

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017

Page: 1

THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017

---

*PROCEEDINGS OF THE NATIONAL ASSEMBLY*

---

The House met at 14:02.

The House Chairperson (Mr C T Frolick) took the Chair and requested members to observe a moment of silence for prayer or meditation.

Welcome to Gauteng guests.

**MOTION OF CONDOLENCE**

(The late Tarnia Baker)

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: House Chair, I move without notice:

That the House -

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017

Page: 2

- (1) notes with sadness the sudden passing of our colleague, Tarnia Elena Baker, after being involved in a tragic accident on 07 October 2017;
- (2) further notes that on the day of her passing, Tarnia was in the Ugu District Municipality, KwaZulu-Natal Province, attending to her oversight responsibilities as a Member of the Portfolio Committee on Water and Sanitation;
- (3) acknowledges that she worked tirelessly as the Democratic Alliance's Constituency Head of the Govan Mbeki and Lekwa constituencies in Mpumalanga;
- (4) further acknowledges the invaluable contributions Tarnia made to the work of the Portfolio Committee on Water and Sanitation in pursuit of improvement of our South African people's lives;
- (5) recalls the generosity, diligence and passion with which she tackled every task that came before her;

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017

Page: 3

- (6) remembers her wonderful and warm personality that will make her presence sorely missed; and
- (7) conveys its heartfelt condolences to her husband Landon Paul Baker, her three children Tersia, Tarlan and Mia and the grandson Ethan David Koopman as well as her family in the DA and her colleagues in this Parliament. Thank you.

Agreed to.

Mrs A M DREYER: House Chairperson, during the last Motion of Condolences for a colleague, Trevor Bonhomme, Tarnia Baker was a speaker from the DA side. He was her uncle. She spoke with such compassion and love; she delivered a truly remarkable tribute. But no one could possibly have guessed that the next Motion of Condolence would be for her.

I am sure that we were all shocked to hear of a tragic passing after horrific accident. She was on her way, after an Oversight visit, to her home town Durban, where her family was waiting for her. Yes, Tarnia was born and

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017**

**Page: 4**

bred in Durban where she also matriculated and she later on became a teacher. After she becomes a Member of Parliament, she decided to continue her studies, registering for Political Governance and Economics at the University of Witwatersrand, Wits.

Tarnia Baker has been my colleague since May 2014 when we were all sworn in as members of this 5<sup>th</sup> Parliament. She was from Mpumalanga and I am from Gauteng. We have not really met before that time but the first time we spoke face to face and got to know each other, I will never forget. She approached me and stood before me with her hands on her hips in somewhat challenging and what I later learned to be a trademark of Tarnia, a cheeky manner, and she said to me: "So Anchen, do you know about your coloured family, because I'm also a Dreyer?"

[Laughter.]

When I replied in affirmative and told her about another coloured Dreyer who was a councillor in Randfontein in the West Rand where my constituency was, as well as my own daughters coloured cousin, she was, very unusual for Tarnia, silent but only for a few seconds. Then she

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017

Page: 5

reassured me that her family actually reflect the rainbow nation of South Africa and she was sick and tired of race classification. [Applause.] After that interchange the topic of race was irrelevant and we never mentioned it again. However, we still have not found our common Dreyer ancestor.

Apart from this one incident where Tarnia did not immediately have an answer ready, she was never at a loss for words. She usually had an answer to almost everything, mostly in a humorous manner. She often made me laugh. During the exceptionally heavy rainstorms a year or so ago in Gauteng, that particularly hard hit the O R Tambo Airport and so we soon started speculating that the parking area was flooded and cars were actually drifting out of the parking area. We were chatting and I said to her: "Tarnia, I hope my car is still where I parked it when I go back home. She said: "Argh! Anchen, maybe your car will meet you at the entrance."

[Laughter.]

Talking of cars, when their family priest had to do without his car for a few days while it was in for

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017**

**Page: 6**

repairs and he had to go somewhere, she simply gave him her car to drive around. Apparently, he was very impressed with this gesture and told everyone that he was driving an MP's car. Her sense of humour was only matched by her compassion for others and readiness to assist whenever she could.

Despite a busy and demanding job, she remained humble and made sure that she continued her involvement in the soup kitchen helping others in need. Perhaps her compassion for others was grounded in her strong Christian beliefs. Tarnia and her family were devoted Catholics and did not just talk about it but lived it. She and her husband Landon went to Mass every Sunday and practiced what was preached.

I was intrigued to hear from Landon that when the family had to decide on which hymns would be sung on her memorial service, it was very easy for them because he took Tarnia's hymn book out of the shelves, he discovered a piece of paper with her handwriting on it. On it she had written down her choice of hymns to be sung at her own funeral.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017

Page: 7

Tarnia made the funeral arrangements easy for her family. Her family was everything to her. She and her beloved Landon had three children, Tersia, Tarlan and *laat lammetjie* [last born] Mia and also her beloved grandson, Ethan.

To her family who are here in the gallery, you were the most important people in her life. [Applause.] We know because she made no secret about it - she spoke about you often and with great pride. When the older children participated in the cooking competition, the whole caucus knew about it. She enthusiastically promoted your team - the Mutton Heads and we all saw the pictures she posted on Facebook.

When Tarina was away from home, she liked to do some gardening in the Parliamentary village where many of us live. She planted roses in pots outside the front door of her house in Arcacia Park which she carefully nurtured. After her untimely passing, one of her colleagues, Désirée van der Walt took it upon herself to look after Tarnia's roses and watered them regularly and they are now in full bloom. [Applause.] The flowers we have put

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017**

**Page: 8**

there on her bench come from those rose bushes she so lovingly cultivated.

During her short three years in Parliament Tarnia had served on various Portfolio Committees but her heart was in Water and Sanitation. She insisted that she wanted to be a member of that committee, even if she was a DA's third member on that committee without voting rights. We usually have only two members on any particular committee. When she eventually became a full member, she was already dedicated and committed and very knowledgeable member of that committee. It was doing exactly what she love doing the most - travelling to do an Oversight visit and attending to problems of people in need when she was killed. I still find it difficult to believe that she is gone.

Her energy, passion, commitment and dedication to what she believed in have left a gaping hole in our caucus and in Parliament. Her voice is silent but we will never forget Tarnia, the legacy she has left and a contribution to her party and a country will live on in our memories.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017**

**Page: 9**

Tarnia, we salute you. May your soul rest in peace.

[Applause.]

Mr H P CHAUKE: Chair, on behalf of the ANC, we want to pass our heartfelt condolences to the family, friends, colleagues, in particular the political party that the hon Baker represented the DA. My encounter with the hon Baker was when I joined the Portfolio Committee on Water and Sanitation in 2016. The first engagement I had with her was: Where are you from? I said to her I am from the North West. I asked her back: Where do you come from. She said I am from both Mpumalanga and KwaZulu-Natal. Now, are you a member of the DA? Yes, I am a member of the DA by membership. The fact is that, Chauke, I grew up in a revolutionary family. My uncle taught me politics, but what I have found today is that the ANC that we grew up knowing, it's no longer the ANC that we want. Therefore, I have decided to join the DA. [Applause.]

The point I am making is that she then said that if you can correct the following I would definitely come back and join the ANC. [Laughter.] The point we were making with her and the chair of the committee was that these

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017

Page: 10

issues, in fact, are the issues that we are resolving in December. [Laughter.] It means that where Tania Baker is now, she is waiting to be accepted by the spirit of Oliver Tambo, Nelson Mandela and Walter Sisulu.

[Applause.] That is where she is now. That is where her heart lies.

Therefore the point that we are making, as the ANC, is that she has made so much contribution at a very short space of time. She was one of the most warmest Member of Parliament. In fact, she was very sharp when it comes to details. When we deal with the reports of the portfolio committee, Tania would go into detail of that report - the fine lines. She will bring forward the issues and she would say, here the department did not address the following. She was very critical on accountability and oversight. However, we then understood her love for her country and her people, her love for her constituency where she was deployed. She was working side by side with the ANC where she was deployed. She did not only see herself as a DA member, but she then felt ... Basson will confirm that. Hon Basson will tell you that she always says her heart lies the revolutionary blood, Chauke. What

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017**

**Page: 11**

we want to see is the better, good and well-run country, which all of us, are working on that goal side by side. I think we have done so much work in that Portfolio Committee on Water and Sanitation.

She was in the forefront of accountability, not leading from the back. Therefore, we want to say to the family that you have not only lost a mother, sister, but you have lost a revolutionary, a freedom fighter because she represented a particular view, of which the Leader of the Opposition understands what I am saying.

When we were paying our last respect and the farewell to the Member of Parliament in that funeral, both the Leader of the Opposition, the Chief Whip of the Opposition, the ANC component together with the EFF, went there in numbers. Mama Khawula was there, the IFP was there, but I have not seen Agang because they don't attend such important things. [Laughter.] I have not seen them. I know that Khubeka the other small parties, in fact, were trying to be there. However, Agang, will not understand these things because it is where we begin to find

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017

Page: 12

ourselves. These are things that bring us together as a family. On that note, as the ANC, we want to say ...

*Xitsonga:*

... moya wa yena a wu etlele hi ku rhula. U tirhile ntirho wa wena, hi khensile swinene, Manana. Hi ta vonana nakambe eka vutomi lebyi nga ta landzela. Hi ri ANC hi ri, inkomu eka mitirho ya wena. [Va phokotela.]

*IsiZulu:*

Nk M S KHAWULA: Sihlalo siyi-EFF sizwakalisa ukukhathazeka okukhulu ngokudlula kwelungu elihloniphekile u-Baker. Lilonke nje u-Baker ubengomunye umuntu obehlukile ekomidini enza isiqinisekiso sokuthi ufuna ukubona abantu phansi bethola lokhu abakuvotele.

Ngibonge kuleliya komidi. Leliya komidi linayo le nto yokuthi uma sikhona kukhonjiswe ukuthi njengoba sikulona sizosebenzela abantu. Kwababuhlungu ukuzwa ukuthi selidlulile emhlabeni ilungu elihloniphekile u-Baker. Okwenza kube buhlungu yingoba sasikade sinaye ngoLwesine kusetshenzwa kungadlalwa. Into bengiyithanda ngo-Baker ebebazi abantu phansi ukuthi kufuneka bathole amanzi.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017

Page: 13

Ngikhumbula nje kwakuzothulwa umbiko waseNkomazi eMpumalanga la babezothula khona umbiko wabo bekubeka ukuthi amanzi akhona. Wabuza igama elinzima wathi: Lawo manzi enithi akhona ngabe ahlanzekile na ukuthi abantu bangawaphuza?

Okunye engikubalule kuyena ngoba ngasho ukuthi umuntu uma ezohamba uNkulunkulu uyakwazi ukuthi anifihlele. U-Tania ubeqinisekisa ukuthi ubheka yonke into ngayinye ngayinye ukuthi iyenzeka. Ubebheka izimali ezilandela ukuthi zisebenza ngendlela efanele yini na. Ubeze agcizelele. Thina silahlekelwe kakhulu ekomidini. Yebo, umndeni wakhe ulahlekelwe kodwa nathi ekomidini silahlekelwe ngoTania. Engikukhumbulayo nje yila ngangikhala khona ngabantu basemakhaya ukuthi abanawo amanzi. Waze wathi uyazi lungu elihloniphekile Khawula nginenkinga, abantu Ogwini abanawo amanzi. Kuyimanje kunguLwesihlanu ngizohamba ngiye khona. U-Tania ebeqinisekisa ukuthi uyaya phansi ebantwini ayobheka ukuthi izinto esikhuluma ngazo ekomidini ziyenzeka yini.

Okunye engikukhumbulayo engithe uma ngabe sengithola izindaba ezibuhlungu ukuthi akasekho ngakhumbula ukuthi

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017

Page: 14

wayegcizelela ukuthi ngabe la manzi aphuzwa abantu basemakhaya ahlanzekile yini. Waphinda wazothi Sihlalo ngiyacela ukuthi ke sihambe siye ku-study tour e-China siyobheka bona ukuthi lezi zinkinga esinazo zesomiso uma behlangabezana nazo benzenjani.

UNkosikazi Baker ube ngumuntu ohlezi ezihlekela kodwa ukuhleka kwakhe ekhombisa ukuthi ufuna izinto phansi zenzeke. Ngiphatheke kabi ngizwa ukuthi usehambile, usishiye ngendlela ebuhlungu. NjengeLungu lePhalamende le-EFF ngithi emndenni wakwa-Baker nabantwana nomkhwenyana wakhe uqobo ngiyazi ukushonelwa kunzima. Ngithi du du, uNkulunkulu uphile, uNkulunkulu uthathile. Abantwana bakhe ngithi abaduduzeke. Bengizojabula siyileli komidi lethu lamanzi nathi siyokwenza esikubone kwenziwa yilungu elihloniphekile u-Tania. Ubengaliphuthi ikomidi into ebengiyithanda ngaye. Noma ngabe ebekuhlasela ngemibuzo ebengabuzi ngokuthi akhombise ukuthi uyalwa. Ubeqinisekisa ukuthi silapha sizosebenza. [Ubuwelewele.]

Engingakusho lilonke u-Tania usinikeze enye into ukuthi uma silapha kufuneka sazi ukuthi sizosebenzela abantu.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017

Page: 15

Sazi ukuthi njengoba silapha asiwona amalungu ahloniphekile kuphela kodwa inhloso yethu ukubona abantu phansi benzelwa izinto. Bengizocela ukuthi zonke lezi zinto ashone akhala ngazo ukuthi zifezeke. Abantu basoGwini babonakale nabo benamanzi. Nale yokuthi ubekhala ukuthi kufuneka siphinde sithole le nto ye-study tour siye ko-China siyobheka le nkinga ekhona esibhekene nayo yamanzi ... [Kwaphela isikhathi.]

Inkosi R CEBEKHULU: House Chair, on behalf of my leader, Prince Buthelezi and all members and staff of the IFP, I wish to pass our deepest and heartfelt condolences to Tarnia's family, friends, and her colleagues in the DA.

Ms Baker was taken so tragically from us on 6 October, whilst involved in parliamentary oversight work on Water and Sanitation. Her passing is a great and untimely loss to the people of South Africa, whose best interests she so diligently served as a proud member of our National Assembly.

Ms Baker was not only an adroit politician but also a loving wife and devoted mother. I had the privilege of

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017**

**Page: 16**

serving alongside Ms Baker in the Portfolio Committee on Water and Sanitation, and can attest to her diligence and capability. She made a difference. Her untimely and tragic passing is sorely lamentable.

Tarnia made sure that challenges facing our communities on matters of water were immediately addressed. She was a true servant of the people. Death has truly robbed the Portfolio Committee of Water and Sanitation of a dedicated Member of Parliament, MP, who put people first.

To Tarnia, her friends, family and colleagues, you remain in our thoughts and prayers. May your soul rest in peace. I thank you.

Mr M L SHELEMBE: Hon Chairperson and the hon members of the House, the NFP shares in the sadness of this honourable House today, as we pay tribute to a fellow member. The late hon Tarnia Baker was a respected colleague in this august House, a dedicated member of both the Portfolio Committees on Human Settlements and Water and Sanitation.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017**

**Page: 17**

It was on an oversight visit to Ugu District, doing her duty, that the life of the late Hon Baker was so suddenly extinguished. The NFP identifies strongly with the description of the late hon Baker as a devoted public representative with untiring commitment and dedication to the service of the people.

Working together with her in the Portfolio Committees on Human Settlements and Water and Sanitation, I have witnessed first hand her dedication and her tireless quest to make sure that the interests and needs of our people are served with enthusiasm and sincerity. Her passion was an inspiration to me, personally, and I am sure to many of us gathered here today.

We extend our sincere condolences to the bereaved family of hon Baker who are coming to terms with the loss of a loving wife and mother. We also offer our condolences to the DA who has lost a loyal and dedicated colleague. We pray that you will find solace and comfort in the knowledge that the late hon Baker has made a valuable contribution to the steady progress of our democracy and that her memory will live on in the hearts of many

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017**

**Page: 18**

people. May her soul rest in everlasting peace. I thank you. [Applause.]

