

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 1

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

PROCEEDINGS OF THE NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

The House met at 14:03.

The Speaker took the Chair and requested members to observe a moment of silence for prayer or meditation.

The SPEAKER: Hon members, I wish to acknowledge the presence of the following veterans in the gallery; N R Langa, T Maduna, T Motshidi, W Ximba, R Selebogo, R Matlhomabe, N E Butsingi and E Muerane from ward 14 Protea North Soweto. You are welcome to our Parliament. [Applause.]

Question 31:

The DEPUTY PRESIDENT: Hon Speaker, I missed you. [Laughter.]

Hon members, I missed you too. [Laughter.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 2

Dr M Q NDLOZI: No, we didn't miss you; no ways. We are fine without you. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY PRESIDENT: Thank you very much. Hon Speaker, in April 2015, Cabinet mandated the development of a National Food and Nutrition Security Plan to address the challenges of hunger and malnutrition in our country. The proposed plan was also aimed at resolving the lack of co-ordination relating to existing food and nutrition intervention that we are making as government so that we ensure that there is greater impact on society.

Following that directive, the Integrated Food Security and Nutrition Coordinating Committee consisting of various departments, our social and development partners was established to co-ordinate the development of a plan. That plan was led by the Presidency and the Department of Planning Monitoring and Evaluation. The committee that was tasked worked tirelessly to develop a plan and completed it in November 2017. The President in his previous capacity as the Deputy President of the Republic approved the plan in December 2017.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 3

The Nutrition Security Plan then became our single coherent response for co-ordinating the various interventions that government and other stakeholders are making with the view of achieving securing in relation to food and nutrition in the country. It is a crucial instrument to help us in intensifying our efforts to eradicate hunger and ensure optimal food security and enhance nutritional status for all our people.

In addition, in establishing relevant co-ordinating structures at national; provincial and at district level, the plan also seek to amongst others, establish inclusive local food value chains that will support access to nutrition and affordable food. The plan also seeks to scale up high impact nutrition intervention targeting women, infants and children. Therefore for us as government, land reform is central in our vision of expanding agricultural production capacity to ensure that agriculture contributes significantly to economy growth and building a food secure nation.

A well managed land reform process will not only address the negative legacy of land dispossession; but will promote the entry of new players into the agricultural sector without

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 4

really disrupting existing production capabilities in the country. Land acquisition, restitution, redistribution, will undoubtedly unleash a massive potential of emerging black small holder and commercial farmers to contribute in enhancing production across a range of commodities.

As part of the stimulus package of agriculture; government will continue to invest in agriculture, infrastructure, and support farmers in unlocking production. Partnership with the private sector will be encouraged in attracting funding to augment government fiscal capacity. We will work closely with provinces in the implementation of projects that are aimed at accelerating agricultural production and ensuring that we focus on skills development and mentorship programmes for youth in agriculture.

As part of the work of the Inter-Ministerial Committee on Land Reform and Agriculture, unutilised and claimed government owned land will be released to expand access to land for agricultural production enterprise development as well as human settlement. Along side enhancing access to food for communities in need, the National Food and Nutrition and

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 5

Security Plan is also contributing towards the imperatives of job creation and economic development in our communities.

We therefore recognise the need for intensified efforts and we are working at improving certain areas in rollout of the food security programme. This includes the need to accelerate the number of additional produces, supplying food to established markets and increasing the rand value of food procured from small holder produces towards the target of spending 30% of the government food procurement budget. We will continue to work tirelessly to ensure that all our efforts towards eradicating hunger and poverty are well co-ordinated across government and are responsive to the needs of our people.

Thank you, hon Speaker. [Applause.]

Ms M R SEMENYA: Thank you Speaker and the Deputy President for the elaborative answer. Deputy President, given the fact that the food insecurity is prevalent in rural households that are predominantly female headed; what are the interventions that will be done to target rural women and children in so far as activities of the National Food and Nutrition Security Coordinating Committee? Thank you.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 6

The DEPUTY PRESIDENT: Hon Speaker, the first targeted intervention is to co-ordinate the efforts of government provincially and nationally; to support all upcoming farmers; women; youth and an open entry for women and youth to go into farming. As government; nationally and provincially, we must co-ordinate our efforts to support these upcoming farmers and allow new entry. And again as I have said, through our redistribution programme as government, we are prepared to make land available for those women and young people. Thank you very much.

Question 31 (Cont):

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Deputy President, there is a perception out there that the land reform process will have a negative impact on food security. What is your view in this and what mechanisms will you put in place as a security measure to ensure that these beneficiaries of land will ensure that it is productive?

The DEPUTY PRESIDENT: Hon Speaker, I think the President has, time and again, tried to allay fears; that this program, our land reform program, will be conducted in a manner that takes

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 7

care of the needs of the country. The President assured people that there won't be any land grab. And therefore, we view this land reform program, ourselves, as one instrument that would expand access, allow new entries into the sector, thereby increasing productivity.

But again beyond that, we are no longer going to be spectators as government, we are going to be ready with immediate support; we are going to create regional support centres, working together with provinces and municipalities so that our support to farmers is co-ordinated. The support will go up to giving all the necessary production input to these farmers, monitor them to a point where they become graduates as well as become commercial and they can stand on their own.

So, there should be no fears that we are going to collapse the production capacity of the country. In a situation where our economy is not doing well, it's not advisable to really destroy the little that is working; instead, you must enhance it. Thank you very much.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 8

Ms N R MASHABELA: Deputy President, the resolution of the land question is not merely about boosting production, it is in essence about redressing historical injustice, it is about recognising that white people have what they have today because they dispossessed and killed black people.

Deputy President, what do you think must be done to resolve this historical injustice, once and for all? Do you think it can be resolved through pleading and massaging the fears of white people? Thank you very much.

The DEPUTY PRESIDENT: Madam Speaker, the hon member has a point that, partly, this land reform process has at the centre of it aiming to redress the past imbalances. We are quite aware of our history, the history our country that land was dispossessed. We acknowledge that point; however, as a country we have chosen a route - ourselves - firstly, we said we must reconcile, we must build a nation - one nation - we recognise the diversity of our people.

Therefore, secondly, going forward we must respect those tenants that are enshrined in the Constitution, that we want

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 9

to build a nation. As much as we want to redress the past imbalances, we must not disrupt the reconciliation and the process of building a nation. Thank you very much. [Applause.]

Mr K P ROBERTSON: Hon Deputy President, while you were the Premier of Mpumalanga R30 million [Interjections.] was appropriated for the construction of agrihub in the Dr J S Moroka Municipality. Under your watch, R20 million was spent on what can only be described as an empty shower resembling a dilapidated doorless structure. Taking this into consideration, with the constant drain of the national fiscus by bloated and shady tenders such as this one; and the fact that we are facing a 92% failure rate on all state-initiated land reform projects and that we are possibly heading towards a Venezuelan-Zimbabwean style implosion due to your radical policies of expropriation without compensation.

Hon Leader of Government Business, what plans do you have in place that will undo the current status quo of land reform in South Africa and ensure that food security is sustained? Thank you. [Applause.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 10

Mr P J MNGUNI: On a point of order, Speaker. As the hon member who raised the question would be aware, Rule 142(6) provides that during question time there shall be no new questions as follow up questions. Therefore, the hon Deputy President may not be expected to answer the new question, new statistics, new facts; it would be unfair. Thank you. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Well, I'm advised hon member ... hon member, take your seat. That a member who is asking a question or a follow up question, has the right to first make some statement, so there's nothing wrong with that. I don't know whether it is in the number of points that he made because he actually just came with facts [Applause.] but Rule 142(5) does allow him to do that. Now, his question is actually whether the hon Deputy President has some plan.

The DEPUTY PRESIDENT: Hon Speaker, I'm aware that as government we have restituted land. We have restituted land to the people that have claimed the land. However, the claimants came in groups not as individuals, and therefore that resulted into a situation where the land that was claimed became unproductive.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 11

Probably as government we should try and close that gap to ensure that all claimants, all people who are given land are supported to till the land. Of course, not all people are claiming land for the sake of tilling the land.

It's important, again, to evaluate each and every claim that is made so that we protect food production; it's not acceptable for people to claim land and lie on the land and do nothing. We'll encourage people that are getting land either through restitution or redistribution, supported by government, to till the land.

The plan, like I'm saying that the committee that I'm chairing, currently is coordinating efforts of departments that are in possession of land to release the land firstly, to those that are in need of land. And of course, also, to recognise that there was land that was given to people that is lying fallow; we must get that land into production. So, the plan is to put these regional support centres that will comprise of all the spheres of government, that is: national, provincial and local.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 12

Remember, we can't leave local municipalities because everything happens in their spheres and they have local economic development plans. So, whatever we do, must speak to the local economic development plans of municipalities so that we enhance their economic growth strategies and in that way, also, assisting those who want to enter into farming to farm productively.

The missing link, therefore, was the support that was supposed to be given: institutional support, financial support and mentorship. Thank you very much.

Question 32:

The DEPUTY PRESIDENT: Hon Speaker, as a point of departure in answering this question: the Deputy Presiding has no direct responsibility for oversight of adherence of the executive to the Executive Ethics Code. This is not part of the responsibilities delegated to the Deputy President by the President.

Having said that, the Deputy President agrees to and regards adherence of members of the executive to the Executive

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 13

Members' Ethics Act, Act 82 of 1998, as well as to the Executive Ethics Code, as important in the promotion and upholding of good governance. In this regard, the executive arm of the state has been tirelessly working with this Parliament and the Public Protector to ensure that the injunctions of the Act are internalised and adhered to by the members of the executive.

The secretary of Cabinet, who is the registrar of the interests for members of the executive, has consistently introduced newly appointed members of the executive to the Executive Members' Ethics Act and the code as soon as they are appointed and sworn in. Members of the executive submit their financial declarations in a prescribed form within 60 days of appointment and annually by 31 May.

I am therefore informed that we have achieved a high level of compliance in the declaration of the executive members' interests. The Presidency has a team that focuses on monitoring and tracking submissions of declarations to ensure that members of the executive do not miss submission deadlines. The team sends reminders and co-ordinates the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 14

submissions of declaration forms. In all Ministries the Presidency has identified and trained officials that are tasked to assist executive members in preparing and submitting their forms.

Where transgressions have occurred, the Public Protector investigates and recommends remedial actions for implementation. We have adequate checks and balances that include available parliamentary mechanisms to enforce accountability. By the way, all members of the executive are Members of this Parliament before they become members of the executive, excluding the President.

Where a report on any executive member's misconduct has been submitted to this august House for consideration, it is incumbent upon members here to act in accordance with the Rules governing this House. Thank you very much.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker. It is great to see that your trip to "Dr Zhivago" has worked so well, Deputy President. [Laughter.] Deputy President, you are obliged anyway to uphold the law of the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 15

Republic. It was part of your oath of office, and the Executive Members' Ethics Act is a law of the Republic.

You would also know that section 2 of the Executive Members' Ethics Act was developed to ensure that there would be an avoidance of any conflict of interest. It specifically says that members of the Cabinet - and this includes the President - must not expose themselves to any situation involving the risk of a conflict of interest between their official duties and their personal interests; and, further, that they shouldn't act in a way that compromises the credibility or integrity of any office of government.

Deputy President, Bosasa is a company that has received hundreds of millions of rand of government contracts. And the recent revelations of their kickbacks, bribery and corruption operations have washed very, very deeply onto the government benches behind you. Through gifts, donations, sponsorships, property investments, travel benefits and, more recently, campaign donations at the highest level to politicians and their family members, they have sought to buy influence and government contracts. You must accept: It is a deep conflict

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 16

of interest for any member of the executive to accept a gift or such sponsorship from Bosasa.

As the Leader of Government Business, in light of the transparency and accountability you have proclaimed here today, have you satisfied yourself that every member of the Cabinet has declared any such benefits from Bosasa, including yourself, and, in the interests of transparency and accountability and because you keep such fastidious records, as you have said today, would you consider making those available to the House ... any such donations or benefits received by Bosasa? [Applause.] [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: The hon the Deputy Minister ...

The DEPUTY PRESIDENT: President ... Hon Speaker, you are speaking to me ...

The SPEAKER: The Deputy President, actually.

The DEPUTY PRESIDENT: Thank you. I thought you meant someone else. Thank you for that. In the matter relating to Bosasa and

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 17

the President, I think the President has answered ...

[Interjections.] ... you in this House, and I am sure if you want to pursue that question you can pursue it directly with the President. But as far as I am concerned, the President has answered. [Applause.] [Interjections.]

I've said ... you must go back to these two Acts. In the case of the national Cabinet, the person who is responsible ... all of us as Cabinet members sign these forms, we declare, we submit to the secretary of Cabinet who is a director-general in the Presidency. That is: we all submit to the President. We declare. In the case of a province, all the executive committee members declare and submit to the premier of the province through the secretary of the executive council, which is a director-general in the premier's office.

Now, those two are the custodians of all the declarations. I am also declaring to the President ... all of us are declaring. So, I don't see my role in, sort of, requesting those declarations. They can be requested of the person who is responsible, that is the President. Thank you very much.

[Applause.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 18

Mr B L MASHILE: Thank you, Speaker. Deputy President, the Executive Members' Ethics Act of 1998 was enacted to provide for a code of ethics governing the conduct of members of Cabinet, Deputy Ministers and provincial executive councils, and to provide for matters connected thereto. The code of ethics, among other things, provides for Cabinet members and Deputy Ministers to disclose their financial interests when assuming office and any financial interests acquired after their assumption of office.

