

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY SESSION - COMMITTEE ROOM E249**

**THURSDAY, 17 MAY 2018**

**PAGE: 1**

**THURSDAY, 17 MAY 2018**

---

***PROCEEDINGS OF MINI-PLENARY SESSION - COMMITTEE ROOM E249***

---

Members of the mini-plenary session met in Committee Room E249 at

Ms M G Boroto, as Chairperson, took the Chair and requested members to observe a moment of silence for prayer or meditation.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon members, let me first acknowledge the presence of our guests in the gallery, you are welcome to share with us in this EPC, more especially to our mother, Mama Sophie de Bruyn Williams. I just want to say that unfortunately the National Assembly have got rules; and the Rules are that our guests should not participate in the processes of the debate.

Whenever you get excited just smile or just wave and don't clap your hands, don't even use your phones to take photos or so, those are Rules unfortunately. We welcome you and we appreciate your presence.

**APPROPRIATION BILL**

Debate on Vote No 13 - Department of Women in the Presidency:

UNREVISED HANSARD

MINI PLENARY SESSION – COMMITTEE ROOM E249

THURSDAY, 17 MAY 2018

PAGE: 2

The MINISTER OF WOMEN IN THE PRESIDENCY: Chairperson, Chairperson of the portfolio committee, members of the portfolio committee, representatives of civil society and the women's movement present, veterans of the straggly, Mam Sophie-uMme, I also saw her, Mam Nomusa, there is also a veteran from the IFP, ladies and gentlemen, fellow South Africans, we stand before this august House to present the Budget Vote 13 of the Department of Women for the 2018-19 financial year.

We present this budget during a difficult time in our country. It is as if South Africans have declared war against women. In the street, in the home, the factory, the office, the mine, the school, the taxi rank, in the combis that operate scholar transport, at church, the university, the playground, the boardroom, as mothers, as professionals in the corporate sector, as gogos; we are not safe in our own country.

The situation of women in our country has reached levels where it has become important to ask; what exactly is the meaning of freedom for women? We must reflect as a society on where the women of South Africa are after 24 years of democratic rule.

Our hands are dripping with the blood of a two-month-old baby, toddlers and girls that are raped by their fathers, uncles, cousins,

UNREVISED HANSARD

MINI PLENARY SESSION – COMMITTEE ROOM E249

THURSDAY, 17 MAY 2018

PAGE: 3

teachers, bosses, lecturers and friends in our families. Young women who are at their prime are raped, maimed and killed by their boyfriends and their husbands. These lovers do not understand the words angifuni, angisakufuni, ga ke sa go rata, I do not love you anymore!

Constable Rasuge, Karabo Mokoena, Zolile Khumalo, Reeva Steenkamp and many other thousands of women in our country lost their lives in the hands of men who were their lovers. Shockingly, our femicide rate is five times more than the global average.

South Africa is a Country with the best Constitution but women's rights are violated on a daily basis. They are violated even at institutions of higher learning. Today young men at universities, where they should focus on their future and be able to internalise that life is navigated through negotiation and understanding are killing their girlfriends. Crime is committed by role models, leaders, by highly educated and prominent people. They prefer to risk going to jail and think their lies will protect them. Others depend on women not breaking the silence. Big business has let women down!

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY SESSION – COMMITTEE ROOM E249**

**THURSDAY, 17 MAY 2018**

**PAGE: 4**

On the one hand we have been mobilising young women to pursue careers in geology and mining. The anticlimax is that they are greeted and welcomed with violence and death in the mines.

We are told that the mining sector is the most successful and making huge profits out of the sweat and toil of our people. This sector is a monster to our women. We are told that the business that controls the means of production, the business that destroyed families in our land is still undermining women. They firstly took our fathers from our mothers, killed some of them, brought some of them back home on their death beds is still undermining women.

When you have one woman amongst a team of ten men underground in this rough, labour-intensive industry, she becomes vulnerable to various forms of abuse. Because the machinery and tools are designed for the male physique, women who can't use heavy machinery are forced to perform sexual favours to get their male colleagues to help them fulfil their tasks. The industry is still seen as a man's world.

While we applaud the increased participation of women in the mining industry since the government legislated the requirements for 10% quotas, we are concerned that they remain powerless in this male-dominated field. Sometimes women are given very difficult jobs in

UNREVISED HANSARD

MINI PLENARY SESSION – COMMITTEE ROOM E249

THURSDAY, 17 MAY 2018

PAGE: 5

the name of pseudo-equality and have to sell their bodies to do those jobs.

What is sad is that these people have never thought about how they get these profits, they never think about our suffering because they are only concerned about making profits. They have not or barely acted on violence against women.

Then those who are filthy rich with our children's blood always walk tall and pride themselves with the riches they have made.

Those who work underground have to contend with ablution facilities and work environments that are unhygienic, especially during their monthly periods. Even the overalls and work gear is still designed for men.

We will be writing to the Minister of Mineral Resources to ensure that security for women in mining is increased, that policies on gender-based violence in the mining sector are developed and implemented, and that gender norms are addressed systematically.

We have been able to make gains in other areas such as having professional women and CEOs in the private sector and state-owned enterprises. We have women directors-general, we have women

UNREVISED HANSARD

MINI PLENARY SESSION – COMMITTEE ROOM E249

THURSDAY, 17 MAY 2018

PAGE: 6

Ministers, Premiers, MECs, MPLs, MPs Mayors, Councillors and Chairpersons of Portfolio Committees and Chapter 9 institutions.

In fact, in South Africa you demand a Chapter 9 institution, you get it; you demand an office on the status of women, you get it; you demand a Ministry of Women, you get it; you demand co-operatives, you get them; you demand small or micro businesses, you get a Ministry; you demand the Domestic Violence Act, you get it; you demand a protection order, you get it; you demand that men must pay maintenance for their children, you get that. But, when you demand equal pay for equal work, you are told that you do not know what you are talking about!

If you demand a woman president, you are called names. You no longer have an identity. You are insulted. You are made to feel small. You are treated as if you have to depend on the mercy of some man's mind for your future.

The measurements that are used to measure the capacity of men is not equal to the measurement used to measure the capacity of women.

[Applause.]

In fact, on the issue of the woman president, it would be made as if, there was never a woman president in the movement. Mama

UNREVISED HANSARD

MINI PLENARY SESSION – COMMITTEE ROOM E249

THURSDAY, 17 MAY 2018

PAGE: 7

Albertina Nontsikelelo Sisulu whose centenary we celebrate this year was the President of the UDF during trying and difficult times.

[Applause.]

*IsiZulu:*

UMama Albertina Sisulu ubeyigorhakazi lomzabalazo wenkululeko yabantu base South Africa. Waphinde waba uMungameli we FETRAW. Ubeyisigayigayi somzabalazo ebesi ngawubangi umsindo. Sikhuluma nje, kukhona abadlule ezandleni zika mama uSisulu. Sikhuluma nje kukhona omama abakhiwe umama uSisulu ngezikhwepha zakhe. Sikhuluma nje wakhipha amasotsha omkhonto wesizwe aye yolwela inkululeko yabantu baseMzansi Afrika. Yikho nje silapha namhlanje sikwazi ukuzikhulumela. Sikhuluma nje wake waboshwela endlini kwakhe. UMama uSisulu waze wakhipha nabantwana bakhe bayolwela inkululeko yethu. UMama uSisulu ubeyithanda kakhulu imfundo ngoba walwela ukuthi abantwana bakhe bayofunda. Abantwana bakamama uSisulu nezinye izinkokheli baphila impilo enzima kodwa abazange baziqhelise nomzabalazo. Yilapho kumele sifunde khona ukuthi ukuzinikela nokuhlonipha kubalulekile. Yilapho kumele sifunde khona ukuthi imfundo ibalulekile kakhulu ngokubonela kubantwana abafunda ebunzimeni obukhulu.

Kumele singomama sihlale sazi ukuthi imfundo ibalulekile, futhi into ayilwela umama uSisulu eyemfundo ekhokhelwa ngokuphasa. Ibalulekile

UNREVISED HANSARD

MINI PLENARY SESSION – COMMITTEE ROOM E249

THURSDAY, 17 MAY 2018

PAGE: 8

ngoba isiza abantwana ikakhulukazi bamantombazana babe nekusasa eliqinile. Bebebabili kuphela omama besizwe lapha eSouth Afrika. Umama uSisulu nomama uWinnie Madikizela-Mandela.

*English:*

These were strong women who were leaders in their own right. It is not an act of favour or pity to put women in decision-making bodies.

This year also marks the centenary of the women's struggles. The Bantu Women's League which was the forerunner of the ANCWL was formed in 1918. Its first president was Charlotte Maxeke. Like Comrade Albertina Sisulu and Winnie Mandela, uMama Charlotte Maxeke would have been the president of the ANC as well as the country.

[Applause.]

Much as we have made progress as women in South Africa, a lot still needs to be done. We have to close gaps and think strategically about what we have and always ask the pertinent question, of how that is going to change the quality of lives of women. The protection order, ufa uyiphethe.

We have already spoken about what we have, but how is the society receiving that, remains a big question? If we look back at some of the people that have been women chief executive officers and

UNREVISED HANSARD

MINI PLENARY SESSION - COMMITTEE ROOM E249

THURSDAY, 17 MAY 2018

PAGE: 9

directors-general both in the private and public sectors at large, how have they changed the lives of ordinary women?