Ms C N MAJEKE: House Chair and hon members, the UDM received the sad news of the late hon Tarnia Baker's unnatural and sadden demise with great shock and sadness. Even though she has already been placed to her lasting resting place, we are still trying to come to terms with this tragic and sad reality.

We have known Tarnia for her commitment for the upliftment of the lives of the people of South Africa and her passion to strive for excellence in her work. She was a strong woman, always very focused and determined, and she died whilst in the service of the nation. Indeed, we have lost a great colleague, who was full of life and energy.

In her capacity as a member of Water and Sanitation Portfolio Committee, on the 23 August 2017, hon Tarnia sought clarity on the disparity between the 100% achievement recorded for the cash management agencies, CMA, under analysis per budget programme and the 28%

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017

Page: 19

achievement recorded for the same programme under income and expenditure for proto-CMA.

This level of detail can only be attributed to her focused approach to work, passion for detail, and the uncompromising service to the people. Our heartfelt condolences go out to her husband, the family, friends and her political family in the DA. We will honour her memory as we continue our work towards a better South Africa for all.

We will espouse integrity in our daily labour, work towards ensuring dignity for each and every South African and building a prosperous nation. May her soul rest in peace. I thank you. [Applause.]

*Afrikaans:*

Dr C P MULDER: Agb Voorsitter, kollegas, die familie van Tarnia Baker wat in die gallery is, dit is 'n goeie en gepaste gebruik wat ons in die raad het om van tyd tot tyd, as iets so tragies soos hierdie gebeur, net stil te staan, te stop en net weg te beweeg van die politieke werk waarmee ons besig is. Ons gee dan op 'n gepaste

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017

Page: 20

manier erkenning en bring hulde aan 'n kollega van ons wat ons ontval het.

Tarnia Baker was nie lank 'n lid van die Parlement nie. Sy het drie jaar in die raad gedien, maar in daardie drie jaar het sy reeds, daar waar sy gedien het in die komitee wat handel oor water en sanitasie, haar stempel afgedruk en dit was duidelik dat sy 'n verskil gemaak het. Sy was 'n persoon, aan die getuienis wat ons kry, wat duidelik 'n verskil gemaak het. Dit is baie belangrik.

Ons en haar kollegas hier van die DA neem afskeid van en bring hulde aan 'n kollega. Vir ons was dit 'n kollega met wie ons saamgewerk het, maar vir haar familie en haar vriende is dit 'n totaal ander situasie. Vir hulle gaan dit oor 'n eggenoot, 'n ma, 'n ouma. Dit is 'n baie meer persoonlike en private situasie as vir ons wat afskeid neem en hulde bring aan 'n kollega.

Sy het haar rol in Mpumalanga vervul, waar sy vir haar party gewerk het. Daar het sy ook haar kant gebring en op haar manier 'n bydrae gemaak.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017

Page: 21

Aan die huldeblyke wat vandag hier gelewer is, spesifiek van kollega Anchen Dreyer, wat vir ons baie meer gesê het oor die persoonlike interaksie wat daar was, is dit duidelik dat Tarnia nie maar net nog 'n Parlements lid was nie. Sy was iemand wat 'n besondere rol gespeel het en 'n baie groot verskil gemaak het.

Die getuienis sê dat sy uit 'n familie kom wat toegewyde Katolieke en Christene is en die dood bly altyd 'n moeilike situasie. Dit bly 'n moeilike saak, maar as Christene weet ons dat die dood nooit die einde is nie. Dit is maar net 'n nuwe begin, al is dit moeilik om te verstaan.

Namens die Vryheidsfront Plus wil ons ons opregte meegevoel betuig teenoor haar kollegas, maar spesifiek teenoor haar familie, wat agterbly met mooi herinneringe wat kan aangaan op die pad, en wat haar altyd sal onthou. Baie dankie. [Applous.]

Ms D CARTER: Chairperson, in many religious, philosophical and mythological traditions, the soul is the intangible and unique essence or the core of each

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017

Page: 22

living being. It's what ultimately defines and differentiates each one of us.

In Catholicism, the soul is immortal; it does not die with the body, from which it is separated by death, and with which it will be reunited in the final resurrection.

I mention this for a number of reasons.

Firstly, it was clear to all who met and interacted with Tarnia that her faith and Catholicism were important facets in Ms Baker's life.

Secondly, almost every person, be it colleagues, office bearers, political foe or friend, has, in lamenting Tarnia's most tragic and untimely demise, spoken of her soul, and I quote:

A warm and compassionate soul; a kind, lovely soul; a wonderful and warm person; passionate about her work; a dedicated public representative; diligent in her work and rigorous in exercising oversight; served with passion, energy and wisdom; a true servant of

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017

Page: 23

the people; an activist; gentle and sincere qualities, not often associated with politicians; and a devoted mother and wife.

What wonderful words to describe the essence of Tarnia.

What warm and wholesome phrases from which to find the beginnings of solace and peace in this time of absolute heartbreak.

Thirdly, the values and principles that defined who Tarnia was are the very same values and principles, which, if followed in service to our people and country, represent the difference between good and indifferent and bad governance.

South Africa needs more Tarnia Bakers. [Applause.] We owe it to her legacy to continually strive for ethical leadership and good and progressive governance in our country.

Finally, to Tarnia's family, husband and children, I say:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017

Page: 24

As much as one doesn't know and cannot comprehend another's sorrow, please take pride in the values and principles, the morality that informed the essence of your mother and wife's being here on earth and find solace in her and your belief of the immortality of her soul.

On 6 October, God picked the most beautiful flower, His most beautiful rose. May her soul rest in peace! Tarnia, fly with the angels. [Applause.]

Mr S N SWART: Chairperson, on behalf of the ACDP, we would like to express our deepest condolences to the family and friends of the late Tarnia Baker, as well as to the DA. Other members have spoken very eloquently about her work here and the void that her passing has left. We support those sentiments.

We were deeply shocked when we heard the tragic news of her passing. Sadly, her death comes soon after that of Mr Tim Khoza, also in a road collision.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017**

**Page: 25**

Ms Baker sat here when I said last month: "Which of those hon members would have thought things would turn out so tragically as they left for their oversight visit that morning." Similarly, she would not have known what awaited her this month. As a believer she was prepared and we heard about the selection of hymns.

Members will recall how I reminded the House that life is very short. I read from James Chapter 4 that our lives "are like the morning fog; it's here a little while, then it is gone." Life is indeed fleeting, as we again see today with deep sadness in the case of Tarnia.

There are no guarantees about tomorrow, let alone next year, or five or ten years. How are we living each day? If we ignore this lesson, we will not live our lives properly in the light of eternity. We need to make our plans and live our lives according to God's commands and purposes. We need to make sure that we are in a right relationship with the Lord Jesus and have repented of our sins. We hear of soup kitchens and it is a wonderful example. She showed an incredible servant leadership. Are we spreading love, forgiveness and reconciliation

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017

Page: 26

wherever we go? Are we shining lights with our warm smiles, like Tarnia?

Lastly, may Tarnia's husband, Landon, her three children, Tersia, Tarlan and Mia, and her grandson, Ethan, be comforted in the knowledge that, as you have heard, she was loved here in Parliament and that she in turn, shared love with her warm personality and bright smile. As a believer, she has run the race, she has kept the faith and now, there is in store for her, the crown of righteousness. We pray that our Heavenly Father will surround her family and friends with His love and peace. I trust that the sentiments, our love for you as a family and your sacrifices will bring comfort to you today. May the Lord bless you, as we pray for you! I thank you.

[Applause.]

Mr L M NTSHAYISA: Hon Chairperson, on behalf of the AIC and my President, Mandla Galo, who has been serving with this lady on the Portfolio Committee of Water and Sanitation, I convey our condolences to the bereaved family of Tarnia Baker, the Democratic Alliance and the

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017**

**Page: 27**

members of this committee. You have lost a beloved daughter, a mother, a dedicated woman of determination.

We understand the pain in which you are, but you must remember that she was not meant to live forever. God gives and God takes and He is never wrong because his decision is always divine. He will keep you strong until the end because He is always faithful.

Losing such a woman of her calibre is very painful. We appreciate the good work she done for the people of South Africa, particularly the poorest of the poorest.

She must be remembered for that good work. Her death could not have been prevented. Death is never early or late but always on time. That is the divine power and secret of God. You are therefore not alone in that suffering, don't hurt yourselves, we are all here. She died in harness, actually doing the work. May her soul rest in peace! I thank you. [Applause.]

Debate concluded.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017**

**Page: 28**

Agreed to, members standing.

**CONSIDERATION OF REPORT OF STANDING COMMITTEE ON  
APPROPRIATIONS ON STUDY TOUR TO SWEDEN AND GERMANY**

**CONSIDERATION OF REPORT OF STANDING COMMITTEE ON  
APPROPRIATIONS ON 16TH ASSOCIATION OF PUBLIC ACCOUNTS  
COMMITTEES CONFERENCE 2016**

**CONSIDERATION OF REPORT OF STANDING COMMITTEE ON  
APPROPRIATIONS ON OVERSIGHT VISIT TO KWAZULU-NATAL**

Ms Y N PHOSA: Hon Chair and hon members, I would like to take this opportunity and introduce the reports as already indicated by the Chairperson. The committee went or attended the Association of Public Accounts Committee, Apac, training in August 2017, on 10 and 11. All members of the Public Accounts Committee and Municipal Public Accounts Committee, travelled from all nine provinces to attend. The committee also was part that participated in this training. The intention was to create a common understanding of the fiscal oversight as an urgent and necessary task.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017**

**Page: 29**

The Apac training creates an opportunity for members to learn from one another and interact with the Auditor-General, the National Treasury, the Public Service Commission and other independent think-tanks. This training was an eye-opener and sharpened our minds on effective oversight function.

With regard to the KwaZulu-Natal oversight on September 2017, the committee undertook an oversight to visit the province to assess health and water infrastructure in the province. The intension of the committee was to assess the progress made in the roll out of bulk water infrastructure and the health infrastructure projects in the following districts. Umkhanyakude District, King Cetshwayo District, iLembe District and uMgungundlovu District and these project sites were visited. The Jozini Bulk Water Supply Project, Greater Mthonjaneni Bulk Water Supply Scheme, Ngcebo Bulk Water Supply Scheme and Umshwati Regional Bulk Water Supply Scheme.

On the health infrastructure, the committee visited the following areas. The Jozini Community Health Centre, Ngwelezane Hospital and the Grace Hospital. Observations

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017**

**Page: 30**

were that, whilst the committee found these projects up and running, there was lack of effective monitoring mechanisms in both sectors which needs to be addressed expeditiously. The committee is concerned about the absence of monitoring and evaluation mechanism which is in contravention of the conditions contained in the budget framework for the transfer of funds through the Division of Revenue Act.

The committee is of the view that the Departments of Water and Sanitation and Health both at the national, provincial and regional level should strengthen their monitoring and evaluation mechanisms in order to take timeous corrective actions without any delays.

The National Treasury in partnership with the Departments of Health and Water and Sanitation strengthen the expenditure management in infrastructure development focussing on maintenance.

With regard to the Sweden and Germany study tour, undertaken in January 2017, the Standing Committee on Appropriations undertook a study tour to Germany and

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017

Page: 31

Sweden from 28 January to 5 February 2017. The purpose of the tour was to learn from these countries the ways of ensuring that the budget process is effective and the legislative process followed on amending the budget and best practice in oversight mechanisms over budget implementation. The German and the Swedish parliaments budget oversight objective is underlined by a clear commitment to fiscal, discipline and debt reduction. Hon Chair, I would like to thank you and these are the reports. [Applause.]

There was no debate.

The Chief Whip of the Majority Party moved: That the Reports be adopted.

Declarations of vote made on behalf of the Democratic Alliance, Economic Freedom Fighters, National Freedom Party and African National Congress.

*Declaration of vote:*

Mr A R M CLOUGHLIN: Chairperson, this Parliament periodically sends delegations from several of its

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017**

**Page: 32**

committees on so-called study tours to the parliaments of many countries around the world. Strangely, these delegations often comprise of only some of the members of the committees as only certain, selected individuals are afforded the privilege. In my humble opinion this must surely, to a large extent, defeat the object of the exercise - on what basis is it logical to empower and educate only a certain portion of any committee?

When questioned, the reason for this seemingly inequitable state of affairs is ascribed only to budgetary constraints. Further investigation reveals that those who go on these tours fly business class and are generally accommodated in five star hotels or their equivalent. Obviously this means that such tours involve a cost far higher than would be necessary for the purpose. Under the straightened circumstances that this country currently finds itself in, I would suggest that serious consideration should be given to the continuance of this practice. If a study tour is deemed necessary, it should surely be undertaken in a manner that is fair to all the members of the committee and at a cost that would

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017

Page: 33

reflect how seriously Parliament views the current financial state of the country.

The second report deals with the Association of Public Accounts Committees' Conference that was held in Bloemfontein. This was possibly the worst organised conference that I have ever had the misfortune to attend. [Applause.]

Delegates trickled in and out of the conference as and when they saw fit. People were transported to all points of the compass as officials desperately tried to find out where their various wards were supposed to be. The conference was conducted over three days, the second of which was incredulously devoted to a choice of several tours to various places of interest in and around Bloemfontein. One of these tours took travellers all the way to Sasolburg, a three and a half hour drive, to view a water treatment plant. Those unfortunate delegates who elected to go on this tour only returned to their hotels after midnight having had little or no food for the day.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017**

**Page: 34**

All in all, this conference was an unmitigated failure and a total waste of money from the point of view of achieving its main aim of empowering the members of public accounts committees for the more effective scrutiny of public accounts and spending.

I am happy to report that the oversight tour dealt with in the third report was a very different affair. On the ground oversight unfailingly reveals just how incompetent and ineffective this administration is in the areas of expenditure and intergovernmental relations and co-operation. Sadly, this revelation also exposes the many reasons for millions of rand worth of unauthorised, fruitless and wasteful expenditure.

To cite a few examples of this, the beautiful new R275 million world class community health centre in Jozini, which was due to be completed in 2014, currently stands as a monument to incompetence and mismanagement. This project was delayed because work on the site carried on under the auspices of the Department of Public Works had to be stopped by the Departments of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries and Environmental Affairs due to

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017**

**Page: 35**

the complete failure of the contractor to undertake an Environmental Impact Assessment. This necessitated the removal and replacement of the existing soil base at huge cost in both time and money.

When the construction work was finally completed, the facility could not be commissioned because it was then discovered that there was no reliable water supply to the facility. Although the Department of Water and Sanitation had built a new water treatment plant in the vicinity, the local community, having been promised water for many years by various visiting ANC dignitaries, happily drilled into the newly installed water line and helped themselves to the available supply of water, leaving no pressure for the health facility. At the time of our visit a new dedicated steel water pipe was being installed at further cost to the Department of Health, who have been compelled to incur this unauthorised expenditure to make up for the inability of the local bankrupt municipality to meet its reticulation obligations.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017**

**Page: 36**

The staff at the previously mentioned water treatment plant advised their visitors that they had themselves decided to install basic reticulation in the area to supply the local communities with much needed water to make up for the municipality's failures. Despite this, the plant could provide 400% more than its current daily water uptake indicating that a far larger plant than was necessary had been installed on this site. It should be noted that although the Department of Water and Sanitation's actions in providing the local community with water were very commendable, they were acting outside of their mandate and incurring unauthorised expenditure.

It must be clear that if the various government entities involved in these two projects had taken the time to communicate effectively with each other, the problems described could have been avoided. The DA support the reports. Thank you. [Applause.]

Mr N S MATIASE: House Chair, it is the EFF's view that appropriations and expropriations for public goods and service to the people, there is no any other better

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017

Page: 37

lessons we can learn from Sweden or Germany other than to take lessons from Amilcar Cabral that people don't fight for things that are in the grandeurs minds of individuals but fights to meet the material needs and benefits, to live better and in peace, to see their lives go forward to guarantee the future of their children.

