

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 15 AUGUST 2018

Page: 1

THURSDAY, 15 AUGUST 2018

PROCEEDINGS OF THE NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

The Council met at 14:00.

The House Chairperson: Committees, Oversight, Co-operative Governance and Intergovernmental Relations took the Chair and requested members to observe a moment of silence for prayers or meditation.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE NCOP: I move that, notwithstanding Rule 247(1), which provides that a sitting of the Council will be dedicated for oral questions, the Council considers motions.

Question put: That the motion be agreed to.

IN FAVOUR: Eastern Cape, Free State, Gauteng, KwaZulu-Natal, Limpopo, Mpumalanga, Northern Cape, North West, Western Cape.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 15 AUGUST 2018

Page: 2

Motion accordingly agreed to in accordance with section 65 of the Constitution.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Before we proceed, I would like to take this opportunity to welcome the Minister from the Governance Cluster. It has been brought to my attention that we have an apology from the Minister of Women within the office of the Presidency. So, instead of dealing with two Ministers, we will be dealing with one. Hon Minister, you are welcome.

Question 197:

The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY: PLANNING, MONITORING AND EVALUATION: Chairperson, there were 331 482 young people trained through the programme who were in the majority, either unemployed or not in institutions at that time, 1 485 of them are now in permanent employment and from the 2 245 youth-owned enterprises supported 11 461 indirect jobs were created. Thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Thank you, hon Minister. In terms of the rules of the House, if the member is not in the House, someone can stand in for such member. It has been brought to my attention that hon Engelbrecht will be standing in for hon Julius. Over to you, hon Engelbrecht!

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 15 AUGUST 2018

Page: 3

Ms B A ENGELBRECHT: Chairperson and Deputy Minister ...

[Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): The hon Minister, not Deputy Minister!

Ms B A ENGELBRECHT: Hon Minister, we have huge unemployment in this country and youth unemployment is increasing quarter and quarter. With the latest quarter the figure is close to 60%. The National Youth Development Agency, NYDA, has got a budget of R411 million and yet, this unemployment is still increasing. In other words, NYDA has failed to bringing meaningful jobs and employment to the youth is now being used as a private bank to pay ANC cadres for their loyalty through employment.

With the jobs crisis in our country, and looking at the budget that you have for the year when you admit that NYDA is not achieving the goals which your department has set out to achieve, and that it has just become another ANC picky bag. Thank you.

The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY: PLANNING, MONITORING AND EVALUATION: Chair, the NYDA is a very responsible agency, and we can see even from the Auditor-General's report that they've clean audits and that

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 15 AUGUST 2018

Page: 4

they are doing what they are supposed to do. In fact, NYDA's success in supporting young entrepreneurs exceeds any other programme. The young people that they've supported have succeeded, and that's why even those young entrepreneurs have produced additional jobs.

So, what the hon members could be complaining about in the NYDA is that probably they should be given more money so that they can make sure that more young people are supported as entrepreneurs in order to reduce the problem of unemployment. But I also want to point out to the hon member that the NYDA is not the only institution that is dealing with youth.

So, you can't juxtapose the entire unemployment in the country to 400 million youth that the NYDA has. There are many other programmes that are there which are supporting young people. Thank you, Chair.

Mr M RAYI: Through you hon House Chair, hon Minister, what strategy does the government has to ensure that the private sector also plays a role to deal with unemployment particularly of the young people, given that the private sector is sitting on trillions and it's not investing them to grow the economy? Thank you.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 15 AUGUST 2018

Page: 5

The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY: PLANNING, MONITORING AND EVALUATION:

Hon member, the government is having a number of engagements with the private sector, precisely on that point, on how the private sector can also play a role in dealing with job-creation for young people, but also in giving them experience at the workplace. But also not only that, but expanding the economy.

We are having discussions with them so that they can invest more in the economy, and therefore expand the economy and also curve new entries in to the economy. New people who can either be farmers and who can be entrepreneurs, we are discussing with them about having incubators. Just recently, the President was talking about them to the Information and communication technology, ICT, companies about incubating young people to be entrepreneurs in the ICT sector.

So, there is a lot of discussion that is going on and I think you would also see the job summit which will also give some answers. But, I think that it is an on-going process that we must undertake. We should not tire talking to them because there will forever be a need to. The government is also doing its part. You've heard that the President has also announced that instead of always insisting that when somebody who leaves the university applying for a job at

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 15 AUGUST 2018

Page: 6

entry levels, five year experience is demanded. Where did they get the job to get such experience?

So, as you know, that is being dealt with so that new entrants into job market, especially in government where we have control, will not need to have an experience because it's an entry level. You don't get experience whilst you are still studying, medicine is one of them, but there aren't many. Thank you.

Question 214:

The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY: PLANNING, MONITORING AND EVALUATION: Char, the Department of Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation monitors and conducts performance evaluations in provinces from time to time. To date, there are 506 such evaluations which are at various levels and stages of execution in all nine provinces. These evaluations vary from frontline office monitoring, such place as schools, clinics, hospitals, police stations and municipal offices.

We also do an analysis of quarterly performance reports submitted to DPME by provinces and national departments. The DPME also utilises the management performance assessment tool to monitor the performance of provinces, provincial departments, which results are submitted and discusses with offices of Premiers.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 15 AUGUST 2018

Page: 7

On section 2, there are several partnerships and collaborations with independent research and monitoring institutions. These are those that undertake strategic research and performance in monitoring, who are appointed by an independent evaluation panel. The panel includes the University of Fort Hare, Nelson Mandela Metropolitan University, University of Cape Town, University of Witwatersrand and the University of Free State, in addition to the SA Institute for Distant Education, Health Systems Trust, the Human Science Research Council and the Centre for Scientific and Industrial Research.

On section 3, the results of the management performance assessment tool will soon form part of the budget review and recommendation processes which will provide for an additional rule for Parliament. Currently, the various parliamentary committees who invited DPME to share information about the performance of government, during which interactions the DPME reports are usually presented. Additionally, the Portfolio Committee on Public Service and Administration, Performance, Monitoring and Evaluation and also the relevant select committees do receive these reports, Thank you.

Mr J M MTHETHWA: Chairperson, hon Minister, thank you for the comprehensive and substantive answers that you presented to us. My follow-up question will start from here: What do you do with

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 15 AUGUST 2018

Page: 8

provinces that did away with policies which were intended for poor people? For instance, in Tshwane the DA has done away with an indigent policy. Is there any mechanism in place to enforce our policies?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Sorry, hon Engelbrecht: Why are you standing?

Ms B A ENGELBRECHT: On a point of order, Chair: Tshwane has not done away with indigent policy. The Minister gave the wrong information yesterday. It was inaccurate. So, that please be rectified for the record. It a total untruth!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Order members! Hon members, I don't need assistance. Hon Engelbrecht, we are used to this process of questions. When a member is asking a question, they are asking the question to the hon Minister. Let's allow the hon Minister to respond. Hon Minister!

The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY: PLANNING, MONITORING AND EVALUATION:
Chair, you know these policies are very important because when they were instituted, it was for a very good reason. In our country, we have poor people; we have people who cannot afford to pay for

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 15 AUGUST 2018

Page: 9

electricity and water. Because the ANC is a caring leader of government, it had to think on how to deal with the situation whereby we have people who are unemployed. Some are elderly and just cannot afford to pay for services.

Besides ensuring that grants are paid and seeing that they are not paid every other month, but monthly, some of us have short memories. We forget that even grants to Africans were paid every other month. So, you starve and just before you die, you get given. Then you starve for another two months just before you die, you get given. The ANC made sure that it is the case. Anyone who stops that would be: A very uncaring person or organisation; the person who does not really care about the poor people; a person who thinks it does not matter if the poor people cannot afford water, electricity or any of those services.

So, it would be important for us, particularly Cogta perhaps: To check what is going on; and to make sure that this situation is corrected, because we cannot visit such cruelty to our people. Even if we are not in charge; we are in charge of this country. We must make sure that the national policies are in place, especially those policies that are mitigating for the lives of poor people - trying to make their live better. Thank you. [Applause.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 15 AUGUST 2018

Page: 10

Mr C HATTINGH: Hon Chair, I would like to ask the Minister a question about monitoring and evaluation, which is the mandate of the Ministry. If we refer to the North West province, which incidentally have now become the most notorious province in South Africa, we only listened yesterday here, the Minister of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs telling us what the state of 20 municipalities is out of the 22 municipalities.

We have the whole provincial government under administration; we have got certain departments on interventions. As background information, remember that it took the trade unions - Nehawu - to collapse the provincial government to collapse government before any intervention occurred, specifically in the health sector. Now how is it possible that this was not picked up upfront in monitoring and evaluation; and why wasn't there intervention long before it was necessary for trade unions to take to the streets?

