

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 1

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

PROCEEDINGS OF THE NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

The House met at 14:02.

The Speaker took the Chair and requested members to observe a moment of silence for prayer or meditation.

The SPEAKER: Hon members, before we proceed with today's business, Parliament has learned with shock of the tragic passing in a car accident of ANC Member of Parliament and Chairperson of the Portfolio Committee on Labour, hon Fezeka Loliwe. We wish to convey heartfelt condolences to the family of Ms Loliwe. At an appropriate time a condolence motion will be scheduled to give the House an opportunity to formally express its condolences. May we stand and observe a moment of silence and respect of the hon member. Thank you.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 2

I also wish to announce that the President has informed me that he has appointed the Deputy President of the Republic of South Africa, Mr D D Mabuza as Leader of Government Business in the National Assembly [Applause.] in terms of section 91(4) of the Constitution.

Lastly, I wish to announce that I have received a notification that the motion in the name of Ms J L Fubbs on the SA Reserve Bank schedule for today has been withdrawn. [Applause.] Accordingly, there will be no debate on this matter today.

**CONSIDERTION OF REPORT OF PORTFOLIO COMMITTEE ON
COMMUNICATIONS - ON FILMS AND PUBLICATIONS AMENDMENT BILL**

There was no debate.

THE DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: Hon Speaker,
I move that the report be adopted.

Motion agreed to (Democratic Alliance dissenting).

Report accordingly adopted.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 3

FILMS AND PUBLICATIONS AMENDMENT BILL

(Second Reading debate)

The MINISTER OF COMMUNICATIONS: Madam Speaker, hon members, first of all, we need to appreciate the work that has been done by the Portfolio Committee during the course of the amendment Bill. It also included requesting the Department of Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation to conduct a socioeconomic impact assessment on the Bill.

We were advised that the committee was confronted by different stakeholders, some of whom applauded to this initiative while others criticise the Bill. This should be taken as a critical process which is part of our participatory democracy as envisaged in our Constitution.

The choice that was faced by all of us was to indicate as to what kind of society we wish to have in this country in line with constitutional values. Can we imagine a state or society without any value system to uphold? Equally, can we imagine a state in which content

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 4

classification and registration of content is not required.

As we have stated previously, the Films and Publication Board, FPB, is now operating in a digital environment that poses challenges to the entity in terms of regulating and classifying content. We are raising some of these issues because section 28(2) of the Republic of South Africa Constitution compels us all to ensure that a child's best interest is of paramount importance in every matter concerning the child. A child means a person under the age of 18.

We also are aware that Internet offers an opportunity for citizens and organisations to add their voices to public life and equally is an involving platform for accessing information.

Researchers found, hon Speaker, that the average age of a child to be exposed to sexual abuse material is 11 years. What is most alarming is that most children do not deliberately search for harmful materials but it just pops up on their screens.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 5

The truth is that as country, we are a signatory to a number of international protocols and internally, there are policies and legislation that we have to adhere to in relation to online child protection.

This Act as amended regulates the creation, the production and distribution of certain publications and certain films by classifying them and by imposing age restrictions.

This Act has become somewhat obsolete in the face of a proliferation of the Internet and social media, the use of revenge porn, and therefore, there is a need to ensure that the Bill encapsulates the technological innovations as they are reflected.

We should once more, Madam Speaker, ensure that as a nation, we also tolerate diversity and choice. It is precisely because of that that as we table and adopt this Bill; we take cognisance of what is happening in the outside community on the processes that have to do with the movie Ixeba. It is on that basis that as we debate here today on this particular Bill, we take into

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 6

cognisance some of the issues that have to do cultural diversity, religious tolerance and the abuse of those that are the most vulnerable and degradation of values and African culture

Let me take this opportunity therefore, to comment the Portfolio Committee and all other stakeholders and reaffirm our commitment as government that we will aspire and continue to pursue the right as enshrined in the Bill of Rights without undermining what is of importance, the right to cultural practice without interference and also preventing commercialisation of culture, religion and most importantly, embrace unity in our diversity. I thank you. [Applause.]

Mr C H M MAXEGWANA: Speaker and members, the Films and Publications Act, Act 65 of 1996, as amended, regulates the creation, production and distribution of certain publications and certain films by classifying them and imposing age restrictions.

This means that any person who knowingly distributes or posts material on any platform, including websites, that

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 7

contains a visual presentation of child pornography, explicit violence, explicit sexual conduct that degrades a person and that constitutes incitement to cause harm, or the explicit infliction of extreme violence that constitutes incitement to cause harm, is guilty of an offence. As we know, the Films and Publications Act was enacted in 1996, and it has become obsolete in the face of proliferation of the internet and social media and the use of revenge porn.

Therefore, there is a need to ensure the Bill encapsulates the technological innovations in the country. In the context of an ever-greater convergence of media technologies, platforms and services, and more media being accessed from the home through high-speed broadband networks, the need for a comprehensive review of the regulatory and classification laws becomes apparent. It is also consistent with international trends on regulation in a digital environment, many of which are driven through the International Telecommunication Union that South Africa is a member of.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 8

The major principles that have informed media classification in South Africa - such as adults being free to make their own, informed media choices and children being protected from the material that may cause harm - continue to be relevant and important. Whilst a convergent media environment presents major new challenges, there continues to be a general expectation that certain media content will be accompanied by classification information based on decisions that reflect community norms and standards.

Noting a number of requests pointing to the inadequacy of the consultation period, the committee extended the date for submissions on the Films and Publications Amendment Bill. A total of 32 were received from various stakeholders who expressed their concerns and took their time to enhance the Films and Publications Amendment Bill legislative process. Even today, there are those who are still submitting their views about the Bill, but surely we cannot continue with an open-ended process. In several cases, organisations made joint submissions. The submissions covered a spectrum of interests, including broadcasting, telecoms and the internet service provider,

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 9

ISP, industry, concerned organisations and groups, regulator and enforcement agencies, nongovernmental organisations, and civil society sector organisations. Some comments were acceded to, and with some the department and committee did not agree.

More pertinently, there is consensus that due to the current digital convergence environment, this was a timely and much needed technical legislative amendment. South Africa and the international markets have seen a gradual shift in the distribution of content from traditional content distribution platforms like DVDs, VHS, and cinema to online content distribution platforms. There have been some significant changes in the way South Africans access media content - sometimes to the detriment of the societal values enshrined in the Constitution, such as hate speech and the protection of children from harmful content. Furthermore, the increasing availability of video-on-demand services has broadened the context within which the South African classification and consumer advice could be displayed.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 10

Members of the committee worked well collaboratively to ensure the work on this important piece of legislation is completed. We further extend our gratitude to the department and stakeholders for the valuable input and hard work. The ANC supports the Bill. Thank you very much, Speaker.

Afrikaans:

Me V VAN DYK: Speaker en lede van die Huis, net soos die DA nie grondhervorming sonder vergoeding kan ondersteun nie, kan ons nooit wetgewing ondersteun wat sal lei tot enige vorm van onregmatige sensuur nie.

Daar is verskeie voorbeelde in die Suid-Afrikaanse geskiedenis waar staatsensuur gebruik is om onregmatig beheer uit te oefen en verdeeldheid te beperk. Boeke, toneelstukke, musiek en films wat as ondermynend beskou is, is bloot verban. Koerante wat die onregmatige onderdrukkingsregime kritiseer het, is summier gesluit. Die herroepe Wet op Publikasies en Vermaaklikhede kon destyds enige opinie of reaksie wat hulle as onwenslik of skadelik vir openbare sedes geag het, of wat moontlik die goeie orde kon benadeel, as geheel verbied.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 11

Op 'n soortgelyke wyse poog die Film- en Publikasieraad, FPR, nou, onder die vaandel van morele wagbond en beskermer van die publiek, om groter sensuur toe te pas. Die onlangse herklassifisering van die film *Inxeba: The Wound* spreek boekdele. Die lot van aanlyn vryheid van spraak en die onafhanklikheid van digitale inhoud hang beslis in die weegskaal.

In die 1990's is die Wet op Films en Publikasies goedgekeur en die Film- en Publikasieraad ingestel as 'n statutêre liggaam. Die raad se plig was om te klassifiseer, nie om sensuur toe te pas nie. 'n Verdere doel was om mense in te lig oor die inhoud van rolprente en sekere ander publikasies onder die volgende slagspreuk: Ons lig jou in; jy kies.

English:

We inform; you choose.

With the Films and Publications Amendment Bill introduced in November 2015, it seems that the Film and Publication Board wants to make these important choices for the public. The new Bill seeks to amend the existing Films

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 12

and Publications Act to make it applicable to all online content under the pretext of the amendments being necessary to combat harmful content such as racism and hate speech found online and, in particular, to protect children from sexual exploitation and child pornography.

Although we fully support the introduction of stricter measures to combat child pornography, we have to consider whether it might not be addressed better under the proposed Cybercrimes and Cybersecurity Act or amendment to the Criminal Law (Sexual Offences and Related Matters) Act, as these matters should be dealt with by the SAPS, not by the FPB. This also extends to the provisions of the criminalisation of hate speech and revenge porn for the same reason. We should ensure the appropriate bodies deal with these very serious crimes in order to guarantee there are serious consequences and sanctions when a crime is committed.

Afrikaans:

Die beleid onderskei nie tussen groot deelnemers soos internasionale videostroom-maatskappye soos Netflix en gewone verbruikers soos 'n persoon met 'n multimedia

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 13

blog, wie SMS'e stuur, of wie gebruik maak van WhatsApp nie. Die gebruik van terme soos "verspreiding" en "inhoud" is onduidelik. Presies watter inhoud moet geklassifiseer word en watter inhoud nie? Oormatig breë en swak gedefinieerde bewoording skep die potensiaal vir misbruik. Definisies en bewoording moet baie spesifiek wees, want enige regulasie wat vryheid van spraak kan beperk, moet streng gedefinieer word.

Vereistes om by die FPR te registreer en vooraf te klassifiseer is 'n vorm van sensuur en is sonder twyfel beperkend op die vloei van inligting. Hiermee word uitgewers verplig om inhoud te weerhou van landsburgers om te verseker dat dit voldoen aan die raad se standarde. Die Grondwethof het beslis dat hierdie vorm van voor-publikasie sensuur onaanvaarbaar is ten opsigte van koerante en publikasies wat deur die Persraad beheer word. Aanlynverspreiders en -verbruikers behoort dieselfde vrywaring te hê en dieselfde beskerming te geniet.

Die uitbreiding van internetverbindinge in Suid-Afrika, vloei van inhoud op nuwe platforms, en die vermoë om met

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 14

dieselfde multimedia-inhoud op verskillende toestelle te kommunikeer, maak beskikbare inhoud onbeperk. Digitale omskakeling bemoelik egter die vermoë van die FPR om sy regulatoriese mag af te dwing, en effektiewe klassifikasie van aanlyn-inhoud sal onnodig duur wees. Dit sal vereis dat groot getalle mense in diens geneem moet word om toesig te hou en hierdie regulering af te dwing - energie en hulpbronne wat beter elders bestee kan word, soos op die bevordering van digitale geletterdheid om mense te bemagtig om hulself aanlyn te beskerm.

Met enige beleid oor boeke, films, die internet en die inhoud daarvan moet gepoog word om 'n gunstige omgewing te skep om die opleidings- en ontwikkelingsektor te laat groei, onder andere inhoudsproduksie wat 'n belangrike komponent kan wees vir ekonomiese groei. Die beleid moet 'n oop en mededingende aanlynlandskap aanmoedig en fasiliteer, een wat die reg op vryheid van spraak en uitdrukking aan platformverskaffers deur billike wetgewing afdwing. Tans probeer die FPR die internet as 'n bedreiging eerder as bemagtiger met ekonomiese voordele voorhou.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 15

Soos die voorgestelde wetgewing tans daar uitsien, kan die DA dit nie ondersteun nie. Die wetsontwerp het grondwetlik baie leemtes wat nie goed nagevors is nie, wat verreikende gevolge ten opsigte van verdere koste en sensuur kan hê.

English:

Government cannot dictate what people in South Africa are allowed to see or what they have access to. Let South Africa choose.

We strongly object to the Amendment Bill and will never support any form of censorship. Thank you. [Applause.]

Ms L L VAN DER MERWE: Hon Speaker, social media can be an unforgiving platform. I am sure, as Members of Parliament, we have all felt the heat at some point.

An unwarranted attack on Facebook or Twitter always hurts. However, I always find comfort in knowing that if we are ever to be confronted with a severe hate speech or racist attack on the Internet, we do have recourse in law

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 16

to seek justice. So, why is there the need for this Films and Publications Amendment Bill?

Proponents of the Bill will motivate that this amending Bill seeks to bring broadcasters of things like hate speech, racism and revenge porn to book. However, opponents of this amending Bill, such as the Right2Know Campaign have likened the Bill to apartheid-style tactics, saying that it uses the pretext of protecting the public to implement a system of internet censorship. So, who is telling us the truth?

Well, it is clear that this Bill, through the Film and Publication Board, seeks to take wholesale control of the Internet. Amongst some of the provisions, this Bill requires everyone who generates some type of revenue from distributing content online to register, pay a fee, and have their content proofed and classified before they can post it. This smacks of censorship. The Constitutional Court has already ruled this type of pre-approval process to be unconstitutional in terms of news content, which forms a large part of our online media consumption.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 17

Let's be honest. Policing the internet is a near-impossible task. More so, if you are expecting the Film and Publication Board to do it. This is the exact same board which is now mired in controversy after it went against the provisions of the Constitution and limited freedom of expression by labelling *Inxeba* as X-rated pornography. This X-rating had to be lifted by the court today, for the time being.

Furthermore, the cost implications of this amending Bill will be massive. Where will the Film and Publication Board find the manpower to man the entire internet? Other concerns include the fact that very little of the public's concerns were taken into consideration.

Let me conclude by saying that the IFP remains advocates for the rights of the most vulnerable in our society, especially children. Much more must be done to stop the spread of child pornography. However, we are unconvinced that this Bill, in its current form, will meet constitutional muster, and so, will, in all likelihood, be challenged.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 18

Finally, censorship forms part of the hallmarks of authoritarian regimes, such as North Korea, China, and former President Zuma's failed administration. We did not expect the same from President Ramaphosa's New Dawn. I thank you. [Applause.]

Prof N M KHUBISA: Hon Speaker, hon members, the film and publications industry has an obligation to educate, inform and entertain both the young and the old.

The original Act has been found to have numerous loopholes in matters of compliance, distribution, exhibition, publications, classification, selling and commercialisation. There is, indeed, a lot of harm that has been caused as a result of failure to ensure proper regulation of the film industry.

Some of the repercussions have to do with moral decay, lawlessness and scant regard for people's religious beliefs and values. For instance, there are widespread complaints around the time slots of viewing some deep, steamy and romantic films and videos on television.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 19

In most instances, children have been exposed to pornography, and in some quarters, there have been sex pests who have sodomised both girls and boys after showing them such steamy pornography. This has caused a lot of harm to our children who have to bear the stigma of having been shown videos that cause emotional and psychological damage to them.

It also means that a lot of our children grow up hurt, angry and confused as a result of such damage. To make matters worse, one finds that there is no psychological or spiritual counselling for some of the children who have been exposed to such traumatic conditions. The following challenge still remains for the board and the enforcement committee - how to ensure that parents or relatives who expose children who live with them to pornography and molest them afterwards are caught, reported and charged.

The Bill provides for a board, a council, an enforcement committee and an appeal tribunal. In some instances, there is a bit of an overlap of roles and functions. They are all obligated to be impartial and independent.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 20

Will they really be able to deal with all films, games, videos or pictures circulated on websites and video machines, etc? Will they have enough manpower to deal with that? Will it click somewhere that a certain gadget played a video containing harmful information or hate speech or vulgar language, etc? Will it really happen?

