

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 1

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

PROCEEDINGS OF THE NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

The House met at 14:02.

The Deputy Speaker took the Chair and requested members to observe a moment of silence for prayer or meditation.

DEPUTY SPEAKER: The secretary will read the first Order ... [Interjections.]

Mr M N PAULSEN: Deputy Speaker! Deputy Speaker!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes.

Mr M N PAULSEN: Can we just welcome the hon Bongo to the backbenchers of the ANC. [Laughter.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 2

**CONSIDERATION OF REPORT OF PORTFOLIO COMMITTEE ON
ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT ON OVERSIGHT VISITS TO MPUMALANGA
AND GAUTENG**

Ms E M COLEMAN: Deputy Speaker, hon members present here, it is with great pleasure that I table before you for consideration the economic development oversight report, which was done on the 12th to the 15th September 2017.

We undertook it to the industrial projects that our government has invested in through funds and support to assess the impact of these interventions on our economy and the national goals of the economic development.

Hon members, many will be aware that the South African Steel Industry has been severely affected by the crisis in the global steel market. As a result, between 2010 and 2015, the industry experienced massive job losses; company closures with some producers applying for further retrenchment in 2017.

International and local companies have been struggling to compete with the low cost and over supply of steel

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 3

products from China. The steel industry plays a very important role in industrial and infrastructure development.

The industry support key sectors such as the construction, mining, automotive and energy, which according to the New Growth Path and the National Development Plan are crucial for job creation and inclusive growth.

Furthermore, the South African Steel Industry has a significant impact locally and on the rest of the continent of Africa. South Africa and Egypt are the only countries that are significant producers of steel in Africa.

It is in this context that the Portfolio Committee on Economic Development undertook oversight visits to one of the biggest steel producers in the continent and other upcoming producer to assess the impact of government interventions among others on job production, competitiveness, downstream industry and inclusivity through the Black Industrial Programme.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 4

Columbus Steel founded in 1966 is South Africa and Africa's only producer of stainless steel flex products; and has its plant in the town of the Middelburg in Mpumalanga province.

The Industrial Development Corporation, IDC, owns 24% of the company share and has worked together with the leadership of Columbus to shield the enterprise from the tough economic times we are emerging from. As of May 2017, the company ships its products to 262 destinations in five continents. The company also supports Mpumalanga stainless steel initiatives, which was established in 2001.

The initiative is entrenched as the only incubator in the steel sector that specialises in stainless steel, knowledge exchanged, shared infrastructure and technology support services to the unemployed struggling entrepreneurs or SMME at one enabling environment and location.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 5

The primary target of the project is the youth. Because of time, I will proceed to the next project, which is the Naledi Inhlango Founary in Ekurhuleni Gauteng. This is 100% black-owned company ably led by its executive chairman, Mr Sibusiso Maphatinyane who is one of the beneficiaries of the industrial policy action plan and focuses its operations on iron and steel manufacturing for the rail, mining and automotive markets sector.

We also visited one of the companies, which is an emerging company also financed by the IDC and the Department of Trade and Industry. I don't have enough time but all I can say, we have recommendations that are appearing in our report and through our oversight we managed to see what our government is doing; and

We also managed to visit the Council for Scientific and Industrial Research, CSIR where we also saw what the government is doing in supporting our emerging small and medium enterprises.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 6

I am not going to dwell on the recommendations; we are going to table them through our ATC for the House to adopt them. We so move. Thank you. [Applause.]

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: Thank you Deputy Speaker. We move that the report be adopted by this House.

Declaration(s) of vote:

Mr P G ATKINSON: Thank you very much, Deputy Speaker. It gives me great pleasure to speak on the oversight visit of the economic development committee to Mpumalanga and Gauteng in September 2017.

I think if one wants to style the visit, the first part of it was to old style heavy manufacturing of steel industry and the second part was to the centre for scientific and industrial research in Pretoria, which very much represent the new economy and the fourth industrial revolution.

The issue with the steel industry in South Africa is that it is an incredibly important industry to the country in

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 7

a sense that it creates about 2,8% of all employment and billions of rands in income.

However, the biggest problem that we face is the fact that there is a lot of really cheap Chinese imports into the industry and the solution for government has thought about is actually being to impose tariffs through our tax of up to 10% against cheap imports; and the second process that they have taken is actually to - for the Industrial Development Co-operation to take equity stakes and loans in that sector.

What was of particular interest to us because we went to Columbus stainless steel, which is the only stainless steel manufacturing plant in the entire continent of Africa?

Columbus stainless steel is owned 72% by a Spanish company called Astronauts SA, and the advantage that we get through that is that the Columbus stainless steel in Mpumalanga forms part of the international network of iron and steel companies owned by the Spanish company and they are also linked into the international network.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 8

By its very nature, the steel industry requires huge amounts of capital investments and in a sense we have to look offshore for that. In addition, really what is of great concern for us today is this whole issue of land expropriation and the Expropriation Bill that has just come up, because certainly without the Spanish investors looking to put millions and billions of rands into the economy, the recent debates in Parliament over the land expropriation will concern me very much.

Now I know the ANC might say to us, all this is only relating to land, but any investors is going to be looking forward over the years to see what will happen when we talk about expropriation of property that goes beyond land.

I can promise you one thing - that if we do continue down the line of expropriation without compensation, this country will get no money at all from overseas. One has only to look at the favourite country of the EFF over there, Venezuela and Zimbabwe as to exactly what happens to international investment under expropriation without compensation.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 9

Secondly, when we move on to our visit in Pretoria to the Centre of Scientific and Industrial Research, CSIR, it was a deeply impressive organisation that is really looking forward in doing much research in this economy.

Time does not allow me to go through all the details and the things that we saw there; but one of particular interest was the joint venture of a company called Aerosud where they have a 3D printing facility at the moment that actually manufactures airline parts to go straight from powder to titanium, and that sort of a thing is really a cutting edge in South Africa.

I think it is terribly exciting as one looks at what the future can bring. How can we as the government and as the people help to improve the situation for our people along the lines of the fourth industrial revolution?

We certainly need to look at supporting organisations like the CSIR; and one of the many ways we can do this is, to make sure that we educate the people sufficiently that they come out and do the kind of research and development that is required in our economy.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 10

I know a lot of the debates along the higher education have been taken up by free fees. However, maybe what we need to do, we need to move on from there. We need to have a look and see what is actually required in the economy. What levels of research and development that can be offered to companies and to institution like the CSIR to make us a competitive country when it comes to fourth industrial revolution?

We are tired of so much of our brain trust moving overseas and hearing of South African who have done incredibly well abroad like Elon Musk. We really as a country must actually have a far better desire to see people like that stay in this country and be right at the cutting edge of technology.

So in conclusion, it was a very useful visit for us because we saw government intervention in an old style industry in the steel industry, and we saw what the future can bring through the CSIR. So, the DA is very happy to approve the report. Thank you. [Applause.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 11

Mr N S MATIASE: Deputy Speaker, in 2009 the Minister of the newly-created Department of Economic Development and the Minister of Trade and Industry – both whom coincidentally happen to be communists we are told – argued that a major hindrance to economic growth in the country was the lack of cheap steel available for various economic activities. Today we find these very same Ministers complaining about cheap steel imports and the negative impact this has on the economy of the country.

South Africa has gone above and beyond meeting the demands and requirements of the World Trade Organisation, the International Monetary Fund, IMF, the World Bank and the rating agencies, through their reactionary and new colonial economic policies similar to those of the National Development Plan.

It is 2018 and here we are. Countries across the world are now imposing tariffs and providing subsidies to local producers and manufacturers to protect their strategic industries like the steel and agricultural industries. The need for such tariffs and subsidies has been the position of the EFF since its inception and is something

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 12

that we have consistently argued for since our arrival in this Parliament.

If this government fails to impose tariffs on steel imports, the sector will continue to face serious challenges and a strategic part of our economy will continue to shrink and lose jobs.

Amongst these Ministers who happen to be members of the Communist Party, is the Minister of mining and Mineral Resources, Mr Gwede Mantashe. We hope there will be a new breath of relief, a new perspective and a new strategic vision about how we can impose new tariffs and ensure that we embark on a massive and aggressive protected industrial expansion in the country.

Welcome Mr Gwede Mantashe. We hope that you will bring some meaningful change and inspire some of your colleagues from the SA Communist Party. Thank you so much.

IsiZulu:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 13

Mnu M HLENGWA: Ngiyathokoza ukucosha ithuba Mhlonishwa Sekela Somlomo, ngiphakama egameni leNkatha Freedom Party ukwamukela futhi nokuseka lo mbiko Wekomidi Lokuthuthukiswa Komnotho emva kohambo lwalo le komidi liya esifundazweni saseMpumalanga. Uzakwethu okuleli komidi akekho namhlanje kodwa ke sithe uma siwubuka umbiko sabona ukuthi umsebenzi owenziwe yikomidi umsebenzi oncomekayo nokho Sekela Somlomo.

English:

The IFP welcomes the fact that there is collaboration with further education and training, FET, colleges to provide internship opportunities for young people and other social interventions surrounding these communities. We fundamentally believe that a greater focus needs to be given to FET colleges because they are really now the educational institutions which are going to drive the economic growth of this country. So the kind of interventions and collaboration we are seeing in this regard is most welcome.

We are of course concerned about the fact that steel dumping is becoming a norm as opposed to being an

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 14

exception or rather something that is happening at all. The ongoing uncompetitive global trends in this regard are affecting South Africa's domestic market. We are appealing that the necessary and relevant departments look into this.

Most importantly is to look at the broader basket of the tariff regime that South Africa has in order to safeguard our own markets from this phenomenon of dumping. We have seen the chicken industry virtually on its knees and the closure of chicken farms and factories throughout the country; of course inducing high levels of job losses.

The high cost of electricity continues to be a big problem for small and emerging businesses, and thereto an intervention is required. The observation of the committee in this regard is most relevant. We must do everything necessary to protect them. This problem is of course compounded by the fact that some municipalities are not paying their Eskom debts on time which leads to Eskom having closures, shutdowns and blackouts in certain areas. Of course, this also leads to the collapse of small businesses.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 15

The whole electricity supply programme must be looked at to ensure that we safeguard small businesses but most importantly to protect jobs.

In conclusion, we must highlight the fact that if we do not reign China in it is going to continue walking all over South Africa. The fact that they are the alpha and omega of the phenomenon of steel dumping in this country, alongside other countries, is the clearest indication yet that despite the International Trade Administration Commission's, Itac's, interventions China is just not prepared to play by the rules. However, we welcome the report and thank the committee on a job well done.

Ms D CARTER: Thank you Deputy Speaker. Having perused the report of the Portfolio Committee on Economic Development, we note the purpose of a visit to projects funded by the Industrial Development Corporation, IDC, was to gauge whether government policy interventions have been effective and whether the objectives of the projects have been met.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 16

In respect of the industries visited in the steel industry, it is important to note that the South African steel industry was badly affected by the global steel market crisis, and by low costs and the dumping of steel products by the Chinese. The net effect of this has been company closures, retrenchments and severe job losses. We know that dumping killed the cotton industry, it's killed the textile industry and it's even busy killing our chicken industry.

From the report it is evident that there is a common thread of concern expressed by those steel industries visited which is that:

Firstly, government needs to seek solutions to protect the local steel industry against below-cost imports or dumping from other countries, particularly China;

Secondly, government needs to provide solutions to rising electricity costs, particularly for small to medium-sized businesses; and

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 17

Thirdly, government needs to foster and formalise a localisation drive to ensure the procurement and utilisation of locally manufactured steel and steel products.

Cope notes that a further negative impact on our steel industry could well come in the form of an imposition of a Trump-inspired 25% USA import tariff on steel and aluminium products. In noting this report, Cope poses the question upon which the oversight visit was premised and for which the report proffered no answer, and that is, has government's interventions been effective?

In the first instance in respect of protecting the local steel industry from low cost and dumped steel and steel products, we question why government was hesitant and took so long to impose an import duty and we also question why antidumping measures have not been effected.

Secondly, we note the own goal scored by government in respect of the corruption and distraction of Eskom and the resultant pressure exerted on an already stressed industry as a consequence of rising electricity costs.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 18

History will reveal that South Africa's industrialisation was initiated and underpinned by two initiatives, which was the creation and development of Eskom and the Iron and Steel Industrial Corporation, Iscor. Under the ANC, Eskom faces near collapse as does much of our steel industry. Government appears to be failing in its developmental objectives.

Finally, in respect of the visit to the Council for Scientific and Industrial Research, CSIR, Cope believes that the need for research, development, innovation and the search for much-needed economic growth ...

[Inaudible.] ... development cannot be underestimated. We agree with the view of the committee.

Mr S A TLEANE: Thank you very much Deputy Speaker. The ANC supports this report. The oversight visits conducted by the Portfolio Committee on Economic Development to Mpumalanga and Gauteng from 12 to 15 September 2017 was a meaningful and fruitful exercise that achieved its goals of ensuring that government's policy interventions are effective and that the strategic objectives of the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 19

projects in question are met. The focus of the oversight visits was on Columbus Stainless, Mpumalanga Stainless Initiative, MSI, the Naledi Inhlanganiso Foundry and United Industrial Cables. These firms are supported by government through the IDC.

Columbus Stainless employs 1 300 workers and 480 trainees, and is crucial for the economic wellbeing of the people of Middelburg and the surrounding areas. It exports stainless steel products to 262 destinations which include Europe, East Asia and Southern Africa.

However, the importation of cheaper products from countries such as China and India into the country is undermining the growth of Columbus. The IDC holds a 24% share in this company, thereby positioning government as an active and willing partner of the private sector in the creation and protection of jobs in this country.

The committee noted the company's positive report on ... remarkable corporate social responsibility such as the sponsorships of schools, collaboration with FET colleges and the provision of internship opportunities for young

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 20

people. The company also appears to have established and maintained good relations with labour.

However, the high electricity costs of our country are impacting negatively on the company. While the company has many positives, women in this company are not being sufficiently empowered to play a fundamental role in the leadership and growth of the organisation.

The committee therefore recommended that the company must, as a matter of urgency, draw up a gender-equity plan to address the disproportionate representation of personnel at various levels.

Transformation is a vital constituent of our young democracy and for economic growth. The committee noted the lack of black Africans in senior management positions and strongly recommended that the company develop a clear transformation and succession plan in order to reflect the demographics of this country.

It was further recommended that the Minister of Economic Development, through Itac, must continuously seek

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 21

solutions to protect South African businesses from below-cost imports from other countries.

The Minister of Trade and Industry, through the process of the Industrial Policy Action Plan, Ipap, must engage other stakeholders in government to find solutions to the challenges of high electricity costs, especially for small to medium-sized businesses in the country.

Next to be visited was the Mpumalanga Stainless Initiative, MSI, which is supported in part by Columbus Stainless. The MSI is a nonprofit company which was established in 2001 as the only incubator in the steel sector that specialises in stainless steel knowledge exchange, shared infrastructure and technology support services to the unemployed, struggling entrepreneurs or small and medium enterprises, SME's, at one enabling environment and location.

It is also supported by the Small Enterprise Development Agency, Seda, the Mpumalanga provincial government, the Steve Tshwete Local Municipality and the Absa Foundation, amongst others.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 22

The highlight of the MSI visit was a young man who manufactures great innovations out of stainless steel but who explained the challenge he was facing; which is that of having to complete unending and complex forms issued by the IDC and other government agencies. He boldly told the committee that all he has are his identity book, ck and creative mind. He cannot deal with complex government documents.

The committee therefore recommended that Columbus, the Mpumalanga regional office of the IDC and Seda must greatly improve the support that is given to the MSI. This relates to basic business support at start-up levels, the funding of the projects run by the trainees, their exposure to the relevant markets and postgraduation support.

In a subsequent visit we will check whether this improved support is being provided by the relevant bodies mentioned above.

The Naledi Inhlanganiso Foundry – acquired by a beneficiary of Ipap and which is 100% black owned with

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 23

the support of the IDC which has a 40% shareholding – employs 320 people. It focuses its operations on steel manufacturing for the rail, mining, energy and automotive market sectors.

