

THURSDAY, 09 MARCH 2017

PROCEEDINGS OF THE NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

The Council met at 14:00.

The House Chairperson: Committees, Oversight, Co-operative Government and Intergovernmental Relations took the Chair and requested members to observe a moment of silence for prayers or meditation.

ANNOUNCEMENTS, TABLINGS AND COMMITTEE REPORTS- see col 000.

Mr W F FABER: Chairperson, Just before we start, I'm a bit worried, hon Mampuru who has got a traditional weapon with her here and I'm quite worried about it. She already threatened me when I walked in.
[Laughter]

NOTICES OF MOTION

Mr G MICHALAKIS: House Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the Council I shall move on behalf of the DA:

That the Council debates the accountability of the executive branch of government to this House.

Mr J W W JULIUS: House Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the Council I shall move on behalf of the DA:

That the Council debates the constitutional obligation of Cabinet and all Ministers to answer oral questions in Parliament as a means to be held accountable against the back drop of President Zuma's statement that Ministers should not answer questions when asked to do so.

Mr E MAKUE: Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the Council I shall move on behalf of the ANC:

That the Council debates the collusion of 17 banks including three of South Africa's big banks; observes that the competition commission has been investigating a case of price-fixing and market allocation into trading of foreign currency pairs involving the rand since April 2015, and has now referred the case to the tribunal for prosecution; realises that the commission found that from at least 2007 the respondents had a general agreement to collude on prices for bids office and bid office spreads for the sport trades in relation to currency trading involving the US dollar and the South African rand currency.

Mr C F B SMIT: House Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the Council I shall move on behalf of the DA:

That the Council –

1. notes that according to the latest statistics released in a situational analysis of the ANC governed Mogalakoena Local Municipalities access to pipe water has decreased from 72 922 house holds in 2011 to only 56 082 households in 2016;
2. declares that this is an absolute disgrace and the violation of the constitutional right of the residents of Mogalakoena especially the poor in the respective rural villages who have to dig for water in the banks of rivers alongside animals;
3. acknowledges that this is another slap in the face of our lost generation, the almost 6 million unemployed youth of South Africa;
4. debates the state of access to residential water, and the poor management of current water crisis by the government, which led to dry taps across rural communities in our country.

Ms C LABUSCHAGNE: Deputy Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the Council I shall move on behalf of the DA:

That the Council, debates government's failure to improve the lives of our young South Africans, our lost generation, who do not have employment, education or training.

Mr W F FABER: Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the Council I shall move on behalf of the DA:

That the Council –

1. notes that the South African government has revoked its intent to withdraw from the Roman Statue of International Crime Court, ICC;
2. regrets that the decision comes after the Gauteng High Court rules that the initial process to withdraw from the ICC was unconstitutional and invalid;
3. acknowledges that membership to the ICC signals the country's commitment to human rights and protect citizens from leaders who become enemies of their people;

4. welcomes this decision by the SA government who now have the opportunity to sit back and rethink the wisdom of the late Nelson Mandela that our foreign policy should be based on human rights as stipulated in our Constitution; and
5. calls for the South African government to recommit human right based foreign policy as per our Constitution.

Mr F ESSACK: Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the Council I shall move on behalf of the DA:

That the Council –

1. notes that the desperation within the eMalahleni Local Municipality in Mpumalanga, continues to sink further and further into a dire and looming disaster crisis;
2. realises that as reported in the media at a meeting attended by the Minister of Co-Operative Affairs and Traditional Affairs, Cogta, Des van Rooyen, Premier D D Mabuza said, “using equitable share allocations was out of the question since the equitable share was used to deliver service to the people and not to clear rolling debt”;
3. admits that R1 billion to Eskom remains unpaid whilst the mayor of eMalahleni Local Municipality, Ms L Ntshalintshali

and municipal manager Theo van Vuuren are resorted to desperate measures to find temporary quick fix-solutions such as disposing of municipal land without up to date valuations;

4. regrets that Emalahleni has had six repayment agreements with Eskom but it has never manage to uphold a single one due to its dire financial position, the worse effects are felt by the people of Emalahleni who still face electricity and water interruptions, purely due to the municipality's failure to deliver; and
5. requests the Select Committee on Cogta to investigate this and make urgent recommendations to the NCOP on the state of Emalahleni Municipality.

Ms T WANA: Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the Council I shall move on behalf of the ANC:

That the Council –

1. debates the possible regulation of the exorbitant fees charged by the private health care centre;
2. queries that health care is a very important human right that must be defended all the time and cannot be left solemnly in the hands of the private sector; and

3. resolves that we must also defend the rights of the previously disadvantaged to receive a high quality health care services just like their rich counterparts.

MOTIONS WITHOUT NOTICE

CYNTHIA KLASSEN FROM DELFT PASSED AWAY

(Draft Resolution)

Ms T G MPAMBO-SIBHUKWANA: Hon Chair, on behalf of the DA I hereby submit a motion without notice:

That this Council -

- (1) conveys its deepest sympathy on the loss of our activist, community leader and devoted councillor, Cynthia Klassen, from Delft in the City of Cape Town;
- (2) notes that Cynthia suffered the last six years from cancer;
- (3) further notes that her dedication and commitment to her work will always be remembered as having a positive impact in our people's lives; and

- (4) conveys sincere condolences to her family and may her soul rest in peace.

Motion agreed to in accordance with section 65 of the Constitution.

**SIYA KOLISI APPOINTED AS THE CAPTAIN OF THE STORMERS SUPER RUGBY
TEAM**

(Draft Resolution)

Mr C HATTINGH: Hon Chair, on behalf of the DA I hereby wish to move a motion without notice:

That the Council -

- (1) congratulates Springbok player, Siya Kolisi, on being appointed the Captain of the Stormers Super Rugby Team, becoming the first black South African to captain a Super Rugby Team;
- (2) notes that he led the team in Newlands on Saturday, 25 February 2017, in his first appearance in the new role, in a classic North-South derby against the Bulls; and
- (3) finally notes that Kolisi not only led his team to a 37-24 victory, but also scored a try in the 50th minute.

Motion agreed to in accordance with section 65 of the Constitution.

Mr W F FABER: Hon Chairperson, just on a point of order, we understand that heckling is allowed in the House, but I just want to know if it is parliamentary for a member to come and sit in the House with a golf shirt on. Thank you, Chairperson.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Faber, you do not disturb because hon Hattingh was on the floor and when you stood up I thought you were disturbing. Anyway, we have agreed with that motion. Order, members!

**FORMER PRESIDENT PRESIDENT THABO MBEKI APPOINTED AND INAUGURATED AS
THE NEW CHANCELLOR OF THE UNIVERSITY OF SOUTH AFRICA**

(Draft Resolution)

Mr T C MOTLASHUPING: Hon Chair, I move on behalf of the ANC without notice:

That the Council -

- (1) notes and congratulates former President both of the ANC and the Republic of South Africa on his appointment and inauguration as the new Chancellor of the University of South Africa on 27 February 2017;

- (2) also notes that President Mbeki replaces Judge Bernard Ngoepe, who served as the Chancellor of University of South Africa, Unisa, for 15 years;
- (3) further notes that his appointment is befitting as he is an outstanding African intellectual giant and the most recognisable 21st century proponent of the African Renaissance who is highly regarded internationally, and would give impetus to the institution to be a transformed African University and realise the African Union Agenda 2063;
- (4) takes pride in the Unisa community for believing in President Mbeki's leadership, and there is no doubt that he will as always, discharge his responsibilities conscientiously with utmost diligence; and
- (5) wishes him strength and success in the execution of his new duties.

Motion agreed to in accordance with section 65 of the Constitution.

Mr W F FABER: Hon Chairperson, you did not tell me, yet, if on my point of order if it is parliamentary for a member like ...

[Interjections.] ... Is it parliamentary?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Okay, let me repeat my ruling. Hon Faber, you know that as the National Council of Provinces we do have our own rules that are governing us, and even now we are in the process of finalising the amendments. Therefore, if there is anything that you are against you have an opportunity to get to that process. Therefore, now there is nothing that is unparliamentary that is happening. Hon Mokwele!

PAPIKI BABUILE RELEASED FROM PRISON

(Draft Resolution)

Ms T J MOKWELE: Hon Chair, I rise on behalf of the EFF and move without notice:

That the House -

- (1) notes that Commissar Papiki Babuile the provincial secretary of the EFF in the North West province has been released from prison;
- (2) further notes that Commissar Babuile was wrongfully accused of murder of the late Mr Oupa Chika, may his soul rest in peace, who was then the ANC regional secretary in Dr Kenneth Kaunda;

- (3) also notes that Commissar Papiki is a well respected person within his community of Klerksdorp, her father and her loving husband to his wife Mpho Babuile;
- (4) also notes that he spent almost two and half years behind bars for a crime he did not commit, his reputation and integrity was compromised by this incidence;
- (5) also notes that Commissar Papiki, fighter Lesole and Happy were sentenced both 15 years to life imprisonment;
- (6) the EFF therefore appeals to Supra Mahumapelo and Chika's wife to come out and tell the people of North West who exactly killed Oupa and why was he killed, was it political or personal;
- (7) notes that the leadership of EFF would like to take this opportunity to thank all fighters and leadership of the province for believing in those fighters and commissars; and
- (8) finally notes that most of all would like to thank the commander in chief for continuously leading and supporting those families.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Is there any objection to the motion?

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): In light of the objection the motion may not be proceeded with. The motion without notice will now become notice of a motion.

Motion not agreed to.

MONEY STOLEN AT O R TAMBO INTERNATIONAL AIRPORT

(Draft Resolution)

Mr O S TERBLANCHE: Hon Chairperson, I hereby wish to move without notice on behalf of the DA:

That the House -

(1) expresses a serious concern about the multimillion rand airport heist that took place on 7 March 2017, at the O R Tambo International Airport; and

(2) further notes that this House request the Minister of Public Enterprises and the Commissioner of SA Police Service to appear before the relevant select committee to account to how it was possible for this criminal to get access to the

airport, disguised as members of the police using a marked police vehicle.

Thank you, Chairperson.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Is there any objection to the motion?

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): In light of the objection the motion may not be proceeded with. The motion without notice will now become notice of a motion.

Motion not agreed to.

PEOPLE LEFT HOMELESS AFTER A FIRE DESTROYED THEIR INFORMAL HOUSES

(Draft Resolution)

Mr D L XIMBI: Hon Chairperson, on behalf of the ANC I hereby move a motion without notice:

That the Council -

- (1) notes with deep concern that 25 people were left homeless after a fire destroyed 10 informal houses in Vrygrond on Monday afternoon;
- (2) further notes that the cause of the fire is not known at this stage;
- (3) appreciates the efforts of the fire fighters that brought the fire under control, however the root cause of the fire must be investigated; and
- (4) calls upon the relevant authorities to give the necessary support to the victims.

Motion agreed to in accordance with section 65 of the Constitution.

**DEMOCRATIC ALLIANCE CONDEMNS THE MURDER AND ALLEGED ASSASSINATION OF
RICHMOND MUNICIPAL MANAGER**

(Draft Resolution)

Mr M CHETTY: Hon Chair, on behalf of the DA I hereby move without notice:

That the Council -

- (1) notes that the Democratic Alliance in KwaZulu-Natal condemns in the strongest possible terms the murder and alleged assassination of Richmond Municipal Manager, Sibusiso Sithole, may his soul rest in peace, earlier this week;
- (2) states that it was no secret that Mr Sithole was doing his best to fight corruption and clamp down on wasteful expenditure in the municipality;
- (3) further notes that Mr Sithole also supported the objection to increasing the number of full time councillors in Richmond who would have been paid R800 000 per year excluding benefits which ultimately would have bankrupted the municipality;
- (4) acknowledges that due to his tough stance on corruption and maladministration, Mr Sithole was forced to seek employment elsewhere and was due to take over as municipal manager at Umgeni Municipality on 13 March 2017; and
- (5) calls on the KwaZulu-Natal member of the executive council, MEC, for Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs, Nomusa Dube-Ncube, and the Community Safety MEC, Mxolisi Kaunda to urgently visit the municipality and get to the bottom of this case and ensure that Mr Sithole's killers are brought to book, at the very least these latest killings must

be included in the investigations of the commission into KwaZulu-Natal ever growing political killings; and

- (6) offers our heartfelt condolences to Mr Sithole's family during this painful time, our thoughts are with the Sithole family and our deepest sympathy goes to them.

Motion agreed to in accordance with section 65 of the Constitution

DEPARTMENT OF BASIC EDUCATION UNDERMINES DISTRICTS IN LIMPOPO

(Draft Resolution)

Man B T MATHEVULA: Mutshamaxitulu, hi ku yimela vandla ra EFF ndzi yima ndzi susumeta:

Leswaku Huvo -

- (1) yi lemuka leswaku Ndzawulo ya Dyondzo ya le Swikolweni eLimpopo yi tsan'wa swikolo eswifundzenintsongo swo fana na Mopani, Vhembe, Capricorn, Sekhukhune na Waterberg;

- (2) yi tlhela yi lemuka leswaku vadyondzi va swikolo leswi landzelaka va manyanile swinene etitlilasini: Nghonyama High School, Ukuthula Primary School, Phadi Primary School na Govani Primary School;

(3) yi tlhela yi lemuka leswaku miako ya swikolo leswi boxiweke laha henhla yi hlakarile swinene, kutani vadyondzi a va nga swi koti ku kuma dyondzo hi ku olova eka swona;

(4) yi tlhela yi lemuka leswaku vana va ti-MEC va dyondza eswikolweni swa valungu; na leswaku

(5) tanihi EFF, hi rhamba mfumo lowu rhangeriwaka hi ANC leswaku wu pasisa milawu ya leswaku vana va van'watipolitiki va fanele va dyondza eka swikolo swa mfumo.

(Translation of Xitsonga draft resolution follows.)

[Ms B T MATHEVULA: Chairperson, I hereby give notice that at the next sitting of the House, I shall move on behalf of the EFF:

That the House -

(1) takes note that the Department of Basic Education in Limpopo neglects schools in districts such as Mopani, Vhembe, Capricorn, Sekhukhune and Waterberg;

(2) also note that learners in the following schools are overcrowded in classes, viz. Nghonyama High School, Ukuthula Primary School, Phadi Primary School and Govani Primary School;

(3) also note that school buildings of the above-mentioned schools are dilapidated, thus the learners are unable to get quality education;

(4) also note that the MECs' children attend white schools; and

(5) that as the EFF, we call upon the ANC-led government to pass a legislation that politicians' children should attend public schools.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Is there any objection to the motion?

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): In light of the objection the motion may not be proceeded with. The motion without notice will now become notice of a motion.

Motion not agreed to.

DA CALLS FOR INVESTIGATION INTO MPUMALANGA MEC FOR HEALTH

(Draft Resolution)

Mr F ESSACK: House Chairperson, on behalf of the DA I move without notice:

That the Council –

- (1) notes that the DA will approach the SA Police Service, SAPS, and the Hawks for an investigation into the Mpumalanga Health MEC Gillion Mashego for violating the provisions of the Public Finance Management Act, Act 1 of 1999;
- (2) also notes that MEC Mashego did not launch an investigation into the irregular expenditure of R1,9 billion that was incurred during the 2014-15 financial year;
- (3) further notes that the former Head of Department, Dr A M Morake, went on to incur a further R1,9 billion in irregular expenditure in the 2015-16 financial year, before he was replaced by the current head of department, Dr S Mohangi;
- (4) acknowledges that government officials are not being held accountable for their actions and continuously escape the arm of the law; and
- (5) further acknowledges that money meant for the people must be spent on the people.

The CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Is there any objection to the motion being put? [Interjection.] In light of the objection, the motion may not be proceeded with. The motion without notice will now become a notice of a motion.

COSATU SIGNS THE NATIONAL MINIMUM WAGE AGREEMENT

(Draft Resolution)

Mr S G MTHIMUNYE: House Chairperson, on behalf of the ANC I move without notice:

That this House –

- (1) notes the recent development with the signing of the national minimum wage agreement by the Congress of South African Trade Union, Cosatu, the biggest labour federation in this country;
- (2) also notes that this event marks a giant leap forwards towards the operationalisation of the long-awaited national minimum wage in South Africa;
- (3) believes that the signing of this agreement has sent a clear message by Cosatu of distancing itself from the anti-worker posture adopted by some political parties in this House, including the DA of hon Faber;

- (4) congratulates the leadership of Cosatu and its affiliates for putting national interests of the workers above narrow ideological and political considerations.

The CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Is there any objection to the motion being put? [Interjection.] In light of the objection, the motion may not be proceeded with. The motion without notice will now become a notice of a motion.

GOVERNANCE UNDER THE ANC HAS HIT AN ALL TIME LOW

(Draft Resolution)

Mr J W W JULIUS: House Chairperson, on behalf of the DA I move without notice:

That the Council –

- (1) notes that the current state of affairs in the ANC run government paints a bleak picture of the future for South Africa;

- (2) also notes that governance under the ANC has hit an all time low, illustrated by the 350% salary hike received by the CEO of the Passenger Rail Agency of SA, Prasa; the SABC's power play; the SA Social Security Agency, Sassa, crisis; the

collapse of the SA Post Office; Eskom and its alleged unnecessary load shedding; state capture and the Guptas; domineering CEOs at state-owned enterprises, SOEs; the practice of suspensions without pay for years within the public sector, the deaths of mentally ill patients at Life Esidimeni; policy uncertainty of the ANC; jobs for cadres; high unemployment; slow economic growth and endemic corruption;

- (3) further notes that the only way to secure a better future is a change in government; and
- (4) acknowledges that the DA proves that where we took over governance we root out corruption and deliver better services; and
- (5) further acknowledges that these are some of the reasons voters abandoned the ANC in 2016 local government elections; and
- (6) expects that these will be the reasons voters will vote against the ANC in the 2019 national elections.

The CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Is there any objection to the motion being put? [Interjection.] In light of the objection, the motion may not be proceeded with. The motion without notice will now become a notice of a motion.

**THE DEATH OF ANC STRUGGLE VETERAN AND FORMER ROBBER ISLAND PRISONER,
MONDE MKUNQWANA**

(Draft Resolution)

Mr E M MLAMBO: House Chairperson, on behalf of the ANC I move
without notice:

That the Council –

- (1) notes with sadness the death of the ANC struggle veteran and former Robben Island prisoner, Monde Mkunqwana, who died of heart complications at an East London private hospital on Tuesday, 21 February at the age of 68;
- (2) also notes that, at the time of his death, he was serving on the ANC's National Integrity Committee responsible for monitoring the moral conduct of party members;
- (3) further notes that Mr Mkunqwana is a descendent of Makhanda kaNxele, a Xhosa warrior who led an attack against the British in Grahamstown;
- (4) acknowledges that he was also imprisoned as well in 1963 for an alleged assassination attempt on the then Transkei Paramount Chief Kaiser Matanzima; and

- (5) conveys its deepest condolences to his family, relatives and his organisation, the ANC.

Motion agreed to in accordance with section 65 of the Constitution.

SEXUAL OFFENCES INVOLVING YOUNG GIRLS

(Draft Resolution)

Ms B A ENGELBRECHT: House Chairperson, on behalf of the DA I move without notice:

That the Council –

- (1) notes that in December 2016 there was a case of a 12-year-old girl who was allegedly held as a sex slave by a 37-year-old man;
- (2) also notes that the alleged perpetrator was charged with human trafficking and kidnapping;
- (3) further notes that the girl had been kept as a sex slave from September 2016 until December 2016 when the case was opened;
- (4) acknowledges that in December 2016, girls as young as 14 were found working as prostitutes;

(5) stresses that every child has the constitutional right to be protected from maltreatment, neglect, abuse or degradation; and

(6) resolves to call upon the Minister of Justice and Correctional Services to take necessary measures to ensure that the Sexual Offences Register is updated and to provide a report to the relevant select committee upon completion thereof.