Similarly, there are crises today and in the past years developing in other provinces, such as the Free State, the Eastern Cape and KwaZulu-Natal. My question is: Is the department efficient and relevant in the context of monitoring and evaluating and timeously identifying worst crisis and nondelivery? Even the collapse of provincial governance and local authorities are of concern.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 15 AUGUST 2018

Page: 11

The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY: PLANNING, MONITORING AND EVALUATION:

Thank you for your question. The department is relevant for monitoring and evaluation. The department needs to be strengthened to ensure that it can monitor many more. It has got a very small budget but it does do the monitoring. What is important is that if you look at even those municipalities: Some of them were picked up and others had already started being assisted, because they were picked up through the monitoring tool of the DPME that monitors municipalities.

They were being assisted to try and get them back to a position where they can deliver services. Of course, whatever happened happened. The important thing is that government has taken steps to ensure that the people in the province are not left without services. That is why there an intervention. In places where we found that there were issues that were very urgent, we got urgent interventions to be instituted in those areas so that our people do not suffer the indecency.

So, what is important is that there is intervention and tomorrow, the ad hoc committee of the NCOP will be receiving a report about that intervention. That is important but I am just saying that some of these municipalities had already been picked up by our monitoring

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 15 AUGUST 2018

Page: 12

system and were already been assisted because we had picked up that there are problems in those municipalities. Thank you.

Ms G G OLIPHANT: Chair, protect me from hon Hattingh!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): You are protected, hon Oliphant.

Ms G G OLIPHANT: Chair, you know: The hon Hattingh must go to Cuba and understand what is happening in Cuba because it is a socialist state.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Order members! Order members! Hon Oliphant, I am protecting you. You are not supposed to be asking hon Hattingh a question; you must ask the hon Minister. Hon Oliphant!

Ms G G OLIPHANT: Hon Minister: How regular are Premiers reporting on performance of their provinces; and the Northern Cape in particular, because I am from there? I hear Hattingh talk about North West. If not, why not? [Interjections.] Hon Chair, I withdraw having said Hattingh.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 15 AUGUST 2018

Page: 13

Mr C HATTINGH: Hon Chair, you have already warned this member initially. She clearly doesn't understand the rules and the whole decorum of this House. So, please educate her.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr. A J Nyambi): She has withdrawn that part, hon Hattingh. You are correct. Hon Oliphant!

Ms G G OLIPHANT: The Northern Cape in particular: If not; why not? What actions have been taken against poor-performing national departments which are underperforming, especially those who manage indirect grants to provinces? Thank you Minister.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Julius, why are you standing?

Mr J W W JULIUS: On a point of order, House Chairperson.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Raise your point of order!

Mr J W W JULIUS: Hon Oliphant just asked two questions, and I thought you will notice that. Thank you.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 15 AUGUST 2018

Page: 14

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): The point of order is sustained. There is supposed to be one supplementary question per member. Hon Minister!

The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY: PLANNING, MONITORING AND EVALUATION:
So, which one to I respond to?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): The first one! [Laughter.]
The first one!

The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY: PLANNING, MONITORING AND EVALUATION:
Hon member, there are various levels at which provinces we get reports. As I alluded in the reply: We monitor, but there are also reports that we get and we analyse from provinces. They are then discussed with the office of the Premier concerned.

However, the President usually has meeting with all Premiers to discuss issues in those affected provinces. That is another level at which provinces have to account or discuss their provincial issues with the national government. So, the Northern Cape is no exception; it participates in all those interactions.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 15 AUGUST 2018

Page: 15

Ms B A ENGELBRECHT: Hon Minister, thank you for that previous reply. It comes back to my question: In terms of the reports that you were speaking about, one of the main outcomes of your department is that there has to be agreements between the President, the Ministers and the Premiers.

Can you please inform us whether those agreements have been signed, and these agreements are specifically performance agreements, development of priority outcomes and monitoring the implementation of deliverable agreements? Have those agreements been signed? If not, why not? If any are outstanding, when will they be signed? Will they be made public and available for us to pursue?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Engelbrecht, you are very close to hon Julius. I have just sustained a point of order from hon Julius. This is not supposed to be supplementary questions; it is a supplementary question. Hon Minister!

The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY: PLANNING, MONITORING AND EVALUATION: The same applies, but anyway: The performance agreements with the new President - as you know President Cyril Ramaphosa has just been in office for a short time - have not yet been signed. Thank you.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 15 AUGUST 2018

Page: 16

Question 205:

The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY: PLANNING, MONITORING AND EVALUATION:

Chairperson, the development indicators assist the government in understanding the impact of its various policies, programmes and service delivery initiatives. The indicators also track progress in the attainment of the 14 National Development Plan, NDP, outcomes areas systematically over time. The indicators are also published for society to track progress and to mobilise behind the attainment of the overall outcomes of the NDP.

Section two, the development indicators are not for the purpose of creating employment nor do they exclusively track the levels of unemployment. The indicators also track progress with regard to service delivery as well as key outcome areas such as economic growth and transformation, households and community assets as well social cohesion, amongst other areas.

Given South Africa's long history of apartheid spatial planning, which resulted in high levels of poverty concentration in rural areas, townships and informal settlements - the development indicators publication tracks indices of human development, this enables the government to track its progress towards systematically eradicating the legacy of the past.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 15 AUGUST 2018

Page: 17

The data is desegregated on a more detailed geographical basis using a geographic information system platform to enhance the government planning, enabling tracking progress towards ensuring service delivery and geographic equity. Thank you.

Mr L V MAGWEBU: Minister, as you have alluded that the development indicators covers a whole wide-range of things, amongst them, I want to focus on the tracking the eradication of the legacy of the past, service delivery, impact on policy programmes and service delivery enhancement. Be that as it may, my question is: Surely then, your department plays the critical role in ensuring that provinces are in line and are performing to eradicating the legacy of the apartheid. So, surely, you are compiling reports and if there are shortfalls or any wrong doing or any failure to really promote those policies, there must be consequences for those who are running those provinces.

In consequence management and ensuring that is done, there must be reports that are released for the consumption of the public. Now, does your department do that and if so, are those reports accessible by anyone, including the performance of provinces and if so, why is it not so? In my view, this is important because we are sitting in a country Minister, as you have alluded, where unfortunately poverty

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 15 AUGUST 2018

Page: 18

levels are increasing, where we now know unemployment rate has increased to 27,2%. It means more than 10 million people are unemployed. So, it becomes a critical role for you. So, those reports, where are they? Are you releasing them, so that even us as Parliament we could hold those provinces accountable and without that information, we will really struggle? What is your response, Minister?

The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY: PLANNING, MONITORING AND EVALUATION: House Chairperson, consequence management is a very important issue in any institution and in any organisation. So, I agree with the hon member that consequence management is very important. Of course the provinces are not managed by Department of Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation, DPME.

The DPME monitors and reports but DPME at this point in time doesn't have the mandate to go and institute consequence management. The people who are heading the provinces and the departments must institute consequence management to the employees. If it is the executive, then the head of the executive will institute consequence management. It is not in the mandate of the DPME to institute consequence management at this point.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 15 AUGUST 2018

Page: 19

Mr D M MONAKEDI: House Chairperson, the Minister has already touched on my question in a way but if she could elaborate further and that is: Whether indeed this development indicators do give clear indication of the impact of government programmes? Thank you.

The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY: PLANNING, MONITORING AND EVALUATION: House Chairperson, you have asked a very critical question because at the moment we have been looking more at output rather than specifically at impact. But it is a matter that we are discussing and we have agreed that in the next five years, we will now be looking at the impact because you can have policies that are implemented and you can tick the box that, yes, this has been done but if you don't know what impact it has on the people it is serving, then you are not looking at the matter comprehensively. So, we have agreed that in the next five years, we are going to concentrate a lot more on the impact. Thank you.

Mr J W W JULIUS: House Chairperson, I think from the previous question, we heard that agreements were not signed but didn't hear when they will be signed and it falls under your department, Minister. But, be that as it may, Minister, consequence management is equally important as public scrutiny. If public scrutiny is not

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 15 AUGUST 2018

Page: 20

even more important because you must remember that governance is all about the people that we serve.

Now, when we look at monitoring and evaluation of your Ministers, these annual reports are done by your department in conjunction with the President and these reports are not released to the public for public scrutiny. It is amongst Cabinet members or your department and the President that will eventually hold them accountable but it should be the people of this country that is holding them accountable.

The ANC members, as it stands in Cabinet, are more important than the people that we serve because they hold Ministers accountable. They get to see the reports and we can't hold them accountable. So, my question is: Would you support, as a new incumbent in this Ministry or department that these annual reports by Ministers be made available to the public for public scrutiny, so that the people can really govern? Thank you, House Chairperson.

The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY: PLANNING, MONITORING AND EVALUATION: Chairperson, I will not oppose it, if it is agreed.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 15 AUGUST 2018

Page: 21

Mr E MAKUE: Minister, I want to particularly focus attention through you, Chairperson, on the second part of the question that talks about the indicators only used for employment. I think that this question was disingenuous but there is an oxymoron in the question as well because we are looking at the NDP, which all parties in this House support. We are looking at the history of apartheid and the inequality in the rural areas, which is a concern for all of us. We are all concerned about the Wage Bill.

