

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018

Page: 1

THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018

---

**PROCEEDINGS OF THE NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

---

The House met at 14:02.

The Speaker took the Chair and requested members to observe a moment of silence for prayers or meditation.

**CONCERNS ABOUT AVAILABILITY OF MINISTERS TO ANSWER  
QUESTIONS IN THE HOUSE**

(Statement by Speaker of the NA)

The SPEAKER: Hon members, during questions to Cluster 1, Peace and Security, on 7 March, a number of issues arose that I believe require clarification so that all members are clear on the procedures to be followed in terms of questions to Ministers.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 2**

I firstly wish to state that I share the concerns raised by members about the availability of Ministers to answer questions in the House. Ministers may be unable to appear before the House for a particular Question Session due to either compelling official responsibilities or personal circumstances. However, the House must be properly notified of this.

Rules 138(3) and 138(4) provide for a Minister to authorise his or her Deputy Minister to reply to a question directed at that Minister, or if a Minister and his or her Deputy are absent, for another Cabinet Minister to respond to the question.

Rule 144(1)(b) provides that a question for oral reply stands over if the Minister to whom it is addressed is not present in the Assembly when the question is called for a reply and it is not replied to by the relevant Deputy Minister or another Cabinet member on his or her behalf. So, Deputy Ministers and acting Ministers are authorised by the rules to respond to questions.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 3**

However, in light of the conflicting information as to the availability of certain Ministers, as well as the heightened tensions in the House, on request of the Whips I ruled that Questions 18, 41 and 8 stand over. These questions will be placed on the Question Paper for reply at the next Question Day when the relevant Ministers are scheduled to reply to questions.

To this end I have written to the Leader of Government Business to appeal to him to ensure that Ministers are available to carry out their obligations in the Assembly.

**ADDRESS AND REGISTRATION WEEKEND**

(Announcement)

The SPEAKER: Hon members, as we are all aware, on this weekend of 10 to 11 March the Electoral Commission is running an address and registration weekend. This weekend's activities form part of a national campaign to update the voters' roll in preparation for the 2019 elections.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 4**

I wish to take this opportunity to appeal to, and encourage all eligible South African voters to please visit their voting stations and do the appropriate thing.

This address and registration weekend is of great importance to ensure that voters are registered in the correct voting districts and are able to vote in the 2019 elections.

Hon members, I will come back to the third statement which is a ruling about the incident that took place in the House yesterday afternoon.

The first item on the Order Paper is a statement by the Minister of Health on the outbreak of listeriosis in South Africa. The hon Minister?

**STATEMENT BY THE MINISTER OF HEALTH ON THE OUTBREAK OF  
LISTERIOSIS IN SOUTH AFRICA**

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Hon Speaker, my Cabinet colleagues, Ministers and Deputy Ministers, hon members of this House, members of the public, ladies and

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 5**

gentlemen, good afternoon. First and foremost let me take this opportunity to thank you hon Speaker, for your prompt response when I made a request to make a statement on the outbreak of Listeriosis in South Africa, because this indeed is important for our country.

Members of Parliament need to have all the facts to help give clarity to their constituencies and also to help identify gaps that they may note in the legislative tools of the country, so that we do not face this type of a situation in future. Members of Parliament also need the information; I am going to impart to help dispel an avalanche of rumours that are swirling around.

Hon Speaker, Listeriosis is a disease caused by a bacterium, not a virus, but a bacterium which is called *Listeria monocytogenes*. You get it when you ingest food contaminated with this bacterium.

*Listeria monocytogenes* is widely found in nature. It can be found in the soil, water, vegetation or faeces of some animals. From these sources, it can contaminate food from four different areas. Firstly, from the food production

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 6**

site that is the farms and the abattoirs or from the food processing factories or from the food packaging sites or even from the food preparation restaurants, hotels and even individual homes.

From this food contamination, food gets into your mouth and infection takes place. This may result in three groups of symptoms and signs. Firstly, you may get flu-like illnesses that mean fever, headache, and general body pains, sometimes with vomiting, diarrhoea and stomach aches.

Secondly, you may get the infection of the bloodstream which is called septicaemia which is very deadly.

Thirdly, you can get infection of the brain and the membranes covering the brain and the spinal cord and the disease is called Meningeencephalitis.

Although anyone of us hon Speaker, can get Listeria, those who are highly vulnerable are four groups of people: firstly, pregnant women because they do not have a very strong immunity; secondly, neonates that means

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 7**

newborns in their first 28 days of life because they get these from their mothers; thirdly, elderly people above the age of 65; fourthly, people with suppressed immunity like people living with HIV and Aids, Diabetes mellitus cancer, chronic lung disease, chronic kidney disease, people on chemotherapy or people who have undergone transplants and are on immunosuppressive therapy to avoid organ rejection.

This disease occurs annually in our country and doctors typically see 60 to 80 patients per annum. This has been the case for the past 40 years.

The disease is treatable with an antibiotic called Ampicillin which is widely available in our health facilities both public and private. Nevertheless, it is a very virulent disease and hence can cause a lot of damage.

Hon Speaker, for the past 40 years, Listeriosis was not a notifiable disease in South Africa. This means that health workers did not have to inform any authority on encountering a person with the disease. Hence, there was

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 8**

no central data in any part of the country where people could refer to. For this reason, when an outbreak occurred, there was no easy way of picking it up.

The question then would be, "Why was Listeriosis not a notifiable disease in our country for the past 40 years?"

Hon Speaker, for a disease to be notifiable, in terms of the country legislations and also in terms of the International Health Regulation 2005 of the World Health Organisation, that disease needs to satisfy at least two of the five qualifying criteria: Firstly, it must be contagious or communicable moving from one person to the other, as we know Listeria does not move from one person to the other; secondly, it must spread rapidly, as you know, it never spread rapidly for the past 40 years; thirdly, it must display unexpected or unusual behaviour, Listeria never behaved unusually in the past 40 years; fourthly, if there is a risk of spill across borders and lastly, if there is a risk of travel or trade restrictions across borders. In the past 40 years Listeria never did any of these.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 9**

However, by December last year, it has become evident that *Listeria* now qualifies to be notified because at least two of the criteria were satisfied. Firstly, there was a rapid spread and secondly, there was unusual or unexpected behaviour never seen in the past 40 years. It is for this reason that the Department of Health introduced a new policy of making *Listeriosis* notifiable and this has appeared in the *Government Gazette* 41330 of 15 December 2017, meaning that from 15 December last year, *Listeria* is now a notifiable disease in South Africa.

So, how will we know that we have an outbreak in the absence of notifiability? I am sure many of you are having this question.

In July 2017, doctors from the neonatal units at Chris Hani Baragwanath and Steve Biko Academic Hospitals alerted the National Institute of Communicable Diseases, NICD, about unusually high numbers of babies with *Listeriosis*, that they were not really used to seeing because there is no notifiability data to make a conclusion, the NICD started gathering data.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 10**

They conducted all laboratories in our country under the network of 265 public laboratories under National Health Laboratory Service, NHLS. This was easy to collect because NICD is part of the National Health Laboratory Service and hence they have access to this data. They started gathering this data tracing back to 1 January 2017 and used the data to construct graphs to see the trends. For comparison, they had to do each year from 2013, in order to do a year-to-year comparison to see if 2017 deviated substantially from the other years.

Hon Speaker, the problem was encountered with private laboratories because they are not part of the NHLS, and hence NICD has no direct access to their data. Their information started trickling in only in September 2017, especially data from 2013 which they did not necessarily keep at hand because they were not obliged to do so.

By November 2017, the NICD had collected data that showed that 557 laboratories confirmed Listeriosis cases have been reported from all provinces. Most cases were found to be in Guateng at 62% followed by the Western Cape at 13% and KwaZulu-Natal at 7%. Hence the three provinces

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 11**

accounted for 82%. Sixty five per cent of the people who fell ill came from the public sector and 35% from the private sector.

Had the NICD rushed analysis of the data only from laboratories which served the public health system, then it could only have released two-thirds of the data living one-third behind which would have completely distorted our numbers. The NICD finished the analysis of data from both public and private institutions on 29 November 2017 and concluded that there is Listeria outbreak.

They then asked for a meeting with me, and I granted the meeting on 4 December and they told me about this, I decided to convene a press conference the following day, on 5 December to announce to the nation.

I want to inform this House that there is a narrative going around which is very prevalent that the outbreak started in January 2017 and we only started knowing about it in July because we were very slow. According to the data analysis, this outbreak started in June 2017 and the doctors at Chris Hani Baragwanath Hospital and Steve Biko

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 12**

Academic Hospital picked it up in July the very following month. They could not have done it faster than that.

The month of June, according to the data analysis, is the month in which Listeria laboratory confirmed cases started differing substantially from the month-to-month figures of 2013, 2014, 2015, 2016 and 2017 itself.

So, I am repeating this, according to the scientific and mathematical analysis of the data, the outbreak started in June and not January. The January confusion might have arisen because I mentioned that we were analysing data from January. Yes, we did so, because we wanted to see a year-to-year figures based on the month-to-month figures.

By the 2nd March 2018, a total of laboratory confirmed cases have reached 948. Of these 948, a total of 659 patients have been traced, with 180 unfortunately who had died.

This constitutes 27% case fatality rates, hon Speaker. Of all countries that have had Listeria outbreak the case fatality rate has always averaged 30%.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 13**

By November 2017, the NICD started analysing or performing what is called genome sequencing. This is DNA finger printing to see the relationship between organisms and infection. The DNA analysis revealed that nine sequence types or ST types were infecting patients. However, 91% of these sequence types was a sequence type called ST6. So, the scientists told us that this is the one that is driving the outbreak and when teams were going out, they were searching for *Listeria* but specifically for ST6.

While this work was going on, the NICD scientists interviewed 109 patients who suffered from *Listeria* and 85% confirmed that they had eaten ready-to-eat processed meat products, of which polony was the most common, followed by viennas, sausages and other cold meats. While still searching on Friday 12 January, nine children under the age of five presented at Chris Hani Baragwanath Hospital with febrile gastroenteritis. Stools from one of the kids isolated *Listeria monocytogenes* and it was ST6.

Environmental practitioners were dispatched to a crèche in Soweto where the kids came from. The kids had eaten

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018

Page: 14

polony from Enterprise and chicken sausages from Rainbow Foods in Sasolburg. Teams rushed to both Enterprise in Polokwane and Rainbow in Sasolburg and Listeria was found there. On 4 March 2018, midnight, NICD phoned me to tell me that the Enterprise specimens yielded ST6.

I then called the press conference on the very afternoon of 4 March, where I made an announcement after informing the factories affected. So... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, I am told you have requested to be stopped at this point, so that you have six minutes left to come back.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Can I continue and you cut my six minutes, is that allowed?

The SPEAKER: You are only now left with six minutes.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: No, can I use... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: You can continue. [Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018

Page: 15

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Alright. And you subtract it.

The SPEAKER: And use up your six minutes. Are you alright?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: No, no, I will use only one minute because I am concluding.

The SPEAKER: Alright.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: The announcement included a recall of their products and warning to avoid cold meat from everywhere because of cross contamination in retail stores.

Hon Speaker, I want to emphasise that Listeria can contaminate any food. The reason that the problem is cold meat is because Listeria is very sensitive to heat. Any other meat that is cooked, it would die, but in the cold meat it does not die and that is why because of contamination, we said people must avoid all cold meat. We are prepared to help families in whatever way including giving them information and data and advice if

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 16**

they so wish to litigate. Thank you, Speaker. I will use the other time when I respond. Thank you. [Applause.]

Ms E R WILSON: Speaker, South Africa is renowned for making records, and, in the case of listeriosis we have recorded the world's largest breakout of the listeria bacteria. This is certainly not a record to be proud of. So where did the stink in the drink water come from? Or rather where did the bacteria in polony start, and who is really responsible? The listeria monocytogenes bacteria, is found everywhere. It will be found on the cattle ranches where beef is processed for meat products, in fact probably most farms where livestock is kept. It can be found in water supplies, soil, and vegetation and in animal faeces as the Minister has alluded to.

In fact, almost the entire South African population, at some point in their lifetime, has been exposed to Listeria. Listeriosis however becomes dangerous when it contaminates food. Listeriosis is treatable, a quick course of antibiotics and in most cases, patients are then good to go. The question then arises, why are we sitting with record breaking outbreak of a disease that

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 17**

has claimed the lives of so many South Africans? What could have been done to prevent this outbreak, and what was not done to avoid it? What role has the Department of Health played in this outbreak? It is common knowledge that the Minister has announced that the source has been traced to the Enterprise processing plant in Polokwane. While I am not here to absolve the factory for the role they may have played in the loss of lives in South Africa, I question whether they are solely responsible. Are they the real source of the problem?

The National Institute for Communicable Diseases, NICD, who must be commended for their outstanding work in assisting with the investigation and role they played in tracking listeriosis and its possible source, are clear as to what needs to be done in the hygiene and monitoring of food handling plants. In the department's norms and standards document, practices with regards to monitoring of food processing factories are made quite clear, and I quote, "Environmental Health must implement an integrated food management system utilising a hazard identification and risk based approach for all food premises." It further states:

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 18**

A risk categorization process is required which uses a site specific risk assessment to determine the risk level, inspection frequency and any other food safety strategies for the safe operation of the food premises. A risk assessment should be conducted to assess conditions on the premises that may pose a threat to the health by identifying potential health hazards from the handling, preparation and storage practices assessing the likelihood of the hazard posing a risk and in food risks, estimate the severity of the consequences if harm could be caused and recommending action plans for the elimination and minimisation of hazards. And risk analysis should be done with specific focus on food handling and preparation methods, hygiene practices and environmental toxins on the premises.

These are just a few of the norms and standards for adherence in your department's 147 page recommendations. The manufacture of fast foods or ready to eat foods in the case of Enterprise is a fast turnover industry, particularly in South Africa, where the price of red meat is beyond the purse of the millions of grant recipients.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 19**

The time from process to consumption is very narrow and therefore the risks are much higher. These factories should have been inspected every three months by an environmental health inspector. But were they? Perhaps the Minister can inform us. I raise this because the responsibility of environmental health inspections was dissolved from a national level to that of municipalities, the feeding troughs of corruption. This was under your watch. The World Health Organisation stated that South Africa has only a third of the recommended environmental health inspectors. Why Minister? This has happened on your watch. 180 people have lost their lives, and one must question what role your department played and if these deaths could have been prevented. The same question was asked in the Life Esidimeni tragedy.

If quarterly inspections were done, by qualified environmental health inspectors, who are properly resourced with equipment and testing facilities, could listeriosis have been picked up at the outset? Where are the reports from these inspections, what do they say, what was tested in those factories and who analysed the

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 20**

reports? Or, was a clean bill of health granted in exchange for a few rolls of polony and viennas? Don't give us half-truths Minister and do not lay the blame on others. When last did health inspectors deal with the mini spazas which are set up outside of schools, in their hundreds? It is also amazing that other countries in the world are having an outbreak at the same time as South Africa. Are they also importing emulsifiers and "white slime" from the same places as South Africa? Can you tell us that Minister? Are your health authorities at port control doing their job and are they properly resourced? I put it to you Minister that you do not seem to know. You have blamed the problems of our failing health system at the door of the provinces and shrugged your shoulders and pleaded innocence in the Life Esidimeni and Mediosis corruption crisis. As they say, there is none so blind as he who does not see. You are accountable, you are the Minister. It is time to take your blinkers off.

You have been quick to advise us of the provinces in which these deaths have occurred. What you have not advised us, is in which hospitals and in which areas these deaths occurred. You see Minister, on Tuesday I did

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 21**

an oversight at the Mafikeng Provincial Hospital. I walked in well and left feeling sick to my stomach. The conditions were ghastly. The hospital is under resourced, dirty, mould grows on the walls, people queued for four hours in the casualties department and the boilers were not even working. New mothers sleep on the floor in the maternity wing, which is equipped for 25 babies a day but attend to between 40 and 50 babies daily.

I am quite confident when I say this, anyone arriving at the Mafikeng Provincial Hospital with listeriosis, particularly children, would likely die. Nothing works and under pressure I assure you, Minister, the likelihood would have been a misdiagnosis. This, Minister is your responsibility. The Ministry of Health and its hospitals are collapsing. Listeriosis and Life Esidimeni are tragedies, but the real tragedy is that thousands of people who are dying because of a failed health system, a health system which for many poor and vulnerable South Africans are a death sentence.

You, Minister, are the judge and the jury and you should be ashamed. I plead with South Africans to change their

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 22**

votes in 2019 and vote for a party with an outstanding health policy that will quickly ... [Applause.] rectify the failing of this government and who is committed to providing dignified healthcare to our people. Something your department, Minister, obviously does not do and I do not ... [Time expired.] Thank you. [Applause.]

Mr H P CHAUKE: Speaker, I rise on the point of order and bring to your attention that we see participation from the people in the gallery. I request you to maintain order of the House and the Rules and we will be happy. Thank you. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Yes, I would like to welcome guests in the gallery and also take the opportunity to explain that we don't expect our guests in the gallery to participate in the happenings down here. We would like you to just enjoy your presence and watch the proceedings without participating. Please, proceed hon Ntlangwini.

Ms E N NTLANGWINI: Speaker, Minister, the listeriosis outbreak should have never happened, and before we know it we would salmonella even Escherichia coli, E.coli. We

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 23**

need to have a health system and food safety system that is working. One life lost to food borne disease is one life to many.

However, Minister, we are glad that your team has worked hard around the clock to find out what exactly are the causes of listeriosis and the sources that brought so much anxiety to the country. The fact of the matter remains, over 180 people have died as a result of these unscrupulous companies who prioritise profit over the safety of people who end up consuming their products.

Many families are left with permanent scars as a result of this. What is more painful though Minister, is the highly unlikely that anyone will be held responsible for this. Because of this, it is engraved in our deoxyribonucleic acid, DNA, as South Africans, not to question transgressions of white companies. We just do not like taking them to task for corruption. In this country it is okay for white companies to flout regulations and to make profit as long as those at the receiving end are indiscreet, inappropriate and are black people.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 24**

Both Rainbow Chicken and Enterprise food must be called to come and account as to why they did not follow Hazard Analysis and Critical Control Point, HACCP, rules, why do they follow the SA government and international food safety regulations, we need to hold them accountable and they need to be prosecuted, it is not okay that 180 people have died to food borne diseases and many other things. They are just continuing as if nothing has happened. Whether it is from your department that have not followed the rules, we need to hold people accountable. If these companies were owned by black people, the DA Zionist would have been throwing their toys out of the cot and demanding accountability. But now they are quiet because Rainbow Chicken and Enterprises are owned by white people. They are not going to call for accountability but they will hold you accountable. It is time that you do your job Minister and hold these companies accountable and so should we as Parliament.

[Interjections.]

We also call on the Department of Health and the Department of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries to as a matter of urgency strengthen inspection services to a

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 25**

level where they would be able to pick up quality control transgressions quickly. We cannot leave the responsibility of controlling of our food to these white corporate only because they don't give a dime about the health and the impact of what they produce, unless that hits them hard in the pocket. As things stands, corporate are busy dishing out low quality foodstuff at exorbitant price to mainly poor black clients.

