

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 1

WEDNESDAY, 05 SEPTEMBER 2018

PROCEEDINGS OF THE NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

The House met at 15:01.

The Deputy Speaker took the Chair and requested members to observe a moment of silence for prayer or meditation.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Chief Whip, you haven't done your work. I will talk to you in my Chambers after this meeting.

QUESTIONS FOR ORAL REPLY

Governance

Cluster 3

Question 131:

The MINISTER OF COOPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL

AFFAIRS: Hon Deputy Speaker, we have the question 131 from hon Mileham and the reply is as follows: thirteen municipalities

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 2

were recorded to have invested funds in the Venda Building Society, VBS bank. The investments were done contrary to the Municipal Financial Management Act 56 of 2003, MFMA and Municipal Investment Regulations of 2005, section 113(1) of the MFMA.

This Act states that the Minister of Finance acting with the concurrence of the Cabinet member responsible for local government may prescribe the framework within which municipality must conduct their cash management and investment and invest monies not immediately required.

Regulation six of municipal investment regulations applies investment types, allowing municipalities to invest in these secured mutual banks. The idea of municipalities investing public funds against treasury regulation is totally unacceptable but even more shocking was reported sudden disappearance of these funds from VBS mutual bank.

Early this year, the reserve bank announced that VBS mutual bank had been put under curatorship due to suspected irregularities. I discussed the matter with the Governor of

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 3

the Reserve Bank. The Minister of Finance was informed that the Reserve Bank and National Treasury had embarked on appointing forensic investigations on the matter.

As the Department of Cooperative Governance and Traditional Affairs, COGTA and the government in general we fully support these investigations which would lead to charges being preferred against all those who are involved in this debacle, whether they are employees, shareholders or management of the VBS or elected representatives or officials of various municipalities. Subsequent to the findings, it is anticipated that the culprits will be charged and take to court.

It is also expected that the investigation would reveal the true situation regarding the disappearance of the large amount of public funds as well as the savings of individuals and funeral and burial services who had invested funds in this mutual bank. These are largely clients from rural and poor communities. Municipalities lost a total of R1,65 billion with Limpopo having been most affected. Other provinces are Gauteng and North West. The source of the fund includes the savings, equitable share and other funds destined for service delivery.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 4

I met with all the affected municipalities on 19 June 2018 to discuss the impact of this loss, particularly on service delivery. I directed that the municipalities should report the potential investment loss to the Municipal Public Accounts committees to play their oversight role.

In addition, I requested that the respective provincial COGTA departments to investigate the investments with mutual bank in accordance to the section 106(4) (a) of Municipal Systems Act 32 of 2000, which allows the Minister to assign the MEC for this kind of investigation into a maladministration, fraud, corruption and other serious malpractice. This also will be done together with the treasuries of the various provinces.

Limpopo has already appointed the service provider and this was announced to the affected municipalities a few days ago. Then the forensic investigation in Gauteng and North West has also started with Deloitte and SekelaXabiso respectively.

The COGTA met with National Treasury and Auditor General on 3 September 2018 to discuss a consistent approach to deal with the potential investment loss in the annual financial

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 5

statements and adjustment budget and consequence management. The meeting resolved that Treasury will issue guidelines for this and this has already been done by 13 August 2018. At this stage, we request information on the numbers of councillors and officials facing disciplinary charges and can't be provided as investigations are in progress.

With regard to actions taken recently, currently, Greater Giyani Local Municipality has since suspended its chief financial officer, CFO who was acting as Municipal Manager at that time. I will attach the list of all those municipalities for interest of the members. Thank you very much.

Mr K J MILEHAM: Deputy Speaker, essentially what the Minister is telling us is that after nine months of investigation nobody is yet facing disciplinary charges. Minister, R1,6 billion of municipal funds with illegal deposited with VBS. It is money that is now gone to those municipalities. So, in addition to the disciplinary and the criminal charges that have been laid against councillors and officials, it is also necessary to hold people politically accountable. In light of this, will you and the ANC support the motion of no confidence

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 6

in the mayors of the affected municipalities which should have been overseeing the municipal finances that have been lost?

The MINISTER OF COOPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: Deputy Speaker, we went through the discussion with the various municipalities, not all of those mayors could have been necessarily present when this happened. So, because of the complexity we found, we believe that it is important to get these reports which we believe will be coming in due cause and any action that will be necessary will be supported by the ANC.

Mr X NGWEZI: Hon Deputy Speaker, some municipalities were warned against getting involved in dealings with the VBS Mutual Bank. Have you investigated the reasons why these municipalities continued to work with VBS even though they were warned before that their action was going to be illegal, because we are hearing rumours that some got commissions for having deposited money or invested money in the VBS bank?

Thank you.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 7

The MINISTER OF COOPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: Deputy Speaker, these investigations must reveal all of that. We have asked various questions. All I can say is that their answers are not satisfactory. There are instances where there are some municipal managers who have argued that they have legal opinion which supported their actions.

There are instances also where the mayors pleaded that they were not informed. They were completely unaware of this and in some instances they actually pointed officials other than the CFOs and the municipal managers who actually acted on this case. I think that is important for us to understand that this matter is in the competent hands of the crime investigation teams, with the forensic audits under way.

The hasty move may actually be complex and I hope that the hon members do understand that the hasty action on try to remove a mayor before you have your case properly presented can actually complicate in a number of issues lending you to court long before you got enough evidence to act.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 8

Ms N V MENTE: Minister, the nice thing is that, you are saying some of the people that are responsible for taking money without following the due processes are no longer mayors. Fortunately, for us South Africans some of those people or 99% of them are still alive and you have to go and find them. They must come and account because I can bet you now that those people are still within the spheres of government. They are not in private business.

Secondly, when the National Treasury took a decision that all those municipalities must take that money out of the VBS bank and that didn't happen, were you in engagement with the Treasury to make that decision? If you were, what did you do to the municipalities that refused to take the money out before the collapse of the VBS bank?

The MINISTER OF COOPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: Deputy Speaker, anyone who would have been involved in the VBS debacle when they are found to have been responsible, they are criminally liable for action, they will have to be charged and be taken to court. Whether they were mayors, councillors, municipal managers, or CFOs they will

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 9

still be charged. Whether they are still part of the municipality currently or they are in private or even abroad, they will still have to be charged.

So, there is no way of actually running away from taking responsibility. My issue here is that we have actually asked with the Reserve Bank why there were no arrests. They told us to wait because their processes are the ones that will identify who will be charged.

Then, because of that we have actually said that what investigation we are doing will handover that information, so that they can align all of that because clearly they would have some collusion going on here. There is no one who must escape and no one will escape and I think if we leave this matter in the hands of the criminal and justice system, it is much better and that for me is where the issue is.

Now, the question of what happened. Some of them pleaded that they didn't receive the circular. Others said they had different interpretation. All of those issues are not a big problem. They will be sorted out in this investigation. That

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 10

is why we insist on the investigation. You can go and lay a charge now; you won't have enough information to deal with them because it must come from this investigation. So, you can go in, it will just be a gesture if you go and lay a charge. It will not be because it wouldn't yield any results. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister, you may take your seat. Please, you can also respond from your seat where you are going to be sitting next time if it will arise. Yes. I am sorry. Hon Minister; please from there can you take the last supplementary question from hon Shabalala? I nearly skipped it.

Ms N F SHABALALA: Hon Minister, I just want to get clarity with regard to those municipalities that have invested in the VBS bank. What is the impact with regard to service delivery and if there is any impact, what is the supporting programme that the department has to make sure that the service delivery is not affected?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 11

The MINISTER OF COOPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: Deputy Speaker, certainly the amount of money that were saved in VBS or deposited in VBS is destined for service delivery. We expect that there will be somewhere an impact, so we called all the mayor and municipal managers and ask them to readjust their entire Budget.

Some of them indicated that the funds that they deposited would have been necessary to be used in the outer years. So, there is no immediate impact but it will be ultimately will have an impact at some point because of the need to readjust that is why we had actually had to call them to come together to sit with us. We will be looking out to see if there is any serious problem, then we can see if there is any need to intervene.

Right now, we have ruled out any bailouts and we have also said that they need to go and engage the communities as stakeholders and explain what has happened and what the problems are and if there is any project that needed to be rescheduled. They must therefore explain that to the community. So, we will be watching the situation very closely.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 12

We will not allow that because of those loses. The municipalities don't adjust their Budget, so that there is no immediate impact but over a period we will also make sure that they take accountability when the impact comes. Thank you.

Question 113:

The MINISTER OF DEFENCE AND MILITARY VETERANS (on behalf of The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY): Deputy Speaker, the framework for planning and monitoring in government is the Medium-Term Strategic Framework, MTSF, developed by the Department of Planning, Monitoring And Evaluation for every five year electoral cycle.

The current MTSF 2014-2019 is informed by the National Development Plan, NDP, after government adopted the plan in 2012 and serves as the first five year plan for implementing the NDP, incorporating the targets and priorities of the NDP.

Within this framework, the Department of Planning Monitoring and Evaluation monitors implementation of the NDP by government departments and report to Cabinet on a quarterly basis. Thank you, Deputy Speaker.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 13

Ms Z S DLAMINI-DUBAZANE: Deputy Speaker, thank you to the Minister. The ANC is aware of the effective instrument in monitoring the NDP activities. However, could you kindly outline, in this House, the collaboration and the alignment? Thank you.

The MINISTER OF DEFENCE AND MILITARY VETERANS (on behalf of The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY): Deputy Speaker, indeed there is collaboration between planning, monitoring and evaluation. In the first instance, as we set up targets, plans and programmes for implementation by government departments, there would have come through the different programmes such as the Millennium Development Goals, the NDP itself and they will be aligned with the MTSF. Thank you.

Mr S C MOTAU: Deputy Speaker, let me start by asking that you convey our serious displeasure at the absence of the Minister from this meeting. She is the very important one and we would have loved to have her because she is directly responsible for this.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 14

The problem we have with the NDP and the fact that there is so much lack of success, is not the fact that we have a plan, but the fact that we do not have an implementation plan. The real problem with this is simply that we have a plan and we can't implement it. So, we essentially have what we call fruitless and wasteful expenditure.

The question is this: Who is the champion of the NDP; who makes sure that it happens, who is accountable and who should be held responsible?

The MINISTER OF DEFENCE AND MILITARY VETERANS (on behalf of The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY): My view is that the champions of the NDP should be the members of the executive of government themselves. Yes, we do have a department of planning and we equally have a department of monitoring and evaluation.

There are tools which have been put in place for monitoring and evaluation of each one of the government departments but also for monitoring and evaluation of government cluster work. This is done through the quarterly reports and our views are

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 15

that the clusters operate both as officials of government but also as members of the executive. So, the director generals of various departments will sit in a cluster, report and are accountable and are guided by the members of the executive who are in that cluster. These are the people who then report to the Cabinet on work being done by clusters. Thank you.

Mr A M SHAIK-EMAM: Deputy Speaker, to the Minister, we are way off in achieving these targets. What is very important is that with the low economic growth and the high unemployment, how do you envisage we will be able to achieve these targets?

The MINISTER OF DEFENCE AND MILITARY VETERANS (on behalf of The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY): Deputy Speaker, truth of the matter is yes, we do acknowledge that there are challenges and our economy has not done as well as we expected it to do and there are growth inhibitors which are prioritised through budget prioritisation programme.

Yes, we do have a challenge of unemployment, hence the call for a job and an investment summit. I think the summits are good because through summits you engage in a dialogue with

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 16

your stakeholders. I should also say that one of the plans is dealing decisively with increasing competition through the Competitions Amendment Bill so that in the process you also curb illicit flows and promote efficient government spending.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Who is that? Who pressed that? Ow! It's Paulsen.

Mr N M PAULSEN: It's me.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Paulsen, don't ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Must we have empty seats and I sit at the back? Do you want that?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Go ahead, hon member.

Mr N M PAULSEN: Minister, regardless of what you say and what the presidency does to allowing government departments, nothing will change. The NDP is failing as the EFF warned you. Our country is in recession and the misguided and naïve believe that changing the presidency would change the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 17

direction of the economy while the ANC remains in power. The renewal of your neoliberal focus is misguided and shallow. Did the ANC or the presidency at any point consider a way forward either than the NDP?

The MINISTER OF DEFENCE AND MILITARY VETERANS (on behalf of The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY): That we start on the negative because you are saying that you have no confidence in the NDP. I think we should have confidence in the NDP in that at least it is a vision, a programme we can use to rally all South Africans across racial lines and class.

I also think we need to around a common programme. It is meant to eliminate poverty, to ensure economic growth in the country, to strengthen our democracy by ensuring that our structures of oversight and accountability of government are exercised and enhance the capacity of the state.

We therefore believe that there is potential to achieve that which we have set for ourselves in the NDP. After all, the NDP is a vision to 2030 so we do have some years within which this

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 18

work can be done. We just need to have confidence in it. Thank you.

Question 116:

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION:
Deputy Speaker, approximately 200 public service employees will be trained in skills for initiating and chairing disciplinary hearings, based on discretionary fund of R1,2 million allocated from Public service sector, education and training authority. This will augment the number of existing labour relations and legal experts, in the public service pool, who used to expedite disciplinary cases.

The Department of Public Service and Administration maintains a central pool of presiding officers and initiators, sourced from various departments and allocates them on request from government departments. This strategy should assist in reducing the turnaround timelines for dealing with disciplinary cases, thus supporting and capacitating structures, across the board to deal with consequence management.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 19

Mr M S BOOI: Deputy Speaker, this is a follow-up question. Which is the longest case and what were the challenges? If you can enlighten us more of what has been going on around this disciplinary cases.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION:
Deputy Speaker, we currently do not have statistics available, we will make them accessible once they are available.

Mr M HLENGWA: Deputy Speaker, another challenge, of course, is the fact that consequence management is far removed from the norms of operation in government and precisely we are in this mess now, for that very reason. Once you speak about 200 people that are going to be trained, you obviously would have benchmarked that against the backlog. The question is then; what is this backlog that you are dealing with in the main, and how many cases and, what is the cost to the state of people who are sitting at home waiting for their cases to be adjudicated and finalised, because you have got people who have been on leave for donkey years, because their cases have not been finalised. What is overall cost year-on-year the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 20

state is paying for the cases that you are not finalising and is the total of some of backlog that you are dealing with?

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION:

Deputy Speaker, in terms of the number of public servants that are going to be trained to deal with disciplinary cases. This is the number that we actually add on the already existing pool of the experts that are there, dealing with legal matters on disciplinary issues.