My question is the building further on the question raised by the two hon members before mine, which is the impact. Minister, can we have an impact if we are not looking at creating employment opportunities as a responsible government for the people? We have heard the people from National Empowerment Fund, NEF, from the Small Business Development and the Department of Labour, all coming to us as select committees and saying that one of the problems that we have is that there is lots of work to be done in the rural areas. Would we be able to do that work without looking at the employment of people to do the work? Thank you, House Chairperson.

The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY: PLANNING, MONITORING AND EVALUATION:
Chairperson, I completely agree, if there is work to be done for now, it has to be done by people until we get to the Fourth

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 15 AUGUST 2018

Page: 22

Industrial Revolution where some of the work will be done by robots. So, yes we can't say we will do the work if don't look at employing people who will do the work, if I understand the question well. So, yes, that will have to be done.

In fact, it's not that it hasn't been done, maybe not sufficiently. You must recall that we have community health workers, who are there in the community to assist communities.

We want to make sure, for instance, in health that people are supposed to take their tablets, people are supposed to go to the clinics and do whatever they are supposed to do. So, it's not like there isn't anything. There are people who have been employed to look at the households, especially the child-headed households to see what is happening. If you recall, there is a programme called ISIBINDI that the government has to actually assist those households that are headed by children and so on. So, I can go on and on.

I am not saying it is enough but I am just saying, yes, there is some work that has been done. Some people have been employed. There was also training of social workers. If you remember, there was a programme to train social workers. It was all to assist and not only to look at impact but to ensure that there is impact. Thank you.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 15 AUGUST 2018

Page: 23

Question 213:

The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY: PLANNING, MONITORING AND EVALUATION:

Thank you, Chair. As of 6 August 2018, at least 3 373 630 beneficiaries had been transferred from the old SA Social Security Agency, Sassa, Cash Paymaster card to the new Sassa Post Office card.

Some beneficiaries were not paid on time for a number of reasons. One, the movement to the Post Office meant that it was a new system and that system had some teething problems and some hitches which need to be corrected. I'll come back to some of them later.

There is also what is called the financial sector industry limitations which only allows 1 600 to be paid over the counter as a limit and that created problems because then it meant that beneficiaries had to have multiple transactions to get all their money, which then clogged the system and made the queues longer.

In addition, at some of the merchant points the Sassa bank identification number, which is called the BIN, had not been loaded. This is crucial in the processing of payments.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 15 AUGUST 2018

Page: 24

There are also problems with the system at the Post Office because at the moment it is not able to take very big volumes. For instance, it can only take 20 transactions per second, which is not a lot when you have millions of people across the country needing to be paid.

So these were some of the problems which meant that beneficiaries were not paid on time, and as you know these challenges are because this programme is not a programme that has been planned properly over time. There is a court order that has a deadline which says that these beneficiaries must be transferred away from the cash payments of Cash Paymaster Services, CPS.

So, it's not a perfect system. It will have to be perfected as we go along. So, as we have done before, we would again like to apologise to the beneficiaries who were not paid on time, but to also ask that they bear with us. It's not because we do not care. We care very much and we would like to ensure that they are paid on time without inconvenience. We are trying our best to get there. For instance, we have applied to change the 1 600 limit to 2 000 so that we don't have the same problem. However, a lot of these things are also not within our immediate control. As I say we have applied for an extension to the limit. If it was in our control we would've just

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 15 AUGUST 2018

Page: 25

said the limit must be increased. So those are some of the problems that we are facing.

Xitsonga:

Ms B T MATHEVULA: Mutshamaxitulu, eka Holobye, xana hi wahi matshalatshala lawa mi ya endlaka ku tiyisisa vaakatiko leswaku eka n'hweti leyi va ta kuma mali ya vona ... [Nkavanyeto.]

English:

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Mathevula, allow the Minister to put ... No, hon Mathevula, your language is appreciated and it's one of the official languages in South Africa. We are in order. I'm just saying let's allow the Minister to be ready to understand your question. You can go on, hon Mathevula.

Xitsonga:

Ms B T MATHEVULA: Mutshamaxitulu, eka Holobye, xana hi wahi matshalatshala lawa mi ya endlaka ku tiyisisa vaakatiko leswaku eka n'hweti leyi va ta kuma mali ya vona ya mudende hi nkarhi? Ndza khensa.

English:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 15 AUGUST 2018

Page: 26

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Minister, were you able to ... Was the interpretation okay?

The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY: PLANNING, MONITORING AND EVALUATION:
Just repeat the first part.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): You can repeat the first part.

Xitsonga:

Ms B T MATHEVULA: Xana hi wahi matshalatshala ... [Nkavanyeto.]

English:

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Ask the entire question, hon Mathevula. [Interjections.] No, no, no, use your language. Use your language, hon Mathevula. Use your language. The interpretation will be sorted. Ask your question again.

Ms B T MATHEVULA:

Okay, I'll do it slowly.

Xitsonga:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 15 AUGUST 2018

Page: 27

Xana hi wahi matshalatshala ... [Ku hleka] ... Holobye, xana hi wahi matshalatshala lawa mi ya endlaka na komiti ya n'wina ku tiyisisa vaakatiko leswaku eka n'hwetileyi va ta kuma mali ya vona ya mudende hi nkarhi?

English:

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): What are the actions you are taking to ensure that the people will get their grants on time this month?

IsiZulu:

UNGQONGQOSHE EHOVISI LIKAMONGAMELI: UKUHLELA UKUBHEKELA KANYE
NOKUHLOLWA: Sihlalo, kule nyanga siyazama kakhulu ukubazisa okokuqala nje abantu ukuthi kuzohamba kanjani kodwa angilikhulume nje iqiniso ukuthi ngeke ngime la ngokuthembeka Ngiyilungu lePhalamende ngithi ngiyaqinisekisa ukuthi kule nyanga ngeke kube khona ubuhixihixi. Siyazama ukuthi izinto ebezenza ubuhixihixi zilungiswe njengendaba yaseposini. Bayazama ukuthi bakwazi ukukhokhela abantu abaningi ngomzuzwana kunale ndlela ekwenzeka ngayo okwamanje kodwa ...

English:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 15 AUGUST 2018

Page: 28

... it means upgrading their system, and I cannot stand here and guarantee that this month or next month the system would have been upgraded in all the post offices. So, as I say we are trying. The Post Office is trying to upgrade its system. We have applied to get the limit of 1 600 increased to 2 000. We are also trying to ensure that the merchants – because as you know some of the people get their payments from Pick n Pay, from Shoprite ... from those merchants – also upload the Sassa BIN which is a crucial number for processing these accounts.

We are also continuing with the swapping of cards from the old card to the new card of the Post Office. In the future – not next month – the Post Office will also be trying to get mobile units which can get to people in their localities, but that's not in the immediate short term. It's something that they are planning to do over time.

So, I think as South Africans we must all communicate to the beneficiaries that this period is a trying period; it's a period where new systems are being introduced in a very short space of time and there could still be some hitches here and there, but we are doing our best to ensure that what happened last month should not happen this month. Thank you.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 15 AUGUST 2018

Page: 29

Siswati:

Ms L C DLAMINI: Ngiyabonga kakhulu, Sihlalo. Ngibonga kakhulu nakuwe Ndvuna; umbuto wami-ke Ndvuna utsi: Siyati kutsi tinkantolo tinekete Litiko Letenhlalakahle kutsi ekupheleni kwalenyanga letako bonkhe laba labebahola timpesheni babe sebasusiwe kulenkampani lebeyibaholela ngaphambili. Lapho-ke kufuneka babe sebaholelwa ngulaba basemaposini; loko kwenta kutsi lomsebenti uletse incindzetelo lenkhulu kulelitiko.

Umbuto wami-ke Ndvuna utsi: Ekupheleni kwalenyanga letako, Inyoni, kutabe sekwentekile yini kutsi bonkhe labantfu babe sebasusiwe ngala kulenkampani lebeyibaholela kucala, bangabe basalala emaposini? Ngiyabonga.

IsiZulu:

UNGQONGQOSHE EHHOVISI LIKAMONGAMELI: UKUHLELA UKUBHEKELA KANYE NOKUHLOLWA: Yebo, sizama kakhulu ukuthi kwenzeke lokho njengoba inkantolo ithe makwenzeke. Siyazama ngawo wonke amandla kodwa kunokwenzeka ukuthi kubekhona abangakawashintshi amakhadi uma kuphela inyanga. Kukhona-ke imizamo esiyenzayo, kwesinye isikhathi noma bewashintshile kodwa kwenzeke ukuthi endaweni eseduze nabo ayikho indawo la bengakhokhelwa khona. Siyazama ukuthi kungabi khona muntu osothatha imoto ahambe ibanga elidlula amakhilomitha amahlanu

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 15 AUGUST 2018

Page: 30

eyofuna iposi noma eyofuna u-Shoprite kodwa okwamanje ngeke sisho ukuthi abekho abantu abanjalo.

