# WEDNESDAY, 18 MAY 2016

***PROCEEDINGS OF EXTENDED PUBLIC COMMITTEE – NATIONAL ASSEMBLY CHAMBER***

Members of the Extended Public Committee met in the National Assembly Chamber at 10:01.

House Chairperson, Mr C T Frolick, took the Chair and requested members to observe a moment of silence for prayers or meditation.

**ANNOUNCEMENTS, TABLINGS AND COMMITTEE REPORTS** – see col 000.

# SUSPENSION OF RULE 253(1)

(Draft Resolution)

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: House Chairperson, I move:

That the House suspends Rule 253(1), which provides inter alia that the debate on the Second Reading of a Bill may not

commence before at least three working days have elapsed since the committee‘s report was tabled, for the purposes of conducting the Second Reading debate on the Appropriation Bill.

Agreed to.

# CONSIDERATION OF SECOND REPORT OF JOINT COMMITTEE ON ETHICS AND MEMBERS INTERESTS

There was no debate.

The Chief Whip of the Majority Party moved: That the House refer the Second Report back to the Joint Committee on Ethics and Members Interests for further consideration and report.

Motion agreed to.

Second Report referred back to the Joint Committee on Ethics and Members Interest.

# CONSIDERATION OF REPORT OF STANDING COMMITTEE ON FINANCE - FINANCIAL INTELLIGENCE CENTRE AMENDMENT BILL

There was no debate.

The Chief Whip of the Majority Party moved: That the Report be adopted.

Motion agreed to.

Report accordingly adopted.

# FINANCIAL INTELLIGENCE CENTRE AMENDMENT BILL

(Second Reading debate)

Mr Y I CARRIM: The Chair, comrades and colleagues. At least you have a more attractive person to deal with now than Dr Makhosi Khoza, if that‘s of any relief.

Basically, I was hoping to respond at the end of this debate after having heard what others have said. But as it happens, I have to speak now and ... what is unparliamentary? [Interjection.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon Carrim, would you just continue. Hon members, we are busy with the debate, can we continue please.

Mr Y I CARRIM: This Bill, as Makhosi Khoza and Thandi Tobias Pokola will explain, deals with strengthening our combating of financial crime and terrorist financing. It deals with ensuring that those who are involved in human trafficking or drug trafficking are dealt with far more actively and far more stringently in terms of the law than has been the case until now.

The government has committed itself from 2009 onwards, to deal with this issue through the Financial Action Task Force which interestingly the former member of this House and former Minister, Kader Asmal, chaired in 2005 and 2006.

We have, through our engagement in the United Nations Anti- Corruption Convention also committed ourselves to attending to these matters.

When we passed the Financial Intelligence Centre Act, the original Act in 2001, we were quiet advanced but as it happened,

we hadn‘t anticipated the full implications of 9/11 and how we would have to combat more actively terrorism financing.

To fully understand the extend to which our country may be used for the financing of drug trafficking and human trafficking. And so it is that when the evaluation is done by the Financial Action Task Force of the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development, OECD, in 2009, they found that South Africa was lagging behind in the international standards and requirements in terms of legislation.

As you know, our financial system is very globalised now and whatever we do in our country is also substantially influenced by the global financial system. For example, banks that are based in South Africa also have connections with banks in the UK, if you take the example of Standard Bank and Barclays Bank‘s involvement in Absa, the regulators in those countries act very, very harshly on the banks in South Africa that do not abide by the international norms.

If we do not implement what seeking to achieve through this Bill, it also affects trade and investment; and certain countries and businesses in those countries are reluctant to engage with countries that have not met these minimum standards.

When we got the Bill before us we had extensive public hearings and amongst the issues that were raised in the public hearings were the following:

Firstly, the various stakeholders claim that National Treasury did not consult adequately with them;

Secondly, that there‘s a need for a National Risk Assessment;

Thirdly, they said the Bill was too prescriptive and defeated the risk-based approach it sought to introduce;

Fourthly, the requirements for ongoing due diligence were onerous especially with single transactions or prospective clients who may well decide not to continue with the business relationship with an institution. There should be a transaction exemption amount for a single transaction;

Fifth, the definition of a politically exposed person in the Bill in wider than the international standards requires and includes a prominent person in the private sector. This will be difficult to implement without a list of prominent persons in the private sector who undertake business with government;

Sixth, the Bill has a one size fits all approach that doesn‘t take into account the wide differences in this code, nature, services and structure of the different sections of the financial sector;

Seventh, the definition of client may result in unintended consequences in some sectors such as the Attorneys profession in the Casino industry;

Eighth, a number of the updated Financial Action Task Force‘s standards and recommendations underpinning the Bill are relatively new and it‘s not clear how they will be implemented;

Ninth, sufficient account of the costs and complexities of implementing some of the provisions were not taken into consideration;

Tenth, there should be a provision in the Bill that provides for a consultative process with the public and industry especially with regard to exemptions, directors and regulations.

Our responses legislated, firstly, we recognise that there‘s an urgent need to combat financial crime, terrorism financing and

other related crimes more effectively. And the aims of the Bill were fully supported.

It is recognised that it will be difficult to implement such a comprehensive Bill overnight, Minister. And there‘s a need to take account of the diversity of the financial sector.

The committee proposed that these challenges be dealt with through phasing an aspect of the Bill providing for exemptions of the sectors of the industry and ensuring more effective regulations, directives and guidance notes.

The Minister and Directors of [Financial Intelligence Centre Act](https://www.google.com/url?sa=t&rct=j&q&esrc=s&source=web&cd=8&cad=rja&uact=8&ved=0ahUKEwjh8aX30u_MAhWgF8AKHU3PBLkQFghRMAc&url=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.fic.gov.za%2F&usg=AFQjCNFAzp2tGQETQzsT2VPO_02AzrcgaA&sig2=4fwN4tjWRscfRGRsjW0zrg), FICA, will facilitate the amendments to the Bill. Amendments will also provide for regular consultations with relevant stakeholders on these issues.

Some flexibility was introduced on certain provisions along the lines of comply or explain why you can‘t principle.

The committee accepted the difficulties National Treasury presented in finalising a National Risk Assessment and agrees that this should not be done before the adoption of the Bill.

And that the institutions‘ specific risk base frameworks can address the key relevant issues.

However, the committee believes that National Treasury, together with other relevant government departments, should seek to finalise the National Risk Assessment within a reasonable time frame.

The definition of prospective client was removed from the Bill and left to institutions to determine in their risk management and compliance programmes, when a person becomes a prospective client.

Due diligence measures for identifying the beneficial owner of legal persons were also made less onerous by clearly providing for incremental cascading steps.

The Minister will, by regulation, decide a threshold on a single transaction below which there will be a less onerous due diligence on the client and no ongoing due diligence.

The Minister of Finance will delay the effective date of those provisions relating to the private sector prominent influential persons until government makes such a list available. However,

the current unavailability of such a list should not deter institutions from undertaking their own risk profile of their clients and undertaking their own due diligence.

National Treasury agreed that the compliance costs will be continually assessed and monitored with the industry.

Parliament will receive a report on the implementation of this Bill at least once a year.

The committee acknowledges that a large number of investigative authorities which could have access to information and the position of the Financial Intelligence Centre, therefore raising a question of possible abuse if some of these institutions are highly politicised.

The centre is urged to share this information that it has in a responsible manner with the strictest conformity of the law. [Applause.]

While the fight against financial crime must be intensified, it is important not to abuse people‘s right to privacy.

We want to say that this Bill is especially important, all of us are committed to combating crime and terrorism financing, and we hope that all parties in this House will support this Bill. It‘s long overdue, it‘s highly necessary, it‘s crucially important to our struggle and combat against crime, and we look forward to this House fully supporting this Bill. Thank you.

Mr D J MAYNIER: Thank you, Chairperson. I wish to extend a welcome to my hon colleague who has just arrived in the House. Nine minutes it seems too late. I think this is called an FTP in sport, a Failure To Pitch.

The Financial Intelligence Centre is responsible for investigating money laundering in South Africa. And the Financial Intelligence Centre Amendment Bill will enhance the fight against money laundering in South Africa.

Which brings us back to a question that has remained unanswered for too long, is the Financial Intelligence Centre investigating the allegations surrounding the Guptas?

The question is more urgent now than it was two weeks ago, because reports suggesting the Guptas may have purchased a R445 million mansion in Dubai have reinforced concerns that the

Guptas may have illegally moved assets, including large amounts of cash, out of South Africa.

I wrote to the Director of the Financial Intelligence Centre, Murray Michell, on 15 April 2016 requesting him to investigate the allegations surrounding the Guptas. At that time, there was a grave concern that the Guptas had left South Africa and that their money had illegally followed them, or was about to illegally follow them out of South Africa.

To have sat back and done nothing would have amounted to allowing the accused to flee the crime scene, with the proceeds of the crime.

Replying to my request for the investigation, the Director said:

―The matter you have raised will be considered in terms of the powers and responsibilities of the Financial Intelligence Centre.‖

The reply was evidently designed to obfuscate rather than illuminate.

I have now written back to the Director requesting him to confirm that an investigation has been launched into allegations surrounding the Guptas.

I cannot understand why the Financial Intelligence Centre is undermining public trust in itself by remaining silent on this matter.

I have put the question to the Minister once and I‘m going to put the question to the Minister again: will the Minister tell us whether - following my request for an investigation on 15 April 2016 - the Financial Intelligence Centre will be investigating allegations that the Guptas illegally removed assets, including large amounts of cash from South Africa?

A simple yes or no will stop the bleeding and stop the zigzagging and obfuscation surrounding the Financial Intelligence Centre and my request for an investigation into allegations surrounding the Guptas. A simple yes or no Minister, will suffice. Thank you.

Mr J A ESTERHUIZEN: Hon Chairperson, I deliver this debate on behalf of the IFP member of this portfolio, hon S J Nkomo. This Bill serves to enable and protect the integrity of South

Africa‘s financial systems. As a country South Africa has a long standing commitment to combat illicit financial activities and improve and strengthen the security of such illegal activities.

Financial institutions must also, in this process, be assisted to explore more innovative ways of offering financial services to a broader range of customers that could bring previously excluded sectors of society into the system or rather the formal economy. This Bill demonstrates South Africa‘s commitment to improve our systems of combating money laundering and the financing of illegal operations and aims to report as such to the financial action task force next month as failure can be risky to our financial stability or at worst lead to isolation and exclusion from the global financial system.

If this Bill is enacted into law will further enhance this country‘s ability to combat financial crimes as well as strengthening and further stabilise our financial systems. The 2015 amendment provides financial institutions with the flexibility to decide how they will verify their clients‘ identity as not all circumstances all clients can be treated as the same. So, it will simplify the existing rules by system on financial compliance.

Banks on the other hand, find the provision in the Financial Intelligence Centre Act, Fica Bill which requires the banks to give special scrutiny to politically influential individuals as a cause of concern as it still unclear how this will be implemented. In this respect, the financial intelligent centre should provide guidance to all accountable institutions and not only banks.

Sanctions have to be proportional to the seriousness, size and nature of the firm as the administrative sanctions now incorporated into the Amendment Bill can be imposed for as an act of non-compliance and the consequences thereof may be of such a nature that the client or firm may not be able to continue to operate.

The IFP is of the opinion that the proposed legislation is in the best interest of South Africa and support the Bill as such. I thank you.

Mr N L S KWANKWA: Hon House Chair and hon members, the UDM supports the Bill. We agree entirely with hon David Maynier that we cannot be talking about trying to fight money laundering and tightening our laws but we turn a blind eye to the reports and

allegations that are in the media about the Guptas having shipped money out of the country.

Siza kuba nengxaki. Yinyaniso emsulwa leyo okanye siyayiba sonke nathi imali siphume singenziwa nto? [We will have a problem. Is that the truth or we all steal money and not get charged for that?]

It is the same way that we have people who accuse people of violating the Constitution and fire them having violated it themselves but remain in their positions. I think we should commend you here Chairperson for the role that you played in ensuring that the Treasury is deep in consultation in that all stakeholders were brought on board in all the various amendments that needed to be made to this Bill.

Kodwa ke ngoku sinexhala lokuba ngeli thuba lizayo lolonyulo,

... [But we are worried because during the time of the coming elections, ...]

... I think there is a point that was made, in particular by the Chairperson, more towards the end of his contribution that for instance, ...

... kuza kufuneka ukuba siqiniseke ukuba, ... [... we need to ensure that, ...]

... this centre which will have access to people‘s confidential information ...

... ufumanise ukuba iza kusetyenziswa ngoku ngendlela apha engahlambulukanga yezopolitiko. Kufuneka ke sibe siyayikhusela loo nto ... [you will find out that it will be used in a bad political manner. We need to protect that ...]

... over and above ...

... ukuzama ukuqinisa amaqhele okulwa urhwaphilizo namaqhele okulwa ... [... on trying to tighten the screws of fighting ...]

... money laundering and corruption. Indeed, we support it and say that most importantly, also the banks are motivated to have their innovative ways of helping in this fight against money laundering. I know, for instance, that sometimes it is a tick- box approach as an exbanker, especially in the financial service in the streets. Just a tick-box approach but sometimes there is no vigilance about what happens and what transactions to flag and so on and so forth. I think banks have an important role to

play as key stakeholders in ensuring that we are able to make sure that all the people who launder money are brought to book. I thank you ever so much.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Thank you hon speaker, before I call the next speaker, may I just to ask the members to keep the noise levels in the House down please. It is very difficult to follow what the speakers are saying if we continue with these loud private discussions. If it is so important, leave the House and conduct it outside please.

I also wish to welcome back into the House the leader of the NFP and the Deputy Minister for Science and Technology after an absence, welcome back. [Applause.] The next speaker is the hon Shaik-Emam.

Mr A M SHAIK-EMAM: Hon Chairperson, hon Ministers present and hon members of this House, the NFP welcomes and supports the Financial Intelligence Centre Amendment Bill tabled here today. The Bill is primarily aimed at establishing a stronger regulatory framework to combat money laundering and financing of terrorism which we believe will align South African legislation with international best practises. In addition, the Bill will also aim to extend the objectives of the financial intelligence

centre to meet out financial sanctions and to strengthen institutions that are accountable by adopting a risk-based approach to money laundering and financing terrorism.

The NFP is particularly pleased by the inclusion of the terms and descriptions of beneficial ownership and prominent persons we believe that these two provisions will assists institutions that are accountable to improve the responsibility to ensure customer due diligence measures. Effective measures to combat money laundering in South Africa are a necessity. No society can tolerate the situation where criminals hide or disguise the proceeds of their crime so that they appear to have originated from a legitimate source and then use such property which is the benefit received from their crime without suspicion or detection.

Moreover, no society can allow its financial institutions to channel money to fund terror on civilians regardless of where such terror is unleashed or for whatever cause. As a country, we have a moral duty based on our respect for human rights not to aid and abet the funding of terror. The Bill tabled here today aims to strengthen our institutions to combat this international scourge of funding terrorism.

Whilst the amendments tabled in the Bill are welcome, the NFP is somewhat concerned that no attention has been given to the regulation of mobile money in the Bill. Mobile money is currently experiencing a revival in South Africa such as for example, the recent re-launch of Mpesa and eWallet which is now firmly established.

The recent development in mobile money can be attributed, at least in part, to the increasing market penetration level of mobile connections in South Africa and with the expected growth in this sector; the potential for money laundering grows exponentially. Our concern is that insufficient provision has been made to extend the regulatory framework to this emerging arena of money exchange, particularly so since it can circumvent legislation dealing with account holders as recipients of mobile money need not be bank account holders at all.

In conclusion, despite the limitation which we have touched upon, the NFP welcomes the amendments contained in this Bill. We accept that legislation to combat money laundering and financing of terror will need constant adjustments and juggle and we will support all legislative efforts that will take the fight to the criminals and terrorists in this regard. We support this Bill, thank you.

Ms T V TOBIAS: Hon Chairperson and hon members, good morning. Let me take this opportunity to dedicate my speech to the women and men all over the world who had to leave their homes to go find peace and better life in foreign countries. Above all though, I dedicate it to the people of Sudan who still undergo challenges and wish our Deputy Preside, hon Cyril Ramaphosa, well in his endeavours to resolve the impasse.

Also allow me to refer to the African proverb when it says, ―If you want to run fast, do it alone; but if you want to go far, do it together.― I am referring to this African proverb having observed the semantics of a blame game that has been taking place in this honourable Chamber. Least we forget, we should share a common destiny as humanity to be able to achieve a better life.

Therefore, I am making a plea to our hon members to maintain our strategic objective of building a nonracial, nonsexist, prosperous and united South Africa because if we are united, Africa will indeed prosper. Hon members, I don‘t understand the sudden obsession by hon David Maynier on the Guptas as this legislation that is suggested by the ANC is comprehensive.

In addressing the conduct of important influential persons, guess what, I didn‘t even imagine that today hon David Maynier will participate on the debate as he said nothing – totally nothing – in our meeting. [Interjections.] [Applause.]

So, it is given - polemics, semantics, gallery, everything - because there is camera. That‘s okay, but I can‘t be diverted form the content issues. I can‘t respond to allegations because we know hon Kwankwa that if there is evidence beyond reasonable doubt about any influential important persons in society, we need to approach the courts. This accountability, today, is brought by the ANC. No one else has ever suggested reforms. So, don‘t be misled by information peddlers.

Today, we are debating the Financial Intelligence Centre Amendment Bill of 2015 – a piece of legislation that will reach out to ‗the Untouchables‘ or ‗the Al Capones‘ of the world. Let me make it clear from the onset: The object of the Bill is not to conduct criminal investigation as that is done by the criminal justice system. It is intended to measure compliance

... I need to repeat this: It is intended to measure compliance by our financial institutions, meaning banks.

Lots of criminal activities have been taking place all over the world. Acts such as money laundering, terrorism financing, proliferation of weapons of mass destruction, illicit activities and the list goes on. South Africa, as the member of the Financial Action Task Force, known as FATF in short, is one of the founding members of this important task force to deal with money laundering.

This is an independent intergovernmental body all over the world and it has committed itself to fight the above listed economic challenges that I mentioned. It will do so by strengthening compliance and helping financial institutions in observing due diligence when dealing with clients‘ day-to-day transactions.

Ka bokgutshwanyane, ke tla hlalosa hore Molaokakanyo ona o tafoleng ya Ntlo ena o etsetswa ho thusa dibanka tsa Afrika Borwa ho lwantsha bobodu, bosenyi le boferekanyi. Ha motho a tsetela tjhelete ya hae bankeng - haeba tjhelete eo e amana le bobodu kapa bona boferekanyi - banka e tshwanetse ho ela hloko le ho tlaleha eo ho Financial Intelligence Centre, ebe yona e fetisetsa taba e jwalo sepoleseng.

Ha ho sa hlola ho ba le tjhelete e kenang kapa e tswang ka bokunyata mona naheng ya Afrika Borwa. Maqitolo a tla lahlelwa ntlwana-tshwana! *(Translation of Sesotho paragraphs follows.)*

[In short, the Bill that is being tabled in this House is tabled in order to assist the South African banks in fighting corruption, crime and terrorism. When a person invests their money at the bank – if that money is linked with corruption or terrorism – the bank is supposed to notice and report that particular person to the Financial Intelligence Centre, they will then pass that matter to the police.

There will no longer be any money which illegally enters or exit this country of South Africa. Criminals will be thrown into prison!]

One other important aspect of this piece of legislation is definitions. For example, influential persons of the likes of Presidents, Ministers, leaders of political parties and all other important prominent individuals and their relationships with current and ex-spouses will be included in the scope of information and definitions needed. This will be done taking into account our own domestic environment. I repeat: Taking into account our own domestic environment.

Ha ke tea mohlala, ha ho sa hlola ho ba le batho ba tsetelang tjhelete mafatsheng a mang. Ka hoo, ke bolela hore: Ba ka se hlole ba pata tjhelete naheng e nngwe, ba e tlosa mafatsheng a bona ba sebedisa mabitso a fosahetseng kapa hona ho fetisa tjhelete e ntshetsang ntwa le boferekanyi.

Re a tseba ho na le batho ba bulang mabenkele mona Afrika Borwa; e re ha ba se ba entse tjhelete, eba ba sebedisa tjhelete eo ho reka dibetsa tsa ntwa. Ha nke re bua ka bona mona! [Mahofi.] Ke nnywe nnywe nnywe Guptas mehla ena! Ho na le batho ba teng mona ba iketsang ekare ke borakgwebo potlana; kanthe ba tlo reka dibetsa, ba itokisetsa ntwa. Ha re bueng ka batho ba jwalo!