The Naledi Inhlanganiso Foundry is an admirable representation of what is good about the Black Industrialist Programme and can, with the necessary support, grow from strength to strength.

Having noted that the company promotes localisation and supports smaller businesses, and recruits and harnesses young black talent, it is nevertheless subjected to high electricity costs and the scourge of below-cost imports from China and India, which are undermining the company's growth and prospects. The ANC supports this report. [Time expired.]

Question put.

Motion agreed to.

Report accordingly adopted.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 24

**CONSIDERATION OF REPORT OF PORTFOLIO COMMITTEE ON MINERAL
RESOURCES ON OVERSIGHT VISIT TO GAUTENG**

Mr Z M D MANDELA: Hon Deputy Speaker, respected members and my colleagues, respected members of the media, comrades, friends and the opposition; I rise to introduce the Gauteng report for the mineral resources oversight visit focussed on Zero Harm and related issues. It is fitting that during this Nelson Mandela centenary celebration year that we acknowledge the long journey we have made as a nation and more specifically as an industry since President Mandela first announced the Leon Commission on Inquiry into the mining sector and since the commission made its findings public in 1995. We salute iNkosi Dalibhunga, as a former mineworker, and in doing so we salute each and every mineworker who toiled in the mines and still do so, sometimes under the most unimaginable and hostile conditions. The Leon Commission Report of 1995 indeed detailed how many were killed noting that some 69 000 miners had lost their lives in the first 93 years of the last century with some 15 000 sustaining serious injuries. We have come a long way on our journey towards Zero Harm since 1994 and we must

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 25

applaud the collective effort of the tripartite of mineworkers, mine owners and government. We still have a long way to go and much work still needs to be done to research the Zero Harm levels of Australia who achieved a three-year record of zero fatalities and Chile who celebrated eight years of zero fatalities.

These comparisons are not made lightly nor to act as a damper on the amazing achievements we have made in the following areas; strengthening our policy and regulatory framework, improving our institutional framework and capacity, enhanced oversight responsibility, fundamental culture change with greater focus on health and safety, adoption of a Zero Harm policy, greater communication between key stakeholders and role players, greater awareness and worker activism, reducing the number of fatalities in the sector. Whilst our oversight visit focussed on Zero Harm, it was abundantly clear that job losses in the industry remained an overarching issue of concern and continued efforts to stem this is required as we sit out ... [Inaudible.] of low commodity prices and depressed demand. It also emphasises the pressing need for greater local beneficiation. Our mining industry

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 26

remains a premier economic sector and it falls upon all of us to address the historic imbalances and ensure that our drive towards radical economic transformation embraces all of these imperatives of improving the lives of mineworkers and the mining communities. Radical transformation of ownership patterns in the sector. Entrenching the culture of Zero Harm to personal environment and economical through embracing best practices standards in risk management to strive for the goal of zero fatalities as the loss of one life is a life too many.

I applaud all the members of the Portfolio Committee on Mineral Resources on a job well done, and the department and its institutions for its leadership. We have come a long way since the National Union of Mineworkers, NUM, first made its historic submission, 8 000 ways to die. Last but not least to our valiant mineworkers for the task that very few of us would be able to do. We, the ANC, support this report. I thank you, Deputy Speaker.
[Applause.]

There was no debate.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 27

The Chief Whip of the Majority Party moved: That the Report be adopted.

AN HON MEMBER: What about the workers?

Mr J R B LORIMER: I will come to that.

Declaration(s) of vote:

Mr J R B LORIMER: Deputy Speaker, possibly the major achievement of this government since 1994 has been to work with the mining industry to reduce fatalities and rates of disease in the mining industry. Despite South Africa having the world's deepest mines and the mining model for those deep-level mines that involves thousands of people working far underground, fatalities have been cut dramatically. People still lose their lives though in uncomfortably large numbers.

But when we look at mining, we need to compare it with safety rates in other sectors like railways, construction or the taxi industry which should be much safer but are not. The architecture of the safety system has proved effective though it still clearly needs refinement. Much

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 28

of this report deals with problems that do persist stubbornly. Many of the constraints now revolve around cost. Inspections are not as regular as they should be because the department says it does not have enough money. Regrettably, the system still suffers from a lack of clarity that leads to what miners see and what the courts have confirmed is heavy-handed and unreasonable action by some mining inspectors. A good system is one that is credible with all players. This report suggests some important steps in that regard. So we approve of this report.

All this comes in a context of a severely troubled economy. Mining has been shielded by a gratifying increase in international commodity prices but this gives an inaccurate and temporary picture of the prospects of the industry and risks shielding us from the reality of the choice in front of us. The basic problems remain. Tens of thousands of jobs have been lost in the last five years. More are threatened. If you look at the numbers concerning our deep-level gold and platinum mines which are the major mining employers, they no longer make

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 29

sense. Even the optimists say most of those mines have only five years left.

AN HON MEMBER: What about the workers?

Mr J R B LORIMER: The latest survey by the respected Fraser Institute into the desirability of countries as destinations for mining investment says, when assessed by how attractive government's mining policies are, we come 81st out of 91 countries surveyed. And if you read further, Fraser uses as a pull quote what was said by one executive director, this person said:

The Department of Mineral Resources is corrupt and incapable of administering licences in an efficient manner. Politically connected people receive special treatment on a regular basis.

Mines do not easily survive that kind of operating environment. [Interjections.] Mines may be able to survive labour - which is one major pay increase - but has refused to change its working practices from the 1970s and threatens or commits violence in every labour

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 30

dispute. They may be able to survive deeper reefs and worsening grades. They may be able to survive a safety system that closes mines without following generally understood guidelines. They may be able to survive intermittent electricity at a rocketing cost. They may be able to survive a mining charter and legislation that extorts money and threatens their security of tenure but they cannot survive all of them and they cannot survive them all at the same time. The trend of this industry is still downwards and will not reverse unless this government fundamentally changes its approach. Tinkering with the Mining Charter and pushing through the latest version of the Mineral and Petroleum Resources Development Act, MPRDA ... [Inaudible] the illusion of change but it is just that, an illusion. This could all be easily changed for the better. Charter III can be dropped without any ifs or buts. Once empowered always empowered could be accepted. The MPRDA could be withdrawn and rewritten in an investor-friendly fashion.

Safety stoppages could be clarified and evenly applied without compromising safety and captured and other crooked departmental officials could be rooted out. We

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 31

need a paradigm shift. The ANC needs to give up on the way it has been running this industry because we are at the stage where the journey to destruction of the industry is clear and the only question is, are we going to destroy mining quickly or we are going to do it gradually? [Applause.]

Mr M N PAULSEN: Deputy Speaker, hon Mandela, you spoke about mining in Australia but what you failed to mention is that in Australia - a coalminer by the way - earns an equivalent of R1 million. Here in South Africa we shoot miners. This government shot miners for demanding R12 500 per month. And in Australia, countries are not disinvesting because of the high cost of labour, they are staying and people are happy and have decent living conditions.

The mining sector continues to lose jobs because between 1994 and 2017, more than a 147 000 jobs were lost in the mining industry. These job losses are systematic and will continue as the sector has been in a crisis for a long time. The central reason why jobs are being lost in the mining industry is mechanisation. It is for this reason

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 32

that despite increases in growth and profits in the mining sector, workers continue to lose their jobs as they get displaced by machines. If we want to address these job losses, mining must once again become more labour intensive but at the same time beneficiation and processing of minerals mines must be increased so that new jobs are created in this process to offset the job losses in the extraction process. This government is failing to do this and that is why the Mineral and Petroleum Resources Development Amendment Bill remains unsigned and also because Jacob Zuma has not signed the Bill before he left, which means it cannot be implemented. While miners are losing jobs they are also continuing losing their lives. In 2017 alone, 81 miners lost their lives while at work and this is an increase of 5% from the previous year. The reason for this is because businesses are cutting corners to minimise costs at the expense of the safety of the worker.

And also because there are only 200 inspectors that have to cover 2 000 mines. So this government is also cutting corners. Mining in this country continues to prioritise profits over the health of its workers and the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 33

development of this country. And as the hon member said before me, we do need a paradigm shift. We need government to nationalise the mines and to ensure the safety of every mineworker in this country. Thank you very much.

Mr J A ESTERHUIZEN: Hon Deputy Speaker, although I unfortunately could not attend this oversight visit, it is good to read in a report though that the mining bodies visited not only undertook to concentrate more on health and safety but also to safeguard the future of South Africa's mining industry through the development of new people centred technology and techniques that prepare our minds for modern mining methods.

It was of great concern that I read of continued allegations of inspectors being bribed as mining is far more than just a job opportunity in that it must also recognise our mine affected communities as stakeholders with legitimate interests and rights that must be heard.

What is clear is that innovation in mining must take centre stage. It must also unleash a wave of mining

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 34

innovation in ways that are not excessively capital intensive but it can make use of the existing mining and community processing and infrastructure. We must do better with what we have. As the committee rightly noted there must be end to end innovation in its broader sense, addressing all aspects of sustainability for a business including safety health environment, needs of the community as well as the Department of Mineral Resources itself.

Here I can use such examples as course particle technology which not only slashes water use but also multiplies output from the existing plant. The IFP hopes that this department and the committee will through regular oversight succeed in arresting the current general decline of the local mining industry in South Africa and help the industry overcome significant obstacles in the future.

Self-inflicted rules and legislation, and prioritised rent maximisation as well as ignoring mining's innate ability to function as a powerful lever for structural economic transformation does not help. A supportive

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 35

legislative regulatory and administrative environment is required to ensure an outcome that floats all boats and it is what is needed to unlock South Africa's mining huge growth potential.

Our mineral resources have massive potential and can help to reduce employment, narrow the inequality gaps, arrest poverty and deliver inclusive growth to benefit all stakeholders. I support this report. Thank you.

Ms D CARTER: Hon Deputy Speaker, the purpose of a visit to Gauteng was to review and update the committee's previous observations and recommendations in support of the concept of Zero Harm. The other important aim of the visit was to consider the views of the stakeholders on how the department is assisting in efforts to stem job losses in the mining industry.

Without wishing to mitigate on the importance of health and safety we have noted that the report contains no advice on the department's efforts to stem job losses in neither the industry nor the industry's view thereon.

Now, the fact of the matter is that our mining industry

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 36

now contributes less than 10% of our GDP having once contributed close to 20%.

Whereas global mining companies have been experiencing upswing on the back of the recovery in commodity prices, our South African counterparts are struggling to keep their heads above water amid regulatory uncertainty including the Mining Charter, increasing input costs amongst others, and an economy in decline.

In respect of Zero Harm we know that there we note that there has been a manifest improvement in the health and safety performance by the mining sector over the past decade. Nonetheless, the number of incidents is still far of the Zero Harm goals that our mining sector committed to at a safety summit in 2016. One incident is one incident too many.

Last year's recorded 88 minor deaths represent an unfortunate regression in this trend. We also express our concern at 14 mineworkers' deaths recorded since the beginning of the current year and may their souls rest in peace and may their families find solace.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 37

Mine safety is not only a matter and responsibility of an industry itself. It is a matter and responsibility for employees, our unions and the Department of Mineral Resources. Deputy Speaker, we are concerned at the reduction of the budget allocation to the mine's health and safety inspectorate of the Department of Mineral Resources.

Currently, given the financial constraints, there are, as stated earlier, 200 inspectors who have to cover some 2000 working mines and each mine can have hundreds of working places that are subject to inspection. We simply do not have sufficient health inspectors of the department apart from the report indicating the need for more comprehensive and cross cutting training and skills of the inspectors.

We know the concern expressed by the Chamber of Mines what they contend to be the injudicious and inconsistent use of Section 54 stoppage notices and the department's inspectors who have an axe to grind with the industry. With the authority of office comes the need to ensure that power is used for the greater good of society as a

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 38

whole and not for private and nefarious ends. Cope notes the report. Thank you.

Mr S LUZIPHO: Hon Deputy Speaker and the hon members of the House, let me appreciate that almost all the parties that spoke here did so in support of the report of the oversight undertaken by the Portfolio Committee on Mineral Resources. I want to talk to the issues that emerged. At the centre of them was how do we achieve the Zero Harm objectives? Amongst other issues that we noted was the fact that in as much as we have reduced fatalities in the mining industry, the biggest problem is that the occurrences are in most cases in big numbers. When we undertook this oversight there were already three fatalities that have taken place at Kusasaletu Mine in Carletonville. That made us to say what is it that we can do?

One of the issues we discovered was that most of the fatalities are as a result of what is called seismic events or a situation where there is a reaction of the ground and therefore it does affect the industry.

Unfortunately on the areas where we visited one of the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 39

issues that was raised was that it is difficult to detect a seismic event.

At this day and age we do not think with our high technology we can say there is something that we cannot be able to avoid. Therefore, we have tasked our research institution, the Council for Geo-science, Mintek as well as CSIR to look at mechanisms that we can apply even if it means that we cannot detect it but to create conditions that we make it impossible.

In Kusasaletu Mine, for example, when the seismic event happened workers had a feeling that with the structure of the soil, it was possible that an accident will happen. Now, the danger is that workers have a right to refuse to perform dangerous work but in an event where a seismic event will occur it becomes so difficult for them to resist going underground. One of the issues we have said is that if the problem is about the cost implications, the life of a mineworker is as important as the life of the mine owner. We also said that we must be able to plough more resources in order to address the problem is seismic events.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 40

It is important also to note that in our discussions with the Chamber of Mines, we have agreed that we need to engage at the level of stakeholders to deal with the principal's agreement and mitigate against job losses. There can be no recommendations that will come from the department.

I think it is important to make one observation. We agree that we have got a challenge and a problem of corruption and we do not think that any individual can defend corruption. A department cannot be corrupt but individuals within the department. I think the way we coin terms may create problems for us.

It is also important to say that in terms of the report it does highlight areas that require a focus attention and therefore we are going to focus on those issues. The Mining Charter is going to be the subject of interaction by stakeholders. The outcome is the one that stakeholders will have to live up to and owned the process.

What we think is going to be critical is not whether the Mining Charter is there or not but how we monitor and

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 41

police the Mining Charter. The question of the principles of the Mining Charter on whether -once empowered always empowered- as the committee we will get an opportunity to deal with that issue. Equally the Mineral and Petroleum Resources Development Act is sitting in the NCOP. I do not think it has got anything to do except that it is in the NCOP.

As for whether the ANC is on destruction path is irrelevant. I think we must be talking about the Chamber of Mines. I do not know how do you miss to read the statements of the Chamber of Mines that is so optimistic about the industry - the fact that we have President Cyril Ramaphosa and the appointment of the new Minister.

I will not say much...

IsiXhosa:

... kuba akekho uNjengele. Ikhona nje enye into ebeyithethile ngaye.

English:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 42

The point is that we cannot say when the industry is the one that pronounces that things are beginning to take shape and then someone else comes and says otherwise. The most important thing...

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: Hon Deputy Speaker, on a point of order: I just want to remind the member that it is Minister Gwede Mantashe. Your Minister. I know that he is new but we know him. You are welcome.

IsiXhosa:

Mr S LUZIPHO: Hayi sikuville MaHlophe, ndiyabona ukuba ubufuna ukulibiza ngokwakho eli gama likaGwede Mantashe.

English:

It is okay. Therefore I find it very strange, but I think it is a discussion for another day. If you make comparison between South Africa and Australia, you missed just one simple thing. The Australian mining industry is one of the most highly mechanised industries in mining. Sometimes quasi-revolutionaries can be a problem if a revolutionary can make an example about Australia. Therefore, at least I would understand if it was hon

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 43

Lorimer to say capitalism can thrive but to stand on a podium and say a system of super exploitation is the best one that we must learn from. I think it is highly contradictory.

Yes, he talked about Australia as one of the countries we could learn. He never praised Australia as the best as compared to South Africa. We also recommended that it would be important for the department to make sure that it conducts an audit of its inspectors. It does not help to have an inspector for the sake of having an inspector whereas on the practical grounds there are new challenges that require a particular skill and therefore we said we have to get hold of that information. Thank you very much. The ANC supports this report.

Question Put.

Motion agreed to (Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).
Report accordingly adopted.