Kukhona-ke imizamo esiyenzayo ukuthi uma bekhona abantu abanjalo emuva kukaSeptemba sibathutha kanjani ukubayisa ezindaweni la bengakhokheleka khona ezikude kodwa sikwazi ukubathutha sibayise kuzona. Ngiyabonga.

English:

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Thank you hon Minister. Hon Essack, I hope you are not going to do the interpretation of the song. [Laughter.]

IsiZulu:

Mnu F ESSACK: Ngiyasokola isi-Xitsonga angisizwa Sihlalo. [Uhleko.]

English:

Thank you, Chairperson. Hon Minister, based on everything that you have said and explained, mine is a very simple one. Why did the interministerial committee then ignore the concerns that were raised by the Constitutional Court appointed panel of experts to avert this mitigation of crisis?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 15 AUGUST 2018

Page: 31

The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY: PLANNING, MONITORING AND EVALUATION:
Chairperson, the panel of experts have submitted lots of reports to
the Court. Can the member be more specific? Thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Essack, are you ready to
do that?

Mr F ESSACK: Chairperson, I'm not ready to give all those reports
because I don't have all the reports here. [Laughter.] My question
is a very simple one. [Interjections.] Chairperson? Hold on.
Chairperson, can I be protected?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Order members! Hon Essack is
protected.

Mr F ESSACK: Thank you. I just want ... My question is very clear,
Chairperson.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): No, let me assist you so that
you can assist the Minister in terms of your question.

Mr F ESSACK: Okay. Go ahead.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 15 AUGUST 2018

Page: 32

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): The Minister is saying that the panel of experts has submitted a number of reports. So instead of being all over, be specific so that she is able to respond to your question accordingly.

Mr F ESSACK: Okay. The question is ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): No, hon Dlamini. Let's allow hon Essack ... [Laughter.] Hon Essack, you are protected.

Mr F ESSACK: Chairperson, thank you for being so transparent and fair today. The question is very, very simple. I respect what the Minister is saying, that the panel of experts gave a whole lot of reports. Fair enough. The question is simple. The panel of experts expressed themselves specifically on the migration crisis and that is what I'm asking. If the Minister does not know and is not ready to answer, and says openly here that she will put it in writing, I can live with that.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): No, we have clarified the issue of the migration crisis.

Mr F ESSACK: Yes.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 15 AUGUST 2018

Page: 33

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Let's allow the hon Minister.
Hon Minister?

Mr F ESSACK: Fantastic. Great. Thank you.

The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY: PLANNING, MONITORING AND EVALUATION:
Hon Chair, the whole Court instruction is about migration. The entire decision of the Court is to migrate the people who are being paid cash away from the company, CPS, which had gotten a tender. So if he says it's on migration; the entire process is about migration. [Laughter.] The entire process that we are involved in is about migrating those people away from CPS. So can you be specific with regard to what it is that we have ignored, because you say we have ignored something that came from the panel of experts?

Now, if you say it's on migration; the entire thing is on migration. So just say which one we have ignored and then I'll be able to answer you, and if I can't I'll say so. Thank you. [Applause.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon members! Hon Julius, let me allow hon Essack to clarify his question. Hon Essack, the hon Minister is affording you the opportunity. I'm affording you an opportunity to clarify.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 15 AUGUST 2018

Page: 34

Mr F ESSACK: Great, Chairperson. You know you heard hon Dlamini sang ...

IsiZulu:

... angazi! Awuzwanga! Awazi! Mhlonishwa Sihlalo.

English:

Now, my question is very simple. Let's not get into a debate with the Minister. I am asking, in very simple terms, why the interministerial committee ignored the report from the Constitutional Court's panel of experts. That's all.

[Interjections.] Are you saying that you ignored some and accepted some? Is that what you are saying, Minister? I don't want to get into a debate with the Minister. Through you, Chairperson, were some then ignored? Is she agreeing that some were ignored or that everything was ignored or nothing was ignored? Perhaps the Minister can express herself. Thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Order, hon members! Hon Essack, let's allow the hon Minister to comment on what you are trying to clarify. Hon Minister?

IsiZulu:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 15 AUGUST 2018

Page: 35

UNGQONGQOSHE EHHOVISI LIKAMONGAMELI: UKUHLELA UKUBHEKELA KANYE

NOKUHLOLWA: Mhlali ngaphambili, ikomidi lizama ukwenza into eshiwo yinkantolo ukuthi sisuse labantu abakhokhelwa ngokeshi bekhokhelwa yinkampani inkantolo eyathi yathola ithenda ngokungafanele. Kuthiwa-ke asibasuse kule nkampani. Yonke imizamo yaleli komidi izama ukususa abantu kule nkampani. Ziningi-ke izinto ezishiwoyo, kokunye kuke kwathiwa abayiswe emabhange bonke, ngeke ususe umuntu uthi akaye ukuyovula iakhawunti yasebhange engafuni, kuyinqubo yokuzithandela nokuzikhethela, mhlawumbe uma ngabe ukhuluma ngaleyo, angimazi ukhuluma ngeyiphi.

Ngakho-ke ngizothi nje mina, esikwenzayo yilokhu inkantolo ethe sikwenze. Siyavuma ukuthi akulula, kunezingqinamba ezikhona kodwa siyazama ukuzixazulula. Yena akahambe ayofunda ukuthi uma ebuza umbuzo kufanele umbuzo uqonde ngqo ukuthi yini ayibuzayo. Ngiyabonga. [Ihlombe.]

English:

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Julius, why are you standing?

Mr J W W JULIUS: I'm still on my point of order, Chairperson. The point of order is that we know that every time Ministers come here

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 15 AUGUST 2018

Page: 36

we want to hold them accountable as the NCOP. It will not help us that there is some sheepish behaviour by the ANC in this House when other members ask questions. You are not here to cheer on the Minister. You did this with President Zuma and look what it got our country into. You cheered him on.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Julius, what is your point of order? [Interjections.]

Mr J W W JULIUS: Chairperson, my point is that it's a valid question. They clapped hands and afterwards the Minister actually attempted to answer the original question. Now they have egg on the faces because of that. I want you to rule that they should not just cheer on the Minister. They must also hold the Minister accountable because they are also with us in this thing. We are here for the people of this country and not to protect other ANC Ministers.

[Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Julius! Hon Julius! Order members! Hon members, I don't need assistance. Hon Julius, you know what you are raising is not a point of order. In terms of the rule of the NCOP, heckling is allowed; the clapping of hands is allowed. I can't rule on the clapping of hands or heckling. I've protected

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 15 AUGUST 2018

Page: 37

hon Essack. That's why I was very generous. I allowed him more than three times to clarify his question because I want the Minister to account in the House.

So, hon Mangethe, you are the last in terms of the supplementary questions, relating to this question. [Interjections.]

Ms L L ZWANE: Chairperson ...

IsiZulu:

... masibonge mhlonishwa Ngqongqoshe, mhlawumbe kubalulekile ukuthi umuntu akubalule ukuthi indlela ophendula ngayo ngobuqotho, ukusho ukuthi kunzima kuphi nokusho ukuthi senihambe umgama ongakanani ukulungisa lesi simo sokususa abantu kwa-CPS baye emaposini, siyakubonga lokho. Awuthengi amehlo abantu. Ukhuluma iqiniso ngoba linjalo, siyakubonga lokho Ngqongqoshe. Umbuzo-ke wami uthi, ngokusuka kwabantu kulezi zindawo zokuhola beyoholela emaposini kwakhekha isimo sokuthi laba abekade behlomula ngokwezomnotho bekwazi ukudayisa bathole ukuziphilisa ngalezi zindawo ebekukade kuholelwa kuzona akusenzeki. njengoHulumeni-ke obonelela abantu, nizenzile yini izinhlelo zokuthi nala esekuholelwa khona manje ikakhulukazi emaposini nasezindaweni eziseduze kwamaposi kubekhona

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 15 AUGUST 2018

Page: 38

indlela yokuthi abantu bakithi abantulayo bakwazi ukudayisa bathole ukuzondla? Ngiyabonga Ngqongqoshe.

UNGQONGQOSHE EHHOVISI LIKAMONGAMELI: UKUHLELA UKUBHEKELA KANYE

NOKUHLOLWA: Sihlalo, impela lento sike sahlala phansi sayidingida ngoba iyinkinga ngoba vele uma kuyoholwa siyazi ukuthi baningi abantu abavula izindawo zokuthengisa bathengise khona. Sesike sayixoxa-ke neposi ukuthi alizame nalo ukuthi uma kuzoholwa kube khona indawo la abantu bengathengisa khona. Yinto exoxwayo leyo, yinto esicabanga ukuthi iposi lizoyizama futhi nokuthi nje nabo ogogo nomkhulu mabezohola kube nezindawo bezokwazi ukuzikhulula, yizinto esizixoxayo lezo neposi ukuthi siyacela ukuthi zenzeke. Engakusho-ke ukuthi sizogapha ukuthi kuyenzeka yini kodwa ngeke futhi ngiqambe amanga ngithi nje uma sekuholwa ngokuzayo wonke amaposi azobe esenayo indawo ngoba akuthina esenza lowo msebenzi, yibona kodwa thina sizokwazi ukuqapha ukuthi kwenzeka kugcine yonke indawo sekubakhona indawo la bekwazi ukuthengisa khona.

