as strong as it could ever be. They needed you to avert a disaster in the 2019 elections. Mr President, you were untouchable. You held all the cards, Mr President. And then you went and blew it. You let us down. You failed to make the required reforms to free up our economy, win back investors and create jobs. And so, instead of turning the corner and getting better, things have got worse.

Today it’s hard to remember how we all felt back then, because the litany of bad news in recent times has been relentless.

Over the past two years, every single number in our country

has moved in the wrong direction. Economic growth has ground to a halt, foreign direct investment is down, tax revenues are down, crime is up and jobs are being lost in their hundreds of thousands. We have seen mines, retailers and factories shut their doors or move and leave our shores, cutting thousands of the precious jobs we need.

We have seen municipality after municipality fail, leaving communities without access to basic services, and without water, toilets or usable roads. We have seen the return of job-killing load shedding, and the need to add even more stages to it to reflect the condition of state-run Eskom.

Since you delivered your Sona speech in this House two years ago over a million more South Africans have joined the ranks of the unemployed. Over 10,4 million working-age South Africans today do not have a job. Now, I am not going to stand here and say that this happened on your watch, Mr President. I think that that would be too kind. It didn’t just happen on your watch, it happened by your hand. You have put us in this situation, Sir. [Applause.] You had your chance and you blew it. You are not the reformer that South Africa thought you were. You don’t have the guts to make the tough choices that our country needs. You are not brave enough to take on the

unions that hold our country to ransom every day, and you don’t have the courage to deal decisively with the corrupt people in your own party. [Applause.]

And so while you were telling us on Thursday evening how you fought back against corruption, you had people like Zandile Gumede sitting right here in this House. While you were telling us how you’ve acted decisively against state capture, the beneficiaries of state capture – some of them chairs of portfolio committees in this House – sat in these very benches. And while our country waited with baited breath for the long-awaited promised arrests to be made, we have to learn in a document sent from Parliament to the public services committee that there will be no arrests, no prosecutions and no orange overalls this year. And that’s why, instead of a New Dawn, there is a new despair.

Through your actions and your decisions these past two years you might have strengthened your internal position – you might even have strengthened the tripartite alliance – but you have hurt the people of South Africa. [Applause.] And that, Mr President, will be your legacy: the man who dared us to dream and who then led us into a nightmare.

I’m not saying your choices were easy. But doing the right thing under difficult circumstances is what separates great leaders from ordinary leaders. Every great leader in history has, at some point, had to pick a course of action that was counterintuitive or risky, choices that would inevitably have put them at odds with the people around them.

Most famously, perhaps, was Nelson Mandela’s decision three decades ago to enter into peaceful negotiations for our new democracy and our Constitution. He was undoubtedly under enormous pressure from people within the liberation movement to choose a different path: to seek retribution. But because he chose peace and reconciliation, we have a democracy today that truly belongs to all of us.

History is full of such examples. Think of Abraham Lincoln and the choice he faced before the start of the Civil War: Should he allow the Southern States full autonomy for them to continue with the abhorrent practice of slavery, or should he take action? Many lives were lost in the war that followed, and this would forever rest on his shoulders. But history will remember him as the man who ended slavery and united his country.

Great leaders recognise their defining moments. And they then have the courage to make the decisions that need to be made at that moment, even if that meant being met with resistance from the people around them.

Your moment, hon President, came on Thursday last week, and you blew it. It was a simple choice: country or party? And, unfortunately for the millions of South Africans, the people of this country, you chose your party. You chose to maintain the status quo because you don’t want to be the man on whose watch the ANC split down the middle. You chose to placate the enemies of growth instead of confronting them head-on.

Nelson Mandela once said that your choices must reflect your hopes and not your fears. Your choices, hon President, as expressed in your Sona speech, reflected only your fears. This was your defining moment and you let it slip away.

On Thursday evening you needed to face the truth. You needed to acknowledge that in its current form Eskom is dead. You needed to tell the country – and your allies in the tripartite alliance – that throwing billions and billions of rand at Eskom was economic suicide. You needed to make it absolutely clear that dipping into the pension savings of hardworking

government employees to artificially keep Eskom alive was both irresponsible and immoral.

Euthanasia is never an easy option, but sometimes it is the most humane option. On Thursday night you should have switched off Eskom’s life-support machine, and perhaps supported the DA’s electricity plan which takes power from the state and gives it back to the people where it belongs. [Interjections.] [Applause.]

You also needed to pull the plug on the National Health Insurance, because – and in your heart of hearts you must know this – the NHI is a fantasy that your government simply cannot make work. There is no way we can even begin to raise the additional R280 billion required, without triggering a flight of both tax revenue and skills which we will never be able to reverse.

We can, and we must, fix public health care within the current budget. And it should be done through proper appointments, through proper investments in infrastructure and maintenance, and by filling all doctors’ and nurses’ vacant posts with qualified individuals. That is exactly what the DA’s Sizani Health Care Plan sets out to do. And if you haven’t read it, I

have brought a copy along for you. Mr President, if you read it I’m sure you will agree there is much on which we can collaborate to really fix health care in South Africa. [Applause.]

Your third big announcement, Mr President, should have been that you were walking away from expropriation without compensation, and that you were going to leave section 25 of the Constitution intact. The sacred protection of property rights is the bedrock of any economy, and without it everything will collapse. You need to stop fooling the public

– and yourselves – into believing that expropriation without compensation is essential for land reform. It is entirely possible to work within the existing legislation to truly empower black South Africans with land ownership in the country.

But the truth is that expropriation without compensation has never been about real land justice. Do you know who David Rakgase is, Mr President? He’s a black farmer from Limpopo who has been fighting for two decades to own the land he farms on. Do you know who he has been fighting, Mr President? He’s been fighting your government. He’s 70 years old now. He began this fight just before he turned 50. With the help of the DA he

took his case all the way to the North Gauteng High Court, where your government was instructed by the court to sell him the land - not give it to him, sell it to him. And despite this court order, your government still refused to comply.

That’s how much you care about returning the land to people, and that’s how much you care about empowering black farmers in South Africa. [Applause.]

Let’s be clear: expropriation without compensation was never about giving land to the people who want to farm the land. It was always going to be a way for the ANC government to get control of the land and thereby control the patronage that comes with it. So, we can continue with the behaviour that Kgalema Motlanthe points out so explicitly of elite capture in the high-level panel report.

Expropriation without compensation is nothing but a ruse; it’s a populist rally call around which you know is going to evoke an emotional response. It was weaponised by the EFF, and you found yourselves unable to resist following them down that rabbit hole. And I assure you, Mr President, just as every economist, every ratings agency and every would-be investor has assured you: the fastest way to collapse this economy is by removing the foundation of property rights.

Those three things: Eskom, the NHI and expropriation without compensation should have been front and centre of the Sona speech if you were serious, Mr President, about stemming the tide and restoring confidence. And if you really wanted to be bold in your reforms, you could have added the following: You could have announced an end to the enrichment scam that is BEE, replacing it with a real broad-based redress programme that helps poor South Africans, not fat-cat political elites. [Applause.]

I know it wouldn’t have been easy, because you yourself have been a beneficiary of this get-rich scheme. You have become very wealthy while the majority of South Africans have remained very, very poor. [Applause.] But, even you, Mr President, must acknowledge that we simply cannot afford this extra layer of politically enriched price gouging.

You could have also announced that some of the powers of the SAPS would be devolved to provinces and metros. This is in line with international best practice. If we want to beat gender-based violence, it means that we have to make sure that policing is done by those closest to communities – and these are the people who should be tasked with their protection.

You could also have officially abandoned cadre deployment as a policy of your party. This ANC policy of cadre deployment lies at the very heart of what is wrong with government in South Africa. [Applause.] Cadre deployment is the midwife of state capture. And don’t just take it from me, Mr President. It was no less than ANC veteran and former director-general of Home Affairs Mavuso Msimang who said of cadre deployment a few weeks ago: “The system is so open to abuse it should be ditched now ... state capture wouldn’t have happened if there had been an independent, professional civil service.” [Applause.]

The fact is, Mr President, your comments last month and last Thursday about building a capable state mean nothing as long as the politically connected feeding trough remains open. And not even a week after you announced your commitment to ending dodgy appointments, we had a Health Minister appointing his compromised niece in his department; we had the head of the Public Service Commission appointing his mistress; and we had the Minister of Human Settlements, Water and Sanitation appointing none other than the discredited Menzi Simelane and the disgraced Mo Shaik as her special advisers. And you let it happen. Party first, country second.

South Africans are tired of hollow words, Mr President. I have seen first-hand the devastation that is wrought and caused by failed governments in places like Butterworth, Siyanqoba and QwaQwa. The capable state will remain a distant dream as long as you build it with your incapable government.

And, finally, you could have announced an immediate review of all labour legislation, and particularly where it inhibits small, medium and micro enterprises from hiring people. The owners of these businesses are potentially your best allies in creating jobs and fighting unemployment. You need to help them create jobs, Mr President. Instead, you kowtow to the trade union bosses who dangle you continually on a piece of string.

These announcements would have been the speech of a real reformer. They would have been a Sona for the people of South Africa. But the truth is you couldn’t do it, because the interests of your party and its allies outweigh the needs of the 58 million South Africans who are watching us today at home. [Applause.]

Yes, your speech had a few good moments, Mr President. Adding grid capacity from renewable energy, natural gas and hydro is a good idea. Allowing commercial and industrial users to

produce their own electricity and expediting their applications is a good idea. Opening bid window five of the Renewable Energy Independent Power Producer Procurement Programme is a good idea, Mr President. And letting municipalities procure their power directly from producers is a very good idea.

But here’s the thing: You can’t claim these as your ideas. The DA has been offering these solutions for years ... [Applause.]

... and you have now left it too late. In fact, on the issue of procuring electricity directly by municipalities, this government has been locked in a legal battle with the DA. The court case was coming up in May and the President knew they would lose.

So, last year you told us the one about the bullet train. Whatever happened to that? This year you announced a sovereign wealth fund, which is a great idea if you have a healthy budget like Norway or Saudi Arabia, but we are running a budget deficit and spiralling into debt. Where is this money going to come from, Mr President? Your own bank account?

And while we are on the subject of banks, you announced the creation of a state bank. The trouble is that we already have

two state banks – the Land Bank and the Post Bank – and they are both riddled with corruption and are bankrupt. You talk of building a smart city in Lanseria when you can’t even keep the lights on in our cities. South Africans don’t want fantasies. They want to know how we are going to get through this crisis. Thursday evening was your moment and you blew it.

Now, you finished your speech with a quote from the late great Ladysmith Black Mambazo founder Joseph Shabalala. Let me add to this tribute with other Ladysmith Black Mambazo lyrics:

When the sun goes down, the birds on the trees Are singing sweet for the night

When the sun says good night to the mountain I am dreaming of the sun

Mr President, we are all dreaming of the sun. I believe we can find our way through. The question is: Are you the man to take us there? And, I think, on Thursday South Africans got their answer.

Now, two days from now you will respond to this debate and you will have one last chance to redeem yourself, Mr President. [Interjections.] Use the opportunity to make the tough

choices. Choose jobs over policies that kill investment. Choose reconciliation over racial populism, and choose your country over your party. Don’t blow it this time, Mr President. South Africa is counting on you. [Applause.]

The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY: Chair of the NCOP, His

Excellency President Ramaphosa, Deputy President uBaba Mabuza, hon Members of Parliament who are gathered here, esteemed representatives of our premiers and all representatives of Salga, distinguished guests in the gallery, fellow South Africans, perhaps the hon Steenhuisen wanted you, Mr President, to be guided by the DA manifesto. [Applause.] Now, you are not a DA member. You are a leader of the *African National Congress.* [Applause.] Your state of the nation address was guided by the *African National Congress.*

Allow me to begin this address by paying homage to recently departed South African music icon uBaba Shabalala. He was the founder and lead singer of the legendary isicathamiya group Ladysmith Black Mambazo, which took traditional music to the world stage and brought honour and pride to our nation. As we convey our deepest condolences to his family, friends and music lovers all over the world, we say, “Your loss is not yours alone; we are with you.”

It is also fitting that uBab’ uShabalala passed away on 11 February 2020, the day that marked exactly 30 years – as my colleague has said, the Deputy Chief Whip of the Majority Party – since the founding president of a democratic South Africa, uTata uNelson Mandela, walked out of Victor Verster Prison after being incarcerated there and on Robben Island for over 27 years. These icons have now been joined eternally to the hip by this historic moment.

Every South African, including those who claim ignorance, knows for a fact that apartheid was a crime against humanity. It was our lived reality as black people. Trevor Noah put it succinctly in the title of his book *Born a Crime*. Therefore, the question of whether or not apartheid was a crime against humanity should not even arise to begin with. It was our lived reality.

Whilst the majority of South Africans have looked to us to unpack government’s plans to create a better life for all, we have allowed opportunistic elements to derail and defocus us. The theatrics we witnessed here last week from the EFF will not transform society. These theatrics will not create jobs. They will not grow our economy. Instead of the EFF engaging in a battle of ideas, we were subjected to spurious points of

order, childish antics and unruly behaviour. Well, they are known for that.

We agree with Father Michael Lapsley’s characterisation of the EFF’s behaviour in this House as antidemocratic, totally unacceptable and actually reprehensible. The EFF’s behaviour was uncouth and disrespectful and demonstrated the disdain they have for this august House and the people of South Africa. [Applause.] I wonder why they get voted into this House. I wonder. [Interjections.]

Mr President, you are the one and only commander in chief in this country. [Interjections.] It is you, in terms of our Constitution, who decides when to appoint or disappoint Ministers in your Cabinet. Those who are seized with delusions of grandeur - fashioning themselves as commanders in chief and instructing the head of state ...

Dr M Q NDLOZI: Point of order.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon member, what is your point of order?

Dr M Q NDLOZI: It is not “disappoint”; it is “unappoint”. “Disappoint” means something different. [Interjections.]

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: That’s not a point of order. [Interjections.]

Dr M Q NDLOZI: It is this thing of reading true love, as opposed to political literature. [Interjections.]

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Please sit down ... [Inaudible.] [Interjections.]

Dr M Q NDLOZI: Not “disappoint”. That means different ...

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon Ndlozi, please sit down.

Dr M Q NDLOZI: Comrade Naledi Pandor, please intervene, man. Jassis! [Interjections.]

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: That’s not a point of order. Please proceed, hon member.

The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY: Those who are seized with delusions of grandeur - fashioning themselves as commanders in

chief and instructing the head of state to fire a Minister – need to have the state of their heads examined.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon Mthembu, just a minute. What is your point of order, member?

Dr M C C PILANE-MAJAKE: House Chair, the point of order I am actually raising is based on Rule 14, in that all members have the right to speak. Just now the member of the EFF just stood without the presiding officer asking him to actually speak. [Interjections.] And he did not even indicate on what Rule he was standing. I’m just cautioning so that we actually have a House that runs in order this afternoon. I thank you.

Dr M Q NDLOZI: This is when the word disappointment comes in. Disappointing. [Interjections.]

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: That point of order ... Please sit down. This point of order is sustained, and if we do things a bit better we may even save time and be able to complete our work. Please proceed, hon Mthembu.

The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY: Late last year President Ramaphosa lodged the 25-Year Review Report which illustrates

quite clearly, despite a number of setbacks, South Africa is a better place to live in today than it was before 1994. One of the key findings of the report is that while a lot has been done to transform the economy, wealth distribution is skewed. As a result, the gap between the rich and the poor remains huge. Unemployment is high owing to the grossly imbalanced structure of our economy and this is exacerbated by the skills mismatch that is so prevalent in our country.

As one of the measures to address our prevailing economic challenges, Mr President, when you first came into office in 2018, you set a very ambitious target of attracting

R1,2 trillion in investments in our country over a period of five years. We have, in the first two years of our investment drive, raised a total of R664 billion in investment commitments, which is more than half of our five-year target of R1,2 trillion.

Mr President, in your 2019 state of the nation address, you announced that government would be setting up an Infrastructure Fund to address the infrastructure backlogs we are faced with. To this end, government has set aside

R100 billion over a decade to co-finance programmes and projects that blend public and private resources, with

R10 billion as the baseline for the next three years. To date, the implementation unit for the Infrastructure Fund has identified possible projects and programmes, amounting to more than R500 billion.

President, you further committed to looking at the National Macro Organisation of Government with a view to making government more effective and efficient in removing duplication across government across government departments.

In May 2019, you announced a reconfigured Cabinet from 36 to

28 Ministers, appointing, for the first time, Mr President, in South African history a Cabinet which comprised 50% women. [Applause.] This progressive step added South Africa to a list of 10 other countries in the entire world that have gender- balanced Cabinets. Thank you, Mr President. [Applause.]

Our Medium-Term Strategic Framework of 2019 to 2024, which was adopted by Cabinet last year, is built on the fundamental pillar of rebuilding and restoring public confidence in the state and government’s ability to efficiently deliver quality services as informed by the National Development Plan.

We have therefore introduced the District Development Model to ensure that all spheres of government cherish a common vision and are guided by the same framework and integrated and overarching plan.

I am recounting all of the above, not only to boast about the achievements of our ANC-led government of the past year, but also to share our vision for the future growth of this country. This vision was clearly articulated by President Ramaphosa in this House last Thursday.

Let me take this opportunity to congratulate President Ramaphosa on delivering what was nothing short of an inspiring state of the nation address. Many South Africans, Mr President, have characterised the 2020 Sona as a frank, honest and pointed appraisal of government’s work with clear time- bound targets. The speech focused on the seven apex priorities of government, addressing urgent issues facing our nation such as the energy crisis, youth unemployment, growing the economy and building a capable state.

We welcome the government’s plan to ensure that Eskom works to restore its operational capabilities, while implementing measures that will fundamentally change the trajectory of

energy generation in our country, such as putting in place measures to enable municipalities in good financial standing to procure their own power from Independent Power Producers.

The President rightfully observed that the solution to the crisis of youth unemployment must be two-pronged. We must create opportunities for youth employment and self-employment. He further presented a comprehensive plan to be executed through the Presidential Youth Employment Intervention.

In an effort to create a larger market for small businesses, we welcome, Mr President, the plan to designate 1 000 locally produced products that must be procured from small- and medium-sized enterprises.

Mr President, we know that you wanted to sign performance agreements with members of the executive and directors-general last October already. However, owing to the delay in concluding the Medium-Term Strategic Framework, the MTSF, and the Cabinet Lekgotla, which was only held at the end of January this year, you could not. We are happy to announce that the performance agreements are now ready to be signed as from next week. These will ensure a solid framework for accountability and management.

Through the Department of Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation, the DPME, we will be monitoring and evaluating the effective implementation of all Sona commitments through an efficient institutional architecture. The DPME will also co-ordinate the presidential assessments of both the institutional performance of government departments and that of the executive authority on a biannual basis. This will provide the President with a line of sight of the performance of government in the implementation of the Medium-Term Strategic Framework and Sona commitments, as informed by the seven priorities of government.

Hon members, we must also congratulate President Cyril Ramaphosa on his appointment as the Chairperson of the African Union, the AU. [Applause.] Mr President, let me join my colleague – the Deputy Chief Whip of the Majority Party - once again in saying that this appointment is the affirmation that the peoples of Africa from Cape to Cairo have confidence in your capable leadership and that of our country.

We will be giving you support in the six priority areas you will be pursuing during your AU chairship, which include, amongst other things, driving the implementation of the Presidential Infrastructure Champion Initiative in support of

the African Continental Free Trade Area. We reported to the 33rd Ordinary Session of the Assembly of Heads of State and Government of the African Union in Addis Ababa and our report was most welcome.

In conclusion, hon Chair of this Joint Sitting, this Sona was inspiring. [Interjections.] [Applause.]

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Your time here.

The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY: Thank you very much, Chair. [Applause.]

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Thank you very much. As the hon Malema approaches the podium, let me just indicate the following: The EFF has a global time allocation of 42 minutes. His party has allocated him 20 minutes. If he exceeds 20 minutes, he will be allowed to continue. He can speak for a maximum time of 42 minutes. [Interjections.] [Applause.] Once done, the table will reconcile the time, so the request is in order.

Mr J S MALEMA: Thank you very much Chairperson of the NCOP and the Speaker of the national Parliament in absentia. I want to

take this opportunity to really thank you for how you conducted the proceedings on the day of the state of the nation address. We have been longing for that type of leadership because the two of you understood that this is a democratic Parliament and therefore any idea that seeks to suggest that the views of the minority should never be entertained is undemocratic. Democracy by its own nature requires that we listen to all ideas, even if it is the ideas of one person, because those ideas, for as long as they meet a rational test, are acceptable.

So, I have seen some fellows here standing up and saying we cannot be held to ransom by minorities. You must know that you are planting a wrong seed; that minorities should not be listened to. If you agree that minorities should not be listened to, it will go beyond this Parliament, and therefore there will not be a single minority in the true sense of minorities that will be listened to.

I heard another one saying here that you want to amend the rules. The problem is not the rules. The problem is reading the rules. Mr President, your comrades do not read. The reality is that they don’t read. They read *True Love* magazine and *Drum.* [Laughter.] When it comes to political literature;

when it comes to reading the rules, they do not read. That is why someone stood up here and said, House of rules. It’s not House of rules; it’s rules of the House. They do not read.

Now, Comrade President, your rise to the high office in our land carried a promise of renewed hope in a better and accountable government, with a clear and sound strategy to lead our people in total economic emancipation. Three state of the nation addresses later there is hardly any evidence that you are different to your predecessor. You are refusing transparency and accountability. You protect incompetence and corruption in your ranks and have already misled Parliament under oath. In your speech you could not demonstrate any meaningful achievement, and with the direction you are taking by protecting incompetence, refusing accountability and misleading Parliament, you too will end at the same destination as your predecessor. This we guarantee you.

The logical framework of your entire speech rested on a neoliberal developmental path that is rooted in market fundamentalism. The central pillar that holds your plan is misguided; hope that markets will transform the inequality, unemployment and poverty that our people face. However, for

25 years this has not worked and you have given us no evidence that it will work with you.

It is therefore impossible to see how a solution to poison can be drinking more poison. To ask us to place our hopes in a white-owned, controlled and dominated private sector is irresponsible because you know that the white people do not have our interest at heart; the hope that a democratic, revolutionary government will play a central role in economic development, lead a radical restructuring of South Africa’s apartheid economy in which black people were always cheap and easily disposable labour; the hope that to be black is not equal to being unemployed, underemployed and unemployable; to live in poverty under spaceless conditions without access to decent water, electricity, sanitation, housing and health care; the hope that we will not bear witness to world-class wealth, supersonic developments and innovation, all owned and controlled by white people who despise us and think of us only as their servants.

Everything you said is about retreating from this task and placing it in the hands of the very white, apartheid created and privileged private monopolies. Nothing is more hopeless

than asking white people to transform themselves or asking them to save black people from wretchedness.

President, you delivered your first state of the nation address in February 2018. We said we are willing to give you a chance. In February 2019 we told you that your proposals are dangerous and will make you enemy number one of the EFF, workers and the poor masses. We told you that you have abandoned politics and put profit and greed above all. We also warned you that if you are not willing to be decisive, to change property relations, and want to continue with your cowardice and wanting to make friends with everyone, you will not address unemployment, poverty and inequality, and few whites will continue to live in opulence in the face of unimaginable poverty. However, you have continued with dangerous ... [Inaudible.] [Interjections.]

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon Malema, just a minute. What’s your point of order member?

Mr J B MAMABOLO: Hon Chairperson, I’m rising on Rule 14(l)(a). Is hon Malema willing to take a question? [Interjections.]

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon Malema, will you take a question?

Mr J S MALEMA: Yes. [Interjections.]

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon members ... [Interjections.]

... just a very brief comment. Can we please allow the presiding officers — whoever the presiding officer is — to run the proceedings, and avoid giving instructions to whoever is on the podium? Thank you very much.

