NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 1

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

## PROCEEDINGS OF THE NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

The House met at 14:02.

The Speaker took the Chair and requested members to observe a moment of silence for prayer or meditation.

## MOTION OF CONDOLENCE

(The late Ahmed Mohamed Kathrada)

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: Hon Speaker I move the Draft Resolution printed in my name on the Oder Paper as follows:

That the House -

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

## TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 2

- (1) notes with sadness the passing of Isithwalandwe Ahmed Mohamed Kathrada on 28 March 2017, known as uncle Kathy, following a short period of illness;
- (2) further notes that Uncle Kathy became politically conscious when he was 17 years old and participated in the Passive Resistance Campaign of the South African Indian Congress; and that he was later arrested;
- (3) remembers that in the 1940's, his political activities against the apartheid regime intensified, culminating in his banning in 1954;
- (4) further remembers that in 1956, our leader, Kathrada was amongst the 156 Treason Trialists together with Nelson Mandela and Walter Sisulu, who were later acquitted;
- (5) understands that he was banned and placed under a number of house arrests, after which he joined the political underground to continue his political work;

### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

## TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 3

- (6) further understands that he was also one of the eight Rivonia Trialists of 1963, after being arrested in a police swoop of the Liliesleaf Farm in Rivonia, and was sentenced to life imprisonment on Robben Island;
- (7) recalls that uncle Kathy spent 26 years in prison, 18 years of which were on Robben Island; and that after his release and the unbanning of the ANC, he was elected to the ANC's National Executive Committee in 1989, leading the organisation's Public Relations Department until 1994;
- (8) further recalls that he was elected to Parliament in 1994 and served as a Parliamentary Counsellor to his long-time friend and confidante, the late former President Nelson Mandela, with whom he was incarcerated on Robben Island;
- (9) acknowledges that while in prison, our leader, Comrade Kathrada, pursued his academic studies and obtained a Bachelor of Arts BA in History and Criminology, a Bachelor of Bibliography in Library Science and African Politics as well as two BA Honours degrees

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

## TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 4

from the University of South Africa in African Politics and History;

- (10) further acknowledges that he was also awarded four Honorary Degrees, including one from the University of Missouri;
- (11) believes that uncle Kathy left an indelible footprint which can never be erased, and a source of wisdom that will benefit South Africans from generation to generation;
- (12) further believes that his life is a lesson of humility, tolerance, resilience and a steadfast commitment to principles; and
- (13) conveys its condolences to his wife Barbara Hogan, the Kathrada family and the African National Congress.[Applause.]

Mr C NQAKULA: Speaker and hon members of this House, firstly, I would like to appreciate the space that Parliament has afforded hon members of this House to pay homage to Ahmed Kathrada, as

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 5

part of our effort to preserve the memory of those who contributed to the liberation of our country to build a new nation, one based on new values.

I hope, in deference to Comrade Kathrada, one of the heroes of the struggle for our freedom and one of the building blocks of our democratic dispensation, we shall be able to raise his memory as a mirror to look at our image as members of this House and scan the country to determine whether we have succeeded in emulating the freedom fighters of yesteryear, some of whom laid down their lives for all our people to be free.

"Comrade Kathy," as many among us here used to call him whilst the younger generation of our people referred to him as "Uncle Kathy," was a member of this House in this First Parliament, working together with our first democratically elected President, the iconic Nelson Rolihlahla Mandela, as the President's Parliamentary Counsellor. As we remember Comrade Kathy today, let us also declare our solidarity with those who, in recent times, lost family members in very unfortunate circumstances visited upon them by natural disasters in the Western Cape, Eastern Cape, and KwaZulu-Natal. There are areas of our country that are prone to those types of disasters where

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 6

some of our people's lives are taken by floods and fires. These are national questions that we need to address as a nation, using our collective wisdom as a weapon to mitigate instances where our people lose their lives.

We should also extend our deepest condolences during this period, which we have defined as Youth Month in recognition of the contribution of our young people to the creation of our new nation, to the families of those whose children's lives were wasted wantonly by malicious attackers. Such brazen criminal actions, especially against the girl child, must be condemned by all peace-loving South Africans and must influence us, as lawmakers, to discuss strategies and tactics that will strengthen law enforcement in our country. It is a fact that the police, working on their own, will not eradicate serious crimes, like murder, in our country. One of the tactics should be our united action, working together with the law enforcement officers of our land across the length and breadth of our country. We should remember that most murders are committed by people who are closely related to the victims, and many of them happen behind closed doors or in isolated areas.

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

## TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 7

Let us use our constituency resources - human and material - to design programmes that educate the communities we serve on how to keep safe, ensure that, through working with the police, our communities see the law enforcers as allies rather than enemies, and build enough confidence to give the police information on crime and where the perpetrators of crime live.

Comrade Kathy would have done exactly what I am talking about. Remember, Comrade Kathy was just a high school student, like the 16 June 1976 cadres, when he mobilised people against Jan Smuts' Asiatic Land Tenure and Indian Representation Act, Act 28 of 1946. Our people called it the "Ghetto Act." It was the "Ghetto Act" that paved the way for the birth of the Group Areas Act, which saw the forceful removal of our people from their ancestral lands to barren spaces completely unknown to them, in pursuit of the dictates of the racist policies of the apartheid regime.

I know there are some South Africans who do not want us to talk about the past - the past terrifies them. Those whose human rights were violated through oppression, exploitation, torture and long periods of detention without trial and those, including some members of this House, who were forced within

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

## TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 8

the context of the skewed philosophy of Bantu education to learn difficult subjects through the medium of Afrikaans, want to remember what happened them personally and to their kith and kin at the height of apartheid colonialism. They want to remember, as we celebrate Youth Month, the gallant young students who faced the bullets of the apartheid police on 16 June 1976 but were not cowed, as well as those mowed down by the callous police. It is part of South Africa's history and must be told and retold over and over again. [Applause.]

These are those, perhaps embarrassed that for years they supported and voted for the racist National Party, who want us to airbrush the warts that forced people like Ahmed Kathrada and other South Africans of Indian extraction, as well as thousands of other black South Africans, into apartheid's ghettos where they were confined in terms of their tribal categorisation. We must always remember those things in order for us truly never to go back to such evil practices.

It is worrisome that now and again racism rears its ugly head in our country. Gathered here as lawmakers, we should consider what else we need to do to ensure we decisively move away from all the negative tendencies that were part of the racial

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

## TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

## Page: 9

policies of the past. Arguing that bygones should bygones and should not be part of the story we tell our kids is a blinkered approach to the difficult project of consolidating our democracy. To argue that we must not talk about Jan van Riebeeck and what he did to the Khoi and the San is to airbrush huge chunks from the annals of our history. We have an obligation to talk about Krotoa and about Dawid Stuurman. We must remind our people that, once upon a time, South Africans of Indian extraction were not allowed by law to sleep over in the old Orange Free State.

Madiba's words at his inauguration as President of South Africa should always ring in our ears, especially these words:

Never, never and never again shall it be that this beautiful land will again experience the oppression of one by another and suffer the indignity of being the skunk of the world.

We must commend cadres like Ahmed Kathrada for taking up cudgels to fight on the side of the struggling masses of our people to free not only the oppressed but the oppressors as well. As we remember Comrade Kathy today, let us remember also

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

## TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

## Page: 10

that the struggle for our liberation was long and hard. That democracy finally came to South Africa is a badge of honour for those countrymen and women who continued to struggle, even when the odds were bleak and even when the possibility was clear and present that they might lose their lives. It is pleasing to remember that Comrade Kathy was among those courageous cadres.

Kathrada walked side by side with the giants of our revolution simply because, like the Walter Sisulus, the Oliver Tambos, the Nelson Mandelas, and the Govan Mbekis, he himself was a giant. When those leaders were arrested and charged in the case that came to be known as the Rivonia Trial, Ahmed Mohamed Kathrada appeared with them as Accused No 5. Joel Joffe, the attorney who managed the defence team led by who Madiba called "the indomitable Adv Bram Fischer," described Comrade Kathy as follows during the trial, as recorded in his book *The State vs. Nelson Mandela: The Trial that Changed South Africa*:

Ahmed Kathrada - the only Indian - was younger than most of the others, still in his middle thirties. He had a sharp tongue and engaging personality. He struck me essentially as one of the doers, not the theorisers, of the movement. Whatever practical job had to be done in this trial,

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

## TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

## Page: 11

Kathrada was willing to do it. He seldom ventured an opinion, especially on a theoretical matter, unless pressed, and never took the lead in any discussion. Yet he held tenaciously to views in many respects at variance with those of the others. He stated these views quite uncompromisingly, defending them when pushed to do so, but always accepted and carried out a majority decision once it had been reached.

Madiba also reveals in his book *Mandela: Long Walk to Freedom* the "uncompromising views" that Joffe referred to and that he "always accepted and carried out a majority decision." He writes on the question of his initial engagements with some of the National Party leaders and Comrade Kathy's response:

The last man was Kathy. His response was negative; he was as resolutely against what I was suggesting as Raymond and Andrew were in favour. Even more strongly than Walter, he felt that by initiating talks it would appear that we were capitulating. Like Walter, he said he was not in principle against negotiations, and I responded exactly as I had with Walter. But Kathy was adamant; he felt I was going down the

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 12

wrong path. But, despite his misgivings, he said he would not stand in my way.

Comrade Speaker, as one of the top leaders of the ANC and some of the national executive committee members that are here, I would like to spend the last minutes of my speech to address you. Firstly, let me remind you that Comrade Kathy had misgivings before he died about the state of his beloved ANC. He raised those concerns, Speaker, openly and without fear. He was doing so remembering, surely, the words of Oliver Reginald Tambo when he handed over the ANC to the incoming leadership of the organisation at the Durban conference in 1991:

I have devotedly watched over the organisation all these years. I now hand it over to you: bigger, stronger intact. Guard our precious movement.

We have made miscalculations in the past, as the leadership of Oliver Tambo's movement. Some of these mistakes gave birth to three parties that have seats in this House: the UDM, Cope, and the EFF. Today, those parties are part of the opposition to the ANC in this House and in the various legislatures and local government councils in the country. That happened as a

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

## TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

### Page: 13

consequence of some of our miscalculations as the ANC leadership. [Interjections.]

Tambo's ANC, Mandela's ANC, Walter Sisulu's ANC and Ahmed Mohamed Kathrada's ANC is expected to mobilise all resources possible, human and material, to destroy corruption ... [Interjections.] [Applause.] ... the ogre that is destroying our moral values and the biggest enemy of our people. [Interjections.]

I therefore want to say, as we remember Kathy Mohamed Kathrada, let us remember some of the things that we need to do in order for us, truly, to provide the service for our people that will ensure that they enjoy a better life. [Interjections.] Let us do all those things that not only must unite the ANC but also must unite the people of this country so that, as a united force, we can begin to address our common enemies of unemployment, of homelessness, of hunger. To that extent, we should do whatever we can as a united force, involving all our people wherever they are active, whatever their national and human endeavours are so that we utilise our collective wisdom for us to find ways to ensure that our economy grows in order to address some of the problems our people have.

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

## TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

## Page: 14

Once more, Speaker, thank you very much for creating this space so that we can remember one of the icons of our struggle -Ahmed Mohamed Kathrada. Thank you very much. [Applause.]

Mr G K Y CACHALIA: Speaker, two score and more years ago, we made a tryst with destiny. I was there, in the ballroom of the Carlton Hotel, alongside my parents, Yusuf and Amina Cachalia, when Nelson Mandela thanked South Africa for placing the nation's faith in the ANC of Albert Luthuli, Oliver Tambo, Walter Sisulu, Govan Mbeki and Ahmed Kathrada. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr G K Y CACHALIA: Ahmed Mohamed Kathrada, or Kathy, as he was affectionately called, understood that tryst. More so, he fought, all of his life, to give meaning to it. I was privileged to have known him. He was an activist to the core and a humanitarian to his very marrow. He gave his all to give meaning to that much-used and abused phrase, a better life for all.

A little-known fact about Kathy, imparted to me by my father, is that he was assured by the stellar legal team headed by Bram

#### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

## TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

## Page: 15

Fischer, that he had no case to answer and that they could ensure his acquittal. Kathy refused, and elected to join his leaders and mentors in jail. There, he sacrificed his freedom for over 26 years to demonstrate the solidarity of the Indian people in our common struggle for freedom. [Applause.] Let us salute his bravery, his sacrifice, his vision and his unfailing commitment to that quest which he saw to fruition, in that Carlton Hotel ballroom where that tryst with destiny was made.

In a speech, Nelson Mandela asked the people of South Africa to hold his government accountable. As Jay Naidoo, the first RDP Minister once said, "We had, in our hands, the levers of power, money in a budget, staff, resources, and the conviction that this government, by virtue of its democratic election, was the only legitimate representative of the aspirations of our people." He added, wryly, "Any criticism of the government was seen as a criticism of the revolution."

That revolutionary narrative - fed, nurtured and kept alive in the body of the ANC by the SACP - that South Africa represented a colonialism of a special type; and that power needed to be seized from the white colonists - set the scene for the decades to come. The "national democratic revolution" became the

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

## TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

## Page: 16

interim buzzword of choice, and a black middle class was created to foster it.

Now, we have the Bell Pottinger refinement of this in "white monopoly capital" - a smokescreen for racist appropriation, tribal control and the continuance of crookery. [Applause.] The theory of the game was that the expropriation of the wealth of the bourgeoisie - white, then, and black, now - would be just deserts for their historic and ongoing appropriation.

In his heart, Kathy would have known that this was not the science of a revolution. He knew it was an apology for plunder. He knew that this is how the revolution eats itself, time and time again. I know this. You know this. This is crass elitism masquerading as social justice. Of course, we need social justice, but this was bunk and Kathy knew this. If anyone is in doubt, read between the lines of his memoirs and other explicit statements he made subsequently.

Kathy knew this in his heart because he had lived history; because he knew; because he had a reflective integrity; because he was a *mensch*. He lamented, too, that liberation has

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

## TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 17

actualised a drive for conspicuous consumption. He knew this. Mandela knew this.

When I raised the issue with Madiba, years ago, he had likened it to children who had never seen sweets being let loose in a sweet shop. Witness the radical chic on many of the benches here. Witness the Breitling watches, the Savile Row suits, the custom shoes and lavish motor cars and VVIP security paid for by the taxpayer, as they continue to buy into the vain notion that socialism will arrive - this frenzy of appropriation notwithstanding - as long as the right structures are put in place and the correct measures taken.

Kathy had the moral fibre to see through this. As time went by, he saw that tryst being trampled and trashed. Moreover, he understood the inherent contradictions, as did Frantz Fanon, who said that the curse of post-colonial Africa was the leaders who took over from the colonialists only to become colonialists themselves - ironically, colonialism of a very special type.

By March last year, Kathy had had enough. He wrote a letter to his president, the hon Jacob Zuma, in which he called for him to step down.

#### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

## TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 18

Kathy's struggle credentials are writ large, in blood, suffering and selfless contribution. On his release in 1989, he served on the first national executive committee of the ANC after its unbanning - which is a far cry from the spineless ja baas [yes, boss] body it is today. [Applause.]

He expressed his pain in writing to the hon Zuma - you, in absentia, hon Zuma - as a loyal and disciplined member of the ANC and broader Congress movement since the 1940s. He had always maintained a position of not speaking out publicly about any differences he may have had with his leaders and his organisation. However, on that day in March 2016, he was moved to break with that tradition.

Echoing the famed lament of Dietrich Bonhoeffer, he wrote:

I did not speak out against Nkandla, although I thought it wrong to have spent public money for any president's private comfort. I did not speak out, though I felt it grossly insulting when my president is called a "thief" or a "rapist"; or when he is accused of being "under the influence of the Guptas". I believed that the NEC would

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

## TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

## Page: 19

have dealt with this as the collective leadership of the ANC.

However, the record shows they didn't and that, sadly and shamefully, is down to the politics of patronage and complicit compromise.

These events, Nkandla and more, led him to ask some very serious and difficult questions. He put it thus:

Now that the court has found that the president failed to uphold, defend and respect the Constitution as the supreme law, how should I relate to my president? If we are to continue to be guided by growing public opinion and the need to do the right thing, would he not seriously consider stepping down?

He went on, and wrote: "I know that if I were in the president's shoes, I would step down with immediate effect", and he appealed to the president to submit to the will of the people and resign. This is the legacy of a man, a man of principle, so far removed from the politics of patronage.

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

## TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

## Page: 20

I feel his pain. It was the same pain that I felt when the ANC left me. Yes, it left me, like it did Kathy and millions of South Africans - because it has lost its way, irretrievably, irrevocably and indefinitely. [Interjections.] [Applause.] The time has come to usher in a change, a change that heralds a break with the old lie - that those who lay sole claim to the mantle of victory over injustice have a god-given right to rule, as they say, until Jesus comes.

In all those years of struggle, Kathy bore witness to the warts that grew on the body of the ANC, and they were legion: Angolan death camps, Quatro, the sweep of the Shishita, the Mkatashinga tragedy, and more. You know this - or, you should! Still he soldiered on to make that tryst with destiny, that tryst that has been so shamefully shattered by one man, who has sought to make South Africa his private fiefdom in the pay of his ostensible masters, the Guptas.

As I alluded to earlier, however, it's not just one man. It is rooted in the DNA of a flawed model, a model that promises an unattainable Utopia of sorts, whose chosen path is defective and riven with contradictions, contradictions that harbour the very seeds of its own destruction.

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

## TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 21

You see, you cannot build a free and open society by following a game plan that has failed throughout the passage of history; that has delivered greyness and misery; that has trampled freedom; that has stifled economic growth; and that has fostered an elite that feeds on its own body and that of the nation. Examples abound throughout history, but these are ignored - and rooted here in the body and the sullied soul of the ANC. On which side of history do you want to be?

It's not the absence of examples. It's the inability to heed the lessons of history and the inability to do the right thing when called upon to do the right thing.

It is incumbent on us to deliver a prosperous and fair state that addresses the needs and individual aspirations of all our people. It cannot be delivered by an organisation that has passed its sell-by date; that prays to the god of Mammon in its vain quest to eradicate - nay, to appropriate - the spoils of Mammon. Let me quote to you Matthew 6:24:

No one can serve two masters; for either he will hate the one and love the other, or else he will be loyal to the

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 22

one and despise the other. You cannot serve God and Mammon.

This is the language that Ahmed Kathrada would have understood, because it is common cause in Islam, as it is in Christianity and in the hearts of all religions. Hajji Ahmed would have known from whence it came. It would have resonated with his understanding, because his values would never have allowed him to be the handmaiden of Nkandla, of the Zuptas, of the misreading of history, and of the attempted sale of our nation. He was a patriot. The ANC of the hon Zuma that left him, that left me, is the antithesis of that patriotism, of that nobility of purpose.

Perhaps Gandhi was right when he said of India - and these words would have resonated with Kathy, who was grounded in Gandhism:

I have repeatedly said that I have neither any part nor any say in many things that are going on in the country today ... My voice is in the wilderness ... mine is a lone voice. I now say things which do not go home ... Yet, I go on saying what I believe to be true.

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

## TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 23

Gandhi had famously called for the Indian National Congress in India to be dissolved because it had done its job by ending British rule. The wise and wizened Mahatma called for a new organisation to serve the people of India, one that would eschew corruption. His plea fell on deaf ears, and there, as it is here, there are none so deaf as those who will not hear.

I share a common history with Kathy: a passage from colonial India and a family steeped in the struggle against injustice. We also share a sense of betrayal. Still, I am buoyed by a conviction that democracy will triumph over time. Gen Obasanjo knew this, and advised as much in his recent visit - advice that President Zuma, Mr Mugabe, Sudan's Al-Bashir and Zambia's Lungu would do well to heed.

You see, democracy triumphed over India's congress and it will triumph over your congress. Of that, the DA and history will make sure, as we honour the spirit of Ahmed Kathrada.

Kathy, know this: Your voice is not in the wilderness. It will ring out loudly in our victory of 2019 when we hallow your purpose; when we consecrate your spirit.

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

## TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

## Page: 24

Our sincere condolences go out to Barbara Hogan and the Kathrada family, and not, as the previous speaker said, to the ANC only, but to the nation and to everybody in this country. [Applause.]

I know how my mother would have voted. I know how I will vote. How are you going to vote? I thank you. [Applause.]

Ms N V MENTE: Speaker, revolutionary condolences to Barbara Hogan, the Kathrada family, South Africans and the oppressed people of the world. We have indeed lost a giant in our universal struggle for justice and peace. The EFF and indeed all South Africans who desire justice are inspired by Uncle Kathy's quest for justice until his last breath. We will remember him for his fearlessness, humility and his love for humanity. In 2014 he was on the frontline of one of the biggest pro-Palestine marches in Cape Town. The EFF urge all South Africans to continue without fear or favour to oppose and root out all forms of injustices such as corruption and prejudice as we strive to build a South Africa and indeed a world that fallen freedom fighters like Uncle Kathy can be proud of. Today unlike any condolence motion, the family of Mr Kathrada was not acknowledged.

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

## TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

### Page: 25

The family of Mr Kathrada was not introduced. You wonder why, South Africans because the family did write to Parliament and informed Parliament that they will not be available. As the EFF, through the Chief Whip of the EFF, we wrote to the Speaker requesting her to postpone the condolence motion of today until the family is available to come and honour this condolence motion but because the ANC never listens, the ANC is failing us. The ANC has failed Mr Kathrada. It is failing Barbara Hogan. It is failing the children of this country. Through you Speaker, Mr Nqakula, you are a very powerful National Executive Committee, NEC, man; when you stand here and quote all the leaders of the ANC and the rot that is within the ANC, help us root it out.

Use your wisdom. Use your powers and root out the corrupt that is within the ANC which is taking this country of ours down the drain. We, as the EFF, we stand here today to affirm that, what Mr Kathrada had wished for is going to come true. What Mr Kathrada has asked to happen, that Mr Zuma must step down, he will indeed step down. If I had to quote from yesterday's press statement from the Kathrada Foundation, it says:

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

## TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 26

If the National Assembly was serious in its intention to honour Kathrada, it would not only lend its voice to the call made by Kathrada and many others - it would act on it when the motion of no confidence in the President comes up in the near future.

What will you do to honour, really honour and not grandstand; you must honour Kathrada and vote against the corrupt President of the ANC, Zuma. Thank you very much. [Applause.]

Prince M G BUTHELEZI: Hon Speaker, Your Excellency our Deputy President, hon Ministers, hon Deputy Ministers, hon members of the House, the passing of Mr Ahmed Kathrada in March this year was a painful moment for our nation. We had lost another of our liberation icons. He was one of a generation, who fought, sacrificed and worked to secure the freedoms we enjoy today and he did so with courage and integrity. We know that his voice will never be silenced. But we will miss his contribution as we continue the journey of democracy.

I am honoured to have called Mr Kathrada a friend. We became close because of our shared love of South Africa. Over eight decades we witnessed countless milestones and endured endless

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

## TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 27

hardships in the pursuit of political liberation. But we were blessed to be among those who saw liberation achieved, and we went on to contribute to the strengthening of a fledgling democracy. Mr Kathrada began his activism for the sake of our country at a very young age, and continued to seek the best for South Africa into his twilight years.

His letter to President Zuma, urging the President to submit to the will of the people, will be remembered as the act of a courageous patriot. It is evidence of the same courage that he showed during the *Treason Trial* and his subsequent incarceration for 26 years. I am grateful that this generation can draw on the wisdom and experience of Mr Kathrada, for his remarkable life and character have been captured in speeches, interviews and statements. Those who want to know who he was can turn to film and watch *A Man for All Seasons* or can read his own book, *Triumph of the Human Spirit*.

His legacy will continue to influence those willing to learn from our nation's past. It saddens me though that there are so few leaders today who are cast in the mould of people like Mr Kathrada and I pray that more leaders like him will be born into the future South Africa. On behalf of the IFP, I again

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

## TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 28

offer condolences to Mr Kathrada's beloved partner, Mrs Barbara Hogan, to their families and friends, and to the many who still feel the sorrow of his passing. May Uncle Kathy, rest in peace. [Applause.]

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Hon Speaker, Deputy President present, Ministers, Deputy Ministers, my very own president of the NFP, Zanele Magwaza-Msibi, hon members, guests in the gallery and the Kathrada family in absentia. Hon Speaker, on behalf of the NFP allow me to start by extending our condolences to the Kathrada family, especially his wife and other members of his family and also the ANC. I think you have lost a very austere, commendable and dedicated leader.

We pay tribute to none other than the late Ahmed Mohamed Kathrada. This is where you differentiate between a politician and a statesman. He sacrificed his youth, starting his political career at the age of 12 when he joined the Young Communist League of SA. He went on to volunteer in the passive resistance against the Pegging Act in 1941.

At the age of 17 he left school and joined the Transvaal Passive Resistance Council to fight against the Asiatic Land

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

## TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

### Page: 29

Tenure and Indian Representation Act. I don't have the luxury of time to be able to do justice in informing this House of all the leadership positions and accolades that the former leader Ahmed Kathrada had achieved. Suffice to say that he excelled in everything he attempted to achieve to such an extent that he was voted as the 46th in the top 100 Greatest South Africans in 2004.