Question 204:

The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY: PLANNING, MONITORING AND EVALUATION: Chairperson, the National Planning Commission, NPC, analyses, advises, and supports government, through the Department of Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation on the alignment of plans. It

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 15 AUGUST 2018

Page: 39

also promotes the implementation of the National Development Plan, NDP.

The NPC meets monthly at a plenary, but it also meets in its work streams. They have formed different work streams where they look at the different aspects of the NDP, whether it's the economy or looking at some of the specific things like township and rural economies, energy, and various other issues raised in the NDP. So, they meet also in those work streams. Besides the monthly meetings they have, this also helps them look at whether the implementation in the different sectors is satisfactory or not.

They receive support from the secretariat and from the Department of Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation that have sector specialists and outcome facilitators. Thank you.

Mr J W W JULIUS: Chair, I appreciate the fact that the Minister said they look into it, and the various issues they look at countrywide, on a monthly basis. Let us consider the role of the National Planning Commission in enhancing service delivery because most of these issues must be seen. Since they are meeting monthly, the commission should have detected some of these things beforehand.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 15 AUGUST 2018

Page: 40

What has the commission done to ensure service delivery continues when there is a foreseeable crisis looming?

One example we can maybe mention is the need for urgent attention to be given to the drought in the Eastern Cape. The Kouga Dam currently stands at 6,88%. There have been multiple warnings from various sectors of government about the threat to water service delivery in the Eastern Cape due to the impact of the drought on the quantity of bulk water available, yet I have seen no evidence that the National Planning Commission has aligned or co-ordinated plans or departments to ensure the residents of the Eastern Cape do not run out of water.

So, I would just like your input on that, Minister. If these things are still happening, and you are meeting on a monthly basis, can't you foresee these things? I would like you to answer specifically on this issue. I don't want to open up the whole country's problems, Minister, with due respect. I think it will not make sense to engage on all the issues, but let's confine it to the Kouga Dam issue. Thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): I will leave it to the hon Minister, even though the question is a little unrelated to the original one. I will leave it. He is talking about Kouga.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 15 AUGUST 2018

Page: 41

The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY: PLANNING, MONITORING AND EVALUATION:
Chair, I think the issue of drought is very serious. It has been serious wherever it happened. Whether it is here or in the Eastern Cape, the drought is serious because it affects the livelihood of all our people. The Department of Water and Sanitation has been dealing with issues relating to water availability. They must attend to short-term issues and then long-term issues like building more dams and so on, which are infrastructure issues also.

So, I think the National Planning Commission cannot have the responsibility now to go and put plans in place for delivering water to the people when there is a drought. Firstly, they do not have that mandate and, secondly, they do not have the money to do it. There is a department in charge of that. The drought in the Eastern Cape is serious, but it is not the first drought in South Africa. There have been droughts before, and they have been dealt with before. They were not dealt with by the National Planning Commission. So, I am not sure why this particular drought must now be dealt with directly by the National Planning Commission. Thank you. [Interjections.]

Mr S G MTHIMUNYE: House Chair, you will call me to order if the question is not aligned to the original question, but I would like

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 15 AUGUST 2018

Page: 42

to understand the following: The gist of the question is on the alignment of the plans of government departments to the National Development Plan as the national blueprint of the country. I need to check whether all provinces' plans - provincial plans as well - are aligned to the National Development Plan for us to achieve the objectives of the National Development Plan by 2030. I am specific in this case with respect to the province of the Western Cape that has a tendency to behave like a republic. [Laughter.]

The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY: PLANNING, MONITORING AND EVALUATION:
Chair, I think there is ... [Interjections.]

Mr J W W JULIUS: Chair, I apologise to the hon Minister, but I just want to draw your attention to the fact that you must treat all of us equally. When you apply the Rules, apply it to everyone. When I asked the question, you just made a wayward comment that it is now Kouga. Here is a Western Cape one. You said nothing about that. Please be consistent - that is my point - and not keep quiet. Please be consistent.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Julius, you know that is not a point of order. He was very clear from the start that if he asked a question not linked to the original question, I would leave

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 15 AUGUST 2018

Page: 43

to the Minister. However, the question is linked to the original question.

The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY: PLANNING, MONITORING AND EVALUATION:
Chair, yes, there is an attempt to align the plans, but I think what is important is that there should be an integrated plan. That integrated plan should be an integrated plan of the country, which seeks to implement the NDP and to deliver services to our people. Then that integrated plan should be monitored. At the moment, the planning is all over the place. It is not integrated and co-ordinated. So, for us, that is one step that should be taken to co-ordinate and integrate the plans. Then you are in a position to ensure there is alignment. If there is an integrated and co-ordinated plan, the budget must also fit with that integrated and co-ordinated plan. Thank you.

Ms B A ENGELBRECHT: Chair, through you to the Minister: You have just confirmed - and your words were "if there is an integrated and co-ordinated plan", and then you also mentioned that the plans are "all over the place" - and admitted that the plans are all over the place. In other words, the theoretical plans are not being implemented. It is just paper, just plans. The idea of the National Planning Commission is to ensure that the plans are aligned, as you

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 15 AUGUST 2018

Page: 44

mentioned, and well co-ordinated for the benefit of service delivery.

However, we look at the service delivery across the country, we look at the departments, and we see how service delivery is failing the people of this country. You have just said the plans are all over the place. I just want it to sink in because I think the people need to realise that it is wonderful to have plans, but if the plans are not being implemented, Minister, it means absolutely nothing. This means that the plans are not being implemented. So, what are you and your department going to do to ensure that these plans are aligned, are implemented, and are not all over the place? Thank you.

The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY: PLANNING, MONITORING AND EVALUATION: Chair, yes, planning is not co-ordinated and integrated. If you look at the laws of this country, there are laws that allow planning here and planning there. That is why I am saying planning is not integrated and co-ordinated. [Interjections.] That is why I am saying we need to address that because it is a shortcoming. That is why a province can, as they were saying, do what it wants to do sometimes.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 15 AUGUST 2018

Page: 45

So, all I am saying is we need ... for instance, there is the Spatial Management and Land Use Act, which is not under us. It is a planning law. It is not a law that is implemented by the National Planning Commission or the Department of Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation. That is why we even published recently, for public comment, a Bill that seeks to do that - to bring planning in a coordinated and integrated fashion. That Bill went out for comment. We are now looking at it again after the public comment. I don't know whether you saw it or not. I am just saying it is not that you are not aware; it is the legal system we have. That is why that Bill is being crafted now to make sure there is alignment of planning by law. [Interjections.]

Having said that, government has not failed the people. This government has had a lot of successes since 1994. This government has tried to address a lot of the things that the party that was a precursor to the DA implemented to oppress and suppress for 300 years.

Mr W F FABER: Three hundred years of suppressed people! We are much older than that!

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 15 AUGUST 2018

Page: 46

The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY: PLANNING, MONITORING AND EVALUATION:
Yes, since 1652.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Order, hon members!

The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY: PLANNING, MONITORING AND EVALUATION:
The ANC is trying to address problems that started in 1652 with the arrival of the Dromedaris and the other ships that came to this country. [Interjections.] That is what the ANC is trying to address. It is a legacy of oppression, of suppression, of dispossession, that took place over hundreds of years, so you cannot say everything should have been resolved in only 24 years. That is the point I am making. Thank you. [Applause.]

Mr W F FABER: Chairperson, on a point of order: I wanted someone to give the Minister a glass of water. I don't know. She's talking about the DA that has been ruling for 300 years. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY: PLANNING, MONITORING AND EVALUATION:
No.

HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): That is not a point of order.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 15 AUGUST 2018

Page: 47

Mr W F FABER: I really must say, stick to the questions and talk about the things you are familiar with. Otherwise, keep quiet.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Faber, you are totally out of order. [Interjections.]

Ms B A ENGELBRECHT: Chairperson, we have a very big library in Parliament. I would like to suggest that the Minister goes there and reads up on our history just to make sure she knows what she is talking about. I will show her where the library is.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): That is not a point of order. Hon Engelbrecht, you know that is not a point of order.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE COUNCIL: Chair, it is exactly ... I stand to request that members are deliberately contravening provisions of the Rules of the House. It is exactly what you are questioning. Repeatedly, you have made rulings. So, can we allow the Minister to respond to the questions without any interruption? [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Your point of order is sustained. Hon Minister, we now come to Question 206 asked by the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 15 AUGUST 2018

Page: 48

hon Magwebu. Hon members, we can't be compromising the decorum of the House.

Question 206:

The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY: PLANNING, MONITORING AND EVALUATION:
Hon Chair, I will answer the question, but I am going to start where they ended. I want to say that the history of this country is known - 1652. If your library says otherwise, then it must be corrected. Secondly, the precursor of the party that ruled during apartheid is known and the successor party is the DA. [Interjections.] If you are a successor party or successor state, you take both assets and liabilities of that party. [Interjections.]