Mr J B MAMABOLO: Thank you very much, hon Chairperson of the NCOP. We must make it very clear that the matter that I’m going to raise here ... [Interjections.] ... is not a personal one, because last year the President, in terms of section 84(1)(d) ... [Interjections.] ... of the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, which is read alongside Rule 7(1)(b) of the National Assembly and the NCOP, called a Joint Sitting.

The President came here to address us specifically on the issues of domestic violence and gender-based violence. Now, all of us in this House made an undertaking that we would all go out and expose any act of domestic violence or any act of gender-based violence. In terms of the Domestic Violence Act

116 of 1998, it talks to the following: physical abuse, stalking and verbal abuse.

Now, my question to hon Malema is ... Gender-based violence is happening at your house. The matter has been dragging for too long. Instead of condemning the issue, members of the EFF decided to crack a joke so that they can divert the matter on Thursday night because they have known about the matter for a very long time. You are abusing your wife. We want you to stand here in front of the nation ... [Inaudible.] ...

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: The question must be brief, hon member. [Interjections.]

Mr J B MAMABOLO: ... and assure us ... assure us ... assure us whether the matter is true. If the matter is true, are you going to apologise? If you are not going to apologise, then you must be responsible. So, my question to you is as follows. Are you abusing your wife? Thank you very much, Chairperson of the NCOP.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Thank you very much. Let’s try and keep the questions brief. Hon Malema?

Mr J S MALEMA: Thank you very much, Chairperson of the NCOP.

However, you have continued with your dangerous plans and you are even courageous. We heard what you said and we now don’t believe anything that you say. [Interjections.] Instead, you are continuing with incoherent, American sponsored, neoliberal, misguided and contradictory ... [Inaudible.]

Mr T V MASHELE: Order Chair.

Mr J S MALEMA: The only thing that you have said and we know you mean it, is ... [Inaudible.] ... only thing that will put profit ... [Inaudible.] ... above all.

Mr T V MASHELE: Order Chair.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon Malema, just a minute. What’s your point of order, member?

Mr T V MASHELE: Chair, hon Malema agreed to respond to a question. Now, there is a question. He must respond to the question before he proceeds with his mini state of the nation address.

Mr J S MALEMA: We don’t believe what you said. Instead, you are continuing with incoherent, apartheid sponsored, neoliberal, misguided and contradictory policies.

Ms T MAHAMBEHLALA: Order Chairperson! Order! Order! Order Chairperson! Huh uh! Order!

Mr J S MALEMA: The only thing you said and we know you to mean it, is everything that will put profit and greed above all.

Ms T MAHAMBEHLALA: Order Chairperson! Order Chairperson!

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon Malema!

Mr J S MALEMA: ... [Inaudible.] ... petrol attendants, unemployed ... [Inaudible.] ... youth ... [Inaudible.] [Interjections.]

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon Malema, just a minute; just a minute. Hon members, I’m going to plead with you that we should make the running of these proceedings as smooth as possible. Now, a question has been raised. I guess the option that hon Malema has decided to settle on is not to answer the question. [Interjections.] However, I would just like him to

clearly indicate, so that if this is not the case we can look at the matter. Hon Malema?

Mr T V MASHELE: No, no, order Chair! Chair? Chair? No, no, Chair ... I don’t ...

Mr J S MALEMA: I never said I’m not answering the question. I’ll answer the question.

Mr T V MASHELE: Order Chair! Order Chair! On a point of order.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon Malema, just a minute. Hon member, what’s the point of order?

Mr T V MASHELE: Chair, we cannot allow hon Malema to disrespect the House and waste the time of the House. Hon Malema agreed to take the question. He must respond to the question. Chair, it was wrong to even allow him to respond to the President because hon Malema disrespected Parliament and walked out, and did not listen to the President. I don’t know what he is responding to because he did not listen to the state of the nation of the President and ... [Inaudible.] ... his bodyguards and ... [Inaudible.] [Interjections.]

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Thank you very much. Hon Malema, maybe you can just indicate if you are answering the question or not so that we can proceed.

Mr J S MALEMA: I never said I won’t answer the question. So, I’m reading my speech. No-one is going to tell me what to do and at what time. I’m in charge. That’s why these fools are running around here. I’m in charge.

Mr S M KULA: On a point of order Chair.

Ms T MAHAMBEHLALA: Order Chairperson!

Mr S M KULA: On a point of order Chairpertson.

Ms T MAHAMBEHLALA: Order Chairperson!

Mr S M KULA: Point of order!

Mr J S MALEMA: ... [Inaudible.] ... the ruling party by ... [Inaudible.] [Interjections.]

Ms T MAHAMBEHLALA: Order Chairperson! ... [Inaudible.] ... undermine ... [Interjections.]

Mr J S MALEMA: I’m in charge. I’m running ... [Inaudible.]

Mr S M KULA: You are not in charge. [Interjections.]

Mr J S MALEMA: You can all jump ... [Inaudible.]

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon members!

An HON MEMBER: You are not in charge. We are going to show you

... [Inaudible.]

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon members! Hon Malema, order!

Mr J S MALEMA: A leader of the opposition is running the House. I’m in charge. Come on ... [Inaudible.] [Interjections.] Who’s next?

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Order members! Can we have order members!

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: [Inaudible] ... Chairperson!

Mr J S MALEMA: Ha, don’t worry DP. I’ve got these things.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon Shivambu, please sit down.

Mr P M P MODISE: Order Chairperson! [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Can we have order Chairperson?

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Can you please sit down hon member? Please sit down.

Mr P M P MODISE: As per the rules of the Joint Sitting, a point of order Chair!

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: I’m ordering you to sit down!

Mr P M P MODISE: As per the rules of the House, a point of order ... [Inaudible.]

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Please sit down, hon member. Please sit! [Interjections.] I’ve not pointed at you. Please sit down.

An HON MEMBER: Because its hon Malema, he must not be asked anything.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: I have not given you permission to speak. Please sit down. Thank you very much.

Mr P M P MODISE: Chairperson, order please. Chair? Chair?

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: What’s your point of order member?

Mr P M P MODISE**:** Thank you very much Chair. I rise in terms of Rule 14(p). Hon Malema has just made a very dangerous statement here. He referred to people as fools. I think it is unparliamentary and Comrade Malema must withdraw that statement. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Order please, Chairperson? Chairperson?

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon members, can I ask you to please sit down? Hon ... [Inaudible.] ... please take your seat. I’ve not pointed at you. Please sit. Hon Malema, please withdraw the reference to members as things or fools, whatever the case may be. Please indicate so that we can proceed.

Mr J S MALEMA: Is it unparliamentary to say you are a fool? It can’t be, Chair. No, man. It can’t be, Chair. I’m telling you now you can check with your staff there.

An HON MEMBER: Point of order, Chair.

Mr J S MALEMA: If you are not clever, you’re not clever. There’s nothing I can do ... [Inaudible.] [Laughter.] [Applause.]

An HON MEMBER: No, on a point of order.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Can I make a ruling on the matter, hon members. This matter will be looked at and I’ll revert back to you with a ruling later on. For now, let’s proceed. Hon Malema?

Mr J S MALEMA: Thank you very much. The only things you said

...

Mr T V MASHELE: Order Chair.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon member, what’s your point of order?

Mr T V MASHELE: Chair ...

Mr J S MALEMA: Let’s keep it for one hour so that I can be on this platform for one hour. Let’s go!

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon member, what’s your point of order?

Mr T V MASHELE: Can you request the fool at the podium to sit down when an order is called ... unto him.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon member, as I’ve done before, I’m going to ask you to withdraw what you have just said please ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: On a point ... He’s not going to withdraw! He will not withdraw! Malema must withdraw first! [Interjections.] He’s not going to withdraw until Malema withdraws first. [Interjections.]

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Two wrongs don’t make a right. Hon member, please withdraw. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Hon Chair, he’s not going to withdraw until Malema withdraws first! [Interjections.]

Mr J S MALEMA: The caucus of the ANC has collapsed. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: An order on you, Chairperson.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon members, we cannot allow the House to descend into chaos.

Mr J S MALEMA: I’m in charge.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: In the same way that I expect member Malema to withdraw, I expect that member over there to do the same. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Chair, why don’t you get them yellow overalls?

Mr B A RADEBE: Hon Chairperson, you made a ruling that you are going to look into the issue with regard to fools. Please also refer that one. Look into it please. Thank you.

Mr L M NTSHAYISA: Hon Chair! Hon Chairperson!

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Yes, I’ll come back to you.

Ms T MAHAMBEHLALA: Hon Chairperson, I want to request that you be consistent. Inconsistencies are going to give us problems here in the House. You have ruled on the matter and that same ruling on this very issue must just be sustained. Thank you.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: We will do the same. We will do the same.

Mr L M NTSHAYISA: Chairperson, thank you very much. Let me give this example.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: What’s your point of order member?

Mr L M NTSHAYISA: When a student gets in the examination room and that student does not answer question six, that student cannot be blamed. Can we proceed with the business of the House now? [Applause.]

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Thank you very much. Please proceed, hon Malema.

Mr J S MALEMA: Thank you very much. I’m happy that you are continuing to learn from me. I just taught you that calling each other fools is not a problem and you did exactly that. You learn after me. You follow me because I’m in charge. I’m running this thing. So don’t worry.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Please proceed with your speech, hon Malema.

Mr J S MALEMA: This is my speech. You can run my minutes. This is my speech.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Please proceed.

Mr J S MALEMA: I’m standing here so that I can irritate you. You can be emotional anyhow you want. There is nothing you can do. [Interjections.] I am in charge. So I’m running this House, you see. So you can get angry and stand up and sit down

... [Inaudible.]

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon member Malema, you are not running the House. Please proceed with your speech.

Mr J S MALEMA: It is your own House as a ruling party. If you want to collapse your own House, it’s your own House. You can collapse it. So there is nothing I can do to help you. Just continue to learn from me.

You are so committed to giving markets more space through restructuring the state to move out of the productive sector of the economy, you are satisfied in becoming a committee for the management of the common affairs of the white monopoly bourgeoisie. Nowhere is this more demonstrated than in what you call repurposing state-owned entities, SOEs. According to you the solutions to the problems SOEs face are simple.

Squeeze them out and allow white capital to provide services they used to provide, like electricity, trains, water, airlines and others.

President, we warned you that no-one will privatise Eskom. However, we see that you did not listen and you do not want to deal with systematic institutional issues facing Eskom. There are issues that require nothing but basic logic.

Firstly, Eskom should standardise all coal prices and only pay the prices determined by the National Energy Regulator of SA, Nersa.

Eskom should explore all legal possibilities, including the Constitutional Court, to exit all the evergreen contracts, most of which were signed before 1994 and are a huge financial burden to Eskom. This should include all short and medium contracts that Eskom entered into in 2017, including the Glencore contract ... that is, Eskom pays more than R600 per ton of coal while the energy regular said Eskom should pay roughly around R300 per ton.

Secondly, Eskom should fundamentally review all power purchasing agreements with renewable independent power producers, IPPs, only designed to benefit South Africa’s racist financial sector.

Companies such as Phembani, responsible for the day to day management of your own company Shanduka ... [Inaudible.} ... power stations selling electricity to Eskom.

An HON MEMBER: Order Chair.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon member, what’s your point of order? On what point of order are you rising?

An HON MEMBER: Chair, gender-based violence is a serious issue in the country. It cannot be that we ignore it when it’s raised here in this House. It must not be an issue of sloganeering; people speaking big English around that particular month. Now it’s February, the month of love. Can hon Malema respond to the question as it is presented by hon Mamabolo. Thank you very much.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon member, I’ve already made a ruling on that matter. So your point of order is not valid. We proceed. Hon Malema?

Mr J S MALEMA: Hon Pravin Gordhan’s daughter Anisha sat on boards of companies that benefitted directly from the collapse of Eskom, and banks that are indebted to our biggest beneficiaries in the whole IPP looting scheme.

You need to complete the construction of Kusile and Meduphi. Billions of rand was stolen and that money is never going to be recovered. The sooner you complete these two projects the better. Build nuclear power stations using the build-operate transfer model ... [Inaudible.] ... of how the private sector will use their money, operate ... [Inaudible.] ... transfer operation and maintenance skills to state ... [Inaudible.]

An HON MEMBER: Chairperson, order.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon Malema, just a minute. Hon member, please sit down. I have not pointed at you. Please sit.

An HON MEMBER: Who’s that? No, he’s sitting.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Please sit.

An HON MEMBER: He’s sitting.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: I’m ordering you to sit.

An HON MEMBER: Oh, me?

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Yes. Thank you very much. Please proceed hon Malema. [Interjections.]

Mr J S MALEMA: We know you will not implement all of these basic solutions because you are hell-bent on deregulating electricity under the misguided idea that competition will reduce electricity prices and will lead to an increase in foreign direct investment. This is misguided because even in a

capitalist economy basic logic together with empirical evidence shows that global investment in renewable energy is declining because of falling costs in wind and solar globally

... [Inaudible.] ... and without massive state subsidies ... [Inaudible.] ... project easily collapse.

An HON MEMBER: Chairperson, order.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon member, on what point are you rising?

An HON MEMBER: I’m calling an order on you Chair, with the hon member on the podium.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon member, on what point are you rising.

An HON MEMBER: You are saying that gender-based violence is invalid. I don’t think you are fair to yourself and the member at the podium. There is a point that relates to gender-based violence that has been raised here and you are saying in your ruling it is invalid in South Africa. Chair, you are out of order yourself.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: I have already made a ruling on that matter, hon members. I therefore plead with all of you to please co-operate and work together so that we can proceed with the business of the House. I am now going to ask hon Malema to proceed with his speech.

Mr J S MALEMA (Contd.): I don’t believe that you entirely believe in state-owned banks. The EFF has forced the hand of the ruling party in 2018 to open a state bank, yet the ruling party was reluctant.

Your Minister of Finance only woke up the following year to hijack the superior logic of the EFF. We know that you don’t believe in state-owned banks. We are therefore challenging you to ensure that this bank is implemented. We want to a bank that is going to help petrol attendants, domestic workers and farmworkers without charging them abnormal interests. We want this bank to exist because we know that banks like Absa, First National Bank, FNB, and Capitec racially profile our people and are racist in deciding who they want to assist.

Mr President, we know that you stole the idea of the EFF on

... [Interjections.] ... Sovereign Wealth Fund, because the

EFF is the one ... [Interjections.] ... that’s always been ... [Interjections.]

Mr S M KULA: On a point of order!

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: I am asking you to sit down, hon member?

Mr S M KULA: Again, I want to ask a question but not about gender-based violence.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Please sit down. I have not recognised you. [Interjections.]

Ms R T SIWEYA: Chairperson, I want to speak on the issue of gender-based violence as far as your ruling is concerned. Last week, in this House, a young woman seated at that corner was beaten by a bottle of water by the members of the EFF; until today that matter has not been discussed. So, I am just saying that for hon Malema not to respond to the issues of gender- based violence it be recorded in this House that he is endorsing that he does abuse women. Thank you Chairperson. [Applause.]

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon members, on the question of gender-based violence and on the specific issues raised with regard to hon Malema, I have already made a ruling. As presiding officers, we intend to come back to this House not only on this particular matter but on all other related matters with regards to getting this House to function properly, so that we maximise the output and ensure that we do the work that we have been mandated to do as public representatives.

I am going to once again, one more time, plead with all of you to please co-operate and allow us to proceed with the business of Parliament.

Mr J S MALEMA: Just bear in mind Chairperson that I said I am going to respond to that question. It is unavoidable. When I respond to it, many of you will regret because I will reveal certain things in a short while. ... [Interjections.] ... Let me deal with issues.

On Sovereign Wealth Fund, Mr President, we want you to establish it to help us to ensure that we finance our own economy but also create the necessary employment in our country through it. We know that Norway and Dubai have done

it. We have the capacity to do it. We just need the political will to deal with it.

For the first time, Mr President, we have a Deputy Minister of Finance who doesn’t have dedicated responsibilities and we think that he is well-capacitated to can specifically handle this matter and ensure it is delivered on time.

Mr President, you didn’t say anything on the Reserve Bank particularly on its nationalisation. Our people want their sovereignty through ownership of their own wealth. Therefore, we want the Reserve Bank to be owned only by the state and not together the private sector, so that the state can give direction on what needs to happen with it.

On the issue of the land, Mr President, from the beginning, we never trusted you. We knew very well that you were using this matter to try and win votes. The land question is an emotive issue. It is not an issue that we should play political games with.

We therefore call upon you and the ruling party to be decisive on this matter. You are sending us back to go and listen to our people. You have already told us what needs to happen. We

need to expropriate land without compensation. [Applause.] That’s the only way we can restore the dignity of our people. We want the ANC to agree with us on this question that the land must be expropriated without compensation. Section 25 of the Constitution must be amended because it is only through this that we will take our people out of the shacks and make sure that they effectively participate in the economy, in particular, on issues of agriculture.

Comrade President, you have not created any jobs. Since you became President, unemployment has increased in South Africa. Instead of being a President that creates jobs, you are a President that creates unemployment. You need to know that since you came in, more young people are unemployed. It is exactly this misguided belief that you have that you are looking for foreign direct investment to create jobs; it will never work.

The only way we can create jobs in this country is to have a decisive state intervention in the commanding heights of the economy. We need to own the mines, banks and industries to ensure that we put money where it matters the most.

Comrade President, you spoke about a new smart city. That question is premature. Before you even go to smart cities, fix Alexandra and before you create a smart city, let us go and fix Khayelitsha. [Applause.] Let’s give the people of Giyani water. [Interjections.] How can you start a smart city in Gauteng which is overpopulated? The only way we can help our people is to identify hopeless areas with no economic activity hope and use those areas to create a smart city and make sure that there are economic activities in those types of areas.

Gauteng is overpopulated. The only way we can depopulate Gauteng is by creating other cities outside Gauteng, so that we allow other provinces and towns to grow.

So, all we are saying Mr President is that you are not ... we know very well. There is no smart city you are going to create but also that it is not your idea ... that one of Lanseria. It was there in 2011. To come here and create an impression that you came with a super idea of creating a smart city in Lanseria is being disingenuous.

If you want a legacy of your own, there is Lephalale and many other areas where we can create democratic cities and make sure that we grow the economy in hopeless areas.

I heard you, Mr President, saying you are going to start a university in Ekurhuleni. We agree with that idea. We also support that idea. But before we even open universities, like we did with opening glorified high schools in Mpumalanga and Northern Cape without clear strategic objectives, why can’t we extend the infrastructure of the existing universities? [Applause.] Why can’t we help Wits University to buy the whole of Braamfontein and the area becomes Wits city, like Oxford and make sure that we get as many young people to go and learn at Wits? Why can’t we ask to Wits to go and open a campus in Rustenburg that is relevant to mining and ensure that we produce young people with skills that are relevant to the economy of their own town?

For sure you don’t know, Mr President, that there was a University of Johannesburg, UJ, campus ... hon Naledi would know ... in Ekurhuleni, which was later closed down because there was no electricity, water and the university was not serviced. This campus was opened during the merging of universities under a democratic government but you still failed to run that campus in Ekurhuleni.

Let us not be excited with opening universities and naming them after ourselves, let’s instead extend the capacity of what is already there.

Mr President, there is also no clear plan on how you are going to finance the needy students. The National Student Financial Aid Scheme, NSFAS, is there but there is still crisis. Every year, children must go to the university to be humiliated, to sing poems about their poverty and to tell how much poor they are whereas these people are Sassa beneficiaries. Why can’t we have a system that is linked; that a child coming from a no- fee school ... [Applause.] ... a child that comes from Sassa grant and an orphan that by the time they arrive at the university, they aren’t asked to sing their poverty but automatically know that this one cannot afford. So, let us make sure that we link the system. [Interjections.]

You have appointed the most incapable person to be a Minister of Higher Education. I can tell you now that he is not going to help you with anything. The man just likes talking ... [Interjections.] ... He was the most hostile during the #feesmustfall campaign and did not help students ... [Interjections.]

Mr W T LETSIE: I am rising on a point of order. Hon Malema is misleading the House. Already when you are a Sassa beneficiary, you do not have to even provide proof to NSFAS

... [Interjections.] ... how poor you are. So, he is lying.

... [Interjections.] ... He’s been accusing the President of stealing ideas whereas he comes and presents an idea that is already living as if it is his own. So, he must stop misleading the House. Thank you very much. [Applause.]

Mr J S MALEMA: So, let’s have a clear free education from early childhood development to the first degree. That is how we are going to ensure that our people benefit from this democratic dispensation.

The De Klerk matter, Mr President, I do not understand why we continue to give him the benefits as a former Deputy President or even the President because those benefits are given to former presidents to go around and spread a positive message and to be nation-builders. There is absolutely nothing that De Klerk does with regard to nation-building. Many of you are scared to confront this question because De Klerk has your force numbers. You were spies and you are scared that when you take De Klerk head-on, your files of being spies will be released and you will be exposed of who you are; that you are

not actually revolutionaries but impimpis [spies] who were on the payroll of De Klerk and the apartheid regime. [Applause.]

Comrade President, we must ensure that we teach the white supremacists a lesson by treating De Klerk in a manner that shows that we have no tolerance for racists. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: You are a tribalist!

Mr J S MALEMA: But if treat De Klerk the same way we treat Nelson Mandela, the white supremacists and their children will never see anything wrong because the man ... [Interjections.]

... who presided over the murder of our people is celebrated. So, we must make sure that De Klerk is punished, so that anyone who wants to follow the examples of De Klerk doesn’t do so because they will know that history will catch up with them and will punish them.

Comrades, we must deal decisively with white monopoly capital. We must refuse the Ruperts and the Oppenheimers to own this country and to run the affairs of this country through the President. Mr President, I saw something very unique in your Deputy President and thought we must pay a closer attention to

him. DD intervened decisively in Jabu Mabuza’s misleading of the President. [Interjections] ...

An HON MEMBER: Order Chair!

Mr J S MALEMA: ... and we were able to get direction from the hon Deputy President ... [Interjections.] ... So, hon Deputy President ... [Interjections.]

Mr T V MASHELE: On a point of order!

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon members, can we just clarify this one little issue. If you want to speak, you raise your hand ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: You do not recognise us.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: I just want to repeat that again. If you want to speak, you raise your hand. Upon seeing you, I will point at you. Only then ...

An HON MEMBER: We are not in a classroom, man.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: ... you can stand up and tell on what point you are rising on. Can we please do that? Let me give you an opportunity to speak. Firstly, on what point are you rising?

Mr T V MASHELE: I am rising on a point of order, Chairperson. The hon member Malema called the Deputy President, DD. We don’t have a DD here. We have an hon member Deputy President DD Mabuza.

Mr J S MALEMA: Hon DD Mabuza, you intervened decisively on the issue of Jabu Mabuza, hon Jamnadas and Eskom. What made me to pay closer attention to you was when Johann Rupert said he can’t have you as a president. I therefore knew that there was something about you which all of us ... I will make an appeal that we pay ... [Interjections.] ... attention to the Deputy President.

*Sepedi*:

Mna J S MALEMA (Cont): ... re se ke ra mo lebelela ka go phakiša.

*English*:

It looks like the Deputy President has something to offer. [Applause.] That is why the Ruperts say they can’t have him as the President. [Interjections.] So, we must make sure ...

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon Malema, just a minute. Hon member, on what point are you rising?

Mr B M HADEBE: I am rising on Rule 14, hon Chair, which states that no member shall refer to any other member by his or her first name. He just said, “Hon Jamnadas”. Can he withdraw. [Interjections.] You cannot refer to a member by his or her first name.

Dr M Q NDLOZI: We have reading problems here, and this is taking us time. [Interjections.] Why don’t you read, guys? It is not hard! Just read!

Mr J S MALEMA: Hon Gordhan.

Mr J B MAMABOLO: You think you are more educated than everybody? Can I call out ... [Inaudible.] ... that Madlozi, what is that Madlozi. [Interjections.] Madlozi.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Because it is not a point of order; we will proceed. Please sit down, hon member. [Interjections.] Hon Malema, please proceed.

