

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 1

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

PROCEEDINGS OF THE NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

The Council met at 10:01.

The House Chairperson: Committees, Oversight, Co-operation Governance and Intergovernmental Relations took the Chair and requested members to observe a moment of silence for prayers or meditation.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon members, I have been informed that the Whippery has agreed that there will be no notices of motion or motions without notice, except for the motion on the Order Paper.

SUSPENSION OF ORAL QUESTIONS

(Draft Resolution)

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 2

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE COUNCIL: House Chair, I move the motion printed in my name on the Order Paper as follows:

That Rule 247(1), which provides that a sitting of the Council will be dedicated to oral questions, be suspended for the purpose of consideration of the Budget Vote on Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs and Report of Select Committee.

Question put: That the motion be agreed to.

IN FAVOUR: Eastern Cape, Free State, Gauteng, Limpopo, Mpumalanga, Northern Cape, North West, Western Cape.

Motion accordingly agreed to in accordance with section 65 of the Constitution.

APPROPRIATION BILL: Policy debate on Budget Vote No 4

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE COUNCIL

APPROPRIATION BILL

Policy debate on Budget Vote No 4 - Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 3

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS:
Chairperson, members of NCOP, Chairperson of the national house of
traditional leaders, hon members, representative of Salga, members
of the Department of Co-operative Governance and Traditional
Affairs, good morning to you all.

In the state of the nation address in February, President Cyril
Ramaphosa rallied the nation behind a New Dawn. The credo of the New
Dawn has been encapsulated in the compelling lyrics of the song,
Thuma Mina - Send Me by Hugh Masekela. At COGTA, we are saying send
me to go and make a difference in my ward, in my community, in my
municipality, my department and in my country.

It is in that spirit that we also celebrate the centenary of our
icons President Nelson Mandela and hon Albertina Sisulu this year,
whose legacy inspires us to work harder each day, to build better
communities.

The local government sphere is the most important sphere because of
its proximity to the people. Everything happens in a municipality
and in a ward. For this reason, we are working hard to build stable,
well-functioning municipalities, with the support of communities and

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 4

every sector of society, as we believe that local government is everybody's business.

A well-functioning municipality is characterised by stability. It has functional council and oversight structures, a consistent spending of capital budgets, unqualified audit outcomes and good financial management. It provides services to the people in an efficient and professional manner, putting people first, in line with the Batho Pele principles.

Functional municipalities also deliver the basics. They cut the grass on the verges of roads and streets, fix potholes, clean the streets and remove waste, fix water leaks and repair damaged sewerage systems and street lights. The municipalities should also be able to detect community concerns before the frustration levels explode into violent protests.

At the national level, COGTA is exploring the acquisition of ICT capability and an early warning system dashboard. This ICT capability will improve our effectiveness in supporting early interventions. So, we don't have to deal with the explosion of protests.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 5

Statistics SA released the 2017 non-financial census of municipalities earlier this month. The report indicates an increase in the provision of some services, such as solid waste management and the provision of water and electricity during 2016 and 2017; which is encouraging because this information indicates that these services are being provided to by many municipalities.

However, the performance of the majority of the municipalities remains below expectations. Seven percent of the country's municipalities are classified as well-functioning, 31% are reasonably functional, and 31% are almost dysfunctional while the remaining 31% is dysfunctional.

We have decided to intervene decisively to address this state of affairs. We have identified 87 distressed and dysfunctional municipalities for intervention, with programmes clustered into three main critical areas; namely, the area of governance and administration; the area of financial management, and then infrastructure and service delivery.

Some of the problems of municipalities are structural. The advent of wall to wall municipalities extended service delivery to previously

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 6

neglected communities at the cost of the fiscus beyond the previously demarcated municipalities.

The services were extended beyond the previous boundaries, which were defined in terms of a concrete rates base that enabled them to raise their own revenue.

Some of the municipalities will struggle to be viable, and creative methods will need to be utilised such as local economic development initiatives tapping on resources such as industrial parks and special economic zones to create revenue streams for those nonviable municipalities.

We are also looking at opportunities created by the special infrastructure projects under the auspices of the Presidential Infrastructure Co-ordinating Commission.

Another major project that will change the face of rural areas and our municipalities in these areas is the agrarian revolution. The plan is to utilise the communal land in the hands of traditional leaders and rural communities. This matter has received active support from the National House of Traditional Leaders.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 7

Through the programme, traditional leaders will participate at the centre of economic development at district level. They will identify land for cultivation, drive ploughing and harvest programmes and engage in building livestock herds and create markets for the people in rural areas. The National House of Traditional Leaders and the Department of Traditional Affairs are currently in the process of identifying more land that can be used for the programme.

Many of our dysfunctional municipalities are facing problems created by poor management and lack of relevant qualifications for key positions. The right people with the right qualifications must be appointed to key positions in municipalities. We will not compromise on that aspect. During the 2017-18 financial years, 423 appointments were concluded with competent and suitably qualified senior managers.

A total of 95 corrective actions were taken to enforce compliance where appointments were made in contravention of the Municipal Systems Act and its Regulations.

Clean governance is also an imperative for COGTA. Since the amendment of the Municipal Systems Act in 2011, a total of 1651

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 8

municipal employees were dismissed for misconduct, and 130 resigned prior to the finalisation of the disciplinary proceedings.

A total of 1 120 candidates were screened by the department to advise as to whether the shortlisted candidates appear on the record of staff dismissed and of staff members who resigned prior to the finalisation of disciplinary proceedings. We have developed a database that will ensure the blacklisting of any manager who is dishonourably discharged from service in any municipality in the country.

As part of building a strong institutional capacity, functional oversight committees such as Audit Committees and Municipal Public Accounts Committees are in place and are fully operational. We are also promoting the leadership and institutionalisation of the Code of Conduct for Councillors and Officials in order to promote accountability and consequence management.

The people must feel that their elected representatives are here to serve them, using ward committees and the Municipal Community Complaints Management System. Progress is being made in this regard.

Many municipalities have been unable to spend the Municipal

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 9

Infrastructure Grant, and this means people cannot obtain the services they need such as water or roads and electricity. There are 226 municipalities in the country that are receiving the Municipal Infrastructure Grant funds.

Over the MTEF period, national government has made an allocation of R47,6 billion and R16 billion is allocated for 2017-18 financial year, that is the one that we are just concluding now.

In the past five years, since 2012-13, a total of R3,4 billion in MIG transfers was stopped and was reallocated from underspending municipalities to better spending municipalities.

This is not ideal as it has an inadvertent consequence of penalising municipalities with a lower capacity and hence punishing the poorer communities. This cannot continue, rather alternatives must be found to support service delivery to poorer communities.

One of the reasons for the failure to spend MIG funds is the systemic problem of skills shortage. Only 55 out of the country's 257 municipalities have qualified engineers to assist in the rolling out of infrastructure projects.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 10

We have decided to intervene immediately. Fifty five municipalities have been identified for the intervention, 17 of which had their Infrastructure Grant transfers stopped, at least, three times in the past five years while 18 had their transfers stopped, at least, twice in the same period. Sixteen technical support teams from our Municipal Infrastructure Support Agent have been established and deployed to support the first group of 39 municipalities.

The intervention began in last month, May 2018 and will continue up to the end of April 2021. The remainder of the municipalities will be covered by December 2018 as Municipal Infrastructure Support Agent, MISA, augments its current capacity. Such MISA interventions have become visible in the North West province where Cabinet has decided to invoke Section 100(1) of the Constitution due to several governance challenges observed in the province.

Building on the work that was started last year in October when the former Minister of COGTA visited the North West, I also visited the North West province to determine what support and interventions we can undertake. We are providing support in 12 priority municipalities together with the National Treasury. And I have got the list of those - I will not go through them just now, but on the written text we will circulate it to the members.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 11

The municipalities are facing numerous service delivery challenges and an allocation of about R373 million is required to stabilise and improve service delivery on the immediate, and in particular the provision of water and sanitation.

The community of Extension 3 in Mamusa spent more than three years without potable water, which is one example of the hardships that our people face. And a number of them actually have got problems of sewerage spillages have also become hazardous to the communities.

Municipal Infrastructure Support Agent has deployed 17 Engineers in North West last month. We also acknowledge the contribution by the South African National Defence which deployed three engineers, five honey suckers and 40 plumbers to fix sewerage problems at Ditsobotla local municipality on the 8th of June, working with MISA engineers.

We are determined to find solutions to the infrastructure problems that make life difficult for our people. We will prioritise the fixing of sewerage systems in Mahikeng, Madibeng, Mamusa, Tswaing and Ratlou in North West - and this is in the immediate. The rest of the support will be going for the rest of the province.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 12

Last month I visited the Eastern Cape and our visit focused on 12 municipalities that are distressed and need urgent intervention and development of action plans. These are Mngquma, Amahlati, Raymond Mhlaba, Inxuba Yethemba, Enoch Mgijima, Walter Sisulu, Makana, Dr Beyers Naude, Matatiele, Mbizana, Port St Johns and King Sabata Dalindyebo.

We are establishing intervention teams comprising Cogta and the National Treasury to begin intensive work with the 12 Eastern Cape municipalities.

The Free State Province is also facing challenges. Tomorrow on 22 June, we shall visit Mangaung to work with the provincial government to see what can be done to support Mangaung Metropolitan Municipality which is distressed and dysfunctional, and there are also nine other municipalities in similar circumstances; such as Mafube, Masilonyana, Maluti-A-Phofung, Kopanong, Letsemeng, Mantsopa, Nketoana, Tokologo, and Mohokare

The purpose of the visit is to identify and agree on critical and priority challenges for Ministerial intervention. On the question of financial management, the Auditor-General released his municipal audit report recently which demonstrated a regression in many areas.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 13

We welcome the fact that 33 of those municipalities received an unqualified audit opinion with no findings in the period 2016-17. While this number remains very low, it is encouraging that 145 or 56% of the municipal audit outcomes are classified as unqualified. There are municipalities that do get things right and become exemplary to others.

As part of our turnaround strategy, a strong focus will be paid to reversing these negative outcomes. No disclaimers will be tolerated. All interventions in municipalities must show improvements and a reversal of negative audit outcomes - we have given them 12 months to do that.

On Tuesday this week, 19 June, I met the 14 municipalities that invested money with VBS Mutual Bank. About R1,5 billion was deposited into the bank by the municipalities from North West, Limpopo and Gauteng Provinces. I met with the Mayors on Tuesday. We have urged the provincial COGTA departments and the affected Municipalities to work on recovery plans to augment possible service delivery disruptions due to the budget shortfall as a result of loss of investment.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 14

All municipalities are expected to report to COGTA on the issues around the finances and their impact on service delivery within a month. The South African Reserve Bank is doing forensic investigating the matter. We have already contacted the auditor-general and the meeting between Treasury, Cogta and the Reserve bank and the auditor-general will sit together and look into the approach of how this problem will be dealt with by the auditor-general.

The fourth aspect requiring more attention in local government is the impact of the local political environment on municipal governance. Political infighting within organisations, undue political interference in governance and administration as well as unstable political coalitions in some areas seriously affects governance.

We are also seriously concerned about conflicts that we often observe among public representatives. KwaZulu-Natal has borne the brunt of the killing of councillors and other leaders.

The department of co-operative governance is also simplified revenue plan project at 42 selected municipalities piloting. With regards to the councillor killings and the violence, we are actually arranging a meeting with the justice and crime prevention cluster to be able

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 15

to go through what is it that we need to do to secure councillors and ensure that investigations are done to uproot corruption as the base of the problems as we see it.

We are therefore going to be dealing with the issues of simplified revenue plan project in those 42 selected municipalities and we build from there to grow this in all the municipalities. And here we want them to ensure that they have a credible budget system, proper debt collection system and so on.

Other critical challenges include the R10 billion debts that the municipalities owe to Eskom and also to water boards. I met ten highly indebted municipalities here in Cape Town ahead of their presentations to the Standing Committee on Public Accounts last week. We also made a presentation ourselves to Scopa as the Inter-Ministerial Task Team on Electricity Reticulation and Distribution and assured Parliament that this critical matter is being attended to.

We have already made proposals of what solutions we see in this matter.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 16

Municipalities are also owed R139 billion for municipal services, which then makes it difficult for them to pay Eskom, water boards and other debtors.

I have established an Advisory Panel to co-ordinate and help all parties to work closely together to find lasting solutions. We have also undertaken as government to persuade Eskom to avoid the discontinuation of electricity supply to municipalities with debt as that tends to punish the innocent, including those who have paid for electricity. We will return to Parliament in September to report back. But I am positive that we will be able to find a solution.

I will lead MECs responsible for local government, as I said, to meet with those Ministers in the Justice, Crime Prevention Security system. We also urge our communities to report the perpetrators to the police so that we can put a stop to these despicable actions.

On disaster management, I announced last week that I would not renew the national state of disaster that had been declared on 13 March 2018, which had lapsed in terms of the legislation on 13 June, as assessments by the National Joint Drought Co-ordinating Committee last month had indicated that the acute phase of the drought in the Western Cape, Eastern Cape, Northern Cape and some smaller pockets

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 17

in the country was ending and was now are entering the resilience building phase.

Since the March declaration, the respective spheres of government accessed more than R433 million to implement the augmentation and other immediate relief projects.

The Community Work Programme, CWP, which is designed to alleviate poverty through the provision of work opportunities for poor and unemployed people, has provided more than 700 000 work opportunities over the MTEF period.

The programme has a footprint in all local and metropolitan municipalities and is being implemented in 226 sites. This programme work cuts across key sectors such as the environment, social, health, education, agriculture and infrastructure. The work done enhances the quality of life of many in beneficiary communities.

During his official visit to COGTA offices on the 10th of May, the President directed us to lead the charge around integrated urban development and to decisively dismantle the legacy of apartheid spatial planning.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 18

Through our Integrated Urban Development Framework, we will ensure that, as part of their spatial development frameworks, municipalities identify strategically located land that is required to transform the apartheid spatial patterns, boost economic growth and provide opportunities to our communities. We continue to provide support to our traditional leaders through the Department of Traditional Affairs.

This department is addressing the concerns of traditional leaders about the tools of trade, such as salaries, transport, security as well as support staff. We are also looking into the refurbishment of traditional councils and courts. Discussions are also taking place with the department of co-operative governance and SALGA on best options for participation of traditional leaders in municipalities.

We have tabled three Bills in Parliament, namely, the Traditional and Khoi-San Leadership Bill, the Traditional Leadership and Governance Framework Amendment Bill and the Customary Initiation Bill, in order to address gaps in legislation in our sector. And we will continue to engage with traditional leaders on these issues.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 19

We also call upon municipalities to shape up and improve the way they work; the people must also play their role. We need to clean our towns, cities and villages.

We also appeal to all consumers to pay their municipal bills. Municipalities are struggling in part due to the culture of non-payment for services by households and by the private sector and government departments. This culture must be eradicated. And this forms part of our response to the issue of nonpayment to Eskom and water boards because we think that a comprehensive programme is needed to mobilise government and society in the private sector to rebuild that culture of payment for services.

Local government is everybody's business. We shall continue to work with provincial and local government, the business community, traditional leaders, religious leaders and other sectors of society in building efficient and functional municipalities.

We are inspired by President Mandela's words when he reminded us that challenges still remain, but that we shall overcome if we work together. He said:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 20

We understand it still, that there is no easy road to freedom. We know it well, that none of us acting alone can achieve success. We must therefore act together as a united people, for national reconciliation, for nation-building, for the birth of a new world. Let there be justice for all. Let there be peace for all. Let there be work, bread, water and salt for all.

I thank you. [Applause.]

Mr J M MTHETHWA: Chairperson of the NCOP, hon Minister, hon Chief Whip, colleagues, ladies and gentlemen. I am standing here on behalf of hon Chairperson of this select committee, Mr Mohapi who is sick and we wish him a speedy recovery.

The ANC has declared the year 2018, the year of Nelson Mandela and Mrs Sisulu to be the year of renewal, unity and jobs and this Budget respond to this revolutionary call, as a tribute to the founding fathers and mothers of our democratic nation and their sacrifice and selflessness without expecting rewards after the attainment of political freedom. We salute them and we will always endeavour to follow their example.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 21

We welcome this 2018-19 CoGTA Budget, as part of the efforts to consolidate, advance and take forward the prevailing mood of Thuma Mina, led by our President Cyril Ramaphosa, whom we know as the renowned champion and shop steward of clean, moral and ethical leadership. That is thuma mina.

The Back to Basic Programme remains an important cursor in our journey to entrenching democratic local government. As we are approaching the end of term of this 5th administration, with renewed optimism and commitment, the back to basics logic remains sound as a programme for significantly improving the performance of our municipalities. The journey has been characterised by new learning. The outstanding feature of this evolution is the effectiveness of intergovernmental relations in our country.

However, systemic and structural challenges remain a hindrance to full realisation of the developmental local government vision; uneven performance continues to characterise the state of municipalities and slow economic growth, unemployment, growing inequality, poverty, rapid urbanisation and apartheid spatial patterns still remain our developmental challenges but notwithstanding the aims and objectives of the Back to Basics Programme, Statistics SA's latest report on the non-financial census

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 22

of municipalities shows that municipalities in the Western Cape Province, reported an increase in the use of bucket toilets. The statistics were released on 04 June 2018, revealed an increase of 11,4% in the Western Cape Province.

A number of other service delivery issues come out when our people protest, such as the quality of service and our people in Khayelitsha and Nyanga, are still forced to relieve themselves in the cold. This is utterly sickening and demonstrates the DA continued racist obsession to service only its white constituency. Shame on you, the DA!

In a 2016-17 study by the Human Sciences and Research Council, HSRC, on the service delivery challenges in Nyanga, ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr.A J Nyambi): Hon members, order. Sorry hon Mthethwa. Hon Mthethwa, sorry! Hon members, it is entirely upon you not to compromise the decorum of the House. You can't be drowning the speaker at the podium, even though hackling is allowed but you can't be drowning the speaker at the podium. Hon Mthethwa, you are protected. Continue.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 23

Mr J M MTHETHWA: ... it was found that service provision to backyarders was a major challenge for the City

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Sorry hon Mthethwa let me take hon Smit. Hon Smit, why are you standing?

