

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 1

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

PROCEEDINGS OF THE NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

The House met at 14:00.

House Chairperson Ms A T Didiza took the Chair and requested members to observe a moment of silence for prayer or meditation.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): I am sorry if you didn't have enough time to pray or meditate. I will do better next time. I will now ask the Secretary to read the First Order, which is a motion in the name of the Chief Whip of the Majority Party. The hon the Chief Whip of the Majority Party?

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: House Chair, we would like to plead with all the parties in the room, in this august House, to please agree to this draft resolution. We know that with the pressures that all of us are faced with there are

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 2

certain things we need to do and do urgently. One of those is what we are putting before this House.

**SUSPENSION OF RULE 290(2) (a) FOR PURPOSE OF CONDUCTING SECOND
READING DEBATE ON DIVISION OF REVENUE AMENDMENT BILL**

(Draft Resolution)

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: House Chairperson, I move the draft resolution printed in my name on the Order Paper, as follows:

That the House suspends Rule 290(2) (a), which provides *inter alia* that the debate on the Second Reading of a Bill may not commence before at least three working days have elapsed since the committee's report was tabled, for the purpose of conducting the Second Reading debate today on the Division of Revenue Amendment Bill.

Question put: That the motion moved by the Chief Whip of the Majority Party be agreed to.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 3

Division demanded.

The House divided.

[TAKE IN FROM MINUTES]

Question agreed to.

Motion accordingly agreed to.

DIVISION OF REVENUE AMENDMENT BILL

(Consideration of Report)

There was no debate.

The Chief Whip of the Majority Party moved: That the Report be adopted.

Question put: That the motion moved by the Chief Whip of the Majority Party be agreed to.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 4

Division demanded.

The House divided.

[TAKE IN FROM MINUTES]

Motion agreed to.

Report accordingly adopted.

DIVISION OF REVENUE AMENDMENT BILL

(Second Reading debate)

Ms Y N PHOSA: Hon Chairperson, hon Minister of Finance, hon Ministers and Deputy Ministers, hon members, distinguished guests, ladies and gentlemen, fellow South Africans, comrades and friends, the ANC supports the Bill. The ANC is committed to transposing the collective National Development Goals to growing the economy, overcoming poverty, unemployment and inequality.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 5

The Minister has said that South Africa is at crossroads. He is right, we are standing at crossroads. Never before, since the dawn of democracy have we been faced with so many important matters that need to be addressed to ensure a safe transition to a stable nation building and prospering South African economy. The committee supports the view that we will need to make profoundly different decisions about government spending on goods and services going forward.

The Money Bills Amendment Procedure and Related Matters Act, 2009 (hereinafter referred to as the Money Bills Act) section 12(4) requires the Minister of Finance to table a Division of Revenue Amendment Bill, with a revised fiscal framework, if the adjustment budget effects changes to the Division of Revenue Act of 2018 (hereinafter referred to as the Division of Revenue Act), for the relevant financial year. Since the adjustment budget for 2018-19, indeed effects changes to the Division of Revenue Act, signed by the President on 1 June 2018. It was necessary for the Division of Revenue Amendment Bill 2018 to be tabled within the revised fiscal framework which complies with the constitutional requirements as well.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 6

The Minister tabled the 2018 Division of Revenue Amendment Bill on 24 October 2018, barely 14 days after being sworn in on 9 October 2018. This was necessary due to the proposed national adjustment budget for 2018-19 which affects the division of revenue between the three spheres of government.

The committee would like to thank the Minister of Finance and the National Treasury for the transparent budget process as detailed in the documents, annexure and explanatory memorandums, as well as the broad consultation undertaken. The Minister's budget is also futuristic as illustrated by the three scenarios around the medium-term baseline economic forecast to quantify macroeconomic and fiscal risks and to test the resilience of the fiscal position to unforeseen economic developments, being: Scenario A – sluggish domestic growth which widens the primary deficit. Scenario B – contagion from a developing economy debt and currency crisis in which the primary deficit widens even further. Scenario C – stronger domestic growth which causes the primary deficit to narrow gradually over the medium term.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 7

The Minister's response to the rising debt to the GDP is that it must be reduced; the emphasis is on must, moving from the assumption that if government does not announce new spending plans, the debt will stabilise at 59,6% in 2023-24.

Furthermore, with regard to the intergovernmental debt, we support the interventions put in place by the National Treasury to resolve the intergovernmental verified debts, for example, the allocation of R100 million to resolve ownership of buildings and register them correctly on the deeds registry in the two outer years, each by R50 million. The committee will closely monitor the full implementation and compliance in this regard.

Well, the financial implications to government are limited to the total transfers to provinces and local government. The main budget allocation in 2018-19 of R1,5 billion has been revised downwards by R564 million to R1,511 billion to the national sphere of government of which the adjustment provide for the unforeseen and unavoidable expenditure.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 8

To this end, it is imperative that we note the 2018-19 Division of Revenue Amendment Bill and the Division of Revenue in the Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement, herein referred to as MTBPS, was formulated in an economic environment characterised by global economic conditions that are currently not good for emerging countries like our South Africa, Democratic Republic of Congo, Venezuela and others. The economic environment is also characterised by low growth, increased level of unemployment and inequality, technical recession, volatile exchange rate, as well as increased number of people living below the poverty line.

The harsh reality is that when the economy has taken a low growth countercyclical policy must drive government initiatives to stimulate economic growth. The DA must listen to this one carefully. [Interjections.] This has been the status quo for time immemorial. So, you must not come here and make a big mountain out of molehill. So, under the leadership of Pharaoh in Egypt where there was seven years of famine, a counter cyclical intervention saw Egypt turning into seven years of prosperity. If you want to read further on this one, please read Genesis 41.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 9

Indeed, the ANC government has been deeply engaged with the difficult economic environment and has provided appropriate responses to unlock inclusive growth and economic transformation. We support His Excellency, the President of the Republic of South Africa's efforts to lift the economy, which includes hosting the job summit, the investments summit and the R50 billion economic stimulus and recovery plan.

We commend the Minister who, even during difficult budgetary constraints found a way to restructure the budget and reallocated R50 billion of public spending to fund His Excellency, the President's policy reform package in order to further boost the economy and create sustainable employment.

With the R15,9 billion of the R50 billion allocated towards infrastructure development programmes, support for industrialisation and the EPWP. Confidence in the partnership between government, business and labour should improve. I am sure you can see that we are on an economic growth path.

Despite the difficult economy, the spending ceiling continues to prioritise social spending on education, which is 15% of

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 10

the GDP, health is 12% of the GDP and social grants is 12% of the GDP. The expenditure on these priorities keeps increasing, which confirms that this budget is a pro-poor budget. The ANC government cares. We have to improve spending efficiency, corruption free government, improved government capacity with investment in human capital, ultimately towards improved governance and financial management. So, we already have a way forward on how we are going to best improve.

We compliment the National Treasury for the increased investment in infrastructure development, as illustrated by the additional R1 billion for indirect Water Services Infrastructure Grant for water supply augmentation projects in drought affected municipalities.

A provisional allocation of R6 billion for drought relief and to augment public infrastructure investment, a total of R3,4 billion in drought response allocated in all three spheres of government; R33 million added to the public transport network grant; R184 million for substance abuse treatment and R800 million for school infrastructure backlogs.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 11

The committee's concern regarding the R800 million for school infrastructure backlog is that, whilst it is a good programme, its performance has been questionable since its inception in 2011. There is a compelling need for close monitoring and evaluation of its implementation towards good progress.

Minister's response to the rising debt to the GDP is that it must be reduced and emphasised, moving from the assumption that indeed if government does not announce new spending plans, the debt will stabilise at ...

Furthermore, with regard to the intergovernmental debt, we support the interventions in place. We also thank the National Treasury for resolving the intergovernmental verified debts.

As I close, there is enthusiasm, listen carefully, and optimism for economic reforms introduced by the ANC-led government under the leadership of His Excellency, the President. An economist in the *Business Day* of 9 November says that South Africa's technical recession is likely to be over in the third quarter due to the 17% growth in the manufacturing sector in the third quarter, a sign that the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 12

economy is growing again. Please, note that, a good ground for optimism.

Working together, with even you DA by choosing hope over despair, we can all, regardless of colour, race or creed, contribute to a stable and prospering South African economy.

Finally, our collective thanks to committee are due to the Parliamentary Budget Office, the Financial and Fiscal Commission, FFC, Prof Daniel Plaatjies for the critical advices you always give us, as well as the SA Local Government Association and Human Sciences Research Council. I also would like to thanks the support staff for helping us.

By working together, by choosing hope over despair, Mr Maynier, we can all contribute to a stable and prospering South Africa that is a proud of staff member of the international community. The ANC supports the Bill. I thank you. [Time expired.] [Applause.]

Mr M WATERS: House Chairperson, on a point of order, I see the Minister is going to respond to the debates, yet for the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 13

Revised Fiscal Framework he wasn't here, for question he wasn't here, and he is not in the House currently. Is it because the Minister agrees more with the DA's economic policy than that of the ANC, that the ANC is keeping him away?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order, hon member, can you take your seat? The Deputy Minister of Finance is here, and I think there are issues you can raise it with the Chief Whip in relation to the Minister's presence in the House.

Mr D J MAYNIER: House Chairperson, the new Minister of Finance, Tito Mboweni is in hot political water, not only for his erratic views on South African Airways but also for a bizarre meltdown on Twitter, which probably explains his prolonged absence from this Parliament. The Minister comes across as a sophisticated version of Donald Trump, sitting back consuming good food, good wine and good cigars, ready to post the first thing no matter how bizarre that comes to mind on Twitter.

Last week, the Minister posted a series of bizarre late night tweets, calling for war on editors and complaining about being

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 14

stabbed in the back. After what must have been a humiliating smack down, following his call to close down South African Airways. The tweets are so bizarre that they merit asking the Minister, who has a reputation for consuming vast quantities of good food, good wine and good cigars, whether he was sizzled at the time he took to Twitter and declared war on the media.

It is simply not good enough for the Minister who is now in damage control mode to assure us and I quote "that there really is nothing to worry about". [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order! Order, hon Maynier, can you take your seat. What is the point of order, hon member?

Ms T V TOBIAS: House Chairperson, on a point of order, does the hon Maynier have a speech for the Division of Revenue?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order! Hon member, the member has a speech. Can you please proceed.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 15

Mr D J MAYNIER: House Chairperson, it is clear; we now see why that hon member thinks that when the Governor of the Reserve Bank meets with the Monetary Policy Committee, that he is actually setting the inflation rate not the interest rate. As I was saying, what we need is for the Minister to get a grip and to start acting like a finance Minister and he could start by apologising for his attack on the media.

Chairperson, we are now here to debate the Division of Revenue Amendment Bill. What is important about the Bill is that no increases have been made to the provincial equitable share, to fund the above inflation public sector wage agreements. This means that provinces must now fork out billions of rands to fund the agreement, which over the medium-term, we think will cost the Eastern Cape R2,6 billion and the Western Cape about R1,7 billion.

The trade unions who negotiated the above inflation public sector wage agreement, which they knew it had not been budgeted for; which they knew we could not afford and which they knew would compromised service delivery in the provinces

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 16

was immoral and proves the trade unions are in fact the enemies of the poor in South Africa. Thank you. [Applause.]

Mr T RAWULA: House Chairperson, the Division of Revenue Bill is a piece of legislation that takes the revenue which was collected nationally and divide it between spheres of government, national provincial and local government. The Division of Revenue Bill is an important piece of legislation that must be framed as a developmental budget. A budget that must prioritise building internal state capacity and invest in local manufacturing processes to unlock growth.

During the last question and answer session with President Cyril Ramaphosa, we agreed in principle that the Division of Revenue Bill in its current form is incapable of solving current development challenges, especially in local government. In the past four years, we took the responsibility to demonstrate to the house and public that municipalities all over the world are central to investment which has led to growing investment infrastructure, construction of roads, houses, water, water pipes, sanitation and recreational facilities.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 17

In Germany municipal investment is the largest investment that leads to job creation in infrastructure development. When China construction bank, open a bank in Zurich, Switzerland more 80% of all R614 billion invested went to the local government for job creation infrastructure project. It has been a trend all over the world, including in Europe except in South Africa. Where such an important sphere of government has been collapse and reduced to a sight looting municipal resources.

We cannot continue to allocate just mere 9% of revenue collected nationally to local government and expect local government to prioritise buying local products, invest in local talents. Local government cannot raise revenue, invest in infrastructure and equally invest in productive sectors, with high level of unemployment. Half of the population living in these municipalities are poor, 17 million people depended on grant and the tax base at the national level is shrinking, as all forms of taxes continue to increase in an economy that is not growing.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 18

We must change the Division of Revenue into instrument to promote a developmental budget that must prioritise local government. In this way municipalities will be able to work with co-operatives banks and mutual banks to transform localise and grow workers-led economy with greater participation of black people. This we can not achieve as long as government including state-owned entities continue to rely on outsources even the most basic function.

Municipalities outsource cleaning, garden maintenance, construction and other major services, only to be charged inflated prices by suppliers and service providers. The whole of Eskom has no internal capacity, everything including maintenance of some of the most strategic stations is outsourced to private sector, which leads to inflated prices and makes impossible for municipalities to afford electricity. We must abolish tendering and build strong internal capacity across all spheres, including state-owned entities.

It is not a Division of Revenue Bill as it stands, if anything it can only be described as a legislation to consolidate and

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 19

reinforce apartheid special planning. The EFF rejects the Division of the Revenue Bill.

Mr M HLENGWA: House Chairperson, when hon Phosa was referring everybody to Genesis, I wanted to refer her and the ANC, to Exodus 20:15 - You shall not steal. Indeed South Africa is at the cross road and, of course, if we continue on the current trajectory of the ANC's policies, which have landed us in this mess of higher employment, poor economic growth, high corruption, then we are bound to be in a far worst situation. Therefore, we need to rid ourselves of the ANC, if we want to rid ourselves of the problems that we face.

South African Airways, SAA receiving a bail out of R5 billion on top of R15 billion, this does not make sense. It amounts to nothing more being egotistic expenditure, which existed as an island of ensuring that the ANC is happy but, in sea of poverty, where our people do not have jobs.

We got the highest number of foreign missions in the world, a bloated Cabinet; this just speaks to irrational expenditure. South African Airways generates R31 billion every year but

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 20

their expenditure is R33 billion. These are people who certainly do not have their ducks in a row, because they know that at every turn the ANC is going bail them out.

The bottom line is that we need to sell SAA, and the Minister of Finance needs to be supported in that regards, because the question is who is travelling on SAA. You are spending billions and billions of rands, year in and year out for the travelling of the elite. Yet poor investment is made for the travelling of the majority of our people who rely on a proper roads and infrastructure; who relies on a functional railways infrastructure, and yet there is no investments made in that regard. For how long must we be bailing out SAA, but then yet again, the ANC is all about egotistic spending.

The bottom line is that all development is local and for so long as the budget does not respond to the collective needs aspirations of majority of our municipality in this country, then we are wasting and wasting money. We are spending too much money on national government and we are not spending enough money on municipalities who are in disparate need of

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 21

ensuring that they create and beneficiate they local economy, so that they create jobs.

How can you built economy top-down, it should be a bottom-up approach. Therefore, for so long as we have this kind of situation, we are not going to come out of problems that we have. The lack of oversight, accountability and consequence management in provinces, is precisely the reason why ANC-led provinces like the North West has collapsed, Limpopo at some point also collapsed, requiring the intervention of national government.

This speaks to a lack of capacity, it speaks to a lack of political will but most importantly, it speaks to wasteful, fruitless and irregular expenditure at the expense and the back of the poor majority our people, whilst may support this Division of Revenue Amendment, Dora, for so long as system are as they are, it is waste time. Thank you.

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Hon Chairperson, the NFP welcomes the report of the Standing Committee on Appropriations on the 2018 Division of Revenue Amendment Bill tabled here today. The Bill

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 22

in its current form seeks to address changes or adjustments in the equitable division of nationally raised revenue among the spheres of government.

On adjustments to provincial and local government, here the NFP wants to emphasise that we believe that not enough resources go to local government. Local government is the heartbeat of service delivery and we believe that in future we need to look very seriously in increasing allocations to the provincial structure.

Hon Chairperson, my colleagues did everything in their power to sabotage this entire process. They walked out of a meeting last night. They walked out today. They called for a division. They called for another division. Yet, they forget - very importantly - a whole lot of allocations that are made here today go towards the Western Cape, particularly, as a result of the Western Cape and their corruption in the water crisis that exist in the Western Cape.

Despite that, they still want to come here and oppose this. If you read and look at the allocation that year, in all

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 23

different aspects - you've got water, rehabilitation of schools, housing and water crisis that they created - yet they want come here to oppose this Bill. Really, I am not sure what their plan of action is or what it is that they want because this is supposed to be in the interest of the poorest of the poor.

One thing is very clear though, that the DA does not cater for the poorest of the poor. They cater only for the elite, so it does not matter to them if they have to oppose the [Inaudible.] that is [Inaudible.] to them. [Applause.] So really, it is very disappointing that on the one hand we say let's work together in the interest of the people but then you want to oppose everything - every possible thing - that we could do try and make a difference in the lives of our people.

I mean, R800 million has been allocated to the School Infrastructure Backlogs Grant. Now, we know for a fact that, particularly in schools, there have been serious challenges in the implementation of these infrastructure projects. The Accelerated Schools Infrastructure Delivery Initiative, the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 24

Asidi programme, particularly in the Eastern Cape is not very effective and we call ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order, hon members! Can you please lessen your voices; you are drowning the speaker on the podium?

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: We call on the department, together with Standing Committee in Appropriations and the relevant departments to ensure that there is greater oversight so that the monies that are allocated and projects that are planned are implemented accordingly and timorously. The NFP also notes the infrastructure grants relevant to provincial departments.

Now, let me also have it that the capacity in the Department of Water and Sanitation must be addressed. Allocations are not the solution to the problem, unless you put capacity and they perform effectively. The NFP will support the report on Division of Revenue Amendment Bill, the Dora Bill, today.

[Time expired.] Thank you. [Applause.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 25

Mr N L S KWANKWA: Hon House Chair, the UDM supports the Bill and the report of committee. In 2013, when I became a Member of Parliament, the first thing I raised was the 9% that is being allocated on an annual basis to municipalities. I highlighted in particular on behalf of the UDM, the fact that this 9% is hopelessly inadequate if you look at the fact municipalities are at the coalface of service delivery.

Not only that: You have a number of municipalities that have limited revenue raising capacity but they are expected to perform miracles with the little bit that they get from government. In reality, South Africa should have a budget that seeks to build a progressive society that uplifts the poor, alleviates poverty, and creates jobs.

Due to the ANC-led government's cavalier attitude to fiscal rectitude over the years, which has caused South Africa to slide towards the African countries that are facing high dead risk, this is not possible. To put this in perspective: If people do not understand the implications of high dead risk is that if we continue with substantial borrowing there will soon come a time when South Africa will have to borrow to pay off

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 26

her debt. This, my dear friends is how you fall into a debt trap.

The other problem with the South African government and how money is an example that was made earlier about the bail out, for example to SA Airways, where there is no performance and consequence management. Regarding those bail outs in the past, there have been no consequences for those people who squandered state resources which were allocated to the same entities.

So, what happens even now: We give them R5 billion, they squander it; in future we change management, then people come and request for bail outs thereafter. By the way, I have it on good authority that this R5 billion has already been spent by SA Airways even while Parliament is still busy with that process.

We do so however welcome an amount of R100 million which is added to the Human Settlements Development Grant for the repair of over 3 280 subsidised houses damaged by floods in

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 27

KwaZulu-Natal and three houses damaged by fire in Knysna in the Western Cape. We were there recently. While we welcome ...

IsiXhosa:

... Thixo, i-ANC inamaqhinga. Iqale ngokususa ama-R400 ezigidi ngezigidi yemali ibingakhange isebenze ngowama-2017.

English:

It reprioritises it because there is no capacity to spend this money but it rewards that by saying we are going to give you R800 million this year to focus on this issue yezikolo [of the schools] because there are elections next year.

IsiXhosa:

Nizama iindlela zokufumana iivoti. Kodwa ke noba ninjalo, siza kunilungisa emva kolonyulo jikelele.

English:

We support the report and the Bill.

IsiXhosa:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 28

Siyayixhasa ingxelo noMthetho oYilwayo. Ninamaqhinga kwaye ningamaqothaqikile ngesiXhosa.

Mr W W WESSELS: Hon Chairperson, the biggest mystery of the Division of Revenue Amendment Bill is the fact that the ANC-led government is bailing out SA Airways once again but they refuse to bail out the rural economy, the rural economy that is failing because of outstanding debt to municipalities - outstanding debt of municipalities to Eskom, which has increased now to R17 billion outstanding debt.

Outstanding debt to water boards that is at the high of R7,4 billion. The rural economy is suffering. Local businesses are closing down. Unemployment is increasing but the ANC-led government is only interested in bailing out the airways. The harsh reality, hon Phosa, is that we are not on an economic growth path, as you put it; we are on a downward economic spiral with no end to it.

The budget that we are considering is not a pro-poor budget, but rather a budget aimed at keeping the majority of people depended on government and depended on social relief for the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 29

ANC's political power. That is the only reason. The ANC-led government rather spends money on VIP protection than on rural development, on municipalities and on infrastructure. They are more interested in the safety of their Ministers than in the interest of the poor.

The hon Imam and the party whom he is the praise singer of - the ANC - are not interested in the poor. No economic growth, hon Phosa can occur whilst we have ever-increasing unemployment and poverty due to ANC-failed policies, because you cannot create wealth by dividing wealth. There is no way!

The economy should be stimulated, but municipalities, provinces and provincial departments fail and have failed. They are unsustainable. There is no way that economic stimulus package can be implemented by failed municipalities and failed provincial departments. It is impossible!

The ANC-led government is only interested in themselves. If this was a pro-poor budget - if this was a budget aimed at developing - it would address the crisis faced by municipalities in terms of Eskom, because although it is their

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 30

own doing, it should be addressed by issuing financial assistance to those municipalities. [Time expired.] I thank you.

Mr W M MADISHA: Chairperson, this bill comes at a time as pressure mounts on all fronts, inter alia, economically, fiscally and governmentally. The root cause lies squarely with the ruling party. The medium term budget policy statement which informs this amendment bill reveals a weakening fiscal outlook.

1. Worse than expected economic growth and poor moving forward.
2. To a widening of the gap between expenditure and revenue and rising debt.
3. An increasingly unsustainable wage bill.
4. Increasing concern at the financial state of our SOEs and the implications of their debt obligations.
5. Deteriorating state of the financial position of our sub national governments.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 31

We note the public sector wages account for more than half of our provincial budgets and that higher than estimated wage agreement means that our provinces have no alternative but to divert resources from service delivery. We agree Chairperson with the concerns of the financial and fiscal commission regarding: the distressed and dysfunctional nature of far too many municipalities and secondly their deteriorating financial position.

We are, for all intended purpose in an ever expanding crisis and unsustainable position as a nation with little room to move add to this a ruling party at war with itself unable to effect the structural change required to ignite growth and unwilling to take unpopular decisions to reduce recurring government expenditure. This bill nearly rearranges the deck chairs of the titanic. We continue to sink therefore we can't go on and agree with this. Thank you.

THE HOUSE CHAIRPERSON: Order! It's the maiden speech of the hon member.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 32

Mr M S SHACKLETON: House Chair, surely 24 years after the dawn of democracy, the time has come to deliver to all the people...

[Interjections]

THE HOUSE CHAIRPERSON: Order hon members! You know the rule of a maiden speech that we do accommodate the member. Order! Continue hon member. You can start again, and mind your time on your left.

Mr M S SHACKLETON: House Chair, surely 24 years after the dawn of democracy, the time has come to deliver all the people of South Africa. In many of our constituencies we continue to find entire hoods never had running water, basic sanitation or refuse removal. The inefficiency of spending and failure to monitor how spending is being carried out is largely to blame for this crisis. We welcome the fact that government...

[interjections]

THE HOUSE CHAIRPERSON: Order! Can you take your seat?

