

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 1**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

---

**PROCEEDINGS AT JOINT SITTING**

---

Members of the National Assembly and the NCOP assembled in the Chamber of the National Assembly at 14:00.

The Chairperson of the NCOP took the Chair.

The Chairperson of the NCOP requested members to observe a moment of silence for prayer or meditation.

**RESUMPTION OF DEBATE ON PRESIDENT'S STATE OF THE NATION**

**ADDRESS**

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE NCOP: The hon Chairperson of the NCOP, the hon President of the Republic of South Africa, hon Members and distinguished special delegates, hon Chairperson, as we may recall, the 2019 President's state of the nation, took place hardly 30 days after the 60th anniversary of one of our

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 2**

own and former member of this House, the late comrade Peter Mokaba.

Peter Mokaba radiated the spirit and talents of the death defying generation of youth activists of the eighties. The young lions as OR Tambo called them in honour. Mokaba expressed the young lion's relentlessness and daring spirit. He expressed their intellect and weed. He expressed confidence and resourcefulness. Mokaba expressed hope and challenges stand of young lions.

As we prepare to renew and grow South Africa together, we are inspired by the revolutionary example of Peter Mokaba, whose loyalty to his people was unmatched. Mokaba taught our youth to love their country and people and never betray the cause of freedom.

Comrade President, I am sure we will all agree that the youth constitute the critical pillar and a special place in the renewal of our country. This special place that our youth must occupy is not a free for all, but requires a commitment to the values of selflessness, solidarity, appreciation of leadership not as a prestige, but honour earned in the actual arena of

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 3**

struggle. These are amongst the fundamental values that Peter Mokaba and his generation have lived and died for.

This Presidents state of the nation address takes place at the most defining and critical moment in the history and evolution of our constitutional democracy. We stand here today at the time when our Constitution ...

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon Rayi, please hold. Hon members, can you converse in lower tones, please? You are drowning the speaker on the floor. Please, continue.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE NCOP: We stand here today at the time when our Constitution and the institutions of our democratic governance have gone through critical tests and trials.

The journey we have traversed since 1994 has been riddled with successes and setbacks that generated hope on the one hand and on the other despair amongst our people and the international investor community.

At the core of the hope of our people was their collective resilience, united in diversity, in their common appreciation

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 4**

and allegiance to the Constitution as the supreme law of the country and the democratic state as the collective property of the people as a whole and on the other hand, the emergence of organized tendencies that threatened to erode the very fundamental values of our Constitution which is the basis of the existence of our democratic state.

As you have pointed out in your state of the nation address, hope is now gaining momentum over despair. Steadily, the old is dying to pave the way for the birth of the new from the umbilical cord of the old. We therefore, welcome your interventions to reconfigure and to strength the capacity of the state to equal the strategic tasks of renewal and the qualitative achievement made over the last twelve months of your leadership.

Our task of strengthening and consolidating the capacity of the state will be short lived if we do not factor in our evolving system of provincial government. This sphere of government is located at the closer to our communities thus opening unique prospects for it to deepen participatory democracy, development and radical economic transformation.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 5**

According to our Constitution, South Africa is one, sovereign, democratic state founded on the values of human dignity, the achievement of equality and the advancement of human rights and freedoms. This necessitates the integration of our provincial system of government in the ongoing agenda and transformation of our democratic state.

The successes of the last 25 years of democratic consolidation and social transformation could not have been possible without the critical role of our provinces.

Our provinces have designed and adopted the public participation frameworks to ensure that our people are at the centre stage of governance, development and policy making in line with the vision of the Freedom Charter that the people shall govern. That's why provincial governments have institutionalised community participation through important structures such as school governing bodies, hospital boards, community policing forums and also community participation in infrastructure projects.

Provincial governments also play a critical role in supporting and providing capacity to the local government to fulfil their

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 6**

developmental function. Without sound intergovernmental relations and co-operation between the provincial and local government, meaningful people-centred and driven development cannot be realised.

The establishment of the Provincial Intergovernmental Relations Structures such as the Premier's Coordinating Structures has gone a long way in strengthening the intergovernmental co-operative governance. This integrated co-operative governance is critical to facilitate service delivery, development and economic transformation.

According to empirical research by leading independent research institutions, there is a significant improvement in service delivery backlogs and decline in spontaneous community protests in provinces, where we have sound public participation and intergovernmental relations model.

One of the critical challenges facing our system of provincial government and the democratic state at large is the uneven concentration of resources amongst the provinces. This is borne out of the historical legacy of apartheid spatial and

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 7**

economic planning and continues to be exacerbated by uneven economic development.

The national Budget equitable share and the infrastructure grants have gone a long way in redistributing towards poorer provinces. Through the division of revenue, government continues to invest in economic infrastructure, such as roads, and social infrastructure, such as schools, hospitals and clinics, to stimulate economic development, to create jobs, and to address economic and social disparities. This is in line with the fundamental principle of equity as articulated in our Constitution.

Our provinces must maximize their fiscal capabilities for improved service delivery and development, greater efforts in the improvement of efficient spending and accountability. This should be backed up by better planning, financing model, efficient procurement and implementation.

As we have pointed out earlier, the footprints of our system of provincial government in the provision of massive social and economic infrastructure over the last twenty-five years is indeed commendable. Today, South Africa is celebrated amongst

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 8**

the developing countries as one of the best countries with the best infrastructure.

In the social front, we have built the best world class schools, public health facilities, sports stadiums and water and sanitation infrastructure. We have built the best road infrastructure network that facilitates the smooth movement of people and goods from our province to another.

As we celebrate our successes in terms of infrastructure developments, we are equally awake to the reality of the persistence of aging infrastructure, which is not well maintained and the huge infrastructure backlog. For this reason, we welcome the new infrastructure implementation model announced by the President during the state of the nation address.

The billions invested in these infrastructure projects have created million job opportunities for our people, the youth, women and people living with disabilities through the Expanded Public Works Programmes, EPWP, which of course on my left, it was resisted in 1994 upon its introduction.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 9**

The best success stories about the EPWP, infrastructure development now create job opportunities and it has become a collective heritage of communities where some of the high impact quality projects were undertaken.

We speak here about Gundulashe in Limpopo, Zibambele Project in KwaZulu-Natal and Makwane Project that played critical part in the rural part of Qwaqwa in the Free State.

We need stronger technical capacity at national level that the provinces and municipalities can draw from for catalytic projects that can help define our nation's economic growth path. The call for partnership with communities is most welcome

The ANC-led government has adopted the Special Economic Zones, SEZs, as one of the policy interventions to maximize foreign direct investment, grow the economy and create jobs in line with the Industrial Policy Action.

Amongst key objectives of these SEZs part of what comrade Rob touched yesterday is to expand the strategic industrialisation focus to cover diverse regional development needs and context;

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 10**

provide a framework for predictable financing framework to enable long term planning.

According to the official records of the Department of Trade and Industry, DTI, these SEZs have 115 operational investors with an investment value of R11,6 billion with a further R34,4 billion investment commitments

One of the serious challenges facing SEZs is the capacity constraint with respect to the technical know-how among development practitioners across the three spheres of government. Lessons from international experience suggest that the success of an SEZ Programme depends on the capacity of implementing agencies to plan, design, develop, manage and operate the zones. Continuous institution and capacity building is therefore necessary for the success of this programme.

That's why the efforts made by the DTI of a five-year agreement with China on sharing experiences have to be applauded. This agreement with China will create a platform for Chinese officials to share their valuable SEZ experience, thus better equipping South Africa's policy-makers,

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 11**

development practitioners and operators with the required planning, technical, managerial and operational know-how.

SEZs are important instrument for attracting investment in for manufacturing sector and because they are situated in provinces. They have a big potential in jobs creation and supplier opportunities for small businesses in our provinces.

It is therefore my submission that more SEZs should be designated for rural provinces, since they will help stimulate economic activity in rural provinces. Free State and Limpopo currently have one SEZ per province, while Northern Cape, North West and Mpumalanga don't have any designated. I think we can do better and this is what is articulated by our manifesto that expansion is much more critical

It's encouraging that the trade and industry has been insisting that the success of the industrial policy will be based on the strong collaboration between spheres of government, private sector and labour and that industrial policy should be strongly rooted in addressing the needs of people.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 12**

In the light of this spirit maybe we should look at effective ways of integrating high impact provincial industrial projects, from rural provinces, within the Industrial Policy Action Plan, IPAP. These can also be part of the Provincial Investment Book that comrade President has requested provinces to submit for the country's investment drive, as led by the President.

The economic repositioning of these provinces cannot be left to fate but should be an outcome of conscious policy thought and action consistent with the attributes of a democratic developmental state we seek to build. That is exactly what the ANC is doing to drive and direct development.

The overriding proposition here is that, economic development concerns all the three spheres of government. It should not be treated as a function for a few national departments.

We should therefore welcome the Integrated Planning Framework Bill that was released for public comment by the Department of Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation, DPME. The main objects of the proposed draft are to provide for stronger integration, coordination and joint planning among the different spheres of

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 13**

government, create structures for accountability and clarify roles and responsibilities within a new, more integrated system.

These are groundbreaking policy moves with regard to planning and coordination should really be commended. The development and adoption of the Provincial Growth and Development Plans by our provinces marked a critical watershed in the coming of age of our evolving system of provincial government. The Provincial Growth and Development Strategies, PGDS, should be formalised and integrated into the national planning system. Clear formalised synergies between PGDS, the National Development Plan, NDP, and the integrated Planning Framework, which is going to replace Medium Term Strategic Framework, MTSF.

The outcomes we envisage in our economic development, particularly for poor rural province should be development and the expansion of the industrial production and thereby attracting investment and creating jobs on a large scale.

In conclusion, let me quote from the ANC's 1994 Strategy and Tactics document. I make this quote for historic reasons as we

UNREVISED HANSARD

JOINT SITTING

WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 14

celebrate the 25th anniversary of our freedom and yet still having so much work to do in achieving social genuine liberation. I also like this passage from the 1994 Strategy and Tactics; because it rings resonance with the spirit of hope capture by President during the state of the nation presentation and I quote:

"This then is the historical juncture at which South Africa is today. The victories scored by the ANC and the democratic movement contain seeds for advance to truly just and prosperous society. Basing ourselves on this assessment of the current conjuncture, on our commitment to democratic principles, on tenacity of our membership, and, above all, on our reliance on the mass of our people, we are confident that we not only possess the capacity but also the will to fulfil our historic mission."

The ANC live and the ANC lead, forward to the renewal of the democratic mandate on 8 May 2019. I thank you.

Mr G G HILL-LEWIS: Mr President, so, your speech on Thursday evening dished up ladles full of syrupy hope, but all of the spun sugar in the world won't be enough to make our country

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 15**

forget what the ANC has done to South Africa these last 10 years.

You have taken South Africa from the largest economy in Africa to the third largest. You have delivered the highest youth unemployment rate in the world. You have delivered 9,7 million jobless people. You have increased electricity prices by 356% and you still manage to bankrupt Eskom and you still can't keep the lights on. Now you want to hike prices even further to pay for it.

Let's not forget that the whole time you were constructing a criminal syndicate fronting as a political party. Now you want to expropriate the pension funds of hard working South Africans to bailout the SOEs that you bankrupted. The message to the country of the last 10 years is clear. The ANC eats, you pay.

Through it all, no one, not one person has gone to jail. No jail time for state capture. No jail time for Life Esidimeni. No jail time for Marikana and no jail time for Jacob Zuma.

UNREVISED HANSARD

JOINT SITTING

WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 16

You see, Mr President, the truth cuts through all the candyfloss. The truth is that the ANC set the house on fire and is now asking the public for five more years in which to put out that fire. While the President peddles hope, the country is right to ask, how we got here, who got us here and Mr President, what were you doing when you were there all the time?

If voters are looking for real hope in action, they need only look to the one province in South Africa governed by the DA. [Applause.] Where the DA governs, jobs are created. In the 10 years of DA government in the Western Cape, job growth has been tripled the next best province. That equals 650 000 new jobs, more than the entire population of Mangaung, in new jobs alone. Unemployment where we govern is 14% lower than the rest of the country. Out of all the jobs created in the whole country, 53,4% are from the one province govern by the DA. [Applause.]

Citizens here know that they can get a fair chance under this DA government. They don't have to pay anyone to get a job. They don't have to sleep with anyone to get a job. They don't have to show their membership card to anyone to get a job. The

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 17**

DA ensures that jobs are fairly available and accessible to all. So, Mr President, while you were sorting out your party, we were creating jobs. While Zondo was showing the world the evil heart of the ANC, we were creating jobs. While your son was doing business with Gavin Watson, we were creating jobs. [Applause.] That is what the DA does. We get things done for the people, not for the politicians.

Now, the Leader of the Opposition said yesterday that the DA aspires for every home to have at least one person who is employed - a job in every home. I thought it would be difficult to find statistics on this, but actually, open the Statistics SA General Household Survey and there you will find more evidence of the DA getting things done.

I am happy to report that we are already delivering on this goal. Here are the facts: Nationally, 20% or 3,2 million families rely on grant income alone. But where the DA governs, this number is 9%, less than half the rest of the country. In other words, 91% of families under the DA govern have at least one job in their home. [Applause.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

JOINT SITTING

WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 18

We are on our way to getting this done too. That is what we do. We roll back poverty, we unlock enterprise, we free small business to thrive and we spread broadly the ownership of private property. We do this because we love our country and we love its people. [Applause.] We do this because South Africa deserves better than a government asking us to give it another chance to solve the problems it has caused.

The ANC destroyed the Scorpions and defanged the NPA. Now the ANC is reopening the Scorpions. The ANC brought us e-tolls and then the ANC marches against e-tolls. The ANC owned Hitachi Power Africa that built the boilers for Medupi. Now that the boilers have failed, the President tells us he is shocked and angry. What did you expect from state capture even long before that term was coined? [Applause.] The President says he is shocked and angry, but his party has literally profited from the destruction of Eskom. Every time Mr President that the lights go out, jobs are lost. Load shedding is job shedding.

You know what? On 8 May, there's going to be stage 4 ANC vote shedding. [Applause.] Living under this government is like being on a never-ending rollercoaster of bad Marxist policies which hurtle inevitably towards collapse and corruption and

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 19**

then spin at the very last moment into new proposals to fix the old ones. With each convulsing corkscrew, people's lives hang in the balance. At the end of each loop, the ANC is forced to adopt a solution that the DA offered right at the beginning - specialised gang unit, specialised drug unit, splitting Eskom and the Youth Wage Subsidy. The least goes on.

But even today, Mr President, Luthuli House says they won't let you split Eskom, proving exactly what we said yesterday. They hired you as the new face of the criminal syndicate, but the same crooks are still in charge. [Applause.] This is not a nine-year Zuma phenomenon; it is the permanent character of the ANC. It is the only possible consequence of the dogma of state control under which no country can survive.

The President quoted two American Presidents in his speech, JFK and Teddy Roosevelt. But those men made their country prosper by pursuing enterprise, competition, individual liberty and security of widely owned private property. You quote them but the ANC rejects all of those values.

That is why South Africa cannot thrive under the ANC. The bus is broken and a different driver simply cannot fix it. South

UNREVISED HANSARD

JOINT SITTING

WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 20

Africa must be led by the DA's values because it is the only way our country can be lead. [Applause.] So, while the President may wish for suspension of disbelief, voters are looking for hope in action. Hope in action that our national decline is not inevitable. Hope in action to get more people into work and a job in every home. Hope in action to bring our country together and build one South Africa for all. With the support of the wonderful people of our great country, hope in action for victory on 8 May. [Time expired.] [Applause.]

Dr P J GROENEWALD: Hon Chairperson, hon President, in Davos, you said that South Africa had nine lost years, referring to your predecessor. However, hon President, where were you? You became the Deputy President of the ANC in 2012; you became the Deputy President of South Africa in 2014. So, where were you? What did you do in five to seven years of those nine lost years that have cost South Africa and its taxpayers dearly? You are complicit in the loss of those nine years, whether you like it or not.

What we need in South Africa is to build the economy. We have to create jobs in South Africa. I want to say it quite frankly and quite clearly to you that there is a simple solution to

UNREVISED HANSARD

JOINT SITTING

WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 21

build the economy of South Africa. You only have to do two things.

Firstly, take race out of the economy. Take race out of it.

Ms Z S DLAMINI-DUBAZANA: Hon Chairperson, on a point of order: I rise on Rule 14. I am requesting that the member address you and not the President.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon Groenewald, address the House through the Chair.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Chairperson, I also rise on Rule 14. This is a different debate. It is a response to the President's state of the nation address. It is perfectly appropriate to respond to the President.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon Steenhuisen, I have ruled. Hon Groenewald, you will address the House through the Chairperson.

*Afrikaans:*

UNREVISED HANSARD

JOINT SITTING

WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 22

Dr P J GROENEWALD: Dis presies wat ek gedoen het, maar soos hulle sê: Die waarheid maak seer.

*English:*

The second thing that should be done is to stop expropriation without compensation. [Interjections.] If you continue doing that, I can assure you that we are not going to get the economy to grow.

The hon Minister of Public Enterprises explained badly constructed plants at Eskom to us now and now he is looking for foreign engineers to solve the problem. Chair, through you to the hon President, we have enough competent, qualified engineers in South Africa to solve the problem, but because of blackness in the economy, they went to foreign countries.

[Interjections.] Stop black economic empowerment because it is nothing else but black elite enrichment. Stop affirmative action, if you want the economy to grow. [Interjections.]

*Afrikaans:*

Ek wil ook vir die agb President sê dat u Suid-Afrika, in u grondwetlike plig van nasiebou in Suid-Afrika, gefaal het.

Hoekom sê ek dit? U het 'n guldige geleentheid met u toespraak

UNREVISED HANSARD

JOINT SITTING

WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 23

gehad, want u het na die kinders wat in puttoilette verdrink het en 'n student wat geskied is, verwys, wat tragies is, maar u het nie na die tragedie van die Hoërskool Driehoek in Vanderbijlpark, waar vier leerlinge gesterf het, as gevolg van gebrekkige infrastruktuur by 'n staatsskool, verwys nie – 'n gemeenskap wat in rou is.

Ek wil verder gaan om vir u te sê dat u dalk 'n gesprek met u Minister van Finansies moet voer, want hy is op rekord, toe die Universiteit van Pretoria besluit het dat Engels die enigste voertaal gaan wees, om te sê: ...

*English:*

"We will regret it in 30 years." You will learn from your hon Minister of Finance. [Interjections.]

*Afrikaans:*

Ek wil verder vir die President sê, u het op Radio 702, na die rassistiese uitsprake en haatspraak teen wittes deur die Black First Land First, BLF, van Potchefstroom ... Wat sê u? U kom nie op nie, u kom nie u plig na nie. U sê dat dit maar nie 'n algemene standpunt is nie en dat daar nog te veel wittes in

UNREVISED HANSARD

JOINT SITTING

WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 24

Suid-Afrika is wat rassisties is. Dit is nie nasiebou nie; dit is polarisasie.

U het ook verwys en gesê dat ons verbaas sal wees om te sien hoeveel jong swart mense kwaad is oor - soos u dit uitgedruk het - "the lackadaisical attitude of whites in the economy" [die traak-my-nieagtige houding van wittes teenoor die ekonomie].

*English:*

May I say to you hon President, that you will be surprised about the anger of black people for the lackadaisical attitude of black business people who became millionaires and billionaires because of BEE. [Interjections.]

I want to say to the people of South Africa ...

[Interjections.]

*Afrikaans:*

Daar is hoop. Op 8 Mei het u 'n geleentheid. Die Vryheidsfront Plus is die politieke party wat die balans terug kan bring in 'n verantwoordelike regering, want dit is wat Suid-Afrika nodig het - 'n verantwoordelike regering. Ek sê dus vandag dat

UNREVISED HANSARD

JOINT SITTING

WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 25

die Vryheidsfront Plus die alternatief is om 'n magbalans te kry. [Tyd verstreke.]

*English:*

Hon President, we will fight back. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION (Ms M A Motshekga): Chair of the NCOP, His Excellency, the President of the Republic of South Africa, hon Members, invited Guests, and fellow South Africans, Let me join all the people who have welcomed the President's 2019 State of the Nation Address. [Interjections.]

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon Minister, can you please take your seat? [Interjections.] What are you standing on, sir?

Mr N PAULSEN: Chairperson, can you ask the two members from the Vryheid's Front to stop harassing and threatening our women here?

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Thank you, sir. Hon members, order. Can I rule on this? Can the hon members of the EFF and the Freedom Front Plus stop harassing each other and let us

UNREVISED HANSARD

JOINT SITTING

WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 26

deal with the business of the day? [Laughter.] Hon Minister, please proceed.

Mrs E N NTLANGWINI: On a point of order, ma'am!

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Yes, what is your point of order?

Mrs E N NTLANGWINI: Ma'am, the guy has been harassing me and you didn't even look out for it. You just said that we are also harassing him. Should I not protect myself against this male counterpart that is harassing me? [Interjections.] Please can you protect us just for once? Can you protect women just for once against this guy?