Hape ho na le batho ba tshwereng ditulo tsa bohlokwa setjhabeng, jwaloka dipresidente, marena le boradipolotiki ba hlokang ho hlaloswa tokomaneng. Ba hlalositswe. Ha ke tsebe hore ntate enwa o bua ka eng ya ditlhaloso. Hoo ha ho bolele hore hothwe ke babelaellwa. Ke kopa ho hlalosa ka Sesotho: Hona ha ho bolele hore ke babelaellwa, Motlatsa Mopresidente. Ha o le rakgwebo jwaloka wena; ha o mmelaellwa. Molao o ka se o belaele ntle le lebaka. [Mahofi.] Ntho ena eo ba batlang hore re e etse kajeno, re kekebe ra e etsa! *(Translation of Sesotho paragraphs follows.)*

[To make an example, there will no longer be people who invest money in other countries. Therefore, what I mean is that they will no longer hide money in another country by removing it from their countries using false names, or send money which is used for war and terrorism.

We know there are people who open shops here in South Africa, and once they have made money, they use that money to buy weapons for war. We hardly talk about them here! [Applause.] All we hear is Guptas this and Gupta that all the time! There are people here who pretend to be emerging entrepreneurs, only to find that they are here to buy weapons, they are preparing for war. Let us talk about such people!

There are also people who play an important role within the community, such as the presidents, chiefs and the politicians who need to be defined in the document. They were defined. I don‘t know what this hon member is talking about with regard to definitions. That doesn‘t imply that they are suspects. Let me explain this thoroughly. This doesn‘t imply that they are suspects, Deputy President. When you are an entrepreneur like yourself, you‘re not a suspect. The law wouldn‘t suspect you without reason. [Applause.] This thing that they want us to do today, we will never do it!]

Above all this, the legislation will address the constitutional gaps found by the Constitutional Court in 2014. That is what they forget. We are addressing the gaps that were found in relation to search warrants. We are not reinventing the Bill.

This happened in the past, where certain government institutions would conduct search warrants without getting authorisation from the courts. So, this gives precedence of having to conduct your business in a respectable manner with integrity.

You can‘t just act ...

... jwaloka mapolesa a apartheid a neng a raha monyako, a kena fela ka tlung ya motho, a setjha a sa botsa le ho botsa. Kajeno a tlameha ho setjha ka semolao. Modulasetulo ya hlomphehang, ha re ntse re sekasekana le Molawana ona, ke ile ka kgahlwa ke diphehiso tse entsweng ke setho sa setjhaba se bitswang Mme Ntombizonke Nyamane.

Mme Nyamane ke e mong wa ditho tsa setjhaba ya latellang dipuisano tse nkang sebaka komiting ya rona ya tsa ditjhelete ka leihlo le ntjhotjho. O tlile kopanong ya rona ya maikutlo a setjhaba [public hearing] a ipatalletse sefofane, ebile a ipatalletse madulo ho tloha ho la Gauteng. *(Translation of Sesotho paragraphs follows.)*

[... like the apartheid police who used to kick a door, just enter someone‘s house,and conduct a search without permission. Today, they have to search legally. Honourable Chairperson, while we were busy with this Bill, I was impressed by the submissions made by one of the community members, Ms Ntombizonke Nyamane.

Ms Nyamane is one community member who meticulously follows hearings which take place in our finance committee. She attended our public hearing by paying for her own plane ticket, and she even paid for her own accommodation, coming from Gauteng.]

Mme Nyamane strongly felt that South Africa should align its laws to international standards. Furthermore, she believes that members of FATF need to have access to information taught in South Africa for probing of prominent influential persons.

Ho bolelang hore mokgatlo wa FATF o tla kena o shebe batho ba Afrika Borwa mona, ke ka hoo ... [Which means that the FATF will join in by investigating people in South Africa, thus...]

... we will be dealing with the Panama Papers. It is also important to note concerns raised by stakeholders in the

financial sector. For example, having listened to the Casino ... [Time expired.] I thank you. [Applause.]

Mr R A LEES: Hon Chair, despite the somewhat over the top remarks about my colleague, David Maynier, it is indeed happy to see hon Thandi back with us today. We were concerned about your health yesterday, but it‘s good to see you with us.

With regard to the question of the Guptas: If it is indeed something that is concerning to the hon Maynier, then it is something that strangely even concerns the hon Mthembu, the Chief Whip of the Majority, because I see on Facebook, he has made a few comments about the Guptas as well.

So, I don‘t think it is something that is peculiar to our colleague, hon Maynier. In fact, I raised the question about the Guptas yesterday in the committee. So, I think it is something that is fairly serious and the country as a whole is looking at.

Corruption in South Africa is endemic and it makes for very fertile ground for money laundering and for financial terrorism. The Financial Intelligence Centre, the Fic, needs to play a role with suspicious transactions. These can only be dealt with if they are reported to it and if the person involved in these

transactions can be identified. This leads to the very painful experience all of us - most of us being complete innocent of corruption - have to go through to be financially analysed by the Fic with banks and others.

South Africa is and has to be a part of the global economy and thus be able to trade internationally. To do this, international requirements for fighting corruption and financial crime in particular must be complied with. These include amongst others, the United Nations‘ Security Council resolutions on freezing of assets. One of the international requirements is an increased surveillance of politically exposed persons, Peps.

However, the South African Bill refers to prominent inferential persons, Pips. I am not sure what ‗Pip‘ in the colloquial sense mean. It sound awfully like a guava pip or a notchy pip or something else, but it includes nonpoliticians and thus does not strictly comply with the international requirements. No matter who is included, this will mean that those who fall into this grouping would have to be super analysed by the Fic. Yet, there is not definitive way for accountable institutions such as banks to identify who is or who is not a Pip!

There can be doubt that all politicians are Pips and it is something that perhaps one or two of our Presiding Officers will rule unparliamentary. However, we are Pips and so it would make the chances of politicians being exposed when they get involved in corruption far more likely.

As always, the success of this Bill lies in its application by both the Fic as well as the police and justice agencies. Time will tell whether this will happen. As to date, the FIC has received nearly 300 000 reports of suspicious transactions and only very few have led to successful prosecutions.

One amendment that did not find favour in the committee was the scope of the Bill to be restricted to national department, in place of organs of state. The word, ‗organs of state,‘ has been retained, which means that even the Johannesburg Zoo is now included in the scope of the Bill. The Bill also deals with the Constitutional Court ruling that the warrantless searchers allowed by the Financial Information Centre Act were unconstitutional. This correction to the undermining of constitutional rights is a massive victory for South Africans.

Let no one say that there are no costs associated with legislation such as this one. The last of investment funds for

the creation of new wealth for economic growth and for job creation is enormous. The DA therefore supports the changes from a rules-based approach to one based on risk analysis. This change can - if the accountable institutions themselves are not completely risky obverse - result in less costly and less onerous thicker burden on the majority of innocent South Africans.

The Financial Intelligence Centre Act and this amendment suck resources into a bureaucracy ... [Time expired.] ... and administration that has massive cost to be paid. The bottom line is that the Fic plays an important role in converting endemic

... [Interjections.] ... kind of corruption that we face in South Africa today. [Applause.]

Dr M B KHOZA: Hon House Chair, allow me to emphasise that we need not be sensational when considering the importance of this Bill. South Africa under the ANC-led government has had to tighten its regulatory framework against the loss of over an estimated R15 trillion in the last 50 years and an estimated loss of over R750 billion annually in the African continent as a result of illicit financial outflows. These statistics, members, are conservative as they are obtained from the International Monetary Fund, IMF, Direction of Trade Statistics, DOTS, they

could be more. These figures exclude intangibles such as; proceeds of corruption, drug trafficking, people and arms trafficking, etc.

This May 2016 being the Africa Month, the cost of illicit outflows happens at the backdrop of the increasing number of Africans living in abject poverty. By 2010, the United Nations, UN, estimated that 414 million Africans lived on less than 1,25 dollar per day. The Africa Development estimates that Africa needs an additional R50 billion to finance infrastructure backlog in Africa. Therefore, we felt strongly that we need to make sure that this Bill is fast-tracked because it has been there since 2009 and it actually undermines our agenda to prosper all South Africans and as such, we are calling on all South Africans to align themselves with the African Union‘s, AU‘s, slogan of preventing capital outflows which is; track it, stop it, get it. In considering the Financial Intelligence Centre Amendment Bill, the committee on finance had to confront the reality that South Africa operates in an open economy international finance space.

It is very important for all members to understand that we have to stop the illicit outflows. We have to ensure we stop all leakages to the public purse. The ANC-led government subscribes

to the natural laws of progress, revolution of thought, prosperity for all and most importantly global integration and alignment in order to confront and defeat the ends of injustice which threatens our public purse. In 2003, South Africa joined the Financial Action Task Force, FATF, after enacting a Financial Intelligence Centre Act, FIC Act, number 38 of 2001. We had to benchmark ourselves against the best in the world as we realised fighting corruption, money laundering, financial terrorism and illicit financial requires strength of global force.

The Bill addresses the following areas which have been already been covered by members and I am glad that all the political parties generally accepted the importance of this Bill, not withstanding some of the lamentations and so forth. These are the areas that the Bill addresses; enhancing the customer due diligence requirement for accountable institution, thus making suspicious transaction detectable and dealt with accordingly. Therefore members and South Africans at large, we are inviting you to comply when requested by banks and other legitimate institutions to provide the proof of address and when asked questions relating to beneficial owner because this is actually in the best interest of us as a whole.

Institutions are now compelled by this very law to stringently perform due diligence on customers and continuously monitor transactions. This legislation adopts institutions such as banks, the entire financial sector, estate agencies, legal accounting firms and many other firms that are potential conduits of illicit financial flows and to ensure that records are kept and continuously monitor all transactions. The Bill provides for the adoption for risk-based approach to customer due diligence. Members, we have to understand that banks at times are going to be doing things that we may not like because they will have to freeze our own assets if they have grounds to suspect that we are involved in some kind of money laundering or illicit financial flows. This Bill, members, removes reference to Counter Money Laundering Advisory Council which, as said, has been dissolved owing to the fact that there are a number of platforms within each country from which to discuss matters of concern and of mutual interest. Of critical importance is that this Bill strengthens co-operation between government and accountable institutions especially banks and firms in effectively mitigating against risk which contribute in weakening the country‘s financial position.

The Bill enhances supervisory powers. However, it is important to note that FIC Act will be done consistent with the Protection

of Information Act 2013. It is also important to understand that we have to give effect to the Constitutional Court decision in the matter of Estate Agencies Affairs Board v Auction Alliance (Pty) Ltd, which in essence, made clear that the Section 45B of the FIC Act was unconstitutional therefore the Bill, consistent with the court order, provides for a warrant requirement and to state in which circumstances a warrant would not be required.

The Bill therefore expands the definition as other members have already said of beneficial holder. It also clarifies who is the legal person. It also further unpacks and dealt with the domestic prominent influential person, executive officer, foreign prominent public official, etc. This is done in order to avoid ambiguities and to ensure that the Bill is actually enforceable. The National Treasury has yet to consult widely and even the committee also consulted widely on this particular Bill because it does have certain implications as also already alluded to by Mazambane [Lees] that there were certain aspects of the Bill that we had to deal with.

Umazambane [Lees] phela owangasekhaya KwaZulu noma esawelela ngaphesheya wayeyiqabane njalo. Usakuba umongameli we-National Union of SA Students, NUSAS, kodwa uyaganga nje. [Kwaphela isikhathi.] *(Translation of isiZulu paragraph follows.)*

[Mazambane [Lees] is from my home town in KwaZulu even though he has moved to the opposition party, he was once a comrade. He is now the president of National Union of SA Students, NUSAS, but he is just messing around. [Time expired.]]

Finally, the ANC supports this Bill and we would like it to be adopted. Comrades let us track it, stop it and get it. [Applause.]

THE MINISTER OF FINANCE: Chairperson, hon members and members of the public, this Bill is about ensuring that South Africa is compliant with international requirements and standards and that we are fully aligned to the regulatory framework for issues around money laundering, financing, terrorism, etc.

Financial crime remains a global concern. The recent Panama Papers shared further light into how wealthy individuals dodge tax and launder money. I hope there is none of us on that list. Following the global financial crisis of 2008, the major economies of the world that came together as the G20, met in Toronto and pledged their support for the work of the Financial Action Task Force and encouraged FATF to monitor global compliance on empty money laundering and combating of financing

of terrorism. South Africa of course, is a member of the G20 and remains bound by that commitment.

The consequences of financial crime and related money laundering and similar such proceeds can have devastating effects on government revenues and the ability to deliver critical services to society. There is a direct relationship between elicit financial flows, tax evasion, stealing money from the state and what people on the ground ultimately benefit or don‘t benefit as a result of this activities.

The ability to easily launder the money can compromise both financial and economic stability by introducing both operational and reputational risk for any financial institution, while also compromising the accuracy of microeconomic statistics and the integrity of our economy. If left unchecked, financial crime, like any other crime, elicit financial flows will chip away at the core of our moral values and stability of our society.

The consequence is South Africa not updating its laws, as we are doing in this Bill, and aligning them with international best practices will result in major negative implications for South Africa. This could include us being put on a FATF list, our financial institutions being sanctioned by supervisors locally

and in foreign jurisdictions and South Africa will struggle undertaking international trip as foreign correspondent banks will refuse facilitating foreign currency transactions on our behalf. All of these could have major implications as you will understand, for South Africa‘s economy and employment in our society.

It is therefore the responsibility of all of us, both in the public and private sector to be constantly vigilant in protecting ourselves from being the targets of potential money launderers. If financial institutions or any other relevant institutions are seen as easy targets by criminals, both within and outside of our ranks, they will be abused and misused. Money laundering is a crime and any concealment of proceeds of financial crime encourages and amounts to collaboration with underlying crimes with bribery, poaching of endangered species, drug trafficking, tax evasion and many other similar crimes.

This Bill which, was tabled in Parliament last year, seeks to make our regulatory framework on combating financial crime, especially money laundering and tariff financing stronger. The Bill adopts best practice, as many speakers and I said earlier, by the Financial Action Task Force, multilateral institutions like the International Money Funs, IMF, and of course, the

United Nations itself. We as South Africa, by virtue of the ratification of the United Nations Convention against corruption by Parliament in 2004 also subscribe to the anti-corruption campaigns around the world.

One of the key recommendations coming from FATF is the need to identify, as has been pointed, out politically exposed persons. Our Cabinet took a bold step in 2015 in its commitment to fight financial crime by approving the current Bill which acknowledges that corruption and bribery have two sides, both in the public sector and private sector. And notwithstanding the lack of clarity around the prominent important persons, I am sure that in a near future we will reach greater clarity in that area and provide the certainty that is actually required.

More recently the question of beneficial ownership has come to the fore a week or so, though there was a conference in London, which discussed this issue; in other words once one looks through all the complex structures that are setup, as Dr Khoza was pointing out, by lawyers, accountants and financial advisors who actually owns a particular entity and is a financial beneficiary of the business that that particular entity conducts. For South Africa, that becomes an important new terrain in which we got to also comply.

One of the messages we need to send as South Africa to the United Kingdom and similar countries, is that they must stop providing protection to tax havens within their jurisdiction. They need to urgently close up those tax havens. Those various islands that I call territories of the United Kingdom, UK, and other countries so that we can actually do the work that we have to do with great efficiency and effectiveness.

There are few other points that I want to emphasise that hon Maynier raises. I am sure that in considering the Bill hon Maynier, you have actually read the original Bill. You will understand that the Director of the Financial Intelligence Centre, FIC, as is the Minister of Finance, is prohibited by the current legislation from indicating, and I don‘t even know myself by the way, whether the FIC is investigating person X or person Y. It is unfair for you to throw the accusation of obfuscation, nobody is obfuscating.

Let me give you the assurance that we will do, and entities that report to me to the extent I can manage that will do what is required by the law without fear or favour. Please understand what the constraints of the law are, and kindly help us not to mislead the public about what can be disclosed and can‘t be disclosed. [Applause.]

Secondly, if this entity is to say person X or person Y, or entity A or entity B is being investigated, you are actually warning them to go and hide whatever they need to hide. This is what we have answered in the Parliamentary Question which we will put on your table today.

I want to thank the committee for the extensive consultations that they have undertaken. I also want to share the concerns that some of the hon members have put on the table, that we have few successful prosecutions in this area whilst there is a lot of activity in this area that needs the attention of both the investigating agencies and the prosecuting agencies. Some of us might be old enough to remember *Springbok Radio* and a programme called *Mark Saxon* and the title of the programme was *No Place to Hide*. What we need to ensure that in matters like this, there is indeed no place to hide.

Let me congratulate hon Carrim and members of the committee and the officials of FIC and the National Treasury for doing an extremely good piece of work. I ask all of you to support this Bill.

Thank you very much. [Applause.]

Debate concluded.

Bill read a second time.

# Appropriation Bill

(Consideration of Report)

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: House Chairperson, I move that the report be adopted by this House.

There was no debate.

Motion agreed to.

Report accordingly adopted.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Before I recognise the secretary to read the next order I want to recognise school learners in the gallery today. Welcome to Parliament. They are from different schools in the Western Cape. [Applause.] It is always a pleasure to have you observing our proceedings. The secretary will read the Firth Order.

# Appropriation Bill

(First Reading debate)

Mr N E GCWABAZA: Hon House Chairperson, Your Excellency, the hon Deputy President of the Republic, Ministers, Deputy Ministers and hon members, I present the report of the Standing Committee on Appropriations with respect to the 2016 Appropriations Bill. Since Parliament referred the Bill to the Appropriations Committee on 04 May 2016, the committee then invited comments through public hearings and written submissions from the public and interested stakeholders as well as departments.

We would like to report that the committee received written comments from 204 individuals co-ordinated by the International Budget Partnership and Code for SA. We received comments from Cosatu. We consulted with stakeholders, the Financial and Fiscal Commission, the Human Sciences Research Council, the Public Service Commission, the Department of Higher Education, the Department of Public Works, the Department of Human Settlements and the Department of Small Business Development.

Hon Chairperson, it is against this backdrop that the committee having considered all the views and suggestions of stakeholders,

deliberated and adopted the report. I make this initial comment so that I could be able to indicate to this House that the Report was adopted, however, the report having been adopted the DA then reserved their right not to support the report. Of course, the EFF did not support the report as was expected. [Interjections.] – I did say that you reserve your right.

Hon Chairperson, the ANC government continues to pursue a goal of achieving inclusive economic growth, creation of descent work and the eradication of inequalities as envisaged in the National Development Plan 2030. In pursuit of this strategic goal, the 2016 Appropriations Bill allocates R10,2 billion over the medium-term to manufacturing development incentives,

R3,4 billion to economic zones programme. The infrastructure programme in industrial parks received additional funding of R260 million for 2016-17 financial year and the 2017-18 financial year as well.

Spending on water resources and bulk infrastructure is expected to increase to R36,4 billion over the medium-term. My colleague, hon Shophe-Sithole will develop on this issue later on. In addition, the Bill ensures a more effective land reform and rural development, more compact cities with descent and

affordable transport and the development of industries and services that use local content and support local suppliers.

Hon Speaker, for the first time the 2016 Appropriations Bill allocates R810 million to earlier childhood development over the Medium-Term Expenditure Framework. It is estimated that 104 000 children will be subsidised through this allocation and 4 000 ECD centres will benefit from the maintenance programme. Basic education has received an annual budget increase of 7,4%, postschool education and training received 7,95 increase and 8,1% budget growth for the social protection over the MTEF period.

I wish to refer specifically to higher education ...

... ikakhulukazi ngoba kusemqoka ukuthi uhulumeni kaKhongolose aqinisekise ukuthi imfundo ephakame iyathuthuka ngaso sonke isikhathi. [... especially because it is important for the ANC- led government to ensure that higher education improves all the time.]

The higher education and training received R16,3 billion which has been added in the medium-term allocation for postschool education and training function group. Of this R5,7 billion is

directed towards the funding shortfall at universities caused by keeping the fees for 2016 academic year at 2015 levels and the carried through costs over the MTEF period. An amount of

R2,5 billion in 2016-17 is transferred to the National Student Financial Aid to clear the debt of 71 753 students for 2013-15 academic years. Along with this is a further R8 billion over the medium-term to support underfunded current students to complete their studies.

