

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 1

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

—

PROCEEDINGS OF THE NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

—

The House met at 15:02.

The Speaker took the Chair and requested members to observe a moment of silence for prayers or meditation.

Question 230:

The MINISTER OF WOMEN IN THE PRESIDENCY: Madam Speaker, the Department of Women's responsibility is oversight on government programmes, to ensure that the 9-Point Plan does contribute towards changing the lives of women. Government is making progress in the implementation of the 9-Point Plan to reignite growth and create jobs.

A report seeking to understand the status of women in the South African economy was released in 2015 by the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 2

department. Further, we have also commissioned a study to establish the extent to which women are beneficiaries of government incentive schemes from DTI whose findings will be released in 2018. Thank you.

IsiZulu:

Nk P BENGU: Ngibonge Somlomo, uMongameli wakhapha umyalelo wokuthi yonke iMinyango ebhekele ezemnotho imele ihlangane ibe nezinhlelo zokuthuthukisa abesifazane kwezomnotho. Ngqongqoshe ungabe uhlanganile yini nozakwenu oNgqongqoshe baleMinyango nabeka eceleni ukuthi yiziphi lezi zinhlelo nokuthi uMnyango wakho Wezabesifazane ulandelela kanjani ukuthi lezi zihlelo ziyenziwa ukuze laba abesifazane bazizwe bebambe iqhaza emnothweni? Ngiyabonga Somlomo.

UNGQONGQOSHE WEZABESIFAZANE: Ngiyabonga Sihlalo, uMnyango wami uhlangene neMinyango kwezenthuthuko ngokuhlukahlukana bebambisene ukusebenzisana ekuboneni ukuba abantu besifazane ngabe bayathola ukuhlomula kwezomnotho eNingizimu Afrika. Uma nje ngingacacisa kafushane uma sibheka laphaya ezindabeni zezimali nokuba abantu

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 3

besifazane ngabe banawo amathuba okuthola izimali ekwenzeni ukuba amabhizinisi abo aphumelele. Ezinye zezinto esizibhekayo esibona ukuthi senza kangcono kanti futhi siyazi khona manje singuhulumeni ukuthi kukhona namathuba abo-preferential procurement ezibhekene nokuba abantu besifazane nabo bakwazi ukuhlomula. Kubekelwe 30% eceleni ezokwenza ukuthi abantu besifazane uma kuba namathuba bakwazi ukubhekana nalezo zinto bahlomule kulawo mathuba. Maningi amathuba akhona kuhulumeni uma sithi siyabheka futhi sibone nalaphaya ku-ocean economy abantu besifazane bekhona behlomula ngoba ngikhuluma nje sesinabo abesifazane abakha imikhumbi la eNingizimu Afrika. Ngiyabonga.

Mrs D ROBINSON: Hon Speaker, Minister, it is great to hear that you were working on the implementation of the 9-Point Plan. However, that is not solving our current major issues in the Department of Women.

We were told by the Chairperson of the Commission for Gender Equality, CGE, in a recent portfolio committee meeting that your lack of availability or absence and your

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 4

failure to co-operate with the CGE is completely unacceptable, while women in South Africa face a wide range of problems everyday, enormous problems.

Looking at the urgent need to reduce workplace conflict, please tell the House why it takes you up to nine months to respond to requests, and whether you are indeed misleading the House when you speak about progress being made.

The MINISTER OF WOMEN IN THE PRESIDENCY: Hon member, I am not going to entertain gossip. I must tell you I was sitting with the Acting Chairperson of the CGE, two months ago. So, I don't know what you are telling me. I just want to bring that to your attention.

On the other issue, my mandate is not to have meetings with the CGE. My mandate is to change the lives of women in South Africa in all sectors of the economy. That includes departments of government, both at local and national level. So, I just want to say that meetings with the CGE over a cup of tea do not ensure that I deliver.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 5

We have ordinary people on the ground. When we have programmes in the provinces, they were saying that commissioners in those provinces will participate in our activities and they are participating. So, unfortunately, gossip is not part of me because I have a bigger task to fulfil in this country.

Ms N V MENTE: Speaker, Minister, the latest quarterly labour survey by Stats SA has revealed that two million and more females are not economically active and the 9-Point Plan that you are referring to seems not to be helping much in creating jobs. There are co-operatives, particularly in the remote areas, formed by women and they do not get the necessary financial support and the entertainment that they deserve from your department and the Department of Agriculture. What are you going to do to ensure that the women in rural areas are empowered economically and is it not time to revisit the 9-Point Plan so that you can at least have something that is workable, understandable and friendly to the people of South Africa?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 6

The MINISTER OF WOMEN IN THE PRESIDENCY: Hon Speaker, the 9-Point Plan is an economic programme of this government. Not long ago, I had a discussion with the Department of Rural Development and looked at programmes done by them. They are in the rural areas. You go to Newcastle and will find that they have a programme which addresses women through tanneries. They are also producing products out of that. That is part of making sure that the rural women are empowered.

Again, Rural Development is also funding and helping various co-operatives. I don't know if you know that Rural Development recently created a co-operative bank to assist women. [Interjections.] You cannot assess what has started. You need to give it a chance and then you assess whether it is effective. I want to say to you that assessment ... Where it is established, it is working and we are satisfied with it because it is indeed empowering women in our country.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 7

There are various programmes that we look at, for example, the ocean economy, where the young women have gone through training. They are now operating in the maritime space. All those programmes show that South Africa is making a change in the lives of women.

We want to acknowledge that, as a country, we face a challenge of unemployment, but the programmes that are done through the 9-Point Plan are addressing that. I have just mentioned the issue of women who are involved in ship building for the first time. It is some of the programmes that are being implemented. These programmes are not an event, it is a process. Give us two years to see ...

[Interjections.] Exactly, because this is not an event, it is a programme.

Mr J A ESTERHUIZEN: Speaker, Minister, the first point on the 9-Point Plan is resolving the energy crisis. Currently, there is not a crisis. There is actually an oversupply of energy caused by a reduced demand. You represent not only women but also millions of taxpayers in this country who

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 8

have a say in the economy. As Minister of Women in the Presidency, do you still see a need for an additional 9,6 kilowatt energy built, at a time when the country's official energy supplier is already technically bankrupt?

The MINISTER OF WOMEN IN THE PRESIDENCY: Hon Speaker, the issue of access to energy by women, especially in rural areas is important. We have seen that electricity is extended, on a continuous basis, to women who come from poor communities to address the challenges of rural women. This is done because rural woman need to use it, and also to create alleviation for women who must go to the veld to fetch wood. We also want to make sure that it creates safety for them and reduce time on cooking in their homes.

So, we see energy as part of the critical component in creating a better life for women, especially rural women in our country.

Question 223:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 9

The MINISTER OF WOMEN IN THE PRESIDENCY: Thank you, Speaker. I would like to indicate that hon member as you know that this is the department which is not properly funded and makes it very difficult for the department to meet its mandate.

Nevertheless, the money which we have utilised currently in terms of the various programmes we have, has been R11,7 million. We are able to do this in partnership with various stakeholders, such as religious leaders, business people and the civil society in augmenting and making sure that our programmes continue to be a success; and we are able to measure progress when it comes to the various programmes. Thank you.

Ms C N MAJEKE: Thank you, hon Speaker. What are the socioeconomic impacts of the programmes that your department and other government departments provide economic support to, from 2014-15 to 2016-17, financial years? If not, why not? If so, what are the relevant details? Thank you, Speaker.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 10

The MINISTER OF WOMEN IN THE PRESIDENCY: Thank you, hon Speaker. I just want to indicate that the question is so detailed I will not be able to give you the information now, but I want to commit that we will give you the detail as you have outlined it because it becomes important.

Part of our work is to work with all other stakeholders, including government departments as I have indicated, and to make sure that we are able to reach out and change the lives of women in South Africa.

We work with the private sector in making sure that we look at their programmes and ensure that as they continue to deal with challenges we are facing as a country, especially in creating jobs - they are able to employ more women.

Not only that, we also partner with them in ensuring that we skill women in South Africa - because part of the challenge whilst we can talk about a high turnover of women who are not employed, is also contributed by many women who lack skills in our country. That's one of the areas where

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 11

we partner with the rest people in making sure that we contribute to skills development when it comes to women.

We are also working with some of the Setas to deliberately make sure that they take more women in ensuring that they are bettered.

Ms H O MKHALIPI: Doctor!

Dr S S THEMBEKWAYO: Thank you Speaker ... [Interjections.]

IsiZulu:

USOMLOMO: Akabhaliwe ukuthi uwudokotela.

Nk H O MKHALIPI: Uwudokotela!

AMALUNGU AHLONIPHEKILE: Uwudokotela!

USOMLOMO: Siyakwamukela dokotela.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 12

Dr S S THEMBEKWAYO: Thank you, Speaker. Gender based violence is a result of attitudes and behaviours of many and how they perceive women; and the way in which they should be allowed to treat women.

Therefore, in order to end gender based violence at the root, the behaviours and attitudes of men need to be changed. My question is, what is the department doing to change the behaviour and attitudes of men nationally; but also in government in regards to how they view and treat women. Thank you.

The MINISTER OF WOMEN IN THE PRESIDENCY: Thank you, hon Speaker. This department is one of the departments which started to make sure that the issue of gender-based violence is not a woman's problem. It is a societal issue; and how are we advancing that?

We are working with various men's organisations, religious leaders, civil society organisations in addressing gender-based violence; and I must say where we are we are seeing

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 13

more men's organisations approaching us around this particular subject to work with us in changing the mind set, not only of women but of every members of the society.

So I want to say, we need to continue doing that; and legislatures to which you have indicated is not the responsibility of my department, it's our responsibility as a whole here to make sure that all these men, all these women can change their attitudes in making sure that the Constitution, which we all believe in, can meet those objectives in the Bill of Rights.

However, not only in the Bill of Rights but also in the Constitution which advances matters of equality. You have a responsibility, so do I and everybody here to make sure that women are safe in this country; but also are seen to be equal. Women are human beings as you know; human's rights are human rights. Thank you.

IsiZulu:

Mnu M HLENGWA: Ngiyathokoza mhlonishwa Somlomo,

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 14

English:

Hon Minister, one of the biggest challenges confronting the combating of gender-based violence is the fact that reporting at police stations at times is the hindrance simply because of the insensitivity display with some of the police officers when these cases are being reported.

What interventions is your department working on with the Department of Police in ensuring that we raise the consciousness of the police officers; and even though there is a notion that the front desks and police stations must have 50% women and so on; but that would be the easy route.

So what is it, practical and tangible programmes are you working on with the Department of Police to ensure that the police men are sensitive to the realities around gender-based violence in so far as reporting is concerned and the investigations thereof. Thanks.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 15

The MINISTER OF WOMEN IN THE PRESIDENCY: Thank you, hon Speaker. The programmes which the Minister of Police recently announced of the Six Point Plan in making sure that the police improve the reporting - but not only that, in one of the areas expected, which the Minister has committed to, has to ensure that training continues in changing the attitudes of the police as a whole.

It is not only policemen sometimes it is also the attitudes of policewomen on how they treat gender victims of violence in our society as a whole.

We need to look at the police wholly to change their attitudes and we are happy with the programme which has been put in place by the Minister of Police on a Six Point Plan - retraining the victim empowerment centres.

I must say I agree with you, sometimes they are not properly utilised and they need to be continuously monitored. We are happy where we are today that the Minister and the Justice Crime Prevention and Security

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 16

cluster, JCPS as a whole has agreed to review and come out with a plan, a comprehensive plan in making sure that matters of violence against women or Gender-based violence, GBV in our country is addressed better.

Because, the mere fact that we continue to see an escalation and more women being victims, it means gaps need to be identified on a continuous basis to make sure that the violence in our society, especially against women, comes to an end.

IsiZulu:

Mnu S C MNCWABE: Ngibonge Somlomo, ngibingelele, mhlonishwa Ngqongoshe, umuntu uthanda ukwazi ukuthi, zikhona yini izinhlelo ehovisini [office] lakho kanye nemali okubeke eceleni ukulekelela futhi ukulwa nokushadiswa ngenkani kwamantombazane nokuthwalwa kwawo? Ngoba noma singekho sisho sithi wudlame [violence] kodwa indlela okwenzeka ngayo kuwukhlukekumezeka kwamantombazane akhona lokho. Uma zikhona lezo zinhlelo, sezihambe kangakanani, sikhona yini izithelo ezibonakalayo? Ngiyabonga.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 17

IsiZulu:

UNGQONGQOSHE WEZABESIFAZANE: Ngiyabonga kakhulu mhlonishwa, esikwenzayo-ke manje ekubeni abantwana bamantombazane bayashadiswa bayaphoqwa ukuthi bathwalwe, into esiyenzayo-ke siwumnyango, eyokuqala nje, ukuba sibheke ukuba, ngabe ukhona umthetho obavikelayo na? Manje laphaya i-SA Law Commission ibiyenze ucwaningo lokubheka ngabe sikhona izindlela abangazenza na. Siyajabula-ke manje ngombiko [report] abavele nawo ekukuthi nathi silahlele kuleyo khomishana [commission] nombiko wayo ukuba basheshe ngemithetho ezovikela izingane zamantombazane ngoba akukhona kuphela ukuthwala, nokushadiswa isikhathi singekaviki, yizinto esizibhekile.

Kanti lokho futhi kuphinde kuthinte nomthetho, i-Customary Marriages Act, nawo, uma uwufunda laphaya, uyabonisa ukuthi kunezinto ezenza ukuba abantwana bamantombazane ukuhlukunyezwa nokuphoqwa ukuba bashade isikhathi singekafiki zilapho. Manje, lokho kwenza ukuba izinhlelo ezikhona kuHulumeni nalolu olubhekelana ngokuthi abantwana bamantombazane bahlale esikoleni esibambisane noMnyango

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 18

kaSekela Mongameli ukuba mabaqhubeke ngemfundo bangashadiswa isikhathi singekafiki. Yizinhlelo esibambisene ngazo ukubheka ukuba bavikeleka kanjani abantwana bamantombazane. Ngiyabonga.

Question 226:

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: Hon Speaker, hon members, the department is currently reviewing its organisational structure with a view to creating an implementation unit. This unit will be responsible for overseeing the implementation of the Bill once it is enacted. The unit will also be responsible for the implementation of the specific provisions of the Bill that assign powers, duties and functions to the director-general, department and me, as far as the new law will allow. Furthermore, the unit will have the responsibility of monitoring the implementation of the new law by provinces.

As far as the recognition of the Khoi-San communities and leaders is concerned, I will establish a Commission on

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 19

Khoi-San Matters, as provided for in this Bill. This commission will assist government with the recognition processes and will, after proper investigation, make recommendations to me on such recognition. However, the process for establishing this commission can only commence once the Bill is enacted. As you are aware, we passed the Bill in this House, yesterday, and it has been referred to the NCOP for concurrence. I thank you.

Mr N A MASONDO: Madam Speaker, my follow-up question is:

Can the Minister further explain and clarify why the Traditional and Khoi-San Leadership Bill is so important?

[Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: Speaker, the brutality of the evil system of apartheid ...

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Madam Speaker, on a point of order ...

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 20

The SPEAKER: Hon Steenhuisen, what's your point of order?
You may take your seat, hon Minister.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Madam Speaker, I refer your attention to Rule 86(b), which states that reflection upon any statute of the same session, except for the purpose of moving for its amendment or repeal, is not permitted. I would suggest that the question asked by the hon Masondo is in violation of Rule 86(b) ...

[Interjections.] ... asking the Minister to reflect upon a statute passed in the same session. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Yes. Hon member, we will deal with the question because the Question is on the Order Paper.

[Interjections.] So, it is under discussion currently, because it was allowed. Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: Since it took over ...

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 21

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Madam Speaker ...

[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Steenhuisen, let's not have a debate about it right now.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Madam Speaker, we either apply the Rules, or we don't. There's nothing wrong with the Question on the Order Paper. What the hon Masondo is asking the hon Minister to do is to reflect on the statute that is being passed. It is nothing about its implementation. The question he is asking is, Why was it so important? We dealt with that yesterday in the debate.

The SPEAKER: Hon Steenhuisen, we are allowing the supplementary question.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: So, you allow his questions, but no questions to the President, like you blocked our questions?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 22

The SPEAKER: Yes. Please proceed, hon Minister.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Shocking! Typical bias.

[Applause.] [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Please proceed, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: Madam Speaker, the Constitution enjoins us to, among other things, ensure that customary provisions are enhanced and promoted; and one of the things that we should do is to recognise the existence of such structures where they existed before.

The unfortunate part of this development is that, in 800, the colonisers dismantled the structures of the Khoi-San people. [Interjections.] When we, as the ANC-led government, reconstituted these structures of traditional leaders, we didn't have any information. That's why the father of our nation, uTata Madiba, established the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 23

National Khoi-San Council, which was tasked with looking into the history of our Khoi-San people.

Working with other stakeholders and ourselves, this council has now brought together and collated information that will allow us to reconstitute the structures and will also assist in preserving the heritage of the Khoi-San people. It will restore their dignity and, at the same time, ensure that their heritage is properly preserved. That is why it is so important for us to take this route. [Applause.]

Ms D ROBINSON: Speaker, this question is for Mr Mileham. I am sorry. This was in error.

The SPEAKER: Alright. Hon Mileham?

Mr K J MILEHAM: Speaker, Minister, just yesterday, it was reported in the KwaZulu-Natal Provincial Legislature that the provincial Department of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs was just about bankrupt because of the remuneration costs of the izinduna [headmen].

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 24

[Interjections.] What are the cost implications in rand terms of the number of Khoi-San councils or Khoi-San leaders who will be supported by your department; and how will you afford that?

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: Speaker, the mooted amendments to the Bill also affect how we deal with the remuneration of public office bearers. Traditional leaders are public office bearers, according to the provisions of the law.

We have already had two sessions with National Treasury because we had already envisaged that by now, we would be processing this Bill at the level on which we have done so. So, there are ongoing engagements now with National Treasury to make sure that we are going to fund the implementation of this Bill, once it has been enacted.

I understand, hon Mileham, that you will forever resist the establishment and recognition of such structures. It is very, very clear that you are not going to support these

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 25

structures, as long as you are accommodating the architectures of apartheid within your party who have been calling for the reinstatement and recognition of the parties of the likes of P W Botha. [Interjections.] We are going to forge on and ensure that the dignity and heritage of our people is respected. [Applause.]

Mr K J MILEHAM: Speaker ... Speaker ... Over here, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Yes, hon Mileham, on what point are you rising?

Mr K J MILEHAM: Madam Speaker, the Minister did not answer the question. The question was, How much? He did not answer that.

The SPEAKER: Hon member, please, when you rise, do tell me on what point you are rising. Just telling me he didn't answer the question ... he answered. He gave some answer. Whether he was answering the question ... [Interjections.] is yours to interpret. [Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 26

Inkosi R N CEBEKHULU: Speaker, hon Minister, what steps do you intend taking ... [Interjections.]

IsiZulu:

... hhayi thulani umsindo!

English:

Hon Minister, what steps do you intend taking in respect of the many complaints about inadequate consultation in respect of calls for the separation of the Bill - one Bill dealing with Khoi-San leadership and another dealing with traditional leadership? Thank you.

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: Hon Speaker, we have supported the approach that will ensure that we standardise and harmonise the traditional leadership sector. Hence the need to combine and rename, of course, the current framework Act where we also embrace the Khoi-San leadership, because we want to standardise and harmonise the traditional leadership sector in our country. We think that that will bring some

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 27

uniformity on how we support - and also how government relates to - the sector. Thank you very much.

IsiZulu:

USolwazi M N KHUBISA: Ngiyabonga Somlomo, Ngqongqoshe njengoba belichaza ilungu elihloniphekile iNkosi uCebekhulu ukuthi umthethosivivinywa lona awukhulumi ngodaba lwama-Khoi-San kuphela kodwa namaKhosi wonkana. Ngqongqoshe olunye udaba oluvele kabanzi, sakhuluma ngalo lomthethosivivinywa ukuthi ibalulekile le ndaba yama-Traditional Councils kungaba ku-district noma ku-local level kodwa udaba olubalulekile ukuthi Amakhosi isikhathini esiningi abaholi bomdabu bathi abavamile ukuthi bathinthwe ngezinto ezithinta intuthuko noma bebaluleke kangaka ezimpilweni zezizwe zabo nalapho bekhona ezindaweni zabo. Umthethosivivinywa lona noma uMnyango wakho uzokuqiniseka kanjani ukuthi abaholi bomdabu bayathinteka ikakhulukazi ezintweni ezithinta intuthuko nasekuthuthukisweni izizwe njengoba umsebenzi obekade bawuqala ukuwenza. Ngiyabonga.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 28

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, apparently, I never gave you a chance to answer the question asked by the hon Cebekhulu. Would you like to start there? [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: Which portion, hon Speaker?

