

UNREVISED HANSARD  
NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES  
WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017

Page: 1

WEDNESDAY, 07 JUNE 2017

---

**PROCEEDINGS OF THE NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

---

The Council met at 14:01.

The Chairperson took the Chair and requested members to observe a moment of silence for prayer or meditation.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon members, I have been informed that the Whippery has agreed that there will be no notices of motion or motions without notice, except for the motion on the Order Paper.

We now come to the motion on the Order Paper as printed in the name of the Chief Whip.

**GRANTING OF LEAVE OF ABSENCE FOR HON YC VAWDA**

The Chief Whip of the Council, moved: That the Council, notwithstanding the provisions of Rule 17(1) of the Rules of the National Council of Provinces, grants Hon. Y C Vawda leave of

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 2**

absence from proceedings of both the Council and committees of the Council in terms of Rule 17(2) until the honourable Member is ready to resume his duties.

IN FAVOUR: Eastern Cape, Free State, Gauteng, KwaZulu-Natal, Mpumalanga, Northern Cape, North West, Western Cape.

Motion accordingly agreed to in accordance with section 65 of the Constitution.

**APPROPRIATION BILL**

(Policy debate)

Debate on Budget Vote No 14 – Basic Education:

The MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION: Chairperson, let take this opportunity to thank you for the Debate on Vote 14 on Basic Education.

Chairperson, allow me to start by raising our serious concerns as a sector, about the violent service delivery disruptions which continue to take place across our country. What is more concerning

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017

Page: 3

to us, is when schools are used as bargaining chips by the aggrieved communities out there. These violent protests, which in most instances have nothing to do with education, do rob our learners of countless school hours, days and scarce resources. We urge everybody to collectively work with us to protect and deliver on our children's rights to basic education.

Again, Chair, let me add my voice to the voices out there that are condemning the violence that is meted out on women and children. What is nerve-racking is the ferociousness that the latest victims had to endure. And we believe that South Africa will never be the cohesive society that espouses the values of *Ubuntu* we all yearn for, when such atrocious acts continue to be committed. We wish to applaud those members of civil society, especially the courageous young men, who stood up and decried the recent spate of violence we are faced with. We must all join these young men in their declared stance, "Not in my name".

Last month, Chair, as South Africa and the African continent, we also commemorated Africa month. In South Africa, we did this, guided by theme "The Year of OR Tambo: Building a Better Africa and a Better World." Surely as proud South Africans, the young and the elderly, we must agree with Kwame Nkrumah, when he said "I am not

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017

Page: 4

African because I was born in Africa; but because Africa was born in me." We must equally agree with President Thabo Mbeki who proclaimed on 08 May 1996 on the occasion of the adoption of the Constitutional Assembly of the RSA that "I am an African".

Therefore, in all of us, as South Africans, we must understand and embrace the reality that xenophobic attacks and hatred on our African brothers and sisters can easily be an artefact of the past. We have a responsibility to teach our children about the History of Africa.

Chairperson and hon members, during this month of June we commemorate the centenary of the stalwart, the teacher, the internationalist, the unifier, the visionary, the leader, Comrade Oliver Reginald Tambo; and in tandem with the commemoration 41st anniversary of the 1976 Soweto uprisings. The South Africa that the mass democratic movement and the Youth of 1976 fought and some sacrificed their lives for, is indeed *the* non-racial, non-sexist, united and democratic society, in which black and white, rural and urban, young and elderly, rich and poor South Africans live and work together in conditions of peace and prosperity.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 5**

Chairperson, in 2015, United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization, UNESCO, adopted the global education agenda: Education 2030. The global education agenda is part of the seventeen United Nations' Sustainable Development Goals, SGDs, that make up the Agenda 2030 for sustainable development. SDG 4 calls for an inclusive, quality and equitable education and lifelong opportunities for all.

Our very own world-renowned Constitution, which marked its 21st anniversary this year, declares basic education as an inalienable basic human right for all South Africans. Therefore, the Constitution, UNESCO, SDG 4, the Continental Education Strategy for Africa on the African Agenda 2063, the National Development Plan, NDP, and our own Action Plan 2019, all provide the moral imperative and mandate for government to improve access, redress, equity, efficiency, inclusivity and quality of our basic education system.

Chairperson, we have reported widely and repeatedly on our achievements as a sector, especially on access, redress and equity. We have indeed opened the doors of learning for all South Africans. We are now increasingly prioritising interventions, policies and strategies that target improved quality of learning and teaching,

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 6**

and we are implementing accountability systems to ensure that quality outcomes in the basic education sector are achieved.

We are of the strong view that the internal efficiency of the system and quality basic education outcomes will be achieved through specific and deliberate interventions especially in the early grades. This, we are doing because research has shown that the major root causes of dropping out of school towards the end of secondary schooling - in the main - are weak learning foundations in the early Grades. Therefore, the most important priority must be to improve the quality of learning and teaching, so that we can ensure improved quality outcomes in the early grades. It is through this pointed focus that learners in the foundation phase can be equipped with the skills needed to cope with the curriculum requirements of the higher grades.

Chairperson, we can report with pride that the effects of our interventions in the Foundation Phase are beginning to result in improved learning outcomes. The skills of learners are continually improving; the rigorous and widely respected international testing programmes are showing an upward swing. I will illustrate these assertions a bit later.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 7**

Chairperson and hon members, Budget Vote 14 we are presenting, is marked by a consolidation of our work, and on guiding and deepening learning and teaching in the classroom.

The total allocation for the 2017 Medium Term Expenditure Framework, MTEF, period for provincial education departments totals R717 billion, which represents an average increase of 7,1% from the equivalent allocation for the 2016 MTEF period. Specifically, the 2017-18 total allocation for all our provincial education departments stands at R223,8 billion, which shows an increase of 4,9% from last year's allocation. Hon members and members from provincial legislatures will give more details in this regard.

Chairperson, we have been closely monitoring whether provincial education departments are achieving the predetermined norm of the eighty to twenty split between Compensation of Employees, CoE, allocations versus the other line budget items. For the 2017-18 we have observed that six provinces have achieved this norm. For instance, Gauteng is leading at the lowest of 74,1%; followed by the Western Cape at 74,6%; then the Northern Cape at 76.1%; the North West at 76,9%; the Eastern Cape at 79%; and the Free State at 79,2%. Only three provinces, Mpumalanga, Limpopo and KwaZulu-Natal, KZN,

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 8**

still have not been able to achieve the eighty to twenty split that we have recommended to provinces.

Chairperson, the 80% of CoE threshold is critical, to at least enable provincial education departments to procure the requisite goods and services, such as Learner Teacher Support Materials, LTSMs, Information Communication Technologies, ICTs, infrastructure, but also to be able to allocate or transfer funds to schools in terms of the thresholds determined in terms of the norms and standard for the funding of schools. And we want to congratulate these six provinces and urge the other provinces to move in that direction.

At the outset Chairperson, I must state that within provincial education departments, we know that there is an effective and accountable management and leadership, good performance and functionality which are guaranteed. Even the Auditor-General has pronounced that, any traceable lack of leadership is the main contributor of underperformance and dysfunctionality. And this is the reality of any sector. Organisational culture lies at the heart of much of the dysfunctionality that we see frequently during our oversight visits, whether it is at school, circuit, district or provincial level.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 9**

Chairperson, the NDP states that South Africa needs to have established a state that is more capable, more professional and more responsive to the needs of the citizens. And in addition, the NDP notes that the unevenness in state capacity and capability leads to uneven performance in local, provincial and national government. It is within this context, the Department of Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation has been implementing the Management Performance Assessment Tool, MPAT, in order to facilitate and support reforms in the areas of management practices and leadership. We have noted similarities between the findings of the MPAT and the Auditor-General.

Chairperson, we wish to remind this House that the Provincial Treasuries in the Eastern Cape and Limpopo had taken over the financial responsibilities from the Eastern Cape and Limpopo Departments of Education in terms of section 18 of the Public Finance Management Act, 1999. But we're also excited to note that after the visit by the Select Committee on Finance, they received a very satisfactory report on the progress made in the Limpopo Department of Education, to an extend that the Limpopo Provincial Treasury may withdraw in July 2017.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 10**

Chairperson, we wish to remind this House that the Provincial Treasuries in the Eastern Cape and Limpopo had taken over the financial responsibilities from the Eastern Cape and Limpopo Departments of Education in terms of section 18 of the Public Finance Management Act, 1999.

Chairperson, the 2017-18, overall budget allocation for the Department of Basic Education, DBE, is R23,4 billion, which is an increase of 5,1%.

The allocations for the five Basic Education Programmes, are aggregated as follows: we have been allocated R416,3 million for administration; R1,9 billion for Curriculum Policy Support and Monitoring; R1,2 billion for Teacher Education Human Resource and Institutional Development; R13,2 billion for Planning Information and Assessment; and R6,3 billion for Educational Services. Those are funds which have been allocated.

For Conditional Grant Allocation we have been allocated R20,1 billion, which is going to go to Mathematics, Science and Technology; Infrastructure delivery, both Education Infrastructure Grant, EIG and Accelerated School Infrastructure Delivery Initiative, ASIDI; the National School Nutrition Programme; HIV and

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 11**

AIDS; and we're excited as a sector that we have been allocated a new grant for Learners with Profound Intellectual Disabilities, because that's an area that we've been extremely weak in.

Funza Lushaka has been allocated R2,4 billion, which it is going to share with the National Education Collaboration Trust, NECT, Workbooks, ICTs, Operation Phakisa, and the new programme called, the Early Grade Reading.

Chairperson, the fact that the 2017 budget has increased from last year's budget by 5,1% and by 4,9% thus confirm that the ANC-led government is committed towards education as its utmost priority.

Chairperson and hon members, we had earlier argued that the basic education system is on the upward trajectory. Progress in the sector has been confirmed by the recent cycles of regional and international assessment studies. The results of recent regional and international studies: the fourth Southern and East African Consortium for Monitoring Educational Quality, SACMEQ IV, and Trends in International Mathematics and Science Study, TIMSS, respectively show that the performance of South African learners is improving, symptomatic of a system in an upward trajectory.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 12**

Chairperson, at the national level, we will only focus on National Senior Certificate, NSC; I don't have time to give you all the details around SACMEQ and also TIMSS, but we will post the full presentation or the full speech in our website.

At the national level, we will only focus on National Senior Certificate, NSC, examination, and the 2016 NSC examinations in particular. The Class of 2016 was the ninth cohort of learners to sit for the NSC examinations, and the Class of 2016 recorded the highest enrolment of Grade 12 learners in the history of our country.

Without going into details about the performance of our learners, districts and provincial education departments, it should suffice to remind this House that for the past six years we have recorded pass rates which have consistently been above the 70%.

The numbers of candidates who qualified for admission to Bachelor studies, candidates who attained Diploma and Higher Certificate passes, and candidates who passed with distinctions have also increased dramatically. [Time expired.]

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 13**

Chair, let me thank you and the House also. The full speech will be uploaded on the website. [Laughter.] [Applause.]

Ms L L ZWANE: Chairperson of the Council, hon Minister of Basic Education, the Deputy Minister of Basic Education, hon members, special delegates from provinces, and also special guests in the gallery, let me take this opportunity to greet all of you and express my gratitude at this opportunity that I've been given to make a contribution to the debate of this very big and important department, which is the apex priority of our government in South Africa.

As a select committee, we have had an opportunity to engage the department on the annual performance plan, APP, and the strategic plan, and we have ensured that there is alignment with all the necessary instruments and tools. We were satisfied that the department is on the right track. We do want to thank the political leadership of the department, for we have always enjoyed co-operation when we come together to engage on issues pertaining to the department. In the unfortunate circumstance where we sit on a Wednesday, we have always had the presence of the Deputy Minister, hon Surty, who has been with us consistently whilst the Minister is attending to Cabinet issues. Deputy Minister, we do want to thank

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 14**

you for that. We also want to thank the director-general, DG, who has been very co-operative, as well as the entire delegation from the department.

Flowing from the Freedom Charter which envisioned that doors of learning and culture will be open to all, the Constitution of the Republic has prescribed that the citizens of this country have a right to quality education. Quality education can be provided within the context of a healthy school ecology which reflects the school's personality and unique character. School ecology is a powerful force and also a very important force that plays a significant role and influence on the school community, and it is interconnected with the values of the community that it serves. The distinctive features of a healthy school ecology would include, amongst others the following important features:

Firstly, the school is protected against unreasonable pressure from the community and parents;

Secondly, the principal and the entire school management team, SMT, are dynamic leaders that support staff while pursuing high academic standards, ensuring that the school's needs are met in terms of national policies;

Thirdly, the staff members tend to maintain a high standard of conduct and display initiative by setting high standards for learners, taking into account the learners' cultures, values, norms, religions and indigenous knowledge systems;

Fourthly, learners work hard and are highly motivated, and treat other studious classmates with respect;

Fifthly, resources and physical facilities are well maintained;

Sixthly, learner-teacher support materials are available and classrooms are equipped with teaching aids and suitable furniture;

Seventhly, staff morale is high and everyone is proud to be associated with the particular school; and

Finally, as education is a societal issue, there is always a high involvement of all the governance structures and parties concerned, and all the important stakeholders in the school's activities.

The product of this kind of school ecology is learners that are good and patriotic citizens, and who have what is called Ubuntu.

[humanity]

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 16**

We want to acknowledge the efforts of the Department of Basic Education in ensuring that, as prescribed by the Constitution, we deliver quality education within the limitations of the budget that is allocated. The Minister actually gave us the figures earlier on.

Firstly, during our visits we did take note of the fact that in the main infrastructure is being attended to. At some stage I remember the Deputy Minister said that there was a roll-out of about one school per week in the Eastern Cape under the Accelerated School Infrastructure Delivery Initiative, Asidi. We bear testimony to that because we have been there to conduct oversight.

In the main, learner-teacher support material has been delivered although there were qualms regarding the specifications and the quality that was delivered by some of the service providers, particularly in the Eastern Cape.

Textbooks have been delivered in the main but there are gaps. We have come across situations where there are textbooks that are stashed in storerooms of other schools whilst the other schools are suffering and they don't have the textbooks. A system whereby there is a rationalisation of the distribution of resources needs to be taken into consideration.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 17**

This government has ensured that in order to address poverty issues, an increasing number of schools are becoming no-fee schools, particularly in areas where there is poverty and areas are rural, and the economy is not that active in those areas. We have discovered that in most of the schools this government has ensured that there is school nutrition and learners get ...

Ms T J MOKWELE: I want to check whether the member is willing to take a question because she is giving us a report that she already gave us last year. So, are you willing to take a question please?

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Order. Hon Zwane, are you willing to take a question?

Ms L L ZWANE: I'm not willing ma'am.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: She's not willing ma'am. Please take your seat.

Ms L L ZWANE: Last year we did a Budget Vote; this year we are doing a Budget Vote. So I don't know what the difference is.

[Interjections.]

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 18**

We discovered that there is a skilled and capable workforce but we still live with a problem where in some of the schools there has to be programmes that are meant to capacitate the teachers to be able to dispense the curriculum.

We also discovered that the post provisioning norms, PPN, is beginning to normalise. Nonetheless, there are schools where the ratio is still very absurd, that is referring to the schools that we visited in KwaZulu-Natal in the Umzinyathi District.

We observed that there are study guides, video lessons, Mind the Gap study guides, new resources and subject advisory services. There was a problem where not all the subjects have subject advisory services allocated and there were constraints where they are not allocated enough kilometers to be able to run around the district and attend to the schools that they are allocated to.

During our oversight to KwaZulu-Natal province, we visited the following institutions: Mqamathi, Dlabesuthu, Dumaphansi, Bhekisizwe, Cabangokuhle, Fundokuhle, Emacityana, Mahlokohloko, Mpikayizekanye, Bathembu, and many others. I'm not going to be able to enumerate all of them.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 19**

We did pick up ... Let me maybe start at district level. The districts there had qualms about the fact that the powers are more centralised at the level of provinces and they are not delegated to the districts for them to be able to roll out the services as smoothly as they possibly can.

The second issue was a disjuncture that existed between the teacher unions and the provincial department of education where the unions complained about the fact that when they have reached agreements in the labour council and these agreements are supposed to be implemented, they don't get implemented by the provincial department of education. As a result thereof, the staff and the workforce get frustrated and there is professional burnout.

We also picked up issues pertaining to leave. With regard to teachers that are supposed to be removed from the system, it takes a long time for them to receive approval for boarding and therefore there is a problem in that they cannot be relieved of their duties. Learners suffer if a teacher is sick for a prolonged period of time and he is not removed from the system.

In other schools we discovered that there is a high rate of pregnancy. We know that it is an issue that schools cannot handle

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 20**

alone. This is why it is very important for parents and all other leaders of society to be directly involved in affairs relating to the school. The issue of parenting is critical. Parents need to have an interest in the lives of their own children. They also need to be directly involved in the education of their own children. They need to know what is happening at school. They need to know what is happening when the child leaves home up to the time that the child reaches school. The lack of parental involvement is really compromising us, because if we compare what is happening in urban and rural institutions you find that in urban institutions parents are much more interested in the education of their children. When meetings are called they attend. When teachers call on them to discuss the performance of children they are able to attend, even in the evenings. However, in rural areas there is a problem of parental involvement, even if meetings are called during the day. So we need to have programmes whereby we try to encourage parents and actually emphasise the importance of education for their own children.

Teachers cannot go it alone. In some of the schools there was a problem of faction fights in the Umzinyathi District. That issue cannot be resolved by the school principal or the SMT alone. It needs the traditional leadership in the area. It needs all the influential leaders in the area to come to the rescue of the

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 21**

institution and ensure that they put all their shoulders together in order to ensure that they resolve the problems in a manner that is not going to compromise the school.

I just want to go back a bit to this issue of teacher unions. As we speak there is a go-slow in Mpumalanga. The reason for the go-slow is that a certain amount of money from the budget was taken away, and therefore teachers are disgruntled and they have gone on a go-slow. That is why I am emphasising the fact that the Department of Education should by all means try to find some kind of co-operation and agreement. If there is disagreement, its okay but it should be disagreement that is known and accepted by everybody in the Labour Relations Council. However, as soon as an agreement has been reached it has to be implemented or honoured by the department.

The monitoring of the performance of schools rests upon the districts and therefore the capacitation of the management of districts is very, very important. I know that at some stage of our engagement with the Department of Basic Education the DG told us that the Minister has programmed engagements with the leaders of districts with a view to ensuring that she gets direct and first-hand information from the districts themselves in terms of what is happening there, and renders support and guidance. I say so,

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 22**

understanding very well that education is a concurrent function. The members of executive councils, MECs, are responsible for ensuring that quality education is delivered at the level of provinces. However, we all know that when things do not go well, people all look at national as if national should have been singularly responsible for ensuring that quality education is delivered. Provinces are there to ensure that they take the policies they implement and deliver quality education.

Lastly, hon Minister and Deputy Minister, the beautiful schools that we have built are going to dilapidate very soon if there is no budget for the maintenance of schools. We are going to be running around in circles. We need to have a maintenance budget to ensure that we at least keep the structures that we have given to our communities for a long, long time from now. Thank you very much.  
[Applause.]

Mr C HATTINGH: Chairperson, Minister, Deputy Minister, I think there is one thing that all of us here have in common with and that is the education system that South Africa can be proud of in which every child can attain the best that he or she can be.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 23**

However, what we have is an education system that at best can be described as captured, if the biggest single South African education problem is dissected and analyzed - lets call it by its name, the South African Democratic Teachers Union, SADTU.

