

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 8 JUNE 2017

Page: 1

THURSDAY, 08 JUNE 2017

---

*PROCEEDINGS OF THE NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES*

---

The Council met at 14:05.

The House Chairperson (Ms M C Dikgale) took the Chair and requested members to observe a moment of silence for prayer or meditation.

**ABSENCE OF MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION**

(Announcement)

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): I have been informed that the Whippery has agreed that there will be no notices of motion or motions without notice. Hon members, I have an announcement to make. I wish to announce that presiding officers were informed that the Minister of Public Service and Administration will not be able to participate in the debate. The Minister of Justice and Correctional Services is therefore acting on behalf of the Minister of Public

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 8 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 2**

Service and Administration. The hon members will notice that this is not the first time that we are having an acting Minister.

Another information is that, the hon members must not be surprised as the screens are not functioning at the moment, but the Information Technology, IT, people are busy fixing the screens. Though everything including our proceedings will be broadcasted. Thank you, very much. Let me take this opportunity and welcome the Minister as I call him on the podium. The hon T M Masutha, over to you, Sir. [Applause.]

**APPROPRIATION BILL**

Policy debate on Budget Vote 10 – Public Service and Administration:

The ACTING MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION (Adv T M Masutha): Hon Chairperson and greetings to colleagues of the NCOP and in particular members of the select committee, including the Chair and the Whip of the committee and of course echo the apology for the Minister concerned for whom I am acting today. Let me also indicate Chairperson that we have a bit of a dilemma because we will be voting on Schedules in the National Assembly, NA, whilst one is preoccupied this side on how we are going to manage.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 8 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 3**

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): My apologies, hon Minister, we were suppose to allow the Secretary to read the order of the day. Our apologies for that as you are already on the podium, you can continue.

The ACTING MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION (Adv T M Masutha): Chairperson, we consider this budget on a very special occasion when we celebrate the year of one of our stalwarts who has led the struggle for the liberation of this country, Comrade Oliver Reginald Tambo. Comrade Tambo dedicated his entire life fighting for the liberation of our country and its people. As South Africans, we are indeed indebted to the sacrifices made by Comrade Tambo and fellow freedom fighters for the democratic dispensation that our country now enjoys. It is in his honour that government has declared the year 2017, the Year of the Life and Legacy of O R Tambo.

The Constitution of the Republic of South Africa in 1996, envisages a public service that is professional, accountable and development-oriented. The National Development Plan, NDP, has identified specific steps that need to be taken to promote the values and principles of public administration as contained in the Constitution. These principles are central in the building of an

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 8 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 4**

efficient, effective and development oriented public service as part of a capable and developmental state.

The Department of Public Service and Administration will continue with the responsibility for co-ordinating and reporting progress to Parliament on the implementation of the Service Delivery Agreement for Outcome 12, which is, an efficient and effective and development-oriented public service. This role also requires the department to be more hands-on with regard to monitoring the application of and compliance of norms and standards through soft and hard policies that are developed by the department, collaboratively with implementing line departments as expected for inclusive policy-making.

Hon Chairperson, the Department of Public Service and Administration has, through the revision of the 2016 Public Service Regulations, which came into effect on 1 August 2016, managed to tighten up all the regulatory instruments and now is gearing up to full-scale implementation in this financial year.

The department has also, in the past financial year, revised the Organisational Functional Assessment, OFA, Tool in line with the provisions of the new regulations. Organisational Functional

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 8 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 5**

Assessment Tool is a holistic organisational performance evaluation instrument to diagnose weaknesses in implementing public service related process based on the Department of Public Service Administration's norms and standards. The OFA Tool measures effectiveness whilst the Productivity Measurement Tool measures efficiency within departments.

In order to have effective service public service machinery, we needed to ensure that we root out corruption in the public service. The 2016 Public Service Regulations stipulates clearly that public servants may not conduct business with any organ of state or be a director of a public or private company conducting business with an organ of state. An organ of state is any institution that delivers services for public good, but exception was made for persons teaching at universities. Public servants were informed accordingly that they should cease doing business with organs of state or resign from the public service.

In order to ensure compliance with these regulations, we matched the Central Supplier Database, CSD, information as at March 2017 with persal data, which is government's payroll system and a total number of 11 516 public officials were found to be registered on the CSD and could effectively therefore be in a position to perform business

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 8 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 6**

with an organ of state. As at the end of February 2017 and for the period of 3 October 2016 to 28 February 2017, a total of 2 536 employees, who were registered on the CSD, have subsequently resigned from the public service.

We further issued two directives to assist with the implementation of the regulations. The first directive is on Other Remunerative Work Outside the Employee's Employment in the relevant department. The directive clarifies that although employees may obtain permission for remunerative work outside their employment, such permission shall not be used as a basis for conducting business with an organ of state, as these are entirely different provisions.

The second directive is on conducting business with an organ of state was approved to clarify the definition of an organ of state and excluding certain activities at universities. These policies and regulations will ensure that we continue to build a professional public service its people with integrity.

We are pleased to report to this House that on 19 May 2017, we revived the National Anticorruption Forum as one of the measures we are undertaking to promote an integrity public service. The forum is made up of government, business and civil society organisations with

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 8 JUNE 2017

Page: 7

a sole purpose of co-ordinating sectoral strategies to fight against corruption. We trust that through this forum, we will curb the scourge of corruption in our society because working together, we move South Africa forward.

Hon Chairperson, the budget for the portfolio of the Ministry for the Public Service and Administration for the financial year 2017-18, is distributed as follows: The Department of Public Service and Administration - R456 919 million, the Public Service Commission - R245 664 million, the National School of Government - R160 506 million and the Centre for Public Service Innovation - R34 055 million.

[Interjections.]

No, it is because they repeated the figures in words and thus just making my reading a bit wobbly. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon Minister, do not listen to them. Order, hon Mokgosi, oh sorry, hon Koni.

[Interjections.]

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 8 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 8**

The ACTING MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION (Adv T M Masutha): Thank you very much, hon member. May I proceed.

Before this august House, we undertake to utilise the allocated budget to ensure that we enhance service delivery to our citizens. As a portfolio, we have already embarked on numerous community engagements as part of our outreach programmes, not only to keep our fingers on the pulse by inspecting the level of service delivery, but also to ensure that public servants are also equipped to perform their duties and listening to what their needs are.

On 28 April 2017, the Minister for the Public Service and Administration hon Ms Faith Muthambi undertook community engagements in Meloding, Matjhabeng Local Municipality in the Free State province. On 5 May 2017, the Minister engaged with the community of Umhlabuyalingana in KwaZulu-Natal and to further strengthen the service delivery mechanisms. [Interjections.]

Ms T J MOKWELE: E re [Say] I launched.

The ACTING MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION: Minister Muthambi launched uMnini Thusong Community Centre in KwaZulu-Natal.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 8 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 9**

The Deputy Minister Ms Dipuo Letsatsi-Duba held community engagements in Khayelitsha in the Western Cape on 12 May 2017.

It is through these community engagements that as a portfolio, we are able to identify service delivery challenges and also, identify areas where public servants need to be assisted to carry out their responsibilities. Through our feedback mechanisms, we will be going to these communities to monitor progress on the challenges identified both by the community and in some instances amongst public servants.

Hon Chairperson, through the Department of Public Service and Administration, hands-on support was provided to the provinces in Limpopo, North West, KwaZulu-Natal and Gauteng, to develop some of the building blocks with regard to operational management.

A web-enabled system was developed to serve as a learning platform and is accessible by all provinces. The system avails the full Operational Management Framework, OMF, and methodology, toolkits and videos to assist partner departments. Furthermore, it serves as a discussion forum for topical OMF related matters which assist the departments in enhancing their performance. At the end of 2016, all provinces were invited to the Service Delivery Implementation Forum

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 8 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 10**

held in KwaZulu-Natal, where amongst others the OMF was showcased and presented.