It is our view that expropriation is an instrument to allocate national revenue on equitable basis to meet the material needs of our people as directed by Amilcar Cabral. If appropriation fails to meet these aspirations as we witnessed in the Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement delivered here yesterday by one Gupta puppet then, hon Chair, expropriations ceases to be an instrument to meet the needs of the people but the legal instrument to loot and bankrupt this country further.

South Africa is technically bankrupt ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon Matiase, will you just take your seat please. Why are you rising hon member?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017

Page: 38

Mr P J MNGUNI: I rise in terms of Rule 92. The hon Matiase refers to the hon Minister of Finance in the manner which he has done to call him a Gupta puppet. We really object vehemently to that kind and we ask him to withdraw immediately.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon Matiase, did you say that?

Mr N S MATIASE: No, I didn't. South Africa ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon Matiase, you say you didn't make that remark?

Mr N S MATIASE: I didn't.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon member, we will check the recording and come back to make a ruling.

Mr N S MATIASE: Okay, thank you. South Africa is technically bankrupt as we speak because of handful of politically connected and corrupt individuals and leaders who get rich at the expense of the poor.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017**

**Page: 39**

This Parliament must use expropriations and related laws to provide a decolonised free and quality education to our people now. It must use the money bills to provide houses, electricity, clean and running water and sanitation to our people now. This Parliament must condemn plans to bankrupt the country further through reckless and dangerous nuclear deals as seems to be the case now. Furthermore calls upon this Parliament to exercise its oversight and constitutional mandate to keep departments of government and in particular the National Treasury in checks and to hold those who steal and loot from the people accountable.

For all of this, the EFF stands here to affirm the correctness of the decision it took yesterday to walk out instead of being part of a process of being complacent with corruption that was taking place and witness crime taking place and we refuse to be associated with further stealing of public resources. [Applause.]

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Hon House Chair, hon members in the House and guests in the gallery, let me start off by saying that the National Freedom Party supports the

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017**

**Page: 40**

reports tabled here today. Hon Chair, let me start off by talking about the Apec conference that was held. The Apec conference is a very valuation conference, however, the challenges that exist is that whatever, we consume, whatever, we learn from there, the question is: Are we implementing it? The response is clearly no.

I know that one of the decisions that were taken was to ensure that all municipalities by the end of December have the municipal public accounts committees in place and I am not sure if to date that has been achieved or not. What was also clear is that despite having monitoring and evaluation in place, consequences is where we have a challenge. People tend to do the same thing year in and year out and do not pay the price for it.

Regarding the oversight Visit to the Jozini Health Centre, obviously we indentified such challenges, I was not part of the visit, but in terms of the report and the engagements that took place in the committee, clearly there are some challenges in terms of the health facilities; delays in infrastructure development and for that the National Freedom Party call on the national

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017**

**Page: 41**

Department of health to intervene together with the KZN Department of health to ensure that they deal with these matters as a matter of urgency including the overspending at Grey's Hospital in Pietermaritzburg.

What has come very clear is that both the Department of Water and Sanitation and the Department of Health in KwaZulu-Natal there appears to be a serious problem in terms of oversight in ensuring that project in terms of strategic plans and budgetary processes are implemented effectively and timeously.

Hon Chairperson, we also had an opportunity to do a study tour on Germany and Sweden. If I talk about Sweden, what was very remarkable in Sweden was the issue of the NSFAS funding where we found that 100% of loans are repaid through a system where a 5% of the salaries are deducted from employees and which I think is a lesson that maybe we as South Africa need to learn. There appears to be very little or no fruitless expenditure or wasteful expenditure but what is important is that whenever they exist they are dealt with timeously. We learnt a lot from our visit there including Germany. We found out that when

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017**

**Page: 42**

it comes to large procurement and infrastructure projects, they ensure that before funds are allocated and approved, they do feasibility studies to check for efficiency and whether the results will be positive.

In a nutshell, we learnt a bit and it is time to actually implement that. As a national freedom party we will welcome the reports tabled here and support them accordingly. Thank you.

Mr N E GCWABAZA: House Chairperson, on the study tour to Germany, the ANC is satisfied that this study tour was taken at an appropriate moment to capacitate members to understand and learn from both Germany and Sweden's budgetary processes they go through in order to make budgeting and implementation effective. We observed that the budget committees are a lot more strongly mandated to scrutinise the budgets of the departments and even the ministries even before those budgets are presented to Parliament for adoption.

What was also very interesting is the strength of what in our instance we call the auditor-general's office. In

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017**

**Page: 43**

their case the auditor-general's office, which they call by different names, are mandated to sit through the whole process of budgeting, implementation and then be able to audit. We think that it would be important for Parliament to consider strengthening the direct participation of the office of the auditor-general in the budgetary processes from the beginning through to implementation and then finally auditing.

On the Conference of the Association of Public Accounts Committees, committee members are satisfied with the contents of the documents and the debates that ensued in the process. However, we are concerned with the programme of the conference which seemed to focus more on a bit of entertainment more than the real conference activities ahead of the activities themselves taking place. We do agree that we gained a deeper understanding and insight into the accounting principles which would strengthen Members of Parliament to understand and be able to read the audit report.

Lastly, on the oversight to KZN on water infrastructure and health infrastructure ...

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017

Page: 44

*IsiZulu:*

... sifuna ukusho ukuthi uKhongolose uzinikezele ekutheni yandise ingqalasizinda yezamanzi ezifundazweni zonke. Esakubona KwaZulu-Natali kwasikhombisa ukuthi lo msebenzi kaKhongolose wokwandisa izingqalasizinda zamanzi kanye futhi nengqalasizinda yezikhungo zezempilo, ihamba kahle kakhulu. Kodwa sifuna ukusho ukuthi siyakhathazeka njengoKhongolose uma sibona ingqalasizinda ingasheshi ukwakhiwa iphele ngesikhathi ekade ikalelwe sona. Lokhu kukhomba ...

*English:*

... that the planning, implementation and timeframes ...

*IsiZulu:*

... kuyagejana. Lokhu kudala ukuthi izimali zokusebenza noma zokwakha bese zigcina sezedlulele enanini elalikade libhekiwe ukuthi lizosetshenziswa.

Okwesibili, esikubonile esifuna ukukuphakamisa ukutho kuyadingeka ukuthi omasipala banikezwe amandla ngokwezimali futhi banikezwe amandla ngokwamakhono [technical skills] ukuze bakwazi ngaso sonke isikhathi

THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017

Page: 45

ukuthatha amanzi emadamini amakhulu bawayise ezindlini zabantu.

*English:*

That capacity is lacking ...

*IsiZulu:*

... iyafuna ukuthi igqizelelwe. Ngasezibhedlela umsebenzi owenziwa uMnyango weZempilo muhle kakhulu. Nakhona kunenkinga yokuthi ingqalasizinda iyasilela ngemuva ...

*English:*

... in terms of timeframes of finishing it, as a result spending overruns occur.

*IsiZulu:*

Izinto esafika sazithola, sazixoxa neziphathimandla zesifundazwe sase-KZN ezazikhona kanye nomasipala ababekhona. Savumelana ukuthi lezo izinto okufanele ukuthi sizilungise. Siyakuthakasela ukuthi iziphathimandla zesifundazwe kanye nakumasipala, kwezinye izikhathi ngisho nomeya babe khona, kuyasithokozisa

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017

Page: 46

ukuthi bawuthathela phezulu umsebenzi wabo. Zikhona izinkinga zezimali, zikhona izinkunga ...

*English:*

... regarding technical and financial capacity ...

*IsiZulu:*

... kodwa umsebenzi wabo bawuthathela phezulu. Lokho kukhomba ukuthi i-ANC isesimweni esihle kakhulu ukuthi ikwazi ukunikeza abantu amanzi ahlanzekile, ikwazi nokuthi izimpilo zabantu ziqhubeke zibe ngcono ngaso sonke isikhathi. Ngakho-ke, akuyona ingozi ukuthi isikhathi sokuphila [life span] sabantu baseNingizimu Afrika ikhulile cishe ifinyelele eminyakeni engama-63 futhi iyanyuka ngokunjalo.

Ngenxa yalokho sizokwazi ukuthi i-target impokophelo yokufika eminyakeni angama-70 yokuphila sizokwazi ukuyifinyelela.

*English:*

I thank you, we support the report.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017**

**Page: 47**

Agreed to.

**CONSIDERATION OF REPORT OF PORTFOLIO COMMITTEE ON  
ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS - ON 22ND SESSION OF CONFERENCE OF  
PARTIES TO UNITED NATIONS FRAMEWORK CONVENTION ON CLIMATE  
CHANGE AND OTHER ENGAGEMENTS**

Mr M P MAPULANE: Hon House Chairperson, hon members, ladies and gentlemen, the South African parliamentary delegation was invited to attend the 22nd Session of the Conference of the Parties, COP22, to the United Nation Framework Convention on Climate Change, which was held in Marrakesh in Morocco on the 7-18th November 2016.

Some of the key events attended by the delegation included the Interparliamentary Union Conference organised by the IPU and the Moroccan Parliament, the High-Level Segment of the conference, the Africa Day celebrations attended by the African Heads of States and Governments in the African Pavilion, the meeting of the Nordic parliamentarians, the meeting of the European Parliaments, as well as various other side events.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017**

**Page: 48**

The Marrakesh climate change conference was significant in that, it ushered in the first session of the conference of the party serving as the meeting of the parties to the Paris Agreement referred to at the CMA 1. The CMA 1 launch took place following the ratification of the historic Paris Agreement of 2015 by overwhelming number of countries surpassing the double threshold of 55 countries accounting for 55% of the global greenhouse gas emissions.

South Africa was part of the countries which participated in this historic gathering in the history of climate change negotiations. The Paris Agreement, which was adopted after four years of intense negotiations initiated by the 2011 COP17 Conference in Durban, South Africa platform was indeed a historic landmark in the history of climate change negotiations.

It signalled the beginning of a fundamentally new cause in the decades old global climate change efforts. We would like to take this opportunity to thank members of this House for unanimously ratifying the Paris Agreement on 1st November 2016. The ratification of the Paris

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017**

**Page: 49**

Agreement by this Parliament gave South Africa the necessary impetus and cloud to continue influencing key decisions and outcomes in multilateral climate change negotiations, especially in light of the fact that the Paris Agreement was originally conceived here in our soil in 2011 through the COP17 Durban platform.

Climate change is not a rumour. It is not a theoretical abstract fascinating the imagination of the scientists nor is it conspiracy invented by the international environmental lobby groups, as some denialist, like; Donald Trump, would want us to believe. Climate change is indeed a global reality.

Emissions of carbon dioxide and other greenhouse gas emission are changing the earth's climate. Global efforts are therefore required to combat the rising temperatures, the extreme weather events and the changing rainfall patterns, which are caused by climate change.

The Paris Agreement amongst others seek to do the following: To reaffirm the goal of limiting global temperature increases to well below two degree Celsius

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017**

**Page: 50**

while urging air force to limit the increases to 1,4 degree Celsius and to establish the binding commitments by all parties to make a five-yearly nationally determined contributions and to pursue domestic measures aimed at achieving them and a whole host of other objectives.

The Marrakesh Conference successfully demonstrated to the world that the implementation of the Paris Agreement is underway and the constructive spirit of multilateral co-operation on climate change continues unabated despite the backwards, archaic and reckless perspectives on climate change as articulated by some in the world.

As part of Africa group and as well as the leader of the basic countries for the Marrakesh Climate Change Conference, the South African delegation is satisfied with the outcomes of the Marrakesh climate talks, which recognise the urgency of addressing climate change through the successful implementation of the Paris Agreement and the extension of the mandate of the Kyoto Protocols and the Adaptation Fund. Thank you very much.

[Time expired.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017

Page: 51

There was no debate.

The Chief Whip of the Majority Party moved: That the Report be adopted.

*Declarations of vote:*

Ms J EDWARDS: I think first and foremost, we should say that no one and I mean no one can treat climate change a fluffy issue anymore. Over the years experts have warned of the dangers that climate change holds yet so many have treated or seen them as being attention seekers with nothing better to do with their time. It is evident though that they were right and that we should have been more proactive in our approach. This doesn't leave South Africa out.

This became evident at COP22 last year. I was in absolute awe of so many participants in countries while interacting with delegates at meetings and side events and listening to the stories. It also became very evident to me that South Africa although trying we are still quite far behind.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017**

**Page: 52**

We have so much potential. Why are we not doing more as a country? We can start by doing something simple that will have a massive impact, like climate change awareness. We have a crucial role to play in shaping people's perceptions of climate change and in building political will needed to tackle this.

We also need proactive climate change legislation in South Africa. There is ample evidence worldwide that countries which have proactively formulated laws to deal with certain issues are generally considered leaders in those matters. Why South Africa is not on that list?

This Parliament should ensure that the cost of climate change law is estimated as well as budgeted for to ensure effective implementation. It must ensure that targets contained in the law are worked into deliverable programmes for the various government departments.

We should also incentivise the public sector because it has a major role to play and it is essential that they are involved as well as encouraged to invest in sustainable low carbon initiatives. This is imperative

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017**

**Page: 53**

for South Africa to make sure that we are in line with the international targets. Unfortunately low carbon initiatives are very low on this government's priority list and therefore we are moving at a snail's pace.

South Africa should adopt a no-nonsense approach when it comes to climate change and environmental issues as a whole. Stop in allowing entities, companies or individuals to get away with polluting. Stop allowing the people of this country to pave their way out of trouble. Stop allowing the citizens to suffer because this government is failing to implement and monitor. Stop allowing the citizens of this country to suffer because of this government's lack of political will. Stop paying us lip service. Let us act now. Thank you.

Mr Z R XALISA: Chairperson, this generation and the generation that follow will suffer the greatest human induced human calamity in history if world leaders collectively don't take drastic action to mitigate the impact of climate change.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017**

**Page: 54**

The onus is on us, as this group of lawmakers to take every possible step to do our part in mitigation and adapting to the delirious outcome of humanity's developmental choices.

The parliamentary delegations to the 22nd session of conference of parties to United Nation's framework convention on climate change could have been used to better position our legislative making capacity to prove the country's capacity in dealing with climate change.

Instead of our delegation engaging with other countries to find solution to the global problems of climate change, our own delegation consisting mainly of ANC people, who have no idea of what the world is dealing with, use this as an opportunity to loiter around, with Frolick giving inconsequential talks here and there.

Since that conference, the US, under the leadership of their maniac has pulled out of the Paris Agreement threatening to punch global action on climate change to a crisis mode. Under these conditions, we must defy the sense of hopelessness brought about in our country by our

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017**

**Page: 55**

own looting maniac and take decisive steps towards the global fight against climate change and strive for the implementation of the Paris Agreement.

This must include having a law of generation of application on climate change, which will bind all government departments to a common approach towards reducing emissions and be an overarching guide to our developmental path.

This must also give timelines on complete outlaws of fossil fuel as an energy source and provide a framework for a transition towards renewable energy sources. We support all actions towards bringing the collective strength of all countries in the world to tackle climate change but we reject this report and we don't condone the use of important forums, such as this as an opportunity of the ANC looters to loiter around using taxpayer's money. Thank you. [Applause.]

Mr N SINGH: Hon Chairperson, the COP22, held in Marrakesh in November, last year, focused on action items, which would assist on achieving the priorities of the Paris

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017

Page: 56

Agreement and more specifically to issues related adaptations, transparency, technology transfer, mitigation, capacity building, and loss and damages.

This was however overshadowed, as we know, by the shock withdrawal of the United State from the Paris Agreement on principle grounds and President Trump's words and I quote: "It being a bad deal for the American people."

Well, President Trump, this has now become a bad deal for the world and global environment and we look forward to the United States rapidly reconsidering its position in this regard.

It is imperative that South Africa continue with its efforts and contributions to reducing the effects of climate change as your hon member from the DA said, a couple of years back we still had a few climate change detractors claiming that it was a myth, hoax, conspiracy and a capitalistic attempt at creating a new markets.

