

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 1

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

PROCEEDINGS OF THE NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

The Council met at 14:03.

The House Chairperson: Committees, Oversight, Co-operative Governance and Intergovernmental Relations, took the Chair and requested members to observe a moment of silence for prayers or meditation.

**CONSIDERATION OF CONSOLIDATED REPORT OF THE REPORT-BACK SESSION:
EASTERN CAPE TAKING PARLIAMENT TO THE PEOPLE PROGRAMME – PROGRESS
MADE BY THE EASTERN CAPE DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION ON THE
RECOMMENDATION MADE DURING THE 2016 TAKING PARLIAMENT TO THE PEOPLE
IN THE EASTERN CAPE PROVINCE.**

Mr R J TAU: Chairperson of the NCOP, House Chairpersons, members of the NCOP and distinguished guests, good afternoon. I should start by expressing my appreciation for the opportunity to exchange views with you on how the report-back of Taking Parliament to the People

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 2

in the Eastern Cape unfolded. As the NCOP, we are confident of the progress made to meet our mandate. We have resolved to build on the solid foundation that has been laid over the past four Parliaments.

As always, the most critical challenge is whether we are succeeding as leaders to mobilise the people in actual practice to be their own liberators. We know too well that on our own we cannot succeed. We know that the programmes of government are not the panacea for all the ills of our terrible past. They are but a platform for South Africans to let their strengths shine through.

We are in the beginning of our second phase of our struggle for a better quality of life. In the course of this struggle, we shall have immediate success and also setbacks, but we shall certainly progress, inch by inch, towards our goals. From time to time, incidents do happen which bring out in bold relief the enormity of the challenges we face. As the saying goes, one falling tree makes more noise than millions that are growing.

Hon members, in the discussions I had with some of you when we were conducting oversight in the Eastern Cape, I posed a question whether we should be satisfied with the steady progress that the province was making. Is the Eastern Cape not capable of breaking out of the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 3

current pace and moving much faster in creating a better life for ordinary South Africans and citizens of the Eastern Cape? Many you answered me, you said, the policies we have accord with the needs of the movement and, of course, the moment. There is no need to change them. Yet, the speed and style of implementing them can be improved. There are a few ingredients to this that need further attention and the first ingredient is partnership.

Members, allow me to remind you of our mandate. The mandate of the NCOP in terms of the Constitution is articulated in section 42(4) which provides that:

The National Council of Provinces represents the provinces to ensure that provincial interests are taken into account in the national sphere of government. It does this mainly by participating in the national legislative process and by providing a national forum for public consideration of issues affecting provinces.

Therefore, the core thrust of our mandate as defined by that constitutional mandate is partnership.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 4

In seeking to implement our mandate, the NCOP held a flagship programme of Taking Parliament to the People at Abbotsford Christian Centre from 14 to 18 November 2016 in Buffalo City Metropolitan Municipality in the Eastern Cape. The programme was held jointly with the provincial legislature and, of course, the NGOs and civil society under the theme: Following up on our commitments.

You would that in the past, Taking Parliament to the People programme comprised of two legs, namely, the pre-visit and the main programme. In the Fifth Parliament, the leadership of the NCOP took a decision to add a third leg, namely, the report-back session. Through the report-back session, we sought to provide feedback to members of the community on progress made by the government on various service delivery issues which they had raised in the pre-visit and the main programme. It is for that reason that, as the NCOP, we convened on the 12 to 16 March 2018 for a report-back session in the Eastern Cape.

We went back to the same districts again and we identified the following: Under the Buffalo City, allow me to table the synopsis outcome of the report-back session. Despite responses on several recommendations still outstanding, a few key achievements pertaining to the resolution of some of the key service delivery challenges

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 5

raised in the 2016 Taking Parliament to the People in the Buffalo City Metropolitan Municipality have been recorded.

The following are some of the recorded key achievements that we would call the quick wins - and I can remember one political party raising an issue that we need to identify quick wins that will transform the lives of ordinary South Africans. [Interjections.]

Mr J W W JULIUS: The DA.

Mr R J TAU: If it was the DA, then that is good.

In response to the recommendation that the provincial Education Department should ensure that B KAT Secondary School is assisted with strengthening of its school management team, mentoring and coaching of underperforming school principals is underway, and training of school principals on curriculum leadership has been concluded.

On the need for the Department of Health to attend to the challenge of nurses leaving work earlier than official working hours stipulate, and thus leaving patients unattended particularly in clinics, the Buffalo City Metropolitan Health Department has issued

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 6

a circular that emphasises that the closing time is 16h30, and it will ensure that clinics adhere to the closing times through clinic supervision visits. This means therefore, that capacity has been increased; the ability and the necessary support have been provided to ensure that supervision visits take place on a regular basis.

In order to ensure that there was focussed intervention concerning the shortage and incomplete supply of textbooks which affected schools such as Ngqika Primary School - as we speak - textbooks and stationery that were in short supply were provided to schools by end of March 2017. The policy of book retrieval has also been activated.

In response to the staffing needs at schools such as St Thomas School for the Deaf, especially the appointments of teachers who are qualified in Sign Language, training sessions for educators in sign language are ongoing. Departmental officials were also trained in just basic Sign Language because the first time we went there, there was a serious problem with regard to educators who could not relate with the learners.

In respect of the recommendation that the provincial Department of Education should investigate the matter of renovating or buying the building from the church - you would remember that at the time we

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 7

were there, the infrastructure, school itself or buildings belonged to the church which, out of courtesy, allowed those buildings to be used for the deaf - and we speak, the department has been able to purchase that property. When we were there for our follow-up visit, work was underway for the reconstruction and renovation of that school because previously, the department could not invest money on property that did not belong to the department and so forth.

With regard to the recommendation that the positions of the two vacant deputy principals at St Thomas School for the Deaf should be filled as a matter of urgency, the two positions - on our follow-up visits - had since been filled. In response to the recommendation that the Department of Education should consider a full adaptation of the curriculum for special schools such as the very same St Thomas School for the Deaf, a full curriculum adaptation framework - in line with the Curriculum and Assessment Policy Statement, CAPS - has been finalised, as we speak. A total of 116 district officials were trained in curriculum adaptation and 2 732 teachers from 382 schools were also trained on the adaptation process.

On the need for the provincial Department of Education to ensure that more classrooms are built at Fundiswa Special School - as we speak - temporary classrooms have been provided to the school, which

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 8

have afforded the school much-needed relief. In response to the recommendation that the water challenges at the Walter Sisulu University should be addressed before end of the week of 18 November 2016 - the week during which we visited the area - short-term solutions including the delivery of extra water tanks and the drilling of a borehole, were put in place.

The Department of Social Development in the Eastern Cape is in the process of decentralising payment for ECDs to the districts, which will be addressed on a quarterly basis. And, of course, as regards the bottlenecks which the ECDs were complaining about, some are in progress while on others there is some slow progress but there is something that is being done to assist ECDs, as compared to when we took Parliament to the people.

The spending of the allocated budget for subsidy transfers has been consistent as opposed to previously. However, the province is still lagging behind in terms of the national norms, which are 209 to 237 for the 2018-2019 financial year. A huge progress has been made in terms of the ECD Massification Programme because the number of conditionally-registered ECDs has increased.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 9

When it comes to local economic development, due to the fact that little or no progress was made, a decision was taken by the NCOP that a technical committee must be established and be coordinated by the Chief Director of Investment and Trade from national Department of Economic Development. We recommended that the committee must facilitate stakeholder meetings between all relevant stakeholders, departments, entities and business owners in order to work out an implementation action plan and focused support mechanism for the following businesses: Proglow; BCM Automotive – After-care Incubator; and East London IDZ Incubator Centre. There are others – it doesn't mean that, having identified these, others are not important. There are those that will obviously have to be taken into account.

Furthermore, the NCOP recommended that the Office of the Premier of Eastern Cape must strengthen oversight over the different departments and entities with respect to preferential procurement policies and legislation to ensure emerging small and medium businesses benefit from localisation. We also recommend for intensive training of co-operatives in the Eastern Cape. I want to emphasise the issue of co-operatives because the problem that we identified with regard to success and progress of co-operatives is lack of understanding and the conceptualisation of their nature,

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 10

structure, purpose, ideological posture and so forth. As a result of that lack of understanding - you find that - most of them collapse. Therefore, we are recommending that more emphasis needs to put on - even before they get established and just by identifying those that will be participating - educating them properly and orientate them in a better way.

As the NCOP, we recommend that the Ncera Macadamania Farming should be supported since it has the potential to alleviate poverty and create the much-needed jobs in the province. Ncera Macadamania must be approached within the context of developing not only black farmers, but also industrialists. A special dispensation dedicated to black rural industrialists should be created in order to have specific focus on rural areas to uplift emerging rural industrialists. This will ensure that rural communities participate fully and meaningfully in the economy, and do away with the two economies that exist currently whereby the rural feeds the urban and there is no return insofar as economic development is concerned.

In the Alfred Nzo District, despite numerous commitments made when we visited the province in November 2016, it became apparent that almost 16 months later, in the same areas of Alfred Nzo District, no finger was lifted to implement certain aspects of our

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 11

recommendations. Water and sanitation facilities remain the scarcest commodities in the district's rural schools even though the Eastern Cape Department of Education has contracted the Amatola Water Board to provide bulk water and sanitation services to the schools in Alfred Nzo District.

We have asked for a report detailing the challenges faced with regard to the implementation of the contracts that the department had entered into with the Amatola. We want to see how we can intervene to unlock the stumbling blocks – as the NCOP serving the interest of provinces at national level. To what extent can we play a role as the NCOP in holding the national Department of Water insofar as the provision of water is concerned?

We need to strengthen political institutions to deliver on their mandate. We need to build effective, integrated planning and service delivery systems. We need to deal with weak vertical macro policy co-ordination across spheres of government and poor horizontal collaboration across departments and agencies of government due to misunderstanding of the devolution and decentralisation of powers within a unitary state, and inappropriate configuration of the centre of government. We need to strengthen our intergovernmental

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 12

relations and make sure issues arising from communities' meetings and Imbizos are linked to the IDPs and, of course, the budgets.

The municipalities visited in the Alfred Nzo District presented the delegations with the most heart-breaking findings. The group based in Mbizana was alerted of a tragic incident where five-year-old Ziwe Mkhethwa, a learner at Luna Primary School, who had been reported missing on Monday that week, 12 March 2018, was found dead at her school's pit latrine toilet on the 13 March 2018. Young Ziwe's horrific death highlights the terrible infrastructural conditions under which some of our learners, especially those in deep rural villages continue to endure in spite of huge amounts being allocated for school infrastructure development projects. Let the death of the young Ziwe Mkhethwa not be in vein. Let's improve our oversight, strengthen that capacity, and ensure that the executive is held accountable.

In all public meetings held across the breadth and length of the Eastern Cape during the report-back session, we noted that thousands of the people are joining hands to sustain their democratic achievements, and they are willing to protect it like the apple of their eyes. They are filled with hope about the bright future that beckons. They shall not be distracted by noise of the falling tree

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 13

amidst the dignified silence of a new future starting to blossom because they know that the NCOP has laid a foundation and the building has begun.

For instance, Ms Nomfundo Bulose, a librarian at Nkontolo Public Library in Mbizana Local Municipality had this to say:

Since the NCOP visit the library has seen more positive change. We have, for the first time, a photocopy machine, internet access and more delivery of IsiXhosa books. I do appreciate the work of the NCOP, and the NCOP should pay us more visits.

[Applause.]

Another testimony we received is from Ms Nomawonga Mqeke, a librarian at Mbizana Library, who said:

Prior to the visit of the NCOP the library was in a dilapidated state. Through the intervention of the NCOP, the library was maintained and the allocation of funds to the library has increased from R2500 000 to R350 000, with a commitment to increase it to R500 000 per annum in the 2018-2019 financial year.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 14

Hon members, the testimonies illustrate that if we roll up our sleeves in partnerships for change, we can and shall build the country of our children's dreams. Thank you. [Applause.]

Ms L L ZWANE: Hon Chairperson and hon members, in the centenary year of the birth our icon Nelson Rolihlahla Mandela and our mother Albertina Sisulu, who are loved by the people of South Africa and progressive forces throughout the world. It is the responsibility of all South Africans, united in our diversity, to work together to make South Africa and Africa as a continent a better place to live in.

Working together as a collective: parents, educators, business, traditional leadership, NGOs, phase-based organisations and the general public, we can assist to turnaround the situation of our education for better in the country.

As a governing party, we've always held a view that education is a societal issue and we recognise the fact that it is not possible for our government to do everything all at once; we can only achieve that much, under the confines of the fiscus that we have.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 15

The Taking Parliament To The People, TPTTP, as the Deputy Chairperson of this House has alluded to and the follow-up thereof, were meant to ensure that the issues that our own communities had raised during it together with the Eastern Cape Legislature are attended to by the various government departments.

We are living under the situation where the fiscus of the country is not positive at all and that has a direct impact on education. You cannot address all the issues that are affecting our education, in terms of quality, when the budget of the department is cut, almost every Medium Term Strategic Framework, MTSF; it is not possible. All that we are saying is that, as a department we need to stretch a rand very far and make sure that we handle our monies, as a country, in a manner that we achieve more with the little that we have.

The oversight visit that we undertook to the Buffalo City and Alfred Nzo Municipalities were undertaken by different groups: Group 1 to 3 that attended to Buffalo City Metropolitan Municipality and Group 4 to 7 went to Alfred Nzo District Municipality.

IsiZulu:

Ngifuna-ke ukuthi ngikhulume-ke ngomphakathi esasixoxa nawo ngenkathi silaphayana siyokwenza i-oversight ukuthi umphakathi

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 16

ukuqondile futhi ukuthakasele njengoba eshilo usekela sihlalo ukuthi thina njengoHulumeni kaKhongolose siyabanakekela abantu futhi thina njengoHulumeni kaKhongolose siyazinikeza isikhathi siyolalela ukuthi abantu bathini. Thina njengoKhongolose siwumbutho osebenza nabantu futhi osebenzela abantu futhi osebenza ngabantu yingakho sathatha isikhathi njengeNdlu yezifundazwe saya eMpumalanga Koloni ukuyobheka ukuthi le mali esiyiphasisa la kwi-NCOP, unyaka nonyaka wezimali ukuthi yenzani laphaya phansi. Asikholelwa ekutheni nje sifunde imibiko elethwa yiminyango. Sikholelwa wukuthi siziyele phansi siyobheka ukuthi imali yabatheli bentela ibenzelani abantu abasivotelayo. Bayakholelwa abantu kulo Hulumeni ngoba uyabanakekela futhi basazophinda bawuvotele lo Hulumeni ngoba uyabanakekela. Ushilo usekela sihlalo wathi la kukhona izincomo ezivela ebantwini abathile, oNomfundo, abashoyo ukuthi, ngokufika kwe-NCOP yashintsha impilo yabo.

English:

The NCOP is led by the ANC; this is an ANC-led government.

IsiZulu:

Usekela sihlalo ye-ablution facility, elinye iqembu yase-Alfred Nzo e-Mbizane, iqembu eliholwa umhlonishwa uDlamini la ingane eyashona khona kwindlu yangasese yomgodi ...

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 17

English:

... because of the bad state of affairs of the ablution facilities in our institutions, we acknowledge that; against the background that the national fiscus is negative.

We wanted to say thank you to the group that went to do oversight in the Mbizana Local Municipality because they took it upon themselves to go to this family and pay respects on behalf of this House; and more than that, they also left a contribution to the family as a token of condolences. We want to say that the ANC does take care of the people. [Applause.]

Mr J W W JULIUS: Chairperson, the hon member on the podium is deliberately misleading the House. It was not the ANC that went to the house; we went as a committee and I as a DA member also contributed there. So, the member must not mislead us due to being misinformed. Thank you, Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon members, there are two things: we can't be subjecting the speaker at the podium at the debate, but, listening to what she said, hon Julius, I thought she said on behalf of the House, and the House to me is not a party. [Interjections.] Okay, order, hon Zwane, can you go back to that

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 18

statement about the visit to the family? [Interjections.] Yes, I'm doing that. Hon Zwane, can you repeat the part of going to the family? Hon Zwane, repeat that statement, I want to make a ruling.

Ms L L ZWANE: I said we want to convey our gratitude to the members of that particular group [Interjections.] as led by hon Dlamini that went to pay respect to the family on behalf of the NCOP.

[Interjections.] Whether or not ... wait a bit, we appreciate that all the parties were there. Chairperson, I ask for your protection. We appreciate the fact that all parties were involved, thank you very much. But the leadership was provided by the ANC.

[Interjections.]

Ms N P KONI: Chair, mama spoke so well, but the ending part of what she said is misleading; she's continuing to mislead this House and South Africa at large. Because it can't be that she concludes by praising the ANC that those people went there. It's wrong.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon members, let me assist. This is the debate, and all parties will have an opportunity; anything that she will say here that will be wrong, you will have an opportunity to correct it when it's your turn. Let's allow hon Zwane to continue with the debate.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 19

Ms L L ZWANE: Chairperson, if the group was led by the opposition, I concede [Interjection.]

Ms T G MPAMBO-SIBHUKWANA: Chair, I would like to know if the hon member can take a question?

Ms L L ZWANE: No, I am here for a serious job. Some of the institutions that we visited where recommendations had been made and the follow-up wanted to know if those were attended to were the following: Elwazi High School, there was a water problem that had not been addressed and on our arrival we were informed that the municipality had provided a water tank to alleviate the water problem in that institution.

Wongaletu High School, an institution that has produced some of our renowned leaders ...

IsiZulu:

... u-MEC waseMpumalanga Koloni uvela kulesiya sikole ekuthiwa yi-Wongaletu. Umhlonishwa u-Mapisa-Nqakula uvela kulesiya sikole ekuthiwa yi-Wongaletu futhi lesiya sikole siyadinga ukuba sinakekeleke ngoba Baba Makupula imiphumela iphansi kodwa esikubongayo wukuthi njengo-MEC ubonelele ukuthi akubekhona

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 20

umqeqeshi osolekelela uthishomkhulu ne-School Management Team, SMT, ekwabonakala ukuthi umsebenzi usungaphezu kwamandla. Siye eHlokoma bekunenkinga yokuthuthwa kwendle nenhlanzeko nakhona safika iHlokoma isiyilungisile indaba yamathoyilethi angasebenzi kahle kodwa saba nesikhalo sokuthi engathi umnyango uhambe kancane ekutheni ubalekelele ngokuthi sibiyelwe isikole ikakhulukazi ngoba uthishomkhulu wumuntu wesifazane. Sifuna ukuthi zonke izikole zamabanga aphezulu eziphethwe ngabantu besifazane zibiywe ngoba bona abakwazi ukuzivikela uma kungena izintswelaboya siphuma emphakathini zizophazamisa ukusebenza kwesikole. Siphinde saya laphaya kuma ...