Minister, we shall continue suffering from food borne diseases because we also allow Genetically Modified Organisms, GMO, to take over our food systems. It is black people who do not have a choice, who buy what is available and cheap. Ultimately the buck stops with you Minister; it is your responsibility to ensure that our people do not eat this poison.

Minister, it starts with you. These companies have to come to Parliament and account, regardless of where they are from, we will hold them accountable because one life lost to a food borne disease is one life to many. They cannot continue our people poison. You will soon be known

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 26**

as Minister of death and health if you don't wake up.

Thank you. [Time Expired.]

Mr N SINGH: Hon Speaker, the question I ask is will it help us to say what should have done, what would have been done and use the word if? It is not going to help us. The stuck reality in front of us Madam Speaker is that 180 people have lost their lives and more are at risk of losing their lives. The question we have to ask ourselves is what is going to be done to prevent further loss of lives? And that's what we should be doing because they say hindsight is the best sight. We mustn't use hindsight to try and resolve a problem of preventing further deaths.

Hon Minister, thank you for your statement. You have told us what the cause of the outbreak is. You've told us who is responsible and where the outbreak started. It reminds me of the food and mouth disease in KwaZulu-Natal over 20 years ago. As the Department of Agriculture, and I was MEC then, we acted swiftly to isolate and prevent further contamination in that particular area and it worked. I compliment you for acting as swiftly as you did after you

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 27**

knew on 4 March. You went into action to try and do whatever you can to prevent further loss of lives.

We understand that some of this bacterium is found to have originated in a so-called, not using this as racist, white paste that is currently imported from certain foreign countries into South Africa.

We call upon the Department of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries and the Department of Health to thoroughly investigate, locate and immediately advise of the source so that necessary import restrictions can immediately be put in place. The sad thing about this is once again though; it is unfortunately our poor and most vulnerable will bear the tragic consequences of this contaminated for profit, lowest price food protein.

How many deaths must there be before we realise that the food we eat, the air we breath, the water we drink, which are what sustains us, and is essential for daily living can be the very factors that cause our deaths?

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 28**

The corporate entities involved with the spread of this bacterium into South Africa must bear the legal responsibilities and consequences of their actions. No amount of false legal poetry can absolve them from bearing prime responsibility for the deaths and continued ill-health of those affected by consuming these contagious products.

Of this there can be no doubt, and we trust that such corporate will fully cooperate with the authorities in not only isolating and determining the origins and alpha-point of this outbreak, but also in providing every assistance to those families so tragically affected by the loss of loved ones, and to those who remain ill due to this bacterium.

On behalf of IFP and my leader hon Buthelezi, we want to extend our sincere condolences to all those families who have lost their loved and we wish those who are in hospital a speedy recovery. I thank you hon Speaker.

[Time Expired.]

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 29**

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Speaker, on behalf of the NFP and my leader, Zanele Magwaza-Msibi, I extend our condolences to the families of the deceased.

Once again, Speaker, we came here to discuss a very important issue, and what I find is that instead of finding solutions, my colleagues on the left decide to start criticising government for the efforts made in a short space of time to identify the source of this bacterium. [Applause.] Let me tell you why they would do that - because they are here to protect white monopoly capital and nothing else. [Interjections.]

This particular company, it is not the first time they have done this to our people. Remember, they were previously fined R99 million for stealing money from the poor.

Mr T RAWULA: Speaker, on a point of order: The hon member should be specific about the people on the left he refers to. We are also on the left. He has to be clear. Which people on the left do you refer to, hon Shaik Emam?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018

Page: 30

The SPEAKER: Hon member, take your seat. Hon Shaik Emam, proceed.

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Speaker, I will clarify that for my colleague. I am talking my colleagues on the left - these people who represent the white monopoly capital, the DA. [Applause.]

Yes, I heard that the hon member said something about the possibility of there being other sources. Yes, you agree. With the 13% that comes from the Western Cape, let me tell you where it comes from. I have repeatedly contacted the City of Cape Town. The environment department and the officials from the municipality do not operate. If you go to all these flea markets and spaza shops they talk about, you will find contaminated goods, and you will find expired goods, and they do absolutely nothing because they don't care about the poorest of the poor. They are only here to protect the interests of the white monopoly capitalists. [Interjections.]

I agree that there must be compensation. These companies - I must agree with my EFF colleague - must be held

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 31**

liable. The arrogant attitude of Enterprise Foods, where they are saying they are not liable, must not be tolerated. They must be brought to account because at the end of the day, it is the poorest of the poor that are affected.

Look at the affected products. It is the products that affect the poorest of the poor. Does it matter to the DA? It does not. [Interjections.] What they did was come here now to try and protect the elite, their colleagues, the ones that are funding them. That is what all of them are interested in. They are not interested in the poor. They are not interested in the blacks. It is only about themselves. [Interjections.]

Speaker, I am not expecting you to respond to what I am going to say now - and you may not agree with me. Just as we have these bacteria and diseases ... that is as much as I am very suspicious and I have said it repeatedly, but where does HIV/Aids come from? The DA thrives on allegations. I want to tell you there are serious allegations: HIV/Aids was created by man to get rid of the population - the black population - in the whole of

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 32**

Africa so that they can take control of our resources.

[Applause.] That is what it is all about. Thank you very much. [Time expired.] [Applause.]

Ms C N MAJEKE: Speaker and hon members, one of the key challenges facing our food production industry is the inadequate supply and use of sufficient environmental health practitioners.

The World Health Organisation recommends one environmental health practitioner for every 10 000 people in order to optimally monitor food production processes. According to the SA Institute of Environmental Health's president Dr Selva Mudaly, South Africa has one environmental health practitioner for every 30 000 people, which is three times fewer than the recommendation by the World Health Organisation. Surely this disaster had to happen. This is one area that needs urgent intervention, both in terms of supply and usage.

Secondly, we need to develop effective, accurate, and responsive early detection systems that are far reaching. Had we had these systems in place, we would have avoided

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 33**

the large and unacceptable number of deaths as a result of listeriosis that had unsettled our nation. The problem is hygiene. This is what caused the initial outbreak of listeriosis. This includes preparation of the food, something that should be checked regularly by health practitioners.

In the same vein, we need to go back to the basics of healthy eating habits. In this regard, we call on government to include in the zero-rated food basket healthy foods including white meat. Along the same lines, government must subsidise healthy food for all its citizens. As a nation, through the assistance of government and the private sector, all South Africans should be able to access a means of organic foods.

The benefits of healthy living and eating healthily are far reaching. Healthy food is a good way to ensure the health of all citizens and, as such, the reliance on state hospitals would be much reduced. Cultivating healthy and organic food will also establish South Africa as a leader in food innovation and production, as people

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018

Page: 34

will start to deal with new and innovative ways of producing sustainable diets.

The UDM would like to express its sincere and most heartfelt condolences to the victims of the listeriosis outbreak. We call on all communities to support the families and hold government accountable for this unavoidable outbreak. I thank you.

*Afrikaans:*

Adv A DE W ALBERTS: Speaker en Minister, dit is inderdaad hartseer as mense eers moet sterf voordat daar besef word iets moet aan 'n probleem gedoen word. Dis natuurlik nie 'n nuwe toestand in u portefeulje nie. Dit het normaal geword dat mense wat in staatshospitale beland weens gebrek aan dienslewering meestal daarheen gaan om te sterf. Daar is talle voorbeelde daarvan. Dit op sig self is skokkend, maar dit is eintlik nou baie normaal.

Die siekte van roekelose dienslewering deur die ANC-regering versprei egter soos 'n virus in ons land.

Onlangs het ons die Esidimeni-tragedie gehad, en nou word

THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018

Page: 35

ons gekonfronteer met die grootste listeriosis-epidemie in wêreldgeskiedenis.

*English:*

Whilst it is very convenient to now point the finger at certain companies, it is abundantly clear there is a pattern of deaths arising and emerging from neglect and lack of service delivery on many levels of government. It is interesting that listeriosis contamination is a phenomenon only found in Third World countries. During their training, our doctors do not really focus on listeriosis, as it is historically not present in South Africa. The fact that it is now present in this country at an unprecedented level is significantly symbolic of what is wrong with this government.

It is clear that regular inspections of abattoirs and all role players in the food value chain are not taking place as it should. The fact that the inspection functions are split between the Departments of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries and Health is indicative of a lack of coherent structural planning to keep the public safe against health hazards.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018

Page: 36

*Afrikaans:*

Dan moet ons ook nog verreken dat van die proteïene wat voorkom in die vleis bestaan uit die sogenaamde wit slym of verwerkte hoender wat ingevoer word. Dit is egter baie kommerwekkend dat hierdie bestanddele nie geïnspekteer word wanneer dit ingevoer word nie. Dit is natuurlik baie sleg wanneer dit uitkom dat daar wel besmetting is. Dit is 'n gaping waarna gekyk moet word. Dié aspek moet onmiddellik aangespreek word, en die regering sal ook onmiddellik moet sorg dat meer goed opgeleide gesondheidsinspekteurs aangestel word.

*English:*

In general, the ANC-led government will have to ensure increased quality service delivery, or we will face more epidemics in future and break international records for all the wrong reasons. Thank you.

Rev K R J MESHOE: Speaker, hon members, the ACDP wants to thank the Minister for his statement on this very serious matter. We appreciate the efforts by his department to keep the public alert of the threat, and to be informed about the progress made in narrowing down the source of

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 37**

the world's deadliest outbreak of listeriosis, which is said to particularly affect those with weakened immune systems, the elderly, infants, pregnant women and their unborn babies.

Our thoughts and prayers go to the families and friends of all those who have lost their loved ones as a result of the infection. We also wish all those who are still ill after ingesting contaminated food products a speedy recovery.

The department's decision to recall products suspected of being contaminated from the entire distribution networks of the manufacturers, both nationally and internationally, is welcomed. A thorough investigation must be made to ensure that the extent and tragedy of this outbreak never occurs again.

While the ACDP is relieved that a breakthrough has finally been made, we are deeply concerned that the food safety standards of some South African manufacturers is well below par. This is totally unacceptable.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 38**

The department must ensure that more environmental health inspectors are employed to do spot checks at food facilities. Manufacturers must also be held to a higher standard, and should be responsible for ensuring that their products meet stringent food safety regulations. When contamination has occurred and led to the illness and deaths of so many, manufacturers must be held to account.

The ACDP also wants to see health inspectors visit all spaza shops in our townships. We are very concerned about the unhygienic conditions at most of our spaza shops, particularly those run by foreign nationals. Some traders sleep and bathe in the same shops they sell food from. [Interjections.] Listen. This is totally unacceptable.

They live in shops that do not have toilet facilities and people wonder what they do when nature calls because they only see them go to the back of the shop that does not have such facilities. This is a reality that has to be attended to.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018

Page: 39

Mr M N PAULSEN: Speaker, on a point of order: I want to know if it is parliamentary for Mfundisi to stand there, a man of the class, to be so xenophobic towards our African brothers.

The SPEAKER: Hon member, what do you see as being xenophobia?

Mr M N PAULSEN: He said foreign nationals that come and do whatever. He "othered" other Africans. Foreign nationals is such a racist, xenophobic term. I am disappointed that you are allowing it in this democratic Parliament.

THE SPEAKER: Hon Paulsen, you seem to be quite obsessed with racism. I wonder what happened to you in the past few days. [Laughter.]

Mr M N PAULSEN: This is a Parliament that allows racism to unfold.

The SPEAKER: Hon Paulsen, take your seat and allow hon Meshoe to finish his speech.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018

Page: 40

*Afrikaans:*

Rev K R J MESHOE: Hy het net my tyd gemors. [Gelag.]

*English:*

The ACDP therefore call on government to urgently look into this matter before another unknown disease breaks out. For the sake of the health of our people, health inspectors should start visiting all shops dealing with food, particularly shops in informal places. If I take Mr Paulsen with me, he will be shocked by what he sees.

[Time expired.] He must not be political here; he must be real. I thank you.

Mr L M NTSHAYISA: Hon Speaker, I am sorry that I did not inform you before hand that I am going to read this speech that had been prepared by hon Jafta, who is a member of this committee. He has been deployed somewhere by our President. The reported cases of the listeriosis outbreak have again set a cat among pigeons, putting the national Department of Health, the South African National Standards, Sans, and the South African Bureau of Standards, SABS, against each other.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 41**

We challenge this House to put the following paradoxes in a proper situation.

Firstly, to what extent has the South African National Standard monitored the work of standard and certification bodies like the South African Bureau of Standards.

Can we justifiably link listeriosis to the SABS for failing to provide conformity assessments occasionally?

Has the SABS failed to promote the quality of commodities, products and services offered in the local market?

Are we shifting the ball and losing the argument on this debate?

These are complex questions.

The health authorities have their work cut out to deal with this disease. South Africans should also do their part to observe the precautionary measures outlined by the Minister of Health.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 42**

The AIC calls upon the much-needed collaboration between the National Institute for Communicable Diseases, the national Department of Health, the certification, accreditation and standard quality control bodies and all South Africans.

Scapegoating the national Department of Health will get us nowhere. Men and women of integrity should be bound by a common vision of advancing quality health care for the benefit of poor South Africans. The culpability of Enterprise cannot be overlooked. It has the duty and responsibility to provide commodities of good quality and standard, in keeping with its international obligations. Indeed, heads must roll.

The challenges of our time must indeed propel us to shift gear and promote human rights. We call upon all the stakeholders to conduct regular checks in all suspected laboratories and factories in other provinces. Let us avoid all processed food, as cautioned by the Minister. I thank you.

*IsiXhosa:*

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018

Page: 43

Nks M L DUNJWA: Mandibulele Somlomo weNdlu yoWiso-mthetho yeSizwe, abaPhathiswa nooSekela babo, amaLungu ePalamente kunye nabantu boMzantsi Afrika uphela abamameleyo.

*English:*

Minister, let us commend your department of ensuring that they jump and ensure that lives are being saved. Let us also commend all those committed health workers in this country in ensuring that our people's lives are saved.

*IsiXhosa:*

Siyi-ANC kubuhlungu ukuba sithi kubantu bakuthi mabalale ngenxeba. Eyona nto ibuhlungu kakhulu kukuba xa sime kule ndawo senze le nto amakhumsha athi...

*English:*

... we play with the emotions of our people on such a very important issue. We agree with the EFF in that people who are to take a responsibility are the big multinationals; we agree with the NFP and also the IFP. [Interjections.] We thank you on that. Yes, we might have erred. Yes, leadership is about ensuring that where you have made a mistake, you take responsibility.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018

Page: 44

The multinationals own big companies and they have been treated - in the health sector you know very well that we are coming from a system that people were treated according to their colour of the skin. That is why when you stand here you make an issue about the conditions in hospitals. [Interjections.] Yes, our hospitals need to be looked into.

Maybe people of South Africa do not know...

*IsiXhosa:*

... ndifuna ukunikhumbuza bantu bakuthi ukuba ngelaa xesha ubunikwa ukutya namayeza ngokwebala lolusu lwakho. Isizathu sokuba ndiyikhankanye le nto yinto yokuba ibuhlungu kakhulu ukuba le nto yenziwe ibhola yezopolitiko le nto ibaluleke kangaka. Kaloku nini abantu abaneenkampani ezinkulu zeenkukhu ezitya izinto esingazaziyo thina bantu bangengawo amakhumsha.

Nini abantu abaneefama ezininzi zeebhokhwe neegusha ezitya izinto ekufuneka ukuba abantu bakuthi baqinisekise ukuba azichaphazeli ubomi babo.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018

Page: 45

*English:*

On 19 February 2018, my secretary called me and said that she is Khayelitsha. Her aunt had been there from 15h00 and it was then after 20h00 waiting to be transferred to Tygerberg Hospital. I am making this example because you think that you are holier than thou. [Interjections.]

FF Plus stands here and said things are not right now. Are they not right now because it is the ANC that is in power? [Interjections.] For your own information, I am standing here because I am from that sector. I am standing here because I know where we are coming from. I know the Department of Health is trying its level best to correct your ills. [Interjections.] Yes, because you to private hospitals. [Interjections.]

Listen, listen. Listen, listen. [Interjections.] I was admitted in a private hospital and for three days that ward was never cleaned. That happened in Cape Town.

[Interjections.]

*IsiXhosa:*

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018

Page: 46

Ndifuna ke bantu bakuthi boMzantsi Afrika nibabone ukuba naba bayasixhwitha kwaye basenza yonke into le kuba kaloku iimpazamo zenziwa ngumntu osebenzayo. Sifuna ukuthi kuni yimameleni into ethethwa nguMphathiswa kuni yokuba musani ukuzitya iipoloni neviyena. Ncedani nizibuyisele zonke kwiiivenkile ebenizithenge kuzo. Masiqinisekise ukuba abona bantu basemngciphekweni kakhulu ngabantu abaneswekile, abantu abadala nabantu abakhulelweyo. Amajoni abo omzimba ngawona asemngciphekweni wokuhlaseleka xa bathe basesichengeni kwesi sifo kwaye siqinisekise ukuba iyafika ezindlebeni zabo le nto ithethwa apha.

*English:*

Hon Speaker, as the leader of this House, Parliament must stop giving us bread with processed food. I am demanding that as I am standing if I have got that authority. It must be taken off and as Members of Parliament we must not eat it but send it because we must lead by example.

[Interjections.]

It is important therefore that the Constitutional Review Committee must look into Chapter 3 of the Constitution,

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018

Page: 47

page 21 because we think, as the ANC, that health inspectors must no longer be in the local government sphere but to be allocated in the national Department of Health. This will ensure that we employ more health inspectors, hon Minister. [Interjections.]

*IsiXhosa:*

Iyingxaki ke le nto yokugrogriswa ngentetho yobuhlanga xa sithetha le nto kuba kaloku intlupheko yaziwa sithi kwaye inyaniso iyakrakra. Aba bantwana besa sikolo sabantwana abancinci saseSoweto abathe bagula bebengathandi ukuba benzelwe ipoloni rhoqo kodwa babethwa yimeko yentlupheko. Nangona kunjalo, sithi masilumke ukuze ingaphindi yenzeke into enjalo.

Mhlawumbi wona amaLungu ePalamente ezitasini zabo aneetshefu zokusula izandla (wipes) kuba kaloku bona banemali zokuzithenga. Silumkisa abantu bakuthi ukuba xa besuka kulaa ndlu yangasese bancede bahlambe izandla naxa beza kupheka ukutya.

*English:*

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018

Page: 48

The unfortunate part, hon Minister is that because our people are poor and they buy food and meat in bulk. They make a mistake of defrosting that bulk meat or food as a whole and then take it back to the freezer. That is the most dangerous thing to do.

*IsiXhosa:*

Nina bantu bojayo inyama musani ukuba nifune ukuyitya ngoku isenegazi. Kufuneka umntu ayojisisise kwaye kubalulekile ukuba abantu bakupheke kakuhle ukutya kwabo. Kubalulekile ukuba ukutya kwakho obukuphekile ubufake kwisikhenkcezisi xa sele kupholile. Iqondo lesikhenkcezisi sakho kufuneka libe kwinqwanqwa lesihlanu.

Niyabeva ke ukuba bayakhala? Kaloku izibhedlela zabucala aziyithethi ukuba zinama-34% abantu abafunyaniswe benesi sifo.