According to recent communication by the Minister to the Human Rights Commission, it is clear that the "Jobs for Cash" investigation failed to address the root of the education crisis, the trade union problem. In this letter the Minister bemoans what she refers to as SADTU's "hardened" attitude to measures to improve education, accuses SADTU of using policy matters as "bargaining chips" to get its own way, talks of SADTU's "antagonistic approach", states that "she is disappointed with illegal SADTU strikes, boycotts and stay-always", and she singles out SADTU as the culprit in the so-called "Jobs for Cash" scandal.

It is therefore clear that the National Department of Basic Education, DBE, does indeed consider the actions of SADTU to be contrary to the goal of improving the quality of education available to South African learners ... [Interjections.]

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon Hattingh, please take your seat.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017

Page: 24

Ms T J MOKWELE: Hon Chairperson, I want to check with hon Hattingh that, can he really tell us how to run education whilst we are being failed by his department and his government before?

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: No, no, no, hon Mokwele that's not a point of order. You are debating ... [Interjections.]

Ms T J MOKWELE: But we are in this mess in education because of them.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP Hon Mokwele! That is not a point of order. Please, take your seat. Hon Hatting, please continue!

Mr C HATTINGH: That is an indication that the member did not attend to lessons in school. [Interjections.]

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: You are protected sir, continue.

Mr C HATTINGH: The Minister acknowledges that SADTU has held up the implementation of the very progressive Quality Management System, QMS, for years. The QMS provides a framework for performance evaluation, including self-appraisal by an educator, lesson



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 25**

observations, appraisal discussions, and scoring according to the QMS appraisal instrument ... [Interjections.]

Hon Mokwele: Will they be able to ... [Inaudible.]

Mr C HATTINGH: On 13 November, three years ago... [Interjections.]

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon Mokwele, don't drown out the speaker. Please continue, hon Hatting.

Mr C HATTINGH: Thank you madam. On 13 November 2014, the draft collective agreement on QMS was unanimously adopted by parties and circulated for signing by the parties to it. All parties, excluding the SADTU, have signed the agreement. SADTU wanted the employer to grant teachers an additional 0,5% pay increase before it signs the agreement. The Minister even indicated that SADTU's antagonistic approach towards employers has been an effective way of galvanizing support among union members.

Clearly, SADTU believes only the interests of its members are paramount, and will happily block measures that are in the interest of learners. SADTU maintains its opposition to performance agreements for principals to the extent that it has held up

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 26**

implementation of such an agreement for five years...

[Interjections.]

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon Wana, on what point are you rising?

Ms T WANA: Is the speaker ready to take a question?

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon Hattingh, will you take a question?

Mr C HATTINGH: I will if I have got time left at the end.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: He is not prepared right now. Please continue.

Mr C HATTINGH: SA Democratic Teachers Union maintains its opposition to performance agreements for principals to the extent that it has held up implementation of such agreements for five years. SADTU intimidates those teachers that do not agree with the Union's position. This has been particularly evident in the administration of the Annual National Assessments, ANA, measurement instruments that are crucial to identifying areas of weakness in the education system and guiding resources to address these weaknesses.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 27**

The Minister's acknowledgement of unlawful strike action by members of SADTU is significant and I quote: The past years have shown an increase in wildcat strikes at a provincial level, more especially in the Eastern Cape.

SADTU members have gone on strike without approval or notification and disrupted learning and teaching in the process. South Africa has the highest proportion of teaching days lost to strike action in the region according to a cross-sectional dataset from the Southern and Eastern Africa Consortium for Monitoring Educational Quality, SACMEQ.

Teachers reported greater absence due to striking than any other reason, and that South Africa has had a far higher loss of teaching time due to striking than the other 14 participants in the study. It is telling that the Eastern Cape is singled out as it is one of the provinces identified as particularly being under the control of the union. As the Ministerial Task Team Report on the alleged selling of educator posts, the so called Jobs for Cash Report, stated: "Where there is a balance of power between SADTU and other unions, such as in the Western Cape, neither union can behave as SADTU does in North West, Eastern Cape, KwaZulu-Natal or Limpopo."

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 28**

The Jobs for Cash Report stated that the Department of Basic Education has retained semblances of managerial and administrative control in only three of South Africa's nine provinces. These are the Free State, the Western Cape and the Northern Cape. In all other provinces, SADTU is in de facto control.

The Jobs for Cash Report makes urgent recommendations to the department including that the Department of Basic Education regain control of administering the education system in all provinces so that clear distinctions are established between the roles and functions of the DBE and the concerns of teacher unions.

Hon Minister, It is clear that you cannot lead the department to achieve this, to address the SADTU problem which now for years is hampering education and education outcomes in South Africa.

Likewise, the ANC cannot self-correct – even more so during the current bitter infighting that will continue ... [Interjections.]

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES: Hon Hattingh, please take your seat.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 29**

Ms L C DLAMINI: Chairperson, is it parliamentary that when we debating about the Department of Education, the hon member only speaks about SADTU?

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon Dlamini, there is nothing unparliamentary about making reference to SADTU. Please continue hon Hatting.

Mr C HATTINGH: I think, the only unparliamentary thing is that a senior member of this Council likes hon Dlamini not to understand the rules of this Council.

Let me repeat, likewise, the ANC cannot self-correct – even more so during the current bitter infighting in the run up to the December 2017 conference. The only solution for South African education lies in the post-ANC era which will be rolled out in 2019, reclaiming the captured education system from the self-serving SADTU.

Hon Chair, before I go, may I request that you perhaps see that hon Dlamini and hon Mokwele gets copies of the rules book of this Council.

Mr M M CHABANGU: Hon Chairperson, hon Minister ... [Interjections.]

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 30**

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES: Hon Chabangu, please wait a little bit. Hon Mokwele and hon Hattingh are exchanging sweets. [Interjections.] I have a member on the podium who must be respected. Order! Please continue sir.

Mr M M CHABANGU: Thank you Chairperson for protecting me. The Hon Minister, Dr Mamiki Mabuya, that I have hobnobbed with, protocol observed - you will never know her.

The EFF rejects Budget Vote 14 of the Department of Education. We have continuously raised in this Parliament our concern that our basic education system has not changed course since 1994. We still have two education systems in one ... [Interjections.]

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES: Mr Chabangu, please let me interrupt you sir. If you make noise in those benches I will kick you out. [Interjections.] Official benches. Please continue sir.

Mr M M CHABANGU: We still have two education systems in one: One is lilywhite, well-resourced and prosperous and the other one is pitch-black, under-resourced and forever in crisis.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 31**

Schools in rural areas, townships and farms which cater primarily for black and poor learners are littered with problems of underperformance and poorly trained teachers. To prove this point, in quintile one schools - that is the poorest - matric pass rate has dropped from 70,3% to 61,6% in the past 3 years in 20% of schools, while the matric pass rate in the wealthiest schools has remained consistently at between 91% and 92%.

As we have argued before, the department has done very little to stem the tide of dropouts in these poor schools. It is for this reason that only half of those who enter Grade 1 will write their Grade 12 exams, if nothing changes. Minister, this means that white children will continue getting access to good quality education while our own black children continue to be subjected to poor quality education, 23 years since the fall of formal apartheid.

There are many solvable causes for this if the department can get its house in order. These are:

Pervasive poverty, which makes it difficult even for the most capable of learners to focus productively on their school work; undue influence of South African Democratic Teachers' Union, SADTU, over the functioning of schools, to an extent that they have

practically taken over powers to even appoint teachers; poor planning and execution of existing plans which leads to such terrible deeds such as non delivery of textbooks in provinces like Limpopo and the Eastern Cape; deeply embedded corruption and ineptitude within the department, leading to employment of unqualified teachers to teach learners in rural provinces; and lack of content knowledge by the teachers of the very subjects they are meant to teach.

These problems require a comprehensive solution; one that will not be implemented by the Department of Basic Education alone, but must be led by it. This is what needs to happen to solve basic education problems in this country:

The department must lead a process to restore back the dignity of teaching. This must entail reviewing the salaries of teachers, to ensure that they are properly paid. It will also entail freeing the teaching profession from the corrupt tentacles of SADTU.

Secondly, there must be universal standards for quality basic education for all. This means that there must be the same norms and standards for school infrastructure, for learning and teaching



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 33**

support materials, for provisioning for pupils with disabilities across all schools - rural and urban.

There must be a comprehensive review of the funding model for schools. The current funding model promotes inequality; well to do public schools are allowed to charge school fees to make up for the inadequacy of government funding while poor schools are made to be no-fee schools. Quality of education must never be directly proportional to wealth, it must be universal.

Addressing the problems thoroughly will ensure that we tackle the basic education problems in a comprehensive manner, and we are not only fixated with matric pass rates, but with the quality of the education system in its entirety. Therefore, we reject this Budget Vote as EFF. Thank you.

Ms M L MOSHODI: Hon Chairperson of the NCOP, the Chief Whip, Minister of Basic Education, Mme Angie Motshekga, Deputy Minister, hon members and colleagues,

The ANC supports this Budget Vote. This debate takes just on the eve of the Youth Month, June, in which hundreds of the school children died for freedom and decolonised education.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017

Page: 34

The movement of the people said that the doors of education shall be opened. Indeed, those doors are open today, although resources to enrol these multitudes, who their Forefathers were denied access to, are still a stumbling block.

Hon Chairperson, we cannot shy away from the reality that South Africa's economy is stagnant today due to the high illiteracy rate we experienced years before liberation.

Should the former regime had a vision that education was a catalyst to economic prosperity of any nation or country for that matter, so many young black lives would not have been lost on the 16th of June 1976.

*Sesotho:*

Ha meya ya bona e robale ka kgotso.

The visionary leadership of the people's movement brought about a light at the end of the tunnel by developing a National Development Plan, a government long term strategy; it is clearly articulated on where the education system would have taken us in 2030.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 35**

Looking at the strategic plan of the department, six priority areas were identified, amongst which improving assessment for learning to ensure that quality and efficiency in academic achievement is key - this is highlighted by the concern raised in the strategic overview of the strategic planning of a high number of grade repetitions amongst boys in secondary schools.

It is also known to us that our maths and science standard are way below par than most developing countries. It is against this stumbling block that we will have to double our efforts in making sure that the Learner Teacher Support Material is appropriate and the schools nutrition programme is run properly to accommodate those from disadvantaged families.

Hon Minister, it is unacceptable that some schools still experience a shortage of learning material such as textbooks in grade 10 to 12 in sections 20 and 21 schools in KZN. However, we appreciate that more 96% of matriculants have access to maths textbooks country wide.

Hon Chairperson, we need to work hard to remove all barriers to schooling in all our schools and provinces irrespective of the status of the schools.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 36**

We cannot advocate the slogan that: the doors of education shall be opened and yet there are children who cannot access institutions not of their own will.

Scholar transport and its safety must be seriously looked. The administration of the farm schools also needs some serious attention. The closure of farm schools means that we are leaving a farm worker's child out in the cold and indirectly perpetuating inequality and poverty in our society.

Hon Minister, the administration must ensure good governance at all institutions in all provinces. It is disheartening to read about the post that are sold and people's careers kept on hold just because someone does not belong to a certain union or is not in good terms with her or his union bosses.

It is high time that Sadtu reign in its delinquent members and stop supporting members that are threatening the livelihood of our future leaders. Sadtu need to gain the moral high ground that its predecessors, such as the National Education Crisis Committee, NECC of yesteryears, inculcated in our cadres at the time.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 37**

The strategic objectives in Programme 3, that is; to promote quality teaching and institutional performance through the effective supply, development and utilisation of resources need to be seriously monitored.

The safety of the teachers at schools also cannot be overlooked. The implementation of efficient and effective schooling programmes goes hand in glove with the feeling of being secured, appreciated and capacitated in all respects. Job satisfaction does not come from monetary compensation only, but sentimental value counts a lot too.

The strategic planning in Programme 2, seeks to develop curriculum and assessment policy, and to support monitor and evaluate curriculum implementation. One of its goals is to improve the access of the youth to Further Education and Training beyond grade 9.

Hon Minister, I think we also need to look at the issues emanating from lower grades that negatively impact on the overall outcome of the high drop-out or failure rate at tertiary institutions. It has been proven that children promoted from grade 11 to 12, many of them do well in their final examination and into tertiary.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 38**

The programme intending to increase the number of learners completing grade 12 is welcomed and will also play a critical role as a feeder to FET colleges.

I think the programme will also play key role in ensuring that the learners move towards a paperless technological environment, thus equipping them for future challenges in the evolving work environment.

The effective implementation of the inclusive education policy will go a long way in the eradication of artificial barriers by certain institutions in the country that are still hell battling to preserve the status quo.

The ANC has fought against all sorts of discrimination; it will, therefore, be a great failure of the department to root out discrimination at an early stage.

Hon Chairperson, quality education and effective service delivery in the basic education system through monitoring and evaluation cannot be overemphasised.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 39**

Programme 4 of the strategic planning is the basis of quality service delivery in the department by ensuring that proper education infrastructure is put in place to improve the conditions under which learners are taught and to promote the functionality of the schools.

Hon Minister and members, I would like to, once more, congratulate the Free State province in general and the MEC in particular, for breaking the 90% pass rate ceiling in matric results and being the best performing province. [Applauds.]

It is commitment and the will of the ANC-led government to empower every child with adequate education and skill to make a difference in her or his life and bring about a prosperous and a better South Africa to live in our lifetime and beyond. The ANC supports this Budget Vote. [Applause.]

Mr V V WINDVOEL: Hon Chairperson, hon Minister, hon Deputy Minister, hon members of the NCOP we want to say in this year of O R Tambo we are proud that the ANC led government has since turned the corner in the performance of grade 12 learners. All the 4 education districts in the province performed above 70% with Ehlanzeni and eNkangala tying at 79.5% and amongst the better performing education districts in the country. This is a province where the majority of schools are

located in quintiles 1 to 3, schools in rural which mean these are schools in rural and poor communities.

The ANC has continued to live by the dictates of the freedom charter that the Doors of Learning and Culture shall be opened. It is also in line with the vision of the Peoples Education for Peoples power. We have strived to ensure that basic education is endowed with the quality of education it deserves. This was done by ensuring that all children who were attending schools in small and non viable and farm schools are organised and placed in state of the art boarding schools where they receive quality education from grade R to Grade 12.

*Siswati:*

Uma sisho loku siyatigcabha Mhlonishwa siHlalo kutsi iMphumalanga ikhonile kutsi yakhe tikolo letihlalisa bantfwana eShongwe, eMkhondo nase Steve Tshwete kulomnyaka wetimali lesikuwo ngekwakhiwa kwetikolo letinetindzawo tekulala eTaba Chweu.

Kuletikolo tekulalisa bafundzi kuvalwe letikolwa letisemapulazini laphe bewutfole khona umntfwana losebangeni lekucala, lesitsatfu nelesihlanu bafundza ekilasini linye, bafundziswa nguthishela munye. Uma agula lothishela bekuphela liviki bantfwana bangafundzi.



UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017

Page: 41

Sikhuluma-nje, labantfwana basemapulazini bahleti kamnandzi lapha ngenca yembuso waKhongolose. Badla kane ngelilanga, kantsi le emakhaya bebaye baye esikolweni balambile. [Tandla.]

Sikhuluma nje, labantfwana batfola tintfo letifana netindlu-mabhuku, netindlu tesayensi lebatitfola kule tikolo tebuciko letinetindlu tekulala letakhiwe ngumbuso waKhongolose eMphumalanga. Bahlala mahhala. Loko kwenta kutsi labantfwana batfole imfundvo lesezingeni lelisetulu.

*English:*

That is why we say we have improved the numbers from the rural and poor community especially black Africans who were not afforded these opportunities by the then regime to access early childhood education. We have also ensured that they are taught by professionally qualified teachers. Now children from farming communities can obtain university education and become professionals like doctors and engineers. As we speak, standing here the ANC led government in Mpumalanga has sponsored students to be in Cuba, Russia and Italy to acquire some of the professions we have referred above.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 42**

The National Development Plan, NDP, states that and I quote, "Make childhood development a top priority among the measures to improve the quality of education"

In the history of basic education in the country there has never been a period where many children between the ages of four six were attending formal grade education in our public schools and it is happening now. This education was a special privilege for the selected white few. The ANC has made it to happen. We must appreciate the visionary leadership of the ANC as I quote O R Tambo when he says" The fight for freedom must go on until it won. Until our country is free and happy, and peaceful as part of the community of man we cannot rest." We want to say that improved education will lead to higher employment and earnings while more rapid economic growth will broaden the opportunities for all and generate the resources required to improve education.

The department through its entity, the Mpumalanga regional training trust is in the final stages of the creation or the establishment of what we call skills up, which will go a long way in ensuring that our youth in the province are afforded an opportunity and affirmed with the relevant skills. This entity has further ensured that the youth is trained in various skills and placed in companies where

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 43**

they render service and employed. This leads to combating unemployment and fighting poverty.

The ANC led government inherited a government that prioritised certain race groups over others. This led to the rural masses of our people not to have adequate schools for our children. As we speak, the department has strived to ensure that schools meet the minimum norms and standard across the province. In this regard we appreciate stewardship of our hon MEC Mohaule.

As we conclude, we want to quote our internationalist revolutionary O R Tambo when he said and I quote, "Responsibility for the proper conduct of children was not confined to their parents only. When they misbehaved, they misbehaved against the community; and a senior member of the community was expected to do something about it."

We want to refer to the kind of the generation of learners we find in our schools; some are involved in drugs like nyaope; others are involved in other social ills hence we have some of these pregnancies happening at a higher rate in our schools. It calls all of us including those with red overalls to act collectively to ensure that our children do go to school and are disciplined and ensure a proper South Africa. Thank you. [Applause.]

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 44**

Mr M KHAWULA: Hon Chairperson, hon Minister, hon Deputy Minister, education in South Africa has continued to be plagued by economic divide of financial viability. This divide has perpetuated the trend of quality education to those who can afford quality and poor education to those who cannot afford to pay for quality.

Indeed, there are areas where during the past 23 years of our democracy government has tried to improve access and standards. For example, the provision of National School Nutrition Programme, NSNP, the National Student Financial Aid Scheme, NSFAS, programme, no-fee paying schools. All these programmes have improved access to millions of poor communities who would not have had similar chances to education without these programmes. Notwithstanding these programmes, South Africa has invested high proportions of the country's budget to education for which the returns have not matched the investment. It should be alarming that for NSC results of 2015, the department had to adjust 30 subjects upwards out of 59 written in order to make 2015 matriculants pass their examinations. For the 2016 NSC results, the department had to adjust 28 subjects upwards out of 58 written in order to make 2016 matriculants pass their examinations. This is a feel-good-syndrome that the country does not need.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 45**

The Department of Basic Education should be focussing on extensively imparting quality knowledge to learners in order to enable them to be self-sustainable and independent. The elephant in the room with Basic Education has always been poor management of institutions and centres in its hierarchy. Where quality management persist from school level to circuit, to district and to province, the results reflect quality. Where mediocre management persist from school level to circuit, to district and to province, the results also reflect mediocre outcomes.

During the Budget Vote debate of 2016-17 I applauded the Minister for her guards in establishing a commission to investigate the allegation of selling of posts in the department. I encouraged the Minister not to chicken out in releasing and publicising the then awaited results of the investigations. In the long run, this ultimately happened. But the hon Minister has again gone back to death silence with regard to action on the culprits who were pinpointed by the investigation. This is not good hon Minister. The culprits of the jobs-for-sale investigation outcomes must be brought to book.