Sithanda ukukubalula lokhu ngoba kukekwabama entanyeni abafundi ukuthi bangakwazi ukuqhubeka nezifundo zabo ngoba kukhona izimali abazikweletayo, abanye bangakwazi ukuqeda kahle izifundo zabo. Uhulumeni kaKhongolose uyakuqinisekisa ukuthi labo bafundi abakade benezikweletu lezo zikweletu manje sezizokhokhelwa ukuze bakwazi ukuqedela ukufunda bathole nezitifiketi zabo baphume bayobheka impilo ... *(Translation of isiZulu paragraph follows.)*

[We are mentioning this because the students were fed up with not continuing with their studies because of the oustanding fees that they‘re owing, some of them couldn‘t finish their studies. The ANC-led government is ensuring that those students who were owing, those outstanding amounts will be paid off in order for them to finish their studies and to receive their certificates so that they can apply for jobs ...]

... in the future.

Hon Speaker, the Appropriations Bill is projected to allocate R810 billion to the 2016-17 social wage which covers health, education, social protection and housing subsidies for poor South Africans. This constitutes 605 of spending and this budget growth grows by 1% faster than inflation over the next three years.

We wish to highlight the achievements of the ANC since 2004 and indicate that this Bill projects forward to further bettering of the lives of our people in 2016. For instance, approximately

12 million households have access to electricity, 7 million more than in 1994. Approximately 93% of South Africans had portable water in 2015 compared to 645 in 1994.

Regarding land and economic transformation nearly 80 000 land claims totaling 3,4 million hectares have been settled and 1,8 million people have benefitted. Five hundred informal settlements have been replaced with quality housing and basic services which have provided 3 million free houses and have benefitted 16 million South Africans. These are just but a few examples of the successes of the ANC government. The 2016

Appropriations Bill seeks to further develop these achievements of the ANC government.

Hon Chairperson, notwithstanding the subdued economic growth and unfavourable fiscal environment, the 2016 Appropriation Bill seeks to achieve a consolidated primary surplus where reserves will exceed none interest spending. The Bill confirms the ANC‘s government‘s commitment to reduce the budget deficit from 3,2% in 2016-17, 2,8% in 2017-18 and 2,4% in 2018-19 financial years.

The ANC government prioritised about R1 billion in 2016-17 for draught relief interventions and R2,8 billion for Fetsa Tlala Food Security. It is expected that this food security initiative will bring 120 hectares of land to productive use, benefitting

145 subsistence and smallholder food producers in each of the next three years. Of significance as well is the allocation of R2 billion for agri-parks and 44 rural districts and R4,6 billion for the acquisition of over a million hectares of land to develop 1 107 farms. All in all, all these social and economic infrastructure projects and agricultural programmes pursue the goal of achieving a better life for all South Africans.

Hon Chairperson, I table the 2016 Appropriations Bill without amendments and I request this House to adopt the Bill. The ANC supports the 2016 Appropriations Bill. Thank you. [Applause.]

Mr D J MAYNIER: Chairperson, We have powers to amend the Appropriations Bill in terms the Money Bills Amendment Procedure and Related Matters Act. And so, for the first time in 22 years, we attempted to use those powers.

We proposed a R9,52 billion adjustment to the 2016-17 budget, by proposing 399 amendments to the Appropriations Bill, in order to fund six proposals, aimed at improving the lives of people in South Africa.

Specifically, we proposed: To create jobs by allocating an additional R1,2 billion to a fund approximately 180 000 new opportunities ,in the Expanded Public Works Programme.

We proposed to fight crime by allocating an additional

R500 million to establish a specialized unit to fight gang and drug related crime.

We proposed to assist struggling students by allocating an additional R2,73 billion to provide more funding for struggling

students who qualify for assistance under the National Student Financial Aid Scheme.

We proposed to fight corruption by allocating an additional R117,89 million to fully fund the Office of the Pubic Protector.

We propose to assist poor households battling high food prices by allocating an additional R2,24 billion to assist social grant beneficiaries.

And we propose to provide drought relief by allocating an additional R2,73 billion to assist drought-stricken communities.

We ensured our budget proposals were budget neutral: in other words they could have been funded by reprioritizing expenditure, within the existing budget, and would have had no effect on the fiscal deficit. So, to reprioritize, we firewall thirteen national departments, responsible for delivering frontline services, from any spending cuts in 2016-17.

And then, specifically: we proposed to save R584,1 million by simulating a hiring freeze and cutting spending on any new employees in the twenty-seven national departments that had not been firewalled from spending cuts.

We proposed to save R1,38 billion by cutting the increase in current spending across ten economic classification items in twenty-seven national departments not identified for spending cuts and this economic classifications, including: advertising; consultants; fleet services; travel and subsistence; and entertainment.

We proposed to save a further R422,21 million by making discretionary spending cuts on any increase in spending between 2015-16 and 2016-17 in the Department of Public Works, Prestige Programme in the Department of Police the VIP Security programme and in the National Treasury, the Secret Service Programme.

We proposed further to save R7,18 billion by making discretionary spending cuts in the National Treasury, the Brazil, Russia, India, China and South Africa, BRICS, Bank and in the Department of Defence, the Presidential VIP Jet.

This is how we proposed to reprioritize R 9,52 billion in the 2016-17 budget: to create jobs; to fight crime; to assist students; to fight corruption; to help the poor; and to provide drought relief.

But, in the end, these proposals were rejected in Parliament. So, let the people know: The DA voted to create jobs but, the ANC voted against creating jobs.

The DA voted for a specialized unit to fight gang and drug related crime and the ANC voted against a specialized unit to fight gang and drug-related crime The DA voted to increase student grants, but the ANC voted against increasing student grants.

The DA voted to fully fund the Office of the Public Protector, but the ANC voted against fully funding the Office of the Public Protector. The DA voted to increase social grants, but the ANC voted against increasing social grants. And the DA voted to increase drought relief, but the ANC voted against increasing drought relief.

This was a first step in making the Money Bills Act work in Parliament. There is much work to be done...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON: Order, hon member. Your time is up.

Mr D J MAYNIER: ... but in the end budget politics is here, and budget politics is here to stay in Parliament.

Prof C T MSIMANG: Hon House Chair, Government spending in today‘s contractive domestic and international economic arena‘s and characterized by slow growth and uncertainty, requires the utmost diligence and care. Government expenditure has now exceeded the R1 trillion mark.

The bulk of the expenditure goes towards social welfare and grants, where almost 17 million people are receiving such welfare and grants, and there is talk of such welfare being made available to people of younger ages, thus widening the welfare net. This begs the question: What kind of state is being set up by this government? Is it a welfare state? Why are we not empowering people to use their hands and their minds to become self-sufficient income earners? If we don‘t begin with this approach in earnest, we will surely run out money one day, and it won‘t be long before we reach the R2 trillion mark in government expenditure.

We must create a state where people are provided with opportunities and this is where appropriation of funds becomes relevant. Too much money is being spent on hand-outs as opposed to hand-ups and as long as this continues to happen with free housing, and free services, then this is just going to create a greater dependency on the state.

This might suit the governing party, as reliance on state sponsored welfare has the effect of creating loyal voters and it is common cause that during election campaigns, the ruling party has gone around and said that a failure to vote for them could result in a withdrawal and loss of welfare.

Broadly speaking, the question is: Can we afford the kind of debt that we are incurring? Budget deficits are slowly creeping, and whilst the Moody‘s rating was relatively neutral, the other ratings agencies might not be so accommodating. It is best that we begin actively reining in our public spending and tightening up. Otherwise we will descend into a spiral of debt from which we will not easily recover.

The taxpayers of this country deserve better...

The House Chairperson: Order hon member, your time is up.

Mr C T MSIMANG: ... government must be reined in. The IFP supports the Bill. I thank you.

Mr A M SHAIK-EMAM: Hon. Chairperson, ministers and deputy ministers, members of this hon House, let me at the very onset say that, the NFP supports this Budget.

In terms of Social Development Vote 17 continues to receive the biggest share with R148,9 billion, which is 20,6% per cent of the total appropriation. The biggest share of this budget is for social grants, which will continue to help families in the face of skyrocketing cost of living.

Sadly, R22,3 billion allocated to Basic Education Vote 14 comes in the backdrop of the torching of schools in Vuwani in the Limpopo Province. In her Budget Vote speech, the Minister estimated the cost of reconstructing the schools to be above R720 million.

Clearly, this will go down as one of the most appalling tragedies, which must definitely be condemned with the harshest contempt possible. We hope that there would not be an introduction of another Accelerated *Schools* Infrastructure Development Initiative, ASIDI, programme, which will take years to construct schools, while children are subjected to unthinkable learning conditions.

In terms of Vote 16 which the Health which receives R38,6 billion, the hon. Minister Motsoaledi indicated,

R1 billion will be used to fund the programme of removing the CD4 count as an eligibility criterion for Antiretroviral, ARV,

treatment as of September this year. This is commendable Minister and money well spent.

The good work done by this Department compels all of us to support this budget. One can only hope that provincial health departments will take a leaf from the national department, particularly in terms of primary health care. We hope that finally there will be improvements in the performance of all components of the National Health Insurance Grant.

The other challenge and concern we have is the issue of the learner transport scheme must be addressed; the Budget of

R56 billion allocated to the Department of Transport will not be a silver bullet unless government sorts out the chaos.

Efforts to root-out corruption the sterling work done by the office of the Chief Procurement Officer, Mr Kenneth Brown, rooting out corruption in the procurement Processes is welcomed The NFP has made recommendations which are included in the final report of the Standing Committee on Appropriations.

Finally, we commend Hon. Pravin Gordhan for his selfless efforts to help steer the country in the right fiscal path in the midst of the most turbulent times...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON: Order, hon member. Your time is up.

Mr A M SHAIK-EMAM: ... in the history of our democracy. Each and every one of us must play our roles. The NFP supports this Budget

Mr N L S KWANKWA: I must be honest House Chairperson, from where I was seating I think our ANC comrades only clapped when they hear the word, commend ... we must commend, they did not know what he was commending. Some of them even thought he was condemning them, so they had to think for few seconds before they started clapping. Comrades, let me give an example, hon Minister, if you talk about improving the quality of our spend in government in general – which is what this Bill deals with - apart from allocations the quality of the spend is a serious problem. I think you have highlighted that in the past.

Key here is that, for instance, a matter was brought to my attention about Parliament trip that was undertaken by the Secretary of Parliament – before you say ha, listen – I wrote to the Speaker on 14 April brought the matter to her attention, and I decided not to do what most political parties would do. Under normal circumstances you would send an open letter – you know - to reach the media before it gets to you. Well, I did not do

that. For eight to nine days were quiet. Nothing happened besides an acknowledgement of receipt. But guess what happened, the response to that correspondence which highlights a clear abuse of state resources was only written on 5 May, but it was only sent to me ten minutes before the Budget Vote on Parliament while the bell was ringing. Right.

Guess what? I decided ok, the Speaker maybe was going to address the matter here. I kept quiet I decided not to raise it. You know, I heard people talking about the matter, I decided, let me not claim the victory and say, I wrote the letter that is neither here nor there. The point is about making sure that we use resources properly. But guess what happened, the letter says, we will investigate the matter. That is the final sentence of the letter, we will investigate the matter. But when the Speaker concluded her debate here, she absolved the Secretary of any wrong doing. Why would you say in the letter you will investigate the matter, and in the debate you are saying, there was nothing wrong, everything was above board in so far that trip is concerned. What are you trying to say? That is the problem.

Now, if we can‘t be serious about such issues, we cannot inculcate a culture where people use state resources properly.

It is also a problem, for instance, if you look at all the reports – whether you go to this department or another department – you find that departments actually they would not achieve their targets, but they had used most of their budgets if not all. It is a serious problem. We have said for instance in the Standing Committee on Finance, we have highlighted this as an issue and we said, sometimes maybe there is a problem with the targets set in the exercise.

I remember in the Committee on the Public Enterprises, where we were talking about the shareholder management Bill and the compact and so on, we said, the problem here at times we are expected to oversight a situation where we did not have an input or understanding into the rationale behind the target setting process. So, you do not know what went into that exercise, whether enough stretch and pull was built into the target setting exercise before we can say you have done a good job or not. [Time expired.]

Yhooo, liyakhawuleza eli xesha Thixo. [My goodness, this time expires very quick.]

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE HOUSE (Ms A T Didiza): Ewe. [Yes.]

Mr S N SWART: Chairperson, we consider this all important Appropriation Bill which sets out spending plans contained in the budget against a sluggish economic growth, weakening currency, a devastating drought and a looming sovereign rating downgrade. Chairperson, the Minister‘s budget was generally well received. He made it clear that a strict consolidation path would be followed, the expenditure ceiling was lowered – we saw that with many departments complaining – and the Minister also made it clear that state owned enterprise, SOEs, would be reformed, and new rules would be brought in to prevent what he termed ―predatory‖ attempts to capture state institutions for the purposes of self enrichment. We have seen that to a certain degree in this Appropriation Bill.

The Minister has also commendably done everything in his power to protect National Treasury and to prevent a sovereign downgrade, and that particularly given startling revelations that we have seen about state capture. Those efforts have borne fruit which the ACDP welcomes. We see Moody‘s ratings confirm the country‘s ratings, albeit with a negative outlook. In its view, the country was approaching a turning point after several years of slowing growth. A muted recovery was also envisaged by the International Monetary Fund, IMF, from next year.

The ACDP – and I am sure – members are encouraged by these views. Yet, we are very clearly very far from being out of the woods. Fitch and Standard & Poor's, S&P, global ratings appear to be more pessimistic and there is a significant risk of a downgrade, with very serious consequences on investments and public finances. Is it not then incumbent upon all of us to work together to avoid this? Hon Minister, our narrative - you have referred to this before – and whilst political point scoring is the very nature of politics, particularly in the run up to an election, surely we also need to regard the common good and the impact that a downgrade will have.

Economic growth is partially dependent on the recovery of global demand, and we have many global head wins. We also need to ensure that the domestic issues over which we do have control do not aggravate the situation. We cannot have policy uncertainty, such as the new mining charter launched without consultation and while litigation was ongoing. The Finance Minister has done everything he can to restore investor confidence and ward off a junk credit rating. Yet, there is this on going battle with those who seek to control state finances for their nefarious aims. It began in December we see it is ongoing.

However, as a word of encouragement, there is ... as William Shakespeare said, ―There is a tide in the affairs of men which, when taken at its flood, leads on to victory‖ To conclude, as a nation, we have this brief moment to recognise where we have failed, to turn from our wicked ways and to recommit ourselves to changes that will make a lasting difference. I thank you. [Time expired.]

Ms D Z SENOKOANYANE: Hon House Chair, hon Deputy President, hon Ministers and Deputy Ministers, hon members, honoured guests, ladies and gentlemen, today we are debating the Appropriations Bill and the allocation of budgets to the different departments and this we do amid all sorts of doubting Thomases and messengers of doom.

The ANC-led government is on track with the realities within the country and therefore has applied conscious efforts to ensure equitable distribution of resources on the basis of real needs and challenges rather than sentiments. This appropriation of budgets is not just a game or an exercise as some would want us to believe, not surprising though as we have people, including in this House who simply thrive on criticising anything that the ANC does. People are so obsessed with the ANC, blaming it just about everything, to the extent that they even say things which

they themselves do not even believe in. Fellow ANC members do not be surprised if you get accused of causing drought that we have just had recently.

Listening to some of them you would think that South Africa only started to exist in 1994, there is never any mention of the apartheid era and its evils whatsoever, but they forget that black people are not that stupid. [Applause.] Gone are the days when brainwashing was the order of the day, and we are wide awake so we can see through all the dirty tricks.

Ask me anything about apartheid and I will give you first-hand experience of what it entailed because I lived it in every manner so it just irks me when someone comes with some fabricated stories. There was a time when some of us were not considered as human beings, and I mean literally.

I can still remember how I was ill-treated in my own country and my family being dispossessed by virtue of the colour of their skin. In 1994 the ANC-led government had to start by undoing the mess created by the apartheid government, including payment of debts for things which they never even benefited from, but you listen to these big mouths and see the selective loss of memory, people pretending not to remember all this.

The ANC-led government has made unbelievable progress during the last 22 years in improving the lives of all citizens including many white people. It is also true that a lot still needs to be done to improve the socioeconomic status of the majority of South Africans, but let us not forget that the mess we are in was man-made as part of the exclusion policies of the apartheid government.

However, guess what, some architects of apartheid have suddenly become advocates of the people, questioning the decisions of government, and have actually adopted criticism of the ANC as their agenda for day to day survival. We have come a long-way and each year we get direction through the state of the nation address and states of the provinces addresses and we have the National Development Plan which is very clear as to where we are going.

The socioeconomic status of black people has changed for the better and continues to do so, no matter what others wish to make it look. It takes just a positive mind to accept that the wheels of change are moving forward and there is no going back, and distorting facts will never make any difference. I have just listened to somebody from the DA trying to tell people that they are trying to do this and the ANC is opposing it. You are not

governing this country and you must just always remember that. [Applause.]

Look at the social services being delivered at different spheres of government and I am very proud of this ANC-led government which has helped me become a real human being.

You may not believe some of the things that some of us have been through. I grew up fetching water from a spring, walking long- distances to school, with some of my schoolmates walking barefooted, being confined to some remote areas, from where my white masters lived.

I was actually a victim of the Group Areas Act whereby my parents were removed from their place of residence at Ladysmith as the area was declared a white area so they were relocated to what these people called reserves, whatever that meant. I do not even know.

I only had electricity for the first time when I was an adult, having only touched electricity for the first time when I was an adult, having only touched an electric switch at boarding school and that was it. Today we have decent housing, electricity,

running water, sanitation, health services and access to education, the list is endless. [Applause.]

Hon House Chair, he 2016-17 budget allocation is clearly propoor, a very necessary step to improve the livelihoods of those living under various forms of social ills. Access to education is one of the most important vehicles for social transformation as it empowers learners and students to be able to have a productive future.

Remember that many of us had the opportunity to get an education as black people because then we would have deprived the white master of cheap and sometimes free labour. Only a limited number of blacks were able to go to school and most did not reach high school and this was compounded by the then system which was called Bantu Education which was inferior and was created specifically for blacks.

When democracy set in blacks were already at a position of disadvantage and getting out of it was one big struggle. In spite of all the progress made we have the serious challenge of racism which continuously raises its ugly head, often in a very subtle manner, but fortunately we can recognise it from a distance.

We have people who want to own public schools today and deny black children access to them, in the name of school governing bodies. Do they even understand why the ANC-led government came up with this concept in the first place? It was definitely not aimed at perpetuating an evil system.

The introduction of the Early Childhood Development programme is but one of those that will help children from poor communities get prepared for school as most of them are unable to access facilities such as crèches due to financial constraints. The budget allocation to this programme is a clear message that it is a priority and has huge benefits.

Hon House Chair, health service in this country had to deal with immeasurable transformation challenges since the advent of democracy. Pre-1994 health services for black people were a joke of tokenism and were deliberately segregated to ensure they could not access quality services. [Applause.] They dared not go to whites only institutions which were the reserve of a few.

Shame on them! Now you listen to the architects of apartheid playing the blame-game and barking at the wrong tree.

The ANC-led government introduced free health services at primary health care level for obvious reasons otherwise I cannot

begin to imagine what would be happening to the masses of our people. The fat cats could not be bothered but are waiting there to find fault.

Social grants have been allocated a fair share even though one cannot necessarily say it will solve all problems looking at the size of the real need. May I remind you what used to happen with old age pensions before 1994, black people received less than 50% of what other racial groups got and they only received these grants every two months while the rest enjoyed bigger amounts and monthly. [Applause.] So here who is fooling who? I have just heard somebody talking about them now promoting funding for social grants, but he does not refer to what they did in the past.

During apartheid black people lived in government owned little matchbox houses for which they had to pay rent to the then municipalities but never had an opportunity to own these houses, and they had almost no access to social services. They had been removed from areas where they enjoyed a certain level of free movement, and an area that comes to mind is Sophiatown in Johannesburg.

In the process the allocation of areas was along tribal lines, where there were areas like Sotho section, Zulu section and so on, another manifestation of the divide-and-rule apartheid policy, a threat to unity among black people. This is a challenge the current government continues to grapple with, mainly the allocation of title deeds. The real sinners are sitting tight and pretending to be innocent. [Applause.]

What compounded this situation was the deliberate location of these settlements as far away from the cities as possible, meaning that black people had to travel long-distances to work, a situation that continues even now. This is obviously costly for the poor, while the rich work closer to their places of residence. Government has introduced the mix housing projects, such as Cosmo City in Johannesburg which is aimed at locating some black people closer to their workplaces, but this really annoys racists who claim these settlements will lower the value of their properties. [Time expired.] [Applause.]

Dr M J FIGG: Hon Chairperson, a national budget is a central political process. In addition to laying out the expenditure and income of the government, it provides a platform for a long-term vision of our country and its political credibility for the future. It is about achieving resilience and ensuring South

Africa‘s fiscal consolidation so that we are not caught up in, and with high and increasing debt.

