

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 1

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

PROCEEDINGS OF THE NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

The House met at 14:02.

The House Chairperson Ms M G Boroto took the Chair and requested members to observe a moment of silence for prayer or meditation.

**DEBATE ON 16 DAYS OF ACTIVISM OF NO VIOLENCE AGAINST WOMEN AND
CHILDREN: #HEARMETOO - A WOMAN OF FORTITUDE**

The MINISTER OF SMALL BUSINESS DEVELOPMENT: Hon Chairperson, hon Members of Parliament, representatives of Civil Society and Women's Movements, ladies and gentlemen, I stand here before you to talk about one of the most and highly emotive issues in South Africa and the world. This scourge knows no colour, knows no religion, knows no race, knows no class and knows no political

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 2

affiliations. It ravages communities and families across class and the colour line. It is a societal challenge which requires a societal responses.

IsiZulu:

Ngicela nje ukuthi namhlanje ngingahlushwa uma ngikhuluma ngento ebuhlungu kakhulu kubantu baseNingizimu Afrika. Ngikhuluma ngento engakhethi ukuthi ungubani, unjani, unemali engakanani nokuthi ungubani emphakathini.

English:

Let us just for a moment put ourselves in the shoes of those who suffer in the hands of abusers. Let us even if it is for a minute feel their pain and trauma. As we do that, let us call upon for those who believe on our almighty and those who believe on ancestors to get into the hearts and minds of these heartless abusers so that they can understand and feel the suffering and the pain that they caused to their victims. This year marks 20 years since South Africa adopted the 16 Days of Activism for No Violence Against Women and Children Campaign. 16 Days of

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 3

Activism is an international campaign aimed at building and strengthening a global movement that works towards ending all forms of gendered violence against women and girls.

This campaign, led by the United Nations, takes place annually from the International Day for the Elimination of Violence Against Women on 25 November to the International Human Rights Day on 10 December. South Africa was amongst the first nations to adopt the global campaign in 1999. Indeed, to defeat the unacceptably high levels of gender-based violence requires the collective efforts of all South Africans. Individually and collectively, we must commit ourselves to do everything in our power to reclaim every part of our land from those who terrorise women and children. These founding provisions demand of us ... We have a Constitution, part of which responds to the rights of women through such founding provisions such as human dignity, achievement of equality and the advancement of human rights.

These founding provisions demand of us to respond to a clarion call that together we must make a solemn pledge that we will

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 4

liberate our homes, including our bedrooms, streets, workplaces, religious institutions and every corner of society from the scourge of gender-based violence. We must isolate and frown upon all who turn a blind eye to acts of abuse against women and children.

In the 24 years of our democracy, government has made significant progress in fighting gender-based violence by formulating and promulgating substantive legislative and policy frameworks. No one can contest our assertion that in the 24 years of freedom and democracy, the ANC-led government has registered significant progress in restoring the dignity of women. Through our progressive policies, the living conditions of the majority of women have undergone significant qualitative change. Women now occupy their rightful places in society and are able to exercise rights and access opportunities that were a dream only about 24 years ago. However, Chairperson and hon members, violence against women and children threatens to reverse all these gains and to derail our national efforts to promote women empowerment and gender equality.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 5

The Domestic Violence Act 116 of 1998, was promulgated to provide mechanisms to deal with subliminal forms of domestic violence such as emotional and financial abuse, threats and intimidation. The Act also provides for witnesses of domestic violence to report to the law enforcement agencies. The Criminal Law Amendment, or the Sexual Offences and Related Matters Act 32 of 2007 provides for gender neutral definitions of rape victims and for special protection for survivors. The Criminal Procedure Act 51 was promulgated in 1997, and provides for procedural mechanisms for the prosecution of criminal activities which encompass acts of violence perpetrated against women. Despite all these efforts, we remain painfully aware that much more still needs to be done. Although South Africa has enacted progressive legislation as well as introduced measures to deal with gendered forms of violence, we know as a matter of fact that violence against women and children remains a reality.

We base ourselves on the understating that the global importance of the struggle to end gender inequalities is encapsulated in the United Nations Sustainable Development Goals Agenda 2030.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 6

South Africa is party to and signatory to various international conventions and protocols that call upon us to institute appropriate measures to eradicate gender-based violence. These include the United Nations, UN, Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women, Cedaw, the Beijing Declaration and Platform for Action, Southern African Development Community, SADC, and African Union, AU, protocols on human rights and women rights.

South Africa is an instrumental member of the global village, is party and signatory to various conventions. The women of South Africa have concrete expression to the #HearMeToo campaign during the Gender-Based Violence and Femicide Summit which was held on the 1 and 2 November. Addressing the Summit, the President said:

I am convinced that by working together, by confronting difficult issues, and by mobilising all South Africans, we shall create a society where women and children feel safe and are safe at all times and in all places.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 7

Indeed, a multisectoral onslaught will help us defeat this scourge. The Minister for Women, Minister Bathabile Dlamini, is bringing attention to this year's #HearMeToo theme through the Robot against gender-based violence. The Robot is an instant and critical determinant between healthy and unhealthy relationships. The Robot is about protection and safety. It is about taking precautionary measures, asking for help, and walking away from violent and abusive relationships.

According to the theme #HearMeToo for 2018 is supported by the sub-theme 'Women of Fortitude', which focuses on unlocking women and girls' potential, and reaching out to those in far-flung areas. The sustainability of the 16 Days of Activism Campaign is supported by the 365 Days of Activism for No Violence against Women and Children initiative. This extends the 16 Days of Activism campaign to a longer term, enabling more inclusive, and continuous programmatic interventions and awareness. We must respect, appreciate and love women and children 365 days a year. Government's strategic approach to the 16 Days of Activism Campaign is guided by the lessons provided by those who fought

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 8

for the struggle before us. The history of South African women's movement and activism reminds us of the strength in women's unity. It is only when women unite across race, class, ethnic backgrounds, sexual orientations, religious beliefs and political parties that the goal of total emancipation of women can be achieved.

Under the umbrella of the Federation of South African Women in 1954, women dismantled the social barriers that divided them and united towards a common goal. It was through this unity that women in our country managed to deliver the historic victories such as the Women's Charter in 1956. On the 9th of August 2018, President Ramaphosa made reference to the importance of honouring 100 years of women's struggles that were led by Charlotte Maxeke through the Bantu Women's League.

The women of South Africa, in particular the women in the African National Congress, convened the Malibongwe Conference in Holland where gender activists and experts from across the post-independence world shared feminist insights with South African

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 9

women. This was one of the first meetings to feature internal women activists, exiles, and women from other countries evaluating and debating gender politics in post-apartheid South Africa. The African National Congress, the ANC, started the struggle for women emancipation many decades ago. At the conference, women criticised the domination of political structures by men and the marginalisation of women from decision-making structures. The conference gave great prominence to the concept of the struggle for nonsexism.

I may take this opportunity hon members, to say that I am able to stand here and the majority of women who are here in this hall today, whether this side or that side of the House, are a result of that struggle which was started by the ANC Women's League and fought for women during the liberation struggle itself because the women of the ANC Women's League said that the struggle for liberation for women cannot be postponed until South Africa is free. It has to be during the time of our liberation struggle. It is also for this reason that we say during this year's 16 Days of Activism Campaign, the Department

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 10

of Women is leading the call to confront various ways that patriarchy is institutionalised. Key to these efforts is government's ongoing assessment of the capacity of institutions of the National Gender Machinery to meet human rights and social justice. The results will give an outline of the programming, organisational efficiency, and resource needs of various structures of the National Gender Machinery.

Hon members, as I take my seat I call upon all of you, irrespective of which political party you come from, to understand that the fight against this scourge is a terrible scourge and it knows no boundaries. Therefore, those who are calling for time I wonder if they for that time in their homes. Thank you. [Time expired.] [Applause.]

Ms D ROBINSON: Madam House Chairperson, members, fellow South Africans, there has been many outstanding women of fortitude in the struggle for freedom from patriarchy and apartheid. The two names that come to mind are Helen Suzman and Mama Albertina Sisulu, who was known as the mother of the nation. Her lifelong

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 11

commitment to democracy, fighting for the rights of women and always inspiring was a never giving up attitude.

Then, there was Helen Suzman, a woman of substance and courage. She was my role model from early childhood, a woman who paved the way for many of us to find our place in politics.

She was not intimidated by the National Party strongmen. She sat alone for thirteen years. She was the only woman in Parliament. She was fearless, unbowed and challenged them by asking difficult questions about the condition of prisoners and the cells and prisons in which they were held. She regularly visited Nelson Mandela on Robben Island and interceded with the authorities to improve the appalling conditions under which the prisoners were held.

She was their intermediary with their families, smuggling in books and letters, providing legal aid and assuring them that they were not forgotten. She left us with an important mantra when in doubt, go back to first principles. See for yourself,

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 12

don't accept anything first hand, investigate and then challenge from a position of strength.

The close relationship with Helen Suzman led Nelson Mandela to pay tribute to her by saying, your courage; integrity and principled commitment to justice have marked you as one of the outstanding figures in the history of public life in South Africa. All she modestly said about herself was that she stands for simple justice, equal opportunity and human rights. That is what we should all stand for.

Hear me too. A cry goes out from the women of this nation. Hear us; respond to our urgent plea to increase funding for the fight against abuse. Stop the corruption that steals from the poor and needy. Cut your Cabinet, reduce the wasteful expenditure and put it where it is desperately needed.

Our society is sick, heinous sexual crimes are being committed daily. Look to the health of our nation, physical and psychological of our mothers and their sons and daughters.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 13

The Budget for the funds must be made available to correct shortage of staff in the SAPS, the justice system, especially the Maintenance Courts.

The many police officers are not properly trained and professional in their approach, especially with regard to gender-based violence and domestic violence cases. There are insufficient police stations and vehicles and they do not have basic rape kits. What about victim friendly rooms? The shelters and the Thutuzela Care Centres are few and far between.

I refer to this document, a policy brief by the Institute for Security Studies, ISS, entitled, crimes against women in South Africa. It indicated that about 70 813 women experienced sexual offences in 2015-16. This was a 53% increase in sexual offences.

There was an alarming 117% spike in femicide during 2016-17. This is appalling. The policy brief states that due to pressure on the fiscus, a unique approach will be needed to advocate for funds for this important work.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 14

The outrage of women, non-profit organisation, NGOs, and our lobbying as parliamentarians, led to the recent Gender Summit being called by the President. I could see that the President was moved by the desperate stories told by the women, victims of rape and crime, but also victims of the system and the inadequate systems that do not meet the needs of the vulnerable in South Africa.

So, please, Mr President, look at the unique approach. Women matters and our health depend on the strength of the family, as well as on women who are resilient and strong, whether to nurture and support partners and children.

I challenge you Mr President, the Ministers of Justice and the Minister of Finance, respectively to find the funds to ensure the safety of our citizens. Let us go back to our Bill of Rights and our Constitutional so that we can implement the decisions and resolution made at the summit.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 15

This will be my last plea from this podium before I retire. To paraphrase the words of Nancy Pelosi Never losing faith, we worked to redeem the promise of America, that all men and women are created equal. For our daughters and our granddaughters today we have broken the marble ceiling. For our daughters and our granddaughters now the sky is the limit.

Women, know your power. Let us stand together in unity, women and men, to heal our nation and to save future generations to know their power.

IsiXhosa:

Malibongwe igama lamakhosikazi! Nkosi sikelela i-Afrika.
Ndiyabulela.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Thank you very much for the road taken on women issues. Thank you.

IsiZulu:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 16

Nk M S KHAWULA: Sihlalo, khona ngiyezwa bakithi umhlonishwa laphaya uyakhuluma ngabantu besifazane kodwa into ebalulekile nje ukuthi make sifundeni ukuthi into esiyikhulumayo iyenzeka yini. Kuyimanje njengoba ngikhuluma nje abantu besifazane uma bethi bayazidayisela bayaboshwa emadolobheni niyakubona kwenzeka eThekwini, befuna nje ukuphilisa abantwana babo. Okunye, ngisanenzela amazubela ... [Ubuwelewele.] bese nizothi nina la abantu besifazane niyalwisana nokuhlumuzeka kwabo, ngibala ukudwengulwa nokuhlukunyezwa ngendluzula kodwa nina uqobo, nangu ezisholo laphaya umhlonishwa ukuthi uyabadlwengula, mbopheni. [Ubuwelewele.]

Engizokusha la - angizile ukuzodlala la - ngithe kwisigceme-75 e-Lamontville kunemindeni yabesifazane nezingane ezihkezi laphayana ezilala ndawonye

USIHLALO WENDLU (Nk M G Boroto): Mam'Khawula! Mam'Khawula, thatha isihlalo kancane.

Nk M S KHAWULA: Ungasidli-ke isikhathi sami ngyakucela.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 17

English:

Mr H P CHAUKE Chair, on a point of order:

IsiZulu:

Umama wami engimthanda kakhulu wenza isitatimende esingalungile sokuthi kukhona umuntu laphayana, athi yena, udlwengula abantu besifazane, bengithi nje kuphela makayihoxise lento lena ngoba ayihlali kahle. Impela nje, ngumama wami engimthandayo lo ... [Ubuwelwele.] ungayingeni-ke wena, ungayingeni nakancane nje, thula. Ukhulumelani-ke wena? Wenzani? Umdala kangaka? He-e!

English:

No! My point is made Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon Chauke! Hon Chauke, you made your point and I don't think that is what she actually said. Thank you, continue ma.

IsiZulu:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 18

Nk M S KHAWULA: Awu! Ngiyabonga. Kuyimaje usihlalo weqembu lomama okuwuyena osengene kulowethu uMnyango Wezabesifazane Ehhovisi Lokamongameli, into eyenzekile ukuthi ngimbikele udaba lokuthi e-Lamontville eWema kunemindeneni eyehlukene engamashumi amathathu okungabesifazane, yizingane, wogogo, kulalwa ndawonye befakwa yikhansela lakhona lakwaKhanyile, ngisho u-MEC uDlomo uyalwazi udaba ngimbikelile. Yiziphi izinto kanti ngempela okufanele sikukhulume ngazo ngoba ningafuni ukuzilungisa, kufuneka badlwengulane yini laba bantu? Futhi ithoyilethi abalisebenzisayo lilodwa, nina nizoyithatha njengehlaya lento, ngoba aniyenzi lento okuthiwa yi-oversight nomsebenzi womphakathi. Aniyi emphakathini nina, nigcina ngokuhlala lana.

Sihlalo omuhle, noma ungekho muhle ngoba ugqoke esiluhlaza okwesibhakabhaka namhlanje ... [Ihlombe.] [Ubuwelewele.] emasontweni ambalwa edlule owesifazane uNk Matalana wadutshulwa washona elokishini lase Nyanga khona la eKapa. Lentokazi ishiye umtwana omncane ozokhula ebhekene nenkinga yokungasabi nomzali. Kuze kube yimanje akekho oseboshiwe ngalesi sehlakalo,

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 19

kunalokho umndeni wakhe njengamanje usunokwesaba ngoba abazi noma bazobuya yini laba abambulele bezobabulala nabo.

Emasontweni ambalwa edlule siyibonile intokazi enesibindi esimangilasayo, u Nk Cheryl Zondi, owanukubezwa uMfundisi u-Omotoso. Lo Mfundisi u-Omotoso kuyimanje sizimisele ukumbona eboshwa, sifuna ukubona nokuthi imvume unayo yini yokuthi azovula isonto la kanti yena uvula isonto lokuzoxhaphaza izingane ngoba izingane ziyamethemba bezazi ukuthi ungumzali kanti ungumuntu ozobulala. Iqiniso lithi kuyimanje baningi bayizigidigidi abanye okutholakala ukuthi nabo bayadlwengulwa. Zonke lezi zehlakalo zikhombisa ukuthi inkulu kakhulu inkinga esibhekene nayo. Uma nje singakwazi ukuthi silusukumele lolu daba singabantu besifazane. Kuyimanje abantwana abaningi baphila kabuhlungu ngaphansi kwezimo zokuthi abazali abanabo. Kodwa awuboni ukuthi kukhona ukubhekelela ... [Ubuwelewele.]

USIHLALO WENDLU (Nk M G Boroto): Siyabonga mama!

Nk M S KHAWULA: Anive niyenza lento yenu ... [Ubuwelewele.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 20

USIHLALO WENDLU (Nk M G Boroto): Siyabonga ma, isikhathi sakho siphelile.

Nk M S KHAWULA: Kodwa njengenkosi kufanele ngabe uyajabula ukuthola umuntu okhulumela abantu njengami ngoba nina anizikhulumi zonke lezi zinto.

English:

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Thank you very much, your time is up hon member. Thank you.

IsiZulu: 14:26:48

Nk M S KHAWULA: Ngicela ungi ... (microphone switched off)

Ms L L VAN DER MERWE: Hon House Chairperson, a few weeks ago, a monster was found guilty of the murder and rape of little Courtney Pieters. Courtney's killer gave her rat poison, before strangling her with a towel, and raping her. Courtney was only three years old. She was from Elsies River.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 21

It is in Elsies, where criminals are in charge. It is in Elsies, where women and children live in fear every, every single, day. Courtney, died, because the system that meant to protect her, failed her, but it is not only her story. It is the story told by many South Africans today.

It is told at our police stations, where women and children who are victims of abuse are turned away and told to go and work out their problems at home. It is told at our courts, where survivors of gender-based violence like Cheryl Zondi are retraumatised for being brave enough standing up and fighting for the truth.

It is told in the damning report released yesterday by Doctors without Borders which pointed to the fact that almost half of government's treatment centres survivors don't offer counselling services. It is the story of a broken system; a broken system that is failing our women and children.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 22

President Ramaphosa recently admitted that gender-based violence is a crisis, tearing our nation apart. He was right. But beyond the rhetoric, hon President, where is the action?

If President Ramaphosa was here today and I see he is not here, his Deputy President, the Minister of Social Development and the Minister of Women in the Presidency, and the Minister of Justice are not here. I need to ask myself whether there is real political will to end gender-based violence.

If the President was here today, I would have given him a few solutions: firstly, adequately fund shelters for survivors of abuse; secure convictions against rapists. This government still prosecutes more sex-workers than rapists; start teaching anti-violence programmes at schools; equip and empower the SAPS in the fight against gender-based violence; but most importantly piece of advice for the President is , find yourself a new Minister of Women in the Presidency. Please, take us seriously and find the New Minister of Women in the Presidency

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 23

At the weekend, this very Minister banned the eNCA from the launch of the government's 16 Days of Activism for No Violence Against Women and Children Campaign, thereby, proving that her struggles are more important than the struggles of women and children. This is the same Minister that lied to the Constitutional Court. It is the same Minister that violated her oath of office.

One wonders what type of the government asks a person that violated the rights of the women and children to look after the interest of the most vulnerable women. It doesn't make any sense. One asks whether this is how much President Ramaphosa values women and children.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon Van der Merwe, actually your time is now up.

Ms L L VAN DER MERWE: I am done anyway.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon member.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 24

Mr P J MNGUNI: Hon House Chairperson, I think that a live debate is acceptable, but I rise in terms of Rule 85 that I am carrying. It is obvious I am very familiar with the Rule. You should know that by now. To say that the hon member is casting aspersions on the good character of the Minister and that she is allowed to do so but through a substantive motion for as long as that substantive motion has not being tabled, she must then withdraw the aspersions. Thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon members, why don't you allow me to look into this first. Unfortunately, really, that phrase I couldn't get but I will rule on it before I leave this table.

Ms L L VAN DER MERWE: Chairperson, it is actually in the Constitutional Court hearing. Thank you very much.

Ms N V MENTE: Point of order, Chairperson.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Yes, hon member.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 25

Ms N V MENTE: Chairperson, I think the member over there is confused. It is a court ruling. It is not an accusation. No one is accusing Ms Bathabile Dlamini of anything. The court ruled that she is a liar

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): I said I will rule on it. Hon member, you are now debating. That is not a point of order. You are now debating. I ruled on the matter. This is a debate on women. Can we respect this moment that we are having?

IsiZulu:

Nk M S KHAWULA: Sihlalo, nginephuzu lokukhalima okuphambukayo. Okwesibili, mabasiyeke labantu besilisa, uyabona uma si-debater lezi zinto zabantu besifazane zithinta thina futhi ngeke usukume ... uyabona uma bengase bazi usizi esibhekene nalo ...
[Ubuwelewele.] akufanele badlale ngathi, sizonquma manje ePhalamende nibone manje ukuthi sidiniwe.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 26

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): That is a debate. I think you had your time. You had your time ma'am Khawula. Thank you very much.

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Hon House Chair, once again and once a year, we are gathered here today as a form of protest to say no to violence against women and children. That is for 16 days in a year and we forget what is happening for the rest of the year.

While we are grandstanding here electioneering, our people are being raped, having their rights violated, they are being murdered and we spend more time here wanting to grandstand on that.

You know, the sad thing about it is that it happens all over, including where you govern. There are serious challenges. So, don't come with excuses and blame others. Put your house in order first.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 27

What we have done is: we introduced Mother's Day because we forgot we had mothers. We introduced Father's Day because we forgot we have fathers. Now, we have introduced 16 days of activism for no violence against women and children because we for forget them too. That's the fact. But let us all ...

[Interjections.]

Isizulu:

Nk M S KHAWULA: Uxolo Sihlalo., nginephuzu lokukhalima ophambukayo.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon Mme Khawula, on what point are you rising?

Isizulu:

Nk M S KHAWULA: Cha, bengithi mina ake singathathi lento siyenze ihlaya ngoba nje ngabe kuhle uma bekuyinkulumo-mpikiswano eyenziwa abantu besifazane bodwa. Lento ayishoyo athi: "there's grandstanding" angazi ukuthi uqonde ukuthini.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 28

English:

We are not here to play. We come here to work.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon member, please take your seat. I am switching off your mic. Hon members, I am trying to be as calm as possible because of the debate that we are having today. This debate is not a joke. Hon members, lets allow the debate to flow. That is a point of debate, hon Mme Khawula, please. Continue hon member.

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: The EFF should be the last one to talk about because they have serious challenges of violating the rights of women in their party. There are allegations all over on what women should do to keep their jobs.

Ms N V MENTE: On a point of order.

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: What are they talking about?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 29

Ms N V MENTE: The member must not mislead the county and talk about things he knows nothing of. He must focus on his dying party. Leave the EFF alone. Focus on your dying party.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon member, I am switching off your mic. That's a point of debate. Can we allow this debate to flow, hon members? Let's respect the debate. Thank you very much. Continue hon member.

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: The rights of our women continue to be violated, including in this very Parliament. There is this perception or understanding amongst men that if I am the boss or superior, then you are entitled to something, that women must adhere to whatever you are saying. It is a problem even in this Parliament that we are sitting in at the moment. There is no doubt about that. What do we do? We rather grandstand than dealing with the challenges that these women experienced.

Take the issue of maintenance, the EFF is not so responsible. They don't pay maintenance properly. [Applause.] The fact of the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 30

matter is: with all the mechanism that we got in place, women's and children's rights are being violated because maintenance is not being paid.

I can give you a good example, if you are self employed, the victims run after those fathers because they refuse to pay maintenance even though the law is in place. They are not getting adequate maintenance for their children.

Too much of democracy has been counterproductive leading to men who haven't given up or break up or divorce holding their former spouses and girlfriends to a life of hell at the expense of the children. There, you have unscrupulous legal team that go and support them.

My very President has been intimidated by members in my own party that want power and control because she is a woman. They won't respect her. So, I think violence against women and children continues on a daily basis and yet you give it 16 days

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 31

only in a year. I think it is time to do something about it.

[Time expired.]

Ms C N MAJEKE: Hon Speaker, hon members, I stand here today and debate violence against women and children. After 24 years of democracy women and children are still not treated with full freedoms, rights and respect. If that is not enough women and children are further subjugated to violent attacks and sexual assaults on a daily basis.

There has been this case that has been going on in Port Elizabeth of a child who has been raped by pastor. You know what? In the African continent, there is a country that closed over 6 0000 churches because of these attacks of people pretending to be pastors only to come to molest and sexual harass our children. What's going to happen? All those who have been locked out are going to come to our country if we are not doing anything about the mushrooming churches that just come on a daily basis over night. [Applause.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 32

Speaker, you will agree with me that South Africa is not doing enough to protect the most marginalised, most vulnerable and often voiceless people. You will agree that during the 24 years of a democratic Parliament, we have failed to protect women and children in South Africa. This is not withstanding the general legislation we have passed over the years but it rather speaks to the effective monitoring and implementation of legislation.

We have had cases of women being assaulted by Members of Parliament. A typical patriarchal disrespect for a woman's right further leads to a continued assault to the even more vulnerable of our society and our children.

These behaviours and actions by our members who are supposed to be fathers, who are supposed to be protecting women, their violence add to the growing statistics of gender and household violence. In South Africa, research showed that one in four women is physically assaulted. [Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 33

Mr N L S KWANKWA: Point of order. Point of order. House Chair, they are drowning out my speaker, please. Can you ask them to ...

IsiXhosa:

... niyangxola ngesiXhosa, khanincede nithethele phantsi. Kha ubacele mama kuba ngoku asimva ukuba uthini umama uMajeke.

IsiZulu:

USIHLALO WENDLU (Nk M G Boroto): Ngiyanicela asilalelaneni.

English:

Ms C N MAJEKE: As a nation, we must never tolerate crime, the crime against girls and infants must be stopped now. We must do everything legal to prevent it from happening and address its root and structural causes.

Violence against women and children is rooted in gender-based discrimination and sadly has become a social norm. Gender stereotypes further perpetuate such violence. The recent spate

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 34

of gruesome murder of women and infants has a devastating effect on children who are our future, women and society in general. In this regard, the patriarchal domination of women and children must not be allowed to grow like an uncontrollable infestation that sickens our beautiful country.

We must not forget that women throughout history stood for the liberation of all and yet today they are the most oppressed.

[Applause.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Members in the gallery, I just want to advice that you are not allowed to participate in the proceedings of this House, either by clapping hands. I am saying this because I have seen flashes of camera. So, just be aware that that is not allowed. Just listen and enjoy the deliberations and smile. Thank you.

Mr W W WESSELS: House Chair, there is no doubt that the ANC government has failed the very struggle Minister Zulu is referring to for the emancipation of women. She is correct

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 35

though to say that we need 365 days of activism are not only 16 days but government fails to do that. Firstly, the SA Police Service and the justice system victimises victims further. Victim support in our justice system is shocking.

My office recently assisted a victim of gang rape in Botshabelo in Mangaung. She knew her attackers, identified them and testified numerous times, each time having to relive the brutal attack in which she was raped by four men. Yet she was made to sit in the passage way of the magistrate court across from the ring leader of the very attackers, ordered not to move. To make it worse, hon Minister, half of the docket got lost and prosecution failed.

Our Police Service and our justice system are failing the women of South Africa. Government also fails because of a Minister of women affairs who herself undermines the rights of women.

Government also fails because of our archaic quota system which is only used by the ruling party for cosmetic purposes and which

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 36

portrays a message that women are not actually equal to men but need a quota system.

We need 365 days of activism. We also fail because of a culture which is perpetuated by leaders in the governing party where women are portrayed as only objects and not as equals. Address those within your inner circle that treat women as objects and then we can talk about activism against violence against women and children. We need a better system to address this. We need an actual justice system that cares about the victims and that are not only there to serve their own purpose. I thank you.

Ms B S MASANGO: Chairperson, women and children are subjected to unprecedented levels of abuse and the statistics on this scourge are alarming. My oversight visits to a number of SA Social Security Agency, Sassa, local offices, among other key challenges, women especially, told sad stories of how their plight has been ignored by government. One of many such stories is that of a lady I met in Meyerton in Gauteng.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 37

For the last four months, she has been shunted from pillar to post with regards to child support grant for her four children. She has been to Sassa offices, sent to a bank, then to the post office but to no avail. This is while her children depend entirely on a school feeding scheme and kind neighbours. This woman is one of many in her area that go through the same experiences under the watch of a government that claims to care for its people.

Another story comes from northern rural KwaZulu-Natal, that of a mother whose three children's grants were stopped in March this year. No number of trips to a local, but far, Sassa local office has resolved her problem. Both her and the lady in Meyerton had one thing in common.

The disdain with which they were treated was unbelievable. Firstly, on further probing, you understood why the understaffing is high and at times employees are overworked and take their frustrations on the poor and vulnerable. What then is the real problem here? It is lack of leadership by Sassa and the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 38

lack of political will to care for the poor and vulnerable in our society. The denial of state support for those who deserve it is one of the worse violations of their constitutional rights

This is just one form of abuse that women and their children go through on a daily basis. The recently published South African Child Gauge highlights, among other things, the abuse women experience when trying to get child maintenance for their children. It summarises the abuse as follows: Given that it is mostly mothers or and female relatives who care for children when parents separate, they tend to bear the burden of securing maintenance payments for themselves and their children.

This would never happen under a DA-led government. With our principle of fairness, we would ensure that we don't subject the sector of society already referred to as poor and vulnerable to further abuse by treating them with disdain as the ANC government is doing. You just have to take a look at a report after report on the performance of where we govern and you will know exactly what I am talking about. Thank you. [Applause.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 39

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE AND CORRECTIONAL SERVICES
RESPONSIBLE FOR CONSTITUTIONAL DEVELOPMENT (Mr J H Jeffery):

Chairperson and hon members, patriarchal practices have characterized all cultures in our society. Under colonialism and apartheid the majority of women in South Africa faced the triple oppression of gender, class and race. Women and children are still a vulnerable group in society today with their rights often violated through domestic violence, trafficking, child pornography and labour exploitation.

We must also not underestimate the existence of intergenerational trauma where multiple generations transmit the damage of trauma over a number of years. Our past has left us as a deeply traumatised society. Gender-based violence also perpetuates gender inequality. Patriarchy, like other forms of discrimination, must be dismantled. The experience of other societies has shown that gender equality is not a by-product of a struggle for democracy or national liberation. It has to be addressed in its own right. Perhaps most shockingly, crimes against women and children are often perpetrated by persons

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 40

known to them. Earlier this month, in the Cape High Court, in the same week, convictions were handed down in the murders of Susan Rohde, Hannah Cornelius and the three-year old Courtney Pieters. They were murdered by people known to them.