Let me answer the question. Ideally, the tabling of the Managing Performance Assessment Tool, MPAT ...

Mr C F B SMIT: Chairperson, on a point of order: The Minister just said now that the precursor and the follow-up party of the National Party are the DA. That was mentioned before in this House and there was a ruling about that. It is clearly false. [Interjections.] It is deliberately misleading because the DA comes from the Democratic Party, DP, and the DP comes from the Progressive Federal Party, PFP. And the PFP does not come from the National Party. [Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 15 AUGUST 2018

Page: 49

If you look for the National Party, there is a member of the National Party and there is a member of the National Party; not in the DA. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon member, can I ... Order! Order, hon members! Order! Hon members! Order, I can't have ... Hon members! Order! I have two members on their feet in the House and you are expecting me to make a ruling on a matter. [Interjections.] Can you just take your seat? Can you take your seat? Can you please take your seat? Hon Prins! Hon Prins! Hon members! Hon members, you are expecting me to make a ruling on this particular matter. May I take ... May I take ... [Interjections.] Hon members! Hon Prins! Hon Prins, please be in order!

The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY: PLANNING, MONITORING AND EVALUATION: It was the DP and the National Party that formed the DA. We were here in Parliament. I was here in Parliament when the two parties came together.

IsiXhosa:

Mabangadlali ngathi.

English:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 15 AUGUST 2018

Page: 50

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon members, you might have noticed something. [Interjections.] Order, hon members! You might have noticed that I relieved hon ... [Inaudible.] ... and you are raising a point of order on a matter that the Minister raised, whilst the House Chairperson was in the Chair. So, it will be unfair to expect me then to make a ruling on a matter that I did not follow. I therefore request the House to allow me an opportunity to consult Hansard and then come back to the House with a ruling on the matter.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE NCOP: Chair, on a point of order: We fully agree that you must refer to Hansard, but I hear ...

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon members, order! Hon Smit! Hon Cathy! I am now going to call you by name! I am now going to call you by name! You leave me with no option, which is not good.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE NCOP: Chair, I equally submit that you should further look into the conduct of the member that was calling for a point of order. The member was further elaborating whilst putting a question and making an insinuation in the House, referring to other members. We could not allow space for a presiding officer to make a ruling.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 15 AUGUST 2018

Page: 51

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon Cathy, please. I don't have to say please. [Interjections.] Hon members, are you going to allow the hon Minister to conclude her response? Essack! Essack! Hon Essack! You should not preside by default. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY: PLANNING, MONITORING AND EVALUATION: Chair,...

IsiZulu:

Ngizalwa ngabazali ababili.

English:

I have two parents. One is a Dlamini and one is a Ndlela. They both produced me. The DA is a product of the DP and the National Party. [Applause.] I was in Parliament when it happened. I was a Member of Parliament. Thank you.

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: On what point of order are you rising, hon member?

Mr C HATTINGH: Hon Chair, on a point of order: You said that the Chair had to leave the Chair and you did not know what was going on because you did not Chair. The whole incident started by

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 15 AUGUST 2018

Page: 52

inflammatory remarks by the Minister and now you allow her to continue.

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon member, I made a ruling earlier ...

Mr C HATTINGH: She does not obey your ruling.

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: No, listen to me. Take your seat, hon member.

Mr C HATTINGH: She did not take her seat. She must take her seat.

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Okay fine. Hon members, I am not going to revert back to that decision. The decision has been taken.

I am going to consult Hansard to see exactly what was said.

[Interjections.] No, I don't know on what basis. Hon Oliphant! Hon Mthethwa! Hon members, can you please behave? Can you please behave?

I will come back ... Hon Cathy, let this be the last warning.

Honestly, I am serious. This is the last warning, hon Cathy. Let us just behave, please.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 15 AUGUST 2018

Page: 53

Mr M M CHABANGU: Chairperson, on a point of order: We are here for the business of representing our people and our provinces. Adults, especially from Natal are behaving like small children today. I don't know why. You keep on saying Cathy, Cathy and the other Chairperson was also saying that and you look at hon Mthethwa. They are adults but they are behaving like small children. Is it because they see the Minister? Let us behave properly and do the business that we came here for. Thank you.

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: I need to make a ruling on that matter. There is no way that we can refer to other members as children in this august House. We are not children and therefore, I would request you to withdraw that part of saying that members behave like children. Can you just withdraw that part?

Mr M M CHABANGU: I have never said ... You must listen attentively, Chairperson.

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: I heard what you said.

Mr M M CHABANGU: I said ... Listen to me. Listening is a skill. I said they are behaving like children. I did not say that they are children.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 15 AUGUST 2018

Page: 54

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: By insinuation, what does it mean?

Mr M M CHABANGU: Like. It is a metaphor.

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: No, no, no. You referred ...

Mr M M CHABANGU: It is a figure of speech.

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon member, I am not going to debate with you on this matter.

Mr M M CHABANGU: No, I am telling you, Chairperson.

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: The minute there is an insinuation that members behave, it may mean...

Mr M M CHABANGU: Listen.

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: I am ordering you to withdraw that part of referring to other members behaving...

Mr M M CHABANGU: I have never said that.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 15 AUGUST 2018

Page: 55

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: You said that they behave like...

Mr M M CHABANGU: Like, yes.

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: I am saying that you must withdraw that part. [Interjections.]

Mr M M CHABANGU: Why should I withdraw it?

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: I explained myself.

Mr M M CHABANGU: No.

IsiXhosa:

Heyi, thula maan.

Mr M M CHABANGU: I am not representing the ... [Interjections.]

Setswana:

...nyaya, kgale le senya nako...

English:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 15 AUGUST 2018

Page: 56

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon members! Please, don't do that. Don't do that. Hon member, ...

Mr M M CHABANGU: I am listening.

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: I am ordering you to withdraw that part.

Mr M M CHABANGU: I withdraw. Let us do the business of the day as usual.

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon members! Hon Mthethwa, can you behave, please?

Mr C J DE BEER: Chairperson, hon Minister thank you for your adequate reply. Looking at the country of Malaysia that implemented a programme called Big Fast Results that is, in principle, based on this programme that is running in government. How widely is the Management Performance Assessment Tool being used in government and the public service to enhance service delivery? Thank you.

The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY: PLANNING, MONITORING AND EVALUATION:
I was just about to answer that. I was answering that question when

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 15 AUGUST 2018

Page: 57

this whole ... [Interjections.] The answer is, ideally the tabling of the Management Performance Assessment Tool results should be before the Budget Review and Recommendations Report, but due to challenges and the elaborate consultation process, the Department of Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation has, in the past, not been able to table the MPAT findings in time for the Budget Review and Recommendations Report.

However, we are reviewing these processes and we are trying to shorten them, so that the MPAT system can assist and be more useful to the monitoring. So, we are trying to make sure that, in future, the results are tabled before the Budget Review and Recommendations Report processes.

The DPME has reviewed the MPAT and processes, so as to endeavour to present its results within a reasonably short time, in order to enhance the Budget Review process. Thank you.

Mr L V MAGWEBU: Chairperson, as a disciplined Member of Parliament, I remained quiet when there was chaos.

IsiXhosa:

Kodwa ke mandibulele Mphathiswa.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 15 AUGUST 2018

Page: 58

English:

As you have said, ideally and correctly so, this should be exactly the way things should be, as I have raised the question. You have given us a commitment that your department is currently reviewing the process to correct this matter. Can you give us a sense when this Budget Review process will be completed? The sooner it is completed, the more it is putting us on track, because these issues finally impact on service delivery. If they are not corrected, we continue to work haphazardly, shooting in the dark and then there is a collapse in service delivery and other areas. As a country, we know that we are grappling with those problems.

IsiXhosa:

Ndiyabulela Mphathiswa kwaye neNdlu mayizole ngolu hlobo izole ngalo.

The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY: PLANNING, MONITORING AND EVALUATION:
I agree with you. I am hoping that by the time we do the next Budget Review, we would have completed. That is my hope. We will try by all means to get to the next Budget Review cycle with these processes completed. Thank you.

Question 13:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 15 AUGUST 2018

Page: 59

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Then, we will proceed to Question 13, which was a request for a written reply and because of the 10-day Rule; we will then allow the Minister to respond to the question because after the 10 days the question then gets ...

[Inaudible.]

The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY: PLANNING, MONITORING AND EVALUATION: Yes, thank you, I apologise, we sent it late. I will answer it. Yes, the answer is yes, Operation Phakisa remains a strategic programme on account of it seeking to accelerate delivery in key and catalytic sectors of our economy and human development. The South African government and the targeted sector players remain committed to mobilising resources from both the public and the private sector for the implementation of Operation Phakisa.