What's your point of order? Order! Hon Khawula can you get to your point? What' your point of order?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 33

IsiZulu:

Nk M S KHAWULA: Hhawu nkosi yami, anazi ukuthi ngifuna ukuthini. Uxolo, uxolo sithandwa. Bengithi uma ngabe kukhona ofikayo nisitshele ngoba ngiyamsaba ngibona nanentshebe. [Uhleko.] Ngiyabonga.

English:

The House Chairperson: Thank you hon member, this is the new member of the DA named hon Shackleton. Thank you, take your seat. Proceed hon member

Mr M S SHACKLETON: We welcome the fact that government is attempting to strengthen the infrastructure planning by introducing one infrastructure delivery management system and that parliament will apparently now receive quarterly updates on the progress of infrastructure projects. To date there has been no real indication of where the money is going especially in the area of infrastructure spending.

Two large capital projects on the cards in the Western Cape and Limpopo where the monitoring facility put in place by national treasury is that if the expenditure exceeds 10% of

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 34

what was planned it must be reported within 30 days. It is a start and perhaps can be viewed as positive in light of the excessive overspending that this government has taken part in. But, surely monitoring and compliance must be strengthened.

To put things into perspective, 10% over 1 billion rand project is one hundred million rand. National treasury has admitted that they're at the beginning stages of monitoring expenditure on infrastructure projects whilst the parliamentary budget office stated in committee that very little information is available at all to indicate how the budgets on infrastructure has been spent.

Efficiency of spending is exceedingly poor and it's driving the people of our beautiful nation into a perpetual cycle of indignity. It is no wonder then the statistics provided to us in committee show the trust and government declined from 69% in 2004 to 28% in 2017. A total decline of 41%.

All of the work we're doing in this house must be aimed at making the country a better place for future generations. Education takes up the highest proportion of the wage bill

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 35

with little return of value. There are schools and teachers that are doing tremendous work but it is also true that South Africa continues to lack behind other countries in areas of maths proficiency and numerous other areas. Striking teachers affiliated with SADTU have taken too much time away from learners who want to receive an education. We must consistently test the knowledge of teachers to teach and assess the subject that they are paid to teach. We cannot just throw money at certain problems, we need to address the root cause of several issues and accelerate monitoring and compliance. We need to fix our beautiful country.

Basic infrastructure at schools has improved but comprehensive change is still needed. The deaths of learners such as Michael Komape who fell into a pit toilet must never be allowed to be repeated. At this point there are 4624 schools in South Africa using pit toilets and we have to ask ourselves, where is the people's money going?

Government must do better than this. We must raise accountability and ensure that every last cent of the people's money is spent on the people. We know that corruption steals

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 36

from the poor. It steals from the ability of people to have the way with all and dignity and live lives of value. Without the daily struggle, that people without delivery in the community have to face, they can turn to providing for themselves and their families and up skilling themselves and their children. We need to focus on what is important. And, where national DA government officials and politicians found guilty of corruption will face a minimum sentence of 15 years in imprisonment. The government does not seem to be capable of managing the real problems that South Africans face each day. That is the sad reality of this division of Revenue Amendment Bill. We will ensure that people qualify for government housing quickly and get the ability to receive a decent home.

South Africans who earn less than R15 000 a month will be able to sign up for a home voucher scheme in terms of which a R150 000 voucher can be used to build one's own home on a site connected to water and electricity. The voucher can also be used as a deposit towards buying an existing home. An alternative would be to choose to live in one of many high rise apartment buildings close to city centres but will be

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 37

built by a DA government. The coming elections are about the future of all South Africans. We urge South Africans to use their vote ensure a strong DA because only the DA can change and speeds up the delivery of basic services. I thank you.

Ms M N S MANANA: Chairperson, hon Ministers, Deputy Ministers, hon members, let me start off by extending my greetings to all South Africans who entrusted us with the responsibility of representing their interests, hopes and aspirations. Today's debate is an opportunity to identify and support key budgetary interventions that respond to socioeconomic needs of our people.

The Standing Committee on Appropriations has carefully examined the 2018 Division of Revenue Amendment Bill; it warms my heart to report that the proposed adjustment to the 2018 Division of Revenue Act is progressive and pro-poor. The budget continues to prioritise social programmes including education, health, human settlements, water and sanitation and social welfare programmes. It is critical that we highlight these adjustments and interventions in these critical sectors.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 38

On health, a majority of our people depend on public health facilities for their wellbeing. According to the General Household Survey, seven in every ten households use public health facilities rather than private hospitals.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order! [Interjections.]
Hon member, thank you, I have noted you.

Ms M N S MANANA: The survey further show that in a population of over 50 million people, only 16% of South Africans had medical aid cover in 2017. A majority of these households with medical aid are concentrated in the two predominantly urban provinces of Gauteng and the Western Cape. The predominantly rural provinces fall far below this figure with Limpopo having the lowest rate of 8,3% followed by the Eastern Cape and KwaZulu-Natal at 9,9% and 12,6% respectively. This is a direct reflection of a deeply unequal society and it is against this context that we support the following allocations and interventions in the Division of Revenue Bill.

The R199,5 million that is allocated to Kwazulu-Natal to repair 14 hospitals damaged by heavy storms and floods. The

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 39

R42 million that is converted from the National Health Insurance, NHI, indirect grant from the health facility revitalisation component to the direct health facility revitalisation grant for dealing with emergency maintenance backlogs in the Northern Cape. An amount of R154 million is added to the NHI grant, of which R166 million will go towards the procurement of medical equipment as well as the planning and design of the proposed new academic hospital in Limpopo.

The Standing Committee on Appropriations welcomes the introduction of the human resource capacitating component of the NHI indirect grant, of which R350 million will help to address the critical shortage of human resources in the health sector.

We also welcome the beds and laundry services component of the NHI indirect grant as this will ensure that patients do not sleep on the floor due to lack of facilities. In the human settlements sector, the government has done a lot to provide human settlements to our people. The reality is that South Africa has a high rate of urbanisation, hence the growth of informal settlements. According to the General Household

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 40

Survey, 13,6% of South Africans live in informal dwellings. Urbanisation is democracy in action.

The Constitution guarantees all of us freedom of movement, and reminds us that South Africa in its entirety belongs to everyone. Therefore, we applaud the decision to ring-fence funds for upgrading of informal settlements in the Human Settlements Development grants. We also welcome the additional R101 million to the Human Settlements Development grant for the repair of over 3 280 subsidised houses damaged by floods in Kwazulu-Natal and three houses damaged by fire in Knysna in the Western Cape. Under Social Development, the committee welcomes the new Provincial Disaster Recovery Grant with a budget of R16,3 million for responding to the damage caused by heavy storms and floods in KwaZulu-Natal. Of this budget, R11,3 million goes towards repairing 10 buildings managed by the Department of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs and R5 million is for the repairing and rehabilitating 10 buildings managed by the Department of Social Development.

We welcome the additional allocation of R175,8 million to the Education infrastructure Grant to help schools damaged by

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 41

disaster in the KwaZulu-Natal and Western Cape. The committee is pleased that R150 million will help to repair and rehabilitate over 87 schools in KwaZulu-Natal and that the remaining R25,8 million will repair and rehabilitate 22 schools in the Western Cape Province. It is encouraging to learn about improved performance of the Schools Infrastructure Backlogs grant, hence the additional allocation of R800 million for the completion of school infrastructure projects. This allocation is about furnishing our children with good education. We agree with the Minister that our children do not deserve to learn in unsafe schools.

Our President, Cyril Ramaphosa, said:

Both the Minister of Finance and I are keenly aware of the need to demonstrate to the people of South Africa that the tax revenue collected from their hard-earned income is being used wisely, productively and for its intended purpose. We remain accountable to the people of this country.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 42

I wish to close by reminding everyone listening that, the wealthy cannot live in an island surrounded by a sea of poverty. We all breathe the same air and we must give a chance to everyone, at least a basic chance. The ANC supports this Bill. [Applause.]

Mr R A LEES: Hon Chair, it is somewhat distressing to see the Deputy Minister of Finance having to use a crutch as he came in this afternoon. He, obviously, has been sending a lot of tweets, doing damage control and in the process he got himself damaged also. The Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement, MTBPS, clearly warns that the growth of unpaid bills and accruals within the provincial and local governments constitutes a serious fiscal risk. These risks are referred to in the MTBPS as "hidden costs" that are not included in the budget.

National Treasury estimate - in other words their considered thumb suck - that the unpaid bills in provinces amount to R25 billion with a further estimate of R80 billion estimate for contingent liability risks of medical malpractice claims. For municipalities the estimate amounts to R 23,4 billion for outstanding bills. None of these provincial and municipal

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 43

liabilities are included in the determination of the Division of Revenue allocations to provinces and municipalities. What we do know about municipalities is that a 113 municipalities adopted unfunded budgets for 2018-19. For example, 41% of the 278 municipalities openly and without caring about where the money would come from, voted to enter into long-term contracts and to spend more than the revenue available to them. What this means is that municipalities simply spend billions of rand excessively on vanity projects and other wasteful expenditure and land up not having the money; to pay suppliers such as Eskom. To provide water to millions of South Africans who have to make do with water from rivers, dams or sporadic tanker deliveries. To provide refuse services, to fix potholes and to even stop raw sewerage from flowing into our rivers.

These zombie ANC-run municipalities are knowingly bankrupting themselves and the poor who are unfortunate enough to live under their financial tyranny. Ultimately if unchecked they will bankrupt South Africa. It is not a shortage of equitable share that has brought municipalities to their knees; it is simply incompetent and corrupt ANC councillors and the appointed officials. Thank you Mr Chairperson. [Applause.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 44

Mr N E GCWABAZA: Hon House Chairperson, hon Ministers and Deputy Ministers, hon members, let me point out up front that the Minister of Finance is not in hot water in the ANC. He is a respected and disciplined member of the ANC who expresses his views which is allowed openly in the ANC. And he will be guided by the positions of the ANC, not only on South African Airways, SAA, but on various issues around the state-owned enterprises.

Secondly, to the DA, mind your house! Perhaps, the DA has blocked the development of social housing and commercial development projects in the inner city particularly in Woodstock and Salt River; a development that would have provided housing and access to economic activities of black people particularly, Africans and Indians closer to the places of economic activity.

The DA caucus leader Mr Smith is reportedly to have said, when they this matter at their caucus "transformation raises alarm bells". That is what transformation means for the DA. Mind your house. You have no interest in the affairs of black people.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 45

I must also point out that the ANC supports the Wage Bill entered into in the public sector central bargaining council between government and the public sector unions and we will support its full implementation.

The ANC having considered the equitable share of nationally collected revenue for the national, provincial and local governments which is detailed in the Division of Revenue Amendment Bill 2018 supports the Bill. The ANC acknowledges that the reduced equitable share between the three spheres of government and especially the reduction in their allocated conditional grants are occasioned by the narrow fiscal space which is caused by lowered than expected tax collection and the lowered and projected GDP growth.

The ANC supports fiscal consolidation whose aim is to reduce the high national debt to GDP ratio and to open space for greater investment spending. The ANC notes with concern the report of the Auditor-General for 2017-18 financial year, which states that irregular, wasteful, and unauthorised expenditure has again rises from R757 million in the 2016-17 financial year to R22,45 billion in the current financial

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 46

year; and calls upon government to take decisive action in order to reverse this trend. Irregular, wasteful and unauthorised expenditure including unspent funds which are then returned to the National Treasury deprive the community of much needed water, sanitation, electricity and roads infrastructure and threatens the ANC strategic goal of a better life for all as expressed in the National Development Plan.

Notwithstanding the fiscal and economic challenges we, the ANC believe that the Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement and the Division of Revenue Amendment Bill 2018, do present a golden opportunity for turning upwards the country's economic growth through the R50 billion stimulus package, the R400 billion infrastructure fund that were announced by his Excellency President Cyril Ramaphosa and the Investment Summit and the Job Summit convened by him.

This amendment Bill allocates R121,8 billion equitable share to local government. Included in this amount is R12,5 billion general fuel levy which is shared between the eight metropolitan municipalities and R46,6 billion conditional

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 47

grant for infrastructure development. During the next three financial years 2019-20 to 2021-22 local government allocations will amount to R415,5 billion. Although allocations to local government will decline by 0,7% in 2019-20, the local government equitable share remains protected as it funds the delivery of basic services to communities. The increase of the local government equitable share above inflation over The Medium-Term Expenditure Framework, MTEF, takes into account the population growth, the need to provide bulk water infrastructure and the electricity costs.

The Division of Revenue Amendment Bill 2018, projects growth of Local Government Conditional Grant to R143,3 billion over the three financial years 2019 to 2022. Conditional grants are located to local governments are targeted at bulk infrastructure development which underpins the delivery of water, sanitation and electricity not only to communities but also to businesses.

The supports the allocations of funds for capacity-building, in municipalities, and for stabilising institutional and governance systems. The ANC supports also the allocation of

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 48

the infrastructure skills development fund, which will be used to recruit and train unemployment graduates for suitable jobs in the municipalities.

IsiZulu:

Yebo, abafowethu no dadewethu abangaqashiwe kodwa abaneziqo, bazoqashwa ngoMasipala ngoba ikhona imali efakwe yi-ANC.

English:

The ANC further supports the Local Government Management Grant to improve financial management and build capacity to implement the Municipal Finance Management Act. It considers important the allocation of a Municipal Restructuring Grant aimed to assist those municipalities in financial distress and to enable them to be financially sustainable ...

[Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon Gcwabaza, would you just take your seat and let me take this point of order. Why are you rising hon member?

Ms M S KHAWULA: Ey, thank you very much, Chairperson.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 49

IsiZulu:

Ave ngilihlonipha ilunga elihloniphekile uGcwabaza, kodwa lento ayishoyo ayikho, kanti naye wazi kahle ukuthi ayikho nje leyonto. Abantu bafundile kodwa abasebenzi. Udlalelani ngabantu ugqoke isudi no thayi. Hhayi!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Please take your seat, that is not a point of order. Continue hon Gcwabaza.

IsiZulu:

Mr N E GCWABAZA: ... hhayi, abafowethu nodadewethu be EFF ngathi baxakekile. Bama lana bathi banikeza abantu umhlaba ukuze abantu bazakhele imizi, zolo loku kade beziveza njengabantu abaxhasa imfundo yamahhala kodwa mihla namalanga bama la-ngaphambili bathi "we reject we reject". Uma I-ANC iphakamisa isabelomali ukuze kufezekiswe zonke lezinto enithi niyaziqhuba nina.

English:

You are confused. The ANC supports as well the Expanded Public Works Programme Grant ... [Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 50

Ms N V MENTE: Point of Order!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon Gcwabaza, will you take your seat please. Why are you rising hon member?

Ms N V MENTE: The member on the podium must stop misleading the country and he must withdraw what he just said that we are confused. We are not confused.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): It's a point of debate hon member. Continue hon Gcwabaza.

Ms N V MENTE: No he must withdraw that, we are not confused.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): There is nothing to withdraw.

Ms N V MENTE: We cannot be told by stupid people that we are confused.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon member take your seat now.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 51

Mr N E GCWABAZA: ... the ANC supports as well the Expanded Public Works Programme Integrated Grant which targets the expansion of work creation in social and economic infrastructure maintenance social, services, and community services ... [Interjections.]

Mr P D N MALOYI: I rise on a point of order. The hon member from the EFF says, by implication, comrade Gcwabaza is a stupid person. We want her to withdraw the stupid part of it.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): That is not a point of order please take your seat. Why are you rising hon member?

Mr T RAWULA: I rise on a point of order, he is misleading the nation. He is saying that we are rejecting it - we are rejecting the 9% allocation to local government. Don't go around saying that we are rejecting - 9% is little. About 17 million of our people are unemployed.

Mr N E GCWABAZA: In addition, the ANC welcomes the introduction of new local government conditional grant; namely, the Integrated Urban Development Grant for

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 52

intermediate cities, which allows them flexibility in their funding of infrastructure development. The ANC expects that municipalities will benefit directly from the R400 billion infrastructure fund which was announced by President Ramaphosa.

To the FF Plus, stop defending the 87% white-ownership of land and support the expropriation of land without compensation so that rural economy will grow faster than it does now. The ANC supports the Bill. I thank you hon Chairperson.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF FINANCE: Thank you, hon Chairperson.

[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Where is the Minister? [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: What have you done with him?

An HON MEMBER: Disappeared.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF FINANCE: Every budget is a balancing act. This one is no different.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 53

An HON MEMBER: Is he sending his notes to you?

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF FINANCE: We just want to restate the principles that ... the adjustment budget is always based on those principles which have stood the test of time – the principles of unforeseeability, avoidability and the pronouncement made by the Minister in February during the Budget statement. Those are the principles on which this has been done, and in doing so, there are three key areas that we focus on.

Firstly, we understand the fiscal challenges that the country is going through. That's why we want to restate that in this budget ... the issue of ... budget ceiling ... we stay put and consistent with it, and stay and ensure that no-one moves out of it. That is our commitment. We stay committed to ensuring that the budget deficit does decrease over time. Those are the key principles. We stay committed that the framework for the transformation and policy transition of state-owned enterprises stays on course. We stay committed to the fact that we engage on how to deal with the issue of the wage bill.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 54

All those principles are the principles that we are actually adhering to and we have no intention to deviate from them.

The second element is that this budget seeks to respond to a number of key issues that affect our people. Amongst others is the effect of the drought relief, where three billion has been allocated through this Bill. The other one is ensuring that schools are repaired, and hospitals, provincial buildings, municipal infrastructure and a number of other related issues are attended to. It also ensures that 350 million is being used as a reprioritising fund to hire much-needed medical specialists for the public health system. It also ensures that 150 million is reprioritised for the provision of new beds and so on. A total of 800 million is added for the accelerated roll out of school infrastructure backlogs.

We do want to say ... I heard an hon member saying we do nothing about rural areas. I just want to say that if you analyse this budget, provided you are lucky enough to have the basics of Mathematics, you will understand that we have allocated twice as much to rural municipalities as compared to metros. The figures speak for themselves.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 55

I do understand the problems of the opposition parties. I'm trying to imagine if I were to stand here towards next year, contesting the ANC. ... an ANC that responds in the manner it does during economic challenges; allocates ... reprioritises 50 billion to ensure that the township economy comes back to life; makes sure that no less than 16 billion, a transaction being done by the Land Bank in a joint effort with other banks ... to ensure that black farming actually comes back to life; ensures that you allocate so much to the SA National Roads Agency Limited, Sanral, so that it stays afloat; responds in this manner by ensuring that you are in partnership with various institutions which have responded very positively by the way, to actually take a new approach in ensuring that South Africa is a construction site; calls a job summit with such a positive response; and calls an investor summit with such a positive response. If that is the party I wanted to remove from power I would be worried.

So, we are not confused that you are panicking in the manner that you do because you realise that it's too early for you to take over this main line. So I'm not ... I just wanted ...

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 56

The third issue is also to look at ensuring that we improve governance in the local authority. One of the things we have observed is that during interventions, be it section 100, we have not been doing well. We think we need resources to improve our interventions ... [Interjections.] ... in as far as that is concerned.

Well, I wouldn't worry with other parties that ... For instance, if I start with our party on my left, I think ... For instance, one of the allocations here is hugely going to the disaster consequences of the Cape province; also to public transport of this province. But this party, the DA, is not interested in that because it is a party of the elite. Here are the characteristics of the elite. One, the elite have access roads. They have lights, unlike Marikana in the black area. The elite have access roads, unlike Makhaza in the disadvantaged area in Cape Town. The elite have lights, unlike Sigalo in the Cape area. The elite have flushing toilets, unlike one toilet to five families in Khayelitsha.

[Interjections.] The elite have flushing ... You can go on and ... So, we don't expect you to represent the people of Cape Town, especially those who are historically disadvantaged

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 57

because that has never been your constituency anyway.

[Applause.]

So your case is clear. That's why Maynier stands here and says nothing about revenue. Instead, he has become a poet for our Minister, and I think we must actually retain and fund him for that purpose because I think he does it very well. He has forgotten the purpose of standing at this podium. So we shouldn't blame him.

To my learned friends here who are red, I think sometimes I sympathise. I sympathise with a party ... Irrespective of the opportunity to take control and run a government, you run away from it. The reason why you run away from it is because you know that you can't even run a spaza shop. That's why you don't want to run any government. Instead you use your numbers to give to other parties that, when it is convenient ...

[Interjections.]

IsiZulu:

Nk M S KHAWULA: Sihlalo, nginephuzu lokukhalima okuphambukayo.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 58

English:

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon Deputy Minister, will you just sit down please. What is the point of order, hon member?

IsiZulu:

Nk M S KHAWULA: Yazi nginenkinga kaNgqongqoshe, uNgqongqoshe kuyimanje umi laphaya uzokhuluma into ayazi kahle ukuthi ayikho lento ayishoyo. Lento athi thina usizwela ngayo, usizwela ngani? Thina singenza kangcono thina. Nina vele nihlulekile ...

English:

Nk M S KHAWULA: ... dismally.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon member that is not a point of order.

IsiZulu:

Nk M S KHAWULA: Abantu laba abasemakhaya anibazi nokuthi bakhona.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 59

English:

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon member that is not a point of order. I will switch off your microphone now. Continue hon Deputy Minister.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF FINANCE: Mama, you had a lovely opportunity to run either Johannesburg or Tshwane. You ran away from both of those because you know you don't have the capacity to do so. You have more capacity to stand in the street and scream. {Interjections.}

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon Deputy Minister, will you just take a seat please. {Interjections.} Why are you rising hon member?

IsiXhosa:

Mnu T. RAWULA: Ubaw' uGungubule makangaxokiseli abantu. Akukho bantu babevotele i-EFF ukuba iphathe koomasipala. Abantu abakasiniki elo gunya. Asisayi kuthatha amandla okuphatha oomasipala ngobuqhinga.

English:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 60

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon member that is not a point of order.

IsiXhosa:

Mnu T RAWULA: Thina kaloku asinakujikela emva kwendlu sixuthe ulawulo sibuye sesinamandla okuphatha.

English:

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Please take your seat, hon member.

Mr T RAWULA: We have not been voted into power in any municipality. Don't mislead us.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): I'm switching off your microphone. Take your seat. Continue hon member.

Ms Z S DLAMINI-DUBAZANA: Hon House Chair, I'm here. I rise in terms of Rule 84. The hon member cannot stand and state that the Minister is lying.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 61

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon member, which member are you referring to?

Ms Z S DLAMINI-DUBAZANA: Hon ... utata ... maRawula.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon Khawula, did you say the hon Deputy Minister is lying?

IsiZulu:

Nk M S KHAWULA: Kodwa kwalokho nje akulungile uma ezothi umuntu wesilisa ambize ngokuthi uMaKhawula, akuyena uMaKhawula lona.

English:

Ms M S KHAWULA: She must withdraw what she is saying now.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): No, No. Hon member, did you say that?

IsiZulu:

Nk M S KHAWULA: Yebo, uthi uMaKhawula lo. Ubani-ke uMaKhawula lo okhuluma ngaye? Ngabe yimina?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 62

English:

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon member, did you say it or not? Did you say the Deputy Minister is lying?

IsiZulu:

Nk M S KHAWULA: Angimazi ukuthi ukuthatha kuphi lokho, ukuthatha kuphi?

English:

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Okay thank you, hon member. You may take your seat.

IsiZulu:

Nk M S KHAWULA: Ubolalela kahle uma usePhalamende, kuzosetshenzwa, akuziwe ukuzolalwa la.

English:

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Please take your seat now. Hon member, I'll check the Hansard and then I'll come back. Continue hon Deputy Minister.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 63

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF FINANCE: Sometimes when people say you are lying they don't mean it. They don't understand what you are saying. Some of the things which you don't understand can look like lies because you don't know what somebody is saying. So you must understand that.

Hon Madisha says we are continuing to sink, therefore we must sink. As he was leaving here he said we are continuing to sink, therefore we must sink. Now, I understand why he favours that, because his ship is the sinking speed. So I'm not surprised why he says we must sink.