Now, Deputy President, you may have covered this particular question in kind in your opening response, but I need you to make it clearer: If a member of the executive fails to comply with the disclosure of financial interests or any provision of the code, what corrective steps will the Office of the President take against such errant member? Thank you very much.

The DEPUTY PRESIDENT: Thank you very much. As I've said, the responsible person in this case is the President. The kind of corrective measures that will be taken if a member has failed to disclose up to the satisfaction level or has missed the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 19

deadline ... definitely there should be corrective measures. If possible, I can go back and find out and furnish that answer. Definitely, I would go back to the Office of the President, the director-general ... look at corrective measures that are put in place for anyone who has not disclosed accordingly. Thank you.

Mr N SINGH: Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Deputy President, this government's Moral Regeneration Movement has been around since first being introduced in 1998 by then President Nelson Mandela. When it was first announced, President Mandela spoke about it as a deterrent to corruption. Perhaps he was aware already at the time of certain factions within his own party that were conspiring for the genesis of the state capture apparatus that is so endemic and prolific in government today.

Now, hon Deputy President, morality is not something ascribed to; it goes deeper. It's an instilling of moral value systems. And, as patron of the Moral Regeneration Movement, what steps will you take - or get members of your executive to take - to instil this core set of values in children as part of early childhood development at school level? Thank you.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 20

The DEPUTY PRESIDENT: Thank you very much. I think as members of this House it is incumbent upon all of us to uphold good moral values; respect our responsibility as assigned by the people. You know that the day you enter this House. You make certain declarations and you are sworn in. You do this and this. Those things are not just mere formalities. They are very important and they should strike a certain cord on members to say: I'm expected to uphold certain principles here.

The same goes for members of the executive - all of us. Of course, we are human beings. We err, and, when we err, there are corrective measures. That goes for the whole of society. I've seen certain incidents of wrongdoing happening right in church ... where I think good moral values should be upheld and people understand why they are in church. They should avoid certain things. Definitely, we must continue to frown on bad values. We must frown on corruption. All the things that can take this country backward we must not agree to, no matter who they are done by. We can't sacrifice the whole nation for the sake of one individual, the wrongdoing of one individual. [Interjections.] We can't do that. Therefore I am saying: all

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 21

of us must be committed, because we want to take this country forward. There are certain things that we must uproot; uproot them. If you leave them, you run the risk of making them a normal thing in the fabric of your society. Thank you very much.

Dr M Q NDLOZI: Speaker, through you to the Deputy President: I genuinely wish you a great recovery.

The DEPUTY PRESIDENT: Thank you.

Dr M Q NDLOZI: I think that when people are suffering health issues, we must wish them well and not make fun of them.

With that said, we are discussing the important question of disclosure. Deputy President, I want to check whether you received any funding for your campaign as the deputy president of the ANC. If you have received this funding, have you disclosed it ... [Interjections.] ... this funding that you would have received to campaign to become the deputy president of the ANC?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 22

Please, could you tell us the names of some of the people or some of the entities that could have funded you to become the deputy president of the ANC?

The SPEAKER: This House doesn't normally deal with party-political issues. [Interjections.] Of course, I will not block the Deputy President from sharing information if he wishes to do so, but I am just finding it strange to get up and ask about a party-political activity. [Interjections.] However, Deputy President, you are free to answer if you so wish.

Mr P J MNGUNI: Speaker, on a point of order: We are in such a litigious environment, and, at some stage, we would want to be wary of courts saying Parliament doesn't observe its own Rules.

The follow-up question by the hon Ndlozi, which you dealt with, Speaker, consisted of two parts. A follow-up question may only have one part. I just rise on that point of order. Thank you.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 23

The SPEAKER: Deputy President, please exercise your right to answer.

Dr M Q NDLOZI: Speaker, on a point of order ...

The SPEAKER: Hon Ndlozi, please allow the Deputy President first. Then I will recognise you.

Dr M Q NDLOZI: Speaker, with the greatest respect ...

The SPEAKER: No, I am saying let the Deputy President answer.
[Interjections.]

Dr M Q NDLOZI: Perhaps before, because I think you misconstrued my question, Speaker, there is an ethics case regarding Mr Maimane receiving funding ...

The SPEAKER: It doesn't matter.

Dr M Q NDLOZI: ... in the DA.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 24

The SPEAKER: It doesn't matter. It is alright. Please just take your seat.

Dr M Q NDLOZI: So, you have an obligation to answer, Deputy President, about funding you are receiving. [Interjections.]

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Speaker, on a point of order ...

The SPEAKER: Please, hon Steenhuisen, let's just let this question be done with.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Madam Speaker, I rise in terms of Rule 85: You cannot cast aspersions on members of the House. There is no ethics committee case involving Mr Maimane before the House.

The SPEAKER: I know, hon member. So, I didn't want us to waste our time with that. [Interjections.] Hon Deputy President, please proceed.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 25

The DEPUTY PRESIDENT: Hon Speaker, to the hon Ndlozi, thank you very much for wishing me well. You are the only one that wished me well from this side. [Interjections.] Thank you very much.

However, your question is a new question, and I don't think it is relevant. If you really insist on the question, put it. I am here with you. If it is agreed in your programming committee that this question must be asked of me, I will be duty bound to do so - to answer it. [Interjections.] At this time, I regard it as a new question, and it involves the ANC, of which normally I am not a treasurer, and I am not a spokesperson of the ANC, but if you insist on the question, put it in writing. Let's take it forward. [Interjections.]

Dr M Q NDLOZI: Speaker, on a point of order ...

The SPEAKER: Hon Ndlozi, what is the point of order?

Dr M Q NDLOZI: Speaker, the question does not have anything to do with the ANC. [Interjections.] It has to do with him and his ambition, personally, to become the deputy president of

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 26

the ANC ... [Interjections.] ... and whether he himself received money to fund his political campaign, not the political campaign of the ANC. [Interjections.] A treasurer of the ANC would not receive money in that regard. You would receive it!

Ms L M MASEKO: Speaker, on a point of order ...

Dr M Q NDLOZI: So, please tell the people of South Africa if you were funded. [Interjections.]

Ms L M MASEKO: On a point of order, Speaker!

The SPEAKER: Let me request the hon Ndlozi to take his seat now and let the hon Maseko please raise the point of order.

Ms L M MASEKO: Speaker, I want you to rule on this. There is no independent in this House. We are all on the ticket of political parties, so there is no person who campaigns for themselves. So, you are just out of order.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 27

Dr M Q NDLOZI: You individually took an oath of office. You alone! You took an oath of office! [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Ndlozi, you should be patient when other people do what you do, which is to exercise their right to raise points of order. [Interjections.] It is alright. You have a view, but the point is your question contained an enquiry as to whether the hon member campaigned to be the deputy president of the ANC. We were all listening. However, we are now done with that particular question.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Madam Speaker, I accept the ruling that you have made, but I would ask that you do look at the Hansard because if you look at Rule 142 the hon Mnguni had quoted, it says here that it may arise from the answer.

The Deputy President opened the door to the follow up when he said that he hadn't had to make a submission and declaration of donations received. So, I would argue that the question by the hon Ndlozi was, in fact, in order because the Deputy President himself had invited the question. [Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 28

The SPEAKER: Alright, I will look at the Hansard.

[Interjections.] Hon members, we come to Question 33, asked by the hon Tsoleli to the Deputy President.

Question 33:

The DEPUTY PRESIDENT: Hon Speaker, let us remind ourselves that the land reform measures we are embarking on, seek to address inequalities of the past that flow from the land dispossession and economic exclusion of the majority. Whereas this issue of land has always been a sensitive matter that is at the heart of what our struggle for freedom was about, there is a general consensus that we have to embark on an accelerated land reform programme so that we redress the injustices of the past and ensure that through this process, we harness all efforts of nation-building and social cohesion.

As we interact and engage with various stakeholders, there is no doubt that the issue of land expropriation without compensation has generated a lot of anxiety among our people and key sectors of society. Among some of the key concerns that were raised as we speak and interact with stakeholders, there is one concern that this process might open floodgates

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 29

for land grabs. There is also a concern that this will erode and undermine critical investments that have been made towards building a competitive agricultural sector in our country. Another concern that it will cause a decline in agricultural output as farmers hold back their investment choices and decisions, and that it will polarise society as some organisations distort the objectives of land reform by spreading falsehoods that the government is targeting to harm its own white farmers - a race-based narrative intended to divide the nation.

Hon members, can rest assured that the concerns that have been raised in the interactions with various agriculture stakeholders are going to be addressed and have been noted. We are going to ensure that this process is handled with utmost sensitivity and care it deserves. Broadly speaking, key stakeholders in the land reform engagements, share our view that the land reform programme must be implemented within a constitutionally defined framework. This is the path that we have chosen, as a country.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 30

Our government has said that, as we embark on this process of accelerated land reform through expropriation without compensation, this must be conducted in a responsible manner without negatively affecting economic growth that we aspire to achieve as a country, the investment drive that we are driving and agricultural production.

We have assured all stakeholders that this process will be orderly, will not lead to disruption of production. In this regard, the President has on several occasions affirmed that there will be no land grabs.

We are now looking forward to the completion of the constitutional review process that is unfolding which is within your hands, as this House. We remain confident that as a country, we are capable of resolving our own challenges in a peaceful and constructive manner. Thank you very much.

Ms S P TSOLELI: Thank you very much Deputy President for your answer. In not so recent, the President of the country has been addressing different platforms. Just last week he has been addressing the Parliament of European Union. Deputy

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 31

President, could you tell us whether the President has assured investors and the international community that land distribution will not affect food production in South Africa?
I thank you.

The DEPUTY PRESIDENT: Well the President has said so in many platforms.

Mr D J MAYNIER: Do you believe him?

The DEPUTY PRESIDENT: He has said so in this House again.

[Interjections.] Well, as the Deputy President when looking at the President when he utters these statements I really believe his good intentions. I am prepared to support him and the entire country in these good intentions and not to ...

[Interjections.]

Mr D W MACPHERSON: Undermine it?

The DEPUTY PRESIDENT: Not to undermine the process and the distance that we have travelled as a country. I think we are almost 24-25-years-old as a democracy. Some of us must

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 32

appreciate that there are people who were here in this House before, the leaders that led and have strived to reach certain objectives. Ours is to build on what they have achieved without destroying the good worked that they have done. Thank you. [Applause.]

Inkosi E M BUTHELEZI: Thank you very much Speaker, Deputy President these fears that we are talking about are justified, it is in the very same ANC government which failed in its effort to address this matter of land reform in the past 25 years. It's also the same ANC government failed to assist emerging commercial farmers who received land through the land reform processes. It is also under the same ANC government that we have seen markets reacting negatively to the call for land expropriation without compensation. My question is: On what imperial evidence have you based you your assurances on this matter?

The DEPUTY PRESIDENT: I think the decision that was taken in the 54th National Conference of the ANC, the ANC which is the leader of the government. We have made a strong assessment of our land reform programme in the country. Quite clearly, in

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 33

our conclusion, we came to the fact that this land reform programme as it currently exists is not affordable. Of course, we went through a number of stages willing-buyer, willing-seller and it is quite unaffordable. Government does not have money to pay those who are claiming to be paid. As government, we are doing it in an attempt to redress the imbalances of the past. If we acknowledge all of us, as a country, that there should be redressed, why don't we do it? Why don't we volunteer to do it without taking money from the little purse that is shrinking?

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: The little purse?

The DEPUTY PRESIDENT: Instead of paying an individual farmer, why don't we put the money into supporting agricultural production? However, let's share the land. Let's share the land. Now that is why we were motivated to come to this conclusion and to this resolution that we have taken. That is why we argued the same together with the EFF when we came to this House to say ... [Interjections.] ... no, let's expropriate land where necessary without compensation.

[Interjections.] But we want to add the rider to say we are

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 34

not going to disrupt the current situation; instead, we are going to protect production, but I must say those who are holding land they should be so kind to realise that land was dispossessed. There were people that were dispossessed.

Prof B BOZZOLI: Can you really be this naïve?

The DEPUTY PRESIDENT: Therefore, if we really mean true reconciliation, we mean true nation-building. Can we address this point in an amicable way, in our own South African way so that we can move forward? We recognise that this country belongs to all of us, but we don't agree that certain people must continue to languish in poverty while a certain section is rich. Thank you very much. [Applause.]

Question 33 (Continued):

Ms T M MBABAMA: Hon Speaker, with your indulgence I would like to welcome Gashwin Cupido, a youth activist from Albertinia in the gallery. [Applause]. Deputy President, as one of the various stakeholders the Land and Agricultural Development Bank of South Africa, Land Bank, in its 2017/18 financial year report said that expropriation of land without compensation

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 35

could bankrupt the bank by setting off a domino effect of defaults that could make the Land Bank liable to immediately repay its entire R41 billion funding portfolio, which it would not be able to settle. Has the government made funds available to bail out perhaps one of the only functioning state-owned enterprises, SOEs, in the country?

The DEPUTY PRESIDENT: Hon member, that is the view of the Land Bank and I am saying we should cross the river when we get there. Of course I have said so, that certain farmers are very sceptical about this process of land reform, therefore they are holding their decision and their choices to invest more.

Some farmers have made loans and have put the land as collateral. We are ready to handle those difficulties when we get there. Each and every case will be dealt with according to its merits and demerits. Thank you very much.