Mr C F B SMIT: I am standing on a point of order. I believe it is a good practice that if you are speaking from the chair that the hon speaker sit down but he is doing only now once I stood up.

HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr.A J Nyambi): I am sustaining your point of order. Continue hon Mthethwa. Next time you have to sit down.

Mr J M MTHETHWA: ... it was found that service provision to backyarders was a major challenge for the City, mainly as a result of infrastructure overloading and maintenance. This creates unfair conditions for citizens living in these conditions, who are often at the mercy of landlords and can't access benefits such as electricity and subsidies.

The researchers further found that service delivery challenges and protests often emanate from communication failures. Therefore, more collaborative spaces are needed to improve provision of basic

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 24

services. Lest we forget, Nyanga is one of the poorest townships in Cape Town and home to a marginalised community facing high unemployment and in terms of the annual crime statistics, it remains the murder capital of South Africa. Shame on you, the DA!

The Auditor-General, AG, has identified contract management and procurement as two of the main issues that municipalities are struggling to comply with in legislation. The attention was not being paid to audit action plans, poor performance planning and budgeting, resulting in unauthorised expenditure and regression of varying degree in the status of internal control. Therefore, the department must respond to municipal audit challenges comprehensively and strategically. The provincial and national governments must support municipalities to perform their legislative functions.

The provincial and national governments must also monitor the management performance, including the financial performance of municipalities. If they can all do this properly and consistently, more financial management problems could be identified and dealt with during the course of a financial year.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 25

There should be a zero tolerance on disclaimers and adverse audit opinions going forward. We need more targeted support and monitoring of the twenty seven disclaimed municipalities.

During the 2018 state of the nation, the President Ramaphosa called for corruption to be dealt with across society as a whole, including the tide of corruption in our public institutions. In responding to this call therefore, national and provincial CoGTA departments, should support and monitor municipalities in developing and implementing concrete systems and internal controls to mitigate corruption and fraud activities in the procurement processes; promote ethical, moral leadership and integrity in local government institutions and involve communities in the campaigns targeted at anti-corruptions initiatives at local level.

Another serious challenge is the level of debt that municipal councils owe Electricity Supply Commission, Eskom, and water utilities. At the end of 2017, Eskom and water utilities began disrupting supply in municipalities that had failed to pay billions.

The Eskom credit policy currently gives a credit deadline of fifteen days to municipalities, whereas municipalities have a thirty days deadline for their lenders. It is very clear that the lack of

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 26

economic basis in many municipalities is one of the key contributing factors of municipalities not being able to pay.

We need to engage deeper on this matter, since we believe that the non-payment of creditors is a symptom of deeper underlying problems and these include weaknesses in revenue collection and underinvestment in maintenance and renewal, which compromises the reliability of basic services. Too many municipalities also fail to adopt credible budgets, meaning that even if they stick to their budgeted plans, they will not be financially sustainable.

The constitutional and legislative imperatives of the Republic of South Africa have placed the institution of traditional leadership within the transformative realm of the democratic developmental state, which places the institution as a key role player in socio-economic development of traditional communities. Thus, it is impeccable that traditional leadership structures at local government level should be functional and able to discharge their functions effectively, to attain the objectives of the back to basics approach in their communities.

The Department of Traditional Affairs is therefore required to transform and support the institution to effectively contribute to

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 27

the developmental role within the democratic institutions of the country.

The Department of Traditional Affairs should also continue to enhance the status of the institution as the custodian of customary law, customs, culture and heritage of traditional communities. The fatalities from customary initiation practice in some provinces are at an alarming rate. Government should maintain a zero tolerance stance to initiation deaths and injuries.

This Budget Vote is a continuation of an honest attempt to address what the ANC-led government inherited under the apartheid dispensation and also charts a way forward as we contribute towards the development of our democratic state. The ANC remains committed to doing much more to improve the lives of all South Africans, and to contribute to the advancement of the lives of all South Africans.

In conclusion, I could not find a more appropriate way to bring this Budget Vote speech to a conclusion but to reflect on the wonderful quote by Ben Okri in his book titled Tales of Freedom, who said and I quote: "we have not yet arrived, but every point at which we stop requires a re-definition of our destination". The ANC supports this Budget. I thank you.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 28

Mr M CHETTY: Chairperson, greetings and salutations, Ministers, Deputy Ministers, members, fellow South Africans, Minister, I hope that the absence of many hon members from the ANC benches has not been due to the factional alliances which are also playing out in local municipalities hence the increase in protest actions in local government.

As the newly appointed Minister of the Department of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs, COGTA, although the legitimacy of the current cabinet has been questioned, having replaced the captured "Zupta" Des Van Rooyen, your deployment was received with relief and optimism that you will act decisively with those errant cadres that have led to the collapse of local municipalities. Sadly, hon Minister in your short stint, your strongly worded media threats are not supported by your indecisive actions.

Service delivery protests are on the increase. Section 139 interventions are on the increase, the number of dysfunctional municipalities is on the increase, corruption and malfeasance are on the increase and most importantly, political assassinations amongst councillors are on the increase. Your opening comments vindicates me that action and not words is what is needed.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 29

I Last week's court ruling against Kgetlengrivier Local Municipality is a major victory for the local ratepayers who are sick and tired of the current escalation of corruption and maladministration in local councils. This ruling will set a precedent for other equally frustrated civic organisations to now embark on this judicial route, because your predecessor, the infamous Gupta stooge Des Van Rooyen, failed to exercise his into oversight role to ensure local government was held accountable.

This ruling that has granted the local ratepayers association permission to take control of the municipalities' water and refuse system is not the first, but the second order granted by the High Court. This council owes Eskom close to R50 million.

The current increase in service delivery strikes have now resulted in the loss of lives due to the incompetency of those MEC's who chose to protect the under qualified and or irregularly appointed senior Section 56 and 57 managers. The most recent interventions in the North West province which you mentioned further vindicates our continued questioning of cadre deployment as the Inter-Ministerial Task Team in their report to the Ad Hoc committee last week highlighted in its findings, that one of the root causes for the collapse of the province as well as 20 out of 22 municipalities were

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 30

found to be dysfunctional, was due to incompetent senior management. Where was COGTA's oversight during the initial stages of collapse within these municipalities? What was your department doing?

It was the factional infighting between the "CR17 and NDZ" camps that led to the pressure of placing the North West province under administration, due to the fact the ANC failed to remove former "Premier League" Premier, Supra Mahumapelo. Even this intervention, was proven to be a political intervention rather than an administrative intervention. One cannot but assume with the resignation of the former Premier Supra, that the status quo in the Northwest will retain itself.

The Municipal Demarcation Board, and their incompetent and irresponsible merger of functioning municipalities with dysfunctional ones, has further vindicated the DA's 2015 plea, for this initiative to be put on hold. Provinces have repeatedly complained, before the Select Committee of COGTA, of the hindrance and lack of foresight by the Municipal Demarcation Board in amalgamating these municipalities, as even those previously well performing councils are now dysfunctional.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 31

Despite the DA's caution, the illegal funds placed with VBS Mutual Bank by underperforming ANC Councils is yet another crisis, which your department has failed to adequately resolve. The DA has ensured that in our municipalities we provide proper support structures to assist with planning, budgeting and implementation – which is why 8 out of the top best performing municipalities in this country are led by the DA.

What have you or your department done to address the ongoing shenanigans by certain COGTA MEC's who placed their own vested interests, ahead of South Africans? There is an old adage which states, "charity begins at home". Msunduzi – your hometown and mine Minister, - has been besieged with service delivery strikes, protest action, complaints from senior management to your office, allegations of tender fraud, and jobs for pals, amongst others. The Special Investigating Unit, SIU by former President Zuma, the council's Gobodo Report and even the KwaZulu-Natal MEC's own Report, are yet to be made public. Why? What are they hiding?

The indecisiveness by MEC Nomusa Dube to place Msunduzi Local Municipality under administration has also led to the loss of innocent lives due to the internal factional fighting in that city. She protects deployed cronies such as the Municipal Manager, Sizwe

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 32

Adolf Hadebe, who has recently been linked to an alleged voice clip which exposes his interference in an appointment outcome. This is both an irregular act and a dismissible offence.

The latest scenario is that the Msunduzi has failed to fulfil its statutory requirements regarding full council meetings. The most recent meeting had to be postponed on three occasions. The second was due to errant ANC councillors, belonging to a faction, deliberately not attending to break the quorum because the matter at hand was to discuss the suspension of the municipal manager.

The third one, was a conveniently called meeting by the Provincial Portfolio Committee of COGTA to meet with the Council. This is not the first time that the MEC has been implicated in interfering with council's sitting. The same concerns were raised prior to the dissolution of the Nquthu Local Municipality where it is alleged that the MEC had requested for the administrator to leave the full council. Minister, by the end of this debate, if again this council fails to sit, for the fourth time, I hope you will intervene with decisive measures.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 33

Another culprit is the Thaba Chweu Local Municipality, in Mpumalanga; one of the top 10 worse performing municipalities for the past four years; yet to be placed under administration. Why?

Since Monday this week, violent protests broke out in the towns of Dordrecht and Lady Frere in the Eastern Cape, protesters wearing ANC t-shirts, burned tires and closed the roads and business was shutdown for two days. This is unacceptable, Minister.

Surprisingly, Minister, with the current increase in the number of dysfunctional municipalities, your department has budgeted only R3,5 million for local government support intervention. Are you serious about resolving this crisis being experienced in local government?

The published threats against the staff of the Auditor-General, Kimi Makwetu, by officials of eThekweni and Msunduzi are still unresolved. The Auditor-General's Report, has indicated that only 33 of the municipalities had received clean audits. This is a drop from the 48 in the last financial year. And you wonder why there has been a regress in the number of councils with clean audits!

In his previous Municipal Report, Makwetu further stated that accountability continues to fail in local government in spite of the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 34

warnings raised by the Auditor-General. This has led to audit outcomes regressing whilst irregular expenditure increased. Minister, what has your department done to address these shortcomings and incompetence?

The reduction of R603 million in the Municipal Infrastructure Grant, allocation will further hinder basic service delivery to the already poor and marginalised. Yet your department allocate R2,7 billion for VIP protection and the infamous blue light brigades. Seriously, Minister how can this be right?

Your fellow comrades will come to this podium- as the hon Mthethwa has done - and criticise the DA, conjuring a far-fetched political rhetoric about the DA's governance. But let me make it clear, in the DA we terminate membership, we do not terminate lives.

Under a DA-run government our people will have sustainable jobs - not simply Expanded Public Works Programme, EPWP, - and houses that do not collapse even before residents can take ownership. We will see a caring government that places the interests of its people ahead of cronies and incompetent cadres. I thank you. [Applause.]

IsiXhosa:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 35

Mnu D L XIMBI: Sihlalo, mandikhahlele phaya kuMphathiswa, ndibulise kubathunywa abasuka ngaphandle, uMphathiswa wesebe kwiphondo laseNtshona Koloni, siyabulisa kusasa nje ngeleNkosi igama. Bawo uChetty, kuthiwa xa kunethile neemofu ziyakhonya, zigqube kuba imvula inethile. UNyombose usandula kutsho ukuba kubi eNtshona Koloni. Ngenene kubi, kuba abantu bame emigxobhozweni ntonje ooChetty baze kuma apha kuba bexakwe zizisu zabo; beqeshiwe yi-DA.

English:

Thank you very much for that. Chairperson, the Freedom Charter clearly articulates the ANC vision, approach and policy perspective on ensuring a better life for all. This is the solid foundation from which the ANC continues to advance the struggle for the liberation of blacks in general and Africans in particular towards a national democratic society to improve the quality of life of all people.

The Reconstruction and Development Programme policy guiding document ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Ximbi?

Mr D L XIMBI: Sorry, sir.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 36

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Sorry! Hon Koni, why are you standing?

Ms N P KONI: Chairperson, can we be clarified? I don't know what is happening on the Order Paper here. It is supposed to be hon Ndamase, and then hon Mathevula but Ximbi has just jumped everybody. I don't know if it is because he is the ANC member. What is happening? So, at least, if you are changing the speakers list, notify us. Don't leave us in the dark because it creates things like this. Thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon members, order! I don't need assistance. I am clarifying you now. I am presiding here being guided by the speakers list in front of me. As a presiding officer, I don't deal with issue of speakers; I am deal with what is in front of me. According to my speakers list that I have, hon Ximbi is the appropriate one, he is the one that supposed to be at the podium. So, if there is anything, you have to address it at the Whippery Forum, not at the plenary. Can you continue hon Ximbi?

Mr D L XIMBI: Thank you, Chairperson. The Reconstruction and Development Programme policy guiding document identify a people-driven process that focused on meeting the people's most immediate

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 37

needs and aspirations to achieve a non-racial, non-sexist, democratic and prosperous society.

The RDP's central objective was to attack poverty and inequality in order to improve the quality of lives of all South Africans. To achieve this, the RDP identified meeting the basic needs of the people such as jobs, land, housing, water, electricity, telecommunications, transport, a clean and healthy environment, nutrition, health care, social security and social welfare, as one of its key priorities.

In South Africa's constitutional democracy, with its three-tiered system of government, local government has a critical role to play in rebuilding local communities and environments, as the basis for a democratic, integrated, prosperous and truly non-racial society. It is the basic unit in which municipalities are tasked with delivering basic services and ensuring the development of the regions that they control.

The Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, which is grounded in the Freedom Charter, mandates local government to provide democratic and accountable government for local communities to ensure provision of services to communities in a sustainable manner;

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 38

to promote social and economic development; to promote a safe and healthy environment and to encourage the involvement of communities and community organisations in the matters of local government.

Local government must also promote the Bill of Rights, which reflects the nation's values about human dignity, equality and freedom, and uphold the principles enshrined in the Constitution.

To fulfil this mandate, municipalities raise their own revenue through property rates and by charging for providing utilities such as water and electricity. They also receive grants from provincial and national government, and raise external loans. The revenue raised must be used according to the Municipal Systems Act, which obliges municipalities to provide these basic services.

To extend these services to communities, municipalities must act reasonably, using an integrated development plan. The IDP is part of the local government financial management process which is guided by the Municipal Finance Management Act.

Municipalities must ensure that there will be adequate money to cover both their planned expenditure, which includes delivery of

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 39

basic services, and their capital budget, which includes long-term investment in assets like buildings, land and vehicles.

In all of this, the ANC government has improved the lives of the majority of our people as demonstrated in the General Household Survey released by Statistics South Africa in May 2017. It states like this on housing: Between 2002 and 2016, the percentage of households that lived in formal dwellings and whose dwellings were fully owned increased from 52,9% to 54,3% while the percentage of partially owned dwellings declined from 15,5% to 8,8%. About 13,5% of households had other forms of tenure arrangements in 2016. More than three-quarters of South African households lived in formal dwellings, followed by 13,9% who lived in informal dwellings, and 5,9% in traditional dwellings.

With regard to social security, the percentage of individuals that benefited from social grants consistently increased from 12,7% in 2003 to 29,9% in 2016.

With regard to energy, the percentage of households connected to the electricity supply from the main has increased from 77,1% in 2002 to 84,2% in 2016. Percentage of households that used electricity for cooking increased from 58% in 2002 to 76,8% in 2016.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 40

With regard to water access and use, although 88,8% of South African households had access to piped water in 2016, only 75,1% of households in Limpopo, and 75,7% of households in Eastern Cape enjoyed such access. This situation does, however, represent a substantial improvement from that of 2002 when only 56,3% in households in this province had access to piped water.

With regard to sanitation, nationally, the percentage of households with access to improved sanitation increased from 62,3% in 2002 to 80,9% in 2016. Nationally, the percentage of households without sanitation, or who used bucket toilets decreased from 12,3% to 4,2% between 2002 and 2016.

IsiXhosa:

Sibanjwe liKapa eli ukuze ibe noko lihlile kakhulu.

English:

With regard to refuse removals, the percentage of households for which refuse were removed at least once per week increased from 56,7% in 2002 to 64,9% in 2016.

The ANC-led government has introduced free basic service which is the minimum amount of basic levels of services, provided on a day to

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 41

day basis, sufficient to cover or cater for the basic needs of the poor households. The free basic services programme currently supports more than 3,5 million indigent households.

The delivery of quality municipal infrastructure and uninterrupted services remain our priorities. During the year under review, about 1 362 Municipal Infrastructural Grant projects were monitored in relation to financial compliance with Division of Revenue Act.

Despite significant progress made in redressing the effects of colonialism and racism, much remains to be done to ensure that all South Africans enjoy quality basic services as committed by the RDP and the ANC Election Manifesto. The ANC acknowledges this and will continue to commit itself to deliver these basic services and achieve its transformative agenda.

Working together, we shall continue with our journey towards a better life for all by building on the great achievements we have already made. I support the Budget Vote, Chairperson. Thank you.

[Applause.]

Xitsonga:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 42

Manana B T MATHEVULA: Mutshamaxitulu, hina va EFF a hi pfumelelani na yona Budget Vote 4 ya Ndzawulo ya Mafumele ya Miganga na Timhaka ta Xintu.

English:

In the 2016-17 local government audit outcome report which was published in late May, the state of local government in South Africa was laid bare for all to see. It was found that in the Eastern Cape there was irregular expenditure in municipalities amounting to R13,6 billion in 2016-17. In the North West this number was R4,3 billion; in Gauteng R3,7 billion, in KwaZulu-Natal R2,5 billion, in Mpumalanga nearly R2 billion, in Limpopo R1,3 billion, in the Free State R675 million, in the Northern Cape R261 million; and in the Western Cape R173 million.