The expectation now is that the Centre for Public Service Innovation will assist in designing systems of government departments onto electronic platforms going forward, so as to assist in the implementation of the norms and standards set by the Department of Public Service and Administration.

In order to strengthen compliance with the eight Batho Pele Principles, in line with the government's Medium Term Strategic Framework, the Department of Public Service and Administration has developed Batho Pele standards which were designed together with six national Departments namely, Basic Education, Health, Human Settlements, Labour, Social Development and Transport. Pilot projects are in progress with all six departments and recently inspection visits were completed with labour offices in the Free State, Gauteng and Limpopo provinces using these standards.

The Department of Public Service and Administration also conducted the capacity-building workshops for the national and provincial departments on Complaints and Compliments Management Framework, where over 50 service sites in the health, police, social

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 8 JUNE 2017

Page: 11

development and labour sectors were visited to inspect and advise on improvement initiatives.

Hon Chairperson and hon members, the National School of Government, NSG, is mandated to provide training in order to empower public servants with the required skills as this will ensure efficient delivery of services to our people. The continuous learning and training of public servants is critical to achieving the ideal public service as envisaged in the National Development Plan, NDP, and critical role to provide and facilitate the provision of training to public servants.

In August 2016, the NSG entered into a five-year Memorandum of Understanding, MoU, with the SA Local Government Association, Salga, to collaborate on areas of capacity-building in local government. The MoU also provides for collaboration in, *inter alia*, public lectures and or leadership platforms for reflection, utilising local and international experts, targeting mayors, councillors and top leaders in local government and induction programmes for councillors and senior management to promote the narrative of back to basics in municipalities.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 8 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 12**

Through the MoU, the NSG will deliver accredited portfolio-based programmes to improve governance and the imperatives of the National Development Plan in the local government. Both the NSG and Salga will collaborate in research and knowledge creation and dissemination relevant to the mandates of the two parties.

The National School of Government, in the context of its constitutional and legislative mandate to train and develop public servants, manages in collaboration with provincial and sectoral academies, relevant Sector Education and Training Authorities, SETAs, the Department of Public Service and Administration, the Department of Higher Education and Training, the Department of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs and the Human Resources Development Council of South Africa, HRDCSA.

The PSTF has positioned itself as the main networking platform utilised by more than 1 000 practitioners who come from all the three spheres of government to learn new knowledge, share information and exchange best practice of the HRD matters. Through this forum, the NSG convene the biannual national PSTF conference to interact with trainers and HRD officials to deliberate on how the ideals of the NDP could be advanced through training for service delivery.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 8 JUNE 2017

Page: 13

Let me conclude, by once again presenting this budget policy statement to yourselves colleagues and on behalf of the Minister of Public Service and Administration, Minister Muthambi on a note that says that as the ANC we are clear about our mandate. We are committed to the values of our Constitution, but above all our people come first. Through service delivery we will continue to ensure that the lives of our people continuously improve for the better. I thank you, very much. [Applause.]

Mr J M MTHETHWA: Chairperson, hon Minister, NCOP delegates, members and distinguished guests ... [Interjections.] ... the debate ... [Inaudible.]

Ms N P KONI: I'm going to tell your congregation!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon Mthethwa, order. Hon Koni, please remember Rule 31. You are not allowed to converse aloud. Thank you. Continue, hon Mthethwa.

Mr J M MTHETHWA: The debate on Vote No 10, the Department of Public Service and Administration, marks another milestone in the evolution of our public service. It marks another era of effort towards a results-based public service. It marks a call for an outcome-

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 8 JUNE 2017

Page: 14

orientated public service that recognises the challenges facing our young democracy. It is equally another opportunity to echo ...

[Interjections.] ... a call to us ending the scourge of corruption in the public service and efforts towards ethical leadership.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon Mthethwa, please take your seat. What is the point of order?

Ms T J MOKWELE: I would like to check whether pastor would be willing to take a question.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon Mthethwa, are you willing to take a question?

Mr J M MTHETHWA: No.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): He's not ready. Please continue, hon member.

Mr J M MTHETHWA: It signals a call on all of us, all hands on deck, to make the year of our illustrious son of the soil, our leader and stalwart, Oliver Reginald Tambo, another year in which together we sold re-dedicate ourselves through our collective efforts to strive

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 8 JUNE 2017

Page: 15

towards a true public service, dedicated to serving the people of South Africa.

Notwithstanding the ravages of our economic landscape, and the resultant socioeconomic imbalances in people's lives, we are called upon to wake up, renew our collective and individual efforts to transform South Africa into a true democratic, nonracial, prosperous country, in which everybody is able to make an honest living.

For this we are all called upon to embrace the true character of Oliver Tambo and all of our forebears who sacrificed their lives for a South Africa of our dreams.

Ms T J MOKWELE: Halleluja!

Mr J M MTHETHWA: At the heart of this dream is a nonracial public service where all citizens are called upon to make their mark by working together to achieve integration, functional co-ordination, co-operative government, collaboration and sound intergovernmental co-operation in the delivery of services to our people.

This, of course, can be realised when all of us in the service of our people are willingly embracing our fiduciary responsibility of

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 8 JUNE 2017

Page: 16

establishing, maintaining and managing our public service through a system of government and governance that acknowledges public accountability good governance, and collective efforts in managing and leading with system thinking.

The Department of Public Service and Administration is equally central to all government effort in the public service transformation value chain which now has evolved for over two decades, striving towards achieving a united, single public service capable of delivering sustainable, efficient services across the three spheres of government by all state organs for the general good of the citizenry.

The challenge of efficiently implementing Vision 2030 up to the year 2063 through the National Development Plan, NDP, as the government's policy agenda for public service delivery, is at the centre of a developmental state. [Interjections.]

The Department of Public Service and Administration is a ... [Inaudible.] ... driver of public service efficiency, responsible for the overall delivery and monitoring of the implementation of key strategic priorities for the whole of the South African public



UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 8 JUNE 2017

Page: 17

service and which, when successfully implemented, would mean that, as a sovereign constitutional democracy, all sectors ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Order, hon Mthethwa.

Mr J M MTHETHWA: ... and state institutions are delivering on ...  
[Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Order, hon Mthethwa.

Mr J M MTHETHWA: ... on the government's mandate.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon Mthethwa, please take your seat.

Ms N P KONI: Stop undermining us, mfundisi!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon Koni, why are you standing?

Ms N P KONI: I can't address you until the member at the podium has taken his seat.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 8 JUNE 2017

Page: 18

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Okay, he has now taken his seat.

Ms N P KONI: Thank you very much.

*Setswana:*

Ke lebogela tshono e Modulasetulo. Ke ne ke botsa gore a leloko mo seraleng mole, le ka tsaya potso ya gore o ikutlwa jang ...

*Sepedi:*

MODULASETULO WA NGWAKO (Moh M C Dikgale): Aowa mohl Koni, o ka se e dire taba yeuwe. [Tsenoganong.] O ka se e kgone yeo taba. O a tseba ... aowa, aowa ... hle mohl, o a tseba gore re swanetše re mmotšiše pele gore o a dumela naa, pele o tšwela pele ka potšišo ya gago. Dula fase, mma. Dula fase. Re a leboga.

*English:*

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon member, are you ... Hon Faber, please take your seat. I will give you a chance to speak

Mr W F FABER: Hon Chair, there is no interpretation.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 8 JUNE 2017

Page: 19

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Oh, there's no interpretation? Please, let's ask them to help us with the interpretation. [Interjections.] Check channel 2 for English.

Hon Mthethwa, are you willing to take hon Koni's question?

Mr J M MTHETHWA: Not yet.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): He's not ready. Continue, hon Mthethwa.