Mr J S MALEMA: No, Chair, let me answer your question on domestic violence. When I spoke here during the state of the nation address last year, I said that anyone who has never beaten his wife in the past 25 years must raise his hand. I said I can raise my hand because I have no history of such things. I have never laid a hand, not once - not on my ex, not on my wife, not on anything – I have never laid a hand on my wife. I asked that question precisely because I got information that the President used to beat his wife, Nomazizi

– the late wife of the President. [Interjections.] May her soul rest in peace. [Interjections.] Chair, I raised that issue because I said to the President that he cannot lead us against gender-based violence if he does not accept that ... [Interjections.] Isn’t it you started this with the wrong person. [Interjections.] This is the first one I am mentioning about the President, I am coming to three other people ... [Inaudible.]

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon Malema, please sit down.

Mr J S MALEMA: You started it with the wrong person. [Interjections.]

Mr J B MAMABOLO: Chairperson, I am rising on Rule 14(a). The fellow here is trying to deviate from the fact of the matter here at hand. [Interjections.] Why are you mentioning the President, and mentioning others, blah blah blah ...

*Sepedi*:

... mokgwa wa gago o mpheane. O no phela o bolela ka bofeane. Hee, hee ...

*English:*

... this rumour, whatever. Chief, get to the point; answer the question. Are you abusing your wife, answer with yes or no. Stop involving other members of the House here. [Interjections.].

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon members ...

Mr J S MALEMA: The answer is no. I have no problem giving that

... [Inaudible.] But I ... [Interjections.].

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon members. Hon Malema, please sit down. Hon members, clearly, there is a problem in the House. Clearly there is a problem in the House [Interjections.] One of the problems that lead to this big problem is the fact that members stand up and input on the integrity of other members. [Interjections.] Now, this kind of behaviour should not be happening in this Joint Sitting, because if you do that, other will stand up and do the same and the results will be chaos a general sense of disintegration and overall undermining of the House. I am pleading with all of us to carry ourselves and to behave in a befitting manner. We should conduct ourselves in a manner that seeks to ensure that we are able to carry out the responsibilities and the mandate that has been given to us as public representatives.

The second problem that I want to draw members’ attention to relates to the use of offensive language. Now, Rule 14(p) of the Joint Rules reads as follows: No member shall use offensive or unbecoming language. What we have experienced here today is seriously disturbing. For example, people being referred to as fools and things, and of course the two people who have done that is a member at the back there as well as the hon Malema himself. The issue regarding the use of

offensive language extends to the usage of words such as “impimpis” and things like, “we need impipis” and other related comments that have been made by members. Can I call on members to please allow us to continue with the proceedings, and allow the hon Malema to conclude his speech. [Interjections.]

Mr J S MALEMA: I am not concluding.

Before he does so, I just want to emphasise that the presiding officers will come back to the House and having examined all of these happenings and developments, they will make inputs regarding this House which will hopefully lead to an improved situation improving compared to how it is today. Please allow hon Malema to conclude his speech. Hon Malema?

Mr J S MALEMA: I am not concluding sir,

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Just a minute. Hon Mahambehlala, come with your point of order.

Mr J S MALEMA: I can be very personal. If you want me to be personal, I can be very personal.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Please hon Malema, just a minute. Hon Mahambehlala?

Ms T MAHAMBEHLALA: Hon Julius, you can sit down now. Chairperson, hon Malema is casting aspersions on the President. The question was about him and only him. When he responds and decides to respond, he must respond to the question and not cast aspersions on the President. So, through you Chair, he must withdraw. Thank you. [Interjections.]

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Indeed ... er ... hon Malema ...

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: Chair, can I rise on a point of order.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: No, sit down.

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: But we have been raising ... [Interjections.]

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Please sit down.

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: But you should recognise us.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: I will.

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: Please do.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Please sit down. Hon Malema?

Mr J S MALEMA: Yes.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Of course, one of the remarks that you have made - and I am sure you won’t deny this, is this comment on the President. Can you please withdraw the remark? [Interjections.]

Mr J S MALEMA: No, no, wait Deputy President, wait. Chair, the question was about my take on gender-based violence. And it was extended and it asked, “Do you abuse your wife?” [Interjections.] So, I answered the question on the wife and I am now dealing with my perspective on gender-based violence. [Interjections.] It must not be gender-based violence when it comes to Julius Malema and when it comes to your President, it is not gender-based violence. I am a president of an organisation too. [Interjections.] And I shall treat your President the same way you treat me. Now, I want to tell you

...

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon Malema, hon Malema, hon Malema?

Mr J S MALEMA: You asked me about gender-based violence. I am now on the President and I am still going to talk about others. [Interjections.]

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon Malema, I have asked you a clear direct question. I have asked you to withdraw what you have said about the President. [Interjections.] I am requesting you to do that.

Dr M Q NDLOZI: Chairperson, with the greatest respect ... [Interjections.]

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: If you can just indicate to us what is your response to that.

Dr M Q NDLOZI: Chairperson, with the greatest respect, can I rise on a point of order. With the greatest respect ...

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon Ndlozi, please sit down. [Interjections.]

Mr J S MALEMA: Chair?

Dr M Q NDLOZI: I want to assist you.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Can you please sit down.

Dr M Q NDLOZI: I want to assist you, Chair, respectfully.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Please sit down. [Interjections.]

Dr M Q NDLOZI: But aspersions are not worth the ... [Interjections.]

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Please sit down. Thank you very much. [Interjections.] Can I again, hon members, ask you hon members to please sit down. Please sit down. It is me pleading with you to please sit down as a presiding officer. Hon Malema, can you please respond to what I am asking you to do. I am asking you to withdraw the remark that has been made about the President. [Interjections.]

Mr J S MALEMA: Okay, let me maybe explain this thing differently. [Interjections.]

Mr J S MALEMA (Contd.): Aaah! You don’t want the truth? [Interjections.] Your President abused his ex-wife; it’s a reality. [Interjections.] You can abuse power the way you want abuse it. You come to me and you say to me I abuse my wife. I give you the facts. Now I can’t [Interjections.] [Inaudible.] with the facts. That’s your President [Interjections.] [Inaudible.] I’m not going anywhere. [Inaudible.] Give the President [Interjections.] [Inaudible.] you come to me [Interjections.] [Inaudible.]

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon Malema, I’m now ordering you to leave the House.

Mr J S MALEMA: I ask you, I’m even taking you to court about it. To show I’ve got nothing to hide [Interjections.] [Inaudible.] President. You come to me with your nonsense, I give you nonsense. [Interjections.] I’m not scared of nothing. I’m not part of your faction. I can leave the House now. But fact remains, Nomazizi must rest in peace. She was abused by your President.

ANC MEMBERS: Leave, leave, leave, leave, leave, leave, leave, leave. [Applause.] [Whistling.]

Ms T MAHAMBEHLALA: Before hon Malema leaves the House.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon Malema, please leave the House.

AN HON MEMBER: Leave the House. Hamba [leave.]. Hamba VBS, hamba.

AN HON MEMBER: Dictator. He’s a dictator. The only speaker in his own party; a dictator. Useless! [Applause.]

AN HON MEMBER: Hamba sticks, hamba.

AN HON MEMBER: Hon Chair, can the bodyguards also follow their master.

AN HON MEMBER: Take your puppets with you. Take your puppets.

HON MEMBERS: ... leave, leave ...

AN HON MEMBER: ... with your fools ...

AN HON MEMBER: ... bodyguards, bodyguards, follow the master

...

*Isixhosa*:

AN HON MEMBER: ... ningosathana ...

AN HON MEMBER: ... hamba sticks, hamba ...

AN HON MEMBER: ... ningosathana ...

*English*:

AN HON MEMBER: ... bodyguards ... take your puppets with you

...

*Isixhosa*:

AN HON MEMBER: ... hambani ...

AN HON MEMBER: ... ningosathana, aniyifuni inyaniso ... [Inaudible.]

*English*:

AN HON MEMBER: ... water ...

*Isixhosa*:

AN HON MEMBER: ... ningosathana ...

*English*:

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| AN | HON | MEMBER: | ... ice boy ... |
| AN | HON | MEMBER: | [Inaudible.] khabaduo |
| AN | HON | MEMBER: | Let them go |
| AN | HON | MEMBER: | [Inaudible.] such an organization, you only |

follow Malema

AN HON MEMBER: ... leave clowns, leave clowns, leave clowns, leave clowns ...

AN HON MEMBER: ... bodyguards, follow your master.

*Isixhosa*:

AN HON MEMBER: ... ningosathana, ningosathana

*English*:

AN HON MEMBER: ... follow your master

AN HON MEMBER: ... ice boy, don’t forget to give him ice

*Isixhosa*:

AN HON MEMBER: ... ningosathana

*English*:

AN HON MEMBER: ... ice boy, make sure you have Julius’ phone there ...

AN HON MEMBER: ... ice boy

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Thank you very much, hon members.

*Isixhosa*:

AN HON MEMBER: ... aniyifuni inyaniso

*English*:

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: We now proceed to the next speaker, hon Dodovu. Sorry, sorry, hon Mangosuthu Buthelezi.

AN HON MEMBER (FEMALE): Chair, I want to raise this concern. It happened during state of the nation address, it happened today. When we want to rise and switch our mics, our mics are off; but the mics on the other side are on; and that is not fairness from our side and you consistently instruct us to sit down. How are going to point as if our mics are not red?

Because the other ones just rise without being noted. Now, that consistency is going to assist us moving forward, hon presiding officer. So, I’m bringing that thing to your

attention. Our mics can never be switched off; if there’s something wrong with the people show are operating the mics *nje* [just] generally, that thing has to be addressed because it sends a particular message of sabotage and it cannot be allowed. Thank you very much. [Applause.]

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: The question of switch of mics must be investigated and looked into. The Table will look into that and at the next sitting we’ll give you a report.

*IsiXhosa*:

UMBHEXESHI OYINTLOKO WEQELA ELILAWULAYO: Sihlalo, ndithi

mandiyiveze le nto kule Ndlu yelungu elihloniphekileyo uMama uSonti ubiza amalungu eNdlu yoWiso-mthetho yeSizwe ngoosathana.

*English*:

On record ...

*IsiXhosa*:

... ndithi ke ...

*English*:

... that matter must also be referred to Powers and privileges...

*IsiXhosa*:

... kuba uyithetha le nto siphakamise isandla ese lapha ngaphakathi ntonje imibhobho yokuthetha ibingasebenzi. Ngoko ke ndiyayiphakamisa into yokuba...

*English:*

... members were insulted here, by hon Sonti. Thank you.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: The matter must be part of the list to be looked into. Hon member!

AN HON MEMBER (FEMALE): Chairperson, firstly, is the complaint, that you always ask us to sit down, we raise our hands and you don’t recognise us.

Secondly, when hon Malema was casting aspersions on the person of the President on a question that the president has previously responded in this very House, you don’t recognise us to clarify that matter. The President was asked whether he has abused his wife. And the President said he has never abused his wife. In the public domain it was said it was his

first wife, and Mrs Hope Ramaphosa went on public record and said I’ve not been abused; Cyril Ramaphosa has never laid a hand on me. And then he turned and he says it’s Nomazizi; because now she’s now late, may her soul rest in peace, she can’t stand and speak for herself.

Chairperson, you are not fair to us, you are not fair to us defending the organisation and the people of the country. [Applause.]

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Point noted. All I can say members, hon members, is ... as presiding officers we do whatever we can to run the House in an even-handed manner, in a manner that seeks to ensure that these difficulties do not arise, where they arise we’ll acknowledge them. And if need be, apologise accordingly. Nompendulo!

Ms N T MKHATSHWA: Chair, to correct you, it’s hon Mkhatshwa.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon Mkhatshwa!

Ms N T MKHATSHWA: Chair, I would like to raise as a concern to the House the fact that we have as a House politicised the gender-based violence issue in this House and we fail to

address the issue of violence having taken place in this House with an hon member, and we would like to make sure that the Chairperson investigates that particular incident to ensure that such behaviour does not continue to occur in this House. Thank you very much, Chair. [Applause.]

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: House Chairperson, I feel I have to rise, not to waste the time of the House. But to register the extreme disappointment of the DA and disgust at what has just taken place. I actually feel physically ill that I sit in a House of Parliament with hon members who certainly do not earn the title, hon members. [Applause.] I have never quite heard insults being hurled at people in their individual capacity as well as people in race groupings, and I find it an abomination of everything that we as the rainbow nation stand for.

To have to sit through a sitting of a debate of the magnitude of the state of the nation address in front of the President, the Deputy President, the Leader of the Official Opposition and all South Africans, and be insulted and be subjected to the grossness that I have to experience to day [Applause.] and I would like to put it on record that I speak on behalf of all women.

When I think that when a political point is made of women who are abused and who are murdered on a daily basis. Women in this country suffer from posttraumatic stress and from stress disorders because we are under siege, we are at war with one another, and when this kind of this is made light of, to make political point scoring a big deal in this House, it is appalling. And if anyone in this country thinks that what just happened in this House is acceptable, they certainly need their heads read, and we as Parliament now need to stand together and say “enough is enough”, this House in an hon House; the decorum must be restored. And if you cannot behave yourself in an hon fashion you do not belong in the servant public Parliament of South Africa. [Applause.]

Mr N SINGH: Hon Chairperson, I rise on a point of order. From the time this debate has started, many members of this House have been cutting their noses to spite their faces. And it does not take rocket science to understand what the strategy is of the ruling party. And one may have some understanding of that strategy. But when we start getting personal in the manner that we have, it just totally unacceptable. And I think the hon President is capable enough, when he responds to the debate, to respond to some of the issues that have been raised. That is his responsibility and he will do that. And it

doesn’t take us to stand up and down here like jumping jack flashes to answer on his behalf, let him answer, he will answer.

But I want you, hon Chairperson, to proceed with this because millions of South Africans out there are starving, they are unemployed, and here we are having personal slanging matches.

Let us now listen to a real response to the state of the nation from the hon Prince Buthelezi. [Laughter.] [Applause.]

The MINISTER OF INTERNATIONAL RELATIONS AND CO-OPERATION:

Chairperson, I rise in terms of the Joint Rules and particularly the use of offensive language. You have referred to some of the comments of the hon leader of the EFF that were made from the podium. There is a worst comment, which I cannot repeat because I was properly brought up, but I would like you to pay attention to Hansard and I believe that must come before a disciplinary committee of this institution. It was absolutely disgusting and I think it should not be allowed in this House.

The CHAIRPESON OF THE NCOP: Hon members, indeed, all of these issues will receive attention, will be referred to the relevant committees and it will be recorded as such.

Prince M G BUTHELEZI: Hon Chairperson of the National Council of Provinces; Your Excellency the President and your Excellency the Deputy President, hon members, Ministers and hon Deputy Ministers and hon premiers, on 8 January 1912, several hundred learned men of our nation gathered in Bloemfontein to chart a course to liberation. In their midst was but one woman, Mrs Charlotte Mannya-Maxeke.

It is that woman whom I wish to quote today. She said, “This work is not for yourselves. Kill that spirit of self and do not live above your people; but live with them. And if you can rise, bring someone with you.

Now this year, we commemorate 150 years birthday of Mrs Charlotte Mannya-Maxeke. We also celebrate the 30th anniversary of Madiba’s release. With these anniversaries, and many more, we are inclined to consider the state of our nation against the original dream. Has it been achieved? Have we come far enough? Is this in fact the country we imagined? Is what we have just seen now what all the people sacrifices their

lives to liberate this country that they did so, so that we should see the drama that we have just watched.

Now, to go back to my speech I must say that the theme for the Sixth Parliament is well chosen, which is following up on our commitments to the people. It is clear that some of the commitments made in 1994, and repeated ever since, are yet to be fulfilled. It is not that government has done nothing to fulfil them, but that the good work started has not been completed.

The great tragedy is that our work has not followed a linear course. Our work, our commitments, our intentions and our plans have been thoroughly waylaid by what Charlotte Mannya- Maxeke called “the spirit of self’. Leaders living above the people and enriching themselves.

We find ourselves now in desperate times, with an economy all but collapsing. Corruption has brought us here. It is not that South Africa is without hope, potential or assets. As the President said, there is “unbounded potential". The root of our problem is described in Proverbs chapter 13, verse 23: “Abundant food is in the fallow ground of the poor, but it is swept away by injustice.”

This is quite literally true. Mr President; there are around

40 000 commercial farmers in this country, feeding a population of some 55 million. Of course, we need to talk about land reform and social justice. But I think as we navigate an economic crisis, we must consider food security as a matter of urgency. To me, it’s a priority.

Unless we empower rural communities to produce food for themselves and for market, our people are staring into the eyes of starvation. I am not being overdramatic. Where there is poverty, unemployment and reliance on an unsustainable social grant system, the basic needs of food, water, shelter and electricity automatically take centre stage.

Your Excellency; I wonder whether anyone on the street could articulate government's three major projects to stimulate our economy. Does anyone know or understand what is being done? Or do they still wonder if anything is being done at all?

The chasm that exists between our people's lived experience and our government's programmes, policies and intentions, is damaging. It is this that the IFP sought to protect against when we engaged in constitutional negotiations.

Prior to 1994 when parties gathered around the negotiating table, the IFP took a stand for the devolution of powers in order to bring resources and decision-making closer to the people.

We sought to decentralise governance, precisely to avoid what South Africa has now: a government where all the power and resources are held at the top in the hands of a few.

Local government, I think is the first point of contact, and generally the only point of contact between the people and government. It is at the level of local government that the basic needs of our people are properly understood, measured and in fact attended to.

It is municipalities that address the bread and butter issues, like water, electricity and food production. And yet we have, across our country, municipalities that cannot even provide water to their communities, because municipalities are at the mercy of those higher up who control the allocation of infrastructure grants.

While the national government holds the purse-strings in an iron grip, local government is being starved and suffocated. I think we need to get the money down to where it is needed; to

where it is used to meet our people's immediate and basic needs.

This is the best practice in any democratic system, but more so in a time of severe economic crisis. It is time to empower our local government. Unless power is decentralised away from the top, then corruption will continue to eat away at the resources that are intended for our people.

We meant it when we said in 1995, “Let the people govern“.

Your Excellency; when you spoke last Thursday one could not help but feel that we were being told the truth at last. The stark reality you described of economic stagnation, deepening unemployment, an energy crisis and severe poverty, was honest. It stood in sharp contrast to the state of the nation address we were subjected to for a full decade, where the false narrative was spun that “there is a good story to tell".

We appreciate hearing the truth from the lips of our head of state and our head of government. But we cannot avoid the obvious question: Why did this government not tell us the truth before, as the President has now done? Why did it avoid the truth for years and years, until South Africa was reduced

to such dire circumstances that untruths were no longer possible?

Mr President, you described everything that has been done in the last two years to try to put our country back on track, but you lamented and I quote you “It has not been enough“.

Sadly, it was never going to be enough. South Africa was taken too far in the wrong direction. Economic recovery will take years, and it depends on a multitude of factors.

So when our President describes billions of rands’ worth of projects, I then have to ask the question, “Where will these billions come from?" The Director-General in the Treasury has told us that the coffers of the state are empty, state-owned enterprises bailouts have depleted our resources; the very state-owned enterprises that the President admits have endured years of corruption, mismanagement and state capture. Surely colleagues, we are talking about treason here.

Yet there have been no arrests, the President simply says that the work of the Zondo Commission is continuing. Will we ever see arrests and convictions? Or will this be another Umzimvubu

Dam; spoken about year after year, with very little to show for it.

There are many conversations that have been going on for years with little to show for it. The problem of high data costs is one of them. Your Excellency, We appreciate the indication that this is finally going to change. But the question is when? We need a timeframe, lest our people lose hope.

Another conversation that began years ago, with the late hon Dr Mario Oriani-Ambrosini, is the medical use of cannabis. I want to personally thank you, Your Excellency, for the commitment to formulate policy this year.

May I urge you sir, please go further into what our late colleague tabled. It is essential that South Africa become a centre of medical innovation and research. If we fail to consider innovative treatment for Cancer alone, the National Health Insurance, NHI will collapse almost instantly.

It was also the late hon Dr Ambrosini who for more than a decade ago warned the Minister of Finance, the Minister of Economic Development and the President that the speed at which our country's debt was growing had become unsustainable. It

worries me that only now in 2020; the President is saying that our debt into quoting is heading towards unsustainable levels. South Africa carries a debt burden that we have no way of repaying, and we have no plan on how to repay it.

In these dire circumstances, it is absolutely true that government cannot rescue South Africa on its own as the President stated even if it did everything it was able to do. There must be partnerships and social compacts. I have often said that we will either swim together, or sink together.

Social cohesion is vital at this point.

Ironically hon members, the EFF gave us a valuable lesson last week. They proved that diverse people can be united when faced with a shared problem. I agree with our Chief Whip, the hon Mr Singh that the Joint Rules need to be revisited to close the door to the kind of embarrassing display we endured that week.

In a time of such volatility and uncertainty, our people do not need panem et circenses. We need integrity, solutions and justice. I thank you. [Time expired.] [Applause.]

Mr T S C DODOVU: Deputy Speaker, His Excellency President Ramaphosa, Deputy President Mabuza, hon Members of Parliament,

ladies and gentlemen, I preface my contribution to this important debate by joining millions of people across the global village in saluting President Mandela as we mark the 30th anniversary of his release from prison in 1990. I rise to express our collective, fervent appreciation of Madiba for the indelible contribution he made in bringing about freedom in our land. I salute him because he taught us that apartheid was a crime against humanity and that we had to fight it with all the weapons at our disposal. This was the way in which Madiba made a deposit into our moral banking account so that we can emulate his virtue and his exemplary leadership.

As we walk along the path and solid foundation laid by Madiba, we owe a special debt of gratitude to him because he has enriched our lives with the magic of his words, the enchantment of his image, the acuity of his insights and the magnitude of his vision.

Madiba taught us that, in order to rise to the majestic heights of success and glory and in order to achieve the strategic objectives of building a united, nonracial and nonsexist democracy, we have to work together. We have to develop partnerships and we have to co-ordinate our actions so as to advance the national development agenda.

In taking this message forward, two months ago, the Select Committee on Co-operative Government and Traditional Affairs, Cogta, in the NCOP called to Parliament five municipalities with the highest accumulated irregular expenditure. We called them because, in his 2017-18 consolidated report, the Auditor- General stated that the spending of these municipalities went against their own budgets, that they were breaking their own municipal policies and bylaws and that they were awarding contracts which were not going through proper supply-chain management processes.

These municipalities are Nelson Mandela Bay and OR Tambo in the Eastern Cape, Johannesburg in Gauteng, the City of Matlosana in North West and Mogalakwena in Limpopo. Three of these municipalities are governed by the ANC while two were under the DA-EFF marriage of inconvenience which has recently imploded. [Interjections.]

We also visited the Mtubatuba municipality in KwaZulu-Natal which is governed by the IFP in coalition. Due to political infightings and financial instability, the Kwazulu-Natal provincial government has placed this municipality under administration in terms of Section 139 of the Constitution.

We have invited the City of Cape Town Metro municipality to our committee meeting tomorrow, that is, Wednesday, to account for its underexpenditure of about R5 billion during the 2018-

19 financial year. Failure to spend this budget by the City of Cape Town, especially on capital infrastructure, is a setback to the people of Langa, Phillipi, Khayelitsha and Gugulethu. These people, too, are desperately yearning for services like water, better roads, community facilities and electricity in their homes. No amount of reason can justify why the City of Cape Town did not spend these funds which had been earmarked for the poor and were desperately needed by them.

Madam Deputy Speaker ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No! [Laughter.]