Poor planning, poor alignment of programmes and poor coordination of resources has once again compromised the department's objectives of

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 46**

improved quality. This has resulted in the department failing to reach its targets. As a result, the Department of Basic Education has once more under-spent on conditional grants for infrastructure. This under spending is so unnecessary and embarrassing as it has happened against the background of schools that needs so much of infrastructure upgrading. The majority of schools in the country, especially rural and township schools, lack facilities such as laboratories, libraries, technical classrooms, administration blocks, Information Technology, I T laboratories, etc. but this department is under spending on the so much need for spending in infrastructure grant. Under spending in this programme means denying poor South Africans the quality services which they deserve.

Speaking to the National Council of Provinces' delegates in the Free State province, Xariep District a few weeks ago on the 8 May 2017, the Health Head of Department, HOD, Doctor David Motau, lamented the fact that skilled personnel such as doctors, dentists and others do not want to serve in the medical centres in the rural areas. He stated that amongst other things these specialists asked for what he called proper schools for their children when they come to serve in rural areas. The point here is that this is the perception that even government officials have of our schools in rural areas. They referred to rural and township schools as not proper and only

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 47**

certain schools in the cities are proper for the education of their children.

I thank you Chair.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION: Chairperson we celebrate with you 20 years of the establishment of the NCOP and in so doing we acknowledge the presence and the election of your new chief whip and the former Chief Whip who is also here. Chairperson, we certainly empathise with the people in the Western Cape. Five people have already lost their lives in the storm and we congratulate and applaud the disaster management team for the wonderful work that they have done. We understand that 13 schools have been affected and we do believe that our prayers have been answered in so far as the rain is concerned but we also pray that it is not accompanied by the collateral damage that the storm caused.

Hon Chairperson, we have heard discourse about the fourth industrial revolution. We talk about our artificial intelligence, virtual classrooms, and blackboards being replaced by smart boards - We speak about mobile phones and applications - We speak about three dimensional drawings - We speak about manotoc technology, bio-technology. This is the 21st century and the single biggest

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 48**

challenge that we face as a system of education – a system which has a very dynamic environment and when I say dynamic environment hon Chairperson, I refer to an ever changing environment. And to what extent do we empower our educators and our learners to ensure that they are able to facilitate learning and teaching in the context of the 21st century learner.

It would mean that not only now has a conversation necessary between a learner from Gauteng and the Free State. But now the reality is the conversation taking place between South Africa and other parts of the world as a result of technology. It also means that through technology we are able to disseminate and provide to our learners books that are digitized and which are owned wholly by the Department of Basic Education. The question then arises hon Chairperson, what do we do or what have we done in terms of addressing this reality. We have done many things and I think its something that we should share with the NCOP. We have for example already digitized 60 of our textbooks – these are owned by the Department of Basic Education made available to all provinces and utilised by all provinces.

We have ensured that all our workbooks and their workbooks, there are 55 million workbooks that are distributed annually to all our



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 49**

learners' country wide, black and white - and these are digitized and in fact are made interactive. We have ensured that more than 205 African readers are made available in digitized form to all our learners and they can be downloaded in any phone and any mobile application. We have ensured that we establish an eCloud which will enable us to provide a core textbook to each learner, in each subject, in each grade. These are important steps that we taken to ensure that we are not left behind in the 21st century. And the single biggest challenge we face is to ensure that the rural child from Mpumalanga, the Eastern Cape, North West and the Free State are not left behind in this reality.

We must recognise that as a result of the disproportion development of our country there are certain serious advantages that the Gauteng province, the Western Cape for example, would have over provinces such as the Eastern Cape, Kwazulu Natal, Limpopo and the other provinces. But it simply means that we have to apply more attention and our focus to those particular provinces to ensure that equity and access is provided to every single child.

And indeed the hon Zwane is correct, if indeed we are true to the spirit and the resolute struggle of Oliver Reginald Tambo and the other leaders of our movement we have to pay particular attention to

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 50**

the values of human dignity, equality and freedom that are embodied in our Constitution. It means that we have to create infrastructure that is appropriate and conducive to learning for those millions of learners who have been historically been left behind. To that extent we can celebrate the fact that we have in the past few years delivered 179 state of the art schools to our learners - that's more than an average school per week.

It also means that we can also celebrate the fact that, as I speak to you now 70 schools are under construction in terms of their city programme and another 42 will be built by the end of this financial year. It also means that we have to acknowledge and recognise at the hon Chabangu has stressed the importance of early childhood development that each grade R child receives four books delivered to him or her free of charge. And that we have made remarkable strides in terms of education.

We have to acknowledge the fact that in terms of the SecMAC, we out of 21 countries are now number five and the only countries above us are small countries such as Swaziland, Mauritius and a few other smaller countries but we are above Zimbabwe and a lot of other countries. It means that for the first time as a result of our focus on literacy and numeracy we have exceeded the average mean in terms

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017

Page: 51

of literacy and numeracy. And that all provinces across our country have performed well. It also means that we have to recognise that in terms of the Trends in International Mathematics and Science Study, TIMSS test which is an international benchmark test South Africa has made the greatest strides in both Mathematics and Science - and that is remarkable - which means that dejectory is right - the challenges still persist but we have done more.

It is sad to basically speak about the challenges in provinces when indeed the Free State and I would have expected that the hon member Chabangu would have said that for the first time a rural province such as Free State has broken the 90% ceiling - [Applause.] for the first time a rural province like Free State has indeed over taken both Gauteng metropolitan and the Western Cape. It means that ICT is alive and real - it means that it produce among best districts and those educators in those schools happens to be by *South African Democratic Teachers' Union*, SADTU who make immense contributions under very difficult circumstances to teach our learners. Yes - there are problems within SADTU, but these amongst members of SADTU but the organisation and its broader membership has contributed significantly to the enhanced performance of our learners and indeed we should recognise this.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 52**

Hon Chairperson, we are in a world of multi media, access to technology - it means that we have voice over. We have wonderful resources and these resources are made available by the department on our website at different teacher education sites. The challenge that we face is how we do what we correctly said a learner he or she should be innovative, creative, analytical, be able to apply different knowledge in different context. We said already in our genetic outcomes for outcome based education that we should promote Mathematics, Science and Technology. We said that we should be committed to life long learning. We said we should be facilitating learning. We said we should embrace collaborative learning and these are realities that we spoke about. That the world is speaking about now but us as South Africa and as the ruling party, the ANC had spoken about more than 20 years ago. And these realities are realities that we have to confront and to ensure that we enhance the capacity of our educators to facilitate in these fast rapidly changing times - this is a huge challenge.

But let me conclude hon Chairperson by saying that the memory of those who have fought for our liberation, the memory of people such as Oliver Tambo can be only kept alive if we recognise that South Africa brings with it a particular brand of tolerance, respect and reconciliation. A tolerance that we do not see anywhere else - so

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 53**

whether you are wearing a wrist band that is of indigenous nature or a wrist band that a Hindu person wears or whether you wear a stud or whether you wear a scarf it should not be a problem because we recognise diversity in terms of culture and religion. That is one of the far most values that we should take with us as we move forward - recognising that we have made huge strides but we should never forget that our ethos is based on our commitment to the non racial, non sexist society that we saw to create.

It is embedded and enshrined in the Bill of Rights which we embrace as a system of government and which we believe would determine the future of our people. Hon Chairperson let me just conclude by saying I have spoken about the storm and I speak now also about another political storm. We are still trying to find out whether Helen Zille is the master or Maimane is. They are speaking about it right now whether colonialism has indeed contributed to our freedom or not and I think that the fact that there is a debate about out here then it means that the DA is indeed confused. Thank you. [Applause.] [Time expired.]

Ms T G MPAMBO-SIBHUKWANA: Hon Chairperson, it started on 4 minutes, can I please get my time, please.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 54**

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Order, could you please readjust the time? The hon member has five minutes.

Ms T G MPAMBO-SIBHUKWANA: Not four minutes forty eight seconds.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: It is okay, I will watch the clock, please proceed.

Ms T G MPAMBO-SIBHUKWANA: Universally, education is considered a basic human right and a significant factor in the development of children, communities and countries. Most hold the belief that opening the doors to education, especially with girl children, will help break at least and weaken the intergenerational chains of poverty. This is because education is seen as being intimately linked to all development goals such as supporting and promoting gender empowerment, improving the state of health in terms of child and maternal health, alleviating hunger, fighting and spread of HIV/Aids and diseases of poverty, driving economic growth and building peace amongst communities.

Given our country's history, the right to education should be considered as an especially important aspect of life that should be seriously protected and promoted. Like many developing countries

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 55**

with unpleasant historical contexts, our country suffers from a significant inequality gap between rich and poor.

Although we are now almost over 20 years into our democracy, we can all still agree that our state of basic education system is one that is unfortunately failing poor children. I am sure that the government shares the same vision as the rest of South Africans that world class education for our children is minimal. However, issues such as mismanagement of funds, internal conflicts and politics in the ANC and lack of accountability and leadership are the cause for concern.

It is no secret that children in rural areas suffer the most from substandard basic education and I would like to remind the Minister that in Lusikisiki children are walking long distances to access education. There is no scholar transport. Your efforts collaborative offers with Department of Transport where this is located should be effected.

It was found, through studies, that most teachers teaching in these remote areas do not even have qualifications to teach. The Funza Lushaka teachers are just placed. Teachers are placed to teach maths when there are English qualified. It is the cause of high failure

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 56**

rate in the Eastern Cape and that is why it is consistently in position last, year after year.

As we speak there are approximately 5000 teachers who are not fit to teach, but are currently employed. We as the DA recommend the issuing of competency test to all new and old teachers in school areas where this problem exists ,especially in the Eastern Cape. This is a government problem that needs to be solved by the government.

Parents don't expect to take ownership and responsibility, worse you should be encouraging this fear. We as a party believe in a system where parents can assess schools and remove their children out of schools which do not perform to the standards which are expected.

Hon Deputy Minister has mentioned the problem of South African Democratic Teachers Union, SADTU, and it must be honest that how we continue with this unlawful teacher strikes have affected the constitutional right of the child's access to education. Hon Minister please realises this fails the challenge to trade union in order to secure your own political system is a failure and causes more failure rate, especially in the Eastern Cape.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 57**

In order for South Africa to have an education system that works and is efficient for the people, we need Ministers who will stand and not be afraid to speak out for the injustice that compromise education. We need a Minister who will not let her existing alliances compromise the rights to child who would rather work selflessly in order to ensure that this right is accessible for all.

It is important to take away from this that, we as a country and government and as parents is responsible for moulding and grooming the futures of our children. We should have a zero tolerance to poor quality education and services and the corruption that comes with it, based on the life long effect that would be here.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon Mpambo-Sibhukwana, please take your seat. Hon Chabangu, I recognised you. The last time I check monghadi(mr) refers to a man and not a female.

Mr M M CHABANGU: Yes, thank you Chairperson.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Yes, morena.

Mr M M CHABANGU: Can I ask a question?

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 58**

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon Mpambo-Sibhukwana, will you take a question?

Ms T G MPAMBO-SIBHUKWANA: In your dreams.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: She is not willing, Sir. Please, take your seat.

Ms T G MPAMBO-SIBHUKWANA: Hon Zwane grand stand here and say all stake holders were present in the Eastern Cape. Can I please remind you that they were not there? The Provincial Department of Education was not there. Don't come and stand here and tell lies and mislead the communities. The support is needed, but the MEC from Mpumalanga I just want to show you that while we support that, the government must feed the children in schools , it has to be a well nutritionalised balance diet not four meals. I am talking from being a teacher for twenty years, if children are over fed they sleep in class. You can ask hon Wana who sleeps in this House. If they are over fed with four meals a day is too much and we support three meals as the DA.

Ms L C DLAMINI: Talking about an outdated teacher!

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 59**

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Order, members!

Ms L C DLAMINI: A teacher who was sitting in schools where there was no school nutrition ... You can't speak about nutrition. You don't know anything about that!

Chairperson, allow me this opportunity to greet the Minister and Deputy Minister of Basic Education, hon members and special delegates.

Allow me to borrow from the words of Dr Judy Dlamini when she said, quality education is both the key to a better life for South African youth, and catalyst for gender transformation in the workplace. She further said quality education is a liberator and equaliser because it enables all people, irrespective of their financial means to realise their full potential and assume leadership positions.

It will be appropriate that, in this Youth Month, we say, we encourage ...

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon Dlamini, please take your seat. Hon Julius, you are on your feet?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017

Page: 60

Mr J W W JULIUS: Chairperson, I just wanted to know whether hon Dlamini is willing to take a question.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon Dlamini, are you willing to take a question? [Interjections.] Are you willing to take a question, ma'am?

HON MEMBERS: Yes! Yes! Yes!

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Order! I have not heard hon Dalmini's response.

Ms L C DLAMINI: No. Outside, Chair.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: She's not willing, sir. Please proceed, hon Dlamini.

Ms L C DLAMINI: We therefore encourage our learners to develop themselves and ask questions and want to know so that they can grow and contribute to the growth of their culture, business and development of their own country.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017

Page: 61

I have prepared this speech. It is a continuation of what has been raised by ANC speakers. There is so much that the department has done that you can't finish saying it all in one day. I will submit the speech.

But I want to use my time to assist other members who debated here.  
[Interjections.]

Ms T J MOKWELE: Don't assist. We are sorted.

Ms L C DLAMINI: Starting with honourable ... [Interjections.] hon Hattingh. Hon Hattingh, we are debating education here. You missed an opportunity to influence this moving train of education, changing our education system for the better. [Interjections.]

Ms T J MOKWELE: The Guptas ... [Inaudible.] ... straight to Dubai!  
[Laughter.]

Ms L C DLAMINI: What we expect, hon members, is that ... raise issues of concerns where they are, but ... [Inaudible.]

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon Mokwele, you can heckle without drowning the speaker!

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 62**

Ms L C DLAMINI: ... you want to add in education. You missed that opportunity. In fact, instead of talking about education, the whole 10 minutes, you used it for Sadtu. I don't know why. Is that what you want to do in representing your province, the North West? I am not sure. [Interjections.]

Allow me to talk about the prophets of doom who have, once again, come out in public to express solace in the internal difficulties facing the ANC. They shout loud about the challenges of the ANC as if it is their own creation, while concealing their own internal turbulences which they cannot handle.

The weekend news reports about the statement that was made by the DA leader, Mmusi Maimane, regarding Helen Zille's tweets about colonial, have exposed fundamental differences within the DA and its ability to stand true to its claim as the future nonracial party for all South Africans. The one statement by hon Mmusi Maimane, flanked by Phumzile van Damme, tells the public about the suspension of Helen Zille. A few hours later, James Selfe and the DA tell a different story. Is this comic or racial manoeuvring, or real supremacy playing itself out in the DA? Can they talk about that?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017

Page: 63

Contrary to the claims by the DA, hon Mpambo-Sibhukwana just now was expressing issues about the Eastern Cape, forgetting about her own province ... [Interjections.]

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon Dlamini, I have a member on her feet; please take your seat. Hon Mokwele, you are on your feet?

Ms T J MOKWELE: Chair, I rise on a point of privilege.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: I don't have points of privilege.

Ms T J MOKWELE: Why, ma'am?

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: No, you rise on a point of order, or ...

Ms T J MOKWELE: It's a point of privilege! But I've got the right to say that! It is within the Rules. Can you allow me ...

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: State your case. If the privilege is not granted, it won't be granted. Please state your case. Let me hear what the privilege is.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017

Page: 64

Ms T J MOKWELE: Thank you very much. The privilege is that hon Dlamini must know that the party she comes from – the ANC ...  
[Interjections.]

Don't say "huh-uh" until you have hear what I have to say!

They are not saying the same thing as the leader Rama. Zuma will wake up in the morning saying ...

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon Mokwele!

Ms T J MOKWELE: ... one thing and Ramaphosa will come with another thing totally different to what Zuma had said in the morning.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon Mokwele, that privilege ...

Ms T J MOKWELE: So, she must not say DA people are not ...  
[Inaudible.]

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: No, that point of privilege is not granted. It is not relevant to the matter at hand. Please take your seat. Hon Dlamini.



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 65**

Ms L C DLAMINI: Chairperson, we are not surprised when the EFF stands up and defends the DA, because they are captured by the DA. [Interjections.] So we are not surprised. [Interjections.]

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon Dlamini, there is a point of order. Please take your seat. Hon Mokwele?

Ms T J MOKWELE: Chairperson, Ms Dlamini is misleading the country. Actually, the people who are captured are the ANC because they are captured by the Guptas. We don't have any relationship with ANC, with DA ...

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Thank you, ma'am. That is not a point of order.

Ms T J MOKWELE: ... and we will never have any relationship with DA. It is as good as us voting with you. We have just voted with the ANC in our committee. So it's the same thing that we have done.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon Mokwele, take your seat! That's not a point of order!

Ms T J MOKWELE: We are not captured! It is you who is captured.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 66**

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Take your seat! Hon Julius, are you still rising on a point of order? [Interjections.] Order! Hon Julius, are you still rising on a point of order?

Mr J W W JULIUS: Yes, Chairperson, my point of order is that hon Dlamini is misleading the country. We are not ... or EFF is not captured. So, she knows the truth. She knows the truth that indeed, the ANC is captured by the Guptas. They are all captured.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Thank you, sir. That is not a point of order. Hon Dlamini, please proceed with your speech.

[Interjections.] Hon Dlamini, please take your seat. Hon Koni, you are rising on a point of order?

Ms N P KONI: Thank you very much, Chairperson. Hon Dlamini should have taken the behaviour and conduct of Ginger yesterday, to see what it is that capturing is about. The sweating at the podium ... the unnecessary, dramatic sweating at the podium, as if she has just finished a bottle of ginger ... [Inaudible.] [Laughter.]

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon Koni, you do know you are out of order! Please take your seat! I do not know what the matter was ... [Laughter.] ... and I am not sure! Hon Makue, you are on your feet?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017

Page: 67

Mr E MAKUE: Chairperson, I think this is getting out of order.

[Interjections.] You need to discipline the members. First we start off by insulting ... [Interjections.]

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Order! Hon Makue, you are protected.

Mr E MAKUE: First we start off by not addressing the President properly. Then we refer to a person as "Ginger". Then, when one is now rising to raise a point of order, you get shouts from these members. It augurs badly for the rapport in this House, Chair.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Thank you, sir. Hon members, order! Can we get back to order? Can we allow hon Dlamini to finish her speech? Can we also remember that the decorum of the House depends on you. Please hold back on spurious points of order. Hon Dlamini, please proceed with your speech.

Ms L C DLAMINI: Thank you, Chair. EFF, you've invited my attention ...

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Leave the EFF! Just get back to your speech, ma'am! [Interjections.]

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 68**

Ms L C DLAMINI: I'm still coming to it, Chair. [Interjections.]

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon Mokwele, I'm not going to take that point of order. I've already ruled that she must leave you alone. Please take your seat. [Interjections.] Please take your seat now! [Interjections.] Hon Dlamini, please proceed.

Ms L C DLAMINI: Thank you very much, hon Chair. I was saying, hon Mpambo-Sibhukwana missed an opportunity to talk about challenges that are facing education in the Western Cape. Instead, she decided ... [Interjections.] ... to focus on issues of the Eastern Cape. [Interjections.]

The report of the audit that was done by Equal Education in the Western Cape last year reflects different from she has just said now. The report indicates that learners in the Western Cape are beaten in 83% of schools, with a daily occurrence of 37%. That is top, according to the DA. One third of learners reports being discriminated against in the Western Cape. That is top in the Western Cape. Sixty-four per cent of learners do not have access to ... [Interjections.]