English:

... Early Childhood Development, ECD, centres , we've always held a view as a committee that Early Child Development, ECD, is of extreme importance. If the foundation is not firm in the ECD, you cannot expect the output at the level of Grade 12 to be the best.

IsiZulu:

Uthi ke uMama u-Loots ngenye inkathi - walaphaya e-Oudsthoorn ...

English:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 21

... it does not make sense to have good primary education as well as good secondary schools in Oudtshoorn if the foundation phase is not of good standard.

The subsidy from the provincial government is not paid on time sometimes and it is also too little for the needs of our children; 80% of the budget for ECDs goes to the salaries of the practitioners; it is an issue that we have taken to the Department of Social Development and they accompanied us during our ECD centres' visits; and made an undertaking that they are going to look into these issues. I also took note of the fact that as I read the Report, in some of the ECD centres, the number of children that are subsidised has been raised; some from 35 to 45, 40 to 50, that is an indication that as a government of the ANC we are taking ECDs very seriously. At the meeting that we had with the Department of Basic Education, the Chairperson of the portfolio committee from Gauteng Province, hon Mpsisi, who is amongst us as a special delegate, was part of that meeting. We raised the issue of ECDs sharply and what the department reported to be doing is that they are training 150 000 ECD Practitioners, to raise them from level 1 to level 4, in order to ensure that the quality of education that we are giving to our children is top quality. That is the response.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 22

Mr M M CHABANGU: Chairperson, the hon member is misleading the House. We are from the meeting where it was stated that in the Eastern Cape the ECDs are tatters, they are in a bad state of [Interjections.] this morning and she comes here and tells us that the ECDs are in good standing.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon member, I've made a ruling that you'll have an opportunity to come and debate. Let's allow hon Zwane to debate. Continue hon Zwane!

IsiZulu:

Nk L L ZWANE: Kodwa kuye kubekuhle Sihlalo ukuthi umuntu ngaphambi kokuba aphakamise isandla alalelisa ukuthi isikhulumi sithini.

English:

... it's very, very important ...

IsiZulu:

Ungaveli nje ukuthathe ngenhliziyo. [Ubuwelewele.] Awukhulumi lento engiyikhulumayo.

English:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 23

... I never said the ECDs are in a good state of affairs. I'm talking about the practitioners. Please listen. Sharpen your listening skills.

In Alfred Nzo ... [Interjection.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Zwane, you can't be talking direct to ... [Interjections.] ... yes, you can't be talking directly to hon Chabangu, you do it through me. And I've made a ruling, don't go back to that.

IsiZulu:

Nk L L ZWANE: Ku-Alfred Nzo kusikole ekuthiwa yiNkundla Primary School besingenayo umabhalane maje usekhona umabhalane ...

English:

... that is delivery.

IsiZulu:

Laphaya esikoleni okuthiwa Mosa Sibi Secondary School ...

[Ubuwelewele.]

English:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 24

Mr F ESSACK: Chairperson, this very educated member at the podium, through you I would like to ask the member at podium a question. A very small and simple one.

Ms L L ZWANE: Those you come to Parliament to play have got time to do what the member is doing; I've got no time for that ...

[Interjection.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Zwane, are you ready to take a question?

Ms L L ZWANE: It's a waste of time.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Zwane!

Ms L L ZWANE: I am not prepared, Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Zwane, order members. hon Zwane, it is within the Rules of Parliament for member to ask a question. So, are you ready to take a question?

Ms L L ZWANE: [Interjections.] I am not withdrawing anything. I don't want to take a question, Chairperson, my time is wasted.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 25

Salaries of expatriate teachers at Mosa Sibi Secondary were outstanding ... [Interjection.]

Mr F ESSACK: Chairperson, with due respect, I'm addressing you. and it is for you to rule whether it is parliamentary or not for the member on the podium to insinuate that I'm here to play and to attempt to insult me and say that she will not waste her time based on my question. Please rule on that, thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon members, order. Hon Essack, you are raising a point. Hon members, I dealt with that; I made it sure that it's responding to what you are asking. That is why I made it a point that it is responding to you appropriately, there's nothing ... continue, hon Zwane.

Ms L L ZWANE: Salaries for expatriate teachers at Mosa Sibi Secondary School were outstanding; the outstanding salaries have now been paid and they are now getting their salaries on a regular basis.

Zwelakhe Senior Secondary School was in dire need of painting; that has been attended to.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 26

At Nzululwazi Secondary School they wanted a site for the construction of their hostels; the site has been secured and the hostels have begun to be built. That is delivery. And what more do people want?

In conclusion I want to say that the opposition parties have always held a view that Taking Parliament To The People is a waste of taxpayers' money; now, they are making the loudest noise about this Taking Parliament To The People [Interjection.]

Mr L B GAehler: Chairperson, Mama Zwane is misleading the House, we are never of the view that it's a waste of money or else we must not go [Interjection.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): No, non Gaehler. Hon members, let me make an appeal to all of you. You have speakers that are in this list, if you have a view about what was said by the speaker on the podium, you have your own chance to reply. But you can't be debating with the speaker at the podium, you can't be doing that.

Mr J W W JULIUS: [Inaudible.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 27

Ms N P KONI: Chairperson, since you have spoken about people who are going to be on that podium, the last time I checked, I am debating today but as I am standing here I don't see my name appearing on the speakers' list.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon members, the speakers' list that I have, I do have hon Koni on my list; that was submitted by the Chief Whip. I'll send it to you. Can you continue hon Zwane?

Can you go and give it to her? Hon Koni, let me ... okay, I'm addressing it now; they are giving it to you. Don't you see your name there? [Interjections.] No, can you give it to her?

[Interjections.] No, you have it, give her that paper. Hon Koni, it means the one that you had is the one that was amended, but in front of me I had an amended one reflecting hon Koni as I'm showing you.

Ms N P KONI: [Inaudible.]

Ms L L ZWANE: Chairperson, the interception of the debate because of administrative issues, I don't think it is parliamentary. It is an issue that the Whips should attend to prior to the sitting, not to intercept a debate, because of administration.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 28

IsiZulu:

Sikhuluma nabantu emphakathini ...

English:

... there has to be order [Interjection.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Zwane ... can you take your seat hon Koni? Let me deal with hon Zwane first. Hon Zwane, you are making it difficult for me and for yourself. Here I'm presiding, I've made a ruling and there's a procedure in dealing with dissatisfaction about a ruling. And I must address the issue, instead on focusing on your speech you are getting to a ruling that I've made, and that is not in order. Refrain from doing that and focus on your speech as you conclude.

Ms L L ZWANE: My apologies, Chairperson. Oliver Tambo Technical School, including the governing body, appreciates the contribution and the involvement of the NCOP in developing the school in order to make sure that the dream of our icon, Oliver Reginald Tambo, who himself identified the land in 1993 so that the school can be built and named the school after himself is realised. Thank you Chairperson. The ANC leads. [Applause.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 29

Mr L V MAGWEBU: Hon House Chair, members and fellow South Africans, two years ago in 2016 we visited the province of the Eastern Cape, my home province and spent the week conducting oversight as we took this Parliament to the Eastern Cape residents. A number of service delivery failures were raised by the people of the Eastern Cape. From the 12-16 March 2018 we returned to the Eastern Cape to follow up on the undertakings made by the government departments, MECs, Ministers and then president Zuma to deliver the services that needed to be delivered in the Eastern Cape.

IsiXhosa:

Andisayi kuncokola mna ndizame ukufihla izinto.

English:

Let us just speak the truth to power.

IsiXhosa:

Apha sithetha ngeengxaki zaseMpuma Koloni.

English:

To me, this matter is very personal. The ANC-led government must stick to the facts and my endeavour this afternoon is to be true to the facts and speak truth to power.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 30

IsiXhosa:

Kufuneka siyeke iintsomi namabali okuthetha izinto ezingekhoyo.

English:

Hon Chair, upon our visit this year, we found that out of 22 undertakings that were made by the MECs, Ministers and then president Zuma, a merely seven were delivered but 15 undertakings remained unattended. That is a fact. Out of 21 service delivery challenges, only four were fully resolved in the Eastern Cape. It should be noted that the challenges that are faced by the Eastern Cape are about the failures in the Basic Education in that province.

I want to quote from Professor Jonathan Jansen, a former Rector and Vice Chancellor of the University of Free State, an internationally renowned expert in Education:

Desperation is an emotion I seldom feel, except in relation to education, for I believe very deeply that for most of our children, a solid school education represents the only means available for ending the cycle of family poverty. Skills come later. Economic growth even later. Social cohesion lies far in the distance. What matters is that children complete 12 years of schooling with the ability to read, write, reason, calculate and

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 31

express confidence for purposes of further studies, skills training and higher education.

The future of our children in the Eastern Cape is in bleak hands under the current ANC-led government. The ANC-led government failures are not new and I will quickly highlight these on schools I personally visited as part of the delegation that visited the Eastern Cape and to mention the few, they are the following: Ulwazi High School in NU 2 Mdantsane. When we visited this school, learners were sitting on old mattresses due to lack of furniture. They did not have desks and chairs. This is unacceptable thinking that it is 24 years in democracy. Shame on you Minister and the ANC. This school has got no libraries, no proper toilets and ablution is a problem and not a staff room.

However, I wish to salute Mama Nomampondo Khosani, the principal of the school for her love, dedication and hard work. Her dedication and commitment to education despite the ANC failures is evident by the 100% matric pass rate. Indeed, a saying that is common in my province – talent is in the Eastern Cape. Sadly the market is elsewhere. MEC let me give you a free advice, with due respect. Work with this lady Nomampondo Khosani to help you because she

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 32

understands how to turn schools around despite your failures as the ANC.

During our visit in March 2018 at Hlokoma High School, learners in this school did not have set books yet these are the very same learners expected to pass at the end of 2018 matric examinations. Again, this is another ANC-led government failure. The furniture in Fanti Gaqa High School in Mdantsane was delivered on the day we visited this school as an NCOP delegation. Very clearly that the ANC is not dealing with the ANC nor South Africans in good faith. They masqueraded that things were all in order, only to push the furniture on that morning we were coming. These are the people who are calling themselves the leaders of the society and again, shame on you ANC.

These learners still need four more classrooms. In 2016, during our visit, the department made a commitment that they will provide these four classrooms. Two years later, the school was sitting with the same problem. The question is where are the leaders in the ANC? I will you that they are busy with factional battles and they are busy failing our children who are expected to succeed under dire circumstances. Again, this is another ANC-led government failure.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 33

I was there at Ebhotwe High School, a school for learners with special needs and 70% of learners are subjected to a main stream curriculum. No wonder these poor learners do poorly on common papers whereas it should be adjusted or differentiated as they are learners with special needs. Again, the Minister and the Department of Education in the province is really failing our children because of poor planning and not anticipating what needs to be done in good time.

These are learners who do not have scholar transport yet they are learners with special needs and they are vulnerable to abuse. They need to be assisted as they commute from home to school. The excuse we got is that the policy does not allow the school to qualify. MEC, the policy must meet the needs of these children. If the policy needs to be revisited these are learners that need to be protected yet the ANC-led government is failing them on the basis that they are living in the radius of five kilometres. These are learners that must be transported with the nursing sister and a teacher assistant because of their conditions.

These are the elements or requirements that are not met because the ANC is busy with everything but not with the education of our

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 34

children. Hon Chair, these problems are found in many districts of the Eastern Cape, if not the entire Eastern Cape. I live there...

IsiXhosa:

... kusekhaya kwaye ndiyayazi le nto ndiyithethayo.

English:

I have no doubt that the members who visited Alfred Nzo District Municipality would agree with me that little has changed but the worst has happened. Everything is deteriorating and all is falling apart. I will not mention the tragedy of a child that fell in the school pit toilet and passed away. All I could say, shame on you ANC.

There is a school in the Chris Hani District Municipality called Isivivane High School which is the lowest performing school in the entire country according to the 2017 matric pass rate. They have been experiencing all these problems of performance and you have been the MEC during this period. All learners failed matric last year. Early this year, I led a delegation of Members of Parliament from my party and we visited this school.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 35

We found out that these learners do not have a scholar transport due to the failure of the ANC-led government because they misclassified this school as the school which does not qualify for scholar yet it does. This problem is known by the department yet nothing has been done to correct this. Hon Makuphula, you know that MpL Jane Cowley wrote a question about this school and you know about it and nothing has been done.

In conclusion, the DA has demonstrated that it cares about the education of our children. Schools where DA governs has proper infrastructure and learning and teaching materials. The future of our children is in good hands. We are the party for all the people of South Africa and what needs to be done in the Eastern Cape is not more promises from the ANC but a total change and the DA provides that total change. We are ready to govern and we will ensure that the DA governs the Eastern Cape.

IsiXhosa:

Hlehla mnhlangani endaweni yenywagi. Sesifikile thina size kuhlanguka iMpuma Koloni. Enkosi tata ndiyabulela. [Kwaqhwyatya.]

Ms N P KONI: Chairperson, let me also take this opportunity to greet all the EFF members and supporters all over the continent. The theme

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 36

for today's debate is making your future work better-learning from Madiba, following up on our commitments. So, the best place to begin is to ask what commitments have the ANC government made.

In 2013 the ANC government lay out and published the National Minimum Norms and Standards for Public School Infrastructure. These norms and standards were: that all schools built from mud as well as those schools built from materials such as asbestos, metal and wood must be replaced within a certain period of three years from the date of publication of the regulations; all schools that do not have access to any form of power supply, water supply or sanitation must be prioritised and provided with the above within a period of three years from the date of publication of the regulations; that the norms and standards relating to the availability of classrooms, electricity, water, sanitation, electronic connectivity and perimeter security are to be prioritised and must be dealt with and implemented within seven years from the date of publication of the regulations; that specific focus must be placed on the norms and standards relating to libraries and laboratories for science, technology and life sciences and these norms and standards must be implemented within ten years from the date of publication of the regulations.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 37

It is now nearly five years since the publication of the Minimum Norms and Standards for Public School Infrastructure and what of these deadlines has the department met.

In the Eastern Cape, we still have mud schools, with learners having to study in the same schools and under the same conditions that their parents studied under during apartheid. These two years after the governments very own regulations said that there should be no more mud schools. In the Eastern Cape, you still have over one thousands schools built from materials containing asbestos.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Koni, sorry. Hon Essack, why are you standing?

Mr F ESSACK: Hon Chairperson, I just want check if it is parliamentary for an EFF member to walkout while his own member is on the podium because now we only have one EFF member left in the House.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): They are out of order, hon Essack.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 38

Ms N P KONI: The schools built with asbestos slowly poison our children. It has been two years since every school in the country should have had access to power supply, water supply, and proper sanitation.

Today, there are still 37 schools in the Eastern Cape that do not have toilets, and over 1 900 that only have pit latrines and during our visit to the Eastern Cape, a tragedy happened when a young child died after falling in a pit toilet. This is a tragedy that could have prevented, had the government stuck to its commitments.

In the Eastern Cape, you still find schools without electricity, and schools despatch, primary school having to cut their days in half because of no water. How is government expecting to lift our people out of poverty when children are not able to attend school for the necessary time, simply because government cannot even supply water?

If government was not able to even meet these very basic standards and norms, how is it meant to meet ... hon member of the DA on my left here is drowning me, so, can you please protect me?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 39

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon members, let us have order. Hon member, heckling is allowed but drowning the speaker at the podium is not allowed.

Ms N P KONI: If government was not able to even meet these very basic standards and norms, how is it meant to meet the others it has made, if it is still catching up with deadlines that have long passed and that unfortunately is not happening. Will all schools in the Eastern Cape meet the minimum norms and standards for libraries and laboratories for science, technology and life sciences, that is in five years, I doubt it. In fact I will be surprised if the norms and standards that were meant to be met five years ago will be met this time.

The Department of Basic Education is everything that the Batho Pele meaning people first does not stand for. It has not prioritised our children, instead the ANC government in the Eastern Cape because of corruption, incompetence, mismanagement and cadre deployment has collapsed basic education in the province, and in turn has failed our children, and by failing our children and the education they receive it has doomed our future already.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 40

The MEC of the Eastern Cape Province, you are sitting there and you are laughing and it is very nice. Why, because your children are not subjected to the conditions of these children that is why you find it so easy to smile when I am here debating, speaking for the hopelessness. Thank you very much, Chairperson.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Let me take the point of order from hon Mokwele.

Ms T J MOKWELE: Chair, on a point of order: I just want to check with you that whatever that has been debated here and needs the attention of the national Department of Education, who is going to take the matters forth because we are debating here and none of the Minister nor Deputy Minister of Basic Education is here with us. So, I want to check with you, are we doing this debate for the sake of doing it or we are just playing here.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Mokwele, even though the issue you are raising here is not for this session to be attended to now but in terms of the procedure, the executive undertaking of the House because we will be waiting ultimately at the end, resolutions of the House will be go to the relevant Minister and relevant department from provinces. So let's allow the debate to go on.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 41

Mr M RAYI: Hon House Chairperson, hon Deputy Chairperson, hon Chief Whip, hon members, MEC for education and other special delegates, the NCOP held its first report back session in the Eastern Cape from the 12-16 March 2018. This feedback session followed the main Taking Parliament to the People visit of the NCOP which was in November 2016.

Delegations which are led for the focus of local economic development in the Buffalo City Municipality with the special focus on the support provided to small businesses operating within the metro. Inspired by the clarion call Vukusenzele, a group of determined businessmen and women ventured into difficult challenge of establishing businesses throughout the length and breadth of the Buffalo City Metro.

During the Taking Parliament to the People Programme in the Eastern Cape in November 2016, we had the honour and the opportunity to meet some of these bold and brave entrepreneurs. That visit had raised the expectations of those and other businessmen and women our delegation came to contact with. We had the honour to see first hand the mixture of different projects that impressed us such as agriculture, manufacturing and technological innovation etc. We were impressed by the determination of these men and women who struggled

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 42

to succeed under difficult circumstances. What was clear to us is that if the projects were properly assisted, they had the potential to grow, sustain and provide jobs for people in their respective areas.

During the feed back session, we found out that not much has been done in terms of assisting the businessmen and women. The delegation felt that it was inappropriate that after 16 months since the main visit was done, inadequate or no progress information was collected for the different stake holders and implementing agents. And that in the same period, meetings that we agreed on were not convened. [Interjections.] Chair, can I be protected? [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon members, I have made a ruling about drowning the speaker at the podium and its applicable to all members of this august House when they are at the podium. You are protected hon Rayi, continue.

Mr M RAYI: Thank you. That in the same period, meeting that we agreed on were not convened and honoured by the same stakeholders. Another issue that came to our attention was the allegation that emerging entrepreneurs are reduced and made to beg for resources and support while we have agreed that they must be fully supported and

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 43

progressively graduate from level of corporative to building industries whose mission would be the backbone of local economy. It cannot be correct for the state institution and officials, treats small businesses and emerging entrepreneurs with contempt when we took a consciously political decision for accelerated and radical socio economic transformation.

