# TUESDAY, 14 NOVEMBER 2017

***PROCEEDINGS OF THE NATIONAL ASSEMBLY***

The House met at 14:06.

The Speaker took the Chair and requested members to observe a moment of silence for prayer or meditation.

The SPEAKER: Hon members, shortly before I came to the House I received a letter from the Chief Whip of the Opposition querying whether the processing of the Division of Revenue Amendment Bill complied with the Rules. We will proceed with the business while seeking legal clarity. If there is any problem with the process we will review the matter. Hon Steenhuisen, I am sure you’ll find that in order.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: As it pleases you, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much.

# NEW MEMBER

(Announcement)

The SPEAKER: Hon members, I wish to announce that the vacancy which occurred in the National Assembly owing to the resignation of Mr L S Tlhaole had been filled, with effect from 1 November 2017, by the nomination of Mr M Tshwaku. [Applause.] The hon member has made and subscribed the oath in the Office of the Deputy Speaker. I welcome you, hon member.

# SUSPENSION OF RULE 290(2) (a)

(Draft Resolution)

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: Speaker, I move the motion as printed in my name on the Order Paper, as follows:

That the House suspends Rule 290(2) (a), which provides, inter alia, that the debate on the Second Reading of a Bill may not commence before at least three working days have elapsed since the committee’s report was tabled, for the purpose of conducting a Second Reading debate today on the Division of Revenue Amendment Bill.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Madam Speaker, it’s usually customary that parties are consulted when the three-day Rule is to be waived. This is not the case in this regard and we would like to register our strongest objection. If we are going to waive the three-day Rule there has to be a consensus of the House and not simple the dictate of a single office. We will be opposing this.

The SPEAKER: There is an objection and I think it’s one that is an established practice of this House.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: Hon Speaker, first of all maybe we need to apologise to all the other parties. Ordinarily, we should have consulted through the Chief Whips’ Forum. It was

an omission on our part. We want to sincerely apologise to all the other parties on this matter. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: I hope the other parties do accept the apologies of the Chief Whip of the Majority Party.

Ms H O MKHALIPI: Madam Speaker, we do accept the apology from the Chief Whip of the Majority Party. He is a leader.

The SPEAKER: I think that goes for everyone. The objection of the DA will be noted.

Agreed to (Democratic Alliance dissenting).

# PROTECTION, PROMOTION, DEVELOPMENT AND MANAGEMENT OF INDIGENOUS KNOWLEDGE SYSTEMS BILL

(Decision of Question on Second Reading)

There was no debate.

Question put: That the Bill be read a second time. Division demanded.

The House divided.

AYES - 190: [TAKE IN FROM MINUTES] NOES - 73: [TAKE IN FROM MINUTES] ABSTAIN - 8: [TAKE IN FROM MINUTES]

Question agreed to.

Bill accordingly read a second time.

(VOTING TAKE IN FROM MINUTES)

Question agreed to.

Bill accordingly read a second time.

# DIVISION OF REVENUE AMENDMENT BILL

(Consideration of Report of Standing Committee on Appropriations)

There was no debate.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: Thank you again Speaker. We move that the Report be adopted.

Motion agreed to.

Report accordingly adopted.

# DIVISION OF REVENUE AMENDMENT BILL

(Second Reading debate)

Ms Y N PHOSA: Hon Speaker, hon Ministers and Deputy Ministers, hon members, compatriots and fellow South Africans, centuries of misrule, oppression and the exploitation of our country by successive racist governments have made South Africa play a catch-up game. Apartheid was even more brazen about this

oppression and suppression of African talent. The Bantu Education Act of 1953 had the most deleterious effect on the ability of our people to use education to extricate themselves from poverty.

I know some amongst us do not want us to remind them about these sins which are still reaping their bitter fruits today. Just to make sure that we are singing from the same hymn book, let me remind you of the unfortunate quote from the apartheid architect, Hendrik Verwoerd, when he said:

There is no place for the Bantu in the European community above the level of certain forms of labour ... What is the use of teaching the Bantu child Mathematics when it cannot use it in practice.

It is critically important for us to remind the people of South Africa that our country is still trying to redress the all-round disarray created by hundreds of years of colonialism which disrupted the lives of the indigenous people of our country. The fact that today we talk about inequality, poverty and high rates

of unemployment is because of the marginalisation and deliberate exclusion of black people in particular from a productive economy. The unemployment rate is highest amongst Africans; poverty is highest amongst Africans; and skills are lowest amongst Africans. The list goes on.

Inequality in this country is unsustainable. This inequality will soon lead to instability which will compromise our ability to attract direct foreign investments which are important if we are to go out of this low economic growth trap. It cannot be justified by any argument that in South Africa the top 10% of our population owns 95% of the wealth. Unfortunately, this wealth still follows racial lines. Without us dealing with this injustice, we cannot talk about freedom from apartheid bondage. The deracialisation of our economy and making it inclusive in terms of race, gender, etc is vital for us in the ANC.

So for us in the ANC, when we scrutinise and interrogate the Budget, it is with the sole purpose of seeing its ability to correct these man-made catastrophes in the shortest possible time. We do not have the luxury to be armchair critics when we

are confronted by subdued economic growth. We cannot be bystanders when the resources meant to address education, health, social grants and housing are depressed.

However, we welcome the additional resources for the community workers programme and the allocation of budget to the value of R19,8 million in Mpumalanga and Limpopo. This is critical to accelerate progress towards malaria elimination.

The proposal to direct 40% of the Education Infrastructure Grant towards the maintenance of schools is highly commended. This is also critical in ensuring a conducive environment for learning.

All of us, regardless of colour, race or creed, have a responsibility to come up with realistic solutions. That we will do, irrespective of the pain we must go through. We are a resilient people.

The Budget presented by the hon Minister of Finance on

25 October has been hailed as the most transparent and honest analysis of the current economic conditions and future

forecasts. He took the whole country into confidence and said should we not change course, things may be worse. As an example, he said if we don't arrest indebtedness of our country in 2021- 22, the debt to gross domestic product, GDP, ratio may reach 60%. Its not there yet; it may reach 60%. So it means we have a responsibility to make sure that it does not reach 60%. It is thus extremely disingenuous for some amongst us to pretend that we are there. We are not there yet. He also tried to focus on the to-do list. He did not end there; he continued to share with us the initiatives of government, both on the expenditure and revenue sides.

The Minister reiterated that the Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement, MTBPS, will continue to be pro-poor and developmental. That is why the increase in education, health care and grants is above the inflation rate, on average seven per cent. We also welcome the pro-growth MTBPS. Despite the difficult economic conditions, government will spend over R900 billion in infrastructure in the Medium-Term Expenditure

Framework, MTEF, period. I think we need to give the Minister a

round of applause for this allocation. [Applause.] This will allow ... [Interjections.] There was applause.

This will allow many companies who would otherwise have no work access to government infrastructure programmes ... This will ensure that, despite subdued investments, construction companies and related industries contribute to much-needed growth.

The committee calls upon provinces and municipalities to double their efforts to focus on sustainable infrastructure with effective and efficient spending, avoiding leakages at all costs because they undermine growth and the creation of jobs.

We are concerned about low levels of private-sector investments. A low business confidence level is cited as one of the reasons. The 14 confidence boosting ... I repeat ... confidence boosting measures announced by the Minister of Finance in July are meant to deal with this challenge. The Minister also said, “Restoring confidence is the cheapest stimulus we can inject”. I do not have the slightest doubt that, if we all embrace this wisdom by

the Minister and work together regardless of colour, race or creed, the fruits of this wisdom will be realised.

We welcome the appointment of the new board with a right skills mix at SA Airways, SAA. We are also hopeful of the turnaround to financial sustainability of SAA because of the appointment of Mr Jarana, the chief executive officer, CEO, of SAA, who started at the beginning of November.

We need private-sector investment to inclusively grow our economy. Gross fixed capital formation has been on the decline for the past two years ...

An HON MEMBER: Why?

Ms N Y PHOSA: ... a decline of 3,9 and 0,6 respectively. This coincides with low levels of business confidence. So, we are urging government and business to work together to ensure that all those things that have led to low business confidence and thus low levels of private-sector investments are dealt with as a matter of urgency.

In terms of the Division of Revenue Amendment Bill, the wage bill is projected to be above inflation, which is 1,8 per cent over the MTEF. We support the Financial and Fiscal Commission’s, FFC’s, view that both government and the unions should aim to reach a sustainable settlement — a strategic move that will be in the best interest of our country’s economy.

The committee welcomes the additional R1,9 billion baseline allocations as announced in the MTBPS. These allocations will significantly cushion the poor from the risks associated with low economic growth. The continuous increase in the local government equitable share simply means redistribution and allocation to poor households. This Division of Revenue Amendment Bill is indeed pro-poor and responsive to the needs of the people.

Let us all then agree that fiscal consolidation, adherence to an expenditure ceiling, our commitment to protect the poorest of the poor and infrastructure expenditure will continue to drive the way we deal with our Budget.

We must also agree that for us to be able to achieve our entire developmental objective, economic growth for everyone is non- negotiable. Economic growth and economic transformation are not mutually exclusive. The focus should be growth for all our citizens, not only one section of our citizenry, and if we were to do that, there is no doubt that poverty, unemployment and inequality will be dealt a fatal blow. We just need to work together and do more for this country.

As l sit down, allow me to borrow wise words from the founding father of our democracy, the very first President of a democratic South Africa, Dr Nelson Mandela, when he said, “As long as poverty, injustice and gross inequality persist ... none of us can truly rest”.

We as the ANC support the Bill.

Mr D J MAYNIER: Speaker, before we debate the merits of the Division of Revenue Amendment Bill, we should pause to consider the chaos in the budget process, which appears to have been

manufactured by President Jacob Zuma, who now seems determined to take out the National Treasury.

The Minister of Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation, Jeff Radebe, tried to reassure us that there was nothing to fear from the new Budget Prioritisation Framework during his briefing following the Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement, in Parliament.

However, yesterday, we heard of the shock resignation of budget officer, Michael Sachs, who is one of the most experienced and one of the most capable senior officials at the apex of the National Treasury.

The fact is that his resignation is a huge blow to the National Treasury and confirms our fears that decision-making about budget priorities and indeed the budget itself has now been centralised under President Jacob Zuma.

The Constitution itself requires that the budgetary processes promote transparency, accountability, and sound financial

management, and yet we now have a Presidential Fiscal Committee making decisions about the budget, which undermines the Minister’s committee on the budget. A mandate paper setting out budget priorities in terms of new budget prioritisation framework, compiled by the Department of Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation, which undermines the National Treasury. That is not to mention rogue elements, like Morris Masutha, who is reportedly peddling a R40 billion budget busting plan for higher education, sponsored formally or informally by President Jacob Zuma.

The fact is that the budget process has been reduced to a bill of spaghetti. What this means in practice, is that in the middle of a fiscal crisis, decision-making on the budget has been plunged into chaos.

We have to face the fact that the National Treasury is being defanged and reduced to bookkeepers with declining influence over budget priorities, and the budget itself under President Jacob Zuma.

Things have got so bad that we are now not even sure whether the government has abandoned fiscal consolidation and its central fiscal objective, which is to stabilise national debt, in favour of a populist spend now, pay later fiscal policy under President Jacob Zuma.

Whatever the case, we can be sure that the ratings agencies, who are circling us like sharks, will have taken notes and the probability of further ratings downgrades to junk status is greater today than it was the day before yesterday in South Africa. I thank you.

Mr T RAWULA: We stand here as the EFF to reject the Revenue Amended Bill. We reject this Bill to send a strong and clear message to our people all over the country to know that the support for the Division of the Revenue Amendment Bill is the support for corruption, kleptocracy and captured ANC. To support this Bill is to give the ANC permission to continue to loot the public purse.

The ANC in Parliament has clearly demonstrated that it is not interested in following the money Bill processes; instead they have turned Parliament into a rubber stamp to steal money.

The ANC in Parliament has clearly demonstrated that it does not respect or value nor is interested in the following of the processes of the Public Finance Management Act, PFMA, sound and practical budgeting; instead Mr Zuma does as he pleases without consequences.

He treats our tax money as if it was his own pocket, where he just takes as he pleases without consequences. The ANC want come here to grandstand, mislead our people and claim that a vote against the Division of Revenue Amendment Bill is a vote against service delivery.

Our vote against the adjusted budget is a vote against corruption, maladministration and state capture. As the EFF, we have in the past provided a clear and concrete proposal on the division of revenue and what is to be done to improve efficiency.

As the EFF, we do so well aware that within the current fiscal framework underpinned by austerity measures, privatisation of state-owned entities and declining tax revenue base, even the most progressive proposals will be rendered unworkable.

To start with, we must do away with the equitable share formula that grossly exaggerates and assumes the capacity of municipalities to collect tax, instead just perpetuate apartheid spatial redistribution of resources. The municipalities must get a lion share of the revenue raised nationally.

We raise this driven by the honest truth that our people don’t reside in provinces, they reside in municipalities and that is where money must go. These are in line with the EFF manifesto of building a people’s centred local municipality and also build the state capacity in particular the local government. This will leave national and provincial government with the minimal responsibility of policy and oversight, as it was intended by the Constitution.

We make a principled call to build and intensify state capacity and abolish tenders because that will free resources, and create jobs and to ensure that taxpayer’s money is used in an efficient manner.

The state dependence on tenders has both political and service delivery implication and unless we start insourcing, the Division of Revenue Amendment Bill as presented is going to continue to produce depressing results for the workers and poor millions in spaceless townships and rural area.

The City of Johannesburg must have state-owned construction company which must build houses in Alexander. City of Ekurhuleni must insource all cleaners, security guards, gardeners, plumbers and all other workers and pay them decent wages with medical aid and pension fund.

All other municipalities must employ engineers, artisans and competent administrators to build roads, clean parks, deliver water, collect waste and do regular maintenance of municipal infrastructure. It is only then that proposed changes to the

Division of Revenue Amendment Bill will have a meaningful impact in the lives of our people, the poor and workers.

We can tell you now, if you a responsive state to our people’s needs, give more resources in local state as a strategy to build an effective, efficient and responsive state. Until then, until you submit to that superior logic, the EFF will forever rejects the Division of Revenue Amendment Bill. [Time expired.]

*IsiZulu*:

Mnu M HLENGWA: Ngiyathokoza lungu elihloniphekile Somlomo, iqiniso elimsulwa ukuthi iNingizimu Afrika isenkingeni ikakhulukazi kulaba bakithi abangaqondi ukuthi inhlekelele esibhekene nayo ingakanani. Ukugqoza kokukhula komnotho, ukukhula kokungaqashwa kwabantu bakithi njengoba sazi ukuthi amazinga okungaqashwa asefike ezingeni elisabisayo. Amazinga obubha anyuka usuku nosuku nazo zonke nezinye izinselelo ezivela ngenxa yokuthi uhulumeni okhona akanawo umbono ukuthi angaluhlangula kanjani izwe kulesi simo somnotho esiyinkinga kangaka ngenxa yokuthi le nhlekelele yomnotho ikhandwe yibo.

*English*:

The reality is before us. For as long as we continue throwing financial solutions to nonfinancial problems, we will not get out of the mess that we are in. Quite frankly, the issue is not that there is no money but the issue is how we are spending that money.

There is a level of reckless and irresponsible spending. We are spending on wants and not needs and at the end of the day it is the majority of our people who are hardest hit by this irrational type of spending which is currently before us.

There is poor growth, policy inconsistency, and high unemployment. Therefore, we are not out of the woods just yet. The junk status continues to linger over us and downgrades are a daily reality.

Quite frankly, the Minister said nothing new in the Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement, MTPBS. He told us what we already know, that the economy has collapsed in the hands of the ANC, if I were to summarise him. State-owned entities have become the

biggest let down. Once what were national assets have become national liabilities and the captain of that team of course is South African Airways, SAA.

When you have now the Budget Prioritisation Framework, which is in fact presidential overreach, where are the checks and balances? Who takes responsibility when things go wrong? Will it be the Presidency? Will it be the Ministry of Finance? What is actually evident now is that Minister Gigaba has been rendered absolutely useless and it tells us exactly why the reshuffle was done because a ‘yes man’ was required for the job.

Michael Sacs resigned yesterday. Are we surprised? We shouldn’t be surprised. The purge is the daily reality at the National Treasury. The National Treasury has been captured and will continue to be captured for as long as the ANC is in power. They are removing people from office, who are fit and proper and fit for purpose.

*IsiZulu*:

Iyona nhlekelele ke esibhekene nayo leyo bantu baseNingizimu Afrika. Sizoshaya ikhwelo lokuthi lesi simo asingaqhubeki.

*English:*

Let us take the country back with the battle of the ballot in 2019 because for as long as the ANC is in government people will remain out of jobs.

*IsiZulu:*

Angikaze ngizibone izahluleki ezidlula lezi ezingapha kwa-ANC. Ngiyathokoza Sihlalo.

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Hon Deputy Speaker, ... [Interjections.] Speaker, allow me start off by condemning the barbaric behaviour of two farmers, who have alleged to have tied up, assaulted and shot a nine-year-old girl in Bronkhorstspruit ...

Ms N V MENTE: Speaker, on a point of order: We did not get the memo that you were demoted to Deputy Speaker. Can you share the news, please?

The SPEAKER: [Laughter.] That’s not a point of order, hon member. He just made a mistake.

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: No, Speaker. The EFF don’t make mistakes, they are a mistake. [Laughter.] Hon Speaker, 300 years of oppression ... [Interjections.]

Mr T RAWULA: Hon Speaker, on a point of order: Can the member withdraw what he just said? He is a mistake himself. He can’t refer to us as a mistake. That’s wrong!

The SPEAKER: No, hon member, that is not a point of order. Please let the hon member proceed.

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Hon Speaker, 300 years of oppression under the apartheid regime where our people were deprived of education

...

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: Speaker, on a point of order: Please, he must withdraw. He can’t insult us like that. He can’t go for a week

and then come back and insult the EFF. He can’t get away with that.

The SPEAKER: ... but ...

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: He’s a factory fault, to start with.

The SPEAKER: No. Well, if you want to square up with him, then you have done it. [Laughter.]

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Hon Speaker, I was referring to our people, who have been, for over 300 years, mistreated and dehumanised. Our workers had to migrate, leaving single families with the head of the household for many days of the year away from their people. And we must not expect miracles that in 23 years you can address the oppression of 300 years.

The NFP welcomes the division of the Revenue Amendment Bill, table here today. We welcome the additional R1,9 billion allocated to local government, as announced in the Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement. However, if not spent correctly, it

will not benefit the poor, especially in terms of the low economic growth that we are experiencing currently. A matter of concern, of course, is the municipalities. Unless the municipalities become self-sufficient and able to find alternative revenue the challenges they will face will be catastrophic, which may result in a lot of the growing concerns or may become bankrupt.

All three spheres of government have failed to spend an approximately R415 million in terms of infrastructure. Now, surely that cannot be acceptable. It cannot be business as usual when the Municipal Finance Management Act and the Public Finance Management Act are violated and no consequences for offenders, especially those who repeatedly do the same thing. Cost containment measures must be accelerates and implemented.

Another matter for grave concern is political party funding by Parliament, which appears to be a very serious problem, because there are no checks and balances and they are actually violated and abused by some political parties. I think greater concerns must be raised and one needs to look into these things. There

must be some monitoring and evaluation in terms of that. Debt owed to municipalities at R128 billion cannot be business as usual. It is really going to be ... and also, R43 billion that is owed by municipalities to government departments – we cannot conduct our affairs in this manner.

Provinces started the new year with R26 billion in deficit. And if you take the Department of Health, they have repeatedly said that they are under budget by approximately R2 billion in each province. Unless we address that, we cannot deal with the health challenges in the country.

In conclusion, the NFP supports the Bill tabled here today. Thank you very much.

*IsiXhosa*:

Mnu N L S KWANKWA: Molweni torhwana. Xa ndiqala nje ndifuna ukuyithetha into yokuba asinakuze sithule. Siyathula xa amapolisa egeza ebetha abantu kodwa asikwazi ukuba sithule sizinkokeli xa abantu begeza bebetha amapolisa. Ibambi kakhulu

into yokuba abantu abazibiza ngamaKrestu kodwa bafune ukutyala ukungabinasimilo nobuntswelaboya eMzantsi Afrika.

*English*:

Section 214 of the Constitution requires that government ensures an equitable division of revenue, raised nationally among the national, provincial and local spheres of government. This Division of Revenue Amendment Bill therefore sponsored the adjustments to the budget through the budget process. But this Bill is tabled at a time when South Africa faces political and economic uncertainty; at a time when our economy is experiencing sluggish growth and revenue shortfalls due to the mismanagement of our economy by the ruling party.

Going back to section 214 of the Constitution I quoted above there is nothing equitable about a system that gives only a fraction ...

*IsiXhosa*:

... yemali koomasipala...

... out of a R1,4 trillion budget. Actually, if you look at your report ...

*IsiXhosa*:

... le kanye nithetha ngayo ...

*English*:

... of the Standing Committee on Appropriations, one of the things it says ...

*IsiXhosa*:

... nto leyo ebonwe nguNondyebo weSizwe...

*English*:

... is that many municipalities find themselves in financial distress, primarily because of this issue...

*IsiXhosa*:

... yokuba aba masipala abanawo amandla okwenza ingeniso.

If you look at it, how do you address issues of inequality, the past imbalances and backlogs...

*IsiXhosa*:

... ukuba uza kunika eyona mali encinci kwaba masipala bangenamali?

*English*:

You say there is a culture of nonpayment for municipal services in stead of saying that people do not have the means to pay for municipal services and therefore government needs to intervene by injecting more resources for the municipalities.

*IsiXhosa*:

Andiyazi ukuba ningathini na ngoomasipala bakuQoboqobo, Cumakala kunye neNkonkobe le ndisuka kuyo, ekuthiwa yiRaymond Mhlaba ngoku xa ibizwa. Kwaba masipala akukho nepeni emdaka phaya kwaye iindlela ziyoyikeka. Uthi xa uthetha nabo ufumanise ukuba abanayo kwale yokulungisa izitalato. Bonke aba masipala kuquka neQonce eli nililawulayo...

... and other places around the country ...

*IsiXhosa*:

... banale ngxaki yokungakwazi ukukhulisa iingxowa zabo.

*English*:

The system, this framework and this structure, therefore, needs to be changed.

*IsiXhosa*:

Ukuze sikwazi ukuqiniseka ukuba oomasipala sibanika imali eyaneleyo siyeke ukuthetha ngotshintsho lwezoqoqosho olukhawulezileyo xa sithetha ngooCR17 nooNDZ 17 kodwa sibe singayenzi ...

*English*:

... in terms of our structure the redistribution and allocation of funds in South Africa.

*IsiXhosa*:

Hayi zinkosi, ningafane nje ningxole ningaske nizixhome ngentambo yesigcawu emthini wetumata.

*English*:

The other thing is ...

*IsiXhosa*:

... yile nto yokufumanisa ukuba ...

*English*:

... this school infrastructure backlogs grant remains a perennial problem ...

*IsiXhosa*:

... kuba naphaya eMpuma Koloni ngoku abantwana bethu befundela kwizikolo zodaka abukho ubuchule bokusebenzisa imali...

*English*:

... because you deploy comrades ...

*IsiXhosa*:

... abangakwazi nokwenza umsebenzi. Emva kokuba nise amaqabane enu phaya nohlwaya abantu ngokuthi abakwazanga ukusebenzisa imali. La masela.

Ms D CARTER: Speaker, the annual Division of Revenue Act essentially gives effect to the constitutional imperative that all three spheres of government are entitled to an equitable share of revenue raised nationally.

In its submission to the Standing Committee on Appropriation regarding the Division of Revenue Amendment Bill, Treasury placed much emphasis on the deteriorating financial performance and delivery of our municipalities. Municipal debt is increasing and this has been aggravated by a culture of nonpayment for municipal services. Coupled hereto the quantum owed by municipalities to their creditors is increasing and this threatens the livelihood of these suppliers.

The core problems that beset local government are not new. They have been analysed and plans have previously been devised.

Municipalities have been subjected to Project Consolidate, the

Local Government Turnaround Strategy and the Back to Basics programme – all to no avail. But Cope is of the view that the ills that beset local government will not be resolved by further programmes and the blocking of loopholes with further legislation.

Ultimately, the real solution lies in the citizenry of our municipalities electing uncaptured, ethical political leaders. The Msunduzi Municipality is a point in question. For the past

15 or so years the municipality has lurched from one crisis to another, despite various interventions, including having been placed under administration. The election of unethical political leadership is a sure recipe to ensuring a dysfunctional municipal administration. When factional political battles are being fought, such as now within the ruling party, it splits the entire municipal administration along the very same factional battles. In fact, the municipality becomes the battleground and its resources the ammunition that is used to fight these battles. Nonetheless, Cope does share the view of the Financial and Fiscal Commission that it’s time that municipalities received a more equitable share of government revenues raised.

In noting the content of the Division of Revenue Amendment Bill, Cope questions why no specific provision was made to assist the devastating drought situation in the Western Cape. I’m very tempted to respond to the Hon Phosa: How many more years will it take the ANC to blame the apartheid government for the ills effecting our injustices today. [Interjections.] Unemployment and lack of quality education of any person under the age of 32 is squarely to blame on the ANC. As she quoted the father of our nation in her dedication, I want to quote him too in saying that, “if the ANC does to you what the apartheid government did to you, then you must do to the ANC government what you did to the apartheid government”. [Time expired.] I thank you.

Ms D Z SENOKOANYANE: Hon Speaker, hon Members of the Executive, hon members and our guests in the gallery, it is yet again time for us to debate the division of Revenue Bill and this time in mid-term, it is also time for those who prefer daydreaming and hallucinating to continue doing that.

Challenges remain but we all have job at hand to serve our people, a task that is never going to be easy. The economy is

giving all those who care sleepless nights as we ponder we are going to tackle the challenges confronting us. However, a consolation is that the ANC-led government has made commitment to the people and we cannot afford to fail them in spite of all the questions we keep asking ourselves on way forward ands in spite of all the noise that we have to listen to.

The National Development Plan is in place and it is our guide even though there are all sorts of constraints in our way as we work towards achieving its objectives. But we do have men and women amongst us who are equal to the task and we will stop at nothing to make sure that we get there, even if it means making the ultimate sacrifices. The ANC-led government has been very consistent in its mission to address issues of economic and social transformation as well as inclusive growth.

Transformation is a key factor in dealing with the historical apartheid injustices characterised by inequality.

The budget as usual is redistributive in nature, making sure that the gap between the wealthy and the poor, who are almost entirely black people, is narrowed. This is a phenomenon that

always makes one wonder. South Africa is not a poor country and we should not be having such huge disparities. People must forward to help this country if they are patriotic. I’ve just realised with this government that everyone matters and an equal access should be a way to go. I sometimes wonder what it would be like if this government were to behave like its apartheid counterpart, utilising the budget for a chosen few and pretending that everyone else does not exist.

The South African economy is going through one of the most challenging times with low growth and increasing government debt as well as investor confidence at a low time low. It is not only government that is concerned about this situation but ordinary, be it individuals or organisations have raised concerns and made submissions to Parliament and engaged with the committee. It was not by mistake that this government included public participation as a key component of its work, but it was a conscious effort to make sure that we make decisions from an informed position. I think we have a great country.

Poverty and unemployment are on the rise and this obviously must raise alarm bells. This government has decided to take this one head on by protecting social programmes which target the poor and disadvantaged citizens including low income households.

Hence we see the bulk of the budget being directed there. The difficulty though, is that this needs to be coupled with economic growth in as much this seems to be a farfetched dream but it is a dream in the right direction. We do not have an option but to soldier on and find ways of reviving the economy.

Fiscal consolidation has assisted our economy for quite some time now, but with the current economic climate it becomes an uphill. Yes, I must commend our Treasury for holding on and do anything possible to halt any spending above the said ceiling, a policy choice with a potential to give us some breathing space. Unfortunately, there are other factors that continue to compromise these efforts.

Job creation should be at the top of our priority list but of course, there are hurdles along the way. Government is facing a huge challenge and as you know, it has been the biggest employer

over many years yet it is not a profit making institution. Can those with money please dig deeper and come on board to provide employment? Surely we should all be concerned about the state of affairs. Redistribution of resources from the wealthy to the poor is a positive step as well as provinces and municipalities having responsibility to redistribute resources from the cities to the remote areas as this is an anomaly that we have perhaps not paid adequate attention to.

I hope those who are only interested in metros and have no time for poorer areas are listening, and it is no longer going to be about metros only and resources shall be shared. Guided by the National Development Plan, mid-term spending priorities continue to focus on low income households to decrease a number of people living beyond the poverty line. An inclusive public health system, as we have seen the introduction of National Health Insurance, which will change the system where only the wealthy benefit and promote access for all. The provision of additional support of antiretroviral treatment programme with the aim of reaching out to more beneficiaries.

It is exciting to see that this phenomenon of health will no longer be reserved for the chosen few who can afford to pay or have medical aids but all citizens of this country will have equal access. Yes, those with bags full of money must fund this programme. We need the National Health Insurance as of yesterday. And once it is fully in place, one of our battles would have been won.