On top of this irregular expenditure municipalities are owed more than R100 billion by government departments, businesses and households. While at the same time municipalities owe Eskom R13,5 billion. Local government is at the frontline of service delivery in this country, and the sphere of government that is closest to the people. But these figures I just read perfectly illustrate how mismanagement, incapacity and corruption have

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 43

crippled local government with our people and the quality of service delivery they receive being the first to suffer.

The corruption and the ease with which people are able to loot the states resources at a local government level, has made local government key to the dispensing of patronage. It is this which has fuelled political killing KwaZulu-Natal and other parts of the country. Where we continue to see the violent assassination and killing of councillors, as the ruling party fight for who has access to state resources and kill all those who expose corruption. While the ANC fight for power and patronage our people continue to be ignored, but they refuse to remain silent. Everyday in municipalities across our country our people are engaging in service delivery protests and land occupations. But instead of providing services and distributing land, protestors are met with brutality and violence.

Local government perfectly illustrates the failure of neo-liberal economic policy, approach to government, the corruption and mismanagement of the ANC and DA governments. That is why we will continue to see an increase land occupations and service delivery protests.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 44

Added to this is that despite being central to service delivery, municipalities remain underfunded with the R83 billion allocated to the department this year not being sufficient. The reality is that this budget will do nothing to address the challenges facing local government. What is needed is a total rethink of local government and its role. Firstly, it must be given a larger portion of the national Budget. People employed in municipalities must be employed in merit and not because of who they know, or what organisation they belong to. The services provided by municipalities must be in-sourced, with municipalities having their own internal capacity. There must be greater consultation with communities on how decisions are made at the municipal level, instead of wasting money on external consultants. The people will always be the best advisors. Municipalities must also play a greater role in reversing Apartheid spatial so that land is returned, and people are closer to work and have access to resources, jobs and service delivery. Not only will these steps improve service delivery, but they will lead to decreases in corruption, and mismanagement. And, by taking away the ability to dispense with patronage at the local level, we will also bring an end to the continued political killings of councillors and councillor candidates which have taken the lives of many innocent, hardworking and committed activists. As the EFF these are the steps we believe must be taken in order for this department and local

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 45

government to do their job. Ndza khensa, Mutshamaxitulu. [Thank you, Chairperson.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr.A J Nyambi): Hon Motlashuping!

Mr T C MOTLASHUPING: Chair, without disturbing the House. When people are insane they start by talking to themselves and shout. I have just been moved out of my seat because a person is perpetually shouting and talking to herself; I don't know. I don't know maybe some sort of examination must be made, please.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr.A J Nyambi): Can you take your seat. I will recognise you, let me make a ruling. Hon members, last week, on Wednesday, when we started the sitting, the Chairperson Mme Modise of the NCOP made a ruling about the decorum of the House. It is entirely up to us. Let us refrain from anything that will compromise the decorum of the House. I have already appealed to all of you that whatever you do make sure that you respect the speaker at the podium. If there is a point for a debate you will get an opportunity to come to the podium to debate.

Even now anything that will suggest or demean an assassination of a hon member of the House; you can raise your point of order without

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 46

undermining another member. Don't imply anything that will create problems and raise questions. We are busy with a very serious debate. I can take any point of order, but not in relation to my ruling. If you have a problem with my ruling there is a clear way of doing it. But if there is a point of order that has nothing to do with what we are dealing with, then I can take it.

Mr M M CHABANGU: Chairperson, I was going to echo the very same sentiment that you have echoed. People must not think that they have schooled better than others and come and hide behind big ways. If you say somebody is insane we can consult our lexicons it means somebody is mad, and that is not the proper language that must be spoken in this House. I thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr.A J Nyambi): Hon members, I have made the ruling it's an unparliamentary expression to refer to a hon member in that way -real unparliamentary expression. That is why when I dealt with it I said, hon Motlashuping if you raise a point of order you can do it without expressing anything that is unparliamentary. So, kindly withdraw what you have said so that we can have the House in order. [Interjections.] Order members! I am dealing with hon Motlashuping. Can you withdraw the part of implying that a hon member is insane? Withdraw that part.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 47

Mr T C MOTLASHUPING: I can't hear you.

Ms N P KONI: So, are you reversing your ruling, Chair, because you have ruled on that matter - are going to reverse it. Chairperson, it's either you were sleeping or else, I don't know.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr.A J Nyambi): Hon Motlashuping, you raised a point of order, but in raising it you implied that the hon member is not normal. Withdraw that part.

Mr T C MOTLASHUPING: There is nothing that I will withdraw because I never mentioned a name of a person. Therefore, Chairperson, on those bases I don't know why I should withdraw. What is it that I should withdraw?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr.A J Nyambi): Hon members, I don't need your assistance.

Ms N P KONI: You need it. You have just used one from the hon member from the EFF.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr.A J Nyambi): Hon Motlashuping, I am giving you the last opportunity. Can you withdraw what you have said?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 48

Mr T C MOTLASHUPING: What is it that I must withdraw, Chair?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr.A J Nyambi): For referring to the hon member that is making noise and he is insane.

Mr T C MOTLASHUPING: Who is that hon member?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr.A J Nyambi): Hon Motlashuping, I am not going to debate with you.

Mr T C MOTLASHUPING: No, I am not debating, but I want to understand your ruling. Assist me to understand your ruling.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr.A J Nyambi): Let me assist you. Hon Motlashuping, I am making a ruling and I am saying that you have to withdraw. If you have a problem with the ruling there is a way of dealing with it in the NCPOP. You cannot stand and debate with me. Withdraw your expression that a hon member made you to leave that chair and sit where you are sitting because that hon member is insane.

Ms N P KONI: No, it's not our problem that you don't understand English.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 49

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr.A J Nyambi): Hon Motlashuping, can you withdraw that.

Mr T C MOTLASHUPING: Chairperson, I withdraw for that.

Mr C HATTINGH: The hon member disobeyed your order and said, "I withdraw from that, Chair." He didn't withdraw what he said. It's not acceptable.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr.A J Nyambi): Hon Chetty, can you be in order. Hon members, I have requested hon Motlashuping to withdraw. {Interjections.} No, may you keep quiet, hon Chetty. Hon Hattingh is assisting me because I thought he has withdrawn. Can I be allowed so that in the next sitting we can make a proper ruling that indeed he withdrew or he said on the seat, then we will deal with it. We will definitely deal with it. We will make consultation on that.

Mr M KHAWULA: Hon Chairperson, hon Minister Khabazela and honourable Nozizwe Madlala-Routledge and her partner who are with us in gallery, The Auditor-General of South Africa has recently released the shocking outcomes of the municipal audits in the country. Out of 257 municipalities audited, only 33 municipalities received clean audits. Irregular expenditure increased from R16 billion to

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 50

R28,4 billion. The National Treasury suggests that 128 municipalities are in financial distress. Municipalities in the country owe Eskom a combined figure of R13,5 billion. The municipalities themselves are owed in rates and services a total combined figure of R139 billion. The municipalities also owe water boards billions of rands. This is part of a glimpse picture of what you have inherited hon Minister.

Let me make a small contribution to some of the areas that need attention at local government. Legislation and policy is not properly adhered to especially with bud budgeting. Whereas compensation of employees is supposed to be curbed not to exceed a particular percentage of the total budget, you will find that municipalities have staff compliments that are far above the acceptable figure. This leaves such municipalities with very minimal financial resources with which to deliver services.

in some very small municipalities with hardly any income base, salaries are exorbitantly high. Especially at the top level of the organograms, managers and their top officials always want to equate their salaries to levels that are never comparable to their situations. Top structures of managements of some very small municipalities are extra-ordinary bloated. You find a municipality

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 51

repeatedly receiving shocking audit outcomes, but managers are paid exorbitant bonuses for nondelivery.

Municipalities fail to adhere to their mandates in accordance with legislation as their powers and functions. They become sports organisers, recreation organisers, employment agencies, travel agencies, funeral parlours, social protection institutions, humanitarian agencies, bursary scheme funders, the list is endless whereas basic municipal functions are suffering.

Mayors spend extraordinary sums of money on municipal luxury vehicles whereas potholes are not attended to.

Whilst expenditure on transport for mayors may be a necessity, but exorbitant spending on luxurious vehicles in this regard is an unnecessary expense. When purchasing mayoral vehicles, Mayoral offices need to take into consideration the terrain in which they operate, the issues of affordability and the needs of the communities they serve. The use of these vehicles also needs to be regulated properly so that they are restricted only to municipal official functions within jurisdictional areas of the municipalities.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 52

Some mayors also have their residences outside of the municipalities of where they are Mayors. This is highly irregular. Political parties must reign in and read riot acts on some of these senseless behaviours of their appointees.

Accountability at the local level is too weak and opposition at local government level is weak. These practises make democracy weak. Political parties across the board have to be blamed for this. All the strong, heavy guns of political parties are deployed to national Parliament and provincial legislatures. Deployment to local government level becomes consolation for the rest. Political parties do not look at ability and capacity for deployment to mayorship but other secondary considerations become the norm. This crumbling situation of municipalities in the country is a result of a combination of some of these atrocities.

Municipal managers, who are supposed to be advisers to councils and accounting officers, also fail to perform their responsibilities. They are too scared to put their feet on the ground on wrongdoings because they want to please in order for contracts to be renewed. Some municipal managers are too consumed in corrupt practices. There is no consequent management on wrongdoings. People get away with

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 53

murder at local government levels. Hon Minister, we need a big broom to sweep local government clean.

In conclusion, in fairness to the Minister wrongs at local government level need a combination of all political parties together. In respect to the Traditional affairs the IFP appeals once more for the budget allocated to traditional affairs to be increased. Thank you

Mr A BREDELL (Western Cape): Hon Chairperson, hon Minister, hon members, ladies and gentlemen, it is an honour for me to be back here today once again in this House representing the Western Cape government.

Hon Minister, let me start off by congratulating you with your appointment to the Cabinet - some will say the hot seat. Minister some colleagues today started with mudslinging match towards the Western Cape, I'm not going to enter that to mind because to those I can say if you look at your hands you will see they are also dirty.

If you look at Eskom and the payments to Eskom I can promise you today as I stand here Minister that no municipality in the Western Cape is behind with the payments to Eskom.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 54

Hon Minister, you can count on my support and we look forward to a long and stable relationship pooling our efforts to provide a better life for all in this country.

Minister in 1994 we started together on a journey to rebuild this country. A lot has been done but challenges remain and we must ask if we are still on track with our journey. Poverty, inequality and unemployment are getting worse and then there are those who seek to divide us once again. We must kick against those sentiments and understand only by working together as one can we really all go forward.

I also wish to take this moment to bring to the attention of this House the latest Municipal Finance Management Act audit results. Municipalities in the Western Cape achieved a record number of clean audits, with 21 out of our 30 municipalities achieving this distinction. I wish to congratulate all our councils for a job well done.

Minister Mkhize in 2009 there was a movement called operation clean audit and it was stated that within the period of five years, every council in this country would have a clean audit. I think this House

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 55

needs to do some introspection into what happened with that plan? We need to ask the difficult questions.

We need to understand that the outcome like a clean audit does not come easily. We need to put the systems, the structures and the support behind our municipalities to reach that. I also want to make it very clear to this House that by no means do I believe a clean audit means a council is perfect or corruption free.

People can also not eat clean audits; and a clean audit is not a forensic audit. It has its shortcomings that are for sure. But we must acknowledge that a clean audit is a way of telling the citizens in our communities that their tax money is being spent within the legislative framework.

There can be no service delivery outside good financial management and good corporative governance in our councils. Hon Minister, so for us in the Western Cape, we want to state that we know there are problematic areas but we are tackling those head on.

And, to our colleagues in other provinces who wish to work with us we want to once again extend the hand of friendship and co-

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 56

operation. Let's work together, let's see how we can help one another achieve more. Poverty is catching up with us.

Our people are more and more desperate as unemployment bites and economic growth lags. In addition, we see increased challenges at local government level with increasingly violent protests breaking out countrywide, also in this province.

We have the added challenge of climate change and the resultant disasters like the devastating drought that we have been struggling with in the Western Cape over the past three years. It feels sometimes like we go from one crisis to another.

Minister, in 2008 we started with load shedding we then had the emerging market crash shortly thereafter and now we sit with the drought. There is but one solution, if we wish to get ahead for a change, we must start doing things differently, we must think outside the box. I would like to share some of the ideas with you.

Hon Chair, the fact is that climate change is real and it will most certainly affect the whole country. We must be more prepared and we must understand what has to be done to ensure we overcome the challenges of climate change.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 57

As responsible officials we know we cannot fix all our challenges in isolation, instead it is vital for governments, communities and business to work together towards long-term and sustainable solutions for the problems facing our people today. In the spirit of doing things differently, there are two things my department is doing in this regard.

The first is the idea of building resilient cities and towns. The lessons we are learning is that we simply must build and design living areas which are more climate resilient and able to provide a certain standard of living to citizens despite possible climate change realities like droughts or the impact of other crises.

An important pillar to building resilient communities is good governance and my department's role in this regard is to exercise oversight, support and to strengthen the capacity of municipalities to execute their mandates. But this oversight and support we need to debate, because if there are no consequences then we don't have a lot of power to shift the municipalities to better service delivery.

In addition, we need to drive the ideas of a greener economy and we must do things more efficiently with less waste. Dirty water must be cleaned and reused as is done elsewhere in the world. The reuse of

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 58

water must be prioritized and the province needs to adapt to the changing realities.

In future, no town or community must be allowed to not reuse water. We need to drive long-term behaviour change in each town and each community and each business and each home.

Of course, no one can do this alone or in isolation, greater co-operation between the state and the private sector will be vital if we wish to make a real impact. Only by working together will we all enter a greener and more sustainable future together.

Hon Chairperson, another thought I will leave you with today is about the governance model of our municipalities. The governance models that manage our different spheres of government were drawn up more than 20 years ago and the question must be asked - is today's environment still best served by the old governance models including the delegation of functions? Should we reconsider the allocations of functions and budgets to the different spheres of government?

For an example, is it optimal to continue placing the responsibility for the supply and management of bulk water infrastructure to the national entity when provincial entities are hands on and best

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 59

placed to manage the situation within their provincial mandates?
What role should district councils play moving forward?

Should we not enable them to a much larger extent to ensure they can provide the necessary services and support to the various local councils what may be less equipped to do so?

There are two systems that are used to manage towns in this country. These are either the executive Mayor or an executive committee system. Most municipalities in the Western Cape operate from an executive mayoral structure.

Hon Minister, we are researching this issue currently, operating on the ground that the executive committee system is more conducive to good governance at local government level. Amongst others, this will hold errant mayors to account and provide a channel for smaller parties that are on councils, to have a real say in the decision-making structures in our councils.

We must as a local government community, focus on the rebuilding of trust within our communities. In the Western Cape we are looking at the contract between the government and the citizens. What must or

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 60

can the citizens expect from government and what is each individual's responsibility to do?

In the Western Cape we also look at what each person needs to enable that person to have a life of dignity. What is the minimum basket of services that should be supplied to each citizen in the Western Cape?

We don't have all the answers but if we all take hands across provincial and party lines, together we can ensure a brighter future not only for the citizens in the Western Cape but for the citizens in this country.

Minister, we will support you. We will work with you because that is the only way we can better the lives of our citizens. I want to end off by saying that we really need a new financial model for local government. It is crucial that we start the debate on that. I thank you. [Applause.]

Ms T WANA: Good morning to everybody; hon House Chairperson, the Chief Whip of the NCOP, Minister of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs, Dr Mkhize, the MEC of the Western Cape, Mr Bredell ...

IsiXhosa:

... zikumkani zelizwe lethu, ingakumbi uNkosi Mahlangu, ndizithoba kuwe Mhlekezazi...

English:

... distinguished guests and members of the media.

IsiXhosa:

Xa kumiwe kule ndawo use ubone ukuba mawukhe uthi qaphu-qaphu nje kancinci. Khabazela kunye nabantu bakuthi abajonge le nkqubo sikuyo masikubulelele ngokujikeleza oomasipala bethu. Kaloku ukunyathela kwakho akusayi kufane nanjengayizolo. Masibulelele ngokuthi uphose esivivaneni phaya kwa-Eskom ukuncedisa oomasipala kuba yindawo apho wonke umntu agqibelisa khona, alala khona.

Namhlanje siwongekile kuba sihleli nenkosi kwaye zonke izinto esizithethayo zinjalo kuba lo mbutho ndime emagxeni kuwo wenziwa zinkosi kunye nabefundisi.

English:

I humbly stand in this august House mandated by the ANC which was born in 1912, in Mangaung. This year is declared by our President, Cyril Ramaphosa, to honour and remember the legacy of two freedom

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 62

fighters, namely, Comrade Albertina Nontsikelelo Sisulu and Comrade Rolihlahla Nelson Mandela, as a result today we are enjoying the democratically elected government by the people for the people.

Mama Sisulu is the oldest daughter of Bonilizwe Thethiwe, a mine worker who died of lung disease. When he was on his death bed, he called Nontsikelelo and said: "I know you are strong. Never fail to support this family."

During the dark days in 1987, Mama Sisulu was quoted saying "Women are the people who are going to relieve us from all this oppression and depression". That is still relevant today.

The prophecy of her father when he was saying she is strong had been confirmed by our Nobel Peace Prize Holder, Archbishop Desmond Tutu, in June 16 2011 when he said "But try as they might, they could not break her spirit, they could not make her bitter, they could not defeat her love."

IsiXhosa:

Zinkosi zakuthi sikhleli ngoloo hlobo ke. Namhlanje inkosi yethu namhlanje iyangqina ukuba isizukulwana sabo sinjani na.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 63

English:

House Chairperson, let me come to our international icon, Rolihlahla Mandela. He was a visionary committed person to defend the exploitation of the have nots by the apartheid and he loved his country ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Sorry hon Wana, let me take hon Smit.