Now, hon Madisha, we refuse to sink with your party because this is not a sinking party. This is a party which has the primary responsibility for the future of this country and it's a party that transcends incidentals like the noise that is being made by you, the EFF, the DA. Those are all incidentals to the ANC. That's why we adopt the stimulus ... because we are assuming responsibility which is allocated by our people to the ANC.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 64

On that point ... Having said that, I'm saying we are therefore ... [Interjections.] ... What I'm saying therefore is that I must acknowledge that other parties like the IFP, UDM, having expressed their views with regard to what they are unhappy about, understand the centrality of adopting this budget because you cannot want to be a ruling party in a nation of no people. People who have no money, who can't spend on public transport, but you still want to use it. I don't understand that but I pity you because I understand your situation.

We are a leading party in the country. That's why we are allocating this way. That's why we are proposing in this fashion. That's why we have adopted the stimulus ...

By the way, if you go to the Small and Medium Practices, SMP, I like where they say, facing the challenges we are facing as they are, but the leadership that is leading us out of these challenges ...

An HON MEMBER: Which one? [Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 65

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... has got clear intentions and it's reliable. Thank you very much. [Applause.]

Debate concluded.

Question put: That the Bill be read a second time.

Division demanded.

The House divided.

[Voting take in from minutes]

Question agreed to.

Bill accordingly read a second time.

UNREVISED HANSARD

**CONSIDERATION OF REPORT OF PORTFOLIO COMMITTEE ON RURAL
DEVELOPMENT AND LAND REFORM ON ELECTRONIC DEEDS REGISTRATION
SYSTEMS BILL**

There was no debate.

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 66

The Chief Whip of the Majority Party moved: That the Report be adopted.

Motion agreed to.

Report accordingly adopted.

ELECTRONIC DEEDS REGISTRATION SYSTEMS BILL

(Second Reading debate)

The MINISTER OF RURAL DEVELOPMENT AND LAND REFORM: House Chair, hon Ministers, hon members, land and the ownership of land is at the heart of any society.

Sepedi:

Mošutelelwa ga a nabe.

English:

That is certainly the case for South Africa, where land has defined us for centuries. Wars have been waged and lives lost for land. The brutal system of apartheid used land, in

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 67

particular the dispossession of land, dehumanised and marginalised the majority of South Africans. When the era of democracy set in, the government of the ANC immediately adopted a policy to restore land to the people guided by the Constitution, which is the supreme law of the land.

So land has been, and remains the front and centre of each epoch of our history. Because of the importance of land, the process through which land is transferred, whether through government programmes or through normal, private and commercial transactions, must be effective. It is for this reason, that the land registration is a critical area of government responsibility.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon Minister, just give me this opportunity. Hon members, the noise levels are too high. [Interjections.] No, no! There is a very important Bill that is in front of the House dealing with the land matter and I think members should pay attention. Hon Minister, you may proceed.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 68

The MINISTER OF RURAL DEVELOPMENT AND LAND REFORM: Thank you House Chair. South Africans can pride themselves in the task that we have embarked on - land registration system, through this process that we are presenting to you today.

The system, for example, eliminates the possibility of double registration of properties. However, there is a need to more effectively utilise technology and develop a land registration system that is more responsive to the needs of the people and the demands of the times while ensuring service delivery to broader citizens of this country - the dispossessed people.

The department is in the process of developing an electronic deeds registration system that will provide: An accurate, reliable, secure land administration system; improve efficiency and accuracy of South Africa's land information management, improve turnaround times for providing registered deeds and documents to the citizens of this country; enhance security in the land registration system; enable the deeds offices to effect registration of large volumes of deeds and documents effectively as necessitated by government initiatives; provide country wide access to deeds registration

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 69

services and provide registration capabilities for other forms of land tenure that government may introduce in future and enhance accuracy of examination and registration.

The electronic deeds registration system will be implemented in phases. The manual as well as the electronic system will be used simultaneously until we have ensured that the electronic system is foolproof and risk free. Only at that stage will we transition fully to the new system. We will investigate the pros and cons of the security of the electronic system and make appropriate decisions. I thank you.

Ms P C NGWENYA-MABILA: Hon Chairperson, section 44 of the Constitution mandates Parliament to pass legislation with regards to any matter, including a matter within the functional area listed in schedule(4). The Deeds Registries Act of 1937 and Sectional Titles Act of 1996 provides for registration process to take place manually.

The Electronic Deeds Registration Systems Bill was initiated by the executive member and tabled in Parliament on 6 December 2017, followed by the committee briefing on 18 April 2018 and

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 70

was advertised in the newspapers from 14 September to the 5th October 2018. The consultation process was done on 17 October 2018, to hear the views of the stakeholders as per section 59 of the Constitution which clearly stipulates that public must be involved in the legislative and to the processes of the assembly and the committees.

The objectives of the Electronic Deeds Registration System Bill are as follows: To fastrack the registration of ownership of land; to decrease to time required for the deeds registration processes; to provide effective registration of large volumes of deeds and enhance the accuracy of the processes relating to the examination and registration of deeds.

The Chief Registrar of Deeds must subject to Electronic Communications and Transactions Act which develops, establishes and maintains the electronic Deeds Registration System, using information and communication technology for preparation lodgement, registration, execution and storing of deeds and documents, and also to provide for the validity of deeds or documents generated, registered, and executed

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 71

electronically, and any other registered or executed deeds or document scanned.

Hon Chairperson, clause 3 of the Bill requires any user of electronic deeds registration authorised by the regulations to be registered in the manner and under conditions as may be directed by the Chief Registrar of Deeds. The Bill further empowers the Minister to make regulations on the recommendations made by the regulations of the board established in terms of the Deeds Registries Act to regulate the procedures of electronic lodgement of deeds or documents; the procedures for electronic record storing by deeds registries.

Also, the manner to identify the person who prepares execute, lodges, registers or stores any deeds or document required or permitted to be prepared, executed, lodged, registered or stored in any deeds registry and the manner in which electronic payments of fees must be introduced; the processing of deeds and documents using electronic deeds registration system; the retention and subsequent production of deeds and documents and any other electronic documents which may be

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 72

pertinent to the registration of rights in the deeds registry, that may be required for administrative or legal proceedings that must be complied with by the user interacting with the electronic deeds registration system.

Authorised users of the electronic deeds registration system authorised by the regulations must be registered in a manner and under the conditions as may be directed by the Chief Registrar of Deeds. Hon Chair, I therefore request the House to adopt the report of the Portfolio Committee on Rural Development and Land Reform on the Electronic Deeds Registration System Bill. I thank you. [Applause.]

Ms T M MBABAMA: House Chair, it seems rather ironic that we should be debating the merits of digitisation of the deeds registry system, when a parallel process to amend the Constitution to allow for EWOC is taking place. If implemented this will lead to what the EFF wants; nationalisation of all property. This is their policy position. It then begs the question: If the state is to own all property, what will happen to the deeds registration system?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 73

Will there be a need for it at all; will conveyancers join the ranks of the unemployed? For a party whose leadership is all gunning for doctorates, I am surprised that they cannot fathom the folly of their ways. How can they not understand the disastrous consequences of expropriation without compensation and nationalisation across the board as experienced in Venezuela?

Can one then blame Prince Mashele when he says: "The EFF is a child coming out of the ANC. The ANC is a university of corruption, the EFF are its graduates, so what you see in the EFF is what they learnt from the ANC." The ANC on the other hand is flip-flopping between nationalising some of the land through their PLAS programmes, while promising not to expropriate land belonging to others such as King Zwelithini's Ingonyama Trust.

IsiXhosa:

Ithini kanti inkqubo yenu maqabane?

English:

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 74

Is the mighty ANC bowing to the dictates of a 6% minority party?

IsiXhosa:

Phofu uMzantsi wonke uyayazi uba ayisafani!

English:

The DA is the only party that is capable of bringing change that builds one South Africa for all its citizens; the DA does not believe in amending the Constitution and nationalisation of all property. What we do believe in, is land reform that honours the right of every South African to have legal title to their property. Do you think that the people who were so brutally dispossessed want to go back to 99 year leases? Hell no!

To date the DA has handed out more than a 100 thousand title deeds to beneficiaries of RDP housing, mopping up the inefficiencies of the ANC government. Where the DA governs the DA delivers! That is why we support the intent of this Bill. We support it because it will speed up the registration

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 75

process and be a conduit to ensure that more and more South Africans have legal title to their land.

A process that is crucial for the development and advancement of those previously excluded, be they farm labour tenants or rural residents under customary tenure. However, we are concerned that a new system usually increases risks and if the Department of Rural Development and Land Reform is not ready, this will spell total disaster in much the same way that the government's Broadcasting Digital Migration programme has been. The Rural Development and Land Reform Annual Report of March 2018 show the Deeds Registration as having the highest vacancy rate of the department.

Will the department be able to recruit the necessary talent on time? A Specialist Conveyance Attorney from the firm, Guthrie Colannani Attorneys, states in an article on the digitisation of Deeds Registration that identity theft and digital editing make it possible to create false online identities, and many of these fake profiles are so convincing that even astute parties may be duped.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 76

Whether the department will have the wherewithal to see this process through without the usual ineptitude, dubious procurement processes and cadre deployment, remains to be seen. The DA supports the Bill.

Dr S S THEMBEKWAYO: Hon Chairperson, the Electronic Deeds Registration Systems Bill seeks to regulate electronic registration of title deeds, and move away from the manual registration process. To this end, the Office of the Chief Registrar of Deeds had already started developing systems for an electronic deeds registration system. In principle, no one should oppose any attempt to improve the efficiency of deeds registration to make this process quicker for property buyers.

However, in reality, what this then immediately shows is that a stand-alone Bill such as this one is neither necessary nor desirable, in order to have an effect on the kind of administrative functions that this Bill seeks to introduce. This could have easily have had an effect through a minor amendment to the Deeds Registries Act and the Sectional Titles Act, instead of an entirely new Act dealing with a functional administrative matter.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 77

Secondly, the Bill will not contribute an inch towards dealing with the failure of the past 24 years in relation to proper registration and recording of all South African land, to enable us to know exactly who owns which land, and where. The last land audit report showed that the state could not account for 6% of land, which remains unregistered trust land in the Eastern Cape and Limpopo. This Bill will not help capture those land details that were not captured.

Thirdly, the Bill still fails to appreciate that at least 60% of South Africans are currently without secure title to land. These people include those in informal settlements, in RDP houses whose registration is in a perilous state, and those working and residing on farms.

This Bill therefore essentially is concerned with making the lives of those in the top 40% in this country easy - those who have money, capital and resources. There is still no system in this country to register rights to land of those who fall outside of the repressive titling system, which excludes the majority, and buttress the predatory elite.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 78

What must happen as a matter of great urgency is the introduction and enactment of legislation that will recognise land use rights to the majority of people who have no tenure to land.

Also, passing a Bill of this nature just before we effect constitutional amendments may prove to be moot. One of the issues the constitutional amendment process is mandated to look at is the desirability of state custodianship of land. If that amendment passes, then we would be forced to develop another Bill for registration and recording of land rights, not of title to land. As a result of these, we do not support this Bill. Thank you.

Inkosi R N CEBEKHULU: Hon House Chairperson, this is a very welcome piece of legislation and significant step by the department to modernise and enhance the efficiency and cost effectiveness of the manner and process in which title deeds are registered in South Africa.

Even though there is an electronic land register, there is still a great deal of manual filing that must be done by

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 79

conveyance attorneys at the deeds office, in order to register and transfer title deeds. This is a timeous and lengthy process and is, on occasion, inaccurate.

In the coming years, South Africa will not be able to handle the expected volumes of anticipated land transfers, unless it implements e-commerce principles through an electronic deeds registration system. Such a system will allow for greater volumes of deeds to be processed and registered, will greatly enhance turnaround times, will provide immediate access to information and status of registration, will improve accuracy of examination and registration services, as well as provide greater security over information.

One must additionally take cognisance of the fact that the current system in place in South Africa is recognised as one of the best in the world as far as deeds registration systems are concerned, which provide for security of title.

It is therefore imperative that we retain the core principles of the current system and incorporate them into the new system.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 80

The IFP would further suggest full and further consultation with all principal role players – conveyance attorneys, banks and estate agents – to develop the system. However, we welcome and support the Bill. The IFP supports the Bill. I thank you.

Prof N M KHUBISA: Hon House Chairperson, land is about dignity and inheritance. The NFP supports this Bill because it speaks to legacy and inheritance. Our people were dispossessed of their land and land spoke to the bread and butter issues that affected them.

Our forefathers died for their land and to deal with the injustices and inequalities of the past, this Bill is therefore important. It serves to deal with the land tenure and also amends the Act of 1937, whereby we have to restore the land back to the people.

Today, they are still the subject of dispossession. Many of them lost their land through registration, execution, storage, lodging, etc.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 81

The Bill will be good for banks, conveyancers and those who have to own land. It is a pity that this Bill comes at a time when there is another process happening. All along, the system was done in a manual way and it rendered itself vulnerable and susceptible to fraud and corruption.

The electronic registry of deeds means that it will provide transparency, accuracy, security and legitimacy. While the NFP would welcome this form of registration, experience has shown that corruption always tries to show its ugly head everywhere. We have seen it with the state-owned enterprises, etc. We understand that the Bill seeks to effect efficiency and efficacy of records and registration.

Having said that, only 20 submissions were received, they were merely procedural in nature and there was nothing substantive in them. For that reason, the NFP will support this Bill. Thank you.

Mr M L W FILTANE: Hon Speaker and members, the Bill was introduced to Parliament in December 2017. It aims to mandate

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 82

the Chief Registrar of Deeds to develop, establish, maintain and store deeds and documents.

With regard to response for comments by those directly affected by it, like conveyancers and banks, as well as the general public, Parliament received less than 20. The concerns raised by the majority of respondents were mainly of a procedural nature, rather than principle-based opposition to the Bill.

Mr T RAWULA: Chairperson, on a point of order: Minister Gwede is asleep.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon member, that is not a point of order. Continue, hon Filtane.

Mr T RAWULA: Minister Gwede is sleeping. He cannot be allowed to sleep in the House. He is sleeping.

Mr M L W FILTANE: During deliberation ... Just to keep you awake. [Laughter.] During deliberation by the Portfolio Committee on Rural Development, it was expressed that such

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 83

concerns should be addressed through regulation of the Bill, once enacted into law.

Given that one great advantage of the Bill will be to fast-track the whole process of deeds registration, there are no valid grounds for opposing it. The process will be simplified by this Bill. Consequently, by the time most South African citizens access land through an amended Constitution, the system would be much smarter and safer against exploitation. Consequently, the UDM wholeheartedly supports this Bill.

[Laughter.]

Mr T C R WALTERS: Hon Chair and hon members, the Democratic Alliance supports this Bill with some reservations, as hon Mbabama has pointed out. We firmly believe, as the Democratic Alliance, that opportunities for all South Africans can be expanded if private property is extended to as many South Africans as possible.

Such an ever-increasing base of real ownership by individuals in South Africa, who are still disadvantaged by the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 84

unaddressed legacy of apartheid, can only benefit all South Africans.

As member Mbabama points out, this is true transformation, rather than continuing the state monopoly of power over the economic future of especially black South Africans that was the root of apartheid.

This Bill, in principle, is a step forward in resisting the current assault on the economic future of the poor that we see in the constitutional review process. It can play a meaningful role in reducing the costs and harmful bottlenecks in deeds registration that first-time property owners face and can remove a barrier to economic progress.

Access to property means that an asset is available to the poor that translates into access to financing, access to business opportunities with a consequential spin-off effect on job creation, and a successful, self-confident, free and fair society.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 85

The reservations however need to be noted. If hacking or identity theft is not effectively countered by a department that is riven by corruption and inefficiency, then we will see the stealing of land becoming more than a populist slogan.

If the physical proof of ownership is not guaranteed and located close to the owner, then we might very well in the future sit with a similar situation that bedevils our restitution processes, where muddled evidence and heavy burden of proof delay opportunity and justice.

The electronic deeds process can actually go far further in proactively expanding and securing ownership for the poor and ensuring that land rights are properly recorded. However, it is a step forward and we support it.

Ms N W MAGADLA: Honourable House Chairperson, hon members, fellow South Africans, I must say it up right that the ANC supports the Bill. [Applause.]

The Bill we are debating in this House today is long overdue. One needs to look at what is happening currently, what this

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 86

Bill does and its impact in our lives. South Africa has one of the best deeds registration systems in world which affords security of title, mainly due to the specific responsibilities assigned to conveyancers and the registrar of deeds in terms of the Deeds Registration Act 1937.

The Deeds Registration Act and the Sectional Titles Act 1986 provides for the registration of deeds to take place manually. A computerised deeds system is in place for the maintaining of the electronic land register. However, the preparation and lodgement by the conveyancers as well as the processing of deeds and documents by the registrar of deeds all take place manually.

This kind of arrangement was fine for the apartheid era where a large population was excluded from ownership of land in the country. President Ramaphosa said in his state of the nation address on 16 February 2018,

We are building a country where a person's prospects are determined by their own initiative and hard work and not by the colour of their skin, place of birth, gender, language

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 87

or income of their parents. We have been given the responsibility to build a new nation, to confront the injustices of the past and the inequalities of the present.

House Chairperson, the new democratic government ushered land reform to redress the racial skewed land ownership in this country. Through redistribution and restitution programmes, a large number of black people entered the property market as land owners. This meant that the deeds office had to process large volumes of registrations manually per annum.

However, the registration infrastructure and the resources in the deeds office were not able to accommodate the rapid increase. Further, as a country we could not continue to have 10 deeds registration offices that are not linked to each other. There was a demand for consolidating and rationalising diversified registrations processes created through legislation by previous political dispensation.

We cannot talk of the fourth industrial revolution while our systems are still of the Stone Age. As a country, we have to be in line with technological developments and to keep up with

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 88

modern business practice in the property sector otherwise we will be left behind with what is happening globally.

There is a necessity in demand for our deeds registration system to change from manual to electronic. The Bill before the House proposes an introduction of an electronic deeds registration system, the electronic keeping of registrars and electronic issuing of deeds.

When the new legislation is enacted, a computer system known as the deeds registration system, e-DRS, will be put in place for maintaining the electronic land registrar. The Bill do recognise that the transition from manual to electronic deeds registration system will take time and needs to be done in phases as the Minister has alluded. Therefore, provisions of clauses 7(2) and 7(3) of the Bill provides for a phased-in approach.

It is without doubt that the new system that the Bill is proposing for will improve efficiency and the accuracy of the country's land information management. For the first time, all the processes relating to land registration will be

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 89

integrated. This means that many of the processes and procedures that are carried from the onset of the transaction to final registration of property will be streamlined which will process large volumes of registrations manually per annum.

However, the registration of infrastructure and resources in the deeds office was not able to accommodate this rapid increase. Further as a country we would not continue to have 10 deeds ... I am sorry.

AN HON MEMBER: Are you supporting the [Inaudible.]?

Ms N W MAGADLA: No I am not supporting ... It is without doubt that the new system that the Bill is proposing for will improve efficiency and accuracy ... I do not have a secretary.

This is in line with the National Development Plan which calls for reduction of housing transaction cost so that more people could fully participate in the economy.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 90

The electronic deeds registration system will ensure that the public, at large, has access to deeds registration services if they have access to internet. According to clause 4, any authorised user of the electronic registration system should be registered under conditions created by chief registrar of deeds to ensure there is some control on who access the system.

There is a concern by some conveyancers that transition from manual to electronic deeds registration system will lead to job losses. People need to be retrained and up-skilled to be able to fit in the new environment of advanced technology. As the industry continues to digitise, there will be an increasing need for professionals that are accredited and have technological skills.

Hon Mbabama, the land issue is not about the EFF's needs but about the ANC's resolution which is the ruling party that takes its mandate from the people. [Applause.]

Hon Thembekwayo, ndikuthembile [I trust you], please read the Bill carefully. It is a given that the EFF does not support

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 91

Bills in this House. I do not know whether your electorates know that.

IsiXhosa:

Prof Khubisa ohloniphekileyo, asikwazi ukulinda ezinye iinkqubo ezisa hamba indima yazo.

English:

To pass the laws is one of our parliamentary objectives.

IsiXhosa:

Asikwazi ke ngoku ukuba sithi masilinde, singaqhubi ngomsebenzi wethu kuba sisithi inkqubo ethile ayikaphethelwa.

English:

Hon Walters, the DA has no other alternative but to support the Bill and we thank all the parties that supported it because ...

IsiXhosa:

... akukho kwanto eniyibonayo eniza kuthi niyiphikise kulo Mthetho oYilwayo. Kufanelekile ukuba niwuxhase lo Mthetho

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 92

oYilwayo, nithanda ningathandi. Okwenu emanikwenze kukulandela apha emva kwe-ANC. Enkosi kakhulu. [Kwaqhwytywa.]

English:

Mr T C R WALTERS: Hon Chair?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon Walters.

Mr T C R WALTERS: House Chair, I just want to point out that the hon Waters was not part of this debate.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Okay, it is fine. The Minister will conclude the debate.

The MINISTER OF RURAL DEVELOPMENT AND LAND REFORM: Hon members on my right I agree with you, that indeed ...

Sepedi:

... phatana hlakola ga e onanenele mohlakodi. Molaokakanywa wo o fa batho ba rena maatla. Bao ba swerego mangwalo a semolao a mong wa lefelo, a bolokeng magagešo gona moo le lego, magaeng. Le se ke la a lahla ka gobane go tla mokgwa wa

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 93

seelekthroniki woo o tlilego go le hlokomela, o tlile go dira gore ge mangwalo ao a semolao a mong wa lefelo a lahlegile goba a swele, le kgone go tseba gore le tla a humana kae - ke thekgo ya mokgwa wa seelekthroniki.

Go na le bao ba rego go na le tshepedišo ye nngwe yeo e tsamaišwago ke Palamente - ka fase ga Sepikara, ya Komiti ya Tekolo ya Molaotheo. Ditlamorago tša yona, le gore di tlile go re tlela le eng, go tseba badudi ba Afrika-Borwa. Feela gore beng ba lefase ba kile ba utswetšwa lefase, ke nnete. Bjale, re dira eng gore re kgone go phela mo re šomago gona? Re tla tšwela pele ka taba ya poetšo ya naga go beng ba yona go ya ka Molaotheo. Re tla tšwela pele ka kaboleswa ya naga; re tla tšwela pele ...

English:

... providing land tenure to our people because this is their South Africa, this is our South Africa. This is a South Africa ...

Sepedi:

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 94

... yeo e hlompago Molaotheo. Feela go se ke gwa ba le batho bao ba dulago mekhukung ba tsebang gore ke bona bomang, ba ba tšwago kae. Bao ba belaelago gore tshepedišo ya kamoso e tla hwetša batho ba dutše bjang, ke nyaka go ba botša gore ba tlile go re humana re eme gabotse.

English:

We are battle ready for whatever comes in defence of our people. I thank you. [Applause.]

Debate concluded.

Bill read a second time (Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

**CONSIDERATION OF BUDGETARY REVIEW AND RECOMMENDATION REPORT OF
PORTFOLIO COMMITTEE ON DEFENCE AND MILITARY VETERANS ON
DEPARTMENT OF DEFENCE**

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: House Chairperson, we move that the committee report be adopted.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 95

Mr M WATERS: Chairperson there is no objection, but we would like to make a declaration.

Declarations of Vote:

Mr C H H HUNSINGER: Chairperson, we are supporting this Budgetary Review and Recommendation Report, BRRR, of the Department of Defence and Military Veterans, but we have a number of serious reservations which are explicit or implied as part of this BRRR.

The department is in a downward spiral wheel. The little bit of defence capability and capacities are diminishing by the day. It is expected by the department that the deficit for this year will be R3 billion, mainly due to do human resources costs, which is absorbing so much of the Budget allocation that little is spent on much needed equipment.

At the end of the 2017-18, human resources were 57% of expenses which has escalated to 75% at the end of the first quarter of this year. The unacceptable spending on human resources implies that, we don't have the funds to assure reliable modern and serviceable equipment which includes

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 96

airlift, maritime signal, and inventory cyber and glone capabilities.