It is a fact that there is a permit to be issued by the board, in accordance with section 23, to all online distributors wherein the online distributors are exempted from submitting films and games to the board for classification, subject to such terms and conditions that the board may deem fit. This again opens a loose valve for the circulation of the wrong information.

To the NFP, this Bill really has a lot of gaps. In its present form, it cannot be accepted.

An HON MEMBER: Hear! Hear! Well done!

Ms C N MAJEKE: Hon Speaker, hon members, the UDM believes that the Bill is not ripe for adoption and should

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 21

therefore be returned to the committee for further work on the following grounds.

Firstly, there is a proposed amendment on the definition of prohibited material that may not be distributed in South Africa. At present, the Act outlaws material that violates or disrespects human dignity; is degrading of human beings; and incites or promotes causing harm to human beings.

The proposal in the Bill is to replace these three with a single definition prohibiting only violent pornography. The unintended consequence is the following. Nonviolent sexual material that does violate human dignity, all degrading material that does not contain an element of explicit violence, and material that does incite or promote harm being done to human beings will become legally distributable in South Africa.

This proposal cannot be supported, as it constitutes a clear violation of human dignity and will create public safety risks in relation to people inciting others in society to harm themselves, or others.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 22

Secondly, in terms of the proposed legalisation of the online distribution of adult pornography to all adults, to the extent that this measure protects children from exposure to pornography, it is welcomed.

However, what about the risk of harm to children and vulnerable women - including people in the sex trade - when adults are exposed to mainstream, hardcore, adult pornography? Scientific research has produced evidence showing that pornography use - also mainstream, hardcore pornography - leads some men to commit sexual violence, including rape, against children and vulnerable women.

In a country with some of the highest levels of sexually violent crime in the world, it is not a good idea to sanction the mass distribution of mainstream, hard-core pornography to all adults in South Africa. Without an investigation into this extremely concerning matter, we cannot conclude that we are doing enough to protect women and children from sexual violence and rape. Legalising pornography creates an incentive for further acts of sexual violence and rape.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 23

The UDM cannot support this proposal until such time as a credible investigation or enquiry has been done into the effects on the whole of South African society, especially women and children, when adults are exposed to mainstream, hardcore pornography. I thank you.

Mr A D ALBERTS: Speaker, this Bill's intention to align the classification of films and publication with new technology platforms and provide for new protections is sensible.

Afrikaans:

Die vraag is egter of ons die regering in hierdie poging tot regulering kan vertrou? Die vraag kan net beantwoord word deur na die geskiedenis en fynskrif van die wetsontwerp te kyk. Daar is talle probleme, maar twee daarvan staan uit.

English:

The first is the Bill's initial provisions that require preapproval of internet content before it could be placed online. Not only is this mechanism a patently unconstitutional form of censorship, its wide ambit would

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 24

bring into the fold and requirements for preapproval, basically any online content.

This clearly unconstitutional submission is emblematic of so many other patently unconstitutional Bills submitted by the ANC in the past. These types of provisions are only suppressed once the opposition and public start pushing back. The ANC is constantly testing the resolve of both the public and the Constitution. Could it perhaps be that they, in reality, do not believe in the Constitution?

The second problem is the fact that the censors in this case are completely oblivious to the fact that internet content, by its very nature, is something that cannot be truly regulated. Yes, you can make rules for content uploaded to and distributed from South African servers, but what can you do about content originating from beyond the borders? You cannot really regulate that - nothing except to report it to the foreign authorities.

Afrikaans:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 25

Dit is dus duidelik dat die wetsontwerp nie 'n *bona fide* poging is om vrouens en kinders te beskerm nie. Daar word eerder gepoog om onder die dekmantel van beskerming sensuur terug te bring en nog erger, om beheer uit te oefen oor die inhoud op die internet.

Daar is geen twyfel dat bese inhoud weg van kinders gehou moet word en die vervaardiging en verspreiding van daardie inhoud gestop moet word nie. Daar is egter meer sinvolle wyses om dit te doen, soos om byvoorbeeld die Kinderbeskermingseenheid in die SAPD weer die beste in die wêreld te maak, ten einde die vervaardiging, verspreiding en die besit van kinderpornografie en ander onwettige inhoud binne die land te verhoed.

English:

It is thus unfortunate that we have to be sceptical about the true intentions of government regarding this Bill. We do not think you had the interests of women and children in mind when you created these mechanisms of censure and control that is patently unconstitutional. Thank you.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 26

Mr R M TSELI: Hon Speaker, Deputy President, Ministers and Deputy Ministers, hon members, the ANC supports the Films and Publications Amendment Bill.

Though tremendous progress has been registered on the implementation of the principal Act which was passed in 1996, several constraints emerged, which necessitated the need to introduce some amendments. The ethos underpinning the principal Act was to shift away from the notion of a censorship board to a classification authority, providing South Africans with the information to make a choice about what they want to watch or play.

As the ANC, we are satisfied with the extensive public consultation that has been conducted and would like to appreciate the interest shown by stakeholders in the media sector who made various submissions to the portfolio committee. This is indeed in the spirit of the Freedom Charter that the people shall govern.

The Film and Publication sector should be at the forefront and a reflection of the high moral standing, so as to protect the broader society and the most vulnerable

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 27

in society - our children. The classification of movies, films and games will enable parents to choose suitable media streaming and safeguard their children from explicit and harmful content in media technologies, whilst, at the same, uphold the freedom of expression, as envisaged in the Constitution. So, the passing of this amending Bill will have a greater impact on preventing children from being prematurely exposed to pornography.

Media remains a motive force in the dissemination of information, broader education and contributing to a knowledgeable nation. This role is vulnerable to content that connotes sexual explicit, violence and hatred to others. As a consequence, government has to be proactive in creating an environment where these tendencies are curbed.

We are confident that, with the passing of this Bill, people will think twice before they advocate racism on social media, due to the severe penalties that are now proposed. However, our observation is that almost all the perpetrators of racism have links, in one way or another, with the hon members on my left.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 28

I just want to remind you of the two much talked about incidents; Penny Sparrow was fined R150 000,00 by the Equality Court for comparing black people at the beach with monkeys. Your own Member of Parliament, Kohler Barnard, caused a storm on social media for claiming that better services ...

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Speaker, on a point of order: The hon member knows full well that if he wants to make allegations against a member of this House, he must do so by way of a substantive motion. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member, indeed, you are aware of that Rule. So, please submit whatever you want to say against the hon member in the right way.

Mr R M TSELI: How you responded to these incidents was really not convincing that you don't subscribe to their actions; in fact, it characterised who you are and what you represent. So, this Bill is intended to deal decisively with incidents of this nature.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 29

One of the limitations of the principal Act was the right to appeal decisions of the board on classifications and we are confident that this Bill closes that gap, as it now provides a platform for those not satisfied with the board decisions, to appeal to the Appeal Board. Equally, there were no direct accountability mechanisms between the consumer and the distributor. The Bill will also reduce cyber bullying, grooming and hate speech, and enhance social cohesion.

Tshivenda:

Mudzulatshidulo, hu tea u vha na tshumisano vhukati ha vhafaramikovhe na zwiimiswa zwothe zwi lwaho na vhugevhenga u itela uri hu vhe na u tevhedzwa ha Bill na u itela uri vha no pfuka mulayo vha dzhielwe vhukando ho teaho.

Rine sa dzangano la ANC ri tikedza u engedzwa ha zwigwevho na dzifaini kha vhane vha do wanala vho vhea zwithu zwi re na masiandoitwa a si avhudi kana zwi si mulayoni kha social media, na vhane vhane vha do wanala vho vhea

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 30

dzifilimu, mitambo na matangwa kha social media vha si na thendelo ibvaho kha Film and Publication Board.

English:

Minister, we call on the department and the board to go on an intensive awareness campaign on this amending Bill, once it is passed. It will empower you to execute your mandate of enforcing compliance, as enshrined in the Constitution. Do it without fear, favour and prejudice.

Therefore, the ANC is unequivocal in supporting this Bill. Thank you very much.

Mr W M MADISHA: Hon Speaker, it was the Film and Publication Board, FPB, that reclassified the film Inxeba – The Wound, to X18 on the pretext of protecting children from being exposed to pornography. This reclassification was done following complaints from, amongst others the Congress of Traditional Leaders of SA, Contralesa. It is hard not to conclude that the FPB was pressured to upgrade the classification by Contralesa rather than consider its content.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 31

I point this out because the Films and Publications Bill seeks in part to amend the Act to make it applicable to online content – to give government, through the board, the power to censor the internet, etc.

Cope accepts that the all-pervasive and constantly growing nature of electronic media has eclipsed traditional and more easily regulated forms of communication. Cope accepts that there may well be a need to exercise some form of regulation over this new field of communication. However, Cope cannot support this Bill in its current form. In this regard, Cope expresses its concerns with, *inter alia*:

Firstly, the constitutionality of the Bill, particularly in respect of freedom of expression;

Secondly, the apartheid-style censorship approach of the Bill;

Thirdly, the need for prior classification and the burden that this would place on the industry;

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 32

Fourthly, the costs and economic implications that the Bill will place on the industry; and

Finally, the capacity of the FPB to deliver on the mandate of the Bill.

We therefore do not support this at all. Thank you.

Dr M Q NDLOZI: Thank you hon Speaker. With this Bill the ANC has set out to protect Mr Maphatsoe from the abuse he suffered when his nude picture was shared on social media.

It is indeed a noble pursuit to invent laws that protect people from such abuse where their nude pictures are published without their consent. Indeed, there are many young women who are forced into relationships they no longer want to stay in by criminals using the threat to publicise their nude pictures and sex tapes on social media.

The Bill also seeks to regulate hate speech. Most important is the prohibition that relates to child

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 33

pornography shared in online films and content in general. In this regard, the Bill appears to have good intentions. Who would disagree with prohibitions of this nature to protect children and human dignity in general?

However, in this noble pursuit the Bill has crossed the line between protection and censorship in ways reminiscent of apartheid. Firstly, in fact the Bill seems to revive the scrapped sections of its former apartheid self. It is surprising because child pornography is already regulated under the Sexual Offences Act. This renders such an amendment of this proposed Bill futile.

Secondly, in the matter of *Primedia SA vs Home Affairs*, the Constitutional Court already ruled that preclassification is unconstitutional. Yet at the centre of the Bill is a mechanism of preclassification of any online publications. Even user-generated content is included in this madness, meaning that Facebook, YouTube, Instagram and Twitter videos must be preclassified before being uploaded, even by us private individuals.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 34

So, let us imagine that indeed the government can generate capacity to preclassify all videos through some super software and hundreds of thousands of employees. How would you regulate live streaming?

This is where not only the stupidity of the Bill lies but also its utter backwardness. To preregulate online publications means to include and upload videos on Twitter, Facebook and Instagram posts and blogs.

To help those trapped by criminals who use their sex tapes and nude pictures to subject them to oppression, we need to create safe police stations and some different mechanisms using social work to save them; not preclassification.

We would not be able to regulate online child pornography through strict preclassification as seen in the Act without threatening the right to free speech.

The Constitutional Court ruling is therefore instructive here. People must publish and then face the consequences of their actions. This means that where violations of the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 35

regulations occur, there must be harsh steps taken to ensure that others do not repeat these mistakes. This, in relation to child pornography, is already dealt with.

Insisting that people must first get certificates or permission from the board before they upload pictures and videos or before they update their social media status on the internet is impractical and reactionary.

Preclassification is open to abuse and threatens freedom of expression and freedom of speech. Here government will have the power to delay and even halt free speech.

Imagine if an online article uploading Zuma's corruption in Nkandla needed permission first or if citizens had to seek permission before they upload videos of criminals stealing cars or racists assaulting our people or placing them in coffins. Worse, imagine if you were to seek permission from the board before you tweet an accident or a health emergency or even if a certain Minister has asked you for sex or a nude picture in exchange for a job.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 36

Under this Bill, Twitter, Facebook, Instagram and even Touch HD or online radio which is being broadcast or live streamed will be literally impossible.

Newspapers already have the power for self-regulation. We reject this Bill. It's reactionary and if needs be we are going to mobilise the whole of society to oppose it, including going to the Constitutional Court to stop it. It's unconstitutional!

Mrs C DUDLEY: Thank you Madam Speaker. According to the memorandum on the objectives of this Bill, one of the objectives is to decriminalise the online distribution of adult content on all platforms, including digital platforms – in other words, to legalise online distribution of adult pornography in South Africa.

On three occasions last year the ACDP addressed the House on the harms of adult pornography for society, especially for vulnerable groups like women and children, and brought the issue to the attention of the committee. The impact on society, including on children, when adults are exposed to adult mainstream hardcore pornography is no

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 37

secret. It has been well researched and documented. The bottom line is that:

Firstly, pornography use is rife in South Africa. We are in the top 20 of all countries in the world, but we are number one in the world for accessing pornography via smartphones;

Secondly, gender-based sexual violence is rife in South Africa, with mostly adult males abusing and violating women and children;

Thirdly, research or scientific evidence shows without a doubt that pornography use is a cause of gender-based sexual violence;

Fourthly, having been alerted to the evidence, what does the socioeconomic impact assessment on the Bill say about this? Nothing! and;

Finally, having been alerted to the evidence, what has the Portfolio Committee on Communications done about this? Nothing, hopefully as yet!

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 38

After viewing over 500 studies to determine whether consumption of pornography caused gender-based violence, Dr. Max Waltman of Stockholm University concluded that the weight of the evidence is clear. Pornography causes gender-based violence!

Research also found that men who believed more strongly in impersonal, promiscuous sex and were hostile toward women, were significantly more likely to commit sexual violence and sexually assault a woman if they frequently used pornography.

It is unthinkable that we as a Parliament are not prepared to debate or consider scientific facts available for the purpose of informing policy decisions like this one that will place women and children at greater risk of becoming victims of sexual violence.

The ACDP appeals to this House to correct this omission, do the responsible thing and send this legislation back to the committee to first do an in-depth investigation into the public health costs and social consequences of adults' use of and exposure to pornography before

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 39

legalising the mass online distribution of pornography in South Africa.

In the USA, nine state legislatures have acknowledged pornography as a public health crisis having multiple harmful public health and safety consequences.

The ACDP also raised the danger of watering down the proposed amendment to the definition of prohibited material which at present outlaws material that violates or disrespects human dignity, is degrading of human beings and incites or promotes the causing of harm to human beings. This is in line with our Constitution.

The ACDP cannot support this Bill, as it is not in the interest of justice or in the public interest and cannot be justified on constitutional grounds.

Mr M P GALO: Hon Speaker, the Films and Publication Amendment Bill underpins the moral character which we sought to define as the South African narrative after 1994. A nation that fails to regulate the filming and publication of any material to be screened in the public

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 40

domain is set for moral decay. The Bill ushers in a new dawn.

In terms of the Bill there is a new amendment on the current definition of child pornography. The Bill punishes anyone: who is engaged in sexual conduct with children; participates in or assists another person to participate in sexual conduct; and shows or describes the body or parts of the body of such a person in a manner or in circumstances which, within context, amounts to sexual exploitation.

The Bill introduces stringent requirements for anyone who wishes to distribute, broadcast or exhibit any film or game in South Africa. Such person is required to register with the FPB and submit for examination and classification any film or game that has not already been classified, exempted or approved under the Act.

The Bill takes the public into confidence. Any member of the public who is unhappy with or offended by a classification may now apply to the board for re-classification. It is assuring that the consumers of this

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 41

material are now enjoined to make decisions about the classification of films in the country.