Mr C F B SMIT: Hon House Chair, just a point of clarity; I think the member is a week early with her speech because that debate is next week. Today is the Cogta debate and she is ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Smit, you know that you are out of order. You have an opportunity to debate; this is a point of debate and you will respond to what she is raising. Continue hon Wana.

Ms T WANA: House Chairperson, the thing that makes me walk tall is the fact that Mr Bredell looked at Mr Smit to confirm that their organisation is a defeated association. [Laughter.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 64

Let me return to my speech. Madiba was a committed person and defended the exploitation of the have nots by apartheid. He loved his country, the people and the children across all races. He was defending everybody across colours. Let me quote him saying, "There were many dark moments when my faith in humanity was solely tested, but I would not stand and could not give myself up for despair".

On 16 June 1976, our youth was gunned down by the forces of the apartheid government. Till today we do not know what happened to the docket of that year. Let me share this with you: Even today we still see our youth consolidating and they know, this morning, that they belong to the ANC.

I am sharing this history with this House to remind us of the journey to democracy. We lost many people who were fighting for this freedom. I appeal to all of us, irrespective of race, to defend our beautiful country.

IsiXhosa:

Zemka iinkomo magwalandini!

English:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 65

It was a black woman who called for intervention during the dispossession of our mothers' land. Even that 'zemka iinkomo magwalandini' is relevant because all our municipalities are deteriorating day by day. Communities are not receiving full services.

Secondly, we appeal to all communities not to destroy what we have because this government is an open door government. We must try and emulate Nelson Mandela and Albertina Sisulu as fellow South Africans.

House Chairperson, Marx and Engels commented in 1902 that if man is shaped environment, his environment must be made human so that we can all defend and exploit those who are disexploiting us in terms of capitalist ideology.

In my province, most of our municipalities, Minister, have a high number of unauthorised expenditures. In North West, there is one municipality that has been granted by the court to be governed by the ratepayers. The Department of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs must look into the issue of municipal managers. Municipal managers are not doing their duties, instead, when a municipality has funding and maladministration issues, they

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 66

compensate and appoint that same manager to another municipality. That must stop because ...

Minister, before you were given this mandate, most municipalities had investigations around financial expenditures and maladministration but all those findings and investigations were never taken care of. As a committee we appeal that you look at those things. We know that you are brave and you are going to resolve these issues in these municipalities.

The House Chairperson (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Wana, conclude.

Ms T WANA: House Chairperson, I am going to conclude. Next week as a committee we are visiting two provinces around the issue of section 139(b); Walter Sisulu in the Eastern Cape and Maluthi in Free State.

We congratulate those municipalities who have managed to fight a good fight.

IsiXhosa:

Zinkosi zelizwe lethu sithi kuni ngalo mzuzu niyayazi into esikuyo apha. Siyi-ANC sithi hlalani koomasipala kuba lo mbutho ngowenu.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 67

Ngaloo mazwi i-ANC iyaluxhasa olu hlahlo-lwabiwo-mali.

[Kwaqhwywa.]

Ms B A ENGELBRECHT: Hon Chairperson and fellow South Africans, in addressing our triple challenge of poverty, inequality and unemployment we should look no further than our municipalities. They should be providing the infrastructure and support to stimulate business and become the breeding ground of investment, yet the Auditor-General indicated that 112 out of 257 municipalities are in a disastrous financial position. Municipalities are in trouble. The increase in irregular and wasteful expenditure combined with endemic corruption, means they do not have the money to carry out basic service delivery.

Nowhere is this clearer than in Premier League provinces. The ANC's Deputy President from Mpumalanga, the ANC's secretary general from the Free State and Supra from North West, all with the worst performing municipalities. [Applause.] They battle to deliver basic services such as clean water, sanitation, electricity, refuse and sewage removal, storm water drainage systems, municipal roads, sustainable street lightening and maintenance of critical infrastructure is totally lacking.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 68

Minister, we appreciate your urgency in addressing the poor performing municipalities, we will hold you accountable in your September report and evaluate your promised 12 months recovery plan.

For the first time in South Africa's history, the national government has taken over a whole province. In all probability 20 out of the 22 North West municipalities will be placed under administration.

Hon Mthethwa, I think he left because he is scared of the truth, his figures are laughable. There are 68 028 pit toilets in South Africa of which 44% are in the Free State, 33% in the Eastern Cape, 15% in the Northern Cape and 5% in the North West - shame on you ANC.

Where the DA governs, we govern well. In the DA-led City of Tshwane, we inherited R2 billion in arrears, and under two years we turned it around to R740 million in the bank. [Applause.] In Johannesburg, Herman Mashaba uncovered R17 billion of corrupt activities through the anticorruption unit, and eight out of the 10 top municipalities in the country are DA-led. [Applause.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 69

The DA will continue to work towards an accountable and transparent government in the municipalities where we govern, holding any person abusing municipal funds or maladministration accountable.

The DA's vision is through stimulating the economy, with effective and efficiently run municipalities, where Small, Medium and Micro-sized Enterprises, SMMEs, and local businesses will grow and develop, providing job opportunities for all so that we can change the future of this country.

Ms G G OLIPHANT: Chair, I would like to ask if the hon member would take a question.

Ms B A ENGELBRECHT: Chair, I am available in the lounge afterwards. [Laughter.] Chairperson, together as South Africans, we need to work harder everyday and we need to work towards one South Africa for all. I thank you.

IsiNdebele:

Nom S G MTHIMUNYE: Ubukhosi bekhethu bakwaNdzundza, Mabhogo, Mahlangu, Ndabezitha. Ngqongqotjhe Mkhize,

English:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 70

... congratulations on your appointment in the department. We welcome you. Chair of Chairs, this year we commemorate the centenary of Isithwalandwe, Comrade Nelson Mandela and Mama Albertina Sisulu. When remembering their collective contribution on this occasion of the Budget Vote of the Department of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs, we remember that so much of their contribution centred on improving the lives of our people, where they live, and in the services they receive. So much of their contribution was about addressing the conditions our people had to live under and provided to them, how a democratic South Africa would look and the need to struggle for this. What guided them profoundly was the mandate given to them as leaders through the Freedom Charter, which remains today the cornerstone of the ANC policy, its ethos and values of the Constitution of South Africa.

This Chair is found on the teachings of Karl Marx when he said and I quote, "The state shall or can be used as a tool for class emancipation." So, I want to quote the preamble of the Constitution:

We, the people of South Africa, recognise the injustices of our past; honour those who suffered for justice and freedom in our land; respect those who have worked to build and develop our

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 71

country; and believe that South Africa belongs to all who live in it, united in our diversity.

It is against this backdrop that we remain committed to providing quality services to our people, with basic services being extended to more of our people than ever before, we are conscious of the challenges, reflected in the community frustration in both municipal leadership and governance in our municipalities. We reiterate what the President said in his state of the nation address earlier this year and I quote:

We will focus on improvements in our budget and monitoring systems, because the effectiveness of municipalities to deliver on their mandate is largely dependent on their ability to plan and allocate public resources in a developmental and sustainable manner.

We note with concern the 2018 Budget Review, which indicates that many municipalities continued to face financial and institutional problems that resulted in breakdowns in service delivery and mounting of debts.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 72

By September 2017, 20 municipalities with the largest outstanding commitments, owed creditors an amount to the tune of R17,4 billion with only R1,7 billion to pay for such services. Most of these debts are owed to Eskom and the water boards in our country.

We are encouraged by the fact that the second phase of the Back to Basics Programme engages in more active and accountability measures. We are confident that the second phase will focus on identifying the root causes of the problems in each municipality, since the successful attainment of service delivery priorities is highly dependent on the ability of each municipality to strategically plan and budget.

The aim of the second phase is to focus on basic service delivery and infrastructure through the following: Prioritising capacity for service and infrastructure delivery; maintenance of existing infrastructure, increasing access to quality, reliable and sustainable basic levels of service in prioritised districts; and making municipal infrastructure procurement more efficient and effective.

Other interventions to improve service delivery include continued support for the 42 prioritised municipalities. This includes a

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 73

simplified revenue plan, which will run for two consecutive years. The simplified revenue plan will ensure that there is: Improved revenue management, reduction of municipal consumer debt, and protection and enhancement of the municipalities' revenue collection potential.

Both the Department of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs and the National Treasury have led a series of meetings with the top financially indebted municipalities. This has resulted in renegotiations of payment agreements between the municipalities and their creditors. As the end of February this year, municipalities signed 55 agreements. There is an ongoing monitoring of payment arrangements of these municipalities and feedback with all stakeholders, to ensure that the outstanding debts are resolved.

We are encouraged by the fact that the Municipal Infrastructure Support Agent, Misa, is now engaged in new initiatives aimed at improving municipal infrastructure procurement; providing multidisciplinary turnaround support to weak municipalities; and proactively driving improvement in access to a level of basic services through evidence-based diagnostics and performance monitoring.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 74

To give effect to this initiative, Misa has already started the process of implementing Regional Management Support Contractors driving these initiatives in the priority districts. The programme is being implemented in three pilot district municipalities; namely Amathole, OR Tambo and Sikhukhune in Limpopo. The SA Local Government Agency, Salga, continues to contribute to this process and this month held a successful Municipal Innovative Infrastructure Financing Conference, under the theme, "Unlocking Infrastructure Financing to Accelerate Service Delivery". The conference looked at municipal financing challenges and served as a platform for municipalities on raising financial infrastructure issues.

Whilst the recent Auditor-General's general report, confirmed that 27 municipalities have received disclaimers, we acknowledge an improvement in the overall municipal audit outcomes. Where there are challenges the Department of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs's commitment through the second phase Back to Basics Programme will ensure the strengthening of financial management and financial viability of municipalities. The Revenue Enhancement Programmes and addressing those municipalities who consistently receive disclaimer audit opinions will be assisted in the process.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 75

The Municipal Finance Management Act since its enactment in 2003 only allows municipalities to bank with commercial banks, and not with noncommercial banks like mutual or co-operative banks. We therefore support the forensic investigation by the Reserve Bank into the deposits involving 15 municipalities with VBS Mutual Bank, more especially since they were cautioned against this practice yet continued to do so.

We want to emphasise that with regard to fighting corruption, the first step is the recognition and admitting that it does exist. We are committed to popularising a new morality of service and integrity in fighting corruption and mismanagement at local government level by ensuring that there are consequences for maladministration, mismanagement, fraud and corruption. The parliamentary oversight mechanisms will pay special attention to corruption. We believe that through the second phase of the Back to Basics plan, of the Department of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs will strengthen good governance enforcing consequence ... [Interjections.]

Mr F ESSACK: Hon Chair, I rise on a point of order.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 76

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Mthimunye sorry, let me take the hon Essack. You can take your seat, hon Mthimunye, whilst I am taking the hon Essack. Hon Essack, why are you standing?

Mr F ESSACK: Chairperson, I am standing on a simple point of order. My point of order is: Did the speaker just say that they are committed to popularising corruption? If not so, may he take a simple question?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Essack, you know very well that you are abusing the point of order. You are debating with the speaker at the podium and that is not a point of order.

Mr F ESSACK: Chair, it was a point of clarity.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): No, you cannot be doing that. Can you take your seat.

Mr F ESSACK: Sure, Sir.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Continue hon Mthimunye.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 77

Mr S G MTHIMUNYE: Thank you, Chair of Chairs. In closing I would like to quote Nelson Mandela in 1998 when he stated:

Our Constitution enjoins us to work together to address the legacy of our divided and oppressive past. In a society in which so many were condemned to a life of poverty, the meeting of their basic needs must be the standard by which we measure our progress. It should be the standard for government and the opposition alike; it should be the foundation of our national consensus.

... as government of South Africa and opposition parties alike. Chairperson, as the ANC we want to support the budget as presented by the Minister of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs. [Applause.] Before I sit down, I think it is worth responded to what the hon Chetty would have come here to advance as part of a debate of the Department of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs Budget Policy debate and decided to focus on completely irrelevant issues. In the first place I attribute what he said and called Msunduzi Municipality as umzunduzi and yet he claims to be coming from Msunduzi and where is patriotism in this case? Perhaps one is tempted to believe out of this ignorance one would have noticed in

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 78

this particular House that perhaps hon Malema was correct in his statement.

Hon Mathevula committed political suicide from this particular platform. The illegal land grabs in this country which are mainly led by the EFF and only dumped the people in these pieces of land only ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Mthimunye, let me take this point of order? Hon Koni.

Ms N P KONI: Thank you, Chairperson. I rise on a point of order. My point of order is: If there is any member who debated at that podium who should be corrected is the hon Wana. What the hon Mthimunye is doing there is abuse! Thank you, Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Koni, your doing exactly what I have cautioned the hon Essack. Let us refrain from debating with the people at the podium. Hon Labuschagne. Let me take the hon Labuschagne.

Ms C LABUSCHAGNE: Thank you, Chair. I rise on a point of order. My point of order is: I would like to know if the speaker will repeat.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 79

Did he say he agrees with the hon Malema by implicating that the hon Chetty is a racist? Because then I want him to withdraw that.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon members, order.

[Interjections.]

Order! No, can you sit down. Hon members, hon Malema has said a lot of things. So, hon Mthethwa, just assist us as to what are you referring to before I can make a ruling, hon Mthimunye. Hon Mthimunye, you referred to the hon Malema being correct by saying what?

Mr S G MTHIMUNYE: Chair, I did not refer to hon Malema to have being correct in any matter. What I said is that perhaps the hon Malema was correct in his statement.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Mthimunye, which statement?

Mr S G MTHIMUNYE: Chair, I did not mention any statement.

[Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 80

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Order, members. Hon members, hon members - no, you can take your seat. Can you take your seat. Hon members, I am not going to allow this House to degenerate when dealing with the very important subject, but allow me to make a proper ruling. Hon Mthimunya at the podium, referred to the hon Malema being correct. I asked the hon Mthimunya after the hon Labuschagne raised a point of order to clarify the correct statement that he is referring to and in assisting me so that I can make a proper ruling, he is not assisting me. He is still making it worse. So, for me to be able to make a proper and informed ruling, it would be very correct to go through Hansard and get the proper context so that I can be able to make an informed ruling because now I would be debating with him and it would be out of order. Hon members, not unless it is something else, anything in relation to my ruling is not going to be subjected to the discussion of the House. However, I can take the hon Khawula.

Mr M KHAWULA: Thank you, hon Chairperson. No, Chairperson I am not debating your ruling, but I also wanted to say the context in which the agreement with the hon Malema was made by the hon Mthimunya was with the reference to the hon Chetty failing to properly pronounce the word Msunduzi.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 81

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Khawula, let us not go there! "Ja."

Mr M KHAWULA: Please, Chairperson, here me out! It was in the context of the hon Chetty having failed to properly pronouncing Msunduzi and in relation to that the hon Malema has suggested that Indians are not South Africans.

Ms N P KONI: No! No! No! [Interjections.]

Mr M KHAWULA: So, that is the context.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Order! Order! Take your seat! Can you take your seat! Hon Khawula! Hon Khawula! Hon Khawula, you are totally out of order, because - no, you are out of order. I have made a ruling and a proper ruling will be made. There is no need to debate it. I have made a ruling. Khawula is out of order. No, he is out of order!

Ms N P KONI: He must withdraw!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): What is he withdrawing, when he is out of order?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 82

[Interjections.]

I am not considering what he has said. Can you take your seat.
Continue, hon Mthimunye.

Mr S G MTHIMUNYE: Thank you, Chair of Chairs. Many at times the illegal land grabs that are happening in the country are seen in the news and in many other social media platforms to be led by the people in red! [Interjections.]

An HON FEMALE MEMBER: So what!

Mr S G MTHIMUNYE: Whether or not those people in red who happen to be leading those illegal land occupations are coming from the EFF, I am not here to confirm that. However, hon Chair, what I have noticed when the poor masses are dumped illegally in this pieces of land and when they face the might of the law they are on their own and the red overalls are not there. And what do you call that?

[Interjections.]

Chairperson, the hon Khawula ... [Interjections.]

Mr M M CHABANGU: Chairperson, on appoint of order.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 83

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Mthimunye, let me take the hon Chabangu. Hon Chabangu.

Mr M M CHABANGU: Thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon members, order! Hon Mathevula, when you were at the podium, you were listened at. Now, I am taking a point of order from the hon Chabangu. Hon Chabangu, you are recognised.

Mr M M CHABANGU: Thank you, Chair. I would like to know as to whether the hon member can take a question from me?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Yes. No, it is in order. We do that in the House. Hon Mthimunye, are you ready to take a question from the hon Chabangu?

Mr S G MTHIMUNYE: Chairperson, I am not ready.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Chabangu, he is not ready.

Mr M M CHABANGU: He is afraid.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 84

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Continue, hon Mthimunye.

Mr S G MTHIMUNYE: Chair, cowardice was bitten out of me by the apartheid regime and I stand here not a coward at all.

[Interjections.]

Chairperson, I have been following with keen interests the debates advanced by the hon Khawula from this platform and I have found them to be very constructive and it is on that basis that I regard the IFP to a lack of better word to be presenting to our country to what is called constructive opposition and I think the ANC needs the calibres of yourself, hon Khawula. Hon Bredell, I think,

IsiZulu:

... uyindoda nje impela, mfowethu. Uyindoda nje impela.

English:

I think we need the likes of you to multiply for us to build a better South Africa. Thank you, very much.

I will not legitimise what the hon Engelbrecht would have come here to say, but we have recently read in the newspapers that one Chief

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 85

of Staff in one office of one mayor was found to be deployed as a cadre unqualified as he was and you had nothing to say about that and where is clean governance? I thank you. [Applause.]

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS:
Chairperson, ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Minister, let me give hon Magwebu an opportunity to speak.

Mr L V MAGWEBU: Chair, it's just a quick point of order. I see the name Dr Mkhize on a speaker's list, and yet you are calling him Dr Khabazela. I just want clarity on that.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Mr Magwebu, you are correct to ask, but it's the same person, Khabazela is Mkhize.

Mr L V MAGWEBU: Oh yes! I didn't know, Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Dr Khabazela, can you continue!