*English:*

Yes, hon members, it is so unfortunate that the DA stands here and speaks as if institutions of health in this province are so good that our people are not suffering.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018

Page: 49

*IsiXhosa:*

Sibamba ngazo zozibini phaya kuqabane ohloniphekileyo uMotsoaledi. UMagaba ukhe wayiveza into yokuba abantu kufuneka bahlale bethe qwa kuba uMphathiswa weSebe lezeMpilo nosiHlalo weKomiti yeMicimbi yeSebe bahamba ngezantya. Ekuhambeleni phezulu kwakho uye wafumana esi sithwakumbe. Abanye apha phakathi kwethu ngethuba elibi siphulukene nobomi babantu balibele kukuthetha ngeevoti zokhetho wama-2019. Ukuba nibavotele maze niyazi ukuba nivotele intengu kuba umbutho okhathalayo ngumbutho ozilungisayo ezi zinto.

Siyaqinisekisa ukuba xa siphinda sibuya siza kunika ingxelo ecacileyo ngesi sifo. [Uwelewele] Somlomo, bendikhe ndatsho ndathi inyaniso iyakrakra. Siyacela ke Mphathiswa ukuba kuqeqeshwe abantu abonobuchwephesha abaninzi, iinzululwazi ezongezelelekileyo kwaye kuqeqeshwe noonompilo.

*English:*

Who was leading in the health sector, 40 years ago? So, please do not scare us from speaking the truth. We know that the truth hurts most.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018

Page: 50

*IsiXhosa:*

Siyababongoza ke bantu bakuthi ukuba bangamameli kakhulu ezi zinto kuhlekiswa ngazo kumakhasi omoya. Siyabacela abantu ukuba bangahlekisi ngezinto ezichaphazela abantu kula makhasi omoya kuba esi sifo siyabulula ngenene. Enkosi. [Kwaqhwytywa.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Speaker, I was quite aware and prepared that, whatever happens, the DA obviously is going to go on and attack. I was prepared for that. [Interjections.]

Mr J H STEENHUISEN: We are holding you to account. You might not like what we are saying, but you are a Minister. You are held accountable.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: But, what I was not prepared for ... [Interjections.] [Laughter.] ... is the desperation of coming to launch an election campaign on the basis of listeriosis! [Interjections.] Because Ms Wilson actually launched an election campaign, even mobilising people in the gallery to come and help you launch that election campaign, because there is listeria. [Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018

Page: 51

I know the media calls you the Desperate Alliance. I never knew you were so desperate. [Interjections.] You are even invoking the tragedy of Life Esidimeni!

An HON MEMBER: Because you were responsible!

Ms E R WILSON: Where were your health inspectors?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Now, Life Esidimeni was a mistake committed in government. [Interjections.] And government took responsibility and it is being punished.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Government is a murderer!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Listeriosis has been committed by a private sector company. That's why you want to blame government again.

Hon Dlamini, I can assure you, there's no way – regardless of what the DA says – there's no way we are going to keep quiet. Laws are available to hold people to account and they are going to be punished in terms of the

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 52**

available legislation. [Interjections.] There's no question that that's going to happen. I can assure you.

I finish my speech and I repeat: Those members of the community who want to litigate ... we will give them all the information. We will give them all the data. We will give them all the expertise to help them to litigate. And we will see what the DA will do. [Interjections.]

On this score, you are also pretending or making as if, when it comes to the DA, things are right. Let me tell this House, when the Health Professions Council accredited hospitals for internship, all the provinces filled the accredited spaces to hire interns. Gauteng, because of their financial problems, at least filled 86%. KwaZulu-Natal filled about 90%. Western Cape with the DA filled only 56% of those posts. [Interjections.] I had to send interns to other parts of the country because I don't have powers over human resources, and you are putting the responsibility on me. I want to take that power away. If I had that power, I would have forced the DA to create those posts. I don't have it. That's a fact. Don't give me the responsibility or authority I don't

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018

Page: 53

have. That authority of human resources is in the provinces, you know, and the DA is proving it.

[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Budget cuts ... [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: On the Kids from Cuba, not a single one from Western Cape, even the poorest of the poor, is training in Cuba, because you are refusing. Out of the 3 000 students in Cuba, not a single one comes from the Western Cape. If I had the power, that would not have happened. So that power is not there.

Hon Majeke ...

Mr H P CHAUKE: Speaker! Speaker! I am rising on a point of order. Rule 92.

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, please take your seat. Yes, hon Chauke?

Mr H P CHAUKE: Speaker, is it correct that the Minister says that "I will take the power" rather than taking the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018

Page: 54

power. Why is the Minister not taking the power instead of warning people that he will take the power?

[Interjections.] Take the power, Minister!

The SPEAKER: Hon Chauke, that's not a point of order; it is a point of engagement with the Minister.

Mr H P CHAUKE: Take the power, Minister!

The SPEAKER: Please proceed, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Power is taken via legislation; it is not grabbed.

I agree with hon Alberts. You are ... I mean ... Hon Majeke, you are very right. We have a serious shortage of environmental health practitioners because environmental health practitioners or health inspectors ... because that function was given to local government via the Constitution in 1996. We are not supposed to do that function. We have even tried to increase their numbers and Treasury reminded us – and rightly so – that that is a local government function.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018

Page: 55

So we will very like ... through you, hon Speaker ... that it was a mistake for the Constitution to give that job to local government because many municipalities simply cannot perform it because they have basic services which they must provide, like refuse removal, etc. So we do have a shortage, yes, of 3 300 environmental health practitioners.

So we would like that part of the Constitution to be looked at and the work of health inspectors be brought to us. [Interjections.]

But, be that as it may, we did not fold our arms. The Director-General of the Department of Health, on 15 November, drew up norms and standards, and sent them to municipalities. We did an audit of municipalities. We gave the results to different municipalities. We even helped the SA Local Government Association, Salga, to do workshops about this function. We did everything in our power, but I don't think many municipalities will be able to perform this function simply for the simple reason that their core functions themselves are very difficult. Refuse removal, clean running water ... [Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018

Page: 56

So, I would like Parliament to help me, not to shout.

That part of the Constitution needs to be relooked at.

This is a function which must belong to health. It must not belong to municipalities because there is no amount of workshops which we can conduct. We have already done capacity-building to 32 of the district municipalities in six provinces by the end of last year. We supported Salga in collaboration with the Health Professionals Council of SA, HPCSA, and NGOs to try and give this capacity.

It's like Port Health. We discovered in 2011 that Port Health is in provinces. We came here when there was a problem at OR Tambo. You helped us change the legislation. We took over Port Health. We were able to hire 300 environmental care officers or health inspectors. We would like to do the same thing.

Hon Alberts, I don't know whether I heard you correctly when you said listeria is a disease of the Third World. [Interjections.] That is a lie. Just last year only, Germany had 600 cases of listeria. France has about 600

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 57**

cases of listeria. [Interjections.] There are cases of listeria in Australia now. So your story of Third World shows your bias. Thank you. [Time expired.]

Debate concluded.

The SPEAKER: Hon members, I would like to recognise the delegation of councillors from the Ekurhuleni Municipality, led by the Speaker of the Council, Patricia Khumalo. [Applause.] They are here to benchmark on the Rules of both Houses and other related matters. Honourable councillors, you are welcome at Parliament.

**UNPARLIAMENTARY LANGUAGE**

(Ruling)

The SPEAKER: Before I allow the House Chairperson to take over I would like to make a ruling. On 7 March 2018 during questions to Ministers a point of order was raised by the hon Chief Whip of the Opposition in relation to a remark made by the hon Paulsen. He's still around.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018

Page: 58

During the reply to a question by the Minister of Defence and Military Veterans, the hon Paulsen took a point of order and addressing the Chair said: "That's so racist! You are just like this one! You are racist!" In response to this remark, the Chief Whip of the Opposition contended that it was offensive and unparliamentary to call another member racist. At the time I concurred that the remark was offensive but Mr Paulsen then denied that he had in fact addressed the Chair in this manner. Instead, he claimed that: "Speaker, I said that is racist. I didn't say you are racist. The hon Steenhuisen must also listen because it is racist not to listen."

[Laughter.]

In response to this, I indicated that I would consult the Hansard to ascertain precisely what the member had said. Having now had an opportunity to study the unrevised Hansard, I wish to rule as follows.

Section 58 of the Constitution gives members of the National Assembly freedom of speech, subject only to the rules and orders of the House. Rules 84 and 85 read together state that no member may use offensive, abusive,

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 59**

insulting or disrespectful language, nor cast personal reflections on another member's integrity or dignity; such expressions and reflections being unparliamentary.

Irrelevant of context, an allegation or insinuation by one member that another is a racist is clearly offensive and has accordingly always been ruled out of order. In this regard, the accusation by the hon Paulsen that the Chair is a racist is indeed unequivocally unparliamentary. Moreover, the comment directed to hon Steenhuisen that he was acting in a racist manner is also out of order.

However, before I ask the hon member to withdraw, I must also caution members from making statements that could be understood as a deliberate attempt to mislead the House; this itself being a serious offence and subject to sanction. If you know you had said something and subsequently deny it, then this borders on contempt.

I must now ask that the hon Paulsen withdraws the statements that members of the House are racist. Hon member?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018

Page: 60

Mr N M PAULSEN: I withdraw.

The SPEAKER: Hon Paulsen?

Mr N M PAULSEN: Speaker, I just withdrew. Must I withdraw again?

The SPEAKER: Okay. You are free to do it again. We may now proceed with the next item of the business of the House which is a debate on a urgent matter of national public importance in terms of Rule 130 in the name of Mr A M Shaik Emam, on the water crisis in the Western Cape, the City of Cape Town in particular and in other provinces, and the impact it has on the country as a result of drought, global warming and other contributing factors. I now recognise the hon Shaik Emam.

**THE WATER CRISIS IN THE WESTERN CAPE, THE CITY OF CAPE  
TOWN IN PARTICULAR, AND IN OTHER PROVINCES, AND THE  
IMPACT IT HAS ON THE COUNTRY AS A RESULT OF DROUGHT,  
GLOBAL WARMING, AND OTHER CONTRIBUTING FACTORS**

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 61**

(Debate on matter of urgent public importance in terms of  
Rule 130)

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Speaker, allow me, as we celebrate this International Women's Day, to acknowledge the role played by our women, not forgetting my late mum and late sister, globally. I think the role that women play in our society today is underestimated. For that reason, I believe that we need to give them much more recognition than we do.

What is clear is that water is life. You can survive with many, many other things, but one thing you cannot survive with is water. It is common knowledge that hundreds of years ago, we knew that South Africa was one of the water-scarce countries in the world. We have a challenge in the Eastern Cape and in Gauteng, and we have a major crisis in the city of Cape Town, in the Western Cape. Some might be through our own fault, some might not, but the question is, What did we do about it and why did we allow it to get to where we are today?

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 62**

Well, let me tell you and especially my colleagues from the EFF, you miss a very, very important point when you repeatedly say our land was stolen. Yes, indeed, it was, but what you forgot to tell these people is that our water was also stolen. [Interjections.]

In 1956, the apartheid government passed a law, and there are political parties right here, now, in this particular House, that were part and parcel of that corrupt apartheid government that passed those laws to take the water and divert it from the poor to the rich, to the agricultural sector. That is what they did.

They did it in the most devious manner, in the most inhumane manner, to the extent that our women, pregnant women, had to carry buckets of water on their backs. Old people, children, had to do that. That is how shamelessly these people treated our people. So, let us not forget from where we come.

It is easy to come here and grandstand, but let me tell you, many of those sitting in this House today were part and parcel of the corruption, the state capture, and

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018

Page: 63

everything during the apartheid regime. They did nothing about it and they are sitting here today.

[Interjections.] They are here, as political parties, today, but they have forgotten what they did.

The issue of the water crisis, as I said, could be partly our fault and partly not. Let us take the City of Cape Town and the Western Cape. It's sheer negligence, recklessness and poor management. That is what it is, nothing more.

Let me add this. Fourteen years ago, a project called Reclaim Cammisa identified 32 outlets of water running into the ocean every minute of every day, right underneath this building we are in, right now. What did they do? Nothing - but they are grandstanding. They did nothing about it.

Let me add this. That lady who did the research was given an award by this very same Premier, the corrupt Premier in the Eastern Cape. [Interjections.] Western Cape!

[Interjections.]

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 64**

The Leader of the Opposition, Maimane, in a very short space of time moved from being one of the oppressed to being an oppressor. Do you know why? It is because the grass is greener on that side. Do you know why it's greener on that side? It's because of the evergreen contracts. [Interjections.] Those are the contracts that they are in charge of - the evergreen contracts. That's why you don't hear them complaining about it.

Let me add that the water in this country belongs to the people of this country. So, if that corrupt leader, Helen Zille, believes there is a spring on her property, it does not belong to her. Like they have stolen the land, they have stolen the water. So, all the water belongs to its people.

Now, let me tell you what they have done in the Western Cape and especially, in Cape Town. Do you see all these people in the gallery? Ask them, and they will tell you what life is like for them in the City of Cape Town and the Western Cape. Ask them whether they can have water.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018

Page: 65

This Day Zero that the DA keeps talking about - Day Zero, Day Zero, Day Zero is now DA Zero. [Laughter.] That is what it is! That was in order for them to manipulate so that they could award that R6 billion contract to the Israeli government. [Interjections.] Maimane goes to Israel, talks and makes a lot of allegations against lots of Ministers and Deputy Ministers but he goes and meets a corrupt leader from Israel who has been charged with bribery and corruption, theft and fraud, and everything, but that is fine with him. [Interjections.]

Do you know why he went there? He went there to collect his brown envelope ... [Interjections.] ... because he did not believe ...

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Chairperson, on a point of order ...

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: ... he cannot believe ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon Shaik Emam, will you take a seat?

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 66**

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: ... and trust anybody here to give it to him.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon Shaik Emam, will you take a seat, please?

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: The hon speaker at the podium knows full well that to impute improper motives to a member requires him to move a substantive motion.

[Interjections.] I would ask that, on that basis, those comments are withdrawn, and if he wishes to accuse members of improper behaviour, to bring a substantive motion to the House. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon Shaik Emam, you must withdraw that remark. [Interjections.]

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Alright, if that satisfies ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): No, hon member, just ...

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Thank you, I withdraw.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 67**

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): ... withdraw the remark unconditionally.

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Thank you, Chairperson, I withdraw.

Now, let me go on. I was in a radio interview the other day together with an official from the City of Cape Town. This is what she said. Yes, indeed, we have plenty of water. No, we do not have a problem with the supply. The problem is maladministration, poor administration, infighting and corruption. I then went on to say, hold on, why do you want Israel? She then admitted we don't need Israel, but it is an important matter because South Africa has the expertise and the knowledge which we are using, right now, in Dubai, to be able to manufacture or produce a desalination plant.

Let me also add that these desalination plants ... and I'm hearing about this - that even one of their corrupt leaders from one of the organisations wants to put this in his building. Let us not forget. The water they want to take belongs to the people. It is not their private water. So, if you are rich, this is what you can do. We

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 68**

are saying no. Do away with that. There is plenty of water.

Let me also add this. Over and above the 32 outlets, there are about 70 outlets of water, springs, all over the city, and I am only talking about around here. They have done nothing about it. Do you know why? They wanted to create a crisis so that they can give that tender and take it away and get that money that they need for the 2019 elections. That is what it is about.

[Interjections.]

Let them tell you about the licence to SAB Miller, privatising the water, and what their plans are with Coca-Cola, which takes 500 million litres of water. Let me tell you what they've done with these people. They have put these substandard meters there that do not comply with SABS standards, demanding large amounts of money – and they're still talking about Day Zero.

Let me tell how deviously they have done what they have done. They wanted to put in a levy that will affect the poorest of the poor. Yet, they come here and say, Don't

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018

Page: 69

increase the VAT. What did they do when we opposed it? They put a surcharge on the water, which works out to much more than the levy, itself. That is how devious and corrupt they are. [Interjections.] For the mistakes that they have made!

So, the NFP says that national government needs to intervene in this corrupt DA in the Western Cape. Co-operative Governance needs to intervene. The MEC needs to intervene and dissolve this in-fighting between them and Patricia de Lille, who they want to fight because they have been exposed. [Interjections.]

HON MEMBERS: Yes. Go away! Phuma! [Go out!]

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Now, we are making this very clear. You need to hand this matter to the Public Protector to investigate these allegations of tender fraud and corruption by the DA. [Interjections.] We need to stop this desalination plant, because there is enough water in the city of Cape Town, alone. They have not followed any environmental processes, at all.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 70**

Their only intention in all they do is to want to serve the interests of the rich and the elite at the expense of the poorest of the poor. That is why our people are suffering every day. They will tell you, these backyard dwellers, what life is like for them.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon member, your time has expired.

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: So, the NFP is calling on national government to intervene immediately and to take it away from this provincial government, in the interests of all South Africans. Thank you.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF WATER AND SANITATION: House Chairperson of the National Assembly, Ministers, Deputy Ministers, hon members of the National Assembly and honoured guests, we are gathered here today about a very crucial issue that is of concern to all of us. We all know that South Africa is a water scarce country and one of the driest countries in the world. It is also important to know that married to the dryness, the country as a whole has not recovered from the 2014

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 71**

drought. During this truly difficult time of drought, it is good and common practice to stretch available water resources through practical application of restrictions to ensure that water supply systems do not fail. This is the principle from which we operate as the Department of Water and Sanitation. This requires that all, and I do stress, all of us play our part and comply with the restrictions which are applied from time to time.

This is true is that the provinces of KwaZulu-Natal, Limpopo, Free State, North West and the Northern Cape bore the burden of the drought at its greatest height. The devastation that led to huge losses of livestock and crops over a period must always remain in our thoughts. What we saw in the early parts of the drought is that the reaction to the drought in KwaZulu-Natal, Free State, Limpopo and North West was more serious than what is experienced in the Western Cape and particularly in Cape Town. The marked appreciation of the situation saw a quicker response to the warnings and adherence to restrictions imposed at the time. The most affected municipalities in the affected provinces understood and

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 72**

appreciated the need for joint efforts towards enabling positive responses to the drought.

A perfect example to remember is that of a two-day programme that included the Department of Water and Sanitation principals meeting with the Premier of KwaZulu-Natal, MECs in the disaster management committee, district mayors of the affected municipalities and executive Mayor of the City of eThekweni. This was followed by a situational assessment site visit to the UGu and UMvoti Dams then, showing absolute political will. This visit followed numerous meetings held by the Department of Water and Sanitation and the KwaZulu-Natal provincial government on fast-tracking relief efforts and unlocking interventions meant to bring short, medium and long-term solutions to the water shortages experienced at that time.

We cannot ignore the important decision to put up the Richards Bay Desalination Plant, utilising the expertise of Umgeni Water to research and find the best technology, facilitate and procure the technology in the shortest

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 73**

possible time without flouting the rules. Engagements with the strategic water partnership network and members of the public on behavioural changes were necessary to ensure water supply and savings through behavioural change.

The then dire drought situation in the Free State prompted the Free State provincial government to call on all people of the province to be actively involved in efforts to save water and fight against devastating effects of global warming and climate change. There was a threat to the livelihoods of the people of the Free State. The province immediately implemented short, medium and long-term measures to address and mitigate the potential impact of the drought then with measures including but not limited to: implementing drought operating rules at all dams; the water mix to include ground water utilisation, rainwater harvesting, reuse of return flows and packaged desalination plants; reducing operational risks through proper infrastructure operation and maintenance with associated skills development; and acquiring and deploying water tanks to affected communities. The Free State government at the time also

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 74**

warned all its citizens that the water restrictions that were being implemented needed to be adhered to for the situation not to worsen.