There is a lot of cyber, explicit material on the internet that is not regulated. The Bill provides for the regulation of this content. For instance, it states that:

No person may create, produce or distribute in any electronic medium, including the internet and social networking sites, any films or photographs depicting sexual assault and violence against children.

The rights of children are of paramount importance. South Africa is a beacon of hope and has since defined itself as the guardian of minor children. We welcome this Bill and its intended objectives. South Africa is not the country that must promote satanism.

Ms M O MATSHOBA: Madam Speaker, Your Excellency Deputy President, hon members and guests, Molweni. (Good afternoon).

IsiXhosa:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 42

Intetho yam iza kugxila kubantwana abancinane ngokuzalwa ukuya kubantwana abali-18 ubudala nabathe bavinjwa ithuba lokuya esikolweni. Loo nto yenzeka phaya kwilali yaseNgcobo, eNyanga, kwicawa yakwaMancoba ebizwa ngokuba yi-Seven Angels Ministries Church.

Siyacela ukuba into eyenzeke phaya kula cawa ingaze iphinde yenzeke kwaye neenkonzozethu ekuhlaleni kufuneka zancedisane ekuphuculeni impilo yoluntu. IBhunga leeNkonzo loMzantsi Afrika lalisilwa nathi ngexesha localu-calulo, kuloko sicela iicawa ukuba ziyeke ukuxhaphaza abantu bethu likhona iBhunga leeNkonzo loMzantsi Afrika. Siyakukhalimela ukubulawa kwabantwana abazelwe bezinkawu kuba eso sisenzo esibi nesimdaka. Akuzange kwenziwa amayeza ngamalungu omzimba womntu. Abantu abenza oko kufuneka batshutshiswe babhalwe kumqulu wabantu abaphula umthetho. Abantu bethu ekuhlaleni siya babongoza ukuba bajonge izenzo ezinjalo kuba ziluhlazo.

Umyalezo esiwushiyayo kubantu ekuhlaleni uthi ...

English:

... you must know your neighbour ...

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 43

IsiXhosa:

... kungathi kanti apha ebumelwaneni kukho izinto ezenzekayo ube wena uhleli ungaziboni.

The SPEAKER: There is a point of order, take your seat hon Matshoba. Yes, hon Steenhuisen.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Speaker, on a point of order, with respect we are discussing the Films and Publications Amendment Bill. I don't know what churches and albinism has to do with the Bill.

The SPEAKER: No, hon Steenhuisen, please don't judge. Especially because this is a maiden speech; just allow hon Matshoba to make her points. Please proceed hon Matshoba.

IsiXhosa:

Nks M O MATSHOBA: Somlomo, abantu bakuthi kufuneka bafundiswe ngamalungelo abo ukuze bangaxhatshazwa ngabantu abakhohlakeleyo. Iicawe kufuneke nazo ziqalise ukubhalisa zibe phantsi kweBhunga leeNkonzo loMzantsi Afrika.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 44

English:

Sensations imposed on Films and Publications Amendment Bill; the Films and Publications Act 65 of 1996 as an amended Act state that the consequence of noncompliance is a period of imprisonment as prescribed or a fine.

However the Act does not prescribe the amount payable and it is therefore left to the judge to make a determination taking into consideration the facts of the case and other legal principles and case law. Therefore, the Bill seeks to remedy these shortcomings by providing certainly on the maximum amount that can be imposed in respect of its transgression.

Furthermore, the current session related to prohibited use of children and the exposure of children to pornography where considered inadequate given the gravity and the impact of the offence. The Films and Publications Bill sought to remedy this by increasing the period of imprisonment which will also bring the Act in line with the offence prescribed in Sexual Offences and Related Matters Amendment Act 32 of 2007 is amended.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 45

We have noted the high numbers of court cases from the media and the Films and Publications Bill, the government of South African need an absolute regulator in these offences in South Africa leaves us no options but to tighten and put emphasis on how the South African government is serious. Therefore the lawsuit should be strongly applied with clarity and determination to protect the African child. The ANC supports the Films and Publications Amendment Bill. [Applause.]

Mr L R MBINDA: Thank you, Madam Speaker. At least today I have more time than the hon Oosthuizen. As the PAC we are always concerned with the content of the programmes in our TV screen, print media and recently social media. Hence on behalf of the PAC, we want to take this opportunity and acknowledge the great job done in the Portfolio Committee on Communications.

The bench marking and consultative process we have been engaged in has revealed how vulnerable is our Films and Publications regulations with some exploiting this for their own gross intentions. There should be a clear demarcation between content used for educational purposes

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 46

and content that is purely unacceptable to be viewed and accessed by society, especially to children - a case in hand is the *Inxeba saga*.

As a nation we must have a self-love which means that we must respect each other's different cultural practices if indeed we are to live together in peace.

Madam Speaker and fellow South Africans, as the PAC we remain opposed to the low levels of regulatory measures towards social media. On a daily basis we see unacceptable content ranging from pornographic content accessed even by kids in primary schools, perpetrators of kids or children abuse thrives on these weaknesses. And this has to come to a stop.

With this we are not calling for some sort of limitation to press freedom. However, we remain concerned when video clips of brutally killed people that should be in the hands of the police doing rounds on social network before even the families of the victims being informed as an example.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 47

In conclusion, media is a very powerful tool in society and it has the power to influence what is right and wrong, what is normal and abnormal. If not correctly regulated we will remain wondering where most of these imaging social ills are imaging from our youth continue learning them from the media. We support the Bill and encourage the House to take this as work in progress.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Hon Madam Speaker, let me congratulate the producers and cast of Inxeba who have been successful in the courts of having the X-rating removed so that South Africans can watch that movie again. Madam Speaker, the problem with this Bill is that it is clearly been conceived by ladderx who have absolutely no conception about the internet, about social media and about the freedom of expression and the freedom to privacy in South Africa. It is a worst example of the nanny state in action trying to adopt a paternalistic approach to citizen's lives.

The premise grapple - this is the issue of the pre-classification. This, in itself is a form censorship. Pre-classification has already been dealt with; are in

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 48

our courts and the courts found in this case with print and other publications that:

Free flow of constitutionally protected expression is the rule prior classification should be the exception.

Section 14 of the Constitution ensures that citizens are entitled to privacy. The ISPs are expected to retain the directories and information and that invades the privacy of ordinary citizens. That information in the wrong hands is terrifying. Section 16 allows us to freedom of expression in South Africa. There is a complete duplication in this Bill. Many of the ill effects that the members on my right has spoken about today fancies under the Criminal Procedures Act, 51 of 1977 in terms of the proposed Cybercrimes and Cybersecurity Bill that comes through later as well as the Promotion of Equality and Prevention of Unfair Discrimination Act, Act 4 of 2000, were in massive duplication.

What we should be most terrified about is the input from the hon Tseli who said that it is government's duty to

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 49

provide our morals and values. It is not government's duty to provide our morals and values. We ask hon Tseli whose morals and values? If it is the ones from this side of the House, I think South Africans should stand up and say, no, thank you. [Applause.]

Mr M U KALAKO: Madam Speaker, Deputy President and hon members, firstly we must remind each other that this amendment was necessitated by the court judgement ruling. The court argued that some of the aspects of it were unconstitutional. So, this Bill is trying to address that and also trying to be in line with the developments in the technological innovations.

There have been areas of concern which are being raised even here today by stakeholders during the public hearings. Amongst them was that the penalty committee lacks sufficient degree of independence and this was due to the fact it is appointed by the Minister. In order to address that, the committee gave this responsibility to the council and the committee is now referred to as an enforcement committee; to enforce the Act.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 50

There are other concerns around the use of the term child sexual abuse material which was preferred over the term child pornography because it is used globally. As the committee and all other departments that were consulted in this regard agreed to retain child pornography as it is in line with the principal legislation which deals with sexual offences namely, criminal law.

Insertion of the phrase - that is where most of my colleagues on the left are actually been screaming and kicking in order to protect their businesses. Insertion of the phrase commercial online distributor in the definition of distributor was also raised as a concern. This is answered by the inclusion of a definition of distributor in the Bill which means a person who conducts the business of distributing films, games or publications and includes a commercial online distributor. Commercial online distributor means a distributor in relations to films.

Dr M Q NDLOZI: YouTube is commercial

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 51

Mr M U KALAKO: Yes, you will open your business and we will protect it. On the other hand on commercial online distributor means any person who distributes content using the internet or enables content to be distributed by a user of online services for personal or private purposes. As FPB seeks to regulate online distributors a distinction has been made between commercial and non-commercial distributors. I do not know the propaganda you are coming with here as if that has not been made. You see, in this Bill we were discussing that with you.

As some of the committee members and stakeholders expressed concerns on addition of the definition of hate speech after the definition of games, comrade Ndlozi, the feeling was that Section 10 of the Promotion of Equality and Prevention of Unfair Discrimination Act, Act 4 of 2000 which dealt with the prohibition of hate speech was more appropriate.

In addressing this concern, definition of hate speech which was introduced in the first version of the Bill has been revised to ensure that it is compatible with the Constitution Act, Act 108 of 1996. This is so in order to

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 52

create legal certainty. It has been confined to the grounds outlined in the Constitution.

Hon members, it is our submission as the ANC that this Bill will protect children from the use and creation of illegal content, that is, child pornography for distribution in the South African market; exposure to illegal content distributed in South African environment especially online; exposure to harmful content online, for example, pornography, sex and violence. Premature exposure could have adverse psychological and behavioural impact on children.

The Bill will also protect adult consumers or parents through clear labelling and consumer advisories of content online enabling them to make responsible viewing choices for themselves and children in their care. Awareness on available mechanisms required in safeguarding children online; responsiveness and accountability of the FPB and service providers when consumer's complaints are lodged.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 53

Furthermore, the Bill will protect online distributors of films and games against piracy. You are also protected as distributors, so do not complain. Get into the Bill and read it thoroughly as you were deliberating on it. You will see that none of the things you were raising here of pre-classification, censorship, freedom of speech. None of those things are there in that Bill. Read the Bill and do not be glued up into your stereotype of opposing something which does not need to be opposed.

The Bill ensures that law enforcement agencies will be empowered to prosecute effectively since perpetrators of prohibited content will be easily identified. Law enforcement agencies can now use penalties and fines provided in the Bill to combat piracy; still protecting your businesses.

The victims of online revenge pornography will now have recourse mechanism and members of the public will be empowered through digital literacy campaigns. Public will make informed decisions through accessing content that have been classified and labelled appropriately.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 54

In closing, it is important to correct some misconceptions. Everybody here, is crazy about Inxeba. You know sometimes I like my chairperson when he corrects this. It is not inxeba but...

IsiXhosa:

... isiko lamaXhosa. Uloluko ayilonxeba, lisiko lamaXhosa.

English:

So, if you want to have cohesion in this society we must begin to be sensitive to each others traditions and customs. Thank you very much Speaker. [Time expired.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNICATION: Madam Speaker, Deputy President, not only does this Bill responds to the two constitutional court judgements and I want to invite hon Ndlozi to again understand the court judgements on the two that include the *Prime Media South Africa VS Minister of Home Affairs* as well as the *Dirco VS Director of Public Prosecution*. In fact, those judgements declared the 1996 Act to be invalid.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 55

What this Bill seeks to do is to ensure that there is uniformity in terms of content regulation amongst online distributors. As we speak now, there is no single regulatory institution that is responsible for developing standards and compliance in line with the local and international standards. Currently, the internet access providers are not obliged to curb prohibited content when using their services. More and more people are using internet access provider services to propagate prohibited substance such as hate speech, child pornography and many other ill gotten acts.

What we should seek to do in this honourable House is to protect the most vulnerable and the most innocent, our children, both as recipients and in many instances as those who find themselves being used in this. Whilst we must be concerned about the commercial interests, we need to make sure that we become a nation that seeks to build a society that will respect one another, cultural diversity as well as tolerance. As we speak now, some amongst us are excited about the movie called *Inxeba* which is not just a movie but a about divulging including distorting of some of the cultural practises. It cannot

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 56

be allowed, tolerated but it is a demonstration that we need to be sensitive as a nation. We cannot see African cultural practises as a form of entertainment as we have seen with what happened to Sarah Baartmaan. We shall have to deal with these issues and go and communicate with the society as to what kind of society we want to build.

Dankie ngiyabonga. [Applause.]

**CONSIDERATION OF REPORT OF STANDING COMMITTEE ON FINANCE
ON SPECIAL REPORT OF PUBLIC PROTECTOR ON IMPLEMENTATION
OF REMEDIAL ACTION CONTAINED IN PUBLIC PROTECTOR REPORT
NO 18 OF 2011-12 ON MALADMINISTRATION DURING
PRIVATISATION OF VENDA PENSION FUND: REPORT NO 15 OF
2016-17**

Declarations of vote made on behalf of the Democratic Alliance, Economic Freedom Fighters, Inkatha Freedom Party, National Freedom Party, Congress of the People and African National Congress.

Ms B P MABE: Hon Chair, on behalf of the chairperson of the portfolio committee, the Special Report of the Public Protector on the implementation of remedial action

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 57

contained in Public Protector Report No 18 of 2011-12 on maladministration during the privatisation of the Venda Pension Fund, Report No 15 of 2016-17 Special Report, the National Assembly was referred to the Standing Committee on Finance for consideration and report on 23 January 2017. The Special Report confirms the findings in the Public Protector Report No 18 of 2011-12 issued in 2011, and seeks intervention by the National Assembly in expediting the remedial action as contained in the 2011-12 report.

The Public Protector found in the 2011-12 report that government mishandled the privatisation of the Venda Pension Fund in a manner that constituted maladministration. The complainants were prejudiced by the maladministration. Concerns about narrative and implementation of the 2011-12 report led to the establishment of a task team consisting of: Officials from the office of the Public Protector, Department of Public Service and Administration, National Treasury and Government Pension Administration Agency. The task team is addressing the issues referred to above in terms of Special Report namely: Paucity of records, verifying

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 58

information relating to posts, department where the complainants were employed, employments dates, remuneration and close list of complainants to prevent a floodgate of claims.

The Special Report highlights the reasons for the government to address the injustice set out in the 2011-12 report and recommends a process based on a close list of complainants and official records to establish a reliable database of beneficiaries of the remedial action of the Public Protector. The Special Report further recommends the commitment of funds by the National Treasury to facilitate the recalculation of pension benefits and that Parliament oversees the implementation of the remedial action in terms of section 182(1)(c) read with section 43(2) and 55(2) of the Constitution. To facilitate monitoring of implementation of the recommendation in the Special Report, the Public Protector directed the Director-General of Finance to submit an action plan to the remedial action contained in the 2011-12 report within six weeks of the date of the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 59

Special Report to the Public Protector and the Speaker of the National Assembly.

The Public Protector directed the Speaker of the National Assembly to report to the Public Protector on the steps taken to constitute an appropriate mechanism to oversee the implementation of the 2011-12 report within 14 days of the date of receipt of the action plan. On Friday, 1 September 2017, the reply from the Minister of Finance to the recommendations to the Special Report was tabled and referred to the Standing Committee on Finance for recommendations and to Portfolio Committee on Justice and Correctional Services.

The letter dated 26 August 2017, sends out a time-bound action plan starting from 1 June 2017 until November 2017. On 4 October 2017, the Standing Committee on Finance received a preliminary briefing on the Special Report and the letter from the Minister. The committee agreed to consider a statement on the matter during its next meeting. On 10 October 2017, the committee received a briefing from the Budget Office in National Treasury. The Standing Committee on Finance shares the views and

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 60

concerns of the Public Protector expressed in the Special Report on the Public Protector on the implementation of the remedial action contained in the Public Protector's report. It is unacceptable that the claimants in this matter had to wait almost 20 years without a resolution. We move that the Report be adopted. [Time expired.]