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Can you take your seat? Hon members, order! No, I have been looking at what was happening there. There have been exchanges between you and the two hon members and I am calling all of you to order. That is it! [Interjections.] No, we will proceed. Please proceed, hon Minister.

Mr J S MALEMA: Hon Chair!

UNREVISED HANSARD

JOINT SITTING

WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 27

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon Malema, I don't want to entertain this; I have ruled on the matter.

Mr J S MALEMA: But we have a problem of Voortrekkers here!

[Laughter.]

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: No, whether it is "voortrekker" or "agtertrekker", let us continue with the business of the day! [Laughter.] Hon Minister, please proceed. You are protected, ma'am.

The MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION (Ms M A Motshekga):

Chairperson, since the dawn of democracy, as the ruling party, we have constantly remind ourselves that the top most priority for the ANC-led government was to establish a single, unified, democratic education system based on human rights values, principles and cultures - not race. In the past 25 years, on an ongoing basis, we have been putting in place transformative legislation, policies and programs to ensure the realisation of transformative reforms envisaged by government. The results of government reforms and developments over these years can be seen in outcomes which have improved on virtually all measures.

*Sesotho:*

Ba na leng mahlo ba iponetse, mme ba na leng ditsebe le bona ba ile baikutlwetse ka mesebetsi ya mmuso wa ANC.

*English:*

We put programmes for all our children; not a few, for instance, that hon member Hill-Lewis can think of as 'we, we, we' ...

*IsiZulu:*

... ukucwasa, mabahambe baye ...

*Sesotho:*

Majella-thoko a jelle thoko a le mang!

*English:*

We really wish to thank you, Mr President, for recognising the performance of the sector as evidenced by steady improvements in the matric results, since this is one of the key barometers we use to evaluate progress in improving access. As Minister Dlamini said that we are almost at 98% access up to Grade 10. On redress, I am proud to say that the second-top learner in the country is the child of a hawker in the Eastern Cape,

UNREVISED HANSARD

JOINT SITTING

WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 29

while the top learner in Gauteng came from the township, in Soweto.

*IsiXhosa:*

Siyaqhuba apha!

*English:*

Verwoerd should be turning in his grave as we see ...

*IsiXhosa:*

... bengcangcazela apha! Siyaqhuba! [Applause.]

*English:*

We have worked hard on equity, inclusivity, efficiency and quality.

Two weeks ago, the department convened the annual Basic Education Sector Lekgotla, which was officially opened by President Ramaphosa. It was attended by more than 600 domestic and international experts, scholars and leaders. Amongst other things, this lekgotla resolved that, we should: Continue to strengthen the foundations of learning, particularly in the early grades; consolidate and strengthen our assessment of

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 30**

learners to ensure that what is learnt is known and can be assessed; intensify the rollout of ICTs for the development of the knowledge, skills and competencies for a changing world and the 4th Industrial Revolution, especially the introduction of coding and robotics in the early years of schooling; ensure that the sector's work to develop teachers' content mastery, skills and competencies to manage the demands of the competence-based curriculum is strengthened; strengthen the ongoing implementation of the Three-Stream Curriculum Model; and ensure that the Sector does not leave out the African narrative in our competence-based curriculum.

Therefore the decolonisation of our system should not only be about sloganeering, but must be a catalyst of conscious activism. As can be noted from the state of the nation address that the President presented, there is beautiful synergy between the resolutions of the Basic Education Sector Lekgotla, the ANC manifesto and the President's directives.

The President has called upon the sector to: buttress of the foundations of learning, especially in the early grades; phase in the migration of an integrated early childhood development programme; strengthen the knowledge, skills and competencies

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 31**

for a changing world and the 4th Industrial Revolution; and to continue to accelerate the rollout of the sanitation appropriate for education initiative and appropriate and safe school infrastructure. [Applause.] [Interjections.]

On the foundations of learning, the President made an important observation about the importance of improving reading comprehension in the early phases of school. The department, through the ongoing interventions in Early Grade Reading Assessment, Egra, the Early Grade Reading Study, EGRS, and the Read to Lead Campaign have been working very hard to ensure that our learners in the Foundation Phase can be equipped with the foundational skills they need to cope with the curriculum requirements of higher grades, as well as the requisite knowledge, skills and competencies for a changing world. Chairperson, through you, we do welcome government's commitment to resource the reading programs further.

I am also pleased to announce that this coming Friday, 15 February, government, in partnership with civil society, coordinated by the National Education Collaboration Trust under the leadership of Mr Sizwe Nxasana and his board members, will be launching what we call the National Reading

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 32**

Coalition at the Kopanong Convention Centre, which includes business partners, NGOs, academics, publishers and our reading ambassadors.

The main intention of the National Reading Coalition is to reinvigorate a culture of reading and writing in our country. President, you had committed that you are going to be one of the ambassadors of the reading campaign. Indeed, we are saying that reading is not only about children. All countries leading in numeracy are reading nations. So, we need to read as a nation to make our children read.

The NDP enjoins us to ensure a quality ECD programme as a priority for the country with the intention of improving the quality of education and the long-term prospects of future generations and the society as a whole. In pursuance the directives that you gave last year, President, we have, as a sector, established a firm foundation for a comprehensive ECD programme which is an integral part of the education system.

The framework is ready; we are working on the costing. We wish to confirm that work has already begun, starting from the directives of last year, to ensure a seamless and smooth-

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 33**

phased migration of ECD and the declaration of a compulsory Grade R programme with effect from the 2019-20 financial year. [Applause.]

Another exciting development that we wish to announce in this area of our work is a partnership that we have with Unicef-South Africa, the Lego Foundation, and the Association for the Development of Education in Africa, Adea, in hosting the inaugural Continental Play-Based Learning for the 21st Century Skills Conference in Pretoria on 25-27 February 2019.

A number of Ministers of Education from the African Continent and their delegations, as well as experts, scholars, and our strategic partners from all over the world, will be coming into the country to attend the conference. The conference will explore how learning through play can improve the quality of ECD, and making ECD an integral part of the education systems in Africa.

In 2018, the President did make a call to the country to urgently develop its capabilities in the areas of science, technology and innovation and as the Department of Basic Education we have begun the journey that supports the

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 34**

President's call to, "The improvement of the education system and the development of the skills that are needed for the future".

As South Africa we have already developed a Framework for Skills for a Changing World. Different provincial education departments are at different stages of implementation, to ensure that teachers and learners are exposed to a range of skills and competencies that equip them for the 21st century. Teachers and learners will be able, "To respond to emerging technologies, including the internet of things, robotics and artificial intelligence".

For the past two decades, we have seen an emergence of a great global movement which we have been participating in as a country. This movement has been calling and examining new approaches to teaching and learning for the 21st century. The World Economic Forum referred to the term 4th Industrial Revolution. As a county, we have been keeping abreast with developments and developing our own capabilities.

To keep pace with the world and these developments, last year the Council of Education Ministers, CEM, approved the

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 35**

implementation of coding and robotics curricula in the Foundation Phase. Hence, we are currently developing the Coding and Robotics Curricula for the GET Band, from Grade R to Grade 9.

We have to express our gratitude and appreciation to UNISA which has agreed to partner with us, has made their 24 ICT Laboratories available throughout the country for the training of 72 000 teachers in coding. We are also grateful to civil society, the Universities of South Africa, the North West in particular and the private sector for working with the Department of Basic Education, DBE, to develop a Framework for Coding Grade R-9 and for supporting the department to develop a coding platform that utilises artificial intelligence and machine learning to customise teaching and learning.

This platform will be available in all eleven languages to ensure that all our learners are introduced to coding and robotics in their own mother tongue, in line with this government's mission to provide an inclusive education accessible to all.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 36**

We can report that there are plans to train at least three teachers in our primary schools in coding. This year we will be starting with a pilot in 50 schools in five provinces to prepare the system for a full rollout of coding and robotics education post-2020. As a department, we have already secured R50 million and we are calling upon the private sector to also support and assist us.

We were also very excited when the President announced that he is going to be launching the Presidential Commission on the 4th Industrial Revolution. We believe that we are on a cusp of a digital revolution. We have already developed a comprehensive ICT plan for an affordable and sustainable implementation of ICTs in education, which does include: Digital content resource development - digitisation; ICT professional development for management; teaching and learning; as well as ICT infrastructure and schools connectivity.

Indeed, already 90% of our textbooks with high enrolments subjects across all grades and all workbooks have been digitised. We are encouraged by the commitment that government has made in supporting the ICT programmes in education. WE

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 37**

will be using 2019 to prepare the system for phasing in the rollout of the program which will start with rural communities, farms - especially your multigrade and multiphase schools - and schools of learners with special needs.

[Applause.]

The ANC-led government has consistently called on government to provide multiple skills opportunities for our children in line with their abilities, interests and needs. The Three-Stream Curriculum Model provides for the academic, vocational and occupational pathways. This model allows for flexibility, articulation and portability of learning programmes towards the achievement of NQF level 4 qualifications - equivalent to the National Senior Certificate level.

We are also exciting to report that after hard work, the 2018 NSC cohort was the first to sit for the examinations, which included the 11 new technical-vocational subjects, comprising Electrical Technologies, Mechanical Technologies and Civil Technologies, with three specialised subjects each, as well as Technical Mathematics and Technical Science.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 38**

In addition, the Council of Education Ministers has also approved the introduction of additional technology subjects, such as Maritime Sciences - which is going to be done mainly by coastal provinces, Aviation Studies - which Gauteng already has, Mining Sciences and Aquaponics. In 2018, 75 schools of skills piloted 26 new technical-occupational subjects.

Hon Buthelezi is not here. He bemoaned the fact that five year down the line, out of the 25 762 public schools we still have 3 898 schools that had inappropriate sanitation facilities at the time, especially pit latrines, despite the fact that we had provided more than 10 000 with pit latrines.

What I wanted to remind him and hon member Holomisa is that the majority of these schools are in KwaZulu-Natal, Eastern Cape, Limpopo and Mpumalanga. What is common amongst them is that they were in homeland governments. So, we didn't build the pit latrine toilet schools but the homeland government provided that. [Interjections.] So, he should also remember where we come from and the fact that these were not built by ANC-led government.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 39**

We wish to thank the President for leading the crusade of eradicating pit latrines and other unsafe and inappropriate sanitation facilities in our public schools. We are also appreciative that resources have been made available. The President did report that we have made progress since the launch of Safe initiative and we have noted with appreciation that during that the President committed 70% of the proceeds to also assist with the eradication of unsafe and inappropriate sanitation facilities. [Applause.]

In addition, we want to acknowledge, with appreciation, the generous commitments made at the Global Citizen concert held at the FNB Stadium on 2 December 2018. I will be meeting with the leadership of the Global Citizen movement on mid-February because they have made pledges which include the eradication of pit latrines in our public schools.

In conclusion, as we approach the end of the Fifth administration of our democratic government, we will be amongst the first to concede that despite the notable stability and great achievements in our education system, much still needs to be done, especially in the areas of efficiency and quality. We do support the President's call for all South

UNREVISED HANSARD

JOINT SITTING

WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 40

Africans to work with government and continue to move the country forward under the leadership of your tested organisation, the ANC.

Young people have not registered to vote. I encourage them to do that and make sure that, on the day of voting, they go to the polls and vote for the ANC. [Applause.] [Interjections.] South Africans should not be misled and listen to these fly-by-nights - ...

*IsiXhosa:*

... onomgogwana, ongabaziyo ukuba bavelaphi, bethetha into abangayaziyo.

*English:*

The ANC will continue in its manifesto to serve people as it did in the last 700 years. It will be consolidating its work towards universal access to education, to improve early childhood and improve the quality of learning. In its manifesto, it has committed to ramping up the provision of the needed infrastructure. I am saying ...

*IsiZulu:*

UNREVISED HANSARD

JOINT SITTING

WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 41

... thuma i-ANC nihlukane nonomgogwana. [Ubuwelewele.]

*English:*

Ms M S KHAWULA: Point of order, Chairperson! Point of Order!

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon Minister, you have 30 seconds left to finish but I am taking a point of order. Hon Khawula?

*IsiZulu:*

Nk M S KHAWULA: Awu, awu, awu, ngiyabonga! Sihlalo, nginephuzu lokukhalima okuphambukayo. Akasitshela ukuthi uvumelekile yini, "unomgogwana" okokuqala? [Ubuwelewele.] Akachaze! [Ubuwelewele.] Yini lena akhuluma ngayo, "unomgogwana"? [Ubuwelewele.]

*English:*

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon Khawula!

*IsiZulu:*

Umangase asho nje manje, ngizohlala phansi. Yini unomgogwana?

USIHLALO WOMKHANDLU KAZWELONKE WEZIFUNDAZWE: Ngicela uhlale phansi, mama!

UNREVISED HANSARD

JOINT SITTING

WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 42

Nk M S KHAWULA: Ukhohlisa abantu, uthi abavotele i-ANC, ivele namanzi ingenawo? Musani ukuganga ngabantu. [Ubuwelewele.]

*English:*

Vote EFF! Vote EFF! Vote EFF!

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon Khawula, please take your seat. [Interjections.] Hon Khawula, take your seat!

*IsiZulu:*

Nk M S KHAWULA: Yebo, abantu mabavotela i-EFF, ...

*English:*

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon Khawula, please take your seat!

*IsiZulu:*

Nk M S KHAWULA: Ukujwayele njalo ukuthi angiqukulane nezihlalo!

*English:*

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon Khawula, take you seat now!

UNREVISED HANSARD

JOINT SITTING

WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 43

*IsiZulu:*

Nk M S KHAWULA: Sinamathele lapha phansi; awusiboni?

*English:*

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Take your seat!

*IsiZulu:*

Nk M S KHAWULA: Senizongenzela esami ke ngizokwazi ukusithatha! [Ubuwelewele.]

*English:*

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon Khawula, I instruct you now to take your seat!

Ms M S KHAWULA: Vote EFF!

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon Minister, please proceed!

The MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION (Ms M A Motshekga): Chair, I am saying to South Africa, ...

*IsiZulu:*

... thumani i-ANC!

UNREVISED HANSARD

JOINT SITTING

WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 44

*Sesotho:*

Le itshwarelle ho seo le se tsebang, le mosebetsi wa sona: Mokgatlo wa Modimo, badimo le setjhaba ka kakaretso. Le se ke la ikgathsatsa ka dimotelara tse tlang. O tswa bomotelareng, a ya pulpiting e mong wa bona. O tlile mona e se e le moetapele.

*English:*

Mr Finder, find a mistake!

*Sesotho:*

Ke batla ho mo jwetsa hore ...

*IsiZulu:*

... akudlalwa la. Sizothuthukisa ilizwe nabantu balo, wena uzohlalela ukubanga umsindo nokusiphaphela la. [Kwaphela Iaikhathi.] [Ihlombe.]

*English:*

Ms M S KHAWULA: You must withdraw what you said, now! Now; not tomorrow!

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon Khawula, you have not been given the floor. Please take your seat!

UNREVISED HANSARD

JOINT SITTING

WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 45

*IsiZulu:*

Nk M S KHAWULA: Kodwa uyaphapha naye!

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon Khawula, take your seat!

*Afrikaans:*

Mnr J J W JULIUS: Agb Voorsitter, President, lede en Suid-Afrikaners, die staatsrede van 2019 was, om die minste te sê, teleurstellend en verbeeldingloos. Die indruk wat dit in baie Suid-Afrikaners se gedagtes gelaat het, is dat ons onder die ANC-beheerde regering soos 'n nasie op 'n verlate stasie is. Daar is geen aksie, net 'n gepraat.

Net soos verlede jaar het ons weer gehoor hoe President Cyril Ramaphosa en die ANC Suid-Afrikaners nog vergaderings sonder veranderings, berade sonder daade, direktorate sonder kragte, konferensies met meer wensies, en seminare vir al die jare belowe. Die mense van Suid-Afrika wil aksie sien - aksie wat hulle lewens sal verbeter. [Applous.] Hulle is moeg vir die leë beloftes en kletswinkels van die ANC.

*English:*

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 46**

It was disappointing to note that, whilst the President spoke of South Africa advancing peace on the continent, he completely failed to mention the humanitarian crisis in Zimbabwe. Instead, he provided support to that regime. What a shame!

The President also missed an opportunity to address South Africans on the issue of illegal immigration during his state of the nation address this year. This is an issue millions of South Africans complain about on a daily basis, and the ANC-led government chooses to ignore it. Ignoring this issue will not make it go away. Mr President, I know you know about this issue because the NCOP took Parliament to the people and, last year during the debate, you were there in Ekurhuleni when people voiced their dissatisfaction on the issue of illegal immigration. You were there. You were part of the debate. You participated. I don't have to remind you because now I know you know. The people of Gauteng said their houses are occupied by illegal foreigners. They cannot compete with foreigners who run spaza shops because those foreigners buy in bulk. They talked about how the queues in hospitals and at clinics are getting longer and longer. There is competition for jobs and opportunities. In your speech, you chose to be silent about

UNREVISED HANSARD

JOINT SITTING

WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 47

this. Please, don't be surprised if the people punish the ANC for not listening to them. You were there, Mr President.

I visited most of our borders recently, something that is characteristic of a DA Member of Parliament. We do our oversight work. My leader ...

*Afrikaans:*

... ons werk! Ons speel nie, en ons steel nie. Die DA werk.

*English:*

People who live in border towns even told me that foreigners come in on the day for grants, to buy groceries, and then go back. You ignore this, Mr President - such an important issue.

That is why I am proud to say that the DA is the only party brave enough to take on this issue. No country in the world can allow its borders to be free for all. Whether you are from Swaziland or Switzerland, you must be documented if you want to stay in our country. [Applause.]

Illegal immigration is not a priority for the ANC, although the Health Minister warned in November that foreign nationals

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 48**

are placing an extra burden on the already overcrowded hospitals and clinics in our country. Our borders are so porous. I went there, and I want to invite Ministers to go there too. You might as well say we do not have borders at all. People are coming in and going out of our country as they please. Among those crossing our borders undetected are drug smugglers, illicit goods smugglers, human traffickers, and the list goes on. Go and try this in that country. You will get arrested. Mr President, why do we allow it in our country?

[Applause.]

Our Home Affairs offices are so poorly equipped that our poor officials cannot do their jobs to the best of their abilities. For almost eight years now, they have not had uniforms or appointment cards. They have been short staffed for years and years. Shame on this government! Our SAPS members at border posts feel their lives are in danger because they have to face syndicates with far more advanced weapons. I feel sorry for these government servants. Most of them try their best in the worst possible circumstances. They are the forgotten ones in this government. These Ministers have forgotten about them.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 49**

The President also failed to make mention of the Department of Defence, the South African National Defence Force, and the issue affecting these institutions. Members of our Defence Force must patrol our borders with very little resources and technology. I spoke to them. All they ask for are drones, cameras and more surveillance equipment to support them in their efforts to properly secure our borders with limited human capacity - but nothing from the department!

Our communities next to border posts are living in fear. Go to Manguzi, go to Zeerust, and go to Musina. Syndicates threaten their livelihoods. They fall prey to hijacking syndicates running cross-border operations. This government is well aware of these problems, but you choose to ignore it, Mr President. We have hotbeds of drug-related crimes, notably Kempton Park, a town which has seen drug-related crimes spike to six times the 2010 levels. The President spoke of the impact on communities of substance abuse, drug trafficking, and crime. We cannot discuss drug trafficking and the impact of substance abuse on communities without a frank conversation about where the drugs flow to and where it comes from, how it gets into the country and how it is taken out, or how it is related to

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 50**

human trafficking and international criminal syndicates running cross-border operations.

Understandably, to a billionaire President like ours, stock theft might appear to be a minor crime. However, to the farmers affected, stock theft has a significant impact on their businesses. In a country short on alternative work opportunities, it threatens their livelihoods and the livelihoods of their employees. Contrary to ANC belief, farmers need and deserve better in this country. Farm workers deserve better in this country. [Applause.]

The Zondo Commission of Inquiry has highlighted to us that criminality is not limited to drug kingpins or drug traffickers. This government has placed the care of detained undocumented immigrants in the hands of a crime ring linked to President Ramaphosa. Perhaps this is why the President failed to make mention of human rights abuses - which have long been reported by civil society - against foreign nationals at the Bosasa-run Lindela Repatriation Centre. Human dignity and human lives have been lost in order for Bosasa bigwigs to eat, for ANC cadres to enrich themselves, and for the President's campaign machine to get its funding. Bosasa doesn't even pay

UNREVISED HANSARD

JOINT SITTING

WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 51

its workers proper salaries, but you have the audacity to take money from Bosasa.

*Afrikaans:*

Voorsitter, ek borrel oor. Mnr die President, verlede jaar het ek jou ook tydens die debat gevra om leefstyl-oudits te doen.

*English:*

You didn't do it. You didn't mention it in this one. You are not serious about corruption amongst those.

