

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 3 AUGUST 2017

Page: 1

THURSDAY, 03 AUGUST 2017

PROCEEDINGS OF THE NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

The council met at 10:00

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi) took the Chair and requested members to observe a moment of silence for prayers or meditation.

NOTICES OF MOTION

Ms T G MPAMBO-SIBHUKWANA: Hon House Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the DA:

That the Council –

- (1) notes that the national government is responsible for the maintenance of water infrastructure like canals, weirs and dams;

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 3 AUGUST 2017

Page: 2

- (2) also notes that recently, however, the Western Cape province had to divert about 75 million of disaster relief funds that Cabinet allocated to the province to pay for essential maintenance of the canals leading to Voëlvlei Dam - which is a national department's responsibility;
- (3) further notes that the Clanwilliam Dam wall needs to be raised. Another national department's responsibility;
- (4) debates the state of water affairs in South Africa, taking into consideration the impact of climate change and unpredictable rainfall received nationally; and
- (5) resolve to call upon the national Department of Water and Sanitation to conduct an urgent investigation into the financial affairs of its national and provincial departments and state-owned entities as well as an examination ... and report its findings to this House. I thank you hon House Chairperson.

Ms G M MANOPOLE: I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the ANC:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 3 AUGUST 2017

Page: 3

That the Council—

- (1) notes and debates human trafficking in South Africa especially the increased number of women and children who continue to fall prey to human trafficking; and
- (2) also notes that in 2013, *The Times* news paper estimated that about 30 000 of children and thousands of women are trafficked in South Africa and 50% of the 30 000 of the children are under the age of 14.

Ms L C DLAMINI: Hon House Chair, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the ANC:

That the Council —

- (1) notes that the month of August is dedicated to pay tribute and honour the tireless efforts, leadership and sacrifices of women in our society;
- (2) also notes that this month is dedicated to pay tribute to the thousands of women who marched to the Union Buildings on 9

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 3 AUGUST 2017

Page: 4

August 1956 in protest against the extension of pass laws to women;

(3) further notes that this historic march was a turning point in the struggle for a non-racial, a non-sexist and democratic South Africa; and

(4) takes this opportunity to pay homage and honour to all the women of South Africa for their tireless effort and leadership in the advancement and transformation of our society.

Mr M KHAWULA: Hon House Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the IFP:

That the Council –

(1) debates the continuing incidents of racial discord which keep on hanging the country's efforts of social cohesion to ransom, noting:

(a) that social cohesion efforts have not as yet yielded successful positive results on this issues,

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 3 AUGUST 2017

Page: 5

- (b) the sometimes heated racial exchanges even amongst Members of Parliament themselves in both Houses of Parliament,
- (c) and some protest actions in communities, some of which are racially charged and racially motivated; and
- (2) calls upon South Africans of goodwill, who have the genuine interest of South Africa at heart, to begin to play a role in bringing South Africans together at work, in schools, in sports, in churches etc and kick start social cohesion programmes that will heal this long standing racial social divide in our country.

FOUR MEMBERS OF PARLIAMENT INVOLVED IN AN ACCIDENT

(Draft Resolution)

Ms L L ZWANE: House Chairperson, I move without notice:

That the Council –

- (1) notes with sadness the passing away of hon Timothy Khoza in an accident that took place in Paarl on Wednesday morning when

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 3 AUGUST 2017

Page: 6

the Portfolio Committee on Education went on an oversight visit;

- (2) also notes that the three other Members of Parliament, Nomalungelo Gina, the Chairperson of the portfolio committee, as well as Ian Ollis and Cynthia Majeke were also present in the accident and they were admitted in the Paarl Medical Clinic for treatment;
- (3) wishes them a speedy recovery and sends our heartfelt condolences to the family of hon Khoza who died in the line of duty serving his country; and
- (4) wishes those that were emotionally traumatised a speedy recovery. Thank you House Chair.

Mr L V MAGWEBU: Hon House Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the DA:

That the Council –

- (1) notes that –

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 3 AUGUST 2017

Page: 7

- (a) currently in South Africa, public representatives in all spheres of government across political party lines are not safe due to intimidation or threats of being killed by those opposed to their politics;
- (b) in June 2017, Councillor Xolile Gwangxu in Western Cape was shot killed in Philippi East;
- (c) the same month, councillor Sfiso Mkhize in KwaZulu-Natal was shot and killed in a hail of bullets in the evening;
- (d) in July 2017, Speaker Thozama Njobe of Raymond Mhlaba council in the Eastern Cape was shot 16 times execution style and was killed; and
- (e) recently again a number of councillors in the Nelson Mandela Bay Metropolitan have received death threats;
- (2) calls for a debate on political killings in south Africa to address measures required to ensure that public representatives are allowed to discharge their duties without fear of assassination; and

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 3 AUGUST 2017

Page: 8

- (3) resolve to call for a special investigation to these murders and extend our deepest condolences to the victims' families.

SHOCKING NEWS OF PASSING OF TWO YOUNG WOMEN LEADERS

(Draft Resolution)

Ms T WANA: Chairperson, I move without notice:

That the Council -

- (1) notes with great shock that on 18 July 2017, a day we were celebrating the life of our international icon, uTata Nelson Mandela turned into a cold and sorrowful day as we received the shocking news of the passing of two of our young women leaders, Comrade Thozama Njobe and Comrade Siphokazi Nkele;
- (2) also notes that Comrade Siphokazi Nkele, who was served as a Council Speaker in Engcobo Local Municipality passed on following a short illness;
- (3) further notes that Comrade Njobe served as the Council Speaker of Raymond Mhlaba Local Municipality and was cold-

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 3 AUGUST 2017

Page: 9

blooded gunned down with six bullets by the unknown while coming from a community meeting in Fort Beaufort, where she resides;

(4) further notes that both councillors have been laid to rest last weekend; and

(5) calls upon the law enforcement agencies to leave no stone unturned and apprehend the murderers and the perpetrators.

May their souls rest in peace.

Motion agreed to in accordance with section 65 of the Constitution.

**UNVEILING OF GOVERNMENT'S INCLUSIVE GROWTH PLAN BY MINISTER OF
FINANCE**

(Draft Resolution)

Mr M RAYI: Hon House Chair, I move without notice:

That the Council -

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 3 AUGUST 2017

Page: 10

- (1) notes that the Minister of Finance unveiled the government's inclusive growth plan to grow the economy;
- (2) also notes that the 14-point action plan aims to lift the economy to a higher growth path through rebuilding business confidence and starving off the risk of a downgrade on local bonds;
- (3) further notes the confidence of the Minister in achieving high growth as a platform to achieving a 3% growth that can go up to 6% and thereby addressing the triple challenges of poverty, unemployment and inequality;
- (4) commends the Minister on this progressive recovery plan with targets and timelines for each intervention that is assigned to the different Ministers.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J NYAMBI): Is there any objection to the motion? [Interjections.] In light of the objection, the motion may not be proceeded with. The motion without notice will now become notice of a motion.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 3 AUGUST 2017

Page: 11

PASSING AWAY OF BISHOP THEMBINKOSI FANDALEKI OF THE METHODIST CHURCH
OF SOUTHERN AFRICA

(Draft Resolution)

Mr L B GAEHLER: Chairperson, I move without notice:

That the Council -

- (1) notes with sadness the recent passing away of Bishop Thembinkosi Fandaleki of the Methodist Church of Southern Africa, who died in his car after a gunshot wound on Monday night, 31 July;
- (2) further notes that he was a serving Bishop of the Methodist Church of Southern Africa's Clarkbury District, which has a head office in Mthatha;
- (3) recalls that the murder of Bishop Fandaleki comes just four years after another popular priest, Rev Sibongile Poncana was shot 13 times in full view of his young daughter in Mthatha in July 2013 and the murderers were never arrested;

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 3 AUGUST 2017

Page: 12

- (4) acknowledges that the death of Bishop Fandaleki is a huge loss to his wife Sindiswa, children, the church as a whole and the District Municipality of OR Tambo as he was a pillar and contributed to the development of the chaplaincy in this district; and
- (5) expresses its condolences to his wife, children, family and the entire Methodist Church of Southern Africa, as well as the friends and colleagues of the late Bishop Thembinkosi Fandaleki.

Motion agreed to in accordance with section 65 of the Constitution.

**LUDUMO LAMATI CROWNED IBF INTERNATIONAL JUNIOR FEATHERWEIGHT
CHAMPION AT MANDELA TRIBUTE EVENT**

(Draft Resolution)

Mr L V MAGWEBU: Hon Chairperson, I move without notice:

That the Council -

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 3 AUGUST 2017

Page: 13

- (1) notes that the fourth annual Mandela Tribute event, a celebration of Nelson Mandela's life as a boxer and a boxing enthusiast, organised by Xaba Promotions and Events, saw hundreds gather at East London International Convention Centre in the Eastern Cape on Friday, 28 July 2017;
- (2) further notes that Mdantsane homeboy, Ludumo Lamati fought against a tough opponent Luis Mendeles of Columbia for the vacant IBF Intercontinental Junior Feather Weight crown but Lamati, like a true Eastern Cape warrior was equal to the task and defeated Mendeles;
- (3) also notes that he was crowned IBF Intercontinental Junior Feather Weight Champion over the weekend;
- (4) also notes that Ludumo's victory is a story not only of boxing talent in the Eastern Cape that is so immense but a triumph against adversity as some boxers in the Eastern Cape train at the back of their shacks with no proper gymnasium or sporting facilities; and

- (5) congratulates Ludumo and Xaba Promotions and wish them more successes as they prepare to continue to conquer the world of boxing.