A delegation directed that all the relevant departments must include issues raised by the delegation as part of their annual performance plans and the committees of NCOP must monitor these accordingly. The projects that we visited are, Magereza furniture, Up Primary agriculture cooperative, pro glove, East London IDZ incubation centre, be bright way product and cleaning services, Miesha grape place, duncan village business support centre, Mega macadamia farming pty ltd.

Hon Deputy Chair has reported on the outcomes of these visits so I am not going to repeat them. But in respect to all other project that we visited, there was consensus that due to the fact that little or no progress was made, a decision was taken for an urgent technical team to be established to follow up on the commitments made and be co-ordinated by the Chief Director of Investment and Trade from the national Department of Economic Development, Mr Duma

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 44

Nkosi. He is a capable and seasoned administrator to facilitate stakeholder meetings between all relevant departments, entities and business owners within 21 working days from the time of the visit to discuss all issues raised and work out an implementation action plan and focus support mechanism.

In 30 working days, a report arising out of these engagements must be submitted to the NCOP. I am happy to report that the first meeting of this technical team met in East London on the 4-5 April 2018. The report further emphasising that the business owners participating in the meeting felt that their long wait was not in vain as they are now hopeful is there is that government will consider moving away from projects but rather develop industry that will strengthen their participation in the economy. The delegation expressed a view that a renewed emphasis must be placed on localisation particularly linked to procurement by government and state-owned companies. There must be an increased designation of products that are locally produced to facilitate and expand public by local campaign.

The black industrialist programme should be strengthened and support programmes should be developed for other sectors. That serious attention must be paid to the issue of development of a corporative

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 45

sector of the economy to enable people to combine their resources and efforts to engage in economic activities that would benefit the largest number of people. They must be biased towards youth especially coming from rural areas and in working class urban communities. Youth support must be incorporated as one of these areas in the score card or failed form which government procure goods and services. Government must radically extend outreach of micro credit programme to enhance the capacity of people at grass root level to engage in productive economy.

Let me also deal with the economic profile of the Buffalo City with the three minutes that I have. I hope I will be done on deindustrialisation. It is a well established fact that the Buffalo City municipality has reindustrialised over the 20 years as a trade competition from global integration. The termination of industrial decentralisation incentives reduce tariff protection and rising inputs cause that is primarily electricity and wages which have grown faster than productivity increases.

Employment in manufacturing is down 50% over the past 20 years. Schedule workers in the matters enduring sub sector are down to 1 200 from 5 800 five years ago. More than 30 00 - 20 years ago,

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 46

Dagama, our textile manufacturer used to employ 9 000 workers, this has reduced to under 500.

The question is does the government, Employment Development Department or Department of Trade and Industry have a clear strategy to slow down the pace for the reindustrialised. What is it that they are doing to build competitiveness in key firms and strategic value chain such as Defy in the white goods sector? On economic development, the tertiary sector on the other hand has experienced a 40% increase in employment from 1995 to 2015 with finance trade and community and government services contributing to this employment increase.

The tertiary sector in the city is driven around government services which are trade and finance around government which makes the city vulnerable. The economy is over depended on government services which bring risks given the current physical constraints facing the country. The other main stain of the local economy is Mercedes Benz of South Africa which also brings risks given that if investment decisions are made in German, economic devastation and business retention must be prioritised.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 47

Is there a clear economic strategy to draw the economy of Buffalo City that is shed across the three spheres of government? If there is no shed perceptible across three spheres, how do we quickly arrive at this perceptible so that the city can benefit? We need the Department of Trade and Industry and Employment Development Department to have a clear strategy for the region beyond just supporting Mercedes Benz of South Africa. Thank you.

Mr M MAKUPULA (Eastern Cape): Hon Chair of Chairs, a very good afternoon hon members, officials and esteem guests in the gallery. Given the limitation of the time I have, let me indeed try and shoot straight to the point. On behalf of the Eastern Cape province, I feel privileged to stand here and accept the report by the NCOP after the visits in the province. In accepting the report, I felt that due to the time limit, let me just group my response to the pertinent issues according to themes gathered.

There are three of them. The first one is Infrastructure. It remains one of the most challenging areas in our work at the province, given the backlog and limitations on a budget. There are mainly three sources of funding for infrastructure, first one being Accelerated School Infrastructure Development Initiative, Asidi. In the country so far, the Eastern Cape remains the major beneficiary of this

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 48

initiative. However, let me indicate that unfortunately this programme is mainly directed and managed at head office level of the Department of Basic Education, DBE. We have got little influence as a province on where and how it works.

The second source is the Education Infrastructure Grant, EIG, which is a conditional grant. That is the main source of our funding from the Department of Basic Education. As the name says, conditional grant, it restricts us to where we must work. Unfortunately, in 2017-18 we were able to utilise the funded amount, up to its 100%. We even went beyond. In fact, there were some outstanding project invoices that had to be catered for in the 2018-19 financial year, an amount of about R340 million which we had to pay over in this financial year. That grant has decreased in 2018-19 down to R1,4 billion, from 1,5 billion the previous financial year.

The last source of funding is Equitable Share. In 207-18 this amount was R55 million. In this financial year, 2018-19, it is R10 million. It is going to be zero allocation in the next two outer years of the MTEF. For the next two years we will not have any amount on allocation from the Equitable Share portion of the province. This is the only source of funding controlled by the province to address its priorities.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 49

The next theme would be human resource management and development. Let me indicate that we have gone a long way over the last 18 months to appoint both the senior level management to ensure that the governance is stable at leadership level of the department, as well as teachers, DDGs, directors and chief directors.

Let me focus on the professionals. By now, at least we have been able to appoint 188 subject advisors and last year we were able to appoint 33 circuit managers. In terms of teachers, without detailing the numbers, in 2017 after your visit, we were able to take a decision that says for the first time let us delegate responsibility of appointing a post level 1 teacher to the level of a district director.

The practice of keeping everything at head office blocks the systems and it takes time. Since then, we have seen a quicker way of appointing educators: Post level 1 to district directors, head of department and deputy principals. Yes, we might be at the bottom, but we are improving. That has shown us a good way of doing things. It has gone a long way in showing by shortening the filling of posts.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 50

The learner-teacher support material, LTSM, is my last theme. You will recall that in terms of stationery, over the last three years we have always been delivering stationery and you had found stationery at schools. We deliver in time; not even on time. You found stationery over there at schools. The challenge lies with text books. Now remember we have mandatory text books each financial year.

In 2018-19 the mandatory textbooks were the Grade 10 literature, the technical mathematics and technical science books.

Where I would appeal to you, hon members, before you attack the department - as you should, because you must - do take note that when you visit schools, please ask from principals how many books did they receive from the previous year retrieved from learners/children.

You know that during my time and your time at school, teachers used to keep report cards if you did not return books. However, due to the advent of democracy these years, principals have just let systems open. Learners/children just don't bring books back to school end of each year. So, every year we are compelled to buy text books. It is a huge challenge. All I am saying is that with the help

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 51

of oversight officials like you, we can make a difference to utilise that money effectively for other areas of need.

In conclusion, as I want to step down, one of the challenges which remain prevalent across the country is the issue of noncompliance to admission policies. That one occurs especially or basically in the rural areas. Where admissions are done in the previous year for this year, you will still find queues at schools with people asking for admission of learners.

Please excuse me as this might sound racially unacceptable, but this occurs every January month during school opening days, especially with African communities in the majority, including in the Western Cape. Yet, planning has already been done and funding already allocated. So, it is like you would be admitting orphans basically whose resources have already been allocated.

Therefore, as I step down, let me not fail to at least indicate to hon members that I am sorry if I have been looking like I was laughing or smiling. I thought I was handsome ... [Laughter.] ... but smiling is also a sign of discipline rather than being angry and crying. [Laughter.] You cannot address issues by being angry and

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 52

howling but one should deal with issue on the ground. You shouldn't look oddly at the faces of people.

The last thing I must say is the fact that the school my dear hon member from the DA mentioned, Ulwazi: That is my former workplace where I used to teach maths and science at. I am proud of that school and I support the 5 400 schools of the Eastern Cape. Thank you very much. [Applause.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Thank you, MEC. Hon Gaehler ... Keep smiling, MEC. I see the hon Koni is ready to give you an apology.

Mr L B GAEHLER: Thank you, Chairperson.

IsiXhosa:

Ndilusizi ukuba ndithethe emva kwakho MEC, bendicinga ukuba kuza kuqala kuthethe mna.

English:

The programme of Taking Parliament to the People is about engaging with the masses. The masses relayed a simple and clear message in East London: that government was failing to deliver to them and that

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 53

the status quo remained the same in the report-back session. The infrastructure is so poor that people cannot enjoy their rights provided for them in the Constitution of 1996.

One of the key areas that is failing is education. Education is the greatest investment for success in terms of the National Development Plan and for the advancement of South Africa's socioeconomic status, with Basic Education as the starting point.

Over time, the quality and output of South Africa's Basic Education system has deteriorated. Just under half of learners in Grade 1 make it to Grade 12. Roughly, 20% of Grades 9, 10 and 11 are repeaters, which suggests that they have been poorly prepared in the early grades. Less than 7% of matric candidates pass maths with a grade of 70%. In the poorest quintile of schools, less than 1% of matric graduates receive a distinction in maths. Only one in three schools has a library, while only one in five has a science laboratory.

The current school infrastructure remains a devil in the Basic Education system. Schools that were built from mud, zinc and asbestos should have been replaced by November 2016; yet, by its own admission, the Department of Basic Education will not meet this undertaking even if the goal posts are shifted again. This is usual

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 54

with Basic Education - they simply shift the goal posts. I spoke to Basic Education: you, Deputy Minister, and the Minister: I think it was in 2009 when I was in the National Assembly when you assured this country that mud schools would be a thing of the past. We're in 2018 now. [Interjections.]

Furthermore, provinces like the Eastern Cape add to the education challenges by being a culprit of underexpenditure. The underexpenditure of the Eastern Cape is because the national Department of Basic Education did not plan properly in terms of the Accelerated Schools Infrastructure Delivery Initiative, or Asidi. Additionally, the dismal failure of the department to replace inappropriate school infrastructure such as pit-latrines has turned schools into graveyards for learners.

IsiXhosa:

Abantwana bayatshona kule mingxunya yezindlu zangasese. Abanye bafundela phandle emvuleni. Musa ukuhleka sisi kuba ngabantwana bethu aba sithetha ngabo. Ibuhlungu kakhulu kumntu ohlala phaya ezilalini obukele abantwana bethu indlela abasokola ngayo.

English:

And you know that, MEC.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 55

IsiXhosa:

Imali ayikho kuwe. Iphaya phezulu ngoko ke asisayi kusola wena mntwana kaMakhuphula. Ukuba bebeninikile ukuba nicwangcise kakuhle la mali ngeyingakhange iphindele emva. Masiyithethe inyaniso, ukuba bebenijongile baninqwanqwada ngesingenayo ingxaki yokuphindiselwa kwezigidi zeerandi kwingxowa.

English:

Worst of all, Deputy Minister, our maintenance sector...

IsiXhosa:

... ayifumani misebenzi. Nokuba bayayifumana na imisebenzi kodwa anibahlawuli. Ibuhlungu loo nto leyo. Akuhlawuli Mathanzima noHolomisa apha, yi-ANC yakho Rayi engahlawuli bantu. Abanye abantu bafile ngenxa yokuba bengahlawulwanga ngurhulumente wenu, Rayi. Urhulumente wenu, Rayi uyoyisakala. UMathinzima noHolomisa babebahlawula abantu hayi le niyenzayo. Umntu apha kuni ugqiba umsebenzi ngeemali zakhe niphinde nina ningamhlawuli.

English:

Please, change Deputy Minister...

IsiXhosa:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 56

... ncedani nilungise le nto le...

English:

... leave that howler Rayi, he is just howling. Thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Order hon members. We will organise a special meeting for those... to deal with their provincial issues. Hon Mokwele, why are you standing?

Ms T J MOKWELE: I am surprised to see hon Gaehler howling! It is for the first time. Iyho... Tyhini [Exclamation]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): That is not a point of order. Hon Khawula, can you continue.

Mr M KHAWULA: Chairperson, on the 12th to the 16th of March 2018, I was part of the NCOP delegation that made a follow-up visit to the Eastern Cape province in Umzimvubu Local Municipality area. The delegation was composed of hon T Mampuru, hon Brenda Mathevula, hon B Nthebe and hon M B Khawula. This was a very good combination and the team worked very well together.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 57

In the area, we were received on the first day by the hon Speaker of Umzimvubu and some councillors with the Mayor of Umzimvubu joining us from the second day onwards.

From the issues that were raised during the first initial visit of the NCOP to the Eastern Cape, the delegation observed a variety of encounters, ranging from satisfactory, to some good responses, and some failures going down to somewhat embarrassing situations.

In respect of the Department of Social Development, DSD, the issues were that the department was failing to pay the stipend for all practitioners, in some instances the stipend was paid in drips and draps. The department was failing to provide adequate infrastructure to all the centres. The department was not subsidising all the learners enrolled in each centre. The toilets in some centres were in a terrible situation. We were all happy that the issue of the stipend to the practitioners has now been resolved in all the Early Childhood Development, ECD, centres we visited.

Whilst not 100% also, the subsidy per learner to the centres has also been partially increased in terms of numbers. However, infrastructure and toilets still remain a major challenge in most structures. In Justice Sodladla Pre-School, the structure used is

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 58

still terrible and dangerous to the safety of the kids. It is both a classroom and a kitchen. There is no water in the area. The community felt that they have been neglected by government in all respects. The same challenge seems to be cutting across most of the ECD centres in Umzimvubu, especially the water shortage challenge and the poor sanitation problem. What disappointed us the most was that officials from the Department of Social Development, DSD, in the Eastern Cape kept on denying that it is the responsibility of DSD to build ECD centres, hon MEC.

The education infrastructure in some schools we visited was in a terrible state. In Nzululwazi Senior Secondary School and MaKaula Senior Secondary School, there were some promising developments on infrastructure. The schools themselves do look good. But in Emthonjeni Primary, there are eight classrooms, all built by parents long ago. The school is in a terrible state. There are two toilets for female teachers, two toilets for male teachers; three very poor, in fact, unusable toilets for female learners; no toilets for boys.

We had to force the department on the spot to take a decision divert money which was to be utilised for the building of the kitchen to say it must be prioritised for the building of toilets. The school

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 59

has been waiting for years for a promise of new classrooms. The road to the school is terrible. There is no water.

Lutateni Senior Secondary is more of the same story. It was started by parents through their contributions in 1984. Even now, there are more classrooms under construction through the contribution by parents and the community. There is also an issue of long distances that learners walk to school in the area.

There was also complains of one bus that the department has hired which is old and dangerous. The school does not have staffrooms, there is no office for the principal, and there is no store room. The conditions are just alarming.

When we started on the first day, we had a rough patch with the municipality but, by the end of the week, both the Mayor and the Speaker of Umzimvubu Local Municipality had come into full understanding of the programme. They even promised that as we left, they were going to see how the municipality could attend to issues of roads, water and other services to the public places.

Sometimes the lack of understanding can ruin the objectives of a good programme. This made us aware that it is important that

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 60

workshops of what is oversight must be conducted for both local government and provincial government. They must be informed too, of what their role is when national parliament conducts oversight in their areas. If you were to ask me what the Alfred Nzo District Municipality is doing in Umzimvubu in providing water, I will tell you I do not know. That district must really wake up pursuit of its mandates.

In conclusion, in respect of servicing schools and ECDs, the Department of Health is trying their best in the area. I thank you.

Mr J W W JULIUS: House Chair, Deputy Minister, members of the executive council, MEC, and members, especially people from the Eastern Cape, I have noted with much disappointment that nothing much have changed regarding school infrastructure in the Eastern Cape when we visited again after two years of requesting changes to be effected. Now, hon Wana this is the very same house home of the legends. ... [Interjections.] ... The very same home of the legends, listen carefully. I also noted that members of the ANC both in the legislature as well as in the NCOP, the committee that I was with found this situation appalling. This must be commended because normally these malpractices are defended because of party lines.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 61

Members of the legislature were not shy to tell us that real problem lies with corruption in the provincial office - MEC they referred to you. Here I think you need a smile again. [Laughter.] They told us that the reason why money meant for the building of school toilets and other infrastructure was because of greed. If a preferred contractor did not get a tender, the money would be withheld until the right corrupt cronies are ready to take on the project ...

[Interjections.]

Ms T WANA: Through you, Chairperson, can the speaker take a question?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Julius, are you ready to take a question?

Mr J W W JULIUS: Hold me accountable, yes, I will.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Yes, he is ready you can ask your question, hon Wana.

Ms T WANA: Chairperson, thank you very much to persuade him to ask a question. I wanted to know how far he has gone with De Lille outside because she's waiting for you.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 62

Mr J W W JULIUS: Chairperson, through you, thank you very much for the question, hon Wana. My response to your question would be, you know, the ANC never cease to amaze me. You like to chase lizards while crocodiles are behind you. You have just had a President that involved in court cases, corruption and all that. You have a Deputy President that does not only understand and they don't have an understanding with your President. You have a province in the North West ... [Inaudible.] ... that is in disarray and you worry with small things about other parties. My suggestion is that stick to your own party. Don't chase lizards, that crocodile will bite your head off. Thank you, Chair. [Applause.]

However, I commend these ANC members that actually strife to take on the issues in the Eastern Cape. They finally saw that the real problem is the ANC and its corrupt cronies. They said it themselves not me - all of them.

Yes, hon Zwane, this is an ANC government as you said. You know that is ANC government by just looking at their failures all over. You don't need to tell us it is an ANC government, but if it is an ANC government just take the failures in the Eastern Cape and say right, I am ANC - it is ANC failures. Don't blame them.

Anyone with a heart would be appalled by the condition we found these schools in. Teachers and learners from these schools have a right to basic health and sanitation. Instead, teachers go to nearby houses to relieve themselves and learners go into the veld to relieve themselves. I even heard a parent saying that her child uses the same pit toilet and veld that she had to use when she attended the very same school in the 1980s - shame on you.

Ms T J MOKWELE: Shame on you!

Mr J W W JULIUS: MEC, just like the same school where you taught maths and science, the children are still sitting on mattresses. I think that we should change and adopt another name for you. We can call it hon MEC mattress. [Laughter.] The ANC clearly forgot about the learners and teachers from the Eastern Cape. Furthermore, the Eastern Cape department ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Order, hon! Hon Chairperson, can I request the speaker on the podium to respect our MEC because he has got his surname. He cannot be given by him the surname, please. Thank you.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 64

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon members, for the sake of the decorum of the House it is always appropriate to refer to each other correctly. Continue, hon Julius.

