

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 1**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

---

***PROCEEDINGS OF THE NATIONAL ASSEMBLY***

---

The House met at 14:00.

The Speaker took the Chair and requested members to observe a moment of silence for prayer or meditation.

The SPEAKER: Hon members, the only item on today's Order Paper is questions addressed to the President, which stood over from 18 October 2018. Members may press the "talk" button on their desks if they wish to ask a supplementary question. I wish to remind hon members that the names of members requesting supplementary questions will be cleared as soon as the hon President starts answering the fourth supplementary questions.

Before we proceed, I would also like to remind hon members that Question 19 was approved as an urgent question for today's Question Session in terms of Rule 141(5). As a result, the question will take precedence over all other questions.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 2**

The question has been asked by the hon the Leader of the Opposition. I request the hon the President to proceed to the podium. [Applause.]

**QUESTIONS TO THE PRESIDENT**

Question 19:

The PRESIDENT OF THE REPUBLIC: Speaker and hon members, let me start by thanking you for your indulgence for having been understanding. When I was supposed to answer questions here, I was indisposed, and you were kind enough to kind a postponement of this session to enable me to answer questions today, so I thank you for your understanding.

Shortly after becoming President, I received briefings on various matters by different government departments. One of these briefings was from National Treasury, where I was alerted to alleged corruption at the VBS Mutual Bank. I was informed that the SA Reserve Bank, specifically the Prudential Authority, had initiated an investigation into this matter. In response to my request for a comprehensive report on VBS, I received a briefing from Treasury, as well as from the Reserve Bank, on the report submitted by Adv Terry Motau, just before

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 3**

its public release. The report presents a deeply disturbing picture of theft and corruption on a massive scale.

It is essential that all those responsible for facilitating this fraud and this corruption, and all those who benefited from it, must be held accountable. We call on all the relevant institutions and, in fact, we insist that all relevant institutions must act swiftly to prosecute those responsible but also to move with greater speed to recover the funds stolen from the bank's depositors. [Applause.] Most of these depositors are pensioners, old men and women, who had put their life savings into VBS, and there are also stokvels and burial societies who are struggling, as it is now, to bury their dead because their money is lost. It is also the municipalities of various areas in our country.

Action must also be taken against those municipal officials, and in some cases they include political officials, who deposited council funds into VBS, knowing that it was not legal, and whose actions could lead to significant financial losses for those municipalities. It is particularly disturbing that many of the people who have suffered loss as a result of these crimes are the poor rural residents of our country.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 4**

It is critical that every effort is made to recover those monies to minimise the losses suffered by the bank's depositors. For much of its existence, VBS was a good bank for ordinary people, a bank that gave loans and mortgages to people in rural areas – and now, through greed, deception, and theft, that bank has been destroyed.

We take a dim view of those who have been implicated in criminal activity rushing to court to try and hide their malfeasance and not making any effort to apologise to those who have lost money. [Interjections.] What they do is to rush to court and not even have a single word of apology to those who have lost money. The real tragedy of VBS is that money was stolen from those in our society who could least afford it.

It is a tragedy that has repeated itself across several of our state-owned enterprises, SOEs, in municipalities, and with respect to several private companies. For the sake of our people and our economy, I believe that we need to make a decisive break with those corrupt practices and build a new era of integrity and honesty in our public and private institutions.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 5**

That is why we must act against those responsible for destroying VBS and for against those – in private companies, in SOEs and in other parts of the state – who are trying to steal our country's future. I thank you.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Speaker, through you to the President: I think I agree with you that what took place at VBS was a complete disgrace. In this particular instance, these are politically connected people who stole money from poor South Africans and stole their life savings, where the rich are protected and they steal from the poor and the unemployed. This culture is pervasive for those who are on the inside, connected to the ANC ... [Interjections.] ... and those who are on the outside, the poor people.

Mr President, here I hold a proof of payment that was transferred to say that R500 000 had to be transferred to a trust account called EFG2 on 18 October 2017. This was allegedly put for your son, Andile Ramaphosa. [Interjections.] Following on that, I have a sworn affidavit from Peet Venter, stating that he was asked by the chief executive officer of Bosasa to make this transfer for Andile Ramaphosa.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 6**

Mr President, we can't have family members benefiting.

[Interjections.] I would want to ask you, right here today, that you bring our nation into confidence and please set the record straight on this matter. Thank you very much.

[Applause.]

The PPRESIDENT OF THE REPUBLIC: Speaker and the hon Maimane, this matter was brought to my attention. It was brought to my attention some time ago. I proceeded to ask my son what this was all about. He runs a financial consultancy business, and he consults for a number of companies, and one of those companies is Bosasa ... [Interjections.] ... where he provides services on entrepreneurship, particularly on the procurement process. He advises both local and international companies.

Regarding this payment, I can assure you, Mr Maimane, that I asked him at close range whether this was money obtained illegally, unlawfully - and he said this was a service that was provided. To this end, he actually even showed me a contract that he signed with Bosasa. [Interjections.] The contract also deals with issues of integrity, issues of anticorruption, and all that.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 7**

The SPEAKER: Order! Order, hon members! Let's listen to the President's answer. [Interjections.]

The PPRESIDENT OF THE REPUBLIC: On this one, I have made sure that I get as much information as I can.

An HON MEMBER: Really?

The PPRESIDENT OF THE REPUBLIC: He is running a clear and honest business as an advisory service, as he has been trained as a consultant with his business science qualification. I have had no idea or inkling whatsoever at what he has informed me, that this money was obtained illegally. If it turns out - Mr Maimane, I can assure you if it turns out that there is any illegality and corruption in the way that he has dealt with this matter, I will be the first, the absolute first, to make sure that he becomes accountable ... [Interjections.] ... even if it means ... [Applause.] ... I can assure you, even if it means that I am the one to take him to the police station. That I will be able to do. [Interjections.]

I am clear about that, and I can let you in on something else. I have told my children that you do not do any business with a

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 8**

state-owned enterprise. You do not do any business with government. That is what I have told them. [Interjections.] Yes, they listen to me, but I do know from time to time some of these errors and some of these activities can surface. The filter that I want you to know I apply, as their father, is that if there is any illegality, if there is any corruption, I am going to be the first one to take them to jail myself, if need be. That I will do. [Interjections.] I will not allow that. That is what I want you to know.

The SPEAKER: The hon Molebatsi? The hon Molebatsi? What's happening? Can I call on the hon Magadla?

The PRESIDENT OF THE REPUBLIC: Alright, Madam Speaker, if there is no further question, that is nice. [Laughter.]

The SPEAKER: So, these were false? Alright. Hon Malema?

Mr J S MALEMA: Speaker, through you to the President: We wrote a letter to the hon Blade Nzimande to ask him if the VBS paid R3 million to the Birchwood Hotel for the SACP conference. [Interjections.] We are expecting him to answer truthfully and honourably.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 9**

The point I would like to make, hon President, is that if the answer you gave is an acceptable answer to your colleagues, then the same answer stands with Brian Shivambu.

[Interjections.] It cannot be that if it is your children with contracts and invoices and they can account for the work they have done, it is acceptable, but when it comes to Brian Shivambu, it is a different matter altogether.

[Interjections.]

My question is the following: This bank, having been formed by the father of the current king, worked very well under the Bantustan and provided services to our people, which commercial banks do not provide to our people. Today, we find ourselves in this situation. Do we close down the school because the principal and the management stole the school fees and not only stole the school fees but vandalised the school? Once we come to the conclusion that they have stolen, they vandalise the school. Do we close the school, or do we arrest the culprits and save the school? [Interjections.] [Applause.]

THE PRESIDENT OF THE REPUBLIC: Madam Speaker, that is a good question, but before I get to that, hon Malema, let me come back to this one. The question that was asked by the hon

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 10**

Maimane about my son, Andile, has nothing to do with VBS. I think that should be clear. It has to do with Bosasa. So, he has not been involved in VBS. VBS is a different matter.

[Interjections.]

I think the question that the hon Malema raises is a very good question: Do we close down the school because the principal has been involved in shenanigans and what have you? Clearly, the answer to that is no. I am one of those, hon Malema, who have a great deal of affection for and almost loyalty to the VBS. I have known about VBS since way back because it operated in the place where my parents grew up and where I am from originally. The problem with it is that it is laden with a great deal of debt. The only way to clean it up is to put it into liquidation. However, the notion, the idea, of a VBS, in my view, should remain alive because that is a bank, as you correctly say, that served people in the rural areas, that served the poor, and that is a bank that many poor people in the rural areas had a great deal of confidence in, much more than many other banks.

I would say, in the end, we should revive VBS, maybe to raise it from the ashes and re-establish a VBS which is clean, which

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 11**

will operate along the principles that the original VBS was established for. Once we have cleaned up this mess, I would support that VBS should be re-established and should rise from the ashes. So, I agree with you on that score.

[Interjections.] You should be applauding, Ntate Malema. Hau!

[Laughter.]

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Speaker, through you to the President: What is very clear is that after many people in South Africa loot, steal, rob, do everything, from and to the poorest of the poor, we only tend to find out much later.

The question is the following: Do you not believe there is a weakness in the system if we find out at a stage after the money has already been taken and stolen? Secondly, based on allegations - many people have paid a very high price in this House - that a public representative in this House received R16 million in his account for a person that was owning a spaza shop a week before and nobody questioned it, shouldn't there be some consequences or suspension from this august House for a person of that calibre who did not question how R16 million came in? [Interjections.]

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 12**

The PRESIDENT OF THE REPUBLIC: Speaker, with regard to pre-emptive action that needs to be taken, I think we have done very well in terms of looking at the Auditor-General's Public Audit Amendment Bill, making sure that we give the Auditor-General teeth so that if the Auditor-General finds there is any form of malfeasance or corruption taking place, it should be able to take action on a proactive basis without waiting, as the normal auditing process happens that they take action later on. That in itself is going to begin to address the issues that you are raising, hon Shaik Emam, because if we are able to see wrong being done and step into the breach and stop it, all the better.

With regard to members who are represented here being involved in these matters or being suspended or whatever, I think we have to rely on the Rules of Parliament. The ethics processes in Parliament should be able to deal with these matters. Speaker, you are the over-lady of all these matters, and your ethics committee should be able to deal with these matters of things that are wrongly done by Members of Parliament. Thank you very much.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 13**

Mr S N SWART: Speaker and hon President, the ACDP is in agreement that what happened at VBS is indeed a tragedy. In a more general sense, what is concerning is that such rampant theft, fraud, and corruption have repeated itself, as you indicated, across state-owned companies, SOCs, municipalities, and state departments. We are indeed facing a severe breakdown in basic morality. We welcome your call for a decisive break to build a new era of integrity in our institutions. There is indeed a need for intervention. All of us need to take responsibility.

Hon President, can faith-based organisations, including churches, not play a much greater role in instilling a culture of honesty and integrity in our nation, and should we not be embracing faith-based organisations to start preaching about integrity and honesty, given the moral crisis that we are facing when it comes to looting and pillaging? Thank you.

The PPRESIDENT OF THE REPUBLIC: Madam Speaker, I think we should be clear that the state-owned enterprises are not the only preserve of such horrible activities like acts of corruption and malfeasance. Even in the private sector, we have seen unbelievable acts of corruption, theft, and

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 14**

malfeasance. You just need to name Steinhoff. You just need to name a few of these companies. They are also involved in such.

Clearly, the real challenge for us as a nation is the issue of morality, the issue of integrity, and when these activities take place, they actually are an attack on the moral fibre of our nation. That is where all of us have to play a role. It is not only faith-based organisations that should play a role. Political parties themselves must play a role by adhering to their value system. Each political party will claim that they operate on the basis of integrity and all that, but these things still happen. We need to get all sectors of society to recommit itself to good behaviour, to good morals, to integrity, and to making sure that the moral culture in our country is well promoted.

I have been very keen to meet with faith-based organisations to discuss this very issue with them. So, your statement in this regard falls on very fertile ears, as far as I am concerned, because it is one of those issues that I would like to discuss with them and ask what we should do or what more we can do as a nation. What role can faith-based organisations play in helping to lift the moral fibre of our nation, the

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 15**

integrity of people, as a whole? So, in the coming weeks, that is exactly what I would like to do. All of us need to play a role. [Interjections.]

Yes, the criminal justice system must play its own role. One of the challenges that we face, of course, is that when these things happen, people who are victims of this become impatient because they see the criminal justice system moving far too slowly. They see people who have been involved in acts of theft just moving around freely without any accountability happening around them. [Interjections.] That is where, for instance, we need a criminal justice system that is more precise, that is very quick in acting, so that we can re-instil the confidence of our people in their criminal justice system. That is where maybe a discussion with faith-based organisations will also help because they have a contribution to make. Thank you very much for coming up with that. Thank you.

