

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 1

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

---

*PROCEEDINGS OF THE NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES*

---

The House met at 14:00.

The House Chairperson: Committees, Oversight, Co-operative Government and Intergovernmental Relations took the Chair and requested members to observe a moment of silence for prayers or meditation.

**APPROPRIATION BILL**

(Policy debate)

Vote No 04 - Co-Operative Governance and Traditional Affairs:

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS:  
House Chairperson, hon Deputy Ministers, chairperson of the select committee, hon members of the NCOP, hon Members of Parliament and distinguished guest, good afternoon, "dumelang, sanibonani, goei

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 2**

dag, avuxeni and molweni" [Good day]. I am extremely honoured to stand before you today to present a Budget Vote speech for our Ministry. We meet at a time when storms and fires have brought havoc in the Western Cape. Our heartfelt condolences go out to those who have lost loved ones in these catastrophic events. We have also two firelighters in this devastation. Bradley Richards and John Blaauw were volunteer fire fighters who succumbed to injuries sustained n fighting the Kysna fires. We also thank the many volunteer fire fighters who have flown to ground zero from across the country to assist in relief efforts. As I heard the many South Africans who have made various contributions to those who have lost their homes. Today, I am really proud to be part of a country with such high levels of caring.

Our revolutionary condolences should be extended to the family and friends of the legendary freedom fighter, Herman Andimba Toivo ya Toivo and to the people of Namibia. You have indeed lost a true icon and a hero of not only your nation, but also a friend of South Africa who dedicated his life to the fight against oppression perpetrated by the apartheid regime. We continue to honour him by working to free our people from all forms of oppressions.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 3**

With this in mind, we convened recently the third presidential local government summit under the capable leadership of His Excellency President Jacob Zuma. We believe its theme of, "Transforming municipal spaces for radical social and economic development", not only address the legacies from the colonial and apartheid eras, but also encapsulate our vision for the local government sector for the next five years.

We meet during the Youth Month at a time where we honour the contributions of the youth to their struggle for freedom. This year marks the 30th anniversary of the founding of the SA Youth Congress, Sayco, whose motto was: Victory is certain, freedom or death. Today, our youth face a different set of challenges which nevertheless require the same commitment. From the 19 to 21 of this month, the Minister of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs, Cogta, will host the local government youth development conference which will assemble youth from municipalities across the country. The conference, inter alia, will ensure that young people are at the forefront of leading development at a local level. The future does, indeed, belong to the young people.

Distinguished guests, we met last year on the cusp of the fourth fully democratic local government elections under trying

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 4**

circumstances. I am glad to report to you that the elections were deemed free and fair. This was largely due to the work of the interministerial committee on elections that convened under the Cogta leadership. We thank all stakeholders who participated in this process. To date, approximately 5 000 councillors were paid a total amount of almost R260 million through a once off gratuity. I must also indicate that Ernst and Young study commissioned by the Remuneration Commission of Public Office Bearers established that councillors are the least paid public office bearers amongst the three spheres of government. Hence we welcome the review of public office bearers remuneration currently taking place and we hope that it will deal with all remuneration-related challenges of our councillors in local government.

Essential to transforming the municipal space and setting the foundation for radical economic and social development has been the Back to Basics programme championed by ourselves. In the past financial year we committed to continue with our second phase of the Back to Basics programme. In line with our belief that local government should be in the hands of our citizens, one of the key elements of the Back to Basics 10-point plan is fostering more positive community experiences.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 5**

During last year's Budget Vote speech we promised to create more public participation platforms. At the end of March this year, 40 dysfunctional municipalities were supported in creating effective community engagement mechanisms. A total of 4 067 ward committees have been established. Also, as promised last year, a national induction campaign for ward committee members is in the process of being implemented. To further improve the state of our municipal finances a generic revenue plan was developed and implemented in 30 municipalities.

The adoption of our integrated urban development framework last year, as our national urban policy, signifies how South Africa is now well-positioned to respond to both national urbanisation challenges, to interface with global dialogues and agreements and to be a thought leader in international dialogues on urbanisation and urban policy development.

Traditional leaders form an integral part of our democracy. In a bid to further democratise our municipal spaces we have pushed for greater involvement of traditional leaders in municipal councils. For the first time, following the 2016 local government elections, traditional leaders attended the integrated councillors induction programme that was hosted by the SA Local Government Association,

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 6**

Salga. Our efforts to ensure zero tolerance towards the deaths of initiates are beginning to bear fruits. While the number of initiate deaths was greatly reduced the previous year, that is never good enough. Our condolences go out to the families who lost loved ones during the initiation phase. We commend the work done by the Cultural, Religious and Linguistic Communities CRL Rights commission in probing further the initiation practice. Their findings will be used to enhance and strengthen our collective efforts to have a death-free initiation practice.

To address most of the policy and legislative gaps and challenges within the traditional affairs sector, the Cogta Ministry will focus on strengthening the current legislation. The Ministry has prioritised supporting the parliamentary processes towards the enactment of the traditional and Khoi-San leadership Bill. The Bill will address, amongst others, the recognition of Khoi-San communities and leaders. It will also support the participation of traditional leaders in municipal councils. We also intend finalising and tabling the customary initiation Bill to Parliament to regulate the cultural initiation practice. In fact, I can confirm that it was approved by Cabinet this morning. We believe this will go a long way to reducing the number of fatalities emanating from the practice.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 7**

Last month, the Ministry in partnership with the National House of Traditional Leaders organised the traditional leadership indaba to address challenges facing the sector. We welcome the indaba declaration on matters such as land ownership, tenure rights, economic development, social cohesion and institutional support. We look forward to work with traditional leaders to resolve these and other issues.

The Community Work Programme, as we are all aware, is one of the flagship programmes of this department. A re-imagined municipal space cannot happen without the involvement of the poorest of the poor. The number of municipalities that have Community Work Programme, CWP, programmes have increased from 198 to 229 in the last year. Out of an annual target of 234 000 we were able to provide 243 work opportunities as at 31 March this year. The CWP is one of the most impactful programmes for the department. It targets the marginalised, the voiceless, the unheard and those who are not on Facebook or Twitter and whose concerns are not reduced to hash tag.

Updated figures reveal that we have exceeded our training target of 23 483 CWP participants - 33 224 CWP participants received training for the financial year 2016-17. I must indicate that one of the

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 8**

biggest weakness that we are intending to address in this financial year is to make sure that all trainings accorded to CWP participants are properly accredited. I must also indicate the additional training was also made possible through partnerships with other sector departments and private stakeholders. The CWP has established a partnership with the Department of Small Business Development. As we are speaking this partnership has made it possible for the training of 227 participants on co-operatives. To date 18 co-operatives have been registered.

However these figures only tell on the side of the story. Siphokazi Plaatje from Ikwezi, Jansenville, was one of the CWP storekeepers. The experience she gained assisted her in obtaining employment at a national retailer that opened in Jansenville recently. Belinda January from Bluekruin Municipality, a mother of two, was unemployed who lives in Pestan, she started working for CWP in October 2014. As we speak today, through her dedication and hard work which paid, she is now employed at the Kuzuko Lodge as a waitress and a guide. These are the little stories that do not make headlines or front pages of the Sunday newspapers, but they do change the trajectory of people's lives for generations to come. This is the government that the people of South Africa voted for.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 9**

We are currently working with the National Treasury to develop a new CWP model which is intended to address identified gaps. We want a transformed municipal space to become a reality for all our citizens. To that end we have identified the misalignment between bulk and reticulation infrastructure as one of the major causes of delay in the delivery of basic services. Working through the Municipal Infrastructure Support Agent, Misa, in collaboration with our partners, the Development Bank of Southern Africa and the Department of Water and Sanitation, we have developed an implementation plan for seven municipalities.

The Municipal Infrastructure Grant plays a vital role in changing the face of municipalities so that citizens experience first hand the work of local government. As at the end of March 2017, R9,5 billion, close to 63% of the total Municipal Infrastructure Grant, Mig, allocation of R14,9 billion was spent. Municipalities in Mpumalanga province are performing the best at this point as they have spent 72,42% which is close to R1,3 billion. They are followed by KwaZulu-Natal that have spent 69,4%, which is R2,3 billion of the total allocation of R3,8 billion.

The Municipal Infrastructure Grant annual allocations over the 2017 Medium-Term Expenditure Framework, MTEF, indicates an amount of

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 10**

R900 million, which is allocated outside of the grant formula and earmarked for specific sport infrastructure projects identified by Sport and Recreation South Africa.

To accelerate the spending level of struggling municipalities, Cogta has planned to strengthen its capacity to support municipalities to improve spending by, amongst others, developing its financial unit capacity to handle Mig conversions for municipalities that fail to spend Mig allocations and also by transferring the Mig programme from the Department of Co-operative Governance, Dcog, to the Municipal Infrastructure Support Agent, Misa. The objective of this transfer is to foster synergy between projects monitoring and technical support functions which is highly required by some of the municipalities with less technical capacity.

A project management office has been established with the role of facilitating the collaborative implementation of intergovernment initiatives aimed at reducing backlogs in the 27 districts municipalities. As part of its efforts to transform the municipal space, Misa trained 372 apprentices towards qualifying as artisans in various trades critical for municipal infrastructure delivery and management. This apprenticeship programme is targeted at producing electricians, plumbers, diesel mechanics and bricklayers.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 11**

The Municipal Infrastructure Support Agent also provided training to 884 municipal officials through short courses in technical skills to enhance their technical capabilities. The focus of capacity building in this financial year will be on the continuation of apprenticeship training for 300 learners currently in the programme. In addition to this, 160 graduates will be provided with opportunities for workplace experience in selected municipalities.

As part of our effort to ensure that competent people are appointed, the department intends promulgating the regulations applicable to all staff members below management echelon during this financial year. We are embarking upon a holistic review of our system of local government system informed by such emerging realities as the impact of urbanisation in our municipalities, the developmental role of local government as reflected in Phase 2 of our Back to Basics, and how to govern effectively, the many socially and economically differentiated environments that characterise the municipal landscape along the rural-urban continuum. A discussion document is under preparation during the current financial year.

The department is gravely concerned about the excessive growth of debt owed to municipalities which is to the tune of R117 billion as at December last year. The work of the national task team on

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 12**

government debt is making progress in resolving the historical debt and government departments have made commitments to adhere to their current debt.

House Chairperson, I must indicate that the budget allocation for the 2017 Medium-Terms Expenditure to the department amounts to R78,414 billion just for 2017-18, R85,1 billion for 2018-19 and R91 billion for 2019-20. This reflects an average growth of 8% over the 2017 Medium-Terms Expenditure Framework. The total allocation of R74, 4 billion in this financial year is divided as follows: for the Department of Co-operative Governance, is R78,2 billion, of which R73 billion will go to transfers and subsidies. For operational costs we received R558 million and special allocations will be made for R3,7 billion. The Department of Traditional Affairs will be allocated R145 million.

In conclusion, We believe that today we have outlined our programmes and plans that will further enhance the economic transformation agenda of South Africa so that all South Africans can enjoy prosperity.

My sincere gratitude goes to my colleagues, both Deputy Ministers Nel and Deputy Minister Bapela, for their hard work and diligence

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 13**

over the past year. We would not have achieved as much without their sterling contribution.

My thanks also go to the various directors-general, including the current Director-General, DG, Dr Charles Nwaila, who is serving both departments. Also to the staff of the ministries and the departments, I thank you for your effort over the past year. It has been my pleasure to serve with you. Thanks to all hardworking MECs and councillors.

Finally, a word of thanks also goes to both the select committee and the committee of the Notational Assembly, and lastly, to my family who has remained my safe haven during all the storms.

Hon Chairperson, I have the honour to submit Budget Vote 4, for your approval. "Ke a leboga" [Thank you].

HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): I must indicate that we have a challenge of the system. It is down. For those who will be going to the podium the clock is not working and I am relying on the one that I have here. Sorry for those who will be getting to the podium.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 14**

Ms N P KONI: Chairperson, I am worried about the issue that you will be the only one presiding over our time. You are not to be trusted. Can't we also check our own time? Please, Chairperson, you cannot be trusted. Something must be done. Actually, it must be corrected.

HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): In terms of the Rules of the National Council of Provinces, it's a serious violation of our Rule if you are an hon member casting an aspersion to the presiding officer without presenting a very serious, effective and valid substantive motion. Refrain from that, and I am not going to make it a subject for discussion. I am saying that we are working on it that the clock will be there. I am not subjecting this unless you are rising on another matter. I have made a ruling on this one.

Ms N P KONI: Everything that I have just said, even if we can also go back to the Hansard of last year and the year before last, I can correct. Thank you very much

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): This is not another matter, hon Koni. What I will do is to remind members when their time is approaching the end.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 15**

Mr J M MTHETHWA: Hon House Chairperson, Deputy Chairperson of the NCOP, hon Minister, Deputy Minister, hon MECs from the various provinces, members of the NCOP representing the provinces, members and distinguished guests, the debate on Vote 4, which is the Department of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs marks another important milestone in the history and evolution of our struggle for freedom. It coincides with the 1976 June 16th anniversary and commemoration of the heroic acts and efforts of our youth to bring about the desired change in our country, where everybody who lives in it enjoys fundamental freedom and all the rights now enshrined in our Constitution.

Today, I stand here in full acknowledgement of these efforts and further express a word of gratitude to our youth, who, unarmed decided to seize the bull by the horns and defeated the apartheid regime, complementing the efforts of the heroes and stalwarts of our struggle for freedom and democracy.

It marks a call for an outcome-oriented local government that recognizes the challenges facing our young democracy. It calls for a system of local government that embraces the role of our youth, precisely because part of building a responsible local government

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 16**

system entails building and mentoring future leaders for the present and future good of our democracy.

It is equally because; it is at the local government level where things are happening in terms of delivery and nondelivery of services. It is exactly where greatest challenges are felt about the state capacity to deliver needs satisfying services. Local government should therefore be recognized and embraced as the epicentre of our development and service delivery value chain. It requires active participation and involvement by all citizens, the various state organs across the three spheres of local government and all sectors of the South African economy.

It is equally another opportunity to echo a clarion call for the end of the scourge of corruption by all those in the local government service in favour of efforts towards good governance and ethical leadership.

It equally calls upon all of us to honour our leader and stalwart, Reginald Oliver Tambo together with many others by dedicating 2017, the year of Oliver Tambo, a year for the achievement of a responsible local government system, by addressing the socioeconomic inequalities in our society whose impact and manifestations are

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 17**

mostly visible in local government. Our people continue to live a helpless life and are unable to make a living.

Our system of local government should essentially take the tune from our Constitution and not lead our people into another life of disempowerment, poverty, unemployment and seclusion whilst a few are enjoying the fruits of our hard-fought democracy where most lost their lives for the betterment of our society.

Working together, we can make it work and more sustainable. We should together re-dedicate ourselves through our collective efforts, to strive towards a true local government service dedicated to serve the people of South Africa.

We have to soldier on in making local government work for all, using the Back to Basics Approach to local government service delivery by renewing our collective and individual efforts towards transforming South Africa into a true democratic, nonracial and prosperous country, where everybody is able to make an honest living by using local government as the basis towards achieving this end.

For this, we are all called upon to embrace the true character of our forebearers, in particular, by emulating what Oliver Tambo,

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 18**

Nelson Mandela, Chris Hani and many heroes of our struggle would be doing in making the dream for a true South Africa work for its people.

True and responsible local government calls upon all citizens to make their mark by working together to achieve integration, functional co-ordination, co-operative government, collaboration and sound intergovernmental co-operation in the delivery of services to our people. For this to happen, resources allocated for service delivery and for dressing unmet community needs should not be for other purposes.

Similarly, benefits resultant from local service delivery should not circulate in the inner circle of selected individuals hence I stand here today calling for strict monitoring of local government service delivery projects to ascertain value for money and how supply chain management as well as tendering and adjudication is executed as key risk areas in local government.

This of course can be realised when all of us, in the service of our people are willingly embracing our fiduciary responsibilities of establishing, maintaining and managing our local government service protocol through a system of government and governance that

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 19**

acknowledges public accountability, good governance and collective efforts in managing and leading with systems thinking.

The Department of Co-operative Governance's budget allocation for the 2017-18 financial year has increased by 1% from R73 billion in 2016-17 to R78 billion whilst the higher increase of 8,9% is under Programme 6: Community Work Programme; Programme 2: Regional and Urban Development; and legislative support has decreased by more than half, averaging at 53%. This decrease is a consequence of the phasing out of the Municipal Demarcation Transition Grant, commencing in the 2018-19 financial year as recommended by the Financial and Fiscal Commission, FFC, which should end in the 2017-18 financial year since it will no longer form part of the intergovernmental fiscal transfer system.

The challenge of efficiently implementing Vision 2030 up to the year 2063 through the NDP as the government's policy agenda for public service delivery is at the centre of a developmental state.

Local government should be repositioned as one of the key drivers of public service efficiency. As all state service delivery and development projects get implemented ...

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 20

Mr F ESSACK: Hon House Chair, through you, I would like to check if the speaker on the podium is willing to take a question?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Mthethwa, are you ready to take a question? Order members!

Mr J M MTHETHWA: No.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Essack, please take your seat. He is not ready to take a question.

Mr J M MTHETHWA: ... The 2017-18 policy priorities of the Department of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs have in real terms increased by 5% from R129 million budget of the 2016-17 financial year to R145 million.

What the Department of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs has set out to pursue or doing, proves to be a continuation of the 2016-17 performance cycle commitments, which are ongoing. Its main priority for the 2017-18 financial year remains the challenge of amendments to the Traditional Leadership and Governance Framework Act, Act 41 of 2003, as well as the introduction of the Customary Initiation Bill as a guide legislation to regulate the cultural

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 21**

initiation practices for the overall reduction of circumcision deaths.

Local government calls for a skilled cadre of employees and public leaders or representatives, who are inquisitive to learn more in order to keep pace with the challenging international local government innovation and service delivery trends so that South African local governments are not left in the changes taking place globally. Similarly, it is important for the government to proactively and strategically reposition the institution of traditional leadership as part of measures to establish mainly and manage intergovernmental co-operation and relations between this important Heritage Institution and the government broadly. Our government is challenged to make use of the institution of traditional leaders on matters of policy relating to all aspects of societal life.

While the department is striving to provide and facilitate a conducive policy environment for the smooth functionality of local government, it is proper to state clearly that it is a government resolve to develop and nurture a result orientated local government services.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 22**

Together, we should work hard to clean local government, corruption and acts of collusion. Our society is yearning for a clean and corrupt free government that represents the interests of a developmental state across the three spheres of government. Local government is thus about providing the unmet diverse needs of South Africa population in the context of a true democratic order and nonracial society.

Putting these needs and aspirations first is the key towards building South Africa's cohesion, united in its diversity towards a common vision for the country. It is crucial for the government to create an environment whereby the entire South African Public Service, inclusive of local government is able to compete globally.

The South African local government public service environment should, as well, be appropriately repositioned to effectively play its role in complementing the work of a developmental state, so that local government truly enables the government to efficiently implement the NDP using the Integrated Development Planning, IDP, approach to achieve synergy.

In conclusion, I stand here to say that local government is everybody's business. We therefore should work together to achieve

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 23

more. Nothing will happen smoothly without co-operative governance. Our Constitution calls upon all of us to be compliant with the principles of co-operative government. Together, we can make it happen.

Lastly, the Budget Vote for the Department of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs and its Annual Performance Plans, APPs, for the 2017-18 financial year is accordingly supported. We support this budget. Thank you. [Applause.]

Mr M CHETTY: Greetings and salutations hon Chairperson of the NCOP, Ministers, Deputy Ministers, fellow members and dear guests. When asked how you would best like to be remembered, the late Tata Madiba said:

There will be life after Mandela. On my last day I want to know that those who remain behind will say: The man who lies here has done his duty for his country and his people.

How true indeed are those words? Unfortunately, the same cannot be said of the current captured leadership that Tata Madiba has left in his wake. Minister of corrupt governance and captured affairs, before you board Emirates Flight JZ 783 to Dubai, paid for by the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 24

Guptas, I, on behalf of law abiding citizens of South Africa, pray that it is a one way ticket.

Ms L C DLAMINI: Hon Chairperson, on a point of order: I just want to check if it is parliamentary for a member to mislead the public by calling a department wrongly of what it is not?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): No! Order! Members - I am sustaining the point of order. Hon Chetty, refer to the department in a very appropriate manner.

Mr J W W JULIUS: Hon Chairperson, on a point of order: I think you are making your own assumptions of what was said. The hon member stood up on a point of order and said you can't mislead the public - how do you know what she meant because you made another ruling now and said just refer to the department like that and that. How do you what she meant?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): How Julius; can you take your seat?

Mr J W W JULIUS: Consistency, Chairperson.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 25**

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Julius, hon Dlamini went on to explain what she was referring to - and if you were not listening don't make it my business. Continue; hon Chetty.

Mr M CHETTY: You see Chair we have a problem here because we all know that the government is corrupt because councils have been placed under administration and we are well aware that affairs has been captured so all I said was corrupt government and captured affairs. I did not refer to CoGTA, I just said .Anyway, going forward Chairperson, be warned, your Ministry's failure to hold ANC MECs' accountable will lead to your demise in this department.

In 2013, your predecessor and successor, now axed Minister of Finance, Pravin Gordhan, informed this House that one third of the municipalities are dysfunctional, one third are at risk and one third are performing well. Three years later, nothing has changed, in fact, under your watch, councils' progress have deteriorated. We have seen an increase in service delivery marches - some turning violent, even resulting in the loss of innocent lives. It is evident that under your watch, the Back to Basics project and its five pillars, have failed to bring about the much anticipated better service delivery and sound governance at a local sphere.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 26**

It cannot be a good story to tell when our unemployment rate increases; the poor are now destitute; our children abandoned, youth are unemployed and students can't afford fees, yet the elite closest to the Gupta's, like you, have captured the wealth of this country. Interventions, not due to administrative failures, but political manipulation, have seen an increase under your watch. Let's not be fooled – Yes, ANC led councils aren't performing, but they enjoy the safety and are secure in comfort, because of their MECs. Whilst in an attempt to capture coalition municipalities, these very MECs are quick to abuse their power, for political reasons, and dissolve them.

Unfortunately, recently in KwaZulu-Natal, the MECs' insistence and arrogance backfired on her. With the ANC not only losing Nqutu Municipality, outright, retaining only three out of the eight wards it won in the 2016 Local Government Elections, the ANC also lost the uMzinyathi Municipality. Tomorrow's crucial by-election in Pongola might yet again witness the ANC losing another municipality – Poetic justice indeed. The abuse of state resources by MECs offering food parcels to our destitute people is scandalous. You should hang your heads in shame.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 27

Mr J M MTHETHWA: Hon Chair, on a point of order: The hon member is misleading the public. The DA contested all the wards in Nqutu, they didn't win - they only got one Proportional Representation, PR.

[Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Mthethwa that is not a point of order - that is a point for debate. Continue; hon Chetty.

[Interjections.] [Laughter.] Order! Members.

Mr M CHETTY: You see Chairperson I know why the hon Mthethwa stood up. He knows he is lucky that the ANC deployed him here because he would be out of a job - because he was the previous Mayor of uMzinyathi. But rest assured, just as a new born baby opens their eyes, so too has the impoverished of this country, and they have punished the ANC - they will no longer be fooled with food parcels.

The intentions of Parliament with interventions were to be a corrective measure and not to manipulate election results or the will of the people, to benefit the ANC. Here is a letter sent to you in 2015 and again in 2016, pleading to place Thaba Chweu in Mpumalanga under administration due to a breakdown of services, including financial mismanagement, sewerage problems, incomplete road works, and water and electricity outages. Yet two years later,

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 28**

you've still done nothing to assist the people of Thaba Chweu - Thaba Chweu has been captured.

In terms of section 139 of the Constitution, steps taken in an intervention are the issuing of the directive; the assumption of responsibility; and the dissolution of the council. In Mngquma Local Municipality and another verses the Premier of the Eastern Cape and others case in 2009, the High Court held that the steps taken by the relevant authority in terms of section 139(1) must be appropriate and therefore fit the situation in order to ensure the fulfilment of the failed obligation. Factors taken into account include the nature of the executive obligation that was not fulfilled, the interests of those affected, the interests of the municipality concerned and the extent of the corrective measures which serve to ensure the problems are resolved.

The Select Committee should be asking themselves this; firstly, have provinces followed the procedural requirements necessary when intervening in terms of section 139(1) and secondly, how did provincial executives justify the use of the particular step they chose to intervene? The provincial executive is only allowed to intervene when a municipality fails to fulfil an executive

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 29**

obligation; not where the politics of the day does not sit very comfortable with the captured ANC.

A fish rots from the head down - never has this saying been more apt, than with reference to the current shenanigans that are unfolding in KwaZulu-Natal, especially in Msunduzi and eThekweni. Similar to the modus operandi of President Gupta and his midnight Cabinet shuffle, the Zuma faction in KwaZulu-Natal has replicated this in Msunduzi, the Chief Financial Officer, and senior managers of Infrastructure and Community Services that are responsible for the bulk of the city's budget, have been suspended, overnight, for yet another midnight shuffle to benefit the Nkosazana Dlamini Gupta faction.

And in eThekweni the ANC Youth League is demanding 40% of all City management positions be awarded to the youth league cadres for patronage benefits and that the city drop or remove requirements such as experience and qualifications. Lowering the entry requirements for management positions would be disastrous for the city and will lead to a collapse of service delivery. The youth league is also demanding a million funding for a youth fund - which it will control, and which it can use as it pleases to further dispense patronage. Both Msunduzi and eThekweni have been captured.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 30**

The independence and autonomy of the Municipal Demarcation Board has been compromised and our charges that the MDB had been abused by the ANC have been vindicated. The fact that the AIC has threatened the ANC that if Matatiele is not incorporated back into KwaZulu-Natal from the Eastern Cape, the coalition in Ekurhuleni will be compromised - that the ANC losing that council. Sadly, when the people of Matatiele staged protest marches, this very ANC, ignored them. It's not about the people - it's no longer about the people, and it's all about the ANC and the Guptas. This is yet another clear example of state capture of a different resource. Again, the Municipal Demarcation Board has been captured.

Corrupt Minister, okay sorry, my apologies CoGTA Minister, the Special Investigating Unit, SIU investigations regarding maladministration in councils, to date have yet to be finalized. This further adds credence to the allegations that these investigations are linked to either the Guptas or those who offer patronage to President Gupta and his NDZ faction. [Time Expired.] Chair, you are supposed to give me a warning before that.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Conclude!