When it comes to number of disciplinary cases, like I have indicated to hon Booi, we currently do not have statistics of the number of people that are now on the list of those that are supposed to go through processes within public service, but whenever those numbers are available, we will make them available to the House. We are also quiet aware of the fact that to some extend this becomes expensive in the sense that paying somebody who is sitting at home on suspension, is quiet an exorbitant amount of moneys that the state has to pay and we are dealing with such matters.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 21

Prof N M KHUBISA: Chairperson, I am sorry, hon Deputy Speaker, I clicked by mistake on this but I wanted to ask a question.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Khubisa, go ahead.

Prof N M KHUBISA: Deputy Speaker, I wanted to ask the hon Deputy Minister as to whether when you deal with disciplinary cases, do you outsource presiding officers and do they get some stipend or some payment? Is there a flat rate or there is a normal rate according to policy?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Deputy Speaker, hon Khubisa, as indicated we have public servant that are already assisting, in dealing with disciplinary cases and more, the 200 that I am mentioning are going to add on to the pool, so we don't outsource this service, we are actually using public servants that have been trained to deal disciplinary matters as presiding officers.

Ms D VAN DER WALT: Deputy Minister, presentation of the presentation at the public service commission committee meetings, we get this outstanding cases. What are you exactly doing to get these cases solved? We can't go from one quarter

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 22

to another quarter and the list never ever gets cleared, to me public service bloated as it is the remedy of getting rid of staff is just not solved and here is a very good example, nothing is being done. What exactly are you doing to get this list cleaned out?

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION:

Deputy Speaker, the fact of the matter is that public service is an ongoing process. So, there will at all times be matters that require some form of disciplinary action, because we are talking about public service across government departments, what is important is look at the turnaround time, as to how we are doing along those lines and this is what we are currently concerned about and this why currently we have actually indicated that about 200 additional public servants are undergoing training in order for them to help capacitate this area of work.

Question 132:

The MINISTER OF DEFENCE: Deputy Speaker, the National Development Plan, NDP, set a target of reducing unemployment from 25,4% in 2010 to 20% by 2015, 14% by 2020 and 6% by 2030.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 23

The paths to achieving the 2015 goal was envisaged to entail the creation of 2,2 million jobs between 2010 and 2015 or 436 000 annually requiring an average growth domestic product, GDP, growth rate of about 4,6% per annum.

On this trajectory, between 2015 and 2020, the average rate of job creation would need to rise to 505 000 per annum, so that 2,500 million jobs are created. Over the period from 2020 to 2030 6,3 million jobs would need to be created at an average GDP growth rate of 5,3 per annum or 11 million jobs created between 2010 and 2030. Thank you.

Mr S C MOTAU: Deputy Speaker that is my problem. We know that, that is in this book! That book says exactly what the Minister has just rehashed. Let me read you something - coming out of National Planning Commission, NPC, the commission itself. They had a meeting in February where they were doing a review of what they were doing and how they were doing.

The commission is deeply concerned that the trends pertaining to the key objectives of the objective of the NDP namely, the reduction of poverty, inequality and unemployment have seen a

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 24

backwards slide and they say, the result is that poverty rate have increased from 36,4% to 40% by 2015, unemployment has increased to 27,7% as of the third quarter of 2017 and inequality remains very high. The question is, why is it like this? And what are we going to do about it?

Let me give you a proposition Minister. Will you agree that the NPC, the commissioners take a lead so that we can have somebody to point at when things fail? Clusters don't lead!

The MINISTER OF DEFENCE: Earlier on, you mentioned unemployment. There was a question which was raised there about our economic growth and the fact that yes, we are aware that there are challenges regarding our economic growth and, of course, if there isn't the kind of economic growth which we want there will be no jobs created. So we need in the first instance to build our economy we need to have investors investing in South Africa. We need to create stability in the country, so that we can attract these investors. Now, you are saying why is there inequality? There will be inequality if there are no jobs. There will be inequality if there is no economic growth in the country.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 25

Of course, there is a plan. Right now, the President is all over the place mobilising investors to come into South Africa. We are preparing for a job summit in October. We are also preparing for an investment summit. I think these are adequate steps, they may be baby steps but these are steps you take in trying to expand and develop your economy. You can't do it alone. Thank you.

Mr L M NTSHAYISA: Deputy Speaker, hon Minister, most of the vacancies that occur as a result of death and retirements, are not always filled. Therefore, I just want to check as to why these vacancies are not filled? Because, for the purpose of reducing unemployment it would at least help if those vacancies were filled. But when these posts are filled it is for temporary basis. Why is this happening?

The MINISTER OF DEFENCE: It's true that in government we do have a very high rate of attrition and of course, there are moments when you have to take tough decisions that as the attrition happens that you will have a moratorium in filling of vacancies so that you allow for restructuring and stability within your government departments.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 26

So, it's not always that when you have vacancies you fill them in. You have also been saying we have a bloated public service and I think that the process which the Minister of Public Service and Administration, DPSA, have started embarking upon of reorganising the state will allow for a smaller state but efficient state. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Who pressed this button?

MS Z S DLAMINI DUBAZANA: It was Dlamini-Dubazana who pressed the button and I pressed from my seat. Hon Gina is sitting here and I am sitting here at the back. That is where I have pressed the button from.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You are giving up the opportunity - are you doing that or are you asking the supplementary question?

MS Z S DLAMINI DUBAZANA: Can I ask a supplementary question?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please, do that. [Giggle.]

IsiZulu:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 27

Nk Z S DLAMINI DUBAZANA: Somlomo, ngiyabonga kakhulu Ngqongqoshe ngempendulo yakho. Bekungakuhle kodwa ukuthi uchazele le Ndlu ehloniphekile ukuthi ngempela ngempela kukhuna ukutshalwa kwezimali okwenziwayo nguhulumeni ukuqinisekisa ukuthi sinciphisa ukweqa komnotho njengoba manje bebona ukuthi kuzokhuphula ukuthi kungabikhona amazinga okuqashwa.

The MINISTER OF DEFENCE ON BEHALF OF THE MINISTER OF PRESIDENCY: Well, at the last Cabinet Lehotla, you would recall that the President did make a pronouncement on the stimulus which has been developed by way of decisions by the Cabinet Lehotla. Part of that is this mobilisation with various stakeholders because government cannot do it alone. Government partners with the private sector in order to grow the economy.

The government's responsibility is to create conditions for the investors to come in to South Africa and invest. So, part of that is to create stability in the country, not only that, it is to make sure that the investors themselves see it as a country of destination where they can throw in their resources

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 28

but of course, we will then continue to partner - because our interest in the main is not just about growing the economy but, it is also about partnering so that our young people can have jobs. Thank you.

Rev K R J MESHOE: Deputy Speaker, Minister, you partly answered the question I was going to ask. We all know that government cannot create 11 million new job opportunities by 2020 as envisaged by the National Development Plan, NDP.

What government can and should do is to create a climate that is conducive for the private sector to create new jobs. Among other things, government should ensure that crime levels are drastically reduced, ensure that there is a clear policy certainty and eradicate corruption. Lastly, ensure that political stability is there in the country as you said.

However, what I want to know from you hon Minister is, what is government doing to address some of these critical issues, because some of them have not yet been properly addressed in order to attract investors. Who will come to help create the jobs we need for our people? Thank you.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 29

The MINISTER OF DEFENCE: Deputy Speaker, I think the emphasis from the hon member is around issues of corruption and crime in the country. You would recall that there is what we call making South Africa feel safe and South Africans feel safe. We are trying our best.

There are structures which have been put in place in addition within the SA Police Service itself. You have a directorate which deals with serious crimes to show and to demonstrate our political will to deal with issues of corruption. You have the Anti-Corruption Task Team which is a multi disciplinary task team which deals with issues of corruption.

We do try as much as it is possible to work together and collaborate. We have also acknowledged by the way that corruption is not just in the public service, it is also in the private sector. There is always collusion between the private sector and the public service and therefore, it's important that internally even within the public service itself you have structures that with issues of corruption.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 30

Of course, I do want to acknowledge upfront that sometimes we take quite long to finalise cases but what is important is that - if you look at some of our Commercial Courts currently, there is a backlog of cases. There are many cases which have gone through the Commercial Court - anyway, which points to the fact that something is done about corruption in the country. And once you are seen to be doing something about corruption and crime, it then increases the levels of confidence in the country. Thank you very.

Question 136:

The MINISTER OF COOPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: Deputy Speaker, unfortunately I am not in a position to comment on the specific management decisions taken in individual municipalities. I have written to the Tshwane Metropolitan Municipality requesting that the relevant information be submitted to Cooperative Governance and Traditional Affairs. Once we have received the information, it will be shared with the hon member.

Cooperative Governance and Traditional Affairs is committed to the principles of good governance and strict compliance with

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 31

supply chain regulations for all service providers, who engage with municipalities for its supplies or services rendered. No service provider is allowed to utilise any relationship to the advantage or to serve their own interest. The question that is raised does not contain sufficient details for a direct response to be provided beyond this statement.

If the hon member has any tangible information to substantiate the allegation, he is encouraged, maybe in fact obliged, to report any irregularity or wrongdoing to the relevant authorities for further investigation. We suggest that the hon. member can supply us with details in a form of a complaint which we will then follow up and investigate. Thank you.

Mr N M PAULSEN: Deputy Speaker, Minister, it is actually quite unfortunate because this is something that affects all communities in the big cities, because the way our cities are structured is to favour big business at the expense of our people. How do you reconcile the contradiction that the very companies who rely on this apartheid spatial design of all our cities still now during 24 years of ANC-led government to

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 32

extract profit from our people are now the very people who are supposed to approve planning or expected to approve plans for city construction and tenders?

The MINISTER OF COOPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: Deputy Speaker, unfortunately the follow up question does not assist to clarify the matter. It is too general and the challenge with is that: What would be useful? He should be specific about a particular company and a particular municipality. That is how we would be able to deal with it. To make a statement in general is a bit problematic because, yes over the years there would have been companies that might have been established and are able to tender for various work in the different municipalities. We have a provision for supporting the inclusion of emerging empowerment companies and if we find that in a particular municipality that is not being taken into account, then we can deal with it.

The general statement needs details so we can investigate and be specific about the company and municipality and the transgression. That is what we would want to propose should be followed.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 33

Mr N M PAULSEN: Deputy Speaker, since he feels the question is too general

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No hon member your time is expired. We are not proceeding; you should have known that in advance. Take you seat hon member.

Mr K J MILEHAM: Thank you Deputy Speaker, Minister, would you agree that where a municipality does not have the capacity or the competency to provide a particular service they need to find that competency in the private sector while they develop their own cost effective capacity, and if not why not?

The MINISTER OF COOPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: Most of the municipalities do go out to source the capacity that they lack and therefore use to advance service delivery. Most of the services that the municipalities and government departments render are done by private sector. What the hon member prior to this last one asking the question is alluding to, is a possibility of a corrupt relationship between a service provider that would assist the municipality but in the process try to do that to their own advantage. That

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 34

is the issue that I am saying let us deal with it in a specific way. Let us have the specifics that we can investigate. In general all municipalities go out and source in form of service providers; consultants and so on, but that does not qualify for a consultant to be so corrupt as alleged and therefore we want to know what are the specifics.

Mr J J DUBE: Minister, Tshwane Metropolitan Municipality has been plagued by allegation of tender irregularities, following a R12 billion deal with a company to oversee a project management in the capital city. What measures have been taken with regard to this?

The MINISTER OF COOPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: That matter has served in the public media and the provincial MEC has indicated that they were investigating that. Once we have got information we will be able to supply the details. In fact when the matter of any form of irregularity is announced publicly, we do follow up to find out what is the source of that information. No municipality will be allowed to transgress on the supply chain regulations and same would be the situation with Tshwane Metropolitan

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 35

Municipality. If there is such, action will have to be taken once the full investigations are done. Thank you.

Mr L M NTSHAYISA: Hon Deputy Speaker, sorry I pressed the wrong button here. Hon Minister, because of what these cheating companies are doing, sometimes most of these municipalities appear to have achieved clean audit but there is no service delivery. Can you therefore reconcile between clean audit and lack of service delivery. Thank you very much.

The MINISTER OF COOPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: Well the auditing process is around ensuring that we confirm that municipalities do follow the regulations as expected, but there is no contradiction between getting clean audits and having service delivery. We need to always make sure that whilst we deal with the problems of auditing, we should not counter pose that as inimical to service delivery.

We must just always make sure that whilst service delivery occurs it must occur within the regulations and that is all about the audit processes. It is not one or the other; it is

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 36

both combined because it is a matter of good practise that we are trying to establish in the governance of municipalities.

Question 122:

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: Deputy Speaker, the response to Question 122 from hon Mthethwa is as follows. The performances of the majority of municipalities remains below the expectations and we have reported in this House that seven per cent of the country's municipalities are classified as well functioning, 31% are classified as reasonably well functioning, with 31% almost dysfunctional and 31% completely dysfunctional. So that ... [Interjections.]

The department has identified 87 distressed and dysfunctional municipalities for interventions towards recovery, working with the National Treasury. The interventions are in line with section 154 of the Constitution, which provides that national and provincial governments must support and strengthen the capacity of municipalities to manage their own affairs, exercise their powers and perform their functions.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 37

The current interventions focus on the main areas, which are governance and administration, financial management, infrastructure and service delivery, fighting corruption and dealing with political instability.

Serious concerns have been raised with the failure of municipalities to spend funds allocated to them, especially the Municipal Infrastructure Grant, Mig, which is the largest. A total of R8,2 billion in Mig allocation was not spent and then returned to the national fiscus over the period of 2013-14 and 2017-18. This translates to R1,6 billion that could not be spent every year.

Failure by municipalities to plan, implement, operate and maintain infrastructure has been attributed mainly to inadequate capacity, as only 55 municipalities have engineers. There is therefore a need to support municipalities in building internal capacity, in order for them to sustainably perform their functions and execute their powers.

The Municipal Infrastructure Support Agent, Misa, is supporting 55 municipalities, of which 17 are district and

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 38

38 are local municipalities which are struggling to spend their infrastructure allocations. Therefore, we have deployed district technical support teams, which comprise of civil and electrical engineers, and town and regional planners, to all nine provinces. These technical experts will be reinforced with governance and financial management experts that the Department of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs is in the process of sourcing, on top of what the department is offering.

The Misa technical experts will focus on infrastructure management whilst the national and provincial Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs departments will attend to the financial, management and governance issues.

Our complete technical support team will be constituted of a total of 150 individuals, which will have an engineer, chief engineer, civil engineers, electrical engineers, project and construction manager, town and regional planner, financial manager and an expert in governance and administration. The teams are expected to build permanent capacity in these municipalities beyond project implementation towards the goal

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 39

of building functional municipalities in terms of our back to basics programme. We will continuously evaluate this intervention in the next three years and then adjust from there. Thank you very much.

Mr E M MTHETHWA: Minister, thank you for the answer. I also understand the number and figures that you have done in terms of the engineers through your Misa project; however, in your answer I did not hear you dealing with this contribution in terms of the employment of youth graduates. How is that going to assist them as well?