Question 20:

The PRESIDENT OF THE REPUBLIC OF SOUTH AFRICA: Hon members, the economic stimulus and recovery plan announced on 21 September outlined decisive steps to rebuild investor

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 16**

confidence and mobilise investments to unlock the growth potential of the South African economy.

The plan, in many ways, recognises that infrastructure expansion and maintenance of our infrastructure is a critical driver of economic activity and has the potential to create a large number of jobs.

Government, as we speak, is in the process of setting up the infrastructure fund that we announced, to manage government's infrastructure expenditure, which has been budgeted at R400 billion over the medium-term expenditure framework period, and to focus on more effective execution of such projects.

In addition to this budgeted funding, state-owned enterprises will continue to invest in new energy, transport and water infrastructure.

Government is seeking to build meaningful partnerships with the private sector, to design the infrastructure fund and oversee project implementation. The fund will have wonderful benefits. It will reduce fragmentation in infrastructure spend

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 17**

and will work with the Presidential Infrastructure Co-ordinating Commission, PICC, to strengthen co-ordination, and that will lead to the improvement of delivery.

We will draw on individuals with a range of expertise and who are well experienced in the delivery field, particularly with regard to large projects, including people who know about project management as well as people who have engineering skills.

The fund will develop a strong pipeline of bankable projects and many of those projects are already on the table. They will also help to improve project design, prioritise projects effectively and strengthen the capacity of existing institutions tasked with project implementation.

National Treasury is exploring the possibility of establishing blended concessional finance solutions to mobilise private and public-sector funding.

Opportunities to draw institutional investors, ... There are quite a number of investors who have indicated their willingness to participate, like the pension funds and

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 18**

insurance companies. They are willing to participate and we are exploring all this.

We will draw on the PICC, the Government Technical Advisory Centre, the Development Bank of Southern Africa and others to provide technical assistance.

Both the economic stimulus and recovery plan and the framework agreement adopted at the recent Presidential Jobs Summit also identified projects and what needs to be done to infrastructure in mining and tourism. Government has prioritised a number of key reforms in quite a number of these sectors.

The Mining Charter has been revised. This is the outcome of extensive consultation between various role players. In agriculture, we will finalise the signing of 30-year leases to enable farmers to mobilise funding. All these things are going to add on to our resolve to make sure that the stimulus package works effectively.

These are among the areas where progress is being made to remove all the obstacles, to increased investment and to make

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 19**

more effective use of our public resources to promote growth and job creation. I thank you.

Mr B A RADEBE: Hon Speaker, hon President, during the state of the nation address, you gave a commitment that you will raise R1,3 trillion to reignite the economic growth so that we can fight the scourge of unemployment, poverty and inequality. We are grateful that you have walked the talk of Thuma Mina [send me] and raised more than R400 billion from the United Arab Emirates, Saudi Arabia and China.

What is more important is that, after the announcement of the economic stimulus of R50 billion, the investment compress was able to raise the pledges of more than R290 billion from the South African investors. This marked the end of an investment boycott by local businesses. [Interjections.]

My constituency also wants policy certainty, in particular concerning the radical social economic transformation. Coming from the 2010 World Cup infrastructure, we know very well that the black industrialists, the SMMEs did not participate effectively in creating and maintaining that infrastructure.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 20**

What will your government do to ensure that our SMMEs are getting 30% set-aside as procurement policies in these various projects? [Interjections.] In terms of the agreement of the job summit, what will the role of civil society, Parliament and all the stakeholders be in ensuring that this noble project finds reality and creates more employment? Thank you.

The PRESIDENT OF THE REPUBLIC OF SOUTH AFRICA: Hon Speaker, the setting up of the execution unit that we have spoken about, which will exist alongside of this infrastructure fund, will address precisely the issues that hon Radebe is talking about.

The extent to which small and medium enterprises and emerging black businesses will participate in infrastructure projects is going to be something that this unit will look at with the eye of a hawk, to make sure there is set-aside for small and medium enterprises and particularly black emerging businesses, that they participate effectively in these projects and that they are not just bystanders.

One of the things that we clearly want to focus on is not just infrastructure built, but also infrastructure maintenance.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 21**

Maintenance is one of the key issues that we need to look at.

Yesterday, I had the occasion to go to the Free State and visit a clinic in an area called Heidedal. The clinic has existed for a number of years. As you walk into the clinic, you clearly see that it has not been maintained over many years. The result of that is that we now need to do major repair work over small maintenance projects that we could have worked on over a number of years. So, maintenance is therefore very important.

As we build infrastructure, we would like to immediately have a facility that will maintain that infrastructure, going forward, because that is a lot cheaper than having to do major overhauls.

This is where small and medium enterprises will play a key role. We also want, as we said in the stimulus plan, to focus on small and medium enterprises in the townships as well as in the rural areas. The set-asides are going to be so well calibrated that they enable those businesses to get on and succeed.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 22**

Therefore, we want to create a number of opportunities, not only for the big companies, but largely for the smaller companies because it is through smaller companies that we are able to create many more jobs. Thank you.

Mr P J GROENEWALD: Hon President, part of the question is on attracting investors, specifically in the agricultural sector. On an international platform, on Bloomberg, you specifically said, and I quote: "No white farmers are killed in South Africa." The official response from your office is that you only reacted to a tweet of President Trump.

*Afrikaans:*

Ongeag of u nou op die twiet van President Trump gereageer het, die werklikheid is, wit boere word wreedaardig in Suid-Afrika vermoor. Dit is dus onwaar om te sê dat wit boere nie vermoor word nie. [Tussenwerpsels.] My vraag is: Is die agb President bereid om daardie families en geliefdes van die wit boere wat in Suid-Afrika vermoor is vandag omverskoning te vra, omdat u dit gesê het en sodende erkenning gee aan daardie leed wat hulle moet ervaar?

*English:*

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 23**

You preferred to refer to white farmers and that is why they are now the subject. I thank you. [Interjections.]

*Afrikaans:*

Die PRESIDENT VAN DIE REPUBLIEK VAN SUID-AFRIKA: Ek is bereid om mooi te verduidelik, want baie mense het nie mooi verstaan wat ek gesê het nie.

*English:*

I was responding to President Trump's tweet when he said in his tweet that white farmers and white people are being killed. I said: No, that is not true. I was specifically referring to that. The fact is that yes, white farmers are being killed, including black people on farms as well. That is the reality that we are living with. [Applause.]

So, the killing of a number of people in our country is something that concerns me. It should concern all of us. I will never categorise it as just saying white. It is people in our country that are getting killed. I have to be completely nonracial when it comes to this. I was responding to Trump.

Let me then say that I am prepared ...

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 24**

*Afrikaans:*

... om mooi te verduidelik ...

*English:*

... to white families who have lost their loved ones. Let me also add that I have been one of those who, as these killings have happened on both sides, have taken time to phone some families, black and white, to say that I am sorry that this has happened because I see it as my task, as President, to be a nation-builder and not to be parochial in what I do.

[Applause.]

*Afrikaans:*

So, ek sal wil verduidelik, want wat President Trump geskryf het in sy twiet ...

*English:*

... was not the truth. It was not the truth.

*Afrikaans:*

Dit was nie die waarheid nie.

*English:*

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 25**

Why is my Afrikaans disappearing today? Then again, maybe, it is because it is a Tuesday.

*Afrikaans:*

My Afrikaans is baie mooi ...

*English:*

... on Friday. [Laughter.] So, that is my answer to that.

Thank you.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Speaker, Mr President, you have gone on public saying that your government should not speak with forked tongue. I think it is important that when you speak about decisive action, we need to take decisive action on SOEs. The one SOE that is poses a serious threat to our fiscus is SAA. SAA is a fiscal risk to us and it poses a threat tour economy. [Interjections.] Your Minister of Finance has gone on an international record saying that we must allow SAA to fail on its own accord. Your Minister of Public Enterprises has gone on another record saying that it requires stabilisation and an equity partner.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 26**

It sounds like this is the very forked tongue that you are describing. Can you settle with any investor, any South African, what exactly your government policy on SAA is and set the record straight, as it pertains to this fiscal risk to the people of South Africa? What is your policy exactly?

[Applause.]

The PRESIDENT OF THE REPUBLIC OF SOUTH AFRICA: Madam Speaker, hon Maimani, I know your policy and approach of SAA is that it should be closed down. [Interjections.] That is what you keep saying. Now, here is the real reality. SAA is laden with debt right now, as we speak. It is laden with debt for a whole number of reasons. It is an enterprise that is 100% owned by the government that has been operating in a very difficult sector and you could say that other airlines are doing well. Yes, it so, but it is especially laden with debt and its own legacy challenges and problems.

Now, here is the problem. If you were to say today that we must sell SAA, you would not even be able to get any value for it. You would have to possibly pay somebody to take SAA out of your hands. You would have to pay them quite a number of billions of rands because the debt that we carry and that we

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 27**

have underwritten as government is quite significant.

[Interjections.] If we were to say that it must be shut down, it basically means that that debt that SAA carries, ... Hon Steenhuisen, ...

*Afrikaans:*

... luister asseblief. [Tussenwerpsels.]

*English:*

I don't want to do what I did the other time and say, shut up.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Madam Speaker, I am not sure if the upper respiratory tract affected the hearing. I did not say a word. It was somebody else. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Okay, let it not be a discussion.

The PRESIDENT OF THE REPUBLIC OF SOUTH AFRICA: Maybe, I like you so much. If we were, for instance, to say, shut it down, it basically means that the debt that is in SAA now becomes payable immediately. Immediate payment of that debt immediately has an impact on the debt that is carried by all

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 28**

other state-owned enterprises. That is how you are then able to even collapse our fiscus.

Now, SAA must be seen as our collective challenge and problem.

What we have said and what the Minister of Public Enterprises has said and he was clarifying and maybe ... [Interjections.] No, no, no. He was actually trying to elaborate more on what the Minister of Finance was saying and is saying.

[Interjections.] In the end, we have to stabilise SAA. The future for SAA has to be, how we stabilise it, and once stabilised, how we carry on with SAA. One of the options that we are clearly looking at, amongst many others, is how we get a strategic equity partner to come and be our partner in SAA, as we take it forward.

That is the trajectory we need to look at. Some of our state-owned enterprises could well be open for opportunities like that. There is just nothing wrong in saying that we can get a strategic equity partner who is well-steeled in terms of finances and who are really good operators who can expand the business opportunities for SAA, to be our partner and take SAA forward.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 29**

Rather than shut it down, that is one of the options that we are looking at and it promises quite a lot for the future stability of SAA, as we stabilise it, going forward. That is precisely what we are looking at and I hope hon Maimane will begin to change his own approach to our national airline.

Thank you.

Mr J A ESTEHUIZEN: Madam Speaker, Mr President, you mentioned the Mining Charter. The mining industry, which has the biggest potential for job creation is currently struggling with low prices and high operating costs as well as restrictive regulations. Are you not reaching out to the mining industry with one hand - the stimulus plan - and take away with the other through your government introducing a regulatory framework that will increase compliance costs for miners and set off temporary boosts that investors needed? Is that not the direct opposite of what you were trying to create through the economic stimulus plan? How can you rectify this?

The PRESIDENT OF THE REPUBLIC OF SOUTH AFRICA: Hon Speaker, I believe that we have really done an excellent job with the Mining Charter, in terms of the extensive consultation that Minister Gwede Mantashe has had. He has taken the time and

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 30**

trouble to consult quite widely with key role players in the industry and even going beyond that. He has consulted with the workers, communities that are around those mines, and mine owners. He has consulted with mine owners, government officials, but also consulted with traditional leaders and a whole range of role players.

To a large extent, almost a complete extent, many of those who have been consulted voiced their satisfaction with the Mining Charter, as presented to them and everyone else. So, I don't see the Mining Charter as being an impediment any longer to further investment in our industry. I see it as being an enhancer. When we were at the investment summit recently, it was the mine owners and the miners who came forward to announce billions and billions of rands that they want to invest.

NuAmerican, for example, came forward and said that they are prepared to invest up to R70 billion in the industry, which demonstrates their confidence and faith in a growing industry. They are the ones who have said that they see mining as a sunrise industry rather than a sunset industry.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 31**

We are already receiving quite a number of enquiries from a number of investors, both local and offshore, who are saying that they want to invest in various mining commodities.