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 31

Mr M CHETTY: Thank you chair. As I conclude; there is a new saying been chanted, behind closed doors at Luthuli house lately, Together we are moving South Africa's wealth to Dubai. And if you, fellow South African citizens are sick and tired of this plundering of our country's wealth by the Gupta's, ably assisted by the ANC, then join the DA on our march to take over the Union Buildings in 2019 - one ward at a time. We therefore do not support a captured budget by a captured department led by a captured Minister. I thank you.

[Applause.] [Interjections.]

Mr D L XIMBI: You spent the whole night writing gossip - the whole night.

Ms T WANA: Hon Deputy Chairperson, hon Chairperson of the NCOP in absentia, Chief Whip of the NCOP, Minister and Deputy Minister of the Department of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs, permanent delegates of the NCOP, a member from SA Local Government Association, Salga ...

*IsiXhosa:*

... iikumkani neenkosi zakowethu ...

*English:*

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 32

... distinguished guests and members of the media ...

*IsiXhosa:*

... ndiyanibulisa ngale mvakwemini. Bantu bakuthi, niyayiva into esikuyo apha. Kule nto sikuyo apha uthi wakujonga kule mibutho ubone ukuba umntwana ubeleke unina lonke ixesha. Wonke umntu olapha, njengokuba i-ANC iphethe nje, naye ingathi angaphatha kusasa oku. Kaloku into yasephupheni awukwazi ukuba uyingande. Sihleli kwelo sikizi nisibona nje apha. Makhe ndiqale ngokubulela abantu bakuMasipala weNgingqi iNquthu abavotele i-IFP kuba kaloku oogxa bethu be-DA bebegqibe inyanga behlala kula Nquthu bengalali ubusuku nemini kodwa abazanga nanto. [Kwahlekwa.] Izinto ezinjalo ziyafuna ukuba zithethwe bantu bakuthi. Imibutho yabantu isuke wathabatha izinto zayo yagoduka yakuqaphela ukuba bafuna ukuxhaphaza umasipala kuba ingathi mncinci. Masiyivuyele i-IFP ngokuthabatha indawo yayo kuba kaloku le nto yabelungu abahlalele ukusebenzisa thina asisayikuyamkela yonke le mihla. Sithi enkosi.

*English:*

Hon Deputy Chair, I am humbled to stand in this august House mandated by the ANC which was born in 1912 in Mangaung, the oldest organisation in Africa and internationally. This is the crucial month of the youth who were fighting for the transformation of our

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 33**

country. The ANC has declared 2017 as the O R Tambo Year. Within his activities during his leadership O R Tambo wrote a letter in 1978 to the United Nations, UN, stating that as South Africans we have managed to adopt our black Bible, ie, the Freedom Charter. He was appealing to the UN to assist us in eradicating the apartheid and the exploitation of black people by the white people.

The National Development Plan, NDP, Vision 2030 defines a developmental state as one of the capacity leading in defining the common national agenda in mobilising all the society taking part in transformation of the municipalities. Today, the local government of the transformation is 17 years old and is doing transformation and good governance. We congratulate local governance for those 17 years of experience.

We must all strive for good governance and sound financial management in all municipalities irrespective of who is leading as a political party because the people on the ground are poor and need services, including the IFP which won in Nquthu. The local government managed to make a Traditional Indaba Summit in Beachwood. All traditional leaders of this country gathered there and discussed the land question.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 34

*English:*

Ngembeko yombutho olawulayo i-ANC sabiza zonke izijemjem zemibutho sathi mabakhe baze kuchaza ukuba baphethe ntoni. I-DA nayo yayimenyiwe kodwa zange izihluphe ngokuya. Sithe sisajonge leyo nombutho we-EFF awazihlupha ngokuphumelela kuloo ndibano yeenkosi.

*English:*

The only organisation which managed to attend was the ANC because it was very interested more especially on the issue of the land question. I will not divulge the declaration because that is another structure.

*IsiXhosa:*

Eyona nto ndizama ukuyiveza yeyokuba aba bantu bazi yonke into zange bakwazi ukuphumelela.

*English:*

The IFP attended the summit represented by King Cebekhulu.

*IsiXhosa:*

Aba bantu bazi yonke into abasayi kuyazi into yapha. Besele niyibonakalisile bantu bakuthi into yokuba aniyifuni into yokusoloko

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 35

nixhanyazeliswa. Masiyibulele i-ANC ukuba xa sime apha nasemakhaya siyabonwa.

*English:*

Ms N P KONI: Hon Chairperson, on a point of order: I want to appeal to hon Wana to stop misleading the country. The EFF started talking about the Freedom Charter because the ANC abandoned it and threw it in the dustbin. The EFF's five cardinal pillars are talking about the land expropriation without compensation. The ANC has done nothing about that. Now that Zuma is facing exit it is now that he is preaching land expropriation without compensation because he wants to leave some nonsensical kind of legacy.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr.A J Nyambi): Hon members, I do not need assistance. Whenever a person is rising on a point of order, you must allow me to listen and then make my own ruling. Hon Koni, it is a final warning. You are out of order and that is not a point of order. You are debating with the speaker at the podium. I am appealing to you to refrain from what you are doing. That was the last warning.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 36

Ms T WANA: As a ruling party in the Eastern Cape, the Eastern Cape is really improving in terms of audit reports because if you can listen to the statement of our MEC on 14 March 2017, he said:

All the municipalities improved from qualified to unqualified audit opinion.

*IsiXhosa:*

Ngelinye ixesha abantu abangxamileyo abaziphicothi kakuhle kuba bazimisele kwinto yokusoloko begxibha iMpuma Koloni. Ndiyayiqonda ke phofu ukuba kutheni iMpuma Koloni isoloko ifakwa kuloo ngxaki. Yinto yokuba kwayona nje inabantu abachubekileyo ...

*English:*

... in terms of education, discipline and humbleness. In the Eastern Cape we have managed in the local government sphere to improve the service delivery. As a result ...

Mr G MICHALAKIS: Nelson Mandela Bay Metropolitan Municipality!

*IsiXhosa:*

Nks T WANA: Hayi kaloku la nto ikuMasipala oMbaxa iNelson Mandela Bay imoshwa kuTrollip. Wandikhumbuza kamnandi. Njengokuba bantu

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 37

baseBhayi nabona ukuba umntu ongcono yiloo Meya yiboneni namhlanje ukuba iyanixhaphaza. Jonga nala ngqushu yabo yala nto yenkazathi. Ummo wayo inkazathi asiyonto yambeko. Inkazathi iyaxabanisa kuba ngoku i-UDM ixabana ne-DA ngala nkazathi. Iyaxabanisa into yasenkazathini kuba kaloku omnye umntu ubeka ama-R10 omnye abeke i-5c kodwa lo une-5c afune ukutya ngaphezulu kwalo ubeke kakhulu. Inkazathi asiyonto ungakhe weyame kuyo. [Kwahlekwa.]

USIHLALO WENDLU (Mnu.A J Nyambi): Ukugalelana. Ukugalelana.

[Kwahlekwa.]

*English:*

Ms T WANA: Hon Chair, this is a caring department because it has managed to create jobs for those rural people who are not recognised by other parties. Through the Freedom Charter Clause that says, "the people shall govern", in the rural areas our province has created war rooms. In the war rooms, it where you sit with the traditional leaders, ward committees, departmental officials and councillors.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr.A J Nyambi): Hon Wana, can you take your seat? Hon Michalakis, why are you standing?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 38

Mr G MICHALAKIS: Thank you hon Chair, I would like whether hon Wana would take my question?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr.A J Nyambi): Hon Wana, are you ready to take a question from hon Michalakis? Order, hon members. Hon members, let us refrain from compromising the decorum of the House. Let us allow the hon member to respond whether she is ready to take a question or not. There is nothing out of order about what was said by hon Michalakis. Hon Wana, are you ready to take a question from hon Michalakis?

Ms T WANA: Chairperson, I humbly request hon Michalakis to send me an SMS because we are together in the committee. [Laughter.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr.A J Nyambi): She is not ready to take your question.

Ms T WANA: As I was saying Chairperson, it is very encouraging when it comes to the issue of the infrastructure ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr.A J Nyambi): Hon Wana, I am afraid as you can hear the noise, your time is up.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 39**

Ms T WANA: The ANC supports the Budget Vote, thank you Chairperson.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr.A J Nyambi): Hon members, before I call the next speaker, let me take this opportunity to apologise as you might have seen on the Order Paper that the IFP is written Inkatha Freedom Fighters. It is Inkatha Freedom Party. So, we are apologising. It is a mistake and we humbly apologise for that.

Mr M M CHABANGU: Hon Chairperson, NCOP members, and protocol observed. The EFF rejects Budget Vote 4 of the Department of Cooperative Governance and Traditional Affairs.

The local government sphere is synonymous with resource wastage, incompetence, and corruption. Local government is the focus of much of the often violent, anti-government protest action that has become such a feature of South Africa 23 years into its democracy.

The R73 billion allocated to this department is not sufficient to carry out the necessary development needed. And most of it will be channelled to Gupta ventures by Mr Van Rooyen.

But what is wrong with the local government sphere of government and why has the ANC failed to provide solutions to these seemingly

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 40

perennial problems? This first problem is the structure of local government itself, which constrains this sphere from performing development functions that it should be performing.

Local authorities have important powers to deliver water services, for example, but they are using the Jojos in order to benefit their friends even in Qhuthu, I have seen it.

Mr J M MTHETHWA: The hon members must not address me but must address the Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr.A J Nyambi): The point of order is sustained. You can speak through me hon Chabangu, so can you continue with the debate.

Mr M M CHABANGU: I have never addressed anybody in this meeting, maybe is afraid. In many respects, a system of centralised, top down local government has been continued out of the apartheid era into today. This leaves citizens with very little real influence on the priorities of their local government. That is why citizens get frustrated and end up leading often to violent protests, because they do not know what their local government is doing.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 41**

Secondly and we have raised this matter regularly, the percentage of the equitable share budget that goes to the local government sphere is ridiculously miniscule, relative to the amount and importance of work that municipalities have to do.

Linked to this, we must seriously start thinking beyond slogans about the desirability of keeping provinces as they are, interrogate the functions they play, and critically reflect if these are not an unnecessary sponge on our national revenue.

Thirdly, is the problem of corruption and how this gets condoned and promoted by the ANC? The fact that Eskom is the main culprit of state companies that owe municipalities is attributable to a belief amongst state institution now, that they can break the law, with impunity and the very presence of Mr Van Rooyen here as Minister is evidence of corruption.

He is one of many of ANC who have sold out their souls for a plate of curry. And he is never to be taken seriously in the fight against corruption and maladministration at a local government level

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 42

Mr M RAYI: Hon Chair, I am rising on a point of order. The hon member is raising a point of casting aspersion on the member without bringing a substantive motion.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr.A J Nyambi): Hon Chabagu, I am sustaining the point of order and refrain from casting aspersion about a hon member. Can you continue?

Mr M M CHABANGU: Maybe we don't understand what aspersions is

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr.A J Nyambi): Hon Chabangu?

Mr M M CHABANGU: It is mindboggling that the ANC has been so unashamed in publicly showing off their willingness to short-circuit government process for narrow and short political gains.

Why is it easy for the ANC to make unintelligible deals with the AIC to move Matatiele to KwaZulu-Natal from the Eastern Cape, while they have been dragging their feet in Limpopo in resolving the Malamulele issue? Mr Van Rooyen is prepared to manipulate the demarcation board processes in order to leverage short term gains and continue looting the municipalities they lead through coalitions with smaller parties.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 43**

Lastly, but not least government must not use traditional leaders, as they do in some areas, to push through illegal mine deals against the wishes of the people. History will judge one day

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr.A J Nyambi): Hon Chabangu, I am afraid, you have heard the watch. The time is up.

Mr M M CHABANGU: Let me just finish. The EFF wants municipalities that are developmental in nature, municipalities must be able to integrate and coordinate functions, to lead infrastructure development and deliver services to our people. It is sad that if the head is sick the whole body will fester with

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr.A J Nyambi): Hon members, what I have done to hon Chetty it were going to be unfair to not do it to hon Chabangu, so that is why I have decided to allow him to conclude. I have already apologised to the IFP and once again I am doing it.

Mr M KHAWULA: Hon Chairperson, hon Minister, and hon Deputy Minister, I want to start by congratulating the newly elected mayor of Nquthu municipality, Cllr. Mabilabila Kunene, the Deputy Mayor, Cllr. Nothile Zungu and the Speaker, Cllr. Mbongeni Mnguni.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 44**

I also wish to congratulate the newly elected Mayor of Umzinyathi District Municipality Cllr. Petros Ngubane, the Deputy Mayor, Cllr. Ntombikayise Mdlalose and the Speaker, Cllr. Felenkosini Sikhakhane.

It is a pity that both Nquthu and Umzinyathi had to wait close to a year before their establishment after the 2016 Local Government Elections. All this long wait because of the failure to concede defeat and accept the results of the elections as they were by some of the parties. The problems of Nquthu were not about a deadlock, but were created to give that picture. The sad part is that the district had to suffer just because of one of its municipalities which had not established. This warrants why parliament has to relook at the Municipal Systems Act and the Municipal Structures Act, so that we do not have a repeat of the same scenario elsewhere in the future in our country. It is sad when people use the positions of influence they occupy to suppress others. This must not happen in the name of democracy

The ushering in of local government in South Africa on 05 December 2000, was supposed to bring the much-required change in attempts to speed up local development of the local communities in the country. Instead of bringing to speed the much required local development, the system has brought with it lots of challenges. These include;

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 45**

challenges of corruption, expensive life for those in power at the expense of funds to be used for development; nepotism and favouritism, and lots of wasteful and irregular expenditure.

The IFP concedes that it is not the system that is wrong, but it is people who are in the system that are corrupting the system. This poses a challenge even in areas where there has been a change of power. If voters have decided to vote otherwise and change power because they were fed up with corruption, scandals, lack of development, and favouritism and other inefficiencies, this calls for those new in power to bring with them that much desired change.

If the new authorities in power bring with them the tendencies that led to the downfall of their predecessors, that will be a sad for South Africa. Therefore, the joy and glory of winning elections does not reside with the winning. The biggest challenge and joy thereafter is providing the much needed development and services after winning.

Municipalities in the country need to be channelled to spend more financial resources on services and development rather than on salaries. They need to spend more financial resources on services and development rather than on luxury vehicles for office bearers.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 46**

They need to spend more money on services, infrastructure development and other priorities rather than on VIP Protection for office bearers.

There is a lot of wastage in municipalities. This must be brought to an end. It is one of the reasons why the country is experiencing so much increase in protest actions by communities. A lot of money goes to waste instead of spending on the itching priorities in our communities.

The IFP is concerned that very little is spent by the department on traditional leaders. It does not show any recognition with respect, dignity and honour for the institution of Ubukhosi by government. The National House of Traditional Leaders, for the year 2017-2018 receives a mere R17,6 million out of total of R74,4 billion.

Out of this show of lip service reflected by the figures in rand and cents, where is reflection of respect for traditional leaders in this country. Even in Local Government governance, traditional leaders are participants with no voting rights. They are actually as good as observers who are given the right to comment. This must be corrected through legislation as promised in the past. I thank you.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 47

Mr M D MONAKEDI: Hon Chairperson, hon Minister and Deputy Minister, hon Chief Whip of the National Council of Provinces, hon members, special delegates ladies and gentlemen, one of Africa's foremost anticolonial leaders and an outstanding leader of African liberation, Amilcar Cabral, in *Unity and Struggle* says, and I quote: "Do not confuse the reality you live in with the ideas you have in your head". Again, former President Thabo Mbeki, in a speech titled "The Historical Injustice", delivered at a seminar in Ottawa, Canada, in 1978 which was published in Sechaba, ANC Publications, begins by reasserting the point, and I quote:

To understand South Africa we must appreciate the fact and fix it firmly in our minds that here we are dealing with a class society ravaged by long years of apartheid neglect.

It is this ideological posture and construct that informed the founding principles of the ANC's democratic policy framework ready to govern, which declared that, and I quote:

Sovereignty vests in the people of South Africa. Their will shall be expressed by their democratically elected representatives in periodic free and fair elections. These

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 48**

elected representatives will adopt a constitution which shall be the highest law of the land guaranteeing their basic rights.

The goal of the ANC, ever since it was formed in 1912, has been to give all the people of our country the chance to choose their own government. It is this proclamation, which found concise and instructive expression from the Congress of the People in 1955 when it declared in the Freedom Charter that the people shall govern. It is this proclamation that finds resonance in the programmes and initiatives of our democratic government to ensure that the masses of our people remain in the forefront of our democracy. It instructs us to avoid at all costs being unprincipled, ideologically dissonant and susceptible to traitors of the will and struggles of our people.

Since the launch of the Back to Basics programme, we have noticed a marked improvement by municipalities across all five pillars of the Back to Basics programme. We have seen improvements in most districts in terms of service delivery, good governance, sound financial management, putting people first, and building the necessary capacity. A key set of indicators to monitor and evaluate the programme on a quarterly and monthly basis, should be in place to ensure rapid responses to critical issues in our municipalities.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 49**

As we move to the second phase of the Back to Basics programme, the main focus of the department should be on consolidating stable, functional and developmental local government systems to address the spatial injustices that continue to define the development landscape of our local government institutions. Through this phase of Back to Basics, the department should be able to respond to the call by the President to ensure that: One, township roads and streets are tarred and repaired; two, the bucket system is eradicated and that all hostels are turned into family units; and three, also address and prevent illegal land invasions and growth of informal settlements.

The ongoing viability of municipalities over the medium and longer terms is a matter that requires more dedicated attention and energy as we go forward. It should remain of utmost importance that our municipalities are able to perform all their functions, as per the Constitution. Only when they are in this space can they render sustainable services to their communities. A number of critical actions should be undertaken to ensure that our municipalities remain financially viable. The department should relook at municipal organisational structures to ensure that municipalities focus on core services in the most cost effective way. They must also ensure that municipalities focus on collecting all revenue that is due to them.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 50**

Many municipalities that have debt repayment plans with Eskom do not have the capacity to honour those agreements. The continuous defaulting by some councillors highlights the poor financial management mechanisms in local government, despite residents paying for their services. Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs should therefore partner with the National Treasury, Public Enterprises and SA Local Government Association, Salga, in finding lasting solutions for those defaulting municipalities, and also assist municipalities in recovering debt that is owed to them by national and provincial departments, which is estimated at R100 billion.

For the past five years, Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs envisaged to introduce the Bill called Intergovernmental Monitoring, Support and Intervention Bill to further improve local government performance. The Bill provides a legislative framework for effective interventions by provinces and national government in municipalities that need assistance. Currently, there is no national legislation regulating interventions in provinces and municipalities. The department should urgently expedite introducing this Bill through the parliamentary processes. If it is passed into law, it will give the Minister powers to set down regulations regarding certain aspects of interventions such as: Prescribing the

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 51**

role of the administrator, defining parameters for early warning systems and broadening the interventions environment to include conditions for support measures. These elements will collectively boost the ability of the department to progressively strengthen the governance and institutional arrangements of the state as these in turn will form the bedrock on which accelerated service delivery can be planned and executed.

The Local Government: Municipal Structures Act of 1998 provides for the participation of recognised traditional leaders in municipal councils. In participating, they are bound by the code of conduct for councillors, but do not have voting rights and do not become councillors. The fact that traditional leaders participate in rural and urban councils creates its own dynamics and municipalities often require assistance in this regard. In cases where traditional leaders participate in municipalities, concerns have been raised about the lack of clarity of roles.

The Department of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs should provide guidelines for the participation of traditional leaders in municipal councils, and how they can contribute in terms of local government development. The White Paper on Traditional Leadership and Governance and the Traditional Leadership and

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 52**

Governance Framework Act of 2003 aimed to transform the institution of traditional leadership so that, indeed, they can play that role of contributing towards the development of their areas.

In the given time, it will defeat the purpose of this input to outline all the issues that require attention in local government than to address just a few strategic issues and then later we can lift up some other issues for priority attention. I therefore suggest that as the NCOP, when we engage in the oversight programmes like Taking Parliament to the People and other oversight programmes like the Provincial Week, we should then utilise those opportunities to provide tailored support to all the municipalities that are in need of support.

Informed by the need to have viable municipalities, from time to time, it becomes necessary to revisit the existence or otherwise of some of our municipalities. During the last local government term of office, in Limpopo, in the Capricorn District, Aganang Municipality was disestablished and it was received by Polokwane, Blouberg and Molemole Municipalities. In Limpopo again, in the Sekhukhune District, Fetakgomo Municipality merged with Greater Tubatse. In the Waterberg District in Limpopo, Modimolle Municipality merged with Mookgopong. There were no changes in the Mopani District. In the

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 53**

Vhembe District, Mutale Municipality was disestablished and it was received by Thulamela, Makhado and Musina Municipalities. In all these areas, the process of redetermination went very smoothly. For that we want to congratulate all the role-players including the Minister and the Presidency.

In Vhembe District, a new municipality was established and is made up of parts of the wards from Thulamela, Mutale and Makhado Municipalities, amongst others. We have all noted the dissatisfaction, and at times violent protests, about some of the boundary changes in Vuwani. We are aware that at the level of government, the Inter-Ministerial Committee has been established to deal with this matter and we want to call upon government to make sure that they work harder to make sure that this matter is indeed laid to rest.

As I conclude, I want to end with the words of the former President Thabo Mbeki when he said, and I quote:

We believe that we must stand together in creating the new South Africa. When our work is done, let all look at the new South Africa with hope and encouragement - hope and encouragement because she will have demonstrated that it is

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 54

possible for the people of different colours and different races and nationalities to live together in peace and in friendship, sharing a common sense of nationhood and humanity.

The Africa National Congress supports this Budget Vote. Thank you.  
[Applause.]

Mr G MICHALAKIS: Chair, on a point of order, I just want to inquire whether all opposition party members are also going to get two minutes extra.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Michalakis, you are taking a chance. I've been consistent. I've started with hon Chetty. I've done it with hon Chabangu and I've done it now with hon Monakedi. Therefore, all of them because they don't have time irrespective of political affiliation, they have got the same treatment. Now, let me invite the hon member of the executive council, MEC, of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs from Mpumalanga, hon Mtshweni.

Ms R M MTSHWENI: Hon House Chairperson, Mr Nyambi, hon Minister of Cooperative Governance and traditional Affairs, Cogta, Mr van Rooyen, hon Deputy Minister, Mr Bapela, the National House of

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 55**

Traditional Leaders, Deputy Chairperson, uNdabezitha, Inkosi Mahlangu, hon members of the National Council of Provinces, esteemed members of the SA Local Government Association, distinguished guests, ladies and gentleman, the Minister of Cogta, hon van Rooyen must be commended for tabling a thorough Budget Vote that seeks to give a meaningful contribution to the transformation of municipal spaces for radical socioeconomic development. His commitment for the implementation of the Back to Basics programme is a crucial lever for the achievement of this target.

I would like to assure him and this august House that the Provincial Department of Cooperative Governance and Traditional Affairs in Mpumalanga is poised to make this commitment a reality.

The Minister's eloquent expression that local government should be in the hands of our citizens resonates so well with the implementation of the Integrated Municipal Support Plan. The Integrated Municipal Support Plan, IMSP, was adopted by the Provincial Executive Council in 2014 as a pillar of support for the B2B. Since the establishment of the service delivery model, Operation Vuka Sisebente, we have launched 383 war rooms out of 400 in support of public participation.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 56**

We are poised to ensure that all wards have war rooms with local council of stakeholders that address service delivery concerns raised by community members at ward level. We are rolling out a programme of the tools of trade in a form of furniture, and have thus far supported 100 war rooms.

This programme will ensure that the council of stakeholders which comprises the Community Development Workers, CDWs, ward council members, representatives of traditional leaders and all other local co-ordinators are enabled with the relevant tools to reach all government institutions whose responsibility is to unblock service delivery bottlenecks.

We will roll this out to additional war rooms in the 2017-18 financial year. Ward committees are a cornerstone for public participation in local government. A total of 143 were established in Nkangala whilst 127 were established in Gert Sibande and lastly, 129 were established in Ehlanzeni District.

The establishment of ward committees is a legislative imperative that gives effect to the Local Government Municipal Structures and Systems Acts. Three hundred and ninety nine wards have already been provided with training programmes, with a focus on the Code of

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 57**

Conduct, development of ward operational plans and the roles and responsibilities of ward committee members.

The provision of basic services is a constitutional imperative and our people will appreciate the fact that the ANC-led administration is sparring no effort in its resolve to make this a reality. The recorded milestone achievement announced by Minister van Rooyen in his budget speech, where in municipalities in Mpumalanga have spent 72,4% of the Municipal Infrastructure Grant allocation attest to this.

Notably, 939 959 of the 1 075 488 households in Mpumalanga province had access to piped water in 2011. The latest 2016 Community Survey report depicts an increase in the number of households with access to water. Currently, about 88% of our people have access to water in the province. The number will definitely be increased as we double our efforts to attain the target of access to water by all households, as envisaged in the National Development Plan Vision 2030.

Our collaborative efforts to increase the number of households with access to electricity continue to produce the desired outcome, a

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 58**

total number of 1 827 households benefitted from the electricity project implemented by Cogta in the 2016-17 financial year.

In addition to this, Eskom and municipalities have connected 32 559 households in the province during the 2016-17 financial year whilst 58 693 indigents are receiving free 50 Kilowatt hours per household on a monthly basis. This is full proof of the African proverb that two ants do not fail to pull a grasshopper.

Minister van Rooyen's concern about excessive growth of debt owed by municipalities is not misplaced. Equally, we are concerned about the pandemic culture of non payment of services that contribute to the R117 billion debts owed to municipalities, some of which are in Mpumalanga.

This exacerbates the daunting task of municipalities of servicing the Eskom debt, not only in Mpumalanga but countrywide. We look forward to the positive outcome of the established national task team on government debt as we pursue a long term solution on this matter.

In Mpumalanga, we are working closely with the National Treasury and the private sector as we implement the smart metering solution

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 59**

provided by Eskom to address the deficiencies related to electricity distribution operations. This will further improve the accuracy of tariffs charged and reduce the huge amount of unaccounted for electricity consumption that usually result in an enormous electricity loss.

We are confident that during 2017-18 all municipalities that were previously in the bad books of Eskom shall reclaim a position of good standing and eliminate uncertainties associated with power cuts for the communities. We have embarked on a programme to mobilise the public and private sector as well as communities to pay for services.

This attempt seeks to avert the potential risk of rendering the fourth local government administration dysfunctional.

When the ANC-led government prioritised the fight against the triple effects of poverty, inequality and unemployment, consideration was made to allocate resources for this cause. This commitment is bearing the desired outcomes.