To date, delivery laboratories have been convened focussing on unlocking economic potential of the South African's ocean - the ocean economy, the ideal clinic realisation and maintenance, leveraging the use of ICT in education, galvanising growth, investment and employment creation along the mining value chain and mining related communities, biodiversity, including bioprospecting and wildlife, agriculture and land reform, as well as chemicals and waste economy.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 15 AUGUST 2018

Page: 60

In convening these labs, the oceans economy project has already attracted over R28,7 billion from both the private and the public sector. In the mining sector, R300 million has been invested from both the private and public sector. The biodiversity project of Operation Phakisa has already attracted around R250 million of investments while two million hectares of land has been mapped for transformation in the wildlife industry. Thank you.

Mr C F B SMIT: Hon Minister, in light of the answer you have just given, when we look at the environmental impact, the depleting fish stocks, the instability in our economy, what are your plans to make sure that we create jobs within this specific industry and how do you plan to make sure that this is sustainable because it has a big impact on our environmental ecosystem as well, when we look at oil and gas exploration, which is a big part of Operation Phakisa and the oceans economy? Thank you.

The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY: PLANNING, MONITORING AND EVALUATION: I think the hon member is correct. It's very important to make sure that the fish stock is sustainable in our oceans, especially. Within Operation Phakisa, there are a number of areas that have been zoned as ocean protected zones, where there will be no activities to allow the spooning of different species of fish that is found in South

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 15 AUGUST 2018

Page: 61

Africa. They range from the west coast right up to almost Kosi bay. There are a number of them.

They get negotiated between all of us, including mining. Once there is an agreement, that zone is then protected and will not be mined. Some of them are still under discussion between the Department of Minerals and Energy and the Phakisa as a whole. So, that is being taken care of through those to make sure that there is sustainability.

But, we are also trying to ensure that it is not only fish from the ocean but that they are viable and sustainable projects on aquaculture where we can breed fish outside the ocean - on land. So, there are licences that are being offered to people who want to do that and there is training that is done to ensure that we have a larger stock of fish coming from aquaculture rather than just wild fish from the ocean. Thank you.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE NCOP: Deputy Chair, thanks to the Minister for sharing with us the strategic importance of the Operation Phakisa intervention. Minister, studies reveals that countries which have a culture of long-term planning and discipline of action stand a greater chance to succeed in their social and economic

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 15 AUGUST 2018

Page: 62

transformation programme. Is our country engaging in deliberate collaboration with other developing countries? Can the Minister share progress in this regard? Thanks.

The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY: PLANNING, MONITORING AND EVALUATION:

I thank you very much, hon member. It is true what you are saying. It is in part of what motivated government in the first place to have the National Development Plan, which is a long-term plan. It was also through looking and collaborating with other countries that have long-term plans. If you look at Operation Phakisa, it was also informed by collaboration with Malaysia, which has a similar programme that has actually succeeded quite well.

We are also collaborating with other countries that have long-term planning. China is one of them. Even in Africa, there are countries that have long-term plans and good implementation. Rwanda is one of them. So, there are quite a number of them and we are collaborating and learning good lessons from them - learning what to do and what not to do while they are also learning from us. Thank you.

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Thank you very much, hon Minister. So far ... Hon Smit, no, no no. [Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 15 AUGUST 2018

Page: 63

Mr C F B SMIT: Why not?

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: It is against the Rules, hon Smit.

Mr C F B SMIT: No!

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: It's only one follow-up.
[Interjections.]

Mr C F B SMIT: My apology, Deputy Chair. A point of clarity, can you please indicate in terms of which Rule you are making that ruling that I may ask only one question?

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon member, I am not going to turn this session into a Rules workshop. You know very well that in terms of our Rules, you can only make one follow-up question and the principal member who asked the question, is the first one to be allowed an opportunity to do so and then allow the four. I have given you that opportunity and this was a follow-up question. Therefore, I am indicating that I can't see any other hand. Therefore, I take it that these were the only two hands of follow-up questions. Now, we proceed to the next question.

WEDNESDAY, 15 AUGUST 2018

Page: 64

Question 14:

The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY: PLANNING, MONITORING AND EVALUATION:

The Department of Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation has not awarded any tender contracts to any of the mentioned companies in the past five years. Thank you.

Mr F ESSACK: Chairperson, the reply was received in writing at 12:10 this afternoon.

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: So, you are happy with the response?

Mr F ESSACK: Yes Sir.

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon members, you would note that the other questions are relevant to the Minister of Women in the Presidency and when we started the session, the apology of the Minister was then submitted and presented to the House and we all agreed and accepted that apology. I don't know why you jumping, I have not thanked the Minister and excuse her from the House. Thank you very much Minister for being with us. [Applause.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 15 AUGUST 2018

Page: 65

(Draft Resolution)

Mr M RAYI: Hon Deputy Chair, I move without notice:

That the Council -

- (1) notes and debates the negative impact that the high cost of data services has on ordinary South Africans, especially workers, youth, students and women;
- (2) further notes that the high cost of data stifles the growth and development of small businesses and it has made it proceed impossible for the majority of our people to enjoy the benefits of the digital economy in our democracy;
- (3) acknowledging that the lowering of the cost of data will be a catalyst for economic growth and contributes to economic growth and job creation; and
- (4) encourages government to take urgent steps to ensure full implementation of all policies and regulations in support of #DataMustFall campaign, working together with the regulator Icasa and all mobile operators in our country.

I thank you.

SOUTH AFRICAN UNEMPLOYMENT RATE INCREASED TO 27,2%

(Draft Resolution)

Mr L V MAGWEBU: Hon Deputy Chair, I move without notice:

That the Council -

- (1) notes that according to the Statistics SA Quarterly Labour Force Survey 2018, the unemployment rate in South Africa has now increased to 27,2% in the second quarter of 2018 from 26,7% in the first quarter, therefore leaving more than 10 million South Africans unemployed;
- (2) debates this increase in high unemployment rate; and
- (3) further debates how to turn the tide by growing our economy and to create jobs for fellow South Africans that they so desperately need.

I so move.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 15 AUGUST 2018

Page: 67

APPLAUD OF INDEPENDENT JUDICIARY IN THE SHAUN ABRAHAMS' JUDGEMENT

(Draft Resolution)

Mr O S TERBLANCHE: Hon Deputy Chair, I move without notice:

That this Council -

- (1) celebrates the independence of our judiciary once again as manifested in the Shaun Abrahams' judgement on Monday 13 August 2018 by the Constitutional Court; and
- (2) acknowledging the damaging results that invalidate an unconstitutional appointment of Mr Abrahams by the former state president Jacob Zuma has on our justice system where the former used his executive power to escape prosecution from his alleged criminal deeds.

I so move.

UNVEILING OF THE NELSON MANDELA STATUE AT CITY OF CAPE TOWN HALL

(Draft Resolution)

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 15 AUGUST 2018

Page: 68

Ms T G MPAMBO-SIBHUKWANA: Hon Deputy Chair, I move without notice:

That this Council -

(1) notes the unveiling of the Nelson Mandela statue at the City of Cape Town Hall on 24 July 2018;

(2) Tata Madiba delivered his first public speech from the City of Cape Town Hall before the approximately 250 000 from all walks of life following his release from prison in 1990;

(3) notes that this statue is to remind us all of the following Tata Madiba's words:

Never, never and never again shall it be that this beautiful land will again experience the oppression of one by another.

(4) this is how we should move South Africa forward as one nation with one future.

I so move.

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon members, is there an objection to the motion? Well, in the presence of an objection therefore the motion shall become a notice of a motion.

Mr F ESSACK: Did she just object to that? And she calls herself an ANC member!

FARMER FOUND GUILTY OF MURDERING WORKER

(Draft Resolution)

Mr D L XIMBI: Hon Deputy Chair, I move without notice:

That this Council -

- (1) notes that a Lutzville farmer has been found guilty of murdering Adam Pieterse, a farm worker, by beating him with a spade, dragging him with a quad bike and then burying him behind his father's smallholding;
- (2) further notes that Martin Visser, who owns the Dassiehoek farm had pleaded not guilty to charges of murder, assault

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 15 AUGUST 2018

Page: 70

with intent to inflict grievous bodily harm and four charges of common assault to three other farm workers;

(3) also notes that the state's two main witnesses were the deceased's friends Patrick Klein and Frans Klaase, who were forced by the farmer to help dispose of the body; and

(4) thanks all those that were involved in ensuring that the murderer of Pieterse faces the full might of the law.

I so move Chairperson.

Motion agreed to in accordance with section 65 of the Constitution.

OUTSTANDING WORK OF SOUTHERN AFRICAN DEVELOPMENT COMMUNITY

(Draft Resolution)

Dr H E MATEME: Deputy Chairperson, I move without notice:

That the Council –

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 15 AUGUST 2018

Page: 71

- (1) notes and welcomes the appreciation expressed by President Cyril Matamela Ramaphosa on the outstanding work of the Southern African Development Community, SADC, Parliamentary Forum in entrenching democracy in the SADC region;
- (2) further notes that President Ramaphosa met a high-level delegation of the SADC Parliamentary Forum, PF, composed of Speakers of National Assemblies in four of the 16 SADC member states at Mahlamba Ndlopfu in Pretoria; and
- (3) takes this opportunity to join the President in expressing appreciation for their tireless efforts in the transformation of the SADC Parliamentary Forum into a SADC parliament, in an effort to involve SADC parliamentarians in regional integration.