The former leader was on numerous occassions detained and put on house arrest and was even confined to the Robben Island Maximum Prison for 18 long years but that did not deter the leader, he went on to achieve his bachelors degree in history, criminology and he achieved three other degrees.

What is clear is that our former leader was fondly referred to as Uncle Kathy. He spent decades of his life either being imprisoned or under house arrest and this he sacrificed solely to create a better life for all the people of this country. He sacrificed his family life, his youth, adulthood and pleasures so that we could be in this very House today.

Until his very last moment, he pleaded for unity, integrity, honesty and pleaded that all South Africans should not forget

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

## TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 30

where they come from and not forget why such sacrifices were made. He spoke openly about his dissatisfaction to the state of affairs in the country, the corruption and the infightings.

If we want to truly pay tribute to our former leader, Ahmed Mohamed Kathrada, then the least we can do is go back to the principles and values enshrined in the Freedom Charter. Leaders like Ahmed Mohamed Kathrada, Yusuf Dadoo, I C Meer, Yusuf Cachalia, J N Singh, Nelson Mandela, Oliver Tambo, all have sacrificed their lives so that we and our people can live a better life.

What we are experiencing today is not what our forefathers fought for. It is time to pay tribute by going back to our roots. It is time to go back to the Freedom Charter. It is time to remember the pain and suffering our former leaders have endured. Let us not throw this away. Let us come together as one united nation putting the interest of our people first.

To our former leader Ahmed Mohamed Kathrada, allow me to apologise for the state of affairs in our country today. May the Almighty God grant you the highest abode in paradise for the sacrifice you have made for this nation. I thank you.

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

## TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

## Page: 31

Dr B H HOLOMISA: Hon Speaker, hon Deputy President and hon members, the UDM appreciates the opportunity created by the National Assembly to honour this tower of strength and a source of inspiration to many generations, although it could have been done earlier and better.

I had the great honour of meeting Kathy and his Rivonia trialists colleagues in Mthatha in 1989. Their presence and words during the welcome home rally we organised for them gave us great confidence to continue supporting the struggle for our liberation knowing that we were on the right side of history.

During my encounters with this stalwart and others, they showed courage, humility and dignity, reminding us that any challenge, however insurmountable it may seem, can be overcome. They were always attentive, frank and robust when discussing issues.

Again in 1990, his fellow Rivonia trialists converged in Mthatha to welcome home the late O R Tambo. In the same period, in the company of the late Madiba and O R Tambo, we discussed, amongst others, our perspectives on the so-called black on black violence. In these discussions, I was accompanied by the current Military Ombudsman, General T T Matanzima and the

#### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

## TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 32

current Force Commander of the United Nations Organization Stabilization Mission in the Democratic Republic of Congo, General D M Mgwebi.

We advised the leadership that apartheid government was negotiating in bad faith and that it was trying to lure the ANC into a trojan horse. It became clear then to us that the negotiations between the National Party team led by Niel Barnard and the ANC team led by the current President of the ANC, Mr Zuma, failed to plan for the security of the leaders and the activists.

This was a huge security risk that could have created serious problems for the success of the negotiations, so we stepped in. The rest, as they say, is history. But Madam Speaker, this is a debate for another day. Today UDM offers its condolences to the wife of Kathy, Ms Barbara Hogan, the family, friends and the ANC.

Lastly, during his last days, Kathy was deeply troubled by the conduct of the seating Head of State and could not reconcile this conduct with values they espoused during the struggle for freedom. I hope this House, in the not-too-distant future, will

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

## TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 33

truly honour him by responding positively to his call on Mr Zuma, especially after these nauseating emails. May his soul rest in peace. I thank you.

## IsiXhosa:

Sekela Mongameli, nobhala wam, sithi musani ukubacenga aba bantu bavelayo besitya imali yesizwe, mababanjwe. Fakani amapolisa kungajongwa ukuba lo udlala eyiphina indima eluntwini, kuqalwe phezulu - ungeza nakuHolomisa ukuba unento onayo ngakuye - phaya kuZuma. Mababanjwe aba bantu kuba balimoshile eli lizwe; musani ukudlala apha.

Dr P W A MULDER: Speaker, Mr Kathrada was a member of the First Parliament after 1994. I am one of the few members left in this Fifth Parliament that served with Mr Kathrada in that First Parliament. We are only about 12 members left in this Parliament that also served in the 1994 Parliament.

On many points I differed with Mr Kathrada but we also had many points in common. He was born in the small North West town of Schweizer-Reneke and I lived in Schweizer-Reneke for several years. We often shared our memories of Schweizer-Reneke.

### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 34

We also shared an attitude of searching for win-win solutions that accommodate everyone in South Africa, therefore leading to positive debates.

In that First Parliament the atmosphere was totally different to what we experience today in this Parliament. As we were writing the 1996 Constitution, we had weekly discussions and debates, mostly in small groups, on how we see the future of South Africa. We were forced to listen to each other and had to try to understand the other person's viewpoints. In this, Mr Kathrada was a good listener and debater, looking for win-win solutions.

What did I learn from those days? I learnt that I do not mind that you criticise me for what I believe in but do not criticise me for what you think I believe in. I learnt that from those discussions with Mr Kathrada and his viewpoints.

I miss this in our present Parliament, where we debate each other without really trying to understand what exactly the other side said or believes in.

Afrikaans:

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

## TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 35

Ek wil dit tog in Afrikaans herhaal. Ek gee nie om dat jy my kritiseer vir dit wat ek in glo nie, maar ek is uiters gefrustreerd as jy my kritiseer vir dit wat jy dink ek glo en wat ek nie glo nie, sonder dat jy ooit moeite gedoen het om werklik my standpunt te leer ken of my te probeer verstaan.

## English:

With this attitude of Mr Kathrada, he invited me to deliver a speech at the annual Ahmed Kathrada Foundation conference in 2012. The title was, What does unity and diversity mean for me as an Afrikaner? You can go and read my speech if you want.

Mr Kathrada's strongest qualities were friendliness and humility, but one should not for one minute doubt his iron resolve to achieve his goals.

When we are young we all have dreams as to how we will change the world and how we shall put our stamp on it. It is given to few persons to live out their dreams in their lifetime. Mr Kathrada succeeded in doing this. Against huge odds he had realised the vision that he had as a young man.

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

## TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 36

Sir, a leader who acts merely to be popular isn't a real leader. A real leader must be prepared to go against the majority because he or she knows that they are wrong and he or she must provide leadership to them in doing so. That is not always easy.

Mr Kathrada was such a leader up to the end where he criticised leaders that he differed with. No-one can deny the impact that Mr Kathrada made on South Africa. The reaction following his death confirms this.

On behalf of the FF Plus, I wish to express my sympathy with Mr Kathrada's family and also with Barbara Hogan whom I also learnt to know better in those beginning years.

Mr W M MADISHA: Hon Speaker, with the passing of Comrade Kathrada we come closer to the end of an era; an era of integrity of leaders in the ANC who stood for honesty, honour, truthfulness, trustworthiness, sincerity, decency and a strong and unwavering moral principle.

It is no wonder that Comrade Barbara Hogan used the phrase, "If you had ears to hear and eyes to see." It is through our

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 37

conscience that we see and hear; that we become aware of our deeply held moral principles; that we are motivated to act upon them; and that we assess our character, our behaviour and ultimately ourselves against those principles. It is when we don't see and don't listen that we become callous. As Comrade Hogan said:

Mr President, you have sacrificed your people on the altar of greed and corruption. ... Mr President, if you had ears to hear and eyes to see, you would have stepped down as President.

Then, as the ANC Youth League made it clear through their callous behaviour at the Durban memorial lecture, the ANC has lost its ability to see and hear; has lost its morality and integrity; and its moral legitimacy to lead and govern society.

The Kathrada Foundation indicated that they would have wanted Parliament to have discussed the conduct of the President. In this way, Parliament could have fulfilled its core obligations to the people of South Africa and truly honoured Kathrada's memory.

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

## TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 38

It was after all the National Assembly's failure to hold the President to account and the subsequent damning judgement of the Constitutional Court that prompted Kathrada to write to Mr Zuma, imploring him to resign.

Now that we have not done anything, I want to say that history will not forgive us altogether. However, as I step down, I want to thank Comrade Charles Nqakula for what he has said. My former general-secretary and a leader in the Communist Party, what you said is great and I think we'll be able to go forward. Thank you very much and thanks Deputy President.

Rev K R J MESHOE: Hon Speaker, even though it is almost three months since the late struggle stalwart and former member of this House Ahmed Kathrada passed away, I wish to convey the condolence of the ACDP to his wife, Barbara Hogan, the Kathrada family and friends and the ANC.

Ahmed Kathrada, who was fondly known as Uncle Kathy, was a man of great humility, tolerance, resilience and had a steadfast commitment to principle.

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

## TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 39

Uncle Kathy became politically conscious when he was 17 years old and participated in the Passive Resistance Campaign of the SA Indian Congress and was later arrested, banned and placed under a number of house arrests after which he joined the political underground to continue his political work. One of the most agonising and painful things he had to do before he passed away was to write an open letter to President Jacob Zuma, asking him to resign.

To honour his memory, there are a few of the issues Uncle Kathy raised that I will raise this afternoon and I quote:

In all these years it never occurred to me that the time would come when I would feel obliged to express my concerns to the honourable President. It is, therefore, painful for me to write this letter to you.

The position of President is one that must at all times unite this country behind a vision and programme that seeks to make tomorrow a better day than today for all South Africans.

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

## Page: 40

It is a position that requires the respect of all South Africans, which of course must be earned at all times.

If not, Comrade President, are you aware that your outstanding contribution to the liberation struggle stands to be severely tarnished if the remainder of your term as President continues to be dogged by crises and a growing public loss of confidence in the ANC and government as a whole?

I know that if I were in the President's shoes, I would step down with immediate effect. I believe that is what would help the country to find its way out of a path that it never imagined it would be on, but one that it must move out of soon.

For these reasons, the ACDP supports the call by the Ahmed Kathrada Foundation for parliamentarians who wish to honour the late struggle stalwart to put the country first and wholeheartedly support the motion of no confidence in President Jacob Zuma, and to speak to the issues that troubled him up to his last days.

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

## TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 41

The ACDP further supports the call by the foundation that said, and I quote:

The National Assembly has the opportunity, through the motion of no confidence, to start the process of putting the country back on track and refocusing on the core challenges that South Africa faced.

I therefore in emphasis call on all parliamentarians to heed what the Ahmed Kathrada Foundation requested that to show our support that we must all support the motion of no confidence in President Jacob Zuma. I thank you.

Mr L M NTSHAYISA: Hon House Chair, hon Deputy President and hon members, we extend our condolences to the Kathrada family. Uncle Kathy was a gentle and yet a radical freedom fighter in the former years of his illustrious life. He started from the trenches and rose to prominence when he appeared in the infamous Rivonia Trial with Tata Nelson Mandela.

He was a man of integrity, a man of truth as if he knew very well that the truth will always set you free. Uncle Kathy was a patriot and his patriotism was never unsurpassed. There are

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

## TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 42

nagging questions that permeates our society today that Kathrada would have bothered himself a great deal. He was a diligent, devoted, a dedicated and always a determined cadre.

In the words of Shakespeare and I quote, "She should have died hereafter. There would have been a time for such a word." His death is not only a loss to his family, but to the nation as a whole.

Hon Chairperson, South Africa should reincarnate his humour, his vigour, his sense of awareness and his jurisprudence. He played his role and those left behind must take leaf from a good work that Kathrada did. We need people of his calibre. He actually achieved his greatness because he was not born a great man. May his soul rest in peace. I thank you. [Applause.]

Mr M A PLOUAMMA: Hon members and hon Chairperson, on behalf of AgangSA and myself we are truly and deeply saddened by the passing of Ahmed Kathrada. Mme Barbara, it is our unshakable resolve to continue with the legacy of Ahmed Kathrada, his brevity fortitude against all odds.

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

## TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

## Page: 43

In memory of Ahmed Kathrada, we will continue fighting against this Gupta economic capital and we will draw inspiration from your nonracialism and defeat this political cholera spread by the Guptas and stooges like Jimmy Manyi, Andile Mngxitama and the ANC Youth League.

Mme Barbara, we know that President Zuma is a proxy of the Guptas, we know that Uncle Kathy asked him to step down and we know that he was vilified and his memorial service disrupted. Mme Barbara, we want to apologise to you and the Kathrada family. We know that those hotheads of the ANC Youth League, hooligans of the ANC Youth League have become unholy warriors of the President and the Guptas. [Applause.]

Hon members, we want to promise Ahmed Kathrada that President Zuma will have his day in court and pay for his greedy sins and this Gupta bondage. [Interjections.]

Ms M S KHAWULA: Aboshwe nokuboshwa!

Mr M A PLOUAMMA: It is really painful that warriors like Ahmed Kathrada, Nelson Mandela and many more have spend most of their lives for Duduzane Zuma to be richer than some of our

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

## TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 44

provinces. [Laughter.] For President Zuma to endorse Gupta colonisation is a serious assault to our nation's character and for Cabinet Ministers to take orders from foreign forces. Please Ahmed Kathrada, tell Madiba resign from the ANC branch in heaven.

The ANC OF President Zuma has become an enemy of your legacy; it has become a fountain of patronage and a corner of dark angels.

We will forever cherish your contribution, your wishes will always be our point of reference and a guiding light when most ANC leaders have chosen subtle cowardice hiding behind their stomach and friendship, putting the love of their country second and loving President Zuma first.

Hon members, Ahmed Kathrada is the hero of this country and we must always keep him in our hearts. He must guide us day and knight. I thank you. [Applause.]

Mr N T GODI: House Chair, comrades, hon members and Deputy President, the APC joins this House in paying tribute to the late Comrade Ahmed Kathrada; a selfless, self-sacrificing

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

## Page: 45

leader in our struggle for freedom. He served, suffered and sacrificed for our freedom. As we enjoy freedom, we must always remember and honour those like Comrade Kathrada who abandoned personal comfort in service to the nation.

He belonged to a generation of South Africans who in the dark days of national subjugation rose to the challenge. He, together with his comrades in the ANC and the Pan- Africanist Congress of Azania toiled on Robben Island, whilst serving as a source of inspiration to the struggling masses. Kathrada, Mandela, Sisulu, Mhlaba, Mlangeni and Motsoaledi were sentenced to life imprisonment on Robben Island in 1964. They came to Robben Island and joined Nkosi, Tefu, Malepa, Mthimunye, Mosemola and Chibane, PAC cadres who had been sentenced to life imprisonment on Robben Island in 1963.

Remembering Kathrada is remembering where we come from, what we sought to achieve for our people in freedom, never to betray the sacrifices of the likes of Kathrada, to do everything for the people and nothing against the people.

Kathrada's generation led us to freedom. What of our generation in the challenges facing our country. Challenges of integrity

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

## TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 46

in public leadership and the need to transform the socioeconomic power relations inherited from white minority rule. The majority are looking to us to provide leadership the same way the likes of Comrade Kathrada did. May his soul rest in peace. Thank you.

The MINISTER OF SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY: Thank you very much Chairperson. I would like to thank the House in the NA for the opportunity to pay tribute to Mr Ahmed Kathrada.

I should also say that the Chief Whip spoke to Mrs Barbra Hogan, and she indicated appreciation and support that this tribute was being held; and indicated due to a family bereavement they could not be here today, nevertheless the tribute should proceed.

Mr Ahmed Kathrada was a true patriot, a faithful fighter, and a disciplined revolutionary. He is part of a cohort of leaders of South Africa and the ANC who are exceptional in terms of living true to the national ideals articulated by and embodied in the very essence of that which we call the movement of the people, our glorious organisation the ANC.

# NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

## TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 47

Drawing on the example of leaders such as OR Tambo, Nelson Mandela, Walter Sisulu, Raymond Mhlaba, Albertina Sisulu, Lillian Ngoyi, Helen Joseph, Albert Luthuli, Winnie Mandela, Peter Mokaba, Chris Hani and thousands others, he shaped his legacy for South Africa.

Kathrada chose to refuse privilege and comfort in service of the people and the struggle for freedom. His personal testimony of life as an activist in his acceptance of the Freedom of Johannesburg speech confirms the resolute commitment of this stalwart.

It's possible that there are mean and venal observers among us who seek to deny Kathrada what may be termed a generous set of accolades but we are fortunate in that we are not interpreting history - we are referring to direct observations.

The signal ANC document, "Through the Eye of a Needle", describes the broad requirements of leaderships; and in looking at Kathrada working closely with his comrades and friends right through the defiance campaign, the mobilisation for the Congress of the People, the drafting and adoption of the Freedom Charter, the promotion of non-racialism by working with

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

## TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 48

all revolutionary components of society, participation and revolutionary sabotage, serving as MK cadre, Rivonia Trialist, Robben Island prisoner and activist, Uncle Kathy proved to be a true leader.

And yet, with all these revolutionary credentials Kathrada reflected the following as set out in "Through the Eye of a Needle," and I quote: a leader should lead by example. He should be above reproach in his political and social conduct as defined by our revolutionary morality.

Through force of example, he should act as a role model for ANC members and non-members alike. Leading a life that reflects commitment to the strategic goals of the NDR includes not only being free of corrupt practices; it also means actively fighting against corruption.

Hon members, if we utilise these attributes as a guide for assessing former hon member Kathrada I believe it correct to say, he would probably achieve a distinction. Some may ask, what is the sum total of his national contribution?

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

## TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 49

Well, he is among the many midwives who gave birth to our Constitution and shaped the many progressive laws adopted by this Parliament, laws that have resulted in positive changes in education, health services, access to social services and support, inclusive sport and housing provision of a scale rarely achieved in a modern democracy.

Several of us will recall his words at the funeral of our great icon former president Nelson Mandela, where he said: "My life is now a huge void I have no one left to turn to."

All of us know that all the Rivonia trialists shared a special bond of comradeship and friendship, yet none so close as Mr Mandela and Mr Kathrada.

Strange then that despite this great bond in this House and seemingly in their personal friendship Kathrada seemed to expect no special acknowledgement or reward from former president Mandela.

His was a rare humility, a rare dignity. Again, as is said "Through the Eye of a Needle": leader should seek to influence and to be influenced by others in the collective.

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

## TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 50

He should have the conviction to state his views boldly and openly within structures of the movement and without being disrespectful, not to cower before those in more senior positions in pursuit of patronage, nor to rely on cliques to maintain ones position.

Kathrada reflected the call that leadership characteristics should satisfy the goals of our revolutionary democratic movement, a non-racial and non-sexist national movement, a broad national democratic movement, a mass movement and a leader of the democratic forces.

Drawing on these attributes of the movement, the retired former parliamentary counsellor to the first democratically elected President of South Africa, continued his life commitment to nurturing a non-racial society, a task on which all of us gathered here still have much work to do; including, - we will remind the hon Cachalia and members of his own party caucus.

As the hon Premier Helen Zille has told us in the public domain, there are members who are treated differently in their party because of skin colour, and that the remarks she made on colonialism hon Cachalia, reflect what many black members have

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

## TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 51

said without sanction in her own party - not my words, those of the hon Zille. [Applause.]

So Kathrada held the strong belief that it is possible to support young people to develop non racialism and this must be pursued with young people from all racial groups, all backgrounds and all classes, if we are to achieve the ideals espoused by our movement.

Thus for him the principles of the ANC were not for regurgitation, they were a map for a practical political life. Again, he reflected the following drawing from through "Through the Eye of a Needle": a leader should win the confidence of the people in her day to day work.

Where the situation demands she should be firm and have the courage to explain and seek to convince others of the correctness of decisions taken by structures even if such decisions are unpopular.

She should not seek to gain cheap popularity by avoiding difficult issues, making false promises or merely pandering to popular sentiment. Uncle Kathy chose the difficult issues of

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

## TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 52

our times, rejecting racism, empowering youth and giving them hope in the future and where needed was ready to say that which may not be popular.

He would be the first however to chastise us for trying to make him a saint, he did not suffer fools or pomposity kindly, he had a wicked sense of humour and could be sharp and pointed in expressing disappointment and displeasure. His World Policy Autumn 2012 contribution does exactly that.

There is much for us as members of the movement to draw on as lessons, a lot for us as public representatives to learn and copy. We need to ask ourselves, whether in our daily, rather petty disagreements and name calling in this House, do we deserve the mantle of the inheritors of this legacy.

Are we doing all that is possible to serve the people? We all collectively work really hard in and outside the House, work that is in service to the people, and in the pursuit of revolutionary ideals or has self service become predominant to the exclusion of national service?

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

## TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 53

We as members of our glorious movement have been bequeathed a wonderful organisation. We in the ANC can multiply its greatness or muddy it. We have too our incredible Constitution, a robust democracy and still thriving democratic institutions.

How do we together make them serve not our idiosyncratic selfish ends but the people of South Africa, especially the most marginalised downtrodden and excluded?

I suspect Uncle Kathy would pose this question, reminding us of the immense power for good we hold in our hands, urging us to work together for the greater good.

I hope, hon members, we will reply to him one day soon, and that that reply will allow him, and those we owe a massive debt of gratitude and service, to finally rest in peace. We would say to Uncle Kathy, you must rest in peace. Qhawe lamaqhawe. [Applause.]

However, we would honour him greatly if that resting in peace would be accompanied by our energetic attention to those issues that gave him the greatest concern.

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

## TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 54

That young people all through our country would be supported and empowered to be non-racial. That indeed, we would accept that we must change the structure of our economy so that those who are excluded are included and not excluded from opportunity.

That we would change our view of each other, and not believe, that every black person of means is a corrupt crook - because that in itself is racist and dishonest. [Applause.]

We would also hope that what we would do is take on the most difficult of the challenges that confront our society; and that we would work within this Parliament to ensure that together we resolve those challenges.

The task that Comrade Kathrada and those who work with him took on was not to further separate our nation, rather their intention was to draw us together in order to ensure that we use our presence in a democratic institution to build a new and very different society.

The time has come for us to ask in this Parliament how often do we mention ourselves and when do we talk about the condition of

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

## TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 55

our people and how we use our muscle in this House to change their condition and not to insult each other.[Applause.]

The legacy of Uncle Kathy serves as a model for each of us as Members of Parliament and leaders in our society. We should as the hon Shaik-Emam has said remember this man of distinction by honouring his legacy and by serving our people as he wanted.

If you look at his writings and all his speeches, in at least two of the paragraphs in every speech and every essay he wrote, seeks the opportunity of education for young people.

We should be making sure that all children in our country enjoy this particular opportunity. We have done well but as he would remind us we have not gone as far as we should go.

We should work hard to eradicate racism as this House as was the task of the foundation that he established. We should draw young people closer to us as leaders in South Africa to imbuing them the values and spirit so well exemplified by Comrade Kathrada.

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 56

As has been said by the hon Mulder just a few of us remain and I am well as told hon Mulder that I 'm an old woman and I should go by the gawping that I get from the left of not the left; but I think it is absolutely wonderful to have been able to have the opportunity to ... [Interjection.]

Mr D W MACPHERSON: [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY: Oh you know you are fully aware of who says it. Don't say who says it. It is your very Chief Whip, more than once.

We have had the opportunity to play a significant role in laying the basis for shaping a new society. What the hon former member Ahmed Kathrada has left us with is the challenge of what do we do with this foundation - that's it! Do we fundamentally alter our society or do we use our time here merely to cap at each other and fail to build a transformed South Africa. "Hamba kahle qwawe lamaqhawe". Rest in Peace Comrade Kathy. [Applause.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON: (Ms M G BOROTO): That concludes the speaker's list on this matter. I take it that there are no

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

## TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 57

objections to the motion being adopted. Will members please rise to observe a moment of silence in memory of Mr A M KATHRADA? Thank you very much. You may take your seats.

The presiding officers associate themselves with the motion. The condolences of the House will be conveyed to the Kathrada family.

Hon members, the parliamentary communication service has published a book titled "Mourning a leader, celebrating a legacy," which pays tribute to the work of the late Dr Ahmed Kathrada through anecdotes and memoirs captured during his life time. Members will be given copies of the book as they leave the Chamber. [Applause.]

SPEEDING UP LAND REFORM BY USING THE LIMITATION CLAUSE IN THE CONSTITUTION TO BYPASS THE FAILED 'WILLING SELLER, WILLING BUYER POLICY

SUBJECT FOR DISCUSSION (Mr S C MNCWABE)

Mr S C MNCWABE: Hon Chairperson, Deputy President, hon Speaker and hon members, in 1913 with the Native Land Act coming into effect, millions of South Africans lost their land with a

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

## TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

## Page: 58

stroke of a pen. This time the dispossession was not through war but through the law. It had been the signal moment when the historic dispossession of the African people had been formally consolidated on a nationwide basis in terms of express racist illegal title. The majority of our people were restricted to live in a mere 7% of the land, which was increased to 13% in 1936, forming the nucleus of the Bantustans which was to give effect to the repressive policies of apartheid government.

Ultimately, after 1913, 15% of the population owned 87% of the land. It is this injustice that has to be addressed, and the NFP believes that it will be just and equitable to similarly reverse this process of dispossession through law and not war.