Communities in rural areas under the jurisdiction of traditional leaders bear the brunt of the triple effect of poverty, inequality

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 60**

and unemployment. With the support of the National Department of Cogta, under the leadership of Minister van Rooyen, we are pleased that 1 867 job opportunities were created against the set target of 1 851 in 17 Traditional Councils in Mpumalanga. The implementation of the CWP will undoubtedly cushion the poorest of the poor against the grinding effects of poverty.

As I conclude, we are inspired by the determination demonstrated by the Minister in the Budget Vote speech to confront the stubborn challenges and obstacles faced by municipalities. This gives hope that the transformation of municipal space for radical socioeconomic development is possible. As Mpumalanga, the place of the rising sun, we support the Budget Vote. I thank you. [Applause.]

Mr L B GAEHLER: Hon Chairperson, smaller and rural based municipalities are struggling to operate and maintain their infrastructure in a cost-effective and sustainable manner. As a consequence, there is rapid deterioration of assets, followed by catastrophic component failure, and regular and prolonged disruptions in service delivery.

In general, municipalities continue to be characterised by the following: An infrastructure whose life cycle scenario can be

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 61**

described as run to destruction because of a total lack of routine and preventative maintenance. The unfortunate outcome is premature asset failure. Asset registers that are not up to date, which makes it difficult to trace missing plant and equipment.

With proper service infrastructure, municipalities will always, as is the case, experience the following, amongst others, collapse in general and rendering of services to the community; procedures that are either not, or wrongly implemented in the recruitment of personnel; irregular and deficiencies with procurement procedures, resulting in rampant corruption; leakages and overflowing of water and sewerage systems; and lack of consultation and cooperation between the municipalities, the business sector and the communities.

The Back to Basic Programme as initially conceived was amongst others; intended to decisively address these fundamentals of service delivery.

Accordingly, the UDM suggests the following: An infrastructure-led growth with deliberate investment in socioeconomic infrastructure in particular roads and general community assets; a thorough assessment and evaluation of the mandate, the role, effectiveness and efficiency of the Municipal Development Agencies. This process must

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 62**

lead to the redesign and support of these agencies so that they are able to play this critical role of helping municipalities to deliver on their constitutional mandate. Amongst these is the expansion of the revenue base of municipalities that will respond to the current challenge of a limited fiscal base. The Department Cogta should facilitate and establish an institutional and structural symbiotic relationship between Statistics SA and municipalities so that the scientific data at Statistics SA is appreciated and informs Integrated Development Plans of municipalities at ward level.

In order to achieve these, UDM suggest that department must have a political and administrative stability so that the frequent leadership change, there seems to be fashionable in this Ministry and department comes to an end.

The inconsistency between the Minister's visions as set-out in the strategic plan as against the assessment of the last 16 years of the democratic local government by the acting head of department must not be tolerated as they are misleading and have the dire consequence for success of the Operation Back to Basics. I thank you. [Applause.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 63

Mr M MNQASELA: Chairperson, hon Ministers, hon MECs, hon members, the people of South Africa, last week's devastating fires and storms left us all wondering, but more so when I visited Knysna. I could see sombre as I walked in. I could not believe that so much was destroyed. It felt like it was a period after war, although we have not experienced war in this country. That was one incident that left me wondering what we should do together as South Africans, especially in this province, to rebuild the lives of the people in Knysna.

I just want to call on everybody present to understand that this is a matter that should unite all of us beyond political lines, more so, when we call for help. We call on every person to participate, from the national government, provincial government to locality so that we can rebuild and help the communities to start from where they last had a life. It is very difficult to start from losing everything to rebuilding the life you once had. Nothing will be the same after all of this.

We wish the communities of Knysna and the entire Southern Cape well and strength, as they rebuild their lives. We know that life will never be the same, but we are looking forward and we know that tomorrow is better than yesterday.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 64**

We're facing various challenges in the Western Cape. Besides the devastating fires, as highlighted above, we're also dealing with the worst drought since the turn of the 20th century. To address this, we've been equipping new boreholes and connecting to the reservoir and pipe network in the Laingsburg Municipality as well as ensuring that we invest in areas like Algeria. We drilled boreholes at a cost of R1,8 million. In Tulbagh, we drilled two boreholes at an amount of R2 million. We have also allocated R2 million to awareness programmes to ensure that people understand that, while we face the droughts, ours is to ensure that we save the little that we have. That is the culture we are busy imparting through these programmes by the Western Cape government.

It is imperative that we keep in mind that this department in the Western Cape receives only R249 million, which also includes disaster management funding. You would recall that when we dealt with the national disaster management, some of the issues that we raised as a province, in our negotiating mandate were that you must couple this with funding. The legislation must not exist alone. It must be met with the costing that it deserves.

The saddest part of that legislation is that it, in the objects of the Bill, highlighted a number of areas that needed to be fixed, but

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 65**

as the Bill was concluded and the costing was done, it stated that 25% must be funded by the national Treasury and 75% by municipalities. I don't know whether hon Minister Van Rooyen, through you Chair, understood the kind of effect and the impact this would have on municipalities, especially the far-flung and the most distressed municipalities.

Let me get to the following issues. We have therefore welcomed the Premier of the Western Cape, Ms Helen Zille's, response to declare the entire province a disaster zone, to avoid "day zero". This has now placed us in a position to immediately accelerate initiatives to ensure that our taps, especially in hospitals and schools do not run dry. [Interjections.] It also presents us with an opportunity to prioritise interventions based on the provincial Drought Risk Register. Furthermore, we have to now, across the province and various government spheres, find innovative and sustainable solutions to this key challenge.

We can make excuses and blame each other, but nobody creates a drought. A drought is a natural disaster. It is only when you deal with a drought, when the response and approach that you take define those who are useless and those who are useful. In this province, we

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 66

have seen Ms Helen Zille, the leader of this province, doing exactly what she needed to do.

*IsiXhosa:*

Asikathethi ngotata uZuma ekwakufanele ukuba kudala namxotha kodwa nisamgcinile.

*English:*

The Western Cape has a vision of creating an efficient and dynamic team that enables well-governed municipalities to deliver services to communities in a responsive, sustainable and integrated manner. It is because of this reason that we place emphasis on local governance, so that all residents are able to access government services, while ensuring active community participation. We govern with the people, for the people, by the people. We don't believe in this Mickey Mouse democracy we hear people talk about in some quarters, at the expense of the people - stealing money from the people. In case you don't know, it is the ANC that does that.

Before I continue highlighting the importance of active community participation, I need to take a moment and congratulate our Western Cape team from the Department of Local Government for not only delivering services but going beyond that and being innovative about

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 67

service delivery. In any local government, for it to work, you need to have three components. You need to have the council, the administration, but more so, you need the people. The tripartite relationship is very important. In doing that, what we have seen is that committees and public meetings alone do work, but to some extent. To take it a bit further, the Department of Local Government in the Western Cape came up with an APP, which is called Theta Nathi-APP.

*IsiZulu:*

Khuluma nathi

*English:*

Talk to us.

Those are the kind of initiatives that we have. It is the first of its kind in the entire Africa as a continent. So, we are not talking about South Africa now and we are not even competing locally because there is no competition. So, let us all try and come up with creative means in bringing services to the people. We have piloted this programme in Laingsburg Municipality, Langeberg, ...

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 68

Mr M T MHLANGA: Hon Chairperson, I just want to ascertain whether the member on the podium is ready to take a question.

*IsiXhosa:*

Mnu M MNQASELA: Xa ndigqibileyo ungathetha.

*English:*

We have piloted this programme in the five municipalities of Laingsburg, Langeberg, Overstrand, Oudtshoorn and Swartland.

[Interjections.] Yes, in Oudtshoorn. We are fixing it because the ANC broke every part of government there. [Interjections.] We are fixing it. When we won there in a by-election and thereafter in a general election on 3 August 2016, we said, ...

*Afrikaans:*

... die poppe gaan dans in Oudtshoorn.

*English:*

We are not going to sit back and watch. We will fix it. The former mayor, the ANC mayor has recently been found guilty and sentenced to five years in prison. We don't recycle thieves; we send thieves where they belong. We don't do like other parties that recycle thieves and promote thuggery. We deal with thieves and we

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 69

congratulate the judiciary for being very clear and decisive on this matter. Thieves are thieves. They must go to jail.

Let me ...

HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr.A J Nyambi): Conclude.

Mr M MNQASELA: As I conclude, we have 25 clean audits out of 30 municipalities. That is something to celebrate. We want to measure the impact of the clean audit and we are in the process of doing that.

I just want to tell South Africans that we are coming to your province in 2019. All of you will enjoy the best services that you deserve from the government of the Democratic Alliance. [Applause.]

*IsiXhosa:*

Cllr B STOFILE: Sihlalo weNdlu weBhunga laMaphondo leSizwe...

*English:*

... Deputy Chair, hon Chief Whip, Minister and Deputy Minister of the Department of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs, Cogta, MECs from different provinces, members of the NCOP, it is a

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 70**

great pleasure to us as the SA Local Government Association, Salga to stand before you and say a few words on the Budget Vote of the Minister of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs.

On behalf of Salga and myself, let me at the outset join the Minister of Cogta and express our condolences to the families that lost their loved ones in the recent extreme weather conditions experienced in our country, as well as due to fire experiences in the Eastern and Western Cape. We appreciate the Minister of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs. I think you subscribe to one of the philosophers in the Asian countries, who once said:

When a dark cloud appears on the sky, we always point out that the darkness is temporarily. The darkness will pass, the sunshine will rise.

In interacting with us as Salga, having experienced in local government the death through the storms and the fires in various communities, you stood with us and engaged us because those conditions were happening in local government and not anywhere else in the sky. Chair, may I also appreciate and thank the opportunity that the Salga Conference indeed requested and debated the issue

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 71**

pertaining to the Minister's Budget Vote with regard to the remuneration of councillors.

Indeed, we were part of the debate on the traditional leaders of our country when they raised a call and challenge pertaining to the remuneration of public office bearers. We applaud and support the suggestion made by Minister that there is a need to review this remuneration of local public office bearers. Salga acknowledges the ex gratia payment to former councillors.

After the August 2016 elections we lost many councillors who had gone home. The significant ex gratia paid to them is appreciated. We now say that it is important to focus on improving that system. However, to ensure that municipalities are able to meet the expectation set in terms of both the international and local initiatives, municipalities must be capacitated to do this, not only required internal financial and human resources capital in municipalities, but the reaffirmation of all spheres of government to the principle of decentralisation. It is of concern that a number of policy positions previously taken, have not been implemented.

I want to specifically refer the NCOP to the following: The powers and functions of the three spheres of government should be reviewed

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 72**

to provide greater clarity and facilitate more effective service delivery and development; there should be a differentiation local government model which must include differentiation in scope of Integrated Development Plans, IDPs, funding support and capacity building; and devolution of certain provincial functions to stronger municipalities.

In this regard, especially in line with the recommendation of the Integrated Urban Development Framework, IUDF, Salga recommends that the entire basket of functions that are necessary for the reconfiguration of the build environment and the eradication of apartheid spatial legacy be developed to the local government sphere as it is the case with municipal planning with particular emphasis on human settlement; public transport planning and infrastructure; water and sanitation including bulk electricity reticulation; and distribution of energy underdeveloped and holdings that are owned by the state and state-owned enterprises.

We recognise that this will not only require a holistic review of our system of local government but also the funding mechanism for local government. This will require a share bigger than the current 9% to the national fiscus to be made available to the local government sphere. Therefore, a total review of the current grant

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 73**

system for the municipalities is imperative. Work on the grant review is currently being done and should be supported. We should innovatively consider new funding models for municipalities including options such as pooled fund mechanism and others.

Greater focus be placed on integrated planning and municipal IDP should form the basis for development in specific municipal localities. No organs of state should be allowed to spend on commitments that are not aligned and reflected in all IDPs of municipalities. As such, we need a government-wide approach towards urbanisation, local economic development and in particular, Small Town Regeneration project should be discarded. In this regard, a regional focus encompassing a full regional economy can benefit individuals and local municipalities.

Salga has initiated the Karoo Development project with regionally-based local economic development initiatives covering four provinces: Western Cape, Northern Cape, Free State and Eastern Cape. A national conference to formally launch this initiative will be on 10 and 11 July in De Aar in the Northern Cape.

Salga concurs with the hon Minister that the involvement of traditional leaders in municipal councils should be more productive.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 74**

It is our view that traditional leaders and municipalities should work collectively to ensure the smooth implementation of the Spatial Planning and Land Use Management Act as it is an important tool in the eradication of apartheid spatial patterns.

Chairperson, Salga also welcomes the support that will be provided to municipalities with regard to the indigent register. We are of the view that the collaboration of Sars and other institutions in this regard, will result in more credible indigent register and will contribute to better revenue management in municipalities.

An area of concern with regard to the financial status of municipalities is the low payment level in a number of municipalities and the resultant inability to service their debts in particular, to the bulk services provider. Although the national Task Team on Government Debt is making progress in resolving the historical debt and government departments have made commitments to adhere to the current debt, but debt owed to municipalities by national and provincial sector departments remains a concern.

Government must lead by example and not only encourage communities to pay for services rendered, but should also honour its own commitments. The debt owed to Eskom and water bonds by

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 75**

municipalities must be addressed in a holistic manner. The Inter-Ministerial Task Team attending to the constitutional aspect of the distribution and more particularly, the reticulation of electricity should also focus on the structural and systemic aspects relating to electricity provision. This includes the requirement to clarify the role of municipalities in renewable energy.

The current tariff increase application of Eskom should also be considered carefully as it will have dire consequences for the financial position of already struggling municipalities and their communities. Salga urges all parties to follow Intergovernmental Government Relations, IGR Framework in resolving their dispute instead of relying on courts to resolve them.

Let me conclude by saying, local government under the auspices of the leadership of Salga, working together with the Minister of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs believes that we can push mountains and achieve goals that we have set ourselves because service is required in communities and not boardrooms. Thank you.

[Time expired.] [Applause.]

Ms B A ENGELBRECHT: Hon Chair, local government primarily aims to interact with communities to deliver services and infrastructure.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 76**

Therefore, local government must be effective as this is where we make a difference to our people.

However, this department has failed miserably; plan after plan, Back to Basics; five pillars of governance and then the 10-Point plan. We then had eight strategic goals and 12 strategic objectives. In spite of war rooms, platforms, planning and pages filled with objectives, the principles of good governance are failing as ANC cadres abuse the coffers of municipalities, fleecing residents of much needed services to fatten their own purses.

Minister, your biggest goal is to get the CWP training accredited, which is honourable. But why don't you rather focus on training the officials not to just spend more money but to spend it correctly in the residents so that they can see that money instead of making their pockets fat and fuller, running syndicates and scams?

I'll use a few examples from Tshwane where the DA inherited a city filled with family-related tenderpreneurs, a R2 billion deficit and R4 billion in suspicious tenders. The ANC refurbished the mayoral house, originally at R1,2 million which went up to R12 million. Yet, the house is only valued at R5 million. Yes, you can ask what happened to all that money, and I'll tell you what happened to it.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 77**

There was a refurbishment contract of R132 million which involved the city hall; R100 million later and the city hall is destroyed, and R90 million had disappeared.

The DA has uncovered massive corruption, gross misconduct and wasteful expenditure with over-inflated prices on tenders. The ANC administration paid R300 per light bulb that would cost you and me just R70. Cartridges that would cost me R300 were invoiced for R5 000 each; small water bottles at R20 each. Other inflated items included the list that goes on and on: Handy Andy, Sunlight Liquid soap, paint, shovels, and toolboxes. I can give you a long list.

Hon Monakedi, you spoke about needing more time; medium budget and longer budget. Yet, you have had 22 years to make the difference. But what do we see? We see theft from our municipalities and stealing from our people who should be getting services.

In Tshwane a new house was built to replace the Tshwane house that was burnt down. The officials from the Speaker are refusing to move into this new fancy building. Why? Because they don't have their own offices but have open plan offices. The argument is that they cannot close the doors and use the fridges that were provided to them by the previous municipality. They can't see residents. Their role is

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 78**

not to see residents but to support the Speaker! Their role is not to use fridges but to work! Therefore, they do not want to be in an open plan office but their own offices. This is shocking for local governance. You should be ashamed!

What does the DA do, because that's the question? It is only in the DA-governed province that you will see the amazing effort that was made by the disaster team. I want to congratulate the hon Mngasela for the absolute amazing and immense effort that they put into their rescue operations and the City of Tshwane for selling the mansion that cost us R12 million; opening the bid adjudication process and making tenders open and available to the public; and ensuring accountability by having crime syndicates investigated.

Only under a DA-led government will we see the money of local government going to the residents and being accountable. I thank you. [Time expired.] [Applause.]

Mr M T MHLANGA: Hon Chairperson, hon Ministers, special delegates and all protocol observed, we are all participating in this policy debate eight months after the 2016 local government elections. Also we are participating in this 2017 policy debates in the year that has been declared as the year of Oliver Tambo. Reflections on the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 79

character of ANC stalwart Oliver Reginald Tambo who for many embodied the ethos of an intellectual revolutionary; those who knew comrade Oliver Reginald Tambo were struck not just by his ability as a strategic thinker, but by his towering intellectual prowess evidencing knowledge of a broad and extensive range of interests and issues. I too, was awestruck upon first meeting the legendary leader in Angola during 1986 when he visited our uMkhonto weSizwe, MK, Camps, by then I was deployed as the acting Chief Logistic in Viyana Camp, which was the transit camp. He was for many young activists of our generation a political and intellectual enigma and an inspiration. The name O R Tambo was shouted during ...

[Interjections.]

Mr M M CHABANGU: Chairperson, I am standing to ask my friend a question.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): No, you cannot ask. You must first ascertain whether he is ready to take a question.

Mr M M CHABANGU: He is ready to take a question.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): I will assist you with that.

Hon Mhlanga, are you ready to take a question?

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 80**

Mr M T MHLANGA: Oh! Usually after I have finished my speech, he knows where we meet. Thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): No, he is not ready to take your question.

Mr M T MHLANGA: The name O R Tambo was shouted during fevered anti apartheid protests in the streets of the townships, and chanted in unison during our community meetings. His name was evoked as we sang in the face of police brutality, inside prisons and in the interrogation rooms. His name meant loyalty, humility and never giving up the struggle for our freedom or sacrificing our principles. I too later learned to appreciate the complexity and thoughtfulness of our leader O R Tambo, but above all, like many millions of others I understood his humility to be the most important aspect of how a leader unites people.

I have mentioned comrade Oliver Tambo to show importance of unity and co-operative governance within our legislative systems. Today South Africa is faced with several contradictions that go against the values comrade O R spoke of in his speeches. Unity above all was one of the most ardent calls he made in his speeches.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 81**

Hon, minister, allow me to extend as an ANC, tried and tested cadre of uMkhonto weSizwe which is currently referred to as the uMkhonto weSizwe Military Veterans, MKMVA, my congratulations for you being re-elected as the Treasure of the our revolutionary association the Umkhonto Wesizwe Military Veterans.

As the minister of Co-Operative Governance and Traditional Affairs, Cogta, and revolutionary cadre who has been tried and tested, we are confident that you are a calibre of a revolutionary cadre, a Minister who is equal to the task of delivering on our local government policies, ANC conference resolutions and local elections Manifesto on Local Government, Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs.

Since 1994, the ANC led government has passed legislations aimed at transforming the apartheid segregated colonial systems of local government. Central to policies passed, is the transformative agenda of ensuring consultative, participatory, transparent and accountable local government at municipal level. Our constitution recognises and provides that apartheid has fundamentally damaged the spatial, social and economic environment, in which people live, work, raise families, and seek to fulfil their aspirations. The Constitution stipulates that local government has a critical role to play in

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 82**

rebuilding local communities and environments, as a basis for a democratic, integrated, prosperous and truly non racial society.

The Constitution of the Republic of South Africa and the White Paper mandates local governments to promote democratic and accountable government for local communities; ensure the provision of services to communities in a sustainable manner; promote social and economic development; promote a safe and health environment; encourage the involvement of communities and community organisations in the matters of local government.

The Select Committee on Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs engaged the department on 2017- 2018 Annual Performance Plan, APP, and budget allocation and resolve to support this Budget Vote number 4

The select committee engaged the department on matters related to the Electricity Supply Commission, Eskom debts, departmental debts to the municipalities, enforcements of bylaws, revenue collections and billing system, capacity building at municipal level and local economic development While we acknowledge the debts of sister departments to the municipalities and community residences, we have also noted the private sectors debts which are inconsistently billed

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 83

lesser charges than our historical disadvantaged communities. The successful enforcement of bylaws will depend on implementation of an effective and efficient billing system, enforced by law enforcement officers capable to perform their tasks.

On revenue collection, it is important to strengthen to capacity and partnership with private sector and encourage sharing of best practice. For example, the municipality of eMalahleni in Mpumalanga in collaboration with private sector, security companies in particular the Red Ants Company on matters related to prevention ...

*Setswana:*

Moh N P KONI: Modulasetilo, ke kopa gore o ntlhotlhomisetse gore a sebui mo podiamong a se ka tsaya potso.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Mhlanga, are you ready to take a question from hon Koni.

Mr M T MHLANGA: I am not prepared Chair. Not now thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): He is not ready.

*Setswana:*

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 84**

Moh N P KONI: Ke utlwile, Modulasetilo. K ne ke botsa fela gore a sebui ga se battle go nwa metsi?

Mr M T MHLANGA: ... related to prevention of land invasion, personal security, including the protection of mayors, councillors and the council meter reading and electricity reading for revenue collection purposes.

Hon Minister, the establishment of effective municipal courts will complement the role played by law enforcement officers - peace officers to enforce the bylaws.

The eMalahleni Local Municipality revenue enhancement initiatives to ensure that Eskom bill is paid implemented the following revenue strategy: dedicated credit control teams since the appointment of the Red Ants to execute the municipal disconnections of defaulting customers we saw a remarkable improvement in our payment rate. This went up from 63% to more than 85% in one month. The Red Ants have been phased in and have targeted so far four of the local municipality suburbs. They are now been extended to four suburbs during January up to June. From middle January, areas with extremely low payments such as Rietspruit have also been targeted. With the roll-out programme all of the more affluent areas and business

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 85

sector a negative cash flow positions is projected to change to positive shift - a movement in additional operational income of R650 million over the next months.

The co-operation by the South African Police Service, SAPS, and joint operations are also assisting. The removal of illegal connection is also progressing according to the service delivery plan. [Interjections.]

Mr F ESSACK: Hon Chairperson, I just want to check through you if my mzala [cousin] [Interjections.] ... the hon member on the podium ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Dlamini, you are joining the list on the last warning. I saw what you did. Continue hon Essack.

Mr F ESSACK: ... she is blocking the way sir. Hon Chairperson with due respect through you, will the hon member just take a simple question?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Mhlanga, are you ready to take a question from hon Essak?

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 86**

Mr M T MHLANGA: Chair, unfortunately this policy debate is very important for our people at home. I am not ready for now.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): He is not ready. Take your seat.

Mr M T MHLANGA: Hon Chairperson, the main customers are been approached individually and the CFO with the Municipal Manager, Mr Van Vuuren are also busy with personal follow ups to clear disputes and to unlock R200 million tied up in that respect.

On legislative framework the Provincial Legislature is expected to develop mechanisms on how Provincial Executive Organs of State will account including how the Provincial Legislature will do Oversight on Provincial Executive Authority section 114 chapter 2.

Section 115(a) stipulates the powers of provincial legislature or any of its committees to summon any person to appear before it.

Section 133 paragraph two clearly outlines those members of the Executive Council of the province collectively and individually are accountable to the legislature.

The role of interventions, chapter 7 of our Constitution on local government, states of Municipality section 152 ... [Interjections.]

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 87**

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Mhlanga, you are allowed to quickly conclude.

Mr M T MHLANGA: ... by concluding I will of course emphasize the following Bills to be considered. The intervention Bill that we are looking at Minister because we - of courses I think you will get my statement. We have stipulated challenges that we are coming across when doing these interventions. We would really appreciate that you speed up the Bill of intervention including the Khoisan and the Traditional Affairs Bill. As the ANC we support this Budget Vote. Thank you. [Time expired.]

The MINISTER OF COOPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: Let me thank you once more, House Chair, but also allow me to pass my words of gratitude to all the submissions that have been made. It is just unfortunate that, because of time restrictions, I won't be able to touch on all of them. Let me indicate that I fully concur with the submission that suggests that the functionality of the local government is a crucial aspect. I agree with this statement, House Chair because, the local government, as you are aware, it is where our approach - there are some people who are disturbing me this side.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 88

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon members, the hon Minister is protected ... [Interjections.] Don't do that. Can you continue hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF COOPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: The functionality of the local government sector is our preoccupation as the cooperative governance and traditional affairs, Cogta. We do this because we understand that the local government should be made to work for our people. Our people know the government and its services through the local government system. I must also indicate that our unitary and developmental government system will make or break at a local government level. Hence, we have embarked upon ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): I am sorry, hon Minister; let me deal with hon Koni. Hon Koni, why are you standing?

*Setswana:*

Moh N P KONI: Ke emela ntlha ya kgalemo, Modulasetilo. Ke kopa gore o ntlhotlhomisetse gore a leloko le le mo podiamong le ka tsaya potso?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 89

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): hon Minister, are you ready to take a question from hon Koni?

*Setswana:*

TONA YA TIRISANOMMOGO YA PUSO LE MERERO YA SETSO: Ka bo madimabe nako ga e a ata, kapa ga e ntsi.

*Setswana:*

Moh N P KONI: Ke kopa gore re e direle mafelo a beke a a kgethegileng, Tona.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): No, hon Koni, the hon Minister is clear that if the time allows, he would take the question. So, let's allow the hon Minister to continue.

The MINISTER OF COOPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: House Chair, out of this recognition, we have embarked upon holistic review of our system of local government. Of course, I want to take this opportunity to request the NCOP and also the SA Local Government Association, Salga, to make sure that the discussion document that I referred to in my Budget Vote speech is properly in reach by the expertise that is lying with them.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 90

To the hon Chetty, House Chair, you know I think this unnecessary or opportunistically praising of our late President Madiba, should be condemned with the contempt it deserves. When Madiba led the armed struggle under the ambit of Umkhonto we Sizwe, your grandparents, also your predecessors and including yourselves, you called him a terrorist. When your grandparents imprisoned him, they called him swartgevaar [black danger.]