There was no debate.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY: Hon House Chairperson, I move that the Report be adopted.

Declarations of Vote:

Mr R A LEES: Hon Madam Chair, a small and enthusiastic crowd it sounds. The DA condemns the incompetence and maladministration of the administrators of the Venda Pension Fund. The injustices inflicted on members of the fund should never have happened in a democratic South Africa and is yet another blemish on the South African democratic miracle. It is some 20 years that members of the Venda Pension Fund have been made to suffer injustice and there cannot be any further delays. Already the first deadline of the 15 December 2017 sets by the Standing

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 61

Committee on Finance for report on the matter from the Minister of Finance has long since passed.

It took five years for the Special Report on the Public Protector to be referred to the Standing Committee on Finance on 23 January 2017. The Standing Committee on Finance has correctly recommended that recommendations in the report of the Public Protector must be implemented as a matter of urgency. The DA supports the report of the Standing Committee on Finance. [Applause.]

Tshivenḡa:

Vho T E MULAUDZI: Mudzulatshidulo, vhahulisei khathihi na vhathu hayani, riṅe vha dzangano ḡa EFF ri ima na muvhigo wo ṅetshedzwaho nga Komiti ya Tshoṅhe ya Masheleni a Phalamennde. Ri ri vhashumi vhoṅhe vhe vha shuma kha muvhuso kale wa Venḡa vhe masheleni avho a vha a songo dzudzanyea, e a vha a khou ngalangadzwa nga muvhuso wa ANC, musi riṅe vha EFF ri tshi swika fhanu nga ṅwaha wa 2014 ro lingedza uri thendelano ya Muthemendeli Vho Madonsela ya uri vha wane masheleni avho i tevhedzwe.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 62

Ri na mbilaelo khulu nga maanda musu ri tshi vhona muvhuso wa ANC u tshi nanga u ongolowa kha fhungo ili. Zwino ri ri vhathu vhothe vhavenda vhe vha tsa vha tshi gonya na mabambiri vha tshi lingedza u wana masheleni aya ngeno na riye ro lingedza n'wala man'walo manzhi u vha tikedza uri vha wane masheleni aya, ri fulufhedzisa vhothe vhe vha shuma na vhe vha lovheliwa uri masheleni avho vha do a wana nga u t'v'hanya ngauri masheleni ayo ndi avho nahone a a vha fanela.

Zwihuluhulu, ri khou dovha ra ri vha Muhasho wa zwa Masheleni kha u ye u kwame vhashumi vhothe vhe vha shumela masheleni aya uri vha talutshedze uri mafhungo o ima ngafhi ngauri ho no fhela mi'waha ya fumbili-ina vha tshi khou a toda masheleni aya. Vha'we na u lovha vho no lovha, ngeno vha'we vhe dzitsiwana nga hone u sa wana masheleni aya.

Sa EFF ri do lingedza u sala fhungo ili murahu u swika masheleni aya a tshi wanala. Ri ri na Tshanda tsha Muphuresidennde Vho Mabuza vha tevhele fhungo ili vhunga vhe muhulwane wa Mishumo ya Muvhuso vhunga hu kale fhungo ili li sa khou tshimbila. Sa EFF ri tikedza muvhigo uyu

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 63

uri vhathu vha wane masheleni avho nga u t̄avhanya saizwi masheleni aya o vha o tea u wanala nga n̄wedzi wa Nyendavhusiku, 2017. Ri a fulufhela uri fhungo ili namusi li do khunyeledzwa fhanu Phalamenndeni. Ri ri hayani vhathu kha vha takale masheleni avho a do wanala. Ndi a livhuha.

IsiZulu:

Mnu M HLENGWA: Ngiyathokoza ukucosha ithuba Mhlonishwa Sihlalo.

English:

The consolidated list of complainants in this matter places the number of approximately 7000 people who are victims of state maladministration that occurred during the amalgamation of the Venda Pension Fund and the first privatisation scheme pre-1994 before the Government Employees Pension Fund came into effect.

Many of the complainants who are all well above their retirement age has since been penniless and many already passed away. Almost 25 years later and only because the diligent work of the former Public Protector, advocate

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 64

Thuli Madonsela, in her Public Protector Report 18 of 2011/12 and more recently in the Special Report number 15 of 2016/17 is this matter finally coming to a resolution. In the 2011/12 Report the Public Protector found there to be clear maladministration where government mishandled the privatisation of the Vhembe Pension Fund and clear prejudice was found to have been suffered by the complainants.

In her Special Report of 2016/17, the Public Protector directed the Director-General of Finance to submit an action plan to redress the wrong and damages directly suffered by the complainants. This plan was submitted to the portfolio committee who agreed that the recommendations of the Report of the Public Protector must be actioned without any delay. Hon House Chairperson, our democracy has been found upon the principle of accountable and responsive state.

The citizens are entitled to just administrative action that is lawful, reasonable and procedurally fair. The state must promote efficient administration. Therefore, the IFP supports this Report and the steps to be taken to

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 65

ensure adequate redress and relief to all the complainants. Thank you, hon Chairperson.

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: House Chairperson, let me also say welcome to the Deputy President of the country and all hon members. Once again, we are here to welcome a report as a result of challenges that we may have experienced, some of which are; poor and maladministration that has resulted in a great injustice against our people especially the poorest of the poor.

Hon Chairperson, I don't want to stand here and find excuses other than to say that the mechanisms that we are now putting in place - and I am glad that the Minister is here - and the commitment that must come from the Minister and the department cannot be over emphasised. This matter has been going on for a very long time. The oversight role that will be played by the committee also is very important in that they need to ensure that this matter is dealt with timeously and that this process does not lead to abuse, especially in the form of claims. We all know that in times like these we will have many claims. One needs to ensure that we verify these claims

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 66

so that those that will be compensated are duly entitled to them.

We also want to highlight one very important factor, that is; the role of National Treasury in this. The National Treasury has been mandated to provide the funds and resources in order to complete this process. We are calling on The National Treasury to ensure that they comply in terms of that and make the necessary resources available so that justice could be done in this matter. The NFP supports the Report tabled here today. Thank you.

Mr W M MADISHA: Chairperson, the Constitution requires of government to be caring and responsive. The sorry saga of the privatisation of Vhembe Government Pension Fund is nightmarish story of a colour's indifferent and merciless government. It is extremely sad that former civil servants of the then Venda government have been without their retirement benefits since 1992 to date. This is as a consequence of maladministration.

Some 25 years later, the pensioners involved have not only been deprived of their rightful money but their

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 67

constitutional rights to social security and their dignity has also been violated. This happened despite some of the affected members having travelled to the capital in Gambia by June to advocate for the release of their pension monies at the meeting of the African Union Commission on People's Rights and despite the Public Protector's findings in their favour in 2011.

Whilst Cope notes the remedial actions proposed and that the standing committee undertakes to monitor its implementation, we wish to emphasise that we rise to say that all the pensioners whose pension funds are basically directed at looking after the working class, in particular, the poor in those areas of our country that our government has not done enough. Therefore, more has to be done after a quarter of a century. Thank you very much.

Sepedi:

O tla bereka, papa; o nkwele.

Ms D G MAHLANGU: Chairperson, Ministers, Deputy

Ministers, Deputy President of the country and that of

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 68

the ANC, let me start by saying that for the first time since 2008, I can firmly and without fear of contradiction say I once worked with my former president, hon Madisha. For the first time ...

Sepedi:

... go tloga mola ke fihlago mo, o thoma go bolela selo sa go kwagala go laetša gore o ile wa ba mopresidente wa ka wa maloba wa Cosatu. [Legoswi] Ke a leboga, gape ke ikgokgomoša ka wena. Ga ke na dihlong tša gore o ile wa ba mopresidente wa ka wa Cosatu.

English:

Hon Lees, mazambané ...

Ms H O MKHALIPI: Order, Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): On what point of order are you rising, hon member?

Ms H O MKHALIPI: Rule 96.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 69

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): There is no point of order under Rule 96.

Ms H O MKHALIPI: Chair, can I suggest that ...

[Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon member, please, that is not a point of order. I will switch off your microphone. That is not a point of order. Continue, hon member.

Ms D G MAHLANGU: Hon Chairperson, thank you for protecting me.

Ms T V TOBIAS: Hon Chairperson!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon member, on what Rule are you rising?

Ms T V TOBIAS: Rule 92, hon Chairperson.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Thank you, continue.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 70

Ms D G MAHLANGU: Hon Hlengiwe rose on Rule 96 that speaks about the quorum of the House! Just to disturb the member!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon member, we have already ruled on that one. Continue, hon Mahlangu. I will not allow you for a dialogue ... [Interjections.]

Ms H O MKHALIPI: Chair, ... [Interjections.] Anyway there is no quorum, hon Thandi.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon member, please! Continue, hon Mahlangu.

Ms D G MAHLANGU: Hon Lees, we must not make a mistake and misinform the public thinking that the Venda Pension Fund that we are talking about is something that happened during our democratic era. Hon member from the EFF, I think you can agree with me - coming from Venda and from the history. In my previous life I know. I am also a product of the homeland system. That system we know ...

IsiZulu:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 71

... ukuthi iyona esibangele le nkinga esinayo namhlanje.

Sepedi:

Ke yona e dirilego gore re be le bothata bja go swana le bjo. Re a tseba gore batho ba be ba lefelwa bjang. Ba be ba sa lefelwe ka tsela ye e beakantšwego gabotse. Ke ka lebaka leo go lego bothata gore mmušo wo wa ANC o latele tshedimošo ya data yeo e tla netefatšago gore baholegi bao ba swanetšego go humana ditšhelete ke bona ka nnete. Re ka se ntšhe tšhelete fela re sa tsebe gore re efa mang. Ka fao, hon Lees, ke kgopela gore o tiiše ge o bolela, o kgonthišiše gore taba ye ke yeo e dirilwego ...

[Tsenoganong.]

English:

Dr M Q NDLOZI: House Chair, can I ask the member a question?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon Mahlangu, they would like to ask you a question, are you ready for a question?

Ms D G MAHLANGU: Yes, I am.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 72

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Continue, hon member.

Dr M Q NDLOZI: My question is; if it is not the ANC government why did it take the Public Protector to tell you that there is maladministration? Surely that reveals your own incompetency as government since 1994.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Are you answering now?

Dr M Q NDLOZI: That's a question. Haven't you been to an exam?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Okay. Continue, hon member and answer the question.

Ms D G MAHLANGU: I will respond to the statement, it is not a question. Hon Ndlozi, if you were of my age group or belong to my history you would understand that which I am talking about. It is the ANC government that made sure
...

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 73

Sepedi:

...gore go ba le ditshepedišo tša go swana le Public Protector tšeo batho ba ka yago go tšona ba iša dingongorego tša bona. Go re tšeere nako ye telele gore re kgone go di dira dilo tše.

English:

But then I'll understand because it is you, hon Ndlozi. I'll understand that there are things that you will not catch up with and I will balance you on those. Hon members, ...

Sepedi:

... re a thaba gore Public Protector o ile a ntšha pego ye e kgethegilego a dira dikeletšo, ...

English:

... and this ANC government listened to that. As a result of those recommendations, we had a task team that had Government Pension Administration Agency, GPPA, the Department of Public Service and Administration, Treasury and the Public Protector itself.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 74

Mr T RAWULA: Hon Speaker.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): On what Rule are you rising, hon member?

Mr T RAWULA: I'm rising on Rule 92.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Continue, hon member.

Mr T RAWULA: The member is abusing her age to bully hon Ndlozi. You can't use your age when you are asked a question. If a Member of Parliament ... [Interjections.] ... abuse him with your age, you are an ageist, moes. What is this? Can you answer questions here?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon member, that is not a point of order! That is not a point of order! Hon member, I will switch off your microphone.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Continue, hon member.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 75

Ms D G MAHLANGU: Unfortunately, ...

IsiZulu:

... akuyona indaba yami ukuthi uzalwa sekudlule
isikhathi lungu elilhoniphekile ...

English:

... I can't help you. It is a benefit I had. Hon
Chairperson, we have had consultations and hearings
together with Treasury. We are convinced and happy with
the work that has been done so far. We know also as the
committee that we expected Treasury to give us a report
in as far as the implementation is concerned given the
due date by 15 of 2017. There is also information that
one needs to share with the public on why we are still
having a problem of implementing what we have agreed upon
as a committee and the task team. There has also been a
request from Treasury because of the workload ...

Sepedi:

... wo ba bego ba lebane le wona. Ba ile ba ya go
Sepikara le ramatlotlo go kgopela gore ba ba okeletše

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 76

nako; re a tseba gore le ba okeleditše nako. Efela re a kgopela, Tona Nene, gore ...

... together with your team, you should not take the patience of our people for granted because it is not elastic. Le rekere ge o e goga e ya kgaoga ka dinako tše dingwe.

English:

So, we should not take their patience for granted that they understand. We must make sure that we fast-track the issue of implementation because ...

Sepedi:

... re a tseba gore batho ba ke batho bao ba hlakilego, bao ba se nago boyo gape ga ba na kgetho. Ba itshepile mmušo fela.

English:

They don't have a choice, the means and money to seek legal assistance for them to fight this battle.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 77

Hon Chairperson of the House, as the ANC we are making this clarion call to the National Treasury and the Government Pensions Administration Agency, GPAA, to expedite the finalisation of this matter because ...

Sepedi:

... re kgotleletše go lekane.

English:

The ANC is of the view that it is unacceptable that the claimants in this matter had to wait almost 20 years without a resolution of their plight and further delays will not be tolerated. I hope that is clear. The ANC, through the Standing Committee of Finance, will exercise oversight of the implementation of the recommendations and ensure that necessary relief and fulfilment to restore the dignity of the right to social security of the concerned Vhembe Pension Fund group. The implementation plan submitted by the Minister of Finance set clear timeframes for the implementation of the recommendations of the Public Protector and the committee. Hon members, we are therefore appreciating the ANC government for setting out the processes ...

Sepedi:

... gore bana ba gaborena le batho ba gaborena ge ba lla ba kwagale. Le gonabjale re sa itlama re le ANC gore ...

English:

We will make sure as the standing committee that we conduct oversight, there is implementation and that ...

Sepedi:

... le humana ditšhelete tša lena ka mo go swanetšego. Llang le ye mmušong wa ANC le mekgatlong ye re e beilego. Le lle gobane ngwana yo a sa llogo o hwela tharing. Ke a leboga. [Tsenoganong.] [Nako e fedile.] [Legoswi.]

Agreed to.

**CONSIDERATION OF REPORT OF PORTFOLIO COMMITTEE ON WATER
AND SANITATION ON OVERSIGHT VISIT TO LIMPOPO PROVINCE**

Mr M JOHNSON: Chair, in 2017 the Portfolio Committee on Water and Sanitation undertook an oversight visit to Limpopo. The oversight visit considered the following activities; the verification of water supply to

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 79

communities in Tzaneen that petitioned Parliament to intervene to the water access challenges in 2015, water allocations to emerging black farmers in the Greater Letaba area in Tzaneen, the resettlement and compensation of communities that were relocated during the construction of Nandoni Dam and the Giyani Bulk Water Supply Project. The following are the key findings of the oversight; the water supply in Tzaneen is not completely resolved as some communities are still without water however a number of projects were underway to ensure that water supply to these communities is available. Projects that are underway are the drilling of boreholes, water treatment plants refurbishment and upgrades and pipelines among many others. The black emerging farmers do not have access to water. The department is unable to assist these farmers as the white farmers upstream are blocking and redirecting water supply to their farms.