Our human body represents an ageing defence force with average age of inventory soldiers at 38 years, colonels at average of 41 years and generals and admirals at 54 years. This doesn't represent a young physical fit and ready force.

The Minister and the department must reconsider their defence mandate in compliance with section 200 of the Constitution and reprioritise expenditure accordingly. The tough and unpopular decision must be made in the best interest of our country and the defence ready, SANDF. The current spending trend will result in the contrary. I thank you.

Mr S P MHLONGO: Chairperson, defence force ought to remain a national pride of the nation, where reserve forces are to be upskilled to play vital role in economic development of the country, while standing forces sharpen required expertise in line with challenges of the 20th century.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 97

For this to happen, strategic direction given in previous defence review ought to have been implemented, yet consumerism overtook objective reality. The continuous plundering of financial resources without vision can't save our defence force from current quagmire and decline it is currently face with.

The failure to align Armaments Corporation of South Africa, Amcor, with Denel continue to blow back on defence capabilities to protect our borders and cease accordingly, hence Chinese are conducting illegal fishing without disruption.

The countless grievances lodged by our special forces especially in Phalaborwa are a reflection of broken chain of command which fails to look after well being of those who ought to defend our country sovereignty. This happens while African and other western imperialist are expanding south wards, threatening our sovereignty as a country and also as a continent.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 98

The sustained austerity measures on defence Budget remains a key national threat to our national security and this must be looked at with a greater understanding that those who benefit out of a declining defence force capability with regard to its size and its capability are those who in return will actually bring about this special form of colonialism that we see being expanded worldwide. Without a proper vision and leadership, people perish and EFF can't simply support plundering of resources in Budget reviews that are without a plan. [Time Expired.]

Inkosi R N CEBEKHULU: House Chairperson, there is no dispute on the role and importance of ensuring country to take care of our military veterans. Their experiences in both war and peace taught us valuable lessons about history, sacrifice, service and the gift of freedom we enjoy today.

This selfless service to our nation must be praised, however, the IFP expresses its deep disappointment in the leadership of the Department of Military Veterans in not achieving the majority of its target and objectives set.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 99

This doesn't board well with veterans who require assistance with the department to ensure that their livelihoods are kept and that we adequately deliver services to them. When our country was in need of protection, veterans who served at the time didn't ask how, who, what or where. They gave their lives and their time to protect us and serve our nation diligently.

This department's failure in delivering key objectives to some extent doesn't justify its spending of its Budget objectives such as the IT system and managing the data base of benefits to recipients. It is disheartening when one reads through the Auditor-General's report on the department. There is a clear lack of consequences for officials implicated in wrong doing in carrying millions of rand in irregular and fruitless and wasteful expenditure and not paying service providers within 30 days.

It is high time that this department gets its house in order. We owe it to those who have served us, but the IFP supports the report.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 100

Mr W M MADISHA: Hon Chairperson, we must accept that where as much of the world spends 2% of GDP on defence, it is unlikely that we will be in a position to increase our spending beyond its current 1% of GDP in the foreseeable future. Nonetheless, from the report it is evidence that the defence force primary objective and problem of course is not its Budget allocation, but it is rather structural in nature.

The international benchmarks suggest that regardless of the quantum of the defence Budget allocation, it should be divided more or less equally between personnel, operational and capable expenditure. In our context, a whopping 80% of the SANDF's Budget is spent on personnel.

Apart from here, whereas one needs young and fit soldiers, our SANDF personnel are ageing. We have our personnel management of The South African National Defence Force, SANDF, wrong. It is no wonder then that the committee's report knows that our air force and navy can't afford to fly or sail sufficient miles to ensure their operational readiness or to carry out operations to ensure our sovereignty. In noting the report and

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 101

its recommendations, we reiterate our view that, we need to address the underlying structural problems. Thank you.

Rev K R J MESHOE: House Chairperson, the Department of Defence AND Military Veterans noted in its annual report that fruitless and wasteful expenditure stood at R55 million in the 2017-18 financial year. This related mainly to the non utilisation of lease properties to the amount of R22 million and medical equipment to the value of R20 million.

In addition, R13 million was paid for software installation, training and travelling cost, but no services were rendered. The ACDP would like to know how many officials involved in what appears to be corruption. Have they been brought to account and how much of the taxpayer's money have been recuperated, particularly from companies that were paid for services that were not rendered?

The Auditor-General note as I have stated that fruitless and wasteful expenditure of R75,137 million was incurred in the 2017-18 financial year while the department reported fruitless and wasteful expenditure of just R55 million for the same

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 102

period. We would like to know what happened to the R20,137 difference between the Auditor-General's calculation of R75,137 million and the department's calculation of R55 million. Thank you.

Mr M S MOTIMELE: Hon House Chairperson, let me just remind you hon members that the department of Defence and Military Veterans derives its mandate from section 22 of the Constitution, Defence Act 42 of 2002 and Military Veterans Act 16 of 2011, which requires the department to provide, manage, prepare and employ defence capabilities that are commensurate with the needs of South Africa.

The ANC in supporting this report commends the strides that the department has made, like strides in peace keeping missions in the DRC and successes in securing our borders more especially curbing cross border illegal activities.

We have noted the poor performance on flying hours and that it is related to the budgetary constraints and complex process to source spare parts. The ANC has also noted the poor performance on the sea hour's target which relates inter alia

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 103

to the unavailability of vessels at required level of capability cycles, delays and operational defects.

We have recommended that the department should provide the committee with a comprehensive report on how it proposes its repositioning based on requirements in terms of section 200 of the Constitution and the available appropriate Budget. The ANC supports the report. Thank you, hon Chairperson.

Motion agreed to (EFF dissenting).

Report accordingly adopted.

**CONSIDERATION OF BUDGETARY REVIEW AND RECOMMENDATION REPORT OF
PORTFOLIO COMMITTEE ON DEFENCE AND MILITARY VETERANS ON
DEPARTMENT OF MILITARY VETERANS**

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: House Chair, I move that the report be adopted.

Mr J R B LORIMER: No objection Madam Chair, but the DA would like to make a declaration.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 104

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G BOROTO): You are quick heh! Eh, anyway DA you are allowed.

Declarations:

Mr S ESAU: Hon House Chair, the DA support the Budgetary Review and Recommendation Report, BRR report, however, we want to indicate to the House that the impact achievement targets stand at 15% only in this department.

The APP targets stands at 28% of what it planned and what it actually achieved. The targets reached in this current year, 72% not achieved, 28% only achieved, and 96, 7% spent, which means much more money is spent for what is being achieved. Does this actually offer value?

The higher this continues in this department the HR staff, the staffs are still incompetent, under qualified, the skills audit is still outstanding, the gap analysis is outstanding, and the training of staff is not taking place. Memorandum of Understanding, MOU is still outstanding and Service Level Agreement, SLA, policies even on transport issues is still outstanding.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 105

There exists no transport yet arrangement benefit for the military veterans, the data base is only now being achieved at 40% and is supposed to have been fully verified, it is standing at 40%, which undermines the allocation or benefits.

The ICT, the integrity of data is still being challenged, the systems are not in place; even the basic system like Logistical Information System, LOGIS and the Basic Accounting System, BAS has only been introduced now to monitor invoices, and of course, exceptional reports.

We look at the organogram that is outstanding and personnel, a staff vacancy of 25%, but 73 additional posts are now accommodated in this department but there are other vacancies.

A critical post of the Deputy Director General, DDG in the second programme is not in place yet. The internal controls, no director only two staff and then we speak about - there is chaos in this department when the internal controls even the sub programmes budgets have been decreased.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 106

So this department is speaking about the turnaround strategy, we are asking, when is the strategy going to turn around? And this is the big problem that this department needs. It is about consequence management that it addresses the issue of risk and improves those conditions in the department. Thank you, very much. [Applause.]

Ms N V MENTE: Thank you, Chair. One of the main reasons why the Department of Military Veterans is dysfunctional is because to begin with, there was never a coherent and sensible reason why the department was created.

If the Department of Defence was functioning, all issues pertaining to military veterans should have been handled there, and efficiently so. Instead a whole Ministry was created as an extension to the ANC for the ruling party to create other means of looting state resources.

The Department of Military Veterans has become an event organising company of the ANC, paying, catering, hiring tents, chairs, sound systems and artist under the false pretence of functions for the poor military veterans.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 107

Many of the people who qualified for military veterans remain poor, ignored and no one pays attention to their cries; do not have proper housing and have no assistance of anyway.

There are people who continue to languish in prison because there were not members of the Umkhonto weSizwe, MK, but the Azanian People's Liberation Army, APLA soldiers. They qualified for presidential pardons and military veterans. Those are the people the department was supposed to have been looking after, to have been helping and looking after their children and grandchildren, but this is not happening.

The Budget Review and Recommendations are failing to address the real issues facing our military veterans and as the EEF, we would never stand here and support the mediocrity that you are given to the military veterans. Give them what is due to them, identify them, they are out there. They are crying for your help, you are busy with parties. Thank you, very much.

[Applause.]

Mr W M MADISHA: Chairperson, disgraceful, shambolic! This Chair is some of the adjectives that come to mind when one

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 108

reads this report and considers the observation and recommendations of the committee in respect of the Department of Military Veterans.

When less than a third of performance targets are met despite close to the entire budget having been spent, one must ask, what was the money spent on?

When one reads that management don't set an example for their subordinates and failed to implement consequence management, one must ask, will the ANC ever learn that cadre deployment and patronage kills the organisations.

When one learns that the department is stagnating despite a turnaround strategy and failing to meaningfully deliver benefits to the veterans, one is inclined to ask, who is benefiting?

When one must learn that the database of military veterans and their family members must be sanitised to ensure that only "real veterans" get benefits, one must ask who is on this gravy train. Who is dishing out patronage and for what

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 109

objective and are these the same MK vets that appear in their Mr Price outfits in defence of a faction of the ANC like we have seen.

Chairperson, we note this report and wish to record our disgust and abject disappointment. Thank you. [Ke a leboha.] [Mahofi.]

Ms N B DAMBUZA: Thank you, very much hon Chairperson. The ANC rises in support of the Budgetary Review and Recommendations Report of the Portfolio Committee of Defence and Military Veterans.

In his maiden state of the nation address, the President Cyril Ramaphosa stated that, guided by the National Development Plan, we are building a South Africa that must be free from poverty, inequality and unemployment. He also indicated the need to create jobs and grow the economy, recognising the contribution of military veterans to bring about a peaceful, democratic and prosperous South Africa.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 110

The ANC-led government established the Department of Military Veterans. We identified in our national conference that many military veterans remain destitute, unemployed, and poor without much assistance from the state.

The ANC-led government has done great work in fulfilling its mandate despite the challenges the department faces. Hon Chairperson, I think we need to...

IsiXhosa:

... kufuneka siyivuyele into yokuba iSebe lezoKhuselo namaGqala eMfazwe lizama kangangoko linako. Siyayazi imiceli-mngeni ejongene neli sebe kwaye yonke imihla siyayixoxa ekomitini. Siyayazi ukuba kwenzeka ntoni na ngaphakathi kuba ayikho into efihlakeleyo kwaye siyayazi ukuba isebe lenza ntoni na ukusombulula ezo ngxaki.

English:

The department standing patterns must be appreciated, R132 million was shifted from underperforming programmes towards education. We are indeed a government that values education. Thank you.

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 111

The ANC supports the Budgetary Review and Recommendation Report of Portfolio Committee on Defence and Military Veterans on the Department of Military Veterans. [Applause.]

Motion agreed to (EFF dissenting).

Report accordingly adopted.

**CONSIDERATION OF BUDGETARY REVIEW AND RECOMMENDATION REPORT OF
PORTFOLIO COMMITTEE ON DEFENCE AND MILITARY VETERANS - 2017-18
ANNUAL REPORT OF CASTLE CONTROL BOARD AND ARMSCOR**

There was no debate.

The Chief Whip of the Majority Party moved: That the Report be adopted.

Declarations of vote:

Mr S J F MARAIS: Chair, firstly, because of the inability of the Department of Defence and Military Veterans to purchase much-needed new vehicles, aircraft, navy vessels, equipment, etc, Armscor was not able to fulfil its designated role as the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 112

procurement arm of the SA National Defence Force, SANDF. Whilst the acquisition of assets for the Defence Force is Armscor's core activity, we have seen less and less time and money being spent on this.

The three most important projects - Projects Hoefyster, Biro, and Hotel - are all currently delayed with an unspecified time for delivery. Whilst this is the case, it seems Armscor has still paid its senior staff performance bonuses, subsistence and travel allowances, and yearly salary increases of up to 35%, with the chief executive officer's increase at 11,62%, which took him from R3,7 million to R4,15 million annually, the chief financial officer's increase at 15,41%, which took him from R2,57 million to R2,97 million, and another senior staff member's increase at 35%, which took him from R2 million to R2,7 million. This is unsustainable, and Armscor will have to cut costs on human resources, similar to the department and other state departments.

On the Castle Control Board, it is a sick - terminally sick - patient, and there are serious concerns relating to its viability and sustainability. The promised revenue

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 113

optimisation strategy plan, which is to justify further funding and its existence, is still outstanding. We have a serious reservation over the fact that a report with regard to the serious allegations against certain Castle of Good Hope staff has not been submitted by the Minister to our portfolio committee for us to do proper oversight. I thank you.

Mr S P MHLONGO: Chairperson, we don't need a Budgetary Review and Recommendation Report for the Castle Control Board. All those functions must just go to Defence, but we will use this opportunity to talk about Armscor and its strategic importance, which the report completely missed.

Armscor, as the procurement agency for the SA National Defence Force, should be used as a tool to encourage and support industrialisation in our country. Procuring weapons and all the necessary equipment needed for the SA National Defence Force should be the functional objective located within this important state asset, Armscor. As a country, we have Armscor that is capable and also well empowered with all capabilities. However, the implementing organ, Denel, is on its stomach

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 114

because of the continuous looting and corruption that have ravaged this particular organ of state.

The EFF has called upon the Minister of Defence and Military Veterans to join hands with the Minister of Public Enterprises in order to ensure that Denel's capabilities are brought into line so that our own defence capabilities are enhanced. However, as yet, this has not happened. The same decline continues unabatedly in Denel, and this is of great concern.

The EFF therefore rejects this budget because it will be part and parcel of the continued plundering of resources without a clear, decisive plan to overcome this decline that affects our national Defence Force as a whole. Thank you very much.

Inkosi R N CEBEKHULU: House Chairperson, it baffles me that the Department of Defence and Military Veterans runs a "vanity project" dubbed the Castle Control Board that manages and maintains the Castle of Good Hope just down the road from Parliament.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 115

Surely, this national heritage site should be managed and guided by the Department of Tourism, as it is has a significant role to play in telling a truly South African story with reference to our defence and the history of the Cape. It is perplexing as to why the Department of Defence and Military Veterans is managing this project and why it has not been able to enforce better financial controls. According to the Budgetary Review and Recommendation Report, BRRR, over R2 million has been lost, and just over R250 000 was written off. Despite the fact that this entity received a clean audit, the Auditor-General raised concerns about the financial viability of the Castle Control Board to effectively manage and maintain the Castle of Good Hope.

I believe the only way forward is for the Castle Control Board to be transferred to the Department of Tourism. The Department of Defence and Military Veterans has an incredibly important role to play in ensuring we are protected as a sovereign state. It should not be dealing entities that could be considered nice-to-haves or vanity projects.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 116

Armcor's unqualified audit result for the 2017-18 financial year is commendable. Furthermore, Armcor, together with the Department of Defence and Military and the SA Aerospace Maritime and Defence Industries Association launched the SA Defence Industry Fund. This fund will see local small, medium and micro enterprises in the defence industry equipped to compete in the global defence market. I thank you.

Mr W M MADISHA: Chairperson, in respect of the Castle Control Board, whilst we welcome the clean audit opinion, we are concerned about the entity's ongoing financial sustainability. The Castle of Good Hope forms part of our national heritage and is an important tourism attraction.

Armcor remains an important national asset. As our premier defence, technology, and acquisitions service provider to the Department of Defence and Military Veterans and given its research and development capabilities, especially in relation to cutting-edge technology products, we acknowledge the need for Armcor to focus on building its sustainability, including forging international defence industry partnerships and

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 117

commercialising its assets, skills and knowledge, research and development, and product development capabilities.

We share the committee's concerns regarding the impact on Armscor of the financial implosion of Denel and the magnitude of the irregular, fruitless and wasteful expenditure incurred. We note the report subject to our observations and concerns being recorded. We note the report. Thank you.

Mr D D GAMEDE: Chairperson, the ANC rises to support the Budgetary Review and Recommendation Report of the Portfolio Committee of Defence and Military Veterans on the annual report of the Castle Control Board and Armscor.

The Castle of Good Hope, as a leading heritage tourism destination and the oldest architectural building, forms part of the tourism industry and contributes towards the National Development Plan outcomes and targets. Its existence contributes to the economic development of our country. The site supports 89 direct employment posts, as well as 300 temporary opportunities associated with the events, and

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 118

runs a very successful internship and learnership programme, offering opportunities to at least 30 youth annually.

We are pleased that no irregular expenditure has been listed for the financial year 2017-18. No unauthorised expenditure or fruitless and wasteful expenditure was incurred during this financial year. We are happy that the Castle Control Board received a clean audit opinion from the Auditor-General for the financial years 2016-17 and 2017-18. We appreciate the progress made with regard to the security and safety aspects of both visitors and staff at the Castle of Good Hope. Given that this has been raised as a strategic risk over the last three years, we urge individuals, hon members, committee members to utilise the Castle Control Board to go and visit the Castle of Good Hope. It has good things. It has meeting rooms. We must take our committees there so that we make it more sustainable.

On Armscor, the National Development Plan ... we support the budget. [Time expired.]

Motion agreed to (Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 119

Report accordingly adopted.

UNPARLIAMENTARY LANGUAGE

(Ruling)

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G BOROTO): Order, hon members! Hon members, on Tuesday 23 October, during the debate on the Venda Building Society Mutual Bank, VBS, report title "the Great Bank Heist" a matter of public importance; hon Gardee rose on a point of order alleging that the remark made by hon Plouamma that he was planning to arrest hon Shivambu was unparliamentary and should be withdrawn. I undertook to seek advice on the matter. Having had an opportunity to study the unrevised Hansard and considered the matter I wish to rule as follows:

The unrevised Hansard captured hon Plouamma's remarks as follows: "When I came here I told my family that I'm going to exercise citizen's arrest. I was planning to arrest the hon Shivambu today." Rule 85 states that no member may impute improper motive to any other member or cast personal

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 120

reflections upon a member's integrity or dignity or verbally abuse a member in any other way. It states further that a member who wishes to bring in any improper or unethical conduct on the part of another member to the attention of the House, the member may do so only by way of a separate substantive motion comprising clearly formulated and properly substantiated charge that in the opinion of the speaker prima facie warrants consideration by the House.

By stating that he was going to perform a citizen's arrest on hon Shivambu, hon Plouamma implied that hon Shivambu was involved in improper conduct. This casted a personal reflection upon on hon Shivambu and was therefore in breach of Rule 85. As stated above a member may bring to the attention of the House allegation of improper conduct by member a member only by way of substantive motion I, therefore, ask hon Plouamma to withdraw his remark. Hon Plouamma!

Mr M A PLOUAMMA: Hon Chair, I withdraw and I pray that Brian Shivambu be arrested.

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 121

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G BOROTO): Hon member, please, can you just ... I'm going to disregard that one. Can you go back to the microphone, hon Plouamma? Can you just withdraw without any ... [Interjections.]

Mr A PLOUMMA: I withdraw, hon Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G BOROTO): Thank you very much. Hon members, I'm now going to ask the Secretary to read the Eighth Order.

**CONSIDERATION OF BUDGETARY REVIEW AND RECOMMENDATION REPORT OF
PORTFOLIO COMMITTEE ON RURAL DEVELOPMENT AND LAND REFORM**

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY: Hon House Chair, once again thank you. We move:

That the Report of this committee be adopted as well.

Declaration of vote:

Mr K P ROBERTSON: Hon House Chair, we agree to a few recommendations of the report namely: an autonomous Land

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 122

Claims Commission will hopefully reduce political interference in restitution; the White Paper guiding South Africa on land policy and internal and external investigations and forensic audits. However, this is too little and too late. Facts the Rural Development and Land Reform budget constitutes only 0,62% of the National Budget. Administration takes up 18% of that budget. The budget for Rural Development and Land Reform mirrors that of the very important person, VIP, protection services in this financial year. Shocking, how seriously is the ANC taking land reform?

Comparing the department's poor service delivery standards and its poor budget allocation, I mix that with the fact that 66% of the department's most senior positions are not permanently filled, you have a failing department. The answers we seek should not result in expropriation without compensation, hon Minister, but rather some tough introspection from the department as to why land reform is not functioning. Amid the ANC's motive call for expropriation without compensation, the Department of Rural Development and Land Reform and the Bushbuckridge Municipality have released 10 000 hectares of prime state-owned property. This is not to our people, but to

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 123

a Chinese company interested in cultivating and exporting rice back to China in the barren municipality of Bushbuckridge.

It is said that the lease agreement is one of 50 years. This denies countless black families the possibility of accumulating into generational wealth and they will again be labourers in land which they should own through title deeds. Again I asked how serious are the ANC taking land reform? Well, not serious at all. We oppose this Budget Review & Recommendations Reports, BRRR. Thank you. [Applause.]

Mr N S MATIASE: Hon House Chair, for 24 years of land reform programmes of government and particular this department of all of those years have been wasteful under the guidance of the ANC government. This is primary because of section 25, the evil section 25 clause, which must be got and rid off. This is the reason why the EFF has embarked on historic task of amending the Constitution so that land can be expropriated without compensation and be returned to our people. We spoke at length about the systematic and structural institutional failures of the Ministry and the department.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 124

However, whilst we have acknowledged this failures and mismanagement including corruption manifesting itself through the Malamala corruption which is a very funny issue as we speak today. We shall remind all that going forward we demand that there should be greater clarity in the Constitution, by amongst others, to delete the reactionary and devilish provisions of the section 25. We demand that the Constitution must be changed to allow for the expropriation without compensation and this must be done before 2019 elections. We demand further that land infrastructure, water rights and natural resources be nationalise and administered by the government.

We demand further that Land Redistribution Bill be urgently passed to create an independent state land management agency. We further demand that should Parliament fail to amend the Constitution to allow expropriation of land, land belonging to big landowners and capitalist must be confiscated by the people. With this in mind the department must begin to prepare itself for the role it will play once we start the process of land expropriation without compensation. Until then we reject this report. Thank you. [Time expired.] [Applause.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 125

Inkosi R N CEBEKHULU: Hon House Chairperson, this department strives to create and maintain equitable and sustainable land dispensation which will ensure rural development employment and the continued social and economic advancement of all South Africans. Agrarian transformation and an improved food security is key to emancipating our communities from hunger and poverty. South Africa finds itself in an increasing disparate situation in respect of joblessness. Rural development should be focusing on assisting jointly with the Department of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries the struggling subsistence farmers and small scale farmers with mechanisation in order for them to work the land produce feed their families and sell surpluses.

The department should by now know out of all the farms that were bought by the state and restore to the claimants, those that are productive and those that are lying fallow. Those that are lying fallow believed to people with a muscle to work and produce. Agri-villages were a brain child of this department. One wonders how many of them are successfully assisted and producing. This is one way that can assist by taking care of the rural population not to flock into towns

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 126

and cities with a hope of getting jobs and end sleeping on the streets.

Basic infrastructure in rural areas must be first tackled and many outer lying areas are still without access to educational facilities, public transport and health care. We need to see the department moving with speed to improve the lives of our people for the better. I thank you.

Prof N M KHUBISA: House Chairperson, the subject of land reform has brought about a renewed wave of interest in both the young and old of our country. Well-co-ordinated, coherent and systematic policy for land restitution is imperative. We need land to build houses for farming, for food security for all, for livelihoods, etc. Land tenure and redistribution is a matter of must.