Some have faced a barrage of attacks; they never had a fair hearing. They have fallen without any support. Those that are standing are, still standing because they have been able to stand on their own and for what they believe in. Some have been able to stand without trailblazers or support from the media.

Sadly, even women journalists are on the side of the media.

Unfortunately, when you are on the side of the media, you are on the side of men because they control it. Media is patriarchal and mostly owned by white conservative men who have always seen themselves as the best thing that the world ever had.

This is the institution that has ensured that it destroys women. It is often used as a hammer of patriarchy to destroy every woman that dares raise her head without its permission.

This institution has historically been used its resources to destroy women. Even black and the so-called progressive men and institutions that are supposed to be independent and protect the rights of the vulnerable, use the story line and language of the media to take male-serving and masculinity decisions. Even conservative men have

UNREVISED HANSARD

MINI PLENARY SESSION – COMMITTEE ROOM E249

THURSDAY, 17 MAY 2018

PAGE: 10

used the media to boost their egos because they know that media is always on their side.

Some have chosen to keep quite. The media has been able to cushion some that drive a very destructive agenda. It is a fact that we have a few journalists in South Africa in the present era. I am talking about a true journalist. Some have decided to be conduits of a destructive propaganda that had no mercy for a gallant fighter like the late Comrade Winnie Madikizela-Mandela. This is gravitating towards what Comrade Zenani and Zindzi Mandela said at the funeral of Mama Winnie. In words of Zenani, I quote:

It has become clear that South Africa, and indeed the world, hold men and women to different standards of morality. Much of what my mother has been constantly asked to account for is simply ignored when it comes to her male counterparts. And this kind of double standard acts also to obscure the immense contribution of women to the fight for the emancipation of our country from the evil of apartheid. I say 'fight' because the battle for our freedom was not some polite picnic at which you arrived armed with your best behaviour.

The South African media is not concerned about facts. They have sustained themselves through the word "alleged". They hang people on

UNREVISED HANSARD

MINI PLENARY SESSION – COMMITTEE ROOM E249

THURSDAY, 17 MAY 2018

PAGE: 11

allegations to an extent that even the society starts taking the allegation as true. They repeat the story-line until you are persecuted and found guilty in the court of public opinion. I do not believe that this is the democracy that uMama Sisulu and uMama Winnie Madikizela-Mandela fought for.

If you raise your honest views that challenge patriarchy in South Africa, you are vilified labelled or insulted. If you shout and make noise like some of us, they will label you mad, mad, mad, and say that you are a liar, liar, liar, because patriarchy fears strong women who have content and substance. [Applause.]

When you go to Parliament and make representations on the Customary Land Rights Bill, they will say you are not from the rural areas, you are just a researcher, and therefore you have no experience and Parliament is the most democratic institution of the country. Some of us behave as we do not know classical case of Mom Kgoshikgadi Shilubana from Limpopo and Dr Zungu from KwaZulu-Natal.

South Africa must change and belong to women too. There is no way we are going to deal with issues of race and fail to deal with the issues of gender. There is no way we are going to deal with issues of class and leave out the issues of gender.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY SESSION – COMMITTEE ROOM E249**

**THURSDAY, 17 MAY 2018**

**PAGE: 12**

Women have always been part of the struggle and therefore gender equality must be on top of the agenda for all South Africans. We must destroy the demons of patriarchy. The leadership must buy into the agenda of fighting violence against women and children. Leaders from all walks of life, from republicans to traditionalists must understand that women must be respected and protected.

We must not as women accept the things we do not understand.

Whatever we have today has gaps that have never been closed or addressed. We have the Commission for Gender Equality, CGE, which is a Chapter 9 institution, but there is a huge appetite to close it because there are many voices saying that it should fall under the Human Rights Commission. Yes, we agree that women's rights are human rights, but we have never been asked as women about the advantages and disadvantages of commission on gender equality.

This is an independent structure that is outside government that has power to monitor, initiate legislation, and evaluate government progress, even intervene where there are differences between government and other sectors of society.

Patriarchy in South Africa has been institutionalised and has institutionalised itself and has to be dealt with by a structure

UNREVISED HANSARD

MINI PLENARY SESSION – COMMITTEE ROOM E249

THURSDAY, 17 MAY 2018

PAGE: 13

that will focus squarely on women and gender issues and that is the CGE.

The Human Rights Commission has a lot of work but also why demand more funds for the office of the Public Protector – I am not against the office of the Public Protector – and want to shut down the Gender Commission. Why is the Public Protector, for example, not taken back to the Justice Department or the Human Rights Commission? Why do we always find it easy to kill structures that frustrate women's?

We have a Women's Ministry but we do not have a budget, how are we going to implement the agenda of women without a budget? Why do we have a women's Ministry and not a structure configured to intervene at all levels from departments have a gender focal points that are senior and can report to DGs and Ministers?

Why don't we have a uniform structure in provinces and allow some provinces to have issues of women fall under vulnerable groups. What is going on with gender issues in municipal and ward levels? Why are departments not accountable on what they have done to change the quality of lives of women? Why are we not decisive and consistent on taking decisions about the cases of abuse of women, domestic violence, rape and killings of women?

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY SESSION – COMMITTEE ROOM E249**

**THURSDAY, 17 MAY 2018**

**PAGE: 14**

Why do we have to believe on the conscience of a judge? Why are we being forced to reverse our decisions because of lack of funds? Where is the structure co-ordinating gender-based Violence? This structure is demanded by CIDO as well as SADC but we have allowed people to push us into the corner and say there is no budget. We are the ones who are passing that message and we have not let those that say there is no budget to go out and say that out in the open.

Fellow South Africans, the Department of Women plays a significant role in representing South Africa in gender structures and driving the gender agenda within international bodies. Key in this regard is the UN Commission on the Status of Women, BRICS, the Indian Ocean Rim Association, the AU and SADC.

The department is also responsible for mainstreaming and co-ordinating the development and submission of country reports on the committee on the elimination of all forms of discrimination against Women. The article on all countries having a structure to co-ordinate gender-based violence is in CIDO.

Following our successful participation in the 62<sup>nd</sup> session of Commission on the Status of Women, CSW, in March this year, we will be working with other stakeholders to implement a plan of action to accelerate the empowerment of women and girls living in rural areas.

UNREVISED HANSARD

MINI PLENARY SESSION – COMMITTEE ROOM E249

THURSDAY, 17 MAY 2018

PAGE: 15

I am pleased to announce that South Africa was recently elected to serve as a member of CSW and we are going to be sitting in the bureau from 2019 to 2023. [Applause.] This provides important opportunities for us to advance the global agenda for gender equality and women's empowerment.

Today, we also join the UNs in commemorating World Telecommunication and Information Society Day society for Sustainable Development Goals.

Hon Chairperson, it is now common knowledge that the world has entered the fourth industrial revolution. As we commemorate this day, the World Telecommunication and Information Society Day, our task is to sharpen consistently the tools needed to ensure that our country women especially those living in rural areas are not left behind.

Hon Chairperson, we remain committed to changing the gender disparity in our economy. Our private sector still lags behind in the acceleration of women into decision-making structures of our economy. We are pleased that since January 2017, it is now mandatory for all entities listed in the Johannesburg Stock Exchange to have a policy of promoting gender diversity at board level, as well as to disclose their performance against this policy.

UNREVISED HANSARD

MINI PLENARY SESSION – COMMITTEE ROOM E249

THURSDAY, 17 MAY 2018

PAGE: 16

Yet despite this policy, women continue to face resistance from the patriarchal structures and cultures of the private sector. We are also aware that our economy is highly racially divided. Therefore, as we increase the representation of women at board level, we are reminded to ensure that African women in particular are prioritised.

We are also gravely concerned about hate crimes perpetrated against the communities of Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Transgender, Intersex, and Queer community.

We therefore welcome the commitment by the Minister of Justice and Constitutional Development to review the Criminal Procedure Act with the intention to “abolish the prescribed period of 20 years” for sexual offences, hate crimes, femicide and all forms of gender-based violence.

The boy-child does not understand the importance and support that is poured on the girl-child. He does not understand why the girl-child should be supported. The girl-child is not safe at her school, at an institution of higher-learning, church and work-place, in business, in government, and the judiciary.

We recognize and applaud the men’s progressive organisations such as Sonke Gender Justice, men and boy foundation, Boys to Men, Not in My

UNREVISED HANSARD

MINI PLENARY SESSION – COMMITTEE ROOM E249

THURSDAY, 17 MAY 2018

PAGE: 17

Name, Afriman, and the South African National Religious Leaders' Association, The Takuwani Riime Campaign, SANAC and the men's sector at large. We value these partnerships.

The commitment by the men's sector to end patriarchy is proof that men have an important role to play in ending gendered inequalities. And we should ensure that whenever we have programmes, at least 10% of the boys or girls or young men and older men are part of those programmes so that they support us, particularly the young men.

We are going to ensure that during the take the girl-child to work, we also have 10% boys as part of that campaign.

We also pay special recognition to Karabo Mokoena's uncle, Malume Tshepo Mokoena and his leadership of the Moving Ahead Development Agency. Mr Mokoena's quest to seek justice for the murder of his niece sets a responsibility for other men to lead the fight to end gendered violence.

The Department of Women welcomes the push for economic recovery and the drive for new investment announced by President Ramaphosa.