The Water Allocation Reform process is not working for black emerging farmers in Tzaneen. The officials lack the will to implement this programme. The relocated communities from Nandoni Dam are not fully compensated and the department is lacking these communities as the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 80

processes are delayed. The Giyani Bulk Water Supply Project is marred by escalating costs, delays in payment to contractors, illegal water connections, vandalism, and theft of water infrastructure and a lack of capacity to operate and maintain the water infrastructure in Mopani. Lastly, to this end the committee made a number of recommendations with regards to each of the issues identified and all of those are carried in the Announcements, Tablings and Reports, ATC dated 22 November 2017 I submit.

There was no debate.

The Deputy Chief Whip of the Majority Party moved: That the Report be adopted.

Declaration(s) of vote:

Mr L J BASSON: Chairperson, the portfolio committee initially visited Limpopo in 2015 to address the concerns raised in a petition by the community of the Greater Tzaneen area in relation to nonavailability of water supply in the affected wards in the area. As a follow-up to the 2015 oversight, the portfolio committee undertook

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 81

an oversight visit to Limpopo in August 2017 and based its oversight mandate within the following objectives: To receive a progress report on whether the 2015 commitments to the petition was honoured and also visit emerging farmers and the Giyani Bulk Water Supply Project.

It was found that interventions between 2015 and 2017 did not show any improvement in the delivery of water in the Mopani District Municipality. 63% of boreholes were nonfunctional. The crisis in the affected area is not being addressed. Money was spent with little benefit seen by the communities. Lack of consultation on projects in the affected communities create further tension with people arguing that it is far better to make use of illegal connections rather than to rely on legal processes. The Department of Agriculture and the African Farmers Association, AFASA, informed the portfolio committee that the Department of Water and Sanitation is not addressing water rights and access to water to black emerging farmers. One of the biggest running projects of the department is the Giyani project. This controversial project is being investigated by the Special Investigating Unit, SIU. LTE Consulting, a cadre company

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 82

that is closely related to the ANC and Minister Nomvula Mokonyane also received tenders. This company is also under investigation.

The results of the SIU investigation will be referred to the National Prosecuting Authority, NPA, and the SIU informed the portfolio committee that they will continue to pursue this matter and see it through until prosecution. The Giyani project started on a R140 million and increased to more than R1 billion. The end of this project is still not in sight and billions more will be needed to be spent to complete this project. Lepelle Northern Water Board that was appointed by the Minister as the implementing agent indicated that due to nonpayment by the department, this project is constantly delayed. The Giyani water purification plant which opened in April 2014 by Mr Jacob Zuma to increase water to the community and villages is no longer working due to poor construction, management and maintenance. I can not say this better than the late hon Tania Baker, this is part of the legacy of Minister Nomvula Mokonyane that left the finances, management and infrastructure of the Department of Water and Sanitation is a deeper, darker and messier

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 83

state than any one of its abandoned pit latrines. I thank you.

IsiZulu:

Nk M S KHAWULA: Sihlalo ohloniphekile, kubalulekile ukuthi uHulumeni abe nohlelo oluphusile lokuqinisekisa ukuthi izingqalasizinda zamanzi zisezingeni ukuze sithuthukise izwe lethu kanye nemiphakathi yakithi. Amanzi ayilungelo lawowonke umuntu ngale kokuthi uHulumeni abakhethe abantu. Ohambweni lwethu siye laphaya e-Limpopo. Into esiyibona laphayana kuyacaca ngokusobala ukuthi uMnyango Wezamanzi ngaphansi kobuholi bukaNgqongqoshe wangaphambili uNomvula Mokonyane abubushayanga indiva eyokunikezwa kwabantu amanzi ahlanzekile ngendlela efanele.

Bekudliwa izimali kuphela. Isibonelo, laphaya e-Mopani District, izikhulu zomkhandlu zehluleka zancama ukusinikeza imininingwane ngezinhlelo abanazo zokubhekana nenkinga yokushoda kwamanzi emiphakathini eyakhelene naloya mkhandlu. Umnyango awunaso isisombululo sokubhekana ngqo nenkinga yamanzi esifundazweni sase-Limpopo. Kunomkhandlu owodwa nje e-Mopani, abantu

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 84

bathembele kumapayipi ukuze bathole amanzi. Kwalawo mapayipi mancane awanawo ngisho amanzi. Alukho nohlelo lokuvuselela amapayipi angasebenzi. Abantu bagcine sebezixhumela ngendlela yabo amanzi, bawaxhuma ngendlela engekho emthethweni. Okunye okukhulu wukuthi umnyango kanye nomkhandlu yile nkinga yomfula okufanele ngabe usiza abantu abangabalimi laphaya ko-Makepisi laphayana nabantu abasezansi e-Malamulele. Lomfula esikhundleni sokuthi uhambe uye ezansi kubona bakwazi ukuthi bawujike. Uma sithi siyabuza ukuthi ngabe kusemthethweni yini ukuthi lowa mfula ushintshwe, uthola ukuthi kulo mnyango kaNgqongqoshe uNomvula Mokonyane ayikho impendulo.

Laphayana e-Nandoni, kunabantu la kusukela ngo-2014 sifika lana ePhalamende ababekhala ngokuthi bayasuswa laphayana ngenhloso yokwakhiwa kwedamu. Leyidamu, ngoba ngikhuluma nani, abantu babelima khona, benezihlahla zabo, benamangcwaba laphaya. Laba bantu, kuze kube yimanje, abakaze bakhokhelwe imali eyisinxaphezelo, nabanikezwa, izindlu ziyawa. Kuyimanje, uma sesibuya la sesizobuza ukuthi, laba bantu sizobe sisaya kwi-oversight basijahe bezositshela into eyodwa na? kwavela ukuthi ikhona imali engu-R30 million, imali esingazi ukuthi

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 85

ngempela kwenzakalani ngayo. Bese kuthi i-chief financial officer, CFO, yakhohlisa iPhalamende la ngaye njalo uNgqongqoshe obekhona kuqala, wazothi, akekho lowomuntu lo okuwuyena oyi-CFO kanti bamatasa ngale ngemuva basayina amasheke benza into engekho emthethweni. Ngaleyondlela sithi, sikhathele bakithi ngabantu bakithi abathi bamele abantu abamnyama bebe bezimele bona. Njengoba ngikhuluma nani awekho amanzi laphayana. Abantu bakithi amanzi abanawo. Ngisho abamaplazi bakhona laphaya abanawo ngisho amanzi. Amanzi okufanele ngabe abantu bayalima ngawo, bathatha amanzi bachelela ngawo, lawo manzi ayathathwa kodwa abamhlophe banawo amanzi. LoHulumeni we-ANC abantu bafuneke bawubone ukuthi awunendaba nabantu abantu, inkinga yabo wukuzidlela imali. 2019 abantu mabavotele i-EFF bazobona.

[Ubuwelewele.]

USOMLOMO: Mama uKhawula, siyaxolisa ma, isikhathi siphelile.

Declaration(s) of vote:

Inkosi R N CEBEKHULU: Thank you, Chairperson. Water is life for our planet and for all the living organisms that

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 86

reside upon it. The right to sufficient access to water is constitutionally enshrined as, and as such must be provided to the citizens of our country in all areas of the nine provinces situated in South Africa.

Communities, resident within seven wards in Limpopo who have been without access to water petitioned the portfolio committee already in 2015, and again in 2017. The challenge to this day remains unresolved.

Upon committee oversight visit to the area numerous challenges were raised by the district municipality which claimed that it had been facing an uphill struggle. Infrastructure development and provision of services were being stifled by vandalism, ageing infrastructure, non-functioning boreholes, theft through illegal connections and the presence of low ground water table which contributed to the difficulty of borehole supply.

Bulk water infrastructure supply to seven villages in Ward 26 was not effectively completed. Pipes were left exposed in the community, which led to illegal

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 87

connections being made, and great damage to the infrastructure.

Consolidated efforts despite the best intentions are living little or no good rewards. This is especially so when one looks at the water services grant, the municipal infrastructure grant and rational bulk infrastructure grant, which were intended to assist with the provision of sustainable water supply in our rural communities and the entire water value chain.

Emerging farmers in the Tzaneen area are being detrimentally affected by the continuous delay in raising the Tzaneen dam wall, as well as by billing for services that are not being rendered because of dilapidated and non-functioning canals, boreholes and irrigation schemes.

We are a water scarce country and the scarcity is increasing through climate change. We must build resilient infrastructure and ensure effective service delivery. The IFP actually supports the report with the hope that something will be done in order to assist the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 88

communities out there that in dire need of the services.
Thank you.

Ms C N MAJEKE: Chairperson, hon members, referring to the oversight report by the Portfolio Committee on Water and Sanitation in Limpopo we are able to see that water has an immediate and lasting effect on infrastructure development and living conditions of many people.

In Kaskad residents needed to resort to protest action as their promised RDP houses were delayed due to lack of water and sanitation. Lack water infrastructure in this country denies people the right to housing. The people are left with no option but to use the right of protest in order for government to listen and react to their needs.

In the report by the Portfolio Committee on Water and Sanitation in Limpopo, we see that people are so desperate to access water; that the water supply has been as reported by members, illegally accessing.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 89

Water in South Africa is becoming a scarce and valuable resource. Government need to recognise the great and desperate need to secure this resource for all citizens as water is the basic human right; and government should not fail to provide this at all cost.

Chairperson, the UDM proposes the following based on the report: That government pays all contractors on time in order to secure that these contractors are not placed at risk with their creditors; their services are delivered on time, and that the cost of production due to stoppages does not escalate and place further cost to the state; security measures are put in place to protect vulnerable and exposed water supply materials and components.

Thirdly, government must speed up service delivery of water supply so that people have access to their basic human right of water as well as reduce the fact that lack of water has on the rights of the people. Finally, a proper planning process is undertaken so that government is better able to identify the lifespan of operational materials and be prepared for maintenance of these water treatment works.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 90

The UDM believes that water is the primary and basic nourishment of the nation. We call on, on all citizens to closely monitor government when dealing with the water project as water is a gateway for further development and prosperity. The UDM supports the report. I thank you.

Ms D CARTER: Thank you, Chairperson. Chair, the report on the oversight visit to Limpopo is a sad tale of failing service delivery, and of the colour indifferent, and more serious government. What happened to the principle of government of the people by the people and for the people?

Chair, it is beyond believe that following an oversight visit in 2015 by the portfolio committee to the greatest Tzaneen area, to increase more to delivery concerns raised in a petition to Parliament by the community; 55 out of 87 boreholes in the area still remain non-functional. This is a serious indictment against government to deliver upon a basic human right.

Cope expresses its great concern at the delays inexperience in effecting payments due to contractors in

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 91

respect of the Giyani water treatment works and bulk water supply project by the Department of Water and Sanitation. Can you imagine what the impact of a non-payment of R600 million has on these contractors, implementing agents and suppliers involved and on the cash flow unreserved over Lepelle Northern Water Board?

Now, with respect for the visit to the Nandoni Dam and the 32 villagers affected by the construction of the dam, Cope is shocked that despite for remedial action outlined by the Public Protector in a 2009-10 report, and despite an oversight visit by the committee in 2015 to the communities, the community still do not have access to water, supplied from the dam some 15 years after its completion.

Compensation due to the families that were removed for the development of the dam is still not being finalised. The affected families have still not received titles to the land to which they were relocated, and that matters relating to the substandard housing provided as a consequences of the relocation has still not being resolved.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 92

Chair, this report points to a incapable, failing, careless, indifferent and a merciless government. Thank you.

Mr M JOHNSON: Thank you, Chair. Indeed, oversights works, we now know where the challenges are. All what the department has to do is to work. Eighty percent of the water in that part of the country goes to the farmers. That brings an opportunity for the reuse of our water resource, especially for your irrigation.

The land reform without water supply is tantamount to reversing the gains that land reform seeks to achieve. We still have a 1956 Water Act that prohibits you as a new beneficiary of our land reform to continue using that water, for that water is traded separately.

The point is made as part of the recommendations that the service providers must be paid on time and that shall go a long way in growing these contractors. Failure to do such, you are as good as killing those service providers, especially the black ones who are literally living on new money where there is no old money.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 93

Maintenance is key to a sustainable use of our infrastructure. We have a case in point where we read about what you have in Cuba today, an old infrastructure that has withstood all the transgressions by the US governments of the past, and that continue to do so even to date.

What government Department of Water and Sanitation must do, is to do more with less. Given all the budgetary constraints that we have this day in age, the new innovations are intact in changing as to how we have to do things differently.

A case in point here would be your typical situation where the infrastructure continues to be your brick and mortar. Yet there exist your new innovations on the same 50 Ml being produced out of that infrastructure using brick and mortar which will cost easily a sum of R400 million.

However, with package plants we can easily go to a figure of no more than R50 million, just to sight but one example. This is a case in point wherein our officials

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 94

Minister, in the department continue to work like it is, the same old way like in the past; wherein they would go out of their way - and we have our own suspicions as a committee that these officials they are literally at the back pockets of some of these service providers.

Your consulting engineers could always go for that project, which is no more than R500 million. Unlike if it was a R50 million project. Precisely because of the fees that are earned out of any specific project; hence then we say we need to appreciate the department officials to do more with less given the new innovations. Once again the ANC support this report. Thank you. [Applause.]

The CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Thank you very much. The motion is that the report be adopted. Are there any objections? No. [Interjections.]

Isizulu:

Nk M S KHAWULA: Ngiyabonga, kanti ngempela uNgqongqoshe uzoboshwa nini ngoba eGiyane amanzi awekho. Uzoboshwa nini yena?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 95

English:

The CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon Khawula, are you raising [Interjections.] Hon member, you are out of order.

IsiZulu:

Nk M S KHAWULA: Lalela ke engikushoyo ngoba anifuni - siyayichitha le. [Ubuwelewele.] Akaboshwe manje uNomvula.

English:

The CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon member, thank you. Hon member, you are out of order. Thank you.

Ms M S KHAWULA: And you too.

The CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): The objection of the EFF will be noted.

Motion agreed to (EFF dissenting).

Report accordingly adopted.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 96

ANNOUNCEMENT BY DR AARON MOTSOLEDI OF OUTBREAK OF
LISTERIA

(Draft Resolution)

Ms H H MALGAS: Chairperson, on behalf of the ANC I move
without notice:

That the House -

- (1) welcomes the announcement by the Minister of Health, Dr Aaron Motsoaledi, on Sunday, 4 March 2018, that polony and products from the Enterprise factory in Polokwane, Limpopo, are the source of the world's largest outbreak of listeria;
- (2) notes that more than 16 environmental samples from the Enterprise Polokwane factory tested positive for the listeriosis monocytogenes strain ST 6;

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 97

- (3) further notes that the results from the factory were confirmed at midnight on Saturday, 3 March 2018, at the National Institute for Communicable Diseases – as being the strain to blame for the outbreak that killed 27% of patients in South Africa;
- (4) understands that the National Consumer Commission has issued the manufacturer involved, Enterprise, with food recall notices;
- (5) recalls that listeriosis affects mostly the elderly and those with compromised immune systems such as people with Aids, diabetes and new born babies;
- (6) further recalls that it has claimed more than 170 lives since January 2017 ... [Time expired.]