Motion agreed to in accordance with section 65 of the Constitution.

**COMMUNITIES OF MASILONYANA LOCAL MUNICIPALITY IN THE FREE STATE
AGAIN WITHOUT WATER FOR AN EXTENDED PERIOD OF TIME**

(Draft Resolution)

Mr G MICHALAKIS: House Chairperson, on behalf of the DA I move without notice:

That the Council –

(1) notes that communities of Masilonyana Local Municipality in the Free State have recently again been without water for an extended period of time;

- (2) also notes that this problem could have been prevented and that the main reason for this state of affairs is disintegrating infrastructure and a serious financial crisis;
- (3) further notes that I have taken this matter up on numerous occasions over the past two years with the Ministry of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs, but am still awaiting a reply;
- (4) acknowledges that the municipality fails to grasp the full extent of the crisis in which these circumstances have caused the municipality to be; and
- (5) resolves to urgently request the mayor and municipal manager to appear before the Select Committee on Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs in order to provide the Parliament with details on how they plan to solve this problem and ensure that the people of these communities are not again left without water for an extended period.

Motion agreed to in accordance with section 65 of the Constitution.

2017 FISCAL FRAMEWORK AND REVENUE PROPOSALS

(Consideration of Report of the Select Committee on Finance)

Ms C LABUSCHAGNE: Deputy Chair, I rise on a point of order and I would like to quote Rule 22: "The business of the Council to be attended to at a sitting of the Council must be set out on the Order Paper arranged by the Chief Whip of the Council."

I just want to draw the attention of the Council to the fact that the order of the day, Order Number 1: the Fiscal Framework and Revenue Proposals, was never discussed in a Whippery meeting and our party was not consulted on this. I read this on the Order Paper when this Order Paper came out. And that was the time that was given to us as a party to prepare. This is a very concerning situation. Thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): I'm not going to be able to make justice to the point of order you're raising hon Labuschagne. But suffice to the Rule that the issue will be considered, I'm not subject the meeting to discuss what you're raising but it will be attended to and you'll get proper response why it was done that way if the Rule was not adhered to.

Not unless there's something different, hon Mokwele?

Ms T J MOKWELE: It's almost similar to what hon Labuschagne has just said ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Let me not suppress you ...
[Interjections.]

Ms T J MOKWELE: But can you hear me out?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): I want ... [Interjections.]

Ms T J MOKWELE: Earlier, earlier ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Sorry hon Mokwele ...
[Interjections.]

Ms T J MOKWELE: Can I continue?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): No, no, before you continue.
If it's almost related to what hon Labuschagne is raising I'm saying
a due process will be attended to. I'll take the issue to the Chair
so that it can be addressed accordingly but I'm saying it won't be
proper for me to subject the House now to discuss it, and I'm not
saying she's out of order and I'm not saying she's in order. But I'm
saying it's going to be attended to, to see why this Rule was not
respected if the allegations are true.

Ms T J MOKWELE: Thank you Chair. Can you now hear me, my other side
of the story? Earlier this month we had multi-party meeting with the
Chairperson where we - I think it is relevant if I raise this matter

in this House so that whatever resolutions that will be taken about the matter be recorded as such. We had a meeting where there was a crisis in terms of the Chief Whip of this House ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Mokwele, can you take your seat so that I can ... take your seat. Let me address it. Anything that is related to something that is in the Order Paper and this Rule that was not respected is going to be addressed and any other issue - I know we do have an Acting Chief Whip, I know he will want to say something to respond, but once I give you an opportunity I'll be forced to give not only him and hon Khawula will do the same thing, hon Gaehler will do the same thing. So, for that reason, I'm appealing that let's agree that the appropriate forum will address adequately this issue you're raising. I'm not dismissing it that's why I'm appealing that let's continue, it will be addressed.

Ms T J MOKWELE: I agree with you Chair but the issue that I'm raising, I'm afraid that it doesn't fall in any structure within Parliament. I don't know where is it going to be addressed and ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): No, let ... [Interjection.]

Ms T J MOKWELE: Listen, Chair. Previously when we were discussing this matter ... [Interjection.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): I don't want to get to that, that is why ...

Ms T J MOKWELE: But listen first and then you will make your ruling. Because when we were discussing the matter we were told that that is the matter of the Council. The Council needs to deal with it, so how are you going to deal with it and when are we going to get the response? That is my question sir, I need to know.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Yes, I'm dealing with that. I'm saying to the House, I've already welcomed even special delegates; they are not even privy, they don't understand what we're discussing now, they're here for another business. And the House sitting now here, I'm not dismissing your issue; I'm saying as somebody presiding, House Chairperson in the NCOP, I'll take the issue to the Chairperson, to the leadership, and the issue will be addressed in detail and you'll be afforded an opportunity to present and the Acting Chief Whip will also have an opportunity to respond. I was even making an example of other parties that might want to have an opportunity to raise whatever.

Let's get to the issue as raised by secretary. Let me invite hon De Beer.

Mr C J DE BEER: House Chair, the key theme in Budget 2017 is transformation for inclusive growth. The Minister said:

Our growth challenge is intertwined with our transformation imperative. We need to transform in order to grow; we need to grow in order to transform. Without transformation, growth will reinforce inequality; without growth, transformation will be distorted by patronage.

Stronger and more inclusive growth is needed. The country should concentrate on transforming the pattern of asset ownership and production, promoting competition and deconcentrating markets. The reality is that 95% of wealth in South Africa is owned by 10% of the people. This has to change.

Presentations were made by the Parliamentary Budget Office and Financial and Fiscal Commission. We also engaged in public hearings where 10 stakeholders made presentations. I turn to the observations. The committee notes that the differences amongst stakeholders who made submissions on the Budget are wider than is usually the case and believes that it may reflect an understandable polarisation in South African society, given the current economic and political climate. Whilst some of the differences may be inevitable, National Treasury and the committee, Parliament in general, as well as other relevant structures should seek to do more to engage more effectively with a cross-section of stakeholders to secure at least a minimum degree of national consensus on the country's goals in terms of economic growth, job creation, and development.

We note National Treasury's responses to the committee's 2017 fiscal framework report to Parliament and require National Treasury to deal further with the recommendations in that report at its next meeting when we are briefed. The majority in the committee welcomes government's commitment to radical economic transformation which it understands to be, as defined by the President in his state of the nation address, as—

... fundamental change in the structure, systems, institutions and patterns of ownership, management and control of the economy in favour of all South Africans, especially the poor, the majority of whom are African and female.

The Budget has to be viewed in this context.

We welcome the fact that the Budget has continued to protect the provision of social services, has provided further resources for the higher education sector, and has ensured that needy students would pay no fee increases. The committee notes the Budget's continuation of the fiscal consolidation path set out in the October 2016 Medium Term Budget Policy Statement. However, National Treasury's 2017–18 growth forecast appears to be more optimistic than those of the SA Reserve Bank, the International Monetary Fund, and the World Bank.

The committee welcomes the proposal to lower the spending ceiling further over the Medium-Term Expenditure Framework period. We also note that the debt-to-GDP ratio sits at above 50% and has been projected to stabilise at 48,2% but only in 2020-21. This is contrary to the previous projection of 46,2% in 2019. As stated in the committee's 8 November 2016 revised fiscal framework report, the committee needs to consider what might be a reasonable debt level, given the country's economic growth and development goals.

The committee is deeply concerned about the decline in private sector investment. Investment growth was 2,6% in 2015, compared to 26% in 2006, and this contributed to an increase in the number of unemployed by 587 000. Government investment has replaced private investment in conditions of declining government revenues.

The committee notes the decreasing revenue from corporate income tax as a percentage of total tax revenue over the last years, representing 17% currently. The committee is concerned about the largest revenue underperformance in eight years, projected at about R30,4 billion for 2016-17. We note the standard considerations that the revenue shortfall could be explained by lower growth than forecasted, lower wage increases that led to lower income tax collected, and reduced imports that led to lower import duty collected.

There has been a significant change in the tax buoyancy ratio from 1,47 to 0,86. Perhaps the Deputy Minister could explain that to us in his reply. The revenue shortfall and uncharacteristic tax buoyancy may have been due, in part, to the calculated delays in processing VAT refunds for the 2015-16 year in order to claim success.

Some stakeholders support a fuel levy in order to raise additional revenue for fiscal consolidation. National Treasury should take cognisance of the regressive impact that an increase in the fuel levy will have on the poor and working class who spend the highest percentage of their monthly income on transport.

The committee welcomes the proposed National Treasury improvements of tax administration and tax collection aimed at clarifying the powers of the Minister to make regulations prescribing the duties for those who administer the Value-Added Tax Act and Income Tax Act and regulations governing the reporting of information to ensure tax administration and tax collection of personal income tax, corporate income tax, withholding tax, and VAT.

There are 29 recommendations, and I will not address every one. The committee requires that National Treasury provide a more comprehensive response than given already to key views of the stakeholders that participated in the hearings at its March quarterly briefing to the committees. The committee broadly agrees

with National Treasury's approach to the interrelationship between growth and transformation as part of radical economic transformation, as set out in the Minister's Budget Speech and Budget documents.

However, there seems to be a lack of understanding of or agreement with the National Treasury approach to radical economic transformation by important role players in government, the state, and civil society. We strongly recommend that National Treasury engage with the relevant role players on this approach. It is also recommended that National Treasury play a more active role in contributing to reducing the wide differences between stakeholders. We are aware that National Treasury makes a significant contribution in this regard, and the responsibility is not that of Treasury alone but of all three spheres of government, legislatures, and other state organs, but recommend that Treasury seek to do more.

We repeat the call made in previous reports for government as a whole to work with business, labour, and civil society to ensure greater economic growth. Treasury should, together with other government departments and organs of state, do more to induce business to invest. So should we, in our constituencies, when we interact with that sector.

The committee notes that even though corporate income tax has been reduced as a percentage of overall taxes, the private sector is not

investing enough in the South African economy. If business continues to abstain from significantly investing in the economy, the committee recommends that National Treasury consider reviewing its reluctance to increase corporate income tax.

Treasury should consider the views of stakeholders expressed in public hearings that it needs to explore alternative ways of implementing fiscal policy, such as reviewing the relevance of the inflation-targeting framework, including whether the blunt instrument currently used - interest rates - is the best alternative to achieve the objective of monetary policy and support economic development.

The committee requires Treasury to report on progress on the possible merger between SAA and SA Express and proposals of further funding of SAA at our next meeting when we engage with Treasury.

Based on the observations, National Treasury and Sars must provide a more comprehensive explanation for the R30,4 billion revenue shortfall for this financial year and, importantly, indicate what is being done to address this. This process should be taken further in the briefings that we will have with National Treasury.

Given the polarised views on the issue of possible VAT increases, the committee urges the Minister to consult widely on any decision to increase VAT in the future and, if VAT is to be increased, to opt

for a model that would protect the poor and the low-income earners more. We recommend that Treasury consider reviewing the basket of consumer goods that is VAT zero rated to be more relevant and appropriately targeted to cushion the poorer people. Poor people also need to be educated on zero-rated goods. It is our job when we do our work in our constituencies. National Treasury should explore the possibilities and efficiencies of higher VAT on luxury goods.

We recommend that Treasury move swiftly to introduce the legislative amendments to the tax laws to improve the administration, collection, and reporting of information on personal income tax, corporate income tax, withholding tax, and VAT.

The committee once again expresses its concerns on the unproductive relationship between the Minister of Finance and the Sars Commissioner and recommends that the Leader of Government Business and/or the President attend to this matter expeditiously. The committee recommends that the Sars Commissioner report fully to the Minister, as required in terms of the law, norms, and established practices and that the Minister oversees Sars' work in terms of the same criteria. This matter has become more urgent in view of the low growth rates, need for more revenue, and shortfalls in tax revenue projected for the 2016-17 financial.

In conclusion, if a group of lions work together as a team, it can bring down a buffalo. It is something to see. We can draw

inspiration from Inkosi Albert Luthuli, the honourable comrade, who said:

I personally believe that here in South Africa, with all our diversities of colour and race, we will show the world a new pattern for democracy ... there is a challenge to us in South Africa to set a new example for the world. Let us not side-step that task.

I believe we can do it. The DA reserved its position on this report. The committee supports the Fiscal Framework Revenue Proposal 2017. Thank you. [Applause.]

Mr F ESSACK: Hon Chairperson, hon members, colleagues, hon Deputy Minister in the House and fellow South Africans, it is great to be here and explain the other side of the coin. I will go slowly so we can adapt and cast this first paragraph because it is a mouthful. The fiscal framework, as mandated by section 77 of the Constitution and the Money Bills Amendment Procedure and Related Matters Act, outlines government's revenue spending and borrowing projections over the medium-term. It forecasts that revenue of R1,66 trillion which is about 30,1% of the gross domestic product, GDP, that we will attain revenue of the income of R1,66 trillion and we will have an expenditure of R1,81 trillion which is about 32,7% of the GDP and that our country's economy will be obstructed, I repeat and that our country's economy will be obstructed by a Budget deficit of some

R145,8 billion which is about minus 2,6% of the GDP by the 2019-20 financial year.

Our net loan debt, is projected then to reach R2,67 trillion which is 48,1% of the GDP in 2019-20 which is only three years away. That debt is the equivalent of a debt of R47 000 per person in South Africa, just think about this, that debt equivalent of a debt of R47 000 per person in South Africa. These are realistic figures which come out of the Budget; they have not been thumbsucked.

As a country we are witnessing how excessive debt results in debt service costs, now projected to reach some R197,3 billion in 2019-20 financial year. Thus in three years' time we will spend more money on debt service costs in this country than we will be spending on health which is projected on R170,8 billion, Defence, police and Justice at R190,03 billion, higher education of course at R68,95 billion or social protection of some R164,93 billion in this year. So, I will try and simplify all of that.

According to the main Budget of 2017 the net loan debt is only going to stabilise at 48,2% of the GDP in 2020-21 financial year. Thus, the DA has proposed that government considers implementing a debt-ceiling in South Africa.

Our economic growth is projected at 1,3% for 2017, up from 0,3% in 2016. We will thus now see a moderate recovery, but this still remains insufficient to reduce the dire unemployment crisis that we

are currently experiencing in this country. And due to lower than expected revenue collection based on the stagnant economic growth and poor tax administration, the Minister has now had to announce tax proposals to raise an additional R28 billion in the 2017-18 financial year.

Hon Deputy Minister, it would be far easier and more prudent to raise this amount by selling some nonstrategic assets as we have discussed, to raise the shortfall in revenues. The former Minister, began this process and we welcomed his decision to sell government stake in Vodacom at that time, which then raised some R25,4 billion in revenue in the 2015-16 financial year.

Colleagues and fellow South Africans out there, if government did the same with Telkom, another nonstrategic asset, then we could raise about R14,7 billion, instead of now forcing the lower income earners of this country to fork out even more money because sadly of a greedy and irresponsible ANC government in power today.

Nevertheless let me go on further to explain, and I will take it easy, because I have some time. You need to kind of digest this for the immediate reference. Thus colleagues, the DA proposes that government considers selling nonstrategic assets to raise revenue that could for example now be ring-fenced to fund this much needed infrastructure expenditure that we so desperately need to roll out in this country.

So, we welcome the R151 billion that will be spent in this financial year on social grants and R77,5 billion that will be spent on higher education. Yes, of course we welcome that. However, it is concerning that irregular expenditure - well I must repeat this very carefully and slowly so you digest this - however, it is concerning that irregular expenditure has increased exponentially to some R46 billion my fellow South Africans, in 2015-16 financial year.

We need to take cognisance of this. Whilst the Minister of Mineral Resources, our man, Mosebenzi Zwane now goes out to purchase a new Mercedes Benz E400 at the cost of R1,35 million something like five days before the Minister of Finance announces the Budget - some food for thought - in totally violation of cost containment measures implemented by the National Treasury. The Minister of Finance contains spending, include an expenditure ceiling, implement cost containment measures, procurement reform and performance and expenditure reviews. But this is something that we speak about all the time, year-on-year and how many of us are really taking cognisance of these serious measures.

So, I will go on further hon Chairperson that we need to implement a Comprehensive Spending Review, requiring the National Treasury, together with the national departments, that is provinces, municipalities and of course state-owned entities, to review the composition of spending in this country, the efficiency of spending and the future spending priorities of this country with a review of

reprioritising expenditure in the Medium-Term Budget between 2017-18 and 2019-20 financial years and if you recall the mind-boggling figures of the ceiling then obviously this has to be now urgently considered.

Thus, the DA proposes that government considers implementing a Comprehensive Spending Review which has proved successful in countries such as Australia, Canada and of course the United Kingdom.

Now further Deputy Minister, it is always great to have you in this House, the DA proposes that Parliament establishes an ad hoc multiparty committee to provide scrutiny and oversight over the implementation of the structural reforms necessary to boost economic growth and create the much needed jobs in South Africa.

Further, hon Deputy Minister, I would like to applaud you for your courage and integrity in standing up against that great grant Gupta family. [Applause.] You confirmed hon Deputy Minister that the family did indeed offer you the top Treasury post. Hon President Jacob Zuma fired Minister Nhlanhla Nene in December the previous year, alongside would what have been a cosy retirement of some R600 000.

Hon Deputy Minister, it seems as if now that you have turned down this money, the floodgates for reapplications for your job and your

current position have now opened up - both Mr Sifiso Buthelezi and Mr Brian Molefe seem to be aspirant Deputy Ministers of Finance.

However, hon Deputy Minister, should you get to your office and find that an aspirant candidate is suddenly occupying your seat or your office, you know you are always welcomed to give the information to the DA as to why that happened. [Applause.] Hon colleagues and my fellow South Africans, it is without doubt that the DA does not support this Bill. Colleagues, I thank you for the opportunity. [Applause.]

Mr M M CHABANGU: House Chair, South Africa's fiscal framework and revenue proposals are inherently incapable and will never ever be able to resolve the challenges of poverty, unemployment, inequality, crime, the ailing economy and an incapable state.

The revenue base is eroding for one or the other reason. The revenue base that existed 10 to 15 years ago is aggressively relocating. Steinhoff has moved its main listing to Frankfurt. Remgro has moved to the British Virgin Islands. Billiton has moved to London. Anglo-American Corporation also moved their primary listing to London. Old Mutual was one of the first companies to move their primary listing in 1999. Other companies that have moved their primary listing include Dimension Data.

It is apparent that they are only doing it for aggressive tax avoidance purposes. This is evidenced by the year-on-year revenue growth that has decreased from 19% in the early 2000s compared to an average of 10% over the last 10 years.

The EFF welcomes the increase in the dividend withholding tax rate from 15% to 20%, and we are of the view that it must be increased to well more than 40%.

The same goes for Corporate Income Tax that has remained marginal; it must also increase to well over 50%.

Now, the issue we want to speak to - and which the fiscal framework did not speak to - is black economic ownership.

Blackstone once said, and I quote:

Legislation alone cannot create relations or change attitudes, but it can set clear standards of accepted behaviour, and provide redress for those who have suffered at the hands of others. If law can play a repressive role by sanctioning racial segregation and discrimination as it has done in Nazi Germany, the American South, Rhodesia and South Africa, it can operate with equal force in the opposite direction by declaring that equality of opportunity, regardless of race or colour, is to be pursued as a major social

objective. It is a statement of public policy by Parliament intended to influence public opinion

It is high time that we legislate black economic ownership. These are the three areas that we need to legislate. Firstly, we must legislate black inclusion in the economy at a minimum of 50%. This is a minimum because black people make up more than 80% of the total population. Secondly, the majority of business licences issued – such as banking licences, mining licences, insurance licences and other licences – must be given to black companies. Lastly, 50% of government procurement must be from companies that are black owned.