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 86

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS:
Chairperson and the hon members, I can see that the members really try to make sure that this debate is quite vibrant. So, I want to thank you for that. There are lots of nice suggestions that have come forth. Also, I just want to say that, it's good to sit here and listen to all the ideas and different views of different parties and different leaders, and also to see how we can actually use those suggestions to improve the way our municipalities are working.

I also do think that we must always watch the limits when we discuss and debate, that we should not create a situation where inevitably we send wrong messages to the public. I think we just need to watch that because we are leaders of our people who listen to us and want to hear what we say.

Therefore, sometimes they might make wrong conclusions from what you have said, and that may not be good. So, I think that it's something that we must always keep in mind. Having said so, one of the things that have been mentioned from the first to the last speaker, to me the concern is way the municipalities are working that is important.

Our major issue as the municipalities is to ensure that we are able to contribute in the fight against poverty, inequality and

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 87

unemployment. So, as we provide services, we are improving the lives of our people; as we improve the governance of our municipalities, we are also ensuring that we can attract so much investment so as to build the revenue based on municipalities. Also, we can ensure that we create jobs for our people.

The best measure of how well we perform as municipalities is the quality of life of our people; their happiness and when they feel that they are living the improving lives. I also want to thank hon Mthethwa for the issues that he has raised. Indeed, we are working on the support that you have spoken about and we have said zero tolerance to disclaimers.

Therefore, we will keep on working on that, though we know that it's not an easy matter and that we will be facing lots of challenges. Hon Chetty, you can calm down, we are investigating Msunduzi. I want us to check your figures because I'm not sure whether you are quoting correct figures. So, let's just be sure that they are correct figures.

Other than that is the issue of VBS Mutual Bank, which is a big matter. Therefore, we cannot expect a quick change because it is a matter that is going through an investigation. A number of

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 88

municipalities are under section 139 and that is not nice. But when the municipality is not where it's supposed to be, we must justify that here.

So, let us not try to push the MEC to take a decision that he has no founded basis for. We will have to come here and explain why we implemented section 139, like what we are doing in the North West. Therefore, when it's necessary we will do so and ensure that it happens. I also do not think that we must glorify murderers, let's get the police to arrest them. Let us not say that this party will kill people and the other one will not kill them. That is not the truth.

I think that we must face the facts that it is not acceptable. It doesn't matter which party you belong to. Hon Ximbi, you've raised some issues, and I like the fact that you have focused on service delivery and some of the successes of the municipalities. Even though there are some protests and people think that things aren't happening, in fact, they are happening. Therefore, I think that it is very important to mention that.

Hon Mathevula, I think that you must stick to the positive messages of what is it that needs to be done. Also, understand that for us,

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 89

local government, when you deal with services, you must not politicise issues. We must be able to say that some things are done correctly and others not. So, where we find corruption, we all have to take a stand on that.

Let me say this to you Gabhisa for your own assistance. Gabhisa is hon Khawula. On the issue of bloating, we are putting up a framework to assist. But as a former Mayor, you know for a fact that, when you were a mayor you guarded your space of independence, and that is what all municipalities do. But we are actually going to give them that kind of guard.

So, we reduce it because it is costly, and personal cost can't be allowed to bloat like the way it is doing. I like the fact that you have pointed out on this issue. Political parties have a role to play in their own party members. Hon Bredell thanks for all the support, - excuse me - and I must say that we are working very well together, hence I want thank you for that. I couldn't attend your meeting on Mayors, but certainly, I appreciate the initiative.

We have asked weather services to investigate further work in relation to resilience and sustainability as we move on. The other challenge that we have is water. Hon Wana, we want to say thank you

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 90

for all the comments that you've made and your support to the municipalities. We will get time to explain a bit more about Ditsobotla and why are we intervening on the issue of the water boards.

Hon Engelbrecht, we are not taking over 20 municipalities, it's only the 12 that you've mentioned. With the rest, we are supporting the whole country. We also want to thank hon Mthimunye for the points that he has raised, and for all the support you've been rendering. The point I think we need to make mention of here is that, corruption is corruption. It doesn't matter in which party you are.

We must draw a line to say that we will not accept corruption. Even if you are a member of whatever party, we will not accept it. We will act on it, investigate on it and there will be consequences. So, as far as we are concerned, we will fight corruption wherever it shows its head and wherever it is.

Therefore, let's not try and politicise it. Corruption is bad and it cannot be associated with anybody. When we find it in any party and we've got proof, we must act on it. Thank you very much for the support. We will continue to come and give the reports. Thank you very much. [Applause.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 91

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon members, on behalf of the leadership of the NCOP, let me thank special delegates, MEC Bradell and you Minister Khabazela for availing yourself for this very interesting debate.

Debate concluded.

**CONSIDERATION OF REPORT OF SELECT COMMITTEE ON PETITIONS AND
EXECUTIVE UNDERTAKINGS - HEARING OF THE EMBRACE DIGNITY PETITION AS
ADOPTED ON 30 MAY 2018**

Mr D L XIMBI: Chairperson, good morning everybody, I can see there uMam'u Nozizwe Madlala-Routledge, the director and founder of the nongovernmental organisation, NGO, Embraced Dignity, the former Minister of Defence - good morning, mama. The Select Committee on Petitions and Executive Undertakings having considered the Embrace Dignity Petition received by the Office of the Chairperson of the National Council of Provinces on 10 December 2014 and referred to the Committee on 24 April 2015, reports as follows:

The Embrace Dignity Petition is submitted by Embrace Dignity, a non-profit organisation which advocates for legal reform to end prostitution and sex trafficking. Embrace Dignity further advocates

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 92

for the provision of adequate support services to women seeking exit from prostitution. In the petition submitted to the NCOP, Embrace Dignity contends that notwithstanding the enactment of progressive legislation, policies and the ratification of international agreements on gender equality and violence against women of South Africa still lags behind in the implementation of these pieces of legislation, policies and international agreements. The dignity of women and girls is violated by the poor implementation of such legislation and policies, the poor provision and resourcing of services in relation to the sexual violence, abuse and economic oppression experienced by South African women and girls.

In the petition, Embrace Dignity further contends that there is a general lack of understanding of the harms of prostitution and its links to sex trafficking. It further asserts that contrary to popular belief, prostitution is not always a free choice and affects mainly women and girls who find themselves in dire socioeconomic circumstances. Lastly, Embrace Dignity asserts that prostitution has harmful effects on women and the link between prostitution and sex trafficking cannot be undermined. Further, it provides that it seeks the intervention of the Parliament in establishing a multiparty committee constituting both Houses of Parliament to investigate the following: the situation of women and or men in prostitution, the

factors which determine the demand for prostitution, the factors which provide and support the demand and the factors that perpetuate and facilitate the trafficking of women and girls.

After holding a hearing on the Petition on 2 March 2016, the committee made the following findings and observations: the Commission on Gender Equality has investigated the allegations of human rights abuses that have been levelled against SA police services, Saps, healthcare workers and social workers by sex workers. There is presently a need for legal reform around the issues raised in the petition as the existing legislative framework which includes legislation such as the Sexual Offences Act and the Trafficking in Persons Act is inadequate for addressing the issues raised in the petition. The joint committee that the petition proposes Parliament establish will also involve multi-stakeholders and will be broad in its mandate. The joint committee will look into, inter alia, the factors enabling forced prostitution such as social and economic factors, the extent to which Saps and other government departments ... [Interjections.]

Mr F ESSACK: Chairperson, through you I just wanted to check if the speaker at the podium would take a question on his sexual endeavours seeing that he talks so much about sex and sexual.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 94

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Essack, you first ascertain whether the member is ready to take a question.

Mr F ESSACK: Yes.

Mr D L XIMBI: You don't ask a question.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Ximbi, are you ready to take a question?

Mr D L XIMBI: I am not ready, Sir, thank you very much.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): He is not ready. Can you continue, hon Ximbi?

Mr D L XIMBI: Ensuring its consideration of the petition, the committee tabled a preliminary report in the House on the petition wherein it recommended that it undertake a study tour to Sweden aimed at broadening its understanding and experience of the Swedish approach commonly referred to as the partial decriminalization approach to the issues of prostitution and trafficking.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 95

The committee undertook this study tour from 2 to 7 October 2017, in Sweden, and thereafter compiled a comprehensive report which is ...

[Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Ximbi, you are dealing with the first report and I have now realised that you are presenting the second one.

Mr D L XIMBI: No, no, no.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): You are still on the first one?

Mr D L XIMBI: I am still on the first one.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Okay.

Mr D L XIMBI: I am just trying to address the House on why we went to Sweden.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Okay, okay, no, it is fine. Continue.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 96

Mr D L XIMBI: It is against the various submissions made during the hearing on the petition and the study tour the committee undertook to Sweden, that the committee recommends the National Department of Justice and Constitutional Development Department; to study the committee report on the study tour it undertook to Sweden attached hereto as annexure A. The committee takes the firm view that there are invaluable lessons to be learnt from the Swedish approach to the issues of prostitution and trafficking, initiate and drive a consultative and investigative process aimed at reviewing the current policy position on the issues of prostitution and trafficking and proposing an approach or response that is specific or peculiar to the country's prevailing circumstances.

In conclusion, the Select Committee on Petitions and Executive Undertakings recommends as follows: that the House adopt the Embrace Dignity Petition Report as tabled by the committee together with annexure A of the Report - which is the Report on the committee's study tour to Stockholm, Sweden. Thank you, Chairperson.

Debate concluded.

Question put: That the Report be adopted.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 97

In Favour: Eastern Cape, Free State, Gauteng, KwaZulu-Natal, Limpopo, Mpumalanga, Northern Cape, North West, Western Cape.

Report accordingly adopted in accordance with section 65 of the Constitution.

CONSIDERATION OF REPORT OF SELECT COMMITTEE ON PETITIONS AND EXECUTIVE UNDERTAKINGS – STUDY TOUR UNDERTAKEN TO STOCKHOLM, SWEDEN FROM 2 TO 6 OCTOBER 2017

Mr D L XIMBI: House Chair, the Select Committee on Petitions and Executive Undertakings having considered the Embrace Dignity Petition, received undertaken a study tour to Sweden, from 2nd to 6th October 2017, reports as follows: In or around, 2nd March 2016, the Select Committee on Petitions and Executive Undertakings held a hearing on the Embrace Dignity Petition. The petition was submitted to the Chairperson of the National Council of Provinces by the Embrace Dignity - a non-profit organisation, which advocates for legal reform to end prostitution and sex trafficking. In the petition Embrace Dignity requests the intervention of the NCOP in, amongst others, investigating the available legislative responses to ending the prostitution and trafficking of women and girls in the South Africa.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 98

Following the hearing on the petition, the committee adopted a preliminary report on the petition, on 7 September 2016 and later tabled it in the House. In the report the committee recommended that the committee embark on study tours to Sweden and the Netherlands.

The purpose of the study tours was to enable the committee to better understand and comprehend the legal approaches or models adopted, in each of the selected countries, as a response to the issues of prostitution and trafficking. Sweden on one hand, had adopted what is often termed the partial - decriminalisation or Nordic model to prostitution and the Netherlands on the other hand, has adopted a regulated approach to prostitution.

A further recommendation, namely, recommendation 10,2, in the report is that the committee adopt a final report on the petition after it has undertaken the study tours to Sweden and the Netherlands. It is against this background that the committee embarked on the first of the two proposed study tours and undertook a five-day study tour to Sweden, from 2nd to 7th October 2017 ... [Interjections.]

Mr L V MAGWEBU: House Chair, on a point of order. I don't understand what is going on here. We have already been taken through this report. He is repeating the same report. This Sweden and this

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 99

Embrace Dignity is the same thing. It should have been in one report to save us time.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): No, it's not the same. Allow him to continue.

Mr L V MAGWEBU: No, it sounds the same. Can't you guys agree?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): No, be patient, hon member.

Mr D L XIMBI: The study tour largely took the form of daily presentations, meetings and engagements with selected stakeholders that are both directly or indirectly involved with the issues of prostitution and trafficking in Swedish society.

These stakeholders ranged from the State Secretary to the Minister of Children, the Elderly and Gender Equality; the Chancellor of Justice; the Swedish Prosecution Authority; the National Co-ordinator for Trafficking and Prostitution; the Swedish Police Authority; the Swedish Parliament and civil society organisations.

During these engagements and interactions, members were able to ask questions around the presentations made and further share their

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 100

opinions and views on related matters. What follows below is a summary of the numerous presentations made to the committee during the study tour and the observations that the committee made consequent to the study tour.

The committee made the following observations on the bases of the presentations it received and its various engagements and interactions during the study tour: Sweden's current government has declared itself as a feminist government, which means that gender equality and gender mainstreaming are central to its priorities. Prior to the enactment of the Sex Purchase Act, a rigorous and robust debate took place in Sweden, on whether or not to criminalise prostitution.

The Sex Purchase Act is a gender neutral Act that criminalises not only the buying of sex but also an attempt to buy sex and helping someone to buy sex. The Sex Purchase Act has nothing to do with morality or ethics. It is instead an equality law that seeks to promote gender equality and protecting the rights of women who are engaged in prostitution.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 101

Although the Sex Purchase Act has not managed to rid Sweden of prostitution, it has managed to reduce the demand for prostitution and change Swedish attitudes towards the issue of buying sex.

The majority of victims of prostitution in Sweden originated from Eastern European countries, such as Estonia, Lithuania, Poland and Romania and some are even from the African continent.

Sweden is a country of destination for trafficking, particularly for trafficking in persons for purposes of forced labour as berry-pickers and street beggars

There are currently more than 20 NGOs in Sweden, working with victims of prostitution and human trafficking and these NGOs are part of the Swedish Civil Society Platform Against Trafficking. The Platform is actively involved in working hand in hand with the Swedish authorities in combating and preventing prostitution and human trafficking.

Sweden has influenced countries such as Norway, France, Canada and Ireland to adopt its legislative approach to prostitution and international organisations, such as the European Parliament have lauded the Swedish approach to prostitution.

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 102

The committee appeal to the House to adopt the Swedish study report, as tabled by the committee, as annexure A to the Final Embrace Dignity Petition Report. I so move. Thank you.

Debate concluded.

Question put: That the Report be adopted.

In Favour: Eastern Cape, Free State, Gauteng, KwaZulu-Natal, Limpopo, Mpumalanga, Northern Cape, North West, Western Cape.

Report accordingly adopted in accordance with section 65 of the Constitution.

CONSIDERATION OF REPORT OF SELECT COMMITTEE ON PETITIONS AND EXECUTIVE UNDERTAKINGS - EXECUTIVE UNDERTAKINGS MADE BY THE MINISTER OF HIGHER EDUCATION AND TRAINING DURING THE HOUSE SITTING OF 9 JUNE 2015, AS ADOPTED ON 30 MAY 2018

Mr D L XIMBI: Chairperson, the Select Committee on Petitions and Executive Undertakings, having requested the hon Minister of Higher Education and Training to appear before it and provide a progress report on the implementation or fulfilment of the executive

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 103

undertakings made or given, on the floor of the House, during the Policy Debate on Budget Vote 15: Higher Education and Training, reports as follows:

The Executive Undertaking 1: We are also pleased to announce that with the support of a number of partners, we have established the first Centre for African Languages Teaching that has been established as part of the University of Mpumalanga 's Siyabuswa Campus. This Centre will promote research into teaching African Languages, particularly the dominant languages of Mpumalanga province, IsiNdebele and SiSwati.

The Executive Undertaking 2: The Census tells that there are 18 million South Africans who need Adult Basic Education and Training of one kind or the other. For this reason, I will therefore establish a fully-fledged branch on adult education and community college education in my department, headed by a deputy director-general.

The Executive Undertaking 3: We are also pleased that we are going to expand what we call Higher Certificate, basically targeting students who have not made it in matric to be able to bridge to go

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 104

to university or college or so that some of them to actually get employment.

On 29 February 2016, the Chairperson of the NCOP referred the above mentioned executive undertakings made or given by the Minister to the committee to scrutinise and ensure their proper implementation. And thereafter, on 6 September 2017 the committee extended an invitation to the Minister to appear before it and report on the progress made in implementing the executive undertakings under his respective portfolio.

In noting the progress report made by the Minister in relation to the implementation of the executive undertakings under review, the committee makes the following observations and key findings:

Firstly, the Department of Higher Education and Training supported the establishment of the Centre for African Languages at the Siyabuswa Campus of the University of Mpumalanga.

Secondly, the department has established a Community Basic Education and Training Branch and further appointed an interim acting deputy director-general.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 105

Thirdly, the department will formally advertise the post of deputy director-general: Community Education and Training, CET, in or around September 2017;

Fourthly, the DHET has established nine Community Educational Training Colleges which will give support and services to the Adult Basic Education.

Fifthly, the department is working with the Department of Basic Education in an attempt to introduce a schooling system that will strengthen and develop mid-level skills of a more vocational nature and this will ensure that the department receives relatively ready-made students.

Lastly, the department has no further room to reprioritise its projects and make further budget allocations towards the Higher Learning Certificates Educational programme since it is under heavy budget constraints due to the fact that it to contribute a total of R5 billion from its Skills Fund to fund the "Fees Must Fall Campaign".

Further, in noting the progress report made by the Minister of Higher Education and Training, the committee, lastly, observes that

the executive undertakings have been adequately implemented and therefore recommends that they be closed. We support this, chairperson.

Debate concluded.

Question put: That the Report be adopted.

In Favour: Eastern Cape, Free State, Gauteng, KwaZulu-Natal, Limpopo, Mpumalanga, Northern Cape, North West, Western Cape.

Report accordingly adopted in accordance with section 65 of the Constitution.