Mr J M MTHETHWA: While the Department of Public Service and Administration provides an exhaustive list of its 2017-18 policy priorities for the entire South African public service, it must be stated clearly that it is the resolve of the government to develop and nurture a results-orientated public service that embraces good governance and accountability, a clean and corruption-free public service that represents the interests of a developmental state across the three spheres of government and putting people first as a focal point that challenges all of us to work together co-operatively towards the achievement of the government's common goal to strive towards a true public service dedicated to serve the people of South Africa. [Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 8 JUNE 2017

Page: 20

The Department of Public Service and Administration ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon Hattingh, please don't be out of order. Allow the member to continue with his speech.

[Interjections.] You are!

Mr J M MTHETHWA: This alone further challenges ... [Laughter.] ... us to embrace intergovernmental co-operation across the three spheres of government, working together to achieve synergy, integration, co-operation, government [Inaudible] co-ordination and co-operation in delivery of services.

In terms of the budget, the department has for 2017-18 financial year been allocated an overall budget of R897,1 million. This represents an increase of 15% when compared with the 2016-17 allocation, which stood at R779,9 million. [Interjections.]

It is vitally important that the current year's budget for the department reflects an upward trend, signifying a developmental budget for the growing transformation needs of the public service of a developmental and transformative state.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 8 JUNE 2017

Page: 21

The Pam Act, the Public Administration Management Act, Act 41 of 2014 is central to a series of innovations aimed at bringing the public service in line with the requirements of the Constitution. Beside the constitutional requirements, it is equally crucial for government to create ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon Mthethwa, please take your seat. Hon Essack?

Mr F ESSACK: With due respect, Chairperson, through you, the speaker at the podium said something about the perm act. Could you just check with him to explain to ... I don't get the perm act. [Interjections.] No, seriously, I don't understand the perm act. Perhaps we could just get some clarification through you, Chairperson.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon Essack, please take your seat. You are allowed to use this if ever you don't hear well what he is saying. Please. English is on channel two. Thank you. Continue, hon Mthethwa. [Interjections.]

Mr J M MTHETHWA: Besides the constitutional requirement, it is equally crucial for the government to create an environment whereby

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 8 JUNE 2017

Page: 22

the South African public service is able to compete globally using a number of rating scales. It should thus be appropriately positioned to effectively play its role in complementing the work ...

[Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon Mthethwa, please take your seat.

Ms N P KONI: You are undermining me, hon Mthethwa.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon Koni?

Ms N P KONI: Chairperson, you know, I stand here traumatised. I'm only standing up because this thing is repeating itself. Somewhere this week when hon Mthethwa debated, he was leaning on the podium, and I'm worried that he will end up falling. He will either get hurt or he will end up hurting the ... [Inaudible.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon Koni, take your seat. You are out of order. Allow the hon member to continue with the debate.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 8 JUNE 2017

Page: 23

Ms N P KONI: Sorry, Chairperson, it's just the trauma that ...

[Inaudible.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): No, you are out of order!

Continue, hon Mthethwa.

Mr J M MTHETHWA: Thank you, hon member.

In conclusion ...

An HON MEMBER: Thank you!

Mr J M MTHETHWA: ... I join all concerned South African in their fight against the abuse of women and children. [Interjections.] Together, as responsible South Africans, we are challenged to call for stern and stringent action against the perpetrators of violence and crime in our society. All those pursuing acts of violence, crime and murder of innocent lives, should stop killing their fellow brothers and sisters.

Lastly, the Budget Vote of the Department of Public Service and Administration and its Annual Performance Plan for 2017-18 financial year is accordingly supported and it is hoped that, during oversight

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 8 JUNE 2017

Page: 24

of performance of this department, Parliament in both Houses will witness ... zeal ... zeal ... zealous effort towards achieving and realising the dreams all our leaders died struggling for.

In 1965 ... [Interjections.] ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon Mthethwa, please take your seat. Hon Gaehler, on what point are you rising?

Mr L B GAEHLER: Chair, I just needed clarity about Zille.

[Laughter.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon Gaehler, please take your seat. You know you are out of order. You can't do that.

[Laughter.] Continue, hon Mthethwa.

*IsiZulu:*

Mnu J M MTHETHWA: Sihlalo, ngowe-1966 kuleli Phalamende leli lakithi eNingizimu Afrika, owayewuNdunankulu umsunguli wobandlululo uDokotela uVerwoed wahlaselwa walinyazwa wafa ekuleNdlu.

*English:*



UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 8 JUNE 2017

Page: 25

I want to warn these people who come up here and think that they can do as they wish, that one day will be one day! Thank you.

[Interjections.] [Applause.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Order, hon members! Order! I see two hon members standing. Hon Mokwele and hon Michaelakis, hon Mthethwa is no longer at the podium. Why are you standing, hon member? Let me start with hon Mokwele first. I will come to you, sir. [Interjections.]

Ms T J MOKWELE: I'm rising on a point of order.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): A point of order? The hon member is ...

Ms T J MOKWELE: So you are not going to take it? Even if he threatens us? You are not going to take it?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon member, your point of order ... there's nobody who is going to ... [Interjections.]

Ms T J MOKWELE: How do you know? [Interjections.] Because, yesterday, you ruled against me. You! I want to get it from you, hon

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 8 JUNE 2017

Page: 26

Chairperson, that you are not going to note what hon Mthethwa has just said about threatening people, about killing people. Is that what you are saying? I just want that from you. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon member, did he say he's going to kill the people?

Ms T J MOKWELE: No, it's a threat! He said Verwoerd was killed. Other people, they think ... [Interjections.] ... and he said one day will happen. [Interjections.] And you heard him very well. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): I am listening to hon Mokwele, hon Koni.

Ms T J MOKWELE: I just want to hear from you, Chair ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Okay, okay. I heard you. Will you take your seat, then?

Ms T J MOKWELE: What are you going to do about the statement that hon Mthethwa has just made, threatening Members of Parliament?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 8 JUNE 2017

Page: 27

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Are you done?

Ms T J MOKWELE: Anyway, I'm not scared of him.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Are you done?

Ms T J MOKWELE: But I just want you to tell me. I'm not scared.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Can I tell you now?

Ms T J MOKWELE: Tell me.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Please take your seat.

Ms T J MOKWELE: I'm taking my seat, and you must address it.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): I want to address you. That is why I am requesting you to take your seat.

Hon Mokgosi, hon Dlamini, hon Goni, hon Dlamini ... [Interjections.]

[Laughter.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 8 JUNE 2017

Page: 28

Ms N P KONI: Chairperson, this thing of Mokgosi, Mokgosi in this House, is wrong! It's unparliamentary. [Laughter.] There is no Mokgosi in this House. Please, Chairperson ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon Koni, I heard you. Please take your seat.

Ms N P KONI: Because, you know, I'm afraid that these Konis will go to my parents and ask for their lobola back! [Laughter.] Please, Chairperson.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Our apologies, hon Koni. Hon Mokwele, you are very correct. Let me go and apply my mind to that one and come back with a ruling, because that is totally out of order. [Interjections.] It is totally out of order, but I want to come back with a ruling.

An HON MEMBER: No!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): What is "no"? Hon Mokwele ...

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 8 JUNE 2017

Page: 29

Ms T J MOKWELE: With due respect, Chair, what mind are going to apply? Hey? What mind?

*Setswana:*

Ke raya gore ke tlhaloganyo efeng e o tlileng go e dirisa?

*English:*

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): I want to come back with a ruling!

Ms T J MOKWELE: What mind are you going to apply?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): I will come back with a ruling, hon member.

Ms T J MOKWELE: Why are you not ruling now, because the member is here!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): The Rules allow me to come back to the House with a ruling.

*Setswana:*

Mme T J MOKWELE: Bothata ba go dira katlholo mo selong se ke eng?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 8 JUNE 2017

Page: 30

*English:*

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): I have told you, hon member ... [Inaudible.] This is totally out of order. But I will come back with a ruling.