With regard to education, the area of Early Childhood Development has proven to be a big contributor towards children’s further development into other stages of childhood and to adulthood. It prepares a young child for school readiness as well as other future milestones. Raising life expectancy at birth can also benefit this programme. Over decades it has been an ongoing challenge for students from poor households to access university education even though they qualify as they cannot afford the high cost involved. This division of revenue has taken this into consideration as part of the social package.

Proposals for the division of revenue focus on finding services for poor communities being prioritised with provincial allocations focusing on social services which include education

and health while municipalities are subsidised for service delivery of free basic service to low income households and the necessary infrastructure for the delivery of these services.

This budget is actually addressing those areas. Social services have seen annual growth in revenue at all spheres of government, including proposals in the current Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement, MTBPS - an encouraging pattern indeed. Provinces and municipalities stand to benefit from the changes in the equitable division of nationally raised revenue through their adjusted allocations, not for themselves but for the communities they serve. This is one of the features of a democratic government coupled with a focus on transformation.

Directing resources to the most vulnerable is one of the mechanisms with the potential to address the social inequalities that continue to affect this sector of society. It is also an indirect investment to the welfare of the country by providing services which promote their well-being and dignity. Before this process of adjustment, the Cabinet responded to the current economic challenges by identifying the need to strengthen the

alignment of the budget instruments and the National Development Plan.

A process which culminated in the development of a mandate Paper, a joint venture by the National Treasury and the Department of Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation. This paper has a focus on establishing a framework for future budget priorities in line with the goals of National Development Plan and sets out criteria for future prioritisation to guide the consideration of future budget proposals.

Hon Speaker, on behalf of the ANC, I support this budget. [Applause.]

Mr B R TOPHAM: Madam Speaker, Vladimir Putin has said many questionable things but you can’t disagree with the following statement: “The unjustified swelling of the budgetary deficit and the accumulation of public debts are just as destructive as adventurous stock-jobbing”. This Division of Revenue Amendment Bill is in the end all about the principle of debt.

We must not forget that our country is facing a total revised deficit of R219 billion. This means we are getting into more debt. Ten years ago we had a debt to GDP ratio of 22%, we are now looking at close to 47%. Debt in itself is not a bad thing as long as it provides for a growing economy creating jobs.

Unfortunately, this is not happening. This is because we have our principles confused or we do not have principles.

Margarete Thatcher said that we will stand on principle or we will not stand at all. Based on the figures we are in trouble and thus l thought it appropriate that I share a story with you; a story about the principles of the birds and the bees – specifically about geese.

Most of us can relate to the story as almost everybody has a desire to have a little patch of land to farm and call our own.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Point of order.

The SPEAKER: Yes, hon Steenhuisen, what is the point of order?

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Madam Speaker, as you know this is a maiden speech, it is generally respected. Perhaps you would like to share with the hon Minister Zulu the parliamentary niceties relating to maiden speeches.

The SPEAKER: The parliamentary niceties about the fact that a maiden speech itself must be as uncontroversial as possible, but the House must respect a maiden speech in the way they deal with it and respond to it. Hon member, please proceed.

Mr B R TOPHAM: I have not been to Nklandla but I think the President will also relate to the story as I believe that he has a goose or two on his little patch of land. Like George Orwell’s *Animal farm*, the farm known as South Africa had a change of management a few years ago; management by the people for the people, where all the pigs are equal.

Like most uprisings timing is very important and fortunately this change happened at a very important time in history, when the tides were rising and there was a very positive story being

told to the international communities about our cool country and everybody was bending over backwards to help us.

As a result, the farm become quite productive; the golden years of our new economy arrived. Like all good stories, there is a twist in the tail. Unfortunately farming is tough; it is very hard. If you don’t wake up everyday, check the fences, feed animals and eradicate predators, you are soon going to have a farm that is in trouble.

Our farm primarily farmed gees. We produced lots of golden eggs and lots of little baby gees or goslings – I know what they are but I won’t refer to them again. Times were good so we didn’t pay much attention to the snake that now and then stole a golden egg or a little gosling and chowed it up every now and then –we didn’t too pay too much attention to them. The farmers were happy because they were producing and the snakes were also happy they were breeding and eating.

But sooner or later, the minimal effort of the snakes passed the hard work and efforts of the farmers and that is when the

trouble started. The principle of hard work was replaced with a principle that corruption is okay to pay off all debts and favours.

By the time the farmers realised that they lived in snake den, they couldn’t move without getting bitten by a snake. So they retreated to the cities and left the farm to the snakes.

The snakes thrived for a while, eating whatever they could find and eventually they turned on each other when there was nothing left; they started to attack each other.

The farmers got hungry in the cities longing for their farms. So they came back with big sticks and started looking for retributions. The snakes being very cleaver, however, decided to move off to greener pastures, better Arabian lands because the terrain here becomes slightly inhospitable. The farmers demanded vengeance and so some international organisations that didn’t account too correctly for and warn of the growing number of snakes on the farm, they took the fall and blame for the greed of all the snakes. All the while the King Cobra was busy

building himself a den in a far away land, far away from the maddening crowd.

Now, despite our country being unable to collect R50 billion in revenue this year, the good news is that all these geese are not dead. A few escaped to higher perches in the trees and survived but as the farmers didn’t feed their animals, through poor political decisions made over a number of years and neglect, the geese were starved. Fortunately these geese are not dead; they are just in need of hospitalisation because they are suffering from anorexia. The problem with anorexia is that you can’t have babies and lay golden eggs. Thus there are fewer profits for taxes to be collected on.

What do we do to stop feeding our gees? Our biggest gees are found in the financial, mining, industrial and agricultural sectors. We all know a little bit about the birds and the bees. The fundamental principle is that to have baby gees we need the goose to come together and play with each other. If you have a lot of goose and no ganger you are not going to have any baby gees either.

Our policies and actions have scared off international ganders and therefore we have few productive developments or foreign investments from which to grow our economy. This is not conducive for our gees to play with each other and to have little babies. Our Black Economic Empowerment, BEE, legislation as currently written makes it impossible for your goose to play with my gander. Once again, no baby gees as a result.

Our mining industry has so much red tape and middle men involved that it is easy for our goose to fly off to Canada in migration than to try and operate in South Africa.

Isaac Newton formulated the rules of gravity and no matter where you live or what your social status is, you cannot avoid the rules of gravity. Unfortunately, in South Africa, we have often found ourselves untouchable by international laws of money. No matter how many times we say that we are a rainbow nation, that this law does not apply to us, when we look again we are going to fall on our faces if we try to ignore this rule of gravity.

Rather than to allow our sick gees to be administered to by specialists, we fly in quacks to come and fix problems in our Treasury. A quack cannot just rebalance the Division of Revenue Amendment Bill; money that is meant to go for provincial and local government efforts to fund free education for instance, is not going to be found by a quack.

As a country, our economic future is dependant on us making the right principle decisions concerning how we farm our land. We are not special; we are all just gees and ganders and we all want to produce some golden eggs for our retirement and for our children’s future. Don’t mess with the principles of the birds and the bees if you want to save our economy from extinction.

Madam Speaker. [Applause.]

Mr N E GCWABAZA: Hon Speaker, hon President and hon Deputy President, hon Ministers and Deputy Ministers, hon members, ...

*IsiZulu*:

... Lesi sichibiyelo somthetho wesabelo sezimali sika 2017 siyakubalula ukuthi inani lemali ekhona kuhulumeni omkhulu

lehlile ngenxa yokuthi izinga lokuthuthuka komnotho liphansi. Kodwa uhulumeni kaKhongolose uyazinikezela ekusebenzeni ngokuzikhandla ukuze kuthuthuke izinga lomnotho, kwakhiwe imisebenzi futhi kwenziwe ngcono ukuqoqwa kwemali yentela. Noma lesi simo sezimali singesihle uhulumeni wabele ohulumeni bezifundazwe kanye nohulumeni basekhaya imali ezokwazi ukufezekisa izidingo zemiphakathi kulo lonke izwe lakithi.

Imali eyabelwe ohulumeni basekhaya yenyukile yaba ngaphezulu kwe-R112.6 miliyoni. Lesi sabelo esengeziwe sivuna abantu bakithi abangathathintweni. Siqinisekisa ukuthi kuqhubeke ukutholakala kwamanzi, ugesi, imigwaqo ehambekayo nezindawo zasekuhlaleni ezihlanzekile. Kukhona nesabelo esingyizi-

R265 miliyoni sokwakha izindlu zangasese ezinokuhlanzeka ukuze kuqedwe ukuthuthwa kwendle ngamabhakede.

Omasipala bakwaZulu-Natali banikezwe imali ecishe ifinyelele ku- R2.8 miliyoni yesibonelelo sokushinthwa kwemingcele yomasipala ngo-2016. Ukwenza umzekelo, umasipala wase-Merafong eGaunteng uzohlomula ngo-R26.1 miliyoni wokulungisa ingqalasizinda eyoniwa yizikhukhula. Kanti uMasipala wase-Butterworth eMpuma Koloni

wabelwe imali engu-R200 miliyoni yokwakha ingqalalsizinda yamanzi.

Esikugcizelelayo siwuKhongolose ukuthi omasipala mabayisebenzise ngokucophelela le mali futhi bangayixhaphazi. Kufanele futhi ukuthi kubonakale imiphumela emihle ngokuthi izidingo zabantu zibonakale zifinyelela kubona. Sithe uma sifakana imilomo nezinhlangano ezikhathalela impilo yabantu ngesikhathi sama- Pub1ic Hearings, sathola ukuthi uyasekelwa lo Mthetho Sivivinyo wokuchibiyela isabelo sezimali. Kuvelile futhi nokukhathazeka kwabantu ngesimo esiphansi sezimali kuhulumeni kanye nesomnotho jikelele.

Kodwa bayakuthakazela ukuthi uhulumeni kaKhongolose uyakuqinisekisa ukulethwa kwezidingo zabantu kakhulukazi kohulumeni basekhaya. Kanti ngaso lesi sikhathi sokufakana imilomo, uMnyango woHulumeni baseKhaya wethule uhlelo oluhle, ubambisene neminye iminyango kahulumeni omkhulu nohulumeni bezifundazwe, lokusiza omasipala abantengantengayo ukuze kuqiniswe izinhlaka zokuphatha, kuqashwe abasebenzi

abaqeqeshiwe, bese kuthuthukiswa nokuphathwa nokusetshenziswa kwezimali.

*English*:

Now, we hear from the DA that there is a takeover of the budget process. There is nothing like that. The DA, especially in the person of the hon Meynier, is notorious for saying things in public that are devoid of the truth. There is neither a takeover of the budget by the Department of Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation led by the hon Jeff Radebe nor the centralisation of the budget process to the president of the ANC.

What government has done looking at the constrained fiscal and economic environment, it has reprioritised the goals of the National Development Plan and the priorities of the medium-term Strategic Framework in order for it to be aligned to the current budget and address the current environment in the budgeting process. But there is absolutely no takeover of the budget process. What we hear is loud noises, the sound of fury without any substance or content.

*IsiZulu*:

Nina DA nabanye abangani benu abakhuluma njengani, abantu banikithi ngeke bayikholwe into eniyikhulumayo. Niyathanda ukuma la nikhulume izinto ezingekho nezingenzeki kuhulumeni.

Esikwenzayo thina ukuqinisekisa ukuthi uma isimo somnotho singesihle ezweni, nesimo sokuqoqwa kwezimali singesihle ezweni, kufanele siqinisekise njengoKhongolose ukuthi abantu bakithi bayazithola izidingo ezibafanele ngemali ekhona, ikakhulukazi amanzi, ugesi, izindlu nako konke abakudingayo.

Kunzima ukukhuluma nge-EFF ...

*English:*

... because in the first instance, you have never tabled in the committee any proposal that you now come here and claim you are tabling. What you have done is simply to absent yourselves from the committee. Otherwise, what you say is a budget proposal that has never been tabled and so you are also not speaking the truth.

So, what some of you are not aware of precisely because some of you are not attending ... [Interjections.]

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: On a point of order, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: What is your point of order?

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: I am rising on a point of order, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Yes, hon Mkhaliphi, what is the point of order?

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: The hon member in the podium he is even struggling to read his own speech ...

The SPEAKER: No, hon member, that is not a point of order.

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: ... but now he want to attack the EFF. I am sure in the committee most of the time he is sleeping when the EFF is there.

The SPEAKER: That is not a point of order, please take your seat. Please, proceed hon Gcwabaza.

Mr N E GCWABAZA: What some of you are not aware of is that this Division of Revenue Amendment Bill has actually significantly increased the allocation of funds to the provincial and local government spheres. I have indicated to you that the current proposed allocation is R112.6 billion which is going to increase to well over R140 billion in the next MTEF. So, it is not true that the allocation to these spheres of government, especially in local government is not increasing. We acknowledge that the current fiscal and economic environment does not allow bigger increases. But effectively there are significant increases which enable the spheres of government to deliver a more and better service to our people.

The resignation in the National Treasury cannot be seen as anything other than the wish of an individual employee to move to other spheres of his work. For your information, he is not lost to government; he is still employed in government except that he has moved out of the National Treasury. We can assure

you that the National Treasury has very able and skilled men and women who will continue to render good service to this country.

Regurgitating these catchy phrases like the Guptas, corruption and state capture with the loudest of voices over and over again does not make any news. It does not make you any better. What the ANC is doing on these very issues that you are talking about, the ANC is the political party that put the issue of corruption as a priority to be fought and to be defeated. It is the President, His Excellency, President Zuma, who was here recently and he expressly told you that he is going to appoint a commission of enquiry to investigate all forms of state capture and all individuals alleged to be involved in state capture.

Wait for that. [Interjections.] What for that because it is going to happen. [Interjections.]

It is not going to help you to shout these catchy phrases as if they are new and you provide nothing, no new idea altogether about what needs to be done. What the ANC is doing is to ensure that we implement radical economic transformation in order to achieve the NDP goals of inclusive growth so that we shift the

economy from the hands of 105 of the population to the hands of the majority of the population.

*IsiZulu:*

Sihlalo, sicela ukuthi le Ndlu Yesishayathemtho Kazwelonke yamukele lo mthetho Sivivinyo wesabelo sezimali futhi iwugcobe ube ngumthetho osebenzayo. Ngiyabonga. [Ihlombe.]

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF FINANCE: Hon Speaker, hon Ministers and Deputy Ministers, hon members of the House, compatriots and fellow South Africans, allow me to wish all our children who are writing examinations good luck, particularly those who are writing matric exams. We wish to say to them, they may not understand the importance of education now, but they are the future and hope of our country. Just to say to our children, when things look tough, they must remember the great words, from a great man, from a great organisation, utata uMandela when he says, “Education is the most powerful weapon which you can use to change the world”. Indeed you will use education to change our country, Africa and the world for the better. There are a lot of theories and conspiracy theories which are being flighted

which have got no basis whatsoever about the resignation of Mr Sachs. Amongst others there is a question of National Treasury’s powers being taken. As National Treasury we will first and foremost like to thank Mr Michael Sachs for the contribution to the process of deracialisation of our economy. National Treasury has 1 300 employees and professionals of which 250 are senior managers. The national budget process is a collective process driven by various divisions within National Treasury. The Public Finance Division manages the national departments’ budgets, the Intergovernmental Relations Division co-ordinates the division of revenue between provinces and municipalities.

I grew up being a soccer player, therefore a firm believer of teamwork. At National Treasury there are teams which I have no doubt will be able to continue with the work done by Mr Sachs. As we recognise work being done by individuals, let us not undermine the 1 299 men and women who remain at National Treasury to serve our people. It is important to note that the economy is not growing at the rate that we expected it to grow at the beginning of the year; hence the downward revision of growth rate from 1,3% to 0,7% in the current year. This has many

negative effects on many other economic variables including but not limited to, revenue collection, employment, the country’s ability to deliver on schools, health, etc. That is why the Minister of Finance on 25 October called on all South Africans to Letsema, to put their shoulders to the wheel so that the economy of our country can be reignited and allow it to again fire from all cylinders. The Minister cautioned about the fiscal cliff we face, like the 60% Debt to GDP in 2020-21 and 15% debt service costs also in 2020-21 if we do not, as a country, change the way we do things. The statistics which l have cited talk to the last year of Medium-Term Expenditure Framework, MTEF. Basically the statistics cited above is simply saying we can not rely on debt in meeting the needs of our people and country.

Unfortunately, some amongst us, from the opposition, hon Maynier deliberately started arguing as if we are in 2022.

*IsiZulu:*

Wafunga wagomela uNgqogqoshe Wezezimali, emi khona lapha engimi khona malungu ahloniphekile, wathi ngeke kwenzeke lokho. Washo wathi singuHulumeni kaKhongolose [ANC], sibambisene nabo bonke abantu baseNingizimu Africa, ngeke sifake leli elingafelwa

nkonyane ezikweletini. Kubalulekile ukuthi lokho sikuqondisise kahle.

*English:*

We are committed to a budget which is progressive; to a budget which is redistributive; to a budget which is alive to the heinous socioeconomic conditions which were visited to the majority of our people by successive colonial powers and apartheid government. No amount of scarecrows will deter us from this. The Minister aptly captured this point in his speech when he said, “The budget is strongly aligned with constitutional imperatives and is highly progressive”. He continued to say, “Two-thirds of spending goes to realising social rights enshrined in the Constitution”.

Our commitment to the victims of apartheid as the ANC is supported by the fact that, post school education, community development, health, basic education and social protection all grow by more than 7% in the MTEF, with post school education and training growing by 8,2% in the same period. This shows real growth. Our people are appreciative of that. Let me repeat here

and now, these commitments will be attained without recklessness; these commitments will be achieved without plunging the country into a debt we cannot afford. As we have said before, we continue saying we cannot live beyond our means. We do this not because anybody is standing on top of Drakensberg mountain, but we do it because it is the correct thing to do; some people should stop behaving like izinduna over us. Changing the lives of our people for the better is ANC DNA. That we have done and we will continue to do. The Division of Revenue Amendment Bill, 2017 before the House is a testimony to our focus to the betterment of the lives of our people. A good example is an additional R265 million which is being reprioritised into the Bucket Eradication Programme. These funds add to the R385 million already allocated for the Bucket Eradication Programme at the beginning of 2017-18 and this will move us closer to finally eradicating this undignified form of sanitation from our residential areas.

*IsiZulu:*

Malungu ahloniphekileyo, mina okungixakayo wukuthi abacindezeli bethu babelala bethini, umuntu enezindlu zangasese ezimbili,

ezintathu, kodwa indlu yomuntu ompisholo ibe ithwalana namabhakede endle. Ngake ngahlala elokishini laseSibongile e- Dundee, lapho ngabona leli chilo lenziwa abacindezeli. Iyonanto uHulumeni kaKhongolose [ANC]abhekene nayo le. Kuyaye kungixake- ke mina abantu bafike bakugubhele umgodi, bese behlekisa ngawe. Ngikhuluma ngabo ontabakayikhonjwa laba.

*English:*

The division of revenue allocates R650 billion in 2017 to provinces and municipalities. The division of revenue works as a powerful tool for redistribution. Allocations to rural provinces are also larger per capita than those to urban areas. This acknowledges that the apartheid government deliberately impoverished these areas, only using them as cheap sources of labour in urban areas. As we invite business, labour, civil society and opposition to this Letsema, I am heartened about the attitude that some of our business takes when looking at the problems that we are facing. In his address of Discovery Leadership Summit, the founder and chief executive officer, CEO, of Discovery had this to say:

South Africa is regularly framed in a negative way. We are too negative about our country. The point is, why create that binary question about success or failure?

He urges us to also focus on our successes and there he singles out the antiretroviral, ARV, programme which is the biggest in the world. It is common cause that life expectancy has increased by about six or more years because of our approach to the scourge of HIV and Aids. Adrian further argues, “Now I'm not minimising these problems. I am making the point that they are solvable”. He continues, “Because we are so focused on the negatives, we actually do not know the positives”. I am extensively quoting Adrian because he aptly summarises the attitude that we should take. Hon members, patriots and fellow countrymen the failure to pay small business and BEE companies within 30 days dampens the spirit of entrepreneurship and the ability of these companies to contribute positively to growth and economic transformation in our country. We are very clear that very soon we must make it hurt in personal pockets of those who fail to do that.

The political struggle cannot be divorced from economic struggle. Oliver Tambo catches this message brilliantly when he says:

Racial discrimination, South Africa’s economic power, its oppression and exploitation of all the black people are part and parcel of the same thing.

Therefore we cannot be persuaded to forget about our past. We cannot be persuaded to remember how we got to where we are. The very fact that we are talking about the issues of education which must be fast-tracked is because some people somewhere decided to put our country in this unenviable position. The Division of Revenue Amendment Bill 2017 is supported. I thank you. [Applause.]

Debate concluded.

Question put: That the Bill be read a second time. Division demanded.

The House divided.

Question agreed to.

Bill accordingly read a second time.

# CONSIDERATION OF REPORT OF PORTFOLIO COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION AS WELL AS PLANNING, MONITORING AND EVALUATION ON PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION AMENDMENT BILL

There was no debate.

The Chief Whip of the Majority Party moved: That the Report be adopted.

Motion agreed to.

Report accordingly adopted.

The SPEAKER: Hon members, there is going to be a debate during the second reading on the same matter. So, there is no need to

make declarations. Hon members will be able to give their inputs at the right time. [Interjections.] There is a correction from the Table that it will not be a debate, but members will be able to make declarations at that point on the same matters.

I am quite glad to take leave of you.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSSITION: Madam Speaker, for the first time in my parliamentary career I have never been more devastated to see you leave the Chair.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Enjoy the pressure.

# PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION AMENDMENT BILL

(Second Reading debate)

Mr C C MATHALE: Deputy Speaker, the lawmaking process is the key component of the work of the constitutional mandate of this august House. Nobody in society can exist without a system of laws. The institution of law is important to the social

organisation of human beings. The process of lawmaking generally requires a long period of deliberation and consideration of many interests.

People’s participation in the process is very significant in facilitating good governance. We all know that laws are not cast in stone, as they sometimes flow in and out with the tide. They sometimes need to be changed and enhanced for the public good.

The public service and administration committee received a referral to process the Public Service Commission Amendment Bill, B 25/2015, in 2015. The Bill seeks to amend the Public Service Commission Act of 1997, in order to ensure efficiency and certainty with regard to the processes of the renewal of the term of commissioners.

The Bill intends to ensure continuity and stability in the Public Service Commission, both nationally and provincially with regard to the commissioners.

The committee advertised the Bill on 4 March 2016 in national newspapers, and invited members of the public and organised groups to submit written submissions. There were no written submissions received on the Bill from members of the public and organised groups. However, the committee deliberated on the amendments of the Bill and the following were noted.

Firstly, the principle Act talks about the renewable term but does not provide the process to renew it. The recruitment process must start all over again even for the extension or the renewal of the term of an incumbent commissioner.

Secondly, the recruitment process takes place after the term of office has expired and it procedurally takes longer to fill the vacancy again. This situation, at some times, resulted in instability in the commission, more particularly in the provincial Public Service Commission where there is only one commissioner.

The committee had made amendments to the Public Service Commission Amendment Bill, which is highlighted in clause 1 and

1. of the Bill. The committee had extensively deliberate on the Bill and therefore, recommends that the House adopts the amendments to the Bill, as tabled. Thank you.

*Declarations of vote*:

*Afrikaans*:

Mev VAN DER WALT: Agb Adjunkspeaker, vandag sit ons die onaanvaarbare tradisie van minagting van ons pligte, wat deesdae ’n norm geword het in die Parlement, onbeskaamd voort.

*English:*

This very basic of piece legislation referred to as the Public Service Commission Amendment Bill has taken more than two years to be tabled and dealt with in the National Assembly. A reminder to us all, section 196 in our Constitution states that, and I quote:

The commission is independent and must be impartial and must exercise its powers and performs its functions without fear, favour or prejudice in the interest of the maintenance of effective and efficient public administration, and a high

standard of professional ethics in the public service. The commission must be regulated by national legislation.

This Bill seeks to amend the Act in order to ensure efficiency and certainty with regard to the process of renewal of term of office of a commissioner and designation of an acting chairperson for the Public Service Commission, PSC.

The provisions of the Bills seek to provide continuity in the PSC with respect to the retention of commissioners with experience and with regard to the execution of the Public Service Commission’s mandate.

In this regard, the Bill clarifies the process to be followed by the President whenever the President renews the term of office of a commissioner, as contemplated in section 196(10) of the Constitution.

It further makes provision for the designation of a commissioner to act as chairperson of the Public Service Commission whenever

both the chairperson and the deputy chairperson are absent or for any reason unable to act as a chairperson.

We call on the Minister of this department to set the example and not keep legislation not dealt with for such a long period, in the whole of government. We will support this Bill. Thank you.

Ms N V MENTE: Deputy Speaker, while the Bill before the National Assembly, the Public Service Commission Amendment Bill deals with a simple and noncontroversial matter of providing clarity on the process of renewal of the term of office for a commissioner of the Public Service Commission, and who acts in the absence of both the commissioner and CEO, the problem we have is that, if ever the ANC continues to deploy their own political preferences to the positions of such a nature, we are going to have a problem renewing the terms. And we do that at a time when the integrating, the capacity and the professionalism of the whole Public Service are in disarray.

Government spends millions every year on senior civil servants sitting, idling and not doing the job that they were employed to do because of long, unresolved and unnecessary suspensions.

Where does the PSC fit in? They do not have the teeth to do anything. We do so at a time when ...

Ms D P MANANA: Sit down.

Ms N V MENTE: Hey!

Ms D P MANANA: Sit down.

Ms N V MENTE: Hey! [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, hon members. No. Hon Manana, you are out of order.

Ms D P MANANA: Deputy Speaker, I am rising on Rule 83. A member must refrain from reading his or her speech. [Interjections.] Yes, it is in the Rule book.

*IsiXhosa*:

Nks N V MENTE: Musa ukuphapha, Dudu.

*English:*

We do so at a time when the department that is entrusted with the planning, management and oversight of the public sector itself has completely collapsed because of a corrupt and incompetent leadership and Minister.

At the end of the day, it is the service delivery that is mostly affected by the disarray and instability, making it impossible for departments to account with constant changes in leadership.

When Mr Zuma changes his Cabinet more than five times, and the subsequent changes lead to the director-generals, DGs, being changed and the Ministers choosing each and every person they feel comfortable with, where does the PSC fit in? They cannot protect the poor DGs. A recent example is the Minister of Higher Education, Prof Mkhize, who was in Home Affairs who wanted to get rid of her own director-general, Mkuseli Apleni, by providing unlawful instructions.

He and many other DGs and senior managers in the civil service broadly find themselves, time and again having to carry out corrupt and fraudulent decisions, in the best interest of corruption – a trend that has collapsed the public service.

It is for this reason that we say that in each current form, the Public Service Commission has not played any meaningful role in ensuring that the Public Service is competent, professional and able to deliver services on time. That means that with this amendment, as much as we accept it, you still need to amend the law again in order for the Public Service ...

*IsiXhosa*:

... ikwazi ukubamba abantu abenza izinto ezingalunganga, nokubamba amagosa akwizikhundla eziphezulu ahlala kumasebe bangawenzi umsebenzi wabo, kwakunye naBaphathiswa abanika imiqhathango engalunganga kubaLawuli-jikelele nakumagosa ukuze abasebenzi phantsi bakwazi ukukhuseleka.

*English*:

Minister Muthambi does not follow the very same rules that her department has set for the rest of the government. When she appoints people, she does not advertise, she does not do interviews, she does not screen. She appoints her friends and family and pays them inflated salaries and nothing happens to her.

The Minister simply does not have any regard for rules or processes. The PSC cannot do anything. So, we must empower it.

Mr M HLWENGA: Hon Deputy Speaker, I just want to say that the IFP will be supporting these amendments because we believe that they provide stability to the Public Service Commission, PSC, they provide certainty and most importantly they will enable us to know exactly who is who in the zoo after a very long time of the ambiguity in terms of the terms of office of the commissioners particularly around the chairperson and the deputy. It is important for us to recognise that the instability in the department and in the Ministry has been a cause for concern. However, whilst we will amend the type of instability which has played itself out in the department, it is equally

important for us as Parliament to reflect on our own instability here which has caused problems for us finalising this particular piece of legislation of a such lengthy period of time when actually it was not necessary.

Here I refer to the fact that when the chairperson of the portfolio committee changed hon Mabe to the hon Dr Khoza, there was a vacuum, and then there was a vacuum when Dr Khoza left to the now new Chairperson, hon Mathale. Therefore, whilst we speak about the instability in the executive, Parliament must be able to shield and protect itself from internal instability and the fact that we must not have a new broom sweeping and cleaning even things that are working. I think that the processes that were already in place should have been seen through.

The effectiveness of the PSC, of course, liaise the support which it will receive from Parliament and the co-operation which will receive from the executive. It is important to ensure that there is compliance in order for that to be meaningful oversight and meaningful accountability of all those whom find themselves having to face off with the PSC. We believe that greater

capacity must be given to the Public Service Commission not to enable to be effective efficient in the execution of its constitutional mandate and for it to be an integral part of the tax and balances of Public Service.