So, I don't see the Mining Charter itself as being a constraint to further investment in the industry. Of course, there are other issues that still need to be addressed. For instance, energy is a major challenge to the miners. That is where we have come up with the issue of administered prices that certain sectors of our economy do need to be put on the administered prices plane so that we can incentivise them and encourage them to invest and to employ more people.

So, all those things are being looked at in a creative manner and the miners themselves were rather grateful for the initiatives that we have taken and in fact they have even vocalised it quite a lot that this Mining Charter is a great improvement from what we had in the past. It therefore enables their boards of directors to vote further investment into their industry. So, I think we are going to see a lot of investments coming into the mining industry, going forward.

Question 21:

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 32**

The PRESIDENT OF THE REPUBLIC: Madam Speaker, violence in schools is a matter of great concern which calls for co-operation between government, the leadership of schools, parents and communities. It is in the end a symptom of some of the social problems that continue to confront young people. It is a matter that requires concerted and consistent action by all stakeholders. School-based violence undermines the environment necessary for effective teaching and learning. I think all of us will agree that our schools must be places of safety where learners feel and know that they can be safe and secure in an environment that will enhance their learning.

In response to these challenges in schools, the SA Police Service, the SAPS, and the Department of Basic Education have entered into a protocol on school safety. The purpose of this protocol is to create safe, friendly and caring learning environments within schools and to promote multistakeholder collaboration in the fight against criminal activities in schools. Arriving at a protocol like this is an important development.

As a consequence, a number of safety measures have been put in place, including that all schools in the country should be

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 33**

linked to a specific police station so that if any incident of violence occurs, there should be rapid and quick action by the police station. The SAPS has appointed dedicated school safety officers in most areas to serve as liaison officers between the police and the schools. School safety committees have been established, comprising of school management, the police, school governing bodies as well as other relevant stakeholders.

The police themselves, in collaboration with various stakeholders, undertake social crime prevention programmes that focus on issues such as substance abuse; that also focuses on a very prevalent type of activity like bullying, violence prevention, sexual offences and cyber-related matters.

The majority of pupils that are involved in criminal activities are also affected by social challenges, such as substance abuse, domestic violence as well as other crimes in their communities. To address these, the Department of Basic Education, as well as the SAPS, Social Development and Justice have convened a school safety summit. School safety also featured prominently in the National Youth Crime Prevention

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 34**

Summit held recently this year. These activities provide ... as they proceed from the understanding that violence in schools is a social problem which can only be addressed through collaboration between government, various stakeholders and communities, and also through a joint problem solving type of approach. Among these, there are a number of tangible initiatives that are coming out of these collaborative activities.

The strategies that are coming out, aim to integrate government efforts to prevent youth criminality, including ... in institutions of learning. All this is being done so that we can end violence in our schools, criminality in our schools, as well as substance abuse in our schools.

In the end, unless we work together as a society to curb violence in schools and do it as a matter of urgency, we will find it difficult to curb crime and violence in broader society for many years to come. I thank you. [Applause.]

Mr X NGWEZI: Thank you very much, hon Speaker and thank you hon President for your response. Hon President, in the past year your home province of Limpopo experienced 942 cases of

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 35**

pupils attacking teachers. Since January last year, Gauteng schools have expelled 151 children and 31 of those are learners who assaulted teachers. In the Western Cape for example, provincial statistics reveal that over 60 attacks on teachers took place during the first quarter of 2018.

I'm glad you are saying that there is collaboration that has begun with the SAPS, but my question is as follows. Mr President, are you confident that the collaboration with the SAPS is going to yield positive results because I'm afraid even the tools of trade for the SAPS is not enough. If you look at your vehicles that the police use, it's a disaster. In some police stations you will find that when you report a matter they will tell you that there is no car, and they will maybe take 20 hours to attend to the matter while the damage is occurring at schools. So Mr President, are you confident that this process is going to lead to positive results? Thank you.

The PRESIDENT OF THE REPUBLIC: Hon Speaker, yes I am confident. I think the measures and the initiatives that are underway are such that they will yield positive results, notwithstanding the challenges that the police continue to

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 36**

have with regard to not having sufficient tools of trade such as vehicles.

Now, the collaboration between all stakeholders in the school environment that we are enhancing and talking about is very important because it also lays a very good foundation to help us address these challenges of the lack of tools of trade – vehicles and what have you.

Now, we are beginning to address all of this in a focussed manner. A week ago we launched the antigang unit here in the Western Cape which we are going to spread to other areas as well. We were able to give that antigang unit tools of trade such as vehicles so that they are able to address acts of criminality as and when they happen.

Now, this country is quite big and broad. We will be able to spread this out to a number of other areas and ensure that the police do have the tools of trade. Now, obviously it's a budgetary constraint but we are working to make sure that safety and lessening criminality in our country becomes something that we focus on.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 37**

So, you ask if I am confident. Yes, I have a high level of confidence, if you care to know. Thank you very much.

[Applause.]

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Mr President, I think we all agree that the scourge of drug use and related crimes is a ticking time bomb we can't accept. What is factually true is that it was your government – it was the ANC – that decided to shut down these drug units. I'm glad that you have finally come around to DA policy and opened the antidrug unit.

[Applause.] I want to congratulate you.

However, the latest crime statistics tell a worrying story. They say that over the past 10 years of ANC government, reported cases of drug use and crimes have almost tripled, yet conviction rates have decreased. Essentially, from 58% convictions we are now down to 52% of reported cases ending up with convictions. In other words,

*Setswana:*

... ditsotsi di a tshwariwa mme di tswa di boela gape kwa setrateng go tla go tshwenya bana ba rona.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 38**

*English:*

Therefore Mr President, what I'd like to know is what is your government going to do to ensure that we massively increase conviction rates in this area in the criminal justice system?

Thank you very much. {Applause.]

The PRESIDENT OF THE REPUBLIC: Hon Speaker, I'd like to invite hon Maimane to live up to the calling of his faith as a 15.02.56 ... reverend ... [Interjections.] ... to have a little bit more faith. [Interjections.]

Now, we are rolling out a strategy to focus on gangs that inevitably don't only get involved in minor crimes but get involved in drug trafficking, kidnapping and all that. We are rolling out this strategy, which you should be pleased about and which you should have faith in.

Now, what is that going to result in? That is going to result in more arrests taking place. It is also going to result in the communities themselves having more confidence. And believe you me, hon Maimane, I walked the streets of Hanover Park and I was able to talk to a number of residents. I met quite a number of people – men, women and young people – who, as we

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 39**

were rolling out this strategy, said, Mr President, thank you very much. We now have our streets back in our control. We are pleased ... [Applause.] ... that you have now given our streets back into our control and you are now dealing with the criminals, the gangs and what have you.

That means that more gangsters are going to be arrested. We are going to make sure that they get prosecuted. We are going to make sure that they get convicted and we are going to make sure that they go to jail.

Now, having set up the antigang unit, have a little faith. As you get involved in your prayers, have a little faith that this is a solution that is going to lead us forward. Now, with this I have no doubt whatsoever that Minister Cele, his generals and officers are going to be on top of this and they are going to make sure that we reduce the level of incidents of criminality in gang-infested areas, as well as drug peddling and drug selling in those areas. You watch this space. You are going to see changes happening. Thank you very much. [Applause.]

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 40**

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Madam Speaker, the hon Maimane asked a specific question on convictions. The gang unit is not going to deal with convictions. They deal with the arrests. That's not the problem. The problem is convictions. The President hasn't answered the question.

The SPEAKER: Hon Steenhuisen, please take your seat. Let's proceed to the next supplementary question by hon Shaik Emam.  
[Interjections.]

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Thank you hon Speaker. Mr President, I think the problem is bigger than what you make it look like. You are not taking into consideration the contributing factors to crime if you take particularly the Western Cape and spatial planning; if you look at the issue of housing in the Western Cape; if you look at the fact that's there's no water and sanitation. There are even no roads for the police to drive on to be able to go and deal with crime. Drug and substance abuse ... Knowing that alcohol was one of the most serious contributing factors to crime and murder in the Western Cape, the DA government is now introducing the sale of alcohol in schools. [Interjections.]

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 41**

Taking all of that into consideration, do you not believe we need a more holistic approach to deal with all the socioeconomic ... bring all the relevant departments together to be able to establish how we are going to work to reduce crime? The police on their own cannot deal with the problem. Thank you.

The PRESIDENT OF THE REPUBLIC: Thank you hon Speaker. I think what hon Shaik is saying is that this is a much broader problem. We should never deal with it on a one dimensional basis. We should deal with the other accompanying societal challenges that we have. Some of those have to do precisely with what he has articulated. The issue of poverty, the issue of unemployment and the issue of the number of people not having adequate housing and not even having the requisite facilities like water and sanitation in the homes, and not even enough roads for where the police can go.

So that is really what is at the core of this. Having been to Hanover Park and having exchanged thoughts and views with a number of people there, one can see that the societal challenges and problems that our people are living under are quite immense.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 42**

The other thing that I saw acutely was that many young people drop out of school. They drop out of school after possibly nine years of schooling and then they become susceptible to getting involved in acts of criminality and they become victims; let alone those who become direct victims as a result of being shot at when they either go to school ... I met a young woman who said she is terrified of going to school because she could either be kidnapped and raped. She could also be shot at.

So those are the broader societal issues, and the real good approach is that we should look at this as a joint problem. It is a problem for all of us rather than ... grandstanding ... standing on platforms pointing fingers. And that's precisely what we were seeking to promote in Hanover Park. The community of Hanover Park embraced this type of approach where they said they are prepared to work with the police; they are prepared to work with all other role-players to have a collaborative approach to reducing the levels of criminality ... levels of gangsterism in their area.

Now, one can sit and stand here in Parliament and point fingers and pontificate. That is not going to be the solution.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 43**

The real solution is that we as role-players must work together. We must work together and walk those areas so that we can get to understand the needs of our people, as we did when we went through Hanover Park.

The police are now amongst the people. They are living amongst the people and they are helping to reduce the levels of criminality amongst the people.

What we need to be doing at national, provincial and local government is to actually embark on programmes and initiatives that are going to reduce the temptation for our people to get involved in all this. Provide proper housing, proper sanitation and proper water so that people can have their dignity back because this is eroding their dignity in many ways.

So, I agree with you, hon Shaik. We need to have a multidimensional type of approach to this. Thank you for that.

The SPEAKER: The hon Mkhaliophi?

An HON MEMBER: You're not Mkhaliophi.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 44**

Dr M Q NDLOZI: Speaker, in terms of some rule can I take this question?

The SPEAKER: Please do.

Dr M Q NDLOZI: Thank you. Hon President, you know this phone doesn't have a camera. You might want to start ordering it for Cabinet members because it will save us a lot from some of the embarrassing activities that they ... [Laughter.] It doesn't have a camera. This phone can't even be hacked. Can I give it to you afterwards so that you can have a model of what phones might be critical for hon Cabinet members?

Anyway, I'm very worried about the criminalisation ...

[Interjections.] ... of the youth and children. The fundamental question here is what kind of a society loses control of its children? When they go into criminal activities, when they go into gang activities, what kind of a society sends the police to students? It's a society that has lost the responsibility of educating those students. It's a society that has lost the power to prepare a future for the youth.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 45**

So, why don't we diagnose the problem properly because it's not one or two students that are stabbing each other? It's a phenomenon of gangs, of drug and alcohol abuse, signifying the failures of the last 24 years to properly run a society.

Why should we be sending the police to children? Why don't we send social workers? Why don't we create jobs for them? Why don't we give them properly qualified teachers who are going to keep them interested in education and ... not getting into drugs and alcohol abuse? I think it's a shame that our solution is to criminalise those kids.

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: Speaker, on a point of order: There was an incident earlier on. When the hon Ndlozi was speaking the Minister of Home Affairs did this. [Interjections.] It looks like he's bringing his past activities here to Parliament. You must not allow that here. You must not allow ... [Inaudible.] ... to come and ... [Inaudible.] ... here, please. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Shivambu, that's not a point of order. Hon President?

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 46**

Mr G A GARDEE: On a point of order, Madam Speaker: Can you please rule that the conduct of Minister Lindiwe, in doing this pinky sign, is very unparliamentary in view of the camera and mouth issues? [Interjections.] Children are watching these proceedings and for her to be doing like this is very, very unparliamentary. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: We will deal with that issue later. Right now I'd like to ask the hon President to respond to the supplementary question of hon Ndlozi. Hon President?

The PRESIDENT OF THE REPUBLIC: Thank you, hon Speaker. Let me immediately say, and this might surprise hon Dr Ndlozi, that I agree with him. We should desist from criminalising our children. We should rather ...

Mr J S MALEMA: Speaker, I want to check if the President agrees with the phone or what. [Laughter.]