Ms D CARTER: Hon Speaker, Deputy President, I note your reply on food security. Are you aware that the value of farms after that motion in the House dropped with almost 35%? Therefore, with a drop like that, farmers can get less money for

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 36

production cost in other words and if we look at fertilizer and fuel costs we sit with a situation that they could plant 40% less.

If we do the simple sums of supply and demand, what does that mean? It is the poorest of the poor that will not be able to afford the food. Now Deputy President, you say that government does not have the money. Where does the money come from? Does it come from government? Does it come from the ruling party? No, it comes from the taxpayer.

Hundreds of thousands of written submissions were not taken into consideration and my question to you Deputy President, what is your view hereon, given our constitutional order and the values and principles that underpin it? Thank you.

The DEPUTY PRESIDENT: well, if you refer to the Constitution, and my views on the whole process. Constitutionally we have agreed that we are a nation that has got a past. We are from a divided past, we inflicted pains to one another and at a certain point we agreed that we must reconcile.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 37

Remember the Truth and Reconciliation Commission, TRC, where we exposed certain atrocities and we seek to close that chapter and at the upper most of the TRC were reparation, restitution, try and compensate those who were wronged in the past. In the process we moved on in that spirit, I do not think we are wrong if we say land was dispossessed and this must be corrected, however the mechanisms that we are going to follow must not take us back. That is the important thing that we must do but the fact of matter is the point that we cannot ignore, we cannot push it aside because certain people were dispossessed of what was normally theirs. If we want them to be part of this new nation that we are building, we must recognise that they were wronged. Thank you very much.

Ms D CARTER: Hon Speaker, I do not know whether the Deputy President did not hear the question, but he did not answer the question at all.

The SPEAKER: Well that is your take on the matter hon Carter but in my record he has answered, maybe not to your satisfaction and I regret that.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 38

Question 34:

The DEPUTY PRESIDENT: Hon Speaker, let me reiterate the fact that as government we recognise and respect the rights of all South Africans especially the rights of traditional, cultural, religious and linguistic communities as provided for and enshrined in our Constitution. This includes the promotion and creation of conditions for the development and use of the Khoi and San languages.

In giving effect to this principle, as far as the status and recognition of the Khoisan people, the Traditional and the Khoisan Leadership Bill which was tabled in Parliament on 23 September 2015 is trying to address this problem.

The main objectives of that Bill are inter alia to provide the recognition of the traditional and Khoisan communities and their leadership positions. Provision is also made for the functions and roles and traditional and Khoisan leaders for the recognition establishment functions, roles and administration of kingship, queenship, councils, principal, traditional councils and traditional sub-councils as well support that must be given to such councils.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 39

Furthermore, provision is made for the establishment, composition and functioning of the National House of Traditional and Khoisan Leaders and the establishment of the provincial and local Houses of traditional and Khoisan leaders.

Following a comprehensive parliamentary process by the portfolio committee and this House, the Bill was finalised by the National Assembly and is currently before the NCOP. Once the Traditional and Khoisan Leadership Bill is promulgated into law, the formal processes of recognising Khoisan communities, leaders and structures will therefore begin in earnest.

Institutions like the Commission for the Promotion and Protection of the Rights of Cultural, Religious and Linguistic Communities continue to conduct programmes that include discussions and campaigns aimed at restoration of the diminishing heritage language of the Khoisan people.

We must also note that a memorandum of demands was presented to the Presidency by the Khoisan kingdom on 31 August this

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 40

year. This memorandum contains a range of demands that cut across the mandates of several government departments including the Department of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs, Rural Development and Land Reform, Arts and Culture and Justice to name a few.

Some of the demands include among others, the recognition, promotion and implementation of the languages of the San and the Khoi and the implementation of expropriation of land without compensation. I am informed that a co-ordinated response will be finalised and communicated to the Minister of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs in due course so that it is responded to to those who presented the memorandum.

Among other initiatives by government, which I want to draw the attention of the House to, is the fact that on 24 September this year, as part of our Heritage Day celebration in Kokstad, we honoured the Great Adam Kok III with the renaming of the Greater Kokstad municipality building after this name as well as unveiling of his statue.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 41

We did this as part of remembering the history of our country and the proud heritage that defines our being as a people. We did this to claim our identity, our sense of self and all that makes and defines us a people, as a united, non-racial, non-sexist South African that constantly strive for a just and prosperous society. We are one people and we will remain one people. The Khoisan people have an equal claim to say that they are South Africans. Thank you very much.

Mr A F MADELLA: Speaker, to the hon Deputy President, thank you for a very [15:05:47] response. The Khoisan were deprived historically of their identity, language, culture, they were oppressed, their dignity was destroyed over centuries of colonial conquest and apartheid rule.

Their descendants were coerced into being classified as coloureds. Today, many still feel marginalised, voiceless, landless and economically excluded. Deputy President, given what you have said, what more practical steps can government take to address this perception of excluded, being at periphery of the society and of being the step child of a democratic South Africa? What more can be done to ensure that

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 42

the descendants of the Khoi and the San feel they are part of this great nation that is being forged.

The DEPUTY PRESIDENT: Hon Speaker, I think that the introduction of the Bill in this House was recognition of that omission. I think all of us here agree that there was an omission and we are therefore trying to correct that.

We said that when the Bill reaches its final destination it is then promulgated into law and that will unleash the process of trying to restore and correct what was wrong. Recognising these languages, the Khoi and San people must be assisted to develop these languages and as we speak now they are not part of the 11 languages that we speak as a country and that is also an omission but it is something that is going to be debated.

I am happy that as a country there is a recognition that these people who are part of our society were neglected, not incorporated in all our day to day life activities. It is good that we are now doing the corrective measures. Thank you very much.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 43

Mr M HLENGWA: Speaker, to the hon Deputy President, in your response you alluded to the issues of traditional leadership as well which are interlinked to the issues of the main thrust of the question. So, if I may crave your indulgence just on that matter that in December 2000, Cabinet resolved a sub-committee for the purposes of looking to chapter 7 and 12 of the Constitution and actually deal with the clashes which are there in the sphere of governance in so far as traditional councils are concerned on one end and municipalities on the other end owing to ward to ward municipality system which was introduced.

No, the Bill you referred to form as part of that peacemil approach. The question then becomes, hon Deputy President, when do we bring this matter of these clashes and uncertainties in so far as governance is concerned in these communities to a logical conclusion? Because as things stand now, we will have to obviously introduce another legislation on top of other legislations whereas Cabinet as far back as 2000 recognised that the main thrust of the problem was the clash of the chapters 7 and 12 of the Constitution.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 44

So, I would be interested to hear your views in so far as that matter is concerned in so far as traditional leadership is concerned. Thank you.

The DEPUTY PRESIDENT: Well, the Bill that we are talking about obviously went through here and I am sure you had an opportunity, hon member, to make your concerns known about the gaps that are there that must be closed.

Of course now the Bill is in front of the NCOP and we might have missed that opportunity to raise this matter, however, we are quite aware that local municipalities are a sphere of government, recognised by the Constitution, certain powers and everything.

Traditional councils have been established through an Act and there are certain powers that are designated to these traditional councils and leaders. However, there is a friction from time to time when it regards to questions of land and development which is something that we think it can be resolved by facilitating a discussion between traditional leaders and these municipalities.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 45

For instance, in my previous job as a premier, I facilitated that and I had a very good group of traditional leaders; we were cooperating and working very well. It differs from area to area and how councillors and municipalities are interacting with traditional leaders. This problem is very less pronounced when it comes to provincial government and traditional leaders because there is a House which sits in the same precinct as the provincial government, less pronounced nationally because there is a national House that sits around here annually and they can raise their problems.

I think what is lacking here is an open communication process working together because these municipalities, their jurisdiction covers also areas where traditional leaders are leaders. That jurisdiction is also a jurisdiction of a traditional leader. If you want to put water or a road, definitely you must involve the traditional leadership.

Well, from the provincial and national government's point of view, each time we go to an area where we know there is a traditional leader, we announce our presence and declare our

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 46

intentions why we are here and what is it that we are going to do and we get consent of the leadership. Thank you very much.

The SPEAKER: Hon Mente ... I must say that hon Mente has been taking many different shapes and forms today. [Laughter.]

Mr M N PAULSEN: I am experimenting ... Deputy President, the most meaningful way in which government can enhance the status and recognition of Khoi and San people is through the expropriation of land without compensation and its redistribution. The Khoi and the San were the first people to be dispossessed of their land by the white criminals. But section 25 of the Constitution limits claims only to those who lost land from 1913 onwards and nearly all land that the Khoi and San once had was stolen long before then.

While your government is supporting the EFF's motion to amend section 25 of the Constitution to allow for the expropriation without compensation, what forms of ownership and redistribution is your government looking at when section 25 has finally been amended? Thank you very much.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 47

Mr P J MNGUNI: Speaker, with due respect I rise on a point of order: Once again, I think we have to respect our own Rules. Now, this is covered by Rule of anticipation, there is a CRC instituted by the House that must still report to the House and at that stage this issue will definitely arise. This question is forbidden in terms of Rule of anticipation. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Hon Paulsen you agree, I can see it in your face.

Mr M N PAULSEN: No, no, I do not agree with him hon Speaker. I think we are speaking about expropriation of land and it has nothing to do with ownership or redistribution. It is well within our rights to question as to what is envisaged. It is not going to be casting a stone but I am asking the Deputy President to give us an idea.

The DEPUTY PRESIDENT: Speaker, we have made our call very clear in terms of what we envisage as government. We really favour a situation where the rights to land and property are protected. However, as we undertake this land reform process, we would appreciate a process where finally the land does not

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 48

come to government but to people, people who are going to work this land and use it productively to enhance our productive capacity.

That is what we envisage and as a move that we are taking, I have said that we are now preparing ourselves to redistribute land that is in our hands to communities that we think will add value and to our productive capacity as a country and to those communities that have claimed the land. We are going to try very hard to assist communities that have already received their land from government to get this land productive. Thank you very much.

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Hon Speaker, to the Deputy President, like many other organisations, the Khoisan people are also divided; there is a perception out there that not all of them are being part and parcel of any negotiation. Could you tell me whether government would, at some stage, try to have a broader attendance of Khoi and San people so that we could bring them together, failing which this entire process might be delayed?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 49

Secondly, once this matter is completed, would government consider, in light of the Khoisan people initially establishing themselves in the Western Cape, changing this province from Western Cape to Khoi San province? Thank you.
[Laughter.]

The DEPUTY PRESIDENT: Well, the last question is very difficult - it would remain on the people of the Western Cape to debate it and probably a popular view will emerge.

Now, when it comes to the divisions within the Khoi and the San people, I do not think we want to encourage those divisions or recognise them because ours is to try and build a nation that is united. Our effort is to get the Khoi and the San people to unite under a common objective. If they are to improve their identity, language and everything, that would need them to unite.

I think it would be detrimental to themselves if they are preoccupied about minor differences within themselves either than the bigger picture and the objective that they reach pursuing.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 50

We encourage them to join all of us to build a nation and unite the nation. That calls upon them to unite first. Thank you very much.

Question 35:

The DEPUTY PRESIDENT: Hon Speaker, hon members and hon Steenhuisen, the Judicial Commission of Inquiry into the Allegations of State Capture, Corruption and Fraud in the Public Sector including the Organs of State as guided by the Public Protector's state of capture report is an independent process and should be treated as such. Therefore, the Deputy President is not expected to interfere with this process so that it duly runs its course without all of us compromising its integrity.

I have confidence that the commission is fully empowered by the law to invite and subpoena where appropriate any individual implicated in any form of corruption or fraud as covered under the terms of reference of the said commission. If there are members of the public who think they have further information to assist the commission, they are encouraged to approach it and present their case.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 51

It is further important to note that the ANC National Executive Committee of which I am a member communicated to the public that it supports the commission and encourage all who are implicated and who have been called upon to present evidence to the commission to fully co-operate with this process.

As a member of the executive arm of the state, it will be inappropriate for me to interfere with the workings of the commission until it finishes its job. Thank you very much.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Thank you for your response, Deputy President. Earlier you said that corruption and maladministration is morally repugnant. I am sure that you agree with the auditor chief as the main factors of this own documentation will be in fact of those who knew something did not appear before it and say what they knew and when they knew it. Now just yesterday, a sworn affidavit emerged from the former President of the Republic and former President of your party. I like to quote from it and I quote: I wish to confirm that at all material times hereto, President Ramaphosa diligently served as my Deputy President and he would have

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 52

been familiar with most important and relevant decisions made by the Cabinet or the presidency.

Given the statement Deputy President, you must surely agree that it's becoming increasingly unattainable for the President to sustain the position that he did not know about state capture, that did not know about the depth and nature of the defence, the protection, the entrenchment of all what was going on and the Cabinet he was serving in, the government he was a Deputy President of, the NEC that he was sitting in and the top six.

This position made even more attainable Deputy President by the fact that for almost two years, the President was a Chairman of the Inter-Ministerial Commission of State-Owned Entities as well as the Deployment Committee of his own party. Its frankly no longer believable that he did not know what was going on. [Applause.] Don't you think Deputy President, and given that this is now more important than ever before than as the patron of the Moral Regeneration Movement, you will be failing spectacularly in your responsibility to moral regeneration repugnant scourge that you spoke about in your

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 53

previous answer, if in fact you did not encourage members of the Cabinet and the executive, including the President to appear before this commission. Thank you. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Deputy President, I note that that was a statement.