GROWTH OF EMPLOYMENT RATE IN DA-LED MUNICIPALITIES

(Draft Resolution)

Ms B A ENGELBRECHT: Deputy Chairperson, I move without notice:

That the Council –

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 15 AUGUST 2018

Page: 72

- (1) notes that while the national expanded unemployment rate grew to 37,2%, the DA-led City of Johannesburg changed that trend, by producing 109 000 new jobs in 2018 and reduced the expanded unemployment rate for Johannesburg from 32,3% to 30,8%;
- (2) further notes that where the DA is in government, we make a difference, by creating opportunities and reducing the red tape to stimulate and increase business confidence; and
- (3) notices that the DA-led municipalities improve the quality of our people's lives by creating more jobs and creating a better South Africa for all.

IDEOLOGICAL CONFUSION ON BROAD-BASED BLACK ECONOMIC EMPOWERMENT

(Draft Resolution)

Mr D M MONAKEDI: Deputy Chairperson, I move without notice:

That the Council –

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 15 AUGUST 2018

Page: 73

- (1) notes with utmost concern the DA's ideological confusion on the Broad-Based Black Economic Empowerment, B-BBEE, policy, which continues to play itself out in the public domain;
- (2) further notes that the DA's position and active resistance to the BBEE continues to expose the ideological posture and policy leaning of the DA, as a party that continues to harbour deep-seated resistance to economic transformation and opportunities to the majority of South Africans, especially blacks; and
- (3) takes this opportunity to reaffirm ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon Monakedi, do you mind if you can take your seat. I see the hon Essack is on his feet. On what basis?

Mr F ESSACK: Hon Deputy Chairperson, on a point of order. My point of order is: Deputy Chairperson, I want to check through you: Was the hon Monakedi saying that he is ideologically confused. Is that what he said?

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: That the DA. He said the DA.

Mr D M MONAKEDI: No, I am referring to the DA. The last point is:

- (3) we are moving this Council to also agree and take this opportunity to reaffirm its support for the B-BBEE as a critical policy instrument aimed at redressing past economic injustices and inequalities.

PASSING AWAY OF MAMA ZONDENI SOBUKWE

(Draft Resolution)

Mr J M MTHETHWA: Deputy Chairperson, I move without notice:

That the Council –

- (1) notes with profound sadness and a great sense of loss the passing away of Mama Zondeni Sobukwe this morning at the age of 91;
- (2) further notes that Mama Zondeni Sobukwe was married to the late apartheid activist and founder of the PAC, Robert Mangaliso Sobukwe in 1954;

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 15 AUGUST 2018

Page: 75

- (3) also notes that Mama Zondeni Sobukwe who was a struggle stalwart in her own right, endured pain, rejection and immense suffering of the heavy-handed racist apartheid regime which she overtly challenged through her writings, demanding the release of her husband who was incarcerated by the illegitimate regime;
- (4) further notes that Mama Zondeni Sobukwe was bestowed with the National Order of Luthuli for her antiapartheid activism by President Cyril Matamela Ramaphosa for her indelible contribution to the struggle for democracy and human rights in our country; and
- (5) takes this opportunity to express its heartfelt condolences to the family of Mama Zondeni Sobukwe, her friends and the PAC.

PASSING AWAY OF PROF BONGANI MAYOSI

(Draft Resolution)

Ms L C DLAMINI: Deputy Chairperson, I move without notice:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 15 AUGUST 2018

Page: 76

That the Council –

- (1) notes with sadness the passing away of the world renowned South African cardiologist, Prof Bongani Mayosi on Friday 27 July;
- (2) further notes that Prof Mayosi who was a loving husband and father, a pioneering researcher who discovered the gene that causes heart attack, a brilliant and much loved dean, passed away at the age of 51 years;
- (3) also notes that Prof Mayosi has been advising Health Minister, Dr Motsoaledi since 2011 on the policy and strategy for health research in his capacity as the National Health Research Committee Chairperson; and
- (4) send our heartfelt condolences to his family, friends and colleagues.

PASSING AWAY OF PROF SAMIR AMIN

(Draft Resolution)

Mr M T MHLANGA: Deputy Chairperson, I move without notice:

That the Council –

- (1) notes with profound sadness and a great sense of loss the passing away of the great African anti-imperialist intellect Prof Samir Amin who suddenly died on Sunday, 12 August 2018, at the age of 86;
- (2) further notes that Samir Amin was a fearless, anticolonial fighter who inspired generations of progressive activists as an Egyptian-French Marxian economist who authored critical scholarship on alternative and radical development perspectives for the Third World; and
- (3) takes this opportunity to pass its deepest condolences to the family of Prof Samir Amin, friends and comrades all over the world.

ANC EMPLOYEE INVOLVED IN HEIST

(Draft Resolution)

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 15 AUGUST 2018

Page: 78

Mr M M CHABANGU: Chair, on behalf of the EFF, I hereby move without notice that the Council:

- (1) notes the car of the Free State Deputy Chairperson of the ANC was found being involved in the heist; and
- (2) further notes that there are two other culprits who are stealing money from the poor of the poorest of South Africans after the arrest of the Luthuli House employee.

I so move.

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES: Is there any objection to the motion? [Interjections.]

Ms B T MATHEVULA: [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES: In the presence of the objection ... [Interjections.] Order! Order! In the presence of the objection, therefore the motion shall read as a notice.

Ms B T MATHEVULA: [Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 15 AUGUST 2018

Page: 79

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES: Hon Mathevula, I heard you. Please, can you withdraw that? I think that members are thieves, bayantshontsha. [Interjections.] I didn't hear that bayabulala [they kill.]

Ms B T MATHEVULA: Which members, Chair?

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES: You generalised and if you generalise it means that this august House sits with all these members - they are all thieves.

Ms B T MATHEVULA: No, Chair, I didn't.

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES: No, I heard you. I don't have to consult Hansard.

Ms B T MATHEVULA: It was Cathy who was saying the ANC members are doing heist. I wasn't me.

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES: Hon Mathevula can you withdraw that by referring to members of this august House as thieves.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 15 AUGUST 2018

Page: 80

Ms DLAMINI: How can you do that? Why would you lie about me? Why do you this to me?

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES: Hon Cathy, I am busy ordering a member to deal with a particular issue that I heard. That is why I looked at her. Just hold the point of order - hold it. I am giving an order to a member. Can you please withdraw that with a greatest of respect?

Ms B T MATHEVULA: I withdraw.

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES: I made a ruling on a matter. If it is on a matter that I have just ruled on, I am not going to allow you. [Interjections.] No, I have already ruled on the matter. I am not going to allow you. Hon Julius, is it a different matter?

Mr J W W JULIUS: You are given.

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES: Is it a different matter?

Mr J W W JULIUS: Different matter?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 15 AUGUST 2018

Page: 81

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES: Yes.

Mr J W W JULIUS: No, no, no, it is ... you know it is always advisable, Chairperson, ... now days I am giving you very excellent advice. If you can indulge, Deputy Chairperson, there was a ruling last time by the Chairperson that if we generalise and we don't say this one, that one or call a member by the name. [Interjections.] Then, it was allowed as said it was part of political debate. It's not casting aspersion on any member as the rule states. So, it was a generalisation. I don't want us every time to jump up and down with another rule.

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES: Are you aware that I have made a ruling on the matter. Thank you very much. I have ruled on the matter. We take note on the matter you have raised, but we cannot also you our ability to insult this House by generalising. We cannot allow that.

**THE MINISTER OF EDUCATION LAUNCHED SECOND CHANCE MATRIC SUPPORT
PROGRAMME**

(Draft Resolution)

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 15 AUGUST 2018

Page: 82

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES: Chair, I move without notice that the Council:

- (1) notes and congratulate the Minister of Basic Education Mme Angie Motshekga on the second chance matric support programme;
- (2) further notes that the Minister has launched road shows that are intended to inspire young people, especially those who did not qualify for their matric certificates, renewed hope at obtaining their matric certificates;
- (3) acknowledges that through the second chance programme can also benefit those presently in grade 12 as it is designed to provide support to matric candidates to improve their matric results for further studies;
- (4) takes opportunity to welcome this programme as a very important intervention that will enable many young people to pursue their dreams and further their studies. I saw the appetite and the interest of this programme during the weekend in Botshabelo, where thousand of people showed up to take advantage and get information about this opportunity for

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 15 AUGUST 2018

Page: 83

a second chance. This intervention goes a long way in facilitating entry to job opportunities as study after study showed that it is difficult in South Africa currently in finding a job on its own, its a difficult phenomenon especially if you don't have a matric; and

(5) urges young people to seize the opportunity.

I thank you, Chair.

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES: Thank you very much, Chief Whip. Is there any objection to the motion? In the presence of the objection the motion shall then read as a notice. Hon members, that brings us to the end of our motions.

The Council adjourned at 16:14