The SPEAKER: No, hon Malema, please. Please proceed hon President.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 47**

The PRESIDENT OF THE REPUBLIC: I agree with hon Dr Ndlozi on the issue that he raises about not criminalising our children, looking at this problem as a societal one and looking at it more broadly as a problem that has to do with the society that we seek to build. This is really the core of the problem.

We need to ask ourselves what type of society we are trying to engender and to build when our children are drawn into all these activities of violence.

However, more importantly for me hon Ndlozi, is the role that we all have as parents. This is not a matter where, yes, after 24 years we start pointing fingers at each other, because the issue is also what happens at the base ... at the foundation of the process of building that society, and it is in the home. It is our role as parents. What do we do with the children that providence has given us to bring up? We bring them into this world, and how do we bring them up? That is where the real challenge is. I saw it for myself, not only in Hanover Park but all over. As you go through the length and breadth of the country you actually see the lack of real commitment amongst us as parents.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 48**

So, hon Ndlozi, we should not be pointing fingers. I don't know where you were pointing your finger, either to the left or to the right, but with regard to this one we should remember that as you point one finger, three fingers are pointing at you ... all of us. And, if we say we should be ashamed, it should be all of us who ought to be ashamed that we have children who either behave in that way in schools but also children who drop out of school.

As I spoke to a number of young people in Hanover Park, I found that easily more than 50% of those children I spoke to had dropped out of school after nine years of schooling, and they are now just roaming around. It was broad ... morning when we were there and I kept asking, why are you not at school. They've dropped out and they are now susceptible to being drawn in by gangsters.

Also, as you say in the schools themselves we shouldn't criminalise our children. Yes, we should roll out more social workers. We should roll out more community workers and they should be the ones who go amongst our children, rather than the police.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 49**

Yes, in the end the police are almost the last line acting as a preventative team that should be looking after society when the wheels come off. We as parents must make sure that we play our role in bringing up children. That is the type of society that we should build and it is our collective responsibility. Hon Ndlozi, it is your responsibility as much as it is mine to make sure that our children are well brought up and we ... ensure that they are not susceptible to violence in schools, drugs and what have you. So, let us do the right thing as parents of our children in South Africa. Thank you very much.

Question 22:

The PRESIDENT OF THE REPUBLIC OF SOUTH AFRICA: Hon speaker, there are several reasons for community protests; ranging from local service delivery failures to broader concerns around crime, municipal demarcation, corruption and failure of governance. Many of these protests, both those that are peaceful and some of those that turn to be violent, reflect the severe weaknesses in our governance structures at local level; they also reflect poor consultation processes with communities and a perceived distance between communities and their public representatives at all levels.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 50**

It is necessary to address the causes of these protests in a holistic and an integrated manner. This is why the national government is working with the provincial and local governments to improve the delivery of services, to build and maintain municipal infrastructure and to strengthen financial and other governance areas.

If we focus on the stimulus and economic recovery plan, you would have noted that the section of that deals with what we have to do in local government. Minister Mkhize is busy with all that now; having identified in a number of municipalities in our country where, for instance, protests have been taking place, what interventions we need to embark upon. Quite a lot of resources have been laid out to do precisely that.

To ensure a systematic response to the causes of violent protests, government has established an Inter-Ministerial task team on service delivery integration and alignment. It includes a number of ministries that have to do with issues that impact on local government. This team has adopted an approach to enhance integrated planning as well as budgeting. We are going to be focusing on eight metropolitan

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 51**

municipalities, 43 local municipalities and six priority district municipalities.

Together, these municipalities account for over 87% of all households living in informal settlements and backyard dwellings. They also constitute over half of all service delivery backlogs and have the greatest number of recorded service delivery protests. We already identified and isolated where all these are happening and we are now coming up with clear interventions that are going to address these.

A set of strategies and action plans are being developed, focused on the short, medium and long-term interventions in 57 pilot municipalities as outlined in the stimulus and economic recovery plan.

The work of the team that has been set up is supported by a programme management office located at the Municipal Infrastructure Support Agent, MISA. This office is going to draw quite a number of other key technical people from a number of professional engineers and planners.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 52**

It is necessary to ensure inter-governmental alignment since the issues at hand cut across national, provincial and various local competencies that it is there. At the same time, it is necessary for public representatives including Members of Parliament, MPs, and Ministers to engage with communities on an ongoing basis to ensure that these needs as well as the concerns of our people at local level are addressed. Because as I alluded to earlier, these protests happen, not because our people are mad, they happen because there is system failure in regard to consultation about a whole variety of matters; but there's also a failure of governance and our people respond to these because they are finding that their hopes are dashed and their aspirations are waylaid. We need to address these so that we properly and positively address the needs of our people.

We are embarking on this process, hon Holomisa, and we will do it with good effect because we have already identified what the real key problem is. Thank you, hon Speaker. [Applause.]

Mr B H HOLOMISA: Mr President, I have often noticed that the hon Minister of Police, Bheki Cele, is singularly visible as a public representative when violent protests occur. I would

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 53**

like to know, notwithstanding what you have just said to us in this House, why ...

*IsiXhosa:*

...kusoloko inguye yedwa engahambi noMphathiswa weSebe lezaManzi noGutyulo noMphathiswa weSebe lezokuHlaliswa koLuntu? Kutheni le nto abanye aba besoloko behleli ezi-ofisini, ehamba yedwa lo?

*English:*

So, we would like to see it to that they accompany him.

*IsiXhosa:*

Kungathethwa kuphela ngemiba yoqhankqalazo nodushe koko kuthethwe ngemiba le ibangela ukuba baqhankqalaze.

USOMLOMO: Into ethetha ukuba awunambuzo.

*English:*

The hon President, you might want to just comment.

The PRESIDENT OF THE REPUBLIC OF SOUTH AFRICA: Yes, hon Speaker. Let me thank hon Holomisa for that observation

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 54**

[Interjection.] Let me thank hon Holomisa for raising this matter and immediately say to him the issue that you are articulating is a matter that we have been addressing and we've decided that as we respond through this Inter-Ministerial task team – that I spoke about – and as we respond to some of these challenges, we need to get government leaders to be out there amongst the people addressing these problems.

Once we know that it is a housing problem, we should get – yes – the Minister of Housing or the Deputy Minister being out there, including if it impacts on sanitation or water, they must be out there. And, yes, we should not only look at it from a policing point of view, we should look at it more broadly; and Minister Cele has been very active in this regard, which I'm glad that you have noticed; but similarly, other Ministers have also been busy with a whole range of other things and we are now going to be adding various government leaders and Ministers to be able to deal with all these challenges and problems.

But once again, thank you very much. It is the most positive intervention.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 55**

*IsiXhosa:*

Ndiyabulela Njengele yam.

*English:*

Mr J S MALEMA: Speaker, can I check quickly here?

The SPEAKER: No, hon Malema.

Mr J S MALEMA: Please, Speaker. It's very urgent. Do we have the Minister of Housing? Do we really have the Minister of Housing?

The SPEAKER: Hon Malema, please take your seat. The hon Maimane!

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION PARTY: Mr President, I think we can all agree that rail, especially for our people, still remains the most affordable form of public transport; especially now that petrol has gone through the roof under your government. And I think what we are discovering is that it has actually been held hostage by few people with arson attacks, they are burning our trains and commuters are left stranded.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 56**

The great difficulty is that recently my colleagues went to engage the community in Mitchells Plain train station. They waited there for an hour, the train never arrived; in fact, the community came back and said "this is becoming like a ghost station." Our people are desperate to find work and they don't have public transport that helps them.

I think, Mr President, as a suggestion, is it not about time that your government actually agrees with the DA that we should take the functions and the infrastructure budget of the national rogue and devolve them down, so that metros that are capable to do that function can run them? [Interjections.] [Applause.] So, we integrate transport and make sure that our people can get to work. Please, is it not time that we do that, Mr President?

The PRESIDENT OF THE REPUBLIC OF SOUTH AFRICA: Hon Maimane, we are busy with a whole range of things and crafting an integrated transport system is one of those things that we need to work on because the legacy that we got from apartheid is so horrible in a way that our transport system was calibrated. It was calibrated in a typical apartheid way where

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 57**

the issue of spatial development just poisoned everything in the way that our people were relegated to far-away places.

So, right now, the country is working on integrated transport system; and as we do so, I would welcome your thoughts and your proposals in terms of how best we can do it. You may think it's best to do it at the metro level, you may think that it's best to do it a local level, but it is a matter that all of us need to put our heads around. But particularly to deal with the issue of the spatial landscape of our country, how our people have been accommodated over the many years of apartheid misrule and the impact that it has today in moving our people around; yes, through trains, buses and minibus taxis, all this needs to be looked at in a broader way.

The time arrives for this, when we have a much broader integrated transport system, then I would welcome your views as far as that is concerned.

Let's come to the issue of the trains. Yes it's a challenge; it is a challenge from a criminal prevention view point and the Minister of Police is dealing with that. Those gangs and those individuals who are targeting trains, particularly here

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 58**

in the Western Cape, who are burning our trains and destroying our trains, which is a burning platform that we need to attend to; and we are attending to it right now as we speak.

And in the end, the efficacy of the service that is then deployed by Passenger Rail Agency of SA, Prasa, in terms of getting trains to arrive on time and to be able to transport our people is a second issue that needs to be addressed.

You would have heard that the unfortunate thing is that our trains have been burnt but Prasa is rolling out more trains that need to be brought to bear into our train transport system and we now have a factory in South Africa as we are igniting the manufacturing base of our country; that is now making South African made trains; trains are now being made here in South Africa. [Applause.]

As we craft this integrated transport system, we are going to be making trains ... you may be interested hon Maimane to know that the African Union, AU, has declared that South Africa – and you may want to have a conversation with Minister Nzimande about this – should be the country that manufactures trains

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 59**

for the rest of Africa. Giving great faith in our transport system; in the way that we calibrate it.

So, we will be calibrating an integrated transport system which will include rail, bus, taxis and vehicles. We will, yes, welcome your views, whether they are DA views or your own views, bring them into the pot. Let's look at how we finalise an integrated transport system. Thank you very much, hon Speaker. [Applause.]

Mr X NGWEZI: Mr President, one main challenge that exist is that our government officials are sort of arrogant; they don't quickly respond on demands by communities and communities have now realised that if you are looking for a clinic you must burn the school. What is it that as the President of the state you are going to do to quickly address the issue of consultation between government and officials; and also, are you not considering giving more funding to municipalities? Because my belief is that all development is local and the easiest or the quickest way where people can communicate closely with government is through local government. Thank you, Speaker.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 60**

The PRESIDENT OF THE REPUBLIC OF SOUTH AFRICA: Hon Speaker, the issue of consultation – as I said in my main reply to the question – is key in all this. We need to deepen and broaden consultation; but we also need to inculcate a culture of real Batho Pele, we must put our people first as we interact with them; in the way of consultation, in the way of providing services to them and in the way of getting them involved in developmental processes.

So, Batho Pele as a concept and as a philosophy is a very important thing; and we keep on harping on this with our civil servants in saying "treat our people as your customers and the customer is always right"; make sure that you consult our people and make sure that they buy into the processes that we are involved in. But, in this regard, we also rely on our public representatives; that is why we have public representatives at local level and ward level; those public representatives are our frontline, not so much government officials, but public representatives are the ones who have been chosen by our people or the community to represent their views and their aspirations. That is where we need to entrench this culture of proper consultation.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 61**

At the same time, clearly, our local government structures need to be capacitated; and capacitating them means that they need to have sufficient resources, but they also know that they need to, firstly, look after the resources that they have and not waste them and not spend them in a reckless manner; secondly, they also need to raise resources so that they are able to deliver services amongst our people.

So, yes, our municipalities are facing serious challenges because quite a number of them don't even have a tax base, they rely on grants from government; and government is looking at the full architecture of our municipalities to see how best we can resolve some of the challenges that they continue to have.

But in the end it is consultation, consultation and consultation that is going to provide much easier answers as we provide services to our people. Thank you very much.

[Applause.]

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: Mr President, I think you are beginning to acknowledge the perennial incapacity of the local state to deliver services. Here is the design that [Inaudible.] the

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 62**

division of revenue process only allocates less than 10% of the overall revenue of the state to the local state and the majority of municipalities expand more than 80% of their budgets on salaries and operational expenses.

In the Medium Term Budget Policy Statement, MTBPS, the Minister of Finance said that 113 municipalities have adopted unfunded budgets. Don't you think that the whole design of the division of revenue process and the manner in which municipalities are structured is fundamentally flawed?