**THE PLIGHT OF FOREIGN-QUALIFIED MEDICAL DOCTORS WHO FIND
THEMSELVES INELIGIBLE TO SIT FOR THE HEALTH PROFESSIONS
COUNCIL OF SOUTH AFRICA BOARD EXAMS BECAUSE OF SECTION 4**

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 44

**OF THE REGULATIONS CONTAINED IN THE HEALTH PROFESSIONS
ACT, ACT 56 OF 1974**

(Subject for discussion)

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I was reading, hon members; this is not my opinion. Hon Singh?

Mr N SINGH: Hon Deputy Speaker, it has been reported that in South Africa - which has a steadily increasing demand for medical services - a growing number of patients suffering from a variety of illnesses such HIV and Aids, tuberculosis, cancer, diabetes, heart disease and psychiatric illnesses are simply unable to receive immediate medical attention due to, amongst other critical factors, the shortage of medical professionals at our public hospitals.

On 27 February, I delivered a Member's Statement in this House expressing the growing concerns and complaints by South African students who had completed their medical degrees abroad over a Health Professions Council of South Africa, HPCSA, enforcement in 2018 of a 2009 regulation

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 45

which, until then, had not been enforced, and which now requires our foreign-qualified doctors to undertake internships in their country of study in order for them to be eligible to sit our South African medical board exams.

Correspondence from the HPCSA has been contradictory, to say the least, with students receiving letters that first advise them of their eligibility to sit the board exam on 27 October 2017 - this is when those letters were handed in.

These were then retracted on 20 February 2018.

These students are now facing the prospect of being unable to sit the board exams this coming May.

This change of direction is totally unacceptable as the students will suffer grave prejudice. It is no wonder that court action against this ruling is in process of being instituted.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 46

One cannot understand what informed this change in decision. I appreciate the fact that in discussions with the hon Minister Motsoaledi - who is not here today - he did indicate that he had engaged with the HPCSA on this matter.

What is now required is that the HPCSA, through the intervention of the Minister, must immediately take steps to rescind the resolution of February 2018 and immediately invite the foreign-qualified doctors who received confirmatory letters on or about 27 October to sit for the May 2018 medical board examination, and urgently provide the necessary guidelines for the same.

However, having made this request for current foreign-qualified students, it leaves the HPCSA and the Minister to express a view on the plight of all South African students who are currently studying abroad whose rights will also be prejudiced if they are - as the regulation states - required to do internships in the country where they are currently studying. They will be stymied and barred from registration as health practitioners if they

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 47

are unable to secure foreign internships as required by Regulation 4E of the 2009 regulations.

This begs the question as to the need for the 2009 regulations. Taking a closer look at this regulation and what informed it, one can deduce that 4(E) makes sense if it applies to a foreign-qualified medical doctor who is not a South African citizen, and who wishes to practice medicine in this country. This is a best practice around the world. Of this there can be no argument.

I believe these regulations had the intention of preventing non-South African citizens who applied to be registered as health practitioners to have completed their internships in their country of study, not South African citizens studying abroad.

One can argue that, by not enforcing the 2009 regulation for almost 10 years now, the HPCSA has created a legitimate expectation with these students, and that they would be in a position to register as interns without complying with section 4(E) of the 2009 regulations. This is what they expect.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 48

How will students who are currently in the foreign academic pipeline secure internships abroad when they are on student and not work visas? Are they not now being unfairly prejudiced?

As a country, hon Deputy Minister, we lauded the initiative taken by government to send students to Cuba. You yourself, hon Deputy Minister - I read - have often waxed lyrical about how wonderful that programme is.

And you are correct. Cuban-trained South African medical students are brought back to South Africa in their sixth year and they complete their final year of study in accredited medical institutions. They then sit the board exams after they have been well prepared for the kind of medical practice they will experience domestically. After passing the board exams, they receive internship at one of our public hospitals.

There is thus proper integration of these students to familiarise themselves with South African health care conditions. Surely, the same system can be replicated for

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 49

all South African qualified medical students, if necessary. Why prejudice some of them?

Finally, depending on your response, hon Deputy Minister, I will raise other issues in my concluding remarks. Thank you.

THE DEPUTY MINISTER OF HEALTH: Hon Deputy Speaker, I thank you for this opportunity to participate in this debate on the plight of foreign qualified medical doctors who find themselves ineligible to sit for Health Professions Council Board Exams as hon Singh has quite ably elaborated on. Let me pass my greetings to hon Ministers, Deputy Ministers and hon members. Thank hon Singh for bringing this matter up for debate today.

Hon Deputy Speaker, it is common knowledge that the medical profession is one of the scarce skills, which is in demand all over the world even much scarce in developing countries. Because of this, medical professionals are often highly mobile with the main pattern being movement from developing poor countries like ours to the more developed and richer countries,

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 50

especially in Europe, New Zealand, Australia and America. It gets even more complicated when you find that even developed countries of the North poach each other's highly skilled medical doctors. A few years ago, while I was on a legislature's visit with other colleagues in Canada, I came across a young UCT graduate practising in a small town in Canada. I complained to the hosts that they were collapsing our health services by recruiting our young doctors. The host acknowledged that that is the case and said that in that particular area, if it wasn't for South African doctors, their health services would have collapsed and thanked me for that. I say, look, you thanking me, but our health services are collapsing because of this. He then went on to apologise and said that they are also having the same effect from their neighbours, the United State of America, which he alleged that they were also poaching their highly qualified doctors.

So, it is because of this that while our training of doctors in itself, we must accept that there is not enough numbers, we need to replenish also those who seek greener pastures elsewhere in the world. It is for this

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 51

reason that as Health and also for Higher Education, we need to do both recruitment of medical doctors from other countries, but also find opportunities for young South Africans to go and train as doctors and come back to serve our country if we don't have enough space in our medical schools.

Hon Deputy Speaker, it is also common knowledge that the medical profession is a very sensitive trade as it deals with the wellbeing of people and therefore, it is about life and death. It therefore makes perfect sense that there should be stringent regulation to protect the population against ill-equipped or even bogus practitioners, even though despite all the measures some bogus practitioners still find their way through the system.

Like almost every country in the world, our country has over time developed laws and regulations and set up bodies to oversee the licensing and supervising the quality and conduct of medical practitioners and intervened where necessary. Our system has evolved over many years, before and after democracy.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 52

Before 1994, we had the SA Medical and Dental Council, which I must say, did not escape the prejudice of apartheid. We all know the infamous conduct of the Biko Doctors.

During that period, the licensing of foreign doctors to practise in the homelands was less stringent than those who were to touch white patients in the four provinces of the Cape, Natal, Orange Free State and the Transvaal.

Recognition of foreign qualifications was generally biased towards those who studied in the commonwealth countries.

Since 1994, the Health Professions Council Act was passed through an amendment of the previous Act. Amongst the objects of this Act are: to assist in the promotion of the health of the population of South Africa; to protect the public in matters of rendering of health services; to uphold and maintain professional and ethical standards.

In terms of the Health Professions Council Act, the council regulates registration of medical doctors through

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 53

two sections, section 24 and section 25 of the Act. Section 24 deals with recognition of medical qualifications from South African universities. I quote from the Act:

The Minister may, on the recommendation of the council, prescribe the qualifications obtained by virtue of examinations conducted by an accredited university, or other educational institution or examining authority in the Republic of South Africa.

This will entitle the holder to registration. This is generally referred to in the Act as a holder of a prescribed qualification - that's a South African qualification.

The issue which hon Singh has tabled, which we are debating today, relates to section 25 of the very same Act. Amongst others, this section says that the Minister may, after consultation with the council by regulation provide that any person who holds a qualification which the council may accept by virtue of the fact that such qualification, in the opinion of the council, indicates a

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 54

satisfactory standard of professional education and training, may be registered in terms of this section in the applicable prescribed registration category, and thereupon the relevant professional board may in its discretion, but subject to any regulations and national health policy and international protocols which the Minister may make or be subject to, register such person

In terms of section 25, a professional board may require the person to pass a board evaluation or exam, which is what we are dealing with, hon Singh.

The Minister may, in consultation with council and relevant board make regulations for imposition of restrictions.

Now, in line with this section 25(4), the Minister gazetted regulations in notice called R101 in February 2009 as hon Singh has indicated.

Now, in terms of these regulations, a foreign qualified graduate in applying for registration, amongst others, must provide a certified copy of an ID or passport; copy

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 55

of registration certificate certified by a notary;
certified copy of a CV which specified a course content
done and also the practical training done.

The problematic part of this is section e(e) of the
regulation, which says, in case of an application for
registration in a profession for which internship is a
requirement, a certificate of completed training as an
intern or similar training or experience obtained
elsewhere and the programme of such a training. So, this
is also part of the requirement.

Now, these regulations were passed in February 2009.
Since the regulations were gazetted in February 2009, in
terms of actual practice by the Health Professions
Council and the Medical and Dental Board, this has been
the case.

Doctors who have been recruited from other countries not
on a government to government agreement and those who
come on their own initiative to South Africa seeking
employment were required the listed documents which I
have mentioned, including proof of having done internship

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 56

if they claim that they have done internship in their countries of origin or another country.

If they come from a country whose curriculum content is viewed not to be at par with the South African training but otherwise the degree is assessed to be credible, they will then be offered an opportunity to write Health Professions Council Board Exam, for which they will be entitled to three attempts. If they then pass on first, second or third attempt, they can then be employed in the Public Service. They can only go into independent practice if they become South African citizens in terms of this Act.

Now, applicants for registration as medical practitioners by the foreign graduates who are fresh from graduating, who in many cases would be mainly South Africans required them to submit the documents mentioned except for proof of internship. This was not a requirement as it was acknowledged that being fresh graduates, they would not have had any internship. So, this was the practice from 2009.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 57

So, the practice of allowing graduates from foreign universities, as long as their degrees were assessed to be credible dates back many years ago. In many of our hospitals and clinics, we do have graduates from India, Pakistan, Uganda, Zimbabwe, Nigeria and many other countries.

Once these graduates pass the board exam, they would then be eligible for employment for two years as interns followed by a one year as community service.

The problem started on 20 February this year when the Health Professions Council issued a circular to applicants for the board exams which are to sit in May this year, in which the council then said that at its meeting of 2 February this year, the Examination Committee of the Council had decided to require all applicants to possess all the requirements, including internship proof.

Based on this decision, the council wrote to all applicants who had not completed internship indicating that their approval letters issued in August last year

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 58

were being rescinded if they had not completed internship elsewhere.

This decision, I agree with hon Singh, has serious implications as it prevents even South Africans who have just completed their degrees abroad from entering the SA Health Service. The only foreign graduates who will survive are those from universities from abroad which are fully accredited by the Health Professions Council and don't require board exams. These are a minority, very few.

It is for this reason that the SA Medical Association had already approach the courts on this matter.

The main problem is that in the past years, there were very few South Africans graduating from foreign universities and the regulations were structured to regulate for doctors who had been in service elsewhere in the world. By invoking the internship clause, the Health Professions Council was trying to limit the increasing number of new graduates sitting for board exams.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 59

In terms of the government to government agreement between South Africa and Cuba, this matter is handled differently as hon Singh indicated because the final year students on this programme do their final year integration in our South African universities, and by the time they write the final year theory paper with the Cuban University, they are already accredited in terms of the Health Professions Council, and they can immediately register for internship.

Our Ministry and the Department of Health has engaged the Health Professions Council on this matter. We have reached an agreement for now that those who had already qualified to sit for the board exam whose approval had been rescinded must be allowed to sit for these exams in May. So, this will happen.

We will then work jointly with the Health Professions Council to work on a more long-term solution, which will make it possible for those young South Africans who are studying in foreign medical schools to be integrated into our health system as hon Singh said more or less towards

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 60

the same kind of treatment as those who are in the Cuban medical schools.

So, we are looking forward to firstly, those who had already been accepted to sit for the exams in May to be allowed to sit for the exams as agreed with the Health Professions Council, but we are also looking for a long-term solution whereby the hundreds of young South Africans who are in various medical schools in India, China, Mauritius and other countries will be given an opportunity through a structured programme to be integrated and sit for an exam, which will be able to allow them to be admitted by the Health Professions Council to practice in our Health Services. I thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

Ms S P KOPANE: House Chair, over the past two decades, the national Department of Health and the Health Professionals Council of South Africa have adopted a principled position against the recruitment of staff from other countries and increasingly enforced restrictive measures pertaining to their employment in South Africa.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 61

Despite the stance that is taken by the government, the DA has been calling for increases in foreign staff for the better coordination of their recruitment; targeted training programmes and for incentives to ensure retention of foreign doctors in the public healthcare sector.

The harsh reality is that, the current demand for medical school places in South Africa, by far exceeds the capacity of South Africa's nine medical schools. We need at least to triple the number of doctors we currently have, to implement National Health Insurance, NHI. This is impossible, given the current stance taken by the Health Professional Council of South Africa, HPCSA.

The HNI is nothing but a pipedream which won't ever work, given the current situation in our health sector. We do acknowledge that the existence of the HPCSA. It is there to protect the public and that we should exercise the due diligence in relation to the training and the qualifications of prospective medical practitioners.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 62

However, unnecessary red tapes will not aid us in solving the problem of major understanding in the health care sector. We are of the view that section 4 of the Health Professions Act that the Deputy Minister alluded to, may give too much power and the discretion to the HPCSA.

There are so many foreign doctors willing to work in South Africa, but the government put so many obstacles in their way to get registered to work in our country. The DA opposes any policy that places unnecessary burden on our medical practitioners even to our healthcare system. The recent ruling by the council that the graduates who studies abroad have to first complete an internship in the countries where they have studied before writing their board exams, is absurd and appalling.

This will cause major problems for medical professionals seeking to come to South Africa, and will in many cases, be impossible due to work permits even the residency issues in these counties. We support the view that HPCSA conducted itself unethically and inefficiently to the detriment and the prejudice of young and aspiring South African doctors in a country that faces a dire shortage.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 63

After this shocking ruling by the council, many returning medical students were advised that they would not qualify to write the examinations before they completed the internship in their countries of study. They were also informed that they could not be accommodated as interns in local hospitals, and this has caused major uncertainty in our country right now.

We fully support the court applications by the parents, the medical students, other doctors and other legal experts to overturn this unjust ruling by the council. Further, we are shocked by the decision by the SA Committee of Medical Deans, SACOMD, not to allow South African students that are studying in China, to complete their clinical electives in South Africa.

This practice has been a norm until the beginning of this year. South African students are now being prejudiced due to the decision taken by SACOMD which clearly falls outside their mandate. These students' patriotism should be applauded, as they were willing to face major problems in our public health system in order to serve South

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 64

African people in institutions which are facing major understaffed.

The DA will also note the concern that these returning doctors were intentionally being discriminated or sidelined, as a result of government prioritising its Cuban medical student programme. In 2016 alone in Gauteng, the Health Department spent R144 million for 461 students who studied medicine in Cuba, which about 50% that will be more if we can train those medical student doctors locally here in South Africa.

The students are there in Cuba for six years, which includes one year learning Spanish. Thereafter, they have to spend an additional two years for integration of studies at South African medical university. This means that, it costs more than R1,8 million to train one doctor in Cuba and another R500 000 for the extra two years in South Africa.

So, the total cost would be about R2,3 million for each medical student to be trained in Cuba. This compares to about R1,5 million to train a doctor in South Africa in a

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 65

short time. It is strange why the department wants to spend so much money training doctors in Cuba, instead of assisting our local medical schools to take extra students.

We should train more doctors locally rather than paying exorbitant amount for overseas study that will require an extra two years for local training. The fact that we recently - if you remember each and everyone of you that - in KwaZulu-Natal we didn't have a single oncologist in the public healthcare system, because of the system that is failing our citizens; a system that urgently needs to be reviewed and a massive failure by our government to uphold the constitutional rights of our South African people.

Only today that it was reported that a group of foreign doctors desperate to practice in South Africa have been forced to take up odd jobs such as guards, others car wash. That is what they can do. At least 40 doctors, mostly from the DRC, who have passed the board examinations and received accreditation from the council

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 66

have been left without options after two-year wait for internship at public hospitals.