CONSIDERATION OF REPORT OF SELECT COMMITTEE ON PETITIONS AND EXECUTIVE UNDERTAKINGS - EXECUTIVE UNDERTAKINGS MADE BY THE MINISTER OF JUSTICE AND CONSTITUTIONAL DEVELOPMENT DURING THE HOUSE SITTING OF 4 JUNE 2015, AS ADOPTED ON 30 MAY 2018

Mr D L XIMBI: Chairperson, the select committee on petition and executive undertaking, having requested the hon Minister of Justice and Constitutional Development to appear before it and provide a progress Report on the implementation or fulfilment of executive

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 107

undertakings made or given on the floor of the House during policy debate on Budget Vote 21, Justice and Constitutional Development on the 4 June 2015 reports as follows:

Executing undertaking one, we have successfully implemented the rationalisation of magisterial districts in Gauteng and North West with effect from 1 December 2014 and has commenced with the roll out of the project to Limpopo and Mpumalanga Province. In the latter provinces, this exercise will culminate in the official opening of Limpopo Division of the High Court earmarked for the later this year and the Mpumalanga Division of the High Court planned as early as 2016.

Executive undertaking two, we intend to expand the mediation services to additional courts and this will happen as soon we have built sufficient capacity at courts to carry out the mediation function.

Executive Undertaking three, a number of strategic positions including that of National Commissioner and Chief Deputy Commissioner for strategic management will be filled soon as the recommendations have been made appointments. Filling other strategic

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 108

positions including the Regional Commissioner of the Limpopo, Mpumalanga and North West regions is receiving priority attention.

Executive undertaking four, we will also run 24 workshops to train officials on ethics and to strengthen our collective vigilance against fraud, corruption and serious maladministration.

On 29 February 2016, the Chairperson of the NCOP referred the above mentioned executive undertakings, made or given by the Minister to the committee to scrutinise and ensure their proper implementation. And thereafter, on 6 September 2017, the committee extended an invitation to the Minister to appear before it and report on the progress made in implementing the executive undertakings under his respective portfolio.

In noting the progress Report made by the Minister in relation to the implementation of the executive undertakings under review, the committee made the following observations and key findings: The Independent Development Trust has been appointed as the implementation agent for the construction of both the Limpopo and Mpumalanga Divisions of the High Court. Moreover, completion of these projects is at almost 90% and the work should be completed by the end of 2017.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 109

In the 2017-18 financial year, the department will be extending the court annexed mediation services to an additional 30 regional courts, primarily on the courts designated as seats for civil regional courts. The assistant registrars based at the regional courts earmarked for the rollout of the mediation project will undergo training on the court annexed mediation rules, during October to November 2017, as part of creating the requisite capacity for the added responsibility.

The department has filled the post of Chief Deputy for Commissioner Strategic Management and interviews for the positions of Regional Commissioners for Gauteng as well as for Limpopo, Mpumalanga and North West Province were conducted during the week of 25 to 29 August 2017 and the process will be finalised soon. The position of National Commissioner of Correctional Services is however currently vacant as the previous one reached the age of retirement in August 2017.

The department has conducted 56 ethics awareness sessions or workshops in the 2015-2016 financial year, wherein a total of 1386 employees attended and participated. Further, in noting the progress Report made by the Minister of Justice and Constitutional Development, the Committee, lastly, observes that the executive

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 110

undertakings have been adequately implemented and therefore recommend that they be closed. Thank you very much Chairperson.

Debate concluded.

Question put: That the Report be adopted.

VOTING [TAKE IN FROM MINUTES]

Report accordingly adopted in accordance of section 65 of the Constitution.

**CONSIDERATION OF REPORT OF SELECT COMMITTEE ON SECURITY AND JUSTICE
- COMMENTS REQUESTED BY THE MINISTER OF JUSTICE AND CORRECTIONAL
SERVICES ON THE DRAFT REGULATIONS MADE IN TERMS OF THE PROTECTED
DISCLOSURE ACT OF 2014**

Mr S G MTHIMUNYE: House Chair, the Minister for Justice and Correctional Services requested the Select Committee on Security and Justice to consider and comment on the Draft Regulations made in terms of the Protected Disclosures Act 26 of 2000, specifically the inclusion of the Chairperson of the National Council of Provinces as

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 111

a person to whom a protected disclosure may be made, in terms of Annexure B of the draft regulations.

The select committee, having considered the subject of the draft regulations, referred to it, reports as follows. The Select Committee on Security and Justice requested and received a legal opinion on the Protected Disclosures Act Draft Regulations on 6 June 2018. The parliamentary Legal Advisor addressed the Committee on the inclusion of the Chairperson of the National Council of Province, NCOP, as a person to whom a protected disclosure may be made.

The Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, Act 108 of 1996, determines in Chapter 4 that Parliament consists of two Houses, namely: The National Council of Province, the NCOP; and the National Assembly, the NA. The Powers and Privileges and Immunities of Parliament and Provincial Legislatures Act 4 of 2004 and the Financial Management of Parliament and Provincial Legislatures Act 10 of 2009 identify the Speaker and the Chairperson of the National Council of Provinces as the office bearers of each House. Where the Speaker and the Chairperson must act in the interest of Parliament, the two office bearers are identified as the Executive Authority of Parliament acting jointly in the interests of Parliament.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 112

Furthermore, the committee deliberated the need to include the provincial legislature Speaker as the executive authority of the provincial legislature to whom disclosure should be made on any impropriety at the provincial legislature. The committee therefore made a recommendation, that: The Select Committee on Security and Justice, having considered the Minister for Justice and Correctional Services' request for comment on the Draft Regulations made in terms of the Protected Disclosures Act 26 of 2000, specifically the inclusion of the Chairperson of the National Council of Provinces as a person to whom a protected disclosure may be made in terms of Annexure B of the said draft Regulations, recommends to the National Council of Provinces the following: In the current Draft Regulations made in terms of the Protected Disclosures Act 26 of 2000, the National Assembly and National Council of Provinces are listed separately and they should be listed as one executive authority.

It is recommended that the name of the, "Chairperson of the National Council of Provinces", under a person or body to whom a protected disclosure may be made, should be removed and replaced with the, "Executive Authority of Parliament". The draft regulations should include reference to the Speaker of the provincial legislature as a person to whom a protected disclosure should be made as well.

Proposed amendments: In page 4, under column 1, heading, "Person or

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 113

body to whom or which disclosure can be made", delete the reference to Chairperson of the NCOP and insert, "Executive Authority, as contemplated in the Financial Management of Parliament and Provincial Legislatures Act."

The Executive Authority is deemed to refer to Speakers of Provincial Legislatures as well. In page 4, under column 2, heading, "Conduct being disclosed", to delete the reference to NCOP and the word, "the" and replace with Parliament after the word, "on". In Page 6, under both columns 1 and 2, delete row 2. Chairperson, I therefore table the report to the House for consideration. [Applause.]

Debate concluded.

Question put: That the Report be adopted.

IN FAVOUR: Eastern Cape, Free State, Gauteng, KwaZulu-Natal, Limpopo, Mpumalanga, Northern Cape, North West, Western Cape.

Agreed to.

Report accordingly adopted in accordance of section 65 of the Constitution.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 114

BUSINESS SUSPENDED AT 12:54 AND RESUMED AT 14:01.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon members, before we proceed, I'd like to take this opportunity to welcome the Deputy President. We will now proceed with the questions as printed on the Question Paper.

Question 7:

The DEPUTY PRESIDENT OF THE REPUBLIC: Hon House Chairperson, this question from the ANC, hon Mohai, is my first question here. The Community Work Programme, CWP, is designed to alleviate poverty through the provision of work opportunities for poor and unemployed people, who are merely living in socioeconomically depressed urban and rural areas, including those areas under traditional authorities. The programme forms part of the broad Public Employment Programme that is co-ordinated by the Department of Public Works.

CWP has provided to date, 729 257 work opportunities over the MTEF period. The programme has a footprint in all local and metropolitan municipalities and is being implemented in 226 sites. As at the end of March 2018, the female participation in the programme stands at 78%, far above the set target of 55%, and the youth participation rate at 37%.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 115

This programme contributes to various sectors like agriculture, which includes the maintenance of community food gardens at schools, clinics, early childhood development centres. The produce harvested from the community gardens helps to feed the elderly as well as orphans and vulnerable children.

The second most common work output is in the environmental and community services sectors where public spaces and facilities were cleaned or maintained such as schools, hospitals, sports fields, grave yards and parks. Illegal dumping sites were cleared and recycling projects were undertaken at some of the sites. Blocked storm water drainage systems were unblocked, thus preventing potential flooding and therefore, saving lives.

As long as our economy is not generating sufficient jobs to absorb the majority of the unemployed, it is important for government to continue with this programme, to create work opportunities for the unemployed, especially the youth and women.

We are currently working on the reconfiguration of our antipoverty programme, in order to improve co-ordination between departments, integration and synergies. Poor co-ordination and monitoring sometimes undermine the impact of this programme. The extent of

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 116

upscaling this programme will be informed by the available Budget. As said by the Minister, for this current year, we think the Budget is sufficient to proceed with the programme. Thank you very much.

Mr S J MOHAI: Hon House Chair, thank you, Deputy President, for the response to this question. This is one important initiative, amongst many, that will generate work opportunities. Deputy President, you correctly pointed out that the current socioeconomic conditions warrant us, as a country, to be hard at work to ensure that work opportunities are created for our people. I want to say that these productive assets like early childhood centres - food gardens - where many of our people work, and even dealing with a health hazard with regard to illegal dumping is critical.

I want to believe that this is an area where the National Council of Provinces must improve its monitoring, to ensure that as many as possible job opportunities are rolled out by government.

The DEPUTY PRESIDENT: House Chairperson, really, as government, we think this programme is very helpful. It provides a safety net for those who are unemployed and vulnerable. It also assists us with the maintenance of public facilities and assets in those poor communities. It also encourages communities to accept ownership of

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 117

these assets like schools and clinics because the community in that ward must be responsible for their upkeep.

So, we think that it is very important and we must say that those that qualify for the different grants are not disadvantaged by their employment through these programmes. They continue to receive what is due to them in terms of the social grants. We just think that this programme is just there to augment what they receive or as a payment or as gratitude for the work done. Thank you very much.

IsiZulu:

Mnu M KHAWULA: Ngiyathokoza Sihlalo ohloniphekile, mhlonishwa Sekela Mongameli, sawubona.

English:

Hon Deputy President, does government consider the concept of CWP as part of decent work? If not, what is governments' concept of decent work? How does this programme of CWP relate to the promise of a million decent job opportunities to be created by government that was made about five years ago?

The DEPUTY PRESIDENT: House Chair, I am not very sure how we define something decent. Here, we are talking about the category of our

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 118

people that don't possess any skill. They have dropped out of school, they don't have any qualification, and they are poor and unemployed. Through the programme, certain artisan skills like painting are accredited for. So, they can paint, fix a part or do this or that. Within the programme, it is important not to just give a grant without giving a skill.

So, in the process, there is participation by the community in the maintenance of our infrastructure, thereby creating a sense of ownership. When people are angry and demand services, they turn against the very same assets that belong to them and torch them. We must fight against that. I think this programme helps them to develop a sense of ownership of these assets because the assets then belong to them.

I can say that the amount of money that each worker is being paid is just to enable them to escape from real poverty, to avoid just receiving a grant without doing anything. Finally, we want a person to acquire a skill. I am sure, down the line, a person can graduate. You can be taught how to fix a globe and finally become an electrician after being taught and accredited as such. Thank you.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 119

Mr O S TERBLANCHE: Chairperson, Deputy President, will you please undertake to ensure that the EPWP also feeds into the CWP? Thank you.

The DEPUTY PRESIDENT: House Chairperson, yes, I am sure, in a very short space of time, because one has been given the responsibility of co-ordinating all antipoverty programmes. We are trying to pull all those programmes together. So, there will not be a difference between CWP and EPWP. That will just be a programme. We are going to find a champion for each programme. Currently, EPWP is being championed by Public Works, CWP by Cogta. So, we want a very good co-ordination. Yes, I can assure the hon member that we are working on integrating all these antipoverty programmes. Thank you.

Ms T G MPAMBO-SIBHUKWANA: Deputy President, what are you going to do to ensure corruption by the agencies hired by CWP is stopped? How will you ensure that these agencies are adequately monitored to ensure that they are workers and that people actually in need of assistance from the programme, get placement and payments from these agencies?

The DEPUTY PRESIDENT: House Chair, as we try to integrate all these programmes, we are going to put the Department of Monitoring and

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 120

Evaluation in the Presidency to play a very important role in monitoring these programmes. Firstly, we want to monitor the impact that it makes in the lives of the people in general. Secondly, we want to ensure that the processes that are supposed to be followed - employment or how people are being selected - meet the necessary criteria.

Therefore, we will also look for corrupt practices in the process. It is also very helpful for members because you represent constituencies. If you detect something is not good somewhere, it is important to raise those matters, so that those who are responsible can deal with it.

I will be happy to have a separate chat with you. If you have noted anything that you think is not good, I will be happy to take that, follow up and give you a response on how we have dealt with the problem. Thank you.

Question 8:

The DEPUTY PRESIDENT: House Chairperson, the hon member here is asking a question about a meeting that I supposedly had with the president of the Russian Federation. To correct that, I have not had a meeting with the president.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 121

The purpose of the visit to Russia, as appointed by the President, was to deliver South Africa's message of congratulations, firstly, to the president on his re-election, as well as his subsequent inauguration as president of Russia. We will recall that President Ramaphosa could not attend the inauguration because of certain commitments. So, I had to do that, firstly, to convey that message.

We held a meeting with the Russian foreign affairs minister, who was assigned by the president for that meeting. In our discussions, we renewed South Africa's commitment to further develop the good relationship we have with Russia, guided by the 2013 Joint Declaration on the Establishment of a Comprehensive Strategic Partnership. We further discussed the importance of the implementation of the provisions of the declaration, especially pertaining to the annual political consultations by foreign ministers and consultations at presidential level.

In those engagements, we expressed South Africa's appreciation that Russia accepted the proposed dates to host the South Africa-Russia 15th Joint Intergovernmental Committee on Trade and Economic Co-operation, ITEC, Session in Moscow. The ITEC session is technical, made up of bureaucrats that normally sit to prepare for the Brics Summit. Before the Brics Summit takes place, all the bureaucrats

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 122

will sit and prepare all the documentation. So, I went there with a proposal that ITEC must sit on this day. They accepted the proposal. As we speak, that session has already taken place. Through that forum, we foster economic relations and strengthen the strategic relationship between the two countries. We also discussed the state of readiness of South Africa to host the 10th Brics Summit of Heads of State in Johannesburg.

The final issue we discussed was reforms of the United Nations. We enlisted the support of the Russian government for South Africa's candidature for the nonpermanent seat in the United Nations Security Council. Hon members would be aware that South Africa was finally overwhelmingly voted into the UN Security Council. Happily enough, Russia voted for South Africa.

In all the issues I have referred to above, there is no mention of nuclear, and no discussion has taken place regarding the so-called nuclear deal which we held. No reference was made about any current or future agreements. Having said that, our government's position on nuclear remains that it is part of our energy mix to diversify our sources of energy. Our Integrated Resource Plan to be concluded later in the year will determine the role of nuclear in that mix. Thank you very much. [Applause.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 123

Ms B A ENGELBRECHT: Chairperson, through you to the Deputy President: In light of your discussions with the Russian foreign affairs minister, can you please confirm whether or not you discussed the modus operandi for the conduct of political assassinations, in light of your own history of alleged involvement in political murders and the Russian government's alleged history of conducting political assassinations?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Order! Order, members! I don't need any assistance. Hon Engelbrecht, you know that the use of offensive, unbecoming language in the National Council of Provinces is against our own Rules. Now, you have just referred to the hon Deputy President in a very unbecoming way. Would you kindly withdraw what you have said?

Ms B A ENGELBRECHT: Mr Chairperson, I did say "alleged". It was no accusation.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Engelbrecht, apart from the fact that the question is a new one, you have referred to something that is against our own Rules. I am requesting you to retract that statement.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 124

Ms B A ENGELBRECHT: Mr Chair, I am completely confused. I have no idea what I have to retract. I am asking the Deputy President regarding the discussion with Russia. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Engelbrecht! Hon members, I don't need assistance. I am dealing with the hon Engelbrecht. Hon Engelbrecht, when we started earlier on today, I made a ruling, almost similar to what you are doing, about a member. If a member has a problem with my ruling, there is a procedure. For the last time, I am requesting you to retract what you have said in relation to the hon Deputy President.

Ms B A ENGELBRECHT: Mr Chair, can you just confirm what part of the question I must retract so that I understand what you are trying to tell me, since I am not sure? That is with due respect, really.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Engelbrecht, I am not going to engage with you in a discussion. It is either you retract what you have said ... [Interjections.] No, I am finalising with the hon Engelbrecht. Let me finish with the hon Engelbrecht. I will come to you. I am finishing with the hon Engelbrecht.

Ms B A ENGELBRECHT: Can I then rephrase?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 125

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): You can withdraw and rephrase your question. There is nothing wrong with it. I am not saying you are not going to ask your question. You are going to have the time to ask your question, but retract what you have said.

Ms B A ENGELBRECHT: Mr Chair, I am not sure what I have to retract because my wording was "alleged", so I withdraw the "alleged". So, it is not "alleged". I am not sure. So, in other words, I must withdraw the word "alleged". I am really not sure.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Can you start and ask your question? Ask your question.

Ms B A ENGELBRECHT: Alright, can I rephrase it and ask my question again?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Ask your question.