Motion agreed to in accordance with section 65 of the Constitution.

COMPANY LINKED TO GUPTA FAMILY CALLED ESTINA

(Draft Resolution)

Mr M M CHABANGU: Chairperson, I move without notice:

That the Council -

- (1) notes that in March 2013, a company called Estina, which is linked to the Gupta family was given a farm and millions of rands by the Free State Provincial Government;
- (2) further notes that in the funding of this project, supply chain management was not followed;

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 3 AUGUST 2017

Page: 15

- (3) further notes that despite supply chain management not being followed, the project was supported by the Premier of the Free State, Ace Magashule and the Provincial Legislature;
- (4) acknowledges that the provincial Department of Agriculture claimed that Estina, the Indian company, Paras were involved jointly in the project and Paras had committed money to the project, but a spokesperson for Paras Dairy denied this claim;
- (5) further acknowledges that deeds show that Estina received 99 year lease on the farm, which investigations suggest was free of charge, despite many poor dispossessed South Africans having no access to the land;
- (6) notes that the National Treasury unit dedicated to Public Private Partnerships of which the farm is one, did not approve the dairy project, and the Free State provincial government did not seek the required permission for the project;
- (7) acknowledges that a National Treasury investigation found that the dairy project had many irregularities, with one of

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 3 AUGUST 2017

Page: 16

the investigators stating that Estina is using government's money to establish a plant, putting cows on the land that is given by government rent-free, and now they get to make a fortune off the infrastructure;

- (8) notes that the EFF opened a case against Minister Zwane, the then Free State MEC for Agriculture and the Premier; and
- (9) condemns all forms of corruption.

Thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J NYAMBI): Is there any objection to the motion? [Interjections.] In light of the objection, the motion may not be proceeded with. The motion without notice will now become notice of a motion.

CONDOLENCES TO THE KGOPE FAMILY

(Draft Resolution)

Ms D B NGWENYA: Chair, I move without notice:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 3 AUGUST 2017

Page: 17

That the Council -

- (1) sends its condolences to the Kgope family for the loss of their 19 year old son, Thuto Kgope;
- (2) notes that Thuto passed away on 26 July 2017 after enduring emotional abuse at the hands of his principal Mr Madavhi at Forte High School in Dobsonville, Soweto; and
- (3) finally notes that the same principal is now refusing Thuto's last dignity of being given a proper send off by his fellow students and friends by forbidding them to hold a memorial service in honour of his life. Rest in peace Thuto, justice will surely be done for you.

Motion agreed to in accordance with section 65 of the Constitution.

TEAM SOUTH AFRICA DEPARTS FOR IAAF WORLD CHAMPIONSHIPS

(Draft Resolution)

Mr M KHAWULA: Chairperson, I move without notice:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 3 AUGUST 2017

Page: 18

That the Council -

- (1) notes that Team South Africa departed on Monday 31 July 2017 for the International Association of Athletics Federations, IAAF, World Championships in London starting tomorrow, Friday 4th August;
- (2) also notes Team South Africa includes seven national record holders namely Akani Simbine, 100 meters; Wayde van Niekerk 200 and 400 meters; Antonio Alkana 110 meter hurdles; Luvo Manyonga Long jump; Lebogang Shange 20 kilometre walk; Carina Horn 200 meters and Caster Semenya 800 meters who all have great potential to come back home as world champions;
- (3) states that we all say to them go out there and make us proud; and
- (4) finally says Phambili! [forward] Team South Africa Phambili!
[forward]

Motion agreed to in accordance with section 65 of the Constitution.

ANC HELD SUCCESSFUL NATIONAL POLICY CONFERENCE

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 3 AUGUST 2017

Page: 19

(Draft Resolution)

Mr J M MTHEETHWA: Chairperson, I move without notice:

That the Council -

- (1) notes that the ANC held a very successful National Policy Conference in Johannesburg on 30 June to 5 July 2017;
- (2) also notes that the conference was characterised by robust and constructive engagement by the branches of the ANC that are building blocks of this glorious movement;
- (3) further note that the ANC emerged as a united force out of the conference with radical socioeconomic transformation, inclusive ownership being some of the main talking points;
and
- (4) congratulate the ANC for a very successful conference that will be very influential in the government's policy direction.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 3 AUGUST 2017

Page: 20

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Is there any objection to the motion? In light of the objection the motion can not be proceeded with. The motion without notice will now become a notice of a motion.

SOUTH AFRICA COMMEMORATES WOMEN'S MONTH

(Draft Resolution)

Ms T K MAMPURU: Chairperson, I move without notice:

That the Council -

- (1) notes that South Africa commemorates Women's Month in August as a tribute to more than 20 000 women who marched to the Union Buildings on 9 August 1956, in protest against the extension of Pass Laws to women;
- (2) also notes that Women's Month is a tribute not only to the thousands of women who marched in 1956, but also a tribute to the pioneers of women's movement in this country;

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 3 AUGUST 2017

Page: 21

- (3) further notes the high number of incidents of violence against women in our country especially during this important month in the history of the women's struggles in our country; and
- (4) calls on all the role players to engage seriously with the impact of gender violence on people's life chances and opportunities and make sure that women play an active role in contributing towards the future development of the country.

Motion agreed to in accordance with section 65 of the Constitution.

DA CONDEMNS SISI NTATE SHOOTING

(Draft Resolution)

Mr O S TERBLANCHE: Chairperson, I move without notice:

That the Council -

- (1) condemns the shooting of Sisi Ntate by a farmer while she was collecting firewood on a farm near Zeerust, leaving her

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 3 AUGUST 2017

Page: 22

wounded by the bullet which, after striking her on the left arm, went through her chest;

- (2) notes that the farmer, Ntshekisang Merakeng, was arrested and appeared in court on a charge of attempted murder; and
- (3) conveys its sincere condolences to the Ntate family.

Motion agreed to in accordance with section 65 of the Constitution.

IMIZAMO YETHU RESIDENTS PROTEST AGAINST CITY OF CAPE TOWN

(Draft Resolution)

Mr D L XIMBI: Chairperson, I move without notice:

That the Council -

- (1) notes that the residents of Imizamo Yethu protested against the City of Cape Town because they were demanding services after their houses were destroyed by fire in March;

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 3 AUGUST 2017

Page: 23

- (2) also notes that the people of Imizamo Yethu have been victims of fire every year because of conditions they are living in and the unresponsiveness of the City of Cape Town;
- (3) further notes that the people have been accommodated in three by three metre corrugated iron structures on a nearby sports field and these structures are not rainproof; and
- (4) calls on the City of Cape Town to fast track the process of building houses for the people by availing land close to the place of employment instead of selling it to big businesses.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Is there any objection to the motion? In light of the objection the motion cannot be proceeded with. The motion without notice will now become a notice of motion.

Hon members! Hon members! Order! In light of what happened yesterday and the motion that was moved by hon Zwane, order members, I request that as you are aware that in the line of duty whilst hon members of the House of the National Assembly were going to Paarl the accident

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 3 AUGUST 2017

Page: 24

happened and we lost one Member of Parliament ... [Inaudible.] so just to stand up and observe a moment of silence. Thank you.

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP OF THE COUNCIL (Mr J M Parkies): Chair, I move:

That, in terms of Rule 21(2) and, in the interest of enhancing public participation, conducting oversight and providing a platform for consideration of issues affecting provinces as provided for in section 42(4) and 72(1) of the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, 1996 -

- (1) the Council resolves to, from 21 to 25 August 2017, conduct public hearings, hold meetings, conduct oversight visits and sit in plenary in the province of the Free State on 25 August 2017, at 09:00, until the conclusion of business on that day; and
- (2) the Council notes that the estimated cost of effecting the change in venue and maintaining it for the specified period will be approximately R 6 million.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 3 AUGUST 2017

Page: 25

IN FAVOUR: Eastern Cape, Free State, Gauteng, KwaZulu-Natal, Limpopo, Mpumalanga, Northern Cape, North West.

AGAINST: Western Cape.

Motion accordingly agreed to in accordance with section 65 of the Constitution.

CONSIDERATION OF REPORT OF SELECT COMMITTEE ON SECURITY AND JUSTICE

**- DRAFT NOTICE: DECLARATION OF AMNESTY IN TERMS OF SECTION 139 OF
THE FIREARMS CONTROL ACT, ACT 60 OF 2000**

Mr D L XIMBI: Chairperson, visitors in the gallery, good morning, the NCOP referred the draft notice declaration of amnesty in terms of section 139 of the Firearms Control Act, Act 60 of 2000 to the Select Committee on Security and Justice on the 8th of March 2017.

The purpose of the draft notice or declaration of amnesty in terms of section 139 of the Firearms Control Act, Act 60 of 2000, the Minister of Police may by notice in the *Gazette* declare an amnesty if the amnesty may result in the reduction of the number of illegally possessed firearms in South Africa and it is in the public interest to do so.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 3 AUGUST 2017

Page: 26

Chairperson, the purpose of section 139 of the Firearms Control Act, Act 60 of 2000, is to remove illegally possessed firearm from the society proviso of amnesty as per section 139. The declaration of amnesty may in the reduction of the number of illegally possessed firearm in South Africa. Secondly, a person who surrenders a firearm in compliance with the notice is indemnified against prosecution and previous amnesty yield significant results in South Africa.