This kind of black economic ownership must not be like the failed black economic empowerment, BEE, that only benefitted the few politically connected. This kind of black economic ownership must include employee share ownership schemes and co-operative share ownership schemes so as to ensure maximum inclusion of the majority of black people in the economy – including you, my friend at the back, there!

This Parliament must pass a black economic ownership Act, not empowerment. Thank you.

Mr S J MOHAI: House Chair, hon members and distinguished special delegates, Deputy Minister, fellow comrades, the presentation of this fiscal framework coincides with critical and defining moments

in the history of our country and the evolution of constitutional democracy which, amongst others, include the celebration of the 100th year of one of the greatest giants of our revolution, Comrade Oliver Tambo, the 20th anniversary of the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, and the NCOP as the second of our democratic Parliament.

This imposes an immense duty on us collectively and individually to live true to the defining legacy of this titan of our revolution, namely Oliver Tambo.

We look back on our past with a great sense of pride, and towards our future with confidence, inspired by the fact that the values that OR lived by and died for – namely integrity, honour and selfless service to our people – are the cornerstones of South Africa's constitutional dispensation.

In his Budget Speech of 2017, the hon Minister of Finance outlined the core elements of the domestic macroeconomic outlook within which our fiscal policy framework is located. Among others, he highlighted uneven income growth, the high concentration of wealth in the hands of a few, the fact that 35% of the labour force is unemployed, and that over half of the children in Grade 5 cannot read adequately. This domestic macroeconomic outlook is not isolated from the evolving global macroeconomic outlook, which is equally

characterised by fundamental shifts, accompanied by deepening levels of unemployment, poverty and inequality.

As a developing country, South Africa is faced with massive and growing unemployment poverty and inequality, coupled with a deep structural legacy of underdevelopment.

Hon Deputy Minister, you will surely agree that this necessitates a conscious choice on our part to strike a balance between consumption and investment spending in the productive sectors of the economy. This constitutes a core strategic imperative for building a democratic developmental state that intervenes in the economy in favour of the poor, the vulnerable and the working class.

As we do this, we should be guided by the ANC's macroeconomic policy that strives for macroeconomic balances to support industrialisation, job creation, long-term stability and sustainable growth.

Among the critical policy priorities of the 2017 fiscal policy framework is the containment of the budget deficit and slowing pace of debt accumulation to maintain spending programmes and promote confidence in South Africa's economy.

While the country's current debt ratio stands at about 50%, this has, however, been projected to stabilise at around 40% over the 2017 Medium-Term Expenditure Framework period.

This, together with the decline in revenue collection - which is reported to be at a value of R30 billion - should inspire us to further explore innovative ways of expanding our revenue base.

The Minister has adopted the right approach in his tax proposals as highlighted in the Budget Speech. If we are to deal with inequalities - and we are one of the most unequal societies in the world - then top income accumulators must contribute to the redistributive nature of the tax system. Social solidarity of our country is critical if we are to transfer wealth to those who are less well off.

The Budget is also about growing the revenue base. Depending on 6 million taxpayers to carry the needs of revenue is not sustainable. Growing a tax base requires structural changes to the economy. We need to state that there is no wealth tax, as some are trying to claim. Tax measures of the wealthy are already there in the form of transfer tax, property tax and dividend taxation.

The new 45% tax on those earning over R1,5 million per annum will bring in a further R4,4 billion.

The low levels of corporate tax as part of our revenue base continue to raise legitimate concerns within public policy discourse. It should, however, be pointed out that, as legitimate as this concern is, the practice is not unique to South Africa, but pervasive among developing countries.

At the heart of this strategic posture is the need to incentivise greater investment by domestic and global business in productive sectors of the economy.

While the proposed revenue and tax proposals should be accepted, we should equally support the call by the Minister for the SA Revenue Service, Sars, to remain a robust and efficient tax collection agency. This should include strengthening the collaboration between Sars and departments that are critical to combating crimes such as tax avoidance and evasion.

These developments are unfolding within the context of a decline in private sector investment, which has fallen to 2,6% in 2015 from 26% in 2006. The assertion by the Minister of Finance is instructive in this regard, and I quote:

Our growth challenge is intertwined with our transformation imperatives. We need to transform in order to grow; we need to grow in order to transform. Without transformation, growth will

reinforce inequality. Without growth, transformation will be distorted by patronage.

This is a very important dialectic: We grow in order to transform, and transform in order to grow.

This calls for a robust engagement with the private sector to ensure meaningful investment in our economy. This is linked to the imperative for social partners within the National Economic Development and Labour Council, Nedlac, to find common ground in leveraging the growth and development of our economy in a more targeted way, in line with the development agenda outlined in the National Development Plan, NDP.

Surely one of the supreme tests against which the success of the Budget will be measured is how it articulates the strategic imperatives of radical socioeconomic transformation in the current epoch. As the President reminded in his state of the nation address, South Africa needs to do something drastic in order to overhaul its current economic structure which does not support the equitable distribution of opportunities across society.

The proposed spending on industrial development economic infrastructure and small business support constitutes critical pathways towards radical economic transformation.

Allow me to point out that, however noble policy intentions are, and even if we had resources in abundance at our disposal, without leadership to mobilise strategic partnerships with business and other critical sectors of our society, the strategic task of building a democratic developmental state will never yield any results. International best practice reveals that small, medium and micro-sized enterprises, SMMEs, have great potential for economic growth and capital formation. In his speech, again, the Minister of Finance outlined the radical measures that are needed to ensure transformation for inclusive growth. Critical to this task is the elimination of the triple challenges of unemployment, poverty and inequality.

To conclude, greater investment in infrastructure development is critical for economic development and growth, while economic development and growth are critical drivers of job creation and skills development. There is no doubt that this Budget is more focused in terms of expenditure on infrastructure. The challenge however, Deputy Minister, lies in our ability to deliver this infrastructure within a specified quality schedule and cost framework.

Let me assure South Africans that their trust in the ANC should remain formidable, as it is the only force capable of a policy trajectory of radical socioeconomic transformation. We lead South

Africa along a developmental path of inclusive growth and structural transformation of the economy.

We therefore welcome this Budget as part of the critical building blocks for fundamental transformation. Thank you. [Applause.]

Mr M KHAWULA: Hon House Chair and hon Deputy Minister, the Minister of Finance this year presented the Budget under very trying times and circumstances inside and outside the country, and inside and outside government. However, the hon Minister tried to present a very pragmatic approach to the situation. He alerted us to the country's not so promising economic growth which is expected not to exceed 1,3% in 2017. He alerted us to the country's growing debt which stands at 50% of the country's GDP. He further warned us that if this is not properly attended to, it will impact negatively on the future generations of this country.

The fiscal framework before us proposes to give meaning and effect to the call for radical social and economic transformation agenda. This should include issues like attention to accelerated economic growth. In the words of the Minister of Finance, there can be no economic transformation without economic growth; and there can be no economic growth without economic transformation. Therefore, the country has a task of balancing the two accordingly. Economic and social transformation should also not be abused to give effect to

favouritism, nepotism and partisanship in the allocation of resources.

The IFP calls for a balance in dealing with the competing priorities of the country. This call is for putting the needs before wants. Government's approach of putting wants before needs will only serve to exacerbate further the socioeconomic disorder and further retard economic growth. The country's important tools to fiscal checks and balances including the legislative role of oversight to government's spending must be utilised appropriately. Efforts to combat transfer mispricing and to strengthen mechanisms which protect our tax base implemented by the country's finance family under the leadership of Treasury are commended. The country needs to continue on a path to revive investor confidence and boost finance moral so that credit rating downgrades which remained a threat for most parts of 2016 are avoided. This entails the fight against corruption which needs to be intensified. This includes the fight against fraud, maladministration, fruitless and wasteful expenditure.

The IFP reiterates its call for the establishment of a special corruption court that will deal specifically with transgressions of the Public Finance Management Act, PFMA, Municipal Finance Management Act, MFMA, and other Treasury legislation transgressions in both the public and private sector. The IFP remains concerned that the fights between and amongst the country's strategic agencies

will never serve any good for the country. The same goes for the finance family agencies of our country. I thank you, Chair.

Mr L B GAEHLER: House Chair, the UDM supports the 2017 Fiscal Framework and the Revenue Proposal and the Report of the Standing Committee on Finance. We appreciate that the Minister has always tried his best, notwithstanding the difficult circumstances occasioned by the bold call from the President for a budget that responds to the radical socioeconomic transformation path as adopted by government. This was a very difficult expectation given the hard fact of a government which is wrestling with an unprecedented national debt challenge post the dawn of democracy.

Consequently, and with respect to the land question, the Budget failed to create hope for a speedy transfer of land to its rightful owners. This was further exacerbated after the ruling party subsequently objected to the possibility of expropriation of land without compensation and or with compensation only for the top structure improvements.

Uyandiva phofu ukuba ndithini? Niphulaphule? [Do you hear what I'm saying? Are you listening?]

Although the Minister had difficulty in manoeuvring for a radical budget, he has however confirmed that our monies as South Africans are in good hands. That is what all good citizens of this country at

least want, in particular during such difficult time when the economy is struggling to grow. People are jobless, poverty is on the rise and individual debts are the order of the day. This therefore brings an urgent challenge to the Minister, his colleagues in the executive, the industry, civil society and citizens in general, to ensure that our economy grows and the ratio between the revenue base and the debt is reduced.

The austerity measures that were announced are welcome. However, government must implement these without compromising on the delivery of basic services to the poorest of the poor. Taking advantage of, amongst others, corporate income tax, government, working with industry should consider financial awareness campaigns at schools and communities in general. When society has an economy that is not growing and citizens are heavily indebted, then that creates a deeper crisis and possible collapse of the entire economy.

Lastly, the UDM still believes that it is possible to provide fee-free higher education and training in particular for the poor, and that this has not been provided for. We, however, welcome the steps taken to improve the chances of our children achieving degrees without crippling debt. We also welcome the call by the Minister that 30% of huge projects would go to the emerging sector. However, I think the devil is in the details of how this will be done. We suggest that instead of leaving these Small, Medium and Micro Enterprises, SMMEs, to the cruel huge businesses, the government

must divide the contractors. If you have a big project, divide it so that these SMMEs contract directly to government.

Okanye baza kubulawa. Baza kutyiwa zingcuka. Sekela Mphathiswa, ncedani abantu bakuni bafake iziniki-maxabiso kuni okanye ... [Or they will suffer. They will die. Deputy Minister, please ask the government to award tenders to the small businesses or ...]

... the big business is going to swallow them. You will never have proper businesses because they will be destroyed.

Umhlaba mawubuyele ebantwini bawo. Bangawuhlawula abasemaghezweni, kodwa makubuyiselwe umhlaba ebantwini bawo. Enkosi, musani ukuba ngamagwala makwedini. [Kwahlekwa.] [The land must be transferred to its rightful owners. The wealthy people can manage to buy, but the land must be transferred to its owners. Thank you; don't be cowards. [Laughter.]]

Mr T C MOTLASHUPING: Hon House Chairperson, Deputy Minister of Finance, special delegates and Chairperson of the finance committee, thank you for the opportunity that you have given me to come and speak today.

Members of this august House and guests in the gallery I stand before you this afternoon not as a messiah who would bring a solution to the economic ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Order members!

Mr T C MOTLASHUPING: ... who presupposes that I can bring a solution to the economic crisis facing South Africa and the world. I shall never and we will never claim to have solutions for the economic crisis that is facing the world at the moment. But as the ANC, we have good policies that seek to address the imbalances and injustices that were created by the then government that sought to limit certain privileges to those who were privileged at that point.

Fellow compatriots, South Africans, I proudly stand before you representing a view crafted in 1955 by our fore fathers - a vision and dream for South Africa. It was not drafted yesterday nor when the DA was born but was drafted in 1955.

The people's budget that was presented before you South African population, citizens of this country, the Minister, amongst other things, stated that wealth in South Africa is owned by 10% of the people - 10%! Anybody who rejects this budget would want this situation to perpetuate and to remain as it is; that 10% of the people in this country should remain with the wealth of this country while the majority suffer and in particular black people.

That is what the ANC is trying to address and redress to make sure that the majority of the people in this country enjoy these benefits. [Applause.]

It is on those basis that the President of the Republic of South Africa ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Motlashuping, sorry. Hon Chabangu?

Mr M M CHABANGU: Can I ask a question? [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): No, order members. Hon Motlashuping, are you ready to take a question?

Mr T C MOTLASHUPING: No, no.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): He is not ready to take a question. Take your seat hon Chabangu. Continue hon Motlashuping.

Mr T C MOTLASHUPING: I will later deal with the radical economic transformation but for now I must just hint on the points that were given by the Minister.

The Minister stated that in order to realise the vision of the Constitution - the document that we celebrated last Friday and is regarded as the best in the world and that opened a path to inclusive growth and development - the 2017 budget will play a central role in transforming the country's economic landscape as it

seeks to redistribute and direct scarce resources towards transformation and growth.

According to the Minister, the 2017 budget also aims to mobilise private and public capital investments to assist in modernising and diversifying the economy. South Africa must concentrate on transforming the patterns of asset ownership and production, promote competition and deconcentrate markets.

It is encouraging to note that the South African economic slowdown appears to have bottomed out. The National Treasury expects the economy to grow at 1,3% in 2017 because the exchange rate depreciation has boosted competitiveness, severe drought conditions have eased, commodity prices have strengthened, electricity supply has stabilised and labour relations have improved.

In this regard, government as a whole must be adequately managed. As one of the measures to transform the economy, a 30% aside, in terms of the new preferential procurement regulations, should be increased over time and much stronger penalties for companies involved in fronting and other forms of transgressions of these regulations should be implemented.

During the first three quarters of 2016, investment in fixed capital fell by 3,9% - the first decline since the recession. The main driver was investment by private business which fell by 5,9%.

Reversing this contraction requires renewed efforts to strengthen business and consumer confidence.

I am obliged by my conscience to come quickly to this issue and address issues that were addressed my learned fellow member from the DA - you can't be my fellow boss. The issue of land ownership is very critical as the President has stated. Land ownership in South Africa is very critical and the most important aspect of the land is that South Africa and South Africans, particularly black people in South Africa, were never workers but tillers of their own land; they had cows, sheep, land and everything. They depended on themselves for survival; they never depended on anybody. So, it is critical and we owe it to the South African population that we restore the land back to its rightful owners. [Applause.]

It is very disturbing that hon Essak comes to this podium and says R47 000 is owed by each and every citizen. That is his own calculation and I do not know how scientific it is or where he gets it from and that I am included in that 47 000.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Motlashuping?

Mr T C MOTLASHUPING: I do not remember, and I must represent the South African population.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Motlashuping, sorry. Hon Essack, why are you standing?

Mr F ESSACK: Obviously House Chairperson, I would like to see or hear if my learned colleague would please take a simple question from me?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Motlashuping, are you ready to take a question?

Mr T C MOTLASHUPING: No.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): He is not ready to take a question, take your seat. Continue hon Motlashuping.

Mr T C MOTLASHUPING: The matter here, which is very critical, is that if South Africans owe R47 000, in which period is it calculated? Was it when I was born because I never participated in the economy of this country? How is the 47 000 calculated? From which point to which point is it calculated if it is then scientifically calculated?

He talks about poor tax collection. My recollection of facts is that South African Revenue Services is the best run and it has received the best audits. It is only hon Essack, through his eye, that he

sees poor tax collection which is not seen by anybody.

[Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hey! Hon Essack! Order members!

Mr T C MOTLASHUPING: We cannot come here and speak about the Minister buying a car for so and so much. Prior to 1994, we never knew the amount that was given to Ministers and whoever was in government and the value of the cars that they drove. What is important in this government is that we are transparent, we tell the public because this is the tax payers' money.

Over and above that, hon Essack does not tell the South African public that Minister Msebenzi has gone out of the ministerial handbook and done something very illegal. He only mentions figures to the South African population and does not mention if it was within the law and there is no law that there is no law has been transgressed.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Motlashuping, I'm afraid your time has expired.

Mr T C MOTLASHUPING: We support the budget. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF FINANCE: Chair of the NCOP, Deputy Chair of the NCOP, members of the NCOP, representatives from all provinces, guests, ladies and gentlemen, good afternoon. I sometimes feel that some of us increasingly should begin to take the heat out of debates on fiscal policy and try to face the real challenges we are confronted with as a country. Most of the stuff that we said in the Budget is almost related to the debates globally because as we travel to different forums we actually realise that everybody is grappling with the same issues.

At the centre of the Budget that the Minister introduced as he explained quite succinctly, is the challenge of low growth. Low growth in South Africa and globally has become the new normal. If we think that we will go back to those times when we had a high growth, I think we should think very hard. Growth is a real problem. Rising unemployment and rising inequality is also another problem that everybody is grappling with and in South Africa we are grappling with it also. We must say that they are both factors that are local and domestic that relate to the very structure of our economy. That is why the Minister and most of our analysis turn to talk about over concentration in the economy. Some of the factors are historical as they come from the apartheid past and therefore certain sections of the population are in such situations because of that very history. They are faced with particular conditions and circumstances. These are issues that I think as a nation we should begin to really depoliticise them in the sense of narrow political-party interests

and use populism to explain and confront them in a more objective way in looking at them so that we can actually get to the bottom of what is needed for the country.

The second point I would want to make is that I have been reading the recent analysis by economics. It is very clear that our economy is beginning to improve. The latest report I saw suggests that we are actually gradually moving in a more positive direction in terms of growing the economy. Part of it I think is driven by the increasing commodity prices. Being a commodity-based economy, commodity prices have a huge impact on the growth of our economy.

Another element of it is, of course, improved labour relations. If you look at the number of strikes in the last 18 months we have major strides in improving the labour relations environment in the country. The other element relates to electricity supply. The consistency of our electricity supply has also had impact on growth in a very positive rate. The exchange rate, equally, has an important impact. Of course there is a natural factor also, drought. Drought has also eased. It has had also an impact on the levels of growth and it shows the growth prospects for the country.

We must also contend the fact that there are still huge risks that we face. Some of them are domestic and many of them relate to probably the levels of certainty - policy certainty in our country. That is where we need to be more upfront all of us and honest about

the fact that we need to create a more consistent and more stronger policy environment that creates certainty because without certainty there will be no investment, without investment there will be no growth in our economy. That's an area that all of us must begin to deal with.

There are also huge potential that we might have external shocks in the global economy. We don't know where the Trump factor is going and what will be the impact of Trump on our domestic economy. We don't know how the Brexit, for instance, will impact our economy. There are also a host of other issues that are happening globally that are likely to have impact on our economy.

Given these circumstances, we also need to guard against something else which also impact on certainty, that is populism. When times are tough we normally hide with slogans and populism. Populism is good because populists only identify the problem. They can neither tell you how to solve it nor participate in solving it. It is important that we guard against populism. I am very objective to say that populism is not only within the opposition, but it is also within the ruling party sometimes. We also sometimes become populists in the way we approach these things. We need to be very formal and solid in our analysis of the problems that confront us.

In summary, the fiscal framework is in a sense at a core and it is the measured path of fiscal consolidation. Fiscal consolidation is

at the heart of the current fiscal policy. Part of it is to reduce expenditure ceiling by R10 billion in 2017-18 and R16 billion in 2018-19. There are a number of things that are to be done to achieve this.