This department has a duty to initiate, facilitate, co-ordinate, catalyse and implement sustainable rural land reform. The NFP is, however, concerned about the bottlenecks and backlogs and about a whole host of outstanding land claims that date back as far as 1998.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 127

Land is important for social cohesion. We have enacted and promulgated an avalanche of legislation, for instance the Deeds Registries Amendment Act in 2017, the Communal Land Rights Act in 2004, the Land Survey Amendment Act in 2017, the Sectional Titles Amendment Act of 2013, and others, but the pace has been slow in so far as the claims are concerned.

The NFP agrees with the portfolio committee that the department must deal with the backlogs in claims and with outstanding forensic reports and investigations, and these must be concluded speedily. The filling of critical posts is a matter of must. Service providers must be paid within 30 days, and the overuse of consultants must be reduced.

The spate of abuse meted out on farm workers and tenants is truly cause for concern. The spate of killings of farm workers and farmers is a serious matter that must be dealt with, and I understand that in this case the Department of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries is also involved. The NFP supports the report. Thank you.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 128

Mr M L W FILTANE: Hon Chair, the UDM supports the report. Land reform as a means to address the past injustices, which came about as a result of brutal racial wars and a series of apartheid laws which denied blacks the opportunity to own land anywhere in their South Africa, continues to present itself as a major challenge, not only to this Parliament but to the nation as a whole.

Intriguingly, most of those who are opposed to the amendment of section 25 of the Constitution use this ongoing failure by the department to make meaningful land reform happen. They are saying that they favour this programme of land reform. There is therefore an all-round cry for this department to up its game and make meaningful improvements to and inroads into this sphere of operations.

Unfortunately, as we speak, the department has no permanent director-general and is just limping along with a very thin upper structure in its administration. Corruption and inefficiency on the part of some staff members have wrecked and crippled the effectiveness of the department.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 129

The government-preferred system of community property associations as a way of land ownership and management is facing both internal squabbles as well as external challenges by traditional leaders in competition for land control in some areas. The problem has been prolonged for quite some time and is quite protracted. No solution is in sight as yet.

Outstanding land claims have now ascended to the upcoming Sixth Parliament; this, despite a concerted effort by the portfolio committee which has, one must happily admit, found a formula for co-operation among its members. Thank you, Chair.

[Time expired.]

Ms D CARTER: Chairperson, to a large extent this report mirrors the finding of the high-level panel report, the view of many land reform and rural development institutions and specialists, and the frustration expressed by many citizens as Parliament's Constitutional Review Committee traversed the country. It points to the failure of government and this department in particular to effect meaningful land reform and development.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 130

We have, on many occasions, raised our concerns that instead of promoting social justice, equality and the democratisation of our traditional communities and securing land tenure and rights of members of such communities, government seems intent on protecting and promoting the status of, for example, traditional leaders at the expense of their people, turning them into Medieval subjects and then promoting the further Bantustanisation of such communities. But to whose narrow party-political benefits, we must ask?

Now, we have to say that if we look at, for example, the Ingonyama Land Trust, we need to ask the question: How much more can they develop and how much more can the communities develop if indeed government does give a title deed?

Now, we note that the committee bemoans the failure of the department to effect meaningful land reform, pointing to the frustration and anger expressed by South Africans as the Constitutional Review Committee traversed South Africa, and as Cope we agree with the findings and recommendations of the high-level panel report that land reform has failed as a consequence of questionable political commitment, a failure to

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 131

develop an appropriate legislative framework and governmental incapacity. We note the report and its recommendations. Thank you. [Time expired.]

Mr P J MNGUNI: House Chair, may I just be upfront to say that the ANC supports the report. A number of issues need to be clarified in respect to the colleagues who spoke. The first is that colleagues must firmly apprise themselves, because now we are going to expose you to the public in that either you are defying this, or you are being opportunistic ... but all that pertains to the rule of anticipation is that if a report of some committee of the House is due to appear or is on the Order Paper, provides Rule 90, point 1, then it is anticipation and therefore forbidden to begin to discuss it when discussing other matters. That's free administrative and governance education now.

Now, there is an issue about the budget raised by the DA and there is also an issue about title deeds raised both by the DA and Cope. About the budget: the DA has not suggested where we will then get the budget to increase from 0,62 ... Now, you see, the old epithet in science is that in a glass container

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 132

or in a container filled with gases, each molecule exerts pressure on the container as if it is the only gas. Please don't come here and talk about budgets as if the department is the only department of state. We are not the only gas; there are many other gases in the container. There are many other needs, so to put it. [Interjections.]

Now, when it comes to the title deeds ... But, in fact, let's just go to the EFF and say: If you were emphasising the redistribution Bill, we were going to definitely agree and we are going to bring it on, so we hope that the EFF will again march together to make sure that the redistribution Bill sees the light of day and becomes an Act.

Why the ANC supports the report is because over 400 black farmers are without land, and we think that therefore it is important that they actually get the land. We do not support nationalisation, but allocation and redistribution to the landless. The ANC supports the report. Thank you. [Time expired.]

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 133

Motion agreed to (Democratic Alliance and Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Report accordingly adopted.

**CONSIDERATION OF BUDGETARY REVIEW AND RECOMMENDATION REPORT OF
THE PORTFOLIO COMMITTEE ON TOURISM**

The Chief Whip of the Majority Party moved: That the Report be adopted by this House. Thank you very much, House Chair.

There was no debate.

Declarations of vote:

Mr G R KRUMBOCK (DA): Madam Chair, the Budgetary Review and Recommendation Report for Tourism, is certainly a tribute to a constructive approach that all members of the committee have made towards promoting tourism as a key sector in our economy. It reflects a multiparty view that our declining tourism performance is a result of the sensitivity to a combination of economic, regulatory and environmental setbacks, especially brand damage caused by high profile attacks on tourist, canned

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 134

hunting and visa processing issues. The DA has argued for a decade that the department's budget should match rather than be half that of our long haul competitors and that an econometric study should be completed to establish our optimal budget. We are pleased at the BRR Report fully supports these fundamental policy inputs.

Other aspects identified in the BRR Report that reflect the policy initiatives that the DA has been driving include 25 more blue flag beaches, increasing a supply of tourism products, better interministerial and departmental co-ordination to spruce up our tourism product offering, and a greater focus on benchmarking and cost-benefit analysis.

What a pity then, that this BRR Report contains a recommendation that Parliament should be advised on "the feasibility of introducing a tourism tax that could be introduced in South Africa." We opposed this vehemently in the committee and we do so now. With South Africans reeling under the triple blows of VAT and petrol price increases, and nearly 10 million people unemployed, the very last thing our country needs is yet another crippling tax. You simply cannot tax a

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 135

vital industry which last year saw a decline of 29% in domestic tourism for this rather fundamental reason, the DA opposes this BRR Report. I thank you. [Applause.]

Mr N S MATIASE: Madam Chair, the tourism industry is a booming industry in the country and this year promises to see a further increase in a number of international tourists coming to South Africa. There is no any other part; there is no any country like South Africa and Africa anywhere else in the world. However, there is a great deal of transformation that is needed in the Tourism sector. The sector remains lily white, not transformed and black workers continue to face abuse and exploitation at the hands of white men, who own the industry. The government is playing hide and seek when it is supposed to intervene meaningfully and decisively, to ensure that the sector is transformed and it serves all South Africans. It must ensure that money, which is allocated for the tourism sector is used to empower and ensure that black people are integrated in the sector. Along with many experiences that we can cite here, the tourism sector continues to be exploitative regarding of labour practices.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 136

Tourism bosses used the excuse of tourism being seasonal, to casualise the labour force.

It is common knowledge that in Cape Town, black clients in different restaurants are treated badly. They are on a daily basis visited with racism and all forms of abuse and until the government intervenes, particularly in the Western Cape and in some parts of KwaZulu-Natal, the so-called historically British colonists, the government would not receive our support and the EFF will continue to object any report that seeks to ensure that this Report is supported. [Applause.]

Ms S J NKOMO: Hon Chair, with tourism playing such a key and sustainable economical role in South Africa and despite it being our largest service export: Why do we still rank so far down on the global most popular tourist destinations? I can tell you, why. One of the reasons is that, because of the damage that we are doing to our brand South Africa by continuing to turn a blind eye to illegal hunting, such as canned and baited lions, hunting and lion bone trading in South Africa.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 137

South Africa with its extensive biodiversity should be showcasing a lot of issues, especially our wildlife although it doesn't do that. On 7 June, this year, there was a major controversy around a lion hunt, which was conducted in the area called Umbabat Private Nature Reserve that borders around Kruger National Park. There remains a great deal of secrecy and controversy on this hunt. This lion was called Sky. He was killed and up until now nothing has been said about him. The Ministry was asked about this, but the Minister was actually very dilly dallying on responding to this matter. It is important for us to take note that brand South Africa makes us who we are. It actually makes us a country that is different and important to wildlife. Whilst we support this BRR Report, we are stating very clearly that brand South Africa is very important. I thank you.

Mr W M MADISHA: No, my problem ...

Sepedi:

... ke gore le rakile Malusi Gigaba ...

English:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 138

... today, he has resigned and therefore, we can't get tourists anymore. [Applause.] Okay. Thank you very much. Tourism can be a significant economic driver and has the propensity to create significant job opportunities. However, Chairperson, even though the potential of tourism is recognised in the New Growth Path as one of our six economic pillars, we are concerned that it is the government itself that stifles and damages its development by underfunding the department, as a whole and more specifically in respect of its marketing functions.

Secondly, underfunding the tourism function at provincial and local government level and by the implementation of damaging Home Affairs regulations which are here to be completely resolved. We are concerned that our tourism numbers are down. We know that tourism and its development struggles ... the responsibility of all three tiers of government. However, there is a need to ensure that developmental importance is recognised by provincial and local government, and that there is a need to ensure co-ordination and coherence of effort between all three spheres. We are saying that the need for additional departmental and marketing funding is necessary.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 139

The acknowledgment of the importance, tourism development at municipal and provincial level is needed. The need for ring-fence tourism funding for our ... okay, Malusi is gone, no tourism anymore ... [Time expired.] No tourism anymore Malusi Gigaba.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order, hon member!
Order!

Ms L S MAKHUBELE-MASHELE: House Chair, the Portfolio Committee on Tourism supports the Budgetary Review and Recommendation Report for Tourism. We understand that tourism is indeed the sunrise sector and that it should be supported by all relevant departments and business for it to flourish. Alone in 2017, the sector contributed around R136 billion to the gross domestic product, GDP, of the country and supported to the total of 1,5 million jobs which is about 9,5 % of the total employment in the country. The committee maintains that the tourism is underfunded given the immense potential that it can contribute towards employment and poverty alleviation. We therefore recommend that the National Treasury should look

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 140

into the funding model for the Department of Tourism, especially at the local level.

We are also encouraged by the private sector through its Tourism Business Council of SA, which finds means and ways of ensuring that the TOMSA, Tourism Marketing Levy SA and levy, which currently a voluntary one per cent contribution from the net profit after tax of businesses, is contributed by all business in the tourism sector. The committee is pleased with the overall performance of the Department of Tourism for the financial year 2017-18. We, however, note the regress and the audit findings that we hope and know that the department together with the entity will rectify and ensure that it moves to the level that we would want it to be.

We are also encouraged by the new visa related reforms that were announced as part of the economic stimulus package which would go a long way in ensuring that it stimulates the tourism sector ... [Time expired.]

Question put: That the Report be adopted.

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 141

Motion agreed to (Democratic Alliance and Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

The Report accordingly adopted.

**THROUGH PEACE AND STABILITY – RESPONDING TO THE NEEDS OF OUR
PEOPLE**

(Subject for Discussion)

Mr M S MOTIMELE: House Chairperson and hon members. Let me share this important quotation by Nelson Mandela with fellow members and South Africans, "Development and peace are indivisible. Without peace and international security, nations cannot focus on the upliftment of the most underprivileged of their citizens."

This icon of our struggle, a visionary, was mainly – I guess – informed by the unpleasant history of apartheid violence where the State was used to harass, divide and humiliate a great majority of South Africans while securing privileges and high standard of service to the minority; where there was no

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 142

respect of the law and the rule of law simply because there was no reason to.

This ended up with the ANC-led government inheriting a dysfunctional state with the economy in shambles. And of course, this icon was also informed by the history of a savage internecine warfare in our region and other parts of the continent: pre-election violence, herdsmen violence, ethnic clashes and terrorism; here at home by despicable acts of gangsterism, property crime, heists, child and women abuse, fraud and corruption; and all other crime and warfare violence that serve as an impediment to peace and stability and a hindrance to development.

Hon Chairperson, despite all this mayhem murking our history, current and past, this government, the ANC-led government, has taken impressive strides in curbing this scourge in line with the contract entered with the people, based on the noble ideals of the Freedom Charter and the ANC Election Manifesto.

This ANC-led government has created South African Defence Force, SANDF, that is ever ready to broker or enforce if

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 143

necessary, permanent peace and stability in the region; and is implementing skills development programs for military veterans and their dependants.

A dedicated South African Police Services, SAPS, that always respond to the needs of our people and has not been treating crime with kid gloves. Our people do now have greater access to justice; justice is no more for the chosen few.

Our correctional services is rehabilitating prisoners, therefore alleviating poverty and creating jobs. Former inmates who have undergone the rehabilitation programs have acquired skills and now are able to contribute to the economy of South Africa.

Our Home Affairs is regulating immigration to ensure security, promote development and fulfil South Africa's international obligations.

Our international relations and co-operation is developing infrastructure linking the people and the economies of the continent and building the African Agenda on the continent and

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 144

globally. This is a demonstration that our government understands that peace and stability are a basic requirement for any kind of positive development to take place.

I am sure that other speakers who will come after me will agree with me and provide details.

Hon Chairperson, if Mama Albertina Sisulu was still here with us she would certainly have this to say:

Look, I have been a dedicated health worker all my life and I am a champion of access to health for all, therefore this ANC-led government should continue ensuring and maintaining peace and stability so that my people should always be fit and healthy without any hindrance. That's the best honour you can ever give me.

Indeed hon Chairperson, it is upon us as a nation to honour and continue honouring her as much as we honour Nelson Mandela in this centenary of Nelson Mandela and Albertina Sisulu by making sure that there is peace and stability for development in the country, in the region and entire continent.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 145

We appeal to members of the community to note that peace and stability is not only about government institutions or policing and soldiering. This ANC-led government would like to see communities participating in all government and community based structures for peace stability with unyielding stubbornness in order to create a conducive environment for poverty alleviation, job creation and elimination of all forms discrimination and unequal treatment.

Sepedi:

A re tšhireletšeng temokrasi ya rena; re tšhireletšeng bokamoso bja rena le bja bana ba rena. Ke a leboga. [Legoswi.]

Mr Z N MBHELE: Hon House Chair, the DA's vision for South Africa is for a country where every person enjoys freedom, fairness and opportunity of one prosperous nation with one future, united in our diversity. While progress has been made in some respects, we still fall far short of our potential and in particular, this ANC government and the ones before it have not been responsive to the needs of our people when it comes to ensuring peace and stability or safety and security quite contrary to the lofty claims of the hon Motimele.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 146

But how can the ANC meet these needs when the SAPS has been politicised and chronically mismanaged, thanks to ANC cadre deployments and its twin sibling of cronyism? How can the SAPS be responsive to the policing needs and priorities of communities when stations are understaffed, under-resourced, under-equipped and undertrained?

Violence and organised crime has been increasing year-on-year since 2012, shattering the possibility for us to enjoy peace of mind in our homes and on our streets. Our Crime Intelligence has been mired in crisis, and our Detective Service is in severe distress, rendering them largely ineffective to combat the robberies and hijackings that threaten our personal safety.

On gang violence, it has taken more than seven years for this ANC government to respond to the DA's calls for the re-establishment of the Anti-Gang Unit in the Western Cape. If you call that responsive, I hate to think what you call unresponsive.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 147

Similarly, violence, unrest, land invasions and other disruptions of public peace have also been increasing, resulting in a thread-bare sense of public safety while our Public Order Policing Units were allowed to wither away to less than half the required capacity.

This tragic state of affairs is merely the tip of the iceberg when it comes to the bad news of an ineffective and inefficient SAPS who are not meeting the needs of our people, thanks to ANC's misgovernance. Now, I must say that, this is not to negate or discount the everyday work of the diligent and dedicated police officers who do their best under difficult conditions. It is, in fact, thanks to their labours, above and beyond the call of duty and despite being left in the lurch that the implosion of the SAPS has been kept at bay.

But if that is the bad news, brought to you by the ANC, then in contrast, the DA is here as a bearer of good news because we have a remedial reform plan to fix the SAPS and make it a police service that meets the needs of our people for peace and stability and for safety and security. [Applause.] Under a DA-led national government, firstly, we would implement a

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 148

radical localisation of policing resources and operational management, in line with international best practice.

Secondly, we would also professionalise the police service through merit-based appointment and promotion, adequate training and strong accountability enforcement. Thirdly, we would drive optimal specialisation and innovation through dedicated units.

The final good news is that although crime feels endemic and out of control, crime can be beaten through effective policing. However it requires the political will to get the basics right and fix the fundamentals which the ANC is incapable of doing. The only chance for reduced crime for the benefit for all South Africans will be through a national government led by the DA. [Time expired.] [Applause.]

Ms Y N YAKO: Hon Chairperson, your Chief Whip is intimidating me. There will never be peace and stability in South Africa as long as there is no justice. When we speak of justice we mean the return of our land because only through the return of our

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 149

land we will begin to respond to the needs of our people. It was Frantz Fanon who correctly stated that:

For a colonised people the most essential value, because the most concrete, is first and foremost the land: the land which will bring them bread and, above all, dignity.

Since Jan van Riebeeck first set foot in this continent in 1652, the peoples of Southern Africa have been subjected to dispossession, exploitation and genocide by white colonial settlers. Throughout Southern Africa our people were systematically dispossessed through their land by violence. Since then violence has been the language of the oppressed and our society as a whole. It was the violence of the settlers that was used to asset the so-called Property Rights; it was the violence of settlers that was used to crush the wars of resistance; it was the violence of the settler that killed Steve Biko; and today the violence of the settler manifest itself in our communities where black people are at war with each other.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 150

The descendants of those settlers whose privileges both on dispossession of black South Africans continue to resist all attempts to see the land returned to its rightful owners. It is this very Parliament where the DA, the FF Plus, Cope and others are doing everything they can to sabotage the Constitutional Review Committee and the Amendment of section 25 of the Constitution which will enable the state to expropriate land without compensation.

They refused to understand that they are too arrogant to accept that it is the only way with which this country will ever see peace and stability if we begin the process of expropriation of land without compensation. It is this refusal to acknowledge their sins and that of their forefathers along with the failures of the ANC government and its compromise with white monopoly capital. That is why till today South Africa remains beset by violence and instability.

When our people demand land they are met with bullets, dogs and tear gas. When students demand free education and decolonisation of education, they are arrested and imprisoned and when mineworkers ask for the beneficiation of the minerals

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 151

with which they extract from the land of their ancestors, they are met with death. In essence when our people demand justice and quality they are met with violence and death.

So, how can we accept that to be peace and instability in South Africa when the demand for justice is met by force and when the very fabric of our society is defined by violence? As long as the black majority who for over 350 years had been systematically exploited and dispossessed of their land and everything that comes with it remained landless, we can assure this House that this country will experience neither peace nor stability.

As the EFF, we have embarked on a generational mission of restoring the land and dignity of the people of South Africa. Only once this has happened we will finally be able to live in peace and with stability. Thank you, very much. [Applause.]

POOR PERFORMANCE OF PUBLIC WORKS DEPARTMENTS

(Member's Statement)

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 152

Mr X NGWEZI (IFP): Chairperson, community service delivery protests have flared up. Nurses are aggrieved with their painful circumstances; teachers are stuck in violent and hostile classrooms.

The students are angered NSFAS has failed them and left them with no books, no food, no tuition and no hope. The miners and workers are begging for better pay and working conditions. The families are torn apart by rape, crime and murder. Service men and women struggle to make ends meet to feed their families.

The fishermen and women can't cope with stringent legislative monopolies. The policemen and women are killed ruthlessly and millions of South Africans are watching the ANC and they are forgiving, but they will not forget what transpired in this country in the past decade. It was Albert Einstein who once said "peace is not merely the absence of war but the presence of justice, of law and order" I believe that peace is also the presence of a responsive, honest, and caring government.

It is illogical to think that our country can be peaceful and stable when we have looting, corruption, violence, and

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 153

instability in our society, when a small minority eat, pour champagnes, laugh and are happy whilst millions of people go to bed hungry in pain and in tears with no hope of finding a job.

Peace is not the absence of war but it is about finding peace within oneself and within the society that truly matters when social cohesion triumphs over hatred, anger and populism over looting and stealing and over injustices.

We can only triumph together when the ANC addresses the grave inequalities it created post 1994. When we balance the scales and redress the injustices of the past. A bunch of cadres are squandering our people's money whilst others suffer, that seems to be the story that is on repeat on our television screens, lest we forget that the ANC has no story to tell.

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Chairperson, as the NFP, and we indeed agree that peace and instability in responding to the needs of the people is of utmost importance. However, let me remind this House that it is easier said than done.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 154

A society where special planning benefits a few, corruption, fraud, maladministration, high levels of unemployment, substance abuse, poor housing, water and sanitation, high levels of domestic violence, lack of accountability and consequences, deployment of cadres, when I say deployment of cadres, I'm saying all political parties are guilty of it, there's no exception. Every political party does it in governance. Anywhere in the country any political party employs its own cadres, so this is not exclusive to one political party, let me make that loud and clear.

The divide between the haves and have not, the rich and the poor seems to be increasing. This particular House which is supposed to be setting an example is far from that and let me give you an example, Chairperson, allow me to present a very profound quote by a South African poet, Adielia Akoo, the author of the book, *Lost in a Quatrain* this is what she says, how profound and fitting to this House, particularly to the left:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 155

A weeping tongue scathingly lashes a false sense of power failing to reflect that a tongue portrays the character of its possessor.

How profound are these words, which is something for this House to ponder over, because all we've been doing since this morning is coming here to insult and hailing abuse at each other forgetting the bigger picture and what is the bigger picture? it is addressing the challenges of the people on the ground. This is what seems to be the core of what happens in this particular House, that has not changed and it cannot change ...

If we want to change and address the challenges that the people face, and I'm not in agreement with hon Mbhele that, crime is about policing. You need to look at the contributing factors to crime, which is what you are forgetting.

You and your party are responsible, and are contributors to the challenges when we talk of gangsterism in this particular province. Visit clinics, hospitals, and where people stay in order to see the housing challenges they are faced with.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 156

Look at the challenges of water and sanitation, you should have done ..., you have the power and the resources but what you choose to do you do, you do it for the benefit of rich and leave the poor. Therefore you must take responsibility for that, and you should work with others to create a better environment for the people.

You choose not to do that because you spend ... and let me tell you something, some of you can contribute meaningfully but you choose not to do that, because all you want is power, control and the resources. All of you are corrupt.

Ms B N DAMBUZA: Hon Chairperson, Members of Cabinet, Deputy Ministers, hon members, under the apartheid regime with its Bantustan of string, the main objective of the Department of Home Affairs was to control black people and deny them their citizenship, identity, dignity and freedom of movement, amongst other injustices.

The National Democratic Revolution seeks to ensure that every South African, especially the poor, experiences an improved quality of life. It seeks to build a developmental state

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 157

shared by the history and socio-economic dynamics of South Africa. A developmental state is unable to meet its essential goal without detailed and secured identification system that incorporates both citizens and non-citizens who live, work and/or study within borders. The identification system is crucial to a range of social, economic and cultural activities, and ensures that the state is empowered to organise itself, plan the future and protect its citizens.

The mandate of the Department of Home Affairs is derived from the Constitution and amongst its purpose, is to efficiently determine and safe guard the identity and status of citizens. It is important to acknowledge that the Department of Home Affairs offers a multitude of services to the citizens of South Africa as well as foreigners who wish to visit work or stay in South Africa.