The South Africa police service, SAPS, briefed the select committee on the draft notice declaration of amnesty on 21 June 2017. The then Minister of Police, hon NPT Nhleko declared an amnesty scheduled for 1st April 2017 to the 30th of September 2017. But the draft notice was only tabled in Parliament on the 8th of March 2017 and Parliament was unable to consider the matter before the end of the first term.

Section 139 (2) of the Firearms Control Act, Act 60 of 2000, also provides that such amnesty will only be valid if it is approved by Parliament. The amnesty must specify the period during which persons may apply for amnesty and must specify the conditions under which amnesty may be granted. The current period of the draft notice declaration of amnesty applied for is 1st August 2017 to 31st January 2018.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 3 AUGUST 2017

Page: 27

Firstly, a return application for amnesty by an applicant must be handed in at a police station and the application must state the full names, identity number and the residential address of the applicant as well as identifying the firearm and ammunition.

Secondly, the firearm must be surrendered to a member of police on duty at a police station who must issue a receipt for the firearm and ammunition.

Should the applicant for amnesty wish to apply for a licence for the firearm or ammunition such an application must be lodged within 14 days from the date of surrendering the firearm. The firearms will be ballistically tested.

Chairperson, the SAPS noted during the previous amnesty period that firstly, focused operations during amnesty periods resulted in increased number of firearms surrendered.

Secondly, firearms could be surrendered at any police station in South Africa. Thirdly, police officials were briefed on the condition of amnesty. Various communications and public awareness campaigns were conducted. Duration of amnesty period of 6 months yield better results.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 3 AUGUST 2017

Page: 28

Chairperson, SAPS will further embark on an awareness raising campaign in order for community members to be aware of the amnesty and the campaign will entail the following slogans and messages:

Surrender illegal firearms ammunition at your local police station from 1 August 2017 to 31 January 2018.

Firearm Amnesty 2017 is an opportunity not to be missed.

These slogans and messages will be communicated to the public via media briefings, through print and electronic media, media updates, tours and social media platforms. SAPS will proceed with this awareness raising campaigns prior to amnesty 2017, during amnesty 2017 and post amnesty 2017.

The Select Committee on Security and Justice having deliberated on and considered the subject of the draft notice, declaration of amnesty in terms of section 139 of the Firearms Control Act, Act 60 of 2000, referred to it, reports that it has agreed to the draft notice, declaration of the amnesty and recommends the council approve the said draft notice. Thank you, Chairperson.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 3 AUGUST 2017

Page: 29

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): I would like to take this opportunity to welcome Blouberg International School learners and educators. Welcome to Parliament.

Debate concluded.

Question put: That the Report be adopted.

Declaration of vote made on behalf of the Western Cape.

Declaration of vote:

Ms C LABUSCHAGNE: Chairperson, in a country that is facing high incidents of crime we will support initiatives that would see the number of illegal firearms being reduced. However, as was the case in the past the firearms amnesty does not in reality serve the purpose of motivating the real criminals to hand in their firearms and is therefore to a large extent a futile exercise.

The Minister of Police needs to understand that this is not nearly good enough an effort to address the crime situation in our country.

A further concern is the question of what happens in to firearms that civilians do turn in that end up in SAPS hands.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 3 AUGUST 2017

Page: 30

In this regard, we call upon the Minister to ensure that these weapons do not end up being used for illegal activities by services men and women and that such activities be dealt with in the most serious terms.

Having noted our concerns for positive role that it does play with regards to honest and law abiding citizens we support this report.

IN FAVOUR: Eastern Cape, Free State, Gauteng, KwaZulu-Natal, Limpopo, Mpumalanga, Northern Cape, North West, Western Cape.

Report accordingly adopted in accordance with section 65 of the Constitution.

CONSIDERATION OF REPORT OF SELECT COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION AND RECREATION – JOINT OVERSIGHT VISIT WITH THE PORTFOLIO COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION AND TRAINING TO GAUTENG

CONSIDERATION OF REPORT OF SELECT COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION AND RECREATION – OVERSIGHT VISIT TO THE PIXLEY KA SEME DISTRICT, NORTHERN CAPE

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 3 AUGUST 2017

Page: 31

Ms L L ZWANE: Hon Chairperson, this is the statement on the oversight that was conducted jointly by the Portfolio Committee on Higher Education and Training and the National Assembly; and the Select Committee on Education and Recreation and the NCOP from 17 to 21 October 2016.

Oversight plays a pivotal role in building and maintaining a democracy. It is the central aspect of accountability in a democracy. These oversight visits give members an opportunity to get more information on issues that are raised on the ground when they meet with members of the public. They also have an opportunity to ask direct questions on the ground and give community members the opportunity to approach them on issues that are raised.

A joint oversight visit was conducted by the Portfolio Committee on Higher Education and Training as well as the Select Committee on Education and Recreation from 17 to 21 October 2016. The post-school education and training sector is making steady progress in addressing the vast issues that are faced by this sector.

The objectives of the oversight were to ensure that the 2016 academic year is saved and also to strengthen the dialogue to enable both the new entrance to institutions in 2017 and allowing graduates to be placed in much needed scarce skills in 2017. The committees

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 3 AUGUST 2017

Page: 32

also met with the following bodies: The Council on Higher Education, the Universities South Africa forum, the Quality Council for Trades and Occupations, the National Student Financial Aid Scheme, the Higher Education Parents Dialogue, the Business Unity South Africa, the SA Union of Students, the National Business Initiative and the National Board of Convocations and Alumni.

With regard to the Universities South Africa, the issue that was raised was the ongoing disruptions caused by protesting students at universities. They were highly regretted and were becoming too expensive for the sector. It would have made it even almost impossible for the learners that were supposed to be taken care of in terms of accessing higher education.

The Council on Higher Education raised issues such as the importance of investing in the youth to develop their full potential. There was a need to increase the number of capable and competent graduates. Concerns were raised about unequal patterns of access to higher education; the legacies of inequality which continued to weigh heavily across all sectors of society and the existing challenges of access, equity and quality.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 3 AUGUST 2017

Page: 33

The Higher Education Parents Dialogue raised the issues of universities not communicating with them directly, rather communicating only with the students and they get to be left out of what is actually happening in universities.

The Business Unity South Africa raised the issues that through the Youth Employment Accord, they are prepared to create job opportunities for the youth to the tune of about 500 000 jobs. They also noted that there are a number of business executives that are serving university councils in their capacity as individuals or collectively and, various processes have been used to engage the students with a view of ensuring that the academic year is saved.

The SA Union of Students, Saus, raised that they cannot accept the fact that there are students that can be excluded from accessing higher education on the basis of financial constraints, and that those in the system should be allowed to access their academic records and complete their degrees.

The SA Union of Students was also concerned about the legitimisation of unelected structures that were also not provided for in the legislation or the university statutes, but were able to submit

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 3 AUGUST 2017

Page: 34

memoranda to university officials and those memoranda were considered.

The SA Union of Students also noted that universities should not rush for court interdicts when confronted by student protests. They demanded that the students that had been arrested should be released as it would be unfair for them to miss their studies during the academic year. Those students that were involved in the disruption of the university infrastructure should face the full might of the law.

The vice chancellors in partnership with students should find amicable solutions to the problems in the institutions of higher learning, and private sector should be able to take care of students with historic debts.

The National Board of Convocations and Alumni, NBCA, was formed by an advisory committee that is inclusive of academics who would advise the NBCA on higher education matters. The composition of the organisation was aimed to be more inclusive in terms of gender and race. The vision of the organisation was to have a board inclusive of all role-players in the higher education terrain. The position of this board was that teaching and learning should continue at

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 3 AUGUST 2017

Page: 35

universities and the violence and the destruction to property should be strongly condemned.

The Vice Chancellors' Forum that was represented by Prof Habib of Wits University expressed disquiet about the fact that students did not want the presence of the police to ensure safety in the institutions of higher learning and that there were disagreements each time there were meetings about the removal or the presence of the police in the institutions of higher learning. The students demanded that the university campuses are centres of learning and they get frustrated if there is a heavy presence of the police officials.

There was a proposal for a multistakeholder forum that would start in December up to January 2017, to map the way forward for higher education to prevent students from engaging in protests in a way that is recurring.

In conclusion, the objectives of the meeting and the interacting with various key role-players in higher education with regard to the ongoing disruptions in the institutions of higher learning were met.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 3 AUGUST 2017

Page: 36

The ANC supports the recommendations made as these allow for better education and enhancing the roles of the role-players in ensuring that higher education goes smoothly each year. I present the report to the NCOP for adoption. Thank you, Chairperson. [Applause.]

Debate concluded.

Question put: That the Report of Select Committee on Education and Recreation - Joint oversight visit with the Portfolio Committee on Higher Education and Training to Gauteng be adopted.

In favour: Eastern Cape, Free State, Gauteng, KwaZulu-Natal, Limpopo, Mpumalanga, Northern Cape, North West, Western Cape.

Report accordingly adopted in accordance with section 65 of the Constitution.