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: Deputy Speaker, I did not mention that aspect simply because there is another question where I have detailed the issue of young graduates.

Amongst those who are being employed there is a very strong focus on young graduates who are coming straight from school, therefore being supported and mentored so that they begin to be part of the capacity that we need in various municipalities. There are a number of others who are trained,

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 40

who have qualifications but who need experience on the job. They are also included in this lot.

There is also a whole lot of other youth that are coming in on the basis of learnerships. They are going to be attached to the various municipalities. So we hope that over a period we will create a cadreship of engineers, and regional and town planners that will actually bring back internal capacity in municipalities. However, there is a question that has a little more detail which I will table at a later stage. Thank you very much.

Mr M L SHELEMBE: Hon Minister, your intervention in these dysfunctional municipalities is an indication that the MECs in provinces responsible for local government ... in charge of those municipalities are lacking capacity in executing their responsibilities.

Would you, in your capacity as Minister, consider recommending to the premiers of these provinces to recall them and replace them with capable MECs? I thank you.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 41

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: The lack of capacity in municipalities is a result of various factors. In particular, you have a challenge in some municipalities that are in poor municipalities with low revenue that cannot afford engineers, irrespective of what their MECs might wish. They are not capable of that. You also have huge competition with the private sector that takes a lot of those highly technical skills and moves them to the private sector.

Therefore, this intervention is actually a cumulative analysis over the few years of what needs to be done to correct the municipalities. It's being done together with those MECs and those provincial departments.

I think it's a little unnecessary to start thinking of redeploying MECs and I'm not sure whether you do have that competence, hon member. However, the point at the end of the day is that we are working together with those MECs. The incapacity that we are dealing with is structural in a number of instances and therefore our intervention is basically a

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 42

step further to all the interventions that we have tried in the past. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. From the EFF benches ... I notice that names that are here ... Can you please do it from your seats? You can speak quietly, hon Mhlongo. But, people who are not sitting in their places, please do so from your place so that there is no confusion. The names that appear here are one thing and the next thing someone else rises there. So can you just correct that ... if those of you who are here and are pressing, press it from your seat. Go ahead hon Mhlongo.

Mr S P MHLONGO: Thank you very much, Deputy Speaker. Hon Minister, one of the reasons municipalities are in a state of disarray and are unable to deliver services to our people is because of a lack of skills and capacity. We understand that there are some Misa technical teams that are being sent to distressed municipalities.

Are these technical people part of the department or are they sourced from consultants, noting that we need job creation but

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 43

also to create capacity for the state to be able to render efficient services to the people?

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: Deputy Speaker, the 150 that we are referring to are actually employees of the state. They are being distributed all over to support the municipalities. Part of the reason why we will be looking at the next three years to evaluate how to improve the system is because the lack of capacity is actually part of the problems that are causing the municipalities not to function. Therefore, we would not be using consultants at that particular level.

However, there is space for consultants because if you have internal capacity in a municipality, for any contract that you need to issue you need to get private sector participants who will come in at various levels, whether its project design or whether its at a level of contractors. Our team needs to oversee and supervise those who are private consultants.

The challenge that we have had is when you have no capacity. Even to initiate the internal design processes or even to

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 44

understand the infrastructure needs, you have a problem if you have to continuously rely on consultants.

The issue around consultants is the issue that you have heard the area members raising with regard to the reliability and all those questions. In our case we need to have internal capacity. All municipalities must have technical capacity. In some instances we have found that the best engineer available is not in the municipality but is in the university or in the private sector and have to keep interacting with the municipality that does not itself have an engineer, making it very difficult for those very sophisticated infrastructure technical plans to be rolled out because the municipality is short of people who understand them.

So it is actually important to keep the capacity as well, even though that does not exclude the need for those who are going to be coming from outside who are going to be contracted to do other services. But there must be our internal capacity.

Mr X NGWEZI: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Minister, we applaud you for this initiative. However, we want

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 45

to be clear as to what the dates are by when this is expected to be carried out because our municipalities and our communities out there are actually desperate. Our infrastructure is actually decaying. If you would one day take a walk in the big cities or even in the municipalities in rural areas you will discover that there are many problems pertaining to infrastructure. So can we really push according to the timelines promised to this particular House?

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: Thank you. We have provided a list of the municipalities where the technical consultants have been dispatched to. So it's already started. If you talk about ... For example, in the North West where a number of towns which had problems with sewage, water and all those issues ... they are actually already on the job.

Last week we visited Mpumalanga – Lekwa, Msukaligwa, those areas. They were actually already on site. So there are already some municipalities where there is action taking place. In some of the areas there will be follow up additional deployments that will take the people there.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 46

The issue of decaying infrastructure is found in many small towns and it's not just your area. It's an issue that we have to talk about because it is the one that is complicating maintenance of various municipalities, where you no longer need just a small maintenance budget but you need a huge investment to replace the entire network of sewer pipes, water pipes and so on. That is an issue which is a challenge that we have to face up to. However, in terms of where the deployment is, there is already work that has started. Thank you.

Question 142:

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: Hon Deputy Speaker, Question 142, hon A M Shaik Emam the response is as follows, the DAs councillors must meet with citizens regularly and this is provided for in schedule 1 of the Local Government Municipal System Act, 2000, which makes provision for that councillors are reluctant to represent local communities on municipal councils. In fulfilling this role councillors must be accountable to local communities and report back at least quarterly to constituencies on council's matters including the performance of the municipality in terms of the established indicators. Our government in particular

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 47

emphasises taking government back to the people or reporting back to communities we serve.

In order to ensure that the councillors fulfil the obligation to communities a code of conduct has been developed, a councillor must attend each meeting of the municipal council and a committee which that councillor is a member of. This includes ward committee meetings and committee feedback meetings. A municipal council may impose a fine as determined by the standing rules and orders of the municipal council on a councillor for not attending to meetings which that councillor is required to attend. Although the legislation requires of councillors to convene committee feedback meeting quarterly, the norm across most of the municipalities is that feedback meetings are convened on monthly basis and councillors are required to produce portfolio of evidence to that effect, such as attendance registers as well minutes and reports of such meetings.

Reports indicate that of the total 4 392 wards across the country feedback meetings have been convened and approximately 90% of the wards. We congratulate those municipalities where

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 48

the councillors have fulfilled this role of being accountable. There are municipalities experiencing challenges with regard to convening community feedback meetings due to a number of factors including, amongst others, poor or lack of information between councillors and municipal administration which renders councillors ineffective. In response to these challenges in the local government sector, our department introduced Back to Basics programme which is anchored on the pillars which involve putting fit people first and their concerns, creating conditions for delivering quality municipal services and good governance, amongst the others.

Furthermore, the department has deployed a team of experts to assist municipality where is affected by range of challenges, including governance, administration, financial management infrastructure and corruption and others. So, we would want to encourage councillors to continue to hold meetings wherein they inform communities of development in the municipality, a lot of the public protest that we see often arises from situation where there is poor communication between the councillors or the council where they've communities.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 49

Therefore, we would like to encourage the councillors to attend those meetings. Thank you.

Mr A M SHAIK-EMAM: Hon Deputy Speaker, through you to Minister, what you are saying is the ideal and that's what should happen. Clearly, that is not what is happening on the ground. There is a lack of accountability when it comes to public representatives all spheres of government, and I think it is a norm that public representatives normally report to their political parties rather than the taxpayers who actually pay them.

Therefore, the question is, what are we going to do about those public representatives that do not report to the structures that pay them or they are allegiance to their parties, because we must remember, Minister, correctly as you mentioned that the reason why they are so many service delivery protests it is because you find a councillor or public representative in a particular area with a toilet without a door. The only time he finds that is when it is in the media. It should have not happened that is what they get paid for. Therefore, what mechanism, Minister, will you put in

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 50

place to ensure and enforce that there is accountability by all public representatives? Thank you.

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs regularly inquires to various provinces to look at whether there are challenges with regards to the hosting of those meetings, particularly ward committee meetings. When we've queries or complaints we actually do write to the particular Member of the Executive Council, MEC, to follow the matter up or in some instances to the Speakers concern. Therefore, the only way of dealing with this is to always educate communities that it is their right for the councillors to host these meetings, but also that they have right to complain about the councillor. If there is such a complaint, Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs will certainly investigate them and we will always ensure that we follow up and remind all the MECs and the mayors that those meeting need to be held. It's a matter of us taking seriously our responsibilities public representative and indeed even the political parties have that responsibility to ensure that their members service the communities. It is an issue that I

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 51

think we must continue to engage on and where there is new information that suggests a need for investigation will be ready to follow it up. Thank you.

Mr K J MILEHAM: Hon Deputy Speaker, this is a really stupid question from hon Shaik Emam who clearly needs a lesson on how public representatives should do their job. Minister, don't you agree that oversight and wards ... [Interjections.]

Prof N M KHUBISA: Hon Deputy Speaker, on a point of order, each and every member has a right to ask a question and I find it to be very offensive. Can the hon member withdraw that?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, it's not allowed to act in ways that fuels bad fight in the House. Stop using language like that. Go ahead, hon member.

Mr K J MILEHAM: So, as I was asking, Minister, don't you agree that oversight of wards and councils ... [Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 52

Prof N M KHUBISA: Deputy Speaker, as the NFP we find that to be offensive. Each and every member has a right to ask a question. Can the hon member withdraw?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, can I ... [Interjections.] please, please, don't interrupt me. Hon member Khubisa, if you disagree with my ruling please let me know so that we must act on it. I've ruled on this matter. Yes, okay. Proceed, hon member.

Mr K J MILEHAM: Hon Deputy Speaker, Minister, don't you agree that oversight of wards and councillors is the job of the municipal Speakers and that direct oversight and the intervention by yourself in wards where meeting do not occur will be a bridge of the principles of separate independence spheres of government and therefore unconstitutional.

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: I do not agree that there will be anything wrong about ensuring that councillors do what they are supposed to do. I would classify that to be under the section 154 of the Constitution which obliges national and provincial government

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 53

to put up packages of support measures to the municipalities to make sure that they operate effectively. I don't think that that will be unconstitutional. However, we are always ready to pick up and there have been a few instances where people where people have raised these issue of meetings or issues around ward committees and the activities in the ward. Therefore, in that case we actually investigate those.

Of course, it depends on how it is happening; we sometimes will ask the Speaker to investigate or the MEC to investigate. Just to say that the issue of the meetings held by the councillors is actually in terms of the Municipal Systems Act, 2000, which in that case, I think I find it quite acceptable for a member of this House to ask me about that. In some of the provinces we go around check how many ward committee meetings have held? Are they being held regularly, because we looked at that and also compute it against the number of protests that are coming in a particular community and we believe that it is important to always work on the coloration of the two. We must keep our eyes open. I don't think we can leave it just like that. Yes, indeed, at the municipal level the council, Speakers, community, ward committees and everyone

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 54

must be alert and they must be on the look out and they must monitor and call councillors to account. However, I don't think that if we were to deal with it, it will be unconstitutional. I think it will well within the responsibility that we have as the department. Thank you.

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Thank you for teaching him, Minister.

Mr M TSHWAKU: Hon Deputy Speaker, it's only the EFF councillors who consult communities. It's a fact. Most councillors in the country spend more time consulting their political parties and caucuses than they do consulting communities that they meant to serve. When the people are tired of being listen to, they protest, but then they are met with rubber bullets and teargas. Councillors refuse to listen. What is your department doing to compel councillors to listen and consult the communities? Smell the coffee, your councillors are not on, on the ground and when the activism left you it didn't say good bye. Thank you very much, Deputy Speaker.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 55

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: Well, on the regular meeting that we host with the MECs and the visits that we make we always insist on ensuring that those councillors continuously interact with their stakeholders who are the communities. It is something that we have to do continuously. Now, when you raise the issues of which party has got councillors that don't consult and so on, I'm not too sure you have adequate expertise even to comment on that. Yes, if you talk your own members you could raise them. You can raise that and so I will not get myself and tangled into that.

All I can say is that all parties here represented are urged to ensure that their members continue to work with the communities very closely. That is the responsibility that we all have of encouraging public representatives to do what they are supposed to do. That is a responsibility, but if you want to compare the councillors of the EFF and the DA and the ANC, I'm not interested.

Mr J J DUBE: Hon Minister, is there a nationwide standardise plan to ensure monitoring of community meetings? Thank you.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 56

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: Hon Deputy Speaker, we do not have that yet. We actually raised the question so that we get responses after the fact to see what has happened. We are currently investigating the creation of an information and communication technology, ICT, dashboard that must be able respond to those issues and will reflect early enough to see if there is consistent adherence to regular meetings so that we can pick it up from a national office level and therefore interact with those who need to be interacted with. At the moment we don't have a clear monitoring tool that goes only to the meeting, but we do surveys where we call and check, that is we interact with the particular provincial leadership to give us the summary of what has happened over a particular time. Therefore, it's not as proactive as I would like it to be and so it's something that is still work in progress for us. Thank you.

Question 108:

The MINISTER OF WOMEN IN THE PRESIDENCY: Deputy Chair, the total number of dialogues scheduled and held from the period mentioned was 21 and the total number of women who benefitted

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 57

directly from the dialogues was 8 801, and if you add men, we had more than this number. It is important for us to mention that we use this platform to take the department to the communities and showcase the various programmes of the department focussing more on women and trying to increase our scope and understanding of how communities define and characterise the issues of women. We had men, women, boys, girls and the youth in the dialogues and civil society organisations, faith-based organisations, men's fora, the disability sector, traditional leaders, lesbian gay bisexual transsexual queer intersex asexual, LGBTQIAs, women in business, academia and research, agriculture, young women in tertiary institutions, the Commission on Gender Equality and women who understand the issues of tradition and culture and these are the women that have gone through the journey of how culture has been used to endorse criminal activities. For instance issues of femicide, killing of LGBTQIs, so-called churches that are cults but behave as if they are churches and lure young women, issues of Ukuthwala. What is also important is that actually South African women are bleeding; they need their own Truth and Reconciliation Commission more particularly because during the struggle women never spoke

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 58

about their abuse and they are now opening up and the younger ones are also opening up and there is a feeling that our programmes are more reactive rather than proactive.

It is also important for us to also raise that whoever is trying to deal with the issues of violence against women and children wants to talk to women. Faith-based organisations see women on Thursdays and Sundays but there isn't anyone who wants to call men and talk to them because it is men that are having problems more particularly because the system of patriarchy favours them and in South Africa patriarchy is institutionalised. [Interjections.]

Nk P BHENGU: Deputy Speaker, hon Minister ... [Interjections.] thanks for your response, yes I fully agree with you that these dialogues reveal that women are bleeding and hurting because of the abuse and killings. Last week we had a two-day joint meeting between women and the Portfolio Committee on Police where there were extremely hurting stories shared by the participants and one of them was students from Rhodes University who had made it clear that rape has escalated at

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 59

tertiary institutions and that they do not trust the police because when they report their cases they are not assisted.