We believe that more resources must be given to the PSC and that generally, they just need to be some sort of education reaching out to the public servants in particular and the politicians when position of authority to actually co-operate with the PSC. The biggest frustration is that the PSC is not being taken seriously and they have time and time again provided work which is to the benefit of progress and to the benefit of the country. The reports are gathering dust and it is report which should be using to maximise the effectiveness and the efficiency of the Public Service. In supporting these amendments, we still do believe that there’s still need to be more work to be done to strengthen the capabilities of the PSC. I thank you.

Mr S C MNCWABE: Hon Deputy Speaker, the Public Service Commission has a very important task to investigate, monitor and evaluate the organisation and administration of the Public

Service. It also has the mandate to ensure efficient and effective performance within the Public Service and to promote the values of transparent and accountable public administration as set out in our Constitution. Commissioners serve for a term of five years and whereas it makes organisational sense to infuse the commission with new blood periodically, it cannot be denied that the commission also stands to lose skills and experience when the term of office for the commissioners end.

The retention of skills accumulated within the executive of the commission is very important and to this effect provision is made in the Act for the renewal of the term of office of commissioners subject to specified limitations. We will come both amendments reported here today; it is a hallmark of effective legislation that it be free of contradictions, vagueness and inconsistency and does not give rise to uncertainty. It is within this context which we approach the report on the proposed amendments. The first issue to be addressed is the uncertainty created by providing for the renewal of term of an existing commissioner, but no process is providing to give effect such a renewal. It is clear that the

process for renewal should not follow the cumbersome process for appointment.

By amending the process to renew term of a commissioner, the existing process which only provides for reappointment is circumvented an effective and given to the provisions for renewal. We believe that the amendments in its current form will remove any vagueness and potential for inconsistency in the process of renewal of a term of a commissioner.

The second amendment addresses an accrual in the organisational and operational structure of the commission. The paralysis which could set in when both the chairperson and the deputy chair is absent was not forcing the Public Service Commission Act. The NFP welcomes the provision containing amendment to avoid such an organisational paralysis from arising. We support the adoption of the report. Thank you.

Ms D CARTER: Hon Deputy Speaker, Chapter 10 of our Constitution provides for the establishment of the Public Service which must function and be structured in terms of national legislation and

which must loyally execute the lawful policies of government of a day. Our Constitution provides further that our public administration must be governed by the democratic values and principles enshrined in our Constitution including the need for a high standard of professional ethic, the efficient economic and effective use of resources that service must be provided impartially, fairly, equitable and without bias and the need to ensure accountability.

Clearly, there is much work to be done in this regard. The Constitution provides for the creation of an independent an impartial Public Service Commission accountable to the National Assembly and whose powers and functions are set out in our Constitution. The Public Service Commission Act regulates the procedure for the appointment of commissioners to the commission. The Congress of the People supports the amendments proposed to the Public Service Commission Act as set out in the Public Service Commission Amendment Bill as amended by the portfolio committee. Thank you.

*IsiZulu*:

Nk R M M LESOMA: Ngiyabonga Sekela Somlomo, sifisa singuKhongolose ukuthi siyawesekela lo mchibiyelo we-Public Service commission Ammendment Bill. Siqale ngokuthi phephisa lungu elihloniphekile Muthambi ngengozi ekwehlele namhlanje sivuka ekuseni nokuthi abakithi noNkulunkulu bakugcinile nabakubhekele. Siphinde sidlulise okuncane ukuthi kuyekuhluphe nxa ungakwazi noma ungalitholi ithuba lokuthi uze emhlanganweni ngoba uyaye usho izinto ikomidi elibhekene nazo. Mangibalulile nje ...

*English*:

... first of all the issues of turnaround of senior management is the issues that the committee has delegated and mandated and instructed the Minister to deal with. Secondly, the fast tracking of disciplinary processes as well and their negative impact on service delivery are the issues one of the things to do by the Minister. However, having said that it will help to say that you must be factual when you make allegations, other than that I would like to say, as the ANC further more as we articulated in our strategy and tactics, that we are committed to lead with the efforts to overcome the challenges of poverty,

unemployment and inequality as guided by the strategy and tactics of our glorious movement and remains vigilant that to achieve that there is a need to deepen the national democratic revolution and accelerate the service delivery and development through a capable and developmental state. The strategy and tactic further emphasise the need for development of human resources that underpins the capacity to be able to develop and implement broad objectives in the policy and programmes. This should be depend ... [Interjections.]

Mr M N PAULSEN: Hon Deputy Speaker, I just want to ask the hon member where Makhosi Khoza is because I used to be very good friends.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Take your seat, hon member. Are you prepared to answer that question, hon member?

Ms R M M LESOMA: After I’ve done with my important business, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Go ahead, hon member.

Ms R M M LESOMA: ... implement and broaden objectives of this policy and programme, this should be depend on the ANC government desire and ability to create a competent Public Service through, among other, proper training orientation and leadership of the Public Service and acquiring and retaining skills, hence the amendments is before the House. The ANC supports the Amendment Bill as presented by the chairperson. Thank you.

Question put.

Agreed to.

Bill read a second time.

# LEGAL PRACTICE AMENDMENT BILL

(Second Reading Debate)

Dr M S MOTSHEKGA: Hon Deputy Speaker, the Bill amends the Legal Practice Act of 2014 to address a number of practical and

technical issues, to ensure a smooth transition to the new dispensation as provided for in the Act. The Legal Practice Act of 2014 was passed to address a range of challenges to do with the legal profession, in particular, the need for transformation to ensure a profession that broadly reflects the diversity and demographics of the Republic under a single regulatory body.

The Act provides for the establishment of a single unified regulatory body, the SA Legal Practice Council, for the legal profession of both attorneys and advocates. In order to lay the foundation for the new dispensation, the Act provides for the establishment of a transitional body, the National Forum on the Legal Profession which has a limited lifespan in which to carry our specific tasks.

At present, only parts 1 and 2 of Chapter 10 of the Legal Practice Act are in operation. They came into operation on 1 February 2015. These parts deal with the establishment and mandate of the National Forum on the Legal Profession. However, Chapter 2 of the Act comes into operation three years after the

date of commencement of Chapter 10, or any earlier date fixed by the President by proclamation in the Gazette.

Chapter 2 addresses the establishment of the SA Legal Practice Council. As 10 Chapter 10 of the Act commenced on 1 February 2015, Chapter 2 will come into operation on 1 February 2018. The Legal Practice Act of 2014 provided that the National Forum on the Legal Profession was to have 24 months to make recommendations to the Minister on matters that include, among others: An election procedure for the council; the establishment of the provincial councils; their areas of jurisdiction; composition; powers and functions; manner of election; practical vocational requirements for candidate attorneys and pupils; and the right of appearance of candidate legal practitioners.

The National Forum on the Legal Profession is also tasked with preparing and publishing a code of conduct for all legal practitioners, both attorneys and advocates, and must make rules for various matters. However, as the National Forum on the Legal Profession was unable to finish its work within the 24 months, 1 February 2017, the Minister has extended its lifespan further.

The Legal Practice Amendment Bill was referred to the committee on 26 April 2017.

The Bill seeks to regulate further: The prescription of the areas of jurisdiction or provincial councils; the duration of the National Forum on the Legal Profession and its functions; the dissolution date of the Law Societies that only practicing legal practitioners may perform certain acts or render certain services. The committee was briefed on its contents on 10 April 2017.

Following this, the Bill was advertised countrywide for public comment. Certain submissions addressed aspects of the Legal Practice Act of 2014 that do not form part of the Bill as introduced. Although the committee was largely sympathetic to include amendments that address the aspects now, it will considerably delay the passage of the Bill.

The committee felt it necessary desirable for now to prioritise a smooth seamless transition to the Legal Practise Council.

However, the committee has asked the department to propose a

further amending Bill to address the submission that identified as falling outside of the ambit of the Bill as introduced.

There are other amendments that have been made which I do not need to go into, but it safe to say that we are proposing the extension of the term of office of the National Forum on the Legal Profession to 31 October 2018, to enable the forum to complete this work. We hope that this hon House will agree with us. We thank you.

*Declarations of vote*:

Adv G BREYTENBACH: Hon Deputy Speaker, the bill aims to amend the Legal Practice Act of 2014, in order: To deal further with the area of the jurisdiction of the provincial councils; to ensure that only practicing legal practitioners may perform specific acts and render specified services; to regulate the duties of banks with regard to trust accounts; regulate the further duration of the National Forum on the Legal Profession on the Legal Profession; to provide for the functions of the National Forum on the Legal Profession; and also to provide for the dissolution date of the law societies.

In short, the Bill will ensure a smooth transition from the current dispensation to the proposed Legal Practice Council. When the late Dene Smuts stood at this podium and opposed the Legal Practice Act, her final words on the matter were, “You are legislating for failure; and we oppose.”

This opposition was based on the fact that the ANC in the committee had rejected each and every proposal then made by the opposition parties. The ANC was determined to force advocates and attorneys into one governing body, putting attorneys in charge. This was done due to ANC infatuation with the concept of fusion as the facilitator of transformation.

The truth however is that significant progress has been made in transforming the legal professions. From as long ago as 2005, black law graduates had outnumbered white graduates. Since 2009 black articled clerks had outnumbered white clerks. Black professional bodies have long been integrated with the General Council of the Bar of South Africa and the Law Society of South Africa.

It was our view then, and it is our view now, that South Africa needs a divided profession. An advocate practicing on the traditional independent basis has always and always will continue to take on politically or socially unpopular cases.

This is as much, if not more, a necessity now than it was in the old South Africa.

Just as the advocates practicing independently took up the course against an unjust and unjustifiable regime pre-1994 to defend those targeted for political aims, so independent advocates today do the same. There are several examples of this and no doubt there will be more to come.

For instance: If the threatened and unfounded action is taken against the author of the *President’s Keepers* for pointing out that President Zuma moonlighted for a security company for months after he took the highest office; or that President Zuma failed to submit his tax returns for year and eventually had his tax liability settled by someone else; or if Pauw is arrested and prosecuted for pointing out that the State Security Agency and the Crime Intelligence Unit of the police have been looted

by officers - many with criminal records and no other qualifications to speak of - who do nothing but protect the President from his political enemies; then no doubt we should all be grateful for an independent advocate’s profession, beefed by an independent attorneys profession, to defend the constitutional rights of Pauw and the constitutional interests of all South Africans.

The quality of advocacy has a direct effect on the quality of judgements handed down by the bench, and so we all have a very real interest in the survival of the independent advocate’s profession. Attorneys more specifically, the smaller firms – this makes up about 75% of South African law firms – should be the frontline of access to justice for South Africans.

A divided professional will ensure that the interests of these, the backbone of the attorney’s profession, are protected. It ensures that even small firms can tackle large and complex matters precisely because they can call on the expert services of an independent advocate’s profession. It will ensure that

small attorneys can make a living while serving all South Africans well.

The idea of fusing the professions has now been abandoned. The submissions about the late Dene Smuts were not made in vein. The National Forum on the Legal Profession has concluded a forum memorandum of understanding with the Minister of Justice, in terms of which the National Forum on the Legal Profession will oversee a democratic election of the first members of the first Legal Practice Council.

The Minister will only make use of his executive powers to appoint members of the council if they hear the elections of the council members are not held. Mr Minister, you can be sure that we are watching this process very carefully. That being said, the DA supports this Bill. I thank you. [Applause.]

Mr T E MULAUDZI: Deputy Speaker, Firstly, the EFF support the effort to transform the legal profession as to allow more black lawyers the opportunity to apply their skills in an environment that does not discriminate them because of their colour. The

desire to transform the legal profession does not absolve the state from playing its part.

To date, briefing pattern by the state when litigation shows no sense of urgency to give more work to black lawyers. We see the same old faces regularly. We submit that it must be legislated that the state must procure most of the legal services from the black lawyers.

Secondly, the Bill yet again, failed to deal with exorbitant price of legal services, which make the constitutional guarantee of everyone’s right to quality legal representative a pipe- dream. Thousands of black youths are languishing in jails because they do not have the money to pay for quality legal services. The Bill missed an opportunity to legislatively regulate the pricing of legal services to put a cap on the amount lawyers can charge people.

It should be the duty of the state to intervene and ensure that everyone has access to quality legal representative at a rate affordable to most of our people.

Thirdly, the Bill also missed an opportunity to make entry to the legal profession more tenable for law graduates. Candidate attorneys are poorly remunerated and made to work under conditions for servitude.

The Bill should have regulated the remuneration of candidate attorneys and put more legislative control on the treatment of candidate attorneys by law firms. The same goes to the populace. People are presently not remunerated. This makes it difficult for law graduates to focus on applying themselves to their professional development. The Bill could have made it mandatory for the people to be remunerated and to regulate the nature of appearance in courts and it does to the candidate attorneys.

One question the Bill has not yet dealt with, which was raised quiet very well during the public hearing is the desirability of the continued fragmentation of the legal profession. Attorneys are being progressively allowed to perform duties traditionally associated with advocates. These, while progressive, may have detrimental effect on the advocates in the end, which will have

their territory minimised as many attorneys do things traditionally associated with the advocates.

This House must honestly engage with the desirability of the separation of this profession. The Bill could have addressed the issue we have raised more strongly. We, unfortunately, cannot support it in its present moment. Thank you.

Mr E M BUTHELEZI: Deputy Chairperson, this Bill seeks to address the matters of both practical and technical application in furtherance of addressing the current challenges impacting our legal system in present day South Africa. Access to legal services, transformation and accountability of the profession are issues arising that must be addressed.

To deal with these, the principal Act prescribe a legislative framework for the transformation of the legal profession, the establishment of a single SA Legal Practice Council and provincial council, the admission enrolment of legal practitioner, the regulation of professional conduct, Legal Service Ombud, Fidelity Fund and establishment of a national

forum for the profession - the national forum being a transitional entity laying the foundation for the coming into operation of the SA Legal Practice Council.

Hon Deputy Speaker, while noticeable progress has been made with transformation of the profession, a great deal of works still remains to be done. The system remains a male dominated environment with men still occupying most of the top positions in our Supreme Court of Appeal as well as our apex legal firm.

The IFP supports the Bill while calling for continuity impetus and interventions in creating an equal opportunity for both men and women to find and gain full employment in the profession.

The IFP support that Bill. Thank you very much. [Applause.]

Mr S C MNCWABE: Deputy Speaker, the Legal Practice Amendment Bill, it serves to find through the Legal Practice Act of 2014, which regulate the legal profession in this country. The principle objective of the Bill is to address practical and technical issues of a non-contentious nature. This includes

transition provision of the Act in respect of limitation of the Act.

The Bill, will amongst other things, amend the implementation time frames in the Act, which will allow the four statutory law societies to continue to regulate attorneys profession for a six month period while the Legal Practice Council comes into operation but without jurisdiction. This will allow for a proper and orderly handover and the NFP will welcome such provisions.

We will also come to the clarity on the role and function of the national forum of the legal profession.

Deputy Speaker, our legal profession is in transition and the NFP believes that this transition is not only desired but is also necessary.

The time has come for the legal profession to move out from the shadows of apartheid when it was co-opted and abused to enforce a crime against humanity. The Legal Practice Act of 2014 is giving our legal profession a new lease of life and as such, as the NFP, we believe that every effort must be made to ensure the

emergency of a legal profession that will be reflective of the people of South Africa, a profession that will embrace transparency and accountability, and above all a profession that will stand in the service of our people.

To conclude, Deputy Speaker, we are of the opinion that adopting the proposed amendment contained in the Bill will assist in the process of the transformation of the legal profession.

Accordingly, the NFP support the approval of this Bill. Thank you.

Mr S M JAFTA: Deputy Speaker, the Bill on transformation of the legal profession to be sure reignites the prolonged debate on institutional reform in the legal profession. In July 2011, the access to justice conference raised a conciliation of structural and institutional challenges in the profession, including that of excess to justice.

The Legal Practice Bill is transformative in nature, in that, it changes the landscape of legal cost structure and introduces provincial councils and legal ombudsman. The established

councils will have to carry the burner of gender parity pursuing training and up killing of rural young women. There can be no denying that some elements of the Bill are a function of legal costs that punitively runs on the plight of the poor.

We cannot help but commend the appreciation of our vast society towards the poor by Parliament. Hon members, the established provincial councils replace the SA law society councils. The jurisdiction of the new council applies only to legal practitioners and candidate legal practitioners. We pin our hopes on the national forum to fully prepare the established counsels. Hon Deputy Speaker, the pro bono provisions of the Bill are highly noble legal practitioners like the doctors and nurses, have to render voluntarily communal service.

Legal practitioners are function of society and should also as a result give back to their very advices.

Hon Deputy Speaker, there is a semblance on care for the general public outlined in the Bill, for instance, only practising legal practitioners may render legal service on a cost basis. This is

to insulate the general public against unscrupulous predatory legal practitioners not registered with the counsel.

Hon members, the Legal Practice Bill is progressive. In the past, only advocates could appear before the Superior Courts. The Bill allows legal practitioners who have the right of appearance to litigate and appear before the High court, the Supreme Court and the Constitutional Court under certain requirements.

We commend this progressive realisation. The AIC supports the Bill. I thank you. [Time expired.]

Mr M S A MAILA: Hon Deputy Speaker and hon members, the ANC rises in support of the Legal Practice Amendment Bill. The ANC promotes the values of human rights, justice, human dignity and equality. These were amongst the issues which were at the heart of our liberation struggle and a negotiated settlement.

The challenge of race, class, gender discrimination as well as privilege, have been an obstruction in access to justice and

legal services. A legal system must reflect justice and be value centred.

The rationale of the ANC-led government’s commitment to the construction of a united, non-racial, non-sexist state was to create a society based on social justice and the rule of law, in which all citizens enjoy the fundamental right to freedom, equality and justice for all.

Transformation of the legal profession is an important condition for the establishment of a society based on social justice, human rights and the rule of law. The Legal Practice Act is a reflection of the ANC’s commitment to the transformation of the legal profession and the judiciary. The Act establish the national forum which is the transitional body ushering in transformation.

We are making a proposal that the life of the forum be extended in principle to 31 October 2018. The primary aim of the Bill is to address the technical and practical issues of noncontentious nature in respect of the implementation of the Act.

The Bill will usher in the much sought transformation within the legal profession and judiciary. It seeks to unify the fragmented profession. The Bill promises greater access to justice as the public will no longer have to pay for both the attorney and the advocate.

The Bill act in public interest and is in line with the transformation agenda of the ANC. It is interesting, Deputy Speaker, to note what the DA means when they talk of transformation.

Hon Breytenbach, comes here and says ... [Interjections.] I know that you are supporting the Bill. She comes here and says that as a show that there is transformation ... She gauges transformation by the number of clerks, who have been absorbed in the profession, which shows the backwardness of this party which we are leading towards transformation. However, we still appreciate the fact that you have seen the light that now you are able to support this Bill. Deputy Speaker, the ANC support the Bill. Thank you very much.

Question put.

Agreed to (EFF dissenting).

Bill read a second time.

# CONSIDERATION OF BUDGETARY REVIEW AND RECOMMENDATION REPORT OF PORTFOLIO COMMITTEE ON TRADE AND INDUSTRY

There was no debate.

The Chief Whip of the Majority Party moved: That the Report be adopted.

*Declaration(s) of vote*:

Mr D W MACPHERSON: Deputy Speaker, the Budgetary Review and Recommendation Report, BRRR, this year tabled before the Portfolio Committee on Trade and Industry is 59 pages of self- congratulations, confusion and hand-wringing. It mildly addresses some of the very serious issues that face our country and our economy. One of those issues being the National

Regulator for Compulsory Standards, NRCS. However, they have continued to fail to implement their risk-based management programme which was supposed to increase access to markets for South African retailers but in fact it continues to slow down that very process. The BRRR misses some of the big issues that face this country like mainly the meltdown in the manufacturing sector which has been overseen by the ANC government. Policy uncertainty which continues to sow confusion and unhappiness around investors and of course the drying up of incentives simply because there is no more money left in the pot. And at the middle of this is the state-owned enterprises’, SOEs, unwillingness to buy locally-made products, giving the middle finger to South African manufacturing at every opportunity. And the World Bank report is scathing in South Africa’s inability to turn itself around and I read from its executive summary wherein it says:

Apart from a drop in global commodity prices, domestic factors such as drought, electricity shortages, logistical constraints and difficult labour relations have contributed to South Africa’s poor growth performance in recent years. Although

authorities are working to address some of these factors, South Africa today is much less productive then before the financial crisis. With the same amount of economic resources - natural resources, capital and labour - South African produced 6% less in 2016 then in 2007.

How damning. And the problem of course is the lack of political leadership and political will. We now have a Minister who has thrown in the towel. He has given up. He sits on his hands and he does not in fact fight for the very people that need his help, that being the South African manufacturing sector. It has only been the committee at my insistence and the support of my colleagues that we now have an inquiry into the failure of localisation, and the ANC can try to spin that in any which way they want. What we desperately needed is a report and a budget that kicks him and the department into gear and out of slumber. We simply can not continue to be an obstacle to growth. We need to be an inspiration for growth. I thank you. [Applause.]

Mr M N PAULSEN: Hon Deputy Speaker, in the previous BRRR the EFF made concrete proposals to the committee and to Parliament. One

of the proposals we made was to review the decision to separate functions between the Department of Economic Development and the Department of Trade and Industry and our view is that it is now the arrangement that has rendered the industrialisation policy redundant. We have in the past made a recommendation that the Industrial Development Corporation, IDC, as a key, central implementation institution of industrial policy should have remained with the DTI. We have also made submissions to the committee and even wrote to the Minister to make recommendations on how government should go about protecting the poultry industry. One of key concrete proposals we made was for government to issue a National Treasury instruction to say that all service providers who are suppliers of food for hospitals, prisons, training facilities, meetings and everywhere else where there is catering must source the chicken from local farmers. We have in the past made a submission on the importance of local beneficiation of mineral resources ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Take your seat hon member.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF HIGHER EDUCATION: Deputy Speaker, on a point of order: Will the hon member take a question? Where is hon Sipho Mbatha, he was always with him. Where is Sipho Mbatha?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Wait! Wait! Hon member, wait, wait, wait. [Interjections.] You cannot ask the question you are asking. Hon member, proceed. Order! Order hon members! Order!

Ms H O MKALIPI: Deputy Speaker, on a point of order: I am sorry to disturb my member in the podium. I want to ask the Deputy Minister ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member!

Ms H O MKALIPI: ... where is Manana?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Mkalipi!

Ms H O MKALIPI: You took Manana’s job.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Mkalipi!

Ms H O MKALIPI: Where is Manana the woman beater?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Go ahead hon member, do not allow your members to disrupt your speech.

Mr N M PAULSEN: ... One of the key components in the current industrial policy but without the Mineral and Petroleum Development Amendment Bill that was introduced in 2013, it has not been enacted. What is clear even if were to review and recommendations to rubberstamp, even the most progressive and concrete proposals that are made, the ANC has no capacity ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: What is the order about hon member?

Mr M N PAULSEN: ... to lead such an industrial-scale transformation ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Paulsen!

Mr M N PAULSEN: ... to change the economic structure, a fact which renders the majority of these reports useless. Thank you very much Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Paulsen, no, hon Paulsen, take your seat.

Mr M N PAULSEN: I am done now.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We have to do that. What are you rising on hon member?

Mr G S RADEBE: Hon Deputy Speaker, on a point of order: I wanted to ask hon Paulsen, where is hon Mokause.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, hon member you are out of order man. [Interjections.]

Mr M N PAULSEN: Can I answer him? I do not know but I have some diet advice for you. I have some diet advice for you and I can recommend a good gym. You are looking terrible. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Esterhuizen, IFP? What is the point of order now?

Ms M S KHAWULA: Deputy Speaker, on a point of order:

*IsiZulu:*

Yazi sengiyasaba njengoba ngihlezi lana. Umhlonishwa [Honourable] uZulu laphaya usho ukusishaya manjena, ngicela axolise futhi [and] usongela u-DSG wethu.

ILUNGU ELIHLONIPHEKILE: Hayi! Hayi! Hayi!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member,

*IsiZulu:*

... kuxoliswani manje ma?

Nk M S KHAWULA: Usabisa u-DSG wethu usho ukuthi uzomshaya, nathi sesiyesaba manje, umhlonishwa uZulu, futhi siyamesaba ngempela manje yazi. Asisaphephile [safe] kwathina lana.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No! No! Hon Minister Zulu! Hayi! [No] Hon member please take your seat. Hon Minister, did you say that? [Interjections.]

HON MEMBERS: No!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order hon members! Do not answer for the Minister.

*IsiZulu:*

UNGQONGQOSHE WEZOKUTHUTHUKISWA KWAMABHIZINISI AMANCANE: Angazi

nokuthi ngitheni Sekela Somlomo [Deputy Speaker] ngoba [because] angazi nokuthi ukhuluma ngani nje nkosi yami. Amagwala angiwazi afunani la.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hayi! [No] Hon Minister, please do not do that to members. You should not be using language like that. You cannot describe members as that. You know you should not. No!

Hon member, please just withdraw referring to members ... [Interjections.]

Ms M O MOKAUSE: She must withdraw.

The MINISTER OF SMALL BUSINESS DEVELOPMENT (Ms L D Zulu): Okay,

I withdraw but ...

*IsiZulu:*

... kodwa uyangisukela, angishongo lutho mina.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay, take your seat hon members, please. Thank you very much. Hon members, let us proceed. Go ahead hon member.

Mr J A ESTERHUIZEN: Chair, from the outset, the IFP supported this Budget Vote but would like to raise the following concerns. Trade and industry in South Africa requires more carrot and less stick. Regulations for regulations are not only counter- productive, but also complicate the trade environment and deter foreign investment.

Although the incentive development programme accounts for the largest share of the Department of Trade and Industry’s budget,

we need more direct and intensive incentives to commit the private sector into supporting local manufacturing. Further regulation of the steel industry won’t work either. There are always unintended and unforeseen consequences. The custom duty introduced a year ago already serves as a slow poison, killing downstream industries in this sector.

Through special economic zones and other measures, government desperately wants to create new jobs, but these intentions are crippled by policies and practices that were designed to achieve political ends. Unless such practices are comprehensively dealt with, we won’t see any meaningful shift in the unemployment rate.

The DTI must now realise that welfare policies only affect the selected and elite few, and do not positively promote economic growth or job creation.

In conclusion, I believe that this committee and its chairperson are honest in their endeavours in wanting to create a genuinely viable and internationally competitive industrial basis for

South Africa. The Department of Trade and Industry must assist this process and must provide short-term incentives subject to review and penalty clauses. The IFP supports this Bill.

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Deputy Speaker, the NFP welcomes the Budgetary Review and Recommendation Report of the DTI tabled here today. [Interjections.]

You can’t be. Of course you can’t be!

The NFP welcomes the department’s focus on attracting investment to grow the economy in the process of creating jobs. [Interjections.] We welcome the performance of the Investment South African Programme that exceeded its targets in investments and exports.

We welcome the DTI’s unqualified audit in ensuring that creditors are paid within 30 days. [Interjections.] What is not clear, however, is the output of the performance compared to the expenditure itself. The NFP welcomes the recommendations of the

committee calling on the Minister to ensure the process of job creation and industrialisation is accelerated.

Am HON MEMBER: You’ve never been to a meeting!

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Now, one of the concerns in terms of job creation for the NFP is ... [Interjections.]

I must agree, my colleagues on this side here don’t want the jobs to be created because then they have something to grandstand about. They don’t want the economy to thrive so that they have something to cry about. [Interjections.] Remember, the DA only gains prominence because of what they identify on other political parties. But, if you look at the people in the Western Cape ... the way the people in the Western Cape are treated ... the way the housing situation ... the socioeconomic conditions

... the corruption in the Western Cape ... Nobody wants to talk about that. It’s a serious problem.

So, corruption thrives among the DA, but they know how to suppress it. They know how to manipulate the system.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Deputy Speaker ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Shaik Emam, please take your seat. Yes, hon member?

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Deputy Speaker, the Rules are very clear that you can’t impute improper motives to Members of Parliament. If we are going to get into that type of slanging match, maybe he should explain why four-and-a- half thousand rand of an employee that he fired and took his job from, was missing from his account! [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member ... Hon Shaik Emam, you made reference to a political party. I am going to look at the remarks that you’ve just made, because I think you might be on thin ice.

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Deputy Speaker, when some ... That is the NFP. When somebody is corrupt, we fire them. We don’t keep them like the DA. We get rid of them. That is exactly what we do. So what we did is in the interest of every taxpayer. Ask them to

account for the R60 million. They don’t even have a proper constituency office.

The NFP supports the Bill tabled here today. [Time expired.]

Ms J L FUBBS: Good afternoon, Deputy Speaker, fellow South Africans and members of this House.

Well, let me tell you, we congratulate the Minister of Trade and Industry and the department. They are actually generating the investment which the World Bank-entitled South African Economic Update released in January 2017 acknowledged would not have been possible without the South African government’s support that it is providing through incentives.

Now these incentives are of such a nature that they are growing jobs at the same time. Let’s have a look at this. The broadening participation programme... There you’ve got the black industrialist programme and the support provided to 36 black industrialists, investment projects of R3,1 billion and the

country creating ... how many jobs? Nearly four thousand –

1. 979. At the same time retaining ... keeping 3 837.