*Afrikaans:*

Die ANC-beheerde regering is soos 'n luiskomers wat ons regering bedek. Hulle byt ons; hulle is parasiete wat die laaste bloed uit ons suig. Hulle suig die laaste sent uit ons en ons regering. Suid-Afrika, ek sê vir julle nou vandag ons moet van hierdie luiskomers ontslae raak. Ons kan nie aanhou om gebyt en droog gesuig te word deur hierdie ANC-parasiete wat hier sit nie. Jy kan nie 'n luiskomers was nie. Ons moet daai luise veld toe te vat en daar gaan los. Stem DA!

[Applous.]

*English:*

UNREVISED HANSARD

JOINT SITTING

WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 52

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon Lekota, the President just stepped out. Please continue.

Mr M G P LEKOTA: Madam Chairperson ...

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Please, just hold on, sir, before your time starts running. Hon members, I do have a member at the podium. Please! Hon Lekota, please start.

Mr M G P LEKOTA: Madam Chairperson, shouldn't I wait for the President? [Interjections.] I would like ...

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: No! No, hon Lekota! Now you are wasting your time. Please proceed. [Interjections.]

Mr M G P LEKOTA: No, no, no! The President addressed me when he was here at the podium. I want the President because I want to provide answers to some of the things he said to me.

[Interjections.] He called me by name. He called me by name.

He spoke ... no, he spoke ...

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon Lekota! Please hold the time.

Hon Lekota, you now amaze me. You have been sitting in these

UNREVISED HANSARD

JOINT SITTING

WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 53

benches since 1994. You know that during the state of the nation address ...

Mr M G P LEKOTA: I was going to reply to ...

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: No, I am addressing you, hon Lekota. I am addressing you. No, hon members! This amnesia is amazing. [Interjections.] Hon members, the President, or any other Minister, is just a human being. They do have a chance to go out and to come back. Since 1994, hon Lekota, you and I have borne witness ... in fact, there were instances when the President would not even be here. He has a staff complement here: deputies, Ministers, and people who will take notes to keep him updated when he comes in. So, please proceed with the debate, sir. [Interjections.] Hon Lekota, you may continue with your speech. [Interjections.] I do not want this interaction, hon Lekota. I had to rule on you.

Mr M G P LEKOTA: Madam Chairperson ...

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon Lekota, if you do not utilise the four minutes allocated to you, you will forfeit it.

UNREVISED HANSARD

JOINT SITTING

WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 54

Ms D CARTER: Hon Chairperson, can we not make a proposal that the ANC speaks and, when the President gets back, my leader can speak?

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: No. [Interjections.]

Ms D CARTER: The reply is a reply to the state of the nation address delivered by the President of a country and not to the Deputy President or to anyone else. [Interjections.]

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon member, take your seat! Hon member, please let me deal with this matter. Hon Lekota, you can proceed with your speech. [Applause.] [Interjections.]

Dr M Q NDLOZI: He must not hold the House to ransom like this. Our people are listening, Lekota. Our people are listening.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: No! Hon member ...

Dr M Q NDLOZI: The forces of the national democratic revolution are listening.

UNREVISED HANSARD

JOINT SITTING

WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 55

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: No, you are not ... you have not been recognised. May I just address you once again, hon Lekota: Please, you cannot hold us to ransom. You are allocated a slot. The list of speakers was circulated. Order! You must proceed with your speech. If you do not want to take that opportunity to speak, I can tell you now that you are going to forfeit the time. Please proceed.

Dr M Q NDLOZI: Chairperson of the National Council of Provinces, his time has expired. The four minutes are gone.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: No, it has not expired.

[Interjections.]

Dr M Q NDLOZI: No, your time is up, chief. Woza!

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: No, no! It has not expired. Please take your seat. Please take your seat! I am addressing this point so that this hon member does not think the President has no time or right to step out of the House and that the debate can be stopped. Please proceed, sir.

Mr M G P LEKOTA: Madam Chairperson and Mr President, I ...

UNREVISED HANSARD

JOINT SITTING

WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 56

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Please allow the member to proceed. Hon Lekota, you are now protected.

Mr M G P LEKOTA: Madam Chairperson of the National Council of Provinces, last week, the President stood on this spot when he invited me, amongst others, to join him. I don't know on what trip. [Laughter.] I do want to say to the President today that I was a bit puzzled that he included Roosevelt in what he spoke about. I'd like to say we must come back to South Africa because I was never in the United States to struggle. We struggled here. [Interjections.]

I do want to say to you, Mr President, that we were invited on a struggle trip by the pre-eminent student leader of our time, the late Steve Biko, who said to us that we must fight for the struggle. He said that in case of danger or living conditions that threaten human life, we must accept life for what it is or not at all. It did not take very long, two years or so - because that was around 1972. Round about 1974, we went into detention, among other things. In the course of that, we had to respond to this challenge. [Interjections.] I want to say to you that you invited me last week. We had to respond to that challenge. Your invitation last week was late. The

UNREVISED HANSARD

JOINT SITTING

WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 57

challenge we had to respond to was at that time and you, with us, in detention. When it was difficult, you wrote to the Special Branch that we put communist ideas in your head. In doing so, you condemned us to the Special Branch.

[Interjections.]

I say this to you ... [Interjections.] No, no! I say this to you because the Special Branch rewarded you, as they always reward their victims, and they sent you home. We headed to Robben Island. [Interjections.] You should have responded. This invitation you issued on Thursday, you should have issued then. We should have travelled together to the island to serve in the struggle for our people. [Interjections.] Yes! I will not join you on the trip you are suggesting. I will not join you because you made your choice then, and I ...

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: There is a point of order. Hon Lekota, please take your seat. [Interjections.] You rose on a point of order, madam.

Ms T V TOBIAS: Chairperson, the Rules do not allow for personal reflections to be made on members, specifically in this case. [Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

JOINT SITTING

WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 58

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon member, I am going to allow the hon Lekota to conclude. Order! The President is quite capable of dealing with whatever matter. Please proceed, hon Lekota.

Mr J S MALEMA: Chair ...

Mr M G P LEKOTA: My time is almost finished.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon Lekota, please take your seat. Hon Malema?

Mr J S MALEMA: We want to offer the hon Lekota eight minutes of the EFF's remaining time. [Applause.] Is it allowed, Chair?

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: That is not allowed, sir. Please take your seat. That is not a point of order!

Mr J S MALEMA: Alright, but can you use your powers to extend his time, please?

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: No. Hon Lekota ...

UNREVISED HANSARD

JOINT SITTING

WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 59

Mr J S MALEMA: This issue of selling out is very important.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon Lekota, please continue.

Please watch the clock.

Mr M G P LEKOTA: The only point I wanted to make is that that was the time the choices were made. I made my choice to go down with our people. You made your choice to go with them. [Interjections.] Now you are inviting us to join you in the corruption of Bosasa, in the corruption of all of these things you have been doing with the others. I am sorry, sir. I will stay with the people in Khayelitsha, in Shawela in Soweto, and so on. The day we get out of there, it will not be to go to the fleshpots of Egypt. It will be to go with our people when freedom is there for everybody. [Interjections.]

I thank you. I am grateful you are a billionaire. Keep the billions, and thank you for that, but we are not going to take part with you. I am not joining that trip. Thank you.

[Interjections.] If you are interested to hear, you must come to our launch. [Applause.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

JOINT SITTING

WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 60

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Order! [Interjections.] Order! Members, order! Hon members, please take your seats. Hon Minister, please proceed with your speech.

The MINISTER OF INTERNATIONAL RELATIONS AND CO-OPERATION: Chairperson, President of the Republic of South Africa, His Excellency Cyril Ramaphosa and hon members, we have had very robust discussions and debates which were very valuable in parts. From where I stand, it is important for us to distinguish between criticism that is constructive and can make us better people and that which is destructive, no matter how attractive that might be.

Africa does not see us as separate bits of a warring people but as one country bound by a historic honour to lead the way in that which identifies us, which is our own intolerance of abuse of human rights bound by a common purpose to improve the lives of our people. Of course that doesn't mean that we will always agree, but it doesn't always mean we will be disagreeable either. What it does mean is that we are tied by a common destiny. Africa sees hope in us; it associates us with all that they want to emulate.

UNREVISED HANSARD

JOINT SITTING

WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 61

Wherever you go there is no doubt that in the developing world we are increasingly regaining our stature. Our reputation and influence are humbling. The African continent sees in us a symbol of how struggle against injustice can create a different world, how the most negative situation - which we have come from in apartheid days - can inspire hope and change the world's discourse. Today we look back on our interventions on the continent and are very proud of the role we have played and are still required to play.

We return from the African Union summit and are overawed by the confidence in us. Almost overnight, the President was declared first vice president of the Bureau of the Assembly of the African Union for 2019 ... [Applause.] ... and elected the chairperson of the African Peer Review Mechanism, APRM, for the same period ... [Applause.] ... and best of all, which you probably already heard, was elected the chairperson of the African Union for 2020. Congratulations Mr President on behalf of all of us that you represent out there. We are humbled by the confidence that has been bestowed on us as a country.

[Applause.]

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 62**

In his state of the nation address, the President outlined the actions that this government will take in dealing with South Africa's social and economic challenges. In the debate yesterday, hon Ministers and other members indicated the progress that this government has made over the past 25 years to improve the social and economic conditions that the majority of South Africans live under. My colleagues discussed the challenges and proposed strategies to deal with these.

This year, 25 years since South Africa emerged from the dark shadows of international isolation, South Africa is a proud member of the community of nations. Our country is respected across the globe for the work that we have done and continue to do in the United Nations, in the United Nations Security Council, in Southern African Development Community, SADC, in the African Union, in BRICS, in G20 and other multilateral fora.

All these are possible because of the ANC-led government that has rescued this country from the debilitating albatrosses of sanctions, sports and cultural isolations and the undesirable position of being a pariah state has brought us to where we are, Comrade Lekota. Because the apartheid state was correctly

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 63**

described by the United Nations as implementing a 'crime against humanity', it was not possible for the representatives of that rogue state to operate openly and freely in the world. But right now we stride the world very proud of what we have achieved and what we continue to achieve.

The sentiments of the Freedom Charter were solemnly expressed by the leadership of all political parties through our Constitution when it declared, among other things, that we must, and I quote: "Build a united and democratic South Africa able to take its rightful place as a sovereign state in the family of nations."

We managed to change and remodel our foreign policy to be in line with the Freedom Charter and indeed adhere to our Constitution and fulfil the wishes of Nelson Mandela and many heroes and heroines who sacrificed so that today we join the international community as a free country.

Through our experience of ending disputes by negotiations and not war we have set a gold standard for the world and we are very much appreciated for that. We have now established our footing and we are very proud that. Through the leadership of

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 64**

the ANC and President Ramaphosa, South Africa has managed to make serious positive impact on the international arena. Among other things that we have achieved, South Africa has a global footprint in all the regions of the world demonstrating the acceptance of the country in the community of nations.

South Africa has played an important role in the promotion of peace, stability and security including donating our police and our defence force especially on the African continent. We strive to maintain world peace and make sure that at all times settlement of international disputes can follow what succeeded with us which is through negotiations.

We contributed to the transformation of the Organisation of African Unity, OAU, into the African Union, AU, and were at the forefront of the implementation of the African development programme New Partnership for Africa's Development, NEPAD, as part of the ongoing efforts to bring about the African Renaissance.

We have played a central role in the sensitive matter of nuclear disarmament very early on internationally, drawing on our own lessons here at home. In fact, the fanfare that the

UNREVISED HANSARD

JOINT SITTING

WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 65

USA is making in its role in the case of North Korea and South Korea pales in significance to the role that South Africa has played in the area of disarmament.

We have played an important role in the United Nations, especially in the formulation of the Millennium Development Goals. South Africa has played a critical role in the fight against racism, xenophobia and related intolerances, including the hosting and giving leadership in the United Nations conference on these matters.

We have not held back when we were confronted with what we regarded as gross human rights abuse. At this point we would like to apologise to the country for the glitch we made on the issue of Myanmar. It will not happen again; we have corrected that.

Our country is one of the leading nations on matters of climate change, through our role in the UN and other forums. We continue to be a leading voice against the oppression of women and the need for gender equality. Our voice in a recent conference on the women's forum on foreign affairs, we

UNREVISED HANSARD

JOINT SITTING

WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 66

provided a passionate call to ensure that women's equality is mandatory in all our work.

A recent report of the United Nations states that Sub-Saharan ... this is very important, I hope Minister Zulu is here. Sub-Saharan Africa has the highest female entrepreneurial activity rate in the entire world and I hope that it grows. We are making great strides out there.

Through hon Minister Dlamini-Zuma, South Africa was central in the formulation of the African Agenda 2063 and as part of the Non-Aligned Movement through China, IBSA etc. We are making headway to make sure that we can empower the poor and the underdeveloped countries. During the African Union summit, the Secretary-General of the United Nations had this to say in a message to us, and I quote:

In the search for durable solutions to forced displacement and the world ... and I personally have drawn constant inspiration from African leadership, African vision and African compassion. Over many years, it has become clear to me:

UNREVISED HANSARD

JOINT SITTING

WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 67

This must be underlined ...

Africa's generosity is unmatched in the world. [Applause.]

Recently, we were privileged to co-host with the United Nations the Mandela Peace Summit that focused on global peace and security, where more than 100 heads of state pledged to follow the principled leadership of Nelson Mandela. We, as a country, basked in the glory of what we mean to the world.

All these and many others are the milestones that this ANC-led government is proud to have achieved and upon which we build and ensure that South Africa continues to be at the pinnacle of addressing and helping to resolve conflicts and wars, especially on the African continent. We will infuse our own ideological interpretation of the world as opposed to being consumers of other people's.

We live in an era of profound global challenges and transitions that have serious implications for South Africa and Africa. These transitions have, as their root, the retreat into neo-isolationism; the reasserting of crude, bare-knuckled power politics; and the rise of right-wing populist movements

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 68**

across the world. This phenomenon is acutely expressed in different parts of the world. We are seeing the rise of right-leaning governments influenced by a rejection of immigration, immigrants and poor global economic performance.

We have a huge responsibility in Africa and in South Africa, all of us, to stamp out the authority of anything that is anti-multilateralism and anything that does not have its base in human rights. We may be geographically and economically a medium sized country, but our combined morality gives the world hope.

Undoubtedly, this highly dynamic and challenging global environment is, at most times, unpredictable. However, these global dynamics offer us an opportunity to strengthen multilateral systems of government, capacitating the regional, continental and global multilateral bodies and ensuring that these international fora have the necessary wherewithal to function optimally.

South Africa has assumed its seat in the United Nations Security Council. This happens at a time when there is frenetic global contestation on all fronts. Our work at the

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 69**

United Nations ... you will need to listen to this because we represent you in this. It is a very important one for South Africa, Africa and the developing countries.

Here we seek to reverse the dangerous trends towards unilateralism and protectionism that are being spearheaded by some countries. This we are doing because we are firmly committed to a strong multilateral system. South Africa believes and would always be there to promote and protect a rules-based international order.

Because most of the issues at the UNSC are those from the African continent, we do not shirk our responsibilities and allow others to dictate terms to us. South Africa will use its time at the United Nations Security Council as well as its chairship of the AU, BRICS and other multilateral forums to continue working for a strong and timeous intervention to anything that needs our decisive steps to end poverty and to make the world a better place.

Africa remains a centre of South Africa's foreign policy. We have historic and fraternal ties with the continent and we would like to continue with these. I could continue to go on

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 70**

about the gains that we have made in the continent, however, I want to go straight to the matter of those things that we have done very recently.

We monitored the Democratic Republic of the Congo, DRC, as it prepared its way to the elections and they declared their elections in 2018. We sent a very strong monitoring team and we were very proud of the peaceful manner in which DRC people conducted themselves. We supported them in that and we would like to take this opportunity to congratulate the new President. President Ramaphosa has already had interaction with President Tshisekedi and we stand to assist them at whatever point they would like to be assisted.

It will be recalled that President Ramaphosa, in his capacity as the facilitator of SADC, was responsible for Lesotho. He has now handed over this responsibility to Judge Moseneke and I hope that very soon we will have very positive results.

We want to inform you that South Africa remains committed to its principled position in support of the inalienable right of the Saharawi people to their self determination and

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 71**

independence, a position based on the resolutions and decisions expressed by SADC, the AU and the United Nations.

In demonstrating our ongoing commitment to the struggle of the Saharawi people, South Africa and Namibia will co-host the SADC Solidarity Conference on Western Sahara in South Africa from 25-26. I would like to invite all progressive people of this House to attend this conference. It is very important for us.

Zimbabwe has an ongoing challenging socio-economic situation which has inadvertently had an impact on us in South Africa. The President has been in engagements with the President of Zimbabwe and we now have a clearer picture of what is happening in Zimbabwe. As such, South Africa stands ready to assist the country in addressing the challenges that face Zimbabwe because they impact on us.

We would like to express our support for the lifting of sanctions of Zimbabwe in order to allow for economic development in that country. We have engaged the government of Zimbabwe and have a clearer idea of the problem. As such,

UNREVISED HANSARD

JOINT SITTING

WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 72

South Africa stands ready to assist the country in addressing these challenges.

Ladies and gentlemen, South Africa is slowly coming into its own. Within the space of less than a year we have seen an end of hostilities in Eritrea, Ethiopia and South Sudan. This gives me hope of what former President Mbeki used to call African Renaissance. It is upon us now and it is in the hands of President Ramaphosa. [Time expired.] I thank you all. [Applause.]

Rev K R J MESHOE: Chairperson of the NCOP, hon President, Deputy President, hon members, the ACDP is very concerned about the disruptive effect that load shedding has on the lives of ordinary South Africans, its chaotic impact on our public transport system, and the economic burden it places on our business sector. Load shedding sends a negative message to potential investors who will be concerned about the loss of production, time and revenue.

The crisis at Eskom, which resulted in unprecedented stage four load shedding, has caused public outrage across the country. The ACDP is surprised that President Ramaphosa is,"

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 73**

shocked and angry" at the crisis. He has been involved with Eskom since 2014 and chaired the Eskom war-room at the height of state capture. In our view, President Ramaphosa is not accepting political responsibility for the crisis and this is unacceptable. If the President was indeed, "shocked and angry", it shows an astonishing lack of information on his part as Head of State. This lack of knowledge, if true, is possibly more dangerous than the blackouts themselves. The ANC blames sabotage for the stage four load shedding but, in our view, it is the ANC government that has sabotaged this once proud global power utility over the years, and must be held accountable. It is shocking that the grossly overpriced and delayed Medupi and Kusile power stations are now said to have been, "badly designed and badly constructed and not performing optimally." This is nothing new. The World Bank warned us about this a long time ago.

But let us not forget that Hitachi, that won lucrative contracts, had a very cosy relationship with the ANC's investment company, Chancellor House. This cosy relationship resulted in Hitachi being fined by the US Securities Exchange Commission in 2015 for allegedly paying \$1 million "success fee" and \$5 million in dividends in connection with these

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 74**

contracts. You have said that you are, "shocked and angry" about this. Please accept responsibility, apologise to the nation and do far more to keep our lights on. Government is the shareholder at Eskom. Surely legal action can and should have been instituted against Hitachi for the shoddy workmanship in terms of the contracts. Has this been done and if not, why not? Voters are tired of excuses and will hold the ANC government accountable on 8 May for sabotaging Eskom over the years. South African voters, if we do not vote the ANC out of government, load shedding will remain with us for many years to come. Remember what Proverbs 29:2 says, "When the righteous are in authority, the people rejoice, but when the wicked rule, the people groan." Our question is, in South Africa, are our people rejoicing or groaning? We submit that they are groaning under the ANC government and that is why change must come. South Africans, vote right this time around and vote for the ACDP, your hope for a great future. Thank you. [Applause.]

Mr M KHAWULA: Hon Chairperson, His Excellency the President, at the outset, let me say that this debate should have ended yesterday after Prince Mangosuthu Buthelezi spoke because, in true patriotic style, he spoke for all of us on both sides of

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 75**

the House. As always, he was a voice of reason. Last Thursday, the President pronounced a wish list for the ideal state that we all aspire to. It was a picture of the future that has been in the promise kit for 25 years.

Millions of South Africans rejoiced the day former President Zuma exited office because at last we saw a glimmer of hope. The so-called "New Dawn" promised that things were going to change for the better. It seemed we might be able to save South Africa from disaster. Little did we anticipate that the "New Dawn" might not actually be what it was dressed up to be? One has to ask whether the past 12 months were good enough to sustain the hopes of South Africans for a better deal. Has a clean out of the culprits responsible for the criminal activities of the nine lost years kicked in effectively, or is it only targeting small fish in order to save face? South Africa faces a trust deficit between the government and the people. Once trust breaks and shatters, it is very difficult to rebuild it. In order to establish trust, you must be trustworthy yourself. It is not the actions of the past 12 months that reveal whether the ruling party can be trusted. It is the actions of the past 25 years. Yes, we have a different captain but how can South Africans pin their hopes on change

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 76**

for the better, Mr President, if your generals are still the same crew who stood by and watched when the 9 lost years were unfolding?