Question put: That the Report of Select Committee on Education and Recreation - Oversight visit to Pixley Ka Seme District, Northern Cape be adopted.

In favour: Eastern Cape, Free State, Gauteng, KwaZulu-Natal, Limpopo, Mpumalanga, Northern Cape, North West, Western Cape.

Report accordingly adopted in accordance with section 65 of the Constitution.

**CONSIDERATION OF REPORT OF SELECT COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION AND
RECREATION - OVERSIGHT VISIT TO LIMPOPO**

Ms L L ZWANE: Chairperson, what is the Order? I didn't hear the Order.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): What?

Ms L L ZWANE: I did not hear the Order.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): What?

Ms L L ZWANE: Is it a Report?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Yes, the debate.

Ms L L ZWANE: The debate?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): The report.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 3 AUGUST 2017

Page: 38

Ms L L ZWANE: Oh.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): The Report of the Select Committee on Education. That is going to be a debate.

Ms L L ZWANE: Okay, thank you, Chair. Now I'm clear. [Laughter.]

Ms T J MOKWELE: Are you sure? If the Chairperson is not sure ...

Ms L L ZWANE: No, I didn't hear the Order, that's all.

[Interjections.]

Chairperson, at the 53rd conference of the ANC, congress noted that there was a general agreement that education has to be protected from disruption. Disruption of schooling through industrial action and service delivery protests has a negative impact on the stability of schools and the quality of education.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Please excuse me, mama. Hon Mokwele, you were doing so well this morning. [Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 3 AUGUST 2017

Page: 39

Ms L L ZWANE: What prompted the Select Committee on Education and Recreation to go to Limpopo was the disruption and the destruction of school property that was taking place as result of protests that relate to service delivery. These protests were not initiated by the teachers or students. We had to go and actually intervene and get the information with a view of trying to bring about stability in that province.

The focus of our visit over and above that was to ensure that we look at issues that are a worry to the schools or the department of education. These are issues that relate to the state of the school environment, the provision of teacher-learner support materials, whether there were catch-up programmes in light of the fact that there were disruptions, the management and availability of learner transport, the management and availability of school nutrition to qualifying learners, the functionality of the school governing bodies and the school management teams, the state of school infrastructure and ICT, and the availability of school furniture.

Learners and teachers need classrooms, electricity and sanitation, security and recreation facilities. The National Development Plan, NDP, the Medium-Term Strategic Framework, MTSF, and the department of education's Action Plan 2019 identify the development of

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 3 AUGUST 2017

Page: 40

infrastructure as a priority for the basic education sector. The sector aims to eradicate all inappropriate school structures and ensure that all schools are equipped with the necessary basic services.

The structures are defined in the regulations relating to the minimum uniform norms and standard for public school infrastructure published in the Government Gazette 37081 of 29 November 2013.

What we found when we went to Limpopo with regard to the infrastructure is that there was a problem of the fact that schools were not maintained being maintained properly.

Ms T J MOKWELE: [Inaudible.] ... don't have finances!

Ms L L ZWANE: The department did not have a policy in place to ensure that there is budgetary allocation for schools to be maintained. Even before the torching of the schools, the schools were not compliant with the minimum norms and standards. This means that not enough of the budget was allocated to ensure that new schools are built, additional classrooms are provided, and special classrooms are put up. That was the problem.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 3 AUGUST 2017

Page: 41

Our findings were also confirmed by the findings of the Auditor-General who actually testified to the fact that in Limpopo there was a problem where not enough information was made available during the process of planning. As a result of that, they were not able to assist with actually guiding the province insofar as the building and the maintenance of schools is concerned. [Interjections.]

This issue of the learner-teacher support material was another issue that was a little bit of a problem in the other schools that we visited. Nonetheless, one would appreciate that we did observe as a committee that, in a number of areas that we visited, learner-teacher support material had been supplied, except for the fact that in other areas there were complaints about the fact that it was not up to the required standard that the education sector would have preferred. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon Zwane, please take your seat.

Ms L L ZWANE: There's no seat, Chairperson.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): There's no seat? Oh my! My apologies. Please move a little bit forward.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 3 AUGUST 2017

Page: 42

An HON MEMBER: Sit on the floor!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon Zwane, just move little bit ... Hon Mokwele, my apology. We are still arranging a chair for the hon member.

Ms T J MOKWELE: You can see, there's a chair!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): No, I'm the one who is chairing, hon Mokwele.

Ms T J MOKWELE: No, I was just saying to the chairperson, she must tell us that 80% of schools ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon Mokwele, will you please ...

Ms T J MOKWELE: ... don't comply in terms ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon Mokwele, is that a question?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 3 AUGUST 2017

Page: 43

Ms T J MOKWELE: No, I just want to check with the hon member that she's willing to take a question.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Can we then check with her first?

Ms T J MOKWELE: Will you take a question, ma'am, through the Chair?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): No! Hon Mokwele, what is the reason for your excitement? Mama, please! Thank you. Hon Zwane, are you willing to take a question?

Ms L L ZWANE: During Christmas Eve I will take a question.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): She's not ready, hon Mokwele. Please take your seat. [Interjections.] Take your seat, mama!

Ms T J MOKWELE: [Inaudible.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Take your seat, hon member! Thank you. Continue, hon Zwane.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 3 AUGUST 2017

Page: 44

Ms L L ZWANE: Insofar as curriculum delivery is concerned, the committee observed that, although teaching and learning had resumed in a number of schools, in many other schools that we visited we found that not much teaching and learning was taking place.

[Interjections.] This was a source of grave concern.

An HON MEMBER: Give the numbers!

Ms L L ZWANE: Chairperson, there is a difference between a debate that relates to a departmental report that has figures and facts, and a debate on a report of a visit. We did not have time to conduct statistics ... [Interjections.] ... because ... [Interjections.]

No, we only visited eight schools in this province. [Interjections.]

You cannot form a generalisation ... [Interjections.] You cannot form a generalisation ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Order, hon members!

Ms L L ZWANE: ... in terms of statistics when we have visited only eight schools out of 500. That would be improper. [Interjections.]

So we can't give statistics. [Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 3 AUGUST 2017

Page: 45

Ms N P KONI: [Inaudible.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon Koni!

Ms L L ZWANE: In terms of curriculum delivery, the other problem that we noted as members of the select committee is that there is little budgetary allocation for education officials to take their cars and drive to the schools. The subject advisory service was particularly lacking in a number of high schools because of budgetary constraints. These constraints meant that officials could not actually go to the schools in order to give support to teachers. [Interjections.]

Also, the subjects of mathematics and science were a problem in that ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon Koni, please ... we are not going to allow you to debate from the floor. You are allowed to heckle, but you are not supposed to drown the speaker out. Hon Wana?

Ms T WANA: I want to remind those members that Chief Zwelithini doesn't like their behaviour. Thank you. [Laughter.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 3 AUGUST 2017

Page: 46

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hayi! Hon Wana, you know you are out of order. You cannot stand up and do that. Please! Continue, ma. [Interjections.] Oh, what is the point of order, hon Mokwele?

Ms T J MOKWELE: Hon Wana must know that King Zwelithini acknowledges our presence in government and in Parliament and what we are doing for the citizens of South Africa.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon Mokwele!

Ms T J MOKWELE: That's why he honoured us ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon Mokwele, you know you are out of order. [Interjections.] Hon Mokwele, please respect the House. Continue, ma Zwane.

Ms L L ZWANE: The ANC-led government has always stressed that education is a societal issue. Therefore we were happy as a committee to note that a number of key stakeholders were actually involved in ensuring that the protests that were there do not go further in terms of destroying more schools.

The committee was happy that there were different stakeholders like the National Education Collaboration Trust. [Interjections.] There

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 3 AUGUST 2017

Page: 47

were also other departments, like Co-operative Development and Traditional Affairs, there were traditional leaders, there was the SA Police Service, SAPS... All came together and collaborated to ensure that peace was restored in those areas that had violent protests. We took note of the fact that, when we engaged with some of the traditional leaders in their areas - because they are active, and they are providing leadership in their areas - schools in those areas were not affected. But areas in which no firm leadership was provided were unfortunately vitally affected.

Insofar as the staffing is concerned, we regretted as the committee that, in quite a number of schools that we visited, the principals had not been appointed on a permanent basis. Therefore we gave guidance in terms of telling them that there has to be an action that fast-tracks the appointment of principals because we know that schools without principals cannot function properly.

The issue of the non-negotiables ... The President has always said that it is expected of teachers to be in class, on time, prepared for their lessons, teaching and ensuring that the curriculum is covered. It is expected of the entire school management and the school governing body to ensure that there is good governance in the institution.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 3 AUGUST 2017

Page: 48

We did take note of the fact that the school governing bodies had been trained and were capable of running the institutions and that there was not shortage or limitation in that regard. But, what also is problematic in the province is that we have got quite a number of schools that are nonviable institutions. So, the rationalisation of schools needs to be fast-tracked. Out of 301 schools that are nonviable, only 130 had been merged, meaning there is still a lot of ground that needs to be covered regarding school mergers and rationalisation.