We do remember also that in 2016 the Integrated Vaal River System was very low and political leadership was shown by the province of Gauteng to encourage all sorts of water saving efforts. The most critical was the reduction of supplies by Rand Water to municipalities to force water savings with direction from the Department of Water and Sanitation and the Gauteng provincial government through the Department of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs, Cogta, MEC.

There is untrue narrative about the City of Cape Town not receiving assistance from the national government. This is inaccurate. The Department of Water and Sanitation, through its Western Cape office, serves not just the City of Cape Town, but the whole province. The drought is not just localised, but provincial exactly the same as what happened in other provinces. Attention has also been given to the province through the work of the interministerial task team on drought. The Department of

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 75**

Water and Sanitation has also availed one of its top managers to be part of the City of Cape Town's advisory committee that keeps the City up to date on all matters of the drought on a weekly basis. This attention never happened in other provinces, but only given to you. It is important to highlight that Cogta through a letter dated 22 August 2017 allocated the following amounts for drought relief in the Western Cape: R20,8 million to the City of Cape Town; R10,9 million to the Bitou Local Municipality; R3,1 million to the Theewaterskloof Local Municipality; and on 25 September 2017 a further R40 million was allocated to the Department of Agriculture for animal feed in the Western Cape.

The total sum allocated to the Western Cape therefore totalled R74,8 million. It is very important that we get to know how much of this has been utilised and on what. We also need to understand how these allocations impacted on the poor and vulnerable people in Khayelitsha and Imizamo Yethu and other places where service delivery is needed.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 76**

What we have observed was that at the beginning of this unfortunate situation, the response of consumers in the Western Cape was quite concerning. After 12 December 2017 restrictions and interventions were announced, with additional interventions published in the *Government Gazette* on Friday 12 January 2018, with regard to limiting the use of water in the Breede-Gouritz and Berg-Olifants Water management areas. This notice included the following among other things, limiting groundwater abstractions for domestic and industrial use by 45% and for agricultural use by 60%. Bringing the restrictions on groundwater use in line with the restrictions applied to surface water use. It was necessary to also limit water for irrigation use from the system dams once the users have depleted their seasonal bulk volumes. Whilst the City of Cape Town is threatening its people with Day Zero and receiving the lion's share of attention due to its centrality with regards to the economy of the Western Cape, we must remember that the current drought has been real in South Africa and the Southern African Development Community, SADC, regions for the last four years at least.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018

Page: 77

To support the situation in the Western Cape and Cape Town in particular the Water and Sanitation signed - listen - a memorandum of understanding, MoU, with the City of Cape Town. That's what we did. Borehole positions were established within the Department of Water and Sanitation premises.

*IsiXhosa:*

ISEbe lezaManzi noGutyulo likhamise oku kwamantshontsho entaka ukuze thina...

*English:*

...must always pump money to them as if they are the only ones that have drought. I want to tell you that this drought started in KwaZulu-Natal, but they never made noise like you. They knew what to do about the drought.

The department assigned additional staff to compliment the maintenance team to you the Western Cape and encouraged the implementation of best efforts to manage the Cape Town systems dams through the application of restrictions which were recently increased. Domestic and

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 78**

industrial use increased from 40% to 45% and agricultural use increased from 50% to 60%. That's what we did.

Following meetings with the Mayor of the City of Cape Town, a directive was issued to Umgeni Water to procure a 10 million litres per day plant as an emergency intervention for the City of Cape Town. Leave Dudu Miyeni I am talking to you. The procurement process has been concluded. Despite the City of Cape Town wanting the project to be delayed deliberately so in order to find an alternate site for the plant, was a lie. They want us to give them more money. We continue with preparation for implementation. You are delaying the process deliberately because you want us to give you money all the times as if you are the only ones experiencing drought. Draught is affecting the whole of South Africa.

The deeper we dig into the apparent water crisis in Western Cape and Cape Town in particular, the more unjustifiable Day Zero becomes.

*IsiXhosa:*

Lo Day Zero wabo kuthiwa ukulonyaka uzayo ngoku.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018

Page: 79

*English:*

We have been waiting like...

*IsiXhosa:*

... oko besithi kule veki yiDay Zero, kulaa veki.

*English:*

But now they have changed and they say Day Zero will be next year. What is that? You call yourselves leaders and you are going to lead this country. You are troubling people...

*IsiXhosa:*

... ngokungathi kukho umgwebo omkhulu ozayo kodwa guququ, uphinde utshintshe lo mgwebo kuthiwe uyeza kulo nyaka uzayo.

*English:*

We are sick and tired of giving you money and you do nothing and you blame the national department.

On 18 May 2017, approval was given to the Trans-Caledon Tunnel Authority, TCTA, to build the Berg River -

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 80**

Voelvlei Augmentation Scheme. In addition to all this, the Department of Water and Sanitation has emergency systems in place should the dam levels reach 13% or lower. That's what we are going to do, and that's what we are doing. We are giving you money, we are giving you meetings to assist you, but you come here and grandstand. You lie to people and say the government is doing nothing.

The joint compliance monitoring and enforcement efforts conducted by Water and Sanitation and the municipalities have also influenced the reduction in water use, particularly the unauthorised use. The Department of Water and Sanitation is also fast-tracking the approval of water use licences and has recently granted licences to the City of Cape Town for the ground water programme involving Steenbras - three phases up to 57 million cubic metres per annum. You know that. You perfectly know it, but you come and lie here; and Cape Flats - three phases up to 75 million cubic metres per annum; and Oranjezicht Springs - up to 1,78 million cubic metres per annum. That you know.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018

Page: 81

*IsiXhosa:*

Uyayazi kakuhle loo nto. Niyayazi. Akukho secaweni apha kuba ufuna singakuphenduli. Siza kuphendula nqo thina wena mntu uthe - lies.

*English:*

This work will continue because we have the interests of all South Africans. We don't politicise water as you are. You politicise water. I wonder the money that we gave you. What do people of Khayelitsha see? Do they see that we have given you money? The money goes to you only and you don't think about Khayelitsha, Imizamo Yethu and other communities in the Western Cape. This work will continue because we have an interest to all South Africans notwithstanding to where they live or work.

*IsiXhosa:*

Singurhulumente okhathalayo kwaye yiyo le nto sisela amanzi. Siyakhathala ngabantu kuba siyayazi into yokungabikho kwamanzi. Abona bantu basokola kakhulu ngamanzi ngoomama kodwa ke anisokuze niyicinge loo nto leyo kuba kwanina ninomama abathathu. Nigcwlise nje ngamadoda odwa.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018

Page: 82

*English:*

How would you think that water is important in women? You must start here and make sure that you respect mama. Do not come and lie here and say...

*IsiXhosa:*

... urhulumente akukhonto anenzele yona eNtshona Koloni.

*English:*

As I conclude, let's separate politics from water. You must separate water from politics. It doesn't go like that. We need to remember that a great deal of consideration needs to be attached to the following...

*IsiXhosa:*

Mamela ndikuphe nje xa ndigqibelisa.

*English:*

South Africa's main source remains surface water. The reality therefore is that South Africa needs to go for an unconventional approach towards water access.

*IsiXhosa:*

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018

Page: 83

Ubuza kuyicinga nini loo nto leyo okanye ubulinde thina sikuxelele?

*English:*

More groundwater development needs to be undertaken, water reuse must be enhanced, brackish and sea water desalinated, and most definitely upscale rainwater harvesting. [Time expired.] That we know. Of the most important adaptation climate change will continue negatively.

Mr L J BASSON: Chairperson, for the purpose of this debate, it is important to first establish who is responsible to guarantee bulk water to local government, farmers, water boards and other users.

The Water Act in Chapter 4 read with Chapter 11 determines the following:

The Water Act is founded on the principle that national government has overall responsibility for and authority over water resource management,

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 84**

including the equitable allocation and beneficial use of water in the public interest.

The Act gives the Minister the power to establish and operate government water works that include water storage dams, water transfer schemes in the public interest out of funds allocated by Parliament.

In short, the Minister of Water and Sanitation on behalf of the government must take full responsibility to guarantee water to the City of Cape Town and other water authorities in the country. The Minister is dodging her responsibility once again.

The drought that's hit Cape Town and surrounding areas, officially the worst in recorded history, has assisted in creating public awareness of the reality of the effect of climate change. And as the new kind of thinking has also put the spotlight on the need for wastewater recycling, the City of Cape Town will be joining other major cities in making this part of the new norm for re-use of water. The government should also implement that elsewhere.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 85**

Since 1995, the City of Cape Town's population has grown by 79%. From 2,4 million to an expected 4,3 million this year. Over the same period the government only gave dam storage and increased it with only 15%.

The Berg River Dam, which began storing water in 2007, has been City of Cape Town's only significant addition to water storage since 1995. Shame on the ANC government! Had it not been for good water consumption management by the City of Cape Town, the current crisis could have hit much earlier... [Interjections.]

Mr D MNGUNI: Order, order, Chair!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon Basson, take your seat please. Why are you rising, hon member?

Mr D MNGUNI: Can the member take a question?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon member, are you prepared to take a question?

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 86**

Mr L J BASSON: I won't take questions. You can ask me in the portfolio committee.

Mr D MNGUNI: What is ... [Inaudible].

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): No, the hon member is not prepared to take a question. Take your seat, hon member.

Mr L J BASSON: The Western Cape government and the City of Cape Town went above and beyond what was required to prepare for drought. However, the system failed, at the level of national government.

In 2007, the Department of Water and Sanitation issued a warning about Cape Town's water supply, saying the city would need new water sources by 2015. What did government do on their own warning to increase water storage capacity? Nothing! Sweet blue all nothing!

However, the City took the warning seriously. It implemented a water demand management strategy involving water meter replacements, pressure management, leak

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 87**

detection and free plumbing repairs for indigent households.

The strategy was so effective that the city met its 2015 water saving target three years earlier. Not something that the government can be proud of what is happening in the balance of the country.

Chairperson, in response to low winter rainfalls in 2015, the Western Cape government took pre-emptive action and applied to National government for R35 million to increase water supplies by drilling boreholes and recycling water. Guess what happened? national government rejected the request.

Had systems in national government been running smoothly, the City of Cape Town's water crisis could have been mitigated. If urgent responses to disaster declarations and water augmentation were met, new infrastructure could have been up and running already.

While the City of Cape Town's water crisis have been dominating headlines, some of the Eastern Cape's key dam

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 88**

levels quietly dropped towards a disaster, rapidly overtaking their still fuller cousins in the Western Cape. Therefore, the drought is spread over more provinces in the country, whilst this government is denying a day zero in the City of Cape Town.

The Western Cape agriculture has recorded R14 billion in losses so far, as a result of the crippling drought in the province with an estimated 50,000 people that could be out of work soon. The Western Cape government is doing everything possible to assist emerging and commercial farmers in the region.

Despite efforts to increase water storage, like the Clanwilliam Dam, the previous Minister, Nomvula Mokonyane, stopped the project and removed the department's construction unit in order to create tenders for pals. To this day, no tenders have been awarded and there is no funding available for this project and thus delaying the project by a further two years.

[Interjections.]

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Point of order, Chair!

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018

Page: 89

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon Basson, will you take a seat. Why are you rising, hon member?

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Will the hon member take a question?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon Basson, are you prepared to take a question?

Mr L J BASSON: Chairperson, the member should listen and learn something. I don't take questions from him.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): He is not prepared to take a question hon member, take your seat.

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Thank you. The tender was stopped ...  
[Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Take your seat.

Mr L J BASSON: The DA will request Minister Nkwinti to urgently reinstate the department's Construction Unit to proceed with construction on the Clanwilliam Dam.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 90**

While this debate focuses on the Western Cape and the City of Cape Town's drought, we must not lose sight of the national government that is failing to respond to water disaster all around the country.

We need to use this debate as an opportunity to mandate national government to start acting with urgency to assist in resolving the drought problems all around the country.

Chairperson, it is clear that national government dropped the ball in their constitutional mandate regarding the drought issue. The Minister and Deputy Minister are denying that. Shame on you, Minister! You know much better.

There is still no water master plan for South Africa. No planning for new dams. No assistance and support or making funds available for new water sources to support the drought areas ... [Time Expired.]

Mr N S MATIASE: Hon Chair, the present crisis of water shortage in the Western Cape and in the Eastern Cape must

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 91**

be placed in a correct contextual continuum. We must be able to demonstrate with facts that this is as a product of primarily three factors:

Firstly, is the failure of the democratic state after 1994 to chart a new developmental path for all South Africans in a manner that spatially diversifies development to prevent everyone from flocking into the very few developed nodes we have currently. The water crisis here in Cape Town, as well as other crises such as housing, transport, energy, and so on; over and above drought, are as a result of direct inability of the democratic State to develop areas other than the urban nodes we inherited from apartheid.

In 1995 for example, Cape Town had a total population of about 2,4 million people, now, it is expected to be about 4,3 million in 2018. These people are depending on the same water resources in 2018 that catered for almost half the size of the current population in 1995. During the same period, only the Berg River Dam, which began storing water in 2007, has been Cape Town's significant addition to water storage infrastructure since 1995.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 92**

Secondly, it is also as a result of human activity and greed. The capitalist greed had force all of us into unsustainable and self-destructive modes of production; in the process, destroying our environment, polluting our freshwater resources, diverting water from natural streams to industrial agriculture and leading to immitigable impacts of climate change. If we do not change our modes of development, then climate change will change humanity forever.

The juvenile behaviour of the ANC and the DA in dealing with the crisis in Cape Town is not helpful and it must stop. Mmusi Maimane cannot use this crisis as a political football to deal with Patricia de Lille as he has done; blurring the lines between the state and a political party.

The City of Cape Town must be stopped from drilling boreholes in critically important ecosystems areas because they are unwittingly causing more damage in the long-term to the future sustainability of the country.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 93**

The ANC must not let Nomvula go without any consequences for her destructive behaviour in the crisis of water.

Thirdly, the perilous state of consequence management across the public service is a serious matter and it ought to be addressed; and the Minister of Water and Sanitation must take full responsibility and necessary steps.

Lastly, we are dealing with this crisis because the ANC has made too far concessions in 1993, leading up to the adoption of the 1993 interim Constitution by conferring semi-federal powers to provinces. Today, you are unable to intervene in the Western Cape. You gave away the necessary instrument of the state: the power of cohesion and of coherence which must be located in the hands of the state.

Now, you cannot, as a central government, use that instrument in the hands of the state to force compliance on the DA government in the Western Cape to ensure that this matter of water crisis is addressed; once and for all. Thank you. [Applause.]

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 94**

INKOSI R N CEBEKHULU: House Chairperson, I would have loved to welcome our guests from the University of Cape Town, UCT, students currently undertaking the Master's Degree on International Environment Law, under the tutorship of Professor Alexander Paterson; unfortunately, some have left.

We, in South Africa, do not exist in isolation or independence from the distressing impacts and challenges we face as a planet in today's economic growth driven world. This global mantra of economic growth above all, as well as our uncompromising reliance on fossil fuels, has led us to a point where climate change is now becoming the new normal. Additionally, the South African economy which is energy intensive and in which mining and agriculture play a significant role, continue to draw substantially on our limited water resources.

Geographically, South Africa is also situated in a region in which the effects of climate change will lead to a drier climate, with less rain, as we are seeing now in most parts of the country. KwaZulu-Natal for instance is currently undergoing what is colloquially known as wet

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 95**

drought, there is water, but dam levels are very low, for example, the one in Jozini are still at precariously low levels.

So, what is the solution? Well, it should start with building resilience into our water supply and water management systems and this includes adhering to a sustainable resource-use approach which must be integrated with our current economic growth model and poverty eradication strategies.

Establishing and strengthening catchment management areas and investing in desalinisation plants as well as determining the sustainable use levels for strategic aquifers is also imperative.

Chairperson, the simple fact is that the sustainability of our scarce resources like water must remain foundational to any developmental path we may embark upon, if we are to emerge as a prosperous and self-reliant nation into perpetuity. Failure to adhere to this will tragically and irreversibly result in us robbing our

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 96**

future generations of the ability to meet their needs. I thank you. [Applause.]

Ms C N MAJEKE: Hon Speaker and hon members. South Africa has made a considerable progress in the provision of water for human and economic development. However, access, conservation, protection, equitable use and the management of this scarce resource continue to be one of the most fundamental problems facing development.

Given that Southern Africa is largely a semi-arid region with uneven distribution of water resources, erratic rainfall, frequent droughts and floods; we need a constantly revised Integrated Water Resource Management Plan built on collaborative inputs from various stakeholders including research and planning institutions, civil society organisations, the private and public sector.

The management plan must balance the pressures of development alongside long-term prosperity for social, economic, environmental and health measures. This

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 97**

requires integrated thinking and specialised technical skills.

Regeneration, not just sustainability, should be the new goal for water resources management and planning in our increasingly uncertain reality. Balancing consumption with supply is a core challenge for effective water resources management across the country.

The increased water demand across all sectors and regions, coupled with growing uncertainty of supply due to projected climate change impact presents a significant challenge to our country's development demands.

Accordingly, in order to unlock sustainable social, economic and environmental benefits linked to water resources, we need to engage our highly experienced engineers and scientists to provide support and skills to water authorities, government, municipalities, the communities and other organisations.

Our water resource management competencies must be complemented by excellence in related disciplines of bulk

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 98**

water infrastructure including dams, canals and hydropower plants as well as pipelines pump stations and water treatment.

The country's ability to innovative, integrated and multi-disciplinary solutions to address water resources management must encompass all project phases from conception through to implementation and operation.

South Africa must invest in the development of its people and must remain at the forefront of best practice and authentic designs. We must be a country that brings ideas to life. I thank you. [Applause.]

Dr C P MULDER: Hon Chairperson, I want to start off by saying that the personal gripe and obsession by the hon Shaik Emam with the DA and other opposition parties is not an urgent matter of national public importance and there is no need to debate his personal obsessions and gripes against opposition parties. [Applause.] As a matter of fact, it is not even a matter of national public importance for his party, it is not. I want to refer the hon Shaik Emam to the reality that it is not

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 99**

the first time that this happens. There was another member in this House in the previous Parliament, who by coincidence also came from Kwazulu-Natal and that hon member's name was the hon Mr Bhoola. The hon Mr Bhoola did exactly what that hon member is doing. Now, I want to give good advice to the hon Shaik Emam but I think it is maybe too late. You cannot out-ANC the ANC. Forget about that. all that you are doing at the moment is, you are creating your party to become ANC-lite and trust me at the election your party will be punished. [Applause.] [Interjections.]

Prof N M KHUBISA: Hon Chairperson!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon Mulder, will you take your seat please. Why are you rising, hon member?

Prof N M KHUBISA: Chairperson, I have a point of order. I am standing out of sympathy Chairperson.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Out of sympathy?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018

Page: 100

Prof N M KHUBISA: Yes, he must read the watch, his time is running. Focus on the speech sir.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): No, that is not a point of order hon member, continue hon Mulder.

Dr C P MULDER: So hon Shaik Emam, unfortunately, the hon Bhoola did not return to Parliament and I wish you well in your future endeavours. [Applause.]