When he was a President, you accused him of taking the country to the dogs. Now today, the DA led by self-confessed proponents of colonialism; the self-confessed proponents of apartheid symbols, the people who went out and claimed that they love Verwoed, want to tell us that Madiba was a hero. What a misplaced submission! Laughable and very opportunistic! Stop, really, taking our people for granted!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr.A J Nyambi): Hon Minister, can you take your seat? Order, members! Take your seat, hon Chetty! Take a seat, hon Chetty! The first person is the hon Julius. I will come to you after dealing with hon Julius. Continue hon Julius!

Mr J W W JULIUS: House Chair, I want to know if it is parliamentary for this corrupt, captured Minister, to come here and actually mislead the South Africans ... [Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 91

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr.A J Nyambi): Hon Julius, you are out of order. You can't cast aspersions like that. Can you withdraw that part? Can you withdraw the part of what you have said?

Mr J W W JULIUS: Okay. Chairperson, I withdraw fully because I know that the emails will prove that he is corrupt.

Mr M CHETTY: Chair, the hon Minister is misleading this House. He doesn't know my political history ... [Interjections.] Hon Chairperson, he made a comment - Chair, can I get a protection here?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr.A J Nyambi): Hon members ...  
[Interjections.]

Mr M CHETTY: His reference was that the hon Chetty do not use Nelson Mandela that, this is what happened! With all due respect, before the rest of the people in this House start to make the noise. Listen, because listening is a skill.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr.A J Nyambi): Can you take your seat?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 92

Mr M CHETTY: You said to me, hon Chetty, before you use Nelson Mandela, remember that when he was a President you called him a tyrant and nothing else. He must withdraw those statements!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr.A J Nyambi): Can you take your seat?

Mr M CHETTY: He must withdraw those statements!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr.A J Nyambi): Can you take your seat?

Mr M CHETTY: He doesn't know my political history.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr.A J Nyambi): Can you take your seat?

Mr M CHETTY: I am not captured by the Guptas.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr.A J Nyambi): Can you take your seat?

Mr M CHETTY: I am not here to serve by the Guptas' will. I am not the Minister of Finance over weekend. I was not appointed here by the Guptas, and I don't serve the Guptas.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 93

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr.A J Nyambi): Hon Chetty, can you please take your seat?

Mr M CHETTY: I serve the people of South Africa.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr.A J Nyambi): Hon Chetty, can you take your seat?

Mr M CHETTY: The Minister must withdraw; he doesn't know my political history!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr.A J Nyambi): Can you switch that mike off? Hon members, order! Hon members, I have appealed to all of you that I do not need any assistance. Hon Chetty, you are out of order! What you are raising, is not a point of order. You can't be debating with the Minister at the podium. You had your own opportunity. So, don't abuse the use of point of order. Can you continue hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF COOPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS:

Indeed, House Chairperson, let's also tell the nation that ...

[Interjections.]

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 94**

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr.A J Nyambi): Hon Minister, let me deal with hon Koni.

Ms N P KONI: Chair, can I address you? It seems like this thing of calling the bouncers and the members that should leave the House only applies to the EFF members. Hon Chetty's conduct is unparliamentary, he was supposed to have left the House long time ago. But, just because he is a DA member, you are not instructing him to leave the House. Let me say that, I am watching you, Chairperson! Just know that I am watching you! I am watching you!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr.A J Nyambi): No, order members! In dealing with the point of order being raised by the hon Koni, you might be having a point in how I dealt with the hon Chetty. Let me also agree that any ruling that I have made, just because in terms of the Rules, we have to subject it to a particular process. It might have been something that I might have missed and you might be having a point. So, I am not dismissing what you are raising, you might be in order. Can you continue hon Minister? Let me first give hon Khawula a chance.

Mr M KHAWULA: Chair, now that you have sustained that point of order, what does it mean about hon Chetty sitting here?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 95

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr.A J Nyambi): It's simple! ...

[Interjections.] Order members! It's very simple! Order, members! In terms of the Rules of the NCOP, if I've made a ruling that you are not satisfied with; I can't go back and review my ruling. That is why I am saying that there is a process that deals with a wrong ruling. So, that is why I am saying now that the hon Minister must continue with the debate.

The MINISTER OF COOPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS:

Chair, some of the behaviour is not necessarily surprising because I know for the fact that, the spies and those who betrayed our revolution, also called Madiba a terrorist. So, their behaviour is not surprising, hence I fully agree with Madiba that, the DA is nothing else but just a mickey-mouse party. Chair, on the issue of progress, I think that the MEC, hon Wana and hon Mhlanga were right that there has been progress on various areas. We have sent an improvement in our last audit outcome ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Minister; let me deal with hon Hattingh. Hon Hattingh, why are you standing?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 96

Mr C HATTINGH: Hon Chair, I would like to know whether it is parliamentary to refer to a political party as a mickey-mouse party if you are a member of a corrupt party.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): No, that is not a point of order! Can you continue hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF COOPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: That was Madiba's view about the DA. So, you must be reminded that the same Madiba that you are praising, he regarded the DA as a mickey-mouse party. Hon Chair, the progress on various areas included the audit outcome. We have sent an improvement on audit outcome and we have sent an improvement on how the Municipal International Co-operation, MIC, was expanded.

We have sent improvement on an expansion of innovative service delivery systems in the municipalities; we have seen expansion of Community Work Programme, CWP, participation, but also, House Chair, through the promulgation of the Minimum Competency Regulations, we know for the fact that ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr.A J Nyambi): Hon Minister, you are allowed to conclude.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 97

The MINISTER OF COOPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: Oh, but you know, Chair ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr.A J Nyambi): No, it's concluding time ... [Interjections.] I am not recognising you. I am presiding, you are not presiding. You can't do that with me! Take your seat! I'm allowing the Minister to conclude. Can you conclude hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF COOPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: House Chairperson, let me take this opportunity to reconfirm our undertaking to our traditional leaders, Nkosi Mahlangu knows of our commitment that we will continue to support our traditional leadership constituency and that we will be working together with the Department of Mineral Resources; we will be working together with the Department of Small Business Development and Cooperation to support all the traditional leaders who are hosting mining operations in their constituencies. I thank you very much for the opportunity, Chair. [Applause.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr.A J Nyambi): Thank you. That concludes the debate. I would like to thank the hon Minister, the Deputy Minister, the MECs and the special delegates who attended the debate.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 98

APPROPRIATION BILL

(Policy debate)

Vote No 39 - Rural Development and Land Reform and Vote No 24 - Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries:

The MINISTER OF RURAL DEVELOPMENT AND LAND REFORM: Hon Chairperson, hon Deputy Chairperson, hon members, hon MECs, colleagues, hon Ministers and Deputy Ministers, esteemed traditional leaders, ladies and gentlemen, the governing party, the ANC, declared 2017, The Year of Oliver Reginald Tambo: The Year Of Unity In Action By All South Africans. Together, we continue to move our great country towards the vision of a united, nonracial, nonsexist, democratic and prosperous society, the strategic objective of the National Democratic Revolution, NDR. The *Ready to Govern* document sets out the ANC's policy objectives as follows; firstly, to strive for the achievement of the right of all South Africans as a whole, to political and economic self-determination in a united South Africa. Secondly, to overcome the legacy of inequality and injustice created by colonialism and apartheid, in a swift, progressive and principled way. Thirdly, to develop a sustainable economic and state infrastructure that will progressively improve the quality of life of

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 99**

all South Africans. Fourthly, to encourage the flourishing of the feeling that South Africa belongs to all who live in it, to promote a common loyalty to, and pride in, the country; and, finally, to create a universal sense of freedom and security within its borders. In pursuit of these objectives, President Zuma established the National Planning Commission and charged it with the task of putting together a national development plan. The National Planning Commission came up with a comprehensive plan, the National Development Plan, NDP Vision 2030, which was widely canvassed among all South Africans and was adopted by this august body, the Tribune of the people of South Africa. This NDP was adopted by the governing party, the ANC, in its 53rd National Conference in 2012. The NDP prefaces its objectives by the following quote from the Reconstruction and Development Programme RDP, of 1994, namely:

No political democracy can survive and flourish if the masses of our people remain in poverty, without land, without tangible prospects for a better life. Attacking poverty and deprivation must therefore be the first priority of a democratic government.

Developing and upgrading capabilities to enable sustainable and inclusive development requires a new approach and a new mindset.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 100**

The story we propose to write involves - so says the NDP - creating jobs and livelihoods; expanding infrastructure; transitioning to a low-carbon economy; transforming urban and rural spaces; improving education and training; providing quality health care; building a capable state; fighting corruption and enhancing accountability; and, transforming society and uniting the nation. The Medium-Term Strategic Framework, MTSF, 2014-2019 has the following to say, in pursuit of these NDP objectives, Cabinet set the following six priorities in its MTSF, firstly, the improved land administration and spatial planning for integrated development in rural areas. Secondly, sustainable land reform, that is agrarian transformation. Thirdly, improved food security; fourthly, smallholder farmer development and support; fifthly, Increased access to quality basic infrastructure and services, particularly in education, healthcare and public transport in rural areas. Sixthly, Growth of sustainable rural enterprises and industries characterised by strong rural-urban linkages, increased investment in agro-processing, trade development and access to markets and financial services resulting in rural job creation.

The key Agrarian Transformation Measurables in this regard are the following; firstly, Meeting basic human needs reference, the RDP. Secondly, Proliferation of agro-village enterprises and industries,

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 101**

including agro-manufacturers and retailers, sustained by credit facilities, markets and other strategic logistics and lastly, improved land tenure system. Challenges and mitigation thereof, one of the great internationalists writes the following in this regard:

The road is long and full of difficulties. At times we wander from the path and must turn back; at other times we go too fast and separate ourselves from the masses; on occasions we go too slow and feel the hot breath of those treading on our heels. In our zeal as revolutionists we try to move ahead as fast as possible, clearing the way, but knowing we must draw our sustenance from the mass and that it can advance more rapidly only if we inspire it by our example.

Che Guevara

It is against the recognition of this fundamental truth that the 53rd National Conference of the ANC ushered in what it called the Second Phase Transition of the NDR that is characterised by radical socioeconomic transformation. Economic transformation, however, is not for itself, but for changing the social conditions of our people for the better. In that context, radical socioeconomic transformation is more appropriate, which is defined as a

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 102**

fundamental change in the structure, systems, institutions and patterns of ownership, management and control of the economy.

Contrary to the prevalent public narrative, this is a succinct and actionable definition. What it requires is political will to drive it, and we have it. Our biggest challenge remains the answer to the question: Who owns South Africa?

In terms of Phase 1 of our Land Audit, it became clear that we still needed to conduct an audit in terms of land ownership by race, gender and nationality. We have just concluded the latter process. However, there are still huge challenges because of gaps as a result of the absence of information in respect of institutions, such as trusts, private and public organisations and companies, as well as sectional title holdings. The source of this enduring challenge is incoherent institutional transformation, both within and external to the department, for example: The absence of a dynamic, interactive relationship between the National Geomatics Management Services, NGMS, and the Deeds Registration system. Yet, the former feeds into the latter. Secondly, we have projectised the land claims process. This was a strategic error, which did not take into account fiscal constraints, complexities associated with verification or validation of claims, court challenges and internal capacity constraints.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 103**

In terms of moving forward, we are working on transforming the Land Claims Commission into a Chapter 9 Institution. The NGMS, Deeds Registries and Office of the valuer-general will be listed as Schedule 2 entities in terms of the Public Finance Management Act, PFMA, of 1999. A further challenge relates to water rights being allocated to individuals, not to the land. When an individual sells the land, he or she leaves with the water rights. Furthermore, subdivisions and changes of land use are happening at a rapid pace. An audit needs to be conducted in respect of both these issues, because they negatively impact on land reform farms. Although regulated by laws, compliance with and enforcement of such legislation needs to be strengthened. A lot is happening in these functions with minimal accountability. The second institutional challenge is that, unless an owner expresses a need to change and submits information voluntarily, our current legal system is unable to compel him or her or the institution to reveal the information. They deliberately withhold information about the changes on land and, or, property. At present we have no institutional mechanism to enforce disclosure. Cabinet is considering the report of Phase 2 of the Land Audit and we are expecting strong decisions to address all these institutional challenges and the Land Commission provided for in the Regulation of Agricultural Land Holdings Bill, which will

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 104**

come to this House, will enforce disclosure of ownership of land and landed property.

We submit to this august House the Medium-Term Expenditure Framework, MTEF budget allocation 2017-18, 2018-19 and 2019-20. It is R10,134 billion for 2017-18, it is R10,853 billion for 2018-19 and R11,229 billion for 2019-20. The provincial breakdown of the current financial year is as follows: The National Office R3,7 billion, Eastern Cape R712 million, Free State R441 million, Gauteng R412 million, KwaZulu-Natal R1,2 billion, Limpopo R925 million, Mpumalanga R1,047 billion, Northern Cape R448 million, North West R644 million, Western Cape R525 million. The total is R10,184 billion, that is 100%

In conclusion, by 2030, South Africa should experience more integrated, vibrant, equitable and sustainable rural-urban communities, that is urban locations and townships, rural towns, agri-villages and farms that are supported by requisite infrastructure and logistics, social and economic infrastructure that is; inclusive economies, development finance institutions. That is very important rural areas do not have these facilities and institutions to support themselves so that we can have a vibrant economic institutions in those areas. That includes credit

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 105**

facilities, bustling markets, small, micro, medium and large-scale enterprises and industries employing millions of people. That is what we want to see by 2030 as we are called upon by the NDP. Thank you, hon Chair. [Applause.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, FORESTRY AND FISHERIES: Chairperson, Ministers, Deputy Minister, Gen Bheki Cele and other Deputy Ministers, Chairperson and Members of the Select Committee on Land and Mineral Resources, members of NCOP, MECs of Agriculture, distinguished guests and ladies and gentlemen, during our National Budget Vote, I cautioned against politicising agriculture and called for a collective effort to address challenges faced by both farmers and farmworkers alike.

Unfortunately, South Africa is experiencing an upsurge of criminality which has manifested in the brutal killings of farmworkers and farmers alike; sometimes farmworkers dying at the hands of their own employers. This is blight on the very fibre of our nation and can no longer remain unabated.

The issue of food security affects us all, Chairperson, rich, poor, black, white, and in a time when sowing division appears politically

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 106**

expedient; only unity of purpose in advancing our national interest, can create a better South Africa we can all be proud of.

Hon members, today, the Department of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries, Daff, is tabling a total budget of R6 807 billion, of which R3,7 billion is ring-fenced for transfers of conditional and parliamentary grants.

In terms of Conditional Grants R1,6 billion has been allocated to the Comprehensive Agricultural Support Programme, Casp.

Chairperson, in his 2015 state of the nation address, President Jacob Zuma pronounced on the Nine-Point Plan to boost economic growth and create the much-needed jobs. And he called upon the department to revitalise of the Agriculture and Agro-Processing Value Chain, known as RAAVC.

Informed by the National Development Plan, the RAAVC sets a target of 1 million jobs by 2030. A sizeable portion of these jobs reside within the Agro-Processing sector through the support of smallholder producers.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 107**

Let me explain something that I think many people make as a mistake. In my language we called abamhlophe (whites) abelungu. Today let us change to say abelungu are only those with the capacities and expertise to employ other people. You may be white in colour but if you don't employ anybody awungomlungu (you are not white) in my book.

For the 2017-18 financial year, we seek to continue the strategic approach of RAAVC in partnership with relevant national departments such as the Department of Rural Development and Land Reform, the Department of Trade and Industry, including sector organisations, labour organisations, and civil society.

Chairperson, in terms of section 80 of the Marine Living Resources Act, applicants are allowed to lodge appeals against the decision of the Delegated Authority. The process is still underway and I would like to appeal to all interested and affected parties to allow the process to unfold and if any party is aggrieved by any decision taken by the department, I encourage such a party to follow the appeal processes that are provided for by law.

It is my intention to finalise the allocations for the West Coast Rock Lobster and Abalone sectors by 31 July this year.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 108**

The establishment of the Fisheries Transformation Council, in accordance with the Marine Living Resource Act 18 of 1998, Chapter 3 section 5(29) will be prioritised. This is the fact I want to say people must not believe that they have a right to fish. It is a state-owned commodity that every South African has a right to apply for and have access to. And if we work together to change that it is what I think we shall have failed in our duty if we don't do so.

[Applause.]

We have also committed to finalise the appeals that have been submitted with regard to the above mentioned nine sectors by 30 September 2017. The department will soon start with the FRAP 2020 process for the 12 fishing sectors that were allocated in 2005 and 2013. These allocations will expire on 31 December 2020.

Hon members, climate change manifests itself in a variety of ways some of which can result in devastating destruction and loss of life, as recently experienced in wild fires of Knysna and Port Elizabeth in the Eastern Cape; coupled with the flooding in Cape Town.

Chairperson, with your indulgence, I would like to request a moment of silence for those who lost their lives during the recent

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 109**

devastation and those whose lives were lost due to criminality within agriculture, forestry and fisheries. Thank You.

Hon members, to address the drought challenge, the Agricultural Research Council, ARC, is participating in two public-private partnerships; namely, the Water Efficient Maize for Africa, Wema, project and the Improved Maize for African Soils, Imas, project.

The Wema project is aimed at developing and deploying drought tolerant maize hybrids royalty free to smallholder farmers in Southern Africa. The Wema project is co-ordinated by the African Agricultural Technology Foundation, AATF, and involves national agricultural research systems in five countries are Kenya, Mozambique, South Africa, Tanzania and Uganda. This is a good demonstration that working together we can do more.

The Kaonafatso ya Dikgomo, KyD, Scheme is a special purpose vehicle aimed at accelerating the participation of smallholder producers into the mainstream livestock industries. The KyD Scheme strives to catapult smallholder farmers to all levels of the livestock value chain.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 110**

The Scheme is gradually realising outcomes of this effort illustrated through progress made by individuals and communities. In this case we speak of the ability of the African people to have programmes like feedlots in their own areas and sell their cattle without being abused and exploited.

In an effort to realise an inclusive livestock value chain, other participants of the Scheme are also venturing into intensive production systems such as feedlots. A feedlot is where you feed your cows without going to the field, and that can also accelerate the growth of African people and make them African farmers.

In the Eastern Cape, a partnership with the Department of Land Reform and Rural Development and Wool Grower Association will see 13 projects supported with shearing sheds and rams. My department will contribute R15,4 million towards the wool production in the current financial year. [Applause.]

Investment in Macadamia nuts is happening in four provinces, the Eastern Cape, KwaZulu-Natal, Limpopo, and Mpumalanga. And the department will spare no effort to make sure that these programmes as they create more jobs are realised. It is the area of growth in the future.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 111**

A total of 14 Aquaculture projects will receive R85 million and create 256 jobs. Poultry production has been allocated R128 million which will benefit 46 projects and create 1 789 jobs; R243 million is set aside to support 94 red meat producers with stock and irrigation dams, dipping tanks and handling facilities.

[Interjections.] I have been trained never to chase dogs when I am depositing posts to families, as dogs have no business of doing that work.

During the 2016-17 financial year, the Free State Department of Agriculture and Rural Development was able to spend 98% of its R174 million Casp allocation. Thirty eight projects were supported and a total of 2 424 people benefitted directly during the year under review.

Gauteng supported 122 land and agrarian smallholder producers with both production inputs and on farm infrastructure through the Comprehensive Agricultural Support Programme and Ilima or Letsema grant. During the 2016-17 financial year 117 jobs were created, 73 from Casp and 44 from Ilima or Letsema.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 112**

The KwaZulu-Natal Department of Agriculture and Rural Development created 2 699 jobs through the Comprehensive Agricultural Support Programme; 2 219 jobs were created under Ilima or Letsema grant.

In a further effort to broaden the food-base in South Africa, Daff, also supported a project for improvement of amadumbe for production and income generation for small holders' farmers as part of a participatory breeding programme.

The Limpopo Province has through Casp supported a total of 447 farmers, across the Casp pillars. Through the Casp support, 1 423 job opportunities were created, out of which 706 were women and 133 youth.

Hon members, communal grazing areas are finding problems because of over grazing, and we all need to do our best to make sure that we control that situation. For example the Sekhukhune district where a focus area due to the increase in cattle herds mainly the Jersey cows, which has added pressure on the fragile mixed bushveld and grassland ecosystems.

During the 2016-17 financial year, the Mpumalanga provincial department of agriculture created 498 jobs through Casp. These jobs

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 113**

were created in the vegetables, red meat, poultry and aquaculture sub-sectors.

The Northern Cape Department of Agriculture and Land Reform created 133 jobs through Casp while the Ilima or Letsema grant created 538 jobs.

The ARC Ganyesa Devil's Claw Project in conjunction with Daff and the North West Province is commendable. This community-based project was initiated to train the Ganyesa community about the sustainable harvesting and utilisation of the medicinal plant devil's claw.

In the 2016-17 financial year, the Western Cape Department of Agriculture created 1 712 jobs through the Comprehensive Agricultural Support Programme, Casp. Through the Ilima or Letsema grant, the department managed to create 825 jobs.

Hon members, aquaculture as a new area of growth presents an enormous opportunity to bring new entrants in the sector as it grows and expands. The sector also presents an opportunity to bring in the youth, women and historically disadvantaged people into the sector.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 114**

Chairperson, we are pleased to announce that the World Aquaculture Conference will take place in Cape Town from 26 to 30 June 2017 attracting more than 3,000 delegates from over 100 countries. Aquaculture is one of the fastest growing food production sectors in the world.

The sector presents the most important protein that is getting diminishing because of illegal fishing and other climate conditions.

Hon members, to address the transformation imperative the department is committed to a gender centric approach in its various programmes. The Female Entrepreneur of the Year Award is but one such initiative that recognises the role women play in shifting perceptions of what a successful farmer looks like.

It is also important to target young people especially agriculture graduates who are unemployed and ensure that we facilitate their experiential learning through mentorships and exposure to commercial farms.

Chairperson, in conclusion, the sector continues to be plagued by outbreaks of animal, plant diseases and pests. Recently Zimbabwe announced an outbreak of Avian Influenza. South Africa immediately

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 115**

suspended all trade in live birds and poultry, meat, table eggs and other unprocessed poultry products and communicated this to the Zimbabwean Chief Veterinary Officer.

We have heightened inspections of all consignments, including all private and public vehicles at all our ports of entry, especially in and out of Zimbabwe.

There is a critical need to capacitate our animal production, food and health safety branch; as they are at the forefront of managing and detecting potential outbreaks that could adversely affect our sector.

In closing, Chairperson, I would like to thank the Deputy Minister Bheki Cele for his commitment and counsel.

I thank the Chairperson and members of the Select Committee on Mineral Resources and Land. I also thank all nine provincial MECs responsible for agriculture for the support.

I would like to say that agriculture is not a place to venture in just because you want make mileage politically. It is about food security. It is about making sure that those who farm understand

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 116

what the impact of farming is; it is about dealing with diseases. It is not a place for those who want fulfill their dreams for tomorrow which might never come.

It may never come if people remain hungry; it may never come if we deny the fact that for many years black people were denied of their future of participating in agriculture, except as farmers. That time has come and that time should end; we need to sing one song of saying that we need a South Africa that is free from hunger.

We need a place where farmers can farm in peace without fearing anything. We need a South Africa where farmers can believe that their employers are also fellow South Africans where no farmworker must be afraid because, Mr Khrosky may mistake him for an animal or feels that his presence disturbs his own presence.

We call for a South Africa that embraces the South Africa that Reginald Oliver Tambo, the former President of the ANC envisioned that the Minister of land reform has quoted. We need a South Africa in which all of us are ashamed of obstructing change.

To the department and Ministry, staff, thank you for your agility, work ethic and commitment to the vision of the department. To you I

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 117**

say meditate on the words of Khalil Gibran when he says: "The teacher who is indeed wise does not bid you to enter the house of his wisdom but rather leads you to the threshold of your mind."

I invite this House to endorse this budget and I believe that working together white and black, and I repeat, being umlungu does not predict colour, but the ability of the individual to put his money into investment and employ others. Time must come when we give this name umlungu to those who are white in colour, some of them are looking for a job and black farmers may employ them. Thank You.

Ms Z V NCITHA: Deputy Chairperson, members of the NCOP, members of SA Local Government Association, Salga, that are representing Salga today, the MECs, the Minister and the Deputy Ministers, members of the public, ladies and gentlemen, today's budget speech comes at a time of a great negative perception of the government in our country, and the performance of the economy. This difficult time can splinter us as a nation, destroy all what we have struggled and strived for, or it could unite us leaving us stronger than we have been ever before. The choice is ours; it lies in our political maturity and our commitment in building a greater nation.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 118**

South Africa is known for its horrific past, but we are also known for our capacity to forgive unforgivable, but we do not forget. So, let us our past teach us again that we remain united by much more than what divide us for the people of this country. If we do not do so, it is our choice to allow us to perish. Compatriots, let us lead our nation with a clear vision insight.

So, I call on all of us today to remain committed to the course of radical economic transformation, were all South Africans can feed our growth of our economy. However, to realise this vision, we must be able to push through the hard economic times, we must persevere the storms, and battle out our troubles with determination and hard work.

Compatriots, while some progress is made, much more is needed by way of inclusive economic growth.

While we admit to the challenges we face, we should also be proud of our achievements. Over the past 6 years, employment in the agricultural sector has risen by almost 300 000, even while farmer wage were increased. Secondly, over the past 15 years, the share of the household experiences hunger has declined by more than a half.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 119**

Thirdly, there are signs of economic vibrancy in former homeland areas, including impressive decline in unemployment rate since 2001.

All this is not bad in agricultural sector, and we must press forward to achieve much greater things.

The challenge is the intervention that we need to take. We must remain insignificant at the economic scale. As a development state, our role is to stimulate growth through policy and investment however, we cannot do this alone. We cannot do this without the full cooperation of the private sector. The fiscus is just not big enough to do what is required to industrialise the agricultural sector, build and maintain infrastructure, while at the same time maintain and create jobs.

A public private partnership is critical element which we must pursue more vigorously. There are several efforts already underway that merge public and private resources in a manner that build local economies.

In Eastern Cape, the Agricultural Economic Transformation Strategy will be implemented through commodity based partnership in the grain, livestock and high value crop industries. The Eastern Cape Department of Rural Development and Agrarian Reform will improve

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 120**

commercial viability and productive utilisation of communal land and smallholder farms through the clustering of arable land into economic units to realise the economies of scale and reduce the cost of production. These clusters will be linked to commercial agriculture for investment, mentorship, entrepreneurship and to exploit the market opportunities in the value chain.

In Limpopo, the Department of Agriculture and Rural Development will start government's much awaited 30% set-aside programme, where 30% of appropriate categories of state procurement for purchasing for Small, Medium and Micro Enterprise Businesses, SMMEs, Cooperatives as well as Township and Rural Enterprises will commence this year.