Mr J W W JULIUS: Hon Chairperson, I did say hon MEC mattress and he is smiling. I don't know why the member is quiet now. I don't know. Furthermore, the Eastern Cape department of ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Can you take your seat, honourable? No, can you take your seat?

Ms T J MOKWELE: Yes, hon MEC.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Can you take your seat? Hon Julius, what I said to ... Order members! Order! Hon Wana! Hon Julius, what I said to Zwane earlier on is applicable to you. I have made a ruling and you can't go back to that. Continue with your speech, I've made a ruling about the point of order.

Mr J W W JULIUS: Furthermore, the Eastern Cape Department of Education failed to spend its budget by R500 million in the 2016-17 financial year, especially on school infrastructure. Think about how many proper toilets could have been built with that R500 million.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 65

This was just for one year. What about 24 years of ANC governance? You mean you could not have built those toilets. However, corruption and greed allowed the ANC to forget about the learners and teachers from the Eastern Cape. Hon Deputy Minister, I don't think we should spare you on this one because you are equally responsible for the failures in the Eastern Cape.

However, to further rub salt in the wounds of teachers and learners from the Eastern Cape, the Minister of Education redirected these unspent funds from the Eastern Cape to other provinces. This can never make sense. Instead of investigating, capacitating and empowering, the Minister simply punishes the learners and teachers of the Eastern Cape. No toilets for you and nothing for you. Instead of going direct to these people and tell them that you are not doing what you are supposed to do and punish them. Can we have a look, Deputy Minister - if you come back because the MEC cannot come back - can you please tell us how many of these people were fired because they couldn't do their jobs? How many of them were fired. They are still sitting there, comfortable in their jobs and our people and learners are drowning in pit toilets. Our learners are drowning in pit toilets. Shame on you for not doing what is right. The ANC clearly failed the learners and teachers of the Eastern Cape. I thank you. [Applause.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 66

Mr D STOCK: Hon House Chairperson, the MECs, the Deputy Minister, members of the NCOP, guests in the gallery, thank you very much for the opportunity. Hon Chair, we had an opportunity to undertake a programme of Taking Parliament to the People in the Eastern Cape. During the beginning of our term here in Parliament, the beginning of the fifth term of Parliament, we had a number of strategic sessions that we had as the NCOP. One of the issues that I am going to extrapolate and highlight from those initiatives created by the NCOP is the fact that through the visionary leadership of the Chairperson of the Council and the Deputy Chairperson and all the House Chairs, including members of this House, we had an opportunity to take a different approach. We told ourselves that we are not going to do things like how they are used to be done in the previous Parliaments.

One of the issues we came up very strong with, in those sessions is that we need to do things differently which we actually termed at that time and I am sure hon members will remember, we termed them the business unusual, meaning that things are going to be done differently. Hence the NCOP came up with this programme of every time when we undertake the programme of Taking Parliament to the People we are not just going to leave the issues unattended. We have to go back again to follow up on the commitments that were made by

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 67

the executive committee, by the provincial government and the municipalities.

Hon members, I think this is a very important initiative of the NCOP, for it gives us an opportunity also to follow up on such commitments that were made by the executive committee, the province, national and so forth. So, in terms of the report back session of the NCOP which we had in the Eastern Cape, we undertook Taking Parliament to the People and there were commitments. And we are not going to run away from the fact that when we went back to the Eastern Cape, the progress that was actually done at that time was a minimal progress. I think we need to agree on that. However, the most important point that we need to make, is that hon members when they come to the podium and lambast the province, the national government and even insult the deployees of the ANC-led government, they are forgetting to tell the right story that this government which is led by the ANC has inherited a very difficult government from the previous regime.

Some of those members that come here at the podium ...

[Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon members, order!

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 68

Mr D STOCK: ... raise the very same issue. Some of them use to belong to that political party that use to govern during the apartheid regime, but today, it is so much convenient for them to come here and then blame everybody under the sun and so forth. However, they are not telling the story of what happened previously and why we are here.

Now as the ANC government, in the 24 years of democracy, we are not running away from the difficulties and the challenges that confront us. We are saying, when there is a problem and where there is a challenge we are going to address those challenges. That commitment was actually made by the President of the Republic. [Interjections.]

Ms T G MPAMBO-SIBHUKWANA: Which one?

Mr D STOCK: President Cyril Ramaphosa, when there was an incident of one of the school learners who fell in the pit latrine toilet in the Eastern Cape. The Minister of Basic Education, including the Deputy Minister, the hon Surty, had their own arrangements to go to the Eastern Cape to look at the challenges and also look at how they are actually how they are going to address those challenges.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 69

Now hon members, there is an hon member who came to the podium here and that hon member said every time you speak about the Eastern Cape it is a personal matter. I want to say to the hon member, service delivery issues are for our people throughout the country, it cannot be reduced to something which we want to personalise. It is an issue to all of us as South Africans as different political parties.

Now this hon member for some reason is for ever emotional.

[Applause.] When he comes at the podium he will be in his emotions and then he will be going and throwing the toys out of the box and all of that. One thing we must tell this hon member is that every time he comes at the podium they must be sober because we are not going to be able to make constructive decisions out of anger. We will not be able to do that. Every decision that we are going to arrive at, if we can follow the example of this hon member who came at the podium so emotional we are going to arrive at emotional decisions. So, that cannot be true and I am appealing to that hon member that next time you come at the podium, you must be very sober. For we are seating here and we are listening and we want to listen to constructive proposals and then we also want to actually ... [Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 70

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Stock, let me take the hon Julius. Hon Julius, why are you standing?

Mr J W W JULIUS: Hon House Chair, I am standing on a point of order. The member, at the podium says that hon member next time, he must be sober. So, meaning and you heard it - I am actually surprised why you not stopped him because I gave you an opportunity the second time only I stood up. So, if the member is not sober, he is drunk. [Laughter.] So, I need you to rule on that. You cannot cast aspersions on a member in the House.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Alright. Thanks hon Julius. Hon Stock, can you withdraw that you imply that the member when he was at the podium was not sober and continue with your speech?

Mr D STOCK: Chair, I withdraw in the interest of progress I withdraw, with all due respect. Now this hon member, who came to the podium also, earlier on ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Stock!

Mr D STOCK: I withdraw unconditionally, Chair.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 71

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Continue.

Mr D STOCK: This hon member that came to the podium earlier on who was so much emotional; he comes here and then he quotes Prof Jansen he even forgets to quote - every time he comes here he does not even quote a single former leader from his party and I do not know the reason why he is not quoting them? He must not be afraid to quote Jan van Riebeeck, Tony Leon, Lindiwe Mazibuko, Patricia de Lille, those are your leaders and you must take responsibility and you must claim them. We are not scared from the party that we belong to, the ANC. We are not afraid to quote Nelson Mandela, O R Tambo.

[Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon members, hon Stock, hon members, hon members, you cannot drown him and hackling is allowed, but you cannot drown him. Continue hon Stock.

Mr D STOCK: Hon members, I also would like to want to raise just want issue that the hon member who was emotional next time when he comes at the podium ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Stock! Sorry. Hon Hattingh.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 72

Mr C HATTINGH: Hon Chair, the hon member appears to be on a roll. Will he take a small question from me please?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi) Hon Stock, are you ready to take a question from hon Hattingh?

Mr D STOCK: In the bus. I am not ready to take it.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi) No, he is not ready. Continue hon Stock.

Mr D STOCK: So, the next time I was saying hon members; the next time that hon comes to the podium, he must be able to take ownership and claim his leaders and he must not be afraid to. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Julius!

Mr J W W JULIUS: Hon Chairperson, on a point of order. I just want a confirmation: Did I hear correctly, he referred to the member as bas.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): No! Hon Julius, take your seat you are out of order. He never referred to him like that. He

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 73

said he will take the question on their way to wherever they are staying in the bus. Continue hon Stock.

Mr D STOCK: So, the hon member who was emotional what he did earlier on here was just political grandstanding and he was actually playing into the gallery. We did not learn anything because I was trying to listen as I am here next to him, but the way he was making noise and the way he went on and I actually lost an opportunity to benefit from his participation.

Hon Julius, in your party the question that is raised about - hon Chair, I also want to respond to hon Julius about the question he failed dismally to respond to about the issue of De Lille. In the ANC the party we belong to, we do not create laws for individuals. We create laws for the political party and we have a political foresight in our own political party. Now your party and the party that you represent here today in the NCOP, you know, you go to a conference and you make a rule for an individual. That individual ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Stock, sorry! Hon Magwebu.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 74

Mr L V MAGWEBU: Hon Chairperson, on a point of order. My point of order is: The hon member, hon Stock is misleading the country. There is no party that create laws for the party ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Magwebu, I have made a ruling about hon members, hon Magwebu ... [Interjections.]

Mr L V MAGWEBU: ... you create policy for the party not the laws. Parliament make the laws not a party.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Magwebu, can you take your seat?

Mr L V MAGWEBU: Thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Magwebu, I have made a ruling that you have an opportunity to come here and debate, but you cannot be debating with the speaker at the podium. Continue hon Stock.

Mr D STOCK: Chair, this party that create laws for individuals, the only thing that I am asking myself ... [Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 75

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Sorry hon Stock, hon Mpambo-Sibhukwana.

Ms T G MPAMBO-SIBHUKWANA: Chairperson, I just want to ask the hon member in my committee, hon member ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): No, the procedure is to ascertain whether the hon member is willing to take that question? Hon Stock, are you willing to take the question from hon Mpambo-Sibhukwana?

Ms T G MPAMBO-SIBHUKWANA: Yes.

Mr D STOCK: No, I am not ready.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): No, he is not ready to take your question. Take your seat, hon Mpambo-Sibhukwana. Continue hon Stock.

Mr D STOCK: This party that creates laws for individuals, the only problem about that to day you have a challenge in your party which I do not want to meddle too much in your affairs, but I am just

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 76

raising it as somebody who has interest in the politics of the country. [Interjections.]

Your party creates a law today for an individual, the question is: What is going to happen tomorrow when the individual is no longer there? The question I am asking is: Are you going back to a conference and change that rule because that person is no longer there? Or what is it that you are going to do?

Hon members, all the challenges that we identified in the Eastern Cape, through the Taking Parliament to the People ...

[Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Sorry hon Stock. Hon Faber.

Mr W F FABER: Hon Chairperson, with due respect, I just like to know if this hon member got 20 minutes for his speech, because he is going on and on?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Faber, what you are doing you know - order members! You know the implications of what you are doing you are even casting aspersions on the presiding officer, and you are out of order. [Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 77

No, here is the time. You are out of order. Refrain from doing that. Continue hon Stock.

Mr D STOCK: Hon Chair, all the challenges that we highlighted when were in the Eastern Cape as part of the report back session, we are actually making a commitment through the ANC-led government, the President also made the commitment to follow up on those commitments. The department has also made that commitment follow up on the commitments. We are not saying the progress that is registered there is a very good progress. There are challenges that are there and those challenges will be addressed under this ANC-led government. I thank you very much for giving me this wonderful opportunity. [Ndiyabulela Sihlalo.] [Applause.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon members, at some stage we will deal with people. You cannot be using a phone just because you doubt what is happening. Even now, the hon member still has a minute and some 23 seconds and you are just casting aspersions for no reason. You are out of order, hon Faber. The Deputy Minister of Basic Education, the hon Surty.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon members, at some stage, we will deal with people. You can't be using a phone just because

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 78

you doubt what is happening. Even now, he still has one minute and 23 seconds left. You are just casting aspersions for no reason. You are out of order, hon Faber. The Deputy Minister of Basic Education, the hon Surty. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION: Hon Chairperson, hon Minister, hon MEC from the Eastern Cape, hon and esteemed colleagues, it's quite a privilege to be here, in this House, again. I listened very attentively to the contributions of members as they addressed this honourable House.

A starting point would be for me to commend the NCOP for what they are doing, because it is, indeed, so that, in the past, one would have taken Parliament to the people, as it were. There would have been an engagement, a very interactive engagement, with the communities, a report would have been compiled and that would have been the end of the story.

I think what this Council has done is to go beyond that. They ensured that it follows up on the concerns that have been raised, reports back to the people, and again, reports back to Parliament. Today is clear evidence of the fact that you take your task or you

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 79

follow up oversight and monitoring very, very seriously. I certainly want to commend all members.

The second reality is that, as one goes out, as a select committee or as the Council, to these provinces, one does so as a collective, as public representatives of the people. It doesn't matter to me and I certainly do not believe it matters - and I'm sure Mr Gordhan will agree with me - whether the leader is an ANC or DA member, or a member of any other political party. [Interjections.] If there is non-performance ... no, I am just saying it does not matter who the leader is. If there is a deficiency, lack of will, apathy, or corruption, we must condemn it, irrespective of the source.

Our responsibility is to ensure that we uphold the principles of integrity and to ensure that we implement the policies of government. That reality is one that places the NCOP in an incredibly different sphere, because it's able to ensure that it can unite provincial, local government and national interests in a way that cannot occur in the National Assembly. You have, indeed, been using this opportunity, optimally.

Colleagues were quite correct to raise their concerns on sanitation.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 80

Certainly, we express without reservation and unconditionally, our unhappiness, sadness and empathy for the child who lost her life. It's sad. We cannot justify or defend what happened in Bizana. It shouldn't happen. It was one life too many - indeed, that was the second life in a short space of time.

The question we have to ask ourselves is, What do we do collectively, as governments - whether provincial, national or local - to ensure that, firstly, we eliminate the phenomenon of pit latrines? It's a travesty of justice. It certainly impugns the dignity of our people and certainly, it is something that requires our urgent and immediate attention.

One could simply say one is going to eliminate pit latrines but what does one replace them with - an Enviro Loo, a ventilated improved pit latrine, VIP toilet, or water-borne sanitation? Is it possible in that particular context? I think it is important to make an assessment of how many pit latrines there are, what is appropriate in those circumstances and how one is going to resource the elimination of pit latrines and replace them with appropriate structures.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 81

I would like to share with members some insight into this reality. Firstly, when you look at sanitation, you can't talk about pit latrines in abstract. You have got to look at the school, itself. Is it a school that has Grade R learners? Indeed, members are aware of the fact that approximately 1 million learners are now in Grade R. That wasn't a phenomenon in the past. Grade R was not part of the school landscape but it is part of the reality, now.

We also recognise the fact that soon we will assimilate or include a pre-Grade R into our schools. That means that the toilets we provide in those areas should be age appropriate. So, as we look at the elimination of pit latrines, we must plan for the toilets to be age appropriate. [Interjections.]

Secondly, we are all aware of the fact that there is huge migration from the rural areas to the urban areas. That would mean that, even where there is sanitation in those schools, is it adequate, given the fact that there has been an increase in enrolment in those schools? Again, that is a phenomenon we have to address, particularly in provinces, such as Gauteng, the Western Cape, and in certain parts of KwaZulu-Natal, such as Durban. That reality of migration exists and schools are confronted by it.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 82

Thirdly, when you eliminate pit latrines, what do you do and what is the most appropriate mechanism? I asked the portfolio committee, this morning and, indeed, journalists, just a week ago, if anyone could distinguish between a pit latrine, an Enviro Loo and a VIP toilet. Nobody was able to do so. I am not going to put the question to you now, but we are aware of the distinction. [Interjections.] Please. Thank you very much, my comrade. I know you will. We wear the same scarf and we serve the same cause, yes. Thank you very, very much.

This is what we have to do. Not only has the Department of Basic Education looked at this matter with a great sense of urgency, the President, himself, has taken the responsibility of demanding - and has, indeed, received an assessment - an audit of all the pit latrines in the country and he wants costed plans. In this way, we can mobilise the resources of national and provincial governments and the private sector to ensure that we can overcome this challenge.

One might ask, Why the private sector? You know, I just shared with the select committee in Parliament, this morning, that there is so much goodwill and if we know how to mobilise resources, we can do things differently. I gave them an example, in fact, it is the true

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 83

reality. We recognise that we are in the Fourth Industrial Revolution. We have to digitise our curriculum content, and 60% of our academic content, including textbooks, has been digitised. As a result of collaboration with the private sector, we have been able to achieve this for nothing.

Indeed, the hope, dream and aspiration is that by the end of this year, we will have digitised every single textbook for every grade in every subject. It is not beyond our reach. Even if the means are not available, there is a possibility of mobilising resources to be able to do this. This would mean that collectively, we all have a particular responsibility to ensure that we deal with this particularly important issue of sanitation.

With regard to infrastructure, it has been raised, quite correctly and legitimately so. Quite interestingly, we are in the Western Cape. The Western Cape has been the beneficiary of 25 state-of-the-art schools with each and every facility, each costing no less than R36 million - but where are they? They are in Atlantis, Gugulethu and Belhar, in historically disadvantaged communities. When we handed over these schools, the principals and the communities would say that they had waited longer than three or four decades for this to happen, and they were very grateful to us for having delivered.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 84

The reality in the Eastern Cape is that we have to eradicate mud structures. It is not acceptable. It is not conducive to learning. Where are we now? As we speak, more than 150 schools have been replaced with state-of-the-art schools that have every facility. [Applause.] As I speak, 87 schools are under construction, 60 of which are located in the Eastern Cape, and 18 of those schools are over 75% complete. We have to pay particular attention to that.

I think there has been a lapse. As one of the hon members has said, capacity is an important challenge we face, particularly in the Eastern Cape. In the Eastern Cape, it is extremely difficult to retain the services of a quantity surveyor, an architect and engineer. Somehow, that is a big challenge. We have even provided resources to the Eastern Cape, and other provinces, to be able to acquire these professional skills so that they can deliver more effectively.

However, there is another reality in the Eastern Cape, and we must recognise it. It is, perhaps, the most litigious province in the country. Over and over again, you have a tender, and the minute it goes out and people are on the ground, you have an application to the high court to interdict them from continuing, simply because

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 85

they are question the procedure and the process. That results, inevitably, in six to nine months of delay.

We have to overcome this. We have to be smarter, more efficient, more diligent. The esteemed Julius will tell you that, when you raise issues here, the Ministry does take it seriously. He's raised the issues of asbestos schools, in Gauteng. He will tell you that we have delivered in our province ... [Interjections.] ... No, not completely, but partially. [Interjections.] No, it has. At least three schools in Gauteng have been replaced. It's also happening in the North West. We said that as we replace our "plankie" schools, we will also replace our asbestos schools.

Colleagues, 203 schools have, indeed, been delivered through the Accelerated Schools Infrastructure Delivery Initiative, Asidi, programme. That is the reality - and 87 schools are under construction. That is the reality. I'm so glad the MEC is here, because the Eastern Cape must work very closely with the national department to ensure that, when we look at infrastructure, we must do it in such a way that we are able to deal with the priorities together, jointly, so that we can improve and enhance efficient delivery. That is their responsibility.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 86

The MEC will tell you that where there are shortcomings, we are not hesitant to draw attention to it. In fact, challenging them and certainly, speaking much more boldly and robustly about the matter than you do in this House. That is part of one's responsibility as a member of the national executive - to ensure that all provinces are able to implement their policies.