The budget is about mobilising the people‘s creative energies to collectively move the nation forward. It is essentially about building trust in the economy. This ANC government continues with its egotistic, know-it-all, dictatorial and vindictive attitudes, and it has presented a budget which is going to make our future even bleaker. It is a budget which is going to increase the gap between rich and poor. Above all, it is a budget that is unrealistic and unsustainable in the medium-term based on likely decreasing revenues. Our hope was that this budget is going to give the country a better South Africa of tomorrow.

There are important quantitative elements in this budget, but they are not everything. Issues such as vision, leadership, governance, genuine democracy and the quality of life of people on a sustainable basis, are equally important. A budget is an opportunity to sow the seeds of inclusivity by reaching out to all the people with sustainable economic and social policies.

Unfortunately, this budget falls far short of the following goals: Education, health, human settlements and social

protection, making up only 56,7% of this budget. We need to ask: Who this budget is really for?

In the last seven years, we have seen a rapid breakdown of state institutions, preventing them from working to the benefit of the people. The Department of Health has many problems like, lack of doctors, nurses, equipment, medication and lack of timely services. The Department of Higher Education has inadequate funding for National student Financial Aid Scheme, NSFAS, and the Department of Basic Education lacks commitment from teachers and it delivers textbooks too late.

The heart of our country‘s problems is lack of good leadership and appalling standards of governance at virtually all levels, which has been exacerbated under President Zuma. A lack of accountability and transparency has become a norm. Good governance is not merely a cliché and catch phrase; its principles are critically important for the progress and prosperity of our beloved nation.

South Africa is ranked way down in the 61st place on the Transparency International Corruption Perceptions Index and it also has below average integrity ratings as measured by the Annual Corruption Perceptions Index. On our economic growth, the

government of the ANC has treated this term as business as usual, without a single major government initiative to create new industries with good incomes.

It has continued to claim acceptable growth. They misuse the term, claiming that the economy will recover in the near future, and making it sound as though somebody will wave a magic wand and this will just happen. Nothing could be further from the truth! But more importantly, has it created many jobs? The answer is, no! The only historic thing about these past seven years has been an increasing weight of debt our people have been placed under. Never in the history of this country have we been in so much debt!

The massive spending last year of more than R2 billion and the allocation of more than R3,7 billion for this year on the New Development Bank funded through borrowing and asset sales of more than R23 billion last year, could leave the biggest dent yet in our budget, and it is our people who will be shackled by the burden of debt. This is unacceptable! The targets of the National Development Plan, NDP, are not being achieved, and it will not be achieved under this ANC government.

The government debt will increase by 9,87% for 2016-17 financial year, and our budget deficit increases to 4,2% of Gross Domestic Product, GDP. Debt as the percentage of GDP will reach 46,2%, it was only 24% in 2009.The long and short of this is that, the people of this country are and will continue to be paying for debt!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Order, hon members! The noise levels are too high. Continue!

Dr M J FIGG: Based on 2016 figures, a child born today automatically inherits a debt of R32 800 upon birth, before they even open their eyes, grown their first tooth or taken their first steps. Each household would have a debt burden of more than R131,200. Each family will forego the opportunity to buy a R131,200 car or invest R131,200 in a house because they presently and against their will owe and will be indirectly paying off R131,200 towards the servicing of these loans.

They are already paying for it from increased prices and poor service delivery, because large amounts of funds are going towards paying our debt and interest payments. We have a great need for sound financial management now more than ever. We should set clear targets on debt and borrowings. How should we

spend public funds? Obviously not by spending millions on Nkandla, where the best use of public funds could be used, in this case, to build 2 200 homes for our people living in townships.

Concerning the cost of living, food prices have increased by between 7 and 14% in the past six months, and the electricity has increased by 9,4%. This has left most households worse off in very real terms. The sharp rise in food prices has disproportionally impacted on the poor, as the poor households spend a large portion of their household budget on food.

Unfortunately, the increased cost of living has not been accompanied by an increase in incomes.

Unemployment rates have increased, and the country‘s continued low economic growth has hampered efforts to address poverty. The only way to improve the living standards of the poor is to have high inclusive economic growth that translates into more employment and increasing family incomes.

The hon Minister of Finance remarked during his budget address that we need to work as a team, to achieve a future that our people deserve. He can count on the DA to do exactly that, and ensure that legislation and policies that passes through this

House will be robustly debated, so that the good interests of the people are represented. It is what we have been called to do.

The difference between the hon Minister‘s view and our view is that the only team that can achieve this future for our people is team DA. There are very shortcomings in the policies underpinning this bill, and accordingly, the DA is unable to support it. I thank you. {Applause.]

Ms S C N SHOPE-SITHOLE: Hon Chairperson, hon Deputy President, Cyril Ramaphosa, and hon members of this House, avuxeni [good morning.]

SWIRHO SWA HUVO: Ahee!

Man S C N SHOPE-SITHOLE: Mi njhani?

SWIRHO SWA HUVO: Hi pfukile, hi ngo pfuxela n‘wina.

Man S C N SHOPE-SITHOLE: Ndzi pfukile. Ndza khensa swinene muchaviseki Xipikara loko u ndzi pfumelerile ku vulavula laha ndzi ri karhi ndzi vulavula na vanhu lava va nga ekaya. Kunene ndzi ta kota ku va hlamusela hi ku hetiseka leswaku ku humelela

yini laha Palamende. ANC ya vona leyi va yi hlawuleke yi le ku tirheni hi ku chivirika swinene, naswona yi tirha yi ri na ku pfumela leswaku swi ta endleka. Tanihi loko Presidente Mandela a hi byerile leswaku: *(Translation of Xitsonga paragraphs follows.)*

[MEMBERS OF THE HOUSE: Good morning.

Ms S C N SHOPE-SITHOLE: How are you?

MEMBERS OF THE HOUSE: We are well and how are you?

Ms S C N SHOPE-SITHOLE: I am well. Thank you so much hon Speaker for allowing me to speak here whereby I address the public who are at home. Truly I will be able to explain to them vividly what is happening in Parliament. The ANC that they have elected is working tirelessly, and it does so with the hope that it will be achieved. Just like President Mandela said to us that ...]

It all seems impossible until it is done.

Eka tiko leri vanhu a va vula leswaku ntshuxeko wu nge pfuki wu vile kona. Kutani hi hina lava, hi laha, hi fikile, naswona hi

Swirho swa Palamende. *(Translation of Xitsonga paragraph follows.)*

[In a country in which people were saying that there will never be freedom. Therefore here we are, and we are Members of Parliament.]

It has happened.

Hinkwaswo leswi swi nga laha ka mpimanyeto leswi swi vulavuriweke hi Holobye na Mutshamaxitulu swi ta endleka hi ndlela yoleyo. Loko ndzi nga se ya emahlweni na mbulavulo wa mina, ndzi tsakela ku teka nkarhi lowu leswaku ndzi tlangerisa

... *(Translation of Xitsonga paragraph follows.)*

[Everything that is encompassed in the budget that was delivered by the Minister and the Deputy Chairperson will happen as such. Before going any further with my speech, I would like to take this opportunity to applaud ...]

... the President, His Excellency, hon Jacob Zuma ...

... ku va a hlawuriwile ... [... for being elected ...]

... to co-chair in the High-Level Commission on Health Employment and Economic Growth by the Secretary of the United Nations.

Ndzi kombela mi n‘wi bela mavoko. [Va phokotela.] Swilo leswi swi komba swinene leswaku hambiloko vanhu va tshamela ku vulavula va ri karhi va sapatela, va sandza na ku endla mihlolo leyi hinkwayo ... *(Translation of Xitsonga paragraph follows.)*

[Please give him a round of applause. [Applause.] This shows that even though people condemn, criticize and do all crazy things ...]

... the world believes in the ANC. The world believes that we can run this country and we are pushing forward.

Ndzi navela ku hlamuselanyana hi mhaka yin‘wana leyi vulavuriweke hi muchaviseki Xandla xa Presidente, Nakulorhi (Comrade) Cyril Ramaphosa, loko a hlamusela hi mhaka ya switirhisiwa a ri eRwanda eka ndhawu leyi vuriwaka Kigali. *(Translation of Xitsonga paragraph follows.)*

[I would like to explain briefly about a certain issue that was articulated by the hon Deputy President, Comrade Cyril

Ramaphosa, when he talked about infrastructure in Rwanda in a place known as Kigali.]

He said that the co-ordination effect has benefited South Africa immensely and can be replicated.

A hlamusela mhaka ya ku hlanganisa mali, miehleketo na timhaka ta thekinoloji ya ku aka thekinoloji. [He talked about joining forces in finances, ideas and issues of technology to build technology.]

He is saying this because he comes from the ANC. He believes in inclusive growth, and this is the message that he took to Africa. He also pointed out that this strategy actually assisted us as the ANC within 21 years to build 4,3 million houses. We were also able to electrify more than 20 million houses because of the ANC strategy of inclusivity and we are including ourselves, yourselves, the private sector and everybody in the development of the Republic of South Africa.

Hikokwalaho, ndzi fanele ku tirhana na timhaka leti vulavuriweke laha hi swidyondzeki swo fana na Phurofesa Msimang wa IFP. [Therefore, I need to deal with the issues that have been

pointed out here by academics like Professor Msimang of the IFP.]

You know, hon members, education is good if it assists you to understand society and what is happening amongst the people. As the ANC, we are not theorising anything. The effect that this grant has had in our people is very immense. I remember between 1988 and 1990, in Bushbuckridge, we used to go to the maternity and count the number of children that died at birth and before the age of five. We are still doing it in Bushbuckridge and guess what? The numbers that used to die have disappeared. Children are living because the mothers and the children are fed. [Applause.] It is a question of life and death, it is not a joke. We should be realistic; hypocrisy will not help us because as a black person – I know Prof Msimang - even if you, as a professor, can afford to feed your children, you do have a distant relative who struggles to put a loaf of bread on the table. You do have those people. You cannot come here and say these things will make us a welfare state. We are a developmental state; we are not a welfare state. [Applause.]

There are people and there are South Africans today who must survive hunger and who must be fed. It is a reality. There are families that will not otherwise see the end of day without

those grants. There is no question of a welfare state. Government is doing everything to make sure that South Africans do realise their first right – the right to life. That is a right in the Constitution and anybody who actually respects the Constitution should observe and encourage that right.

I was very happy when I saw hon Maynier on the stage. I remember what happened in the committee yesterday. In the Appropriation Committee we were presented with a thick document from the DA. They said that they are making amendments to the Appropriation Bill. I even called it a doctorate thesis and I said how much are you going to pay me to assist you with your thesis, because we do not work like that? In that committee we demand and we are adamant to the fact that departments must give us documents at least three days before. We cannot have people going and draft some secret documents, thick bibles like this and dump it in front of us and say that we must decide on them.

When we queried that hon Dr Figg raised his hand and he said

―No, hon chair, I did it because it is a norm of this committee‖. He said that and he knows very well that we have always reprimanded departments and he also spoke on those debates. Therefore, I want to tell you that I will not even border to worry about what he has said because I cannot rely on

a person with a straight face and say things that he knows are not correct. He knows very well that what he was saying was wrong. He knows the stands of the committee but he decided to come and say the opposite.

I think, hon members, that when we deal with the budget we are dealing with the lives and survival of our own people. We must not come and play jokes. What I want to say is that that bible that the DA brought to our committee is nothing else but a document intended to delay the passing of the budget. I want people at home to know that if the budget is not passed, government will not deliver services. Grants will not be paid and if grants are not paid it means that we will not be able to survive as a nation because many people will lack food. [Interjections.]

I do not worry because I am not talking about these people on my left. I will tell you why. Hon Maynier yesterday made me understand why they do this. He asked the President a shocking question. He said ―Don‘t you consider abandoning your policies and adapting to structural adjustments by the International Monetary Fund, IMF?‖ I was shocked because those things have never worked in many developing economies - they suffered. Many countries went bankrupt and the crafters of those policies did

not have the courtesy to apologise. They came out with more excuses that ―those countries do not implement the policies correctly and then they did not implement them faithfully‖. All sorts of excuses, the fact of the matter is that structural adjustments did not do well for developing economies. [Applause.]

Therefore, as the ANC we believe in the mixed economy. There is no way we are going to just look at one strategy and say that this is the one that we are going to follow like the DA. They are married to that and they are married to one dollar, one vote

- that is their problem. They do not believe in taking everybody on the democracy only in this country. They were dragged, screaming and kicking to the one man, one vote. That is their problem.

As the ANC, we are going to implement our policies without worrying about the structural adjustments – forget them, they will not work on this country. I want to highlight one thing. [Interjections.] Me, when all of you speak I keep quiet and listen. I do not shout at any one of you, but you do not believe in the Constitution. You are trying to frustrate my freedom of expression which my parents, myself and everybody have fought for. You are not going to win. [Applause.]

I am going to assert my right to speak in this House. People believe me, let me tell you one thing that is what we are going to do ... [Interjections.] ... I must bore you. Why must I please you? IMF, why must I please you? Structural adjustments, I do not want to please you. I will bore you, it is my time. I just want to tell you that this government is going to put a lot of attention in investigative drugs like the drugs that were found in the church of your leader. Thank you. [Time expired.] [Applause.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Chairperson, hon members, the Chairperson of the Committee, Mr Gcwabaza, thank you very much for an excellent piece of work. The Appropriation Committee is one that is not sufficiently recognise as one of those that has a very complex task to look at the entire budget and receive representations and then present to Parliament its recommendations on what Parliament should do in respect of the various allocations that government has decided upon.

Let me repeat the key messages of the budget and recall for you that the budget is about people‘s lives, it‘s about their future; it‘s about saying what we consider to be our priorities and is about how we establish stability within our country

whilst we look at a variety of challenges that we actually have to deal with.

We said that South Africa is a resilient country and a resilient people. And then we will be able to respond to the challenges that the globe provides for us in terms of the tough economic environment and the dismal economic outlook, both amongst the advanced economy and the negativity towards the emerging markets.

We have learned with the Deputy President at the World Economic Forum on Africa that in Africa we also have countries that are oil dependant and resource dependent, who are going through tough times. Bu at the same time, there are group of countries that are doing extremely well.

Our focus we said is to reignite inclusive growth, growth that will bring more people into the economy, ensure that the marginalised don‘t remain marginalised, but importantly that all of South Africa benefits from any form of economic growth that we have.

We said that we will do whatever we can in terms of our fiscal strategy to create a sustainable path forward. And so we

delivered contrary to what some of the hon members have been saying, a balance budget which enables to reduce our deficit to 2,4% in the outer year, which enables us to look for R15 billion in two of the outer years as well to get to the point that we want to get.

We can for the first time say that we will have a primary surplus that is, revenue will be above the expenditure for that particular year, and an important mark of how we running our economy, our fiscus, we kept our promise that we will consolidate our fiscus even further.

And above all we said that we will make sure that our dept is sustainable unlike what hon Figg ... Oh, he is here. Well he was saying earlier on and he doesn‘t really have an alternative either. In doing so, in approaching the expenditure question, which is what we are looking at here, we have used various techniques in the post-recession period. We said we will come back with full expenditure and we have another list of wasteful expenditure that we want to cut during the current and succeeding years. We said we will reduce the compensation budget and we have a plan that we put forward in that regard, close down underperforming programmes. This is what we are doing with

the Planning Monitoring and Evaluation Department. In the past we have used what we called a general headcount.

We will stop new programmes or slow some of them down and we are beginning to do that. We schedule or postpone certain capital projects, which already have enough money, but in the outer years, we will have to battle for money.

But there are two things we said we will not do. The one is cancel the key capital projects. And the second, we said we will not do is impact negatively on core social services and provision of income for poor people as in social grants. And that‘s the promise that we have kept to our people.

When hon Maynier talks about exercising the power to the Money Bill, we congratulate him on that, but in terms of what the committee seems to be reporting, he should have taken the committee into confidence much earlier to give himself the opportunity to persuade the committee and eventually all of us that he has a better set of ideas about how allocation should actually work. So, now he comes along and says he wants more money for Expanded Public Works Programme, EPWP, there is enough money there. And when we have a better fiscal situation, we will put more money there. But there are many other places where

there is money, for example, the Community Works Programme and the Jobs Fund. So, there are many areas in which government has demonstrated its commitment to creating jobs.

But what it does not tell the South African public is that most of the jobs in South Africa created by the private sector. And no way in the presentation that it says where are we going to get the jobs in the private sector. And again, it is us as government and as the ANC that has been ensuring that the ratings agencies give us more time to get our plan to ignite growth going.

It is we as the government and as the ANC that have been engaging business and trade unions that we have been putting together a package that we can credible put to the ratings agencies, but also to our own people to say not only do we have a plan but we have a plan of action to change the character of our economy.

On the question of students and the additional requirements, we have met their current requirements. But what he should also know and say to the South African public is that in the longer term, we need to find the better solution and so our commission has been set up. There are discussions with the private sector

on how they could participate in solving the problem of fees for students at tertiary education that cannot afford them. And let‘s awake the work of this particular commission.

Another example that he gave is drought relief, but we said in the budget that in the contingency amount that we have set aside, we have both money in that contingency amount and in the budget of the Agriculture Department and in the Disaster Management Environment to actually take care of any eventuality that farmers in South Africa, both small and big will be confronted with as a result of the drought.

He talks of the hiring freeze, but this is like stealing intellectual property. We have said to them we are working towards a hiring freeze with certain categories of people and reducing the compensation budget.

So, the one appeal I want to make to hon Maynier and to hon Figg is, please help us to differentiate between grandstanding and electioneering and providing intelligent workable structural solutions. [Applause.] Don‘t mislead the public that you actually have an answer when actually haven‘t run a country in your life. This side has running for 20 years. [Applause.]

The hon Msimang as the previous speaker said, hon Shope-Sithole, we are not a welfare state. What we want is most of our people to earn their income by working, by applying their skills by being better change and having the dignity of work and income.

And that‘s the goal in the medium-term that all of us want to actually achieve.

Shaik-Emam is right that the destruction that we see as the Minister of Basic Education has indicated in the schools in Vuwani is something that is both regrettable and must be outright condemned. It cannot be as Minister Mahlobo is quoted as saying that those who are having financial interest because of the old arrangement of municipalities now inspire a rampage where almost two thousands schools are wiped out in a very short period of time. And all of us must ask some tough questions about who is going to pay for these schools and where is that money actually going to come from.

Hon Kwankwa, I think you should pursue any matter in relating to the abuse of state resources and I am sure you will begin to get some answers in that particular regard.

And hon Swart, I want to agree with you, is a point that I have just made, let‘s move away points scoring when it comes to the

common good. All of us should be interested in avoiding at downgrade because it is going to be a downgrade that impacts on every single South African, regardless of the colour of the T- Shirt that you wear. [Applause.]

And it‘s about time that the DA in particular, but others as well begin to distinguish as I have said this million times at this platform that in party political interest and national interest. And we just don‘t seem to be getting the maturity in this particular regard. [Applause.]

The hon Figg, at eight minutes, and regrettable he didn‘t spend it well. He is looking for a long term vision when we already have one. Maybe we must provide him with the copy. He is talking about resilience and leadership when we have adequately demonstrated that. He is talking about the gap between rich and poor, but is his party‘s policy that is responsible for that gap being increased. All the time, we are the ones who want to reduce the gap. [Applause.] We are the ones who want to improve the quality of life of South Africans. And the prove of the caring is in the way in which we have allocated resources, particularly to the social wage.

He says the social wage of 56,7% is too little. In fact is one of the highest in the world that he will ever find.

So in conclusion, I don‘t have a time to respond to rest of what you are saying. We don‘t have unsustainable debt. We are managing our deficit well. What we should always focus on is how we inspire confidence in our economy. How do we stop shooting ourselves in the foot? How do we focus on providing new and creative answers, which is coming from this side of the House on inclusive growth that will meet the requirements of all South Africans? I urge all of you to support the Appropriation Bill.

Thank you. [Applause.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon members, in light of Rule 76, I will now postpone the decision for the question for a later session. [Interjections.] I will now suspend the proceedings until 14:00 and wish to remind members that consideration of votes and schedules to Appropriation Bill will be taken at 14:00 this afternoon. Thank you.

Business suspended at 12:14 and resumed at 14:03

# APPROPRIATION BILL

(First Reading debate)

Debate concluded.

Question put: That the Bill be read a first time.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Hon members, I wish to remind you that after the debate on the First Reading of the Appropriation Bill earlier this morning, the decision of the question on the First Reading of the Bill was postponed. I now put the question. Are there any objections to the Appropriation Bill being read for the firs time? There is an objection. Those in favour say, aye, and those against say, no. The ayes have it.