The department services are divided into two broad categories which is Civic and Immigration Services. The ANC 53rd National Conference noted that the presence of undocumented migrants in the republic poses both an economic and security threat to the country and therefore resolves that Home Affairs should take a

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 158

lead in boarder management as a department which is seized with immigration issues. The creation of decent work depends on trade and tourism and the flow of skills and knowledge all of which is impossible without movement of people.

A better and safer life for all South Africans is only possible if we are integrated in the global community and if we develop together with our regime. However, it is important to register that the ANC and the masses of our people have always stood against racism and embraced internationalism and a sense of belonging to humanity. Notwithstanding that government has a responsibility to defend the state and the people of South Africa's sovereignty.

In order to strengthen our boarder control, the Boarder Management Authority that is to be established, will assist in controlling and stopping illegal migrants from getting into South Africa. Whilst the current system of having a multi departmental boarder control, it is recommended that collaboration amongst sector departments is to be strengthened.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 159

The performance of the department during 2017-18 on Civic Services, the department managed to register 772 000 births during the period under review within 30 days against the 750 000 that was targeted. The department also managed to issue 2,8 million smart ID cards to the citizens aged 16 years and older. On the immigration performance, 98% of temporary residents permit adjudicated within 8 weeks for application processed within the Republic of South Africa, including the skills business permits and general work against a target of 85%. I think ...

IsiXhosa:

... loo nto kufuneka ukuba siyincome kuba kuyabonakala ukuba kuyasetyenzwa kweli sebe akuhlalwanga nje.

English:

The interim biometric solution is currently at operation at OR Tambo International Airport, Cape Town and King Shaka International Airport and Lanseria International Airport.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 160

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order hon member! I am sure you are still dealing with immigration within the broader topic that we are discussing on peace and development.

Ms B N DAMBUZA: Yes it is.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Okay

Ms B N DAMBUZA: The Department of Home Affairs also took several initiatives to ensure and streamline the management processing and adjudication of asylum seekers. These included extensive upgrading of software, hardware processes, filling system, security, cue management, as well as infrastructure at the Desmond Tutu Refugee Reception Offices. This allowed the Department of Home Affairs to close the Tshwane Interim Refugee Reception Office at the show ground and merge with the newly revamped Desmond Tutu Refugee Reception Office.

The Department of Home Affairs has introduced an offsite interpretation service that allow for central interpretation centre. This minimises interaction between interpreters, clients and staff and allows for a digital recording of all

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 161

interpretations. In an effort to streamline and support the client experience, an Automated Booking Terminal which is integrated with National Immigration Information System was introduced.

In ensuring legal movement of travellers within the Southern African Development Community, SADC, the government implemented the Lesotho special permit which follows from the Lesotho special dispensation [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order! Order! Hon Dambuza, can you take you seat? What is the point of order hon member?

Ms N V MENTE: Rule 68

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Yes ma'am

Ms N V MENTE: I don't think the member got the right speech. We are not cleaning the House of Malusi Gigaba here; we are busy with peace and stability. [Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 162

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order hon member!

Ms N V MENTE: can we do peace and stability please.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order hon member! Home Affairs is part of the security cluster that is why I asked the member whether she is still within the broader topic.

Thank you very much.

IsiZulu:

Nk B N DAMBUZA: Injalo Sihlalo.

English:

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): I am sure she will be coming closer to summarising her debate. Can you please proceed hon member?

Ms B N DAMBUZA: Chairperson, the Department of Defence and Military Veterans ... [Interjections.]

IsiZulu:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 163

Ms M S KHAWULA: Kwenzakalani lapho kuye weSihlalo, uyasiphazamisa, uzodlala ngathi la....

English:

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order hon member! Can you please take a seat? Order!

Ms B N DAMBUZA: ... people of South Africa in accordance with the Constitution and principles of international law.

[Interjections.] The department had planned to support 4 500 military veterans and their dependants in 2017-18 financial year, however to date, it has supported 7 712 in basic and 2 046 in tertiary. These numbers have increased considerably compared to the department's prediction due to the changing socio-economic conditions of the military veterans and the increased awareness amongst military veterans about the benefits.

Considering the socio economic conditions of the triple challenge of poverty in equality and unemployment which impacts greatly on military veterans, a Ministerial intervention established a programme in 2017 financial year.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 164

The department assisted 2 832 military veterans with this support at an expenditure of R25,8 million.

The department has embarked on a capacity building programme through the Military Skilled Development System and the University Reserve Training Programme. This year, 1 552 recruits, reported for duty for the Military Skilled Development System, MSDE programme which is the department's contribution to job creation and poverty alleviation.

In successful completion of basic military training, the 2017 intake of Military Skilled Development System will undergo further training, particularly in mastering range from fire and emergency services through the chefs and other support functions. [Time expired.]

Mr N L S KWANKWA: House Chair, last week, the President launched the National Anti-Gang Strategy. While we welcome the initiative, we have not been told of the key weaknesses in our policing system that has allowed this type of crime to increase, particularly in this part of the country.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 165

Notwithstanding what the President alluded to in his speech, there is an urgent need to go deeper to find the real cause of this phenomenon. We cannot hope to develop and rectify any issues affecting peace and stability if we cannot constructively recognise our shortcomings.

The UDM would, consistent with its policy of safety and stability, agree that our streets must be taken back to the law abiding citizen. However, peace and stability requires and demand a consolidated effort to understand and respond to poverty, chronic unemployment, unabated corruption and all the other social ills that are destroying South Africa's social fabric. Any attempt to try and create peace and stability without addressing these problems would be futile.

This week the Portfolio Committee on Police is focusing on the rural crime. This is one area to which we must give urgent attention. Many serious crimes are committed in the rural hinterland and due to the nature of these areas, as well as the poor service delivery, these crimes are often not reported and thus do not feature on any agenda as things that we need to tackle.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 166

Also important, political killings remain a disturbing characteristic of our political landscape. Gravitating towards the national and provincial elections, this phenomenon is threatening to be on the rise, and could thus be a possible threat to free and fair elections.

Earlier this month, the Acting Director for Community Service in the uMvoti Local Municipality, Thobani Ndaba was gunned down in his office at work by an as yet unknown man. This murder is a direct attack on the law in this country. Ndaba's killing comes a week after the house of Ward 12 councillor Nancy Jili in the uBuhlebezwe Local Municipality, again in KZN, was burnt to the ground.

All of these issues, in some or other way, affect our country and its people's peace and stability.

I once said something very important. I said, even us here ... there's a tendency among some or many of us to conduct ourselves less according to national interests, and more according to vote maximisation at all costs, and mostly according to the primitive doctrine that might is right.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 167

Unfortunately, when we behave like that we expect society to behave differently, and yet we leaders are failing to show leadership on many issues, and at times even deciding not to take a partisan approach to challenges that face our nation. Thank you.

Adv A de W ALBERTS: Chairperson, let me start off by saying we should not be having this debate in the first place. The Constitution weighs upon us in the preamble to ensure peace, stability and to respond to the needs of our people so that we "improve the quality of life of all citizens and free the potential of each person."

The need for this debate is proof that we are far from that objective.

Afrikaans:

In werklikheid beweeg ons al hoe verder weg van vrede en stabiliteit en die nood van die mense van die land word lankal nie meer raakgesien nie. Ons lewe eerder in 'n samelewing waar elkeen kyk hoeveel voordeel hy of sy uit die stelsel kan kry ten koste van die ander. Hierdie self-destruktiewe houding wat

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 168

na alle lae van die samelewing deurgesyfer het val natuurlik nie uit die lug nie.

English:

So, this brings us to the question, where does this attitude of entitlement and selfishness come from? What moral frame provides a license for theft, corruption, self-enrichment, murder and mayhem? For those are surely the defining features of our country now. It is how the world views us, and is even the point of view of our many African neighbours.

These bad fruits all stem from immoral leadership that sets the tone and example in society. The ANC has been looting the coffers of the state since the day they came to power by way of cadre deployment and broad-based black economic empowerment, BBBEE, amongst others.

Poor policy choices have aggravated the problem to the point where the country is now facing a fiscal cliff and economic implosion. This country has almost more unemployed adults than those employed, while the rest of the developing world is expanding. How is this possible?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 169

It was all made possible by the ANC who is now so intellectually blank that it follows the hollow noises of a 6% party. It boggles the mind that the ANC cannot formulate a coherent and evidenced-based policy position without looking at what the EFF is doing. It is the blind leading the blind and pulling this country into the hell of Venezuela where people are now eating their pets to stay alive!

Afrikaans:

Ten einde die aandag af te lei van onwerkbare beleid wend beide die ANC en EFF hulle tot rasse-polarisasie. Veral die onverantwoordelike uitsprake van die EFF teen wittes en ander minderhede het nou uiteindelik gelei tot aanranding in die Parlement self.

Die vraag is hoe lank voor daardie gedrag oorspoel na die breër gemeenskap?

English:

It is clear that we can respond to the needs of all people in this country but the prerequisite for that is the effective implementation of pro-growth economic policy. Unfortunately,

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 170

it is not possible at this stage due to the obstructive and destructive nature of the ANC and the EFF.

So, the message is clear: either change your ways or get out of the way of South Africans to improve the quality of their lives. Thank you.

Ms D CARTER: Chairperson, this subject – Through peace and stability: responding to the needs of our people – appears to put the horse before the cart. It confuses cause and effect. I put it to you that it should read: responding to the needs of our people will create peace and stability. Or, put another way: meeting the needs of our people will create social harmony and cohesion as a nation.

The fact is that it is when government fails to deliver, that society becomes restless and our cohesion as a nation frays at the edges.

The Congress of the People agrees with the view of political commentator Lukhona Mnguni who contends that the principle agent for social cohesion is government.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 171

In our national context, our Constitution represents our national compact – our social contract. It sets out our vision of a transformed society, one in which the divisions of our past are healed; a society in which democratic values, social justice and fundamental human rights, prevail; a united society in which the quality of life of all is improving and the potential of each persons is freed.

As citizens we elect representatives to Parliament, provincial legislatures and municipal councils, who, in turn, appoint executives to lead government. We vest in our representatives and executives our trust and the power and authority to act for the betterment of all and the country as a whole.

It is government that is given the ability to collect revenue, propose policy and make laws, disburse resources and policies and drive socioeconomic transformation and the attainment of a better life for all – not the citizens. It is government.

It is no co-incidence that the High Level Panel report argues that social cohesion and nation-building can be encouraged through the progressive realisation of socioeconomic rights

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 172

for all. The report points to failures by our legislature and the executive – our government – as a reason for fraying social cohesion.

The principle agent for peace and stability and social cohesion is government, and ours is failing.

It is also members of this Parliament.

During election desperation, it was members of this Parliament who played the race card in 2014.

To South Africans I want to say, be the change you want to see. Have mutual respect for one another and respect everyone, for South Africa belongs to all who live in it. Do not allow politicians to divide our rainbow nation. Thank you. [Time expired.]

Mr F BEUKMAN: House Chairperson, hon members and fellow South Africans, the 2017 Strategy and Tactics document of the ANC, as adopted by the 54th conference, states that safety and security is a human right that society needs to pursue as a

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 173

united force. This requires continuing improvement in the capacity of the state. I quote:

Critically, for state agencies to meet their objectives, they should enjoy popular legitimacy which, in turn, would ensure that they command a sense of authority among the broader public.

The ANC accepted the challenge in 1994 to build a society where all are treated with respect and dignity, where no one is exploited and abused, and everyone feels safe in their homes and on the streets.

We are committed to the fight against crime and will do everything possible to protect our people, especially against violent crime and contact crime. Crime is unacceptably high and far too many people are assaulted, raped, murdered and robbed.

The ANC will work tirelessly to ensure that our police service respond to emerging crime trends, be more effective and professional in the execution of their duties, earn the trust

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 174

of communities and build partnerships with our people in villages, towns, cities, rural areas and the farms, wherever they are.

In 1994, the democratic government highlighted the inappropriateness of apartheid policing methods and introduced a process towards community and civilian policing.

Legitimacy and fit for purpose necessitates ongoing community and police co-operation as key in the collective response to deal with safety and security challenges. House Chairperson, that is the quantitative difference between our approach and the approach that we heard from the left side this afternoon.

The approach of the ANC is based on the principle that the fight against crime is not just the responsibility of the state - every community and every one of us have to share the responsibility to build a safer country. We must, as a given, unite against those in our midst who commits crime, protect each other, and work together to address all the causes of crime.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 175

Our approach to policing has been to involve the community in every way possible through partnerships, education and police station accountability. We acknowledge that much more can be done to improve the functioning of community police forums and the roll out of community safety forums in our municipalities to strengthen co-ordination and resource sharing.

More work should be done to strengthen our reservist resources within the South African Police Service, and the development of street committees, community patrollers, Bambanani's, local business, farmworkers committees and Farm Watch as partners to strengthen community participation.

A key to peace and stability is the safety of our women and children. The ANC believes that South Africans need to expose the abuse of women and children, and to encourage people to report these crimes. More and more cases have been reported to the police and the media.

The Family Violence, Child Protection and Sexual Offences Unit of the SAPS should be at the forefront to deal with crime reported against women and children. Improved detection rates

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 176

for crimes against women and children and the strict implementation of the Domestic Violence Act by the relevant departments is non-negotiable.

The establishment of victim support centres at many police stations are a reality today. The ANC supports the plans for more shelters to be build and the roll out of focussed victim support programmes to stop femicide.

The police service has doubled in size to deal with crime, police stations and satellite stations have been built in rural and urban settings, and special units have been set up.

The safety of our people is of primary importance to the ANC. Today, more than 11% of the national budget is allocated to the SAPS - more than R92 billion. The ANC supports the development of a professional police service with the specialised units needed to combat crime. This includes cyber and IT capacity, forensic capacity, and technology as force multiplier.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 177

The importance of a human rights-centred approach to policing and mechanism to strengthen civilian oversight is underscored by the establishment of oversight institutions like the Independent Police Investigative Directorate, IPID, the Office of the Directorate for Priority Crime Investigation, DPCI, and the Civilian Secretariat for Police Service, CSPS.

The President of the Republic, Hon Cyril Ramaphosa highlighted the importance of peace and stability in the state of the nation address, 2018, and how should be responded to the needs of the people.

The President noted that fighting crime is an apex priority of government. The President said that the police will increase visibility based on the successes achieved during the safer festive season deployment.

The President further announced that the police will utilise specialised capabilities, including the Tactical Response Team, TRT, and National Intervention Units, NIUs, to assist the visible policing division in addressing problematic high

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 178

crime areas. We have seen that in the last nine months being rolled out.

The President highlighted the need for communities to build stronger partnerships with the police in the fight against crime and to ensure safer communities. Very importantly, the President indicated that other measures to fight crime nationally will include the establishment of more specialised units, focusing on drugs, taxi violence, firearms, and the enhanced utilisation of investigative aids such as forensic leads.

We have seen in 2018 that the ANC government has been resolute to strengthen the leadership and capability of the SAPS by, for instance, the appointment of a new head for the DPCI, crime intelligence, the arrest of high-ranking police officers allegedly involved in corruption and tender manipulation; the establishment of a multiagency task team, including the Hawks, to investigate the Steinhoff and VBS Mutual Bank matters, and also the implementation of an effective multipronged strategy to deal with cash-in-transit heists and organised crime syndicates.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 179

Currently, the SAPS Act of 1995 and the National Crime Prevention Strategy is under review to ensure that government respond effectively to a new environment and to ensure peace and stability in our country.

The ANC believes that the recommendations of the National Development Plan, NDP, on policing and the establishment of a National Policing Board that would set the standards for recruiting, selecting, appointing and promoting police officials and police officers is an important agenda point for the future. The policing board will also develop a code of ethics and analyse the professional standing of policing based on international norms and standards.

The ANC wants the best of our young people to join the SAPS with the annual recruitment intakes and to encourage matriculants and graduates to join the police service as a first choice career to contribution to peace and stability.

I want to close with a quote by President Mandela:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 180

Now is the time to unite and deal crime and violence a vital blow. Now is the time to make South Africa a safe place for its entire people, for investors and for our visitors. Now is the time.

I thank you.

Mr M H HOUSEN: Hon Chairperson, South Africa's declining growth, uncontrolled migration and a growing unemployment rate is a perfect recipe for the sporadic outbreak of xenophobic violence that we have seen in the country over the last few years. Since the first outbreak, very little has changed and indications are clear that more outbreaks of violence will emerge in our communities very soon. This is an indication of built up frustration over the last ten years by communities who have lost confidence in government's ability to control the movement of foreigners in and out of our country, in a manner that is fair and one contributes to the growth of the economy.

This is why communities take the law into their own hands.

Porous borders, corruption and inefficiencies at ports of

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 181

entries are the main contributing factors. This uncontrolled inflow of foreign nationals into the country contributes to the levels of growing frustration in communities, especially those with high unemployment rates. Another contributing factor is government's inability to reduce the high number of undocumented immigrants already in the country. This is largely because South Africa only has about 700 immigration inspectors employed by the Home Affairs department.

There are several reports of organised crime syndicates operating within the country, many of whom are undocumented foreign nationals. During my recent oversight visit to the Beitbridge border I witnessed first hand, large tracts of unfenced land where people simply walk or drive into the country undetected. I also observed at the port of entry, hundreds of people who try to enter the country legally, but have to spend an entire day in the queue because only two out of the 12 computers were operational on that day. Many more can walk freely across the border, just 1km away from the port of entry to avoid the queues. This is an attractive incentive for criminal elements.

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 182

Studies conducted indicate that there are an estimated five million undocumented immigrants in the country and the SA Police Service believes that this figure could be up to 11 million. When one considers the average cost of about R1 200 per person in deportation costs, Home Affairs will have to spend a few years of their annual budget on deportation costs to reduce this number. But even this approach is not a lasting solution because within hours of being deported, many simply walk across the border again without any detection. Unless urgent measures are adopted to overhaul border management in South Africa and secure our borders, we will continue to find a situation where communities take the law into their own hands and further outbreaks of xenophobic violence will continue to emerge.

This is why the DA has offered a number of practical policy proposals to the former Minister of Home Affairs to bring some semblance of control in migration. We thank God he's gone. Our plan is simple and it is very practical if only the ANC government will listen. Capacitate the police and Defence Force to secure our borders. Redirect the funds that you are spending to from the protecting the ANC politicians and

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 183

protect our borders. Introducing efficiency and processing travellers within minutes will make our ports of entry more attractive than the holes in the fence. Simply put, a DA government will make it as easy as possible for people to enter the country legally and as difficult as possible for people to enter illegally.

These interventions will turn an obstacle into an opportunity, create jobs and grow the economy. If citizens in South Africa want to see a change in immigration in South Africa, they really have only one option, change your government. Thank you very much. [Applause.]

Mr M A PLOUAMMA: Hon House Chair and hon members, the real threat to the stability of this country is a disparate ANC - the ANC that resorts to populism which cannot distinguish itself from the state. Since they know that they are going to be voted out in 2019, I will not be surprised if most Ministers cannot sleep without drinking sleeping pills or having nightmares of living without blue lights.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 184

Hon members, can we have peace and stability when some fake messiahs preach whiteness and blackness? When are we going to learn that we need each other? We are all South Africans. Why do we allow Hitlerisation, bigotry and populism to flourish? We must desist from encouraging the entrenchment of the bearers of the past. We all know now that those leaders who preach division are looters of note. The VBS Mutual Bank and state capture are examples. They are so ruthless and heartless. They have become so disparate that they are now applying the politics of racism.

The real enemy of stability and peace is poverty, lack of opportunities, lack of employment and self-enrichment. We must unite against these negative forces, and we must be the true servants of our people. My stomach first and others' later must stop. We must serve our people diligently, and then we will have a true peace and stability. I thank you.

Sepedi:

Moh M R M MOTHAPO: Ntate Plouamma, waAgang SA, a re ye ke go felegetše Senwabarwana re ye go bula molato wa bahlakodi bao ba gago. Ebile o re ANC ke mokgatlo wo o gakanegilego. Ke

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 185

manyami ka gore lena le le ba babedi fela go mokgatlo ke le kwela bohloko gore le tla boa naa? O tla boa naa?

English:

Hon Chairperson, in response to today's subject of discussion, "Through peace and stability - responding to the needs of our people." we the ANC understand the importance of justice and that there can be no peace and stability without access to justice. The concept of access to justice is understood in terms of the legal rights processes and procedures. It denotes the situation where state legal systems are organised to ensure that every person is able to invoke the legal processes for legal redress, irrespective of social or economic capacity and that every person should receive a just and fair treatment within the legal system.

Chairperson, the ANC inherited a dysfunctional state which was not representative of the aspirations of the people of South Africa and provided no access to justice to the indigent. The National Development Plan correctly identified that apartheid left South Africa fragmented and with unrepresentative

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 186

institutions designed to concentrate resources on only a small section of the population.

It also identified that poorly located and inadequate infrastructure limits social inclusion and faster economic growth and those spatial challenges continue to marginalise the poor. The concerted efforts by the ANC-led government have been to ensure that not only basic services are delivered to even remote areas, but also justice. The pre-1994 court system did not place access to justice and responsive service delivery at the heart of its values. The ANC-led government has led the reorientation of courts into a service culture accompanied by a sound performance management system. Through the efforts of the ANC, we have rationalised the system of justice within the unification of the 11 apartheid based systems of justice.

The introduction of the Constitutional Court, the various labour courts, the Land Claims Court, the maintenance and small court, the Equality Court and other specialised judicial institutions. The judiciary has been transformed and that we have a sizeable number of judges at the Constitutional Court

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 187

and various divisions of the High Court who were previously excluded.

Hon Chairperson, as we speak now Mandisa Muriel Lindelwa Maya is the first female President of the Supreme Court of Appeal in the history of South Africa. This could only be achieved through the ANC progressive policies. [Applause.]

Hon Chairperson, let me respond to the hon Z N Mbhele, who said that the ANC is promoting cadre deployment.

[Interjections.]

Hon members, do you remember the story of Marietta Oucamp?

[Interjections.] Ask the Mayor of Tshwane, Msimanga, he knows that very well about cadre deployment.

On the issue of gang-violence, you said it took us seven years to address the issue. How can we respond to that as you are busy as the DA holding meetings with gang leaders here in the Western Cape? How do you expect us to respond to that? We agree with you that the Defence Force is under-resourced; however, our SA National Defence Force is doing much with the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 188

little resources. It has been regarded as the best peacekeepers in the continent. Only that happened under the ANC-led government. [Applause.]

The hon Yako of the EFF, I fully agree with you about the issue of the return of the land to our people is very, very critical. It is a very emotive one. You are aware that the Constitutional Review Committee's processes are unfolding and the dispossession of our land as I have alluded to is very emotive. Hence the ANC in its 54th National Conference took a resolution on the issue of land expropriation without compensation. [Applause.]

[Interjections.]

We are in South Africa and not in Venezuela. [Interjections.]

With regards to the issue of protests, it is a constitutional right which is enshrined in the Constitution, but it should be done within the ambit of laws. [Interjections.] It needs to be regulated. You break the law, you face the law. That is the bottom line.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 189

The hon Ngwezi of the IFP, the same applies to you, in relation to the issue of protests. Yes, it is the democratic right and freedom of speech is promoted. However, the same applies that should happen within the ambit of the law.

[Interjections.]

Yes, crime and in particular murder has increased. However, hon Ngwezi, you are aware that what has been transpiring these days especially on the issue of femicide and the police have played a very critical role in making sure that the suspects are being arrested. The conviction rate in that regard has been very high. Thanks to the police.

The hon Shaik Emam of the NFP, thank you so much for your progressive inputs and for exposing the hypocrisy of the DA. Thank you so much.

The hon Kwankwa of the UDM, the ANC-led government has the National Rural Safety Strategy, whereby rural crime is a priority. You may be laughing, but you know very well.

[Interjections.] It is a priority. It is government's view

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 190

that the safety and security of the rural community in South Africa is a priory and I emphasize that.

The hon Alberts of the FFP or minus, you say the ANC is looting state coffers and you allege that we are being led by a 6% party by implication referring to the EFF. We are not led by the EFF. We are a 62,5% party. [Interjections.] That is what we got. Let me remind you, we took a resolution at Nasrec relating to the land. So, there is no way we can be led by the EFF. That is an ANC resolution, whether you like it or not! It is an ANC resolution!