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 69**

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon Dlamini, hon Labuschagne is on her feet. Hon Labuschagne, what is your point of order?

Ms C LABUSCHAGNE: Chair, I rise on a point of order. I would like to know whether hon Dlamini would be willing to take a question.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon Dlamini, are you willing to take a question?

An HON MEMBER: She can't answer questions! [Interjections.]

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Order! You are not hon Dlamini!

Ms L C DLAMINI: Outside, hon Chair.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon Labuschagne, she is not prepared to do so.

Ms L C DLAMINI: The report indicates that 64% of learners do not have access to sanitary pads in schools. More than half of the schools do not meet the minimum norms and standards in terms of quality of schools. In fact, I have this report. Let me read it straight from the report. Here, I am quoting from the report. The

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017

Page: 70

report reads that some of the findings of the audit in the Western Cape indicate that broken toilets, shoddy infrastructure ...

[Inaudible.] ... use of corporal punishment and lack of student safety are some of the issues highlighted in the social audit.

I just want to quote one student. Hon Mpambo-Sibhukwana indicated that in the Eastern Cape children walk long distances ...

[Interjections.]

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon Mokwele, you are rising on a point of order?

Ms T J MOKWELE: Chair, I rise on a point of order. I warned the hon member that she must not mislead South Africa. I am repeating that. What she is saying also happens in all other eight provinces that are governed by the ANC.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon Mokwele, that is not a point of order.

Ms T J MOKWELE: In Limpopo our kids are still using pit latrines ...

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 71**

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon Mokwele, take your seat! That's not a point of order! Hon members, order. You know, debate issues. This report which the hon member is quoting is allowed. It is a point in debate which I am allowing. Please proceed, hon Dlamini.

[Interjections.] Please proceed, ma'am! [Interjections.] Order!

Ms L C DLAMINI: Chair, on the issues of safety of schools ...

[Interjections.] ... the report also found that the safety of schools programme ... [Interjections.]

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon members, you are drowning the speaker out, and I will not allowed that!

Ms L C DLAMINI: When talking about safety of the school, Umbayu, one of the learners said, schooling cannot be effective when students do not feel safe. We have holes in the fences, so anything that's not allowed to be in school has easy access, she said. There are broken windows, where there is no difference between me inside the school and the person outside the school. As a result of the broken windows, it is very cold in school.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017

Page: 72

When speaking about transport, one learner said she walks for two hours to get to school and two hours to get back home. That is the best, according to the DA. [Interjections.]

Then, you ask yourself, when the DA says the Western Cape is the best, who are they talking about? Are they talking about the few in the cities, or are they talking about everyone in the Western Cape?

An HON MEMBER: Everyone! [Laughter.]

Ms L C DLAMINI: Where are they staying? [Interjections.] Where are they staying? [Interjections.]

This research was conducted in a number of schools by qualified, skilled researchers from the various universities in the Western Cape and educators. The MEC and the officials from the department acknowledged the issues that I am raising here and they said they are dealing with them.

But you come here in the House and speak about things that you are not aware of because you are so obsessed with other provinces.

[Interjections.]



UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017

Page: 73

About the EFF ... [Interjections.] ... about the EFF ...  
[Interjections.] ... I don't expect them to understand these issues.  
[Inaudible.] ... issues are very complex. [Interjections.] If hon  
Chabangu ... [Interjections.]

Chairperson, can I be protected?

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: You are drowning the speaker out. Hon  
Mokwele!

Ms L C DLAMINI: Chairperson, if hon Chabangu cannot differentiate  
between quality and education system ... she is saying there are two  
education systems in the ... [Inaudible.] ... but when he debates,  
he speaks about infrastructure. I'm not surprised. These education  
issues are very complex for them. [Interjections.] It will take  
time for them to understand. [Interjections.]

I also do want to say to the public out there, when the EFF rejects  
the budget, they are saying schools must be closed, teachers must be  
retrenched, there should be no scholar transport, and there should  
be no nutrition schemes in schools. We therefore say, they are  
missing an opportunity to influence the education system in this  
country. [Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017

Page: 74

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon Dlamini, please take your seat. Hon Koni?

Ms N P KONI: Chairperson, the speaker at the podium is misleading the House. If she wants to understand the reasons behind the rejection of Budget Votes, she's welcome to engage me, even if it's in the bus on our way to Acacia Park.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Thank you very much. That's not a point of order.

Ms N P KONI: I will be more than willing to assist her. She must be ... [Inaudible.]

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Thank you very much! It's not a point of order! The speaker is debating. Ayiye! [Let it go, man!]  
[Laughter.]

Ms L C DLAMINI: Thank you, Chairperson. I don't ... [Interjections.]  
[Laughter.]

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon Dlamini, please take your seat. Hon Chabangu?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017

Page: 75

Mr M M CHABANGU: Chair, I just want to check as to whether it is parliamentary for you to say "ayiye". [Laughter.]

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon Chabangu, ayiye, let the debate continue! [Laughter.] It is parliamentary, even if I am finding for myself! It is parliamentary! [Laughter.] Hon Dlamini, please proceed.

HON MEMBERS: Ayiye!

Ms L C DLAMINI: Thank you very much, Chair. I'm not taking advice from people who are not going add value to me. What I have is far more than what she wants to tell me. I can only help her.

[Interjections.] I can only advise her. [Interjections.] She can't advise me. [Interjections.]

The ANC supports the budget. Thank you. [Applause.]

The MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION: Hon Chair, let me again thank you for the opportunity for us debate. I would not respond to all the matters raised for instance... [Interjections.]

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Order!

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017

Page: 76

The MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION: I can say Mr Hattingh, the obsession about SA Democratic Teachers Union, Sadtu, is not helpful. However, Chair what I can share with you Mr Hattingh is that the report and the investigations that we have done is a year now that the resolutions are implemented or the recommendations that have come.

[Interjections.]

Mr C HATTINGH: [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION: No. Listen. What comes out which I think will disappoint you, nothing in the investigations points to Sadtu, which really confirms what we have been saying that who ever might have been selling posts, it is not their instruction and it is not them. Of all the cases that we have taken to the police, the main culprits are your officials in districts and in circuits. So, there is nothing in the report and the investigation that points to them. I think we all have to admit and say indeed there was a challenge, because even Volmink himself says, he heard one of the people he was interviewing who said Sadtu - so, it is one individual. However, all the investigations are not pointing in that

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017

Page: 77

direction. I think we need to apologise, even including yourself.  
However, the other point ...

[Interjections.]

You are just standing, I am not going to take any question and you  
are going to sit down and relax. [Interjections.]

You are going to sit down.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon Minister! Hon Minister!

[Interjections.]

*Sesotho:*

LETONA LA THUTO YA MOTHEO: Ha a dule fatshe a theole moya hle.

*English:*

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon Minister!

*Sesotho:*

LETONA LA THUTO YA MOTHEO: E re a theole moya hle.

*English:*

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017

Page: 78

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Minister, take your seat! Hon Hattingh, order! Hon Hattingh, on what point are you rising?

Mr C HATTINGH: Hon Chair, I just want to have it on record that I would like to know if the Minister will take a question.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon Minister, will you take a question?

The MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION: No.

*Sesotho:*

Ha a dule fatshe.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: She has said no, sir. Please continue Minister.

The MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION: What I can really say let me advice you, disabuse yourself of really being this obsessed about Sadtu because your member also in the National Assembly, NA, had just this madness about Sadtu which was unfortunate. However, Chair the other point which I want to say to the member is around - again Mr Hattingh - especially you and me we look like the same age group. Let us not stoop low into gossips because your house is on fire on

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 79**

something so fundamental in our Constitution which is nonracialism and which we said is major principle. Rather than deal with this very embarrassing principled issue and stop really poking your nose into other people's political lives and deal with your problems that violates the basic principle of our Constitution. [Interjections.]

So, what I also failed to get to because of time - I just want to quickly go through those points, Chair. The other point I missed raising during the time I had is about the fact that we are introducing incrementally the three streams in the academic sphere. I also was unable to report on Annual National Assessments, Ana, that indeed we have reconceptualised the Annual National Assessments. We have now worked out that we are going to have your summative, your systemic and your diagnostic.

Chair, we want to say I think it would have been great to have had an opportunity to have all the provinces here, like we had in Mpumalanga, because indeed provinces are doing great, great, great work. All provinces might be uneven, but is lots of good work that is taking place there. I want to take this opportunity whilst I am here to really thank the South African public for coming to the party especially the South African business which is giving us lots of support, the NGOs, the academics and also the civil society.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 80**

Also there was a point mentioned by the IFP, also which is a gossip around the moderation of results. We are not going to stand here and undermine independent bodies such as Umalusi, about the work that they have to do. It is a body of professionals who have integrity and standing to come here and say they take things up and down as if it is just a bunch of criminals and crooks who can be manipulated by the Minister. I think it is very unfortunate and I think it is very disrespectful of other people. One needs to understand why moderation happens. Moderation is to ensure that the currency of the qualifications remains consistent through objective tools. So, I thought I should clarify to say let us not get into gossips.

*IsiXhosa:*

Mntasekhaya, ndishiywe lixesha ke, wena we-DA. Ndiye ndibe nobunzima bokuthatha oqinisekileyo umntu ojoyine i-DA, ndiqonde ukuba andimazi nokuba uthethiswa sisisu okanye mhlawumbi uthethiswa yinto ethile engenye. Ndiyaxakeka nje, ndiqonde ukuba mhlawumbi uxakene nento umntu. Nyhani ke ngoba ayikho nje into eyenza ukuba ndikholelwe ukuba uthetha ngengqondo okanye uthetha ngesisu. Ngoko, andizi kukuphendula ke kuba andazi nokuba nithetha ngesisu okanye nithetha ngengqondo. [Kwaqhwatjwa.]

**APPROPRIATION BILL**



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 81**

(Policy debate)

Vote No 17 - Social Development:

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hon Chairperson, chairperson and members of the select committee, MECs of Social Development present here, hon delegates, distinguished guests, ladies and gentleman, the Minister of Basic Education and the Deputy Minister of Basic Education, ...

Ms T J MOKWELE: Chairperson, on a point of order: I just want to check with the Minister whether we should trust her to deliver the budget to us, when she cannot handle her department properly.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES: That is not a point of order. Please take your seat.

Ms T J MOKWELE: Maybe we must check whether she can handle such a huge budget of the department.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES: Hon Mokwele, take your seat! That is not a point of order. Hon Minister, continue.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017

Page: 82

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Chairperson, it is a pleasure to rise in this august House today to deliver Budget Vote No 17, ...

Ms N P KONI: Chairperson, I would not be standing if this thing was not a burning issue.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES: Is that a point of order?

Ms N P KONI: Yes, Chairperson. About 10 minutes ago, I started getting this thing ...

*Setswana:*

... ya gore go nkgwa bojalwa, Modulasetilo.[that there is a liquor smell]

*English:*

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES: Hon Koni, that is not a point of order. Hon members, I will not take spurious points of order. Hon members! Continue, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: I would like to tender the apology of the Deputy Minister ...

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 83**

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE NCOP: I would request that you consult Hansard and rule on the allegation that the member is making here in the House. And against hon Mokgosi, she is making a very serious allegation in the House, which should never be said.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES: I will consult Hansard and rule. Please, proceed, hon Minister. No, hon Mokwele. No, I am not taking any points of order, because I have said ... Hon Minister, take your seat. Hon members, I have said that I am not taking any spurious points of order. There is nothing about what I have said regarding consulting Hansard, which needs you to make a point of order. Please, take your seat. [Interjections.] Please, take your seat. No. [Interjections.] Hon Mokwele, please take your seat and allow me to do my job. No, hon Koni. I have said that I am not taking any spurious points of order. [Interjections.] What is it?

Ms N P KONI: Hon Mokgosi. Let us ...

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES: Hon Mokgosi, please take your seat.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 84**

Ms N P KONI: We don't know ... Hon Mokgosi. You are saying it. Who is hon Mokgosi?

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES: Please take your seat, hon Koni.

Ms N P KONI: Okay.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES: I am waiting. Hon Minister, please proceed.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: From the onset, I would like to tender the apology of the Deputy Minister of Social Development, Ms Hendrietta Bogopane-Zulu, who is unable to be here due to ill health. We wish her a full and speedy recovery.

I would like to acknowledge the presence of 41 young people in the gallery, as we mark the 41<sup>st</sup> anniversary of June 16 under the theme: The Year of O R Tambo: Advancing Youth Economic Empowerment. As we observe this important occasion, it is befitting that we pay tribute to the stalwart and one of the founders of the African National Congress Youth League, ANCYL, in 1944, Comrade President Oliver Reginald Tambo. It was under the stewardship of Comrade O R Tambo

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 85**

that the ANCYL adopted the Programme of Action, which transformed the ANC to a mass movement that carries the hopes and genuine aspirations of all people.

To this day, the Freedom Charter continues to be the beacon of hope for South Africa and the foundation of our progressive Constitution. The values of a nonracial, nonsexist, united and democratic South Africa that Comrade O R Tambo stood for are espoused in the Constitution. As we commemorate June 16 this year, there is every reason to celebrate the generation that Comrade O R Tambo called, and I quote: "the young lions of the struggle" because our history cannot be told without mentioning the vital role of our young people.

We are certain that if Comrade O R Tambo was present here today, he would applaud the progress we have made with regard to the empowerment of young people through some of the programmes such as the social assistance programme, Social Work Scholarship, Isibindi Model, the National Youth Camp and some of the interventions that we will outline in this Budget Vote.

We are committed more than ever before to radically address the legacy of economic colonial imbalances by empowering our people,

particularly women and youth to claim a fair share of our national wealth. Black people, Africans in particular, cannot remain the hewers of wood and drawers of water ...

Mr M M CHABANGU: Chairperson, can I ask the Minister a question?

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES: Hon Minister, will you take a question?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: No.

... in their native land, while the national wealth remains in the hands of the privileged few. [Interjections.]

We are making a significant contribution towards unlocking the potential of SMMEs, co-operatives, townships and rural enterprises, as outlined by President Jacob Zuma in the Nine-point Plan. In the last financial year, the department and its entities procured over R300 million worth of goods such as school uniforms, nutritious food, blankets and dignity packs from local co-operatives.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 87**

This is a drop in the ocean, as we need a radical transformation of the public-sector supply chain management, to ensure that local small businesses and co-operatives benefit.

The department received a budget of R160 billion this financial year. Of this amount, R151 billion goes directly to the social assistance programme.

We have begun engagements with relevant organs of state ...

Ms N P KONI: Chairperson, on a point of order: Can the Minister please leave with the gum that just put on the podium when she is done with her speech?

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES: That is not a point of order. Proceed, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: What do you know about hygiene? [Laughter.] This will be implemented in line with the relevant procurement processes. We have also moved swiftly to incorporate the Constitutional Court orders into the Annual Performance Plan of the South African Social Security Agency, Sassa, starting in the current financial year and over the MTEF period.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017

Page: 88

*IsiZulu:*

Hlala nezindlu ezigcwele uboya bezinja!

*English:*

Improving access for eligible beneficiaries remains our priority.

[Interjections.]

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES: Hon Minister, please, take your seat. [Interjections.] Order! Order! Hon Chabangu. Hon Mokwele, take your seat.

Mr M M CHABANGU: Chairperson, on a point of order: Is it parliamentary for the Minister to say that people are izinja [dogs] or should we tell you that you are also a dog? [Interjections.]

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES: Order, hon members! [Interjections.] Order! Order! Hon Chabangu, you will not refer to any member of this House as a dog. Order! I am still ruling. [Interjections.] No, I am still ruling. Hon Minister, I do not know whether you have called any member of this House a dog. No man, I am addressing this Minister.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: No, Chairperson, I did not.



UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017

Page: 89

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES: Hon members, I am going to consult Hansard and I am going to rule on this matter. [Interjections.] Order, members! Order! [Interjections.] Order, hon Mokwele! Hon Mokwele! Hon Mokwele! Take your seat, hon Koni. Hon Koni, take your seat. Take your seat! Hon Mokwele! Hon Mokwele, I am addressing you. Stand up! [Interjections.] I am ruling. You have absolutely no business to interrupt my ruling. You interrupted me by ... [Interjections.] ... Yes. Hon Mokwele, I have ruled on this matter. I have said that ... I have asked a direct question to the Minister. She denied calling any member a dog. I then went on to say that I am going to look at Hansard and come back and rule on this matter. Allow this matter to rest there. [Interjections.] Please, take your seat, if you are allowing me.

Ms T J MOKWELE: You said I must stand up. That is why ...

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES: Because I was addressing you.

Ms T J MOKWELE: So, I must sit down and allow you to ...

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES: I am finish with addressing you.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017

Page: 90

Ms T J MOKWELE: May I, with due respect, address you, my hon Chair?

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES: Are you going to address me on the ruling I have just made?

Ms T J MOKWELE: You know ...

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES: No, are you going to address me on the ruling I have just made?

Ms T J MOKWELE: Can I not answer a direct question from you? May you please allow me to speak?

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES: Hon Mokwele, take your seat!

Ms T J MOKWELE: Chair, this is very unfair. I will sit down, but I want this to be recorded. Chief Whip, as much as hon Koni was saying ...

*Setswana:*

... go nkgga bojalwa ka fa ...

*English:*

... you stood up. A person is calling us dogs and you cannot stand up and defend us. [Interjections.] This woman is calling us dogs and you cannot do anything! [Interjections.]

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES: Hon Mokwele, take your seat. [Interjections.]

Ms T J MOKWELE: Your life is at stake, ...

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES: No, there will not be a threat of that nature in this House. [Interjections.] Hon Mokwele, you take that seat, or you will go. I will have order in this House. I will recognise you. Hon Mokwele, you will take your seat and allow this House to do its business. Hon Koni, what was your point of order?

*Setswana:*

Moh N P KONI: Modulasetilo, ke lebogela go mpha tshono eno. Katlholo ya gago ga e nkgotsofatse sentle. Le gone, ke nagana gore fa re sa e kgotsofalele, re tshwanetse re go tsitsibuse kgotsa re go itsise. Jaanong Modulasetilo, ke kopa gore ke feleetse ntlha eno, fa ke

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017

Page: 92

fetsa o tla bua lenna. Ka bokhutshwane, le nna ke kopa gore ke re mme ona le en eke ntja, ebile ke ntja ka sebele.

*English:*

Hon Koni, you will withdraw that. No, no, take your seat. Hon members, order! I have said that I will not allow spurious ... Is there no interpretation? Please attend to the interpretation. No, put your hands down, please. I am not going to entertain any other point of order on the issue that hon Mokwele and hon Chabangu have raised because I have ruled on that. No member in this House is going to stand and call any other member a dog. I am not going to answer any other question on a ruling I have made. If you are not satisfied, please leave this House. I have said I am going to consult Hansard and rule on the matter. Therefore, I do not know why members want me to rule on something that I have not ...

[Interjections.]

Ms T J MOKWELE: ... [Inaudible.] ... so that it is on Hansard. As the EFF, we are ...

*Setswana:*

... re ema jana mama, re itsise ...

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017

Page: 93

*English:*

... our dissatisfaction and our concern. You will receive our letter of dissatisfaction.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES: That is fine. Just take your seat.

*Setswana:*

Moh T J MOKWELE: ... ka ntlha e mme yoo a e buileng.