In the Free State, the Agro-Processing Summit held this year increase; include the development agro-processing in the province, with the aim to build greater public-private investment partnerships aimed at supporting small business in agro-processing.

In Gauteng, a total of R23 million is allocated for agro-processing to enhance investment in their food and beverage sector.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 121**

Concerning food and nutrition security, the Department of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries formed part of the five government departments that participated in the development of the National Food and Nutrition Security Plan.

The National Food and Nutrition Security Plan has six strategic objectives, one of which is led by Department of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries, Daff, namely, the establishment of inclusive local value chain to support access to nutrition affordable food.

Expected outcomes of this objective is to market, stimulate and small hold production to participate in the local value chain; an improved policy environment to enhance participation of the smallholder produce in local food value chain; improved access to nutrition affordable food, especially at local and household levels and improved access to production and marketing infrastructure.

Implementation of the strategic objective will commence during 2017-18 financial fiscus to quality and quantity of fruit produced by smallholder and the supply, value addition, storage such as produce to institutional markets and non-government sector.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 122**

Hon members and distinguished guests, one of the greatest challenges in developing new farmers is the access to markets. Currently, the Daff has targeted about 33 farms from Nwanedi in Limpopo for a contract to supply tomatoes; 14 producers around Lebowakgomo have also been contracted to supply beans and two producers from Marble Hall are supplying peas.

One of the more important interventions in 2017-18 is the remodelling of the producer support programme. Existing support to produce are fragmented not only in method and approach, but across various layers of government and institutions. To address this Daff together with the provincial department will finalise the National Policy on Comprehensive Producer Development Support, which seeks to standardise what and how support is rendered to the producers.

Chairperson, the policy will regulate and guide intervention provided to the various categories of producers by government, the private sector and civil society organisations as well. This policy, I believe will result in an integrated and well coordinate producer support system for South Africa.

Concerning agro-processing, the Department of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries, Trade and Industry and Department of Rural

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 123**

Development and Land Reform, approached and engaged several companies in the development of a National Enterprise Supplier Development Incentive Programme and 2017-18 will be its first year of implementation.

With respect to producer support, a total of R20 billion of grant funds were made available to provide support to our producers. By the end of 2016-17, a total of 346 projects were supported, benefiting 32 000 smallholder producers and creating 9 000 jobs.

Producers were supported with infrastructure for production, marketing and agro-processing; land preparation; production inputs; training and mentorship as well as the SA Good Agricultural Practices certificate to access local and international markets.

For 2017-18, an amount of R2,2 billion is allocated to continue this work.

Chairperson, in the state of the nation address 2017, His Excellency, President Jacob Zuma announced the support to black commercial farmers. This is introduced in an effort to transform the existing ownership patterns in agriculture. Specific attention will be given to the development of 450 large scale black commercial

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 124**

farmers. The target is to have 2 250 black commercial farmers by 2022.

A further 23 559 smallholder producers and 2 909 black commercial farmers are targeted to support in the current financial year.

With all things remain favourable, we plan to create 20 000 jobs through our grant-based programme namely, Comprehensive Agricultural Support Programme, Casp, and Ilima-Letsema.

With respect to training and skills development, the department trained 26 370 farmers and linked 440 of them as mentors.

The Daff has also partnered with the Department of Higher Education for the further training of 630 farmers and mentors on 970.

The strategy within the sector for capacity building includes building partnership with industry organisation such as Red Meat Abattoir, which has been mentioned previously by the Minister through which 2 116 abattoir workers benefited from various training programmes.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 125**

We note the benefits our provinces are gaining through the department's capacity building programmes through our bilateral relations. The department in partnership with the Japanese International Cooperation Agency is implementing the Smallholder Horticulture Empowerment Programme, which promotes the principle of grow to sell as opposed to growing without a focused market.

For 2017-18, the programme plans on train 21 723 farmers; 3 015 farmers will receive mentorship, and Red Meat Abattoir Association will also train them.

The department has since 2008 initiated and coordinated the implementation of the Extension Recovery Plan. The main objective of the plan is to revitalise public Extension and Advisory Services, through skills development, increased human resources and adequate tools.

To date, 1 500 extension practitioners were recruited and trained, bringing the total number of extension personnel in the country to 3 140 extension officers. Extension practitioners have been provided with laptops, 3G cards, cell phones, printers and digital pens.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 126**

On the issue of trade agreements, bilateral agreements that have been signed with China, Indonesia, Vietnam and India are benefiting different provinces. Products exported to these countries include maize, fruit, wine, forestry products and nuts.

The NCOP is confident that we can sustain these markets and open a few more others to ensure that our farmers have much more market to access.

Chairperson, we therefore support, given the work that has been done by the department as articulated by myself. Thank you very much.

[Applause.]

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Thank you very much. Before hon Smit, earlier on the House Chairperson did indicate to the House that the clock was not working or functioning. Now, it is functioning, including that one. So, please, let us observe that.

Mr C F B SMIT: Deputy Chairperson, please correct my time. I don't have four minutes. Deputy Chair, hon members, members of the public in the gallery and fellow South Africans, this week, we are supposed to celebrate Youth Day on 16 June in memory of the young people who

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 127**

participated in the Soweto uprising of 1976 that followed the Sharpeville massacre of 21 March 1960.

Hon members, it seems history is repeating itself. The ANC-led government is busy massacring the future of our youth. We now sit with nine million unemployed people, of which the youth comprises six million. This said, what does the future look like when we look at these two Budget Votes - Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries and Rural Development and Land Reform?

Hon Minister Zokwana, my first observation is that your department has become the ANC-led government's stepchild in its programme of state capture and in the quest for self-enrichment. You have said your department's budget has been halved in the past few years, which makes it nearly impossible to deliver on your mandate. Well, let me tell you how to get rid of an unwanted thing. You starve it, and then you push it aside. Does this ring a bell, hon Minister? This is similar to the three million jobs promised by the ANC in the 2009 election, something that ended in three million jobs lost instead. The one million jobs in agriculture are about to go the same way. How do you plan to create a million new jobs in agriculture with half the budget? It is not going to happen, sir.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 128

In terms of Outcome 7, which refers to creating vibrant and self-reliant rural communities, your department is so far off par that it is not even funny. There is no way you can achieve it, but you keep going in the same direction - doing the same thing over and over. It was Albert Einstein who said the definition of insanity is doing the same thing over and over and expecting a different result.

With regard to land that is claimed and handed to claimants, the blame for the massive failures in sustaining productive use of the land is passed on from the one to the other. When I asked Minister Nkwinti about it, he quickly pointed to you, Minister Zokwana. He said it is your responsibility and that I should ask you. When I asked you, Minister Zokwana, you said it was unfair of Minister Nkwinti to pass the buck to you without the budget. [Interjections.] Minister, let me tell you what the problem is here: There should not be two different departments in the first place. [Interjections.] Oh, but I forgot - this is part of the programme ...

Ms L C DLAMINI: Deputy Chair, on a point of order: Who is Minister

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: No, that is not a point of order. You may continue, hon Smit.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 129

Mr C F B SMIT: Haai shame, Cathy. [Laughter.] Oh, but I forgot - this is part of the programme of your beloved ANC to have a bloated Cabinet so that more cadres can jump on the gravy train. This is self-enrichment.

In 2019, the DA-led government will sort out this problem for you, Ministers, by creating a 15-department Cabinet. It will be leaner, more efficient, and save costs so that the Budget is freed to direct funds towards agriculture and job creation in the industry. The DA-led government will ensure that all farmers are supported, especially small-scale and upcoming farmers, by ensuring proper and easy access to markets so that they can sell their produce easily. There will be massive investment in infrastructure like transport, communication and distribution facilities. We will also stimulate investment in modern urban farming ventures like warehouse farming, which is space efficient. Ordinary citizens will have easy market access and access to proper infrastructure support to allow them to sell their excess fruit and vegetables to local communities, retailers, distributors and restaurants. This is how you create one million jobs in agriculture, Minister Zokwana.

On fisheries, I can only hang my head in shame for your department, Minister. It is still a disaster, and it is getting worse by the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 130

day, as is evident from the fact that vessels cannot go out due to a lack of maintenance. Who suffers? It would be the poor fishing communities like Paternoster and Port Nolloth. This is, again, because of greedy ANC comrades who stuff their pockets at the expense of the poor. I was told of instances where connected individuals buy off community members' fishing quotas for peanuts. In turn, this money is used for alcohol, and then they have nothing left. Sies, man! The ANC should be ashamed of this blatant abuse. [Interjections.]

Minister, today my question to you is the following: Why is the fisheries sector not a provincial competency similar to agriculture?

Ms N GQIBA (Eastern Cape): Deputy Chairperson, on a point of order: Is it parliamentary to say "sies" in the presence of hon members?

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF NCOP: You know, hon members, I did hear the word, and it immediately struck me. I was grappling with that. May I satisfy myself by looking at the Rules to check whether the use of that word in the House is parliamentary and then come back - it can be tomorrow - and make a ruling in tomorrow's sitting? Continue, hon member. Just hold. Hon Michalakis?

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 131**

Mr G MICHALAKIS: Deputy Chairperson, may I also ask, when you make that consideration, that you also take into account that we are very limited for alternatives for "sies" that are worse than that. You don't want to take away the only word that is not parliamentary.

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF NCOP: Hon Michalakis, allow me to do exactly what I said I would. Thank you.

Mr C F B SMIT: Minister, my question to you today is why the fisheries sector is not also a provincial competency like agriculture, as each province has its unique circumstances and needs. When will you decentralise this function and allocate the various budgets, Minister Zokwana?

Talking about provincial mandates and funding, you acknowledged that the provinces do not account properly and funds are misused by some ANC provinces, like Limpopo. Please explain to me how it is possible for the Limpopo provincial Department of Agriculture and Rural Development to spend R1,48 million on a single kilometre of fencing. Let me show you what this R1,48 million fence looks like, hon Minister. This is in Limpopo. There it is - R1,48 million. There is another one - R278 000. [Interjections.] You see, Minister, we have a Gupta-like character in Limpopo, Dada Jedwood Hardware.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 132

Mr A J NYAMBI: Deputy Chair ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: May I listen to the point there?

Mr A J NYAMBI: Deputy Chairperson, I would like to know whether it is parliamentary to go to my respectful province, Mpumalanga, take a picture of my yard, and come here and show it to members whilst making serious allegations. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Order! Order, hon members! Unfortunately, precedence was created when a member was allowed to show a picture in the House. That was in the other House but has carried over. May we allow this and then, maybe, the subcommittee on Rules will look at this and amend it if necessary. Continue.

Mr C F B SMIT: Because it hurts so much. Ouch! [Interjections.] Minister, we have a Gupta-like character in Limpopo, Dada Jedwood Hardware, who stuffs his pockets, together with his compromised ANC politicians and officials.

*Afrikaans:*

Da' is 'n ou stukkie draad, Minister, en da' 'n ou stukkie draad.  
[Tussenwerpsels.] Minister, verduidelik jy nou vir ons vandag ... en

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 133

om die kersie op die koek te sit, is die fondse gou-gou, so twee weke voor die 2016 munisipale verkiesing, oorgeplaas na mnr Dada se besigheidsrekening - gerieflik! Ek wonder of dit dalk ook 'n befondsingsmodel was vir die ANC se verkiesingsveldtog. Dit laat my nogal dink aan die Nkandla-skandaal. Dit maak my naer om te dink hoe jou geliefde ANC-regering geld mors terwyl 14 miljoen Suid-Afrikaners elke aand honger gaan slaap. Sies vir julle. Ek sal my skaam vir sulke mishandeling van ons mees afhanklike burgers in Suid-Afrika.

*English:*

Minister Nkwinti, the man in charge of land capture, when do you and your ANC-led government plan to give the tribal communities full ownership of their residential properties? Hereby I refer to full ownership title deeds that will give them assets they can use as security to get access to resources so that they can attain individual independence and economical freedom.

Minister, I am not talking about land use rights but full ownership so that those communities also have individual freedoms of choice, like the rest of South Africa. This is required in terms of Chapter 2 of the Constitution, the Bill of Rights, sections 25(5) and (6) that read as follows:

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 134

(5) The state must...

... not may but must ...

... take reasonable legislative and other measures, within its available resources, to foster conditions which enable citizens to gain access to land on an equitable basis.

(6) A person or community whose tenure of land is legally insecure as a result of past racially discriminatory laws or practices ...

... like the old Bantustans that were designed to divide South Africans on the basis of race ...

... is entitled ... either to tenure which is legally secure or to comparable redress.

I am sure you will come up with some excuse, hon Minister, but, if you are truthful, you will tell South Africans today that you don't plan to give them individual freedom. The ANC needs the kings to control the masses so they will have no choice but to vote for the ANC. Doesn't that sound familiar, hon members? [Interjections.]

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 135**

Let me list some mass control measures already put in place by the ANC: a reconstruction and development house, where you wait years for the title deed so that you can be threatened with the loss of your house if you don't vote for the ANC; an Expanded Public Works Programme job so that you need to come back every few months and beg for it in exchange for voting ANC; and a social grant to hold you hostage with threats of losing the grant if you don't vote for the ANC. I can go on and on. [Interjections.]

South Africans want individual freedom, hon members, not the peanuts and leftover crumbs handed out by the ANC-led government. The time is near, my dear South African compatriots. The year 2019 is around the corner, and the DA-led government will ensure that you are free to choose your own destiny and have the individual choice and economic means to realise your dreams and aspirations. Change is coming fast, and it is going to change your life forever.

Vote DA and dream big because you can with a caring society and government. The time has come for this generation of young people to rise like a blue tsunami and fire this president Gupta and his mouthpiece, Mr Zuma, in 2019. The DA can and will deliver on your dreams. We sing:

Nkosi sikelel' iAfrika  
Maluphakanyisw' uphondo lwayo,  
Yizwa imithandazo yethu,  
Nkosi sikelela, thina lusapho lwayo.  
Morena boloka setshaba sa heso,  
O fedise dintwa le matshwenyeho,  
O se boloke, O se boloke setshaba sa heso,  
Setshaba sa, South Afrika ...  
... And united we shall stand ...

... for you, South Africa, our land. We love South Africa.

*Sepedi:*

Ke a leboga batho ba Afrika-Borwa. [People of South Africa, thank you.]

*English:*

Thank you very much. [Applause.]

Mr M QOBOSHIYANE (Eastern Cape): Hon Chairperson, hon Ministers and Deputy Ministers present and hon leadership in this august House, I just want to quote one of the utter colonialist, Lord Macaulay, in his address in British Parliament on 2 February 1835:

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 137**

I have travelled across the length and breath of Africa and I have not seen one person who is a beggar, who is a thief and a prisoner, such wealth I have seen in this country, such high moral values, people of such caliber, that I do not think we would ever conquer this country, unless we break the very backbone of this nation, which is her spiritual and cultural heritage and therefore, I propose that we replace her old and ancient education system, her culture, for if the African's think that all that is foreign and English is good and greater than their own, they will lose their self-esteem, their native culture and they will become what we want them, a truly dominated nation.

Hon Chairperson, indeed, citizens without land are people and slave permanently; will lost identity, sovereign in character but delegitimised in law. We were effectively and painfully colonially captured with our gold, diamond, platinum, land, forestry fisheries and ocean; and our Irelands were illegally appropriated without compensation by unsympathetic thieves who also use religion to dispossess us of what the creature bestowed upon us. This must change, hon members, we cannot cry anymore. We must be a generation of correcting the wrong.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 138

Our peace and reconciliation was not a sign of submission but a foundation for a new decolonisation agenda and eradication of apartheid colonial features. Off course, we cannot bow in adoration when we are seeing big tree in forestry; we see big five in construction; we see big five in fisheries; generations will spit on our graves and if we continue with this trajectory, indeed, they will be saying we have sold them in the real sense of the world.

*IsiXhosa:*

Umsindwana wentaka uphelela endlwaneni, Sihlalo.

*English:*

Our responsibility as the department is to attest to the programmes tabled by the two Ministers, Minister Zokwana and Nkwinti before this House. As I speak here, farmers in our province are working hard producing crops, farming in livestock, selling their produce to the markets, especially meat and citrus fruits. Some of these farmers include Laphumikhwezi Co-operative, which is owned by 10 women and one man. They received two beef master bulls from the department, which they mated with 52 heifers. They produced 43 calves ready for the market as weaners.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 139**

During our engagement a co-operative member, Nonzwakazi Mpongoshe, told me that they did not get good money from the sale of the progeny of their previous bulls. However, they worked hard and smart to mate their heifers with the new bulls and the results were the impressive progeny which they will sell at a good price.

Genetically superior beef bulls fetch in the order of R26 000 and heifers around R8 500. Mpongoshe told me that the money they make from the sale of their livestock is shared among co-operative members enabling them to provide for their families. [Applause.]

These farmers got farm from land reform programme, hon Minister, and benefit from the money we received from the Department of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries to expand agriculture. They show that when black people use land reform farms, they get such good results; they benefit from the economic spin-off from the agricultural economy.

This year, of this financial year, the department will invest R122, 2 million to support grain producers to produce production of maize and we are targeting 47 800h projected to yield 175 200 tons of grain valued at R403 million.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 140**

Our department is now driving economic transformation of agriculture in the province where we are facilitating partnership between commercial emerging, black and white farmers. This is done through commodity based partnership programmes with a focus on expansion of deciduous, pineapple, chicory, macadamia production, revitalisation of irrigations schemes in Ncorha, Zanyokhwe, Qamata and small irrigation schemes like the one in Port St Johns.

Together with the premier of the province, we handed over financial vouchers to young people involved in agriculture to help them start agri businesses, get money to buy implements, seedlings, livestock and also livestock feed for them to work in this particular sector.

Youth from lower Zingcuka and all other parts of the province were trained in agriculture focusing on crop production, poultry and livestock farming, giving them skills to master the trade. All students in our own agricultural college such as Tsolo Agriculture and Rural Development Institute are benefiting from the bursary facilitated between our department and Health and Welfare Sector Education and Training Authority, Seta. Indeed, in that college now, fees have fallen. All 222 students in that college are receiving free education for the next coming three years. [Applause.]. These students are studying animal health diploma - indeed, we are going

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 141**

to reap rewards of animal health technicians out of them - which is accredited by the SA Veterinary Council. Indeed, we heard the cries of our youth in the province.

The province is currently engaged in lobbying for the support - of which I hereby due - for us to be resourced and be considered to be a place that is compelling to establish the second veterinary science school in the country, which must be situated at the University of Fort Hare. The draft curriculum for the school has been submitted to Universities of Pretoria, Zimbabwe, Makerere, Lagos, Hannover, Texas A&M, which have veterinary schools for peer review. We want this school because our province is currently not benefiting from the high livestock population numbers; and I cannot dwell on that one because we all know.

This week, we will launch a one-year long programme aimed at empowering unemployed young people coming from poor households with food security skills to fight poverty. We are working with the Universities of Fort Hare and University of SA, Unisa, to train these young people on an National Qualifications Framework, NQF, level five one-year programme so that they can take over their own community-based gardens; they can run their own youth co-operatives

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 142**

so that they have means of food production and not to depend on buying food that is coming elsewhere.

I am standing here with heavy heart and disappointment after a Uitenhage farmer, 37 year old farmer from Kuilsriver, Mr Piet Voigt, alleged to have killed eight cattle wounding three severely all belonging to Mr Stokwe's family. Surely, the mere sight of cattle can never warrant the lethal use of a deadly firearm, stripping these livestock owners of their only means of survival. This is an attitude and barbaric behaviour we must collectively condemn as it is against civility and coexistence of black and white commercial farmers, especially emerging African farmers. They have lost close R250 000 worth of assets.

Just to say to young people, "who so neglect learning in his youth loses the past and is dead to the future". I want to advise young people to roll their sleeve seized the opportunity as O R Tambo once said in conclusion.

The land on which the cattle grazed was communal property. It was owned by no one. It was nobody's private farm. It was the common property of the people, shared by the people. So the practice of sharing was central to the concept of ownership of property.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 143**

We need business to invest in South African youth. We need private sector to broaden investment through youth empowerment; also to adopt youth agri-entrepreneur will solve the pertinent challenges facing our young people in this country in order to lower the scale of anger in this country so we dearly love.

Indeed, hon Chair, I cannot leave this podium without reporting back to you as a person young as I am from the province of the Eastern Cape about the mayhem, the misery, disorientation, the loss of hope, the despair that we have managed to see in eight months of local government of what is happening in Nelson Mandela Metro. We cannot even leave a Chamber because the mayor and the deputy mayor can really devour each other. We are no more opposing we have to guard them not to touch each other. It is a serious situation leadership. We thought the coalition in Nelson Mandela will work but the people there are dashed and their hopes have been damaged by what we call a DA-led municipality. What a crisis that we have now seen.

I think it must be a lesson to those that always come and boast here whilst they are living trash unattended in that municipality.

[Applause.] It is a real sad situation for our democratic dispensation. If 23 years is something to talk about, I think hon Ministers we need to take courage of the next 23 years so that we

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 144

change this calamity once and for all. I think we do have in our power, as the ANC, to advance and soldier on.

*IsiXhosa:*

Umkhomb'ubhembesile phaya eBhayi.

*English:*

You can visit them; in their own mayoral committee meeting, they are not listening to anything except to fight everyday up until they go for press conferences in each and every moment they get. We support this budget. This country is in good hands, let us move forward ladies and gentlemen. [Applause.] [Interjections.]

*Setswana:*

Mme N P KONI: Ke a leboga Modulasetulo. Ke setse ke nale maatla a le mantsi, le fa o ka nkemisa - wa ntudisa mo fatshe - wa nkemisa - wa ntudisa mo fatshe ke tla nna pelo telele. Ke a leboga.

*English:*

Hon Chairperson - this year marks 104 years since a white minority regime passed the Natives Land Act of 1913. The Act, as many others before and after 1913, legislated away the humanity of black people by confining them to just 7% of the land of this county. This year

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 145**

also marks 144 years since the murder in Robben Island of Inkosi Maqoma ka Nqgika, who led three of the nine wars of resistance against colonial land dispossession in what is now known as the Eastern Cape. Defined by the colonialists as a savage of extraordinary ability and a commander of savages second to none, he remains to us an immortal inspiration to all dispossessed people across this country and this continent.

Today, the descendants of the colonialists who murdered him are with us in this House - denying that they are beneficiaries of a brutal system which stripped black people of their humanity. Today, we have a government led by black people, which refuses to complete the struggle that their grandfathers died for. Most of these people who lead us are descendants of those warrior men and women led by Maqoma, Bambatha, Moshoeshe and many other gallant leaders of our people who died with their spear held high in defence of their land, and their humanity.

Today, 144 years after Maqoma took his last breath; black people are still landless, black people are still nationless, black people are still pariahs in the land of their own birth. Today, 23 years after the ANC took over power, and forced through a land policy premised on a ridiculous principle of willing-buyer willing-seller, only 8%

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 146**

of the land in South Africa has been transferred back to black people since the end of apartheid colonialism.

Today, 23 years after blacks were given political power, and after credible opinion showing that the property clause in the Constitution is a major hindrance to land reform, the ANC refuses to amend the Constitution to allow for speedy land reform. As a result of this, we as a country have no land reform programme, but a massive land purchase programme. This is why out of a budget of R10,1 billion for this financial year - R3,2 billion will go to the component dealing with restitution which entails amongst other things, buying up land from white farmers to be returned back to black people. At the rate at which we are going, it would take us more than 120 years to transfer at least 40% of the land back to black people. This is a crisis, it needs resolute leadership. The ANC has been sloganeering for far too long, talking about radical economic transformation on one hand, while wanting to appease white feelings on the other.

Once again, we offer our support to you to amend the Constitution. This may be the very last chance you have to do something meaningful for our people. You will lose votes in 2019 - and that is a fact. And will be in no position to lead a programme of radical change in

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 147**

our society. Then you will only be remembered as people who had no balls to dismantle the key foundations of white supremacy and black subjugation in this country.

Minister, we must also tell you right now your attempts to recreate the Bantu Authorities Act through your Communal Land Bill is a very dangerous attempt at circumventing democracy in rural areas. We need to deal with the continuing Bantufication in the former homelands in a manner that respects the rights of all people, including unmarried and widowed women, gay and lesbian people to own land. Your assertion that in areas where there are both Communal Property Associations and Traditional Authorities, your department will recognize only traditional authorities is ridiculous, and must be condemned.

Ms T WANA: Chairperson, on a point of order: Is it parliamentary when the speaker is announcing the balls?

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: I didn't get that. Can you repeat yourself hon member?

Ms T WANA: I wanted to understand if it's parliamentary when the speaker is announcing balls during her speech?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 148

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Balls?

Ms T WANA: Yes.

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: No, I didn't pick that one up hon members. Can I respond to that? [Laughter.] Hon member, Order! Can that also be my task for tomorrow just to check the context in which that was said?

Mr M KHAWULA: Chair, on a point of order: It is very easy to check that one - you can do a spot check. I am saying it is very easy to confirm that one - we can do a spot check hon Chair. [Laughter.]

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: No, no, don't do that - don't do that. [Laughter.]

Ms N P KONI: [Laughter.] Thank you very much Chairperson. In her book, *An Empty Plate*, Dr Tracey Ledger poses the following questions: Why is it that food prices are so high that millions of South African families go hungry, while the prices paid to farmers for that same food are so low that many cannot stay in business? Secondly, why are the people that produce our food, farm workers,

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 149**

among the most insecure of all? Why do high levels of rural poverty persist while corporate profits in the food sector keep rising?

How did a country with a constitutional right to food become a place where one in four children is so malnourished that they are classified as stunted?

This department's stated vision is: United and transformed agriculture, forestry and fisheries sector that ensures food security for all and economic prosperity. Agriculture has the potential to absorb the most labour - But it would require radical transformation of the agricultural sector. We have seen in the poultry industry alone how 50 000 jobs were lost due to the import of cheaper, albeit poorer quality poultry products. Our local poultry industry cannot compete with their overseas counterparts because of these two factors: Overseas farmers are subsidized by their governments. Secondly, South Africa does not impose tariffs to restrict import of poultry products.

Fundamentally, the land question and the agrarian question are intimately linked. We cannot resolve the agrarian question without first resolving the land question. So, as the EFFs' first cardinal pillar say: Land must be expropriated without compensation to its

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 150

rightful owners for equal redistribution. We will not support both of this Budget Vote. Thank you very much.