Mr T S C DODOVU: Sorry! Hon Deputy Speaker, the problems facing these municipalities are just the tip of the iceberg. They are a microcosm of a much bigger problem facing local government. The state of many of our municipalities leaves much to be desired and needs urgent attention. I think we have unfortunately underestimated the magnitude of the challenges facing government at municipal level. Local government remains

one of the most complex and protracted projects of state transformation since 1994.

It is for this reason that the ANC fully supports the district development model adopted by our government last year to address many of these problems facing municipalities. The district development model is a key intervention for service delivery, integrated planning and co-operative governance.

The model is being piloted in the OR Tambo district, eThekwini metro and Waterberg district and it is anticipated that it will fast-track service delivery and ensure adequate support and resources for municipalities to enable them to fulfil their constitutional mandate.

For this model to succeed, each district or metropolitan municipality must accelerate, align and integrate service delivery under a single plan that is developed jointly by all spheres of government and other role-players like business, labour and our communities. In this way, the national priorities such as economic growth, employment creation, improvements to living conditions of our people and the fight against crime and corruption will be better co-ordinated

especially in the rural areas where these services are mostly needed.

In addition, the model will strengthen the working relations between municipalities and traditional leaders, and will address poverty, inequality and the aging infrastructure. It must also remodel the Community Work Program, the Extended Public Works Program and develop implementable local economic development, LED, strategies.

As we continue to resolve our problems, we must be responsible to the people. We must be frank, candid and honest about the challenges we are facing. As Mao Tse Tung of the People’s Republic of China taught us: our duty is to hold ourselves responsible to the people. Every word, every act and every policy we make must conform to the people’s interests, and if mistakes occur, we must admit and correct them - that is what being responsible to the people means.

It is unfortunate that leaders of major political parties have dismally failed to seize the strategic opportunity presented by the President in terms of ameliorating this situation.

Instead of maturely engaging on the issues, they only pour

venom, direct personal vitriolic attacks and pander to cheap populism. [Interjections.]

As for the DA — which has recently suffered heavy electoral losses to the Freedom Front Plus, especially in the white communities — its desperation has been uncovered, because you are replacing black leaders with white leaders and you are being unmasked for who you are — a white party which inherently preserves white supremacy and white interests. [Interjections.]

We want to express our disgust at the EFF’s kindergarten mentality of disrupting the SONA last week. Its threats of violence and of undermining freedom of speech need to be firmly resisted. Such behaviour has no place in our democratic order. As its leaders waddle about like infants in kindergarten, their behaviour can only confirm that they are still wet behind ears and their eyes need to be opened so that they can clearly see the way.

It is my considered view that is it clear that as we move towards the local elections next year, its anarchy and madness will reach unparalleled proportions if it is not arrested.

They will be looking for votes like predators that have

smelled blood and will strive to scavenge off what they call the ANC carcass.

We have the responsibility to defend the ANC and to defend the gains of our revolution.

Taking this forward, it is quite important that we listen to what the President has carefully said to us in terms of attending to these particular issues. The ANC is quite confident that these particular maters will be addressed.

On that basis, I really want express my profound gratitude to the President for his positive message to the people of South Africa. All of us should embrace it and take forward in terms of attending to the many challenges that are facing us. Thank you, honourable ... Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Dodovu, please contact my office to arrange a meeting so that I can assure you of one or two things here! [Laughter.]

Dr P J GROENEWALD: Deputy Speaker, through you, I want to start by saying to the hon President that I don’t deliver a speech today to score political points. It is a pity that we

saw what we saw this afternoon. South Africa is too deep in trouble and we have too many crises to waste our time on political point-scoring. It started with the ANC. It was an ANC member who started to ask a question to Malema. You don’t have to be very intelligent to understand and predict what the chaos will be. That is disrespectful of your own members towards you. [Interjections.]

Two years ago, you became the President of South Africa, pledging a new dawn of reform, economic growth and jobs. Those are South Africa’s main three problems, especially when we talk about jobs. We know that you can only create jobs if the economy grows well. You know that.

With great respect, a lot was said by the President in the Sona - reform, new legislation as far as procurement is concerned to favour Small, medium, and micro enterprises, SMMEs. Yes, you can register a company or a business within one day. Yes, your water rights will be dealt with within a 90-day period. I call that the cosmetics of economic growth. The real test is whether the economy grew in the two years.

Before you became the President, the economic growth rate was 1,4%. Under your leadership, the first year, it decreased to

0,8%. Today, the prediction of the Reserve Bank is that last year’s economic growth is going to be 0,4%. So, despite all your job summits, your conferences on investments, that is the reality of the economic growth rate.

Before you became the President, the unemployment rate was 26,7%, on the narrow definition. After your first year, it increased to 27,1% and last year to 29,1%. Those are the realities of what is happening to the economy.

Let us take Eskom. I stood at this podium and said numerous times that we have to do away with black economic empowerment, we have to do away with affirmative action and we must stop expropriation without compensation. Why did I say that?

Firstly, the people ask certain questions when it comes to Eskom.

The first thing they ask about is the war room. In 2014, when you became the Deputy President, you were appointed in charge of a war room of Eskom, to ensure no load shedding. I have asked you last year why you disbanded it. You explained by saying that you have requested it to be disbanded because there is not a CEO and so on. Now, you come again and start a new war room under the hon Deputy President. Why will he make

a success? The people are asking that. Will he be better than you?

During stage-six load shedding, you declared that there was sabotage. The people of South Africa are still asking how far the investigation is.

Furthermore, why do I say that you must stop black economic empowerment? Let me explain to you how it works in Eskom. Next time when you visit a hardware shop, you can ask them the price of a normal 4ft long fluorescent tube. It will be more or less R65, but Eskom procure that same tube for R900. Do you know why? It is because of black economic empowerment that we have that difference between R65 and R900. You can do an investigation and come back and be honest with the people so that they can see what happens with black economic empowerment. That is not economic empowerment; it is economic theft - the taxpayers’ money.

The FF Plus says that you must review the labour legislation. At municipalities - the ANC controls almost all the municipalities in South Africa - people must understand, if you want electricity, you have to pay for it. I understand the six kiloliters and six kilowatt free electricity. It is

acceptable, but there are many people who can afford it, but they don’t pay.

Furthermore, I asked you, hon President, to put a moratorium on black economic empowerment and affirmative action until South Africa has a growth rate of 5%. [Interjections.] Stop expropriation without compensation and you will be shocked once more to see how quick we will get to 5%.

I want to talk about affirmative action and I want to read a letter to you from a father in *Die Burger* of 20 June 2020.

*Afrikaans:*

Dit is van mnr Dirk Spangenberg van Bellville, en ek haal aan:

Ons dogter het twee weke gelede haar matriekuitslae gekry. Sy het agt onderskeidings gekry met ’n gemiddelde van 90%. Sy het talle gemeenskapsuitreike gedoen, asook IsiXhosa-kursusse, nogtans, nadat die sjampanjeproppe geskiet is om die suksesse te vier, moes ons trane afdroog, aangesien sy nie keuring gekry het om medies te studeer nie. Haar passie was en is steeds om ’n pediater te word en dit is hoekom sy so hard gewerk het.

Wat sê jy aan jou kind wanneer dit gebeur? Hoe hou jy haar positief wanneer drome vertrap word deur ’n stelsel van onregverdigheid?

*English:*

Hon President, I appeal to you, on Thursday, can you please answer this pupil. She has an average of 90% and eight distinctions, but she cannot study medicine.

Lastly, I also said numerous times that the Afrikaner wants to build this country. [Interjections.] We extend our hand to try to build. [Interjections.] On Reconciliation Day, you referred to the Blood River issue and the Voortrekkers as invaders or freedom fighters. With great respect, that was an insult to my ancestors. I am a descendant of those Voortrekkers.

*Afrikaans:*

Agb President, dit is nie nasiebou nie. [Tussenwerpsels.] Dit was ’n gelofte tussen die Voortrekkers en nie die regering nie. Ek wil ook vir die agb President sê dat dit nie oor gelofte- of versoeningsdag gaan nie.

*English:*

It is not or; it is and.

*Afrikaans:*

Die wat geloftefees wil hou, hou dit. Die wat versoeningsdag wil vier, vier dit.

*English:*

Reconciliation between the Voortrekkers and the Zulus happened in 1840 where they gave stones to each other as a symbol of peace and until today, there is peace.

In conclusion, hon President, every President has a legacy. You decide what your legacy will be. Let me tell you what the people feel your legacy is at the moment.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Your time has expired.

Dr P J GROENEWALD: I will just finish. [Interjections.] They say that the legacy we have is that we have a shocked President who cannot take decisions. Take the decision in the interest of South Africa and not in the interest of the ANC and you will have a good legacy. [Interjections.] Thank you.

An HONOURABLE MEMBER: Sit down, sit down!

The MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION: Deputy Speaker, His Excellency President Cyril Ramaphosa, hon Deputy President David Mabuza, hon members of the National Assembly and the NCOP, ladies and gentlemen, last week, President Ramaphosa asserted that, and I quote:

We have steadily improved the reach of education and intended for the basic needs of the poof.

Indeed, there is no doubt that the basic education system is beginning to reach the desired stability which is healthy for a large system as large and important as ours. The public system in South Africa continues to enjoy the confidence of South Africans and we have to give our best at all times.

South Africans continue to send almost 95% of the country’s learners to ordinary public schools.

On early childhood education, the President is indeed very correct in asserting that, and I quote:

The investment we make now in early childhood development and early school learning will yield great economic benefits in the next two decades and beyond.

The President’s assertion is supported by the World Bank, the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development, OECD, and the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organisation, Unesco. After President’s injunction during the 2019 state of the nation address we can report as a sector working together with Social Development that we are in the process of declaring two years prior to Grade 1 - Grade R and Grade R R - in the Basic Education. We will be tabling and Bill here amongst others which will pronounce on this matter.

Again, the ministries of Social Development and Basic Education are at an advanced stage in actualising the early childhood development, ECD, function shift from the Department of Social Development to the Department of Basic Education,

with transitional arrangements already determined. We have also regularised such transitional arrangements for the ECD function shift under the guidance of the Office of the Chief State Law Advisors. We have already drafted two proclamations. The national proclamation will be signed by His Excellency and the nine provincial proclamations will be signed by the honourable premiers in our nine provincial administrations. We are in the process of finalising the national framework for an integrated ECD which we will release for broad consultations.

We will also go on broad consultation during the course of this financial year. Finally, guided by the Government Technical Advisory Centre we are determining the financial and human resource implications of an integrated ECD programme at local, provincial and national levels.

Again, on the relevance of our educational outcomes into the future, the President also indicated that, and I quote:

There are immediate interventions that should be made to continue to improve the quality and the relevance of our educational outcomes.

In October 2019, as a department we undertook and completed field trials on the early learning national assessment in all our provinces. This assessment, which is designed to establish the level of school readiness for Grade 1 learners after completing Grade R, assesses the level of school readiness in terms of emerging literacy and numeracy skills and the underlying cognitive processing and executive functioning associated with improving learning outcomes in the Foundation Phase.

On the matter of skills for the changing world, as the sector we are mindful of the reports, including a report from the World Economic Forum that estimates that 60% of the current jobs will disappear in the next 10 years and that new skills will be required to function effectively in the future. As the sector we acknowledged the need to ensure that every South African child is equipped with skills, knowledge and competencies required to function effectively in a changing world and during the era of the Fourth Industrial Revolution. The Department of Basic Education has completed the development of the coding and robotics curriculum for Grade R-

9. We are assisted by experts in these areas comprising university lecturers, labour in the sector, experts from the industry, our partners in the civil society and education experts nationally and internationally. This exciting curriculum will equip learners with digital skills required for future jobs to function effectively in a changing world and will teach every South African child about artificial intelligence, virtual reality, 3-D printing and advanced manufacturing. We can say we have received a lot of support from the nongovernment organisations, NGOs, in this space. We want to give special thanks to Africa Teen Geeks, institutes of higher learning, especially Unisa and the Sasol Foundation for assisting us in this regard.

President, in response to the injunction that tablets should be availed to all learners, after your injunction in 2019, we immediately hosted a round table with all communication companies in the country and other players in the value chain of supplying connectivity, devices, digital content and information communication technology, ICT. Government’s vision and the Department of Basic Education’s comprehensive plan of ensuring that every learner has access to an ICT device by the end of the sixth administration was presented at this roundtable. Through the Independent Communications Authority of South Africa, Icasa, all network operators were allocated schools which they have to start with.

Our plan to provide ICT equipment, including assistive devices, prioritises learners with special education needs, learners in multigrade schools, learners in farm school areas and learners in hard to reach areas. The plan has started and will be completed before the end of March. We can report that, for instance, Vodacom will complete its quota of 140 special schools by June. MTN has already done 33 and by the end of the financial year they would have done 102. Foundations like the Thabo Mbeki Foundation have also come to the party to assist us to reach this target

President, you also spoke about skills for the future. Because of time we can’t give you lots of details about how far we have gone around the curriculum for skills of the future, but plans are underway using different programmes and support that we have to ensure that we convert a number of schools into schools of specialisation and schools of vocational education and focus schools. We have signed memorandums of understating with companies like Ford South Africa which will be donating

200 engines, gearboxes and a car to different schools. It will be adopting a school per province. Ford South Africa has come to the party. Toyota and BMW are also working with other provinces.

President, you also applauded the class of 2019. We agree that it is very encouraging to see green shoots in the system as much as all need to be done. I also want to talk about the General Education Certificate, GEC, qualification. We are making lots of progress about it. I want to clarify that the GEC certificate is not there to encourage learners to leave the system before time, but it is meant to provide different pathways for our learners. We are piloting it in 2021 with the intention of fully rolling it out in 2021.

Again, we have made lots of programmes around the early grade reading assessment, EGRA. I want to quickly run and leave all the issues that we can report on Basic Education around early grade reading to the work that we have done around the areas that you have directed us to.

I want to go back to the financial support for postschools students. I want to confirm to what the Minister of Higher Education and Training has said that all the SA Social Security Agency's Sassa beneficiaries automatically qualify for a NSFAS funding. The funding for 2020 has increased from R11,2 billion in 2016, to about R35 billion in 2020, which translates to more than 212% from the previous years.

There is also a programme that the Department of Higher Education and Training is running with the Department of Basic Education, the Funza Lushaka bursary. We also like to report that I heard that they say that we are jumping around universities. Yes, indeed, the Department of Higher Education and Training is putting processes in place towards the establishment of a new university in Ekurhuleni. It’s going to be a university of science and innovation. It has been planned to be a unique and a focus institution playing a leading role within a differentiated higher education landscape drawing on

the advantages of its locality to forge partnerships with the city and industry to develop a highly specialised university for the advancement of our society.

Again, I can also confirm that work is at an advance stage in terms of the different universities that the department has planned.

The Department of Higher Education and Training has already published the National Skills Development Plan which is going to be implemented in April this year using the Sector Education and Training Authorities, Setas, as the core towards the training of young people and making sure that we provide learnerships, internships, apprenticeship and work for integrated learners. [Time expired.]

*Setswana*:

Ke a e bona ... ga ke sa kgona le go tswela pele. Ke a leboga. [Legofi.]

Ms D C CHRISTIANS: Honourable Deputy Speaker, hon members, hon President, fellow South African. It is now 26 years after the dawn of democracy. As the President so eloquently delivered in his state of the nation address address, it is now 30 years

since Nelson Mandela’s march to freedom. However, for many of our country’s people, we are still not free. We remain trapped in poverty and unemployment. We remain in a time warp of an unfair and unequal society. This was made even more evident by the President’s inability to give direction to the country in terms of the early childhood development implementation, as well as the quality of teaching and learning in grades one to three.

The level of preparedness by the Department of Education to implement early childhood development after many years of planning is worrisome, as access to early childhood development remains the crux in preventing the high dropout rates that occur later in high school.

The President together with the Department of Basic Education has to date, failed to deal with the poor levels of reading and writing in the foundation phase of our schools. The real reason for the high dropout rate in high school is because we do not get reading, writing and comprehension at the required level in the foundation phase. The President has stated that every 10-year-old needs to be able to read for meaning.

However, the truth is that with the Department of Education promoting learners in grades one to three without them being

able to read is the real reason for our massive failure and dropout rates later on in their school careers. It is commendable to introduce coding and robotics in grades R to three, but when our learners are unable to grasp the fundamentals of reading and writing, how will they grasp the fundamentals of coding and robotics?

The President has also reminded the country that half of all young people are unemployed. The truth is that, these unemployment statistics have a direct correlation on the quality and type of education that our young people are receiving in the early years of their schooling careers. The education system is failing our young people by lowering standards and promoting learners, thereby setting them up for failure later on. Mr. President, in your state of the nation address, you told the nation that you were wearing a suit made by a local designer, this is commendable. Nonetheless, our schools are not adequately equipped to prepare learners in the foundation phase with the skills to get them ready for the world of work and exactly such entrepreneurship. Skills, abilities and sharp minds are honed during the early childhood development years, but we are not getting this right.

Towards the end of your state of the nation address, you reminded the country that it is time to build on the foundations. We are all aware that a strong foundation is needed for a house, a company, a relationship in order for it to be successful. Without a strong foundation, you are setting yourself up for failure, and this is what the government is currently doing to our young minds. The best and first foundation to build is on improving the quality of education in our foundation phases and grades one to three, to make our schools safe, to eradicate pit latrines once and for all and to ensure that every child who proceeds to high school is able to read, write and comprehend. I thank you [Applause.]

Rev K R J MESHOE: Deputy Speaker, hon President, Deputy President, hon members. I first want to register on behalf of the ACDP our extreme disappointment at the toxic atmosphere that some Presiding Officers have allowed to preside and to prevail in this House. The fact that rulings are made and not enforced and rulings are not consistent does not help to have order in the House. So, I want to appeal to all Presiding Officers to treat all members and all parties equally.

When one saw what happened on Thursday for example, points of orders that came from the EFF were entertained and there were

many hands this side that were ignored. That is setting a precedent for the future. We want to say that what happened cannot and should not be allowed to continue. The dignity and decorum of this House must be restored as a matter of priority particularly during joint sittings.

We are tired of hearing people on the ground saying, when is the circus beginning? We are tired of hearing people saying that this House is now one of the best entertainments they can see on television. The Presiding Officers hold the key to bring order to the House.

Chairperson or Deputy President [Laughter], Deputy Speaker, the ACDP agrees with the President that our economy has not grown at any meaningful rate for over a decade now. We also agree that government alone cannot solve these economic challenges. That is why the ACDP believes that business should be enabled to create the right opportunities for job creation and growth.

Mr President let us not forget that when things deteriorate, and we find ourselves where we are today, the President should not shy away from asking the nation to help government by

praying for the future of this country, because without Him you should know Mr President that you won’t make it.

Further, we all know that Eskom is one of the main contributors of our poor economic growth as load shedding continues to disrupt and hamper businesses and people’s lives on a daily basis. That is why the ACDP welcomed the President’s pronouncement that municipalities in good standing will now be allowed to procure energy directly from independent power producers. The ACDP does ... [Time expired]

Mr B H HOLOMISA: Hon Deputy Speaker, hon President, Deputy President and hon members. Since the change of government in 1994 there have been improvements. Yet, judging by the uneasiness of the people who have been suffering due to poor service delivery, it is difficult to explain to them, when the same leadership which liberated them yesterday are now embroiled in the looting of state resources. It simply means that the noble intentions which were pronounced in 1994 have been hijacked by thugs. Monies that could have been used to alleviate the backlogs and imbalances of the past have been stolen.

Take all these cases, such as the massive Gupta looting, VBS, Bosasa and other revelations of the commissions of inquiry, we just cannot allow this nonsense to continue. Either the National Prosecuting Authority’s, NPA leadership must resign, or be fired, and we must employ competent people, or request secondment of experts from countries that we have bilateral agreements with. Hon members, the state of our environment needs attention in particular pollution and the lack of enforcement regarding waste management.

Mr President, we propose that all vehicle owners or drivers be made liable for people throwing garbage out of cars, taxis and truck windows. Shop owners should stop dumping packaging material on our sidewalks. It is time that we inculcate a culture of ownership. We must clean up the mess we made.

Nobody is going to do it for us.

In conclusion, I agree with you Mr President that climate change is a reality of which South Africans should be keenly aware. General decertification, dams that are dried up and soil erosion are at the order of the day. Silting of dams and riverbeds are problematic. Job opportunities can be created if government could launch a programme to plant grass and put other erosion combating measures in place, to preserve the

soil in rural areas and to clear silted dams and rivers to restore their capacity but ...

*IsiXhosa*:

... mhlekazi kufuneka ube ngathi uyayixhuzula imikhala, makucace ukuba...

*English*:

... you are in charge of the country. Discipline...

*IsiXhosa*:

... iphelile apha.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon...

*IsiXhosa*:

Mnu B H HOLOMISA: Isabalulekile le nto ndiyithethayo [Kwahlekwa.]

*English*:

The discipline here ..., the discipline here is gone.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I am drawing the line hon Holomisa. Discipline must be shown by example.

Mr B H HOLOMISA: Order ... Order! [Inaudible.]

*Siswati*:

INDVUNA YETEKULIMA TEMIMHLABA NEKUTFUTFUKISWA KWASEMAKHAYA:

Lisekela laSomlomo, Mengameli Lohloniphekile neLisekela lakho, kanye nemalunga alendlu nabozakwethu, ngiyanibingelela.

*English*:

Mr President, in your speech last Thursday, you affirmed the words of Tata Mandela, when he said, I quote:

Our march to freedom is irreversible; we will not allow fear to stand in our way.

In reflecting on this message of encouragement and hope in the midst of challenges which gave in this House last week, accepting where there are challenges, where we have failed but also indicating where there are promises and identifying what possibilities lie ahead because we as South African are resilient people.

I was reminded of the words of Rev Dr Schuller in his book, I quote: “*tough times never last, but tough people do*”.

He said “People are like potatoes. After potatoes have been harvested they have to be spread out and sorted in order to get maximum market dollar. They are divided according to size. It is only after potatoes have been sorted and bagged that they are loaded onto trucks. This is the method that all Idaho potato famers use, all but one.

One farmer never bothered to sort and yet seemed to be making the most money. A puzzled neighbour asked what his secret was. The farmers said in response it’s simple; I just load up the wagon with potatoes. The small will fall to the bottom and the medium to the middle while the big potatoes rise to the top. That is not only true for the potatoes; it is the law of life, tough people rise to the top in rough times.

I wish to agree with His Excellency the President, we will not fear amidst the many challenges we face. We as South Africans are the tough and resilient people. We defeated colonialism and apartheid and triumphed. We spoke of racism, looked at the face and never denied it existed. So as apartheid we knew it was not a system that was recognised and respected by all and that’s why it had to go.

Through the constitution-making process we acknowledged that we have unequal distribution of land because of land dispossession. We resolved that the state must undertake land reform in the public interest. It is this fearlessness of our society that have been able to appreciate candidly that even now we have not resolved the land question at scale even with the resources that have been put by government. We do not fear to tread where others have failed. Tough times never last but though people do.

*Siswati*:

Uma ngingabuya kuwe babe Steenhuisen, ludzaba lwababe Ragatsi asikalukhohlwa futsi asiluphikisi singuhulumende. Ngikhuluma nje namuhla sitfole umlayeto lobuya kubameli bakhe bababe Ragatsi, asiphendvula ngelinani lemali lesiyentile kuye lekutsi sitawutsengisela kanjani, loko ke Mengameli kusho kutsi cha singuhulumende asuluphikisi loludzaba, siyilalele inkantolo siyachubeka futsi siyavuma liphutsa, lekutsi lokwenteke ngaphambili, kwenteka ngekushintja kweluhlelo lolwalucatjwanga nguhulumende ngalose sikhatsi, keje itse inkantolo uma seyikhuluma salalela, asesabi Mengameli kuvuma liphutsa uma silentile siyalivuma. [Tandla.]