Mr S C MNCWABE: Point of order Chair!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Why are you rising, hon member?

Mr S C MNCWABE: Chairperson, on a point of order: The member in the podium is totally irrelevant to today's topic. Can he be in order?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): No, hon member let us allow the hon member to continue. Continue, hon member.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018

Page: 101

Dr C P MULDER: No, it is not irrelevant. Unfortunately I do not have enough time then we will get to the subject as well. I have only with Shaik Emam, we will get back. The fact of the matter is the hon Minister of Water and Sanitation tells us that South Africa is a very arid and dry country.

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Point of order Chair!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Why are you rising, hon member?

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Chair, on a point of order: I would like to ask the member a question whether he is denying that he oppressed us? [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): No, hon member, you have asked if you could ask the member a question. Nobody gave you permission to ask that question. Continue hon Mulder.

Dr C P MULDER: If you know me, I would love to take all your questions. Unfortunately, I do not have time. The

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 102**

hon Deputy Minister told us that the country is an arid country. We all know that. Why do we not ask what the best practices in the world are and make use of the experts in this field namely Israel. What if we do that? Israel recovers 90% of their water. If South Africa could do that, we can double our water resources. The country that comes closest to that is Spain with 20% but once again because of political and other reasons we do not want to talk to Israel.

When it comes to water, there is no place for politicking. Water is life. When National Aeronautics and Space Administration, Nasa, goes out in the world, what do they want to find? They want to find water. Do not make cheap politics of water. Go out and find best practices. Go find out what is happening in Israel and bring that technology here and bring water to all the people in South Africa. No you do not. You do not want to because it is political. Then I suggest you go to the West Bank and get their technology maybe that will assist you. Unfortunately my time has expired but the fact of the matter is, water needs to be addressed. We can not do that in a way of making cheap politics and it is

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 103**

unfortunate that hon Shaik Emam is trying to do exactly that. Thank you. [Applause.]

Mr M W MADISHA: Chair, in 2008, an acclaimed scientist, Dr Anthony Turton, was ordered not to deliver a hard-hitting presentation on South Africa's water crisis. He was to have warned that South Africa had run out of surplus water and that for us to remain silent was bordering on criminal negligence. According to Turton, we are in the process of an unfolding national water crisis. And that, whilst the focus is currently on Cape Town, Gauteng came within a week of running out of water last year, saved only by a major rainfall event that fell deep into the eleventh hour.

Similar situations exist in the Eastern Cape, KwaZulu-Natal, and Limpopo, Northern Cape et al. This is apart from gross malfeasance and rampant corruption that has crippled the Department of Water and Sanitation and which threatens water security across the country as evidenced in today's action by The National Education, Health and Allied Workers' Union, Nehawu. I must emphasise that the union is correct. We also need to ask why the ANC-led

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 104**

government did not react to the National Water Resource Strategy published two decades ago that stated that four of our water management areas would be in deficit by 2025. This, given as a fact that in powers and functions of government as espoused by the Constitution, national government is responsible for bulk supply and municipalities for water reticulation. I agree with hon Tshwete that national government is responsible. Yes, it is responsible and that which permeates at the provinces is actually primary to what national government is supposed to do. So therefore, if there is a failure down there, it is actually not a failure by the provinces, it is national government that has failed.

But, as Turton points out, "ingenuity takes place on the cusp of chaos" We agree that we need a paradigm shift in how we think about and approach the water crisis. So, we wish to ... [Time expired.]

Mr S N SWART: Chairperson, certain areas in South Africa is experiencing drought conditions, with Cape Town experiencing the worst drought in its recorded history. And we from the ACDP side believe that we can learn from

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 105**

international experience. We can learn from Spain. And Deputy Minister, we understand that departmental officials went to Israel and they have learnt from some of the best practices, so let us learn from them as we deal with issues of drought throughout our country. If Arab countries learnt from Israel in this regard surely we can as well. So, I would urge us to look into that.

We would also like to commend all residents and visitors to Cape Town and other drought-stricken areas for being good stewards of limited supplies of water and in the case of Cape Town for significantly reducing their water usage. And we would also like to commend for reducing their water usage and Elgin and Grabouw valley who contributed millions of water to the Steenbras Dam, from where it will be pumped to city residents. So it shows we can together resolve this crisis but the question is, could it have been avoided had there been better planning by national, provincial, and local spheres of government? And so we all need to look at these issues and accept the blame that we each contributed in this situation. While Cape Town's previous Water Demand management programme worked well during 2004-2005 drought conditions. That

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 106**

programme was premised on sufficient rainfall and we know that did not occur in this situation. Now, so we need to be praying more for rain but we also need to be taking action. And what has made this situation worse if we would have a look and yes, the national department has contributed significant funds.

But one of the issues relating throughout the country is the canals that need to be maintained. And one of the canals is to the Voelvlei Dam. Have a look at that Minister. That is an important source of water for both the City of Cape Town and the whole Western Cape and it was reported that 7,5 million cubic metres of water was lost in 2016 and again in 2017 significant losses if we properly maintain that canal and I understand the sluice gates need maintaining now. The sand has been cleared out. Let us make sure that our canals are flowing into the dams that require that. We also know that the City of Cape Town has a bulk water division and yes whilst it is a national department competence; there is a bulk water division in the City of Cape Town and it has a capital budget. And my understanding regrettably is that the city has underspent its capital budget by R720 million. So we

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 107**

need to look at that as well and accept responsibility across the board. We, from the ACDP side, commend that we need to be praying, trust in the Lord for rain and also being good stewards of our water resources at this stage. Trust Him; like I said last year when I addressed the Deputy President, the Lord does answer prayer. Thank you very much.

Mr M JOHNSON: Chairperson, comrades, friends, fellow South Africans, the World Economic Forum's Global Risks Report of 2018 identified water crises as a societal risk that could have devastating impact on communities wherever it occurs.

South Africa has experienced a sharp significant decline in the available quality and quantity of fresh water that resulted in myriad of harmful effects on socioeconomic activities.

Since 2015, almost all provinces were declared disaster areas at various times due to drought. Some provinces have since recovered while others are still experiencing

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 108**

drought conditions such as Northern and Eastern Cape and Western Cape.

In times of crisis, a simple language becomes the first step towards any solution, like we have in water. The day zero notion has been confusing our people and it must stop.

South Africa has since been declared a national disaster on 8 February 2018. This is a worst drought South Africa is ever facing over years, with more than 2,7 million households facing water shortages across the country.

Yet, water in South Africa remains a constitutional right as enshrined in section 27(1)(b), I quote, "everyone has the right to have access to sufficient water".

Fellow South Africans based in Khayelitsha and also in Manenburg, our very Constitution is clear on the concurrency between national and local roles; the national government is responsible for bulk supply whilst local government must supply you and me in our homes with sufficient water as the Constitution enjoins us.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 109**

In other words, if you, South Africans, do not have water in your homes, blame your local government for not being able to manage your and our water resource. If your municipality cannot manage our natural resource, thuma i ANC [send ANC] to do it for you.

People of Cape Town, unfortunately, you do not have a mayor, say thank you to the ANC. The leader of some party has since become a *de facto* premier of some province. Co-Operative Governance and Traditional Affairs Minister, maybe in hindsight, you are called upon to do your job and do it better than them. Officially, you must take over the province before many other illegal activities can take place to these honorary Cape Town citizens.

Signs of drought are everywhere in the country, ranging from rivers that are not flowing properly while some are completely drying out. More than 80% of boreholes that serve as an alternative water resource to existing supply have dried up. The dams established to cater for the livestock and communities are drying or below expected levels; and most of the areas that are affected have been

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 110**

constantly receiving less than average rainfall in the past five years.

Reuse of water is one of the key solutions towards any resolution of any water crisis - Balito is a case in point, wastewater is being treated out of Balito plant, supplying that affluent Zimbali Estate. Zimbali Estate, in a nutshell, survives and lives on wastewater being reused.

Drought impacts were mainly on irrigated agriculture and livestock farming in almost all provinces while the water supply to communities for domestic use is severely affected countrywide. The situation has enormous negative implications on South Africa such as loss of jobs and food security due to farmers deserting their farms. This was reported in the Free State and Western Cape provinces wherein it was no longer economically viable to farm due to water shortages. The crop farmers in North West are reported to have suffered an estimated R4,3 billion due to severe drought. This loss has definitely been felt on the food prices across the country.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 111**

Mayors of South Africa, apart from drought and low rainfall, wastewater treatment and management pose a greatest risk to South Africa's water security. The poor operation and maintenance of wastewater treatment infrastructure is a cause for concern in South Africa. Many water quality studies conducted in South Africa revealed that this problem contributes to the pollution of water resource upon which most rural communities depend for all their domestic and other purposes. Pollution that results from poor management of this wastewater and sewage system infrastructure has direct impact on human health and the environment.

In 2011, Green Drop Report found that only 44% of all wastewater treatment plants in South Africa could be classified as average to excellent, while an enormous 66% is at critical to very poor performance state.

The average excellent performing wastewater treatment plants are to be found in KwaZulu-Natal, Gauteng province and also Western Cape while the critical to very poor plants are in the Northern Cape, Limpopo, North West, Eastern Cape and Free State.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 112**

The majority of critical systems are also located in the Eastern Cape, Free State, Limpopo, Northern Cape and Mpumalanga. This means that receiving environment, rivers or other bodies are under serious threat.

South African law is lauded with, amongst others, the best in the world because it addresses issues of equality, sustainability, among others, which are key for water resource. In other words, South Africa would only be water secure when there is equity in water access and use both in terms of gender and race. For example, water allocation reform has not advanced to significant redress levels acceptable to the marginalised and highly disadvantaged. This is a consequent of lack of implementation of our progressive water legislation and strategies.

This begs a question about the ownership of our water resource in our country. Our National Water Act is very specific, water in South Africa is owned by the state, is a public good and the Minister of Water is a custodian of our water resource.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 113**

The irony to this is that in the middle of a drought we are going through, especially in Cape Town, our private white commercial farmers can afford to release some sizable amounts of water from Grabouw Farms as a form of some gesture of goodwill.

Fellow South Africans, nevertheless, this is not all doom and gloom, the government has put in place various initiatives to address water security risks, such as drought, namely, water consumption restrictions; drilling and refurbishment of boreholes; drilling of vein water; water leaks repairs; refurbishment of wastewater treatment plants; wastewater schemes and water tankers, and of course, your perth desalination plants.

Speaker, all these initiatives are aimed at ensuring sustainable water supply to our communities, whether you are black or white, poor or rich.

However, the question that must be honestly answered is how our water security can be improved and maintained in South African? In addition to a number of solutions that could make South Africa a water secure country, ownership

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 114**

question of our water resource again must be addressed urgently through government sponsored legislation. For example, strict implementation of drought operating rules at all dams including restrictions; increase the water sources mix, especially ground water utilisation, rainwater harvesting, reuse of return flows, wastewater recycling and packaged desalination plants. All of these are some of those solutions you want to have in our country in order to make sure that indeed South Africa is a secure country in as far as water is concern.

These measures would provide the necessary preparedness and relief to the country. Prevention is better than cure. Although some aspects of water crises such as drought could not have been prevented, the communities and the country at large could have been prepared better.

If long-term water management plans were in place, the water management plan for the country could have ensured that communities are more resilient to the impact of drought. I therefore, firmly believe that secure of water in South Africa is possible if and only if we act together, black and white, public and private, young and

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 115**

old, urban and rural, among others in planning and implementation of our water security measures as I have outlined earlier on.

South Africans, do not be shy anymore ekuthumeni i ANC [sending ANC.] to continue doing a great job of changing the lives of our people for the better, especially the poor. Malibongwe! [Praised!]. [Applause.]

Mr M P GALO: Hon Chair, the ongoing water crisis has been the subject of vague pussyfooting, academic banter and political gimmick. After 1994, South Africans were hopeful that all water resources in the country would be under the custodianship of the state. After all, it is the state that is the vanguard of the people.

Many advocates of this proposition have bemoaned private ownership of water resources in the country. This criticism is lazy. The ANC is in government; it is not an official opposition. When the members of the ANC cry foul about this anomaly, you will be mistaken into thinking that they are not at the helm of government. The AIC raises this because these are members who have both the

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 116**

legislative and executive authority to change the status quo. If power cannot be exercised, then what purpose does it serve?

The drought that besieges our country is self-inflicted. The capacity of the state to provide access to clean water to our people is a constitutional obligation. We should stop examining the wrong problems.

The granular scale of drought in the country is an indictment to the poor. The reality that confronts us today is that drought is anti-poor. These are the people who are made to bear the brunt inflicted by big corporates, industries and mining companies. These culprits utilise excessive amounts of water for production. The Kyoto Protocols of this world are mere international instruments couched in passive monotones.

In conclusion, the AIC calls upon all South Africans to do their part and conserve water. This must be a collaborative act shaped by a common vision and interest of our people. If we deny our people access to water

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018

Page: 117

resources, we violate their basic human rights as entrenched in the Constitution. I thank you.

Mr M A PLOUAMMA: Hon Chairperson and hon members, in this water crisis, the DA-led government is vulnerable to the accusation of being flip-floppers, sloppy and lacking ideas. They truly have become a badge of shame. Secondly, we had a Cinderella former Minister Nomvula Mokonyane who tortured us with sterile-sounding speeches, howling repeatedly until she was reshuffled.

This is a man-made problem caused by lack of planning and vision. Western Cape is one of the fastest growing provinces. Therefore, we need leaders who always think a step ahead. This crisis should have been dealt with a few years ago, but guess what, the premier of this province is addicted to *twitter* like Fikile Mbalula. However, because she is a godmother, she remains untouched.

Look at what the DA-led government is doing as part of the solution. They chastise Mayor Patricia De Lille and subject us to shouting matches between the mayor and their newly-ordained priest, Mr Smith. This is a sign of

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 118**

political immaturity and bankruptcy of policy direction. The Western Cape government has just become a midwife of frustration and sorrow to our people.

I have observed recently that the Leader of the Opposition, Mr Maimane behaves like a de facto Mayor of Cape Town. It is very clear that the DA lacks capacity to deal with this crisis. Therefore, I agree with hon Emam Shaik that the national government must monitor this situation. We should not trust these highly-scripted choreographed press conferences and self-serving statements. If we do, we will be doing that at our own peril.

Finally, we thank all South Africans who are part of the solution under these difficult circumstances they have endured, particularly in the Western Cape. We hope the national government will monitor this. The DA cannot be trusted now and even in the future. I thank you.

[Applause.]

Mr G G HILL-LEWIS: House Chairperson, in this debate I do not wish to match the antics of the proposer, hon Shaik

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 119**

Emam, except to say that his own credibility has hit Day Zero very long time ago, and I think the public, everyone in this House and his own party know it.

Hon members, yesterday we were pleased to announce that, if we keep to our current consumption levels, Day Zero will not occur in 2018. We were only able to make this announcement because all of the residents of Cape Town have answered the call to defeat Day Zero with inspiring commitment. [Applause.] They have cut water consumption by 60% from 1,2 billion litres a day to 500 megalitres.

This is an even better performance than the residents of California and Melbourne, who suffered similar severe droughts in recent years. This incredible united response from the public has made this victory possible. We are also particularly grateful to the 117 diverse Overberg farmers who have generously donated 10 billion litres of water to the residents of Cape Town from a dam they built themselves. We should not be attacking them Mr Johnson [Applause.] We should be thanking them for doing the job for you. While we certainly cannot relax, and must

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 120**

continue to save water, this is an example of what we can do together.

As for some of the comments made here today, hon members, governments on both sides of the House have many complex tasks which they have to deliver. But political parties only have to do one thing; they only have to contest elections. Therefore, it was quite incredible to hear criticism from the hon member of the NFP who could not even get their act together sufficiently to contest in the past elections. They couldn't even pay the deposit to be on the ballot paper. [Applause.]

We have also heard some amazing conspiracy stories. Chief Whip, I think we need to have a separate debate in this House on conspiracy theories, which the hon Shaik Emam can lead. We can debate whether the moon really exists; who killed Kennedy; who funds the NFP; and other conspiracies. But if he really believes the drought does not exist, then he needs his head read.

The central question that no government speaker has answered today is this simple question: What has the

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 121**

national government actually done to help defeat Day Zero? The answer is, absolutely nothing! The country is suffering the worst drought in 400 years. There are currently at least 26 towns in the Free State alone, where there is absolutely no water supply.

According to a leaked briefing from the Department of Water and Sanitation Deputy Minister - I hope you have seen this briefing - taps across the country will run dry within the next five years unless there is a major immediate investment in new infrastructure. But there has been no urgent attention. There is no Operation Phakisa or special committee. The President has not even called the conference yet. Perhaps he will soon hold an early morning fun walk. We live in hope. No, instead, the approach of the national government has been - quite literally repeated by you again, Deputy Minister - to hope for more rain.

However, unlike the erstwhile Minister of Water and Sanitation's approach to the rand, you cannot pick up rain water. You actually need to collect or harvest rain water, and that needs infrastructure. But there is no

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018

Page: 122

plan to build new infrastructure. There are no teams building dams right now and no plans for them to do so.

Every major project in your department is years behind schedule and billions over budget. And there is no more money. The Department is bankrupt and Treasury doesn't have the funds to turn the money taps back on. The Auditor-General, AG said that the department was "deliberately hiding irregular expenditure," and was the worst performer of every single government department in a very crowded field. [Interjections.]

Where did all the money go? The same place it always goes; into cronies' pockets. Wherever you see a crisis, look hard enough and you will find an ANC crony. In this story, enters Ms Dudu Myeni.

Minister Mokonyane tried to force the City of Cape Town to appoint Umgeni Water to provide desalination plants to the Western Cape, and even did so in writing. Therefore, while taps are running dry around the country, Minister Mokonyane is the only person whose cup is still running over.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 123**

The contrast could not be starker with the DA-led governments. We said that we were not happy with the city's performance and we took action. We wanted residents to know exactly where we stood and what could be done. We hold ourselves to a very high standard. The public knows that the DA will govern better than any other party in this House [Interjections.] And they can continue to know that.

My time has expired, Madam Chairperson but let me say a warning to any party in this House, which wants to put the ANC back in government. Do not do so, and do not associate with this mess. Thank you very much! [Time expired.] [Applause.]

Mr H P CHAUKE: Chair, firstly, let me take this opportunity to thank Comrade Emam-Shaik for proposing this debate today so that all of us can then begin to address the problem. The problem that we must address is that who controls water in this country? If it is national department, let me tell you what they are not telling you. In this country, there are 4 000 dams of

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 124**

water. [Interjections.] The state only controls 300 – only 300. [Interjections.]

Hon Mulder would have stood here and address the issue of 3 700 dams remaining that are in private hands that water we don't have access to. [Interjections.] The point we must make is that where do they get this water from. [Interjections.] Where do they get this water from to donate? [Interjections.] A farmer stands there and says I am donating.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G BOROTO): Order, hon members! You are now ... [Interjections.]

Mr H P CHAUKE: A farmer stands there and says I am donating water. The farmer has more water than the City of Cape Town. [Interjections.] The DA is not even worried. It is not even worried that these farmers control water, which is a water resource and national resource that is supposed to be controlled by the state. Now, let us go back to the problem where the problem comes from. The problem starts from the beginning ...