We need a different ... because it will never happen that municipalities, in the current design, will have the capacity to deliver basic services to our people. Don't you think we need to rebase the whole structure in terms of the current structure of municipalities? Thank you very much. [Applause.]

The PRESIDENT OF THE REPUBLIC OF SOUTH AFRICA: Hon Shivambu, when I spoke about the architecture of our local government system it also touched on things like that because it is a matter of concern and must be a matter of concern to us that a number of municipalities find themselves without a proper revenue base, they are not able to raise any revenue and

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 63**

therefore in the end they will just forever depend on the grants that they get from national government; and as you correctly say, the division of revenue is such that they only get a small portion of the overall revenue and therefore we need to have conversations about how best we address the problem, but more importantly the challenges that many of our municipalities have.

What we also need to do is to look at a whole number of things, for instance, we need to look at what the Auditor-General is also saying because where they actually have the resources, a number of municipalities are misspending those resources. Much as – yes – they are spending quite a huge percentage on salaries, but at the same time what should be going towards capital investment is getting wasted and is getting misspent. So, we need to address and find a way of dealing with that while at the same time look at the broader issue of the full architecture of municipal funding. That is a process that we need to embark on; and in fact through the Minister of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs, we are looking at precisely that because we cannot carry on with a system that relegates a number of our municipalities to being completely unfunded in a number of their own activities.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 64**

So, if there are any wiser ideas hon Shivambu, we will welcome that. Thank you very much.

Question 23:

The PRESIDENT OF THE REPUBLIC: Hon Speaker, South Africa will become a member of the United Nations Security Council in the nonpermanent member category for the third time, in the term 2019-20.

This is where we have to give a great deal of gratitude to many countries around the world, who supported our bid to become a member of the Security Council. More importantly, to also give a great deal of gratitude to our ambassadors, who are strewn all over the world, who worked ceaselessly and campaigned to get South Africa to be elected and also our Department of International Relations and Co-operation and especially Minister Sisulu. [Applause.] They worked very hard to get South Africa to be re-elected to this important seat.

What we will do is to use our term on the Security Council to advance President Nelson Mandela's legacy by focusing on conflict prevention and mediation. We will seek to bring together divergent perspectives and also seek to resolve

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 65**

impasses which undermine the ability of the Security Council to act where needed. A number of countries are looking forward to South Africa's tenure on the Security Council because they expect that we will be bringing in wide experience in matters of conflict resolution and prevention. So, this they believe will stand the council in good stead.

Our presence on the council presents an opportunity to work with other African countries that are serving on the council, particularly Equatorial Guinea and Cote d'Ivoire to promote peace and stability on the continent.

South Africa will build on its own experience in conflict resolution and mediation, and work closely with permanent and elected members to fulfil the council's mandate of maintaining international peace and security.

In addition to country specific conflict situations, serving on the council will also provide us with an opportunity to place emphasis on the importance of women in peace and security operations.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 66**

We will emphasise the need to work within and through multilateral institutions to advance post-conflict reconstruction and development and to promote the peaceful resolution of conflicts.

The current global environment is characterised by various threats to international peace and security, continued poverty and underdevelopment as well as the displacement of populations because most of these challenges are transnational in nature, they require collective action, which is what we will be advocating.

Even the most powerful states should not achieve security nor maintain prosperity and health for their people by acting unilaterally or in isolation.

South Africa will continue to advocate multilateralism as a key aspect of international relations and that collective action is required at all times to mitigate the risks of global development, governance and security.

We advocate and support a rules-based international system that fosters greater interdependence and mutual co-operation

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 67**

in the only way in which we can successfully address conflicts and difficulties that many countries have.

We see the Security Council as the main body specifically mandated with the responsibility to maintain international peace and security.

South Africa will therefore use its position on the UN Security Council to collectively work with others to promote a more equitable and a more inclusive global order, which promotes peace and security for all in the world. Thank you, Madam Speaker.

Mr F BEUKMAN: Madam Speaker, I thank the hon President for the response. In a statement after your recent talks with the German Chancellor, Ms Angela Merkel, both South Africa and Germany indicated that we will work closely at the UN Security Council to ensure that the council contributes meaningfully to resolve important questions on international peace and security.

Mr President, more than 60% of the issues currently on the agenda of the Security Council are from the African continent.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 68**

How can we collaborate with our fellow African Union members, members of the BRICS countries and the G20 on the council to promote an agenda of international peace and security that promotes inclusivity and multilateralism rather than unilateralism? I thank you.

The PRESIDENT OF THE REPUBLIC: Hon Speaker, we are fortunate in that we belong to the BRICS club, if you like, we are also part of the African Union and we will be collaborating with two other countries on the UN Security Council. The orientation of these three entities is very similar to ours, where we will be working together to co-operate and collaborate on promoting peace and security, not only on the African continent but also in the world.

At the BRICS level, during the BRICS summit that was held here, we were very clear collectively as the five countries in declaring that we believe in multilateralism and that we are irrevocably interdependent as countries. But more importantly, those countries in the world should consider themselves being interdependent and the same obtains for the African Union. As we work with other African countries, that's what we will be promoting.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 69**

Clearly, at the G20 level, particularly at the summit that is going to be held in Argentina in the next two or three weeks, we will be taking that message forward to promote a perspective that says that we need to act in a multilateral manner and that there should be no country that will act on a unilateral basis so as to try and have an overbearing influence in the world.

We believe that our word and the influence that we will collectively have with other countries is going to strengthen multilateralism even if it goes against the grain of what other countries and players believe. We want to spread this message to ensure that it is embraced and owned by all and that it brings to bear an influence, particularly in relation to addressing challenges of security and peace, not only on our continent but all over. We will carry and take that message forward even as we work with Equatorial Guinea and Cote d'Ivoire on the UN Security Council from the African perspective.

We also have other countries who share our perspective, who are also nonpermanent members on the Security Council. So, we

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 70**

will be pushing exactly the same message with them. Thank you, hon Speaker.

Mr M HLENGWA: Hon Speaker, Mr President, as South Africa joins the UN Security Council, as you have said, for the third time, one of the globally unresolved questions is that of Israel and Palestine. It has become a global perennial headache and needs a speedy resolution. While subscribing to the two-state solution and the outlook of the South African government, what is of concern is that the ANC and its government are speaking at opposite ends and one of the threats which is looming now is the downgrading of the South African Embassy in Israel into a liaison office.

So, Mr President, can you clarify us so that we will know exactly what's South Africa's position is on that body so that we do not contradict ourselves on the global stage and utter something else on the domestic front?

As things stand now, and moving forward, what is the South African position in so far as the Israeli-Palestine question is concerned? With regards to the embassy, what is our position because at some point the Minister of International

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 71**

Relations was going to make a statement in this House but that was postponed and of course that continues to create uncertainty in that regard? Thank you.

The PRESIDENT OF THE REPUBLIC: Hon Speaker, our position as a government in relation to the Palestine-Israeli question is that we are firmly in support of a two-state solution. It is a concept that is broadly supported by many players around the world. We are also in firm support of a peaceful resolution of that conflict.

We, as the ruling party, have taken a decision that the embassy should be downgraded. We are working on that to see how best to do that. May I say at the same time, that one of the number of role-players have been saying to us that South Africa does have a role to play in fostering peace between Israel and Palestine. This has also been clearly vocalised by people on the Palestinian side.

So, as we proceed to see how this resolution that was taken by the governing party is to be implemented, we continue to say that the conflict in that basin of the world must be properly resolved. As South Africa, we are quite happy and pleased to

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 72**

play whatever role that we may be able to play to ensure that the conflict is peacefully resolved.

We are open to playing that type of role but at the same time, we have taken a very clear position. The position came into being as result of the deep problems that the Palestinians have been going through themselves. As a governing party, we have been, as it is well known, acting in solidarity with the Palestinians. We have been saying we support their struggle.

Obviously, within the broad parameters of supporting that struggle, we are also saying that that conflict needs to be resolved peacefully and that the resolution needs to be a two-state type of solution, which is broadly accepted.

So, all these matters can be taken forward in tandem as we address the situation in full. Thank you very much.

Mr S J MALEMA: Hon President, my question is based on the trade embargo imposed on Cuba by the US. You will know that the UN voted that the embargo must be lifted and only two countries voted against. The US will use its veto powers to overrule that decision and as a result, it will not be

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 73**

implemented. Don't you think that we need to do away with these veto powers by other countries – meaning maybe we should restructure the UN and the inability to restructure the UN, we might have to consider identifying the progressive forces in the UN and establish an alternative to the UN because we cannot be subjected permanent undemocratic practices, which overrule the majority all the time when the superpowers do not have their way?

The other thing, Mr President, is that, don't you think we should maximise our trade with Cuba ... [Time expired.] ... an establishment of solidarity fund, maybe with Cuba, just like the Nigerians did? [Interjections.] Don't say sit down, you never ask questions. Even your children know that you are useless, and you don't ask questions. [Interjections.]

Mr P J MNGUNI: On a point of order, hon Speaker!

The SPEAKER: Who is raising a point of order?

Mr P J MNGUNI: Hon Speaker, in terms of Rule ...  
[Interjections.]

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 74**

The SPEAKER: Where are you?

Mr P J MNGUNI: I am here next to you.

The SPEAKER: Oh, okay.

Mr P J MNGUNI: In terms of Rule 142, other than the time that the hon member had exhausted, but also that the follow-up question should be limited to one question ...

[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Yes, that is true.

Mr P J MNGUNI: ... but however, hon Speaker, I would also like you to rule if it is parliamentary for the hon member to say that we must shut up, we never ask questions, we are useless. Hansard can confirm the exact words. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Hon Malema, did you say another hon member must shut up because they never ask questions?

Mr J S MALEMA: No Speaker, they were saying I must shut up. You ruled that I must sit down and I continued. Then someone

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 75**

said shut up. In answering that person ... [Interjections.]

Don't say who because it is not you. So I answered ...

The SPEAKER: Take your seat now.

Mr J S MALEMA: Maybe it is someone from the gallery.

[Laughter.] Why is this one jumping, saying it is unparliamentary? You don't know who I am talking to. You stop being tjatjarag [hasty]. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Malema, let's allow the President to answer the question, please. Hon President!

Mr G A GARDEE: Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Hon Gardee, sit down, please?

Mr G A GARDEE: The member there, who is being called to order, is also showing the pinkie finger gesture to us here.

The SPEAKER: No, please, just take your seat? [Interjections.]

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 76**

Ms P S KEKANA: Hon Speaker, I am here! I am sitting here listening to the President and people are talking about my name. [Laughter.]

The SPEAKER: I didn't hear anyone talk about your name. Hon President, I think hon members are getting tired. They start doing this when they are tired. Hon President, please answer?

The PRESIDENT OF THE REPUBLIC: Hon Speaker, clearly, the issue of the embargo against Cuba is a matter of concern to all of us. We continue to be dismayed that instead of having the embargo lifted, there is one country that continues to insist that the embargo should continue whilst the people of Cuba continue to suffer.

We are in full support that the embargo should be lifted and it should be done with immediate effect. In relation to the United States itself, we are on the side of those who say that ... and we advocate that the UN Security Council should be reformed. We need reform because we cannot have a situation, from the inception of the United Nations in the 40s, where only five countries in the whole world have a veto on decisions that needs to be taken.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 77**

Hon Malema, we are continuing to put that message across and are getting a lot of support from around the world, particularly from the African point of view. None of our countries on this huge continent that represents well over a billion people is represented on the UN Security Council and we think that it is gross unfairness, which is imposed on the people of Africa that we are unable to participate in the highest decision-making echelon of the United Nations.

Hon Malema, before we even veer into the direction of saying set up another entity, which we don't support because we believe that the United Nations is the one body that has the capability, gravitas and enjoys the confidence of people around the world, it is that body that we must reform. I think we shouldn't try and set up other bodies - another body which in the end will just be a faction or a splinter group. Let us work inside the United Nations and reform the United Nations.

Our message is gaining traction. Firstly, there should agreement that it will be reformed; and secondly, that we should have other countries, particularly our continent, that are not represented on the UN Security Council be represented. Thereafter, we can then look at which of the countries on the

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 78**

African continent are best placed to be able to represent the continent as a whole.

As you can well expect, we also have our own thoughts and views on this matter but that should come later once the idea has been embraced that there should be reform of the UN Security Council.

We have raised it with secretary-general of UN. We have also raised it with a number of permanent members. Clearly, there seems to be a real issue here because the pact of those five security members who are already inside may not see the need to reform but we are continuing to advocate for the reform because we cannot continue living in multilateral organisation that represents the people of the world - more than 6 billion people and in the end it is only five members who have a veto on the decisions that have to be taken.