Parental involvement has always been a problem in all the areas that we have been to. When parents are called to meetings, when there are problems in the school or when they are called upon to have an engagement with teachers to look at the performance of their own children, parents do not seem to be willing to turn up. This does not only happen in Limpopo, but I do want to stress that it is important for teachers and parents to co-operate. When parents are invited to institutions of learning because there are problems or because they need to know what is happening or they need to support the system, they need to oblige because this is the education of their own children. No better person can really provide that kind of support other than the parents themselves.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 3 AUGUST 2017

Page: 49

The issue of infrastructure – let me go back a little bit there – is problematic in that there are some schools that are built by the national department through the Accelerated Schools Infrastructure Development Initiative, Asidi. There are schools that are built from the allocation that is given to the provinces. But there is a problem whereby the schools that are built by the national department – and this view is supported by the findings of the Auditor-General – are not quickly transferred to the custodianship of the provincial department. This means that problems will arise as a result of the fact that there is a tussle because it is not known whether it is the national department that is responsible for the structure or whether it is the province that is responsible for those structures. So there is a need for the department of basic education nationally to ensure that, once the schools are finished through the programme of Asidi, they are quickly transferred to the provincial authorities responsible for those schools to ensure that the maintenance issues are taken care of at provincial level and that there is no finger-pointing and arguments about who is supposed to do what. Thank you, Chairperson. [Time expired.]

Ms T G MPAMBO-SIBHUKWANA: Hon Chairperson, Ms Dikgale, it is a great honour for me to be part of this debate. Hon Chair, I will focus on

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 3 AUGUST 2017

Page: 50

the South African Constitution, section 29, which provides the right to basic education. Research has shown that the country has one of the highest rates of public financial investments in the world. Also, the research has also shown that with quality education individuals are better off equipped in today's tough work environment when proper education has been awarded.

The importance education in South Africa is specifically highlighted by the fact that the country has literacy rates of approximately 84,6% as a developing country. South Africa needs to invest more time in transforming the legacy of apartheid on the education system. A common factor that comes up mostly in this country is the access to this right, which is education.

The ball of contention and the crux of the problem, contained in this report is the demarcation process in the province of Limpopo. Ironically, I wish to state it categorically, I was with hon Dlamini and the Department of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs was not part of the stakeholders when we were addressed by the Minister there. That, for me, was a problem because you cannot address demarcation processes in the absence of the Department of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs, as a department because the chiefs, the Departments of Social Development and

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 3 AUGUST 2017

Page: 51

Education were also there. The absence of the Department of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs was a big problem for me because it forms an integral part of that demarcation process which is a bone of contention.

Whilst we acknowledge and understand the people's rights to demonstrate, we also believe that this right should be exercised in a manner that is responsible and in accordance with the law. We do not believe that one should be able to exercise the right in such a manner that leads to the destruction of either public or private property. Such an important right of demonstration should be carried out with due regard to the rights of other people, specifically in this case, the other learners.

The burning of the number of schools in Limpopo is undermining the rights of basic education to hundreds of other learners who are negatively affected by these acts of arson. We also understand that it is important for us to look at the grievances of the learners in order to understand what has driven the learners to take such measures. After all, it is fairly reasonable to believe in the saying which proclaims that prevention is better than cure.

Ironically, the Department of Intelligence knew of the uprising a year before but could not do any preventative measures.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 3 AUGUST 2017

Page: 52

We believe that the Department of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs should have addressed the demarcation process in its entirety. Their failure to address the problem not only led to the negative consequences of schools burning down but also created an unnecessary stress and expense for the South African government at the expense of the taxpayer. It was found that the Department of Basic Education's intervention and provision of 76 mobile classrooms amounted to R17 million, as per report.

It is important to note that although these expenses are quite significant, they will not address the issue. The department was running short of approximately 35 mobile classrooms. The department has also contracted three catering services providers to deliver nutrition to schools in Vuwani before the community protests commenced. The total expenditure of providing nutrition to Mastek Foundation, Makhado and Tivumbeni ran up to about R100 000. Instead of using thousands of taxpayers' money to only, now, address the problem of schooling in Limpopo, the department should have focused on the issues and learning conditions faced by the Limpopo learners before strikes had occurred.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 3 AUGUST 2017

Page: 53

During the oversight visit conducted by the select committee it was uncovered that schools in the Limpopo area are facing a number of challenges. Some of the problems are specific to certain primary or high school but the committee has found that the most of the problems are common amongst the schools in the area. Also, educators were most fearful to talk in front of their chiefs, fearing to lose their jobs.

These problems included staff capacity; fencing around schools, especially in Vhudzani and the availability of adequate and qualified teaching staff. Another issue that plays into the employment of academic staff is the problem of contract renewals. It has been found by the committee that contract renewals are not occurring in time. As a result schools end up losing the little qualified academic staff they already had. The rotation of senior management or lack of there of is yet another problem that was highlighted by the community. By rotating management, there is a higher likelihood for accountability to increase as well as the chances of having fresh ideas presented being implemented.

The late implementation of programmes is the further issue that has been identified in the schools and it was found that such implementation resulted in the department requesting roll-overs.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 3 AUGUST 2017

Page: 54

Finally, an issue that seems to be the most pressing and concerning one was the lack of water and electricity in some of the primary and secondary schools in the area. These two services are considered basic essential services that constitutionally should have been provided. By not providing schools with water and electricity the government and its department is not only defaulting on the constitutional obligation but it is also affecting the constitutional rights of learners to learn in an environment that is not inferior to the standards of other comparable public educational institution.

We look forward to the report due to be tabled before the committee within two months and urge the department to make haste of getting our schools and the learners back on track with their curriculum in a dignified manner. One of their basic human rights may be sufficiently realised. I wish to state it that there were second uprisings after the intervention of the Department of Basic Education. The reason for the second uprisings where the Minister even said, on a national radio show:

IsiXhosa:

... ndizihlambile izandla zam ngeVhuwani. [I have washed my hands with Vhuwani.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 3 AUGUST 2017

Page: 55

English:

She had also had enough and her interventions and interrogations into addressing the right of basic education had come into a certain level. I wish to state it categorically that the second uprising was because there was no demarcation process addressed by Department of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs. That was the most integral part to address the demarcation process. Not only the stakeholders that were there. In my committee when we were addressed by the Minister Education, Department of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs was not there, maybe in the other group, but in my group it was not there. I thank you.

Sepedi:

Moh T K MAMPURU: Mohl Modulasetulo, ke le dumediša ka moka. Ke rata go tlaleletša se modulasetulo wa komiti a se bontšhitšego mo gore

...

English:

... a departmental report will never be similar to an oversight report.

Sepedi:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 3 AUGUST 2017

Page: 56

Seo ke nnete ya mathomo le mafelelo ka gore ge re ka akaretša, ra se nepiše; re tlile go šalela morago.

English:

Hon Chairperson, indeed we as the Select Committee on Education and Recreation visited Vhembe District, which includes Vuwani, after the violence that led to the burning of more than 20 schools and damage to more than 40 in total. We visited libraries as well as about seven schools that were caught up in the violence. What we found on our visit is that the violence that led to the destruction of these schools was devastating. Learning had been severely compromised, exam preparations were seriously impacted and there were thousands of pupils stuck in a state of paralysis, not knowing when learning will resume. In some schools, records of admission numbers and pupils' results had been lost. It was clear to us that even if learning were to resume swiftly and new buildings built, the crisis in Vuwani had dealt a destructive blow to an already struggling system.

Sepedi:

Modulasetulo o hlalositše pele re eya kua Vuwani go ya go lekola seemo sa thuto gore Kgoro ya tša Thuto e be e sa šome gabotse.

Kamoka re a tseba; ga se sephiri.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 3 AUGUST 2017

Page: 57

English:

The Department of Education in Limpopo was under administration. However, there was also some resilience and fight for the right to education by some community members. These members made notable efforts to protect their children's schools, at least those that still remained, where teachers and parents took shifts to guard the schools. They did this despite the obvious danger that they faced from the hooligans and bullies that continued to burn the schools and thus destroy the future of the children of Vuwani, which we seriously condemn.

The damage caused is well captured by the Minister of Education, Mme Angie Motshekga's response in her written reply to a parliamentary question in October last year, that it will cost more than R460 million to repair and rebuild schools damaged during violent protests in Vuwani, Limpopo. This amount included costs to rebuild, renovate and repair the schools that were burnt and vandalised.

So far about R45 million have been used for the deployment of mobile classrooms. Out of all the schools, seven schools have been furnished with mobile classrooms. Vuwani has also been declared a disaster area so that funds can be quickly released to begin

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 3 AUGUST 2017

Page: 58

rebuilding schools and providing alternative, interim classrooms so that learning can proceed. However, the bureaucracy associated with government procurement processes is delaying the rebuilding of schools. But as I've said utilisation of mobile classes is an interim measure used to ensure that teaching and learning are not compromised. This augurs well with the non-negotiable that we urged the department to ensure that they were observed and implemented in schools. These include that learners and teachers were at school on time; that teachers were teaching, covering the curriculum and that principals were managing schools effectively.

One school, Vhafamadi Secondary School, has been rebuilt through the assistance from the private sector, in particular, M Shandukani Foundation and Simba Community Development Foundation as well as the National Lottery.

We hope that this spirit of co-operative governance will be brought into the planning and accommodation process for the other remaining schools, and into urgently fixing the other many schools in Limpopo that have existed for years with unsafe infrastructure.