The SPEAKER: The hon Cebekhulu raised a supplementary question and apparently, I never gave you a chance to answer it. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: Not at all. I think I have answered the question, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Ah! [Interjections.] Please proceed, hon Minister. Answer the hon Khubisa's question.

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: Speaker, our own interaction with traditional leaders, through the various platforms we have created, the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 29

latest being the indaba we held with them in June, indicates that there is serious conflict in some of our municipalities between the municipal council and the traditional leaders or the traditional councils in those constituencies. It goes further, to show that there are serious tensions between traditional councils and communities. In some cases, communities feel that traditional councils are not allowing them to participate in matters that affect their daily lives.

Now, one of the reasons for introducing this Bill is to address those grey areas. If you look into the Bill - and I know your party participated quite sufficiently in your consultation process - you will see it is to address the relationship between the traditional councils and municipal councils. It also goes deeper, by outlining the provisions for participation of traditional leaders in municipal councils; and how the traditional council should be constituted to make sure that communities are properly represented within the councils.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 30

It does not end there. It also addresses the issues of gender and accountability, and especially on financially related issues. Thank you, hon Speaker.

Question 235:

The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY: Chairperson, the National Youth Development Agency, NYDA, provides economic and social interventions that are intended to impart the requisite skills to young people; Firstly, with regard to economic interventions, young people are provided with access to information and support to higher education and training so as to prepare for available job opportunities. They are also provided with life skills to facilitate their placements into jobs, as well as business support services for youth entrepreneurs.

Secondly, on social interventions, the National Youth Service, NYS, Framework has recently been approved by Cabinet last month. This framework provides for active participation in youth activities that benefit communities and society.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 31

Lastly, to give effect to the implementation of the youth policy, the NYDA recently finalised the Integrated Youth Development Strategy and additionally, the department has developed a Monitoring and Evaluation Framework to track implementation amongst others of the economic and social interventions to ensure that they standardise and uniform the collection and reporting of data to stakeholders on those interventions that are aimed at improving the quality of lives of the youth. Thank you, Chairperson.

Mr H D KHOZA: Minister, given that the support in higher education and training is provided for the youth to prepare them for available job opportunities, what kind of support is provided and/or does this include plans to curb the increasing rate of unemployed graduate, who do not meet the entry level of experience that is required in the work places? This, Minister, is a serious challenge for the youth applying for jobs because they don't possess such experience. Thank you very much.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 32

The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY: Chairperson, amongst others; there is also the National School's Fund, which has to also ensure that our young people are provided with those skills. There are various programmes as the hon member is asking of making sure that the projects are being implemented, including the Brigade Data Collection Project, the issue of Artisan Development Programme, the Technical Skills Training Programme, as well as National Rural Youth Service Corps Programme. Various SETAs are also collaborating with NYDA to ensure that even graduate interns are being placed by the NYDA head office, as well as in local youth offices. So, these are some of the activities that are embarked upon to respond to the hon member's question.

Mr S C MOTAU: Hon Minister, the big issue here is that the current quarterly labour force survey indicates that 60% of South African youth are unemployed and this fact was made graphically this morning at the meeting with the NYDA leadership.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 33

It is quite clear that because of the South African economy being so anaemic, there will be less money available for skills development and things that you mentioned here this afternoon.

Furthermore, it is quite clear that youth unemployment has become a national crisis which needs urgent intervention yet there is clearly no political will to address this problem. We are in dire need of economic growth yet our Cabinet lurches from one scandal to the other. How will you ensure that youth in whom we have invested finally get employment in a country where 9,4 million people are now jobless? Thank you.

The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY: Chairperson, it is true that the young people bear the brunt of youth unemployment in our country, with 27,7% unemployment in our country and our Cabinet has decided that going forward, one of the key issues to focus upon is the issue over and above job creation and small business development is to focus on youth development. I must emphasise that the government on

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 34

its own will not be able to resolve all the problems that confront the South African economy. We require all partners, the private sector, labour and organs of civil society to come on board so that you can ensure that we reignite this economic growth.

As we all know that about 75% of the economies are in private hands, so they must come to the party to invest in our young people so that we can be able to get the jobs that are required in order to achieve our objectives in the National Development Plan, NDP. Thank you.

IsiZulu:

Mnu M HLENGWA: Ngiyathokoza Somlomo, mhlonishwa Bhungane, zinle impela izinhlelo [programmes] okhuluma ngazo, inkinga yazo yinye nje, zitholakala emadolobheni bese thina-ke intsha ehlala emakhaya lezi zinto singazitholi, imali yokugibela asinayo, i-inthanethi [internet] ayikho, i-WiFi, hayi mina ngihlala eMfume emakhaya kuwodi-105 [ward 105] eThekwini phansi kweNkosi uHlengwa emakhaya, ngiyazazi ngihlalaphi ima, Whoa! Kahle. [Please] Ngakho-ke Bhungane

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 35

engifuna ukwazi wukuthi, yiziphi izinhlelo eziphathekayo ezizoqinisekisa ukuthi intsha yasemakhaya, intsha yaseMfume, ekufanele igibele amatekisi amathathu ukuze ifike edolobheni ukuthi nayo isizakale? Ngoba empeleni abantu abasha basalele emuva uma lamathuba bengeke ukuzuwathola ngoba siyazi sonke ukuthi uma sebefikile emadolobheni beshiye emakhaya bahambe bayohlala ezindaweni ezingalungile bavuleleke kwizidakamizwa kanye nazo zonke izinto ezenza ukuthi zibuyele emuva.

English:

We have discussed this thing of the national footprint of the NYDA before and it needs to be fast-tracked because for as long as it is not done, rural youth remain at the periphery of the discourse of youth development. Thank you.

IsiZulu:

UNGQONGQOSHE EHHOVISI LIKAMENGAMELI: Ngiyabonga Somlomo, hayi, uqinisile uMnu uHlengwa, yikho-nje nathi siyasho kwi-NYDA ukuthi isabalale iye kuzo zonke izindawo zasemakhaya ngoba siyazi ukuthi ulusha lwasemakhaya aliwutholi kahle

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 36

ulwazi [information] olukhona. Kanjalo [So] siyavumelana naleyonto. Yikho-nje i-NYDA ingena kubambiswano [partnerships] neziphatimandla zezindawo [local authorities] ikakhulukazi omasipala basemakhaya ukuthi kubekhona amahovisi khona lapho nanokuthi futhi uMnyango Wezokuthuthukiswa Kwezindawo Zasemakhaya Nezinguquko Zomhlaba nawo kufanele ubambe iqhaza ekusizeni ulusha ikakhulukazi kulezo zindawo okhuluma ngazo kodwa ngoba sengisho nje, kufanele yonke imiphakathi ibambisane noHulumeni kanye ne-NYDA ukuze lezi zinkinga ulusho ezibeke phansi kwazo ukuthi sikwazi sizisombulule. Kanjalo, ngiyabonga.

Mr M N PAULSEN: Speaker, I will take the question. The NYDA is just an automated teller machine, ATM. Three years after the ANC and the DA supported youth wage subsidy came into effect, youth unemployment has reach an all-time high of 55,9%. Over R5 billion has been given to support the youth wage subsidy, which even its most vocal supporters say it has failed. Is it not time to scrap the youth wage subsidy

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 37

and come up with other social interventions so that young people can acquire the necessary work experience?

The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY: Hon Mashabela, no, the solution is not to close the programme but to expand them. So, we believe that we need to put more effort in supporting youth development initiatives. That is why there are many government programmes that are aimed at supporting the youth but also part of the solution is to impart youth entrepreneurialship because our young people's ambitions must not just be to have skills and to be job seekers but to be job creators in their own right. That is why the Department of Small Business Development is engaged in those initiatives to empower our young people so that they must have the courage and ambition to be job creators in their own right.

Question 241:

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: Speaker, I think in my previous response to this question to the House I indicated that the President

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 38

established the interministerial team constituted of the Department of Public Enterprise, National Treasury and Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs, Cogta.

This team attends to challenges faced by various municipalities with regards to Eskom accounts. I must indicate that most of these challenges are structural and systematic. Members of this task team and Eskom officials also visit various municipalities in each of the provinces as a response to the Promotion of Administrative Justice Act processes initiated by Eskom.

Common challenges are identified by this task team through such engagements. The team has managed to resolve the following issues to make it more affordable and easier for municipalities to pay Eskom: The team has been able to negotiate with Eskom which eventually agreed to reduce the interest rate charge to municipalities on overdue accounts from prime plus 5% to prime plus 2,5% and this has been given effect as of 01 July this year.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 39

Eskom is also now charging its customers interest after 30 days from the payments that municipalities made to Eskom as of the same date. This interest used to be charged, as you are all aware, after 15 days and this created problems for municipal financial systems.

National Energy Regulator, NERSA, is also being directed by the interministerial task team to review the method of calculating the notified maximum demand penalty as well as the notified maximum demand rules to address this matter. These penalties are keeping municipalities perpetually in debt because they become due after two months of defaulting for the balance of the year, irrespective of whether there are no further defaults.

These reviews will be completed before the end of the current financial year. Our team has facilitated that National Treasury is assisting municipalities with the consolidation of all amounts due to Eskom to determine the capital and interest due respectively. National Treasury

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 40

adjusted section 41 Reporting Template for Eskom to breakdown the capital amount and the interest component.

In addition, the team facilitated that National Treasury conduct a comprehensive and holistic analysis of the 60 highest owing municipalities for the affordability and financial sustainability assessment. This assessment results from the basis of provincial engagement with the affected municipalities which I led to facilitate ownership by premiers to drive the rehabilitation programme at that level. Our engagements with premiers are currently under way. Thank you very much, Speaker.

Mr K J MILEHAM: Speaker, the Minister gave us no further information based on what we heard in October, so there's been very little progress. But perhaps the Minister of non-answers can answer this: Currently there are six municipalities being throttled and a number more facing cut-offs starting in December. Minister, the life blood of these municipalities' economies is being sucked up by the increasingly heavy-handed Eskom.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 41

As the Chairperson of the interministerial task team on this crisis, will you agree that the affected municipalities are unlikely to ever afford the repayment plans being forced upon them by Eskom, and what are you doing to get Eskom to write-off some of the older debt and interest?

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: We currently attending to problems of four municipalities in as far as their debt to Eskom is concerned. We are currently working with our team and Eskom in Thabazimbi, Thaba Tshweu, Renosterberg as well Thembelihle.

As I have indicated, we are working with National Treasury to make sure that as their repayment plans are agreed to these repayment plans are realistic and municipalities are able to honour.

So, definitely, this is something that we are working on and we think that in the long run we will be able to have a

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 42

long lasting solution to deal with sustainable repayment plans by these municipalities. Thank you very much.

Mr M L SHELEMBE: My question is, would the Minister consider placing such municipalities, where debt to Eskom is threatening to destabilise the lives of residents who pay their electricity bills regularly, under administration? I thank you.

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: I indicated earlier on that the problems we are dealing with here are structural and systematic. So, the issue of intervention or introduction of section 139 is not a solution here. There are serious underlying problems that need to be sorted out and some of these problems range from financial viability because most of our municipalities that we are dealing with don't have what I term "solid economic base" up to issues of technical capacity that we require in these municipalities to handle this problem.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 43

I don't think intervening without addressing those structural and systematic challenges is a solution. We will be working very closely with the affected provinces, municipalities, Salga and all other role players to assist these municipalities to be viable and to be able to attend to their creditors and financial obligations. Thank you very much.

IsiZulu:

Inkosi R N CEBEKHULU: Ngiyabonga Somlomo, lungu elihloniphekile inselelo lapha ekuhambeni kukagesi emadolobheni njengalokhu omasipala behluleka ukukhokhela ukusetshenziswa kukagesi akushayi kuphela abahlali kodwa kanjalo nosomabhizinisi nezinkampani ezikhona ezisebenzayo ziyashayeka. EMnyangweni wakho ingabe kukhona yini ilungu elihloniphekile elikuhlelayo ukubhekela ukuthi basizakale ukuze abantu abaqashiwe abasebenzayo bangaphelelwa umsebenzi ngoba cishe kungagcina kuholele ekutheni izinkampani eziningi ziphume kulamadolobha uma zihluleka ngoba u-Eskom akakhokhelwa ugesi ukuze usetshenziswe. Lithini lungu elihloniphekile kuloko.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 44

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: Electricity is a very central service for our economic development, so obviously if we do not have a solution to electricity problems then that might adversely affect our National Development Plan but also compromise the growth prospects of the country.

As a result of that, we are treating this matter very seriously and hence we are going all out to make sure that we don't pay lip service to address this problem. We are addressing this problem to make sure that all the structural issues ... remember that this is not a new problem and now our pre-occupation or obsession is about finding solutions to these stubborn and perennial problems that have been identified in these municipalities. That is exactly what we are doing in a collaborative fashion. Thank you very much hon Speaker.

Prof N M KHUBISA: Hon Minister, one of the issues that came quite sharply at the portfolio committee recently when there was a meeting between the department, Eskom and

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 45

Treasury, was the fact that there was a fight over space between Eskom and the municipality and also the issue of the indigent people who cannot afford to pay.

What has the department done to ensure that such challenges are dealt with, the issue of space and of indigent? Thank you very much.

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: Speaker, there is ambiguity around who is the executive authority of providing electricity in the definition of Eskom and Salga respectively on behalf of municipalities.

As a result of this ambiguity, Salga, on behalf of municipalities presented to the task team that they would want a declaratory order just to give clarity around who is having the complete or the executive authority over the electricity reticulation in the country.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 46

We said the declaratory order is not the way to go; let us explore all the platforms that are there for us within the frame of intergovernmental relations. We now have concluded the terms of reference because we want a mediatory process to kick in where we will be appointing an advisory panel of experts just to give guidance around this impasse and we hope that this will provide clarity around the executive authority of electricity management and reticulation in our country.

Going forward, there are issues around where Eskom is providing services, how do we deal with public goods like street lighting, public lighting and these are the issues that we are currently faced with as this task team because we need to be clear where Eskom is providing service. How do we handle such things and their maintenance as well as their efficiency?

These are some of the things that we are currently discussing. We will go on to deal with how to ensure that the credit control provision of municipalities are

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 47

accommodated within the Eskom system of providing such a service where Eskom is rendering such a service because municipalities find it difficult to effect their credit control measures in areas where electricity is provided by Eskom.

These are some of the things that we are discussing as well as how to accommodate indigents within the Eskom system. These are the discussions that are currently taking place. Thank you, hon Speaker.

Question 233:

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION:

The National Development Plan identified the following challenges: The turnover rate and the evaluation of head of department, HODs, impact negatively and affect productivity, service delivery, institutional memory and organisational knowledge; the deficit in technical/specialist skills and professionalism affects all elements of the public service; and the management of career incidents of head of departments.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 48

The contradictions in the legislation as role clarification and relationships at the executive and administrative interface are sometimes not clear. The discrepancy between the authority and responsibility in terms of the Public Finance Management Act and the Public Service Act also contributes to predicting and service delivery.

This role allocation is one of the key reasons of conflict between executive authorities and heads of department, and this has led to instability in some departments. A demarcation between accountability for policy issues and accountability for administrative matters, and this instability of leadership and policy approach impacts heavily on service delivery.

To stabilise the political-administrative interface, the NDP proposed the creation of a Head of the Public Service with responsibility for managing the career incidents of heads of departments, including convening panels for recruitment, performance assessment and disciplinary

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 49

procedures. Research is currently underway that will guide the way forward on this matter. Thank you.

Mrs W S NEWHOUDT-DRUCHCHEN: Hon Deputy Minister, the Minister approved the guidelines to clarify the administrative roles and responsibilities when developing operational policies. Was this directive sent out to national and provincial departments on the guidelines to clarify the roles and responsibilities; and do the guidelines assist to avoid detentions of the political and administrative interface?

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION: Hon Speaker and the hon member, yes, it does! In order to stabilise these contradictions, the department has developed performance management and development systems for HODs, to be implemented with effect from 01 April 2018. I thank you.

Ms Z JONGBLOED: Hon Speaker, the Ministry seems to be running the department from a private office, where

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 50

according to reports, she has private office staffers taking over key responsibilities from high-ranking officials that opposed the direction in which she wanted to take the department, and took a tough stance on fiscal control. Can the Minister definitively state that her private office staffers are not interfering with senior officials' competencies, or is this a blatant attempt to capture the department by her?

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION:
Hon Speaker and hon member, the Minister is not running her office privately. He has her offices in Pretoria and in Cape Town. We are not aware of her having an office outside these two precincts. Thank you.

Mr M HLENGWA: Hon Deputy Minister, let us be practical: The problem at SA Social Services Agency, Sassa, was on issue of procurement, and you had interference of politicians in that process. We bungled from scandal to scandal: Make me an example. Now, we are already finding ourselves sitting on the brink of a crisis. The question then becomes: What

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 51

protection do you offer the public servants who find themselves bearing the brutal brunt of the interference of politicians?

When things go pear shaped, politicians then pull back and say: No, no, no; it was not my competence. However, if you go and investigate, you can trace their hand from A-to-Z of the problem. At the end of the day, it is public servants who take the fall for the incompetence of politicians, particularly Ministers. So, how are you going to go about protecting public servants from the rogue hands of politicians?

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION:
Hon Speaker and hon member, Hlengwa, the public servants are protected by the Constitution itself. Over and above that, the Public Service Act also protects them as well. So, anybody who is being intimidated or instructed to perform unlawful acts has a mechanism to go and report the incident. In our view, we don't think that there is anyone who will be abused or intimidated because they all know

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 52

what to do in case there are those incidents. I thank you, hon Hlengwa.

Ms N V MENTE: Speaker, political administrative interference has rightly been highlighted in the disastrous National Development Plan as one of the challenges in realising a capable developmental state, yet, the Minister suspended the DG, the DDG and the CFO. We are supposed to be developing the state!

Also, across other departments, like the Department of Water Affairs and Sanitation, we saw a DG being suspended and fired. Then another DG was hired. Six months down the line, the DG is gone! There is an Acting DG that must take a wrap of things that they do not know. Every time, there is an unlawful instruction to DDGs and DGs which they must carry out without asking questions.

Just recently, a DG had to take the Home Affairs Minister to court in order for him to be reinstated. Who is going to be liable for the cost that the state bears due to the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 53

negligence and unlawful instructions of Ministers upon DGs in the public service?

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION:
Hon Speaker and hon member, let me start by clarifying the issue of the DG from the Department of Public Service and Administration: He is not suspended but he is on a special leave. He has requested that ... [Interjections.] He requested the special leave himself. In relation to the costs ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Please proceed, hon Deputy Minister. Hon members, allow the Deputy Minister to finish answering the question.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION:
The other question which was raised by the hon member is: Who will bear the costs of the court proceedings in relation to the suspension of the HOD? I am sure you were referring to the Department of Home Affairs. The state will have to carry those costs because the Minister was acting

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 54

of behalf of government ... [Interjections.] Whether it was unlawful or lawful, she was carrying her responsibility on behalf of the department. I thank you, hon Speaker.

Question 231:

The MINISTER OF WOMEN IN THE PRESIDENCY: Hon Speaker, the Department of Women in the Presidency, conducted and launched a report on the status of women in August 2015.

[Interjections.]

IsiZulu:

Ngicofile. Ngicofile. Ayizwakwali ngiyaxolisa.

English:

The MINISTER OF WOMEN IN THE PRESIDENCY: Subsequent, the President issued a directive to all departments in the economic sectors employment infrastructure development to report periodically to the Department of Women in the Presidency on how women are to be mainstreamed in all plans, programmes and budgets of government. The Department of Women in the Presidency has been further tasked with

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 55

oversight towards achieving the mainstreaming of women into the country's economy.

Currently, we are busy developing two policy frameworks on Gender Responsive Budgeting, GRB, which will help us in the monitoring as well as the financial inclusion in the economy and the GRB is intended to align planning and budgeting and informed areas of prioritisation, whilst the latter aims to determine the extent of which women access benefits from the incentives. Thank you, Chair

Ms T C MEMELA: Hon Speaker and hon Minister just give us the information based to our interactions especially women because they are frustrated and I am now quoting the women in Phongola who are actually harvesting oysters without any proper implements. How are we going to help them?

The MINISTER OF WOMEN IN THE PRESIDENCY: Hon Speaker, just to respond to the question is that the women in Phongola who are involved as part of the ... [Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 56

Mr M WATERS: why are you reading the answer, you are not supposed to know the supplementary question.