Agreed to.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 98

ABSCONDMENT OF EIGHT GIRLS FROM DON MATTERA CHILD AND
YOUTH CENTRE

(Draft Resolution)

Mr M WATERS: Chair, I hereby move without notice on behalf of the DA:

That this House -

- (1) notes that in February 2017, eight girls absconded and some are still not found from the Don Mattera Child and Youth Centre in Edenvale;
- (2) further notes that four of the girls were allegedly taken to Hillbrow and the other four to Alexandra, where they were exposed to child trafficking and drug syndicates and that children who absconded and later returned were not brought before the children's court for assessments as required by the Children's Act nor was the Department of Social Development informed;

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 99

- (3) acknowledges that the Democratic Alliance has been informed of other horror stories such as, amongst others, girls being raped, underage children being engaged in sexual intercourse and children engaging in drug abuse;
- (4) recognises that the SA Human Rights Commission revealed that the centre has not been quality assured by the Department of Social Development for more than a year and that there is no complaints register in which to formally record complaints and incidents as required by law;
- (5) condemns the abuse of children and mismanagement of child and youth centres which are intended to be places of safety for minors; and
- (6) calls for an urgent investigation so that those responsible may face the full might of the law.

I so move.

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 100

Mr B A RADEBE: Chair, the ANC objects this unresearched motion.

**CONGRATULATIONS TO PROFESSOR MAMOGKETHI SETATI-PHAKENG ON
HER APPOINTMENT AS VICE CHANCELLOR**

(Draft Resolution)

Ms N V MENTE: Chair, I rise on behalf of the EFF to move without notice:

That the House -

- (1) notes the decision by the senate of the University of Cape Town, UCT, to strongly recommend the appointment of Professor, Mamokgethi Setati-Phakeng as the Vice Chancellor;
- (2) congratulates Professor Mamokgethi Setati-Phakeng on this important recognition and consideration for the position of Vice Chancellor of UCT;

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 101

- (3) welcomes the decision as not only long overdue, but as a well-deserved recognition and a meaningful step in the right direction towards true decolonisation of institutions of higher learning;
- (4) recognises Prof Setati-Phakeng as a fabulous academic, black and proud South African and as a full professor with a PhD in mathematics education;
- (5) acknowledges that Prof Setati-Phakeng's nomination is a testament to the struggle of Lilian Ngoyi, Frances Baard, Albertina Sisulu, Miriam Makeba, Charlotte Maxeke, Ruth Mompati, Zondeni Veronica Sobukwe, Mama Winnie Madikizela and many other mbokodos;
- (6) further acknowledges that her appointment will inspire generations to come to believe and live with ambitions as black and proud fabulous children; and

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 102

- (7) applauds Prof Mamokgeti Setati-Phakeng for being considered for the position of Vice Chancellor of UCT.

Agreed to.

**CONGRATULATIONS TO MINISTER NALEDI PANDER FOR BEING
HONOURED BY LEIDEN UNIVERSITY**

(Draft Resolution)

Ms D R TSOTETSI: Chairperson, on behalf of the ANC I move without notice:

That the House -

- (1) welcomes the recognition and inauguration of Minister Naledi Pandor by the Netherland's Leiden University as an honorary Oort Visiting Professor of Astronomy for Development, on Monday, 26 February 2018;

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 103

- (2) notes that Minister Pandor gave a ceremonial lecture on astronomy for development on Monday, followed by an interdisciplinary symposium on science diplomacy and development at the Leiden University campus in the Hague on 27 February;
- (3) understands that Minister Pandor's appointment as Leiden University's honorary visiting professor for science and development is in recognition of her inspiring and charismatic promotion of science and astronomy in South Africa, Africa and globally;
- (4) recalls that Professor Jan Oort, whom the professorship is named after, was the director of Leiden Observatory for many years and played a pioneering role in many aspects of modern astronomy;
- (5) believes that in awarding Minister Pandor, the Leiden University considered her as an inspirational and charismatic ambassador of

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 104

science as a tool for development, particularly in the field of astronomy;

(6) commends the executive authorities of the University of Leiden for honouring one of our dedicated servants of the people, Minister Naledi Pandor; and

(7) congratulates Minister Pandor on adding one more accolade to her achievements.

Agreed to.

**CONGRATULATIONS TO PRINCE MANGOSUTHU BUTHELEZI FOR BEING
AWARDED A MEDAL IN TAIWAN**

(Draft Resolution)

Mr N SINGH: Chairperson, I hereby move without notice on behalf of the IFP:

That the House –

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 105

- (1) congratulates His Excellency Prince Mangosuthu Buthelezi, the President of the Inkatha Freedom Party, for receiving the Taiwan Friendship Medal of Diplomacy, in recognition of his efforts to promote good relations between Taiwan and South Africa;
- (2) notes that in his acceptance remarks, he made mention of the appropriateness of the Medal being called a Friendship Medal and not just a Diplomacy Medal, because although his work has been done at a political level, it was always done out of the bond of friendship;
- (3) acknowledges that Prince Buthelezi has enjoyed a long friendship with Taiwan and the Taiwanese, having opened a trade office when he served as Chief Minister of the KwaZulu-Natal government, securing economic growth and development for the people of KwaZulu-Natal through this valuable partnership;

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 106

(4) further acknowledges and sincerely appreciates the attendance at the event last week of political party leaders and senior representatives from various political parties in this Parliament; and finally

(5) wishes that the productivity, work ethic and ingenuity of the Taiwanese, which the Prince so admires, rubs off onto our people and sees us realising our collective goals for our country.
Thank you.

Agreed to.

ONGOING STRIKE AT UNIVERSITY OF ZULULAND

(Draft Resolution)

Mr S C MNCWABE: House Chairperson, I move without notice on behalf of the NFP:

That the House-

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 107

- (1) notes the ongoing strike at the University of Zululand whereby students demand better accommodation and tuition fees, and raised concerns about the National Student Financial Aid Scheme, NSFAS;
- (2) further notes that, at the same time, employees are demanding better salaries and better conditions of employment;
- (3) acknowledges that the meetings that were held between the Portfolio Committee on Higher Education and the University of Zululand went well, but it is clear that the resolutions were not actioned by the university management;
- (4) calls on the Department of Higher Education and Training and the University of Zululand management to speedily find a solution that will bring about normality at the university;
and

- (5) further calls on students to desist from destroying the university property.

Agreed to.

25 PEOPLE PERISH IN FIRE AT DRUG REHAB CLINIC

(Draft Resolution)

Ms M P MMOLA: Chairperson, I move without notice on behalf of the ANC:

That the House -

- (1) notes that twenty-five people perished in a fire which tore through a drug rehabilitation clinic in the Azerbaijani capital, Baku, early on Friday, 2 March 2018;
- (2) further notes that three of the thirty-four people that were rescued from the blaze were hospitalized;

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 109

- (3) understands that a criminal case was opened by the prosecution authorities, and that an investigation team was established;
- (4) recognises that the fire completely destroyed a wooden building, in which bed-ridden patients found themselves unable to escape;
- (5) recalls that the ex-Soviet Caucasus nation has a history of large-scale casualties as a result of fires in residential buildings and elsewhere;
- (6) further recalls that in October 1995, 289 people died in a metro fire in Baku, in the world's deadliest subway disaster that was caused by outdated Soviet equipment; and
- (7) conveys its condolences to the Government of Azerbaijan and families of the deceased.

Agreed to.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 110

**MOKOENENE TO REPRESENT SOUTH AFRICA AT CHIVAS VENTURE
COMPETITION IN AMSTERDAM**

(Draft Resolution)

Mr N L S KWANKWA: I move without notice on behalf of the
UDM:

That the House -

- (1) notes that an engineer and innovator, Mr Clement Mokoene, was selected as South Africa's international representative at the Chivas Venture competition to be held in May 2018, in Amsterdam;
- (2) further notes his achievement to provide cheap, sustainable, clean and affordable electricity through his vehicle energy harvesting system, VEH system, by installing an overlay on an existing road, extracting the pressure and transferring it to the side of the road in a

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 111

way similar to a wind turbine that then creates electricity;

- (3) acknowledges that the result is the electricity that is at a much lower affordable price than the 90% of South African energy which is currently generated by coal fire-powered stations which has huge environmental costs;
- (4) applauds the innovative and this great idea has the potentially to improve the quality of life of the poor people by making electricity affordable;
- (5) calls on government to actively engage with Mr Clement Mokoene in order to integrate his clean energy VEH system to the national grid's power supply; and
- (6) wishes Mr Mokoene, as a representative of South Africa, the very best as he prepares to compete against other global entrants in May 2018.

Agreed to.

RHINO POACHING ON CRITICAL LEVELS IN SOUTH AFRICA

(Draft Resolution)

Mr R K PURDON: Chairperson, I move without notice on behalf of the DA:

That the House -

- (1) notes that rhino poaching has reached critical levels in our country;
- (2) further notes seven butchered rhinos were discovered in a single day in KwaZulu-Natal's flagship uMfolozi Game Reserve last week;
- (3) acknowledges that the Pilanesberg Game Reserve is also suffering huge losses;

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 113

(4) records that four rhinos have been poached on different reserves in the Eastern Cape during the last two weeks; and

(5) calls on all relevant government departments and ministries to revisit this national crisis with the urgency that it deserves.

Agreed to.

**TOWER PSYCHIATRIC HOSPITAL IN FORT BEAUFORT ON SHOCKING
STATE**

(Draft Resolution)

Dr S S THEMBEKWAYO: I move without notice on behalf of the EFF:

That the House -

(1) notes the shocking state of Tower Psychiatric Hospital in Fort Beaufort, in Eastern Cape;

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 114

- (2) further notes that as a result of this since 2010, 90 patients have died in this facility;
- (3) acknowledges that a lot of what we know about the hospital would not be possible without the efforts of Dr Kiran Sukeri, a psychiatrist at the facility, who laid complaints about the hospital's conditions with the Health Ombudsman, the SA Human Rights Commission and the SA Society of Psychiatrists;
- (4) recognises that patients are not fed properly, are kept in solitary confinement, do not have proper toilet facilities, and they are generally neglected by staff at the hospital;
- (5) further recognises that there is no specialised medical care facility at the hospital, and that there is no doctor on duty on the weekends;
- (6) understands that staff continues to resign as they cannot be part of this human rights violation;

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 115

(7) realises that if nothing is done, another Life Esidimeni situation will occur, only this time Parliament will have been forewarned; and

(8) further realises that if nothing is done, Parliament will become culpable in this crime, and should therefore ensure that the Portfolio Committee on Health inspect the facility, and address the problems facing the hospital.

Agreed to.

19 MIGRANTS DIE & 60 INJURED IN LYBIAN TRUCK ACCIDENT

(Draft Resolution)

Mr G S RADEBE: Chairperson, I move without notice on behalf of the ANC:

That the House -

(1) notes with sadness the death of at least 19 illegal migrants and 60 injured people, mostly

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 116

from Africa, in a truck accident in the Libyan town of Bani Walid, approximately 189km south-east of the capital Tripoli;

- (2) further notes the truck was carrying an estimated 300 refugees and migrants when it crashed in the north-west of the North African country on Wednesday, 14 February 2018;
- (3) understands that Libya has become a major point of departure for African migrants leaving Africa for Europe in search of a better life;
- (4) further understands that the journey is hazardous with many crammed into overcrowded vessels, in poor condition, operated by human traffickers;
- (5) recalls that hundreds of people have died after the boats overturned in the Mediterranean and those that have remained behind have been subjected to abuse in Egypt's detention centres;

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 117

- (6) remembers that many of these centres are headed by a myriad of militias who control large swathes of the country, after it plunged into civil war in 2011 following the overthrow of the late leader, Muammar Gaddafi;
- (7) calls on the international community to do more to tackle the migration crisis in Libya; and
- (8) conveys its condolences to the governments of the affected migrants and families of the deceased.

Agreed to.

CRIPPLING DROUGHT AFFECTS WESTERN CAPE WATER SUPPLY

(Draft Resolution)

Ms D CARTER: Chairperson, I hereby move without notice on behalf of Cope:

That the House -

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 118

- (1) notes the crippling drought that affects the Western Cape water supply and that threatens all sectors of society under livelihood of the business and agricultural sectors and their employees;
- (2) applauds the unselfish act of goodwill of fruit growers of the Groenland Water Users' Association who released some 10 million cubic metres from their farm dams to augment existing water supplies in the Western Cape Supply System, thus pushing further back Day Zero projections;
- (3) appreciates the collective efforts of all affected water consumers to reduce their consumption;
- (4) calls upon them to continue with their efforts;
and
- (5) implores all spheres of government to ensure a collective and coherent response to the current

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 119

crisis and the mitigation of future drought and water supply disasters.

Agreed to.

RUT GOUWS QUALIFIES FOR THE YOUTH OLYMPIC GAMES

(Draft Resolution)

Mr S M RALEKGOMA: Chairperson, I move without notice on behalf of the ANC:

That the House -

(1) notes that Rut Gouws is in line to qualify for the Youth Olympic Games in Buenos Aires in October 2018 after finishing on top of the list African TT:R Under 18 competition in Dakhla, Morocco, on Saturday, 3 March 2018;

(2) further notes that the 14 year old from Stilbaai powered her way to first place in the Youth Olympic Games Kite Boarding qualifier;

- (3) understands that the victory puts Gouws in line to be selected as part of Team SA for the Youth Olympic Games in Buenos Aires in October 2018;
- (4) further understands that Gouws put in a fantastic performance, winning 10 of her 12 races to finish as the undisputed champion; and
- (5) wishes Rut Gouws much more success in her future endeavours. [Applause.]

Agreed to.

GRUESOME MURDER OF SIYABONGA LANGELIHLE NGCOBO

(Draft Resolution)

Mr S M JAFTA: Chairperson, I move without notice on behalf of the AIC:

That the House -

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 121

- (1) notes that Siyabonga Langelihle Ngcobo, a taxify driver, was gruesomely stuffed into the boot of his car;
- (2) shocked by the barbaric and primitive act of setting alight his car while he was still alive;
- (3) recognises the fact that Ngcobo, who was enrolled to further his studies at the level of higher education, was an innate organic scholar who sought to fund his studies;
- (4) anguished by this deteriorating sheer silence in various quarters of our society by this cowardice act;
- (5) regrets that the impasse between meter taxis, taxify and uber has gone unabated with scant intervention;
- (6) commiserate with the family of Ngcobo in these trying times; and

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 122

- (7) calls upon the relevant portfolios in government to seek an amicable solution in the current impasse.

Agreed to.

THE DEATH OF BARAKA LEONARD NAFARI

(Draft Resolution)

Ms S MCHUNU: Chairperson, I move without notice on behalf of the ANC:

That the House –

- (1) notes with sadness the death of a Tanzanian PhD student from the University of Johannesburg, allegedly at the hands of a taxi driver on Friday, 23 February 2018;
- (2) understands that colleagues and friends of Baraka Leonard Nafari, a PhD student and research assistant, went to Brixton Police

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 123

Station to file a missing person's report after he failed to arrive at work;

- (3) further understands that the university footage linked the taxi driver to the incident where the taxi driver was seen striking Baraka against the fence of the Sophiatown residence, killing him;
- (4) realises that the taxi driver had made a statement to police, and had claimed that Baraka and his friend had weapons and tried to hijack him;
- (5) recognises that the friend who was with Baraka when the taxi driver chased them is consulting the psychologist and psychiatrist as he is still in great shock;
- (6) calls upon the South African Police Services and the university to leave no stone unturned in their investigation of this matter; and

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 124

- (7) conveys its condolences to the family and friends of Baraka Nafari.

Agreed to.