IsiZulu:

Lokho kuholela ekutheni kube nabafundi abazibulalayo. Mhlonishwa Ngqongqoshe, ngokubona kwakho sekumele kwenziwe njani ngoba lolu daba lokubulawa kwabantu besifazane nabantwana nodlame okubhekiswe kubo sekuyisenzo esijulile. Ngabe akhona yini amaqhinga amasha eninawo okuqeda lesi sikhava kuleli zwe? Sewuke walenza yini ucwaningo lokuthi yini le engaka eyenza abantu baphenduke izilwane. Ngiyabonga.

UNGQONGQOSHE WEZABESIFAZANE EHHOVISI LIKAMONGAMELI: Sekela Somlomo, kuwukuthi wonke umuntu kumele ayibandakanye nokukhuluma ngezindaba zokuhlukumezeka kwabantu besifazane. Singathi umangabe silana sihlezi sonke kubekhona abakhomba abanye. Abaholi bawowonke amaqembu ezombusazwe kumele bakhombise ukuthi bazimisele nokulwisana nokuhlukunyezwa kwabantu besifazane. Okunye okubalulekile wukuthi, imithetho ekhona eshayiwe kumele siyicubungule sibheke ekufanele ukuthi ishintshwe nekufanele ukuthi iqinise nekufanele ukuthi yenziwe siqinise ingalo yethu ekutheni imithetho yenziwe.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 60

Okunye okubalulekile wukuthi emuva kwe-dialogue yase-QwaQwa elinye lamasonto eligaphansi kwaBaba u-Mokoena, ngaleli sonto elizayo, nabo bayoba ne-dialogue yabantu besilisa, futhi ukukhombisa ukuthi umnombo walento eyenzekayo isuka kumphakathi, kubonakala ngokuthi ezindaweni eziningi ezihlukene abantu besilisa bahlukumeza abantu besifazane. Umangabe ubheka, abafana abafunda ezikhungwini zemfundo ephakeme basuka emiphakathini la abantu besifazane behlukumezekile kakhulu.

Ms N V MENTE: Chair, Minister, firstly I would like you to explain to South Africa, when you are talking about benefits, the women that are benefitting from the dialogues, what kind of benefits is that? And how soon will you be in every place in South Africa? But my main question to you is that, the culture of brutal killings of young girls in universities is all over the place now.

IsiXhosa:

Isihogo esikhulu ngoku sikwiiyunivesithi.

English:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 61

As we speak, just two days ago ...

IsiXhosa:

... bekukho inkonzo yokugxwala emswaneni yomfundi Engcobo.

English:

After Rhodes, there are two girls in the Eastern Cape that have been raped and brutally killed. How is your office going to work with the universities to ensure that girls are safe in those universities?

IsiZulu:

UNGQONGQOSHE WEZABESIFAZANE EHHOVISI LIKAMONGAMELI: Sihlalo, thina ekufanele sikwenze ukubheka iminyango yonke sibheke indlela abahlela, abaqapha nokuhlola ngayo. Siphinde sibheke ibhajethi yayo ukuthi iphendula kanjani ezintweni zabantu besifazane kuhambisana nokuhlolwa okusemthethweni kanye nezinkomba esizisebenzisayo kufanele abe nesigqi angabi nje yizinkomba ezikhuluma ngama-target ezibheka abantu besifazane njengama-target njengokuthi umangabe ukhuluma ngendlela ekubikwa ngayo ubugebengu, ama-trio crimes, azikhulumi ngokubulawa kwabantu besifazane. Umangabe ukhuluma ngama-trio crimes, awakhulumi ...

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 62

English:

... about other forms of violence against women and therefore
...

IsiZulu:

... impendulo yethu izoba kahle umangabe izinkomba zethu
zilungile.

English:

But one other thing ...

IsiZulu:

... ayikho ezikhungwini zemfundo ephakeme kuphela into
yokuhlukunyezwa kwabantu besifazane, igcwele iNingizimu Afrika
yonke futhi sekunokuthi sesijwayele nje ukuhlala ezweni la
sihlukunyeziwe khona kakhulu futhi thina esifuna ukukubheka
kakhulu yizo zonke izindawo ukuthi zenzani zizodwa
ngokuhlukumezeka kwabantu besifazane. Uhulumeni wenzani
ngabasebenzi bakhe abahlukumeza abantu besifazane? La
ePhalamende kwenzekani ngabantu abahlukumeza abantu
besifazane?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 63

English:

Ms C N MAJEKE: Chair, hon Minister, women's economic empowerment is a key to driving sustainable livelihoods and economic growth, after your dialogues, in the provinces and the areas you have been, do you see any improvement in women's economic development that has improved women's livelihoods or changes that took place after your intervention?

IsiZulu:

UNGQONGQOSHE WEZABESIFAZANE EHHOVISI LIKAMONGAMELI: Sihlalo, abantu besifazane bayazama ukuba kwezamabhizinisi futhi banamandla ngoba amabhizinisi abo awawo kalula kodwa umangabe ubheka ukwesekwa kwabo ngokwezomnotho izikhungo zezezimali zikwenze kwabanzima ukuthi abantu besifazane abanamabhizinisi amancane bakwazi ukuwaqinisa ngoba uma ukhuluma ngabadayisi, ngezipaza, ukhuluma ngama-co-operatives, amabhizinisi amancane, yilabo bantu abondla imindeni. Yilawo makhosikazi ahlala wodwa anobaba abangaziwa ukuthi baphi. Ngakho into ekumele siyibheke manje wukuthi zizokwenzani izikhungo zezezimali neminyango efana nowezohwebo nezimboni ukuthi abantu besifazane bakwazi ukuthola ukwesekwa ngakwezomnotho.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 64

English:

Mr M HLENGWA: House Chair, hon Minister, I fully agree with you in that women' rights are a collective societal responsibility and none of us can sit on the sidelines and watch as women are abused and all the other issues that you have raised. Whilst I do not doubt your intentions of the dialogues but at the same time we need to guard against the abuse of these dialogues particularly from a financial point of view. How do we justify that two summits paid about R557 000, on average, for two facilitators? Because then if that becomes the case, we are using these dialogues to milk the fiscus and do not actually receive the impact which should be happening. What I am asking Minister is the financial security of these dialogues against abuse and exploitation from people who want to use them for other intentions as opposed to those which they seek to achieve. It cannot be that a facilitator will receive R500 000 for a dialogue. Thank you.

The MINISTER OF WOMEN IN THE PRESIDENCY: Okay ...

IsiZulu:

... ama-dialogues ahlukile, kunama-dialogues enziwa ...

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 65

English:

... over a period of a month.

IsiZulu:

Kubekhona lawo esikade siwenza, angazi ngilikhohlwe kanjani iphepha lami elibhaliwe imali yawo wonke wonke ama-dialogues, ayikho i-dialogue efike ku-R500 000 kulawa ma-dialogue esiphuma kuwona, nginesiqiniseko futhi ukuthi ayikho ekwenzile lokho. Futhi kukhona abasancedayo, abathi uma beza kuma-dialogue bagqoke imifaniswano yabo ngakho-ke ububona ukuthi kunabantu abahlukile kuma-dialogues. Okunye, kuma-dialogues besibambisene nabanye abantu, kukhona enye ebesinayo uDkt Nokuzola Mndende, akalona ilungu likaKhongolose, u-Litchfield-Tshabalala sisebenze naye ...

English:

... over a period of 10 days ...

IsiZulu:

... akalona ilungu likaKhongolose. Ngakho-ke besidonsa ubuchwepheshe yabantu abaziqondayo izinkinga futhi sisabheka ongothi ngoba asifuni abantu belokho bezwa thina nsuku zonke.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 66

Kufanele bezwe amanye amazwi ahlukile kunamazwi ethu, abantu abenze ucwaningo futhi abanobufakazi obusemthethweni ngezinto ezenzekayo. Ngiyabonga.

English:

Mr M HLENGWA: Hon House Chairperson, on a point of order: The Minister has indicated that she had figures, may I request that she submit those as part of the record please.

IsiZulu:

USIHLALO WENDLU (Nk A T Didiza): Siyabonga. Njengoba esho uNgqongqoshe ukuthi akazi ukhohlwe kanjani kusho ukuthi ubevele ezimisele, uzowadlulisela kuleli Tafula ukuze bakwazi ukukudlulisela lokho. Siyabonga lungu elihloniphekile

Question 115:

The MINISTER OF DEFENCE AND MILITARY VETERANS ON BEHALF OF MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY: Chairperson and hon members, since the establishment of the Department of Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation in 2010, the department has developed a government-wide monitoring and evaluation system to monitor the implementation of the National Development Plan 2030. At

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 67

the national level the Department of Monitoring and Evaluation monitors the implementation of the National Development Plan, NDP, 2030 through the Medium-Term Strategic Framework which serves as a five-year implementation plan of the NDP 2030.

The Medium-Term Strategic Framework, MTSF, is structured in accordance with the 14 outcomes of government and is aligned to the 15 chapters of the NDP 2030. The latest MTSF covers the term of office of the current administration 2014 to 2019. Quarterly progress reports on the implementation of the NDP 2030 to the MTSF 2014 to 2019, are presented at ministerial implementation forums chaired by Ministers responsible for the co-ordination of each outcome whilst by-annual progress reports are tabled before the five Cabinet committees chaired by the President. Cabinet uses these reports to assess progress and take corrective action where required. Thank you, Chair.

Mr M S BOOI: Minister, thank you for your response. I just want you to elucidate, move forward and be able to tell us how departments are reporting back to you about the progress that they are making in relation to implementation of this particular programme.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 68

The MINISTER OF DEFENCE AND MILITARY VETERANS ON BEHALF OF MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY: Chairperson, there is a forum called Forum of South African Directors-General, Fosad, which is a forum which brings together all director-generals of our government departments. There are also the clusters which I had referred to earlier on. The cluster of director-generals, DGs, comes together discuss and report to a forum of clusters of Ministers of government but obviously, you can imagine there must have been many other processes before the reports gets to the DGs.

Having done so, the clusters of Ministers and the clusters of DGs and whoever other senior government officials discuss and prepare a report for the Cabinet subcommittee. We have what is called subcommittees of Cabinet. You report to that cabinet committee which are held on a fortnightly basis. Once done, then that report goes to a meeting of Cabinet through the reports of cabinet committees which are presented to a Cabinet Committee of Ministers of government for approval. Once that report reaches Cabinet, all Ministers who are Cabinet members have an opportunity to engage in a discussion on issues which

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 69

emanates right from the departments to the clusters and finally to Cabinet.

Forum of South African Directors-General, Fosad, as well has an opportunity. The DGs have their own ... Thank you very much. [Time expired.]

Mr S P MHLONGO: Hon Minister, you don't need complex reporting mechanisms to know that the NDP is failing; you just have to look at the economy of our country, unemployment, poverty, high rate of crime and inequality to know that this very NDP was destined to fail. Would you please, then, tell us in this House what tool have you put in place to ensure compliance by various state departments with the dictates of NDP? What measurement can you give to this House to say; this is how far you have achieved inline with that particular direction of your NDP? Thank you.

The MINISTER OF DEFENCE AND MILITARY VETERANS ON BEHALF OF
MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY: Hon Mhlongo ...

IsiZulu:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 70

... uyawuphinda lo mbuzo.

English:

Chairperson, just to say that in government we believe in collaboration, so, as we plan we collaborate to make sure that the goals that we have set for ourselves are attained throughout government departments. We also have a system which is designed to serve a developmental state. Therefore, whatever programmes which are in the government departments, these are programmes which are meant to reach those objectives.

Now, you keep on going back to this challenge of the NDP.

However, I do want to say that the NDP has both short term and long term plans. For instance, if you look at the current, for the five years there was a lot of planning, decision making and the next five years is then the actual implementation of the programmes which were designed in the first five years.

Just also to indicate that the engagements amongst ourselves and all other sectors also shape the budget of a department.

So, our budget allocation is designed such that it meets our

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 71

plans as departments. I do also want to say that planning and implementation, right, ... Thank you. [Time expired.]

IsiZulu:

USIHLALO WENDLU (Nk T A Didiza): Masixolisise Ngqongqoshe isikhathi sesiphelile.

ILUNGU ELIHLONIPHEKILE: Isikhathi siyahamba.

USIHLALO WENDLU (Nk T A Didiza): Asihambanga isikhathi, sikhona nje.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Why are you frustrated this afternoon?

Mr S C MOTAU: Chair, well let me tell you why I am frustrated. The Minister missed me and she is still missing the point. Our concern about the NDP is that it is not doing what it was supposed to be doing. It came up in 2008 and we said let us have a plan to develop our country so that we won't go into a recession again. The problem we have here is that there is no implementation and no consequences. Would the Minister really

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 72

do what we have been asking them do to. There should be consequences; the Public Service Commission should have teeth and the Department of Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation, DPME, so that people in Fosad or whatever if they don't do what they are supposed to do they get punished.

The MINISTER OF DEFENCE AND MILITARY VETERANS ON BEHALF OF
MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY: Okay, now...

IsiXhosa:

...ndiyakuva...

English:

... you are raising a different matter. I think we have understood each other right from the beginning about what the NDP is meant to do, what is meant to achieve and that which government is currently doing. What you are raising is that where there hasn't been, right, proper implementations of those plans and decisions, what are the consequences? Is there accountability in government departments?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 73

Yes, there is accountability. You are correctly saying consequent management. Here in Parliament we have a committee called Standing Committee on Public Accounts, Scopa. Scopa, for instance, it is amongst committees which ensure that Ministers and officials appear before that committee. I know that you are nice and bored because you are saying that you don't agree with the NDP. If your approach from the beginning is that you don't see what it does then you won't even see the consequence management. There is consequence management. The facts that we have people who go through disciplinary processes, that there are people who are fired from work, that there are people who are suspended ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): ... order, hon members! Order! Chief Whip of the DA, let us allow the hon Minister to finish answering the question. Order, hon Steenhuisen!

The MINISTER OF DEFENCE AND MILITARY VETERANS ON BEHALF OF MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY: Sorry, hon Steenhuisen. We do believe that there are consequences. They may not be adequate, you may be unhappy about the extent of the penalties imposed but there is consequence management within government. The

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 74

Department of Public Service and Administration, DPSA, and the Commission on Public Service are the ones that should really help us on how to deal with these issues. Thank you.

Siswati:

SIHLALO WENDLU (Nkt A T Didiza): Nyalo sesitakuya kulombuto lolandzelako Umbuto 128, lobutwa lilunga lelihloniphekile, Nkt D van der Walt.

English:

... no, there are three. There was a follow up from the person who first asked the question and three others.

IsiZulu:

ILUNGU ELINGABALULIWE: Cha usumkhohliwe uHlengwa.