Ms T J MOKWELE: I want you again. This is for the third time. I'm saying, you can do whatever you are doing, Mthimunye ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): No, leave him. You are protected, hon member.

Ms T J MOKWELE: You can do whatever you want to do. I'm keeping this on record again. It is for the third time, that EFF ...

*Setswana:*

... ga e itumelele mokgwa o o tsamaisang Ntlo ka teng.

*English:*

Ms T J MOKWELE: This is for the third time in two days that the rulings are not consistent. I'm going to keep this on record and I'm going to take a step as the EFF. Please note that.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon Michalakis?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 8 JUNE 2017

Page: 31

Mr G MICHALAKIS: House Chairperson, it is the second time in two days that a member of the governing party has, not just in the House, but over a microphone, in your presence, threatened other members of this House.

I find it very disturbing that you can't make a ruling immediately if you hear such threats. Because, if you hear them and you don't rule, it means that you don't have the will to rule. If you hear them and you don't hear them, it means that you are not paying attention on that seat.

I would be more than happy to give you a Rule Book, but if you want to sit in that chair, you are supposed to protect all of us. If a blatant threat is made over a microphone and you do not rule on that, then you are, with all due respect, a sorry excuse for a presiding officer.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Thank you very much, hon Michalakis. Hon Mthethwa, will you please stand up and withdraw the threat you have just made in the House ... [Interjections.] ... that one day is one day. You said ... [Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 8 JUNE 2017

Page: 32

Hey! Hon members! Hon members! [Interjections.] Hon Mthethwa! Hon Mthethwa ... okay ... allow me to continue with the ruling.

[Interjections.] Please take your seat, hon Dlamini. Take your seat, hon member. [Interjections.] Please take your seat, hon Dlamini. I will come back to your point of order. I am still dealing with the hon member now.

Hon Mthethwa, please listen to me. You made a statement that the hon Verwoerd was killed in this House and you continued by saying that one day is one day. So, I want ... The hon members are not satisfied about that. They feel that it is a threat. So I want you to withdraw the threat. [Interjections.]

Mr J M MTHETHWA: I don't think that they are satisfied by the speech I delivered. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): No, no, no! [Interjections.] The only part that you said when you were concluding your ... Hon member, please make your life easy. Withdraw. Withdraw that threat.

Mr J M MTHETHWA: Why?



UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 8 JUNE 2017

Page: 33

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Because it is not parliamentary. [Interjections.]

Mr J M MTHETHWA: I never threatened anybody. [Interjections.] I never threatened anybody. [Interjections.] If I did call somebody, he must stand up and say, you said this to me. I never threatened anybody! [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): You did not mention a name but you said it will happen in this House. [Interjections.] Please withdraw that.

Mr J M MTHETHWA: I never said that would happen. Go and consult Hansard. [Interjections.] Go and consult Hansard. Then come and rule. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Okay. Hon members ... [Interjections.] Hon members ... [Interjections.] Order! Order, hon members! [Interjections.] Order, hon members!

Hon Mthethwa, can I then request you to repeat what you said about Verwoerd?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 8 JUNE 2017

Page: 34

HON MEMBERS: No! No! No!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): I am ruling! You gave me a chance to rule! [Interjections.] Let him repeat! [Interjections.]

Ms N P KONI: [Inaudible.] If we refuse to ... [Inaudible.] ... you take us out. [Inaudible.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Please, hon Mthethwa ... please withdraw! [Interjections.] Hon Mthethwa, please withdraw your statement. [Interjections.]

Hlalani phansi, comrades! Sit down, hon members! [Interjections.]

Hon Mokwele! [Interjections.] Hon Mokwele! [Interjections.] Hon Mokwele, please take your seat! Can I deal with ... can I finish with the hon Mthethwa? [Interjections.] I asked the hon members to take their seats. I don't know why they are standing. Hon Labuschagne, please take your seat. Take your seats, hon members! [Interjections.] Hon members, take your seats! [Interjections.]

I have already made a ruling. I asked hon Mthethwa to withdraw the statement. [Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 8 JUNE 2017

Page: 35

An HON MEMBER: You have been instructed by the Chair to ...

[Inaudible.] You are not special!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Take your seat, hon member!

Hon Mthethwa, I'm asking you for the last time ... will you please withdraw those words because the members are not ...

[Interjections.]

Mr J M MTHETHWA: I'm not guilty, so I will not withdraw.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): You're not? [Interjections.]

Can you please give me a chance to chair this ... Hon Mthethwa, you are refusing to withdraw. Will you please leave the House?

[Applause.] Thank you very much.

Let us continue with the debate. Hon Engelbrecht? [Interjections.]

Oh, before hon Engelbrecht, honourable ... let me ... Hon Hattingh

... no, allow the member to leave the House, please. Hon Hattingh!

[Interjections.] Don't listen to him! [Interjections.] Don't listen

to him! Leave the House, hon Mthethwa. [Interjections.] Hon

Mthethwa, please, don't degenerate this House! [Interjections.] Hon

Mthethwa, don't degenerate this House! Go out, hon Mthethwa!

[Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 8 JUNE 2017

Page: 36

Let me recognise the hon member ... [Interjections.] Please take your seat, hon member! Hon Engelbrecht, take your seat.

Let me recognise ... [Interjections.] Hon members, I am done with the ruling. I'm requesting you to take your seats because we want to continue with the speakers' list of the day, unless you are rising on a new point of order. [Interjections.] It's a new one? [Interjections.] Let me allow you then.

Ms C LABUSCHAGNE: Thank you, Chair. I appreciate the fact that you ruled in the end on not only what is unparliamentary, but on what is absolutely against the Rules of this House – unbecoming language and a threat in this House have never been allowed.

You ruled for the member to leave ... [Interjections.] You ruled for the member to leave the House. The member then stopped and made some other comments – “talking to this boer”. Now I am just informing you, Chair. I will personally lay a charge at the Ethics Committee on the conduct of this House and the members of this House.

Can you please make a ruling that all this kind of behaviour stops today, because we can also start doing all these kind of things. And then there will be nothing left of this House. Thank you.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 8 JUNE 2017

Page: 37

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Thank you very much, hon member. I am still going to make a ruling on what happened yesterday, at the end of our speakers' list. I will then come back with a ruling. I will combine what happened yesterday and today, and then we will continue.

Hon Faber, are you rising on a new point of order?

Mr W F FABER: Yes, Chairperson. Thank you for your ruling. I would just also like you to go back to Hansard on exactly what the member said. I think it was quite a serious threat that was made. I don't think this House can just leave it there. I think you should, when you have all the evidence recorded in Hansard, act upon that.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon Faber, you were here when I wanted to go back to Hansard and check everything, but the hon members insisted that I had to rule on the matter, and I did that. So, the hon member is out of the House. We are now continuing.

I saw your hand, hon member. You are fine now? Thank you very much. Continue with the debate, hon Engelbrecht.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 8 JUNE 2017

Page: 38

Ms B A ENGELBRECHT: Madam Chair, firstly I would like to take this opportunity to congratulate the Western Cape disaster for their immense effort that they took these past two days in saving lives. It was a terrible two days for this province and the immense effort that was taken by the disaster management fund. And then, our condolences go out to the people who lost their lives and to the people who lost their homes. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Order! Order, hon members! Allow the member to continue with the speech.

Mr E M MLAMBO: Chair, on a point of order, I don't think that it is correct for a member to congratulate a disaster!

Ms B A ENGELBRECHT: Madam Chair, obviously we need to get these people hearing aids because it is the disaster management fund.

The main objective of this department is to improve the effectiveness and efficiency of the public service by cultivating integrity and strengthening accountability in the public service.

This department is headed by the Minister Faith Muthambi, former Minister of Communications, who almost destroyed the SABC. Her

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 8 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 39**

track-record does not bode well for a department with a mandate to cultivating integrity and strengthen accountability. After 70 days in her position she is yet to attend a single portfolio meeting. She never even bothered to attend a two-day workshop dealing with her budget, and she is not here today - so much for strengthening accountability!