Certainly, there are deficits in terms of the ability to deliver in the national departments. That, too, must be corrected, but it is a collective challenge. As I indicated to the hon members, this morning, we tend to forget the path we have traversed in such a short space of time. Just 10 years ago, we had fewer than 150 000 children in Grade R. Today, we have almost a million. It's incredible! Just 10 years ago, less than 10% of our population below the age of five went to a preschool facility. Today, we have more than 40% who do. It is huge. Ten years ago, children would not receive workbooks at their schools. Today, 16 million workbooks are delivered to every single child, black or white, from Grade R to Grade 9, free of charge. These are huge strides, and we are consistently improving in terms of the quality of education.

Ms N P KONI: House Chair, Deputy Minister, scarf or no scarf, solidarity or none, you are abusing us. You can't tell us about what

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 87

happened 10 years ago, praising yourself for things you are supposed to do.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): No, hon Koni ...

Ms N P KONI: Please, give us a way forward as to what must happen.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Order, members! Hon Koni ...

Ms N P KONI: Don't tell us about things that happened and the failures of 10 years ago.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Koni ...

Ms N P KONI: We are aware of them. You continue to fail.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Koni ...

Ms N P KONI: Give us a way forward. Thank you, Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Koni, you know you are out of order. That is not even a point of order. When you were here and they were disturbing you, I told them to refrain from debating

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 88

with you at the podium. So, you can't go and do that with the hon Deputy Minister. Continue, Deputy Minister. Hon Julius?

Mr J W W JULIUS: House Chair, I would like to ascertain whether the Deputy Minister is willing to take a question, please.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION: Chair, I am more than happy to engage with the hon member after the debate but not now, because I have limited time to respond to various issues, particularly.

So, with regard to the way forward, we must pay particular attention to certain things, one of which is in the context of the Eastern Cape. We have to make sure we pay particular attention to infrastructure ...

Ms T J MOKWELE: Chair, the truth of the matter is that what the hon Deputy Minister is telling us, today, has been said before. So, we are appealing to the Deputy Minister ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Mokwele ... Hon Mokwele, you are out of order.

Ms T J MOKWELE: So, we are appealing to the Deputy Minister ...

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 89

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Mokwele, will you take your seat?

Ms T J MOKWELE: ... to tell us the progress they have made, not the plans. We are appealing. We just appeal.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Mokwele, take your seat. Hon Mokwele, refrain from doing what you are doing. You know it's wrong. Continue, hon Deputy Minister.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION: Thank you, hon Chairperson. It does seem as if the truth does hurt. So, when we say to you that we deliver, not we are planning to deliver, but we are, indeed, delivering 16 million books, on time, to every single child, that is the truth. When we say to you we have delivered 203 state-of-the-art schools, it is not a plan or an idea or a figment of our imagination, it is, indeed, what we are doing. [Interjections.]

When we say to you that we recognise that there are challenges with regard to sanitation, our plan is, firstly, to do an assessment and an inventory of it; secondly, to have costed plans; and thirdly, to work together with the provinces to mobilise our resources and

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 90

address this matter, urgently. It is not a plan. It is something that is happening.

We have not pretended that we have all the answers. Nor have we suggested that we have achieved excellence. What we can say in the context of the sector of education, however, is we have been making steady progress. The trajectory is good. There is a good narrative, and if we work even harder at the outcomes we seek to achieve, we could, indeed, create a better place.

Colleagues in this House will remember that it wasn't very long ago - and I say it in the presence of the MEC who is here - that there was no transport, nutrition, or delivery of textbooks in the Eastern Cape, and there was a huge problem with financial management. Today, the Eastern Cape has, perhaps, the best nutrition scheme. Hon member, I am not imagining this - 9,2 million children are being fed every day, and one can just look at the Eastern Cape to see how they deliver it, because we provide kitchens, utensils and training there.

Today, the Eastern Cape is slowly but surely improving in terms of its early childhood development programmes; and in terms of the last assessment, the Eastern Cape, which was on the bottom rung of the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 91

ladder, is no longer there but is somewhere in the middle. This means that the interventions that are being made are paying dividends.

I really want to thank hon members. Truths are hard to receive, and you have spoken some real truths, indeed. There are huge challenges in the Eastern Cape which we cannot ignore. We cannot pretend that they do not exist. What it should do is to galvanise us to work closely together to ensure that we take this particular challenge very, very seriously and make a difference to the lives of the people, the poorest of the poor, particularly in areas such as the Eastern Cape.

The Ministry is always open to engage with the Council in relation to solutions. We have, in the past, listened most attentively to your debates and recommendations, and certainly acted on them. We will continue to do so in the future. The reason we do it is that you do not merely raise debates in a vacuum. You do so on the basis of visits and engagement in the provinces. You are aware of the realities on the ground. You engage with the provincial legislatures as you go to the provinces.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 92

So, what you come with out here is to bring to this House the provincial perspectives. You raise them with the executive. The executive has to note it and make the appropriate interventions, because when it does so, it does so not only on the authority of this House, it also does so on the authority of the provincial legislature and, more importantly, the people on the ground. For that, we thank you.

Together, we can, certainly, look forward to a better future, where we could work together in order to create that hope and renewal that our President has spoken about. I thank you for your time and attention.

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon House Chair, let me thank all the participants in this report - the MEC, the Deputy Minister, and let me also take this opportunity to welcome Minister Gordhan in the House. I think when I started I presented a report and the report spoke about the issues we picked up when we took Parliament to the people. That report spoke about the scientific research that was done even before we went to the Eastern Cape. The report that I presented further spoke to the observations that we came across or have done when we made our follow-up visit. It's a pity that, instead if us focusing on the report, some members decided to divert

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 93

and dealt with other issues that ... [Interjections.] ... Yes, of course, it's within their right. It is just that I am bringing it to the attention of the House. Sometimes we tend to lose the opportunity to really engage with issues that are before us. What the Deputy Minister did now reminded me of the fact that ... and for which I would advise and encourage members to go and google the Riekert Commission that was established in the late 1970s and what IT speaks to - unfortunately hon Julius is not here. What we are dealing with here today speaks absolutely to what the Riekert Commission was established for in the late 1970s - its work, its recommendations and its purpose or the reason for its establishment in so far as the reconstruction of South Africa between the rural and urban areas is concerned - the concentration. In my report, as I presented it to this House, you will observe ... I was speaking to the issues of ...

Ms T J MOKWELE: I think the apartheid government had a system and a strategy to deal with us as black people. We are now in government as blacks; let's have the strategy to redress what the apartheid government did to us, simple!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Mokwele, you can't be doing that. You had an opportunity. Take your seat.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 94

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: What is happening now is that we can't really compare the urban and rural provinces. The challenges are not going to be the same. [Interjections.] What is being done to address the issues of rural education will need extra effort, hence as I presented in my report, I spoke about partnership. I spoke about the National Council of Provinces in so far as strengthening our capacity with regard to oversight work is concerned. What is it that we are doing? Are the mechanisms that we are using currently in strengthening and implementing our oversight constitutional obligation enough? Perhaps that is the question that we need to be asking ourselves. Perhaps that is the question that the select committee need to be asking themselves - if they are doing enough. What is it that we need to do more? Why do we have to wait until we take Parliament to the people to pick up some of these issues, when in actual fact we have the portfolio committees in the legislatures, we have select committees in the National Council of Provinces and we have portfolio committees in the National Assembly. Is it not time that we need to pause and say that maybe we need to do better? We do have the capacity. There is also enough human resource. The question therefore becomes, "Do we have the ability and the political will to do that?" Do we have that? That is the key question.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 95

We can't undo history at our own pleasure, there are certain conditions that dictate to us - I am sorry, through you hon House Chair to hon Mokwele, we don't create our own history at our own will. There are certain things ... hence I made reference to the Riekert Commission because there was a deliberate structural approach which said that this is how we are going to structure South Africa.

Thank you very much to the department and the province by the kind of effort and will that you are putting in ensuring that we undo that and not only undo that by words only. In reporting to this House, I presented ... [Interjections.] Yes, there are instances where there was progress. There are instances where progress is being made and there are instances where nothing is being made but there are commitments. Ours now is to ensure that those things happen. We spoke about corruption which we picked up in the province.

There are certain areas where principles ... I mean it is quite funny, it is unfortunate that hon Julius is not in the House. I don't know if it was hon Makwevu who referred to corruption as if the ANC has never spoken out about corruption ... [Interjections.] ... as if this Parliament has not spoken about corruption; as if

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 96

this Parliament, especially the National Council of Provinces, has not reported on issues of corruption. [Interjections.] Yes, hence I mentioned that partnership is key and important when I presented the report. We can't do it alone. We need to involve civil society. We need to involve everybody. It is a South African problem. It is not a problem of one political party. It is a collective issue that we need to deal with collectively and pause and say, "How then best do we address this devil?" [Interjections.] It is a devil. It is something that we need to get rid of. How we do that is a key problem that needs an answer we should respond to.

I tried to create a balanced reporting when I presented the report. I showed and demonstrated the difference between metro schools - where we were, and the Alfred Nzo district schools where there are serious challenges and how these challenges played themselves out. The unevenness of what we observed when we went to the Eastern Cape is that what one gets in the metro one will not get in Alfred Nzo district. Therefore, it is important that once we have that understanding, we would stop generalising and we would be able to say that in the metro, this is what is happening. We should be able to say that in the deep rural district where the level of poverty, unemployment, inequality is very high and this is what is happening. How then do we plug in our resources in order to assist the poorer

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 97

ones not to remain at that level, but at least bring them up to a higher level?

We have consistently been raising this issue in South African. How do we break the rural and urban gap? How do we ensure that our local economies speak to the retention of skills, the ability and interests of our young people in the areas where they are. I am happy that the hon Rayi spoke about ... what is that project, the one that I fell so much in love with ... the macadamia project. I didn't say macadamia project when we met with the members of the project, they cautioned me and said that they are not a project but an enterprise. How is the enterprise structured? There should be the chief, the community and the private sector and with that then a trust is established wherein all these interested parties are represented with specific dividends or share allocations ... or whatever, I am not that conversant with the vocabulary of ... alright, "e a nshapa" [It beats me.].

At the end of the financial year when the dividends are issued, the community trust then receives its share and with that the chief will also be represented there. [Interjections.] The community convened a meeting and looked at what they have and their needs as a community. The government is not involved here, but the community itself find

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 98

out what they need - it can be a clinic, roads, a soccer field. And the money is allocated on the basis of that. The level of unemployment is reduced as young people are being skilled. There are no imported skills. The community recruit young people in the community; those who matriculated in that area are the ones that get recruited in the macadamia project.

I happened to speak to one young person who was a machine operator at the macadamia project and I asked him a simple question of how he came to work there. He said that when he was introduced to the project, he was just a general worker but today he is operating the most sophisticated machine - an imported machine that sort the nuts from the trees and so forth. All what the people in the project asked for was for the Eastern Cape government to partner with them in order to expand the enterprise. Through the enterprise expansion they can be able to employ more people in the community so that the issue of the rural-urban divide will be broken. In that way they will be able to build a better South Africa and not be all over the show and just speak for the sake of speaking. Thank you very much.
[Applause.]

Debate concluded.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 99

Question put.

IN FAVOUR: Eastern Cape, Free State, Gauteng, KwaZulu-Natal, Mpumalanga, Northern Cape, North West, Western Cape.

Report agreed to in accordance of section 65 of the Constitution.

APPROPRIATION BILL

Policy Debate on Budget Vote no 9 - Public Enterprises:

The MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES: Chairperson, the Deputy Chair of the NCOP, hon members and fellow South Africans, the new dawn that has been ushered in with the induction of President Ramaphosa as the President of this country has also given us an opportunity to do some new and different things with regard to our approach to state-owned companies, which is responsibility as far as six entities are concerned of the Department of Public Enterprises.

We will without hesitating recognise the reality that there was state capture, that these were institutions where the was major focus of state capture, that there has been massive corruption running into billions of rands - we needed a calculator at some

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 100

stage to work out how much that amounts to. More importantly, it is our responsibility as we go forward to interrogate the reality of state capture and corruption to understand its extent, much of which we hope the Deputy Chief Justice of this country will do through the commission of inquiry.

In the state of the nation address, the President very clearly said that what he thinks needs to be done and that is: Firstly, to make sure that state-owned enterprises do the job that they are required to do; secondly, that the corruption must be ended; thirdly, that the developmental and economic mandate of each of the SOCs must be efficiently executed; fourthly, that there must be financial susceptibility and sustainability in these institutions; and fifthly, that where necessary, their operating models must be reviewed so that we understand where their revenue sources are going to be.

Some of the bigger SOCs, like Eskom, Transnet, SAA Express and Denel are critical economic and development actors in our society.

Therefore, what happens to them happens to South Africa. If Eskom as we know stops producing electricity efficiently, it affects our economy. Soon after 2009, we had an instance where there was load shedding and that saga cost us about 1% of our growth in GDP terms at that time.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 101

Let's look at what these SOEs would be involved in: Firstly, as the government we will be investing R368 billion over the next three years and the major part of this will come Transnet and Eskom. The infrastructure investments being undertaken by the SOCs will contribute towards the improvement of the quality of life of our people, for instance, in the electricity sector, Eskom continues to connect new households to electricity. In the 2017-18 year, some 200 000 households were connected to electricity. We will have universal access by 2025.

These enterprises also play a central role in the transformation of our economy. Let me give you a few examples: Eskom's mission is the provision of electricity as I said, as well as related services to enable development and economic growth. It achieves this by powering the economy and enabling businesses, particularly mining and manufacturing to thrive and create employment.

Transnet's ports, rail and pipeline infrastructure facilitates the movement of goods from where they are produced to where they are consumed within the country. They also promote trade with our neighbours and provide the connection to export markets. It is critical that as an enabler of cost effective, efficient and seamless movement of goods through our economic system.

Denel is another example, which supports a supply chain of both small and large companies operating in the defence sector. In addition to ensuring the country's security through its research and development, the company contributes to the development of the advanced skills necessary for the company and for our country.

Denel has leading technology and manufacturing capability, as well as strategic defence capability that advance our national competitiveness - that's if it works properly.

South African Express, similarly, operates on routes connecting secondary cities to metros, and indeed, connects us to our region as well. So, to put it more bluntly and succinctly in our case and effectively manage an efficiently performing and well governed public enterprise sector should play a dynamic part in: Firstly, delivering important public services and public goods that enable economic activity and improve the quality of lives of our people as you have been debating in the last hour or so.

Secondly, investing in infrastructure to reduce the cost structure in the economy - in other words, reducing the cost of doing business in South Africa so that other economic players become more efficient and competitive and compete with other parts of the world.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 103

Thirdly, supporting and growing small and medium-sized businesses, which is a crucial national task that we have.

Fourthly, undertaking research to develop new technologies to equip the country to compete effectively in a world after ... forget about during, but after the 4th Industrial Revolution.

Fifthly, transforming the patterns of ownership in the economy by directing the procurement spend to black-owned businesses.

Finally, providing jobs, training and skills development for our young people, in particular so that they can compete and be amongst the most innovative in the world.

However, the state capture that we have had over the past few years has interrupted our progress in ensuring that these entities play the kind of roles that I have just outlined.

In the case of Eskom which is responsible for generating some 45 Gigawatts of energy and it generated some 225 Terawatt hours of electricity in 2017-18. It has a critical role in our economy. It was one of the centre pieces of the state capture project.

Government has a new board in place. That board has been working

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 104

very effectively, I can report to you, as well as put in place an acting chief executive in the form of Mr Hadebe.

Amongst the things that this board and the chief executive have already accomplished and will continue to work on, is instituting a culture of effective and transparent governance, including ensuring that those who were engaged in fraudulent activities are brought to account. This has resulted in the departure of six managers on the basis of serious allegations of misconduct. A further three senior employees remain on suspension. Two of these will be facing disciplinary hearings this month.

Employees as well as outsiders have been encouraged to use the whistle-blowing facility to share information about corruption at Eskom. One of the things that we need to recognise is that between Transnet and Eskom, they probably employ about 110 000 people. Not all of them are corrupt nor were they all captured by these agents of extraction. We need to do everything possible to restore the dignity of the staff and the institutions and encourage them to speak out because they know best what happened in their institutions.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 105

The board has also introduced lifestyle audits amongst the senior management staff and these have commenced and the process will be completed by the end of July. So, Eskom is a pacesetter in that regard. An assurance that we gave yesterday in the National Assembly is that there shall be no load shedding in this coming winter period.

One of the issues that came up in the parliamentary inquiry into Eskom was the late night testing of coal, taken there allegedly by Mr Koko, a senior manager at that time to the South African Bureau of Standards, SABS. The Department of Trade and Industry and its Minister, Mr Davies has been looking into what really happened when the sample of coal was taken to the SABS to see whether it meets the standards that were required by the power station. I have recently been handed a report from the DTI, from which it is clear that a key institution like the bureau of standards was part of the capture process due to the influence on the outcome of the testing of the quality of coal.

It is also clear that certain SABS officials and Eskom officials perhaps, like Mr Koko, were responsible for SABS issuing an unauthorised and defective test certificate. This certificate was used by Mr Koko for an improper purpose and that purpose being to

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 106

justify that the coal can be procured from Tegeta, which is the Gupta mine and that that coal actually meets the required standards by the power station concerned. So, that is the extent to which state capture has gone in order to begin to extract money from the South African state.

A crucial issue that is confronting both you as the national council and the provinces is the performance of municipalities, and in particular, the debts that municipalities owe to Eskom. We all that this is a formidable amount of money that we are talking about, currently R13,6 billion, which has grown from R9 billion, which was the case at the end of 2016-17.

I must emphasise the importance of Eskom's ability to recover all of these revenue so that it can provide electricity to others and other citizens in this country but more importantly, to sustain itself financially as well. The growing trend of nonpayment is posing a risk to the entity's cash flows and its financial sustainability. In terms of the PFMA, accounting authorities of the public entity, we must take effective and appropriate steps to collect all revenue due to the public fiscus. It is therefore critical that Eskom is able to collect the revenue for electricity supplied.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 107

Perhaps an important debate that we need to apply our minds to is that the nonpayment to Eskom is not only Eskom's challenge, it is today a national challenge. Any noncompliance with regards to payment or with the law in more general terms is not in the national interest nor is it in the long term interest of South Africa.

Perhaps one of the issues we need to look at and not perhaps recommend is that we need to tackle this culture of nonpayment that still persists in many of our communities because if we don't, we would have a situation where many of our entities, like water boards and Eskom in particular won't be able to meet their own financial requirements.