This has been a great uptake of the department’s incentive.

Then there’s the manufacturing and investment programme, among others, and the automotive one. And if you look at that, particularly the Manufacturing Competitiveness Enhancement Programme, MCEP, that we’ve got here ... the MCEP is really ... it’s done so well. We have one request. That is, please, we need to allocate more funds here.

But let’s look at the investment. The investment – Trade Investment Africa – has actually done so much better than we even expected it to do. It has attracted R58,6 billion largely from infrastructure and manufacturing projects.

The ANC totally supports the performance of the DTI led by a very competent Minister who is incredibly dynamic. Thank you.

Question put: That the Report be adopted.

Motion agreed to (Democratic Alliance, Economic Freedom Fighters and Congress of the People dissenting).

Report accordingly adopted.

# CONSIDERATION OF BUDGETARY REVIEW AND RECOMMENDATION REPORT OF PORTFOLIO COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC WORKS

There was no debate.

The Chief Whip of the Majority Party moved: That the Report be adopted.

*Declarations of vote*:

Dr M J FIGG: Deputy Speaker, the department received a budget of R6,5 billion for the 2016-17 financial year with which to accomplish the established policy priorities, but failed dismally.

In its annual performance plan, the department reported on 32 targets. Only 19 were achieved – which is 59% – while 13 were not.

The expenditure, however, revealed a different picture, as the rate of expenditure was 98%. This means that the Department of Public Works did not use R109 million of its allocated budget. The underspending was mostly on goods and services, and compensation of employees.

While the main Vote received an unqualified audit opinion, there are, however, areas of concern, which include the following: material misstatements, unreliable information, financial statements not prepared in accordance with prescribed standards, and potential fraud and financial misconduct.

The annual financial statements of the Property Management and Trading Entity, PMTE, showed signs of regression. In 2015-16 it received a qualified opinion, while in the 2016-17 financial year, the auditor-general expressed an adverse audit opinion on the PMTE’s annual financial statements. This was after the

entity was given an opportunity to correct errors and omissions in the financial statement it submitted on 7 July 2017. The main issues that caused the regression were: incorrect valuation of assets, the fact that entity still uses Excel, inadequate systems to maintain its records, no supporting documentation to prove accounts receivable, and no systems to record and manage maintenance of funds.

The Independent Development Trust, IDT, was established in 1990 with an initial endowment of R2 billion. Some of its responsibilities include project management of schools, clinics, magistrates’ courts, and Expanded Public Works Programme, EPWP. In spite of its important role, the entity is running at a financial loss and received an adverse opinion for the past two financial years.

The IDT continues to be rewarded for its mismanagement of funds, non-delivery on predetermined objectives and poor governance.

Additional funding has again been approved. Thank you. [Time expired.]

Mr M L W FILTANE: Deputy Speaker, the reported underexpenditure of R109 million makes a mockery of this department’s claims of being serious in its approach to serving the needs of the poor under the Zuma administration.

The midnight Cabinet reshuffle at the end of the 2016-17 financial year – which resulted in the replacement of the old Minister with another – has yet to bear any fruit. The Minister has been to the portfolio committee only twice, if not once. The new vision of the Minister brings nothing new to the people of South Africa. This department just needs to implement.

Government buildings throughout the country are crumbling. Even the Auditor-General has pointed out, and correctly so, that this department fails at its most basic functions, which is to maintain government property.

Contracting processes, both for maintenance work as well as new structures, are hardly reflective of the much-spoken-about transformation. As evidence of this, building contractors in the Eastern Cape have started blockading construction projects

there, in protest against being effectively sidelined by this department. Work gets allocated to builders from other provinces.

Risk management is at its poorest. Poor record-keeping by the IDT as well as nonpayment by beneficiary departments for its services have virtually run this institution into the ground insofar as cash flow is concerned. When government departments fail to pay the IDT, it, in turn, fails to pay contractors.

Their businesses collapse and their families suffer. All of this under the Zuma administration ...

The work of the Construction Industry Development Board, CIDB, is not producing any meaningful upgrading of black contractors. Instead, CIDB carries an irregular expenditure of over

R1,4 million.

While we support this report, we do not support the dubious nature in which this department conducts its business because it negatively affects poor citizens in all aspects. This is a

department in dire straits. Do something about it, or else move aside.

Ms S S THEMBEKWAYO: Deputy Speaker, the Department of Public Works should be building the internal capacity of the state to construct and maintain infrastructure such as roads, railways and dams, and basic services like schools, hospitals and recreational facilities. Furthermore, they should be creating jobs and securing sustainable development while doing away with the corrupt tender system.

Instead the Department of Public Works is symbolic of ANC rule, as it is defined by corruption, mismanagement, incompetence and a failure to deliver services. This is a department which, until recently, registered hundreds of thousands of government assets on Excel, despite a key mandate of the department being asset management for and on behalf of the state. This is a department that paid for a financial management system with taxpayers’ money but still does not use it, making it hard for the Auditor- General to audit the finances of the department.

The EPWP is currently giving money to ghost employees. Instead of building state capacity, the department has been turned into a purse for the ANC. We cannot give funds to support any of this. That is why we reject this report. Thank you.

Mr K P SITHOLE: Deputy Speaker, the IFP supports this Budgetary Review and Recommendation Report subject to the following observations.

Out of the 32 targeted programmes, the department only managed to achieve 19. Thirteen failures to achieve target is clear evidence of a ... [Inaudible.] ... seven-year turnaround strategy as well as a lack of strategy and poor planning.

Nkandlagate – which is now resurfacing because of ... [Inaudible.] ... suspended officials during former Minister Thulas Nxesi and former director-general, Mziwonke Dlabantu, has now been given a senior position as acting director-general heading up the PMTE which means that there is no leadership stability again in the department.

The employment of workers through the Expanded Public Works Programme and Community Work Programme, CWP, using ANC membership as the only criterion for employment remains rife in Wards such as Ward 52 in Thokoza, Ward 61 in Zonkizizwe, Ward

105 in Sokolumi, Ward 33 in Soshanguve, and Ward 12 in Winterveld.

Underspending in this department and the PMTE to the tune of R109 million shows that there is little or no accounting and leadership in the department.

Access facilities for people with disabilities are still sadly lacking in many of our buildings maintained by Public Works.

This backsliding by the department must be arrested. Urgent interventions are necessary and the IFP will be keeping a close watch on all developments over the next period. I thank you.

Mr M L SHELEMBE: Deputy Speaker, hon members, the department and its entities are responsible for translating government’s built

environment and construction policies into funded programmes to facilitate their implementation.

In addition, the department must provide accommodation and property management services to all the other Ministries of the South African government.

The Department of Public Works received a budget allocation of R6,51 billion for the 2016-17 financial year and had 32 targets to meet during this period. Disappointingly, only 19 of the 32 targets were achieved, leaving the department with a dismal success rate of only 59%. During the same time during the past fiscal year, the department spent 98,3% of its budget allocation, underspending by R109 million. How can a department spend 98,3% of its budget, and only achieve 59% of its targets?

The NFP is concerned about the ratio of spending to targets achieved. The figures here show us clearly that this department is underperforming. This underperformance, coupled with the third consecutive unqualified audit report increases our unease

about the department’s ability to execute its mandate effectively.

We fully support the observations and recommendations of the committee contained in this report. We agree that there is an urgent need for stable leadership, particularly at the level of senior management and we encourage the department to give effect to the various recommendations related thereto.

The NFP also call on the department and its entities to pay heed to the recommendations regarding the internal financial control and management issues, in particular to ensure that the ethos of anti-corruption, financial control and accountability are prioritised.

In conclusion, the NFP supports the adoption of the report.

Ms D CARTER: Deputy Speaker, Cope notes a mixed bag in respect of Public Works.

We are concerned at the systemic abuse of the EPWP employment processes.

In respect of the Property Management Trading Entity, Cope is concerned at its regression to an adverse audit opinion.

We are further concerned that the Independent Development Trust also received an adverse audit opinion – its second in a row – and particularly with regard to contraventions of the Public Finance Management Act in respect of procurement.

Furthermore, Cope notes that the Council for the Built Environment and the Construction Industry Development Board both received unqualified audit reports, and welcomes this development.

Cope notes the portfolio committee’s report’s call for leadership stability within the department. Now, in this regard, it is noted that, under Mr Zuma’s presidency, the department has shockingly had four Ministers and six directors-general of whom some were acting.

Finally, Cope is concerned about the collapse of the Nkandla disciplinary enquiries, and that the prosecution of the Nkandla architect remains unresolved.

Cope will not rest until the real truth is exposed. Thank you.

Mr H M Z MMEMEZI: Deputy Speaker, the Portfolio Committee on Public Works unanimously approved this Budgetary Review and Recommendation Report which considered the performance and expenditure for this financial year of the Department of Public Works and the Property Management Trading Entity, which is its implementing arm.

The report also includes the department’s four entities. Indeed, the portfolio committee did note some areas of concern. And for these, if you peruse our report, we did give recommendations which, we have no doubt, if the department, the entities ... of course, led by the Minister can ensure that recommendations are implemented.

Indeed, we were not happy with the instability insofar as the leadership of the department ... We were also not happy about the weaknesses of the internal controls. We were indeed not happy with the underspending on key areas which lead to vacancies, in particular at higher levels.

So, for all these ...

*Isixhosa*:

... sithi kubantu baseMzantsi Afrika iSebe lezeMisebenzi yoLuntu lilo elenza ukuba uMzantsi Afrika ushukume. Izikolo ezininzi zakhiwe kwaye izikolo ezakhiwe ngezitena zodaka ziphelile kuba Isebe lezeMisebenzi yoLuntu lincedisile. Sifuna abantu basemakhaya bayazi ukuba iNkqubo yeMisebenzi yoLuntu eyoNgezelelweyo iyanceda ukuba balale betyile. [Uwele-wele.]

*English*:

Mr T RAWULA: On a point of order, Chair.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, please take your seat. Yes, hon member? [Interjections.] Hon Filtane, please sit down.

Mr T RAWULA: Deputy Speaker, the member is misleading the House when he says mud houses are finished. We still have mud houses in the Eastern Cape. I think he must correctly state what he wants to say and stop lying to Parliament.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Mmemezi?

Mr H M Z MMEMEZI: Deputy Speaker, in fact, for anyone who cares to know, the work of Public Works is helping the Department of Education to eradicate mud schools and that is indeed appreciated. It may not be eliminated as we speak, but the work is indeed done. [Time expired.]

Motion agreed to (Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Report accordingly adopted.

# CONSIDERATION OF BUDGETARY REVIEW AND RECOMMENDATION REPORT OF STANDING COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

There was no debate.

The Chief Whip of the Majority Party moved: That the Report be adopted.

*Declarations of vote*:

Mr R A LEES: Hon Deputy Speaker, what is significant about this report is not what is in the report, but what is not in the report. While the BRRR was professionally handled by the Standing Committee on Finance, it is most distressing that the Sars failed to table its annual report and has still not done so. The DA welcomes the Davis Tax Committee Report on Tax Administration which was published yesterday. We look forward to fully study its contents. [Interjections.]

Ms B P MABE: I wanted to check if the hon member is prepared to take a question.

*Sesotho:*

O a tseba hore molato ha o bole.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Mabe, you must wait for the member to respond to your question. Hon member, are you prepared to take a question?

Mr R A LEES: No, not at this stage. Thank you Deputy Speaker.

Ms B P MABE: [INAUDIBLE.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, no, no, take your seat! Go ahead hon member.

Mr R A LEES: Deputy Speaker, the unexpected return to work at Sars by Jonas Makwakwa despite an ongoing criminal investigation into his finances, adds to the already significant reputational damage at Sars. It took over a year whilst they were on full pay and paid bonuses for Hogan Lovells and Adv Terry Motau to deal with the Makwakwa-Elskie matters.

Before the criminal investigations had been finalised, Sars issued an incredibly abrupt press statement to the effect that the Makwakwa and Elskie had not been found guilty and had returned to work on 01 November. What exactly did Hogan Lovells investigate if not the suspicious bank account deposits?

Deputy Speaker, there is something horribly wrong when the Sars Manager responsible for the collection of personal and corporate income taxes, and whose personal finance matters are being criminally investigated, is allowed back at work at Sars which handles R1,2 trillion worth of tax funds that belong to the people of South Africa. Makwakwa and Elskie must surely be suspended from Sars with immediate effect until the criminal investigations have been finalised. Thank you very much. [Applause.]

Ms N V MENTE: Deputy Speaker, the EFF warned this Parliament about the capture of Mr Zuma and we warned South Africans that on the next list of capture were the Treasury and the public purse. He former CEO of Gupta-linked Trillion told the Portfolio Committee on Public Enterprise that the Guptas, Essa Salim, Eric Wood and other Gupta associates knew about the firing of former Finance Ministers.

In December 2015 we told everyone, not for the first time, that South Africa has been under the management of a criminal syndicate masked as genuine business people headquartered in

Saxonwold, and you called it frivolous. Now, the budgeting is happening in Saxonwold with no respect to the Constitution which set out Treasury functions, the PFMA or Treasury Guidelines. The ANC is in denial and they continue to call our warnings frivolous.

Minister Gigaba is the last person to assure the nation that under his leadership, Treasury remains committed to transparent budgeting while he knows very well that there is no transparency in Dubai and Saxonwold. As we speak, the Treasury will be at the forefront leading the looting that is currently happening at an industrial scale. And for the Chairperson of the Standing Committee of Finance to present a Budget Review and Recommendation Report as if it’s business as usual, is not only misleading, naïve and reducing Parliament to a rubberstamping body, but it is also dishonest.

The attempts to capture the Public Investment Corporation, PIC and workers’ pensions are now confirmed and undisputable. We call on all South Africans to rally behind the PIC and legislative reform processes to make the PIC Board more

democratic, transparent and protected from the capture of Mr Zuma and his associates. Thank you.

Mr M HLENGWA: Hon Deputy Speaker, at the outset the IFP is concerned about the noncompliance with supply chain management policies and processes as outlined in the Auditor-General’s Report. This concern is about the cases of extension of tenders without inviting competitive bids, what is known as purchase order contracts and the failure to invite three quotations and apply the preference system.

Therefore, if it’s only National Treasury that is not complying with National Treasury Regulations, then of course we have a problem. When it’s the National Treasury that is not complying with the PFMA, then obviously we have problems. This culture of noncompliance obviously extends to Sars and its failure to submit its annual report. Furthermore, the committee should also note that the IPF is also concerned about consequence management and the slow pace in improving internal controls and addressing the risk by senior and executive authorities.

What is alarming hon Deputy Speaker, is that fruitless, wasteful and irregular expenditure increased from R2 million in 2015-16 financial year to an alarming R69,6 million in 2016-17 financial year; and irregular from R66 million to R140 million. So, these are again the problems which characterise the National Treasury, and which must be sorted out as a matter of urgency. The PIC is obviously under siege and the threat of the sale of Telkom shares today even has turned the value of those shares and the profits thereof.

The committee welcomes, and we agree with it, the fact that SAA will now be audited by the Auditor-General because, quite frankly, there was no need why it wasn’t. But what is currently evident before us is that SA Airways, which was once a national asset, has become a national liability. And if drastic action is not taken, it is going to sink the fiscus of this country with their endless bailouts. In fact, they are generating R30 billion of revenue every year and that money goes up in smoke because

...

*IsiZulu:*

... abantu bacasha ngemali yabantu.

*English:*

Thank you, Deputy Speaker. [Time expired.]

Mr A M SHAIK-EMAM: Hon Deputy Speaker, the NFP welcomes the Budget Review and Recommendation, BRR Report tabled here today on Finance. Yes, indeed when I heard the response here from my colleagues on the left ... [Interjections.] ... because hon Steenhuisen, in the DA they do everything. They can be corrupt; they can steal, manipulate and even steal their best friends’ wives or girlfriends, and it is acceptable and fine. It is a way of life for them.

Of the R28,4 billion allocated in the 2016-17 financial year, Treasury has underspent by R0,1 billion while some programmes spent an overall of 99%. The NFP welcomes R6,5 billion contingency reserves as a result of profit due to a strong rand.

In the NFP, whether you are a Member of Parliament or staff, if you steal, you steal and if you want to eat the taxpayer’s

money, we won’t allow it. We will not pay people for not working. If the DA does that and they are corrupt, so be them and not the NFP.

The NFP expressed concerns at the outstanding audit report from Sars and the SA Airways. However, we must add that the new CEO appointed at the SA Airways has made a great start in that he has gone to visit his employees to try and get input in order to identify the challenges.

You must take Audrick and keep him with you. He worked for you for one year, did nothing and got paid. You are like that because you are eating the taxpayer’s money. The findings of the Auditor-General on breaches in the SCM processes on applying preference points, failure to invite three written quotations and noncompliance of bidding processes must be addressed.

Fruitless expenditure must be reduced. There has to be consequence management for irregular expenditure. The NFP supports the Bill tabled here today. Thank you very much. [Time expired.]

Ms D CARTER: Ooh, Deputy Speaker ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, hon members ... No, no, no! You are out of order. [Interjections.] Do not do that again because it is wrong. You can’t stand up, walk in the man’s path and do what you did. I saw you. No, no, no! it is unacceptable and I find it wrong. Please allow us to proceed, hon Khusisa.

Ms D CARTER: Deputy Speaker ... [Interjections.]

*IsiZulu:*

USolwazi N M KHUBISA: Hhayi Somlomo, ayingaqali impi, iyabulala impi. [Ubuwelewele.] Iyabulala!

*English:*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I am trying to prevent that from happening, hon members. Hon Carter, please proceed!

Ms D CARTER: Deputy Speaker, apart from the Executive, Treasury is the only department that receives its mandate directly from the Constitution. It is now clear Treasury has been captured as

part of the State Capture project. During the treachery of Mr Zuma’s presidency, we are now subjected to our fifth Minister of Finance, our third Deputy Minister and our third Treasury Director-General. It is clear that Mr Zuma has sought plying Treasury leadership and that he now has this in the form of a Minister heavily implicated in the capture of our SOEs and a Deputy linked to corrupt activities at Prasa.

The weakening and repurposing of Treasury is clearly evident from the attacks upon the Office of the Chief Procurement Officer and attempts to lessen its control of departmental procurement deviations. And now, in the face of a new Presidential Fiscal Committee presided over by persons with no Treasury exposure; the shifting of a budgetary process to the Department of Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation; and attempts to recklessly fund free higher education; Mr Michael Sachs, a commensurate and dedicated professional, has thrown in the towel.

Deputy Speaker, the Cope notes that the portfolio committee was unable to consider the annual reports of the SAA and Sars. The

Cope is concerned at the growing white-anting of the capacity of Sars which is being committed with purposeful intent. The Cope has no faith in any commission of enquiry established by the President, Mr Zuma and calls upon Parliament to establish its own enquiry into the capture of Treasury and the Receiver of Revenue. Thank you.

Ms T V TOBIAS: Hon Deputy Speaker, let me request upfront that I beg for the indulgence of the House to adopt this report.

However, let me first clear some misconceptions before I speak to any of the things that I need to respond to.

Firstly, let us speak to the issues of Mr Makwakwa. Hon Lees, let us not put the cart before the horse. We agreed as the committee that we want a report about the disciplinary processes of Mr Makwakwa. Therefore, allow the process to come to the committee and you’ll have an ample opportunity to engage with that issue at that time.

Secondly, when it comes to fruitless expenditure, I think we agree in principle that it is the IMFS project that the

Department of National Treasury has had fruitless expenditure in. If you look at the report of National Treasury, actually it has received unqualified audit opinion including all the entities which report under National Treasury. Seven of them got unqualified audit opinions without findings and five of them had unqualified opinions with findings.

In relation to Sars, I think we agreed in principle that Sars has not submitted its financial statements because it is taking the Auditor-General to court. We are waiting for the process to unfold so that we can understand what the problem is. With regard to the SA Airways, we agreed in principle that the failure to submit the financial statements for auditing is a matter of concern. We have suggested a turnaround strategy and we are waiting for Sars when it comes to present its quarterly report to come and account.

In relation to tender irregularities, we agreed in principle – David I hope you are going to be happy about this one – that when they come for their quarterly report, we want them to

report to us in terms of consequence management in relation to the matter. May you please accept the report? Thank you.

Motion agreed to (Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Report accordingly adopted.

# CONSIDERATION OF REPORT OF PORTFOLIO COMMITTEE ON SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY - BUDGETARY REVIEW AND RECOMMENDATION

Ms D Z S DUBAZANE: Thank you Deputy Speaker, I move that the report be adopted.

*Declarations of vote*:

Ms C V KING: The global technical system is undergoing a profound transformation based on information technologies and new technology such as biotechnology and neon technology that are changing our worlds and the outset societies.

The role that science technology and innovation play in the economic transformation of our country is underestimated by

government; 0, 73% of the GDP, gross domestic product is spent on research and development in South Africa compared to other African countries which on average invest 2%.

The poor mathematics and science by South Africans scholars, the low through put rate to post graduates study and low investment and research and development remains a challenge to department and its entities.

A concern is raised by the recreation in audit outcomes of the Department of Science and Technology, Human Science Research Council and the National Research Foundation, in relation to complying with the legislation, supply chain management and performance information.

Condonement of irregular expenditure in the long run will set the precedent of flouting supply chain management procedures which have an adverse effect on audit outcomes in the future.

The Minister’s commitment to take action in this regard is noted. Human capacity as a result of unfilled vacancies, Square

Kilometer Array, SKA project is only left in 32 instead of 64 antenna commercialisation of science output are some of the targets which could not be reached because of the R53 million decreases in the budget.

The suggestion of the venture capital fund for commercialisation purposes under constraint budget will only be feasible if the private sector investment is encouraged; and collaboration of other government departments with the Department of Science and Technology and its entities are addressed, specifically in areas where water scarcity, electricity, information and communications technology is encouraged. This will bring an innovative approach in addressing domestic economic challenges. Thank you. [Applause.]

Mr M N PAULSEN: Thank you Deputy Speaker, the EFF rejects this report. The role of science and technology in developing a self sufficient independent and an industrialised economy that is able to employ people must never be underestimated.

Along with protectionism and subsidisation of infant industries, research and development has played a key role throughout the world in turning developing countries into developed ones.

Without Samsung, Hyundai and Kia and the technology that these companies developed, South Korea will still be a country of peasants.

These state support companies whose products the world is relying on are a product of state support and investment in research and development. We are entering the age of the Fourth Industrial Revolution.

If we as a country do not want to get left behind by this investment science and technology must be prioritised. At the same time the country faces many challenges.

If we want to be independent and not relying on old and new colonial power’s innovations then development is needed to tackle these challenges like water scarcity.

If we invest in this localised science and technology will emerge, which will be decolonised science, not in theory but in practice. The failure of the report to recognise any of these is why we reject it. Thank you very much.

Mr M HLENGWA: Hon Deputy Speaker, at the outset the IFP recognises the important role of science, technology and innovation particularly using it as an agent of economic growth and economic development for the country because as we are approach the Fourth Industrial Revolution we are going to need to anchor our capabilities in science, technology and innovation.

Therefore, the move to cut budget we should certainly stay away from cutting the budget of this department because we feel that it is an important department to try and change things for the better.

Hon Deputy Speaker, of course we know that there is the question of Palestine and Israel in this country which for a very long

time is one hand government policy and on the other hand ANC policy; and you never know really what’s what and what is not.

However, pushing all those things aside for a moment it would be in the best interest of this country to benchmark against Israel; and to actually explore their capabilities in terms desalination.

We have a problem of water scarcity in South Africa, the Western Cape is bound to hit ground zero, and provinces last year found themselves baring the brutal brunt of the drought. This is no certainly in the collective interest of South Africa that we benchmark against the best.

Here is the political consideration that then you can have that debate; but currently what we have before us is the desperate situation and the fact that you have the willing partner in Israel has actually been prepared to partner with South Africa in building up our own capabilities in this regard would be a welcome move.

So I think that it would help the Department of Science and Technology and its entities, and universities – and there are almost dysfunctional Department of Water and Sanitation to actually work with the best in that regard.

We do wish the department and its entities well moving forward and certainly hope that under recreations that have been noted, will be dealt with as matter of urgency. I thank you.

Prof N M KHUBISA: Thank you very much Deputy Speaker, we welcome the report as the NFP. The department has a very important task that is to develop, co-ordinate and manage our national system of innovation science and technology to assist in transforming the economy for the benefit of all our people.

Moreover, the department and its entities has the responsibility of creating an environment conducive to promoting innovation and to enhance our nation’s knowledge capacity; and generally to built science and technology infrastructure and capacity.

The department was allocated the budget of R7, 4 billion for the financial year 2016-17, of which R7, 3, an amount of 4% was spent. The spending ratio across the five programmes accurately reflects the department’s priority areas; but the NFP would like to see an adjustment in favour of the international cooperation and resources programme.

We believe that it is imperative for South Africa to maintain an international science and technology presence so that we can benefit from international knowledge and innovation.

An increased funding for this programme will ensure that we remain competitive on an international front. We know that the department has retained its qualified audit opinion with findings and it has achieved the highly commendable 89% of performance targets for 2016-17, fiscal year.

We also encouraged by the observation of the committee that the department and its entities have made extensive efforts to make sure that operational costs fall within the allowed prescripts and that the bulk of the public allocated funds and those funds

that were sourced externally have been used to fulfil core mandates.

Having said that Deputy Speaker, we note that the department is digressing a bit and we urge the department to work hard to retain its clean audit.

However, we want to comment the Deputy Minister and also the staff for the job well done; and we urge the department to increase the production of experts in these departments. Thank you very much.

Ms D CARTER: Thank you Deputy Speaker. Deputy Speaker, it is generally a pleasure to consider the budgetary review and recommendations relating to the Department of Science and Technology; and to recognise what can be achieved through responsible political leadership and stability within the management of the department.

Cope notes that the department received yet another unqualified audit opinion. That year and year the department has

consistently demonstrated that it can spend its budget allocation and meets its performance targets.

Cope agrees with the committee that science, technology and innovation do indeed play a vital role in the economic development and transformation of our country. Cope notes that we currently spend less than 1% of our GDP on research and development; and that our spent in this regard has been stagnant for the last two years.

Now our spent on RND need to increase if we are to reach our development goals; Cope agrees with the portfolio committee and the Minister that any attempts to reduce the budgetary allocation to the department must be resisted given the important role that RND and innovation play in the development.

There is also an urgent need to do further research in the effect of our organic eruptions in our oceans. The effect it has on the water temperatures and the effect it has on global warming; because currently we are only concentrating at what is happening in the atmosphere and not what is happening in our

oceans. Indeed Cope supports further appropriations to this department. Thank you.

Mr N J J V R KOORNHOF: Thank you Deputy Speaker. Science and technology and innovation have been long important drivers of the economic growth and human development. The STI activities conducted by the Department of Science and Technology and its entities are essential for building the industries of tomorrow as well as to develop the required human capital and skills needed for the next industrial revolution.

Therefore, even during times of economic slowdown the challenge remains to ensure support for science and technology. However, what was glaringly evident from the committee’s interaction with the department and the entities is that the allocations they received from the national fiscus is not sufficient and not even keeping pace with the inflation; and this is very worrying.

Hence, the committee once again strongly recommends that all efforts must increase to up the South African investment in science and technology; and that especially local and provincial

governments increase their investments in innovation to improve and expand service delivery.

The committee once again commends the department on their first rate performance achievement and prudent financial management during 2016-17, financial year.

I want to thank the committee for the work done during this time and I have really hoped for the hon Paulsen to support it but hope was not good enough. The ANC will support this report.

Motion agreed to.

Report accordingly adopted.

# CONSIDERATION OF BUDGETARY REVIEW AND RECOMMENDATION REPORT OF PORTFOLIO COMMITTEE ON INTERNATIONAL RELATIONS AND CO-OPERATION

There was no debate.

Ms D Z S Dlamini-Dubazana moved: That the Report be adopted.

Declarations of vote made on behalf of the Democratic Alliance, Economic Freedom Fighters, Inkatha Freedom Party, African Christian Democratic Party, National Freedom Party and African National Congress.

*Declarations of vote:*

Mr S MOKGALAPA: Hon Deputy Speaker, this department lacks accountable leadership. The absence of the Minister has left the committee without anyone to be hold accountable. As she has been awol from the National Assembly, and being hiding since March 2016, she also refrained from appearing in the committee on a regular basis in order to avoid accountability for her failures.

Given the Minister’s absenteeism, it is clear why the Auditor- General identified the lack of leadership as a major concern in the department. The department incurred irregular expenditure which amounted to more than R785 million as proper tender processes were not followed. The Auditor-General also found that the financial statements submitted for auditing were not were not prepared in accordance with the prescribed Financial

Reporting Framework and supported by the full and proper records as required by the Public Finance Management Act.

Another huge problem is the lack of consequence management and poor performance management for officials who transgress supply chain management. It became clear that the disciplinary steps were not taken against officials who had incurred or permitted irregular expenditure as required by the Public Finance Management Act. Basically no disciplinary steps have been taken. Only two out of the 239 disciplinary hearings were finalised.

The chief financial officer, CFO, issue is not yet resolved.