I want to come to this issue. Again, sometimes populism is problematic. We don't deal with some of the challenges. If you reduce expenditure carelessly and recklessly, as some of the political parties sometimes tell us, you will actually undermine the economy and service delivery and that reduce the prospects for growth. It is always important that we have a measured approach in the reduction of expenditure. That is what we are doing in the Budget. We look at what is possible without damaging growth. That is the essence of the approach we are taking in these things. I know it is easy to stand there and say you should cut growth by this amount. It doesn't work like that in real life.

Part of what we are doing is managing economy - improving economic governance in the country. In order to do that we must be more realistic of about what is possible. So if you take the extreme populist stance of saying cut expenditure by X amount and therefore don't temper with taxes. The reality of the matter is that, well it does not work like that. We have to manage the expenditure ceiling down, but as we do that we must take cognisance of the need to protect social expenditure, infrastructure expenditure and all these areas that we have identified.

We are introducing tax policy measure to generate additional R28 billion in 2017-18. Again, on the tax issue we've heard all sorts of criticisms around our tax policy and the introduction of tax. Many people are suggesting that we should have done this and we should have done that, we should have tempered with the value added tax, VAT, etc. at the centre of our tax policies is ensuring that our tax remain progressive. Progressive tax systems means that you must ensure that those with money pay more, but your expenditure must to ensure that it remains propoor. That is the essence of these things. The fact that we have moved to the higher tax bracket is an attempt to ensure that once we increase taxes we maintain the progressivity of our tax system, but also ensure that we have sufficient resources to distribute to the poor and the marginalised in society. That is the essence of the logic that we are adopting around these tings.

Again, perhaps you will never get it right perhaps in tax issues. But all the commentators on our tax policy proposals have come to one conclusion that we have achieved the objective of maintaining its progressivity. People are arguing that we should have increased VAT into our tax. The reality of the matter is that VAT is one the tax that is retrogressive. Again, we are not saying that we are closing on VAT, but we are just saying that when we go that route you must understand its impact on the poor and the marginalised in society.

We also have a combination of lower expenditure ceiling and higher taxes as we have explained. The idea is to narrow the Budget deficit as we have explained over and over again.

Central to the debate is that fiscal policy is but one thing. You are not going to solve the problems of the country through fiscal policy. Fiscal policy has a role and indeed we are using it as much as we can. I was listening to Prof Hauseman recently, two days ago, arguing that if there is any area South Africa has performed very well it is with regard to fiscal policy. The challenge is, growing the economy. We can temper around and do all these things that we can do, but if we don't grow the economy the reality of the matter is that we are increasingly less to distribute. Growth, as part of the broader proposal, is a critical area of our focus moving forward.

I want to talk a little bit about tax morality and the social compact and the distributional consequences of the Budget because that is probably at the core of some of the things that we are to undertake. About two thirds of the 2017 Budget is allocated to functions dedicated to realising constitutionally mandated social rights. That includes education, health, social security and housing.

There is an important part of the Budget that I hope people have recognised. The Minister said we do need as a country a charter of

economic rights. In different ways I think all of us seating in this Parliament must begin to realise that we cannot continue with the current economic model. The exclusion and inequality in our economy is growing and is deepened and it is not sustainable. What we had as grand agreement in 1994, is probably having a lot of stresses and there is a need for a national conversation around a new framework for growth and reduction of inequality in our society. That's probably where the constructive debate needs to come in; where we will probably need to take off our party caps and look at the real issues that confront us. It requires leadership and it requires that we take particular risks in looking at some of the challenges we are facing. The Minister calls it working towards a charter of economic rights. We do need to confront that. We cannot have this number of excluded people. We cannot continuously increase expenditure on social grants and social security without necessarily growing the economy on the other side. I think it is an important point to me.

The third area that I would want to talk about is the issue about expenditure itself. We have introduced the ceiling, but we ourselves in different forums have stated the need to change the composition of spending. The balance between consumption and investment in our Budget remains a challenge that we must deal with. There was somebody who talked about expenditure reviews. We have actually done expenditure reviews and we have been doing it as a country for a long time. I think what we have been doing has been very effective and it is just that I would really urge members to go and read some

of these expenditure reviews and begin to use them in the committees.

To shift to a comprehensive expenditure reviews because Australia is doing comprehensive expenditure reviews is not going to necessary help us. I think let us make what we have work first. The expenditure review system that we have adopted is working and we need to ensure that it is used by different institutions and people quite effectively.

The other area that we have spoken about which is critical to the discussion, is the issue of the wage bill. Can I say the following? We took a view that we must manage down the wage bill because it is critically important that we manage that expenditure centre quite well. And we have done pretty well. If you look at it most of our provinces have reduced expenditure quite substantially. The debate about expenditure must not cloud another debate about the wage bill which is the debate about the quality of our Public Service - productivity in our Public Service. Those are and the composition of the Public Service. That is where I think increasing the policy debate should be about. We need more teachers, we need more nurses, we need more engineers and we need more technical staff in the system. That is why in the Budget we emphasised the importance of protecting and also broadening the critical posts in the system because that is the explanation for failure in service delivery.

We must reduce bureaucracy in our system. We have a lot of bureaucracy in our system. We must confront the challenge of reducing bureaucracy across the board. That talks to local authority, municipalities and also in national government departments and provincial departments. We need to really manage wage expenditure. Provinces are doing well. We must say that our national departments are not necessarily doing well. There are those that are performing very well in this regard.

The other issue that we need to deal with is underspending. It is a challenge that we need to solve. Again, underspending is linked in a sense to capacity. It is linked to our procurement processes - managing our procurement processes better. By and large most of the delays in the delivery of infrastructure projects stems from poor management of supply chain processes. That is a big issue that we must deal with. Our procurement reform process is dealing with that issue.

One of the areas that is particularly concerning is infrastructure underspending, and is across the board - provinces, municipalities as well as some national departments. If we do not address the challenge clearly it will have a huge impact on the overall expenditure.

We have also talked about the state-owned corporations, SOCs.

Sometimes we turn to forget when we stand on these forums and think

that managing our SOCs better is not happening. We are very hard on our SOCs. That is why you know what is happening in the SOCs. All of us, government has taken a very hard line on the SOCs by improving efficiency, improving governance, improving impact of their spent on development. We have introduces a number of policy proposals which were accepted by Cabinet recently. Part of it relates to how do you use public funds to catalyse private investment in this thing.

Let me conclude with the debt issue. The comrade from the DA, I must say these things to you. We are clear that we must manage debt, but there is no kind or magical level to say if it is at this level it is good. I think the approach that we have taken is that we need to ensure that we stabilise debt and gradually push it down because we think that if your economy is not growing you cannot replace it by growing debt. It is a path to nowhere. I think the danger in this debate is to say, if it is R2,2 trillion we are in trouble. We must understand that there is no kind of major point that is to say it is problematic or there is a magical kind of a formula around the debt. You will find countries with huge debts. In South Africa we are saying the levels at which our economy is growing suggests that we need to manage debt as a country because the cost of debt is growing. We must also ensure that we protect our credit rating.

In summary, therefore, there are two platforms in this kind of administration overarching policy. It is a fiscal consolidation

platform and a growth platform. Part of that includes introducing sweeping economic reforms in the economy. Thank you. [Applause.]

Debate concluded.

Question put: That the Report be adopted.

IN FAVOUR: Eastern Cape, Free State, Gauteng, KwaZulu-Natal, Limpopo, Mpumalanga, Northern Cape, North West.

AGAINST: Western Cape.

**CONSIDERATION OF REPORT ON TAKING PARLIAMENT AND LEGISLATURE TO THE
PEOPLE PROGRAMME — EASTERN CAPE PROVINCE CONSOLIDATED PREVISITS AND
MAIN PROGRAMME REPORTS 2016**

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: My respects to you Chairperson, special delegates and hon members. We took Parliament to the People to the Eastern Cape last year. We had started the process of Taking Parliament to the People by focussing our provincial whips and our oversight weeks on issues of education across the country. We focussed on education in the Eastern Cape primarily because of the perpetual last or worst-achiever reports in terms of the matric results.

We started our previsits in the Alfred Nzo district because it is the worst performer in the Eastern Cape. Our main programme was then held at the Buffalo City Metropolitan Municipality from 14 to 18 November last year.

For the first time we actually included members of the portfolio committee on education of the National Assembly, both in the previsits and in the main event itself. We must also say that for the first time we had a joint venture with the provincial legislature. This was almost thrust upon us because we could have chosen to go our separate ways and therefore wasted state resources; however, it made sense for us to come together precisely because at the time which we proposed to go to the Eastern Cape, the Eastern Cape already had a programme of their own of Taking the Legislature to the People. So at some point this programme was separate and at a particular point it came together. That is why you will see that the report of the NCOP has instances where we include the joint ...

[Inaudible.] ... of the programme with the Eastern Cape and where the Eastern Cape report will separate because they were within their rights and we were within our rights. However, it also worked for us, especially financially, to have a joint programme.

We want to say that we are very grateful for the co-operation we got, both from the legislature and from the executive of the Eastern Cape. We must also say that we learnt a lot of lessons because this programme worked for us in fulfilling what the Constitution demands

of us, which is to take Parliament to the People, to listen and to educate, but also to co-ordinate the business of government across the spheres, and in and amongst the provinces themselves.

We learned good lessons which I'm hoping we will take back to all the other legislatures. We also observed bad practices which I'm also hoping that we as different provinces will make sure are not repeated in our provinces. We were also able to learn – those of us who do not come from the education sector – to listen to, amongst the best teachers and principals, and also to identify amongst them the worst teachers and the worst principals. As public representatives we also had an opportunity to learn from the practitioners themselves and sometimes heard what the children themselves had to say.

We started by visiting early childhood development centres, ECDs, because we believe that they are an important foundation for education in South Africa. If these work well they help us determine the country's potential and deficiencies. We think that ECDs should also be taken more seriously than we are currently doing. It doesn't matter in which province but generally if you go to ECDs they are very, very thinly funded and resourced.

In our visits we found that most of them ... one did not have educational toys for the children, the spaces within which the children were kept were terrible and the numbers which were

subsidised by the department for tuition and for food was very limited, which meant that the facility then had to cross subsidise the other children from the poor.

We also found that the ablution facilities at ECD level were terrible. We were quite shocked to see some of the facilities. We took pictures and we hope that we will never subject our children to that gain.

We also noticed that in some instances even practitioners at ECD level were well trained but at some facilities they were just keeping the children busy ... were not properly trained.

We noticed that the provision of meals was fine ... was there but the facilities to cook nutritious food for the children was also a problem.

We went on to look at public libraries and we have to say that again we moved from one of the worst that was dilapidated and a risk both to the staff and to the public, and to one that was extremely well built. What we did find to be a problem though was the quality and quantity of the materials found at all the libraries in the Eastern Cape. Hon members, it cannot be that the main, main, main books in a public library are Mills and Boon. What exactly do we want to say?

Also of concern to us was whether public libraries should be used to replace libraries at schools, and if we agree, what portion of the public libraries should go to students, who supervises them and who procures? The interaction between the municipality, the province and the national Minister on governance issues around public libraries is also a concern that we want to look into.

We met good teachers. Across the board we have also picked up that the Eastern Cape has an interesting high percentage of teenage boys at schools that abuse drugs. We have also taken note of the high rate of teenage pregnancies at schools. It took us almost all of our previsits before we asked simple questions. How old are these kids that are abusing drugs and who are impregnating other learners at schools? We discovered that these are the young men who are about to become men. So the issue of culture then begins to come into the space of education.

We were worried about the availability of clean potable water at schools, again at the quality of nutrition, the quality of the schools and the quality of teachers in some instances. I've already said that in some instances we were enthralled with the excellence that we found at the schools in the Eastern Cape.

We want to say that we were shocked at the ablution facilities but again we want to say thank you to the Eastern Cape for responding very positively and quickly to the request we had for temporary

toilets. However, we will be keeping an eye as to whether permanent clean toilets are put in with the bins and sanitary pads for the girls at those schools.

Hon members, we are also worried about the quite glaring policy gaps or lapses. There are schools which are meant for children with special needs but either the national or the provincial departments treat these schools as though these kids do not have special needs. Therefore you have challenges ... playgrounds for children who are in wheelchairs and ramps which are thin, old and only carry them from where they sleep to their classroom. So we think that as Parliament we need to work to look at this. We need to go back to those issues.

Of course, there were other issues. People spoke to us about issues of social development. They spoke to us about health. They spoke to us about Reconstruction and Development Programme, RDP, houses. They spoke to us about all the other things. However, I think that we need to begin by saying that yes, we need to standardise but as we standardise we must not kill initiative at schools. As we want to normalise and give every child an opportunity in life we must go back to how we impose policies on schools which do not work for schools. For example, with regard to the complaint about the progression of learners, without a doubt, all schools, black and white, complained about this. If so, we need to ask, who is responsible? When do we get consultation on the way? How far are we

consulting communities when we rationalise schools so that as Parliament we can better represent? Ke a leboga [Thank you], Chairperson. [Applause.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Chairperson, greetings to our hon guests from our provinces, MECs and Members of Parliament, our colleagues and officials that are present. Let me start my debate by quoting Chairman Mao Tse-Tung:

The Marxist philosophy of dialectical materialism has two outstanding characteristics. One is its class nature: it openly avows that dialectical materialism is in the service of the proletariat. The other is its practicality: it emphasises the dependence of theory on practice, and emphasises that theory is based on practice and in turn serves practice.

Our strategic objective for economic development is to seize new opportunities that support the creating of decent work. We are reducing income inequalities in South Africa. In this regard, we have always declared that the government has a crucial role play in creating enabling environment that will facilitate and accelerate social and economic development in our society.

In pursuant to our commitment, to account to the electorate and through our history we took leaf from our Taking Parliament to the People programme with a theme which loudly chants, Follow Up on Our

Commitments. Indeed, we followed up on our commitments and cultivated public trust and confidence that the people shall govern and commitments shall be kept.

For example, a lady by the name of Zukiswa Sizani, a resident of Sweet Waters in King William's Town, Buffalo City Metropolitan Municipality, commended the current government on the delivery of housing in that community. But on the same vein, she did highlight the issue of misallocation to beneficiaries and raised that as an issue for us to follow up. She further states that new government-built human settlements lacked recreational facilities such as play parks for children and young people.

It is also true that the people were not only complementing the government, but they had many complaints and grievances. As form of summary, these are the few that I will touch upon: The lack of provision of housing which cut across in some of the wards in Buffalo City; high rate of unemployment amongst young people; prevalence of drugs and alcohol abuse; high levels of reported crime; insufficient staff and shortage of medication in some clinics; general shortage of school furniture, hon Makupula; shortage of learning-teaching material, especially textbooks; lack of scholar transport for some learners who take long distances to and from school; and poor roads infrastructure where there are rural areas.

That is about Buffalo City. If you look at the challenges that were raised by those communities, they are more or less the same. Buffalo City and Alfred Nzo District Municipality have a lot of rural areas. The whole issue of transport came up. Using dilapidated buses as the mode of transport was also an issue which we really need the department to take note of.

These are some of those key issues raised by those people in the Eastern Cape. As such, we debated issues effectively and in the province. We are tasked to ensure that provincial interest is taken into account in the national sphere of government, especially during the budgeting period. This, therefore, implies that there continues to be a need to improve co-operation and co-ordination. These matters are within and across the different spheres of government, especially on concurrent areas such as education, health and housing.

As a progressive and caring government, now more than ever, we are called to respond and intervene to challenges facing our communities decisively. A call for radical economic transformation in speeches will be meaningless if we do not appropriately reprioritise our limited resources to make a visible impact in changing the lives of our communities. In this regard, we must recall and internalise the progressive words of Amilcar Cabral when he said:

We must always bear in mind that people are not fighting for ideas, for the things in anyone's head. They are fighting to win material benefits, to live better in peace, to see the lives go forward, to guarantee the future of their children.

The availability of representatives from all spheres of government in the visit to Eastern Cape was very valuable as they could directly respond to grievances of communities. For example: The human settlements. The national government reaffirmed that the building of new houses remain their priority, even though funds for maintenance and repair also remain insufficient.

What was also key to note is that the demand for housing and accommodation seem to be increasing, despite the fact that government has provided more than 4 million houses since 1994. We are the only country and the only organisation that delivers free houses to communities in South Africa. [Applause.]

Buffalo City Municipality has also challenges of the so-called 'gap market', which is a limited middle class housing stock and credit constrain of household within incomes that are above the threshold for subsidy housing but insufficient to be able to access commercial bank home loans. In this regard, the ANC position as per the 4th National General Council is that there must be an expansion of the subsidy instrument to medium income household which refer to the household earning R3 500 to R7 000 per month.

Also, the funding for the medium density social housing where the state subsidy rental houses, in areas where there is a high demand for housing, as it is the case in the area of Buffalo City. These contradictions warrant that we must consolidate both short and long term integration and sustain strategies for land ownership use, spatial planning, human settlement and transport.

Pertaining to the crucial issue of addressing challenges of unemployment of young people and skills development, provincial government indicated and is steadfast in implementing National Youth Service Programme and providing bursary schemes to implement the EPWP. Furthermore, the government has developed a joint project with Amathuba Job Portal to assist young people to find employment opportunities.

Moreover, there are plans underway to skills development for primary and secondary co-operatives. In addressing this lack of work experience, internship programmes have been developed with the participation of the private sector in the area of the Eastern Cape. The government also reaffirmed that one of the service centres will also be constructed to ensure that government services are readily accessible to the public. In addition to initiatives, there is a ...

[Time expired.] Thank you very much Chair. [Applause.]

Mr V MAGWEBU: Chairperson, hon members, special delegates and fellow South Africans, Prof Jonathan Jansen, Author and former Rector and Vice Chancellor of the University of the Free State, once said:

Desperation is an emotion I seldom feel except in relation to education, for I believe very deeply that for most of our children, a solid school education represents the only means available for ending the cycle of family poverty. Skills come later, economic growth even later. Social cohesion lies far in the distance. What matters, is that the children complete 12 years of schooling with the ability to read, write, reason, calculate and express confidence for purposes of further studies, skills training and higher education.

During our visit to the Eastern Cape, when we 'took' Parliament to the people, it became evident that there is no solid foundation for preparing our children for the future in the Eastern Cape Province. The early childhood development centres we visited amongst many failures by the provincial Department of Social Development. We discovered that the grants that are paid were not paid on time, thus making it difficult to keep these Day Care Centres or Early Childhood Development Centres in operation, thus compromising their duty to nurture our children as they prepare them for schooling.

Further, we visited high schools and met with management officials of the provincial education department. Both visits and meetings

revealed the following failures by the provincial department: Matric results for previous years have been going decreasing drastically and some schools were performing below 30%. There is little support rendered by the education department for underperforming schools because there are resources that are not provided when they are needed. Low Staff Morale is caused by lack of support to teachers by the provincial department. Mud schools remain not eradicated.

Hon Chairperson, the Eastern Cape was the country's worst performing province in matric results yet again in 2016. The province has recorded the worst matric pass rate for the past five years. The five districts that performed below 50% in the country are all in the Eastern Cape. Last year, more than 36 000 matric pupils in the Eastern Cape failed Grade 12 exams because of a lack of political guidance and leadership.

These schools and these poor performances are compounded by ANC-led government policies that are not working. The national Department of Education introduced a progression policy in an attempt to address the problem of drop-out rates in the system through the policy that allows school children to proceed to the next grade.

This disingenuous policy requires that a learner not be held back in a phase for more than 4 years even if he or she fails. This therefore means that should learning and teaching not be of high quality, children still proceed through the education system from as

early as foundation phase with a learning backlog. Essentially there is a crisis in the education system and the progression policy exacerbate the compromise on quality by causing bottlenecks in the last phase of the system, namely Grades 10, 11 and 12.