*English*:

One of the vexing questions that the Sixth Administration will have to address is tenure reform in particular under South Africa’s Communal Land areas. The Presidential Land Advisory Panel in its recommendations has implored government to urgently deal with this matter in order to ensure security of tenure for millions of our people in traditional lands of our country. I must say that the varying views on this matter of tenure reform in our country further highlights the influence of the European Jurisprudence on land ownership in our country. The way in which the settler community related to land ownership was totally alien to natives in sub-Saharan Africa. Amongst Africans and indigenous people, land was an asset that defined political control and economic livelihood as well as a heritage for future generations.

*Siswati*:

Ngakoke bantfu bakitsi babawubamba umhlaba, bangawubambeli bona kuphela njengeticu tabo kepha bawubambela laba labangasekho, labasatakutalwa, nalabaphila lomuhla.

*English*:

Mr. President, in your state of the nation address, in June 2019 you committed government in the medium term to identify and release public land that is suitable for smart urban

settlements and for farming. Six months into the Sixth Administration, led by the Deputy President the following has been achieved: 14 000 ha has been identified and released for human settlement; 100 parcels of government land have been released for restitution purposes, 44 000 ha of these have been transferred to communities such as Berlin Mission in Gauteng Province, Qhubekani Mnqobokazi in Kwazulu-Natal Province, Batlhabine,Limpompo Province and Kwa Ndabeni here in Cape Town; 1,3 million ha of agricultural land has been identified and ready for allocation, 300 000 ha of this will be used for the settlement of restitution claims, 700 000 ha of these will be allocated to women, youth, people with disabilities and those who have been farming on communal land.

*Siswati*:

Mengameli loko kusho kutsi hulumende wakho uyasebenta. [Tandla.]

*English*:

In addition to your commitments to this House, you have indeed through Cabinet approved the Beneficiary Selection Policy, as well as the Land Donation Policy to enable those who want to donate land for land reform purposes. Currently, National Treasury has conditional tax benefits for farmers who want to

donate land, however if I may advice you, those who are interested can consult the South African Revenue Services for details, so that indeed you understand what is possible and what is not.

Mr. President in your own words in this House in 2018 you said:

There are few in our country who would contest the fact that dispossession of Africans of their land contributed fundamentally to the impoverishment and disempowerment of the majority our people.

Precisely because of this we want to affirm that the necessity of land reform in our country is also aimed at empowering those who have been dispossessed in order for them to participate in the economy of this country. Agriculture as an economic sector is dependent amongst others on land to thrive. Its use will require as Ubaba uMangosuthu Buthelezi has said here:

That as government we do not only give access to land, but support those who enter into the agricultural economy

with training, extension services, finance, water, research, mechanization and infrastructure.

Given the challenges of climate change, we need to ensure that our farming systems are consistent with this reality. Thinking about the future, we need to build a new cohort of farmers. The current training that we are undertaking through National Rural Youth Service Corps, NARYSEC and agricultural colleges of 1000 young people from the three districts that have been identified as pilots for the District Development Model, working with the Department of Cooperative Governance and Traditional Affairs, CoGTA, will contribute towards the development of new farmers.

In addition to these we have maximized the use of our international exchange programs by sending young people for training in critical agricultural skills,

*Siswati*:

Ngikhuluma nje sekukhona bantfwana labafundza le ngesheya, labatawubuka, bacubungule kutsi ingabe kudla kwetfu kuphephe kangakanani, ingabe sichubeka kanjani nekutfutfukisa kutsi loku lesikutjalako, sikujikajikise phela kute kusinike linani lelitse caca ngasetimalini. Sitsi uma ngabe senta ijuzi

yemawolintji, sibe sati kutsi siyisusa ewolintjini, siyijikajikise ngemishini bese kuphuma ijuzi yemawolintji lesiyinatsa ibe mnandzi. Ngulokoke lesibona kwekutsi kutasisita Mengamela, kwakha hulumende locinile. Ngangasho nje futsi kutsi lokushilo la embi kwetfu kusebenta ngekubambisana sitihlaka tahulumende, sitigaba tahulumende kanye nabo bonkhe nje bantfu labasemabhizinisini nalabangekho kuwo. Ngikhuluma nje bantfwana labangu 1018 sibatjalile lapha etimbonini tekulima, ema-Agro-Business Commodity Groups, lapho batokwati khona kutsi bafundze buchwephesheke nyalo kwekutsi uma silima, silima kanjani ngendlela lesiyisa phambili. Sitsembeke kutsi labo bantfwana batawutsi nasebabuya babe sebabalimi labavelele.

Ngingashoke Mengamela kutsi ngiyajabula mina njengoba ngime lapha, kutsi kusebentisana kwami nebalimi nalabo labangebakhiciti betimboni kutekulima kusente kutsi itolo nje sikwati kuphakamisa kuvinjelwa lekumayelana nekutsi singatsengisi ngetilwane nalaba labafuna kulobola nkosi yami batekwati nyalo kuhambisa letinkhomo tabo, ngoba lesifo samatele noko ingatsi sesisibambile, ifoot and mouth phecetisi. [Tandla.]

It is important for me to say that despite the challenges we have had on foot and mouth we have still been able to export our beef to the United Arab Emirate, UAE and China, however working with the industry we have agreed that we need to strengthen our bio-security, so that in future we can manage better our animal health system.

*Siswati*:

Mengameli asengigcine ngekutsi nje ngisho kutsi cha, impela lemboni sijikajike umtfunti wetinkhukhu, insango ke kodvwa lengadzakwana lesiyibita ngesilungu ngekutsi phecetisi ihemp, sikulungele ngoba silwentile lucwaningo...

*English*:

...we have done the investigation, we even have got two seed cultivars to be able to plant hemp, we are just working with the ministers led by Minister Mkhize to finalise the detail so that indeed we can go with stream. [Appluase.] My colleague, the Minister of Communication has harping on us on how to use the Fourth Industrial Revolution, particularly the applications in the agricultural sector. I want to say, my colleague we are on course. We now have got an application, App, which has been developed by the Agricultural Research Council, ARC together with the weather services, that advice

for us on time when to plant and when not to plant. I also want to indicate that we have been working with other people, particularly in the sector such as bit farming, so that you with your Stilettos and Florsheim, you can own a bit of a farm, own a cow without a cow dung.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon former presiding officer...

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, LAND REFORM AND RURAL

DEVELOPMENT: ...lastly I want to...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ... your time has expired [Laughter.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, LAND REFORM AND RURAL

DEVELOPMENT: ... I just want to recognise Ntuthuko in the podium there who had started a good platform on livestock wealth, on how you can own livestock again without being on the farm. [Applause.]

*Siswati*:

Siyabonga kakhulu Mengameli ngenkhulumo yakho.

Mr V ZUNGULA: Deputy Speaker, Mr President, your state of the nation address comes when our country is experiencing high

levels of unemployment; poverty rates are sitting at more than 57% and the majority for those unemployed and in poverty are black people. Out of the trillion rand budget, less than 30% goes to small, macro and medium enterprises, SMMEs. Even the thousands of young entrepreneurs will find it difficult to survive under the existing pro-big business policy of the state such as the Preferential Procurement Policy Framework Act, PPPFA as well as the Construction Industry Development Board, CIDB.

SMMEs must be preferred over funders of the CR17 campaign. The monopoly of Bidvest over state contracts must come to an end. It can’t be that everywhere you go it is Bidvest and those greedy capitalists even get tenders worth a mere R500 000.

Like it is done across the entire continent, only South Africans must trade in the informal economy, laws must be developed for the informal economy to favour South Africans. In South Africa we have an informal economy that is worth more than R400 billion rand and South Africans are predominantly spectators in this sector. Non-South Africans must work on a scarce and critical skills basis. It is criminal that the majority of Uber drivers, waiters, security guards, truck drivers and metered taxi drivers are not South African. A person can’t come all the way from Asia and drive a metered

taxi whereas we have got so many people in Nyanga, Gugulethu with drivers’ licences but are without jobs.

If these entry-level jobs are dominated by foreign nationals, where must our young people find work? The granting of permission for municipalities to buy directly from independent power producers, IPPs, is privatisation through the backdoor. It also means the slow killing of Eskom because financially viable municipalities will no longer procure from Eskom that is also financially struggling.

The clustering of poor municipalities with a financially poor Eskom and on the other hand financially viable municipalities with financially well-off IPPs can only undermine the revenue streams of Eskom. Mr President, I was wondering if by mentioning the Lanseria smart city development which started in 2009 within the context of your 2019 dream being a reality, where you not once again misleading Parliament by claiming victories you have got nothing to do with?

Lastly, Mr President, after listening ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes! Hon member, take your seat.

The MINISTER OF INTERNATIONAL RELATIONS AND CO-OPERATION:

Deputy Speaker, on a point of order: The hon member speaking at the podium has said the President misled the House. The President has not done so. He should withdraw that remark. It is unparliamentary.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member ... hon Minister, it has to be said, deliberately so, for the reason that he didn’t say so, it is a debate.

Mr V ZUNGULA: Thank you Deputy Speaker, thank you. ... to your speech I couldn’t help observing that you were responding to most of our 15 reasons for not having confidence in you. The ATM and the people of South Africa have not been fooled. Mr President, we still do no not have confidence in you and the secret ballot is looming.

Mr S M DHLOMO: Hon Speaker, Deputy Speaker, hon. President, Deputy President, our premiers, all hon Members of Parliament including Ministers and Deputy Ministers, we are able to update this House on the information compiled almost hourly, and this is information from an hour ago that on the coronavirus, thanks to you hon President for deploying a capable leader in our government, Mr Mkhize, that the

coronavirus outbreak has a significant effect on global health with the World Health Organization, WHO, declaring it an emergency.

South Africa is well-placed to identify the virus with the assistance of the National Institute of Communicable Diseases, NICD, and the laboratories they use. To date, we have no cases of the coronavirus in South Africa. Port health officials are testing all persons entering our ports to detect and isolate such cases. This is of course to mention that it is collaboration with all other government departments and South Africans must rest assured that the government is at work on these programmes.

On the National Health Insurance, NHI, we are heeding the call of the WHO of Universal Health coverage. In September 2016, the former WHO, Director-General, Dr Margaret Chan had this to say:

The inclusion of universal health coverage, UHC, as one of the targets in the Sustainable Development Goals provides the platform for moving towards all other health targets through the delivery of integrated, people-centred services that span the life course, bring prevention to the fore, and

protect against financial hardship. Universal health coverage is the ultimate expression of fairness and one of the most powerful social equalisers among all policy options.

Vision 2030 of the National Development Plan, NDP, directs us to embark on a trajectory that reforms the health system to ensure that it serves all South Africans equally and ensure them of access to comprehensive quality health care services regardless of their financial status. Last year in September, Her Excellency hon Gro Harlem Brundtland of the Elders while visiting South Africa and Parliament had this to say:

We must invest in promoting Universal Health Coverage for all members of the Society from the richest to the poorest and most vulnerable, to access health care they need without falling into poverty.

*IsiZulu:*

Isho njalo i-NHI, ithi omncane, nomdala, osebenzayo, ongasebenzi, ocebileyo nompofu, ogulayo nophilayo bathwalisane eNingizimni Afrika kwakhiwe isikhwama esizobhekelela impilo yabo bonke abantu kungabhekwanga ukuthi leliya khaya linayo yini imali yokukhokhela ukugula. Abazohlomula kakhulu kulesi

sikhwama ilabo abangathathintweni izimpukane zikalujaca.

I-NHI ithi akufanele uthole ukwelashwa kuphela uma unemali ephaketheni. Ukugula uma kudlanga kudinga ochwepheshe. Akubona bonke bethu abakwazi ukufinyelela lapho.

*English:*

The recent story we got in the public hearing on NHI in Klerksdorp on 1 February 2020 confirms this. A young female South African, a mother of a 2, 8-and 11-year old, told the committee she has a breast cancer and her specialist oncologist, has advised on the medication she needs to have. Her medical aid is refusing to pay for this lifesaving drug, because it is expensive. She wants to see her children grow into adulthood, but currently she faces the certainty of death. Why? Because money is considered more important than life.

*IsiZulu:*

I-NHI umcimbi wobuntu.

*English:*

It is a social solidarity. The Health Market Inquiry led by Judge Sandile Ngcobo is an eye-opener for all of us. It takes

away a popular slogan that has been used in this country, “Fix the Public hospitals and leave Private hospitals alone.” The concluding statement on that report says:

We have found that utilisation rates and hospital admission rates, level of care and admissions to high care and intensive care units, ICUs, length of slay were much higher than can be explained by the burden of disease of the population being cared for.

“We found that excessive utilisation was a significant driver of health care costs”. No one has ventured to call that corruption, inhuman or excessive profit-making at the expensive of life. This report compels us to shift to a new paradigm, that there are serious challenges in both private and public health systems; maybe we should not lose this opportunity to collectively create a new order of health systems in our country.

*IsiZulu:*

Ezithangamini zokulalela imibono yemiphakathi esithe saba nazo kuzo zonke izifundazwe, sekusele nje i-Gauteng, baningi abantu bekhuluma. Bathi abanye kudala siyilindile le-NHI mayiqaliswe. Abanye bathi siyayamukela, siyayidinga, kodwa

kunezinto ezisikhathazayo; Ukushoda kwabasebenzi, ama- ambhulensi, ukushoda kwemithi, imitholampilo ikude nathi nathi kakhulu, izakhiwo zigugile futhi abasiphethe kahle abasebenzi bezempilo ezindaweni ezithile.

*English:*

It is therefore important for the Department of Health to have visible programmes and plans for strengthening the South African health system through Presidential Heath Compact of 2019. The Presidential Health Compact contains pillars of NHI.

There is a young African female farm worker who presented her submission in Umzimkhulu, KwaZulu-Natal and this is what she had to say:

I do not support NHI, this is going to put an extra burden on whites in our country. They have done so much for us. We must not burden them anymore.

There are other government concerns raised that we need to be attended to.

*IsiZulu*:

Okokuqala anisiletheli nje enye into efana no-Eskom, no-SA Airways, SAA, sizothemba kanjani ukuthi izimali azizokwebiwa na? Abanye besithi umsebenzi kaHulumeni owokuthi mawuqhelise amasela kulesi sikhwama semali se-NHI.

*English*:

We need to support and participate in the Anti-Corruption Health Forum, launched by our President.

*IsiZulu*:

Bathi abanye, bambalwa abantu abasebenzayo ezweni, izophumaphi lemali ye NHI? Abanye bethu bathi akuqalwe kudonswe lemali yethu ye-medical aid.

*English*:

We are subsidised in our medical aid to the tune of over R25 billion per annum. Why? Because we are better citizens than our gardeners and domestic workers, we cannot justify

that thinking. Let us start on those privileges of the 16% of our country’s population and all the other monies will then flow thereafter.

In the United Kingdom, UK, universal health coverage, UHC called the National Health Service, NHS was instituted in that

country during the years of economic hardships following Second World War, same as in Japan. Despite the teething problems, these two countries and many more continue to offer best models for government managed and public funded healthcare.

Fear of unfavourable economic conditions did not paralyse the UK and therefore should not immobilise South Africa.

There is a concern that health care professionals, mainly doctors, may leave the country. We want to plead with those health care professionals to reconsider that situation.

The universal health coverage, as I indicated, is all over the world. We wonder if they do leave, where they will be going to because all countries are on the universal health coverage, UHC, like in South Africa, and some of them have already implemented it. But again, those sentiments that they would like to leave are individual members, it is not a SA Medical Association, Sama, position. I am in continuous contact with the Sama leadership and the Sama supports the NHI. The Sama has discussion points that they have forwarded to us a committee and we will be meeting them shortly and discussing those issues.

There is a last point I wanted to raise. In Luke 10 verse 25- 37, a story of the Good Samaritan tells of a helpless dying man on the side of the road. A Levite from a class of religious society came around and avoided him. He was rushing to a church meeting, which was more important to him than a dying man. A priest from the same club of elitists came around. He too avoided touching this dying man, but a Good Samaritan came around. He put him in his transport and took him to a healthcare facility; he paid for him.

This is what the ANC is doing for you, advocating for the. NHI [Applause.] The bleeding masses will taste the quality of health in their lifetime. The ANC will continue to champion this programme. Hon President, we wish that as the chairperson of the African Union, your leadership should then champion this NHI in our country as you do but encourage other African leaders to initiate universal health coverage in their countries. We owe this to Africa. Thank you very much.

Mr G G HILL-LEWIS: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. Mr President, there is a very strange thing happening in our politics at the moment. Four times now the President has come to our House to promise urgent reform and to pledge his leadership. Three times now the Finance Minister has pleaded for reform in his

budget speeches and in his strategic plan document, and I’m sure that is what he’ll do again next week. The President promises major reform, the Treasury supports major reform, as the Leader of the Opposition has said today that the opposition supports major reform, and the country is crying out for major reform. Therefore, here is the very curious thing: where is the major reform? We have been promised it, but we do not have it. So, let’s track what progress it has been on reform for a moment. In 2018 the President said, I’m quoting, “Next month we will launch the youth employment service to create a million paid internships in three years.”

We are just months away from that deadline, and it has created

32 248 internships. At this rate it will reach its target in

88 years time, the year 2108. In 2018 he said: “We need to see mining as a sunrise industry, rather than a sunset industry.” However, his mining Minister published a new Bill that was, if possible, even worse and more confusing than the Bill it was designed to replace. Now mining giants are leaving and the industry is not just in sunset, it is in pitch darkness. In 2018, he said: “We will reduce the regulatory barriers for small business. I am going to ensure that the regulatory barriers are reduced, very emphatic.” But not a single regulation has been removed for small business as yet.

Value-added tax, Vat, has gone up though. Petrol taxes have gone up, and thousand of small businesses have closed. In 2019, he said that we would go from 82nd in the world to the top 50 in the World Bank’s Ease of Doing Business reports.

But, in fact, we have dropped down another two places, and we are now at number 84. In 2019 he said: I quote, "our highest priority would be visa reform.” However, after that statement it took 10 months for the Minister of Home Affairs to issue a simple letter to cancel the disastrous birth certificate requirement, and 10 months to sign a letter for the government’s highest priority. In 2019 he said: “Security of energy supply is an absolute imperative. We need to take bold decisions and decisive action.” There has been none of either.

In June 2019 he came back and committed to a lower debt trajectory. In October of that same year his Finance Minister announced a much higher debt trajectory. And now to 2020, he promises a sovereign wealth fund and a state bank when he knows full well that there is no money to capitalise either of those. They simply will not happen in any meaningful way. All of this begs the question: what is the point of the state of the nation address if it is just a list of emphatic promises that most emphatically will never be implemented? The truth is

this; we have a President in the grip of paralysis, and a government that is no longer even functional.

This government cannot decide even the most basic of questions or resolve even the simplest of problems - all the while our country edges closer and closer to disaster. Therefore, the President was wrong to say that we face a stark choice. It is him that faces a stark choice, not us. [Applause.] He can achieve immortality if he wants. He can go down in history as the man who saved South Africa from economic collapse, or he will be remembered as the President who failed to lead in a time of national crisis.

Sadly, I think that he told us which choice he has made when he made a case for more “consensus building” and “social compact”. The question is, Mr President, consensus among whom? There is already a broad consensus. Never since 1994 has there been such wide agreement on what needs to be done. So, who are these nameless enemies of the obvious and the urgent? The truth is that he means ANC consensus.

There are still so many state capture looters in his own party that are fighting him and fighting his reform agenda. They may brandish the language of the loony left, but they are

rapacious, corrupt and hell-bent on winning back control of the state and its resources, and they sit on both sides of this House. Look at what was done to you today, Mr President. Why are you interested in building consensus with these people

- these enemies of growth and they support as in your own benches? [Applause.] Why make any social compact with them? The only compacting that needs to happen is the crushing of their corrupt careers.

You see, Mr President, my great fear and my firm suspicion is that when you say “consensus”, you mean “concession” - and every concession you make to the enemies of growth will only be met with another fresh demand. So you will go on conciliating until you have given up everything. What then will have been the point of your Presidency, Mr President? To have won a mandate for reform, only to concede everything in the name of consensus. Your latest appeasement is your rumoured support for a Congress of South African Trade Unions, Cosatu, plan to use R250 billion of civil servants’ hard- earned pension savings to bail out Eskom. This is a disgrace, and you should have ruled it out explicitly, but you didn’t.

You said that you would mobilise funding without putting pensions at risk. What you mean again is that you will be

taking their pension money and then guarantee the value of the pension later. But every civil servant should know now that that guarantee is not worth the paper it’s written on. If government can’t pay its Eskom debts now, hence the scheme, it will not be able to pay for your pensions later. [Applause.]

Amazingly, Cosatu has actually admitted this on the record. They have said upfront, in the interview with the *Business Day* two weeks ago, that workers should not expect a financial return from this bailout. They should be happy with a social return. Civil servants work hard and save hard for their retirements. That money is theirs. It comes from their pay cheques. It doesn’t belong to Cosatu, and it cannot be ceased to pay for the ANC’s mismanagement and corruption at Eskom. Mr President, your support for this shows that the enemies of growth are on the march, and quite frankly, sir, it is starting to look as though your Presidency is in retreat. They are winning because you are not even fighting.

In your absence, it is only the DA that is still making the case for what we know South Africa needs. [Applause.] We still believe in South Africa and in the vision of a country united in shared prosperity. We know we that we should be booming.

These people don’t love South Africa they don’t want what was

best for our country. If you want to build a consensus that really matters, one that can fix our country, you need to look beyond your own party. There are enough people in this House who are committed to the reforms we need. They’re just not all on your benches. If you reach out, Mr President, you can build this majority. We call on you, put your country first, let’s unite with people who love this country and want to see it succeed. Stop conciliating everything away and get in the fight. Thank you. [Applause.]

Ms F A MASIKO: Hon Deputy Speaker of the House, His Excellency the President, hon Deputy President, members of the Cabinet, and hon Members of Parliament, it is my singular honour to debate on behalf of the people’s movement, the ANC, during this debate of the state of the nation address.

We have again this year, seen the enemies of the people trying to deny millions of South Africans, especially young people in particular, the opportunity to receive the report from the President, on how their government is improving their lives.

What happened in this House last week did not surprise us at all. The axis of evil will never like you Mongameli,

[President.] so long as you continue to lead the journey towards development and a corrupt free South Africa.

I have to mention here hon President that these hon members, come from the same organisation that claims to champion the plight of young people. How can they possibly try and champion anyone’s plight when they themselves need help? [Applause.]

Hon President, in March last year, you visited ugogo [Grandmother.] uMafa, my late grandmother in KwaZulu-Natal, Clermont. She did not ask for anything, but however, she did complain about young people burning institutions of higher learning, including libraries meant to provide them with knowledge and information. She asked for the history of our country’s struggle for liberation to be taught in schools. I wish to amend my grandmother’s request and add a plea for some kind of assistance for the members in the red overalls to be helped to appreciate the responsibility they carry when they walk into this august House. [Interjections.]

It cannot be that we go into communities addressing social ills when we have some elements of them in this Parliament. I say that having been hit with a bottle of water last week. Who knew that for the first time, I would have experience violence

as a woman, would be from an hon member in the red overall? [Applause.]

Indeed, the former President of Burkina Faso, Thomas Sankara warned us against characters of political charlatans when he said and I open quote, “A soldier without proper ideological and political training is a potential criminal.” [Applause.]

The report they tried to stop you from giving to this nation hon President, gave a message of hope to millions of South Africans especially young people who are exposed to the threat of insecurity, unemployment, social ills and the scourge of HIV and Aids.

You have consistently and concisely tabulated the challenges we face as a nation. More importantly, you offered sound and practical solutions. This shows that we have a government hard at work to improve the lives of South Africans, particularly the historically disadvantaged.

Mongameli, [President.] we fully agree with you when you say we should move beyond words to practical programmes. The plans you presented will without any doubt turn the tide against slow or contracting economic growth and unemployment.

We see the plans you have presented as a radical step that will increase national productivity, change how the world views South Africa and they will also enhance the prospect of employment for the youth. We have no hesitation that this will result in an economy that does not sleep.