Division demanded.

The House divided.

AYES - 203: Abrahams, B L; Adams, F; Adams, P E; Bapela, K O; Basson, J V; Bekwa, S D; Beukman, F; Bhengu, P; Bhengu, F; Bhengu, N R; Bilankulu, N K; Bogopane-Zulu, H I; Bongo, B T; Booi, M S; Boroto, M G; Brown, L; Buthelezi, N S; Capa, R N; Capa, N; Carrim, Y I; Cebekhulu, R N; Cele, B H; Cele, M A; Chauke, H P; Chikunga, L S; Chiloane, T D; Chohan, F I; Chueu, M

P; Coleman, E M; Cronin, J P; Cwele, S C; Didiza, A T; Dirks, M A; Dlakude, D E; Dlamini-Dubazana, Z S; Dlulane, B N; Dunjwa, M L; Ebrahim, E I; Faku, Z C; Filtane, M L W; Frolick, C T; Galo, M P; Gamede, D D; Gcwabaza, N E; Gina, N; Goqwana, M B; Gordhan, P J; Gumede, D M; Holomisa, S P; Jafta, S M; Jeffery, J H; Johnson, M; Jonas, M H; Kalako, M U; Kekana, P S; Kekana, H B; Kekana, M D; Kekana, E; Kekana, C D; Kenye, T E; Khosa, D H; Khoza, T Z M; Khoza, M B; Khunou, N P; Kilian, J D; Koornhof, G W; Kubayi, M T; Lesoma, R M M; Loliwe, F S; Luyenge, Z; Luzipo, S; Mabasa, X; Mabe, B P; Mabe, P P; Mabija, L; Mabilo, S P; Mabudafhasi, T R; Madella, A F; Madlopha, C Q; Maesela, P; Mafolo, M V; Mafu, N N; Magadla, N W; Magadzi, D P; Magwanishe, G; Mahambehlala, T; Mahlalela, A F; Mahlangu, D G; Maila, M S A; Majola, F Z; Makhubela-Mashele, L S; Makhubele, Z S; Makondo, T; Makwetla, S P; Malgas, H H; Maluleke, J M; Maluleke, B J; Manana, M N S; Mandela, Z M D; Mantashe, P T; Maphatsoe, E R K; Mapulane, M P; Martins, B A D; Masango, M S A; Masehela, E K M; Mashego-Dlamini, K C; Mashile, B L; Masondo, N A; Masuku, M B; Maswanganyi, M J; Mathale, C C; Mathebe, D H; Matlala, M H; Matshoba, M O; Matsimbi, C; Mavunda, R T; Maxegwana, C H M; Mchunu, S; Mdakane, M R; Mjobo, L N; Mkhize, H B; Mmemezi, H M Z; Mmola, M P; Mmusi, S G; Mnganga - Gcabashe, L A; Mnguni, P J; Mnguni, D; Mnisi, N A; Mogotsi, V P; Mokoto, N R; Molebatsi, M A; Molewa, B E E; Morutoa, M R; Mothapo, M R M; Motimele, M S;

Motshekga, M A; Motshekga, M S; Motsoaledi, P A; Mpumlwana, L K B; Msimang, C T; Mthembu, J M; Mthembu, N; Mthethwa, E M; Mudau, A M; Nchabeleng, M E; Ndaba, C N; Ndongeni, N; Newhoudt-Druchen, W S; Ngcobo, B T; Ngwenya-Mabila, P C; Nkadimeng, M F; Nkwinti, G E; Nobanda, G N; November, N T; Nqakula, C; Ntombela, M L D; Nxesi, T W; Nyambi, H V; Oliphant, M N; Oosthuizen, G C; Pandor, G N M; Phaahla, M J; Phosa, Y N; Pikinini, I A; Pilane-Majake, M C C; Radebe, B A; Radebe, J T; Radebe, G S; Ralegoma, S M; Ramaphosa, M C; Ramatlakane, L; Ramatlhodi, N A; Rantho, D Z; Raphuti, D D; Semenya, M R; Senokoanyane, D Z; September, C C; Shope-Sithole, S C N; Sibande, M P; Sisulu, L N; Sithole, K P; Siwela, E K; Skosana, J J; Skwatsha, M; Smith, V G; Sotyu, M M; Surty, M E; Thabethe, E; Tleane, S A; Tobias, T V; Tseke, G K; Tseli, R M; Tshwete, P; Tsoleli, S P; Tsotetsi, D R; Tuck, A; v R Koornhof, N J J; Van Schalkwyk, S R; Williams, A J; Xego, S T; Yengeni, L E; Zokwana, S; Zulu, L D.

NOES - 5: Figg, M J; Maynier, D J; Mazzone, N W A; Ollis, I M; Waters, M.

Question agreed to.

Bill accordingly read a first time.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Deputy Speaker, I think it is important to make a very significant note that this was an attempt to sabotage the national Budget and the expenditure of our over a R1 trillion for the benefit of all South Africans. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, order! You are not allowed to do that.

Mr M WATERS: Deputy Speaker, may I address you? I think this also needs to be noted that this was a deliberate attempt to sabotage the R1 trillion Budget by the ANC members who do not appear for work. Where are your members, hon Minister? Why are they not here to vote for your own legislation? Why are they not here to vote for your Budget? Get some discipline in your caucus.

# APPROPRIATION BILL

(Consideration of Votes and Schedule)

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I wish to thank parties for advising the staff on which Votes will they make declarations, on which will they record their objections and on which they intend dividing. This information will greatly assist the process this afternoon.

I will put each Vote and ask parties for declarations of vote as they have indicated. Members may make declarations of vote from the floor microphones if they wish. After this I will put a Vote for decision.

I have been advised by the agreement that declarations will be limited to two minutes each.

Hon members, we have skipped a vital step. Let the secretary read the Sixth Order.

Consideration of Votes and Schedule - Appropriation Bill

The remarks that I have just made includes that I have been advised that by agreement a declaration will be limited to two minutes each. The bells will be rung for five minutes for the first division on a Vote, but for only one minute on subsequent divisions.

Vote No 1 – The Presidency – put.

*Declarations of Vote:*

Mr S C MOTAU: Hon Deputy Speaker, lack of a dedicated portfolio committee for the Presidency is a single failure on the part of

this Parliament to discharge its constitutional mandate to hold the President and the Deputy President properly accountable as required by section 92 (3) of the Constitution.

It is highly irresponsible for this Parliament that the President should take part in the Extended Public Committee, EPC, process merely for the purpose of having Budget Vote 1 rubber stamped by this House. To support this budget will be to accept that it is okay for nearly nine million South Africans to be out of work and poor at Mr Zuma‘s watch while he lives in luxury at their expense.

To support this budget will be to aid and abet Mr Zuma in his failure to uphold, defend and respect the Constitution as the supreme law of the Republic. To support this budget will be aid and abet Mr Zuma in his violation of his oath of office. To support this budget will be to aid and abet Mr Zuma when he makes monumental blunders that cost this country billions of rands in lost assets because of his presidential prerogative. To support this budget will be to aid and abet Mr Zuma in his shameless arrogance and apparent contempt of the country‘s Constitutional Court and its justices. To support this budget will be grossly irresponsible on the part of the members of this House. The DA cannot support Budget Vote 1. [Applause.]

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: Deputy Speaker, the ANC fully supports Budget Vote 1. Indeed, by supporting this Vote will be supporting the peace and stability that have been established through the advent of democracy in our country.

Secondly, we will also be supporting the propoor policies that have been implemented by our government. Look at electricity, look at water provisioning, look at the grants for the poor, look at the many schools that are no-fee schools, and look at the number of students at tertiary institutions who would not have been there if this government was not in power. We fully support this budget. [Applause.]

Division demanded.

The House divided.

AYES - 212: Abrahams, B L; Adams, F; Adams, P E; Bapela, K O; Basson, J V; Bekwa, S D; Beukman, F; Bhengu, P; Bhengu, F; Bhengu, N R; Bilankulu, N K; Bogopane-Zulu, H I; Bongo, B T; Booi, M S; Boroto, M G; Brown, L; Buthelezi, N S; Capa, R N; Capa, N; Carrim, Y I; Cebekhulu, R N; Cele, M A; Cele, B H; Chauke, H P; Chikunga, L S; Chiloane, T D; Chohan, F I; Chueu, M P; Coleman, E M; Cronin, J P; Cwele, S C; Didiza, A T; Dirks, M A; Dlakude, D E; Dlamini-Dubazana, Z S; Dlulane, B N; Dunjwa, M

L; Ebrahim, E I; Esterhuizen, J A; Faku, Z C; Frolick, C T; Fubbs, J L; Galo, M P; Gamede, D D; Gcwabaza, N E; Gigaba, K M N; Gina, N; Goqwana, M B; Gordhan, P J; Gumede, D M; Holomisa, S P; Jafta, S M; Jeffery, J H; Johnson, M; Jonas, M H; Kalako, M U; Kekana, P S; Kekana, H B; Kekana, C D; Kekana, M D; Kekana, E; Kenye, T E; Khoarai, L P; Khosa, D H; Khoza, T Z M; Khoza, M B; Khunou, N P; Kilian, J D; Koornhof, G W; Kubayi, M T; Lesoma, R M M; Loliwe, F S; Luyenge, Z; Luzipo, S; Maake, J J; Mabasa, X; Mabe, B P; Mabe, P P; Mabija, L; Mabilo, S P; Mabudafhasi, T R; Madella, A F; Madlopha, C Q; Maesela, P; Mafolo, M V; Mafu, N N; Magadla, N W; Magadzi, D P; Magwanishe, G; Mahambehlala, T; Mahlalela, A F; Mahlangu, D G; Maila, M S A; Majola, F Z; Makhubela-Mashele, L S; Makhubele, Z S; Makondo, T; Makwetla, S P; Malgas, H H; Maluleke, J M; Maluleke, B J; Manana, M N S;

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Mandela, | Z M D; Mantashe, P T; Maphatsoe, E R K; | Mapulane, M P; |
| Martins, | B A D; Masango, M S A; Masehela, E | K M; Mashego- |

Dlamini, K C; Mashile, B L; Masondo, N A; Masuku, M B; Maswanganyi, M J; Mathale, C C; Mathebe, D H; Matlala, M H; Matshoba, M O; Matsimbi, C; Mavunda, R T; Maxegwana, C H M; Mchunu, S; Mdakane, M R; Mjobo, L N; Mkhize, H B; Mmemezi, H M Z; Mmola, M P; Mmusi, S G; Mncwango, M A; Mnganga - Gcabashe, L A; Mnguni, P J; Mnguni, D; Mnisi, N A; Mogotsi, V P; Mokoto, N R; Molebatsi, M A; Molewa, B E E; Morutoa, M R; Mothapo, M R M; Motimele, M S; Motshekga, M A; Motshekga, M S; Motsoaledi, P A;

Mpumlwana, L K B; Msimang, C T; Mthembu, J M; Mthembu, N; Mthethwa, E M; Mudau, A M; Nchabeleng, M E; Ndaba, C N; Ndongeni, N; Newhoudt-Druchen, W S; Ngcobo, B T; Ngwenya-Mabila, P C; Nkadimeng, M F; Nkwinti, G E; Nobanda, G N; November, N T; Nqakula, C; Ntombela, M L D; Nxesi, T W; Nyambi, H V; Oliphant, M N; Oosthuizen, G C; Pandor, G N M; Patel, E; Phaahla, M J; Phosa, Y N; Pikinini, I A; Pilane-Majake, M C C; Radebe, B A; Radebe, J T; Radebe, G S; Ralegoma, S M; Ramaphosa, M C; Ramatlakane, L; Ramatlhodi, N A; Rantho, D Z; Raphuti, D D; Semenya, M R; Senokoanyane, D Z; September, C C; Shope-Sithole, S C N; Sibande, M P; Sisulu, L N; Sithole, K P; Siwela, E K; Skosana, J J; Skwatsha, M; Smith, V G; Sotyu, M M; Surty, M E; Thabethe, E; Thomson, B; Tleane, S A; Tobias, T V; Tseke, G K; Tseli, R M; Tshwete, P; Tsoleli, S P; Tsotetsi, D R; Tuck, A; v R Koornhof, N J J; Van Der Merwe, L L; Van Schalkwyk, S R; Williams, A J; Xasa, T; Xego, S T; Yengeni, L E; Zokwana, S; Zulu, L D.

NOES - 64: America, D; Bagraim, M; Baker, T E; Basson, L J; Bergman, D; Boshoff, H S; Bozzoli, B; Brauteseth, T J; Breytenbach, G; Cardo, M J; Chance, R W T; De Freitas, M S F; De Kock, K; Dreyer, A M; Edwards, J; Esau, S; Figg, M J; Figlan, A M; Groenewald, H B; Horn, W; Hunsinger, C H H; James, W G; James, L V; Jongbloed, Z; Kalyan, S V; Kohler, D; Kruger, H C C;

Krumbock, G R; Lees, R A; Lorimer, J R B; Lotriet, A; Lovemore, A T; Majola, T R; Malatsi, M S; Marais, S J F; Marais, E J; Masango, B S ; Maynier, D J; Mazzone, N W A; Mbhele, Z N; Mhlongo, T W; Mileham, K J; Motau, S C; Mulder, P W A; Mulder, C P; Ollis, I M; Rabotapi, M W; Redelinghuys, M H; Robertson, K P; Robinson, D; Schmidt, H C; Shinn, M R; Steenhuisen, J H; Stubbe, D J; Swart, S N; Topham, B R; Van Dalen, P; Van Damme, P T; Van Der Walt, D; Van Der Westhuizen, A P; Van Dyk, V; Vos, J; Waters, M; Wilson, E R.

ABSTAIN - 2: Filtane, M L W; Kwankwa, N L S.

Vote accordingly agreed to.

Vote No 2 – Parliament – put.

*Declarations of vote*:

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Deputy Speaker, Minister Ghordan through you, Chair, let me be very clear we will do our best to sabotage your budget. We do not support it. We have put forward our amendments and you have not to those amendments. We will never support a budget with a R4 billion jet for President Zuma. We won‘t do it. But, let me be very clear as well we are not the ones trying to sabotage this House. Your members can‘t

get here. We are not after trying to sabotage you Minister it‘s your own party that is trying to sabotage you by having you arrested. That has nothing to do with the DA. That is your own members. [Interjections.]

Mr H P CHAWUKE: Chairperson, we are dealing with Vote 2 so, the member is really out of order. He is not addressing the issues of Vote 2.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: I think that the Finance Minister is sabotaged by his own party like the way Minister Gordhan has everything to do with the budget. But let me say, this Parliament is down but it is not out. Two decades of sustained initiatives by the ANC to pull the teeth of this watchdog have taken their tolls. The Nkandla debacle is nearly symptomatic of a deepest structural problem with this Parliament. The ANC has sought to actively weaken this House and suffocate stability to hold the President and his Ministers accountable. This is not the Parliament that the framers of this Constitution envisaged. They dreamt of a robust and energetic multi-party chamber.

Let‘s start by being honest about the short comings in this House and let‘s deal with the failures and the recent court

judgements. Let‘s marry this together with the merriest of reports tabled in this House over the past 10 years and let‘s start to understand what real accountability and what real oversight of the executive means. We as parliamentarians need to hold this House accountable. We should have a dedicated committee that meets regularly to exercise over it. This will ensure proper oversight. At the moment this does not exist. We therefore, oppose this Budget. [Applause.]

Dr C P MULDER: Hon Deputy Speaker the blood field that I referred to last week between the real ANC youth league currently dressed in red and the ANC under the leadership of the hon President still continues and because of that the image of Parliament is still in tartars. If we don‘t that the public rejects what is happening in this House after what we saw yesterday the question simply is; why is this happening? Why is this kind of thing happening in our Parliament?

This Parliament under the leadership of the ANC with the ANC‘s majority took certain decision during the last session last year which caused the Constitutional Court to come out and say the decisions taken by this Parliament with its ANC majority were unlawful. It is the first time since 1994 that decisions taken by Parliament were found by the Constitutional Court to be

unlawful. Why were they unlawful, because the ANC majority was misused to protect the President in the Nkandla saga. Now, the question is very simple. Who is going to accept the responsibility on behalf of Parliament to try and rectify this wrong doing by the ANC majority? Is it going to be the hon Speaker? Is she going to accept responsibility? Is it going to be the Deputy Speaker? Who advised the ANC to take those unlawful decisions? Are the members of the ad hoc committee going to take responsibility? Unfortunately, leader of government business somebody has to take responsibility in terms of both decisions that were taken. In the mean time it allows the EFF to run rampant in this Parliament in terms of the things that have happened here. We cannot support Parliament if you think that at the moment we can continue as if nothing has happened you are making a huge mistake. Somebody, please stand up, accept and take responsibility for those wrong decisions you acted unlawfully and Parliament is the one that is loosing out. We will not support this.

Mr A M SHAIK-EMAM: Hon Chairperson the NFP believes that the time has come to restart the credibility of this highest legislative institution of our beautiful country. It cannot be postponed. The recent conduct in the House has a negative impact on our people and is doing harm to the image of our country in

the eyes of the world; causing investor confidence to be shaken. Our conduct has taken away our time for making law as is our function as legislators. It deprives us of time for much needed robust debates. This House should be a haven for free speech and is sphere for dialectical discourse and should be tempered with a modicum and level of ethics, courtesy and professionalism.

One of the challenges that we have in terms of the budget on Parliament is the abuse of parliamentary funds in respect of constituency offices and the abuse of parliamentary funds in terms of travel. We urge Parliament to take the necessary steps to ensure that tax payer‘s monies that are used in constituency offices that those offices do exist; that they serve the purpose between the member of Parliament and the constituency; that furniture that has been bought is there and does exist; that from time to time we need to pay oversight visits to ensure that we protect the tax payer‘s money.

In conclusion, the NFP with this submission will support this. Thank you.

LISEKELA LASOSISWEBHU WELICEMBU LELIKHULU KUNALAMANYE:

Angibingelele Sekela Sihlalo, ngibingelele nebalingani bami kuLendlu. Angikubeke kucace kutsi emalunga langema 203 lavotile

kulolwabiwomali ngemalunga aKhongolose. Licembu le-DA likhetse kutsi lihlale ngaphandle ngoba lingafuni kutsi hulumende achubeke nekwenta umsebenti wakhe, kepha liyafuna kutsi bantfu bakitsi labahluphekako balivotele. Kwangatsi bangabona labo bantfu labalayishwa ngemaloli kutsi bahambe bayewukhankhasa kantsi labanye bahleti etindlini bashaywa ngumoya wetiphuphutsi, loku kukhombisa kutsi lenhlangano ye-DA ayikabakhatsaleli.

Angikusho loku kutsi kubalulekile kutsi silusekele loLwabiwomali lwePhalamende ngoba ngaphandle kwalePhalamende hulumende angeke akhone kusebenta. La kulePhalamende siphasisa imitsetfo. La kulePhalamende senta imitsetfo. LakulePhalamende siphasisa netabiwotimali tawo onkhe ematiko ahulumende lakhona kulelive laseNingizimu Afrika; lapho bantfu bakitsi batfola khona tinsita kanye nalaba labahluphekile. Anginandzaba nalaba labenta ngemabomu ngoba bayati kutsi bona badla lizambane lampondo.

Labo-ke abanandzaba nebantfu. Kuze kutsi tsine sibe nahulumende kufanele siluphasise lolwabiwomali. Ngako-ke, ningazami kuta nemachinga ekwehlukanisa emalunga aKhongolose.

Indvuna Yelitiko Letetimali iyasekelwa la. Lolwabiwomali siyalusekela sonkhe njengoba sentile. Wente kahle kusho loku lokukhulumile ngoba laba abati kutsi beteleni la. Siyalusekela lwabiwomali lwePhalamende futsi la ePhalamende

bekungashukwashukwa yona indzaba yeNkandla yodvwa. Sincumo seNkantolo yeMtsetfosisekelo sitsite liPhalamende lihambise kahle tintfo. Ningafiki la bese nisima ngekugucula yonkhe intfo, nente shangatsi ngini nodvwa lenikwati kufundza tintfo nitive kahle. Ngiyabonga. [Tandla.] (*Translation of Siswati paragraphs follows*.)

[The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY:I greet you Deputy

Chair as well my fellow equals in this House. Let me explicitly say that the 203 members who supported the Budget Vote were ANC members. The DA opted to abstain because they do not want the government to continue doing its work, but at the same time they want our poor people to vote for them. I wish that those people who are transported by truck to go and campaign, while others are seated in their houses enjoying their aircons, can notice this. This shows that the DA does not care about them.