Land restitution is not just about rebuilding houses and giving back farms; it is about pain, loss and acknowledging the human suffering of people who were dispossessed. Moreover, restitution is not just about returning land; it is about restoring dignity and identity and ultimately simply having a place that one can call home. Government has during the past 23 years made efforts to implement land reform process through legislation and other means but the results are not very encouraging. Initiatives such as the willing-buyer, willing-

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 59

seller has failed to deliver real tangible progress. One of the serious challenges facing the implementation of the land reform programme related to incoherent institutional transformation.

There are in our view, two major obstacles to successful land reform. Firstly, the entire process has ground down to a snail's pace because of administrative delays and bureaucratic red tape. The second obstacle is financing the land restitution programme and process which has drained the fiscus of almost R42 billion thus far, of which half was used for compensation. Such a continued drain on the fiscus is not sustainable and has to be addressed.

The question we are now facing is how do we proceed, how do we balance the need for ordered land reform with the impatience of our people who have been waiting for so long. We take our cue from Justice Albie Sachs who said during a recent form party lecture delivered as part of the Oliver Tambo Centenary Series "I believe that the realisation of the full potential of the Constitution as presently worded would make radical and sustainable land redistribution imminently achievable".

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

## TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

## Page: 60

Following the statement of Justice Albie Sachs, the answer to effecting equitable and just land reform lies in the Constitution as it is worded right now without having to resort to the drastic measure of amending the Constitution.

The NFP believes that it is time for government to consider invoking section 36 of the Constitution, which we know as Limitation Clause, to address the constitutional requirement of compensation for Expropriation of Property contained in section 25 (2) (b) in general and by implication, section 25 (3) in its totality. We are of the opinion that by invoking section 36, the state could meaningfully limit compensation and address one of the major obstacles to land reform being the prohibitive financing costs which are estimated to be in the range of R180 billion to settle the existing land claims. This figure will escalate to ten-fold once the unconstitutionality of the Restitution of Land Right Amendment Act is addressed by this House to facilitate a second round of land claims and a cost which fiscus will simply not be able to absorb.

In conclusion, having placed our proposal on the table, the NFP is looking forward to hear the views of our colleagues in this

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 61

House in the spirit of our national quest to find ways to speed up the land reform. I thank you.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF RURAL DEVELOPMENT AND LAND REFORM: Hon Chairperson, people of South Africa, all protocols observed: It is my view that when dealing with such matters it is of paramount importance to start from the beginning. The question we are debating today is not only emotional but also sad in a sense that our forebears had to pay with their lives in defence of their own land as well as in defence of their cattle and all belongings.

The arrival of the white settlers in the South Africa in 1652 brought about the denigration of the indigenous people of this country. Therefore, it is important to indicate that when dealing with the history of land dispossession, which has been the subject of critical contestation amongst the people of this country, it becomes crucial to cite the history of resistance and wars waged by our people against the white colonial settlers.

Before 191, the African people under the leadership of their traditional leaders fought fierce wars against the white

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

## TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 62

colonial settlers whose only intentions was to dispossess them of their land and livestock. These dispossessions of the African people of their land spread like wild fire in the continent of Africa, resulting in many wars fought by the people in defence of their land.

This inequality is also evident in ownership patterns. Land, property and human capital remain heavily skewed in the hands of a minority while the majority continue to strive for a better life. It was for this reason that the democratic government is introduced measures to arrest these imbalances and to provide redress to those who were dispossessed of their land through discriminatory laws and/or practices.

This resulted in the restitution programme of government, which derives its mandate from section 25 of the 1996 Constitution, and is central to the government's vision of 'radical socioeconomic transformation' of the country. The Commission on Restitution of Land Rights has over the years continued to restore land to various individuals and communities to reverse this legacy.

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

## TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 63

The overall progress regarding the redistribution of white owned agricultural land in South Africa, amounting to 82 million hectares, from 1994 is such that there are 4,8 million hectares under Land Redistribution through 5 337 projects amounting to more than R12 billion. A 3,4 million hectares is the land acquired through a Restitution Programme, totalling to 8,2 million hectares, which is 50% of the National Development Plan target, NDP target, of 20% as set to be achieved by 2030.

Benefitting under the land reform programme, in a form of groups, individuals and black emergent farmers obtaining grant well as land acquired under leasehold are 293 137 beneficiaries benefitted: Of which, 67 985 are women; 34 641 are youth; and 689 are people with disability.

Of the 4,8 million hectares, over 760 000 hectares are redistributed mainly for the purpose of settlement through Settlement Land Acquisition Grant, Slag, while 840 000 hectares is redistributed for municipalities under Commonage Grant, COMG. Furthermore over three million hectares of land is redistributed mainly for agricultural purpose through Land

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

## TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 64

Redistribution for Agricultural Development, LRAD, and Proactive Land Acquisition Strategy, Plas.

The introduction of a land reform programme created the possibility for communities and larger groups of persons to control land on a communal basis. This necessitated the passing of the Communal Property Association Act of 1996. There are currently 1 513 communal property associations, CPAs, which have been registered countrywide.

The enormous resources that are normally at the disposal of these entities tend to manufacture factions and conflict that eventually renders these entities dysfunctional. The Communal Property Association Act is currently being amended with a view to strengthen control mechanisms and establish a proper registrar of CPAs.

Currently, the department is processing more than 20 000 labour tenant applications that were lodged. In the Medium Term Expenditure Framework, MTEF, period the department plans to settle 6 434 labour tenant applications which will award 28 100 hectares of land. The department will settle all the claims

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

## TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 65

other than those that will be referred to the courts in the next five years.

The State Land Lease and Disposal Policy, SLLDP, is one of the policies meant to provide land access to the previously disadvantaged with a view to address poverty, unemployment and inequality. This policy identifies women as a special priority group within the main target groups. In all this that I have mentioned, we still have got a good story to tell. You can go to Limpopo, in the Ravele restitution projects , where this community is coming back home with R10 million annual turnover. [Applause.]

You can go to Nkanini restitution project in KwaZulu-Natal, where there is training unemployed youth with matric qualification in sugarcane production. You can also g to Mpumalanga, at Matsafeni restitution project where these communities are exporting fruit to far places, such as Russia. All three have succeeded in driving away the frontiers of poverty among their communities by providing jobs and skills for their people. These are amongst the many achievements that are there.

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

## TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

## Page: 66

The former president of the ANC, Oliver Tambo, addressing the world consultation of the World Council of Churches in 1980, had this to say, and I quote:

What was arrogantly described as a civilising mission in South Africa was in fact the genocidal destruction of the Khoi and the San people, the land expropriation of the rest of the indigenous people, the obliteration of their culture in all its forms, the application of a consistent policy for the impoverishment of the black people and their transformation into labour units for the enrichment of the coloniser and the political domination of the majority by a white settler minority.

I thank you.

Mr K P ROBERTSON: House Chair, hon members, this very house has been instrumental in designing a constitutional framework on land reform and redress. This framework was drafted and adopted by some of the most astute politicians of our time. The framework was adopted on the basis of its transparency, fairness and practicality but mostly based on addressing the imbalances of the past.

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

## TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

## Page: 67

We know the Constitution is sound and that policy implementation is clearly the problem, so why does this motion not speak to the implementation of policy? Instead it deflects attention away from the failures of the ANC and their various departments in provinces. Surely a logical and progressive approach would be to engage with another political party capable of its implementation before attempting to amend the constitution?

Hon House Chair, despite the political rhetoric which is being used in an attempt to force a wedge between the private sector and the poor, there is still great enthusiasm from the private sector regarding agriculture and land transformation. There is not one agricultural union in SA that is against land reform and that is against addressing the painful wrongs of the past. This is how far we have come as a nation. The private sector is of critical importance, as it proves that not only do they have the will to assist emerging farmers, they have the expertise to transform redundant land into commercial powerhouses.

In Amsterdam Mpumalanga, there is a farmer who has undertaken to mentor neighbouring emerging farmers. They were left desolate and poverty stricken by the state after the

# NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

## TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 68

finalisation of a claim. He undertakes this at his own expense. These emerging farmers are guided in the intricacies of maize farming, soil analysis and more importantly, they benefit financially from his mentorship.

Another example is Grain SA who have undertaken to plant 4000 hectares of maize on designated one hectare one household land, this, to the benefit of the community and the economy. Four thousand households will benefit from this initiative. Together, we must grow our economy. If we restrict the private sector participation, there are harsh realities that lie ahead. As currently there are thousands of state-owned farming implements and tractors that were bought to assist emerging farmers that now stand broken or unused in the fields; an utter incompetence from the ANC departments.

The DA will prioritise land ownership for beneficiaries. We will prioritise mentorship and we will ensure that our most rural areas are exposed to the economy and that they contribute positively toward it. In a DA government we believe that freedom, fairness, opportunity and accountability - the beneficiaries of land reform will be a priority and their

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

### Page: 69

success is something DA takes very personally. I thank you. [Applause.]

Mr M S MBATHA: Good afternoon, House Chair, our people do not want charity. Our people want ownership of their land. The very same democratic order was supposed to understand that the difference between apartheid and the future democratic state was the return of the land to its rightful owners, to restore the dignity of our people and the ANC unfortunately missed this understanding, just like it has missed so many other things, when in particular coming to issues that pertain to the oppressed.

When we came here in 2014 we made available to the ANC our six percent to enable the ANC to go through all the legalities, but the legalities would have never helped you because far beyond the legalities, there is what you call political consciousness. You need the will, you need the zeal to take a decision to take land back to its rightful owners without compensation and for that you will not need the EFF to keep on reminding you, you need to remind yourself of why, in the first place, your forbearers were involved in the wars of resistance.

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

## TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

### Page: 70

Returning the land to its rightful owners requires a bold political decision. This is the kind of decision that has been missing for the past 23 years. This debate today is misplaced. It assumes that to possibly speedup land reform through the use of the limitation clauses in the Constitution is the best of ideas that you have today.

As the EFF we believe that expropriation of land and all its mineral wealth without compensation is the answer. Returning our land without compensation means that we recognise and accept that in the first instance our land was stolen through the barrel of the gun and thus through many years of resistance and the wars fought throughout the corners of our country, that our people even though they were not able to win back their land, the defeat they suffered meant that when you become a democratic state, you have to return: The psychological defeat; landlessness, and; many other things that they suffered.

As the democratic order your obligation was to return the dignity of the people, to effect socioeconomic justice that would have been paramount to your cause of making your Constitution democratic. Today our people are left with the Constitution. They cannot eat the Constitution. They cannot

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

## TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

### Page: 71

settle in the Constitution. They cannot progress in their lives using the Constitution. We need the land to settle. We need the land to farm. We need the land to maintain our sovereignty, to provide food security and many other things which attack our people today. One of the biggest nightmares of our people is impoverishment. Poverty did not visit them during apartheid; it has visited them now more. You have no solution to this except returning their land and make them to work on their land and make them to be resistant to poverty and to be resilient to their own fight for self sufficiency.

The nature of the beast is that it will take the ANC another 100 years to return 80% of the land. By that time you will almost be not in power because your laziness to decide on many other things could possibly force our people to make sure that you go out of power quicker than you ever imagined. Thank you. [Applause.]

Mr M HLENGWA: Chairperson, the systematic dispossession of land belonging to the indigenous peoples of this country over hundreds of years and the subsequent land reform process which is only two decades old, will still take many years to resolve. Land reform remains an imperfect policy as we still grapple

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

## TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 72

with the fair and successful process thereof. In terms our Constitution, government must effect land reform but within the parameters of the rule of law.

Chairperson, we can all agree that land reform has performed poorly. Its stated objective being the alleviation of poverty and inequality of many has fallen far short of the mark. The few that have benefitted have in many instances been the wrong people. Agricultural land that was once productive now lies fallow. This is in part due to weak post-settlement agricultural support systems, no real market access, to much focus on subsistence farming, lack of adequate funding models and too great a reliance on the land market.

The willing buyer willing seller model in which expropriation and redistribution takes place is only one part of the equation though. The IFP has always called for a broader view to be adopted, from expropriation to redistribution to successful and sustained use of the land. The land reform issue requires a holistic approach to solving its many and varied challenges. Colleagues, there is no quick fix to this problem.

### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 73

The topic we are dealing with today, specifically deals with Section 25 of the Constitution and circumventing the willing buyer willing seller process by seeking to invoke the Section 36 limitation clause therein. The IFP therefore emphasises section 25(8) which clearly states that:

No provision of this section may impede the state from taking legislative and other measures to achieve and, water and related reform, in order to redress the results of past racial discrimination, provided that any departure from the provisions of this section is in accordance with the provisions of section 36(1).

Chairperson, Land reform therefore must be seen as part and parcel of our nation building and reconciliation responsibility. All South Africans must benefit from this process but the process must be just, fair and equitable.

The IFP continues to advocate for a model that ensures means of fair and just expropriation with compensation. Yet restitution will not help, if it is amongst other things, unaccompanied by a viable economic programme of farmer education and training, resourcing, continued support and supervision.

### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 74

Finally, hon Chairperson, really land grabs must be stopped and the police must do everything possible to arrest those people, otherwise we breed a culture of lawlessness, criminal activity because if we handle the land question recklessly, then we run the risk of descending into an unnecessary state of violence. So, the police must shape up or ship out. Thank you.

Prof N M KHUBISA: House Chairperson, hon Deputy President, Ministers, hon members, the application of the Limitation clause to section 25 of our Constitution should be given serious consideration if we are to address the fiscal strain of Land reform.

Earlier, my colleague identified two major obstacles to meaningful land reform, namely financial considerations, and the administration of the process.

This year alone, an amount of R10,3 billion — which represents 32% of the Department of Rural Development and Land Reform's budget over the Medium-Term Expenditure Framework, MTEF — will go towards settling land claims.

### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 75

In a reply to a question from the NFP, the Minister of Rural Development and Land Reform listed the following as reasons for the backlog in the processing of land claims. Firstly, research that is complex because of multiple overlapping rights; secondly, claims that were in court not being processed fast enough; thirdly, land owners challenging the validity of claims; fourthly, disagreements between the claimants and beneficiaries on settlement options or entities to hold the land on how financial compensation is distributed; and, finally, untraceable claimants who the department is trying to locate.

Several of these issues relate to the administration of the land reform process and have to be addressed with serious intent if we are to make speedy and meaningful progress in returning the land to our people.

Another issue which needs urgent attention is the prevalence of corruption which has seeped into the land reform process. Land reform deals often involve inflated prices that enrich the elite. Earlier this year, the Sunday Times reported on a Limpopo farm that the agriculture Minister allegedly lined up for two ANC cadres who had neither an ancestral claim to the

### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

### TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 76

land, nor any agriculture experience. The deal cost R130 million of public money, while 31 farm workers went unpaid and a productive farm fell into disrepair. Similarly, the much acclaimed Mala Mala land claim deal cost taxpayers R1 billion and yet the beneficiary community has not seen any benefits and remains in deep poverty.

Having said that, I want to say that transfer of skills and rendering of support to beneficiary communities are absolutely critical for a successful land reform process. The NFP believes that such programs of assistance are of crucial importance if we are to have meaningful land reform.

The NFP does not accept the killing of farmers. We totally abhor anarchy and totally condemn it. It takes our country back and does not assist us or social cohesion.

In similar vein, I must point out that the NFP abhors the abuse, harassment, torture and killing of farmworkers. Those kinds of things are disgusting and must not happen in our country. The removal of people from their land is unacceptable. In all the provinces this is happening. Even around the corner,

### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

### Page: 77

here in Woodstock and Khayelitsha, that is happening. The department must investigate that. Thank you.

Mr M L W FILTANE: Chairperson, on the debate about section 36 of the Constitution, I want to state categorically, up front: forget about buying back our country. This is just not the way to reverse the effects of the wars of dispossession.

Even if you had wanted to buy back the land, you would anyway not have enough funds to do so, especially after the floodgates were opened by the then Minister of Home Affairs when he recklessly allowed the granting of South Africa citizenship to the Guptas.

# Isixhosa:

Hayi ke emva koko baye bazenzela kwimali yeli lizwe, yaphela akusokuze kubekho nale yokuthenga.

# English:

Now, South African-born citizens have neither the money nor the land off which to live.

### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 78

Then there is the issue of the pre-1913 dispossessions. We shall not give up on our cry for the inclusion of those large parcels of land in the list of parcels to be ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon Filtane, please take your seat. There is a point of order. On what point are you rising, hon member?

Mr M S RALEGOMA: I rise in terms of Rule 85, Chairperson. The member here has said ... He knows what he has said. [Interjections.] He must substantiate because I'm rising on the point of Rule 85.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon member, I will follow up on what he said. Thank you. [Interjections.]

Mr N L S KWANKWA: Point of order, Chair. Can you please reprimand the hon member? He can't rise on a point of order on an issue he cannot remember! [Interjections.] [Laughter.] It is a frivolous point of order which wastes my member's time. Please!

### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

### Page: 79

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Thank you, hon member. The mere fact that he talks about Rule 85 ... that's why I say I will consult Hansard to determine what he said and will come back. Continue, hon member.

Mr M L W FILTANE: Thank you very much. We won't give up on the pre-1913 dispossessions. We shall not support any legislation that excludes those acres of our land. The landless indigenous citizens of this country must not continue to be excluded by the current Zuma administration.

The state has so much land in its possession. Why not release that land to the landless? This government has made a direct contribution to the junk status in which this country finds itself. It does so by failing to come up with a clear citizenbenefiting land policy. Little efforts like the one-family, one-hectare and one-family, two-cows policies will not dent the poverty faced by so many, so much so that the department has not even attempted to do estimates of the socioeconomic impact of such measures. They are that negligible!

Was this Constitution crafted mainly to protect minority rights or to give more rights to the majority? Thus far it has given

### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

### Page: 80

very little meaningful rights to the majority and more meaningful rights to the minority. Look at the economy if you do not understand what I mean by that. The government is scraping the barrel in order to feed the landless. Food parcels are an example.

This government is even failing to efficiently manage the land in its possession. We are sitting with Public Works today ... it's just poor, poor, poor! Blacks continue to trade on street pavements, in the open or in shacks and caravans in the country of their birth. They have no land on which to put up decent business infrastructure.

I guess it would take this administration 20 years before it could put up something like the Mall of Africa. They would be debating and debating.

The period from 1994 was supposed to be the best of times for the landless, but it has turned out be the worst of times.

Wake up to the challenge. The sun is about to set in 2019 and your days will be done forever.

### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 81

We have reached a point at which this government is dead against the state of South Africa. The government cannot deliver to the state - which is the citizens, the land and the people of South Africa. The Zuma administration must go! Thank you.

### Afrikaans:

Dr P J GROENEWALD: Agb Voorsitter, 'n mens kan sien dat in 2019 daar 'n verkiesing is wat in Suid-Afrika gaan plaasvind. En ons kan nou al sien dat die hooftema vir daardie verkiesing grond gaan wees. Want daar is 'n kompetisie tussen die ANC aan die een kant, en die EFF aan die ander kant om te kyk aan wie hulle die meeste beloftes kan maak in terme van grond.

### English:

Let me put it quite frankly: If anybody in South Africa thinks that you take the land without compensation, you are living in a dream. [Interjections.] Let me put it quite frankly to you: If you want to start a civil war in South Africa, do that! [Interjections.] Do that!

And I told you before ... [Interjections.] ... I told you before, that ... don't misjudge ... [Interjections.]

### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

### TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

### Page: 82

### Afrikaans:

Die HUISVOORSITTER (Me M G Boroto): Agb Groenewald, asseblief ...

English:

What are you rising on, hon member?

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: I am rising on a point of order.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): In terms of which Rule, hon member?

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: The Rule that establishes point of order. You know what the Rule is. But the point of order is, he can't stand there and threaten civil war for a radical programme of land occupation. It's not parliamentary to threaten civil war. If you want civil war ... [Inaudible.]... don't threaten it here.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Thank you very much. I think, hon member ...

### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

### Page: 83

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: You must never threaten civil war. You know nothing about war

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon member, thank you! Your point has been made. Thank you. [Interjections.]

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: ... and you must never, ever threaten war in this Parliament. Please!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon member, your point has been made and I agree with you, but I will get advice and I will return. Thank you.

Hon member, it is unparliamentary to do that. Continue.

Dr P J GROENEWALD: Chairperson, I will continue. You must listen carefully to what I said. I said, if you are going to continue with this, that is going to happen in South Africa. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon Groenewald, I have already ruled on that. Can you continue? [Interjections.]

### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

### TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

### Page: 84

### Afrikaans:

Dr P J GROENEWALD: Ek wil ook vir die agb lid van die ANC sê ... wat u sê, dat al die grond deur oorlog gevat is ... gaan lees u geskiedenis. Daar was baie stamkapteine, selfs konings wat grond gegee het aan die Voortrekkers. Hulle het dit nie gevat nie. Hulle is gegee vir daardie mense in Suid-Afrika. [Tussenwerpsels.]

As u die ekonomie wil vernietig, dan moet u voortgaan met hierdie tipe ... [Tussenwerpsels.]

### English:

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon Groenewald, please take your seat for a while. Yes, hon member?

Mr H P CHAUKE: Chair, is the member willing to take a question?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon Groenewald, are you willing to take a question?

### Afrikaans:

Dr P J GROENEWALD: Voorsitter, ek het net drie minute. Ek het nie nog tyd om te mors op vrae nie!

### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

### Page: 85

Die HUISVOORSITTER (Me M G Boroto): Hy is nie bereid nie. Dankie, agb lid.

Dr P J GROENEWALD: Kom ek sê vir u so, agb Voorsitter. Die mislukking van grondhervorming is nie as gevolg van die beginsel van vrywillige koper en verkoper nie; die mislukking is as gevolg van onbevoegte amptenare, en as gevolg van korrupsie wat plaasvind met grondhervorming. Tans is daar meer as 20 000 plase op die opemark, waar die prys tot selfs 20% goedkoper is as gevolg van die droogte.

Daarom, om die beginsel van vrywille koper en verkoper te wil gebruik as 'n verskoning, sê ek vir u, mislei u uself. Kry skoon administrasie. Boere is bereid om te help. Hulle is ook gereed vir mentorskap. Hulle gee dit reeds. U maak nie gebruik van die welwillendheid van die boere nie, spesifiek as dit kom by landbougrond.

Ek maak klaar.

English:

### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

### TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

### Page: 86

I want to say to the hon members of the EFF: maybe you still have to learn what I have forgotten about war. Thank you. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Thank you. Hon Carter.

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: But, Chairperson ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon member, why are you on your feet?

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: I want to call a point of order on this warmonger. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon member, you are ...

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: He's again threatening war. He can't just steal our land and then he threatens war here.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon member, please don't continue, because you will also implicate yourself. I am going to follow up on what he said just now. Thank you.

### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

### Page: 87

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: Okay. We must not be taken for granted.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Thank you, hon member. I will get advice on these utterances that were made.

Ms D CARTER: Chairperson, as former Deputy Chief Justice, Moseneke, put it;

Our constitutional democracy was forged under unbelief division, past injustice and economic inequality but on the hope for reconciliation, nation building and cohesion. It contains our joint and minimum ideological and normative choices of what a good society should be. It enjoins the state, all its organs to take reasonable steps without undue delay to achieve that good society.

Our constitutional designers are empathetically transformative. It is meant to migrate us from a murky and brutish past to an inclusive future emanated by values of human decency and solidarity. It contains a binding consensus on us or a blueprint of what a fuly transformed society should like.

### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 88

The important issue of land was - according to Moseneke foremost at the time of the formation of our Constitution. The property clause is emphatic; that those dispossessed of property as a result of past racially discriminatory laws or practices are entitled to the restitution of that property or to equitable redress, that those whose tenure of land is legally insecure as a result of past racial discriminatory laws or practices are entitled to tenure, which is legally secure or to comparable redress, that property may be expropriated for a public purpose or in the public's interest which includes the nations' commitment to land reform and that state must take reasonable legislative and other measures within its available resources to foster conditions which enable citizens to gain access on land on an equitable basis.

The Constitution does not protect property ownership. It merely protects an owner against arbitrary deprivation. Deprivation that is not arbitrary is permissible. The property clause does not carry the phrase "willing buyer willing seller" which is often blamed for an inadequate resolution of the land question. The state's power to expropriate does not depend on the willingness of a land owner. The compensation may be agreed, but if not a court can fix it - and must fix it - the

### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

### Page: 89

compensation must be adjusted equitably and not necessarily the market value of the land. A market price is but one of the five criteria the Constitution list for a court to set fair compensation.

As Moseneke points out, the misrepresentation of the Constitution in this regard has two political functions; first is to deflect responsibility for the failure to achieve meaningful land reform after apartheid away from the ANC, and secondly, is to do so in a manner that present the constitutional order as an impermeable barrier to the realisation of popular aspirations which are both legitimate and urgent. It is this that is most worrying.

From a state capture project it is evident that there is a predatory elite intent on delegitimizing our constitutional order. When the land question is folded into active attempts to affirm and extend the reach of traditional authority, it is equally easy to argue that the demand for justice is being misused to shore up a shift towards undemocratic and unconstitutional modes. Thank you. [Time expired.]

### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

### Page: 90

Ms C DUDLEY: Madam Chair, the ACDP acknowledges the fact that distribution of land is closely linked to whether or not economic development actually addresses the scourge of poverty in a society and is acutely aware of the need and for importance of a successful land reform process in South Africa.