Meanwhile, patients are forced to stand in long queues at public hospitals, wanting to see doctors. This irregular ruling by the council is aiding to the problem of shortages of doctors and also to the detriment of every single patient suffering in our public health system. As the DA, we are calling for the development of a specialist visa scheme, to import foreign trained doctors, nurses and professionals to fill the massive gaps in the health system.

We maintain that there should be an increase number of foreign doctors in South Africa, and that there should be incentives including tax exemptions for highly desirable professionals and other mechanisms, to improve the attractiveness of practicing in our country. This is an urgent approach that needs to be taken now, to alleviate the massive burdens on our health system.

We clearly believe that the only lasting solution to this problem is to increase the capacity of South African

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 67

institutions to enrol medical students. In addressing this, we are appealing for the Department of Health that they must work urgently with the national Department of Higher Education and Training, through the Joint Health Sciences Education Committee, to ensure the expansion of medical education in South Africa.

The DA will continue fighting for a growth in medical school places, to ensure that in the long term, gifted and ambitious South Africans will be used to fill all vacancies in the system. We will then revamp the entire health system. This is the DA promise and this is the caring government that the DA will bring. [Applause.] [Time expired.]

Ms L MATHYS: Hon Chair, the EFF obviously welcomes this debate because we have declared 2018 the year of quality public health care, and we do know that what EFF says they will do, they will do. We said that we will deal with Nkandla corruption, we have; we said Zuma will fall, he has. So, when we say that we going to have quality public health care, EFF is going to do it in 2018.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 68

Hon Chair, on this motion, we know that South Africa is facing an acute shortage of qualified doctors and other medical practitioners. For a country facing a public health problem such as serious as ours, it is way beyond comprehension why is the department is making it extremely difficult for South Africans trained abroad, and for other non-South Africans wishing to practice medicine here, to do so.

It must be noted that upon registration of this Act, which was passed and amended in 2007, the regulations that relate to the registration of health profession, was last updated in 2009. Regulation 4(e) and (g) requires that people who obtained their qualifications outside the borders of South Africa, must first present a certificate indicating that they have completed their internship in the countries where they completed their studies before they can sit on the HPCSA Board Exams.

This regulation has not been implemented since it was passed in 2009, and there is absolutely no explanation now from the HPCSA of why they think all of a sudden, the failure to implement this particular regulation will

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 69

affect the quality of doctors allowed to practice in this country. What is more sinister about this is, is that the HPCSA only alerted these prospective doctors in February that they need to go back to the countries where they trained to do their internship.

So, how do these students or these young people, and it's mainly young people, of course, I suppose who apply for work permits in this country and also to be able to get funding to be able to get to these countries and do their internship? This conduct is just pathetically the administrative, young doctors are going to be locked out of the system until they manage to do whatever they need to do, to get themselves back to the countries to where they qualify.

While this happens, almost a 1000 prospective doctors are left in limbo and who are barred by the country's regulative body from serving the people of South Africa.

While this happens, the public health system is on its knees, and because is on its knees simply because we cannot produce enough doctors for the country's health

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 70

demands. This is also because; while in KwaZulu-Natal we have a serious need of oncologists.

The action by the HPCSA has nothing to do with ensuring that we have quality medical professionals. What it is doing rather, is creating a massive stumbling block for us to take care of the health needs of South Africa. Both the legislative framework and the regulations are seriously outdated and ought to be repealed altogether and a new Act in line with the prevailing conditions of our public health challenges.

We therefore call on the Portfolio Committee on Health to urgently begin a process to develop a new Health Professionals Bill and repeal the 1974 Act. We also urge the Minister to intervene with the HPCSA and stop them from damaging the careers of so many young South Africans by invoking unworkable regulations that are damaging to our ability to look after South Africans health needs.

Mr M HLENGWA: House Chair, I appreciate the fact the Deputy Minister says that health skills are scarce skills in this country. The contradiction is that the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 71

regulations are not scarce; they are the headache and the
Bain of which inhibits young people from pursuing their
own careers. It is a scarce skills hampered by a large
scale number of regulations which are actually not in the
national interest.

We are in fact creating barriers for young people from
serving this country. If this regulation continues to be
in place, we are in fact creating a brain drain. If a
student leaves this country on a student visa and we
expect them to arrive at the country of study and then
get a work permit, for what reason do they have to come
back? What the Deputy Minister is actually saying that
people are looking for greener pastures could in fact
well be that we are creating that departure here at home
because by not creating a conducive and enabling
environment for students to come back into the country
and serve the country.

We are talking about scarce skills in South Africa
insofar as health is concerned yet we are not creating
enough spaces for students to study hence they are
compelled to go abroad. At the same time, those skills

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 72

spaces that are available have been the subject of scandals if you look at the University of KwaZulu-Natal Medical School whereby positions for studying are sold to the highest bidder, furthermore leaving people who need places in those universities unable to access them because a position in the university to study health care is for sale before you even pay the exorbitant fees of studying.

The question then is where is the seriousness in building the infrastructure to train insofar as scarce skills are concerned. Why did you close colleges of education, why did you nursing colleges? You created a problem by closing the places which trained people and then they must look for alternatives elsewhere and after acquiring those skills coming back home is a big problem.

The regulations by their nature must be fair, just and rational. As things stand now, it is not the case.

Frankly, the Health Professional Council is not acting in the national interest. We are bombarded with regulations which are desktop exercises taken by people in spinning chairs without any clue or appreciation of realities

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 73

prevailing on the ground, and imposing these on South Africans, chucking doctors out and leaving South Africans without the necessary assistance that they have.

Therefore, the powers of the Health Professional Council must be relooked at, it must be revamped and if it means overhauling the Act then we should do so because fundamentally, at the end of the day, what this does it impacts negatively on the poorest of the poor who are unable to access health care just like all of us. The scarce resources that are available are not stretched far enough to help them. It is either we shape up or ship out. We cannot be held to ransom by the Health Professional Council with their draconian regulations which are impacting negatively on young people of this country who actually don't deserve to bear the brutal brunt of this kind of behaviour. Thank you very much.

Mr A M SHAIK-EMAM: Hon House Chair let me start off by saying that I think the intervention by the Minister of Health in terms of the challenges faced by some of the medical students or the graduates that are coming to the country as a result of whether misinterpretation or

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 74

application of the law has been dealt with. I think the Minister has also met with the graduates, some of whom last week and I think that they have reached an understanding.

Let me also add that one must be very mindful. Yes, I think we should not deter these graduates from coming into the country and practising here, especially as a result of the fact that we have a shortage of medical staff in South Africa and we want to rollout the National Health Insurance, NHI, especially primary health care in the rural areas. Let me also give you an example, I know of a student that came here, failed the Board Examination three times. South African student who studied overseas failed three times and today she is practising in one of the neighbouring states. So, we must also be mindful of the fact that stringent conditions must be put in place but that does not mean that the conditions must be such that it must allow those that qualify to practice.

Hon Chairperson, the other issue that we have which is in my view, a very serious one, is that provinces in the Republic of South Africa send medical students to go and

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 75

study abroad like in Cuba. We have already had about 700 graduates, we've got another 700 that is coming and there is about almost 3000 including that 700 that are still in Cuba.

Who are these kids? These children are some of the poorest of the poor. My problem is that not a single one of them emanates from the Western Cape. Not a single medical student is being given an opportunity to go out there and become a Medical Practitioner because of the selfishness and greed. This DA-led government wants to only promote the children of the rich.

Can you imagine that hundreds of our children in the Western Cape are being deprived by the selfish DA because they refuse to send them. Do you know why? Because they want the NHI to fail; they have said it repeatedly that they want NHI to fail. [Interjections.] That's why we believe that constitutionally, amendments must be made, so, national departments and Ministers have a greater role to play when our learners are being marginalised like by DA. We can have intervention at a high level so that we are not marginalising or depriving our students

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 76

from the Western Cape, the poorest from Manenburg, Ryterwacht, Phillippi and Gugulethu from becoming doctors and serving our people. We call for that intervention, otherwise our people will continue to suffer in the hands of DA. [Time Expired.] [Applause.]

Ms C N MAJEKE: Hon Speaker and members, good afternoon. The UDM believes that the Health Professional Council of South Africa, has incorrectly applied section 4 of the regulations contained in Health Professions Act No. 56 of 1974.

We also believe that the HPCSA has contravened the Administrative Justice Act, as they have failed to give affected parties the right to a formal hearing. We understand that the training in medical fields around the world is not standardised and therefore is different from country to country. The Minister of Health must work in consultation with all stakeholders, inclusive of the affected Foreign Qualified Doctors and the HPCSA to resolve this matter urgently.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 77

Speaker, South Africa's severe doctor shortage in rural areas requires specific attention and cannot be achieved through a single mechanism. Whilst training in rural areas could increase the propensity of medical students to practice in those areas, our experience with doctors completing their community service and internship in rural areas, illustrate that this not sufficient.

This problem will likely be best addressed through a combination of models that include; the affinity model, the practice-characteristic model, the economic incentive model and the indenture model.

The competition and applied economics report, commissioned by the Hospital Association of South Africa in August 2015, found that in 2013, South Africa had 60 doctors per 100 000 citizens, whilst the world average was sitting at 152 doctors per 100 000 citizens. The effect of this shortage is already a negative factor in the rolling out of the National Health Insurance plan.

Minister, the UDM believes that your plan to triple the number of medical graduates to at least 3 600 doctors per

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 78

year, may be frustrated by the delay in the placement of medical graduates in public hospitals. Whilst provinces have the statutory obligation to allocate funds and place medical graduates at hospitals, the reality is that there are provinces which are falling far behind on this programme.

According to the SA Medical Association statement, published in November 2017, the number of student doctors eligible for internship in 2018 exceeded the available pool of funded posts in the country.

Accordingly, we invite the Minister to take advantage of the recent R61 billion increase in the Health budget, monitor provincial budgets, their allocation and expenditure against the priorities of our public health and to ensure that the problem of the interns is not allowed to continue unabated. Thank you.

Mr W W WESSELS: House Chair, let's get to the bottom of the problem. The problem is that we have a critical shortage of medical doctors in South Africa, a mere 25 medical officers per 100 000 South Africans. That is

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 79

the problem. Then we have limited places in our medical schools. We have only have 1 900 places available for first-year students to study medicine. The unfair admissions system at medical schools is a further problem.

How does government try and address this? Firstly, they try and completely obstruct South Africans who do go and study in foreign countries and want to come back to South Africa to make a contribution here from studying through the application and enforcement of a regulation that is 10 years overdue. Then, they also try and address the problem by sending students to Cuba to study, spending billions of rand. In response to the hon Singh's member's statement in this House, the Minister said, in an effort to defend the enforcement of this regulation, that all medical training is not universal.

That is true, but let us then take Cuba as an example. It is a fact that when you study in Cuba, you are not prepared to address South African medical problems because you are then not competent to do a Caesarean section. You are not competent to apply safe anaesthetics

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 80

- to give safe anaesthetics - or to treat a fracture or complicated tuberculosis and HIV/Aids patients.

The government spends billions of rand on sending South Africans to Cuba rather than on expanding the medical programmes in South Africa. The hon Kopane asked the question: Why? Let me try and assist. It is not a logical answer. The answer is a nonsensical, historical loyalty to Cuba that outweighs the best interests of South Africans. [Interjections.] If you stop with your historical loyalty and actually invest in expanding the medical programmes, there will be more medical graduates who can address the problems in South Africa. This problem is not logic based; it is based on historical loyalty.

We need an actual responsible government that addresses the medical problems in South Africa. People are dying at the hands of Cuban doctors - Cuban graduates - who are not prepared for the problems in our rural areas.

[Interjections.] People are suffering.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 81

Mr H P CHAUKE: Chair, on a point of order: I rise on Rule 92. It is not parliamentary for a member to mislead the House. No one has died because of Cuban doctors. In fact, for your information, the superintendent of a hospital in Vryburg, the chief superintendent, studied in Cuba.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Alright, hon member, you are now debating. I think I got your initial point. [Interjections.] Hon member, don't mislead the House, as they say. Continue with your speech. I don't have the facts.

Dr C P MULDER: House Chair ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): I don't have the facts. I will check the facts on what you have said.

Mr W W WESSELS: Chairperson, I am not misleading the House. The fact is ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): I will check the facts on what you have said.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 82

Dr C P MULDER: Chairperson, it is not a point of order to declare that somebody misleads the House. If those are points of order, we will have to take them against those guys all the time.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): There is no point of order in what was said by the hon member. That is what I am saying. Continue, hon Wessels.

Mr W W WESSELS: House Chair, the hon member should visit clinics. He shouldn't just sit here. He should go out and visit clinics. He should read the Treatment Action Campaign's reports on how people are suffering because doctors are not necessarily trained. That is the point.

Mr H P CHAUKE: No, Chairperson. A member cannot make such insinuations that I must visit clinics. I go to clinics more than you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon member, that is not a point of order.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 83

Mr H P CHAUKE: You have never been to any clinic in your life. Which clinics do you know?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon member, I am going to switch off your microphone!

Mr H P CHAUKE: It is a lie.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): That is not a point of order. That is a point of debate which I think that can be taken somewhere. Continue, hon member. You are left with one second.

Mr W W WESSELS: House Chair, litigation will solve this problem, and taxpayers' money will have to be spent in court because the government is not responsible. I thank you. [Time expired.] [Applause.]

Mr H P CHAUKE: Chair, I just want to bring to your attention that it would really not be correct to breed young parliamentarians of such a nature.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 84

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon member, that is not ... let's not waste the time of this House. You know what a point of order is, and that is not correct.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: House Chair, I would like to draw the member's attention to Rule 85. There are no young parliamentarians in this House, just as there are no old parliamentarians in this House. We are only parliamentarians.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Thank you, hon member. That is why I ruled that it is not a point of order. It is not a point of order. It is not registered or recorded anywhere. Continue, hon Carter.

Dr C P MULDER: Chairperson, I rise on a point of order: The hon Chauke is supposed to be a Whip. I suggest that he attends a workshop or something because he doesn't understand ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon member, that is not a point of order either. It is a point of debate again. Continue, hon Carter.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 85

Ms D CARTER: Chairperson, it is just a pity that I am not in my bench, so I cannot rise on a point of order. The fact of the matter is that it is good for us to have young parliamentarians in this House, and the people on the right-hand side can be extremely jealous for having to read their speeches whilst a young parliamentarian stands up and tells us exactly what is happening.

[Interjections.]

Several questions require clear and unambiguous answers in this sad and worrying situation. The first is why a regulation first promulgated in 2009 and never enforced was suddenly imposed when returning medical students were advised last month that they must conduct their internship in the foreign country in which they had studied. [Interjections.] Some of these graduates had applied in 2016 and 2017 and had been accepted to write the board exam in May this year but have now received advice that they would not be able to because of the regulation.

These are young, willing, able, and patriotic South Africans who have, at great personal and financial

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 86

expense them and their families, and some the poorest of the poor, sought to follow their vocational calling by studying medicine outside of the country, given the limited capacity of our country's medical schools. Now, after they have completed their studies, we are intent on refusing them an internship in our hospital system. It is unconscionable!

It is no state secret that we do not have enough doctors in our public health system. Brazil, which has a similar GDP per capita, has two doctors for every 1 000, whereas we have less than one. Apart from the skewed admissions policies, the problem lies in our production line. Our medical schools simply do not have the capacity to produce sufficient doctors. Each of our eight institutions produces some 200 doctors per year - simply not enough to serve a population of over 50 million South Africans.

Our local graduates are not assured of internship placement either. A delayed 2018 process for the placement of internships, which initially saw only 1 400 out of 1 900 placements, prompted a final year

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 87

medical student at Wits University to lament the following: Do I want to be a doctor in South Africa anymore? I am tired - emotionally, physically, and mentally tired. The worst part is I haven't even started working yet. I am now breaking the silence in the hope that people take note of the serious problems regarding the nature of the administration of health in this country currently.

On behalf of the people, we say to the Minister in his absence that there must be a pragmatic resolution to the issue of the internship of those South African medical students who had little alternative but to study overseas. Furthermore, the lack of medical school capacity and public hospital internship capacity to meet the legitimate needs of our society must be resolved.

Thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): As we are on the subject of health, I just want to request the Service Staff not to add more patients to our hospitals with this air conditioning. I have had many complaints about the air conditioning. Thank you. [Laughter.] [Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 88

Ms C DUDLEY: Chairperson, the ACDP welcomes the assurances of the Deputy Minister that these problems are going to be attended to and rectified. It is important to note that we are talking about South African students not foreign students, who choose to study abroad, often because quotas in South Africa do not allow for high achieving students to get into universities in South Africa to study the profession of their choice. These are not foreign students, they are South Africans.

The ACDP welcomes this opportunity to highlight the inefficiency of the HPCSA which is resulting in unethical consequences and the ACDP is appealing to the Minister of Health to urgently ensure the HPCSA is not allowed to prejudice young and aspiring doctors in this manner especially in our country that faces a dire shortage of doctors. This is a legal issue but it is also a human rights issue on many levels affecting service delivery in all communities.

An Appeal was served in the High Court; Gauteng Division on the 2nd March 2018 as the HPCSA does not provide a tribunal or internal resolution process for lay foreign

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 89

graduates This is shocking when millions of people have little or no access to the High Courts of South Africa due to the costs.

The legal argument is that the HPCSA and their examination committee are applying the wrong regulation in using section 4 against students with foreign qualifications. Section 2 governs the students with foreign qualifications as they are categorised under interns.

Section 4 governs the registration of foreign qualified doctors to be admitted as general practitioners or specialists. The use of the wrong section is causing concern and great anxiety for students with foreign qualifications in South Africa and overseas and is forcing our young graduates to abandon their calling to the people of South Africa and having to use their medical training in other countries. The HPCSA is confusing students with foreign qualifications with foreign qualified doctors applying for registration.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 90

The ACDP on behalf of affected and future students is calling for the Minister of Health to ensure these discriminatory practices within the HPCSA affecting medical graduates stop; establishment of independent commission to investigate the discriminatory practices of the HPCSA and their Examination committees; an investigation into the placement of foreign qualified graduates by the Department of Health in respect of internships and the prolonged administrative delays; the review of regulations and possible capping of the number of students going to study abroad so that ... [Time Expired]

Mr M P GALO: Hon Chairperson, as a prelude, this debate was nearly lost in translation because the main subject for this discussion refers to section 4 regulations in the Health Professions Act, which came across as confusing, in that it was the 2009 Regulations which effectively gave rise to this current impasse.

A cursory reading of these Regulations rightly justifies Mr Singh's discontentment. The Regulations prohibit returning doctors to practice in South Africa provided

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 91

that they have completed an internship programme in the country in which they have studied. In consequence, they are unable to sit for their HPCSA board exams.

There are a number overlapping interlocutors that this debate conjures up. In the very main, it underscores the country's attitude towards quality health care, which appears, by all account, dismissive.

Let me put it differently, the success of dispensing a world class NHI project is not divorced from a built skills set offered by our medical doctors. The overemphasis on technocratic requirements over national imperatives, such as the right to quality health care, is ill-advised.

It will be self-defeating, similarly, to avoid the flip side of this debate. The Gauteng Department paid a staggering R1 billion in medical malpractice in the preceding years.

If the understanding is that, medical doctors should intern in the countries in which they have graduated,

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 92

precisely because they would have been trained in line with the medical lexicon of those countries, I personally see no reason to cast aspersions on the Health Professions Councils.

We need to assign properly qualified medical doctors with a view to avert, among others, the scourge of medical malpractice.

The AIC proposes the following to arrest this impasse: the Commission on Foreign Medical Graduates should improve its international rapport with the health authorities in the country; the standard of medical studies offered abroad should be benchmarked against best international practices; the National Department of Health must establish support structures to help South African born medical doctors who studied abroad; there should be decisive leadership on whether the 2009 Regulations should be scrapped, if the Cuban experience is anything to go by. Thank you. [Time Expired.]

Mr L R MBINDA: Hon Chairperson and hon members of this House, receive my greetings. Let me welcome the debate by

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 93

the IFP as this is a very critical and important debate more especially for this house.

As the PAC we suspect that there are politics at play with the recent developments and decisions of the HPCSA Health Professions Council of South Africa.

Firstly, it is worth noting the lack of transformation in the HPCSA as there are only two black people out of a board of seven members and this for us is a problem. Like in many other sectors in our country we have a serious problem of transformation hence we from time to time find ourselves in situations where people act as if they mean well while their intentions is to perpetuate the socio-economic imbalances in our society.

As the PAC we are calling for a halt in this requirements and the related regulations until the necessary measures are put in place either through engagements with those countries they are studying at or put in place effective measures that will enable our affected students to be able to get verified and register with no red tapes in the processes.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 94

These regulations were introduced in 2009 and have not been implemented to date until the current Minister of Health effected and enforced these regulations sometime in the beginning of the year ignoring those affected.

As the PAC we are taking this on a serious light and we will be looking very close in the cases and situations affecting all our students studying abroad. I thank you

Mr M H HOUSEN: House Chairperson, the plight of these medical doctors is not a new discovery. This is, unfortunately a situation that has been prevailing in our country for many years now. Getting access to medical training in South Africa is nearly impossible for many students, and it seems like it will stay like this for decades to come.

Looking ahead we will be short of more than 2 000 doctors and about 11 000 nurses by 2020. We have had a shortage of medical practitioners in the past, we have a shortage in the present, and by current standards we will have a shortage of doctors in the future. This is because we have a government that is big on plans and conferences but short on implementation.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 95

This is posing the greatest difficult for the people we need most, young aspirant doctors. Take the story of a young student I spoke with recently from Pietermaritzburg in KwaZulu-Natal. Having received five distinctions in high school, he was rejected by almost every medical university in the country.

Determined to achieve his dreams of becoming a doctor, he applied to several countries elsewhere in the world. And he was welcomed with open arms by institutions in Mauritius in China and the Philippines.

Today he is in his last year of study and will soon qualify. But his misery does not end there, his country will not allow him to complete his clinical internship in his own country so, it seems that all his struggles will come to nothing. This is the sad reality of thousands of our young South Africans.

House Chairpersons, the plight of medical students raises a much bigger problem in our country. Their plight is merely an indication of the huge skills shortage that we have in South Africa. We are unable to attract the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 96

required skills that we need to build our economy and create jobs, which is why millions of young people are still out there, struggling to get by.

This is a direct result of our prohibitive policies and systems, coupled with our inability to manage the skills deficit in the country. Over the past few years, I have received dozens of enquiries and complaints from skilled people who struggle to secure work visas in South Africa. The costs are too prohibitive and the process is frustrating.

Four years ago, just under 2 000 foreign nationals qualified for critical skills permits to work in the country. Three years later, that figure dwindled to just over 700. It is clear that the numbers are on the declines and our ability to attract critical skills into our country is definitely fading.

We have a massive shortage of skills in the country, yet we make it extremely difficult to attract these skills from other countries into South Africa. But we are the masters at attracting unskilled immigrants. We have a

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 97

border with no fence that anyone can just walk across. An unknown number of mostly unskilled and undocumented immigrants are entering the country and are employed in labour intensive industries across South Africa.

The employment of illegal and undocumented immigrants has direct impact on our job creation abilities as a country and this is an area of focus that must be addressed. Far too many companies employ undocumented immigrants and simply pay a fine when they get caught. This is clearly an insufficient response, to a massive challenge.

Chairperson, Minister Gigaba and his department are failing in their responsibility to tighten our borders and reduce the high number of undocumented immigrants into our country. They are also ineffective in clamping down on people who employ undocumented immigrants.

Unskilled people simply walk into our country undetected while medical practitioners who want to come and work in our country have to jump over many hurdles to get a proper visa. If we continue in this direction, we will continue to have a reduced number of skilled people

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 98

coming into the country, and a higher number of unskilled foreign workers pouring in.

Now, to fix this: We must secure our borders and fix our fence, making it almost impossible for people to enter the country illegally. We must make it as easy as possible for those who wish to enter legally, with an emphasis on skilled workers, like doctors. We must also take stronger sanctions for people who employ immigrants illegally.

Madam Chair, we call upon Minister Gigaba to approach his job as a public servant of the people with the seriousness it deserves ... [Time expired.] Thank you.

Mr A F MAHLALELA: Hon Chairperson, we want to take this opportunity to also welcome the debate on the plight of the qualified medical doctors. The issue that we want to raise is that as we all know that registration of people whose qualifications are obtained outside South Africa is regulated by the Health Professional Act of 1974, especially whereby there is no country to country arrangement like the one that we know of the South

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 99

African-Cuban Medical Collaboration scholarship programme. As a result of that, the Act requires that there must be a regulation around that.

In 2009 as hon members have said, the Health Professions Council of South Africa then introduced regulations of which section 2(2) deals with these regulations of foreign qualified persons. It puts certain requirements that individuals must meet for them to be registered after they have been trained as medical doctors outside South Africa. The most important thing that we need to note is that all these years, the Health Professions Council of South Africa has not invoked this section until recently when there has been a huge increase of the number of applications of South African citizens who out of their own go out and study medicine in countries outside South Africa where arrangement of country-to-country does not exist.

And a result of that, the Health Professions Council of South Africa tried then to say how best to regulate it. We are however pleased that as a result of the challenges that has been uncounted as a result of the invocation of

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 100

this regulation, the Minister of Health has intervened and it is our understanding that the matter is currently being resolved.

The Minister of Health has engaged with the Health Professions Council of South Africa and there has been an agreement that those students, who are supposed to sit and write the board exam in May, will accordingly do so as the result of that intervention. We all know that this is as a result of the high rate of South Africans who study outside the country. Currently, there about 185 South Africans who have graduated from foreign institutions who unfortunately has not done internships and they have to undergo that process. But the misunderstanding was whether they should do the internship in the country where they trained or they can do it in South Africa.

There is an understanding that should not be the matter that prevents them to write the board exam, they can still do the internship here in South Africa. Our understanding is that there is a political will on the Minister to work together with the Health Professions

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 101

Council of South Africa in an effort to assist all those South Africans who do not meet the requirement.

There is also an understanding that this should be done in a manner that the council together with the department has been able to handle the Nelson Mandela Fidel Castro programme for training of doctors in Cuba. It is in this context that we are therefore urging the Minister and the Health Professions Council of South Africa to use this opportunity to assist these doctors in the same way they are assisting the Cuban doctors who are studying in Cuba.

However, we want to deal with the issue that some members have raised in particular the DA and other parties around the Cuban programme. It's unfortunate that the hon member from the DA is saying that as the DA they encourage a situation where they will want to see targeted foreign training doctors being increased. But as the hon Shaik has indicated, since the Cuban programme has started, the DA in the Western Cape has not sent a single student and the reason for that is because they don't want to see the poorest of the poor benefitting out of the programme.

Because the Cuban programme targets mainly the poorest of

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 102

the poor and because that is not their interest to focus on addressing the challenges that confronts ordinary people who are poor in South Africa, that is why they don't send those students there and therefore they don't allow them to benefit out of that programme. For your own information hon members because I know that you don't understand ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G BOROTO): Hon Mahlalela, please take your seat. Yes hon Kopane, what is your point order?

Ms S P KOPANE: House Chair, on a point of order: I think it is unethical to mislead the House and say that the DA does not support black people because we talk about the cost of money that the ANC is spending.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G BOROTO): Hon member that is a point of debate. I don't think that is the point of order. Continue hon member.

Mr A F MAHLALELA: No if you do support, how many have you sent to Cuba? [Interjections.] There is none so you can't

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 103

say you support something else but you are not doing something else. [Interjections.] How many doctors have you sent to Cuba? [Interjections.] You have sent nothing because you don't support the programme. So you can't stand there and say you are supporting the programme when you don't.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G BOROTO): Order hon members! I can't hear the speaker on the podium.

Mr A F MAHLALELA: So the reason why the ANC government has decided, and we are not apologetic about it, to send students to Cuba is because of the high quality of medical training that the Cubans offers, that is the most highly skilled that you can find in the world. Their approach to health care is different because it promotes disease prevention instead of training of cure which is unsustainable and undesirable in a developing country like South Africa.

As a result of the training they provide, the health outcome for your own information in Cuba is one of the best in the world. The Cubans have managed to eradicate

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 104

mother to child HIV transmission. They have eradicated malaria, TB, and they are one of the best. The population in Cuba only acquire non communicable diseases at a very late stage than any other country that you can find in the world. [Applause.]

In Cuba, doctors for your own information are not judged by the number of legs and arms amputation they make, but how they promote health to their communities. [Applause.] How they prevent disease, trauma and injuries, not on the number of amputation they have conducted. This is because of the emphasis in health education and health promotion. People in Cuba as I have indicated, only developed non communicable diseases quite late in their life. This is precisely why we are sending students to Cuba so that we are able to implement the Cuban model of primary health care because we are engaging on the re-engineering of primary health care. [Applause.]

We currently have more than 2800 students in Cuba that are doing primary health care and more than 600 have graduated. They are deployed in the deep rural areas where most of the doctors who qualified in South Africa

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 105

are not prepared to go and serve there. It is only the Cuban doctors because of the orientation that they received that they are prepared to go in the deep rural areas and serve our people and those are the types of the doctors that we want to see at the end of the day and not the ones that you want us to produce.

So in conclusion, what we want to raise to the Minister and the council around this matter is that we have more than five hundred and something doctors that are currently training in various countries like China, Malaysia, Mauritius, Romania, Sudan, Russia and Ukraine, we are saying lets prepare ourselves in making sure that when they come back, they are able to be easily integrated into the system in the same way we are able to do when we are implementing the Nelson Mandela Fidel Castro Scholarship programme so that we are able to make sure that we use this opportunity.

But as we do that, we must do it in accordance with the law. As we do that, we must not do short cuts. As we do that, we must not be opportunistic in everything that we do because we are dealing with doctors that must go and

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 106

work with the lives of our people. Therefore, our people deserve better doctors that have better skills that are needed in order to improve the skills and the health that the people of South Africa require.

So this is what we want to see happening at the end of the day. Therefore, we urge the council to build the necessary capacity so that as they implement these regulations, they then have the necessary capacity not to drag long time and make sure that applications are processed on time and therefore we manage to make sure that doctors are made available as we need them highly in South Africa.

We also urge the applicants as well to also co-operate with the council so that the information that the council will want they must be able to provide those necessary information and documentation so that they are easily processed and we make sure that we deliver services to our people as they need them. Thank you very much.

[Applause.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 107

Mr N SINGH: Hon Chairperson, there is a saying that I know: Every adversity, every failure, every heartache carries with it the seed of an equal or greater benefit. I think today, we, as hon Members of Parliament have found that opportunity in the adversity of some students who are being denied the opportunity to write an exam in May.

I want to immediately thank the hon Deputy Minister for bringing a round-one victory. At least those students will now be able to write, with certainty, their board examinations in May.

As I said, this debate has allowed us to broaden our horizons, not to only deal with those students but to deal with the broader picture of health care provision in South Africa.

I want to thank all hon members who participated because I think that we are ad idem on the fact that South Africans deserve quality health care by quality, trained professionals. That is something that we all agree on.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 108

Hon Deputy Minister, I think what we need to do is to provide a directory of accredited institutions from around the world that will be easily acceptable. We know that some of our parents are in the habit of sending our learners to institutions that may be suspect. We have suspect institutions here - hon Naledi Pandor can tell us about it - in the higher education sector. Some of the private institutions are not accredited.

So, let us provide a directory of accredited institutions from around the world, so that parents know exactly where they send the students to.

However, we must remember that the Health Professions Council of South Africa, HPCSA, is established by an Act of Parliament. It follows regulations approved by this Parliament. What this debate behoves us to do is to continue our discussion, so that interns ... We are also having a problem with South African qualified medical students. We can deal with that situation. Hon Deputy Minister, you need to set up a forum, so that we can continue to engage with all affected parties in this regard.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 109

Finally, these students are going abroad to study, not out of choice but because of limited spaces. We, in this government, will not be able to afford building more medical institutions. We have done one recently. There are people in the private sector who are willing to come in with a private-public partnership. Why doesn't the Office of the Presidency call for requests for proposals in that regard and see what they can come up with?