Finally, the department incurred over and fruitless wasteful expenditure this year, while National Education, Health, and Allied Workers’ Union, Nehawu has made serious allegations of nepotism, corruption and victimisation in the department which has still not been addressed by the Minister. We need a Minister who is willing to do her job and who can be held accountable.

The DA will not stand by and absolve the Minister from her responsibility, and we will continue to ensure accountability

and that the department is clean and the institutional rot is done away with. I thank you. [Applause.]

Ms H O MKHALIPI: Hon Deputy Speaker, the EFF is the only political party with the progressive internationalist outlook which seeks to engage with global progressive movements, whether you like it or not. One of the seven cardinal pillars of the EFF is the massive development of the African economy and advocating for a move from reconciliation to justice on the African continent. These are the cornerstones of the EFF approach to international relations and inform our position on relations with all countries.

It is the reason why we will continue to call for the expulsion of the Israel ambassador and a boycott of Israel whose illegitimate government oppresses the people of Palestine daily on our continent, whose recent history has been defined by the struggle against colonialism. Morocco which continues to colonise Western Sahara has been readmitted into the African Union, which we reject.

The primary purpose of this department should be the facilitation of a united Africa, not dependent on colonialist both old and new, but the Africa where we are economically independent and trade with each other. Instead, the department has brought back a suspended chief financial officer, CFO, who was guilty of corruption and cannot account for missing funds from an African renaissance.

Now, the CFO in this department presided over a corrupt tender process which embezzled funds from the Bank of America Corporation, BAC, yet there are no criminal charges laid. The R416 million which is not accounted for plus R2,4 million, a rent paid for an unoccupied building in Gana under the ANC.

Ms H O MKHALIPI: So, we have raised these concerns with the Minister ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, your time is up.

Ms H O MKHALIPI: ... she told us that, we are still young in the democracy, it is time for the ANC to loot. We reject this budget. [Applause.]

Mr M HLENGWA: Hon Deputy Speaker, in fairness to do justice to this report, we need to deal with the issue of parliamentary oversight. For all intense and purposes, the Minister is a visitor to Parliament. She is never here. Whether is in the committee, whether is for question session, the Minister is never here and I do not think that it bolds well for oversight accountability and for us to hold her accountable against the benchmark of her own commitments. I think that the ANC really needs to rein her in to understand that the first place for accountability is Parliament because some of these international trips have become nothing but junkets which are a burden on the fiscus and are unnecessary.

However, you cannot even pose those questions to the Minister because she is never here and even when she is certain things happen which are not desirable.

Hon Deputy Speaker, one for example the recognition of the immunities of the Zimbabwe first lady, we received zero accountability on that and once again human rights are sacrificed at the altar of political expediency and so-called diplomacy. As to when will we get the answers to all these things they are not there? Irregular expenditure of R336 million and how do you get an explanation for these things; you will not get it because the Minister is never there.

Her saving grace is the two Deputy Ministers who are able and capable, but in the final analyses, they are not the executive authority. So, even that declaration of duty on the part of the Minister.

Finally, Deputy Speaker, South Africa has the second highest of foreign missions in the world, which is a drain on the fiscus for no good reason. We want to be present everywhere and be absent where it matters most. The rationalisation process of these compasses and console offices must be sped up so that we can get value for money. I thank you.

Ms C DUDLEY: Hon Deputy Speaker, the ACDP welcomes the department’s unqualified audit report despite the material findings. This is the step in the right direction. We also acknowledge upfront that the department has operated within a tied budget despite its growing responsibilities. [Interjections.]

Ms S M KHAWULA: Deputy Speaker, on a point of order.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Sorry, hon member, please take your seat.

*IsiZulu*:

Nk S M KHAWULA: Bengingajabula mhlawumbe uma nje beningamtholela amabhasi azophelezela ilungu elihloniphekile uShaik-Emam noma esebuya.

USEKELA SOMLOMO: Cha, cha lungu elihloniphekile hlala phansi!

*English:*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, hon member, hlala phansi nawe. [You sit down to.] Go ahead hon Dudley.

Ms C DUDLEY: Despite its growing responsibilities and that an unpredictable foreign exchange places this department perhaps more than any other at risk especially in the missions where the bulk of its activities take place of operations being negatively impacted. The ACDP fully supports committee recommendations that training programmes for offices responsible for financial statements, procurement, supply chain management and asset management be identified and implemented and that the skills audit in the finance unit takes place to determine whether there is appropriate capacity to address the root causes of recurring qualified audit opinions for the past four years.

Now, it also goes without saying that the accounting officer must have the necessary mandate and capacity to deal with and oversee the implementation of turnaround strategies aimed at addressing the root causes of recurring audit findings.

Once again the ACDP calls on Parliament to ensure that the parliamentary committee responsible for the oversight of the Department of International Relations and Co-operation can at least once a year conduct oversight on South African missions

abroad. If the committee is to monitor causes of irregular expenditure and noncompliance with supply chain management this is essential.

Now, on the global stage the United States Human Rights Committee has been drafting general comment 36 and the ACDP is concerned that the current version of this draft will effectively require all states to allow abortion up until birth for any or no reason. It will also put pressure on states to legalise euthanasia and assisted suicide.

Now, the Choice on Termination of Pregnancy Act in South Africa clearly recognises the increasing interests of the developing unborn child.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, your time has expired.

Ms C DUDLEY: It leaves no question that this was the intention of the legislatures. The ACDP calls on government to ensure South Africa holds a principled stand and we will be supporting the Budgetary Review and Recommendation Report, BRRR. Thank you.

Mr A M SHAIK-EMAM: Hon Deputy Speaker, allow me on behalf of the NFP to extend our condolences to the family and members of those who have lost their loved ones in this devastating earthquake that occurred in Iran and also allow us to extend our condolences to the Republic of Iran on this very tragic incident that has taken place.

The NFP welcomes the Budgetary Review and Recommendation Report, BRRR, tabled here today on international relations. In line with the policy of building a better Africa, South Africa has clearly played a pivotal role in conflicts in both Lesotho and South Sudan.

The formation of the Brazil, Russia, India, China and South Africa, Brics, bank is welcomed and it is hope that the

R10 billion US dollars reserved for infrastructure in the industrialisation and skills development will provide many jobs and contribute to economic development.

South Africa’s role in the Southern African Development Communities, SADC, is vital as the SADC region is our biggest

trading partner. The NFP welcomes the proposals on the Brics credit rating agency, a Railway Research Network and the agricultural research. South Africa’s presence internationally has yielded positive results.

The NFP notes with concern the unauthorised expenditure, including the irregular expenditure. Supply chain management processes were violated. Of serious concern is the absenteeism rate in the high-level skilled employees of 6 485 days of sick leave. The investigation of the alleged misconduct against the chief finance officer, CFO, must be accelerated.

The NFP is satisfied that the department has spent its budget accurately to its 2016-17 strategic plans. We welcome the measures the department intends putting in place to combat the previous transgressions. The NFP supports the report tabled here today. [Applause.]

Mr M S A MASANGO: Hon Deputy Speaker, the ANC is of course in full support of the Budgetary Review and Recommendation Report, BRRR and recommends that this august House adopts the report

because of the excellent overall performance of this department in terms of the international relation’s work and the diplomatic work it is doing.

Indeed, as some members pointed out, there are a few small or bigger weaknesses that we have pointed out to the department to which, we have directed that it must attend to them expeditiously. Some of which are the supply chain management, the asset management register in the missions, the payment of suppliers which is not being done within 30 days, the Information and Communication Technology, ICT, deficiencies, the solving of the matters that continue to arise in the Southern African Customs Unions and of course the fact that the department must speedily migrate from the African Renaissance and International Co-operation Fund to the SA Development Partnership Agency.

There are of course - for I think, I am not going to burden this House with all of the things we found, but there are 42 findings and 27 recommendations the committee has met.

With regard to the conduct of the Minister, the agreement with members that made the observation that the committee was not and is still not happy over the fact that the Minister has not been attending committee meetings. Of course, we did hold a no-holds- barred meeting with the Minister.

*IsiNdebele*:

Satjhiya esilikhohliweko. Njeke ...

*English:*

... we have accepted the apology that the Minister gave to the committee. [Interjections.]

Furthermore, the committee congratulates the Department of International Relations and Co-operation for receiving an unqualified audit report with material findings for 2016-17. [Applause.]

We also congratulate this department for being ranked number one in Africa in digital diplomacy. With that said we request that

this House to adopt this report. Thank you, very much. The ANC is in full support. [Applause.]

Motion agreed to (Economic Freedom Fighters and Democratic Alliance dissenting).

Report accordingly adopted.

# THE PROVISION OF QUALITY EDUCATION, SKILLS DEVELOPMENT AND INNOVATION IS FUNDAMENTAL TENET FOR ATTAINMENTOF A DEVELOPMENTAL STATE

(Subject for Discussion)

Mr M JOHNSON: Comrades and colleagues, former President Nelson Mandela once said:

Education is the great engine of personal development. It is through education that the daughter of a peasant can become a doctor, that the son of a mineworker can become the head of

the mines and that a child of farm workers can become president of a great nation.

Fellow South Africans, from the onset, the ANC welcomes the tabling of the Heher Commission Report on Fees Commission. We look forward to progressive steps that must take us closer towards achieving the Freedom Charter goal of unconditionally opening up the doors of learning and culture to all South Africans. The ANC‘s policy remains that of being pro poor. Those in the education field must be urged to give meaning to the type of education South Africa needs, a People’s Education for People’s Power, an Education for Liberation in that blue print called Education Charter, so that we are not held hostage by hollow slogans like decolonised education among others.

Colleagues, this bears testimony to the fact that education is a cornerstone for any developmental agenda worldwide. In fact, the provision of quality education, skills development and innovation in keeping with the 4th industrial revolution is a fundamental tenet for the attainment of a developmental state.

In this regard, the ANC Strategy and Tactics of 2012 calls for

the building of a developmental state that is people-centred and people driven, and sustained development based on high growth rates, restructuring of the economy, sustained and decent jobs, and socioeconomic inclusion.

The 53rd National Conference of the ANC resolved that social transformation has a fundamental role to play in the building of a developmental state. In other words, the task of social transformation is about advancing the goal of the ANC as articulated in the Strategy and Tactics of 2007 which states that our strategies for social transformation must seek to empower people to lift themselves out of poverty while creating adequate social nets to protect the most vulnerable in our society.

In light of the broad goal of the ANC, the 53rd National Conference resolved, amongst others that the state must continue to build capacity to drive the socioeconomic agenda in the country, including absorbing young people and women into the mainstream of our economic activity, employing professionals, investing in skills required by the economy, and investing in

research and development to respond to the demands of the knowledge economy.

Colleagues and fellow South Africans, where credit is due, it must be accorded. It is a fact that for the first time in the history of our wonderful South Africa, under President Zuma’s administration, we now have a National development Plan. [Interjections.] Whether you like it or not, it is a fact. [Applause.] It is also a fact that the ANC Deputy President started steering the administrative ship towards the attainment of those goals of doing away with unemployment, poverty and inequality. A need therefore of growing our country’s skills base towards achieving Vision 2030 cannot be overemphasised.

This role cannot be confined to the public sector alone ... [Interjections]

Ms S M KHAWULA: On a point of order.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon member, what is your point of order?

*IsiZulu*:

Nks S M KHAWULA: Ngiyabonga, bengithi angizame kumhlonishwa wami ukuthi azi ukuthi le nto ye-reshuffling iphelile. Nanoma angancoma kanjani ngeke asathola lutho ...

*English:*

... it is gone, it is gone ...

*IsiZulu:*

... akusashafulwa manje. [Uhleko.]

*English:*

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Can I advise members that points of orders should relate to points of procedure. Continue hon member.

Mr M JOHNSON: Those are facts that cannot be denied. A need therefore of growing our country’s skills base towards achieving Vision 2030 cannot be overemphasised. This role cannot be confined to the public sector alone either, as the private

sector, community based organisations, NGO’s equally have a role to play towards achieving our shared vision 2030.

Speaker, social cohesion and nation building are a critical tenet for social transformation. These underpin all national, provincial and local government strategic priorities, inclusive of integrated economic and social development, education, health, human settlement, land and rural development, safety and security, immigration policies and programmes, arts, culture all aimed at preserving our technological innovations through research and development.

Comrades, in this regard, the ANC’s policy on Developmental State, Education and Social Transformation are succinctly reflected in the 2030 National Development Plan. Briefly, the NDP calls for the improvement of the education, training and innovation at four levels namely: Early childhood development; basic education; post-school and the national research and innovation system. In so far as the developmental state is concerned, the NDP calls for a stable political-administrative interface; development of technical and specialist professional

skills; strengthening of local government; improvement of interdepartmental coordination; and strengthening the delegation, accountability and oversight, amongst others.

Fellow South Africans, lastly, the NDP calls for transforming society and uniting the country through redress, promotion of economic and social inclusion, social cohesion, active citizenry, broad based leadership and the crafting of a social compact. It is worth noting that some of these programs are already being implemented while others are at various phases of implementation and planning by the ANC government. To this end the ANC remains a trusted leader of society and a champion of the national democratic revolution.

The last point that I wish to make is that of having to wish the class of 2017, all the best in this year as they are in the middle of their examination. Thank you for your attention. [Applause.]

Mr M L W FILTANE: Point of order, Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon Johnson, maybe just to add that I also want to wish members of Parliament who are writing their exams very well as they do so this year. And I am expecting all of you to pass. Yes, hon member.

Mr M L W FILTANE: Chair, we have been missing you.

*Afrikaans*:

Waar was jy vir so lank?

*English*:

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Thank you hon member. Hon Majeke, congratulations I was not here when you received your doctorate. You are congratulated. [Applause.]

Mr I M OLLIS: House Chair, I would like to add my congratulations, as well.

According to [www.etu.org.za,](http://www.etu.org.za/) “a developmental state is a state that plays an active role in guiding economic development and using the resources of the country to meet the needs of the

people” by such things as “to attack poverty and expand economic opportunities.”

This topic for debate today is a smokescreen. It’s a soft landing, if you will, for a state that is in crisis. It seeks to draw our attention away from the problems in government and from the problems in the Departments of Basic Education and Higher Education and Training. I suppose the ANC needed a topic that would be safe because there are so many levels of government that are collapsing that it has become a huge embarrassment.

Take the National Prosecuting Authority and Mr Shaun Abrahams, for example. He hasn’t prosecuted any of the significant high- profile cases, because apparently, he needs someone to bring him a copy of the various newspapers that contain all of the evidence. Week after week, we read it in the Sunday papers.

Neither the police and the Special Investigating Unit nor the Hawks and Mr Abrahams can ever investigate these high-profile cases, so they just pile up. Why worry about the developmental state when criminals are taking over the state?

What about state-owned enterprises? Why worry about the developmental state when the state-owned enterprises are going bankrupt, with SAA as the most visible example? If a developmental state means running the state like SAA or Eskom or SA Social Security Agency, Sassa, or the Passenger Rail Agency of South Africa, Prasa, or the Department of Mineral Resources, then take it away - quickly! Who needs it? The citizens of South Africa don’t want a developmental state. They tried it and have turned their backs on it.

The Department of Water and Sanitation is a prime example. They can’t build dams. I believe Minister Mokonyane went to the NCOP recently and said that one dam that had had to be enlarged now has to be broken down because of the poor workmanship in building the enlarged dam wall – but we’re in the middle of a massive drought. Where is the developmental state in that?

What we really want is good education for all South African children. So, dear ANC, give up on your half-baked developmental state and just get back to the basics. Firstly, let’s sort out the infrastructure.

Instead of connecting zero of the targeted 620 schools to electricity, as for last year, let’s connect – I don’t know – say, 300, this year. Instead of only connecting 10 of the targeted 280 schools to water, let’s connect 200. Instead of only connecting nine of the targeted 265 schools to sanitation this past year, let’s reach, perhaps, 200 or 180. Instead of only building 16 of the targeted 59 schools that are needed to replace the mud schools in South Africa, let’s build the actual, full, 59 new schools, this year. [Applause.]

Instead of having 6 000 school teachers with inadequate or no qualifications to teach, let’s require them to complete their studies, with our support, in two years. Set a deadline!

Instead of having fewer than 50% of the schools connected to the Internet with computers for teaching or learning, let’s connect 90% of them, this year. Instead of having computers lying unused in some rural schools, let’s make sure at least one teacher in every school has the proper training on how to use the ICT equipment for teaching and learning.

Under a DA-led government, we wouldn’t waste time here discussing a developmental state. We would ensure that no teacher goes to trade-union meetings during school hours. Not ever. By doing that, we would cut down on absenteeism by 25%.

A DA-led government would simply expect teachers to be on time for the first lesson every day and to teach the mathematics classes, which they are paid to do. Currently - and listen to it

– 40% of teachers in South Africa are regularly absent ... [Interjections.] ... and 40% also come to school later than their own learners. Can you believe that? Furthermore, the first class is a mathematics class, so, they don’t teach mathematics because they’re not in the classroom.

How can the ANC come with a developmental state when they can’t get the basics right? I guess you have to ask, when you are trying to get rid of a President and his friends, who are busy breaking your party and our country, why would you want to come to Parliament and have an arcane, theoretical debate about the philosophy of state development? It’s nonsense!

Tell me more. Why do you want to tamper with school governing bodies’ rights? Community involvement, aside from regular police patrols and police work, is actually the most crucial role- player in crime prevention and safety on a school property. When the school parents, the school governing body and the local community feel part of a school, they will fight to keep that school safe.

Finally, I must say a word about safety at schools, itself. The SA Council for Educators, SACE, the body responsible for the vetting of teachers, came to Parliament recently and told the committee the following. The way the state has been set up by you, the system does not allow them to get files of those found guilty of or dismissed due to sexual offences against learners, or from gross misconduct, until the educator has been employed in another school in another province.

Let’s put that into perspective. A teacher rapes a pupil, resigns, moves to another province, and starts teaching your daughter! Is that what we want from a developmental state? [Interjections.] [Applause.]

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: Welcome back, Chair. Indeed, we have missed you.

Firstly, our most fundamental principle is that the state must provide free, quality education, and not outsource this responsibility to the banks. The EFF believes that all students in South Africa can be funded by our government, regardless of whether they choose TVet or university qualifications.

The EFF has made concrete proposals regarding expanding our tax base by nationalising mines and banks to allow the government to source more funding for higher education and training. The responsibility of educating young people must not be placed on a loan scheme from the private sector. It must be placed on the government.

It was always in the liberation perspective that to fund education, government must expand its tax base or look beyond its immediate Fiscal Framework. This is how nationalisation of the commanding heights of the economy was justified. That the ANC has rejected nationalisation is proof of how much they have

been captured by interests other than those of advancing the poor people.

Secondly, we need to focus on the quality of our basic education. Today, our education system in South Africa is rated as one of the worst in the world. This is so because of a process of deliberate dumbing-down of the education system by the elite now in government.

The Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development, OECD, did a ranking of the education systems around the world, in 2015. In results published early this year, South Africa is rated 75th out of 76 countries. Oh, what a shame! What a disgrace, ANC! The report found that 27% of South African pupils who have attended school for six years cannot read, compared with 4% in Tanzania and 19% in Zimbabwe.

Last year, the World Economic Forum, WEF, released their Global Information Technology Report 2016, which ranked South Africa last in mathematics and science education quality. South Africa also finished at 137 out of 139 countries when looking at the

overall quality of its education system. The WEF’s 2016 report also ranked South Africa’s mathematics and science education quality lower than that of Nigeria, Mozambique and Malawi.

Shocking as this may be, it is not new information. We have consistently argued against the national obsession with matriculation results since we got here, in 2014. We do so because we know the matriculation pass rate reflects the picture of those who managed to get to Grade 12.

About half of the pupils get lost in the system between Grades 1 and 12. The Department of Basic Education and the country, as a whole, have no plan for these young people, who are likely to spend the rest of their lives without access to regular sources of income because they would be joining the army of the unskilled and unemployable. These are, wholly, black children of the poor and the working class.

We submit that, if we continue to fail to pay attention to basic education in its entirety, we are preparing ourselves for a

failed state – that is, if we survive uBaba kaDuduzane’s attempts to make us one now. Thank you, Chairperson.

Mr D MNGUNI: House Chair, members and guests in the gallery, since 1994, the ANC-led government has made significant progress in addressing the triple socioeconomic and development challenges of poverty, unemployment and inequality, thereby achieving a better life for all South Africans.

A greater number of our people and households have access to basic infrastructure and services such as clean water and sanitation, electricity, social grants, including education.

As the ANC, we continue to reach out to many more South Africans who still require access to basic services, infrastructure, and improved sustainable livelihoods, with the objective of developing integrated and sustainable communities. We have also made great strides in the building of a socially inclusive and cohesive nation.

However, despite all these changes, we are aware that there are still many of our citizens who still live in poverty. Racism and inequality continues to remain stubborn developmental obstacles to the achievement of socioeconomic equity in our country.

It is for these reasons that the ANC is implementing the programme for radical socioeconomic transformation ... [Interjections.] ... aimed at ending poverty, unemployment and inequality. We endeavour for social transformation that prioritizes the rights of children, the creation of national identity and the creation of an inclusive society.

There are initiatives taken towards quality early childhood development, ECD, for all. The ECD programme provides services related to the care and mental stimulation of children and their learning to socialise in a structured environment. In this regard, Cabinet approved the Integrated ECD Policy, confirming ECD as a public good.

In preparation for implementation, National Treasury allocated an amount of R812 million for the provision of ECD

infrastructure and to create the child subsidy. To date, more than 1,4 million children are accessing ECD services while there are more than 28 000 ECD centres registered in the country. All provinces were orientated regarding ECD policy and programme to ensure better implementation. The Department of Social Development is also praised by the ANC for continuing to create a conductive environment for the training of ECD practitioners towards the minimum National Qualifications Framework, NQF, and Level 4 qualification. [Interjections.]

The ANC supports the initiatives of government towards enhancing the effectiveness of ECD by creating stronger collaborations between the departments of Health, Social Development and Basic Education.

Accelerating the implementation of a comprehensive ECD programme while taking into consideration the proposals in the NDP that calls for ensuring universal access to, at least, four years of ECD; providing childcare facilities at public and the private sector workplaces; ensuring integrated services, including nutritional support to expectant mothers and children up until

the child’s fifth birthday; ensuring the provision of full funding assistance covering tuition, books, accommodation and living allowances to students from poor families; and, lastly, paying special attention to child-headed households.

The state must ensure that it is compulsory for all public buildings to be easily accessible by people with disabilities. The state must implement policies and protect this section of the community. This, therefore, calls for an integrated approach that promotes the participation of people with disabilities at all levels of the movement and in all spheres of government.

Whilst ensuring the continuation of mainstreaming people with disability and establishing full services in the schools, we must prioritise the establishment of special needs schools for specific disabilities where such need arises.

We must also develop mechanisms at the ECD level that enable us to detect the developmental needs and challenges of a child at an early age and also consider the establishment of a commission or a structure focusing on people with disability.

By 2030, South Africans should have access to education and training of the highest quality, leading to significantly improved learning outcomes. The performance of South African learners in international standardised tests should be comparable to the performance of learners from countries at a similar level of development and with similar levels of access.

The education system in SA should build an inclusive society, providing equal opportunities and helping all South Africans to realise their full potential, particularly those previously disadvantaged by apartheid policies, namely black people, women and people with disabilities.

We are aware that South Africa loses half of every cohort that enters the school system by the end of the 12-year schooling period, wasting significant human potential and harming the life-chances of many young people. Secondary school completion rates in the USA is 77% while in the UK it’s 87% and in Japan it’s 93%. South Africa aims for a comparable completion rate of between 80% and 90%.

As the ANC, we support the Department of Basic Education’s plans to increase the number to 300 000 by 2024, with 350 000 learners passing mathematics and 320 000 learners passing physical science. Action is required throughout the education system, but particularly in ECD, given that the cohort that will enter university in 2030 has not yet started primary school.

Consideration should be given to expanding the Dinaledi schools initiative, which increases access to maths and science in underprivileged schools.

*Siswati*:

Batali emakhaya ...

*English*:

... we as the ANC are in the process of initiating a three- stream model which is a product of a roundtable discussion that was initiated in 2015, which the ANC appreciates. The concept is aligned with the principles used to measure the performance of an education system, which are access and efficiency, redress and equity, quality, and inclusivity.

The use of this model is meant to mediate the high dropout rate of learners from the basic schooling system by increasing the learner retention rate to 90% and allowing for an increase of the number of learners entering vocational and occupational pathways.

The model seeks to create various career pathways and opportunities to all learners in order to deal with skills shortage which contribute negatively to the ongoing low vacancies, and reduced productivity. The three streams are academic, technical-vocational and technical-occupational streams.

The academic stream expects learners to pursue university education. This is what is happening at schools today and will be maintained.

The technical vocational stream prepare learner to work in trades and craft as technicians. It may act as a supporting role or assist learners wanting to pursue such studies, for example, engineering, accounting, nursing, etc.

The technical-occupational stream relate to regular work for a living. Learners who will be in the stream are prepared for direct employment, for example, they can do panel beating, glass work, glazing and woodwork. I know hon Malema knows more about woodwork!

Time is not on my side to explain the streams in full, but I am prepared to give the opposition a free lecture, should you send me a Please Call Me ... [Interjections.]

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: Chairperson, on a point of order.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order, hon Mnguni. Please take your seat. What is the point of order, hon member?

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: Why do you, in your confused speech, have to mention our CIC? Can you stick to your confused speech, chief!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order, hon Mkhaliphi, that’s not a point of order.

Mr D MNGUNI: We have noted a large demand for teacher training in priority areas such as the foundation phase literacy and numeracy and Grades 10 to Grade 12. A number of teachers still find it difficult to access such training from the existing teachers’ centres in some subjects like accounting, science, and the like.

We are moving towards the Fourth Industrial Revolution which my colleague will talk about later.

We have to look at the operation and existence of the teachers centres currently. The following pointers should be looked at in respect of teachers’ centres so as to ensure quality education and teaching, more especially in the existing teacher centres to determine their abilities in teacher development by indicating the resource capacity of each teachers’ centre in terms of resources, both human and physical; assessing the capacity of each teachers’ centre to deliver teacher development programmes; determining the size of each centre and its accessibility to teachers; indicating what can be strengthened and how; and determining if there is any need to establish new teachers’

centres in areas where they do not exist and recommend sites for such establishment.

In order to achieve educational progress, South Africa needs an institutional structure that promotes good teaching and that attracts and retains the best teachers. Effective schools require well-selected principals together with management teams that understand and effectively fulfil their roles as leaders of the curriculum, ensuring an organised environment conducive for learning and teaching.

The districts should provide targeted support to improve practices within schools, facilitate communication and information sharing between the authorities and schools, and promote the sharing of best practices amongst the schools.

We are aware that teacher development programmes are not unfolding at the pace we expect. However, we took the initiative of making it a collaborative exercise in which stakeholders like the SA Council of Educators, Sace, NGOs, higher education

institutions and teacher unions like the Sadtu, are playing a pivotal role in various provinces.

South Africans, building of a new creation is easy because you use your own innovations and ideas and only those you will serve with your creation will feel comfortable. But, fixing the creation that is already in existence is daunting. The ANC is fixing a well-orchestrated ideology of education planned and implemented for over 300 years by many of these members’ forefathers and were once implemented by some of them here. It is still haunting us in this House and South Africans in general.

*Siswati*:

Nine e-EFF, angati kutsi nifunani kulabantfu laba - basisebentisela intfo lengekho etikolweni, basifundzisa bo head, bo thorax nabo abdomen ...

*English*:

... and insects like locusts ...

*Siswati*:

... tintfo letingamange tisiyise ndzawo. Ngaleso sikhatsi bona bafundza ngetintfo te-technology.

*English*:

Mr D MNGUNI: You, DA members, should be throwing stones on your forefathers’ graves for this mess. Help us in this process by asking the monopolised ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order, hon member, your time has expired.

Mr D MNGUNI: ... big businesses to assist in black townships ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order!

Mr D MNGUNI: ... and rural areas with education to share skills

...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon member!

Mr D MNGUNI: ... rather than being big mouths here ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon Mnguni!

Mr D MNGUNI: ... and disturb our learners writing exams with that ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon Mnguni! Your time has expired! [Interjections.] Hon members, this is a debate; let’s engage one another with ideas.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon members, this is a debate, let us engage one another with ideas. You may proceed, hon member.

Mr E M BUTHELEZI: Chairperson, at the outset I would like to take this opportunity to thank my leader, hon Prince Mangosuthu Buthelezi, and all members of the Inkatha Freedom Party for the faith they have placed in me to come into this House not only to represent the constituency needs and concerns of the IFP at the

national platform, but to also serve the national needs and concerns of the people of South Africa.

Chairperson, the Inkatha Freedom Party has always championed the policy of education for liberation. As far back as 1976, in the wake of the Soweto uprising when supporters of the armed struggle were calling for quote liberation now, education later, the IFP juxtaposed this position with the slogan called education for liberation. We stated it then and we remain decisively of the opinion that today education is the only universal tool for liberation, emancipation, human growth and development. However, when looking at the current status quo and service delivery challenges in both our Basic and Higher Education sectors, we see a future for our children that is strewn with dashed hopes and broken dreams.