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 125**

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G BOROTO): Hon members, you cannot drown the members like that. [Interjections.] You don't deny your hackling but you cannot drown the member like that.

Mr H P CHAUKE: Chair, the problem starts from the arrival of Jan Van Riebeeck. [Interjections.] That is where the problem starts. Jan Van Riebeeck's mandate were two: firstly, to supply fresh water to the ships that were passing - that is the chief executive officer, CEO, of the company called the Dutch East Indian Company and secondly, he discovered that we can even take the land. Now that they have taken water, let us take the land. His programme of the CEO of the company from Holland - now, you need to cut the umbilical cord of you and Jan Van Riebeeck - that's your problem. You are not able to cut that umbilical cord and become South Africans. [Interjections.] If you do that, you then begin to understand the challenge that you are faced with. The issue of drought is real. [Interjections.] The issue of drought is with us and we need to address it together.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 126**

The ANC has tried to avoid many times politics into the water space because we understand once you begin to put politics, we would not be able to provide water to the people in Khayelitsha. People in Khayelitsha don't have water. They use buckets that you are supplying them with. Look at the people there in Dunoon who are cramped in that place. Have you ever been to Dunoon and see the conditions there? You have never been there. You don't know it.

Now, the issue that we must address is: Here is a water resource, we have just dealt with the issue of land last week, here. We cannot separate the issue of water and land - you can't separate it. You can't separate the issue of land and water Mam'uKhawula. It's another struggle that you must fight and win - the struggle for water.

Then the Land Reform and Rural Development goes and give our people land in a dry place where there is no water. A farmer when he leaves that farm, Mulder, he leaves with a water licence. The poor black farmer moves to that land. Then you come and claim that we give them land and they

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 127**

can't do anything there. What would they do if they don't have water? [Interjections.] I have said this in the last platform when I was addressing here that the struggle of water has begun. The proposal that we are going to make from the ANC's side is that the committee that has been established, the [Inaudible.] committee that has been established to deal with the issue of land. It must deal with the issue of water too. You cannot separate the two. We are going to insist, in fact, to be very honest that we have made a proposal that when we come back from recess, we are going to debate the issue of ownership of water and the water right. [Interjections.] If we don't do that, you are not going to address the challenges that this country faced with, especially the poor and the black people that are confined in those Bantustans there.

In my constituency where I come from, hon Basson, you know that is why I don't want to address you today. Both of us agree that there are problems even in the constituency where both of us come from. In Swartruggens for the last four years, in Kgetleng the people don't have water there. You know it, but the issue is not that there is no water because it's not raining. The fact is

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 128**

that the farmers around Swartruggens have diverted the stream that supports the Lindleyspoort dam in Swartruggens. That is a problem that we are faced with. [Interjections.]

So, what we will then do is to support the programmes of the Department of Water and Sanitation. The issue that we must do again is to make sure that that Department takes control of every drop of water in the country.

[Interjections.] No donation that must come from anyone. We must take control of water in the country.

Mr G G HILL-LEWIS: Will the hon member take a question?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G BOROTO): Are you going to take a question, hon member?

Mr H P CHAUKE: No, the hon member is too young to ask me a question. Now your strategists stood here and the issue that they addressed ...

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018

Page: 129

Mr M N PAULSEN: Chairperson, on a point of order: Do we allow ages in this House? Can the member be ruled out of order for calling him too young?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G BOROTO): Let's not talk about people's age, that's discrimination. Can you please do just withdraw that.

Mr H P CHAUKE: No, Chair, obvious is not about the age and how old he is. It was the understanding of the issues.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G BOROTO): Hon Chauke, can you please just withdraw. No, no.

Mr M N PAULSEN: Just withdraw and stop the nonsense. Just withdraw.

Mr H P CHAUKE: Madam Chair, I will definitely withdraw the instruction by the EFF that I must stop attacking the DA. In fact, it is so embarrassing that the EFF is the one that stood and defended the DA ... [Interjections.]

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 130**

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G BOROTO): Hon member, you have withdrawn. Can you please continue?

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: House Chairperson, the member is supposed to withdraw unconditionally.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G BOROTO): He withdrew so that is why I asked him whether he is continuing with his speech.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: I never heard the word I withdraw, Madam Chair. I am going to check the Hansard.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G BOROTO): He did. We will.

Mr H P CHAUKE: Well the Chief Whip of the Opposition, my brother, I have withdrawn unconditionally that the hon member he is the old man like me. So I really agree that we are both of the same age. [Laughter.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G BOROTO): Hon Chauke, don't go on that line again.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018

Page: 131

Mr H P CHAUKE: Therefore, the call you are making Madam Chair is that Emam have opened up a wound that a lot of colleagues here in the House do not want us to touch. I am telling you that I am going to mobilise the EFF to agree with us. [Interjections.] It's only that this other EFF member who's stood up here doesn't understand the politics of the EFF that the issue of the land and water cannot be separated. The Leader of the EFF agrees with me on that point, but the most confused ones would never understand this part. [Laughter.]

So, hon Mulder last week you stood here and defended the issue of the farmer.

Mr N S MATIASE: Chair,...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G BOROTO): Hon Matiase why are you standing?

Mr N S MATIASE: Hon Chauke never ceases to amaze us. He never ceases to amaze us.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018

Page: 132

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G BOROTO): Is that a point of order?

Mr N S MATIASE: Chief stick to your script.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G BOROTO): Thank you very much, hon member. Sit down.

Mr H P CHAUKE: The party on the far left - that is the EFF - last time when I stood here, I told you that they are going to break away slowly and they are coming this side. Very soon they will be wearing black, green and gold. It is just a matter of time. [Laughter.] That is where we are going and we are slowly getting there. [Applause.] I am very happy that the Fighters are in support of the programme that we are dealing with.

Now, Mulder, let me tell you. When you stood up here last time you were defending ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G BOROTO): Hon members, please. On what Rule are you standing, hon member?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018

Page: 133

Mr M N PAULSEN: Chair, will the member take a question?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G BOROTO): Hon Chauke, are you ready to take a question?

Mr H P CHAUKE: No, this one still needs to be rehabilitated by the EFF.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G BOROTO): Hon Chauke, please mind your language.

Mr H P CHAUKE: No, I am not taking a question.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G BOROTO): Please sit down, hon Paulsen.

Mr H P CHAUKE: So, let's come back when we were dealing with the issue of the land, FFPlus stood here and threatened people that this is what's going to happen and all of that. In reality, only four per cent of the African people control the land. That is the truth. Now, let's go back again into the water, not a single dam is controlled by a black person. Show me anyone in the

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 134**

country. [Interjections.] Nobody! Nobody!

[Interjections.] All the remaining 3 700 dams are white controlled dams. They are white controlled dams. That's reality and it's a fact. We are going to enter into that struggle together, which you hear. [Interjections.] What we must not do, obviously, is to disorganise our own farmers that we love so much. What we are saying to them is that the state is going to come and take that water. The state is going to control the water that you use. Currently, you are diverting streams and rivers - all of these things that you do is illegal. We are going to be in control of every drop of water. Deputy Minister this is what you must do. The 1956 Act gives you that power to control water - control water - take charge. I raised this point earlier when hon Motsoaledi was talking about the issue of "I am going to take power."

Mr C P MULDER: Hon Chairperson, it seems the member wants to debate. Are you prepared to take a question?

Mr H P CHAUKE: I have a debate that I have proposed when we come back from recess.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018

Page: 135

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G BOROTO): Hon member, are you going to take a question?

Mr H P CHAUKE: No, I don't take questions now. I am waiting for a debate. For now, we are dealing with the issue of drought. It becomes an issue because now it's Western Cape. The last ten years in this country, from the North of the country and even across if you go to Zibambwe, Zambia and Namibia, people have been ravaged by drought. All of a sudden, now it is in the Western Cape - it's an issue. [Interjections.] Emam made a point here. It becomes an issue because it is Western Cape - Cape Town

*IsiZulu:*

Umlungu kumele abe namanzi zonke izinsuku kumele ageze.

[Ubuwelewele.]

*English:*

Mr H P CHAUKE: You have never pushed a wheelbarrow in your life. You have never carried a bucket on your head. [Interjections.] You have never done it. All of a sudden now it's Western Cape - Hey, you know there is no water.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018

Page: 136

People are worried. Investors are not going to invest. Even investors would not come to Western Cape because there is no water - what? For ages, for years, in the last 350 years of apartheid in colonialism our people were subjected to do that - to carry buckets, to push wheelbarrows, to drink with the cattle and the dogs, and the sheep and all of that. [Interjections.] This is what has been happening.

That is why I am saying break the umbilical cord with Jan Van Riebeeck, then will understand the problem that the country is faced with. If we were to do that, Chair, I am telling you with my comrade, friend Oosthuizen we are going to have a beautiful country. A beautiful country, I am telling because you will then begin to become South Africans. For now, you still believe that Holland is still your country, you must leave. If they moer [beat] you here. There is no Holland for you. You belong here. [Laughter.] You can't go anywhere. [Applause.] We are here together and we need to address our problems together - nobody else except ourselves. On that note thank you very much. Let us work together and will be

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 137**

able to resolve the challenges that are facing the country. ... [Time expired.]

**CONSIDERATION OF REPORT OF PORTFOLIO COMMITTEE  
ON TOURISM ON OVERSIGHT VISIT TO LIMPOPO  
PROVINCE**

**CONSIDERATION OF REPORT OF PORTFOLIO COMMITTEE  
ON TOURISM ON OVERSIGHT VISIT TO WESTERN CAPE  
PROVINCE**

Ms E K M MASEHELA: Thank you very much, House Chairperson. The Ministers present, Deputy Ministers present, hon members and visitors in the gallery. Happy International Women's Day!

Hon MEMBERS: Happy!

The Portfolio Committee on Tourism undertook provincial oversight visits to the Western Cape and Limpopo provinces on the 1st to 4th August 2017 and 11th to 15th September 2017, respectively.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018

Page: 138

The overall objective for the visits was to assess the state of tourism in the provinces especially with regard to working for tourism programmes, the co-ordination and co-operation amongst the spheres of government; the stakeholders participation in both public and private sectors and also the support given to emerging tourism enterprises.

In his state of the nation address, the President of the Republic, his Excellency Matamela Cyril Ramaphosa said, I quote "Tourism is another area which provides our country with incredible opportunities to quite literally shine."

Tourism currently sustains ... [Interjections.]

The House Chairperson: (Ms M G Boroto): Hon members, can you please take your seats? There is too much movement and noise. Continue Mma.

Ms E K M MASEHELA: Tourism currently sustains 700 000 direct jobs and is performing better than most other growth sectors. There is no reason why it cannot double

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 139**

in size. We have the most beautiful country in the world and hospitable people.

It is therefore imperative that we must all look at tourism as the sunrise sector with a huge potential to create job opportunities and address the country's socioeconomic challenges.

In the Western Cape, the committee was alarmed by their airlift strategy which has seen all spheres of government working together with private sector to have more flights landing in Cape Town.

The province has also increased the capacity of International Convention Centre which makes it to lead in tourism business and international arrivals. We also observed that the opportunities to involve the communities in cultural and heritage tourism are not well developed.

There is a need to develop local routes, township tourism and art and culture products. This area is not yet given much attention. The challenges that we observed was the

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 140**

devastative fires that almost destroyed the industry completely in Knysna.

House Chairperson, however, we would like to congratulate the people of Knysna especially the tourism stakeholders by their resilience. We also want to thank the government and private sector for their prompt intervention.

Tourism is booming in major urban areas like Cape Town whilst there is a challenge in hinterland and in the townships. These areas also need attention.

Transformation remains a challenge. The previously disadvantaged communities in places like Oudsthoorn and townships are still marginalized.

During the interaction with stakeholders, it was clear that tourism industry is still owned and dominated by the previously advantaged. The committee urges the provincial and the local authorities to create an abling environment for inclusive tourism.

We would also like to condemn the violence meted against Mzoli's place, which is the Iconic Shisa Nyama spot in

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 141**

Gugulethu. We have to teach our people the importance of tourism.

In Limpopo, the committee was pleased with the performance of domestic tourism and it has been leading in this regard since 2014, driven by visits from friends and relatives together with religious tourism.

We recommend that the South African Tourism assist the province to convert this into leisure tourism for it to generate income and create jobs.

We were also pleased by the co-ordination amongst the different spheres of government and stakeholders. The province has immense opportunities to further develop tourism due to its rich cultural diversity and the wildlife economy. Thank you so much. I do tourism let us all do tourism. [Applause.]

The TEMPORARY CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY (Mr M U Kalako):  
House Chairperson, I move that the reports be adopted.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 142**

The TEMPORARY CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY: (Mr M U Kalako)

There has been requests for declaration

*Declarations of Vote:*

Mr J VOS: Thank you, Madam Chairperson. These oversights visits once again demonstrate why tourism is fully dependent on well-maintained and functioning infrastructure.

So what we experienced in Limpopo compared to that of the Western Cape could be described as day and night. Madam Chair, the road network in certain parts of Limpopo is so bad that avoiding a pothole is a challenge; driving to the many tourism locations is a nightmare.

The fact of the matter is that fixing these roads in Limpopo would be a major investment in many ways. Not only would it improve mobility but it will also make it safer for citizens and visitors to drive on the roads and ultimately it will boost investor confidence.

Now, in a sense we could even label the Limpopo province as the province of potholes; such a pity because this is

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 143**

the province with great tourism potential but sadly not enough political will. Madam Chair, you cannot separate the value derived from tourism to the conditions of infrastructure and services. They are completely linked.

Therefore, the failure of so many ANC-led municipalities and the same goes for the Limpopo province, to deliver on their mandates of infrastructure, road network, sanitation and so the list goes on, impacts clearly on the ability of those towns to deliver on any tourism prospects.

Madam Chair, in my view, this robs the poor and the marginalised communities of the rights that the Constitution guarantees. Madam Chair, let the truth be told, these oversights visits simply indicate the real state of tourism on a local level, which is in a state of collapse.

Now more than ever, citizens need to realise that contrary to public believe, tourism does not clog up services and neither is a preserve for the rich. We need

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 144**

tourism to survive and it is essential for economic growth.

The figure that really strikes me is that one in seven people rely on the tourism sector for their livelihood. This is according to the High Level Panel Report released last year by former President Motlhanthe. In stark contrast to my visit to the Limpopo province, what we experienced in the Western Cape was a breath of fresh air to witness how municipalities are using their resources and their infrastructure to develop the tourism economy of their towns.

To be a successful tourism destination government must work with the private sector, to establish products and services that create market access and business opportunities; and this is precisely what we have done here in the Western Cape.

We are investing an infrastructure that drives demand and that makes business sense; a few examples, of course, would be the expansion of the international airport; the

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 145**

dedicated cruise terminal and also the international convention centre.

Those are the type of services that you need to make available if you want to be a successful tourism destination; but of course, we also need invest much more time and energy in doing township tourism revitalisation, because that is where a lot of our talent is; and that is where we can build tourism businesses from the ground and that could be tourism transformation in action.

It is a fact, Madam Chair that domestic tourism is coming under pressure. The reality is that many South Africans cannot afford to travel in their own country and with the looming increase in Vat it will absolutely put more South Africans under pressure in terms of the finances and again affecting the poor.

Madam Chair, the increase in Vat will certainly impact on the entire tourism value chain. Products and services will be affected, transportation cost will go up, and the knock on effect in terms of pricing on consumers will be much more.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 146**

Therefore, the implication of reduced tourism revenue generation will be the decrease in the potential of the tourism sector to create the much needed job opportunities for the economy of our country.

Madam Chair, let me conclude by saying that the tourism successes in the Western Cape cannot be limited to one province, just imagine what we could do for job creation throughout the country if we can change bad government for good in South Africa. Thank you. [Applause.]

Mr T RAWULA: Hon Madam Chair, we have always maintained that tourism in South Africa requires a political will. Because there is no political will, the only people in South Africa that are travelling this country everyday are taxi drivers, but there is no political will to involve taxi drivers to become tour guides. They are not brought in so that you increase the participation of black people into the tourism industry. It is mainly because they are black, because there is no other reason why taxi drivers are not trained to be the tour guides. That is number one.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 147**

Number two, we have a problem in South Africa of the monopolisation of grading council to those that they have been privileged participating into the industry. You still have the grading council that is untransformed. As a result, some of the requirements for some establishment from black townships - for them to be graded - they are useless ones just because to ensure that you constrain bed and breakfast, B&Bs, in townships from being graded and that is one of the obstructions of the transformation in this country. Therefore, we expect political will, Minister Hanekom, to ensure that there is more participation of the establishment in the township in terms of becoming B&Bs and also accommodate people that are coming as tourists.

Tourism in this country remains untransformed, particularly here in the Western Cape. You find in the Western Cape when it comes to tourism is white bosses tourists and black exploited workers. In our discussions with workers in the industry, particularly in the Western Cape when we conducted our own oversight, we found that workers remained casualised for years and they do not have contracts of employment. As a result, they are

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 148**

underpaid, receive no overtime payment and have no job security and are often racially abused. The DA in the Western Cape has allowed this to continue as it means that their distant relatives from overseas have a good holiday and their immediate relatives make profit at the expense of the black workers that are exploited.

Fundamental change is needed in the tourism industry so that it can be properly transformed. Our local tourism industry continues to experience double digit growth year to year. It is in this growing sector that government can and must empower black-owned tourism enterprises, even if it requires direct state support and protection. What this committee found in Limpopo is that government - despite having policies and measures in place to assist small black-owned small, medium and micro-sized enterprises, SMMEs, in the tourism industry - continues to face challenges. These include late payment of invoices from government itself.

We expect a political will to ensure that there is no constrain that is put in front of the black people that wish to participate into this industry. It is very clear

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 149**

that there is no capacity from the many municipalities here in the Western Cape and other areas to ensure that local people are able to participate and benefit from the tourism industry. We can only expect national government under your leadership, Minister, to ensure that you do everything in your power to ensure that local people are able to participate - this includes here in the Western Cape. The current initiatives and their institutions will do little to transform the tourist industry, and that is why we reject both reports as EFF. Thank you very much.

Inkosi R N CEBEKHULU: Hon Chairperson, may I firstly congratulate the Minister for having resumed his position again to lead this department, Mr Hanekom. Western Cape Province enjoys steady and growing influx to tourists through word of mouth and the positive review which a tourist who have visited Cape Town share upon their return to their countries of origin. Cape Town is undeniably an international tourist destination and is fondly known around the world as the Mother City. Only now due to recent events around the looming drought crisis in the city, and due to tourist not wishing to add to the strain on the already scarce resource, they are

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 150**

looking at visiting other areas and towns in the Cape Town.

Oudtshoorn is one such area which offers both historical and natural beauty. Tourism in Oudtshoorn which is adequately budgeted for by its local government structures and implemented by De Rust Tourism ensures that there are consent attractions and activities to ensure a steady stream of a tourist to the area. The fact that tourism is so well-co-ordinated through the municipality and De Rust Tourism makes it easy to receive private funding and income for further tourist related development provided from membership fees, fundraisers and from many corporate benefactors in the surrounding private sector. Challenges arise out of poor maintenance of facilities and roads and lack of signage. There are also other small towns in the surrounding area which we should be enjoying the fruits of obtaining rewards in tourism businesses, but because of lack of co-operation and co-ordination in lifting the busy of tourism in their municipalities, they continue to lack behind.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 151**

Limpopo which is one of the most rural provinces in South Africa also enjoys a large number of domestic tourists. This is maximising during the holiday month of the year when schools are closed and during the Easter holidays. Foreign tourists visit provincial parks and national parks - Kruger National Parks in this case and private game reserves. Tourist forums have been established to take care of promoting rapidly growing tourism initiatives including of ... Thank you. We support this report. [Time expired.]