The limitation clause we are debating today in terms of speeding up land reform provides for all rights in the Bill of Rights to be limited in terms of law of general application. As these limitations however, must be reasonable and justifiable in an open and democratic society based on human dignity, equality and freedom it could well be part of the solution.

The ACDP notes former Deputy Chief Justice Moseneke's reference to the property clause as radical in both spirit, letter and his comment that government has so far failed to test the radical transformational reach of the idea of compensation for expropriation being based on the just and equitable principle and not exclusively on the basis of market value. The ACDP was encouraged by hon Cronin's caution that expropriation without restraint and compensation will be exploited. We just need to look across the Limpopo to see who the main victims are when this happens. The same black majority

### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 91

who have been oppressed in the past; black workers, the urban and the rural poor, the chronic food shortages and the sky rocketing food prices.

While the concept of revenge seems sweet to some, it will be a bittersweet pill if past injustices are not addressed in the manner that ensures growth and jobs. South Africa - we are told - needs growth of 6% of GDP, gross domestic product, a year plus increased investment and employment if want to significantly reduce poverty. Interventions that undermine property rights will only create instability and discourage investment, the very investment needed to create opportunities for employment and entrepreneurial activity to stimulate the economy.

The ACDP view is that fair compensation would demand that the market value is an important consideration but must be weighed against factors listed in the Constitution which would include the history of the property and the purpose for which it is required. In addition to retaining the safeguards in the Constitution for all who live in South Africa, the ACDP believes it would be wise to have the issue of compensation dealt with by a dedicated valuations court to assess and sign

### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

### Page: 92

off on all compensation linked to forced expropriation in line with the Constitution. Protection of property rights is essential to individual and collective prosperity and it is also essential for political freedom and we appeal to this House to ensure that they are not eroded.

Apartheid restrictions on African land and home ownership were among the most damaging aspects of past racial discrimination. Since these restrictions began to crumble in 1975 and were finally abolished in 1991, African ownership of houses, land, and other assets has finally been able to grow and has done so exponentially. We must ensure that growth is not undermined. Thank you.

Ms T MBABAMA: Chairperson, the black parties must unite on this issue. We cannot fight about nothing. A single law should be developed to address the issue of land restitution without compensation. The necessary constitutional amendments will then be undertaken to effect this process. Madam Speaker, and hon members, these words were spoken by none other than the President of the country - the not so honourable Jacob Zuma in his address to the council of the traditional leaders on the ... [Interjections.] of land ...

### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

### TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 93

Mr B A RADEBE: I am rising on Rule 84. The member has just referred to President Zuma as "dishonourable" I think that is desperation.

Mr H P CHAUKE: Point of order too. The point that I want to get clarity on, Madam Chair, did I hear it proper and correct that the member said that black parties must unite on the land issue? Did I hear it proper from the DA that black parties must unite on the land issue?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): That one I will not go to, let me respond to the point of order by the hon ...

Mr H P CHAUKE: Okay, I will wait for a while.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Okay, hon member, I will listen and come back to you. I will not ... [Interjections.]

Mr M L W FILTANE: Point of order, Chair!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon Mbambane.

Ms T MBABAMA: Mbabama!

### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

### TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 94

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Sorry, my sister for ... Mbabama. Okay, I will come back to you. Continue with your speech.

Mr M L W FILTANE: Comparative speech is not a denial of the honourability or otherwise of the President. She has just said "... not so honourable ..." still honourable. Thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon member, please, take your seat. We did not ask for your clarity. That is not a point of order. Continue, hon member.

Ms T MBABAMA: My first words were a quotation from a speech by President Zuma when he spoke to the council of traditional leaders on the slow pace of land reform. This was from a man who was supposed to be honouring the legacy of Nelson Mandela; for a prosperous, non-racial and non-sexist democracy that belongs to all South Africans.

This directly contradicts the stance that was taken by the ANC in Parliament. There is no doubt that the land reform under an ANC government has failed dismally due to reasons ranging from gross incompetence of officials, rampant corruption in

### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 95

determining monetary value, supporting copy paste business models and rent-a-crowd policies in land reform. The ANC as a governing party is divided on the way forward and rapidly losing votes. The President of the country believes in one course of action while his parliamentary caucus believes in another.

The ANC is deeply divided and President Zuma recognises this, is desperately trying the populist route of using ...

IsiXhosa:

Nks T MBABAMA:

... intlungu yabantu abangenamihlaba ukufumana iivoti ngokuthi athembise ngezinto azaziyo ukuba azisoze zenzeke.

[Kwaqhwatywa.]

# English:

The Democratic Alliance does not believe in expropriation without compensation and blaming the "willing seller willing buyer" to take the attention away from government failure is not the thing to do. What we - as the DA - believe in, is to immediately legalise land tenure in the former TBVC, Transkei, Bophuthatswana, Venda and Ciskei, states. All rural residence

### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 96

and farm dwellers to have security of tenure, government support to be tailor made to include the rural poor in the mainstream economy either through successful small holdings or through ownership of successful agribusinesses.

The land audit is to be fast tracked and completed to conduct land reform in such a manner that the property values of land that are redistributed to the poor do not lose their market value. Destroying the value of the land destroys the value of what is redistributed. The ANC may be abandoning its non-racial rules under President Zuma, but the Democratic Alliance is a home for all; irrespective of colour, creed and sexual orientation. We believe in freedom for people to make their own choices on their own land, fairness in the redistribution process and opportunities for all. Thank you. [Applause.]

Mr H P CHAUKE: Chair, with respect I stood earlier and I thought that you will make a ruling on the point that I have made that ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon member, that was a question of clarity that you were seeking. It was not a point of order.

### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

### TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 97

Mr H P CHAUKE: ... that black parties must unite.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Yes, that is how I heard it but I don't think it is a point of order, you can just find it out.

Mr H P CHAUKE: Okay, black parties must unite.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon member, thank you very much! It has nothing to do with us.

Mr M WATERS: Chairperson, may I address you. To help the hon Chauke, the fact of the matter is that the hon member was quoting the President. Actually they are quoting your President.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon member, please, I did not ask for clarities from you.

Dr C Q MADLOPHA: Hon Chair, all protocol observed, the Freedom Charter:

### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

### Page: 98

Our people have been robbed of their birth right to land, liberty and peace by government founded on injustice and inequality that our country will never be prosperous or free until all people live in brotherhood, enjoying equal rights and opportunities, that only a democratic state, based on the will of all the people, can secure to all their birth right without distinction of colour, race, sex or belief.

Firstly, section 25 calls for security of tenure, ownership, in cases where the colonial and apartheid legacy of the past has left millions of South African's, and women in areas of communal land tenure, for instance, with insecure property rights.

Secondly, section 25 empowers expropriation in the public interest. It defines public interest and including the nation's commitment to land reform and to reforms to bring about equitable access to all South Africa's natural resources; and it also adds property is not limited to land. I will confine my input to the matter of expropriation as it concerns the Constitution as well as the Expropriation Bill, which is currently being considered by the House of Traditional Leaders.

### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

### Page: 99

The first word of self-criticism, as the ruling party, we have failed to fully utilise the powers granted by the Constitution for purposes of land expropriation. We have allowed the alien and nonconstitutional language of willing seller, willing buyer to creep in and dominate the discourse of land reform.

This has resulted in major distortions in the market as government demands for land for restitution and redistribution artificially drives up prices so that sellers are effectively over compensated for land. The general framework for expropriation is outlined in section 25 of the Constitution, which provides that property may be expropriated only in terms of a law of general application, and that no law may permit arbitrary deprivation of property. The Constitution further determines that expropriation may only occur for a public purpose or in the public interest and subject to payment of compensation.

The review of the 1975 Expropriation Act became necessary to ensure consistency with the spirit and the provisions of the 1996 Constitution, in particular the equality clause, the property clause, with the need for just administrative action as well as, to extend the purpose for expropriation to include

### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

### Page: 100

public interest. Amongst the main changes in the Compensation in terms of 1975 Act is determined primarily on the basis of market value.

Section 25(3) of the Constitution, however, requires that just an equitable compensation be paid and that such compensation be determined by having regards to relevant circumstances, without placing undue weight on any single factor and I quote:

Relevant circumstances, include -(a)The current use of the property, the history of the acquisition and use of the property, the market value of the property, the extent of direct state investment and subsidy in the acquisition and beneficial capital improvement of the property, and the purpose of the expropriation.

The implications of these are very clear that the concept of 'willing-seller, willing-buyer' was never enshrined in the Constitution, nor in the policies of the ANC, and that market value is the only one amongst many factors to take into account when calculation just and equitable compensation. That is why the Constitutional Court held that the purpose of section 25 has to be seen both as protecting existing private, property

### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 101

rights as well as serving the public interest, mainly in the sphere of land reform, but not limited thereto and also as striking a proportionate balance between these two functions. In recognising property as a social construct, the Constitutional Court has held that individual property rights are not absolute, but subject to societal considerations.

The Expropriation Bill does not interfere with the powers of existing expropriating authorities. Rather it ensures that procedures for all expropriations are uniform, consistent with the Constitution and fair to all parties. Thus the Minister of Rural Development and Land Reform already has the power to expropriate property emanating from the Restitution of Land Rights Act, Act 22 of 1994; the Provision of Land and Assistance Act, Act 126 of 1993; and the Extension of Security of Tenure Act, Act 62 of 1997.

The important contribution that the Expropriation Bill will make in governments land reform programme is to provide certainty and guidance to all parties on the process of expropriation. That includes the organs of state, land reform beneficiaries, property owners and financial institutions. Thus, the bill facilitates a clear and streamlined process

### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

### Page: 102

which is fair and provides protection to all parties in line with the Constitution.

Having said this, and as the Constitution states: "the will of the majority must prevail." We are also very clear that the land that was acquired through illegal means and is being used for illegal purposes will be expropriated without compensation. It is also important that we need to be sensitive and responsible when we are dealing with these matters as, as this is part of addressing the injustices of the past. I thank you, Madam Chair. [Applause.].

Mr S M JAFTA: Hon Speaker, in debating this motion, there are pressing and critical questions which underlie the scheme of land reform in our post-apartheid constitutional settlement and arrangement. Let us then critically slaughter a few sheep. Has the current government been able to dismantle the spatial patterns of apartheid? Has land development achieved rural and urban justice and equity? Have we achieved land restitution within the pretext of land reform? Have we aggressively empowered women and their immediate families against illegal evictions? In other words, have we secured land tenure of our people against illegal deprivation and eviction of property?

### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

### Page: 103

In his Steve Biko's 13 Memorial Lecture in 2012, Ben Okri confronts us to address the most pregnant and philosophical questions facing humanity. With hindsight, the land reform debate is but one such question. Hon Chair, the process of reconfiguring the scheme of land rights in South Africa has succeeded in legislation. In implementation, however, it has stalled. The government has introduced a number of unhelpful legislations.

Hon Speaker, under the currency of these laws, rural hunger has amplified, illegal evictions in commercial farms have skyrocketed, shack settlements and shanty towns have increased; the spatial planning introduced by apartheid has not been dismantled. The land restitution measures have not inculcated subsistence food producing and farming and have not addressed rural and urban injustice.

This motion, hon Chair, envisages that, by using section 36 of the Constitution the limitation Clause, the land reform project can be achieved. This approach is problematic. We cannot problematise the question of land reform. Our long-standing view on this matter is that land reform is possible outside the framework of the limitation clause. It is even surprising that

### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 104

this route is proposed when it's very provisions are clear that, in liming the rights in the Bill of Rights, there should be evidence that there existed no less restrictive means to achieving the intended purpose. Our take is different therefore ... [Time expired.]

### Afrikaans:

Mnr T C R WALTERS: Agb Voorsitter, voordat ek begin wil ek net noem dat ek hoop geen party probeer deur populistiese oorlogspraatjies stemme wen in hierdie Huis nie. Dit is goedkoop en onverantwoordelik.

### English:

The Democratic Alliance welcomes this debate because it allows us to highlight the true reasons why the ANC government has failed at delivering land reform.

It is a moot point that land reform in South Africa has not succeeded. The department's own past figures have shown that anything from 73% to 90% of government-run land reform projects have failed. Billions of rands have been spent in propping up failing projects, with no reliable measurements in place to tell us whether this expenditure is in fact succeeding.

### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 105

It is also a moot point, as underlined by the Constitutional Court, that this ANC government reopened land claims without any intention of budgeting for this. Not even outstanding claims, dating from before the reopening of land claims, were properly budgeted for.

The ANC's recent fanfare around speeding up land reform is also not borne out by the budget that was just approved, with less than 2% of the government's expenditure in the Medium Term Expenditure Framework being spent on Land Reform.

Millions of hectares of communal and state-owned land lie fallow and are dead assets to the desperately poor households, already living on it and engaging in agriculture.

Of course, no discussion of ANC government failures is nowadays complete without referring to the ANC's key policy objective corruption. We see from forensic audits springing up and complaints being made that state capture has its tentacles firmly in place in tenders and strategic partnerships around land reform, begging the question: "Who are the true beneficiaries of land reform?"

### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

### TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

### Page: 106

It needs to be stated unequivocally that Land Reform went wrong not because anyone was out to sabotage or derail, or because of the willing-buyer, willing-seller principle or because of some third force, but because of government failure, plain and simple.

There exists enormous societal goodwill to assist government. It is not beneficiaries that are at fault but rather poor government support and the fact that government refuses to transfer land to beneficiaries. By refusing to give beneficiaries title deed, a cap is placed on the financing that could be raised to increase production. A ceiling on wealth creation for the poor is put in place.

And no, it is not like the Minister said the other day; the DA does not own the banks. In fact, any study of banking executives will show significant ANC sympathy there. Where is Maria Ramos nowadays?

There is not a single agricultural union that does not support land reform, but yet government keeps blaming commercial farmers, often in racial terms, for its failure.

### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

### TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 107

The DA has repeatedly challenged the ANC government to emulate its successes in transferring title deeds to the poor and driving successful share equity schemes. We will support successful land reform and show it in deeds.

In terms of this motion, it is necessary to briefly deal with the truism that the willing-seller, willing-buyer principle is the reason for all of the above-mentioned failures.

It not this principle that reduces the supposed beneficiaries of Land Reform projects to unpaid workers without property rights on taxpayer-subsidised state farms that are milked dry by cronies of the ANC.

It is not this principle that leaves the rural poor in former homelands without title deed on the land they have farmed for generations. The rural poor are deliberately kept in poverty to lock them into voting for the ANC.

It is not this principle that delays the purchase of land from existing budgets at reasonable prices, but rather endless delays in the process, driving up the costs and therefore, the price of sellers.

### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

### Page: 108

It is not this principle that limits a transforming agricultural sector's stability. It is not this principle that fails to provide much needed jobs in a sector currently shedding jobs.

It is not this principle that allowed extension services to decay. It is not this principle that allowed the Agricultural Research Council to decline. It is not this principle that prevents suitable financing for emerging farmers.

It is not this principle that limits investment opportunities. It is not this principle that mismanaged drought relief. It is not this principle that runs agricultural colleges into the ground. It is not this principle that fails to take workable proposals from organised agriculture, Communal Property Associations and land reform beneficiaries on board.

Attacking the willing-buyer, willing-seller principle, when the Constitution clearly provides a framework when it gets abused, is nothing but a Houdini act, to escape a looming appointment with voters who increasingly know the truth.

# NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

## TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 109

The Democratic Alliance has shown that a cohesive policy, based on our Constitution and guided by our principles of freedom, fairness and opportunity, can make land reform a success. The real problems in Land Reform are really addressed there.

Land reform can be a much needed opportunity to reverse the decline of a farming sector, injecting new ideas, people and investment into a key job-creating sector. It has shown that a success rate of between 60% and 80%, even without national government largesse, is possible. Imagine what we could do if we controlled all levels of government.

The DA believes in rapid expansion of property rights to the poor, to give all South Africans a stake in the economy. We believe in leveraging the goodwill of society in voluntary partnerships, to destroy poverty and create jobs. We believe in our progressive Constitution that guarantees just land reform for all South Africans. We are the only party that truly believes in property for the poor. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC WORKS: Thank you Chairperson, hon members and fellow colleagues. The land question in South Africa is a deeply emotive issue, and rightly so. It's

# NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

## Page: 110

something that clearly the hon Groenewald doesn't understand. I'm sorry that he's absent from the House. I think it's something that particularly white South Africans, whether they are right-wingers or red like me, need to appreciate and understand.

The history of colonial and apartheid genocidal dispossession wasn't just theft. It was genocidal dispossession of land, livestock, crops, livelihoods and the enslavement of the Khoi and San people – those that survived the genocide. All of this has left a deep and lasting scar on our society. It underpins the continued racialised crisis of poverty, inequality, unemployment and social distress that a great majority of our people feel.

It's not just about land, as the hon Mncwabe and the hon Mbatha have said. It's also about restoring dignity, a sense of identity ... the basic rights of citizenship ... belonging to the place in which you live.

However, what is the land question in 2017 and how do we address it? Two weeks ago the KwaZulu-Natal land claims commission office complained that of the 110 claims settled

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

## TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

## Page: 111

last year, over 60% were settled in cash and not in land compensation. KwaZulu-Natal's land restitution support chief director, Adv Bheki Mbili, said it was:

a general problem across the country. ... Many of the claimants already have small pieces of land and some don't even live in those areas where their forefathers were removed from. Some say to us that they don't want ... the risk involved if they ask us to buy them these huge pieces of land that will go out of production.

Adv Mbili went on to say that:

The problem with this is that if you look at the outcome of the first phase of the land audit, the amount of land that it is private land, particularly that is owned by white people in this country is still in the region of between 70% and 80%. We can only change the land ownership pattern if people opt for restoration. If they opt for financial compensation, the pattern stays the same. If you take the money you don't dent the problem that currently exists.

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

## Page: 112

An HON MEMBER: What do they want?

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC WORKS: Clearly there is a disjuncture between what the public official regards as the problem and what the people, namely the claimants, regard as their problem and therefore their solution.

In the 1950s when the East German government expressed disappointment at the conduct of the people, the Bertolt Brecht ironically suggested that if the government was unhappy with the people it should dissolve the people and elect another. Now I'm not suggesting that Mbili should dissolve the people and elect another.

However, I've even heard some colleagues suggest that we should amend the land restitution legislation to compel claimants to take land and not cash. Now, we need to think what it is that we are trying to do collectively as South Africans; not just as the ANC, but as South Africans in general. Obviously, land restitution is only one dimension of what needs to be a broader land reform programme. Yet, what the majority of land restitution claimants are telling us is that for many; probably for the majority of them in fact, it's not a question of a

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

## Page: 113

simple return; of a straightforward restoration; of a going backwards to pre-1913 ... pre-whatever.

To build a nonracial, egalitarian and inclusive society, as the ANC but also as a country, we have to go forward, and I would say radically forward. Therefore, where I strongly agree with the NFP in introducing this topic for debate is that a marketdriven solution, which is to say the willing-seller, willingbuyer approach to the land question and to many other questions, will simply not work. The market is not what the followers of Adam Smith would have us believe. It's not a zone of perfect freedom in which buyers and sellers interact on equal terms, trading to their mutual benefit and for the good of all. There are huge inequalities in the market, especially in a society like South Africa.

If we attempt to introduce serious land reform and land transformation in our country, a market-driven, or if you like a willing-seller, willing-buyer approach, is likely to result either in little progress or in large-scale failure. Why? First of all, a willing-seller, willing-buyer approach is likely to result in a patchwork of farms acquired for land reform, depending on what comes up on the market for purchase.

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

## Page: 114

However, land reform for agriculture requires effective, planned and consolidated interventions to enable new farmers or existing small farmers to have a chance of success. This means state-led upstream and downstream market support. It means appropriate irrigation, water rights, fencing, agricultural extension offices, veterinary and crop services, and logistics infrastructure. A piecemeal approach simply makes these critical interventions impossible to consolidate and therefore to afford.

Of course, the market might deliver a more consolidated batch of willing sellers under circumstances, and this was what was rather cynically suggested by the FF Plus earlier this year, and again hinted at today by the hon Groenewald, when they said that the drought - they said this in February - was a good time to scale up the willing-seller, willing-buyer land reform programme, ie what they were saying was that government, at public expense, would bale out drought-stricken white farmers and settle new farmers on parched land. Frankly, that's the height of cynicism.

Successful land reform programmes like that in South Korea, which was the foundation of its subsequent remarkable

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

## Page: 115

industrialisation, are about scale and about unleashing productivity, and also as many have said, the determination and clarity of what you are trying to achieve.

In South Africa, with some 64% of our people urbanised and with ongoing urbanisation accelerating very rapidly, the land question is significantly, perhaps even primarily, an urban issue. Yet, we know that the property market in our urban centres ... just in rural areas creates huge barriers to entry and to inclusion for the majority. These barriers are just as severe as the apartheid-era group areas, forced removals and pass laws.

This is the general context in which we need to approach the subject of today's debate. Is our 1996 Constitution and specifically, as is implied in the topic for debate, is clause 25, the property clause, an impediment to achieving effective, meaningful, sustainable land reform, both rural and urban? Can the blockage, again as is implied in the topic for debate, in clause 25 be overcome by invoking clause 36, the so-called limitation clause?

# NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

## Page: 116

Well, let me first of all appreciate the intention behind the hon member from the NFP who has introduced this topic because what he's trying to do is to say, how can we advance land reform, which we need to do, but within the bounds of the Constitution?

However, well intentioned as the topic is, it's misguided and it's barking up the wrong tree. There is absolutely no reason to sneak around clause 25 and invoke clause 36. In the first place, as many other speakers have already said, there is absolutely no willing-seller, willing-buyer requirement in the property clause in section 25. In fact, you won't find a single reference to willing-seller, willing-buyer throughout the entire Constitution.

What is to be found in the property clause is the requirement that in the case of expropriation, just and equitable compensation must be paid. However, the property clause is very clear. Compensation is not based simply on market value. The hon Carter said this correctly. The hon Madlopha also explained this nicely. The property clause allows for expropriation in the public interest which it explicitly defines as: "the nation's commitment to land reform", and not just to land

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

## Page: 117

reform, "and reforms to bring about equitable access to all South Africa's natural resources." That's very far reaching; very radical.

What is more, clause 25 has its own limitation clause even before we get to clause 36. Clause 25(8) reads: "No provision of this section", the rest of the property clause, "may impede the state from taking legislative and other measures to achieve land, water and related reform, in order to redress the results of past racial discrimination."

In other words, the compensation provision in the property clause cannot be used to impede land reform; genuine and wellintentioned land reform. Therefore, I would argue that compensation could in circumstances be merely a token. It needs to be paid but it could be a token. So I don't think that compensation is the real hurdle to effective land reform. We have already noted that hundreds of millions of rand is being spent in the land restitution programme for instance, to pay cash to claimants and not to purchase land.

It should also be noted that in the past the state has simply been taken for a ride. We have heard a lot about the good will

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

## TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 118

of those facing claims and so forth but there's lots of bad will as well. The terrible and notorious case is of course the MalaMala Game Reserve which cost, as another speaker mentioned, R1 billion for restitution.

In 2014 this Parliament passed the Property Valuation Act which, amongst other things, established a state valuergeneral. Instead of relying on the private sector to value property and to be taken for a ride as has been happening in the past, the Department of Rural Development and Land Reform now has its own state valuer-general. According to Minister Gugile Nkwinti, that office has already saved the public purse R84 million on what would otherwise have been paid out for farms.

What is more, the courts are ahead of many politicians sitting here in Parliament. In July last year, the Land Claims Court heard a case in a land claims issue brought by a Mr Philemon Msiza whose father had been a tenant farmer. When the dispute over payment finally reached the Land Claims Court last year, the farm owner's expert valuer from the private sector, the well-meaning, well-intentioned private sector, said the market value of the portion of land claimed was R4,4 million. The

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

## Page: 119

state valuer-general said no, its R1,8 million. Very interestingly, the Land Claims Court brought the figure down even further to R1,5 million. The wording of its ruling is very noteworthy. It argued that a just and equitable price is not the same thing as a market price. Moreover, in its ruling it argued that in assessing price in cases of land reform, market value must not be given more weight than other factors listed in section 25 of the Constitution. Again, as other speakers have alluded to, these other factors include the history of the acquisition of the property, its current use and the purpose for which it is now being intended.

Interestingly, but not surprisingly, during the portfolio committee hearings on the Expropriation Bill, the DA and the FF Plus argued exactly contrary to what the court has now said. They argued that, yes okay, market value is one of the criteria but it needs to be the most important criteria. Why should we be surprised that that was their argument?

What about the EFF? Now, first of all let me appreciate the reasonable, as always, tone that hon Mbatha adopted. I think that helps, unlike the hon Groenewald who really is not helping the issue at all by coming out in the way that he did. But you

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

## Page: 120

know the EFF's position on this matter is actually a remarkable achievement. Let me say that. It's a remarkable achievement. It manages to be both consistent and at the same time incoherent. It says it wants to give the ANC its parliamentary votes so that we can change the Constitution to allow for expropriation without compensation; yet, while they are saying it they are giving their votes to the DA in metros - the very DA that wants compensation to be determined largely on the basis of market value. Go figure! On the other hand the EFF ... [Interjections.]

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: On a point of order Deputy Speaker: I think Jeremy I comparing apples and bananas.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, that's a political issue. It's not a point of order.