Unless I forget, she quickly hosted two imbizos valued at R1,3 million, so much for integrity! This money could have been spent on improving people's lives. Ten posts are allowed in the Minister's department, yet now they have 22 personnel, so much for improving efficiency! With a start like this for the Minister, I shudder to think what will happen to this department.

The mandate of the public sector is to improve the general welfare of society by delivering public goods and services to our people. To do this the public sector needs to be effective and efficient in fulfilling its responsibilities. This means maximum use of the limited financial resources.

Albert Einstein said: "Insanity is doing the same thing over and over again and expecting different results."

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 8 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 40**

South Africa's cabinet is one of the world's largest in comparison to its population, with a hugely bloated government and positions.

The Public Sector Wage Bill is one of government's biggest expenditure items, with more than R550 billion allocated to public sector wages for this financial year. This amounts to 36% of the budget. In 1994, the public wage Bill was only 5% of the total government expenditure. This has now grown to 13% of the total government expenditure.

Corruption in the public service has risen to endemic proportions with politicians and public officials diverting public funds away from service delivery into their back pockets. The former head of Special Investigation Unit, Willie Hofmeyr, in 2011 reported that between R25 billion and R30 billion was lost yearly to this type of fraud.

According to the Journal of Public Administration and Policy Research reforming the public sector has not been possible mainly as a result of political interference; unaccountable civil servants; noncompliance with reforms, and the overall decline in governance.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 8 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 41**

Our departments lack political will, not surprising since we have a President with a R215 million scandals where public money instead of being used for our people, has being used to upgrading his private homestead. Further the President is undermining the institutions to which he should be held accountable, by propping government positions with officials sympathetic to his cause and their own political ambitions. The leaked email saga has clearly shown how this country has been captured by the Guptas. The emails are evidence of the influence of the Gupta family on the Presidency and on government.

According to the Council for the Advancement of the South African Constitution, South Africa as a nation loses an estimated 20% of its GDP annually to corruption. Corruption in the public sector procurement process is one of the biggest challenges. In spite of legislative and regulatory frameworks, corruption delegitimizes these processes. This scourge continues unabated as the public purse is seen as a get rich scheme for those in public office.

Four years ago, the National Public Service Commission admitted that over 20 000 public servants had been charged with corruption. The education department revealed that 3 000 of its employees received government tenders with R153 million over the three-year period; and

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 8 JUNE 2017

Page: 42

in the health department, 235 employees benefited from government deals worth R42 million.

The Auditor-General indicated that government workers were linked to companies that benefited from tenders worth more than R600 million, and that 90% of the government's senior managers revealed that they have private investments or interest in companies doing business with the state.

Corruption steals from the poor, and it undermines service delivery and stifles economic growth. We must have economic growth to stimulate the Small and Medium Enterprises, promote employment and ensure that all South Africans have a quality life.

South Africa's economy is in intensive care. We have just slipped into a recession after our GDP declined to 0,7% during the first quarter of 2017 after contracting by 0,3% in fourth quarter of 2016. The loss of confidence in South Africa ... [Interjections.] ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Order, hon Mthimunye! Allow the hon member to continue. Hon Mthimunye, hon Mthimunye, hon Mthimunye, please don't be out of order! Continue, hon member. Hon Labuschagne, why are you standing?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 8 JUNE 2017

Page: 43

Ms C LABUSCHAGNE: I am standing on a point of order.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms. M C Dikgale): What is the point of order?

Ms C LABUSCHAGNE: Chair, the point of order is that we continue with the same kind of remarks that is going into apartheid ...

[Interjections.] Hon Labuschagne, with due respect, please I called the member on a point of order and now you are standing up ...

[Interjections.] hon Mthimunye, allow me to address the member! Hon Labuschagne, take your seat. Continue hon member.

Ms B A ENGELBRECHT: Thank you, Madam Chair. It is interesting that after 22 years of the ANC government this is what this report is about. And after 22 years the loss in confidence in South Africa is due to a culmination of political, social, and economic factors.

Under the ANC leadership, just in the past financial year, government spent altogether R35,2 billion on the services of consultants, travel and subsistence as well as catering and entertainment. Also, R9,2 billion was spend on travel and subsistence costs; 927,4 million - this is just last year - on catering, entertainment, and venue rentals. This government continues to waste money that should be spent on improving people's

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 8 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 44**

lives. [Interjections.] You are just scared of the truth, that's all.

At the end of 2016, the Auditor-General revealed that irregular expenditure in national and provincial departments had soared to R46,4 billion in the past three years. Just in the previous year, irregular expenditure increased by nearly 80%. Irregular expenditure is further incurred through the extension of existing contracts. According to the Auditor-General, where the principle amount of the contract is at R100 million for example, the extensions of the contract could end running into billions - this is from the Auditor-General. The audit results also found that 89% of the R46,4 billion of the irregular expenditure arose from procurements related to goods and services received.

According to the Auditor-General more than 3/4 which amount to 76% of departments and almost 40% of public entities financial health was rated as concerning or requiring intervention.

The past year which contributed to the highest irregular expenditure were as follows: Prasa about R14 billion; KwaZulu-Natal health department R2,5 billion; Gauteng human settlements department R2,3 billion; Gauteng roads and transport department R2 billion;

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 8 JUNE 2017

Page: 45

Mpumalanga health department R1,9 billion; the national Department of Water and Sanitation R1,7 billion.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms. M C Dikgale): The hon Mthimunye, hon Mthimunye! Awa man! No. hon Mthimunye, eh, eh, respect our rules! Hon Labuschagne, please take your seat. Hon Dlamini why are you standing?

Ms L C DLAMINI: Chair, I am sorry it is not directed to her. It is a point of order, is it parliamentary ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): What is the point of order? Order, Hon Essack! Allow the hon member to speak, hon Essack! Hon Essack you are out of order! Continue hon Dlamini.

Ms L C DLAMINI: Chair, is it parliamentary for a member to say if you are black - it is a racist comment - you are allowed to steal?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms. M C Dikgale): Hey! I can't even what the hon member is saying! Hon Mokwele! Allow her to say what she wants to say, hon Mokwele! Continue mom.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 8 JUNE 2017

Page: 46

Ms L C DLAMINI: Chair, my point of order is: is it parliamentary for a member to say that if you are black, you are allowed to steal? That is the hon Labuschagne.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms. M C Dikgale): because I did not hear that, let me check with the hon member. Hon Labuschagne, did you say that? Did you say what the hon Dlamini says you have said?

Ms C LABUSCHAGNE: Chair, I did not say if you are black you are allowed to steal, but I said: Do you think if you are black you are allowed to steal? That is what I said.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms. M C Dikgale): Then, hon Dlamini? Okay, but is ... [Interjections.]

Ms L C DLAMINI: So, she said ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms. M C Dikgale): Hon Mokwele! Hon Mokwele! Hon Mokwele, please! Hon Dlamini, I asked her and she said she did not say that. And there is nothing I can do because it is not recorded on the Hansard.

Ms T J MOKWELE: She did say, it is a racist remark.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 8 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 47**

Ms B A ENGELBRECHT: Chairperson, to determine the root causes of the consistent public sector failures, research was done using the AG findings over a nine-year period and three key recurring problems were identified. Firstly, transparency and accountability is critical and the AG uses the term qualified audit opinion. This is a negative measure and not something to be celebrated, used to assess whether or not public sector institutions are executing financial management practices according to recognised standards in an adequate and effective way. If the root causes of poor financial management are not addressed, qualified audit opinions will continue to occur.

Secondly, resource optimisation issues which indicates that personnel have been appointed to positions for which they have either limited or no experience and where poor performance is not - I apologise - is not being taken seriously.