The state of the nation address shows that government is putting in place, numerous policy interventions to bring young people into the mainstream of the economy, as well as ensuring the issues affecting young people remain high on the list of national priorities.

We are doing this because we strongly believe that empowering young people is not an option, but a national imperative. We call on young people to seize the opportunities announced by the President.

While our achievements in empowering young people in the past

25 years are worth celebrating, they must not lull us into complacency, we still have a long way to go.

As a caring organisation, we know that far too many young people still find themselves marginalised from the economic mainstream because of unemployment and lack of skills. The

best tribute we can pay to the different generations of courageous young activists such as Charlotte Maxeke, Anton Lembede, Nelson Mandela, Peter Mokaba, Siphiwe Zuma, Liyanda Maphanga, Babalwa Ntabeni and Bavelile Hlongwa, is to honour their memory in ensuring that we achieve the economic freedom in our lifetime.

As we are all aware, of the 1,2 million young people who enter the labour market each year, approximately two thirds remain outside employment, education or training. We therefore welcome the announcement by the President that the Presidential Youth Employment Intervention which focuses on six priority actions, will be implemented over the next five years to reduce youth unemployment.

Under the Presidential Youth Employment Intervention, South Africa will create pathways for young people into the economy. This will allow them to receive active support, information and work readiness training to increase their employability and match themselves to opportunities.

Hon Deputy Speaker, this programme will not bear fruits if provinces do not play their role. We want to see more and more provinces setting up business development funds which have

recently been successfully implemented in the provinces of KwaZulu-Natal, Mpumalanga and the Eastern Cape.

We shall therefore always seek means to empower young people and shape them to be active and productive citizens. We applaud the decision by the National Youth Development Agency, NYDA, and the development of small business to provide grant funding and business support to 1 000 young entrepreneurs in the next 100 days starting immediately. The setting aside of 1% of the budget to deal with high-levels of youth unemployment is also a progressive move.

Adding to the above mentioned, the NYDA has successfully advocated for the scraping of experience as a requirement for entry level jobs. With this intervention, a lot of opportunities have availed themselves to young people who afforded them the platform to step into lifelong career paths and improving the socioeconomic standing of their respective communities.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the ANC-led government is also scaling up the Youth Employment Services and working with Technical and Vocational Education and Training, Tvet, colleges and the

private sector to ensure that more learners receive practical experience in the workplace to complete their training.

The late President Nelson Mandela is surely wishing this programme only the best of success because he was passionate about skills development and valued education as an important instrument of self-development and a crucial weapon in the fight against human deprivation, unemployment and inequality.

It is President Mandela who said and I quote:

It is through education that the daughter of a peasant can become a doctor, that the son of a mineworker can become the head of the mine, that a child of farm workers can become the president of a great nation. It is what we make out of what we have, not what we are given, that separates one person from another. [Applause.]

This House had the privilege to see the greatness Tata Madiba referred to in the late Deputy Minister of Mineral Resources and Energy the hon Bavelile Hlongwa, an ordinary girl who achieved extraordinary things in her short life. It is incumbent upon us to deliver for our youth an effective

education, jobs and economic opportunities in order to produce more young people like the hon Bavelile.

We have also not yet been able to match skills demanded by the industry with those that are supplied by the postschool education system. And without the correct skills set, we cannot achieve the 5% gross domestic product, GDP, growth envisaged in the National Development Plan, NDP.

Hon Deputy Speaker, whilst trying to open opportunities for young people, we must also keep an eye on issues of alcohol, drug abuse and the scourge of HIV and Aids which have potential to reverse the gains we are making. Almost every part of South Africa is engulfed in cheap drugs that are sold mainly to young people and this is a battle that cannot be tackled by government alone.

Hon Deputy Speaker, allow me to conclude by referring to the inspirational words of Tata Nelson Mandela who always believed in human agency and the power of a collective action. It is him who said and I quote:

Sometimes it falls upon a generation to be great. You can be that generation. Let your greatness blossom.

Let us grow South Africa together. I thank you. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, please allow me to join the hon Amos Masondo in undertaking to reflect and review on how as presiding officers we may be contributing to some of the problems that all of you in this House, in one way or another, directly or indirectly pointed out.

We do wish to request you too, to join us in reflecting what we say in this House, its consequences and what we do in this House and their consequences on the House itself, but also on the reputation of Parliament as an institution. We will appreciate that in a big way.

We now take a break for 15 minutes. The bells will be rung to invite you back. Thank you very much.

Business suspended at 17:41 and resumed at 18:04.

*IsiZulu*:

Mnu Z N MBHELE: Sihlalo, ngibingelele uMongameli noSekela Mongameli nabahlonishwa ...

*English:*

... If any small business owners were watching and listening to President Ramaphosa’s state of the nation address hoping to hear the announcement of bold measures and reforms that would foster a more enabling environment for them and their businesses, they would have been sorely disappointed.

Following the tough economic year – 2019 - many small businesses have been struggling to stay afloat. If they weren’t suffocating in a stagnant economic climate, they were being strangled by the impact of fuel price increases or being kicked in the gut by loadshedding.

A 2019 study by a financial services retail company showed that business was good for only 10% of SMEs while the other 90% were buckling in the challenging conditions of low-growth economy, unreliable utilities and rising operating costs.

These ﬁgures represent a grave looming threat given that collectively SMEs keep close to 11 million people employed, accounting for approximately 65% of all formal jobs.

When they’re not being subjected to service disruptions and late payments, they are held back by red tape and compliance regulations and face shrinking demand as households and other customers tighten their belts. These are thousands of hard- working South Africans — trades people, coffee shop and

restaurant owners, local grocers, spaza shop and shisanyama outlets — who get up everyday to serve their communities and support their families. They deserve our admiration and much more support than they have been getting to date.

However, instead of announcing SME exemption from sectoral wage determinations and the more stringent labour law requirements or introducing much-needed tax exemptions to ease their cashflow burden, the President’s Sona contained merely a handful of SME-related promises that lacked innovation and hardly packed a punch. Without diminishing or negating the potential value that these could bring - if effectively implemented, which is a key proviso - they do not represent hope for small businesses that things might turn a corner for the better anytime soon.

The announcement, for example, that the National Youth Development Agency and the Department of Small Business Development will provide grant funding and business support to

1 000 young entrepreneurs in the next 100 days is laudable.

But is it anything new? Does that promise represent additional money to help young small business owners or would that have happened without the President’s announcement anyway? Are we talking a new budget or are we simply reframing and relabeling

what was already on the cards? Hopefully the President will provide some clarity in his reply to this Sona debate.

The President also announced that government plans to designate 1 000 locally produced products that must be procured from SMMEs. While this is a noble sentiment, the implementation is likely to run into major obstacles for at least two reasons. Firstly, it risks undermining the imperative for an objective and unbiased approach that should underlie procurement processes to ensure cost-effectiveness and value for money. Lest we forget, it was the manipulation of state procurement processes for predetermined ends that created the state capture monster that has ravaged our public finances and crippled state-owned enterprises as well as local governments alike.

This brings us to the second risk factor to these SME-boosting measures. The legacy of state capture means that government will be hugely constrained to meet these commitments when budgets, as we all know, are increasingly going to shrink.

This is against the backdrop of a declining economic growth, an increasing public debt-to-GDP ratio and tax revenue targets repeatedly being missed - as the finance Minister is likely to enlighten us next week – deteriorating public infrastructure

and the bottomless black holes that have been some of our bailout-guzzling state-owned enterprises. In short, ...

*IsiZulu:*

... imali ayikho, imali izoshoda.

*English:*

Since 2014, Eskom has benefited from over R150 billion in bailouts and has had a government guarantee of R350 billion since 2012. SAA has had over R18 billion in bailouts and a government guarantee of over R19 billion. And what do we have to show for all these billions? We have a power utility that can’t meet the country’s energy demand - hobbling an already strained economy - and an airline that is cancelling flights and will soon have to start selling its routes. There isn’t even time to get into the SABC and the Post Office.

In short, unless this government fundamentally shifts gear to position small business as the spearhead of growth and development, our future, Mr President, will be one of doubt and despair. It is time to liberate our SMEs to save this economy. [Applause.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNICATIONS AND DIGITAL TECHNOLOGIES:

Deputy Chairperson of the NCOP, His Excellency, President Cyril Ramaphosa, the Deputy President, Comrade D D Mabuza, Ministers and Deputy Ministers, Members of the House, the National Assembly, ladies and gentlemen, fellow South Africans, good afternoon.

Panic, anxiety and excitement have become our daily fourth industrial revolution dose, 4IR dose. Every day, we wake up to read the headlines on diverging opinions on the fourth industrial revolution. Jobs are being shed and some are not certain when their own jobs will come to an end.

Businesses are disrupted everyday whilst policy makers and regulators grapple daily with what they never anticipated. Disrupting the disruption is the order of the day - scary animal indeed. However, this is not to say that the impact of the 4IR should only be measured in the inevitable shift that it will cause in the jobs economy.

Though widely regarded as the fourth industrial revolution, countries around the globe have come up with their own definitions, what it means to them and its implications on socio-economic imperatives. In South Africa, we have defined

it as, “An era where people are using smart, connected and converged cyber, physical and biological systems, smart technologies and business models to define and reshape the social, economic and political spheres.”

Hon members, preceding industrial revolutions moved humankind from relying on animal power to relying on machines. Mass production became a reality and digital technologies flourished. The first industrial revolution which was powered by the steam engine, not only established the original factory floor through mechanisation and transformed the way people travelled, it permanently altered the market structure from agrarian to industrial, from farm to factory.

The second and third industrial revolutions, driven by electrification and digitisation respectively, gave birth to mass production and automation where processes that were ordinarily manually done by humans were now performed by computers.

In South Africa specifically, these revolutions took place during an era of the plunder of land and mineral resources which explains the current racialised inequalities in our

country. This happened in an era of a system that was deemed a crime against humanity.

Effectively, South Africans and Africans in general were broadly relegated to the consumption end of the spectrum. As these revolutions occurred during the colonial era, the little that took place in Africa was almost all imported and managed by the colonial powers. In the fourth industrial revolution era, we have a unique opportunity to ensure that our people participate in the entire manufacturing and production value chain.

Madam Speaker, in 1993, just before the democratic government came into power, the ANC made decisive interventions to ensure that the licensing of Vodacom and MTN was accompanied by obligations in an attempt to avoid perpetuating inequalities. While there is still a lot of work to be done, our government has indeed succeeded in creating a communications industry that largely meets the needs of the majority.

We are, however, aware that there are still South Africans who do not have access to quality digital infrastructure. Plans to address that will be detailed in the Budget Vote. With the advent of the fourth industrial revolution, Mr President, you

have shown remarkable leadership in preparing South Africa to be one of the leading nations in taking advantage of the new innovations to address our social and economic realities.

The Presidential Commission on the Fourth Industrial Revolution which was appointed in 2019 has, with less than one-year in office, submitted its diagnostic report, which entails the following amongst others: Establishment of the

Artificial Intelligence Institute; establishment of a platform for advanced manufacturing and new materials; incentives for future industries; development of laws that will be agile in order to place SA firmly in the 4IR; calls for a concerted and coordinated effort for all of us to be agents of change in order to harness our potential to unlock the future of our economy; investment in Human Capacity development; and building of fourth industrial revolution infrastructure.

The Commission will continue to engage with relevant stakeholders.

Fellow South Africans, as mentioned by the President during state of the nation address, plans to licence high demand spectrum, HDS, are advanced. We await a conclusion that will

enhance competition, transformation and empowerment as some of the core principles of this licensing process.

This will also be backed by our plan to ensure wall-to-wall broadband coverage, including the rollout of fibre in many parts of our country, including rural areas. At the same time, we will start the policy process of the licensing of 5G, which is critical in enabling a digital economy which cuts across all sectors and opens up opportunities for small businesses throughout the value chain. [Applause.]

It is said that South Africa has about 30 000 telecommunications towers and we need four times more than that. What opportunities then exist in this space, especially for new entrants in the market? We have identified that in terms of the Telecommunication Infrastructure Build Programme presents opportunities exist to ensure localisation of components, such as fibre optic cables, batteries, steel cabinets and radio frequency cables that are used in Base Transceiver Stations as these are currently being imported. We have no reason not to produce those items locally in order to create jobs.

In implementing the, “One tablet per child” policy, with over

11 million learners in the public schooling system, and digitising government where there are about 1,2 million employees in national and provincial government. An opportunity for local manufacturers to provide laptops and tablets is presented.

The Digital Migration process that is being led by the department creates an opportunity for local set-top-box and IDTV manufacturers is presented as there are a lot of households that still need to migrate to digital television.

Lastly, with over 11 million households with metering solutions, there is a case for a smart metering manufacturing to serve South Africa and Southern Africa. It is now up to our social partners to choose whether to join us in our quest to reindustrialise the electronics industry or to continue to be spectators even in this revolution.

Digital skills are another priority area that requires all role players to collaborate in massifying skills throughout society and not confine this important responsibility to academic institutions, which in no doubt also play a huge role. As such, our department recently undertook a digital

skills gap analysis to identify critical skills that are needed to fuel the digital economy. A Draft Digital Skills Strategy that will soon be submitted to the Human Resource Development Council and Cabinet.

In preparing young people for the future of work; we recently concluded a pilot programme with Media, Information and Communication Technologies Sector Education and Training Authority, Mict Seta, where 1 000 young people were trained on data science and related skills. This was highly successful and will be replicated.

With regards to government, we will prioritise the digitisation of front-end services throughout the three spheres of government. We have completed the development of an e-services portal for this purpose and we hope to unveil this to the public as soon as we have uploaded services for consumers, government-to-government and government-to- business.

More work still needs to be done to tap on other technologies especially as we integrate into Big Data enabled innovations. SITA will also establish a framework and platform for tech start-ups and the innovator community to source digital

government services such as applications and related tools. Together with the Ministry of Social Development, we are working to resolve the challenges around social grants distribution, and as such, fellow South Africans, we assure you that we will continue to deliver social grants without fail.

Mr President, the progress on the commitment to build a smart city comes at an opportune time as we are seized with preparing South Africa for the licensing of 5G spectrum. To enhance such efforts, we have prioritised the building of connected towns within the pilot districts identified in the District Development Model in order to enable deployment of the internet of thing technologies by the techs start-ups.

The development of smart cities and smart communities necessitates smart people who are equipped with the requisite skills ... [Time expired.] We now have a choice to allow these technologies to replace us or we leverage on them to change our economic and social status. Aluta Continua! [Applause.]

Mr S N AUGUST: Hon Deputy Chairperson of the NCOP, hon President, Madam Speaker, Parliament is a place to debate and implement ideas on best way to run the country. In order to

decide whose ideas they like the most, voters must hear what government has achieved and is proposing to do. That’s how functional democracies work.

Parliament is also a place for truth and accountability, where democracy cannot be silenced and lies cannot be sustained. We can’t argue over facts, because facts are facts. Everyone is entitled to their own opinion but not to their own facts. It is a fact, for example, that apartheid was a crime against humanity. And, it is a fact also that we would be much further down the recovery road had we prevented incompetence and corruption from infesting the administration of the state.

Many of us are working tirelessly to reverse these negative trends, and the state of the Nation address pointed to a number of green shoots. I welcome government’s commitment to allow municipalities to directly obtain renewable electricity. It makes economic and environmental sense and it vindicates Patricia De Lille in taking government to court in 2016 to demand it. As we increase energy security by including renewables, we will reduce the impacts of climate change.

Fixing the rail network will provide relief to masses of the poorest communities, while reducing road congestions and

carbon emissions. Repairs of trains must be faster. Where I want to see more progress is in the war against corruption, wasteful and fruitless expenditure. We should never allow greed, incompetence, disrespect of authority and the law to undermine service delivery or our own democratic systems.

The members of this House must lead by example. We are not here to benefit ourselves. It is not about who can shout the loudest but who has the best ideas. To stand any chance of growing the economy and reducing unemployment, we have to restore confidence in the country and government. That means we need a government united in its commitment to fight politicians, government workers and businesses who are stealing our tax money.

Mr President you have GOOD’s support for a better South Africa and our commitment to fight corruption and wasteful expenditure. We are not part of the permanently negative. You also have our promise to hold this government to account when it falls short of delivering on its promises. Thank you. [Applause.]

Dr Z SAUL (Premier of the Northern Cape): Hon Deputy Chairperson of the NCOP, His Excellencies, the President of

South Africa and the Deputy President, hon Members of the National Assembly and the NCOP, ladies and gentlemen. Hon Deputy Chair, based on the manifesto of the governing party and our commitment to reposition the Northern Cape as a growth centre, the Sixth Administration articulated a binding vision, which is to build a modern, growing and successful province.

The vision seeks to reposition the province by building on the

25 years of spade work and heavy lifting to create a democratic, nonracial, nonsexist and prosperous country. This vision calls on action all the Northern Capers including you, Deputy Chairperson, and particularly the political leaders to exit our self created comfort zones, take bold and courageous decisions to turn the tide against the developmental challenges facing the province.

We need to do things differently and more cost-effectively to create hope to the people of our province, particularly the youth. St Augusten of Hippo had this to say about Hope, I quote:

Hope has two beautiful daughters*.* Their names are anger and courage; anger at the way things are, and courage to see that they do not remain the way they are.

Whilst appreciating the massive strides made over the past 25 years to ensure a better life for all, we are angry at pronounced developmental challenges in our province, and I must assure this august House that this Sixth Administration is injected with a healthy dose of courage to change this. Hon Deputy Chairperson, we are quite cognisant of the fact that we are embarking on this difficult task to improve the quality of life of our people confronted by a very constraining fiscal environment.

This environment compels us to think more creatively than not to think at all. Therefore, hon Deputy Chair, we cannot afford not to think and courageously introduce new ideas on how to salvage our people from the debilitating scourge of poverty, unemployment and inequality. Driven by this attitude, the implementation of the vision to build a modern, growing and successful province, is in full swing with key projects lined up for implantation.

Our efforts to mordenised the province to be at the cutting edge of the Fourth Industrial Revolution punctuated by a number of complementary initiatives that seeks to ensure high degree of connectivity, broadband rollout and leveraging innovation and technology to improve service delivery. Case in

point is the Bloodhaund world land speed record attempt. The findings from this attempt and the tremendous incentives it offers for students are of global importance.

This is stimulating interest and career path in science and engineering for young people in the province. The work to cultivate interest in science and maths done by the Maths and Science Leadership Academy, MSLA, is also prioritised. The skills development programmes offered at this academy prepare learners for the challenges of the world economy which requires scientific and technological skills.

Hon members, given the significance of technology in education, we have introduced offline information in computer technology resources for all critical subjects such as maths and science. In responding to our geographic challenges, the province is engaged in a process of installing broadband platforms. This includes the use of live streaming to reach and support remote learning centres. Live streaming is a tool that offers multiple benefits and opportunities for learning.

Advancing the Fourth Industrial Revolution in the province requires an inclusive information society in which the use of information computer technology, ICT, will be harnessed to

ensure that every one has fast, reliable and affordable access to information and technology. This will enable our people to participate meaningfully in the economy. To this end, our plans for the next five years includes among others, fast- tracking internet connectivity and the establishment of WiFi hotspots at all 223 provincial libraries and all youth service centres. [Applause.]

This has commenced with the connectivity of 150 libraries and will be increased to 200 by 2021. In partnership with Afrovision, the provincial government and the Wireless Access Service Provider Association will install 200 WiFi hotspots in the province. The fourth phase of installation includes 20 sites in Kimberley. In partnership with the technology innovation agency, we are in the process of implementing community telecom co-operatives to support and sustain the wireless mesh project in John Taolo Gaetsewe District.

We are busy creating a government portal to connect all citizens to government services and to ensure their access to information. Hon Deputy Chairperson, the province is implementing coding and robotics in collaboration with our partners to enable our learners and teachers to derive

benefits of digitisation towards the Fourth Industrial Revolution, focusing on science and innovation.

Sol Plaatjie University, SPU, is the only university in Africa to offer data science undergraduate and postgraduate degrees. [Applause.] The students that are enrolled in this course are well-equipped to complement the Square Kilometre Array, SKA, with regards to data analysis. The SPU continues to play an influential role in imparting digital skills to our various communities by hosting various programmes such as hackathorns and vakok. These programmes assist to empower our communities.

Plans are at an advance stage to implement a computer-aided ambulance dispatched system in all Emergency Medical Services, EMS, call centres in the province. This will ensure that we automate and modernise the communication systems to improve the response time of ambulances. We are also working on the digitisation of patients files. West End Hospital and seven feeder clinics have been identified as pilot sites. These programmes will incrementally be rolled out through out the province.

This will lead to improved efficiency and enhance the quality of healthcare services. Deputy Chairperson, this year we will

introduce online learner admission system. This will enable online registration and placement of children in different schools. The business requirements of the system have been completed, therefore, paving the way for implementation. [Applause.] Through the growth will platform, the provincial government renders hands-on and onsite support to ICT entrepreneurs.

This support includes business registration, support and mentorship. Hon Deputy Chair, we are prioritising creating jobs for young people. We are collaborating with the National Youth Development Agency, NYDA, who annually approves grants to provide seed funding to about 50 youth start-up businesses, each creating three to five job opportunities. About 25% of these businesses are in the technology and innovation sector, with the rest being in agriculture, personal services and small scale manufactures.

With the NYDA, the provincial government developed an application to link unemployed graduates to job opportunities. Young people will be able to view live on the mobile app if they have been identified by prospective employer and can make follow-ups where necessary. Hon Deputy Chair, the Gross Domestic Product, GDP, of the province is R96 billion of which

mining accounts is about R19 billion, agriculture, R6,8 billion and construction, R2,6 billion.

Also, there are huge untapped investment opportunities in our province. Hon President correctly stated that mining is a sunrise industry. We punctuate that by saying that the next

100 years of mining in South Africa are in the Northern Cape.

Hon Deputy Chair, allow me to highlight some few programmes in this regard. We have identified a multimodal corridor in the province which stretches from the Gamagara Mining Corridor to the proposed Boegoe Baai deep-water port.

This corridor will provide substantial opportunities for growth in the province. The key anchor project along this line includes a metal and protein cluster, Kathu Industrial Park and the Namaqua Special Economic Zone, SEZ. These opportunities provide potential for public private partnerships and will yield the requisite investment and employment opportunities for the province. We also appreciate our President’s commitment in convening the investment council as this platform enables us to secure an anchor investor for the proposed Namaqua Special Economic Zone, SEZ.

This investment amounts to R26 billion, translating to 6000 temporary and 1 850 permanent jobs. The current zinc mining activities will trigger a new wave of industrial and economic development in the region. The envisaged number of direct and indirect jobs to be created across this multimodal corridor is

30 000 jobs. In addressing the country’s energy crisis, we are well positioned with the newly developed independent power producer, IPP, capacity.

The province can produce more than 100% of its own energy needs from renewables. In line with what was pronounced in the state of the nation address, SONA, the Northern Cape has 59 of the 64 operational renewable energy projects and 47 of the 90 active projects. [Applause.] Collectively, the projects have created 35 485 temporary jobs during the construction phase.

In enhancing the value chain of these projects, the province is looking at manufacturing component. As the Northern Cape Sixth Administration, we have the will, power and courage to see through the implementation of our vision to modernise, grow and make our province successful. Thank you very much. [Applause.] [Time expired.]

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Hon House Chair and President. Allow me first of all to condemn the utterances made by the former

Deputy President De Klerk. Now, this is not the first time he has made utterances of this nature and the NFP does not accept his apology because it does not come from within him he saying it because of the situation he is faced with.

But, also allow me to condemn what happened earlier on here today House Chair, particularly on the issue of gender based violence. Such a sensitive issue that the country is going through, hundreds of our women, in fact I think there is 113 of them that are being raped and murdered everyday in South Africa and we come out here and make it as if it’s some kind of fun or excitement of scoring points. I think it is totally unacceptable and I think we need to deal with this in a more in a sensitive manner.