Inclusive of economic growth that ignites all our economic sectors, and produces decent jobs and tackle the high unemployment rate

UNREVISED HANSARD

MINI PLENARY SESSION – COMMITTEE ROOM E249

THURSDAY, 17 MAY 2018

PAGE: 18

especially among youth and women in particular is urgent and critical.

When unemployment is high and the labour market fails to absorb young people into jobs, it is mainly women that carry the burden of care and support for unemployed family members. We look forward to the positive outcomes of this investment drive. We demand that the success of this drive is not only measured in the billions of rands it attracts, but must be measured also in the direct opportunities for growth, economic participation of women as well as the improvement of their quality of life and status of women.

We must begin to measure our success not only in economic terms and indicators but also in social and human indicators. We all know that unpaid women's work is not included in the calculation of the GDP and other economic indicators. I thank you. [Applause.]

*Siswati:*

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Siyabonga. Ngiyabona kundzima kutibamba kubavakashi betfu, ngiyanibawa ukuthi ningashayi izandla.

*English:*

UNREVISED HANSARD

MINI PLENARY SESSION – COMMITTEE ROOM E249

THURSDAY, 17 MAY 2018

PAGE: 19

I know that it is difficult but let's just respect the rules of the House. Now, we now proceed to call upon the Chairperson of the committee uMama uMemela.

Ms T C MEMELA: Chairperson, Minister, Deputy Minister, hon Members of Parliament, distinguished guests in the gallery, the veterans in the mist of the people here, Mam Sophie, and some of the members from the IFP who have decided to be with us today, ladies and gentlemen, women in the country have always been at the forefront of the pursuit of equal rights during the liberation struggle. Since the dawn of democracy and freedom in South Africa, the ruling party, ANC, has improved on a number of women taking up leadership positions in areas previously dominated by men.

In post-apartheid South Africa, women continue to bear a disproportionate burden of poverty, inequality and unemployment, violence and abuse still bear a largely black, rural and woman face. Indeed, we need to uphold the right to culture, the right to traditional norms, however, the equality must also be respected.

It is against this backdrop that gender inequality in our societies requires us to address discrimination in all sectors and institutions and not to hold to the myth that inequality exists only in customary law or religious practices. Women continue to be

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY SESSION – COMMITTEE ROOM E249**

**THURSDAY, 17 MAY 2018**

**PAGE: 20**

marginalised and discriminated against in terms of economic opportunities, the labour market as well as access to land, credit, and finance.

In 2017 Poverty Trends Report, a significant disparity in the poverty levels between population groups and sex of individuals. In general, black African females, children who are 17 years and younger, people from rural areas, and all those with no education, are the main victims in the ongoing struggle against poverty. Statistics SA 2017 has already published the report. The findings show higher proportion of females, 71,7%, living below the Lower Bound Poverty Level compared to the males, 38.2%. The higher proportion trend for females has been persistent since 2006. The report is the Department of Women, 2018.

The primary mandate of the department is to lead, co-ordinate and oversee the transformation agenda on women's socioeconomic empowerment, their rights and equality. Our endeavours must be about the emancipation of women. It is this understanding and commitment that we must achieve to give meaning to our presence in this esteemed House and to give purpose to our occupancy of the seat of government.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY SESSION – COMMITTEE ROOM E249**

**THURSDAY, 17 MAY 2018**

**PAGE: 21**

The department in partnership with other role players in the society have made remarkable advances in promoting and advancing the interests of women across our society and we are not oblivious to challenges we face and it is in this regard that discourse on socioeconomic empowerment must fit into the minds of all decision-makers.

Looking back since the establishment of this department, we can all agree that we are not where we need to be, but we are confident that it is work in progress and with commitment we will get to where we planning to get there.

Some of the departmental key achievements are as follows:

Organisational structure redesigned based on new mandate and revised strategic intentions. The structure of the department is now streamlined to deliver efficiently on the mandate. The departmental restructuring has prioritised the need for management competency to drive our programmes. This was necessary to address a misalignment of a department with higher percentage of lower skilled employees.

Quarterly performance reviews conducted as planned and reports submitted to the Department of Performance, Monitoring and Evaluation and National Treasury.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY SESSION – COMMITTEE ROOM E249**

**THURSDAY, 17 MAY 2018**

**PAGE: 22**

The department complied with 80% Management Performance Assessment Tool, MPAT, required standards and status report approved by accounting officer and managed the MPAT improvement plan.

Maintained a less than 2% underspending in expenditure against budget allocation as planned for 2017-18, expenditure against allocation – 99,31% after spending 0,69%.

Maintained a vacancy rate of less than 10% annually as planned. Vacancy rate on 31 March 2018 was 5,6% of funded vacant posts. Mid-Term Evaluation Report on Nine Point Plan and Outcome 14 were produced. Nine Point Plan focuses on amongst others, government's implementation of the Nine Point Plan in unblocking obstacles to the financial inclusion and empowerment of women. Elements of the Nine Point Plan that the programme will be focusing on include Monitoring Ownership and Management Control, Development Finance and Enterprise Development, Access to Credit, Land and Property.

The department planned to finalise the draft frameworks – Sanitary Dignity, Financial Inclusion and Gender Responsive Budgeting in 2018-19.

The committee commends the departmental areas of focus, i.e, Access to Development Finance and Enterprise Development opportunities for

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY SESSION – COMMITTEE ROOM E249**

**THURSDAY, 17 MAY 2018**

**PAGE: 23**

Women; Ownership Pattern and Management Control in Top listed 100 companies of JSE; Skills Development for Women Entrepreneurs and Women's Access to Credit and Land.

The Committee noted with concern that the department had not implemented many of the recommendations from the 2017 Budget Review and Recommendations Reports, BRRR. We believe that those recommendations have find expression in the 2018-19 planning. However, there are concerns, it was not clear to the committee as to what the department's strategy for monitoring and evaluating these areas in the absence of a financial framework.

Although the committee commended the department on the revival of the National Gender Machinery, NGM, and the Inter-Ministerial Committee to deal with gender-based violence, it still needs to be clear on how the committee will be established.

It is our role as portfolio committee to play oversight, ensure accountability, enhance public involvement, deepen engagement and involvement. It is in this regard that the committee recommends that: Firstly, the department to lobby for the zero rating of sanitary towels. Secondly, finalisation and implementation of frameworks have been long standing items since the inception of the department. Thirdly, four reports on international participation on

UNREVISED HANSARD

MINI PLENARY SESSION – COMMITTEE ROOM E249

THURSDAY, 17 MAY 2018

PAGE: 24

gender meetings, SA Development Community, SADC, AU, Commonwealth and UN women's affairs were produced. However, we need to be up-to-date on how far South Africa has come in terms of implementing recommendations resolutions undertaken.

In closing, we must all be at the forefront of all campaigns aimed at engendering equality between men and women at all levels. We call on men in particular to be activists in the campaign to eradicate gender stereotypes that not only oppress women; but also have the effect of keeping men in psychological bondage. Part of the campaign should be the socialisation of children to respect one another and to shun gender stereotypes. It was against this backdrop we support Budget Vote. We are pleading with our men, please protect and not abuse a girl child. Thank you. [Applause.]

Mrs D ROBINSON: Hon House Chairperson, members and guests. When I looked at the Budget speech I delivered last year, I hoped that I would be able to report on some changes, improvements in the Department of Women and some progress in society in general.

I hoped to see a reduction in sexual harassment and gender-based violence, but there is nothing to indicate that women are any better off now than they were previously, with rape and murder on the

UNREVISED HANSARD

MINI PLENARY SESSION – COMMITTEE ROOM E249

THURSDAY, 17 MAY 2018

PAGE: 25

increase and the police being unable to secure the safety of our mothers and daughters.

The article by T T Thabane says: not a new dawn for the battered South African women. You have acknowledged all the problems of society and I am grateful for that but now your challenge is to turn this department around. The department that has in all its previous years failed women, we want to see that your talk can be challenged into action and that we can have a turn around.

The Me Too campaign hit the headlines last year with long-held damaging secrets being aired by women who were seeking justice after being sexually harassed by men for years.

More well-known figures like Danny Jordan have recently hit the headlines accused of by Jennifer Ferguson against her rapist. She has launched the local we too campaign.

Thankfully, effective justice was recently meted out to Karabo Mokoena's killer. We need to make sure that harsher sentences are handed down to those who are found guilty of gender-based violence, especially to politicians, such as convicted criminal Mduzuzi Manana, who should be a role model as public representatives. He

UNREVISED HANSARD

MINI PLENARY SESSION – COMMITTEE ROOM E249

THURSDAY, 17 MAY 2018

PAGE: 26

should have been dismissed after his first offence. He should now face a full might of the law.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Order Hon members.

Mrs D ROBINSON: As far as ... [Interruptions.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): You can't drown the speaker on the podium.

Mrs D ROBINSON: As far as the Department of Women is concerned, I can only report as much of the same. It seems like the game of musical chairs has been played there with constant changes of senior staff, officials, Directors-General, DGs, Deputy Directors, DDGs, to Chief Financial Officers, CFOs and, of course now a change of Ministers with Ministers Dlamini replacing Minister Shebangu.