Sepedi:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 3 AUGUST 2017

Page: 59

Modulasetulo, ge ke bolela ka ye nako, dikolo tše di sentšwego kamoka ga tšona ke tše 10, tše e lego gore Kgoro ya Thuto ka Limpopo e nepiša go di aga lefša. Ge ke bolela bjale ...

English:

... out of the seven schools, they are at 25% stage ...

Sepedi:

...di a agiwa; gomme tše dingwe dikolo Kgoro ya Mešomo ya Mmušo e kgethile barerišani gore ba kgone go tšwetša mošomo pele.

English:

Both the national and the provincial department should also be commended for their response to the crisis so far, together with the Limpopo provincial government and the Houses of Traditional Leaders. The manner in which the collective response was organised indicates a level of co-operative governance as required by our Constitution. Chairperson, it should be noted that before the violence broke out, Vhembe District - where Vuwani is located, was the highest performing district in the National Senior Certificate results in the province in 2014 and 2015. The violence thus had the potential to tarnish this good performance by the Vhembe District in 2016.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 3 AUGUST 2017

Page: 60

However, surprisingly the challenges arising from the violence didn't stand in the way of a strong matric result. Vhembe still led all districts with matric results in Limpopo. The Vhuronga Circuit in Vuwani emerged as the top performing circuit in Limpopo. Edison Nesengani High School was one of Vuwani's greatest achievers and produced 100% pass rate. We want to commend all those involved, especially the learners and teachers, who worked hard to achieve these results.

In April this year fresh violence erupted in Vuwani over the municipal boundary line and schools were among the targets by these hooligans. Thankfully this was quickly quashed. We want to take this opportunity to thank the law enforcement agencies for containing the violence so far and urge them to keep it that way. We cannot allow the hooligans to rob our children of their future in this way. We also like to call on the department to move faster in rebuilding the schools that were burnt. We, as the ANC, support this report and implore this House to adopt it. I thank you.

Sepedi:

Modulasetulo, dinomoro o ka re ba le file nako ye di kgopelwa mola go modulasetulo wa komiti. E re ke bontšhe gore dikolo tše di

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 3 AUGUST 2017

Page: 61

amegilego kua Limpopo ke tše 76, go akaretša dipraemari le disekontari. Barutwana bao ba amegilego ke ba 29 220 .

English:

Out of this number, 18 072 ...

Sepedi:

... ke bana ba diphoraemari, 10 948 ke bana ba disekontari. Re leboga go bontšha maikemišetšo ga Kgoro ya Thuto ka Limpopo ka go ikopanya le dikgoro tša thuto le dikolokomiti go bona gore re aga bokamoso bja bana ba rena. Molaetša go badudi ba Afrika-Borwa, kudukudu badudi ba kua Vuwani, seleteng sa Vhembe, re kgopela gore re thušaneng le mmušo wa rena gore re age bokamoso bja bana ba rena ka gobane thutelabogolo e a roba. Ke a leboga, Modulasetulo.

HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon members from the EFF, you cannot do that, please.

Ms D B NGWENYA: Chair, my time. Seconds have gone.

HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms. M C Dikgale): Start now. Your time will be fixed. Start with the debate. I promise you.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 3 AUGUST 2017

Page: 62

Ms D B NGWENYA: Thank you, Chair. [Interjections.] I don't need your advice. I would first like to pay my respect to the ANC MP, hon Timothy Khoza, who sadly passed away unceremoniously, yesterday. I cannot stand here and talk about the same issues that my colleagues and the other members of this House have spoken about, regarding the challenges in the Vhembe District in Limpopo due to the on-going protests and the destruction of property that it resulted in. Therefore, I will rather use this opportunity to speak about the fundamental challenges facing basic education in this country.

It would be foolish of us to think that the challenges facing education in Limpopo are only a result of the protests, because it is not.

The fact though is that, while there are challenges that are unique to basic education in Limpopo, there are much deeper issues than this. Fundamentally, basic education in South Africa faces systematic problems, which continue to perpetuate the unequal ownership of resources and access to opportunities that defined South Africa before 1994, and continue to define South Africa's education system, and as a result, it affects the economy after 1994.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 3 AUGUST 2017

Page: 63

Education in South Africa has from the days of Hendrik Verwoerd been an unequal one. This limited the ability of particularly, black students to gain the necessary skills and education they needed to better the material conditions of themselves and their families, which, coupled with economic dispossession, meant that there were basically no means by which the majority of South Africans could live a dignified and poverty-free life.

It is unfortunate that we are still facing that problem now even after the 23 years of democracy. Therefore, under the ANC government, South Africa has one of the worst education systems in the continent and the world, despite spending more than other African countries. Children continue to learn under open skies or leaking roofs. Hundreds of thousands of children share toilets and some still use pit toilets, as we speak. Some children are hungry and some are fed with non-nutritional food. Some are fed with expired food. We still have schools with over one hundred children in a classroom.

The type of schooling system we want and shall deliver is one that ensures that text books are delivered on time; children learn on full stomachs; children leave school literate; children can communicate and converse perfectly in this country; children have

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 3 AUGUST 2017

Page: 64

access to proper facilities and infrastructure; we have quality teachers who are committed and dedicated, who do not run away from teaching people in the rural areas, after they have used the money of the taxpayers.

Using our seven cardinal pillars as a guide, we as the EFF shall establish a free quality education system which will nurture, educate and socialise children, so that they can become meaningful, contributing adults who will help build and grow an economy and society that benefit all South Africans, not just the few.

If we do not do this, the black majority will continue to suffer as the private education system gets better and the public education system continues to deteriorate. This will have terrible consequences for the future of this country.

We live for a South Africa that will progress and not stagnate. We live for a South Africa that has children who are equally educated. We love our children. We want to see them educated. It is time that we sit and communicate and not through insults to each other. We must do it for our children and make sure that we make promises that we can keep. Implementation is important in this country. Thank you.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 3 AUGUST 2017

Page: 65

HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Order, hon members! Hon Mokwele, order!

Mr M KHAWULA: Hon Chairperson, today, the House is receiving and considering three oversight visit reports of the Select Committee on Education and Recreation: the joint oversight visit to Gauteng on 17 to 21 October 2016, nine months ago; the oversight visit to Pixley ka Seme District on 31 January to 3 February 2017, six months ago; the oversight visit to Limpopo on 29 August to 2 September 2016, 11 months ago.

If these reports are an important instrument in the role of Parliament conducting oversight over the executive, why wait for almost a year before a report is considered? Surely, Parliament must have itself to blame when sometimes some powers that be in some quarters begin to take it for granted, either by passing or ignoring the involvement of Parliament in the decision-making process.

Be that as it may, the IFP has certain observations about the reported oversight visits. The crux of the matter in respect of the protests at the universities is inadequate funding. Whilst the higher education sector has experienced a speedy increase of unprecedented proportions over the past years, this increase has not

been matched by the same speedy growth of the financial support to the sector. This has resulted in a swift decline in the per capita subsidies at the universities, leading to serious challenges of funding inadequacies.

The IFP concurs with the conclusion that inadequate funding for the higher education sector has negatively impacted on the ability of the higher education sector to enrol more students from the poor family backgrounds.

The Higher Education Parents Dialogue raised issues of poor consultation between parents and institutions of higher learning. They raised concerns of there being very little or no recognition at all by institutions, of a role that parents can play in normalising the abnormal situations in times of need. This is a valid point which Parliament must seriously consider, going forward.

The very nature of student politics is based on populist behaviour. As a result, during the heightened and hectic periods of the protest actions, populism overshadowed the legitimate elected structures in the institutions.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 3 AUGUST 2017

Page: 67

The IFP considers the destruction and burning of property during a protest action highly unacceptable. We always believe in peaceful engagements and the peaceful resolution of disputes. It is thus regrettable that, during the Fees Must Fall and the Vuwani protests, the institutions around the country experienced property losses amounting to billions of rands.

In the same vein, the role played by the police and other security forces did not contribute to resolving matters amicably. Some police action in some instances perpetuated the already destructive situations in their engagement with the participants. It is crucial that South African police must undergo serious training in how to deal with protest actions and crucial situations in manners that are not destructive. We saw this happening in Marikana. The Fees Must Fall campaigns were very close to giving us a repeat of the Marikana experience.

Commenting on the Limpopo report would seem an already futile exercise, as some recommendations thereof are water under the bridge. Save to say that the IFP hopes that the schools that were destroyed have already been repaired and rebuilt as promised, at least for the benefit of our learners.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 3 AUGUST 2017

Page: 68

At the wrap-up meeting on 2 September in Limpopo, it also seemed like the locals already knew who the instigators of the perpetrators were. However, this meeting was so skilfully co-ordinated that some traditional leaders, whom we suspected would have volunteered the hidden valuable information to us, were diplomatically excluded and sidelined from being invited to the wrap-up meeting. I thank you.

Mr J W W JULIUS: House Chairperson, members and fellow South Africans, whilst condemning the destruction of infrastructure, it is also commendable that some efforts were made to get the education of Vuwani learners back on track. Chairperson, this report is not clear on real and long-term solutions to the education crisis faced in Vuwani. There are no clear recommendations of when permanent classes will be built. It is further commendable that 76 mobile classes were provided to these affected schools. Hon Zwane, I know you said that there were no figures but let me give you some figures.

[Interjections.] The worry is that the Basic Education Department spent R17 million on these 76 classrooms. This amounts to about R223 000 for one mobile classroom. This cannot make sense.