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: Yes, but he's comparing two things. We are saying six ... [Inaudible.] ... and we are fighting against ... [Inaudible.] ... against the ANC.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, it's not a point of order. Hon member, it's not a point of order. I'm switching off this.

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

## Page: 121

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: Don't confuse things. You must focus chief.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, don't do that.

Mr B A RADEBE: On a point of order Deputy Speaker: The Chief Whip of the EFF called Comrade Jeremy on first name terms, as Jeremy. It's not in compliance with Rule 82. He must correct that please.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Shivambu, what I do want to address you on is, please listen to the presiding officers when they ask you to obey the rules. You don't. You speak even when advised that your point is not a point of order. Then you name and you speak to the speaker here as if you are talking outside the House. It's not okay. It's incorrect and you persist in doing that. Proceed hon member.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC WORKS: Thank you Deputy Speaker. Ms H O HLOPHE: Order Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: What are you rising on hon member?

# NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

## TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 122

Ms H O HLOPHE: A point of order: I just want to remind hon Jeremy that in Kannaland they voted with the DA as well. Don't have a short-sighted memory.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Hlophe, can you withdraw that? Call the speaker mr or hon.

Ms H O HLOPHE: I said hon. You don't listen Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, you are out of order. Take your ...

Ms H O HLOPHE: I said hon. I said hon Jeremy Cronin, the former deputy secretary of the SA Communist Party. In Kannaland the ANC voted with the DA. So, I'm reminding him of the fact.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Oh, okay. Hon member, take your seat. Go ahead hon member.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC WORKS: I'm glad that at least I woke up the EFF. They were fast asleep. So on the one hand they offer us votes but they vote with the DA but on the other hand the EFF says that the present government ...

# NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

## TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 123

Ms H O HLOPHE: Hon Deputy Speaker, order. I think he must withdraw that because it's unparliamentary. We are not sleeping here. It's only ANC members who are sleeping in Parliament, not us.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Hlophe, take your seat.

Ms H O HLOPHE: No, he must withdraw.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Take your seat. Proceed hon member.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC WORKS: On the other hand, the EFF says that the present government is kleptocratic but it wants to change the Constitution so that the same government can expropriate without compensation. Go figure!

We don't need to change the Constitution but we do need to expedite the long-delayed Expropriation Bill which the President has sent back, but strictly on procedural grounds.

Above all, we need to drive a sustainable rural and urban land reform programme that cannot be about hitting mechanical quota

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 124

targets for their own sake. A radical land reform programme must be about productive lives, about sustainable livelihoods, about food security for all, about not just a new class of commercial farmers but also about sustainable livelihoods and sustainable communities for those living in communal land tenure dispensations.

It must be about mixed use, mixed income human settlements on well-located land and, yes indeed, it must be about the release of well-located state land for human settlement occupation, including Department of Public Works' land.

The Constitution is not an impediment to these objectives. In fact, it is a clarion call to achieve these goals. [Applause.]

Mr S C MNCWABE: Chairperson, hon members thank you for participating in this debate. While, we acknowledge that we might differ on how to approach the Constitution on this matter, but we are happy that all of us, we are saying the land issue must be addressed. It is long overdue. Our people have been waiting for so long. We really appreciate that.

# NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

## Page: 125

Hon Deputy Minister Dlamini, I agree with you that the land problem started when colonisers arrived in our country.

## IsiZulu:

Izimpi eziningi zaziliwa ngamakhosi akithi namaqhawe akithi, babengalweli ilungelo lokuvota noma ilungelo lokuya ePhalamende. Babelwela ilungelo lokuvikela umhlaba wabo umhlaba wobab'omkhulu. Ungabe ukhuluma ngeqhawe uBhambatha kaMancinza noma inkosi uLangalibalele Hadebe wesizwe samaHlubi noma ukhuluma ngo-King Hintsa ka kaKhawuta wesizwe samaXhosa, noma inkosi uSandile wesizwe samaXhosa, noma ukhuluma ngempi yaseSandlwana konke kwakusegameni lokubuyisa umhlaba wesizwe sakithi nobukhosi.

# English:

But I am very disturbed with you, hon Groenewald. You must be born again. You must be born again, if we want our land; we want our land - full stop! [Applause.] You cannot come here and say we are inviting the civil war. Our forefathers died for this land. [Interjections.] If you speak of the civil war, we are not scared. We are ready because that is what are our forefathers died for. [Applause.] We must remind you, hon members, that for us going up and down in the corridors of

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

## Page: 126

power, but have not addressed the land issue the blood and bones of our forefathers are still crying. [Interjections.]

IsiZulu:

Igazi lobab'omkhulu lisakhala ukuthi siyobabuyisela nini into abayifela.

English:

The land issue cost them their lives. So, hon Groenewald don't even go there, because we are ready for that. We will follow our ancestors in addressing the issue of land.

IsiZulu:

Ungazosisabisa ngento enayintshontsha. Ngempela ngempela akufanelanga ngabe sikhuluma ngokuthi kufanele kukhokhwe.

# English:

I agree with you, hon Mbatha. Sometimes ...

IsiZulu:

... indaba yokwemali nemali ekubeni into yakithi yantshontshwa ngesibhamu kufuneka sikubeke eceleni. Uma befuna isibhamu ...

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 127

English:

... we are ready. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Hon remembers, order!

Mr H P CHAUKE: Chair, Chair ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: yes, hon member.

Mr H P CHAUKE: The member forgot to speak about the Ngungunyana kamanokuza in Soshangane.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, no, Chauke. You can continue that outside.

# DEBATE ON AFRICA DAY: BUILDING A BETTER AFRICA AND A BETTER WORLD

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF INTERNATIONAL RELATIONS AND CO-OPERATION (Mr L T Landers): Hon Deputy Speaker, hon members, this debate takes place after the successful celebrations of Africa Month in May 2017. Pan-Africanism will serve as the foundation for

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

## Page: 128

today's debate, during which we will demonstrate our commitment to its ideals and values.

Allow me to begin by paying homage to the Namibian struggle icon and anti-apartheid activist, Herman Andimba Toivo ya Toivo, who passed away at the age of 93 in Windhoek, on Friday, 9 June 2017. Cde Toivo ya Toivo joins his fellow Pan-Africanist peers and our founding fathers in that better place.

Herman Toivo ya Toivo, who served 16 years on Robben Island in the same section as Nelson Mandela, was a co-founder of the South West Africa People's Organisation, Swapo. He was a Pan-Africanist of note and will be remembered for his tireless struggle towards Africa's and Namibia's struggle for emancipation. He is credited with fostering unity during the difficult times in our continent's history. We use this occasion to express our deepest condolences to his family, to Swapo, and to the people and government of Namibia. The accolade, "giant of the struggle", does not even begin to describe Cde Toivo ya Toivo. Hamba kahle [go well], Cde Toivo.

The genesis of our Pan-Africanist ideology and movement was in response to colonisation of the African continent and our

# NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 129

resolve to work towards a shared future as Africans. Prof Adekeye Adebajo, Director of the Institute for Pan-African Thought and Conversation at the University of Johannesburg, describes Pan-Africanism thus: "Pan-Africanism can be defined as the efforts to promote the political, socioeconomic and cultural unity and self-reliance of Africa and its diaspora."

Pan-Africanism is a worldwide, intellectual movement that aims to encourage and strengthen bonds of solidarity between all people of African descent. It extends beyond continental Africans, with a substantial support base amongst the African diaspora in the Caribbean, Central and Latin America and the United States.

It is based on the belief that unity is vital to economic, social and political progress, and aims to unify and uplift people of African descent. It asserts that the fate of all African people and countries are intertwined. At its core, Pan-Africanism is a belief that African peoples, both on this continent and in the diaspora, share not merely a common history but a common destiny.

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

## Page: 130

This vision of African unity found expression in the writings and pronouncements of African descendants across the globe, like Sylvester Williams, W E B du Bois, Marcus Garvey, Sol Plaatje and Pixley ka Isaka Seme, to name but a few. Our founding fathers, such as Julius Nyerere, Kwame Nkrumah and O R Tambo, amongst others, built on this ideological platform and developed concrete programmes to implement Pan-Africanism, both in the struggle against colonialism and apartheid and in our post-colonial and apartheid eras.

We have subscribed to this ideology and its values from the onset of our struggle for liberation from colonialism and apartheid. The founding fathers of our liberation movement, the ANC, were, from the outset, Pan-Africanist in their intellectual, revolutionary and ideological outlook, as well as in their political activism. The establishment of the ANC in 1912 was, in fact, a Pan-Africanist liberation response to colonialism and apartheid in Africa, in general, and South Africa, in particular. Our Pan-Africanist outlook as a country is therefore a post-democratic vision grounded in our historical struggle against colonialism, imperialism and apartheid.

# NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

## Page: 131

And so, we say today, we are Africans. We share a common history and destiny with our brothers and sisters on the continent and in the diaspora. We will continue to contribute towards the rebirth of our continent and the ushering in of a new era - an era where Africa will be free from the bondage of colonialism and apartheid. I am reminded of the famous words of Pixley ka Isaka Seme, in 1909, when he articulated the kind of Africa we aspired to when he said: "The regeneration of Africa means that a new and unique civilisation is soon to be added to the world."

Leaders, such as Félix Houphouët-Boigny of Côte d'Ivoire; Nnamdi Azikiwe of Nigeria; Jomo Kenyatta of Kenya; Julius Nyerere of Tanzania; Kwame Nkrumah of Ghana; Ahmed Ben Bella of Algeria; Patrice Lumumba of the Congo, Ahmed Sékou Touré of Guinea; Gen Nasser of Egypt; Amílcar Cabral of Guinea-Bissau; Thomas Sankara of Burkina Faso; and Modibo Keïta of Mali, amongst others, all embodied the idea of Pan-Africanism as a necessary political and ideological response to addressing the legacy of colonialism and the fight against apartheid.

It is important to observe that this year, 2017, our fellow Ghanaian patriots celebrate 60 years of freedom. Ghana's

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

## Page: 132

independence served as a thrust for the independence of many other African states, and for that, we remain forever grateful to their leadership, particularly Dr Nkrumah, who once said:

If we are to remain free, if we are to enjoy the full benefits of Africa's rich resources, we must unite to plan for our total defence and the full exploitation of our material and human means, in the full interests of all our peoples. To go it alone will limit our horizons, curtail our expectations, and threaten our liberty.

We have acknowledged the role fellow Africans and the global anticolonial movements have played in our struggle. It is, however, important to emphasise that our own destiny and future can never be divorced from that of the continent. Our own icon, the late President Nelson Mandela, through an article in *Foreign Affairs* magazine in 1993, reminded the world that South Africa cannot escape its African destiny, and emphasised our role in the pursuit of African unity. In the final analysis, it must be deduced that we are not Africans by mere geographical location, we are Africans by birth.

# NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

## Page: 133

Hon members, democratic South Africa has taken its rightful place on the continent and contributed immensely towards Africa's peace and prosperity. We have been honoured with various leadership roles in Africa. African leaders have entrusted us with leading the continent on many international fora. Certainly, this will continue as we work within the collective of the African leadership, going forward.

You will recall that in the year 2002, we hosted the landmark summit which culminated in the Organisation of African Unity becoming the present-day African Union, AU. We were guided by the shared vision of a united, prosperous and strong Africa that Nkrumah, Luthuli, Tambo and Mandela envisioned. Most importantly, in the city of Durban, the AU was entrusted with the mandate to take the political and economic integration agenda of the continent forward. For our part, this ushered in an era that sought to bolster efforts to reverse the legacy of colonialism which Chief Albert Luthuli referred to during the 1960s when he said: "Our continent has been carved up by great powers ... human skills and energy have been harnessed for the advantage of our conquerors."

# NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

## Page: 134

It is against this background that we availed Dr Nkosazana Dlamini-Zuma for the position of AU Commission Chair. She made us proud by, amongst other things, leading the adoption of a revised, shared vision of the Africa We Want in the form of Agenda 2063. Most notably, Dr Dlamini-Zuma played a leading role in women empowerment on the continent and, as such, made gender equality central to the pursuit of Pan-Africanism and in fostering unity of purpose. [Interjections.] We use this opportunity to congratulate her on the successful completion of her tour of duty. [Applause.]

I also want to use this opportunity to add to the congratulations already extended to Ethiopia's Minister of Foreign Affairs and former Minister of Health, His Excellency Dr Tedros Adhanom Ghebreyesus, on his election as the new Director-General of the World Health Organisation, WHO. Dr Ghebreyess brings his rich experience to this position, having also served as Chairperson of the Board of the Global Fund to Fight Aids, Tuberculosis and Malaria, amongst others. We celebrate his election and we will support him in all his efforts.

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

## Page: 135

On this matter, I want to quote from a column in the African Independent, written by Victor Kgomoeswana:

Let Dr Ghebreyesus use his five-year term at the WHO to force multinational corporations to make the cure for HIV/Aids and other killer diseases affordable, among others, as his reputation suggests he just might.

So, I repeat. We celebrate his election and we will support him in all his efforts.

On 2 June 2017, President Zuma formally launched Youth Month under the theme, The Year of O R Tambo: Advancing Youth Economic Empowerment. This will enable us to have focused debates on how best we can accelerate youth empowerment. We are therefore encouraged by the African Heads of State and Government's decision to declare 2017 as the year of Harnessing the Demographic Dividend through Investments in Youth.

In moving forward, South Africa should work hard on the improvement of cultural exchanges and promotion of cultural diplomacy. We also need to be proactive and remind our citizens of the role the continent played in pursuit of the freedoms we

#### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

## Page: 136

enjoy today, and that, informed by the foundations laid by our forbears, the ideals and values of Pan-Africanism shall propel us to realise the aspirations of Agenda 2063. I thank you.

Mr D BERGMAN: I must say, I am very surprised at the Deputy Minister's choice in presidential candidate.

"We mustn't ask what can be done for Africa but rather what can we do with Africa." This was an important quote from Bill Clinton. Often Africa is looked upon as the welfare state. Funds and aid are made available as a sign of charity and guilt, sent in to projects that never see this of day.

It is a sad story that our continent is the wealthiest in resources but we remain the poorest. Africa Day should seek to turn talk into action. Instead of having dialogue and planning sessions at Southern African Development Community, SADCO, African Union, AU, and the Africa, Caribbean and Pacific Group of States, ACP, we should be creating resolutions that will transform Africa today and not tomorrow.

When it comes to transformation, Africa is her own worst enemy. In the new African Renaissance we should be promoting

# NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

## Page: 137

intraregional trade. It cannot be acceptable today that a shipa-container from China to Kenya costs around \$600 but to move that container anywhere in Africa will cost at least \$1 600. We should follow the lead of Kenya and the Eastern Corridor when it comes to infrastructure planning.

We should not have a narrow-minded focus but rather seek ways in which to ensure that our infrastructure is adaptable to neighbouring infrastructure, so that we can grow our bilateral trade with our neighbours and regions in competitive and productive environments. This could happen today.

The second problem we experience in Africa is the fact that our natural resources end up being exported as raw material. Think of the jobs and growth in economy our country and continent would experience if we industrialised. Instead of exporting raw and keeping our GDP growth at a certain percentage, we could send a manufactured product increasing our GDP by more percentages!

In international forums that I have had the opportunity to seating, we speak about growing entrepreneurs and jobs but we have the solution and tools right here, in our own back yard

# NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

## Page: 138

today. All it takes is for government to invest in themselves and work with business to take that bold step from the mindset of mining to the mindset of manufacturing.

When a problem is continental, it is important that we make sure that we are building relationships with the region. Having had the opportunity of sitting as a delegate in many of the regional forums, when it comes to regional posturing, South-Africa is always seen and treated as the arrogant stepsister. We are no longer seen as the bench mark.

Countries such as Egypt, Nigeria, Seychelles and Mauritius continue to grow at high growth rates. We continue to sink to humiliating ranks. It is sad to watch our delegates try to represent us in amidst this decline because our approach stays the same but our efficacy on these unions has long dwindled.

The hope and ray of light Madiba brought to the African stage continued under the diplomatic and academic President Mbeki but has now become a fading candle. We need to regroup and rethink our approach. We can lead and we can represent Africa, and move them from underdog to top dog, but we need to appreciate that sometimes it's better to listen with our ears and not our

# NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

## TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

## Page: 139

mouths. We can learn this helpful lesson today and not tomorrow.

South-Africa sits chasing commonwealth games and others that they cannot afford but imagine if we could host a continental game based on indigenous games unique to our continent? Imagine we can host countries of our region to sport and networking opportunities that bring down fences and pretences.

We can build true diplomacy in the wake of an ever changing landscape: Where today's dictators become tomorrow's legends; past democratic presidents are banished to academic halls by the greedy and the shameless; and political opposition threatened and jailed on trumped-up charges.

That does not have to be Africa! Africa could be a truly unique experience, different to anywhere else in the world: Where Africans find harmony first and foremost with each other; then in neighbour's home; and within each other's region. Sport can achieve the impossible and can bridge the divide.

A continental competition funded by unspent funds in the African Renaissance and International Co-operation Fund, ARF,

#### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

## TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 140

can be done today and not tomorrow. Africa tends to flirt with countries that boldly flash money but then discreetly hand over the invoice and terms. Historically this trend was focused on the west but over the last decade or so it has moved happily and carelessly to the east.

Our approach should rather be proud and promote our African identity and not be sold to any exploitative bidders anymore! We should promote Africa for Africans and become a venue of direct foreign investment rather than costly loans that auction our identity to these bidders. This can happen with a focus on ending open government corruption, exploitation of the poor and disenfranchisement. This could happen today and not tomorrow.

The time has come for Africa to rise. Let's not dream of an Africa tomorrow; let's create an equal Africa today.

For as the famous poet says:

I owe my being to the hills and the valleys, the mountains and the glades, the rivers, the deserts, the trees, the flowers, the seas and the ever-changing seasons that define the face of our native land - I am an African.

# NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

## TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 141

[Applause.]

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: Deputy Speaker, on 25 May 1963 the progressive pan-Africanists met in Addis Ababa, in the congress that culminated in the formation of the Organisation of African Unity. These were leaders like Haile Selassie, Sékou Touré, Julius Nyerere and Kwame Nkrumah. They said that we must unite the continent; we must have African solidarity. We must coordinate and intensify intra-African economic, political and trade co-operation.

Part of their objectives was to emphasise that we must defend the sovereignty and territorial integrity of the African continent. However, they also said that we must eradicate all forms of colonialism that had come to define the African continent for many centuries since the 19th century.

It was only 28 years later, where a practical elaborate programme was adopted in Abuja, in 1991 where the African Economic Community was established in what came to be known as the Abuja Treaty. The Abuja Treaty was adopted by the assembly of heads of states and government - 51 of them. It set the clearest programme of action on what was to be done towards

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

## TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

## Page: 142

achieving the original aims and objectives of the Organisation of African Unity.

It said that we should establish organs of the African Economic Community which include the Council of Ministers, the Pan African Parliament, the African Court on Human and People's Rights, the Economic and Social Commission that should coordinate all work that is needed to be done here in the particular continent.

Most of those entities have not been given full expression in the manner in which they have been dealt with. We must perhaps deal with the reasons as to why is South Africa lagging behind. The African continent is lagging behind in terms of these issues.

The Deputy Minister of International Relations came here to sing praises for Nkosazana Dlamini-Zuma who was a dismal failure as the African Union. [Interjections.] Her deployment to the African Union was to smooth operations for the Gupta Dynasty that had started to do business because she was there.

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

## TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 143

It led to the senseless deployment of South African soldiers to the Central African Republic because they wanted to achieve their own narrow business interests. Fifteen soldiers were killed because of that particular deployment ...

[Interjections.] ... under Nkosazana Dlamini-Zuma as AU Chair.

The fact of the matter is that the Western Sahara still remains a colony. Morocco was readmitted as the member of the African Union and Pan African Parliament under her own foresight. This political leader who is successful allowed Morocco to be readmitted - a coloniser country in the continent dealing with that.

Under her stewardship of the African Union, Nkosazana Dlamini-Zuma, the so-called hero of African Unity, the AU is still dependent. More that 80% of AU's funding still come from the European Union. What is revolutionary; what is pan-Africanist about that? What did she do? She came with Agenda 2063!

There is a programme of action that is incomplete, called the Abuja Treaty that has got dates up until 2028. What did she do? She comes and says: We want Agenda 2063 for Africa - shifting the goalpost far above what we currently have.

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

## Page: 144

The agenda which this Parliament - which South Africa must affirm - is the Abuja Treaty of the establishment of the African economy so that we are able to consolidated African Unity in the vision that was given to us by: Andimba Toivo ya Toivo of Namibia - may his soul rest in peace; Julius Nyerere; Haile Selassie; Kwame Nkrumah; and all the great African leaders. [Time expired.] Thank you very much. [Applause.]

Mr M A MNCWANGO: Hon Speaker, this Africa Day provides us with an opportunity for pause and reflection on the continental *status quo*, its challenges, successes and shortcomings. It enjoins us, as Africans, to adopt such continental vantage point in order for us to be not on the cognisant but also duty bound in ensuring the greater peace and prosperity for all within its borders.

The Pan Africanist ideology, though it is somewhat faltering its once clear calls for co-operation and unity are no longer subscribe to by the many. Although the African Union, AU, still champions such efforts one must question whether there is still the political will and impetus by some member states to strive for the ideal of an open democratic and free Africa.

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

### Page: 145

Peace, security, stability and good governance are a *sine qua non* and foundational to the success of the continent. Continental Peace and Stability remains concerning. Even though strides have been made in this area by the AU, we still see the challenge of 'fragility' in many post-conflict countries. Peace and stability remaining as it were on a knife-edge. Conflict involving children, women and youth on the continent must receive greater attention and efforts in mitigation thereof must remain an AU priority.

Using children as combatants is barbaric and every effort must be made to bring peace to such war-torn areas. Emerging issues such as maritime security, border tensions, trafficking in illicit drugs, human trafficking and poaching of wildlife are areas of grave concern, as is the constant threat of terrorism. Murderous religious intolerance as we have recently witnessed in Egypt with 28 Christian cops being brutally killed, will only sow further division.

African dictatorships that sacrifice the well-being of their citizens for the monetary benefit of the few are a challenge that is going to require an African solution. At the beginning of this year we witnessed Economic Community of West African

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 146

States, Ecowas, through the use of diplomacy and possible military intervention convince Gambian President, Yahya Jammeh to leave the country after he refused to step down despite losing in the elections. Closer to home, our SADC should take page from the Ecowas's manual and adopt a more robust position as regards the situation in Zimbabwe.

Chairperson, Africa is one of the wealthiest continents in the world and yet we continue to conduct our affairs as if we were the poorest. This is a mindset and it must shift if we are to create the African dream and renaissance. We must imbue our youth with the vision and capability through world class education and skills development to reach this dream. They are the future of Africa. This is the dream and this is our dream.

Hon Speaker, this debate is an auspicious debate for me for another reason as it marks my last debate before this most august assembly. [Applause.] I have been privileged for the last 23 years to serve as a member of this National Assembly and to have played a small role in the ushering in, not only our transformation into democracy but also in its further development. I wish to take this brief opportunity to thank all of you seated here today for the friendship and camaraderie

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

### TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

### Page: 147

that we have garnered over the years as we have striven together to create a better future for all South Africans. In particular, I would like to thank my colleagues in the IFP, my leader, Prince Buthelezi, my Chief Whip, Mr Narend Singh, and my Chairperson of Caucus, Prof C T Msimang for granting me such a wonderful opportunity to better serve the people of this great land and I am forever grateful for that.

To our caucus staff, thank you for your outstanding support. To my family, my wife Audrey and children Skhumbuzo, Zama and Mvelo, my heartfelt thanks and love for the sacrifices you have made in having a husband and father away from home whilst serving in Parliament. Your love and support is cherished and has kept me going through the good times and the bad ones.

In conclusion Chairperson, my message to South Africa is that, we are a great land with a great people. We need to forge ahead as one, root out the disease of corruption that currently besets us, uphold the rule of law, stand together irrespective of race, colour or creed, and in so doing become that shining example of what all other African nations should aspire to, in service and benefiting not only to the people of this country, but to all the people of Africa. I thank you. [applause.]

### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

## TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

### Page: 148

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much hon Mngcwango. On our behalf: ...

Sesotho:

... O tsamae hantle ntate. [[Mahofi.]

English:

We add our words of thanks to your family and your party for having worked with us well during your time here. Thank you very much.

Prof N M KHUBISA: Hon Deputy Speaker, we must also add our voice and wish you Mpangazitha all the best wherever you will be and we will also remember you for your knowledge and understanding of matters of justice, correctional services, police, security and international relations, all the best Sir. Nkwame Nkrumah once said:

I am not an African because I was born in Africa but because Africa was born in me.

There is indeed a thread that connects us from Cape to Cairo anchored in our shared characteristics and interrelationship as

### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

### Page: 149

Africans. That thread is Africa born in us. It matters not what race we are but being African transcends race and nationality. It transcends political philosophies and unites us in a social cohesive force that is waiting to emerge from the shadows of our colonial past.

We must mutually agree as Africans that we will only become stronger when we come together with no tarnish records of poor governance, corrupt tendencies, greed and nepotism. The time has come for Africa to take stock and have eyes in order. Deputy Speaker, member states in the African Union have their sovereignty as individual states hence no member can interfere in the affairs of another without the mandate from the member state concerned. However, it is of paramount importance that all members should subscribe to the prescripts of African regional law and international law.