I say tarry a little bit. Don't rush too much to say establish another United Nations. Let's reform this United Nations because I think it is possible that we will be able to reach our objective in this regard. Thank you, hon House Chair.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 79**

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Madam House Chair, Mr President, I recently hosted two MPs from Venezuela. Venezuela as a nation is about to collapse. It is described as a failed state.

These MPs are exiled from their country of birth mainly because Venezuela adopted very radical populist ideas. Isn't it about time, Mr President, that we, in the next two years – as South Africa has a crucial role on the UN Security Council – as a country, part ways from these dictators who have risen up, who are, in fact, oppressing people as we speak right now as Venezuela stand? [Applause.] When you look at South Africa's own voting patterns, they have been supporting these dictators. Mr President, can I ask you to take a stance to depart from the radical populists and actually begin to establish the rule of law and democracy in Venezuela? Thank you very much.

The PRESIDENT OF THE REPUBLIC: Madam House Chair, obviously, our tenure on the Security Council is going to be underpinned by advancing our own values – values that are enshrined in our Constitution. We are also going to advance the values that are enshrined in the African Union's Constitutive Act and the

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 80**

general decisions that are also taken by the African Union.

That is what is really going to guide us as we seat on the Security Council.

Obviously, we will seek to act in the interests of the people of the world. What advances their interests is what will be prominent in our minds.

Mr Maimane, we are not in the business of saying, you we will not associate with, you we will associate with, you we don't love, you we love, and all that. We act on a principled basis and not on the basis that you are trying to box us into. We are an organisation that is principled and that is what we are going to take to the United Nations. Thank you very much.

Question 24:

The PRESIDENT OF THE REPUBLIC: Hon House Chair, as I indicated in the NCOP in September, there are no specific conditions that ... with regard to the loan that Eskom received from the China Development Bank.

The loan is guaranteed by government under the under the existing Government Guarantee Framework Agreement.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 81**

No amendments or conditions were written into the Government Guarantee Framework Agreement for the purposes of this loan.

As I said and indicated in the NCOP, no Eskom assets have been used as security for the loan, and the China Development Bank is not entitled to any direct or indirect ownership of Eskom assets.

The same conditions that are applicable to all government guaranteed facilities are applicable to the China Development Bank facility. I thank you.

Rev K R J MESHOE: Thank you, Mr President, for that reply.

While you have assured the nation, even today, that no Eskom asset was used as guarantee of the loan, what the President did not mention is what would happen if Eskom does fail to observe its obligation and defaults on the repayments.

Looking at Eskom's track record, we see they have failed on a number of occasions. My question is, what will happen if Eskom does default? Will the President assure the nation that not a single South African asset, including land, will be used as an

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 82**

assurance to the Chinese government, and will not be attached? Can we get that assurance that nothing, not only Eskom, but any South African assets, would be attached if Eskom defaulted on their payments. Thank you.

The PRESIDENT OF THE REPUBLIC: Hon House Chair, hon Meshoe, we are not in the business of entering into agreements knowing that we will default on those agreements. We abide by the terms of the agreements that we enter into. Eskom has not failed to live up to the payments that it should live up to when it comes to repaying loans. We do not intend to have Eskom in the end defaulting on the agreements that it has entered into.

I have specifically said, if you had listened very carefully, Reverend, that, as we entered into this loan, there is no security in the form of assets – a portion of Eskom indirectly or directly that has been offered as security ... We have not done that.

Now, the guarantee that has been given is part of the broad, general guarantee framework that we give as we underpin the loan processes that any state-owned enterprise has. It could

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 83**

be Transnet, it could be Sanral, it could be Umgeni Water, and it could be anyone.

In the end, government is the one that is the backstop to all these loan processes. It is not a specific asset. I would like to give you assurance when it comes to that. That is how these guarantees work. A general government guarantee framework agreement works in that way. It is a broad pot of guarantees that is given by government. In the end, it is the sovereign ... it is the government in the end that is seen as the backstop. We don't give specific assets. We don't even give ... [Inaudible.] ... we don't even give land. We don't even give vehicles or anything as a guarantee, because, in the end, for the loan providers, that is worthless. That is worthless.

What is more worthwhile for them is a government guarantee. It is the sovereign guarantee that people place more emphasis on.

So, if you have read that in other countries loan providers have gone after certain assets, I can assure you that it is not going to happen here. We will not allow that to happen.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 84**

In fact, Reverend, you credit us with a level of wisdom that, as we negotiate these agreements, we are not going to sell the family or the country's silver. We are not going to do that. Thank you.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Thank you for your answer, Mr President.

However, given the flip-flopping record of your government – sell SAA, don't sell SAA, oppose the DA's court application this morning, withdraw the opposition to it in the afternoon – it's hard to take these assurances seriously.

The R33 billion loan from China Development Corporation poses a significant risk to the South African fiscus and to our citizens. That's why, during the previous Question Session, we asked you to make a full disclosure of what the terms and conditions of this secretive loan were.

After Eskom, through our Promotion of Access to Information Act, initially refused to grant this request, they then gave us some information, but left out all the important

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 85**

information that would probably show transparency and accountability here.

Now this tactic is only all too familiar. It's precisely the secrecy and lack of transparency that provided the fertile ground for state capture to take root in South Africa.

We will approach the courts, if necessary. But, Mr President, in the interests of openness and transparency, in breaking the secrecy and subterfuge of the last eight years, will you commit today to make these terms and conditions public so that the South African people can ... [Inaudible.] [Time expired.]

THE PRESIDENT OF THE REPUBLIC: Let me say, hon House Chair, that I want to reject the notion that this loan that has been provided to Eskom is going to provide an overbearing risk in the way that you describe it on the sovereign. This loan is no different ... [Interjections.]

Yes, it is no different from the loan that Sanral has. It is no different from the role that Transnet has. It's no different from the loan that all our state-owned entities have, including SAA as well. [Interjections.]

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 86**

You may ooh and aah and all that, but in the end, all these happen under the broad government guarantee framework agreement. We have not entered in to any special deal with the Bank of China when it comes to this. It is a straightforward, vanilla type of loan ... [Interjections.] ... that is guaranteed by the sovereign. [Interjections.]

That's what it is! It is no different whatsoever from all the others.

So, I want to say very clearly to you ... [Interjections.]

And there is a problem of hon members, and particularly Steenhuisen, not having the ability to listen. It does seem that he's bit handicapped when it comes to that.

[Interjections.] He does not ... he cannot listen. Even as one tries to give him an explanation, there seems to be a serious handicap. I would immediately have said, maybe he needs to go for audio testing, but maybe that is not his only problem.

There is a deeper problem which we should maybe have some analysts look into. [Interjections.]

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 87**

Because he's not listening. Maybe it is a problem of properly assimilating the information that he is given.

So I think we have a problem with hon Steenhuisen.

But I have given him the answer. Maybe, overnight, he'll be able to spend time and be able to properly assimilate the information that has been put before him. Thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon Steenhuisen, you stood up?

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Madam House Chair, I'm very glad that the President is so concerned about my health.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Is it a point of order?

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Yes, it is, because you cannot cast aspersions ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon Ndlozi, I'll come back to you.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 88**

Dr M Q NDLOZI: Point of order, Comrade ... [Inaudible.] Why is he rising? On which Rule? [Interjections.] On which Rule? Can you have consistency, hon Chair? Don't be intimidated by anyone. [Interjections.] Don't be intimidated by anyone! Why is this guy rising? On what Rule? [Interjections.] Sit down and take it!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon Ndlozi! I'm glad you have taken your seat because, indeed, you raised a point of order. I said I'll come back to you. But you then also did what is wrong, and continued to express yourself. Hon Steenhuisen stood up on a point of order. I'm still listening to him ... [Interjections.]

Dr M Q NDLOZI: He never said that! He just stood up!

THE HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): I asked ...  
[Interjections.] Wait ... [Interjections.]

Hon Steenhuisen, what is your point of order?

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 89**

THE CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Well, to quote the hon Ndlozi from earlier, "some Rule". That's what he got away with earlier.

Nonetheless, I thank the President for his concern about my auditory abilities and the like, but I don't think that it is appropriate ... [Interjections.]

Mr J S MALEMA: Hon Chair, please ...

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Can the VBS Bank looters please give me a chance ... [Interjections.] [Inaudible.]

Mr J S MALEMA: No, no! You are not going to call me a VBS looter, you racist, young white man!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon Steenhuisen, can you please come to your ... [Interjections.] [Inaudible.]

Mr J S MALEMA: A racist young man who was accused of rape, of bonking a woman in an office ... [Interjections.] You are not going to do that. [Interjections.] You are not going to do that! [Interjections.] You are accused of ... [Inaudible.] in

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 90**

an office. When you are in a municipality you bonk a woman in an office!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon members!

HON MEMBERS: Pay back the money! Pay back the money!

[Interjections.]

Mr J S MALEMA: Racists! Racists! [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order, hon members. Hon members of the DA and the EFF ... [Interjections.]

HON MEMBERS: Racists! Racists!

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: House Chairperson ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon Shivambu, I would listen to you. Can you please ask your members ...  
[Interjections.] Order! Order! [Interjections.] Can the Serjeant-at-arms come in. [Interjections.] Serjeant-at-arms, please come in. Order, hon members! [Interjections.]

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 91**

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Can I continue?

[Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Sergeant-at-arms, can you please act. [Interjections.] Hon Gardee ... Hon Shivambu, can you please ask your members to take their seats.

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: Can I raise a point of order?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Yes, but please first ask your members to take to their seats. [Interjections.] Hon Steenhuisen, as a chief whip, can you also ask your members to take their seats.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: They are sitting down. I have my whips there. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Can you please ask your members to take their seats! [Interjections.] Hon Shivambu ... hon Shivambu, can you please ask your members too to take their seats.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 92**

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: But you can't allow a person to speak without a Rule. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon member ...

Mr J S MALEMA: You are not going to be scared of this white  
...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon member, can I address you.

Mr J S MALEMA: You are not going to be scared of this white  
...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon members, can you take your seats, including hon Steenhuisen.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: I haven't finished my point of order. [Interjections.]

Mr J S MALEMA: We are not going to be intimidated by whites here! [Interjections.]

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 93**

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Please take your seat, hon Malema. [Interjections.]

Mr J S MALEMA: There is no white man who is going to intimidate us here! [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon members of the DA and the EFF, can you take your seats. [Interjections.] You have disrupted one another on points of order. I will now allow the President to respond to the question. I will talk to the Chief Whips of both parties. [Interjections.] Yes, hon Steenhuisen, because you actually stood up and you went on and started responding to hon Malema. [Interjections.] I am now ruling.

Hon President, can you please answer the question.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Madam House Chair ...  
[Interjections.]

Mr J S MALEMA: You are not going to speak here, wena! You are not going to speak! [Interjections.]

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 94**

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon Malema!

Mr J S MALEMA: No, you must allow the President to answer. The President is going to answer. The white boy is ...

[Interjections.] [Inaudible.] The President is going to answer! We are not scared of these whites!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon members, I have allowed the President to respond!

Mr J S MALEMA: He must sit down! He must sit down!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Can you allow me to chair?

An HON MEMBER: Shut down his mic! Shut down his mic!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Take your seats, hon members! Hon Steenhuisen ...

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Madam Chairperson, I'd like to make my point of order.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 95**

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Yes, I hear you. Allow me to rule.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: It's a separate point of order.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Can you please allow me to rule that, for now, the President must respond.

[Interjections.]

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Madam House Chair, with respect, I rise on Rule 85 ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): With respect, I'm also asking you to take your seat.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Rule 85! You're going to let me be called a racist in this House?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Can you take your seat?

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: This is not right!

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 96**

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Take your seat.

[Interjections.] Order, hon members! Can the House be in order! Hon President, please respond. [Interjections.] Hon Steenhuisen, I will address your other point of order once the President has responded to the question. Hon President, please respond to the question.

The PRESIDENT OF THE REPUBLIC: Hon House Chair, I actually did respond. Unless there is another question, I'm rather sad and taken aback by the ... [Interjections.] ... and almost handicapped by what is happening.

But, I did respond. I guess my response had been to hon Steenhuisen in the way that I was trying to answer him. So, I'm ready for the next question. Thank you. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon members, can you take your seats. I ruled that I would give the President an opportunity. On Rule 67, in terms of our own Rules, which is the rule of precedence of presiding officers ...

Whenever the presiding officer addresses the House during a debate, any member then speaking or offering to speak must

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 97**

resume his or her seat. And the presiding officer must be heard without interruption.