In the past year, we have heard shocking stories of how those who were entrusted with the guardianship of the country's resources have contributed to the collapse of its systems, by looting those very resources. We have heard of an SACF conference that contributed to the collapse of VBS bank. We have heard that state power was ceded to criminal elements in exchange for trivial personal gain. We heard confirmation testimonies of how the security and justice systems of the country were compromised in order to safeguard and perpetuate the criminal activities of the looters. These are not new stories to your ears, Mr President. The difference is that they are now being told from the horses' mouths, and not from the benches of the opposition. When we in the opposition sounded the sirens of danger, your colleagues jumped to this podium to defend the rot, enabling it to continue. It seems our country is now trying to run the marathon of recovery on a treadmill. We are not getting any closer to the promised destination. Those who were fighting for free education this time last year, are still fighting.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 77**

*IsiZulu:*

Labo ababengasebenzi namanje abakasebenzi. Ababengenamanzi, namanje abanawo. Ababengenamgwaqo, namanje abanawo.

*English:*

Those who were devastated by load shedding then are still suffering now. As the country gears up for the citizens to give a fresh mandate to a new government, the IFP reiterates its call for integrity, respect and honour for the oath of office. It cannot be that year after year, the Auditor-General keeps on lamenting the waste of our country's finances through irregular and wasteful expenditure, but nothing is done. It cannot be that, after 25 years, nothing has changed for our rural communities to make them proud of their democracy. It is shameful that our education system still favours the haves, whilst the have-nots continue to suffer an inferior education. Conditions at our tertiary institutions and TVET colleges are deteriorating so fast that many have reached unacceptable levels. Healthcare cannot be a saviour to those with money and a disaster to the poor. The Minister in the Presidency waxed lyrical yesterday on Aids successes, yet her party engineered an age of denialism and refused to roll-out antiretrovirals until the Constitutional Court intervened. The IFP had done it

UNREVISED HANSARD

JOINT SITTING

WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 78

in KwaZulu Natal. The ANC was ordered to follow suit. People in rural areas, under chiefs, also need good roads, they need clean water, they need electricity, and they need jobs. People in our black townships in Umlazi, Soweto, Khayelitsha, Mdantsane, KwaMashu, and others, also need protection from crime, they need good schools, they need good roads and decent living conditions.

Burnt down businesses in black townships should have been rehabilitated by now. Instead, undocumented foreign nationals have taken over and are selling expired goods to our communities. For far too long the people of South Africa have suffered betrayal at the hands of the ANC. They voted the ANC into power, and decisions were outsourced to the Guptas while tenders were controlled by Bosasa. The route to fair and effective justice was hijacked by criminals. This has to stop. People of South Africa, why watch this space?

*IsiZulu:*

Kuyobuya amakewu kogeza lapha nijamile.

*English:*

Trust us! Vote IFP!

UNREVISED HANSARD

JOINT SITTING

WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 79

*IsiZulu:*

Ngiyathokoza. [Ubuwelewele.]

*IsiZulu:*

Nk T M MBABAMA: Lafa elihle kakhulu.

*English:*

Considering the hype around expropriation of land without compensation, Madam Speaker, we would have expected President Ramaphosa in his state of the nation address to give us more clarity on time frames and a high level framework around the envisaged implementation process of this policy. The only relevant statement he made was the identification of state land passes for redistribution, something that the DA has always advocated.

This lack of clarity points to an absence of consensus and direction in the ANC government, around the policy of expropriation without compensation, proving that it is indeed being used as an election gimmick by the ANC and something to rally around and thus creating false sense of unity in the party. Professor Ben Cousins writes:

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 80**

The expropriation without compensation debate is essentially a distraction; it is not the main issue in land reform. The real questions are: Who do we want give land to, for what purposes? How are they going to hold that land? With what property rights and how are we going to support them? How do we secure the rights of the 60% of South Africans who hold land and housing outside the formal system?

He hits the nail on the head, as the majority of South Africans already own land under customary, communal and traditional law in our rural areas. As Professor Cousins opines the challenge is to formalise these customary land holdings using a recordal system that will give legal recognition and support to existing local processes. Amending the Constitution will not have any beneficial impact on these rural communities.

By promoting a populist stance on expropriation without compensation, the EFF-led coalition with the ANC is furthering a narrative that says the majority of black people are hungry for agricultural land. Nothing could be further from the truth, 92% of land claimants chose monetary compensation over land in the finalised restitution claims between 1995 and

UNREVISED HANSARD

JOINT SITTING

WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 81

2014. Most of the farms that were transferred to claimants as going concerns are now lying fallow due to a lack of post-settlement support from the ANC-led government and a lack of knowledge, resources and passion to farm from the claimants.

*IsiXhosa:*

Icace gca ukuba abantu bakuthi bafuna imisebenzi, bafuna ukunikezelwa ngeenkondo ezifana namanzi, umbane, iindlela, iikliniki, imfundo esemgangathweni kubantwana babo kwaye bakwafuna nokhuseleko nokunqandwa korchwaphilizo. Ewe, siyavuma ukuba abantu bakuthi mababuyiselwe imihlaba yookhokho babo kodwa imidaka emininzi namhlanje ifuna oku kwezindlu ezisemgangathweni nezigisekiso zobunini zazo.

Urhulumente we- ANC woyisakele. Kule ingama-25, abantu basahlala ematyotyombeni ekubeni iSebe leMisebenzi yoLuntu lihleli nezakhiwo ezixabisa i-R7.5 yezigidi zezigidi ezingahlali bantu. Kutheni le nto zingalungiswayo ukuze zinikwe abantu abazidingayo, Thulas Nxesi?

*English:*

The Special Investigating Unit's, SIU report into widespread and endemic corruption in the government's land reform

UNREVISED HANSARD

JOINT SITTING

WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 82

programme, is yet more proof that we do not have a Constitutional problem; we have got an ANC problem. The SIU report has been gathering dust on President Ramaphosa's desk for nearly a year, confirming that he has no intention of fixing the rampant corruption and real issues in land reform. Mr President, you are in denial that this policy has had, and will continue to have a negative impact on investment. This is despite concrete examples from countries that have walked this path before us, such as Venezuela and Zimbabwe.

This is why the DA opposes the amendment of our precious Bill of Rights and we will continue to fight it in the highest court in the land. The DA will not allow the ANC and the EFF to trample on the rights of South Africans. If we want to steal South Africa on a better path, we need to send a clear message this year that corruption will not be rewarded.

*IsiXhosa:*

Sonele nini.

*English:*

We need to expropriate power from the ANC and vote for the party that believes in giving title to the land, the DA.

UNREVISED HANSARD

JOINT SITTING

WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 83

A DA government will deliver a land reform solution that works. We have already done so in the Western Cape where there is a 62% success rate on land reform projects as compared to 8% countrywide Alan Winde. We will continue handing out title deeds so far 103 000 in ten years in the Western Cape and 6000 in Gauteng since Herman Mashaba became mayor.

We will fast track the over 6000 outstanding restitution claims and give tangible tenure to rural communities and farm-labour tenants. All government residential property and farmland will be offered to qualifying people under a grant and equity scheme with proper post settlement support.

*IsiXhosa:*

Siyi-DA sakha uMzantsi Afrika omnye, ka wonke-wonke.

*English:*

Please do the country a favour and vote DA. [Applause]

Ms L S MAKHUBELA-MASHELE: Hon Speaker, your Excellency the President, hon Ministers and Deputy Ministers, hon members, esteemed ladies and gentlemen.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 84**

Our vision as the country, as outlined by the President, lies in us in investing in our youth. Our youth should be given skills that will make them economically active citizens of the country. As a country, we must envisage the future that we want and sharpen the intellectual, social and economic awareness of the citizens who must take the baton from us.

The youth are the greatest asset and resource, and a necessary force for improving the productivity and sustained growth of all sectors of our economy. In the bigger scheme of things, the future and the youth are inseparable; the future is the youth and the youth is the future.

We firmly believe that the coherent and achievable plans set out by the ANC in our 2019 election manifesto concerning the youth are in accord with their needs and aspirations. The plans and targets are realistic and achievable.

It is an undeniable fact that millions of our youth and young people across the length and breadth of the country have benefitted from tailored programmes, policies and opportunities created by the ANC. Over the past 25 years,

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 85**

government has worked tirelessly to reduce youth unemployment and skills shortages.

The ANC-led administration is under no illusion of the difficulties and obstacles that are encountered along the road to a better future for all South Africans; specifically for the youth, who comprise of a dynamic, enthusiastic, resourceful, creative, innovative and adventurous population.

The National Youth Policy was based on the consciousness of the historical and current imbalances and realities to build a non-racial and non-sexist democratic South Africa in which young people, not only enjoy, but, contribute to their full potential in the social, economic and political spheres of life. But also recognise and develop their responsibilities to build a better life for all.

One of the major tenants of the National Youth Policy is economic participation. The policy was developed in the backdrop of various interventions to improve the opportunities and skills that young people, which for a long time, have lacked.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 86**

Hon members, in a move to create one million new work opportunities for young people, the Youth Employment Service, YES, initiative has already found placement for over 4 600 young people in 2018. The figure is not necessarily impressive given the rate of unemployment in the country, but it is a good start.

Currently, the focus on the Youth Employment Service initiative is on getting corporate partners on board. It is appreciated that a total of 248 companies in South Africa have joined this initiative to place young people for high quality work experiences within their organisations and have sponsored youth employment or youth placement in Small Medium and Macro-sized Enterprises, SMMEs, preferably within their own supply chain.

One of the highlights in the 2018 Youth Employment Service was the first community hub, which is situated in Tembisa, in Gauteng. The hub is aimed at providing infrastructure for rural areas and township communities.

This year's initiative aims at establishing over 100 community hubs across the country, which will strategically give

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 87**

business opportunities, develop and market their skills and train them.

The President reported that progress is being made in the areas of installation, repair, maintenance jobs, digital tech and coding, and data analytics as well as global business services. This will enable the absorption of more youth, specifically those exiting schools, colleges and those that are not in any education and training currently, into productive economic activity and further work opportunities.

We highly commend the government for deciding that the requirement for work experience at entry level in state institutions will be done away with. This was a huge hindrance for the qualifying first-time work seekers. As the President indicated, this gives our young people a real head start in the job market. This bold move proves that the ANC government takes issues of youth seriously.

We hope that the next thing to be done is the removal of stringent criteria for young people seeking funding to start up their own businesses. Because these stringent measures are hindrances and prohibit young people to start up businesses.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 88**

As we are talking about the real head start, we need to ensure that we emulate the KwaZulu-Natal funding model which was recently launched for young entrepreneurs. [Applause.] This model is a typical funding model aimed at assisting deserving young people to kick-start their business ventures, find new innovation business ideas and expand existing businesses without the red tape associated with traditional funding models. [Applause.] Mr President, we hope that all eight provinces will follow and emulate the KwaZulu-Natal funding model for young people.

The Fourth Industrial Revolution is upon us and as a global player in the economy, the Fourth Industrial Revolution has characterised the evolving technological trends that have the potential to fundamentally change the future of work in our country. The artificial intelligence is also threatening the nature of future work in South Africa.

We are happy, hon President, that the government is cognisant of these global trends and is planning to equip our young people with the requisite skills to remain competitive in the global village. The country must adequately prepare for these

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 89**

changes with a view to maximise the potential that they present before us.

The youth should realise that there are more jobs in entrepreneurial opportunities and in artisan skills. So, it is not everyone who should finish matric and go to universities; others must prepare and pursue the artisan field. The National Artisan Development Centre, NADC, has also created opportunities for young people across the country; and it is commendable that they are skills in track with the 30 000 artisan per annum, which the National Development Plan, NDP, targets.

Hon President, you have indicated that government is focusing attention on policies and programmes on the key parts of the economy that are labour-intensive, which include agriculture, tourism and oceans economy.

It is, indeed, an irrefutable fact that tourism is a growing economic sector that provides merit opportunities for job creation for young people. Tourism is a labour-intensive sector and is already providing the much needed solutions for youth unemployment.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 90**

The emphasis put by government on tourism is encouraging. Both in your maiden state of the nation address in 2018 and now in 2019, you have shown that you understand the barriers inhibiting tourism growth and what needs to be done to maximise the benefits from this sector.

Hon President and hon members, as the Portfolio Committee on Tourism, we are in constant communication with organised tourism business represented by the Tourism Business Council of SA, TBCSA.

I am aware that the President recently held a meeting with this industry's players. Amongst the issues that were raised were regarding unabridged birth certificates, immigration regulations, visas, tourism permits, the China-India focus strategy, infrastructure, and more recently, the industry is concerned over the decline in advanced bookings.

You will be pleasantly surprised, your Excellency, that as Parliament, we've been engaging with the Minister of Tourism and the marketing agency, SA Tourism, to develop the China-India strategy. We are looking forward to a focused approach towards harnessing tourism growth from the African continent,

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 91**

if the intended increase of international tourists of 21 million by 2030 is to be achieved.

I would like to commend and thank you Mr President in the role that you played in the Inter-Ministerial Committee, IMC, on immigration regulations. We have started to see the improvement in numbers of international arrivals. We appreciate the visa-related reforms that will facilitate ease of travel and ease of access to international tourists and business investors in general. We, therefore, welcome the announcements that the highest priority this year will be placed on the introduction of the world-class e-visa regime as it will be piloted by New Zealand.

The issue of demand and supply in the tourism sector is being attended to by the national Department of Tourism. We have seen that they are promoting youth employment. The department has conducted skills audit which culminated in the development of the tourism sector's human development strategy. This test strategy targets the entire tourism value chain and the youth in particular. The strategy is also yielding positive benefits for the youth.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 92**

In 2018 alone, about 488 young people from across the country graduated in this tailor-made programmes that were provided by the tourism industry. The ANC is pleased to report that over the years some graduates have opened their own restaurants and others are being employed as executive chefs and chefs across countries such as the Seychelles. It is a good story to tell.

[Applaud.]

Hon members, tourism should not be the after thought, but must be an integral part of all government programmes and government planning. We urge all government departments to remove all the unnecessary barriers that inhibit faster growth in this sector.

Mr President, we are well aware that tourism is a volatile service sector that strives on the optimum collaboration of many government departments. We call upon all sector departments to play their expected roles in facilitating tourism growth.

We are, however, concerned regarding the reports that international airlines are still not clear about practical implications on the revised immigration regulations. Thus, we

UNREVISED HANSARD

JOINT SITTING

WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 93

still need to ensure that those that are bringing tourists this side and the departments and various government entities know what to do. They must understand that the immigration regulations have been revised; they should not still be looking at what has happened previously.

Hon members, allow me to close this debate by quoting from the late Mama Winnie Mandela on the national Youth Day in Tshwane, in 2015, when she said:

Youth are the future of the country, so, it is important for us to give them hope. We look forward to them taking on the baton from us and spearheading the country into a prosperous nation. Therefore, as the state, we should partner with the youth today to ensure a brighter, stable and a prosperous future for our country; and as a developmental state we should acknowledge that the youth are the important actors in shaping the country's developmental agenda.

I thank you. [Applause.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

JOINT SITTING

WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 94

The SPEAKER: Hon members, we will now take a 15 minute break. The bells will be rung to indicate resumption of the debate. Thank you.

BUSINESS RESUMES AT 16:21

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Hon Speaker, hon President, fellow Cabinet colleagues and Deputy Ministers, hon members of the House, members of the NCOP, ladies and gentlemen, I'm in a dilemma here. Before I give my speech I wanted to get answers to certain things that were said in this House from ... Oh yes, my dilemma is over. I was worried that hon Lekota was not in the House. Hon Lekota, I am asking for the truth and for answers; nothing else but the truth because we are hungry for the truth.

In 1982, I was the president of the student representative council, SRC, at the University of Natal. The Deputy Minister of Health, Dr Joe Phaahla, was the president of the Azanian Students Organisation, Azaso.

One of the things that we were confronted with was rumours about comrades who sold out during the Frelimo rally.

UNREVISED HANSARD

JOINT SITTING

WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 95

Unfortunately, the comrade who was fingered most of the time was the late Comrade Ben Langa. We worked with him. He mentored us and we worked with him every day.

We wanted to know the truth around this story. So we took it upon ourselves that when people were released from Robben Island, especially those who were in that Frelimo trial in ... [Inaudible.] ... come and tell us the truth.

The first person who was called was Comrade Strini Moodley. The second person was you, Comrade Terror Lekota. We bought you a ticket to come to the University of Natal to address us. You addressed the student body, with us organising. On 16 June 1983 ...

An HON MEMBER: What's the relevance? [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: That evening ... [Interjections.] ... we called you. We sat together with you. We called senior student activists and we said, please clarify this matter of comrades who sold out during the Frelimo rally to us, and clear or specifically confirm the name of Comrade Ben Langa. We asked you ... and any other name.

UNREVISED HANSARD

JOINT SITTING

WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 96

The answer you gave us was that there was no such thing. Those were smear campaigns by the Boers who wanted to divide us. That's what you told us. [Applause.]

Now, I've got this question. At that time there was no reason whatsoever for you to protect one Cyril Ramaphosa. There was no reason. You could've told us about the way he sold out.

Now, these things worry me. Comrade Ben Langa was the younger brother of the former Chief Justice, Pius Langa. He was killed in 1984 after a similar thing; after the trial in Pietermaritzburg that included the late Judge Maqubela, Bulelani Ngcuka and Mvuyo Tom who was with us at medical school. They were ... Ben was killed because there was a rumour that he had sold out.

Pius Langa went up to Lusaka because they said the order had come from Lusaka, and Oliver Tambo said there was no such thing. Yet, he was killed. He was buried.

Maki Skosana was killed in 1985 after a rumour that she was a spy and a sellout. At the Truth and Reconciliation Commission, TRC, it was revealed that there had been nothing like that.

UNREVISED HANSARD

JOINT SITTING

WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 97

Now, if the Boers told you at that time that one Cyril Ramaphosa had written them a letter and had sold out, why didn't you disclose it to us at that time?

In 1981 when we went ... [Interjections.] ... No, yes, you asked what happened in 1974. There was no way of knowing in 1974 because he was in jail. We waited for him to come out. We wanted all the SA Student Organisation, Saso, members who had been in the Frelimo rally to clear up this matter. I'm telling you what Terror Lekota said. There's no reason to tell you what the others said because that is not relevant.

In 1991 when this President Cyril Ramaphosa was standing as the secretary-general of the ANC, you were one of the people who came to mobilise us to vote for him. Why did you want the ANC to vote for a sellout when you knew ... [Applause.] ... exactly that this man was a sellout? He sold you out on Robben Island. Yes, because you were ... [Interjections.] ... Yes, I remember the young people, led by Peter Mokaba, wanted Alfred Nzo. We were of the United Democratic Front, UDF, era and we listened to you because you were our very famous ... very famous, powerful ... yes ... publicity secretary and you directed us to vote for Cyril Ramaphosa. Why a sellout who

UNREVISED HANSARD

JOINT SITTING

WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 98

sold you out so much that you wanted him to be a leader of a liberation movement? Perhaps you will give us answers. I don't know. [Applause.] [Interjections.]

Mr President ...

Dr M Q NDLOZI: Point of order.

The SPEAKER: Please take your seat, hon Minister. What's the point of order, Mr Ndlozi?

Dr M Q NDLOZI: Hon Lekota has a sworn statement, chief, not intsumansumane [stories.] He's got a sworn statement under oath of the President selling out. [Interjections.] Give us a sworn statement yourself.

The SPEAKER: Hon Ndlozi, that's not a point of order. There's no point of order there. Just take your seat, hon Ndlozi.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: It doesn't matter. It doesn't matter. Our comrades have died because of such sworn statements. Any sworn statements from security officers ...

UNREVISED HANSARD

JOINT SITTING

WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 99

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, please proceed with your speech.

Mr M G P LEKOTA: Madam Speaker?

An HON MEMBER: No, but the issue of sworn statements doesn't scare us. [Interjections.]

Mr M G P LEKOTA: May I rise ...

An HON MEMBER: Thank you, Mr President. [Interjections.]

Mr M G P LEKOTA: Point of order. Point of order.

The SPEAKER: What's the point of order?

Prince M G BUTHELEZI: Hon Speaker, Mr Ramaphosa is the president of the ANC but he's also the Head of State. When serious matters like these ... allegations so serious about him are being discussed, I just plead with my colleagues that they should give us an opportunity to hear both sides. *Audi alteram partem*. [Applause.]

Mr M G P LEKOTA: Madam Speaker?

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 100**

The SPEAKER: Hon Lekota, I'm not taking your point of order because I would like the Minister to proceed with his speech. We listened to what you said in the House earlier and he has given another view. If you have anything more to say to the House that is substantive we would like you to submit it in the form that you are aware the rules allow for please. Hon Minister, please proceed.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Mr President, thank you for giving the nation marching orders about the biggest health revolution that is going to hit the shores – the National Health Insurance, NHI. To quote you, you said:

After extensive consultation, the NHI Bill will soon be ready for submission to Parliament. The NHI will enable South Africans to receive free services at the point of care in public and private quality-accredited health facilities. By applying the principle of social solidarity and cross-subsidisation, we aim to reduce inequality in access to health care.