African countries and independent states have to uphold the rule of law and not abuse the fundamental human rights. Nations of the world will respect us Africans if we are united; promote the socioeconomic advancement of Africa; and most importantly if we shun greed, corruption, nepotism and all patriarchal and chauvinistic tendencies which bedevil our beautiful continent.

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

### TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

### Page: 150

If we want our voice to be stronger on the international stage when we have to speak then we have to speak with a united and distinct voice.

As Africans we share a common humanitarian philosophy of Ubuntu which has a potential to unite us and as a continental power that values human life, peace and stability. It is a voice that will tell of our deep rooted compassion for our fellow Africans and mankind and our admittance that in life we have not only rights but also obligations. Our voice must speak of a shared vision and purpose.

We need to interrogate what Nkwame Nkrumah meant when he said:

Africa is a paradox which illustrates and highlights neocolonialism, her earth is rich yet the products that come from above and below the soil continue to enrich not Africans predominantly but groups and individuals who operate to Africa's impoverishment. Thank you Deputy Speaker.

Mr N L S KWANKWA: Hon Deputy Speaker, we would also like to thank hon Mngcwango for serving our country for the years he

### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

### Page: 151

spent serving our country with distinction. Sir, we are greatly indebted to you. Thank you very much.

IsiXhosa:

Uqhube kakuhle.

# English:

When it comes to this Africa Debate, colleagues I think there is an important question that we must pose. It is a sad irony for us Africans that what is happening to us is exactly what Mike and the Mechanics describes in one of his songs that says, we are beggars while sitting on the beach of gold.

A major contributing factor has to do with the fact that a lot of African countries have adopted misguided economic policies. If you look at the recent report of the International Monetary Fund it tells you exactly that growth in Africa last year was 1,4%. The major contributing factor to those challenges in those issues has to do mainly with the poor performance of some of the leading economies in Africa, firstly in Nigeria which is in recession. It is in recession because it chose a wrong mix of policies and also struggles with her fair share of bad leadership.

### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

### Page: 152

Look at South Africa, for example, we are in recession now. Issues have to do primarily with corruption and mismanagement of the economy. That we cannot shy away from it. The fact of the matter is that when we talk about Africa's development as the two largest economies what we must consider is the responsibility that our leadership role places on our shoulders. If we fail two economies we fail with the rest of the continent.

The other issue as Africans we must ask, sit down and pose a very important question is when it comes to a poor leadership and some of the countries that have hardened into autocracy such as the Democratic Republic of Congo for example, Burundi and many others - what are we doing? Are we doing enough, firstly at a regional level and secondly, at a continental level to try and intervene to address those issues? We are not doing enough.

If you consider properly that at the time when the summit conference of the African heads of states took place in 1963 where Haile Sellasse said:

### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

### Page: 153

We remain persuaded that in our efforts to scatter the clouds we dream the horizon of our future success must come if only because failure is unthinkable. We have to make a similar clarion call to say that we have to try and tackle the challenges that face Africa with the same vigour. The other problem is the issue that faces Zambia at the present moment with Hakainde Hichilema. I read in the Lusaka Times yesterday that he even says that he is prepared to die for what he believes in if that is what these political opponents want. But the question is, what is he going to die for? Why are our African leaders silent on the issues that face the African continent? We should stand up and raise our voices and condemn them and say this is not the direction we want to take whether you talk about implementing vision 2063 or any other visions that you come up with and fail to implement when we need to do so.

### IsiXhosa:

Siyaqhuba, mayihambe i-Afrika.

## English:

God bless Africa. I thank you so much. [Applause.]

# NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

## TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

### Page: 154

Dr C P MULDER: Hon Chairperson, allow me to also extend our best wishes to our colleague, Albert Mncwango. It is true that our colleague served in Parliament since 1994 and he was always a colleague that you should take seriously because his arguments were always sound. He always made good inputs in debates. I understand that his favourite quote is the following and I quote: "The only source of knowledge is experience." How do you get 23 years of experience in Parliament? By serving in Parliament for 23 years.

So, we wish our colleague everything of the best and we hope that his future will be bright and where he is going to serve, will also be to the benefit of the people he serves.

Today, we are debating Africa Day, which is on 25 May and the topic of our debate is building a better Africa and a better world. I want to say to my other colleague, hon Kwankwa from the UDM that he has just made a very good speech. I hope that colleagues listened because I think what he said was the essence of what we need to say to one another.

We have had too many debates on talking about the past and about things that were decided at this convention and at that

### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

### Page: 155

symposium or whatever the case may be. When are we going to talk about the future of our continent? It is one thing to always talk about the past this and the past that. It is time that we stop talking and start doing things in terms of developing our continent in Africa.

There are various reasons that the continent is not performing. I cannot think for one minute that there is a single member in this House who do not want to see our country and our continent succeed.

### Afrikaans:

Ons almal wil dit graag hê. Ons wil graag hê dat ons kontinent met die res van die wêreld moet kompiteer en dat ons suksesvol moet wees.

Ons is baie gou om te sê dat Afrika moet verenig. Miskien moet ons minder tyd spandeer om Afrika te verenig en by ons eie huis begin - ons eie land - en kyk of ons hiervan 'n suksus kan maak. As elke land dit basies sal doen, sal ons by 'n suksesvolle uitkoms kom, wat dit betref. [Tussenwerpsels.]

### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

### TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 156

Dis baie goed om van Pan-Afrikanisme, politiieke, kulturele, sosiale en ekonomiese ontwikkeling en solidariteit te praat. Dis reg en goed, maar dit begin by die basiese goed, in terme van ekonomiese groei.

Dit is pynlik om te sien dat Suid-Afrika besig is om te gly. Dis pynlik om te sien dat Egipte by ons verbygaan. Dis pynlik om te sien dat Nigerië by ons verbygaan.

Kom ons kry ons eie huis in orde. Kom ons maak 'n sukses van Suid-Afrika en dan kan ons ons rol speel in die res van Afrika en die voorbeeld basies stel.

Aan die einde van die dag gaan dit oor leierskap, oor leiers wat bereid is om op te staan vir wat reg is, om op te staan teen korrupsie en wanbesteding en om 'n voorbeeld te stel. Suid-Afrika het 'n groot pad om te gaan, wat dit betref.

Die VF Plus is trots om deel te wees van Afrika-dag en die viering daarvan. Baie Dankie.

Mr W M MADISHA: Deputy Speaker, as some of us know, the theme for Africa Day this year was: The Year of O R Tambo: Building a

# NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

### TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 157

Better Africa and a Better World. This year, South Africa is also reaffirming its support for the African Union's Agenda 2063 - Committing the country to playing its role within the AU, to ensure the successful implementation of the vision and plan to build a better Africa.

Amongst the AU aspirations for 2063 are a prosperous Africa, based on inclusive growth and sustainable development; an Africa of good governance, democracy, respect for human rights, justice and the rule of law; peaceful and secure Africa, and an Africa with strong values and ethics.

The question is, as South Africa, how are we going to contribute to Agenda 2063 when we now face a full-blown recession, junk status, economic growth destroying policies, chronic unemployment and ballooning inequality, and as a consequence, unsustainable development?

As South Africa, how are we going to contribute to Agenda 2063, when instead of attracting investment and creating growth and employment, we are intent on creating an unsustainable government-dependent populist?

### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

### TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 158

As South Africa, how are we going to contribute to Agenda 20 63 when we have moved from being the champions and model of good governance on the Continent to being an example of poor and rotten governance, with rampant corruption and now, a captured state by foreigners?

As South Africa, how are we going to contribute to Agenda 2063 when our government and ruling party regularly attack the judiciary and disregard the rule of law?

As South Africa, how are we going to contribute to Agenda 2063 when we have moved away from our human rights approach to foreign and continental affairs to supporting tyrants wanted by the ICC?

As South Africa, how are we going to contribute to Agenda 2063 when it appears that we may well have intervened in conflict on the continent for corrupt and enrichment ends?

As South Africa, how are we going to contribute to Agenda 2063 when we have shifted from being the continental leaders in good values and ethics to being a pariah state?

# NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

### TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

### Page: 159

We don't think that we are doing well and something has to be done. Thank you.

Rev K R J MESHOE: Deputy Speaker, the ACDP believes there are three important things that government must do before our nation can start building a better Africa and a better world.

Firstly, safety and security, order and discipline must be restored in our country. Crime is out of proportion and criminals appear to be in charge in certain areas. Since the beginning of this year, a shocking number of women and children have been killed in our country. A new evil has developed where women are raped, killed and set alight.

According to the South African Medical Research Council, every eight hours, a woman is killed by an intimate partner. This is totally unacceptable.

Secondly, corruption that has become endemic in our society must be eradicated. The looting of state resources must stop and the current President Zuma administration must be replaced by an administration that cares for the poorest of the poor and

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

### Page: 160

that will ensure that jobs are created and that the economy grows.

We cannot build a better Africa and a better world when our unemployment rate is sitting at more than 28% and lawlessness and corruption are at an all-time high.

Corruption is destroying South Africa's economy, employment opportunities and investor confidence. It must be dealt with, before we can start dreaming about building a better Africa.

Thirdly, South Africans must be willing to learn from successful nations such as Singapore, that managed to progress from being a Third World Country to a First World Country in the space of only 35 years.

Led by their first Prime Minister, Lee Kuan Yew, who was in office from 1959 to 1990, Singapore was transformed from one of the poorest countries in the world in the 1960's to being among the most advanced today.

Key elements that enabled their transformation included the rule of law, efficient government structures, the continuous

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

### Page: 161

fight against corruption, and overall stability. Unfortunately, our country is lacking in all these four areas.

Until South Africa gets a leader that is committed to social cohesion and nonracialism, this House will forever dream about building a better Africa.

The ACDP believes that if we learn and apply the lessons of Singapore, then we will see a repeat of what is recorded in Genesis 41:57, where it says: "And all the world came to Egypt to buy grain from Joseph, because the famine was severe everywhere." Imagine the world coming to Africa for sustenance because of all the mineral wealth that we have.

The ACDP plans to apply the lessons of Singapore and to help restore Africa to her former glory where she, once again, becomes the bread basket of the world.

A few weeks ago, a Zimbabwean showed me an article that appeared in *The Herald* newspaper. It said that 50 years ago, Rhodesia, Zimbabwe today, use to send foreign aid to the UK. The question is: Can Africa do that again? Can they send foreign aid to Europe again? I believe it can be done.

### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

### TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 162

Lastly, the ACDP wishes hon Mncwango future success and thank him for the 23 years of distinguished service in this House and we wish him well.

Setswana:

Tsamaya sentle, Rra. Modimo a go tlhogonolofatse.

Ms E M COLEMAN: Hon Deputy Speaker, let me also join the House in bidding farewell to hon Mncwango and wish him well in his future endeavours. [Interjections.] I also don't know who you are. [Interjections.]

Hon Deputy Speaker, as we discuss all matters about Africa, we raise our fists in salute and bow our heads in grief at the loss of yet another gallon son of the soil - one of the revered fathers of our struggle, Herman Andimba Toivo ya Toivo.

There are no better words to describe the man than the words echoed by the ANC in its recent statement on his passing calling him a loyal friend of the South African people, a freedom fighter, hero and icon of Namibia struggle for self determination.

### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 163

Every time we lose a member of that golden generation, the conscientious call for us to exert more efforts in the struggle for the total emancipation of our people, grows even louder. It's a call we must respond to sparing neither effort nor strength in dealing with the hurdles before us.

The ANC believes South Africa's prosperity is linked and coexists with the consolidation of the African Agenda – addressing inequality between the poor and the wealthy countries with increasing poverty and the marginalisation of millions of people, the globalisation of terrorism, unilateralism and militarism of major powers.

Our strategic approach as the ANC is to achieve an international order with greater security, peace, dialogue and equity between countries. We are guided by the principles of a better life for all and a vision of a just and equitable world and a better Africa.

The applicability of our values in parts of Africa and the world has projected South Africa as a beacon of hope for the rest of Africa and the developing world. At the 50th anniversary of the African union in 2013, African leaders

# NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

### Page: 164

declared that our continent commits to accelerate Africa's infrastructural development; to link African people's countries and economics and to help drive social, cultural and economic development.

In this regard, the leaders committed themselves to meet strategic targets in transport, Information and Communications Technology, ICT, energy and other social infrastructure by committing national, regional and continental resources to this effort.

Agenda 2063 of the African Union sets out the aspirations of African people. These include: A prosperous Africa based on inclusive growth and sustainable development; an Africa whose development is people driven, relying on the potential of African people especially its women and youth and caring for children; an Africa as a strong united and influential global player and partner.

As we mark Africa day in 2017, we need to review the progress we have made as Africans in the area of economic development. The challenge of meeting the eight Millennium Development

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

### Page: 165

Goals, MDGs, depended on the economically developed nations fulfilling their obligations.

None of the MDGs were achieved by the developing nations and in particular the sub-Saharan Africa by 2015 primarily because rich nations fail to honour their commitments to MDGs such as cancellations of debts in the highly indebted and economically poor countries - the implementation of eight programmes and making available 0,7% of their grodd domestic product, GDP, to poor countries.

They have continued to subsidise their own agricultural output knowing fully well the implications for developing countries. They have also placed stumbling blocks to an agreement on a free, fair, just and sustainable trade regime.

Hon Deputy Speaker, infrastructure development links the people of the continent as well as her countries and economies in ways that advance the integration of Africa and promote regional economic integration but also strengthens our solidarity. It builds mutually beneficial infrastructure that strengthens the ability of countries to trade and establish regional value chains for increased competitiveness.

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

### Page: 166

Given low levels of intra-regional economic exchange and the smallest share of global trade, Africa remains the least integrated continent in the world. Infrastructure inefficiencies are costing Africa billion of dollars annually and are stunting growth.

Bridging this gap can only be achieved through regional and continental co-operation and solution finding of which we are busy with. In spite of these challenges, African countries have collaborated successfully to build major infrastructure projects, among them are the Inga 3 Hydropower Project in the Democratic Republic Congo, the Lesotho hydropower phase two and ... [Interjections.] Sorry about that.

The ANC believes that the programme of integrating African economies is best served by the ongoing work to integrating our regional economies under programmes such as the Regional economic integration communities, creating alternative trading blocks, increasing inter-trade amongst countries in the south and developing initiatives such as the BRICS.

These initiatives are supported by the African Union's and Regional Economic Communities, REC's measures to boost market

# NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

### TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

### Page: 167

access and intra-African trade. During the commodity boom period when extractive industries enjoyed huge profits, African states could not take advantage of the boom because of the poor state of the institutional government systems.

Changing policy and the regulatory environment takes much longer than a changing market; it has taken nearly a decade for developing countries to realise this policy gap and begin to discuss ways of correcting this. Even though the dramatic politic upheavals unfolding in many African states create new uncertainties about the future of multilateral co-operation, there is hope that through the building of strong institutions, these conflicts can be mitigated.

Africa's natural endowments are often a source of these conflicts which in turn are also funded by foreign powers seeking to extract maximum benefits from both resources and situations.

Arbitrary internal divisions imposed on us by our history of colonialism have left us relatively more isolated both from each other and the world as a whole. To overcome that legacy,

### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

### Page: 168

we first need to liberate ourselves from foreign domination and set our people on a path to dignity and prosperity.

By all accounts, Africa's economic growth and performance this past decade has been exceptionally strong even in the midst of widespread global economic crisis and recession. The growth however, has not resulted in significant and commensurate declines in poverty levels nor has it been rich in jobs. In a large measure, the growth has also not been sufficiently inclusive. Low intra-Africa trade, limited integration and infrastructure connectedness are additional obstacles to boosting the global competitiveness of Africa and economies, and contributing to elimination of poverty.

We need to work to promote policies and programmes for inclusive growth and job creation and accelerate progress towards achievement of SDGs. The AU has committed to support programmes that are designed to help member states adopt policies on inclusive growth - for those who do not know. The body is also working towards accelerating progress towards establishment of a continental free trade area, harmonisation of monetary policies and other standards.

### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

### Page: 169

In conclusion, as the African idiom says: Sugar cane in sweetest in its joint. Simply meaning that good and sweet things of life may appear difficult to achieve but in the end, it is worth it.

Hon Shivambu, you must know that ... [Interjections.] Keep quiet. [Interjections.] ... to get lost is to learn the way. You need to go and understand that proverb. I thank you. [Applause.]

Mr M P GALO: Hon Deputy Speaker, the son of the soil Robert Sobukwe has written extensively on building a better Africa and a better world for global peace and harmony. He has been neatly articulate on the subject. He stated that and I quote:

Besides the sense of a common historical fate that we share with the other countries of Africa, it is imperative, for purely practical reasons, that the whole of Africa be united into a single unit, centrally controlled. Only in that way can we solve the immense problems that face the continent.

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

### TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

### Page: 170

African descendants have never renounced the idea of crafting African solutions to African problems. We owe it to our founding forbearers to deepen regional integration in the continent, to harness our coexistence as a people and to form a global pact geared towards advancing the competitive environment to which we trade as global partners.

The African Peer Review Mechanism reminds us that Africa, using its requisite natural resources and intellectual prowess, can manifest a sense of renewed hope for its people. Patriotic vanity is never enough, Deputy Speaker. We need men and women who are champions of justice, morality and fairness. Global peace can only advance if the vanguard movements jealously guard against the depletion of state coffers and the abuse of Africa's natural resources to advance personal cults and interest.

African states cannot simply prosper on this basis. We will regress progressively towards the downward spiral. Deputy Speaker, the unity of Africa and the global world is prefigured on the understanding that, in our view, the ownership of the means of production should vest under the curatorship of the indigenous people of Africa. It is the people who tilt the

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 171

soil, who built the bridges and who mines platinum. It should follow that their control of the means of production will harness the state capacity to provide services to the poor.

The African Traditional Leaders have proven, time and again, that their contribution to humanity has tended to recalibrate the values of interdependence, social cohesion, *Ubuntu -* and all those salient principles that advance the global accord. We often take for granted that Kwame Nkrumah, Nelson Mandela and many others... [Time expired.]

Mr M A PLOUAMMA: Hon members, hon Mncwango, we wish you well true patriot. I might speak like a lover who just got a surprise engagement. [Laughter.] You have served South Africa well and you have served the IFP well. [Applause.] You deserve the best in your future engagements.

Hon members, today I want to remind you of how Patrice Lumumba was killed and one of his killer's daughter still hold his teeth as an inheritance and pet of amusement.

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

### TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 172

So much sacrifice, but Joseph Kabila and his killers have hijacked the fruits of independence. Congo is now a killing field.

The remains of the Herero people still grace the German museums and universities as part of their historical expeditions and conquest. The modern Germany still refuses to compensate or participate meaningfully in rebuilding Namibia. I want to say, rest in peace, Ntate Toivo Ya Toivo.

Hon Members, here in South Africa, we are still living under the bas spell of Cecil John Rhodes, the founder of economic cartels with Rothschild. We can still trace the arrogance of Paul Kruger from his descendants and our Kings and Queens were slaughtered under their skewed land grabs and expansion. Things still remains the same; they own the economy and the best part of our country and communal lands.

Black people are still the ones who still wake up in the morning to work for their masters in the cities; it is very difficult for us to celebrate and to even think that Africa moves forward.

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

### Page: 173

Those who oppressed us have not repented; they have never asked for sincere apology, we just offered forgiveness and convinced ourselves that they will change.

Hon members, Africa Day should not be like a relic to be worn once a year. We need to ask ourselves whether Africa is fully independent from the chains of the past. Can we celebrate Africa, when all means of production are still in the hands of the few or do we celebrate few black bourgeoisie added around the table of former oppressors? Can we define our future and our destiny without the interference of the West?

We need to ask ourselves in which way this continent has progressed or is it the world of slavery redone in the fashion of the day. We have inherited misery; false solution guided by the dark intellectuals of the past. I thank you.

Ms S V KALYAN: Deputy Speaker, on behalf of the DA and myself, I would to bid farewell to the hon Mncwango and wish him all the best in the next chapter in your life. Something I will always remember you by is your courteous and tearful manner. Go well!

# NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

### Page: 174

In Professor Ngugi wa Thiong'o recent lecture entitled "Decolonise the Mind, Secure the Base" used the analogy of the home to explain the idea of securing the base. He says that one should treat ones house as a base. It is from this base that one meets with the heads of other households. Usually, the head of the household fights tooth and nail to protect their assets. The same should happen in the continent of Africa. Do we see it as a home or as a place from which we can come to steal? He says many of Africa's leaders have come to view their homes as hunting grounds from which they can steal. He says African leaders go a step further and invite outsiders to plunder their homes. They invite robbers in and then allow the robbers to dictate how to run their country. Wa Thiong'o says that African leaders are taking money from their own to build or buy mansions in Brazil and Dubai. In South Africa we call it state capture.

There are two main actions or two main consequences of such actions is poverty - dire poverty, resulting in the exit of masses to find a better life in another country and the illicit outflow of finances. In 2016, 2 500 Africans were either swallowed by the sea or abandoned in the desert. Why did they

### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 175

leave their country to pursue a better life? Because they believe there is no hope at home.

Illicit financial flows from Africa are large and are increasing. Africa is a net creditor to the rest of the world, but the continent is losing more than \$50 billion annually through illicit financial flows. The African Union, AU, High Level Panel on Illicit Financial Flows led by the former President Thabo Mbeki confirmed that corruption drains billions of dollars from Africa - money that could be used to create jobs and better living conditions. And the deceitful way it is done by the large multinational co-operations, it is so difficult to catch them. Usually, it is commercial tax evasion, trade misinvoicing, abusive transfer pricing and criminal activities like human trafficking, illegal arms dealing and smuggling of contraband. Unique to South Africa or perhaps not unique to South Africa is also bribery and corruption of government officials.

He former US President, Barack Obama, addressed the AU in 2015 and remarked, "Africa does not need strong men, it needs strong institutions". The AU and its predecessor are founded on the ideals of African unity anchored in the values of respect,

# NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

### Page: 176

tolerance and solidarity. These are lofty ideals indeed. But the unfortunate reality is that Africa today is ill prepared to adequately respond to current events because the AU still has to be made fit for purpose.

This is one of the many findings of the Kagame Report which was tasked to look at the restructuring of the AU. The chronic failure by Africa to see through and implement AU decisions is giving truth to the perception that the AU is really a toothless body. The AU has adopted more that 1 500 resolutions but there is no way of monitoring implementation. South Africa is guilty of noncompliance. The overdependence of the AU on partner funding means partners dictate how the AU behaves and that is why there is such a deviation from its lofty ideals.

The AU stands by idly by when African leaders extend their presidential-term limits even when they are well past their sell-by date. Some African leaders seem to believe that they have a monopoly and wisdom on leadership and therefore deem themselves to be presidents for life and use brutality and force to sustain their longevity in power.

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

### Page: 177

Here are some cases in support of my point. Zimbabwe has a 93year-old "sleepy Joe" president who has been in power for 35 years and still wants to run for another term. The president of Equatorial Guinea has been in power for 36 years. The president of Angola has been in power for 36 years. The president of Sudan, a wanted International Criminal Court, ICC, criminal has been in power for 26 years. Do you think the citizens of these countries are celebrating Africa Day?

We have also observed the creeping in of authoritarian tendencies next door in Zambia. South Africa's silence on what is happening in Zambia is deafening. The AU has allowed Morocco back into the AU without any measures in place to ensure compliance with any of the AU instruments. While South Africa did not support the readmisssion, 36 African countries under the leadership of Nkosazana "Zumba" did and her legacy will be that she will be remembered for the unchecked colonialism and the continued depression of the rights of the people of Western Sahara.

The people of the Gambia and Economic Community of West African States, Ecowas, must be commended for showing leadership in the face of a potential bloodbath after their recent elections. The

### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 178

Kagame Report has a very strong conclusion that the AU stands at yet another crossroad in history. It can carry on down the same road or change direction to become more relevant. It suggests that it's time to change direction and ... [Time expired.] ... hopefully the new AU chair will turn the AU into a more credible institution. Thank you.

Mr M S A MASANGO: Hon House Chair, hon members, distinguished guests, fellow South Africans, the heads of state and government in their Summit held in Kigali on 29 January this year, masterfully noted that, I quote:

Continuing to defer necessary reforms to the future is an implicit decision to do nothing. It means giving up on ourselves and our people, tolerating our conditions as inevitable, and accepting Africa's subordinate place in the community of nations as natural.

Hon Members, it is indeed instructive to note that amongst the seminal decisions taken by the Summit was, amongst others, the realignment of the African Union, AU, Institutions to deliver against its priorities; the self-financing of the AU by the African states because foreign donations undermine Africa's

### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

### TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 179

national sovereignty; and a faster implementation of decisions and programmes; and, of course, lastly the creation of the African Volunteer Corps.

Fellow South Africans, I cannot agree more with Prof Thandika Mkandawire when he urges the continent to train its own professional cadres, Afrocrats. He argues that Afrocrats must understand the vision of their political principals and thus will be passionate in implementing such a vision and its programmes within the AU, the Pan African Parliament, Pap, and their national governments.