There must be conditionality, which can include that, if we agree to establish this facility, then x-number of students must be given free tuition from the first year until the time they qualify.

So, these are innovative ways in which we can ensure that we have more facilities available in our country, so that these students don't have to travel abroad but study here in their own country.

Finally, I want to thank the Legal Resource Centre, Mr Suresh Naidoo, ... [Time expired.] ... for their input that they gave me. Thank you to all hon members.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 110

CAPE TOWN CYCLE TOUR

(Draft Resolution)

Ms N R MOKOTO: Chairperson, I move without notice:

That the House -

- (1) notes that South African, Nolan Hoffman, secured first place in the Cape Town Cycle Tour, for the third time in his career on Sunday 1 March 2018;
- (2) understands that he finished in a time of 2:37:30, closely followed by New Zealander, Sam Gaze, in second place, and another local, Reynard Butler, in third place;
- (3) recalls that the 40th edition of the iconic race was once again packed with 35 000 cyclists;
- (4) also notes the death of three people, one cyclist who succumbed to his wounds at the scene of a pile-up with other cyclists at the base of

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 111

Wynberg Hill, and a second one who is suspected to have experienced a heart attack, as well as a Rotary marshal who was stationed towards the end of the 109 km race;

(5) conveys condolences to the families of the deceased; and

(6) congratulates Hoffman on his splendid performance.

Agreed to.

THE SUCCESSFUL LAUNCH OF PROJECT NALEDI

(Draft Resolution)

Mr R W T CHANCE: Chairperson, I move without notice:

That the House –

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 112

- (1) notes that on Saturday 17 February, Project Naledi was successfully launched at the Soweto Equestrian Centre in Moroka, Soweto;
- (2) further notes that Project Naledi is a partnership between international law firm Pinsent Masons, the Soweto Equestrian Centre, Soweto Cricket Club and Sir Ramabitsa Education Programme;
- (3) takes cognisance of the fact that the project has already enrolled over 200 youngsters who are receiving extra lessons in Mathematics, Accounting, English and Science, to better equip them for the world of work;
- (4) congratulates the local community members who initiated this programme, based on a firm commitment to improve the life chances of their young people;

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 113

- (5) acknowledges the important role Pinsent Masons is playing by providing funds, resources and networking opportunities;
- (6) further acknowledges that this epitomises the sort of partnership President Ramaphosa called for in his state of the nation address; and
- (7) encourages the establishment of other similar partnerships in communities throughout South Africa, to build trust, collaboration and work towards the betterment of the lives of millions of South Africans who deserve better than they have experienced under 24 years of ANC government.

In the light of the objection, the motion without notice will become a notice of a motion.

A LACK OF CLEAN RUNNING WATER IN MTUBATUBA, KWAZULU-NATAL

(Draft Resolution)

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 114

Ms N NOLUTSHUNGU: Chairperson, I move without notice:

That the House -

- (1) notes that the residents of Ward 9 and KwaMsane in Mtubatuba, KwaZulu-Natal have been without clean running water for over two years;
- (2) further notes that thousands of people have been affected as a result of a lack of clean running water;
- (3) acknowledges that the boreholes that were installed remain dry and are now white elephants, as not even a single drop has come out of these taps;
- (4) understands that, instead, delivery of water by water trucks is used as a cash cow for "tenderpreneurs", while there are practical and sustainable solutions;

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 115

(5) realises that whenever these water trucks arrive, which is not often, residents of Mtubatuba have to get up as early as 2:00 in the morning to ensure that they get water;

(6) recognises that people have gotten sick and died in the past, because of a lack of clean water;

(7) further recognises that the money spent on these boreholes was fruitless and wasteful expenditure; and

(8) calls on the Portfolio Committee on Water and Sanitation to investigate the failure to deliver water to the Mtubatuba Municipality.

Agreed to.

RWANDA STRUCK BY LIGHTNING

(Draft Resolution)

Chief Z M D MANDELA: Chairperson, I move without notice:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 116

That the House –

- (1) notes that at least 16 people were killed and dozens more injured after lightning struck a Seventh-day Adventist church in Rwanda on Saturday, 10 March 2018;
- (2) understands that 14 victims were killed on the spot, and two others died later as a result of their injuries, while 140 people were rushed to hospital and district health centres;
- (3) realises that a similar accident took place on Friday, 9 March 2018, when lightning struck a group of 18 students, killing one of them;
- (4) remembers that in 2016, lightning killed 30 people, injured 61 and killed 48 livestock;
- (5) recognises that lightning strikes are frequent across Rwanda, which has many hills and mountains, and that the country's police records

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 117

a number of human and livestock deaths each year;
and

- (6) conveys its condolences to the government of Rwanda and families of the deceased, and wishes the injured churchgoers a speedy recovery.

Agreed to.

COST TO COMMUNICATE IN SOUTH AFRICA

(Draft Resolution)

Mr N SINGH: Chairperson, I move without notice:

That the House –

- (1) notes that the cost to communicate in South Africa remains amongst the highest in the world;
- (2) further notes that this stifles economic growth and contributes to the high levels of youth unemployment;

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 118

- (3) acknowledges that in August last year, the Competition Commission officially launched an inquiry into the high price of data services in South Africa, which is yet to be finalised;
- (4) further acknowledges that South Africa's mobile operators have started to make small efforts to reduce the cost of data, however, this is not nearly enough;
- (5) recognises that there are features of South Africa's telecommunications market that prevent, distort or restrict competition;
- (6) calls on government to expedite and increase efforts to ensure that data costs are significantly reduced without further delays; and
- (7) further recognises that all South Africans must be given access to affordable means of communications, which should be considered a basic human right.

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 119

Agreed to.

THE DEATH OF FOUR CHILDREN OF THE MBHELE FAMILY

(Draft Resolution)

Mr S C MNCWABE: Chairperson, I move without notice:

That the House –

- (1) notes that last year, four children of the Mbhele family in Port Edward in KwaZulu-Natal were hacked to death whilst their mother went to drink at the tavern next to her house;
- (2) further notes that it was reported that the mother of these children left them alone to drink beer at the tavern, from Friday to Sunday;
- (3) recognises that the uncle of the children was arrested last Friday and is due to appear in court in connection with the brutal killing of the children;

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 120

- (4) further recognises that this breakthrough happened after an investigation which started in September last year; and
- (5) congratulates the South African Police Service for the breakthrough, and hopes that the court will find the truth behind this heinous crime and brutal murder of the children.

Agreed to.

**OUTSTANDING PERFORMANCE BY THE PROTEAS ON 2ND SUNFOIL
TEST**

(Draft Resolution)

Ms M R MOKOTO: Chairperson, the ANC moves without notice:

That the House -

- (1) notes the great performance by the Proteas during day three of the second 2018 Sunfoil Test match between South Africa and Australia

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 121

at St George's Park, Port Elizabeth on 11 March 2018;

- (2) acknowledges that the brilliance of A B de Villiers and stunning performance of Kagiso Rabada ensured that the Proteas levelled the series;
- (3) remembers that the 34-year-old de Villiers was the mainstay of the Proteas innings, with a superb unbeaten 126;
- (4) further remembers that it was his 22nd test century and first since returning from his sabbatical;
- (5) understands that fast bowler, Rabada, made a key breakthrough when he bowled David Warner for 13 during a hostile opening spell in which his fastest delivery was timed at 151 km per hour;

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 122

- (6) further understands that Rabada struck again when he had Shaun Marsh caught behind for one, with the second ball after tea;
- (7) recalls that Australia's fast bowlers, who had a heavy workload on the previous day, wilted under an assault in which De Villiers played strokes that were sometimes breathtaking; and
- (8) congratulates the Proteas on such a splendid performance.

Agreed to.

SIX POLLSMOOR ESCAPEES REARRESTED

(Draft Resolution)

Mr M L W FILTANE: Hon Chair, I move without notice on behalf of the UDM:

That the House -

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 123

- (1) notes that on 12 March 2018 six inmates escaped from the Pollsmoor correctional facility in Cape Town;
- (2) further notes that one of the prisoners who escaped is serving a 12-year sentence for attempted murder;
- (3) applauds the swift action of the SA Police Service, SAPS, that has resulted in the rearrested of five of the six escaped inmates;
- (4) calls on the SAPS and local law enforcement agencies to continue their diligence work of recapturing the remaining inmate as he may pose a direct and immediate threat to society;
- (5) further calls on the Department of Public Works together with the Department of Correctional Services to do an on site investigation of the security of all prisons, starting with Pollsmoor, to secure and upgrade these facilities where necessary; and

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 124

- (6) urges members of the public to be vigilant and come forward with any information that may lead to the recapture of the remaining inmate.

Agreed to.

SOCIAL SECTOR IN DIRE SITUATION

(Draft Resolution)

Ms B S MASANGO: Chair, I hereby move on behalf of the DA:

That this House -

- (1) notes the National Development Plan states that government needs to increase the supplier of four categories of Social Service professionals to 55 000 to respond to the demand appropriate basic Social Welfare Services that is social workers, auxiliary or assistant social workers, community development workers and child and youth care workers;

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 125

- (2) further notes that this was affirmed at the first Social Work Indaba held on 24-26 March 2015, around which time the department mentioned that there were 16 500 social workers in South Africa falling far below the target of 55 000 by 2030;
- (3) recognises that the cry by Department of Social Development trained social work graduates, who have not been absorbed into the system with the numbers sitting at over 3 800. The numbers of those who are in the pipeline is 4 800;
- (4) acknowledges that this is in a country with significant levels of social fragmentation, unacceptable levels of social alienation and the breakdown of social institutions and increase levels of vulnerability among children, youth, women, older persons and persons with disabilities;
- (5) notes with concern that in 2018 the government does not seem to have made any strides in

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 126

addressing this dire situation facing the social sector; and

- (6) calls for an urgent absorption of the much needed social work graduates into both government and the public sector to work with the various communities who are vulnerable as a result of mainly social ills.

Ms M R MOKOTO: The ANC objects.

**TWELVE EMPLOYEES ILLEGALLY DISMISSED AT TRANSNET NGQURA
CONTAINER TERMINAL**

(Draft Resolution)

Ms N R MASHABELA: House Chair, I move on behalf of the EFF without notice:

That the House -

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 127

- (1) notes the unfair and illegal dismissal of 12 employees at the Transnet Ngqura Container Terminal in Port Elizabeth;
- (2) notes that these workers, who are all black, had been continuously racially abused and victimised at work by their white supervisor Deon Williams;
- (3) further notes that this racial victimisation and abuse included, white employees being given privileges over black employees, and black employees being compared to dogs;
- (4) acknowledges that these workers lodged grievances with management about the victimisation they were facing at the hands of Deon Williams and asked for a meeting to resolve the differences, and agreed with management that until the meeting, Mr Williams would not supervise them;

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 128

- (5) further acknowledges that the day after lodging the grievances they were once again confronted by Mr Williams, who warned the 12 workers that he is the boss, and that they would be dealt with; and that on the same day the 12 workers were suspended;
- (6) realises that a few weeks after this an illegal and unfair hearing was conducted where these 12 workers were dismissed;
- (7) recognises up until now the union representatives of these workers have done nothing to help their case, and have in fact sabotaged it by submitting papers late which saw the case being dismissed by the Labour Court;
- (8) calls on the Portfolio Committee on Public Enterprises to immediately investigate the matter, and ensure that the 12 dismissed men get reinstated immediately and Mr Williams gets fired.

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 129

Agreed to.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A G Boroto): Let's remind one another. It's 180 seconds and I have been very lenient today.

KWAZULU-NATAL ANC ELECTION CO-ORDINATOR SHOT DEAD

(Draft Resolution)

Chief Z M D MANDELA: Chair, the ANC moves without notice:

That the House -

- (1) notes with sadness the killing of an ANC elections co-ordinator in the village of Imfume in KwaZulu-Natal early on Saturday morning, 10 March 2018;
- (2) further notes that Nqobizwe Mkhize's door was kicked open at 02:30 am, and the three gunmen opened fire on him while he was in bed and in the presence of his wife;

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 130

- (3) reckons that his killing occurred on a day that marked the first round of voter registration ahead of next year's national elections;
- (4) understands that Mkhize served the party as a voting district co-ordinator responsible for the co-ordination of organisational programmes related to election mobilisation;
- (5) believes that Mkhize was a true revolutionary who served his community with dedication, and that his leadership skills and wisdom would be sorely missed;
- (6) trusts that the law enforcement authorities will do everything in their power to apprehend and bring to book Mkhize's murderers; and
- (7) conveys its heartfelt condolences to the Mkhize family and the ANC at large.

Agreed to.

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 131

CONGRATULATIONS TO DR KAY BROWN FOR HER APPOINTMENT

(Draft Resolution)

Ms M R MOKOTO: The ANC moves without notice:

That the House -

- (1) notes that Dr Kay Brown has been appointed as the chief executive officer of the Financial Fiscal Commission, FFC, with effect from 1 April 2018;
- (2) recalls that Dr Brown previously held a position as a Chief Director at the National Treasury;
- (3) recognises that Dr Brown has a wealth of experience, knowledge and expertise in comprehensive economic and fiscal governance, public policy and financial planning and systems arenas within the public sector;

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 132

- (4) believes that her appointment will reset the FFC as the economic and fiscal policy and governance knowledge-based public institution of choice for the South African state and society;
- (5) further believes that she will also bring professional integrity into the macroeconomic, social, fiscal policy advice to all sectors of government and society, and is looking forward to her joining the FFC; and
- (6) wishes her well in her new leadership and professional position of responsibility.

Agreed to.

ANASO JOBODWANA'S 150M WIN

(Draft Resolution)

Mr Z M D MANDELA: Chairperson, I move without notice on behalf of the ANC:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 133

That that House—

- (1) congratulates Anaso Jobodwana for winning the 150m race at the Liquid Telecom Athletix Grand Prix event in Pretoria on Thursday night, 8 March 2018;
- (2) notes that Anaso Jobodwana comfortably beat the world 100m champion, Justin Gatlin, who was regarded as the favourite in the race;
- (3) further notes that Gatlin, an American, was regarded as the favourite, despite the fact that 150m was an unfamiliar distance for him;
- (4) also notes that Gatlin trailed in the fourth position, as Roscoe Engel came through in second position and Luxolo Adams in third;
- (5) respects Anaso's guts to withstand the pressure of being seen as the underdog to America's Gatlin and by proving the speculators wrong by winning the race;

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 134

(6) commends Anaso on his sterling performance and achievement in that race; and

(7) wishes him more success in his future endeavours.

Agreed to.

HANDING OVER OF POQO MARTYR REMAINS

(Draft Resolution)

Mr L R MBINDA: Chairperson, I move on behalf of the PAC:

That this House –

(1) notes that on 21 March, during Sharpeville Day commemorations, the Department of Justice will be handing over 17 human remains of the Poqo martyrs who were killed by the racist regime in 1967;

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 135

- (2) further notes that these Poqo martyrs fought against the then SA Defence Force and the British Army with self-made weapons;
- (3) recognises that the commander of these martyrs was Mr Nontasi Tshweni from a village called Nyamankulu, in the area of Nququhu administration; and
- (4) recognises the role played by these heroes and heroines in the liberation of our mankind.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Thank you, hon Mbinda, but there is a process in this Parliament that all motions without notice should be circulated for other parties to agree to, or not. As such, I am not going to put the question. I am sorry.

SORRY STATE OF HEALTH DEPARTMENT IN NORTH WEST

(Draft Resolution)

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 136

Ms S P KOPANE: House Chair, I move without notice on behalf of the DA:

That the House -

- (1) notes the mismanagement of finance and questionably awarded tenders in the Department of Health in the North West province;
- (2) further notes the department's lack of planning, general mismanagement and lack of resources and maintenance at public hospitals and clinics in the North West province;
- (3) acknowledges the underresourcing of public hospitals and clinics, which has led to the equipment shortages and drastic understaffing in operating theatres, psychiatry, oncology and emergency services across the provinces;
- (4) takes cognisance of the poor state and lack of maintenance in wards, especially those that

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 137

care for the mentally challenged patients,
maternity and neonatal care;

(5) condemns the mismanagement of funding, which has resulted in the lack of linen and basic amenities, as well as the poor food quality for ailing patients; and

(6) calls on the Minister of Health to take steps to intervene in order to rectify the gross mismanagement of finances by the Department of Health in the North West province.