I tried several times ... to members who were raising points of order against points of order, and you did not observe the Rule. That is why I, at the end, had to use my discretion to actually say, I will say I will speak to the Chief Whips of both parties whose members were even at the point of engaging in a physical fight. In order to bring order to the House, I ruled and I still rule that I will now give an opportunity to the President to address the next question. [Interjections.]

You may have a problem, hon Steenhuisen. I will request that that matter ... [Interjections.]

Hon Steenhuisen, protection must be offered equally to all members of the House. At the moment I have ruled ...  
[Interjections.]

No. Hon Steenhuisen, Rule 67 still applies. I am speaking and you shall listen. Hon President, can you please answer ...

Mr M A PLOUAMMA: Hon Chair ...

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 98**

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon Shivambu, can you please ask your supplementary question. Hon Plouamma.

Mr M A PLOUAMMA: Thank you. You did not recognise me. I have a point of order. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon Shivambu, please take your seat. What's your point of order?

Mr M A PLOUAMMA: Hon House Chair, I do respect your ruling.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Yes.

Mr M A PLOUAMMA: But I think we cannot allow in this House for someone to say that whites can't speak in this House.

[Applause.] We cannot!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon member ...

[Interjections.] Can you finish your point of order.

[Interjections.] Order! [Interjections.]

Mr M A PLOUAMMA: Sit down! Sit down! [Interjections.]

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 99**

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon Kwahula ...

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] ... member. Never point at me!

Never! Never!

An HON MEMBER: Fok off!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon Plouamma! Can you please take him out! Hon Plouamma! [Interjections.] Hon Paulsen! Serjeant-at-arms, can you please take those members out! [Interjections.] Hon Plouamma ... [Interjections.] Hon Plouamma ... [Interjections.] Hon Plouamma! [Interjections.] Can you please ... the protection services, come in. Can we suspend the House for five minutes. Protection services ...

BUSINESS SUSPENDED AT 16:27 AND RESUMED AT 16:30.

Question 24 (cont):

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order! Order! Hon members, can you please take your seats? I have requested that the Chief Whips should have a meeting tomorrow to address one of the matters of conduct on the floor. Hon Plouamma was not yet done with the point of order, on which none of you do not

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 100**

know how I was going rule. I have then asked him to leave the House because he allowed himself and another member to engage on a scuffle. [Interjections.] Order, hon members!

Mr J H STEENHUISEN: Chairperson, that was self-defence.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon Plouamma insulted. I was listening and I was on the floor. [Interjections.] Order, hon member! I then asked the Sergeant-at-arms to take both ... [Interjections.] hon Paulsen, can you please leave the House. Those two members, I will report to the Speaker so that their matter is dealt with in terms of their conduct. What is your point of order, hon Nkwankwa?

Mr N L S NKWANKWA: Chair, the EFF cannot do what they are doing.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): What is your point of order?

Mr N L S NKWANKWA: No! People have got a democratic right to make their points here; whether you agree with them or not they should be allowed to make those points! Mr Plouamma was

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 101**

busy making his point, and so was Mr Steenhuisen by the way!

We can't allow ourselves to be intimidated. People must allow us to express our views and when we are done; they can stand up and make their points. [Applause.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order! Thank you very much, can you take your seat. Hon Nkwankwa, I correctly agree with you. However, all the members in the House, those who ask the points of order and those who are sitting, none of all of us have the right to then continue the scuffle and make disparaging comments and insult one another.

That is why I had to rule in the earlier debate so that the House can proceed. And I said that if any member has a problem there are protocols on how we raise the problems on the ruling of the Chair. I was just informing all of you in this House that I have taken a decision to suspend those two members of the House out. I am now proceeding with the question. What is your point hon Steenhuisen?

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Thank you, Chair. It is Rule 85. The hon Malema very clearly called me a racist and effing white boy and a whole lot of other epithets. Those are

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 102**

unparliamentary – it is never parliamentary to call another member racist before. [Interjections.]

Mr J S MALEMA: You called me names before – you called me names before! Why did he call me a VBS looter?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order! Order, hon Malema! Can you take your seat? Can you take your seat! Hon Malema can you take your seat?

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: I would ask that he is asked to withdraw those comments; they are unparliamentary and have no place in this Parliament.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order! Order, hon member, hon members can you allow the Chair to run the House. There are issues I raised earlier, hon Steenhuisen. There are disparaging remarks you raised. I am not saying racist is not a point ... [Interjections.] ... I will protect all members of the House. [Applause.]

Hon MEMBERS: Yes!

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 103**

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): And I will make my ruling tomorrow on both your statement and the hon Malema's statement. I will thank you very much.

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: Thank you very much, House Chair. You know Samora Machel used to say that if you are applauded by white people you must know that something is wrong with you.

[Laughter.] So, those who have been applauded white people here must know that there is something wrong with them.

However, I want to talk about public debt, President, that is, South Africa's debt to GDP ratio is now approaching 60%. And by all forms of measure and predictions South Africa's economy will not grow by more than 2% in the next three years. That is a fact of the matter.

In the entire Medium-Term Expenditure Framework in the three years budget allocations the biggest expenditure item will be debt services followed by Education, Health and other things. So, it's like servicing debt services - meaning that we are going to spend more than R200 billion dealing with that. We are now talking about the China debt in terms of what should happen.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 104**

When the Minister of Finance was presenting the Medium-Term Expenditure Framework, it did not come out clear in terms of how do we deal with public debt? What is the most believable strategy to deal with huge public debt in South Africa because the economy is not growing and we are faced the challenge of expenditure ... [Inaudible.]

The PRESIDENT OF THE REPUBLIC: House Chair and hon Shivambu, as clearly articulated by the Minister of Finance we are concerned about our debt profile, particularly in relation to the debt service costs that imposes on us, the costs that we incur in servicing our debts are growing exponentially higher than all the other expenditure items on our budget. And the fact that we are now beginning to bridge the 60% level is a matter of serious concern.

Now, how are we going to address this? We obviously have to address this through the fiscal prudence that we have always spoken about. But in the end we have got to spend within our limits. And that does not mean that we immediately going to austerity measures but we have got to embark on priority expenditure type of solutions. This is what we are going to be

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 105**

looking at as we craft the next budget because we just cannot continue seeing our debt growing at an alarming rate.

So, we will be coming up with solutions. Obviously, we want to generate more economic growth which will help to address this challenge that we are facing. But we are in a difficult situation and the best way out is to spend more prudently and also to grow our economy. There are a number of expenditure items that we need to look at which we are already beginning to communicate to all and sundry that we have to watch and keep our eyes on that.

However, we will continue to manage our public finances in a much more prudent way. One of the better things that I think that this new period has yielded is that; firstly, we are aware of the problems and the challenges but we have already started curbing some reckless expenditure, corruption, malfeasance and with that we will be able to rollback the expenditure processes that were completely out of kilter with our budgetary prudence.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 106**

So, we are on the way of doing precisely that but we have to repair quite a number of areas as we move forward. Thank you, House Chair. [Applause.]

Mr N SINGH: House Chairperson, millions of Hindus across the world will celebrate Diwali tomorrow, including me. And I expected some fireworks tomorrow but not today – in the House. [Laughter.]

Hon President, you give us an assurance that South Africa as the perception is across Africa will not become the cash and carry of China. There is a fear out there that that is exactly what is going to become because there are examples, like in Sri Lanka where the Port has now been ceded to Chinese. Now, instead of borrowing from the Chinese Development Bank why are we not using the Brics Bank? China is a participant but it is a more inclusive bank, why are we not using the Brics Bank to borrow from to meet our debts for the SOEs or for any other development programme? Thank you.

The PRESIDENT OF THE REPUBLIC: House Chair, hon Singh you might have heard the Minister of Finance as he was outlining the stimulus and economic recovery plan including the partners

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 107**

that we would be seeking to obtain finance from. The New Development Bank is one of such. We have already had a discussion with them about a facility that would help us bolster our infrastructure fund.

Remember that we are shareholders in the New Development Bank. We have put money which was voted for by this Parliament and so we are therefore insiders. The terms that we will be able to get are terms that are fairly friendly and we will be able to get long-term financing with easy terms of pay back. So, we are going to be able to get muscles for capital investments.

We may well say more debt but in the end when you are borrowing – which many countries do by the way around the world for capital expenditure. It is very different from borrowing for consumption expenditure. What the new drive is all about is to focus on real investment, capital investment, putting infrastructure on the ground and investing in areas that are going to yield better returns for the people of our country.

But, at the same time creating a very good balance in the management of our financing to make sure that the process of

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 108**

ensuring that our people, particularly those who are dependent on the grants – the processes that we have got to get involved in for education, health and others continue.

So, we have to create a very good balance but the new thrust that I would like to communicate, hon Singh, is that yes, we are going to be focussing more on capital expenditure and we will be watching the scale that the hon Shivhambu spoke about, about not breaching in an overly manner the GDP debt ratio; because we need to keep that on check so that our servicing costs do not grow exponentially.

So, we have to create a very delicate balance but at the same time invest so that our economy continues to grow. If we can drive economic development and growth we should be able to begin to turn this around. Unfortunately, it will take us sometime, as Treasury has also postulated. It will not happen within a year or two years, it will take us sometime but we will begin to see the needle moving in the right way. I can assure you that the prudent management of our resources is in good hands and we will continue to make sure that it does happen in a correct manner for the interest of our people.

Thank you.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 109**

Prince M G BUTHELEZI: Yes, Madam House Chair, just for my guidance, during the brawl I heard the hon member referring to other members as "these whites." I just want that for guidance to know in future, whether we are going to refer to each other as "these whites" or "these blacks" because I think that when the head of state is actually answering questions and a remark like this is made. I think it is grossly irresponsible on my part to just let it go. I just want guidance for the future ... [Inaudible.] [Applause.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms AT DIDIZA): Thank you, hon Buthelezi. Indeed, in terms of guidance, it is unparliamentary. That's why I said, I will reflect on all the matters because there were many rules that were broken during that period.

I said, I'm not condoning what happened, but there are a lot of things that happened, which ended in the chaos that was; and I will give a ruling tomorrow on all of those matters. Rule 67 was broken, Rule 69, Rule 82, Rule 84, Rule 48, Rule 92 and Rule 85, all of which during the period that you are referring to. Hon Malema, can you please take your seat I will consider you on your point of order.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 110**

So I will reflect on all of them and come back to the House, because even the way in which we now turned to raise the point of orders, is not in accordance with the rules, which at times, create the brawl that we saw happening earlier.

Hon Buthelezi, the matter is not concluded, but one had to bring the order to the House so that we can continue with the business of the House. That's why I also said, Chief Whips will have to meet as they are meeting tomorrow, reflect on this issue, because several times I asked Chief Whips of both parties to actually talk to their members because some of these statements that were said earlier on, were breaking one of our rules in terms of impugning on the character of other members.

That is why I said allow me as a presiding officer to have a comprehensive ruling. No one will be spared who actually went against our rule. So indeed, it is not acceptable, but we will have to come back to this House; because I felt if we had to continue it was going to actually disrupt the House even worse than it happened earlier on. I hope you will agree with me. Thank you, very much.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 111**

Mr J S MALEMA: No, I also want to raise my concern that I have been called here a VBS looter, and when I stand up to defend myself, now there are some people with some morality, which only sees one side and do not take into consideration what transpired before we uttered the words we uttered.

[Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms AT DIDIZA): That's why...

[Interjections.]

Mr J S MALEMA: I will never - let me speak Chair because the rest of other people were given an opportunity.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms AT DIDIZA): Oh, I thought you were done. I thought you were done. Okay, you can finish.

Mr J S MALEMA: I will never submit to whiteness. I don't care where it takes place. I will never subject myself to whiteness, and...

Mr M WATERS: Racist.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 112**

Mr J S MALEMA: ... whiteness must be called out and be put in its rightful place and be called by its rightful name.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms AT DIDIZA): Can you take a seat hon Malema.

Mr J S MALEMA: And if there is a punishment for that I'm ready to take it. I will never keep quiet if we are threatened here by whiteness.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms AT DIDIZA): Okay, hon member can you please take your seat. That's exactly why - order, hon members! That's exactly why I said the rules that I have mentioned are all the rules that in that process, were actually impacted upon by members of this House; and I will rule tomorrow.

Question 25:

The PRESIDENT OF THE REPUBLIC: Hon House Chair, this question addresses possibly the issue that seems to have emerged in this House as you have observed and dealing with issues of ethnic chauvinism and narrow nationalism. Nelson Mandela represented the hopes of millions of South Africans who dreamt

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 113**

of a life unshackled from a system that sought to stifle their potential by virtue of race or ethnicity. The emergence of ethnic chauvinism and narrow nationalism represents a direct challenge to the hopes of our people and the values of our Constitution. We need to respond to these tendencies as a society.