Also, let me just respond to one issue in terms of Hon Malema when he said that members in this House can’t read the rules and he’s correct because he can’t read the rules. If he looks at 13.2 says there is no debate in a joint sitting but he is the one that’s been calling for a joint sitting here on the day of the state of the nation address.

What I want to say Mr President, is that I think it’s time that we should stop dreaming, I think it’s time we should stop

having these meetings and Lekgotlas and Cabinet meetings and spend a few days with me

Let us go on the road and I am going to show you and I hope the Eastern Cape Premier is here. Louwterwater is one area where 26 years later Mr President, people are drinking water contaminated with sewage and share water with pigs. Is it acceptable 26 years later?

So, where is the Premier? Tell us what you’re going to do about it. Tell us what you’re going to do about Tsitsikamma and Mandela Park and the conditions people are living in.

Mr President come with me to the Paarl area and I will show you under what conditions the people are living in, with rubbish dumped all over outside their doors, toilets are not functioning, brand new RDP houses are collapsing.

Mr President let me draw your attention to this, while of us were celebrating Christmas, over 400 people in Caledon did not have electricity and water for the entire festive season. Is that totally acceptable 26 years into democracy? Clearly I don’t think it is not acceptable. So I think there’s a lot of work that needs to be done. I only have three minutes but, Mr

President I want to give you one solution in terms of corruption.

We agreed there’s over R240 billion being lost in South Africa annually and I want to suggest that all tenders and quotations that are awarded be advertised in the local paper where they have been awarded, with the bill of court is of exactly how much you are paying for each item so that people can see whether they are paying for an A4 examination pad R50 or R10 which is the market value and I tell you, you will be saving R240 billion.

In small businesses, there is an organisation called case, no funding available, I can promise you the work they are doing with inmates is unbelievable. So we need to look at these things Mr President. We need to face reality and change the lives of our people. Thank you.

The MINISTER OF ENVIRONMENT, FORESTRY AND FISHERIES: Hon

Deputy Chairperson of the NCOP, Excellencies President Ramaphosa and Deputy President Mabuza and hon members, allow me at the outset to acknowledge the important commitment President Ramaphosa made in his state of the nation address to undertake a decisive shift in our energy trajectory at a time

when human kind faces the greatest threat to its sustainable future namely climate change.

I also want to welcome the President’s promise that the Presidential Climate Change Commission will lead our just transition to a low carbon climate resilient and sustainable society which will leave no one behind.

Science tells us that our country and our continent are warming much faster than the rest of the world. Whereas the world on average has warmed by roughly 1 degree above pre- industrial times. In Southern Africa the rate of warming is twice that.

A warmer climate is accompanied by extreme weather events, the Eastern, Western and Northern Cape have experienced the most prolonged periods of drought in recorded history. KwaZulu- Natal and the wild coast of the Eastern Cape have experienced severe storms and flooding with unprecedented frequency that has destroyed lives, homes and infrastructure.

Heat waves and multi year droughts are impacting on agricultural production, the livelihoods of thousands of

subsistence farmers and systemically on our country's Gross Domestic Product, GDP.

Our coastal cities already face sea level rise and storm surges. People, animals and plants confront new diseases and infestations of pests. Climate change also impacts negatively on biodiversity, ecosystem structure and the survival of most species.

It is now an accepted scientific fact that the phenomena which collectively represent climate change results from greenhouse gas emissions, a by-product of our industrialised society and human activity. Most recent research confirms that greenhouse gas emissions continue to rise and that atmospheric levels are currently at an all time high.

It is the ultimate injustice that developing nations, such as our own that have historically contributed the least to greenhouse gas emissions are the most affected.

Our continent has been responsible for a mere one percent of greenhouse gas emissions historically. Today we contribute only 4 percent to global emissions, with our own country responsible for half of these.

South Africa's vulnerability to climate change is exacerbated by our own economic inequality, poverty and our current dependency on coal-fired power generation.

So, no matter how we look at it, Climate Change poses significant risks to our country's current and future socioeconomic development. But all is not yet lost. There is still time to take decisive action to mitigate the worst impacts of climate change and to adapt to a warmer world.

This year the Paris Agreement under the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change, UNFCCC, comes into force. Throughout the world there is a call to enhance ambition in the fight against climate Change.

The Paris Agreement identifies three related and equally important aspects to ambition.

Firstly ambition in mitigating or reducing greenhouse gas emissions; secondly ambition in adapting to the consequences of climate change; and lastly ambition on the means of implementation include finance and technology).

As a responsible global citizen, South Africa must also make a fair contribution to the global effort to reduce greenhouse gas concentrations in the atmosphere. This year our country is expected to submit a revised Nationally Determined Contribution at Conference of the Parties, COP26, in Glasgow. Already in consultation with all stakeholders, we are finalising our long term low emissions development strategy that will guide this submission.

In putting it together we are mindful of both the opportunities and the difficulties. International experience demonstrates the potential of green industries to stimulate growth and job creation

A recent study by Accenture estimates green industries and technology can unlock economic activities to the value of

$350 billion on the African continent.

To ensure that the South African economy benefits from these new technologies and industries, the National Employment Vulnerability Assessment and the Sector Job Resilience Plans must identify economic sectors vulnerable to climate change, find viable new green economic activities, quantify the value

of these opportunities and understand which sectors have to change and how.

Together with the Department of Science and Technology we will intensify research and development on clean technologies and increasing the sink capacity in the land sector to enhance mitigation potential.

As we transition, we must be mindful of our country's current dependence on fossil fuels both for energy generation and foreign exchange earnings. Our movement to a lower carbon climate resilient economy and society must be undertaken in a responsible, phased and planned manner.

The soon to be constituted Presidential Climate Change Commission will be tasked with coordinating the work of all sectors of government and society in a common effort to ensure a just transition. Only by working together can we ensure that no one is left behind.

This year we will bring the Climate Change Bill to the NA. The legislation provides for effective management approaches to the inevitable impacts of climate change.

We will finalise the National Adaptation Strategy so that we galvanise our nation to invest in preparedness, early warning capabilities and risk mitigation for society.

Most provinces and a number of municipalities have formulated climate change response strategies. This year we must start to implement them.

Three weeks ago I met with the South African Weather Service and we agreed the service will educate local communities across the country so they can better understand Climate Change and respond appropriately.

Through our environmental programmes this year, we are spending R1.9 billion to restore wetlands, estuaries and coastal dunes to better protect infrastructure and human settlements from storms, floods and sea level rise.

Honourable Holomisa although I haven’t documented it today, there are further programmes that prevent soil erosion and land degradation

Hon members, it is estimated that African countries are spending between two and nine percent of their GDP on

adaptation. So, we will continue to lobby developed countries to provide for an adequate reliable and predictable source of international funding for both mitigation and adaptation.

Honourable members, we must all be clear that Climate Change and its associated consequences can only be addressed by the world's nations working together. Accordingly we must be seriously concerned that one of the world's biggest emitters has taken a decision to withdraw from the Paris Accord.

It is essential that the nations of the world stand together in support of the Paris Agreement. We have a common moral responsibility to future generations to honour our mutual commitments and our differentiated responsibilities to fight the causes and consequences of climate change. Our country is

a responsible global citizen. We will not shrink from the task that confronts us. I thank you

*IsiXhosa*:

Mnu L N NTSHAYISA: Qhwabani izandla kaloku, kutheni ningandiqhwabeli nje mna? [Kwahlekwa.]

*English*:

Hon Chairperson, Deputy Chairperson, in our manifesto as the AIC in the last general elections, we were at pains to stress the structural barriers laden in the South African economy.

However, to our credit we have pushed back the cycle of grinding poverty and despair where we co-governed in the Ekurhuleni Metropolitan Municipality, Rustenburg Local Municipality and the Nelson Mandela Bay Metropolitan Municipality. I hope we are going to do the same even in the City of Johannesburg Municipality so that we put things together.

Hon Deputy Chair, we were pleased Mr President by your announcement that government has decided to establish the sovereign wealth fund as means to preserve and grow the national endowment of our nation, giving practical meaning to the injunction that the people shall share in the country’s wealth.

It bears repetition; however that it took 11 years for this government to give effect to the New Growth Path initiation of the fund. It also took 24 years to give practical meaning to the injunction that the people shall in the country’s wealth. Mr President, it cannot be correct therefore to pick and choose some portions of the New Growth Path which only

envisages the sovereign wealth fund that also propagates the establishment of the state-owned mining company which will co- exists with the strong private mining sector. We would like to have our home brewed De Beers-Botswana partnership, Mr President.

Deputy Chair, the Koeberg Power Station will reach its lifespan in 2024 which means that the Minister will have to immediately apply section 34, the provision of the Electricity Regulation Act, of 2006, to ensure that the supply of additional electricity to the national grid is increased, creating safety net for energy security.

Deputy Chairperson, the issue of the infrastructure in the schools is of great concern to us. In the state of the nation, we were expecting a list of detailed information on how this challenge is going to be addressed. However, you did mention some measures that are ready to try to bring this in order.

We were also, Mr President, expecting that how you think the municipalities that owe Eskom will be encouraged to pay a lot of money that they owe. The debt is estimated at about

R18 billion and that is why sometimes Eskom cannot perform well but that is not the only reason. Of course, we know that

the old structure is the problem but there are some other reasons. [Time expired.] [Applause.]

Mr M G MAHLAULE: Hon Deputy Chairperson, hon President, Deputy President, I rise to remind this Joint Sitting of the two Houses of Parliament and the masses of our people who are watching this debate about the fundamental importance of history. The great philosopher Karl Marx wrote in the *Eighteenth Brumaire of Louis Bonaparte* that, “history repeats itself, “the first as tragedy, then as farce”,

On O7 April 2017, when EFF leaders such as Mr Malema marched, shoulder to shoulder, with the FW de Klerk Foundation, amongst others, under the banner of “Save South Africa”; chanting the slogans, some of us warned about this seemingly strange alliance. We warned that the alliance between the descendants of B J Vorster and H F Verwoerd and the so called Progressive Sankarists was history repeating itself. Unfortunately, very few of us pay sufficient attention to history, especially the history of fascism. Italian Marxist Antonio Gramsci captured the historical moments of the 1920s when he wrote from a prison cell that:

The old world is dying, and the new world of struggles to be born: now is the time of monsters.

What Gramsci meant was that despite the loss suffered by imperialist capitalism in the First World War, social and economic justice was not enjoyed by the struggling masses in Europe, hence the rise of new monsters - the fascists. Few people know that fascism was actually a brainchild of the European bourgeoisie. Fascists were sponsored to form gangs wearing black shirts in order to roll back the advance of socialism in Western Europe. Incidentally, President, fascists have always liked wearing uniforms and giving themselves quasi-military titles like Commander-in-Chief and Commissars, even though they have never ever been in combat. [Applause.] We have witnessed grown men and women, right here, being forced to wear cheap overalls with Louis Vuitton shoes, just to please their supreme leader.

It was in the 1930s after the collapse of the New York Stock Exchange, leading to the Great Depression that the fascists and Nazis broke away from their bourgeois sponsors and rode the anti-government wave which won them seats in parliament. It was therefore not an accident that the EFF, a proto-fascist political party, was very comfortable to wine and braai with

their sponsors, the likes of De Klerk and his foundation when it suited them.

Thanks to De Klerk’s milk that has fed them and they are now fat. They have now grown, and they can afford to denounce him as the last supreme apartheid ruler he is. Thank you also hon Mazzone and your team. Your EFF babies that you suckled from 2016 in City of Tshwane, City of Johannesburg and Nelson Mandela Bay Metropolitan Municipalities with milk from shady tenders have grown and they hate you. [Applause.]

Though we are all angry about De Klerk’s racist utterances, let us not forget that the EFF is not part of the progressive democratic forces. It is an anti-democratic minority party that will undermine any democratically elected President, whether the name is President Ramaphosa or anyone for that matter. They have insulted President Nelson Mandela before.

The critical question, Chair, which we need to ask is, what are the material conditions that allow violent, narrow nationalist populism to flourish? History teaches us that in Italy and Germany, Benito Mussolini and Adolf Hitler respectively mobilised thousands of unemployed, armed and starving former soldiers. We can then conclude that if we do

not address poverty, unemployment and inequality quite decisively in the six term we would have failed the millions of young people who stand hopeless in our townships worried about their future, hungry and angry. I am talking about those who are unable to find jobs and do not qualify to receive any social assistance from government. The hope of a better life lay with us Mr President, not demagogues who shout slogans and mobilise chaos to solve problems that need sober thinking. [Applause.]

If you compare the fake anger in the rhetoric of the EFF leaders to the speeches of a young Hitler and Mussolini or even Idi Amin; the similarities are very striking. When people are hungry and desperate, they will follow any demagogue who can stir their emotions by passionately expressing how they feel. The fact that these EFF gentlemen live like fat cats in posh suburbs; sipping expensive champagne with the rich and famous does not matter to our people.

Hon President, in the ANC we have been given a mandate to lift our people out of dehumanising poverty and joblessness. We believe that the struggles led by the kings and queens of African independent nations for land and dignity were not in vain. Ownership of land brings closeness of our people to

their ancestors and spirituality. For Africans, land is central to our being and humanity as it is more than a commercial commodity. It is the essence of our humanity and existence. We commit that the ANC-led government will deliver justice on land to all our people.

The ANC-led government has delivered basic services such as housing, electrification to poor communities, basic education, Early Childhood Development and access to quality Primary Healthcare to millions of South Africans.

We welcome the state of the nation address commitments to a series of reforms that promote growth and economic development and inclusion of the majority of South Africans; create an enabling regulatory environment for the development of new businesses; leveraging the public infrastructure build programme to remove barriers to entry for previously disadvantaged contractors; use of a state bank to unlock the potential of new business ventures and a Sovereign Wealth Fund for the development of national capital; and the support labour-intensive work that target the youth in designated sectors and skills for the Fourth Industrial Revolution.

As Parliamentarians, our duty is to collectively ensure that the President’s call to buy local is delivered by the very same government that we are leading. The purchase of South African manufactured goods is critical to our industrial strategy. Hon President, we are excited about the announcement of a science and technology university in the City of Ekurhuleni Metropolitan Municipality. Education breaks the chain of generational poverty that enslaves mainly black and African communities. [Applause.] That is why we offer our support to the students peacefully protesting for access to education in institutions of higher learning across the nation. We say to them, theirs is a noble cause.

In closing, we have to acknowledge that De Klerk represents a view held by the likes of the racist AfriForum and Solidarity Union and promoted by Freedom Front plus and the DA, that the hateful past was not at all that bad and perhaps maybe even better than the current. Their goal was and is to see blacks in misery. I believe that the most effective way of punishing an unreformed racist is to let him live for long so that he can be tormented by the sight of seeing his legacy unravels.

Killing dictators end their pain quickly. We must make sure that they see democracy and black progress in action. Let them

see apartheid melt in front of their eyes. That way they die a slow painful death. They get tortured by their lies of many years. That is how racist dictators must be punished - they must experience nonracialism which truly breaks their hearts because it is irreversible. This is the confidence that we have in what we call, “victory of good over evil”. [Applause.]

Mr M G P LEKOTA: Madam Speaker, hon President and Deputy President. [Interjections.] I ...

The SPEAKER: Hon Lekota, you may commence. You may start, sir.

Mr M G P LEKOTA: I join those who’ve expressed the uncertainty of the future especially as indicated by the economic trends that our country is faced with and other problems. It is clear that our country is facing an economic emergency requiring urgent emergency measures to deal with these problems.

Mr President, I do want to say that we must think very hard about how to address this uncertainty. A picture I saw when I chanced upon Zimbabwe in the recent period and looked at what happened previously to a country that was heavily agriculturally productive, left a very sad picture because people are running across South Africa to come and buy food

here and carry them in big amounts. There is nothing ... they go back to their lands and so on; but there is simply nothing to eat. There is no capacity to produce and so on. And it opened my mind to something which I had never thought about.

When we lost our lands in 1913, there abouts, we didn’t only lose our lands; we lost also the knowhow to work the land. And it also opened my mind to the fact why our senior leaders often said to us: No, you must not intimidate these guys to runaway with their knowledge, to runaway with their thing because we need them to use them and educate our people, our children and further expand the economy of our country; because they are our country’s people. [Interjections.]

Please man, please, if I may just speak.

Because they are the people of South Africa themselves. They will have no reason to runaway if we don’t intimidate them. And indeed, indeed, this is correct. Large numbers of South Africans have not just chosen to runaway once there was an indication to them that we would not take their properties, properties, not their land but properties; because section 25 speaks to property. Then we had this atmosphere that we cultivated. But since there is uncertainty that we created

about whether properties of people would be secured or not, it has also caused us a lot of damage. And many of these very educated and trained in civil engineering – I was in the military for ten years – and all that and so on, these people who were very valuable to our country have now started leaving because they feel uncertain about what’s going to happen to them here and so on. And we really have a duty [Time expired.] to encourage them to come back to this country so that they can help rebuild and cultivate the country. I thank you.

Mr M A NHANHA: Hon Speaker, I’m pleased for once you got my surname correct.

Hon Mahlaule, we did not give tenders to EFF in Port Elizabeth, PE, it is your President who gave money to EFF Members of Parliament, MPs, who later resigned; we don’t give out money. [Applause.]

Hon Speaker, hon members, fellow South Africans, in 1969 I was born in a friendly city of Port Elizabeth. But in 1978 my family moved to Mdantsane; a township outside of East London.

My father was the first in his family to obtain a Form 1 (Standard 6 or Grade 8) Certificate. If you are old enough,

you would know how important it was to have a Grade 8 at the time.

I lived with my parents, six siblings, my grandmother and two other relatives. In both our stays in Port Elizabeth and Mdantsane, the 12 of us had to stay in four-roomed house, like a Reconstruction and Development Programme, RDP; of course, they were of better quality. In the evenings the lounge, the kitchen would double up as extra bedrooms. During the holidays and weekends I could not sleep past six in the morning because I was sleeping next to the kitchen door, and I would be disturbing early morning traffic at home.

But what was more painful to my parents was not owning the houses they lived in; instead, they had 99-year leases.

In 1983 we were on the move again; as my father got transferred to Alice. It was in Alice where my late father’s dream of owning property became a reality. He bought a three- bedroom house with two outside rooms, a lounge, a dining room and a kitchen. Boy oh boy. By our own standards this was a mansion to us; given the fact that we used to live in four- roomed houses.

Whilst my siblings and I were excited and marvelling about the extent of our new home ...

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Speaker, on a point of order. I’m terribly sorry to interrupt my own member but I must rise in terms of 14(b) of the Rules of the Joint Sitting. We are not allowed to converse in a manner that disrupts the person at the podium and the levels of noise in this House and the interjections are simply unacceptable and we cannot hear what the hon member is saying. So, I would ask you to please quieten the House down.

The SPEAKER: Your point is sustained.

Hon members, you may converse but please do not drown the speaker on the podium. Please continue, hon Nhanha!

Mr M A NHANHA: Somebody said they can’t read rose, Chief whip.

Whilst my siblings and I were excited and marvelling about the extent of our new home, my father was a proud and relieved man that he finally could own a property his children could truly call home.

In case some of you are too young to remember, in November 1959 the DA’s earliest predecessor, the Progressive Party, was formed by a group of progressives who left the United Party after the latter in its congress earlier that year passed resolutions that would deny natives civil liberties; amongst those was the right to own land.

To this day, the DA has stood firm in the resolve of its founding fathers. We remain opposed to the proposed constitutional amendments [Applause.] that will give the state sweeping powers to expropriate land without compensation and turn property ownership to long-term leases, just like my late father’s.

To be clear, colleagues, we agree for a harmonious co- existence; land reform is essential but it does not have to include the amendment of the Constitution; harming my father’s dream of owning the property.

It is my submission in this Joint Sitting that there is nothing wrong with section 25 of the Constitution [Applause.] there is everything wrong with the bureaucrats that are tasked with the responsibility; they are incompetent and downright farad. [Applause.]

When you talk of land reform program that has failed, please don’t look across the Limpopo River.

In the late 1970s and early 1980s, white-owned farms were expropriated by the then Ciskei government to make way for black farmers. Almost all those farms were given to Ciskei Cabinet Ministers, high-ranking government officials and well- connected members of the Ciskei National Independence Party.

These were thriving citrus farms in Alice and Middledrift; these were flourishing pineapple fields in Peddie. Today, all of them lie in fallow and *boet* [brother] Sakhi Somyo can bear testimony to this. [Applause.]

All the cases above, ladies and gentlemen, occurred some 35 years ago but they remain relevant today and there are lessons to be learned by all of us.

Mr President, judging by the track record of your party, there is absolutely nothing that persuades me not to conclude that your planned expropriation of land will kill farming in our country with catastrophic consequences. The people who stand to benefit are the same old elite that are well-connected to the governing party.

Ladies and gentlemen, like my father [Interjections.] South Africans should be allowed to own property; this is a fundamental civil liberty that many of us fought for. [Applause.]

*IsiXhosa*:

Lo mthendevu wasemaMpondomiseni uyabulela ngokuba nimboleke iindlebe. Ndisatshaya, enkosi. [Kwaqhwatywa.]

Ms K D MAHLATSI: Hon Speaker; Your Excellency, Mr President Cyril Ramaphosa; Deputy President; fellow South Africans and hon members, history has no blank pages. Dispossession and forced removal of African people under colonialism and apartheid resulted not only in the physical separation of our people along racial lines, but also in extreme land shortages, insecure land rights and poverty for the black majority. This onslaught did not only leave us poor but landless. The land of our forebears was stolen and it must be returned. As South Africans we must remain resolute on ensuring that section 25 of the Constitution is amended to redress the injustice of the past.

Hon Speaker, the ANC 54th National Conference adopted a resolution to expropriate land without compensation.

Subsequent to this, the Fifth Parliament adopted a resolution to amend section 25, to make explicit what is implicit in the Constitution, in simple terms, to make possible expropriation of land without compensation. The Sixth Parliament, which is this Parliament, is therefore mandated to deal with the actual amendment to the Constitution. I hope hon Malema understands these two processes.

Hon President, as we carry out this task that the National Assembly has mandated us to perform, we do it within the context of our progressive three-tier land reform system of; one, land restitution; two, the land redistribution and transfer of productive assets and three, security of land tenureship. Hon Speaker, the skewed spatial patterns in our towns and cities does not reflect integrated and equitable society. Therefore, without the redistribution of the land, we will not be able to build a united, nonracial and nonsexist democratic society. This political sentiment was expressed by uTata Mandela and I quote:

Only a fair redistribution of the land to its former black owners would guarantee peace as the country emerges from apartheid minority rule.

Hon Speaker, this year as we continue to celebrate Madiba’s life and also marking the 30th anniversary of his release from prison, let us remind the Democratic Alliance that as they quote Tat’ uMandela they must not quote him selectively. He was a revolutionary to the core. Indeed he must be celebrated. He is an international icon, but the return of the land to his people would be a beautiful present to celebrate the 30th anniversary.

As the ANC, our main focus is on the land not property. South Africa must not be misled. After we have passed the 18th Amendment Bill, the House will receive the Revised Expropriation Bill for consideration. This Bill sets out circumstances under which expropriation of land with or without compensation is permissible. This Bill further makes clear the distinction between land and property. There is no unlawful confiscation of property that will take place under the constitutional dispensation brought about by the ANC. [Applause.]

Hon Speaker, the answer to the question about the authority to determine compensation lies in the Constitution. Misplaced views around the courts determining the quantum of compensation are not well informed, and clearly, those

advocating for this do not understand the Constitution and its separation of powers. The court had, in the past, clearly indicated that administrative justice lies within the ambit of the executive and not judiciary. Therefore, the executive authority is the executive not a judge in terms of the Constitution of the Republic. It is only in an event of a dispute that an aggrieved party may seek judicial review recourse. There is nothing arbitrary that the ANC is proposing rather a scientific methodology of determination.