Similarly, we see in the Eastern Cape a bloated cohort of Grade 11s progressed learners. These are cases where learners fail grade 11 twice but the policy progresses them to grade 12. According to the Eastern Cape Department of Basic Education, this is the largest Grade 12 group in the past 5 years. Therefore, the question is, can we blame the teachers entirely for the Eastern Cape's poor performance?

The answer is, No. They are not the policy-makers, but the blame lies with the ANC government. More than 2 000 schools in the Eastern Cape have two or three teachers each. As we are standing here, 219 schools are led by one teacher in each school. Let's face it! Let's first give the teachers the necessary support and then probably we can blame them.

South Africa spends R280 billion on educations. This is more than a fifth of our national budget yet; it is not matched by results in Eastern Cape, in particular. But I have good news. This crisis can be salvaged. The DA has a rescue plan. Over the next year we will focus our attention on these learners. We will stand in solidarity in their plight, talk to them and listen to them.

Together we will build a brand new policy platform, a rescue plan for this lost generation. Freedom, fairness and opportunity will be at the heart of this plan, a policy package that will put each young person at the centre of their own development.

As I conclude, we will start with pre-school nutrition, ending when young adults enter the labour market. We will harness the energy & passion of the thousands of committed teachers and principals to lead the change in turning our schools around, while shielding our children from the destructive influence of politics and labour unions. We will invest in training existing teachers and recruit more teachers, particularly for maths and science. We will explore the feasibility of bringing back teacher training colleges. This is what the Eastern Cape needs. Enkosi Sihlalo, Ndiyabulela. Thank you.

Mr T G CHEPAPE (Limpopo): Hon House Chair, Chairperson and Members of the NCOP, distinguished guests, thank you very much for this opportunity to debate on the report, Taking Parliament and Legislature to the People Programme in the Eastern Cape.

In terms of section 70(2)(b) of the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, the National Council of Provinces has a responsibility to ensure participation of all provinces in its proceedings in a manner consistent with democracy. Furthermore, section 188(1)(a) and (b) enjoin provincial legislatures - and in this case, the Eastern Cape Provincial Legislature - to facilitate public involvement in

the legislative and other processes of the legislature and its committees, to conduct its business in an open manner and to hold its sittings, and those of its committees, in public.

It is against this background that the NCOP and the Eastern Cape Provincial Legislature had a joint Taking Parliament and the Legislature to the People programme. As the Limpopo province, we also participated in this programme, and I must mention that we have learnt a lot. As the Chairperson of the NCOP indicated, the programme was held from 14 to 18 November 2016 under the theme, Following up on our commitments.

The programme included site visits and public hearings. These site visits enabled members to engage with the management of schools, educators, learners and beneficiaries to further enrich the understanding and appreciation of the issues that emerged from the various educational institutions and economic development projects that were visited. The pre-visits report highlighted the key issues that emerged during the engagements with all the stakeholders.

In the visit to the early childhood development, ECD, centres, it was observed that funding is a challenge. The insufficient funding for ECD from the Department of Social Development results in many unintended consequences by the system. These include limited space at some day care centres, resulting in some children not being admitted. This goes against our objective of ensuring that each and

every learner of school-going age is at school. In some instances where schools or ECD centres over-register learners, they are faced with the challenge of having to share the limited resources among themselves. There were also the issues of centres that had closed down as they were not viable, and the community expressed dissatisfaction with the lack of consultation during these processes.

The insufficient funding in this area also implies that the stipends received by the ECD practitioners are mostly insufficient and sometimes paid late. The consequence is that some of the ECD practitioners start becoming demotivated in an environment where there is understaffing. Learners in this critical phase also require adequate mental support. However, it was reported during one of the visits that there is a general lack of professionals, such as psychologists and career coaches, who should be assisting in this regard.

It was also reported that there are not enough recreational facilities. As the Chairperson has correctly indicated, there is also a general shortage of water. This affects various activities in the ECD centres, especially sanitation, as the ablution facilities are also inadequate.

I must indicate that these challenges are also experienced in other provinces, not only in the Eastern Cape. All of these provinces are

experiencing these challenges. Perhaps the DA in the Western Cape does not see this because they occur in the black schools, and the DA only concentrates on the urban and white areas. Perhaps that is their problem.

Various schools reported that there was a shortage of learner-teacher support material, particularly textbooks. In some instances, learners are sharing textbooks. This negatively affects their preparations, especially when they write tests and examinations.

Another key challenge that affects the quality of education in schools is the redeployment of teachers who have been trained in inclusive education to other schools. This, thus, disadvantages the schools from which they are redeployed. It was also highlighted that there is a lack of regular teacher training and development through workshops and training sessions.

Regarding the National School Nutrition programme, it was indicated that all schools are benefiting from this programme. However, most of the schools complained about the budget allocation, saying it is too low. The limited budget could result in learners receiving inadequate portions, as the available food is shared amongst the higher number of learners. Furthermore, the quality of food provided by school feeding schemes is compromised.

A further challenge, the lack of scholar transport, was highlighted in some of the schools that we visited. Some learners travel long distances to and from schools. Furthermore, the roads leading to these schools are not accessible when it rains. This results in some learners missing valuable learning time, and, as the saying goes, time wasted is never regained.

Various schools reported the shortage of infrastructure, such as classrooms, staff rooms and libraries for schools. These shortages result in overcrowding, which affects learning. This challenge is further compounded by the fact that, in some instances, the existing school buildings are not well maintained. Many schools have also reported that they are short of furniture, that is, school desks, as well as ICT infrastructure, including computer laboratories. Some of these schools do not have electrical connections. This raises the need to explore alternative sources of energy for affected schools, as suggested to them by the team that visited those schools.

The delegation was also concerned to discover that some schools are operating without school governing bodies. This was a very serious concern. This situation not only negates effective governance in schools, it also steals precious learning and teaching time, as some of the educators are forced to assume the roles that ought to be filled by the parent component of the school governing body. It was also reported that there was poor parental involvement in some schools. This could also mean that the school work of some learners

is not monitored by their parents at home. Hence, some of the schools have reported that a number of learners were ill disciplined and unruly and also involved in substance abuse.

Despite all of these challenges in the schools, it is not all doom and gloom. There are many schools that perform well and manage to do better academically, in spite of the challenging circumstances within which they operate. One such school is Ulwazi High School in Mdantsane Nu 2. This school has 13 old teaching classrooms, no library and no computer laboratory. Furthermore, it is surrounded by a rough community where crime is a daily activity. However, this school, managed by a woman, continues to produce a 100% matriculation pass rate every year. [Applause.]

We are also comforted and given hope by the fact that our caring government is not sitting, arms folded, and doing nothing about these challenges. Several programmes that were developed and implemented to address these challenges were outlined by the MEC when he addressed the gathering, even though they may not be adequate at this stage.

We have noted that the conditional community library grants are generally not used for library purposes by some municipalities. This leads to various challenges. These include the lack of maintenance of library buildings, inadequate safety and security measures at and around some public libraries, and a shortage of library resources,

including reading books in public libraries. In some of the libraries, the available books are also getting lost due to the shortage of book detector systems. It was also reported that there is an outdated book collection system that does not serve the needs of communities or library users. Generally, there is also the challenge of a shortage of qualified librarians across the whole Buffalo City Metropolitan Municipality.

Following the deliberations and the engagements during the public hearings and site visits, some solutions were suggested. I must indicate the Limpopo province has since resolved to take this Taking Parliament to the People as a good example. Thank you. [Time expired.]

Ms B T MATHEVULA: Chairperson, Taking Parliament to the People in the Eastern Cape and Alfred Nzo was an eye opener to you as the ruling party that you have abandoned the poor masses of our people.

The province is failing in providing basic needs and restoring dignity. You fail to provide our people with toilets, water and roads. Because of your narrow mentality and pushing the agenda of kleptocracy, you are more than John Cena, "You can't see that something is wrong in that province."

About 10% of the population in Alfred Nzo do not have identity documents but no one is saying or doing anything about this matter

because personally, you will not benefit from assisting those people.

It is now 23 years into the so called democracy but our black children are still attending mud schools without books or without a teacher to teach them.

Chairperson, that on its own tells you that you as the ANC and the ruling party do not care about the education of a black child. You have occupied positions of leadership but you still take instructions and implement the policies and processes of the oppressors that black people must not get proper education.

Failure of government to even act on executive members that are unable to perform like the MEC of Education in that province, will result in failing our people.

As the EFF, we will never allow a situation where we are forced to adopt a Report that seeks to undermine our people and not promoting or enhancing sustainable services to our people. We will never support a Report that seeks to undermine the integrity of our people.

This Report does not reflect the true challenges and frustrations that our people are faced with.

The worst thing that you did on the last day was to allow a criminal, a man who violated his oath of office, a man who does not respect the Constitution to address hon members.

As you like to impose everything, no, no, no, not this time. EFF therefore recommends that the House reflect further and put the entire province under administration.

The MEC of Education must be criminally charged for failing to perform and failing hundreds and thousands of our people. Thank you, Chairperson.

Ms T WANA: Hon Chairperson of the NCOP, Deputy Chairperson in absentia, Chief Whip in absentia, Deputy Minister of Finance in absentia, permanent members from different provinces, distinguished guests and members of the media, good afternoon. Let me thank my organisation for allowing me the opportunity of standing in this august House and debate early childhood development. Allow me to salute the organisation which is 105 years old and the oldest organisation in Africa and in the world.

This programme of early childhood development was initiated by the former ANC President, our own O R Tambo. Long live the spirit of O R Tambo, this is your year!

Ulele nje Tambo, uyathetha. [While Tambo is no more with us, he is still with us in spirit.]

When O R Tambo was in Tanzania, he assisted Charlotte Maxeke by making a crèche there. The reasoning behind that was informed by the struggles faced by the parents in Tanzania and he wanted to protect the children from the hardships of the apartheid system. Those people are amongst us now. There is one thing that I like about the ANC; we can afford to stay with the people who were oppressing us though they did not stay with us when they were oppressing us.

I wanted to say in this House that ...

... utata wohloniphekileyo uMagwebu wayenguMphathiswa ngexesha likarhulumente kaSebe. Ngoko ke, uqhelile ukutya amagazi abantu ...

(Translation of isiXhosa paragraph follows.)

[...the father to the hon Magwebu was the Minister in the cabinet of the government of Sebe. Therefore, he is used to sucking the blood of the people ...]

... irrespective of colour. Therefore, I am not surprised when he is debating in this House very negatively. If you can analyse him, he is not discussing but impressing his bosses. Thank you very much.

Let me say that in 1987 - oh let me repeat it. Hon Magwebu who was standing here, benefitted from the apartheid because his father was amongst the Bantustan Cabinet and he is used to sucking the blood of the poor and the have-nots. So, when he is debating here, he impresses his masters.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Order, hon Wana, please take your seat! Hon Magwebu why are you standing? What is the point of order, Sir?

Mr L V MAGWEBU: Hon House Chair, on a point of order: I do not have a father who served in the Bantustan. It may be a family but not a father. She must get her facts right.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Point of order taken, hon Magwebu. Continue hon member Wana.

Ms T WANA: Thank you Chairperson. I am not talking about insinuation; I am talking about the content. The content is that you are coming from a family which used to exploit the blacks because you benefitted from apartheid. Let me remind this House about the 8th Statement of the ANC by O R Tambo saying that our children and students have been oppressed and abused from childhood because their mothers and fathers were not allowed to stay with them in their workplaces. Because of the apartheid system, their mothers and fathers were given slavery names like kitchen girl and garden boy. So, we are still living with those scars, even in the present situation because the whites are not impressed with anything done by the black ANC majority.

As I am saying, O R Tambo and our icon Nelson Mandela's spirits are with us even though they are not with us in flesh and blood. How can

a person wearing an overall - there was a smell of a person in the kitchen frying ...

... amagwinya bethuna. Uthetha into ebengekho kuyo. [... fat cakes. He is talking about something he was not involved in.]

How hypocritical are they?

Le nto ikhoyo yale mibutho mincinci. [This tendency of the minority parties.]

Because once you wear overall, you are not going to do a clean job. Once you wear an overall, that is an indication that, at any given time, you cannot do any perfect job.

Njengokuba ndisitsho ukuba ... [As I was saying that ...]

... as the ANC we are protecting the poorest of the poor.

Nangoku ke Tambo mabahambe kuba bathi bayahamba. Ndiyayivuyela loo nto yokuba besithi bayahamba. Siyavuya Madiba kuba ude wafika wasincedisa. Ukuba bafuna ukuhamba mabahambe kuba ...

(Translation of isiXhosa paragraph follows.)

[Even now Tambo they must go because they said that they are going. I am happy that they say they are going. We are happy Madiba because

you arrived and helped us. If they want to go, they must go because ...]

... they have nothing to offer to the poorest of the poor. The second leader who implemented this early childhood development programme was our first Minister of Education, Professor Kader Asmal. On 12 December 2000, he put aside a budget of R195 million and suggested that it must be catered for in the Department of Social Development. Remember, in the ANC we analyse and put strategies so that we can implement our programmes and policies.

During the apartheid era, there were no black children benefiting from crèches. So, ever since 1994 my organisation, which had the majority, was given the mandate by the people of South Africa and managed to create crèches. For instance, in this Taking Parliament to the People, our institution looked at education and health. We went to the deep rural areas of Alfred Nzo District Municipality and looked at those crèches. After that we made some preparations, as the chairperson has alluded to, to go back on September with most of the things being done by our government and not other people, as people had given us a mandate.

When we were in the rural areas we found that churches and other community centres were accommodating early childhood development programmes from six months up to four years. Those young people were very excited when they were graduating and going to a formal school.

Those were good news that we heard from the people because in the rural areas they accommodate for those mothers who are working and also for those who are not working.

Our international icon, former President Nelson Mandela said in his book, *The Authorised Book of Quotations*:

If we want to be the caring society we thought we were striving for during our fight against the iniquities of apartheid, we must eradicate all traces of violence against and abuse of children.

We know in this House that the programme of early childhood development and students were close to the heart of Nelson Mandela. Long live your spirit, you have made us proud!

In South Africa, we have got 12 650 early childhood development centres and within this short space of time of democracy this number is covering all the provinces. The opposition is not happy about this because they have no policies to implement. Thank you ANC for giving these policies because our people are always cherishing ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Order! Order hon Wana, please take your seat. Hon Mokwele, why are you on your feet?

Ms T J MOKWELE: The speaker is not talking about Taking Parliament to the People.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon Mokwele, please take your seat. That is not a point of order.

Nks T WANA: Kaloku abantu xa sele behamba, abazinzi kuba kaloku bayashiywa mhlawumbi zibhasi okanye izinto zokuhamba. [Kwahlekwa.] Ngoko ke xa bengazinzanga, asinakuyinceda loo nto. (*Translation of isiXhosa paragraph follows.*)

[Ms T WANA: When people are already leaving, they are restless because the busses or any other mode of transport are leaving them behind. [Laughter.] Therefore when they are restless, we cannot help that.]

Let me say that the Eastern Cape in the Department of Social Development has managed to make a very good budget of R231 million for early childhood development. With regard to infrastructure, they have put aside R10 million in terms of maintenance and renovations. We are very proud as the Eastern Cape because we have 13 914 people who are benefiting in the early childhood development programmes of which 200 are disabled people.

Uyayazi ke xa sesilapha Sihlalo weNdlu, ukuba abantu abanempahla ezibomvu abakhange bazibonakalise ubudlongodlongo babo baza kuthunyelelwa umyalezo omfutshane ngutata wabo athi mabatwebeke. (*Translation of isiXhosa paragraph follows.*)

[You know that as we are here Chairperson of the House, the people who are wearing red clothes if they did not display their violent behaviour they are going to receive a short message from their father who is going to tell them to misbehave.]

Therefore, there is no content. The current budget is conversing all the things the chairperson has announced here. Let me salute the United Nations International Children's Emergency Fund, UNICEF, for assisting an African region in this early childhood development programme because the wars that took place in Africa made UNICEF to assist us and our country is among the 190 countries ... Oh no! Thank you very much. [Time Expired.][Applause.]

Mr B D KIVEDO (Western Cape): Hon Chair, I note the presence of the hon Chairperson of the NCOP, hon Modise, hon MECs, hon Members of the NCOP and also hon members of the special delegations.

Education remains pivotal to ensuring that millions of South Africans have a chance to escape poverty. Taking Parliament to the People continues to present Members of Parliament with the wonderful opportunity to engage with citizens across the country. These initiatives are crucial to understanding issues which may be affecting the people of South Africa so that government can find the necessary solutions to address those respective issues.

Our team recently visited the Eastern Cape in order to gain a better understanding of the issues faced by the people there. The oversight visit offered us the opportunity to assess and evaluate where the Department of Education in the Eastern Cape was succeeding or failing in their duties. Rather than just seeing this oversight visit as a means of comparing the state of educational services in the Western Cape to that of the Eastern Cape, we believe that this was more of an opportunity for the education departments from each province to learn from one another in order to improve the lives of the people that we represent.

The amount of effort put into educating our youth will ultimately determine our education outcomes. Impact studies suggest that parents who care more about education are those who seek to ensure that their children receive adequate education at all cost. It is those parents who constantly spend more time ensuring that their children are progressing well in school.

Since democratisation, I am glad that all South Africans have been granted access to an equal educational system that looks to provide each and every child with the opportunity to live a life that they value.

I am still deeply concerned that, although children have equal access to the educational system, when the quality of education being received throughout South Africa is assessed, massive

discrepancies in the quality of education being offered to the children of this country can still be found. To my disbelief, the oversight visit to Eastern Cape presented such large discrepancies in the quality of education being delivered to children in South Africa. I was deeply concerned to see that, while many learners have been granted access to education, government has failed to provide the necessary resources needed for them to succeed in the school environment. It is for this reason that many Eastern Cape children flock to the Western Cape, and I welcome them with open arms.

My colleague, the hon Mokwebu, made a wonderful comparative analysis earlier on. Let me just focus on it as a backdrop, and not as a means to grandstand about the Western Cape's scenario. The latest matric results are just one of many indicators highlighting my concerns surrounding the quality of education children are receiving in the Eastern Cape. The latest matric results indicate that the Western Cape achieved a matric pass rate of 86%. This represent an increase of 1,3% compared to the previous year. Compare this to the Eastern Cape where the matric pass rate was 59,3%.

There are several reasons learners are achieving the results that are seen across the two respective provinces. Firstly, these two provinces are governed by two different political parties. The DA-led Western Cape outperforms the Eastern Cape for the simple reason that our government does not just say that it will improve the lives of its people, it delivers on what it promised. We have the best

practices which we believe can be implemented across all provinces. So it has to be shared.

We believe that no person should fail to have the opportunity to attend school because of their financial circumstances.

Lastly, it must be noted that 98,5% of the schools in our province are either no-fee schools or schools that have been compensated and assisted by the Western Cape Education Department in one way or another. We have already allocated nearly up to R50 million to fee-paying schools. This equates to us providing assistance to 97% of all provincial fee-paying schools.

The efforts made by the Western Cape Education Department produced a teacher learner ratio of 1:35. Where funding and resources limited learners' access to education, the Western Cape Education Department rolled out more than 150 mobile classes over the 2017 financial year. These additional mobile classes are a simple, yet effective way of dealing with the current teacher-learner ratio. The Western Cape government has also made use of several e-learning game changers to ensure that access to education is supported by technologically innovative initiatives. By April 2017, a total of 1 239 schools across our province would have been connected to broadband.