Hon members, former President of Nigeria, Olusegun Obasanjo and co-authors "Making Africa Work", a handbook for economic success, not only highlights some of our current weaknesses but also cautions us that by 2050, Africa's youth could be a whopping 430 million. Thus honing their skills, expertise and employability is an urgent task.

### IsiNdebele:

Sihlalo neNdlu yesiBethamthetho, kazi kuyatlhuwisa kwamambala ukutjheja bonyana lapha e-Afrika enarheni yeSahara yeTjingalanga abantu bakhona basese ngaphasi kwegandelelo

### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

### TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

### Page: 180

leMorocco. Njengathi ngaphambi kuka 1994, basatlhagiswa, bayabetjhwa bebabotjhwe nabanghonghoyilako.

Sithi i-African Union neenarha zoke akuragelwe phambili ngomzabalazo wokutjhaphulula iSahara yeTjingalanga, ngombana kuyindaba yobudosi phambili be-Afrika.

## English:

And yet, the DA is conspicuous by its silence to this excruciating colonial yoke of oppression by Morocco on Western Sahara and it equally equivocates about human rights violation in Palestine. Their silence was deafening on the recent mass hunger strike by the #Political Prisoners of Palestine - 1300 of them embarked on a hunger strike. [Applause.] Only the members from this side of the House actually took two days of fasting and issued statements. [Applause.] Nothing came out from the DA. There4 was no condemnation of Israel whatsoever.

Fellow compatriots, the OAU established in 1963, the AU established in 2002 and aspirations embodied in the African Agenda 2063, are a quintessential fulfilment of the vision of Kwame Nkrumah, Nnamdi Azikiwe, Jomo Kenyatta, Pixley ka Isaka Seme, OR Tambo and many others in the diaspora. Nkrumah noted:

#### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

#### TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 181

we all want a united Africa not only in our concept of what unity connotes, but united in our common desire to move forward together in dealing with all the problems that can best be solved only on a continental basis.

Fellow Africans, thus shall we make bold our unassailable assertion that South Africa is proud to have deployed its leadership in brokering peace, deployed peacekeeping forces and continues to participate in periodic election observation missions in the continent. By the way, peace is indeed a conditio sine qua non for development. The objective of silencing the guns by 2020 continues apace.

Hon members, the Africa we want, through Agenda 2063, behoves us to maintain the current diplomatic footprint of 124 missions, 47 of which are in Africa because it is in our best national interest. As a nation, we don't want to be a passive political passenger on the global stage, whilst human civilisation evolves.

#### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 182

Africa stands firm in its resolve for the realisation of a caring, a humane, and a just world order. Thus, the demand for the democratisation, representativity in the United Nations Security Council and other multilateral global governance institutions remains in strategic sight. We cannot allow few nations to wallow in opulence whilst Africa drowns in abject poverty, as correctly observed by Walter Rodney in his 1972 treatise "How Europe Under-developed Africa." Hon Kalyan buy and read this book.

Chairperson, in 2017, we must revive discussions about Pan-Africanism and what it truly represents, we must re-appropriate our common history, our identity, our films and literature, our oneness in diversity, our values of Ubuntu and avoid all trappings of foreign enculturation.

In our various jurisdictions, we need to rekindle our national consciousness through our National Anthems and the singing of the AU anthem to reassert our common destiny. We therefore applaud the initiative taken by the institute for Pan African Thought and Conversation at the University of Johannesburg for bringing together, this weekend, Friday, Saturday and Sunday – academics, historians, economists, philosophers and social

# NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 183

scientists to commemorate Africa Day, June 16 and to contribute to the decolonisation of the academic curriculum so that it can truly reflect the African context.

Hon members, colonialism, slavery and apartheid undoubtedly inflicted unyielding scars on the socioeconomic landscape of the continent. It is thus disheartening and an insult to the memory of the founders of the OAU, the AU and the memory of Steve Biko, Nelson Mandela, George Padmore, Robert Sobukwe, Franz Fanon, Maya Angelou and many others involved in the crucible of struggle against colonialism to hear Zille, a beneficiary of our freedom, who has zig-zagged Mandela's reconciliation into a zilch by extolling colonialism, slavery and apartheid. [Applause.]

Of course, it is quite clear the DA has been historically asleep or at least selectively asleep. It has no sense of what was said in 1906, 1945 in Manchester, 1955 in Bandung, in 1963 in Addis Ababa, 2002 in Durban. It behaves as a party which is not in the African continent populated and leading Africans. [Applause.] It sees Africa as somewhere there that the ANC and others ... [Interjections.]. It does not see it self as a party that must work with them. It is for this reason that the DA has

#### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 184

forgiven Helen for saying what she has said. So the DA must tell the South Africans whether it is a "domalliance" and if it is not then it must expel Zille. Finish and "klaar". [Interjections.] It is clear that Helen Zille does the thinking and Maimane does the listening and he must be told what to say, how to say it, what to think and when to think.

#### Afrikaans:

Jy moet altyd luister as the groot ma praat.[Gelag]

#### English:

Of course, the question is also the DA is the opposition. What are they opposing? Why are they opposing us? [Interjections.] We must transform this country from apartheid to its democratic future. [Interjections.] We must build the economy; it says it is an opposition. What are they opposing? Why are they opposing the black economic empowerment, BEE, why are they against the country moving away from poverty? They want the status quo to remain. [Interjections.] Quite clearly, the DA is a party of the past and it cannot be given the right to lead this country in 2019. [Applause.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Order, hon members.

#### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 185

Mr M S A MASANGO: One of the things that the DA would do if the leadership of the African continent were to do. To demand that there must be reparations for slavery, colonialism and apartheid. They would be the first ones to be against the African continent not anti-African. They have the Africans, but they have the Africans they want [Interjections.] The Africans who must think the way they want them to think who must behave the way the want...

#### Afrikaans:

... 'n geel boy, 'n swart boy, 'n kort man ...

#### English:

... or whoever. [Laughter.] They want the kind of Africans who think like that. They are against the fact that we have 47 missions in the African continent. What is wrong with that? As an African country, our first port of call is to be part of the African continent and develop and evolve with them. Members this side of the House are not showing a finger at the leadership of the Africans. They have been with them in the international socialist league, in the nonalliance movement, in the African liberation committee and many multilateral fora. We

#### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 186

together think and bring the collective genius of the African people about the Africa we want. That is what ...

Afrikaans:

... hierdie bittereinders ...

#### English:

... and of course Groenewald ...

#### Afrikaans:

... en nie hierdie hensoppers nie. [Gelag.] Nie hierdie hensoppers ...

# English:

... who are working with them in Port Elizabeth, Johannesburg and Tshwane. In terms of your history, I am sure you know who the "henshoppers" are. [Interjections.]

Mr M S MBATHA: House Chair, I rise on the point of order: How many minutes does a member still have ... [Interjections.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms C T Frolick): Hon take your seat. You are irrelevant.

#### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 187

Mr M S A MASANGO: I wish on behalf of the ANC and on behalf of the committee to congratulate ...

Ms E N LOUW: Chair, on a point of order, I rise to ask a member a question, if he would like to take a question?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms C T Frolick): Will you take a question, hon member?

Ms E N LOUW: As to why is he crying?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms C T Frolick): No, hon member. He has not agreed to take a question yet. Hon Masango, are you prepared to take a question?

#### IsiZulu:

Mnu M S A MASANGO: Anginasikhathi sokudlala.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms C T Frolick): Hon member, no, it's not ... no, hon member.

Ms E N NTLANGWINI: Why are you crying for our votes? You are a coward. [Interjections.]

#### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

#### TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 188

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms C T Frolick): Hon member, take your seat. Take your seat! Hon Masango, will you please conclude.

IsiZulu:

Mnu M S A MASANGO: Bengithi ngizimbandakanye nabo bonke abakhulumile lapha ukuhalalisela ubaba wethu, Mpakazitha Mahlobo. Hhayi ke nami ngithi njengoba sihlangana kwikomidi yezoDudlelwano Namazwe Omhlaba kanye nokubambisana usebenze kahle ndoda yakithi. Uyisebenzele iNingizimu Afrika, uwusebenzele uhulumeni wentando yeningi. Kuhle loko okwenzile. Ukwenze loko ngokungenabogovu. Uma ukuthi ubaba uMncwango useyokwenza okunye, cha sithi unwele olude Mahlobo, Mpangazitha sizoba nawe nje. Usibongele emndenini wakho ngokuthi usiboleke wena sisebenze kahle kangaka. Siyabonga. [Ihlombe.]

# PRESIDENT JACOB ZUMA APPOINTS JUSTICE RAY ZONDO AS THE DEPUTY CHIEF JUSTICE

(Draft Resolution)

Ms L A MNGANGA-GCABASHE: House Chairperson, I move without notice:

#### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 189

- (1) welcomes the appointment of Justice Ray Zondo as the Deputy Chief Justice of the Republic of South Africa by President, Jacob Zuma, on Wednesday 7 June 2017;
- (2) notes that Judge Zondo filled the position that became vacant as a result of the retirement from the active service of the Deputy Chief Justice Dikgang Moseneke;
- (3) further notes that prior to being appointed as a judge, he practised for many years as a human rights and labour lawyer,
- (4) understands that he began his career as an articled clerk under the late Mrs Victoria Mxenge;
- (5) further understands that Justice Zondo also served on several commissions and committees, including the Goldstone Commission of Enquiry regarding the Prevention of Violence and Intimidation, as well as the Managerial Task Team which was established in 1994 to drive the Labour Relations Bill for post-apartheid South Africa;

#### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 190

- (6) recalls that Justice Zondo was appointed as a:
  - (a) Judge of the Labour Court in November 1997;
  - (b) Judge of the then Transvaal Provincial Division of the High Court in 1999; and
  - (c) Judge President of the Labour Court and Labour Appeal Court in 2000 for a period of 10 years. [Time Expired.]

Agreed to.

### FIRES IN KNYSNA AND PLETTENBERG BAY IN THE WESTERN CAPE

(Draft Resolution)

Ms P T VAN DAMME: House Chairperson, I move without notice:

That the House -

(1) notes with great sadness fires that tore through the town of Knysna and Plettenberg Bay in the Western Cape last week, leaving in its wreck a devastation in its path;

#### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 191

- (2) further notes that the fires were fanned by devastating storm that toured through the Cape Peninsula on Wednesday;
- (3) acknowledges that nine people lost their lives during the storm as a result of the fires;
- (4) further acknowledges that the fires were eventually brought under control as a result of the immense sacrifices and hard work of fire-fighters and volunteers from around the country;
- (5) recognises the immeasurable role of the Western Cape Disaster Management Unit, Working on Fire, the Volunteer Wildfire Services, the Western Cape Government and the municipalities of Bitou, George and Knysna who worked tirelessly to save lives and repair damages;
- (6) further recognise the role of civil society, non-profit organisations, private companies and generous South Africans who came together to provide much needed shelter and food to the thousands of the residents who have been displaced; and

#### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 192

(7) conveys our sincere condolences to the families of the nine victims of the fires. [Applause.]

Agreed to.

#### THE PASSING OF ANDIMBA TOIVO YA TOIVO

(Draft Resolution)

Ms H O HLOPHE: House Chairperson, I move without notice:

- notes with sadness the passing of struggle icon and former Robben Island prisoner Andimba Toivo Ya Toivo;
- (2) further notes the important role Ya Toivo played in the founding of the South West Africa People's Organisation, SWAPO;
- (3) acknowledges Ya Toivo's genuine commitment to the people of Namibia and his struggle against the illegal occupation of Namibia by apartheid South Africa;

#### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 193

- (4) further acknowledges that, for his participation in the struggle, Ya Toivo was sentenced to 20 years in Robben Island;
- (5) understands that despite his imprisonment, Ya Toivo remained resolute in his commitment to a free and independent Namibia;
- (6) further understands that the young people of today must take courage and learn from the words of Ya Toivo that:"Only when we are granted our independence, economic independence, will the struggle stop;"
- (7) recognises that we must learn and emulate the selflessness demonstrated by this struggle icon, Ya Toivo; and

(8) call on Prliament to send its conveys its condolences and pay respect to the family of Andimba Toivo Ya Toivo and the people of Namibia.

Agreed to.

### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 194

### BAFANA BAFANA'S VICTORY OVER NIGERIA

(Draft Resolution)

Mr M S RALEGOMA: House Chairperson, I move without notice:

- welcomes Bafana Bafana's victory over their nemesis
   Nigeria in an African Nations Cup qualifying match at
   Akwa Ibom Stadium on Saturday, 10 June;
- (2) recalls that goals from Tokelo Rantie and Percy Tau handed Bafana their first ever competitive win against the Super Eagles, as they began the 2019 Africa Cup of Nations qualifiers with three points;
- (3) recognises the way the victory was achieved which has been so emotional: The long trip to West Africa, the short preparation period and by completely destroying the home favourites in their own backyard;

#### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 195

- (4) remembers that it took Bafana Bafana 24 years to break their unlucky streak against the Super Eagles in an official match;
- (5) congratulates the coach Stuart Baxter and Bafana's current crop of players for making history; and
- (6) wishes them well in their next encounter against Cape Verde in a FIFA World Cup qualifier.

Agreed to.

# BONGMUSA MTHEMBU WINS 2017 COMRADES MARATHON

(Draft Resolution:

Mr N SINGH: House Chairperson, I move without notice:

That the House -

(1) congratulates Bongmusa Mthembu who won the 2017 ComradesMarathon that took place on Sunday, 4 June 2017;

#### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 196

- (2) notes that Mthembu was born and raised in Bulwer just outside Pietermaritzburg;
- (3) further notes that he won this race for the second time, the first time was in 2014;
- (4) recognises that he is one of two South Africans to have ever won this race twice;
- (5) acknowledges that this champion crossed the Comrades Marathon finish line just before 11am, completing the challenging 86,73 kilometre race from Durban to Pietermaritzburg in a time of 05 hours, 35 minutes and 34 seconds;
- (6) further acknowledges that other participants who also took part and completed this challenging race, in particular, our very own Member of Parliament, Mr K P Sithole;
- (7) further recognises that Mr Sithole completed the race in just under hours and is not new to the Comrades Marathon as he had completed the race six times previously; and

#### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 197

(8) commends the camaraderie which the participants and all parties involved in making the race a success, and further alludes the attention this race still enjoys from international participation.

Agreed to.

# MS TSHIAMO LEGOALE WINNING THE TOP HONOURS AT THE FAMELAB INTERNATIONAL 2017 CONTEST

(Draft Resolution)

Prof N M KHUBISA: House Chairperson, I move without notice:

That the House

(1) notes that South African geologist, Ms Tshiamo Legoale, won top honours at the FameLab International 2017 contest last week, where more than 30 scientists from across the globe battled for the title of FameLab Champion in the world's biggest science communication competition;

#### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

#### TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 198

- (2) further notes that Ms Legoale is a 27-years-old and a geologist at Mintek, where she specialises in metallurgic research and probing methods to use wheat as a gold hyper accumulator, where wheat plants are used to harvest gold from mine dumps;
- (3) recognises that the wheat-to-gold method research done by Ms Legoale could represent a potential alternative to illegal mining in a sustainable manner and assists with the rehabilitation of old abandoned mines;
- (4) further recognise that Ms Legoale's achievement is particularly relevant whilst we are celebrating the youth month, and that she is setting a shining example for our scholars;
- (5) calls the house to congratulate Ms Legoale on her achievement; and
- (6) encourages the young South African scholars to follow the shining example set by Ms Legoale to excel in science and innovative ways.

#### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 199

Agreed to.

#### MUSLIMS OBSERVE THE MONTH OF RAMADAN

(Draft Resolution)

Ms L A MNGANGA-GCABASHE: The ANC moves without notice:

- extends its best wishes to the Muslim community as they observe the month of Ramadan which started on May 27, 2017 and will finish on June 24, 2017;
- (2) further notes that Ramadan is the most sacred month on the Muslim calendar and marks the time when Islamic holy book, the Quran, was revealed;
- (3) understands that it is also a time of devotion and reflection when Muslims abstain from food and water from sunrise to sunset;

#### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 200

- (4) further understands that following Ramadan, Muslims will celebrate Eid, which is to be held on 25 June 2017, marking the end of the Ramadan fasting and the start of the next month, Shawwal;
- (5) urges Muslims to use this opportunity of the blessed month that represents peace, unity and compassion, to once again renew their pursuit of peace and justice for all; and
- (6) wishes all Muslims in South Africa well over the fast.

Agreed to.

# WASHINGTON SIXOLO DIES

(Draft Resolution)

Mr M L W FILTANE: Hon Chair, sorry for the delay. I move without notice on behalf of the UDM:

#### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 201

- (1) notes with sadness the passing on of a legend of the Creative Cultural Industry, Mr Washington Sixolo, popularly known for his role as Jwara in Emzini Wezinsizwa;
- (2) further notes that Jwara died of multiple illnesseson Sunday, 4 June 2017, at the age of 83;
- (3) believes that Jwara leaves behind a large legacy from which we can all learn;
- (4) further believes that as a veteran actor, he enthralled his audience with fascinating stories;
- (5) acknowledges that Ntate Sixolo was also a language adviser to some of the productions including *Generations*, and that he acted in television, TV, series *Shaka Zulu* as Bhebhe and Jackie Chan's *Who Am I* as a Zulu king;
- (6) further acknowledges that in 1983, he won a Tonight Acting Award in recognition of his excellence in acting; and

#### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 202

(7) expresses its condolences with the members of the Sixolo family, the friends and the Creative Cultural Industry as a whole.

Agreed to.

# ACKNOWLEDGING THE PEOPLE AND COMMUNITY OF NALEDI

(Draft Resolution)

Mr R T W CHANCE: I hereby move without notice on behalf of the DA:

- (1) notes that on 8 June 1976, at Naledi High School in Soweto, police vehicles were set alight after the attempt to arrest a learner, Enos Ngutshane, who had written to the Department of Education in protest against the Bantu Education Act;
- (2) recalls that the South African Student Movement leaders went underground to arrange, with surrounding

#### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 203

schools, a meeting on 13 June where the June 16 march was planned;

- (3) acknowledges that on that fateful day, students began marching from Naledi High School, through Mofolo, Tladi, Jabulani and other suburbs of Soweto, arriving in Orlando West where the shooting of Hector Peterson made international headlines; and
- (4) requests that this House gives due recognition to the people and community of Naledi, arguably the birthplace of the 1976 student revolt, which unleashed an unstoppable movement culminating in our first free democratic elections 18 years later.

Agreed to.

#### CHAPTER 9 INSTITUTIONS TREATED UNFAIRLY

(Draft Resolution)

Ms M O MOKAUSE: Hon House Chair, I move on behalf of the EFF without notice:

#### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 204

- (1) notes the discontent with which Parliament and government treat institutions that are supposed to support and strengthen our democracy;
- (2) further notes that this is even after the Constitutional Court has affirmed Chapter 9 institutions powers and their binding recommendations;
- (3) acknowledges that since the release of the state capture report by the former Public Protector, Advocate Thuli Madonsela, seven months ago, Parliament has failed to follow up on the findings or implement the recommendations by Advocate Thuli Madonsela;
- (4) also notes that all efforts of judicial review of the report by Jacob Zuma are simply a waste of taxpayers money and mean to delay justice while the looting continues by the Ministers appointed by the Guptas;

#### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

#### TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 205

- (5) acknowledges that with the new evidence that is now available, Parliament cannot afford to wait on other processes but it must play its role to deal with state capture;
- (6) further acknowledges that all efforts to uncover state capture must be supported; and
- (7) calls on this House to take a serious exception to attempt to continue to undermine the state of capture report and remind us all to focus on implementing its recommendations, and not give lip service to and undermine these important Chapter 9 institutions.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon members, I now put the motion, are there any objections?

An HON MEMBER: We object, Chairperson.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): There is an objection. Order, hon members! There is an objection and the motion is thus not agreed to.

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 206

#### SPRINGBOKS BEATS FRANCE

(Draft Resolution)

Mr S M RALEGOMA: The ANC moves without notice:

- (1) notes that on Saturday 10 June 2017, Springboks end at a losing streak when they beat France 37-14 during the International Rugby Union test match at Loftus Versfeld Stadium in Pretoria securing a pressure relieving win for coach Allister Coetzee;
- (2) remembers that South Africa scored two tries in a minute in the second half on the way to victory regaining some pride after a disastrous previous campaign;
- (3) believes that this win will ease some of the grinding pressure on the coach and players;

#### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

#### TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 207

- (4) congratulates the Springboks for playing a good game; and
- (5) wishes them well in their second match with France in Durban next Saturday, 17 June 2017.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon members, I now put the motion, are there any objections? There is an objection ... [Interjections.] Who is rising on a point of order here?

Motion not agreed to.

Ms R N CAPA: Chair, is it parliamentary for that hon member to be standing while we are busy in this House? [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Order, hon members! Let me deal with the motion. There's an objection, and the motion is thus not agreed to.

Hon members, we are aware of the situation of the hon member that underwent an extensive ... [Interjections.]

Ms D KOHLER: [Inaudible.]

#### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 208

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Order! Order, hon member!

We are aware of the situation of the hon member, and that's why we are allowing her to stand. She underwent an operation. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Apologise in this House!

# PRIMARY SCHOOL PUPILS ASSAULTED BY POLICE AT PRINCIPAL'S INVITATION

(Draft Resolution)

Ms D CARTER: Chairperson, on behalf of Cope, I move without notice:

That the House -

 notes that merely a week before 16 June, 15 primary school pupils were allegedly beaten up and kicked by members of the SA Police Service, SAPS;

#### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 209

- (2) further notes that it is alleged that the principal at Mamomoane Primary School in Madidi near Soshanguve invited the police to come and discipline the children because they were not listening;
- (3) recognises that two officers from the Klipgat police station assaulted these children, aged between 10 and 12;
- (4) further recognises that one of the children is still hospitalised with broken ribs;
- (5) acknowledges that the station commander has referred the case to the Independent Police Investigative Directorate, Ipid, for investigation; and
- (6) calls on the Department of Basic Education, SAPS and Ipid to investigate and leave no stone unturned.

Agreed to.

Ms E N NTLANGWINI: Chair, on a point of order. Chair, I think you should ask that member to apologise to the hon Natasha. We

#### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 210

should, in fact, commend her for being here at work and working even though she has to stand to do so. Some of their members go home and sleep!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Thank you, hon member. The matter has been dealt with. [Interjections.] Order!

#### TELEVISION PERSONALITY JOHANN BOTHA SHOT AND KILLED

(Draft Resolution)

Mr S M RALEGOMA: Chairperson, on behalf of the ANC, I move without notice:

That the House

(1) notes with sadness the death of Johann Botha, the presenter of the long-running wildlife show 50/50 on SABC 2 after he was shot during a robbery at a bar in the Maboneng Precinct on Wednesday night;

#### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

#### TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 211

- (2) believes that, according to the police, four people three men and a woman - entered the bar, bought food, and then pointed a gun at the owner;
- (3) further believes that the owner and Johan Botha were shot in the upper body and both died at the scene;
- (4) understands that Botha was a former producer, presenter and executive producer of the SABC's environmental programme Projek Ardwolf;
- (5) further understands that by the time of his death he was a producer on MNet's Carte Blanche investigative magazine show;
- (6) acknowledges that Botha had an enormous talent and a big heart, and that his energy on camera and investigative journalistic insight made him a champion for the environment; and
- (7) conveys its condolences to his family, colleagues and friends.

#### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 212

Agreed to.

#### SOUTH AFRICAN ECONOMY OFFICIALLY IN RECESSION

(Draft Resolution)

Mr S M JAFTA: Chairperson, I move without notice:

That the House -

- notes that the South African economy has officially entered technical recession;
- (2) further notes that the economic cluster Ministries should weigh-in on this quagmire and introduce austerity measures in public spending;

(3) calls upon these Ministries to engage with business across the spectrum, to quell business anxiety and fears of political unrest; and

(4) further calls upon these Ministries to assure all stakeholders in business, labour and the National

#### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 213

Economic Development and Labour Council, Nedlac, that government is working tirelessly to inspire investor confidence in the state administration.

Agreed to.

# CAPE STORM CLAIMS NINE LIVES AND WREAKS HAVOC

(Draft Resolution)

Ms L A MNGANGA-GCABASHE: Chairperson, I move without notice:

- (1) notes with sadness the death of nine people following a storm which ravaged the Western Cape on Wednesday,
  7 June 2017 till Thursday afternoon;
- (2) further notes that scores of people were displaced and spent the night at community halls, churches and alternative shelters;

#### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 214

- (3) believes that hundreds of structures were destroyed while thousands of people were affected by waterlogged homes;
- (4) recalls that many trees were uprooted and roofs blown off, which resulted in several blocked roads and snapped power lines;
- (5) understands that, in the Hout Bay area alone, more than 700 structures were affected by floods;
- (6) commends the NGOs, churches and authorities who gave necessary support to those affected; and
- (7) conveys its condolences to the families of the deceased.

Agreed to.