I must say that it is important that we support the Parliamentary Budget Vote because without Parliament, government will not be able to function. Here in Parliament we also pass budgets of all government departments available across South Africa; where our people receive services including those who are poor. I do not care about those who do things purposefully, because they know that they are wealthy. Those are the very ones

who do not care about people. For us to have a government we have to support this Budget Vote. Therefore, do not try to come with cunning stunts to divide the ANC members.

The Minister of Finance is supported here. We all support the Budget Vote just as we have done. He did very well by saying what he did, because these ones do not know why they have come here. We support the Budget Vote and here in Parliament it was not only the Nkandla issue that was debated. The Constitution Court‘s judgement said that Parliament did things accordingly. You must not come here and cling onto changing everything, and do as if you are the only ones who are able to read things and understand them very well. Thank you. [Applause.]]

Division demanded.

The House divided.

AYES - 207: Abrahams, B L; Adams, F; Adams, P E; Bapela, K O; Basson, J V; Bekwa, S D; Beukman, F; Bhengu, P; Bhengu, F; Bhengu, N R; Bilankulu, N K; Bogopane-Zulu, H I; Bongo, B T; Boroto, M G; Brown, L; Buthelezi, N S; Capa, R N; Capa, N; Carrim, Y I; Cebekhulu, R N; Cele, B H; Cele, M A; Chauke, H P; Chikunga, L S; Chiloane, T D; Chohan, F I; Chueu, M P; Coleman,

E M; Cronin, J P; Cwele, S C; Didiza, A T; Dirks, M A; Dlakude, D E; Dlamini-Dubazana, Z S; Dlulane, B N; Dunjwa, M L; Ebrahim, E I; Esterhuizen, J A; Faku, Z C; Filtane, M L W; Frolick, C T; Fubbs, J L; Galo, M P; Gamede, D D; Gcwabaza, N E; Gigaba, K M N; Gina, N; Goqwana, M B; Gordhan, P J; Gumede, D M; Holomisa, S P; Jeffery, J H; Johnson, M; Jonas, M H; Kalako, M U; Kekana, H B; Kekana, P S; Kekana, M D; Kekana, C D; Kekana, E; Kenye, T E; Khoarai, L P; Khosa, D H; Khoza, T Z M; Khoza, M B; Khunou, N P; Koornhof, G W; Kubayi, M T; Lesoma, R M M; Loliwe, F S; Luyenge, Z; Luzipo, S; Maake, J J; Mabasa, X; Mabe, B P; Mabe, P P; Mabija, L; Mabilo, S P; Mabudafhasi, T R; Madella, A F; Madlopha, C Q; Maesela, P; Mafolo, M V; Mafu, N N; Magadla, N W; Magadzi, D P; Magwanishe, G; Mahambehlala, T; Mahlalela, A F; Mahlangu, D G; Majola, F Z; Makhubele, Z S; Makondo, T; Makwetla, S P; Malgas, H H; Maluleke, J M; Maluleke, B J; Manana, D P; Manana, M N S; Mandela, Z M D; Mantashe, P T; Maphatsoe, E R K; Mapulane, M P; Martins, B A D; Masango, M S A; Masehela, E K M; Mashego-Dlamini, K C; Masondo, N A; Masuku, M B; Maswanganyi, M J; Mathale, C C; Mathebe, D H; Matlala, M H; Matshoba, M O; Matsimbi, C; Mavunda, R T; Maxegwana, C H M; Mchunu, S; Memela, T C; Mjobo, L N; Mkhize, H B; Mmemezi, H M Z; Mmola, M P; Mmusi, S G; Mncwango, M A; Mnganga - Gcabashe, L A; Mnguni, P J; Mnguni, D; Mnisi, N A; Mogotsi, V P; Mokoto, N R; Molebatsi, M A; Molewa, B E E; Morutoa, M R; Mothapo, M R M;

Motimele, M S; Motshekga, M A; Motshekga, M S; Motsoaledi, P A; Mpumlwana, L K B; Msimang, C T; Mthembu, J M; Mthembu, N; Mthethwa, E M; Mudau, A M; Nchabeleng, M E; Ndaba, C N; Ndongeni, N; Newhoudt-Druchen, W S; Ngcobo, B T; Ngwenya-Mabila, P C; Nkadimeng, M F; Nkwinti, G E; Nobanda, G N; November, N T; Nqakula, C; Ntombela, M L D; Nxesi, T W; Nyambi, H V; Oliphant, M N; Oosthuizen, G C; Pandor, G N M; Patel, E; Phaahla, M J; Phosa, Y N; Pikinini, I A; Pilane-Majake, M C C; Radebe, B A; Radebe, J T; Radebe, G S; Ralegoma, S M; Ramaphosa, M C; Ramatlakane, L; Ramatlhodi, N A; Rantho, D Z; Raphuti, D D; Semenya, M R; Senokoanyane, D Z; September, C C; Shaik Emam, A M; Shope-Sithole, S C N; Sibande, M P; Sisulu, L N; Sithole, K P; Siwela, E K; Skosana, J J; Skwatsha, M; Smith, V G; Sotyu, M M; Surty, M E; Thomson, B; Tleane, S A; Tobias, T V; Tseke, G K; Tseli, R M; Tshwete, P; Tsoleli, S P; Tsotetsi, D R; Tuck, A; v R Koornhof, N J J; Van Der Merwe, L L; Van Schalkwyk, S R; Williams, A J; Xasa, T; Xego, S T; Yengeni, L E; Zokwana, S.

NOES - 71: America, D; Atkinson, P G; Bagraim, M; Baker, T E; Basson, L J; Bergman, D; Boshoff, H S; Bozzoli, B; Brauteseth, T J; Breytenbach, G; Cardo, M J; Chance, R W T; De Freitas, M S F; De Kock, K; Dreyer, A M; Edwards, J; Esau, S; Figg, M J; Figlan, A M; Groenewald, H B; Grootboom, G A; Horn, W; Hunsinger, C H H; James, W G; James, L V; Jongbloed, Z; Kalyan, S V; Kohler, D;

Kopane, S P; Kruger, H C C; Krumbock, G R; Lees, R A; Lorimer, J R B; Lotriet, A; Lovemore, A T; Mackay, G; Mackenzie, C; Majola, T R; Malatsi, M S; Marais, S J F; Marais, E J; Masango, B S ; Matsepe, C D; Maynier, D J; Mbhele, Z N; Mhlongo, T W; Mileham, K J; Motau, S C; Mulder, P W A; Mulder, C P; Ollis, I M; Rabotapi, M W; Redelinghuys, M H; Robertson, K P; Robinson, D; Schmidt, H C; Shinn, M R; Steenhuisen, J H; Stubbe, D J; Swart, S N; Tarabella Marchesi, N I; Topham, B R; Van Dalen, P; Van Damme, P T; Van Der Walt, D; Van Der Westhuizen, A P; Van Dyk, V; Volmink, H C; Vos, J; Waters, M; Wilson, E R.

Vote accordingly agreed to.

Vote No 3 – Communications – put.

*Declarations of vote:*

Ms P T VAN DAMME: Hon Deputy Speaker, the DA does not support this Budget Vote. Firstly, we ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, please allow the member to speak. [Interjections.]

Ms P T VAN DAMME: Are you going to protect me, Deputy Speaker, or are they going to continue howling? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Proceed, hon member, please. [Interjections.] Hon members, you can‘t be screaming at members.

Ms P T VAN DAMME: Hon Deputy Speaker, the DA does not support this Budget Vote. Firstly, we do not believe that this department should exist. This should be one Department of Communications and one Department of Telecommunications. It is clear that the only reason this department exists is to be the ANC‘s propaganda wing – and boy, has Minister Muthambi, over the last year, done well to deliver on her promise to turn the Department of Communications into the department of propaganda!

Over the last year, Minister Muthambi has tabled policies and legislation that will give the ANC-led government total control over South Africa‘s broadcasting, print and online media. Rest assured, members, that the DA will do everything in its power to oppose this legislation. We will lobby civil society. We will lobby the public to oppose any legislation that infringes on South Africa‘s hard-won right to freedom of expression, the hard-won right of the independence of the media, and the hard- won right of South Africans to receive and impart information.

Not only is this department the department of propaganda, it is also a department used to prop up Gupta business. In a reply to a parliamentary question, it was revealed that the Department of

Communications has spent over R1 million on new subscriptions to the *New Age*, a newspaper that nobody reads. It is absolutely useless for governments to be buying subscriptions to *The New Age*. [Interjections.]

It is clear that this department is a department of propaganda. It is a department used to prop up Gupta business, and the DA cannot and will not support it. [Interjections.] [Applause.]

Ms L L VAN DER MERWE: Hon Deputy Speaker, in a blistering attack on the media and media freedom, Minister Faith Muthambi, the Minister of state propaganda, recently declared in her Budget Vote that to sell their publications, media houses paint this government as corrupt, inept and helpless.

This is simply not true. There is just no basis for continuing to blame the media for our government‘s own shortcomings. The Minister‘s comments were not only a direct attack on our democracy, they must be condemned.

While our nation is now rightfully outraged by allegations of state capture by the Gupta family, it must be noted that the cozy relationship between government and the Guptas was aided and abetted by the former Minister of Communications, Ms Dina

Pule, when the Minister and the Government Communication and Information System, GCIS, entered into bulk-buying advertising deals with the Guptas. [Interjections.] We were therefore not surprised when the former GCIS head, Themba Maseko, recently revealed that he was ordered to divert government advertising to *The New Age* newspaper.

Well, our economy now limps along. Our government continues to spend millions of our taxpayer money to keep the Gupta media empire alive, and it must be condemned.

At the same time, the Broadcasting Amendment Bill, which this budget will fund, will further erode the credibility and independence of our public broadcaster. The new online regulation policy of the Film and Publication Board is also cause for concern, with many arguing that it will lead to government censorship of online content. Both pieces of legislation are steps in the wrong direction.

All of these require urgent attention, or the many questions about the effectiveness and credibility of this department will remain. For as long as this department remains the propaganda tool of this government, the IFP will not support this Budget Vote. I thank you. [Interjections.]

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Hon Deputy Speaker, let me start by saying the NFP supports this Budget Vote. [Interjections.] I don‘t know, when the colleague from the DA talks about propaganda, what she is talking about, because the very same DA-run Cape Town Metro discontinued subscriptions to the *Cape Times* because they did not want to produce any ... [Interjections.] So, I cannot understand what they are talking about.

In fact, what one hears and sees in the media is a lot of negative publicity. What we don‘t see are all the successes and good things that happen in South Africa and I think it is time that there must be a balance in media reporting. Otherwise, we are sending out a message – and I get calls ... I got a call the other day and was asked what was happening in my country. I said they were not to worry; that this was a media house, a movie house where one doesn‘t pay for a movie but where people come to grandstand. That is what it is all about. [Interjections.]

So, this is what you call the highest level of hypocrisy. You are saying it‘s propaganda, but you, yourselves, are now going out there and preventing – and refusing to buy the *Cape Times* because they will not ... [Inaudible.] ... you. This is basically what it is about.

However, the NFP believes that the department is doing a good job. We will support this Budget Vote. We call on you and we support your initiative to address the challenge in terms of youth unemployment, so, we are quite satisfied with that.

Again, though, we want to reiterate the point that there must be a balance in reporting on the country so that people are aware that there are successes and there are challenges. I think that is very important. We support this. Thank you. [Applause.]

Ms S R VAN SCHALKWYK: Hon Deputy Speaker, the ANC supports this Budget Vote because the majority of the entities, including the department, itself, got clean audits in the past financial year. We congratulate the SABC on the 90% airtime spent on local content of the music industry to advance South African artists. [Applause.] It has happened for the first time in the history of South Africa.

We also welcome the delinking of SABC TV licences from the registration of set-top boxes for indigent families within South Africa. We appreciate the efforts of the Independent Communications Authority of South Africa, Icasa, to open offices in all the provinces. These are just some of the initiatives of

the ANC-led government to improve the lives of ordinary South Africans.

Minister Muthambi, we have all the faith in you to take this department forward. We have no other choice then, and urge all South Africans to vote for the ANC on 3 August because they, indeed, better the lives of South Africans. [Interjections.] [Applause.]

Vote accordingly agreed to (Democratic Alliance, Inkatha Freedom Party and Freedom Front Plus dissenting).

Vote No 4 — Cooperative Governance and Traditional Affairs — put.

*Declaration(s) of vote*:

Mr K J MILEHAM: Deputy Speaker, I see that neither the Minister nor Deputy Minister are here for their Budget Votes. Quite interesting! [Interjections.]

It is no secret that a large number of municipalities in South Africa are dysfunctional. The ANC‘s own government reports confirm this. Yet, this budget that we are asked to approve today, significantly decreases the funding available to the

local government support and intervention programme. Well, perhaps that isn‘t a bad thing especially when one considers that the interventions this department have made at national and provincial level have very rarely resulted in improvement in service delivery or functionality at the affected municipalities. One only has to think of the more that

R3 million that was paid to Pam Yako as administrator in Makana. That did not achieve the objectives of the intervention and had to be renewed with a new administrator.

The equitable share allocation in this budget has not kept pace with inflation and is a far cry from the increase given to Eskom. This will place further pressure on municipalities who are already struggling to pay their utility bills. This grant is intended among other things to provide free basic services to indigent consumers. The current allocation will do little help the plight of the indigent and the 8,9 million unemployed South Africans.

In the 2015 Budget Vote, the SA Local Government Authority, Salga, was identified by former Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs Minister, Pravin Gordhan, as an area where cost-cutting would be achieved. In a startling turnabout, in this budget, they get a R90 million increase. Now, if the

Minister were here I would ask him whether that was state capture at a local level, whether that was a result of his one- day trip to Dubai, and whether he returned with a suitcase full of cash from the Guptas.

Frankly, this budget does not address the challenges faced by municipalities, the problems that the department has identified itself, and the many that it hasn‘t, or the many interventions that are required to resolve this dysfunctionality. [Interjections.]

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY: Hon Deputy Speaker ...

Mr K J MILEHAM: The DA cannot support this budget. [Applause.]

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY: Hon Deputy Speaker, our Rules clearly indicate that you cannot cast aspersions on a Member of Parliament. [Interjections.] Therefore, by saying that he might have carried a bag full of money from the Guptas ... that‘s casting an aspersion on hon Van Rooyen. We request that he must withdraw.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, you know that is not appropriate. You shouldn‘t say that. [Interjections.] Yes, hon Waters, what are you rising on?

Mr M WATERS: Deputy Speaker, from what I heard the hon member say, there was no aspersions being cast on the hon Minister. I would urge you to consult the Hansard before making a ruling. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, I heard the hon member. [Interjections.] I heard him. [Interjections.] I heard him. [Interjections.] Yes, he made it. [Interjections.] Hon member, withdraw that.

Mr K J MILEHAM: Sorry Deputy Speaker, what is the problem?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Withdraw what you said. [Interjections.]

Mr K J MILEHAM: Deputy Speaker, I am not going to withdraw.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Oh, you are not going to withdraw?

Mr K J MILEHAM: No, I am not withdrawing. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, if you do not withdraw that allegation, which you made without bringing evidence before the House, that constitutes casting aspersions on the Minister. So, if you are not going to withdraw, then leave the House, hon member. You leave us no option. [Interjections.] You leave us no option. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Look at the Hansard! He asked a question!

Mr M WATERS: Deputy Speaker ... [Interjections.] Deputy Speaker

...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, I have made a ruling, please.

Mr M WATERS: No, he‘s going. He‘s going. I just want to place it on record that the hon member did not cast aspersions.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Sorry, you want me to ... [Interjections.]

Mr M WATERS: The hon member is leaving. But I would like to place on record that the hon member did not cast aspersions on the hon Minister‘s integrity. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay. Alright. [Interjections.] Thank you, hon members. [Interjections.] Hon Groenewald?

Dr P J GROENEWALD: Agb Adjunk-Speaker, dit lyk vir my die Stoel is al nou so geoefen om mense uit te stuur; ek hoop nou nie u stuur my uit voordat ek gepraat het nie! [Gelag.]

Tagtig persent en meer munisipaliteite in Suid Afrika word beheer deur die ANC. So u regeer in daardie plaaslike regerings. Maar, agb Minister, as ons gaan kyk na die insameling van agterstallige dienstegelde, dan sien ons dit word eenvoudig nie gedoen nie. Sodanig, dat die betalers van dienstegelde nou nie- betalers moet subsidieer.

En dan kry ons die situasie waar daar sommige munisipaliteite is waar Eskom na vore tree en die krag afsit omdat die rekeninge nie betaal word nie.

U het u begroting, agb Minister. Nou wil die VF Plus vir u sê, u kan nie geld oorbetaal aan ‘n plaaslike regering as hulle hul bedryfskostes nie behoorlik kan bestuur om die rekening te betaal nie. Want die mense betaal vir die krag, maar dan word dit afgesit. Alvorens u enige gelde aan die munisipalitieit oorbetaal, moet u doodseker maak dat Eskom se rekening vereffen

is, want dis onbillik dat betalers van dienste se krag afgesny word weens administrasie.

In die Noordwes provinsie is al die munisipaliteite wangeadministreer. Daar was ‘n ondersoek geloods na almal van hulle. Ons wag nou nog vir sommige verslae vanaf die Spesiale Ondersoekeenheid.

Agb Minister, hoe kan u verwag dat ‘n politieke party u begroting moet ondersteun as daar totale chaos is, as die amptenare onbevoeg is, as korrupsie eenvoudig net seëvier, en u sit hierso met ‘n vroom gesig asof niks fout is nie.

Die VF Plus sal nie hierdie begrotingspos ondersteun nie. [Tussenwerpsels.] *(Translation of Afrikaans speech follows.)*

[Dr P J GROENEWALD: Hon Deputy Speaker, it looks to me as if the Chair is by now well versed in sending people out; I really hope that you will not be sending me out before I have finished talking! [Laughter.]

Eighty per cent and more of municipalities in South Africa are controlled by the ANC. So you govern in those local authorities. But, hon Minister, if we have a look at the collection of

arrears service payments, we see that this is simply not happening, to the extent that the payers of service payments now have to subsidise non-payers.

And then we have the situation where there are some municipalities where Eskom comes to the fore and disconnects the power because the accounts are not being paid.

You have your budget, hon Minister. Now the FF Plus wants to say to you, you cannot pay over money to a local authority if they cannot manage their operational costs properly in order to pay the accounts. Because people are paying for electricity, but then it is disconnected. Before you pay over any monies to the municipality, you must make quite sure that Eskom‘s account has been paid, because it is unreasonable that the electricity of the payers of services is disconnected because of an administrative issue.

In the North West Province all the municipalities are maladministered. An investigation was launched into all of them. We are now waiting for some reports from the Special Investigating Unit.

Hon Minister, how can you expect that a political party should support a budget if there is total chaos, if the officials are incompetent, if corruption simply reigns, and you sit here with a pious face as if there is nothing amiss?

The FF Plus will not support this budget vote. [Interjections.]]

Mr A M SHAIK-EMAM: Hon Deputy Speaker, the NFP supports this Budget Vote. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: What a shock!

Mr A M SHAIK-EMAM: Hon Deputy Speaker, to execute its mandate, the department has a budget of R72,9 billion. This amount has been earmarked to improve corporate governance.

One of the fundamental principles of corporate governance should be to ensure that we are accountable as office-bearers. [Interjections.] Now, when you have a situation like you had in Khayelitsha, where people were using toilets that had no doors for a long period of time, and even thought you had a councilor in the area who did not see that or do anything about it, it makes you wonder whether there is accountability. [Interjections.]For that reason, the NFP says that more emphasis

needs to be put in place to ensure that there is greater accountability by public representatives who are paid by the taxpayers to ensure that they are delivering to the people of thios country. [Interjections.]

My colleagues keep complaining on this side. You hear their oohs and aahs. But there is an ideal example of the clinics in the Cape Metro who is the worst in the entire country. [Interjections.] But they will choose to do nothing about it. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Where‘s the proof?

An HON MEMBER: You lie!

Mr A M SHAIK-EMAM: Why? Because it is not in Constantia; because it‘s not in Bergvliet; it‘s not in [Inaudible.] That is what it is all about!

So, in conclusion, the NFP call on the department to place greater emphasis on ensuring accountability by public servants. In view of that, the NFP supports this budget. Thank you. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Check your facts! You‘re really embarrassing!

Mr E M MTHETHWA: Chairperson, the ANC supports this Budget Vote. [Interjections.] We support it because this Budget Vote of R72,9 billion is mainly focused ... it has not just come ... it has come through with a programme that is called Back to Basics, which I think now is well-known and accepted within the department and government.