The DEPUTY PRESIDENT: I think the hon member has a view of what has happened. I think certain people must appear before the commission. It's your right to go and state that in the commission. You have the right. [Applause.] It will be wrong of us here in this House to start discussing statement that are said in the commission because that commission is a Judicial Commission. Now, we can't compromise this process by creating something parallel this side discussing what is said in the commission. Now, if we want this commission to produce the correct results, let us support it. Let us not interfere. Now, if you want to support it go and make a statement there. In that way you will be supporting the commission. [Applause.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 54

I don't know maybe you can go where the commission is holding this enquiry and "toyi-toyi" or go inside and make a statement. So, I am encouraging all people.

I don't know the procedure of the commission because the commission has the right to invite people. If you go there without invitation, they will say that they have not invited you. I don't know what will happen. The commission invite and subpoena people. It has that right. If you are subpoenaed by the commission, you cannot say no. It will be an offence. Whether people can offer to do that, I don't know, you must ask if you can go there and make submission. [Interjections.] No, I have no issue that I want to present to the commission.

I will go to the commission if I feel that there is a need to do that. That time will come, but I am not sure. But as I am saying, I am encouraging the hon member to go there and make a submission. Thank you very much. [Applause.]

Ms S J NKOMO: Deputy President, as the Patron of the Moral Regeneration Movement which is aimed at encouraging people to recommit to efforts of building communities grounded on

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 55

positive values and rededicating to building a caring society in pursuit of creating lasting peace and prosperity in our country, are you in any way encouraging members of the executive to undergo lifestyle audits with a view to reassuring our nation that the ANC government is actually very transparent to the people of South Africa? Thank you.

The DEPUTY PRESIDENT: I think this question has been asked to the President and the President said every member of the executive will go through that process. Who I am to contradict the President, I must follow suit. As soon as that process is started, all of us will comply. So, that matter has been addressed. Thank you.

Mr M S A MAILA: Deputy President, thank you for displaying that you are a great teacher. You have just offered a free lesson on the importance of upholding the doctrine of separation of powers to Mr Steenhuisen and the white caucus.

Having said that, at the conclusion of the Commission on State Capture, Deputy President, is the government prepared to

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 56

implement the recommendations of the commission? Thank you very much.

The DEPUTY PRESIDENT: I don't think the Rule of anticipation. I don't think if we have created a Judicial Commission, I don't see us at the end of the process standing against and say we are not going to implement your findings. Remember the status of the commission. The decisions that are taken there are binding to us as the government. We are going to act on the basis of the findings. Thank you very much.

Ms N W A MAZZONE: Deputy President, given the fact that the fuel price has increase exponentially this year that Eskom is effectively unable to service its debts so that massively increasing the fuel price, Denel faces mass of challenges and is reported not to be able to pay its worker's salaries, Alex Khizen a distraught and will it be honestly almost the chaos that is in SAA and SA Express. As the Patron of the Moral Regeneration Movement and as Leader of Government Business, Deputy President, wouldn't you agree that you have an obligation, in fact, a statutory obligation to lay criminal charges against all the Ministers and members in this House,

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 57

and perhaps even more importantly against ex Ministers such as Ms Leon Brown, Ms Tina Joemat-Pettersson, Mr Gigaba and Keno Molefi in terms of the Public Finance management Act, PFMA, section 6 and section 6 of the Prevention and Combating of Corrupt Activities Act?

Dr M Q NDLOZI: Point of order, House Chairperson.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Yes, hon Ndlozi.

Dr M Q NDLOZI: Dealing with the question from the Chief Whip of the DA, hon Steenhuisen and then hon Mazzone makes a follow-up after a follow-up of hon Steenhuisen and his question, this is white monopoly capitalism.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): That is not a point of order, hon Ndlozi, please.

Dr M Q NDLOZI: Can't we have other people from other parties to do a follow-up.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 58

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon Ndlozi, please take your chair. That is not a point of order.

Dr M Q NDLOZI: Please, hon House Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon Deputy President, please continue.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: House Chairperson?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon Steenhuisen? You can take your chair, hon Deputy President.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: I am not sure if it is parliamentary to refer to term white monopoly capital. I would say, if he is worried about us taking all the questions that party is welcome to try loot them ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon Steenhuisen, I am not going to respond to that. It is not a point of order. What is it, hon member?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 59

Mr N M PAULSEN: Chair, I just want to refer you to a ruling you have made yesterday, where only three follow-up questions were asked and we were not allowed to ask the fourth one and you said you prefer to give it to different parties.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Okay.

Mr N M PAULSEN: But that wasn't in the practice today.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon member, we are talking about the person who asks the question and the question that came. The Deputy President has to respond to hon Mazzone first. Thank you.

The DEPUTY PRESIDENT: Now, all of us as members of the executive have been assigned responsibility. That is why there is Minister for Rural Development and Land Reform; there is a Minister of Public Enterprises and other Ministers. This is a delegated function, delegated to you by the President.

So, we are all responsible for certain spheres of our delegation as members, including me. I don't just do as I

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 60

wish. I do what is assigned to me because there is a Minister who is responsible for that Department of Public Enterprise

Therefore, what I have seen and what you know is that there were board members that were changed. There are people that are currently undergoing disciplinary processes within those SOEs. In fact, that is an indication that there is an action on certain things that probably are seen to be wrong. I am satisfied with what the Minister is doing because people must be accountable. They can prove they are innocent in those disciplinary procedures. They can even go to court to prove their innocence.

So, I am satisfied that our process of trying to get these state-owned enterprises, SOEs, right functioning is on the right track. It's going to assist the country to get back to its mode of trying to win investment of trying to grow this economy. So, we should support that effort without really clouding it, all of us talking. Let's allow the responsible Minister to deal with those issues. This Minister can always come here and answer if there are issues. Thank you very much.

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 61

Question 36:

The DEPUTY PRESIDENT: As government we acknowledge that our state-owned enterprises play an important role in South Africa's economy through the infrastructure investment programmes. The South African economic growth strategy has been underpinned by public sector infrastructure spending to total R2,7 trillion between 1998 and 2017.

The economic and social infrastructure spending, mainly by SOEs, accounts for R1,2 trillion over the same period, which is almost 44% of the total public sector infrastructure spending. It is through such infrastructure expenditure that SOEs create the necessary and the much needed jobs and in the process address poverty and inequality.

Thus, SOEs are important drivers to economic growth because insufficient investment in economic infrastructure will create constraints to economic development. The SOEs investment in infrastructure is a powerful lever to reindustrialise and deepen industrialisation in the South African economy and it is for this reason that they should be at the forefront of the industrialisation process.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 62

The SOEs are therefore central in the economic growth and development of our country as they operate within the energy and transport sectors, as well as in strategic sectors such as water, air and rail transport, telecommunications and other sectors like financial services and development finance.

The SOEs have made a significant contribution to the economy, social development and poverty reduction in South Africa since 1994. A range of SOEs continue to provide essential economic and socioeconomic infrastructure and services in this regard.

They are also playing a key role in enhancing skills, promoting entrepreneurship and opening up opportunities for job creation. We can only reduce poverty by generating income through sustainable jobs and business opportunities. I would like to focus on some practical examples and to provide a small glimpse into the extensive work done by the SOEs to alleviate poverty.

Let me start with the commercial SOEs, for example, Transnet, Eskom, Sanral, Telkom and Broadband Infracore, which remain an important part of our national economy across a wide range of

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 63

sectors. These are being directed by their respective shareholders to deliver on developmental outcomes, often in areas where market or institutional failures would make such outcomes unlikely if left to private enterprises that tend to be wholly focused on profits.

Procurement policies, processes and related systems are being revised to ensure that local supplier development is integrated into procurement practices. Supplier development related key performance indicators are now embedded in the shareholder compacts of most SOEs. Through the supplier development programs, implementation is driven towards maximising localisation and making an impact on both the economy and in the critical socioeconomic infrastructure.

For example, Eskom places a particular emphasis on supplier development and localisation to transform the supplier base, whilst developing supply sectors that are important to the industry. Eskom-wide, a total of 1 373 new contracts worth R70,4 billion were awarded and commenced during the financial year 2017-18 alone, of which 87% or R61,3 billion of the contract value was committed to local content. Of those, 85

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 64

contracts worth R1,8 billion were awarded within the new-build programme. The local content committed to in the new-build programme amounted to R1,6 billion, representing around 86%.

Eskom continues to connect previously disadvantaged households in licensed areas of supply through the Department of Energy funded electrification programme. During the financial year 2017-18, Eskom connected 215 519 households to electricity, thereby exceeding the target for the year in all provinces. Universal access to electricity has been reached for clinics thus eliminating the backlog that was there.

As of 31 March this year, 38 111 people were employed by the capacity expansion programme at the Medupi, Kusile and Ingula new-build sites and on large transmission projects.

Collaborative efforts with construction and government partners continue to drive skills development and skills transfer.

Corporate Social Investment initiatives, CSI initiatives, are focused on developing small and medium enterprises, education, health, food security, community development, energy and the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 65

environment. For 2018, Eskom's CSI activities have already impacted more than 1,1 million beneficiaries, with a total spend of R192 million.

It is also critical that we drive our information technology network through companies such as Telkom and Broadband Infraco. These companies implement the required communications infrastructure - not only for the formal business sector, but also for small micro business sector thus leading to much needed socioeconomic upliftment of the poor section of our community.

Telkom is implementing strategic transformational projects, which include delivering an integrated broadband plan and becoming South Africa's leading provider of Wi-Fi services. The provision of Wi-Fi services goes hand in hand with government's household electrification policy.

As an example, a small or micro enterprise with an electricity connection and an internet connection can have direct access to information pertaining to its products that will unlock the sale of goods and services, payment for those goods and

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 66

services, creation of employment and ultimately a reduction in poverty.

In terms of road infrastructure, Sanral is also making a meaningful contribution to the reduction of poverty through the delivery of socioeconomic infrastructure that opens opportunities for SMMEs to participate as well as in the creation of job opportunities and skills development.

The improvement and expansion of key economic corridors have substantially improved mobility, and in the process, stimulating economic growth in the key production centres and areas with depressed economic potential.

This enables job creation and income generation. A few examples are: The Gauteng Freeway Improvement Project, GFIP; the Gateway and Umngeni Interchanges in KZN; the Gauteng-Durban Corridor; and the N2 Wild Coast, which have been a good training ground for the development of SMMEs from Grades 1 or 2 to Grades 3 to 5.

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 67

The SMMEs are put through an intense 24-month training program and trained in road construction trades in order to equip and enable them to pursue opportunities in Sanral's mainstream national projects or other projects in provinces and municipalities.

The Sanral also has a skills development program that capacitates people across various levels. In high schools, it focuses on providing scholarships in maths and science, and in universities and TVET colleges where they give higher education bursaries in engineering and technical careers. They also provide support to Universities in post-graduate research.

In terms of internships programme, they provide design and construction site experience. The Sanral also has a Technical Excellence Academy for engineers in training to professional registration. All of these initiatives help grow capacity in the roads construction sector, thus ensuring good quality infrastructure delivery and skilled employment.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 68

Through all these efforts, our SOEs will continue to play a meaningful role in the growth and development of our economy. Therefore, the measures to improve governance and efficiencies that the President is championing, will place our various SOEs in a much strengthened position to thrive, become profitable, thereby enhancing capacity to fulfil their economic mandates and responsibilities that have been entrusted upon them. Thank you!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Thank you. I am informed that the follow-up question to hon Shivambu's question will be taken in charge of by hon Ndlozi.

Dr M Q NDLOZI: House Chairperson, Deputy President, in relation to the dealings of IPPS and Eskom: What is the perennial marginal shortfall of Eskom purchasing electricity at R2,22 and then selling it at 89c for the poor and for poverty alleviation in general? Thank you.

The DEPUTY PRESIDENT: Well, I am not aware of that information, but of course, if you say it like you are saying it, I don't think it is logically correct for Eskom to sell

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 69

electricity to the poor at a very unaffordable price when it buys it at a very cheap price. It is a matter that can be discussed so that Eskom can be persuaded to be aware of the economic environment in the country, so that we lessen the burden of the poor. I am not aware of it, but logically I think it is incorrect.

Dr M Q NDLOZI: Chairperson, I didn't say that!

The DEPUTY PRESIDENT: What have you said?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon Ndlozi, you didn't even ask my permission, you just continue to talk to the Deputy President. [Interjections.]

Dr M Q NDLOZI: I am sorry! My sincere apologies, but I really ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Yes, you are allowed. Continue ... [Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 70

Dr M Q NDLOZI: This is not what government policy is. Eskom buys electricity from independent power producers, IPPs, at R2,22 and then sells it at 89c; not the other way round.

[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY PRESIDENT: Ooh okay! Okay! [Interjections.]

Dr M Q NDLOZI: But, what are the implications of that for Eskom's survival? It's not making any profit; it is a loss. That means it is on the path to collapse, which will literally mean it is privatised or electricity provision in the country will be privatised. That's what I mean! [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Thank you, hon Ndlozi, I think that the Deputy President got your point.

[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY PRESIDENT: I've heard him! [Interjections.] I got it! [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Are you going to respond, Deputy President? [Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 71

The DEPUTY PRESIDENT: Yes!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Okay!

The DEPUTY PRESIDENT: Well, those independent power producers are in business, and Eskom is in business too, but what you are talking about does not make business sense. If I buy something very costly and I sell it cheap: What does it mean to me, the one who is buying? It does not make business sense. These people are in business, so they must correct themselves. Thank you.