Chairperson, this is the hallmark of projects undertaken by the ANC government. They are preying on these dire infrastructure needs. Disasters are seen as opportunities to loot. Hon Zwane even if

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 3 AUGUST 2017

Page: 69

enough money is budgeted for infrastructure, a large amount gets stolen in the process. That is why the schools are in the state that they are today.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Please address hon Zwane through the Chairperson.

Mr J W W JULIUS: Through you Chairperson, hon Mampuru mentioned that there is R460 million needed to replace these schools in Vuwani. You know, if the Guptas were involved in building the schools, this money would have been found to build the schools because all the money is directed towards the friends and families of the President. I agree with hon Mpambo-Sibhukwana that the real reason for the situation in Vuwani is not addressed in this report and will therefore not lead to a lasting solution because the Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs, the Cogta, is the real problem here. The ANC has forgotten the people. If you listened to the will of the people in the first place, it wouldn't have happened. Now, we must go there and spend a lot of money. We must go there and try to solve the problem whilst the ANC continues with the problem - and I will show you now.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 3 AUGUST 2017

Page: 70

This unrest resulted because the ANC insisted to change the demarcation boundaries. Although one can condemn the resultant actions of burning infrastructure, this problem could have been avoided if the ANC had only listened to the people of Vuwani - but they will come back and show you. "You don't listen to us, we don't listen to you". The unrest was further stirred when the President had to go to Vuwani for a community meeting. First, it was said that the reason why the President couldn't make it for that meeting after the people were waiting in the hall, it was said that the President feared for his safety by our weekend special Minister of Cogta. [Laughter.] Then it was also said afterwards that those people who were sitting and waiting in the hall for the President since the morning didn't represent the affected community. The fact is that the President ran away. He cannot face the people of this country because of all the looting and theft that is going on. This is the disrespect the ANC has for the people of our country.

Chairperson, we also have seen the newly discovered clairvoyance of the Minister of State Security, David Mahlobo. This man can see in the future. This Minister said he knew a year before the Vuwani unrest broke out that it would happen! How can the Minister insult the residents of Vuwani so blatantly? The question is, "What has he done to prevent these schools from being torched if he knew?" Maybe

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 3 AUGUST 2017

Page: 71

it could be that the ANC knew what will happen a year in advance because they knew that people will not be satisfied with the ANC's selfish and greedy ways any longer. The Minister now needs to enlighten us, Chairperson, on what will happen because he can see in the future - tokoloshe[a malevolent mythical manlike animal of short stature] - I don't know. The Minister can see in the future what will happen. [Laughter.] So, he must enlighten us what will happen in 2019 when the ANC will be treated with the same contempt it deserves. I thank you. [Applause.]

Mr D STOCK: Thank you very much hon Chairperson. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Order hon members!

Mr D STOCK: The acting Chief Whip hon Parkies, special delegates, members in the gallery and hon members of this House, after the crisis of the burning of schools in Limpopo, the committee on Education and Recreation paid a visit to that area. As a responsive government, the ANC-led government made sure that it had to nip that problem in the bud. As we all know, the crisis was not only related to education. However, education was affected in a bad way, mostly as it was approaching the June examination.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 3 AUGUST 2017

Page: 72

On our visit we realised that schools were behind in curriculum delivery and we had to make sure that there was a plan to ensure that learners finish the curriculum before the final examination. We were happy with the stakeholders that assisted the department, namely ... and I can put it on record here because of the distortion that was created earlier on that the Department of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs was not part of us, as part of that oversight. I was part of that oversight visit to Limpopo when we visited Vuwani and the Department of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs was part of us throughout. When the Department of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs made a presentation to us they never said to us, hon members ... because we must not come here and create an impression with our own stories because we are obsessed about the 2019 government elections. Now we want to come here and create stories ... [Interjections.] ... and we want to put words in the mouths of our critical stakeholders that were part of that oversight visit in Limpopo. The Department of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs never said to us that the crisis of the burning of schools in Vuwani was as a result of the demarcation process. That was never said to us. So if some members of this house have conducted their own research, they have embarked on their own oversight and they want to smuggle their

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 3 AUGUST 2017

Page: 73

report through this podium. I don't think it's going to assist us with anything.

The Limpopo Department of Education had to prioritise the learning of students in the entire district. We also ensured that the department took steps to arrest the situation in Vuwani:

Firstly, a total of 74 mobile classrooms were delivered to 18 schools and two mobile classrooms had to be delivered;

Secondly, the Department of Public Works had to ensure that there was running water in all schools;

Thirdly, Eskom had to come on board and install electricity at the schools with immediate effect. Boreholes were also dug in areas so that some of the schools that were affected could at least have some running water; and

Finally, in some of the schools that were burnt the Department of Co-operative Governance and the provincial government of education in Limpopo also had to create some means to ensure that in the meantime, whilst the schools were torched, at least the lives of ordinary school kids and school children were not affected

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 3 AUGUST 2017

Page: 74

tremendously. We as the members of this committee are happy that at least furniture was made available to schools.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Order! Hon Stock, please take your seat. Hon Koni, why are you standing?

Ms N P KONI: On a point of order Chair: I would like you to check with the member on the podium if he would take my question. Northern Cape to Northern Cape.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Thank you very much. Are you ready to take a question?

Mr D STOCK: I'm not ready to take a question. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): He's not ready. Please take your seat. Continue hon Stock.

Mr D STOCK: We as members of this committee are happy that furniture was made available to schools which had been burnt. The province still had a challenge of 301 small and nonviable schools. However, 130 had been merged. Before other schools are merged we need to have

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 3 AUGUST 2017

Page: 75

thorough planning with regard to the transportation of learners in those schools.

In terms of social cohesion which was to be used to address the cause of the crisis in Vuwani ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon Stock, hon Mokwele is standing. Why are you standing hon Mokwele?

Ms T J MOKWELE: On a point of order Chair: You know, we are getting three contradictory ... information from ANC members. One said there were no numbers; the other said there were numbers ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): What is the point of order? What is the point of order?

Ms T J MOKWELE: ... now hon Stock is busy giving us statistics.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): What is the point of order hon Mokwele?

Ms T J MOKWELE: Which one should ... No, there's no truth in whoever ... [Inaudible.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 3 AUGUST 2017

Page: 76

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon Mokwele, please take your seat. Hon Mokwele, please take your seat. You know you cannot debate from the floor. That has never happened and it will never happen. Even today it will not happen. Continue hon Stock.

Mr D STOCK: To illustrate that our work was not in vain, there are learners from Vuwani who scored high marks in their matric examinations in 2016. These learners did well in the gateway subjects, which is Mathematics and Physical Science.

Before I conclude, let me also take this opportunity to applaud those members who have made positive contributions in the debate today. Unfortunately or fortunately, I don't have anything to say to those who came to this podium because they are obsessed with the 2019 general elections. I also don't have anything to say to those who have not said anything at this podium, and who came here and wanted to grandstand. I also don't have anything to say to some members of this House who came to this podium and then wanted to play to the open gallery because they are preoccupied about the successes that the ANC-led government is making. [Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 3 AUGUST 2017

Page: 77

Hon Sibhukwana, as I indicated earlier on in my debate, I think we must clarify that when we go out as hon members of select committees to conduct our oversight visits we go there as an institution. We leave out our party political colours. It's not a political matter. [Interjections.] The situation which happened in Vuwani ... [Inaudible.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Order hon members!

Mr D STOCK: ... and when we went there as a select committee we went there not wearing our party political colours. All of us went there as an institution ... as the NCOP to go and correct the situation because we are a caring government of the ANC.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Order hon Stock. Hon Stock?

Mr D STOCK: So when we arrived ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon Stock, please take your seat. I'm going to recognise hon member Mokwele first and then you'll be next because she stood up before you. Please take your seat. Hon Mokwele?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 3 AUGUST 2017

Page: 78

Setswana:

Moh T J MOKWELE: Tsala ya me fano ga e bue nnete ka gonne rona re rometswe ke makoko ... [Tsenoganong.]

English:

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon Mokwele, you know you cannot debate from ... Even if it is hot ... the seat is hot, we cannot allow you. Hon Mokwele! Hon Mokwele! Hon Mokwele, you can't do that. Hon Mpambo?

Ms T G MPAMBO-SIBHUKWANA: Thank you hon Chair. I'm pleading for your indulgence. Can you please ask hon Stock to address me as hon Mpambo-Sibhukwana because I belong to royalty? [Applause.]

[Laughter.] That Mpambo ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Okay, point of order taken. Please take your seat.

IsiXhosa:

Nkskz T G MPAMBO-SIBHUKWANA: Ndingumntwana wegazi mna.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Yes, I'm going to tell him now.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 3 AUGUST 2017

Page: 79

IsiXhosa:

Nkskz T G MPAMBO-SIBHUKWANA: Loo nto leyo ayifihlwa.

English:

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Take your seats hon ...

[Inaudible.]

IsiXhosa:

Nkskz T G MPAMBO-SIBHUKWANA: Akufihlwa makhuba kulinywa.

English:

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon Mokwele and hon Mpambo

... [Interjections.] Hon Stock, the hon member Mpambo-Sibhukwana

would want to be addressed as the hon member please. I see another

one standing. {Interjections.] The hon member does not want us to

come to the conclusion. It can't be. Hon members ...