Ms M S KHAWULA: Mr Waters, stop it!

The MINISTER OF WOMEN IN THE PRESIDENCY: The women in Phongola are part of the Aquaculture Women's Area and I must say that when we deal with the issues of the women, Operation Phakisa is considering areas in which they can make sure that they regularise and licence them for them to be more productive, but for them to contribute towards the economy of the country. Part of the Operation Phakisa, intends to make sure that women are empowered and also making sure that more women expand in the area of Operation Phakisa in our country. Thank you.

Ms T STANDER: Madam Speaker, Minister you need to stop blaming society for your failures the facts are girls do better than boys in school, yet 70% of top management is made up of man. Women are the majority of the unemployed. Women are paid 25% less than man. The World Trade

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 57

Organisation's Committee on Trade and Environment 20-year report, CTE 20-year report, shows that inequality has increased under the ANC and according to the Commission for Gender Equality, CGE, they have reported to the committee that you have refused to accept that gender missionary has failed and collapsed in places like the premier's offices. Yet last year you spent 98% of your budget on administration which includes salaries and travel while only receiving two of 22 core service delivery objectives! [Interjections.]

These are the facts, Minister and society is not responsible for them. When and will you today admit you have failed! [Applause.]

The MINISTER OF WOMEN IN THE PRESIDENCY: Hon Speaker, the issue of gender equality starts directly across the floor. Whereas the ANC has made sure that the issue of fifty-fifty becomes a reality, hon member, you have to start where you are right now before you can talk about women out there. [Applause.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 58

The other thing which I want to say, hon member, you're being here today, is because of my sacrifice as a young woman in the ANC underground. [Applause.] Where were you? Where were you? Where were you? We continue as the ANC in government to make sure that women in this country changes and participate equally. Where are your policies?

[Interjections.]

Ms T STANDER: Speaker, Speaker ...

The MINISTER OF WOMEN IN THE PRESIDENCY: Where are your policies, which talks about the woman? Where are your policies as a party which shows your commitment in advancing women in this country?

The SPEAKER: The Minister has finished answering the question. Can I call on the ... [Interjections.]

Ms T STANDER: She is misleading this House.

[Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 59

The SPEAKER: Hon member, please take your seat. Hon Khawula.

IsiZulu:

Nk M S KHAWULA: Sawubona weSihlalo ngaphambili, Ngqongqoshe, [Minister] mina ngifuna ukubuza nje okuncane, ungilalele kahle, anithuleni nithi du. [Ubuwelewele.] Abantu besifazane siyababona bakhona bayakwazi ukusebenza ezimayini baqashiwe, ngabe Ngqongqoshe, yinini lapho nathi esisobabona abantu besifazane nabo sebengabanikazi [owners] bezimayini? Uma bekhona, bakuphi, bangobani? Yilokho nje, ngiyabonga.

The MINISTER OF WOMEN IN THE PRESIDENCY: Hon Chair ...

IsiZulu:

Ngibonga kakhulu mhlobo wami ngoba phela la eNingizimu Afrika, ngenhlanhla ngiphuma lapho la ngakha khona imithetho eyenze ukuba abantu besifazane bakwazi ukuba baqhubekeke laphaya ezimayini. Sibakhuthaze [Psych up] ukuba babe namakhono [skills] kanti-ke ukhona umama laphaya

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 60

okuthiwa wumama u-Daphne Mashile-Nkosi ophethe imayini enkulu e-Northern Cape, manje ngenza isibonelo, [example] baningi. Hamba ngala eMpumalanga, uzobathola nabanye omama abephethe izimayini, asipheleli lapho kuphela, siphinde sithi nalaphaya kwimisebenzi yasezimayini mabaphathe abantwana bethu. Ngingasho nje ukuthi, akukudala la ngihlangane nentombazane eneminyaka engamashumi amathathu nambili [32 years old] ebingitshela ukuthi ingumphathi wemayini [mine manager] wezempilo nezokuphepha [health and safety] laphaya eSasol, manje siyaqhubeka sense ukuba abantu besifazane sikwazi ukuba siqube babe nenqubekela phambili. Thina siyaqhuba, usele emuva wena.

Ms H O MKHALIPI: Chairperson, on a point of order.

English:

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Yes hon member, what is your point of order?

Ms H O KHALIPI: My point of order is:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 61

IsiZulu:

... uNqgqongqoshe [Minister] akezwanga, sifuna abafazi abangabanikazi [owners] bezimayini, hayi abaqashiwe ...

English:

Mine owners.

IsiZulu:

Akusona Isingisi lesi njengoba washo ku-Dali Mpofu, abangabanikazi bezimayini eNingizimu Afrika.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Thank you, very much. I think the Minister has responded. Can we move to the next follow-up question by the hon Majeke.

Mrs C N MAJEKE: Hon Chair.

IsiXhosa:

Hayini, niyangxola kodwa.

English:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 62

Hon Minister, given the departmental mandate on streamlining of the gender equality: How much is budgeted and spent by each of the service delivery departments and on which specific projects and the allocation with quantitative and qualitative beneficiation to women? Thank you, Chair.

The MINISTER OF WOMEN IN THE PRESIDENCY: Hon Chair, may I say, hon member, and the reply is so detailed. If I knew I would have given you the information, but I am committing that I will put it in writing and give all the information you require. For indeed, we are making progress and we have challenges, but we will put it in writing and give it to you. Thank you.

Question 242:

The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY: House Chairperson, the Management Performance Assessment Tool, MPAT, of the Department of Planning Monitoring and Evaluation has been instrumental in assessing the compliance of the Promotion of Access of Information Act in government departments.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 63

The Promotion of Access of Information Act standard has been utilised to effectively monitor the implementation of Promotion of Access of Information Act in ensuring that access of information is dealt with in a transparent and accountable manner.

The assessment of Promotion of Access of Information Act standard encompasses the compliance evaluation on whether a department has appointed a deputy Information Officer to monitor the implementation of Promotion of Access of Information Act in the department, whether it complies with the issuing of section 14 manual in three official languages which indicates to the public on mechanisms a department should have in the handling of records, information requests and also the issuing of section 15 notice to the Department of Justice and Constitutional Development, on which records are automatically available as well as the issuing of the section 32 notice to the South African Human Rights Commission on how a department has handled a Promotion of Access of Information Act request over the period under review. Thank you.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 64

Mr S C MOTAU: Hon Minister, sadly things are not as you express them. Clearly there is something very wrong and this is despite the efforts of the Department of Planning Monitoring and Evaluation - your ministry - to intervene. Clearly there is something wrong when 58% of Promotion of Access of Information Act requests are willy-nilly refused by government institutions.

During the two year period that was being looked at by the commission, 3 321 complaints were directed to the South African Human Rights Commission relating to violation of constitutional right to access of information. In that period, 369 Promotion of Access of Information Act requests were made.

Recently, as an example, the DA suffered such refusal of our Promotion of Access of Information Act request for information on the budget prioritisation framework or what is known as the Mandate Paper. This was rejected; we were told that the Mandate Paper is classified Cabinet record. What is the Presidency hiding? Could the Mandate Paper be a

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 65

ploy by the Presidency, and that is President Zuma, to hijack the budgeting process from the Treasury to prioritise a trillion Rand nuclear deal with Putin's Russia? Thank you.

The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY: It is very unfortunate that the hon Motau knows the answer to what he is asking. His colleague, Maynier, asked that question and I did answer it that there was an exuberant enthusiasm of a public official and we did provide that Mandate Paper to the committee last week, which I did personally.

There is no hiding of the Mandate Paper; it is a public document and has been distributed. There is no intention of taking over National Treasury; that is a myth. The issue of the Mandate Paper, as I previously explained, emanated from the National Planning Commission for us as government to reprioritise our budget to be in line with the National Development Plan priorities. This has been accepted by Cabinet as well as the extended Cabinet that is why it is in the public domain with all those seven priorities going

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 66

forward which will be reflected in the budget speech of the Minister of Finance in February 2018. There is no substance in the sense that Motau is suggesting.

Even though there have been challenges in the past three years but there is a lot of progress in terms of government departments responding to Promotion of Access of Information Act requests. Try us again and we will ensure that these things are done in a proper manner.

Mr D M NTOMBELA: House Chair, will the Minister agree that the promotion of access to information by public and constituencies greatly contribute towards participatory governance? If so, would the Minister agree that the access can be facilitated through updated government departments' websites broadcasts in the constituency offices and simplified language? The question is: Are these measures in place and how effective are they?

The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY: I do agree with the hon member I can also indicate that over a three year period

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 67

from 2014 to 2016 the national average for the Management Performance Assessment Tool's Promotion of Access of Information Act standard has increased from a below compliance score of 2,4 in 2014 to a staggering 3,1 in 2016 which reflects a 27% increase over a mere three year period. The Promotion of Access of Information Act performance rate in 2016 now stands at 70%. That shows progress of what is being done here.

I do agree that also as parliamentarians, in our constituency office, as the hon member is suggesting, we can use those offices to spread the transparency in our work. Thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): The next supplementary question will come from hon Mente.

Ms N V MENTE: The Deputy Secretary General will take it.

Ms H O MKHALIPI: Bhungane, the Minister of Social Development has constantly and purposefully prevented

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 68

Parliament from accessing the most basic information on South Africa Social Security Agency, Sassa, documents relating to grant distribution. This directly contravenes with the Promotion of Access of Information Act.

Does the Minister have the necessary tools and power to hold those accountable for not providing information as highlighted in the Act? If yes, can the Minister guarantee that he will use this power to compel the Minister of Social Development, Minister B, to supply the required information on Sassa to Parliament? It looks like Minister B is very powerful in the ANC nowadays...

IsiZulu:

... ngenkathi abantu abadala bethu bezophuthelwa ukuthola impesheni yabo. [Uhleko.]

English:

When Minister B comes here, she is very big and very arrogant.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 69

IsiZulu:

Ngqongqoshe siyakucela xazulula le nkinga. Uze asibize nangamaselele. [Uhleko.]

The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY: Through the Promotion of Access of Information Act issues as indicated in the law, the Minister and the affected parties there are actually channels of accessing this kind of information. I am sure that necessary information needed in the Portfolio Committee on Social Development will be provided. If my Cabinet colleague receives that request he will consider it in terms of the applicable legislation of Promotion of Access of Information Act. Thank you.

Ms H O MKHALIPI: Point of order House Chair. With due respect,

IsiZulu:

... awuphendulanga lungu elihloniphekile. [Ubuwelewele.]
Ngithi ngamandla anikezwe kuwe ungakwazi yini ukuwufuna yini lo mbiko kuNgqongqoshe B ngoba akafuni nawo? Sengibuza

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 70

kuwena ehhovisi lakho Ngqongqoshe lungu elihloniphekile
Bhungane - ngo-B bobabili, B Dlamini kanye no-B Radebe.

English:

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Alright hon member.
Minister, you have responded, do you still want to respond?

The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY: [Inaudible.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Okay, thank you.

Question 228:

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL
AFFAIRS: Hon member, the department drafted the Customary
Initiation Bill and consulted widely on it. The Bill is
based on the principles contained in the policy on the
customary practice of initiation in South Africa, which our
Cabinet approved in 2016.

In July this year the Bill was published in the Government
Gazette for public comment. Based on the comments received,

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 71

the Bill was refined and referred to the Office of the Chief State Law Adviser for the final legal editing.

Once the Bill is received from the Office of the chief State Law Adviser, it will be submitted to the Cabinet for final consideration and approval to table it in Parliament.

I must indicate that answering the second part of the question, question b, the department is currently reviewing its organizational structure with a view to create an implementation unit.

This unit - as earlier indicated - will be responsible for the implementation of the laws administered by the Department of Co-operative Governances and Traditional Affairs, on behalf of the Minister. This includes laws that assign specific powers, duties and functions to the director-general and the department. This unit will also be responsible for the monitoring of the implementation of the new laws by relevant role-players.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 72

As far as the financial resources are concerned, the department has already informed National Treasury for the possibility of this Bill becoming a law and the additional financial resources that may be required.

The department will therefore make provisions for these in the forth coming financial cycle.

I must emphasise, Chairperson, that it is a collaborative effort. The Department of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs is working in partnership with the South African Police Service, SAPS, Department of Health, the House of Traditional Leaders, Department of Social Development, National Prosecuting Authority, NPA, and NGOs; especially Right to Care, which is composed of medical doctors and nurses and Community Development Foundation of South Africa. Thank you very much, House Chair.

Mr J J DUBE: House Chair, when does the Minister anticipate the process of reviewing the organizational structure to be finalized by the department?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 73

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: House Chair, I think it is important to emphasise the need for ensuring that a national department like Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs, Cogta, is fit for purpose.

So, as we are speaking now, we have what we call enterprise architecture, which deals with all the shortcomings and the gaps that are there in our organizational structure. This process - as we are speaking - is on-going and we think that the unit that we've referred to will be accommodated in the said organizational structure. Thank you very much, House Chair.

Mr K J MILEHAM: Hon Minister, the number of initiate deaths is a cause for concern every year. The proposed Customary Initiation Bill will go some way to addressing this.

But Minister, the question is, why has it taken so long for this Bill to come to Parliament, in fact it hasn't even come to Parliament yet. Where is the sense of urgency on

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 74

this matter? How many more young men must die or being mutilated before your ANC takes action?

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: Indeed hon member, you are correct. This issue has been taking too long. But as you know, our democratic system requires us to do extensive consultations; and you know for a fact that this process has been subjected to a very very consultative and thorough process.

At times, as much as you do have some appropriate submissions to make or help our developmental course; I get concerned when we comply with the democratic provisions, and you complain; when we don't comply, you take us to court. Truly speaking, you should be considerate before you label the ANC-led government as the government that is not performing because there are provisions, as guided by the legislation, that should be followed. We have done exactly that and definitely, our campaign for zero tolerance to deaths in initiation schools is on course, with the support

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 75

of other role-players. Thank you very much, hon House Chair.

Prof N M KHUBISA: Hon Minister, you have alluded to the fact that your department, especially on traditional affairs, works in tandem with other departments in ensuring that this Bill is a success and also to curb the deaths of initiates.

Now, in KwaZulu-Natal, KZN, in particular, his majesty the king, amakhosi and other departments have been working together to ensure that this sacred initiation is done accordingly.

Would you think that whilst the Bill is in process, the same should apply with other provinces, especially in the Eastern Cape, where there have been so many initiates that have died in the process of ... under such unscrupulous individuals who were masquerading as people who can perform initiation? Thank you very much.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 76

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: As part of our zero tolerance to this loss of life encountered by young people as they through sacred customary practice, it does not imply that when the Bill or when there is no law there's nothing that the provincial governments are doing. Guided by the policy - remember we do have a national policy that has been approved. Now, I have insisted with all the provincial departments that they should develop provincial laws that are guided by this policy.

And I can confirm now, as KZN is doing, it's happening in all other provinces. I think the Bill will assist us - I mean - to criminalize some of these practices that you have alluded to; because I think that's where we have been lacking, and the development of this Bill will empower us to deal with those who are taking advantage of this important practice. Thank you very much, house Chair.

IsiZulu:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 77

Inkosi C N CEBEKHULU: Angithokoze Sihlalo, cishe uSolwazi ubekile ngolimi lweSilungu kodwa obekungihlupha kukodwa mhlonishwa, eminyakeni cishe engamashumi amabili umbuso usemandleni, yinselelo enkulu le ebibhekene nesizwe, ukulahleka kwentsha yethu nxa ngabe iye entabeni. Kuthathe sonke lesi sikhathi esingaka mhlonishwa ukuthi kugcine kube nokucabanga emnyangweni ukuthi kufanele kwenziwe uMthethosivivinywa ukuwenza ukubhekela lokhu. Umuzwa wami akuwona nje owami njengomuntu nelungu kodwa usekutheni mhlonishwa, unyaka nonyaka nxa ngabe intsha yethu yabafana iya entabeni kuphoqa ukuthi omame baphequle iyikhaka benzela ukuthi izingane zabo zihambe zibuye entabeni.

Yini evimba ukuthi, njengoba esho uSolwazi, umnyango ukuphoqe ukuthi, laba abaye entabeni akube khona nodokotela abaqheqeshekileyo ukuze kugwemeke isimo lapho silahlekelwa yintsha yethu? Ubuhlungu nje yilobo bokuthi, njalo kufuneka babophe izinkalo omama uma kwenzeka kuphequla izikhaka nxa izingane zabo ... ngoba kufana nokuthi ziya empini uma ziya entabeni. Ngiyabonga.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 78

Setswana:

TONA YA TIRISANOMMOGO YA PUSO LE MERERO YA SETSO: Ke a leboga, Kgosi Cebekhulu. Jaaka ke setse ke tlhalositse, ga re a phutha matsogo ka gonne molao ono ga o teng. Re ntse re tshwere ka thata re dirisanammogo le mafapha a mangwe go netefatsa gore ditatlhegelo tse re di bonang kwa bogwera di a fokotsega.

E re ke go direle sekai, ngwagola ka 2016 re latlhegetswe ke makolwane a le 77; fela monongwaga ka mariga re latlhegetswe ke makolwane a le 18. Seno se diragetse ka ntata ya gore re tshwere ka thata le mafapha a mangwe go lwantshwana le bothata bono.

Ga re ithaye gore re fitlheletse maikaelelo a rona. Re tlhalosa fela gore matsapa a re ntseng re a tsaya ke one a re thusitseng gore re fokotse palo eo. Ka jalo, a re netefatseng gore re dirisanammogo le puso fa re ntse re letetse gore molao ono o nne teng.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 79

Ke lebogela tshegetso ya magosi kwa KZN le diporofense tse dingwe fa re ntse re lwantshwana le botlhokatsebe bono.

Dingaka le baoki ba teng e bile ba tsaya karolo mo ntweng eno e re tshwaraganeng le yone. Ke a leboga.

Question 234:

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION:
Chairperson of the session, thank you very much, and to the hon member who asked the question. On 15 June 2017, the Minister approved the establishment of a task team to deal with the outstanding issues at the Public Service Co-ordinating Bargaining Council, PSCBC. The Minister also mandated the chief negotiator for the state to table again the review of the Government Employees Medical Scheme, Gems, as well as the Government Employees Housing Scheme at the Public Service Co-ordinating Bargaining Council. Now, Chair, the employer is awaiting a response by organised labour in this regard. Further to answer the question, it is the intention of government to sign a multiyear agreement as it brings stability to the Public Service. A multiyear agreement will also give parties to the Council

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 80

an opportunity to grow the economy and promote sound labour relations between the state and the employer and its employees.

Parties are afforded the opportunity to implement the policies and collective agreements concluded during the negotiation process. Signing a multiyear agreement, hon Chair, will depend on the salary negotiation proceedings at the Public Service Co-ordinating Bargaining Council. I thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): I am sorry, it starts with a person who asked the question. Hon Lesoma, my apologies.

IsiZulu:

Nk R M M LESOMA: Angibonge Sihlalo ngaphambili sizibongele kakhulu ithuba osipha lona. Sekela Ngqongqoshe uyazi nawe ukuthi kuleminyaka emithathu eyedlule yesivumelwano uhulumeni asenza nabasebenzi kukhona izinto eziningi ezingenziwanga lapho. Umbuzo engiqondise wona kuwe: Uma

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 81

ngabe sesiza kulonyawo lolu lokuxoxisana ngokunyuka nokubuyekeza kwamaholo ingabe ikhona yini imali ebekelwe eceleni ukuqiniseka ukuthi lezi zayizolo izinto ezingenzekanga nesizovumelana ngazo manje zizokwenzeka, nesiqiniseko sokuthi uzakuqikelela ukuthi kuyenzeka lokho? Ngiyazibongela.

English:

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION:
Hon Chair and the hon member, as I indicated, the negotiation processes are on as we speak now. The issues of the negotiators and the Treasury are also happening as we speak. So, it is our belief that those agreements which were not able to be met in the previous negotiating circle, would also be addressed. I thank you.

Ms Z JONGBLOED: Chair, the Minister of Finance Malusi Gigaba stated that drastic steps are needed to help South Africa's ailing economy including freezing senior civil servants salaries. Was the Minister consulted about these? Does the department support the stance and how does

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 82

Minister Muthambi ensures that the Public Sector Wage Bill is fiscally responsible in the current economic climate?

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION: I thank you, hon Chair. There is interministerial task team which was set to make sure the negotiations including the capping of high bill in the public sector is maintained. As I indicated earlier on, negotiations are on as we speak now and we can only respond once the negotiations are concluded. I thank you, hon Chair.

IsiZulu:

Mnu K P SITHOLE: Ngiyabonga Sihlalo, lungu elihloniphekile Sekela likaNgqongqoshe, ...