While there is much that government can do to reinforce the principles of our Constitution, this is necessarily a task that must be undertaken by all parts of our society. This is a responsibility that falls on the shoulders of all of us as South Africans, of parents, community structures, schools, faith-based organisations, employers, trade unions, civil society and indeed all public bodies, but all South Africans. It is important that we should reaffirm the values that are enshrined in our Constitution which clearly says that South Africa belongs to all the people who live in it, irrespective of their race, culture, creed or religion.

For its part, government sees schools as a fundamental foundation for advancing social cohesion and nation-building. It introduced the National Identity Passport of Patriotism in schools in 2014, which contains many of our important symbols

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 114**

that define our national identity. It is finalising the auditing of teaching and learning material for latent racism, sexism, stereotypes and other forms of discrimination. A teachers' guide has been developed to provide practical ways for schools to promote the rights and the responsibilities of children and indeed should also mean citizens. It shows how a rights and responsibilities culture can be built into school and classroom management.

We have promoted the recital of the Preamble of our Constitution in public schools and printed the preamble on the cover of the workbook on Life Orientation. We have also introduced the Prevention and Combating of Hate Crimes and Hate Speech Bill, which gives effect to our obligations in terms of the Constitution and international human rights instruments concerning racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and related intolerance. Constitutional awareness campaigns through the media, highlighting the constitutional values that we have embraced continue.

Some departments have focused the campaign specifically on vulnerable and marginalised groups in our society. The Department of Justice and Constitutional Development conducts

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 115**

community dialogues on racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and other forms of intolerances. The Department of Basic Education is incrementally introducing the African languages programme in schools as part of promoting and increasing multilingualism in our schools.

The task of building a nonracial society cannot be separated from the task of redressing the huge material inequalities in our society. We therefore need to pursue all measures to combat racism, ethnic chauvinism and narrow nationalism alongside a clear programme to create jobs, tackle poverty and transform the economy of our country. We all share a constitutional obligation to build a united, nonracial, nonsexist and democratic society. As government, we are committed to fulfil our obligation in this regard. In the end it behoves on all of us, particularly here as Members of Parliament whether we are indeed going to subscribe not only to the values that are articulated in the Preamble of our Constitution, but also in the Bill of Rights that is very much the key body in our Constitution.

The project of building a nonracial society in South Africa is a historic task and it is a task that we cannot in this day

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 116**

and in this hour move away from. South Africa characterises itself as a nonracial democracy and that is what we must be. There should never be a time and an opportunity where we see each other as black, white and so forth and insult one another. [Applause.] There should never be times like that. [Applause.] We are South Africans and this is what defines us. This is the key hallmark of what distinguishes us and separates us from many, many other peoples in the world. We are a nation that has been crafted from the crucible of oppression and racism and apartheid. We cannot go back to that horrible past that we have had. We are a nonracial democracy ... [Applause.] ... and however painful it might be and we still live with the pain of what apartheid did. We cannot revert to raw racism and separation of ourselves as this type and this type of people. We are one people and we are being forged as one nation with one future and one vision. Let us live up to that as this Parliament. That is who we are. That is all I have to say. [Applause.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T DIDIZA): Thank you, President. Hon! Order, hon member! Hon Makhubela-Mashele!

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 117**

Ms L S MAKHUBELA-MASHELE: Hon House Chair, now what we have witnessed this afternoon in this House is a clear indication that says that we have all not rallied behind the project of nation-building and social cohesion. I hope with the response that the President has given to us, we will do a self-reflection and see how best as public representatives we lead by example because the nation cannot emulate what we have just done in this House this afternoon.

Hon President, now you have made a clarion call on your maiden state of the nation address which talks about the "Thuma mina" campaign. Therefore, that clarion call was for all South Africans together with government to use it as a vehicle towards social cohesion and nation-building. Now, I want to know, what has departments been doing because as you made that clarion call be it as written or unwritten policy it was for all government agencies, government departments, social partners and all to rally behind and programmatise it and ensure that we forge ahead towards social cohesion and nation-building using what you have given us as vehicle. I thank you.

[Applause.]

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 118**

The PRESIDENT OF THE REPUBLIC: Hon House Chair, clearly the social cohesion project that we have and the nation-building task that we are supposed to engender in terms of our constitutional values, it is an important one. It calls on all of us be it as leaders sitting here and as government departments to embrace that, but not only to do that but advocate it and promote it. Now, government departments by policy and by policy directive are supposed to enhance social cohesion and make sure that the nation-building project that we have is advance further. Now, many government departments are committed to doing that.

Indeed, in terms of, say for instance, the state of the nation address tasks that we set out we are supposed to speed that up. To speed it up with a view of ensuring that indeed we do build a nonracial society in our country. Various departments are rolling that out. You have already heard how the Department of Basic Education, for instance, has taken the lead in as far as ensuring that the education materials that it is putting out promotion of our languages, ensuring that the preamble is recited everyday in schools is part of that whole process and make it sure that our children at that foundational level are taught about nonracialism and the

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 119**

importance of, for instance, our history where we have come from.

Other departments, the Department of Justice and Constitutional Development, ensure that the Constitution is also spread and constitutional lessons are given. The Department of Arts and Culture under Minister Mthethwa has printed all these documents and these pamphlets that promote the values of our Constitution and also ensures that our identity as a nation is prominently promoted so that everyone knows precisely who we are as South Africans that we are a nonracial nation. This is very important and it revolves around principle.

I was in Germany recently and I had a discussion with Chancellor Angela Merkel, and my reflection to her was, well you seem to have really been firm on the issue of migration. She said to me that she does compromise 10% or 20% on the whole number of issues, but on matters of principle, particularly on issues that have to do with solidarity with other people migration being one of them, she said to me that she is principled and she will remain firm. Similarly, on issues of nonracialism we must all say that we remain firm and

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 120**

we will not be moved because it is a matter of principle, because it speaks about where we come from and speaks about where we want to go. We are South Africans who are meant to forge a united country, a united nation and we cannot be taken back and almost be torn asunder by chauvinism and narrow chauvinism that seeks to promote just sectional interests.

We are South Africans united in our diversity and it is our diversity that we must promote. It is our diversity that we must be grateful for because it is this that makes us stronger as we deal with the terrible legacy that we have had in the past. So, I'm articulating this and say that this has to be a matter of great principle and we should never compromise on this matter. Thank you. [Applause.]

Dr C P MULDER: Hon President, all members of this House sworn about the Constitution when they became members. One of the founding provisions of the Constitution we find in Chapter 1 that deals with values enshrined in the Constitution, section 1(d) deals with nonracialism. It seems perhaps all of us are devoted and committed to that oath that we took when we became members of this House. Hon Chairperson, the original question put to you identified ethnic chauvinism and narrow nationalism

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 121**

as the real facts to nation-building and social cohesion. The point I wanted to make was that that is not the real fact. The real fact is blatant racism. Luckily or unluckily today we saw exactly the example of what I was hoping to say – blatant racism is rampant in South Africa if you need to address that nonracialism.

The question that I would like to ask, hon President, is the following; one of the biggest disappointments for me is section 185 commission; the Commission for the Promotion and Protection of the Rights of Cultural, Religious and Linguistic Communities. That commission as far as I'm concern has done everything but further promoted the rights. Is your government prepared to look into the functioning and the original Act 2002, to improve that Act? Thank you, sir. [Time expired.]

The PRESIDENT OF THE REPUBLIC: Hon House Chair, we continue to have discussions precisely on that Act and we have continued to talk to a number of people about it and I'm also prepared hon Mulder to have further engagement with you on it. When we crafted it we obviously wanted to build a South African nation and we want to continue doing precisely that. Therefore, I would like to invite you that, yes, let us continue our

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 122**

collaboration and our discussions in that regard because we should be committed to ridding this country of racism, but we should also much as you say maybe that is not the real core of the question, we should also continue to rid our country of displace of ethnic chauvinism and narrow nationalism because that does not define us. That does not tell the whole world of what we are. Therefore, I'm prepared that we should continue discussions around that Act. Thank you very much. [Applause.]

Mr M L W FILTANE: Hon House Chair, it is very difficult to mix chalk and cheese. South Africa has a very disappointing Gini coefficient which is influenced by sickening social disparities. We need a solvent to enhance social cohesion. Mandela was that product. He was the Mandela the person of persons who did not discriminate between ANC members and the rest of South African population. But, alas the ANC has always projected him as its exclusive property to the exclusion of everybody else in the process and opportunity to use him as a rallying point for social cohesion ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T DIDIZA): Order, hon members!

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 123**

Mr M L W FILTANE: ... every time there was an event around him you would see only and only ANC colours not national colours, for instance. What can you do to repair this reputational damage to such a good and great name going forward?

The PRESIDENT OF THE REPUBLIC: Hon House Chair, I would have crafted the question silently differently and I would have said what can we do to enhance the reputation that Madiba has in as far as nation-building and social cohesion, which is precisely what this government has been doing, particularly in this year when Madiba would have turned 100 years as well as Mama Albertina Sisulu. What we have sought to do is to actually spread the message not only through our country, but throughout the world as well. We saw with great pride how the world embraced Madiba and what Madiba stood for and his values and principles that he suffered or lived for. How the whole world at the United Nations was able to dedicate a few hours just talking about Madiba's life.

In a few days I will be going to the European Parliament, just precisely to continue this celebration of Madiba's life by the European Parliament. The African Union did exactly the same thing when we held the African Union Summit in Nouakchott in

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 124**

Mauritania. The whole world continues to regal itself in the aura and the memory of Madiba and similarly in our country as well. Therefore, obviously as these moments are held people will wear regalia that associate them with what Madiba stood for and we have never sought, never - underline never sought - as a government to prevent South Africans as a whole to celebrate Madiba's life to associate themselves with Madiba.

In fact, even his own organisation, the African National Congress, has known for ever and a day that Madiba does not only belong to the community in Mvezo; does not only belong to his family; does not only belong to the African National Congress and he does not only belong to us as South Africans; and he belongs to the whole world. That is why we must be proud to embrace Madiba in that way and to celebrate his life.  
[Applause.] Thank you, hon House Chair.

Prof N M KHUBISA: Hon House Chair, it is blatantly clear, hon President, that the matter must be attended to in a holistic manner as you have alluded to that there are so many structural inequalities within our country embedded within our society in the work place within schools, etcetera. Now, I want to know within the ambit of the law, what is it that can

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 125**

be urgently and robustly done to ensure that we once and for all do away with this narrow nationalism and ethnic chauvinism? Thank you.

The PRESIDENT OF THE REPUBLIC: Hon House Chair, hon Khubisa, the processes that we are involved in which I articulated in terms of spreading this message and inculcating this culture of nonracism in our children in various programmes that we embark upon as government is precisely aimed at ensuring that we all embrace a nonracial culture and show that South Africa indeed in truth and in effect is seen as a country that belongs to all of us who live in it. So, within the broader ambit is not only by the law but of our Constitution. There are things that we should continue doing and I guess today's debate or discussion on this matter is particularly one gives us a number of ideas or precisely some of the things that we should do, because having come from this terrible past that we have come from clearly there is still a long route to turning to our country into truly nonracial South Africa where we are able to tolerate one another in the diversity that is the makeup of our society.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 126**

There is a lot that we can do and we want to rely on the wisdom of all of us to come up with a number of interventions, a number of initiatives and programmes that can enhance the social cohesion and the nation-building project that we have of necessity to embark upon. Thank you, House Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T DIDIZA): Thank you very much, President, for answering the last question and I would ask you to take your seat. [Applause.] Thank you, President. Ordinarily I would have said this has brought us to the end of the question to the President and the House adjourn, but I think it is important as a presiding officer and on behalf of this House to actually apologise to you for what happened during the question sessions, and also thank you for having been patient and allowed to continue with the question regardless of what has happened. I'm sure in the last question you spoke about some of the issues that happened here today. I would like to thank you for actually having honoured us with the extension of time.

I also want to indeed say to members none of us can be proud about what happened in the House today and I really think that we should reflect a bit more, particularly the Chief Whips on

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 6 NOVEMBER 2018**

**Page: 127**

their role and what their responsibilities are on their members and on the House that all of us as members should also relook at our rules and see how best we can implement them to the latter.

Hon members, I think that we owe it to one another to be respectful even though we may differ, but do so in a manner that respects the decorum of the House. I would like to thank all of you and, indeed hon Steenhuisen, I heard what you said. We will talk about it afterwards. Can the House adjourn for today? Thank you very much.

The House adjourned at 17:12.