Mr L M NTSHAYISA: Hon Chairperson, Deputy President, in the light of corruption, fraud and everything dirty in these SOEs, I don't think, perhaps now, that these SOEs can lead the way in the development of socioeconomic structure. What difference is going to be brought about; or what turn-around strategy this time is going to be brought about to change the situation in order to reduce poverty? This is because everything that is done now does not reduce poverty as it is. So, what is this new turn-around strategy in the case of these SOEs? I now hope

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 72

you are not affected in this reshuffling, my friend. Thank you very much.

The DEPUTY PRESIDENT: I think this question came up before this House and it was mainly directed to the President. There were a number of suggestions that were made, probably to the President, on how best to strengthen governance and address its failures, corruption and fraud in these institutions.

I am confident that the way I look at it that there are really serious attempts on the side of government to get these SOEs on the right path. Of course, that does not really suggest that there are no good things that were done by those SOEs. There are good things that were done. Probably not following correct procedures is where it went wrong, and that is where certain individuals must be held accountable. However, in terms of delivering on their mandate, I think there are certain things that were done correctly.

The entire infrastructure that I have mentioned is good for the country. Whether it was delivered correctly or all the processes were followed correctly is another case. We need the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 73

infrastructure. So, I am certain that the ANC-led government will improve this situation because already, we have recognised that there is a problem. We need to attend to the governance and the failures in these SOEs.

Ms E M COLEMAN: Hon House Chairperson, hon Deputy President, I know you have partly replied to this question, but I am going to ask it anyway. Do you think that government is winning in cleaning our state-owned enterprises, especially in as far as management and systems' control are concerned; and how do you think this links up with the socioeconomic transformation programme of government? [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon Ndlozi, what is it? What is it, hon Ndlozi?

Dr M Q NDLOZI: There is an hon member who always stands to say people must have one follow-up question, not many follow-up questions. Now he is quiet because it is members of this party! [Interjections.] Double standards!

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 74

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): But, you can't make noise like that when the Deputy President wants to understand a question. [Interjections.]

Dr M Q NDLOZI: I am provoked by this inconsistency. Sorry! [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Okay, take your seat, it is fine! Hon Deputy President!

The DEPUTY PRESIDENT: House Chair, I don't think I have heard the question very well. I will request the hon member to repeat, please.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon Coleman, would you please repeat?

Ms E M COLEMAN: Do you think that government is winning in cleaning our state-owned enterprises, especially in as far as management and systems' controls are concerned? This question is linked to the government's programme on socioeconomic transformation. How do you link the two? [Interjections.] It

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 75

is a question related to alleviating or eradicating poverty. So, the programme is around that. [Interjections.] It's not a new question; it is the same question.

The DEPUTY PRESIDENT: House Chair, from where I am standing, I think government is willing and is capable to change the situation in our SOEs. Quite a few examples have been demonstrated already, because there are certain officials in those SOEs who are held accountable. Some have resigned on their own, which is a direction that seeks to restore confidence and improve governance. When people are questioned and they resign, it raises eye brows. Why do you resign when you are questioned?

Some board members, of which certain failures happened under their nose, were removed because they should take accountability of the institution that they managed. That is a good indication whereby we are starting to say there should be consequences for wrong doings - for allowing things to go wrong under your watch. It is a good thing and it must be encouraged. However, we must not stand here and say: Over the years, these SOEs have done nothing.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 76

I think they have contributed much into the so-needed socioeconomic infrastructure that will boost your roads, and you can talk electricity. There were times when we battled. Eskom did very well to bring some of Medupi and some of Kusile into the generation. We now receive electricity and we are a country that does not fear load shedding. We are continuing to build. Of course, we must be mindful that things that occurred that were wrong must be corrected, but we must applaud these SOEs where they have done very well.

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Hon House Chairperson, Deputy President, first of all, I don't know whether it is a joke when I have my colleague, hon Shivambu, wanting to talk about anti-poverty because actually if you look at the truth, they have made the poor people even poorer by looting the poorest of the poor in Limpopo province. So, I am actually shocked about it! Now, hon Deputy President, ... [Interjections.]

Dr M Q NDLOZI: Point of order! Point of order, Speaker!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): You may take your seat, hon Deputy President. Yes, hon Ndlozi?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 77

Dr M Q NDLOZI: While hon Shaik Emam is asking a question, he is casting aspersions on people that have asked the question, who are also hon members of this House, by saying that we have looted from the people of Limpopo. I think he must retract and ask his question intelligently.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon Shaik Emam, you know very well that rules do not allow us to cast aspersions on members of this House without bringing a substantive motion forth. So, please refrain from doing that.

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Alright, in light of that, hon Chair, I will bring a substantive motion. Thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Thank you.

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Hon Deputy President! Hon Deputy President ... [Interjections.]

Mr N M PAULSEN: He hasn't retracted yet!

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 78

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): No, I never said he must do that. Take your seat, hon member!

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Deputy President, whilst we are expecting the SOEs to create infrastructure development, Eskom and the Department of Water and Sanitation are owed over R30 billion. Now, unless we address this, surely infrastructure development will be affected. What will government be willing to do to address this problem? Take Eskom: There is about R19 million or R20 billion owed to them. They have to go to China to borrow! [Time expired.] What are you going to do to prevent that, Deputy President?

The DEPUTY PRESIDENT: I think Eskom and all the water boards have a problem in their hands. They are supplying electricity and water while people are not paying. Some are defaulting and all that. That means, they must find better systems to get those clients or consumers, who are supposed to be paying, to pay. There are sophisticated technologies that can help Eskom and water boards to make people pay. I am aware that people are making illegal connections in terms of electricity and illegal connections in terms of water as well.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 79

However, it is important for these SOEs to ensure that there systems in place to avoid illegal connections and ensure that people pay. It is their responsibility, but of course we are not just saying Eskom and water boards must see to finish. Wherever we go, we encourage communities to pay for the services. At times we differ here in the House. Some are saying: No, we can't pay! But, it is the right thing to do. When you afford, you must pay for the services that you consume.

So, we are prepared to help Eskom and all the water boards to recover, because these SOEs are now in bad financial situations. Some of the money is being owed by people out there, and people are stealing electricity and water. There should be an understanding that if you are stealing electricity and water, you are in fact dragging your own country downwards. Thank you very much.

**CONSIDERATION OF REPORT OF NATIONAL ASSEMBLY RULES COMMITTEE
ON PROCEDURES TO GIVE EFFECT TO SECTION 89 OF THE CONSTITUTION**

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 80

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: House Chairperson, I move that the report be adopted.

Declarations of vote:

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: House Chairperson, at the outset let me commend the Rules committee and all members who were involved in the putting together of these Rules. I think that they certainly do give constitutional effect to section 89 of the Constitution. I think a very important mechanism is provided for in section 89, but also in section 102 of the Constitution in order for us to hold individuals and, most particularly, the President and his executive accountable.

I have been quite surprised in recent days and months to see some rather interesting comments emerging from outside of the ANC. First of all, we had Mr Enoch Godongwana who was, to say very clearly, and I quote ... [Interjections.] Listen carefully ... [Interjections.]

Mr H P CHAUKE: Point of order.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 81

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon Chauke, what's your point of order?

Mr H P CHAUKE: Chair, I think in the National Assembly we don't have an hon Godongwana. We don't have Godongwana in the Chamber here. Please ... could we address properly so that we know who the hon member is talking about?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Thank you very much. Continue, hon Steenhuisen.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: He said - and I'm quoting - that Zuma was to blame for the recession. Just a week ago, the President of the Republic of South Africa, the hon Ramaphosa, said, and I quote: "Jacob Zuma is to blame for SA's woes."

Now, the question we have to ask ourselves - because this mechanism is used to hold a president accountable - is: Can we believe the myth and shibboleth that is being shot out to South Africans that one man, on his own, was capable of entrenching, ensuring, defending and manipulating the whole state capture process in South Africa?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 82

Now, hon members, that is so fanciful that anyone who believes that probably still believes in the tooth fairy or Father Christmas - because it is impossible to sustain the grand theft that we've seen in the state capture by a single individual. We know, you know, and South Africa knows that at every step of the way Mr Zuma was aided, abetted, protected and defended by the very party that sits to the right of me today. [Applause.]

It was also very clear from the affidavit that Mr Zuma himself provided that those who now proclaim that they didn't know, that those who profess to say that they were unaware of what was going on around them, are, frankly, not believable, and that argument is frankly unsustainable in a thriving democracy - because if this angazi [not me] brigade to the right is to be believed, then, frankly, they were hoodwinked for eight years and have spectacularly failed in their responsibilities and duties to hold somebody accountable for the grand theft and grand-scale corruption that we have seen over the past eight years of the Zuma administration.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 83

The truth of the matter is that it is not sustainable for Mr Ramaphosa to say he didn't know; just as it is not sustainable for him to say that he did not know of the half-a-million-rand campaign donation made into his son's trust account.

[Applause.] We have swapped ...

Mr P D N MALOYI: Madam Chair, point of order. Is this relevant to the issue that we are discussing today? From where I am sitting, this is irrelevant. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon member, could you allow the member at the podium to continue?

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: It's absolutely relevant because it speaks about presidential accountability.

[Interjections.] What we have ... and you can say "Shut up" all you like. Really, you've spent 21 years trying to get me to shut up. It hasn't worked very well for you today. I'll say this to you: We've swapped uBaba ka Duduzane for uBaba ka Andile. So, we have to ask ourselves, South Africans: What has changed? What has changed?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 84

We may have a shiny new bottle on the outside that sits here, but inside that bottle is the same rotten wine that has pushed 10 million people into the unemployment queues, that has steered the South African economy onto the rocks, and that has allowed a party to become so entrenched - so compromised - with the corruption and maladministration of Bosasa paying for children's education and upgrades to their homes that they cannot move. This is where I agree, for the first time, with the hon Bathabile Dlamini about the "smallanyana skeletons". That's why we have just seen this damp-squib announcement of a so-called Cabinet reshuffle. Here was the opportunity to clear out the rot of the past eight years. Here was the opportunity to clear out Ministers who have facilitated and enabled state capture in their departments and have robbed the future of the people of South Africa. Here was an opportunity to send a message out that people who have got Auditor-General report findings against them, people who have had huge amounts of money stolen on their watch in their departments are no longer tolerated in government. Instead, it's the same rotten people who are going to be sitting around the same table making the same bad decisions with the same bad results.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 85

If you want change in South Africa you need to turn your back on this party and vote for another party ... [Inaudible.] ... vote for change. [Time expired.] [Applause.]

Mr H P CHAUKE: Chairperson ... Chairperson ... Chair ...
Chair!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon Chauke, yes?

Mr H P CHAUKE: We thought that the hon Steenhuisen was going to address why he needs this relationship with the EFF so much.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon member, that is not a point of order.

Mr M WATERS: Ya, what is the point of order, Chair?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): That's not a point of order. Continue hon Ndlozi, it's your turn.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 86

Dr M Q NDLOZI: House Chairperson, indeed we welcome this report but we want to express deep regret that it is long overdue. The Constitutional Court ordered Parliament but an invention of an impeachment rule must happen, and I quote, "without delay." Parliament has to start taking very seriously the judgements of the highest court in the land. We should have approved this, latest two months after declaration of the Constitutional Court. Therefore, it is long overdue and that is regrettable. But really, the new rule is a compromise between two arguments, one represented by the EFF and the other by the rest of the political parties in the House.

It had to do really with all of the political parties, refusing an independent body that must be constituted by a judge, which must determine if a President has a case to answer. All of them did not want that to happen. They wanted to be ones who go through the parliamentary rules processes that establish committees to go and vote on questions where they are determined on the basis of evidence.

The panel that must be constituted by a judge is really the achievement and the sole argument of the EFF, but it is line

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 87

with what the Constitutional Court had required of us to do. We are supportive of the establishment of this panel.

We would have wished that the appointment of the judge to that panel not be an optional exercise. It must be an obligation and whatever that judge is appointed into that panel must automatically become the chairperson of that panel. That is what we would have wished for, so that the process of inquiry whether the President has something to answer is really done by people who are experts not us politician who want to vote whether the person is guilty or not. You could not vote the person is guilty or not.

But what this rule really does, it says that the days where Presidents, like the constitutional delinquent, Jacob Zuma, who violated the Constitution, that when such people have done so in the way that Zuma did, it will no longer happen without consequences.

If we can't vote out in the House, at least, you will come and be asked about your responsibilities, behaviour and your action in front of judges firstly and secondly in front of

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 88

your peers. Who will put it to you, that why did you do this and that in relation to duties that have bestowed upon you.

It seems that the next person who must be taken through this process is Ramaphosa. We must investigate as Parliament. We must put this rule into a test. [Interjections.]

Mr P J MNGUNI: House Chairperson, on a point of order, in term of rule 85, the hon Ndlozi is casting aspersion on the good person of the President; it is unacceptable he is got to withdraw.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon Ndlozi, firstly you address the President as we agreed in this House with dignity, secondly, you are casting aspersion on the President by implying that he must be the next one. Would you please withdraw that part?

Dr M Q NDLOZI: House Chairperson, with the greatest respect, I have not accused him of anything, I am suggesting that, the President confessed to Parliament that he has received a donation, after having said that he didn't and therefore it is

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 89

my suggestion that we must test this rule of impeachment on him. We must test it, then we can determine ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon Ndlozi that is not you said, in the begging. No. Now - Now I am going to say to you please withdraw your first statement that I have asked to withdraw

Dr M Q NDLOZI: Which is what? What is the statement that I must withdraw?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon Ndlozi, please you said a next person that should go through that process is Ramaphosa. That's what you said and I want you to please withdraw that statement because ... [Interjections.]