*IsiZulu:*

Mnu KHAWULA: Sihlalo, abahlonishwa oNgqongqoshe, oSekela Ngqongqoshe, kuyishwa ukuthi eNingizimu Afrika lokhu okwakungeminye yemigogodla yomzabalazo wenkululeko yikhona okuthe uma kufika inkululeko kwathathwa kwenziwa isimo esingaphuthumiyo. Into yokuqala okhokho bethu abaphucwa yona yinqubo yobukoloni bengcindezelo kwaba umhlaba kanye nemfuyo yabo. Lezi zinto ziyahambisana, awukwazi ukuba nemfuyo kanye negcebo yezolimo kepha ungenawo umhlaba. Kanjalo futhi awukwazi ukuba nomhlaba kepha ingceba yezolimo nemfuyo kushaywe indiva.

Bekufanele iNingizimu Afrika ekhululekile lezi zidingo eziphethwe yile minyango yomibili kube yizidingo ezisukunyelwa phezulu. Hawu, pho-ke kuya ngokuthi kuphethwe obani, baphethe kanjani, futhi bacabanga kanjani. Angeke siphathwe ngodaka emehlweni ukucabanga sikubona ekwenzeni nequbo elandelwayo uma kwenziwa.

Ngesikhathi kufika inqubo yobukoloni kule lizwe kudliwa ngundluzula izwe, izwe labe liphucwa amakhosi nabantu babo. [Ubuwelewele.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 151

*English:*

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES: Hon Khawula, let me take a point of order.

Mr M M CHABANGU: I would like to know as to whether are the interpreters of Parliament on leave because he is busy conveying the speech and there is no one interpreting. Thank you.

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES: Can you just check your channel. There is Zulu translation? There is? No, just check your channel there, channel two. Okay, continue hon member.

Mr M KHAWULA: Chair, I can do my speech in any of the 11 languages. I am saying that ...

*IsiZulu:*

... ngesikhathi kufika inqubo yobukoloni kule lizwe kudliwa ngundluzula izwe, izwe labe liphucwa amakhosi nabantu bawo. Cishe zonke izimpi ezabe ziliwa izizwe ezimpisholo ngokuhlukahlukana kwazo zabe ziliwa ngoba kuvikelwa umhlaba nemfuyo ngaphansi kwesandla sobukhosi bomdabu. Kuyamangaza ukuba uma uhulumeni wentando yeningi esebuyisela kubanikazi izwe elahlwithwa ngodli, kuthiwe lakhelwa

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 152

amakimiti azoliphatha, ama-trust, kodwa izwe libe lingaphucwanga amakomiti.

Lama komiti [trusts] uma esenikezwe ukuphathwa le mhlaba egameni labanikazi abangama-beneficiary kwezinye izindawo kuba nemibango exakile. Iqembu Lenkatha Yenkuleleko liyakholelwa ekutheni umhlaba ubuyiselwe kubanikazi bawo ngendlela ehlelekile, futhi siyakholelwa kule sihlo esithi ...

*English:*

... "two wrongs do not make a right."

*IsiZulu:*

Ngakho akuna kuthi ngoba kwahlithwa umhlaba ngendluzula ebeze uhulumeni osemthethweni esebenzisa indluzula ukubuyisa umhlaba. Nokho siyakhala ngokushaya ngonyawo lonwabu kundlela uhulumeni asebenza ngayo odabeni lomhlaba. Kufanele ukuthi kunyuswe izinga lokuphuthumisa izicelo zokubuyiswa komhlaba. Kufanele uhulumeni aqikelele nohla lwalabo abasuke bezohlomula uma kubuya umhlaba, kunganikezwa ubunikazi kubantu abangena mlando nokudliwa kwendawo njengoba kwenzekile kwezinye izindawo.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 153

Ngike ngaphawula lapha ngaphambilini, Sihlalo ohloniphekile ukuthi ukuthuthukiswa kwemboni yokudoba nokufuya izinhlanzi makungabi into yesifundazwe saseNtshonalanga Koloni kuphela kepha nezifundazwe ezilolwazi njengeKwaZulu-Natali nazo mazibambe iqhaza elibonakalayo.

Isimo sokuguguquka kwezulu esingathembekile sesibe nomthelela ongemuhle neze empilweni yabalimi ikakhulukazi ezindaweni ezisemakhaya. izinga lesomiso, ukukhahlamezeka kwemfuyo kanye nezitshalo kusezingeni eliphezulu kakhulu kule minyaka. Sidinga uhulumeni asondele kakhulu ngokosizo kubalimi emakhaya ngenxa yalezi zimo zesomiso. Akufanele uhulumeni asondele nosizo kumbe uxhaso ngoba nakhu kuzovotwa njengoba sibonile laphaya eNquthu umhlonishwa uMthembu uMEC enxenxa abavoti njezimbuzi ebeziphiwa umphakathi. Kepha kufanele ukuthi uhulumeni asondele emphakathini nosizo lweqiniso nezinhlelo eziphapheme, hhayi ukulutha umphakathi.

Kuyiqiniso ukuthi izinga lokutshalela ukuziphilisa emakhaya sekwehle kakhulu, lokhu kudalwa ubunzima bokucosha izinsiza kusebenza kule miphakathi esemakhaya. Kanjalo futhi nabalimi abasafufusa abathenge imihlaba yokuhweba nabo bathwala kanzima ngenxxa yesomiso, ngingabala nje abalimi abasezindaweni ezifana nalaphaya KwaMgayi eMzumbe, abalimi bomoba bakwaQoloqolo eMzumbe, eMalangeni Emdoni, e-Oribi nase e-Hibiscus Coast bonke abangabalimi bomoba. Bonke

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 154**

bathwala kanzima ngenxa yalokhu kuguquguquka kwezimi sezulu. Lokhu kuye kwenze sengathi abalimi abampisholo bayihluleki kanti qha yisikhathi nje abaficane naso esinzima. Ngakho-ke izinsiza zikahulumeni zidingeka kakhulu kulezi zindawo engizibalayo kanye nezinye ezifana nazo ezweni lonke.

Bahlonishwa bayahlukumezeka abalimi abalime imfuyo ngenxa yamasela antshontsha imfuyo. Amanye alama sela anqamula ege imincele yezwe nemfuyo yomphakathi ingaphinde itholakale. Make uMnyango Wezolino ubambisane neminyango eqondene yokuphepha ukuze kuvikelwe ukuntshonthiswa kwemfuyo ngendlela ekwenzeka ngayo.

Mhloniswa Ngqongqoshe Wezolino, ngiyadumala ngokuthi imboni yabalimi abahweba ngenkukhu ihlaliseke lubhojozi kangaka kepha uNgqongqoshe nomnyango wakhe akanazo izinhlelo zokuyitakula. Ngenxa yezivumelwano ezenziwe yiNingizimu Afrika nezwe lasemelika-iBrazil namanye amazwe e-European Union, lokhu kubonakale kungenisa inkukhu esezingeni eliphansi futhi eshibhile lapha ngaphakathi ezweni. Kibonakaleka imboni yokufuya izinkukhu eNingizimu Afrika yehluleka ukumelana nokuncintisana, kwavalwa ezinye izimboni abasebenzi abaningi ikakhulukazi KwaZulu-natali naseLimpopo kule mboni balahlekelwa ngumsebenzi. Angizi kukhuluma lutho ngemithelela yezempilo engemihle ngalesi sivumelwano kepha ngiphawula nje ngokulahleka kwemisebenzi

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 155

eyenzekile nokuthi-ke lokhu okusasele kuhlengwa kanjani ukuze kungandeke ukulahlekwa kweminye imisebenzi.

Impela iqembu Lenkatha Yenkululeko luyakugqibalela ukuthi udaba lwamaholo abasebenzi ezindaweni ezisemapulazini luyadingwa ukweluswa. Nakuba umnyango wezemisebenzi uyibeka imiqathango yamaholo okungafanele abasebenzi bahole ngaphansi kwawo, kepha nokho kwezinye izindawo ikakhulukazi emapulazini le miyalelo ayilandelwa njengoba isuke ibekiwe. Ngakho-ke udaba lwabasebenzi abasebenza amahora eqile kunalawo avumelekile ngoduku kanye nemihlo ewubala kuloku okuvumelekile kuyinto ejwayelekile kwezinye izindawo ezisemapulazini. Ngiyathokoza.

Mr E M MLAMBO: Hon Deputy Chair, hon Deputy Ministers, hon Ministers, MECs; members of executive council, hon members, special delegates and ladies and gentlemen, on the very same day, 1950, the then whites only Parliament of South Africa passed the Groups Areas Act, Act 41 of 1950, to complete the policy of racial segregation by removing Coloured and Indian people from so-called white areas.

*IsiZulu:*

Wumlando lowo ...

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 156

*English:*

... we need not to forget about that, that is where we come from. This series started with the Native Land Act of 1913, which apportioned 8% of the land area of South Africa as reserves for the Africans and excluded them from the rest of the country which was made available to the white minority population.

The promulgation of the Native Land Act made the then Secretary-General of the South African Native National Congress, as the ANC was then known, Sol Plaatje, to write:

Awaking on Friday morning June 20, 1913, the South African native found himself not actually a slave but a pariah in the land of his birth.

Hon Koni, not opportunistic. The Native Land Act was followed by the Native Development and Trust Land Act 18 of 1936, which increased land available for use by Africans by 5% bringing the total to 13% of the total area of South Africa, although much of the land remained in the ownership of the state through the South African Development Trust supposedly held in trust for the African people. Thus, 80% of the population was confined to 13% of the land while less than 20% owned over 80% of the land. The purpose of all this

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 157

racial segregation was; first, the obvious one of making more land available to white farmers, second, was to impoverish black people through dispossession and prohibition of forms of farming arrangements that permitted some self sufficiency - this meant they depended on employment for survival thus creating a pool of cheap labour for the white farms and the mines, third, was the enforcement of the policy of racial segregation. Motivating for the urgent passing of the Bill, on 13 June 1950, the then Minister of Lands, Hans Strydom, had this to say:

If we do not do so as quickly as possible the white race will not be able to maintain itself as a white race and the eventual result will be a bastard race and if our white nation does not preserve its colour sense, nothing on earth can prevent our nation from bastardising.

As I said the Bill was passed and it also granted the Minister of the Interior a mandate to forcibly remove non-whites from valuable pieces of land so that they could become white settlements. What followed thereafter was a nightmare for our people. The general black population of South Africa with forced removals, I just want to make some few examples of how our people in various areas were removed; a rich "closely knit" Indian community that used to live in

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 158**

an area called the Magazine Barracks close to the Durban CBD, Central Business District, was removed under this Act to Chatsworth many kilometres away from their place of work, - it is a pity hon Chetty is not around - a community that comprised 3 500 so-called "Coloured" and 50 Indian families was removed from an area called Die Vlakte within the town of Stellenbosch, African, Indian, so-called "Coloured" and Chinese people were removed from Sophiatown, Kofifi.

There were also the District Six removals in Cape Town. Like the removals of Sophiatown, the District Six removals which affected Coloured, Cape Malay, Indian and African alike gained worldwide notoriety. This apportionment of land remained until the end of apartheid and remains virtually unchanged to date. This is confirmed by the latest statistics and land audits, hon Minister. The Constitutional Court, in the recent judgment in the case of Daniels versus Scribante, also held this view. This, hon Minister, must be a serious indictment on the part of our government as the ANC - at least we are able to critic each other as the ANC - more so because since 1994 land restitution and redistribution has been a key central government programme. As of 2016 the government has pumped more than R60 billion in land reform projects since 1994, but despite this investment the land reform programme has not yielded

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 159**

desired results. However, we do not need opportunists to come and grandstand, we are aware of what we are doing as the ANC.

The majority of our people still do not have land for economic and social reasons, especially those in rural areas. This is so despite the National Development Plan's explicit provision that rural communities require greater social, economic and political opportunities to overcome poverty. We have recently witnessed protests in Gauteng places such as Eldorado Park, Ennerdale and Klipspruit West, and those protesters were clear that they were not only protesting for RDP, Reconstruction and Development Programme, houses, but also for the land where they can build their own houses. Here, in Cape Town a group of Khayelitsha backyarders orchestrated a large land occupation about five weeks ago fighting for land to build houses. The backyarders say that they are tired of renting and living with their parents while a large piece of land has been empty for years.

One serious challenge that we seem to be having is lack of co-ordination and coherence of various structures that we have put in place. Despite this we seem to want to continue with more structures and we need to limit that. For example, on the land reform front aside from the proposed land commission, there is a planned CPA,

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 160**

community property associations, registrar and steps to strengthen communally owned property governance under the draft CPA Amendment Bill. The restitution process is also mired in backlogs and lack of resources as well as challenges of co-ordination with other departments such as agriculture, environmental affairs and water and sanitation.

It is unclear how these various structures created for land reform and restitution would talk to each other. We need to look into that as we go to our policy conference as the ANC so that these structures must be able to ultimately relate to the deeds office and records are proper, hon Minister. All these are some of the reasons why we are not implementing properly the National development Plan. However, the main reason is no doubt the budget. The current Budget for land reform of 0.4% of the national total is clearly not enough to make land purchase affordable. It needs to be increased to about 2% then land purchase would be eminently affordable. There is as such a need for a change of tact. President Zuma, in his response to the National House of Traditional Leaders debate stated that the goal of radical socioeconomic transformation in relation to land reform meant an audit of pre-colonial land ownership after which a single law should be developed to address the issue of land restitution without compensation. He however, stressed that this

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 161**

would be done within the prescripts of the law and the Constitution. As hon Khawula has alluded, I could not agree with President Zuma more. We need this law as in yesterday.

Another possible solution could be the one proposed in a recent round table on land reform by policy makers, administrators, traditional leaders, communal property institution leaders, activists, business people, academics and consultants, where the participants were unanimous that we need an inclusive approach to land reform with a pro-poor orientation. This will require policy makers to create an enabling environment in which a wide range of actors can contribute to land reform.

This means there must be a collaborative approach entailing hard talk and compromises by all stakeholders, including government, farmers, land reform beneficiaries, civil society organisations and financing. However, we must be careful of negotiating forever. The issue of land is now a ticking bomb and we don't have luxury of time. The growing inequality gap between the rich and the poor necessitates that we act fast. The late Comrade Oliver Reginald Tambo, whose centenary birthday we are celebrating this year, had this to say about perpetual negotiations:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 162

How do you deal with a criminal that will not listen to what you have to say and who continues his policy of violence? Some say you continue to talk and let him tire himself out. But nearly 40 years after the institution of apartheid, is there anyone who still believes that verbal persuasion will work?

Those who are negotiating within terms of the land they don't listen to the government of the day and the ANC will act. When negotiating we must be also aware of those people who will deliberately frustrate our efforts of reversing this apartheid legacy for their narrow selfish interests. Theirs is to continue with this legacy so that our people will forever live in poverty. We hope and believe that this Budget, though insufficient, will contribute in ensuring that our people get their land and thus their dignity back. As the ANC, we support this Budget Vote, but before I sit down, hon Minister, please, don't forget the people of KwaNobamba about their land claim that I spoke about in the select committee.

Thank you very much, hon Chair. [Applause.]

Ms M A MOKABA-PHUKWANA: Hon Chairperson, I just saw a picture of a Piet Koekemoer. I don't know if Limpopo ...

*Sepedi:*

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 163

... re šomiša batho go ageletša - ba be diterata.

*English:*

So I just want to apologise to the people of South Africa who are watching this programme, because it is very serious that, that it was just an advertisement of Mickey mouse and dinosaurs.

In his speech to the United Nations Economic Commission for Africa, in Lusaka, 21 April 1979, one of the most outstanding sons of this soil, Kaizana Oliver Reginald Tambo narrated about a vision of a future in which we shall no longer experience the haunting spectacle of a child digging through refuse heaps, searching for rotten pieces of food.

This can only be achieved through expanding irrigated agriculture as well as integrating rural and commercial farming. There is evidence, for example that 1,5 million hectares under irrigation can be expanded by at least 500 000 hectares through more efficient use of existing water resources and the development of new water schemes.

Hon Ministers, Deputy Ministers, Chairpersons, Members of the Portfolio Committees, fellow MEC's present here. Members of the NCOP distinguished guests and fellow South Africans, good afternoon.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 164**

We are persuaded by research and the NDP that agriculture is the primary economic activity in rural areas with potential to create close to one million new jobs by 2030. Furthermore, the NDP stated that we can bring under used land in the communal areas into commercial production.

We also need to develop strategies to support new farmers and link them with the markets. To make the most of these opportunities, we need an integrated approach to farming. We need interdepartmental cooperation in order to maximise our available resources especially to expand our water resources and irrigation infrastructure.

We also need to invest in market linkages such as road and rail infrastructure, cold chain facilities and market information systems.

Critically, we need to find ways of providing tenure security for communal farmers, and investigate better ways of financing land reform so that new farmers do not become saddled with debt.

The plan proposes a district based approach to land reform and financing. It proposes that each district should establish a

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 165**

district land reform committee where all stakeholders share information.

This is the year of OR Tambo and the Youth Month; we therefore dare not refer from to his work with doubt and fear for rattling the feathers.

Addressing the International Conference in Harare in 1987 on the topic: Children, Repression and the Law in Apartheid South Africa, OR deliberately quoted an Afrikaner poet, Ingrid Jonker, who committed suicide at the young age of 32. She took her life after being overwhelmed by the depression of the unbearable conditions of the apartheid regime. May her soul rest in peace.

This illustrate the non-racial, passion, strength and foresight of OR. His embodiment ought to baptize us more than ever, as we take a leap in his great convictions. We are in this year of unity in action, as he would normally preach, we must take the bull by its horns. This we do in an effort to radically transform the economy of our beloved country. This we must do for the children and youth of this land to ultimately enjoy their rightful position amongst nations of the world.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 166**

Based on this hypothesis, you will agree that the central theme for Operation Phakisa as cited by the Minister for Agriculture Forestry and Fisheries in his Budget Speech is not accidental. We are more and better ready to transforming the Agricultural Sector towards an inclusive rural economy.

That we must do through a deliberate empowerment of the previously disadvantaged farmers, the youth, women and people living with disabilities. That could only happen when our commercial farmers who unfortunately, the majority happen to be white, joins us as government in this transformation trajectory.

That is one way we can positively impact on the conditions of our rural communities by generating and growing the economy in those areas. That will contribute towards managing urban sprawl that leads to overcrowding and centralised unemployment and crime.

However well crafted our policies, we cannot deliver unless we integrate our societies around patriotism and working towards a common purpose. The approach will not only improve our rural community livelihoods, but their health status as well. That is guaranteed as we will be producing and consuming fresh produce from our countryside.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 167**

We are indeed actualizing agriculture as one of the critical sectors that can serve as a catalyst for radical socio-economic transformation. Agriculture can create and ensure food security for all. We need to decisively unlock challenges of previously disadvantaged farmers in rural areas by speeding up the development of agric-parks.

The revitalisation of the agriculture and agro-processing value chain remains one of our key plans towards economic growth and job creation. The successful hosting of National Food and Nutrition Security Indaba by our National Department of Monitoring and Evaluation in January 2017 was a great collaborative milestone.

The conference highlighted the negative impact of disintegrated approach towards development. At the level of provinces, we ought to ensure that Land Reform and Agriculture are harmonized, as the latter depends highly on the former. Prime agricultural land must be protected under the land reform policies to ensure sustainability and the much needed food security and employment.

We need to synchronise our priorities between hunger and shelter. The finalisation of the National Comprehensive Producer Development Support policy is expected to be a benchmarking tool at the level of

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 168**

provinces. The implementation should also highlight the imperatives of regional agricultural competitive advantages.

This should spark the appetite for provinces to focus on their comparative advantage and maximise their ability commercial reasons. Regions could then start trading between themselves and augment their capabilities.

That, hon members, could only be realised if we work together and improve on our research and development. Cooperate with our academic institutions and professionals in the field. We need the support from government, private and non-governmental agencies.

In Limpopo, we have recently reviewed our Farmer Support Policy to comprehensively provide the required support. The exercise will leverage an all encompassing aid to a farmer in order to fast track commercialisations.

We have recently in our province, made a call to farmers to register with the department in order to update our data base for improved support. Our announcement coincides with the youth month in order to attract the youth into agriculture. Our first intake batch and

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 169**

support is especially aimed at encouraging young farmers to grab this opportunity.

Most of our youth are often characterised as pursuing quick fixes strategies. The youth is known for being impatient and reluctant to be involved in the agricultural sector that required patience, commitment and hard work.

We must always discourage shortcuts in our daily activities, particularly as agricultural operatives. We must therefore widen incentive schemes to attract the youth to this all important lifeline sector. As we commemorate the forty first year of youth uprisings since 1976, we welcome the aggressive youth engagement efforts by the Department of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries.

We must spare no effort in encouraging our children to get their hands dirty and realise the importance and wealth of the sector.

As a province our efforts are focussed at the empowerment of the youth through training, farmer support, and incentivised programs. One such project is the Young Farmer Awards events that are taking place towards month end. We have gone back to basics by revitalising

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 170

the school gardening program as a way of fostering the passion and love for agriculture at a young age.

The youth is our future. We need to involve them in our mainstream economic activities through support and development. We need to secure their young imagination and channel them towards agricultural productivity. In this case, I prelude that the agrarian revolution belongs to the youth. We must integrate the youth in every agricultural initiative.

*Sepedi:*

Ka Sepedi sa bo rena re re: "Rutang bana ditaola le se ye natšo badimong."

*English:*

We must teach them young. We should rise above the dictate that the struggle is between the new that is struggling to be born against the old that is refusing to die.

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: MEC, can you sum up?

Ms M A MOKABA-PHUKWANA: We must revert to the crisis pointed out by Antonio Gramsci in his notes from prison when he state that:

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 171**

The old is dying whilst the new is not yet born. It is just unfortunate that I can't continue. Thank you very much. Let me thank everyone and again to hon Smit through you Chairperson that I think it will be good if the Minister will take this matter seriously so and investigate and should we found that this is an allegation, bring the man to me. I will sort him out.

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: I must apologise, I tried to be flexible but when I look at your speech I realised that you will need another 10 minutes to conclude, but is fine. Oh, you didn't get me?

Mr C F B SMIT: Hon Deputy Chairperson, I believe is a threat that is being referred to my side by the MEC.

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: I wouldn't really regard it as a threat, but a suggestion on how to deal with the matter that has been brought before the House. So, I won't take that as a point of order.

Mr L B GAEHLER: Hon Chairperson, the UDM supports budget 24 and budget 39, however, with regard to the Department of Agriculture and Forestry, the mere location of R975 million to the Agricultural

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 172**

Research Council, ARC, is far from being sufficient. Moreover, if things go according to plan Ncexha farms in the Eastern Cape is due to be taken over by the ARC during the course of the current financial year therefore, more financial support is required. There is a need to consider the budget allocation to Onderstepoort Biological Products, OBP, as the infrastructure there is decaying

The department must move with speed in ensuring that its targets are aligned with its performance indicators. This department need to work very closely with the department of land affairs so that those who have ideas on the use of land to produce food are able to be assisted to access land and realise their ideas. South African with bright ideas on the usage land, must be helped to access and work the land.

The worrying factor is that stock theft is at a very high rate. Last month in Xongara 260 sheep were stolen, 144 were from a widow. This needs to be addressed.

The Fisheries sector faces ongoing strife. It has no transformation charter, and as a result, there are no clear policy guidelines on the allocation of fishing rights, yet the stocks at sea are declining. Something urgent has to be done. The Department of Rural

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 173**

Development and Land Affairs, we wish to suggest that the monitoring of progress with regard to the Agri-Parks must be conducted regularly so that this initiative can be able to realise its good intentions.

The UDM also appeals that the process of finalising the outstanding internal disciplinary cases should be expedited. We need stability in the administration of this department because it deals with very emotional issues that affects the lives of our people, in particular the peasantry and the rural areas.

Hon Minister of Rural Development, in 2012 you sent a former Deputy Minister of Rural Development hon Nxesi to Hybrid farms. An agreement was then reached there that the 34 claimants will be paid. Up to date nothing has been done. Worst of all hon Minister is that most of their land is taken by people and they are selling it at a high price. I have been at your Department of Land Claims in Umtata and the leader there showed me court orders which are not being implemented. Worst of all, while they have court orders on this illegal land sale of which the money does neither go to the government fiscus, nor to the traditional leaders agriculture on one side is demarcating land. There is a court order this side, on the other side national agriculture is demarcating land. So, this needs

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 174

to be addressed. We therefore suggest that a political decision needs to be taken here whereby rural development, agriculture and the police sector meets so that in the elite unit investigates where these monies go to.

Chairperson ...

*IsiXhosa:*

... ndincedakele ukuba neli xesha lingaka. Inkazathi ...

*English:*

... hon Wana, we were sober when we went into that coalition ...

*IsiXhosa:*

... besinganxilanga. [We were not drunk.]

*English:*

We knew what that coalition is about. It was about South Africans. Worst of all you cannot tell me about inkazathi [coalition.] who are you to tell us about inkazathi? When you went into inkazathi to the National Party. That is why we are in this mess. It is because of the inkazathi you had with National Party. That is why our people do not have land, it is because of the inkazathi with National party;

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 175

that is why you don't control the economy of this country because of the nkazathi with National Party; you cannot tell us about the nkazathi. Secondly, Mdungwa, I respect you ...

*IsiXhosa:*

... uyayazi loo nto leyo, kodwa ndiya nyanzeleka ukuba ndikuphendule. Indawo yokuqala laa nto iqhubeka phaya eNelson Mandela ...

*English:*

... the leadership, as the collective, is handling that; that is under control.

*IsiXhosa:*

Nina anikwazi ukusixelela ngaloo nto kuba izolo oku beninengxaki apha e-Buffalo City, ooceba benu ...

*English:*

... voting against their own mayor; your own councillor voting with our opposition.

*IsiXhosa:*

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 176

Beninayo ingxaki kwakhona phaya eMnquma ooceba benu besilwa bodwa.  
Into yokugqibela ebalulekileyo ...

*English:*

... the councillors of the opposition in the King Sabata Dalindyebo, KSD, Municipality were requesting a report ...

*IsiXhosa:*

... ngemali yesifihlo sikaTata uMandela eyatyiwayo.

*English:*

That report is not forthcoming; so, address your problems within the ANC, worse ...

*English:*

... Tata uMthethwa apho kuwe eNatala ooceba bakho bayabulalana phaya. Asikabulalani ke thina. Simisa ingqondo kwezi nkazathi zethu asinayo ingxaki. Enkosi. [Kwaqhwytywa.]

Mr J W W JULIUS: Deputy Chair, hon members, Ministers in the House and South Africans at large, in order to ensure that these budgets are not used to further advance the practices of corruption, maladministration, project failures, preferential treatment and

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 177**

other actions that hamper the priorities of these departments, we need to ensure that these practices are stopped once and for all. Today we have the departments of Rural Development and Land Reform with the Department of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries in one room and in one debate. I think that the two Ministers missed an opportunity to deal with the challenges impacting on one another's departments.