IsiZulu:

USIHLALO WENDLU (Nk A T Didiza): Nxesi Hlengwa, sukuma ke umbuze. Lixhoshwa libhekile, Hlengwa.

Mnu M HLENGWA: Hawu weSihlalo, ayikho inkinga yingoba zonke izono ziyasulwa.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 75

USIHLALO WENDLU (Nk A T Didiza): Yingoba uyasebenza namhlanje Hlengwa.

Mnu M HLENGWA: Cha, Sihlalo angithokoze ...

English:

... hon Minister, I hear what you are saying. It sounds all good, well and seems much organised. There is reporting - subcommittees and so on, that is all fine but what is the impact of all that? What are the results? What I am trying to get hon Minister, is that; did your reports actually tell you that we would get into a recession? Did your reports tell you that the economy was not growing? Did your reports tell you that unemployment was shooting through the roof because fundamentally plans are living documents? The question is; what interventions were then done to plug the whole so that we could avert the crisis? Or it is just to receive the reports noted and went to the next item? We will arrive at 2030 and realise that none of the things that you had set out were actually realisable or done. So, what is the mechanism in place to deal concretely and succinctly with the reports so

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 76

that you can institute corrective action, plug the whole and avert ama-crisis? Thank you.

The MINISTER OF DEFENCE AND MILITARY VETERANS ON BEHALF OF
MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY: Hon Hlengwa, let me start by
saying, yes, we are in recession and this is the report which
was presented to the South African public by Statistics SA
yesterday. That obviously, government through Cabinet will be
seized with analysing, discussing that report and see in what
way we can deal with some of the challenges which arise out of
that report. However, I do want to say that ...

[Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): ... order, hon members.

The MINISTER OF DEFENCE AND MILITARY VETERANS ON BEHALF OF
MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY: ... hon Hlengwa, I do want to say
that; for instance, under economic performance challenges such
as your sluggish growth/technical recession, right, one of the
things which had happened is that growth inhibitors are
prioritised through budget prioritisation programme. In other
words, whatever inhibits growth is that which should be

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 77

identified by government and find ways of navigating around that.

I did mention earlier on that the preparations are underway, for instance, for job and investment summits for real private sector commitment to stimulate economic growth and create jobs. These summits will obviously provide an opportunity between us and the private sector to really engage and find meaningful solutions to the challenges we are having. Dealing decisively with increasing competition through the Competition Amendment Bill - I think I did mention that earlier on - dealing decisively with corruption in state-owned enterprises, SOEs, for instance, to further cushion the economy from the adverse risks and effects. I am sure, hon Hlengwa, you will agree with me that our SOEs have had challenges and currently there are processes of dealing with that and make sure that we appoint the correct people to the right positions. Thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order, hon Steenhuisen.

[Laughter.] Hey! It is very interesting; I think you need a dialogue with the Minister on some of these matters. I can hear you; you are asking more questions as she is answering.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 78

Siswati:

Nyalo-ke, ase sibuye site kulelilunga lakho, lelingu Dkt Van Der Walt, lekungulona libute lombuto Endvuneni Yetemisebenti Yakahulumende.

Question 128:

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION:

Thank you, House Chairperson. It should be noted that the projected R30 billion additional costs to public service wage Bill is spread over the three years of 2018 Medium-Term Expenditure Framework, that is 28 to 2021 financial years. A number of policy initiatives are being considered to better manage personal expenditure in public service.

These include: resigning the design of organisational structures across government; utilising existing exit mechanisms applicable in different sectors where employees would like to leave the system voluntarily; implementing a uniform job grading system, which ranks job commensurate with worth so that employees are paid on the principle of equal pay for equal work stretching the public service range. Applying

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 79

costs serving measures in the areas of administration, service delivery mechanisms; procurement, information and communication technology and process management; conducting through a negotiated effort a review of personal expenditure in the public service sector that should lead to revised remuneration strategy for the public sector. I thank you.

Ms D VAN DER WALT: House Chair, Deputy Minister, be honest, you don't know where that is going to come from, you don't know what is going to happen, and there is no additional R30 billion. You are, in fact, from the poor to give more to public servants. Why would public servants be more important to you than the poor? [Applause.]

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION:
House Chairperson, the hon Van der Walt is at liberty to have her opinion because the department is actually informing you as to how we will actually manage to recover the costs. And I have actually explained that we will actually do it over three Medium Term Expenditure Frameworks, which would be from 2018 to 2021; and that is the answer for today. Thank you.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 80

Sesotho:

Mr M L D NTOMBELA: Ha ke lebohe Motlatsi wa Letona ka karabo eo feela nna ne ke rata ho botsa potso ena:

English:

Should government go the severance package route to cut on additional costs in relation to the public-sector wage Bill? Which salary levels would be ideal to court into taking the severance package and why? Is there any programme of government so far that does not have value for money in order to target towards reducing the wage Bill?

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION:
House Chairperson, one of the ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza):

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION:
Order hon member, the question is not about Cabinet, it's about public servants. Hon Deputy Minister, you don't have to improvise, you can have a new question.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 81

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION: One of the points mentioned earlier was utilising existing exit mechanisms, hon Ntombela, applicable in different sectors where employees would like to leave the system voluntarily; and that would refer to severance package that you are actually alluding to and it actually goes across the board for all salary levels because it is voluntary. Thank you.

Mr M TSHWAKU: Thank you very much, hon House Chair. This is not a complex institution building exercise. The business of government is to deliver services to employ public servants to deliver certain services; services like water, building houses, roads, health care and education.

Many of these people can do their job with necessary support if they are employed by government. And would not cost as much as it does now where you have to pay public servants and contractors and suppliers; and as a result the public sector is blotted at the top and we don't have artisans, engineers and technicians. That is why as the EFF is going to introduce the in sourcing Bill, and the question is, will you support it? Thank you.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 82

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION:
House Chairperson, this question is not the one we are actually dealing with now. It is a different question that still needs to be answered later, the one on in sourcing.

Ms N V MENTE: On a point of order, Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Yes, hon Mente, hon Van der Walt if you can take a seat.

Ms N V MENTE: Now, the question is not new. It is very relevant to the main question, and it is also providing a solution to the problem that we are talking to now; where is she going to get the money; and how is she going to avoid running out of cash?

The HOUSE CHAIPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Thank you, hon Mente I think the first part of the question was answered and the second question - that is why she is saying it's a new question. Let us allow may be the hon Van der Walt.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 83

Ms D VAN DER WALT: Chair, hon Deputy Minister, figures that just came out is that the country's personal income tax paid is less than the private sector wage Bill - public sector wage Bill is less, how do we expect to close this gap?

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION:
House Chairperson, hon Van der Walt, the question that you are asking now is the question that you asked earlier. And the answer will still remain the same answer that we have given you as to how we will recover the costs; and what we are actually saying is that in terms of recovering the costs ... [Interjections.] ... there will be measures that will be put in place.

Then, may I take the opportunity of reading those measures to you again to say that we will continue reviewing the design of organisational structure across government utilising existing mechanism in different sectors where employees would like to leave the system voluntarily.

That is where there would be some savings; implementing a uniform job grading system that would actually lead to equal

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 84

pay for equal work also helping in certain areas to actually manage to do some cost saving; applying cost saving measures in areas of administration, service delivery mechanism procurement information and communication technology and processed management; conducting through a negotiated effort a review of personal expenditure in public sector that should lead to revised remuneration strategy for public sector. And I am just hoping that this time the answer will be heard. Thank you, Chairperson.

Question 111:

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION:

House Chairperson, it must emphasised that there is no mass retrenchments of public employees. The review of government departments falls within the purview of the Presidency. The Minister for Public Service and Administration provides inputs at the President's requests in line with Minister's administrative responsibility for organisational structures and macro organisation of government. I thank you Chairperson.

Mr M J MASWANGANYI: Chairperson and Deputy Minister, I think Deputy Minister that there is confusion or ambiguity with

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 85

regards to this matter. It would be proper that this matter be clarified in regards to voluntary severance package vis-à-vis retrenchments. So, it is because of this uncertainty and ambiguity that the issue has remained in the public domain. If that can be clarified, I think that the matter would be laid to rest. I thank you Chairperson.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION:

Thank you hon Maswanganyi, indeed, it must be reiterated that there is no mass retrenchments of public service employees. It is not clear what informs the narrative that continues to inform the public. Voluntary severance package is different from mass retrenchments, and the mass retrenchments that you see within the public space, is not something that actually exists and it's a message that we actually need to send out there. Thank you.

Mr N M PAULSEN: Through you Chairperson, Minister I'm really relieved to hear that there won't be retrenchments. But as the EFF, we feel that the problem with the public service is that it needs to be reorganised because public servants can't just be go-between between contractors and government. Are you

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 86

looking at reskilling public service employees to play greater role in the delivery of services other than just being go-between between government and contractors?

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION:
Chairperson, it's a new question, it's not related to the question we are dealing with now.

Mr N M PAULSEN: Chairperson, the deputy Minister mustn't be lazy here. This question is related to the ...

[Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order! What's your point of order?

Mr N M PAULSEN: It related to the previous question; the main question. She says that it's not going to happen. Therefore, I have asked whether are they going to consider reskilling staff since there is a risk of losing 30 000 jobs?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon Paulsen, if I've heard your question very well the way you prefaced it, you

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 87

were stating a view about the reorganisation of the public service and you then further asked, which is then a new question, whether will the Minister or the department will consider the reskilling, and I thought that's why the Deputy Minister is saying that it's a new question because the first part was not a question, it was rather a statement in your view. So, can we move to the next member to ask a question? Over to you, hon Hlengwa!

Mr M HLENGWA: Hon Deputy Minister, I think that this is just about semantics.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order, hon Paulsen!

IsiZulu:

Mnu M HLENGWA: Saze savelelwa.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order, hon Paulsen!

IsiZulu:

Mnu M HLENGWA: Kahle Paulsen.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 88

USIHLALO WENDLU (Nk A T Didiza: Usuze ukhuzwa ngomunye umuntu.

English:

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Yes, hon Hlengwa!

IsiZulu:

Mnu M HLENGWA: Uyozithuka esekhuzwa yizingane.

English:

Hon Deputy Minister, I think that it's just a matter of semantics, whether it's mass retrenchments or the reconfiguring of public service. The challenge is that, last week the Deputy President from the podium there told us that government is in the process of reconfiguring the public service. Now, that could be easily interpreted as mass retrenchments or retrenchments. So then, the question is: Is government singing from the same hymn sheet or is the Department of Public Service and Administration actually in control of this process which is in action elsewhere and you just have to implement because ...

IsiZulu:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 89

... lomacashelana eniwudlalayo ...

English:

... is what is causing uncertainty.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order!

IsiZulu:

UNGQONGQOSHE WEZEMISEBENZI KAHULUMENI NOKUPHATHWA KWAYO:

Sihlalo, awukho umacashelana ...

English:

... what the Deputy President was alluding to is ...

IsiZulu:

USIHLALO WENDLU (Nk A T Didiza): Umacashelana.

UNGQONGQOSHE WEZEMISEBENZI KAHULUMENI NOKUPHATHWA KWAYO:

Umacashelana.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms AT Didiza): In English, it's hide and seek. Hon Hlengwa you should have put it correctly you too, not ...

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 90

IsiZulu:

... umachashana.

Setswana:

MOTLATSATONA WA LEFAPHA LA BODIRE DIPUSO LE TSAMAISO:

Modulasetilo ke a leboga. Ke ne ke rata go mo itsisi gore se a se buang ga se sona.

English:

What the Deputy President was alluding to is indeed true that we are looking at reconfiguring of the state. But the question was about mass retrenchment of 30 000 public service employees, which we are actually saying that there is nothing like that; it's not really taking place. What we are actually saying is that, there may be voluntary retrenchments, which means that the public service employees may decide at a certain point that they need to leave the public service, and we would actually welcome that decision. This is one of the areas which we will be looking at that might actually help in terms of cost saving. I thank you Chairperson.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 91

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Well, if they don't, it's a new question. Over to you, hon Van Der Walt!

Mr N M PAULSEN: Hon Chairperson, I'm standing on a point of order.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): What is the point of order?

Mr N M PAULSEN: Can you see how she changes the response now to the initial response?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon Paulsen, can you please take your seat?

Mr N M PAULSEN: The woman is useless!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon Paulsen, can you please withdraw that! Can you please withdraw! Can you please withdraw!

Mr N M PAULSEN: I withdrew it!

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 92

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): No, I haven't heard you; can you please do it properly?

Mr N M PAULSEN: I withdraw!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Sit down, thank you!

Ms VAN DER WALT: Deputy Minister, you speak of voluntary retrenchments. Do you expect us to believe that you will 30 000 people who will volunteer to leave their jobs?

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION: Hon Van Der Walt, you are actually now talking about voluntary retrenchments and there is nothing like that. We're talking about ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order!

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION: ... voluntary severance packages.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 93

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order! Hon Deputy Minister, I think it was just a slip of your tongue when you were responding earlier, you said ... [Interjections.] Don't try and help the Chair, I am helping the Deputy Minister that there was a slip in her tongue when she responded earlier and spoke about voluntary retrenchments, but as she says, voluntary severance package.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION: ... severance package, yes! Thank you Chairperson.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order! Order! Hon members, the Deputy Minister indeed accepts that there was a mistake when she responded earlier, let's accept it as such. Now, we move to the next question.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: I am sorry, hon Chairperson, the hon Van Der Walt is very clear in her question, she says: If this takes place, how does the Minister intends to fund it?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 94

THE HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Thank you very much, Mr Steenhuisen. Can you take your seat? Hon Deputy Minister, would you like to respond?

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION: Hon Chairperson, this is just semantics, because what we have actually indicated is that there is no 30 000 retrenchments of public service employees, and of course we have actually indicated that where there is suggestions or interests in voluntary severance packages, it will be welcome. That's all that we have actually indicated here, and we have also actually indicated how the money will be recovered, hon Van Der Walt. I kept on reading all the information that is supposed to inform you as to how we intend recovering the money. It just depends whether you want to actually then internalise this and understand it for what it is, or are you going to be rejecting it. I thank you, Chairperson.

Question 121:

IsiZulu:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 95

UNGQONGQOSHE WEZOKUPHATHA NGOKUBAMBISANA KANYE NEZINDABA

ZENDABUKO: Sihlalo weNdlu ehloniphekile, umbuzo wakho unombolo-121 ovela kumhlonishwa uMasondo ...

English:

I just visited the Eastern Cape, North West, Limpopo, Free State and Mpumalanga provinces. This Friday we will be meeting the Gauteng Provincial Government and visit the remaining other provinces in the next few months. The visits are undertaken in the spirit of section 154 of the Constitution, which states that national and provincial governments should support municipalities to manage their own affairs, to exercise their powers and perform their functions.