English:

... are all trade unions broadly supportive of government intended multiyear wage agreement? What challenges do you foresee in this regard? Can agreement be reached soon?

Thank you very much.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 83

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION: I thank hon member. Can the agreement be reached soon? One cannot certainly say yes, but what we can assure the members in the House is that all the unions are involved, together with the National Economic Development and Labour Council, Nedlac, to make sure that the negotiations proceed as fast as they can because you will recall we are left with four months to can start with the next salary conclusions with the unions. Thank you.

Tshivenda:

Vho T MULAUDZI: Mufarisa Mulangadzulo, ndo imela Vho Matiase,

English:

... Deputy Minister.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon member, just say you are answering ...

Sepedi:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 84

Ke a go kwa gore o reng. Ga se wena o swanetšego go bolela,
e re o ema legatong la gagwe.

Tshivenda:

Vho T MULAUDZI: Ee, ndi khou fhindulela Vho Matiase.

English:

Deputy Minister, the unions in the Public Service are demanding 10% to 12% wage increase for the next three years. Will the government be able to afford such a wage increase, if not, does the Minister think it is justifiable to deny public servants a wage increase if the government were to embark on trillion rands nuclear deal?

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION:

Hon Chair, ...

Sepedi:

Ke a leboga. Ke hlalositše gore ditherišano di tšwela pele,
Modulasetulo. Re le mmušo re ka se ke ra thibela maloko
goba bahlankedi ba mmušo gore ba se hwetše kokeletšo ya

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 85

bona mo ngwageng wo wa ditšhelete, empa re ka se netefatše gore mmušo o tla ba fa 10%.

Ka ge ke setše ke hlalositše ...

English:

... negotiation is about give and take. So, as soon as we reach an agreement, whether is ten or less or more, it will depend on the outcome of the negotiations. I thank you.

Question 239:

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): The next question, Question 239, asked by hon Van der Walt to the Minister of Public Service and Administration. I am informed that hon Jongbloed will take charge of the question.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION: Chairperson of the session and the hon member, the Minister of Public Service and Administration does not participate in any public service wage negotiations but only gives political advice and guidance. On the 15 March 2017,

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 86

Cabinet approved in the establishment of a committee of Ministers - I have already answered to that one but I will answer formally - the function of the committee of Ministers is to consider determinations on stipulations conditions of service for, firstly, employees in general or for a particular category in term of the Public Service Act. Secondly, educators in general or for a particular category in terms of the laws governing their employment and lastly, members of the regular force of the SA Defence Force, the SA Police Service and the Department of Correctional Services in general or a particular category in terms of their respective laws governing their employment. I thank you.

Ms Z JONGBLOED: Chair, the question concerns the Ministerial Handbook and the follow-up is, the department is meant to set the tone for other government departments in terms on administrative and staffing matters. The Ministerial Handbook currently states, there should be a maximum of 10 individuals for Minister's private offices yet Minister Muthambi has 26 staffers and counting

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 87

allegedly filled with family and friends. Is this an example other departments should follow? And can the Minister definitively state whether she has family members appointed to her personal office? Thank you.

AN HON MEMBER: It is a family business!

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION:
Chairperson, the answer is no. The Minister did not appoint family members in the Ministry.

AN HON MEMBER: Who appointed them?

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION:
On numerous occasions it has even been factually put on record that there is no single employee appointed in the Ministry who is a family member of the Minister.
Furthermore, the structure which is being used to capacitate the Ministry is exactly the same, which was being used by her predecessors and has been funded and approved prior to the Minister's appointment.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 88

The Minister has also openly denied these baseless allegations during her appearance in the National Council of Provinces, NCOP, as well as in the portfolio committee. All employees in the Ministry were employed legally in terms of the public service regulations and in line with Chapter 8 of the Ministerial Handbook. There was no violation of any prescript in this regard. I thank you.

Mr R D RYDER: Madam Chair, and through you to the Deputy Minister, the current Ministerial Handbook holds few consequences for transgressors. Will the updated version include any legal or formal consequences for breaches of this new Ministerial Handbook?

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION: I thank you hon member for the question, the Ministerial Handbook is being revised as we speak. We have already received inputs from all the stakeholders, all the departments, to make sure the revision covers what the hon member is raising and we hope before the end of the financial year the Ministerial Handbook will be completed

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 89

and members will be able to refer to it each time there are queries. I thank you, hon member.

Mr M HLENGWA: Hon Chairperson ...

IsiZulu:

... kuthiwa, "ayinuki ingosiwanga"

English:

So, you can hear these denials.

IsiZulu:

Kodwa okusalayo ...

English:

... Something fishy went on in the appointment of officials in the Department of Public Service and Administration when the new Minister took up her Portfolio after having wreaked chaos at the Department of Communications. So what we would like to know is the department and Minister specifically prepared to hand over

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 90

to this House the processes which were followed? Firstly
...

IsiZulu:

... sifuna ukubona okuzuziweyo [scores] ...

English:

... in terms of how the people were appointed, who appointed them because the issue is, she would go home to Limpopo and come back with an employee or a relative so it can not just be easily said, no I did not happen. If she adamantly says it did not happen, will she take action against the people who said she did that so that she can clear her name in court?

IsiZulu:

Kodwa nje, ayinuki ingosiwanga.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION: I am not sure if there was a question but I assume that the question was that, are we prepared to forward the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 91

information in terms of the scores to the House? It has never happened hon member. Thank you.

Mr D H KHOSA: Chair, hon Deputy Minister, is there a monitoring and evaluation system in place to assess compliance to the Ministerial Handbook once it is approved for implementation? Whether there will be consequence management for noncompliance. Thank you.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION: I thank you hon member, as I have indicated, the review of the Ministerial Handbook is currently happening. One of the issues which are being factored in the review is that, previously there was no consequence management system in the Ministerial Handbook; this is one of the issues which are included in the revision as we speak. I thank you, hon member.

Question 246:

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: The answer is no, there is no intention from my

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 92

side to fill the request with the National Treasury because each of the unspent conditional grants allocations per department is subject to each framework and conditions and all these are clearly define in the Division of Revenue Bill. In principle conditional grant funding cannot be included in the local government equitable chair. This is not the conditional grant, it is unconditional. Unconditional grant as we are all aware are designed to address specific issues in support of municipalities. Thank you very much.

Mr Z R XALISA: Chairperson, I expected that the Minister will waffle. However Minister the South African Salga recently warned that in the near future municipalities across the country will be not be able to provide basic service due to the latest budget allocations. This view is supported by municipalities across the country. What is the department doing to ensure that the local government which is in the frontline of service delivery's receive a greater share of the National budget?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 93

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: Well, Chair, I think I will understand why hon member is accusing me of waffling. You know, ministerial finance aspect can be very technical to a new comer, but just listen so that you can learn.

Ms H O MKHALIPI: Chair I rise on a point of order, Rule 92:

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): What is your point of order?

Ms H O MKHALIPI: Who is the new comer, is him as the weekend special Minister to this department? Do not waffle chief, answer.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon member, thank you.

Mr B A RADEBE: Chair, on a point of order:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 94

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon member, that is not a point of order, Thank you.

Mr B A RADEBE: Chair, on a point of order, as just I am rising on Rule 84 cheers whose are unparliamentary language by saying a Minister is a weekend special and also waffles. Can she withdraw that.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon members, we have to respect each other's dignity. We must be able to live to our standards by making sure that we maintain the order in the House. Let us refrain from using the words that are going to result in frictions. Thank you very much. Continue hon member.

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: House Chairperson, albeit this question is not directly related to the question pose because the question posed was about request a transfer of a conditional grant to an unconditional grant. Now, the question posed or the follow-up question is about the formula of allocating

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 95

resources to the municipality from the national revenue fund. The rate on the matter is that as we are all aware municipalities are just allocated 9,2% from the national revenue fund. Constitutionally municipalities are enjoined to generate their own revenue. Now as a result, jointly with Salga on behalf of municipalities and national treasury we are currently in the process of reviewing the funding model, not only of municipalities but also of all the three spheres of government. Definitely, we think that will address how much is allocated by the national revenue fund to municipalities but also to other spheres of government. That is a separate question but I am more than ready to take through my brother. I have been in this ting for quite some time.

Mr K J MILEHAM: Minister, thank you for admitting that a primary cause of your departmental under spent was failure to for properly spent or account for municipal infrastructure grant expenditure. Now, it is common cause that many rural municipalities are hopelessly incompetent when it comes to spending their funds. As an example the O

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 96

R Tambo District Municipality is reported to have written off R3,8 billion in unauthorised irregular and fruitless expenditure earlier this year. Will the Minister agree that the ANC cadre policy has failed South Africa and is the primary cause of corruption, maladministration and under spending and if you do not agree with that, why not?

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: I will not agree with your insinuation and I will tell you why; besides your passionate hatred of the ruling party. The current under expenditure as - I think you will be taking through the dissection of the current expenditure. The current under expenditure is for various solid reasons that will be accommodated in our post audit actions that we are currently developing as the Ministry. It is not that insinuation of yours. Really, if I had time, I will take through around the facets of the current under expenditure. The Department of Co-operative governance and Traditional Affairs as we are speaking now we have a Department of Traditional Affairs, for the first time in its existence has now realise a clean audit. Our standing

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 97

now, we have an unqualified audit opinion with clear clarifications and we are working on that. The unit that are accountable to us the commission on CRL, dramacation board they all have clean audits, why don't refer to those and look at a black spot in the whole white sheet. It is all because of your passionate hatred to the ruling party.

Sepedi:

Modulasetulo wa Ntlo (Moh M G Boroto): Re a leboga

Ye e latelago potšišo e tšwa go mohlomphegi Sithole.

IsiZulu:

Mnu M HLENGWA: Sihlalo, kwenzeke iphutha ... [Akuzwakali.]
lapha besicindezela, angazi noma ngingaqhubeka yini?

USIHLALO WENDLU (Nk M G Boroto): Qhubeka baba.

Mnu M HLENGWA: Ngiyathokoza. Munye uSihlalo la eNdlini,
kahle, hlonipha uSihlalo, yingakho ngicela.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 98

English:

Hon Minister, we know that there is quite a number of municipalities who have been receiving - I know when there is always says there is a clean audit and let me give a sophisticated name to what is a not a clean - dirty audits for over five years now and the AG has time and time again made reference to those. Now this speaks their limitation in terms of service delivery and which impacts negatively on communities. Of the - may be 10 worse performing municipalities, what interventions are practically there - I know back to basics exist but these municipalities evidently need something beyond back to basics to ensure that you pull them out of the difficulty that is in. So, what targeted interventions specifically for those municipalities which have demonstrated the struggle for the past five years is in place which is not similar to what is generally being meted out for everybody else. Thank you.

IsiZulu:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 99

UNGQONGQOSHE KAHULUMENI WOKUBAMBISANA KANYE NEZINDABA

ZENDABUKO: Ngiyabonga lungu elihloniphekile [hon member]

...

English:

Indeed, we have all agreed and accepted that some of the municipalities that have been enjoying our focus through various interventions have been in that situation for quite some time. That is why the define second phase of our back to basic is addressing exactly your concern because this municipality is very clear that one of the lessons that we have learned out of various interventions that have been done is that their problems are not the same and they need exactly what you are suggesting, and focus and a very specific intervention. But the reality of the matter is that some of our interventions are we are convinced that were not properly configured because in some cases we send an administrator as if an administrator will have the required capacity to intervene in the running of the whole municipality. Now, we have realised that that approach is not working. We must have an approach where we send a team

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 100

of expects depending on the problems encountered by that municipality.

That is what we are doing now. We are currently engaging provinces we have already engaged Northern Cape focusing on all of those municipalities. Just last week Friday we were in North West, very soon we will be going to Mpumalanga. The intention is to do exactly that. In those working section meetings we are taking a thorough analysis of each municipality to look at what are the problems and how can we solve them, working together with the National Treasury, municipalities, premier offices and of course the Department of Finance and Departments of Local Government in those provinces. We are definitely taking a different approach this time around. Thank you very much, hon Chair.

Mr E M MTHETHWA: Minister, can you share with us this funding model that you are talking about, particularly to those municipalities that has been really failing now and then; may be as you have alluded to earlier on that there

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 101

is a model. Can you share with us what is this model and how far with it?

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: Chairperson, albeit of course a completely a new question. However, I think as I have already indicated the funding model that we are employing to determine the distribution of resources to municipalities is local government equitable share. As we are all aware, we have been reviewing this equitable share for the past few years. For now we are on the second if the not the third review of this formula. What we have realise- hence we are calling for the review of the formula is that in the past review we were not considering the cost of - as an example - providing a service in the rural areas as compared to the cost of providing such a service in an urban area. We have been using a blanket approach just as an example of areas that will need our focus going forward. The cost of providing service in the rural cannot be the same with cost of providing service in an urban area. They differ because of their geographical aspect as well as other topographical

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 102

issues that we will have to consider. Therefore, the review that I am referring to hon Nyambos is in the process as definitely your committee will be engaged in that process because we want a comprehensive and a realistic funding model to ensure that we have clear and functional municipalities that will add value into our developmental agenda.

Question 229:

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: Chair, hon member, Cogta has facilitated the development of various public participation mechanisms to deepen the relationship between citizens and local government over the years. These, of course, were aimed at contributing to the attainment of public participatory governance.

These mechanisms include the following. We have institutionalised public participation through the establishment of community participation structures. We have also popularised public participation model through

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 103

awareness campaigns which were used to mobilise communities to participate in ward committee elections to establish credible ward committee structures.

We also strengthened community participation and local government accountability through the creation of innovative public participation platforms. The department is working in collaboration with the GCIS to implement a government-led social media platform that enables active engagement between government and communities in real time. We call these Gov Chat. The platform will connect about 10 000 councillors with their constituencies. I thank you.

Mr E M MTHETHWA: Minister, it seems that municipalities with small towns are really struggling to manage their finances. Can you tell us: What is the plan or the remedy to assist them?

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: Chair, let me reiterate that we are currently engaging all provinces through joint national and

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 104

provincial sessions with a view to identify municipalities that are struggling. Up until we conclude that assessment, we won't be able to give details regarding how we are going to deal with their challenges.

However, I must indicate that as part of our approach, we want to ensure that the outcome of these sessions are binding to the affected municipalities, binding to the districts and are also binding the provinces. They are binding as well to us the Cabinet of the country public because for municipalities to be functional, it is a collaborative effort.

So, definitely, the plans that will come out of these sessions will be adopted by municipalities, by districts, by provinces and finally will be adopted by the Cabinet of the Republic. I thank you.

Mr K J MILLEHAM: Minister, let me start by saying: I don't hate you; I don't hate the ANC. What I do hate is hate is bad government. [Interjections.] [Applause.] So, this is an

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 105

easy one for you. At the start of the Back to Basics programme in 2014, roughly one-third of South Africa's municipalities were considered dysfunctional. What criteria are used to measure the functionality of municipalities; where do you report on that; and how many municipalities are still considered dysfunctional three years later?

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: I know you don't want to hear a mention of a Back to Basics programme but you know we have five pillars of that programme. That is the basis through which we are able to determine the status of functionality of each individual municipality. Out of that, we are then able to determine appropriate interventions that should be meted at those municipalities.

The number of municipalities that are currently dysfunctional keeps on fluctuating because some municipalities move out of that category while other municipalities get into that category. So, the process of dealing with those numbers is definitely ongoing. As I have

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 106

indicated, the current provincial interventions are specifically targeting those municipalities per province. Thank you very much.

Mr K P SITHOLE: Hon Minister, in respect of the Back to Basic programme and the 10-point plan, particularly the aspect of deepening the relationship between citizens and local government: What steps are being taken to extend visions of a local government municipality beyond five-year politically motivated IDP planning vision, towards 30-year long-term plan and vision, as well as so called True North for any given community?

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: The reality of the matter is that besides those public participation mechanisms and measures that I have alluded to, the current measures do not cover all the sectors of our communities. I mean, if you were to look into the trend of attendance of IDPs or maybe our ward committee meeting for example, it may tell you that not all

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 107

the sectors or perhaps the majority of our people in a given constituency/ward do attend those meetings.]

As a result, on above all those communication mechanisms which I alluded to in my response to hon Mthethwa's question, we are also contemplating innovative measures that we should employ to reach out to our people. That is why the golf-tag initiative, where we worked jointly with GCIS is one of those measures that we are currently employing.

As from now onwards, we also want to review the ward committee model itself. Remember, the ward committee model is meant to serve as an interface between a municipal council and communities. The reality of the matter is that the current status of these ward committees clearly shows that the model needs some complimentary actions. It needs some reconsideration about the way we deal with issues of representation within the said model.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 108

So, we think that we are definitely ready to review the participatory mechanisms that we currently have in our country. Thank you very much.

IsiZulu:

Nk H O MKALIPI: Sihlalo, ngebhadi ke angizazi izithakazelo zakwa-Van Rooyen. Ngabe ngiyakuthakazela ngithi: Wena owakwa-Van Loyen! [Uhleko.] Ngithi ke Ngqongqoshe i-ANC ...

English:

Imposes ward committee members because they are getting paid. Communities do not benefit on ward committees. So, people are in arms because they are fighting this imposition. [Interjections.] Secondly, the EPWP is only benefiting ANC members as well in the municipalities.

So, all programmes that are initiated by the ANC-led municipalities are only benefiting ANC card-carrying members. So, this Back to Basic programme of yours is designed to only help ANC members or their communities.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 109

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: Truly speaking, the hon member - the poor soul - was just all over. I couldn't even get the specific questions that you asked. The reality of the matter though is that the intentions ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Can I assist you, hon Minister?

Ms H O MKALIPI: No, I can assist him.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): No, don't worry hon Mkalipi, I am in charge.

Ms H O MKALIPI: Okay!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon Minister, she wants to know whether these ward committees are benefiting communities or ANC members only.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 110

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: The reality of the matter is that you just summarised one aspect of her statement, but of course, they are not meant. Hence, we are saying that the model must be reviewed. We are reviewing this model because we are concerned about the representivity aspect of the model.

Remember, the model is premised on sector representation. So, if sectors are not represented, it creates a problem because that simply suggests that there are other sectors within a given ward that are not represented in that committee. It simply suggests that there is no liaison between that sector and the municipality.

The other problem also - which is a very interesting one - is that some people come sing to the model, purporting that they are representing sectors, only to find that they are representing their jackets. If they represent sectors, they must take information from their sectors to the ward committee engagements, via the ward committee chairperson who is the ward councillor, to the municipal council.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 111

All this is not happening because people sit in those ward committee meetings but they don't report back. They also sit in those ward committee meeting without proper mandate from their constituencies. So, that is why we think this is the time for us now to review the model. Thank you, Chair.

Question 250:

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: Chair, through you to the hon member: Pomeroy is an area under the jurisdiction of Msinga Local Municipality. The Department of Human Settlements has donated a number of sites to the Msinga Local Municipality. Some parts of sites are still with the Department of Human Settlements in the province. Other sites are still with the Department of Rural Development and Land Reform. Now that the land has been transferred to the Msinga Local Municipality, developers can get title deeds directly from the Msinga Local Municipality.

In terms of said municipality's integrated development plan, Pomeroy is one of the municipality's development

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 112

nodes. Hence, it forms an important private and public sector investment sector. The following current and medium-term development programmes targeting the node are important. A secondary hospital has been constructed by the Department of Health. The municipality has just approved a low-cost housing scheme consisting of about 1 000 sites. Development is expected to commence soon.

In order to boost development, the uMzinyathi District Municipality plans to boost water supply to Pomeroy and the surrounding communities as part of the Sampofu regional water supply scheme. The Msinga Local Municipality has approved a shopping mall. The implementation is envisaged for the not too distant future. The Msinga Local Municipality, together with the Department of Sport and Recreation, has erected a stadium in Pomeroy. This initiative will display practically the aspiration of the Integrated Urban Development Framework on spatial transformation. It will also demonstrate integrated human settlement, which brings people closer to economic opportunities. I thank you.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 113

Prof N M KHUBISA: House Chairperson, through you to the Minister: It is indeed the mandate of your department to ensure the ground is levelled for investor confidence, especially in municipalities, and also to ensure conditions are conducive for job creation. Now, in Msinga in particular, a certain Mr Shuben is one of the main employers in Pomeroy. He has indicated more investment is challenged by the total lack of water, sewage and infrastructure.

If none of this is available, would the Minister make this Pomeroy issue one of his special projects to zoom in on that area for development? I have also heard the municipality has started to do it. I am sure you have answered some of the questions, Minister. Would you like to say anything?