*English:*

You are not going to allow being harassed. My apologies.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES: If you talk back again, you will leave this Chamber. You will leave this Chamber. Hon members, I have made a ruling. I am not going to rush into a ruling on a matter ... Hon Mokwele, talk back again and you will march. Hon members, I did not hear the context or whatever the Minister said. I have said that I want to consult Hansard, so that I make a very fair ruling on this matter. I want to lay that matter to rest there. In the context of that, no member will refer to any member of this House as a dog, any other animal or any other thing other than a human being, who was named and is honourable by virtue

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 94**

of being a Member of Parliament. That is understood.

[Interjections.] I have ruled.

Ms T MOTARA: Chair, hon Mokwele made a threat to the Minister saying that her life is in danger. [Interjections.]

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES: I have immediately ruled on that matter when she said that. I addressed her.

Ms T MOTARA: Thank you, Chair.

Ms L C DLAMINI: Hon Chair, I just want to check if it is parliamentary for a member to threaten the Chairperson by saying that there will be no peace until this woman - referring to the hon Minister - has withdrawn.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES: Hon members, I am big enough to defend myself. Hon members, I have said that I will rule on this matter. I am sure I do not fear anybody. On this earth, I do not fear anybody. I will rule as honestly as I can after I have addressed this matter. Hon members, ... No, hon Hatting, I want to continue with the business of the day. All your matters are serious

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017

Page: 95

to you, but you are also delaying ... Hon Hatting, please. Hon members there is a small matter, which is not under your control and that is the weather out there and we have promised that for your safety, we will conclude this business before five. There is a storm that does not understand your spurious matters in this House. So, allow us to get on with the safety of the other members who wish to get home safely.

Mr C HATTINGH: Hon Chair, I cannot sit here and allow a member to make blasphemous remarks in this House. This hon member loudly said, in response to what you have ruled on, very loudly "Jesus". That is totally unacceptable. I cannot sit here, unfortunately. This is totally unacceptable in any community.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES: Hon Mokwele! [Interjections.] No, hon Mokwele. No. No. No, hon Mokwele, you will not do that. Hon members, behave yourselves. Hon membes, behave yourselves. Order! Hon Koni, I will not call you to order again. I think I have appealed to you. You are all adults. [Interjections.] Do you want to be appealed to now individually? I cannot do that. Hon members, allow this House to continue with its business.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017

Page: 96

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Improving access for eligible beneficiaries remains our priority. Last year alone, Sassa processed over two million new social grant applications. This is a huge increase from the previous years, as most experienced undue hardship due to drought and the current economic conditions.

We intensified our interventions and community engagement through Programme Mikondzo and *Integrated Community Registration Outreach Programme*, ICROP, through which we reached 1 235 wards. This financial year, we plan to reach 450 poorest wards in the priority districts.

Through this budget, we will continue to invest in the improvement of pay point infrastructure. Currently, we have a total of 9 917 pay points spread across the country. In the previous financial year, we converted 176 open pay points into proper structures. This is in addition to the 262 pay points that were improved in the 2015-16 financial year.

Our pay points stimulate local economic development. An amount of R4 billion circulates through the pay points every month. We intend to use this investment to stimulate further local economic



UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017

Page: 97

development, by way of introducing alternative pay points and local health shops.

Our long term goal is to ensure that we render services to our people in better conditions, which uphold human dignity. In this regard, we will continue to work hard to ensure that long queues, dilapidated and inaccessible buildings, particularly for persons with disabilities are a thing of the past.

This is the new narrative we have started as we work towards consolidating the solid foundation we have laid since the agency's inception. On this note, we would like to once more convey our heartfelt condolences to the Yawa family on the untimely passing of one of the longest-serving Sassa regional executive managers, Mr Sakhumzi Yawa. His passing robbed us of his valuable experience at a very crucial time when we are looking to take Sassa into a new era.

*IsiZulu:*

Sithi kusapho lakwa Yawa, akuhlanga lungehlanga, iNkosi ibe naye lapho elele khona.

*English:*

May his soul rest in peace.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017

Page: 98

We will during the course of this financial year and over the *Medium Term Expenditure Framework*, MTEF, period focus on deepening comprehensive social security as part of implementing Outcome 13. Our ultimate objective is a system of social protection that protects against particular vulnerabilities and risks, addresses retirement needs, while at the same time, promoting economic and social development.

In this regard, we are pleased to inform this august House that we tabled the Comprehensive Social Security Discussion Paper at the National Economic Development and Labour Council, Nedlac, in November 2016.

We have filed our notice to appeal the North Gauteng High Court judgment on illegal deductions. The Constitutional Court ordered that the personal data of grant beneficiaries should remain private and only be used for the payment of social grants. The Constitutional Court also ordered that beneficiaries should not be invited to opt to share their personal information.

We will continue working jointly with the disability sector towards achieving the objectives of the Convention on the Rights of the Persons with Disabilities and its Optional Protocol. In this regard,

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 99**

we are pleased to inform this House that Cabinet approved the piloting of the Disability Inequality Index.

The recent spate of brutal violence against women and children is a matter of grave national concern. It is a tragic reminder that we all need to work together, irrespective of political affiliation to combat this scourge.

In just the first five months of this year, it is reported that 20 children were killed here in the Western Cape alone, with Minentle Lekhatha being the latest victim. Nationally, it is reported that over 50 women have been brutally murdered.

We are deeply concerned that this occurred during the Child Protection Week, when we were calling on communities to do more to protect children. Let me remind you of the African proverb that says and I quote: "It takes a village to raise a child." Men are the main perpetrators of these barbaric crimes, which include hate crimes against lesbians, gays, bisexual, transgender, intersex and queer people. The figures are just the tip of the iceberg, as there are more cases that go unreported, particularly cases of domestic violence and intimate-partner violence, as it was the case with the late Karabo Mokoena.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017

Page: 100

We must put a stop to this. And we must stop it now. We must all say enough is enough, because behind these figures lie shattered families and communities that live in constant fear. The protection of women and children is everybody's responsibility, starting with all of us in our families and our communities.

We want to emphasise that, while passing and enforcing legislation is important, it will take more than that to combat this scourge. We need a collective and resolute action by society as a whole, working together with government and all sectors of our society.

We appreciate the contribution by the *United States Agency for International Development*, USAID, towards strengthening our child protection intervention. Through this partnership, we have recruited 105 social work graduates and 24 supervisors.

On a related matter, I would like to inform this House that we have been allocated a conditional grant of R181 million to absorb 556 social work graduates in this financial year. We will sustain this number over the MTEF period. We have requested all MECs and heads of departments to move with a sense of urgency on this matter.

*IsiZulu:*

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017

Page: 101

Sihlalo, kubalulekile ukuthi sicacise kule Ndlu ukuthi yikomidi la lana ku-NCOP elisicebise ukuthi sithathe kuyo le mali yemifundaze bese sifaka izisebenzi zezehlalakahle [absorb social workers] ikakhulukazi labo esibabuthela [recruit] ukuthi bafunde babe bancane. [Ihlombe.]

*English:*

During President Jacob Zuma's recent visit to Elsies River, the community highlighted a number of socioeconomic issues that need to be addressed as a matter of priority. Amongst these are the protection of women and children and the important role that both families and communities must play.

*IsiZulu:*

Imiphakathi kumele iyeke ukuthi uma ngabe izwa umntwana ekhala ngaphandle bese ivale iminyango, ivale amafasitela, ivale namasango. Lokho akubona ubuntu.

*English:*

We welcome the stand taken by men through initiatives such as #Not in My Name and the National Boy Day launched by the Community Development Foundation for South Africa, Codefsa, under the leadership of Mr Nkululeko Nxesi.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017

Page: 102

We also applaud the Safe Ride campaign by the South African National Taxi Council, Santago, for denouncing the despicable acts of violence against women and children by those who masquerade as taxi operators. It is time for men to name and shame those amongst them who perpetuate the gruesome rape culture.

We must also urge victims ...

*IsiZulu:*

... besifazane ukuthi bangabophisi abantu ngoba bafuna uxolo ngempelasonto. NgeSonto useyomkhipha bese ucisha icala ngoba ethi nguye umuntu omondlayo ekhaya.

*English:*

Let me hasten to add that we will not win this war as long as we have a patriarchal society with patriarchal men and who strangely believe that they have a birth right to exert power and control over women.

We must name and shame those who believe that they have a right to determine other people's sexual orientation and gender identity. This is in stark contrast to the values of a nonsexist, nonracial and a united democratic society that Comrade O R Tambo fought for.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 103**

We will implement the recommendations of the Ministerial Committee on Foster Care. These include strengthening parental support for foster parents, prevention and early interventions, as well as exploring the feasibility of specialised foster care services.

We are pleased to inform this House that we have eliminated the backlog on the child protection register. In the previous financial year, over 7 000 abused children were recorded in Part A, while more than 100 000 persons were vetted and recorded in Part B of the register. In addition, 281 persons were found unsuitable to work with children.

This commitment that we have in the protection of children is early childhood development, ECD. To date, over 800 000 children access early childhood development services. Of this number, 500 000 children receive a subsidy of R15 per day for 264 days. In KwaZulu-Natal, they are already paying R17 per day per child.

Over the MTEF period, a conditional grant to the value of R812 million has been allocated for the expansion of ECD services, focusing on rural and informal settlements. The allocation for this financial year is more than R317 million.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 104**

We call on all MECs and members of all Houses, more particularly, this august House, to monitor the implementation and reporting of this conditional grant.

Our work on the legislative front continues. To this end, we will introduce the Social Service Practitioners Bill to Parliament. The Bill seeks to regulate all social service practitioners, and includes measures to support emerging professionals in the sector.

We are also in the process of amending the Social Assistance Act, with a view to introduce, amongst others, a funeral and savings fund for social grant beneficiaries. We have started in earnest with the amendment of the White Paper for Social Welfare. Once completed, this process will culminate into the Social Development Act.

We remain in the frontline to confront head-on the twin challenges of alcohol and substance abuse. The easy availability of cheap illegal designer drugs such as tik, mercedez and nyaope has reached epidemic proportions in South Africa.

*IsiZulu*



**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 105**

Baphelile abantwana nemindeneni yethu ngenxa yalezi zidakamizwa. Sonke lana singabamba iqhaza, singafakaza ngabazali esibaziyo noma esifunde ngabo abanomntwana odla izidakamizwa.

*English:*

This is war we cannot afford to lose. We must not be deterred in our efforts to build a drug-free society.

Until recently, there has been a lack of adequate public treatment facilities across provinces. We are going to add Bokone Bophirima, Free State and the Northern Cape in this financial year.

The Limpopo treatment centre in Seshego will be fully operational by the end of this financial year. These new facilities will improve the quality of treatment and rehabilitation services.

*IsiZulu:*

Okunye okubalulekile ukuthi i-treatment yezidakamizwa akufanele incike ezikhungweni kuphela ngoba zincane. Kufane ukuthi sizame ukuthi sicale nasekhaya kodwa okubalulekile ukuthi ama-NPO enza lo msebenzi kumele abhaliswe ngoba lawa asebenza njengamanje awabhalisiwe.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017

Page: 106

Kumele futhi sicacise ukuthi i-NDA isebenze umsebenzi omkhulu ngokuthi uqeqeshe amakhosikazi nentsha eningi ukuze ikwazi ukufunda ukuphatha ama-NPO, ukubhalisa amabhizinisi asebenza ngokubambisana [co-operatives], nokwazi ukuthunga, ukutshala kanye nokwazi ukuxhumana neminye iminyango esingasebenzisana nayo ukuthuthukisa abantu bethu. I-NDA siyayandisa futhi siqale ngohlelo lokuyiyisa nasemakhaya. I-EPWP sisebenzisana nayo, into ebalulekile njengamanje ukuthi sisebenzisa izingqumo eziphakamisiwe ngesikhathi kwenziwa ukulinganiswa kwe-EPWP.

*English:*

We pay tribute to the late Prof Babatunde Osotimehin, the Executive Director of the United Nations Populations Fund, UNFPA. He worked tirelessly to promote the sexual and reproductive health and rights of women and young people in Africa and across the globe.

I had the honour and privilege of working with him in this field over the years and I was always inspired by his unwavering commitment to human rights and the equality of women to men. The UNFPA will certainly not be the same without him. [Time expired]

Ms L C DLAMINI: Hon Chairperson, with this weather our hearts go out to all the homeless people who have no shelter to hide and to those

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 107**

who live in informal settlement in the Western Cape and other parts of the country. We request the City of Cape Town as well as the Department of Social Development to meet those people at the point of their needs. As it is cold we are rushing to our houses to be safe, they have nowhere to go.

We are supposed to be celebrating what our government is doing for the vulnerable and poor in our society but spiritually we are at our lowest as women, young girls and children of this beautiful South Africa.

Violence against women, young girls and children has reached the tipping point. Hon Minister, who is also the President of the ANC Women's League, we are pleading with you together with our Chairperson who also happens to be a woman and a leader, to lead us in the campaign of protecting our women and the children. Hon Chairperson of the Council and hon Minister, this situation of the killings and abuse of women and children cannot be worse than this.

The Department of Social Development is at the centre of the fight against poverty, unemployment and inequality. Through the department, the South African government remains committed to fight against these triple challenges. In so doing, the department is

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 108**

responsible for ensuring the provision of comprehensive, integrated and sustainable quality social development services to the most vulnerable and poor citizens of South Africa.

The department, through the South African Social Security Agency, Sassa, administers eight grants namely, old age grant; disability grant; foster care grant; care dependency grant, war veteran grant, child support grant, grant-in-aid and social relief of distress grant.

Over the years, the Department of Social Development has come up with a number of programmes that have assisted our poor in the country. For example, in 1994, there were only 2,9 million recipients of grants and to date, social assistance grants are reaching more than 16 million South Africans and more than 12,3 million of whom are children. We really appreciate the work done so far. This represents more than six times the number of recipients in 1994 and contributes significantly to South Africa's progressive realisation of the right to social security as enshrined in article 27 of the South African Constitution.

According to a study by The United Nations Children's Fund, UNICEF, the evidence is clear that children who received the grant –

particularly those who had been enrolled at birth – completed more grades of schooling and performed better, were less likely to experience illness or stunting and more likely to have their growth monitored by a health professional.

Social assistance grants provide income support to the most vulnerable in our society. These grants account for 94,3% of the social development's total budget allocation of almost R160 billion for this year. It is also worth noting that the spending on grants is also expected to further increase as the Department of Social Development is working towards providing a higher support grant to orphans who are in the care of extended family members. This will bring the social protection provided to these orphans closer to parity with that of those in foster care.

Numerous research studies have indicated that the prevalence of substance abuse in South Africa has reached significant proportions within the youth and adult population. According to the Global Status Report on Alcohol and Health 2011, the hazardous and harmful use of alcohol is a major global contributing factor to death, disease and injury.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 110**

In this regard, the Department of Social Development has initiated a national audit of in and out patient substance dependency treatment centres. The audit aims to assess and monitor compliance with any prescribed requirements and applicable minimum norms and standards for treatment centres and halfway houses.

The state of the nation address 2017 highlighted that during this financial year, the government will continue to work with society in fighting social ills that affect communities such as drug and substance abuse. It also states that government will prioritise the provision of treatment and prevention services. When you look at the decline in the budget for the substance abuse sub-programme, it is unclear how the department is going to do that. We are raising this as a concern, hon Minister, because substance abuse is a threat to our youth and the society but we have noticed that the budget has been reduced.

I heard hon Minister mentioning other provinces but there is Swaardfontein in Mpumalanga that is half renovated by the Department of Trade and Industry. We went there in April and it needs major renovations. Although it is doing a good job by accommodating patients from other provinces, there is also a long waiting list due

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 111**

to unavailable psychiatric services there; they depend on the local hospital which is also under distress because of their own patients.

As the National Development Agency, NDA, will be assisting to conclude that project, we are requesting that a ward that is responsible for psychiatric services be part of the centre so that the centre does not depend on the hospitals around the area.

As the Select Committee on Social Services, we have continuously raised the issue of unemployed social workers. We appreciate hon Minister that you have taken our recommendations and we hope that provinces will follow suit.

The National Development Plan, NDP, supports social security reforms that are being considered by government, including mandatory retirement contributions. It emphasises the need for some social protection of the working age population including through enhancing public employment programmes such as the Expanded Public Works Programme, as mentioned by the Minister.

The NDP further advocates that social welfare services be expanded, funding for non-profit organisations reviewed, and more education and training expanded for social service practitioners. It also

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 112**

highlights gaps and strategies that government must pursue to effectively build a human capital foundation for the country through early childhood development centres.

In our visit in Mpumalanga we saw beautiful early childhood development centres that are built by the NDA and we appreciate that hon Minister. We are requesting that this be extended to other provinces like the Eastern Cape because it the opposite situation there; it is pathetic. That is why we are requesting that we increase the budget of the NDA because the work they are doing has a potential to contribute to the economy of the country.

Hon Chairperson, as a committee we had enough time to go through the plan of the department, in fact, we had two sessions with them and made recommendations, they came back again and we discussed. We think with that the department will be able to take us forward with an understanding that with regards to the Sassa issues that we all know, we requested the department to go back and projectise and monitor the implementation of the court findings to avoid finding ourselves in the same situation as we did last year.

With that, the committee supports the budget of the department.

Thank you Chair.



UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017

Page: 113

Ms T G MPAMBO-SIBHUKWANA: Thank you hon Chairperson.

*IsiXhosa:*

... nam mandizeke mzekweni ndidlule kwelamanyange ndithi kwabo baphulukene neentsapho zabo, noomama babo abangamashumi amabini, mabalale ngenxeba kuba nguThixo othathayo ikwanguye nonikayo.

*English:*

Hon Chairperson, South Africa is a country that is marked by vast discrepancies in resources, wealth, education as well as career opportunities. This is one of the many legacies of apartheid but also a common feature of newly industrialized countries worldwide, as there are increasing pressures to remain competitive in the globalized world.

The Department of Social Development's main objective is to provide comprehensive, integrated, sustainable and quality social development services.

The department, which is responsible for management and oversight over social security and also regulating developmental social welfare services that provide support to alleviate poverty, vulnerability and the impact of HIV/Aids, flags its approach as

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 114**

being in the spirit of "Batho Pele Principles" which directly translates into "People first."

However, as of recently, the department does not seem to be living up to this a roach. One of the issues we are faced with is what the Minister has just alluded to - the shortage of social workers.

Hon Dlamini from Mpumalanga also said that there is a shortage of social workers in the rehabilitation centre that we visited in April.

The National Development Plan found that it will need approximately 60 000 additional welfare service practitioners by the year 2030, in order to meet South Africa's welfare needs.

Currently there are just over 17 000 operational social workers in the country, of whom only 14 000 are government employees. Further research shows that the South African government pays dedicated social care workers less than anyone else in that form of employment. This has been approximated to almost R500 per month. Included in this badly paid group are social workers, home-based care givers and providers and counsellors who help with victims of domestic abuse and child abuse.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 115**

Hon Chairperson, we as the DA recognizes the role these social care workers in both the individual lives of patients as well as in the broader communities.

If we want to ensure sufficient, consistent and quality care for one of our most vulnerable groups of our society, then we should acknowledge the fact that social workers deserve more respect and dignity to better services.

Just recently it has been reported that Cash Paymaster Services recorded a tax profit of approximately R1,1 billion from paying social grants on behalf of the government. Such a profit is concerning as the lawfulness and the accessibility of social grants to deserving people remains controversial topic.

How can we accept such significant money being written off as profit when we are not even creating job opportunities for the youth who live in poverty and receive state assistance grant that in some barely cases supports them.

A company such as Net1, which is responsible for an organ of state function, should not be benefiting or making any kind of profit from contracts such as this.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 116**

How can we accept such a considerable amount of money being written off as profit when the legal basis of the contract with Net1 and the state has been declared unlawful? This is a concern, it also raises a question: what did the Minister gets as benefit in this regard?