Government has responded to and continues to respond to this scourge of violence with a number of priority interventions. In addition to passing legislation preventing and prohibiting domestic violence, sexual offences, harassment as well as trafficking in persons. We also have various policies and programmes to support victims and to prevent secondary traumatisation. Since August 2013, we have been progressively establishing new Sexual Offences Courts every year. Sexual Offences Courts at a regional court level offer a number of victim support services which include amongst others, court preparation services and intermediary services who convey questions and statements received from court to the victim in a sensitive and age appropriate manner. They currently appear in cases involving child witnesses and witnesses with mental disabilities.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 41

In addition, we make use of in camera testifying services for children, persons with mental disabilities and all traumatised victims irrespective of age. These witnesses testify at the private testifying room and out of the physical presence of the accused and other people via a closed circuit television, CCTV, camera. These services are primarily available in Sexual Offences Courts but we are now in the process of extending them to other victims of gender-based violence where possible. Last Saturday, Minister Masutha launched the Botshabelo Sexual Offences Court which was also in response to the Declaration of the Gender-Based Violence Summit, held earlier this month which requires the continued roll-out of Thuthuzela Care Centres or TCCs as we call them, Sexual Offences Courts and shelters for gender-based violence victims with an adequate budget allocation. The Sexual Offences and Community Affairs Units of the National Prosecuting Authority established 55 TCCs in support of victims. The Thuthuzela Care Centres are attached to hospitals or clinics where a survivor can go to for medical attention and have evidence collected at the same time.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 42

The regulations on the minimum requirements for sexual offences courts are close to being finalised after having been extensively work shopped with stakeholders. The final draft regulations will be submitted to the chief justice for concurrences required by the Act. Domestic violence doesn't just mean only physical or sexual abuse but it includes emotional, verbal, psychological and economic abuse, intimidation, harassment, stalking, damage to property or any other controlling or abusive behaviour towards a complainant where such conduct harms or may cause imminent harm to the safety, health or wellbeing of the complainant. Of the over 209 000 reported abuse cases, emotional, verbal and psychological abuse were the most prevalent forms of domestic violence contributing half of the overall number of cases received. One of the demands raised during the recent gender summit was the proposed introduction of an automated national registry for protection orders to track down all persons whom the protection orders were granted against and to understand the magnitude of domestic violence in the country. We are currently engaged with civil society on this issue.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 43

On the issue of human trafficking, our Prevention and Combating of Trafficking Persons Act came into operation in 2015 and it creates a comprehensive legal tool to combat trafficking in persons in all its forms. A National Intersectoral Committee on Trafficking in Persons which comprises of national government departments; the Police, the National Prosecuting Authority, NPA and civil society organisations was established. The committee leads the implementation and administration of the Act as well as establishing Provincial Rapid Response Teams to attend to optional matters. From the side of the Justice, Crime Prevention and Security, JCPS, cluster, tackling gender-based violence is an absolute priority with the SA police focused integrated implementation and monitoring the six-point plan on gender-based violence and vulnerable groups.

Interventions as part of the cluster response include: Firstly, increased training of frontline desk staff in all relevant departments in the dealing of victims in a more sensitive manner. Secondly, focusing on 32 hotspot police stations and improving the quality of interactions between victims, police

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 44

and other relevant role players as well as ensuring the police and prosecutors are better trained. Thirdly, to implement measures to ensure more client or victim or survivor satisfaction from reporting phase to court proceeding phase. Fourthly, plans are also underway to further capacitate the Family Violence, Child Protection and Sexual Offences Units of the SA Police, and lastly, improving the turnaround time on deoxyribonucleic acid, DNA, forensic sample's processing and improving the processing of blood and alcohol analysis.

As at 31 March 2018, the police reported that 1 049 victim friendly rooms are operational throughout the country. The SA Police Service, Saps, is also expanding the establishment of victim friendly rooms to a further 110 police stations and prioritising the remainder of hotspot and rural police stations as well as to ensure optimal utilisation. So what more can be done? Reducing levels of gender-based violence can never be the responsibility of government alone, we need our communities and our partners in civil society to assist. As I was coming here, I heard that a researcher showing that 75% of domestic violence

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 45

where gender takes place in the home. It is not something to politic over as some of the hon members have done.

However, it is ironic that the one party that has never had a woman Member of Parliament, the Freedom Front Plus, was so vocal on women's issues. We also need to empower communities and build partnerships through Community Policing Forums, Community Safety Forums and street and ward committees. The Community Safety Forums, CPFs, should be in position to direct victims where to go and how to proceed in instances of gender-based violence. In addition, each one of us must teach our boys that "they are because women are." No woman must be told by the police or prosecutors to go fix things at home. No woman must be turned away from a police station without a proper investigation. We must encourage the reporting of gender-based violence through all relevant role players and strengthen school safety and campus safety programs.

We participate in the various 16 Days of Activism events and activities around the country and show our support on social

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 46

media. When someone talks about abuse be supportive and encourage them to go to a police station to open a case or to call the gender-based violence command call centre on 0800428428. Another area where the community can play a role is in the granting of bail. A magistrate is supposed to consider a number of factors before deciding whether an accused should be let out on bail and at what amount. Among the factors they are supposed to consider is the severity of the crime, the threat that the accused poses to the victim and other witnesses and the accused's flight risk. If members of the community are aware of information that could affect the granting of bail, they should contact the investigating officer as relevant information can influence whether or not the accused will be let out on bail.

Finally, when people do decide to testify in court, let us be supportive. Many members of the public followed the case of the rape trial of Nigerian pastor, Timothy Omotoso, and his two co-accused. Many of us saw the first witness, Cheryl Zondi, and were outraged at the tone and content of the cross-examination that was directed at her. Whilst legal practitioners should act

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 47

in their client's best interests and have the right to cross-examination, there is an obligation to protect witnesses from inappropriately harsh and or irrelevant lines of questioning, all the more so when such witnesses are sexual violence survivors.

In this regard, we are proposing that we consider changing the law so as to allow for the testimony and cross-examination of adult witnesses in sexual offence cases to also be via an intermediary, so as to reduce further unnecessary trauma. Hon members, violence against women and children are violence against all humanity. It must be stopped. To the victims of violence I want to reiterate the words of President Ramaphosa at the gender summit: "We hear you and we will not fail you." Thank you. [Applause.]

Mrs C DUDLEY: Chair, to appreciate the prevalence of violence against women and children in South Africa, we need statistics to move from numbers to people. South Africa's statistics shows that three women die at the hands of their partners every day in

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 48

this country, and nearly half of women across South Africa are subjected to violence by an intimate partner.

Just looking around this Parliament, we can be sure most of us have intimate knowledge of this happening to people we know, and a significant number of us will have experienced personally this trauma.

We in South Africa are a people who bear emotional and physical scars, who have known the desperation to get away and to get loved ones to a safe place. As the director of Children's Institute says –

... if children are to reach their full potential, and the cycle of intergenerational violence is to be broken, South Africa must consider solutions that are collaborative.

Also calling for collaborative solutions is the project leader for the Building an Inclusive Society programme at the Institute for Justice and Reconciliation. He however asks the following:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 49

What happens or what should society do after conviction of a perpetrator? He also questions whether we do enough to understand what reproduces behaviours known as toxic masculinities in our society. He points out that we should not dismiss the impact of widespread trauma and mental health problems amongst men.

Whilst there are many causes and multiple factors to the violence, often exacerbated by alcohol and drug abuse, there is general consensus that we should be looking for behavioural patterns and harmful gender norms that give men a sense of permission to use violence against women and children. Whilst this research is being done, however, and long-term approaches developed, practical and urgent needs exist, like the need for housing for women and children who are being bashed and bloodied to escape these bullies.

Having appealed to several Ministers over the past four years, today the ACDP is appealing to you, Mr President, through your Office. We know you have been deeply moved - you said "hurt and

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 50

ashamed" - by the personal accounts of abuse you heard at your summit. We know that children who witness their mothers being abused in the home or who are abused themselves are more likely to harm others later in life. Safe state housing provides an escape that would provide them with a hope and a future. The special-needs housing policy needs your urgent attention. It has been ready and waiting for a Minmec and a signature for approval for over 47 months. Getting this policy approved and implemented would immediately assist those working on the ground to turn the situation around and offer real help in the face of real danger.

The ACDP appeals to you to intervene and get this policy approved and implemented. Thank you.

Ms D CARTER: Chairperson, I prepared a speech and then, just yesterday, a video was circulated on social media about two naked women, badly beaten, in prison. I closed the video in shock and immediately asked where the video came from. I got no response. I asked again and again and still, up to now, no response. I opened the video again and painfully watched with

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 51

tears running down my face how these two badly bruised, exhausted women were begging these men to stop. Why did the first person to receive this sick video not report it? Why did no one hear them? I ask myself whether we do, for example, have an Intelligence Service in our country. Hacking into cellphones and emails is used to fight party political battles, but why can't the origin of these messages be traced?

We have had 20 years of the 16 Days of Activism for No Violence Against Women and Children campaign, and what have we achieved? Over the past five years, we have been subjected to an increase of 16% in the murder rate of women. In the 2017-18 financial year, 18 000 child rape cases were recorded. Poverty, inequality and unemployment, which have a disproportionate impact on our women and youth, continue to escalate. Why are we failing to translate our constitutional rights into meaningful reality?

Section 33 of the Constitution states that a child has a right to just and fair administration. This is not being upheld in the maintenance courts, due to ongoing postponements, untrained

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 52

staff, and parents and lawyers who abuse the system. This is a large contributing factor to why 6 million of our children are starving, as recently reported. Parents cannot postpone their children's needs. Interim orders must be put in place so that our children's needs are seen to whilst the cases are finalised.

When we talk about gender-based violence and violence against women in South Africa, we cannot ignore the senseless violence perpetrated against lesbian women in South Africa. A culture of discrimination has ensured that corrective rape and the brutal rape and murder of lesbians have become a perpetual evil in our society. When reporting these crimes, many have experienced outward discrimination from the SA Police Service and are victim shamed.

I want to read you a letter: Growing up in our community, it was the norm to see a man beating up his wife or partner. We would be woken up by screams. The first screams in the house would be the child begging the father to stop beating the mother. We

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 53

would then just listen. No one would dare get up to try and help.

IsiZulu:

Ayingenwa into yabantu ababili.

English:

In the morning, the husband has left to go to work. Only then you will see some neighbours going to find out what happened. It will just become neighbourhood gossip. Black-eyed, with her doek on her head to cover her bruises, embarrassment on her face ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon member, your time has expired.

Ms D CARTER: This will continue until one day it is actually a funeral. It has to stop. We have to start speaking out about this. We need to stand together in this country as men and women. Thank you, Chair.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 54

Ms T STANDER: Chairperson, blame must be apportioned to the ANC-led government for violence against women and children. Just two months ago, Minister Bathabile Dlamini and President Ramaphosa admitted that the ANC has failed women. The ANC has been so obsessed with the politics of position that it has abandoned the politics of the people. [Interjections.]

Today, almost 100 newborn babies will die. Today, about 30 children will die from hunger. Today, a girl will start her period but won't be able to afford sanitary towels. Today, 109 sisters will be raped by men who have access to free condoms. Today, a job seeker might be compelled to have sex with a government official to get a job. Today, two children and eight women will be murdered. This issue should be apolitical, but the legislation, budgets, and oversights led by the ANC in this House breed the social ills we see in the country today. Today, a victim of violence will not be helped by the police, will not receive counselling from the Department of Social Development, and will not be able to find a place of safety. Today, women and children desperately seeking asylum at our

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 55

borders will be turned away because they cannot afford the R200 bribe.

This debate is a farce! This politically correct motion was added onto the parliamentary programme at the last minute. Minister Zulu, you pat your back in this House when you are quoted saying some women are opportunistic and should not be trusted. You have said the ANC has regressed on women's issues, so do not come here and mislead the people and pretend the ANC cares. [Interjections.] The ANC turned on Khwezi at Zuma's rape trial. The ANC heckled three victims Manana assaulted. The uMkhonto weSizwe Veterans who were in the camps have still not received justice for the rape and assault they had to endure. [Applause.] The ANC cannot liberate and protect our women and children from violence if it protects patriarchy, rapists and abusers in its very own ranks.

Deputy Minister Jeffery, I asked you where the Traditional Courts Bill and Prohibition of Forced Marriages and Child Marriages Bill, which was introduced in 2011, are. He said it is

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 56

not appropriate in an election year. [Interjections.] That is what this Parliament has come down to. Yesterday, these benches were full.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE AND CORRECTIONAL SERVICES RESPONSIBLE FOR JUSTICE AND CONSTITUTIONAL DEVELOPMENT (Mr J H Jeffery): Chairperson, with due respect, the hon member is lying. [Interjections.] The Traditional Courts Bill is in Parliament. The other Bills have nothing to do with Justice or me. Thank you. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon member, firstly, you are aware that that is a point of debate. Secondly, you cannot say in the House that a member is lying.

An HON MEMBER: Withdraw!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon Jeffery, can you please withdraw the part where you said she is lying before I rule on this. [Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 57

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE AND CORRECTIONAL SERVICES RESPONSIBLE FOR JUSTICE AND CONSTITUTIONAL DEVELOPMENT (Mr J H Jeffery): I withdraw that she is lying, but I dispute that she is speaking the truth. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Thank you.

Mr M WATERS: Chairperson, may I address you? The Deputy Minister must withdraw unconditionally. He put a proviso on the withdrawal. It must be unconditional, please.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Did he say something after that? I can't hear. [Interjections.] Hon Waters, I heard him withdrawing. [Interjections.] Continue, hon Stander.

Mr M WATERS: Chairperson, if I may, he did qualify. He said, "I withdraw", and he qualified it. So, please ask him to withdraw the qualification.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 58

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Alright, I didn't hear that part, but the withdrawal I heard. Thank you. I will check that. [Interjections.] Continue, hon Stander.

Ms T STANDER: Yesterday, the ANC benches were full to push through bad legislation and budgets that are not worth the paper they are written on, yet these important Bills that could change people's lives on the ground have been outstanding, and then you just want to, at the last minute, push through selected pieces of legislation that are not going to actually help the people. [Interjections.]

Whilst the Prohibition of Forced Marriages and Child Marriages Bill is not in place, as of 2016, 90 000 girls between the ages 12 and 17 are married, many of them to men a lot older than them. So, if we are to hear and heed the #HearMeToo call, then raise your voice in the only way the ANC understands.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Thank you very much. Your time has now expired.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 59

Ms T STANDER: No! No, Minister Zulu had 20 extra seconds!

[Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon member, your time has expired. I am going to switch off your microphone.

[Interjections.] Hon Stander, please leave the podium. Your time has expired. Please! [Interjections.] [Applause.]

Setswana:

Moh N P KHUNOU: Modulasetulo, maloko a Ntlo e tlhomphegang, re fitlhile mo nakong eo tlhokofatso ya basadi le bana e ileng magoletsa. Re simolotse go lwantsha tlholego ya Modimo ka go bopiwa ga mosadi le monna mo lefatsheng, ba bopilwe gore ba nne mmogo ba ratane. Modimo o dirile mosadi gonne a nne le pelo ya lerato, ya tlhokomelo, ya boutlwelobotlhoko le ya bogatlamela masisi.

English:

She is indeed a co-creator with God.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 60

Setswana:

Ka IsiXhosa bare mosadi ke nkosikazi, e raya gore mosadi ke kgosigadi. O ikutlwa yang ntate fao tsholetsa letsogo o lwantsha mosadi wa gago o mothulantsha mabota. A e gofa boitumelo ba gore ke mo phatlotse tlhogo. A o robala sentle bosigo fa o mo bolaile? Gore o itire phologolo e fetang phokojwe ka gonne phokojwe fa e bona batho e bona dijo tsa yona. Jaanong wena yo o bolayang ngwana, yoo bolayang mosadi, o itirile phologolo. Malome ga o bona lesele le tshoga le wena, a itumela gore ke tshwere ke wa losika, wena o bona mosadi o o ka morobalang? E kare nkabe ke le ngaka ya tlhaloganyo gore ke kgone go bona gore go diragalaeng mo bobokong jwa batho bao.

English:

16 Days of Activism 2018 happens after the first ever Presidential Gender Based Violence Summit and femicide. This is the first ever gathering in the world that a President convened this kind of a summit. This means that gender-based violence has escalated. The summit was primarily an outcome of the mobilization efforts by women living in South Africa, social

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 61

movements and civil society. We appreciate and acknowledge the #Total Shutdown Movement which was an umbrella body that organized the march.

So as the country we have to build on that, and ensure that each and every government department implements the resolution on the outcomes of the summit. 16 Days of Activism 2018 must ensure that each department takes out issues from the declaration and commit itself to that. Government must put resources both human and financial to ensure what the country started will lead to zero tolerance, zero deaths and zero abuse. Hon Stander, this is when we are working together to eradicate violence on the ground.

As government we must work together with civil society and properly support the NGOs' that are on the ground, doing the work. They should be given the necessary resources and be closely monitored, at the Deputy Minister have said. There shouldn't be any competition or any political grandstanding if we want to make a difference, rather complement each other to

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 62

end this violence. Coming here and blaming the ANC for violence against women and sexual abuse and rape is a really cheap politicking. Our country is burning and instead of us looking at the root cause of the problems and say that we are solving them, we come here and blame each other. It is not going to help us at all.

In South Africa we should not only be seen only from the 25 to the 10 December as both hon members of the ANC have said, it should be a programme for the whole year. We want to see departments and civil society coming together to give a feedback. Next year we need to be talking about that feedback. On the 10th of December when we close Parliament, we should be saying; this is what we have achieved in fighting the scourge of violence in this country.

As part of the declarations of the Presidential Summit, we as The Multi-Party Women's Caucus support the establishment of the National Council on Gender-Based Violence resourced both human and financial. We support a National Strategic Plan on Gender-

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 63

Based Violence, GBV ... that one ... [Laughter.] ... to be developed as soon as possible. And ensure that all the laws and policies are implemented and are effective. Promote women centered economic development.

A targeted, social behaviour change program to address values and norms and structural drivers of Gender-Based Violence is developed and implemented. This should be targeted at all sectors including individuals and families, communities, civil servants, religious and traditional leaders, private sector and media and others that are strategically placed to influence attitudes, behaviours and practices. The issue of patriarchal practices which is institutionalised and entrenched within family, cultural and family traditions; we all have moral responsibility to ensure that we dismantle it.

All of us as a collective, we need to continue to involve men and boys as campaigners and survivors who prove that the cycle of violence can be broken. And today in Multi Party Women's Caucus we had Sonke Gender Justice when they were talking about

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 64

these issues and for members who were not there we said we are going to give you all the notes from Sonke Gender Justice.

We have to acknowledge the challenges that we have in fighting violence against women because we need to be coming up with solutions as Members of Parliament - that is our job. The ANC-led government, to emphasise on what the Deputy Minister has said, has established the Gender-based Violence Command Centre and we will give the number to you. It has established of Khuseleka One Stop Centre which is one of the ground breaking Victim Empowerment Programme shelter model, offering a full basket of services including reintegration of survivors into the community and self reliance.

The government which is led by the ANC is funding shelters for victims of Gender-Based Violence and has also established White Doors Safe house to provide safety and shelter services to the victims and Thuthuzela Care Centre for counselling and medical care. Come up with solutions. Don't come and throw stones. We need to come up with solutions. These are the serious problems

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 65

that are affecting our nation. I am saying, Members of Parliament as we are going on recess, let us go to the boarder posts and ensure that there is no human trafficking. We need to stand there as women and say; we are going to check each and every car that leaves South Africa to other countries; to make sure that our children are not trafficked. If we don't do that we will never get what we want to achieve at all.

Hon Fubbs yesterday gave me a book of poems and I would like to quote from one of the poems, it says:

"I will not abandon hope, we will never abandon hope; hope will never abandon the people - not now -never. We will fight on and on until we are all liberated"

She was celebrating 100 years of Mama Albertina Sisulu. Thank you very much for doing that.

Hon members - Wessels - Oh God. I don't understand the audacity of you coming in front here and saying to a political party that

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 66

is bringing equal representation of women in this Parliament and you these are cosmetics, I am neither a cosmetic, nor all these women on my right. They are not cosmetics at all. Maybe you can start by changing your own house and say to the FF Plus that we want 50-50 representation of women in this country. We used to be exemplary as South Africa to the whole world but we have regressed and it is because of parties like yours who don't want to take it seriously. Hon Stander ...

Setswana:

O utlwisa bothhoko.

English:

You are a disappointment. How do we say we are going to deliver services when we cannot even come and approve budget? Why do we see that as a negative thing? I am not sure what I can do. I was hoping that the Minister of Health would be here, really. This is the time that we need to look at ... [Applause.] [Time expired.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 67

The MINISTER OF SMALL BUSINESS DEVELOPMENT: Hon Chairperson,

Siswati:

Ngekutitfoba ngoba nguwe lolapho manje, mine nawe siyevana
nalabo labakhuluma Siswati ekhaya seyevama.

Setswana:

Ka boikokobetso, ke kopa gore ...

English:

... as we leave this house all us, as individual members we must
really go into our consciences and begging to realise ...

Setswana:

... gore ngangisano ya gompiono e ne e sa ya go polotika, e ne e
se ya go kgathisa batho, e ne e se ya go bontsha gore mang o
montle kgotsa o maswe, e ne e le ngangisano ya gore ...

English:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 68

... we must feel the pain and the suffering of the women that we were talking about.

Setswana:

E ne e le ngangisano ya gore rona ...

English

... as South Africans and Parliamentarians in particular ...

Setswana:

... re tshwanetse gore ...

in our homes, in our community in everywhere, where we go...

Setswana:

... moo re bonang gore kgang ya ...

English

...abuse against women and children is something that we need to talk about in the fore front.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 69

Setswana:

Selo sengwe seo ke batlang go le bolelela sone ke gore go na le batho ba ba tlang go bua thata fano ba lebetse gore pele ga ngwaga wa 1994 go ne go na le mosadi a le nosi fela mo Palamenteng yo neng a fiwa tlotlo e e fiwang basadi gompiono.

{Legofi.}

Ke batla gore ba ba ratang go polotika, fa ba tswa mo Ntlong eno e e tlotlegang, ba bogele thelebishene gore ba kgone go bona le go utlwa ...

English

...some of the things that were said by the women during the conference. Where others were feeling that these women have gone to far, by expressing certain things. The bottom line is that those women had to go there and do what had to do because they wanted to be listened to. So as we leave this House today, let us also go and relook into something that causes a lot of pain in my heart when I was looking at the TV the other day, and saw that the question which was being asked was not the right

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 70

question. You can't ask the question whether 16 days of activism is right thing or the wrong thing. You need to ask the question, why are we here? What needs to be done? How can we relief and release this pain.

I watched Josina Machel when she was explaining that she is part and parcel of the women's movement and she was even before, but because she was a daughter of a president and because she thought she had education in and whole lot of things, that would not happen to her and yet it happened to her, so I would like us Members to go back to what I said from the very beginning...

IsiZulu:

... ukuthi, lento esikhuluma ngayo ayinapolitiki, ayinamali, ayanabule, ayinabubi, ayinalutho, inento nje yokuthi, yini esingayenza ukuze iphele.

English:

It is also important for this House to offer a solution and not just talk, talk, talk. Parliament needs to be more carefully

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 71

look into a research rather than using such a debate for point. Research shows that women are least safe in their homes and that alcohol and drugs are factors that increase likelihood of violence and that socialisation of boys and men needs urgent attention. So this House needs to realise that we are sometimes ourselves the people who do not bring men into the discussion.

People must realise that the manner in which we bring our own boy child that makes the difference. So let's stop politicking about it, the ANC has always committed itself to the emancipation of women. Thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T DIDIZA): That concludes the debate, the Presiding Officer also join the National Assembly as we debate in this House and reflect on the scourge of violence against women in our country and hoping that in deed, we will as Parliament make our contribution to deal with the scourge. Thank you very much.

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 72

INQUIRY INTO GOVERNANCE, PROCUREMENT AND FINANCIAL
SUSTAINABILITY OF ESKOM

(Consideration of Report)

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: Chairperson, I
move:

That the report be adopted.

Motion agreed to.

Report accordingly adopted.

Ms D Z RANTHO: Hon Speaker, Ministers, Deputy Ministers, hon
members of the National Assembly, respected guests, comrades,
friends, fellow South Africans. Hon members of the Portfolio
Committee of Public Enterprise, today I official handed over the
award that was given to the committee by the Lead SA
Changemakers, it is been given formally to the House Chairperson

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 73

Mr Frolick. It gives me both pleasure and relief to introduce this oversight inquiry report of the Portfolio Committee into matters of corporate governance, corruption and state capture at Eskom. It has been a long and arduous process that has tested the resolve of all the members of the Committee and of our families.

As we consider this report, it is important to remind ourselves that we took the decision to conduct the inquiry on 21st of June last year we were in a very different political environment then. The current Minister of Public Enterprises, hon Gordhan, and the Deputy Minister of Finance, hon Gungubele, were members of our Portfolio Committee and they both made tremendous contributions to the inquiry process, when there was no decision yet by the former President to appoint the Zondo Commission.

The members of the committee distinguished themselves by their level of political maturity for a few months. Parliament was competing with the soapies for prime time television viewership. South African people watched us as we acted as one team of

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 74

elected representatives, determined to get to the bottom of allegations of corruption and state capture in our State-owned corporations, SOCs. For that I believe our people's faith in the institutions of our constitutional democracy was. The faith of people in Parliament was restored.

The revelations in the Public Protector's State of Capture report, research done by academics as well as the work of investigative journalists, shocked us about the extent of corruption that was going on in our State-owned companies, but even as we took the decision to conduct the inquiry, nothing could have prepared us for what has now been uncovered. We realised that we needed resources and we requested the services of an evidence leader as well as legal and secretarial support, all of which were granted by Parliament.

The inquiry commenced on 17th October 2017 and this is the product of those hearings. The fruits of our oversight are quite remarkable. We now have a new Board of Directors at Eskom and executives who are pursuing literally hundreds of investigations

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 75

into corruption, fraud and other crimes. We can rightly claim that it was in our inquiry that a global management consultancy firm, McKinsey, pledged to pay back over R1 billion of ill-gotten money to Eskom. Eskom is currently seeking to recover hundreds of millions of rand from Trillian and the other company implicated in the looting.

The inquiry was instituted in line with the mandate of Parliament as articulated in section 56 of the Constitution and rule 167 of the National Assembly. The terms of reference included: board's ability to discharge its fiduciary duties, looking into financial status and sustainability of Eskom, appointment of board members and executive management, failure to comply with procurement prescripts. We also intended to look into circumstances surrounding the incorporation of Denel Asia and governance issues at Transnet, but time did not allow us to do so.

The report is divided into four parts: part A is the overview; part B is the summary of evidence, based on witness accounts,

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 76

both oral and documentary evidence. It examines the following matters: how a Gupta family owned company, Tegeta was assisted to acquire optimum coal mines and awarded contracts by Eskom; the manner in which Trillian, McKinsey and Regiments fleeced Eskom; the shenanigans surrounding the New Age sponsorship contract worth millions of rand; Eskom's arrangement of Mr Brian Molefe's resignation and pension; and Governance at Eskom. Part C are the findings of the inquiry; and part D are the recommendations.

As a multi party committee of thirteen members, each party was represented proportionally. The committee interviewed a number of witnesses, most of whom submitted written statements as part of evidence. Several witnesses who included former Ministers and former Deputy Minister of Public Enterprises, former members of the Eskom board of directors and executives, directors of companies that had dealing with Eskom; and whistle blowers.

The Committee heard evidence which illustrated the extent to which public procurement had been used to serve the interests of

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 77

certain private businesses and families, in direct contradiction to Eskom's constitutional obligations. In addition, various Eskom Board members worked to benefit a network that sought to achieve the capture of Eskom. Evidence before the Committee also showed how persons entrusted with key public powers acted inconsistently with their responsibilities. In our recommendations, we call for decisive action to improve the regulatory environment governing SOCs and clearly defining the roles, responsibilities and accountability of the shareholder and the board.

We make a call to the board to continue with the work of cleaning up Eskom and holding those responsible for wrongdoing accountable. We call on Parliament to deal decisively with those individuals who have undermined this institution and the people of South Africa by refusing to appear before the committee and those who sought to mislead us by providing falsified information. The report appeals to the law enforcement agencies

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 78

to make arrests and imprison individuals who have committed the highest form of betrayal of one's country – facilitating the capture of public institutions for personal enrichment.

We also request this House to hand over this report, to the Judicial Commission of Inquiry led by Deputy Chief Justice Raymond Zondo for further investigation. I wish to call to all South Africans across all sectors and political backgrounds for unity in tackling corruption and state capture. Corruption robs all us regardless of race class or gender, corruption is evil. We must not dismiss the efforts of fellow South Africans who are fighting corruption by launching racial attacks on them.

IsiXhosa:

Bantu baseMzantsi Afrika, masiwulwe lo mkhwa wokubiwa kwemali karhulumente sisonke nokuba kukweliphi na inganaba. Into yokubiwa kwemali karhulumente yenza kubenzima ukuba nakhelwe izindlu kwaye kufundiswe abantwana abangathathi ntweni. Masitsho sonke ngazw'inye sithi, phantsi ngorhwaphilizo, phantsi.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 79

English:

Finally, I wish to thank the leadership of Parliament for the support they have given to us. We thank the whistle blowers, staff and board members who were victimised simply because they refused to sell off our national assets to the state capture project. We reserve a special word of gratitude to Advocate Ntuthuzelo Vanara, and all the support staff for their selfless service to Parliament and the people of South Africa.

IsiXhosa:

... nonke siyanibulelela, sithi kuni , maz'enethole,. Enkosi.

Ms N W A MAZZONE: House Chairperson, today is a good day to be a South African. Today is a historic day in our Parliament's history and a day that should make us all proud to be Members of Parliament. Most importantly, today should make us all proud to be South African. When the history books are written, today will be remembered as the day Parliament managed to expose and destroy the monster of state capture in Eskom. Today marks the day that South Africa won. For too long, as a country, we were

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 80

stuck in what seemed to be an unbreakable cycle of corruption, greed, theft, mismanagement, maladministration, and terror. So great was the monster that is state capture that, at times, it seemed that this monster and the parasites that were feeding off it would never be captured, never mind destroyed.

The Portfolio Committee on Public Enterprises soon realised that we had become the country's first line of defence. We were on the people's watch, and it was our duty to guard and protect the country from the monster. We had a rocky start. Never before had Parliament embarked on such an ambitious task. We required legal opinions that what we were attempting to do and accomplish was lawful so that when certain individuals tried to stop us - and believe you me, they tried! - we would be armed with everything that we needed. We soon realised that we had a very powerful weapon on our side. We had the South African Constitution, which allowed for us to do our jobs. We were protected, and that was all that was needed.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 81

During the inquiry, I began to realise why the mafia has a code of silence known as Omertà. You see, this code of silence only works if everyone adheres to the same rules: you never talk out, you never flinch, and you never give away secrets. Thankfully, like most bullies and parasites, once you have them in a corner, they quickly buckle under pressure, as they possess no real courage, and they depend on one another to keep safe. It took one parasite to break Omertà, and the floodgates were open. What happened during the Portfolio Committee on Public Enterprises' inquiry into state capture at Eskom played out in the public like a James Bond movie. It was hard to believe that those who were walking amongst us had managed to amass the power that they had due to the protection they were receiving from the very highest echelons of power. They had virtual free rein to pillage Eskom and rob South Africa blind. In one piece of testimony I asked a witness the following: Why didn't you report what was happening when you realised something was wrong? The answer, quite simply, was actually this: Who do you report it to when it goes straight up to the very top? [Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 82

I must emphasise that we did not only have parasites that came to give us evidence. Many brave South Africans came forward at huge personal cost to tell us exactly what was happening. To those who volunteered to testify and give us information to help with the inquiry, I would like to offer my sincere thanks.