Ms B A ENGELBRECHT: Deputy President, in light of your discussions with the Russian foreign affairs minister, can you please confirm whether or not you discussed the modus operandi for the conduct of political assassinations, with the alleged involvement in political

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 126

murders and the Russian government's alleged history of conducting political assassinations?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Let me assist. Order, hon members! Let me assist you. Hon Engelbrecht, you know very well that in terms of the Rules of the NCOP, a supplementary question is linked to the original question. The first question - Question 8 - you can look at it. I am not going to read it for you. You know the question. You are introducing a completely new question not linked to this one. I will leave it to the hon Deputy President to decide if he is interested in commenting. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY PRESIDENT: House Chair, I think I must answer this question. Firstly, we have not discussed any political assassinations. That was not on the agenda. I have listed all the things we discussed. Again, I have to say if there is anyone with any information about political assassinations, please do the honourable thing and go to the law enforcements institutions, report it, and open a case. It does not help anyone to continue daily to allege and allege. That is tantamount to assassinating the character of a person. [Interjections.] You keep on alleging. You don't want to provide proof - even if you have all the institutions around you

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 127

where you can stand up and go and report anything that you think is wrong. So, I find it very ingenuous of you ...

An HON MEMBER: Ingenuous?

The DEPUTY PRESIDENT: ... disingenuous ...

Ms B A ENGELBRECHT: Disingenuous?

The DEPUTY PRESIDENT: ... disingenuous of you to continue to make allegations as an hon member. Thank you. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Engelbrecht, why are you standing - point of order to whom?

Ms B A ENGELBRECHT: Chair, may I please ask for your ruling? Is it parliamentary for the person standing and speaking to address me as "you"? He should be speaking through you, Chairperson.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon members, I don't need any assistance. I sustain your point of order. Hon Deputy President, when replying, you speak to hon members through the House Chairperson. So, I sustain your point of order.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 128

Mr M RAYI: House Chair, through you to the Deputy President: Given that the Russian people - Soviet in general - played a huge role in assisting us to achieve our liberation, what role is Russia going to play to ensure economic development in South Africa, given the agreements you engaged in with Russia? Thank you very much.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Rayi, it is exactly like the hon Engelbrecht, but I will leave it to the hon Deputy President. It is a completely new question, not linked to the original question. Deputy President, it is entirely up to you to comment.

The DEPUTY PRESIDENT: Chairperson, I have learned today that I must answer you, hon member, through him. [Laughter.] I must go through him to answer you. I will try and do that. The history that you refer to is very important.

Mr M M CHABANGU: Chairperson, on a point of order: Let me just reiterate the fact that the Deputy President ... [Interjections.] ... on procedure - the Deputy President is still on his feet.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon members, the arrangement of having the Deputy President at the podium is to allow him to face

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 129

you. As you were asking, I thought you were not raising an issue about that.

Mr M M CHABANGU: I was merely asking the question whether it is parliamentary for the Deputy President, even if he is your homeboy, to say, should I speak through "him". He must say the following: Should I speak through the hon Deputy Chairperson? Thank you.

The DEPUTY PRESIDENT: I am going to speak through the House Chair. [Laughter.] Am I right now? [Laughter.] Thank you. I am going to speak through the House Chair.

The follow-up question, I want to say to the hon member - through you, House Chair - that our history, where we come from as a country, we cannot ignore that past, that very important past, when we were struggling for our freedom.

Therefore, I think the conceptualisation of Brics was a very important platform for those countries to come together and define their development path. Our participation in Brics, Russia's participation in Brics, and that of China, India, and Brazil - it is a very important platform where those developed nations like China and Russia can assist those nations that are still in the process of

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 130

development. That is why there was the conceptualisation of a Brics bank that will allow all the Brics countries to tap into that bank for their own development.

Truly speaking, I don't think Russia is just folding its arms. It is really pulling out all stops to assist developing nations like ours who have just emerged out of our freedom to develop our own country. Thank you very much.

Mr C F B SMIT: House Chair, in light of the Deputy President responding to the hon Engelbrecht's question, I would like to know if, at any point, a discussion was had between the Deputy President and the government of Putin on the modus operandi for the conduct of rigging elections, ahead of South Africa's upcoming election - this in light of the Russian government's alleged involvement in rigging elections in both its own country and other democracies?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon members! Hon members! Order, all members! Allow me to be very consistent. What I did since we started, almost all of these supplementary questions are new, but I am leaving it to the hon Deputy President. Before doing that, let me take the hon Chief Whip.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 131

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE COUNCIL: Chair, I am standing on Rule 46, which says that no member may deliberately make a statement in the Council which the member knows is false. I think, let's really have integrity. We call the Deputy President once a term to this House to engage on very issues of nation-building. So, we must seize this opportunity to discuss such matters.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon members, I am sustaining the point of order and appealing to all of you - all of you - to refrain from anything that will degenerate and compromise a very important event on the NCOP calendar, that of having the Deputy President coming to the NCOP to respond to questions.

The DEPUTY PRESIDENT: House Chair, well, I realise that I have been generous and trying very hard to answer to new questions.

[Interjections.] I have come to a point that I am not going to answer a new question anymore. [Interjections.] Thank you.

[Applause.]

Question 9:

The DEPUTY PRESIDENT: Concerns regarding the recruitment of the Expanded Public Works Programme, EPWP, participants have been raised previously. There have been some accusations levelled against

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 132

political parties on unfair recruitment processes. Let me categorically state that the abuse of recruitment of EPWP participants for narrow party political, factional, or individual reasons is unethical and unacceptable, irrespective of party-political affiliation of those involved.

In response to the concerns raised, the Department of Public Works and all other key role-players have developed the EPWP Recruitment Guidelines which were approved by the Minister of Labour in December 2017. These guidelines are to be used by all the EPWP employing government departments to ensure that the recruitment of the EPWP participants is undertaken in a fair, transparent and equitable manner, whilst also ensuring that the EPWP targeted groups are reached.

These recruitment guidelines have been widely workshopped with and distributed to implementing bodies, and they are also posted on the EPWP website. To follow up on this, the Minister of Public Works will on 28 June 2018 promote the EPWP Recruitment Guidelines in KwaZulu-Natal. This will be followed by provincial roadshows to further raise awareness of these guidelines. Where they are well-run, EPWP projects have demonstrated a clear ability to help build

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 133

social cohesion in poor communities. Partisan recruitment, if and when it occurs, undermines this critical endeavour.

We do, of course, need to be aware that in communities in which there are high levels of unemployment and in which EPWP work opportunities will not be available to all, there might be an unfair impression that exclusion has been based on party political or other grounds. That is why recruitment should always occur in a transparent manner that can be verified by the community at large. This is what the recruitment guidelines seek to promote.

In the event that there are cases where the recruitment of EPWP participants is not undertaken in a fair, transparent and equitable manner, Members of Parliament and the broader public are requested to report this, particularly to the Department of Public Works for further investigations and decision. Thank you very much.

Mr M M CHABANGU: Thank you Deputy President, the ruling party has used the Expanded Public Works Programme as an extension of its patronage network, with ANC cadres and members being given first preference in the allocation of the network of the Expanded Public Works Programme jobs that municipalities allocate. This happens across the country but in my province, in the Free State, it is

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 134

extremely bad and the practice has collapsed the purpose of the Expanded Public Works Programme. Deputy President, how do you plan to remedy this problem and ensure that Expanded Public Works Programme jobs are available for all South Africans regardless of their political affiliation? I thank you.

The DEPUTY PRESIDENT: House Chair, I think with regard to this follow-up question, the answer is what I provided in the first question. Let us ensure that the recruitment process happens in a fair and transparent manner so that there is no one who will say that this people were appointed in darkness and the criterion that was used is not known. If something is not done in a transparent manner, members of the community in that neighbourhood have the right to question it then and there before it can even get higher up where they will ask how these people were appointed. Remember that as the ANC we are quite aware of our role as a governing party. We want free and fair elections but beyond us winning the elections, we carry the responsibility of even serving those people that have lost elections. For example, as we deliver services we cannot discriminate people by saying that we are going to give houses to those who have voted for the DA or the EFF. We don't do that. If we do that, it means that we don't understand our responsibility.

[Interjections.] Like I have said, if there are people who do that

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 135

in the name of the ANC, they should know that it is unethical, unacceptable and it must not be done. Thank you.

Mr L V MAGWEBU: Thank you House Chair and Deputy President, notwithstanding the guidelines, one has to admit that the Expanded Public Works Programme has indeed a noble endeavour. However, implementation has been a challenge and found to be appalling. When we took over Tshwane, Nelson Mandela Bay and Johannesburg as the DA, we have found this programme riddled with lots of corruption - insidious levels of corruption.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Order! Order! Hon members! Hon members ... [Interjections.] ... Hon Magwebu, I am assisting you. Hon members! Hon members, even though heckling is allowed, you cannot be drowning the speaker. Let's allow him to ask a supplementary question. Hon Magwebu, you are protected.

Mr L V MAGWEBU: Thank you House Chair. Deputy President, notwithstanding the guidelines that are in place now, my question is, "In the spirit of transparency, will you consider a centralised online database so that all South Africans can see the beneficiaries and those who have applied?" In my view, as it has been done in our

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 136

municipalities, it has fostered the spirit of transparency in practical terms. What is your response to that?

The DEPUTY PRESIDENT: I am ready to answer the questions ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon members! Hon ...

[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY PRESIDENT: Well, the Expanded Public Works Programme and the Community Works Programme, CWP, are programmes that are ward based. Recruitment is done at a ward level where that programme is going to be implemented. Gradually, we are going through this digital highway - I am sure our children will be able to use the website because all of them will be educated and will be able to use those things. Now as we speak, there are people who are already working in these programmes and those that are candidates to work in these programmes. I said that these people have no schooling and they do not have access to all the media houses and social media platforms and it would be very difficult to co-ordinate. Co-ordination should be at a close range.

Like we said, if we can ensure that this recruitment of participants at ward level is transparent and is monitored by the community

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 137

there, it would yield better results. What I have said when I started here is that as government we need to strengthen the monitoring and evaluation and also evaluate the impact of these programmes. We should ensure that the money we are paying as salaries to these people is used towards a good cause. For example, we should see to it that that school is renovated, that the road is fixed and so on. Beyond that, we must ensure that all the processes in employing participant are fair and transparent.

There has been an outcry that councillors in some areas use their party affiliation to employ members that they think belong to their party and overlook communities and households that are in dire need. The aim of the programme is to try and alleviate poverty. There are families or households in the community where one can see that there is no one working and no one knows whether they have anything to eat before they sleep. So, if there is a need for a participant for the Public Works programme, first preference for employment is to be offered to members of that family. If that is done in a fair and transparent manner, communities will not have a problem. I have done that in the past. I have build houses for people who are in need and each time I choose a household that needs to be assisted, the entire community agrees with me because poverty cannot be hidden. Poverty cannot be hidden and you know it when your neighbour is in need more

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 138

than you are in need. If I choose your neighbour, you will agree that my choice is correct - that in fact your neighbour needs more help than you. So, we want to refine those guidelines, put them into practice and ensure that we monitor these programmes, right at the local level - at the municipal level, at a provincial government level and at a national level so that from time to time we get feedback. There is a lot of money that we put in these programmes and we must ensure that these programmes yield the desired outcomes. Thank you.

Mr E MAKUE: Deputy President, let me start with the question and the motivation. My question is with regard to the fact that the EPWP is not an alternative to full-time employment. Can you please motivate in your reply whether you agree or disagree with me on that. In the EPWP, it is important to remember that this programme has its origins in the Growth and Development Summit that was held in 2003. At that summit, four themes were adopted, one of which was "More jobs, better jobs, decent work for all". Now I want to assert further that the question before us is mischievous and disingenuous when it refers to persons who are employed in this programme. Deputy President, in your answer you consistently used the word "recruitment" of people and not "employment" of people. The final part I want to raise ...

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 139

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Makue. Order members! Order members! Order members! Hon members! Hon members, it is time for supplementary questions. The person who has asked the original question is the one who has the right to make some remarks or say anything but should not respond to questions. Conclude your question, hon Makue.

Mr E MAKUE: House Chairperson, for the sake of the House, I will repeat my original question, which is for the Deputy President to motivate whether he agrees that the Expanded Public Works Programme is not an alternative to government's plan to create full-time employment. Thank you very much, House Chairperson.

The DEPUTY PRESIDENT: That is correct. I am quite excited about your understanding of the programme. You clearly understand the programme. What has become a controversial matter here is that those people that you recruited by putting them in the programme and giving them necessary skills while in the process you give them an incentive, has been misconstrued as an employment - that is why we have this problem today - everyone is queuing because it is alleged that this programme is an employment. But finally, the people who are recruited into this programme - which is a passage towards acquiring a skill, are better placed to utilise the skill after

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 140

acquiring it. They can be a small contractor or they can be a small entrepreneur where one works for oneself. You can be a painter, a carpenter and you can fix this and that because you have an accreditation that the programme assisted you in acquiring. Of late, this programme is seen as an employment. Thank you.

Setswana:

Moh N P KONI: Motlatsamoporesitente, ke tla bua Setswana fa ke botsa potso. [Tsenoganong.] O ka se nkutlwe? A mme ke leke go bua sekgowa le fa ke sa kgone go se bua.

English:

I will try to speak in English but I also do not understand it. Deputy President, things you were saying about the EPWP projects where before community members are to be hired - especially women, it is very unfortunate that there would be threats where women are expected to sleep with those people who are responsible to hire them in exchange for a job. If they do not do that then they do not get a job. Secondly, the other thing you said is that hiring must not be based on which party one affiliated to, but unfortunately it is happening. My question is, "Deputy President, is there a system that you can create or formulate where we will be able to identify people who are appointed or hired because they are in a relationship with

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 141

people who are responsible for hiring or where we will be able to identify people who are not in a relationship with those people? Can the Office of the Deputy President assure us that they will create that system where we can easily identify those people who are hired or appointed because they are in relationship with those who are responsible for hiring? Thank you.

The DEPUTY PRESIDENT: I get the question, exactly. You see, we must decide where we want to start. There is a problem out there already. A good programme of government is now being abused by those people who are administering it. Now, one thing to fix this problem is to chase and go after each and every individual. You should correct the guidelines. If you correct your guidelines you will eliminate all these bad practices. For instance, the criterion for participation in the EPWP should be corrected and be made transparent so that it eliminate favouritism and eliminate a situation where a councillor who is responsible for the programme can ask for sexual favours in return. The criterion which will not allow such because it will be transparent and it will allow community members to have a say.

A simple thing I once did is that I went to a community where I identified a house and I decided to build a house for this old woman. I wanted to know how many contractors there are in that

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 142

community. In the meeting I held with the community I found out that there are almost more than 10 contractors in that community, so I decided to do a small exercise - a raffle game. I put names in a basket and told the contractors that anyone who is going to pick up a piece of paper from that basket with the name of the old woman written on it will be chosen to build the house for the old woman. I am just giving you a simple example of what I did. When we came out of that meeting no one said that the MEC has chosen the contractor and no one said they do not know what criterion was used to choose this contractor over the other. I just made a simple thing to say it is his luck because he chose the right paper. In this case we want to create guidelines that will eliminate all these corrupt practices. Hon members, I can tell you that you will come here and complain about malpractices in the programme if we do not create the necessary framework to do away with these malpractices. Our office will participate, the guidelines are already out there, they are consulting. Finally, we will have a say as well. We want to tighten these guidelines and the criteria. If anyone has gone outside the criteria or guidelines must face disciplinary action.

Question 10:

The DEPUTY PRESIDENT: Chairperson, the Department of Rural Development and Land Reform, in partnership with the Department of

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 143

Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries, hosted an Operation Phakisa segment on Agriculture, Land Reform, and Rural Development, launched by President Zuma on 24 February 2017. The sustainable, managed assets, resources and technology, SMART, Agri-village and the accelerated land redistribution and development initiative are some of the initiatives prioritised by this operation to address the plight of labour tenants and farm dwellers. These departments have engaged with different stakeholders to solicit their commitment and participation in the implementation of these initiatives.

Through accelerated land redistribution development initiatives, government will acquire agricultural land to promote smallholder production of high-value horticulture and small livestock farming within 10 to 60km of rural service areas, rural towns and peri-urban areas across the country. This includes the development of serviced land and provision of bulk infrastructure in conjunction with our municipalities, banks, development finance institutions, the private sector, and land developers. The Department of Rural Development and Land Reform is piloting the accelerated land redistribution development initiatives on 54 farms over the next three years.

With regard to smart Agri-villages, Operation Phakisa initiated an integrated, holistic and co-ordinated on or off farm worker house

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 144

ownership plan, based on a partnership between farmers, farm workers and the state. This partnership will seek to secure title deeds for farm workers in houses and on land that they own. It will be complemented by the provision of basic, public infrastructure and services to create sustainable human settlement. The partners are presently conducting research to develop a best practice model to facilitate land transfer for the construction of SMART Agri-villages and housing for the benefit of farm dwellers and labour tenants.

In addition, the Department of Rural Development and Land Reform has prioritised the settlement of 8 500 labour tenant applications for land acquisition, and award of 28 000 hectares of land to farm dwellers and labour tenants, and will settle 3 369 land restitution claims.

Whereas government is making progress within the existing framework to address land reform, we do acknowledge that the pace is slow and it is not enough. That is why the report on the High-Level Panel on the Assessment of Key Legislation and the Acceleration of Fundamental Change recommended slight amendments to the Extension of Security of Tenure Act and the Land Reform (Labour Tenants) Act. These amendments included a special focus on the redistributive

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 145

aspect in order to address land ownership for labour tenants and farm dwellers. Thank you, House Chair.

Ms Z V NCITHA: Hon Chair, let me express my appreciation to the Deputy President for his comprehensive response to the question that I asked. I would like to know the following: In line with the programme on SMART Agri-villages he has identified, is there meaningful participation from those who will be beneficiaries from the programme in a language that is accessible to them so that they are not spectators in their own development? Thank you very much.

The DEPUTY PRESIDENT: House Chair, the programme can't continue without the involvement of the beneficiaries, because, first of all, one needs to understand their economic way of life, their day-to-day living. Some live on subsistence farming. Some are smallholder cattle stock farmers. Now, one needs to understand their situation before one can design a village that will be suitable for settlement and also to sustain their livelihoods. That one can only do if one gives grazing to their cattle and if one allows them space to farm so that their lives are sustainable and the settlement becomes sustainable. Thank you.