Today, it is reported that 90% of scientist agree that humanity's current and ever-increasing carbon footprint, which describe the amount of greenhouse gas emissions in

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017**

**Page: 57**

our global environment is reaching critical levels and reduction measures must be implemented and legislature by all countries if we have to stave off an impending global crisis.

Air pollution is a global problem and it is imperative that South Africa take all necessary steps at ensuring that our surrounding environment can accommodate our national carbon footprint.

Out of every three breaths we take here right now in this House, two of those breath come courtesy of our marine environment. Why are they so reckless with our ocean management? As a start, we must ensure that through a vehicle like the Marine Spatial Planning Bill, currently before this House, that our marine protected areas are of sufficient size and we support calls to increase this amount to 10% of our exclusive marine environment.

Such basic steps we believe that our fundamental in creating a sustainable environmental architecture in our country. Let us start with getting the basic right and

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017**

**Page: 58**

the complexity and enormity of the challenge will then not as daunting and difficult as it now appears to be.

Climate change and the effects thereof can be prevented. It does however require the necessary political will. I thank you, Chairperson.

Prof N M KHUBISA: Chairperson, I'm doing this on behalf of my colleague, hon Shelembe.

Climate change is a single most common threat to the future existence and survival of humanity. The terrifying reality is that we are not only at the beginning of this global change in climate that will continue to create havoc in the lives of millions of people.

Chairperson, this is a relentless change that will increase intensity as decades of the industrial pollution and environmental abuse reveals the true extent of the damage done to our global environment. Future generations will be the ones to pay the price.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017**

**Page: 59**

Hon House Chairperson, our government will have to make a paradigm shift in its approach to preparing for the ravages of the climate change, which is likely to affect the poorest of the poor most severely; and this needs to be done swiftly. We need the framework act of Parliament to facilitate and drive our efforts to deal with climate change; of course, we also need to do more than that.

We propose as the NFP that what South Africa need is an integrated climate change management programme, which will cut across the divides between government, business, organised labour and the society.

It is time to set differences aside when we deal with this matter. We must identify the common challenges posed by climate change, and devise a suitable strategy that will take into consideration the immediate challenges, as well as the need to adapt to our planning and policies in the long-term.

We welcome the observation of the committee that a curtain is steadily been drawn on fossil fuels and that the global trend shows a noticeable increase in the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017

Page: 60

proportion of renewable energy in the energy mix of countries.

We support the report and believe that it is an important subject and any attempt by the West to play this superpower role when dealing with this matter does not assist the nations of the world. Thank you very much Chairperson.

*IsiZulu:*

Eh, Chief Whip, I-orange Awubonanga kahle, I-orange.

Mr Z S MAKHUBELE: Hon House Chairperson, Ministers, Deputy Ministers, Members of Parliament ...

[Interjections.]

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: [Inaudible.]

Mr Z S MAKHUBELE: They are there, you may not see them.

If you can't see them blame it on me.

The ANC supports this report as presented. It is worth mentioning that we had a multiparty parliamentary

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017**

**Page: 61**

delegation, which was part of the country's team to the Conference of the Parties, COP 22. The EFF's allegations are predictable and not surprising because they were not even there.

The parties that participated in that conference had adopted this report through their representatives. This is a report aimed at indicating what happened and was achieved for the country regarding combating climate change impacts.

The country's delegation consisted of persons from various stakeholders and sectors who are affected or have an interest on reducing the effects of climate change in our country - from businesses, politicians, experts, research institutions, environmental rights, NGOs, etc.

We urge the government to co-ordinate effectively all those who play a role as partners and stakeholders in order to address the concerns raised last year in this regard as we approach COP 23. We must also allow those

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017**

**Page: 62**

involved to showcase their activities at these international platforms.

The ANC wishes to congratulate both the Development Bank of Southern Africa, DBSA and the South African National Biodiversity Institute, SANBI for their appointment as the implementing agents for the global climate fund. It is hoped that they will focus on climate resilience development project and programmes, even in the rural and most vulnerable areas of the country; and the southern region.

Recent storms and floods in KwaZulu-Natal and EThekweni in particular, indicates the extent to which climate change impacts post disastrous challenges to the country, to which the local government sphere may not adequately be ready to handle.

The climate adaptation fund should be utilised to alleviate these challenges as and when they happen; the development of climate sensitive risk responses projects - taking into consideration the social impacts of climate change pertaining to gender and other inequalities.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017**

**Page: 63**

I therefore on behalf of the ANC, agree and accept the report and hope that the recommendations shall be implemented. I thank you, House Chair. [Applause.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Thank you hon member. There were no objections to the report being adopted.

Motion agreed to.

Report accordingly adopted.

**CONSIDERATION OF REPORT OF PORTFOLIO COMMITTEE ON LABOUR  
ON OVERSIGHT VISIT TO MPUMALANGA FARMS**

Ms F S LOLIWE: House Chair, I am here to present the report which is to update Parliament on some of the work done by the committee as part of its oversight role. As a Portfolio Committee on Labour we conducted an oversight visit in five farms in Mpumalanga from the 15 to 18 September 2015. The objective of the oversight was to monitor compliance to labour legislation, conditions of employment in particular. What we picked up there was

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017**

**Page: 64**

that there were a substantial number of employees that were foreign nationals, some of which were made supervisors in the various farms. Some of these foreign nationals did not have the required immigrant documents. Most workers' residential places were horrible and employees were charged for that in that they were paying rental.

Most employees complained about their wages and non-registration in the Unemployment Insurance Fund, UIF. We singled out two farms there, Inyoni Boerdery Farm and Umbhaba Farm because challenges there were such that we had to refer them to the Department of Labour for follow-up which was done. We appreciate the fact that the provincial government in Mpumalanga working with the Department of Labour and all stakeholders that are involved have been following up on the matter especially the case of Umbhaba Farm where about 300 farm workers were dismissed by the employer there.

We then proposed as the committee that inspections should be upped a bit in the two farms because conditions of service were terrible and the Department of Labour has to

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017

Page: 65

deal decisively with noncompliance. We are also saying countries closer to the borders of South Africa should work with South Africa to ensure that the influx of illegal immigrants to South Africa is being curbed. We then lastly want to lend by saying Parliament should take cognisance of the fact that farm workers may not be enjoying the freedom we deem to be having because the way in which they are treated is a horrible one. I want to lend by citing a story where one employer was saying:

I am treating my employees very well; when a cow dies I give it to them free of charge so they are supposed to appreciate that.

All parties that were there left those farms frustrated because it was clear the South Africa that we are in has not arrived in those farms thus the report we are tabling. I thank you. [Applause.]

There was no debate.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: House Chair, again we move that the report be adopted by this august House.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017

Page: 66

*Declaration(s) of vote:*

Mr D AMERICA: House Chair, this oversight visit took place so long ago that the details of the visit are fairly vague however there are three things that stood out for me from this particular visit. Firstly, being that it was quite evident there was connivance between officials of the Food and Allied Workers Union, Fawu, and some officials of the labour centre in Malalane, that they conspired against the employees to boost the image and the recruitment potential of the workers.

Secondly, there is a lack of capacity at the Malalane Labour Centre particularly with regard to labour inspectors to effect effective inspections around the district and thirdly, the high levels of youth unemployment in the Malalane and Nkomazi district. Now, youth unemployment is not only restricted to those two districts. We know it is a South African problem and it currently stands at 55,6%. Of the 9,3 million South Africans who do not have jobs, over 5 million of those unemployed people are young people. Subsequent to our visits, at least 68 000 Mpumalanga residents joined the ranks of the unemployed in 2016. This figure includes

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017**

**Page: 67**

36 000 people that have lost their jobs and 32 000 people who are new entrants in the labour market and could not find jobs. Mpumalanga's youth contribute significantly to this number as some are forced to stay at home with qualifications because there are no opportunities. The increase in unemployment can be seen as a failure of the ANC's incoherent, inconsistent and sometimes unconstitutional economic policies.

Yesterday the Minister of Finance in his speech used the word "must" 48 times. Not once did he mention or provide any "hows" We are faced with an economic crisis in the country and no solutions were provided as to how we are going to get ourselves out of this mess. It is clear that the governing party is struggling to create a conducive environment that will create employment opportunities for both the unemployed and new entrants to the labour market. A DA government will create an environment for growth and job creation. The DA will assist small businesses to gain access to capital and to grow their businesses to create jobs particularly those in our townships.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017**

**Page: 68**

This report before us lists a number of problems faced by farm workers. No doubt, those problems must be addressed. The department was given three months subsequent to the report to respond to those problems that were identified. Sadly, I must say, nothing came of it. The only feedback the committee received was a letter stating that two cases are with the Commission for Conciliation, Mediation and Arbitration, CCMA, for resolution. That was way back in 2015. The department needs to stop making recommendations and start taking actions. It is clear that the ANC government does not care about farm workers otherwise it would not have taken them more than two years to table this report.

This report is so outdated that we have to schedule another oversight visit to the area in order to ascertain ourselves with the true state of affairs. I can assure you that in all likelihood the conditions have not improved. We as the DA will aim to improve the working conditions of farm workers and the challenges faced by farmers. South Africa is a country of countless opportunities and possibilities. Our people and especially our youth needs to be given hope that tomorrow

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017**

**Page: 69**

will be better than today. That their parents' sacrifices and pain of the past will not be in vain, that their children and grandchildren will have a better future. Come 2019 they will vote for new beginning. A new beginning, a DA-led government ensuring freedom, fairness and opportunities for all South Africans, the DA support the adoption of this report. I thank you. [Applause.]

Mr T RAWULA: House Chairperson, the common thing with all these oversights including this one of Mpumalanga, the farm workers are staying in properties of farm owners on condition that they are rendering cheap labour to farm owners. The farm workers are subjected to exploitation by farm owners. They are paid below the controversial minimum wage of R20 sponsored by Mr Ramaphosa which is further stark for farm workers and domestic workers below the R20, between R12 and R16 per hour respectively. Sometimes these farm workers are paid with a bag of maize meal and cheap alcohol as a condition of their stay in these farms as cheap labourers.

Farm worker do not enjoy the rights enshrined in the Basic Conditions of Employment Act. They are working

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017**

**Page: 70**

irregular hours which are between nine and 10 hours and 45-50 hours without being paid overtime in a week. They are paid between R1 600 and R2 000 per month. It is an indignity that our people enjoy in the hands of unscrupulous farm owners. Farm workers do not enjoy basic rights such as, access to adequate ablution services such as toilets, water and showers. Women that are farm workers are forced to help themselves in the field together with men. These poor women of which some are married are vulnerable to abuse and rape from the same farm owners due to these working conditions. All of this is happening in the presence of the Department of Labour inspectorate services. The inspectors are charged with the responsibility to monitor and inspect compliance of farm owners with basic labour rights of workers such as working hours and safety, employment equity and skills development. However, the inspectors either do not do their jobs or not enforcing the findings.

This is despite the inherent limitation of the inspection services which relates to capacity constraints. The department lacked capacity in terms of personnel provision, skills deficiency amongst ... the morale of

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017**

**Page: 71**

staff is low due to lack of leadership and poor remuneration. All these affect directly the poor workers. The immediate solution is to change patterns of ownership in these farms to give expression of farm workers as co-owners of land. This will assist to address the imbalances of the past in terms of ownership patterns. This could only be done when sanity prevails to all Members of Parliament as legislators to amend the Constitution, the property clause, Section 35 to give expression of expropriation of land without compensation. This is the second pillar if the EFF that only when land is expropriated without compensation finds expression in our Constitution we could resolve the challenges facing the farm workers in South Africa. We call this Parliament to exhaust its thinking capacity and further tap into the superior logic of the EFF and pass laws that will force the ownership of land by the state and ownership of profit margins by the farm workers. This will end the perpetual exploitation of our own workers. The EFF supports the recommendations. [Interjections.]

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017**

**Page: 72**

Mr J A ESTERHUIZEN: Chairperson, having been requested to do this presentation only during this morning, I have decided to concentrate a little more ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Order hon members!

Mr J A ESTERHUIZEN: ... on the structural challenges faced by farm workers and what their children face daily. How successful is the implementation of new legislation such as the Sectoral Determination that has been put into place. Farming for food production is a tough job both for the farm owner and the farm worker. Farm workers face challenges such as poor working and living conditions and always, very important, farm school education. The children must walk to schools, being taught in multigrade classrooms receiving low quality education. Farms mostly have become multinational corporations through acquisitions and farm workers have had to adjust. Some farm workers have now become stakeholders and have a say in their children's education.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017**

**Page: 73**

But there are many challenges still faced by the farm workers today, for example, unemployment and employment of cheap labour Mozambique and other countries as well as illnesses, housing, work security, training and career growth and wages. Currently farms and farm owners are closely monitored to inform the policy makers, members of legislatures and delegates and other stakeholders on the working and living conditions of farm workers. And the department is continuing playing a role in regulating and providing guidelines for the employment conditions for farm workers and their families.

But having said that the responses were varied from farm to farm in this report, a concern that I share and that many farm children, do not receive quality education, or drop out of school at a very young age, or migrate to nearby towns. These are harsh realities and daily experiences of children who grow up in farms. Already their destiny in life has been decided. Most do not have the opportunity as children in villages, townships or suburbs and through this department I hope we can ensure that they have a brighter future ahead of them. I thank you.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017**

**Page: 74**

Prof N M KHUBISA: Chairperson, in spite of the fact that this report has taken too long to be presented to this House, the NFP notes that there is still a lot of neglect and undermining of the Labour Relations Act and the workers in farms are still exploited at the extreme. Issues of less pay whereas the department should have been doing this and it is a pity that from 1994 to date, things are not well in farms. Farm workers work long hours yet they are paid less and what is also observed is that there are labour inspectors but seemingly they become reactive, they do not do their work, they do not investigate what is happening in farms in terms of compliance.

It is therefore recommended that inspectors should do their work all the time and ensure that compliance is really done in farms. Also, it is not acceptable at this time and age and we see it as dehumanisation that farm workers will work for food parcels and of course their socioeconomic conditions are not taken into cognisance. Schools are not in good stead, some of the farm schools are dilapidated. They do not have the necessary resources, lack of clinics, toilets, water and

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017**

**Page: 75**

sanitation, etc. So these are the issues that bear to the fact that there is still a lot of dehumanisation in farms. And also the fact that most farm workers complain that their jobs are being taken by foreign nationals and the NFP is of the view that this Department of Labour must ensure that there is a strong partnership between it and the Department of Home Affairs to ensure that whilst we need scarce skills but these immigrants must have the necessary documentation in order for them to work within the farms. So these are issues that we are bringing to the fore and we support the report. Thank you.

[Applause.]

Ms S R VAN SCHALKWYK: Hon House Chairperson, I know it is very strange for me that one hon member can say that this visit has been conducted so far back that he cannot remember what happened but it is very fresh in our minds because we think back about the bad working conditions in those farms that many of our workers were subjected to. We know that some of, many of, the employers are doing their part but there is still, also, a lot of the employers that are still practicing exploitative practices in this sector on the vulnerable workers and

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017**

**Page: 76**

bad working and living conditions when in some cases, one small room is occupied by more than 10 workers and they are supposed to do everything in that room and they are not paid according to the relevant legislations and nothing is being said about it.

And we noticed that there is a total disregard for relevant existing labour legislations especially in terms of the Basic Conditions of Employment Act and the relevant safety and health regulations and some employers are totally ignoring it. We had a lot of disputes there and we need to give some background in terms of what happened at Umbhaba Farm. Some of the workers realised in 2014 that they are totally not handled correctly by their employers and hence they tried to join the Fawu trade union but as a result of that they embarked on a protected strike where they were informed of their rights that they have and then they embarked on a strike but afterwards it was very bad to note that more than 300 workers were dismissed because they embarked on their strike to claim for their rights. This dispute is currently handled by the CCMA. As the ANC, in that study group, we are continuously following up on the plight of

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017

Page: 77

those workers in that area because we are feeling for those workers.