This programme, to take it forward, we are going to use the money through the 10-point plan. This 10-point plan is how the money is going to be spent to ensure that it is spent correctly.

The committee has accepted the programme and its implementation, especially the issues to be addressed during the second phase.

We are now in the second phase of this Back to Basics programme which is working very well.

We will play our oversight role on the 10-point plan and to ensure that we assist the department to implement the second phase of the Back to Basics programme. We should therefore support this department in the implementation of this programme so that to measurable improvement and the citizen experience of the local government that can be achieved.

We therefore support this budget. [Applause.]

Division demanded.

The House divided.

AYES - 204: Abrahams, B L; Adams, F; Adams, P E; Bapela, K O; Basson, J V; Bekwa, S D; Beukman, F; Bhengu, P; Bhengu, F; Bhengu, N R; Bilankulu, N K; Bogopane-Zulu, H I; Bongo, B T; Boroto, M G; Brown, L; Buthelezi, N S; Capa, R N; Capa, N; Carrim, Y I; Cebekhulu, R N; Cele, B H; Cele, M A; Chauke, H P; Chikunga, L S; Chiloane, T D; Chohan, F I; Chueu, M P; Coleman, E M; Cronin, J P; Cwele, S C; Didiza, A T; Dirks, M A; Dlakude, D E; Dlamini-Dubazana, Z S; Dlulane, B N; Dunjwa, M L; Ebrahim, E I; Faku, Z C; Filtane, M L W; Frolick, C T; Fubbs, J L; Gamede, D D; Gcwabaza, N E; Gigaba, K M N; Gina, N; Godi, N T; Goqwana, M B; Gordhan, P J; Gumede, D M; Holomisa, S P; Jeffery, J H; Johnson, M; Jonas, M H; Kalako, M U; Kekana, P S; Kekana, H B; Kekana, M D; Kekana, C D; Kekana, E; Kenye, T E; Khoarai, L P; Khosa, D H; Khoza, T Z M; Khoza, M B; Khunou, N P; Koornhof, G W; Kubayi, M T; Lesoma, R M M; Loliwe, F S; Luzipo, S; Maake, J J; Mabasa, X; Mabe, B P; Mabe, P P; Mabija, L; Mabudafhasi, T R; Madella, A F; Madlopha, C Q; Maesela, P; Mafolo, M V; Mafu, N N; Magadla, N W; Magadzi, D P; Magwanishe, G; Mahambehlala, T;

Mahlalela, A F; Mahlangu, D G; Majola, F Z; Makhubele, Z S; Makondo, T; Makwetla, S P; Malgas, H H; Maluleke, J M; Maluleke, B J; Manana, D P; Manana, M N S; Mandela, Z M D; Mantashe, P T; Maphatsoe, E R K; Mapulane, M P; Martins, B A D; Masango, M S A; Masehela, E K M; Mashego-Dlamini, K C; Mashile, B L; Masondo, N A; Masuku, M B; Maswanganyi, M J; Mathale, C C; Mathebe, D H; Matlala, M H; Matshoba, M O; Matsimbi, C; Mavunda, R T; Maxegwana, C H M; Mchunu, S; Memela, T C; Mjobo, L N; Mkhize, H B; Mmemezi, H M Z; Mmola, M P; Mncwango, M A; Mnganga - Gcabashe, L A; Mnguni, P J; Mnguni, D; Mnisi, N A; Mogotsi, V P; Mokoto, N R; Molebatsi, M A; Molewa, B E E; Morutoa, M R; Mothapo, M R M; Motimele, M S; Motshekga, M A; Motshekga, M S; Motsoaledi, P A; Mpumlwana, L K B; Msimang, C T; Mthembu, J M; Mthembu, N; Mthethwa, E M; Mudau, A M; Nchabeleng, M E; Ndaba, C N; Ndongeni, N; Newhoudt-Druchen, W S; Ngcobo, B T; Ngwenya- Mabila, P C; Nkadimeng, M F; Nkwinti, G E; Nobanda, G N; November, N T; Nqakula, C; Ntombela, M L D; Nxesi, T W; Nyambi, H V; Oliphant, M N; Oliphant, G G; Oosthuizen, G C; Pandor, G N M; Patel, E; Phaahla, M J; Phosa, Y N; Pikinini, I A; Pilane- Majake, M C C; Radebe, B A; Radebe, J T; Radebe, G S; Ralegoma, S M; Ramaphosa, M C; Ramatlakane, L; Ramatlhodi, N A; Rantho, D Z; Semenya, M R; Senokoanyane, D Z; September, C C; Shaik Emam, A M; Shope-Sithole, S C N; Sibande, M P; Sisulu, L N; Sithole, K P; Siwela, E K; Skosana, J J; Skwatsha, M; Smith, V G; Sotyu, M

M; Surty, M E; Thomson, B; Tleane, S A; Tobias, T V; Tseke, G K; Tseli, R M; Tshwete, P; Tsoleli, S P; Tsotetsi, D R; Tuck, A; v R Koornhof, N J J; Van Der Merwe, L L; Van Schalkwyk, S R; Williams, A J; Xasa, T; Xego, S T; Yengeni, L E; Zokwana, S.

NOES - 66: Alberts, A; America, D; Atkinson, P G; Bagraim, M; Baker, T E; Basson, L J; Bergman, D; Boshoff, H S; Bozzoli, B; Brauteseth, T J; Breytenbach, G; Cardo, M J; Chance, R W T; De Freitas, M S F; De Kock, K; Dreyer, A M; Edwards, J; Esau, S; Figg, M J; Figlan, A M; Groenewald, P J; Groenewald, H B; Grootboom, G A; Horn, W; Hunsinger, C H H; James, L V; James, W G; Jongbloed, Z; Kalyan, S V; Kohler, D; Krumbock, G R; Lees, R A; Lorimer, J R B; Lotriet, A; Lovemore, A T; Mackay, G; Mackenzie, C; Majola, T R; Malatsi, M S; Marais, S J F; Marais, E J; Masango, B S ; Matsepe, C D; Maynier, D J; Mazzone, N W A; Mbhele, Z N; Mhlongo, T W; Motau, S C; Mulder, P W A; Ollis, I M; Rabotapi, M W; Redelinghuys, M H; Robertson, K P; Robinson, D; Schmidt, H C; Shinn, M R; Stubbe, D J; Tarabella Marchesi, N I; Topham, B R; Van Dalen, P; Van Damme, P T; Van Der Westhuizen, A P; Volmink, H C; Vos, J; Waters, M; Wilson, E R.

Vote accordingly agreed to.

Vote No 5 — Home Affairs — put.

*Declaration(s) of vote:*

Mr A M FIGLAN: Thank you very much, Deputy Speaker. As we always do, the DA recognises that the department has made significant progress over the years in a number of areas and the service level in Home Affairs is getting better over time.

However, we can also not discount the serious problem that still exists in the department that requires urgent intervention.

Although the changes to the immigration regulation has had a positive spinoff after much protest from the tourism sector, it is still struggling to recover from the damage and more work needs to be done to make our immigration rules more tourism friendly.

It still takes far too long for permits to be approved, especially for permanent residence — permits which often take years to be resolved. The roll-out of the smart identity documents, IDs, is also plagued with long queues and the entire process remains very frustrating to applicants.

Although there has been an increase in the allocation for immigration services this year, the allocation amount is still

insufficient to deal with the millions of illegal immigrants who are living in South Africa. The cancellation of dual citizenship of citizens without prior warning is yet another contributing factor to the department‘s ... [Inaudible.] ... human rights violations and this must be addressed with urgency. For these reasons the DA will not support the budget. [Applause.]

Mr A M SHAIK-EMAM: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. That is why I call this the movie house. The NFP supports ... [Interjections.]

... the Vote on Home Affairs. I think the hon Minister of Home Affairs is present. I think I saw him.

Let me talk about a good story again. I had the opportunity the other day when one of the members of the SA Development Community, Sadec**,** region who was present at a conference in Johannesburg unfortunately lost the unabridged birth certificate of her little baby. However, I made just one telephone call ... just one telephone call to the immigration office at Johannesburg international and I promise you just that one phone call ensured the safe passage without any delay for this person who came from Namibia. So I think it‘s actually a good story to sell**.** I want to emphasise ... and I did explain to some of them that the Minister did not say that if you did not have an unabridged birth certificate you can‘t travel. What he said was

that the immigration officials at the different port of entries must use their discretion. If there is suspicion then you must stop. I think when I spoke to the immigration officer at Johannesburg international they understood that very well and there was absolutely no problem.

Minister, with regards to the Umgeni Road I once again want to say and reiterate that the staff is very accommodating at the Umgeni Road branch. One of the challenges that they experience is the very long queues and that is as a result of people from different areas going to that particular branch when they can use the facilities at their own branches. So maybe we need to encourage them; maybe not restrict them but encourage them to use the facilities at their particular branch. We support this. [Applause.]

Mr B L MASHILE: Thank you very much, Deputy Speaker. There are really many good stories to tell. The registration of children at hospitals does happen; the smart ID cards do happen; and the use of banks to actually increase access for the application of passports and smart ID cards also really improves services.

1. support Vote No 5 as it allows us to guarantee the security of our country, our citizenship as well as the National Population

Register. It allows this country to be a global player in the arena of the economy, peace and development.

1. want to indicate that in the committee we generally agree and support the budget except for the DA‘s obsession with the Guptas. I think that is the problem which they have. Everyday they talk about the Guptas.

The department has increased access to civic documents**;** it supports the Independent Electoral Commission, IEC, in its quest to hold local government elections this year; it also supports the Government Printing Works as the preferred government printer; and the department has also embarked on the modernization of its systems. We must agree that the department has turned around and it is contributing in global tourism. Our passports and IDs are on par in terms of security across the world.

We need to make the call that parents register their children within 30 days to assist in securing the National Population Register as the only entry into that register. South Africans have to be safe and feel safe. The Department of Home Affairs is key in ensuring this security and safety. The ANC supports this

Vote. Come one, come all. Join the ANC march. Sishoda ngawe.

[We‘re short of you.] [Applause.]

Question put.

Division demanded.

The House divided.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The clocks are not working. Close those doors; the time is over.

AYES - 203: Abrahams, B L; Adams, P E; Basson, J V; Bekwa, S D; Beukman, F; Bhengu, P; Bhengu, F; Bhengu, N R; Bilankulu, N K; Bogopane-Zulu, H I; Bongo, B T; Boroto, M G; Brown, L; Buthelezi, N S; Capa, N; Carrim, Y I; Cebekhulu, R N; Cele, B H; Cele, M A; Chauke, H P; Chikunga, L S; Chiloane, T D; Chohan, F I; Chueu, M P; Coleman, E M; Cronin, J P; Cwele, S C; Didiza, A T; Dirks, M A; Dlakude, D E; Dlamini-Dubazana, Z S; Dlulane, B N; Dunjwa, M L; Ebrahim, E I; Faku, Z C; Frolick, C T; Fubbs, J L; Gamede, D D; Gcwabaza, N E; Gigaba, K M N; Gina, N; Godi, N T; Goqwana, M B; Gordhan, P J; Gumede, D M; Holomisa, S P; Jeffery, J H; Johnson, M; Jonas, M H; Kalako, M U; Kekana, H B; Kekana, P S; Kekana, M D; Kekana, C D; Kekana, E; Kenye, T E;

Khoarai, L P; Khosa, D H; Khoza, T Z M; Khoza, M B; Khunou, N P; Koornhof, G W; Kubayi, M T; Lesoma, R M M; Loliwe, F S; Luzipo, S; Maake, J J; Mabasa, X; Mabe, B P; Mabe, P P; Mabija, L; Mabilo, S P; Mabudafhasi, T R; Madella, A F; Madlopha, C Q; Maesela, P; Mafolo, M V; Mafu, N N; Magadla, N W; Magadzi, D P; Magwanishe, G; Mahambehlala, T; Mahlalela, A F; Mahlangu, D G; Majola, F Z; Makhubele, Z S; Makondo, T; Makwetla, S P; Malgas, H H; Maluleke, J M; Maluleke, B J; Manana, D P; Manana, M N S; Mantashe, P T; Maphatsoe, E R K; Mapulane, M P; Martins, B A D; Masango, M S A; Masehela, E K M; Mashego-Dlamini, K C; Mashile, B L; Masondo, N A; Masuku, M B; Maswanganyi, M J; Mathale, C C; Mathebe, D H; Matlala, M H; Matshoba, M O; Matsimbi, C; Mavunda, R T; Maxegwana, C H M; Mbalula, F A; Mchunu, S; Memela, T C; Mjobo, L N; Mkhize, H B; Mmemezi, H M Z; Mmola, M P; Mmusi, S G; Mncwango, M A; Mnganga - Gcabashe, L A; Mnguni, P J; Mnguni, D; Mnisi, N A; Mogotsi, V P; Mokoto, N R; Molebatsi, M A; Molewa, B E E; Morutoa, M R; Mothapo, M R M; Motimele, M S; Motshekga, M A; Motshekga, M S; Motsoaledi, P A; Mpumlwana, L K B; Msimang, C T; Mthembu, J M; Mthembu, N; Mthethwa, E M; Mudau, A M; Nchabeleng, M E; Ndaba, C N; Ndongeni, N; Newhoudt-Druchen, W S; Ngcobo, B T; Ngwenya-Mabila, P C; Nkadimeng, M F; Nkwinti, G E; Nobanda, G N; November, N T; Nqakula, C; Ntombela, M L D; Nxesi, T W; Nyambi, H V; Oliphant, M N; Oliphant, G G; Oosthuizen, G C; Pandor, G N M; Patel, E; Phaahla, M J; Phosa, Y N; Pikinini, I

A; Pilane-Majake, M C C; Radebe, B A; Radebe, J T; Radebe, G S; Ralegoma, S M; Ramaphosa, M C; Ramatlakane, L; Ramatlhodi, N A; Rantho, D Z; Raphuti, D D; Semenya, M R; Senokoanyane, D Z; September, C C; Shaik Emam, A M; Shope-Sithole, S C N; Sibande, M P; Sisulu, L N; Sithole, K P; Siwela, E K; Skosana, J J; Skwatsha, M; Smith, V G; Sotyu, M M; Surty, M E; Thomson, B; Tleane, S A; Tobias, T V; Tseke, G K; Tseli, R M; Tshwete, P; Tsoleli, S P; Tsotetsi, D R; Tuck, A; v R Koornhof, N J J; Van Der Merwe, L L; Van Schalkwyk, S R; Williams, A J; Xasa, T; Xego, S T; Yengeni, L E; Zokwana, S.

NOES - 66: Alberts, A; America, D; Atkinson, P G; Bagraim, M; Baker, T E; Basson, L J; Bergman, D; Boshoff, H S; Bozzoli, B; Brauteseth, T J; Breytenbach, G; Cardo, M J; Chance, R W T; De Freitas, M S F; De Kock, K; Dreyer, A M; Edwards, J; Esau, S; Figg, M J; Figlan, A M; Groenewald, P J; Groenewald, H B; Grootboom, G A; Horn, W; Hunsinger, C H H; James, L V; James, W G; Jongbloed, Z; Kalyan, S V; Kohler, D; Kruger, H C C; Krumbock, G R; Lees, R A; Lorimer, J R B; Lotriet, A; Lovemore, A T; Mackay, G; Mackenzie, C; Majola, T R; Malatsi, M S; Marais, S J F; Marais, E J; Masango, B S ; Matsepe, C D; Mbhele, Z N; Motau, S C; Mulder, P W A; Ollis, I M; Rabotapi, M W; Redelinghuys, M H; Robertson, K P; Robinson, D; Schmidt, H C; Shinn, M R; Stubbe, D J; Tarabella Marchesi, N I; Topham, B R;

Van Dalen, P; Van Damme, P T; Van Der Walt, D; Van Der Westhuizen, A P; Van Dyk, V; Volmink, H C; Vos, J; Waters, M; Wilson, E R.

Vote accordingly agreed to.

Vote No 6 – International Relations and Co-operation – put.

Declarations of vote made on behalf of the Democratic Alliance, National Freedom Party, Inkatha Freedom Party and African National Congress.

*Declarations of vote:*

Ms S V KYLAN: Hon Deputy Speaker, the Department of International Relations and Co-operation is very proud of its

125 missions abroad at a very high-cost to the South African taxpayer. Given yesterday‘s debacle in Parliament, I wonder how our missions are explaining this to the world at large. It must be quite embarrassing this morning. [Interjections.]

These missions are costly for the fiscus especially under the current economic climate. Programmes 2, 3 and 5 of the department cost well over R4 billion and is this from a total of R5,8 billion budget. In an effort to show up its role of a big

brother on the continent, South Africa has undertaken too many foreign payments which the taxpayer is bankrolling. For example is the R2 billion for the Brazil, Russia, India, China and SA, Brics bank, which could balloon to R24 billion over the next six years.

Through you Deputy Speaker, I ask the Minister, given that there are 8,9 million job loses that the Minister of Finance has called for austerity measures that one of the National Development Plan aspirations calls upon the Department of International Relations and Co-operation to conduct an audit of foreign representation in terms of whether the country should maintain its current global footprint, when is the Minister going to catch a wake up and commence with the review and rationalisation of South Africa‘s missions abroad? The DA cannot in all honesty support the Department of International Relations and Co-operation‘s budget. [Applause.]

Mr A M SHAIK-EMAM: Hon Deputy Speaker, the NFP supports this budget. [Applause.] Let me start of by saying that and I will specifically talk on the issue of the Southern African Development Community, SADC, region because we are a member representative country in that region. There are lots and lots of interventions especially in the SADC region such as the

infrastructure development that we are about to embark on, the process of fighting tuberculosis, diabetes and HIV in the region, the issue of skills sharing and we must keeping the skills in the region than allowing them to be taken away by the imperialists throughout the world.

So, I think you know, allocating the budget and maintaining the international relationships throughout the world is very important. I like when we talk about job loses, but in my view the issue of African Growth and Opportunity Act, is also going to course job loses because we were forced to actually bring in poultry from the United States, thanks to the DA. [Laughter.] So, as a result we have that. Here with our relationships with the SADC regions and I can tell you that we will be creating lots and lots of jobs. We will be able to have the economic development in the area. I will give an example of the shortage that we have ahead of the general practitioners, GPs, which the National Health Insurance, NHI, could not kick off and which the DA does not want to kick off. The Mauritian government part of the SADC has offered 400 GPs. So, there are a lot of work and good things coming from the international relationships. We must support this budget. Anywhere where there is going to be in the interests of South Africa or country and our people as a whole

we must support it. The NFP will support this budget. Thank you. [Applause.]

Mr M A MNCWANGO: Hon Deputy Speaker, the IFP believes that it is imperative that stringent cost-cutting measures be implemented by this department in line with the overall fiscal belt- tightening that is taking place across all other departments.

The IFP believes that a reduction in a number of missions which stands at 125 currently must be looked at. The cost involved in maintaining trade missions with little or no benefit at all to the country is just undesirable.

Symbolic missions are cost-prohibitive as well as the phenomenal growth in the terrorism scourge in Africa, is also a course for grate concern to us. If not checked, it will undermine every effort at economic regional integration which is underpinned by the African Union, AU, infrastructure development initiatives.

The IFP nevertheless supports this budget. [Applause.]

Nom M S A MASANGO: Sihlalo,kokuthoma ihlangano yesitjhaba esekelwa nguZimu nabezimu i-ANC iyasisekela isabelo seemali soMnyango weeNdaba zeenTjhabatjhaba nokuBambisana. Angithome ngokuthi itjhebiswano hlangana neSewula Afrika namazwe

wangaphandle likhule kusuka eendaweni ezima-37 ukuya kezili-126. Lokho kwenza bona iSewula Afrika isebenzisane kuhle khulu neenerha zangaphandle.

Kwesibili kukobana irhwebo hlangana neSewula Afrika neenarhakazi ye-Afrika likhule kusuka ku-R11 wamabhiliyoni ngaphambi komnyaka we-1994 njenganje lijame kuma-R385 wamabhiliyoni. I-ANC iyasekela. [Iwahlo.]

Kwesithathu, ihlangano ebizwa nge-*Forum on China-Africa Co- operation* njengombana beyibanjelwe lapha emnyakeni ophelileko, kufakwe imali enengi edlula ku-R92 wamabhiliyoni ezokwenza amathuba wemisebenzi nokuqeda itjhirho.