It is strange that Minister Bathabile, who has consistently failed to fight for women's rights if you remember Khwezi and left her previous department in chaos, was appointed to our ministry. This decision by the President shows utter disrespect and disdain for women. It is clear that women are not a priority for our government.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY SESSION – COMMITTEE ROOM E249**

**THURSDAY, 17 MAY 2018**

**PAGE: 27**

However, your fighting talk is encouraging but I hope you are going to make a change and let us see that this department will work. We have so many changes and instability with the department drifting instead of focusing on meaningful oversight.

The purpose of the Department of Women is to lead, co-ordinate and oversees the transformation agenda on Women's socio-economic empowerment, rights and equality. The department has however failed to transform this. It has been one of the most inefficient ministries in our government and thus far is a disgrace to all women.

We should promote public participation through advocacy and outreach and conduct dialogues. We should interact with service delivery departments such as the Department of Social Development, the South African Police Services, SAPS and the Department of Justice and most importantly with the Commission for Gender Equality. They have done sterling work and they should be given a bigger Budget and I applaud what you said in that respect but there again, let's see the action.

The Department of Women should not sit in splendid isolation but should be out there amongst those who need assistance monitoring service delivery and the practical implementation of the existing laws to protect our government. I trust that you will be able to

UNREVISED HANSARD

MINI PLENARY SESSION – COMMITTEE ROOM E249

THURSDAY, 17 MAY 2018

PAGE: 28

change this, so that you could also cut down on the top heavy administration and staffing Budgets.

This flip-flopping we have been subjected to for the past two terms or three terms gives the impression that the ministry and the department have no clear direction. It also did not implement many of the valuable recommendations made by the Portfolio Committee in the 2017 BRRR. I ensure and I challenge you, Minister, to remedy the shortcomings of your predecessor.

For too long, this department has been a lame duck contributing little to eradicating the scourges of crime, rape and violence. Twenty years into our new democratic dispensation, the government should have been able to provide safety and security for all its citizens. The lack of sensitivity, tools, crime cats and rape cats.

Harassment of women often takes place in public places, at taxi ranks and on trains. When the DA government takes over we will ensure that public spaces are regularly patrolled, so that people can walk in safety and be secure.

Families will be encouraged to develop a personalised safety plan for themselves and their children, thinking ahead proactively. This could have been done. Street lighting should be improved and

UNREVISED HANSARD

MINI PLENARY SESSION – COMMITTEE ROOM E249

THURSDAY, 17 MAY 2018

PAGE: 29

security cameras installed, especially at places like taxi ranks where we can gather evidence.

Lack of funding is given as an excuse for the inefficiencies. We need more safe houses like Saartjie Baartman and Sisters Incorporated. We need more Thuthuzela centres. What has government been doing? I hope you are going wake up and pull up your socks and look after our women. Don't forget about the maintenance courts

The NGOs have long been calling for a national strategic plan on gender-based violence, for how many years, now? We are still waiting. Once in the government, the DA will give priority to this, also rolling out prevention programmes to address harmful gender norms and provide counselling.

We will bring about change that creates order, safety and justice for all. The human trafficking, facing the day election 2019 when the DA takes over and brings human rights to the fore. We work together.

*IsiZulu:*

Nk M S KHAWULA: Ngibonge Sihlalo, nginibingelele nonke eningaphakathi kanjalo nezihambeli zethu, egameni lamakhosikazi ...

UNREVISED HANSARD

MINI PLENARY SESSION – COMMITTEE ROOM E249

THURSDAY, 17 MAY 2018

PAGE: 30

AMALUNGU AHLONIPHEKILE: Malibongwe!

Nk M S KHAWULA: ... kubuhlugu Ngqongqoshe ngoba ukhuluma nje, ubala izingqalabutho zabantu bezifazane ababelwa belwela abantu besifazane nangesikhathi sama-ID. Kodwa manje uma ngithi ngiyabheka, iningi labo sebekohliwe ukuthi labayana obabiza manje ukuthi yini ababeyilwela kuphela bona sebebheke imali sebekhohlwa ngabantu besifazane. Ngiyabonga. Indlela abantu besifazane abaphethwe ngayo kuleli zwe iyashaqisa. Kunamadoda asephenduke imidlwembe adlwengula, ashaye, abulale abantu besifazane. Baphinde bababulale ngokomoya. Izikhathi eziningi, njengabantu besifazane, asinayo nendawo esingabalekela kuyona uma sibhekene nokuhlukumezeka ngoba izenzo zokuhlukumezeka sezizezamukeleka ezimpilweni zethu njengenqubomgomo ejwayelekile emphakathini yakithi. Ngisho noma kunenkinga sekuvele lokho kushayiwe indiva kuthiwe, hayi, umndeni usazohlala ubone leyo nkinga ekubeni ekugcineni kugcina kushone abantu. Izingane zamantombazane ezincane ziphoqwa ukuthi zishade nabantu abadala. Abanye babo uthola ukuthi bayagula, banezifo, ngenhloso nje yokuthi kutholakale le maliebizwa ngokuthi yilobolo. Abe basabheka ukuthi leyo ngane ingakanani nokuthi la eyokwendela khona kunjani. Imiphakathi yakithi eminingi ifuya abadlwenguli abango malume nobaba bezingane kungabi bikho nomthetho okwazi ukuvikela lezi zingane. Noma kuyiwa emaphoyiseni, amacala akona aphelela obala. Lokhu kuvikeleka kwezigebengu ezihlukumeza abantu besifazane emphakathini

UNREVISED HANSARD

MINI PLENARY SESSION – COMMITTEE ROOM E249

THURSDAY, 17 MAY 2018

PAGE: 31

yethu yikho okwenza sigcine sinabantu abafana nalaba; oSandile Mantsoe, osanda kubulala ngesihluku owesifazane u-Karabo Mokoena.

Mhlawumbe niyakhumbula into eyenzeke eMangosuthu eThekwini. Ingane encane - noma phela yayikwenzile lokho yathandana nalowo muntu - siphilisi isidingo sishimane ndini sokuthi ubulale umuntu wesifazane futhi okwesibili, lento oyenzayo awusabulali ingane, usubulala imiphakathi eminingi noma isimame Sisonke. Lobu bulwane osebungenisile emiphakathini yakithi kumele sibukhiphe buphele nya. Yingakho lo mnyango, obaluleke kangaka sinenkinga yokuthi sibe nenkinga la ngoba uMongameli ukwazile ukusifakele uNgqongqoshe uBathabile Dlamini, siyafisa ukuthi yena uqobo akhombise iqhaza azolibamba ukuvikela abantu besifazane. Asikakhulumi ngaye, asikamboni. Enquthu le kunenkosi yakhona ekuthiwa u-Molefe - mina ngiye ngithande ukukhuluma ngezinto ezibambekayo - lenkosi le ngokuthatha kancane abantu besifazane ... [Ubuwelewele.]

USIHLALO WENDLU (Nk M G Boroto): Kusele umzuzu Mam'Khawula!

Nk M S KHAWULA: Hawu, wena! ... yenze izimanga yafaka imayini, abantu uma bethi bayakhala ukuthi kufa izindlu zabo, yabadedelela amaphoyisa bashayiwa bagcwala isibhedlela abanye baboshwa. Yini? Emakhaya umuntu wesifazane akakakhululeki ngabe ngokomhlaba noma ngabe ngokwani, bayakubuza ukuthi uhlangana kuphi nomhlaba.

UNREVISED HANSARD

MINI PLENARY SESSION – COMMITTEE ROOM E249

THURSDAY, 17 MAY 2018

PAGE: 32

Besizocela Ngqongqoshe uqinisekise ukuthi, sikubheke ngamehlo abomvu ngoba wonke umuntu uma efika kulesi sikhundla ufike athembise sengathi kukhulu azokwenza. Emapulazini Ngqongqoshe - ngifuna ungizwe kahle - kunomndeni okade usebenza, uyazi laphaya emapulazini bayasihlupha labo zakwethu esinabo la. Into eyenzeka laphayana, kunale mindeni ehlala laphaya utjole ukuthi kwakuhlala ugogo nawo wonke umuntu. Uthole ukuthi manje bona ngoba sebezwa sikhuluma ngale yokubuyiswa komhlaba, ngoba siyawudinga ngempela umhlaba, sebeyayidayisa imihlaba. Manje uma udayisa umhlaba wena banikhipha ngaphandle, abantu besifazane nezingane.

USIHLALO WENDLU (Nk M G Boroto): Siyaxolisa Mam'Khawula, isikhathi siphelile.

Nk M S KHAWULA: Okokugcina, ingane idlwengulelwe umtwana wayo epulazini. Umqashi ulwa nalona odlwengulelwe ingane uthi makasule icala. Ngikhuluma nawe nje usezintabeni ngenxa yabo labongxiwa laba.

USIHLALO WENDLU (Nk M G Boroto): Siyabonga mama. Siyabonga.

Nk M S KHAWULA: Ngithi, mina angiyivumi leBhajethi okwesibili.

[Ubuwelewele.] Abantu mabavotele i-EFF ... [Ubuwelewele.]

USIHLALO WENDLU (Nk M G Boroto): Mam'Khawula siyabonga. Isikhathi sakho siphelile. [Ubuwelewele.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

MINI PLENARY SESSION – COMMITTEE ROOM E249

THURSDAY, 17 MAY 2018

PAGE: 33

Nk M S KHAWULA: Awungiphe imizuzu emihlanu. [Ubuwelewele.]

USIHLALO WENDLU (Nk M G Boroto): He-e! He-e! Mam'Khawula!

Nk M S KHAWULA: Angikaqedi nje.