EU CHAMBER OF COMMERCE INDUSTRY IN SOUTHERN AFRICA SURVEY

(Draft Resolution)

Ms G NGWENYA: Chairperson, I move without notice on behalf of the DA:

That the House -

- (1) notes that the European Union Chamber of Commerce and Industry of Southern Africa representing South Africa's largest trading block released in 2017, a business climate survey which identifies Broad-Based Black Economic Empowerment, BBBE as a top regulatory challenge to do business in the country;

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 125

- (2) further notes that the world's economic forum's Global Competitive Index for 2016-17 ranked South Africa 108 out of a 144 countries for the burden of government regulation;
- (3) also notes that the promotion and protection of the investment Bill, now there is euphemism, which was signed into law in 2015, reduce the rights of farm and domestic properly owners;
- (4) notes that denuding of property rights has not been abated and instead is gathering pace with the unjustified review section 25 of the Constitution in order to give wide birth to expropriation without compensation;
- (5) acknowledges that South Africa persistently introduces legislation which compromises the ability of business owners to make long term investment decisions even when later scraped, Bills like the Restitution Of Land Rights

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 126

Amendment Bill do irreparable damage to confidence;

(6) therefore we urge this House to recognise that across the departments, this African legislative environment is engaged in a silent war attrition against domestic business and foreign investors; and;

(7) therefore calls for presidential review into the top 10 regulatory obstacles blocking investment and the rationale for keeping them in place. [Applause.]

The CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G BOROTO): Can you move please?

Ms G NGWENYA: I so move

Dr M Q NDLOZI: House Chair ...

The CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G BOROTO): Thank you. Can I finish with this first?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 127

Dr M Q NDLOZI: No it's a quick one. Is it parliamentary to imitate Minister Naledi Pandor? [Laughter.]

The CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G BOROTO): Hai man eish!

[Laughter.]

Dr M Q NDLOZI: The EFF objects

The CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G BOROTO): Hon members are there any objection to the motion? No objection, agreed to.

Dr M Q NDLOZI: We object. The EFF objects

Mr G S Radebe: Chair, we object. This motion is ill-informed. [Interjections.]

The CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G BOROTO): The ANC's objection will now make the motion without notice to fall off and will become notice of a motion.

**SOUTH AFRICA WILL CO-HOST THE 17TH WORLD CONFERENCE ON
TOBACCO OR HEALTH IN CAPE TOWN**

UNREVISED HANSARD
NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 128

(Draft Resolution)

Ms N C NDABA: Chairperson, I move without notice on behalf of the ANC:

That the House -

- (1) notes that South Africa will co-host the 17th World Conference on Tobacco or Health from 7-9 March 2018, in Cape Town;
- (2) further notes that the conference will be held under the theme, Uniting the World for a Tobacco-Free Generation and will be the first to be hosted in Africa;
- (3) hoping that South Africa's hosting the conference will assist in creating awareness on the harmful effects of tobacco use, and the need to intensify tobacco control measures;
- (4) recognises that the conference calls for committed action, and provides a platform for governments,

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 129

civil-society organisations, United Nations agencies, international organisations, health workers and other stakeholders to discuss and share knowledge and experiences, particularly regarding youth and women who are exposed to tobacco use;

- (5) believes that the conference outcomes will assist a great deal to campaigns and strengthen movements dealing with harmful effects of tobacco, as well as encourage South Africans in particular, to live a healthy lifestyle; and
- (6) wishes the conference organisers and participants a successful conference. [Applause.]

Agreed to.

STUDENT DESIGN WINNER

(Member's Statement)

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 130

Ms J L FUBBS (ANC): House Chairperson, the ANC congratulates young furniture designer, Mr Lwazi Mshibe, the winner in the Student Category of the 5th annual Furniture Design Competition Awards. Furniture designers from all over country exhibited their designs at the Homemakers Expo in Johannesburg recently. He has studied a Bachelor of Technology and Interior Design at the University of Durban Technology. It shows he has never give up as it was his second time of entering the competition.

Speaking on his award-winning design concept, Mr Mshibe said that the word songa means to fold in IsiXhosa and it came as an inspiration during his study years when he had to leave home and stay in a residential flat.

Deputy Minister, Bulelani Magwanishe who was speaking there said: "The furniture industry is playing a key role in radically transforming South Africa's economy." He added that this was partly due to the fact that it is one of the most labour intensive and trade supporting sectors and if it is promoted correctly, it can significantly

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 131

contribute to industry development and lead to the beneficiation of raw materials." I thank you.

THE PRIMARY SOURCE OF LISTERIOSIS OUTBREAK

(Member's Statement)

Ms A T KHANYILE (DA): House Chair, the DA welcomes the Minister of Health's announcement on Sunday that the source of the listeriosis has been traced. But it is clear that the primary source of listeriosis still has not been identified.

We also appreciate the efforts by the National Consumer Commission to issue all the companies involved with the safety recall notices and suspending the exporting of their goods. But South Africa still needs to be informed as to how processed food should be disposed of without creating another health hazard.

The DA believes that there should be stricter guidance for international food imports and that the national food control agency should be created in order to ensure the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 132

safety of South African people. It is not only the health sector that is negatively affected, but it is far reaching as the food industry as well as the agricultural industry and various other industries.

Currently the outbreak has claimed more than 180 lives, and the total number of the infections stands at more than 900. South African legislation pertaining to food safety and security appears to be inadequate.

We are calling on the national Minister to launch a national campaign together with the Department of Agriculture and the Department of Trade and Industry, to ensure that people have more information about the outbreak of the listeriosis and that they are able to avoid the infection. Thank you.

**EFF CELEBRATES THE 61 ANNIVERSARY OF THE INDEPENDENCE OF
GHANA**

(Member's Statement)

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 133

Dr M Q NDLOZI (EFF): House Chairperson, the EFF joins the African continent in the celebration of the 61st Anniversary of the Independence of Ghana. The year 1957 will always represent the inauguration of African political freedom characterised by self-determination.

In this regard, we remember the founding father of Ghanaians on this crucial day of Pan-African determination, Kwame Nkrumah, who defined Ghanaians freedom and independence to be incomplete until the entire continent is decolonised.

On this occasion, in memory of Nkrumah and in marking the 61st Anniversary of Ghanaians Independence, we call on Morocco to end its criminal occupation of Western Sahara. We further call on the African Union to reverse its reactionary decision to accept Morocco into the African family of states whilst it acts as a coloniser over Western Sahara.

The EFF wishes the people of Ghana well, and call on them to join in the wave of economic freedom in our lifetime. Indeed, 61 years later, majority of the people of the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 134

continent remain in underdevelopment, poverty, and hunger. These challenges must be confronted through an uncompromising program of economic freedom in our lifetime to complete the genuine decolonisation that was initiated by Ghanaians 61 years ago.

We call on the land and mineral resources of the continent to be redirected to benefit African people and their economies. We call on financial institutions like Banks to be nationalised and forced to invest in the economic activities of native peoples of the continent.

Finally, we wish President Nana Akufo-Addo who is presiding over Ghana today a long life. We wish him strength in the important chapter of economic freedom in our lifetime; that there must be economic freedom in his lifetime for all Ghanaians. I thank you.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Chairperson, I rise on Rule 92 point of order, is it parliamentary for the hon member to impersonate Jacob Zuma when he speaks?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 135

**MALUTI-A-PHOFUNG SPECIAL ECONOMIC ZONESET TO BOOST JOB
CREATION**

(Member's Statement)

Mr P J MNGUNI (ANC): House Chairperson, the ANC has committed itself to speed up the roll-out of the special economic zone incentive as one of the means to grow the local economy and ensure job creation. We therefore welcome the construction of the Maluti-A-Phofung, Special Economic Zone in the eastern part of the Free State Province. The Special Economic Zone, SEZ, is scheduled to begin construction in March 2018, and is expected to produce 255 direct permanent jobs and 420 indirect jobs in the current financial year.

A further 1 700 temporary work opportunities are also expected to be created during the construction phase of these top structures, as was done through phase one bulk services project, which already commenced in September 2017. The ANC government has initiated Special Economic Zones as geographically designated areas in the country,

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 136

set aside for specifically targeted economic activities to promote economic growth.

Our government around the country is focussed on growing the economy and creating jobs and believes that the Maluti-A-Phofung Special Economic Zone will go a long way in improving the provincial unemployment rate in the Free State. Thank you

FAILURE OF THE DEPARTMENT OF RURAL DEVELOPMENT AND LAND REFORM WITH REGARDS TO ITS POST SETTLEMENT PROGRAMS

(Member's Statement)

Inkosi E M BUTHELEZI (IFP): Chairperson, failure of the Department of Rural Development and Land Reform with regards to its post settlement programs, in particular the protected land under conservation, is a cause for concern to the IFP.

Despite the despicable manner that was used by the apartheid government to evict rural communities from their forefather's land which costed them their entire

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 137

livelihood, these communities understood the importance of nature conservation, the value of biodiversity and the obligation of the state to at least have 10% of its land put aside for conservation.

These communities agreed to get their land back, and to the fact that the land use was not going to change, and that the management of the same land was going to be under the management authorities in terms of section 42(d). It is therefore, very tormenting to note that some of these management authorities seem to undermine the settlement agreement and are deliberately failing to accept the fact that the land is owned by these rural communities.

Landowners who are the communities, instead of being treated as landowners and equal partners, these management authorities continues to treat them like junior partners which is something that undermines the co-management agreement. The management authorities continue to take decisions on their own without the consultation involvement of the landowners.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 138

We therefore urge the Minister to intervene because if this is not addressed, it will pose a threat not just to the relationship between these two parties, but a threat to nature conservation itself. Thank you.

**THE CONTINUOUS THEFT AND HIJACKING OF VEHICLES FROM
MANGUZI AREA IN KWAMHLABUYALINGANA AND SURROUNDINGS**

(Member's Statement)

Mr M S MABIKA (NFP): House Chair, the NFP notes with great concern the continuous theft and hijacking of vehicles from Manguzi area in KwaMhlabuyalingana and surroundings. These vehicles are stolen from innocent people by thieves who send them to Mozambique. It is worrying that although this crisis situation is well known to government, but not much is done to stop it.

Former President Zuma went there twice and former Police Minister Mbalula also went there twice. I don't want to mention MEC Kaunda at all, because is as good as doing nothing in his position. Their visit did not help the suffering community except to deliver useless speeches in

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 139

trying to stop the community from blocking the border and closing Manguzi, Mbazwana and Siphumelele towns.

We therefore call new brooms, President Ramaphosa and Minister Bheki Cele to speedily sweep clean because their predecessors failed the people of KwaMhlabuyalingana and the government as a whole because, once the state President intervenes as the Commander in Chief, it is expected that action be done without fail. So, we hope uNdosi will come with new ways of dealing with the matter before it gets out of hand. I thank you.

**ESKOM SIGN PACT TO BOOST MATHEMATICS AND SCIENCE RESULTS
IN THE EASTERN CAPE**

(Member's Statement)

Ms N NDONGENI (ANC): Hon Chair, the ANC always welcome initiatives that improve the quality of schooling, particularly performance in mathematics, science and technology, and therefore commends the signed agreement between Eskom and Technology Research Activity Centre SA, Trac SA, to extend the coverage of the Eskom Science

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 140

Enhancement Initiative support programme, from five to 30 schools. This initiative aims to assist with science, mathematics and technology selected schools for Grade 10 to 12 in the districts of Libode, Qumbu, Cofimvaba, East London and Uitenhage, in the Eastern Cape schools.

The programme has shown remarkable results within the first year of its inception. Over 2 000 learners and 30 educators from 30 schools have benefitted from the programme, and has assisted in improving the pass rate in maths and science in the province. The ANC believe that the impact of improving the pass rate in maths and science will benefit the Eastern Cape and the country as a whole, and is confident that the extension of the programme to the wider Eastern Cape province will open up doors for learners to pursue various careers, thus instilling a sense of hope for a brighter future. I thank you. [Applause.]

**WITHDRAWAL OF THE ANC SPONSORED DEBATE IN PARLIAMENT ON
NATIONALISATION OF THE RESERVE BANK**

(Member's Statement)

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 141

Mr W M MADISHA (COPE): Chairperson, Cope has taken note of the decision by the ANC to withdraw its sponsored debate in Parliament on the nationalisation of the Reserve Bank. Nonetheless, Cope is concerned at the ANC's stance on the Reserve Bank as adopted in their conference.

The independence of the bank's operations and policy, particularly in relation to political interference is of paramount importance, a cornerstone in our democratic order. Any insinuation that the bank's current private shareholders hold any sway over the bank's mandate is pure bunk, as the role, mandate and independence of the Reserve Bank are clearly articulated and enshrined in our Constitution.

What concerns Cope is, at the ANC's dogged determination to nationalise the bank and what informs this insistence?

We raise this, given the presidential hopeful and now Minister in the Presidency, the hon Dlamini-Zuma's comments that the Reserve Bank's policy could not be independent from the government and that the bank should

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 142

have a clear and deliberate task to implement developmental policies of the ANC, rather than the entire country. This is wrong. Thank you. [Time expired.]

**NELSON MANDELA CHILDREN'S HOSPITAL OPENS INTENSIVE CARE
UNIT**

(Member's Statement)

Mr T M NKONZO (ANC): House Chair, the ANC places children at the centre of our health care programmes. We therefore welcome the opening of the paediatric and neonatal Intensive Care Unit, ICU, unit in the Nelson Mandela Children's Hospital on 28 February 2018. The unit consists of paediatric cardiology and paediatric nephrology units. The opening of the paediatric ICU will add an additional 48 beds to the system, to accommodate children from South Africa and Southern African countries.

The opening of this unit will also assist a great deal with reducing waiting times for magnetic resonance imaging, MRI, scans and computed tomography, CT, scans.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 143

Charlotte Maxeke Johannesburg Academic Hospital, Chris Hani Baragwanath Academic Hospital, Rahima Moosa Mother and Child Hospital and Steve Biko Academic Hospital, will also be assisted in reducing the waiting list and waiting time significantly, for children in dire need of these resources. The ANC believes the opening of the Paediatric Intensive Care Unit complex marks another milestone in the hospital's journey to fully operationalise... I thank you. [Time expired.]

**NEWSPAPER REPORTS ON SA AIRWAYS APPROACHING NATIONAL
TREASURY FOR FURTHER LOANS**

(Member's Statement)

Mr R A LEES (DA): Hon Chairperson, the *City Press* on Sunday carried a front page story that included reference to the SA Airways, SAA, chief executive officer, CEO, as having approached the National Treasury for authority to raise a further R13 billion in loans. The SAA was bailed out by taxpayers and at the expense of the poor and 9,2 million unemployed South Africans to the tune of R10 billion in 2017.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 144

The SAA is bankrupt and it was always clear that the R10 billion bailout was not going to be enough to fund the losses. At the time of the November 2017 bailout, the National Treasury informed Parliament that an additional bailout of R4,8 billion would be required in 2018-19.

Now, only three months later, it seems that even the R4,8 billion will not be enough and the SAA are asking for more than double that at R13 billion.

Hon Chair, there are millions of children in South Africa who do not get enough to eat every day, who go to sleep hungry every night. Instead of feeding our children and equipping them to be productive members of society, we continue to waste money on trying to force a dead duck to fly, when we all know that dead ducks cannot fly at all. The SAA must be put under business rescue, stabilised and privatised. [Applause.]

**NO WATER, NO CLINIC, NO ROADS AND NO ELECTRICITY FOR
MQANDULI COMMUNITY**

(Member's Statement)

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 145

Ms H O MKHALIPI (EFF): Hon Chairperson, "I am only 23 years old; supposedly a born free, but in honest truth I do not know what freedom is. To me and my fellow people from Mqanduli, Lower Tsolo, to us democracy is a fairytale." These are the words of a young university student from Mqanduli. In the community there is no clean running water, no functioning clinic, no proper roads and no electricity.

It is the lack of electricity in Mqanduli which brings me before this House today. For years the community has written to government, at local, provincial and national level and even wrote a letter to the Mayor Dumani Zozo personally, but they continue to be ignored. Whilst there was once a budget for electricity provision in the area, it is mysteriously became insufficient "AKA" corruption.