Mr S C MNCWABE: Hon Chairperson, greetings to hon members. We all know that tourism plays an important role in growing the economy of our country. The role of government, the civil society and the small businesses and other role-players is to ensure that tourism is brought to the centre of advancing the gains of our democracy. The Limpopo province competitive advantages include: The diversity of wildlife; the natural and the cultural attributes; wild settings and vast open space; the World Heritage Site; cultural and landscapes; the three national parks; and the lot of game farms and nature reserves. The Limpopo Marula festival brings a

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 152**

total of about R42 million in the economy of the province each time the festival is heeded.

The NFP also agrees with the report that forensic audit be conducted to ascertain if funding for the phases of 1 and 2 for the Khalanga Guest Lodge were appropriately used. The challenge of infrastructure cannot be overemphasised and the need to engage the Department of Economic Development, the Department of Environmental Affairs and Tourism as well as the SA National Roads Agency, Sanral, also cannot be overemphasised. In the Western Cape we believe that all role-players should come together to tackle the issues of disaster that impact negatively on the tourism sector of the province.

We also believe that the Tourism Bill must be introduced as a matter of urgency to make sure that tourism is prioritised as one of the important sectors in our country, especially in economic development. Finally, we believe that if the department and municipalities as well as small businesses come together, they can play a crucial role in advancing the tourism in our country.

Thank you. We support the report.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018

Page: 153

*Afrikaans:*

Ms P E ADAMS: Agb Voorsitter, laat my toe om ons nuwe Minister, Derick Hanekom, terug by die Huis te verwelkom.

*English:*

The Portfolio Committee on Tourism done oversight visits to the Western Cape and the Limpopo Province, with the objective to assess the state of tourism in the above mentioned.

Tourism is perceived as a sector in the economy that can enhance economic growth and job creation. To meet this challenge, government and the private sector should support each other.

Through the development of the National Development Plan, the ANC-led government aims to eliminate inequalities and poverty by 2010.

The committee visited the Garden Route after the devastating fires and advocates for the development of a National Tourism disaster management strategy that, in

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 154**

the case of disaster, co-ordinates all the stakeholders at the three spheres of government.

The committee noted that tourism development and growth is flourishing in the major urban centre such as Cape Town but observed in the more rural areas of the province such as Oudshoorn and Hesekwa.

There are vast opportunities to involve communities in activities such as cultural and heritage tourism, township tourism and the development of local routes and homesteads often and authentic African tourism experience.

The airlift strategy of the province leads increased numbers of international airlines landing in Cape Town and ensured that business tourism increased and it improves on international arrivals. However, these benefits of the booming tourism in the Western Cape must be felt by the people in the townships.

The performance of domestic tourism is commendable, as this province is the number one spot in terms of tourism

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 155**

performance since 2014. The co-ordination amongst different stakeholders impressed the committee. The province should focus on developing business tourism.

The airlift in the province needs urgent intervention, as flights are erratic and unreliable, as the committee, on its visit, experienced firsthand.

The committee is pleased that the national tourism sector strategy was published by the department in December 2017. This will assist provinces in aligning with the national vision for tourism and improved tourism growth.

The Department of Tourism and SAT are therefore urged to take all provinces on board to improve the tourism sector.

Let us all do tourism! The ANC supports the report of the Portfolio Committee on Tourism. I thank you. [Applause.]

Agreed to (Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

**COMMEMORATION OF INTERNATIONAL WOMEN'S DAY**

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018

Page: 156

(Draft Resolution)

Ms M R MORUTOA: House Chair, I move without notice:

That the House -

(1) notes that -

(a) the 8<sup>th</sup> March is observed as the International Women's Day;

(b) further notes that this year's International Women's Day draws our attention to the rights and activism of rural women, who make up over a quarter of the world population, and are being left behind in every measure of development;

(c) believes that International Women's Day is a time to reflect on progress made, to call for change and to celebrate acts of courage and determination by ordinary

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018

Page: 157

women who have played an extraordinary role in the history of their countries and communities;

(d) further believes that it is also an opportunity to consider how to accelerate the 2030 Agenda, of building momentum for the effective implementation of the Sustainable Development Goals, especially gender equality and empowerment of all women and girls, as well as ensuring inclusive and quality education for all and promote lifelong learning;

(e) acknowledges that this year, International Women's Day comes on the heels of unprecedented global movement for women's rights, equality and justice;

(f) recognises that International Women's Day 2018 is an opportunity to empower women in all settings, rural and urban, and celebrate the activists who are working

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 158**

relentlessly to claim women's rights and realize their full potential; and

- (g) calls upon all South Africans to join activists around the world and UN Women to seize the moment, celebrate, take action and transform women's lives everywhere.

Agreed to.

**DA WON BY-ELECTIONS IN NELSON MANDELA BAY METROPOLITAN**

(Draft Resolution)

Mr R K PURDON: House Chair, I move without notice:

That the House -

- (1) notes that -

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018

Page: 159

- (a) by-elections were recently conducted in Ward 1 of the Nelson Mandela Bay Metropolitan Municipality;
- (b) further notes that the official results of the election indicate that of a total of 4767 votes cast, the DA secured 92% of the votes, which amounts to an overwhelming victory;
- (c) acknowledges that that this result is a resounding vote of confidence in our Executive Mayor, Athol Trollip, and the DA-led coalition government;
- (d) further acknowledges that the ANC's latest recruit, Mr Stanford Slabbert who endorsed the ANC candidate was unable to secure a victory for the ANC as a likely consequence of the allegations of racism against him for which he was expelled from DA in 2013;

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 160**

- (e) takes conscience of the tireless work of electoral officials of the Independent Electoral Committee in presiding over elections across South Africa; and
- (f) reaffirms its commitment to ensuring that South Africa's vibrant democracy continues to thrive through conducting regular elections which are free and fair.

**RABIES OUTBREAK IS STILL PREVALENT DESPITE VACCINATION**

(Draft Resolution)

Mr S P MHLONGO: House Chair, I move without notice:

That the House -

(1) notes that -

- (a) the outbreak of rabies which appears to have started in KwaZulu-Natal, and has now

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018

Page: 161

spread to Limpopo, Mpumalanga and Eastern Cape;

- (b) further notes that rabies is spread when an animal, usually a dog or cat, bites or scratches a human being, and their saliva comes in contact with an open wound;
- (c) acknowledges that despite the Department of Health stating that they embarked on a massive rabies vaccination programme last year, the number of reported rabies cases has increased since then;
- (d) further acknowledges that rabies is nearly always fatal with few cases of people surviving, and that because of this we have now unfortunately seen five deaths in the country since December 2017, due to the outbreak;
- (e) accepts that, because of the large amounts of stray animals in townships, it is

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 162**

mainly poor black people who are most at risk, and that children, particularly young children are most at risk of contamination of this particular disease;

- (f) recognises that a mass awareness campaign needs to be launched to inform the public on the dangers of rabies; and
- (g) calls on the Portfolio Committee on Health to investigate why, despite the vaccinations there was such a large outbreak.

**MOTION OF CONDOLENCE**

*(The late Else Depouche)*

Mr F ADAMS: House Chair, I move without notice:

That the House -

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018

Page: 163

- (a) notes with shock the passing of the ANC Western Cape PEC member, Mr Elese Depouche, on Tuesday, 6 March 2018;
- (b) further notes that Mr Depouche was shot as he entered his house in Crossroads around 20:00 on Tuesday, and died in Groote Schuur hospital hours later;
- (c) understands that the motive behind his murder and those responsible for it, is still unclear at this stage;
- (d) acknowledges that a former City of Cape Town councillor, Depouche, was a resilient and patient cadre of the movement with an indomitable spirit;
- (e) remembers him as a humble and honest bearer of the interests of the poor who realised that politics and public service is more than just work;

THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018

Page: 164

(f) calls upon the SA Police Service to leave no stone unturned in their investigation of this case; and

(g) conveys its condolences to the family and friends of Mr Elese Depouche.

**ROBBERS BRUTALLY ATTACKED TRIATHLETE MHLengi GWALA**

(Draft Resolution)

Mr M HLENGWA: House Chair, I move without notice:

That the House –

(1) notes that a Durban-based triathlete, Mhlengi Gwala, will undergo surgery after three unknown robbers tried to saw off his legs;

(2) further notes that the incident occurred on Tuesday during Mhlengi Gwala's morning cycle;

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018

Page: 165

- (3) understands that the three men dragged him into the bushes where they used a chainsaw as they attempted to cut off his right leg;
- (4) further understands that after failing to cut through his bone, they proceeded to attempt to cut the other leg, until security came to Gwala's aid;
- (5) calls on the police to ensure that the perpetrators of this cruel and heinous crime are apprehended and brought to book;
- (6) records its grave concern with the high levels of crime in South Africa which is increasingly becoming more violent;
- (7) further calls on the new Minister of Police to start treating crime in South Africa as a national crisis; and
- (8) wishes Mr Mhlengi Gwala a speedy recovery, hoping that he will return to the track to

THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018

Page: 166

pursue his dreams and inspire other young South Africans.

Agreed to.

**DISTRICT SIX RESIDENTS UNHAPPY WITH RENAMING OF  
UNIVERSITY**

(Draft Resolution)

Prof N M KHUBISA: House Chair, I move without notice:

That the House -

- (a) notes the concerns of the people of District Six in Cape Town with regard to the renaming of Cape Peninsula University of Technology;
- (b) further notes that District Six in the Cape Flats has some reservoir of history that has to do with the violation of basic human rights, and which also pertains to forced removals;

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 167**

- (c) recognises that the renaming of places and institutions needs consultation with all residents of the area concerned;
- (d) acknowledges that we have an obligation as a nation to reverse the injustices of the past; and
- (e) calls on the Department of Higher Education and Training to liaise with the administration of the Cape Peninsula University of Technology to discuss this matter and consult with the District Six residents before renaming the University to ensure that all the residents of Cape Flats are at ease and they are also brought on board as to the monumental importance of ridding the university of the baggage of the past and ensuring that it is in line with the new dispensation which does not bring with it the baggage of the apartheid regime.

Agreed to.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 168**

**ESKOM 95<sup>TH</sup> BIRTHDAY**

(Draft Resolution)

Ms L A MNGANGA-GCABASHE: Chairperson, the ANC moves without notice:

That the House -

- (1) notes that the power utility Eskom marked its 95th birthday on 1 March 2018;
- (2) further notes that the power utility was established on 1 March 1923 under the then Government of the Union of South Africa;
- (3) recognises that the power utility generates approximately 95% of the electricity used in South Africa and approximately 45% of the electricity used on the African continent;
- (4) also recognises that turning 95 years is a great milestone for Eskom, especially when it

THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018

Page: 169

grapples through the liquidity and governance challenges that are currently facing the power utility; and

- (5) finally, have confidence that the power utility will continue to contribute to the growth and development of the economy in our country South Africa.

Agreed to.

**WORLD HEALTH ORGANISATION'S RECOMMENDATION**

(Draft Resolution)

Mr M L W FILTANE: Hon Chairperson, on behalf of the UDM I move without notice:

That the House -

- (1) notes that the World Health Organisation, WHO, recommends one environmental health

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018

Page: 170

practitioner for every 10 000 people in order to optimally monitor food production processes;

- (2) further notes that the South African Institute of Environmental Health president, Dr Selva Mudaly, claims that South Africa has one environmental health practitioner for every 30 000 people, three times fewer practitioners than the recommendation of the WHO;
- (3) acknowledges that the above view was advanced by the UDM during the debate on the outbreak of listeriosis;
- (4) calls on Government to employ unemployed environmental health practitioners and where there is a shortage of skills, provide bursaries to aspirants and encourage the youth to become students in this field;
- (5) further calls on Government to meet these minimum standards, at the very least, so that diseases such as listeriosis can be tracked

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 171**

down before causing much harm to the citizens;  
and

- (6) lastly calls on Government must stringently regulate and improve food production quality standards to protect all people and visitors to South Africa.

Agreed to.

**TWENTY WOMEN EXAMINED FOR SIGNS OF MENSTRUATION**

(Draft Resolution)

Ms T STANDER: Chairperson, I hereby move on behalf of the DA without notice:

That the House -

- (1) notes that TopBet confirmed an incident where approximately twenty women employed in their Germiston branch were stripped down and physically examined for signs of menstruation;

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018

Page: 172

- (2) further notes that one of the victims, a 56-year-old woman, despite disclosing that she was menopausal in a plea to avoid this humiliating abuse described how a cleaner was instructed to put in a glove and physically inspect each woman, one by one in a toilet cubicle;
- (3) acknowledges that today is International Women's Day, and that too many of our mothers, sisters and daughters suffer human rights abuses daily;
- (4) condemns this act as an abhorrent violation of International Human Rights and the Bill of Rights as contained in our own Constitution;
- (5) calls on the Department of Labour to investigate the Basic Conditions of Employment and the Health and Safety conditions at TopBet branches across South Africa;
- (6) conveys our empathy and supports to the women who suffered this ordeal; and

THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018

Page: 173

- (7) urges all women in our country to report violence, abuse and harassment which is a legally and morally requirements and to seek support and justice for themselves and for others that is where we can stop human rights violations against women.

Agreed to.

**FIVE AMBULANCES IN THE SARAH BAARTMAN DISTRICT**

**Municipality**

(Draft Resolution)

Mr T RAWULA: Chairperson, I hereby rise on behalf of the EFF to move without notice:

That the House -

- (1) notes that the Sarah Baartman District Municipality in the Eastern Cape only has five ambulances servicing 80 000 population and three of them are not operating. They are not

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018

Page: 174

operating because, they are faulty since November last year;

- (2) further notes that Sundays River Municipality under the Sarah Baartman District Municipality, the traffic department further discovered that these ambulances are not road worthy;
- (3) acknowledges that this so called ambulances are in fact simply Iveco vehicles modified into an ambulance and that due to this and lack of maintenance these vehicles should never been allowed to transport patients;
- (4) further acknowledges that in October 2017 as a result of this perusal state of these ambulances, one ambulance broke down while caring a patient and as results the patient sadly lost his life;
- (5) recognise that this tragic accident could have been avoided had been there been proper

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 175**

management and sufficient resources in the public health sector;

- (6) realises that because of cadre deployment and corruption neither of this was possible; and
- (7) calls upon the Portfolio Committee on Health to investigate the matter and report back to the House.

**HENRI SCHOEMAN GOLD MEDAL FOR WORLD CUP TRIATHLON SERIES**

(Draft Resolution)

Ms B L ABRAHAMS: House Chairperson, the ANC moves without notice:

That the House -

- (1) notes that the South African athlete, Henri Schoeman, collected the first gold of the 2018 World Cup Triathlon Series, in Abu Dhabi, on Saturday, 2 March 2018;

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018

Page: 176

- (2) believes that the Olympic bronze medallist was in a class of his own in the sprint event as he won both the swimming and the cycle races to claim an impressive victory;
- (3) understands that Schoeman became the only second male triathletes after two-time Olympic champion Alistair Brownlee to win both the swimming and cycling events, and go on to win a World Triathlon Series, WTS, race;
- (4) remembers that it was an impressive display considering the wet conditions, making the course difficult;
- (5) recalls that the South African beat defending series champion Mario Mola of Spain in a mad dash on the 5 kilometre run leg; and
- (6) congratulates Schoeman on the fantastic performance and wishes him well in the upcoming 2018 Commonwealth Games next month.

THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018

Page: 177

Agreed to.

**SCHOOL GOVERNING BODY'S TRAINING**

(Draft Resolution)

Mr L M NTSWAYISA: Hon Chairperson, I hereby move on behalf of the AIC without notice:

That the House -

- (1) notes the significance of the training of school governing bodies, SGBs, which started at the beginning of March 2018, across the country;
- (2) further notes that SGBs are responsible for the schools' code of conduct, admissions, discipline, and the curriculum;
- (3) stresses that discipline at a school contributes positively to the school's pass rate;

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 178**

(4) acknowledges that the SGB should admit learners according to the space or accommodation available, and that the SGB, and the principal in particular, should be discouraged from excluding parents from decision-making processes; and

(5) calls on the Department of Basic Education to ensure that all SGBs receive proper trainings so as to run schools properly and that there are still no fee schools that are charging school fees that the department now should seriously start looking to this issue.

**SERGEANT GRANVILLE BROOKS KILLED HIS GIRLFRIEND; HER  
MOTHER AND HIMSELF**

(Draft Resolution)

Mr L RAMATLAKANE: Chairperson, I move without notice on behalf of the ANC:

That the House -

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 179**

- (1) notes that Detective Sergeant Granville Brooks, 41 attended detective training in Oudtshoorn and on his return home on Wednesday night an argument broke out between his partner and himself at the Lentegeur home on Thursday morning, 1 March 2018;
- (2) notes that he shot and killed his girlfriend and her mother before turning the gun on himself,
- (3) notes that the father of the girlfriend was the only survivor in this tragedy;
- (4) understands that the police responded to the incident and had to use smoke grenades to enter the house only to find three bodies in the bedrooms and;
- (5) that the House conveys its condolences to the family and friends of both families who suffered the loss in this tragedy.

Agreed to.

THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018

Page: 180

TRAGIC DEATH OF TWO YOUNG CHILDREN IN AN INFORMAL  
SETTLEMENT IN REDCLIFFE

(Draft Resolution)

Mr T J BRAUTESETH: Chairperson, I move without notice on behalf of the DA:

That the House -

- (1) notes with great sadness the circumstances surrounding the tragic death of two children in an informal settlement in Redcliffe, Verulam near Durban over the past weekend;
- (2) notes that the Duma children, aged nine and seven, were asleep at home on Saturday evening;
- (3) notes that at around 11pm, their father was forced to leave the family home to assist his sister who was a victim of domestic abuse;

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018

Page: 181

- (4) notes that Mr Duma was fearful of his children's safety, but was forced to assist his sister and as such secured their home by locking the front door and went out to get medical assistance for his sister;
- (5) further notes that whilst Mr Duma was away, the family home caught fire and that both children unable to escape, tragically perished in the blaze;
- (6) acknowledges the terrible loss the Duma family has suffered; and
- (7) extends its sincere condolences of this House;
- (8) calls on all members of this House to intensify all our efforts to improve the living conditions of all our communities in order to avoid similar tragedies in future.