USIHLALO WENDLU (Nk M G Boroto): Siyabonga mama! Siyabonga!

Nk M S KHAWULA: Hawu! [Ubuwelewele.]

Mr J A ESTERHUIZEN: Madam Chair, Minister, this was written by the hon Liezl van der Merwe and she unfortunately cannot be here. I will read it on her behalf.

South Africa is one of the most dangerous countries for women and children to live in. We cannot come to this podium every year to repeat the same refrain, things must change.

Three women die at the hands of their partners every day. Africa Check noted in its fact sheet on sexual crimes statistics. Last year, data from a South African market research firm found that women earn 27% less than men in this country. While the actual size of the gap differs based on individual study characteristics,

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY SESSION – COMMITTEE ROOM E249**

**THURSDAY, 17 MAY 2018**

**PAGE: 34**

research consistently shows a notable difference in what women and men take home.

Women living in rural areas are the backbone of families, communities and rural economies. They continue to demonstrate tremendous resilience in the face of multidimensional poverty and inequality.

Chairperson, this year marks the centenary of two internationally renowned South African icons that were passionate advocates for the rights of women and children. We celebrate the centenary of the birth of Mama Albertina Sisulu and former President Nelson Mandela.

These two icons selflessly served the cause of humanity and believed in the total emancipation of women in the political, economic and social spheres and that women's rights are human rights. How can we celebrate their legacy when we full well know that so much more can be done to fully unshackle women in this country?

It is our duty as South Africans to ensure that women's rights are protected, that their privacy is respected and that we live up to the women who sacrificed their lives for the freedom we can all enjoy today, men and women alike, we must remember the saying:

UNREVISED HANSARD

MINI PLENARY SESSION – COMMITTEE ROOM E249

THURSDAY, 17 MAY 2018

PAGE: 35

Now that you have touched the women, you have struck a rock, you have dislodged a boulder, you will be crushed.

We need to send out a strong message to all who continue to lift their hands on a woman, murder, and rape and kill our mothers, daughters, sisters. Enough is enough. It is my hope Chairperson that this department fast-tracks delivery of policy proposals to address the abovementioned challenges. I thank you. [Applause.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon the hon Shaik Emam has asked that we put him down the speakers' list because he is still participating in another debate. We have agreed. We now call on the hon Tseke to take the debate forward.

Ms G K TSEKE: Thank you very much House Chairperson. Hon Minister and Deputy Ministers present, hon Members of Parliament, the guests in the gallery, Mama Sophie de Bruyn, our veteran of the ANC, malibongwe! [Applause.]

Let us be reminded that 2018 marks 22 years of the Constitution of South Africa, the Constitution which is the product of the selfless sacrifice of many forebears of our struggle. It is a product of intense pressure to the apartheid government that for many years, oppressed people were on the basis of the race and dispossessed

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY SESSION – COMMITTEE ROOM E249**

**THURSDAY, 17 MAY 2018**

**PAGE: 36**

their land and economic rights. The Constitution that acknowledges that South Africa was founded on the values of human dignity, the achievement of equality and the advancement of human rights and freedom. The Constitution that advances equality and it is against sexism. It is section 187 of this Constitution of the Republic of South Africa that established the Commission for Gender Equality which is mandated to promote respect for gender equality and protection, development and attainment of gender equality.

Hon Chairperson and hon members, notwithstanding the gains of our democracy, it is worth stating that whilst celebrating the 22 years of this progressive Constitution, we need to pause and pass our sincere condolences to families, friends and relatives of all women, girls, children, people with disabilities, people with albinism and Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Transgender, Queer or Questioning, and Intersex, LGBTQI community, who were brutally killed in our country.

South Africans have some spent years talking about non-sexism and gender equality. And while talking, rapists, paedophiles, homosexuals are intensifying their brutality on our fellow citizens. They are brutalized, raped and killed just because of their gender. We welcome the sentence by the High Court in Johannesburg, on Tuesday, of Shadrack Chauke, the serial rapist who was found guilty on 23 counts of rape and two of attempted murder, and was handed 25

UNREVISED HANSARD

MINI PLENARY SESSION – COMMITTEE ROOM E249

THURSDAY, 17 MAY 2018

PAGE: 37

life terms, and was also slapped with a further 254 years in jails for other crimes. [Applause.] We applaud the court for dealing decisively with cases of gender based violence. Indeed, we need to acknowledge that South Africa has made tremendous strides in the emancipation of women, but much more still needs to be done.

Fellow South Africans, on the occasion of the 106th anniversary of the ANC which was celebrated in East London, the President of the ANC and the President of the country, His Excellency, Cyril Ramaphosa said:

“We must confront the seeming resurgence of patriarchy and backward attitudes towards the role of women in society. Gender-based violence and violence against other vulnerable groups such as children, the elderly, people with disabilities and members of the LGBTQI community is a scourge that needs to be eradicated”

The fight against gender-based violence must be champion by all of us across political lines hon Robertson. It is not a thing for cheap political point scoring. It must be the fight by all of us across all races, gender and religion.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY SESSION – COMMITTEE ROOM E249**

**THURSDAY, 17 MAY 2018**

**PAGE: 38**

As we are speaking, the community of ward 21 Vaal Reefs in the City of Matlosana Local Municipality are embarking on a protest march after a woman was raped by 15 illegal miners who used mine hostels as their safe haven. The community of Matlosana and many other communities in the country are terrorized by rapists, who are roaming the streets and their hopes is in us as law makers to hold the law enforcement agencies accountable. The budget allocated to Commission for Gender Equality is not equals to the task and it will never be. Therefore, the R80,7 million allocated to this entity, the Commission for Gender Equality, for the year under review must be used to continuously educate our communities on nation building and social cohesion programs.

We welcome Commission for Gender Equality programs in educating and providing information and public awareness campaigns on gender equality, done in collaboration with SABC TV and radios, campaigns and cases on forced marriages for children as young as 12 years, widowhood rite and rights, gender representation in political parties, even though it is a challenge for now; interventions done in cases on sex for jobs especially in the Eastern Cape; policy dialogues with policy makers with regards to the gaps in the legislations and; representing the vulnerable and the victims of domestic violence and related cases in our courts of law.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY SESSION – COMMITTEE ROOM E249**

**THURSDAY, 17 MAY 2018**

**PAGE: 39**

We acknowledge the work undertaken thus far of conducting public hearings on key challenges facing women in the mining sector which was done by Commission for Gender Equality to Glencore Mine and its subsidiaries, African Rainbow minerals, Anglo American and De Beers Mining and; transformation hearing which was done at the University of Free State, Johannesburg and Stellenbosch. We will therefore as the portfolio committee continue to monitor the progress.

When going out for public consultations on the review of the Report by Professor Kader Asmal, we should take into cognizance the current conditions of high rate of women and child abuse in the country. We should also note that the Report in the employment equity on gender is still very skew in favour of men. The deep racial divisions and hatred that continues to exist across the full spectrum in our society, economic advantages that continue to be enjoyed by a greater proportion of minority groups, and the economic exploitation of the majority of South Africans, especially the blacks.

The nature of our society still requires a powerful and a concerted drive to develop and attain an acceptable culture of human rights where all citizens will live in peace and harmony alongside each other as contemplated in the National Development Plan, NDP. One question that we need to seek answers for is; will the merger assist in the fight against gender-based violence or do we need to resource

UNREVISED HANSARD

MINI PLENARY SESSION – COMMITTEE ROOM E249

THURSDAY, 17 MAY 2018

PAGE: 40

the existing bodies adequately to focus on their Constitutional mandate efficiently and effectively? That's the million dollar question.

Hon Chairperson - fast forward, there is a need to resuscitate the national gender machinery. There's a need to review the National Gender Policy. There's a need to revive the National Council for Gender-based Violence and review our integrated plan of action addressing violence against women and children which come to an end this year. The committee is comfortable so far that Minister Dlamini is prioritizing them in the Annual Performance Plan, APP of the department. And we are looking forward Minister to working with you and the department. [Applause.]

The committee will continue with our oversight in monitoring Commission for Gender Equality key programs amongst others, gender transformation in other universities, the judiciary, prioritizing women in the procurement, continuous engagement with traditional leaders on forced and early child marriages and the implementation, monitoring and compliance of international and regional conventions.

We welcome the *Commission for Gender Equality* approach for the year under review to focus on shelters and victim empowerment centres, hon Robertson, the Thuthuzela care centres and the role it plays in

UNREVISED HANSARD

MINI PLENARY SESSION – COMMITTEE ROOM E249

THURSDAY, 17 MAY 2018

PAGE: 41

supporting the victims of abuse. Maybe legislating for 50/50% gender parity in all sectors at all levels must be considered as a step closer to dismantle patriarchy and all its facets. There is a need to push back all the frontiers of patriarchy and male chauvinism.

To honour MaSisulu and Tata Mandela in their centenary celebrations, who have dedicated their entire lives to the people of this country, let us dedicate our efforts and join hands in building a gender oppression free society. Let us join hands and build a united, prosperous, non-sexist and non-racial South Africa where women, gays, lesbians and children, people with disabilities and people with albinism are safe.

In conclusion,

“Although politics has given me a rough life, there is absolutely nothing I regret about what I have done and what has happened to me and my family throughout all these years.

Instead, I have been strengthened and feel more of a woman than I would otherwise have felt if my life was different”.

This is a quote by Mama Albertina Sisulu. [Applause.]