This brings us to the situation in the Eastern Cape. My heart goes out to the children of the Eastern Cape. I am a child of the soil of the Eastern Cape, born and bred in the Tsitsikamma and settled in Uitenhage. So, it is my province also and I will stand for my province. My heart goes out to the children of the Eastern Cape. Much work needs to be done there in order to establish an educational environment that produces future citizens that can contribute to our beloved country.

It must be noted, that although the teacher-learner ratio in the Eastern Cape is around 1:33, many of the schools visited are experiencing huge challenges that do not do justice to the positive teacher-learner ratio. General challenges experienced in the Eastern Cape include high numbers of teenage pregnancies, a high rate of sickness amongst learners, and a shortage of water supply to schools, particularly schools located in rural areas.

What is really alarming is that numerous schools in the province were experiencing burglaries and theft on a regular basis, leaving these schools with no essential equipment and teaching aids such as computers, etc. That is a major problem, as school governing bodies cannot afford to appoint additional security officers.

Poorer areas do not have access to scholar transport. Continued use of the toilet bucket system by some preschool facilities still takes place, like Vuyani and Zingisani preschools which are located in the

Umzimvubu Local Municipality. Many schools do not have internet services, a lack which denies children access to the information required to be successful in the technological age in which we live.

In conclusion, I recommend – and this is just a recommendation, because I am not saying that I have the solutions – that the Eastern Cape government and, in particular the relevant departments, should, as a matter of urgency, intervene and seek ways to address these challenges for the sake of quality learning and teaching and better academic performance by the South African education system. Our department is more than willing to reach out to the other provinces, especially the Eastern Cape, to share with them our best practice models with a view to enhancing their education practices. In the process, we will build a strong, capable, competent and resilient South African nation. I thank you, Chair.

Ms L X F HLONGWA-MADLALA (KwaZulu-Natal): Hon Chairperson, Ministers in our presence, Members of the NCOP, both permanent and special delegates, receive my greetings this afternoon. We wish to start by saluting women from all walks of life in this very important month, as we celebrated the International Women's Day. It is equally our country's Human Rights month and we remember the struggles of the 21st March 1960, and pay tribute to our heroes and heroines who fought the just war so that we can have the democracy and freedom we have today.

The ruling party, the ANC, has proclaimed this year 2017, as the Year of Oliver Reginald Tambo. Oliver Reginald Tambo represents the best example of how good leaders can contribute to forging excellence in the collectives they lead, and to raising the movement's performance to a high pedestal. His incisive mind encouraged all of us to learn and seek to understand connections among various factors in the dynamics of the struggle. This is equally true for government officials at the helm of various departments, and our success rests on administrators who are selflessly committed to serving our people beyond the call of duty, like the great Oliver Reginald Tambo.

The NCOP's visit to the Eastern Cape in Buffalo City Municipality last year during the Taking Parliament to the People programme, painted a rather not so rosy picture about the state of affairs in the province. However, we believe that there are a handful of solutions we can bring to the table as KwaZulu-Natal. Hon Chairperson, the journey of transformation is not an easy one and it requires capable and visionary leaders such as the great OR who can make things happen.

There were a lot of concerns raised at both the public hearings and at sites, and we have to turn this corner by strengthening our intergovernmental relations to ensure that services due to our people are rendered in time. This is the strength of the KwaZulu-Natal province, Madam Chair.

In the KwaZulu-Natal Human Settlements Portfolio, we have since 2002 involved the National Home Builders Registration Council, NHBRC, to address the challenges in the human settlements sector in order to avoid complaints and litigations. Most of the projects from 2002 are not as bad as they were in the past, because we now have a body that quality assures the work we are doing in the province, and thus the space for shoddy workmanship is reduced. The Human Settlements Department in KwaZulu-Natal has strengthened community liaison to deal with vulnerable groups both women and youth and adopted few interventions to address poor quality of houses. They have appointed reputable contractors and implementing agents, they have improved controls on site through the introduction of a four tier system including *inter alia*, municipal building inspectors, NHBRC inspectors, departmental inspectors and structural site engineer. Contract management capacity is also build inside the department to monitor those who fall behind the development programme.

Madam Chair, the most disconcerting in this report is the entire Early Childhood Development, ECD, story in the Eastern Cape and we think as the KwaZulu-Natal, there are lessons that we can share with you because we believe we have done fairly well in this area. The Departments of Education, Health, Arts and Culture as well as Social Development have joined hands in ensuring that ECDs is rolled out adequately and without fail to its beneficiaries. One of the important facets of the ECD basket is the role of NGOs and nonprofit

organisations, NPOs, which are actively involved in the programme facilitation.

The Department of Arts and Culture together with National Lottery, have committed to support children with toys for fine and gross motor skills development. During the year 2016-17, the Department of Social Development continued to register newly established ECD's centres and also registered 165 more ECD programmes. This led to an increase in a number of children benefitting from the ECD services. After the review of the provincial integrated ECD action plan, the department facilitated provincial consultation of the ECD policy and programmes, in partnership with the Department of Education, National Development Agency and Ilifa Labantwana, and the main reasons for these consultations Madam Chair, were to avert challenges that were prominent in the Buffalo City Municipality visits.

The KwaZulu-Natal Provincial Growth and Development Strategy goal four, relates to the building of the strategic infrastructure. During the public hearings people lamented about the poor road infrastructure, the absence of tarred roads, poor quality workmanship, poor road maintenance, and absence of taxi ranks as well as sheltered bus stops in some instances. In KwaZulu-Natal, we view road networks as strategic and catalytic tools to enhancing economic growth, and are at the centre of the seamless movement of goods and people.

To demonstrate the commitment of the KwaZulu-Natal government to the improvement of the road networks, the Department of Transport is now increasing its internal capacity to deal with road maintenance in particular so as to curb the expenses that come with the upgrades. Over the years the department has worked with the people for the people, through programmes such as the Zibambeke and Vukuzakhe which are meant to uplift the historically disadvantaged people in the main women and youth. These two programmes are directly addressing vegetation by the roads, whilst municipalities maintain storm water and sewerage pipes to avoid health hazards.

Madam Chairperson, it is a well known fact that we still have large numbers of youth unemployment in KwaZulu-Natal, but a lot of work is being done even through Economic Development, Tourism and Environmental Affairs, EDTEA, to support co-operatives to create employment for our people. The province has in the past formed a partnership with the University of Zululand to train and develop co-operatives to play a meaningful role in the mainstream economy. The Department of Economic Development, Tourism and Environmental Affairs has since acquired some level of expertise in developing co-operatives, and so many Departments, including Education, and Health are now dependent on this department for skilling.

Hon Chairperson and hon members, we also noted the challenges faced by the Department of Health and Education in the province, and of particular importance is the Lovedale Technical and Vocational

Education and Training, TVET, which is the pride of our nation. We think there is a lot of work that needs to be done there to accelerate radical economic transformation in the region. The college's infrastructure is no longer in a good state and we think it warrants the attention of the Department of Higher Education. Equally the issues of funding which seem to cut across all our TVET colleges and we think should be handled in a particular manner to avoid disruptions in our colleges.

In KwaZulu-Natal, we also started the year on a bad note with many college students threatening to go on strike, should their demands be not met, and we must appreciate Minister Nzimande and his department for intervening in this regard. We were also amazed by the good work done at the artisan academy and we think those kinds of institutions must expand and be found all over the country to meet the needs of our economy.

The schools in the Eastern Cape are not so different with the schools in KwaZulu-Natal, in that learners still travel long kilometres to school, some schools are without furniture, some schools are without ablution facilities, and even some are without qualified teachers.

The KwaZulu-Natal Department of Education is working hard to ensure that the Learner Transport is managed such that it benefits more learners than what it is benefitting currently. Just last week, the

MEC launched a ferry boat programme which benefitted about eight schools in Nkovukeni area in Umkhanyakude and Nhlanghe, to assist learners that were crossing rivers to school. We have taken a view that we can no longer lament about the inadequate money, but we are going to strengthen our fiscal discipline and learn to do more with less.

KwaZulu-Natal same as the Eastern Cape does face challenges of lack of classrooms, libraries, laboratories, specialists rooms, security, academic performance, shortage of teachers as well as good managers and leaders in our schools. However, the MEC of Education in our province has pledged to fast-track the transformation of the schooling system, which is a programme aimed at rationalising small schools and optimally using human resources to benefit the needy schools.

Equally on the issue of performance, the department is busy capacitating teachers to understand the curriculum through programmes called Just-in-Time and Operation Bounce Back. Managers in our schools are subjected to curriculum delivery and management courses.

Of great importance in KwaZulu-Natal education now is to give support to all schools to perform better, and be able to produce responsible and productive citizenry. The department is building its

internal capacity, again to address infrastructure issues so that we do not always go to public works in case there are problems.

On the issues of discipline as they were raised in the Eastern Cape, we have at the beginning of the year conducted our annual oversight to more than 75 schools as the legislature and at the centre of all the visits was the cry about parental involvement in the education of their children ... We want to request the Eastern Cape to open its doors for us and also are opening our doors for the Eastern Cape to learn. Thank you Chair. [Time expired.] [Applause.]

Mr S L MALAZA (Mpumalanga): Hon House Chair, hon members of the NCOP, it is an honour to rise and join a debate on the work of the National Council of Provinces, a work that continues to ensure that there is interaction with our people, in pursuit of our constitutional obligation to engage and place our people at the centre of development.

This year, we are celebrating the 105th anniversary of the founding of our glorious liberation movement, the ANC. Equally, 2017 is the year of Oliver Reginald Tambo. Had he lived, he would have been 100 years old this year. If we, as an organisation, were to account and stand before him, we would have said, comrade President, our today is better than yesterday. We would have said, despite the challenges and setbacks of the moment, this organisation you left is on course, we are soldering on, and nothing can stop us now.

Quite a number of issues emanated from the public hearings and site visits to Buffalo City, such as poor road infrastructure, poorly maintained roads, an absence of taxi ranks, and a high rate of youth unemployment. We should not lose sight of the fact the Buffalo City Metropolitan Municipality is predominantly rural.

On the basis of the above, the municipality is characterised by challenges which affect the majority of the previously disadvantaged, from the mainstream of the economy to access to services.

Given this background, the municipality has a high unemployment rate and that affects our young people. They are definitely not a lost generation. They are a generation of hope and leaders of tomorrow. It is therefore key to put effective measures in place such as local industrialisation and local economic development programmes, including putting systems in place to address the agricultural economy, to ensure that the inequality gap is adequately dealt with. It is critical for the municipality to capitalise on the predominant economic activities and drive the transformation agenda in this regard.

We should instil a culture of becoming producers rather than consumers in our youth - young people who are going to be employers rather than seeking employment.

A number of issues were raised on health care, education and road infrastructure, which characterise the life of the citizen and the condition under which they live, however good stories were also shared. A case in point is the state of the art hospital, Cecilia Makiwane, delivered by the ANC-led government. [Applause.] It is a well-managed institution. Lovedale is a high-performing agricultural college. Despite challenges, the college develops skills in young women and young men to be farmers.

We are not mentioning these things because we intend to turn a blind eye to the challenges, but importantly, there are success stories in the Eastern Cape. All these things serve as a beacon of hope for our people in that province. Our people continue to rely on the government that is led by the ANC, despite all these challenges.

Indeed, as the African National Congress, we can boldly make this assertion without any doubt that if all the leaders who have passed on ask us today how we are doing; we would confirm that, indeed, our today is better than yesterday.

Allow us to draw words of wisdom from Comrade O R Tambo who said and I quote: "The fight for freedom must go until it is won, until our country is free and happy and peaceful as part of the community of man, we cannot rest." As Mpumalanga, that is the message we are bringing, that we cannot rest until all the things raised by our citizens in that municipality are won. We will fight with them and

walk with them side-by-side to ensure that this ANC-led government delivers. We have heard them; we know their concerns and we are not turning a blind eye.

We know it to be true that this current government led by the ANC in Buffalo City has done some tremendous work. Not all is black and bad. There are success stories. We know for sure that they have delivered housing, improved health care services and road infrastructure. With them, we are soldiering on. The ANC lives, the ANC leads. [Applause.] I thank you.

Mr C HATTINGH: Chairperson, standing here once again speaking on the state of basic education in the Eastern Cape - as was evident during the NCOP Taking Parliament to the People programme - feels like déjà vu. Most of us had been there, repeatedly, in the past. However, there is no tangible evidence that any improvements flowed from previous engagements with the Eastern Cape education system.

Perhaps I should just pause a moment and reflect. We had the hon Chepape here - I think it was a hit-and-run speech. He came here and recited the findings. He came here empty handed: no solution, no vision, no future, nothing - empty handed. It was the same with the hon Hlongwa-Madlala from KwaZulu-Natal, which is the third worst performing province in the country in terms of education. She came here with the problems but no solutions. She was proudly representing the ANC: no future, no vision, and no solutions.

By now, most of us can actually tell what we will find at Eastern Cape schools. It won't be different in KwaZulu-Natal. When we arrive at the schools, even before we get out of the vehicles - some of us actually did get out of the vehicles. Hon Wana didn't always get out; that is why she didn't know what was going on. Sometimes she slept in the vehicle. Upon arrival at a school with broken windows and dilapidated classrooms where plastic and paper cling to broken fences and gates, we will almost certainly find the members doing the oversight ticking the boxes right there in the vehicle without even getting out.

The Minister of Basic Education, Angie Motshekga, only last week confirmed and revealed, despite it being illegal for learners at schools not to have access to basic infrastructure such as water, electricity and sanitation, that learners in 1 585 Eastern Cape schools are still being exposed to pit toilets. A total of 61 schools have no toilets. Some of them still use a bucket system, and 58 schools are without water supply.

Minister Motshekga further stated that 800 of the approximately 1 000 schools in South Africa built with wood, mud, asbestos, and zinc are situated in the Eastern Cape. Even the SA Democratic Teachers' Union, Sadtu, report hailed by our golf-playing member at the back revealed that hundreds of pupils at 16 Eastern Cape schools returned to unsafe school structures, as the department had failed

to replace and renovate or, at least, safeguard these schools, as was promised by Eastern Cape Premier Masualle last year.

Maintenance and planning appear to be an insurmountable mountain for the Eastern Cape Department of Education. The delivery of textbooks, including the delivery of textbooks for critical subjects like science and mathematics, despite repeated assurances by the department during onsite visits and briefings, still remains a major challenge for the department.

ANC-affiliate Sadtu reported that 11,5% of textbooks were not delivered to the schools. This was in March and was confirmed by the Eastern Cape provincial department that made excuses by saying they only had access to a limited number of printing companies. It is very good news that the SA Human Rights Commission will now investigate the nondelivery of textbooks in the Eastern Cape. I am so happy that they have announced this.

There is a critical shortage of educators, something that was mentioned at the podium a bit earlier. There is a critical shortage of educators, and we have seen that in the 2016 results where the province again found itself at the bottom – the worst performing province. It was also found that, apart from the Alfred Nzo district, the O R Tambo, Amathole, Joe Gqabi, and Chris Hani districts face a critical shortage of mathematics and science teachers. It appears that the Eastern Cape is once again ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon Hattingh ... hon Hattingh ...

Mr C HATTINGH: I will not take a question.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon Hattingh, please take your seat. Hon Mokwele, why are you on your feet?

Ms T J MOKWELE: Chair, I would like to ask whether the hon Hattingh is willing to take a question.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Alright. Thank you very much.

Ms T J MOKWELE: He was part of that government.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): No, hon Mokwele! You can't do that. [Interjections.]

Ms T J MOKWELE: It is because of you that we are in this mess.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon Hattingh, are you ready to ... Hon Mokwele! Are you ready to take a question from the hon member?

Mr C HATTINGH: Chair, I am sorry. She doesn't really ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Are you ready to take a question?

Mr C HATTINGH: No! She doesn't know what is going on here.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon Mokwele, he is not willing to take a question. Continue, hon Hattingh.

Mr C HATTINGH: Literally thousands of educator positions are vacant, whilst Sadtu stated 320 positions for principals are vacant.

[Interjections.] Scholar transport has already been mentioned here.

So, Chair, the following, unlike the ANC MECs and people from other provinces coming here and trying to lecture us on what should not happen there ... [Interjections.] Just explaining the problems, the Eastern Cape and KwaZulu-Natal will not turn around its problems if there is no proper planning, if there is no proper delivery of learning and teaching support material on time, if critical vacant positions for both educators and principals, as well as for critical subjects like mathematics and science, are not filled, and if sufficient scholar transport is not provided.

A national intervention in the Eastern Cape infrastructure crisis in the education system is overdue. There should be an investigation into the root causes of the high dropout rate in Eastern Cape schools. Taking into consideration the dropout rate, the matric

results would look even worse now. Until this situation is rectified, the Eastern Cape situation will continue, and thousands of children will, for the rest of their lives, live with inferior education thanks to the ANC. [Time expired.] [Interjections.]

Mr M MAKUPULA (Eastern Cape-MEC Education): House chairperson, hon members and guests to this august House, good afternoon. I am standing here to accept and appreciate the report of the NCOP visit as led by the Chairperson of the NCOP, hon Thandi Modise.

Let me indicate upfront that, indeed, even to us as the province, the visit of the NCOP was more of a lesson in the sense that the jerking up of how we have been doing things was checked. A combination of challenges that are systematic and structural; but also people's problem, especially by the officials. This is rather not to shift the blame but how the oversight ... [Interjections.] ... as well ... the combination of challenges.

Let me also say that since the visit of the NCOP, there has been some significant work that the department has done.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon MEC, please, take your seat, sir! Hon Smit, why are you standing?

Mr C F B SMIT: I would like to know if the hon member is willing to take a question.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Let me find out from him.

Hon MEC, are you ready?

Mr M MAKUPHULA (Eastern Cape): I only have 10 minutes.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): He is not ready, hon member. Please, continue hon MEC.

Mr M MAKUPHULA (Eastern Cape): The first thing to highlight is the focus on the early childhood development, ECD. Despite the fact that there is no national policy - it remains a draft since 2011, for the first time in the Eastern Cape that we have professionalised 900 Grade R practitioners. We have appointed them as Foundation Phase post level 1 educators. They are starting to get into the system with their benefits.

Another thing to highlight on the Grade R level is that of the 4 500 primary schools, we have been able to attach a Grade R classroom to more than 4 400 of them. 98% of our children accessing early learning classes are actually accessing Grade R classrooms. 85% of those that are doing Grade 1 currently have passed through a Grade R classroom.

To be specific to the visits to both Alfred Nzo and Buffalo City, I would like to highlight that I have declared 54 747 posts to ensure that almost all schools have adequate number of educators as

provided by the Act. Obviously, some schools are losing educators every year because of the numbers that are changing. As at 6 March 2017, the reports provided by districts indicate that there are 1 603 identified additional educators. We are working on open bulletin, which will be issued before the end of this month to ensure that additional educators are given opportunities to schools where their services are needed.

On special schools, especially, Mbizana, Nompumalanga and Zamokuhle Special Schools, tenders for water and sanitation have been closed on 24 February. Contractor award processes are underway for completion in March 2017. We expect that contractors must be on site beginning of April especially to all the special schools.

Sive Special School was another school that was visited. The school is almost 100% finished; only one thing holding us is Eskom and electricity. Eskom has confirmed that the pending electricity connection will happen by the end of March upon completion of the installation of the transformer by the departmental contractor.

One of the most painful things that members picked up was that a teacher in that school, Mr Tsese, was not paid for a period of 10 months. I can stand here safely to say Mr Tsese has received all his dues and is part of the normal system now. [Applause.]