[Applause.] You have proved that good will always triumph over evil. You are proof that, in a world dominated by corruption, there are good people who are brave enough to fight, and you can be called true patriots.

I have thanked him before, but I must during this, what I consider to be a great South African victory, thank Adv Vanara, the evidence leader of our committee, just one more time.

[Applause.] The history books will remember him as a true South African hero, a fighter for a free and fair society. What he personally sacrificed, the hundreds of hours that he put in preparation, in deliberation, and in assisting the committee will never - and must never - be forgotten.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 83

This report is excellently drafted. It has the legal precision and is perfectly frank and a true representation of what happened in the inquiry. However, this report goes one step further in that it makes recommendations to Parliament that action must be taken by this very House against Ms Dudu Myeni, Mr Duduzane Zuma, Mr Tony Gupta, Mr Atul Gupta, and Mr Ajay Gupta. I believe that this will be the first time that such action is taken by Parliament, and therefore that in itself is historic. This report will be handed over to Deputy Chief Justice Zondo. It will form part of the evidence that he will lead in the state capture inquiry.

We, as a portfolio, take great pride in handing over this report to the Zondo Commission. Our work in defending this country has paid off. We recommend that a number of people are also called to testify before the Zondo Commission, including Mr Brian "Cry Me a River" Molefe, Dr Ben Ngubane, Mr Anoj Singh, former Minister Lynne Brown, and former Minister Malusi Gigaba, to name but a few. Information that is currently being uncovered is proving that these individuals will have more than just Eskom to

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 84

worry about when they face the Zondo Commission. Dirty hands were also all over Denel, Transnet, Alexkor, and many other state-owned entities.

Today is indeed a great day to be a South African. Today, we prove to our country that we can and will triumph over evil. Today, we prove that if you remain brave, steadfast and determined, you will win. Today, we prove that South Africans are brave, kind and resilient. Today, we understand what that feeling is, that particular flame that burns deep inside of you. It is inside all South Africans. It is a feeling of pride. It is a feeling of pride that we have that although we have shame in our government, we are completely proud of our country. It is that proudly South African feeling that makes you want to hug someone when you are out of the country, and you hear someone say, "Heita da, sharp-sharp, or howzit". It is that feeling that tells us that we are stronger and better and undefeatable when we are together.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 85

It is that flame that burns inside us that tells us no matter how hard they will try to divide us, we will always remain united. It is that flame inside of us that reminds us of the Preamble to our beautiful Constitution that says:

We, the people of South Africa,
Recognise the injustices of our past;
Honour those who suffered for justice and freedom in our
land;
Respect those who have worked to build and develop our
country; and
Believe that South Africa belongs to all who live in it,
united in our diversity.

Today, I say to the people of South Africa, being elected as a Member of Parliament is the greatest honour of my life. This report is not only a victory for Parliament. This is a victory for all the people of South Africa. To my colleagues on the committee, I salute you all. I am proud to stand beside you, and

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 86

I must tell you that the pleasure has been all mine in working with each and every one of you.

Today is indeed a very good day to be South African. [Applause.]

Mr T RAWULA: Hon Chairperson, the renowned Nigerian Author, Chinua Achebe, once explained that one of the truest tests of integrity is its blunt refusal to be compromised. We have over the past 10 years been at pains as a nation. We have had the very foundation of our society shaken to the core and this was not because there has been agitating to redefine power and the structure or society, no. Our nation has been shaken has been shaken because of institutionalised and embedded corruption, cronyism and unscrupulous and brazen theft of public resources for the benefit of the select few.

Eskom is the biggest symptom of this tragic abortion of the deepest hope of a nation fresh from violence and turmoil. The report of the committee illustrates with horrifying clarity how Eskom and those entrusted with authority at Eskom had used that

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 87

authority and trust to stage a silent coup and a heist and handed over authority and public funds to a consensus clique of people intent on milking our state for all its wealth.

It details how people at the helm of which one was Mr Jacob Zuma represented by his acolytes lied when presenting evidence at the committee hearings in order to white their complicity in the hallowing out of Eskom. They used legitimate calls for transforming Eskom into a vehicle for looting for the benefit of just one family the Guptas.

The report list a number of people who must be criminally charged among whom are former board chairpersons, Ben Ngubane, Zola Tsotsi and Zethembe Khoza as well as Brian Molefe, Matshela Koko and Anoj Singh. We asked that these people must be taken to court as a matter of urgency to make an example of them and those who's favourite past time is stealing public money.

We can no longer continue as normal; we need to take extraordinary action to restore integrity and ethics in the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 88

management of public institutions. We asked the law-enforcement agencies to focus on those external factors and actors who facilitated the hollowing out of Eskom. The Gupta family, Duduzane Zuma, Dudu Myeni and Jacob Zuma must be prosecuted as a matter of urgency.

Chairperson, in fact it was Dudu Myeni in the house of Jacob Zuma who summoned the former Chairperson of Eskom Zola Tsotsi, to come and gave him instructions that he must fire the three directors of Eskom as a matter of urgency. In fact it was Tony Gupta who told Zola Tsotsi that "Chief you are assisting, you must start assisting, and otherwise the President is not going to be happy with you." We have heard that in the commission. We cannot wait for the conclusion of the Zondo Commission to start prosecuting people who have been made ... [Inaudible.] ... out of our nation.

If President Ramaphosa is serious about cleaning out our country, he must not be happy with the fact that Malusi Gigaba

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 89

and Lynne Brown are no longer Ministers. The long arm of the law must find them and drag them back to where they belong in jail.

We as well express our gratitude to Adv Vanara who led evidence with impeccable ability and integrity. Some how we believe there is hope through the likes of Adv Vanara. In the midst of all the negativity in our nation, a bright star like him shines to remind us of what we are capable of. Adv Vanara is one of those bright stars. This report is the opportunity for this House to unite against corruption. [Time expired.] [Applause.]

IsiZulu:

Mnu M HLENGWA: Mhlonishwa Sihlalo, ukuba ngisenkonzweni bengizohlabelela umhlabelelo othi, *Masimbonge onomusa kangaka.* Ngoba ngempela yinhle into eyenzeka eNingizimu Afrika namhlanje.

English:

I rise on behalf of the hon Singh who was a member of this committee and an enquiry who was one of the first people to call for it and we just want on behalf of the IFP at the outset to

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 90

thank the hon Chairperson, Rantho and her colleagues in that committee who against all odds and against personal threads rose to the occasion and she in particular ably steered this ship to what is today a credible report. To her we say well done hon member. [Applause.]

To Adv Vanara, the IFP say well done, good, faithful and patriotic South African, you have done the nation proud.

This inquiry reminds all of us of the duty of serve and leadership and the burden of parliamentary responsibility. That at most material time we will be called upon to rise above the divides of politics and put South Africa first. In the midst of the chaos of the Fifth Parliament this enquiry has been one of those initiatives that has given us hope that says that Parliament can and does function.

Clearly the Guptas had their hand in every single pie and their lieutenants in the form of Dudu Myeni, Duduzane Zuma, Koko and Ngubane to name just a few, almost brought Eskom to its knees.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 91

Of course we are glad that we now have been able to undergo this process of this inquiry to hopefully prevent that.

Eskom remains one of the greatest single threats to our democracy and our stability if we do not get things right. Therefore, may this report now form part of the new journey for a new Eskom so that this country does not collapse. We hope that the recommendations of the committee contained there in will be realised to the fullest potential so that we may be able to bring about justice, restore good and effective governance at Eskom and ensure that the majority of our people who are previously disadvantaged and presently disadvantaged access electricity which as far as we are concerned in 2018 is a human right.

We hope that the Zondo Commission against all the odds and the public humiliation, it has been subjected to from some quarters, will embrace this report, process it and ensure that whatever is contained therein is actually seen through.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 92

Finally, hon House Chairperson, may the work of this committee remind all of us in Parliament that portfolio committees are not an extension of the executive and that portfolio committees will do their work so that we do not ever find ourselves in a situation where we have to deal what went wrong, let us rather prevent it. Prevention is better than cure. Thank you, hon Chairperson. [Applause.] [Time expired.]

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Hon House Chair, at the very outset, allow me to congratulate and commend the Chairperson together with all members of this committee that despite the intimidation and the court challenges you have made us proud. Indeed if what we see in terms of your response to what has been happening at Eskom can be taken to all departments and all parts of the country.

You know what is very important, hon House Chair, we heard members speak here with lot of passion, hope, courage and lots of good things were said. Equally what I would like to see, because I am personally of the view that even the Limpopo province is captured. So, I would like us to equally even if it

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 93

is our own organisations, our own political parties and our leaders that are corrupt then we too must take a stand against them. If we can all do that united, no one would be able to steal from the poorest of the poor in South Africa. [Applause.]

We cannot be divided when people are stealing the monies of the poorest of the poor. Billions and hundreds of billions of rand are being lost. What does that clearly tell us? There has to be a weakness in the system. It is either policy, legislation, but there has to be a weakness in the system if individuals from the private sector in collusion with political parties or leaders are able to do what they have done, to the extend that they have done.

What does it also tell us that giving too much power to any individual will destroy an entire nation? That is what has happened in South Africa. So, what does it tell us? We need to close the gaps and I am glad many of the Ministers are here. We need to look at the challenges that we faced how the state was

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 94

looted and what we now need to do to close those gaps so it can never happen in South Africa ever again.

Do we have the will to do that? I think we do. We do have the will. However, I think what is important ... [Interjections.] Well, I am hoping and talking for everybody here that might have the will to want to be acting in the best interest of all South Africans. [Applause.] I think the time has come to put our differences aside and I am not saying we can grandstand and we can do what we want to do. However, let us put our differences aside. When it comes to ensuring that we protect the fiscus and protect every cent of the state against looting and corruption. And I want to tell you there is plenty more to come! I want to see how some of our colleagues will respond to it. We need to deal with it and deal with it properly. Thank you. [Applause.] [Time expired.]

Mr N L S KWANKWA: He he he! This is a good story to tell.

Woodrow Wilson once said, on 9 June 1907,

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 95

We live in an age disturbed, confused, bewildered, afraid of its own forces, in search not merely of its road but even of its direction. There are many voices of counsel, but few voices of vision; there is much excitement and feverish activity, but little concert of thoughtful purpose. We are distressed by our own ungoverned, undirected energies and do many things, but nothing long. It is our duty to find ourselves.

This was last year. In 2018 we are saying this committee played an important part in ensuring that as a country we find ourselves and ensure that the monies of the taxpayers are used for the benefit of the public and not for the select few.

I want to say again, trying to commend the good work that is being done by this committee and Parliament by extension, by quoting one of the speakers who talked about integrity. He says: "Integrity commits itself to character over personal gain, to people over things, to service over power, to principle over convenience, to the long view over the immediate". It is exactly

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 96

what this committee did when it was trying to investigate this matter to ensure that those who were looting state resources and those who engaged in state capture are brought to book.

We are particularly happy as the UDM to see the likes of Dudu Myeni and Duduzane Zuma who thought they could get away with undermining Parliament. There is a clear recommendation for the Speaker to institute action against these because we cannot allow people to continue to undermine the authority of Parliament because in future when we want to subpoena people to appear before committees - which is in line with our Constitution - people can just decide to ignore us.

What is also important and what we find pleasing as the UDM is the recommendation that says that this report must then be referred to the commission that is currently under way, the Judge Zondo commission of inquiry into state capture because this is very critical, in our view, in ensuring that we do not deal with state capture in a piecemeal fashion.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 97

So, I hope we can get President Zuma to come back here and say "He he he! This is a good story to tell" because this one is a real good story to tell and he is one of those people who are going to be thrown under the bus for facilitating the looting of state resources and state capture.

IsiXhosa:

La masela.

Mr W W WESSELS: House Chair, good can triumph over evil. The hon Rantho is correct, corruption is evil. The hon Rantho and her committee members should be commended for their unbiased and persistence to, amidst immense pressure, excel with inquiry. There is hope. The whistle blowers who shed light on this severe corruption is proof thereof.

South Africa is currently suffering loadshedding as a direct result of the looting uncovered in this inquiry. What created an environment where this was allowed to happen? A lack of accountability, a lack of transparency and a lack of adherence

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 98

to laws and regulations such as with the Financial Markets Authority, FMA, a lack of oversight and a lack of those who appoint the boards and the CEOs of our state-owned enterprises to actually appoint people who are there to do their job, who are appointed on merit and who can do the job.

We should prevent this from happening in future. Consequences for those who are found guilty must be there. It is worrying that the National Prosecuting Authority yesterday withdrew the case against those involved in the Vrede Dairy Project corruption. We should avoid that this happens to Brian Molefe and his cronies.

There should be consequences for those who have stolen from Eskom, which provides such an important service and role in our economy. We cannot afford that this ever happens again. Consequences should follow this good report and this good inquiry - there should be consequences.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 99

But Chairperson, it is not an achievement for the ruling party that there is now a Zondo inquiry into state capture. It is not an achievement of the ruling party that there is a successful inquiry. If I break this microphone and I fix it, it is not an achievement. It can never be achievement if you allowed it to happen under your watch and then fix it. You should take full responsibility and accountability for what happened and for you who allowed state capture to happen. I thank you.

IsiXhosa:

Gq Z LUYENGE: Sihlalo weNdlu ohloniphekileyo, ndivumele ndikhahlele kuzo zonke izihandiba nezinxiba-mixhaka ezilapha egameni lombutho wesizwe i-ANC. Ndimapha ndisithi siyazingca ngomsebenzi omhle owenziweyo, siqhwebela izandla uMongameli uCyril Ramaphosa nenkomfa yaseNasrec. Sibulela kakhulu kwikomiti yesigqeba solawulo ye-ANC, uSomlomo wale Ndlu yoWiso-mthetho, umama uMbethe, uMphathiswa weli sebe omtsha kraca, umfo kaGordahn nakuMbhaxeshi oYintloko weQela eliLawulayo ngalo msebenzi enithe nawuvuma ukuba wenzekela. Sithi siyi-ANC...

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 100

English:

The unity of all South Africans against corruption and state capture is critical to our efforts to defeat the phenomenon. That is why we all need to condemn the emerging culture of harassment and insults against those who come forward to testify as witnesses and now the media, which started at the time Parliament decided to institute the Eskom inquiry and it is continuing at the Zondo commission.

Chairperson, we refuse to be bullied and silenced because we are South Africans and we fought for freedom of conscience and freedom of expression and we care for our country and its people. Some of the evidence that came to the fore during the Eskom inquiry show a disturbing pattern of capture and repurposing of entities for private benefit of individuals and their families.

We must call upon the Minister of Public Enterprises and the Cabinet to prioritise the introduction of the Shareholder Management Bill to Parliament. This is long overdue and we can

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 101

only speculate as to why it was never introduced. Its main objective would be to clarify the role of the Minister and the department vis-à-vis the roles of the board and the executives of the state-owned entities.

The fact that two previous Ministers appointed individuals to the boards of our SOEs and when we discovered that these board members had links to corrupt networks, all our Ministers could say was that they did not know or that their hands were tied. We believe that we need to hold members of the executive, vested with powers to appoint board members to a higher standard of accountability in line with the King Code.

We also need to strengthen oversight and powers of Parliament as the representative body of people, we must update our rules so that we are able to compel those accused of wrongdoing in public entities to present themselves to Parliament when they have been summoned in line with the Constitution and sections 14, 15 and 16 of the Privileges Act.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 102

As the ANC we are fully behind the processes of holding people to account for their actions and exposing the facts about corruption and we expect the law to take its course without fear or favour or prejudice. We wish to remind South Africans that it was the resolution of the ANC to institute the investigations into state capture and corruption and to set up the judicial commission of inquiry. It is the ANC and the ANC alone.

Whoever has acted improperly and happens to be an ANC card-carrying member should know that they do not represent the mandate of the ANC when they plundered resources of the people of South Africa - they must jive for their music.

If we are asked to choose between a compromised and a captured individual, no matter how powerful he or she is, and the people of South Africa, the ANC will always choose the people.

IsiXhosa:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 103

Umbutho wesizwe sakowethu uya kuhlala uhamba nabantu bakuthi. Asokuze ukhongolose athengise ngabantu. Ubusela bufana nqwa nokubhukuqa umbuso.

English:

Corruption is treason and that is why I want to make a clarion call to all the men and women of conscience who have information that can shed more light on corruption and state capture to volunteer to go to Zondo commission to give evidence and not to be intimidated by those elements who want to keep the truth under wraps.

Hon Chairperson, as members of the Public Enterprises Committee we are deeply disturbed by the institutional and oversight failure that have allowed private accumulation to thrive at the expense of Eskom. We cannot understand that the law enforcement authorities have not yet acted, in light of the overwhelming evidence of serious crimes committed already.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 104

The fascistic conduct of certain political parties that were always with us in this noble patriotic fight against corruption is truly shocking, to say the least. None of the members of our society must feel secure in the comfort that these proto-fascists have not yet targeted them.

Joseph Goebbels, Adolph Hitler's own Nazi propagandist said, and I quote,

We do not want to be a movement of a few straw brains, but rather a movement that can conquer the broad masses. Propaganda should be popular, not intellectually pleasing. It is not the task of propaganda to discover intellectual truths.

The words of the poem written by Lutheran Pastor Martin Niemoller ring true whenever fascism, that has lay waste all the progress of humanity, rears its ugly head. Niemoller wrote a warning to generations:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 105

First they came for the communists, and I did not speak out – because I was not a communist.

Then they came for the trade unionists, and I did not speak out – because I was not a trade unionist.

Then they came for the Jews, and I did not speak out – because I was not a Jew.

Then they came for me – and there was no one left to speak for me.

We could put these words in our context and say: First they came for Pravin Gordhan, calling him an Indian, and I did not speak out – because I was not of Indian descent.

As the ANC, we want to tell everybody that Pravin Gordhan is one of us. Unlike some of these peacetime heroes, Pravin's credentials are known in the struggle for the liberation of this country. Honourable Chairperson, The ANC fully supports this report and all the good work people of conscience are doing at the Zondo commission. We condemn the proto-fascist tendency dressed in red, the colour of the revolutionary working class

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 106

movement that seeks to redefine us that we are no longer just South Africans, but we are blacks, whites, Indians and coloureds. As the ANC of Nelson Mandela and Albertina Sisulu we will not bow down to narrow ethnic chauvinism. Thank you!
[Applause.]

Mr N S MATIASE: House Chair?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): What is your point of order?

There is no point of raising a point of order because you allowed him to leave the podium.

Can you take your seat hon member? Hon Carter.

Ms D CARTER: House Chair, the COPE welcomes this report and supports its recommendations. We salute the committee. We welcome the co-operative manner, across party lines, with which

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 107

it tackled this mammoth task and arrived at findings and recommendations supported by all.

We express our sincere appreciation to the members of the committee and to the fearless and brave leadership of its Chairperson, Comrade Rantho, who had to contend with a fight back from within her own party. But Chair, with respect, as COPE has been at pains to point out this is not rocket science.

As a collective, we have been elected to represent the people and to ensure government by the people under the Constitution. Each one of us swore or affirmed to be faithful to our country and to obey, respect and uphold the Constitution. What the committee has done is no more than what the Constitution expects of us and let this committee be an example to all others. It's about ethical conduct, putting the interests of our country and the well-being of our people first, before those of our own and those of our parties.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 108

The sad, stark reality is that, had the majority party, in particular, respected and upheld the Constitution; had it been prepared to hold the executive to account; and had it put the interests of the country and our people before narrow, corrupted and captured interests, then the capture, corruption and destruction of Eskom which was once internationally renowned would not have happened.

We would not be fighting to recapture our captured state or facing a fight back within the ruling party and in government itself. We would not be faced with our greatest post-apartheid crisis that threatens to sink us and our prospects forever.

Yesterday, Eskom released its six months financials. It revealed a broken utility that is now financially unsustainable. It is forced to borrow to meet operational expenditure; that faces greater than anticipated losses moving forward; that is experiencing reduced generation performance that will not be able to trade its way out of its predicament; that its own words

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 109

and I quote: "cannot resolve the financial and sustainability challenges that it faces alone."

Eskom is in a death spiral. It may still sink us financially as a nation. What was allowed to happen at Eskom and to our state is unconscionable and there must be consequences.

Now, I have to agree with hon Luyenge, corruption is treasonous. It was this treasonous act that was defended in this very same House eight times in a vote of no confidence. [Interjections.]

Ultimately, the greatest accountability and consequence management tool in a democracy lies with the people and that's their vote. I thank you.

Mr S N SWART: House Chair, this is indeed a good day for South Africa, the beginning of victory over state capture and corruption. This oversight inquiry has undoubtedly been one of the ... if not the highlight of my almost 20 years in Parliament representing the ACDP. It is therefore with great pride that we

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 110

as parliamentarians united across political lines known as Team SA present this report to the House.

By shedding light on the modus operandi of a network of implicated individuals with political protection right at the top, we were able to connect the dots.

We have undoubtedly set a precedent for future oversight inquiries. The award of lead South Africa of "change makers for the year 2018" is well deserved, but not only to the MPs involved, but to every staff member, Adv Vanara, journalists, members of society, the academics, Prof Eberhard of University of Cape Town's, UCT, Graduate School of Business, who, prepared booklets and assistance for us, everyone and all South Africans that were riveted in watching this form part of change makers of the year, 2018.

Lets us be mindful of the intimidation, the death threats and the attempts to bribery, and had we not been resolute and

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 111

determined to get to the bottom of the state capture at Eskom, we don't know where we would be sitting today.

I commend our members; the witnesses that received death threats.

Hon Rantho, remember when the commission started, we had the SA Council of Churches, SACC, coming and giving us a scripture. You said, "Because we have put God first, we will be successful with this inquiry. Hon Luyenge, remember when I asked you for scriptures every day and you were there. We were at stages where I said to you, "At the height of the threats and intimidation, we will address the nation." I said;

Stop trying to intimidate this commission. The more you threaten us, the more resolute we become, and don't you know that no weapon that is formed against us shall prosper.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 112

I thank God for the answer for our prayers, that not one of us that were threatened was touched in any way. So, let us be grateful for God in that regard. [Applause.]

Yes, the inquiry made riveting views and presented a ray of hope from Parliament of what MPs could and should in uniting behind a common course.

Who would forget the then ordinary MP, now Minister Pravin Gordhan questioning Minister Lynne Brown or us cross questioning Brian Molefe, Anoj Singh or Koko Matshela.

Now we have reached a stage of handing over to the Zondo Commission. It is worrying that very little criminal action has been taken.

William Shakespeare said, "There is a tide in the affairs of men, which taken at the flood, leads on to fortune." Members of this portfolio committee, you shall be called repairer of the breach and restorer of the streets to dwell in.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 113

So, let us continue this fight against corruption and so to the breach we go. I thank you [Applause.]

Tshivenda:

Vho R M TSELI: Mudzulatshidulo, sa ANC, ri tikedza muvhigo wa Komiti ya Mabindu a Muvhuso nga ha tsedzuluso dzo itiwaho nga ha vhuada na vhumbulu kha bindu la muvhuso la Eskom. Mabindu a muvhuso a na mushumo muhulu wa u alusa ikonomi, u lwa na vhushai na u sa vha hone ha mishumo na ndinganyo.

Tsedzuluso dzo sumbedza uri ANC yo diimisela u lwa na vhuada sa zwe zwa tshewa kha Khoniferentsi ya ANC yo farelwaho Nasrec. Nga hedzi tsedzuluso na dze ra ita kha SABC na Khomishini ya Zondo, fhulufhelo la vhathu na la vhoramabindu kha ANC na kha muvhuso lo vhuya.

Ri livhuwa vhanna na vhafumakadzi vho dzhiaho la u da kha dzulo la tsedzuloso u itela u anetshela zwine vha zwi divha nga ha u thubiwa ha muvhuso.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 114

English:

Some of the contemporary challenges facing Eskom include the matters in Eskom's interim financial results, as announced yesterday, such as the loss of more than R11,2 billion, high and unsustainable debt levels, and challenges in the electricity generation division.

However, Eskom announced some good news yesterday that its revenue is up 3%, to R98,1 billion; the company has secured 73% of funding requirements for 2018-19, and that 22% of funding for 2019-20 has also been secured; Eskom has recovered irregular expenditure of approximately R1 billion; the international bond issue oversubscribed despite tough operating conditions; and Fitch ratings lifted Eskom's negative ratings watch.

However, in spite of the evidence of some progress, and while we appreciate that steps are being taken by the board and management, to achieve a sustainable turnaround of Eskom, the company's operational and financial performance has continued to deteriorate in the six months to the end of September 2018, with

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 115

the situation expected to worsen before it improves by 2023. This is grim news for our economy, particularly for the working people of our country and the poor.

But I want to make a case today, that as South Africans, we have no choice but to support the new board of Eskom in its efforts to rebuild the company, as a publicly-owned power utility. We must not confuse our party-political agendas with what is best for our country. We have heard some mumblings from the neoliberal school of thought that Eskom must be privatised.

This is not surprising to us because neoliberals believe that the public sector has a marginal role to play in economic growth and development. They argue that the state is sluggish, inefficient and it must just stick to the basics of building infrastructure, providing education and health services for the poor, and lowering the cost of doing business for business. According to them, the state must leave the economy to the efficient hand of the market.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 116

Scientific evidence, however, proves that this is merely dogma, not supported by facts. A quick look at the historical roots of all the pioneering technologies of the past century points to decisive leadership by the state, not the private sector. In the developed countries in North America and Europe, for instance, state-owned companies and public investments have led the innovation, research and development that have facilitated the establishment of most of the well-known global brands, including Apple, Renault, Microsoft, GPS and many others.

We know that Eskom is facing severe challenges, both operationally and financially. The CEO reported yesterday that the company is reliant on debt as a result of low tariffs, limited growth in sales, increased costs, and the rising capital investment programme. In addition to this, the company is facing reduced generation performance, low coal stockpiles, and increases in municipal debt.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 117

I want to ask you to think for one moment, if we had not conducted the oversight inquiry, led by the African National Congress, what would the state of Eskom be right now?

The impact of our enhanced oversight is there for all to see, in particular the most recent achievements such as the clean-up and stabilising measures that the Eskom board and management are embarking on. Some may argue that it is too little too late, but those of us from the ANC would argue differently. We believe that it is never too late to right the wrongs of the past. What is critical is to acknowledge them honestly and move forward. That is exactly what we are doing.

Clearly, the inquiry paints an ugly picture of how Eskom was consciously taken apart, piece by piece, until all we have left is the giant power utility almost on its last legs. However, with the steady hand of Minister Gordhan at the helm of Public Enterprises, we believe the days of capture and repurposing our SOCs are over. We must remain vigilant and sharpen our tools of regulation and oversight.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 118

Now let us turn to the charade we have witnessed recently by some political parties, posing as revolutionaries. I don't think there is a single serious South African who takes them seriously. They took people by bus to the Zondo Commission, as fascist stormtroopers would do in the 1920s, to intimidate and threaten progressive people and the media into silence.

The big question is why? Thanks to investigative journalism, the circus has been exposed for its lies. South Africans must know that the bank account details given to the police by these colleagues do not match the account numbers used by the Royal Bank of Canada. [Applause.] Minister Pravin Gordhan is unable to open a bank account, unless he is a Canadian citizen or in the process of applying for residency status with that country's authorities.

As the ANC, we call the board of Eskom, organised workers, suppliers, lenders and all patriotic South Africans to work together to support the efforts to stabilise our only national power utility.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 119

As the ANC, we support the recommendation of the lifestyle audit that must be conducted, not only on the implicated individuals, but on all the senior executive board members, including board members of all state-owned entities. As the ANC, we will monitor, very closely, the implementation of the recommendations of this committee, once they have been adopted by this House. Once more, the ANC supports the report. [Applause.]

Mr E J MARAIS: House Chairperson, corruption affects communities by taking away resources that should be used for service delivery. The Democratic Alliance believes that public money should be used fairly to benefit all our people. Our money should not be taken by politically-connected like the Guptas to enrich themselves and to live lavish lives, while South Africans live in poverty.

South Africa loses billions every year to corruption and bad administration. This money should have been spent on building houses, providing bursaries to students, so that they can have

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 120

the opportunity to learn, have jobs or start their own businesses.

The performance and governance of Eskom had been in decline for some time. Responses to questions asked by Parliament regarding corporate governance matters and corruption at Eskom were misleading. Eskom officials have misled Parliament and the South African public with regard to maladministration and performance at the state-owned company.

In the light of the findings of the inquiry into Eskom, the committee recommends to the Department of Public Enterprises and Cabinet that they should review the legislative and regulatory framework governing state-owned companies, but the Public Protector's state capture report was the beginning of the opening of a can of worms.

Two previous Ministers, namely Minister Gigaba and Minister Brown, played an integral role in the appointment of new board members and CEOs at Eskom. Eskom board and CEOs have overseen

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 121

the systematic erosion of rules that govern the entity's procurement, and allowed for massive unauthorised, improper or irregular expenditure.

Afrikaans:

Die Minister van Openbare Ondernemings verteenwoordig die staat as die enkelaandeelhouer en daarom word absolute integriteit en verantwoordelike besluitneming van sodanige Minister verwag. Die vraag is: Het voormalige Minister Malusi Gigaba and Lynne Brown korrek opgetree? Die antwoord is nee.

Dit is baie duidelik dat daar oortredings van die Wet op Openbare Finansiële Bestuur asook ander regulasies en interne prosesse was. Dit is baie duidelik dat daar 'n baie nouer verhouding tussen openbare ondernemings en die Departement van Openbare Ondernemings moet wees. Sterker oorsig en kontrole moet voortaan deur die Portefeulje Komitee oor Openbare Ondernemings gedoen word.

English:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 122

Despite the long hours, it was a pleasure to serve as a member of this inquiry committee, to the benefit of Parliament and the people of South Africa. I want to end with two lines: Corruption is the name, but procurement is the game. The Democratic Alliance supports and accepts this report. Thank you.

[Applause.]

The MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES: Chairperson and hon members, from March ...

Mr T RAWULA: Chairperson, order.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon Minister, will you just take a seat please? Why are you rising, hon member?

An HON MEMBER: Here we go.

Mr T RAWULA: Chair, without disturbing the House we want to submit here that we are not going to listen to a greatest

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 123

enabler of state capture. [Interjections.] We are going to leave the House until he finishes speaking. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon member, that's not a point of order.