And currently it is being handled by the CCMA as being prioritised but the farmer tries to play delaying tactics by referring the case to the labour court and it is still there. And we know that currently that the problem that those workers are faced with is that the Fawu lawyers withdrew hence these workers are still unemployed at the current conjuncture. We recognise that we really have a problem in terms of necessary labour and staffing in terms of the inspectorate of the Department of Labour and we realise that with the 1 392 labour inspectors, they are not enough to perform the relevant duties as we would like them to do.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon member, will you just take your seat please. Why are you rising, hon member?

Mr M N PAULSEN: Hon Chairperson, on a point of order: Will the member take a question as to who is responsible for fixing these ... [Inaudible.] [Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017

Page: 78

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon ... no, do not ask the question. Hon member, are you prepared to take a question?

Ms S R VAN SCHALKWYK: No Chairperson.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): The member is not prepared to take a question. Please proceed hon member.

AN HON MEMBER: That is not ... [Inaudible.], Chairperson.

Ms S R VAN SCHALKWYK: We recognise that currently we have 835 inspectors below the required international standard for the economy of our size and yes indeed, that is why we are recommending continuously that more and more funds should be injected to ensure that we employ more staff and more inspectors in this area. But the truth, however, is that employers should also try to be true to the cause of the needy and the poor workers in these vulnerable sectors and ensure that they treat the employees with dignity and according to the real value instead of advancing their capitalistic ideals. They too have a role to play in ensuring that there is a better life for all

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017

Page: 79

and not strictly placing it on the doorstep of the governing party because we know that many of the people who are the employers in these areas they are capitalists and they do not care about the plight of the workers and that is why they employ foreigners and that is why they exploit those foreigners at the expense of low and no skilled workers that are unemployed in South Africa and we know ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon member, will you just take your seat. Why are you rising, hon member?

Ms L MATHYS: House Chair, on a point of order: Will the hon member take a question about who are the foreigners in the country?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): No! No! Hon member, you first ask if the hon member would take a question ... [Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017

Page: 80

Ms L MATHYS: Yeah! No, I am asking if you will take a question about who are the foreigners ...

[Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Then I will ask her before you put the question. Hon member, are you prepared to take a question?

Ms S R VAN SCHALKWYK: No, reality is what makes it difficult for us to accept but we need to go to those workplaces and we need to be, as public office bearers, we need to be firm on the ground because some of us as employees in our own homes, we are also practicing exploitative practices and we need to start there before we look forward and hence we are urging all workers out there to make themselves aware of the relevant rights that are protecting them that have been enshrined in the relevant labour legislation to ensure that they are protected and to ensure that they go to the Department of Labour's offices and expose these employers that are exploiting them. And really there are a lot of structures in place like the CCMA who are also doing their part and they are doing an excellent job as long as we take note

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017**

**Page: 81**

of this and we make use of the offices and the officials that are there. We know that this life can be a better life for all of us and as our chairperson indeed said that some employees are still not free. It is as if they were left behind in the apartheid era and that is not what we envisaged and hence we are asking all hon members to play their part in ensuring that indeed everyone is free. I thank you Chairperson. [Applause.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon members, there were no objections to the report.

Motion agreed to.

Report accordingly adopted.

**CONSIDERATION OF REPORT OF PORTFOLIO COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC  
ENTERPRISES - ON OVERSIGHT VISIT TO COMMUNITY OF SOWETO**

Mr D Z RANTHO: Hon Chairperson and hon Members of Parliament, the Portfolio Committee on Public Enterprises undertook an oversight visit to the community of Soweto

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017**

**Page: 82**

late in March 2017. Our delegation included the hon members, Letsatsi-Duba, Tseli, Nobanda, Mazzone, Singh, Nkwankwa and me. We were accompanied by four parliamentary officials. This oversight visit was prompted by the receipt of three petitions submitted to the National Assembly by hon Mhlongo, DA, MP, on behalf of the communities of Soweto.

It is unfortunate, Chairperson, that I must report and share with you and the House that Mr Mhlongo organised DA members of that communities to disturb our meetings because the initial visit was to meet leaders and representatives but he organised his constituency. Now, he wants to be paid by Parliament, money for sound system, which we did not budget for as the committee because he had organised that sound system to campaign for himself at a committee oversight. That is disgusting, hon Chair.

Late in 2015 and early 2016, the residents of Diepkloof phase one ...

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017

Page: 83

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon Rantho, will you just take your seat. Hon member, why are you rising?

Mr C MACKENZIE: House Chairperson, on a point of order, if the member has anything to say about another member of this House, can she bring it in a form of substantive motion. Can she withdraw that remark please, House Chair? Thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Order, hon members. Hon members, while it's accurate to refer to what happened during the oversight visits, if there are any implications or if there could be any accusations of wrongdoing on the part of any particular member then we request a substantive motion in that regard. Continue, hon member.

Mr D Z RANTHO: The pensioners demanded that Eskom must grant senior citizens 100% rebate on electricity. They also requested accurate billing and cancellation of debts after three years. The main purpose of the visit was to interact with Eskom and the community in order to find solutions to the issues raised.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017

Page: 84

Furthermore, the committee wish to report on how the community's petition had been processed. Eskom claimed that it had consulted broadly and extensively on the matters raised by the residents. Consultations were held with the MMC, councillors and community leaders but not with the general community.

According to Eskom, complain by the community was due to the fact that the people were against the principle of prepaid electricity. As a result, the debt of electricity in Soweto was rising monthly and stood at R8 billion with interests.

Eskom had fallen far short of its target for installing prepaid electricity meters as a result of the resistance from the community and the demands that the utility felt were unreasonable, such as a flat-rate, which could not be implemented in one community. There were disputes about the rollout programmes of prepaid meters, which the community felt were imposed on them. While Eskom believed that there had been sufficient consultation, residence also questioned the *modus operandi* of the municipality and Eskom. They claimed that they had been deprived their

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017**

**Page: 85**

right to access free basic electricity, particularly the indigence.

There was an agreement that pensioners should not be afforded to settle their historical debts and Eskom also advised them to desist from buying electricity from illegal vendors. Residences were also informed of an expanded social package that would cater for senior citizens.

The committee also made a number of recommendations to resolve the impasse. This included: Improvement of communication and consultation by Eskom; collaboration between Eskom and the city to update the indigent register; collective responsibility to educate resident about Eskom's programme and finding other sustainable ways to recover the debt without the negative impact in the livelihoods of communities, as well as finding long-term solutions.

In my conclusion, the committee encouraged community members, who can afford to pay, must pay the electricity. Those who are indigent to be registered and given a

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017

Page: 86

subsidy. The committee will further conduct public engagement with Soweto to provide feedback to the community. The committee pleads that this report be considered. Thank you, Chair.

The Chief Whip of the Majority Party moved: That the report be adopted.

*Declarations of vote:*

Ms N W A MILEHAM: House Chairperson, once again, we see how the truth hurts. Instead of commending hon Tsepko Mhlongo for actually doing his job as an MP and making sure that a petition that is brought to him by the residence of his constituency comes to Parliament and receive the attention, the ANC do nothing but lambast him. [Applause.] That is what I called disgusting, Chairperson.

Let me tell you that it is quite an interesting occurrence. The whole process was organised in such a haphazard and disorganised way that had hon Mhlongo not organised a sound system and the venue himself, we certainly would not have been able to hear the concerns

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017

Page: 87

of the residence, which we know was done deliberately. So, hats off to hon Mhlongo. May a lot of people follow your brilliant example of what it means to be an MP and a servant of the people. Even more appalling my friends, when we were in this oversight committee, the police arrived because residence of the community started becoming rather upset with the ANC's attitude towards them. So, instead of dealing with the public, the ANC has always run scared of their people and called in the police.

Interesting, hon Mhlongo and I had to go outside and asked the police to leave because the ANC members of the committee were inside hovering in fear because they are scared of what they have done to their own people.

[Applause.]

It was hon Mhlongo, who stood up for the people of Soweto and make sure that their voices were heard, not the members of the ANC, and shame on them for that.

[Applause.] In the dead of night, colleagues, Eskom arrived and put in prepaid meters that in many instances did not work. In many instances, when people loaded their

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017

Page: 88

prepaid electricity into the meters, the meter half the amounts of electricity that was put on.

So, it's a shameful to make it sound like in anyway these prepaid meters had done this community any sort of favours. It was made very clear to us that no one expected free electricity to be given to them. Yes, they wanted free basic services to which they are entitled, but everyone said that if things have just been explained to them, they would have known how to budget for the month ahead, but no, of course not Eskom nor the ANC took any time to explain to residence what had happened. People went to bed one night with electricity and wake up the next morning with no electricity.

Now, if you are not scared of your community, why do you go in the dead of night when everyone is sleep if have nothing hide.

I have no words actually; following what hon Rantho said, except to say, we are servants of the people. It's our job to make sure that the voice of the people is always heard. South Africans must always come first and if

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017

Page: 89

anything that this oversight did teach us, it taught us the importance of petitions and making sure you fight for the community that you represent. It taught us the importance of proper oversight because yet again, the ANC failed the people, Eskom failed the people and the ANC did nothing to help better the lives of South Africans.

Hon Mhlongo, I take my hat off to you for making sure that the people of your constituency had their voices heard in Parliament. [Applause.]

Mr T E MULAUDZI: House Chair, what Eskom is doing to our people in Soweto, other townships and rural areas by forcing prepaid meters is a classic World Bank and International Monetary Fund, IMF, discredited case of public squeeze prior to private profiting and corruption.

As early as 1996, World Bank and IMF models of cost recovery strategies of basic service simply cannot work in a country where 9,3 million people cannot find jobs, 30 million people live in poverty, on less than R1 000 per month and on terrible conditions.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017

Page: 90

To demand and to expect the poor, the pensioner and unemployed to buy prepaid electricity when they cannot afford to buy food or put roof over their heads is a sophisticated way of denying them access to electricity. It is to deny them such a basic human rights, a right which without is tantamount to say people must live like animals in the dark.

What is extremely concerning is the fact that over 20 years, Eskom has failed to maintain electricity infrastructure and failed to add all households to the grid in an affordable and sustainable manner. But most lately, it is the corruption and the collapse of governance at Eskom that have seen the drastic increase in electricity tariffs because corruption is very expensive.

*Tshivenḁa:*

Vho T E MULAUDZI: Vhathu vha mishashaniSoweto a vha khou wana muḁgasi wo fanelaho une wa kona uri u vha thuse.

Rine sa dzangano la EFF ri khou ri ri tshi ḁo dzhena muvhusoni nga 2019, ri ḁo vhona uri vhathu vha khou wana muḁgasi wa mahala. Ndo livhuwa.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017

Page: 91

Mr N SINGH: Thank you, hon Chairperson. Hon Chairperson, when we present this report my understanding is that the chairperson or the acting chairperson presents the report on behalf of the committee, and then the ANC will have another speaker later on.

However, now in this report, which I had a look hon Kwankwa will bring it through, there is no mention of hon Mhlongo's ulterior motives.

So I think it should not have been part of the report presented to Parliament because it is not written in the report; [Applause.] but it can be a view expressed by the ANC member and we have got no problem with that.

Having said that, Chairperson, this was a community interaction that they rose from petition received regarding the planned Eskom installation of the prepaid electricity metres, as we have heard.

We were advised that Eskom had failed to respond to residents' petition in the matter nor conducted any kind of public education, seminars before the summary

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017**

**Page: 92**

installation of prepaid metres in the areas of Diepsloot and Orlando.

Eskom itself conceded in the meeting that I was there on the first day, that it did not have consultations with the general communities in this matter. We now have a situation of a community at odds, with the principal supply of electricity, and this leads to illegality such as in the form of illegal and unsafe connections being made by residents to high voltage wiring.

We know hon members and Chairperson that electrocution due to illegal connections are common place and there is a danger to small children and it is life threatening. Cables lie on the streets and unsafe connections are made from formal to informal dwellings.

Our community members must be informed and educated on the dangers of tempering with the high voltage electricity supply boxes; and Eskom must speedup formal electricity service delivery to these areas, as these illegal electricity connections, besides being lethal to

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017

Page: 93

any soul unfortunate to come into contact with them additionally affect the quality of electricity supply.

I have personally seen, hon Chairperson, people who actually manage lines that comes from the electricity poles to informal settlements, and they collect a fee. Each one is in charge of a particular line and they collect a fee. I even seen them have fights with each other because they say this is my line to turn houses and that is your line. So we must stop that kind of a thing.

Hon Chairperson, while we work lyrical some members come here and watch lyrical of the number of houses that have been electrified since democracy and we agree there have been a number, real challenges continue to exist; and not least of all the high cost of electricity that is imposed by Eskom.

If Eskom, as we go through its inquiry, stop stealing the kind of money that they have been stealing and giving it to people then the electricity will be cheaper in this country. Thank you, Chairperson.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017**

**Page: 94**

Prof N M KHUBISA: Thank you, House Chairperson. When we look at the representation made and reported on it is evident that what happened in Diepsloot and Orlando West is not a simple matter. A complex set of interrelated factors have combined to give rise to a situation where the community and state sponsored provider of services are at loggerheads.

We should not underestimate the implications of this situation for if the problem is not solved it holds serious consequences for the future roll-out and provisions of electricity to our poor communities.

Chairperson, the NFP believes that for service delivery to succeed in South Africa all stakeholders should co-operate and join hands in both dialogue and actions. It will be over simplifications to suggest that the problems in Soweto are caused solely by Eskom lack of consultations or communication with the community.

At the same time however Chairperson, we cannot deny that this omission by Eskom has contributed largely to the problem. Herein on the other hand the report reveals a

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017**

**Page: 95**

community who had not been empowered with information, a community which is faced with uncertainty.

Above all a community steeped in poverty, who can barely afford electricity. It is a community that needs to be assisted to get electricity; and viewing this and in the light of billions of rands being squandered at Eskom, I say Chairperson Eskom must step up the game.

In the light of the complexity of the problem facing Diepsloot and Orlando West communities, the NFP welcomes recommendations made in the report.

In particular, we are encouraged by the balance apportionment of obligations and duties distributed among the stakeholders, which transcend the co-relationship between the community and Eskom, and brings on board government departments which have a valuable input to make.

We believe as the NFP that these recommendations if implemented will go a long way to resolving the competing but mutually compelling demands and needs of the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017

Page: 96

community, Eskom and the departments. Thank you very much. We support the report. Thank you.

Mr N L S KWANKWA: Chairperson, we will have to edit out the part where the Chairperson made reference to hon Mhlongo and said hon Mhlongo had mobilised members of the DA in that meeting.

*IsiXhosa:*

Usihlalo ebesenza ingabula zigcawu yengxelo yekomiti kaloku, musa ukusimoshisa Mam'uNqarhwana. Uza kuza nawe nentetha yakho ebhaliweyo uthethe ne-DA.

*English:*

We must indeed commend hon Mhlongo for the initiative that he took...

*IsiXhosa:*

... ngokuthi azame ukuqinisekisa ukuba izikhalazo zabantu ziyeza ngaphambili.

*English:*

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017

Page: 97

However, I think what is important is that, one of the issues besithetha ngazo nga la mini nabahlali ...

*English:*

What featured prominently especially in the inputs that were made by the community members was the fact that Eskom did not consult enough on issues related to prepaid metres; and in many instances ...

*IsiXhosa:*

...bebezinyanzelisa kuba bebehamba nabenkonzozamapolisa [law enforcement agencies]. Zange ndayibona mna into yokuba uthi uze kuthengiselwa into umntu ahambe nabenkonzozamapolisa.

*English:*

However, a lot of things that are happening at Eskom defies logic; for an example, yesterday I was listening to the Minister saying in the past we had a shortage of energy supply and now we have an over capacity problem, but the price hasn't come down. Right, under normal circumstances ...

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017

Page: 98

*IsiXhosa:*

... kuba imali ingena ezipokothweni zabantu ...

*English:*

...the price must go down and you reach a new equilibrium but here because ...