Agreed to.

Mr N SINGH: Hon Chairperson, I rise on a point of order in terms of Rule 92, to refer to Rule 132, on statements by members: Earlier on, I think for the record, you said you'd give us 180 seconds. It's 90 seconds, ma'am ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Oh!

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 138

Mr N SINGH: ... and I think we need to correct that, ma'am. Thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Thank you! You are always alert. Thank you for that.

ALLEGED INSULTING OF THE HON FILTANE

(Ruling)

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon members, on Wednesday, 7 March 2018, while the Deputy Minister of Home Affairs was answering Questions for Oral Reply, Ms Mente rose on a point of order, alleging that the Deputy Minister had insulted Mr Filtane by saying he is unintelligent. I inquired from the Deputy Minister whether she had made such remarks, as alleged by the hon Ms Mente. She denied making such a remark, by shaking her head. I then ruled I would read the Hansard and come back with the ruling.

Having read the Unrevised Hansard, I therefore rule, as follows: Rule 84 states that no member may use offensive,

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 139

abusive, insulting, disrespectful, unbecoming or unparliamentary words or language, nor offensive, unbecoming or threatening gestures. The impugned remark by the Deputy Minister stated: "Chairperson, let me just say that, at face value, the question seems quite intelligent, but it isn't."

It is my considered view that the Deputy Minister of Home Affairs did not directly impugn on the hon Mr Filtane in the terms alleged by the hon Mente but attacked the nature of the question posed by the member. I caution hon members and urge all of you to refrain from using language that is potentially derogatory or may be construed as insulting and/or impugning the dignity of other members of the House. That is my ruling.

RESCHEDULING OF MEMBERS' STATEMENTS

(Ruling)

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): I have to read another ruling here, which is supposed to be made by the Speaker. I am told I have to do it on her behalf.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 140

Hon members, last Thursday, 8 March 2018, after the concerns were raised that members of the executive were not present and therefore would not respond to statements that affected their portfolios, the House agreed that members' statements would stand over. At the time, political parties proposed that an additional slot be programmed to ensure that those members whose statements would stand over as a result of the decision not to proceed with statements would not be disadvantaged.

I will therefore be requesting the Programming Committee, when it meets on Thursday this week, to schedule an additional opportunity for members' statements with the same sequence as would have been followed on 8 March 2018, before the end of this term. This matter will also be raised in the ongoing engagement with the Leader of Government Business. Thank you very much.

[Interjections.]

Mr M WATERS: Chairperson, may I address you, please? With regard to the ruling by the Speaker, who actually wasn't in the Chair on Thursday last week, but you were, the consensus amongst all the opposition parties, as I

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 141

understand it, was that we would have a double session of members' statements, today. So, as far as the DA is concerned, we would have six members' statements instead of three and the EFF would have four instead of two. That was agreed to by consensus in the House.

So, firstly, I find this ruling by the Speaker strange; and secondly, there is no Joint Programming meeting set up before the end of the term, so I doubt that we are ever going to meet. The members' statements are current and they were written for last week. It is therefore imperative that members be allowed to deliver their members' statements in order for them to remain current, or else they are going to lose the impetus of such members' statements.

So, I would urge that we reconsider that ruling by the Speaker and we do allow members to read out their members' statements, as agreed by all political parties here last Thursday. Thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Thank you for engaging with me, hon Waters. Hon members, I am not going

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 142

to go back to what I said, but as we recall it, we said all the issues that were raised would be communicated to the Speaker. As we speak, this is the response from the Speaker, and I believe all other options that you want to have taking place will be discussed at the opportune time. As the Speaker has said, that will be on Thursday during the programming. I want to leave it at that. Thank you.

GERMANY HONOURS FORMER PRESIDENT NELSON MANDELA

(Member's Statement)

Ms M O MATSHOBA (ANC): Hon Chair, the ANC applauds Germany for her intention to honour the late anti-apartheid stalwart and former President Nelson Mandela with a personalised postal stamp, thus making him the first statesman outside of Germany to be honoured by the powerful European country. This honour is befitting, as it takes place in the year in which South Africa and the world is celebrating 100 years since the birth of the father of our nation and icon of our struggle.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 143

The world recognises the importance to pay tribute for the contribution that he made during the time-span of his life, to the struggle for freedom and the cause of building humane social relations across the globe. Let us all be inspired by the life of uTata Mandela and his generation, always remembering that ours is to emulate Madiba's legacy of selflessness, sacrifice and commitment to the realisation of his vision of a united South Africa in which all live in peace with equal rights and opportunities. I thank you. [Applause.]

MALAMALA RESTITUTION DEAL

(Member's Statement)

Mr K P ROBERTSON (DA): Chair, the South African taxpayer paid a total of R1,1 billion for the Mala Mala restitution deal, the most expensive in the South African history, yet Kgalema Motlanthe's High-level Panel and the Land Claims Court both described the deal as nonvalid. The infamous land deal was finalised three months before the last general election. Why is that?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 144

The R1,1 billion could have furnished at least a 110 restitution cases costing R10 million each and would could have thus given approximately 60 000 other beneficiaries the benefit to title ownership and ownership and access to land. Instead the EFF and the ANC have called for expropriation without compensation, despite knowing that even the most expensive land deal in South Africa's democratic history has not yielded the supposed beneficiaries with the economic freedoms envision.

The DA calls on President Ramaphosa to further investigate the High-level Panel Report on the Mala Mala land deal and have the report brought to Parliament for discussion. We the DA will not allow such flagrant spending of the taxpayers money to occur without consequences. This is another reason why South Africa cannot afford to entertain expropriation without compensation, the corruption and the lack of effective governance runs too deep. I thank you. [Applause.]

YOUNG GIRL WENT MISSING IN UGU DISTRICT IN KWAZULU-NATAL

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 145

(Member's Statement)

Ms N V MENTE (EFF): Chair, on Saturday 10 March 2018, the 10-year-old Nonjabulo Dlamini went missing around 9:00 near a spaza shop at KwaHlophe tuck shop, this is in the Ugu District in KwaZulu-Natal. She was only found in the early hours of today in an unoccupied building lying there unconsciously, brutally raped and in a pool of blood.

Our young kids are not protected especially the girl child. The young girl is admitted in Port Shepstone Hospital Intensive Care Unit, ICU. You must imagine how traumatised her mother is, as no one aspires to imagine her child going through such pain. We call on the Minister of Police and the Minister of Social Development to ensure that the perpetrators are apprehended and the young girl is assisted with counselling sessions with the parents and everyone else involved. We call on the community to assist the police to apprehend these suspects and the justice system to keep them in jail. Thank you.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 146

**SOUTH AFRICANS SHOWCASING PRODUCTS AT GHANA INTERNATIONAL
TRADE FAIR**

(Member's Statement)

Ms S R VAN SCHALKWYK (ANC): Hon Chairperson, recently South African business people showcased their products and services at the Ghana International Trade Fair, expressed satisfaction with the interest shown and the opportunity to gain access to the market in Ghana. The Department of Trade and Industry funded many of these business people, who are optimistic that they would be returning to South Africa with a significant number of deals, trade leads and orders that will result in exports to Ghana and other countries in the near future. The accounts manager of the Durban based furniture manufacturers, Home Concept; Mr Pankie Silwanyana says his company's cupboards will soon be making their way to Ghana. "It is really a great show and a very positive one."

The chief executive officer, CEO, of House of La RicMal, a wine making company, Mr Malcolm Green, expressed his

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 147

appreciation to the Departments of Trade and Industry, International Relations and Co-operation and business for making it possible for the medium-sized businesses to showcase their products outside the country. He described the international shows as important for the growth and development of the South African economy. The ANC believes that this type of market access support from government remains critical for black businesses to sustain their growth and develop their brands. I thank you, Chairperson.

MUSHROOMING OF INFORMAL SETTLEMENTS AROUND THE COUNTRY

(Member's Statement)

Mr K P SITHOLE (IFP): House Chair, we need to speak not merely in reaction, but proactively to the problems that are facing the Department of Human Settlements. The IFP has on numerous occasions expressed its concerns regarding something that all the provinces failed dismally that is to put a system in place that control and automatically prevents the mushrooming of the informal settlements.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 148

The housing issue in South Africa has become a recurring and persistent one. Informal housing structures are rapidly increasing all over the country especially in the areas crowd around City of Johannesburg, COJ, Ekurhuleni, Cape Town, eThekweni, Tshwane, Mpumalanga, North West, the West Rand and the Free State, yet there is still no department policy that deals definitely with this clearly out of hand situations.

There is also essentially a total failure of the national and provincial departments as well as municipal to effectively put a stop to this relative new phenomenon of queue jumping. It has become common knowledge that people have now resorted to jumping the queue through corrupt means in order to receive government homes through corrupt means, while many other law-abiding citizens are still waiting patiently to get their houses.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon member, please finish up.

Mr K P SITHOLE: It is unfair and, not to mention, unlawful that this situation has become the norm in which

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 149

rich people improperly and informally erect dwellings in areas which they ... [Inaudible.] I thank you. [Time expired.]

EXECUTIVE MUST ACCOUNT TO THE NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

(Member's Statement)

Dr C P MULDER (FFP): Hon Chairperson, section 55 of the Constitution deals with the powers of the National Assembly. Section 55(2) says the National Assembly must provide for mechanisms to ensure that all executive organs of state in the national sphere of government are accountable to it and (b) to maintain oversight of the exercise of national executive authority including interpretation of legislation.

Member's Statements is exactly one of those mechanisms in terms of the rules of Parliament and the National Assembly to keep the executive to account. I want to ask from the executive and any Minister is welcomed to answer: Why was not one single member of the executive present on Thursday when this was on the order for that

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 150

day? Not one single member was present on that day which basically made it impossible - it seems that that Minister wants to answer and that is good. It seems that ... [Interjections.]

IsiZulu:

UNGQONGQOSHE WEZOTHUKUTHISWA KWAMABHIZINISI AMANCANE:

Kodwa, ungangikhombi kanjalo!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order!

Dr C P MULDER: ... not one single member of the executive was present to answer in terms of what is expected in terms of the Constitution. I would like to know why that would be the case?

We had Member's Statements in the past hon Chairperson, at the beginning of the proceedings or during the day and it was moved by the ANC to the end of the day. Quite clearly it is not working at the end of the day because it seems members of the executive have other things to do.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 151

I would suggest that we either move it to the beginning of the proceedings or that we bring back the whole notion of interpellations where we can interact with the executive. I would like to know why not a single member was present last Thursday? Thank you, Ma'am.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon member, as you know that the issue of scheduling can be dealt with by the Rules Committee as well as the Programming Committee. I am sure you as a party you would be able to make that proposal in those meetings.

Dr C P MULDER: Yes. Absolutely, Ma'am, but in the meantime, I would like to know from the executive why not a single member was not in the House? [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Well, I understood your question, but I was just saying that on the other matter of scheduling, you know what the procedure is. Hon Minister, are you rising on a point of order?

The MINISTER OF SMALL BUSINESS DEVELOPMENT: It is a point of order, Chair. The hon member if by any chance, he does

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 152

not know my name; I am not that Minister, my name is Lindiwe Daphne Zulu.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Thank you, hon Minister. Order!

Dr C P MULDER: Hon member and Chairperson.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Yes.

Dr C P MULDER: I can assure the hon Minister that I am very well familiar of what her name is. I basically said that that hon member, that hon Minister and I stuck to that because that hon member was the only one that seemed to be willing to answer the question. However just now there will be other opportunities ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon Mulder, your question will be answered. What the Minister was saying is that she would rather prefer you to use her name, as opposed a reference to that and I think let us put the matter to rest.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 153

[Interjections.]

Order! Hon member at the back, be in order - yes I know who it was.

**COMMUNITIES ENCOURAGED NOT TO TAKE LAW INTO THEIR OWN
HANDS**

(Member's Statement)

Mrs V BAM-MUGWANYA: Hon Chair, the ANC calls upon the communities to engage with their public representatives regularly and discuss the issues of housing and land in order to find better solutions, and not take the law into their own hands. We strongly believe that the sporadic protests over the housing issue are not invasion escalated to vandalism, looting and burning of the Post Office building in Nyanga 112. It is believed that the protesters, mainly backyard dwellers, occupied the land belonging to the local businessmen which was earmarked for development. Illegal structures were erected on a piece of land in wards 40 and 41, but were subsequently

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 154

demolished by the City of Cape Town's antiland invasion unit which led to the actions mentioned above.

The ANC understands that the demands for land are legitimate and is a key factor in addressing the challenges of poverty, inequality and unemployment. Our people need land for housing, for farming and for businesses. We do not however, condone the use of violence when protesting for services. We respect anyone's right to protest, but the violence and malicious damage of property cannot be condoned. We call upon the city of Cape Town to address this key issue ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon member, please finish up.

Mrs V BAM-MUGWANYA: ... of our people in the Western Cape who do not have access to housing, through all the legal means available. I thank you.

2017 FOURTH QUARTER SAW SOUTH AFRICA ECONOMY EXPANDS

(Member's Statement)

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 155

Mr S H MBUNYANE (ANC): Chair, the ANC welcomes the 3,1% increase in the South African gross domestic product in the fourth quarter of 2017, as announced by the Statistician-General on Tuesday, 06 March 2018. The main contributors in this increase are largely the agriculture, forestry and fishing industry which grew by 37,5%; trade, catering and accommodation industry, grew by 4,8%; manufacturing industry and finance, grew by 4,3%; and real estate and business service increased by 2,5% among others. Moreover, the most encouraging increase has been the 1,3% increase in the real annual gross domestic product, GDP, in 2017 as compared to the 0,6% increase in 2016. This confirms that the budget GDP forecast on 1,5% for 20018, is on-site.

The ANC believes that this good story augur well with its commitment to work with the stakeholders to create jobs for the people of South Africa, in particular the youth. The ANC remains committed to the agenda of radical transformation of the South African economy as part of the resolution of the 54th conference. I thank you, Chair.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 156

INEPT ANC GOVERNMENT EXPOSES CITIZENS' SAFETY

(Member's Statement)

Mr Z N MBHELE (DA): Chairperson, the ANC's unrelenting assaults on poor communities as a result of its misgovernance continues to intensify. Its aiding and abating of state looting, plunder and capture during the past nine years now means that the burden to plug the hole in the fiscus will be imposed on the backs of taxpayers thus affecting poor household the worst. It also means disastrous cuts to police service delivery through a reduction of at least 2 000 personnel in the fixed establishment of the SA Police Service, SAPS. This will mean fewer offices on the ground and in stations which are already understaffed, underresourced and overstretched.

It will mean streets that are less safe and communities being overrun by criminal gangs and lawlessness as it is currently happening in the Angelo informal settlement in Ekurhuleni where a community leader, safety patroller and the DA branch chairman, Thomas Sibuya, was killed in a

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 157

fatal shooting last week Tuesday. The only solution to high crime levels is to vote the ANC out of government. [Applause.]

EASTON CAPE HEALTH CARE SERVICES IN DISARRAY

(Member's Statement)

Mr Z R XALISA (EFF): Chair, this past weekend South Africans were once again shown the gross reality of public health care in the Eastern Cape. Images of women, the old and children sleeping on the floor and on benched waiting to be assisted by the staff at the hospital, were circulated. It is such common practice to wait at St Patrick Hospital that patients bring blankets with them to make themselves comfortable. Waiting at Home Affairs is a problem in itself. To expect sick and dying patients to wait for hours or even days is criminal.

Unfortunately, waiting for such period is a norm and not an exception in public hospitals across the Eastern Cape.