Mr T RAWULA: Pravin Gordhan remains the greatest enabler of state capture and therefore we cannot stay here and listen to him. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Please take your seat. I'm switching off your microphone now.

Mr T RAWULA: We'll wait outside. We are coming back.

[Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): I said I will switch your microphone off. Please take your seat. Please take your seat, hon member.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 124

Mr T RAWULA: We'll never listen to you. You are a greatest enabler of state capture. [Interjections.] You are debating state capture under your own reign. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Where is the Serjeant-at-arms?

Mr T RAWULA: When you were the Finance Minister ...

[Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Where is the Serjeant-at-arms?

Mr T RAWULA: ... you were the one that enabled the greatest ... You are the greatest enabler of state capture. We are dealing with state capture ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Serjeant-at-arms, will you please escort the member out of the House?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 125

[Interjections.]

Order, hon members! Order! Hon Minister Gordhan, will you just take a seat. Let me take the point from the hon Minister of Higher Education and Training.

The MINISTER OF HIGHER EDUCATION AND TRAINING: Thank you, Chairperson. I have raised the matter of those members and their breach of Rule 85. This is the third time in this House, and each time the presiding officers have not made them withdraw the aspersions they've cast on Minister Gordhan.

When those members come back, could that member be made to withdraw what he said because it directly breaches Rule 85?

[Applause.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon Minister, we will attend to the matter. That's why I immediately switched off the member's microphone to avoid ... because it was quite clear that

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 126

he was not willing to listen to anything. Why are you rising, hon member? [Interjections.]

Dr M J FIGG: On a point of order. It happened the last time and it's happened again now. When the members leave, they use abusive and vulgar language. They do it every time. They've done it again, Chairperson.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Yes, hon member. Will you identify those members and put it in writing to us please? Minister Gordhan, you may continue.

The MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES: Thank you, Chairperson.

[Applause.] As they say, the truth is hard to bear; but none the less, the truth will succeed eventually.

Hon Chairperson, hon members and my colleagues in Cabinet, from March this year, this government has been on a campaign to recapture and stabilise state-owned enterprises, SOEs, and to ensure that as much of the corruption as possible is exposed and

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 127

is dealt with in a very effective way. However, more importantly is that these SOEs are set on a sustainable path.

It's been a privilege to wear two hats when I speak here; first as a member of the portfolio committee during this period and now as the executive responsible for some of the SOEs. So it's been a privilege to work with the multiparty team led by the chair of the committee, hon Gcabashe, and the brave hon Rantho who took a lot of ... [Applause.] ... strain but who held firm in the face of that strain.

We have raised the role of parliamentary committees and created a pioneering effort to ensure that we can actually diligently examine the facts at hand, get the witnesses before us – as unwilling as some of them might have been – and begin to sift the fact from the fiction and the lies that were actually told to us. We have used our collective resources to get to the bottom of corruption and capture, and there is much more to do in this regard with other entities as well. I will come back to that.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 128

Through the incisive questioning and interrogation of documents, you have produced this brilliant report which South Africa should be very grateful for. We are grateful for the effort that you have put in, but importantly, as all the speakers have mentioned, we succeeded, notwithstanding what you have just seen, to work as a team across party lines. We set our differences aside. We had a single goal. [Applause.]

All the members of this committee demonstrated a very special type of courage and integrity. Chairperson, Parliament's leadership must also be thanked for supporting the committee, particularly your role in this particular regard in allowing the inquiry to actually happen; tabling and debating this report. Thanks to the Chief Whip as well. In particular, I want to echo the remarks made about Adv Vanara and his diligence, his incisiveness and his hard work. [Applause.] Thanks are also due to the true patriots who came forward to this committee, courageous whistleblowers, academics and researchers who spent an inordinate amount of time without any money being paid to them. We received honest testimonies from many, many witnesses.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 129

Investigative journalists have played a tremendous role in the past, and if you look at *News24* today, they've played a tremendous role again in exposing what's going on in Johannesburg. The *GuptaLeaks* was of course a tremendous phenomenon that has thrown a whole lot of new light on what corruption means, and indeed, the shape of state capture in South Africa.

However, we must also say no thanks to those who lied, who hid their roles, who withheld information from the committee, and I'm afraid ex-Ministers who facilitated capture, board chairs and members who betrayed the country, managers who lied, stole and broke institutions, businesses that willingly – and many of you haven't addressed this ... on the other side of government was business – took part in corruption and capture, and of course the new erstwhile defenders of corruption as well.

One of our colleagues talked about what capture means. However, there is also the politics of capture. Ultimately, as the academics have pointed out in the *Betrayal of the Promise*

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 130

report, capture and corruption is a political project. You first capture a political office at one or other level; you place key individuals in pivotal positions on boards and in managements; you identify pools of money; you then ask the question, how do we benefit the few at the expense of the many and create fantastic schemes; and then we ensure that no investigation, no prosecution ... and there is no consequences of the stealing that actually happens.

There is a whole range of enablers that we need to focus on as well. The banker ... the financial system, the lawyers, the consulting firms – all of whom are listed in this report – who still need to account for who was really involved from their side. Some of the names are mentioned here, for example Vikas Sagar of McKinsey, whose name hasn't appeared before. We want to know why McKinsey is still hiding his name and not exposing him as the key person who interacted with people in Eskom and Transnet.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 131

By way of background, it's the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development, OECD, which said that capture is the name, or corruption is the name, and procurement is the game. So, worldwide procurement is the most vulnerable area in many of these institutions. Some of the lessons that we learn from the OECD is that the phenomenon of corruption and state capture is not limited to leadership. It stems from a deep and widespread culture within institutions. So, I think we should not delude ourselves that by changing boards and management we've gotten rid of the culture of corruption. There's still a lot more work to do, and you need integrity, hard work and boldness amongst leaders, both in boards and in managements, to ultimately clear up the culture of corruption.

Secondly, a network of people relies on this culture.

Professional enablers like lawyers, accountants, financial advisors, transaction advisors and banks, all advance the corruption process. However, it's the same system through which we can actually trace where the money has gone and see how we can recover the billions that South Africans have actually lost.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 132

A precondition for corruption to thrive and persist requires economic rents; it requires discretionary powers. Throughout this report you can see how discretionary power at all levels of the hierarchy was used to actually ensure that corruption can take place. Weakened law enforcement and prosecutorial institutions assist in this process as well because then you can operate with impunity.

Corruption increases the cost and risk of business activity; it deters investment; and it depresses growth that could've lifted millions of citizens out of poverty by now. In South Africa it has not only increased the trust deficit between government and citizens but also caused the extraction of resources for private gain, often driven by just plain greed.

Eskom and Transnet became the focal points of the Gupta family but there were many other entities as well. Not only do you have the big syndicate; you also have many microsyndicates operating and you'll begin to see how these syndicates get exposed in the near future, as one of them was today. This is no coincidence.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 133

They account for – that is Transnet and Eskom – 36% and 34% of the total government SOE spend, and SA Airways, SAA, ranks at about seven per cent. So, it gives you some sense of proportion.

Total procurement spend available in these state-owned companies, SOCs, is the equivalent of a quarter of the total fiscal expenditure. If the total fiscal expenditure is a trillion rand, R250 billion is what we are talking about here.

The OECD says that: “infrastructure projects are notoriously vulnerable to corruption and fraud due to their size, complexity and investment value ... governments are required to navigate various sectors and industries” whilst ensuring that “resources are used effectively and that projects are implemented to the highest standards of quality.”

In our case as well, we still need to have a closer look at Medupi. How did it double the cost? How did it actually increase the amount of time it takes to construct that place? And there

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 134

is still a lot more work that the Eskom board needs to do in that particular regard as well.

So I agree with many colleagues who said that corruption is the enemy of the people. This report is full of Optimum Coal, *The New Age*, the information technology, IT, systems, SAP, which is a global German-based company but it made all sorts of funny deals with SOEs in South Africa, as did T-Systems as well.

Eskom acknowledged that it borrows money, as it said yesterday, and relies on debt for liquidity. It has many problems that have arisen, particularly in relation to the purchase of coal. So today many power stations find themselves in a very precarious situation where they have fewer than 20 days supply of coal. With the rainy season coming, it means that you are going to see a lot more load shedding, until and unless emergency arrangements are made. However, once you make emergency arrangements, you then pay a higher price for the coal itself. So those are some of the challenges that we are actually dealing with.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 135

I want to take the liberty to also talk briefly about Transnet, because it was mentioned in one or other context. What we are learning about Transnet is that over a 12-year period, R274 billion of capital investment took place but no volume growth took place. A total of R165 billion was invested but R42 billion of revenue shortfall was experienced in 2017-18, compared to the Market Demand Strategy. The loan book grew by 432% between 2007 and 2015, from 25 billion to 134 billion. I've got lots of other facts here, but to put it simply, Transnet is a special case where it was repurposed to ensure that most of the money it gets is put into capital investments and the stealing if you like and the corruption took place through trains and locomotives, whilst at the same time the Transnet management had nothing to renew or maintain the rail system on which locomotives are supposed to actually move.

I was with Transnet's management a few days ago and asked them the question, what went wrong in the last seven years? They said there is a mismatch in capital investment and returns, and they lost the focus of operations. They're only focusing on the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 136

investment side or were asked to actually do that. They lost operational skills. Unqualified people were appointed for different roles; the disempowerment of top management; and bloated overheads of the core and within business units. I can go on with this particular list that I have. In essence, Transnet was repurposed with the intention of ensuring that money can be extracted on the kind of scale where R36 billion of locomotives one day becomes R54 billion the next day.

Tequesta, which is a Gupta linked ... Salim Essa linked Hong Kong-based entity, got a R5 billion bonus or commission for doing absolutely nothing.

As I conclude, many colleagues addressed some of the issues that I have raised. Firstly, let me give the assurance that the President is looking at setting up a SOC council. This council will begin to co-ordinate the efforts of developing the shareholder Bill, further stabilise the SOEs, and continue to clean up and stabilise the entities that we have.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 137

Secondly, as the department we are putting all our documents together to hand them over to the Zondo commission. Some are missing but there is a whole effort going into that as well.

Let me conclude by reading this set of lines from the speech that President Mbeki made in 1996 from this podium:

I owe my being to the Khoi and the San whose desolate souls haunt the great expanses of the beautiful Cape ...

Today, as a country, we keep an audible silence about these ancestors of the generations that live, fearful to admit the horror of a former deed ...

I am formed of the migrants who left Europe to find a new home ...

In my veins courses the blood of the Malay slaves who came from the East. Their proud dignity informs my bearing, their culture a part of my essence ...

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 138

I am the grandchild of the warrior men and women that Hintsa and Sekhukhune led, the patriots that Cetshwayo and Mphephu took to battle ...

I am the child of Nongqawuse. I am he who made it possible to trade in the world markets in diamonds, in gold, in the same food for which my stomachs yearns. I come of those who were transported from India and China, whose being resided in the fact, solely, that they were able to provide physical labour ...

Being part of all these people, and in the knowledge that none dare contest that assertion, I shall claim that – I am an African.

Thank you. [Applause.]

Debate concluded.

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 139

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Thank you, hon Minister.
[Applause.] Thank you, hon members. I now recognise the Chief Whip of the Majority Party.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: Chair, I move that the report be adopted.

Motion agreed to.

Report accordingly adopted.

**CONSIDERATION OF REPORT OF PORTFOLIO COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC
ENTERPRISES ON OVERSIGHT VISIT TO ESKOM MEGAWATT PARK**

Ms L A MNGANGA-GCABASHE: Hon Chairperson, the Portfolio Committee on Public Enterprises undertook the oversight visit to Eskom Megawatt Park on 1 February 2018. The main purpose of this visit was to formally meet and interact with the newly appointed board of Eskom, give support and develop a working relationship with the new board. Eskom experienced governance challenges.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 140

There were allegations of maladministration, corruption and undue influence from the Gupta family and their associates. The Portfolio Committee on Public Enterprises initiated an inquiry into corporate governance, procurement and financial sustainability of Eskom. Some of the members of the previous board and some executives of Eskom were implicated with many allegations levelled against them.

Government appointed a new board and a group chief executive officer to deal with the governance challenges and to stabilise Eskom financial performance and act against those who had been implicated in corruption allegations at Eskom. The committee took a resolution to visit the new board as part of a relationship building exercise. Hon ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr R T Frolick): Hon Mnganga-Gcabashe, will you take your seat, please. Hon Rawula, I have asked you to leave the Chamber. You are not welcome back, sir.

[Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 141

Mr N S MATIASE: House Chair ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr R T Frolick): I am busy here dealing with the hon member. Take your seat; I will come back to you.

Mr N S MATIASE: No, chief. Don't intimidate us like that, man!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr R T Frolick): Serjeant-at-arms, will you see to it that the hon member is moved from the Chamber, please.

Mr N S MATIASE: You can't intimidate us like that. We want an explanation. [Interjections.] You can't intimidate us like that. We want an explanation.

Mr T RAWULA: Chair, you never asked me to leave the Chamber. [Interjections.] You have never asked me to leave the Chamber! [Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 142

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr R T Frolick): Hon Mnganga-Gcabashe, you may continue.

Ms L A MNGANGA-GCABASHE: House Chairperson, the board had taken action against all senior executives who had been accused of maladministration, corruption and contributing to governance lapses at Eskom. The board took a decision to suspend, initiate investigation and undertake internal disciplinary processes on all implicated senior executives. Subsequent to oversight visit at Eskom, the committee had learnt that some of the senior executive who were implicated in wrong doing have resigned from the state-owned company.

In its recent report to the committee, Eskom outlined that 11 implicated senior executive exited. The finalisation of outstanding disciplinary hearings relating to senior executives is being accelerated. There are 11 criminal cases have been opened, five of these involved nine senior executives. There is a total of 1 049 disciplinary cases that commenced since April 2018 of which 822 have been finalised, resulting in 97 employee

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 143

exit. The committee commenced the Eskom board on its commitment to clean governance and for its action against corruption.

The committee oversight made the following recommendations to the Minister of Public Enterprises: One, to improve the image of the company and the communication strategy; two, to review all contracts and procurement processes; three, to submit a progress report on the Medupi and Kusile build programmes; four, to address the municipal debt issue with National Treasury and five, to ensure compliance with policies and regulations.

The committee is pleased to note that progress has been made in these areas and we are confident that the board and the executive management have committed themselves in addressing challenges faced by Eskom. The committee supports the report on the oversight visit by the Portfolio Committee on Public Enterprises to Eskom Megawatt Park dated 30 May 2018. I check you ...I thank you, hon House Chair.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 144

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY: House Chair, I check you too, thank you. [Laughter.] We move that the report be adopted by this House. Thank you.

Motion agreed to.

Report accordingly adopted.

Declarations of vote:

Ms N W A MAZZONE: Hon Chairperson, I do not think that any member of the portfolio committee actually understood what would happen when we arrived at Megawatt Park. We knew that we would have staff that had gone through trauma that no company should go through. We knew that we would be faced with figures and facts that would scare us. However, Chair when push came to shove we realised that we had a new board that we all had faith in. We had a chief executive officer, CEO, Phakamani Hadebe, Chairperson, Jabu Mabuza, and for the first time that I had been on the public enterprises portfolio, we got an honest, frank

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 145

description and presentation of exactly how bad things were at Eskom.

The situation was this: We had come almost to the brink of losing absolute control over one of the largest and most important state-owned entities in our country. Now I do not like to be an alarmist. However, if something happened to Eskom, and it came so close to that actually being the situation, our country literally would have been plunged into darkness.

Here we sit today Eskom announcing another section of Schedule 1 and Schedule 2 load shedding. We knew at the time the board was completely honest with us. They did not try and paint a pretty picture and they did not try rose tinted glasses, they said to us we simply do not have the money it is gone. We simply do not have the coal we do not know where it is all gone and we simply do not know how many of the contracts that have been concluded are legitimate and how many people that work for us are working for the greater course of this country and not still involved

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 146

with the Gupta linked and Minister at that point linked individuals.

The fact of the matter is this; there is a chronic coal shortage in our country that exists because coal was used as a catalyst for state capture. That we cannot deny. However, equally as South Africans, we have to stand firm and say that we cannot be held ransom by any one or any company when it comes to looking after the economy of South Africa. The facts of the matter are this simple: What we realised during our oversight visit is if Eskom fails, the economy literally goes into a free fall. It goes into a free fall. Minister, when I was at Eskom, what struck me was this: It cannot and it can never be business as usual, business as usual at Eskom was corrupt and in fact the plan to steal Eskom was so genius yet so diabolical in its nature that we are suffering today and we will suffer for many years to come.

This is my concern, when a chairperson honestly stands up in front of a committee and tells you that Eskom is in a deep, deep

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 147

amount of trouble until at least the year 2023 and we do not know where the funds are coming and how those funds would be paid back and how loans would be honoured, we are in a very, very precarious situation. The only light if you would pardon the pun that was at the end of the tunnel was finally we had a board who was willing to stand up and say we should not have six to 700 middle managers, we should not have the inflated and bloated staff component not actually doing much in their offices and leaving everything to power stations to chance. They were very open and honest about the dire situation. However Minister, the situation gets direr by the day.

I personally am terrified by what I am hearing and what I am seeing. They came to the committee after we had this oversight. We will do more oversights. However Minister Gordhan, I am asking you please engage with the opposition, please let us sit down after this report and please let us look at possible solutions that we have that we can that we can possibly offer you so, that we can avoid a total blackout at Eskom, because the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 148

monopoly stranglehold that they have now is a stranglehold on the entire economy. I thank you. [Applause.]

Ms N V MENTE: Chairperson we are not surprised and [asoyiki ngokoyikiswa] we are not afraid by being threatened by the attitude and the behaviour of the members of this House and how they receive the information the way they receive it. When we exposed the Gupta scandals, it was the very same receipt at that we endured in this House. It was the same behaviour and attitude you had against the EFF until you disconnected from the web of corruption. However, it is so, unfortunate because we are going to the lists and every one of you do not want to even see the truth, even if it is sitting on your nose. You will never see it.

Today we are here, with the highly praised Minister of the state-owned enterprises, SOEs, who has brought that the nuclear deal in the form of independent power producers, IPPs you think that is better than what the nuclear deal was, that is 10 times worse than the nuclear deal. Before it was fashionable it was

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 149

the EFF who exposed the Gupta corruption and all of you set here and protected Zuma, protected the Guptas until it was not nice to sit in the Zuma camp.

What is needed to be done is the following in the form of the zuptas and the Eskom finances is established here. You are the enablers of the state capture yourselves as members of this Parliament. However, instead we have a Minister of Public Enterprises who is hell bent on collapsing the SOEs that they must be privatised. It is not going to happen. We are already seeing that at Eskom where the independent power producers who are privately owned and are slowly added to the national grid displacing energy producing ones done by Eskom. Where have you seen where a person buys something for double the price, but they are going to sell it for half the price? Where will you ever get production and profit from that?

These IPPs are controlled by a handful of local and international companies, as well as a few connected members of the new dawn.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 150

While we do not have a fundamental problem with the renewable energy being used, it must be renewable energy produced and supplied by the state. Energies of national importance and security we cannot handover the supply of energy to private individuals like your highly praised Minister Gordhan. The push towards the privatisation of Eskom through the IPPs is driven by the logic of economics and it is driven by greed. Now you are blaming the DA for neoliberalism, it is you who are driving that agenda and nobody else.

What sense is there in Eskom buying electricity from IPPs for R2,32 per unit and selling it for 90c. It does not make business sense. The answer is that it does not make sense and it will never make sense. The IPPs must be carefully watched and cannot afford South Africa's energy supply to be privatised. You can sit here today and praise because you want to be put on the lists, let me tell you something the day Eskom gets privatised and the day you lose the SOE called Eskom, you will realise that just like when you realised later with the Guptas, you will realise that your highly praised Minister Gordhan is not what

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 151

you think he is and what he shows himself to be. He is the enabler of corruption, he is corrupt and he is a thief!

[Applause.] [Time expired.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon member. Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF HIGHER EDUCATION AND TRAINING: Chairperson.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Yes.

The MINISTER OF HIGHER EDUCATION AND TRAINING: This member has directly breached Rule 85, very, very directly. She has said and you can check the Hansard, she says that the Minister is a thief and is corrupt. She has not provided any substantive motion and must withdraw and I think given the reputation of members of her party, this should go to the disciplinary of Parliament. Thank you.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 152

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Thank you, Minister. Hon Mente. You must withdraw that remark.

Ms N V MENTE: What remark, Chair?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): You know what you said. You referred to the Minister towards the end of your speech as a thief and being corrupt.

Ms N V MENTE: He is exactly that.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Will you leave the House please.

Ms N V MENTE: Oh with pleasure, I will leave! Enablers of corruption!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon member, will you leave the House. The next speaker is from the IFP.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 153

Mr J A ESTERHUIZEN: House Chair, I am delivering this declaration report on behalf of my colleague, hon Singh. The committee welcome and encourage the board's actions against corruption in the interest of the entity although there was still a need to investigate the executives who were advancing their own self-interests at the expense of Eskom and the taxpayers. We realised that a falling Eskom will cripple one and all as its financial and operational problems are negatively to impact not only big users and consumers, but its own position as well.

The committee is concerned about the company's debt situation and coal contracts are a real threat to their business. In its latest financial statement Eskom revealed the loss of R2,3 billion. The entity has also incurred an additional R57 billion in debt at a higher interest rate, and before the cash it receives from its operations is not nearly enough to cover its debt serving costs. With a mass debt of R399 billion, total electricity supply blackout has once again become a reality. Eskom's coal stock piles at several power stations have

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 154

reached critical lows requiring an urgent short-term procurement of four million tons to bring stock piles to the stations up to the required levels. Sadly, the additional contracts which have been signed now have a greater negative effect in the next financial year.

Another big concern for the committee was Medupi and Kusile. The incompetent management and the overspending of R52 billion is long overdue on completion target. A critical question to ask and investigate in practical terms is how Eskom came to be so woefully mismanaged for so long. The IFP supports the budget.

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: House Chair, the NFP supports the report tabled here today. Let me start off by saying to the Minister that when you want to stop corruption you will get these kinds of things. If you want to stop looting and stealing of state resources clearly people will target you. Really, you must look at it as an achievement when they do that. Actually, they will do everything in their powers to divert the attention. It is very loud and clear of what is going on. But I hope at one stage

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 155

we need to investigate the Limpopo province. Really, there are a lot more going on there, I can tell you now. I am surprised that the audit report of 2012 has not been dealt with and there are serious implications in that audit report. You will find the leader of the EFF wanting and other things, but anyway!

The common knowledge is the fact that Eskom has been experiencing serious governance issues as a result of corruption, influence of political leaders and other things. I think that is quite obvious and there is a new board in place. I think there are still some challenges in terms of the old board because in my understanding there are some of them who are still conflicted. If that is the case, I think it's a matter that we need to deal with immediately.

There are executives that have been implicated. The question arises from the state capture. The amount of money that is being used is rightfully so because we need to get to the bottom of what has happened so to stop it once and for all and to learn from it so that we don't have a repetition of it. The problem

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 156

however is how we are going to be able to recover these moneys. That is the problem that we are sitting with. At the end of the day it is the people on the ground - the poorest of the poor. The state itself has lost a whole lot which is irrecoverable. All is as a result of weaknesses like as I mentioned earlier on.

There are challenges in terms of the procurement process. I think we must also look at the supply chain processes that have been in place. The central procurement policy that has come into effect may help a lot in trying to do that. Consequence management again seems to be a major issue. We should ensure that those employees that have been implicated should never work for the state at any level of government at all - whether is in local government, provincial or national; they should never be employed. And I think this is very important. This seems to be the problem that we have. Sometimes you are implicated in one section but you go and work for another department. I think this is another matter.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 157

Minister, a major problem is the issue of debt. And you know we are borrowing money now. It doesn't make sense that people owe us money and we end up borrowing money. I think it is a matter that you need to deal with but I know it is not directly under your control. I think the municipal debt must be dealt with. The NFP supports the report tabled. Thank you.

Mr S N SWART: House Chair, the ACDP rises to support the report as well. We do want to say, Minister Gordhan, we, South Africans, stand behind you. You are rebuilding the walls and you are exposing state capture at its root. Do not be discouraged by what we see today. Be brave and strong. As you have said to us before that you expect a push back and this is what we are seeing. So we stand behind you.

At the time of the visit much of the evidence was already in the public domain; the reverting views of what have been taking place; the joining of the dots. At that stage thankfully we had a new board that had been appointed. At that stage of the visit there was a decision to view all contracts and procurement

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 158

processes and we welcomed this. What we have seen now as a result of the auditors that have been subcontracted by the Auditor-General is that irregular expenditure is shooting up as procurement contracts have been exposed that they were corrupt in the past and this is expected to increase. Of course, as other speakers have indicated the knock-on impact has been in the coal contracts. This was a tangible part of our visit as well as our inquiry to determine what was happening with the coal contracts and why existing cost plus mines and Exxaro's contracts were cancelled.

In the one case we had a mine that had closed now. Traditionally, power stations are both on mines and in that situation due to the state capture that mine was closed and 1 500 workers lost jobs. That is disgraceful. This is the type of information that is coming to the fore. The result is that today as we are sitting, we are sitting with a coal shortage and load shedding. Of course emergency coal supplies have to be purchased at a much increased cost. That is why yesterday the Eskom board chairman indicated that Eskom's first half year

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 159

profit has plunged by 89% and this is expected to increase to a full year loss of R15 billion. This is the extent to which this once proud public utility has come from where at one stage it had R40 billion in reserves. Its credit rating was better than the solvent credit rating. This is the situation we are sitting with. But thankfully this is turning; the tide is turning as I indicated earlier and we welcome the steps that are indicated in this report. In that stage far more progress has taken place - disciplinary actions and audits. Lastly, again we look forward to the recovery of the losses and the institution of criminal actions. I thank you.

Mr R M TSELI: Chairperson...

Tshivenḡa:

... sa ANC, ri khou tikedza muvhigo wa Komiti ya zwa Mabindu a Muvhuso na musu komiti nga ḡuvha ḡe ya ḡangana na bodo yo vha i si na ḡwedzi.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 160

Ro ~~t~~u~~t~~wedzea u vhona lutamo na mafulufulu a u shandukisa nyimele ya Eskom nga maan~~d~~a zwi tshi ~~d~~a kha masheleni. Musi ro fara nyambedzano navho, ro kona u vhona uri sa Afrika Tshipembe na vhathu vho~~t~~he vhane vha funa shango ~~l~~avho, arali ra thusana, ri nga lwa vhua~~d~~a na u thusa vhathu vho~~t~~he vhane vha vha na tshipimbi na tse~~d~~a vhane vha khou ~~t~~oda u fhedza masheleni a muvhuso zwine zwa kundisa vhathu vhashu u wana tshumelo.

Nga kha Muphuresidennde washu Vho Ramaphosa, ri na fulufhelo ~~l~~o ~~d~~alaho ri~~n~~e vha ANC uri ri ~~d~~o fhedza vhua~~d~~a na vhuvemu ho~~t~~he kha Eskom na ma~~n~~we mabindu o~~t~~he a muvhuso. Sa ANC, ri takalela u vhona uri u bva tshe ra ~~t~~angana na vha bodo nga ~~d~~uvha ~~l~~o bulwaho ~~l~~a Luhuhi, ho no vha na tshanduko khulu ngei Eskom.

Ro kona u vhona kon~~t~~iraka dzi kanganyisaho na dzi so ngo ~~d~~aho zwavhu~~d~~i dzi tshi fheliswa. Ri ri kha Minisita, ri~~n~~e vha ANC ri navho. Ra tikana, zwithu zwi ~~d~~o tshimbila zwavhu~~d~~i vhathu vha wana tshumelo. Sa ANC, ri khou tikedza muvhigo uyu wa komiti. Ndo livhuwa. [U vhanda zwan~~d~~a]

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 161

English:

Ms N V Mente having disregarded the authority of the Chair was ordered by House Chairperson Mr C T Frolick to withdraw from the Chamber for the remainder of the day's sitting.

The member thereupon withdrew from the Chamber.

Motion agreed to.

Report accordingly adopted.

**CONSIDERATION OF REPORT OF PORTFOLIO COMMITTEE ON BASIC
EDUCATION ON - OVERSIGHT VISIT TO BOHLABELA AND NKANGALA
EDUCATION DISTRICTS, MPUMALANGA PROVINCE**

Mr D H KHOSA: House Chair, thank you very much for the opportunity, greetings to all Ministers, Deputy Ministers available, Members of Parliament, I greet you all. Riperile!

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 162

Chairperson, I present to you the report of the Portfolio Committee on Basic Education on Oversight Visit to Bohlabela and Nkangala Education Districts, Mpumalanga Province. Before I do that Chairperson, let me start by saying this, when addressing students in the early sixties in Cuba Comrade Ernesto Che Guevara has this to say: "The first duty of a revolutionary is to be educated."

Chairperson, the purpose of the oversight visit was to assess the state of school readiness for 2018 as well as to ascertain the basic functionality of schools.

In this regard, the oversight focused on the following areas: The state of the admission; the provision of Learner Teacher Support Material, LTSM; staff establishments; school improvement plans; the availability of School Nutrition Programme, SNP and learner transport; the functionality of the School Governing Bodies, SGB and School Management Teams, SMT; the school infrastructure and the rollout of the ICT and many more.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 163

Chairperson, the above areas form part of key deliverables finding expression in the Medium Term Strategic Framework, MTSF 2014-19, as well as the NDP 2030. Chairperson, the Mpumalanga province was one of those provinces that had experienced a decline in the 2017 matric results, hence the visit.

Chairperson, the key findings on the oversight are as follows, I will start with the strength as they overweight the weaknesses: The committee was impressed that most schools were functioning very well and producing good results. These include some rural schools such as Magigwana Secondary School, which achieved 100% in subjects such as Maths, Science and Business Studies; as well as Moses Mnisi High School, which achieved 98% - 100% over the past three years in Bohlabela District.

Chairperson, in Nkangala district, we have found that the Leonard Ntshuntshe Secondary School achieved 97% over the past three years. The Wolvenkop Special School was also contributing meaningfully to the welfare of the learners with special needs.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 164

The committee observed that these schools had three things in common, which are one, committed and competent principals; well motivated and hard working teachers, and; supportive SGB and the parent of the learners. In most of these schools visited Chairperson, the NSNP was functioning very well. Several schools visited had also developed their school improvement plans.

Chairperson, we have also identified some challenges in our visit. Challenges are such as the provincial education department was experiencing budgetary constraints, and; also ineffective textbook retrieval was also a challenge in that province.

The other challenges included the inadequate support of schools, which were converted into Mathematics, Science and Technology, MST in the province. The other issue Chairperson is the poor ICT connectivity.