*IsiXhosa:*

Imali ingena ezipoketheni zabantu ...

*English:*

The price doesn't come down because we must subsidise amasela (thieves) and that's the problem. [Laughter.]

The issue that we spoke about, to make sure - sayithetha prominently, we said, one which is captured accurately in the report of the committee - we said, Eskom must address the issue of lack of consultation and where there was no communication regarding the conversion to prepaid metres.

On that particular day, by the way ...

*IsiXhosa:*

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017

Page: 99

... akukho nomnye umntu owayenxibe isikhipha seDA...

*English:*

... for us to be sure that it was the DA that mobilised its members to go and disrupt the meeting there.

[Interjections.]

*IsiXhosa:*

Ukuba i-ANC ayizange ikwazi ukuba ize namalungu ayo ayilotyala lethu elo. Nanenze loo nto kuMthetho oSaYilwayo woLwazi [Information Bill] neza namalungu enu nayiqweqwedisa laa nto, nisenza izinto ezingekhoyo phofu njengesiqhelo. La masela.

*English:*

The other issue which is important here is that as we conclude - I made this very clear. I said what we must not do and what we must guard against is creating Soweto exceptionalism.

We must address this problem so that...

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017

Page: 100

*IsiXhosa:*

...ukuze abantu baseSoweto bakwazi ukuhlawula umbane ...

*English:*

...like the rest of us and make sure that those who fall under the Indigent policy ...

*IsiXhosa:*

... banikwa umbane wabo simahla ngenyanga ...

*English:*

... so that we do not create this perception because the ANC has failed to tackle this matter properly for years, that there is Soweto exceptionalism. I think that is important. We support the report; edit out the other part that talk about the DA and hon Mhlongo. [Applause.]

*IsiXhosa:*

Nks D Z RANTHO: Sihlalo weNdlu, i-ANC iyayixhasa le ngxelo eziswe apha. Mna bendithetha ngezinto ezenzeke ngala mini phaya kweza ntlanganiso ebesinazo nabantu baseSoweto. I-ANC iyazithoba kubantu baseSoweto kwaye ibabongoza abo bakwaziyo ukuba bahlawule imali yombane.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017

Page: 101

Urhulumente we-ANC unalo icebo analo lokulungiselela abantu abahluphekileyo. Besiye kwindawo apho kuhlala abantu abasebenzayo. Bambalwa abantu abadla umhlalaphantsi abahlala phaya kwaye i-ANC ayisokuze yoyiswe ukulungiselela abo bantu. Sihlalo weNdlu, ndicela ukuba le ngxelo yamkelwe. [Kwaqhwatywa.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Siyabonga. (Thank you). The motion is that the report be adopted. Are there any objections? In light of the objection the motion will be ... [Interjections.]

Division demanded.

House divided.

[Take in from Minutes.]

Mr T RAWULA: Chair, what are we waiting for now? Are we waiting for people from offices? Can we vote please?

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017**

**Page: 102**

Ms A STYN: Sorry Chairperson, we have one member that couldn't vote because he is not registered yet. Can we just register his name?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Okay, can we get the name; they are asking, Rainey?

Order! The question before the House is that the report of Portfolio Committee on Public Enterprises on oversight visit to community of Soweto be adopted.

Mr P J Mnguni moved: That the Report be adopted.

Motion agreed to.

Report accordingly adopted.

**FIRES IN PARTS OF PORTUGAL AND SPAIN**

(Draft Resolution)

Ms D E DLAKUDE: Chairperson, I move without notice:

THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017

Page: 103

That the House –

- (1) notes with sadness the death of more than 40 people and the injury of more than 60, following tragic fires ravaging parts of Portugal and Spain from Sunday, 14 October 2017;
- (2) understands that the fires blazed across northern Portugal throughout the weekend before spreading across the border into Spain;
- (3) further understands that many roads and schools in Galicia were closed, with several schools used as shelters for those affected by fires;
- (4) recalls that Portugal has been plagued with the largest wave of fires since 2006;
- (5) further recalls that the latest fires follow on the heels of the summer blaze four months ago that claimed 64 lives in one night;

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017**

**Page: 104**

- (6) acknowledges that rain and lower temperatures on Tuesday, 16 October 2017 helped emergency teams bring under control most of the wildfires; and
- (7) extends its deepest condolences to the Republic of Portugal and the citizens who lost their loved ones in this catastrophic event.

Agreed to.

**THE EXAMPLE SET BY DA-LED CITY OF TSHWANE**

(Draft Resolution)

Mr Z N MBHELE: Chairperson, I move without notice:

That the House –

- (1) notes that the DA-led City of Tshwane is setting the example with its merit-based appointment in policing by Mayor Solly Msimanga's nomination of an experienced career officer to be the next permanent Tshwane Metro Police Chief;

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017

Page: 105

- (2) further notes that ensuring fit-for-purpose leadership, with the correct priorities that get the basics right and enforces strong accountability is the foundation for a professional and effective police service;
- (3) acknowledges that the recently released crime stats showing continued increases in violence and organised crimes show the desperate need for the professionalisation of the Police Service;
- (4) further acknowledges that the Msimanga administration has made significant progress in its fight against crime through such reforms, as the establishments of an antidrug specialised unit; and
- (5) congratulates Mayor Msimanga for his efforts to build a professionally-led metro police service that the people of Tshwane can have more trust in. [Applause.]

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017**

**Page: 106**

In the light of the objection, the motion will be converted into a notice of a motion.

**THE ARREST OF SIBONGILE NDASHE AND 12 OTHERS BY THE  
TANZANIAN POLICE**

(Draft Resolution)

Ms S S THEMBEKWAYO: Chairperson, I move without notice:

That the House –

- (1) notes that Sibongile Ndashe and 12 others were arrested by the Tanzanian Police, and that many of those she was arrested with are activists and South African citizens;
- (2) further notes that Sibongile Ndashe and others held a meeting in order to find ways to import particular health services for HIV patients to Tanzania;

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017**

**Page: 107**

- (3) acknowledges that the Tanzanian authorities raided their meeting, arresting all present under the pretext that they were promoting homosexuality;
- (4) further acknowledges that this is a gross violation of human rights and the rights of South African citizens, and that no South African citizen should ever be arrested unjustly;
- (5) realises that their arrest is a betrayal of the vision of a decolonised Africa, the African Unity and the quest for equal rights for lesbian, gay, bisexual and transgender people all over the world; and
- (6) urges the South African government to immediately ensure that Sibongile Ndashe and 12 others are released.

**INTERNATIONAL TEACHERS' DAY**

(Draft Resolution)

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017

Page: 108

Ms P J MNGUNI: Chairperson, I move without notice:

That the House –

- (1) notes that 5 October is annually recognised as International Teachers' Day;
- (2) further notes that this year's celebration was held under the theme: Teaching in Freedom, Empowering Teachers;
- (3) recalls that this theme echoes the 2015 theme that followed the adoption of the new Sustainable Development Goals, where teacher empowerment was reaffirmed as a top priority in all education and development strategies of the United Nations;
- (4) believes that the empowerment of teachers is paramount, as it promotes the importance of education and good values to the learners;

THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017

Page: 109

(5) calls upon South Africans to honour and value the teachers' immense contribution and dedication to deliver quality education; and

(6) wishes all teachers a happy Teachers' Day.

Agreed to.

**THE PLASTIC PELLET SPILL, ALONG THE KWAZULU-NATAL  
COASTLINE**

(Draft Resolution)

Mr N SIGNH: Chairperson, I move without notice:

That the House –

(1) notes the plastic pellet spill, referred to as nurdles, along the KwaZulu-Natal coastline, which threatens marine life;

(2) further notes that the nurdle spill currently stretching over more than 300km of KwaZulu-Natal

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017

Page: 110

shoreline, is likely to spread as far south as Port Elizabeth and as far north as Mozambique;

(3) acknowledges that the nurdles currently spread from Richards Bay in the north to Trafalgar in the south, and that residents of KwaZulu-Natal's coastal towns were urged to rally in efforts to rid the beaches of billions of nurdles spilled in the Durban storm;

(4) further acknowledges that the nurdles are a monumental problem because the worn down micro fragments block filter feeders and clog respiratory gills, and that if they contain additives then the toxicological aspects will take a toll along the food chains,;

(5) recognises that there is a clean-up initiative involving civil society organizations, Plastic SA, and the CoastKZN portal, which is managed by the Oceanographic Research Institute; and

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017**

**Page: 111**

- (6) calls on government departments and other civil society organizations to offer their assistance in this regard, and to those already involved to remain steadfast in their efforts to put into action the clean-up initiative and help restore marine life.

Agreed to.

**SOUTH AFRICAN SCIENTISTS WERE NAMED AS THE RECIPIENTS OF  
THE ESTEEMED INTERNATIONAL LIFETIME ACHIEVEMENT AWARD BY  
THE INSTITUTE FOR HUMAN VIROLOGY**

(Draft Resolution)

Prof N M KHUBISA: Chairperson, I move without notice:

That the House –

- (1) notes that two distinguished South African scientists and leading HIV/Aids researchers, Prof Salim Abdool Karim and Prof Quarraisha Abdool Karim, were named as the recipients of the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017

Page: 112

esteemed international Lifetime Achievement Award by the Institute for Human Virology;

(2) further notes that the award acknowledges the exceptional public service the two scientists delivered through their contributions to the global Aids response, and in particular, for the landmark Centre for the Aids Program of Research in South Africa, Caprisa, 004 study, which sought to develop a safe and technologically advanced way for women to protect themselves from HIV infection;

(3) recognises that Prof Salim Abdool Karim is currently the Director of the Centre for the Aids Program of Research in South Africa, known as Caprisa, and that Prof Quarraisha Abdool Karim is its associate scientific director;

(4) congratulates Prof Salim Abdool Karim and Prof Quarraisha Abdool Karim on this prestigious award;

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017**

**Page: 113**

(5) thanks them for the important contribution made in the fight against HIV/Aids; and

(6) encourages them to continue with resilience and vigour in their quest to find new ways to combat HIV/Aids.

Agreed to.

**PASSING AWAY OF MR SLINGERS - ACTIVIST AND FORMER TEACHER**

(Draft Resolution)

Mr X MABASA: House Chairperson, I move without notice:

That the House -

(1) notes with sadness the death of an activist and former teacher at Trafalgar High School, Polly Slingers, on Monday - 16 October 2017 - at the age of 91;

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017

Page: 114

(2) understands that Mr Slingers is recognised as one of the highly regarded educators to have graced Cape Town's teaching profession;

(3) remembers that he was a teacher during the turbulent 1950s and 1960s who went far beyond simply trying to impart knowledge;

(4) recalls that he was an unrelenting revolutionary for truth and justice, a true giant and an untainted humanitarian;

(5) further recalls him as the most committed and fearless member of the then Teachers' League of South Africa, an organisation aligned to the Non-European Unity Movement, later renamed the New Unity Movement;

(6) recognises that even though it was difficult to teach freely during the apartheid days, Mr Slingers was able to navigate these difficult waters, and instil in his children a love of history and an appreciation of the role played by

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017**

**Page: 115**

South Africans in the troubles and triumphs of the past;

(7) understands that Mr Slingers had a great influence on many activists in the Western Cape province such as Basil February, James Marsh, James April, Tilley Abrahams and many others; and

(8) conveys its condolences to his family and friends.

Agreed to.

**GREYWATER SYSTEM INVENTION BY NKOSINATHI NKOMO**

(Draft Resolution)

Mr N L S KWANKWA: Chair, I move without notice:

That the House –

(1) notes that a third-year South African black engineering student from the University of Cape

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017**

**Page: 116**

Town has made a more affordable system that can help to mitigate the devastating effects and impact of the current water shortages in South Africa, in particular the Western Cape;

(2) believes that the much affordable system for harvesting, storing and purifying grey water from the bathrooms, showers, bathtubs and basins will reduce household's water bill, since the costs of irrigation and toilet flushing will be transferred to the newly invented system;

(3) appalled by the fact that Nkosinathi Nkomo had to suffer financial exclusion from University of Cape Town, which resulted in him missing the 2017 academic year;

(4) celebrates his resilience, notwithstanding the devastating reality of being financially excluded from an institution of higher learning, as he was not discouraged by this instead he turned the situation around into a success through this system;

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017

Page: 117

- (5) further believes that there is much more that still need to be done in higher education sector to ensure that it is accessible to all, in particular the historically disadvantaged groups;
- (6) calls on government, the local authority and citizens to support AquaRenu and to invest in meaningful projects, such as the grey water system in order to unlock the potential of the youth in South Africa;
- (7) recognises the need to provide more funding for South Africans in innovations and research which will help the country achieve greater autonomy from foreign market forces.

*IsiNdebele:*

USIHLALO WENDLU (Kks M G Boroto): Ungasaregeli phambili ngombana sengikuphe isikhathi esinengi.

*IsiXhosa:*

Mnu N L S KWANKWA: Hayi, ngala masela la andiphazamisayo.

[Uwelewele.]

THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017

Page: 118

Agreed to.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Let me remind everybody who will be doing a motion without notice that you have one minute and 30 seconds. I have been very lenient with all of you but this one was over that time.

**ESTHER MAHLANGU HAS BEEN HONOURED WITH A BOULEVARD AND  
MURAL DEDICATED TO HER WORK IN NEW YORK CITY**

(Draft Resolution)

Dr E R WILSON: I move without notice:

That the House –

(1) notes that renowned South African Mpumalanga born artist, Ester Mahlangu, was recently honoured with a boulevard and mural in her honour in New York City;

(2) also notes that the mural spans a two lane road in downtown New York and showcases the instantly

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017**

**Page: 119**

recognisable Ndebele patterns, art and designs that have become synonymous with her works;

- (3) further notes that for 28 years, Ester has been showcasing her artwork around the world;
- (4) acknowledges that Ester's colourful and geometric designs inspired artists across the globe and showcased South Africa's colourful cultures;
- (5) further acknowledges that Ester, who has been painting since she was a child, remains passionate about South Africa, her roots and her humble beginnings; and
- (6) congratulates Ester Mahlangu on the recognition bestowed on her internationally and the great pride she brings to all of South Africa.

Agreed to.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017

Page: 120

(Draft Resolution)

Ms V KETABAHLE: I move without a notice:

That the House –

- (1) notes that tomorrow, 209 years ago, slaves in what was then known as the Cape embarked on the first mass slave rebellion in South African history;
- (2) with the current generation of fighters draws inspiration from their sacrifice and commitment to human emancipation, and continue their struggle by fulfilling our generational mission of economic freedom in our lifetime for Africa, workers and the poor;
- (3) understands that it was the Khoi and San people who started the long resistance of South Africans to racist and imperial, political, economic and social domination;

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017**

**Page: 121**

(4) acknowledges that their sacrifice was not in vain; and

(5) celebrate the 350 years of African resistance against colonial and economic domination and exploitation.

Agreed to.

**PROFESSOR BONGANI MAYOSI ELECTED TO THE US NATIONAL  
ACADEMY OF MEDICINE**

(Draft Resolution)

Mr P J MNGUNI: I move without a notice:

That the House –

(1) congratulates Professor Bongani Mayosi, the Dean of the Faculty of Health Sciences at UCT, on his election to the US National Academy of Medicine;

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017**

**Page: 122**

- (2) notes that the National Academy of Medicine, formerly the Institute of Medicine, was established in 1970 under the charter of the National Academy of Sciences to advise on medical and health issues;
- (3) realises that the election to the academy is considered one of the highest honours in the fields of health and medicine, and recognises individuals who have demonstrated outstanding professional achievement and commitment to service;
- (4) understands that being elected as a member requires one to commit himself to volunteer his services to the NAMs aspiration to encourage education and research;
- (5) believes Professor Bongani Mayosi is up to the task and will contribute immensely to required research and knowledge needed to take forward the works of the US National Academy of Medicine; and

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017

Page: 123

- (6) congratulates Professor Mayosi and wishes him more success in his new position of responsibility.

Agreed to.