Thirdly, compliance issues indicate no or very few consequences when regulations are contravened. If these problems are not addressed at their root causes, noncompliance may soon become a norm in the public sector environment and possibly part of its culture.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 8 JUNE 2017

Page: 48

Of concern is senior officials' nondisclosure of financial interests. Not only does this finding suggest public officials disregard for ethics; it also describes an environment that may be conducive for wrongdoing, fraud and corruption.

As civil society expectations rise and public sector challenges become increasingly severe, public sector institutions need to find mechanisms to overcome their current operational bottlenecks and process problems. Minister, let's see if your bloated department is up to the challenge.

If you are not up to the challenge, the voters will remove this ANC government that has repeatedly shown that it has no respect for utilising public money, and considers public money as a get-rich-quick scheme. As the DA has demonstrated in the areas where we govern, we are transparent and we use public money responsibly and ethically. South Africans deserve more, we all deserve a public service that is ethical, value-driven and fights corruption. I thank you.

Ms N P KONI: Six minutes, please Chairperson.

HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Okay! If ... [Interjections.]



UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 8 JUNE 2017

Page: 49

Ms N P KONI: My time is my business!

HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Start with your speech, hon member. It will be set.

Ms N P KONI: Eish, you know: I don't want you to confuse me.

HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): I will give you your six minutes.

Ms N P KONI: Okay. Hon Chairperson, we do not understand why the Minister was not made a Minister Without Portfolio if Mr Zuma is that desperate to include her in his cabinet. The same way we did not have faith in her when she was a Minister of Communication, yes we had all the reasons after the destruction the Minister caused in that department and at the SABC.

We can only wait for the destruction and chaos to come to this department. We say so because everywhere you go, the Minister leaves a trail of destruction. Where there was faith and hope when she arrives, by the time she is gone there is nothing but mistrust and misery. What an unfaithful Minister! But let's deal with much more

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 8 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 50**

substantial and policy matter, which we have raised since our arrival in Parliament.

Hon Chairperson, in January 2017, the University of Witwatersrand announced that it would start insourcing contract employees. The salary of outsourced workers who earned below the minimum wage was increased to R4 500 in January. The University of Cape Town have insourced all workers, more than 1 000 who were previously outsourced as security guards, cleaners, caterers, gardeners, and drivers.

They are all now employed with medical and pension benefits, and their children will be treated the same way a professor child will be treated. .A daughter of a gardener will get free education because a parent is an employee of the university. A son of a cleaner will get free education because a parent is an employee of the university. This is a trend that will be spread across all other universities.

The EFF Student Command will not rest until all university workers are insourced ethically and with dignity. However, we are not debating Higher Education today; we are debating Public Service and Administration. We stand here as the EFF to put forward a much more

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 8 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 51**

sustainable and financially sound proposal of how to build efficient public service. Government must take a lead in fight against outsourcing, and not be led by university when government is supposed to be a leader of society.

Government departments, provincial departments, municipalities and state-owned entities outsource basic functions worth billions every year. Thousands of workers are employed by companies and subcontracted to government, creating a network of corrupt unnecessary and middleman layer of ANC cronies who get these tenders but pay these workers like slaves.

It is time that all of government in all spheres start employing people and we must do away with contracting, outsourcing and acting. In most departments officials are acting. We are tired of actors and actresses in departments. Cleaners, gardeners, drivers, plumbers, artisans and all other workers currently outsourced must form part of public services. They must benefit from medical aid, pension and housing subsidies.

All workers must have full-time jobs, 20 working days a month and a minimum of 42 hours a week with paid leave. If the ANC is serious about socioeconomic radical transformation from a public service

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 8 JUNE 2017

Page: 52

reform, this is the most logical and practical manner to be radical and transformative. The EFF rejects this Budget Vote.

Chairperson, the unbecoming language of this House: Members being called dogs; members being called black rubbish; terrifying threats; lobbying of Minister from the very same podium where I am standing is very wrong. It must start within the ANC.

To the Chief Whip: Just last week I was praising you and so happy that this House will go somewhere. Your seat is hardly warm but already you are inconsistent and biased. You must remember that you are not a Chief Whip to the ANC only; you are Chief Whip to all parties in this House. At least it is still soon, it has not been long that you have been in that sit. You must be very careful; we will remove you like we put you there. I thank you very much.

Mr M D MONAKEDI: Hon Chairperson, hon Acting Minister for Public Service and Administration, hon members, the director-general and senior management of the department Ladies and gentlemen this year, we celebrate the birth and legacy of a South African struggle icon, Oliver Reginald Tambo, a selfless compatriot and a leader of our struggle for freedom. We celebrate the legacy of O R Tambo and pay homage to him by remembering the words he left us with in his quest

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 8 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 53**

to see South Africa free when he proclaimed and I quote, "It is our responsibility to break down barriers of division and create a country where there will be neither whites nor blacks, just South Africans, free and united in diversity".

The ANC's commitment to building a non-racial, non-sexist, united, democratic and prosperous society remains guided by the Freedom Charters call that and I quote,

"The People Shall Govern; all people shall be entitled to take part in the administration of the country; the rights of the people shall be the same, regardless of race, colour or sex; and all bodies of minority rule, advisory boards, councils and authorities shall be replaced by democratic organs of self government."

The goal of the ANC since its formation has been to give all the people of our country, the chance to choose their own government. The apartheid government was always been used to harass, divide and humiliate the great majority of South Africans, while securing privilege and relatively high standards of service for the minority. This resulted in the ANC's call for a Constitution that guarantees a high quality of government service for all, as articulated in the 1992 'Ready to Govern' ANC policy guiding document. The 'Ready to

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 8 JUNE 2017

Page: 54

Govern' calls for a public service that must be based on the principles of representivity, competency, impartiality and accountability.

The ANC has also envisaged a public service that is non-racial and non-sexist in its character, comprising of personnel that are well-trained, disciplined, humane and loyal to the Constitution. It envisaged a public service that is drawn from and serves the interests of the people as a whole. This was reaffirmed by the Reconstruction and Development Programme, RDP, of the ANC which called for a public service that reflects the gender and racial composition of South African society and that all public service institutions must develop more efficient systems of delivery.

The RDP states and I quote,

People from groups that were previously excluded from the public sector should be employed to ensure that all our people are fairly represented. There should be training and support for these people. The number of staff employed in the public sector should match the need to deliver services to the people. There will be codes of conduct for all government officials. These codes will set the standards of professional service that all South Africa's

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 8 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 55**

people expect from the public sector. Training will ensure that public servants are able to serve people effectively.

Prior to 1994, the public service in South Africa was thus characterised by a poor quality of services, a low skills base, inefficiencies, a lack of commitment and no respect for citizens. In addition, the public service lacked transparency and accountability, providing space for abuse of power and corruption, which indeed started at that time. The ANC has fought to ensure that these balkanised apartheid-era institutions are amalgamated into a single democratic, non-racial system. South Africa's first democratic government inherited a fragmented, unaccountable and racially divided governance system in 1994. Post-apartheid, since 1995, the public service has engaged in the process of transforming itself into an efficient, effective, democratic, fully representative, development-oriented, people-driven and people-centred instrument of service delivery.

To this end, the country's governance landscape has changed significantly since 1994. The publication of the White Paper on the Transformation of Public Service by the ANC government, served as a point of departure for the transformation ... Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 8 JUNE 2017

Page: 56

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon Mokwele; please!

Mr M D MONAKEDI: ... of the public service. The Constitution of the Republic of South Africa as adopted in 1996 provided the foundations for building a democratic and inclusive state and is hailed indeed, as one of the most progressive in the world. Apartheid laws were repealed and a Bill of Rights enshrined in the Constitution, guaranteeing all citizens' socio-economic and human rights.

Furthermore, in the first decade after the transition to democracy, the ANC government focused on restructuring, intensive policy development and comprehensive legislative reform, including ...  
[Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon Koni, you can't do that and you know.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: Hon Chairperson, I am just rising to remind the House that this is a convention that the member is making a maiden speech. It is an uninterrupted speech. So, I appeal that we really stick to that Rule. Thank you.



UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 8 JUNE 2017

Page: 57

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): My apology hon members. I should have made mentioned that the hon member is rendering his maiden speech. So thank you very much hon Koni.

Hon Mokwele, why are you on your feet?

Ms T J MOKWELE: Actually, I was congratulating him.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Okay. Thank you for the congratulations, but you are interrupting. Take your seat.

Mr M D MONAKEDI: Furthermore, in the first decade after the transition to democracy, the ANC government focused on restructuring, intensive policy development and comprehensive legislative reform, including the wholesale revision and modernisation of the legislation governing the public service. New legislation introduced during this period includes the Public Service Act, PSA, and the Public Finance Management Act, PFMA, as well as the Municipal Systems Act, MSA, and the Municipal Finance Management Act, MFMA. This legislative reform process was largely completed by 2004, and since then the focus has shifted to improving and accelerating implementation.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 8 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 58**

The extension of access to basic services such as water, electricity, education, housing and social security has been a major achievement of the post apartheid era. However, despite this dramatic expansion, access to quality services remains uneven. These disparities result from apartheid spatial and governance systems, compounded by institutional weakness in some provinces and municipalities.

It was against this back drop that the 2002 National Conference of the ANC highlighted the need for cadres to actively build a developmental state, capable of implementing the objectives of our National Democratic Revolution, NDR, including the creation of a better life for all, addressing the legacy of apartheid colonialism and patriarchy, and acting as the driving force for socio-economic transformation.

Furthermore, the 2004 Election Manifesto of the ANC promises better co-operation among national, provincial and local governments with integrated planning, monitoring and evaluation, and a common system of public service. This was further emphasised by the 2007 National Conference of the ANC which resolved and I quote,

The creation of a single public service initiative will:

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 8 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 59**

- a) enable administration in all three spheres of government to be organised and to operate in ways that ensure efficient, quality, collaborative and accountable service delivery to promote social and economic development for the people of the Republic;
- b) enhance service delivery through flexible structures that enable and promote operational and front-line integration, innovation by means of amongst others electronic government, human capital and talent management, managerial accountability, performance and people-orientated service culture; and
- c) further enhance service delivery through systematic information and knowledge management and collaboration between institutions within and across spheres of government as well as between those spheres and private and development sectors.

The idea of a single public service by the ANC is to have the machinery of state across the three spheres of government strategically aligned and harmonised to complement one another so as to more effectively fulfil the goals of the developmental state and in particular, the pressing and urgent service delivery needs. A public service and local government administration with harmonious systems, conditions of service and norms would reduce fragmentation

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 8 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 60**

and promote more efficient co-ordination between the different spheres of government. The single public service would also promote mobility of staff between the spheres thereby facilitating optimal deployment of skills and allocation of functions.

In addition, a single public service is aimed at creating a common ethos of service delivery across the three spheres inspired by the basic values and principles of public administration as enshrined in Chapter 10 of the Constitution and the Batho Pele principles.

While the ANC government has come a long way in transforming the machinery of the state to better address the challenges facing the public service, it recognises that more still needs to be done to confront numerous challenges of unevenness in service delivery, which requires a collaboration between all sections of society and effective leadership by government. As the ANC, we support this budget. Thank you very much.

Ms T WANA: Hon Chairperson of the NCOP, Chief Whip of the NCOP, hon Mohai congratulations, Acting Minister of the Public Service Administration, permanent delegates of the NCOP, distinguished guests and members of the media, good afternoon. Let me congratulate the people of our country for taking a resolution of adopting the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 8 JUNE 2017

Page: 61

Freedom Charter which today is 62 years of old. Oppression was designed to exploit the masses of our country. Before the adopting of Freedom Charter black people were suffering and their properties were taken from them by the ruling system of the apartheid.

Last month was a month of the workers of the world united in protecting their lives and efforts by doing bargaining chambers for better salaries and benefits. This month is the month of the youth people but as South Africans we are surrounded by the wounds of exploitation where our youth was gunned down in Soweto in 1977 by the apartheid regime. We salute those youth who died for us because their spirit is still fighting with the spirit of demons of counter-revolution which were stated by Frederick Engels in his book written, *Revolution and Counter-revolution* about the revolution in Germany in March 1850.

Let me make some short corrections so that the public must know the truth. Just talk the truth to the power. During the negotiations in 1994 there were clauses that the ANC could not defeat on the table, because it is a caring organisation. As a result, all the departments which were very economical were occupied by the white people. That is why it was 5% because the black people are the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 8 JUNE 2017

Page: 62

majority in this country. We do not regret the discipline of Nelson Mandela and of those who were negotiating for our democracy.

*IsiXhosa:*

Bantu bakuthi nezikumkani ndiyayivuyela into enisuka kuyo ezilalini kuba nina niyayazi ukuba umntu okhulele etyotyombeni akafani nomntu okhulele kuronta. Kaloku umntu okhulele kuronta ulala engatyanga kodwa okhulele etyotyombeni utya le nto kuthiwa yibhisto. Ngoko ke izimilo azinakuze zifane.

*English:*

The ANC is here as a caring government more especially to the poor and we are doing that. We are declaring this year as the year of O R Tambo; long live the spirit of O R Tambo. He was born in a very remote rural area in Mbizana but he managed to serve the international world with humbleness, discipline and dignity. As a result today we are enjoying because we defeated the autocratic apartheid racist regime, hence today we are talking to our oppressors.

Yesterday the ANN7 News bulletin headlines read as follows: DA is a hypocrite.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 8 JUNE 2017

Page: 63

Mr F ESSACK: Hon Chairperson, on a point of order: With due respect to you, myself being also a product of apartheid, I hear that the speaker ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms. M C Dikgale): Why are you standing hon Essack? On what point are you standing?

Mr F ESSACK: I am standing on a point of order.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms. M C Dikgale): What is the point of order, then?

Mr F ESSACK: Will you allow me to speak?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms. M C Dikgale): Yes please, put your point of order.

*IsiZulu:*

Mnu F ESSACK: Thula, ngiyakhuluma.

*English:*

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 8 JUNE 2017

Page: 64

What I am saying is that the speaker on the podium says she is speaking with her oppressors currently. Now, I am kind of lost. I mean what oppressors?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms. M C Dikgale): Hon Essack, please take your seat. That is not a point of order. You were supposed to ask if ever she is willing to take a question because that is a question and not a point of order.

Ms T WANA: Chairperson ...

Mr F ESSACK: Then on a point of order, through you. Through you, will the speaker on the podium take a question?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms. M C Dikgale): You failed on a point of order. Let us ascertain if she would want to take a question. Are you ready to take a question?

Ms T WANA: No, because he is delaying my time.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms. M C Dikgale): He is not ready, take your seat.



UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 8 JUNE 2017

Page: 65

Mr F ESSACK: You mean she is not ready?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms. M C Dikgale): She is not ready, take your seat. Thank you, for correction.

Ms T WANA: On the ANN7 News Bulletin there was a writing that said: DA is a hypocrite and they were saying they would no longer support ANN7 and a *New Age* Newspaper. I asked myself on who is fooling who? Who is fooling who? Today DA is saying they are opting out to support ANN7 and the *New Age*. I pity those people who think that the DA will bring anything nearer because everybody is saying in 2019 they are going to rule.

Our own are still fighting even if they are not here with us in terms of the flesh but their spirit is with us because we are standing here on their shoulders. The National Development Plan, NDP, highlights the needs of the effective ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms. M C Dikgale): Order, hon Wana please take a seat. Hon Essack, you are on your feet why?