Chairperson, the key recommendations made in this report is directly linked to the above challenges. They include that the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 165

department should: Support and assist affected schools that have been converted to offer Mathematics, Science and Technology, MST as compulsory subjects; consider an increase the budget allocation to the province; assist and support SMTs and principals with the effective implementation of school policies.

In conjunction with the local municipalities, ensure that all schools receive water and sufficient sanitation; provide security to all schools; progressively provide all other infrastructural needs such as computer laboratories and libraries.

Chairperson, as the ANC, we are saying that education should be a privilege so that those who have money can study but the right to all learners. Thank you very much, Chairperson.

IsiXhosa:

Mnu F BHENGU: (ENDAWENI YOMBHEXESHI OYINTLOKO WOMBUTHO

OLAWULAYO): Ndiphakamisa ukuba le ngxelo kunye nezi ziphakamiso mazamkelwe yile Ndlu yoWiso-Mthetho. Ndiyabulela.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 166

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): The motion is for the report to be adopted. Are there any objections?

Mr M WATERS: Yes.

Question put.

Motion agreed to (DA dissenting).

Report accordingly adopted.

Declarations of vote:

Ms N I TARABELLA-MARCHESI: We went for the oversight at Mpumalanga as the previous member mentioned, and we had a couple of issues that we identified. Despite the fact that there were learners that were doing very well under the challenging conditions, what I would like to basically talk about is the department itself; because on the last day, we were supposed to give a report of the oversight that we had and specifically allow...[Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 167

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon member, will you just stop there. There is a gathering there at the back. Will you take your seat, please? Continue.

Ms N I TARABELLA-MARCHESEI: So that meeting that was scheduled the department didn't show up. It was very difficult for us as a committee to convey our concerns and also to discuss our findings, and also to find out if we can find a solution and commonplace between ourselves and the department. So that was unfortunate.

What is also disturbing is the fact that the report itself does not highlight this issue. So that is quite concerning for us as the DA as for me as a member of the committee.

We also identified the three schools amongst that we visited that there was a school for instance, by the name of Mkhuhlu Teacher Development Centre that had challenges when it comes to infrastructure. The roofs were falling apart; there was a lack of personnel in that training centre; it was not well resourced;

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 168

there were problems of the ICT, and; also the fact that there was no proper furniture.

Most importantly, the building was dilapidated and it hasn't been maintained even when the roofs were falling off. Public Works didn't do anything to come and ensure that the building is safe.

The other school that we also visited was Marhagi Secondary School where there was a ratio of 1:50 learners, as well as in a class of science we found that there were about 62 learners in one class.

There was also another issue where the hall was supposed to be. So the issue was that there was a tender being given to a contractor because the contractor did show up and what he did he just stuck the foundation and he never came back. So those were the issues that were a concern to us.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 169

Also, in M L Nkuna High School whereby the matric results declined from 80,3% in 2015 to 66,5% in 2016; and in 2017 to 57,1%. The reason why it had declined is that there was a lot of infighting at the school.

What was more concerning was the fact that the Principal was a member of Sadtu, and not only a member of Sadtu, but a secretary of Sadtu itself. So what would happen was that he wouldn't show up at school and most of the time he will be absent at school, and therefore that ended up with the results that declined over the three years that he was a principal.

He did say that eventually he will resign but those were the issues that were concerning. So I think as a committee, we have to be very clear on a true reflection of what happened during oversight because I believe that this report is kind of lacking on these issues, specifically the issue of - you know, the tender that went out for a hall to be built but we don't really know, was the money paid out?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 170

So we need to make a follow-up. I would suggest that the report - because really it is not a reflection of our visit - that it is returned back to the committee and then we can be able to look at it and rectify, and; also include - it is a suggestion - include what hasn't been included.

I just want to go back to the last part which is the conclusion of where she was speaking about the appreciation of the report. The chairperson of the committee said, I would like to thank the provincial Department of Education and the National Department of Basic Education that was at the meeting.

We didn't have the department there on the last day. So how can it be that we appreciate people that were not even there? So that is why we need to really have a true reflection of this report. It must come back to the committee and also have everyone contributing. Thank you. [Time expired.] [Applause.]

Declarations of vote:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 171

Mr X NGWEZI: House Chairperson, this morning as we entered the parliamentary precinct, we were greeted by the Western Cape learners who had spent the night and slept outside Parliament. The gathering was organized by an NGO called Equal Education. The complains were about continuing poor conditions in their schools. Please, listen properly! Please listen! Conditions in our schools without shouting at me are not pleasing at all. The portfolio committee is aware of it without you shouting here. We don't shout when you present your Report. You have presented your Report here.

Chairperson, is this the only way in which our learners can be heard by resorting to such measures? The answer is no. Our schools in Mpumalanga province face the same problems as the schools in Western Cape province, Eastern Cape province, KwaZulu-Natal and other provinces. In Mpumalanga particularly there has been infighting over management posts and this affects teaching and learning and the department needs to intervene and try to resolve those infightings because they have a negative effect in the results in our schools.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 172

Perhaps, I should say that you that there majority of our schools in South Africa face these kinds of problems and it needs all of us to intervene and solve them. Or even more simple that, the ANC-led government is failing our learners and parents.

Why do our schools still do not have the necessary information and communication technology, ICT, infrastructure in place? This means that our learners will not be prepared and equipped to deal with the challenges in the workplace as regards to the looming fourth industrial revolution. Especially so in the rural areas. This department is failing to reduce the inequalities in the education sector.

Violence and crime are becoming the order of the day in our schools. And the government seems to have no answers. Most schools in Mpumalanga indicated the issue of gangsterism, so it is not only in the Western Cape or KwaZulu-Natal, it is common problem.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 173

So the department needs to get closer and all of us to also assist in trying to solve these problems. I want to say to the parents, NGOs, SGBs, teachers and learners, we the IFP have observed your sufferings and we have heard your voices. As the ANC-led government has become deaf to your cries and please, the IFP has heard your voices. We support the reports. Stop howling and attend to these issues.

It is because your kids are not studying in the rural areas that is why you are howling at me. If there were studying in the rural areas you would about these problems. [Interjections.] I can't come to where you are seated ... [Time Expired.]

Prof N M KHUBISA: Chairperson, I think President Mandela was right when he said "Education is the most important weapon you can use to change the world". It is important that in order the shape and character of our nation our children must get the best education.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 174

Chairperson, the NFP welcomes and supports this Report. However, there is a lot that is still going on in our education. I have seen I the recommendation that talks about the support that must be given to schools with regard to Maths and Science. But it is also exciting that most of the schools were not performing well in Mpumalanga province. But we have a school which was formally a mud school that has been developed and it is now performing well and it is getting about 98%. I think that must be appreciated. That is the Moses Mnisi high school.

It is always exciting when you visit a school where you did your Grade 12 or school where you were a principal. For instance, I was visited a school where I was a principal and I saw that the principals who came after me developed that school and they took it to a higher level and that is always exciting. The pass rate has always been 98 or 100% which is good and the buildings have improved. There are schools which are performing badly. And then that says to the department attend to the whole issue of infrastructure, attend to the whole issue of school governance management because if we have got good principals, senior

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 175

management teams, SMTs, we have got good teachers, there is a culture of teaching and learning, buildings to talk to the austetic factor of the school and all these things put together. All stakeholders assisting the school then the government comes in with the infrastructure then we will have good performing schools.

The culture of teaching and learning is very important. Our schools are beset by gangsterism these days and it is the case again with Mpumalanga. Most of the schools are affected by gangsterism emanating from the factions that come from the community. Hence the community must play an integral part within our education system. We need the best of the bests. I am just citing the Moses Mnisi high school which was a former mud school but now it is a state of the art shool with 1155 learners, 38 educators. 98% of learners they camp in the school, they sleep on the floor and they produce the best results. So that says to us if there is a will, hard work we will perform well. However, our education system has got to do something with the ICT. when we visited as England as Chief Whips we saw that ICT is very

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 176

good. And some of the modern schools do attend these conferences. Chairperson we support this Report but a lot has to be done with regard to our education. But there is good is happening with ... [Time Expired.]

Ms J V BASSON: Chairperson, Hon Marchesi, it is true that we visited schools where learners are performing well under bad circumstances. I remember, the school you are speaking about is Gigwana and it is a Maths and Science school. And those children sleep under those circumstances. For the past three years the school produced 100% to show that teachers, the SGB, the parents are committed. And thus we had recommendations that school should be supported and today I can tell you, that school is a priority to receive the new school.

And even that ratio that you are talked about, if you remember we recommended that the schools that have funded vacancies should be filled in. thank you for your reminder. You said the Chairperson is speaking about the department of education that was not there. Don't you remember? Because they didn't come so

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 177

we summoned them to this office and they accounted here. To tell you the truth now, every recommendation that was recommended to them is receiving attention.

Mr Ngwezi, I am very disappointed in you. You are speaking about children at the gate. Who brought those children here? During school hours! And now, what have you done? Who ensured that those children are absent at school today? Who should be blamed? I thought that because you participated in the oversight I thought about you will speak about Bohlabele, Nkangala Schools not Western Cape and Kwazulu-Natal. You are out of order.

Hon Chairperson, it is pleasing to see that the AnC is working ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T FROLICK): Hon member, will you just take your seat. Why are you rising hon member?

Mr X NGWEZI: may I rise on a point of privilege?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 178

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T FROLICK): Hon House Chairperson, when I came in the morning I happened to pass by because our bus had ... and I engaged the learners as to what were they doing. They said they have a problems of infrastructure in their schools. And you must deal with that. I was not part and parcel of their [Inaudible.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T FROLICK): Take your seat, hon member.

Mr P J MNGUNI: House Chair, I rise on Rule 92. I just request hon Chair to really prevail to the House Rule 66 on a member not to be interrupted precedes everything else. That so called privilege had nothing to do and that may we in the House allow the House at least allow the debate to flow in terms of Rule 66. Thank you.

Ms J V BASSON: house Chair Mpumalanga is one of those provinces that proves that the ANC is the ANC at work. The ANC lead and the ANC is there for the people on the ground. It is functioning

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 179

on the ground, it is listening on the ground and it listens on the complains of the people. Thus we remind the people at home that come 26 and 27 January they must go and register and they must vote ANC. They must register to ...

Afrikaans:

Ons sê reeds dat hulle moet gaan registreer, sodat hulle ANC kan stem.

English:

We are telling you. And for those learner teacher support material, LTSM that you talk about - the learners must be encouraged. You know education is a societal problem. So we must encourage parents to register the children on time so that the schools should do their budget correctly.

Remember, our oversight was a "back to school campaign" in short. So if the parents are still registering children in January, how can the LTSM be 100% at school? Shortages will be there. We, as the leaders of society must encourage the parents

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 180

to adhere to the rules of the government that children should be registered on time so that they can be accommodated in all the aspects of welfare at school. I propose that this report should be adopted. Thank you.

**CONSIDERATION OF REPORT OF PORTFOLIO COMMITTEE ON TRADE AND
INDUSTRY ON - OVERSIGHT VISIT TO SUGAR CANE FARMERS AND SUGAR
INDUSTRY ASSOCIATIONS IN KWAZULU-NATAL**

Ms J L FUBBS: Chairperson, hon members, colleagues and compatriots, fellow South Africans, good afternoon, this is the Report of the Portfolio Committee on Trade and Industry which recently although not that recently, arguably in January this year undertook an Oversight Visit to the Sugar Cane Farmers and Sugar Industry Associations in KwaZulu-Natal from 25 to 26 January 2018.

We may never have gone on this oversight. In fact, we were destined to go elsewhere when - by chance, after been at the Catholic Cathedral one lunch time I came across some members - I

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 181

suppose very much like the school children but of course, these are adults not attending school and they said "we are now tired of not having the issues addressed". I said, and you are? "We are the South African Farmers Development Association" in the sugar cane industry and we are trying to see the Department of Trade and Industry, DTI, and the Chairperson. I said well, I am the Chairperson. I am glad we have met. And we immediately made arrangements for them to come and share with the committee the challenges they faced.

I am not the first one to say this, that it is sometimes in a busy schedule to overlook certain things. I want to say from the podium that I would not want to apologize to all South Africans but especially the Sugar cane black farmers that I never ever realise there was such a law on our books currently. The 1978 law regarding the sugar industry which has the shortest amendment, I think in 1992 which simple says, "Black sugar cane farmers are no longer illegal". That was the extent of the transformation.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 182

So, I want to apologize publicly from this podium. I now know in our Legacy Report we will indicate to a future Chairperson to please undertake an audit of all legislations pertaining to industries and agreements, right. That was in October 2017. Well, that is not so long ago. And in that time, we undertook an extensive oversight visit and some of the things we came across were shocking, like yes, I do have water then I saw a little pump which you work with your foot for an entire plantation. No, no, no, that is not what we need. Absolutely not. So there were recommendations and the committee which is a multiparty committee said, we must address the lack of transformation within the industry within a year. Then, we must also ensure that all farmers - all stakeholders are in one association and in line with the late President Rolihlahla Mandela who said "Yes, we negotiate not only with friends and talk to them but also we negotiate with people who do not agree with us including our enemies."

So, we engaged with all the stakeholders and said look, we are all South Africans and that is the start. And the time has come

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 183

for us to be more inclusive. That's exactly what we did and we actually resolved and asked the department to be apply all measures to ensure that they address this and exercise their powers in this regard. They were actually funding the sugar cane industry giving them a little something which was only shared among white farmers. That was then changed. The tariffs were then raised and I say publicly to the sugar cane industry, we want to help you but you must transform. We will have the tariffs addressed through the Department of Economic Development and International Trade Administration Commission of South Africa, ITAC. I want to you to know hon Chairperson, the ANC fully supports this Report. I thank you.

There was no debate.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: Chairperson, I move that the Report be adopted. Thank you.

Declaration of vote:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 184

Mr D W MACPHERSON: House Chair, it's always difficult to come after the hon Fubbs but I will do my best. I am not going to show you my water pump extracting skills. Before us is the Report on the Oversight Visit to the Sugar Cane Farmers in Kwazulu-Natal, KZN, but there is an important back story that must be told to this.

The ANC and the EFF would tell you how they are on the side of black sugar cane farmers but, this couldn't be further from the truth. When sugarcane farmers - black and white were at their most vulnerable neither party could be found. When cheap subsidized sugar was pouring into South Africa at below the cost of production for local farmers they were nowhere to be seen. In fact, for seven weeks in 2017, sugar was dumped into our country without a cent of duty being paid due to a "technical glitch" by Sars, which decimated local production.

Today, not a single person has still being held responsible for this technical glitch. When myself, hon Steyn and hon Cachalia marched with sugar cane farmers black and white to the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 185

Department of Trade and Industry, DTI, in Pretoria demanding that the duty bound rate for sugar be raised to 856 dollars a ton. The ANC and EFF were nowhere to be seen. I guess if it would have included e-tolls and VAT, then maybe the ANC would have made an appearance.

But in the end, farmers only got 680 dollars a ton while International Trade Administration Commission of South Africa, ITAC dragged its feet in complete contradiction to the way it dealt with steel tariff applications by ArcelorMittal record time. Again, the ANC and EFF were nowhere to be seen. When two billion rands was provided to the land bank to assist in drought relief and which never got to farmers in KZN. Again, they were nowhere to be seen.

The truth is, what sugar cane farmers especially black sugar cane and small scale farmers need is a certain future. They need to be able to scale up their farms to become commercially viable and participate in an inclusive economy. This was best summed up by the ANC when I said to black farmers in Parliament, that they

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 186

would not help them until there is transformation. And yet, they have done nothing to the Department of Labour or the Department of Rural Development and Land Reform to help sugar cane black farmers.

But when you do not own the land you farm on it is neatly impossible to see real transformation in this industry. And this is what we should be paying particular attention to. We know that the ANC does not take transformation in sugar farming seriously when they budget more for VIP protection than they do for land reform. When the ANC and EFF say they want to take your land away, the DA says we want you to be the owners of your land and to secure your future. When the ANC won't give you Title Deeds for the land you have rented from government for 30years to farm on, the DA says you will not have to pay the government another rent and you will be the owner of your land.

Hon members, transformation is not simple about representation in an association body and while that is important and critically important, ownership of the land you toil every day

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 187

is the real key to economic freedom and transformation for the tens of thousands of black farmers that have been shun by the ANC-led government and who today, live under the threat that with the ANC and EFF coalition, they will become land slaves to the state for the rest of their lives, forever shackle to the state that simple does not care for them. I thank you.

Declarations of vote (cont.):

Mr J A ESTERHUIZEN: House Chairperson, South African sugar cane industry has already lost approximately 20% of its sales in this country and this is only last year, mainly due to cheaper imports.

The Southern African Development Community, SADC, declined from 20 % to 1%. This affects everyone in the industry but unfortunately even more so, the small farmers. What is of additional concern is that the current challenges are only going to be elevated by the implementation of the sugar tax that will have an adverse impact on the entire industry.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 188

It is estimated that 13 200 hectares was lost in production and up to 20 000 direct job loses which will force a number of sycamore to shut down its operations. This will negatively impact on about 90 000 people's livelihood. The question is, how we are protecting this industry, especially the smaller scale growers when we take away with a left hand what we are giving with the right hand?

The committee is of the view that there's a need for a joint meeting with the Portfolio Committee on Economic Development, the Department of Trade and Industry, DTI, and the International Trade Administration Commission of SA to discuss the importance and the implications of the increases in tariffs. Additionally, we need to engage with the sugar industry to develop and implement mechanism which directly addresses the challenges in the sugar cane industry which include improving access to mills and access to information particularly for the black sugar cane growers.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 189

With the mar light of the challenges facing this industry, the IFP strongly recommends that the DTI, the South African Sugar Cane Research Institute, the South African Sugar Cane Association, investigate the feasibility of developing downstream industries for alternative markets such as aphynal and fruit industries. The IFP supports the report.

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: House Chairperson, allow me to start off by paying tribute to my forefathers and the indent-ship laborers who came by ship from India to work on the sugar cane plantations and worked under horrendous conditions. Receiving water and toilet facilities were just a pipe-dream - they didn't have all those things. So I must admit that the conditions they worked under were shocking but let me also pay tribute to the selfless individuals and the role they played in the industry and the economic development of South Africa and we must not shy away from that.

The industry is today experiencing gauge challenges as a result of various contributing factors: the high input cost, chemicals,

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 190

and seedlings, control of logistics, access to funding and of course, the very important factor, the importation of cheap sugar. I heard somebody talking about sugar tax, you know what we are forgetting is that the only reason the sugar tax was initiated was as a result of the cost to the country in terms of men lost through sugar and the effect of diabetes which is fast becoming the greatest killer, not only in South Africa but globally and we have no choice, because whilst the industries concentrate on making money and profit - it was all being done at the expense of the people.

When the Minister of Health initiated this and we passed it, it was in order to try and reduce sugar consumption. The emphasis was not really about money but to try and reduce sugar consumption. It has been said that just in one can of Coca-Cola, there are 7-9 tea spoons of sugar, so what is that? What does it tell you, and you know the situation, in fact colleagues in the Western Cape you have got the highest levels of diabetes here, seriously, no, no no, the Western Cape it is, so let's not talk too much.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 191

What is very clear is that this industry has been for a long time controlled particularly when we talk about the issue of seedlings and I think the question we must is, who is controlling that industry? because whilst we our people working in the farm, the seedlings and other things are under the control of big businesses who seem to be making the profit, so I think its something that we really need to look at.

But let me not waste time of this House, we still have a long programme to cover. The NFP welcomes the recommendations as set out. Let me also commend you as the Chairperson of the Committee for the role you played after somebody spoke to you and you dealt with the matter timeously, and promptly, and that is service delivery to the people

Ms P T MANTASHE: House Chairperson, from the Trade and Industry Portfolio Committee side, we have made strides in addressing the plight of the black sugar farmers in KwaZulu-Natal and Mpumalanga. When SA Local Government Association, SALGA, asked those farmers who were oppressed by their white counterparts,

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 192

who are enjoying even the incentives from the Department of Trade and Industry, the Department of Rural Development supported them throughout and it is not true that the ANC was not there to assist them.

We are observing the hypocrisy that is displayed by the DA on this podium that they are represent transformation, they are not. When they gave black farmers barren land and the ANC is trying correct such a situation. They are now rushing to sell the productive land for human settlement because they want money out of that land which they did not pay for when they took it.

Chairperson based on the deliberations of the Portfolio, we applaud the efforts of the South African black farmers based in KwaZulu-Natal and Mpumalanga. We have given them support. As we are sitting here Chairperson are appealing from the Department of Agriculture to assist those farmers, to enable them to have enough water so that they can be productive. We also appreciate one of the white farmers there who is so progressive, and gave

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 193

those black farmers 75% of his business so that they can produce their own fertilizers.

Chairperson, the ANC will go a long way with those black farmers until they reach their emancipation and the DA will not be there because they are hypocrites who do not care about black farmers. We want your white people to share that land with black farmers so that they can be as productive as you are. And we will ensure that that happens.

In conclusion, Chairperson, the committee welcomes SALGA's efforts to represent the needs of the small scale farmers, both in KwaZulu/Natal and Mpumalanga areas. The committee emphasized the need for small scale farmers to find ways to contribute to other activities in the sugar value chain.

The committee welcomes the work of the SASRI, the Research Institute however challenges were highlighted with respect to new varieties and to information for small scale growers.

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 194

The committee remains concerned about the state of transformation in the sugar industry where black farmers have not been able to sufficiently penetrate into the industry and grow into larger commercial farmers. But we are assuring South Africans that we will go with them step by step and that they reap the fruits of the sugar industry. Thank you, Chairperson.

Motion agreed to.

Report accordingly adopted.

**CONSIDERATION OF REPORT OF PORTFOLIO COMMITTEE ON HEALTH ON
OVERSIGHT VISIT TO KWAZULU-NATAL PROVINCE FROM 14 TO 17 AUGUST
2018**

Mr A F MAHLALELA: Hon House Chair, the Portfolio Committee on Health conducted an oversight visit to KwaZulu-Natal in Umgungundlovu District Municipality, which is a National Health Insurance, NHI, pilot site, as well as the eThekweni Metro. The facilities that we visited amongst others were in Umsunduzi

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 195

Local Municipality, Imbalenhle Clinic, CLC Mpumuza Clinic, Edendale Hospital, Fort Napier Psychiatric Hospital and Grey's Tertiary Hospital.

At uMshwathi Local Municipality, we were able to visit two clinics, which are Claremont and Gcumisa. We also visited one Rock District Hospital which is Appelsbosch. In uMngeni Local Municipality, we were able to visit one clinic, Mpophomeni, and also uMngeni Psychiatric Hospital. In eThekweni, we conducted a surprise visit in one health facility, Umlazi V Clinic.

We also visited other clinics that we planned to visit like Addington Hospital. During our visit, we were also able to interact with the public, and in most instances, there were some key concerns raised by the public about the challenges around shortages of staff, which results in patients having to wait for long hours before getting attended to.

The other challenge is around the responses of the Emergency Medical Service, EMS, and the use of patient manual record

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 196

system in some areas, which results towards the challenges of files getting lost or misplaced at some point. However, regardless of the challenges we came across, it must be noted that we were able to observe some successful stories.

The stories include the following: Implementation of the electronic health patient record system in most of the health facilities. There is also a vast improvement across maternal infant and child health due to outreach teams that are in various health facilities. Most patients have been successfully enrolled with Central Chronic Medicine Dispensation and Distribution, CCMDD, which reduces overcrowding in health facilities.

We were also impressed by the work done by the province together with the national department, in relation to the recommendation by the Human Rights Commission regarding the oncology services at Addington Hospital. Hon members will recall that we presented a report at some point from the Human Rights Commission around the challenges of oncology services in Addington Hospital.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 197

We are pleased to report that during our oversight visit to the Addington Hospital, we found out that the province has done the following: It has procured a new machine of oncology services; there has been a doctor that was employed; the city scanner was operational; the machine that was damaged has been repaired and the system was functioning well at the hospital.

However, a reflection at the report itself by the committee is that, most health facilities are operating under huge constraints due to shortages of staff. Therefore, as the committee, we request the department to urgently look at the organisational structure which is currently operating because it is outdated and it is not in line with the requirements.

The department should also deal with the infrastructure because some of them are dilapidated. There must be a system of making sure that they are maintained and lastly, we are suggesting that there must be in sourcing of essential support services such as security, laundry services, kitchen cleaning so that there is an improvement of efficiency and accountability.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 198

Once all that has been suggested by the committee is done, there will be an improvement of services. When we met with the MEC, he made a commitment that he is going to address these matters. Thank you very much. [Applause.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr R T Frolick): Thank you, hon member. I now recognise the hon Chief Whip of the Majority Party.

There was no debate.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: House Chairperson, I move that the report be adopted.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr R T Frolick): The motion is that the report be adopted. Are there any objections?

Hon MEMBERS: No.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr R T Frolick): There are no objections. However, there's a request for declaration.

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 199

Declarations of vote:

Ms E R WILSON: Chair, from the outset of the oversight it was obvious that health in KwaZulu-Natal was in serious trouble. On our very first visit to a clinic that is supposed to have gold ideal status, we found a clinic that was far too small to cater for the four wards it serviced. People there told us that they had been in the queue with tiny babies and children, for four hours.

Pharmacy shelves were empty and the BP machine, suction and defibrillator had not been checked or calibrated since 2015. This was the start of two days of visits with the same horrifying results. In the surgical outpatient departments where two doctors were trying to treat 120 patients per day, was so overcrowded that people were sleeping on stretchers in passages because there were not enough beds.

Every facility had shortages of staff. Labour wards were doing 650 deliveries a month and there were only 14 beds in the ward. There was no one to administer epidurals and no equipment for

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 200

vacuum deliveries. Nurses' residences were an insult to committed staff who were already under pressure due to shortages, some even without water.

There are only two forensic psychiatrists in the entire province and psych patients are waiting on a seven month waiting list for assessment. Compiling records for courts is a nightmare. In one hospital there was one radiation machine for 50 patients per day; one CT scanner for diagnosis and the simulator machine had not been working for eight months. Some units visited were National Health Insurance, NHI, pilot sites. Oh, what a joke!

If the billions spent on NHI were supposed to make significant improvements to these sites, this department has a lot to answer for; for the unbelievable wastage of expenditure. The pages of recommendations on this report to the Minister are not worth the paper they are written on. It is the same old, same old recommendations that have never been attended to. But we must ask ourselves, why?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 201

Well it is quite obvious. You see, Dr Motsoaledi and the ANC government he represents, and who has now resorted to devious manners to push through a severely flawed NHI policy, wants to nationalise health. In fact, they are pushing it to become another money-spending with no return state-owned enterprise, SOE.

The grand plans to improve health on all levels have come to naught, and they won't. Poor and vulnerable South Africans suffer daily, while we hear day after day the excuses of health's failures that it will take 14 years to institute NHI and billions are dropped into a bottomless pit.

South Africa, hear me, if you want a proper health care for all within 5 to 8 years, that is fairer and affordable; if you want to see improved standards and health care at your clinics and hospitals, and enhanced maternal and child care; if you want to be able to make the choice of where you go for care and cure, regardless of your income and proper ambulance care to assist

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 202

you in emergencies, then you must vote for change and a one South Africa for all.

Only the DA has put adequate plans in place for an all inclusive medical health plan, within the confines of the current budget and medical aid taxes. We will provide an extra billion per year for the appropriate training of health professionals; we will provide an extra R2 billion per year for expanded maternal and child care programmes for hospitals and clinics.

We will reform medical aids so they can compete on price and quality of health care they provide, instead of the risk groups they target, and make the Council for Medical Schemes independent of the department. We will insist that hospitals are run and managed by clinically trained personnel and autonomous boards that will hold them to account.

These are just a few of the promises that the DA is prepared to deliver on, and that we have delivered in the Western Cape. We do take the health of every South African seriously, and will

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 203

ensure that a healthy and vigorous health sector can provide the care that every South African is due in terms of our great Constitution. I thank you.

Declarations of votes contd:

Ms S J NKOMO: Chairperson, the state of health care services in the province of KwaZulu-Natal is still problematic, with reports of a lot of systems failure. We do have a few success stories. If I could just quickly relate to one of the success stories, where Dr L P H M Mtshali, the former Premier of KwaZulu-Natal, who passed away, actually instituted a situation where babies that they were born to mothers who are HIV positive were protected from the virus.

This happened during the time when the IFP was in charge of the province. The stand of health or the situation of health in the vast majority of public hospitals in the province is in an abysmal state of despair. With not only the infrastructure, which is problematic, we also have equipments that are problematic and there is no medication in a number of places.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 204

There are also sewerage system problems and a lot of other problems. Urgent attention is especially required in Mphumutsa, as well as Empophomeni and especially in Umngeni Psychiatric Hospital.

There is a situation where we have a shortage of medical doctors in KwaZulu-Natal especially, yet we have a lot of professional doctors who are South Africans, who have been trained in foreign countries, but they are not given certificates, let alone taken through any of the tests so that they are put into practice in our hospitals. The HPCSA is inundated with emails from such excluded doctors. It is about time that we actually look into their situation and they are brought on board.

We also find ourselves plagued by the so-called quadruple burden of disease, where we have infections and noncommunicable diseases: We have high rates of maternal and child mortality, as well as trauma. It is important for us to look at the term 'prevention' for what it is. When we talk in terms of prevention, we are avoiding a lot of treatment which has got to

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 205

be given when a disease becomes chronic. The IFP supports the areas which have been addressed in this report and we would like things to be taken care of. [Time expired.] Thank you.

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Hon House Chair, I have not been part of this oversight team that visited the KwaZulu-Natal province as a result of being occupied in other committees. However, having gone through the report, I note the recommendations and the findings as outlined in the report. Yes, indeed, there appears to be some challenges, particularly the shortage of staff at Grey Hospital and the limited budget allocation. However, when we talk about limited budget allocation, I think what is very important for us to understand is that very often even budget allocated is not spent correctly. That is why you seem to be having a problem.

Once again, let me highlight the challenges of the community of Gumathane Nguza of Mzumbe in KwaZulu-Natal, who do not have a clinic or a hospital. They travel long distances, wait in long hours or an ambulance, despite the province identifying this

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 206

need years ago, budgeted for it, the matter remains unresolved, with the provincial department saying there is no money, with no alternative plans. So, that is really a problem.

One of the areas that were visited is Gumiza Clinic. They don't even have a pharmacy. Clearly, how do you dish up medication if you don't even have a pharmacy there? I also want to come back to my hon colleague from the DA. You said a whole lot about what you would do better. Why don't you do me a favour and start today? This is because you control health in the Western Cape.