It is important to note that this profit of R1 billion only covers the money that has been accounted for. It therefore excludes the money that was received for loans, airtimes and other controversial deductions. It is not unreasonable Chairperson, for one to suspect that there are larger profits than this to be accounted for.

Ms T WANA: Thank you Chairperson, can the speaker take a question?

Ms T G MPAMBO-SIBHUKWANA: Chairperson, at the end of the year.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms. M C Dikgale): She is not ready Mam.

Ms T G MPAMBO-SIBHUKWANA: Although these figures is already a cause for concern, this is not unreasonable for one to suspect that there are larger ... [Interjection.]

Mr S G MTHIMUNYE: Chair, the speaker makes reference to the Minister, allegedly has - she puts a question, how much did the

Minister receive out of the kickbacks that she alleges were transacted among the people. Therefore, from where I stand that cast aspersion on the person of the Minister.

HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms. M C Dikgale): Thank you hon Mthimunye, your point of order is taken. You are very correct. Hon member, please don't put aspersion on the Minister.

Ms T G MPAMBO-SIBHUKWANA: Chairperson that was a rhetoric question. I must teach you forms of speech.

HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms. M C Dikgale): Hon Mpambo-Sibhukwana, you are not chairing, please continue with your debate.

Ms T G MPAMBO-SIBHUKWANA: We as the DA strongly believe that Net1 should be held accountable by declaring the profit and returning the money they received in profits.

Ms L C Dlamini: I 'm standing on a point of order hon Chair. Is it parliamentary that the EFF will be a spokesperson of the DA all the time?

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 118**

HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms. M C Dikgale): Hon Dlamini, you are out of order Mam. Take your seat. Continue hon Sibhukwana.

Ms T G MPAMBO-SIBHUKWANA: We stand with the Constitutional Court's ruling that a party to ... [Interjection.]

Mr L B GAEHLER: Chairperson, with due respect, when the NCOP Chairperson was residing there, she made a ruling that these unnecessary point of orders must stop. Now, this is happening and because it is a ruling party you are not stopping it. Why is it so because the Chairperson ruled here in our presence that this must stop? Thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms. M C Dikgale): The hon Gaehler, I 'm sure you did not listen to me carefully. I have to listen to the point of orders and make a ruling; and that I did.

Mr J W W JULIUS: Thank you House Chair. Chairperson, I'm extending that point of order due to the fact that earlier on it was also ruled that it is a point of debate. Whether you cast aspersions on the character or what of the Minister the Minister can come back and debate. This is a debate.

The Minister must come back and tell us how much did she gets out of those contracts. She has the entire podium and all the time to come and tell us there - and come on record to say I did not take it. It is a debate. She has an opportunity to come back.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms. M C Dikgale): Hon Julius, that is not a point of order, I have made a ruling on that one. We continue; continue hon Sibhukwana.

Ms T G MPAMBO-SIBHUKWANA: This is why the DA has reffered the CPS profit to the Minister of Finance, hon Malusi Gigaba, for the Chief Procurement Officer to investigate this manner. We will get ... [The truth.] ... at the end of the day.

*IsiXhosa:*

... inyani ekugqibeleni kwaye yona izakuvela.

*English:*

We expect a reply from Minister Gigaba in this regard and not a covering up. In these cases, the issue is not about the system that has been put in place.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 120**

Under the correct supervision and leadership, such an agreement between the company such as Net1 and government agency Sassa has the potential to viable and dependable procurement.

This, however, is not the reality. Almost no accountability is being taken; it seems that everyone has adopted the Minister's approach to avoiding responsibility for state failures.

In conclusion Chair, I would like to say instead of focusing to the needs of the people of this country, the Net1 scored R1, 1 billion from the unlawful Sassa contract, and the CPS had a 12, 2% profit margin on the distribution of grants.

The Minister is so busy other than protecting the vulnerable of South Africa as a constitutional mandate. She is so busy allocating R3 million from her department to protect her VIP children and that of Lumka Oliphant - squandering R3 million. Where are the job opportunities for the youth? [Applauds.] That money could have gone into the youth.

She cannot protect the most vulnerable. She goes around campaigning in communities for Nkosazana Dlamini Zuma whom she is related to. The Minister believes some people are more important than the other



UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017

Page: 121

people. I would like to say, with my one minute, twenty five seconds left.

Mr S G MTHIMUNYE: Chairperson, the speaker continues to refer to allegations as though they were facts. I think she continues to cast aspersions on the person of the Minister.

HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Eh! Hon Mthimunye, my apology sir, what I'm going to say is not what you are expecting. You are out of order. Continue. I'm chairing. Order! Order hon members!

Ms T J MOKWELE: Chair, it looks like you are biased towards the ANC. Why are you so lenient? You must just tell him that he is out of order.

HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms. M C Dikgale): You are out of order hon Mokwele. I have ruled on the matter and I told the member that he is out of order. Take your seat hon Mokwele.

Ms T J MOKWELE: Don't say you have ruled on the matter. Don't be romantic like that.

*Setswana:*

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017

Page: 122

Hee banna! ... [Inaudible.]

HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms. M C Dikgale): Hon Mokwele, take your seat.  
Continue hon Sibhukwana. Order hon members!

Ms T G MPAMBO-SIBHUKWANA: Hon Chairperson, I further go on to say that hon Minister Dlamini believes some people are more important than the others. In this regard Lumka Oliphant, her spokesperson together with her children the VIP protection should be paid from her own salary, not from the taxpayer. It is not right. [Applauds.]

Could I also remind the Minister that despite the fact that people were paid on the 01 April 2017, Chairperson, in Rabasotho - and I did say this in the select committee. In Rabasotho in Tembisa Gauteng province, people were not paid. In conclusion, Chairperson I would like to say during this past week, we celebrated Child Protection Week, it is quite sad that we have lost so many people. I would like to say, let the spirit of women and girl children who become the nation and communities and make families in this country - be uplifted. I thank you. [Applause.]

*IsiXhosa:*

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 123**

Nks P C SAMKA: Sihlalo ohloniphekileyo, Mphathiswa, uMama Bathabile Dlamini, amalungu ahloniphekileyo ale Ndlu, uMbhexeshi oyintloko, iindwendwe zethu eziphaya phezulu, manene nani manenekazi, mandibulise ngegama elihle leNkosi. Okokuqala, mandiqale ndigqithise lo myalezo egameni lamalungu amele iMpuma Koloni akule Ndlu ndilandele okuchatshazelwe nguMphathiswa uBathabile Dlamini malunga nokusweleka kukaSakhumzi obeligosa phaya kuMasipala oMbaxa iNelson Mandela Bay eMpuma Koloni othe wasishiya engozini. Sithi singala malungu, umphefumlo wakhe mawuphumle ngoxolo, silila nabo kwezi ntsuku zinzima.

Kuluvuyo kum ukuphinda ndithabathe inxaxheba kuHlahlo-lwabiwo-mali le-17 yeSebe lezoPhuhliso loLuntu yama-2017-18. Ukususela ngowe-1994 ukuza kuthi ga ngoku iyabonakala indima edlalwe ngurhulumente ekulweni indlala egubungele ilizwe lethu. ISebe lezoPhuhliso loLuntu lisebe elijongene noxanduva lokunika inkxaso kubantu abahlelelekileyo nakwabo bangathath'entweni ukuze bakwazi ukuzimela ngokuthi bafumane uqeqesho oluya kubenza babenezakhono eziya kuba lulutho kubantu ngokubanzi. Kwakhona, eli sebe lelona sebe lihamba phambili ekuququzeleleni amanye amasebe ukuze angenelele ekulweni nale ndlala.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 124**

Nangona urhulumente encedisana noluntu, kubalulekile ukuba abafundise ukuloba intlazi abantu angasoloko ebanika intlanzi esandleni. Yoko ke loo nto ifuna imali ethe xhaxhe ukuze ibe iyenzeka ukuncedisana nesebe eli kunye noluntu. UMgaqo-siseko unika ilungelo lemfundo kubantwana bonke nto leyo enyanzela ukuba abantwana bafumane iziseko ezizizo. Eli sebe kufuneka libambisene noorhulumente basemakhaya (local government) ekuqinisekiseni ukuba iindawo zokufundela ziyakhiwa ukuze abantwana bakhule kakuhle, bafumane iziseko ezizizo bekhuselekile kananjalo.

Uphando olwenziwe ngabeNkxaso-mali yabaNtwana yeZizwe eziManyeneyo, Unicef, lunika ubungqina bokuba abantwana abaxhamle kwesi sibonelelo, ingakumbi abo baxhamle besebancinci, bakumabakala aphezulu kwezemfundo kunjalo nje baqhuba kakuhle. ISebe lezeMpilo nalo aliyekanga ukubaxhsa ngezonyango nto leyo engqina umsebenzi owenziwa liSebe lezoPhuhliso loLuntu. Ukunyuka kwezinga lokusetyenziswa kweziyobisi kumandla kodwa masiyincome indima edlalwa leli sebe kuba lisoloko lithe gqolo ukuqinisekisa ukuba abo bangamaxhoba eziyobisi bayaqokelelwa ukuze basondezwe kumaziko apho baya kuthi banyangwe baze baqeqeshwe khonukuze bathi bephuma apho babe bengabantu abanekamva eliqaqambileyo. Kwintetho kaMongameli yobume ngelizwe ugxininise ukusebenzisana noluntu ukuze kuliwe naziphi na izigulo ezichaphazela lona nokusetyenziswa kweziyobisi.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 125**

Ukuba uyaqwalasela kuhlalo-lwabiwo-mali uya kufumanisa ukuba lwehlile kweli isebe. Xa kusehliswa uhlahlo-lwabiwo-mali kweyona nto ingumceli-mngeni ingaba eli sebe liza kuwuphumeza njani lo msebenzi ukuze abantu bakwazi ukuphuncuka kulo mkhuba wokusetyenziswa kweziyobisi? Enye yezinto esenza singonwabi ncam singumbutho we-ANC kukunqongophala koonontlalo-ntle babe bebaninzi abathi bafumana inkxaso-mali kwizifundo zabo kodwa namhlanje bahleli nje emakhaya.

Isebe kufuneka liyithabathele amanyathelo aphezulu ukuqinisekisa ukuba bayangena emisebenzini. Ndivuyile ukuva, Mphathiswa, ukuba kukho imali ebekelwe bucala ukujongana nokugashwa koonontlalo-ntle. Ndimvile kwakhona uMphathiswa wesebe kwiphondo uMam' uSihlwayi ngoMvulo kwinkqubo u-Apha na phaya kaMhlobo Wenene esithi eMpuma Koloni i-100 loonontlalo-ntle liza kugeshwa kuzo zonke eza ngingqi. Loo nto ithetha ukuba okuthethwe apha phezulu kwehlela emazantsi. Yiloo nto siyinqwenelayo ke thina singumbutho we-ANC.

Xa ndiza kuhlala phantsi Sihlalo, makhe ndibhekise apha kubantu bakuthi baseMzantsi Afrika. Urhulumente wenza konke anako ukuqinisekisa ukuba uncedisana nabo ngokuba abanike izibonelelo. Masiziphatheni kakuhle sizisebenzise kwezi ndawo zimele ukuba ziya kuzo. Ukuba imali ijongene nomtwana, mayiye emntwaneni ngokunjalo nakumakhulu kufuneka ijongane nomakhulu. Akufunekanga ukuba ibe

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 126**

yimali yokuthenga ngayo iziyobisi. Loo nto iya kumenza urhulumente abe madol'anzima ukuqhubeka ngazo.

Ngeliphandle, ndifuna ukuthi i-ANC iyaluxhasa olu hlahlo-lwabiwo-mali. Enkosi. [kwaqhwatywa.]

Ms D B NGWENYA: Chairperson, hon members of the NCOP, special delegates and the citizens in the gallery. Firstly, the EFF would like to send our heartfelt condolences to our fighter deputy secretary of the EFF Free State, fighter Lewile Modisanyane, who has sadly left us. May his soul, rest in perfect peace.

Chair, the EFF rejects Budget Vote 17 on Social Development. How can this department come here and expect us to accept this Budget when we know that this budget will be used to protect the Ministers families, buy for them cars and be used as the Ministers' own private fund.

Ms T WANA: Chairperson, is the speaker ready to take a question?

Ms D B NGWENYA: No, Chair. May I continue with my speech?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Continue, hon member.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 127**

Ms D B NGWENYA: While I could talk for hours on the countless examples of corruption within the department and its entities this speech will focus on some ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Chairperson, is it parliamentary for the hon member to cast aspersions on the Minister about the allegations insinuations about the Budget?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon Mokwele, please, allow me to ... Take your seat, hon member. Hon Mokwele! Hon Koni, No, no! The hon House Chair, that is a point of debate. Continue, hon Ngwenya.

Ms D B NGWENYA: While I could talk for hours on the countless examples of corruption within the department and its entities this speech will focus on some of the fundamental issues relating to social development. As the EFF, we do not believe that social grants are a long term solution to the problems facing this country. People do not want your money, they want jobs. That is what as the EFF understands as human dignity, Minister. If the government was serious about social development they would expropriate the land without compensation, nationalise the means of production and strategic sectors of the economy so that it benefits the people,

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 128**

they would support and drive industrialisation and a more diverse economy which could employ more people, they would do away with the tender systems, employ people to do the work of government instead of outsourcing it and provide quality decolonised education.

Doing this would cause unemployment to drop and mean people wouldn't need government grants and food parcels. Nevertheless, we understand that in the context of the white dominated ... [Interjections.]

Ms T J MOKWELE: Sorry commissar. I just want to check what is Minister Zwane doing in the House? What is he doing in the House or he is here to protect his fellow Gupta friend?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon Mokwele, take your seat. Hon Mokwele, you are out of order. Please, don't repeat that. Continue, hon Ngwenya.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE NCOP: Chair, my appeal is that can members respect really the people in the gallery. They have attended here for a very important debate to address huge backlog that is facing our people and also that the sitting of a council is open, hon Zwane is a member of the executive and he has a full right to seat in these proceedings. Thank you.



UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017

Page: 129

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon Chief Whip, that is why I said hon Mokwele is out of order. She knows very well that the hon member is a Member of Parliament and he has all the right to be here. Hon Koni, why are you on your feet?

Ms N P KONI: The point of order Chairperson is, the hon Chief Whip ...

*Setswana:*

... a seke atla gore tshosetsa a re bolelela gore re dire mmereko wa rona. Re itse melao ya Ntlo e go feta bona batho ba re ba fitlhelang mo. Jaanong re kopa gore a seke a tla go re tshosetsa fa re tlhagisa dintlha tsa kgalemo.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon Koni, No,no! That is not a point of order. You are out of order, hon member. Take your seat. Let your hon member continue with the debate.

Ms D B NGWENYA: Nevertheless, we understand that in the context of the white dominated neoliberal economy which is allowed to flourish by the ANC, millions of our people particularly the black majority will not find jobs and will continue to live in poverty making them

reliant on the grant as they have been dispossessed of the land and the resources which would have allowed them to support themselves.

Ms T WANA: Chairperson, a point of privilege.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): What is the point of privilege?

*IsiXhosa:*

Nks T WANA: Hayi, bendikhumbuza abantu emakhaya ukuba babone le meko esiphakathi kwayo yabantu abangakwaziyo ukulawuleka. Enkosi.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon Wana, that is not a point of privilege, you are out of order. Continue, hon member. Hon Mokwele, please, take your seat. Let me recognise hon Gaehler first, he raised a hand before you.

Mr L B GAEHLER: Chairperson, the weather is bad outside and we cannot continue like this here. Hon Wana cannot raise unnecessary point of orders, please. Thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): The point of order sustained, hon member Gaehler. Hon Mokwele.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 131**

Ms T J MOKWELE: You know, hon Wana is the worst sleepest in this House. She must never ever say anything because once she wakes up she stands on a point of order. You are the worst, wena! (you)

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon Mokwele! hon Mokwele, hon Mokwele. Eish! Continue, hon member.

Ms D B NGWENYA: Chairperson, we as the EFF therefore propose that grants be increased as follows: pensioners and disability grants increase from R1,600 to R3,200, the child support grant must increase from R380 to R800, the war veteran grant must increase from R1,200 to R2,400, care dependency grant must be increased from R1,600 to R3,200, foster child care grants must increase from R920 to R1,840. On the Sassa issue we find it another example of how the ANC government has turned this country into a banana republic and is breaking down our constitutional democracy.

Ms L C DLAMINI: Chairperson, I am just standing on a point of order. Is there a foster chair grant in the department?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon Dlamini, please, take your seat. You know you are out of order. Continue, hon member.

[Laughter.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017

Page: 132

Ms D B NGWENYA: May I continue, Chair?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Continue, hon member.

Ms D B NGWENYA: It is the outsourcing of grants through a tendering system, which is how government officials in the department have been enriching themselves with the illegally procured Cash Paymaster Services, which is a foreign white-owned company. It is why the Minister did everything in her power to hold the country at ransom so she could ensure that the country has no other option but to work with CPS, Cash Paymaster Services, in the distribution of grants despite the court rulings that its contract with CPS was illegally procured over two years ago. All of this was done so that the Minister's friends, family and close comrades would benefit from the illegal contract. For this, the Minister Bathabile Dlamini should have stepped down but we know that she won't, as long as her, the President and their friends continue to benefit from the Sassa contract. It is for all of these reasons, Chairperson, that we reject this budget.

*IsiXhosa:*

Sithi isidima sabantu masibuyiselwe ...

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017

Page: 133

*English:*

... in this country. Thank you, Chair.

Mr L B GAEHLER: Chairperson, let me pass ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Order hon members!

Mr L B GAEHLER: ... the UDM's condolences to a young woman who was killed this morning, the two-year old child in Atlantis. Also a 17-year old boy in North West who killed his girlfriend, who was pregnant, may their souls rest in peace. During the 41st anniversary of the Youth Month, we want to bring the attention of the department that the grant that is intended to benefit our children is a suspect of misuse. Its intended purpose and outcomes may not be realised if there a no strong monitoring and evaluation systems in place. In this regard, we call on the department to put in place, implement a thorough system of monitoring and evaluation of whether the child grant received is used for the purposes it was designed for and whether the outcomes are realised

Hon Minister, notwithstanding the Constitutional Court judgement with regard to the illegal deduction from the social grant beneficiaries and in particular, without their knowledge and

consent; we are also receiving complaints of illegal deductions from beneficiaries in our constituencies, that is happening now Minister. Accordingly, we would wish to be clarified on the progress made with regard to the stopping of the illegal deductions that robs the social grant beneficiaries of beneficiation of their rights. No one must deduct from the social grants without the expressed consent of the unsuspecting beneficiary. Secondly, given that the social grant beneficiaries are illiterate, it would be important that the department investigate this matter and where there is a breach of law the offender must be brought to book.

One of the greatest enemies of building sustainable families and communities is the ever increasing abuse of drugs and alcohol. The department has this function as its primary mandate and therefore it should do more to ensure that drugs and alcohol moves out. Sorry, Chairperson, just protect me from this lady here ...

*IsiXhosa:*

Mnu L B GAEHLER: ... ndingekade ndicaphuke, ndiyakucela.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon Dlamini, please, let there be order in the House.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 135**

Mr L B GAEHLER: The system of community-based social welfare workers has to be strengthened and monitoring can be done closer to where there is a challenge. The department pays dedicated care workers less than anyone in its employ. This system needs to be evaluated and give sense and respect. Lastly, the Department of Social Development is paying nongovernmental organisations, NGOs, less to provide services.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon Gaehler!