**DR NOTHEMBA SIMELELA APPOINTED TO THE WORLD HEALTH ORGANISATION'S NEW LEADERSHIP TEAM**

(Draft Resolution)

*IsiXhosa:*

Mnu P J MNGUNI: Hayi, ngenene kuyasetyenziswa; ndakuwufumana ndivile umvuzo wam.

*English:*

I move on behalf of the ANC:

That the House –

- (1) notes that Dr Nothemba Simelela, a South African top obstetrician was appointed to the World Health Organisation's new leadership team;

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017**

**Page: 124**

- (2) believes that with her experience and vast knowledge, she would add value and be an asset to the World Health Organisation;
- (3) further believes that she will discharge her responsibilities in a team environment with distinction and make the country proud by flying the South African flag in the international arena; and;
- (4) wishes her everything of the best and good luck in her new position of responsibility.

Agreed to.

**SOUTH AFRICAN SWIMMERS WIN MEDALS IN DOHA**

(Draft Resolution)

Mr X MABASA: The ANC moves without notice:

That the House –

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017**

**Page: 125**

- (1) notes that South African swimmer Chad le Clos and Cameron van der Burgh made the country proud by winning the nine medals at the fifth leg of the Final World Cup series in Doha on Wednesday 04 October and 05 October 2017;
- (2) further notes that Chad le Clos won six medals, four gold and two silvers, while Cameron van der Burgh brought home two gold medals;
- (3) believes that with the fitness and sterling performance, these two athletes will do wonders at the last three legs of the lucrative World Cup series, which will be held in Beijing, Tokyo and Singapore next month; and
- (4) wishes them well in their last lucrative World Cup series next month.

Agreed to.

**MUNICIPAL OWNED WASTE WATER TREATMENT PLANTS IN  
MPUMALANGA POLLUTING FRESH WATER**

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017

Page: 126

(Draft Resolution)

Ms H S BOSHOFF: I hereby move on behalf of the DA:

That the House –

- (1) notes with concern that 76 municipal owned Waste Water Treatment Plants in Mpumalanga are currently polluting fresh water sources all over the province as indicated by the MEC of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs, Refilwe Mtsweni;
- (2) also notes that of the 88 Water Treatment Plants in the province, only 12 that are owned by the Department of Public Works, Roads and Transport received Green Drop Standards Compliancy;
- (3) further notes that communities across the province are at risk of contracting waterborne diseases caused by the sewerage that is being dumped into fresh water sources by municipalities;

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017**

**Page: 127**

- (4) recognises that the Constitution under section 24 guarantees everyone the right to an environment that is not harmful to their health or well-being;
- (5) calls on the MEC to ensure that a waste water compliance programme is implemented in all the municipalities to ensure that valuable fresh water is no longer polluted;
- (6) condemns all actions whereby residents of Mpumalanga and of South Africa at large are denied their rights to a clean environment; and
- (7) commits itself to continually monitor this dire situation as there is no life without water.

Agreed to.

**KENSINGTON CHORALE GIRLS' CHOIR WINS A GOLD AWARD AT THE  
ATKV ANIMATO CHORAL COMPETITION**

(Draft Resolution)

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017

Page: 128

Mr P J MNGUNI: I move without notice:

That the House –

- (1) notes that Kensington Chorale Girls' Choir won a gold award for The Best Prescribed Song and The Best Overall Title for Community Choir in South Africa in their section, at the ATKV Animato Choral Competition in Johannesburg on Sunday, 01 October 2017;
- (2) further notes that the ATKV Animato Choral Competition has categories including the youth, community and chamber choirs, and that the Kensington Chorale Girls' Choir took part in the community section;
- (3) recalls that the 27 members choir from the Malay community of Cape Town, was formed 10 years ago, took part in the regional round before qualifying for the ATKV Animato Choral Competition national event;

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017**

**Page: 129**

(4) understands that the choir has the ambition to compete in the World Choir Games in Tshwane next year and to travel to Spain in 2019; and

(5) wishes the Kensington Chorale Girls' Choir more success in their future competitions.

Agreed to.

**UPGRADE OF KHOTSONG TB HOSPITAL**

(Member's Statement)

Mr W B MAPHANGA: Chair, hospital upgrade benefits more than 300 people. The ANC welcomes the upgrade of the Khotsong TB Hospital valued at over R436 million, in Matatiele in the Eastern Cape, and views it as a pillar of hope for employment and attainment of skills in the construction industry around the area.

More than 300 people stand to benefit from the upgrade of the world class, modern hospital and since the start of the project, 96 local people have received Construction

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017**

**Page: 130**

Education and Training Authority accreditation to equip them with skills that will sustain them post the construction of the project.

Furthermore, the project has set aside over R94 million in construction work for local Small Micro Medium Enterprises, and currently, over 14 local SMMEs contractors have been awarded contracts worth a combined value of R8,1 million as of the second quarter of this year.

The construction of this project is implemented by the Coega Development Corporation on behalf of the Department of Health in the province and has brought about much needed skills training and development in the area.

Obtaining such skills via this project, empowers those to go further and find jobs where they can utilise their skills further. I thank you, Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Thank you. A reminder again, it's only one minute thirty seconds for the statements.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017**

**Page: 131**

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: House Chairperson, may I address you in terms of Rule 132. I am sure if you cast your eye around the Chamber, as far as I can see, there is only one Minister that is actually present here today out of 35. That's Minister Davies. Well, he must be complemented for being here today. I think it's an indictment on the executive that one out of 35 of the Ministers who exercise executive authority and the Republic and for which they are accountable to this Parliament is present today.

Last night, we had the figures from the last financial year, 319 members' statements read out in the House, 119 executive responses, clearly, a horrific problem with this very important model that represented my oversight model of executive accountability. I ask you as a genuine concern. What is the point of us reading up members' statements, all of us, where there is one Minister who can potentially respond? It makes a complete mockery of this Parliament. I would suggest that the members of the executive that are not here today, should be charged with contempt as set up in the Powers, Privileges and Immunities of Parliament Act because they are

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017

Page: 132

deliberately ... [Applause.] impeding the ability of this House to do its job, which is to hold executive accountable.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon member, besides the last part, where you ... I think that can come as a resolution to the House. I cannot respond to that one, but in as far as the absence, I think we really have to do our work and make sure we read statements because we represent our constituencies.

Mr T RAWULA: Order, Chair. Chair, you are moderating on a substantive legitimate issue that is being raised, which requires your ruling because basically it renders the relevance of members' statements useless. To give a member statement in the absence of Ministers, and in fact, it's vulgarisation of the programme of this House. Why are we having it as an item when there are no Ministers? That's a point that is being raised. Please, answer it genuinely ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): I am doing that.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017

Page: 133

Mr T RAWULA: ... and give a ruling.

*IsiZulu:*

USIHLALO WENDLU (Nks M G Boroto): Qha, ungazongitshela njalo.

*English:*

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: House Chair, we fully concur that it will be a good thing for our executive to take the session on members' statements serious. We fully agree. That's why hon Steenhuisen, the Rules Committee insist with this matter. Now, it assists to listen a bit, just to listen a bit. It assists. Again, the Rules Committee has taken the matters that it has brought before itself through its own sub-committee, precisely because all of us are bore with this type of situation that we are confronted with today. So, therefore, whilst we agree with you, but we will still move that we still pursue the Rules Committee root to deal with this matter that we are confronted with. That's why it is before the Rules Committee in the first instance. Thank you very much.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017

Page: 134

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Thank you. Can we proceed? The DA, did you take your ... [Interjections.]  
Okay.

Ms N V MENTE: Chairperson!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Yes, Maa'm

Ms N V MENTE: My humble request. When the bells were rung here earlier, Ministers came into the House, immediately after that, they left. You know why? It's because they do not respect the duties that they are given by the people.

You cannot expect us to read statements to empty seats. Who is going to respond? You can't expect us to just do it for the sake of doing it. We are not ticking boxes here. We are working. We can't just do that exercise to tick the box that today's members' statements were read. They are read for the purpose of getting answers from the Ministers. If that cannot be done, the exercise is fruitless. [Applause.]

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017**

**Page: 135**

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Thank you very much. I think we continue with our programme.

**ANC GOVERNMENT OF NELSON MANDELA BAY**

(Member's Statement)

Mr K J MILEHAM (DA): Alright, let's continue with the farce, then. When one of the ANC's leading lights in the Nelson Mandela Bay, Chippy Olver writes a book that is entitled *How to Steal a City*, it pace to take notice.

Olver's book is a tell-all-tell of corruption under influence and maladministration at the hands of the ANC and former mayor Danny Jordaan. It reveals how the desperate ANC government of Nelson Mandela Bay misuse municipal funds and resources for campaigning purposes and pressured officials and Ministers to approve certain contracts in return for donations.

It tells how the cash strapped ANC regional structure link on municipal officials to keep the lights on a day

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017**

**Page: 136**

offices. Olver described the ANC and its government in Nelson Mandela Bay as, and I quote:

A web of lies, threats and a sophisticated political syndicate designed to milk a city dry and exposes how the municipal procurement process was manipulated on a day-to-day basis. In fact, he calls it a criminal network closely aligned to the ANC.

But we should not be surprised; this is the ANC of 2017. This is what has become of the party of Tambo and Mandela. It's the party of Gupta and Putin, Shaik and Zuma

The DA Mayor of Nelson Mandela Bay, Chancellor Athol Trollip has already committed to a comprehensive investigation of all allegations because that is what good government do. [Applause.]

**MEDIUM TERM BUDGET POPICY STATEMENT NON RECOGNITION OF  
MINISTER**

(Member's Statement)

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017

Page: 137

Ms N V MENTE (EFF): I will read it because it does not require an answer, is a message. To you masela, yesterday's Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement and any other speech made by Mr Malusi Gigaba will never be legitimised by the EFF. We will not legitimise his appointment as a Minister, which in actual fact is just an extension of Mr Zuma. He is not different from Duduzane.

Having Mr Gigaba at Treasury is as good as having Atul, Ajay and Rajesh Gupta sitting with a public purse at a Saxonworld shebeen with Duduzane's father as chief enabler of state capture and looting while Mr Gigaba is the principle implementer. While he was a Minister of Home Affairs, he illegally naturalised the Guptas as citizens of South Africa. As Minister of Public Enterprises he handed over SAA ... [Interjections.]

Mr D M GUMEDE: On a point of order.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon member! Hon Mente! Please, take your seat. Hon member, what is your point of order?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017

Page: 138

Mr D M GUMEDE: I am standing on Rule 84.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Okay.

Mr D M GUMEDE: According to Rule 84, referring to members as amasela, [thieves] is unparliamentary. Thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon member, the issue of amasela is still being deliberated. We are not supposed to rule it off as out of order. Can you continue? We will still come with a comprehensive ruling on it.

Ms N V MENTE (EFF): As the Minister of Public Enterprises, he handed over SAA, Eskom and Denel to the Guptas. We will find all the bribes that SAP has admitted to paying for Transnet tenders and we can guarantee South Africa that some of the money is with Mr Gigaba and Brian Molefe. We will not be surprised if Telkom is sold to one of the Gupta companies, which was sold yesterday with you, you endorsed it. Mr Gigaba will collapse South Africa fiscal policy and the economy because he is the Gupta stooge. [Time expired.]

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017**

**Page: 139**

**BOYCOTTING OF ROUND TABLES CHEF'S FESTIVAL**

(Member's Statement)

Ms M R M MOTHAPO (ANC): The ANC welcomes with appreciation the boycotting of Round Tables Chef's Festival by celebrated and renowned South African Chefs, Chris Erasmus of Foilage in Franschoek and Ozzy Osman of Ozzy's kitchen in Sandton. Erasmus and Osman have joined prominent international chefs and restaurateurs in calling on their colleagues, through an open letter, to withdraw from the upcoming Israeli Round Tables culinary festival. The cooking festival, taking place between 29 October and 17 November this year, is sponsored by the Israeli government. The festival is also in partnership with Dan Hotels, which has an Israeli hotel built in an illegal settlement on stolen Palestinian land.

ANC believes that the renowned Chefs on boycott cannot be faltered. Million Palestinians are denied equal rights by the state of Israel. They live in conditions which closely resemble the apartheid system that existed in South Africa. There is no right of free speech, assembly

THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017

Page: 140

or movement. Today, Palestinians are discriminated against in terms of education, healthcare and legal services. While the Israeli government sponsors international chefs to cook delights, it continues to deny people of Palestine their livelihoods, push families from their lands and limit access to water. The ANC salute the Chefs for this progressive move.

**SOFTWARE GIANT SAP, HAS REPORTED ITS GUPTA-LINKED  
ACCOUNTS TO US AUTHORITIES**

(Member's Statement)

Mr N SINGH (IFP): Hon Chairperson, earlier today it was revealed in the Wall Street Journal that German based software giant SAP, has reported its Gupta-linked accounts to US authorities for further investigation. It further stated that it had commenced disciplinary proceedings against three of its employees with regard to misconduct of the issue relating to Gupta related third party business concerns that involved around R100 million paid in kick backs to secure massive contracts with Transnet.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017

Page: 141

Chairperson, the rot of state capture in South Africa is surfacing now at an alarming global rate. Its tentacles are quite beyond comprehension, almost stupefying. We as South Africans have been ensnared in a nefarious agenda of a politically aligned elite group of profiteers with our country, people and national fiscus consummate pawns and losers.

Yesterday we had the Minister of Finance say, nuclear cannot be afforded, yet 10 minutes later hon Mahlobo, the Minister of Energy was talking to reporters outside and I heard him saying nuclear is still on, we will find the money. Are there two sides of power in this country? Hon Rob Davies needs to respond because he is the only Cabinet Minister who is here. Thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): UDM - ANC, the hon Matlala. [Interjections.] No, I called UDM. Oh!

Mr M L W FILTANE (UDM): We are always in this corner hon Chair. [Laughter.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017

Page: 142

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): I was looking at Maesela.

Mr M L W FILTANE (UDM): Even in the absence of all the Ministers in the Security cluster including, the newly appointed Bongo, he is not here. I will still read this. [Interjections.] I said Ministers.

AN HON MEMBER: On a point of order Chairperson [Interjections.]

Mr M L W FILTANE (UDM): I said Ministers.

AN HON MEMBER: No! [Interjections.]

Mr M L W FILTANE (UDM): You must understand your grammar. [Interjections.] I said Ministers that was my prefix. Understand your grammar or go back to class. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon member are you going to read your statement? Please read your statement. [Interjections.]

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017**

**Page: 143**

Mr M L W FILTANE (UDM): I collected all the Ministers under that prefix, okay?

**THE MINISTER OF POLICE'S SOUTH AFRICAN CRIME STATS**

(Member's Statement)

Mr M L W FILTANE (UDM): On Tuesday, the Minister of Police stood in front of the nation and presented crime stats for South Africa. In his own admission, the Minister accused police officers, the very people whom he trusts to maintain law and order in the most dangerous areas of South Africa, as failures.

The issue is that the Minister did not use the crime stats as a reflection of his own poor performance as the leader in that area of governance. He rather chose to smoothly deploy that tactic back, recently appointed Ministers have become familiarise to, that is to shift the blame.

According to the Ministerial reply, to hon Kohler Dianne Barnard, there are approximately 3500 South African

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017

Page: 144

Police Service officers that the Minister smoothly deviate attention to that is uncertified to carry firearms but still carry them on the pretext that they have been permitted to do so. Now, this has several points of concern for the UDM and the people of South Africa.

Firstly, why is the Minister not enforcing the relevant policy to ensure that only police who are certified to carry firearms, actually carries them, not permitted. Secondly, if these police officers who are uncertified are attacked and disarmed of their firearms it may mean that they were not fit enough to control the firearms in the first place. They should not be handling them. The UDM does no more calls on government do to any better; we have given up ... [Interjections.] Now we say, step aside. [Time expired.]

Prof N M KHUBISA: Chairperson, on a point of order:

Before you called you called hon Filtane, you referred to hon Kwankwa as esela. Do you think that is parliamentary?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017

Page: 145

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): No, I didn't.