UNREVISED HANSARD

JOINT SITTING

WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 101

Mr President, it was very important for you to say so; to put your stamp of approval because there are some individuals and institutions who want to undermine this.

In 2011, the prestigious British medical journal, *The Lancet*, said that universal health coverage, which we in South Africa call NHI, is going to be the third transition to health, ever since human beings populated this planet.

*The Lancet* said that the first transition was in the 18th century and that was when clean running water, sewerage and sanitation were introduced to humankind. While some may believe that this was a small step and take it for granted, in health terms it introduced a totally new world altogether. Mortalities and morbidities around the world dropped in a dramatic fashion. Dying under unsanitary conditions was no longer a certainty.

*The Lancet* went on to say that the second transition arrived in the latter part of the 19th century, and that was the introduction of vaccination. Many diseases were vanquished and swept off the face of the earth without a cure ever being found. One of them was smallpox. It was declared over by the

UNREVISED HANSARD

JOINT SITTING

WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 102

World Health Organisation in 1970 due to the worldwide immunisation of human beings. No cure was ever found for this disease that had exterminated many, many people around the globe before the second transition, which was vaccination. The second transition did away with it. Up to now, more than 50 years later, it's still gone.

*The Lancet* went on to say that the third transition is going to occur in health if universal health coverage becomes a reality. What is NHI, as we call it in South Africa? It simply says from the total wealth of the country, who gets what for health care and for their health needs. For the first time in the history of our country, NHI is going to ensure that receiving health care has nothing to do with the depth of your pocket.

Transitions in health are not just inventions, discoveries or new innovations. There was a question by some when *The Lancet* mentioned the three transitions I referred to. They wondered why one of the greatest achievements of humankind, the first ever heart transplant on earth, performed by a South African, our very own Dr Christiaan Barnard, did not qualify as a transition.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 103**

The first heart transplant was no mean feat. It was one of the greatest human achievements for our country but it does not qualify as a transition. Transitions in health are those that change the whole population; the total transformation of human experience. Transitions in health are those that will change even the lives of people who would not have heard about them.

Actually, in linking the first heart transplant with NHI, I wish to bring to the attention of this House that the recipient of that heart in 1967 was one Louis Washkansky. He was an ordinary South African. He never had to suffer the anxiety of not having money. He did not even know or did not have to know what the heart transplant cost. All he knew was that he was sick and doctors told him that he needed a new heart otherwise he would die if he didn't get one. The rest was left to the state.

Fast forward to today. Anyone going to have a heart transplant needs to crunch figures and numbers, calculate their bank balances and audit their assets. Two years ago, I was faced with a very serious story of a family's agony, whose dying child was required by a private hospital to pay three million rand for an auxiliary heart while waiting for a heart

UNREVISED HANSARD

JOINT SITTING

WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 104

transplant that was going to follow later. The total for the auxiliary heart and the final heart transplant was three million. This cannot be allowed to continue. The NHI is designed to completely change this state of affairs and give South Africans a Louis Washkansky experience of health.

Universal health coverage was a central issue in Davos in January. It was a central issue at the AU's Africa Leadership Meeting, called Investing in Health. In September it is going to the high level meeting at the UN.

Now, because of this worldwide support, those who opposed it have now added the word, but. They've changed. They've said we support NHI, but. And the but is about improving the health care system of the country. They say we must wait until the situation has improved.

Why should the poor always wait? All of us in this House enjoy free health care at the point of service. Yes, that is what your medical aid does for you. It gives you free health care at the point of service and this free health care is heavily ... [Interjections.] Yes, that is the myth.

UNREVISED HANSARD

JOINT SITTING

WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 105

This free health care is heavily subsidised by this government. When we want to subsidise the poor you complain. Last year alone, all people on medical aid were subsidised by R57 billion ...

An HON MEMBER: By who?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: ... by this government. Yet, you are saying the poor are not entitled to that money. We can't ... [Interjections.] Yes, including me. I'm benefitting from this. We cannot keep on telling the poor to wait. Wait for what?

We are the ANC. We can't. [Interjections.] We are a movement of all South Africans - the poor, the rich, black, white, brown, yellow, the employed, the unemployed, the young, the old, the healthy, the sick, the rural, the urban, and all citizens who reside within the borders of our country. We want to give them equal, good quality health care. [Applause.] We are not inclined to make others wait for an undefined period in the future before they could ... [Inaudible.] ... this good, quality health care.

UNREVISED HANSARD

JOINT SITTING

WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 106

We are not like one organisation I know about in this House that was very excited last week after realising that black people actually exist and that black people do actually have a right to the economic pie of the country.

That party was excited that they now realised this. We in the ANC realised it more than 100 years ago. [Applause.] They realise it now. Now, President, the way they were excited after realising that black people exist ... I heard this in Addis Ababa and I said, oh, they are so excited; it's as if they had just successfully performed the first brain transplant just by realising that black people exist.

At any rate, Mr President, yesterday we gave an account of what we are going to do to improve the public health care system and I'm here to report to this Parliament that eight of the ideal clinics built under NHI have been completed – in Lusikisiki, Lutubeni, Sakhela, Maxwhele, all of them have been ... [Applause.] We are going to open them in March or April. Four are being built in Vhembe and four in Gert Sibande; all of them under NHI. [Time expired.]

Thank you very much. Thank you very much. [Applause.]

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 107**

Ms N I TARABELLA-MARCHESI: Chairperson, when the curtain falls on the one-party reign of the ANC, this government will be measured on how it treated the most vulnerable. The ANC's treatment of learners is shocking to say the least. The greatest failure of the Department of Basic Education in the last decade is its inability to provide our learners with decent sanitation.

Not only because of the tragedy of losing two learners who drowned and died in pit latrines, but because each and every president since the dawn of democracy, sat on that sit and promised to eradicate pit toilets. [Applause.] The most profound speech was made in 2004, by then President Thabo Mbeki, who said:

By the end of this financial year we shall ensure that there is no learner and student learning under a tree, mud school or any dangerous conditions that expose learners and teachers to these elements.

That was 15 years ago, Mr President. Last year, President Ramaphosa, you told us all that the Accelerated Schools Infrastructure Delivery Initiative, Asidi, projects would be

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 108**

finished by March 2019. It was populist propaganda then and it is populist propaganda now. And the reason was always one, to garner votes just like you are trying to garner votes when you talk about giving out tablets. Mr President, we need toilets now, not tablets; we need teachers now, not tablets; we need textbooks now, not tablets; and we need you to deal with the SA Democratic Teachers Union, Sadtu, now, and not tablets.

Show leadership and be resolute with Sadtu. The Minister Angie Motshega will thank you for it.

Mr President you announced that 699 schools were provided with safe and adequate sanitation since the launch of the Sanitation Appropriate for Education, Safe, Initiative since its launch in June last year. How did you pull that miracle in seven months with a fraction of the budget on sanitation? We need specifics: when, where, how and by whom. Give us the price tag because the toilets at Myolwa Primary School, Lusikisiki, in the Eastern Cape cost R4,5 million, for nine pit toilets.

Remember also, and don't be shocked, R7,2 billion was taken from school infrastructure and moved to Higher Education, and

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 109**

now apparently there is another budget cut on the second year mid-term budget, but according to you we need tablets. Is it really tablets for learners or you want to line the ANC pockets? Where are your priorities, Mr President?

You say you care about education. We just celebrated 78% pass rate in matric, but actually the real pass rate is 37,6% because we have 52% of learners who dropped off the system. The Multiple Examination Opportunity Policy intended to advantage learners is bound to be exploited by the teachers, principals and provinces. As we sit here Limpopo has about 23% of progressed learners, the highest in the country, and the Western Cape sits on a mere 6,3%, the lowest in the country for the last two years.

But the ANC's disdain for South Africans is not only limited to the children of our country. The distribution of social grants has all but collapsed under the mismanagement and corruption in the Department of Social Development. South Africans eventually had to turn to the courts to prevent Minister Dlamini from halting social grant payments through her dodgy deals with the Cash Paymaster Services, CPS. Why didn't you fire the Minister, Mr President? You recently

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 110**

commended the Department of Social Development for complying with the Constitutional Court order. When do we congratulate a government for following the law? You should have begun with a sincere apology to the millions of South Africans that wait in queues for hours on end, uncertain whether they will be able to feed their children.

South Africa, if you ever needed an indication of how little the ANC thinks of the plight of women in our country, it is this. The President rewarded the person who destroyed our social grants system by making her the Minister of Women. In her we are unlikely to find the champion for women that South Africans so desperately in need of.

You have wonderful plans and summits to tackle gender-based violence, but on the ground the government actively contributes to the risks that women face daily. In the specialist units that deal with sexual offences and family violence, the most vulnerable victims of such crimes were exposed to even more criminals. The DA uncovered that 57 officers with serious criminal records, including culpable homicide and assault, are working in SA Police Service, SAPS,

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 111**

and the Family Violence, Child Protection and Sexual Offences, FCS, units. This is typical of the ANC government.

This is hardly surprising considering how the ANC backed the Deputy Minister caught on camera assaulting a woman. In contrast, the DA has always made sure that the protection and the rights of the people come first and quality service delivery at the centre of everything we do. The DA provides the best quality education in the country. That is according to the Department of Basic Education's own inclusive basket measure. Just ask the Minister. The Western Cape has run a world-class infrastructure project which is why there is no school in the province that is without Safe sanitation. The Western Cape... [Time expired.]

Mr S M JAFTA: Hon Speaker, in reminiscent of the total shutdown in Zimbabwe in 2018, which was engineered by ordinary Zimbabweans to depose former President Mugabe, President Ramaphosa has made an address to the nation last year and was also met with optimism and renewed hope. Only last week this optimism has faded away. While the President has enjoined us to collectively move the country forward, he has not taken the country into his confidence in addressing the structural

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 112**

deficit in the South African economy. His constant refrain to foreign direct investment is not only unfeasible, but also unachievable, especially in a country that is a feeding ground for policy uncertainty, corruption, power shortage and state inaptitude.

Our electricity capacity is in crisis. While the unbundling of Eskom will offset the current electricity constraints, it is not clear how Eskom subsidiaries will feature on this transition to recapitalise Eskom. The President must outline these processes.

The President has not sufficiently addressed the attendant offset that the politicisation of our criminal justice system has had on the performance of our economy. In this regard his failure to initiate a discussion around the appointment of the National Director of Public Prosecution is again unsurprising. It is unsurprising yet more that the President has chosen not to insulate the appointment of the commissioner of the SA Revenue Service, Sars, away from political delegation.

We also don't believe that the process of handling the restructuring of the National Intelligence will be led by a

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 113**

political appointee such as the President. The criminal justice system should completely be depoliticised.

About 52% of the youth population in South Africa is not employed. The President is an inactive exponent of meaningless job summits which often have little bearing on the millions of young people trapped under the yoke of poverty and inequality. As outlined in our manifesto, the entry level job requirements such as experience have not only worsened the plight of young people, but also excluded them from participating in mainstream economy. Our education system is designed to perpetuate the inequality gaps seen everywhere in the country. To improve the education system the AIC will do away with the rationalisation of schools policy. Mega-sized schools do not always address the structural socioeconomic challenges affecting our learners.

In recalibrating the size of government departments, we propose the following mergers. Water and Sanitation should be merged with Environmental Affairs. Economic Development, Trade and Industry and Small Business Development should be merged together. Tourism and Sport and Recreation should also merge, and Mineral Resources and Energy likewise. We hope these

UNREVISED HANSARD

JOINT SITTING

WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 114

interventions will rid the country of excesses of executives.  
I thank you.

Cllr T NKADIMENG: Hon Speaker of the National Assembly, hon Chairperson of the NCOP, Your Excellency, President Cyril Ramaphosa, hon members and fellow South Africans, it is my honour and a humbling privilege to bring to you greetings from the leadership collective of the SA Local Government Association, Salga. We are under the astute leadership of the president of Salga who also serve as the President of United Cities and Local Governments, the mayor of the world, Councillor Parks Tau. [Interjections.] I speak here this afternoon on this debate representing the local fraternity of our country, very cognisant of the increased expectations of both local communities and the global development community of the critical role of the local arm of the state in making meaningful impact and the advancement of the development of our people.

His Excellency, President Ramaphosa started his state of the nation address by, amongst others, inviting us to recognise and celebrate the 25 years anniversary of our freedom. He asked us whether we have build a society in which all South

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 115**

Africans, equally and without exception, enjoyed the indelible right of life, dignity, and liberty. I am a living testimony that we are living that. Starting from inception, at the time when I was looking for my sister Nokuthula Simelane who was brutally murdered by the apartheid regime, until today, I would be sitting with Coetzee, Pretorius and Mong in court to ensure that that right to life is respected. You further went on by challenging us to reflect on the progress we have made on challenges that we have encountered - the setbacks and the progress that we have made.

In an attempt to respond to that, hon President, as organised local government, we must start by acknowledging the massive progress that we have made over the past 18 years of our democratic dispensation. [Applause.] This includes the provision of basic services to so many of our people, the rapid development and the quality infrastructure, the increase mobility, investment in social amenities and massive progress in financial management and institutional resilience. This is highlighted clearly in the 2017 Statistics SA nonfinancial census of municipalities, which confirms that the number of consumers receiving services from our municipalities increased

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 116**

in the provision of sewer, sanitation, electricity, solid waste and water.

Hon President, we pride ourselves by our indigent support management system which is given to our indigent households. About 3,6 million of indigents benefits in this. They receive 6 kl of water for free. If I say 6 kl you will be tempted to think that it is just little amount, it is 6 000 l free water per month. [Applause.] [Interjections.] They receive 50 kilowatts of free electricity in their homes, and this indigent system is meant to benefit the poor - the real poor who are sitting in rural municipalities.

While we are mindful and appreciative of the progress made by our sector, we are ever mindful as well that there are policy-related presumptions which were made at what the system will focus on and how it will be resourced and supported. Chief amongst this includes the revenue, rate assumption that local government will be able to generate 90% plus of current expenditure. The following realities have proved otherwise. Municipalities are under cash flow constraints, with over 123 municipalities collecting less than 80% on a monthly basis, and a further 75 municipalities with less than 60% collection

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 117**

levels. Speaker through you to the hon President, in short, the aggregate municipal consumer debts amounts to R158 billion of which is realistically not collectable. But we are here not to complain, we are here to bring solutions. It is our submissions that fundamentals in making municipalities developmental is an urgent need to sort out these lingering challenges arising from the current fiscal framework. This must include consideration of unsustainable and increasing debts owed to municipalities.

Before we talk about those who are owed by municipalities, can we talk about those who owe municipalities? Emalahleni Local Municipality debt book, as at December 2018, is sitting at about R3,8 billion. To me and you who knows Emalahleni, it looks like a viable municipality. It is in town, it is modern and it is urban but the payment rate is at 66,8%. Now it is our respective view that bold measures are needed to cap the debts and ensure that municipalities collect and better manage their customers and that national interventions are initiated. Can we introduce a legislation which will follow a proper, thorough process of writing off of bad, uncollectible debts against incentives such as the installation of prepaid meters to prevent recurrence of nonpayment?

UNREVISED HANSARD

JOINT SITTING

WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 118

In addition hereto, there is a need for us to rethink the overall government fiscus and grading architecture that will ensure that the adequately resourced genuinely undercapacitated municipalities, particularly rural municipalities, perform their functions and discharge their obligations properly.

*Sepedi:*

Ka segagešo re re ga go na yo mosehlana.

*English:*

Loosely translated it means that human beings are of equal wealth, something that you still need to teach yourself, and our records are a desire that municipalities need to serve its people with desire and dignity. So, if we grade a rural municipality low, it means it is unable to provide services to its people and we are calling for a better government fiscal and grading architecture to make sure that rural municipalities are able to deliver.

We have a responsibility to ensure the urgency in the building of this. A large number of municipalities are enviable due to the structural and systematic problems. These problems

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 119**

continue to weaken local government to discharge its obligations which is now manifesting itself in the impasse between our member municipalities and Eskom on the outstanding debts against that backdrop which is owed by municipalities.

Most municipalities affected by these ballooning debts and affordability repayment weaknesses are the so-called unviable municipalities. It means without this structural fiscus response to review funding of municipalities and without reviewing the systemic problems like high interests on debts, excessive punitive measures, Eskom credit control policies and unreconciled municipal credit policies collection cycle, the problem will persist.

We must also hasten to add support to the voice of the President that we need to take the step to reduce municipal nonpayment to Eskom, but also by extension to our water boards, and confront the culture of nonpayment that exists in some communities. As Salga we remain committed to be in partnership with the Department of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs and the Presidency to champion the campaign to encourage such payments of municipal services.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 120**

We welcome acknowledgement that bold decisions and decisive actions are needed to secure energy supply and the need for a business model to ensure that we get power and clear generation. We stand to support the decision to relook into a model of Eskom in the hope that in doing so there would be a response to the mammoth task to resolve and provide sustainable solution on some of the most difficult stubborn challenges.

Now is the time to ensure that the sustainable electricity industry have a positive impact in the livelihoods and health of our people. The recent intergovernmental relations platforms, including government, and confirming schedule 4(b) of the Constitution read together with section 1313 that mandates municipalities with reticulation and supply of power. So, local government is a key player and materially affected in the electricity and energy space. We therefore eagerly await to contribute to this consultation and a dialogue that will unfold with regard to this.

As local government we are similarly focusing our efforts on reigniting growth and jobs. It is inspired by what the hon President said to us on December 2018 at Salga Members

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 121**

National Assembly, convened also a council of mayors underenhancing a role of municipalities in promoting investment and job creation from 6 to 7 February 2019. Within this context, we acknowledge that local government faces many challenges, including issues from the need to grow our economy and create jobs, extensive service delivery needs and high expectation among residents.

We have also held these fruitful outcomes and agreed that we will hold together a government labour business, civil society, communities to remove the constraints to inclusive growth and pursue far greater levels of investment. It is within this context that we welcome the establishment of the team and support the work of the team that will address the policy, legal, regulatory and administrative barriers that frustrate investors and constraints inclusive growth.

With regard to the fight against corruption, as leaders in local government we are pledging our unreserved support to root out evil within our municipalities. We are taking the responsibility. Much is to be done to inform member municipalities about the imperative of accountability and the inescapable consequences in local government and to enable

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 122**

them to enforce the implementation of accountability legislation, regulation and measures. We remain committed to institute and deepen consequences to make sure that there is accountability in the sector.

The slow pace of land reform is becoming a concern to us and various partners have raised the matter for a while. We therefore welcome the pronouncement by the President in this regard; in particular, the ability for municipalities to access land for human settlement will go a long way in transforming our spatial form that had been deliberately fragmented for years.

We are committed in reversing the apartheid spatial form that has proven to be one of the biggest facing local municipalities today. So, it is very critical for us to deliberate in not just delivering houses for which we have performed with unparalleled success, considering over 4 million houses have been built in just over 20 years. However, it is critical that these houses are built in a manner that makes social and economic assets to their recipients.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 123**

As I conclude, hon Speaker, I stand before you on behalf of Salga and the local organised government sector and the leaders from all our municipalities and pledge our positive support as we embrace the spirit of activism in line with the President's clarion call of "Thuma Mina" to send us. You have sent us to serve our people with dignity and integrity. Yes Mr President, we will be there to respond to our people's cry for services. [Applause.] [Interjections.] We too will be there to turn the faces of poverty to beaming sunlight. We will be there to turn the despair and the state of destituteness to smiles of hope in our people. We will be there to lead the fight against rampant corruption in our municipalities.

Hon President, we wanna be there when the records of history applaud us for fulfilling the Constitution of our promise to build a better future for all. [Applause.] [Interjections.] This realisation comes from our founding father, Nelson Mandela, who said that it is in our hands to make our country a better place for all our people. I thank you.

[Interjections.] [Applause.]

Ms L M MASEKO: On a point of order. Is it parliamentary for the Leader of the Opposition to drink coffee in the House?

UNREVISED HANSARD

JOINT SITTING

WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 124

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP:

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Hon Deputy Chairperson, Your Excellency, the President of the Republic of South Africa, Mr Cyril Ramaphosa, president of the NFP, V Z kaMagwaza-Msibi, hon members and extinguished guests in the gallery, allow me to pay tribute to our men and women in blue, particularly those that have lost that have lost their lives in the line of duty serving our communities. Also allow me to extend our condolences to the families of the three learners who died at Hoërskool Driehoek tragedy, including the student who was gunned down at Durban University of Technology, DUT, in Durban.

Hon President, while I understand that this speech is more an election speech and I think that it is evident by the responses from all the different parties here today. Allow me to express my disappointment, hon President, that in your speech, you didn't address the challenges of the Khoi and the San community, particularly the recognition, the chieftainship and the kingship in terms of the resolution that was taken in 2007, at the United Nations.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 125**

Mr President, also allow me to express our concern that you did not touch on the issue of Palestine despite it being a resolution in your conference to downgrade the South African embassy in Israel to a liaison office.