The community has embarked on various peaceful protests, but to no avail. This government will continue to ignore the community until they became so disparate that they embark on violent protest. Why must it get to this point?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 146

We therefore call upon the Minister to ensure that people of Mqanduli are provided with electricity with the urgency it requires. Thank you.

**THE ANC WELCOMES CONGO AIRWAYS WEEKLY LAUNCH KINSHASA TO
JOHANNESBURG ROUTE**

(Member's Statement)

Mr M P SIBANDE (ANC): Chairperson, the ANC welcomes the launch of the national airline of the Democratic Republic of Congo, DRC, Congo Airways flights between South Africa and Congo. The flights from Kinshasa to Johannesburg will run three times a week: on Wednesdays, Saturdays and Sundays. The new DRC South Africa service represents Congo Airway's first scheduled flight to South Africa, affording an opportunity to further strengthen relationships, build new economic partnerships, and enhance trade and tourism business between the two countries.

The launch of Congo Airways DRC South Africa route follows the two country's adherence to the Single African

Air Transport Market which was launched last month on the margins of the African Union Summit in Addis Ababa, Ethiopia. We believe that the South Africa industry players will work closely together with their Congolese partners to make the African Union Agenda 2063, a successful one regarding the movement of our African people and goods. I thank you. [Applause.]

EFFECTS OF DROUGHT ON MAIZE HARVEST

(Member's Statement)

Mr L M NTSHAYISA (AIC): Chairperson, we are very much concerned that this year the maize harvest is going to drop by 33% from 2017. This is due to low rainfall and decrease in planting maize. We understand well that maize is our staple food and is used for many purposes for example, human and animal product consumption and exportation to other countries. We are still to hear whether maize is also contaminated with this disease "Listeriosis."

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 148

The 2016-17 maize harvest of 16,8 billion tons was far above the harvest of 14,6 million tons of 1981, the largest biggest before 2017. I wish that we come up with more plans so that we can harvest more maize for 2019.

Because, this is the most we can export to other countries. With the land that the government has bought for the people there should be more planting that should be supported by the government. Yes, we are aware of the support given through Comprehensive Agricultural Support Programme, CASP, and others, but there should be more of this.

Those that were running these farms before should be willing to impart skills to the new owners and hand over the equipment or mechanisation. The dream of creating more jobs in agriculture and contribution to the growth of the country will then be realised.

We are aware of the attempts that are made by the Department of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries, but, there should be more of this so that they can have more jobs for our people. Thank you very much. [Time Expired.]

R440 MILLION INVESTED IN ROAD CONSTRUCTION

(Member's Statement)

Ms C L THEKO (ANC): Chairperson, the ANC is committed in accelerating and expanding investment in public infrastructure. We therefore welcome the Gauteng Provincial Government's investment of R440 million on a road construction project on the K54 in Mamelodi, Tshwane East.

This project includes constructing a northbound dual carriageway, two bridges over the railway line, cycle and pedestrian paths as well as taxi bays. Furthermore, the project will also involve the resurfacing of the section leading to the N4 freeway, application of road markings and the installation of traffic signals.

Upon completion, the road will serve as a link between Mamelodi and the N4 freeway, and act as an alternative to Moloto Road. It will also improve road safety in the township as the Tsamaya Road is one of the busiest arterial routes in the township.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 150

The ANC believes that the main contractor will ensure that the Small and medium-sized enterprises, benefits from this project by creating job opportunities and skills transfer for women, youth and people with disabilities and alleviate poverty. Ndza khensa, Mutshamaxitulu. [Thank you, Chairperson.]

R7 BILLION STOLEN BY THE ANC FROM POOR CHILDREN

(Member's Statement)

Mr I M OLLIS (DA): Chairperson, the ANC is stealing R7 billion from poor children by raiding the basic education budget over the next three years. At the same time government is proving billions of rands to the much older students to provide free higher education. In so doing, government is putting young helpless children against much older vocal students. And guess who won the fight?

Why did the students win? Well, because they are better organised to burn down university libraries to topple old statues, to burn police vehicles, to throw faeces at the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 151

military and to march through the streets smashing shop windows. But, was this necessary?

The DA has pointed out how government could save R112 billion through cost saving measures which could have afforded subsidising free or low-fee higher education for students without stealing money from our children schooling like a robber in the night.

As Margaret Thatcher once said: "The trouble with Socialism is that eventually you run out of other people's money"

The trouble with the ANC is that they have already run out of other people's money. But this time it's the children that will have to suffer. Not the champagne drinking bloated Cabinet. Thank you.

R1 BILLION INVESTMENT BY THE SMALL BUSINESS DEVELOPMENT

(Member's Statement)

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 152

Ms DG MAHLANGU (ANC): Chairperson, the ANC understands that entrepreneurship contributes to the success of South Africa's economy. We therefore welcome the announcement of an investment of R1,5 billion by the Small Business Development Ministry said to benefit the entrepreneurs. We understand that this is the outcome of the collaboration between the Department of Small Business Development, Small Enterprise Development Agency, Small Enterprise Finance Agency and Services Seta. The entrepreneurship and co-operatives development institute in which the three-year R1,5 billion funds will be invested was launched in Johannesburg recently.

This partnership is the culmination of a long process of efforts from various stakeholders in both private and public sector organisations for the past 12 months in an effort to build entrepreneurship and enterprising nation.

We believe that there is a programme of action net which comprises of business, monitoring and evaluation, entrepreneurship societies, micro-entrepreneurship programme, business growth programme, start-up enterprise villages and skills development. The ANC government

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 153

believes in partnering with small business in order to create a framework that would ensure that entrepreneurs succeed in their endeavours. Thank you. [Time Expired.]

STUDENT DESIGN WINNER

(Minister's Response)

The MINISTER OF TRADE AND INDUSTRY: Chairperson, I want to thank the hon Fubbs for the information that he provided to the House about the roll out of the top structure programme for the Maluti-A-Phofung Special Economic Zone. I should say that the top structure means the actual factories and the productive activities regained on those factories.

The bulk infrastructure much have it is already been roll-out. That top infrastructure is only rolled out as we start to see investments coming and I couldn't say that the infrastructure is against committed and investments and applications of a total of merely two billion rand so investments of around two billion rand are being rolled out in the Maluti-A-Phofung Special

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 154

Economic Zone. In project like reprocessing chemicals, renewable energy, clothing textile and other manufacturing,

As far as the listeriosis is concerned, I wanted to just say that we have been working with the department of health as well as our colleagues in the department of agriculture, forestry and fisheries. As soon as we became aware of the risk of this listeriosis out-break when the report from National Institute of Communicable Diseases was released by the Minister of Health on Sunday and when that report became available, an hour thereafter the National Consumer Commission, NCC, issued its recall notices.

The hon member is correct that we need continue to communicate with our people about the issues associated there with including the question of the return of the products and also the disposal that is being discussed right now this afternoon between the NCC and the companies concerned.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 155

We will continue to monitor this and wherever there are instances of harmful products being supplied on our markets wherever they come from, we will not hesitate to act through the NCC.

Finally, I just like to add my voice to that of the hon Fubbs and congratulate Mr Mshibi for his well deserved award at the furniture exhibition. Thank you very much.

SARS REACHES TRILLION MILESTONE

(Minister's Response)

The MINISTER OF ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT: Hon House Chairperson, to appreciate the statements of hon Mahlangu and Capa and hon members may be interested to know that Statistics SA this morning released the countries latest GDP figures.

Six take outs for the hon members, the first is that the economy is now valued at R4,7 trillion.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 156

Secondly, the Statistics SA indicated that the quarterly results for the last quarter of last year show that the economy grew by 3,1% for the quarter and agriculture particularly maize production drove that growth.

Thirdly, it was also the annually GDP results and it showed that the GDP growth in reality exceeded the estimates that we had at the time of the budget. The GDP grew by 1,3% against a growth the previous year of 0,6%. Interestingly also is that the provincial growth results came out for 2016 so it is the year earlier and the province with the strongest growth was Gauteng Province with 1,4% growth, followed by the Western Cape with 1,1% and then the Eastern Cape with 0,8% and KZN with 0,7%. Perhaps I should also indicate worrying for us that in the latest results imports are growing faster than exports.

Finally, the Statistics SA provided information going back in which they restated some of the figures. Based on that restatement, the Statistics SA says, that the recession that was announced last year, didn't in fact not happened because we didn't have two quarters of

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 157

consecutive decline. I am sure that all of these things will be of interest to hon members and will be discussed and debated more widely in the next few weeks. Thank you very much.

ESKOM SIGNS PACT TO BOOST MATHS, SCIENCE RESULTS IN EC

(Minister's Response)

The MINISTER OF SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY: House
Chairperson, just speak to the statement made by hon Ndongeni around the implementation of the work that has been done by the department. I think is the Department of Basic Education but more around the improvement of Maths and Science in high schools in order to contribute towards a better community especially for our children and definitely agree that the South African government especially the ANC government has done a lot of work in really investing in the future of the children of South Africa by putting more emphasis of the work around Sciences and Technology because we understand that with the new industrial revolution, more works are going to come from that sector.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 158

If you look at it as well, hence we are saying if you look at the World Economic Forum report that estimates that almost around 2050 more than half of jobs we have today will not exist. Therefore it is important for this government and for the country and all of us to partners and work towards ensuring that the youth of this country are equipped in such a manner that they can respond to the technology but also to respond to the future challenges that are going to be there. So, I really want to stand and say we need to emphasise the work that needs to be done in that area but more encourage all of us to partner and ensure that our children are ready for the future. Thank you very much.

The MINISTER OF HIGHER EDUCATION: Hon Chairperson, I wish to begin by informing the hon Ollis that I don't drink champagne which he probably does. But secondly, I hope that before he tabled the statement here that he had consulted his colleagues the hon Cassim and the hon Bozzolli who work in the education sector and understand the interests and needs of young people and therefore that they would fundamentally disagree with the statement he made.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 159

We are pleased as the ANC that fee free higher education would be introduced through the allocation of an initial R12,4 billion in the new financial year providing support to over 340 000 university students and over 420 000 TVET full time equivalent students.

We believe this is an appropriate policy we have taken and it is about time that the doors of education and learning were opened to all children in our society whatever their circumstances. Thank you very much.

The MINISTER OF POLICE: Chairperson, indeed it is true that there is a problem at the border of kwaHlabawalingana and Mozambique of the four by fours and SUVs that is been stole, but it is not very true that nothing has been done and the figures are beginning to show that something has been done under the leadership of the former President and the former Minister. More so, there were steps taken and left in the middle by the former Minister of Police that will be taken forward like involving the government of Mozambique because without their cooperation no achievements will be reached. So, we are working towards that. Yes, there is a decline and it

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 160

is low but very soon things will be fine and be stable.
Thank you.

The MINISTER OF SMALL BUSINESS DEVELOPMENT: Chairperson,
I wish to thank hon Mahlangu for the comments she has
made in relation to the fund. From the department's point
of view, we would like to say that we all should try by
all means to speak and support small and medium
enterprises because clearly the future in as far as
economic development, empowerment and addressing issues
of poverty, unemployment and inequality truly rest on
supporting small and medium enterprises.

What I would like to say is that, we call on big business
because the member was speaking about a fund that is
being put together by government. We will call on big
business to also implement the fund that they announce
two years ago which is R1,5 billion but at the same time
we would like to say that government can do everything it
can to have the funds to train people but if small and
medium enterprises don't get the access to the market and
big businesses is the one that is really not opening up

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 161

the access to market, particularly to youth, woman and black owned businesses in general.

Finally, I want to say that when I started here there is a party called the democratic ..., what are they called, Democratic Party? DA, neh? They said there is a trust deficit between government and big business. I want to tell them today that trust deficit that they think exist will only exist if big business doesn't give the opportunity to small and medium enterprises and in particular black-owned businesses. We are not apologetic for opening up the opportunity and giving small and medium enterprises that are black owned the opportunity. We are saying the DA must also stand up and tell the big business which in the majority is white to open up the opportunity for black business. Thank you. [Time Expired]

NOTICES OF MOTION

Ms J L FUBBS: Hon House Chair, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the ANC:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 162

That the House debates celebrating the 100th anniversary of the birth of one of the greatest leader of this country, the continent and the world, Isithwalandwe Nelson Rolihlahla Mandela. I thank you.

Mr R A LEES: Hon House Chair, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of DA:

That the House -

(1) notes that -

(a) In light of the recently announced that Value Added Tax, VAT, will be increased from 14% to 15% despite the fact that this increase is not necessary considering that expenditure can be reduced to avoid the VAT increase for this year; and

(b) further given the fact that this increase will hurt the people of South Africa,

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 163

especially the poor, it is of utmost importance that this House debates the desirability of VAT increase as opposed to expenditure cuts.

Mr M N PAULSEN: Hon House Chair, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of EFF:

That the House debates the establishment of a state-owned bank to drive the transformation of the country's economy.

Mr P J MNGUNI: Hon House Chair, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of ANC:

That the House debates working with the farming communities to accelerate the improvement of the living conditions of farm dwellers, including the provision of subsidized houses and other basic services.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 164

Inkosi E M BUTHELEZI: Hon House Chair, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of IFP:

That the House debates the failure of Department of Rural Development and Land Reform development and reform to assist rural committees whose land is under nature conservation. Thank you.

Mr S C MNCWABE: Hon House Chair, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of NFP:

That the House debates the outbreak of listeriosis disease in Limpopo province and the ways to prevent it from spreading all over the country.

Ms N NDONGENI: Hon House Chair, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of ANC:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 165

That the House debates the acceleration of the provision of proper sanitation systems in the rural areas. Thank you.

Ms C N MAJEKE: Hon House Chair, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of UDM:

That the House debates the effects of unregulated houses or rooms letting such as Air Bed and Breakfast, AirBnb, on other registered accommodation facilities in residential areas as well as the risks that ordinary residents are exposed to.

Mr M S F DE FREITAS: Hon House Chair, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of DA:

That the House debates the continuing and current shambolic state of the Passenger Rail Agency of South Africa, the attempt by the previous Minister and the interim Board to stop the investigation into

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 166

corruption into Prasa and what needs to be done to get Prasa back on track.

Mr M N PAULSEN: Hon House Chair, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of EFF:

That the House debates addressing nutritional insecurity, which has a dire impact on especially poorer communities.

Mr T M NKONZO: Hon House Chair, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of ANC:

That the House debates the prioritising and acceleration of the development of sport facilities in black townships and rural communities.

Mr M P SIBANDE: Hon House Chair, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of ANC:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 167

That the House debates strengthening the instruments of representative and participatory democracy.

Mr L M NTSHAYISA: Hon House Chair, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of AIC:

That the House debates the feasibility of changing the current electoral system, to improve representative democracy, including public representation in government decision-making processes.

Ms C L THEKO: Hon House Chair, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of ANC:

That the House debates implementing the widening of the allocation of the state's legal work for broader participation by black people, in general, and women in particular.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 168

Ms N I TARABELLA-MARCHESI: Hon House Chair, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of DA:

That the House -

(1) notes that -

(a) In light of the fact that the majority of scholar transport deaths since 2013 happened in the last in the last 11 months despite the DA consistently raising the issue of scholar over many years.

(b) We therefore propose that this House debates the safety of scholar transport as a matter of urgency.

Ms D G MAHLANGU: Hon House Chair, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of ANC:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 6 MARCH 2018

Page: 169

That the House debates investing in the indigenous research and innovation capacities as long-term sustainable development.

The House adjourned at 17:24.

UNREVISED HANSARD