Dr M Q NDLOZI: That is not casting aspersion. I am saying we must test the rule.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon Ndlozi, that is what you are explaining now. Can you please withdraw?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 90

Ms N K F HLONYANA: House Chairperson, on a point of order:

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon member, I am dealing with a member on the podium, I will come to you. No, no I do not need your assistance. Hon Ndlozi, please withdraw.

Dr M Q NDLOZI: Hon Chairperson, I have not cast any aspersion.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon Ndlozi, will you please withdraw.

Dr M Q NDLOZI: How can I withdraw when I am suggesting person must be taken through a process?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon Ndlozi, you are going to withdraw?

Dr M Q NDLOZI: Hon Ramaphosa must be impeached.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon Ndlozi, are you not going to withdraw?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 91

Dr M Q NDLOZI: No, House Chairperson, I can't withdraw the truth.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Thank you, now leave the podium, and please leave the House. [Interjections.]

Ms N K F HLONYANA: House Chairperson, you are too harsh, you are really harsh.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Take your seats hon members.

Mr M HLENGWA: House Chairperson, since the handing down of judgement and the directive of the Constitutional Court in this matter, same has been thoroughly interrogated by both our subcommittee on rules and the committee on rules of National Assembly. Legal opinions were considered and were suggestion implemented in order to insure compliance with the Constitutional Court judgement.

Granted the matter before us was necessitated by the repeated Ultra Vires Acts of office by Mr Zuma, and had be dealt with

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 92

urgently in order to create Parliamentary rule certainty in respect of the procedure to be followed in term section 89 of the Constitution.

The IFP believes that the report before here us today adequately ensures Parliamentary procedural compliance and certainty as regards to section 89 of the Constitution and accordingly the IFP supports this report.

As results we now have certainty as regards to definition, priority, regards to initiation of impeachment procedure and on easing of the evidential burden required to initiate the process, but I think we must clarify aspersion or the subtle insinuation that has been made here that there was one part on one side and the other parties on the other side, as if all those issues were subjected to debate, we debated this matter extensively.

What is fundamental is that Parliament cannot outsource its duties, its functions and responsibilities to another body. If we elect the President here it is our duty and responsibility to hold the President accountable here. It would be

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 93

dereliction of parliamentary duty then for us to ask judges, another sphere of government to perform the duties of Parliament.

We will be rendering the parliamentary process useless and demonstrating that we do not have faith and confidence in ourselves. If we are honest to our oath of office, Members of Parliament today and in the coming terms will understand that this process requires us to rise above the petty divides of politics and actually embrace the oath of office which we take when we become Members of Parliament.

It is on that basis that the IFP could not support a situation where we sit back and fold our arms and allow other people to do the work that we are expected to do. That is the burden of leadership and that is burden of holding the office that we hold. It is all good and well to actually to stand on the grandstand and seek paint us black, the bottom line is that we have been elected to perform this duty and when the need arises we shall do so consistent with the Constitution and consistently with the rules that we are passing today. The IFP supports the rule. Thank you.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 94

Mr S N SWART: House Chair, the ACDP supports this report which was unanimously accepted by parties on the Rules Committee and we commend the committee for its exceptional work in this regard. The institution of this new mechanism was as a result of the severe indictment of the Constitutional Court in its ruling on 29 December last year.

In that process, the court found that the failure by the National Assembly to make rules regulating the impeachment of the President in terms of section 89 constitutes a violation of that section. That means that this Parliament acted unconstitutionally by not, firstly, having the rule and secondly, the court said in addition, the failure by the National Assembly to determine whether then President Zuma had breached section 89 (1) (a) is inconsistent with the section.

So, besides the findings in Nkandla issue about the President not fulfilling his Constitutional obligations, the court found that Parliament itself had not fulfilled its constitutional obligations, firstly, by not having a mechanism on this matter and secondly, by not investigating or determining whether the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 95

President had breached his constitutional duties imposed upon him.

So Chair, this is very serious. In my years in Parliament, this is the first time that the court said Parliament itself has breached the Constitution. It referred to section 2(37) which states that all constitutional obligations must be performed diligently and without delay.

It also referred to section 42(3), the National Assembly is elected to represent the people and to ensure that government by the people under the Constitution does this by choosing a President and by interiorly scrutinising and overseeing executive action. Clearly, Parliament has failed in this regard.

I would submit that the Majority Party has failed in that regard because for many years, we've tried to hold the President accountable and the President was protected by the Majority Party. This resulted in the Malay that we are faced with as a nation at this time.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 96

The Nkandla issue was a symptom of far deeper state capture and as we have seen in the evidence and on a numerous speeches debated here, that the power vested on the President without the effective oversight from Parliament was exercised to benefit a few people and individuals. We are now facing that consequence.

Therefore, I would submit that the ANC has a case to answer because it was the ANC that failed to exercise oversight, and the ANC needs to respond to the Commission of Inquiry. This rule which we support, is a little too late given the damage this country has suffered. I thank you. [Time expired.]

Prof N M KHUBISA: House Chairperson, the NFP supports the report. We believe that it is a step into a right direction and the court ruled on this matter in terms of section 89 that Parliament failed to comply with the Act by way of compiling the enacting rules that had to amplify section 89.

Therefore, that's why we believe that it is a step in a right direction because Parliament cannot come away from its tasks and purposes and it cannot fail to do its task to hold the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 97

President and the executive accountable. That is why, therefore, we feel that we have to support this report.

We cannot sit on the periphery and allow somebody else to do the work. The court was merely saying that Parliament has got a duty to perform because they took an oath of office and as representatives, now is the time for us to do the job. The court cannot hold the President accountable for the Parliament as it is Parliament's duty to do so.

Parliament's responsibility is to exercise oversight and we believe that as time continues, we will be able to act on the rules that have now been passed and that this caviar is very important for us to act when the President fails to honour the oath of office. Chairperson, we're here to say that we support the rules and the report as such. Thank you so much.

Ms J D KILIAN: Chairperson, when listening to the debate, one would almost think that the parties that participated here today were not around when we adopted the new rules. According to my knowledge - and this is what the 9th edition of the National Assembly Rules which was adopted on 26 May 2016 is

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 98

saying that - those parties have been part of comprehensive revision of the rules.

On that occasion, it was considered that there is provision for a 102 motion and there was a specific rule in the rule book for a 102 motion of no confidence, but it was generally agreed amongst parties that section 89 could be managed through the appointment of an ad hoc committee.

That was suggested when we considered a comprehensive review of the rules of the National Assembly. However, when the EFF approached the Constitutional Court, the court found that - I just want to read some of the principles because actually, we missed some of the debate in the politics of state capture from hon Steenhuisen - the National Assembly rules must provide for specific rules.

Hon Swart, we have all said that there is provision for appointment of an ad hoc committee in case when there is section 89 motion that is brought before the House, in fact, there were such motions, but the Constitutional Court didn't

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 99

agree. The court suggested that we should provide for specific rules to regulate section 89 proceedings.

This suggestion was brought forward by the court and it made the announcement on this issue last year on 29 December 2017. The National Assembly may only remove the President in terms of section 89 on the grounds listed in the Constitution. Those are very specific grounds, and they are as follows: Firstly, through a serious violation of the Constitution or the law; secondly, a serious misconduct or lastly, inability to perform the functions of office.

So clearly, we had to look at a provision to determine when that could constitute a serious violation, and when it would be inability by the President to perform functions of office. The court also found that there must be an institutional predetermination of what serious violation is, which is what I referred to:

That we must decide where the grounds exist in order to initiate the process envisaged in section 89 paragraph 1(7)(9). Now, what I want to say about this is that, we have

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 100

seen a tremendous surge in political opportunism. Very often, if we look on the number of section 102 motions of no confidence that we see in the history of this Parliament, we will realise that we need a determination, not only on what constitutes serious violation, but we also need an objective panel to assess whether it would be a serious case that the President should answer.

So, what we have established is mechanism, and I think it was a good mechanism. I must say that all parties agreed on it. I agree that the EFF came up with their proposal of outsourcing this function, but our interpretation - and we have legal opinions in this regard - is that, only the National Assembly can remove the President.

We are the appointing body and we must remove the President on the basis of evidence. Therefore, his removal must be substantiated on evidence. There is also a panel for the removal of the President. So, how this mechanism will work is that there will be a motion that must be introduced, it is very extensive and it must be clearly formulated.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 101

There must also be a substantiated charge on the ground specified in section 89; it must be substantiated as to why it is serious violation, etc. All the evidence relied upon in support of the motion must be attached to the motion. The charge must relate to an action or conduct performed by the President in person.

Also, the motion must be consistent with the Constitution, the law and these rules. For all of these, the minute that this so-called charge is levied, the Speaker will receive it and will immediately refer this motion to a panel consisting of three people, one of which would be a judge. Parties would be consulted on who should be appointed to this panel. Thereafter, a chairperson will be appointed.

They must then perform their investigation the minute that the Speaker receives the so-called charge. The Speaker will inform the President and the meeting will be convened. Once they made their final determination, the first process must be brought back to this House because again, it says that the National Assembly must decide on that.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 102

If there is a prima facie case, the National Assembly will precede and then the new impeachment committee - we call it an impeachment committee - will then be appointed. It is an impeachment committee for section 89 inquiry. The impeachment committee will be fully representative of all parties, and it must elect one of its members as a chairperson. Obviously, this committee will then start.

Its functions and powers are clearly listed in the rules. In terms of its decisions, a question before the committee has to be decided upon when a quorum in terms of rule 162(2) is present and they will then complete their investigation and will then report back to this House ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Thank you very much, your time has now expired.

Ms J D KILIAN: So, it's only this Assembly that will determine that right. Thank you.

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 103

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Thank you. Hon members, the motion is that the report be adopted. Are there any objections?

Hon MEMBERS: No.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): No objections.

Agreed to.

**CONSIDERATIONS OF BUDGETARY REVIEW AND RECOMMENDATION REPORT
OF PORTFOLIO COMMITTEE ON INTERNATIONAL RELATIONS AND CO-
OPERATION**

There was no debate.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: House Chairperson, I move that the report be adopted.

Declarations of Vote:

Ms S V KALYAN: House Chair, South Africa's foreign policy is supposedly underpinned by human rights. Yet the silence of our

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 104

government on the Jamal Khashoggi murder and our recent abstention at the UN General Council decision on the human rights violations of the Rohingya in Myanmar gives lie to this.

I would like to focus on one aspect regarding the budget of the Department of International Relations and Co-Operation. This is with regard to the New York mission. Procurement processes were noncompliant; tender processes were not followed; the declaration from SA Revenue Service, Sars, was not written off or approved; and Treasury did not sign off, yet the Director-General at the time saw fit to give the go ahead.

Here is another thing, a company that did not even tender for the project in terms of the construction was given the tender. Initially, the construction was for 40 000 square metres but the "successful bidder" decided that it would only put up a construction of 20 000 square metres. A sum of R118 million has been paid towards this and the construction is not up and going, there is a question about it and yet the former Director-General who initiated all of this is sitting with a

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 105

plum position in the New York mission. He should be fired. Why is the investigation taking so long? What is all this foot dragging all about? The CFO was suspended two years ago but his disciplinary has been shelved and ongoing. Again, the question is why is this taking so long? The DA cannot support the Department of International Relations and Co-Operation's Budget with so [Inaudible.] hanging over it.

Mr Z R XALISA: Hon Madam House Chair, the foreign policy of this government is not guided by the ideology and morals but by the capital and the ANC has lost all moral and ideological authority on matters of foreign policy. The type of foreign policy this country needs is one guided by the principle of Pan Africanism and International Solidarity. Neither of these is reflected in the action of this department.

On International Solidarity, the ANC government continues to maintain relations with the apartheid state of Israel which has dispossessed the Palestinians of their land and has forced them into glorified homelands where they are subjected to abuse, exploitation and deprivation. But all other the government has to offer are the statements and messages of

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 106

support. What is needed is the action so that all diplomatic relation with Israel is immediately ended.

On the question of the continent, this department and government should be driven by the cause of the Pan Africanism and the strengthening of continental institutions but instead we are being led by other African nations.

The Commander in Chief, who has taken the initiative, is a leading voice of the South African people in the continent. We need continental bodies like the Pan African Parliament to be given the necessary teeth and muscle so that they are able to execute and expand on the mandate of the Parliament, the African Union and the broader vision of the United Africa.

It is also time for us as the continent and the country to reconsider the role of the United Nations Security Council because in reality it is the relic of the Cold War and at time where nearly the entire continent was under colonial role. As Africans we have no representation and subject to the decision of others. The Security Council is undemocratic and it is time

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 107

that it is either be reformed or ... [Interjections.] The EFF rejects this BRRR. [Time expired.]

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Hon House Chair, the NFP welcomes the BRRR of the Department of International Relations and Co-Operation tabled here today. Once again, the department is bogged with irregular expenditure. A total amount of R374 million was identified by the Auditor-General as irregular expenditure; and failure to comply with the supply chain management processes. Lack of skill of paying within 30 days is just some of the causes of irregular expenditure.

The department received the qualified audit report, a regression from the previous financial year and senior management appears to be one of the culprits. The Auditor-General has identified a host of challenges faced by the department. The increase in residence and accommodation in missions is alarming and must be dealt with and the audit plan of action was not implemented.