Mr President, let me get to the issue of state-owned entities. I want to make it very clear that the NFP will never support the privatisation of state-owned entities. There is no problem with state-owned entities; in fact, many of those that are employed in the state-owned entities come clean, until such time they come in contact politicians, then they get corrupted. That is where the problem is. If we deal with the corruption, maladministration and do proper oversight ... there is nothing wrong with state-owned entities.

There is also nothing to brag about the discovery of gas and oil if foreign nationals are going to continue controlling it. Let this be a benefit to South Africa and South Africans as a whole. That is why the NFP says that let the wealth of this country belong to this country.

Mr President, let me head to another issue. My colleague here on the left-hand side, who is in self-imposed exile, and that

UNREVISED HANSARD

JOINT SITTING

WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 126

is hon Maimane ... [Laughter.] Mr President, he comes here and says ... and I like the idea of what he said. He has been throughout the country and has found a whole lot of challenges. Shouldn't charity begin at home? Has he visited the Western Cape and see under what kind of conditions the people are living? [Applause.] It is shocking and horrendous. [Applause.] He does nothing about it. I can give you so many examples, Mr President.

Mr President, I addressed this House on evictions and you gave an assurance that it must stop and that we cannot continue while land restitution ... [Inaudible.17:03:09] It still continues under the DA.

Corruption has not stopped. I think you are aware that, we, as the NFP brought to light the corruption with regard to the R600 million.

Mr President, let's talk about corruption in South Africa. Why is the corruption still not being addressed wholeheartedly and openly? Let me give you a good example, we have Bosasa and state capture, what about Limpopo province in 2012 under Malema? [Interjections.] It was corrupt. He bankrupted it. Why

UNREVISED HANSARD

JOINT SITTING

WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 127

are we not dealing with this issue? [Interjections.] These are all monies of poor South Africans that they have been stealing and eating. [Interjections.] Putting a red overall for R50 with R400 000 underneath means nothing, Mr President. Let us deal with these problems holistically. South Africa is burning and our people are suffering, yet nothing is happening. We need to deal with it.

Mr President, why are we not dealing with the VBS Bank issue? When the EFF takes the money, then it comes from a family member, it is not theft. We need to deal with this thing, Mr President.

The NFP is telling you, the DA, watch what is going to happen in the Western Cape. It is time for you to move and run very fast. Life would change for the people of the Western Cape.

Mr President, the NFP is expressing its concern that government is not dealing with the challenges that people face in the province ... [Time expired.] Thank you very much.

[Applause.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

JOINT SITTING

WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 128

The MINISTER OF WOMEN IN THE PRESIDENCY: Hon Chairperson of the NCOP, hon President of the Republic of S A, President Cyril Ramaphosa, hon Ministers, Deputy Ministers, ladies and gentlemen ...

*IsiZulu:*

... uyazi kunenkinga uma kuyiwa okhethweni. Uyabona ilungu elihloniphekile uTerror Lekota usefike la wazokhuluma.

*English:*

Now issues about him are flying in the social media. There are also accusations he is faced with that he was selling out when they were returning from Steve Biko's funeral. He asked to alight from the bus at an isolated dark spot on the way in a veld where there was no transport and later the bus was stopped by the special branch and comrades were arrested - hon member Terror [Interjections.]

Chairperson, I stand here today representing the interests of 51% of the population of South Africa. [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Order, hon members! Can we hear what the Minister says, please? [Interjections.] No, no,

UNREVISED HANSARD

JOINT SITTING

WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 129

don't choose what you want to hear and what you don't want to hear. Allow the Minister to then present her input on the state of the nation address. [Interjections.] Order, hon members! Order! It is not everything that you would want to hear that we like. Hon Minister, can you continue with the debate, please.

*IsiZulu:*

UNGQONGQOSHE WABESIFAZANE EHHOVISI LIKAMONGAMELI: Kwavuka bonke abekade belele. [Uhleko.]

*English:*

I stand here today representing the interests of 51% of the population of South Africa. The struggles waged by women over centuries have ensured that we have made important strides towards our national goal of a nonsexist society. South Africa's democracy is founded on the Constitution, which gives the three arms of the state, the executive, the judiciary and the legislature the power to eradicate patriarchy that is dominating within white males. [Interjections.] We have Chapter 9 institutions that were established to protect human and women's rights. We have a vibrant civil society that

UNREVISED HANSARD

JOINT SITTING

WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 130

ensures gender equality principles are mainstreamed in all institutions.

*IsiZulu:*

Imizabalazo yomama uCharlotte Maxeke, uMama Sisulu, uSophie de Bruyn, uMama Winnie Madikizela-Mandela, Helen Joseph [Uhleko.] Rahima Moosa, Phila Ndwandwe, Nomkhosi Mini, Dulcie September kanye noCecilie Palmer iyona eyenze saba namalungelo kanye nenkululeko yabantu besifazane efakwe yashicilelwa kuMthethosisekelo waseNingizimu Afrika.

*English:*

This freedom, not only benefitted the millions of black women but also white Afrikaner and English speaking women, and LGBTQIA, lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender, queer or questioning, intersex and asexual or allied+ Communities. [Applause.] What did the ANC-led government inherits in 1994? Madam Speaker, women were systematically excluded from the political, social and economic spheres under a racist, sexist and violent apartheid regime. The problem is that you get excited very easily. [Interjections.] The State Capture Commission would never have been under the leadership of white National Party apartheid government. [Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

JOINT SITTING

WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 131

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Order! Order, hon members!

The MINISTER OF WOMEN IN THE PRESIDENCY: You failed to tell the truth in the Truth and Reconciliation Commission.

[Interjections.] You are enjoying up until today the pain of our people. You are doing what the apartheid people and the police did whilst killing our people having 'braai'.

[Interjections.] That is what you are doing.

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon Minister, just hold it. Hon Steenhuisen, there is one thing I like about you. You always carry the Rule book and you always quote from the Rule book. I guess you know that when a member is on the podium you are not supposed to debate or engage the member.

[Interjections.] Hon Minister may you please address the House through me to avoid this kind of engagement. [Interjections.] Order, hon members!

The MINISTER OF WOMEN IN THE PRESIDENCY: Chairperson, the heroic, noble and brave idea of the State Capture Commission was a tedious process that was very painful, discussed by the National Committee of the ANC and you would never have done that. [Interjections.] Up until today, you are still fighting

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 132**

for the land you stole. [Interjections.] Up until today, you are enjoying the wealth of the country whilst you are a few. Up until today, you believe that you are a superior race. [Applause.] As women, we have made significant strides in ensuring that we are better represented and have a voice in Parliament, in the judiciary, in Cabinet, in the Public Service, and in society at large. The percentage of women in Cabinet increased from 11% in 1994 to 48% in 2018. [Applause.] Women's representation in Parliament increased from 28% to 42%. The number of women in senior management in the Public Service increased from 5% in 1994 to 42% in 2018. These are our achievements as the ANC-led government, which have seen to South Africa's improvement in the global gender inequality index.

We have made important advances in improving women's access to quality health care, quality education, skills development, and the fight against HIV and Aids. Our social protection system has a direct impact in alleviating the poverty facing women and girls. This shows our commitment to building an inclusive and caring society based on social solidarity and social justice. The rights of women workers have been entrenched.

UNREVISED HANSARD

JOINT SITTING

WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 133

You must ask a question from your leadership [Interjections.] Why they are defending the cases of racism, sexual harassment, people that abused women from other municipalities and provinces and bring them here. [Interjections.] You must ask your leader: Why he said LGBTQIA + Communities have a problem they need to be prayed for? [Interjections.] You must know that you are standing on a shaky ground. [Interjections and Applause.] Yes, presently your successes depend on three women that you have been pushing from pillar to post. They depend on Lindiwe Mazibuko, Patricia de Lille as well Hellen Zille. [Interjections.] You don't want them. Yes, Mr President they must watch the space. You will never have the power to galvanise and mobilise people to vote for you, like the women who mobilised for you to have the percentage you have now and today. [Interjections.] Whatever you do, whatever sign you show, you are also going down. [Applause.]

You know I saw some of you here. Some were not born in 1994 and some were still in nappies. You ran to hon member Terror and you felt very morose as if you did nothing and as if you did not gain anything during the apartheid regime - when you gained a lot. [Interjections.] You always want to remove your

UNREVISED HANSARD

JOINT SITTING

WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 134

guilt from yourselves to us. Go and drink with me in the bar.  
[Applause.] Our social protection system has a direct impact.

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon Minister may you take your seat. Hon member on what point are you rising? Hon members, order! May I hear what the member is rising on?

Mr P VAN DALEN: There was a ruling earlier that said a member cannot address or attacking another member. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon member I can't hear you. Hon members, order! Order, hon members! I want to hear what the member is rising on. [Interjections.] If it so happened that you have ... hon members, order!

The MINISTER OF WOMEN IN THE PRESIDENCY: Your mother.  
[Laughter.]

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon Minister, can you take a seat please. If you have heard what the member is rising on, please give me an opportunity to hear now. Hon member what point are you rising on? Can you please speak to the mic.

UNREVISED HANSARD

JOINT SITTING

WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 135

Mr P VAN DALEN: Yes House Chair, it was a ruling that was made earlier that said that the member on a podium must not have a dialogue with someone sitting on the benches. [Interjections.] Hon Minister may you please address the members of the House through the Chair. Thank you very much.

Ms Z S DLAMINI-DUBAZANE: Hon Chair, sorry to disturb. [Interjections.] Sorry to disturb, hon Chair.

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Where are you? Oh, okay.

Ms Z S DLAMINI-DUBAZANE: Hon Chair, I just want to make a follow up - that is Rule 14(1). Rule 14(1) it is when a speaker addresses an individual within the House either than addressing that member through the Chair. The Minister on the podium is just making a political debate [Interjections.] facing them not addressing an individual person.

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon members, order! Order! There is an earlier ruling that was made by the Chairperson of the National Council of Provinces and I am just following up on that. As we address the House, let us recognise that there is a presiding officer and engage with the House through the

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 136**

presiding officers. I appeal also to the members of the Opposition as and when you feel to heckle, may you please avoid drowning the member and not allowing other members who want to hear what the member says or what he has to say. Can we continue with the debate, hon member.

The MINISTER OF WOMEN IN THE PRESIDENCY: The rights of women workers have been entrenched through progressive labour laws introduced by the ANC government over the past 25 years. This includes the Labour Relations Act, the Basic Conditions of Employment Act, the Employment Equity Act, the Unemployment Insurance Act, and the National Minimum Wage Act. Women continue to face a deeply entrenched system of institutionalised patriarchy. This is defended and reinforced by the justice system, our political parties, our education system, our families, the media and our religious systems. Among the greatest challenges facing our society is the scourge of gender-based violence, which is deeply rooted in the colonial and violent apartheid past. South African society has declared a war against women.

Mr President, you have responded to the call for the fight against gender-based violence with your commitment to increase

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 137**

the budget for gender equality and women's empowerment under the leadership of the Department of Women. This budget will enhance the rollout of Thuthuzela, Khuseleka and Kgomotso Care Centres, shelters for women, white and green door safe houses, and the National Gender-Based Violence Command Centre. The Presidency continues to work with women from across all sectors to ensure that the resolutions of the Presidential Summit on Gender-Based Violence and Femicide are implemented.

We are currently building a national multistakeholder council, which will be adequately funded. The composition of the council will be representative of all South African women, and the LGBTQIA+ Community and will be governed by legislation.

The eradication of gender-based violence requires a comprehensive and systematic response by all South Africans, by all sectors. Mr President, your exemplary leadership in the fight against gender-based violence must be emulated by other leaders in government, civil society and the private sector. Gender-based violence must become a household debate.

[Applause.] The police and the courts must be better capacitated and equipped to support victims and survivors of gender-based violence, to prevent secondary victimisation and to ensure justice is done.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 138**

We pay tribute to Cheryl Zondi and other young women for their bravery and courage in the face of a brutal and uncaring judicial procedure. We welcome the appointment of the new National Director of Public Prosecutions, Advocate Shamila Batohi. We remain confident that under her leadership the prosecution of sexual offences will place at the centre the needs of victims and survivors. We support the Commission for the Promotion and Protection of Rights of Cultural, Religious and Linguistic Communities recommendations made to Parliament that there must be an audit and registration of all places of worship. The time is now for the total eradication of the abuse of women and children under the guise of religion.

[Applause.]

Tomorrow is the 14th of February and we are reminded of the murder of Reeva Steenkamp. We remember Karabo Mokoena, Zolile Khumalo, Susan Rohdes, and countless others who died at the hands of the people they loved. In September 2018, Nicholas Ninow was arrested for the alleged rape of a 6-year-old girl. We stand by Criselda Dudumashe and Babes Wodumo and many other women who have been abused by their intimate partners. The abuse of women - young and old, rich and poor, famous and not

UNREVISED HANSARD

JOINT SITTING

WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 139

famous shows that violence against women cuts across.

Therefore ...

*IsiZulu:*

... asikho isidingo sokuthi silwe ngalolu daba. Kumele sibe nesigcawu esisodwa la sizokwazi ukubukana nokuhlukunyezwa emaqenjini ethu singakhohliswa abafuna ukubheka kwamanye amaqembu bashiye okwenzeka emaqenjini abo. [Ihlombe.]

*English:*

It is for this reason that women need to stand together. [Interjections.] We urge women to heed the call of the #365Days #HearMeToo campaigns by participating in the gender-based violence hearings that will be launched in March. We are aware and understand the challenges of mental health faced by young women. Women such as Khensani Maseko find themselves making the choice of taking their own lives rather than having to face their rapists and relive the trauma in their homes and places of learning that protects rapists every day.

We call on traditional leaders to work with the government to eliminate child marriages. Mr President, we already heard the cries of young women demanding the provision of sanitary

UNREVISED HANSARD

JOINT SITTING

WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 140

dignity pads. On 28 February this year, we are launching the rollout of sanitary dignity pads in Mpumalanga. [Applause.] We have also relaunched the National Gender Machinery. We have also had a summit discussing gender responsive, budgeting, monitoring, evaluation and planning. This will ensure that quality indicators and targets are included in all government plans to show that we are working and our life is in our hands.

*IsiZulu:*

Ngiyabonga kakhulu leli thuba. [Ihlombe.]

Mr A WINDE: Hon Deputy Chairperson, Mr President, hon members, it is an honour to be here today to answer this debate. I sat here in that seat last week and listened to some ANC talk. I listened to ANC talk that reminded me of DA action. Mr President, I sat here and listened to you speaking about the economy. You spoke about tourism, agriculture and agri-processing, oceans economy and oil and gas.

That reminded me of a project we called Project Khulisa that in the Western Cape under DA action we started five years ago. [Applause.] Project Khulisa which is what you were talking

UNREVISED HANSARD

JOINT SITTING

WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 141

about but we put it into action. If I highlight a couple of those projects just to help you on what needs to happen in South Africa going forward. We still have a project called Airlift. The ANC and SAA were cutting flights from London to Cape Town; from Germany to Cape Town and we put up a project in place that brought more flights into Cape Town. [Applause.]

We started that five years ago and today as I stand here we brought 14 new direct flights from across Africa and the world to Cape Town. [Applause.] That means 1,5million new seats in and out of our airport. It means 52% growth in trade underneath the belly of those aircrafts. It means that tourism grew in 2016 by 16% and in 2017 by 20%.

Last year, in the height of a drought with junk status we still grew at 10%. [Applause.] Whatever, we do in this province Mr President; we do to create growth and jobs. We do it for the people of the Western Cape but we also do it for South Africa. [Interjections.] Project Khulisa, as I stand here today is busy in KwaZulu-Natal helping that province with exactly the same province. [Interjections.] We are busy in Kenya with that exact project.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 142**

Mr President, you spoke about agriculture and I will highlight one project on agriculture also. You also spoke about market access but we focused on a whole low market. We have grown that now to an export market from this region of R10 billion a year. [Applause.] We focused on the oceans economy and oil and gas. I will tell you a little bit more of that just now but all of these projects talk to what you were speaking about. It is not about talk but about action and it is DA action.

I could talk about a red tape reduction or red tape to red carpet or I could talk about green Cape; I could talk about skills or tik. All of these, we measure Mr President.

Yesterday, guess what came out? The jobs numbers came out in South Africa. What happens when the jobs numbers came out in South Africa, in this province once again, the unemployment rate went down? [Applause.] We now still hold the lowest unemployment rate in South Africa in this province at 19,3%, 7,8% lower than the average in our country.

In rural areas, where people are really poor, our unemployment rate dropped by 3,45 to 15,7%, the lowest rate in South Africa. This region after investing in broadband free WiFi hotspot incubators in Khayelitsha, Elsies River and hotspots

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 143**

across the province, we are now Africa's tech hub and we are also or Sub Sahara and Africa's top financial centre. This happens when you don't just talk but you move to action.

There are a few things that are really holding us back. There are a few things in this province that are like cancer eating away at the people of our province. One of those is crime. Crime is out of hand in our province and at the moment if it is controlled in Tshwane at the national level. We need to change that. This is a very serious issue and we need to centralise policing in our province. We need to decentralise it to provinces and cities so that we can really deal with crime.

I am going to highlight one or two issues to you. These are the documents that I am going to talk about and I will put them in this brown envelope. This brown envelope in the Western Cape we normally think about Rasool but this is not going to have cash in it. It is going to have documents. Crime is serious, Mr President because 10 people every single day in this province are murdered. On 11 October the Cabinet in this province wrote this document to our Minister of Police. This document deals with very serious issues and amongst them is

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 144**

Section 206 of our Constitution. This document, to date has not been answered.

On 10 December, we wrote this document to the Minister and it deals with the Anti-Gang Unit which we welcome but it asks some serious questions. To date we have not heard an answer to this document. On 11 December we wrote this letter to the Minister, reminding him of the 10 October letter. We still have not heard an answer on that document. [Interjections.]

On 10 January we wrote this letter to the Minister. At the moment, our senior management in SA Police Service, SAPS in this province are laying charges against each other. At the moment our senior management in SAPS are really dire straits and 10 people are dying everyday in this province. We need to change things.

Too many children in places in this province do their homework underneath the dining room table because they are too scared of stray bullets if they sit up at the dining room table. When family members suffer a heart attack in places of this province the ambulance cannot go directly to that household because it has to go via the police station to get an escort

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 145**

so that it can go and fetch someone to give them the much needed healthcare.

In conclusion, there was a judgement in this province that was brought by the Social Justice Coalition that ruled at the end of last year that the Western Cape High Court has declared that the allocation of police resources to the provinces unfairly discriminates on the basis race and poverty. It discriminates against poor black people. I will include the judgement in the envelope and the Minister has said on radio that he will withdraw and appeal. There is an appeal against this judgement. He will withdraw it but guess what; there has been no actual appeal of this judgement. The police now want to appeal the judgement of the court that there is unfair allocation to police of poor and black areas in this province. That is absolutely shocking. We need control here in the province.

Mr President, you asked me when I sat here to watch the space. While I was watching the space, the lights went out. You spoke about oil and gas. You spoke about the discovery of Mossel Bay. We have been working on oil and gas for 10 years already and not only as a province but with the Dti and the national

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 146**

government. We also worked on it in Saldanah Bay with the local authority.

We are ready for that oil and gas and when the lights went out and this really reminded me of Minister Joemat-Peterson. She made an allocation of gas to Ngqura Port and Richards Bay. If the lights are out, we have already done the Environmental Impact Assessment, EIA at Ankerlig Power Station in Atlantis. We have already done all the work on gas to come in to Saldanah Bay.

Mr President, we need that decision changed. Gas must come in now to the Western Cape. We are ready now to start with gas to power. [Applause.] So, if you are serious about making a difference in our country and not just the talk but the action, give us the right to bring in that oil and gas. This will enable us to generate energy alongside of our green energy in this province and make a difference. We want to make a difference and we will fight for energy independence and will also fight for energy resilience and sustainability. We want gas to make that difference to the green economy and at the same time let us also focus on getting gas into Mossel Bay too.

UNREVISED HANSARD

JOINT SITTING

WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 147

Mr President, if you are serious about crime we need 4500 more policemen and women. You need to make sure that the Minister withdraws the appeal against that judgement at the Social Coalition. You also need to make sure that we allow gas to come into the system. In 84 days the country is going to make a decision and when this country makes a decision they would be tired of just a talk. They are going to make a decision for action and we are going to make sure that that action comes from a DA. We are sick and tired of waiting and we now need that action and the DA will deliver that in 84 days. Thank you very much. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: One moment, hon Plouamma. [Interjections.]

Mr M A PLOUAMMA: Hon Deputy Chairperson, hon President, hon members, hon Ministers, allow me to give you, hon President, some free education. [Interjections.] Even if the ANC refuses to give our young people a truly free, quality education, I am willing to give it to you today. [Interjections.]

Hon President, on the day of the state of the nation address, you quoted the 26th President of the United States of America,

UNREVISED HANSARD

JOINT SITTING

WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 148

Theodore Roosevelt. He was the most racist President of the USA and once believed that African Americans were inferior to white people. Please, hon President, in future, don't quote racists. [Laughter.]