Mr F ESSACK: Hon Chairperson, on a point of order and with due respect, the Order Paper says Public Service and Administration

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 8 JUNE 2017

Page: 66

Appropriation Bill No-5. This is what the debate is about. I am not sure which debate the hon member on the podium is talking to.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms. M C Dikgale): Thank you, please take your seat. Hon Essack, that is not a point of order. Allow the hon member to continue with the debate.

Ms T WANA: Chairperson, for the sake of peace and progress I want to make Essack to be on par. The DA speaker who was discussing here was even talking about issues of the economy. So, he must open his ears when the DA is talking here. I am not far from what he said. Public sector department has got a disciplinary structure where all the public servants of the state are disciplined.

*IsiXhosa:*

Ngoko ke ncedani zinkosi musani ukuza apha nifike nithethe into engoyonyaniso.

*English:*

Other opposition parties are so economical in truth. I do not know. If you mention that the composition of the public service in 1994 was 5% of white people it is because it was 5% of white illiterate white people. You cannot take, in this current situation, a person

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 8 JUNE 2017

Page: 67

because he is more experienced without credentials. The credentials are the first requirements when you want to employ a person. So, let us not stand here and grandstand about what the ANC is doing.

I really want to talk to the department to implement the integrated finance management system because it is crucial in addressing the challenges of the persal system. They must also consider monitoring and evaluating the vacant posts in all the provinces. The ANC is saying we must create jobs and they must not act against the manifesto.

The department must also monitor the youth learnership, internship and artisans so that after the youth has been trained they are able to get positions and acquire experience.

*IsiXhosa:*

Namhlanje kumnandi kuba i-ANC isibeke kule ndawo sikuyo kwaye wonke umntu uzingela ephethe ityiwa. Xa uza kuzingela uphethe ityiwa uyingozi kuba kaloku ungaze utye nenkukhu kuba awusazi esona silwanyana ekufuneka usityile. [Kwahlekwa.] Kuyo yonke loo nto yokuzingela niphethe ityiwa ingathi thina bantu be-ANC aza kufika ama-2019 singekho. Ukanti ke thina singurhulumente okhathalayo kwaye thina asibuzisi. Phaya emakhaya ezilalini bayayazi ukuba umntwana

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 8 JUNE 2017

Page: 68

ophikiweyo ngumfana uyayinikwa imali yokuba atye kwaye umntwana uyaya esikolweni nokuba ukhulelwe. Namhlanje ingathi inyaniso ayikho kuba banoxanduva lokuhamba nabantu kodwa abangeni kwinkomfa. Njengokuba abantu abantsundu bebaleka emva kwe-DA nje abangeni phaya kwela qoqo liphezulu (federal) lolawulo lwe-DA. Enkosi [Kwaphela ixesha.] [Kwaqhwyatywa.]

The ACTING MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION: House Chair, let me recognise the presence of the NCOP Chair, the Chief Whip, all the chairpersons present and hon members once again. Earlier on, the Minister of Finance articulated the budget proposals of government that we have presented this year. Amongst the achievements that were mentioned in that debate was the fact that when the ANC-led government took over in 1994, we have a total national budget of just about R100 billion.

Today, we have grown that budget to approximately R1,5 trillion. In those two decades, we have achieved the extension of access to social security to all poor and vulnerable children of South Africa up to the age of 18 as defined in the Constitution. I recall, when I headed legal service at the Department of Social Development back in 1996 and was privileged to write the law that introduced the Child

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 8 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 69**

Support Grant at the time, not a single African child received social security.

Today, over 14 million poor children in this country, predominantly African: Are able to go to school with their stomachs full because there is school nutrition; and they are not thrown out of school because they don't have uniform or because their parents cannot pay school fees. An ANC-led government indeed has fulfilled its promise to the people of this country. We have millions of families in South Africa having access to free housing that we provide to the poor, unknown anywhere else on this continent.

Today, access to health care services in this country has resulted in a significant improvement in the survival rate of children as well as improving life expectancy of our people in a significant way. We rolled out anti-HIV and Aids programmes through treatment and testing. These have ensured that today our people no longer succumb to disease and they are able to live a full life.

Ms Zille, this morning on ANN7 tries to explain herself and she says, " I have been misunderstood. I did not say I celebrate ..." - to paraphrase her - "... colonialism. I am talking about the legacy of colonialism, that not everything was bad about it"

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 8 JUNE 2017

Page: 70

Well, let's tell her something: It is precisely the legacy of colonialism that today continues to explain the poverty, unemployment and the inequality that our society is reeling under. Ms Zille does not understand what we are talking about. She is lost, and it's so sad that she somebody who is a Premier of a whole province which is characterised by high levels of inequality.

You go to Khayelitsha! You go to Mannenburg! You go to any coloured or African township! Poverty, the social breakdown and the levels of crime because of the underlying socioeconomic conditions speak for themselves. What have you achieved in over a decade that you have been in power in the Western Cape, DA, other than continuing to sustain a white homeland? You sustain it as the last outpost of an apartheid-run territory. You are actually advancing the apartheid policies effectively.

You are calling our people refugees in a country of their birth. What does that mean? It is worse than insight. It is outright racism. I wonder if she would sustain with those kinds of utterances the day the new law that outlaws hate speech and hate crimes comes into effect. She might just qualify to be the first person to be charged under that new law. Thank you very much Chairperson.

[Applause.]

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 8 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 71**

**UNPARLIAMENTARY LANGUAGE**

(Ruling)

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon members, I want to make a ruling on the point of order raised by the hon Mohai, hon Labuschagne and hon Ngwenya yesterday on 7 June 2017, during policy debate on Budget Vote 17: Social Development. During the policy debate on Budget Vote 17: Social Development, both hon Chief Whip and hon Labuschagne rose on points of order against remarks made by the hon Mokwele. Hon Ngwenya also rose on a point of order on the same matter.

I have noted that the points of order relate to matters raised when members were in private discussion, though we are all aware that Presiding Officers are not privy to the private discussions between members as our focus is on the speaker in the podium.

Notwithstanding this, the conducts of the member sometimes result in the disruption of the House.

What then disrupted the House was that members heard the hon Mokwele say:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 8 JUNE 2017

Page: 72

You know this white man! This white man must not tell me that I am wasting time. This white man must never! Yeses, I white person telling me? Yeses! A racist white person telling me to sit down; I will never! He must never tell me!

The issue is that there are two members to consider: Firstly, the behaviour of the hon member; and secondly, the language used in the House. My analysis is that members are aware of their constitutional rights to freedom of speech in the Council and its committees. Similarly, members should also be aware that the right is limited by Council Rule 46(a), which provides that: No members may use offensive or unbecoming language in the House.

In keeping with the decorum of the House, members are required to afford each other mutual respect by referring and addressing one another in a respectful manner. Referring to another member as 'this man', or 'this white man', or 'a racist white person' is disrespectful and offensive.

I am mindful of the mitigating argument made by the hon Ngwenya that hon Mokwele may have been provoked and that we may not be aware of what hon De Beer had said to the hon member. It is however what hon



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**THURSDAY, 8 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 73**

Mokwele had said and the type of conduct she displayed that goes against the decorum of the House.

Hon members, there is a procedure to be followed if one member feels aggrieved by the conduct or utterances of another member. There is no doubt that if hon Mokwele had opted to follow that procedure, the Presiding Officer would have been able to attend to and address the matter. Unfortunately, hon Mokwele chose to display the behaviour, not only unbecoming on the decorum of the House but also of her position as a public representative.

Members will recall that there have been rulings in this House on calling another member a racist. I wish to reiterate that it is not parliamentary to call another member a racist, regardless of the situation or context. I therefore rule that the conduct and the language used by hon Mokwele were not in keeping with the decorum of the House. In fact, it is unbecoming and unacceptable. Hon members will recall that yesterday I requested the hon member to withdraw from the House. Therefore, this should be a last caution to the members.

Debate concluded.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

THURSDAY, 8 JUNE 2017

Page: 74

The Council adjourned at 15:51.

UNREVISED HANSARD