*Setswana:*

UNREVISED HANSARD

MINI PLENARY SESSION – COMMITTEE ROOM E249

THURSDAY, 17 MAY 2018

PAGE: 42

Modulasetulo, mokgatlho wa setšhaba o kgolotseng maAfrika Borwa, wa ba naya tokologo, mokgatlho wa ANC, o ema nokeng tekanyetsokabo ya lefapha la bomme.

*English:*

Lastly, I also want to respond to hon Robertson to say, as a member of the portfolio committee, dealing with the rights of women, I am so shocked that in the DA, you only have 30% of women representation in Parliament and in the provincial legislature. [Interjections.] Some of their ... [Interjections.] ... me ... the one on the platform. Some of their powerful woman in the DA, Patricia de Lille - dumped. And surely the women in the portfolio committee are supporting that. Lindiwe Sisulu - dumped. [Interjections.] Lindiwe Mazibuku - dumped. [Laughter.] And I am sure that they have contributed. Lindiwe Mazibuku; Lindiwe Sisulu is our member of the ANC. She can't be in the DA. Lindiwe Mazibuku - dumped. Members in the portfolio committee have surely contributed. Hon Phumzile Van Damme - demoted. [Interjections.] Maybe she is about to be dumped soon. Therefore the ANC supports the budget. [Thank you.] [Applause.]

The ACTING CHAIRPERSON (Mr N A Masondo): The hon Shaik Emam will speak after the hon P J Groenewald. We will now proceed to the hon Majeke.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY SESSION – COMMITTEE ROOM E249**

**THURSDAY, 17 MAY 2018**

**PAGE: 43**

Ms C N MAJEKE: Hon Chairperson, hon Minister, hon members, and our guests, although some progress has been made in uplifting women's lives in South Africa, a lot still needs to be done to overcome the cultural, economic and health burdens borne by mostly young, elderly, and disabled women - in particular, those locked in the rural hinterland and informal settlements.

The scourge of violence against women in South Africa is still largely rampant, but hidden beneath cultural practices and beliefs. The system of patriarchy remains dominant. Communities are still not united against women abuse, notwithstanding campaigns run by government and other nongovernmental organisations. This is why this Ministry is important.

The health of women is affected by a plethora of factors, most of which revolve around a lack of adequate health facilities and infrastructure. The lack of medical facilities, supplies and trained staff, and poor transport mean that many rural women do not have a health worker present during childbirth. This situation heightens complications, leading to higher maternal and child deaths.

One of the most important steps that this department can take to drive progress is to ensure and improve the political, economic and social rights and opportunities of women. To sustain the progress

UNREVISED HANSARD

MINI PLENARY SESSION – COMMITTEE ROOM E249

THURSDAY, 17 MAY 2018

PAGE: 44

made already, the department must ensure mainstreaming of women's issues and translate them into concrete improvements in the lives of women - in particular, the integration of women in the rural areas. This would require focused and committed departmental leadership, from the political head down to the last official.

This budget we are supporting, today, comes at a time when the violation of women's rights is under the national spotlight. This budget must aim to create a platform for high-level dialogue on current issues affecting women and girls in the country; create an avenue for the economic empowerment of marginalised women and girls; and communicate the pulse of the women and girls to the communities for collective daily actions.

Building a sustainable momentum towards Women's Month, the 16 Days of Activism, and other calendar days, is what the Minister must focus on. Hon Minister, we look forward to your full dedication and practical action on matters affecting women. As a member of the Portfolio Committee on Women, I am looking forward to working with you in making a difference in the lives of women in South Africa. You have all our support. We support the Budget Vote. I thank you.

Dr P J GROENEWALD: Hon Chairperson, I must say I was quite surprised by the reaction from the hon members of the ANC, especially the

UNREVISED HANSARD

MINI PLENARY SESSION – COMMITTEE ROOM E249

THURSDAY, 17 MAY 2018

PAGE: 45

women, at the mentioning of the name of Mr Manana by the hon member Robinson.

Why am I surprised? I want to say to the hon Minister, Minister, if a member of the FF Plus were to be found guilty of any violence against a woman, his membership would be terminated, immediately. There would be no chance that such a member of the FF Plus would remain a Member of Parliament. [Interjections.]

Therefore, I am saying I am quite surprised. Furthermore, I also want to say that, earlier on this afternoon, we had the Budget Vote on Higher Education and Training, and the hon Minister Naledi Pandor referred to the security of women students at universities. She said it is not about security, it's about the men and the societal problem. I agree completely with her.

The question is, How do we bring up our children to ensure that they have a future in their lives? Is it not so that we must also look at ourselves, as parents, and ask ourselves what type of upbringing we ensure for our children? Do we ensure that our children have respect – respect, not only for women, but respect for everybody, irrespective of who he or she is? If you have respect and you have a generation who has respect, then there will not be any violence, especially not against women.

UNREVISED HANSARD

MINI PLENARY SESSION – COMMITTEE ROOM E249

THURSDAY, 17 MAY 2018

PAGE: 46

Therefore, I want to say that the ANC, as an organisation, must also look at its own actions when it responds on certain matters in society. If we have protest marches and the people are running around, looting and burning and breaking, what happens? Then, the ANC, as government, reacts immediately.

Do you know what people out there on the streets say to me? The only way to get the attention of the government is to act violently. Then, we know we will get the attention of the government.

Therefore, I want to say that the ANC must also, as government, set an example to ensure that we have less violence. Sometimes when I look at Parliament, I am ashamed to think that I am part of Parliament by the disrespectful and violent way that some members react in Parliament.

*Afrikaans:*

Daarom wil ek vandag vir u sê daar moet altyd respek wees, veral vir vroue. Ek doen ook 'n beroep op mans. Jy mag fisies sterker wees as 'n vrou, maar dit beteken nie dat jy haar meerdere is nie. Jy mag fisies sterker wees, maar as jy respek het, sal jy dit altyd met 'n gelyke basis hanteer. Ek dank u.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY SESSION – COMMITTEE ROOM E249**

**THURSDAY, 17 MAY 2018**

**PAGE: 47**

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Hon Chairperson, The NFP supports the report tabled here today. Allow me to acknowledge the role of two women that played a vital role in my life that is my mom and my late sister. Also allow me to acknowledge the role women played in the liberation of us all in the country. Women such as the late Albertina Sisulu and Winnie Mandela amongst many others.

The women march of 9 August 1956 was the stepping stone in South Africa's liberation. Hon Chairperson... the Minister is here. I am glad the Minister is a woman. You understand women better than anybody else. You will understand the plight of those women and children and the families of those women and children that are massacred every other day, including the eight months old child.

We believe as the NFP Minister that women at large in South Africa, part of the ANC as well will play a pivotal role in ensuring that the Palestinians enjoy their freedom and get their freedom together, with your assistance.

I want to tell you Minister of one incident while I am the Chair of Women and Social Development in the SADC region. There was this child that came there that told us her plight of sanitary pads and let me tell you what she told us. It was painful and emotional. They were using cowdung because they could not afford it. That is what

UNREVISED HANSARD

MINI PLENARY SESSION - COMMITTEE ROOM E249

THURSDAY, 17 MAY 2018

PAGE: 48

the plight of women, in the region is. And I think it is a problem that we have extensively in South Africa in the poorest areas. And I want encourage you Minister that your department does something about it in ensuring that every girl child in every school, in every rural school is well secured in terms of that so that they can get it. I would hope Minister that you will intervene.

Let me tell you - we talk about "women, women" every time we come here. There are lots of programmes... women are still marginalised, women are still brutalized, women are still raped and murdered in South Africa everyday without fail.

When you talk about marginalisation of women in terms of positions - let me give an example about the Western Cape with 55% of the women in Cape Town, in the coloured community, fewer than 4% of them hold managerial positions. Minister, these are matters that you need to deal with to ensure that women come into the forefront of the struggle that they have been - and that they are accepted... Whatever role that they play here must be equal to that of a man. Previously, it was the man's responsibility to provide food, clothing and shelter.

Today it is the women that provides food, clothing and shelter while the man sits at home. But yet the man want to be in control. So, it

UNREVISED HANSARD

MINI PLENARY SESSION – COMMITTEE ROOM E249

THURSDAY, 17 MAY 2018

PAGE: 49

is up to the women to take responsibility and drive this process forward. If you are not going to do it believe me no man is going to do it.

I had a complain the other day of a woman - And this is a major problem with your domestic violence Act while it is there to protect [inaudible]

She cannot serve the papers. The husband has gone to another province. She must phone the police, she must go to the Sherriff, then he moves from here to there ... you cannot do it.

The Domestic Violence Act is in ineffective in it... The NFP supports this report. [Time Expired.]

Ms T STANDER: Chairperson, to date, this Parliament has spent R641 million over four years with nothing to show for it. Sanitary dignitary project framework "dololo", dialogue roadshows, report "dololo", yet the department claims these as "targets achieved", it has lied to the portfolio committee. It ignores our requests for evidence and flouts recommendations made by the committee and the auditor-general year after year.

The prevailing excuse for its incompetence: "Akanamali". Ngoba?

UNREVISED HANSARD

MINI PLENARY SESSION – COMMITTEE ROOM E249

THURSDAY, 17 MAY 2018

PAGE: 50

The Commission for Gender Equality, a Chapter 9 institution, has made an enormous contribution with minimal funding. It is an example of how integrity plus accountability equals performance.