[Interjections]... hon members, please take your seats.

[Interjections.] What is the problem? [Interjections.] Hon members,

the hon Mpambo-Sibhukwana was addressing me. She was not addressing

... [Interjections.] Please take your seats. Take your seats.

[Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 3 AUGUST 2017

Page: 80

Hon members, I asked them to take their seats. [Interjections] Hon Koni, hon Mampuru, hon Zwane and hon Motlashuping, please don't be out of order. Take your seats. I still have to recognise the hon Khawula. [Interjections.] Okay, your time will come. Hon Khawula?

Mr M KHAWULA: Chair, on a point of order.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): What is the point of order? Hon members, order! Order hon members. [Interjections.] Hon members from the ANC, order please. [Interjections.] Continue hon Khawula.

Mr M KHAWULA: Chairperson, I'm on a point of order in respect of ... it's not the first one ... in respect of how our microphones are being operated. Before the hon Mokwele finishes what she says, the microphones are already off and we cannot hear what she is saying to you. Can this thing really be corrected that the microphones are on until you issue an instruction from the chair please? This has happened for far too long. We are being abused here ... [Inaudible.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon Khawula, thank you very much for raising that. If the hon member stood up on a point of order it must be on a point of order. If she is debating I am going to switch the microphone off. She must just listen to me.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 3 AUGUST 2017

Page: 81

Mr M KHAWULA: Chairperson, my point of order is that it only needs to be switched off at your instruction; not just somebody deciding somewhere.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Okay hon Khawula, I hear you. I have a button here with me. If ever you rise on a point of order and I hear that you are debating I'm going to switch this microphone off. It's right here in front of me.

Ms T J MOKWELE: You don't have that right Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): I do have the right.

[Interjections.]

Hon Khawula, I have made a ruling on your point of order. Can you please take your seat and we'll continue. Hon Khawula, what is the ... [Inaudible.] No hon members. Hon Mokwele, can you please respect the hon member ... [Inaudible.]

Mr M KHAWULA: Chairperson, my order is that it makes sense that the Chair must first hear what the member is saying before a decision on whether switching off or on is taken.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 3 AUGUST 2017

Page: 82

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Okay hon Khawula, as from now on please make sure that you concentrate on the orders that the members are raising because that's what I did. I did that. Hon Mokwele, do you still want to say something? Okay, I'll come to you. Are you standing on a point of order?

Setswana:

Moh T J MOKWELE: Modulasetilo, ga re mo lekgotleng la kwa Seshibitso kgotsa Pitsedisulejang moo e leng gore kgosi ... [Tsenoganong.]

English:

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon Mokwele that is how I will then switch off the microphone because you are just standing. You are out of order. You are out of order. [Interjections.] You are out of order hon Mokwele. Hon Mokwele, please take your seat. Take your seat hon Mokwele! Hon Mokwele, take your seat! Take your seat hon Mokwele! Hon Mokwele, take your seat! Hon Motlashuping? [Interjections.] Then behave like we are in the House. Don't behave like we are in a lekgotla.

Mr T C MOTLASHUPING: Thanks Chairperson. I think it is in order and in respecting the decorum of this House that when you make a ruling

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 3 AUGUST 2017

Page: 83

you don't debate your ruling with a member. That must be respected. That is the first issue. [Interjections.]

The second issue ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale) Order hon members!

Mr T C MOTLASHUPING: ... is that here we are not to consider any royalty, though we respect it. However, we are all hon members and that must be noted. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Noted hon Motlashuping. [Interjections.] Yes, it's a point of order. [Interjections.] It is a point of order hon Mokwele. Hon Mpambo?

Ms T G MPAMBO-SIBHUKWANA: Thank you Chairperson. My point was that you don't pronounce the Sibhukwana and leave out the Mpambo part. That's what my point of argument is. It's not about whether its royalty or not. What I'm saying is, don't say hon Sibhukwana and leave out Mpambo. It's like *Phumzile Mlambo-Ngcuka*, with Mlambo being the maiden name. Mpambo is my maiden name and Sibhukwana is my married name. It has to be pronounced simultaneously. That's why I

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 3 AUGUST 2017

Page: 84

said I'm pleading for your indulgence. You should be taking the lead in teaching these hon members, especially hon Stock.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Thank you hon Mpambo-Sibhukwana. That is why I asked the hon member to address you as the hon member. Thank you very much. Continue hon Stock.

Mr D STOCK: Hon Khawula, the three reports that we are tabling today ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon Zwane, hon Mampuru and hon Dlamini, order please.

Mr D STOCK: Hon Khawula, with regard to the three reports that we are considering today in the NCOP, I do of course agree with you that we are very late in tabling them in the NCOP. However, what you must not forget is that we must always tell the truth where it hurts the most because the assertion that is being created here is that we are late, that nothing is happening and we were there 11 months ago. No, there is work that has been done in the area.

When hon Mampuru participated in the debate she said in her speech that there is already 25% progress that has been made. Different

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 3 AUGUST 2017

Page: 85

stakeholders have been in the area to ensure that the situation is going to improve. So we are not completely late. Also, in consideration with our parliamentary programme, before we went on recess there were issues of the annual performance plans and different budgets of the departments. So I thought we must also correct that.

Unfortunately, hon Julius is not in the House but I thought I must also give him clarity with the teachings of one of our greatest philosophers and writers, Albert Einstein. One of his quotations says that we must always try to avoid negative people because they have a problem for every solution. So when hon Julius looks at a problem ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon Stock, take your seat. Hon Michalakis, they can't see where you are. Please assist us with the sound.

Mr G MICHALAKIS: Thank you, House Chairperson. I just need to know when Einstein became a philosopher.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon Michalakis that is not a point of order. Continue.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 3 AUGUST 2017

Page: 86

Mr D STOCK: Thank you very much. Hon Julius, thank you very much that you are back.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon Stock, the hon Essack is standing. What is the problem hon Essack? Order, hon Koni, your member is standing.

Mr F ESSACK: Chairperson, through you, perhaps you could ask the speaker on the podium to quantify. I'm not sure if I understood him correctly. He made a comment that they have a problem for every solution. Is it that they have a solution ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon Essack, you know you cannot just stand up and debate. You have to stand either on a point of order or if you want to ask a question. However, if you are debating I'm not going to allow you. What is your point of order?

Mr F ESSACK: My point of order is that I would like, through you ... if you could quantify with the speaker on the podium whether he said a problem for every solution or a solution for every problem. That is all. So that I can comprehend what he is implying.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 3 AUGUST 2017

Page: 87

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon Essack, please take your seat. Take your seat. Take your seat! Take your seat hon Essack! Hon Essack, take your seat. [Interjections.] Hon Essack, please do not be out of order. Continue.

Mr D STOCK: Hon Julius, I'm happy that you are back in the House, so that when we clarify some of the distortions that you made and also refer to your obsession with the ANC you must be in the House. Thank you very much for your presence.

I was still on the point of Albert Einstein's quotation. One of the writings of Albert Einstein says that it looks like some of the members in this House have a problem for every solution. The select committee went to Limpopo to provide a solution. We are coming back to the House to report on the progress that has been made but still you have a problem. Yet, what you are not telling us is what your solutions are. What are your solutions? At least when you identify the problem we are not saying don't criticise us. However, when you criticise you must always tell us, this is the solution that I will be providing. It does not help when you are always complaining. When we have a debate on this particular topic you come here ... you speak about ... you ... [Inaudible.] ... us on the rules ... of the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 3 AUGUST 2017

Page: 88

point of relevance in your debate. You speak about this family and that family. You leave important issues.

So what we must teach you today is that when you have a script in front of you, stick to it so that you don't miss the important points. It does not make you a better person to speak about things that you don't know or you have very little knowledge of. It makes you very clumsy and it makes you look like an hon member who has not researched or rehearsed your speeches before you come to the House. On that note, I would like to thank you very much.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Thank you very much hon Stock. Please take your seat. Take your seat. [Applause.] Hon Chabangu?

Mr M M CHABANGU: I was just going to say that he must not address us.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): You have to stand up on a point of order sir.

Mr M M CHABANGU: Yes, again he must know that a little knowledge is dangerous ... [Inaudible.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 3 AUGUST 2017

Page: 89

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): You see hon member, you are out of order.

Thank you very much. You are done. [Applause.]

Debate concluded.

Question put. That the Report be adopted.

Mr M KHAWULA: Chair, how does it happen that the Chairperson is asking provinces to vote on a matter which parties were deliberating on? How does that happen? We deliberated and provinces are voting. Which is which Chair?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon Khawula, the status of the report allows us to continue as I am continuing. Hon Khawula, if you ever have a question or you are not satisfied you can always follow the procedure of writing.

Mr M KHAWULA: Chair, why did we debate it as parties when you now allow provinces to vote?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 3 AUGUST 2017

Page: 90

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon Khawula, you know what to do. I continue. The hon members will vote in favour or against, or will abstain. I now call upon the provinces.

IN FAVOUR: Eastern Cape, Free State, Gauteng, KwaZulu-Natal, Limpopo, Mpumalanga, Northern Cape, North West, Western Cape.

Report accordingly adopted in accordance with section 65 of the Constitution.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): After the House adjourns hon members are requested to remain seated so that they get a report on what is going to happen with regard to Taking Parliament to the People.

The Council adjourned at 11:59.