I want you to go and visit the ... [Interjections.] No, let me explain: I am not talking about better; I am talking about the fact that you make it look like you are perfect and that is the difference. Now, let me tell you: Go and visit the Tafelsig of clinic in there and see how many days people have to go there for their medication. They can't even find their files.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 207

Let me tell you something else: Go to the clinic in Atlantis right now and see what is happening. People can't even gain access to the clinic. This is how bad it is. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Can you use the microphone, hon member?

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: There is some good work and I am not going to deny that, but equally, there are a lot of challenges. So, let us not just try to grandstand. Put your house in order as well because if you can deliver, then yes indeed we can use your model. How do we use your model when you are not delivering as well? You've got serious ... [Interjections.] I have been personally! I visited the Groote Schuur Hospital. It took me only over 15 minutes just to find a ward. There is no direction in the place; it's so difficult.

So, we can come here and say a hell of a lot. [Interjections.] I am not saying there is no good work. I am not saying that. What I am saying is: You make it appear as if you got the solution to

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 208

everything. Then start now, today! [Interjections.] The people in the Western Cape, particularly in the clinics! I can tell you! I can give you a good example. Ruyterwacht is run perfectly well, but some of the others are serious challenges. Don't make it look like you have the plan. You don't have a plan; what you are doing is scoring points on weaknesses! Let's work together and find the solution. [Time expired.] Thank you very much.

Ms C N NDABA: Hon House Chair, hon Minister, Deputy Ministers and hon members, I want to read an article that was on Sunday Times on 11 November 2018. It says Khayelitsha Hospital looks like a five-star facility but it is facing multiple challenges, a parliamentary committee was told this week. When it opened to the public six years ago, Khayelitsha District Hospital was touted as the state-of-the-art facility.

It was the first hospital to be built in the Western Cape in 40 years and dedicated to Cape Town's largest township - the fastest growing in South Africa. Now, the 300-bed hospital is

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 209

overcrowded and docked by staff shortages and allegations of mismanagement and corruption.

So, hon Wilson, if you are talking about the Western Cape being a good example in terms of good governance and practices, I don't think the ANC can copy this thing. [Interjections.] What is worse is that you just mentioned one clinic that you were a part of; the rest of the oversight visits you were sick and sleeping. [Interjections.] I don't know you are talking about. You depended on the report that we gave you in the portfolio committee. [Interjections.]

Mr M WATERS: Is the speaker going to listen to you or not, Chair? She is just going to carry on.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon Ndaba, can you take your seat so that I hear a point of order. What's your point of order?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 210

Mr M WATERS: Chair, Rule 92 is my point order. I thought you were dealing with the oversight visit to KwaZulu-Natal.

IsiZulu:

Nksz C N NDABA: Hhayi suka wena!

English:

You are wasting my time!

Mr M WATERS: These hon members that told me about the state of health in KwaZulu-Natal! [Interjections.]

HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order, hon member! Indeed you are ... [Interjections.] Order!

Ms C N NDABA: You are wasting my time. Sit down. I am talking woman-to-woman; I am not sure why you are interfering!

[Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order! Order, hon Waters!

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 211

Mr M WATERS: Don't be so rude; learn some manners.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order! Hon Waters, can you allow the Chair? I was listening to your point of order. Indeed you are correct, but references are being made in general terms. However, you are correct in terms of the report that is being discussed.

Mr M WATERS: Yes! Chair, if I make addition: It seems like the speaker is too embarrassed to talk about health care in KwaZulu-Natal. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order, hon member! Hon member, can you take your seat! You are correct to say the point of order relates to the report, but members here were making references to other provincial health sector systems.

Ms C N NDABA: I am not your friend ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order, hon member!

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 212

Ms S V KALYAN: Madam, may I address you on a point of order?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order! What's the point of order, hon Kalyan?

Ms S V KALYAN: Point of order is unparliamentary language. The member used a swear word and she also said, "Hayi suka wena"!

IsiZulu:

Nksz C N NDABA: Hhayi suka maan!

English:

You are wasting my time!

Ms S V KALYAN: Aah aah! Aah aah! You used a swear word that starts with 'n', and there has been a twist against ...

[Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon members, can you please take your seat?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 213

IsiZulu:

Nksz C N NDABA: Hlala phansi! Hlala phansi!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon Ndaba, can you please allow the Chair to listen to the point of order? Yes, hon members?

Ms S V KALYAN: So, swear words and 'suka wena' is unparliamentary. I ask you to ask the member to withdraw.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order, hon Kalyan! Unfortunately, the challenge for the Chair is that when there is so much noise, and there is exchange across the platform, I am not in a position to hear. I did not hear the member. So, I will ask here ... [Interjections.] Order, hon member! We are just addressing the same issue. [Interjections.] Can you please be in order? Allow the Chair to ... [Interjections.] Can you allow the Chair to rule? Please! [Interjections.] Hon Ndaba, did you say the words that are alleged you have said?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 214

IsiZulu:

Nksz C N NDABA: Hawu, hhayi suka wena ngimshilo Sihlalo.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Can you please withdraw it? [Interjections.] Hon members, ... [Interjections.]

Ms C N NDABA: Okay! Chair, I am withdrawing 'hhayi suka wena' for the sake of progress.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Thank you.

Ms C N NDABA: Chair, the ANC rises in support ...
[Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order! Hon member, what is the point of order?

Mr M WATERS: Unparliamentary language!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Which is?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 215

Mr M WATERS: The 'f-word'!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): I will actually listen to the audio, because I didn't hear it.

Mr M WATERS: Or maybe you could ask the hon member is she said it!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon member, I will listen to the audio and come back to this House to make a ruling. Can you take a seat? Can you proceed, hon member?

Ms C N NDABA: Can I proceed, Chair?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): You can proceed, yes!

Ms C N NDABA: Hon members, there is nothing good that we can learn from the Western Cape. The ANC rises in support of the Report on the oversight visit to UMgungundlovu District Municipality and Ethekwini Metropolitan Municipality in KwaZulu-

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 216

Natal province. The realisation of the universal health care for all was envisioned in the social contract of 1955, the Freedom Charter, which states that, "Free medical care and hospitalisation shall be provided for all."

The purpose of the above-stated oversight visit was to assess progress and challenges in the UMgungundlovu District Municipality, which is a National Health Insurance pilot site for the health sector. The health sector has adopted the ideal clinic model for clinics to meet quality standards. Most of the clinics that the committee visited have achieved silver and gold status. The KwaZulu-Natal province has focused on building clinics and hospitals in rural and far-flung areas to redress the imbalances of the past by ensuring that our people have access to health facilities and receive quality health care services in their areas. [Interjections.]

HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order, hon members! Can you please don't drown the speaker on the podium?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 217

Ms C N NDABA: These facilities are beautiful, functional and resourced. Over and above, ...

IsiZulu:

... i-KZN inamabhasi. Amabhasi awumtholampilo futhi ayisibhedlela, anabodokotela, anabahlengikazi. Abantu bakithi abasuki le kude ko ... [Ubuwelewele.]

Abasasuki kude. Sebehamba eduzane bangasayi eKing Williams. Amabhasi eza kubo. Kulawo mabhasi abantu bakithi bayakwazi ukuthi bayosoka. Ngakho ke leyonto yenziwa uhulumeni kaKhongolose, obusayo njengamanje. [Ubuwelewele.]

English:

In Umlazi V-section Clinic, we made an unannounced visit and we observed that the clinic was not ideal in terms of structure and location. It was a house that was converted into a clinic to ensure that our people receive health care services. In terms of service delivery, we noted that the clinic is clean.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 218

The staff is dedicated, committed and work as a team. Clients were positive about the service they receive and there were medicines in the pharmacy. The staff utilise the small resources they have to deliver quality services. Due to the above-mentioned conditions, the committee recommended that the clinic be used as a TB clinic or children's clinic.

At Claremont, the committee noted that Claremont Clinic is small but was impressed with cleanliness and quality of services provided. The pharmacy is fully stocked and organised, despite not having pharmacy personnel. Staff and clients are happy. However, the infrastructure division was advised by the committee to put shelter for our people while waiting for consultation. They have agreed to do so as soon as possible to protect them from harsh weather conditions.

The KwaZulu-Natal must expropriate the unused neighbouring land next to the clinic and rebuild the clinic. On oncology, I think most of the issues that were raised by the SA Human Rights

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 219

Commission were being addressed by the department. Others are still being attended to by the department.

IsiZulu:

Futhi konke kuzokwenzeka!

English:

The Prince Cyril Zulu Communicable Disease Centre, located at the busy Warwick Triangle, surrounded by major taxi ranks, railway station, major bus ranks and informal traders provides the following services: HIV, TB, ARVs, NCDs, X-rays and contraceptives. Due to the accessibility of the facility, patients from outside the province are also able to access those services.

IsiZulu:

Akufani nala eWestern Cape naseKhayelitsha.

English:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 220

KwaZulu-Natal is doing well under the circumstances: With little resources they have; the vastness of the province; increasing population; people have got access to health care services; and treated with dignity and respect. The province will do much better with assistance of the national Department of Health. The ANC supports the report.

IsiZulu:

Bantu bakithi votelani i-ANC. Uma nivotele i-ANC niyobe nenze okulungile, hhayi abantu abagqoke izingubo eziluhlaza.

Ngiyabonga. [Ihlombe.]

English:

Inkosi Z M D MANDELA: On a point of order! On a point of order, Chair!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): What's a point of order, hon member?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 221

Inkosi Z M D MANDELA: Chair, with your indulgence: It seems that our vernacular languages are becoming intolerable here in Parliament. I want to speak to the word, 'suka wena'.

[Interjections.] 'Suka' means move; 'wena' means you. So, if then tomorrow I am to see you there and say,

IsiXhosa:

'Suka wena, awusemhle!' [Kwahlekwa.]

English:

Does that now become unparliamentary?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Thank you, hon member, for the point of order. I was indeed reminded of hon Essop Pahad who one time used the same word, "Hhayi suka wena!" I have just asked the Table Staff member, Mahlangu, just to check for me whether it is indeed unparliamentary so that I can deal with it. I understand, hon members. I will come back to that issue. That is why I am saying I reflected on it, hence I reminded myself of

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 222

what hon Essop used to say, so that we can clarify those matters. I also want to say ... [Interjections.]

Order, hon members! [Interjections.] Order, hon Kalyan! Can you take your seat; I will recognise you. [Interjections.] Order! Hon members, I think it is important to be tolerable of one another and not be selective also in the way in which we want others to behave whilst we behave in a particular way. At times, seated here as Presiding Officers, we can hear certain interjections that are really offensive. I don't think it is proper for anyone.

I would also want to say: These sounds that we sometimes make... At times a person will stammer but to then make those sounds is not correct, no matter who does it. I think we should refrain from it! [Interjections.] I have said anyone; I have not been saying this person or that one. I am just saying that from the Chair at times we can hear things that are said which are not supposed to be said in this House. What is your point of order, hon Kalyan?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 223

Ms S V KALYAN: Madam, there has been a precedence set in this House regarding the use of the word by hon Zulu. I think it is important for you to also look at the tone and context of the way the words are expressed. It can be expressed in a joking manner; and it can also be expressed in an insulting manner. [Interjections.] That is what the member did at the podium, but I leave that to you to finalise. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon member, that is why I said I will reflect on this matter and come back to you. I think I understood the context properly. I also understand the issue of the language. I will come back to this Chair and make my ruling on the matter. That is why I am saying let us just be tolerant of each other and appreciate ... [Interjections.]
Order, hon members!

You will remember that last week there was an issue raised about references on using our languages. I said you we are a multicultural plural society. Diversity is what we embrace. In terms of the rule, what is important is the respectfulness of

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 224

some of the phrases that we used so that we are at one about whether those issues are in terms of the rules offensive or not.

At times the failure of appreciating each other's languages might create problems. That is why I reflected on the issue that Mandela is raising, because indeed we need to be accommodative of each other's languages. On my side, I have actually asked Mr Mahlangu in order that we reflect on that issue so that we do not create a wrong precedence. Thank you very much, hon members. Can I put the question with respect to that report?

Ms P BHENGU-KOMBE: Hon Chair, I am here.

HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Yes, sorry hon member.

Ms BHENGU-KOMBE: You can also add the word 'shut up', because in IsiZulu, 'shut up' means 'thula', but in Parliament we are told that 'shut up' is unparliamentary.

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 225

HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Okay, thank you very much hon members. Are there any objections to the report being adopted? No objections.

Report accordingly agreed to.

**CONSIDERATION OF REPORT OF PORTFOLIO COMMITTEE ON HEALTH ON
STATE OF MENTAL HEALTH CARE SERVICES**

Ms M L DUNJWA: House Chair, Ministers and Deputy Ministers that are present, Members of Parliament, guests, if there are any, and you South Africans...

IsiXhosa:

... nani bantu boMzantsi Afrika, ndiyabulisa ngale njikalanga kwaye sicela nimamele. Mandikhawulezise kuba ixesha lixhatshwe yinja.

English:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 226

We are saying that as the Portfolio Committee on Health, upon receiving the report from the ombudsman regarding the unfortunate situation at Life Esidimeni which we have drawn lessons from as the ANC, we then called all provinces to come before the committee and explain to us the state of mental health in provinces. With regard to the Eastern Cape, we observed that there is a high rate of vacancies and infrastructure challenges, particularly the shortage of beds - which we were concerned about. In terms of the Western Cape, we were also concerned about the relationship ... because we know that there are traditional leaders in the province. We want to know how the relationship between traditional healers and health workers is. In terms of the Free State, we are also concerned about the Mental Health Review Board. We want to know if it is not functioning according to the Mental Health Care Act 12 that was amended in 2014. With regard to North West, we are also concerned about the review board because review boards are playing a fundamental role in terms of the mental health when patients are to be discharged and when patients are to be transferred in other institutions. In respect of KwaZulu-Natal,

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 227

we are concerned about the issue of review boards and the issue of human resource.

We are raising this because the ombudsman raised a number of issues that are very important and we are confident that the department has started addressing them, to ensure that provinces are doing what they are supposed to do with regard to the executive authority. On the issue of provinces, we invited them again to come before the portfolio committee because we wanted them to be aware of the state of health in our country. We did that precisely because whether people like it or not, National Health Insurance is here to stay. We then called the provinces to ask about the weaknesses, the potential and the strength of the health sector in all provinces. All provinces have challenges.

IsiXhosa:

Sifuna ukuthi kuni bantu baseMzantsi Afrika, xa abantu bethetha apha besithi imeko yezempilo ayisayi kuze itshintshe...

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 228

English:

... you must know that the ANC is addressing the legacy that we inherited by putting these programmes and these Acts. We inherited a legacy from the health sector where people were treated according to their colour; where people were given food according to their colour and where people were given blankets according to their colour. Yes, we may be making mistakes, but as leadership, we are leading the country we are to accept and acknowledge because that is what leadership is about. If you go to Khayelitsha, you must ask for your MEC for health and the head of department. I phoned them, and whenever I am called by people that I don't know from a bar of soap about the situation in Khayelitsha ... and you stand here and say that things are better.

Provinces raised the issues of infrastructure. Yes, there are improvements with regard to infrastructure, though there are challenges - even here in the Western Cape. You want billions to revitalise Tygerberg Hospital when you already have been given billions by the apartheid regime to revitalise Groote Schuur

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 229

Hospital. Now you stand here and begin to criticize issues ... and where is Groote Schuur Hospital situated and who is then in charge of it. In terms of human resource, we are comfortable that the Presidential Health Summit that took place about a week ago acknowledges the challenges that exist. We are saying to the people of South Africa, voting for the ANC is not a sin ... [Time expired.] ... voting for the ANC will change your life, particularly in the health sector. I thank you.

There was no debate.

The Deputy Chief Whip of the Majority Party moved: That the Reports be adopted.

Declarations of votes:

Ms E R WILSON: Oh, the sad reality of Health in South Africa! We can harp on endlessly about the collapse of Health in South Africa, so many oversights visits to hospitals and clinics; so many reports of people suffering and dying and being denied their constitutional rights to proper health care. So bad is it

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 230

that even the Deputy President of South Africa does not trust and he goes to Russia. He should have come to the Western Cape, we would have sorted him up quickly. [Interjections.] Has this ANC government and Dr Motsoaledi made any real progress since they started with their National Health Insurance, NHI, plan? "Dololo!" [Nothing] Let's deal with the mental health report. In light of the 2017 ...

Mr P J MNGUNI: House Chair. On a point of order.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order, hon member. Can you please take your seat? Let's take a point of order. What's the point of order?

Mr P J MNGUNI: Hlala phantsi [Sit down] ma'am. You are asked to sit down.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order, can you take your seat.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 231

Mr P J MNGUNI: Hon House Chair, in terms of the precedence, I am asking that you rule as to whether the word "dololo" is parliamentary, so that we may know if we can all use it thereafter ... [Interjections.] ... if it is parliamentary. Please rule on that. Thank you.

Ms E R WILSON: You guys use it all the time.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order, hon member. [Interjections.] Order! [Interjections] Order! Hon member, can you proceed with your speech.

Ms E R WILSON: Thank you, House Chair. In light of the 2017 Health Ombudsman's report into the circumstances surrounding the death of mentally ill patients in Gauteng, the Portfolio Committee on Health considered it vital to assess the state of mental health services in the eight provincial departments of health. And what did the committee hear? There is a mushrooming of unlicensed NGOs and it was highlighted that this required urgent attention in order to avert similar tragedy that happened

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 232

in Gauteng, as it was partly attributed to unlicensed NGOs. There is infrastructure countrywide which is not suitable for psychiatric services.

There is a lack of child and adolescent psychiatric units. There is lack of forensic observation units. There is poor networking activity in the hospitals. There are severe budget restraints. There is a severe shortage of core and support staff, and there is overcrowding in most facilities. The committee also raised a concern about a high number of vacant posts - up to 60% in some instances, particularly for psychiatrists, community psychiatrist nurses and occupational therapists. Clarity was sought on whether the province has a strategy in place to recruit those professionals. "Dololo"! At the end of the day it was painfully obvious that the mental health care and mental patients are ... [Interjections.]

Mr N XABA: Hon House Chair?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order, hon member.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 233

Mr N XABA: Yes, House Chair, is the hon member prepared to take a question?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon member, are you prepared to take a question? [Interjections.]

Ms E R WILSON: I will meet you in Barney's afterwards.
[Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): You can take a seat; she is not prepared to take a question. Proceed.

Ms E R WILSON: At the end of the day, it is painfully obvious that mental health care and mental patients are certainly not a priority with this ANC-led government. In fact, they are treated as second grade citizens and they are treated in the most inhumane manner as the Life Esidimeni tragedy proved to us. We are still waiting to hear where 21 of those poor patients are. To compound this tragedy it has become apparent that well qualified educational psychologists are being sidelined too.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 234

Educational so extensively trained and the majority who are skilled in the areas of assessments in psychotherapy, which includes individual, family, parental, couple, marital and group therapy. They are skilled in systematic interventions and research and are particularly skilled in learning and development across life spans. In fact, many of this highly skilled people were brought into the families with the horrific trauma laid on them by Life Esidimeni tragedy. We hear that there are plans afoot to only allow these practitioners to practice in schools because they are educational.

Many questions are now being raised by the Professional Board of Psychology. Questions like who has been appointed to that board and how the board members were actually appointed, if procedures were correctly followed. Who is in that board and who are they related to? How is it that when mental health and its facilities are in such shambles and severely short staffed, high qualified psychologists play the part in helping in the biggest tragedy in this country in recent years are now being dictated to as to

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 235

where they may or may not practice and are being herded into a small kraal and made ineffective.

Mr Motsoaledi, we need answers; but I suspect that you don't have them or are deliberately bringing Health down so you can find the excuse to nationalise Health and dictate what is best for us. Is it long past time that South Africans stand up for their rights and say enough is enough. The collapsing health system, including mental health is affecting every citizen in this country for the worst. We have proved that we can deliver in the Western Cape, Mr Imam. We have the highest number of specialists, doctors, and best-run facilities and hospitals. You cannot dispute that. If you want a South African health system for all, a one South Africa for all, it is time to vote for the DA, because we care. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): The ANC?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 236

Ms L L VAN DER MERWE: Chairperson, my apologies. I did inform the Table earlier that the hon Nkomo will be speaking from her seat.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon Nkomo?

[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Hey, dololo! Sit down, dololo!

Ms S J NKOMO: Thank you, Chairperson. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order, hon member. Order, hon Nkomo. There's a point of order.

The MINISTER OF HIGHER EDUCATION AND TRAINING: I ...

[Inaudible.] My apologies, hon Nkomo. Chair, I actually wanted to say to you that had you allowed me to use my language – the speech was so good – I would've said, hayi suka! [Laughter.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 237

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order hon member. Hon Nkomo? That's not a point of order. [Interjections.] Hon Nkomo? I think we need a holiday now.

Ms S J NKOMO: The report before us speaks to the assessment of the state of mental health services in eight provincial departments of Health. However, let us not forget the often quoted saying that our mentally-ill patients or ill people are guests of the President. As the High Court of South Africa is the upper guardian of all children, we would expect government to take special care of our mentally-ill patients. Yet, what we have witnessed is far removed from that.

The tragedy of Life Esidimeni is in fact tantamount to what one would state is complicity to murder, where we as government actually did that. It is still by no stretch of the imagination that mental health in South Africa is in a state of despair where many of our patients are still not taken care of.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 238

Increased poverty plays a very big part. An inequality exacerbated by government's cadre deployment as well as looting has actually led to many mental illnesses in our communities where you find that fathers and mothers are not able to take care of their families because of the self-imposed poverty by government.

It is quite interesting as well to note that all these things are happening under the so-called guise of taking care of our people and ensuring that our people are given food parcels. Yet, we are perpetually putting our people into poverty so that they even become mentally ill where they cannot take care of their responsibilities.

The remedy here is that we should be very, very vigilant when it comes to the prevention of these illnesses. The IFP's Medical Innovation Bill looked at such issues where prevention became quite a serious component. Whilst we support this report, we would like the matters that we have brought forth to be taken care of, especially the deliberate way in which our people are

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 239

being put into poverty so that they continually keep looking for food parcels.

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Thank you, hon House Chair. It's been a long day. [Interjections.] [Laughter.] The NFP notes the report of the Portfolio Committee on Health.

Allow me to ... I won't concentrate on the financial aspect because I think ... [Inaudible.] ... is obvious that we are very, very good at spending money but in getting value for money is another thing. That clearly seems to be a challenge which we need to address.

The issue of community health care workers remains unresolved, and if we remember, the previous President said that community health care workers will become permanent. These community health care workers earn between R1 300 and R1 500 per month. In many provinces this has not happened but let me welcome the statement by the Minister yesterday, where he said that they are now going to become permanent.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 240

The supply-chain management, SCM, challenges still remain unresolved and I can tell you that many service providers are waiting for their money. In 180 days ... 365 days, they have not been paid to date. I guess one of the challenges appears to be the fact that Ministers and national departments have limited mandates in terms of that.

One of the problems that you've identified is the mushrooming of uncontrolled nongovernmental organisations, NGOs, which is a serious threat to health care in the country. But let us also be cognisant of the fact that there are other contributing factors. The health sector in South Africa is underbudgeted for by billions of rand. Then you've got the influx of foreigners. I heard the other day about 10 million or so of them that also impacts. The socioeconomic conditions that they live under also impacts. So, if we don't look at these challenges holistically, we are going to continue with the problem that we have. It's not going to change.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 241

If you take the issue of mental health care, some of the hospitals in some of the provinces have a serious problem. In fact, I suggested that the Western Cape, which has a lot of space at their hospitals and facilities ... because it's known that there's a stigma attached to mental health and families don't visit them. So, I suggested, take the patients from the Eastern Cape and put them in the Western Cape. That was denied. I was told, no you can't do that. You can't move people around. So I'm ... [Inaudible.]

I would also like you as the Western Cape to tell me why it is that you do not want to accept the principle of an ideal clinic. Why don't you want to recognise the community health care workers and make their payments? Are you happy that they are earning R1 300 a month? Can they survive? Look at the service that they provide. Surely we must be able to work together to find the solution to that. That appears to be a serious problem ... [Inaudible.] [Time expired.] The NFP supports the report tabled here today. [Applause.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 242

Mr A F MAHLALELA: Thanks very much, House Chair. You see, hon Minister Motsoaledi said one day that he believes that hon Wilson is lost in politics ... [Interjections.] ... and every day she comes to the podium I get convinced ... [Laughter.] ... that she really is lost. She's supposed to be joining *Generations* and other soap operas because I'm sure she can act better there. [Interjections.]

The national Department of Health, together with provincial departments, has made notable progress over the years towards the delivery of equitable and good quality health care services for all in our country. We, however, acknowledge that there remain challenges.

Generally, the state of health care shows that the department is operating under severe quality health care pressure as a result of the challenges around financial resources and the question of financial management, which as you know, for the past ... the department's budget has been reduced by almost nine billion rand.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 243

When assessing the state of health in the country, the portfolio committee focused mainly on four areas, which was your human resource management with particular emphasis on community health workers. We are pleased and welcome the position that has now been adopted by government that, after consultation, there has been an agreement that more than 54 000 community health workers that are situated in 3 519 ward-based teams, will receive stipends in line with the National Minimum Wage ... [Applause.] ... with the exception of community health workers in the Western Cape, because the Western Cape government refuses to provide that National Minimum Wage that ordinary people require. [Interjections.]

The other issues that the committee focused on was around the issue of infrastructure management; the implementation of an ideal clinic initiative where we are pleased that a sizeable number of clinics in the country – in particular in the eight provinces with the exception of the Western Cape – are implementing the ideal clinic initiative. A sizeable number of them are becoming ideal clinics, which is needed for the

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 244

prevision of health care services in the country, as opposed to what is happening in the Western Cape.

For the past few years, South Africa has taken some important steps towards the strengthening of its mental health system in line with the requirements of the World Health Organisation. The Department of Health developed the National Mental Health Policy Framework and Strategic Plan 2013-2020. However, despite this framework and strategic plan that have been in existence for almost five years now, there still remain ongoing challenges that face mental health in South Africa.

Mental health care continues to be underfunded and under-resourced by provinces – all of them, including the Western Cape – compared to other health priorities, despite the fact that neuropsychiatric disorder is one of the contributors to the burden of disease in South Africa, and infectious diseases.

There is enormous inequality between provinces in the distribution and allocation of mental health services and

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 245

resources. For example, there are provinces that don't have health directorates, as required by the policy and strategic plan. Some provinces don't have a psychiatric hospital ...

An HON MEMBER: Like Gauteng.

Mr A F MAHLALELA: ... which Gauteng does have. Unfortunately, for your own information, the one that doesn't have one is Mpumalanga, not Gauteng. [Interjections.]

There is also a lack of public awareness around mental health and widespread stigmatisation against those who suffer from mental illness. I saw some of that stigmatisation today when members started howling at someone ... one of the members who displayed some mental illness at the stage her during the women's debate on 16 days of activism. [Interjections.] ... from the opposition.

Mental health services continue to labour under the legacy of the colonial mental health care system. [Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 246

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order hon Mahlalela. Can you take your seat? What's the point of order? [Interjections.]

Mr T W MHLONGO: Can I ask the member a question?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon Mahlalela, are you willing to take a question?

Mr A F MAHLALELA: Yes, when I'm done with what I'm busy with.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): He's not willing to take a question. Proceed, hon member.

Mr A F MAHLALELA: Mental health services continue to labour under the legacy of the colonial mental health system with a heavy reliance on psychiatric hospitals. While the integration of mental health into primary health care is enshrined in the White Paper and the Mental Health Care Act, in practice mental health care is mainly confined to the management of medication of those with severe mental disorders, and does not include the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 247

detection and treatment of other mental disorders such as depression and anxiety disorders.

There is therefore a need for provinces to vigorously engage on mental promotion, prevention of mental illness, treatment and rehabilitation.

It is in this context that we as the ANC are very worried about the current ruling by the Constitutional Court – taking into consideration that there is a huge abuse of substances – where they agree that we must decriminalise dagga. That is going to create another burden for the state in terms of mental illness and this is one of the challenges that we need to focus on and address. We support the report. [Time expired.] [Applause.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: House Chairperson,
I move that the reports be adopted.

Question put: That the Reports be adopted.

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 248

Motion agreed to.

Report on State of Mental Health Care Services accordingly adopted.

Report on State of Health Care Services in South Africa accordingly adopted.

CONSIDERATION OF REPORT OF PORTFOLIO COMMITTEE ON SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT ON OVERSIGHT VISIT TO KWAZULU-NATAL DEPARTMENT OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT, SOUTH AFRICAN SOCIAL SECURITY AGENCY AND NATIONAL DEVELOPMENT AGENCY PROJECTS

Ms S P TSOLELI: Chair, the Portfolio Committee on Social Development adopted a strategic decision, whereby oversight was based on the dominant issues affecting the province. Food security was identified as the key focus area for oversight in KwaZulu-Natal. The objective of the oversight to KwaZulu-Natal was to consider the progress made by the provincial department

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 249

in implementing the National Policy on Food and Nutrition Security and the Household Food and Nutrition Security Strategy.

The committee found that, through the Operation Sukuma Sakhe Programme, the province has had significant success in linking services of various government departments through the War Room on Poverty. The province has also managed to implement the aforementioned programmes by linking food security co-operatives, community nutrition development centres, skills development programmes, and youth development through the Radical Agrarian Socioeconomic Transformation, called Raset. Raset is a government programme directed at addressing the crisis of joblessness, poverty, inequality, by supporting black African subsistence and small farmers.

Notwithstanding, the above, the committee raised a concern that the distribution of food and negotiation of food prices were outsourced to nonprofit organisations. This is the responsibility of the department. We are of the view that the department should build capacity or establish co-operatives that

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 250

will assist communities to be self-sufficient. The department should also utilise local government structures to deliver food.

The committee was assured by the department that its concern will be escalated to the Deputy President of the country, so that it can be addressed and co-ordinated. The committee believes that its concerns and recommendations were addressed by the province. During a committee meeting held on 14 November 2018, the committee was informed that significant progress has been made to address the issues raised by the committee.

I therefore present the committee's report on oversight to KwaZulu-Natal to be considered for adoption by the House. Ke a leboha. [Thank you.]

Declarations of vote:

Ms A T KHANYILE: House Chair, the oversight conducted in KwaZulu-Natal and the Free State revealed that some programmes have the potential to push against poverty, if all those involved in implementing them have, as their goal, to put an end

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 251

to poverty. It also revealed that some youth are ready to get their hands dirty, to not only fight poverty, but to create thriving businesses in agriculture. This is encouraging.

However, surprisingly, the oversight also showed that there are those whose focus is on enriching themselves through government programmes, without heeding the main objective of these development initiatives.