Whilst some of the challenges go back many years, very little or no progress was made in addressing these challenges. What

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 108

the department lacks its consequence management. The NFP notes the recommendations made by the committee but it is doubtful whether the department has the capacity and the will to address this. However, we are quite hopeful with the Minister in place, the assistance by the Deputy Minister and the department that progress would be made in the 2019-20 financial year.

The downgrading of the South African Embassy in Israel to a Liaison Office which is long overdue whilst not implemented has seen many Palestinians being massacred with the human rights violations. Now that the Deputy Minister is here, it is about 335 days since you took a resolution in your conference in Bloemfontein and nothing has been done about it.

When will we address this as a starting point to bring peace to the Middle East? Equally, we are not expressing our disgust and we are silent about the killing of the journalist Adnan Khashoggi who was massacred in the most careless manner in Turkey by the Saudi prince. The NFP supports the report tabled here today.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 109

Mr M S A MASANGO: House Chair, the ANC is in full support of the report and recommends to this august House that the report be adopted because the overall performance of the department has been excellent in terms of its core mandate. South Africa has just been re-elected for a third term to serve in the United Nation Security Council by an overwhelming majority of the General Assembly.

South Africa serves in the African Union Peace and Security Council and plays a useful role in the United Nations, an African Union peacekeeping mission all over the world, including in Africa. She is seen by a global community as an honest and impartial mediator between or amongst countries and political parties. She continues to condemn human rights violations anywhere in the world.

However, there are a few weaknesses that are part of our findings and are followed by corresponding recommendations that the senior management of the department has undertaken to improve and implement respectively. I herewith congratulate all the hon members of this committee for their constructive inputs in the consideration and adoption of the Foreign

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 110

Service Bill this morning. This is a historic landmark because since 1994 South Africa did not have a legislation that created a single and professional foreign service.

IsiNdebele:

Ngibawa-ke abantu bekhethu, bengiyabancenga bonyana njengoba babona kusiphuka amagade, kuyasetjenzwa, inarha iyatjhugululwa kulwiwa nomthlago ngalababadosiphambili abangapha. Abathi umnyaka ozako nabayokuvoda bavule amehlo, bawakhuphe enyameni, baqale iinzukulu zabogalajani, nalaba abambatha ngendlela ehlukileko ... [Kwaphela isikhathi.]

English:

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Order, hon members. The motion is that the report be adopted. Are there any objections? In light of the objection I will now put the question. Those in favour will say, aye.

Hon MEMBERS: Eye!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Those against will say, no.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 111

Hon MEMBERS: No!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): I think the ayes have it.

Division demanded.

The House divided.

[Take in from Minutes.]

Motion agreed to.

Report accordingly adopted.

**CONSIDERATIONS OF BUDGETARY REVIEW AND RECOMMENDATION REPORT
OF PORTFOLIO COMMITTEE ON ARTS AND CULTURE**

There was no debate.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: Chairperson, I move:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 112

That the Report be adopted.

Declarations of vote made on behalf of the Democratic Alliance, Economic Freedom Fighters, Inkatha Freedom Party, National Freedom Party and African National Congress.

Declarations of vote:

Dr G A GROOTBOOM: hon Speaker, the Report has been tabled and we have no legitimate reason not to support the Report.

However, be as it may fruitless and wasteful expenditure in the sector of more than R44,8 million in the period under review is an indication of this department inability to curb this malpractice. It is also an indictment against the executive officers. Of the R44,4 million, R32,2 was for rent of a building that remained unoccupied for more than a year.

Furthermore, fruitless and wasteful expenditure of the Ditsong Museums has exhausted about 25% of its budget. Then, yesterday the Minister explained at length the measures that would be put in place to curb this. However, when the Minister made the remark that we will not send them to the gallows, basically he is saying to the officials that they could go on misspending

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 113

government's money. The only thing lacking in this Report is how the punitive measures would be instituted so that we can curb this malpractice.

Finally, the implementation of Grab 103 on an ongoing basis would require additional funding. The entire cost of this accounting practice has yet to be costed by Treasury. I think Treasury will have to go back to the drawing board visa versa the implementation of Grab 103. I thank you. [Applause.]

Ms N F K HLONYANA: Hon Chairperson, the EFF rejects the Budgetary Review and Recommendation Report of the Portfolio Committee of Arts and Culture. We will hammer this point until it begins to make sense to the ANC as a ruling party that fought relentlessly against colonial and apartheid repression.

It makes absolutely no sense and it is actually offensive that we still have parts of an apartheid national anthem forming part of the anthem of the democratic state. Die stem must be removed as soon as possible from our national anthem. It is the right thing to do. The same goes for all the statues of apartheid and colonial leaders we have all around us, they

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 114

must fall. They must fall as a matter of urgency. We have our own heroes and heroines. Who must remain unrecognised? We must start with this one outside Parliament ...

IsiZulu:

... seNdlovukazi yamaNgisi.

English:

Secondly, it is not chastinous that the Department of Arts and Culture has allowed the degeneration at the national archives to get to the state it is in today. We have no solid system of keeping and storing crucial historical material because our national archives are in tatters. We have deprived the future generation of properly stored historical materials. The ANC must never be forgiven for doing so.

Thirdly, the ANC has overseen massive looting at all the entities under this department and this must be immediately subjected to forensic investigation. We cannot approve such conduct. Therefore, as the EFF we reject this Budgetary Review and Recommendation Report. Thank you.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 115

Ms L L VAN DER MERWE: Chairperson, sorry hon Chairperson, I am here.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon Van der Merwe, yes.

Ms L L VAN DER MERWE: Sorry. Hon Nkomo will be speaking from her seat, if you would allow her. Thank you very much.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Thank you. Can we allow hon Nkomo first, hon Khubisa? Thank you.

Ms M J NKOMO: Thank you very much, Madam. I am reading this report on behalf of hon Esterhuizen who is not with us today. The accelerated and shared growth initiative of South Africa has identified our creative industries as one of the best drivers of sustainable economic opportunities and the manner in which the livelihood of our local communities can be immediately improved. Therefore it is of great concern as regards to the deficits in this department especially the internal controls which have resulted in inadequate processes and monitoring of controls.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 116

It was also found during our oversight visit that the opportunity or appointments specifically seemingly were orchestrated to favour certain individuals who were highly incompetent. These appointments on renovations were done and they were never completed. All resulted in the communities concerned losing privileges and access to state-owned art centres. This department introduced the heritage promotion and preservation in libraries which must therefore ensure that the learners receive education that do not only empower them in terms of technical skills but also create skills that set examples in their own culture and traditions. The IFP will support this Report. Thank you.

Prof N M KHUBISA: House Chairperson, we welcome the Report tabled here today. This department has a mandate to focus on the language, culture, naming of places, access to information on land to some extent and education. The department seeks to unleash the potential of arts and culture and heritage to contribute to job creation, economic growth and development through the Mzansi golden economy strategy.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 117

Having said that, Chairperson, this department has done fairly well in on the process of naming places although it sometimes it takes too long. It is noted also that this department has done also well through the collection of the remains of our heroes and heroines.

Mr M N PAULSEN: Is hon Semanya okay, she is dosing off and waking up ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): We will check that. Take your seat, we will check that. Thank you!

Mr M N PAULSEN: She doesn't look well. She is dosing off all the time.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): We will check your concern. Thank you.

Mr M N PAULSEN: Ja, you must check.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Don't worry. Sit down. Hon Khubisa must continue. Continue, hon Khubisa.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 118

Prof N M KHUBISA: It is also noted that this department has done well regarding the collections of the remains of our heroes and heroines who were buried in other countries or whilst they were still in exile fighting for the liberation of our country.

However, it is noted that some entities has not performed well in the financial year 2017-2018. For instance, the Ditsong Museums of South Africa incurred irregular expenditure on the following items: R12,793 for services rendered without a purchase order. R960 162 for a contract continued on a monthly basis without a proper documentation and clarification. R26,5 million bid to advertise for less than 21 days without the approval from the National Treasury. When it comes to heritage assets the Auditor-General was unable to obtain sufficient and appropriate audit evidence for valuation of heritage assets. This is because the entity did not maintain complete records of information used to determine values of heritage.

Chairperson, having said that, the NFP agrees with the recommendations of the portfolio committee. I know Hlengwa will be excited. The NFP agrees with the recommendations of

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 119

the portfolio committee that there should be a clear plan for funding films and bursaries and it should be documented. The National Freedom Party supports this Report.

Mr M HLENGWA: Welcome back home.

Ms L L VAN DER MERWE: Chairperson, I just want to welcome the professor back to the IFP.

Motion agreed to.

Report accordingly adopted.

IsiXhosa:

Nkz X S TOM: Siyi ANC siliqhwebela izandla isebe ngendlela elisebenzise yayo imali kulonyaka sithetha ngawo. Kuba Nompicothi Zincwadi uyivumile indlela esetshenzise ngayo imali enikwe elisebe. Kananjalo indlela amaqumrhu asebenze ngayo ingakumbi emva kokufumana imali kwiSebe lezeMali ukuncedisana nawo ku-Grab 103 obehleli ewasokulisa kakhulu entities ze-department. Zithe zakufumana lemali sibonile

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 120

amaqumrhu esuka kuqualified audit afumana iclean audit. Noko siyiqhwabela izandla lonto. [Kwaqhwatywa.]

Nendlela isebe elenza ngayo ekulandeleni, kuba siyikomiti sisithathile isiqgibo sentoba njengoko imali eninzi yesebe inxenye yemali yayo isiwa ngaphandle kwe-department kumaqumrhu nakuma entities ezingaphandle sathatha isiqgibo sokuba sizawuhlala siyijonge indlela ekusetshenziswa ngayo. Siyavuya ke ngoku siyikomiti intoba indlela elenza ngayo ukulandelela imisebenzi eyenziwa ngababantu babanikimali. Kodwa ke into esifuna ukuyiqininisa kakhulu yeyokuba makufumaneka indlela yokucacisa uba ulawulo luphi na kuba amanye alamaqumrhu kuyacaca ukuba afuna ukwenza unothanda into keleyo engalunganga. Siyayibulela kakhulu i-department ngokulandela izinto esiziphakamisayo siyikomiti. Enkosi. [Kwaqhwatjwa.]

English:

Motion agreed to (Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Report accordingly adopted.

CONSIDERATION OF BUDGETARY REVIEW AND RECOMMENDATION REPORT OF

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 121

PORTFOLIO COMMITTEE ON SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT

There was no debate.

The Deputy Chief Whip of the Majority Party moved: That the Report be adopted.

Declarations of vote:

Ms A T KHANYILE: Hon House Chair, we have a Minister who does not know what is happening in her department. Yesterday during the Question Time and answer session, she confidently responded that biometrics was not suspended. Well, the Minister as usual is not here. The biometrics were suspended amid the National Education, Health and Allied Workers' Union, Nehawu, strike as per presentation made by the SA Social Security Agency, Sassa, on 7 November 2018 at the portfolio committee and that will certainly open doors for more corruption, more ghost recipients and more unauthorised recipients.

One would not expect the Minister to know this because she has never attended the portfolio committee meetings except when

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 122

she came to be introduced. The Auditor-General report indicated that the department regressed, irregular expenditure increased from R376 to R517 million.

With regard to most common findings on supply management, there were 67% where written quotations were not invited, 33% contracts were awarded to bidders who did not score the highest points in the bid evaluation and there was no justification for deviation.

Thirty three per cent contracts were awarded to contractors who were not registered with the Construction Industry Development Board, CIDB. Officials who deliberately and negligently ignored their duties and contravened the legislation are not held accountable for their actions.

Given all these, mothers cannot afford to feed their children because the child grant is still below the food poverty line and this is criminal in a context where 10 million adults are unemployed. The DA rejects this budget. I thank you.

[Applause.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 123

Ms N R MASHABELA: Hon House Chair, the Department of Social Development whilst is one of the most important departments in government, has been one of the most inefficient and the worst run departments, for many years. Under the Minister Bathabile Dlamini, the social grant system was nearly collapsed and civil society constantly had to take the department to court. However, even under the new Minister, this department is failing to live up to its responsibilities. One of the reasons for this is the department's lack of sufficient budget.

This department's mission statement is to ensure that the provision of comprehensive social protection services against poverty within the constitutional and legislative framework and to create an enabling environment for sustainable development.

While as an organisation, the EFF does not believe that grants are the long-term solution to our country's problems. Because of the ANC government's embrace of the neoliberal economics, unemployment, inequality and poverty continue to rise, meaning more and more people are forced to rely on social grants to survive. However, the size of social grants are so small that

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 124

to expect any individual, let alone a family to rely on the social grant shows a lack of empathy and understanding of the plight of the poor and does not speak to the department's mission.

Since the founding of the EFF, we have called for all social grants to be doubled. There is nothing comprehensive about a child grant of R410 and to expect a mother to support her child and provide it with a life of dignity on less than R500 a month. It is ridiculous and we will never accept it. There is money available in the country to double the social grants. All we need is the political will. The EFF rejects this report. I thank you. [Applause.]

Ms L L VAN DER MERWE: Hon House Chairperson, the Department of Social Development has just emerged from the SA Social Security Agency, Sassagate. It was a self-made crisis. A crisis at the behest of the ANC. A crisis led by the former Minister of Social Development. It was a crisis which in every way sought to benefit Cash Paymaster Services, CPS. A company with dodgy business practices who stole from the poor through

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 125

illegal deductions and make billions from the state while holding an unlawful contract.

Just two months ago the Constitutional Court found that the former Minister of Social Development was indeed guilty of having engineered this crisis. It is therefore unforgivable today that this Minister who placed at risk the lives of the most vulnerable in our society continues to serve in this so-called new dawn Cabinet. [Interjections.]