I agree with hon Smit and I was in the meeting, during the Budget Vote presentations to the select committee, the Ministers revealed that the reason for some major failures could be blamed on the other department not working together. Allow me to challenge both departments to confront each other here on the frustrations that you face with each other's departments. Let me make an example, the failed land reform projects where there were once lucrative farms are now lying dormant. The one department blames the other. You now have an opportunity to set the record straight, sought it out with yourselves Ministers, there are problems. Maybe it is a bloated Cabinet, I don't know.

Policy uncertainty or in this case, drunk policy utterances, hon Mlambo, are mainly blamed for slow progress over the years and will certainly impact badly on further transformation efforts. Earlier

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 178**

this year, President Zuma suggested that land should be expropriated without compensation. This in effect means that section 25 of the Constitution must be changed. The ANC policy document on the other hand suggest that you do away with paying premiere prices and instead pay just and equitable compensation. Ministers, can you please clear the air in terms of your land reform policy. Do you agree with President Jacob Zuma's views or not? If you do not agree, are you willing to go on record here to say that the President made reckless statements that are not in line with ANC policies because policies impact on your delivery?

Minister Nkwinti, the Bekendvlei Farm is still a problem to me. You introduced your friends from Luthuli House to the officials in your department. I am saying your friends because they were in Luthuli House, you knew the person from there and you were a guest speaker at the wedding. Therefore, you have to know them. Forget about the grave corruption allegations and forget about the fact that they later changed the tune and they actually made allegations against you. The point what I am getting is that, why could we not give the opportunity to the people that worked on the farm for over 20 years to own the farm? They have years of experience and it is their livelihood, unlike your friends who did not have any experience in farming. How do we determine who will benefit from land reform? Is

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 179

the politically connected or the poor people of South Africa? Rural people are sold out in favour of your friends in the ANC.

Hon Ncitha, you would agree with me that this is not transformation, this is radical cadre transformation. The ANC first and the people of South Africa last. Land claims remain a challenge, Minister Nkwinti. You know that the Opperman's ground in Koffiiefontein is still not resolved. For over 10 years ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES: Hon Julius, can you take a seat? Yes, hon member.

Ms P C SAMKA: ... [Inaudible.] ... if a member can take a question.

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES: Hon Julius, are you prepared to take a question?

Mr J W W JULIUS: No ... [Inaudible.] ... I'm sorry.

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES: No, he is not prepared.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 180

Mr J W W JULIUS: I don't take here the statement of the member ... [Inaudible.] ... the hon member is an elder. Can you please call him to order? It is an elder and I must take a question - that is out of order.

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES: Hon Julius, I put the question to you whether if you are prepared to take a question and you said no.

Mr J W W JULIUS: And I said no.

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES: I responded to the member that you are not prepared to take the question. Therefore, any other comment I don't know about it and I didn't hear it and it is off the record. Order, hon member! Can you continue?

Mr J W W JULIUS: Land claims remain a challenge, Minister Nkwinti, the Opperman's grounds in Koffiiefontein is still not resolved. For over 10 years the department is dragging its feet and subsequently failing the poorest of the poor. Can you please commit to look into this matter because these people are bit ageing and they actually confronted me last week about this. Hon Qoboshiyane, you know the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 181

people of Nelson Mandela Bay are happy. They are happy. The ANC must get over it and you lost the municipality. Get over it and move on with your lives. Get your party in order and fight elections. You lost. The people rejected the ANC in Nelson Mandela Bay. Get over it. Get over it once and for all. And yes, hon Qoboshiyane, you mentioned a few successes in the Eastern Cape and I'm happy. I see that he is gone now, Minister.

However, he failed to mention the following where the DA had to go and look what is happening in the Eastern Cape: The Magwa and Majola tea plantations where R200 million was pumped into that project and no harvesting took place by 2015, workers have not been paid up to 13 months; further, the Ncora Irrigation Scheme, no maintenance of irrigation canals done for years in that one; and the Fort Cox Agricultural College, it is in an appalling condition and you didn't even mention it that that farm was neglected for years. We know about you in the Eastern Cape. Don't come and boost here and say that what you are doing and all that reveal what you are doing.

Minister, there is also the one in Gauteng where the Gauteng department bought a farm for R11 million, the West Rand Agricultural College. There is nothing happening there. It is also in an appalling state and nothing is happening. How do we expect to

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 182**

transform agriculture in this country if we close these agricultural schools? It will now cost over R100 million to restore it in its own value and I think that we should do something about it, Minister. I thank you. [Time expired.] [Applause.]

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF RURAL DEVELOPMENT AND LAND REFORMS: Hon Chair, hon Ministers, Deputy Ministers, MECs present and all members and guests present here, good evening during this lively debate. This debate takes place just a few days before we commemorate the 41st anniversary of June 16. We really today should salute those that laid down their lives in June 16 to make sure that we are able to be here today and speak freely. This is also the month when that noble document was adopted, the Freedom Charter, whose DNA is found today in the South African Constitution. The RDP document explained, when it said:

The land reform programme as part of a comprehensive rural development program must encourage the use of land for agricultural, other productive or residential purposes.

It further asserts that a national land reform programme is the central and driving force of a programme of rural development as it tries to reverse effects of nearly 350 years of colonial conquests.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 183**

We are guided by these policy documents. We are addressing the injustices of forced removals and the historical denial of access to land through restitution. We are ensuring that security of tenure for rural people, farm dwellers and Transformation of Certain Rural Areas Act, TRANCRAA, communities. We are rekindling the emergence of the black farmer who must play a meaningful role in the Agro-processing value chain. We are addressing the triple challenges of poverty, unemployment and inequality.

The last time we were in this august House we were talking of piloting District Land Reform Committees, DLRC, we can happily report that these land reform committees have been successfully launched in all our 44 districts. Applications for acquisition and location of land to potential beneficiaries go through these committees. They have subcommittees known as the Beneficiaries Selection Committees which screens and interviews applicants for farms. Their input and that of the provincial structure informs the decision that is taken through National Land Allocation and Recapitalisation Control Committee, NLARCC. We have initiated One Household One Hectare land reform programme targeting state-owned farms and communal land to create rural smallholder producers at household level to ensure food security, reduce poverty, develop skills and support the Agri-parks Programme.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 184**

The department has approved 158 sites benefitting 5 734 households across the country. Six of these sites were launched by the Minister, benefitting close to 700 households at a value of R30,4 million. These are in Mantusini, Gorah, Krugerpost Farm situated in O R Tambo and Sarah Baartman districts respectively, Westwood Farm at Umgungundlovu district, KwaMashabalane and Libhaba CPA farms in Mkhondo district. In Limpopo we are implementing this programme in 19 sites situated in Vhembe, Capricorn, Mopani, Sekhukhune and Waterberg districts. On strengthening the relative rights of people working the land, we have received over a 100 applications under this programme and 14 of these were approved in the last financial year.

Thus far we have invested close to R700 000 benefitting 4 450 beneficiaries. These are some of the projects which have been approved. In the Free State, Oatlands, Diamond and Kalkput farms; Eastern Cape, Birbury and Klein Monden River farms; KwaZulu-Natal, Paardefontein farm and Houghton farm; Limpopo Dabchick Farm; North West Stars Away; Western Cape Solms Delta. On the Recapitalisation and Development Programme, RADP, there are 1 496 farms under this programme since 2009 and amounting to an investment of R4 billion. This has helped to create more than 7 000 jobs in the agricultural sector. These projects are divided as follows: Eastern Cape 196,

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 185**

Free State 182, Gauteng 117, KwaZulu-Natal 218, Limpopo 206, Mpumalanga 209, Northern Cape 83, North West 216, Western Cape 69.

The Minister has indicated that this function will now move, as you all know, to the Department of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries. On restitution, the commission has exceeded most of its annual performance targets. For example, the Annual Performance Plan, APP, target was 454, and the actual claims that were settled were 672. The provincial breakdown is as follows: Limpopo 127, Western Cape 159, Gauteng 78, Free State 84, KwaZulu-Natal 81, Eastern Cape 63, Mpumalanga 30, North West 25 and Northern Cape 25 too. Some of the successful restitution projects, Ravele in Limpopo; Nkanini in KwaZulu-Natal and Matsafeni in Mpumalanga are indeed making South Africans proud and serve as an inspiration to other similar projects.

Recently, we also learnt of the success story of the Malambwane CPA outside Makhado in Limpopo who run a thriving game farming and breeding enterprise after their land was returned to them in 2008. On Communal Property Institutions, CPIs, land redistribution programmes meant that groups of persons now control land on a communal basis. These enormous resources at their disposal sometimes cause conflict that at times involves courts having to adjudicate on

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 186**

such disputes. This necessitated the passing of the Communal Property Associations Act in 1996. The Act is currently being amended as we all know. The Land Rights Management Facility, LRMF, established in 1998, is meant to give legal support to people being evicted illegally or threatened with evictions on farms. The state-funded panel of land rights lawyers and mediators are available to provide access to justice to indigent people in rural farming areas. The breakdown of the 156 eviction cases dealt with in the last financial year are as follows: Eastern Cape five, Free State 13, Gauteng 13, KwaZulu-Natal, Limpopo two, Mpumalanga 22, Northern Cape zero, North West seven, Western Cape a huge 66 evictions.

[Interjections.] You should actually congratulate the Northern Cape, no one has been evicted. You must listen. The department is busy with a programme on Deeds of implementing the alignment programme which is meant to align the Deeds Registry Areas of jurisdiction to provincial boundaries. In other words, each Deeds Registry should service the province in which it is located.

Through this programme the Deeds Office was established in Polokwane a few months ago. The separation and transfer of all physical and electronic records from the Cape Town office to Kimberley was another milestone. The National Geomatics Management Services, the department is responsible for the provision of accurate geospatial

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 187**

information to support other institutions while playing a leading role in different fora [forums] in Africa and in other international forums. Spatial Data Infrastructure Act will regulate the sharing of key geospatial data amongst organs of state. The Office of the Valuer-General assists the various branches in the department as they implement their programmes through systems put in place.

On rural development, in the last financial year, the department has implemented 179 Animal and Veld Management, 7 River Valley Catalytic, 69 Socioeconomic and 53 Agri-parks related infrastructure projects. The implementation of these infrastructure programmes has had significant impact in our rural communities thus creating 1 574 jobs. On Agri-parks, one of the key initiatives announced in the 2015 state of the nation address was the Agri-park programme. We can be pleased to announce that significant progress has been made to date. The Agri-parks Programme seeks to improve production by smallholder farmers, improved access to markets and engagement in the agriculture value chain.

Three Agri-hubs are already operational in Ncora, Springbokpan and Westonaria. In Butterworth an abattoir is under construction.

Farmers in the surrounding areas are being mobilised to supply red meat to the abattoir. In Thaba Nchu, the abattoir has been upgraded,

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 188**

the access road has been regravelled and the boundary fencing has been completed. The Springfontein Agri-hub in the Xhariep District is being developed and the fencing and water connections have been completed. The Hon President recently visited the Westonaria Agri-park. This facility includes state of the art vertical hydroponic tunnels as well as a pack house and training facility amongst other supporting infrastructure.

In Bushbuckridge, a pack house and cold storage facility will become fully operational in this financial year. In Dr. J S Moroka Municipality, within the Nkangala District Municipality, a fresh produce market is complete and the facility will become fully operational in this financial year, 1 150 farmers will supply produce to the fresh produce market. Yes, clap hands. [Applause.] In the Capricorn Agri-hub the provincial government has completed the Raletjena Packhouse and dryer for a black farmer. This processing and packaging facility sees the establishment of one of our first black industrialist as a result of the Agri-Parks programme. The Nwanedi Pack house is under construction, and on completion in the current financial year, it will provide support to 150 farmers.

In the last financial year, the department implemented seven River Valley Catalytic projects to revitalise four irrigation schemes on

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 189**

2 000 hectares in KwaZulu-Natal and Mpumalanga. These include Ndumo, Mthandeni, Buffelspruit, Madadeni and Figtree schemes. To support the revitalisation of rural towns and villages, the department in the last financial year completed in the Western Cape the upgrading of gravel roads, walkways and construction of a storm water system in Kassiesbaai. In this financial year, 30 socioeconomic infrastructure projects will be completed at an investment of R252 million, which will result in creation of more than 2 000 jobs. Skills development is an important component of radical socioeconomic transformation and to this end; we will skill more than 1 480 rural people as part of the rural disaster mitigation programme.

The Co-operative Financial Institution, CFI, in May 2016, arts and crafts co-operatives successfully registered the co-operative financial institution namely Mzansi Rural Art and Craft CFI which is a deposit taking financial institution, owned and controlled by its members. The members have demonstrated commitment by depositing savings on a monthly basis and have paid R50 000 for participation in the banking platform. The CFI will continue to increase its membership to ensure sustainability. In conclusion, we are forging ahead with the implementation of the National Development Plan, NDP. We are busy with institutional transformation.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 190

As I sit down, I just want to say that the concern we have about Nelson Mandela Bay, is the fact that there is nothing happening. People are fighting there. and lastly, I was very concerned when Ms Dlomo asked whether it is parliamentary to use the word "balls" I was just wondering what if Xhosa was used what would the person be saying. [Laughter.] I am now going to sit down. I just want to say that the EFF ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES: Hon Deputy Minister, can you just take your seat.

Ms N P KONI: Hon Chairperson ...

*Setswana:*

...ke kopa o nkitsisetse motl Motlatsatona gore ke nyetswe ko maxhoseng, a ka nna a nleka ka sexhosa. Ke a se itse.

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES: No, that is not a point of order.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF RURAL DEVELOPMENT AND LAND REFORMS: The hon member of the EFF correctly narrated the history of colonialism.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 191**

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES: Order!

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF RURAL DEVELOPMENT AND LAND REFORMS: I just wanted to remind her that she is exactly responsible for the mess we find ourselves in Nelson Mandela. She voted there for the DA to win that particular municipality together with ... and lastly, hon Minister Nkwinti and hon Minister Zokwana, as people who fought for freedom, I just want to remind you; the security police would detain both of you and put you in different cells. They would go to that cell and say, hon Nkwinti, Mr Zokwana says this about you and they would go to the other one and say, hon Zokwana, Mr Nkwinti says this about you. Old tricks refuse to die. Sies! Hon Smit, Sies!

[Applause.]

Mr V R SHONGWE (Mpumalanga): Thank you very much Deputy Chairperson. Hon Minister Nkwinti and hon Minister Zokwana, Deputy Minister baba Skwatsha and Deputy Minister baba Cele, hon members of the NCOP and distinguished guests, all protocol observed.

Let me take this opportunity to appreciate the privilege of participating in this debate on the two very important departments that are fundamental and central in the fight against the three

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 192**

stubborn triple challenges in South Africa, which are unemployment, poverty and inequality.

Our ability to implement government policies and particularly accelerating the implementation of the core mandates of the two departments is a precondition for a successful battle to conquer the social challenges facing the majority of our people, particularly the previously disadvantaged ones.

As provinces we work tirelessly to support the efforts that the national department does by putting in place tangible programmes and action plans that work towards the achievement of our goals. This we do to complement and deepen government's efforts to liberate our people from all forms of the negative colonial legacy.

As part of ensuring that we oil our machinery and also to strengthen the efforts put in place by the Department of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries, as well as the Department of Rural Development and Land Reform, we in Mpumalanga conducted a provincial land indaba to discuss pertinent policies and issues affecting the land reform programme.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 193**

We cohosted the indaba with the Department of Rural Development and Land Reform, which was attended by about a thousand stakeholders. During our engagement at that indaba we noted that, despite the intervention and progress made on the land reform programme, there are still more serious challenges facing beneficiaries, contributing immensely to the deterioration of some of these farms.

As I mentioned, the indaba was attended by about a thousand stakeholders representing farm dwellers and vulnerable farmworkers, representatives of communal property associations, CPAs, and trusts, traditional leaders, youth and women in farming, organised agriculture, nongovernmental organisations, NGOs, and commercial farmers.

However, at the end of the indaba there was consensus among the stakeholders that the land question is an emotional one and it cannot be addressed and finalised in only two days. As part of intensifying and building on the base we have laid, we will share the resolution taken at the indaba with all the relevant affected departments and other government agencies, as well as commercial farmers, for their implementation.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 194

I just want to remind the House today ... just to take you back a bit. You see ...

*IsiZulu:* ... umhlinishwa osuka eNtshonalanga kappa ukhuluma ngodaba lwaseNelson Mandela ...

*English:*

... and the challenges that our people are facing there. I am from Mpumalanga. I do not stay in the Eastern Cape but I can tell you here right now about the experience of a black person who stays at 306 Sadie Street, Lynnwood Park, in the eastern part of Pretoria. That person ...

*IsiZulu:*

... uhleli ngaphandle kogesi ...

*English:*

... for the past four days. He reported this case to the DA government and he was updated from time to time. They had received his complaint and they were going to attend to it. For the past four days they have not attended to that particular challenge and that particular person ended up hiring a private company to go and fix that particular challenge. So for people to come here and say ...

*IsiZulu:*

... ukuthi umhlinishwa uQoboshiyane ...

*English:*

... from the Eastern Cape is lying is not true. The government of the DA does not care about a black person. They don't care about a black person ... [Interjections.] ... and I'm saying this because in Lynnwood Park ...

*IsiZulu:*

... kuhlala ...

*English:*

... mainly white people and that particular black person is the only one. The only person ...

*IsiZulu:*

... ongenawo ugesi ...

*English:*

... electricity is that only person ...

An HON MEMBER: You're a racist man!

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 196

Mr V R SHONGWE (Mpumalanga): ... and you want to tell me that you care about people? People are paying dearly for voting for this particular party.

An HON MEMBER: You're a racist! [Interjections.] You're a racist!

Ms B A ENGELBRECHT: Mr Chair, point of order: The hon member is misleading this House. [Interjections.] Can I be protected please? It's a point order.

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: No, no, no hon members. Yes?

Ms B A ENGELBRECHT: The reason why there is no electricity is because the cables have been stolen. Cables to the value of R20 million are being stolen in Pretoria on a weekly basis. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon members, order!

Ms B A ENGELBRECHT: So he mustn't come and lie, and say it's because he's a black person. It's got nothing to with skin colour. Absolute ... [Inaudible.] [Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 197

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Order, order! Can you keep quiet ma'am? Can you keep quiet? Can you take your seat? Can you take your seat? Can you take your seat? No, no, no hon member, can you take your seat? No, I'm not going to allow you to speak. I'm not going to allow you. I'm not going to allow ... Yes, I'm not going to allow you! [Interjections.] Can you take your seat? [Interjections.] Hon member, can you take your seat? You are being disruptive! You are being disruptive! You are being disruptive!

Hon members, I think we must address this thing so that it doesn't repeat itself. You can heckle but you don't have to debate with a member who is at the podium, especially if your party had participated in the debate. So let us not do that. Let us not do that. [Interjections.] I'm calling you to order but you continue doing that. That should be the last time now. Can you continue hon member? Hon Koni?

Ms N P KONI: Deputy Chairperson, you will be the second presiding officer today that I will be calling to order about the conduct of the DA in this House, and you don't chase them out of the House. [Interjections.] But let me tell you that if it was the EFF you would have chased me out of the House long ago. This thing

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 198

Chairperson ... please. Consistency! Chairperson, we must be told if these bouncers are only for the EFF. We must be told.

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon Koni, can you take your seat? Alright. Can you take your seat hon member? I've made a ruling on the matter. Can you continue with the debate hon member?

*IsiZulu:*

Mnu V R SHONGWE: Sekela Sihlalo, ngifuna ukubuyela ngisho ukuthi le nto engiyishoyo ngifuna ibe ...

*English:*

... loud and clear ...

*IsiZulu:*

... ukuthi loya ngesi lapho uhambe khona ...

*English:*

It is not about infrastructure ...

*IsiZulu:*

... noma kutshontshwe ikhebula ...

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 199

*English:*

... the only thing ...

*IsiZulu:*

... logesi uhambe endlini yomuntu omnyama kuphela. Abomakhelwane bamhlophe ugesi awuhambanga khona.

*English:*

You are spot on MEC from the Eastern Cape. This is what our people will always pay for voting for this particular party, which is very cruel towards our people. [Interjections.]

In order to transform the agricultural sector, the province of Mpumalanga designed and deliberately put in place mechanisms to introduce youth into farming as an economic activity through the Fortune 40 Young Farmers Incubator programme which was officially launched in September 2015.

Already in the past year the department was able to support 15 projects with infrastructure while seven of these are already in production and are doing very well. These farms are run by young people and we are very pleased with their commitment and the progress they are making. [Applause.]

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 200**

Through Fortune 40 our aim is to draw young people into farming, thereby creating jobs in the process and ensuring that land which was lying fallow for years is brought back into production. In the process we are putting a dent to the triple challenges.

We have just returned from a very successful outbound mission to Serbia and Egypt to see tractor assembly plants and maintenance scheme that we are working towards establishing in Mpumalanga. The tractors in question are much different to the ones that we know. They are of a better quality, stronger, reliable and effectively conducive to the South African soil surface and terrain, which includes hard land.

This initiative will not only create job opportunities but will also bring great improvements to the development of our growing agricultural economy. Two operational sites have already been identified for these developments, at Ekandastria in Nkangala and Secunda in Gert Sibande in the Mpumalanga province, respectively.

As part of ensuring that the land under the control of amakhosi is used productively and effectively to contribute to food security efforts, we have developed a new programme to intervene in that space for the benefit of their subjects. As a department, we will

identify a few amakhosi who have land that is underutilised, interact with them and enter into an agreement to ensure that the land becomes productive.

To support land reform beneficiaries, we provide them with technical and infrastructure support. These include subsistence food producers, smallholder farmers, co-operatives and the Fortune 40 programme. To emphasise the tilling of the land, we mobilise our farmers through a slogan called, Phezu Komkhono Mlimi.

*IsiZulu:*

Uma sithi phezu komkhono mlimi sisho ukuthi ...

*English:*

All the time we have been saying ...

*IsiZulu:*

... asibuyele emasimini.

*English:*

Now, to practicalise that particular concept we are saying ...

*IsiZulu:*

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 202

... phezu komkhono mlimi ...

*English:*

... meaning, let's do it practically now. [Applause.]

I must mention that during the 2016-17 financial year, 1 033 smallholder producers were supported, with 203 farm assessments completed. We further compiled 157 project performances ... which are in the process of realising the creation of 195 jobs through land reform.

There are also 32 young agricultural graduates that we placed on land reform farms across the province. We also had 12 commodity-based mentorship initiatives implemented and maintained. We included vegetables, sugar cane, citrus, livestock, grains, mushrooms, soya beans, dry beans, as well as poultry.

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Can you summarise now Mr Shongwe?

Mr V R SHONGWE (Mpumalanga): Oh, thank you very much. We are also engaged in a programme of nutrition where we supply schools and create a market for our small farmers. We are also dealing with

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 203**

agriparks. We have three. One is in Dr J S Moroka, another is in Mkondo and the third one is in Gert Sibande. We are also reopening the Marapyane Agricultural College so that we empower our young and old farmers.

Mr J W W JULIUS: Chairperson, sorry to the speaker who is actually concluding, but I think you must treat us all fairly. When I was on the podium you just said, your time is up, stop. It happened with all other speakers. Yet, with ANC speakers I have noticed the whole day that you give them time to conclude; time to conclude. I mean, it's unfair.

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Okay, thank you very much for bringing that to my attention. Can you conclude hon MEC?

Mr V R SHONGWE (Mpumalanga): We are also boasting of a soil testing laboratory in the province of Mpumalanga where we are testing soil and where we have scientists that are engaged in a number of aspects in so far as agriculture is concerned. I think the Western Cape can learn a lot from us in Mpumalanga. [Applause.]

Ms B SCHAFER: Hon Deputy Chairperson, Ministers, hon members, fellow colleagues, good evening. The acquisition and use of land is both a

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 204**

pertinent and a painful topic of discussion in South African politics. The bitter legacy of apartheid is most visible in the clear spatial divisions in our country, which continues to separate races and, in turn, perpetuate racial oppression by cutting black South Africans off from land which they have always had a right to claim.

The denial of land to the majority of South Africa's population is arguably the most important factor contributing to a lack of economic opportunity in our country. Where each and every one of our country's residents should be able to make use of the land equally, some remain excluded with no hope of change.

Under the ANC, land reform has moved at a snail's pace, and hope of owning and making use of land among the majority of our citizens is fast dwindling. In addition to the failure to restore 20% of South Africa's land to black farmers by the year 2030 as outlined in the National Development Plan, NDP, there is neither a database to check the number of land restitution cases carried out by the Department of Rural Development and Land Reform, nor a contingency plan to ensure that farmers are skilled to make efficient use of the land upon acquisition. The communication and cooperation between the Departments of Agriculture, and Rural Development and Land Reform

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 205**

have lapsed and failed over the past 20 years resulting in a backlog of land restitution cases and a lack of skill and expertise necessary for efficient land exploitation.

Quite simply, a process vital to reversing economic exclusion in South Africa has been overlooked by this national government. The ANC has not prioritised the physical embodiment of racial oppression in South Africa, the very reason why so many of our fellow citizens remain in poverty and economic turmoil. In stark contrast, the Western Cape's land reform support unit and reform success by making sure that beneficiaries can make efficient and successful use of the land as part of an ever-growing and inclusive Western Cape economy is happening. Where the national government has failed, the Western Cape is beginning to pave the way forward for equal access to land for all South Africans in line with the DA's policy on land reform.

Although the mandate for land reform lies with the National Department of Rural Development and Land Reform, it is in the interest of the Western Cape that land reform farmers become a success, given its constitutional imperative. It is exactly this appreciation that led the Western Cape to call the first ever land reform summit. The purpose was to bring together diverse

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 206**

stakeholders in the agriculture and agribusiness sector to discuss land reform models their challenges on support services and to make recommendations on models to be piloted in the province.

Land reform should not be at the behest of food security and arable land. Land that can produce food must be given to real farmers who want to farm. I would like to acknowledge Minister Zokwana's remarks on this importance of food security and the protection of agricultural sector in South Africa.

The Western Cape's commodity approach in the delivery of support systems and of land reform farmers across the province is simply a partnership arrangement with the private sector aimed at ensuring access to mentorship and markets for land reform farms through the existing commodity networks. A partnership of 120 hectares of fruit had been planted on land reform farmers with the assistance of home of the SA deciduous fruit grower, Hortgro. In addition, over 293 land reform projects had received support from the department since 2009.