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: Chairperson and hon member, I pointed out the commitment by the municipality but also the commitment by

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 114

other sector departments to ensure that development in the Pomeroy vicinity takes place in a very integrated fashion.

What is also important for us to understand is that, going forward, the future of municipalities will be determined by the economic base of those municipalities. There is no way in which we can start thinking of a functional or viable municipality if we don't treat issues of economic development as a basic requirement for a functional municipality. We understand the Back to Basics programme rests on five pillars, but we think issues of local economic development are not properly elevated within the Back to Basics approach. As a result, we have commissioned a study and contemplate adding, instead of launching a new problem, a sixth pillar of local economic development within the Back to Basics model.

I am happy because all provincial premiers as part of their Back to Basics reporting have agreed, in the President's Co-ordinating Council, to report about local economic initiatives being taken in their provinces and

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 115

municipalities. So, we are going forward with the proposal of elevating issues of local economic development in our Back to Basics approach. Thank you.

IsiZulu:

Mnu N A MASONDO: Angibonge Mgcinisihlalo, Ngqongqoshe egwayini ke siyashiyelana sicobelana ngolwazi. Umbuzo wami uthi ke: Ingabe yikuphi esingakwenza ukuqinisa ubudlelwane phakathi komasipala la eMzansi neAfrika? Yikuphi esingakwenza ukuba sikhuthaze ukutshalwa kwezimali silethe intuthuko komasipala ...

English:

... municipal-to-municipal partnerships? What needs to be done to ensure this becomes an established practice - something that we use as we move into the future? Thank you.

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: Chairperson, creating an environment conducive to business investment and economic activities in

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 116

municipalities should be prioritised. That is why, if municipalities can ensure that basic services like water, basic services like electricity, and basic services like refuse removal are provided efficiently, we think that would be enough to attract investment to the area. Maintenance and investment in infrastructure will also go a long way to ensure the conditions at that level are conducive to investment by private investors.

Equally, collaboration by sector departments is key. That is why in Irene tomorrow, we will host the first ever national local economic development conference. This is in collaboration with the Department of Economic Development and the Department of Small Business Development because we think local economic development should be prioritised accordingly. I thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): The hon "Shi-lembe" will ask the next supplementary question.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 117

Prof N M KHUBISA: House Chairperson, it is the hon "Shelembe".

IsiZulu:

Mnu M L SHELEMBE: Yebo, uShelembe.

USIHLALO WENDLU (Nk M G Boroto): Ngiyaxolisa baba.

Mnu M L SHELEMBE: Ngiyabonga, ngithi angibuze la ngoba uma ubheka indawo yalaphaya ePomeroy ibonakala inemizi evele yakhiwe la edolobheni ukuthi intuthuko le esikhuluma ngayo noma ukuvula isimo sokuthi kube khona amabhizinisi kungabe izinhlelo zikhona yini kuNgqongqoshe? Kungabe umasipala uhlelile yini ngokohlelo lwakhe ngaphakathi ukuthi uma ngabe ethuthukisa idolobha laba bantu abakhe lana bazosizakala kanjani, noma abantu abafuna ukutshala izimali khona bazokwenza kanjani ukuthi basizakale? Nanokuthi ke uhlelo lwamanzi olulaphaya ePomeroy lukhomba ukuthi indlela olwenziwe ngayo lwenzele nje ukuthi kusetshenziswe abantu emizini yabo. Alwenziwe ngendlela yokuthi kungakwazi ukuthi lube ne-bulk enganelisa isimo sokuba nezimboni laphaya.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 118

Yilokho bengithi angikucele ikakhulukazi ngoba sizogcina uma umasipala engahlelile ... [Kwaphela isikhathi.]

English:

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: Chairperson, if I understood the hon member correctly, he refers to the bulk infrastructure backlog.

The bulk infrastructure backlog is not an isolated problem or one encountered by that constituency only. You know here we are dealing with a backlog that has been created by the evil system of apartheid where the majority of these areas where black people were settled was not necessarily developed for sustainability and were not necessarily developed as economic nodes for the future. We will have to reverse that, and it has cost implications.

Definitely, through its integrated development plan, the municipality - and also, because we are encouraging municipalities to have a local infrastructure master plan, we will then identify those backlogs. Working with other

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 119

spheres of government, we will then have to prioritise and, of course, allocate accordingly to the municipality.

Remember, this is not only Pomeroy municipality facing the problem. All 257 municipalities in our country are encountering this problem.

So, the infrastructure backlog is currently enjoying the focused attention of this ANC-led government. We will definitely attend, at an appropriate time, to that problem too. I would encourage the hon member to take advantage and participate in the local economic development plan of said municipality. I thank you.

Mr K J MILEHAM: Chair, through you to the Minister: Given that you are attending this national local economic development conference over the next two days, hopefully you will be able to give a coherent answer to this question. [Interjections.]

Local economic development has largely stagnated under the ANC's watch. Can you inform this House of how much money

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 120

has been brought in through local economic development initiatives on a national scale?

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: Yes, I know you will never believe in me, hon Mileham. I am just too dark for you to believe in me.

[Interjections.]

I can tell you now the initiative you refer to is not just about attendance. No, we are collaborating here. The principle of collaboration and working together in partnership is gaining traction. It is discussed by the executive of this country.

Mr C MACKENZIE: House Chair, on a point of order: The Minister's reference ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): On what point do you rise, hon member?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 121

Mr C MACKENZIE: Rule 85. The Minister's reference to a member of this House by his race is unparliamentary, and I would ask that the Minister withdraw that comment.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): I didn't hear any comment about race. May I ask the Table for assistance?
[Interjections.] No, I didn't hear it. Was there any race?
[Interjections.] Hon Minister, did you comment on the race of the member?

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: No, Chairperson. I referred to my beloved complexion. I referred to my beloved race. I didn't refer to his race.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Thank you. Continue, hon Minister.

Mr C MACKENZIE: Sorry, House Chair, with respect, the Minister made a reference to his race, but he implied that the member of this House discriminated against this

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 122

Minister or viewed him differently because of his race. The implication is that this hon member is acting as a racist. The Minister must withdraw that.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): No, I get what you are saying. Who is ... alright. No, let me address this one. Hon Minister, let's not do that. Can you just withdraw that part? Let's continue. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: Which part should I withdraw, Chair?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Withdraw the part where you referred to yourself as being black and referred to him as being white. [Interjections.] Can you just withdraw that so that we can continue? [Interjections.] Hon members, perhaps I didn't hear him correctly.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: On a point of order, Chair ...

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 123

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): I am being assisted. He says you said he is white, and you are black.

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: No. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon member, there was an insinuation, but because it is not clear exactly what you refer to, we will listen to the Hansard. Continue, hon member.

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: Chair, I think I have answered the question. Thank you.

Question 232:

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION: Hon Chair, thank you very much. I thought I was done for the day.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 124

The introduction of outcomes-based performance management in 2010 necessitated the Performance Management and Development System, PMDS, for the senior management service, SMS, to adopt an outcomes-based approach. Hence, the revised PMDS for the SMS is designed to ensure that the objectives contained in the department's focus area, to be included in the performance agreement, what we call the PAs of heads of departments, are cascaded into the PAs and performance assessments of senior managements. This will strengthen the alignment between individual performance results and organisational performance.

The Department of Public Service and Administration, in conjunction with the office of the Public Service Commission, PSC, and the Department of Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation, has developed a revised PMDS for heads of departments which enhances the integration of the management of individual performance with the management of organisational performance.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 125

The draft revised PMDS for the SMS has been developed on a similar ... [Inaudible.] ... and premise, and is aligned to the proposed PMDS for heads of departments. Therefore, the implementation of the PMDS for senior management is dependent on Cabinet's approval of the PMDS for heads of departments.

The PMDS for heads of departments has been kept in abeyance to allow for further consultation with other key stakeholders of the departments.

The inputs have been received from these departments and have been incorporated into the revised draft PMDS for heads of departments. It is envisaged that the PMDS for heads of departments will be tabled in Cabinet during this financial year. Once it is approved and obtained ... approved ... as it will be obtained for PMDS for heads of departments, the Minister of Public Service and Administration will approve the framework for the PMDS for senior management.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 126

Mr C C MATHALE: Thanks Deputy Minister for the response. What is the turnaround strategy to ensure that departments comply with the implementation of the revised PMDS upon approval in order to improve management practice and promote a culture of continuous improvement of government performance? What will happen to those departments that do not comply?

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION: Once the Cabinet approves, the departments which do not comply will have to be taken to task. As you will remember, in this revised PMDS there are strict performance areas that, if departments are not in adherence to, the consequence-management mechanisms are in place. I thank you.

Ms Z JONGBLOED: Thank you Chair. In her recent comment to the portfolio committee, the Minister referred to various government departments and units as top heavy and packed with senior management. What I would like to know is how the Minister and the department will address this issue to

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 127

ensure efficient delivery of service to the South African public?

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION:

Thank you Chair. As I indicated, with regard to this performance management agreement, once its done with the heads of departments it will be able to be cascaded to senior management level so as to align the performance of individuals and of the organisation they are leading.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): The next follow up Question is to be asked by the hon Mhlongo.

Mr S P MHLONGO: Sorry Chairperson, it was in reference to the previous Question.

Ms N V MENTE: Thank you Chair. Deputy Minister, the PSC report indicates poor submissions in terms of disclosures by senior managers, and the Public Administration Management, PAM, Act prohibits public servants from doing business with the state. The latest PSC report indicates

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 128

high levels of senior managers doing business with the state. Number one of those departments is the SA Police Service, the SAPS, followed by Correctional Services. Then the other departments follow. All of them have a senior manager dealing with the state in terms of business.

The Question is when are you ever going to professionalise the state at the Public Service, and not have the Ministers picking directors-general as and when they feel like it?

Secondly, when are you ever going to deal with the poor performance of your senior managers whose sole mandate is not to provide the service but to do business with the state?

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION:

Hon Chairperson, there are three Questions from the hon member. I will start with the disclosure for senior management.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 129

As the department, it has been a concern that disclosing is not enough because it affects their work. You can disclose but at the same time you'll be able to do some other work which is remunerative outside the Public Service. The Public Service Act you have quoted is in the process of being reviewed as well to address the issue of disclosures but also to completely ban the Public Service from doing business with government.

The second Question you referred to is when we are going to professionalise the Public Service. You will recall that we have the National School of Government whose primary mission is to make sure that the Public Service is being professionalised so that it can render an effective and efficient Public Service. As you know, there are teething problems in the school. Globally, schools which happen to train the Public Service take long to mature. I will give you the example of Brazil which is almost 40 years in place. We are only about three or four years. So, the problems are there and we are striving to make sure that

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 130

the school will add value to ensure that we professionalise the Public Service.

I can't remember the third Question but I think it was in relation to disclosures by the police which is in the main in doing business with government. I've already answered that hon member, and I thank you.

Question 227:

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: Hon House Chair, the Inter-Ministerial Committee on Vhuvani which was established by His Excellency hon Zuma. I must indicate that a similar structure has been established by Limpopo Provincial Government led by the MEC of Co-Operative Governance and Traditional Affairs. Both the two structures are supported by technical committees.

The following measures have been introduced to deal with the impasse in the Vhuvani and surrounding areas: A support and development package has been developed to give support to the Vhembe District Municipalities and its local

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 131

municipalities including municipalities Lim 345. This support and development package contains projects with sector departments at both national and provincial levels. Some are implementing it in the area.

The Department of Arts and Culture is partnering with the provincial counterparts in implementing the social cohesion programmes. These programmes involve amongst others, initiating compensation with the affected communities to bridge the divisions in the area. It is also conducting a study to establish the root causes of social conflicts in the area. We are expecting it to come up with recommendations on how to resolve these conflicts.

I must indicate that the SA Cultural Observatory, Saco, a research hub for arts, culture and heritage sector has been engaged. The consortium comprising of the University of Fort Hare, Rhodes University and Nelson Mandela Metropolitan University were also engaged regarding this study. The University of Venda has been briefed on this

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 132

study and they will facilitate engagement with researchers at the University of Limpopo.

The Department of Arts and Culture is working with the Co-Operative Governance and Traditional Affairs' established mediation panel to broker the impasse. It is out of all these exercises that these initiatives will inform the final resolution of the impasse. I thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon members, I have been informed that the hon Maluleke will take charge of Question 227 in terms of NA Rule 137(10a).

Ms B J MALULEKE: Thank you Chair, hon Minister when can the outcomes of these initiatives taken by the Department of Arts and Culture in partnership with the Limpopo Provincial Department and other institutions you mentioned can be expected? Do you foresee them having long-lasting solutions to the Vhuwani situation?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 133

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: Indeed hon member, it is our intention to find a lasting solution to this impasse. That is why we are not taking shortcuts. We will accord these expects to assist us in rooting out the underlying causes of this impasse. We cannot guarantee or come up with a time frame. Let us allow that process to run its course. Of course it is our expectation to resolve the matter as soon as yesterday.

Besides these processes that I have mentioned, we are continuing to work with various sector departments to make sure that the situation is normalised but also service delivery is provided in the affected areas. Thank you very much.

Mr K J MILEHAM: Minister, Treasury informed the portfolio committee just two ago that they had advised against the amalgamation of dysfunctional municipalities basically because two wrongs do not make a right. In other words, merging two dysfunctional municipalities is never going to sort out the financial situation. Will you admit that the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 134

amalgamation process in Vhuwani and elsewhere was poorly conceived and has resulted in further dysfunctionality and protest in affected municipalities and has not achieved any of the supposed positive spin-offs touted as reasons for those amalgamations prior to the 2016 Local Government Elections? Further, will you admit that these were purely political mechanisations aimed at keeping the ANC in power in those municipalities?

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: Hon Chair, I think let us all agree that the product that you are referring to here, the new establishment, is the product of an independent process which was overseen by an independent institution called the Municipal Demarcation Board. So, unfortunately the statement by the member is a misplaced and misinformed statement. Thank you very much House Chair.

Mr Z R XALISA: Thank you Chair, I will take the question.

IsiXhosa:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 135

Mphathiswa, ndiyakusizela kuba ndiyayiqonda into yokuba la kheri yooGupta iyakongamela wena.

English:

Does the Minister see the protest in Vhuwani ending anytime soon?

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: House Chair, we are not going to come and claim easy victories for problems that are entrenched and have been there for many years. So, we are not going to be populists here and claim easy victories. We are engaged in that process and definitely we will strive to realise a long lasting solution. We are not looking for a bubble gum solution like some of the bubble gum parties that are in this Parliament. Thank you, Chair.

Ms H O MKALIPHI: Hon House Chair, on a point of order: What is a bubble gum party in this Parliament except the weekend special Minister who was a mayor, chased away and his house was burnt down? You are a shame. [Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 136

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon member, please take your seat.

Inkosi R N CEBEKHULU: Hon Minister, the simple solution on the Vhuwani is to return it to its original municipality which is Makhado. The residents clearly do not want to fall under the new municipality where they have been driven into. Why is the government so obstinate on this issue given the clear signals from the residents of Vhuwani? I am asking this question taking from the fact that the same thing happened during the Khutsong community who were forced to go to North West province. They revolted and destroyed properties resulting in their kids having to be taken away from Khutsong to go and school elsewhere but at the end of the day people were relocated to Gauteng. Why in this case is it taking the department so long in insisting that the people of that section should be forced to go into another municipality? Thank you.

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: To a larger extent I think I have tried my level

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 137

best to answer part of the question but I want to just clarify the difference between the Khutsong and Vhuwani issues. Khutsong was a provincial boundary issue and it required a constitutional amendment. The Vhuwani situation is a municipal issue, as I have indicated earlier, which is driven by the Demarcation Board. Of course the dynamics between the two issues are different.

I think we should be very cautious as public representatives when we deal with the situation because these processes are expected to be independent and to be championed by institutions established by us with the sole intention of ensuring that they run independently. As we advocate let us not forget that these institutions are the institutions that are a product of our own work.

Let me also bring to the attention of the hon member that Municipal Demarcation Act, Act 27 of 1998. is currently under review because since its inception it was never reviewed. Now there are gaps that have been realised out of this Act and as we speak the Act is being reviewed and in

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 138

due course it will go through the due processes of public participation. Thank you very much House Chairperson.

Question 236:

The MINISTER OF WOMEN IN THE PRESIDENCY: Chairperson, the answer is that gender-based violence is a responsibility of all South Africans. Our Constitution guarantees equality and freedom from any form of violence or discrimination and prohibits gender-based violence, GBV. As part of the department, we have partnered with various organisations, civil society, business and the government departments in fighting the scourge of violence in our country.

As the government, we have the Inter-Ministerial Committee, IMC, on GBV and the programme of action as part of a comprehensive response against the scourge. We also have various departments participating here. As I have indicated earlier on, the Minister of Police has launched a six-point plan to facilitate reporting of gender violence by victims but also making sure that police treat victims with respect and dignity and be sensitive to their issues. Police also

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 139

have the victim-friendly rooms that give privacy and support. It also helps that professional health care people also form part of it in making sure that victims of violence are given proper attention and this is what the government as a whole is involved in. Thank you.

Mrs D ROBINSON: Hon Minister, I hear what you say but a reply to a DA parliamentary question has revealed that the Police Service failed to execute 99% of warrants for arrest granted in terms of Domestic Violence Act. This is extremely disturbing, considering the extremely high level of gender violence in South Africa. Since 2015-16 financial year, out of 224 000, 930 warrants of arrest issued, a mere 1 624 arrests were made. This means that a tiny 0,72% of those warrants were carried out. This is absolutely appalling considering the rate of gender violence in our country.

Minister, what can you do more to address this from your department, which is clearly not succeeding in its fight against gender-based violence? VP rooms are fine, what

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 140

about the rest? What can you do to make sure that our police act in a most sensible manner and are more proactive? This is a disgrace in our country, which is supposed to have free and human rights for all people. No safety - that is the first option of the government but it's not provided. We need more action from you, Minister.

The MINISTER OF WOMEN IN THE PRESIDENCY: Hon Chair, the issue of gender-based violence is a global problem. That's the first point I would like to raise. Hence today, we have #MeToo, which is trending globally because it's a societal problem. So, don't make it as if it's a South African problem alone. It needs all of us

The other issue which I want to respond to is that gender-based violence is a very complex problem because it is informed by a patriarchy and you know where we come from. In South Africa, part of our experience is because violence in South Africa was instituted within the system of apartheid. Hence, you can't remove violence against women within that context and as the government. That's why we

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 141

are putting various mechanisms in addressing violence against women or GBV in our country and making sure that it's not just about violence. It's also about the empowerment of women, hence the economic programmes which we are referring to are part of the programmes of making sure that the quagmire of violence in our society is addressed and bring back the dignity of women.

Addressing that would also include various social programmes, which we are involved in addressing GBV in our country. Civil society is involved. I agree with you. What the police are doing is not enough. They need to do more, hence the Minister himself is committed to the six-point plan, hence the whole of the Justice Crime Prevention and Security, JCPS, cluster is reviewing all the various mechanisms which are there in identifying the weaknesses and making sure that where there are challenges, where there are gaps, what is it that we need to do in ensuring that the response and prevention of GBV in our country is adequate.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 142

Ms C N MAJEKE: Hon Minister, what specific programmes are available to eradicate gender-based violence, by which department, in what locations? If there are not any available, why not, if so, what are the relevant details? Thank you.

The MINISTER OF WOMEN IN THE PRESIDENCY: Hon member, there are different departments which are involved in various programmes in addressing gender-based violence. We have Social Development, as you know that is involved with the issue of white doors, they have the hotline, which last year won an award globally because it was one of the best.

The Justice Department has its responsibility in making sure that cases of people are brought to justice. As we speak today, there is a rollout of sexual offences courts - we know that in Limpopo there was one which dealt with sexual offences matters. Home Affairs is involved because when you talk about human trafficking, it also affects them, but in an integrated way, the police have indicated.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 143

So, we have various departments which are participating in making sure that in their own space, they can contribute to fighting gender-based violence in our country and being part of an integrated approach because when each department work in silo, they will not be able to successfully combat violence against women in our country. What we need is an integrated approach. But it's not only the government which must do that, we need partners, civil society, various women organisations are involved, like People Opposing Women Abuse, Powa, research institutions, Centre for the Study of Violence and Reconciliation, CSV, is involved in there. So, we need that comprehensive inclusive approach in ensuring that we really fight this scourge of violence in our society. Thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon members, the time allocated for questions has expired. Outstanding replies received will be printed in Hansard. Hon members, we will now take the questions that stood over from Wednesday, 8 March in terms of Rule 144 (2), an additional 30 minutes has been allocated for these questions.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 144

Question 5:

The MINISTER OF WOMEN IN THE PRESIDENCY: Hon Chair, the national dialogues which have been co-ordinated by my department in partnership with other spheres of government and civil society stakeholders have provided us with in-depth insight into the magnitude of the problems facing our communities and specifically, women at local level.