The former portfolio Minister Susan Shabangu provided no leadership or direction. The department was never held accountable, and individuals accused of financial misconduct are yet to face real consequences. On the ANC's watch gender inequality and violence has increased. On the ANC's watch the face of poverty is still black young female, and rural.

This hopelessness, injustice and indignity must anger us all. Visiting Gwatyu, a rural community in my Constituency, young tell me "asinalo ithemba. Sihlala phantsi qha".

ANC Member of Parliament, Mduduzi Manana is a convicted woman beater, and faces new allegations of assault, bribery, corruption and extortion. ANC Member of Parliament Mervyn Dirks called my friend and fellow DA Member of Parliament Phumzile van Damme "straatmeid" in Parliament and during the last parliamentary sitting saw him allegedly strike a woman seated next to him.

He was sitting over - there he is and he serves on the portfolio of women. Where is the accountability?

UNREVISED HANSARD

MINI PLENARY SESSION – COMMITTEE ROOM E249

THURSDAY, 17 MAY 2018

PAGE: 51

The ACTING HOUSE CHAIR (Mr N A MASONDO) Hon member, please give us a second.

Ms H H MALGAS: I rise on a point of order. The member has to give a substantial motion if she wants to speak about people or hon members personally. And she has to respect us because she is not calling them hon members, and that is rule 82. Thank you.

Ms T STANDER: Prostitutes. Sorry Chair, I am referring to everyone as Mr, I make very sure that I am respectful at all times. and he called her "straatmeid" which means Prostitute"

Ms H H MALGAS: Point of order!

The ACTING HOUSE CHAIR (Mr N A MASONDO): a ruling will be made at a later stage. It does seem as if it is some matter that needs to be looked into. But for now I will just urge you to proceed.

Ms T STANDER: This is the reason why we need a parliamentary ethics committee. But it does not sit to deal with the likes of Mr Manana and Mr Dirks. Mr Manana broke his oath of office when it was convicted of three charges of assault, he should not be in this House.

UNREVISED HANSARD

MINI PLENARY SESSION – COMMITTEE ROOM E249

THURSDAY, 17 MAY 2018

PAGE: 52

Last year when Minister Bathabile Dlamini said the ANC had many other worse members to deal with before Manana. Minister, you need to name them and you need to deal with them.

In March Deputy President David Mabuza told me the ANC does not throw its members into a dustbin but believes in rehabilitation. Last week President Ramaphosa said "Mr Manana must be subjected to his own party's processes". [Kodwa] Ramaphosaa and Manana are in the same "whatsapp group" [wena].

This is the cost of having an ANC-led government appointing crony leaders without integrity, and refusing to hold them accountable. Minister, you speak powerfully but the ANC actions have been weak. Your commitment sounds bold but play like a stuck record.

The DA will not rest until Mr Manana is transferred from Parliament to jail. He does not deserve to sit in this House earning a salary paid by taxpayers. Sincerely, we want Mr Manana to rehabilitate, in jail – where all woman beaters belong. [Interjections.]

Ms H H MALGAS: Point of order!

Ms T STANDER: We do not favour the privileged, powerful and wealthy over the vulnerable in society. [Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

MINI PLENARY SESSION – COMMITTEE ROOM E249

THURSDAY, 17 MAY 2018

PAGE: 53

The ACTING CHAIRPERSON (Mr A MASONDO): Hon member, sorry, there is a point of order.

Ms H H MALGAS: Chairperson, the hon member must be addressed because she is discussing another member. She needs to have a substantial motion.

The ACTING CHAIRPERSON (Mr A MASONDO): Can you allow a space for me just to make a comment or two at the end of the member's speech. Please proceed.

Mr M WATERS: Chairperson, I rise on a point of order. The Whip from the ANC rose on a point of order saying that the Stander must submit a substantive motion. The hon member in question has been found guilty in a court of law. There is not need for any substantive motion. He has been found guilty. Can I make a plea that you allow the member to conclude her speech and I will make one or two comments after that. Please proceed.

This is the cost of having an ANC-led government appointing crony leaders without integrity, and refusing to hold them accountable. The DA does not favour the privileged, the powerful or the wealthy over the vulnerable in society. We care about the dreams and hopes

UNREVISED HANSARD

MINI PLENARY SESSION – COMMITTEE ROOM E249

THURSDAY, 17 MAY 2018

PAGE: 54

of all South Africans. We do not take for granted our responsibility to represent you and your struggles, your hopes and dreams.

The DA cares that the diverse talents and potential of our women should be amplified by an economy that includes women in the top decision-making positions and developing skills for tomorrow's economy equal pay, and the opportunity to own title to property. The DA cares that women are healthy, feel safe walking alone or xa ba khwela itaxi 17:53 [when riding a taxi] and receive the support they need from the justice system, whether it be maintenance or protection orders.

We know this can be achieved by appointing leaders with integrity and who believe in "Batho Pele principles", and by holding them to account no matter what position they hold. You are all part of this fight. Ask your employers for proof of pay parity. Raise your hands for leadership positions. Report abuse to the police and support victims if someone tries to rape or abuse you, you grab their testicles, twist them or kick them and run away to the nearest police station or place of safety.

*IsiXhosa:*

Bafazi baseMzantsi, "Mayibuye".

UNREVISED HANSARD

MINI PLENARY SESSION – COMMITTEE ROOM E249

THURSDAY, 17 MAY 2018

PAGE: 55

*English:*

I call on each of you to rise.

*SiSwati:*

Vula umlomo. [Raise your voice]. [Singing]

*English:*

Raise your voice [Singing]. Time Expired.

The ACTING HOUSE CHAIR (Mr N A MASONDO): Hon member, order. As I understand it the member called another member a straatmeid, meaning a prostitute. Hon member, you cannot use a judgement to attack another member. Therefore, I am going to ask you to withdraw the remark.

Secondly, if you want to pursue the matter you need to have a substantive motion. I am basically appealing to you to withdraw the remark. And if you want to take the matter further, do so accordingly, either pursue the issue at the rules committee or similar structure of Parliament. But for now you should withdraw the remarks.

Ms T STANDER: Chairperson, first of all I did not call anyone "straatmeid" [prostitute]. I never called. I made reference to a

UNREVISED HANSARD

MINI PLENARY SESSION – COMMITTEE ROOM E249

THURSDAY, 17 MAY 2018

PAGE: 56

comment in my speech. Secondly, I have removed myself from the podium. I have completed my speech, I cannot be called to withdraw now. So, unfortunately, based on those facts I respectfully will not.

The ACTING HOUSE CHAIR (Mr N A MASONDO): It does seem hon member that we may have to pursue the matter somewhere else in the relevant structures of Parliament. For now, we will leave it. But the matter is not sorted out. It will have to be followed up.

Ms M P CHUEU: Hon Chair, hon Minister Bathabile Dlamini, hon Deputy Ministers in our midst, hon members of the portfolio committee and our hon guest, Mme Sophie de Bryun.

I will start with the DA. When it is their member they follow procedure. There's a member in the DA who has been accused of sexual abuse ... [Interjections.] ... yes, that member is still in the DA. So, when it is them it's okay, when it is other parties it cannot be okay. [Applause.] [Interjections.]

Hon member Groonewald, I accept that when people are taught respect they behave in a respectable manner, but also, patriarchy goes beyond respect. There are many people who have been brought up to be respectful but they are still sexist; they go on oppressing their

UNREVISED HANSARD

MINI PLENARY SESSION – COMMITTEE ROOM E249

THURSDAY, 17 MAY 2018

PAGE: 57

women; there are parties in this Parliament that do not even want to elect women as their representatives. The FF-Plus for instance, they have been changing members but they have not given us a woman. So [Interjections.] [Laughter.] ... yes, because they still continue in a patriarchal manner. So, being respectful does not mean that you cannot discriminate women; it doesn't mean that you cannot rape.

To hon member Esterhuizen, he said the killing must stop; we agree that the killing must stop, but he as a man, we want to see you on the podium saying so and making sure in action and making sure that budgets of different departments address women in disparities.

[Applause.]

I want to agree with Prime Minister Justin Trudeau when he said, in Davos,

#MeToo, Times Up, the Women's March – These movements tell us that we need to take a critical discussion on women's rights, equality, and the power dynamics of gender and sexual harassment, for example, in business and in government. And this is a systemic problem and it is not acceptable. As leaders, we need to act to show that truly, time is up.

UNREVISED HANSARD

MINI PLENARY SESSION - COMMITTEE ROOM E249

THURSDAY, 17 MAY 2018

PAGE: 58

If a man of his stature can agree that time is up for men to oppress women, it means patriarchy is a very serious matter. Patriarchy comes in many forms and it one of the pillars of capitalism; not only capitalism, but communism because women - even under communist countries - were never liberated, out of patriarchy. They were still oppressed. That is why when women are in charge, you'll hear men making negative comments, that is a patriarchal attitude. So, when men come here and pretend that they support women, that is not acceptable. I think Trudeau agrees with by saying men like these need to be exposed and they need to be dealt with. And I think what he wanted to say is that we need a new system that is going to overthrow this system that makes women properties.

I want to dedicate my speech to two gallant women, Mama Sisulu and Mama Winnie Mandela, [Applause.] women who came out of difficulties and fought against patriarchy. And it is unfortunate that we have people, in our midst, who used to stand up against them.