Mr L B GAEHLER: It expects the NGOs to obtain their funding from the private sector.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon member, Gaehler, please, take a seat.

Mr L B GAEHLER: Mama!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon member, hon Dlamini, why are you on your feet?

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 136**

Ms L C DLAMINI: House Chairperson, on a point of order: I am a hon member of this House; I can not be pointed with a finger by another member in the House no, it can not happen.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon Mokwele! Hon Koni, can you please give her a hearing. Hon Gaehler, she does not want to be pointed with your finger.

Mr L B GAEHLER: She pointed me first. If she did not point I would not have pointed at her.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): It is just that we do not have a TV we only have a Hansard otherwise I was going to consult but you refuse, she did not. Please. Hon Gaehler, stop doing that.

Mr L B GAEHLER: NGOs and welfare's budget has been cut in the Eastern Cape by 50%. We know that with the dawn of democracy, alternative funding has shrunk. The donors have shifted their focus to lower-income countries. At the same time funding for social welfare services by private sector has stagnated. We must invest equally to the care economy. Today due to this weather, eight people have died, we need to pass our condolence to them as well.



*IsiXhosa:*

Mnu L B GAEHLER: Okokugqibela Mphathiswa, kungelishwa ukuba olu hlahlo-lwabiwo-mali lwakho lube nokungaphathwa kakuhle. Njengabantu abangaphumi kwimizi efanayo, Mphathiswa, kodwa inyani masiyithethe yokuba ndandikhe ndakubhalela incwadi ndikhalela abantu abasebenzisa imali esisibonelelo sabantwana ngendlela egwenxa. Zange undiphendule. Imali eyayimele ukuba incede abantwana, kwathengwa ngayo utywala. Kungelishwa ukuba ungazange ukwazi ukundiphendula njengoMphathiswa. Loo nto leyo iyenzeka, imali karhulumente imele ukuba incede kodwa hayi abantwana abangafundi nokufunda.

*English:*

That is what we are talking about. As the Minister, you must not look at us from different political perspective ... .

*IsiXhosa:*

... sijonge nje ngamaLungu ePalamente.

*English:*

The reason I wrote to you and gave you the addresses which you did not come back to me on.

*IsiXhosa:*

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 138**

Aba bantwana baloo ndawo abafundi kwaye imali isetyenziswa ngendlela engalunganga. Le mali ithenga utywala. Enkosi. [Uwelewele.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Thank you very much. Hon members, order. Order! Hon members, please note that the hon Ramathuba's flight was diverted to Kimberley due to bad weather so she is not with us.

Mr M KHAWULA: Hon Chairperson, hon Minister, The social protection programmes in a developing country like South Africa are necessary programmes especially given the current circumstances of large inequality gaps between the poor and rich, slow or stagnant economic growth, pending recession and rising unemployment. It is a pity that the circumstances which necessitate the establishment of social security are the same circumstances that also become a threat to social security. Right now, the Right now, the economic conditions of the country are a threat to the social security programmes of the country. When the growth of the economy is slow or stagnant, when unemployment rises, when the poor get poorer, when inequality widens, the social security net becomes wider and burdens the national fiscus. This is what is unavoidably happening in South Africa.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017

Page: 139

Such a situation calls for extra prudence in the handling of the resources at hand. This is what this department does not have. When one hears of what is charged to SA Social Security Agency, Sassa, by the stubborn service provider Cash Paymaster Services, CPS, in order for the service provider to merely pass on the grants from government to the beneficiaries, one gets a sense of a ripping off of the highest order.

*IsiZulu:*

Kuxetshulwa umkhoma.

*English:*

No wonder the drama that took place when a new service provider was to be procured. How does it happen that a department is given three years by the Constitutional Court to secure the services of a new service provider, but the department fails to do that in that given three years? The same department is given a grace of another 12 months for a job that was not performed in three years. The department boldly comes out to say now the same job it will be done in 12 months. I just wonder who is fooling who. Now the department is under administration by the Constitutional Court. Why should the government continue to pay the salaries of the Minister, the Deputy Minister, the director-general, the chief executive officer, CEO, of

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017

Page: 140

Sassa, when all of them, their duties are being performed by the Constitutional Court?

We missed your presence when we were dealing with social cluster questions in the House. I wanted to find out why the department allowed mayor candidate, Zandile Gumede to campaign in a Mikonzo function in Verulam in July 2016, using department's food parcels and blankets, to campaign for the ANC? When we raise these issues the department always asks for evidence. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Order! Hon Koni and hon Mokwele, order.

Mr M KHAWULA: But this was a function that was attended by both the Ministry and the department. All that happened was taking place in front of them and with their blessings. It is un-African to take the plight of the people and use it to advance yourself and use it for political point scoring.

*IsiZulu:*

Akubona ubuntu ukusebenzisa ukuhlupheka kwabantu ukuziqhakambisa ngako nokuzigayela ivoti.

*English:*

This department services the most vulnerable groups of our country. Integrity, respect and honesty should be amongst your highest priorities in your hierarchy. When you take the dignity of the people and you link it to their plight because they are desperate, you are demeaning the very being of their existence. And this is not acceptable. The Select Committee on Social Services conducted an oversight visit to Mpumalanga province in March 2017. Amongst others, we visited a rehabilitation centre that is well-built and well managed. We also visited a beautiful Early Childhood Development, ECD centre. This shows that the department does have the capacity and ability to can do better if they want to. The challenge is the will power to do well. Sometimes it exists, at other times, it is absent. Former KwaZulu-Natal Premier, Senzo Mchunu coined a phrase in KwaZulu-Natal that said, "Doing good even when no one is watching". That is what we need from a caring civil service. Umntwana wakwaPhindangene at the IFP conference in 2001, after the first local government elections in the country said:

When you take a simple pen, Bic, from the municipality, and it has not been officially given to you, you must know that you have stolen.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 142**

He was saying this to the newly elected councillors. Integrity is doing the right thing even when no one is watching. The underpinning theory in integrity is what Prince Buthelezi calls, "doing what is right because it is the right thing to do." And he learnt and got mentored by the great minds, the likes of Chief Albert Luthuli, Pixely ka Isaka Seme. And this is the philosophy he has instilled in the IFP. [Time expired.] Your department, you can learn a thing or two from this philosophy. I thank you.

Mr C HATTINGH: Hon Chairperson, some of our members in this House ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Order, hon members, order.

Mr C HATTINGH: ... are already sleeping up. Are we all know about the Luthuli House instructions to quote Oliver Tambo when they come to this podium and they simply don't do that and we don't here quote such as never heard this one and I wonder why. We have a vision and he said we once had a vision of South Africa in which black and white shall work and live together as equals in conditions of peace and prosperity.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 143**

While the Chairperson is investigating the dog issue perhaps let this issue also be taken to your heart.

Another quote Oliver Tambo's and this is specifically applicable perhaps to the Minister's speech that the true facts are not always obvious. They often have to be looked for. Now, on that context the question that South Africans specifically those that were directly and indirectly affected by the recent grant payout crisis and which the Minister played and not a small role was what was behind this?

What should have been normal procurement processes rolled out that they become a major controversial issue involving a myriad of role players. Court cases investigations, suspensions, dismissals and even Constitutional court intervention, all contributing to insecurity in our social security system.

The debate whether PostNet can or can't distribute social grant payout still continues, highlighting massive financial interest that the grant payout system contract is creating. It worth billions to the beneficiaries of the only winning tender and I think the Minister would know what I am talking about.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017

Page: 144

The delay in appoint a new service provider which falls the continuation of an illegal contract came because of the intricacies of the Universal Electronic Payout System, UEPS, under scores the high stakes involved which left its impact on stock, even on stock exchanges and then the current era of state capture with Gupta emails leaking implicating many in the looting of the fiscus. It is not strange that the grants payout and the billions involved are also being linked to same loss in confidence in the ANC run government.

In 2012, SASSA award the five-year ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon Hattingh, please take your seat.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): I am checking whether hon Hatting can take just one simple question?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Okay, let's check if ever he can. Hon Hattingh?

Mr C HATTINGH: I am almost done, right when I get there I will take it. In 2012, South African Social Security Agency, SASSA, awarded



the five-year R10 billion contract to distribute social grants to Cash Payment Services, CPS, a subsidiary of Net1, UEPS Technologies. Later that same year, grant recipients around the country began to complain about a noticeable rise in what have come to be called deduction. Deduction is a catch-all term to describe deductions of money for airtime, electricity, insurance and loans, etc from grant beneficiary's bank accounts.

Only yesterday, it was reported in the media that Nomvo Ngejeni, 73, from Bizana, Eastern Cape, had to stand in a queue once a month from dark in the morning for hours to collect her social grant and she was interviewed. She said appreciated the R1600 grant, however she complained about unknown deductions on her grant for the past couple of months. She said she had been receiving only R1 410 and did not know why. I hear the same story and I quote: "I buy electricity and airtime. We do not have electricity in our village and I do not own a phone".

Perhaps the Minister could advise us if she knows where the money goes to. It is a serious concern that the department and SASSA allowed these deductions to continue for years and only recently, after public exposure and pressure, implemented steps to have it stopped.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017

Page: 146

The extended social grant payout saga, including the illegally appointed service provider, not only highlighted the massive amounts involved, but also seriously damaged image and credibility of the department and SASSA. I will not even mention the Ministers name here. It will take years for the damage incurred to be repaired and for confidence to be reinstated.

South Africa does not need a government that is in war with itself quoting the Deputy President's words. We need the government that will put the interest of its people and the obligations imposed by the Constitution before our own interest and greed. Such government will come into place when the 2019 elections will herald a new beginning for South Africa in the post ANC era and in the post Dlamini era. Thank you.

*Sepedi:*

Moh T K MAMPURU: Ke tla go tia, wena. [Tsenoganong.] Ke tla go tia, wena.

Ms T G MPAMBO-SIBHUKWANA: Chairperson, on a point of order: I want to know if it is honourable and I would need your ruling as soon as possible when hon Mampuru points a finger at me saying ...

*Sepedi:*

... o tla ntia.

*English:*

It is not acceptable. I am waiting for her to come beat [tia] me here; I am ready for her - Ready, ready, ready for her.

[Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Order!, hon members.

[Interjections.] Hon Mpambo-Sibhukwana, please take your seat. Hon member you are totally out of order hon Mampuru. You can't do that in the House please. Okay let me recognise the other hon member. Take your seat. [Interjections.] Hon Mpambo-Sibhukwana, she is totally out of order. And she can't do that in this House. Please be quiet hon Mampuru. Let me recognise hon Chabangu and after him it will be hon Khawula and then hon Michalakakis will be the last one. I am sure the hon members are rising on a new point of order because that one I have dealt with it.

Mr M M CHABANGU: Chairperson, on point of order: I am humbly requesting as to whether it's parliamentary for a member to go with a knobkerrie to the podium? [Laughter.] [Interjections.] I am asking?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon Chabangu, please take your seat. You know that you are out of order on that one. You know it is her spiritual weapon so you can't do anything with that one.

Mr M KHAWULA: Hon Chairperson, point of order: We have just debated the issue of abuse of women and children and all of a sudden Chairperson, we cannot allow women in the House to ...

*Sepedi:*

... tiatiana. [Disego.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon Khawula you are out of order. I have ruled on the matter and the matter is laid to rest. [Interjections.] I have ruled. No! Take your seat. I am still recognising the members. [Interjections.] Order! Order! hon members.

Mr G MICHALAKIS: Hon House Chairperson, there was a point of order from the hon Mpanbo-Sibhukwana that the hon Mampuru withdraws her statement. I heard it all the way up to here - it was said over the mike. I would like you to ... because there isn't yet a ruling on her having to withdraw her statement and I think it was very serious breach of the quorum.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017

Page: 149

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon Michalakakis, if she repeats that, she will have to withdraw but now I have ruled on the matter. [Interjections.] I did. I called the hon Mampuru to order. [Interjections.] I asked her not to be ... [Interjections.] I am the one who is chairing here.

Ms L C DLAMINI: Thank you very much hon Chair. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Please take your seats hon members. I will recognise you hon Mokwele. I will recognise you hon Sibhukwana.

Ms L C DLAMINI: Thank you very much hon Chair. I just want to check if it is parliamentary for hon Londt to call hon Mampuru - hon Mampara. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon Dlamini, the hon Mampuru is hon Mampuru - she can't be hon Mampara. You stood up before the hon Mpambo? Okay your time.

Ms T J MOKWELE: I am just requesting you Chair with due respect that you allow hon TK to withdraw ...

*Sepedi:*

... go tiatiana ...

*English:*

... because hon Sibhukwana ...

*Setswana:*

... o tshogile mo a leng gore o tla betswa [tiiwa] ka molamu [knobkerrie].

*Sepedi:*

MODULASETULO WA NTLO (Moh M C Dikgale): Mohl Mokwele, batho bao ba babedi ka moka ga bona ba tšwile tseleng. Mohl Mampuru o rile o tla mo tia; ke mmoditše gore a se sa e bušeletša taba yeo. Mohl Mpambo-Sibhukwana o rile etla, ke gona - ka mo gare ga Ntlo. Ga se ba swanela ke go di dira dilo tšeo. Ga di nyakege ka mo gare ga Ntlo. Re swanetše re tšwele pele ka mošomo wa letšatši, ge maloko a a hlomphegago a ka ntumelela. [Tsenoganong.]

*English:*

Hon House Chair can I recognise hon Sibhukwana? I am sure it is on a new point of order. If it on that one I am not going to allow you.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017

Page: 151

Ms T G MPAMBO-SIBHUKWANA: Hon Chairperson, the Constitution allows us to be treated equally. And from that chair that you are sitting on, you are not showing equally on how you treat the ANC members and the DA members, I being one. Hon Chairperson, I expected you in your ruling to say to hon Mampuru of the ANC, and you being the ANC and me being the DA that she must withdraw. Hon Chairperson, don't treat us differently. When you sit on that chair, you must be neutral.  
[Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon Mpambo-Sibhukwana ...

Ms T G MPAMBO-SIBHUKWANA: South Africans are watching you when you being ... [Inaudible.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon Mpambo-Sibhukwana, you are totally out of order. I have ruled on the matter and now I want to continue. [Interjections.] Hon members, please take your seat. Hon House Chair I want to continue with the debate of the day.  
[Interjections.] Order! hon members.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon House Chair ...

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017

Page: 152

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Before you hon House Chair. [Interjections.] Hon Ximbi and you hon member, please take your seat. You know what you are doing is not allowed in the House. Take your seats. [Interjections.] Hon Nyambi, please take your seat, we want to continue with the order of the day. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): No Chair, it's a very serious matter. I respectfully submit that I was sitting here. I always respect Members of the House and when hon Londt referred to hon Mampuru as hon Mampara, we heard it and hon Dlamini raised the point and we heard it sitting here. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Okay! Hon Nyambi, I have ruled on the matter. I told hon Dlamini that she cannot be hon Mampara, she is hon Mampuru. Can we continue hon members?

[interjections.] Ms Mokwele, take your seat. Take your seat hon Mokwele. Hon Mokwele, take your seat. [Interjections.]

*Sepedi:*

Ga ke sa tšea dintlha tša tshepedišo tša lena, bjale re tšwela pele ka ngangišano ya rena.

*English:*



UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017

Page: 153

Hon Mampuru, please stick to your debate. [Interjections.] Hon Mokwele I have requested to continue with the debate. Take your seat hon Mampuru. Hon Mampuru, take your seat.

*Setswana:*

Mme T J MOKWELE: Ke kopa ka boikokobetse Modulasetulo gore fa o ntse moo ...

*English:*

... eish! You know this white man, eish! You know this white man ne? [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon Mokwele now you are becoming out of order.

Ms T J MOKWELE: ... must not tell me that I am wasting time.

[Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): What is your point of order?

[Interjections.]

Ms T J MOKWELE: This white man must never ever, ... this white man.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017

Page: 154

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon Mokwele, take your seat. Please take your seat. Take your seat hon De Beer. [Interjections.] Hon Mokwele! Hon Mokwele!

Ms T J MOKWELE: Never in your ... [Inaudible.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon Mokwele, take your seat. Hon Mokwele, ... [Interjections.]

Ms T J MOKWELE: Yeses! A white person telling me, yesses.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon Mokwele!

Ms T J MOKWELE: A white person - A racist white person. Who hijacked the struggle. [Inaudible.] [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon Mokwele!

[Interjections.] Hon Ximbi, take your seat! Hon Koni, take your seat! [Interjections.]

Ms T J MOKWELE: A racist white person. [Interjections.] - A racist telling me to sit down. [Interjections.]

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 155**

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon members!

[Interjections.]

Ms T J MOKWELE: A racist! She must never! [Interjections.] Not in my lifetime. [Interjections.] I will never be told by a white person what to do. Never! [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon Mokwele! Hon Mokwele! If you are not going to listen to me I am going to ... [Interjections.] Hon Koni if you continue doing that, I will request you to go out of the House. [Interjections.] Okay! Hon Labuschagne, can I recognise the Chief Whip before you. [Interjections.]

Ms T J MOKWELE: That's what you know. That's what you know. You have hijacked the struggle. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon Mokwele! Hon mokwele!

Ms T J MOKWELE: You have never struggled in your life.

[Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon Mokwele, please go out of the House. [Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017

Page: 156

Ms T J MOKWELE: [Inaudible.] [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon Mokwele, get out of the House!

Ms T J MOKWELE: We are in this mess ... [Inaudible.]  
[Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon Mokwele! Hon Mokwele!  
Hon Mokwele! Please go. [Interjections.]

Ms T J MOKWELE: White racist!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Go! hon Mokwele.

[Interjections.] Can I recognise you hon Chief Whip?

[Interjections.] Hon Labuschagne, please take your seat. I will  
recognise you. [Interjections.] Hon Mokwele, please get out of the  
House. Chief Whip. Order! Hon members! Order! Hon members!

[Interjections.] Hon members, please. Hon Prins you can't do that.

Hon Ximbi! Hon Ximbi! Take your seat. Hon members take your seat.

[Interjections.] Order! Order! Hon members! [Interjections.] Hon  
Dlamini, you can't do that. Hon Koni, please keep quiet man, ai!

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 157**

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE NCOP: Can we appeal ... Chair, this thing doesn't say anything. Thanks.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Order! Hon members! Order! Order! Hon Koni, please order!

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE NCOP: Thanks Chair. First of all Chair, I think I rise to thank the conduct of hon member De Beer in restraining himself under these very serious offensive and unbecoming language in the House which borders on undermining what this House stands for. And I appreciate Chair that even based on the ruling should further relook on the Hansard the repeated statements that are made despite the fact that a ruling has been made in the House. That really borders on degenerating this House into what it is not. So I believe that if you can look into that and help us to always present ourselves in a manner that is acceptable - that furthers the aims and the provisions from the Constitution of the republic. Thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Thank you Chief Whip. Order sustained. Take your seat Mma. Hon Koni, take your seat.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

**WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017**

**Page: 158**

Ms C LABUSCHAGNE: Chairperson thank you for recognising me. I stand up in a point of order just to say, unbecoming language in this House is one thing - but refer to fall back on mere racist calling each other is not becoming for any member of this House. And I conquer with the Chief Whip's request. But I also would like to refer back - A ruling was made on this earlier this year in this House. And I think we should take action on those rulings. Thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Thank you very much. Order sustained. Hon Mampuru, continue with the debate. Hon Ngwenya, and you. What is the problem?