The challenge in these struggling municipalities manifest in the areas of governance, administration, infrastructure, development and maintenance, financial management, issues of poor revenue collection, issues and corruption and fraud, political instability as well.

These are some of the areas that we discussed when I visit provinces. Progress is being made towards recovery as we all

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 96

three spheres of government are united to find solutions. During the visits we met Premiers and MECs responsible for local government and finance in the main - sometimes Human Settlements as well, the mayors of the distressed municipalities, speakers, chief whips and other councillors.

We discussed challenges facing the municipalities and together agreed on interventions that must be undertaken in an action plan that we as national Cogta will monitor and work on together with the province. We also met the business, communities and national House of Traditional Leaders, civic community organisations and members of the public. We met business communities as we did in Makana, the Eastern Cape; in Secunda, Mpumalanga; in Mafikeng, North West; and also academic communities which we did successfully meet at Rhodes University and the University of the North West.

The Eastern Cape 12 municipalities were identified as distressed and requiring attention. These are King Sabata Dalindyebo, Makana, Sarah Baartman, Walter Sisulu, Mquma, Enoch Mgijima, Alfred Nzo, Port St Johns, Amahlathi, Joe Gqabi, Mbizana as well as Matatiele.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 97

Our Municipal Infrastructure Support Agent, Misa, has also several projects in the Eastern Cape. These projects include: Construction of connection bit in Mpama Village under Mbashe Local Municipality connecting Mqanduli and Mbashe; provision of water reticulation at Nkantolo Village in Mbizana; the development of special development framework in the rehabilitation of roads in Makana; as well as Misa assisting other projects, such as Road R63 in Middeldrift to Stutterheim via Keiskammahoek and Amahlathi.

In the North West province, 12 distressed municipalities were identified. We continue to support Ngaka Modiri Molema District Municipality, Ditsobotla Local Municipality, Tswaing Local Municipality, Mahikeng Local Municipality, Ramotshere Moiloa Local Municipality, Maquassi Hills Local Municipality, Naledi Local Municipality, Lekwa-Teemane Local Municipality, Mamusa Local Municipality, Madibeng Local Municipality, Kgetlengrivier Local Municipality and Bojanala Platinum District Municipality.

In May this year, Cabinet approved section 100 intervention and we have since issued directives to the province and a

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 98

number of municipalities have been also placed under section 139 by the provincial government. We have had our engineers, together with the defence force, going out to deal with sewerage problems in Bakerville Clinic, Bodibe Clinic, Besiesvlei Welfare Organisation Clinic, Lichtenburg Town Clinic, Boikhutso Clinic, Blydeville Clinic, Coligny Clinic and Itsoseng Clinic. [Interjections.]

IsiZulu:

USIHLALO WENDLU (Nk A T Didiza): Siyabonga Ngqongqoshe! Ilunga elihloniphekile uNyambose.

Mr E MTHETHWA: Minister, thank you very much for your reply to this question. But tell me ... Surely you could see that all these municipalities need a certain plan to ensure that they go back to basics ... [Interjections.] ... or what the community expect: To promote good governance, ethical leadership as well as putting people and their concerns first. Do you have that plan, Minister? [Interjections.]

HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] ... a new government! Vote DA!

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 99

The MINISTER OF COOPORATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: Yes, hon member. When we go to all these municipalities, we put together a plan which is co-signed by municipalities as well as provincial and national government. In particular, we have a framework for various issues that we deal with. When it comes to issues of governance, we give them a framework, particularly to deal with staffing and establishment as well as issues of revenue collection and so on.

These plans are actually then adopted by the municipalities, and those municipalities implement them as their own plans. We then ensure that we bring together various government departments to work in an integrated manner to deliver services which communities require. We have to continuously work for improvement of the quality of the staff that municipalities have, as well as the quality and integrity of those who run these municipalities.

This a work that we have to do, in particular to ensure that they remain accountable to communities and always ensure that

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 100

they interact with communities to explain the challenges that they go through as municipalities. Thank you.

Mr K J MILEHAM: Minister, we note your visits to these to these various provinces and municipalities but unfortunately there seems to be very little following through. Those municipalities are still dysfunctional today and showed no signs of improvement. Many of them face daily Eskom cut offs. Enoch Mgijima Municipality, which you have just referred to, had its entire municipal fleet auctioned off due to its financial crisis, just after you were there.

What did you do about it? What did your department do about it? Nothing! [Interjections.] Minister, my question to you is: What did you learn from your tour of the provinces; and more importantly, what are you doing about it? How are you holding the mayors, councillors and municipal officials accountable for their poor performance?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T DIDIZA): Hon Minister.

[Interjections.] Allow the Minister to respond!

[Interjections.] Order! Hon members, wait! You can't judge

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 101

whether it's an honest reply or whatever if you don't listen to the reply.

The MINISTER OF COOPORATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: Well, hon House Chairperson, we have reported about the problems that we have identified and the plans that we have instituted. In some of the areas, why you may not be seeing activities, is because there are procurement processes that we have to go through first. We need to grant that some of those delays will happen. Otherwise, we will run into problem with supply chain issues. So, a number of contracts are being signed to be able to deal with those particular areas.

When it comes to issue of accountability generally, the hon member said earlier that there are certain things that municipalities must do themselves. One of those is to be able to stand up and say: In this particular area, these are the consequences. We are saying to municipalities: We want to see consequence management where there are transgressions and we will continue to do so.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 102

The issue of electricity cuts is a matter that hopefully in the next month or so we will come with a proposal to indicate how we intervene and deal with the issue of Eskom on a final basis. Therefore, I think the hon member should give us a space so that we can bring that report. This is going on in a number of areas. We have gone through these discussions. We are going through negotiations with Eskom. We have got an interministerial task team to deal with the issues of Eskom.

So, the problems are deep; but you can't expect immediate answers on everything that we are dealing with. They will take but we are making progress. Thank you.

IsiZulu:

Usolwazi N M KHUBISA: Sihlalo, mhlonishwa Ngqongqoshe ...

English:

In your response to Question 122, which I think is related to this one, you alluded to the fact that you have given yourself three years to see to it that there is a turnaround in those municipalities that are distressed - 87 municipalities; three years!

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 103

With regard to this one, you have not given us a period to see to it that there is a turnaround. Just recently, your department gave some scarce skills to capacitate these municipalities and the variety of adverts to that one. Now, do you think then that you are able to deal with the issue of allegation and perception which says that in some cases there is no service delivery because there are councillors who are perceived to be partisan or else they indulge in some semblances of conflict management by way of getting involved in tenders and other things? [Time expired.]

The MINISTER OF COOPORATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: With the technical teams, the infrastructure and service delivery programmes, the programme will run for three years. We don't wait for the outcomes and impact for three years, we expect to show progress as we go ahead. The evaluation is about how to take that programme forward.

When it comes to issues of governance and revenue collection, we have already intervened on most of the municipalities where they have got unfounded budgets. We have actually corrected

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 104

that, so it is behind us. If we find something that is wrong, we intervene immediately.

When it comes to issues of disclaimers, we have given all municipalities a whole year. By end of the year, they must be out of disclaimers and we want to insist on that. Those which are section 139(1) (b) or (c) must also be out of that situation within a period of a year.

The teams that we send in on a continuous basis must give us progress reports on a quarterly or four-monthly basis so that we can measure the progress. So, everything has got time frames and is measurable.

Mr P MHLONGO: Gubhela, some of the municipalities visited by yourself are in the top ten of councils owing huge monies to Eskom. One among them is Emalahleni, in Mpumalanga. What steps have you taken to ensure that communities are not punished by Eskom through cut offs due to failures by municipalities to strengthen their revenue collection systems? Thank you.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 105

The MINISTER OF COOPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: House Chair, the hon member is correct: The top ten municipalities with regard to Eskom are basically responsible for almost 70% of the debt. So, we have been through to them. There are a number of things that we are doing. This interministerial team is doing a number of areas.

We have sat down to analyse the finances of these municipalities and we have actually insisted on them to have an agreement to pay Eskom on a continuous basis. However, when we look at them, we realised that some of them are in such a debt trap; they will never be able to recover on their own. So, we have gone into the analysis of the debt.

We have actually said that part of the solution must include restructuring of this debt. We will have to go into those details when we report next time. On the other hand, we have raised the issue of discontinuation of supply of electricity to Eskom. They have raised their own problem in relation to their own compliance issues. We have now asked for a temporary moratorium with Eskom so that we can get the solution tables and then work together.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 106

Where there is assurance that there will be a continuous payment for services by municipalities, by communities and by government, Eskom will not interrupt electricity supply. That will come when we say probably table that report in about more than a month from now. Indeed, we are actually seized with this work.

We have also streamlined cases that are going to court to actually ensure that we don't have precedence of direct payment where we ultimately find that this solution we are looking at becomes just academic. So, indeed, it is a very serious issue, but we believe that we will be able to solve it. Thank you.

Question 130:

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: House Chair, Question 130 from the hon Mileham; the response basically refers members to the state of local government and financial management reports of June 2017. When we supply the response we will be able to give some of the details of those analysis which we have looked at, but by and large the issues of financial management and distress relate

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 107

to poor budgeting for maintenance, refurbishment and replacement of aging infrastructure resulting in poor quality and breakdown of services, poor communication and accountability relationship with communities, problems with political administrative interface, corruption poor financial management and negative audit outcomes, nonviability due to design nonexistent rates base, inadequate fiscal allocations and so on.

So, we have also analysed all the different grants and we have seen that we need a comprehensive intervention by government into all the areas that I have indicated that are the cause for distress. So, we have integrated Municipal Recovery Action Plans that are going to the 87 prioritised municipalities. At that level, I have just indicated now that the Department of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs and National Treasury have set up joint teams to work on the provincial counterparts to address on the issues of development of credible and funded and cash paid budgets, development of simplified revenue regeneration plans, support with development Financial Recovery Plans, monitor expenditure and the procurement processes, support the implementation of

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 108

postaudit action plans, strong focus paid on reversing audit outcomes and we have said we will not tolerate any disclaimers. So, those are the issues of how we are intervening as the national government. We are therefore looking at the issue of the interministerial team as I have just alluded to that and for the members they can look at all of those analysis of the financial issues. We will supply the additional information in that regard. Thank you.

Mr K J MILEHAM: House Chairperson and Minister, in your response to a parliamentary question earlier this year, you identified the lack of sound financial management practices as the root cause of municipal disfunctionality. Recently you announced the deployment of 88 engineers and town planners to these dysfunctional municipalities and while we understand and agree that there is a dire need for engineering and infrastructure support in many municipalities, there is a far more urgent need to address the financial challenges.

So, my question to you is this: Why have you not complied with your constitutional obligation in terms of section 129 of the Constitution and intervened in all of these municipalities?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 109

Why are you sending them engineers and town planners, instead of the auditors, accountants and financial managers they so desperately need?

IsiZulu:

UNGQONGQOSHE KAHULUMENI WOKUBAMBISANA KANYE NEZINDABA

ZENDABUKO: Hayi kushu kuthi leli lungu elihloniphekile alizwanga kahle.

English:

We agree about the need to attend to financial distress. We agree about the responsibility in terms of section 154 of the Constitution and we are doing just that. What we are saying is: We have first the teams from National Treasury in terms of the Municipal Finance Management Act and the teams in terms of Municipal Systems Act who are going into the various municipalities. That is already happening in particular when we are talk about the cash back unfunded budgets. We have already dealt with that using our internal capacity. There will be additional capacity that will be sourced to reinforce already what we are doing, but what was urgent was to deal

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 110

with these particular issues. So, we are actually attending to that issue.

The process is going to take us long. When we deal with investigations and when we when we deal with the issues of financial transgressions, we send our teams to investigate, where we require additional support like when we need audit firms, accountants and so on, we source that separately and go and reinforce. So, work is already being done as I indicated at the beginning of the term and we will continue to do so. When we sit down we can look at where this has happened. For an example I went to Limpopo and out of the 27 municipalities I found that 15 had actually unfunded budgets. We had to revise all of them and got them to be corrected, whilst we at that point. It was done through Treasury and the Department of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs and we went around and doing that. There is capacity to do that, but for further training and further intervention inside the institution and councils, we will then be reinforcing with additional consultancies or consultants or companies that will come from outside. Thank you. [Applause.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 111

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): I am afraid Minister, your time has expired. Thank you, Minister. Nyambose.

Mr K J MILEHAM: Chairperson, on a pint of order.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon member, what is the point of order?

Mr K J MILEHAM: Chairperson, my question is related to section 139 of the Constitution and not 154. [Interjections.]

IsiZulu:

Nkz M KHAWULA: Hlala phansi!

English:

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF CO-OPARATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: Section 139 of the Constitution, where we have used this section has been specifically in the North West where we have asked for all the 22 municipalities to be issued with directives then we have said the MEC must analyse and identify

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 112

those that will need section 139(1)(b). They have done that now we have said; we will monitor them if they do not respond we will intervene in terms of section 139(7). So, we are watching the space. There is no default at this point.

[Applause.]

IsiZulu:

Mnu E M MTHETHWA: Ngqongqoshe, ngikuzwile ukhuluma ikakhulu ngesibonelo osibalile ...

English:

... where there were 27 municipalities in Limpopo.

IsiZulu:

Zikhona ezinye izifunda Ngqongqoshe ngoba ziningi izifunda ezinalenselele. Kukhuna yini lapho nibuye nisebenza khona ngendlela lapho amaqembu akho ...

English:

... these joint teams that you were talking about that you have dispersed to other provinces. Which are those provinces, Minister if you can expand on that?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 113

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: Well, hon House Chair, the hon member is asking about our intervention teams. We have dispersed our intervention teams that is the Department of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs and the Municipal Infrastructure Support Agent, Misa, technical teams have gone so far to 17 districts and 38 municipalities. It covers all the provinces. There is no province that is left out. We can actually give specifics of those municipalities.

When it comes to the oversight by the joint task teams of the Department of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs and Treasury we oversee all of them and we use provincial and then reinforce if we need to go and intervene. So, there is no province that has not been given attention. Thank you.

Mr M L SHELEMBE: Chairperson and Minister, one of the challenges that leads to financial distress by municipalities is the noncompliance to the service delivery and budget implementation plan and where by municipalities spend more than their projected income. Do you have an idea whether there are municipalities that are not complying with the Service

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 114

Delivery Budget Implementation Plan, SDBIB? If yes: What do you intend doing to remedy the situation? I thank you.

The MINISTER OF CO-OPARATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: There are municipalities that may not be complying with those service delivery budget implementation plans, but what I tabled which I said for information of members and let me give a report that was done for an assessment which was done by Treasury which I started quoting when I answered the question that you have to do this assessment and then give a report which I do not have now, but 64 municipalities had negative cash balances by 30 June 2017 that was the report of Treasury and we wait to see this year's report what it will show.