President Ramaphosa's decision today, to keep Minister Bathabile Dlamini in his Cabinet is another clear indication that the ANC has completely lost its moral compass that you do not care about the poor, that you do not care about the rulings and findings of the Constitutional Court and that you care even less about accountability. I think it is absolutely shameful and I hope the voters of our country are taking note.

Hon House Chairperson, while this department was grappling with its own self-made crisis other critical issues were neglected. Under the new Minister Shabangu the fight against

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 126

gender-based violence which this department leads on behalf of government has not received the support it deserves.

Shelters and NGOs that provide with vital services on behalf of the state have not received the support they deserve. Six million children in our country are living below the poverty line; they too have not been given the support they deserve. The plight and lack of social workers in our country have also not been given the attention they deserve. This is clearly a recipe for disaster and these issues must be addressed without further delay. The IFP cannot support this report. I thank you. [Applause.]

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Hon House Chair, the NFP supports the report tabled here today. [Applause.] A matter of concern is the issue of the White Paper on social welfare which I think is long overdue and the process needs to be accelerated. A matter of further concern is the underspending in the HIV/Aids programme. Whilst the value for money is not achieved the NFP notes with concern that vast sums of money are spent on S and Ts, Subsistence and Travelling Allowance for officials and this must be reduced immediately.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 127

A recommendation by the committee to make use of local fieldworkers to carry out certain projects in this regard is welcomed.

Now on Chairperson, once again irregular expenditure and this time of R82 million as a result of noncompliance seems to be a norm throughout all departments. Again it is as a result of there being no consequence management. Unless we deal with consequence management this is not going to change anytime soon.

I do appreciate and understand it is a time for electioneering so, we are going to hear a lot. However, it is the view of the NFP that we need to work collectively to be able to find solutions to the challenges and problems some of these departments are facing. There has been some improvement in SA Social Security Agency, Sassa, and I must admit that and there have been serious challenges in the past.

Now, one of the matters of concern to us is the social grant system and whether it is going to be sustainable in the long-term and I think the time has come for us to look at

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 128

alternatives. People certainly cannot survive on R1 500 or R1 600 and R300 really it is not possible.

The other issue is the issue of children who are receiving social grants. It is not actually going to route to the children themselves; parents are receiving them and foster parents not even spending those monies on the children. Children are not going to school. Previously there used to be a system to monitor that attendants and report in school before ... [Inaudible.] ... The NFP will support this report. Thank you, very much. [Time expired.]

Sesotho:

Ms S P TSOLELI: Modulasetulo, re le mokgatlo wa ANC re tshehetsa raporoto ena ya Lefapha la Social Development. Re utlwisisa haholo hobane lefapha lena le ile la ba le diqoloso tse ngata dilemong tse pedi tse fitileng. Haholoholo qoloso e ile ya ba ka sehlohong ke qoloso eo ya ho patala ha di ditshehetso tsa ditjhelete feela re ile re ikgotsofatsa ka hara komiti hore ho tloha ka nako eo ho ne ho na le diqoloso tseo ho fihlela hona jwale, ma Afrika Borwa kaofela ao a fumanang tshehetso ena e tswang mmusong ba kgonne ho fumana

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 129

tshehetso ena ntle le tshitiso ya letho hofihlela hape lefapha lena le ile la tshepisa hore ka kgwedi ena ya Lwetse ho tlabo ho sa hlole ho ena le thendara e ntshitsweng ho Cash Paymaster System (CPS). Ene e le kannete ha re bua tjena, lefapha le kgonne hore CPS e ntshuwe ka hara tsamaiso ya ditshehetso tsa ditjhelete.

Re kene tshebetsong eo mmuso o nentse o batla hore ha ele hantle ditshebeletso tsena tsa disthehetso tsa ditjhelete di tsamaiswe ke Post Office le SASSA. Re bua tjena re ikgotsofatsa hore re fihlelletse qoloso eo. Ha e sa hlotse e le phephetso hore ditshehetso tsa ditjhelete di fihle bathong. Ebile rena le tshepo hore ha selemo sena se fela, jwalo ka ha ba tshepitsitse hore e tla be e tswile ka ho phethahala, e tla be e tswile. Re ne re kopa hee ho lefapha hore qoloso e ngwe ke qholoso ena yah ore e shebe lenane tsamaiso la basebetsi. Le moo diphephetso nyana tseo tse teng, re kopa hore ba dishebe ba dilokise.

English:

Yes, we agree there is progress in the department and its agencies and we have confidence that all issues raised this

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 130

Budgetary Review and Recommendation, BRR, Report will be attended to by the department. We therefore urge this House to adopt this report. I thank you. [Applause.]

Question put: That the motion moved by the Deputy Chief Whip of the Majority Party be agreed to.

Division demanded.

The House divided.

[TAKE IN FROM MINUTES].

Motion agreed to.

Report accordingly adopted.

**CONSIDERATIONS OF BUDGETARY REVIEW AND RECOMMENDATION REPORT
OF PORTFOLIO COMMITTEE ON COMMUNICATIONS**

There was no debate.

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 131

The Deputy Chief Whip of the Majority Party moved: That the Report be adopted.

Declarations of Vote:

Afrikaans:

Me V VAN DYK: Voorsitter, die DA aanvaar die tegniese versorging van die komiteeverslag, maar ten spyte van 'n ongekwalifiseerde ouditverslag, is daar kommer oor die verdere regressie van die Agentskap vir Media-ontwikkeling en Verskeidenheid, AMOV, die Film- en Publikasieraad, FPR, en die SABC. Laasgenoemde is, in een woord, soos die ANC, disfunksioneel.

Die DA dring aan op 'n onafhanklike vaardigheids- en salarisoudit voor afleggings. Die AMOV het slegs 45%, of 20 van 44, teikenaanwysers behaal - 'n drastiese regressie van die 2016-17 finansiële jaar. Die DA het verskeie male gevra vir 'n forensiese ondersoek na AMOV aangeleenthede. Die ANC sleep egter voet. Die politieke wil ontbreek. Brand SA en die Departement van Toerisme deel grotendeels dieselfde doelwitte. 'n DA-regering sal beslis duplisering van entiteite beperk om

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 132

te verseker dat die belastingbetalers nie uitgebuit word nie en dat geld eerder aangewend word vir ware langtermyn werkskepping.

Gebrekkige kontinuïteit en leierskap in die regerende party lei tot beleidsonsekerheid. Die vyfde Minister van Kommunikasie is pas aangekondig terwyl die vierde onlangs nog 'n nuwe visie en rigting rondom die uitrol van digitale migrasie voorgestel het om dit weer op die spoor te bring. Wie het dit in die eerste plek die afgelope 11 jaar ontspoor? Die ANC in beheer is die rede dat Suid-Afrika die ITE-oorskakeling van analoog na digital in 2015 en 2018 gemis het - die uitsaaiwese kwesbaar.

Wat visie betref in Suid-Afrika het net die DA 'n implementeerbare, werkbare visie vir hierdie land. Gemeenskapsmedia kry nie genoeg ondersteuning nie. Die digitale gaping vergroot daaglik. Inligtings- en kommunikasietegnologie behoort groter steun te kry om die agterstande van die verlede te help oorbrug. Slegs die DA sal groter beleggersvertroue inboesem en volhoubare transformasie in die kommunikasiesektor verseker. Dankie. [Applous.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 133

English:

Mr M N PAULSEN: House Chairperson, the Department of Communications is in a mess. Thank goodness, government's wrecking ball has been removed from this department. But oh God, the environment is in trouble! At the SABC, which was nearly collapsed and was made bankrupt by individuals within government who allowed and who were active participants in the misuse and abuse of SABC's budget for corrupt activities and state capture. It is not those responsible individuals who are being held accountable. It is ordinary men and women who work at the SABC who have families to feed and who had nothing to do with the corrupt activities of these ANC deployees.

There are being forced to face the consequence of mismanagement, corruption and state capture and because of this, there are being retrenched. Chairperson, we should grant the SABC a guarantee so that innocent people's jobs can be saved. Those who are responsible walk away with multi million rands payouts. Digital migration which was meant to have happened years ago is continuously delayed because of the incompetence of this department and because it has allowed

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 134

itself to be manipulated and become an extension of the Multichoice monopoly.

The SABC is meant to ensure that all South Africans have access to media and news in their own languages and for many that rely on community radio stations for this. But community radio stations are not getting enough support from government. And once again, it is also clear that in this Budgetary Review and Recommendation Report, BRRR, they have not been properly prioritised. They are many other challenges and fundamental problems with the SABC and it is because of this and all that we have mentioned that we reject this BRRR. Thank you very much.

Ms L L VAN DER MERWE: House Chairperson, the now former Minister of Communications, Minister Nomvula Mokonyane once told us that she "would simple pick up the rand when it falls". With such magic powers I had wondered why she was not able to pick up the Department of Communications with the same ease.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 135

It was clear that under her leadership the department continued on its downward spiral, which is probably what necessitated her reshuffling today although she should have been reshuffled out of Cabinet but, it was further evident in her recent admission that government's involvement in their set top box programme has been a massive failure. She further admitted that the ill-fated project had already caused government R10 billion. It is only a reckless government that will squander R10 billion with such ease.

However, probably the most worrying development pertaining to this department is the crisis at the SABC. The SABC stands once more on the brink of a disaster. It finds itself in Intensive Care Unit, ICU, and in need of a government bail out once more.

There is also a crisis at Lotus fm where loyal staff members have been chased away for simple speaking the truth. We, as the IFP stand in solidarity with the Lotus 3. And believe they should be reinstated without further delay.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 136

But let us be clear today that no staff member at the SABC should lose their job because of the years of mismanagement of the SABC. Let us never forget that the SABC's troubles started when it was captured by the likes of Faith Muthambi, Hlaudi Motsoeng and former President Zuma, to name a few. So we hold the view that before the SABC starts scaling jobs of thousands of bread winners.

The now new Minister of Communications and Telecommunications Ms Stella Ndabeni-Abrahams must recoup the millions that were looted from the SABC and lastly, gross mismanagement former ANC comrades Muthambi, Motsoeneng and Mr Zuma. Like paying our TV licences that would be the right thing to do. [Time Expired.]

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Hon House Chair, well, I wouldn't say the Minister, I think it's the former Minister now. She gave the assurance in this House a while ago that the parliamentary channel will be moved to SABC. It has not happened. And in the questions session she gave us a response that certain rural areas were receiving this coverage but, it is not good enough because most of our people - the poorest of the poor cannot

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 137

afford DSTV. And in order to make an impact, I think it is only fair that we move it to an SABC channel. But, more importantly we will be saving millions rands if we do that. So we think it is very important that we are able to do that.

The other challenge was just brought to my attention a short while ago about a programme called "View in the House" which appears at 09:00 am. I am told it was not televised today. There appears to be some rumours that it may be discontinued. Again, this programme - although limited in nature, has a great impact of disseminating information on parliamentary matters to the public.

The Auditor-General has highlighted noncompliance again, not complying with the Public Financial Management Act, PFMA. Again, it is an issue of consequence management. Although the department received a clean audit opinion, there was a total of eight findings which appears to be a norm as the department has received unqualified audit opinions with findings three years in succession.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 138

There are serious allegations in the media of corrupt relationship between SABC and Multichoice, a matter that needs to be thoroughly investigated. The SABC reported a net loss of R622 million and did not achieve its targets. Non payment within 30 days - although it was extended to 60 days have still not being met. While the department has reduced its losses from the previous corporations liabilities far exceeds its assets.

However, the recommendations by the portfolio committee is welcomed and we are of the opinion that if implemented will make a difference. The NFP supports the report tabled. Thank you.

Ms H B MKHIZE: House Chair, I would persuade the House to support this Budgetary Review and Recommendation Report, BRRR. I must say that the ANC is committed in ensuring that the people of South Africa are connected and they are the drivers of the open society through broadcasting in particular.

Since the configuration of this department in splitting into two there has been a commitment to ensure that we don't

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 139

deviate from the principle of convergence, taking into consideration that the technologies we are talking about they are interconnected.

Hon House Chairperson, I just want to talk about a few things. The manufacturing of the set top boxes was the major achievement. Yes, I will be the first one to admit that there was a delay. But, it boosted the manufacturing sector. As we are talking today, about 486 077 set top boxes have been installed for indigent households. There are lesson to be learned that in this sector technologies move very fast. So policy and legislation has to be adapted accordingly.

The question of public broadcasting and community media - the portfolio committee has continued to support and to work very hard in ensuring that even the most remote communities at least they have access to radio stations and that they have got access to critical information which is really about their own development and also that they are at the centre of their own developments.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 140

There are challenges that are brought by the technologies that we are talking about. However, the committee has speedily processed the Film and Publications Amendments Bill. The ANC supports the Bill ... [Time Expired.]

DIVISION CALLED

During division:

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): No, hon member there is committees that are meeting and we gave them permission to meet so we must give them enough time to get back.

Mr N M PAULSEN: One minute? I will see all those older people in their offices running down here in a minute.

Mr H CHAUKE: Chair, the clinic is still open. That hon member Paulsen needs help, honestly. We cannot afford to see what is happening in the House.

Mr N M PAULSEN: Chauke, you must not push!

Division demanded.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 22 NOVEMBER 2018

Page: 141

The House divided.

[TAKE IN FROM MINUTES].

Motion agreed to.

Report accordingly adopted.

Business concluded.

The House adjourned at 17:37.