The hon Carter ... [Interjections.]

It does not matter; you cannot understand my language, as much as I am doing you a favour! [Interjections.]

The land issue ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Order hon members!

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 191

Ms M R M MOTHAPO: ... hon Carter, with due respect, I hope you are here; the land issue is a very emotive issue. As the ANC as long as our people are excluded from owning or dispossessed of their land, there is no way we can talk of justice without our people having a right or having their land back. Hence, as the ANC, we fully support this process which is unfolding and which is our initiative, by the way.

The hon Hoosen, Parliament is busy finalising the immigration laws in terms of Border Management Authority. So, we are aware that some of our borders are porous, but the issue is being attended to.

The hon Plouamma, fortunately I addressed you in the language you know and the one you will understand better. I am more than prepared to accompany you to the nearest police station and open a case for the so-called looters. I am more than prepared to do so.

So, let me quote our icon Tata Nelson Mandela when he said, "For every women and girl violently attacked, we reduce our

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 192

humanity. For every woman forced into unprotected sex because men demand this, we destroy dignity and pride.”

Having identified the patriarchal fibre in our society, the need to eradicate gender discrimination and build a nonsexist and prosperous society, we promise to protect the rights of children and place special emphasis to the realisation of women’s emancipation.

The ANC-led government established Sexual Offences Courts. In 2007, we enacted the Criminal Law Sexual Offences and Related Matters Amendment Act 32 of 2007 to protect communities against rape and other sexual related crimes. The Act provides protection to victims especially women, children and people living with mental disabilities that have been raped or have been victims of sexual crimes and offences.

The Justice Ministerial Task Team correctly identified that the impact of sexual abuse on victims especially children often has far-reaching physical, emotional, psychological and developmental effects. The insensitive and hostile treatment of victims in the criminal justice system cause secondary

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 193

traumatisation, which result in victims suffering from further trauma and consequently withdrawing from the system. The Sexual Offences Courts are part of the efforts of the ANC in ensuring the protection of women and other vulnerable groups.

There are various dedicated victim support services and one stop centres like the National Prosecuting Authority's Thuthuzela Care Centre. On the National Prosecuting Authority hon members, you will be aware that the DA is eager to control the National Prosecuting Authority.

Afrikaans:

Dit sal die dag wees! Dit sal nie gebeur nie. Baie dankie.

[Applous.]

Ms C KING: Chairperson, the 1994 was an important year for South Africa. It ushered in a democratic society committed to the eradication of racism, sexism and all forms of discrimination. It brought political change that promised the building of a rainbow nation, committed to the ideals of equity and redress.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 194

Then 24 years on, the question is raised about how far our country has come in addressing equity and inequality in education, following on the ideals of Nelson Mandela. Just like the miners in Marikana, and a 144 service delivery protests which took place this year alone; students and workers have made it clear that they want change and they are tiered of waiting on this government. It is doubtful though that such structural change can be brought about by politics of the crowd.

The ANC government's underspending of the education infrastructure grant and the lackadaisical approach to infrastructure development at schools, directly led to the deaths of Lumka Mkhethwa in Bizana and Michel Komape, for which the North West education department refused to take responsibility, who died inhumanely when they fell into pit latrine toilets.

This is just the tip of the iceberg; the Eastern Cape department of education cannot even give proper sanitation to 1 598 school. And the Department of Basic Education reach to 18 242 second chance matric learners illustrate that more

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 195

needs to be done to address the learner throughput rate in South Africa.

Our history alone is not the only reason why our education system is failing. Constant shifts in educational curriculum, lack of monitoring and evaluation systems, no clear policy direction, union interference, sex and cash for jobs and the absence of leadership are eating away at the seams of our eroding education system. The ultimate victims of this crime to humanity is our children!

Why is it then that out of nine provincial education departments, the Western Cape education department always remains a benchmark for others to follow? Policy certainty, clear vision and leadership, proper monitoring and control measures, integrated education system, and a workforce that has the necessary skills to ensure quality services that caters to the needs and abilities of learners are delivered.

It is therefore no doubt that a learner educated in the Western Cape has a better chance of employment, seeing that

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 196

the western Cape created 75% of the jobs in South Africa in the past year.

Now, that is what you call service to our people! [Applause.]

The fixation of the education department to have talk shops in luxurious hotels; and the successes and failures of the education system, indicate that our children's rights die one PowerPoint at a time. In this context, one can't but think that the appeals that are premised on the ANC government being willing to act in the best interest of the learners, are falling on deaf ears. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon member, will you just take a seat. Why are you rising hon Deputy Minister?

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF FINANCE: House Chairperson, in the member's enthusiastic pursuit about 75% jobs, can she take a question?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Are you prepared to take a question, hon member?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 197

Ms C KING: I am not prepared to take a question because ...
[Inaudible.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): The member is not prepared to take a question. Please conclude your speech.

Ms C KING: Listen carefully. So, let me try a more utilitarian argument: To enhance peace and citizenship curriculum models have to provide for more flexible pathways to develop learner's abilities and talents, improve efficiency in provision of education and reduction of waste.

Unless young people's skills are developed for work, they will ultimately be excluded from active participation in society and when educational delivery is characterised with exclusion and inequalities, it can exacerbate conflict. [Interjections.]

The ANC and the EFF should stop the race divide and work for one South African ... [Time expired.] [Applause.]

Mr M S MOTIMELE: Chairperson, hon members, you remember when I was talking earlier on; I said those who would talk after me

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 198

will agree with me and give details. That is exactly what happened and we thank everybody who participated. The ANC colleagues' comrades will always agree with me because I am putting the ANC position here.

The opposition did agree though their agreement in details was put in the form of complaints and lamentations, and what was short was to applause the ANC for the strides that it has taken to create peace and stability. I will do that for you; and of course ...

Sepedi:

... gwa no ba le ditšiebadimo tša go tšwa go Agang SA tša gore ANC e ka se ke ya tla ya buša ka 2019. ANC e tlile go buša ka 2019, Mna Tlouamma, le hlokomele ... [Nako e fedile.]

Debate concluded.

THE DEATH OF FORMER FREE STATE MPL AND FREEDOM FIGHTER SOLOMON

MOSALA SEFOTLHELO

(Draft Resolution)

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 199

Ms D D RAPHUTI: Chairperson, the African National Congress
moves without notice:

That the House -

- (1) notes with sadness the death of former Free State
Legislature member and freedom fighter Solomon Mosala
Andy Sefotlhelo on Thursday 1st November 2018 after a
long illness;
- (2) understands that under the command of the late Chris
Hani, Sefotlhelo was tasked to establish the first ANC
underground area political committee in the then Orange
Free State;
- (3) further understands that he was arrested in 1981 and
sentenced to five years on Robben Island for
underground uMkhonto we Sizwe activities;
- (4) recalls that he was appointed the first provincial
coordinator of the South African Council of Churches in

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 200

the Orange Free State upon his release from prison in 1986;

- (5) remembers that he was also a founding member and served as a National Executive Committee member of the South African Youth Congress, SAYCO, which later became the African National Congress Youth League;
- (6) believes that comrade Andy was a principled man who served ANC with integrity in various positions and upheld the Batho Pele principle; and
- (7) conveys condolences to the family of comrade Solomon Sefotlhelo.

ESSENTIAL SERVICES COMMITTEE TO DESIGNATE THE BOARDING SCHOOL SERVICES

(Draft Resolution)

Ms N I TARABELLA MARCHESI: Chairperson, I hereby move on behalf of the DA without notice:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 201

That this House -

- (1) notes the decision by the essential services committee to designate the boarding school services of house, parents, sanatorium staff and staff dispensing medicines and security as essential services;
- (2) applauds the committee for taking this step to safeguard boarding school learners in the face of strong oppositions from unions;
- (3) urges the Minister of the Department of Basic Education to ensure that this designation give rise to a minimum service level agreement as soon as possible;
- (4) further urges the Minister to negotiate minimum service level agreement for other services not designated as essential by the committee, but that are nonetheless vital to ensuring learner safety, such as the supervision of learners; and

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 202

- (5) calls upon all stakeholders to place the health and wellbeing of South African Learners first and ensure that children are free to learn in a safe environment.

PREVENTION OF EFF MEMBERS TO CAMPAIGN IN WITTENBERG CAPE TOWN

(Draft Resolution)

Mr N V MENTE: Chairperson, I hereby rise on behalf of the Economic Freedom Fighters without notice:

That the House -

- (1) notes that on Saturday 10 November 2018, members of the EFF were prevented from voters in the Wittenberg region of the Western Cape in preparation for a by-election;
- (2) further notes that Mr du Toit is a white DA farmer and member on Kromfontein Farm;

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 203

- (3) understands that this two stations account for 51% of all registered voters in the ward;
- (4) despites the EFF having given notice of its intentions to come and talk to farm workers and despite the DA having campaigned already on the farm during the week, Mr du Toit attempted to intimidate members of the EFF with guns and dogs and to prevent them from entering the farm, while the EFF were eventually allowed on the property
- (5) understands that preventing parties form talking to voters anywhere in South Africa is illegal, but this behaviour is common in the farms where white farmers prevent farm workers from either voting or when they vote they are threatened to vote the DA because if they don't they get chased away and lose their job;
- (6) acknowledges that the EFF has reported the matter to the police and the Independent Electoral Commission, IEC; and

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 204

- (7) further warn Mr Du Toit and all other racist white farmers for this illegal conduct and an undemocratic behaviour.

**CONGATULATING THE POLICE FOR ARRESTING NINE SUSPECTS FOR THE
MURDER OF AHMED KATHRADA'S FAMILY MEMBERS**

(Draft Resolution)

Ms M P MMOLA: Chairperson, the ANC moves without notice:

That the House -

- (1) congratulates the North West police for swiftly arresting nine men in connection with the murders of two of Ahmed Kathrada's relatives in Schweizer-Reneke;
- (2) notes that the arrests come after Kathrada's nephew Yunus Kathrada, age 65, and his son Ahmed, age 28, were killed at their home in the small North West town;

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 205

- (3) understands that the police had also confiscated a firearm and two vehicles believed to have been used during the murders;
- (4) welcomes the commitment that this kind of police swiftness in arresting crime suspects is extended to victims of all serious crimes in this country; and
- (5) commends the law enforcement agencies for the sterling work in swiftly apprehending the suspects

WORLD DIABETES AWARENESS DAY

(Draft Resolution)

Mr N SINGH: Chairperson, this is an appropriate motion for a late night sitting. I hereby move without notice on behalf of the IFP:

That the House -

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 206

- (1) notes that tomorrow, 14 November 2018, will mark World Diabetes Awareness Day;
- (2) further notes that World Diabetes Day seeks to raise awareness of the serious medical condition, that millions of people in the world live with every day;
- (3) understands that 7% of adults in South Africa between the ages of 21 and 79, which translates to 3,85 million South Africans suffer from diabetes, but many more remain undiagnosed;
- (4) recognises that according to StatsSA, diabetes became the second most common natural cause of death in 2016; and;
- (5) further recognises that diabetic epidemic costs over 2500 leg amputations in KwaZulu-Natal alone in one year;
- (6) therefore, calls on South Africans to educate themselves about the signs and risk of diabetes, to get

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 207

themselves tested and treated so that they take proactive steps to avoid becoming another causality of this serious but treatable disease. I so move.

Agreed to.

MURDER OF LINDELWA BOWES

(Draft Resolution)

Prof N M KHUBISA: Chairperson, I hereby move without notice on behalf of the NFP:

That the House -

- (1) notes with sadness that Lindelwa Bowes, who was a matric pupil at Siyahlomula High School in Ashdown, was found murdered in a pool of blood in her room on Saturday morning, 10 November 2018;
- (2) further notes that Ms Bowes had opened a rape charge against one of the kingpins of a gang that is

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 208

terrorising the communities of Edendale, Imbali and Vulindlela township in Pietermaritzburg;

- (3) realises that her mother did not hear the gunshots or screams, and that Ms Bowes was discovered later after her room was opened;
- (4) therefore, conveys its deepest condolences to the Bowes family, relative and friends; and
- (5) calls upon the police to arrest the perpetrators of this heinous crime syndicate, and
- (6) also deal with this crime syndicate that terrorises the townships of Pietermaritzburg. I so move.

Agreed to.

**SOUTH AFRICAN STUDENTS' INVITATION TO NEW YORK TO DELIVER
THEIR TALKS AT THE TED-EDUCATION**

(Draft Resolution)

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 209

Ms L C THEKO: Chairperson, I hereby move without notice on behalf of the ANC:

That the House -

- (1) notes that two South African students, Boipelo Moagi from Roedean school and Ayanda Bokaba from Carlswald House, have been invited to New York to deliver their talks at the upcoming Technology Entertainment Design, TED-Education event from 17 to 18 November 2018;
- (2) understands that the topics of their talks are "How can we stop racism in private schools" and "How criticism affects people's confidence";
- (3) recalls that this is an initiative of the Think Ahead programme which works in partnership with schools to support them in their 21st century teaching and learning journey;
- (4) acknowledges that during the event at Technology Entertainment Design's New York headquarters,

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 210

participants will share inspiring performances, participate in hands-on workshops and attend sessions of Technology Entertainment Design talks; and

- (5) congratulates Boipelo Moagi and Ayanda Bokapa on their selection and wishes them well in their presentations in New York. Thank you.

**INKONYAMA TRUST AND ITS SOLE TRUSTEES ACCUSED OF ACTING
UNLAWFULLY AND IN VIOLATION OF THE CONSTITUTION**

(Draft Resolution)

Mr N L S KWANKWA: Chairperson, I hereby move without notice on behalf of the UDM:

That the House -

- (1) notes that on the 6 November 2018, Inkonyama Trust and its sole trustees were accused of acting unlawfully and in violation of the Constitution and hence since been served by court papers;

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 211

- (2) further notes that the accusation is about the disposition of land from female land owners and expecting them to use men as their proxies and forcing residents into 40 years lease agreements;
- (3) believes that it is the duty of this House to ensure that all human rights are protected in any process that involves land occupation;
- (4) further believes those women's rights to own land are undermined after almost two decades and a half in our democracy;
- (5) calls on all the relevant bodies and the justice system to speedily resolve this matter. I so move.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): If there are no objections, I put the motion.

AN HON MEMBER: We object Chairperson.

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 212

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): There is an objection so motion is not agreed to.

**CONCERN ABOUT POOR INFRASTRUCTURE OF LEKWA EXTENSION 8 PROJECT
IN PUMALANGA**

(Draft Resolution)

Ms A T KHANYILE: House Chair, I move without notice:

That the House -

- (1) notes that since the extension 8 project in Lekwa, Mpumalanga was started in 2015, it has been characterised with shoddy workmanship and poor quality housing;
- (2) further notes that the project has been delayed due to employees not been registered by the developer and the Labour Department;

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 213

(3) express concern about the poor infrastructure of the project, including poor sewage pipe connections, poor drainage system and poor electricity connections, which put community lives at risk;

(4) calls upon the Minister of Human Settlements to intervene to ensure completion of the project for the benefit of the community of extension 8.

[Applause.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): If there are no objections, I put the motion.

AN HON MEMBER: The EFF objects.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): The motion is not agreed to.

TRAVESTY OF SABC AND MULTICHOICE

(Draft Resolution)

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 214

Dr S S THEMBEKWAYO: Chairperson, I move without notice:

That the House -

- (1) notes the travesty of SABC and Multichoice, which the Competition Commission correctly recognised as some sort of a merger;
- (2) further notes that for many years Multichoice, as a pay television company, has retained an undue and toxic monopoly, undermined all transformation space in pay television and continues to abuse their monopoly to prevent new entrants;
- (3) acknowledges that as things stand, Multichoice is in a position to influence strategic direction of the SABC - a situation that came about because of conniving and fraudulent relationships;
- (4) realises that in the absence of ethical media, in particular journalism, with free editorial and independent policy and respect for freedom of

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 215

journalists, the SABC was supposed to be a public broadcaster that we all can expect to report news fairly, with no fear or no journalist defending politicians who lie to Parliament;

- (5) calls upon the portfolio committee to request the SABC and the Competition Commission to appear before it and get to the bottom of this.

Thank you.

Agreed to.

IRISH CHARITY WORKER MURDERED IN CAPE TOWN

(Draft Resolution)

Mr A M SEABI: Chair, I move without notice:

That the House -

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 216

- (1) notes with sadness the murder of the Irish charity worker John Curran at a high-security residential complex in the Cape Town CBD on Wednesday, 7 November 2018;
- (2) further notes that Manhattan Place, where his body was found, is opposite the Western Cape headquarters of the National Prosecuting Authority and close to several small eateries, bars and shops;
- (3) understands that the 60-year-old John Curran had recently finished a two-year contract as a director of education for Mellon Educate in South Africa;
- (4) further understands that he was a founding principal of Good Shepherd National School at Churchtown in Dublin and was also a founding member of the Irish Primary Principals Network;
- (5) recalls that he took early retirement in 2005;

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 217

(6) recognises that Mr Curran was much loved by everyone who met him and especially by the thousands of children he helped during his time with Mellon Educate in Cape Town; and

(7) conveys its condolences to his family and to all the volunteers he worked with.

Agreed to.

20 PEOPLE HOSPITALISED IN DURBAN DUE TO SALMONELLA OUTBREAK

(Draft Resolution)

Mr W B MAPHANGA: House Chair, I move without notice:

That the House -

(1) notes that at least 20 people have been hospitalised owing to the salmonella poisoning in Durban, KwaZulu-Natal as discovered on Saturday, 10 November 2018;

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 218

- (2) further notes that the outbreak started at the Old Town Italy restaurant in Umhlanga and that the restaurant's famous Hollandaise sauce - made from raw egg - is reportedly the source of the outbreak;
- (3) understands that Lancet laboratories reportedly alerted doctors in the region about cases of both children and adults;
- (4) further understands that food that has been affected includes orange juice, eggs, fresh vegetables, frozen dinners, dairy products and peanut butter based on test by the laboratories;
- (5) recalls that salmonella infection is a common bacterial disease that affects the intestinal tract, where individuals become infected most frequently through contaminated water or food;
- (6) understands that its symptoms usually include vomiting, stomach cramps and diarrhoea;

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 219

(7) urges all individuals to be knowledgeable about the symptoms of salmonella poisoning.

Agreed to.

**AUTHOR MONGANE SEROTE BAGS NATIONAL POET LAUREATE PRIZE AT
LITERARY AWARDS**

(Draft Resolution)

Ms B P MABE: Chairperson, on behalf of the ANC, I move without notice:

That the House -

(1) notes that author and poet, Mongane Wally Serote, has been honoured with the National Poet Laureate Prize at the South African Literary Awards in Pretoria on Tuesday, 6 November 2018;

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 220

- (2) understands that the event was organised to celebrate those who have contributed to South African literature;
- (3) recalls that the 64-year-old Serote has spent over four decades in the literary world;
- (4) further recalls that he published his first book titled *Yakhal'inkomo* in 1972 which went on to win the Ingrid Jonker Prize for debut poetry in English and has been scooping major awards ever since;
- (5) recognises that his writing at a very young age was inspired by the fighting spirit of his people against the country's social ills; and
- (6) congratulates Dr Mongane Wally Serote on receiving such a prestigious award.

Agreed to.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 221

(Draft Resolution)

Mr M BAGRAIM: Chairperson, on behalf of the DA, I hereby move without notice:

That the House -

- (1) notes that the high-level panel established during the fifth democratic Parliament has reviewed some of the labour legislation and found this legislation to be problematic in that it is one of the causes of enormously high unemployment in South Africa;
- (2) further notes that the panel recommended that enterprises below a certain size in terms of employees be exempted from certain regulations, including the obligation to pay the minimum wage and specific components of black economic empowerment, BEE, legislation;
- (3) understands that the panel recommended that people below a certain age, people in rural areas and those

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 222

living with disabilities be employed without the employer being required to pay the minimum wage on the same terms; and

- (4) further understands that the panel recommends the setting of a separate wage for the vulnerable in the labour market.

Agreed to.

FOUR PEOPLE KILLED BY EXPLOSION

(Draft Resolution)

Mr T S MPANZA: Chairperson, on behalf of the ANC, I move without notice:

That the House -

- (1) notes that four people were injured when a chemical factory exploded in Boksburg, Ekurhuleni on Thursday, 8 November 2018;

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 223

- (2) understands one person was in a critical condition due to facial, neck and inhalation burns, while the other three were in a serious but stable condition;
- (3) further understands that the three were taken to the Tambo Memorial and Sunshine hospitals for smoke inhalation and superficial burns;
- (4) recalls that the explosion could be seen and heard from a distance, and that some of the 210-litre containers from within the workshop were ejected through the roof;
- (5) acknowledges that the cause of the fire has not yet been determined, although it is thought that it may have been caused by a chemical reaction; and
- (6) wishes all the injured employees a speedy recovery.

Agreed to.

GOVERNMENT OFFICIALLY REOPENS TEXTILE FACTORY IN KZN

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 224

(Member's Statement)

Mr S H MBUYANE (ANC): Hon House Chair, we welcome the ANC-led government on its rational intervention in reviving a collapsed giant textile factory in Kwazulu-Natal, Glodina, one of the South Africa's largest towel manufacturing company, has resumed its operations in Hammarsdale on the outer west of Durban. The factory was officially opened on Tuesday, November 2018, a year after it closed down due to financial cash flow challenges. As part of the intervention, a multistakeholder task team comprising the Department of Economic Development, Tourism and Environmental Affairs, Trade and Investment KwaZulu-Natal, Industrial Development Corporation, IDC, and the Southern African Clothing and Textile Workers' Union, Sactwu, was established. The department played a key role in linking potential investors with Development Finance Institutions such as IDC and KwaZulu-Natal Growth Fund.

We are very grateful with the swiftness with which the government and the IDC have handled the matter in responding to the pressing economic needs of the communities on whose behalf it exists. After the completion of due diligence

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 225

process, the IDC approved a funding package of R150 million for an IDC ownership and acquire the assets from the previous ownership. Thank you, Chair. [Time expired] [Applause.]

COMMEMORATES REMEMBRANCE DAY

(Member's Statement)

Mr S J F MARAIS (DA): Hon House Chair, at the 11th hour on the 11th day of the 11th month in 1918 the guns fell silent over the battle field. It marked the signing of an armistice that ended the First World War a conflict that claimed the lives of between 15 and 19 million people. Although on Sunday the 11 of November we mark the centenary of the end of World War One. Remembrance Day is commemorated each year on this day to honour not only those who gave their lives in World War One, but all the fallen heroes from diverse nationalities, racist and religions around the globe since then.

The trauma of 1914 to 1918 for ever change due political boundaries the science of killing and the meaning of war is sadly had a profound impact on South Africa. We specifically

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 226

remember and honour all South Africans who sacrificed their lives in conflict since then so we can enjoy the opportunity to live in a free South Africa taking our place with the rest of the world. Let us always remember and honour each one of them. Let us also take a moment to consider the men and women who are serving in our armed forces today and who stand ready to defend our hard won freedom. I thank you. [Applause.]

EFF ACCUSES WARD COUNCILLOR OVER THE WATER PROBLEM

(Member's Statement)

IsiZulu:

Nk M S KHAWULA (EFF): Sihlalo weNdlu, Njenge EFF sithanda ukudlulisa ukungagculiseki kwethu ngendlela iKhansela lakuwadi 100 eThekwini eliphethe ngayo umphakathi. Leli Khansela livala amanzi afakwe nguHulumeni ngenxa yokuthi lifuna umphakathi usebenzise amanzi alethwa ngamatrakhi ngoba kuyithenda layo, kanti futhi kwayilawo matrakhi afika ebusuku abantu sebebeke izigubhu emgaqweni.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 227

Kuyimanje kuboshwe abantu ngenxa yokuthi bebelwela izidingongqangi. Leli Khansela lijaha abantu ngezibhamu, igama laleli Khansela nguMbuyiseni Mkhize we-ANC. Ezindawen ezifana nako Ngonyamane, koNtambanana, awekho nhlobo amanzi, imigqomo ihlala emgaqweni usuku lonke, okubangela ukuthi abantu bagcine bebuyela emakhaya bengawaphethe amanzi.