I also want to agree with other speakers who said the systematic issues that we find in patriarchy, which is in education, in education are forced not to take up maths and science subjects as they are always told that these are difficult subjects. Those are finer words of saying "don't come in because this is only meant for men's sphere". And this is not for the first time that this has been

UNREVISED HANSARD

MINI PLENARY SESSION – COMMITTEE ROOM E249

THURSDAY, 17 MAY 2018

PAGE: 59

raised sharply; the difference is that Trudeau is a male person who raised this matter. Women have been raising it for centuries, since the primitive times; when men acquired property, women raised the issue of oppression and they refused to be bound by this structure; we find that there were women that came out openly - even defying the monarchy during the period of monarchies because patriarchy even then, prevailed.

Patriarchy must be fought socially, ideologically, systematically, culturally and structurally. This means that public institutions and nations that have to remove it have to be gender sensitive and do not disadvantage women in any way. Women, wherever they are, should not be disadvantaged on the basis that they are women and poor.

All budgets of different departments must be mainstreamed and assessed critically to benefit women. In all these budgets that we are passing today, most of them are not helping women to go out of poverty.

The face of poverty in South Africa is a woman's face; and that yoke is in unemployment and inequality. Our villages and communities still have women doing domestic work without pay. It is our mothers who are still in large numbers in the informal sector economy and in the streets vending to fend their families. Our women work under

UNREVISED HANSARD

MINI PLENARY SESSION – COMMITTEE ROOM E249

THURSDAY, 17 MAY 2018

PAGE: 60

harsh conditions in farms and in mines. Our young women who cannot go to institution of higher learning work in shops, restaurants, financial sector and everywhere else earning very little as casual workers.

To us, empowering women economically will mean women must access finance and not be exploited by financial institutions in paying high interest rates for loans.

We want women to be able to use computers in their villages, to be taught basic technology for their survival as they enter the fourth industrial revolution. [Applause.]

Let us advocate to improve safety for women in schools, universities, factories, homes and in Parliament.

We must develop firm property rights for women and it is a right for women to own land. [Applause.]

The Freedom Charter says land shall be shared amongst those who work it. The majority of farm worker are women; they must own the land, they work it. [Applause.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

MINI PLENARY SESSION – COMMITTEE ROOM E249

THURSDAY, 17 MAY 2018

PAGE: 61

We must remember that as we are seated here, more women are dying in the hands of our males in our country. Among the many recently murdered is Lindiwe Sibiya, a 31-year-old mother of two, who was allegedly locked in the house by her suspect husband after an argument. She was found dead with 17 stab wounds on her body. But the husband is now out R5000 bail for allegedly killing her; claiming that she killed herself because they had an argument. The story of Lindiwe is one of many sad stories of past recent killings of women.

We call on the law-enforcement agencies to arrest all perpetrators and not to be limited when applying justice on such criminals.

In conclusion, we want to see all our male folk standing up and stopping other male folk for violating the rights of different women everywhere, in professions, in all the professions of this country we want to see our male folk fighting against the violation of women's rights.

Our men should not hide behind culture as if culture - in any society - is stagnant. Thuma mina [Send me] President Ramaphosa to go and change the mindset of our male folk. The ANC accept the Budget Vote 13. [Applause.]

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY SESSION – COMMITTEE ROOM E249**

**THURSDAY, 17 MAY 2018**

**PAGE: 62**

The MINISTER OF WOMEN IN THE PRESIDENCY: Hon Chairperson, before I get excited let thank my colleagues, Deputy Minister Pam Tshwete and Zou Kota for attending our debate. Let me also thank our acting director-general, GD, as well as Shoki and as well as the special advisor, Dr Makasela, officials in the department that are less than 100, including the officials from the office for the work they have done to prepare for this Budget Vote whilst we were also busy with the report back of the Commission on the Status of Women, CSW. I also want to thank all the Members of Parliament for their contributions and say that hon member Robinson, charity begins at home. I understand everything you have said, but you do have as a party sexual assault cases that have not been dealt with. For instance, the Chief Whip in Bisho, the issue of someone in 2003 who was given a golden handshake of R5 million to leave the SA Police Service, SAPS, after four women accused him of sexual harassment.

The sex gate issue of the anonymous email that circulated within the DA claiming the culture of senior man in the DA and it was said that that is a campaign to smear the senior leadership of the DA. What we need to do as women is to stand together when it comes to the issue of violence against women and children because we are not going to close our space that we had created during the Kempton Park negotiations when we formed the coalition. We marched as women because we were not represented. The coalition came up with the

UNREVISED HANSARD

MINI PLENARY SESSION – COMMITTEE ROOM E249

THURSDAY, 17 MAY 2018

PAGE: 63

effective charter for effective gender equality. [Applause.] When we came here we went back to our corners and we are used to defend the atrocities that are committed against women. And ...

*IsiZulu:*

... okwesibili, angeke ngingedwa ngime la ngenze ushintsho ezintweni zamakhosikazi. Isizathu ...

*English:*

... United Nation has a UN women, it is because they have seen that issues of women are important. But also when we go to the UN countries work together and this should serve as an example to all of us here that there are areas that we have to ensure that we come together, fight together and let our male leaders be part of our agenda to fight gender inequality. There is no way we are going to come here and say that we have this percentage in the ANC and in the DA you have that percentage, because we are going to see your weaknesses. Why are we not discussing our weaknesses and fight together on some of the issues? [Applause.]

You know how we got Frene Ginwala as the Speaker of Parliament. We lobbied before all men. By the time we had to elect the Speaker we had already lobbied. We know that when we came to Parliament there was something that put men as superior in terms of thinking.

UNREVISED HANSARD

MINI PLENARY SESSION – COMMITTEE ROOM E249

THURSDAY, 17 MAY 2018

PAGE: 64

However, because we are trained as women, we were ahead of them and they had to recognise that women understood more than them. I don't want to go back, but I'm saying that let's come together and move forward and let's our leaders pronounce on the issues of women. [Applause.] ... [Interjections.] ... My plan will come from all of us.

*IsiZulu:*

Mina into engiyenzile njengo nkosikazi, ngikhulumile nomakaMduduzi futhi ngisazokhuluma naye uMduduzi kodwa into engiyaziyo wukuthi angizuphushwa ngiphushelwe ekhoneni ukuvikela into engingayiqondi. Futhi enye into engifuna ukuyisho wukuthi, ukuthi abantu mabasule ...

*English:*

... or move them from one area to a municipality, or make them resign when they are in the process of divorce pushes the responsibility back to the society. It does not remove it. Therefore, pushing the issues of a sexual harassment is a gender blind approach. It is not a gendered approach.

*IsiZulu:*

Ngakho singacabangi ukuthi mangabe siphusha abantu kalula bahambe siyakwazi ukubhekana nezinkinga ...

UNREVISED HANSARD

MINI PLENARY SESSION – COMMITTEE ROOM E249

THURSDAY, 17 MAY 2018

PAGE: 65

*English:*

... for gender violence. Amongst our strategic areas of focus is the issue of driving gender responsive policy planning, budgeting, monitoring and evaluation, mainstreaming the socioeconomic empowerment of women, building partnerships with key stakeholders, raising awareness and conducting outreach programmes in advancing the struggle for gender equality.

*IsiZulu:*

Futhi sibikile ngezingxoxo kwi-portfolio committee sasho sathi sisenza umbiko. Nami ngisazowuthola umbiko bese siwuza ekomidini. Kodwa umangabe sesishaya la engathi asazi lutho, ngiba nenkinga ngalokho. Okunye okubalulekile ...

*English:*

... is that our government and the judiciary have taken great strides in addressing challenges faced by women living in rural areas. Despite this, rural areas remain the persistent site of underdevelopment, poverty, precarious, land tenure system and patriarchal power relations linked to customary law and traditions as hon member Chueu has said. However, what is also important is that in September 2017, the Pretoria High Court decided to protect the land rights of Mantshabelle Mary Rahube, who is 68 years old and was a facing eviction by a male relative from the family home in

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**MINI PLENARY SESSION – COMMITTEE ROOM E249**

**THURSDAY, 17 MAY 2018**

**PAGE: 66**

which she has lived for more than 37 years. Therefore, we support Mary Rahube who is today taking her matter to the Constitutional Court. [Applause.]

We are also very proud of the decision that was taken by the ruling party in its 54th National Conference that calls for land expropriation without compensation. [Applause.] One other issue is that we intend to invest on sanitary pads or towels processes and we want to assist women to make business out of this. [Applause.] Also, 28 to 29 this month we have the first of its kind the symposium on menstrual health management and it is being driven by the United Nations Fund for Population Activities, UNFPA.

Lastly, a key imperative of the department in the current financial year is to develop the gender responsive learning and budgeting framework across all spheres of government. Yes, that we have started to win. Thank you, Chairperson. [Applause.] [Time expired.]

The ACTING HOUSE CHAIR (Mr N A Masondo): Thank you very much. As we move towards concluding our business, please allow me to thank our leader, Mme Sophie de Bruin, the Minister and the department as well as the guests for having been with us and having taken time to be with us in this Budget Vote. This therefore concludes the business of this plenary and the mini-plenary will rise.

UNREVISED HANSARD

MINI PLENARY SESSION - COMMITTEE ROOM E249

THURSDAY, 17 MAY 2018

PAGE: 67

Debate concluded.

The mini-plenary session rose at 18:20.

UNREVISED HANSARD