Skills development and innovative thinking, which is now so desperately needed as we hurtle towards the fourth industrial revolution, is premised upon solid Basic and Higher Education service delivery. Private Universities are mushrooming because of the current crisis in the public higher education sector. As

we have seen yesterday, the ANC despite its previous electioneering promises will not be able to deliver universal free education. Where does this place those who cannot afford to attend one of the top performing private universities? It places them between the devil and the deep blue sea and only perpetuates elitism of the select few who can afford tertiary fees, whilst the poverty stricken masses remain exactly where they are, the unfortunate victims of a failed state.

Chairperson, the statement of quality education being a fundamental tenet for the attainment of a developmental state is a given. It is the State that must provide and is duty bound to do so. South Africa is failing its children and in so doing, failing itself. Delivery of quality education is a primary factor in achieving all of our developmental goals as a country. Let us not waiver in this solemn responsibility as a country.

Thank you very much.

Mr M S MABIKA: Chairperson, our highly respected and much beloved President, Nelson Mandela, said and I quote: Education is the most powerful weapon which you can use to change the

world. It is sad that we have not applied his wisdom here in South Africa to change our society for the better over the past

23 years of democracy.

Chairperson, the NFP agrees that a developmental state must indeed have quality education, skills development and innovation if it is to achieve progress, growth and development. It is a noble goal to aspire to. However, the best intentions are often meaningless if there is no will power to reach out and make the goal a reality. Quality education, skills development and innovation are interlinked and failure in one of these components will have a negative effect on the others. Basic Education in South Africa is currently in a deepening crisis and political incompetence lies at the root of this crisis. We just need to look at the state of basic education in KwaZulu-Natal as an example to see that we are not even close to reaching our goal of quality education.

Yes, we have quality education for some, notably for those who can afford it, but Chairperson, the majority of learners in KwaZulu-Natal are condemned to second class education which is

failing dismally to prepare them for the rigorous demands of the adult world. The problem does not lie with the content of the education it lies with the way the education system is managed. In KwaZulu-Natal, for example, nutrition suppliers have not been paid since July when they were appointed. Many children rely on the school nutrition for their only meal of the day and we all know that a hungry child cannot concentrate, cannot learn and cannot grow.

Moreover Chairperson, many schools in KwaZulu-Natal are still waiting for their Learning and Teaching Support materials, LTSM, funds for next year. The NFP is concerned that if this situation is not attended to urgently we are at risk of starting schools next year with no textbooks or stationery for our poorest of the poor learners. Surely, this is not quality education. Finally, the NFP believes that we have to reconsider our mother tongue education policy. Quality education is not a one size fits all concept. Quality education has to be shaped to suit the needs of society and to maximize on the resources available.

Chairperson, let us look at China as an example. Within the space of a few decades, it has transformed from a developmental state to a leading international superpower. China did not embrace a foreign language as a medium of instructions in its schools; it retained mother tongue education as part of its quality education mix. Thank you. [Time expired.]

Ms C N MAJEKE: Hon Chair and hon members, on Wednesday 27 September 2017, the statistician general, Dr Lehohla, confirmed that South Africa is skills deficient. Accordingly, the UDM believes that without an educated population, South Africa cannot progress towards a developmental state. We need to work collectively and restructure our education systems so that it is a seamless and integrated system from the Early Childhood Development stage to the tertiary level.

Currently we have a disintegrated system that lacks proper interface thus producing less skilled people and more drop outs. Even those that make it and graduate with a degree, their destination is the ever growing number of unemployed graduates. Efforts by parents to see their children progress are

unfortunately not matched by government as there is still not enough supply of classrooms and the financially inaccessible education. Adding to the budget constraints is administration and corruption that compounds the problem.

The lack of capacity and quality challenges in government’s public schools has given rise to a new challenge that of the emergence of private schools market. For a developmental state, we need to decisively address the extreme inequalities characterising our education system. Chairperson, we must be a country that produces knowledge for its socioeconomic and political development. We must find a new pact that transcends political choices of origin, united by a common desire and goal to address the challenge of a nation that has a shortage of skills. If we fail, we must accept that the generations to come will never forget and forgive us. In noting the Report of the Commission of Inquiry into the Higher Education, we reject the Report’s recommendation that income contingency loans be adopted as the new funding model, as this commodifies education. Such a system will create a large number of young graduates who are

debt-trapped long before they even get an opportunity to earn an income.

South Africa’s unscrupulous banks will be cash flushed by charging students exorbitant fees and interest rates on risk free loans. Chairperson, while we welcome the recommendations on Technical and Vocational Education and Training, Tvet, colleges sector, we are concerned that throwing money at the challenge without addressing the structural challenges will compound the problem. Finally, UDM says that the government should fund fee free quality education by downsizing its executive, putting an end to the ever increasing wasteful, irregular and fruitless expenditure and closing the tap on illicit financial flows, amongst others. I thank you.

Dr P W A MULDER: Chairperson, what can we learn from wise people from the past about today’s topic?

Confucius was a Chinese teacher, politician, and philosopher. He said, if your plan is for one year, plant rice; if your plan is

for 10 years, plant trees; if your plan is for 100 years, educate children.

Our educational system is in trouble. In a league table of education systems drawn up in 2015 by the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development, OECD, countries, South Africa ranks 75th out of 76. In one of the latest studies of Trends in International Mathematics and Science Study, TIMSS – a test sat by 580 000 pupils in 57 countries – South Africa was near the bottom of the rankings.

With all our resources, we are behind several African countries in poorer parts of the continent.

Why is that?

A shocking 27% of South African pupils who have attended school for six years cannot read, compared with 4% in Tanzania and 19% in Zimbabwe. Only 37% of children starting school in South Africa go on to pass the matriculation exam, and just 4% earn a degree.

And yet money is not the reason for the malaise. Few countries spend as much to so little effect. In South Africa, public spending on education is 6,4% of GDP. The average share in European countries is 4,8%.

I believe there are two reasons for all this. And I’ve got little time ...

Firstly, central to our problems and failures is the SA Democratic Teachers Union, Sadtu. A lack of computers and lack of science laboratories are often given as reasons for our educational problems. I have heard from many dysfunctional schools that these factors are the reason for our problems.

Let me tell you, I have never seen a dysfunctional school, but I have seen and met many dysfunctional principals. In any normal situation, such a principal would have been disciplined and fired but, because of Sadtu, it is almost impossible to get rid of such lazy and dysfunctional principals.

In Limpopo, I can take you to schools with no laboratories or computer centres but with very good matric results. Why? Because of a capable and functional principal.

The role of Sadtu was laid bare in a report published in May by John Volmink, an academic. The report found widespread corruption and abuse. This included teachers paying union officials for plum jobs.

Let me get to my second reason, which is the universal principle of the superior value of mother-tongue instruction. Dr Neville Alexander, an ex-Robben Islander, demonstrates in various articles how bad it is for children who do not have English as their home language to become slaves of English when they go to school.

This is not a political argument but an educational one. [Time expired.]

Ms D CARTER: Thank you, Speaker ... Ag sjoe! I’ve just promoted you, Chairperson!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon Carter, the clock is ticking.

Ms D CARTER: Chairperson, judging by the empty benches here today it is clear how important the attainment of a developmental state is to the ruling party.

The National Development Plan, NDP, puts it that South Africa needs to build a state that is capable of playing a developmental and transformative role. The message is clear: If you want a developmental state, you first and foremost need a capable state.

But a capable state does not materialise by decree, nor can it be legislated or waved into existence by declarations. It must be built, brick by brick, institution by institution, and sustained and rejuvenated over time.

Three priorities stand out if the objectives of the NDP are to be realised, and these are: the need for increased employment through faster economic growth; improving the quality of

education and skills development; and building the capacity of the state to play a developmental and transformative role.

If the NDP represents our national strategic plan, then the subject matter for discussion should be less about the statement that informs it and more about what progress has been made, if any.

We know that unemployment is rising faster than economic growth to the point where many argue that Mr Zuma and his cabal are purposefully intent on collapsing the economy and capturing our resources. We know that much of the state has been captured and repurposed for the corrupt ends of a mafia with the President at its apex and, as such, has been incapacitated and rendered weak, feeble and incapable.

And we know ...

Mr J J SKOSANA: Point of order, Chairperson.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order, hon Carter. Yes, hon member, what is your point of order?

Mr J J SKOSANA: Hon Chairperson, I rise on Rule 84. The hon member is casting aspersions on the President when she talks about the collapse of the country’s economy. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order! Hon member, indeed, the point is sustained. If you want to put a substantive motion, you should do so. Continue.

Ms D CARTER: Much of our education system has, yes, also been captured — captured by the ANC’s alliance partner, the SA Democratic Teachers’ Union, Sadtu. The Jobs for Cash report found that Sadtu officials had captured our basic education system in six provinces. Let that sink in! North West, KwaZulu- Natal, Gauteng, Limpopo, Mpumulanga and the Eastern Cape have been captured by Sadtu.

It is now evident that the State Security Agency has been involved in and has been bankrolling the FeesMustFall campaign

and that one of its operatives was none other than the boyfriend of Mr Zuma’s daughter — who also happens to be the mastermind behind Mr Zuma’s fees legacy project.

And former Higher Education Minister Nzimande is now alleging the involvement of some of his comrades in the fuelling of student protests as part of the factional battles within the ANC and its alliance. Connecting the dots leads straight to one person, and that person is the President.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order!

Ms D CARTER: What is clear is that ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon Carter!

Ms D CARTER: ... Mr Zuma and his ANC must go if we are to improve our education.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon Carter, your time has expired.

Ms C DUDLEY: Chairperson, a developmental state has been described as a model of capitalism in which the state has more control over the economy through strong state intervention as well as through extensive regulation and planning.

Interestingly, while many South Africa state with conviction that they do not want increased state intervention and control, people across all parties continue to call on government for increased intervention in so many aspects of our lives.

Now, whether we want a developmental state or not, we all want quality education and skills development. South Africa consistently allocates a higher proportion of its budget to education than the US, the UK and Germany, yet we seem unable to catch up with demands and problems continue to escalate.

While the independent commission set up by President Jacob Zuma has made recommendations on funding alternatives, among other things, these are unlikely to solve all the problems and creative solutions are a necessity, like the suggestion, for example, which includes primary and high school education that

we embrace current digital technologies for wide-scale online learning.

The online model would free the system from the need to produce vast numbers of quality mathematics and science teachers, and the focus would be on producing education managers instead.

Although the initial setup would be costly, the running costs are much lower and more efficient than classrooms.

The ACDP notes that the University of the Free State now offers 100% online Advanced Certificates in Teaching and English. To quote Professor Daniella Coetzee-Manning —

Our education system is producing students who are completely ill-equipped to deal with the complexities of quantitative analytics which, together with qualitative communication, is said by the World Economic Forum to be the two skill sets essential for survival in our post-Fourth Industrial Revolution world.

Perhaps it is time for our education system to take a leap into a brave new educational world of large-scale online education that can provide quality, skills development and innovation as a fundamental tenet, giving our youth the chances they deserve in the attainment of a developmental state. Thank you.

Mr L M NTSHAYISA: The long-awaited Heher Commission fees report has been released and it coincides with this debate. The AIC has carefully studied this report and our contribution to this debate will primarily revolve around it.

Hon Chair, the provision of quality education is enshrined in the Constitution. The function of a literate society is a nagging nightmare to grinding poverty, inequality and unemployment. Education is fundamental, as it pursues a developmental and national building agenda. The AIC is a proponent of quality education, coupled with the state-sponsored funding programmes, aimed at empowering the poor of our communities.

Our policy framework on quality education is anchored in the fundamental right to economic and social justice. The Heher fees report offers some solution to this debate. It requires the state to guarantee study loans. The AIC is consulting on the practical possibility of the Income Contingency Loans.

Hon Chair, the National Aid Financial Scheme, NSFAS is an important driver in the scheme of free, quality education. It has been able to live up to the constitutional edifice of our democracy, bringing about structured funding programmes to our students. Therefore, we oppose the idea of dismantling NSFAS. It should be changed from being a loan to a bursary.

The platitudes around free education cannot be sustained. Our view is that free, quality education is achievable to the extent that it delineates between deserving poor students and those who can afford. The South African economy is stagnant, and is likely to shed more jobs as the state grapples with the state of unemployment, portfolio outflows and foreign direct investment.

Hon Chairperson, the attainment of a developmental state is a goal that needs us all to work towards its achievement.

Education should play an important role in this regard. A successful nation is a nation that cares about education. To achieve this goal, quality free education, the relevant skills and innovations should be provided and these should be offered at our institutions. Thank you very much. [Time expired.]

Ms N I TARABELLA-MARCHESI: Chairperson, I believe that we are all created the same and capable of doing well with enormous potential to succeed. However, South Africa’s political past is one of gross inequality and restricted access to education resources and opportunities.

South Africans continue to struggle in a two-tier education system characterised by disparities between those who have and those who have not. We have made progress by providing a meal a day at school to those in need, but in the past months I have been struck by the reality of what some of our learners have to go through everyday.

I hope to further create awareness of the shortage of scholar transport in our country and to understand the challenges learners face in accessing quality education. In August I walked for 10km to Ukuthula High School deep in the valleys of Sangcwaba village, in Ubuhlebezwe Municipality in KZN with learners.

Yesterday we accompanied learners who walk for 6km from their homes to Arran Primary School in Bethlehem, Free State. This is a small farm school that is a catchment for learners who can’t be admitted to schools near their homes due to shortage of schools at Bohlokong township. This school accommodates learners from six years to 17 years, including learners with learning disabilities, despite having no special resources.

On Sunday I was told that one of the learners who walk to school was raped on her way to school by an adult male from the area.

This resulted in her contracting HIV. The incident had so much devastating effects on her that she is now unable to cope at school.

We arrived the following morning at 5am at the home of the two learners as they were preparing themselves to go to school. They did not have breakfast, and I actually doubt if they had supper the previous night. This appears to be common to those who live at Bohlokong township as there is high unemployment and many are grant dependents.

On the walk to school we crossed two dangerous provincial roads where cars were travelling at 120km per hour. When I asked the principal why they don’t have learner transport, he said that according to the Free State policy, learners who live in the township and attend farm school cannot be provided with learner transport. This is a clear indication that policies are made by people who sit in air-conditioned offices and have no idea of the challenges communities have to overcome. [Applause.]

South Africa needs an agile government that is responsive to the needs of the society and makes policies relevant to the challenges on the ground. Provinces must take responsibility for learner transport and allocate enough funds to address this problem.

Deputy Minister, we welcome progress made in providing one meal a day and this works in certain communities, but it does not address the hunger experienced by the learners at Arran Primary School because that is the only meal learners receive per day. One can just imagine what happens during school holidays.

These children do not get the same opportunity to achieve and thrive like other learners do. Opportunities for them are not likely to get any better in higher education. We are crying out for guidance from the President and the government. Instead of developing a considered, measured funding policy, the President is writing policy back of a napkin as directed by a friend of his daughters.

How will he explain to the children around the country that he is planning to cut the budget for building schools when they are desperately needed? We have to create a society in which opportunities exist for our young people, not only to imagine a different future, but also craft opportunities for themselves within this future. Politicians in government can create enabling environments for this to take place.

At the moment the only source of opportunities is through patronage. Opportunities are strangled by corruption, crime and lack of basic services that enslaves the imaginative minds of our young people in daily struggles for survival.

As the DA, we believe that an opportunity society is one in which every individual is afforded the opportunity to take advantage of their rights and freedoms in order to determine their own destiny. In an opportunity society your prospects are not determined by demographics or the circumstances of your birth, but by your talent and effort brought to bear on the opportunities you are afforded. Such a society is characterised by freedom that allows young minds to imagine and create better futures for themselves.

Our young people must demand this from all our governments in every province in the country. Where there is no response, you have a responsibility to yourselves to use your majority as the youth to vote for change.

I have heard many young people saying that they are not interested in politics or voting. This is sad because politics determines every aspect of your life, from the basic services you receive, the education you get, and the economic opportunities you are afforded. A government that is corrupt steals opportunities and makes poor people poorer. [Time expired.] [Applause.]

Ms S MCHUNU: Good evening members, let me appreciate this opportunity afforded to me by the ANC to take part in today’s debate. The issue of skills is a societal matter and requires the involvement of all stakeholders. We all are required to put our hands on the plough and work together to ensure that there are adequate and relevant skills to grow our economy. This is necessary to eradicate the triple challenges of poverty, unemployment and inequality.

Hon members, I want also to use this profound opportunity to thank the ANC government for its dedication and concerted effort in developing and improving the skills base, since taking over in 1994. Indeed, the repealing of all divisive apartheid

legislation that prevented the majority of our citizens to realise their potential was a step in the right direction. The Constitution in section 2, the Bill of Rights, guarantees the right of every individual to attain basic education and training. However, we are still battling with the legacies of the cruel apartheid system that manifest themselves mainly in education and training. Hon Mkhaliphi and hon Mulder, I hope you will bear with us.

Hon members, South Africa like many other countries with developing economies is battling with the issue of skills and is working tirelessly to find the right remedy to address this issue. Skills development is critical especially for our youth, this has also been reiterated by His Excellency President Jacob Zuma, I quote:

Investing in South Africa’s youth and paying particular attention to their skills development is a key to the country’s future economic growth.

Members, the world is not static and with advent of technology and internet in South Africa we cannot lack behind. There is a need to up-skill and equip the current workforce with requisite skills that will enable them to participate meaningfully and be efficient, effective and productive in their working environment. As I have indicated our country has indeed made huge strides in putting new policy frameworks for education and training. Access to education and training has been broadened and a significant growth in the enrolment and graduation numbers of the previously marginalised, in particular blacks and women.

We still have a long way to go to overcome specific challenges experienced by the majority of our people, especially people living with disabilities, and women in some institutions. These challenges include racism, unwelcoming institutional culture to students and staff, language of teaching and learning, industry owned by the minority not opening up their workplaces for on the job training and apprentices for students who have completed their theory at both universities and technical vocational education and training, Tvets, colleges, inadequate teaching and learning infrastructure at post-school education and training,

Pset, ageing professoriate and artisans, social partners to the National Skills Accord not coming to the party, to mention but a few.

The National Development Plan, NDP, clearly articulates that some of the direct and immediate measures to attack poverty are to create or increase employment and broaden opportunities through education, vocational training and work experience. The NDP notes that the colleges are the backbone of the technical and vocational education and training and they should be strengthened to become institutions of choice. The plan has set a target of 30 000 artisans per year by 2030. Our government through the Department of Higher Education and Training has invested a lot in the Tvet sector. A number of steering mechanism frameworks and policies have been developed to ensure proper performance reporting, financial management, qualification development, information technology in the Tvet sector, partnerships with industry, and secondment of lecturers from the industry to colleges as well as college lecturers to the industry for work exposure. We believe that all these policies will address the shortcomings within the sector.

The DA member was grandstanding here, hon Ollis, today by raising issues related to infrastructure of which they know very well with those who serve in Portfolio Committee on Higher Education that we are dealing with those. In any way a number of plans and infrastructure development processes were explained to us here with regards to the Department of Basic Education. The DA and the EFF are deceiving the citizens of this country by claiming that they care about them while they are not.

*IsiZulu:*

Thola ukuthi siyanibuka nje.

*English:*

They can claim, but they cannot be an alternative to the African National Congress. They rejected the report containing recommendations ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order, hon Mchunu! Can you take a seat? What is the point of order, Mme?

Ms N V MENTE: The point of order is that the speaker on the podium is misleading the country by saying that the EFF does not want free quality education. You provide free quality education and we will support you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order, hon member! Order! Hon Mente, I don’t think that is what the speaker said. All what she said is that you are deceiving the nation by saying that you care about them. There was no mention of exactly what is it in that. I think it’s a point of debate and members are debating.

Let’s allow the debate to proceed. Hon Mkhaliphi, what is the point of order?

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: Chairperson, point of order, I think the hon member must withdraw that.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): No.

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: She can’t speak on behalf of the EFF.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order!

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: She does not know what the EFF is standing for. We are the poorest of the poor organisation.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon member! Hon Mkhaliphi!

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: We stand on the side of the poor ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon Mkhaliphi, can you please take your seat?

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: The ANC rejected the nationalisation of Banks and the DA ... [Interjections.]

Mr L M NTSHAYISA: Don’t bring this House to the mayhem.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon Mkhaliphi! Order, hon members! I said early in the debate that this is a political debate. Let’s engage one another on ideas. We may differ, but we have got points to raise, each one of us and members across the

board have been making statements about each other’s party and their view of parties. I think that let’s just allow the debate. Let’s engage one another. Order! Continue, hon member.

*IsiXhosa:*

Mr L M NTSHAYISA: Nyamezelani mawethu, nyamezelelani.

Ms N V MENTE: Chairperson!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon member, what is it that you want me to know?

Ms N V MENTE: I do respect your ruling, Chair, but what I’m saying is that we can’t allow here to distort the EFF because she is not a member of the EFF. Therefore, she must stick to her speech.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon member, I appreciate a bit of robustness, but actually there was nothing mentioned other than saying that you mislead the public. However, as to the content let’s not debate it and let’s allow the member to

continue. If we want a debate we can have the debate later. At the moment, there is no casting aspersion on anything. Proceed hon member on the platform.

Ms S MCHUNU: Thank you, Chair.

Ms M KHAWULA: Point of order.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): What is the point of order, Mme?

*IsiZulu:*

Ms M KHAWULA: Bengithi umhlonishwa lo akajwayele ukuthi uma ezokhuluma azi ukuthi uzokhuluma ngani. Angagibeli phezu kwendlu yesonto. Usugibela phezu kwendlu yesonto manje wena.

*English:*

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Mma Khawula, fortunately I know IsiZulu and I don’t think on a debate we need to threaten one another. Let’s just allow the debate and engage each other. Yes, hon member, what is the point of order?

Mr J J SKOSANA: Point of order, House Chair. I rise on a point of order under Rule 68 the relevancy while all the speakers that are talking here are irrelevant on a topic they are debating here.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon member, thank you very much, but these are not speakers, they are raising points order on which I’ve ruled on. Can you proceed, hon Mchunu?

Ms S MCHUNU: They rejected the report containing recommendations to address the budget shortfall within the Tvet sector, so as to ensure that there is proper infrastructure for skills development and workshops. How can you stand here and pretend that you have the interests of our people at heart? I hope the youth of this country has taken note of the two-faced DA and EFF. As members of the Portfolio Committee on Higher Education and Training, Tvet college students and many other stakeholders were ... [Interjections.]

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: Chair, can we be protected please, because this member won’t finish the speech if you are not going to protect us.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): About what, hon member?

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: She’s busy attacking us. What two faces is she talking about?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon members, can we proceed with the debate?

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: No, Chair, please tell her to stop attacking the EFF that’s ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon members, Order! Hon members! Wait, I haven’t ruled on the debate. Let’s not have many points of orders. Can you please take a seat? I want to remind members as I said earlier that points of order and reality as we know about procedures ... hon members can we

proceed with the debate? No, hon Buthelezi, can you please take your seat hon Mchunu must proceed with her debate.

*IsiZulu:*

Nks M KHAWULA: Kodwa umhlonishwa uMnchunu useqhuba intwala ngewisa. Awuhlukane nathi manje.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon Mma Khawula! You know hon members I think that all of us, indeed, have different points of view on matters, but I don’t think we should degenerate to a point of nonrespect. Continue, hon Mchunu.

Ms S MCHUNU: As members of the Portfolio Committee on Higher Education and Training, Tvet college students and many other stakeholders were concerned about the relevancy of the qualifications offered by our Tvet colleges. I am pleased to inform this august House today that the Quality Council for Trades and Occupations as a quality assurer is also working hard to ensure curriculum relevance that responds to the needs of the labour market. The Quality Council for Trades and Occupations, QCTO, has partnered with industry and social partners to develop

priority occupational qualifications that support renewable energy developments, car manufacturing industry, ocean economy and transportation industry.

The SA Qualifications Authority, SAQA, has developed a policy on the recognition of prior learning as well as policy guidelines for implementation, which will go a long way in levelling the playing field and address the inequalities of the past. Those who have acquired technical skills and experience through on the job training are assessed and awarded full or part qualifications to enable them to fully participate in the economy.

With regard to the Sector Education and Training Authorities, Setas, they have also made huge strides. The Setas have played a very major role in bridging the gap between the world of education and training and workplace. Through disbursing the funds to training institutions, the Setas have ensured that between 2015-16 and 2016-17 financial years, 349 788 work-based opportunities were created, 59 454 new artisan learners were enrolled, 79% of new artisan learners were self-employed. Let me

indicate that the Indlela is making tremendous progress and has been exceeded its target of 52% by 3% on its trade testing.

Significant progress has been made in the implementation of the National Skills Development Strategy III by the department, Setas and the National Skills Fund. The National Skills Authority has published reports on the implementation of the National Skills Development Strategy, NSDS, III. The ANC government has identified tourism as the new gold for South Africa’s economy. New skills would be required to address the needs of these new sectors. We urge the Culture Arts Tourism Hospitality & Sport Sector Education and Training Authority, Cathsseta, to develop skills that would ensure growth in the tourism sector as well as to create more employment ... [Interjections.] ... yes.

Hon Buthelezi, let me clarify the point you made about free education. Free education for the poor is the ANC policy, neh. Members, our government has heard the concerns of the youth of this country in regard to commodification of higher education. In response, the President appointed the Heher Commission to

look into the issue of funding for the whole Pset sector in order to find a suitable funding model. In the past few weeks, pressure has mounted from all sectors, calling for the President to release the report. This was despite the plea by the President to be afforded time to consider the findings and recommendations, so as to make an informed pronouncement that will take into consideration all the proposals. Indeed, the same people who are criticising the President for releasing the report without government pronouncement forgot that they are the ones who pushed to summon the submission of the report and also applied for the Promotion of Access to Information Act to compel the release of the report. The President has established the Inter-Ministerial Committee to come up with a new funding model. I urge all of us to exercise patience in this regard.

Hon Mabika, our focus was on skills development and innovation and not your obsession with the KwaZulu-Natal Department of Education. I think that you don’t understand the NFP policy.

Maybe you should ask hon Emam ...

*IsiZulu:*

... yena uyibambile ngqi.

*English:*

Hon Carter

Mr M S MABIKA: Chairperson ...

*IsiZulu:*

... umhlonishwa ngolwazi oluncane ngezemfundo angawuthatha yini umbuzo?

*English:*

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon Mchunu, can you answer the question?

*IsiZulu:*

Nks S MCHUNU: Uma sengiqedile, lunga elihloniphekile.

*English:*

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): You can take a seat.

Ms S MCHUNU: Hon Carter, you overwork yourself, I feel pity for you. You must just relax, you are always mourning.

*IsiZulu:*

Hhayi uyakhathaza.

*English:*

The DA member, Tarabella, the nutrition programme and the learner transport programme, those are the ANC policies. They were not there during the apartheid era.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: House Chairperson, the hon member is the hon member of this House and she is either hon Marchesi or Mrs Marchesi. She is not DA member Tarabella.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon member, you need to correct that, indeed, the point is sustained.

Ms S MCHUNU: Okay, hon Marchesi.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Yes.

Ms S MCHUNU: Yes, that DA member.

Ms D CARTER: Hon Chairperson, can someone please just give a speaker some water.

*IsiZulu:*

Nks S MCHUNU: Awuthule. Awuthule!

*English:*

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon member on the podium, it is not for you to answer, the member is talking to the Chair. Can you please proceed with your point of order? Proceed with your statement.

Ms S MCHUNU: Okay. I was just saying to hon Marchesi ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): I think that she heard on that one.

Ms S MCHUNU: ... the nutrition programme and the learner transport, those are the ANC programmes my dear ... [Interjections.] ... yes, they are ANC programmes and they were not there during the apartheid era ... [Interjections.] ... whatever. Those did not exist during the apartheid era. That’s what I want ... remember that we are dealing with the legacy of apartheid, but you don’t see any good in what the ANC is doing

... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon member! Order! Hon Mchunu! Hon Ntshayisa, I hear, can you please take a point? Hon Mchunu, you are debating and you are not supposed to debate with members. You are addressing the Chair making your point. What is the order hon Ntshayisa?

Mr L M NTSHAYISA: Chairperson, can I plead with the hon members not to allow this House to go back to mayhem. Mayhem is a place of confusion, danger and everything ... [Interjections.]

Ms S MCHUNU: Hon members, let me reiterate that education and training is a societal issue and all of us we should get

involved. It is not going to assist this country to grandstand on issues of education. I thank you. [Applause.]

Mr G S RADEBE: Chairperson, I rise on Rule 92(3)(a) and (b) that any hon member who wants to raise a point must be able to quote the relevant rule and also be able to listen to you, Chair. If any member doesn’t want to follow the rules that is pointed out, the Rule point (3)(b) says that a member must be told to sit down or else must leave out the House. Thank you, Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon member, thank you very much. Order! Hon Mabika, can you take a seat? Hon member, you quoted the rule correctly and it applies to all members in the House and I will really plead that all of us collectively from both sides of the House must remember that rule because in all instances a member stands up and they don’t draw the attention of the Chair on procedural matters, they actually deal with the debate. Therefore, I am very happy that you are quoting that rule reminding all of us here on what we must do. I will now allow us to proceed. Hon Mabika!

Mr M S MABIKA: Chairperson ...