[Interjections.]

Mr K J MILEHAM: Intervene now!

The MINISTER OF CO-OPARATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: And we are intervening! And that is what we are saying. When we sit with the committee, we might be able to

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 115

take members through because in these two minutes I cannot give you each and everyone of the municipalities. I will attach to the members' information the list of the municipalities where we intervene, but if it is necessary for me to walk with the member, municipality by municipality on the 87 of them that I have discussed with them in the committee and in the House, I will certainly do that again.

The other issues that we have looked at here are the number of municipalities which overspent and those that actually where we are seeing that they have reduced the level of unused, returned infrastructure or conditional grants. So, we have to look at that to say: How do we intervene and all of them are about financial recovery.

The other point that was raised by the hon member where there are people who are involved in interfering in the supply chain irregularly. Whether these are councillors or members of the administration we have to deal with that as corruption straight ahead. That for me is a matter that the municipalities have a responsibility to investigate on a continuous basis.

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 116

Ms N V MENTE: Chair and Minister, I think in measuring ...

IsiXhosa:

... indlela oomaspala abasebenza ngayo, nendlela onokonga ngayo imali kufuneka ujonge kwiJohannesburg Metro kuba baya ...

English:

... insource and that keeps money at home and we do not spend much money trying to hire people outside. You also cut on consultants that are unnecessary and built capacity within the municipalities. So, my question Minister is: Do you still want to keep the tender processes, the consultants and every service provider that is costing the state a lot of money than building the capacity and insourcing of the workers?

The MINISTER OF CO-OPARATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: Well, I am not sure if the hon member is quoting the right example, because I have seen some of these municipalities and metros who have not spend grants that are allocated to them, but let me say that part of the intervention that you are talking about is to actually help to

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 117

create in-house capacity in various municipalities, that is why we are creating these teams. We cannot make a rule that says you will never create tenders. What you need to say is we need to ensure that there is adequate capacity internally in the municipality to do as much as it can, but there is a limit. There is no municipality that will have its own company to build the roads and to go and do all the work that needs to be done. You can have some of the contracts which are done in-house and some of the things that will be done by external agents.

What I also agree on is that there is no need to rely where you can use your own staff to rely on external consultants, but it does not mean that you completely cut any support that you will need to get from those. All government departments have to ultimately issue out contracts for work to be done by external contractors that you will have to do at some point. So, there is no way you can draw a line and say no more tenders. Indeed there is a need to beef up internal capacity, but that capacity has to be guided in terms of the staff establishment and the job descriptions of all the people that we have in-house. However, there are things that you cannot do

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 118

you have to actually get someone from outside. So, you have to keep a particular balance at that kind of level. Thank you.

[Applause.]

Question 118:

The MINISTER OF WOMEN IN THE PRESIDENCY: Hon Chairperson, the responsibility of the department is to provide oversight and monitor the degree to which the public and the private sector have mainstreamed gender imperatives, in respect of women with disabilities, within the 2% target set by government. However, the attainment of the 2% target lies within the purview of the Department of Public Service and Administration. We are currently developing gender indicators to ensure that 50% of the 2% target is audited and achieved on an annual basis.

What is also a challenge is that most departments employ people with disabilities at all levels, but we do not provide proper access and we do not provide proper tools so that they can do their work. Thank you.

Ms W S NEWHOUDT-DRUCHEN: Hon Chairperson, Minister, what will the involvement of the National School of Government be in the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 119

training processes, and what are the timelines for the completion of this framework? Thank you. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T DIDAZA): The issue is about the National School of Government and what its role will be in ensuring that training is undertaken.

The MINISTER OF WOMEN IN THE PRESIDENCY: Chairperson, the question now is about people with disabilities.

[Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T DIDAZA): Order, hon members! The Minister is answering. [Interjections.] Order! Order, hon members! Minister, can you please respond?

The MINISTER OF WOMEN IN THE PRESIDENCY: Chairperson, we are already working with the Department of Public Administration and we are trying to ensure that their programmes, more particularly the School of Government encompasses the development of people with disabilities. [Interjections.]

IsiZulu:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 120

Ake niyeke ukungithethisa. [Ubuwelewele.] Ake niyeke!

[Ihlombe.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T DIDAZA): Order, hon members! Hon members, can we please be respectful to one another? No matter the views, she answered the question that was asked.

[Interjections.] No. Order, hon members. You can't determine.

While I was sitting here, I have listened carefully to the question and the Minister's answer. So, please, can you be in order?

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Hon House Chair, Minister, my President is an ideal example of a person who has a disability and who is physically challenged, but still has the capacity to perform and yet, there are those who are not physically challenged who cannot perform as equally as she can. How would government intervene to ensure that this corrupt DA government in the Western Cape, which marginalises coloureds and blacks from senior managerial positions, does not continue to marginalise those that have disabilities or who are physically challenged?

IsiZulu:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 121

UNGQONGQOSHE WABESIFAZANE EHHOVISI LIKAMONGAMELI: Uhlelo lwethu ...

English:

... working with provinces is going to be strengthened through ensuring that we reconfigure gender mainstreaming. That reconfiguration is going to include provinces, and therefore, everyone will be judged or tested on the basis of what they are doing.

Therefore, gender mainstreaming and reconfiguration of the gender machinery is going to also involve ... You must learn about women's issues. You must learn about it. You must know ... Surely, you read a lot. Therefore, you must read about what gender machinery is. [Interjections.] Don't ask me here. Go and read. Go and empower yourself. [Interjections.] Don't expose your ignorance about women's issues here in Parliament.

Ms T STANDER: Chair, Minister, as with the 2% disability target, premiers are supposed to oversee the provincial traditional houses and it is a requirement that traditional councils meet the quota in terms of the Traditional Leadership

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 122

and Governance Framework Amendment Act of 2009. It stipulates a one third representation of women on these councils. Do they comply and if not, how are you going to ensure they comply, as this is a competency of premiers in the provinces to oversee them? Thank you.

IsiZulu:

UNGQONGQOSHE WABESIFAZANE EHHOVISI LIKAMONGAMELI: Ngiyacabanga ukuthi loko kumele kwenziwe yithina sonke siwuhulumeni. Sibone ukuthi sonke siyafinyelela engxenyeni yesithathu ...

English:

... before you talk about other houses. You must talk about your organisation ...

IsiZulu:

... ukuthi liyafinyelela yini engxenyeni yesithathu?
[Ubuwelewele.] Isifunda sakho siyafinyelela yini engxenyeni yesithathu? Omasipala bakho bayafinyelela yini engxenyeni yesithathu? ONggongqoshe bakho lapha esifundazweni bayafinyelela engxenyeni yesithathu yini? Ngabe omasipala bakho abahlukumezi yini abantu besifazane, babafune uma befuna

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 123

amavoti amaningi uma ngabe sebewatholile lawo mavoti bese sebeyabaxosha?

Ms T STANDER: Madam Chair, on a point of order: The Minister did not answer the question. [Interjections.] I asked whether traditional councils comply with the 33% quota. I just need to know whether they do or don't and what she plans to do. That is my question.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T DIDIZA): Hon members, can we be fair to the Minister? The question you asked actually departed from the original question because you are now talking about traditional councils and the quotas that are met or not met. So, she also responded broadly to the provincial ... So, if you look at the ... [Interjections.] Hon member, if you look at the original question, as it has been asked, your question was very specific on traditional councils and the quotas. The Minister responded what they are doing broadly in terms of the gender machinery and how all of us must work towards that.

Ms S J NKOMO: Madam Chair, Minister, yes, we have noted all the areas of the gender focal points as well as some of the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 124

challenges that we are still faced with when it comes to addressing matters of people who are challenged and who are working in environments that should be changed, in order to suit them as well. In all nine of the provinces that we have in our country, which provinces have actually made good progress and can actually state that they have done very well? I note that, in the province where I come from, Gauteng, we did very well some years back and then we dismantled everything. Thank you.

The MINISTER OF WOMEN IN THE PRESIDENCY: I think for now ... Okay, let me say firstly, I agree that Gauteng was one of the provinces that were doing well when it comes to all sectors of women, not only women with disabilities. When we destroyed this structure that was there to ensure that we monitor everyone, we lost the whole plot. [Interjections.]

That is why we are saying we need to reconfigure the gender machinery. We need to ensure that people who are appointed to deal with gender issues in provinces are placed in premiers' offices. They must also be at a high level, for instance, they must be chief directors so that they can take a decision. If

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 125

you have a junior official, whatever decision you take does not see the light of day because that official does not meet the HOD as well as the premier.

So, what we are doing right now is to look at restructuring the gender machinery and ensuring that we bring back the strength it used to have.

Question 64:

The MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION: House Chair, the response is that candidates are normally given much to subjects they did not write. Therefore, the request for numbers such as these is not applicable in this regard.

The policy relating to examinations and assessments for candidates that are absent from exams and if a valid reason is provided the learner is been given another opportunity to write the exam. But in this case, there was a technical error where two learners with similar surnames were entered incorrectly; the other learner was writing Maths and the other Maths Literacy.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 126

And because the school and the learners themselves did not verify the information when it was sent to them; after exams they were accredited incorrectly.

So the 00,9 was that the learner was writing Maths, the one that is in question here, was not given marks because they had entered him or her as having written Maths Literacy. But the matter was corrected and the learner has been properly accredited.

So, there is no tradition at all in the department whereby learners are given marks for subjects that they have not written. This is a specific case about a learner, which is a mistake that was supposed to have been rectified at the school level, and that's why there were these problems, but the matter has been resolved.

Mr M S MABIKA: House Chairperson, it's amazing that the Minister is just saying it lightly when she says the matter was resolved. Without considering the consequences to say, as we speak right now, the learner was not admitted at a tertiary institution because she did not get her marks.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 127

Now, the question is what becomes a corrective measure? Because this was a human error that has resulted in the learner suffering for the whole year sitting at home doing nothing.

The MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION: House Chairperson, there is no way I can undermine and underestimate this error, it is a serious error. But as I explained, before learners go for exams, the schedules are sent to schools for learners to verify in the forms if indeed they have been properly recorded or registered, the school also is supposed to do the same exercise. So, this problem occurred not because of the department but I think of the mistake that happened at the school level where the entry was incorrect.

And he's quite correct, it's quite sad that there was this problem. It's not anything we take lightly for a learner to lose a year but I'm explaining how this particular case occurred and where the error occurred, without undermining the fact that the learner, indeed, lost the whole year.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 128

Mr N M PAULSEN: House Chairperson, I just like to know from the Minister, given the response that it was a confusion between two learners with the same name and surname, which is quite common is going to happen more often, shouldn't you have systems that will use other areas to distinguish between two learners? Actually an ID number is unique number and to go and sort based on their surname or name only is going to cause you problems. Surely an ID number is more unique characteristic of every learner, so you probably have problems with your systems as well, shouldn't that be a better option?

The MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION: House Chairperson, last year there were more than 800 000 learners who entered exams and the method to make sure that you rectify mistakes is that schedules are sent to schools to ensure that both learners and schools verify, at the school level; that's the other method that is there so that if there is a technical problem like this, there are other measures outside the national exams system that enable both the learner and the school to clear, and in this case it did not happen at a school level.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 129

And as I say it's one ... and I'm not saying one case is one too many, but we are talking about more than 800 000 learners who have entered and this specific learner in this school faced this problem. For the mere fact that it is one learner out of 800-and-something-thousand learners, it means the system is working, but there was this specific one where unfortunately the verification was not properly done at the school level by the learner himself/herself and the school at that level.

Ms H S BOSHOFF: Minister, you think you do have a problem? I agree. Forty thousand 2017 matric certificates have not been issued to learners and 19 000 of these come from the Eastern Cape and you now speak about one learner, I'm speaking about 40 000. And this is according to your reply to Question 227(1).

What I would like to know is, Minister, this is a major problem for completing employment paperwork. Furthermore, Minister, you say you will issue the remaining certificates within two weeks. If you have not completed it by now and

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 130

after nine months as well, what do you, Minister, plan on doing differently in two weeks?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T DIDIZA): Hon Boshoff, the question that I think we're dealing with, which stood over, is Question 64.

Ms H S BOSHOFF: Quite correct, Chair, and that is a question, it's got to do with matric results and matric certificates. We were speaking about one learner that didn't get, now we're speaking about 40 000 learners that haven't been issued it.

The MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION: House Chairperson, I want to respectfully be able to respond but ...

IsiZulu:

... angazi ukuthi ilungu elihloniphekile likhuluma ngani. Sikhuluma ngoNxumalo ukuthi kwahlangahlagana phakathi koNxumalo ... uzongitshela ngezinkulungwane ezingama-40. Uma efuna ukungibuza akangibuze ngizomphendula kahle. Asikhulumi ngaleyo sikhuluma ngalendaba kaNxumalo, makakhulume ngayo. Uma afuna ukukhuluma enye, ayikhulume, siyiphendule kahle ngoba

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 131

manje angazi ukuthi ngizovuma ngithi yebo noma ngithi hhayi - angazi ukuthi ukhuluma ngani.

English:

Ms H S BOSHOFF: On a point of order, Chair. It is exactly the same, whether it's one learner or two learners. The Minister has just said one learner too many. So, we are now speaking about 40 000 learners that have no access to the economic market because they have no matric certificates.

[Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T DIDIZA): Order, hon member! I hear your question but to me it sounds as a new question.

[Interjections.] Order! Can I just explain? Because the matter at hand that we're dealing with on Question 64 relates to an issue where there was a misallocation of results from one learner to another, whose surnames were the same and verification not done at school level, and I thought that's the question we're dealing with.

You are now asking a question with regard to 40 000 learners who have not received their certificates. The question

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 132

[Interjections.] order, hon member! What the Minister is saying is that she doesn't know whether the circumstances of those 40 000 are similar to the one question she was answering. That's why I was answering you earlier because [Interjections.] order, hon members! If the question is about when are you going to ensure that the 40 000 certificates are out? I would respectfully say it's a new question.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: On a point of order, House Chairperson. In terms of Rule 142(6) which deals with supplementary questions. It says clearly that the supplementary question must arise directly from the original question and the reply given there too. The Minister herself opened the door when she started speaking about this matter and I would find it [Interjection.] because she started speaking about the one individual learner who was in this situation. What the hon Boshoff has done is use that opportunity now to ask ... I would find it very odd for a Minister to not know about the situation this serious. She said she's going to answer the question; she's a serial [Inaudible.] in this House. When dose she intend to answer it?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 133

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T DIDIZA): Hon Steenhuisen, with due respect, there is no protection. Minister, no! Hon Steenhuisen, hon Boshoff did ask a question to which the Minister answered, maybe the interpretation was not clear enough. [Interjections.] Order! Hon members, really? You must not be selective in what you want to hear. Minister said I don't know what you want me to answer on because ... order, hon Boshoff! She said I don't know what you me to answer on because I thought the matter I'm dealing with is that one. Obviously, you want another answer to the other 40 000 which hon Steenhuisen said the Minister in her earlier answer opened up; and clearly in her answer she's not ready to give you an answer to that question. So, you can submit a written question. Thank you very much. Indeed, it's a very important matter. Hon Shelembe! [Applause.] [Interjections.]