[Laughter.]

**THE PRESIDENT OF CHINA, XI JINPING INTRODUCED THE MEMBERS  
OF THE STANDING COMMITTEE OF THE POLITBURO**

(Member's Statement)

Mr M H MATLALA (ANC): House Chair, the President of China, Xi Jinping on Wednesday introduced the members of the Standing Committee of the Politburo, which is the highest decision making body of the governing Chinese Communist Party. The Standing Committee members will work alongside President Xi as he embarks on a second five year term as party leader with an agenda to spread prosperity and expand the global influence of the world's second largest economy.

As expected, Xi was given a renewed mandate following the first meeting on Wednesday of the new Central Committee that was elected at the party's twice a decade National Congress. The party congress had already elevated Xi's status on Tuesday at its closing session by inserting his

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017**

**Page: 146**

name and doctrine into the party's Constitution and alongside past leaders Mao Zedong and Deng Xiaoping, cementing his status as the most influential leader of the country in decades. ANC congratulates President Xi, the Chinese Communist Party and the people of China for their achievements and visionary leadership. Thank you very much Chairperson.

**SOLIDARITY WITH THE PEOPLE OF SWAZILAND**

(Member's Statement)

Mr N T GODI (APC): Chair, the APC, the party of revolution, expresses its solidarity with the peace and freedom loving people of Swaziland. Swaziland cannot be the only country in Southern African Development Community, SADC or Africa that does not allow free political activities and the popular sovereignty of its people.

The APC condemns the harassment and arrest of political activists using draconian laws and a 44 years old state of emergency which has concentrated executive legislative

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017**

**Page: 147**

and judicial powers on the King in ways totally inconsistent with African culture and democratic practice.

South Africa as a chair of SADC must make resolving the Swaziland situation its urgent and central task. The same way that SADC has agreed to assist with political challenges in the DRC and Lesotho, so should it be with Swaziland.

The party of revolution, the APC, calls on all conscious and progressive people in our country to rally in support of people of Swaziland and their progressive movements in their struggle to call their souls, their own. We have thus today joined the Swaziland people's liberation movement demonstration in Tshwane and intend to sustain this until victory. I thank you.

**XOLISA MENEMENE OFFERS HIS X-RAY SERVICES TO PATIENTS IN**

**THE TOWNSHIPS**

(Member's Statement)

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017**

**Page: 148**

Dr P MAESELA (ANC): The ANC applauds the effort by Xolisa Menemene who has ensured accessibility, convenience and affordability for his X-ray service to the townships of the Eastern Cape. The 33 year old Menemene has seen the problem of people in townships struggling to get X-ray services and decided to offer his services with affordable prices.

According to him he had to consider the challenges that people in townships encounter, such as unemployment or not earning enough to cover health matters. The Port Elizabeth born Xolisa, consults about 10 patients a day sent by General Practitioners in the township for his services. The disease most common amongst the patients he has discovered is breast cancer.

Xolisa was raised by a single parent with siblings and attended Lawson Brown High School and graduated from the PE Technikon, now known as the Nelson Mandela University, where he studied radiography. After doing research on the X-ray market in townships, he realised that patients referred to X-ray centres in urban areas and hospitals in town, was time consuming and costly for them. He started

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017**

**Page: 149**

his practice at the Ziyabuya shopping centre in Kwadwesi.

[Time expired.]

**POOR SERVICE DELIVERY**

(Member's Statement)

Ms C V KING (DA) The ANC's greed and bad governance keep poor people poor. The umsombomvu then project has still not began despite all the promises of water and employment to 720 000 households in the drought stricken areas of Lady Grey, Rossouw and Sterkspruit.

The project has been stopped because Minister Nomvula Mokonyane has tried to bypass tender processes. She tried to give a big tender to a Chinese company but was stopped by Treasury and the parliamentary portfolio committee. President Jacob Zuma even had a sought turning ceremony for the project in April 2014, just before the last elections.

Now, it is obvious this was nothing more than a ploy to win votes. Thousands of people are still relying on

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017**

**Page: 150**

trucks to deliver water, and those trucks are supposed to come every second day. Two months ago the truck broke down and protestors closed off Sterkspruit in frustration. The Minister should account for the delays in this R12,5 billion project, which is sorely needed by thousands of poor South Africans.

It is a pattern we have seen before, big promises then money get allocated but when it comes to delivery the giving out of contracts to cronies is more important for this government than serving our own people. It is not for nothing that this Minister is known as the queen of empty promises. [Applause.]

**CASE OF SENZO MEYIWA' S MURDER**

(Member's Statement)

Mr M N PAULSEN (EFF): Thank you Mam. Today marks three years since Senzo Meyiwa Orlando Pirates and Bafana Bafana captain was murdered. To date the Meyiwa family and the entire nation are waiting for those who killed him to be brought to justice. The investigation has

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017**

**Page: 151**

stopped and the SA Police Service has all together failed to bring finality to this matter.

It is not acceptable to the Meyiwa family, the football community and the whole of South Africa that a person can be killed in the presence of more than one witness but the investigation has resulted in no arrest.

The case of Senzo shows that serious crimes are committed and criminals get away with murder literally and figuratively. Until this case is resolved and the murders are brought to book, this case is symbolic of the basic failure of the SA Police Service to fight crime in this country as there are many families that are yet to receive justice. Thank you very much.

**MAN CAUGHT WITH SUITCASES OF MONEY**

(Member's Statement)

Ms D P MANANA (ANC): Chairperson, the ANC welcomes the arrest of a man found in possession of two suitcases filled with R10-million worth of currency at the Cape

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017**

**Page: 152**

Town International Airport on Wednesday, 18th October 2017.

The 38-year-old suspect was allegedly from Pietermaritzburg en route to the United Arab Emirates when Customs officials pounced on him.

He appeared at Bellville Magistrate's Court on Thursday on charges of contravening section 15 of the Customs and Excise Act 91 of 1964, which is the failure to declare.

The Hawks' Serious Commercial Crime Unit members were summoned to the scene for further investigations. The ANC calls upon the authorities to leave no stone unturned in their process of investigating the trail and origin of this money.

The ANC condemns money laundering and we hope that if the suspect is found guilty, he will be held accountable here in the Western Cape because this is the province of the DA. I thank you.

**POLICIES TO COMBAT DRUG TRAFFICKING**

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017**

**Page: 153**

(Member's Statement)

Ms M P MMOLA (ANC): House Chair, the ANC's policies aimed at combating and strengthening drug trafficking and substance abuse are bearing fruit, as evidenced in the seizure of 30kg of cocaine estimated at almost R9 million by SA Revenue Service Customs officials in two separate incidents.

One was at OR Tambo International Airport, in Johannesburg, and the other was the seizure of heroin with a street value of R3,1 million, by customs officials at King Shaka International Airport in Durban.

These successful operations have been made possible by the increased joint operations between SARS and the SA Police Service.

The ANC therefore commends Sars and the SA Police Service for their swift action. These drugs were destined to end up on the streets and townships and in the hands of our children. I thank you.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017**

**Page: 154**

**CONGRATULATIONS TO TSHWANE MAYOR'S DECISION TO SELL  
MANSION**

(Member's Statement)

Mr M S MALATSI (DA): House Chairperson, the DA welcomes the decision by the Mayor of Tshwane Solly Msimanga to sell the mayoral mansion for R5 million. This mayoral mansion was renovated by the previous ANC administration for over R12 million to be a palace of comfort for their mayor Sputla Ramokgopa.

The sale of the mayoral mansion will now make funding available for the construction of at least 50 houses for residents who are currently on the housing waiting list.

The looming sale of this mayoral mansion makes the star contracts between the ANC and the DA clear, while the ANC is obsessed with mansions and luxurious vehicles for their leaders in government, the DA is purely preoccupied with improving the quality of lives of residents.

THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017

Page: 155

We congratulate the Mayor of Tshwane for taking yet another bold step towards the realisation of his commitment to dispose of nonstrategic municipal assets to create housing opportunities for the poor. I thank you.

[Applause.]

**TRANSFORMATION OF CRIME INSTITUTIONS**

(Member's Statement)

Mr S T XEGO (ANC): House Chairperson, the ANC is of the view that the transformation of institutions dealing with crime, including integrated efficiency is critical. This applies to management, expansion of personnel, utilisation of latest technology and enhanced intelligence capacity.

We therefore welcome the handing over of 200 high performance vehicles and 75 motorbikes to law enforcement agencies in Soweto. These will go a long way in achieving the Gauteng government's target of reducing crime by 50% in priority police stations.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017**

**Page: 156**

These vehicles are fitted with the latest technology, including trackers and registration number plate recognition, to allow police officers to perform their job better. With this initiative the police will ensure that gender-based violence and drug-related crimes, are prioritised and reduced.

The focus, however, must be placed on mobilising society to participate and form partnerships with the police in their communities to assist with information on criminals in their midst. This should include an overhaul of gender and family relations and intolerance of abuse within communities. I thank you, House Chair.

**GOVERNMENT ACQUISITION OF NUCLEAR ENERGY**

**GUPTA-LINKED ACCOUNT BY SAP**

**NELSON MANDELA BAY CORRUPTION BOOK**

(Minister's Response)

The MINISTER OF TRADE AND INDUSTRY: House Chair, just to point out that I am not the only executive member here,

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017**

**Page: 157**

there are two Deputy Ministers as well. However, let me start by ...

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Point of order, point of order! I am not sure if hon Davis needs a new battery but I said members of the Cabinet. Deputy Ministers are not members of the Cabinet.

The MINISTER OF TRADE AND INDUSTRY: But they are members of the executive they can respond to member statements. Let me respond to just a few of the statements that has been made. The first one is hon Singh, he was raising the question of the approach of government on the potential acquisition of the nuclear energy. I think it is worth repeating what Minister Gigaba said yesterday. He said that the energy mix going forward on the sequence of adding new generation capacity will be informed by the updated integrated resource plan. That has to happen, that has not yet happened.

He then went on to say that during The Presidency Budget Vote debate on 31 May, President Zuma reaffirmed and he quoted him; "with regard to nuclear energy we reiterate

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017

Page: 158

that the programme will be implemented or at the pace that the country can afford" As Minister Gigaba then comments; ... this will necessarily take the economic climate and electricity demand in consideration. As far as I know, those are the steps that Cabinet has agreed on for any potential decision on a nuclear acquisition programme that remains our policy that has been well established and it was repeated yesterday.

On the question that was raised about the SA Police, SAP, reporting various accounts and also the statement that was made about the book which I haven't read by Crispian Olver, I think that the hon member from the ANC indicated in respect of another case that with regard to money laundering and crimes of that nature, the ANC calls for no stone to be left unturned and we call for our authorities to be active in this regard. I will endorse what the Deputy President said the other day that; if our agencies are not active in this regard, we will find international bodies that will be bidding us to this task and that would not be desirable. I think that is something that needs to be looked at. Then the last ... Thank you very much. [Time expired.]

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017**

**Page: 159**

**SOLIDARITY WITH PEOPLE OF SWAZILAND**

**XI JINPING RENEWED MANDATE**

**HOSPITAL UPGRADE BENEFITS MORE PEOPLE**

(Minister's Response)

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES: Hon House Chair, the matter raised by hon member Godi, is very important that South Africa really does what it can in order to promote human rights in Swaziland.

The other issue raised by way of complementing the work and the election of the new leaders of the Communist Party of China we also support that congratulatory note by the ANC.

The other issue of government responsibility of the new upgraded hospital in the Eastern Cape is also an important one. The health facilities in quite a number of our hospitals are not up to the standard in which they should be. Therefore, where there is improvement it is to be applauded. Thank you.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017**

**Page: 160**

**SENZO MEYIWA'S MURDER CASE**

**HOSPITAL UPGRADE BENEFITS MORE PEOPLE**

(Minister's Response)

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF SPORT AND RECREATION: House Chair, I would like to respond to the hon member of the EFF who spoke about the loss of Senzo Meyiwa. He would know that from the national Department of Sport and Recreation, we were very present in that funeral. It was a sad loss. Let me remind hon member that, yes, we would like to see justice and those that were responsible to be brought to account. The law has a long arm, my friend. The case is not closed and we will certainly the step that we would like to see with his parents is that those are brought to book.

May I just also say hon Chair, on Matatiele, the hospital there speaks to - like my hon colleague said - our government's commitment to deliver, give services and to better the lives of all our people. Lastly, hon Chairperson, the EFF yesterday walked out when the Minister of Finance delivered his Medium Term Budget

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017**

**Page: 161**

Policy Statement. [Interjections.] No, no, no, listen, we listened to you when you spoke but you were confused, my friends. You were not here to listen to the hon Minister and what you did was you made up your minds, you walked out and you came and confused with the facts.

In the interest of all the South Africans, I would urge that you listen and make a positive contribution before the people of our country like we do as the ANC. Thank you.

Mr M N PAULSEN: Chairperson, I just want to tell that executive PA that our contribution to South Africa is to remove this ANC from government, that is our contribution and we will remove them.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon Paulsen, that is not a point of order, I will switch your microphone off. That is not a point of order.

**NOTICES OF MOTION**

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017

Page: 162

Mr M R MDAKANE: House Chair, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the ANC:

That the House debates the impact of pro-poor programmes in enhancing the performance of basic education.

THE CHIEF OF THE OPPOSITION: House Chair, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the DA:

That the House debates state capture and obstructions deliberately designed to impede a thorough investigation into the capturing of our state and measures to remove these.

Mr Z R XALISA: House Chair, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the EFF:

That the House debates the latest crime statistics released by the SA Police Service.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017

Page: 163

Ms M R M MOTHAPO: House Chair, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the ANC:

That the House debates the data breach involving the personal details of an estimated 33 million South Africans, its impact on identity theft and other criminal activities.

Mr J A ERSTEHUIZEN: House Chair, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the IFP:

That the House debates the failure of government to uphold citizens' human rights by allowing toxic waste from mine dumps run freely into creeks, rivers and dams in and around Johannesburg and East Rand.

*IsiZulu:*

Sol N M KHUBISA: Sihlalo, ekuhlaleni okulandelayo kwale Ndlu ngizosukuma ngiphakamise egameni le-NFP:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017

Page: 164

Ukuthi le Ndlu idingide udaba losomabhizinisi abasafufusa abadinga usizo lokucijwa ngamakhono nokuthola uxhaso lwezimali emabhange nasezikhungweni zikahulumeni ezixhasa osomabhizinisi abasathuthuka ukuba baqhube imisebenzi yabo. Ngiyaphakamisa.

Mr M H MATLALA: House Chair, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the ANC:

That the House debates building a developmental state that is capable to lead efforts to overcome unemployment, poverty and inequality.

Mr M L W FILTANE: House Chair, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the UDM:

That the House debates mechanism for monitoring evaluation and enforcement of implementation of non-racial labour laws in the private sector in particular, especially the small-scale businesses.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017**

**Page: 165**

Mr Z N MBHELE: House Chair, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the DA:

That the House debates the scourge of murders affecting all citizens on a daily basis.

Dr S S THEMBEKWAYO: House Chair, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the EFF:

That the House debates the role of government in moving towards green economy.

Mr P MAESELA: House Chair, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the ANC:

That the House debates dangers of Cyber Hackers to companies in South Africa.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017**

**Page: 166**

Ms D P MANANA: House Chair, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the ANC:

That the House debates how can the tools of industrialization localization can drive and advance higher value-added manufacturing to develop and sustain an inclusive economy.

Ms M P MMOLA: House Chair, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the ANC:

That the House debates interventions to resolve the effects of drought in regard to food industry.

Ms D ROBINSON: House Chair, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the DA:

That the House debates the effects absenteeism and prolonged of sick leave on the service delivery levels

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 26 OCTOBER 2017

Page: 167

and effectiveness of government departments at all levels of governance.

Ms S T XEGO: House Chair, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the ANC:

That the House debates enabling the creation of a conducive environment and support services for small and medium enterprises.

Debate Concluded.

The House adjourned at 17:28.