We heard of a situation where the MEC for Social Development had to temporarily close the Lower Umfolozi Service Office, due to rampant fraud and corruption relating to foster care. Twenty-seven officials were subsequently charged, eight have been dismissed, two have been given three months suspension without pay, one has received a final written warning. The balance of 16 disciplinary hearings was scheduled to be finalised at the end of September 2017. A further 17 officials have since been charged for misconduct. The department also found out that there were cases where children were adopted twice.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 252

We witnessed a situation where, instead of procuring food from local co-operatives, food was procured from mainstream retail wholesalers, defeating the very objective of ensuring that the local, most unemployed and therefore poor people are financially empowered via government development programmes.

The Household Food and Nutrition Security Programme, also known as the Community Nutrition Development Centre, CNDC, is a great initiative aimed to alleviate poverty where individuals from households in need of food come together to enjoy nutritious meals, which meet the most basic human needs.

CNDCs are designed to empower people through training and skills development. However, the department creates a culture of dependency. There is currently no exit plan in place. It is crucial to ensure that skills development programmes take place to ensure that the beneficiaries of this programme are able to exit the programme and be independent. This is a shame, given the high levels of unemployment that leads to entire communities being left to remain poor.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 253

We will monitor all the issues that we have raised, to ensure that the committee's recommendations are taken seriously. It is only the DA that has a plan to create fair access to real long-term jobs across South Africa, where small business owners will be empowered. [Applause.] We support this report.

IsiZulu:

USolwazi N M KHUBISA: Sihlalo, siyawamukela lo mbiko ngoba sicabanga ukuthi lolu hambo lweKomidi lwalubaluleke kakhulu. Angisho nje Sihlalo ukuthi ukungasebenzi kwentsha eningi

English:

... the single biggest challenge facing South Africa, with numbers of school leavers outstripping the availability of jobs, causing frustration and many other social issues for the youth. Therefore, ...

IsiZulu:

Ukusebenza kukaHulumeni wesiFundazwe ngokuqala kwakhe leya phrojekthi yaseVuma, ebizwa ngokuthi iYouth Development Centre

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 254

eseShowe eyaqalwa njengohlelo lokuzama ukubona ukuthi ingasebenza yini (pilot), iyiphrojekthi ebaluleke kakhulu ukuhlanganisa abantu abasha nokubheka amakhono abo, kanjalo nokubasiza nakwezinye izinto eziphathelene nempilo.

Kanti nokubathatha futhi bagcine sebefunda eMfolozi TVT College bethola ulwazi lwemfundo ephakeme ukuze bakwazi ukuzisiza bathuthuke bayephambili ngemfundo yabo kanjalo futhi bazuze namakhono abalulekile. Yize ke noma bengaphumelelanga ezifundweni zikamatikuletsheni kodwa bakwazi ukuzuza amakhona okuziphilisa, nalabo abasabambeke ezidakamizweni babuyiswe. Ngakho ke sifisa ukusincoma kakhulu lesa sikhungo ukuthi sibalulekile ukukhulisa amakhono abantwana bethu

Kukhona futhi enye iphrojekthi eseNgwelezane, eMpangeni, KwaZulu/Natal lapho khona abantu abasha besebenza khona ukulima izingadi, ikhombisa ukuthi iphatheke kahle, okutshengisa ukuthi zikhona izindawo lapho abantu abasha uma beqeqeshiwe, futhi bezimisele bevuma, bekwazi nokuphatha kahle izimali zikaHulumeni

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 255

ngoba uMnyango wezeNhlalakahle ufaka izimali zakhe khona lapho kodwa sithola ukuthi le ntsha ziziphatha kahle lezi zimali.

Sifisa futhi ukuncoma okuhle okwenzeka laphayana ehhovisi laseMfolozi uma kutholakala ukuthi kudliwa izimali zombuso, abantu bayabanjwa, bajeze babhekane nokona kwabo. Lokho uHulumeni fanele akusebenze kakhulu. uMnyango njengoba ukwenza lokho nezinye izindawo lapho kunuka khona intuthu yokudliwa kwezimali zikaHulumeni, abantu mababanjwe bajeze ngokwenza kwabo.

Lolu hambo lwaluqondene nodaba lokukhulisa nokukhuselwa kokudla ngenhloso yokubheka ukuthi umgomo kaHulumeni uyasebenza yini.. Njenge NFP uma sekuza odabeni oluthinta abantu abakhubazekile uHulumeni kusamele ake athi ukwenyusa amasokisi, futhi siyincoma nemizamo kaHulumeni wesiFundazwe, njengodaba naseNduduzweni, eThekwini, nasoSizweni eMgungundlovu lapho besebenza khona imisebenzi yezandla, kukhona futhi esinye isikhungo lapho abantu abakhubazekile etholakala ngaseMpangeni okuthiwa iJabulani lapho

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 256

bezisiza khona. Zonke lezi zindawo zibalulekile. Siyawuxhasa lo mbiko

Ms B L ABRAHAMS: Hon House Chair, the ANC supports this report. The committee, having conducted an oversight visit to KwaZulu-Natal found that, even though the province made significant progress in implementing food security programmes, the service of distributing food was done by NPOs. This is a service that should be done by the department. This means that the NPOs act as a conduit. The committee thus recommended the following.

Firstly, the committee advised the department to consider increasing its capacity, with the assistance of local government through community development workers. These workers can be used to distribute food. In that way, an amount of R830 million out of R1,2 billion allocated to the department that was reported to have been transferred to the NPOs can be saved.

Secondly, the committee resolved to invite the national Department of Social Development, to brief them on the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 257

comprehensive report on the Integrated Food Security Programme. The committee received this briefing on 14 November 2018, where provincial food distribution agencies were also present.

The food distribution agency operating in KwaZulu-Natal reported that it had addressed the issues raised by the committee. It signed more than 50 memorandums of understanding, MOUs, with corporatives, it procured from these corporatives, inline with the Radical Agrarian Socioeconomic Transformation principles. The ANC supports this report. Thank you.

Motion agreed to.

Report accordingly adopted.

UNPARLIAMENTARY LANGUAGE

(Ruling)

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 258

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T DIDIZA): Hon members, I just want to come back to the issue that was raised earlier in the debate on the report of the Portfolio Committee on Health on the oversight visit to KwaZulu-Natal Province from 14 to 17 August 2018. A point of order was raised by hon Kalyan in which she requested the Chair to rule that the phrase "hayi suka wena" used by hon Ndaba was unparliamentary.

The Chair requested the member to withdraw and hon Ndaba indeed withdrew. Hon Mandela requested that the Chair reflects once again on her ruling, given that the phrase "hayi suka wena" in other languages is actually not offensive. Particularly in African languages, the phrase can be used in a variety of ways.

It can be used as a prefix when you want to complement somebody, as hon Naledi Pandor said. It can also be used when somebody is trying ... [Interjections.] Hon Waters, I am still ruling. It can also be used as a reference when somebody does not want to be disturbed, which is also not unparliamentary.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 259

Hon Kalyan, after hon Mandela has raised the issue, requested that the Chair must look into the context. The Chair indeed has considered this matter that was raised, including the context in which the phrase was made. During hon Ndaba's debate on the podium, hon Wilson made continuous interjections, which hon Ndaba responded to by saying "hayi suka wena". In this context, the phrase "hayi suka wena" was an expression to say, don't disturb me. As such, the phrase was not offensive and therefore, not contravening any Rule, particularly Rule 84. [Applause.]

Hon members, indeed, our languages in this Parliament, which are all official, in terms of the Constitution, are very rich in content. Some of them also have idioms, which sometimes maybe understood wrongly. In this instance, that was indeed the case.

Hon members, indeed, in my language, we could also say, "lixhoshwa libhekile". That means: Even a mistake can be made when you least expect it. Therefore, even the presiding officer, in this instance, immediately ruled when she was supposed not to

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 260

in that context. Therefore, the presiding officer apologizes to hon Ndaba.

UNPARLIAMENTARY LANGUAGE

(Ruling)

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T DIDIZA): Another matter was raised by hon P J Mnguni about the phrase "dololo" that was used by hon Wilson on the podium, asking whether or not such a phrase is parliamentary. Hon members, in this Parliament, the way in which we have used the phrase "dololo", meaning nothing, has been accepted.

Again, the issue of the intonation and phrasing might mean certain things. It was in that context that hon Mnguni was raising it. So, I understood the context in which Wilson was raising the phrase, meaning nothing. So, it was not unparliamentary in that case. [Interjections.] Hon Wilson.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 261

So, hon members, as the principal of the school, even though for a short time, until the next election, we must have some language laboratory to ensure that across the board, we can understand these phrases. It can actually enrich the debate in this House, as oppose to degenerating it in any other manner. Thank you very much for your indulgence.

Mr M WATERS: Chair, thank you for those rulings. Just on the other issue ... the F-word ... are you still ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): I will still come back to the other issue because I need to listen to the audio.

Mr M WATERS: Thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Yes, we will do all of that. Yes, hon member, what's your point of order?

Mr M XABA: Chair, I was just asking: to vote ANC, is it ...

[Inaudible.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 262

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order, hon member! You are now introducing a new thing that I would have to deal with! Hon Xulu?

The MINISTER OF SMALL BUSINESS DEVELOPMENT: Thank you very much, Chairperson, for your ruling. In that context ...

IsiZulu:

... ngizocela ukuthi ilungu elihloniphekile uKalyan. Ubani igama lakhe?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Kalyan.

IsiZulu:

UNGQONGQOSHE WEZOKUTHUTHUKISWA KWAMABHIZINISI AMANCANE:

Ngizocela ukuthi uma ebuya ahoxhise naye ngoba ungisukele ngingashongo lutho. Wangimemeza wathi uZulu uthe, wathi ngibe ngingashongo lutho. Usithethe isinqumo ngakho uma ebuya lapha kufuneka ahoxhise.

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 263

English:

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon Xulu, thank you very much. I will have to look at Hansard, because I cannot recall right now what the actual context was within which your name was referred to. [Interjections.] Order, hon members! You are also out of order now!

**CONSIDERATION OF REPORT OF PORTFOLIO COMMITTEE ON AGRICULTURE,
FORESTRY AND FISHERIES ON OVERSIGHT VISIT TO NORTH WEST
PROVINCE FROM 10-15 SEPTEMBER 2017**

**CONSIDERATION OF REPORT OF PORTFOLIO COMMITTEE ON WOMEN IN THE
PRESIDENCY ON OVERSIGHT VISIT TO NORTH WEST PROVINCE FROM 10-
15 SEPTEMBER 2017**

Ms P BENGU-KOMBE: Chairperson, the ANC supports the adoption of the joint Reports of the Portfolio Committee on Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries and the Portfolio Committee on Women in the Presidency, to North West on 10 to 11 September 2017.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 264

The purpose of the joint oversight was to oversee the implementation of the concurrent activities and cross-cutting policy issues particular to women in agriculture, including matters related to gender mainstreaming and equality.

The portfolio committees held stakeholder meetings with the provincial department on rural development, the environment and agricultural development. The MEC of the North West Department of Agriculture, the executive Mayor of Dr Kenneth Kaunda District Municipality, the Commission on Gender Equality and Provincial Office on the Status of Women.

During the oversight visit, we visited several agricultural projects which were Sabolanang Abbatoir, Moses Skotana Crop Production, Groot Marico Vegetables, Lebone Vegetables, Kopanelo Beef, Sehlohono Mokoena Agricultural Milling, Tswelopelo Fishery Project, Doorpan Mixed Farming, Tusano Communal Property Association, Motlahong Pickery, Setiso Farming, Apple Dry Agricultural Primary Co-operative, Sekonya and Sekonyana Farming.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 265

As a delegation, we made stark observations on issues of intergovernmental relations. There were inadequate intergovernmental relations between all these departments - rural development, water and sanitation, and agriculture.

Isizulu:

Okunye esakubona ukuthi lamapulazi athengwa nguhulumeni ukuba alinywe abantu abamnyama ewathenga kubalimi abamhlophe. Abalimi labo abamhlophe babe sebegodla amalayisense amanzi ukuze labalimi abamnyama bangakwazi ukusebenzisa amanzi futhi bangakwazi ukukhiqiza imikhiqizo yabo. Okunye futhi ...

English:

... there was poor building and skills development of beneficiaries to be fully capable of managing all aspects of their projects and business without depending on government or service providers.

For all projects, reports were done by officials of the department. Access to electricity and high electricity costs,

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 266

lack of timeframes for project completion and exit strategies for each government-funded project, no clear linkage or alignment of some projects with agricultural policy action plan, and municipal integrated development plan, IDPs, lack of feasibility studies and assessment prior to project implementation, the use of one of the ...

I'm sorry, Chair.

The use of one of the service providers which was AgriDelight as one of the service providers for the whole province.

We also have these observations and recommendations as the portfolio committees for a provincial department of agriculture which is ... [Inaudible.] ... to submit a comprehensive report of interventions on outstanding issues that we observed. The issue of why only one service provider AgriDelight as the one service provider for the whole province, that the provincial department to submit all black farmers to department ... all black ... the list of all black farmers that will be

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 267

commercialised, and why there was an absence of the national policy on comprehensive producer supports and to develop an exit strategic plan for the Office of the Secretary to Parliament to give the timeframes that specifically address the women challenges, that the department must ensure that all gender focal point persons are placed at decision-making.

Nonetheless, as the two portfolio committees, we were so happy with the performance of all the beneficiaries. The commitment and the hard work of many of the black farmers, both women and men ... Therefore, as the ANC, we fully adopt this report.

Declarations of Vote:

Ms A STEYN: Chairperson, according to Statistics SA, 14 million or 26% of South Africans are experiencing hunger on a daily basis. It is therefore important that this Parliament ensures that the Department of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries is properly functioning.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 268

If you read the report on the portfolio committee oversight visit to the North West it is clear that this department is massively underperforming, and that no clear plan exists to help small-scale farmers to become independent from government.

The main challenges that were highlighted included high production input costs, persistent drought, high electricity costs, record-keeping skills, and high maintenance costs for machinery and equipment. It also includes paying rent to government for leases, although no lease agreement has been renewed.

Hon Nkwinti, I'm looking at you! You were telling them in 2010 that their leases would be renewed. It has not been renewed.

Poor capacity building and skills development of beneficiaries to ensure that they are fully capable of managing all aspects of their projects and business without being dependent on government or service providers ...

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 269

What becomes clear is that the North West department has outsourced its agricultural department to a company called AgriDelight. It must be noted that this company used R100 million that was supposed to be spent on small-scale farmers to buy cattle for President Zuma. I cannot even say that dololo is happening in the North West, because it's not dololo; they are stealing money that was supposed to be used for small-scale farmers in that province. That is why this province has now been put under administration.

During our visit, it became very clear that AgriDelight was used to steal money from small-scale farmers. The portfolio committee members asked for documents on AgriDelight, and we even summoned them to come and appear before the committee here in Parliament. Until today, we have not received information on how this company was appointed and in how many projects it was involved.

Afrikaans:

Die feit dat ons nie inligting uit hierdie provinsie kon kry nie, is seker nie 'n verassing nie. Die Noordwes is met 'n yster

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 270

vuis geregeer deur Supra, en niemand kon optree sonder sy goedkeuring en medewete nie.

Die Noordwes en Vrystaat provinsies is voorbleelde van hoe geld wat vir armes bedoel was, gesteel word deur korrupte ANC kaders. Dit is ook makliker gemaak deurdat die Department van Landbou geen oorsig werk doen nie.

Gepraat van oorsig, ons was ook veronderstel om inligting te ontvang oor sogenaamde AgriParks, wat in samewerking met die Department van Landelike Ontwikkeking opgerig is, om kleinboere te help met medewerking.

Alhoewel ons geen Agriparks in Noordwes besoek het nie, het ek wel uit persoonlike ondervinding reeds parke daar besoek en weet dat daar slegs vermorsing van geld plaasvind, sodat die departement kan raporteer aan Parlement dat vondse gespandeer word. Maar dit word gedoen sonder dat landbouers werklik gehelp word.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 271

Ek het verlede week 'n Agripark in die Ooskaap besoek, Minister Nkwinti. Ngqushwa. Daar is miljoende rande gespandeer, en daardie projek is gevandaliseer. Die rede hoekeom dit gevandaliseer was is omdat die boere rondom daardie projek nooit ingelig was dat dit vir hulle bedoel was en wat daar sou gebeur het nie. Ek het die mense gevra; hulle het nie eens geweet waarvoor die projek was nie.

Gepraat daarvan, die kwessie van land.*English:*

Mr Rakgatse has been paying rent in Northwest province since 1991. He had the option to purchase that farm. The Department of Rural Development stopped that contract one-sidedly, and he is still paying rent to this day, and he was now told that he will never own that land.

So we would ask the Department of Rural Development and Land Reform, when are you going to start implementing your project to give title to black farmers.

On the issue of the women, I want to say that it was really a privilege to go with the Department of Women to see what the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 272

impact was on women. It was shocking to see that there is not much that it happening, especially in agriculture, to assist woman farmers, and especially people with disabilities. It was very difficult to access some of these farms and to make sure that women are being supported on land. Thank you. [Applause.]

Inkosi R N CEBEKHULU: Chairperson, the Department of Agriculture had focused on giving support to household food security through the establishment of food gardens. Agriparks have been established in order to further the grain value chain and to promote small-holder farmers.

The province was under the attack of the ***** worms which destroyed plants, causing a massive loss of food and income to agriculture. People of the province are benefitting a lot from both departments of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries, as well as Rural Development and Land Reform in many projects where we are funded by these departments.

This province is rich in mineral resources. The largest employers are mining and agriculture. Mining alone contributes

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 273

32% of the provincial economy, followed by manufacturing at 5,6%, then agriculture at 2,9%.

The District Municipality of Dr Ruth Mompathi has identified a portion of land on a farm outside of Vryburg to develop Agri Park activities where they will build a feed mill and a feedlot. These are the items the province had delivered to the people of the Northwest. All these have been reigned in by the corruption that has overcome the province, resulting in the takeover by administration.

National government had to deploy the army to assist the communities that are under traditional leadership where, empowered by the construction of an abattoir administered by five members, Thlabologang Abattoir in Moses Skotane Local Municipality ... This project will supply local butcheries with red meat and government-led markets around Bokone Bophirima.

The project was supported by the Comprehensive Agricultural Support Programme, Casp, with an amount of R5 million.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 274

Feed crops are produced to alleviate poverty and create jobs for locals.

This as well in other ... part of the decision in the province were poultry and piggery ... has been part of projects to develop the communities. The Tswelelopele Fisheries project run by 12 participants where a challenge was noted that the entrance fees when entering the game reserve gate has resulted in them putting on hold fishing activity. They cannot afford the R75 entry fee at the gate daily just to fish. There are about 19 local women forums which were capacitated during the 2016-17 financial year.

A good working relationship was formalised ... Anyway ...

IsiZulu:

Siyawuxhasa umbiko siwu-IFP.[Ihlombe.]

IsiZulu:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 275

Usolwazi N M KHUBISA: Sihlalo, sisukuma ngokuwuxhasa lo mbiko ngoba uwumbiko obaluleke kakhulu.

English:

And the visit was meant to oversee the crosscutting policy issues [Interjection.]

Ms L L VAN DER MERWE: Chairperson, I'm sorry to interrupt. You just called the IFP again; he's in fact an NFP member. I know he wants to rejoin, he's already [Interjection.]

The HOUSE Chairperson (Ms M G BOROTO): No, I said NFP.

Ms L L VAN DER MERWE: Well, we are happy do another declaration.

The HOUSE Chairperson (Ms M G BOROTO): I thought you were talking on behalf of mam'Nkomo. No, it's NFP.

IsiZulu:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 276

Usolwazi N M KHUBISA: Ngiyambona ukuthi ukhathele. Ngike ngambona ephuma eya kwenye indlu ngapha. [Uhleko.] Kukhona akutholile. Kuyalishintsha ikhanda lokho uma ukuthole kwaba kuningi. [Ubuwelewele.] [Uhleko.]

USIHLALO WENDLU (Nk M G Boroto): Qhubeka! Qhubeka baba uKhubisa.

English:

It was meant to oversee the cross-cutting policy issues, progress on agri-park limited projects, implementation of the Fetsa Tlala Food Production initiative and support that is given to small holder and subsistence producers to enhance food security and production at the national and household level through the program such as the Comprehensive Agricultural Support Program, Ilima-Letsema.

Chairperson, North West contributes 2,9% to the agricultural economy of the North West province, which is a population of 3,7 million people and it is 70% rural, hence agriculture is very important.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 277

IsiZulu:

Siyaqonda futhi ukuthi kuneprojekthi enye eyisilaha uHulumeni la efake khona imali eningi ...

English:

... R5 million and R8 million; R8 million for the rooms, butchery, cattle pants, water, waste, drainage etc.

IsiZulu:

Esithemba ukuthi lezi zimali zonke zizosetshenziswa kahle kodwa siqaphele okunye ukuthi, sike sakhuluma lana ngamalungelo okuthola amanzi, enye into ebanga ukuthi bengakwazi ukusebenza ...

English:

... is the lack of water rights, poor water quality, there is also transport issues and also project branding. And I believe that we have these skills within the department; rather than outsourcing them, we can use department officials so that we save the money and we use the officials to assist our people who

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 278

are in farming to brand, market and manage their product; and all the skills that are being insourced. The question of packaging their product is also an issue.

Electricity connections, there are a lot of frequent power outages, which means ...

IsiZulu:

... ukudla abakukhiqizayo kungabola ... [Akuzwakali.] bese-ke nemali yabo ...

English:

... is being stolen at some point; whereby you need the police to come in.

They also need some assistance in formal business training skills and there is persistent drought; but the work that they are doing is very good.

IsiZulu:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 279

Sisho futhi ukuthi mhlawumbe kungasiza ukuthi nabaholi bomdabu balekelele basize nabo ukuze bakwazi ukulima. Uma uya ezindabeni ezithinta abantu besifazane, kuyacaca ukuthi ...

English:

... they still need access to basic services such as water and electricity as well because there's very little that is done for women in farming; whereas women are good farmers. We once had a farmer of the year who was a woman. [Time Expired.] So, all these issues must therefore be taken into cognisance. We support the Report. Thank you very much.

Sepedi:

Mna M R SEMENYA: Modulasetulo wa Ngwako, re le ANC re thekga pego ye, re re ke tšeo di diragetšego ge re be re le kua Leboa-Bophirima. Ke nyaka go le botša gore go pego ya rena ga go na moo e lego gore Agrilite e reketše Zuma dikgomo. Ge e le gore mohl Steyn o na le ditaba ... motho yo mongwe le yo mongwe gonabjale ka gore re ya dikgethong, ge a nyaka go tutuetša dikgetho, o bolela tšeo e sego tša nnete. Ke nyaka go le botša

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 280

gore pego ya rena ga e na tšona tšeo. Se se lego gona ke gore re nyaka go tšea sebaka se re leboge Kabinete ge e ile ya romela Mme Nkosazana le ba bangwe go ya go thuša profense ya Leboa-Bophirima gore ditirelo di kgone go fihlelela batho.

Seo re nyakang go se bontšha ke gore ga se gore kua Leboa-Bophirima dilo di senyegile kudu; re na le Mme Lebone, yoo a filwego dihekthara, o bjala merogo o fepa setšhaba le mmaraka wa go na moo nageng. Gape re na le Katlego, o na le polasa kua Leboa-Bophirima, go na le dinku le dikolobe, o rekiša le peu. Re na le Katlego gape yo mongwe woo a lemang, ebile o rekiša mabele a gage mošwamawatle. Ke yo mongwe yoo a thopilego sefoka sa go ba Rapolasa wa Moswa wa Ngwaga ngwaga wo o fetilego. Bjale, ga se gore dilo di senyegile go ya ka mokgwa woo DA e di hlagišago ka gona. Ke nyaka gore go batho ba Afrika-Borwa, le tseba mo ANC e tšwago gona le lena. [Tsenoganong.]

English:

... ANC will travel this journey with you, we'll correct the mistakes and we'll do better than before because ...

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 281

Sepedi: 1

Maabane go ka se swane le mamohla, ebile mamohla go ka se swane le gosasa. Mokgatlo wa ANC ke wona tsela, le nnete, le bophelo. Re thekga pego. [Tsenoganong.]

The Deputy Chief Whip of the Majority Party moved: That the Reports be adopted.

Motion agreed to.

Report of Portfolio Committee on Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries on Oversight visit to North West Province from 10 - 15 September 2017 accordingly adopted.

Report of Portfolio Committee on Women in the Presidency on Oversight visit to North West Province from 10 - 15 September 2017 accordingly adopted.

THE UNTIMELY DEATH OF THE ANC FORMER PROVINCIAL SECRETARY, MR

NDLELENI MOSES DUMA

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 282

(Draft Resolution)

Mr M WOLMERANS: Chairperson, I move without notice:

That the House -

- (1) notes with sadness the untimely death of the former provincial secretary of the ANC in the North West, Mr Ndleleni Moses Duma, who died on Friday, 23 November 2018, after a long illness;
- (2) remembers that the 60-year-old Duma known as Prof was a selfless leader whose integrity stood the test of time during the mass mobilisation and underground operations to fight against racial segregation and oppression;
- (3) further remembers that he became the first provincial secretary of the ANC in the North West Province between 1994 to 1998;

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 283

- (4) recognises that he was a selfless and resilient leader who served the province of the North West with diligence and great distinction;
- (5) recalls that Duma served the provincial government in different capacities, including MEC for agriculture between 2004 and 2006, and sport, arts and culture between 2006 and 2009;
- (6) further recalls that he was later deployed to the National Assembly where he was a Member of Parliament from 2009 to 2014;
- (7) understands that at the time of his passing, Duma was a member of the North West Provincial Legislature; and
- (8) conveys our deepest condolences to the Duma family, friends and comrades during this difficult time.

Agreed to.

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 284

REPORT BY FORMER MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY ON PROBING VIOLENCE
AGAINST FOREIGN NATIONALS IN NOVEMBER 2015

(Draft Resolution)

Mr R W T CHANCE: Chairperson, I move without notice:

That the House -

- (1) notes that the former Minister in the Presidency, Mr Jeff Radebe, reported to Parliament's Ad Hoc Committee on Probing Violence Against Foreign Nationals in November 2015 that the Inter-Ministerial Committee on Migration estimated that there were between five and six million documented and undocumented foreign nationals in South Africa, which constitutes 10% of the population;
- (2) further notes that studies by the Sustainable Livelihoods Foundation found that up to 75% of spaza

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 285

shops in Delft in Cape Town and Ivory Park in Johannesburg were owned or run by foreign nationals;

- (3) recognises that the retail sector in our townships and rural areas has been dramatically affected as a result, leading to anger and resentment among former South African spaza shop owners;
- (4) acknowledges the periodic outbreaks of violence against foreign nationals since 2008 resulting from this anger, most recently in Soweto in August this year; and
- (5) calls upon government to accelerate the plan of action outlined in the Ad Hoc Committee's final report which includes securing our borders, professionalising our police service and improving access to jobs and small business development, so that long-term solutions can be found that eliminate outbreaks of violence and lead to a thriving locally owned retail sector once again.

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 286

Agreed to.

THE KILLING OF CHARLTON KARUWERUWE INSIDE A SCHOOL TOILET

(Draft Resolution)

Ms J V BASSON: Chairperson, I move without notice:

That the House -

- (1) notes with great shock the killing of Charlton Karuweruwe, a Grade 1 pupil, who was stabbed to death inside a school toilet in Makapanstad, North West on Wednesday, 21 November 2018;
- (2) further notes that Charlton was allegedly stabbed multiple times by a Grade 11 pupil from Mankala Technical High School;

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 287

- (3) acknowledges that it is alleged the suspect had apparently slept in the toilet overnight without anyone knowing he was there;
- (4) further acknowledges that it is also reported that the deceased was one of the first to go to the toilet in the morning and the Grade 11 learner allegedly repeatedly stabbed him;
- (5) understands that the deceased was then rushed to the local clinic where he was later certified dead;
- (6) supports fully the police investigation into the circumstances of this horrific murder to ascertain the reasons behind the murder;
- (7) thanks the principal of the school for the bravery in managing the apprehension of the perpetrator. I thank you, Chairperson. [Time expired.]

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 288

Agreed to.

**BANYANA BANYANA WINNING SEMI-FINALS MATCH OF THE AFRICAN WOMEN
CUP OF NATIONS**

(Draft Resolution)

Ms L L VAN DER MERWE: Chairperson, I move without notice:

That the House -

- (1) congratulates the SA women's national soccer team, Banyana Banyana, for winning their semi-final match at the 2018 African Women's championship in Ghana on Tuesday evening, 27 November 2018;
- (2) notes that the 2-nil victory over Mali was a historic victory as it ensured that Banyana Banyana qualified for the very first time, for the FIFA Women's World Cup which will take place in France next year;

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 289

- (3) further notes that the national team is set to play in the 2018 African Women's championship final against Nigeria on Saturday, 1 December 2018;
- (4) recognises the sterling performances of all team members that led to Banyana Banyana's victory, while especially appreciating the leadership and dedication of their coach and captain;
- (5) calls on the Department of Sports to urgently review its support to the women's team including the salaries of players which requires urgent attention; and
- (6) wishes the national team all the best with their upcoming matches and calling on the nation to rally in support behind them. I so move.

Agreed to.

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 290

KPMG GIVING SOTHERN AFRICAN DEVELOPMENT COMMUNITY PARLIAMENTARY
FORUM IN ANGOLA THE SEXUAL AND REPRODUCTIVE HEALTH AND HIV AND
AIDS GOVERNANCE PROGRAMME AN UNQUALIFIED AUDIT OPINION

(Draft Resolution)

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Chairperson, I move without notice:

That the House -

(1) notes that at the plenary assembly of the Southern African Development Community Parliamentary Forum, SADC PF, in Angola, it was reported that KPMG had given the Sexual and Reproductive Health Rights, SRHR, programme, a clean Bill of Health an unqualified audit opinion;

(2) further notes that:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 291

- (a) months earlier, the very same KPMG, conducting an independent audit of the project, provided a damning report;
- (b) the former chairperson of the committee, requested a copy of the KPMG report which the researcher Natalie Leibrandt either failed, neglected or refused to provide;
- (c) the division manager Mr Sithole, who is allegedly not qualified to be in his current position, blocked the release of the KPMG report;
- (d) the attempts to obtain the unqualified audit opinion has also not been provided despite numerous requests;
- (e) the former Secretary-General who agreed to a forensic audit was thereafter suspended with immediate effect in an unlawful manner, without following due process, resulting in hundreds of thousands of rands in wasteful expenditure being paid to him in a settlement agreement;

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 292

- (f) an attempt was made to file a motion calling for a forensic audit, however, this again was stopped by the researcher, Natalie Leibrandt, and Mr Sithole;
- (g) despite a policy in place to ensure employment of staff on rotational basis many countries are marginalised;
- (h) despite a maximum of two terms for employees this undertaking is ignored;
- (i) attempts were made to table a motion on oversight and this was rejected; and
- (j) at the plenary assembly member states were levelling accusations at each other, accusing each other of benefiting unduly from this project;

(3) acknowledges that various attempts were made to address the challenges;

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 293

calls on the South African government through the relevant structures to intervene and investigate the above matters. [Time expired.]