Hon members, I think we must indeed be respectful and in order. Hon Deputy Speaker earlier on said - you can continue to speak your French - there are a lot of interjections, some of which are really improper and improper language used. I really hear those and I've been very respectful to you. I just ask you to be in order, but you know the things that you said

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 134

are really unparliamentary, some of them. Hon Steenhuisen, don't say "ah what" if you didn't hear because I heard your members and they were responding to me in isiZulu. That's why I'm responding to them. Hon Shelembe!

Mr M L SHELEMBE: Hon Minister, such a technical error has happened under your leadership in your department. What I want to know from you is that since this has led to a serious consequence to that child, are you prepared to make a public apology? So that the family and the child can at least feel better. Thank you.

IsiZulu:

UNGQONGQOSHE WEMFUNDO EYISISEKELO: Shelembe, ithi ngikhulume ngesiZulu ukuthi sizwane kahle. Ngithi uma eza ama-schedule umfundi nesikole kumele baqinisekise ukuthi kugcwaliswe kahle. Akwenzekanga kumfundi, esikoleni ngakho ke kube naleliphutha elikhona. Manje sekufuneka ngiyothwala isono engingasenzanga ngoba umfundi obekufanele aqinisekise iphutha ...

[Ubuwelewele.] Angizukuxolisa. [Ubuwelewele.] Lilonke angizukuxolisa.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 135

English:

Mr M S MABIKA: On a point of order, House Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T DIDIZA): Hon Mabika, I've heard you, can you take your seat? Allow the Minister to finish and I will recognise you. Hon Minister, can you finish?

IsiZulu:

UNGQONGQOSHE WEMFUNDO EYISISEKELO: Akukhonzima kuANC ukuxolisa kodwa angazi kumele ngixolise ukuthi ngenzeni. Ngakho ke ayikho into engizoyixolisela ngaphandle kokuthi ngithenga amahlo nokunijabulisa. Ayikho nje into ethi sixolise.

English:

Mr M S MABIKA: House Chairperson, the point of order is that the Minister is misleading the House. Here is the timetable of the learner, indicating that the learner is registered for pure Mathematics, here is the timetable with me. What she's saying is she's misleading the House. [Interjections.] Here is the copy of the learner's timetable. She must not shift the blame to the school, it was verified. [Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 136

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T DIDIZA): Hon Mabika, the Minister answered you earlier on and you did not make that follow up question as you're now making it, after Shelembe has raised the issue. If you have further issues that you want to raise with the Minister you can actually do so outside this House because you had an allocated time and you did not raise that point. Thank you very much. I now move [Interjection.]

Mr M S MABIKA: But, she is not correct, here. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T DIDIZA): Hon Mabika, can you please respect some of us. You had an opportunity. You are contesting it and I am saying you can raise it with your Minister directly. You had an opportunity to have a follow up question on your question and you never raised that issue. Thank you, hon member. [Interjection.]

Mr M S MABIKA: She's misleading [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T DIDIZA): Can you please take your seat?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 137

Question 60:

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: House Chairperson, the answer to Question 60 ... I have just pressed, okay ... is that the SA Social Security Agency, Sassa, together with SA Post Office, Sapo, has undertaken to roll out the new Sassa Sapo social grants cards to all beneficiaries who received their social grants in cash as well as those who access the money electronically at paypoints in the national payment system and also at merchants, different banks' ATMs and Post Office outlets. Our target was that cash payment beneficiaries, who were approximately 2,5 million at the court decision, were supposed to receive new cards before the 30th September 2018. Today, approximately 5,8 million new cards have been issued. Thank you House Chair.

Ms B L ABRAHAMS: Thank you, hon House Chair. Hon Minister, thank you very much for a very comprehensive response.

[Interjections.] My question to you hon Minister, in terms of the new Sassa card which has an expiry date of five years, what is the reason and the purpose because there are many people who wouldn't be able ... You have gone through this process ... and also taking into account that people with

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 138

disabilities have to do verification and certification annually. Minister ...

Afrikaans:

Terwyl omruiling van kaarte kostelik en tydsaam is, was daar nie 'n ander manier om hierdie koste te bespaar nie en liever net 'n kaartomruiling te aktiveer, wanneer 'n beginstigterkaart beskadig of verloor het nie? Dankie.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you very much, hon member. What we are doing currently is to make sure that people with disabilities either use biometric or identity documents but if they don't want to be involved in the process of biometrics and using their fingers, they can use their identity documents. But if they forget their pin numbers, what they can do is to do card reset at paypoints to make sure that for whatever reasons they are able to get a pin reset which is only meant for them and that no other people should use it.

I must also say that outside of people with disability, we also have elderly people, some of who have fingerprints are not clear so what we do to ensure that they are correct, we

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 139

use their ID numbers. They should carry their IDs as a form of identification to make sure that they are paid.

IsiXhosa:

Mnu M HLENGWA: Xa ndigeza yintoni ingxaki yakho xa ndizigezelayo mna.

English:

The Auditor-General in his latest report ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order! Hon Hlengwa, can you please ask your question. And members, don't provoke another member.

IsiZulu:

Mnu M HLENGWA: Ngizokubuza kahle Ngqongqoshe.

English:

The Auditor-General in his latest report to the Constitutional Court said that they have little faith that in October there will be a functionally, effectively, efficiently and economically grant payment system. Moreover, Sassa itself has

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 140

admitted that we should not continue as planned in swapping all beneficiaries by the end of September when cash paymaster services and unlawful contracts ends.

Therefore, hon Minister, what permanent measures have you put in place to prevent any further technical clichés from botching the system and preventing payments to grant recipients from taking place. Can you give us an assurance that grants recipients will receive their money on time, come 1 October 2018?

IsiZulu:

UNGQONGQOSHE WEZOKUTHUTHUKISWA KOMPHAKATHI: Nami ngizokuphendula kahle.

English:

Thank you, House Chairperson, I just want to assure you that come 1 September where we are expected to have terminated our relationship with Cash Paymaster Services, CPS, as Sassa ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): It is the 1st of October, Minister.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 141

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Yes, 1st of October.

[Laughter.] Thank you, House Chairperson.

IsiZulu:

Uyabona labantwana abahlekayo noma impukani idlula.

English:

Mr T W MHLONGO: Can I rise on a point of order, House Chair.

IsiZulu:

Phendula, Ngqongqoshe.

UNGQONGQOSHE WEZOKUTHUTHUKISWA KOMPHEKATHI: Ngisaphendula.

[Ubuwelewele.]

Mr T W MHLONGO: On a point of order, House Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): What is the point of order now?

IsiZulu:

Mnu T W MHLONGO: Akuna bantwana lapha.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 142

English:

It is unparliamentary. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon Minister?

IsiZulu:

UNGQONGQOSHE WEZOKUTHUTHUKISWA KOMPHEKATHI: Ngiyabonya.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): I don't think a reference was made to any specific member. [Interjections.] Minister, "abantwana" - they want you to withdraw the word "abantwana".

IsiZulu:

UNGQONGQOSHE WEZOKUTHUTHUKISWA KOMPHEKATHI: Abantwana! Bathe abantwana bona?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Withdraw the ...

[Interjections.] Minister, withdraw.

IsiZulu:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 143

UNGQONGQOSHE WEZOKUTHUTHUKISWA KOMPHAKATHI: Bahleka impukani uma idlula. Hhayi ke bantwana ngiyaxolisa. [Ubuwelewele.]

English:

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Minister, withdraw. [Interjections.]

IsiZulu:

UNGQONGQOSHE WEZOKUTHUTHUKISWA KOMPHAKATHI: Ngiyahoxisa.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): She has now withdrawn. Thank you.

Ms A STEYN: Can I rise on a point of order, House Chairperson.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Yes.

Ms A STEYN: House Chairperson, I also think you were out of line. You said, "Abantwana also want you to withdraw." House Chair ... "

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 144

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): I was explaining to her ... [Interjections.]

Ms A STEYN: No, no, House Chair!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): ... using her language rather, but I will withdraw.

Ms A STEYN: Thank you. [Interjections.]

Mr M HLENGWA: Hon House Chairperson, no, no, no, I am rising on a point of order.

IsiZulu:

Asingafikini lana singcolise isiZulu. Ngiyacela ukuthi lesi sinqumo uyosicubungula ngoba uma namagama esintu nolimi lwakithi angenalutho kuthiwe "unparliamentary" kusho ukuthi sizocina sesingasakhulumi lapha eNdlini. Sizocela lesinqumo niyosicubungula ngoba akukwazi ukuthi kuzothiwa lelo gama li- "unparliamentary" ngasiphi isizathu.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 145

USIHLALO WENDLU (Nk A T Didiza): Ngiyabonga lungu elihloniphekile sizocubungula impela. [Ihlombe.]

UNGQONGQOSHE WEZOKUTHUTHUKISWA KOMPHEKATHI: Ngiyabonga Sihlalo [Ubuwelewele.]

English:

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order! Let's allow the Minister to respond.

IsiZulu:

UNGQONGQOSHE WEZOKUTHUTHUKISWA KOMPHEKATHI: Engikushoyo lungu elihloniphekile ngiyaqiniseka ukuthi kuzawufika umhlaka zi-1 ku-Okthoba uhlelo lwethu esibhadala ngalo ukusukela Mhla zi-1 ukuyophela Mhlazi-20 ngenza isiqiniseko sokuthi abantu abahlomulayo bazoholelwa ngendlela efanele. Kulezi zinkinga esibe nazo uma ungabheka ukuthi sibe nezinkinga nini. Sibe nezinkinga uma siholela ngenyaka kaJulayi. Isizathu sokuthi sibe nenkinga ngaleyo nyaka kaJulayi ukuthi besiqala ukusuka ohlelweni oludala siya ohlelweni olusha. Ngaleyo ndlela saba nenkinga yenethiwekhi ebeyingenele ukuthi ikwazi ukuqhubekela phambili nokuthwala bonke abantu abafuneka ukuba bangene

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 146

ohlelweni olusha. Lokho sikulungisile sisebenzisana no-Telkom, MTN, Bank Serve, Payments Association of South Africa, Pasa kanye nawo wonke amanethiwekhi akho eNingizimu Afrika futhi sikhokhela nange-“satellite”. Yingako sikwazi ukufinyelela nasezindaweni zasemaphandleni lapho kukhona abantu bethu kanti nezobuchwepheshe ezingafinyeleli senzela khona ukuthi sikubalekele lokho. Uma ubheka inyaka ka-Ogasti sikhokhe ngendlela efanele. Ngiyabonga.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order, hon members. Indeed the hon Hlengwa is right because I heard the member of the DA saying “siyabonga gogo” [thank you, grandmother] and other members of the DA were complaining about “ukubizwa abantwana” [being referred to as children]. Indeed the hon Hlengwa is correct that we need to relook at this issue of language and idioms and how they are used.

Ms B S MASANGO: House Chair through you to the Minister, over the past two months, we have been conducting various oversight visits to monitor the switchover process from the old cards to the new ones. We witnessed widespread chaos with beneficiaries

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 147

in the country as far apart as KwaZulu-Natal, Cape Town and Johannesburg in possession of up to four different cards per person, none of which would yield money. In the face of the repeated assurances by the department and Sassa that the switchover process will go well, how can the hon Minister explain the widespread occurrence of problems such as these and how will it be remedied. [Interjections.]

IsiZulu:

UNGQONGQOSHE WEZOKUTHUTHUKISWA KOMPHAKATHI: Ngifuna ukusho ukuthi liyangimangaza ilungu elihloniphekile ngoba belihleli ekomidini livuma ukuthi ngempela ngempela sisebenze kahle nala sikhona. Amalungu amanye ekomidi angakufakazela lokho kodwa engifuna ukukusho le-“widespread disruption” ngifuna ukukuqinisekisa ukuthi ayikho.

Okwesibili engifuna ukukusho ukuthi amakhadi amane yingoba uyazi wena njengelungu lekomidi ukuthi iSassa inekhadi layo. Aphinde futhi u-Cash Paymaster Services anikeza abantu bethu

ikhadi eliluhlaza esebenzisa uGrindrod ngaleyo ndlela ubangela ukudideka. Abanye uma beya beyoshintsha uphinde abanikeze lawo

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 148

makhadi futhi azama ukubaphindisela emuva. Ezinye zezizathu uma kukhulunywa ngokuphazamiseka kubonisa u-Cash Paymaster Services ngendlela azama ukululaza uhulumeni, ngendlela azama ukuthi singabinenqubekela phambili.

Kepha ke namhlanje uwutholile umbiko ekomidini wokuthi sikwazile ukuthi sisuse izigidi ezi-5 zamarandi sizise ohlelweni olusha. [Ihlombe.] Izinkinga ebesikade sinazo okunye okumele ukwazise. Siyakwazi namhlanje into ebingayenzwa uCash Paymaster Services, abantu bethu uma beyohola ezikhungweni yisho ukuthi sesibahlalisa phansi, siletha nezindlu zangasese. Senzela ukuthi bangahlupheki. Manje konke lokho yingxenye yoguquko. Angisho ukuthi izinhlelo ngeke ziphazamiseke [offline] kodwa akuyona into ejwayelekile, akuyona futhi into esezingeni eliphezulu kakhulu okuyinkinga. Lapho kuzoba nezinkinga zizolungiswa ngendlela efanele. Ngikusho ngoba ngihamba phansi, angikhulumi ngamaphepha. Angikhulunyelwa ngamaphepha, ngihamba yonke indawo. UNggongqoshe uCwele akekho

khona manje ushone phansi, sihamba sishosha phansi asisebenzisi maphepha. Sifinyelela ngo ebantwini sizwe izinkinga.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 5 SEPTEMBER 2018

Page: 149

English:

Ms C N MAJEKE: House Chair through you to the hon Minister, as the Minister, would you consider reducing the financial strains that government has placed on the elderly and poor through the VAT increase of 15%? Will you also make sure that all items bought with the new South African Post office cards are zero rated? Thank you.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you very much hon Majeke, I think that is a very important point for us to consider when we deal with the comprehensive social policy. Even if I might not commit now, I want to say that we will make sure that we consider such measures you have mentioned of VAT, but there are various aspects which we are looking at in ensuring that the baskets of the vulnerable, especially our elderly people, can increase with the money they have. We have various options. When we come to Parliament with the policy, we will see. We are going to make sure that the vulnerable, especially elderly people can be able buy in an affordable way. Thank you.

BUSINESS CONCLUDED AND THE HOUSE ADJOURNED AT 18:30.