To move quickly as time is running out for me, let me also talk about East London on the following schools: Sinovuyo, Alphendale, Parkside and Vukuhambe Schools, fencing are being installed at all these schools. I have been to Vukuhambe, fencing is completed - high quality material fencing. A tender for the refurbishment of Vukuhambe Special School has been approved. In fact, the contractor will be on site in April.

Ulwazi High School, and coincidentally, Madam House Chairperson, that's the school I started teaching at. That school, who's principal is a lady, all the requisitioned furniture has been delivered beginning of this month. [Applause.] In King Williams Town, Iqonce Junior Secondary School, the one that has been occupying a private building. We have already provided them with four temporary classrooms, which have been delivered and are being utilised since February.

Another point to highlight is that the question of schools sitting on private land or land owned by church, for example, the Tsitsikama area, towards the end of 2016, last year, the department bought land at R1,5 million from the Morovian church where two schools are occupying the land i.e. Amamfengu Public Primary School and Clarkson Public School in Clarkson and Humansdorp respectively. That land is now owned by the department and we are servicing those schools from our land.

Moving to Learning and Teaching Support Material, LTSM, a very topical issue; this year, the mandate we had was to buy literature for Grade 12 and technical books for Grade 11. Technical books cost us R2,7 million and Grade 12 literature cost R36 million, an overall amount of R38 million. Orders were issued out by 31 August 2016. As we are issuing these books, which was the mandate for this year, we picked up that schools do not retrieval policies.

We have a vicious cycle that, every year, principals and teachers are demanding books when in actual fact the lifespan of a textbook is more than three years. Schools aren't retrieving books; all they do is go to the media and say the department has failed. I appeal to members, before you accept a statement that says there are no books, can you ask the principal: how many books did you retrieve from the books of the previous years? We all know during our time that they use to withhold a report for not bringing back a book.

We are in a democratic era; we are not withholding children's reports but schools have a responsibility of retrieving books. I am happy to indicate to you that 100% of stationary has been delivered to schools. As at March, 98% of literature was delivered. Technical, mathematics and science were standing at 75%. By the way, these are small schools and are only 65 in the province. The outstanding deliveries are being attended to and other deliveries are also being handled directly by the LTSM co-ordinators.

As I step off, let me indicate to my hon members, those who have opened their arms to say, indeed, let's co-operate and work together. I want to say, I am leading a department that is offering public institutions of children of the people of Eastern Cape. This is not my private property. To my colleague, to KwaZulu-Natal, I led a visit to KwaZulu-Natal in 2012, by then Senzo was still an MEC. This is where I learned how you are doing the multi-year agreement rather than declare every year, which is disruptive. Another thing I learned there ... [Time expired.] Thank you very much. [Applause.]

Ms T K MAMPURU: House Chairperson, let me indicate that, in her opening remarks, the Chairperson of the institution was very clear to indicate to the House that, as the ANC which is leading the government, we are our own critic. Unfortunately, ...

...banabešo, Matlebjane o bolailwe ke tswala ka gore ge o le mmušo o tšea bana o re ke ba gago, ga o tsebe gore naa ba bangwe bona ka dikgopolong tša bona go direga eng. Ga se ka phošo ge tatagorena, mohl Rolihlahla Nelson Madiba Mandela a ile a re, ke a mo tsopola: "Thuto ke lerumo le maatla leo motho a ka le šomišago go fetola lefase."

Ge go be go kgonega, re be re swanetše go etela kua sehlakahlakeng sa go tsebega bjalo ka Robben Island go ya go ithuta le go hlaologanya taba ye ke tlilego go tsena go yona, re lebeletše profense ya Kapa Bohlabela.

Nkemele gannyane, Modulasetulo wa Ngwako. (*Translation of Sepedi paragraphs follows.*)

[... fellow members, some of the problems we are experiencing are self-inflicted. They are internal problems. Our former leader, hon Rolihlahla Nelson Mandela said for a fact, and I quote: "Education is the most powerful weapon which you can use to change the world."

If it was possible, we would take an educational tour to the renowned Robben Island to learn and have a background understanding on what I am to share with you about the Eastern Cape.

Wait, House Chairperson.]

For many years, black political prisoners spent a lot of time digging both lime quarries and blue quarries as a form of torture, brutality and punishment. The lime quarry hole was ultimately used as a toilet, in brackets, are self-inflicted as they were caused some of our own a relief area when nature called, and a classroom when the need arouse, hence the quote by Tata Rolihlahla.

The NCOP visited the Eastern Cape province on 14 to 18 ...

[Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon Mampuru, please take your seat.

Ms T J MOKWELE: Ma'am, what have I done. I am listening to you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon Mokwele, speak to me.

Ms T J MOKWELE: I can't. Don't worry.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Okay, take your seat.

Ms T J MOKWELE: O seke wa tshwenyega mama. [Don't worry Mam.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Take your seat, hon Mokwele. Continue, hon Mampuru.

Ms T K MAMPURU: Let me go back to where I was. The NCOP visited the Eastern Cape province on 14 to 18 December 2016 to undertake the programme of Taking Parliament to the People. The NCOP executed these activities together with the provincial legislature under the theme "Following Up on Our Commitments".

Modulasetulo wa Ngwako, thuto ke lesedi, tša yona ga di fele - ke bokoti re a neetšana. Badudi ba Afrika-Borwa, tsebang gore pušo ye e eteletšwego pele ke ANC ke ya lena. Moreromogolo wa yona ke go le hlankela ka go bona maphelo a lena a fetoga letšatši ka letšatši.

Kua Kapa Bohlabela, NCOP e hlaotše mafelo a go swana le selete sa Alfred Nzo seo se etilego pele le sa Buffalo City seo se latelago ka

morago, feela se le swanetšego go se tseba ke gore maikemišetšo a a swana - e lego go lekola gore melao ye e hlangwago ke efe mo magatong a mmušo wa bosetšhaba - gona mo re lego gona Palamenteng, la profense, le la mmasepapala.

Lekgotla la Bosetšhaba la Diprofense le lekotše tše di latelago: Meago ya dikolo le phahlo ya dikolo, dipuku, dinamelwa tša bana ba sekolo, phepo ya barutwana, tlhokego ya barutiši, meetse dikolong, dintlwana tša botshwelamare, dikolokomiti, polokego dikolong, dikolo tša digotlane le phepo ya bona, dikolo tša bana ba go se itekanele - kudu monaganong, dikolo tša difoa, tša dimumu le a mangwe maemo a bona ka go fapafapana, kopanyo ya dikolo tše dinnyane ... lenaneo le ke le letelele; selepe gomela! Ga se leabela, ke go lepelela.

(Translation of Sepedi paragraphs follows.)

[House Chairperson, education is key; it opens up doors for opportunities. Fellow South Africans, the ANC is the ruling party precisely committed to deliver services for the betterment of daily lives for all.

In the Eastern Cape, the NCOP has identified Alfred Nzo and Buffalo City regions respectively to run an oversight on the delivery of services. The main objective is to oversee the laws that are made in various levels of government - the national and the provincial Parliament.

The National Council of Provinces has conducted oversight and identified the following: school buildings and furniture, books, transport system to and from school, learners feeding schemes, shortage of teachers, water supply at schools, availability of toilets, School Governing Body, school safety, crechès and feeding schemes, schools for learners with disability - especially for the mentally disturbed, the blind, the deaf, and other various forms of disability, combining schools... the list is endless. We will proceed against all odds.]

The government's National Development Plan 2030: Our Future - make it work, on education states that each community should have a school with well-educated, trained and caring teachers. The outcome of this is the provision of quality education, skills development and innovation.

Modulasetulo wa Ngwako, tša Kgoro ya Thuto mo Kapa Bohlabela ke mabotse le mathakga. Tše dingwe tša dikolo tšeo di etetšwego e bile Sekolo sa Praemari sa Cranberry. Go lekotšwe phepo ya barutwana, sekolokomiti, phahlo ya sekolo; ebile a mangwe a maloko a sekolokomiti a thwetšwe go ba baletadikgoro ba dikolo. Ke kgatelopele yeo.

Senthara ya Tlhokomelo ya Ithemba lethu e thomile ka bana ba masome a mabedi ba mengwaga ya go tloga go 0-6. Lehono ge re bolela, bana ba ke ba 152 ka moago woo o feleletšego. Go na le ofisi, bobolokelo,

morale le phapoši ya digotlane tšeo di tlogo pele ga Kreiti ya R. Ga se tšeo fela, go na le serapana sa merogo - ga se re tlwaele gore kua disenthareng tša tlhokomelo, bahlokomedi ba tšona ba tšee matsapa a go bona gore ba a lema gore bana ba rena ba tšwele pele go ipshina ka merogo. (*Translation of Sepedi paragraphs follows.*)

[House Chairperson, there is a good story to tell in the Eastern Cape Education Department. One of the schools which were visited is the Cranberry Primary School. Oversight was conducted on learners feeding schemes, the School Governing Body, school furniture. Furthermore, some of the SGB members were appointed as school security officers. This is a remarkable stride.

Ithembaletu Educare Centre has started the programme with 20 children from the age of zero to six. As we speak, the centre has 152 children with a fully-fledged building. It is equipped with an office, storage room, kitchen, and Grade R classroom. Not only that, there is also a vegetable garden. It is not often that we find caregivers taking an initiative to make a vegetable garden so that the children can indulge in fresh produce.]

Early Childhood Development - there's a step ahead ...

... ke ye nngwe ya mehlala ye mebotse. Barutiši ke ba lesome, bao ba seelago ba na le mangwalo a bokgoni, Tlhako ya Bosetšhaba ya Maswanedi a Dithuto ya legato la 4, (NQF) o tee o na le Tlhako ya

Bosetšhaba ya Maswanedi a Dithuto ya legato la 5, ba babedi ba gare ba ithuta Tlhako ya Bosetšhaba ya Maswanedi a Dithuto a Bosetšhaba a legato la 4, ba babedi ba mafelelo ba na le marematlou. Ke therešo o di bone Anthony J D Angelo ge a tla re, ke a mo tsopola:

(Translation of Sepedi paragraph follows.)

[... and this is one of the best examples: There are 10 teachers at the school: 6 of them have level 4 of the National Qualification Framework (NQF); One teacher has NQF level 5; two teachers are currently working on NQF level 4; and the last two have matric certificates. J D Angelo had it right when he said, and I quote ...]

Develop a passion for learning. If you do, you will never cease to grow.

Go ditlhohlo ka moka tšeo di hweditšwego, Molekgotlaphethiši, re a go leboga ka lebaka la gore ge re eme mo, re ile ra ikana gore tše dingwe tša ditlhotlo o šale o di rarolla. Re a kwa mo gore o kgonne go tšwela pele, re a go leboga. Gatela pele, o tšwele pele, Molekgotlaphethiši. A re re sephetho e bile gore Molekgotlaphethiši wa tša Thuto, e lego mohl Mna Makupula, a lebeledišiše le go lekola ditlhotlo ka moka tše di hweditšwego, kudukudu taba ya dinamelwa ya barutwana. Ka lebaka la ponagalo ya naga - ka moka re a tseba gore sebopego sa Kapa Bohlabela ga se sa ema gabotse, e dutše godimo ga meboto. Ke ka moo le bonago dikolo di le kgole le kgole.

Polokego dikolong, kabo ya barutiši, dipuku tša go bala, dihostele dikolong ke tše dingwe tša dikeletšo tše re tlilego ka tšona ka lebaka la sebopego sa Kapa Bohlabela. Re bone gore bana ge ba tloga ka kua thoko yela, ba bangwe ba tloga ka mo, ba bangwe ba tshela dinoka le maope, matšatši a mangwe ga go kgonagale gore ba fihle sekolong. Ga go šetšwe taba ya gore go be le dihostele gore bana ba rena ba tle ba bolokege. Go matlafatša thuto, Molekgotlaphethiši o hlalositše phepo ya barutwana le kopanyo ya dikolo tše dinnyane, le dikolo tša go ikgetha - kudu ka gore go barutwana ba ba go se itekanele ga go bonolo go latišiša mananeo a thuto a dikolo tša bona go swana le a tše di tlwaelegilego.

Modulasetulo wa Ngwako, tše ka moka di ka kgonega ge re ka se lebale gore ge nkabe e se ka peke le tšhisele kua Robben Island, re ka be re se moo re lego gona lehono. Rena re bakgoditš ba moriti, a re boneng gore setšhaba sa Afrika-Borwa se dula tlase ga wona se nwe meetse a mokgako.

Molaetša wa mafelelo šoo. (*Translation of Sepedi paragraphs follows.*)

[Hon MEC, despite all the challenges we are faced with, we still thank you for resolving the challenges that we agreed you will resolve. We hear that you managed to continue to address the challenges, and we thank you. Keep it up. The consensus reached was

that the MEC for Education Mr Makupula will monitor and evaluate the findings of the challenges.

House Chairperson, all this is possible only if we do not forget that had it not been by pick and chisel at Robben Island, we would not be where we are today. We are just the trendsetters, and let us ensure that our fellow South Africans sit back, relax, and enjoy the fruit of our labour.

I have the last message to say.]

Against all odds, we will achieve all our goals. Let us make early childhood development a top priority amongst the measures to improve the quality of education and long-term prospects of future generations. Dedicated resources should be channelled towards ensuring that all children are well cared for from an early age and receive appropriate emotional, cognitive and physical development stimulation.

A re šomeng; a re boneng dipoelo tša mašelang ao ba le filego ona - dibilione tše R32,9 tšeo di abetšwego Kgoro ya Thuto ya Kapa Bohlabela ke Molekgotlaphethiši, Mna Sakhumzi Somyo wa *Kgoro ya Tlhabollo ya Ekonomi*. (*Translation of Sepedi paragraph follows.*)

[Let us work together; let us make use of the allocated funds of R32, 9 billion for the Eastern Cape Education Department by MEC Mr Sakhumzi Somyo of the Department of Economic Developemnt.]

J F Kennedy said, "the goal of education is the advancement of knowledge and the dissemination of truth".

Re a leboga. [Legoswi.] [I thank you. [Applause.]]

Mr M KHAWULA: Hon Chairperson, Chairperson of Council, MECs, colleagues. I am not going to say much about the Taking Parliament to the People pre-visits in Alfred Nzo District on 18 to 21 October 2016. Those visits focused specifically on education in the Alfred Nzo District. It is, however, safe to say, hon MEC, that education in that district is a disaster waiting to happen. What is left is for the Premier of the Eastern Cape to put together emergency rescue plans, so that when the disaster does happen, at least some souls can be saved.

During the Taking Parliament to the People programme, I was part of the team that visited the local economic development, LED, sites and that is what I'm going to focus on. The LED sites that were visited are The Agricultural Production and Processing in Dimbaza; Protective Wear Manufacturing in King William's Town; Steve Biko Centre in Ginsberg; BCM Automotive Aftermarket incubator in Mdantsane; East London Industrial Development Zone, IDZ; Ncera

Macadamia Farming (Pty) Ltd; Mngqesha Great Place Tourism Site in Dimbaza; Ilitha Lomzamo trading as Bee *Brite* Cleaning Products, manufactures of households and industrial detergents in Mdantsane; Duncan Village Business Support Centre; and Magebheza Furniture Manufactures in Fort Jackson.

These projects are a mix of own funding and government funding. Government funding is at all levels, namely local, provincial and national. What was noticeable with most of them is that even those that could be doing much better than the current scenario mostly suffer from underfunding and a lack of adequate support, especially from the local and provincial governments. A few of them are indeed better funded. They just need time and professionally skilled support from government in order to stabilise.

Two projects that surprised us for performing extremely well even with very little or no support at all from government - financial or otherwise - are the Magebheza Furniture Manufacturers and the Protective Wear Manufacturing. I am sure with adequate funding and support from relevant levels of government, these two industries can do much better. This will also be in line with government's ideology of industrialisation and the President's call for economic transformation.

The owners of these two industries are young black males from the townships. National government officials who were in our company

promised to get closer to these industries. One hopes that the local government officials will do the necessary follow-ups that were promised.

The East London IDZ has big plans, with a promising vision, but also suffers from underfunding to realise the vision. I wish to commend the national government officials who were with us, especially Mr Thami Klassen from the Department of Trade and Industry. He proved to be very hands-on with what is going on in the Eastern Cape regarding matters of both trade and industry and also economic development. The colleagues who were with me here can testify to that.

The public hearings conducted at the Christian Centre in Abbotsford on 15 and 16 November and in the Buffalo City provided a very interesting scenario. The scenario was much more interesting, at times, than what the members of the community were saying. The hearings were stage-managed and so skilfully manipulated. All the people who were brought to the public address system to speak were those who were prepared beforehand, and were telling us only what was prepared for us to hear. All the spoilers who would have said anything else not meant for our ears, were skilfully sidelined and shut up in order for us not to hear anything else but the play. Whoever had prepared that drama, I take my hat off to them. They are the real masters of manipulation. Be that as it may, we came, we saw, and we know exactly what is happening. I thank you.

Mr B KOMPELA (Free State): Chairperson, MECs that are here today; hon members of this important upper House, the NCOP; and special delegates from our different provinces; firstly, I want to set on record that there is no implosion of education in the Eastern Cape. There is no implosion, in any way, that would happen in the Eastern Cape. I want to put this so that members would understand the work that is going on in the Eastern Cape. In fact, the Western Cape and the DA must go to the Free State and see how to attain 93% wish of education.

The Western Cape must go to the Free State and see how the combating of crime is happening in the Free State and not in the Western Cape. The Western Cape must not come and play big brother here on a rampant, formerly an apartheid dispensation called the Eastern Cape. They must come to the Free State to learn. We are prepared to give them some few lectures in the Free State. [Interjections.]

The MEC for Transport, Liaison and Security is interacting with the Free State on some of the lessons that members have picked up in the province.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon Faber, why are you standing?

Mr W F FABER: Chairperson, I would like to ask quite an intelligent question to this debate after this hon member.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Let us check first with the hon MEC, hon Faber. Hon MEC, are you ready to take a question?

Mr B KOMPELA (Free State): Sorry Chair, I have little time.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): He is not ready, hon Faber. Please take your seat. Continue hon MEC. Order, hon Hatting!

Mr B KOMPELA (Free State): The first thing that the hon MEC of the Eastern Cape has done from a new HOD who has just come to work, was to make sure that he gets his way through to the Free State so that all the things that hon members picked up during the visit, can be corrected. He went to see what lessons other provinces could give for the Eastern Cape to be stable. We are working very intensely and seriously with them so that they could see how we could help the Eastern Cape.

In a historic process of developing a Constitution for our new democracy, the ANC succeeded in arguing for an organ of Parliament that was not only going to break with the elitist past but also remain attached to the masses of our people. The organ in which the two Houses including both the provincial legislatures and Salga would work together in advancing the interests of our people and pool their resources together, where necessary, so that they could benefit our people.

This programme of Taking Parliament to the People is very critical because that is where you become a witness to the coalface of events that are happening in municipalities and bring them to this important House for us to be able to address. It is not a police policing other people but it is how you enrich provinces to be able to do take corrective measures on the issues that you pick up there on a different face and outlook as neutral people. This is because we deal with those matters in a partisan manner on daily basis as provinces but you are not going to deal with them in a partisan manner because you deal with them with a different and fresh outlook. [Applause.]

More importantly, these organs of the legislative sphere would contribute to the deepening of representative democracy and also accountability of our people to their own people. Indeed, Parliament as we know it today, as well as various other organs of a democratic state, includes Chapter 9 institutions reflecting the important democratic principles which are enshrined in the Constitution, of a state rooted in the communities it serves through the principle of representative and participatory democracy demonstrated by all of us today in our endeavour to reach our people to find those things ...