Lento iyinkinga enkulu ngoba amanzi ayisidingingqangi sawo wonke umuntu. Izikhulu zikaHulumeni we-ANC akeziyeke ukubeka amathenda phambili zinakekele abantu bakithi. Sihlalo, imigwaqo yakuleya ndawo ungayibona inemigodi, akulungiswa lutho futhi namapayipi abhonculiwe, nginabo ngisho nobufakazi obuyizithombe ezifakazela lokhu.

LEARNERS WITH SPECIAL NEEDS RECEIVE WORLD-CLASS TECHNOLOGY

(Member's Statement)

Ms B C NDLOVU (ANC): Hon House Chair, the ANC commends the public-private partnership between the Department of Social Development and the MTN SA Foundation, which resulted in a donation of two computer laboratories and each laboratory

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 228

fitted with 22 specially adapted computers to the Efata School for the Blind and Deaf in Mthatha in the Eastern Cape. This computer centre will assist the learners living with vision disabilities to have text-to-speech capabilities and earphones so that each learner can focus on their own work. For deaf learners, the computers have special software that will help them with their main subjects, including SA Sign Language.

The school is one of 40 schools that will be receiving computer laboratories in 2018 through the public-private partnership between the Department of Social Development and the MTN SA Foundation. The ANC is of the view that as the world evolves into a digital era; learners with special needs should not be left behind when their peers experience new technology as part of learning in schools. [Time expired.] [Applause.]

TAXI OPERATOR KILLED

(Member's Statement)

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 229

Mrs S J NKOMO (IFP): Hon House Chair, there was a report just yesterday that two unknown suspects entered the Noord Street Taxi Rank in Johannesburg central business district, CBD, and open fire killing a taxi operator and the queue marshal and leaving another three people who were wounded during this incident. It is suspected that the act of violence was related to the ongoing taxi wars in the taxi business. This is unfortunate because the taxi rank services upon thousands of people on a daily basis which includes school children and their safety is something that is paramount important to us all.

This ruthless violence is deplorable and we simply cannot continue to sit by and watch our people lose their lives recklessly in these careless attacks. The IFP calls on a thorough investigation deeper into these operations as well as to look at these attacks and for the protection of the innocent people. This simply cannot be allowed to continue. We would also like to extend our deepest condolences to the people that have lost their loved ones and we would like to wish a speedy recovery to the ones that have been injured. I thank you.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 230

POOR PERFORMANCE OF DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC WORKS

(Member's Statement)

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM (NFP): Hon House Chairperson, the NFP notes with concern the poor performance of the Department of Public Works which is the custodian of all state properties.

Department after department, including but not limited to the SAPS, the Department of Health and the Department of Education have all expressed concerns regarding this department's poor performance which has a negative impact on their performances.

The Department of Public Works does not even have a proper record of the assets of the state. Many buildings leased by different departments have been condemned by the Department of Labour, with some buildings being a health risk, fire risk, and the lifts are not in operation resulting in safety risk. Many government departments continue to be evicted, locked out, the electricity is disconnected and evicted.

The Telkom Tower building has not been completed resulting in some sections of SAPS leased premises with their leases

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 231

expiring, resulting in serious challenges at the cost of hundreds of millions of rand. The Department of Public Works is clearly in the intensive care unit, the ICU.

The parliamentary precinct, hospitals, clinics, police stations, government buildings face dire consequences as a result of the failure of the Department of Public Works to perform optimally. Billions of taxpayers' money is being wasted due to inefficiency of this department.

ANTI-GANG UNIT BUST DRUGS WORTH MORE THAN R1 MILLION

(Member's Statement)

Ms L D MESO (ANC): The ANC welcomes the sterling performance of the newly Anti-Gang Unit, which was launched recently in Cape Town, whose sting has already started to bite. Six suspects, aged between 23 and 35, were arrested in Philippi on Tuesday, 6 November 2018, in connection with drug dealing and the unlicensed possession of firearms and ammunition.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 232

This operation led to the discovery of two 9mm pistols, a 45 calibre pistol, 70 rounds of ammunition, dagga valued at R1 million and heroin with a street value of R129 950, six cellular phones and R11 550 cash. It is believed that this money was for proceeds of drug trafficking.

The successes in our fight against gangsterism in the Western Cape have been made possible by the good working relationship between the police and the communities in the Western Cape. This was demonstrated when the unit conducted a search of a residence in Oasis squatter camp after receiving a tip off from the community.

The ANC is delighted that residents in the drug-infested communities are assisting the police to make our communities drug-free, safer and secured. The ANC is making a concerned call to all communities with drugs and gangsterism problems to emulate this example by reporting acts of criminality. I thank you

THE LOW YOUTH VOTER REGISTRATION

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 233

(Member's Statement)

Mr D J KABINI (ANC): The ANC notes with concern the low numbers of registration by young voters for the 2019 General Elections as alluded to by the IEC Chief Electoral Officer at a media conference at the IEC head office in Centurion on Wednesday, 7 November 2018. Only 15,6% of eligible voters in the 18- and 19-year-old age group registered to vote, and 56,7% eligible voters in the 20- to 29-year-old age group appeared on the national voters' roll.

The ANC is delighted by the recommitment of the IEC's resolve to undertake the registration drive with the roll out of a national communication and education campaign to encourage participation of young people, with the thrust of the campaign urging young, first-time voters to register.

We thus make a clarion call to all political parties, religious formations, civil society, labour, sport bodies, youth and student formations to also join the IEC in its campaign to tackle youth apathy, especially among first-time voters. We need to encourage and persuade them to register to

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 234

vote in the final registration weekend of next year, 26-27 January 2019. I thank you

BABIES BORN IN HORRIFIC CONDITIONS IN LIMPOPO

(Member's Statement)

Ms E R WILSON (DA): It is shocking to learn that babies are being born by torch light or cell phones in the Mookgopong Health Centre in Limpopo. This is because the generator is not functioning and there are no lights in the maternity wing.

Furthermore, the suction machine was not working, the sonar and foetal monitor is dysfunctional, and not one incubator can be found. This has resulted in three babies recently being delivered in horrific conditions at the centre.

One baby, in distress, had to be rushed to the Hospital in Mokgalakwena, but tragically died en route. The centre has no paediatric antibiotics, analgesics and was seriously short staffed. The doctor, who is seconded from the nearby Mokgalakwena hospital, had not been available for two weeks.

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 235

Two patients were lying in the emergency unit on drips. Both drips were finished and had been for some time. There were no staff in the unit, drugs were lying on a table in front of an open door leading outside, and cabinets with syringes, scalpels and needles were standing open. There was no water and the toilets do not work.

The unacceptable state of clinics in Limpopo is beyond comprehension. Voters must now make their voices heard and vote for the DA who puts the health of our citizens above corruption and ensures that the right to reasonable health care is a priority. I thank you.

DYSFUNCTIONAL SATELITE POLICE STATION IN DZUMERI

(Member's Statement)

Mr T RAWULA (EFF): Hon Chairperson, the community of Dzumeri in Giyani does not have a police station. The satellite police station that was meant to open 24 hours on seven days per week, 24/7, is dysfunctional and most of the time is closed. The community of Dzumeri wrote letters, emails and

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 236

consistently called the Minister's office but nobody has listened to them. These correspondences were forwarded to the EFF. We wrote questions to the Minister of Police, asking him what he is doing about the situation. His reply was to mislead us and say the satellite station is always open when it is not.

The satellite police station continues to be closed at certain hours of the day and criminals are taking this opportunity to terrorise the community. They do what they do best: People are being robbed; women raped; and the people of Dzumeri are left to defend themselves against these criminals. We call on the Minister of Police to commit to ensuring that the satellite police station in Dzumeri remains open 25 hours a day. Thank you.

GAUTENG EDUCATION DEPARTMENT LAUNCHES AVIATION PROGRAMME

(Member's Statement)

Ms T A MFULO (ANC): The Gauteng Education Department launches innovative aviation programme for Grade 5 learners. The ANC

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 237

believes that our government should make maths and science more visible to the youth, in order to inspire more children and increase the number of engineers entering the profession. We acknowledge that we have an unfortunate legacy inherited from the former education system within our country, which discouraged black learners from choosing mathematics and science for matric.

We therefore welcome the launch by the Gauteng Department of Education of an innovative aviation programme that will make the learning of mathematics and science fun again for over 400 Grade 5 pupils. The launch took place at the Sci-Bono Discovery Centre in Newtown, Johannesburg on Friday, 9 November 2018. More than 400 pupils at primary school level in the province will use science, technology, engineering and mathematics to learn the principles of flight through the historic programme.

The programme, which will benefit pupils from Lyndhurst, Bovet, Halfway House, Mitaketa and Nokuphila Primary Schools, is a partnership between the Gauteng Department of Education and global Fortune 100 software industrial company, Honeywell.

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 238

The idea of beginning at the primary school level to get learners interested and excited about maths and science from an early level before they reach high school is an excellent one. [Time expired.] I thank you. [Applause.]

**FORMER MINISTER HOGAN AND TESTIMONY IN STATE CAPTURE
INVESTIGATIONS**

(Member's Statement)

Mr M A PLOUAMMA (Agang): Hon House Chair, I want to take this opportunity to thank former Minister of Public Enterprises Ms Barbara Hogan for courageously testifying without fear or favour. [Interjections.] [Applause.] State capture is the product of the ANC. The only way to stop state capture is to remove the ANC. No antibiotic can help this rot with which the ANC has infected our public life. [Interjections.] [Applause.] We are in this mess thanks to them.

Keep it up, Ms Barbara Hogan, Agang SA is with you. We knew Minister Mantashe would try to pour cold water on your testimony. The truth will remain: they are all accomplices of

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 239

the Zuma administration. They were his praise singers. They even had the misguided courage to call you a racist. Ms Barbara Hogan, the people of South Africa will forever be indebted for your struggle contribution. I thank you.

[Applause.]

**CHATSWORTH MOTHER FOUND GUILTY OF ABUSING AND KILLING TODDLER
GIVEN 20-YEAR SENTENCE**

(Member's Statement)

Ms N ABRAHAM-NTANTISO (ANC): Hon Chair, the ANC welcomes the 20-year sentence imposed on the Chatsworth mother found guilty of abusing and killing her three-year-old daughter, known as Baby X to protect her identity.

The Durban High Court on Thursday, 8 November 2018, sentenced the mother to 20 years in prison for murdering her toddler daughter who had endured being beaten, starved and burnt with cigarettes, having chilli powder put in her nappy and being tied to her bed at night.

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 240

The ANC believes that the law should continue to be harsh and show no mercy towards the perpetrators of child abuse. We are encouraged that government has put in place child-protection mechanisms such as legislation, and that the country has ratified international instruments as a commitment to the protection of children's rights. Key among these is section 28 of the Constitution, which specifically deals with and lays the foundation of children's rights. The ANC asserts that as a nation we must never tolerate any form of abuse against children.

We continue to call upon law-abiding citizens to continually expose child abusers and to defend and prevent the abuse of children in our communities. I thank you.

RESIGNATION OF FORMER MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS MALUSI GIGABA

(Member's Statement)

Mr M H HOUSEN (DA): Hon Chairperson, a few minutes ago the lying former Minister of Home Affairs once again took matters into his hands and this time handed in his resignation.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 241

Although we are satisfied with his decision, it is very unfortunate that he massaged the truth for so long, and in the process singlehandedly destroyed the reputation of Home Affairs and our government. [Applause.]

Mr Gigaba's resignation is clearly an indication that he has now finally accepted that he has lied to South Africa, and all of the allegations that have been levelled against him are clearly true. Knowing Gigaba very well, if he were innocent he would have never resigned.

So now that we have finally rid ourselves of former Minister Malusi Gigaba, we have just one piece of advice for him: Please, Mr Gigaba, imagine what the truth feels like in your mouth. [Laughter.] [Applause.]

SUCCESS OF AFRICA INVESTMENT FORUM

(Member's Statement)

Mr J J DUBE (ANC): Chair, we welcome the inaugural Africa Investment Forum that took place in Johannesburg from 7 to 9

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 242

November 2018. The Africa Investment Forum was convened by the African Development Bank. Its aim was to build on current successes by bringing together public- and private-sector investment to chart a new growth path for the entire African continent. During the forum, project sponsors, borrowers, lenders and public- and private-sector investors all came together to accelerate African investment opportunities.

The ANC believes that Africa has potential, and the growth of the African economy relies on the continent investing in itself. The forum concluded with investors, government leaders and the private sector unanimously agreeing that the gathering was successful. The forum saw 45 projects worth \$32 billion receive funding, with South Africa clinching deals for projects worth \$6,8 billion. That is incredible for a first-time forum convened in Africa. The \$6,8 billion in South African investment will contribute to President Ramaphosa's drive to attract \$100 billion in investments over the next five years.

TAXI VIOLENCE

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 243

(Minister's Response)

THE MINISTER OF JUSTICE AND CORRECTIONAL SERVICES: Thank you, House Chair. Firstly, in response to the IFP statement relating to the taxi violence, just to indicate that as a cluster we have scheduled to meet this coming weekend, to have a workshop, to really look at building signage and looking at how to strengthen collaboration between ourselves as the different law enforcement agencies.

Such issues have the flare-ups in the taxi industry as well as some of the situations of drug abuse, of gangsters even issues of illegal migration and the impact on the issues of security, etc, are amongst the issues we will be looking at closely as part of responding to the responding to the President's call of "Thuma Mina" ensuring that all of us put hand on deck to ensure that some of the critical challenges such as the high levels of violent crime in our society are actually dealt with, in a much more decisive manner. Thank you very much.

GAUTENG DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION LAUNCHES AVIATION PROGRAMME

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 244

SPECIAL NEEDS LEARNERS RECEIVE WORLD-CLASS TECHNOLOGY

(Minister's Response)

THE DEPUTY MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION: Thank you, very much hon Chair. I would like to respond to the statements of hon Ndlovu and hon Mfulo with regard to the aviation initiative in Gauteng.

We certainly want to endorse the direction that it is taking. It has also, in addition, established an aviation side, the technical school where there is an aeroplane where mechanical engineering can be taught. Gauteng is doing extremely well in this regard.

With regard to the emphasis on mathematics and science, indeed, we are encouraging the Gauteng; they have put a particular attention to this area, unlike the Western Cape, which only has 32% of its learners in Grade 12 doing mathematics, whereas KwaZulu-Natal is 54%.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 245

We would want to say, please look at the other provinces and learn from them. Do not consign the poorest people, the historically disadvantaged people to mathematical literacy and having more affluent and elites doing mathematics.

With regard to inclusive education, we want to cheer and celebrate the fact that this year for the first time Grade 12 learners are being tested in Sign language, as an official part of our language landscape and we wish them well.

[Applause.]

The MTN has done wonderfully well in terms of its partnership and we hope that by the end of this financial year every else in school would have the necessary ICT capacity to enhance teaching and learning. In addition, the MTN Foundation has undertaken to digitise, in fact, we almost finalised this process here in computer science and computer technology.

What we can celebrate is as a result of the partnership approximately 90% of high enrolment subjects have now being digitized and textbook are now owned intellectually by the Department of Basic Education, which means that we have moved

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 246

education from a common good to a public interest. That is a good course for the celebration. We do hope that the DA is taking note. Thank you. [Applause.]

REOPENING OF TEXTILE FACTORY

(Minister's Response)

THE DEPUTY MINISTER OF ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT: Thank you, very much Chair. I want to say to uBaba Mbuyane that the reopening of the sixty-year-old factory that closed down in the beginning of this year, resulting in the loss of 500 jobs was as a result of a quick response and collaboration by the province and national.

The intervention has resulted in the immediate saving of 211 jobs of the 500 jobs that were lost at the beginning of the year. However, the 150 million contributions by the IDC need to be understood from a bigger picture that the IDC is saving and creating jobs.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 247

In the financial year 2017-18, it has just approved R16,7 billion of finance of which, R15 billion must actually disburse, and it is estimated that 300 jobs are going to be created.

However, we are humbled by the comment that has been made by one of the re-employed people, Gugu Mlotsha, when she says:

When the company close down, we never thought it would be saved. We really want to thank our government for what they have done. We would like to see the company grow so that it can accommodate all employees who lost their jobs.

We would like to say to Gugu, with more intervention from the Industrial Development Corporation, IDC and the Development Finance Institutions, DFIs and the implementation of the Job Submit, and the Investment Conference and Stimulus commitment, the tightening of the monitoring of imports and the reducing of the illegal imports at the ports of entry, more jobs will be created and more of a colleagues shall be re-employed. The

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 248

African Investment commitment really adds the cherry on top.

[Applause.]

CENTENARY OF WORLD WAR 1, 1918

(Minister's Response)

THE MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, FORESTRY AND FISHERIES: Thank you House Chair. I would like to respond to a misrepresentation of facts by the hon member of the DA. We cannot be called upon as South Africans to remember and commemorate the signing of the League of Nations Armistice.

As this country was torn asunder when some Afrikaners wanted to join the war on behalf of Germany, we ask ourselves, where were the black people? What was the cause of that war? It was the aspirations of imperialism. It undermines the role of black South Africans. There is no way that you can come and call upon us to serve in such a war. It left this country divided. Let that we were not part of it, so to call upon us to even remember how it was signed.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 249

I know that the then Prime Minister of South Africa General Smuts, stated in the armistice, what did it achieve? There was a war within a few years because they attended that meeting when they were still bleeding, when the wounds were still clear. There was no solution to the problems.

It cannot be that we are called upon to then stand and say, there was ever such a situation because black South Africans were oppressed, not regarded as human being by our fellow South Africans. [Applause.]

UCEBA OPHETHE KAKUBI ABAHLALI

(Impendulo yoMphathiswa)

isiXhosa:

UMPHATHISWA WEZAMANZI NOGUTYULO LWELINDLE: Sihlalo ohloniphekileyo, umhlonipheki uKhawula uthetha into enkulu kakhulu nebalulekileyo. Le nto ayithethayo, ndikhe ndayiva xa bendiye eKoster ku Masipala weNgingqi iKgetlengrivier, eMntla Ntshona, ndafika kuthethwa le nto ngabantu. Iyanwenwa le nto

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 250

apha eMzantsi Afrika, kuthiwa ooceba ngabo aba bagqobhoza imibhobho kuba baneelori zokuthutha amanzi bawathengise.

Abantu bala ndawo bathe kuthi, ikhona ilori abayitshisileyo kwaye bacela kuze amajoni ukuze bayazi ukuba ngurhulumente lo uzisa la manzi. Loo nto iza kwenza ukuba kuphele amaqhinga nobuqhophololo obenziwa ngoceba. Le nto kufanele ukuba isidibanise sonke singamaqela opolitiko. IDA mayingapolitiki ngento eyenza abantu baseMzantsi Afrika bakwazi ukuphila. Ndiyabulela kumama uKhawula. Enkosi.

NOTICES OF MOTION

Ms L D MESO: House Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the ANC:

That the House debates the prioritisation of learners with disabilities for science and technology training.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 251

Mr G G HILL-LEWIS: House Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the DA:

That the House debates ideas for ensuring fair and equal access to job opportunities for all South Africans.

IsiZulu:

Nk M S KHAWULA: Sihlalo weNdlu, ngaphansi kwegama le EFF besifisa ukuthi le ndlu ngokulandelayo ike ibheke udaba lwakuwadi 53 eMawoti olwabantu abazibiza ngokuthi bayizinsizwa kepha manje sebezishintshile bazibiza ngokuthi oMbombela, baphatha imikhonto, bagwaza abantu ngayo, babakhipha ngisho nasezindlini zabo bazishise, kanjalo futhi baphinde babashaye uma behamba ebusuku

IKhansela lakhona lisebenzisana nazo lezi zinsizwa, ngokwazi kwami zavalwa leza zinsizwa ngoba zazibulala abantu, baphatha imikhonto nobhushu, ababayeki abantu, ngiyabonga.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 252

Ms B C NDLOVU: House Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the ANC:

That the House debates closing the existing gap of inequality between rural and urban schools.

Mrs S J NKOMO: House Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the IFP:

That the House debates the need and putting into action innovative long-term strategies of fire hazard reduction, to prevent urban and veld fires that predominantly affect the residents of especially, informal settlements during the so-called fire season. I thank you.

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: House Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the NFP:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 253

That the House deliberates and resolves to erect a statue of the late Winnie Madikizela Mandela on the parliamentary precinct.

Mr J J DUBE: House Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the ANC:

That the House debates the speeding up of effective programmes aimed at accelerating the beneficiation of South African minerals.

Mrs C N MAJEKE: House Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the UDM:

That the House debates the sustainability and current infrastructure deficiencies affecting water-related progress in the transition to a water-secure country.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 254

Mr D R RYDER: House Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the DA:

That the House debates the financial impact on basic services provided by municipalities, caused by the costs associated with controlling illegal land invasions, which are increasing due to policy uncertainty and disingenuous electioneering.

IsiXhosa:

Mnu T RAWULA: Sihlalo weNdlu, ndenza isaziso sokuba, xa le Ndlu ihlala kwakhona, ndiza kwenza isiphakamiso egameni le-EFF:

Sokuba le Ndlu -

- (1) ixoxe umba wemeko yezempilo yaseMpuma Koloni emva koqhankqalazo lwabaqhubi beenqwelo yezigulana nabasebenzi kwizibhedlele, kwiveki ephelileyo;

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 255

(2) iqaphele ukuba abasebenzi baye bazibeka phantsi izixhobo zokusebenza, kwama yonke into ngenxa yokungahlawulwa kwabo, urhwaphilizo nazo zonke izinto ezibandakanya ezempilo eMpuma Koloni; kwaye

(3) iqaphele kwakhona into yokuba bekume yonke into kwiSebe lezeMpilo kwiphondo laseMpuma Koloni, nto leyo ibizintloni ezingummangaliso eluntwini. Enkosi.

Mr D J KABINI: House Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the ANC:

That the House debates the creation of Wi-Fi spots in rural communities.

Mr S H MBUYANE: House Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the ANC:

That the House debates ensuring that programmes of TVET colleges respond to skills, needs and unemployment.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 256

Ms N A NTANTISO: House Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the ANC:

That the House debates strengthening of parliamentary oversight mechanisms, in order to pay special attention to and respond effectively to corruption.

Mr K P ROBERTSON: House Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the DA:

That the House debates the lack of departmental co-operation resulting in excessive backlogs in land reform.

Ms T A MFULO: House Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the ANC:

That the House debates addressing the severe shortage of student residences for students from poor and working-

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 257

class families, particularly those in historically disadvantaged institutions.

UNPARLIAMENTARY LANGUAGE

(Ruling)

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G BOROTO): Hon members, on Tuesday 30 October 2018, during motions without notice, hon Lorrimer from the DA rose on a point of order and alleged that a member of the EFF, whom he did not mention by name, had been repeatedly uttering the phrase "shut up". Hon Lorrimer submitted that the word is unparliamentary in terms of Rule 84. I advised the House that I would give a considered ruling, as I unfortunately did not hear the remark.

Having now had an opportunity to study the unrevised Hansard as well as the relevant video footage, I rule as follows: Assembly Rule 84 states that no member may use offensive, abusive, insulting, disrespectful, unbecoming or unparliamentary words or language, or offensive, unbecoming or threatening gestures. Neither hon Lorrimer, nor hon Waters who

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 258

rose on a point of order mentioned the member by name. Secondly, the alleged utterance of the unparliamentary phrase shut up is not captured in Hansard or the video footage.

Hon members, I would like to take this opportunity and appeal to hon members to always behave in a manner that reflects integrity and honour in the House. Furthermore, if you wish to draw the attention of the presiding officer to the transgressions of the Rules by another hon member, it is important to identify the member concerned.

In instances when it is unclear who committed the transgression, or when the presiding officers themselves did not hear or see the transgression, it places an undue burden on the presiding officer and makes calling the member to order, virtually impossible. I thank you, hon members.

The House adjourned at 19:53.