Let me briefly turn to Transnet, which is responsible, as I said, for providing land freight transportation services through its ports, rail and pipeline infrastructure, transporting various materials. There are some interesting statistics that we have here. Transnet operates eight commercial ports in the country. Our interventions in Transnet more recently have been as a consequence of the fact that a number of members have resigned, but more importantly, that there hasn't been appropriate steps taken by the board to ensure that those guilty of corruption as you saw on the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 108

weekend papers, are dealt with in a set of way amongst other reasons.

As a result, we have accepted the resignation of some of the members and have a new board in place as of two days ago. We have accepted the resignation of the CFO. I have approved the appointment of an acting CFO in the form of Mr Mahomedy, who is a chartered accountant and who has been at Eskom for some time. We have also ensured that the new board will very quickly get into step and begin to tackle some of the issues that previous boards have not been able to give their attention to for some dubious reasons.

The opportunities that Transnet has are also quiet formidable to contribute to economic development and growth in our economy. There is a strong focus on optimising movement of freight on coal, manganese, iron ore and other major export corridors. Transnet operates in the Cape Corridor Investment, which currently amounts to about R5 billion. The most significant work will be done around the Cape Town Container Terminal.

The South Corridor Investment is about R15 billion and will mostly be allocated to the manganese programme. The scope includes moving manganese exports from Port Elizabeth and other areas through Port

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 109

Ngqura. They will be both a port terminal, including equipment, facilities and rail infrastructure portion. The first phase of manganese rail line investment project runs from Kimberley to De Aar and the second phase entails infrastructure upgrades to Ngqura.

Saldanha's third Tippler installation investment over the next two years will be around R1,6 billion and will include the Tippler and associated infrastructure as well.

As you might have learned more recently, we have also replaced the Denel board and the board is rapidly making progress with regards to getting on top of the issues they are confronted with. Most recently, we have had the resignation of the chief executive officer there. Together with the board, we have appointed an acting chief executive officer in the form of Mike Kgobe, who is the current head of Denel Aviation, as the acting CEO.

Urgent attention is being given to intervention in the South African Express situation where the mandate of the board expires in a very short period of time, probably in the next 10 days or so. Senior department officials have been seconded to South African Express in order to stabilise the airline. In the next 24-48 hours, I am putting in place a special task team, which will look into all the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 110

issues that South African Express, including financial issues and make recommendations to me on how we can ensure that the kind of disruptions that we see at South African Express are not continuing.

In respect of Alexkor, yesterday I said that we have appointed a forensic investigator to look into the various happenings that are taking place there. Soon, we will be a lot wiser about what is really going on in that situation and what losses the Richtersveld community and us as the state might be experiencing as a result of the events that are unfolding there.

So, clearly, hon members, our intention is: Firstly, to move along the lines of the mandate that the President set out; secondly, to intervene as rapidly as possible to get co-operate governance right in every one of the six entities that report into the Department of Public Enterprises. If you like, this is a recapture project.

[Laughter.] We want to recapture these institutions, bring them under the control of the public and the government in a proper kind of way, restore the financial stability of these entities, and restore the dignity and the reputation of these entities.

A pattern which has been happening in every one of these entities is that good people get fired and victimised and the bad people take

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 111

their place. Part of the restoration process must be how do we ensure that those who have been unfairly treated have their cases looked into so that we can do justice them as well.

Finally, it would also mean that we need to position these entities so that they can contribute to inclusive growth, increase investment in our economy, as you know the President said that we are looking for US\$100 billion over the next couple of years as investment both from local businesses and overseas businesses.

Job creation and skills development are obviously crucial as well. Thank you, Chairperson. [Applause.]

Ms Z V NCITHA: Thank you very much, hon Chair. My greetings go to hon Minister Pravin Gordhan, our colleagues, hon members ...

IsiXhosa:

... ababukeli ekhaya. [viewers at home.]

English:

Let me start by quoting the late Muammar Gaddafi as a patriot.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 112

I will not go into exile to any foreign country. I was born here in Libya, and I will die here. This country was a desert, and I turned it into a forest, where everything can grow.

No one loves this land more than its citizens. If Europe and America tell you that they love you, be careful. They love the wealth of your land. The oil and not the people. They are helping you to fight against me but, it would be wiser for you to fight against them.

This debate comes when we are just waking up from the nightmare of the widespread corruption and corporate capture, as the Minister has indicated, commonly known as state capture. The comrade capture project had primarily targeted our state-owned companies, particularly those in the Public Enterprises portfolio, such as Eskom, Transnet and Denel. It sought to repurpose these entities without the consent of the democratic government, or the knowledge of the people, for the purpose of the wholesale parcelling off of valuable national assets to fund private interests here in South Africa and abroad.

This year we acknowledge the role played by our struggle icons, our former President, Nelson Mandela, and uMama Albertina Nontsikelelo

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 113

Sisulu, both of whom would be turning 100 if they were still around - had they been alive today.

We want to invoke the memory of our fallen heroes and heroines ... [Inaudible.] ... and not merely to grandstand, but to bask in the glory of their outstanding contributions to our nation. And we seek to remind ourselves that the aspirations and values of our forbearers be held dear. Among these was always the principle of putting the people first: Batho Pele.

Let me take this opportunity to pay tribute to our colleagues in the National Assembly Portfolio Committee on Public Enterprises for the pioneering work they have done in their parliamentary oversight enquiry into government challenges at Eskom. For a few months our people watched the enquiry on TV, especially during prime time, focusing on the programme that was held in our National Assembly.

We believe that the government policy of placing state-owned companies at the centre of economic development and transformation is appropriate to our developmental needs. We therefore look to this budget to start the journey that will place our SOEs on the path of creating wealth, reducing poverty, eradicating unemployment and growing the South African economy.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 114

The mandate of the current government is derived from the Medium-Term Strategic Framework of 2014 to 2019. Government expects state-owned companies to play the critical role of driving development through building and maintaining economic infrastructure. The key priorities include the expansion of the electricity supply; and public investment in the transport sector, which would open up broader growth opportunities through improved urban commuter services and a substantial expansion in the capacity to carry freight by rail.

The National Development Plan, NDP, envisages investment in a strong network of economic infrastructure designed to support the country's medium-term and long-term economic and social objectives. This economic infrastructure is a precondition for the provision of basic services, such as electricity, water, sanitation, telecommunications and public transport, and it is needed to be robust and extensive enough to meet industrial, commercial and household needs.

As part of our responsibility to turn SOEs around, we make a call on the shareholder, the Minister of Public Enterprises, and on the department to take firm action against boards of directors and officials of state-owned companies that are implicated in

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 115

malfeasance, and to place these important institutions of our people on a path of financial sustainability.

Working together, both Houses of Parliament must support the fast-tracking of the Shareholder Management Bill in order to strengthen the oversight capacity of the department over the SOCs. We want to close the chapter of rogue operations whereby individuals saw our SOEs as their private ATMs and did not ... indeed, with impunity, as the shareholders' hands seemed to be very tight.

We would like to see a plan to expand the corporative social investment of SOCs to help our people in large, rural, private ... provinces, sorry ... and municipalities work with other departments to strengthen localisation, support small businesses and grow employment initiatives.

State-owned entities have a huge role to play in changing the lives of communities. Transnet has led the way in changing the lives of students from poor backgrounds who have been trained as engineers and technicians. Since 2014, the company has trained 2 359 artisans who have qualified, and 424 engineering bursary holders have graduated with degrees in various fields. Over the same period,

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 116

1 200 engineering technicians received experiential training at Transnet facilities.

Transnet has also set aside a budget to fund an ambitious research and development programme, which seeks to place the company at the cutting edge of development in new technology and with the leaders in Africa in this regard. These achievements come despite a challenging operating environment and a fluctuation in demands.

The ANC supports Transnet's epoch-making investment drive in South Africa's rail, port ... [Inaudible.] ... infrastructure and equipment. Our people in remote areas have also benefited from ... [Inaudible.] ... training services which provide mobile health care, especially to disadvantaged communities.

The SA Forestry Company, Safcol, is a state-owned company that operates mainly in Limpopo, northern KwaZulu-Natal and Mpumalanga. It manages and controls state forests, and its mandate and scope of operation are mainly in the rural areas. Safcol plays an important role in developing areas in co-operatives, but most of these are subject to land claims. These make it very difficult for the company to function optimally. This matter must be looked into by government and resolved as soon as possible.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 117

We would like to see more communities and economic development projects train the capacity-building of entrepreneurs, particularly of women in forestry. We acknowledge the work Safcol has done to construct team ... [Inaudible.] ... structure in communities, such as early childhood development centres, or ECD centres.

South African Express is an airline in the portfolio of Public Enterprises. The company has also been plagued by rampant malfeasance that is being investigated. Several of these aircraft have been grounded since May 2017 when the SA Civil Aviation Authority took that decision. Thank you very much, Chair. [Time expired.] [Applause.]

Mr C F B SMIT: Hon House Chair, members and fellow South Africans, I greet you as my fellow brothers and sisters, as South Africans.

Today, I have the opportunity to address you on the state of Public Enterprises and the budget for the next financial year.

I can keep you busy for the six minutes talking about how the same ANC, who simply changed its dress and makeup for a while, totally failed South Africans and how billions were allowed to be milked from South Africans pockets by their friends and cronies, such as

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 118

the Gupta's. Yes, Minister, you are addressing that but what happened while it was happening; the ANC stood and just looked how the things happened. Now, all that money is lost already.

But I'm not going to do that. I would rather like to tell you what the DA is going to do when we walking to the Union Buildings in 2019.

The DA believes government should bring total change to the lives of all South Africans from all races and all backgrounds, one South Africa for all.

In this department, the core purpose of Public Enterprises is crucial. We need to understand this purpose.

Government intervenes by investing in an industry when it sees there is a gap in the market that at that time cannot be filled by the private sector due to lack of large capital investment and infrastructure. This is often done for strategic purposes as well.

Not to compete with the private sector but rather to assist the sector to flourish in order to create an environment conducive to job creation and the generating of revenue to expand the fiscus.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 119

Today, many public enterprises' viability dates have expired and SA Airways, SAA, is one of them.

In a national government, the DA will privatise all nonviable and nonstrategic public enterprises or sections thereof, which can be provided by the private sector.

In the same breath, the DA will use this as an opportunity to facilitate wealth redistribution by handing shares in such enterprises to ordinary South Africans in order for these South Africans to have ownership in these different industries. The first beneficiaries of this policy will be the employees of these enterprises.

The DA will further ensure that public enterprises work for South Africans and not milk them of their wealth. Transnet will be used as a tool to facilitate rural development and access to opportunities. Imagine a massive capital investment in rail infrastructure that link mines, farming areas, villages, towns, cities and industrial areas in order to boost private sector investment all along that network of infrastructure. It will be easier, more comfortable and cheaper for jobless rural communities to access job opportunities and to create small businesses.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 120

We need to dream big as South Africans. We need to be bold as a government and invest in the future of all South Africans. The DA is just that government - a government which will bring total change in 2019 and beyond. I thank you. [Applause.]

Dr Y C VAUDA: Allow me first and foremost to acknowledge the present of our supreme forces, irrespective of whatever our perceptions might be. I greet all of you with *Assalamu alaikum*. I am sure hon Chair, hon Minister, members, all of you will join me in wishing the Muslim community well for trusting month of Ramadan which begins tomorrow.

Chair, hon Minister, you know, there have been speakers already here on this podium, three speakers, they have mentioned a lot of things but none of the speakers have mentioned something which is very important with regard to state capture and with regard to what is happening with the state entities in the last ten years or so. What is happening while the coffers have been looted? This is where the agony lies most. While the coffers have been looted, we have seen the increase in the cost of electricity, transport, education, hospitals and health services in the country. Who is affected most? I have never heard even the Minister standing up here and express a concern about the fact that this is affecting the poor, the most in

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 121

this country. The poor are expected to pay more for these services. These increases the coffers of the state, and more money are looted by people who work within the state sector. This is where the agony lies, hon members. It is the poor amongst us in this country that are suffering the most as a result of the looting that is taking place in the state sectors all the time.

Now, hon Minister, the EFF rejects the Department of Public Enterprise proposed budget. Hon Minister, we welcome the firing of the corrupt Gupta stooge Lynne Brown. But this does not mean that we welcome the hon Minister appointment now. The truth of the matter has already been referred by the previous speaker. The truth of the matter is that we have seen that state entities in this country have been looted. We have seen state capture. This has happened under the ultimate watch of the Minister while he was Minister of Finance in this country. That is a sad state of affairs. I am afraid that this has an indictment. We cannot sit here and point fingers of what was happening over the last 10 years when we have been responsible. It has happened from Eskom, Denel, Transnet and SAA.

We have seen this happening in the four corners of this country. The truth is that looting is not confined to state entities alone. Looting is also taking place in national governance. It is taking

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 122

place in provincial governance. It is taking place in local governance. Your previous Minister stood here in this podium a few minutes ago and asks a question or rather lamented about what could be done about this. The truth is, stop stealing and take that money and put it in infrastructure development, human resource development and service delivery development. That is when we will see how this country will take a better shape in the years to come.

Hon Chairperson, we heard a presentation from the Department of Tourism. They were full of praise for the SA Tourism Board. When I heard them being full of praise, I could not help but wonder that because this board was so efficient that is the reason why we saw the Minister that is now Hanekom, how at some previous state was fired from his position. What this ANC government is doing? You are taking good people and make bad people out of them. You are taking good people and you are making crooks out of them. Your bad people are being rewarded. Take good people and reward them. This is the message that we as the EFF want to bring forward today.

The hon Tau earlier mention something about focussing only on the subject. The truth is, hon Chair, we must look at the broader picture because when we look at the broader picture we will then really understand where the agony really lies. The EFF does have

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 123

some proposals that we would like to make. The first is that we will amend legislation to end the powers of one Minister as the only shareholder with all the powers of state-owned entities. If you capture that one Minister effectively, you capture all the entities.

The second proposal we are making is that board members and senior executives of the state-owned entities must be selected and interviewed by Parliament, the same way we do with other important entities.

The third and last proposal we are making is that, the state-owned coal company African Exploration Mining and Finance Corporation must get the biggest share of coal supply to Eskom in line with our manifesto to build state capacity. Thank you, hon Chair.

Mr L B GAHLER: House Chairperson, hon members and hon Minister, the UDM supports the budget of the department. [Interjections.]

Ms T J MOKWELE: [Inaudible.] ... the Speakers List that we have in front of us says hon H E Mateme. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): What is happening, hon Koni? The hon member is on the floor.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 124

Ms T J MOKWELE: We want ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): I want to hear what she is saying. Can you please keep quiet? Hon Mokwele?

Ms T J MOKWELE: Chair, I'm asking ... Item number five after commissar ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Number five on the list that I have is hon Gaehler.

Ms T J MOKWELE: But we must be told because we have been given a Speakers List and it's not Gaehler here; it's Mateme. We must be informed.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Okay. Thank you very much, hon Mokwele. I think what you are saying carries weight. Can the hon members please be given the revised Speakers List? [Interjections.] Hon Koni, you cannot do that. Okay, go out silently then. Please do not disturb the speaker on the podium.

Mr L B GAEHLER: The UDM also welcomes the seemingly concerted effort by the new administration's initiative to clean government entities for the sake of the interest of the nation. Your endeavours to

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 125

stabilise government entities is appreciated, Minister. These institutions must not be a dumping site for ANC cadres who could not be deployed to Parliament or in the executive. They must be structured and positioned so that they can be the strategic anchors for fundamental economic transformation.

Chairperson, you are aware that most of our state-owned enterprises, SOEs, have over the years experienced major governance failures due to weak accountability, excessive politicisation and unclear objectives.

South Africa's opposition parties, the ANC government, civil society and all watchdogs must guard against the redeployment of these people who had not acted in the best interest of the country through these public entities.

In order to revive government business entities, we need new, determined, dedicated and innovative people to drive these entities forward and compete ... [Inaudible.] [Interjections.]

Ms L C DLAMINI: [Inaudible.]

Mr L B GAHLER: Can you protect me please?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 126

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon Dlamini, the hon member is protected. Please don't disturb him.

Mr L B GAEHLER: Protect me. I know I've got to see her this evening. Sorry, don't worry. I'll come.

... dedicated and innovative people to drive these entities forward and compete with other countries' local entities to show the determination of South Africa.

The role played by the SA National Roads Agency Limited, Sanral, in building state of the art roads is appreciated and we believe that provinces, which anyway are glorified homelands, could learn more from the entity. Although we note the separation between national and provincial spaces we invite the Minister to look at local government agencies in municipalities and provinces to drive forward the people's will to work and prosper. I thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Thank you very much hon ... Hon Mateme, please take your seat. Hon Mateme, huh uh. [Inaudible.]

Dr H E MATEME: Not yet?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 127

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Please take your seat. Hon members, I want to rectify something here. Rule 44 in our Rule Book states that a member may speak in a debate in the Council only when called by the officer presiding. If we can stick to this rule, even if there's confusion, no-one will ... [Inaudible.] Hon Mateme?

Dr H E MATEME: House Chairperson, hon Deputy Chairperson of the House, hon Minister present, members of the select committee, members of this august House, ladies and gentlemen, we say a problem identified is a problem solved. It is unfortunate that despite processes that have been put in place – commissions of inquiry, new boards in place, you name them, resignations, replacements, etc – people continue to lament about the past. We belong to the part of society that says the glass is half full; not the people who say it is half empty.

Those who do not know, the National Development Plan, NDP, is our national plan. Yes, Chairperson, here and there we may falter in implementing the plan but a plan we do have.

The body of literature on the concept of the state is enormous. The approach of the topic is often underpinned by the philosophical and ideological standpoint from which a particular party is arguing. The

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 128

policies of political parties represented in this institution are also based on their philosophical outlook and ideology, even though they may deny it in public.

Those of us from the ANC make no secret of our outlook and policy orientation. Ours is a story of self-less sacrifice made by generations of heroes and heroines in a struggle for freedom, nonracialism, nonsexism and democracy.

It seems every month this year we are laying to rest our stalwarts from a particular generation. A moral revolutionary duty is thus imposed upon those of us who have been privileged to serve in this legislative arm of the state to exercise oversight over the executive in order to preserve the values and traditions of the generations of freedom fighters.

We must be conscious of the fact that, despite all of the achievements made thus far, we are still faced with a huge responsibility of accomplishing unfulfilled aspirations of millions of South Africans. To those who say we are not doing enough, we acknowledge that. We are human beings. We are conscious of the reality.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 129

The seeds planted by the long walk to freedom can only bear fruit when we achieve our strategic objectives of building a national democratic society, a united nonracial, nonsexist, democratic and prosperous society. One member in this House this afternoon has been insisting, what is your strategy? That's our strategy.

When we conceptualise the role of the state in our Ready to Govern policy document, adopted before the 1994 democratic breakthrough, we said,

The democratic state will have ultimate responsibility in co-operation with the trade union movement, business and other organs of civil society for co-ordinating, planning and guiding the development of the economy towards a sustainable economic growth pattern. The policy surroundings will be characterised by the principles of transparency, consistency, predictability and accountability.