We were also able to assess institutional mechanisms, facilities and services that are in place to address the scourge of violence against women and children. That has helped us to gather community perceptions on the manner in which the criminal justice system is dealing with perpetrators of violence against women.

The outcome of dialogues has ensured that it raises awareness and empowers communities to respond to violence against women. Thank you.

Ms T C MEMELA: Chairperson, there is no follow-up question.

[Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 145

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): We just have a problem with the screen. The staff must follow proceedings and reset the screen.

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: Chair, Minister, so after this dialogues that took place with women, does your department have the necessary funds to address such issues that have been raised in dialogues and if you have funds, what is the budget specifically for these dialogues that have been taking place?

The MINISTER OF WOMEN IN THE PRESIDENCY: Hon Chair, hon member, the dialogues are an integrated approach. We partner with various departments, including provinces where we go, local municipalities, different organisations, different businesses. Then we come together to address violence against women in the communities. It is not that we have to do it; we do it in partnership with everybody.

I have alluded to the fact that we do not have sufficient funds. That is why it is critical for us to work in an

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 146

integrated way and make sure that we are able to address violence and the challenges. Therefore, we are engaging civil society and the communities. If we don't involve everyone, even with lots of money, we will not be able to address violence adequately. The police and various government departments are involved. Thank you.

Ms T STANDER: Chairperson, if the Minister attended portfolio committee meetings, she would know that the Commission for Gender Equality has told our portfolio committee that they do community engagements, that the Minister could but does not collaborate with them, and that she only met them nine months after they had invited her to do so. Further, the dialogues have taken place in Mpumalanga, Limpopo and the Northern Cape. The Minister is quoted in saying that Statistics SA has highlighted the Eastern Cape, Western Cape and North West as provinces with the highest prevalence of violence. So, you did not answer the question, Minister.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 147

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon member, what is your follow-up question? You have five seconds left.

IsiXhosa:

Nks T STANDER: Hayi kodwa nali ixesha, soze ibenjalo.

English:

How much did they cost and is this not actually a politicking platform for you to waste taxpayers' money?

[Time expired.]

The MINISTER OF WOMEN IN THE PRESIDENCY: Chairperson, the hon member is worried about CGE. I think you are their shop steward. I also want to say that you refer to CGE on a continuous basis. CGE has letters which are informing them about dialogues in different provinces where we go. If they want a meeting ... We don't have competing mandates. You need to know that. They have work to do and we are doing work and where we collaborate, we invite them into our dialogues.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 148

I am very much aware that they conduct their own dialogues. I want to invite you to come to the dialogues that we conduct with the various stakeholders in provinces because we don't deal with one person. I want to invite you. We are going to the Eastern Cape from 20 November. Please, join us so that you can understand what we are doing and how we make sure that we really make a difference.

Stop politicking here. Make sure that you work on the ground. That is what we need you to do, instead of coming here and grandstanding. Please, help me.

Mrs D ROBINSON: I was simply pressing the button for Ms Stander. Thank you.

Question 6:

The MINISTER OF WOMEN IN THE PRESIDENCY: The 61st session of the United Nations Commission on the Status of Women, UNCSW, was held in March 2017 and focused on priorities thematic area women's economic empowerment in the changing world of work. The session also reviewed the progress of

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 149

member states on the challenges and achievements in the implementation of Millennium Development Goals, MDGs, for women and girls. In preparations for this the department and the country prepared in making sure that we do it in partnership with government, civil society and also private sector. The country statement was delivered at the UNCSW. Thank you.

Ms G K TSEKE: Hon House Chair, thank you Minister for the response. The delegation to the UN Commission on the Status of Women consists of different government departments. As the Department of Women in the Presidency, how do you hold them accountable in implementing the resolutions, preferable the 2017 resolutions? Thank you very much.

The MINISTER OF WOMEN IN THE PRESIDENCY: Thank you very much, hon member. The way we intend to hold them accountable as you know that 2016 was the adoption of the MDGs, so all departments are expected through Statics SA and the Department of Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation to start implementing the various MDGs. As part of that we

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 150

said that all departments will have to make sure that the Sustainable Development Goals 5, SDG, must be integrated as part of the work in making sure that they address challenges facing women in our country. Thank you.

Ms N V MENTE: Hon Chair, through you to Minister, certain aspects of the Khoisan Leadership Bill undermines the role of women and places them on an unequal footing with men. Secondly, the issue of decriminalising the sex work has been set out for public hearings and the recommendations that come out of the Cabinet which we sit in is that there will now decriminalise women and criminalise men. Now, the question is, did you make any submissions to the Bill of the Khoisan and Traditional Leadership with regards to the women status in it and then did you have any input pertaining to the sex work decriminalisation process?

The MINISTER OF WOMEN IN THE PRESIDENCY: Hon Chairperson, on a point of correction, the Bill has not come to Cabinet. It has ... [Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 151

IsiZulu:

... Ha-e! Linda phela, engithi ngiyakuphendula?

[Ubuwelewele.]

ILUNGU ELIHLONIPHEKILE: Angakuchathi umile!

UNGQONGQOSHE WEZABESIFAZANE: Ungangichathi ngimile, kunjalo. [Ubuwelewele.] [Uhleko.]

English:

It has not come to Cabinet, and also the issue of sex workers, the South African Law Commission has done work around that, but that work is still has to be processed further and it has not come to Cabinet. Therefore, let me ...

IsiZulu:

Hawu! Hayi! Hayi! Hlengiwe, hayi, yima kuqala mani.

English:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 152

Just also I must say that with regards to the issue of sex workers, we are involved with them as a department. We also believe that we need to criminalise, but also recognise the issues which have a gap in terms of the report of State Law Commission. I agree with you that we cannot allow a situation which has been proposed, so we are going to make our contribution when they start putting that report and working towards a Bill. Thank you.

I must also say that with regards to the Khoisans, we have not seen the Bill yet. As soon as we are busy and we have noticed what is out there, we are going to make our own contributions in making sure that in terms of the Constitution the women are not discriminated against. Thank you.

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: On a point of order, Chair.

IsiZulu:

Bengicela uNgqongqoshe [Minister] ahoxise [withdraw] igama lokuthi, uchathwa emile ...

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 153

English:

... that is unparliamentary. Ukuchatha [administer an enema] is unparliamentary. Therefore, I will ask the Minister to withdraw that. Yinhlamba [it is an insult]. Last week I was called a frog by another Minister. Now ...

IsiZulu:

... kuthiwa sichatha oNqongqoshe. [Ministers]
[Interjections.]

English:

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Thank you, hon member. Take your seat, hon member.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: Hon House Chairperson.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Who is rising now? No, no, I'm busy dealing with the point of order. I have been informed by the Table staff that it is not unparliamentary; it is a phrase that is being used. In the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 154

context that is being used it is not unparliamentary. The next follow-up question ... hon Deputy Chief Whip of the Majority Party, why did you rise?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: I'm partially covered, hon House Chairperson, and I also wanted to tell the hon member that it is hon Hlengwa who said that, not the Minister.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Now you are covered. No, thank you hon member let's not reopen the discussion now. Hon Stander, you have a follow-up question.

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: Chair, I have a problem with that interpretation because Ukuchatha [administer an enema] is something else, Chair, please go and get a very proper explanation of what I'm saying and come back to me.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): No, I've made a ruling in that regard. Order! Order, hon members! I have made a ruling.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 155

Prof N M KHUBISA: House Chairperson, can I offer myself for explanation?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): I have made a ruling to say that it is not unparliamentary. That explanation will have in a different forum. I'm not going to allow it here.

Prof N M KHUBISA: I just wanted to bring about clarity on that.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): No, it is fine. Thank you very much for your availability to assist, but not now. Hon Stander!

Ms T STANDER: Hon Chairperson, the Minister took an entourage of eight officials to New York. Every delegate actually had to have accreditation in order to participate. Therefore, I would like to ask the Minister, did every official of those eight parts of the delegation have accreditation. How much did it cost for each person to

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 156

attend, and if they did not have accreditation what were they doing there?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Before the hon Minister respond I just want to read the rule. Order, hon members! Order! Let me just read the rule in terms of follow-up questions because it has happened to few times. It is Rule 142(7) that says that a supplementary question may not consist of more than one question. Therefore, I want hon members to keep that in mind that it cannot consist of more than one question and it must, of course, in terms subrule 6 also rise directly from the original question. Hon Minister!

The MINISTER OF WOMEN IN THE PRESIDENCY: Hon Chairperson, I just want to put it on record that we did not take eight officials. All those who were there were part of the negotiating team ...

IsiZulu:

... angikhulumi nawe, thula wena. Angikhulumi nawe.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 157

English:

Can you talk to ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Address me, hon Minister, and ignore them.

The MINISTER OF WOMEN IN THE PRESIDENCY: Thank you. That is the problem about patriarchy. It manifests itself in a way that people are not conscious that they continue to practice on issues which they don't even stand for in principle. The officials which went to New York were part of the negotiating teams. It is not only from my department, it was the various team members from other departments, Defence, where we deal with issues of resolution 1325.

Hon Robinson, can you help me to educate because you become part of the delegates, but you come back and pretend as if you don't know. We called you and briefed you when we were in New York before we leave. Can you please make sure that you give a report ...

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 158

IsiZulu:

... akusimina! Akusinina mhlobo wami, angizange ngikushiye. Akusimin! Ha! uHlengiwe, uHlengiwe owenza ukuthi bangakumemi.

English:

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon Minister, don't get sidetrack just address the Chair. The next supplementary question is from the hon Hlengwa. Order, hon members! Hon Hlengwa, will you just take your seat I want to hear what the hon member has to say while she is rising.

Ms N V MENTE: Chair, it is on a point of order.

IsiXhosa:

Umntu omdala akakwazi ukuxokisa abantu. Ngokwesintu sethu abantu abadala asibavumeli ukuba baxoke. UMphathiswa uyaxoka.

English:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 159

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): No, hon member, that is not a point of order. Hon Hlengwa!

IsiZulu:

Mnu M HLENGWA: Ngiyabonga Sihlalo, mhlonishwa Nggqongqoshe, sengithintwa wulolu daba nje oluthinta lo Mthethosivivinyo [Bill] ngoba kukhona umkhuba ongenayo la ekhaya, leli Phalamende, lokuhlasela isakhiwo sobukhosi. Ngike ngibone ukuthi kofanele kuhambe kuhambe lolu daba sililungise ngoba ngoba kukhona izithombe esipendekayo okungathi amakhosi acindezela abantu okuyinganekwane nje exoxwa emini, ilumbo, zizomila izimpondo. Engifuna ukukubuza-ke Nggqongoshe kuwukuthi, ukuze sikulungise, yiziphi izinhlelo esezikhona-ke manje ukuthi sixoxisane nezakhiwo zabaholi bendabuko ukuqinisekisa ukumeleleka kwabantu besifazane ezakhiweni zokubusa nokuphatha njengoba kwenzeka nje manje lapho ukuthi, kukhona umthetho o-KwaZulu-Natal ukuthi, imikhandlu yamakhosi ayikwazi ukumiswa abantu besifazane bengekho, kufanele babe yingxenywe yalokho ukuze siyilungise kahle lento ngoba kuqhamuka entshonalanga bazokhuluma izinganekwane ngokuthi singobani thina la eNingizimu Afrika

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 160

[South Africa] nokuyinto engalungile impela ngangokuthi, yilungise Ngqongqoshe ngoba izohamba ihambe idide nezingane ezizayo babone engathi yisakhiwo esakhelwe ukucindezela abantu kanti yisakhiwo sokuphilisa abantu. Ngithintwa yilokho ukubuza ukuthi, yini isixazululo sikaNgqongqoshe?

The MINISTER OF WOMEN IN THE PRESIDENCY: Hon Chair ...

IsiZulu:

... ngiyavumelana nawe lungu elihloniphekile ukuba izindaba zamakhosi kumele sizihloniphe kanti asisho futhi ukuthi ukuhlonipha kusho ukucindezela. Njengoba usushilo, kunezigungu ezihlukahlukene kanti nabantu besifazane sebeyahlala laphaya kwizingungu ezithatha imithetho ezindaweni zokuhlala kwabantu. Ngingasho futhi ukuthi njengoba sizoba nezingxoxo [dialogues] eMpumalanga Koloni [Eastern Cape] njengoba besinazo eMpumalanga, siyahlala namakhosi sizame ukudingida lenkinga yokuhlukunyezwa kwabantu besifazane. NaseMpumalanga Koloni njengoba sizoya khona, ithimba lami seliyasebenza laphaya ukulungiselela ukuba singahlangani kuphela nomphakathi, namakhosi mawasho

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 161

ukuthi, bazosisiza kanjani ukulwa nodlame olubhekiswe kwabantu besifazane, singapheleli lapho, ukucacisa nje kancane, enye into esengiyizwile, amakhosi athi, kunenkinga laphayana ekuhlaleni, yokudlana kwabantu, ubuzimuzimu, bafuna sibonisane ukuba singenza kanjani ikakhulukazi abantu besifazane okuwukuthi yibona abahlaselwa yile nkinga ekhona manje. Ngiyabonga.

English:

Ms N V MENTE: Sorry Chair, can the Minister please furnish us with the details of her visits to the Eastern Cape as when, where and what time so that we can go to the dialogue as well.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): No, I think that information will be made available and it shouldn't a problem. The next Question 24 has been asked by the hon Khawula to the Minister of Women in the Presidency. The hon Minister!

Question 24:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 162

IsiZulu:

UNGQONGQOSHE WABESIFAZANE EHHOVISI LIKAMONGAMELI:

Engizazama ukukucacisa kuqala ukuthi le ndawo esikhuluma ngayo akukhona kwaMahlobo kukwaHlobo laphaya eMnquma Local Municipality. Bengizama ukucacisa. [Ubuwelewele.] Hhayi loMahlobo esinaye la. Okwesibili, engizakusho ukuthi kulendawo yakwaHlobo njengoba libuza ilungu elihloniphekile la ukhona umtholampilo oseduze ngqo ukusuka eHlobo ukuya eMngcwe. Kuhambeka umgama oyi-10 wamakhilimitha ukuya la umtholampilo ukhona. Manje engizama ukukusho la ukuthi izinhlelo zokubonelela abantu besifazane zikhona laphaya kanti futhi baphinde babe siduze nesibhedlela saseButterworth esinohlelo lwesikhungo sethuthuzela esibonelela abantu besifazane abahlukunyeziwe. Kuningi engingakusho kodwa ngithe mangithi qaphuqaphu.

Nk M S KHAWULA: Ngiyabonga Sihlalo, Ngqongqoshe okokuqala nje izibhedlela nemitholampilo zikude laphaya noma uzosuka uye eButterworth abantu bahamba namuhla balale baze bayofika ngakusasa. [Uhleko.] Bahamba ungathi bagibela amatekisi, ngiyadlula lapho. [Uhleko.] Ngqongqoshe kunomama

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 163

laphaya be-women rural movement abenza umsebenzi wezandla ngabe uyazi yini ngabo, uma ngabe wazi ngabo yiluphi usizo obazela lona ukuthi bakwazi ukuxosha ikati eziko? Omama bakuleya ndawo bayahlukunyezwa, bayadlwengulwa neziteshi zamaphoyisa zikude. Kuleya ndawo noma ngabe ushaye ucingo ngokushesha ayikho nento okuthiwa umahamba nendlwana kukude laphaya. Wena othi angikwazi laphaya mina ngingowakwaKhawula mina angikhulelanga eDurban. Ngiyakwazi laphaya. Okwesithathi, mina ngilungu elihloniphekile likaZwelonke siyahamba ayokho indawo esingayi kuyona. [Ubuwelewele.] Ngifuna ukwazi lokho Ngqongqoshe. [Ubuwelewele.] Angifani nani nina enikhulumela izindawo zenu, ngikhuluma nge-Eastern Cape ngiyazi njengoba injalo.

English:

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Order hon members!

IsiZulu:

UNGQONGQOSHE WABESIFAZANE EHHOVISI LIKAMONGAMELI:

Ngiyabonga kakhulu lungu elihloniphekile kulo Masipala waseMnquma kunemitholampilo engama-28, izindlela zakhona

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 164

ziyahambeka - Ngiyazazi. Uyabona lomtholampilo oseceleni osetshenziswa umphakathi wakwaHlobo ngifuna ukusho ukuthi usuka yonke indawo. Abanye abantu bashiya imitholampilo yabo baye laphaya eMngcwe beyofuna usizo ngenxa yokuthi yiwo umtholampilo ... [Ubuwelewele.]

Ms M S KHAWULA: Point of order

English:

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): What is your point of order hon member?

IsiZulu:

Nk M S KHAWULA: Ngiyabonga Sihlalo, uNgqongqoshe phela nkosi yami akayazi le nto engikhuluma ngayo, mina ngikhuluma ngento engiyaziyo. Abantu uma besuka la beya laphaya baphuma ngelinye elanga, i-ambulensi iyodwa ihamba ibaqoqa njengoba kwenziwa uma kuthathwa itekisi. Abanye bashonela ezindleleni. Bakithi akungadlalwa ngathi.

Ngqongqoshe, cha, qaphela!

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 165

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon member, the Minister was still busy replying to the question. Let's allow the Minister to completely reply.

IsiZulu:

UNGQONGQOSHE WEZABESIFAZANE EHHOVISI LIKAMONGAMELI: Cha, lungu elihloniphekile kusemzini wami laphaya eGcuwa. Manje ngizama ukuthi ngiyayazi leya ndawo nami bengingafuni ukuthi ngizengifinyelele lapho kodwa ngizakusho ngoba wena usuthe unguZwelonke uhamba yonke indawo. [Ubuwelewele.] Uyabona nami nginguZwelonke ngihamba yonke indawo kodwa ngiphinde ngihambe ngiyokotiza kuleya ndawo. [Uhleko.]

Okunye engingakusho ukuthi lento oyishoyo ukuthi imitholampilo ekhona kumasipala wendawo angama-28 kube nezibhedlela ezimbili. Laphaya eGcuwa sikhona isibhedlela. Manje ngizama ukuthi njengoba kuhanjwa laphaya akukhona nje indawo eshodayo. Ngiphinda ngisho ukuthi ukhona nomtholampilo waseBhongweni nasePhothane khona laphayana. Ngizama ukucacisa ukuthi ... [Ubuwelewele.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 166

Nk M S KHAWULA: Ayinawo amaphilisi ayinabo ngisho odokotela. [Ubuwelewele.] Amaphilisi akabonwa laphaya. [Ubuwelewele.]

UNGQONGQOSHE WEZABESIFAZANE EHHOVISI LIKAMONGAMELI:

Uyamuzwa ke. Uyamuzwa.

English:

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon member, please take your seat now; really. Hon Minister, complete your reply please.

IsiZulu:

UNGQONGQOSHE WEZABESIFAZANE EHHOVISI LIKAMONGAMELI: Leyo usoyibuzile nabomahamba nendlwana bakhona laphaya. Manje bane-comprehensive plan ekhona laphaya. Ngiyabonga.

English:

Ms T STANDER: Chair, the DA wants women to own title deeds to land as we believe this is a sure way to include her in the economy and ensure that she prospers. Now without any

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 167

disrespect to traditional leadership, the truth is that rural land is often under the traditional custodianship and not in the hands of women.

Now, this is true in urban areas as well as sis Ntombekhaya from Nomathamsanqa in Sundays River Valley reported that she has received a house but she has no title deed to that house. [Interjections.] Minister, I want to know what you specifically have done to ensure that women own title to land in South Africa.

The MINISTER OF WOMEN IN THE PRESIDENCY: Hon Chair, the ANC government when it came into power, one of the ...

[Interjections.] I am ANC and now I am giving you an answer from the ANC. [Interjections.] The ANC government which I am part of made sure that the land issue is addressed. I am happy to say that in various places, women have title deeds, they own title deeds, including myself. Now we have title deeds. During apartheid we were renting and my mom was arrested each time she didn't pay rent. Where we are

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 168

today we are privileged as women have rights and title deeds. In the rural areas, the same thing applies.