Ms D B NGWENYA: Can I have my mike on? Okay! Chair, I feel like there are some biased unfair things that are going on here. It is not fair to congratulate the hon member because we don't even know what he said to hon Mokwele. They provoke in a very quiet manner because they know that we are vocal, we will respond vocally. We don't know what the hon member said and I feel that it would be fair if you consider both people - who said what to who - to provoke that volcanic ... I don't think hon Mokwele is that insane that she can just go and make noise like she did if she was not provoked.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017

Page: 159

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Thank you very much hon Ngwenya. I think you are on what the Chief Whip has just said. I will look onto matter and come back on the next sitting. Hon Mampuru, continue with your debate.

Moh T K MAMPURU: Mohl Modulasetulo, ke leboga Sefepisegolo ka ge a šetše a ntšeetše mantšu. Ge ke dutše mola fase ka mehla, ke tle ke lebelele ke be ke lebeledišiše gore naa maitshwaro a rena ka mo gare ga Ntlo ye a bjang ka gore Afrika-Borwa ke nnete e re lebeletše. Afrika-Borwa e nyaka go kwa feela ge re re re tšea maphelo a bona re a tloša ntlheng ya mathomo go fihla go ya mafelelo. Ke motho wa go se kgopišege gabonolo ka gore ke tšea gore ke gotše. Go na le se mohl Chabangu a se boletšego - se a se boletšego ke molato wo mogolo. Lebaka le ke le fago ke gore ga go na motho yo a kgethago go ba se a lego sona, o a kgethelwa. Nna ke kgethetšwe go ba se ke lego sona; ke a se rata, ke ikgantšha ka sona ebile ga ke tšhošwe ke motho ka lebaka la gore lena le tletšego mo ka moka ga lena le ka se ntire se ke lego sona. Ke a boa ke re go Modulasetulo wa Ngwako, e re ke gomiše mantšu a ka go mohl Thandi Mpambo-Sibhukwana ke be ke mmotše gore ke a holofela gore a ka se tsoge a dirile bjalo - e ka ba mo diphasetšeng goba dikopanong tša dikomiti, le ge e ka se be ka gare ga Ntlo ye. O a tseba ebile o a nkwa gore ke reng.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017

Page: 160

Tona, ke rata go go tsebiša gore re le komiti ya go hlaola, re lebelelane le kgoro yeo e eteletšego pele - re leboga mašeleng ao ba abetšwego ona ebile re thekga peggo yeo e sepelelanago le mašeleng ao. Lehono ge re le mo ... diboledi ka moka tše di emego mo, di rile, "A meoya ya bona e robale ka khutšo". Ke realo le nna legatong la profense ya Limpopo ka taba ya maabane ya thekisi le lori tše di thulanego thokong ya Lenting. Lenting ke gare ga Lebowakgomo le Ga-Masemola. Batho ba senyane ba lobile maphelo a bona. E sa le morwalo le morotoga go wena Tona ya Kgoro ya Tlhabollo ya Setšhaba ka gore batho ba ba šiile bana bao ba sa tlileng go tla kgorong ya gago ba kgopele thekgo ya mašeleng gore ba kgone go tšwela pele ka maphelo a bona. Se o swanetšego go tseba ke gore, "Tau tša hloka seboka di šiwa ke nare e hlotša." Re seboka ka mo, re ka kgona go fetola maphelo a batho ba Afrika-Borwa.

Tona, o se ke wa tshwenywa ke ba ba rego o a palelwa. O tšeere Tirelo ya Tšhireletšo ya Leago ya Afrika-Borwa (Sassa) wa e kaonafatša. Mošomo wa rena ke eng? Mošomo wa rena bjale ka setšhaba ke go go thuša go nyaka diphošo tšeo di diregago ka gare ga mananeo ao wena o re thušitšego ka ona bjalo ka moetapele wa kgoro. Ke fa mohlala, go na le dilwanalwana tše di tšwelelago kua ke dulago Tubatse, Ga-Sekhukhune - re dikaneditšwe ke meepo, gape re na le bookelo bjo bo bitšwago Dilokong - batho ba tloga mafelong ao ba



goletšego go ona ba tle Ga-Sekhukhune ba lebeletše go tla go nyaka mešomo. Banna ba tlogela malapa a bona ba tla ba nyaka mešomo, gomme ge ba fihla moo ba hwetša basadi ba ka mahwafeng gomme ba dula le bona, ba aga metse. Malwetši a kae ka sebaka seo? Diokobatši tšona di kae ka gore mo go nago le šeleng, moruo o golela godimo gomme dinokwane le tšona di ipha maatla.

Ge di ipha maatla, di kgetha gore di ka ipha maatla ka mokgwa mang. Dinokwane di tlile go tla le dirithifatši tša di neela bana ba rena, go lebeletšwe kudu bana ba bašemane. Bana ba banenyana bona re tlile go reng gonabjale ka gore ba gweba ka mebele ya bona? Re le komiti ya photfolio re bona gore go hloka badirelaleago ga go botse. Re rile Tona a tlogele go šomiša mašeleng a go thekga bana ka ditšhelete tša go ithutela go ba badirelaleago, a upše a re ka mašeleng ao a ba tliše ka mo kgorong ba šome gore ba tle go lebelelana le ditlhohlo tšeo re lebanego le tšona bjalo ka batho ba Afrika-Borwa.

Re a thaba ge tšhišinyo ye ya rena lehono o e adile ka gare ga Ntlo ye. Re a go leboga, go ra gore o na le tsebe ya go theeletša, ebile o na le pelo le maatla o go tšea magato. Tona, ge re le mo lehono, o lebane le tlhohlo yeo o bego o sa e emela bjalo ka moetapele wa Kgoro ya Tlhabollo ya Setšhaba. Ledimo šele le rutlumutše dintlo

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017

Page: 162

ebile batho ba hlokofetše. Gape le dikolo le tšona ga di go. Bana bale ba bannyane ba Lenaneotlhabollo la Dithuto tša bana ba mengwaga ya ka Tlasana(ECD) o tlile go ba iša kae mafelelong ge o fetša ka lenaneo leo? Dikolo di a nyakega, Kgoro ya Thuto ya Motheo a e tle e kgone go go thuša. Kgoro ya Maphelo a e tle go thuša le yona. Ga go na mo re sego ra swanela go se thušane. Ke ka moo ke rego leeto le ga se la motho o tee, leeto le ke leeto la rena ka moka. E re ke re, "E ba le kholofelo, o se ke wa tshwenyega, o tshwenywa ke bao ba rego ga o dire selo." Nnete ke gore ge motho a re ga o dire selo, bokaone a a tšee se wena o mo filego sona a se buše, ka gore o a se nyatša.

Ge re dutše mo ka moka ga rena re na le bomakgolo, bommane, bommagorena le bommamogolo ba rena; re na le bana ba gaborena - bao ba hwetšago mphiwafela ya go fapana. Gona le mphiwafela wa botšofadi, wa go hlokomelwa ke bafepi, wa thušo ya bana, ka moka ga bona ba a e hwetša. O tloga ebile o kgona le go abela digole ditulo tše tša go thwetha (wheelchairs). O kgona le go agela babotlana dintlo. O kgona go rekela bana ba rena ba digotlane diyunifomo gore ba kgone go ya sekolong.

Se re se nyakago go tšwa go kgoro ya gago leina la sona ba re ke eng? Re reng re sa lebelele morwalo wo o o rwelego wa go bona gore

maphelo a batho a a fetoga, ra go botša gore o kgotlelele. Re ka re kgotlelela, o sware o tiiše o tšwele pele ka lebaka la gore ga go sa na motse le o motee mo ba robalago ka tlala. Tlogela go theeletša bao ba rego o goka batho ka diphasela tša dijo. Batho kua magaeng ba reng ba sa bušetše dijo tše go wena le ge tlala e ba bolaya. Ke ka lebaka la eng ba sa re dijo tšeo ga ba di nyake gomme ba re o di romele go batho ba o tla ba goketšago gore ANC e kgone go tšwelela dikgethong. Bao ba holegago ka lebaka la mphiwafela wo o tšwago kgorong ya gago ba reng ba sa ntšhe ka hlogo? Ke ka lebaka la eng ba sa re ka gore ga o dire mošomo wa gago ga ba nyake mphiwafela ka ge o sa ba hole ka selo. Yeo ga e kgonege. Aowa, ge e le letšatši la mathomo la kgwedi, ba ema dilaeneng kua diposong le dipankeng. Ba a tseba gore R1 600 e gona ka gare ga diakhaonte tša bona. Ba a ya, ba a e hwetša tšhelete yeo. Ba a tseba le bana ba rena gore mphiwafela wa thušo ya bana o gona. Ke nnete, ga e fetoge. Se se swanetšego go direga ke gore re dumeleng gore kua morago re be re sa phele gabotse ...

*English:*

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Order, hon members. Hon Mateme! Hon Mateme, order. Order!

*Sepedi:*

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017

Page: 164

Moh T K MAMPURU: ... efela gona bjale gona,mmušo wo o eteletšwego pele ke ANC o gatela pele, o fetola maphelo a batho.

*English:*

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Order! Order, hon member! Hon Mathevula, no, allow the hon member to debate. It's hon Chetty, hon Hunadi Mateme, the hon from the EFF. Hon Chetty! Hon Chetty, hon Chetty, hon Chetty, you know you can't converse aloud in the House. Order, hon member! Hon members! Hon members! What is the problem hon Chabangu? [Interjections.] What is it that you want to say?

Mr M M CHABANGU: House Chair, this thing ...

*Sesotho:*

. . . e etsahalang mona, e etsahala ka lebaka la hao le Sephadi se Seholo. Ha le le moo, le re kame ka kama e lekanang. Ha motho a etsa phoso, o se ke wa nka hore ke ANC kapa mang. Re tshwareng kamoo le tlamehileng ho re tshwara kateng mme ntlo ena e tla tsamaya hantle. Empa ntho eo le e etsang, e tla etsa hore ho se ke ha ba le kgutso hobane le dumella ba bang ho etsa seo ba sa lokelang ho se etsa.

*Sepedi:*

MODULASETULO WA NGWAKO (Moh M C Dikgale): Mohl Chabangu, ga ke tsebe gore o eme ka lebaka lefe ka gore mohl Mateme o be a dira lešata, efela ke mo kgopetše gore a homole. Mohl Chetty o swanetše a homole. Ga ke tsebe gore o bolela ka eng ge o tliša taba ya mokgatlo ngangišanong ye. A re tšweleng pele, Mme Mampuru.

*English:*

Let us proceed with the debate, maybe hon Mateme is not the member of the House but I called her and she is there and she responded to my order. Continue, hon Mampuru.

*Sepedi:*

Moh T K MAMPURU: E re ke boe ke go leboge mosepediši wa kopano ye. Re mo kgweding ya Baswa. Baswa, molaetša ke wo o tšwago go bagologolo, o re: "Popotela ye e sa kwego, e wetše leretheng la mohwelere". E reng re emeng gona mo. Re sa le mo dingangišanong tša rena, ke a bušeletša ke re le se ke la lebala gore moetapele wa lena wa maloba, Tsietsi Mashinini o be a lwela gore le kgone go tseba gore ke lena bo mang. O be a lwela gore le kgone go tseba gore le nyaka eng. Yona kgweding ye ya lena ye, e reng ...

*English:*

... no, no, no, to substance abuse. Say no, no, no to teenage pregnancy ...

*Sepedi:*

... ka gore dilo tše le di dirago ka moka ga tšona, di rweša kgoro ye morwalo wo boima. Mananeo a re a hlotšego re ka se tsoge re feditše go a phethagatša ka gore ge re re re a fetša, morwalo o a gola, ge re re re thiba ka mo, di tšwelela ka thoko yela. Bjale nna ke re kgwedi ye ke ya lena. Baswa, dulang fase le tsitsinkele taba ye, le be le boeleng dibukeng tša lena. Le swanetše le tsebe gore bokamoso bjo bo botse bo hwetšwa thutong, ga go na tsela ya ka pejana ya go hwetša bokamoso bjo bo kgahlišago moo o ka kgonago go humana tša go iphediša. Tsela ya mathomo ya go kgona go iphediša ke ge o rutegile. A re ihlokomeleng, gomme morwalo wo re o rwešitšego kgoro ye le tše dingwe dikgoro, o tla fokotšega.

Ge e le taba ya mešomo yona a re e beeleng ka thoko ka gore Tona o hlalositše mo. Le mo kwele ge a re bona ba lwa le taba ya tlhokego ya mešomo. Re rile batho ba ka se ye sekolong, ba boa, ba dula ka gae bas a šome. Batho ga ba ye sekolong, ba boe gomme go tloga moo ba thwalwe, ba šome. Nna ke le mohl T K Mampuru ke kgwathilwe ke taba ya Mokgatlo wa Bosetšhaba wa Bašomi bao ba Kopanego ba Thuto le Maphelo (Nehawu). Ge mokgatlo wo o be o dira ditšhupetšo, ba be ba

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017

Page: 167

re naa re duletšeng mola batho ba hlaka setšhabeng. Re a go leboga Tona, wa go swana le wena ga a gona. Swara o tiiše, leeto le le ka se fele lehono. Leeto le e sa le le letelele; o se ke wa ba wa fela pelo, ke tlou e hlabja ke diloka. Ba re: "Ngwana hloka moditi molao o tšea ka tsela". Yo a ratago go theeletša o tla theeletša gomme yo a sa ratego go theeletša a ka se theeletše. [Nako e fedile.] A re tšweleng pele ka leeto. Re a e thekga pegu ya gago, Tona. [Legoswi.] [Tsenoganong.]

*IsiZulu:*

UNGQONGQOSHE WEZOKUTHUTHUKISA EZENHLALAKAHLE: Sihlalo namalungu ahloniphekile we-NCOP, ngicela ukubonga ukuthi siyavumelana sonke mayelana nezindaba zokuhlukumezeka kwabantwana nabantu besifazane. Lokho kuchaza ukuthi lezo yizindawo okumele sibambisane kuzona. Ukubambisana kwethu akusho ukuthi sesingabangani kodwa kusho ukuthi zikhona izinto ezisenza ukuthi sizwelane. Okwesibili i-NDP ithi sidinga ochwepheshe bezenhlakalahle abayizi-55 000. Kumele sizame ukuthi ibhajethi ye-NDA ikhuphuke kodwa okumele sikubonge kakhulu ukuthi iyakwazi ukuphuma isebenzisane nosomabhizinisi njengoba sikwazi ukuthi sakhe izinkulisa, njengoba sikwazi ukuthi kube khona izinkulisa ezihambayo [mobile crèche]. Lokho akuwona umsebenzi obengabe wenziwa yithi, loyo umsebenzi okwakumele wenziwe nguhulumeni wasekhaya.

Indaba ye-comprehensive social security sishilo ukuthi sesiyifakile idokhyumentu yengxoxo [discussion document] ku-Nedlac, abasebenzi basayibheka, izobuya ize kithina. Indaba yentela ye-CPS kungcono singayingeni noma mhlawumbe ngizikhulumele mina ngoba ngokomthetho uma ngabe bekukhona umsebenzi eniwenzelwa yinkampani, uma loyo msebenzi uphela kumele nikhethe inkampani ezimele yabacwaningi ukuze ibheke ukuthi kade kukhokhelwa ngendlela efanelekile yini na, bese ithula loyo mbiko. Uma ngabe kuwukuthi kuthathwe imali engaphezu kwaleyo okufanele ukuthi bayithathe, lezo zinto kuzomele ukuthi zilungiswe zonke. Ngakho-ke isazobuya imali yethu uma ngabe kukhona ehambile.

Enye into ukuthi inkantolo yasho kahle ukuthi i-CPS ...

*English:*

... is an extension of government ...

*IsiZulu:*

... ngoba ihlinzeka ngezinsiza zethu kuhulumeni. Le Ndlu yesishayamthetho inelungelo lokuthi ibabize ...

*English:*

... to come and account.



UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017

Page: 169

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms. M C Dikgale): Hon Minister, please take your seat. Order hon members! Hon Mpambo, why are you on your feet?

Ms T G MPAMBO-SIBHUKWANA: Hon Chairperson, firstly before I even ask the Minister if she can take a question, I need your protection in terms of your ANC members ...

HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms. M C Dikgale): That is why I am calling the hon members to order, I am protecting you, I am protecting you. Continue.

Ms T G MPAMBO-SIBHUKWANA: Hon Chairperson, I would like to know if the Minister would take a question with regards to the CPS that she just uttered.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms. M C Dikgale): Hon Minister, are you ready to take the question?

*IsiZulu:*

UNGQONGQOSHE WEZOKUTHUTHUKISA EZENHLALAKAHLE: [Ubuwelewele.] Hhayi, nawe uthe uyowuthatha ekupheleni konyaka umbuzo kodwa mina ungibiza ngekhawadi. [Uhleko.] uyabona-ke inkinga ukuthi la kunabantu abafuna

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017

Page: 170

ukusitshela ukuthi sikhulume kanjani. Mina ngeke ngempela ngikwazi ukukhotha [quote] u-Verwoed owathatha okhokho bethu ...

AMALUNGU AHLONIPHEKILE: Ha!

UNGQONGQOSHE WEZOKUTHUTHUKISA EZENHLALAKAHLE: ... wabenza izigqila ezweni labo.

AMALUNGU AHLONIPHEKILE: Khuluma!

UNGQONGQOSHE WEZOKUTHUTHUKISA EZENHLALAKAHLE: Ngizokhotha u-Oliver Tambo mina ...

AMALUNGU AHLONIPHEKILE: Yebo!

UNGQONGQOSHE WEZOKUTHUTHUKISA EZENHLALAKAHLE: ...ngizokhotha uCharlotte Maxeke ...

AMALUNGU AHLONIPHEKILE: Yebo!

UNGQONGQOSHE WEZOKUTHUTHUKISA EZENHLALAKAHLE: ...ngizokhowutha uLilian Ngoyi ...

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017

Page: 171

AMALUNGU AHLONIPHEKILE: Yebo!

UNGQONGQOSHE WEZOKUTHUTHUKISA EZENHLALAKAHLE: ... ngikhothe uHellen Joseph ... [Ubuwelewele.]

*English:*

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms. M C Dikgale): Hon members, we are not in a choir, we are not in a church.

*IsiZulu:*

UNGQONGQOSHE WEZOKUTHUTHUKISA EZENHLALAKAHLE: Yilabo bantu engizobakhotha, angeke futhi ngithi ngoba ngihlulwa yindaba yokulungisa lo mphathi wami owathi ingcindezelo yayingcono, ngilokhu ngizokhahlela la, ngiyakhahlela ngiyabhoka kodwa ekhaya ngiyahluleka.

Okunye, savuma indaba ... [Ubuwelewele.] ... yebo, indaba yaseThembisa sayizwa. Into ebaluleke kakhulu ukuthi abanye abantu bathatha abantu babahambise ezindaweni lapho kwakungakhokhwa khona ngempelasonto, senza isimemezelo sokuthi abantu abahola impeshini bayazi ukuthi siqhuba kanjani. manje kuthiwa ngibhizi ngikhankasela umama uNkosazana ... [Ubuwelewele.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIPONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

WEDNESDAY, 7 JUNE 2017

Page: 172

*English:*

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms. M C Dikgale): Order hon Hattingh!

*IsiZulu:*

UNGQONGQOSHE WEZOKUTHUTHUKISA EZENHLALAKAHLE: Uyazi, uNkosazana ulwele abantu abaningi besifazane la. Njengoba sikhuluma uye-eDenmark uyothola indondo ... [Isikhathi siphelile.] [Ihlombe.]

Debate concluded.

The House adjourned at 18:09.