Agreed to.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 182**

**VOTER REGISTRATION WEEKEND IN PREPARATION FOR 2019**

**GENERAL ELECTIONS**

(Draft Resolution)

Mr B L MASHILE: Chairperson, I move without notice on behalf of the ANC:

That the House -

- (1) notes that the weekend of 10-11 March 2018 was confirmed by the Independent Electoral Commission, IEC as an open voter registration weekend in preparation for 2019 general elections which are expected to take place between May and August next year;
- (2) understands that the IEC will open all the 22 609 voting stations around the country between 8am and 5pm to assist new voters to register;
- (3) believes this is an opportunity to also allow already registered voters who may have relocated

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018

Page: 183

or moved to re-register in their correct voting districts with their new personal details;

- (4) acknowledges that registered voters can check where they are registered by sending an SMS with their ID number to 32810;
- (5) recalls that according to the IEC, this registration weekend is a milestone towards the culmination of a two-year project to harvest addresses for all registered voters;
- (6) acknowledges the ruling of the Constitutional Court in 2016 which gave the Electoral Commission until June 2018 to update the voters' roll with all available addresses;
- (7) calls on all voters to bring along their bar-coded ID book to register. [Time expired.]

Agreed to.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018

Page: 184

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G BOROTO): Hon members that concludes notices without notice. The next item on the Order Paper is members' statements.

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY (Mr M U KALAKO): House Chair!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G BOROTO): Okay, let me allow the hon Acting Chief Whip

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY (Mr M U KALAKO): House Chair, in view of the fact that we don't see any Ministers here ... [Interjections.] the issues and the concerns were raised in the programming committee. And we know that this have been repeatedly raised in the House, the absence of Ministers during members' statements.

We would propose that the matter be referred to the Speaker to address this problem so that this can be raised with the leader of governance. And because of this absence of Ministers, we propose that the member's statements be deferred for today. But we seriously and

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 185**

strongly recommend that the Speaker must look to the matter so that this matter is addressed once and for all. Also as the ANC, we have a number of statements which our members have drafted to raise today. Thank you.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: House Chairperson, in terms of Rule 132 I would like to address you. Yesterday this House and members of this House could not perform their functions because members of the executive were not here. Today we are prevented from performing our functions as members and also this Parliament is prevented from performing its function because members of the executive have not bothered to come to work.

This is a direct violation of section 7(a) (b) of the powers, privileges and immunities of Parliament's Act because those Acts are now preventing us from doing our work. And these are matters and behaviour that I believe constitute contempt in terms of that Act and there are disciplinary sanctions that this House can oppose in terms of section 12 of that Act for members who show contempt for Parliament.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 186**

And I would suggest, because we talk about this, you know would know that this is not the first time we have raised it. We are talking this matter over and over again and nothing is happening and it is not acceptable. So, we have to look at changing the order of business to what we have been suggesting to move the order business so that this is at the beginning of the programme so that the executive can be here.

Secondly, we need to take a far harder line as this Parliament because this it's not acceptable that Ministers can just simply not pitch up and expect us to carry on. And I think we do need to look at charging Ministers for contempt in terms of powers and privilege act and it might then force them to come here. Otherwise, this new dawn is going to turn to a false dawn.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G BOROTO): Hon members, let us remember what the Acting Chief Whip of the Majority Party just said. He said that they propose that the statement be deferred. Can we respond to that? And I will allow those who are the Chief Whips or the Acting Chief Whips first to speak.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 187**

Ms N V MENTE: Chair number one, on the proposals, in terms of Rule 132(4)(5)(6) with the number of statements, as much as we have no other option but to defer because no one is going to respond to us, then on the day that we defer today's statements, we do not remove the statements of that particular day. That means we are going to have today's statements with particular day's statements read together. So if EFF has two, it will have four on that day.

Secondly, I second the Chief Whip of the DA on saying that members' statements, motions without notice and notices of motion must move to the top of the programme of everyday because the Ministers of the ANC are very important so we are trying to cater for their status of only being here and earn their salary for the beginning part of Parliament and they are not here when we are closing the days duties of Parliament.

Lastly, all of them must be charged. Powers and privileges not only apply to us. In terms of ethics of this Parliament, this is an unethical conduct. We cannot have Ministers that are just being awol so someone must

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018

Page: 188

account, and its themselves and not just the leader of governance. Thank you.

Mr M HLENGWA: House Chair, I think the fact that we have an executive of plus minus 72 people and only one member of the executive is here today, the Deputy Minister of Science and Technology is the clearest of indications of how unserious the executive takes this Parliament. And what is unfortunate and I think this must be conveyed in the clearest of terms, we are not ...

*Zulu:*

... isiphukuphuku ...

*English:*

... in this House to be raising the same issue over and over again with the same people as if we are speaking to children. It's unacceptable and the niceties of it at some point must come to an end, so yes, they must be charged. The Minister was here and as soon as his item was done he left and we must remain in the House.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 189**

Secondly, last year the former Minister of Communications who is Science and Technology now, told this House that in one way or the other they developed the rooster to make sure that the Ministers are here and even that has not worked. So it is the clearest of indications that in the absence of consequences, Ministers will continue to treating this House with disdain as if it is an executive Parliament whereas its actually not.

So, I think it is important that the concern of members are raised in the most strongest of terms for them to recognise how seriously we are taking this. On the proposal that has been placed on the table, its fine, fair enough, lets defer the member's statements. It's unfortunate though that we have to do that because we have intended to raise important issues. Hon Ngwezi was here to talk about basic education, the biggest of crisis. We can't raise those things because the Ministers are not here. But we agree that one, let them be deferred.

Secondly, on the day on which they are placed like hon Mente has said, we will have two rounds of it so that we

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 190**

must not be prejudiced as members from performing our own duties. Finally ... [Interjection.] ... excuse me?  
[Laughter.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G BOROTO): Continue hon member, we are listening.

Mr M HLENGWA: So what I am saying is that the leader of government business as new as he is, the fact that he is not here is a clearest of indication that this new dawn is only there for morning runs and early evening to go and rest for the next run in the morning.

Prof N M KHUBISA: Thank you very much House Chairperson. As the NFP we also want to register our displeasure. You are also a witness that this matter has come up sharply in almost all National Assembly Programming Committee, NAPC, meetings, especially last year, and each time it came up the Chief Whip of the Majority Party promised that the whip would be cracked and Ministers would come and answer, and respond to Member Statements.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 191**

This is the only opportunity that members have in line with Rule 132 and it just deprives members the opportunity of raising issues. They have many issues coming from their constituencies.

Of course in the morning the Speaker promised that this matter would be taken up but there have been promises, promises and promises that have never been fulfilled.

It is therefore our wish that there should be a timeframe and an end to this. I concur with the members who have said that there should be sanctions because this is nothing else but a dereliction of duty and an abdication of the constitutional responsibilities of Ministers and Deputy Ministers. We want to see it happening as speedily as possible.

The President, when he was still Deputy President, promised that this matter would be attended to but this matter has never been attended to. Therefore we say, with these recommendations that we give, that this matter should be attended to as speedily as possible.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 192**

Mr N L S KWANKWA: Hon Chair, thank you very much for the opportunity. If you remember correctly, some time towards the end of the fourth term last year this matter came up and one of the proposals that some of the smaller parties made was that the Member Statements had to be deferred to the next sitting. Remember that? It was the two largest parties that rejected that proposal. Today we are saying that Member Statements must be deferred and we are expected to agree to that because the two largest parties are making that proposal. I don't operate like that in general. I do not.

However, here I think we have to try to be reasonable and say that the problem here is that you have members of the executive who behave like celebrities. It's almost as if they are doing us a favour by coming to Parliament. They come here to greet us and they leave us, and then they don't perform their duties. We had the same problem yesterday and we have the same problem today.

However, since there are initiatives already being undertaken by the Speaker to once again engage the executive on our behalf, in particular the President ...

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018

Page: 193

the Leader of Government Business, we would agree with the proposal that Member Statements be deferred.

In particular, we want to agree with the proposal from the EFF. Hon Mente is quite right in saying that the cycle must not be changed. Remember, the cycle will affect us, right? The cycle must not be changed. Those who were supposed to make Member Statements today should deliver their Member Statements during the next sitting of the House. However, over and above that, we must make sure that whatever other Member Statements had to be delivered on that particular day are not sacrificed so that we are not disadvantaged at the end of the day.

The fact of the matter is that we can only change the situation if sanctions can be imposed on Ministers who show or treat Parliament with disdain and who don't take us seriously. It's as simple as that, otherwise ...

*IsiXhosa:*

... into eza kwenzeka mama, siza kude sipele esi sigaba sale Palemente ibengathi siyanqwakuza okanye sifane nabantu abanethontsi entloko sibe size apha ukuza

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 194**

sebenzela abantu boMzantsi Afrika. Andikwazi ke mna ukubane ndithetha into enye oko ingathi mhlawumbi ndinengxaki okanye ndinethontsi. Le nto mayenziwe ngendlela kwaye iNkokeli yoLawulo lukaRhulumente - Leader of Government Business makeze, lo kanye usandula kungena ukuba abe ngumongameli. Ngela xesha ebeyilaa nkokeli ebebane esiza, andimazi ke lo umtsha ingathi uzakuba ngusaziwayo naye umane esiza xa ethanda azele nje ukubulisa aphinde ahambe.

Mr S N SWART: Thank you Chairperson. From the ACDP's side we would like to endorse what previous speakers have said. Let us also bear in mind that the Constitutional Court criticised Parliament for not holding the executive sufficiently to account in a number of matters.

Statements are a form of holding the executive to account and therefore it is disgraceful that members of the executive are not here today. I am fully in support of the moves and possible sanctions because - being here in my fourth term of Parliament - this is an issue which continues to come up, come up, come up. We get undertakings that it will be addressed and yet we see no

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018

Page: 195

action in that regard. So from Parliament's side we do need to issue a very strong message that this will no longer be tolerated.

Mr L M NTSHAYISA: Thank you very much hon Chairperson. Sanctions are the way. You know, this is very disheartening and we can no longer tolerate it. Each and every day at our Chief Whips' Forum meetings we talk about this and nothing is happening. I don't think the Ministers are very serious. They are not serious about this. It's worse today. Not even one Minister is here to respond to the statements that we make.

So where are they taking this country to now? What are they thinking? They should be serious, and even if they are not paid just for one month that will be very good so that they can feel it.

*Sepedi:*

Mna M A PLOUAMMA: Modulasetulo wa Ngwako, le nna ke re ke bolele ka Sepedi sa gešo gore Matona le Batlatšatona bao ba sego gona mo ba a re swabiša. Ke be ke gopola gore re seke ra ba tlogela ka lebaka la gore ke Matona a mantši

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018

Page: 196

ao a kgethilwego ke ... Le ge a kgethilwe ke mopresidente wa naga, bontši bja Matona a tšwa go ANC.

Ke be ke kgopela gore le e hlagiše taba ye lekgotleng gore batho ba ba tsebe gore go ba Tona ke go direla setšhaba; ga o itirele boithatelo. Taba ye e a nyamiša ka gore ba bangwe ba bona ga ba na le dibeke tše pedi ba kgethilwe. Eupša ba šetše ba tagilwe ke maemo, ga ba sa tla le go tla Palamenteng. Seo se kgopišago ke gore ba senyetša le rena nako. Go ba ga rena mo ga ba bone go na le mohola.

*English:*

They serve themselves.

*Sepedi:*

Bjale, anke Palamente ye e bontšhe gore ka nnete go ba Tona ke go direla setšhaba. A re seke ra humana re bolela mo Palamenteng, gosasa ge le fihla lekgotleng la ANC la ba tshepiša go ba tšhireletša.

*English:*

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018

Page: 197

They must know that we are all important and we are serving our people. To be a Minister is not a privilege or a birthright. You are a servant of the people, as the President said. I don't know who they are serving. Where are they? So, ...

*Sepedi:*

... ke be ke kgopela gore ...

*English:*

... this thing must stop! We can't tolerate it anymore.

*Sepedi:*

Gonabjale re eme mó re tlo dira ditatemente tša maloko, eupša ga ba gona. Gape re senyegelwa ke nako.

*English:*

The next time we are going to have a long day because of them. They must be punished for this day. I agree with all the parties that have spoken. We can even take their salaries if needs be. We must make sure that each one of them who comes here ... Like Minister Derek Hanekom. He just came in and left just now.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018

Page: 198

*Sepedi:*

Ga se yena feela.

*English:*

There are many of them.

*Sepedi:*

Bjale, se se ra gore ...

*English:*

... they are just here for us to listen to them and for whatever they want to do. After they are finished they don't care anymore. Whoever was here today and who left without any reason must be named and shamed.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): All parties were given an opportunity to comment on the proposal and what I got is that none of them oppose the deferral of this item. I must honestly say that we will ... This concern that members have raised has been recorded and we will convey it to the Speaker's office. The Speaker will know that the Leader of Government Business is the one responsible. The Speaker will talk to the Leader of

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 199**

Government Business. Maybe the Rules Committee will have to suit and even Programming, to see how we come out of this because being here we cannot impose a sanction.

However, I want to thank you for really understanding the situation that not only you but everybody who is a member of this Parliament is in. I think we share the sentiments and we will make sure that this issue is dealt with. When the Speaker opened this plenary today she spoke of what happened yesterday and what will be happening. This will also be packaged to that. Thank you very much.

At this stage I want us to continue and finish our Order Paper. We now go to Notices of Motion.

**NOTICES OF MOTION**

Ms G K TSEKE: House Chair, I give notice that at the next sitting of the House I shall move on behalf of the ANC that the House debates dispelling the dangerous myths and discrimination of albinism in South Africa.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018

Page: 200

Mr M WATERS: Chair, I give notice that at the next sitting of the House I shall move on behalf of the DA:

That the House –

- (1) notes that section 17(2e) of the Powers and Privileges Act states that a person who whether or not during examination under section 17 would fully furnish this House or committee within information or makes a statement before it which is far from misleading, committing offence and is liable to a fine or imprisonment for a period not exceeding two years or both the fine and imprisonment;
- (2) further notes that the report under recommendation 41(12) of the South African Broadcasting Corporation, SABC, Ad hoc enquiry into the SABC board found out the then Minister of Communications Mrs Faith Muthambi testimony with regards to the amendments of the Mii did not align with the contents minutes of the board

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018

Page: 201

meeting and could be seen as a attempt to misleading the enquiring;

(3) takes cognisance of the Minister's evidence with regard to Hlaudi Motsoeneng's appointemtn as coo contradicts the board's minutes that she did not pressurise the board to appoint Mr Motsoeneng as the coo;

(4) acknowledges that the following Member of Parliament has been identified for possible further process in terms of section 13 of the Powers and Privileges Act, namely Ms F Muthambi and refers Ms Faith Muthambi to the powers and privileges committee for further investigation [Interjections.]

Mr P G MNGUNI: I rise on a point of order. Obviously, I think our colleague there might be tempted to do a statement. I think we are in the notices of motion.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 202**

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G BOROTO): Can I allow him to finish. Finish hon member. You have removed my clock there. I had been counting he was left with 4 seconds.

Mr M WATERS: I am moving a substantive motion which is the rule.

- (5) Refers Ms Muthambi to the Powers and Privileges committee for further investigation.

Mr M N PAULSEN: Chair, I give notice that at the next sitting of the House I shall move on behalf of the EFF that the House debates a model for reducing the dependency of municipalities on the national fiscus by developing self sustaining municipalities that will participate in the economic development of the municipality.

Ms H V NYAMBI: I give notice that at the next sitting of the House I shall move on behalf of the ANC that the House debates improving access to justice and the transformation of the judicial system in order to enhance

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 203**

efficiency and effectiveness of legal services to society.

Mr X NGWEZI: I give notice that at the next sitting of the House I shall move on behalf of the IFP that the House debates the issue of the 115 young learners of Mashiyamahle High School under Maphumulo Municipality in KwaZulu-Natal who were alleged to have been involved in a matric examination cheating scandal in 2014 who have not been found guilty but have still not yet received their result and whose lives are on a complete standstill as a result of this.

Mr S C MNCWABE: Hon Chairperson, I give notice that at the next sitting of the House I shall move on behalf of the NFP that the House debates the nationalisation of all privately owned dams.

Mr M WOLMARANS: Chair, I give notice that at the next sitting of the House I shall move on behalf of the ANC that the House debates the intensification efforts to realise Madiba's vision of a united South Africa in which all live in peace with equal rights and opportunities.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 204**

Mr N L S KWANKWA: House Chair, I give notice that at the next sitting of the House I shall move on behalf of the UNDM that the House debates the need to brought in the mandate of the South African Reserve Bank in order to ensure that it also has a socio economic development objective.

Mr M H HOOSEN: I give notice that at the next sitting of the House I shall move on behalf of the DA:

That the House –

(1) notes that Minister Gigaba misled the Portfolio Committee for Home Affairs on the 6th of March 2018 when he stated that neither Ajay nor Atul Gupta were South African citizens as Ajay had not renounced the Indian citizenship and Atul never applied for South African citizenship;

(2) further notes that the director-general of the Department of Home Affairs Mr Apleni subsequently exposed Minister Gigaba 's false during a media briefing on the 7th of March

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018

Page: 205

2018 confirming that Atul Gupta had been naturalised as a South African citizen in November 2002;

- (3) acknowledges that such behaviour is in contravention of paragraph 2.(3a) of the Executive Ethics Code which states that Members of the Executive may not deliberately or inadvertently mislead the President, the Premier or as the case may be the legislature;
- (4) recognises that appropriate action must be taken against hon Gigaba;
- (5) further notes that this House has been played by evasive and misleading statements by various Ministers;
- (6) refers this matter to the Joint Committee on Ethics and Members' Interests for an appropriate sanction.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018

Page: 206

Mr N S MATIASE: House Chair, I give notice that at the next sitting of the House I shall move on behalf of the EFF:

That the House –

- (1) debates the memory of Chief Junghwa and Ndlambe who were murdered on Christmas day in 1811 and 1812 by Juan Graham; and that in murdering them he named that town after himself;
- (2) call upon the people of eRhini to remember these two events done by so called Christians on Christian Day and New Year's Day and change the name of Graham and all symbols that represents Johan Grahams in eRhini and the surrounding areas.

Ms P V MOGOTSI: I give notice that at the next sitting of the House I shall move on behalf of the ANC that the House debates building a society in which black poverty and white privilege are consigned to the past, replaced by respect, solidarity and nonracial equality.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018**

**Page: 207**

Ms P BHENGU: I give notice that at the next sitting of the House I shall move on behalf of the ANC that the House debates strengthening the organs of civil society, including street committees and other community based organisations, understanding that they provide the means through which people can participate fully in changing their lives for the better.

Mr N XABA: I move on behalf of the ANC that in its next sitting the House debates building an open and dynamic economy that embraces technological innovation, pursues higher productivity, creates jobs and improves the quality of life for all citizens.

Ms J EDWARDS: Chair, I give notice that at the next sitting of the House I shall move on behalf of the DA that the House debates the lack of recycling in South Africa, as well as the dismal failure of government to hands with the private sector to create sufficient opportunities that will enable a recycling conscience environment.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 8 MARCH 2018

Page: 208

Ms P NKONYENI: I give notice that at the next sitting of the House I shall move on behalf of the ANC...

[Interjections.]

*IsiZulu:*

USIHLALO WENDLU (Nk M G Boroto): ... Ma, ngicela uwubeke ... uyicindezele inkinobho ... iyasebenza? Yebo iyasebenza. Sondela kuwo ma. Wubambe.

Ms P NKONYENI... I give notice that at the next sitting of the House I shall move on behalf of the ANC that the House debates Intensifying the effort of building a nonsexist society in which the oppression and exploitation of women, whether in the workplace, in communities or in the home is eradicated.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G BOROTO): Happy International Women's Day.

The House adjourned at 18:14.