To further accelerate the pace of transformation, our Land Reform Advisory Desk situated at Casidra's head office is there to assist land owners with land reform initiatives in this province.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 207

Chairperson, a great deal of farmers in the Western Cape wants to participate in land reform. This deal gives the private sector the opportunity to participate in transforming the agricultural sector of the Western Cape.

But let me just take this opportunity to say this, Minister Nkwinti bandies words around like the NDP in his speech as if today, he is using the process and using the guidelines in this NDP. However, in the next sentence, he bandies the words, Radical Economic Transformation, RET, as if they actually sit on the same momentum in the same continuum. Minister Nkwinti, they are opposite, pole opposite of each other. One is inclusive and the other is an elite, exclusion and patriot system.

So, the main challenge with current land reform strategy; the Proactive Land Acquisition Strategy, Plas, is that it does not allow for outright land ownership by farmers and this is specifically in contrast to what Minister Nkwinti made earlier this evening. The consequences of the Plas approach is that black farmers are not able to access financing for farming as they lack the title deeds which can be used for security by financial institutions. It must be noted that African Farmers Association of South Africa, Afasa, has raised

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 208**

this challenge with Minister Nkwinti sometime last year when they marched to the Union Buildings.

Further implications are that the same farmers are made to be dependent on the state for farming and can never be a sustainable option given the economic reality is facing our country. There are currently over 40 Plas properties that we are aware of in the Western Cape with no lease agreement, and yet the ANC bandy around transformation and redress.

Minister Nkwinti, this in itself must be urgently addressed. I know that you and your department have largely ignored any calls to assist with this matter. You are failing the people of this province and you fail the people of this country. You clearly have no interest in returning land to the people who are entitled to it, and your governance is flip flopping by saying one thing and doing another.

According to the United Nations, agricultural production must increase by 60% to meet the demand of the nine billion people who are expected to live on earth by 2050. The Western Cape is poised to play a vital role in meeting this challenge.

In the province, the Gross Value Add of agriculture, an indicator of all the goods and services produced by this sector amounts to R18,6 billion, with export revenue generating R40 billion per annum and producing between 50 and 60% of South Africa's agricultural products and exports.

By looking at the data from the quarter of 2017's Labour Force Survey, it is clear that there are currently 215 300 people employed in primary agriculture in the Western Cape of which 144 966 are agri-processing workers and 100 106 are agri processing support workers. This equates to 17,6% of all people employed in the province. The important point here is that there are 32 847 people more than in the first quarter of 2015; a healthy growth of 8,4% in the Western Cape.

Noting the ability of agriculture and agri-processing to dramatically accelerate growth and jobs in our province, in 2014, as part of our economic strategy, we gave this priority as a priority sector status. As part of Khulisa, we worked in closely with the private sector to define a set of action plans to maximise our competitive potential in these areas.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 210**

It is clearly evident that the redistribution and the repurpose of land in the Western Cape have in line with the Constitution and the NDP been carried out in such a way that it benefits not only individuals but the provincial economy at large. Where the ANC continues to fail in this regard, the Western Cape is right on track with rural development and land reform in conjunction with our agricultural sector to get our people access to land, access to skills and necessary to farm and develop it. This process empowers our people and gives them a seat at the table of our provincial economy and its management.

The DA continues to state the following; land reform must be undertaken in line with the Constitution; land for agriculture must be redistributed with the skills and expertise necessary to farm it. Let us remember that merely giving land to an individual does not ensure his or her economic wellbeing. As a saying goes, give a man a fish and you feed him for a day. Teach a man to fish and you feed him for a lifetime. I thank you. [Applause.]

Cllr B STOFIE (Salga): Deputy Chair of the NCOP, Minister Nkwinti, Moinister Zokwana, Deputy Minister Cele, Deputy Minister Skwatsha and distinguished members of the House.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 211**

It is a great opportunity well received by us as Salga to speak on this important issue, land. I can hear everybody speaking about land and speaking about people, and people and land are residing in the municipality. It is important that as we locate the debate about the land we also remember that we are operating in the municipal space.

Chair I'm sure the Minister will agree with us that the configuration of poverty, inequality and unemployment in South Africa, particularly in rural areas is a direct outcome of colonial and apartheid engineering.

We all know, hon members, that the most prominent aspect of these racist engineering were large scale land dispossession. The establishment of the Bantustans which were deliberately located in an unproductive land parcel carefully selected to manufacture the current class disparities between urban and rural areas; and the most glaring between black and white South Africans.

The struggle to reverse this calamity will indeed take a big and long time. The dislodge and entrench economic enclave will indeed require a more radical approach by all progressive sphere of government.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 212**

We hope that all South Africans beyond political party allegiances share in Oliver Tambo's vision when he says:

We seek to create a united democratic and non-racial society. We have a vision of South Africa in which black and white shall live and work together as equals in conditions of peace and prosperity.

Using the power you derive from the discovery of the truth about racism in South Africa, you will help us to remake our part of the world into a corner of the globe on which all - of which all of humanity can be proud.

So said Tambo - the geographical, racial and gender dimension of this spatial injustice remains a daunting challenge that the democratic government must address if what OR Tambo envisioned is to be achieved. It is in this context that as Salga we remain convinced that rural development and land reforms can contribute towards not only radical economic empowerment of our people, but serve as catalyst for nation building and reconciliation in our country.

As Frantz Fanon once said:

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 213**

For a colonized people the most essential value, because the most concrete, is first and foremost the land: the land which will bring them bread and, above all, dignity.

So said Lennon - as a fundamental aspect of our thorough going national and local government transformation, and indeed our shared commitment to under apartheid special injustice, all South Africans have a right to land and associated of the economic empowerment.

Hon Chair, we concur with the Minister that transforming rural economies requires much more than access to land. A holistic system that will ensure that transformation of the land tenure system, development of the necessary social and economic infrastructure such as roads, bridges, dams and ICTs - and ensuring that all, the entire agricultural value-chain is adequately developed for farmers of all scales to produce for both local and international markets.

I am certain you will agree with me that fundamental economic transformation requires an activist state - a state that invests resources to ensure realisation of the radical economic empowerment of women, youth and all people in general. As the former president Nelson Mandela when he addressed our congress in 1996, he said:

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 214**

You have the task of doing whatever is necessary to ensure that our new local government system serves the needs of our communities. You have the responsibility to make their voice heard and to provide an effective instrument for them to improve their lives.

So said Nelson Mandela - it is against this background of these words from the former president Mandela that we want to respectfully argue that in order to achieve a state that is capable of playing a developmental and transformative role we must ensure that all spheres of government support the local government as the sphere closest to the people, and the implementation level of government as a whole.

Hon Chair, we call upon you, hon Minister to work with us to reinforce rather than undermine the potential role of developmental local government so that municipalities can address poverty and inequalities by developing rural communities to dislodge apartheid geography.

It is in this context that we implore both national and provincial spheres to ensure that greater focus is placed on integrated planning and the municipal IDP should be the base for all

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 215

development, and specific municipal localities. Hon Chair, we fully support district rural development plans, with your support we will actively engage our members to ensure that these plans are integrated into the IDP; and constitute and integral component of the municipal plan.

On behalf of Salga I wish to extend an invitation that we have already said that we have to focus on CARO. Let me conclude by invoking the spirit of Steve Biko who envisioned that - I quote:

We have set out on a quest for true humanity, and somewhere on the distant horizon we can see the glittering prize. Let us march forth with courage and determination, drawing strength from our common plight and our brotherhood. In time we shall be in a position to bestow upon South Africa the greatest gift possible—a more human face.

So said Steve Biko - therefore, we have no reason as the local government sector not to support the both budgets. [Applause.]

Mr A J NYAMBI: Hon Deputy Chairperson, hon Ministers and Deputy Ministers, hon members, hon guests in the gallery, ladies and gentlemen, to both hon Ministers Albert and Steyn advice us and I

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 216**

quote, "Stay away from negative people. They have a problem from every solution." Guided by the theme: 'The Year of the Freedom Charter and Unity in Action so as to advance economic freedom' the 2015 ANC Policy National General Council adopted the programme of radical economic transformation to address the slow pace of transformation. At the heart of radical economic transformation it is an effective state that is decisive in its pursuit of structural change. We committed the country to radical economic transformation where all social partners, government, the private sector and organised labour work together in mutual reinforcing ways to create decent work.

Despite the massive advances made since 1994, there has been insufficient progress with respect to employment growth, wage income and work place inequality. The situation has worsened because of global economic slow down. This reflects a structural shift in the economic world with significant uncertainty and no clarity on where the new areas of growth will happen. Looking forward, we are not likely to see significant improvement in the coming five years or so. Coupled with these has been the impact on lower metal prices, exports, and investment leading to slower growth. What does this then mean for the direction we need to pursue with regard to today's Policy Budget Vote debate on agriculture and land reform, hon Smith?

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 217**

Clearly, policy must address the slow pace of land reform. We know that only 8% hectares of arable land had been transferred to black people, which is only 9,8% of the 82,4 million hectares of arable land in South Africa. At this rate, it will take us more years to reach the set target. Furthermore, there are more outstanding land claims since 1998.

There are two things that have to be done urgently to achieve an inclusive economy and just equable social order. Firstly, we must ensure that we expedite land redistribution. Land shall be shared amongst those who work it in injunction from the Freedom Charter and it goes out to further to set out in some detail what the democratic government has to do to assist those who work the land.

The ANC' 53rd national conference passed resolutions in this regard, some of which have been implemented while others are being processed for implementation.

Secondly, we must beneficiate strategic resources within the country and this relates in the context of this debate to agriculture and forestry products. Policy direction is generally sound and even the critiques are largely unable to provide sound and rational alternative but cling to slogans without having the credibility of producing proposals on how a regulatory environment will be able to

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 218**

lend any credibility to their proposal as hon Smith and hon Julius have done today. Other proposals will require a review of the Constitution which cannot be proven to be necessary. Ours is to pursue a system of differentiated support services to the agricultural sector and to the black producers, whether subsistence; small holder, small scale or commercial. We need to operationalise new land reform legislation aimed at establishing land administration structures and accelerating performance including the Spatial Planning Land Use Management Act, Act 16 of 2013, assented to in August 2013 and the Property Valuation Act, Act 17 of 2014, assented in August 2014. We have to ensure that we reduce inflated pricing for land acquired by the state for land reform by utilising the Expropriation Act, Act 63 of 1975, where necessary. We have to encourage land claimants to accept land instead of financial compensation. Over 90% of claims are currently settled through financial compensation which perpetuates the dispossession. And, we must develop and enforce spatial planning to address competing uses of land between mining, agriculture and human settlements.

Policy determines the creation and maintenance of equitable and sustainable land dispensation so as to ensure rural development and sustainable rural livelihoods; a policy mandate that draws on section 24, section 25 and section 27 of the Constitution; we have

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 219**

to ensure attainment of vibrant equitable and sustainable rural communities. Agrarian Transformation is informed by policy and strategy. Agrarian Transformation is rapid and fundamental change in the relation system, patterns of ownership and controls of land, livestock and cropping.

Following the publication of the 2011 Green Paper on Land Reform, a protracted process of policy development which entails extensive public consultations has taken place. Out of that process, a plethora of policies and legislative amendments have been proposed and others subsequently implemented. Some of these have been the strengthening relative rights for people working the land which derives both from the Freedom Charter and our beloved Constitution.

The one household, one hectare and the recently pronounced the one household, two dairy cows programmes policy on exception to the 2013 cut off date is long overdue and the department and the commissioner are urged to finalise the policy hon Minister.

For the 2017-2018 financial year, we know that the department has planned to process critical pieces of legislation; key among these being the Regulation of Agricultural Land Holding Bill - a Bill which seeks to provide for regulation of communal land; disclosure

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 220**

by land owners of their nationality, race and gender; the circumstances under which foreign person may own and have access to land; the establishment and maintenance of a register of land ownership; the submission of information on public land; the establishment and composition of the land composition as it has been said by the Deputy Minister and the resolution of disputes over situation in which two or more title deeds have been issued in respect of the same parcel of land; the Deeds Registry Amendment Bill which seeks to effect technical amendments to the Deeds Registry Act, Act 47 of 1937, to improve on some of the technical implementation challenges together with the Electronic Deeds Registration System Bill which seeks to amend the Deeds Registrar Act and provides for electronic registration of deeds; the split of the land reform programme into land redistribution and the development as well as land tenure is welcomed initiative which will result in a focused land management especially lease management and allocation of land to deserving beneficiaries and support them through the recap programme.

The transfer of the administration and implementation of the recap policy to the Department of Agriculture Forestry and Fisheries could potentially result in more efficient farmer support by the relevant and capacitated line function department. Noting that the programme

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 221**

does not have dedicated funds and that it had been using 25% of the budget for land acquisition in the Department of Agriculture Forestry and Fisheries unless this is addressed, this will become a challenge in the foreseeable future. The prioritisation of acquisition of strategically located land has clearly targeted beneficiaries with adequate development support both in terms of pre and post settlement stages of the project; this could address some of the weaknesses of the current programme of land reform.

Hon Minister, we must ensure that the pace of land redistribution is increased by finalising policy framework to guide and interface the office of value general and the commission as the entire chain for acquisition of strategically located land. This means reviewing both issues that were long outstanding that have been raised at committee level hon Minister. Key programmes in the agricultural sector are to ensure and enhance dynamic functioning agricultural value chain.

Without these, we shall not have done the job creation we speak off.

In relation to financing the small holder farmers; the question of the location of the Land Bank on particular and relook at the legislation and regulation that inform its orientation is long overdue. Priority 1 of the Nine Point Plan address the intensification of the of the revitalisation of agriculture agro

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 222

processing value chain and focus on five critical areas, the implementation of Agri-parks, agricultural policy action plan, collaborating with the private sector partners and aquaculture.

Hon Minister and Deputy Ministers, capacity building at all spheres of government is long overdue as it is a matter of must. To hon Smit and hon Julius, I have this to say to you. I thought I was going to use the Constitution to read the Preamble so that you understand what it means when it says we have to address the historical imbalance of the past.

*Siswati:*

Ngibuya eMphumalanga mine.

*English:*

In Mpumalanga we happen to have a farmer that put a young boy in a coffin while he was alive, and you never came here in this podium to condemn that act to show that you understand what is in the Preamble of this Constitution. I am a member of a glorious organisation that is very clear that South Africa belongs to all who live in it; black and white. [Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 223

Mr C F B SMIT: Hon Chairperson, I am actually prepared to stand up and condemn it.

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES: No, that is not a point of order.

Mr A J NYAMBI: Thomas Sankara once told us that anything not effective and efficient is reactional. That is what you are doing hon Smit.

I want to teach you today the three things in life that never come back when gone. The first one is time. You have the opportunity to understand us using this time.

The second one is the words that you always utter when you are here. You are abusing this platform. The last one is an opportunity. When you get an opportunity you always disabuse us. Refrain from doing that.

There are three things that should never be lost by you hon Smit and hon Julius. The first one is peace. The second one is hope and the last one is honesty. When you are here you must always be honest at all times. I will give you a copy ... [Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 224

Mr J W W JULIUS: The hon member is casting aspersions. He is actually saying that we are dishonest. He meant that we are dishonest. When we are there we must be honest, meaning that we are dishonest.

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES: Can I check the context, and I will report.

Mr A J NYAMBI: Hon Smit and hon Julius when you were here trying to make as if hon Nkwinti and hon Zokwane, the two Ministers are contradicting each other, yet as the NCOP we are the House that has all the opportunity to have both of them under one roof because they belong in one select committee; you were very dishonest. I will give you a copy of the wise words of a philosopher called Plato.

[Interjections.]

Mr J W W JULIUS: You are very ... [Inaudible.]

Mr A J NYAMBI: I will give you a copy of the wise words of a philosopher called Plato. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES: Hon Julius!

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 225

Mr A J NYAMBI: "Wise men speak because they have something to say; Fools because they have to say something."

Hon members, you know we have to learn from yesterday, live for today, hope for tomorrow. The important thing is that as hon members of this august House, let us not stop questioning and give credit where it is due.

I want to tell you that when dealing with the issue of land hon V R, the MEC for where the sun rises, people are working harder, the province where I come from, Mpumalanga; the issue of land - you are very correct. It is a very emotive issue. The issue of land ... the land question, if you want to be fair about it hon Julius and hon Smit, it will be appropriate to refer to it as a historical fraud. The land question is a historical fraud and to understand that you have to visit, when all of us are being sworn in as members not only myself because I am here, they gave us this thing. I will read because it is not in my speech. It is something that was given to you. [Interjections.]

*Siswati:*

Liyababa liciniso. Awuhlaliseki. Ngibuyile la!

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 226

Mr J W W JULIUS: Chairperson, I rise on a point of order. The member is directly speaking to me and he must speak to you.

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES: Hon member Nyambi, can you please address members through me.

Mr A J NYAMBI: Hon Deputy Chairperson, as I am talking to hon ... through you, to hon Julius and hon Smit, what was given to us called the Constitution, the Preamble says "We, the people of South Africa recognises the injustices of the past."

For reasons I can't tell, through you hon Deputy Chairperson, hon Smit decided to start at the end and deal with the part of '*Nkosi sikelel' Afrika*.' You must start with the first part from the Preamble, then you will understand the correct context.

[Interjections.]

In conclusion to the hon members and hon Ministers, we must at all times, when dealing with this issue of land question remember that the land belongs to the dead; few who are living, but a countless many more who are yet to be born. As the ANC we support Budget Vote 39 and Budget Vote 34. Thank you.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 227

The MINISTER OF RURAL DEVELOPMENT AND LAND REFORM: Hon Chair, it is a pity the hon Schafer ran away. As she was speaking here, she reminded me of the day when President Nelson Mandela stood up and walked to the podium after former President De Klerk spoke. She spoke like she was pontificating here, just like other DA members who are pontificating, particularly those who are white. They have not extended their hands to reconcile, in terms of what they did to the African people. [Applause.] That is a problem.

This is a challenge to us. You see, we black people ... When I say African, I include the Khoi and the San, by the way. The first war of dispossession took place right here in 1659. It was white people here, under Jan van Riebeeck who killed the Khoi and the San people. That was in 1659.

So, they come here when we actually try to do our best to bend backwards. We are going to break our backs because we are accommodating them. They are arrogant. They stand here and everywhere and tell us that we are doing nothing and that we are slow. They tell us that we are not doing this for our people.

Friday, Saturday and Sunday, I was at a conference of Umkhonto weSizwe Military Veterans' Association, MK MVA. There is a

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 228

resolution. We persuaded them. They say expropriation without compensation. We persuaded them because we were remembering people like Tambo, Mandela, etc, who were responsible for that Constitution. They extended their hands to reconcile with the white compatriots here. However, whites never contributed to reconciliation in this country. Let me confess here. I said to them to please not do it that way.

We are going to bring a Bill to this House and I am very happy that they are talking the way they are and that they want to give people land. We are going to bring a Bill here, the Regulation of Agricultural Land Bill. We have not set the limit. We have said that there will be ceilings. We have not determined what the extent in terms of hectares will be.

You are parliamentarians and all of you are therefore challenged to set the ceiling. I was in Harare, Africa just over a year ago and 50 hectares ... In fact, 0 to 5 is a smallholder farm. Fifty hectares is a medium-scale farm. A large-scale farm is 500 hectares. Here, we are talking about people who own land of hundreds of thousands of hectares in South Africa.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 229

You have it now. Thank you very much, DA , for being arrogant here. I am challenging you, when that Bill comes here to set the large-scale farms at 500 hectares. [Applause.] Then the rest ... I said to the soldiers to please not do it that way, but to rather explore the possibility of seeing anything above the set ceiling as expropriation without compensation. [Applause.] Let us challenge the white South Africans to extend their hands of reconciliation to the African majority who they ... They did not take land. They did not steal land. EFF, you are wrong. They did not. They killed our people to take the land.

I have a chief, Chief Chungwa, who was killed on 4 January 1812. His warrior, a Khoi, escaped that death and went to Ndlambe in Zierburg in the Eastern Cape. He got there and Andries Stockenström Senior was engaged with the Xhosa under Ndlambe. Then this warrior said to Ndlambe that the Chief has been killed in Alexandra. When Ndlambe heard about that, he sent his own warrior, who was also a Khoi to kill Andries Stockenström. That is how the fourth of the nine wars of dispossession started. So, this land was never stolen. I am helping the young people of the EFF. It was war. [Interjections.] It was taken by force of war.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 230

So, thank you very much, DA. When that Bill comes here, let us agree to set the ceiling very low.

Mr J W W JULIUS: Hon Minister, my apologies, I see that you are on a roll, but we have to stick to time. Three minutes are long gone.

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES: Naai, man. [Interjections.]

Mr J W W JULIUS: How can you say, hayi man? How can you say, hayi man? No, you see ...

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES: Hon Julius. Order! Order, hon members! I did not want to ...

[Interjections.] Can I address you? I did not want to do this. Hon Julius, I did not want to do this earlier on when you raised this issue. Hon Mampuru, order, please. Hon Julius, familiarise yourself with the Rule of the presiding officer, because I am using my discretion. The Rules empower me to use my discretion.

[Interjections.] Okay, fine, I might have reacted otherwise. I withdraw that. I withdraw that. I withdraw that, hon Julius.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 231

The MINISTER OF RURAL DEVELOPMENT AND LAND REFORM: By the way, hon Julius raised a matter here about oom Freddie.

*Afrikaans:*

Ek gaan vir oom Freddie kuier ...

*English:*

... during this recess. I have already arranged that. Please tell him.

So, let us agree that the land reform is very slow. Let us agree. Do you know why? We, as the African National Congress, wanted to be decent. [Applause.] Remember, even during the years of struggle, it was very strict in the African National Congress to never kill civilians. Do you remember the young boy, Andrew Zondo, who made that mistake? Today, we are not even talking about him because he made that mistake. That is how serious the African National Congress is about human life across the racial line.

So, don't provoke us. Please, don't provoke us. I am challenging this House when the Bill comes here ... It is going to come here. We already have 300 objections and they are from white people. We have 300 objections. They do not say that we must make it 50 or so. We

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 232

have 300 objections. They say that they reject this Bill. It will come to this House. You are law-makers. You want reconciliation in the country. You want to share land with everybody else. Please, ensure that the ceiling at the highest level is 500 hectares. Explore the possibility of seeing anything above that as expropriation without compensation because in that situation, everybody will have land, including those who have land now and others can share land. Thank you very much. [Applause.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, FORESTRY AND FISHERIES: Hon Chairperson, I agree with Minister hon Nkwinti that those who want to shine must be practical in action.

*IsiXhosa:*

Ukukhwela ihashe ujonge ngasemva kunegama lako kodwa ngumkhwa wamakhwenkwe.

*English:*

I am going to say this because Mr Smith wants to locate black people into peripheral fishing refusing to get the challenge as to who is currently monopolising fishing. In this country only five companies are involved into fishing. Black people are there as workers. If that is not wrong I would like you to join me when I present a

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 233

transformation programme that will make sure that fish resides with the state. If you speak of decentralising; what about the seven provinces without an ocean? I am appealing to you to be practical because fishing is the science. You cannot just decentralise. There are only four provinces that have got oceans.

No, no, no you had your time and you did not use it. I am asking you not to come here and grandstand and claim that the ANC is playing with land reforms when you are doing anything. For example, Mark Scott-Crossley has been arrested twice for killing and injuring black people. I did not hear you speaking about that. I did not hear you saying some of the farmers are ill treating their employees. You did not speak about farm workers who have been shot mistakenly to be animals. You did not say that is wrong and you come here and make it as if all that the ANC has done is wrong. For instance, apartheid was worse than any other policy. You designed a disempowering law called Bantu education and your own ancestor which was praised in your congress by Allister Sparks as being the most intelligent South African we know of, said:

The Bantu education we have designed for Black people is not to give them a status of being equal to their counterparts but being able to take instructions as workers.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 234

Today, you come here and pretend to be angels and I think that we need to be fair and say that we will build this country when we work together. You come here like Nongqawuse and want to be my ancestor to put words in my mouth to say that the Minister of Rural Development and Land Reform did not tell the truth. Yet we agreed with you in that meeting that the two departments must come together and present on what is the future of agriculture and land reform. [Applause.] I think the DA has gone to school where the Nazis have been and you have studied the philosophy of Paul Joseph Goebbels of telling a big lie with a straight face repeatedly until that lie becomes the truth. [Applause.]

If you travel from Cape Town, you do not see shacks in Cape Town but people staying in cupboards. You see them on daily basis in your eyes because you have to tell the lie that they do not exist. Shame on those who come here and pretend to be angels and yet where they come from racism is not only seen but those who live there feel it as painful. I repeat...

*IsiXhosa:*

... musa ukukhwela ihashe ujonge ngasemva... [Kwahlekwa.]

*English:*

... be practical so that we know whether you are coming or going.

*Afrikaans:*

Agb Julius, my broer ... [Hon Julius, my brother ...]

*IsiXhosa:*

... uhayi ngesiBhulu...

*Afrikaans:*

... in Afrikaans, beteken "nee." [... in Afrikaans means "no."]

*English:*

It is not an insult. It means no. So, I challenge the DA because you said the ANC should persuade its MPs to vote with their conscience and undermine the organisation when today DA councillors in Mogale City Local Municipality are undergoing a lie detector test because one of them has voted with the ANC to unseat their capital. Why do you play double standards? Do not come here and make it as if you are staying in glass houses. I want to say to you that those who stay in glass houses must please not throw stones. We have been so patient and understanding in so much that you misunderstood us to be cowards.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 236

*Afrikaans:*

Ons is nie bangbroeke nie. [We are not cowards.]

*English:*

If you want to challenge us we will show you. I think black voters must know that DA does not love them except their votes. I repeat, black people who vote for DA have betrayed their ancestors. They have betrayed their being. They have been made to believe the lies that are told on daily basis. I also believe that Goebbels may have played his role in your own philosophy and understanding that of telling a big lie repeatedly. For instance the strike in agriculture was in the Western Cape because black farmers are exploited. I am saying therefore that we need to tell the truth so that we can build the future. Thank you very much. [Applause.]

Mr C F B SMIT: Hon Deputy Chair, I believe that the Minister was saying directly to me that I was lying.

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES: Order, order. I want to hear the member.

Mr C F B SMIT: I want to know if that is parliamentary.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 237

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES:

Unfortunately for me, I cannot even hear what hon Smit is saying. I just heard him saying that the Minister something me. Can I just hear the member? What is the member trying to say to me?

Mr C F B SMIT: Hon Deputy Chair, I was saying that the Minister was directly saying that I was lying. I want to know if that is parliamentary.

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES: Well, I did not hear that part. Can I be allowed an opportunity to check?

Debate concluded.

The Council adjourned at 20:08.