... mabinabine a pelo tsa bona. [... they care deeply about.]

In particular, the NCOP as an organ of Parliament in a legislative sphere would ensure that a new democratic institution would refer

mainly to the accountability and service delivery to our people down there, where a service is needed. Therefore, when we speak of following up on the commitments, it is not just a theme but it is a reality of assessment of the engagement on the things that were raised; how far we have travelled so far; and what are the challenges so that you give wisdom on resolving some of the challenges that are facing provinces.

However, as implied in our Bill of Rights, the state is not only bound to fulfil the rights contained therein, but remains accountable to the fulfilment of those rights. Taking Parliament to the People is therefore about how one part of a singular Parliament holds the executive accountable and thereby ensuring that the executive serves the people who have elected them.

How then do we together demonstrate once more that the ANC-led government is not only responsive by following up on its commitments but also correcting all those things which have been picked up? Allow me to illustrate, in particular, an important constitutional ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon MEC, my apology, sir. Hon Faber.

Mr W F FABER: Chairperson, I really would ask if it is possible for the hon member to answer one of my questions if there is a few

moments left after his speech, or you can even extend his time so that he can.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon Faber, please take your seat! Continue hon MEC.

Mr B KOMPELA (Free State): ... principle that oversight and accountability are, in fact, the fulfilment of commitments made to our people ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): My apology hon MEC, the other member is on his feet. What is the problem, hon Smit?

Mr C F B SMIT: Hon Chair, it is standard practice that, if a member stands on a point of order like I am doing, the member at the podium sits down unless there is a special arrangement Thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon Smit, the hon member did not stand on a point of order. Please continue, hon MEC.

Mr B KOMPELA (Free State): ... by referring to a specific focus area of Taking Parliament to the People, in this case the work that was undertaken by the Buffalo City Metropolitan Municipality with specific focus on health issues raised during the programme in November 2016.

During the period 18 to 21 October 2016, the NCOP undertook a pre-visit to the Alfred Nzo Municipality and within two weeks followed up, from 14 to 18 November 2016, with the 2016 Taking Parliament and Legislature to the People programme. It was important that this should happen so that the NCOP should have an integrated approach of all the accounting levels including the local Salga as an important integral part of this institution in order that at least all these matters could be listened to.

With specific reference to health issues, for example, key issues emerged, illustrating why we say the state must be responsive. Indeed, Taking Parliament to the People, as a principle and practice, recognises the role of not only provincial legislatures as important role-players, but how our communities must direct organs of state on issues affecting them and which are very important.

Therefore, it is important that, in joining hands with the provincial legislatures and Salga, the NCOP recognises that provinces have more intimate information on their environments and Salga is also like that because local government is at the coalface of things that are happening in municipalities. Certain issues can be resolved literally on the spot on that day when all of us have gone there jointly.

Clearly, Taking Parliament to the People is a democratic practice that involves all role-players and stakeholders including the

communities themselves. The key issues that emerged therefore ranged from education, water and sanitation, unemployment, health and so on. Many things that arose there were quadruple of burden of diseases. That was the main thing in that area which has to be focused on, and we are happy that the province is beginning to be equal to the task.

The shortage of clinics was one of the things that were raised, particularly in newly emerged communities or those that have experienced growth. The township has a rapid growth and therefore clinics are unable to carry the load. A clinic in Noncedo in Ward 20 was no longer big enough to carry huge load. There is a need for more clinics in Masingatha, Tolofiyeni and Mdingi in Ward 37.

Ward 27 would also need a bigger clinic because there is a rapid expansion of a settlement. All these are challenges that are not man-made but challenges of the patterns which are emerging throughout any other economy which is struggling, where people would look for better or greener pastures. Therefore, such a place which has been identified would always carry a burden of a number of people who like to come to greener pastures. However, on the contrary, that might not be greener pastures.

Already, as early as November 2016, soon after the visit but not necessarily as a result of that visit only, the hon MEC for Health and all other MECs in the Eastern Cape had their hands dirty, and

are at work. When this hon Parliament goes back there, at least there should be a different scenario and impression that you'll get. Thank you very much. [Applause.]

Mr S G MTHIMUNYE: House Chairperson, with due respect, can I please have two minutes to address you on a point of privilege, please?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon Mthimunye, I am not going to give you that time, please take your seat.

Mr L B GAEHLER: House Chairperson, you started this debate on a high note and let's hope you can end it on the same note.

The UDM notes and welcomes the commitment by the Premier of the Eastern Cape in his state of the province address in relation to the creation of better access to quality education as an apex priority of the province. In this regard, we make the following innovation as part of the solution:

Equip the school principals with skills and knowledge to lead and change and mobilise the communities around their school; provide practical hands-on support to principals as they embark on a change journey at their schools; share what works with and engage leaders to replicate proven intervention; partner school principals with local brewed business leaders with skills and knowledge.

The principals must work with community members to rediscover their capacity to lead and collaborate in this approach and must then produce the following outcome to the turnaround:

Principals that are capacitated with confidence and skills to lead; a school management team that works as an aligned and cohesive team; a motivated teacher team re-energised to teach with joy and engage parents and community members; learners to benefit from all the crucial improvements.

On a light note, the challenge of water in the Nelson Mandela Bay is a critical area for cooperation of all spheres of government. The Premier also spoke about education that it is also a priority project. The challenge of health cannot be resolved where water is not available. This means that efforts to ensure better management of available water supply.

House Chairperson, this is my province I am talking about. You cannot divide or take the challenge of roads in the Eastern Cape. Teachers in Eastern Cape travel for 160km daily to get to their schools which mean 320km a day on those bad roads. So, if you want to address the issue of education you have to address the issue of roads. It is very important, our roads are a mess and teachers have to travel on these bad roads.

Secondly, Eastern Cape has inherited a backlog of infrastructure. Our schools are bad; we have to accept that this is the truth of the matter - that is what we say always. The national government must plough more money in infrastructure. We need to plough more money into infrastructure.

Lastly, just a few points ...

Mphathiswa kwiphondo [MEC], into yabantwana abangakwazi ukungena ezikolweni kuba bengenazazisi ifuna ukuqwalaselwa. [MEC, I suggest that we seriously consider the challenges children face who are not accepted at schools because they don't have ID documents.]

Yes, we have to verify their identity but at least register them at school because those poor kids are losing.

Lastly, today we are talking of the year of O R Tambo. You speak about him but what is happening at the O R Tambo Technical School ... the quality - there are no equipment; there is nothing. How can you? Oliver Reginald Tambo was a leader of South Africans not of the ANC, make no mistake. But not only that, MEC, all technical schools in the Eastern Cape are in a mess.

Wena, musa ukushawutisa maan, awazinto wena. [Kwahlekwa] [You, don't shout, you don't know anything. [Laughter.]]

All technical schools in the Eastern Cape are a mess. So, we need to invest in our technical schools because those kids need to get out there and learn. We went to O R Tambo Technical School and there is nothing happening; there are no roads, there are no equipments - there is nothing. Those are the things that need to be addressed in the Eastern Cape. Do not politicise this debate, it does not need politicising or the Western Cape and so on, we are all South Africans. So, that needs to be addressed. Thank you.

Mr E MAKUE: Hon Chairperson, hon Thandi Modise, the Chairperson of the NCOP, the ANC is unequivocally committed to changing the lives of our people and deliver quality services. We in the ANC know very well that this commitment requires dedication, analysis, determination and strategic actions.

Fortunately, we have been taught by Mr Nelson Mandela that: "If every racist statute were to be repealed tomorrow, leaving the economic status quo undisturbed, white domination in its most essential aspects would remain." This is what we observed during Taking Parliament to the People in the Eastern Cape. The ANC and this democratic government are accordingly now concentrating on radical economic transformation.

We have been successful in our role of making the NCOP a forum where ordinary people can make their voices heard. MEC Makupula welcomed the report of Taking Parliament to the People, as an indication of

how we, as this House, have succeeded in serving the provinces that we are representing. From the report of this august activity, it is abundantly clear that the legacies of two homeland governments, Transkei and Ciskei, and its apartheid masters caused immeasurable injustices, resulting in the present unemployment, inequality and poverty, prevalent in the Eastern Cape province. We have had hon Gaehler, as a member from the opposition party, sharing with us the inheritance of the Eastern Cape province.

It is painful to observe how access to social services like education, housing and health continue to impoverish, plague and disadvantage scores of Eastern Cape residents.

On the other hand, we were humbled by the tremendous interventions initiated since 1994. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon Mokwele, please don't drown the speaker. [Interjections.] Hon Mokwele, hon Mokwele! Hon Mokwele, please.

Mr E MAKUE: We were humbled by the tremendous interventions initiated since 1994. Due to the severity of the challenges, there remains a lot to be done. We will be the first to say that. We know and hon Faber should know as well that freedom is not free. We have to pay a price for that.

It is this Parliament, led by the ANC that decided to annually visit several communities as part of Taking Parliament to the People. For hon Faber, that was most probably the first time that he visited the Eastern Cape. We commend our leaders for facilitating such an enriching experience, both for us, but more importantly, for the people in the Eastern Cape that we are serving.

By Taking Parliament to the People, we have raised hope. We have listened and we have learned. This government will act in the best interests of our people, particularly the historically disadvantaged people. The MEC for Education in the province has indicated that to us. We should marvel at the fact that we have had a representative from the DA in the Western Cape offering to co-operate, as well as the MEC in the Free State.

Mr W F FABER: Hon Chairperson, will the member take a question? I would really like to ask him a question.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon member, are you ready to take his question?

Mr E MAKUE: Hon Chair, I will gladly take his question if he comes to me when the camera is not on him, after the session.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): He is not ready. Please, take your seat, hon member.

Mr W F FABER: Chairperson, can they take the camera off me. I will please ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon member, please take your seat. Hon Faber, please take your seat.

Mr E MAKUE: Most of the people that we engaged and consulted received us warmly. They welcomed our consultations and openly shared those matters that need redress. Wherever they could, people proudly shared their achievements resulting from the opportunities created by the democratic government. Hon Ncitha, as a delegate from the Free State, emphasised the importance to reprioritise our limited resources.

Zwelakhe Senior Secondary School in the Ntabankulu Local Municipality is but one sterling example of what people's determination can yield. This rural school achieved an 87,4% pass rate for 2015.

Members of this House who were joined by our National Assembly counterparts during oversight in several and different communities, all reported on extraordinary achievements, but also on the staggering challenges.

Building on the Freedom Charter and particularly the ideal that the people shall govern, Taking Parliament to the People is a dedicated

effort where we use our time and resources in convening public meetings, so that we can hear what the people want from government. Ordinary people had the opportunity to take part in this people's Parliament.

St Thomas School for the Deaf in Woodlands is however a shocking example of the educational and training needs of differently abled children and children with special needs. While the school accommodates learners from Grade R to Grade 12, those learners who manage to pass Grade 12, in schools like these, are still underemployed and are still having difficulties with ensuring that they acquire the requisite skills so that they can contribute to the economy of this country. Such experiences require our drastic and urgent intervention.

Paulo Freire, in his publication on Pedagogy of the Oppressed, aptly reminds us that, and I quote:

While the problem of humanisation has always, from an axiological point of view, been humankind's central problem, it now takes on the character of an inescapable concern. But while both humanisation and dehumanisation are real alternatives, only the first is the people's vocation. This vocation is constantly negated, yet it is affirmed by that very negation. It is affirmed by the yearning of the oppressed for freedom and justice, and by their struggle to recover their lost humanity.

The people of the Eastern Cape are no different in their struggle to recover their lost humanity.

The Eastern Cape is known for historic and prestigious schools like Lovedale, Healdtown and the Holy Cross Anglican School. This is where the seeds of modern anticolonial struggles were germinated, alongside many other historic schools across the country.

For hon Maqwebu, who is not here, there are 92 755 Eastern Cape students who registered to write the 2016 Grade 12 exams. However, only 83 000 actually wrote them. It is sad that only 15 645 got a Bachelor level pass, which represent only 19% of students who have a chance of attending universities. We are saying this is not the South Africa we want. We want to enable those students to live better and to have a better chance in life. We will not like hon Magwebu call them the lost generation because they are our present leaders and our future leaders. Hon Ncitha indicated to us the government interventions that are presently being undertaken and that was further emphasised by the MEC of the Eastern Cape.

Why did this happen? It happened because we, as the NCOP, were prepared to move out of this confined space and join our government leaders in that part of the country, to show our solidarity with them.

Former President of the ANC, Oliver Tambo, warned us to be wary of the of wedge driver and to watch his poisonous tongue. He further commanded that the order of the day to all units of Umkhonto we Sizwe is that they must strengthen links with the people. While we are not using arms, we are using our legitimacy as this government in order to strengthen links with the people through Taking Parliament to the People.

Finally Oliver Tambo said and I quote:

I had other plans for my life. I wanted to be a Minister of the Anglican Church with Bishop Clayton. After we married, I was going to train for the ministry in Cape Town. But God had other plans for me. God's plan was for me to fight in the political liberation for my people.

That is the fight that the ANC continues to fight in humility. Thank you. [Applause.]

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Thank you, Chairperson, let me thank you, hon members, for the debate. Let me also express my disappointment at the politicizing of a very sensitive area in the lives and the future of this country. It always hurts when we bring politics into health, security, and into education; it is not about us. We are passed it. It is about the future of this country and

about us trying to speak the truth so that we can identify what is on the ground so that we can find solutions.

So, for me, it is important for us to begin to say that the report as it stands works and in all represents the picture, hon Mathebula, of what we saw. It shows the good; and there were good and excellent schools in the Eastern Cape. It represents the bad that we saw; it represents simple issues of interrelational problems. It represents serious lack of infrastructure and we can go into it - the infrastructure.

For instance, if you have noticed - those of you who went to Matatiele - you should have noticed that the roads go up and up and that brings us back into the issue of concurrence of the powers in education between the province and the national. And that is the elephant in the house that after 20 years we need to go back to re-examine concurrence between the national government and the provincials on health, social development and on education; because sometimes you whip the wrong people.

It is also very true that when we pushed the Eastern Cape and we were very unkind in our group and we had representatives of the national government department. The administration which the Eastern Cape was put under, the withdrawal of the national department; but the remnants of the centralisation of issues still bogs down issues of education in the Eastern Cape. We are raising that, we are taking

it up, and we are also saying that even if we would take some issues which we think belong directly to the national department, the Eastern Cape must pull up their socks because those children must get a fair chance.

The South Africa that we talk about must have leadership. Now, the generic definition of leadership is that you are looking at a multifaceted process of identifying goals; of motivating people to act; of providing support; of ensuring that, that which was identified gets achieved - as leadership. It is not about the self. It is about processes and about collectives, about service, about giving and not about how I gain out of the system. It is about values and principles. Let us face it politicians, sometimes we need to put values, principles, integrity into that so that we can then push that agenda which does not belong to us but belongs to the children, to the future of this country, which is much more important than who has what colour.

So, I am saying that I am a little bit disappointed. We protect the Constitution and yet the Constitution is a negotiated process. It has the good and the bad. It must be something which for as long as we have got it becomes the umbrella and the protective layer into the future for our children. So I want to say that we need to develop leaders; we need to knit South African society together. We need to forget blackness and whiteness. We need to work to where we can erase the rural and the urban.

We need to create a South Africa which has common standards which we are all fighting to attain so that nobody remembers their colour more than they remember their own dreams. That is the role of education and that is what some of us would stand up for. This politicking is sometime just embarrassing us as a country. It is also true that in this politicking; we must also be at one with dealing with corruption; does it exist, can we identify it; deal with it and don't postpone it. Because some of the issues if we follow them, why were infrastructures not built, what happened to the money that was allocated for it? We need to follow the runs and that is our job as the public representatives. [Applause.]

So, sometimes if we can get together and say oversight is what unites us in the House. Then we can start getting things right which we need to get right. Perhaps, we can then get back to getting the integrity of Parliament where it should be and that should be that we are public representatives and we are focusing on the people who sent us here.

Chairperson, I would beg that the report be adopted because it does represent and I would also just reiterate my gratitude to the different provinces that are here today, but that were also in the pre-visits and in the final taking Parliament to the people. I was very proud to see that it did not matter where the members came from. They asked the questions and they were not saying that I come from this party and therefore I will not - we did.

I will also say, again, it was a new exercise, a departure from the normal way of taking Parliament to the people but the fact that we were in a friction sometimes having to give way as the NCOP to the programme of the legislature legitimately, and sometimes asking the legislature to put their programme abeyance to join us in ours and it worked. We are grateful; and let us now work on making sure that Ntate Makupula follows through with some of the things that he has said are outstanding here. But also help him with the Minister at national level to open up; and ensure that those things does happen, especially on the money for infrastructure development; especially on fixing policy when it comes to children with special needs. The facilities are just not it - it just doesn't.

Now, you cannot get into a situation where black people will run away from the Eastern Cape because the kids have autism and there are no schools specialising on that - the kids have special needs which schools - they tried! In one school in which we were with hon Mpanbo-Sibukwana we were so impressed. The teachers knew exactly what needed to be happening. It was just not there. So, do you whip the teachers when they know; but they don't have the wear-with-all?

So, I want to say that our report will always strive to reflect what needs to be done and we will follow through. By the time we go back to the Eastern Cape at the end of 2017, we will have made sure that we have hounded, we have screamed, we have pounded the doors of the

executive to ensure that the future of our children gets better and better. Ke a leboga, Mme. [Thank you, Madam.] [Applause.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Ke a leboga, motswadi.

[Thank you, our parent.] Thank you very much. Order, hon members! We really want to thank our mother for telling all of us, including you, hon Khawula. You were included, hon Khawula, when mama was talking to all of us. I want to respond because you kept on saying, "Tell them Ma!" and you were excluding yourself there. So, mama was telling all of us. [Laughter.] Okay, hon Khawula.

Mr M KHAWULA: Chairperson, on a point of order, the Chair is out of order right now. [Laughter.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): That concludes the debate. I shall now put the question. The question is that the Report be agreed to.

VOTING

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): KwaZulu-Natal?

Mr L P M NZIMANDE: Chairperson, yap! On my personal note, then to the powers that be, this NCOP excluded me from this programme I raised the question of the brail, I raise it again and we can't be hypocritical about our commitment to the disabled people when I am

sitting hear and I can't even get a brail programme. This is about the fact that I raised a point, and I was ignored and I did not attend this programme.

However, on behalf of KwaZulu-Natal, we support the Report because it is important for the people whom we serve and represent. Thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon Faber and hon Thandi Sibukwana, please take your seats!

Mr W F FABER: Chairperson, just on a point of order ...

[Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Okay, hon Faber, both of you are standing. Hon Thandi, please take your seat. What is the point of order?

Mr W F FABER: Chairperson, I am Sorry that I am speaking, but the delegation from the Northern Cape is sitting here. And there was no one in this delegation decided nor did we decide on anything, but if the hon member takes it on his own or maybe he can show me a written reply, we can maybe look at it. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon Faber, take your seat! Take your seat, hon Faber, and let me tell you that you are now totally out of order. Western Cape?

WESTERN CAPE: Supports.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Thank you. All heads of delegation have voted. Nine provinces have voted in favour.

Report accordingly adopted in accordance with section 65 of the Constitution.

The Council adjourned at 18:22.

ANNOUNCEMENTS, TABLINGS AND COMMITTEE REPORTS

Please click on the following link to access the relevant Announcements, Tablings and Committee Reports for this day.

[https://www.parliament.gov.za/parliamentary-papers?sorts\[date\]=-1](https://www.parliament.gov.za/parliamentary-papers?sorts[date]=-1)