State-owned companies, SOCs, are an important pillar to achieve our economic policy objectives of transforming our country from apartheid to the new democratic society. The SOCs are not created to maximise profits or to incur unnecessary losses. We acknowledge the faults.

Rather, their existence is for the purpose of driving the developmental agenda. The dual mandate of SOCs is to achieve a balance between the required level of self-funding and undertaking developmental projects that the private sector would ordinarily not do.

So when the leader of the DA, ahead of the 2018 Budget Speech, said that:

We must stabilise public finance by announcing a package of austerity measures and a comprehensive spending review. We must reform state-owned enterprises by privatising or part-privatising Eskom.

We know where he is coming from, ideologically. We know that DA policies are underpinned by the classical liberal philosophy. Classical liberalism is a political philosophy and ideology in which primary emphasis is placed on securing freedom of the individual by limiting the power of the state.

Liberals have historically promulgated a belief that the market will deliver the greatest good to the greatest number of people, and the conviction that the state should interfere as little as possible in

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 131

the lives of individuals. However, a quick look at the historical roots of all pioneering ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Order, hon Mateme. Please take your seat. Hon Faber, why are you standing?

Mr W F FABER: Chairperson, I would just like to applaud the member for studying DA policies so well. Well done.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon Faber, you are out of order; totally out of order. Please don't repeat that. Continue, hon member.

Dr H E MATEME: However, a quick look at the historical roots of all pioneering technologies of the past century points to a decisive leadership by the state sector. In the developed countries, in North America and Europe for instance, state-owned enterprises, SOEs, and public investments have led the innovation, research and development that have facilitated the establishment of most of the well-known global brands.

Apple is a perfect example that supports my argument. Every technology that gives the iPhone its smartphone capabilities owes

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 132

its vision and funding to the state. The technologies I am talking about include the internet, global positioning system, GPS, touchscreen displays and even the voice-activated smartphone assistant Siri.

The ninth biggest auto manufacturer by volume globally is the French company Renault. Very few of us know that it is an SOE. The company was expropriated without compensation by the government of Charles de Gaulle from the suspected Nazi-aligned Renault family in 1945.

In developing countries we are fed propaganda that SOEs are by their nature undesirable assets that the state should sell off to the private sector. Even students in our public universities and business schools swallow this neoliberal mantra uncritically. Its time that we educate our society that, in fact, the tenth largest bank in the world with total assets worth over US\$2 trillion is the Post Bank of Japan. Four out of the top five banks globally are from the communist-governed People's Republic of China and are part owned by the state. Chinese oil and gas ... all of them SOEs, have recently displaced their well-known North American and European counterparts and now top the list of the largest firms in the energy sector, globally.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 133

Many South Africans have accepted a myth as a fact that SOEs are always associated with crises and failure, and can only rely ...

[Interjections.] Am I protected, Chair?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Yes, you are. Hon members, order. Hon Hattingh, order.

Dr H E MATEME: ... and can only rely on state bailouts to survive. However, evidence here at home and abroad show that with a bold vision driven by capable and ethical leadership, SOEs are able to be viable commercial businesses that are global leaders in their field.

In fact, the proliferation of SOEs under apartheid was part of the agenda of the regime to promote ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon Mateme, your ...

Dr H E MATEME: I'm concluding; I'm ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Your time has expired.

Dr H E MATEME: Chairperson, it is here I wish I could have concluded.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 134

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Unfortunately your time has expired. Hon Makue, you standing?

Mr E MAKUE: Chairperson, I think it is unfair that the opposition should get free political education. They must pay Dr Mateme.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon Makue, that is not a point of order. Hon Khawula?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): No, hon Julius. What is the point of order?

Mr J W W JULIUS: [Inaudible.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Continue with the debate, hon Khawula.

Mr M KHAWULA: Hon Chairperson, hon Minister, once again, the IFP has to grapple with the consistent appeal to government by saying that state-owned enterprises, SOEs, belong to their relevant departments in government. There is no need for them to have their own dedicated department.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 135

While this would help to create a relevant and dedicated focus into the SOEs by relevant departments, it would also help reduce our bloated government and drastically reduce the unnecessary spending by government, which I know was one of the Minister's primary objectives for years while he was in Finance. One has to agree with the hon Minister - SOEs are an important asset of our country. They are an important contributor to our economy if well managed.

For many, many years here, in Parliament, the IFP has sounded repeated warnings on the way our country's SOEs have been run. We have complained about corruption. We have complained about the Gupta family's takeover of SOEs. We have complained about the bailouts to some SOEs which have threatened to collapse the very existence of our government.

Where in the world have you ever heard of a chief executive officer who corrupts a government company and thereafter, jumps ship to become a Member of Parliament? He serves as an "honourable" member for one month - a world record! When he does not get a ministerial position, he runs back to the chief executive officer position he had vacated - and claims that he had not resigned but had been on special leave. In other words, Parliament is a "leave territory" for those who corrupt the country.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 136

Only in South Africa would you have a R38,6 billion tender ballooned to R54,5 billion, but get approved. Only in South Africa would you find a foreign family controlling state procurement and pocketing a kickback of R10 million for every R50 million purchase. Hon Minister, this is a strange and very interesting country.

Only South Africa has a mindset to buy train locomotives worth billions of rand which are unable to run under the bridges of the country. So, they just become tens of billion rand toys for the Zuma and Gupta families with their friends. Only South Africa appoints a chairperson and chief executive officer of state airlines that become a burden to the country instead of empowering the country - and get away with it.

The country's SOEs have been the core of state capture. All the while, we were not silent. We were talking. However, the ANC members in this House were defending the rot all the time.

IsiZulu:

Bebeze bame ngomlenze owodwa lapha bevikela inkohlakalo.

English:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 137

Hon Minister, they cannot be trusted. They are the very same members who were singing praises to the rot. The only difference this time around is that the hon Pravin Gordhan is the Minister of Public Enterprises.

The IFP wishes to give you a chance, hon Minister, because you are a Minister who was fired for protecting and defending the country's purse. You got fired for trying to stop corruption. You got fired for wanting to stop looting. You came from the same political home as the Guptas, the Zumas and the Ramaphosas, but because of the reputation of your integrity, the IFP wants to give you the benefit of the doubt.

Your biggest task and challenge, hon Minister, is to root out corruption in the SOEs, please. Please arrest those who have stolen, irrespective of where they may have run to in the world. Please bring back our precious billions ...

Ms L C DLAMINI: Hon Chair, on a point of order: The hon member is misleading the House and the public that the ANC is now the political home of the Guptas. He is misleading the country and the House. [Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 138

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Continue with the debate.

IsiZulu:

Mnu M KHAWULA: Niyabaphika namhlanje.

English:

Please bring back our precious billions of rand that were looted and stolen. Please do not disappoint us, hon Minister. I thank you, Chair.

Mr J W W JULIUS: Chairperson, Minister, members and fellow South Africans, state-owned enterprises should play a leading role in the development of infrastructure, as well as the transformation of our economy. Most of our state-owned companies have failed dismally in this regard, to say the least.

The consequences of these failures have multiple negative influences on the transformation of the economy. We are now seeing people growing impatient with the slow pace of transformation in South Africa. These very state-owned companies, that were supposed to help change the lives of our people, are used by the ANC and its cronies to enrich themselves without their ever thinking about the people of South Africa.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 139

Eskom, Denel, SA Express, Safcol and Transnet all received qualified audit opinions. Eskom suffered a R6,4 billion loss and cannot pay its debts. This will impact on the credibility of the South African government. Furthermore, if South Africa is downgraded, it is the poorest people that will be severely endangered.

Do we really care about the poor in this country? Do we really make all efforts to transform the economy so that we can work on achieving equality in South Africa?

I heard what the Minister said. I heard all about the New Dawn that the President is prophesying. Minister, in this sense, I commend you. I commend you for taking charge of these SOEs and trying to clean them up. There was a funny word - you tried to recapture them. It is good that the ANC tried to recapture them because only you know how to capture, in the first place. It is you who captured. It is not Zuma or them or them. Minister, it is the ANC.

I can't help but wonder. Do we really need to try and change the SOEs at this stage because we want to save our political careers?

There's an election next year. That's why we need to root out corruption now. You stood by former President Zuma all the time.

[Interjections.] The President was Deputy President under President

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 140

Zuma. He was tasked with overseeing the change in SOEs. What did he do? He sat by, watched it, and instead, came to show us some fruity condoms. He never said anything about the corruption and looting while it was going on. Only afterwards, did he come along. Did you wait for the President?

I am asking this straight, directly to President Ramaphosa: Did you have to wait? We told you! Did you have to wait for President Zuma to go? Because we told you.

I hear the Minister speaking of a New Dawn and these efforts to clean up. I commend it but I don't buy the honesty with which you are doing it. You are not doing it for the people. If you wanted to do it for the people, you would have done it on the very same day we told you it's there. You denied it. The ANC denied it. [Applause.] There is no state capture. There is an ANC-led government state capture.

Unfortunately, VAT has increased from 14% to 15% in order to raise an expected additional revenue of R22,7 billion. I am sure the Minister will understand this, coming from that environment. This is roughly what government now needs to cover the losses from state-owned companies. What does it tell us? We, the people of South

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 141

Africa, now have to pay because former President Zuma looted with the Guptas, and we, ordinary South Africans, must now pay for this from our hard-earned savings.

What is even more heart-breaking is that the ANC comes in and says, Thuma mina.

Afrikaans:

Stuur maar vir my. Ons het klomp gesteel ...

English:

... and they failed. Then they come and say this is a New Dawn. A New Dawn? You didn't even tell us what they did wrong! What was wrong with the old dawn? You didn't tell us what President Zuma did wrong. Did he steal?

Come and tell us, Minister. President Zuma was fired because he is corrupt. You didn't even tell us that. You, as the ANC, didn't even attempt to apologise to South Africans for capturing the state. It happened under your watch. You didn't even apologise. You want us to accept a new dawn but you don't accept your failures. Please accept your failures before we can accept your apology. Come and apologise. Tell the poor people of South Africa that you didn't do it because

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 142

you are corrupt; you have been corrupt; you are only now seeing it for yourselves now, like you said, Minister.

There are some state-owned companies that are doing well, actually. Not all of them fall under this department, but I think they are worth mentioning. The Land Bank; the Development Bank of Southern Africa, DBSA; the Industrial Development Corporation, IDC; and Sentech are examples of these. These entities do well because they usually attract strong business partners, private funding, clients from the private sector and reliable suppliers.

I heard the hon Mateme speaking on policy. You know, we limit the power of state. We believe in that. The power of the state must be limited, and you want more power to the state. That is why they were captured in the first place. You had too much power. President Zuma had too much power. That is why he could capture the state. That's why he could fire the Minister over that. He had too much power and the people had less power.

Instead of running these big, state-owned companies to create better infrastructure, the ANC insists on bailouts. Minister, you said the word, "bailouts", must become a foreign word when you were the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 143

Minister of Finance. Now, you're asking, again, for bailouts. I thank you. [Time expired.]

Mr A J NYAMBI: Chairperson, hon Minister, hon members, ladies and gentlemen, it is always an honour to get an opportunity to participate in a budget vote in this august House. You might be mistaken and think maybe we are discussing something else. I understand the purpose of what we are doing, hon C F B Smith and hon J J W Julius. Probably ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms. M C Dikgale): Hon Nyambi, take your seat.

Mr J W W JULIUS: Chairperson, I just want to direct the member on the podium ... [Interjections.] my name is J W W Julius.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms. M C Dikgale): Oh! Okay.

Mr J W W JULIUS: The original.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms. M C Dikgale): Take your seat, hon Julius.

Mr A J NYAMBI: Hon J, J, J W W Julius, it's like early commandant Fidel Castro was thinking of you, may his soul rest in peace. When

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 144

he said: "there is no world like knowledge, no poverty like ignorance." [Applause.]

Chairperson, let me from the onset demystify the notion that seem to obscure particularly members of the opposition who have spoken before me. In the interest of this House and the electorates, I must disseminate the unfounded truth that the ruling government is not dealing with the issues of stat-owned entities under the watch of the Department of Public Enterprise.

Hon Minister clarified what the department is doing; it has done a presentation to the committee and has clarified that to us. Since they have chosen to expose their undiagnosed amnesia, let me remind them that these state-owned enterprises were not established in 1994. When the new democratic government came into power, but were inexistence - long before that.

The apartheid regime, despite being the champion of privatisation, finance, SOEs with taxpayer's monies, it had the full support of the minority section of the population and their benefit. Today there is a democratically elected government that is committed to transform the SOEs into profitable business enterprise for the benefit of all the people.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 145

Government committed in addressing SOE challenges is demonstrated in the President state of the nation address. The President of the Republic of South Africa, hon Ramaphosa, highlighted key focus areas of his administration as follows: namely, state-owned enterprises are experiencing severe financial operational government challenges which are negatively affecting their performance.

Government is committed in ensuring SOEs fulfil their economic and developmental mandates. Government will address the issue of racialisation state-owned companies for better co-ordination oversight and sustainability. Government will ensure that the allocation of the spectrum to reduce barriers to entry promotes competition and reduce the cost to communicate; to build collaboration with business and labour to restore confidence, hon J W W Julius, and prevent investment downgrade.

Hon J W W Julius, to take tough decisions ... [Laughter.] ... to close the physical gaps.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms. M C Dikgale): Hon Nyambi, he is hon J J W, J J W. Take your seat, hon member, take your seat. What is the point of order?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 146

Mr J W W JULIUS: Chair, firstly, I need to correct you, he is right; J W W, Chairperson ... [Interjections]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms. M C Dikgale): No, no, no! You are J J W ... [Interjections.]

Mr J W W JULIUS: Chairperson, can I ask you, did you find anything wrong in the last minute with the speaker on the podium?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms. M C Dikgale): Hon Julius ... [Interjections.]

Mr J W W JULIUS: But you wouldn't - let me raise my point of order, he directed everything to me and not through you! And it's funny that you didn't notice it. [Interjections.] It's because you are clouded ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms. M C Dikgale): Hon Julius, hon Julius, take your seat. Hon member talk to the hon J J W Julius through me.

Mr A J NYAMBI: Hon Chairperson, he is hon J W W Julius. [Applause.] [Laughter.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 147

Hon members, the recent 54th conference resolution on economic transformation of the ANC noted: "that current factors such as persistence of low-levels of economic growth, rising national debt, some weakness of state-owned companies, low-levels of business and consumer confidence, low investment levels, credit rating downgrading, policy inconsistencies and public and private sector corruption; have limited the ANC-led government ability to drive socioeconomic transformation and address South Africa's triple challenges of inequality, poverty and unemployment."

The ANC conference addressed the issue of corruption. The ANC government is not shy to deal with the issue of corruption. It's always surprising to note the extra-ordinary pattern of members of the opposition that when they get an opportunity to speak, as they have done this afternoon; being represented by the hon J W W Julius. [Laughter.]

Every year, our committees plan and adopt their strategic and operational plans when in they indicate how they will perform their task as they do oversight as mandated by their committee. Hon Chair, as represented by hon J W W Julius, they must understand that this process ... [Laughter.] ... includes, among others, undertaking oversights. We have been to these state-owned entities. We know what

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 148

is happening, we have very committed efficient, effective worker in those entities. You can't come here being represented by hon J W W Julius undermining committed workers of these state-owned entities.

Perhaps you may explain to me how a department and an institution for that matter can be expected to perform without a budget. Hon Chairperson, probably you can educate me one day allowing hon J W W Julius to explain to this august House ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms. M C Dikgale): Hon member, take your seat. Hon J W W, Julius, you are on your feet.

Mr J W W JULIUS: Thank you, Chair. Will the hon Jomo Nyambi take a question from His Excellency, J W W Julius, please?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms. M C Dikgale): Eh-eh, hon member. [Applause.] Are you ready to take a question, hon Nyambi?

Mr A J NYAMBI: I will never be scared to take a question, I will expose you. I am ready to take the question.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms. M C Dikgale): Yes, he is ready to take question.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 149

Mr J W W JULIUS: Yes, thank you for attempting to expose me ...

[Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms. M C Dikgale): Order, hon members! Hon members, order!

Mr J W W JULIUS: Being a member of this select committee, hon Nyambi, is he ... [Interjections.]

Mr L V MAGWEBU: Procedural matters, Chair, you can't have two members standing at once. When hon member Julius is speaking and hon Nyambi must learn to sit down! He doesn't own this House.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms. M C Dikgale): Thank you, hon Magwebu. The hon member did the correct thing now. According to the Rules he must take his seat when the hon Julius stands. [Interjections.] I didn't notice that, continue hon Julius with your question. I did not notice that, continue hon Julius with your question.

Mr J W W JULIUS: Thank you, Chairperson. Firstly, will he go on record to state that the Guptas were never ... [Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 150

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms. M C Dikgale): Order! Hon members, order!
Order, hon members!

Mr J W W JULIUS: Through you, hon Chair, I want to know, firstly, can he go on record to say that the Guptas were never members of the ANC, secondly, when did he become aware ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms. M C Dikgale): You did not say questions. You said question.

Mr J W W JULIUS: Yes, well, leave the first one. When did he become aware that president Zuma is ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms. M C Dikgale): Order! Order, hon Julius, order! Over to you, hon Nyambi.

Mr A J NYAMBI: I knew when I said I will take a question, in responding to your question, hon J W W Julius, I would advise you with wise words. It is better to keep quiet and be thought a fool than to open your mouth and leave no doubt. [Applause.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 151

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms. M C Dikgale): Order, hon members. Order! Hon members, hon members, hon members, order! Hon Hutting, hon Hutting, your member is standing. Hon Faber, why are you standing?

Mr W F FABER: Hon Nyambi just exposed himself, Chairperson.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms. M C Dikgale): You are out of order, continue, hon house chair.

Mr A J NYAMBI: Hon House Chair, speaking at the Olof Palme Memorial lecture on disarmament and development in New York, in January 1987, the then President of the ANC, comrade Oliver Reginald Tambo had this to say:

Every age has its prophet. The immediate conditions of life demand of the peoples that they act in particular ways. And yet each day carry both the burden of its past and the seeds of the future. One day bears both of the future scares of yesterday and the potential of human development, whose basis had been laid by the present and earlier generations. To overcome and understand the former as well as appreciate and exploit the latter requires men and women with honesty, courage, intelligence, and instinct of Olof Palme. Hon J W W Julius.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 152

These profound words, coming from the mouth of one of the finest son of our land remains relevant today, as they were years ago. Let those words of wisdom inspire us as public representatives. What are the implications when we have an opposition being led by a sweeper called hon J W W Julius opposing a budget vote? What do we expect the department to do without a budget? What message are you sending to South Africans? You come here and grandstand.