St Patrick Hospital forms part of the Alfred Nzo District Municipality which, is and always, has been the lowest

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 158

spending district in term of the health care spending per capita in the entire country. In nearly all health care indicators, the Alfred Nzo District consistently performs the worst. It is therefore not a surprise to find patients waiting for so long that they have to bring their bedding with to the hospital. But it is very saddening and reminder of how the ANC failed our people.

KWAMBONAMBI COMMUNITY RECEIVES LIBRARY FACILITY

(Member's Statement)

Mr E KEKANA (ANC): Chairperson, the ANC-led government is making good strides towards realising the ultimate goal of the national democratic society that will ensure that every child acquires the necessary skills that she or he will need in the future to build a healthy nation. The ANC therefore welcomes the official handover of the mobile library to the community of KwaMbonambi on 09 March 2018 in KwaZulu-Natal by the Minister of Arts and Culture, Mr Nathi Mthethwa. As the ANC we recognise the right of people to knowledge, the right of a child to access education, the right to equality in access to

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 159

knowledge so that it is not the domain of the rich, but also empowers the poor.

We strongly believe that this facility is going to assist the community of KwaMbonambi, especially the schools in the area to do their work effectively. We are of the view that libraries help in building dreams for the youth, instilling in them the belief that the sky is the limit. Possibilities are endless when you open the doors to reading. The opening of this library will go a long way in encouraging the youth to see a brighter future. The ANC calls for the community... [Time expired.]

MONUMENT FOR PAC POQO FIGHTERS BUILT

(Member's Statement)

Mr L R MBINDA (PAC): Hon Chair, the PAC again wish to acknowledge the role played by the National Prosecuting Authority, NPA, and the Department of Justice in connecting families of the deceased martyrs who were killed by the then racist regime. These 17 martyrs were among the 200 Poqo fighters who were hanged by the white

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 160

minority regime for fighting for the restoration of their land.

The unveiling of the monument and handing over of their human remains on 21 March, will remind the Africans of the brutality instituted by the white minority regime. It is important for the beneficiaries of the deceased to be taken care of as they are currently living in destitute with no water, sanitation, shelter, etc, after the supreme sacrifices paid by their loved ones. Thank you.

SOUTH AFRICA EXPANDS TRADING MUSCLES TO MOZAMBIQUE

(Member's Statement)

Mr A J WILLIAMS (ANC): House Chair, the Department of Trade and Industry must be commended for the proactive approach in taking South Africa's black industrialists on a trade mission to explore trade and investment opportunities to Mozambique. In so doing, we ensure that black industrialists participate in intra-Africa trade opportunities, and forging networks and partnerships with relevant businesses and industry associations.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 161

Mozambique forms part of the top five South African partners on the continent and is one of several missions that the department has invested in to ensure that black industrialists participate. It is imperative that South Africa intensifies and strengthen its relations, especially in the area of economic co-operation and investment. The ANC believes that this initiative should be encouraged and emulated by other Southern African Development Community, SADC, countries and in so doing, contribute to the African agenda for industrialisation and regional integration for sustainable and inclusive development. Thank you.

RESERVE BANK SPOTS BREACH OF ACT BY MUNICIPALITIES

(Member's Statement)

Ms K J MILEHAM (DA): Chairperson, on top of the financial crisis faced by many municipalities, it is now clear that they are flouting the Municipal Finance Management Act by depositing funds with the VBS Mutual Bank. Section 7(3) of the Municipal Finance Management Act, MFMA, states that:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 162

A municipality may not open a bank account with an institution not registered as a bank in terms of the Banks Act

The VBS Mutual Bank is registered in terms of the Mutual Banks Act, and not the Banks Act. This raises questions about the actions of both the municipal officials and the staff of the VBS Mutual Bank who accepted the deposits.

More significantly however, it brings in to question why this matter has been allowed to drag on since it was brought to the attention of the Minister of Finance in October 2016. The number of depositors from the municipalities has skyrocketed from two municipalities in June 2016, to 21 at the last count according to the Governor of the Reserve Bank. So, where is the oversight from the National Treasury? Why did it take until August 2017 for the Treasury to issue an instruction to municipalities to withdraw their funds from the VBS Mutual Bank?

We commend the decisive actions taken by the SA Reserve Bank to protect the funds of both municipalities and

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 163

individual depositors. Both the Minister of Finance and the Minister of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs need to seriously jerk up their oversights of municipal finances and municipal officials. Thank you.

[Applause.]

ABALONE POACHERS NABBED

(Member's Statement)

Ms A TUCK (ANC): Chairperson, the arrest by the Hawks of 16 people in various parts of the Overberg who are thought to be linked to an illegal abalone syndicate, should be commended. The suspects were apprehended on Tuesday last week as the clampdown on the illegal abalone trade is intensifying. The ANC is very disturbed that nine cops and two officials from the Department of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries were among a ring of 17 people arrested on charges of corruption and poaching. The accused officials are facing seven charges which include racketeering, theft, defeating the ends of justice and corruption. The massive breakthrough follows a two-year investigation by the Hawks, the Asset

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 164

Forfeiture Unit, the Department of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries, DAFF, Tactical Response Team, TRT, and the Task Team.

It is believed that the DAFF officials allegedly aided abalone poachers by selling back abalone seized during their daily routine and were further involved in ensuring illegal abalone shipments.

During the arrests, an undisclosed amount of cash was recovered at the premises of one of the suspects, while in another, an illegal firearm was recovered. We commend the Hawks for their swift action in arresting the officials who were not only corrupt but had also brought the department into disrepute. The arrest is a huge breakthrough for authorities in protecting South Africa's valuable perlemoen industry. [Time expired.]

SOUTH AFRICANS SHOWCASING PRODUCTS AT GHANA INTERNATIONAL

TRADE FAIR

(MINISTERS' RESPONSES)

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 165

The MINISTER OF TRADE AND INDUSTRY: Chairperson, I want to just thank the hon Williams and the Van Schalkwyk for their statements about the trade missions and the participants who were going there. The hon Williams is quite right to point out that the support for black industrialist has to reach beyond simply providing them with a financially incentives or with loans to support their businesses.

Access to markets is a critical at this stage including access to markets in the region. We started off by taking the number of the beneficiaries of the black industrialists programme to Namibia and there was a success there. I can say that there were nine black economic empowerment, BEE, companies that went on a mission to Mozambique, and that companies in the rail industry and in the Agro-processing have all been invited back to go and sign agreements with their counterparts within three weeks' time. Therefore, I think there is a success there.

Last Thursday and Friday I had the privilege to lead our government's delegation to the meeting at the African

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 166

Union Ministers of Trade where we were finalising the framework agreement for the African continental free trade area. Next week on the 21st - when I have no doubt that many members on that side of the House will be at leisure enjoying a public holiday, which is in fact Human Rights Day - we will again assemble in Kigali in Rwanda, where we will be at work to conclude the adoption of that Tripartite Free Trade Area, TFTA, which I have no doubt will provide many more opportunities as the hon Van Schalwyk indicated in other parts of the continent which will be commercially and economically meaningful for the development of our country. Thank you very much.

The HOUSE CHAIR (Ms A T Didiza): Thank you very Minister Davis, and indeed and we hope you will be able to conclude that agreement. Order! Hon members, he was responding to the statement and further informing all of us about the next meeting where they will conclude, hopefully a free trade agreement at a continental level; a long issue that has been outstanding and I am sure the committee's responsible know about that. Hon Zokwana.

ABALONE POACHERS NABBED

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 167

(Minister's Response)

THE MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, FORESTRY AND FISHERIES:

House Chair, we would like to agree to the fact that agriculture has been contributing in boosting the economy, notwithstanding the challenges it has faced in the form of purple and other diseases. They believe that if we do everything, we need by the way to reflect the contribution by black farmers to the final stage of agro-processing. That is the task we need to embark on.

On the issue of Department of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries officials, we would like to say that we have not only been dealing with officials, we have been able to recoup money stolen by another company that has been taking or fisheries to the Americans. That case is still pending. We would to say that we thank the Hawks for making sure that these arrests are made.

I have just written a letter to say that all the officials in fishing industry will be requested to comply in the process of conducting a lifestyle audit. As we believe that without their participation, some of them,

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 168

not all of them, it would not have been possible for abalone to be stolen at the rate it had been, but rely upon communities along the coastal area to participate in this.

We should shout when people are stealing, whether it's big or small companies. We cannot win the battle by targeting the small flies when we leave big tigers. They believe that the DA and other will join us in this fight.

GERMANY HONOURS FORMER PRESIDENT NELSON MANDELA

(Minister's Response)

THE DEPUTY MINISTER OF INTERNATIONAL RELATIONS AND COOPERATION: Hon Chair, I rise to respond to the hon Matshoba's statement about Germany's honouring Nelson Mandela's Centenary year; and that it is our duty to emulate the examples set by Madiba. This singular honour is shared by all South Africans.

Efforts are also underway by the Department of International Relations to persuade the United Nations

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 169

General Assembly to hold a special debate when it meets later this year during which the opportunity will be provided to both the international community and heads of state to pay homage to our high icon during this centenary year of his birth.

Efforts are also underway at the United Nations Human Rights Council in Geneva where the seventeenth anniversary of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights has been celebrated; and that this celebration be held in conjunction with South Africa's celebration of the centenary year of Madiba at a high-level segment debate of this Council. Thank you.

SOUTH AFRICAN ECONOMY EXPANDS AT 2017 FOURTH QUARTER

(Minister's Response)

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT: Hon Chair, we also want to welcome the increase in the GDP, hon Mpiyane, and not for the sake of it but especially the fact that, notwithstanding that, we have lost 21 000 jobs in that quarter. In 12 months, the economy managed to

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 170

create we 1 2000 jobs of which 62% of it came from the private sector and 38% from the public sector. It is very critical that we should be appreciating this because the growth in the economy shows the confidence of the private sector in our economy, not for the sake of it but also for the creation of jobs. Of significance is the fact that Statistics SA has also indicated that the growth has even, uneven of what we thought it was a recession in the previous year. Thank you very much.

YOUNG GIRL WENT MISSING IN UGU DISTRICT IN KWAZULU-NATAL

(Minister's Response)

The MINISTER OF DEFENCE AND MILITARY VETERANS: Madam Chair, thank you hon member from the EFF for the statement on the missing girl who was found today or during the weekend. However, I think it is important for us to, as we talk and mobilise our communities, constantly engage our people about some of these matters. We increasingly discover that these children are victims to people who are known to them such as their fathers, grandfathers, uncles and neighbours. I think that is one

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 171

unfortunate thing because this also creates a situation where there is no trust amongst families because one has to tell the child to be careful of this and that, and of course it is now creating a distance between children and males family members.

The point I'm raising is that we have to continuously engage with our communities about the fact that people who commit these kinds of crime are people who are known by the community and have tendencies which are known. We need to talk about these things so that we can empower our young girls and the women in our communities.

There was a matter raised by the hon Mulder on the role of the National Assembly and its responsibility of oversight. Chair, I think I should say this, with all due respect, that members and Ministers who were not in the House on Thursday did not do this out of disrespect for the National Assembly [Interjections.] nor was it done because people undermine the authority and the oversight role played by Parliament. There may be different reasons why people were not in the House. However, I believe that this is a matter which should be taken further by

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 172

Parliament together us members of the executive so that we can the account.

However, to go back interpellations, I am not sure in what way it will help to go back it. You may have to go back and check why a decision was taken to move away interpellations to statements so that we can then find common ground on the matter. Thank you.

(Minister's Response)

The MINISTER OF JUSTICE AND CORRECTIONAL SERVICES: House Chair, let me acknowledge hon Mbinda's statement relating to the envisaged turnover with regard to the gallows project, which we launched in March 2016, which is meant to correct a wrong of the past where people who sacrificed for liberation of this country were sentenced to death by means of hanging are now being exhumed and their remains handed over to their families. I will be attending a ceremony he is referring to next week in East London.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 173

This being the Human Rights month and this year being the year of Nelson Mandela, it is opportune for us to take a moment to acknowledge the contribution that has been made selflessly by many heroes and heroines of our liberation struggle across political divides, including members of Poqo and PAC as he correctly states.

We see this as an opportunity for us to also make a small contribution in correcting the wrongs of the past as perpetrated against our people by apartheid and colonialism. I thank you.

NOTICES OF MOTION

Ms S R VAN SCHALKWYK: House Chairperson, I move on behalf of the ANC that in its next sitting:

That the House -

- (1) debates the impact and the effect of the United States decision to impose a global tariff of 25% on imports of steel and 10% on imports of

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 174

aluminium on the South African economy and the world economies.

Mr P G ATKINSON: House Chairperson, I hereby move on behalf of the DA that in its next sitting:

That the House -

- (1) debates the international experience of land expropriation without compensation in countries where this policy has been enforced and the economic impact on their economies with special reference to economic growth, job creation and its effect on private investment.

Mr N S MATIASE: House Chairperson, I rise on behalf of the EFF that in its next sitting:

That the House -

- (1) debates the need to call for an end to a system of exploitation of modern slavery called labour brokering and outsourcing that MPs, Ministers

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 175

and Deputy Ministers, who have shares in labour brokering must be named and shamed.

Mr S H MBUYANE: House Chairperson, I move on behalf of the ANC that in its next sitting:

That the House -

- (1) debates the engagements with traditional authorities and other stakeholders on the massification of asset ownership, including the provision of title deeds, which are critical for socio-economic activities to people in urban and rural communities. Thank you.

[Applause.]

Mr K P SITHOLE: House Chairperson, I move on behalf of IFP that in its next sitting:

That the House -

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 176

- (1) debates the mushrooming of informal settlements at all major cities without any proper mechanisms to put an end to it.

Mr S C MNCWABE: House Chairperson, I rise on behalf of the NFP that in its next sitting:

That the House -

- (1) debates racism in schools and ways and means to uproot it.

Ms M O MATSHOBA: House Chairperson, I move on behalf of the ANC that in its next sitting:

That the House -

- (1) debates the need to act with speed and purpose to restore state-owned enterprises as drivers of economic growth and development.

Mr M L W FILTANE: House Chairperson, I hereby move on behalf of the UDM that in its next sitting:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 177

That the House -

- (1) debates working towards an integrated and comprehensive infrastructure development strategy to fight poverty, inequality, advanced economic development and reverse the ills of unemployment.

Mr K J MILEHAM: House Chairperson, I hereby move on behalf of the DA that in its next sitting:

That the House -

- (1) debates the ongoing municipal financial crisis, the role of National Treasury and the Minister of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs to intervene in these financially dysfunctional municipalities and the lack of effective oversight over municipal finances.

Mr N M PAULSEN: House Chairperson, I rise on behalf of the EFF that in its next sitting:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 178

That the House -

- (1) debates the need to build the state and the government capacity in all spheres of the government that would lead to the abolishment of tenders.

Mr M D KEKANA: House Chairperson, I move on behalf of the ANC that in its next sitting:

That the House -

- (1) debates directing development finance institutions and state banks to give greater emphasis to employment creation, empowerment, industrial diversification and the development of small businesses and co-operatives.

[Applause.]

Ms V BAM-MUGWANYA: House Chairperson, I move on behalf of the ANC that in its next sitting:

That the House -

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 179

- (1) debates the house debates "The strengthening of a range of measures aimed at building social cohesion and a common national identity. Thank you.

Mr A J WILLIAMS: House Chairperson, I move on behalf of the ANC that in its next sitting:

That the House -

- (1) debates acting with the vigour, diligence and determination in fighting corruption, collusion and other criminal activities in the private sector. [Applause.]

Mr S J F MARAIS: House Chairperson, I move on behalf of the DA that in its next sitting:

That the House -

- (1) debates the importance of the South African National Defence for South Africa and SANDF's compliance with section 200 of the Constitution

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 MARCH 2018

Page: 180

with reference to the current organisational, structural and financial challenges facing the SANDF and potential solutions to restructure, reposition and recapitalise the SANDF to fully comply with the requirements of section 200 of the Constitution.

Ms A TUCK: House Chairperson, I move on behalf of the ANC that in its next sitting:

That the House -

- (1) debates confronting the resurgence of patriarchy and backward attitudes towards the role of women in the society.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms T Didiza): That concludes notices of motion and the business for the day. Thank you.

The House adjourned at 17:35