Agreed to.

**THE BARBARIC ATTACK ON THREE DOCTORS IN THEIR HOSPITAL RESIDENCE
IN LETABA HOSPITAL IN TZANEEN, LIMPOPO**

(Draft Resolution)

Mr D MNGUNI: Chairperson, I move without notice:

That the House -

- (1) condemns in the strongest possible terms the barbaric attack on three doctors in their hospital residence in Letaba Hospital in Tzaneen, Limpopo, on Thursday, 22 November 2018;

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 294

- (2) notes that a group of about five heavily armed men broke into the doctors' quarters in the early hours of Thursday, shot two doctors and stabbed the third one;
- (3) understands that the doctors are currently receiving treatment at the hospital;
- (4) recalls that several incidents of robberies where doctors were targeted, have previously been reported at other hospitals in the province;
- (5) views the attacks on our medical professionals as a declaration of war on the state and the citizens of the republic;
- (6) calls on law enforcement agencies to ensure that those behind the attacks are apprehended and brought to justice; and

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 295

(7) wishes the injured doctors a speedy recovery. I so
move.

Agreed to.

**INNER-CITY SCHOOLS DESPERATE FOR INSPIRATION, LEADERSHIP AND
LOVE FROM THEIR TEACHERS**

(Draft Resolution)

Mr M BAGRAIM: Chairperson, I move without notice:

That the House -

(1) notes that many of our inner-city schools are desperate
for inspiration, leadership and love from their
teachers;

(2) further notes that Ms Caroline Green, known as Mrs
Butterfly at a larger inner-city co-ed government

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 296

school in Hillbrow, Johannesburg, has been that inspirational teacher and has made her mark on many of the students who had to live through violence, poverty, absentee fathers, gangsterism, to name a few social ills;

- (3) recognise that the motivational programme inaugurated by Ms Caroline Green which became known as the Butterfly Movement enabled students to embrace their own belovedness, in order to make positive and lasting changes in their lives;
- (4) further recognises that the Butterfly workshops were started, and the schools served as a cocoon and a nurturing space in which the students could gradually transform into butterflies;
- (5) congratulates Ms Green on her book, *the Butterfly Moments*, which documents some of the success stories

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 297

and encouraging encounters of the Butterfly Movement;
and

- (6) applauds and encourages dedicated teaching staff who has an enormous positive influence on their students, such as Ms Green.

Agreed to.

PRAVIN GORDHAN RECEIVING DOCTORATE FROM HENLEY BUSINESS SCHOOL

(Draft Resolution)

Dr P MAESELA: House Chair, the ANC moves without notice:

That the House –

- (1) notes that Minister of Public Enterprises, Pravin Gordhan, has been conferred with an honorary doctorate of Business Administration degree by the University of

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 298

Reading's Henley School of Business on Thursday, 23 November 2018;

- (2) further notes that the degree was conferred on the Minister at the school's annual graduation ceremony held at the Theatre on the Track, Kyalami in Johannesburg;
- (3) remembers that Henley honoured Gordhan with a doctorate for all of the great, brave and selfless work he is doing for South Africa;
- (4) understands that Minister Gordhan became the first South African to ever receive an honorary doctorate from the University of Reading's Henley Business School; and
- (5) congratulates Minister Gordhan on receiving such a prestigious award.

Agreed to.

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 299

DEATH OF REVERAND CHRIS VESSELS

(Draft Resolution)

Ms N P KHUNOU: House Chairperson, the ANC moves without notice:

That the House –

- (1) notes with sadness the death of the struggle veteran and former political prisoner, Reverend Chris Wessels, on Tuesday, 13 November 2018, after succumbing to pancreatic cancer;
- (2) understands that 83 year old Wessels believed in justice and righteousness in all spheres of life and dedicated himself to the upliftment of the poor and marginalised and the dismantling of the evil system of apartheid under which many people suffered;

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 300

- (3) recognises that his fight against apartheid injustices and involvement in the black consciousness movement landed him in prison a few times;
- (4) remembers that in the middle of the Soweto uprisings in 1976 he wrote about ten proposals to the government, and one prominent proposal probably angered the system the most and had him imprisoned;
- (5) recalls that Rev Wessels travelled throughout the world looking for bursaries and study opportunities for many young South Africans before and after the 1976 student uprisings;
- (6) acknowledges that he lectured at the Moravian Theological Seminary and retired in January 2000 after 30 years of dedicated service, but continued serving part time at congregations; and

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 301

- (7) conveys its deepest condolences to his wife, his children, grandchildren and the entire Wessels family.

Agreed to.

INTERNATIONAL DAY OF SOLIDARITY WITH THE PALESTINIAN PEOPLE

(Draft Resolution)

Mr P J MNGUNI: House Chairperson, the ANC moves without notice:

That the House –

- (1) notes that in 1977, the United Nations General Assembly called for the annual observance of 29 November as the International Day of Solidarity with the Palestinian People;

- (2) remembers that the Palestinian people live primarily in the Palestinian territory occupied by Israel since 1967,

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 302

including East Jerusalem, in Israel, in neighboring Arab States, and in refugee camps in the region;

(3) recalls that this day provides an opportunity for the international community to focus its attention on the fact that the question of Palestine remains unresolved and that the Palestinian people have yet to attain their inalienable rights as defined by the General Assembly such as the right to self-determination without external interference;

(4) acknowledges that the parliamentarians from the Palestine Parliament particularly from Hamas, is currently here in South Africa for a week long visit to thank the South African government and the people of South Africa for playing a leading role in international solidarity with the Palestinian people;

(5) further acknowledges that the peoples of Africa and the Palestinian people share an experience of struggle

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 303

against tyranny colonialism, including settler colonialism and apartheid; and

- (6) calls on governments and member states to support and highlight the observance of this Day of Solidarity with the Palestinians

Agreed to.

GRADE SIX PUPIL, MAURICE BOTHA, SECURES A SEAT TO COMPETE AS PART OF THE NATIONAL SPELLING BEE TEAM IN THE ANNUAL AFRICAN SPELLING CHAMPIONSHIP

(Draft Resolution)

Dr M J FIGG: House Chairperson, I hereby move without notice:

That this House –

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 304

- (1) notes that Jeffreys Bay learner, Maurice Botha, secured a seat to compete as part of the National Spelling Bee team in the annual African Spelling Championship hosted in Kenya;
- (2) further notes that the Pellrus Primary School Grade 6 pupil won last year's Spelling Bee while in Grade 5;
- (3) also noted that the competition will see the 11 year old Afrikaans home language speaker pitted against the best spellers from seventeen other African countries;
- (4) acknowledges that Maurice is the only Eastern Cape pupil in the six man South African team;
- (5) also acknowledges that coming from an area that is plagued by social, moral and financial challenges, Maurice Botha is still able to exceed all expectations and is the first pupil in the school's history to compete at an international level; and

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 305

(6) wishes him well as he competes for the Grand Prize of R280 000.

Agreed to.

**APHIWE DYANTYI NAMED THE 2018 WORLD RUGBY BREAKTHROUGH PLAYER OF
THE YEAR**

(Draft Resolution)

Mr S M RALEGOMA: House Chairperson, I hereby move without notice:

That the House –

(1) notes that the Springbok and Lions wing, Aphiwe Dyantyi, was named the 2018 World Rugby Breakthrough Player of the Year in Monaco on Sunday, 25 November 2018;

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 306

- (2) understands that Aphiwe beat Ireland wing, Jordan Larmour and New Zealand prop, Karl Tu'inukuafe, to receive the award;
- (3) further understands that the 24 year old became the first South African to win this prestigious award for players in their debut international season;
- (4) recalls that Dyantyi scored six tries in his first eight tests for the Boks - including two in the famous win against the All Blacks in Wellington and finished his debut season with 13 caps this year;
- (5) recognises that Aphiwe has been sensational since making the step up to senior provincial rugby and after a superb debut season for the Emirates Lions in Vodacom Super Rugby, he was deservedly called up to the Springbok squad;

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 307

(6) remembers that he finished as the joint top try-scorer in the Castle Lager Rugby Championship, which is a wonderful achievement for a rookie test player; and

(7) congratulates Aphiwe Dyantyi for picking up the World Rugby Breakthrough Player of the Year 2018 award.

Agreed to.

ANC EMERGED VICTORIOUS IN BY-ELECTIONS

(Member's Statement)

Ms M L DUNJWA (ANC): Hon House Chair, the African National Congress welcomes the results of the by-elections held in the Eastern Cape, Free State and the Western Cape on 21 November 2018. In the Eastern Cape retained Ward 4, 6 and 7 in Great Kei Municipality. The African National Congress stood firm against the challenges of former ANC councillors who stood as independents as the ruling party comfortably held all three

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 308

wards. The ANC retained these wards with a big margin especially in Ward 4 where the ANC received 87% against 21% of the independent candidate and 1% of the EFF.

The results are once again a confirmation that the ANC remains the people's movement. We thank our communities for the show of confidence in the African National Congress, come 2019. The ANC sincerely congratulates the ANC volunteers and supporters of the movement for this overwhelming success. We equally wish the newly elected three councillors in all wards and knowing that their responsibility is to serve and put the people of South Africa at the centre of our project of the radical socioeconomic transformation. Thank you. [Applause.]

FIREARMS TO PRIVATE ARMIES

(Member's Statement)

Mr Z N MBHELE (DA): Hon House Chair, it is sad that the skill of a great illusionist is providing a compelling distraction - the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 309

loud of the noise and the more shocking the controversy the more effective. Therefore, there is no surprise that those like the EFF who have little more to offer than the illusion of being revolutionaries have consistently taken to offering that a rolling programme of dog and pony shows to the media, public and to this Parliament from the use of camouflage and other military gear to the display of firearms by private army and firing automatic weapons that rallies to the use of labels like commander in chief and fighters, the pseudo-military revolution will simply reveal the facetious threat to democracy that they are.

All the ingredients of a deadly political cocktail are there: radicalism, authoritarianism, ultranationalism, suppression of and intolerance for opposition as well as a strong regimentation of society for the purpose of picking out scapegoats. This is a cocktail that is dangerous for freedom and dangerous for democracy. It is a cocktail that our country must not be tempted to drink but must be dealt with as it should, pour down the drain into the gutter. I thank you. [Applause.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 310

SIGNING OF HISTORIC NATIONAL MINIMUM WAGE INTO LAW

(Member's Statement)

Mr B L MASHILE (ANC): The African National Congress welcomes the signing of the historic National Minimum Wage Bill into law. We are pleased that in our statutes, we have a piece of legislation that protects our workers from scrupulous and predatory employers who work our people for no meaningful wages. This law will advance economic development and social justice by improving the wage of lowest paid worker, protecting workers from unreasonably low wages, preserving the value of the national minimum wage, promoting collective bargaining and supporting economic policy.

The law also establishes the National Minimum Wage Commission that is tasked to review the national minimum wage annually and make recommendations to the Minister of Labour on any adjustment of the national minimum wage. The law also provide for exemptions that must be done in a prescribed format. Such

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 311

exemptions may be grant offer convincing substantive proof of incapacity of the employer to pay the national minimum wage. We as ANC are pleased that the era of slave wages is gone. No more poverty wages to the workers of Mzansi. I thank you.

FAITH-BASED GATHERING

(Member's Statement)

Ms S J NKOMO (IFP): Hon Chairperson, on Sunday 25 November 2018, the country observed the annual National Day of Prayer for all South Africans. The First National Bank, FNB, Stadium in Gauteng was the venue where the event was held which was hosted by the Motsepe Foundation. Thirty plus religious and faith-based organisations are signatories and were all taking place or actually were assembled for the second time this year in the 2018.

Over a 100 000 people were in attendance and the number of routes around the stadium were closed to traffic because of the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 312

event. This day was reserved to pray for a variety of issues that occurred in our country. This actually included a few areas which are the following: there was a prayer for the elections in our country which will be happening next year and it was attended by leaders of government who were there. It was business leaders. It was traditional leaders. It was members of political parties and community-based organisations who were gathered together for a day of prayer, for peace of our elections, for the eradication of poverty and unemployment and the eradication of corruption. We thank the Motsepe Foundation. Thank you, Madam. [Time expired.]

UNABRIDGED BIRTH CERTIFICATES CONSENT

(Member's Statement)

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM (NFP): Hon House Chair, the National Freedom Party expresses concern on the impact of tourism to the country including challenges faced by travellers out of South Africa. As a result of the confusion around the unabridged birth

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 313

certificates consent by both parents even though in many cases both parents do not live together and having met each other or seen each other for many, many years. Despite affidavit being provided by a single parent, the department still either refuses or not willing to assist in ensuring that these travellers are able to enter the country and or leave the country. I'm talking about the South African visitors, a South African that wants to travel overseas.

The added to this problem is the fact that at the ports of entry they appear to be confusion with the officials who do not understand exactly what the requirements are. Now, we do know that at some stage the Minister said that he only asked them to enforce this if there were suspicious that something was wrong. However, this message has not been cascaded to different officials and different ports of entry which is creating great difficulty for tourism and for travellers that are leaving the country.

EFF ATTACK ON MINISTER PRAVIN GORDHAN

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 314

(Member's Statement)

Mr P J MNGUNI (ANC): House Chair, the desperation by the EFF to tarnish the name and character of the hon Minister Gordhan is because they fear his decisive tackling of corruption and looting of the public purse in SOEs and SARS, will uncover the truth about those implicated, including them. They have lied about the bank account he allegedly holds in Canada. As a South African citizen, he cannot open a Canadian bank account. They have no evidence to back up this untruth.

By concocting and parading untruths about him and his family, they appear under threat and their fabrications have been uncovered by an investigation by News24. His daughter, Anisha, was accused of being awarded contracts through her companies which she was at some point a director. Again, it took News24 to establish that these claims have no basis.

They have accused him of being at the centre of state capture, but we still await them to take their evidence and present them,

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 315

under oath, before the State Capture Inquiry. The Zondo Commission is waiting for that evidence. The EFF must be seen for what it is - a party which will go to extreme lengths to defend themselves and other characters involved in looting and corruption while crudely applying a distorted version of the ideology founded by the likes of the classical fathers, like Marx, Lenin, Engels, Fanon, Mao and other great revolutionaries. We so move.

JUBILATION AS 1 800 SOSHANGUVE RESIDENTS RECEIVE TITLE DEEDS

(Member's Statement)

Mr X MABASA (ANC): House Chair, jubilation as 1 800 Soshanguve residents receive title deeds. The ANC aims to issue title deeds to every house and eradicate squatter settlement. We are working hard to speed up the transfer of ownership of homes to millions of our poor people.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 316

One thousand eight hundred beneficiaries from Soshanguve Extension 5, 6 and 7 received their title deeds on Friday, 23 November 2018. There were scenes of jubilation at the Soshanguve Extension 7 sports grounds where residents were handed title deeds by the Gauteng Premier, David Makhura, as part of the programme to restore dignity to the people.

The ANC thanks the Department of Human Settlement for ensuring the residents realize that they are an important part of the developmental project and they now have proof that they are the real owners.

By not having title deeds in place, people are denied the opportunity to participate in the property market. The ANC encourages residents not to sell their homes no matter how difficult the challenges they face as this is a long-term investment for generations to come. I thank you.

AUDITOR-GENERAL CONFIRMS WESTERN CAPE AS CLEANEST GOVERNMENT

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 317

(Member's Statement)

Mr R T HUGO (DA): Once again, the DA-led Western Cape government has received the highest number of clean audits in South Africa ... [Applause.] ... in 2018-19 across all entities and departments, with 83% clean audit outcomes achieved. Eleven out of 13 provincial departments received clean audits overall; and 12 out of 13 received an unqualified opinion.

This compares to the next closest province, Gauteng, which trails far behind at 52%. This is bad news for the people of Gauteng and great news for the people of the Western Cape as there's a direct link between the DA's brand of good governance and the quality of services delivery to our people.

In 2009, under the ANC and their New National Party alliance partners, not one department in the Western Cape had a clean audit. Since then, under a DA government, good governance and accountability to the people of the Western Cape has been entrenched.

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 318

For the last five years, the Western Cape has also consistently come out as the top financial performer according to the Presidency's Performance Management Assessment Tool.

The Auditor-General has confirmed something we all know - the Western Cape runs the cleanest provincial government in South Africa. Come 2019, we look forward to extending the DA's brand. Thank you. [Applause.]

**DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION ANNOUNCE THAT
WORK EXPERIENCE NO LONGER A RECRUITMENT REQUIREMENT**

(Member's Statement)

Ms L D MESO (ANC): House Chair, the ANC applauds the announcement by the Department of Public Service and Administration that as from 01 April 2019, work experience will no longer be a requirement for recruitment for entry-level jobs in the public sector and views this commitment as a step in

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 319

the right direction with regard to alleviating the youth unemployment, particularly that of the jobless graduates.

This initiative is part of the ANC government's effort to address the country's high youth unemployment rate. By removing unnecessary barriers for entry into the public service as well as providing a platform for new graduates to acquire the required experience in their chosen careers.

Further, this will bring and attract new innovative blood into the public service that will enhance the government's human resource development capacity. This illustrates that the ANC government is a caring government, which listens to the problems and challenges facing young people and is tirelessly working very hard to address high levels of youth unemployment.

This effort is one amongst many that the government has initiated to alleviate youth unemployment. I thank you.

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 320

DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION ANNOUNCE THAT
WORK EXPERIENCE NO LONGER A RECRUITMENT REQUIREMENT

(Member's Statement)

Ms M L DUNJWA (ANC): House Chair, the ANC applauds the announcement by the Department of Public Service and Administration that as from 01 April 2019, work experience will no longer be a requirement for recruitment for entry-level jobs in the public sector and views the this commitment as a step in the right direction with regard to alleviating the plight of youth unemployment, particularly ... [Interjections.]

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: On a point of order. I have a bad case of déjà vu. I am sure we have just heard we have just heard that member's statement.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon member, that statement has already been read. Thank you. [Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 321

NEW PRESIDENT OF INTERPOL

(Member's Statement)

Ms D KOHLER (DA): Some of us in this Chamber lived through the terrible Jackie Selebi era - the man South Africa trusted enough to make our National Police Commissioner and who brought such pride when he was elected President of the Interpol.

This was the man who, in 2008, was put on fully paid extended leave and who resigned as President of Interpol after being found guilty of corruption and sentenced to 15 years.

He served just a few months before being released on Schabir shaky grounds. He died five years later not having paid taxpayers' a single cent of the R17,4 million we forked out only to find him guilty.

The shame brought to the SAPS by these events was inordinate, but a week ago we had the chance to shine again. Our contender

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 322

for Interpol President looked to be a shoe-in. Brigadier Anbuen Scott Naidoo, retired, was nominated at the 87th general assembly. Only two others were nominated from Russia and South Korea.

Today, we should be basking in the glory of having a new SA President of the Interpol but our candidate was withdrawn. Instead, South Africa backed the controversial Russian candidate and alleged former Komitet Gosudarstvennoy Bezopasnosti, KGB, agent, Alexander Prokopchuk and lost.

Who took this dodgy decision Minister? Who ditched a South African in favour of a dodgy Russian? Is it a coincidence that this decision was taken as our Deputy President, who wasn't sick but was on sick leave in Russia? What did we get out of this dodgy deal? [Time expired.]

PRIVATE COMPANY REPLACES EASTERN CAPE VILLAGE SCHOOL'S THREE PIT

LATRINES WITH 16 TOILETS

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 323

(Member's Statement)

Mr I A PIKININI (ANC): House Chair, the ANC would like to thank the private company, Amalooloo, for joining hands with the Department of Basic Education and its donated 16 toilets to pupils of Mfunalwazi Primary School in Ncera Village during Toilet Day, on Monday, 19 November 2018. The new toilets include six for girls, six for boys and four for teachers.

The toilets are eco-friendly and use a compost system with a tank behind them for pupils to wash their hands. Other schools have benefited from this company through partnership collaboration and participated in the Sanitation Appropriate for Education campaign launched by President Cyril Ramaphosa in August 2018. We commend the private company, Amalooloo, for heeding President Cyril Ramaphosa's call for partnership with the private sector and the government as part of the Thuma Mina campaign. Thank you very much.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 324

(Minister's Response)

The MINISTER OF TOURISM: Hon House Chairperson, I want to respond to the points about the birth certificates and the requirement for travelling minors to carry documents with him as it currently stands. The good news is that the revised regulations were gazetted yesterday and will take effect from Saturday 01 December and they are considerably changes to the situation that prevailed before. Firstly, if two parents are travelling with a child, no documentation will be required at all; secondly, a single parent or one parent or a guardian or another adult travelling with a child may be required to prove the relationship between the travelling adult and the child. That will take the form of producing an Identity Document, ID. It will be a copy of an ID and it will not have to be a naturalised copy and would not have to be an affidavit. It will be an easy document to carry but that would only be required in the events that there are grounds for suspicion.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 325

In the event that there are still grounds for suspicion, the immigration officer may require other documents. In other words, if there is something untoward or something arouses suspicion a letter of concern from the other parent or a legal guardian may be required. At the end of the day, if the travelling adult with the minor is unable to prove that relationship because of the missing documentation, then they will still be given 24 hours to obtain that documentation. So, it is a considerable shift from where we were before and this will apply to people travelling from Visa exempt countries, of course. Those applying for Visas from Visa requiring countries will still have to produce the documentation. The real agony was in our biggest source markets, ie, Germany, United Kingdom, USA and Canada. [Time expired.]

PRIVATE COMPANY REPLACES EASTERN CAPE VILLAGE SCHOOL'S THREE PIT

LATRINES WITH 16 TOILETS

JUBILATION AS 1 800 SOSHANGUVE RESIDENTS RECEIVE TITLE DEEDS

NEW PRESIDENT OF INTERPOL

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 326

(Minister's Response)

The MINISTER OF SMALL BUSINESS DEVELOPMENT (ON BEHALF OF THE MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION): Hon House Chair, I was requested by the Minister Basic Education to respond to the issue of the company that donated the toilets. She requested me to thank the company and also to indicate that we need more of the big companies to respond to the call by President Cyril Ramaphosa which he made in August 2018.

The second issue also relates to the member's statement by hon Mabasa in relation to the title deeds. The issue here is to really sincerely thank our government but to make a call on the citizens not only to protect those houses but also to make sure that government assist them to bring development in those communities that live around those houses. Lastly, House Chairperson ...

Russian:

Это вообще кошмар ... [It is a complete nightmare ...]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 327

English:

... that today we sit and listen to people talking about somebody that they do not even know, Comrade Jackie Selebi, who is resting in peace.

Russian:

Я вообще не понимаю как ... [I really do not understand how ...]

English:

These people who are so afraid of Russians ...

Russian:

Это вообще кошмар ... [It is a complete nightmare ...]

English:

I will call it "koshmar". That is what the Russians would say to me - "koshmar". [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr R T Frolick): Order, hon members! Calm down. Calm down please.

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 328

DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION ANNOUNCE THAT
WORK EXPERIENCE NO LONGER A RECRUITMENT REQUIREMENT

EFF ATTACK ON MINISTER PRAVIN GORDHAN

AUDITOR-GENERAL CONFIRMS WESTERN CAPE AS CLEANEST GOVERNMENT

(Minister's Response)

The MINISTER OF HIGHER EDUCATION AND TRAINING (ON BEHALF OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION): Hon House Chairperson, we welcome the decision announced by the Minister Public Service and Administration responding to the call of young people in our country that the entry level posts requirements which relate to work experience should be reconsidered by government. We believe that the announcement is indeed going to be attended to and that the requisite Public Service Regulations are going to be amended in order to allow for qualifications to be appropriately stipulated and to create opportunities for young people to enter the public service. This is indeed an important decision by the government which should be welcomed. [Applause.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 329

We also welcome the statement made by the hon Mbele, although it did surprise us given the relationship. Nevertheless, we do note that there is trouble in paradise. We would support hon Mnguni in that the aspersions that have been cast against Minister Gordhan are totally unwarranted and without any substance. We are aware that the first refugee of a scoundrel is insults and that is exactly what is happening.

Finally, we certainly are committed as government to working hard to ensure that more of all our spheres achieve improved our audit outcomes and that is something that Parliament should support all departments on. We should not just limit ourselves to looking at one aspect of government. I think it should be a priority for South Africa that all public resources are properly accounted for and utilised for the purpose to which they are directed. Thank you very much. [Applause.]

ANC EMERGED VICTORIOUS IN BY-ELECTIONS

NEW PRESIDENT OF INTERPOL

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 330

AUDITOR-GENERAL CONFIRMS WESTERN CAPE AS CLEANEST GOVERNMENT

(Minister's Response)

The MINISTER OF WATER AND SANITATION: Hon House Chair...

IsiXhosa:

... i-ANC iyasetyenzelwa. Iphulo u-Thuma Mina liyasebenza kwaye abantu boMzantsi Afrika bayayazi ukuba i-ANC ngumbutho wabo. Ngoku i-ANC ibuyele ebantwini ngo-Thuma Mina kwaye abantu babonakalisile ukuba bayayithanda i-ANC. Abantu bathi bayiqhele ngolu hlobo lulungileyo i-ANC kwaye ngowama-2019 kuza kubanjalo. Baza kudana naba babane besithi baza kuphatha. Baza kuphatha phi?

Kukho iLungu lePalamente elihloniphekileyo, uKohler Barnard...

English:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 331

... attacks a person who long departed in this world.

[Interjections.] It is shameful and does not deserve any substantive response. It is just shameful.

IsiXhosa:

Asikhonjalo thina kwaye ayibobuntu ukuhlasela umntu owabhubhayo.

[Kwaqhwytywa.]

English:

Why would we be surprised when the Western Cape, the last outpost of racial privilege in this country receives most of the clean audits? Why should we be surprised?

IsiXhosa:

Iphondo laseNtshona Koloni lilawulwa yi-DA esenababantu babefundiswe ezikolweni ukodlula abanye abantu kwaye uninzi lwabo lwaabalekela apha eKapa. Balapha ngoku. [Kwaqhwytywa.]

SIGNING OF HISTORIC NATIONAL MINIMUM WAGE INTO LAW

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 332

**DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION ANNOUNCE THAT
WORK EXPERIENCE NO LONGER A RECRUITMENT REQUIREMENT**

(Minister's Response)

The MINISTER OF LABOUR: Hon House Chairperson, I would like to thank hon Mashile for raising the issue that relates to the National Minimum Wage. I must also confess and commit that as the Department of Labour we are going to make sure that those who will be applying for exemption will submit the relevant documents particularly when it comes to unaffordability. At the same time, we have agreed at National Economic Development and Labour Council, Nedlac on the joint monitoring of the implementation of the National Minimum Wage. We also want to appeal to the workers that when the employer is saying that he or she is applying for the exemption the workers as well must submit the petition that agreed to that application by that employer so that we can be able to see whether the reality is that the employer cannot afford.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 333

In addition, I just want to clarify the confusion particularly because at the public there, there is an issue of the increase of the Sectoral Determination for Domestic Workers that that sectoral determination is dealing with the increase of a yearly basis and when the National Minimum Wage kicks in, the domestic workers will further get the increase as per the Sectoral Determination.

Hon House Chair, let me also say in terms of the work experience, to add on what hon Minister Pandor has said, I just want to remind the comrades that as the ANC there was a resolution that was taken at Nasrec. As the ANC we are proud to say that we implement our resolutions as the ANC because...

IsiXhosa:

... asinamona, asinanzondo kwaye sisebenzela abantu baseMzantsi Afrika.

English:

Thank you very much. [Applause.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 334

NOTICES OF MOTION

Mr B L MASHILE: Hon House Chair, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House, I shall move on behalf of the ANC:

That the House -

debates strengthening and supporting the government's interventions and initiatives aimed at addressing the increasing levels of poverty experienced by South Africans. I thank you.

MR G R KRUMBOCK: Hon House Chair, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House, I shall move on behalf of the DA:

That the House -

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 335

debates the disintegration of the built environment of the capital city in KwaZulu Natal- Msunduzi, particularly in respect to urban decay froth on the streets and that law enforcements of the bylaws of the city.

MS M L DUNJWA: Hon House Chair, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House, I shall move on behalf of the ANC:

That the House -

debates the development of an economic strategy and appropriately balance between meeting our developmental objectives as well as promoting inclusive growth. I so move.

MS L L VAN DER MERWE: Hon House Chair, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House, I shall move on behalf of the IFP:

That the House -

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 336

Debate the salaries and support to Banyana Banyana. I so move.

PROF N M KHUBISA: Hon House Chair, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House, I shall move on behalf of the NFP:

That the House -

deliberates on the challenges faced by consumers as a result of the sale and sharing of personal information to marketing companies and call centres.

MR F ADAMS: Hon House Chair, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House, I shall move on behalf of the ANC:

That the House -

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 337

debates accelerating and strengthening government's intervention to mitigate the impact of the drought in economic development and job creation. I so move.

MS C N MAJEKE: Hon House Chair, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House, I shall move on behalf of the UDM:

That the House -

debates the issues that negatively affect the commuter's access, infrastructure and availability of public transport. I so move.

MR C H H HUNSINGER: Hon House Chair, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House, I shall move on behalf of the DA:

That the House -

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 338

debates government's failure to create the enabling environment that maximizes freedom of trade in rural areas, to increase success of business and job creation in South Africa. I so move.

MR I A PIKININI Hon House Chair, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House, I shall move on behalf of the ANC:

That the House -

debates promoting local economic development particularly in centres where there is a great potential for localization and beneficiation. I thank you.

Ms E N N MOLEKANE: Hon House Chair, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House, I shall move on behalf of the ANC:

That the House -

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 339

Debates stimulating trade through adequate infrastructure and reliable, transparent practices and procedures. I thank you.

Xitsonga:

Nkul X MABASA: Mutshamaxitulu, ndzi hundzisa xitiviso xa leswaku eka siku ra ntshamo lowu landzelaka:

Yindlu yi va na njhekanjhekisano hi ku tumbuluxiwa na ku tiyisisiwa ka ndlela yo vika nandzu handle ko titivisa leswi swi nga ta va ndlela yo lwa na tihosi ta swidzidziharisi na swigevenga.

Ms J STEENKAMP: Hon House Chair, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House, I shall move on behalf of the DA:

That the House -

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 340

debates the 37.5% increase in elephant poaching, in the first and second quarters alone in the Kruger National Park. I thank you.

MR P J MNGUNI Hon House Chair, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House, I shall move on behalf of the ANC:

That the House -

debates the strengthening and capacitating of neighbourhood watch and Community Police Forums, CPFs, to continue working with law enforcement agencies to combat human trafficking and sex slavery. I so move.

The House adjourned at 20:35