IsiZulu:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 146

Mnu M KHAWULA: Ngiyathokoza Sihlalo ohloniphekile, mhlonishwa iPhini likaMongameli ...

English:

You have given in your response a lot about land restitution initiatives and land redistribution programmes.

IsiZulu:

Uyabona ke uma kukhulunywa ngomhlaba thina sinobaba uNzimande nobab'umthethwa sesimane sithukeze, simane sijeqeze. Sihamba sijeqeza ukuthi nakho ke, kwase kusukile futhi loko.

English:

Can you allay our fears - all these land redistribution and land initiative programmes have nothing to do with the Ingonyama Trust Land? [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Order, members!

Mr M KHAWULA: This is land that is already in the hands of the previously disadvantaged people, especially the rural people of KwaZulu-Natal, the custodianship of which is under the King of the Zulu nation and the amakhosi of the Zulu nation. Can you allay our

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 147

fears, because, I think the objective of these programmes - you will agree with me - is to do with bringing back that which was taken from the real owners?

Now, the Ingonyama Trust Land is land that is already in the hands of the real owners of the land. Can you allay our fears, sir? Thank you.

The DEPUTY PRESIDENT: House Chair, I don't think there should be any fears. No fears. [Interjections.] Let us try and explain what we mean, to give all of us an understanding about what we mean about land.

In this case, we are talking about communal land. Communal land is in the hands of our traditional leaders. Our traditional leaders are custodians of the land, on behalf of their communities.

[Interjections.] Yes! Now, what we are advocating there is that, as a traditional leader, instead of giving your community member permission to occupy, give that community member a title deed.

HON MEMBERS: Yes! Yes! [Applause.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 148

The DEPUTY PRESIDENT: So, we are together there? We are together there. This title deed ... because you are not helping if this land really belongs to the community and you are holding it on behalf of the community, why refuse to give them a title deed? They are, after all, the rightful owners. [Interjections.]

In addition, economically, the land is not an asset. It might be very good land but because we don't want to give a title deed, we can't use it as collateral. We can't use it anywhere for development. The owner of the land becomes poor, so why don't you allow this one to hold a title? Even if people ... it does happen now ... you see, House Chair, in rural areas, in traditional areas, you see the development of chain stores and shopping malls.

If any private-sector company wants to come and build a mall on communal land, the process is as follows. First of all, the chief or inkosi must be notified and the inkosi or chief must call a community meeting. The Department of Land Affairs and all those stakeholders should be there at that community meeting, so that that land is alienated through a community agreement.

Now, when it is alienated, it is then given to the person who wants to develop a mall. That person can then go and apply for a title

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 149

deed because there is a community resolution stating that yes, a mall can be built there. That land is now economically active. It has got value.

What is happening currently is that, even with our own traditional leaders ... from my previous job you will understand that I was someone very close to traditional leaders. I assisted them in tilling the land. I assisted them with moving around because they didn't have cars. We bought them cars. We bought them tractors. Traditional leaders are a very important aspect of our lives. So, I will always respect them. However, what is missing?

Every day, they come to me and complain. I say to them I see informal settlements mushrooming in their areas and ask them why this is so. They say it is the council. Because I am a chief, I have appointed a traditional council. This traditional council goes around allocating stands to people and they pay the council without the knowledge of the chief.

So, that system is very chaotic. We go to sleep tonight and there is no settlement. When we wake up tomorrow, there is a settlement. Someone has taken money and what has happened in between? They have just given this person permission to occupy without a title deed.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 150

That permission has not been given by the traditional leader, him- or herself, so it's flawed. Even if our traditional leaders can cry about this or that, they must know that holding this land has now become a hot potato for them, because people are invading the land. They are doing all sorts of things and they are losing control.

I don't think the way communal land sits now under the custodianship of traditional leaders is a problem. There is no problem as long as community members are able to access the land and have title deeds, because it is their land. We are not threatening any traditional leader here. That must be understood.

In fact, we are fighting over a bone that has no meat on it because the land we are fighting about is not productive. There is no water there. Those are the areas we used to call the homelands. There is nothing there. It is barren. There is dust. The soil is not productive. Those areas were carefully selected. You see people staying on top of mountains. They can't plough anything. So, why do you fight about this? Thank you.

Question 11:

The DEPUTY PRESIDENT: Chairperson, hon Labuschadgne goes back to the same issue of the Communal Land Tenure Bill. The hon member should

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 151

remember that communal land refers to land inhabited by African communities in what we used to call former "homelands" which according to apartheid laws could not be registered in the South African natives name and continue to be held by the state in the democratic era.

Let me reiterate that land in traditional communities belong to the people. Therefore, the objective of the Communal Land Bill is to clarify in detail how security of tenure is addressed and to remove any confusion around land ownership and use, as prescribed under Customary Law.

However, there has been a distortion of Customary Law that at times affects security of tenure of people living in communal land. To address this point, the Department of Rural Development and Land Reform has published the Communal Land Tenure Bill for public comments. The Bill provides for the transfer of ownership of communal land to communities that occupy such land.

It further provides for the transfer of ownership of residential portions that are currently occupied by community members to such community members. It is therefore, envisaged that under this Bill this communities will have title deeds for their communal land and

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 152

members of communities will have title deeds for their residential and business portions.

The process of soliciting public comments has been concluded and the department is currently considering all comments put forward as we are working towards the finalisation of the Bill. Thus, it will be premature to speculate more or less the outcome of this process and the public comments. You will realise that this matter is close to the hearts of South Africans. Thank you.

Ms C LABUSCHAGNE: Chairperson, in light of the fact that Communal Land Tenure Bill that you referred to is in progress, we are all aware that there are still problems with the Communal Property Associations, CPAs, and I would like to draw your view to the fact that there are a few distorting facts - one of is that - the government spends more money on VIP protection for politicians than land reform. There are tens of thousands of South Africans living in abject poverty in South Africa with no security of tenure.

The DA visited more than 1 500 of these South Africans in the Gwatyu community and discovered first hand the lack of government action. An elderly man in that community was forced off his land on the very same day you were answering oral questions in the National Assembly

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 153

on communal land tenure, Deputy President. Yet, the Gwatyu Communal Property Association remain unregistered, and without the ownership of the land that they have lived on for generations.

While we welcome the Minister of Rural Development and Rural Reform's commitment yesterday for the land rights enquiry to be presented to the department, this promise speaks only to the delivery of a land audit and is dead silent on the registration of CPAs that is two years overdue. What plan of action does your government have to ensure that the Gwatyu CPA is registered? And if any, what is the deadline for this registration? Thank you.

The DEPUTY PRESIDENT: House Chair, the hon member talks about a specific Communal Property Association, CPA. I might not be quite aware of the details why the CPA is not registered. I will be glad to make a follow-up on that matter to understand why. When a CPA is elected the Department of Rural Development and Land Affairs becomes part of that meeting, to monitor the elections of the CPA and the term of office is determined. The CPA right from that meeting becomes a recognised entity. Why is this not recognised? I will have to find out.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 154

Coming to the principle itself of a CPA, whether it is a workable model or not... because in most instances the CPA members are bogged down with infightings, they don't till the land. At times they find the land productive and the production level of the land goes down each day because they are no longer focusing on the production. But when you go to the Freedom Charter it says "The land shall be shared amongst those who work it". So, people must work the land.

There is one category of people that are saying we have been removed from our land and we can show that we were staying there. But some of those people come and say "no, now, I am no longer staying in land I am putting a claim but in exchange I want money" which I think it should be discouraged.

If you claim the land you must work the land. Because you find that land productive and you must increase the production of that land. We are not challenging the claim itself. You might have been incorrectly removed but when your right is restored, till the land. The production capacity of South Africa has gone down and I am sure it is because of the slow pace, the uncertainty of land redistribution and restitution.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 155

We must have a resolve. We must resolve on how best we want to conduct this process. But the bottom line of this process is that the rights of people on their land must be restored. But these people must till the land.

IsiZulu:

Asibhekanga nje ukuthi abantu bathole umhlaba bese bayolala ngaphansi kwezihlahla. Abantu kumele basebenze bawulime lo mhlaba. [Ihlombe.]

Ms D B NGWENYA: Chairperson, a key problem regarding this communal land and all land in South Africa for that matter is the lack of access for women to the land. For the past 24 years of democracy the government has failed to distribute land to black people, especially to black women. The most logical step government can take to address this issue, is to expropriate the land without compensation to equal distribution of which women should be the key beneficiaries.

My question to you Deputy President is, what do you believe has been the reason why government has failed in distributing land to women specifically. And what is the government's commitment to remedy this? Considering that we are left with less than two years before we come an end of a decade of empowering women which was from 2010

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 156

to 2020. What is the government's commitment to giving land to women? Thank you.

The DEPUTY PRESIDENT: Chairperson, the question is spot on, that there is a section of our community that has been lagging behind, that is still engulfed with all sorts of problems of the past. That section of our community is women and young girls.

A fair amount of progress has been made but scattered - I mean our effort to try and restore land to women has been scattered. We need an integrated approach, because - I will tell you what - there is land that is in communal areas, there is land that is in the hands of government, that can be given to those women, put them together, allow them to till the land. So, it is not a question of really... the lack of land. We do have land. Some of you who might have visited my former province where I was working, you will be aware of a programme called "Fortune 40".

Fortune 40 is a group of young girls grouped together; they are given a farm, if they decide to grow chicken. Government will support them and put those broilers and give them the first stock of small chicken and then they grow that way. Some are given cattle, they go into stock farming, some go into vegetable farming and the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 157

programme is spreading. I am not saying this is the only project - I am aware that rural development has done a lot of projects but our efforts are not co-ordinated. So, we can't realise the impact that we want. Thank you.

Question 12:

The DEPUTY PRESIDENT: House Chair, the question here is about the Human Resource Development Council, HRDC. On 10 to 11 May this year we hosted the third HRDC Summit that was attended by similar institutions from elsewhere in the region with an intention to develop new networks, strengthen existing partnerships and share the latest lessons on how, through education and skills transfer, we can transform our economies in the light of emerging trends in the global economy, especially the implications of what is termed the Fourth Industrial Revolution.

At that summit, a point was made that the pace of change over the last few years has largely been shaped by technological disruptions and innovations. These disruptions have an equal impact on the current set of jobs in the market. This means that as we continue to focus on skills development, we must bear in mind that, even jobs that were considered as vocational, are now becoming high tech and require specialised knowledge and skills.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 158

This reality suggests that digital disruption will impact on how we do things. Therefore, as South Africa, we need to embrace this global trend or risk becoming less competitive on the global stage. As part of this embrace, our training and skills development must be accelerated to keep up with the pace of change.

For our part as government, the Department of Science and Technology is currently investing in the technological building blocks of this revolution. To this effect, it will develop a public-funded science, technology and innovation plan of action over the next 12 to 18 months for socioeconomic impact in the context of this revolution that we are speaking about.

Through smart investments in research and development, the Department of Science and Technology is supporting the South African industry to grow and create more jobs through building scientific, technological and knowledge-based capabilities.

We need a private sector that is engaged, so that as a country we can unlock the full potential of the education and training sector. Future value creation lies in humans and machines working together to create new user experiences, new products, new services and new possibilities.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 159

We must therefore put relevant programmes in place to develop the necessary skills through rethinking education systems and incentivising lifelong learning. This is why investment in early childhood development is critical.

For its part, the HRDC has held road shows to create awareness regarding the human resource development strategy towards 2030 with various structures, including the provincial human resource development forums, provincial human resource development councils, provincial skills development forums, public sector trainer's forum; and all these institutions that are involved in skills training. Thank you very much, House Chair.

Sepedi:

Ngaka H E MATEME: Mohlomphegi Motlatšamopresidente wa Repabliki ya Afrika-Borwa, ke leboga karabo ye o e filego setšhaba go re sedimoša gore le rena re le badudi ba naga ye, re ka se šalele morago ge "Fourth Industrial Revolution" e fihla gomme e tšwela pele.

English:

Deputy President, if you consider the urban-rural divide, oftentimes programmes of this nature will favour the urban side. Then we also go to the previously historically disadvantaged. They also become

the agterosse. [stragglers.] My leader, can we be reassured that as we enter this Fourth Industrial Revolution, we will do so in an equitable manner, meaning ...

Sepedi:

... bale ba bego ba sa hwetše selo kgale, e be bona re ba hlokomelago.

English:

Can we become sensitive and implement these new programmes in an equitable manner, my leader? Thank you.

The DEPUTY PRESIDENT: This Fourth Industrial Revolution can only happen when there is a society that is capable enough to drive its own development. A society that is not capable will be left behind. We can only be capable by preparing ourselves, by educating our children, by giving our children the necessary skills and by moving with the current artificial technologies so that we are always up to date as a nation. In that way we will be able to lead our own development.

In the case of our country - from where we come from - we must separate between two things. Right from that day when we got our

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 161

freedom as a country, we should've said, no child must be found at home if that child is of school-going age, so that there is a break from the past.

Now, we have people where the damage has already been done. You see, when you take your car to a motor mechanic or panelbeaters, at times they tell you, this car is beyond repair. That means we can't fix it. It's too damaged.

Earlier we talked about programmes that we are initiating as government – your Community Work Programme, CWP, your Expanded Public Works Programme, EPWP. These are programmes that are trying to pull the rest so that finally they acquire skills. You can't have a South African who does not have a skill because such a South African will hinder our progress ... our movement forward.

Collectively we possess strength. That is why it's important that, for this country to develop further, we as a country must acknowledge the wrongs of the past and collectively fix them.

Now, what should happen ... We are undermining ourselves ... our potential because there is still these racial tendencies amongst ourselves, but when I look at this country, it has huge potential.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 162

The way we address one another ... Some nations are moving forward. We are trapped in things that are meaningless for advancement.

If we can all acknowledge that ... Let's give our young people, let's give everyone in the country a skill. All the programmes of government that are designed to give people skills must be prioritised and I'm happy if you are complaining about the abuse of such programmes that are designed to give people skills. It is our terrain where we must protect our resources as a country to ensure that they go to the rightful beneficiaries. But the end result is that we will have a nation that is capable of developing itself.

Our young people ... Yes, they are in the schooling system; they have graduated. I am not very sure standing here ... given the fact that yesterday we were told that in the last quarter our economy has just gone down. Our prospects that we had ... no, we are going to grow at 1,5%. That dream seems to be shattered. Why? Why?

Is it because we do not have the necessary people? When I go around I am told we have graduates without employment moving around. How come? Maybe these graduates have followed skills that are not in demand, because your economy is looking for particular skills. The role of the HRDC is to evaluate the demand out there in our economy,

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 163

then to respond to the demand and prepare people to access those opportunities there.

A country like ours should have invested a lot in mining and in agriculture because those are critical sectors of our economy that makes us. So we should be advanced. We should probably have invested a lot in giving our people skills around there.

I can go on and on and on, but the fact of the matter is that those that are in the cracks and those that have not completed school ... There is an effort. The Minister of Higher Education will be launching something called a community college ... something less than a technical and vocational education and training, TVET, college. It will allow you to go even without any qualifications, but you will leave that community college with a skill. We need everyone to have a skill. Then you will see that the movement forward is going to be a bit faster. Thank you.

Mr S G MTHIMUNYE: Thank you, House Chair. Deputy President, over the past few years the country developed a policy around human resource development. That was the Joint Initiative on Priority Skills Acquisition, Jipsa, which was attached to former President Thabo Mbeki in the main. Concurrent to that, there was an economic policy

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 164

called Growth, Employment and Redistribution, Gear. They have since been incorporated into what is now the national blueprint, the National Development Plan, NDP.

In talking about the Fourth Industrial Revolution, earlier in your response you made reference to former homelands ... Bantustans ... places where people were dumped and where there is no real term economic activities happening. I'm taking about ...

IsiNdebele:

... ngekhethu laphe ngibuya khona, uyakwazi Sekela Mongameli.

English:

A few years ago the Transport Minister came to this House, and undertook and made a commitment that the ... [Inaudible.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Mthimunye, for the benefit of the House, they would want to understand the response what the hon Deputy President ...

IsiNdebele:

... uyakwazi bona ngibuyaphi ...

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 165

English:

Specify bona ubuyaphi for the benefit of the House.

IsiNdebele:

Nom S G MTHIMUNYE: Hhayi, uyangazi uSekela Mongameli laphe ngibuya khona ngekhethu kwaNdebele. Laphe ngibuya khona Sekela Mongameli ...

English:

Deputy President, there was a commitment, and I want to believe that this project fits properly and perfectly in with the Fourth Industrial Revolution, in the context of developing skills to see that project realised, and coupled with that, the declaration of a special economic zone in that area – the Moloto Rail coupled with a special economic zone. What is your thinking around that, so that we can ignite economic development in that area?

The DEPUTY PRESIDENT: House Chair, I listened to the question and it's like I must commit myself ... [Laughter.] ... that this project is going to happen. All that I can say to the hon member through you, House Chair, is that it's a project that was adopted by government, of which I am part. I am aware that there are efforts to try and get that project back on track because the reality is that you have a very big working population that is always in transit

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 21 JUNE 2018

Page: 166

between former KwaNdebele and Pretoria, and a lot of people are dying on that road. All attempts have been made to expand the road but it's quite clear that it just gets congested and congested. So, the Moloto Rail Corridor development is now a necessity, if you want to allow that community a better link access to their job opportunities and to allow them to develop to a different level ... to have new problems rather than having old problems forever. I'm sure there will be movement in that regard.

Well, we must notice that as a country, as much as we want to move forward, we have our own constraints. We might not have been wise in terms of our choices on where to invest, but what I can tell you is that over the past 10 years or so this government ... our investment in infrastructure is starting to yield the necessary results. We could have insisted on building ... From the 2010 mood of building stadiums and all that, we should have sustained ... We would be far now in terms of access, economic activities and getting our people active in their own economy. I'm sure government will find a way of reigniting the infrastructure development programme. [Applause.]

The Council adjourned at 15:46.