Ms T STANDER: Chairperson without any disrespect, I have a problem. The Minister is speaking about herself rather than the plight of women in South Africa. [Interjections.] I didn't ask her about herself, I want to know about women outside. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon member, you didn't get the right to speak. Lets us allow the Minister; she still has time to respond. Listen to the answer and then you can consider your response. [interjections.] Continue hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF WOMEN IN THE PRESIDENCY: Chairperson, I am a woman in South Africa so I have to present myself as a woman and also what this ANC government has done for women in South Africa. About the land issue, the access by women to land is part of what we are dealing with as the ANC government. When we talk about rural development, the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 169

Minister has given me statistics which shows that as they do restitution, women also have access in the restitution process and they own land. So I just want to say that ANC has really brought back the dignity of women in South Africa. [Applause.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon members, the 30 minutes allocated for questions that stood over from Wednesday 8 March has expired. Outstanding replies received will be printed in Hansard. The secretary will read the order of the day. [Interjections.] Order hon members!

Mr M N PAULSEN: You have expired! Hamba!

**CONSIDERATION OF REPORT OF STANDING COMMITTEE ON FINANCE -
2017 REVISED FISCAL FRAMEWORK AND REVENUE PROPOSALS**

Ms T V TOBIAS: As we debate the Fiscal Framework, we appreciate the fact that we need to look at the long-term growth path address low growth rates and we equally also need to address the long-term challenges that faces our

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 170

economic growth. We also need to interrogate how the budget will achieve the long-term economic objectives.

The National Development Plan remains our strategic focus in implementing our policy priorities and through it, we will realise our growth plan. We also welcome the mandate Paper, prepared by the Department of Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation which was presented by Minister Jeff Radebe during the last week's Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement, which is intending to ensure a faster pace of implementation of the National Development Plan.

However, we also have taken stock of the fiscal risk that is facing us in implementing this and we will have to ensure that the National Development Plan, NDP ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon Tobias, can you just give me a moment please. Hon members, can we keep the noise levels down please. It is difficult to follow what the hon member is saying here from the podium. It is not a

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 171

good habit to disrupt your own speaker anyway. Continue hon Tobias.

Mr D J MAYNIER: It's always difficult!

Ms T V TOBIAS: We also need to ensure the alignment of the Medium Term Strategic Framework, MTSF, and look at the suitability of our budget structures. We need to address the spending pressures and analyse the future prospects of growth as envisaged by the Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement, MTBS. We should dispel the notion that we are heading towards a fiscal cliff. And I repeat: we should dispel the notion that we are heading towards a fiscal cliff.

One of the key issues we need to address is to balance revenue measures and expenditure patterns. Revenue growth should relate to economic growth. We should also use our tax policies to address the above.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 172

The Standing Committee on Finance held public hearings on the Fiscal Framework with different stakeholders which made contributions through this. One of the agenda items that was sharply discussed was whether there is a need for fiscal consolidation. Different perspectives were presented on the matter but over and above the engagements. One comes to a conclusion that there is no one size fits all in terms of addressing economic constraints.

Therefore, a balance between fiscal consolidation and performance of key economic sectors becomes imperative. I like it because you agree. We have reached consensus that the fiscal space has contracted and we need to engage thoroughly on our fiscal policy. We have also reached ...
Chair I need your protection from David.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): No, hon member just concentrate on your speech and don't respond to them all the time. May I also request the members on the left, especially the member in the waiting bench that your interjections are clearly audible to the speaker; let's not

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 173

do that because the same will happen to you when you come to speak. Continue hon member.

Ms D KOHLER: Heckling is supposed to be audible!

Ms T V TOBIAS: We have also reached consensus to address the current public debt, we will also pay attention to contingency liabilities of state owned enterprises. We also worried about our revenue shortfalls therefore we have agreed that borrowing to address public debt is not the best option. We believe that government should enhance economic growth beyond fiscal consolidation. To stabilise that, you need to raise the Gross domestic Product, GDP growth.

We also need to encourage a balance between imports and exports. Over and above what I have said, the committee have made the following observations and recommendations:
It is inevitable that issues related to the 2017-18 revised Fiscal Framework overlap with issues to the proposed Fiscal Framework for the MTF period. Several outstanding issues

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 174

will be dealt with in the Committee Report on the proposed Fiscal Framework.

The committee knows the adjustment of the budget from R1,409 trillion to R1,413 trillion leading to an increase in the 2017-18 budget by R3,8 billion. Much of this increase was directed at bailing out state-owned enterprises and reinforces the committee's concern that there need to be a stringent conditions set to the bailouts and that this should as far as possible be tabled in Parliament.

In these extremely challenging economic times, it is obviously difficult to have redistributive budget. We welcome the Minister's commitment to retain social spending. The low economic growth means that there will be a R50,8 billion shortfall in tax revenue and we note the borrowing will shoot up with nearly 15% of the budget being spent on servicing debt by 2020 and 2021. This means that more than ever we have to focus on the quality and efficiency of spending more decisively and quickly to root

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 175

out wastage and corruption and strengthen SA Revenue Service, Sars, collection capacity.

While the committee agrees that the primary reason for the revenue shortfall is the slow economic growth, it feels that Sars also need to be more effectively capacitated and more efficient in its work. It also needs to far more effectively tackle illicit financial flows including through working with other state agencies. It also needs to be more adeptly in addressing waning public confidence in Sars and decreasing tax compliance among taxpayers and a decline in tax morality.

Revenue shortfalls have become a risk to the fiscal outlook and the committee recommends that Sars the National Treasury report more pointedly and in greater depth on progress in revenue collection in their quarterly briefings to the committee.

The Consolidated Government Fiscal Framework referred to in section 3 shows that in 2017-18 fiscal year, revenue as a

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 176

percentage of GDP will decline by 29,5% to 29,2% in 2017-18 respectively. We express serious concern about this in a context where growth rates are projected to be at 0,7%. I hope this is not going to be used against government because we appreciate the fact we just came out of technical recession. The committees are seriously concerned that the percentage of debt to GDP is projected to reach 60% in last year of 2017 MTF period. The committee recommends that the National Treasury should develop and implement a credible debt management strategy over the short term to medium term to effectively manage and monitor the debt trap and report quarterly to the Finance Committee.

In addition to binding fiscal policy certainty, listen David, the Minister of Finance should indicate the timeframes and the levels at which debt is expected to stabilise. The committee know that the Minister says that debt to GDP ratio needs not to reach 60%, please don't talk about it here, we have resolved that matter David.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 177

We note that 95% of the wealth - hon members please listen to this one - we know that 95% of the wealth of our country is still in the hands of 10% of the entire population. Who are those? This is completely unacceptable and reinforces the need to radical economic transformation and [Inaudible.] growth that will benefit all the people, but primarily, the poor and the disadvantaged need to benefit. The promotion of Black Industrialist Programme is an important part of this. [Applause.] The decision to introduce a Public Procurement Bill next year to provide ... [Time expired.] Please all parties support the Fiscal Framework. I beg for your indulgence. Thank you.

Mr D J MAYNIER: Chairperson, the Minister of Finance, Malusi Gigaba, revealed the full horror of President Jacob Zuma's disastrous management of the economy when he delivered his Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement two weeks ago, in Parliament. [Interjections.] The Minister tabled the Revised Fiscal Framework during his Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement which exposed a full-scale budget blow-out in 2017-18.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 178

Let me note that it's a great pity that the Minister is not present here to listen to the debate on the Fiscal Framework, leaving the heavy lifting to the former Deputy Minister, Thandi Tobias.

In any event, the hard facts are as follows. Economic growth is down by 0,6%, from 1,3% to 0,7%. Revenue is down by R50,8 billion, from R1,41 trillion to R1,36 trillion. Expenditure is up by R3,5 billion, from R1,563 trillion to R1,566 trillion. The fiscal deficit is up by R54 billion, from R149 billion to R203 billion. National debt is up by R300 billion from R2,23 trillion to R2,53 trillion; and debt service costs are up by R900 million, from R162,4 billion to R163,3 billion.

The budget blowout was caused, principally, by a R10 billion bailout for zombie state-owned enterprise, South African Airways. The Minister is now drowning in red ink and has been forced to sell the family silver to hold the fiscal line in 2017-18.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 179

The fact is the R50,8 billion revenue shortfall is the biggest revenue shortfall since the global financial meltdown. To avoid a breach of the expenditure ceiling, about R3,9 billion worth of Telkom shares will have to be sold. The R6 billion contingency reserve has been wiped out, despite the fact that funds may well be required to assist with flood damage and drought relief.

Debt service costs are the fastest-growing item in the budget, consuming 13,7c of every rand collected in revenue. We will spend more this year on debt service costs - R163,3 billion - than we will spend on police - R93,7 billion - and higher education - R76,7 billion. These numbers are staggering and they are terrifying.

However, the full horror of the budget blowout is revealed when one considers the primary balance, which is the difference between total revenue and total noninterest expenditure. The deficit in the primary balance is set to widen by a staggering R51,9 billion from R4,4 billion to R56,3 billion in 2017-18. What this means is that we are

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 180

borrowing money to pay the interest on borrowed money. Or, to put it more simply, we are using our credit card to pay the interest on our overdraft in South Africa.

The situation we now confront is serious and has been described as the biggest fiscal crisis since the global economic meltdown in 2008-09 hit us in South Africa. We are going to have to take some big, bold, tough decisions to solve the fiscal equation, especially on the expenditure side.

That is why we have proposed a comprehensive spending review, aimed at reviewing the composition of spending, efficiency of spending and future spending priorities with an idea to cutting spending and changing the composition of spending. A comprehensive spending review would be geared towards making hard decisions about spending cuts that could be sustained by, for example, reducing the size of the executive to approximately 15 Ministries, which could save an estimated R4,6 billion per year, or a total of R13,8 billion between 2018-19 and 2020-21. In addition,

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 181

running the provincial legislatures more efficiently could save an estimated R1,8 billion in 2018-19, R1,9 billion in 2019-20 and R2 billion in 2020-21, or a total of R5,5 billion between 2018-19 and 2020-21.

However, if we are going to get serious about cutting spending, we will have to confront the ballooning cost of compensation of employees. A freeze on the salaries of senior managers who earn more than R918 000 per year, and who are employed on salary levels between levels 13 and 16 could save a total of R6 billion between 2018-19 and 2020-21. Whatever the case, the savings identified could, from the comprehensive review, be allocated to hold the fiscal line on social protection and to cut the fiscal deficit.

If the Minister is serious about dealing with the fiscal crisis, he should give serious consideration to implementing a comprehensive spending review in South Africa. I thank you.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 182

Mr T RAWULA: Our position as EFF has always been that the country's economy has completely collapsed in all manner we are speaking. We have always risen simply on the logical basis of mismanaged microeconomic framework and the inability of government to provide clear direction on the management and co-ordination of industrial strategy. This best manifested in the poorly articulated National Development Plan which does not have any measurable targets in terms of tilting the structural economic development in favour of our own people.

It is a result and the consequence when the whole government thinking that is outsourced to Washington institutions and three rating agencies in New York. With full knowledge, the ANC adopted austerity measures under the disguise of financial consolidation even after evidence across the world that such thinking about the policy has definitely failed. This demonstrated by the inability of the ANC government and in particular the Gupta Minister of Finance to propose the concrete and immediate way forward

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 183

to rescue the situation. There is no credibility ...

[Interjections.]

Mr B A RADEBE: On a point of order, I'm rising on Rule 84 using the offensive language in the House. The speaker has just referred to the Minister as the Gupta Minister of Finance. Can he withdraw that?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Yes, I heard the remark, hon member, you must withdraw that remark.

Mr T RAWULA: But I did not refer to any person, I referred to the office.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): No, you must withdraw that remark. You know exactly who are you referring to.

Mr T RAWULA: Okay, it's withdrawn, Chair. There is no credibility in the Revised Fiscal Framework and we say this as the EFF from a realistic and sound reasoning after the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 184

evidence that has been presented in one Parliament's inquiries, into a state capture, but in particular the Zupta corrupt dealings. As we speak now, the Guptas are in the bosom of Eskom and they are milking it to the ground. We have totally revised revenue of R1,3 trillion increasing to R1,7 trillion in 2021. However, government has committed more than R400 billion guarantees for state-owned companies, like Eskom, Transnet, SA Airways, SAA, and others which remain a lunch for Guptas.

If we do not rescue the situation at Eskom immediately, if we do not stop the looting that is going on as we speak at Eskom, if we, as this House, do not adopt the report to suspend payment to Gupta-linked companies and in all our state companies, South Africa will be forced to pay more and more loans, guaranteed from taxpayers' money. The point that we are making was the inquiry at Eskom that is taking place, this House must take a decision that all payments that are linked to Gupta companies must be suspended because it has been proven that all of them are done corruptly.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 185

State-owned companies like what Telkom did are supposed to be managed efficiently in a profitable manner and must contribute revenue to the National Revenue Fund. This is happening at times when our revenue connection is failing to meet its target. Our position as the EFF is that any Commission of Inquiry into SA Revenue Service, Sars, must be judicial commission of inquiry and it must be appointed by the President. An essential to the terms of reference for such inquiry must be the investigation of aggressive tax avoidance, disillusion and illicit financial flows is a central reason why South Africa is failing to collect maximum revenues, and until we plug this loophole our fiscal framework has got no merits, it is a waste of time which cannot be taken seriously. The EFF rejects this Revised Fiscal Framework.

Mr M HLENGWA: Hon Chairperson, well the irony, of course, is that last week from this very podium when I said to the President that the economy was collapsing at the hands of the ANC, the President said: "We have grown the economy from billions to trillions". Now, the lack of understanding

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 186

even in Basic Economics 101 is the clearest indication of why we are in this problem, so it is growing a budget to R1 trillion plus and does not mean that the economy is actually in a good state of health. It speaks about this policing inconsistency. It speaks about this policy misunderstanding and that is why we are in this mess.

Therefore, as we also try to meander through the problems caused by the ANC, in this regard, where we are servicing debts and when the costs have gone up, we are borrowing from Peter to pay Paul. There is high levels of fruitless expenditure, high levels of irregular expenditure, high levels of wasteful expenditure and there is high levels of no accountability. The National Treasury is captured, the Public Investment Corporation, PIC, is captured and Telkom is on the verge of being captured. Therefore, you have a situation whereby you have got a government sticking from both sides of its mouth. The President is saying that he is speaking about radical economic transformation on one hand. The National Treasury is telling us that they are speaking

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 187

about inclusive growth on the other hand. Who is who in the zoo? What is going on? Nobody seems to know.

IsiZulu:

Abantu nje basixoxela izinganekwane.

English:

Are we surprised? We are not surprised. We've been down this road before: Growth, Employment and Redistribution, Gear, Accelerated and Shared Growth Initiative for South Africa, Asgisa, Reconstruction and Development Programme, RDP, and now there is confusion even about the National Development Plan, NDP ...

IsiZulu:

... ngangisesikoleni ngifunda ...

English:

... hence I'm here. The failure to create a conducive an enabling environment for us to attract businesses landed us in a technical recession and landed us with economic

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 188

downgrade. For as long as the ANC government cannot get its ducks in a row, for the next year and the half that they are in government because 2019 ...

IsiZulu:

... bayobe bezoncenga kuthina ukuthi sibabambise kuHulumeni. Ngakho kulokhu okusele nje ...

English:

... at a very least to leave a lasting legacy of meaningful efforts of restoring the economy. It is collapsing in your own hands. Your interventions have come to zero and they have failed. Unemployment has increased, 27,7%. The outlook for economic growth has been revised downwards to 0,6%. Surely, that is not a good story to tell, it is along woeful meander which speaks about failure, which speaks about incompetence, which speaks about policy inconsistency and which speaks to people who do not know what it is that they are doing.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 189

State-owned entities, SOEs, are the bails which are collapsing this economy, from SAA to Transnet. We are throwing financial solutions to nonfinancial problems. The issue is not that SAA is not making money, they generate R30 billion of revenue every year, but the spending patterns are all wrong. Therefore, get your priorities right so that the country can get right. We are sick and tired of ...

IsiZulu:

... umsangano wenu.

English:

Thank you, Chair. [Applause.]

Prof N M KHUBISA: House Chairperson, the Medium Term Budget Policy Statement was delivered in a context of limited, sluggish and subdued economic growth declining budget revenues and rising poverty and inequality. It was indeed an honest assessment and the Minister tried nothing to hide from us. However, at the same time there were not so many

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 190

confidence building measures contained in the Medium Term Budget Policy Statement other than offering insight into emergency measures to plug the budget gap.

The bare facts of the Medium Term Budget Policy statement are grim. We have a confirmed tax revenue shortfall of R50,8 billion and a budget deficit will stretch to 4,3% of the GDP against the target of 3,1% while growth for 2017, is focussed to be not more than 0,7%. Whilst the outlook is bleak, Chairperson, it will not avail us to beat our chest and wait.

It is a time like this when the country faces a difficult time that we have to pull our hands together and find solutions and common grounds which cuts across the many divides which characterise our society. The solution will not be simple, House Chairperson, but we will have to address at least the following basics:

First and foremost we have to increase revenue. Our Growth domestic Product, GDP, has declined for two years in a row

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 191

and there is no doubt that this will impact on tax revenues, however government will have to consider finding ways to improve on the tax collection capacity of South African Revenue Services, Sars. The raising of tax is another avenue which needs to be explored and in particular increasing work tax. It I noted that 95% of our wealth is held by 10% of our population and it will therefore be just and equitable for those who are wealthy to be taxed accordingly. Once economic emancipation is being implemented let us also consider the issue of corporate tax.

Secondly, we have to decrease expenditure. The National Freedom Party suggests that we should give serious consideration to down-sizing government and the blotted civil service and take serious consideration for non developmental and non performing State-Owned Enterprises, SOEs. The poor state of the country's state-owned enterprises feature prominently in the Budget Statement and some of these are nothing but bottomless pit in which the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 192

taxpayer's money is poured year after year with no tangible or developmental returns to show for it.

Thirdly, Chairperson, we must stimulate growth. From our account it is apparent that the root causes of our sluggish economic growth and performance lies in the domestic arena and that is where the intervention is necessary. We have to face up to the fact that investor confidence is hampered by our policies. In fact, we have policies and they are solid, the problem lies with the conduct. We can say that we will be hard on crime, but we must also be hard on corruption. Let us deal with corruption, irregular fruitless expenditure of ... [Inaudible.] Thank you. [Time expired.]

Mr N L S KWANKWA: What we have here is an indication of a crisis of leadership. I wish to reiterate what I said on behalf of the UDM in reaction to the Minister of Finance Maiden Budget speech that the Minister was frank in his admission of fiscal deterioration in South Africa under his government's watch. However, what the Minister failed to do

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 193

was to give a comprehensive turnaround plan for our country's economy and finances.

It is a fact that it is under this government that our debt GDP ratio now stands at approximately 50% and is projected to go up to as much as 60% in 2021/22, that is about R3,4 trillion. It is under the same government that debt service costs had been allowed to become the fastest growing item and are projected to be at about R223 billion in 2021. The policies of the same government have resulted in massive unemployment and rising poverty and inequality.

IsiXhosa:

Inyani.

English:

Interestingly, and to his credit, the Minister has admitted that the ANC government has failed to put in place the conditions for people to realise aspirations for the society. Unfortunately, once again this admission has not invited any real solutions or even alternative to existing

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 194

policies which has resulted in this quagmire. In our view, the Minister's lukewarm proposals and vague statements did not even go far enough or come close to addressing these challenges. Instead, they boldly declared that this government intends to accumulate more and more debt to meet its expenditure needs.

Bearing this in mind I am not sure how the same government can say that it wants to stabilise debt as a show of GDP over the medium term. As Professor Rossouw from Wits University puts it, and I quote:

Government's management of finances and fiscal policy is mortgaging away the income of the next generations through the government debt burden and guarantees to state-owned enterprises.

The current government is pushing South Africa over a fiscal cliff and the sad part about it is that President Zuma does not give a hoot about it, he doesn't care especially when one considers his comments recently about

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 195

the nuclear deal. Repeating what I said yesterday, President Zuma and some cronies in his government have no more regard for our nation than a predator does for its prey. Nowhere is this more evident than in the; I do not care and no consequences attitude of government after the Auditor-General released a report last week showing that irregular expenditure and state-owned entities has dramatically increased by 55% to a whopping R45,6 billion and still going up.

The government seems to have lost a moral sense of outrage when these figures were released. They went on with their lives as if nothing happened. Clearly, your government has neither the capacity nor the political will to run South Africa properly and to manage our finances effectively. South Africa ... [Inaudible.] [Time expired.]

Mr W M MADISHA: Chairperson, the Budget Policy Statement painted more than a picture of a failing economy and a worsening fiscal crisis. It paints a picture of the wholesale failure of the ANC to govern the affairs of our

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 196

country responsibly, progressively and to the best interest of the people. It points to a multiplicity of ills namely; constitutional, social, economic and governmental. All of which are rooted in a political crisis of corrupted leadership, rampant looting, state capture, bad governance, irrational and destructive policy choices.