Hon President, just accept that you are a prisoner of the corrupt ANC. Your New Dawn is fast becoming a house built on sand. [Interjections.] Just show me one ANC leader who is not implicated in or suspected of corruption. [Interjections.] Just show me one - just one! [Interjections.] I don't want many. One! One! One! [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Order! Order, hon members! [Interjections.] Hon Plouamma, can you focus on the speech, please? [Interjections.] Order, hon members! Can you allow him to make his speech? [Interjections.] Hon members, order! Order! [Interjections.] Can we allow him ... [Interjections.] Hon members, order! Order! [Interjections.] Hon Plouamma, can you continue with your debate? [Interjections.] Hon members!

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: House Chairperson ... [Interjections.] ... House Chairperson, in terms of Rule

UNREVISED HANSARD

JOINT SITTING

WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 149

14(1), the hon Mantashe had his hand up. I think he is misleading the House! [Laughter.] [Applause.]

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: That is not a point of order. [Interjections.] Hon Plouamma, can you continue with the debate? [Interjections.]

Mr M A PLOUAMMA: Hon President, please don't even think of Minister Mantashe with his embarrassing tower of his house. [Interjections.] Your state of the nation address is a good dream. Let me wake you up.

You were the first apostle of the former President. You kept quiet when he was dismembering the state. You chose to save your political career when corruption severely constrained poverty alleviation and economic development. In this mess of Bosasa, the Guptas, and the SA Revenue Service, Sars, you are an accomplice. You are a witness. [Interjections.]

Mr P J MNGUNI: Hon Deputy Chair, I rise on a point of order in terms of a substantive motion: If the member knows an accomplice to any crime committed, he must certainly do the right thing and submit a substantive motion to be entertained

UNREVISED HANSARD

JOINT SITTING

WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 150

by the House, or else he must withdraw saying that the hon President is an accomplice to any crime that was committed. Thank you. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Order, hon members! You know, I struggled to hear that. I wasn't sure if I heard it correctly, or not. If it is the case, the way it is put by the member ...

Dr M Q NDLOZI: Deputy Chairperson ...

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Can I make a ruling? Will you allow me to make a ruling? [Interjections.]

Dr M Q NDLOZI: I just want to assist you because you saying if it is the case ...

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: No, no, no, no. I haven't asked for any assistance. Can I make a ruling on the matter?

Dr M Q NDLOZI: Alright.

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Yes. If it is the way I heard it and it flows with that, I would recommend to the

UNREVISED HANSARD

JOINT SITTING

WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 151

member that he present a substantive motion for debate in the House.

Mr M A PLOUAMMA: Hon Deputy Chair, that man is confused.

[Inaudible.] I never said that. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Just take your seat, hon Plouamma.

Mr M A PLOUAMMA: He is confused. I have never said that!

[Interjections.] Hon President, he has been rising on points of order since yesterday. He is tired. [Interjections.]

Hon President, you still have a chance at redemption, and here is the solution. Put Mr Magashule in prison. Attach his assets. Give them to the poor.

Put Mr Jacob Zuma in prison. Sell Nkandla and give the money to needy students.

Remove all the Ministers from your Cabinet who are implicated.

Then, you can begin ... [Time expired.] [Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

JOINT SITTING

WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 152

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Order! Order! hon members. Hon Zikalala, please continue with the debate.

The ACTING PREMIER OF KWAZULU-NATAL (Mr S ZIKALALA): Hon Chairperson, His Excellency, President Mr Cyril Ramaphosa, hon members of this House, lies have no future. The opposition tries its best to mislead the people of South Africa and claim its victories. Right here today, hon Hill-Lewis claimed that the Western Cape is leading in creating jobs. [Applause.] Now, I am not sure which statistics is used. According to Statistics SA as they released their report yesterday on the 12th, they indicated that the province that is leading on job creation is Gauteng by 86 000 ... [Interjections.]

Mr T RAWULA: Speaker!

The ACTING PREMIER OF KWAZULU-NATAL (Mr S ZIKALALA): Western Cape is not even among the top two. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon Zikalala, can you just take your seat. On what point are you rising on hon member?

UNREVISED HANSARD

JOINT SITTING

WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 153

Mr T RAWULA: Speaker, I was going to advice that he stands up. We can't see him. [Laughter.] [Laughter.]

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: That is not a point of order and that statement can be also discriminatory. So, we should avoid that kind of a situation. Continue with the debate hon member.

The ACTING PREMIER OF KWAZULU-NATAL (Mr S ZIKALALA): Hon Chair, we are told that Western Cape is leading. Yet, reality tells you that Africans and small business have no space in Western Cape, even hawkers are not getting any support. [Applause.]

Hon Chair, speaking here yesterday, the Leader of the Opposition, hon Maimane, said that he stands with the people of Zimbabwe, Western Sahara. But because of his hypocrisy, he omitted and didn't tell us that he equally stands with the people of Israel who continue to oppress, kill and continue with illegal occupation in Palestine. [Appalause.]

There is a joke, hon Lekota talks about corruption; that is good, we must fight corruption but hon Lekota must not think

UNREVISED HANSARD

JOINT SITTING

WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 154

that we have forgotten that he was charged and he had to pay a fine of R11 485 in May 2003 for failing to declare his interest in wine and oil industry, it was here. [Applause.] [Interjections.]

Now, there is someone called hon Winde, he comes here and says there is programme called Project Khulisa they are trying to implement in KwaZulu-Natal, now let's not tell lies. There is nothing like that in KwaZulu-Natal. [Interjections.] Yes, we must all work in promoting tourism but it's not only the Western Cape that is succeeding. In KwaZulu-Natal we have launched a direct flight that flies through Durban and there are more flies that connect us with the world. [Applause.] [Interjections.] In essence, let's tell the truth in forums where it's not debated and its public. Western Cape government is always represented by MEC Nomafrench Mbombo, now because we are here, you thought that she will not do well and you are here for her. [Interjections.] [Applause.]

Hon Chairperson, we stand here to affirm that South Africa is far better than it was before 1994. On the 10 May 2004, former President Nelson Mandela addressed this very august House as

UNREVISED HANSARD

JOINT SITTING

WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 155

part of the celebration of the first decade of freedom. In his address, Madiba said:

“There is always enough reason for cynicism and despair. But then we should take heart from our own experience and performance. Let us not underrate what we have achieved since 1994 in establishing a stable and progressive democracy”

Today, Madiba would have reminded us that let us not underestimate what we have achieved in the past 25 years of freedom. He would have pointed out that in 1994; the democratic South Africa inherited eschewed and racialised economy. But today, our economy serves the whole of our citizens irrespective of gender or colour. The size of the economy has more than doubled. In 1994, our Gross Domestic Product, GDP was at 136 billion US dollars and in 2017 about 350 billion US dollars. [Applause.]

Former President Nelson Mandela would have told us today that when we inherited government in 1994, the public debt stood at 69% yet today it is at 53% and we are continuing to reduce it. Former President Mandela would have said that the number of

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 156**

employed people in South Africa has rose from 9,5 million in 1994 to 15,2 million in 2013. Despite the fact that as we create more jobs, there are jobs that are shed but the reality remains that we created more than 7 million jobs for South Africans.

Today, South Africa is number one diversified economy in the continent and is considered as the regional manufacturing hub and the most industrialised country. The end of apartheid regime has seen the phenomenon growth in tourism with 400 billion added to the GDP and the creation of 1,6 million job opportunities. Ocean economy contributes 4,4% and creates 6 500 jobs.

Hon President, Given the slow pace of transformation and the continuing social and economic exclusion of millions of people, as the ANC, we adopted Radical Economic Transformation. Through Radical Economic Transformation, we seek to deracialise the economy. As the province of KwaZulu-Natal, we have not only theoretically defined Radical Economic Transformation but we are implementing it.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 157**

We have developed a detailed implementation plan which is already implemented under the umbrella flagship of Operation Vula. Through this programme, we have set aside more than 58 commodities and made it strictly for all government department and entities to procure those commodities from the previously disadvantaged corporative as well as Small, Medium and Micro-sized Enterprises, SMMEs. [Applause.]

We are working hard on the implementation of Radical Agrarian Socio-Economic Transformation which we launched in 2017. This is the programme which we seek to create an alternative value chain for all involved in the agricultural sector in order to bypass existing structural barriers. We have therefore provided guaranteed market through government departments such as Department of Health, Department of Education and the Department of Social Developments.

Hon President, we have supported 29 842 farmers over the past five years. We have also invested more than R2 billion in agricultural. Through the programme which is called, On-farm mentorship, we have enrolled more than 200 young people who are graduates in agriculture. [Applause.] Hon members of this House, enterprise development is key to us as a province.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 158**

We are pioneering a ground breaking initiative known as KwaZulu-Natal Bulk Buying and Warehousing programme which is aimed at lowering the cost of sales for our small and emerging retailers so that they will be more competitive and be able to expand their market share and participate in the retail value chain. We are working in partnership with all traders association. We are happy to report here that on the 31 January, our province invested in the future of this country, investing in the youth by launching the youth fund which was piloted by 50 million and we believe that we will continue ensuring that we dedicate funding for enterprises that are launched by young people. [Applause.]

KwaZulu-Natal became the first province to conclude the memorandum of understanding with the Department of Trade and Industry to implement the black industrialist programme. As we speak, nine black industrialist project has been launched in KwaZulu-Natal to the value of R300 million. The latest is the one we launched on the 22 January this year in partnership with the Department of Trade and Industry which already employed more that 400 people in clothing and textile.

[Applause.]

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 159**

On special economic zone, the government's effort and roll out of special economic zone programme is making a huge investment in our province. In Richards Bay, PVC pipe manufacturing has already implemented the project to the value of 300 million. The Dube Tradeport is equally working on a number of projects and we have now started phase two because phase one of Dube Tradeport is already fully occupied. Forty-five hectares is reserved in the second phase which will be open by 2020 and will attract more than 18 billion over the next five years. We are happy with the investment by the number of the private sector companies.

RBM, which is the Richards Bay Minerals is expanding its operation by 5,5 billion and that will create more than 2000 jobs. Whirlpool, in iSithebe, Mandeni has already invested more than 100 million. Sumitomo in Ladysmith has already invested 2,1 billion and is creating more jobs. We are expecting not less than 193 additional jobs to be created. Sappi has invested more than R7 billion.

The hon President indicated during state of the nation address that KwaZulu-Natal came to the Presidential Investment Summit with its booklet which contains potential project which are

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 160**

bankable. The total number of these projects is 25. Without getting into details, the profits of doom have criticised the hosting of the Presidential Investment Summit.

Hon President, let me report here that during the Investment Summit, the Mara Group which manufacture smart phones pledged 1 billion investments in the country. I am happy to report that Dube Tradeport signed a lease agreement with the Mara Group and that investment will go towards KwaZulu-Natal and create more than 500 jobs. [Applause.]

Hon President and members of this House, we edge this House, especially hon President and Cabinet, to decisively ensure that they expedite the amendment of the Banks Act to allow ownership of the banks by the state. For us in KwaZulu-Natal, the amendment will enable Ithala Soc limited to become a full commercial bank. We also edge the Cabinet to ensure that it expedite the Bill on the production of Biofuel and blending with petroleum. This Bill is key in sustaining sugarcane industry, a key sector for KwaZulu-Natal and this will address the plight of the sugarcane farmers. We also call that we should expedite the finalization of the amendment of the

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 161**

Public Procurement Bill which will provide protection and sustainable support for small enterprises.

Hon Chairperson, Surely, none will dare challenge me when I affirm that South Africa is far better than before 1994 democratic breakthrough. [Applause.] The future of the country remains with the ANC. There is not even a single organization that can take South Africa forward. Let us all unite in action and grow South Africa together. I thank you. [Applause.] [Time expired.]

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: Thank you very much, outgoing Deputy Chair of the NCOP, and outgoing Deputy Speaker of the National Assembly. You would agree, commander in chief, that it is pure opportunism. In fact, it is actually childish and unprincipled for anyone to want to exonerate themselves from the nine years when President Zuma was the president of the ANC and of the country and of all the failures that have characterised the ANC since 1994. Those who do so are no different from Bruno Ntolo, from Dr J S Moroka, who, when things were difficult in the liberation movement, compromised the struggle at critical moments.

UNREVISED HANSARD

JOINT SITTING

WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 162

Maybe what the hon Patrick Lekota said earlier bears testimony in that you have the Bruno Ntolos, you have the J S Morokas who collaborated with the Special Branch. We want to officially recommend to you, President, that you should allow the Chief Justice to appoint a judicial commission of inquiry to investigate your involvement with the Special Branch during apartheid. We do so because this allegation of your collaboration with the establishment is not coming up for the first time. When you applied for membership of the Communist Party in the early 1990s there was an investigation internally which concluded in the positive that you were having questionable security arrangements in the '70s and in the '80s. So perhaps to clear the air ... We cannot have an Office of the President that has a questionable relationship with the apartheid Special Branch. We don't think that we should deal with these issues.

We should take a leaf out of the book of Amílcar Cabral who says hide nothing from the masses of our people. Tell no lies. Expose lies whenever they are told. Mask no difficulties, mistakes, failures. Claim no easy victories. That is what Amílcar Cabral says.

UNREVISED HANSARD

JOINT SITTING

WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 163

The MISTER OF STATE SECURITY: Point of order, hon Speaker. I'm rising here on a point of order ... in particular when he talks about Communist Party issues: that is not true.

[Interjections.] People must not come here and talk about things they don't know about.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC WORKS: Is the hon Shivambu prepared to take a question about the misleading of the House that he has just done?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Shivambu, are you prepared to take a question?

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: I don't take questions from people who have ideologically misled the Communist Party for a very long time to its degeneration now. I would never do that.

[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC WORKS: In other words, you haven't got a response.

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: I have just quoted Amílcar Cabral, Chief Whip of the Majority Party. I am not quoting newspaper articles,

UNREVISED HANSARD

JOINT SITTING

WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 164

the local newspaper articles, that were quoted here yesterday. I was referring to Amílcar Cabral, who says we must not tell lies.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Shivambu, take your seat. Hon member, what are you rising on?

Mr P J MNGUNI: On a point of order, Deputy Speaker. The point of order pertains to the principle of the casting of aspersions. It went on ... earlier on ... and it has slipped through, and, once again, with the hon Shivambu. I dare ask you, hon Deputy Speaker, to even look at the Hansard and rule on whether what he is continuing to do does not really constitute the casting of aspersions on the good character of His Excellency the President. Thank you. So we may not allow him to continue to do that.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We will do that. Go ahead, hon member.

Mr J S MALEMA: Hon Deputy Speaker, I just want to rise on a point of order, because this comrade has been disrupting speakers here. He does this consistently, and the Chief Whip of the ANC is not intervening. If you are going to continue

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 165**

like that, we will do that with every speaker of the ANC. Every time the opposition rises here, this fellow just stands up and raises issues that are not there.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, please take your seat. Hon members, order please. Let's proceed. Go ahead, hon member.

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: Now, when we debated the state of the nation address in 2018, after the bloodless coup d'état, which was correct, we then said to you, President, we were going to hold you accountable according to what you said and the commitments that you made here. We are going to do so now and quote exactly - verbatim - what you said on each and every issue, not the meeting commitments which we cautioned you about.

You said in the state of the nation address in 2018 that "in the next three months we will launch a huge cancer campaign similar to the HIV counselling and testing campaign that we launched". Did that happen? No. You also said that the accelerated schools infrastructure delivery initiative programme would complete all outstanding projects by the end of "next year". Did that happen? No.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 166**

You also said that starting from "this year", referring to 2018, free higher education and training would be available for first-year students from households with a combined annual income of up to R350 000. Did that happen? It did not happen. That is why Madonsela, fighter Madonsela, was killed at DUT.

You also said that government "is finalising a small business and innovation fund targeted at start-ups". Did that happen? No. You said further that you were going to assemble a team to speed up the implementation of new projects, particularly water projects ... health care maintenance and road maintenance. Did that happen? No.

You further said that you were going to speed up industrialisation. Did that happen? No. All the industrialisation aspects and attempts are a joke in South Africa. From 1994 until now, there are fewer than six special economic zones. There have been less than R11 billion in investments there. There have been fewer than 10 000 jobs created. So for 25 years, R10 billion! Compare that to other expenditure items in the budget. And you are saying you are pursuing industrialisation!

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 167**

That is why we remain a colonial economy, which exports semiprocessed and raw materials to the established economies and then we import finished goods and products. If you go and check the top 10 imports from China, from Europe, from the US, you will realise that all of them are finished goods and products. All of our top 10 - actually top 20 - exports to China are semiprocessed products. That is the relationship that the South African economy has with the rest of the world.

You said further in the state of the nation address that before the end of 2018 you were going to finalise the Mineral and Petroleum Resources Development Act, the MPRDA. What did you do with that piece of legislation? You withdrew it. And who did that? The Minister of Mineral Resources - where was he? He was in Australia meeting with possibly the person he quoted here. A Mineral Resources Minister comes here to quote Mark Cutifani from Anglo American. And then he says that "I am giving you lessons in mining." So we are being educated by Anglo American, the company, the corporation, that has ripped off this country. The corporation that has plundered this country, and then we are taking lessons from it.

UNREVISED HANSARD

JOINT SITTING

WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 168

The MPRDA is withdrawn now. What does the MPRDA Amendment Bill say we should do? It sets a specific amount of minerals that must be locally beneficiated. It won't happen now. It says that the state should own a certain component of all the petroleum resources. So the Bill was withdrawn so that we can have Total, with a BEEE shareholding of 10%. [Applause.] It won't be a mistake. If you go deeper into that 10% you will find the occurrence of the President. You will find there is no way that the Pembani people and all those people who are in Shanduka are not involved in that commitment.

But let's leave aside the commitments that have not been filled which we have dealt with. Your own conference gave you a mandate about the SA Reserve Bank; about the creation of a state bank, which the acting premier ... okay, the real Premier of KwaZulu-Natal says must be established; about the creation of a pharmaceutical company; about the expropriation of land without compensation. Are those things happening? No. Are they going to happen? No. That is what we are dealing with here: a president that just comes to speak, and then makes a lot of commitments. You clap hands. He commits on summits. Summits are easy to organise. It's just the travel agent that

UNREVISED HANSARD

JOINT SITTING

WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 169

you need there to organise for you, and they don't have an impact on the lives of the people.

I have two questions that you must answer when you respond tomorrow. One, why are you interviewing the Sars Commissioner in secret? You want to impose an incompetent person who does not have qualifications on the revenue collector. Why is the Sars Commissioner being interviewed in secret?

Two, why is the company that is going to supply engineers to inspect the power plants of Eskom coming from a company that is benefiting from the independent power producers? Where is the logic in that?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, your time has expired.

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: These are the issues that we are dealing with. The people of South Africa must see the hypocrisy ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: If you proceed, I am switching off your mic.

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: ... and vote for the EFF on ... [Applause.]

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 170**

Mr M S MALATSI: Hon Deputy Speaker, Mr President last year you stood here claiming that you had seen a contract between your son and Bosasa. Today, not many minutes ago you have written to the leader of the official opposition, basically refusing to release that contract. These are your words: "The Presidency cannot provide the information to which you require" These are not the actions of someone who has nothing to hide. So, it has become very clear, Mr President, that either between you, your son or Bosasa someone has got something to hide. If you really have nothing to hide, come back to this podium tomorrow and speak honestly about the contract with Bosasa, then we can take your words.

Mr President, if you ever needed any justification to fire the Minister of Women in the Presidency, just read her speech today. It embodies incompetence, incoherence and confusion. This is the same Minister who was found by the Constitutional Court to not only have lied, but to be incompetent. It goes without saying that the state of the nation address should be a brutally honest reflection of the state of our country. Yours was a wishful reflection of the nation that many people don't live in. It did nothing to give hope to many poor South Africans that their lives would get better.

UNREVISED HANSARD

JOINT SITTING

WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 171

Mr President, you implored us to watch the space in your attempted serenade to help us believe your dreams, but how much longer must Christina Maluleke from Mandela Park in Modjadjiskloof, closer to where hon Mboweni lives, to watch the space to continue competing with livestock for water? How much longer must Thulasizwe Mncwango in Msholozhi informal settlement, Mbombela, watch the space to have his home electrified? How much longer must Tlangelani Mabunda from Mninginisi Village in Giyani watch the space have a clinic in her area?

All these realities, Mr President, reflect the daily battles of survival for many poor black South Africans. They don't have the patience to wait. They have been watching the space while you are destroying this government.

*Xitsonga:*

Vanhu va karhele hi ku yimela vukorhokeri lebyi nga humeleriki, Nkulukumba Phuresidente.

*English:*

Now is the time for action. Our Constitution reminds us daily that "... South Africa belongs to all who live in it ..."

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 172**

Where we govern, we are working to make sure that South Africa does indeed work for all who live in it. We want a South Africa where every village has access to clean water that you take for granted. We want a South Africa where every family has access to a toilet in their households. We want a South Africa where the government is obsessed in speeding up the basic service delivery, not speeding up how many kickbacks it can get. Everyday, DA governments are giving true meaning of freedom to residents who have suffered the indignity of waiting for long period for basic services.