Hon Speaker, without giving the poor the means to productively farm the land, we will not defeat poverty. Therefore, the land must be used as an economic asset to ensure food security and facilitate economic development. The prophets of doom are

hell-bent on instigating our people against this process through malicious threats of food security. In fact, by amending section 25 will make it easy as it gives in an opportunity to South Africans to enhance food security, reduce poverty and redress historical injustices.

The President in his state of the nation address outlined the land reform programme focusing on the release of the state land amounting to 700 000 hectares during the 2020/21 financial year. As the ANC welcome this initiative, however,

this figure must be increased and the processes be increased, Mongameli (President). We are saying that the majority of our people are ready to work the land and they have been patient. The youth of this country have been throttled with inequalities, unemployment and social ills, and therefore, we seize this as a milestone towards a better future. We are aware of land hunger amongst our people and in light of this we call against illegal land grabs and land occupations. This is not the ANC policy.

Hon Speaker, as the ANC we remain vigilant and responsible and will not lure our people towards a process that will collapse the country and the economy. We have taken into consideration, international implications of amending section 25 of the Constitution in relation to the international treaties. We have considered the legal, economic and political implications of expropriation of land without compensation. We are therefore confident, Mr President, that this Parliament will ensure that the process of amending section 25 is in line with our constitutional prescripts and the rule of law. There is no policy uncertainty and investment risks are well within acceptable global standards.

Hon Speaker, the Freedom Charter as one of our guiding documents that speaks directly to the land ownership; “The land shall be shared among those who work it” And, it goes further to elaborate the role of the state. Therefore, the state cannot be a sole custodian of the land. The land belongs to the people. Nationalisation of the land has never been an ANC policy from inception.

We will remind all of us, the children whose ancestors were brutally murdered and disposed of their land and the wealth, that we have nothing to inherit except our collective future. It is therefore of critical importance that we collectively define and create our own future today. The first steps to architecture this common future is through participation in numbers during the public hearings and make submissions in support of section 25 of our Constitution. This is a bloodless but democratic process. This is one of the efforts to move close to achieving our generational mission as adopted by the ANC Youth League National Congress in Gallagher Estates in 2011, long before the chaotic populists who claim it today were actually formed in 2013.

Mayibuye! I-Afrika! I-Afrika! Mayibuye! Thank you very much, Sihlalo (Chairperson). [Applause.]

Mr M NYHONTSO: Hon Speaker, Mr President and Mr Deputy President, on 21 March 2020 it will be sixty years since the Positive Action Campaign led by PAC was launched and the Fascist National Party regime in an act of criminality massacred our people at Sharpeville and Langa. Having swallowed the National Party, the same concomitant action was taken against the workers of Marikana, the people of Sharpeville, the students and workers of Soweto, the people of Boipatong, the Mpendulo twins and three others including the five-year old in Mthatha that Verwoerd to De Klerk murdered and accepted responsibility and awaits justice.

Mr President, you promised a new city but as we speak the people of eGcuwa, Qwaqwa, Cradock, Ditsobotla, Makhanda and Sekhukhune do not have water. If you can’t provide simple running tap water in areas that had pipes and water in the past, what megacity will you build? Mr President, the money used for the state capture commission should be deployed to the prosecution and investigation services. We must see arrests instead of confessions. Judge Zondo is not an archbishop to hear confessions.

*IsiZulu*:

Phambili ngosiyasebenza awumbala owolintshi.

Mr President, we want the immediate return of the land to the people of Azania without any course or action. The land was stolen and the land must be returned. We want Sobukwe to be accorded the same status posthumously accorded to former Presidents. Apartheid imprisoned and killed Sobukwe because he was the President of the African people. We are the voice of Sobukwe. We want the immediate pardon and release of all Apla prisoners and former liberation fighters still incarcerated.

Apla soldiers deserves better. We want all the audio, electronic voice and visual recordings of Sobukwe to be unbanned with immediate effect. Apartheid banned Sobukwe’s voice because he embodied the aspirations of *Uhuru* of our people. The ANC bans Sobukwe because he inspires the masses of our people.

Lastly, we demand the arrest of F W De Klerk for ordering the killing of the Mpendulo twins and three others in Mthatha in 1983. Thank you, Speaker.

The PREMIER OF THE NORTH WEST (Mr J MOKGORO): Hon Speaker, His

Excellency, the President, the Deputy President, hon members,

*Setswana*:

Mmusakgotla, ka Setswana; go kgwa dikgaba ga se go rumolana.

Ke ka moo ke lebogelang tšhono ya go tsaya karolo mo dingangisanong tsa gompieno, le lesego la gokgwa Tautona Ramaphosa dikgaba.

*English*:

Mr President, it is important that I begin by congratulating you for your stewardship and steady hand in managing the affairs of the state since taking office in February 2018 and after the renewal of your mandate in May 2019. Your exemplary leadership and commitment to the course of our struggle has vindicated the choice of our membership and the nation at large to entrust you with the task of leading both the ANC and government respectively.

In these turbulent times, when our nation faces unprecedented challenges, some inflicted and others external, the nation relies on your reflective leadership and deep abiding love for your country and its people to lead the way in finding solutions to South Africa’s challenges. We have absolute confidence and trust in your leadership, both in the ANC and government.

Mr President, your leadership has so far earned our country the gift of stability and certainty which is a necessary pre-

requisite for the achievement of the goals of our developmental agenda. The developmental goals we have set ourselves, as reflected in the Medium Term Strategic Framework, adopted by the sixth administration, require the presence of quality leadership both at political and administrative levels. It needs mature ability to manage the complex balance between capabilities and capacities required to build a truly democratic developmental state; able to meet the needs and aspirations of our people for jobs, shelter, food and security.

Hon members, the National Development Plan addresses the issues of capability and capacity of the state, and we in the ANC believe that these should be understood separately.

Capability deals with the structures, processes, systems and governance instruments at a macro level, and capacity deals with human resources and skills necessary for driving state machinery. These capabilities are required by the democratic developmental state to lead in the definition of a common agenda; to mobilise society and business; to take part in the implementation of the agenda; to change gear and accelerate growth and transformation of our economy.

The great revolutionary, Thomas Sankara, defines the developmental state as:

“A new state capable of guaranteeing the democratic exercise of power by the people; for the people”

In the same manner, the ANC through successive resolutions in both the 52nd and 53rd National Conferences properly conceptualised our choice of a democratic developmental state unique to our conditions of a mixed economy led and guided by the state that intervenes in the interest of the people as a whole.

Mr President, it is therefore my argument that the democratic developmental state is the logical outcome of a successful National Democratic Revolution. The state does not exist for its own sake or to serve individual or sectarian interests.

The democratic developmental state is an affirmation of participatory democracy at all levels of government, a binding contract partnership with the people and civil society. Hon members, the building of a capable democratic developmental state is a national priority which should not be allowed to fail.

Mr President, the sixth administration under your able leadership carries a historic mandate both legal and constitutional to realise the South Africa of our dreams, and we have full confidence that you are more than equal to the challenge.

Hon Speaker, section 195 (1) outlines principles governing public administration in our country and if you look at the eleventh section you will see the various principles outlined there. These principles have also informed the objectives set out under Chapter 13 of the National Development Plan; including a state that is capable of playing a developmental and transformative role; a public service immersed in the development agenda but insulated from undue political influence; and staff at all levels should have the authority, experience and competencies.

Hon members, the appointment of a capable cadreship of public servants imbued with the right sense of national duty will provide a strategic vision and a drive to build partnerships in the implementation of our economic and social transformation strategies. It is the only guarantee our people will have; that our schools will work, and continue to improve outcomes; that our hospitals will properly manage and cure

diseases; that our SOEs’ will meet their developmental mandates without burdening the public fiscus; that our public infrastructure, houses, roads, bridges etc, will be built properly and not fail thereby causing harm and injuries; and that those entrusted with the responsibilities of management and leadership have the relevant competencies to comprehend and solve complex problems facing our people on a daily basis.

Mr President, we are heartened by the leadership you have provided since taking office; to make merit the requirement for all appoints you have made both in the national Cabinet and in key government positions. There is no doubt that President Ramaphosa is committed to the implementation of the ANC’s commitment to deploy a capable cadreship with relevant competencies to manage state institutions as demonstrated by recent decisions to make key appointments at various public sector institutions.

We are further encouraged by the pronouncement you made Mr President, during the ANC Lekgotla closing address that criteria will be developed to determine minimum competency requirements for all people occupying public office, starting with the local government elections of 2021.

In addition to the measures implemented and commitments already made, I would like to highlight a few interventions required to firm our resolve to build a democratic developmental state: We need to launch a national audit to assess whether the skills we have across the public service meet the demands of the jobs. Launch an audit on the appointments of all public servants in senior management positions, in national, provincial and local government spheres.

The merit principle must apply in the deployment to senior appointments, based on legislative prescripts and in line with minimum competency standards. The office of standard and compliance must be established to set and oversee implementation of uniform norms and standards in public administration in all three spheres in order to move towards a single public service; strengthen the Performance Management and Development System to achieve accountability and consequence management; increase the role and authority of the Public Service Commission in the selection and appointment of senior managers in the public service; and urgently revise the fixed contract appointments of heads of departments and start immediately with those in key clusters.

Hon Speaker, there are still weaknesses across government, particularly at provincial and local levels to introduce and implement stringent measures to protect the state against those whose occupation of positions of management in the public service serves no benefit to the people, nor the agenda of the of the democratic developmental state.

We need to assert the authority of the state and insulate its policies and procedures from undue political influence, corruption and maladministration through the appointment and deployment of people not qualified in the public service.

Hon members, it is common knowledge that our provincial administration is under section 100 (1) intervention by national government; and that 15 of the 22 municipalities in the North West are under some form of intervention by the provincial government, and the majority being under section

139 of the Constitution.

I can therefore claim, shameful as it is that we in the North West know very well the implications of governance and administration failures and its impact on the capacity of the state to discharge its mandate and delivery of services to the people.

Section 100 interventions have achieved visible progress in enhancing stability, good governance, curbing corruption and improving service delivery. [Applause.] We continually extract lessons from our experiences in section 139 interventions in municipalities, and have successfully applied the principle of learning-by-doing in implementing the District Development Model at the Mamusa local municipality.

Our situation demonstrates that the task to build a capable democratic developmental state is not a nicety or a figment of intellectual theoretical construct; it is a guarantee of the fulfilment and advancement of the National Democratic Revolution. [Interjections.]

The building of a capable, democratic and developmental state should not be left to chance. It is for this reason that the ANC NEC Lekgotla ... [Interjections.]

MMUSAKGOTLA: Tonakgolo e e tlotlegang, nako ya gago e fedile nkgonne.

TONAKGOLO YA BOKONE BOPHIRIMA (Rre J MOKGORO): Ke lebogile

Mmusakgotla. [Legofi.] [Nako e fedile.]

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Madam Speaker, Deputy President, hon President, members of the House, the year is 2020 - it is a new decade, a new year, and still South Africa remains in the grips of an economic crisis - a crisis of ethics in our government. A Parliament in crisis based on ideology trumping the culture of pragmatism, and a crisis in safety as South Africans live in constant fear for our lives. Today, Mr President, is not a good day to be South African.

Hon Mahlaule, you and your party birthed the monster that is the EFF. They are the snake that has turned. Now they are trying to eat you.

I have sat in your committee, sir, and I have watched you cosy up to your Gucci revolutionary buddies. The country isn’t blind. We see your secret meetings with the fascists in order to get support for the change of the Constitution. But let me make one thing very clear. You and the fascists can argue about who is the lion and who is the tiger. We are going to stay the wolves because we will not perform in your circus. [Applause.]

Last Thursday I argued, point after point, for my right and the right of every South African to listen to the President’s

Sona speech. I lived in hope that firm and decisive steps would be announced to relieve us from the continued crises that we, as South Africans, face on a daily basis. Yet again, my hopes were shot down in what was a dramatic display of the inability of the governing party to put the needs of South Africa first, above their own political party. I watched as Parliament was treated with contempt as those who do not have the ability to argue and to debate attempted a coup of the evening using Stalingrad tactics to bully their way into significance. It is not a good day to be South African

As I sat in my chair, the irony was not lost on me that this was not the first time Judge Zondo had seen many Members of Parliament. In fact, he has seen far too many ‘honourable’ members in his commission, appearing for a variety of reasons, none of them earning them the title of ‘honourable’. The irony was also not lost on me that the President looked over to our benches and viewed us as the enemy because where I sat, I had the bird’s eye view of every person who wishes the President harm, and it certainly was not us.

I looked across at members who are so resolute in the power that they yield within one party that they do not think twice about making outrageous statements on the steps of court, or

join fellow members appearing on corruption charges to show their support. What we need to realise is that this is not only a show of force for the President; it is a blatant slap in the face of every South African who believes in justice and the rule of law. This is not a good day to be South African.

Madam Speaker, South Africans are so used to being slapped in the face, that I think as a nation, we are literally punch drunk. If it wasn’t for our humour and our dogged determination to succeed, we would be in complete dire straits.

While I think that it is really funny and genius in its creation, I don’t think that, as South Africans, we can be proud of the fact that a television advert teases our government by calling it Mzansipoli, where you can beat the game that has been playing you. South Africans shouldn’t feel like their government is playing them, but let’s be honest, what else can they think? We now depend on Apps on our phones to tell us when the electricity will be on, and how can we forget when in December 2019, when the country ...

The SPEAKER: Hon Mazzone, please take your seat. Is it a point of order, hon Mkhize? [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: It is a point of order.

The SPEAKER: On what point are you rising, sir?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: I am rising on point 14(s) of the Joint Rules of the debate.

The SPEAKER: Continue. [Interjections.] Order, members!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: The structure of the debate is such that I will not have an opportunity other than to raise a point at this moment. I am very sorry about that, but the hon Steenhuisen raised an issue which is untrue, which is a lie that is related to a statement ... [Interjections.] ...

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: ... that has been ... [Interjections.]

AN HON MEMBER: Point of order.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: ... the statement ...

The SPEAKER: Please take your seat. Hon Mkhize, the hon member on the podium is hon Mazzone and not Steenhuisen. Are you referring to her? [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: No. The hon member is the Chief Whip of the party. The Leader of the party made a point and sat down. [Interjections.] I need to put it on record. He needs

... [Interjections.] I would like you to investigate on the basis of Rule 14(g) and ask the member to withdraw.

The SPEAKER: I will rule, hon members; give me a space.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: I would like you to investigate in terms of Rule 14(g) and ask the member to withdraw because the statement was withdrawn by the newspaper that made it, and retracted it when the matter was taken to the Press Ombudsman. The member knows. It has to be raised now because it is relevant to the debate. We cannot proceed unless that member has been made to deal with the issue. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Mkhize, can I respond to the point you are making! I cannot make that ruling now because I did not witness or hear what the hon member said. This debate continues tomorrow. We will look at the recordings and will

then be able to rule on the matter. But at this point, we cannot do so. Hon member.

AN HON MEMBER: Speaker ... [Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Sorry, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Hon Steenhuisen.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Madam Speaker, the Rules of the House are very specific. A point of order must be taken at the time of the transgression and it’s meant to ... You cannot come ex post facto nearly six hours later and raise a point of order. It is just simply completely outside the bounds of the Rules.

The SPEAKER: Hon Stuisen. Hon Steenhuisen, I am sorry to mispronounce your name. I do get what you say. I do not know what the member is raising. What you say is ... [Interjections.] No! No, no! [Interjections.] I do hear what you are saying but I still want to satisfy myself and I will rule. If the hon member is right, I will rule. Whichever way, I will rule! I have never been scared to make a ruling which

is direct in this House. Please give me that space! [Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: I get your time ... I get your point on the time lag. I do acknowledge that. But I do not know what the hon Minister is on about. [Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Neither do I, Madam Speaker. But I would say that what you do now will create a precedent, going forward; which means that people in this House can get up and raise points of order hours after a speaker has finished. The point is that you are meant to be able to call the person to order. If the hon member has a problem with what I have said, he can lodge a complaint with the general ...

The SPEAKER: Hon Steenhuisen, I am aware of all you are saying. I will make that ruling. If you are correct, I will get there. Can we continue, hon Mazzone!

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Thank you, Speaker. The hon member would do well to check on Twitter. Hon Malema posted screenshots of a WhatsApp group that the ANC Whips said so.

Maybe the member should join that WhatsApp group. [Interjections.] So, back to where I was.

We now depend on Apps on our phones to tell us when the electricity will be on, and how can we forget the December 2019, when the country had to hold its collective breath as we entered the unchartered territory of stage 6 blackouts.

I read tweet after tweet, facebook post after facebook post, as South Africans used humour to lift their spirits. I noted how many South Africans posting the lyrics to the song, *The Sound of Silence*. The song starts with the line, "Hello darkness my old friend". So, of course, it was apt, and we all giggled, but the song goes on:

And in the naked light I saw Ten thousand people, maybe more People talking without speaking People hearing without listening

People writing songs that voices never share And no one dared to

Disturb the sound of silence

It is not a good day to be South African.

However, Madam Speaker, let me conclude by saying this, it can, in fact, be a very good day to be South African and in the face of all the crisis I see, I am more determined than ever to make tomorrow, the day after that, and the day after that are good days to be South African. This is my home; this is my heart; and this is my pride. I will live and strive for freedom.

I believe in South Africa; I believe in our future; and I believe that the South African flame that we all have will guide us through this very dark period of our history. Mr President, I hope that you too will use this flame to guide you. And I hope, sir, that you will break the sound of silence. Thank you. [Applause.]

Mr M GUNGUBELE: Hon Speaker, Mr President, Deputy President, hon members of this Joint Sitting, may I express my gratitude for the opportunity to participate. To my Chief Whip, if I was allowed, after hon Mahlaule spoke I was going to say that I rest my case. [Applause.] But I thought one has some few things to speak about especially in the area of social cohesion which you instructed me to speak about.

I thought it is important to share with this House because of a number of developments that have occurred in the past few days, that demonstrate that we are a fractured society and there is a huge challenge to all of us, in a nonpartisan way, to commit to a united South Africa; to a cohesive society; the one which works towards the wellbeing of all its members; the one that fights exclusion and marginalisation; the one that creates a sense of belonging to all South Africans; the one that promotes trust and offers its members opportunities of upward mobility; set differently; its anti exclusion, sense of belonging, trust and a key defining characteristic focuses on the wellbeing of its members.

Post 1994, hon Speaker, there emerged an alternative system in pursuit of a cohesive South Africa to deal and eliminate a historically racially and ethnic divided South Africa, undemocratic without peace, sexist and unprosperous. Put in a nutshell, devoid of all the characteristics of a cohesive society. That kind of society is a society that cannot find resonance in an environment where fascists are dominating. I think Mahlaule has spoken about that.

At a risk of messing it up, we just want to say again that the 1955 Kliptown gathering came with a purpose of a non-racial

South Africa, democratic, united and prosperous. It was an intention of a cohesive South Africa. In other words, the elements of the new mission became the dictates of the new purpose. With this in his mind, Chief Albert Luthuli had this to say, I quote:

But I personally believe that here in South Africa, with all our diversities of colour and race, we will show the world a new pattern for democracy. I think there is a challenge to us in South Africa to set a new example for the world.

Listen to this ...

Let us not side-step that task.

In other words, Chief Albert Luthuli, one of the finest brains ANC has ever produced, refused to be a victim of apartheid. He despised it and never gave it honour. As a result, he opted for leadership of South Africa out of apartheid.

It is no surprise, therefore, that after a period of years the warring forces in the country came to realise that they are

inevitably bound together thus negotiations began, and dialogue became the founding platform of this great nation.

Now, the opposing forces agreed on a common platform for coexistence, which is our Constitution, towards a cohesive society which I have already spoken about. Against this greatest achievement of the humankind, Nelson Mandela said this:

We enter into a covenant that we shall build the society in which all South Africans, both black and white, will be able to walk tall, without any fear in their hearts, assured of their inalienable right to human dignity - a rainbow nation at peace with itself ...

What I am trying to say here is that that is why then our preamble says:

We as South Africans freely having elected our representatives, commit to heal the divisions of the past, lay the foundation for democratic and open society in which government is based in the will of the people and every citizen is equally protected by the law.

The point I am trying to make here is that this commitment cannot be shared in leadership with fascist. This commitment cannot be shared in leadership with right wingers. This is a commitment of the progressive forces. [Applause.]

The problem with dictators and anarchists is that they thrive in an environment with noise, because where there is noise there is no clarity and the absence of clarity creates grey areas around who they are, which member Mahlaule explained.

All I want to say here is that it is critical that we worry about a future of a cohesive South Africa especially if you look at the summation of the results of the research institutions. In 2019 the South African Human Rights Commission highlighted that most of the reports received were race related.

The commission said that majority of complaints, 38%, were related to the allegation of racial discrimination against black South Africans in areas of Gauteng, Western Cape 15% and KwaZulu-Natal 14%.

The Foundation for Human Rights conducted a baseline survey which indicated that 44% of adults had no trust in people of

other race groups while 45% felt they had been discriminated against based on race.

The South African Institute of Race Relations commissioned a poll through Victory Research to establish how south Africans view race relations. Overall the survey revealed that racial goodwill remains strong. This is a significant and a very positive outcome.

What are the factors undermining cohesion? The average income of white South African is 444 000 while blacks is just under

93 000. Black South Africans earn less than national average and over 70% of their income is salary based. The facts on blacks tell a story of the nature of impact when blacks lose jobs and the kind of impact it has. If you look it from an intergenerational perspective it spells disaster going forward.

What are the foundations of a cohesive society? Clear minded leadership that is committed to our Constitution which is our people’s covenant — a key anchor for the nation of their dreams and leaders that spend most of their time on the essence of nation building and not its incidentals.

In my view, the issue that occurred here yesterday around a member who made a misstep ... called Mr de Klerk ... The nature of the Constitution we have adopted makes us execute management of our differences and not exclusion of those who differ with us. That is the principle of this Constitution. Therefore, to us as the movement, the fat that Mr de Klerk made a misguided statement cannot translate in us stopping him from coming to Parliament because for us to be able to talk to him and change him we must keep in touch with him.

But let me come to some other few issues. The problem is that if there is one thing that the DA masters is the untruth. I just want to say to Lewis, with all his energy, hon Lewis, you made statements that you cannot confirm on the spectrum.

We just want to restate for the sake of South Africans that policy has been finalised and gazetted on the spectrum; Independent Communications Authority of South Africa, ICASA, has issued info on the licensing process; a new energy plan has been gazetted setting out a plan for the next 10 years providing certainty. Those are facts and not alternative facts.

Policy has been finalised of the separation of Eskom’s operations into generation, transmission and distribution. All these things have happened.

On the EFF, again here is another falsification. In Tshwane, EFF as a matter of fact was in coalition with you. In Johannesburg EFF was in coalition with you and that is the only way Herman Mashaba became a mayor. You always told people that where you govern governance is better. Your track record in Johannesburg will show the following: the service delivery in Johannesburg to the people of Johannesburg became worse during your time. [Interjections.] The financial ratios, because numbers don’t lie, were worse during your time; and reserves were worse during your time.

But because you are committed to falsification you continue to do this. In George last year, hon Minister Nzimande is here, you misled South Africans that you are putting a BRT there. We went to see what a farce that was there. That thing was meant for exclusively whites and messing up with the black people not offering access to mobility. We inspected it and we called Mr Grant and he agreed that it was wrong. It is against you telling us that where you rule as DA things are better. I want to say to Mr Groenewald ...

The SPEAKER: Please round up.

Mr M GUNGUBELE: Mr Groenewald says the inefficiency of black empowerment has something to do with blackness. Because it is black then it is inefficient. It makes Mr Groenewald a bad representative of Afrikaners going forward. [Time expired.] [Applause.]

The Speaker of the National Assembly adjourned the Joint Sitting at 19:58.