*IsiZulu:*

... umhlonishwa lo osuka lakho obekade ecula ngento angayazi ... [Ubuwelewele.]

*English:*

Mr S N BUTHELEZI: What rule, Chair, is he rising on?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order, hon Buthelezi! Can you please take a seat? Hon Mabika!

*IsiZulu:*

Mnu M S MABIKA: ... ukuthi uma eseqedile uzowuthatha umbuzo futhi isikhathi sakhe asiphelanga. Bekufanele ukuthi afeze isithembiso sakhe, ukuze azoyeka ukukhuluma ngento angayazi.

*English:*

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon member, you can engage each other outside on that debate. Hon Johnson, can you please proceed?

Mr M JOHNSON: Chairperson, thank you very much to all the contributors to this very important debate, safe for Mr Ollis, who perhaps need to be reminded about the theme for the debate, which is about the provision of quality education, skills development and innovation is a fundamental tenet for the attainment of a developmental state and not what we have heard here from Mr Ollis.

He contradicts himself obviously, as usual, by contesting that there is no need for such, yet he encourages training and retraining for the teachers. Contradicting himself is what he does best.

We remain focused in changing the lives of our people for the better through vision 2030 by denting unemployment, poverty, and inequality.

Ms Mkhaliphi from the EFF speaks as if you she is an Australian. Very quickly, perhaps, what I can share with you is this that ask not what South Africa can do for you but what is it that you can do for South Africa.

When COPE started, it called itself COPE but a fake and a crumbled one. Now, it is demonstrating in practice of a need for shared 2030 vision. That is what COPE continued to be. From its inception it crumbled as it is crumbling, from 25 members to three members.

Ms D CARTER: Correction, 37 members.

Mr M JOHNSON: Ms Tarabella-Marchesi from DA, spoke about the haves and the have nots. You talked about those that continue to find our country in this situation we are in. We are in a programme to reverse those imbalances. We take serious concern of what shall have happened to the young person from a school at Bethlehem and wishing her a speedy recovery.

These are the kinds of things, which under normal circumstances, when our country was not oppressed, when we were a free country, which took us 342 years for us to be free. Had things being normal, had there been no colonialism, no apartheid from a number of those that are seated here, whose forefathers and forebears have subjected to that young child to have been

walking six kilometres away from school. If we didn’t have such, that child I am so sure, she shouldn’t have gone through what she has gone through to be raped.

We want to send our frank apologies, to the family and the victim herself that she should really go through a speedy recovery.

The ANC once again is convinced that in order to improve the lives of our people for the better, vision 2030, that seeks to bring about away inequality, poverty, and unemployment, indeed, we are on course, come 2030 with improved skills that seeks to make sure that ours is a developmental state and as I said, which seeks to do away with all the legacies that we shall have been subjected to over 342 years. I thank you. [Applause.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon members, I do hope at one stage as this House, we will be able to debate issues as South Africans from a common interest. All of you said very good important points but at times we do a lot of filibustering and lose the essence of advancing the important debates and I hope

we will gradually learn because this is a matter in my view which combines all of us to be able to find solutions for this country’s future.

This concludes the debate on this subject. Hon member, you have done a lot of points of orders which took your time but we have an agenda that must be followed, regardless that it is 19:15, we still have to do motions without notice, member’s statements, and motions. Wow. Okay, we are all ready and it is a Tuesday today, nobody is going anywhere. Let us start.

Debate concluded.

# LUVO MANYONGA CROWNED THE SPORTS STAR OF THE YEAR AT THE SA SPORTS AWARDS IN KEMPTON PARK

(Draft Resolution)

Mr J J SKOSANA: House Chairperson, the ANC moves without notice:

That the House -

1. notes that the world long jump champion, Luvo Manyonga, was crowned the Sports Star of the Year at the South African Sports Awards in Kempton Park on Sunday, 12 November 2017;
2. understands that the South African long jump hero also beat the likes of Wayde van Niekerk and Chad le Clos to claim the Sport Star of the Year accolade;
3. believes that this award topped a stellar year of the horizontal jumper, in which he had broken the South African record twice before winning his maiden world title;
4. remembers that he set the sandpit alight in 2017, leaping over 8,6m on four occasions, where he first broke Khotso Mokoena’s national mark with a jump of 8,6m in Pretoria, in March, before winning the South African title with a jump of 8,6m in April;
5. recalls that he completed the winning streak over a full calendar year over 10 meetings before finishing the year off with the Diamond League Trophy in the long jump; and
6. congratulates Luvo Manyonga on winning the Sports Star of the Year Award. [Time expired.]

Agreed to.

# ORGANISATION CALLED MOSAIC WAS ESTABLISHED BY ROLENE MILLER

(Draft Resolution)

Mr M BAGRAIM: I hereby move on behalf of the DA without notice:

That the House –

1. notes that the organisation called Mosaic, which was established in 1993 by Rolene Miller, is an organisation with an in-depth understanding of and expertise in

violence against women, domestic violence, sexual violence, and sexual reproductive health;

1. further notes that it is a community-based, nongovernmental organisation for the specific focus on preventing and reducing abuse and domestic violence, particularly for women and youth living in disadvantaged communities;
2. understands that Mosaic’s main objectives include increased availability and accessibility to high quality, integrated services for survivors of abuse and domestic violence;
3. further understands that Rolene Miller started training grassroots women from targeted areas in July 1995, most of whom remain auxiliary workers and court workers in those same areas, while representing the vision and mission of Mosaic;
4. recalls that in 1996, a second group of women was trained as the need for services increased;
5. further recalls that Mosaic is unique and it is the first organisation in the Western Cape to start working with domestic violence complaints directly at the courts and Mosaic court workers were trained and worked in 16 domestic violence courts in the Cape Metropole and surrounding rural areas in Johannesburg and Pretoria; and
6. acknowledges that Rolene Miller, who established the organisation 25 years ago, was the first executive director and is still involved with the organisation and as an active member of the Board of Directors. [Time expired.]

Agreed to.

# REVOLUTIONARY DAY IN LIBYA

(Draft Resolution)

Ms H O MKALIPHI: House Chairperson, I hereby rise on behalf of the EFF without notice:

That this House –

1. notes that on this day, in 1969, the revolutionary government of Libya under the leadership of Colonel Gaddafi, nationalised all foreign-owned banks;
2. further notes that in the following year, all banks in Libya were state-owned;
3. acknowledges that with the state-owned banks and the nationalisation of other strategic sectors of the economy, Libya was able to achieve the highest standard of living on the African continent within a very short space of time;
4. further acknowledges that state-owned banks provided zero loans to all Libyans and help to ensure the country had

no foreign debts instead have reserves of over R2 trillion;

1. notes that in Libya, electricity was free, land and farming equipments was given to all those who wanted to farm, health care was free, education was free and all these were facilitated by the state-owned bank;
2. further notes that this social programmes allowed Libyans to live a life most South Africans could only ever dream;
3. acknowledges that if economic freedom and life of dignity for all South Africans is to be achieved, nationalisation of banks and other strategic sectors is required. Rest in peace Mohammed Gaddafi. [Time expired.]

Mr J J SKOSANA: Chairperson, the ANC object.

Ms H O MKALIPHI: Chairperson, I am not surprised. It is the ANC of today, who killed Gaddafi by enemy.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order, hon member.

# BRANDEN GRACE WON NEDBANK GOLF CHALLENGE IN SUN CITY

(Draft Resolution)

Ms Z C FAKU: The ANC move without notice:

That the House –

1. notes that on Sunday, 12 November 2017, Branden Grace won the Nedbank Golf Challenge in Sun City;
2. understands that the 29-year-old is the first home winner of South African’s biggest tournament dubbed Africa’s Major, since Trevor Immelman a decade ago;
3. acknowledges that Branden sank a 40-foot birdie putt on the 16th hole to set up a victory at the Nedbank Golf Challenge on Sunday as he carded a blistering final round

66 to win by a single shot from Britain’s Scott Jamieson;

1. recalls that the 29-year-old came from three shots back overnight at the Gary Player Country Club for an 11 under par total of 277, an eighth European Tour victory and

€1 million price in the penultimate event of the season; and

1. congratulates Branden Grace on his outstanding performance and wishes him well in the future matches.

Mr M N PAULSEN: Chairperson, the EFF, object to the bourgeois sports and snowballs.

The House CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order, hon member. Hon member!

# THE 2000 PEOPLE KILLED IN A BLAZE IN CLARE ESTATE, KWAZULU-NATAL

(Draft Resolution)

Mr N SINGH: Chairperson, I hereby move without notice on behalf of the IFP:

That the House –

1. notes with great concern the plight of almost 2000 people left homeless after a shack fire spread through Foreman Road informal settlement in Clare Estate, KwaZulu-Natal;
2. further notes that this fire was precipitated by a single fallen candle and that resident attacked firefighters and vandalised the fire hose that was being used to douse the flames;
3. acknowledges that this horrific fire took the life of a two-year-old child and others were hospitalised;
4. further acknowledges that fires that occur and spread in informal settlements are by and large due to improper municipal spatial planning;
5. appreciates the courageous efforts of the firefighters who risk their lives on a daily basis to save the lives and possession of others;
6. condemns the community violence against firefighters who were assaulted as the crew battled the blaze;
7. sends condolences to the families of those who have lost their loved ones; and
8. finally, calls upon the government to urgently intervene and undertake spatial planning audits in all of our informal settlements in order to identify potential fire hazards and take corrective action in ensuring the safety of lives and the health of residents in these areas.

Agreed to.

# A POWERFUL EARTHQUAKE, BETWEEN THE ISLAMIC REPUBLIC OF IRAN AND THE REPUBLIC OF IRAQ

(Draft Resolution)

Prof N M KHUBISA: House Chairperson, on behalf of the NFP, I move without notice:

That the House –

1. notes that a powerful earthquake, registering 7,3 on the Richter’s Scale has shook the mountainous border region between the Islamic Republic of Iran and the Republic of Iraq late on Sunday, 12 November 2017;
2. further notes that the epicentre of the earthquake occurred approximately 31km outside the eastern Iraqi city of Halabja and was felt as far away as Turkey, Pakistan, and Israel;
3. also notes that the confirmed death toll is currently 452 and rising, with more than 4000 people hurt and an unknown number of people missing, with the most widespread damage occurring in Iran;
4. finally notes that the earthquake has triggered more than

108 aftershocks and landslides which are hampering rescue efforts in the difficult mountainous areas which are affected; and

1. conveys its condolences to the people and governments of the Islamic Republic of Iran and the Republic of Iraq on the loss of lives and devastation caused by the earthquake.

Agreed to.

# UNITED NATIONS’ INTERNATIONAL DAY FOR TOLERANCE

(Draft Resolution)

Mr J J SKOSANA: House Chairperson, the ANC moves without notice:

That the House –

1. notes that the United Nations’ International Day for Tolerance is annually observed on November 16 to educate people about the need for tolerance in society and to help them understand the negative effects of intolerance;
2. further notes that this is a time for people to learn about respecting and recognising the rights and beliefs of others;
3. understands that discussions and debates take place across the world on this day, focusing on how various forms of injustice, oppression, racism and unfair discrimination have a negative impact on society;
4. recalls that human rights activists also use this day as an opportunity to speak out on human rights laws, especially with regard to banning and punishing hate crimes and discrimination against minorities;
5. acknowledges that the United Nations is committed to strengthening tolerance by fostering mutual understanding among cultures and people worldwide; and
6. calls upon countries to observe this day and use it to promote tolerance, respect and dignity.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Are there any objections?

Mr M N PAULSEN: We object and we object to the [Inaudible.] of the United Nations as well.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon members, if you object just say you object and not give all the reasons. Let us not pass interjections that are unparliamentary.

# GORDON BAY AND SIMON’S TOWN SUFFERED FIRE DAMAGES

(Draft Resolution)

Mr M L W FILTANE: I move without notice on behalf of the UDM:

That the House –

1. notes that Gordon’s Bay and Simon’s Town areas in Cape Town recently suffered fire damages, the same applies to the people of KwaZulu-Natal;
2. further notes that in Gordon’s Bay, the fire burnt houses, vehicles, factories, restaurant and music school; thus leaving some residents unemployed and short of facilities while the Navy in Simon’s Town lost about five magazines, store rooms and other facilities;
3. commends the 350 to 400 fire fighters who were working tirelessly in these areas throughout the night last Tuesday in order to contain the fire, with 210 from the City of Cape Town and the rest from other areas;
4. empathises with the business and homeowners who have suffered financial damages, and unemployed residents who will also suffer loss of income and be faced with poverty in the coming months and possibly years;
5. calls on the government, the local authority and citizens to continue supporting these areas in this period of sorrow, this includes even the people in KwaZulu-Natal; and
6. further calls on South African communities to ensure that they exercise measures that will keep them and the environment safe from these hazards, and be vigilant at all times.

Agreed to.

# BAFANA BAFANA FAILS TO QUALIFY FOR 2018 WORLD CUP

(Draft Resolution)

Mr M J FIGG: Hon House Chairperson, I hereby move on behalf of the DA:

That this House –

1. notes with great disappointment that Bafana Bafana failed to qualify for the 2018 World Cup in Russia next year;
2. also notes that Bafana Bafana was eliminated on Friday night, 10 November 2017, by Senegal;
3. notes that we empathise with the players in missing out on this great opportunity; and
4. calls on everyone to continue to support and give them the necessary encouragement for 2022.

Agreed to.

# FEES COMMISSION INTRODUCE LOAN SCHEMES BY PRIVATE SECTOR BANKS TO FUND STUDENTS WHO CANNOT AFFORD

(Draft Resolution)

Ms N V MENTE: House Chair, I hereby rise on behalf of the EFF:

That the House —

1. notes that the Fees Commission has scrapped NSFAS and introduced loan schemes by private sector banks to fund students who cannot afford and recommended a R50 billion for fee free TVET colleges education;
2. acknowledges that the Fees Commission has dismally failed to provide coherent, concrete and sustainable way forward for fee free education across all institutions of higher learning;
3. recognises that these recommendations imply a class segregation, where universities are destinations for the rich and TVET colleges are destinations for the poor, regardless of talent, hard work and constitutional right to study;
4. further acknowledges that the responsibility to educate young people must not be placed on a loan scheme from the private sector, for already indebted society and extremely exploited working class population;
5. appreciates that the duty to educate society cannot be entrusted with greedy banks that have demonstrated their inability to prioritise societal development above profits; and
6. rejects the report and instead focus this House’s resources in legislation reform that will enable South Africa to expand existing tax base.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Are there any objections?

Ms C DUDLEY: The ACDP objects to the political statement.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Objects to the political statement but not the motion? [Interjections.] Order! Hon Khawula. Hon Dudley, are you objecting to the motion? [Interjections.] There are objections; the motion will be converted to a notice of a motion. [Interjections.]

Ms N V MENTE: But House Chair, she objected to a political statement and I read a motion and not a political statement.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Thank you hon Mente, I asked again and she nodded that she was objecting to the motion.

Ms C DUDLEY: On the grounds that it is a political statement.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order! Hon members, an objection has been noted. ANC ... [Interjections.] Hon Khawula!

# LESETJA KGANYAGO AWARDED BUSINESS LEADER OF THE YEAR

(Draft Resolution)

Ms Z C FAKU: The ANC moves without notice:

That the House —

1. notes that the South African Reserve Bank Governor, Lesetja Kganyago, has been awarded Business Leader of the Year *at* the Sunday Times Top 100 Companies Awards*,*

which took place at the Empire venue in Parktown on 8 November 2017;

1. understands that the Sunday Times Top 100 Companies is where industry leaders gather to celebrate the JSE- listed companies that have performed well in delivering the highest shareholder returns over the past five years;
2. recognises that the Sunday Times Business Leader of the Year Award is considered to be the top accolade as recipients are decided by CEOs of the Sunday Times Top

100 Companies from the previous year;

1. remembers that Lesetja Kganyago is a South African economist and central banker who was appointed Governor on 6 October 2014;
2. recalls that recently he has been named Central Bank Governor of the Year for Sub-Saharan Africa, an accolade which affirms the good work of the bank; and
3. congratulates him on winning yet another prestigious award.

Agreed to.

# PASSING AWAY OF 8 YEAR BOY AFTER PARAMEDICS AMBUSHED EN ROUTE TO HOSPITAL

(Draft Resolution)

Mr J J SKOSANA: The ANC moves without notice:

That the House —

1. notes with sadness the death of an eight-year-old boy after the ambulance he was being transported in came under attack on the N2 highway on Wednesday 8 November 2017;
2. believes that the child was picked up early on Wednesday morning after he had been injured in a road collision;
3. further believes that the Western Cape government health ambulance, on its way to Red Cross War Memorial Children’s Hospital, was ambushed on Borcherds Quarry;
4. understands that the crew was gun pointed and robbed, and the ambulance was left immobile;
5. understands that the eight-year-old patient passed away due to the delay caused by the robbery;
6. condemns the increasing attacks on emergency medical service personnel while they are on duty; and
7. conveys condolences to the family of the deceased child.

Agreed to.

# AIC’S FLAGSHIP POVERTY ALLEVIATION INITIATIVE IN EASTERN CAPE

(Draft Resolution)

Mr S M JAFTA: House Chair, on behalf of the AIC I move without notice:

That this House —

1. records the continued work of the AIC through its flagship poverty alleviation initiative aimed at breaking the cycles of grinding poverty and despair among the locals in the Eastern Cape;
2. commends the campaign cheerleader, Mr Mandlenkosi Galo, who has coined the initiative “Umtu ngumtu ngabantu”;
3. further commends the AIC for adopting three families in Mnquma Local Municipality, in the Eastern Cape, under the leadership of iNkosi Tsipa in the area of Emzantsi; and
4. underscores the importance of this initiative, in that it has been instrumental in assisting families living in

abject poverty and Grade 12 learners who aspire to pursue their studies beyond high school.

Agreed to.

# REBURIAL OF UDF ACTIVIST, THOBILE LLYOD

(Draft Resolution)

Ms Z C FAKU: The ANC moves without notice:

That the House —

1. notes that on Saturday, 11 November 2017, one of the exhumed United Democratic Front, UDF, activists and freedom fighters, Thobile Lloyd, was laid to rest at a Heroes Acre in the Zwide cemetery;
2. understands that he was one of the seven UDF activists sentenced to death and hanged at Kgosi Mampuru Prison, formerly Pretoria Central between 1987 and 1989;
3. recalls that after almost 30 years buried in an unmarked grave in Mamelodi, in Pretoria, Lloyd’s remains were laid next to other political luminaries such as Govan Mbeki and Raymond Mhlaba in Port Elizabeth;
4. recognises that as part of a process of restoration and restitution, a government programme is being implementing a programme through which the remains of activists who were killed by the apartheid government are now being exhumed and repatriated for reburial in their ancestral homes;
5. believes that this reburial will bring closure to the families who had unanswered questions regarding the disappearance of their loved ones; and
6. conveys its condolences to the family of Thobile Lloyd.

Agreed to.

# WESTERN CAPE DEPARTMENT OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS WINS AWARDS AT THE NATIONAL GOVAN MBEKI HUMAN SETTLEMENTS AWARDS

(Draft Resolution)

Mr M R BARA: House Chairperson, I hereby move on behalf of the DA:

That this House —

1. notes that on Thursday, 9 November 2017, the National Govan Mbeki Human Settlements Awards were held at the Gallagher Estate in Johannesburg;
2. further notes that the awards are presented annually to recognise and appreciate extraordinary work done by national, provincial and local governments to ensure that our people have good, liveable and secured human settlements;
3. acknowledges that the Western Cape Department of Human Settlements won the Best Performing Province of the Year in Human Settlements Delivery;
4. further acknowledges that the Western Cape Department of Human Settlements also scooped the Best Social Housing Project Award; and
5. congratulates Minister Bonginkosi Madikizela and the Western Cape government on this achievement, and wishes them well in their pursuit of delivering better services to all.

Agreed to.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): I saw the Chair adding to your motion quietly. I am sure she will make another motion. She was saying, “In conjunction with KwaZulu-Natal”.

I am sure he was beating the drum for the Western Cape.

# PATRICE MOTSEPE RECEIVING SUNDAY TIMES LIFETIME ACHIEVER AWARD

(Draft Resolution)

Mr J J SKOSANA: House Chair, the ANC moves without notice:

That the House —

1. notes that the South African mining magnate and philanthropist, Dr Patrice Motsepe, received the Sunday Times Top 100 Companies Lifetime Achiever Award*,* a decision made by two independent panellists;
2. understands that the awards, said to be the most anticipated event of the year for South African businesses, took place in Johannesburg on 8 November 2017;
3. remembers that Motsepe is the founder and executive chairperson of African Rainbow Minerals, Non-executive

Chairperson of Harmony Gold Mining and Deputy Chairperson of Sanlam;

1. recalls that he has managed to grow a significant mining business through African Rainbow Minerals and, like titans before, is amid a diversification drive that has seen him moving into banking;
2. recognises that he became the first black partner in one of the big five law firms, Bowman Gilfillan in 1994;
3. recalls that he joined a philanthropic organization in 2013, The Giving Pledge, where he committed to donating half of his fortune toward charitable causes;
4. understands that he is one of a few black businessmen

... [Time expired.]

Agreed to.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): That concludes Motions without notice but we are moving on to another agenda item, the last but one on the agenda, Members’ Statement. The next item on the Order Paper is Members’ Statements.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: House Chair, again I think it is important that the House notes that in the House today we have two Ministers and two Deputy Ministers. It is really not acceptable. I can’t hold the executive accountable if they are not here.

We keep on being told that it is going to get better but it is getting worse every week. We really need to look at moving the order of business so we can accommodate the executive and have meaningful oversight. This is a shame.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Thank you hon member. I am sure this matter can also be raised tomorrow in the Joint Rules as well as the NA Rules where applicable. [Interjections.] Order!

# BASIC EDUCATION HANDS OVER BHEKISIZWE PRIMARY SCHOOL IN MQANDULI

(Member’s Statement)

Ms J V BASSON (ANC): Thank you hon Chair. The Department of Basic Education’s Accelerated Schools Infrastructure Delivery Initiative, ASIDI programme which aims to eradicate backlogs in school infrastructure, continues to provide sustainable change to rural education.

The latest official hand-over of Bhekisiwe Primary School outside Mqanduli, Eastern Cape on Friday 10 November 2017 is a practical example of this commitment.

With the hand-over of this R 28 million school ASIDI continues to play a vital role in eradicating mud schools and restoring dignity to rural education.

The Accelerated Schools Infrastructure Delivery Initiative was established with the aim of eradicating backlogs in school

infrastructure in the 2010–14 strategic planning period and beyond.

This is to be carried out by applying a combination of strategies for immediate and medium-term improvements. I thank you.

# CORRUPTION CHARGES AGAINST THE STATE SECURITY AGENCY DIRECTOR- GENERAL MR ARTHUR FRASER AND HIS FAMILY MEMBERS

(Member’s Statement)

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION (DA): Thank you House Chair. The DA has today laid corruption charges against the State Security Agency Director-General Mr Arthur Fraser and several of his family members in terms of the Prevention and Combating of Corrupt Activities Act.

Fraser initiated and oversaw the now infamous principle agent network programme. His allegations simply cannot be dismissed as

the President has attempted to do as a work of fiction in a book.

A secret internal SSA documents of its investigation, which I have in my hand today into the PAN programme found wide scale financial mismanagement, fruitless expenditure, nepotism and corruption amounting to hundreds of millions of rands.

I quote from Finding 8, 3, quote:

There are clear indications of a corrupt relationship between Mrs Fraser and Galloway. All indications are that numerous offences in terms of the Prevention and Combating of Corrupt Activities Act have been committed.

Finding 9, 9: during 2011 investigation team made a presentation to the Minister of Justice and Constitutional Development Minister Jeff Radebe in Cape Town; and in the presence of the Minister of State Security Siyabonga Cwele, even before the conclusion of the presentation Minister Radebe indicated that he

has heard and seen enough and that there is a prima facie case that must be dealt with by law enforcement.

So why has no action been taken against Arthur Fraser to date; because he is part of the broad network of state capture at the Union Buildings. ... [Interjections.] has no excuse to not to nail him and jail him. [Applause.] [Time expired.]

# METSIMAHOLO ELECTIONS

(Member’s Statement)

Mr T RAWULA (EFF): The EFF would like to make a call to all freedom-loving residents of Metsimaholo Municipality in the Free State to get up on the 29 November and reject corruption and thuggery of the ANC during the rerun of elections there.

We call on the residents of the municipality to give the EFF an overwhelming mandate to clean up the municipality of the mess created by the looters of the ANC in the past.

We acknowledge that the municipal residents made the first step towards their liberation by kicking out the ANC in August last year. They must continue to reject the ANC and their agents, who masquerade as representatives of the people, while continue looting the resources.

The EFF will clean up the administration of the municipality and ensure that no workers are fired illegally, as was the case before. We will ensure that water and electricity are provided to all citizens, in particular the poor and the elderly.

An EFF run Metsimaholo Municipality will ensure that each ward has its own clinic that is open 24 hours a day, its own early childhood development centre, and care facilities for the disabled.

An EFF run Metsimaholo Municipality will focus on localised manufacturing, and purchase most of its services from Metsimaholo, creating more jobs for people of the Metsimaholo Municipality. Your time for economic freedom in your lifetime has come; don’t lose it on the 29th November. Viva EFF!

# THE ANC WELCOMES THE NEW VEHICLES TO BEEF UP BORDER PROTECTION

(Member’s Statement)

Ms N A MNISI (ANC): Thank you House Chair. The ANC is committed to strengthening South Africa’s border controls with a view to improve security as well as managing immigration effectively.

As the ANC, we therefore welcome the announcement of the SA National Defence Force to launch new mobility package vehicles that will be used for border protection across the country to assist in improving protection at the borders.

The ANC believes this will allow a relatively small force to use a high mobility cross-country vehicle that can be easily maneuvered to effectively cope with the situation at hand.

The initial roll out of the new vehicles will start at the KwaZulu-Natal and Mozambique border, and will be followed by the Mpumalanga and Mozambican border and then the Limpopo and Zimbabwean border.

The ANC welcomes this initiative which gives effect to our manifesto’s aim of improving security at our borders, especially as we approach the festive season. I thank you.

# THE RELEASE OF THE FEES COMMISSION REPORT

(Member’s Statement)

Mr M HLENGWA (IFP): Well, well, well, hon Chairperson, the fees commission report is finally out, and what hogwash is it. The shortcoming of this fees commission at the outset is that not even a single expert in education is part of the commission.

The time of the release of the commission’s report by the President is somewhat disingenuous to say the least. To release such a controversial report right within the exams, whilst they are underway, and this does not bode well for stability and calm in institutions of higher learning.

This is about being put in a corner as the report literally says continue charging students continue with the fee increments and

does will bare the brutal brunt upon stabilities and anger brought by the student protest, and disruptions are bound to follow.

The report prioritise the TVET colleges fair enough over universities but now what happened to the other privileged students at the universities; what about the influx of students at TVET colleges when it becomes the first choice institution. Do they even have the capacity to accommodate this numbers?

Essentially the report takes us back to where we were eighteen months ago, sitting with the set of recommendations which were under the banning question of when fees will fall.

It is just the focus of fees falling to extenuating topics like how to make it affordable in this instead, it remains – education rather remains in light of this report a private good for sale. It remains a commodity

The report recommends that students start of their lives already in debt. The poor start of with working lives sitting on a

mountain of debts accumulated through the years of study which put the large majority of other working class population with even more debts. In short this report breaths debt. [Time expired.]

# AN INVESTIGATION ON AN ALLEGED POISON TO THE HON PRESIDENT JACOB ZUMA

(Member’s Statement)

Dr C P MULDER (FFP): Hon Chairperson, we live in a constitutional democracy under the rule of law; and in the constitutional democracy under the rule of law a change of government should only be taking place in terms of a peaceful election and no other things should be attempted.

Now last night we saw the hon President, hon Jacob Zuma in what was termed an exclusive interview on the *television channel ANN7*, and in that specific interview last night live, the hon President made the following statements, he said I was poisoned, and he said it was a very strong poison.

Now that means that the President’s use is of the view that there was an attempt on his life. What I would like to know from the hon Minister of Defence who is part of the security cluster is, whether that allegation by the President has been investigated. Surely there is an attempt on the life of the hon President in terms of being poison – it should be investigated. I would like to know that.

When the President was pressed last night to tell the viewer who was poisoning him, he ducked the question. He didn’t answer he said he is got very many enemies; he suggested maybe some colonial powers but we were all aware that there are other things being said who was responsible for this attempt on the President ‘s life.

I think it is absolutely essential that we get some information whether that investigation is going on in terms of allegations made by the President that he was poisoned.

# CLAIMS OF NEPOTISM AGAINST DA COUNCIL OFFICIAL

(Member’s Statement)

Ms S R VAN SCHALWYK (ANC): Thank you hon Chairperson. The ANC learned with shock the allegations of nepotism and tender manipulation involving the City of Cape Town’s transport and urban development authority commissioner Melissa Whitehead.

We have always known the DA’s righteous behavior is a superficial one. It is alleged that Whitehead has awarded a tender without following due process and placed her friends, a wife and husband, in higher job positions earning R1,8 and R1,5 million per annum respectively.