The picture points to the stag reality that the ANC must go if South Africa is to be saved. Chair, first and foremost, and of course most importantly we need economic growth. Instead, our growth focused has been revised downwards and we remain stuck in a low growth high inequality trap. Low growth means rising unemployment, inequality, poverty, less tax income, rising budget deficit, ballooning government debt, high debt financing costs, less revenue, redistribution, service delivery in the face of growing demands and less fiscal means to stimulate growth. Instead of creating conditions conducive to growth, we have a government that seems intent on sabotage and on collapsing our economy. Just look at the Zupta stooge destroying our minerals, mining sector and the nine President's brazen

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 197

capture of National Treasury that junked our economy. Now we have a Treasury headed by a Minister heavily implicated in the state capture project. Less Treasury control over our budgetary processes and attach on the office of the chief procurement officer which is tasked with ensuring probity in government procurement. We learn today that the Minister of Finance has been meeting with financials on the ... I hope those who have taken the plastic bags ... [Time expired.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Thank you, hon member, would you leave the podium now.

Mr X MABASA: Point of order, Chairperson. The hon member sitted across EFF is drinking grapetiser or appletiser in the House.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon members, hon members, we know what the Rules are. Let us not at this stage of the day, it has been a long day to bend the Rules.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 198

We know that it is only water that is being allowed into the House.

Ms P S KEKANA: Hon Chair, we must check whether there is no other substance in that ... [Interjections.]

Hon House Chair, Ministers and Deputy Ministers, hon members of this august House, the Revised Fiscal Framework calls for the engineering of a new growth and transformation model, one that is anchored on a common vision for the economy and its society - a vision that embraces the sharing of economic resources and which produces a South Africa that truly, economically belongs to all of us who live in it. Such a vision must address a structural change of patterns of ownership, management and production. The financing of the policy choices reflected in the Revised Fiscal Framework is therefore underpinned by the ANC-led government's commitment to social and economic transformation.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 199

We note that 95% of the wealth of our country is in the hands of 10% of the population. This is completely unacceptable and reinforces the need for radical economic transformation that benefits all our people, but primarily the poor and the disadvantaged. The promotion of a black industrialists programme is an important part of this, as is the decision to introduce the Public Procurement Bill next year to provide set asides for the disadvantaged strata of our society including the youth.

While the Revised Fiscal Framework commits to fiscal consolidation, this is not done at the expense of the key commitment to address poverty and inequality, best reflected in the commitment to retain the levels of social spending.

Our country faces a dire economic situation due to declining revenue collection, an increasing Budget deficit, and declining economic growth.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 200

We as the ANC therefore agree with the Minister of Finance when he says that drastic action has to be taken in order to prevent the slide that is predicted in the Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement, MTBPS, focused on the Medium-Term Expenditure Framework, MTEF, period.

The 2017 Budget presented in February projected GDP growth of 1,3%, but this projection has, however, been revised down to 0,7% for this year, slowly recovering to 1,9% in 2020.

An HON MEMBER: Why?

Ms P S KEKANA: You will hear why!

Hon members, over the past five years, our government has been implementing fiscal consolidation measures. There were some successes in this regard as expenditure remained well contained and the gap between revenue and noninterest spending narrowed. This was sustained by tax revenues that

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 201

outperformed economic growth. However, this period appears to have seen its better days.

An HON MEMBER: Why?

Ms P S KEKANA: The 2017 Budget projected a revenue shortfall of about R30 billion.

An HON MEMBER: Why?

Ms P S KEKANA: This has now been revised to R50,8 billion.

[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Why?

Ms P S KEKANA: Listen!

This means that our budget deficit for this financial year will grow to 4,3% ...

An HON MEMBER: Why?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 202

Ms P S KEKANA: ... compared to the projection of 3,1% as presented in February.

This has implications for our gross national debt, which is expected to rise to 54,2% of our GDP this year ...

An HON MEMBER: Why?

Ms P S KEKANA: ... to reach 60% in 2020.

Ms P S KEKANA: Listen to this. If nothing is done to salvage the situation ... [Interjections.] And this is what the Minister is saying. [Interjections.]

Hon Maynier, don't mislead the public by saying everything ... all these projections are true. These are projections and we may have ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Those are not projections; that is being optimistic!

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 203

Ms P S KEKANA: No, we may have the situation being salvaged. [Interjections.]

Hold your horses; the ANC is equal to the task!

We support the Minister when he says decisive action should be taken to achieve new growth, and we urge the Minister to be clearer on this decisive action and await his plans.

So, be patient; you will get the plans!

We have noted that the South African economy has been performing at a rate that is relatively lower ...

An HON MEMBER: Why?

Ms P S KEKANA: ... than its global and regional counterparts, including sub-Saharan Africa.

An HON MEMBER: Why?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 204

Ms P S KEKANA: This implies that the challenges to our situation are largely domestic.

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

Ms P S KEKANA: You are the cause!

A rigorous implementation of the Nine-Point Plan and Minister Gigaba's 14 confidence-boosting measures is required to restore consumer, business and investor confidence in the short- to medium-term to stimulate economic activity.

We also support his efforts to sort out tax administration issues at the SA Revenue Service, Sars, through the announced commission of enquiry.

We remained concerned about low investment levels by our corporate citizens. [Interjections.] Government seems to be spending alone. You are doing nothing. We are not so convinced of the excuses of political uncertainty that are

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 205

being used by the business community when they hog investment, despite the profits they make from this environment, particularly in the financial sector as well as the construction sector. You benefited a lot, even with the 2010 Fifa World Cup. Your big corporates benefited, and you never said anything. Even now, you continue to be the biggest beneficiaries from construction. [Interjections.]

We also know now that some of our corporate citizens use the justification of political uncertainty in order to siphon money out of our country into tax and regulatory havens. [Interjections.] Two years ago, names appeared in the so-called Panama Papers. Just yesterday, many other names are said to be appearing in the so-called Paradise Papers. [Interjections.] These counter-revolutionary and counter-developmental practices continue to rob our people of the most revenue.

We as the ANC would like to warn those who evade their obligations to pay taxes by concocting elaborate schemes of

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 206

aggressive tax avoidance and outright tax evasion that the net is closing. You will be caught!

Sepedi:

Le tlo tshwarwa!

English:

The developed countries that have been abetting illicit financial flows ...

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: House Chairperson ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon Kekana, please take your seat. Why are you rising, hon member?

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: House Chairperson, members of this House are honourable members and another member may not impute improper motives to members. To point her finger at this side of the House, and say that we are tax evaders ... [Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 207

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Order, hon members!

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: ... is incorrect. She should be pointing her finger at that bench there, because the biggest tax evader sits in that bench when he is in Parliament.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Thank you, hon member. Well, you have basically reversed what she said and you are now pointing fingers the other way. Let's just continue, hon member, and conclude your speech, please.
[Interjections.]

Ms P S KEKANA: Thank you, hon Chair.

We said to you the net is closing in. You will be caught. You, tax evaders.

The developed countries that have been abetting illicit financial flows from the continent or are turning a blind

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 208

eye to it are also coming now to the party as they lose billions of dollars in tax revenue each year.

Through the automatic exchange of information by tax authorities throughout the world, you will be caught. [Interjections.] The money that leaves our country and the rest of the developing world is the money that is needed for the development and maintenance of infrastructure which the executives of these big companies so lavishly enjoy.

In our report, we asked the Minister of Finance to strengthen his collaboration with the relevant stakeholders and ministries to address corruption and illicit financial flows. The Reserve Bank, Sars, the Financial Intelligence Centre, FIC, the Hawks and other state agencies should play a central role in detecting illicit financial flows.

We still call for a interministerial task team to be established to fight this anomaly. We believe that we have a world-class legal framework to deal with this phenomenon.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 209

The only issue is co-ordination, co-operation and implementation.

A report released two years ago estimates that South Africa has lost over R100 billion through illicit financial flows in recent years. According to the Global Financial Integrity Report of 2013, developing countries lose over US\$1,1 trillion per year, competing highly with foreign direct investment into developing countries.

It is precisely this form of behaviour that is leading to revenue shortfalls which then forces us to deal with the consequences of revenue shortfalls.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon member, your time has expired.

Ms P S KEKANA: The ANC supports this Revised Fiscal Framework. [Interjections.]

Afrikaans:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 210

Hou jou bek! Hou jou bek!

'n AGB LID: Hou jou bek?

Mr N T GODI: Hon Chairperson, the APC, the party of revolution, believes that there is no reason to panic yet but there is reason to be worried about the state of the economy and finances. The deficit in the tax collection is worrisome. Whilst we accept that the state of the economy is a factor, the APC questions the impact of illicit financial flows has on our tax collections.

The Panama Papers and now the so-called Paradise Papers demonstrate how the rich benefit from the society but readily dodge societal obligations and restrictions. We need to vigorously pursue and punish those who rob the fiscus of its juice.

The leadership and staff at Sars must be applauded and encouraged to continue working conscientiously. The citizens of our country are applauded and reminded to

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 211

dutifully pay their taxes but having said that, the government has a responsibility to use these hard-earned taxes in a responsible and accountable manner. We must eliminate the irregular, fruitless, wasteful and unauthorised expenditure, as well as unnecessary deviations and expansions.

The APC rejects with all the revolutionary vigour in our being Treasury's projection that the debt ratio to gross domestic product, GDP, will rise beyond the current 54%. It is not responsible of the government to seek to deliver the country to the International Monetary Fund, IMF, because that will be selling out the country and the sacrifices of our fight for freedom. The IMF is a no, no.

Rising debt means we are not curbing expenditure or growing the economy. Our state-owned enterprises, SOEs, are imperilling this economy with their endless request for bailouts. Eskom is a threat to the fiscus sovereignty of this country. The government can and should do better. Our country deserves better. I thank you.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 212

Mr R A LEES: Chairperson, I am rather pleased that I am here again, today, thank you very much for having me. The revised 2017 fiscal framework indicates that the expenditure ceiling is going to be exceeded by R3,9 billion. This breach was avoidable had remedial action been taken to stop the political interference and had competent people been appointed to the board of the SAA.

As far back as September 2016, when the SAA should have been put into business rescue, the ANC chose to give it a R4,8 trillion guarantee lifeline.

Ms B P MABE: Hon Chair?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon Lees, will you just take your seat? Why are you rising, hon member?

Ms B P MABE: I was checking if the hon member will be able to take a question?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 213

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon member, are you prepared to take a question?

Mr R A LEES: Chairperson, I only have three minutes.

[Interjections.]

Ms B P MABE: But you made a very unfortunate statement yesterday. You must account.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon member, no. Hon member, the member is not prepared to take your question.

Ms B P MABE: You made a very unfortunate racial statement yesterday. You must account.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Please take your seat.

Mr R A LEES: In order to prevent Standard Chartered Bank from calling in the government guarantee at the end of June 2017, the Minister of Finance invoked section 16 of the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 214

Public Finance Management Amendment Act, Act 29 of 1999, PFMA, to make an emergency payment of R2,2 billion to SAA.

For the 2017-18 fiscal year to July of this year, the SAA has run at massive losses of R294 million every month and had no prospect of paying the loans of R6,8 billion due at the end of September.

Domestic lenders were persuaded to rollover their loans on condition that certain conditions, such as the removal of Dudu Myeni from the SAA board were met.

Citibank, however refused to rollover their loan and demanded payment in order to enable the SAA to pay Citibank the R1,8 billion per arrears to suppliers R1 billion and to have just a little working capital, the Minister of Finance once again invoked section 16 of the PFMA and made a R3 billion payment to the SAA and this brought the direct cash bailout to the SAA in the 2017 year to R5,2 billion.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 215

A further R4,8 billion is now budgeted for the SAA to fund ongoing losses. Once this appropriation is approved, it will bring the total cash bailouts to the SAA in one year to R10 billion. It is these R10 billion bailouts to the SAA that are causing the expenditure ceiling to be breached. Unfortunately, despite the appointment of a competency CEO and the board being restructured, the losses will continue with the Minister of Finance budgeting rather optimistically for a further R3 billion bailout to the SAA in the 2018-19 year and that R13 billion could have provided a 100 000 RDP houses and a 162 000 bursaries.

[Time expired.] Thank you, Chairperson.

Mr Y I CARRIM: Comrade House Chair, Comrade Deputy President, comrades and friends, I've been wondering, having heard Mr Maynier speak today, I know him to be a very erudite person, a very sober person. When the skies fall down, does the roof also fall? Because I see the roof is there and although I am not a scientist, it is clear that the skies haven't fallen down. [Interjections.] Yet, if you listen to Mr Maynier, what do you hear? "Horror" -

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 216

his words. "Terrifying", "budget blowout", "biggest financial crisis", "economic meltdown" ... I can't imitate him, unfortunately, nor do I care to, but he'll swing from this side and he'll swing to that side and it's melodrama par excellence as usual - no substance, just style. He entertains us. So, for entertainment value, he's great; for substance, zilch.

Let me just say his favourite term is "there is a civil war". Every time he disagrees with a committee, there is a civil war. There was a civil war before 1994. Which side, Mr Maynier, were you on in that civil war? Ask yourself.

Ultimately, all that Mr Maynier has done is repeat statistics. Where did he get the stats from? From Minister Gigaba and the National Treasury. Why? Because we rank amongst the top three countries in the world. Not the USA, not the UK - the countries that they like referring to - not any country in Europe or Australia. It is us that are amongst the top three and sometimes number one in the world for transparency and openness of information. [Applause.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 217

So all he has done is repeat the stats that we already know and have discussed endlessly.

What analysis does he provide? What strategy does he provide? What programme does he provide? Nothing! Worse, when Minister Radebe came to the committee two Fridays ago and said we've got the NDP, we've got the Medium-Term Strategic Framework, here's the plan, the plan provides the framework for the budget, he says, "no, why do you have the Minister in the Presidency here? What is going on? The Minister of Finance is being dominated", and so on. We don't see that. What we see is rational planning, and so it must be.

In the municipal legislation we've got the Integrated Development Plan, it's in a Municipal Systems Bill, the Act, that glorious piece of legislation that we passed. It says that the IDP comes first and then comes the budget. If it is there in the national sphere, if it is there in local government, why not in the national and provincial sphere? Yet, interestingly, though he repeats statistics, he does

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 218

not repeat the most fundamental one, which Comrade Pinky referred to - 95% of the wealth of this country resides in 10% of the population. Why? Because most of those 10% vote for his party. Most of those 10% subsidise his party.

Let me go on to say there is, because there is no strategy, inevitable contradictions. Okay? They don't want a plan, they just want to focus on budgets, finances - no plan. So they have inevitable contradictions. He states, "they're selling off the family silver. Wow, look how bad things are". Yet, they have been saying since 1994 "sell the family silver". They want it privatised. It's we who were saying "no, no no".

Mr Lees talks about the SAA. We say yes, the SAA is in a severe crisis. That's a correct assumption. I'm sure the Minister agrees, he says similar things. The issue is how will privatising SAA reduce the inequalities of our country? Inequalities that are largely racially defined. Why they don't care is because they have this fundamentalist faith in the market - "the market shall

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 219

deliver", because they represent that market. They can't explain to you how that market will improve the gap between the superrich - their constituency - and the super poor - our constituency.

We say, yes, things are grave. Read our report. We made it clear that things are grave. We're not denying that. Comrade Thandie raised it, Comrade Pinky raised it. There it is in our report. We have expressed serious concerns, but it's not all doom and gloom. The sky hasn't fallen down, Mr Maynier, and the roof hasn't fallen down. I'm still here. There is electricity, there's a functioning speaker.

The Minister is telling us that it could become 60% in the outer year GDP:debt ratio. [Interjections.] He himself says, in a pointed question from one of the Chairs in the hearing two Thursdays ago on whether this is inevitable, it is not inevitable. If we act decisively on structural reforms, then that 60% will not be attained. He himself expressed concern that our country should reach that. Here

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 220

it is. What is he saying? He is saying let's have those structural reforms. He is also saying in a polite way, because government is government, a Minister can't intrude on the terrain of another, that is why we have the Presidency intervening.

What he suggested, if we deal with the challenges around mining, if we deal with several other challenges that involve other Ministers and other sections of government, then we will deal with the debt to GDP ratio. And so it is that they have a Presidential Fiscal Commission - a committee of Ministers, I think it's called the Presidency Fiscal Ministerial Committee. But they don't want that, they have all sorts of suspicions about why it's there. So, basically, that's how we're dealing with it. It involves more than the Minister of Finance - as invariably should be the case. Your notion of a super Minister of Finance flows from your commitment to neo-liberalism. Where does this idea that the Minister of Finance must be above all other Ministers come from? It comes from globalisations, neo-liberalism where Ministers of Finance became strong because

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 221

of Margaret Thatcher and Ronald Reagan. Now we've moved on from that ear. Even the IMF and the World Bank does not agree with that. So, we do not agree that the Minister of Finance should be a super Minister anymore than we agree with Mr Maynier's view that we, the Finance committee, is a super committee. No, it is not. It is merely one of other committees that are important. Ultimately, it's actually party of a collective effort that must deal with these things.

We talked about problems in SOEs. Let me tell you what we have said in our report. Colleagues, comrades, will you read this report? It raises many of the issues. Mr Kwankwa, many of the things you have said, apart from the political jibes, which is your right, ...

IsiZulu:

Nk M S KHAWULA: Ngiyabonga Sihlalo, ukukhalima ophambukayo bengithi kodwa ngeke athi ukuhlisa kancane izwi sekubuhlungu ikhanda manje. [Ubuwelewele.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 222

English:

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): No, that is not a point of order. Please take your seat.

Mr Y I CARRIM: ... but I take what you are saying. It is very surprising that you are raising it, because I experience that problem sitting so far away from you all the time, but I take your word. [Laughter.]

Let me read to you what it says here ...

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: Chairperson, on a point of order: Why are you not calling this member out of order? He is not allowed to interact with the member ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): No, hon member, take your seat. That is not a point of order.

Mr Y I CARRIM: Through you, Chairperson, I repeat what I said ...

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 223

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: ... [Inaudible.] ... communist.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Continue, hon member.

Mr Y I CARRIM: My dear ... my friend ... Can I go on?

IsiZulu:

Nk M S KHAWULA:

English:

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Take your seat. You are wasting our time now.

Mr Y I CARRIM: The committee strongly believes that there should be far more stringent conditions set for any financial support for the SOEs. We welcome the Minister's commitment to ensuring that boards appoint ... I'll just refer you to section 408. We are saying that we agree with cost containment. We agree with that. We agree with what Mr Maynier said about the review of expenditure, but not at

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 224

the expense of delivery. Even the Minister agrees with it. Government is looking at saving money. Comrade Deputy President, we must all agree, including your Office and the President's Office. You have to look at curtailing expenses. You are committed to that, right? That's why this ministerial committee you've got in the Presidency must be tasked with that. We can save money. Members of Parliament, we shouldn't point to the executive. How much money do we unnecessarily waste on study tours outside the country? How productive are we? Do we report back after study tours, and so on? There are many other things. We can't just focus on the executive. That is why we say we need a collective effort.

You see, Mr Maynier spends all his time ... Mr I, I, I Maynier. I, I, I ... you know? [Laughter.] I don't hear the DA ever mentioned. It's me, me, me Maynier, or I, I I Maynier. The things is, he will say "I believe this ... I believe that. I believe you must call for a halt ... " and so on. After all the melodrama, does he ever say what he as a parliamentarian is doing to ensure more effective

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 225

oversight over the executive? This is not just about government, it's about us. And, as Comrade Pinky said, it's about your constituency sitting on trillions of rand and refusing to invest. And you encourage the lack of investment. You increase their anxieties, you exaggerate the problems, though they are many. So it is you who are contribute to the crisis, as Pinky said.

We welcome the Minister's statement ... [Time expired.]

Debate concluded.

The Chief Whip of the Majority Party moved: That the Report be adopted.

Division demanded.

The House divided.

Mr P J MNGUNI: House Chair, I understand that, in terms of the principle that when every member who is in the House is

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 226

supposed to cast a vote one way or the other. My fellow colleague in the red shirt there, hon Paulsen, didn't cast a vote at all. To that extent I can ask that someone go his ... like all ours can be checked. He never voted. Thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): No hon members.

Mr M N PAULSEN: Chairperson, I'm obligated to respond. That man is an idiot. He can't see all the way here from where he is sitting. [Laughter.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon member, you cannot call another member that. You must withdraw that.

Mr M N PAULSEN: Chairperson, I'm not going to withdraw the truth.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Can you leave the House, please?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 227

Mr M N PAULSEN: Sure, no problem.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Thank you.

[Interjections.]

Agreed to.

Motion agreed to.

Report accordingly adopted.

The House adjourned at 19:47.