They always thought you are a sweeper, today you have been exposed, hon J W W Julius for what you represent. You are an empty vessel.

Siswati:

NgeSiswati sakitsi batsi: [Interjections.] [Applause.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms. M C Dikgale): Order! Order! Order! Hon members, members, members, members, the hon member is standing! Hon J W W Julius, ah, ah!

Mr L V MAGWEBU: Thank you, hon Chair. With due respect, to hon Nyambi, I want to make a ruling - is it parliamentary to cast aspersions on the integrity of another member and call him an empty vessel? He must withdraw unconditionally and shame on him as the House Chairperson to behave that way, shame on you! [Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 153

Make a ruling, Chairperson! Make a ruling! [Interjections.] So, he must withdraw unconditionally! Shame on you, sir! Shame on you! South Africans are watching! You are the leader of this House; you come and call people empty vessels! Shame on You!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms. M C Dikgale): Hon Magwebu, hon Magwebu, hon Magwebu! Order, hon members! Order! Order, hon members! Hon members, can we have order in the House. Can we have order, hon members? Hon Mthimunye, please take your seat.

Hon Magwebu, you know you cannot do that. You rise on a point of order; you don't even wait for me or give me a chance to make a ruling. Then you continue with what you did, which is out of order. Hon Nyambi, can you please withdraw.

Mr A J NYAMBI: Withdraw what? [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms. M C Dikgale): You said, you said [Interjections.]

Mr A J NYAMBI: Withdraw what?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 154

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms. M C Dikgale): You said, hon Julius is an empty vessel.

Mr A J NYAMBI: No, I said he is an empty vessel?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms. M C Dikgale): Is he an empty vessel?

Mr A J NYAMBI: That's what I said. You say I must withdraw that?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms. M C Dikgale): Yes.

Mr A J NYAMBI: If you are saying, let me withdraw. I withdraw.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms. M C Dikgale): Thank you. [Interjections.]

No, no, no! He did withdraw. [Interjections.] Hon Julius, hon Julius! Hon members, hon Chetty, please. Okay let me deal with this one and then you can stand up. Let me deal with this one first.

Hon Julius, the hon member did withdraw and I want to continue with the debate. What is the point of order?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 155

Mr J W W JULIUS: He didn't withdraw unconditionally, and if he doesn't withdraw unconditionally I can equally call him a stupid because I notice all the time. He is as stupid as can be.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms. M C Dikgale): Ah! Hon Julius, you know you can't do that. You are totally out of order. Hon Nyambi, do you want to continue? [Interjections.] [Applause.] Hon Julius! You can't do that. Hon Julius! Over to you, hon Mthimunye.

Mr S G MTHIMUNYE: Chairperson, I stood up ... [Interjections.] ... earlier, and I wanted to talk to the point of order before even hon Julius spoke. First, hon Magwebu addressed himself on a point of order, in respect of the speech by hon Nyambi; and in his point of order, he says hon Nyambi does not own this House and that is utter arrogance from where I stand. Secondly, then hon Julius is ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms. M C Dikgale): You can't do that hon member. Hon Mokwele, hon Mokwele! Hon Mokwele, the member is rising on a point of order. Hon Mokwele! Hon Mokwele! Hon Mokwele, please take your seat. Take your seat hon Mokwele! Hon members, let me listen to him first. You are making a lot of noise; I can't even hear what he is saying. Please take your seat I want to hear what he

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 156

is saying. If ever he is not saying anything I will hear that. Hon Mokwele please, take your seat. Take your seat, hon Mokwele. No, no, no, you can't do that hon Mokwele, Oh, oh! [Interjections.] You want me to loose control, why are you speaking while I have not even recognised you. Continue, hon Mthimunye, I want to hear what you are saying.

Mr S G MTHIMUNYE: Hon Julius, standing on a point of order and he addressed himself to hon Nyambi and he called him stupid. Can you please rule on that?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms. M C Dikgale): Hon Mthimunye, we have ruled on that one, we have ruled on that matter ... [Interjections.] you see now, you see. Then sit down yourself. Hon Mokwele, please take your seat. Hon member, I have ruled on the matter and we are not even going to go back to that order. [Interjections.] Who is that?

Hon members, you ... [Interjections.] ... hon members from the EFF - hon members from the EFF please, maan, let's have order in the House. Hon Dlamini, you can't do that, you know you can't do that. Please take your seat. Hon Dlamini, I will give you a chance.

[Interjections.] She is not. She raised ... [Interjections.] ... hon

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 157

members; you don't even give me a chance to respond to what you are saying - while you are totally out of order. You cannot speak in the House while I did not recognise you. Hon Dlamini, let me give you a chance.

Ms L C DLAMINI: Thank you, hon Chair. You have not ruled that hon Nyambi ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms. M C Dikgale): You see, I don't even hear what he is saying ... [Interjections.]

Ms L C DLAMINI: Can I finish, hon Chair?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms. M C Dikgale): Can she be protected?

Ms L C DLAMINI: Can I finish, Chair?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms. M C Dikgale): I want to hear what she is saying hon Koni. Hon Koni, continue ma.

Ms L C DLAMINI: Like I rose up earlier to say they are saying Guptas, ANC is a home for ANC ... [Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 158

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms. M C Dikgale): Oh, you are done with that one ... [Interjections.]

Ms L C DLAMINI: No, you did not rule, you did not rule, Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms. M C Dikgale): Now you are talking about this one. I have ruled on that one, talk about the one you want to talk about now. [Interjections.] ... Which, one?

Ms L C DLAMINI: when they say ANC is home for Guptas you did not rule, you asked the speaker to proceed.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms. M C Dikgale): Hon Dlamini, I did not want to ... [Interjections.] ... no, no, no, because wena you want to debate from the floor, and you know you can't do that - you know you can't do that hon member. Hon Khawula ... [Applause.] Eyii, hon Koni, eh, eh, maan! No, no, no, no! Hon Khawula first then you will be next. Hon members, you can't do that! It's, hon Khawula then you are the next. [Interjections.] Hon Mokwele, hon Mokwele.

Mr M KHAWULA: Hon Chairperson, really we are very serious, we want to go on with the business of the day.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 159

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms. M C Dikgale): Yes that's what I want too.

Mr M KHAWULA: So that we can proceed smoothly. Can I from the IFP offer hon Nyambi a glass of water and hon Julius a glass of water. Then we can proceed.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms. M C Dikgale): Hon Khawula, please take your seat that's not a point of order. [Interjections.] Hon members, please, I want to continue, hon Koni, a member is standing.

Mr T C MOTLASHUPING: Thanks hon Chair, I appreciate the fact that you want to maintain the decorum of the House and I respect that. However, Chair, you made a ruling and I am not challenging it, that hon Nyambi should withdraw. And on the basis of his withdrawal he withdrew. All of us listened and then hon Julius then said that he is a stupid, can hon Julius withdraw those words.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): E-hee! Thank you very much ... [Interjections.] ... before you, hon member, please take your seat. Hon members, I want to request you to know that I am chairing here. If there is whatever point of order you want to rise on, it

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 160

comes from the floor. I cannot just say the hon member is out of order while you, guys ...

Sepedi:

... le dutše, le iketlile efela le bona gore ga se yona.

English:

... now that you are rising then I am going to request the hon Julius to withdraw what he said. You said the hon member is stupid. [Interjections.]

Mr J W W JULIUS: Respectfully, respectfully, I ... [Interjections.]
Hon Mokwele, can we deal with this one then we give you a chance.

Ms T J MOKWELE: Yes, hon ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms. M C Dikgale): Order, hon Chetty!

Mr J W W JULIUS: When I requested hon Nyambi that he must withdraw unconditionally, he did not.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms. M C Dikgale): Who said he must withdraw unconditionally?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 161

Mr J W W JULIUS: That is what the Rule says, not me not you hon ...
[Interjections.] ... and you are presiding over the Rules!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms. M C Dikgale): Hon Julius, I requested you
to withdraw the word stupid that you uttered unto the member.

Mr J W W JULIUS: Did you allow him to withdraw unconditionally,
Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms. M C Dikgale): He did withdraw.

Mr J W W JULIUS: He didn't withdraw unconditionally.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms. M C Dikgale): Okay, I will go back to the
Hansard ... [Interjections.] ... hon member, I will ... hon Julius,
listen to me. Hon Julius, I will have to go to the Hansard and
check; because what I heard is that the hon member withdrew, but you
said - you see now - you don't even give me a chance - you don't
even give me a chance. You are arguing with me. Hon Julius, you
can't do that - hon Julius, you know you can't do that! Hon Julius!
Yes.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 162

Mr J W W JULIUS: Chairperson, I do not want to withdraw conditionally because I believe in the Rules of this House that the very member is the custodian of this House. He sits there everyday, talking to us to respect the Rules but I will not do that. I will tell you, Chairperson that I will ... [Interjections.] ... can I finish?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms. M C Dikgale): Hon Julius, I asked you to withdraw the word stupid, please.

Mr J W W JULIUS: Yes, I am giving you the reasons why I withdraw

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms. M C Dikgale): E, e, I don't want the reasons, hon member. I request you to withdraw the word stupid because the hon member is not stupid!

Mr J W W JULIUS: You see, that is why there are emotions in the House because - there are emotions in the House because you are not fair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms. M C Dikgale): Because you don't want to follow orders!

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 163

Mr J W W JULIUS: You are not fair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms. M C Dikgale): Hon Julius, if you don't want to withdraw then I am going to request you to go out, hon member. Hon member, hon member, hon member, hon Julius, hon Julius, hon Julius, hon Julius, I am going to request you to go out because you don't want to withdraw the word stupid. The hon member is not stupid!

Before any point of order, let's deal with this issue first. No, no, I will come to you later. Hon Magwebu, please take your seat, I still want to deal with the matter. Eh, I am fair. He did withdraw, because he is handsome. Hon Julius, I request you for the last time please leave the House because you don't want to withdraw. Leave the House, hon Julius because you don't want to withdraw. Can I request the usher of the black rod to assist the hon Julius ask him to go out?

AN HON MEMBER: Hamba kahle.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms. M C Dikgale): Thank you very much. The hon member Mokwele. Hon members, if ever you want to leave also

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 164

please leave quietly. [Interjections.] Hon Mokwele, you are standing ma. Hon Mokwele, you are on you feet.

The hon members of the DA left the NCOP Chamber.

Ms T J MOKWELE: Don't allow them to go.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms. M C Dikgale): No, no, no, they are going - they are going.

Ms T J MOKWELE: We have very important matter of making how important to attend to.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms. M C Dikgale): Hon members of the DA, leave. The door is open, please don't disturb us. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms. M C Dikgale): Move, move, move, move! Hon Essack!

Hon MEMBERS: Move, move, move - move! [Laughter.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms. M C Dikgale): Okay, hon Mokwele, hon Essack, hon Mokwele, hon Mokwele ... [Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 165

Ms T J MOKWELE: No, Chair, what I actually wanted to say to you is that you allow both members to withdraw unconditionally - both members meaning - you are threatening me with you face - oh, yaa, you making your face long ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms. M C Dikgale): Eh, can you please, stop! Can you please assist us? The hon member is standing at the door and we want to continue with the business of the day.

AN HON MEMBER: Who is that?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms. M C Dikgale): Okay, continue hon member.

Ms T J MOKWELE: Yaa, what I wanted to say, hon Chair is that you allow both members to withdraw whatever words that were used that are unparliamentarily - to withdraw them unconditionally.

[Laughter.] But you didn't allow me to speak first.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms. M C Dikgale): Hon members, hon Stock, how can you do that? Hon Stock, hon Stock! The member is standing! No! Hon Mokwele ...

Setswana:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 166

... ke nagana gore ...

English:

... what you want to say now, we are done with that one. The hon Nyambi said Julius is an empty vessel and he agreed to withdraw. So, can we close the matter and continue with the business of the day.

Ms T J MOKWELE: Chair, I also wanted to say for you to delay the issue to go further ...

Setswana:

... e dirile gore ko bofelong Ntlo e latlhegelwe ke seriti se e se tshwanetseng. Ka jalo, ke ikuela mo go wena gore fa go ka diragala se se diragetseng gape jaana kamoso, o netefatse gore tshweetso ya gago ga a sekamele kwa letlhakoreng la lekoko la sepolotiki le o le emetseng mo Ntlong eno; o netefatse gore maloko otlhe a Ntlo a tsholiwa ka go tshwana ...

English:

... it is just my appeal to you, hon Chair.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 167

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms. M C Dikgale): Hon Mokwele, please allow the House to continue with the business of the day, continue hon Nyambi. What is the point of order, hon Hattingh?

Mr C HATTINGH: Hon Chair, I sat here and while this feral was going on that hon member, Nyambi gave instruction to you from where he was sitting and you don't have to believe me because I doubt whether you believe me but go and watch the TV. See how you listen to him giving instructions to you as Chair, while he has proven that he doesn't know the Rules. I want you to rule on that but you will not know, go and watch the TV; and is it acceptable that he from where he sits in his sitting position gives instructions to you on what must happen in this House.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms. M C Dikgale): You see now, you are casting aspersions on me. What did he say, what was the instruction?

Mr C HATTINGH: I said that he spoke to you while you should have listened to members and you listened to him when sitting on his chair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms. M C Dikgale): What did he say? What did he say?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 168

Mr C HATTINGH: That is totally unacceptable.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms. M C Dikgale): Hon Hattingh, what did he say that I listened to him and continue with what he said. What did he say?

Mr C HATTINGH: I can't hear because this member drowns you. Is he allowed to drown you? Ask him.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms. M C Dikgale): Hon Hattingh, [Interjections.] No. Hon members, I really what to here what the hon member is accusing me of because ... [Inaudible.] [Interjections.]

Mr C HATTINGH: I have said it repeatedly, there was just ... [Inaudible.] ... debate going on I couldn't hear what he said but you should listen. You listened to him. You should tell me what he said to you. While I was sitting here watched it's all on the TV hon Chair, why do you ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms. M C Dikgale): Yoh, yoh, yoh, yoh! Hon Hattingh, please take your seat, take your seat, hon Hattingh you are out of order. Take your seat. Eh, hon Koni do you want to continue, why are you standing? What is the point of order?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 169

Ms N P KONI: You are allowing hon Hattingh to cast aspersions and he is misleading the House because he is saying hon Nyambi gave you instructions, again he comes and say that he did not here what he said to you. So, how did he come about to the conclusion that it was instructions to you? Chair, we are just wasting time here let's continue with the business of the day because some of us have got invitations to honour.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms. M C Dikgale): Hon Koni, please assist the House. I told the hon member that he is out of order. I told him that he is ... [Interjections.] ... now you continue on and on! No, no, no, you can't do that. [Interjections. Hon Nyambi continue with the debate.

Mr A J NYAMBI: Hon members, in conclusion the ANC supports the budget vote, what I did today was to expose what the hon Julius represent. And ...

Siswati:

... ngeSiswati batsi liciniso liyababa.

English:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 170

I just did that. I spoke truth to him and he was exposed for what he represents. I thank you. [Applause.]

The MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES: Hon Chair and hon members, I think the last half hour has been very regrettable. We are on a public platform and the public can actually see what we are doing. We are, in fact, public servants and we get paid by the public. I want to respectfully appeal to you that, when you have important matters like public enterprises on your agenda, let's focus on the substance and that applies to all the parties.

We might actually learn what we need to do with the current circumstances that we are faced with and actually demonstrate to the public that, despite our political differences, we are one in terms of saying that we want to recapture or regain control over these institutions; we are united in fighting corruption wherever we actually find it; we want good governance and accountability to return to these institutions; financial stability and our ability to make sure that these entities do not depend on the fiscus are important objectives that we share amongst ourselves as well; it is important that people learn to differentiate between serving a national interest and personal interest. Hon member - it is not my job, Chair but we have two debates in the House.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 171

I am not sure whether there is much point in going into detail responses because many members who have raised issues are not here now. However, I must pay particular compliment to hon Mateme who, very accurately, both philosophically, ideologically and in substance, captured the key issues very well. One was hoping that there would be an equal level of debate with hon members like that, who are introducing substantial items on the agenda in a very knowledgeable way. Her classification of some of her views as neoliberal or almost ... [INAUDIBLE.] are very accurate. But again, we don't have the people here who have raised some of the issues.

However, we do want to say to hon Smit that the Union Buildings is a public and he, as a member of the DA, will be welcome as a visitor anytime before or after the elections. Somebody should pass on the message to him. Secondly - and I am sure hon Mateme and others would agree with me - that there isn't just one view in life contained in the word privatisation. There are many different views developing today. In fact, studies by the OECD and other institutions show that publicly-owned institutions, whether it is Chinese, Japanese-owned or other, are playing a greater and greater role in the economies of various countries and globally as well.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 172

If we are interested, there is an interesting economist who is currently based in the United Kingdom, Prof Mazikuto, who has a very different view on how public institutions and publicly-funded processes - and that's where hon Mateme was right about how the internet and many other technological discoveries - were made. They were made as a result of state-sponsored research. It is those sorts of things that we should debate.

We should also remember that leadership in the private sector is also very frank with us. They know that there is corruption in the private sector as well. The recent events in relation to Steinhoff, Nkonki, KPMG, McKenzie - the list goes on - and even visitors from outside this country, Bell Pottinger, have made their contribution to state capture in our own environment as well. We can't avoid making reference to those sorts of situations.

The one thing where I want to agree with hon Nyambi and others as well, is that he is asking the ANC who are today saying: a) We have connected the dots; b) we understand what this phenomenon means, we didn't always understand it and if anybody else did it, they didn't quite tell us, otherwise it would have been on the public record; c) it is the ANC today that is leading the fight against corruption and cleaning up these institutions. In many ways there are good people

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 173

in all organisations and I am sure they would like to join ANC members in this kind of fight. We certainly agree with hon Khawula that we need to bring back the millions, billions or hundreds of billions - I am not sure yet - and that will be a process that we will follow as well.

However, there are a couple of corrections that were put here in respect of certain information. I am informed that the Eskom financial position was not one of loss-making over many, many years. There were, in fact, reported profits for a while. It is in the current financial year that there could be a loss, but we'll wait until July when we have the information.

Also, reference was made to the Land Bank and the Development Bank of SA, DBSA but those are not State-owned Companies, SOCs but development finance institutions. They are managed in the Treasury and tightly managed for that matter unlike the SOCs which have been captured. That's why - if I may remind all of us - Treasury was the target of state capture so that, once they had captured it, they would capture the fiscus and finance institutions which have billions of rand under their control as well. Therefore, it is important to do our homework before we make all the kinds of claims we do in these sorts of debates.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 16 MAY 2018

Page: 174

Finally, I say to the Muslim community, Ramadan Mubarak as they start their fast. Thank you very much. [Applause.]

Debate concluded.

The Council adjourned at 18:22

UNREVISED HANSARD