This is evidence by the fact that 14 out of the 20 municipalities who have the highest number of households with access to sanitation are here in the Western Cape. Our cross subsidisation of basic services to right the wrongs of the past, restores dignity to poor communities. The proof is in the statistics. The Western Cape has the highest number of households benefiting from free basic water. All the communities in the Western Cape, where DA municipalities are in charge, have 97% access to electricity and 99% access to pipe water.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 173**

The Minister of Health had a lot to say about the National Health Insurance, the truth of the matter is that the National Health Insurance, NHI, is not the solution for our crumbling public health system but it is just another attempt to nationalise the healthcare system. Where we are governing, we are dedicating billions into improving the health infrastructure. We have spent over R3,8 billion building world class health facilities in Khayelitsha and Mitchells Plain. We have upgraded 10 emergency centres to allow our hospitals to provide emergency services as quickly as possible. We have built over 14 primary healthcare centres to enable residents of the Western Cape to access basic health services in the areas that are closest to where they live.

All these interventions are done to ensure that the province has the highest percentage of households living at least 30 minutes within the nearest health facility in their own area. It also means that we provide the primary healthcare that the people need, in fact, health makes the people in the Western Cape live longer because here the public health system is functional. Not in the Eastern Cape, not in Mpumalanga and not in Limpopo.

UNREVISED HANSARD

JOINT SITTING

WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 174

The Minister of Basic Education came here to tell us about the work of the ANC government.

*Sepedi:*

Mme Motshekga, se o sa se bolelago ke gore mešomo ye mengwe ya ANC ...

*English:*

... is that it is actually the work of the ANC that killed people in Marikana. It is the work of the ANC that killed people in Life Esidimeni. It is the work of the ANC that brought us Bosasa and it is the work of the ANC that is bringing out power blackouts. [Applause.] So, fellow South Africans, in every election cycle the ANC will plead for more time in government, but what they need is not more time in government. They have done the damage already. They need more time in opposition.

Mr President, how can you honestly lead an honest government when you are in an arena full of crooks, full of incompetent Ministers, full of failures who have been nothing but embodiments of failure in government? There is no doubt that as we go closer to 08 May, we will see more ribbons being cut.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 175**

You will see more public relations, PR, stunts of the elderly being pushed around to open houses that would have been given to them long ago. Of course, South Africans will get food parcels. The difference is that they will be smaller than the ones hon Mokonyane got from Agrizzi.

The people of South Africa should ask the ANC, where have you been for the last 25 years when our communities went without basic water? Where have you been when all these communities went for 25 years without electricity? Where have you been for the past 25 years when all these South Africans went to bed hungry? Now is not the time to be fooled by the trickery and the prose that beset the state of the nation address. Now is the time to vote for change. Now is the time to vote for a government that understand the urgency of delivering the basic services. Now is the time to vote for a government that gets stuff done, the right way, on time and within budget. Not a government that protects its own corrupt ones and pays lip service to the suffering of black people. I thank you.

[Applause.]

The MINISTER OF ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT: Hon President and Speaker, hon members, fellow South Africans, over the past

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 176**

year there has been a tangible change in the general mood in our country, not always reflected in the proceedings in this House. This change has been occasioned by your message of inclusivity, your appeal, Mr President, for South Africans to put aside what divides us and to unite behind a common, patriotic effort to address the challenges of our society.

On Thursday last week, with your moving call to action, Mr President, it has become more difficult than ever to be in the opposition. You call on them, along with all South Africans, to contribute constructively to build this country. Some opposition parties clearly marginalised themselves from that call. Hon members, in the six days since state of the nation address and the two days of debate, the country has been confronted with two competing versions of reality and two competing visions for our nation.

On the one hand, President Ramaphosa addressed the nation with an action list of what government has done, an acknowledgement of real challenges we are still faced with and what we will do about them, and an optimistic vision of South Africa and its future. On the other hand, the Members of Parliament, MPs, from some of the opposition parties defined themselves in the

UNREVISED HANSARD

JOINT SITTING

WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 177

margins through a litany of complaints, whinges, smears, personality attacks and negativity packaged for an election campaign, not for building a country, severe case of 'electionitis,' a desperate alliance indeed.

It's difficult to be in the opposition. It is a difficulty that the hon Maimane was rudely reminded of when presenting the DA attempt at an alternative state of the nation address last week. A member of the diplomatic corps, the consul general of Portugal in Cape Town, told him bluntly that business people seem impressed by the work that President Ramaphosa is doing and are ready to take their votes from the DA and give them to the ANC. [Applause.]

He said this was not only the view of business people of Portuguese origin but also from many other South African business people in Cape Town. Yes, it has become difficult to be in opposition. I was tempted to start my remarks by sharing data from our work in government, many examples of real solid progress in the past year, but on reflection I realised that facts don't fit into the story-line that the official opposition is desperately clinging to.

UNREVISED HANSARD

JOINT SITTING

WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 178

It's not easy to be in the opposition; it's stressful. So I recommend to the hon Maimane, Lekota and their advisers a thoughtful book by Hans Rosling entitled *Factfulness*. Its main theme is that a major stress-reducing habit is to take a deep breath, clear your mind, and only carry opinions for which you have strong supporting facts. [Applause.]

Adrian Gore, a South African entrepreneur and founder of Discovery has a similar view. He recently diagnosed accurately the malady from which much of the opposition suffers. On the basis of global research, he called it 'declinism.'

'Declinism' is the belief that our country and public life are on an irreversible downhill trajectory and that the future will undoubtedly be worse than the past and present in spite of facts to the contrary, driven largely by our stubborn ignorance about the way national development indicators have actually improved.

This is Gore speaking. Gore offers some reasons as to why this irrational pessimism matters, and it is worth quoting him again:

UNREVISED HANSARD

JOINT SITTING

WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 179

First, we don't see our country's progress, and there has been plenty. As an example, our Gross Domestic Product, GDP, is 2,5 times the size it was in 1994 on a dollar basis, formal housing increased by 131% from 1996 to 2016, new HIV infections went down to 60% from 1999 to 2016, and the murder rate per 100,000 dropped to 50% from 1994 to 2017.

Linked to this, we undermine our size and relevance when we ought not to. Our provinces square up against other countries in terms of GDP, and our economy is substantial in terms of stocks traded in 2017, South Africa trumps the Middle East and North Africa region, Singapore and Norway; and it holds 82% of the pension fund assets in Africa, 18 times that of its second-ranked peer, Nigeria.

But perhaps honourable Maimane will discount Mr Gore's comments as they do not fit his party's narrative, the framing of South Africa. So let's go to a think-tank that is above all identified with the DA worldview, namely the SA Institute of Race Relations, which published a statistical compendium late last year called, 'Life in South Africa: Reasons for hope.'

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 180**

Yes, they are critical of the ANC, particularly the past 10 years but they also state, and I am now going to quote them:

In the course of our work, we are confronted with considerable evidence of real substantive progress in building a better country. This is not cherry-picking some successes here and there. All the trends that follow in this report are examples of substantive improvements in economic performance and the living standards of millions of people, sustained over a long period.

Real GDP per capita has increased by over 30%. Employment data provides a vivid reflection of the progress that has been made, - I am still quoting them - it is not true, as many populist activists and politicians alleges, that South Africa has suffered two decades of jobless growth. Rather, the number of black people with a job increased from 4,9 million in 1994 to over 12 million last year, while the total number of employed people roughly doubled.

The impact on the living standards, independence, dignity, and self-respect of households was considerable. As much as it courts controversy, - I am quoting them - we stand on the

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 181**

point that service delivery was one of the key successes of the ANC, in government. [Applause.]

This is not to overlook failures, but the numbers below are so great, that they speak to a profoundly important rising of the living standards floor in our country. This is a substantively better society to live in than it was in 1994.

Though we made progress, we accept that we need to do more. In order to build a strong and transformed economy, we are taking a number of steps, they include the following: Boosting investment through forums like the investment conference where pledges were made; addressing business and consumer confidence; strengthening institutions and acting against corruption; enabling access to markets; supporting township businesses and small, medium and micro-sized enterprises, SMMEs, through changes in competition law; developing a skilled work force; improved infrastructure investment, like the new R100 billion Infrastructure Fund; facilities to incentivize job creation and partnerships, which the Summits and social dialogue are promoting.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 182**

Unlike opposition which only claims and promises, we act together with many inspiring South Africans and we can see the results of the turnaround. Let's go on a journey to South Africa, because clearly, hon members, some part of the opposition has been greatly absent from South Africa.

While hon Julius grandstands about farmers, the ANC-led government takes action to support small-scale farmers, like Solomon Masango, an ex-mineworker who was given support from a competition-linked fund. He is one of many farmers to get that support. He has become a successful small-scale farmer, now cultivating a piece of land, the size of 560 FNB Stadium soccer pitches.

He employs permanent and part time workers and grows maize, soya and sugar beans. Also, there are a growing number of black farmers like Solomon. [Applause.] While the DA puts up billboards, government supports world-class businesses like Hulamin, a Pietermaritzburg-based company that is the only supplier anywhere in the world that can produce a crucial fitting for wifi components in airplanes, and it manufactures much specialised products that are used in electric vehicles like the Tesla.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 183**

While the hon Lekota is in full election mode, desperate to have his 30 seconds of fame, supporting AfriForum one moment, then furiously throwing outrageous smears to make the next headline, the ANC is involved in active delivery to our people, like the 28-year old Tshepo Mokwena who manages patients' data at the new Mothiba Village Clinic in Limpopo that opened in June last year.

The clinic is able to take 1000 more patients every month than the old clinic, providing more healthcare access to South Africans. The other example is that of Keitumetse Konko who is a 17-year old matric student at Soshanguve East Secondary School in Gauteng, she completely replaced the school facilities with hi-tech smart facilities in 2017.

In so doing, the facility doubled the capacity of learners. That school is one of nearly 600 new and replacement schools that we have completed building during this administration in South Africa. While some in the opposition goes around the world bad-mouthing their own country, government mobilises foreign investment to create jobs and opportunities for people like Siyabonga Matyumza, a worker at the Beijing Automobile International Corporation, BAIC, auto-plant in Nelson Mandela

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 184**

Bay, whose foreign-owned company invested in the local economy last year, and his company is not alone.

Reserve Bank data shows a net R70 billion inflow of Foreign Direct Investment, FDI, into South Africa for the first nine months of last year. While hon Hill-Lewis contemptuously talks about ladles full of syrupy hope, we can proudly note that we had a record soya bean harvest and we are processing the bean locally into value-added products. [Applause.] South Africa has produced its highest crop of citrus ever, and we are now the world's second biggest citrus exporter. [Applause.]

In fact, go anywhere in the world, eat a citrus fruit and one out of 10 would have been grown if it is exported here in South Africa. Exports of beef to China went from zero six years to R400 million now, syrupy hope indeed. While the DA talks about exporting plans, the ANC rolls up its sleeves and opens up markets for locally-produced products. Manqoba Mkhize is a worker at the Volvo Truck plant in KwaZulu-Natal that you visited last year, Mr President.

South Africa is the biggest exporter of trucks to the rest of the African continent. It is also the biggest exporter of

UNREVISED HANSARD

JOINT SITTING

WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 185

paper, plastics, fruit and mining machinery to our continent. We are also the largest exporter of catalytic convertors to Germany. While Hon Groenewald condemns blackness in the economy, whatever he means by that, we promote young innovators like Soweto-born Ruli Diseko who is setting up a Nickel Purification Plant that will manufacture and produce high purity nickel sulphate used in lithium-ion batteries for electric vehicles, stationary energy storage and consumer electronics. [Applause.]

We are focusing on practical beneficiation processes while others are howling. While hon Cassim complains about new skills development for the industries of tomorrow, we are empowering new youth, like Atsile Itumeleng, from Morokweng village in North West, who has just registered for an Honours degree in Data Science at one of South Africa's two new universities, Sol Plaatjie University in Kimberley, and he is one of more than 1000 graduates from the two universities.

There is also Malvin Nkomo from a company called Hailer, he is seated in the audience, who developed South Africa's answer to Uber. [Applause.] The other example is Refilwe Lediga, who developed a machine to 3D print concrete structures able

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 186**

potentially to change the way low cost housing is developed. While the DA plays the critic on joblessness, we are taking steps to create jobs, like at Highveld Steel, now reborn as a major industrial hub of 1000 workers.

There is also Celrose factory in Tongaat which created more than 600 jobs over the past 2 years. You see, these are South Africans and their government doing things, not South Africans howling. It's hard to be the opposition, Mr President, when you have an ANC-led government that acts, and all they do is grandstand. Each of these stories is about what you called, Mr President, the triumph of hope over despair, which is the story of South Africans, that's who we proudly are.

We and our people, workers, entrepreneurs and investors, are building this economy, which now generates R5 billion in GDP every year creating jobs, with 16,5 million people currently employed, the highest number yet in our history. In the last quarter of 2018, the economy created 149 000 net new jobs and for last year as a whole, 358 000 new jobs, and yet, the ANC-led government recognises that though we have made many gains, there are still much to do.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 187**

There are millions of people without work, young people who need opportunities and gaping income and wealth inequalities. The key strategic priority is now deeper, faster, bolder economic inclusion, growing the economy and transforming it, so that millions of young people and the unemployed can find opportunity as entrepreneurs or as workers. The Manifesto of the ANC commits the party to address monopolies and the structure of the economy in order to boost growth and economic inclusion.

The Manifesto commits the governing party to ensure competition authorities have the legal power to address the problems of monopolies, the excessive economic concentration and abuse of dominance by large players that keep small businesses and cooperatives out of the mainstream economy. Earlier today, at 1pm, President Ramaphosa signed the Competition Amendment Bill into law, and over the next number of months, we will implement the new law in phases.  
[Applause.]

The law directly responds to the call in the ANC Manifesto for a new inclusive economy in which young people, small businesses, new entrants and young innovators can enter

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 188**

markets and large incumbents are not allowed to create closed-shop markets. It responds to the big imbalance in power between small spaza shop owners and the large supermarkets; between township panel-beaters and the insurance industry; between small clothing manufacturers and large retail chains; between small tilers and bricklayers and large construction companies.

The law is the first on our statute books that promotes the inclusion of workers in shareholding structures of companies and the next logical step will be to have workers represented on the boards of large companies. The law is about opportunity, about enterprise and about inclusion. It supports innovation and investment.

Big players who dominate markets have left millions of our people as hewers of wood and drawers of water. This law is a step to change that. It is about giving effect to the Freedom Charter's call for the wealth to be shared by all. It was signed today by the President, a mere six days after the state of the nation address where he said he will sign it, as a sign of our focus not on grandstanding, but on action and implementation. [Applause.]

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 189**

The DA speakers stated that our people in areas under DA-governance fared better than areas under ANC-governance. But all South Africans are under national ANC governance. The claim that jobs are the result entirely of what the DA does in provincial or local government is weak and wrong, airbrushing out the role of national government. But let's play the DA at its claim, just for a moment. What do the facts show?

Under ANC-governance between 2004 and 2009 - remember the ANC ran the Western Cape in that period; - the Western Cape economy grew faster than under the period of DA-governance, subsequently. That's right. Under the ANC, in the Western Cape, it grew by an annualised 5,5%, but under the DA it's been 1,9%. Manufacturing output in the Western Cape grew much faster under five years of ANC-governance, 27% than under 8 years of DA control 2,6%.

During the period of ANC-governance in the province, the Western Cape had the lowest levels of unemployment in South Africa. Let me repeat that, during the period of ANC-governance in the province, the Western Cape had the lowest levels of unemployment in South Africa, a position it has retained over the years. Sorry, hon Hill-Lewis, sorry MEC

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 190**

Winde, that is clearly not a result of DA-governance.

[Applause.]

Since the DA took office in the Western Cape, the number of unemployed has gone up by 86 000 people. This is in spite of the strong efforts by national government to promote economic activity in the Western Cape, like support for the projects, MEC Winde boasted about, like the investment by the Industrial Development Corporation, IDC, in the continent's largest gas-storage facility in Saldanha; or the R2 billion that the IDC gave to companies in the Western Cape last year to boost their performance, or the provision of tax benefits for the new Special Economic Zone, SEZ, in Atlantis and Saldanha; or the support that national government provided to the City of Cape Town to deal with the water crisis and I can quote many more.

Even in this Trumpite era, when respect for facts seems to be out of fashion, even in this era, it is still remarkable that Hon Carrim, Hill-Lewis and Maimane and MEC Winde can just make up numbers. They clearly failed to realise that new employment figures came out at 11:30 yesterday morning. They used wrong figures and compounded it with false and incorrect claims. So,

UNREVISED HANSARD

JOINT SITTING

WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 191

did the Western Cape create half of new jobs in the last year as it is claimed?

The facts show the following: Gauteng created the largest number of jobs in 2018 with 172 000 new jobs; KwaZulu-Natal was second ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister, can you hold just one second, there is someone who wants to say something.

Mr Y I CARRIM: Deputy Speaker, there is a fundamental - if marginal - but fundamental difference between Cassim and Carrim ideologically and every other way. Not least looks, he's Cassim, he's a neoliberal and I am a narcissist.... [Interjections.]

*IsiZulu:*

Mnu M Q NDLOZI: Manje thina singena kuphi?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: It's okay.

Mr M Q NDLOZI: Write him an sms ...

UNREVISED HANSARD

JOINT SITTING

WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 192

*IsiZulu:*

... singena kuphi?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Ndlozi!

*Sesotho:*

Ngaka M Q NDLOZI: Re kena kae?

THE DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister, please do the correction.

The MINISTER OF ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT: Hon Carrim, absolutely so corrected, looks, ideology and respect for the facts. So, did the Western Cape create half of new jobs in the last year? The facts show otherwise: Gauteng created the largest number of jobs last year with 172 000 new jobs; KwaZulu-Natal was second with 135 000 new jobs, followed by Limpopo with 59 000 and then Western Cape with 29 000 new jobs. [Applause.]

Similarly, the claim about job numbers in the period the DA has been in power is also shockingly wrong. It seems hon Hill-Lewis mixed up the numbers for the growth in the labour force - let me explain the concept - it includes employed and unemployed with the numbers for jobs created. I have a

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**JOINT SITTING**

**WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 193**

complimentary copy - free of charge - a complimentary copy of the StatsSA Report that I will present to the DA. They are welcome to come up if the presiding officer permits it and have it in order to be educated. [Applause.]

When the DA talks about the ability to govern, it's the same party that is engulfed in the turmoil about Black Economic Empowerment, BEE. Now they back it, now they don't. They are prisoners of their past who are struggling to embrace their future. When the DA talks about the ability to govern, let's hear what Gwen Ngwenya, the Head of Policy wrote in her most revealing resignation letter:

On my arrival, I conducted a skills audit of the researchers in the policy unit. It was soon apparent that for all of them this was their first serious research job and that they had recently graduated from university. We were trying to extract from those researchers more than they could reasonably deliver. The policy offer for the national government in waiting should not rest on the shoulders of three inexperienced researchers.

UNREVISED HANSARD

JOINT SITTING

WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 194

Three inexperienced researchers who are writing your policies, hon Maimane. She goes on to say she can't fire them without breaking the labour laws and then she says

The party spends more on temporary billboards and other marketing, than it does on developing a longer-lasting comprehensive policy blueprint for the country.

You can't run a large and complex economy with policies by three inexperienced researchers who you wish you could fire. You can't run Africa's most sophisticated economy through gimmicks like billboards and other marketing. Governance is serious business. It's not child's play. [Applause.] Hon members, the ANC stands for the building of a strong, vibrant nonracialism that recognises that South Africa belongs to all who live in it, black and white.

Our public discourse should not be pockmarked by racial slurs and polarisation of our people, white South Africans have a future here, black South Africans want them to be here, but also, the next part is that at the same time, the ANC stands for a fair society, in which all shall share in the wealth of

UNREVISED HANSARD

JOINT SITTING

WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 195

the country, where we challenge inequality and privilege and we build an inclusive society.

In desperation we saw today, exposed in their nakedness, members of the Opposition resorting to character assassination and a sordid and dirty attempt to take us into the mud. Please step out of the mud; please step out of the mud because we can be proud of the 25 years of democracy and we can be optimistic about the future. In the words of Guillermo Del Toro:

Optimism is the hard choice, the brave choice. And it is, it ... These days, the safest way for someone to appear intelligent is to be sceptical by default.

History and fable have both proven that nothing is ever entirely lost. David can take Goliath; bravery can topple the powerful. These facts are often seen as exceptional, but they are not. Every day, we become the balance of our choices; choices between love and fear, belief or despair. No hope is ever too small. Optimism is not uncool. It is daring, rebellious and vital.

UNREVISED HANSARD

JOINT SITTING

WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 196

As South Africans, we combine optimism and action as we build our country. Join us in this great nation-building project; join us as the ANC provides leadership to South Africa. I thank you. [Applause.]

THE DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, that concludes the debate and the President will reply tomorrow. Thank you very much.

The Deputy Speaker of the National Assembly adjourned the Joint Sitting at 18:43.