We have learned that the ANC in the council has a dossier detailing evidence of alleged corruption and nepotism including images of Whitehead and her friends on an overseas holiday in 2015 before the tender negotiations started.

The allegations follow the *Sunday Times’s* article alleging that Whitehead threatened and coerced members of the city’s bid

evaluation committee for the foreshore freeway precinct to award the tender to a particular entity.

It is further alleged that Whitehead was involved in unfairly advantaging this company to secure a R249 million tender to manufacture 11 electric buses. The double standards of the DA show that their outrage over corruption is indeed selective.

We shouldn’t be surprised as that superficiality of moral righteousness is evident in everything they do. I thank you.

# MEDIA REPORTS ON FEES MUST FALL LEADER AND SPECIAL ADVISOR TO THE PRESIDENT, MUKOVHE MORRIS MASUTHA

(Member’s Statement)

Ms D CARTER (Cope): Thank you Chairperson. Now Chairperson, some will remember that then State Security Minister, Mr David Mahlobo stated that Fees Must Fall leader Mcebo Dlamini had visited him at his home several times; and then subsequently he denied this.

In the interim, the Inspector-General of Intelligence, an IPID have indicated that they are both investigating, his money from a secret service account which was used to fund elements of a Fees Must Fall Movement, destroying infrastructure.

I noted earlier that protests were part of the intra-ANC factionalism agenda. Now then today *News 24* shockingly revealed that Mukovhe Morris Masutha, a special advisor to the President, who dated the President’s daughter, and who was the prominent leader in the Fees Must Fall campaign was listed as an employee of State Security Agency during his time as a student at Wits University.

Now if one joins the dots, then it is hard not to come to the conclusion that the President, our security agencies are all conspirators, connivers, collaborators, accomplices and ... [Interjections.] [Inaudible.] ...in the Fees Must Fall. Thank you.

Ms B A RADEBE: I’m rising on Rule 85. The member is casting aspersions on the character of the President by claiming that he is a conspirator in doing these things.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon member, I will follow up on that issue but on my listening the member referred to allegations that have been made in the News Media 24, and then further in her debate made that statement, which I will investigate and I will come back to the House.

# FORD INVESTS R3BN FOR PRODUCTION EXPANSION IN SA, INCLUDING FIRST-EVER FORD RANGER RAPTOR

(Member’s Statement)

Ms P T MANTASHE (ANC): Thank you House Chair. The ANC is of the view that the automotive industry is increasingly offering a secure base and ideal location for multi-national motor companies to locate operations to South Africa.

This will ensure export into the potentially huge African market and other markets of the world, and we commend Ford Motor Company of Southern Africa for having confidence in the country’s economic potential.

We are encouraged by the investment of R3 billion to expand production capacity at its South African manufacturing operations in order to meet growing local and international demand for the trendsetting Ford Ranger.

Along with the continued local investment, Ford has confirmed that the first-ever Ford Ranger Raptor will be produced in South Africa when it hits the market in 2019, introducing an entirely new level of off-road performance and capability to the one-ton pickup segment.

The ANC is of the view that this significant investment reaffirms Ford’s ongoing commitment to South Africa as a local manufacturer, exporter and key employer in the automotive sector, and will support a large number of direct jobs as well as indirect employment through its extensive supplier base.

Thus every effort has to be made to maintain and grow the automotive manufacturing industry as a strategic long-term industry in this country. I thank you. [Applause.]

# ROCKDALE HOUSING PROJECT IN THE STEVE TSHWETE MUNICIPALITY MPUMALANGA

(Member’s Statement)

Mr T W MHLONGO (DA): Thanks House Chair. The DA recently conducted an oversight visit to the Rockdale Housing project in the Steve Tshwete Municipality in Mpumalanga where we were shocked by the provincial ANC government’s delay for providing housing opportunities to the poor.

The 200 houses in the project were completed in October last year, yet to date there haven’t been officially allocated to the rightful beneficiaries.

In addition there is no infrastructure for basic services such as water, toilets and electricity. It is completely unacceptable

that more than a year after the houses were built both the Steve Tshwete Municipality and the provincial Department of Human Settlements have failed to take measures to allocate these houses.

As such, illegal occupants are currently taking over some of the houses while the rest are crumpling down due to vandalism. All the while thousands of residents who have been registered on the housing waiting list have to watch in desperation for their turn to get a house.

The Rockdale housing project is another evidence of the ANC-led government‘s complete failure to successfully provide housing opportunities to the poor.

We call on the national Minister of Human Settlements and the department to intervene immediately in this project to ensure that the houses are released immediately to their rightful beneficiaries. I so move you. [Applause.]

# INSUFFICIENT CLINICS AND NURSES IN MLAZI

(Member’s Statement)

*Isizulu:*

Nks S M KHAWULA (EFF): Sihlalo, ngisukuma egameni le-EFF ukuphakamisa lokhu okungahambi kahle kulo hulumeni kaKhangolose. Abantu bakithi bacindezeleke kakhulu iminyaka eminingi. Lokhu ngikusho ngoba kunabantu abagulayo othola ukuthi badla amaphilisi, imishanguzo kodwa bangabhekelelwa ngokuthi bakwazi ukuthi bayakwazi yini ukuthola ukudla ukuze badle kahle amaphilisi.

Enye into engikhala ngayo la ukuthi imitholampilo ayikwazi ukubhekelela laba bantu ukuthi ama-CD 4 count abo ayehla noma ayenyuka ukuze bakwazi ukuthi babone yini inkinga bgoba ngeke uwadle amaphilisi uma ungenakho ukudla. Into ebuhlungu eyenzekayo laphayana eMlazi, imitholampilo yakhona ayifuni nhlobo ukwenza umsebenzi wawo kanje nezisebenzi zezenhlalakahle [social workers] zinenkinga.

Enye into esikhala ngayo ukuthi kunalaba bantu ababizwa ngokuthi abonompilo, abangena umnyango ngomnyango baqinisekisa ukuthi

abantu bawathatha kahle amaphilisi noma izinkinga zikuphi. Kodwa laphaya eMlazi ikakhulukazi kwaJ abakwazi ukusizakala.

Okubuhlungu nakhona ukuthi imitholampilo ikude le ko-H, uma umuntu engenayo imali yokugibela ngeke akakwazi ukuya, kanti ikhona indawo kaKhambule ezitolo lapho ngabe bebekelwa okungenani umahamba nendlela. Ngiyabonga.

# HAWKS ARREST CAPE TOWN LAW ENFORCEMENT OFFICER FOUND WITH ‘GANG- LINKED’ MANDRAX

(Member’s Statement)

Ms M A MOLEBATSI (ANC): The ANC is deeply concerned about the increase in cases of the Cape Town Metro Police’s involvement in criminal activities especially in the Western Cape.

This came to light after the arrest of the law enforcement officer within the City of Cape for allegedly being found with

41 000 mandrax tablets worth about R1,9m on Tuesday night, 07 November 2017.

The drugs are believed to belong to a high-profile suspected gang boss in Bellville South. Once again, the arrest of the Cape Town Metro Police suspect is as a result of active citizens participating in reporting suspicious criminal activities. The Hawks had received a tip off and found the drugs in two vehicles on the property.

The ANC believes that though the networks of crime have grown in their reach and sophistication, including syndicates that deal with money laundering, human and drug trafficking and abuse, our police seem to be making inroads into stamping out these syndicates.

The ultimate aim of the ANC-led government is to eliminate some of the conditions that breed.... [Interjections.] Ke a leboga Mme. [Nako e fedile.]

# ILLEGAL CORPORAL PUNISHMENT AND FORCED PAYMENT OF SCHOOL FEES IN THE EASTERN CAPE SCHOOLS

(Member’s Statement)

Mr L M NTSHAYISA (AIC): Thank you hon Chairperson. As the AIC we welcome the investigation into the allegations of the use of corporal punishment at Makaula Senior Secondary School in Mount Frere in the Eastern Cape.

This has been alleged and confirmed by the principal of that school being very much aware that this act against the law. He is claiming to have been permitted by the parents of the learners to use corporal punishment.

Many learners have left school because of this bad behavior on the part of the principal. This is going to contribute to crime, unemployment and poverty.

We would also appreciate that the same investigation be conducted into the allegations that the principal and the SGB of the Zwelakhe Senior Secondary School in Thabankulu are demanding the payment of school fees from the parents under the pretence of charging school building fee.

The learners whose parents have not paid are not given their results or reports. Another argument put forward by this principal and the SGB is that there is not enough accommodation for the learners.

The policy is that the admission of learners should be in accordance with the classroom available in that school. This can’t be an excuse; the national department must conduct an oversight over these schools and give the necessary assistance so that we do not have chaos in our school. I so move.

# THE ANC WELCOMES THE R11BN FOR MONTROSE MEGA CITY PROJECT

(Member’s Statement)

Ms P V MOGOTSI (ANC): The ANC is committed to building a cohesive, sustainable and caring community with closer access to work, social amenities, including sports and recreation facilities.

Therefore, we applaud the ANC Gauteng government for committing R11 billions on developing the Montrose Mega City project in Rand West City Local Municipality in Randfontein.

This project will include social housing, bonded houses, RDP and military veterans’ houses, as well as schools, clinics, crèches and commercial developments, urban agriculture, and the revitalisation of the railway line to ensure that people are able to travel.

More than 10000 housing are units are expected to be built upon completion of this project. The ANC provincial government also intends to revitalise the Rand West municipality’s economy which suffered losses when mines and businesses closed down services, partly by procuring the material to build the Montrose project from business people within the area, thus contributing to creating job opportunities for the locals.

The ANC believes that this will create jobs for the people of Montrose their own new city with all government amenities and

would no longer have to travel to Randfontein for government services. I thank you.

# THE MINISTER OF TOURISM’S OVERSEAS TRIPS AND FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

(Member’s Statement)

Mr J VOS (DA): Thank you Madam Chairperson. At the time when government is facing massive self inflicted financial difficulties, lavish overseas journeys must come to an end.

I feel duty bound to share details of my parliamentary question on the overseas trips undertaken by the Minister of Tourism as this has some serious financial implications.

I’m doing this because we simply cannot afford over the top trips and spending sprees yield no or little results. It was revealed that the Minister has spent more than R2 million on overseas trips including her recent journey to Chicago needing the taxpayers to fork out another R6060 000, for a single trip.

Now according to the response received the Minister attended an American civil rights organisation rainbow coalition; and it was stated that the Minister attended several launches and she also did a radio interview; but what is most concerning is that in the response there is a footnote by one of her staff members asking exactly what were the outcomes of these meetings.

Therefore, it is clear that not even her own staff have any clue why this trip was undertaken and how South Africa will benefit. Clearly Madam Chair there is a difference between how the DA-led government conduct travel missions to those of the ANC-led government. We select key source markets that produce results and simply not pick an overseas trip for the fun of it. Thank you. [Applause.]

# THE DA BATTLE IN GAUTENG GETS UGLY

(Member’s Statement)

Ms D SENOKONYANE (ANC): Thank you hon House Chair. The ANC is taken aback by the revelation of the DA’s vicious battle for the

leadership of the DA in Gauteng, which is said to be turning ugly, with allegations of dirty tricks in the run-up to the elective conference this weekend.

This stems from a party that portrays itself as a moral and ethical in our current society, intent on achieving power in Gauteng and South Africa in 2019.

That the DA leaders can ferociously fight for positions of power and leak party secret documents, it seems they also have slates which indicate preferences for positions.

The Gauteng slate is pitted against some in the DA’s parliamentary caucus, and in one slate, it is alleged there are vultures set to oust Solly Msimanga in favour of party newcomer Ghaleb Cachalia.

While Mr Mmusi Maimane has been busy ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON: (Ms A T Didiza): Order hon members! Order! Order! Hon members of the DA, let’s allow the member to

finish her point. I can see definitely that maintaining, developing an organisation dealing with faction intra fights is very normal and complex for any organisation. So let’s allow the hon member to finish. Order!

Ms D SENOKONYANE: Okay, can I finish? While Mr Mmusi Maimane has been busy studying ANC material and literature ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON: (Ms A T Didiza): Order! Hon member, what is the point of order?

Mr R W T CHANCE: Thank you House Chair, the hon member is misleading the House. The ... [Interjections.] [Inaudible.]... election in Gauteng on Saturday is between John Moody and Ghaleb Cachalia. Hon Maimane has nothing to do with this. Hon member can get her facts straight. Thank you, Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON: (Ms A T Didiza): Hon member, hon member, order! Order! The member said alleged so let’s allow her to finish. Finish your point hon member. I heard what she said

that’s why I’m sitting here to listen. Continue hon member finish your point.

Ms D SENOKONYANE (ANC): Okay, while... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON: (Ms A T Didiza): Order! Order, it’s a Member’s Statement so the member must finish her statement.

Ms D SENOKONYANE (ANC): While Mr Mmusi Maimane has been busy studying ANC material and literature to obtain evidence to attack the ANC, it would seem that he has, in the interim, ignored his own party’s dirty campaign against their own members. I thank you. [Applause.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON: (Ms A T Didiza): I am not sure about some of the statements whether Ministers can really respond to them; but this a democratic process, members can express themselves. I will now allow Ministers to respond.

# HAWKS ARREST CAPE TOWN LAW ENFORCEMENT OFFICER FOUND WITH ‘GANG- LINKED’ MANDRAX

**THE ANC WELCOMES NEW VEHICLES TO BEEF UP BORDER PATROL**

(Minister’s Response)

The MINISTER OF DEFENCE AND MILITARY VETERANS: Chairperson ...

[Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon Minister, just proceed with your response.

The MINISTER OF DEFENCE AND MILITARY VETERANS: I just wanted to

know what he was saying so that I could respond accordingly.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): He was just saying welcome.

The MINISTER OF DEFENCE AND MILITARY VETERANS: Oh, dumelang,

ntate. [Interjections.]

I’ve not been sleeping at all. I’ve been listening to all your

... [Interjections.]

There’s no way ... [Interjections.]

Thank you very much, Chairperson ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order!

The MINISTER OF DEFENCE AND MILITARY VETERANS: Allow me to start

with ... I’ll answer two questions because we’re not allowed to respond to more than that. I’ll take the one on the police.

Indeed, there was a sting operation in the Western Cape which resulted in the arrest of this high-profile policeman or woman. Just to say that the police ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order, hon members!

The MINISTER OF DEFENCE AND MILITARY VETERANS: The police have

now decided to adopt a multidisciplinary approach to fighting crime. They are working very closely together with the Hawks and Crime Intelligence. All operations are literally intelligence- led.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Are you going to arrest Mark Lifman?

The MINISTER OF DEFENCE AND MILITARY VETERANS: So, we also know

that there have been a number of high-profile cases and this is what we have been trying to follow up, hence the sting operation which resulted in the arrest of this person.

But the point is, the ultimate goal is to break the criminal syndicates, particularly in areas such as the clubs where young people visit, areas where there are lots of drug trafficking and drug sales to young people. We are also trying to deter, discourage and prevent our young people from joining gangs and becoming gangsters. This is a very common trend in the Western Cape. [Interjections.]

Secondly, the question raised by the hon member about the patrol vehicles which are being delivered tomorrow at the border ...

Yes, indeed, we are delivering vehicles tomorrow – vehicles which are called troop packs – which will be received by the Chief of Joint Operations in Pongola. The reason we started with

that area is not because we are not prioritising other areas. It is because of some of the challenges which we have been encountering in the ...

Mr M WATERS: Chairperson ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order, hon member. What is your point of order?

Mr M WATERS: I rise on Rule 132(5) which limits a Minister’s reply to two minutes. Her reply has far exceeded that by now.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon member, the Minister indicated that she was answering two statements.

Mr M WATERS: That may be so, Chair, but the Rule states two minutes. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order! Hon member, I have noted your point. It might be my mistake, but let me allow the Minister to conclude her response.

The MINISTER OF DEFENCE AND MILITARY VETERANS: Thank you very

much, Chair.

We are happy that these vehicles are being delivered tomorrow because they will be very useful to the soldiers who are deployed on the border. All of us as South Africans have been preoccupied and very concerned about the challenges on the border and the porous borders we have in South Africa. Thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Thank you, hon member. Hon members, I think it would be unfair to blame the Minister. As I said, I do take the responsibility that I might have had an oversight in the manner in which I allocated time to these two statements. So, I think it is important that we don’t shift the blame to someone who shouldn’t take that blame in the first instance. Hon Muthambi? [Interjections.]

# CLAIMS OF NEPOTISM AGAINST DA COUNCIL OFFICIAL

(Minister’s Response)

The MINISTER OF THE PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION: House

Chair ... [Interjections.]

In response to the statement raised by hon Van Schalkwyk, the latest revelation of the corruption and fraud perpetrated by the likes of the DA doesn’t come as a surprise to us... [Interjections.] ... because this is the hypocrisy of the DA which knows no boundaries. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: You are a fraudster, yourself!

The MINISTER OF THE PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION: Yet

today, as we were listening to them raising the issues here, they think they are a party that can teach us about democracy and accountability. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order, hon members! Members were allowed to raise statements. Ministers are responding to those statements. We may not like what they say, but let’s allow them the time to respond.

An HON MEMBER: Why is she reading a statement?

The MINISTER OF THE PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION: House

Chair, nothing exposes the DA hypocrisy more than the deafening silence that characterised ...

Mr M WATERS: Chairperson ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): What is the point of order, hon member?

Mr M WATERS: May I ask why the Minister is reading her answer from a statement that was given by an ANC member? Was she informed of the statement beforehand so that she can have a prepared reply ... [Inaudible.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order, hon Waters. Hon members, can we please be in order? When members raise statements they have the right to rise. I don’t think we can determine what members must do or how they must do it. Continue, hon Minister. You have one minute left.

The MINISTER OF THE PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION: Chair, I

was still on the point that the hypocrisy of the DA is deepening because this characterises its response to the revelation of corruption, especially when it’s done among its own ranks and in the private sector. [Interjections.]

There was no whimper heard when the Competition Commission revealed that millions of rands were siphoned from the poor by the banks. We never heard the DA saying anything to that effect. We never heard the DA standing on the rooftops calling for a commission of enquiry into the construction industry or even the latest developments that were raised about ... that suggest that billions of tax monies are taken by the rich into foreign tax havens. [Interjections.]

While the DA is busy assuming that it is holier than thou, the attitude that they have ... I must assure you that our government is hard work dealing with corruption. [Interjections.] Not only has the ANC-led government instituted a ... [Inaudible.] version, I want to assure you, hon members

... I want to assure you that we are dealing with the scourge of

corruption and the government is party to many international conventions that deal with corruption. [Interjections.]

I think when we also like to invite, in particular, the Western Cape government and the City of Cape Town ... [Time expired.]

Mr M WATERS: Chair, may I request that you actually do enforce the rule of two minutes, please? That was well over three-and-a- half minutes.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon Waters, order. Indeed, the enforcement of the time has been done, but you know as well as I do that when a point of order is raised, we pause the clock. [Interjections.]

Exactly! I’m also looking at the watch. It wasn’t three minutes, hon Steenhuisen. Let’s not debate that point.

# MOTOR VEHICLE MANUFACTURING IN SOUTH AFRICA

(Minister’s Response)

The MINISTER OF ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT: House Chair, I want to welcome the statement by hon Mantashe on the new Ford motor investment in South Africa. As South Africans, I think we can all be proud that a major company globally chooses to put

R3 billion extra into expanding its production capability in Silverton in South Africa. It is part of a much wider success story. Currently, Ford itself produces the Ford Ranger model and it is exported to 148 other counties, not only on the African continent but across the world. The Ford investment is part of a big drive by auto manufacturers.

I visited the Toyota plant not very long ago to see the launch of the new Fortuner vehicle. Some of us like me drive a Fortuner. It is made in South Africa and it is exported to other parts of the world.

There is also the new Chinese investment in Nelson Mandela Bay. They are putting just over R4 billion into building the first new light manufacturing vehicle assembly plant in South Africa. It is first built in the last 40 years.

So, all of this will help to create jobs, industrialise South Africa and ensure that, in fact, we can get inclusive growth. Together with that, we are now trying to localise more of the component manufacturing and we are also trying, through this programme, to enhance the skills base for young South Africans. Thank you very much.

# MONEY SPENT BY THE MINISTER OF TOURISM

(Minister’s Response)

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF TOURISM: House Chairperson, I would like to respond to the statement made by hon Vos from the DA. The way I understand the procedures of the Minister’s travelling and the submissions I have seen in the Department of Tourism, the Minister is representing the department wherever she is. I think the invitations come from everywhere, but also from within the UNWTO, which is the United Nations World Trade Organisation.

She has now been elected as one of the vice-chairpersons. In fact, we should be congratulating her in terms of her making a difference and representing. [Applause.]

In terms of looking at the value of the money spent and what we get, I believe that you don’t go on a conference or trip today and then next week Monday you want to see the results. Some of them may come after a month or a year or two. It depends on how we project or represent our country. That is what the Minister is doing. We will follow up on this and check exactly what he is raising in terms of not spending money accurate.

However, as far as I am concerned, the Minister is doing a good job and is spending the taxpayers’ money accordingly. Tourists are coming to this country because of her attending some of these. Tourism is one of the game changers in this country. I thank you.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF TRANSPORT: Chairperson, ...

*IsiZulu:*

... ngicela ukuphendula isitatimende [statement] sika mhlonishwa umama uKhawula mayelana [regarding] nodaba [issue] lemishanguzo ethithibalisa igciwane lengculazi, [antiretrovirals] ukusho ukuthi kuqala, imishanguzo ethithibalisa igciwane lengculazi eNingizimu Afrika [South Africa] inikezwa mahhala kodwa akusho [it does not mean] ukuthi njengoHulumeni [as the government] siwathola mahhala. Kodwa ukuthi aye kubantu, anikezwa mahhala futhi umthelela [and the impact] yalokho Sihlalo [Chairperson] wukuthi namuhla, uma ngo-2015 abantu bebezalwa belindele ukuthi bazophila impilo yeminyaka engu-49,5, namuhla ngenxa yemishanguzo ethithibalisa igciwane lengculazi iminyaka elindelekile yokuphila [life expectancy] yabantu baseNingizimu Afrika iku-61,2 yeminyaka. [years] Kusho ukuthi ikhulile.

Ngiyacabanga kufanele sikushayele ihlombe lokho. [Ihlombe.] Zikhona ezinye izinhlelo [programmes] zikaHulumeni zokuthi babone ukuthi abantu bayakwazi ukuphila njengezibonelelo [such as grants] ezinikezwa wuMnyango Wezokuthuthukiswa Komphakathi [Department of Social Development] ukuthi bakwazi ukuphila. Loyo ongenakho ukudla, umnyango [department] iyabanikeza kodwa akukwazi ukuthi kube yinto engenakuguqulwa. [permanent] Isuke

ibanikezela ukuthi ngesikhathi esithize mhlawube bezula bezanyelwe ukuthola izibonelelo, ngakho [so] lokho kuyenzeka. Uma ngabe kunendawo ethize [specifically] njengoba [like] umama uKhawula esho la kunenkinga [problem] khona, kungaba [be it] inkinga yemitholampilo [clinics] noma inkinga yosonhlalakahle [social workers] kungakuhle mhlawumbe athinte uHulumeni noma [or] umnyango ...

*English:*

... so that we attend to that problem but the problem of antiretrovirals in South Africa and to treat HIV and Aids is acknowledged worldwide as the best.

*IsiZulu:*

Ngiyabonga kakhulu. [Ihlombe.]

# SCHOOLS BUILT IN SOUTH AFRICA

(Minister’s Response)

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION: House Chair, I will

respond to two of the statements. The first is in relation to the Accelerated Schools Infrastructure Delivery Initiative Asidi. Indeed, we can celebrate the fact that this is the 185th school that has been delivered. These are state-of-the-art schools that have all the facilities and normalities - libraries, laboratories, ICT capacity, information technology, sport and recreation facilities, special dedicated kitchens for preparation, etc.

So, the target really has been one school per week. That has been a happening last year. Today, as we speak, there are 42 schools under construction in the Eastern Cape. Another 47 will be built in the course of this year and another 15 in the Free State. We certainly are confident that not less than 52 schools will be built in this financial year, but I am aspiring and aiming for the establishment and the completion of 100 schools for this financial year.

With regard to the other statement, certainly corporal punishment is unlawful, unconstitutional and illegal. With

regard to the payment of fees, 85% of our learner population attend no-fee schools and that is a wonderful achievement in terms of equity and access. No school can demand payment where a learner attends a no-fee school.

With regard to the withholding of the report, it is illegal because legislation strictly prohibits the withholding of reports on the basis that fees must be paid first. Thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order, hon members! I just want to advise members that in respect of time management, the Speaker or presiding officer seated here does not do her or his own calculations. The Table staff does that management and the time is there. So, we watch the time. I am responding because I heard somebody raising a concern that other people are cut off. In respect of hon Mapisa-Nqakula, I acknowledge the mistake. All members, regardless of which party they belong to, sometimes when they are in the middle of a speech, even if the time has ended, I actually allow them to conclude their statements. So, I just want to advise that at least, since I presided here as the Chair, there was no unfairness in the

allocation of time. We now move to the last item on the Order Paper, which is notice of motion. Order, hon Mkhaliphi.

Ms H O MKHALIPI: Chair, I am rising on Rule 35 which addresses members’ attendance. I have never seen Nkosazana-Zuma in this House since she was sworn in. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Thank you hon member, we will ...

Ms H O MKHALIPI: Can I be clarified on that one?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Unfortunately, we can clarify that in the Chief Whips’ Forum tomorrow, I am sure. Can we move to the last item on the Order Paper? Does any member of the ANC wish to give a notice of motion?

# NOTICES OF MOTION

Mr S R VAN SCHALKWYK: I hereby give notice that on the next sitting of the House, I shall move:

That the House debates the realignment of state-owned enterprises, development finance institutions and other public agencies to support radical economic transformation.

Ms A STEYN: I hereby give notice that on the next sitting of the House, I shall move:

That the House debates the importance of protecting our agricultural sector in ensuring a thriving economy.

Thank you.

*IsiXhosa*:

Nks N P SONTI: Sihlalo, ndenza isaziso sokuba, xa le Ndlu ihlala kwakhona, ndiza kwenza isiphakamiso egameni le-EFF:

Sokuba le Ndlu –

iqwalasele banzi ixesha elithi ivule ngalo iklinikhi ekuWadi

26 eWonderkop nelivala ngalo, iphinde ngeempelaveki ingasebenzi ukunceda abantu abalimeleyo nabafayo.

Enkosi.

Ms J V BASSON: I hereby give notice that on the next sitting of the House, I shall move:

That the House debates the strengthening of vocational training institutions as a catalyst for developing skills that can move the South African economy and society forward.

Mr J A ESTERHUIZEN: I hereby give notice that on the next sitting of the House, I shall move:

That the House debates the numerous accounts of attacks on police officials.

I thank you.

Ms S C MNCWABE: I hereby give notice that on the next sitting of the House, I shall move:

That the House debates the scourge of child trafficking, child kidnapping and the heartless murder of our children who are the future of our country.

Ms N MNISI: I hereby give notice that on the next sitting of the House, I shall move:

That the House debates the development of new strategies to minimise the effect of the recent malaria outbreak which continues to remain a public health challenge.

Thank you.

Ms C N MAJEKE: I hereby give notice that on the next sitting of the House, I shall move:

That the House debates the economic and social impact of untaxed and unregulated Airbnb accommodation model in the context of the great need for fairness.

Mr A M FIGLAN: I hereby move on behalf of the DA that in its next sitting the House debates the shortage of water in Xala, in the following villages, Phola Park, New City and others, especially over December holidays. Thank you.

Ms V KETABAHLE: I hereby give notice that on the next sitting of the House, I shall move:

That the House debates the lack of water in Amathole District Municipality, especially Mnquma Local Municipality and Mbhashe Local Municipality.

Ms T P MANTASHE: I hereby give notice that on the next sitting of the House, I shall move:

That the House debates the enhancement of the capacity of the state to directly provide goods and services rather than rely on outsourcing.

Ms D CARTER: I hereby give notice that on the next sitting of the House, I shall move:

That the House debates cost-saving mechanisms to be implemented to ensure free basic and higher education, from Grade R, and for all.

Ms M A MOLEBATSI: I hereby give notice that on the next sitting of the House, I shall move:

That the House debates the development of large black-owned companies to ensure that they can compete globally undertaking large complex projects and export their services and products to other global markets.

I thank you.

Ms D SENOKONYANE: I hereby give notice that on the next sitting of the House, I shall move:

That the House debates the rolling out and expanding of aquaculture projects to enhance job creation and promotion of access to high protein foods.

Mr S J F MARAIS: I hereby give notice that on the next sitting of the House, I shall move:

That the House debates the state of readiness of the Defence Force to fully and effectively respond to and comply with the Constitution’s paragraph 200(1) and (2), given the current primary need for land, sea and air border patrol and control the current and future financial constraints, the support required to grow our economy and create jobs and no immediate conventional warfare threats

Ms P V MOGOTSI: I hereby give notice that on the next sitting of the House, I shall move:

That the House debates making race and colour discrimination a punishable crime in South Africa.

Debate concluded.

The House adjourned at 20:35.