SOUTH AFRICAN WRITING LEGEND P G DU PLESSIS PASSES AWAY

(Draft Resolution)

#### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 215

Mr G A GROOTBOOM: Chairperson, I move without notice:

That the House -

- notes the death of Pieter Georg Du Plessis on
   7 June 2017 after a long period of illness;
- (2) further notes that, during his successful career, he won a number of literary prizes for his outstanding works that are still popular all over the country today, of which *Die Nag van Legio* was, most certainly, the best known literary piece;
- (3) recognises that he also won the coveted Hertzog Prize for the masterpiece, Siener in die Suburbs;
- (4) recalls that Du Plessis was known in writing circlesas a top-class story teller and filmmaker;
- (5) remembers the following words that might find favour with everybody:

Afrikaans:

#### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 216

Mens moet ook maar vrede maak met die kortheid van jou dae en jy moet die skoongeid van jou kortstondigheid aanvaar;

- (6) acknowledges his massive contribution to the treasure trove of South African literature; and
- (7) conveys its heartfelt condolences to his family and friends.

Agreed to.

# COURT APPLICATION FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT AGAINST THE ANC DISMISSED

(Member's Statement)

Adv B T BONGO (ANC): The ANC welcomes the decision by the South Gauteng High Court on Tuesday 6 June 2017 to dismiss with costs the application for summary judgment brought by Ms Sihle Bolani against the ANC. The court has dismissed this case of the public relations expert Sihle Bolani, who claimed that ANC owed her more than R1 million for the role she underhanded on the

# NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 217

issues of black ops campaign targeted to the opposition parties.

The ANC has consistently maintained that it has no relationship with Ms Bolani and it knows nothing about the black ops campaign around the issues of Local Government Elections.

The ANC has always since its formal launch in 1912 relied and depended on the just basis of its policies and the superiority of the ideals of building a true non-racial, united, nonsexist, democratic and prosperous society and it has always used that to gain the support of the people of South Africa and it is committed to make sure that the people of South get to be their own liberators. Together with the people of this country, we have recorded compelling achievements in the economy; improving the livelihood ... [Time expired.]

RESIGNATION OF THE ELECTRICITY SUPPLY COMMISSION, ESKOM, BOARD CHAIRPERSON

(Member's Statement)

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 218

Ms N W MAZZONE (DA): House Chairperson, the DA noted late last night, the unsurprising resignation of the Electricity Supply Commission, Eskom, Board Chairperson, Ben Ngubane.

Hot on the heels of damning revelations of the capture of the Eskom leadership by the Guptas and the breakdown of the corporative governance at Eskom; Mr Ngubane who presided over the retrenchment, then retirement then rehire of Brian Molefe as Eskom CEO has much to answer for, not least of which includes Molefe's R30 million golden handshake deal and an avalanche of accusations that the Guptas have milked Eskom for many years.

Let us not forget that this is the same man who chaired the South African Broadcasting Corporation, SABC, at the time that Tlaudi Motsoeneng was made acting CEO of the Public Broadcaster and defended him in this very institution unconditionally at all times.

Ngubane's resignation will not exonerate him from liability of the breakdown of governance at the power utility and the DA will use the Parliamentary enquiry into Eskom set to commence from 20 June to hold Ngubane to account.

### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

## Page: 219

As one by one, the ponies in the chess game that the state capture for the DA reiterate that South Africa is not for sale. Not on our watch.

### GUPTA CORRUPTION IN TRANSNET

(Member's Statement)

Ms N V MENTE (EFF): Thank you Chair. On the 09 June 2017 last week Friday, the EFF CIC Julius Malema and EFF officials laid criminal charges against the Minister of Finance Malusi Gigaba and other people who were involved in the Transnet locomotive tender corruption.

The EFF has all along warned South Africa about money that was moved by Mr Zuma and other Cabinet Ministers to Dubai, money that was looted from the state through corruption.

All what we have been saying is now supported by the hardcore evidence that is available for anyone to see, and we are not surprised that no Cabinet Minister has challenged the integrity of these emails.

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 220

Minister of Finance was the instigator and implementer of the Gupta corruption at Transnet and those who want to stand up on Point of Orders for a substantive motion must go to Johannesburg Central Police Station they have a full docket there.

Efforts to recapitalise Transnet were hijacked and thieves saw opportunity to loot and prices were negotiated to include bribes and kickbacks instead of price going down.

Transnet is paying for locomotives at a price that even developed countries are not paying because of the criminal organisation regiments and trading... [Interjection.]

Mr S M RALEGOMA: Chair, I'm rising on Rule 85: the member is raising issues that needed to be substantiated.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon member I have listened to your statement which at one stage was according to the rules but then it started making very specific accusations and you referred to a case, however although that is a matter that is still under investigation it does require a substantiated motion in the House so that if we feel that

# NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 221

strongly about the House can look into it. So a substantive motion is thus required.

Ms N V MENTE (EFF): The docket is available as a substantive motion. We can give you copies. In fact, copies were already forwarded to you. I don't know why you haven't seen them.

The police must do their job and investigate all these corruption because there are also foreign companies involved. We have written to the Chinese ... [Interjection.] ... and American Embassies to refer to the respective law enforcement agencies. You must go down. [Time expired.]

# EASTERN CAPE TO RE-ALLOCATE UNOCCUPIED HOUSES

(Member's Statement)

Ms V BAM-MUGWANYA (ANC): The ANC welcomes the move by the Eastern Cape Human Settlements provincial department to give the go ahead to all municipalities to re-allocate unoccupied houses to long awaiting qualifying beneficiaries.

### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 222

This decision was taken when it has come to the fore that some municipalities are struggling to trace beneficiaries whose houses have been completed. As a result, such houses most of the time are vandalized and used by criminals for crime purposes.

We support this move, as long as that undertaking is done cautiously through a legal process of deregistration of approved beneficiaries who have not taken ownership of their completed government subsidy houses.

The ANC is of the view that the department must trace the missing beneficiaries of unoccupied government subsidy houses before undertaking the process of deregistration. This requires that the missing beneficiaries are traced through advertisement and are given a period of 21 days to respond before the deregistration process commences.

The unoccupied houses also delay the transfer of issuing title deeds to the correct beneficiaries. This year alone, the department plans to lodge transfer and issue 10 000 title deeds to the correct beneficiaries in line with the ANC's commitment to eliminate the backlog of title deeds. I thank you.

# NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 223

# ARREST OF FOREIGNERS WITH RHINO HORN

(Member's Statement)

Mr N SINGH (IFP): Chairperson on Sunday two foreign national record leaving South Africa with R5 million worth of Rhino horn hidden in their luggage. That's the tip of the iceberg. This year alone 477 Rhinos have fallen to poachers.

In KwaZulu-Natal we lost 23 in just twelve days. Tragically our anti poaching victories in the Kruger National Park have simply relocated the battle.

With our country still losing three Rhinos a day we dare not cut budgets and think we are winning. Within a few short years there will be no Rhino left unless government acts across the board.

Treasury must count the cost to our country of illegal Rhino horn trafficking. Tourism must count the future cost of lost revenue; justice must create circuit courts in all the districts were protected areas occur; police must investigate and refer the syndicate who are operating freely; safety and

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

## Page: 224

security must refit our military with green barys to defend our national heritage.

The environmental affairs must study the pros and cons of dealing with the existing stock piles of illegal horns; communities living around protected areas must receive the same terms and training to become partners in this fight.

Chairperson through project Rhino KZN, a million youth are calling on us to stop this slaughter now. If we fail their generation will never see a wild Rhino. A year from now our progress will... [Interjection.] [Time expired.]

# PUBLICATIONS OF EMAILS ALLEGING GUPTA CORRUPTION

(Member's Statement)

Mr S C MNCWABE (NFP): Thank you hon Chairperson. Chair, where there is a smoke there is fire. We can also assume that where there is a lot of smoke there is a big fire.

### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 225

During the past few weeks South Africa has come face to face with a flood of emails which starts to reveal the extent of the Gupta interference in the state affairs.

The Gupta links make it difficult Chair to deny that our state has indeed been captured. Chairperson, this state capture is the result of a shadow state, governed from somewhere. It is a state that operates for the benefit of the few using our executive as its political hitman.

It is a state that prays on the greedy of individuals in position of power and influences those who want more - a state that ruthlessly pursues the aim of looting the public coffers at the expense of the people. Under the rule of this shadow state the economy of our country has been perished and racked.

Our national integrity has been tainted. In the midst of every passing day with all these things, our chances of economic recovery becomes less and our chances of further rating downgrade is certained. While our people are becoming poorer the connected few will become richer. Thank you.

# SEA POINT DA WARD COUNCILLOR FINED R10 000

# NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 226

(Member's Statement)

Ms M C C PILANE-MAJAKE (ANC): Hon Chairperson, the ANC believes that the R10 000 fine imposed on the Sea Point DA Ward Councillor Shayne Ramsay, for her racist and anti-poor statements, is a slap on the wrist. Ramsay pleaded guilty at a disciplinary committee of the DA for referring to homeless people as criminals, mentally retarded and social outcasts. Shocking!

Poverty can never make you stupid like the DA believes. It can never make you ridiculous, it can never make you unworthy and poverty should not make you an outcast, like the DA believes. Poverty for South Africans was never bought over the counter, but it is a direct outcome and consequence of the struggles that our people endured for years under the white apartheid regime that dehumanised and disenfranchised our people and that put the wealth of our country in the hands of the whites for 300 years.

The DA and its alliance partners the EFF, can continue to put spanners in the works, organise marches and riots, but we shall overcome, so says the ANC, as they lie to themselves that they

# NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 227

have already won the 2019 elections when they have already lost the 2014 elections. We want to send a clear message to the DA... [Time expired.] [Applause.]

# HUMAN SETTLEMENTS BANK LAUNCHED IN CAPE TOWN

(Member's Statement)

Ms M F NKADIMENG (ANC): Hon Chair, the ANC welcomes the newly established Human Settlements Bank meant to assist as many as 3 million people in the gap market. The bank was officially launched in Cape Town on Friday 19 May 2017, by Human Settlements Minister, Lindiwe Sisulu. Among its purposes, the bank will facilitate faster access to home financing for the poor. It is understandable that the bank would take the form of the Development Bank of Southern Africa, which is a development finance bank. Public servants including nurses, teachers and soldiers would benefit from home loans from the bank.

The gap market comprises people who earn too much to get Reconstruction and Development Programme, RDP, houses and too little to get mortgages from banks. The ANC believes that this bank will transform the property sector, which remained

#### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 228

untransformed. We hope that the private sector will come on board and assist in this project which is underpinned by a policy of undoing apartheid era spatial divides and bringing the poor closer to economic centres. The bank would also provide finance to emerging black entrants into the property sector, and would scale up delivery of the finance linked individual subsidy. I thank you. [Applause.]

# CONDEMNING ALL FARM ATTACKS AND MURDERS

(Member's Statement)

Ms A STEYN: Chairperson, North West Premier, Supra Mahumapelo, blamed and I quote, "White racists", for the death of young Matlhomola Mosweu. He said and I quote, "There is no confusion at whose hands did Matlhomola lose his life." He referred to and I quote, "Visitors who came empty handed to South Africa... none of them came with sunflowers or cows here..."

Shortly after this, North West province has seen an increase in farm attacks and murders with seven attacks in one month, one person murdered and another raped.

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 229

Instead of calling for calm and solutions to unite the community, he abused the opportunity to lash, and divide races, at a time of immense volatility. The DA condemns all attacks and murders and call on political leaders to unite and not divide communities. I thank you. [Applause.]

# MINISTER MALUSI GIGABA UNDULY GRANTED THE GUPTA FAMILY CITIZENSHIP

(Member's Statement)

Mr M S MBATHA: Yesterday we provided proof that Minister Malusi Gigaba unduly granted the Gupta family citizenship. This was after Mr G G Hlatshwayo on behalf of the DG of the department correctly denied the Guptas the citizenship stating that they were not meeting the requirements within the act.

The application for naturalisation was therefore unsuccessful as conveyed to the Minister by the officials. On 23 December 2005, in less than few months ago Minister Gigaba wrote to the Guptas granting them in terms what he grants as naturalisation. It is now beyond reasonable doubt that Minister Gigaba was

# NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 230

brought back to Home Affairs to finalise this process as it has been outstanding for a while.

This is after he has done a mess at the Public Enterprise Department by appointing all the Gupta family and cronies in all strategic positions in boards within the state enterprises. The EFF has taken a decision to approach its lawyers to take the matter to court with a view to rescind and to correct the big mistake that has been done by Minister Gigaba. It is clear that he works for the Guptas. Thank you.

# HANDING OVER A NEW HIGH TECH COMPUTER LABORATORY TO SIGIDISABATHEMBU PRIMARY

(Member's Statement)

Ms N NDONGENI (ANC): Chairperson, The ANC believes that education and skills are fundamental requirements for creating a prosperous society. As such, the ANC commends the Department of Science and Technology for handing over a new high tech computer laboratory to Sigidisabathembu Primary in the poverty stricken rural village of Ilenge-Majuqule in Ladysmith,

# NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

## Page: 231

KwaZulu-Natal, a school that few years ago was just two shacks with no windows and doors.

Today the school has dramatically changed from what it was, to a brick school with a new high tech computer laboratory. The school boasts a laboratory, which is internet enabled and equipped with 30 desktop computers, a multimedia printer, external hard drives and a projector. Moreover, nine laptops have been donated for the school's six teachers, and 19 tablets for Grade R learners to use. This development has opened up a new world of education for children at Sigidisabathembu Primary School.

The schoolchildren and the community would not have to spend time and money travelling more than an hour to town to access and use a computer. Instead of travelling, learners will get to use computers every day at school. This initiative is the Department of Science and Technology's Youth into Science Programme. I thank you.

# THE KILLING OF WOMEN AND CHILDREN

(Member's Statement)

# NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

Page: 232

Mr L M NTSHAYISA (AIC): Hon Chairperson, as AIC we call upon the intelligence police safety and security services of our country to look thoroughly in the issue of criminals. There should be a clear turn around strategy in dealing with these unscrupulous satanic culprits which are killing women and children almost everyday.

All the stakeholders in all municipalities should come together and assist the government in dealing with this scourge of murder and raping of our children and women. Everytime we hear that children have been snatched from schools by these criminals and are never heard of again and only their dead bodies would be found.

Basic education should also check and assist schools in drawing up the so called the school safety policies and this should be implemented.

The issue of inter-departmental relations becomes very much important in this regard. These devilish criminals are killing the future of our nation. Our youth should refrain from the youth of drugs and other substances so that they don't become

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 233

targets. It may sound xenophobic, but most of these drugs are brought by these foreign nationals. Their skills are accepted but the killing of children and women can never be allowed.

We hope that as the government, we will win this fight against these criminals and so on. Thank you.

## NEW CLINIC IN RANDFONTEIN

(Members's Statement)

Mr W MAPHANGA (ANC): House Chair, the ANC will always strive to ensure that South Africans have access to comprehensive quality health services irrespective of their socioeconomic status. The recent launch of R40 million state of the art clinic by the Gauteng provincial Government at Randfontein in Rand West City Local Municipality is welcomed and is commended. This clinic will serve residents from Brandvlei, Elandsfontein, Louwmarina, Helikonpark, Greenhill and other areas in that region.

It provides maternal and child health services and has lifesaving facilities for emergency births, provides treatment for chronic illnesses such as TB and HIV, has an outreach team that

# NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 234

visits schools and goes to patients' homes to ensure compliance with treatment for TB, HIV and other conditions. The clinic also offers the services of specialists that include social workers, a dietician and a dentist. The clinic has the capacity required by the doctors, nurses and specialists servicing the community. The ANC believes that this clinic will ensure the best care for local residents. ANC is of the view that the comprehensive health services should be made available as close to communities as possible. Thank you, Chair.

# SERVICE DELIVERY IN DA-RUN METROS

(Member's Statement)

Mr Z N MBHELE (DA): Chairperson, while the recently past DA-run Johannesburg Metro pro poor budget allocated R31 million to metro police departments for the recruitment of 1500 new officers to increase police visibility, the ANC-run eThekwini metro police wasted R4 million to hire more than 50 top vehicles during a six month spending spree in 2016. While the DA-run Tshwane Metro has introduced an anti-hijacking units and beefed up the anti-cable theft units within its metro police, and the Nelson Mandela Bay Metro has stabilized its metro police with the appointment of a new

# NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 235

police-chief and has already trained more than 100 new recruits since DA took over.

The supply chain management processes in the ANC-run Durban Metro were under multiple irregularities that squandered resources meant to increase safety for eThekwini residents. This is the DA difference that citizens can look forward to under a DA government after 2019. A DA government that cuts corruption, improve service delivery and increasing safety for all communities. Thank you.

# MOGALE CITY MAYOR

(Member's Statement)

Ms B J MALULEKE (ANC): Chairperson, the ANC welcomes the positive outcomes of a motion of no confidence against Mogale City DA Mayor, Michael Holenstein on Wednesday 7 June 2017, with votes tallied 39/38 resulted in favour of the ANC's motion of no confidence in the executive mayor. The motion was tabled on the basis of gross violation of the laws by the executive mayor. The ANC Speaker of Council agreed to his party's request to conduct a motion of no confidence against DA's Holenstein

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 236

through a secret ballot. Although the DA cried foul that the motion was not done through a show of hands by stating that the municipality's rules did not allow for a secret ballot when conducting motions of no confidence. This irony does not escape the ANC.

The ANC, thus views the position of the opposition parties as disingenuous given that on a national level they supported the United Democratic Movement's calls for a secret ballot vote for the motion of no confidence against the President, Jacob Zuma. The DA went further by calling on ANC cadres in Parliament to vote with their conscience. And even more hypocritically, the DA's national leadership was part of last month's march by opposition parties to the Constitutional Court in support of the secret ballot. I thank you.

# MINISTERIAL RESPONSES

The MINISTER OF ENERGY: House Chair, firstly let me start by reiterating government's commitment in dealing with and fighting corruption amongst departments and everywhere else. That is witnessed by the signing of the FICA by Minister Gigaba today, which he has signed and gazetted. It is part of the

# NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 237

areas and the actions that government is showing on its commitment to fight corruption.

The second issue I want to respond to is a statement by DA that speaks to poor budget in Johannesburg. I am not so sure hon member which Johannesburg you are talking about because the City of Johannesburg has cancelled free basic water to poor communities. Now, you are talking about the poor; the poor people's budget is not there. [Interjections.]

You have cancelled free litres of water that are given to communities which were introduced by the City Johannesburg then under the ANC. Today, members of the community who are poor, with child-headed households and who are senior citizens are going to suffer under your leadership. [Interjections.]

The other issue I want to respond to is the issue around the killing of women and children. I think this issue needs all of us, from government to civil society and all members of society in terms of women and men, to stand together and say: Not in our name. Let's protect women; let protect children so that everybody can feel safe. Those who are found abusing women must

# NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

## Page: 238

be isolated in society. So, there must not be any level of tolerance for those who are found wanting.

Finally, I want speak to the state-of-the-art clinic in Gauteng. I think this is a commitment of the ANC-led government in ensuring that we do not bring ... [Time expired.] Thank you, Chair. [Applause.]

The MINISTER OF SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY: Chairperson, I wish to begin by agreeing with the hon Singh that we should not cast or rather neglect attention to rhino poaching in any part of the country, particularly where we have very rich wildlife such as KwaZulu-Natal. Thus, the collaboration that we've had between the SA National Parks, SANParks, as well as the CSIR and the SA Police Service in using technology developed by the CSIR in fighting rhino poaching in the Kruger Park is something that we should take to other parts of the country. So, we would strongly support the hon Singh there.

Secondly, I thank the hon member of the ANC who referred to the laboratory that had been provided for the school in Ilenge in KwaZulu-Natal. This is part of our attempt to ensure that we increase resources for developing competence in science and

# NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 239

technology in all parts of our country. We value the support of all Members of Parliament in encouraging young people in South Africa to take up science and mathematics.

Finally, we applaud the Department of Human Settlements for continuing with the excellent record that government has built as the ANC-led government in providing housing to many millions of poor citizens in our country who would not enjoy such access had it not been for the democratic government of South Africa.

Thus, we encourage increased efforts by the Human Settlements department, and particularly congratulate them on this step taken: To support those who have not been able to get mortgages from banks; who will now be able to purchases homes with loans that are affordable from the entity created by the Department of Human Settlements. Thank you, Chairperson. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS: Chair, the hon Minister has covered me basically on the rhino horn issue but we absolutely agree with the hon Singh that indeed our country's resources are being looted and that we can and should do better with regard to border management. It is a real pity that of all

# NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

## Page: 240

of the opposition parties, it was the IFP that voted in favour of the Border Management Authorities Bill.

We certainly think that all parties of the House should agree that we can and should do better with border management in the future. We note however that the perpetrators in this particular case were apprehended and we congratulate the officials in this regard.

With regard to the issue of waivers, I am sure Minister Gigaba can speak for himself on this matter which was essentially more of a substantive motion than a Member's Statement. However, be that as it may, I think it is wrong for Members of Parliament to suggest that the Minister was not acting within his legal powers. It is usual in Home Affairs for waivers to be applied for and to be granted with regard to special motivation.

Finally, just speaking about the DA difference: I wonder if the hon member who raised the issue of the DA difference read the letter to the Sunday Times by Ms Bev Hermanson who said, and I quote:

### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

## Page: 241

The DA promised that they were going to do better, that service would improve. Well, they lied! Big time! ... Huge potholes [in Randpark Ridge], no electricity, and sometimes no water.

I wonder if we shouldn't all agree that, "DA disappoints in Joburg". [Time expired.] [Applause.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T FROLICK): Just to remind the House ... [Interjections.] ... that I indicated to the member who moved the motion with regard to the Minister of Finance during his term as Minister of Home Affairs that it requires a substantive motion. So, we wait for resubmission thereof and we will process it.

### NOTICES OF MOTION

Adv B T BONGO: Hon House Chair, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the ANC:

That the House-

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

# Page: 242

debates strengthening government, private sector and labour partnership in attempting to address the country's unemployment challenges.

Thank you.

Mr H M HOOSEN: Hon House Chair, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the DA:

That the House-

debates the excessive guarantees and bail outs given to the state-owned enterprises in the light of the recession and continuous downgrades.

I so move.

Ms E N NTLANGWINI: Hon House Chair, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the EFF:

That the House-

#### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

## Page: 243

notes that since our arrival in Parliament 2014, we have called on this House to intervene; wrote letters to the Minister and rose the matter at every opportunity on the Apla political prisoners to be released; and

calls on the House to debate the continued imprisonment of the Apla political prisoners.

I so move

Mrs M C C PILANE-MAJAKE: Hon House Chair, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the ANC:

That the House-

debates social cohesion and nation-building in the context of peace, humanity and equality we must jealously promote towards final liberation and development of our beautiful country.

I so move.

# NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

# Page: 244

Mrs S J NKOMO: Hon House Chair, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the IFP:

That the House-

debates the poor train services that have left many commuters stranded and led to destruction and looting of public property.

I thank you.

Mr S C MNCWABE: Hon House Chair, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the NFP:

That the House-

debates ways in which the South African economy can be put on a path of recovery to mitigate the impact of inevitable further credit downgrades.

Thank you.

# NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

## Page: 245

Ms V BAM MUGWANYA: Hon House Chair, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the ANC:

That the House-

debates promoting inclusive growth and employment creation towards a prosperous South Africa.

Thank you.

# IsiXhosa:

Mnu N L S KWANKWA: Somlomo ohloniphekileyo, besele ndicinga ukuba unomkhethe, ndenza isaziso sokuba, xa le Ndlu ihlala kwakhona, ndiza kwenza isiphakamiso egameni le-UDM:

Sokuba le Ndlu-

ishukuxe umba wezothutho ezikolweni (scholar transport) eMpuma Koloni nakwamanye amaphondo nokunqongophala kwemali urhulumente asilelayo ekuyikhupheni.

### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

# Page: 246

Enkosi.

Ms H S BOSHOFF: Hon House Chair, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the DA:

That the House-

debates the increase in South Africa's unemployment rate to 20,7% the highest it has been in 14 years.

Thank you.

Mr Z R XALISA: Hon House Chair, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the DA:

That the House-

debates that every year winter storms and floods in the townships all over the country in particular in Cape Town destroying the homes of poor people in particular blacks and the so-called coloureds; and

### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

## Page: 247

calls on this House to debate a need for proper city planning that will bring the people closer to the work places and decent housing to eradicate this suffering.

I so move.

Ms N NDONGENI: Hon House Chair, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the DA:

That the House-

debates encouraging the youth to make meaningful use of all support and resources available at their disposal to improve their prospect and their advancement in the economy.

I so move.

Ms M F NKADIMENG: House Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the ANC:

#### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

#### Page: 248

That the House debates the government subsidy programmes which is focused and directed at meeting the needs of the most vulnerable households including the orphans, the aged and the disabled. Thank you.

Mr S M JAFTA: House Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the AIC:

That the House debates the role of the Truth and Reconciliation Commission units located within the Departments of Justice and Correctional Services in implementing the recommendations by the committee on reparations and rehabilitation.

Mr W MAPHANGA: House Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the ANC:

That the House debates the strengthening the healthy system to ensure that it is efficient and responsive, and that it offers financial risk protection. I thank you, Chair. [Applause.]

# NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

# TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2017

## Page: 249

Mr C H H HUNSINGER: House Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the DA:

That the House debates the shambolic state of affairs at the Metrorail and Passenger Rail Agency of South Africa, Prasa, and their failure to deliver a reliable service to thousands of commuters.

Ms B J MALULEKE: House Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the ANC:

That the House debates the recognition of traditional leaders as central to the deepening democracy, public participation and effective governance.

The House adjourned at 19:25.