Kwamaphelelo ibhanga le ebizwa ngokuthiwa yi-*Development Bank* kanti abanye bathi yi-*Brazil, Russia, India and SA, Brics bank* nayo seyithomile ukufaka imali eSewula Afrika ne-Afrika lapho abantu bazakukghona ukuthola imisebenzi nakwakhiwa amabhlorho, iindlela nemitato nazozoke izinto ekuthiwa ngesikhuwa yi- infrastructure, umthangalasiseko. Ngiyathokoza, ihlangano yabezimu iyasekela. [Iwahlo.] *(Translation of isiNdebele speech follows.)*

[Mr M S A MASANGO: Chairperson firstly, the ANC, the nation‘s organisation that is supported by God and our ancestors, supports the Budget Vote of the Department of International Relations and Cooperation. Let me start by saying that the number of countries that South Africa has a working relationship with has grown from 37 to 126 countries. That means South Africa has a good relationship with other countries.

Secondly, is that the trading between South Africa and the African continent has risen from R11 billion before 1994 to R385 billion. The ANC supports the Vote. [Applause].

Thirdly, the Forum on China-Africa Co-operation, which was held here in South Africa last year, has invested more than R92 billion that will help in the creation of jobs and with the alleviation of poverty.

Lastly, the Development Bank which some people call the Brics Bank - Brazil, Russia, India and SA - has also started to invest money in South Africa. This will help South African people in respect of the creation of infrastructure with work opportunities in projects such as the building of roads and bridges and telecommunications - this is called infrastructure

in English. I thank you. The ancestors‘ organisation supports the Vote. [Applause.]]

Vote accordingly agreed to (Democratic Alliance and Freedom Front Plus dissenting).

Vote 7 - National Treasury – put.

*Declarations of vote*:

Mr D J MAYNIER: Deputy Speaker, the great economists, John Maynard Keynes, viewed National Treasury‘s and I quote: ―as a bulk walk against overwhelming wickedness‖. The problem of course is that it is true National Treasury does stand against wickedness and does stand between good and evil in our country.

Now, we have a tipping point economic growth is collapsing to 0,6%, 8,9 million people do not have jobs or have given up looking for jobs and we are hurtling towards a ratings downgrade in South Africa. But of course, despite this the Minister was a victim of a political heat on the weekend with newspaper headlines screaming Pravin arrest shock, which of course triggered an extra-ordinary statement from a Minister which read and I quote: ―all South Africans need to protect the National

Treasury staff who have diligently, honestly and scare fully served the national interest to the best of their ability‖.

And so, we must ask: who does the National Treasury staff, require protection from? And of course the answer is clear, President Jacob Zuma and his proxy forces including the sugar daddy‘s in Dubai. The petals of project spider web and the wreckers in cabinet who support him and so, we choose to stand against wickedness and support the National Treasury Vote in 2016-17. I thank you.

Mr A M SHAIK-EMAM: Hon Deputy Speaker, let me start of by commending the Minister and his entire team at the Treasury for the job well done. Minister, hon Deputy Speaker and ministers present, with regards to the challenges that municipalities are facing in terms of the Municipal Public Accounts committees, the NFP believes that more power must be given to the Municipal Public Accounts Committee, because to very large extent they appear to be undermined by municipal managers and mayors and things, so I think we need to that.

The other thing we found is that, irregular expenditure, there seem to be lots and lots of loop holes in irregular expenditure where you spend the money and then come out and regularise it,

even though it may not have been entirely necessary or it could have waited for the next Budget and things, so I think those are some of the issues we believe that we must address and give more power to them.

With regard to the issue and the challenge with the non-payment by government departments and where Treasury is intervening and ensuring that they are paying directly. We must try and ensure that the recurrence of this must not go on and on. We must put a stop to it and ensure that people are accountable and make sure that the policies that we have in place must be implemented at all given time, because they come with this strategic plans and quite often they know that it is not realistic. They are not going to be able to achieve them and I think Treasury need to take that into consideration.

However the NFP believes that and we will support this Budget. Thank you very much.

Mr M L W FILTANE: Hon Chair, the reason the UDM thought it is necessary that I come over here is to register our concern to the Treasury over the fact that, when a department under spends by as much as R16 million. To Treasury that means nothing, but if you were to measure the amount of development that you can do

with R16 million, socio-economic impact of R16 million, then you would understand that Treasury needs to move from that way of thinking.

This declaration was made by your Chief Director when we were dealing with land reform which had under-expenditure close to that figure. So, we want to say as UDM, do not undermine under- expenditure. Get serious with the way in which you handle the finances of the state.

The other point in closing that I would like to raise is that, we do support Treasury, because we do realise the fact that it needs to have the cash to disperse to the various departments. But lastly, we want to say as the UDM, that it is still a matter of concern that all government departments seem to concern and confine themselves to reporting that we have spent so many billions and that‘s the end.

Socio-economic impact is the reason why there is government. Please, add that. They will listen when you speak as Treasury. They don‘t listen when we encourage them to do that. I thank you.

Mr Y I CARRIM: Deputy Speaker, comrades and friends, Mr David Doom and Gloom Maynier, says everything that is predictable now, of course he says the country is hurtling forward to a downgrade. He said that some six, eight weeks ago and he was proven wrong. There is no reason why you again won‘t be proven wrong.

There is nothing inevitable about the downgrade. If we all work together as a country in our national interest whatever our differences which what the Minister appealed for in his Budget speech. We can avoid that downgrade, because you see ultimately who will suffer if there is a downgrade? Is not just all of us here, but primarily the poor and the disadvantaged.

For the DA, it doesn‘t matter, because that is not its constituency. In facts, are the poor and the disadvantaged that will suffer disproportionately far more than us, so it‘s in our national interest. Many other countries facing similar problems, despite the very big differences within political parties have drawn together. Why don‘t we expect the spirit of what the Minister said in his speech of working together, being resilient, working together as we have done in the best of times?

Also to say, at our meeting yesterday, we observed once again as we now report on your budget, that the Strategic Plan and Annual Performance Plan, APP, of the SA Revenue Service not yet being presented. You have of course asked for an extension to the Speaker of Parliament until the end of July. The committee has welcomed it, but says we cannot afford the divisions we currently have, not in the context we currently face. So, we appealed for the President, the Deputy President as the leader of government business, the Minister and the Commissioner Tom Moyane, to sort these issues out.

When you come back to us as Parliament, we have no choice but to get tougher on this, Deputy President. It has to be sorted out. Whatever the differences are? We are not taking position on that. What we do know is that the differences have to be substantially reduced, if not eliminated, which will increase our case to call...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Carrim, I regret your time has expired.

Mr Y I CARRIM: ... for civil society to work closer with us. Thank you.

QUESTION PUT: Those in favour will say Aye and those against, Noe? The Ayes have it.

Vote accordingly agreed to.

Vote No 8 – Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation – put.

*Declaration(s) of vote*:

Mr S C MOTAU: Hon Deputy Speaker, I just want to make a remark: Working together does not mean that the DA should be the lapdogs of the ANC. [Interjections.] The DA has warned previously that the empire building in the Department of Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation, DPME, will only serve to deepen the ANC‘s crony network of cadre deployment. As matters stand, the number of permanent posts in the department is set to increase from 372 in the 2015-16 financial year to 490 in the medium term.

Consequently, the budget for compensation of employees is expected to grow at an average annual rate of 18,4%, accounting for 30,9% of the department‘s budget over the medium term.

This is truly breathtaking at a time when the Minister of Finance has appealed for serious cost-cutting across all national departments. This country is in dire economic straits.

Nearly 9 million jobless South Africans demand of all of us in this Parliament to trim this bloated government.

The DA holds that the single hybrid portfolio committee for the DPME and the Department of Public Service and Administration, DPSA, cannot do effective oversight over the two departments.

Indeed, as I have pleaded before, if the two departments are important enough to each have a Minister, a Deputy Minister and loads of programmes, then each of these departments must be important enough to have a dedicated portfolio committee.

I know the Minister is listening here. These are the issues that make it very difficult for us as the DA to support the budget of a Ministry that actually works much better than others. For those reasons, we cannot support the budget for Vote No 8.

Mr M A DIRKS: Hon Deputy Speaker, comrades, hon members of this House, monitoring and evaluation is very important to this government and therefore, the African National Congress wholeheartedly supports this budget. By supporting this budget, we are actually saying that we are supporting youth development, the empowerment of youth, job creation and government to actually evaluate and monitor departments when it comes to service delivery.

Just allow me to say that the Democratic Alliance is actually very, very naughty this afternoon. We actually need a more serious opposition in this House. [Interjections.] We don‘t need this kind of lapdog. We need a more serious opposition. The Democratic Alliance only comes ... The Democratic Alliance is wasting taxpayers‘ money. They are only coming to this House here for self-pleasure and self-indulgence. Therefore, the African National Congress supports this budget. [Interjections.]

Declarations of vote made on behalf of the Democratic Alliance and African National Congress.

Vote accordingly agreed to (Democratic Alliance dissenting).

Vote 9 – Public Enterprises – put.

*Declaration(s) of vote*:

Ms N W A MAZZONE: Hon Deputy Speaker, there is mounting evidence to suggest that a number of state-owned entities, SOEs, had been captured by the Gupta family, allegedly influencing not only Ministerial appointments but also the appointments of the SOEs themselves.

I recently had the misfortune of being party to a portfolio committee in which the state-owned entity, Denel, spent the entire meeting blaming National Treasury and the very department that is their stakeholder for alleged noncompliance to the Public Finance Management Act, PFMA.

It is not a healthy state of affairs when a SOE blames or attempts to pass the buck for its inactions on the fact that they should have been sanctioned by the Department of Public Enterprises, but had no communication with the Minister.

It is imperative to uncover the full extent to which the Gupta family has influence over state-owned entities. This is with the view only to make sure that the very nature and credibility of our state-owned entity is brought back.

Parliament is duty-bound to hold government accountable as well as to ensure that the cabal of ANC cronies with links to President Zuma and the Gupta family do not seize our economy.

The DA will not allow the ANC to prosper at the expense of ordinary South Africans. Over 8,9 million South Africans remain jobless. As long as the ANC continues to put itself first, our

nation will always come second. The DA will not support this Budget Vote.

Prof C T MSIMANG: Hon House Chair, I am making this presentation on behalf of hon Narendra Singh. As indicated during the Budget Vote debate on Public Enterprises, hon Singh said that he believed that there is no need for this department to continue existing.

The number of state-owned companies over which this Ministry has an oversight role has reduced considerably. He went on to say that the current state-owned companies, which include Eskom,

Denel, SA Express Airways, the South African Forestry Company, Safcol, can quite easily be made accountable to the relevant line function departments.

The arm-length approach by the Minister and the department, in respect of their oversight is often the case because these state-owned enterprises hide behind the Companies Act and the independence of their boards.

An interaction by our committee with the Denel board chairperson and officials over the VR Laser issue is a case in point, where

state-owned companies literally said to the Minister, and I quote: ―Do not interfere.‖

The department has a budget of R274 million, which could be better used for service delivery. Notwithstanding this, our view is that the department does exist and does have a responsibility to oversee some SOEs and this must continue.

We will accordingly support the current budget in the hope that sooner rather than later there will be no need for the department.

Dr P J GROENEWALD: Agb Voorsitter, die Transnet-hofuitspraak is weereens ‘n bewys dat die agb Minister nie ernstig is oor die belastingbetaler se geld in Suid-Afrika nie. Agb Minister, ons praat van miljarde rande wat hier betrokke is. Ek wil vandag vir u sê dat u so gou as moontlik behoort te skik in hierdie pensioensaak, om nie die belatingbetaler se geld verder te mors nie.

So ‘n paar weke gelede was SA Express Airways se lisensie net eenvoudig opgeskort. Ek hoop die agb Minister het gesien toe ‘n bruin vrou op die lughawe in trane was, omdat sy nie kon vlieg nie, want haar ma het daardie dag 80 jaar oud geword. Dis ‘n

eenmalige gebeurtenis. Dit was as gevolg van SA Express wie se veiligheidsrekord nie op datum is nie. Daaarna is gesê dat dit maar net dokumentasie was. Wat was dit? Was dit sommer net oor dokumentasie? Dan moet daar sekerlik ‘n paar amptenare ontslaan word, want as dit die ongerief en die kostes is wat swak administrasie te weeg bring, is dit totaal onaanvaarbaar.

Agb Minister, ek het u pertinente vrae in die debat gevra oor Denel Asia, wat aan internasionale wapenskoue deelneem en mense eintlik bedrieg. U het my nie geantwoord nie. Al wat u my kon sê is dat ek nie respekvol teenoor u is nie. Nou wil ek vandag vir u iets sê en u moet mooi luister. U is gewoond daaraan dat amptenare aan u verantwoording doen en as u sê spring dan sê hulle, hoe hoog. In hierdie Huis doen u hier verantwoording aan die belastingbetalers van Suid-Afrika. U moet nou nie ‘n ou tjankbalie Minister word as u nie die vrae kan beantwoord nie. *(Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follows.)*

[Dr P J GROENEWALD: Hon Chairperson, the Transnet court judgment is once again proof that the hon Minister is not serious about the taxpayer‘s money in South Africa. Hon Minister, we are speaking about billions of rands that are involved here. Today I want to tell you that you should settle as quickly as possible

regarding this pension matter, in order not to waste the taxpayer‘s money any longer.

Just a few weeks ago the license of SA Express Airways was simply suspended. I hope the hon Minister saw how a coloured lady at the airport was in tears because she was unable to fly, as her mother was turning 80 that very day. This is a unique happening. It was as result of SA Express whose safety record was once again not up to date. Afterwards it was said that it simply had to do with documentation. What was it? Did it simply have to do with documentation? In that case a few officials should certainly be dismissed, because if that is the discomfort and costs is that poor administration causes, that is totally unacceptable.

Hon Minister, I have put pertinent questions to you in the debate about Denel Asia, which participates in international weapons shows and actually deceives people. You did not answer me. All that you could tell me is that I was not respectful to you. Now today I want to tell you something and you need to listen carefully. You are used to officials who answer to you and if you say ―jump‖ they ask ―how high?‖ In this House you are answerable to the taxpayers of South Africa. You must not become a little cry baby now if you cannot answer the questions.]

That is what you became – a cry baby Minister. Thank you. [Applause.]

Mr A M SHAIK-EMAM: Hon Chairperson, the National Freedom Party supports this Budget Vote. Let me start off by talking about one of our successes. I think Eskom has turned because not very long ago we used to hear moans, groans and cries from people about Eskom and load-shedding, but suddenly I don‘t hear people saying that there is no load-shedding, what a privilege, what a pride. Yes, nobody wants to talk about it. [Applause.] So, nobody talks about successes, we only talk about negative issues.

In saying that, I also think what we encourage in this House is that every member in this House, understanding that South African Airways is part of a government entity should all travel South African Airways. Why don‘t you all travel South African Airways if you want it to be proper? That is what they must do. I think government must put a policy in place - I am glad the Deputy President is here – to insist that members of this House use South African Airways. [Interjections.] Why are we enriching the west? Why are we enriching the imperialists when we have our own?

As the National Freedom Party, I want to emphasise that South African Airways should not and must not ever be sold. What must happen with South African Airways is that we must just get our management correct and make it a profitable organisation once again. South African Airways is the pride of South Africa. We must not get rid of the South African Airways for the interest of others.

However, I want to emphasise, we must ensure as soon as possible, that all my colleagues travel South African Airways. I would like to see them on the South African Airways plane in the economy class. The National Freedom Party supports this Vote.

Thank you. [Interjections.]

Ms D Z RANTHO: Agb Groenewald, dit was net dokumentasie. Dit was net dokumentasie en niks anders nie. [Hon Groenewald, this was just documentation. It was just documentation and nothing else.]

The ANC supports the Vote No 9, because ...

... eli sebe libeka amaqanda. [... this department lays the eggs.]

The turnaround of the six state-owned companies, Eskom, Transnet, SA Express Airways, Denel, Safcol and Alexkor under Minister Brown is bearing fruits. We can mention numerous successes, but the biggest success to date is the one that hon Shaik-Emam has spoken about.

Last year, I stood here and I said and I am saying that again, load-shedding was not a crisis. I say it again. Now that there is no load-shedding, there is nobody who says anything. Their mouths are closed as if there is glue pasted on their lips. The last day that Eskom had load-shedding was in the August 2015 and nothing until now. Why? [Interjections.] You should ask yourself why you were crying in the first place. Thanks to the leadership of Brian Molefe and Dr Ben Ngubane

I just want to say that we are aware of the other SOEs that have small problems and we are working on that. On the Denel issue, Denel is always associated with the Guptas, but the people who associate it with the Guptas never mention the other white companies that have shares within Denel because it belongs to them. That is why they are quiet. [Time expired.] We support this Budget Vote. [Interjections.]

Declarations of vote made on behalf of the Democratic Alliance, Inkatha Freedom Party, Freedom Front Plus, National Freedom Party and African National Congress.

Division demanded.

The House divided.

AYES - 204: Abrahams, B L; Adams, F; Adams, P E; Basson, J V; Bekwa, S D; Beukman, F; Bhengu, P; Bhengu, F; Bhengu, N R; Bilankulu, N K; Bogopane-Zulu, H I; Bongo, B T; Boroto, M G; Brown, L; Buthelezi, N S; Capa, R N; Capa, N; Carrim, Y I; Cebekhulu, R N; Cele, B H; Cele, M A; Chauke, H P; Chikunga, L S; Chiloane, T D; Chohan, F I; Chueu, M P; Coleman, E M; Cronin, J P; Cwele, S C; Didiza, A T; Dirks, M A; Dlakude, D E; Dlamini- Dubazana, Z S; Dlulane, B N; Dunjwa, M L; Ebrahim, E I; Esterhuizen, J A; Faku, Z C; Filtane, M L W; Fubbs, J L; Gamede, D D; Gcwabaza, N E; Gigaba, K M N; Gina, N; Goqwana, M B; Gordhan, P J; Gumede, D M; Holomisa, S P; Jeffery, J H; Johnson, M; Jonas, M H; Kalako, M U; Kekana, H B; Kekana, P S; Kekana, M D; Kekana, C D; Kekana, E; Khoarai, L P; Khosa, D H; Khoza, T Z M; Khoza, M B; Khunou, N P; Koornhof, G W; Kubayi, M T; Lesoma, R M M; Loliwe, F S; Luzipo, S; Maake, J J; Mabasa, X; Mabe, B P; Mabe, P P; Mabija, L; Mabilo, S P; Mabudafhasi, T R; Madella, A

F; Madlopha, C Q; Maesela, P; Mafolo, M V; Mafu, N N; Magadla, N W; Magadzi, D P; Magwanishe, G; Mahambehlala, T; Mahlalela, A F; Mahlangu, J L; Mahlangu, D G; Majola, F Z; Makhubela-Mashele, L S; Makhubele, Z S; Makondo, T; Makwetla, S P; Malgas, H H; Maluleke, J M; Maluleke, B J; Manana, D P; Manana, M N S; Mandela, Z M D; Mantashe, P T; Maphatsoe, E R K; Mapulane, M P; Martins, B A D; Masango, M S A; Masehela, E K M; Mashego- Dlamini, K C; Mashile, B L; Masondo, N A; Masuku, M B;

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Maswanganyi, | M | J; Mathale, C | C; Mathebe, | D H; | Matlala, | M | H; |
| Matshoba, M | O; | Mavunda, R T; | Maxegwana, C | H M; | Mbalula, | F | A; |
| Mchunu, S; Memela, T C; Mjobo, L N; Mkhize, H B; Mmemezi, H | M | Z; |
| Mmola, M P; Mmusi, S G; Mncwango, M A; Mnganga - Gcabashe, | L | A; |
| Mnguni, P J; Mnguni, D; Mnisi, N A; Mogotsi, V P; Mokoto, | N | R; |
| Molebatsi, M A; Molewa, B E E; Morutoa, M R; Mothapo, M | R | M; |
| Motimele, M S; Motshekga, M A; Motshekga, M S; Motsoaledi, | P | A; |
| Mpumlwana, L K B; Mthembu, J M; Mthembu, N; Mthethwa, | E | M; |

Mudau, A M; Nchabeleng, M E; Ndaba, C N; Ndongeni, N; Newhoudt- Druchen, W S; Ngcobo, B T; Ngwenya-Mabila, P C; Nkadimeng, M F; Nkwinti, G E; Nobanda, G N; November, N T; Nqakula, C; Ntombela, M L D; Nxesi, T W; Nyambi, H V; Oliphant, M N; Oliphant, G G; Oosthuizen, G C; Pandor, G N M; Patel, E; Phaahla, M J; Phosa, Y N; Pikinini, I A; Pilane-Majake, M C C; Radebe, B A; Radebe, J T; Radebe, G S; Ralegoma, S M; Ramaphosa, M C; Ramatlakane, L; Ramatlhodi, N A; Rantho, D Z; Raphuti, D D; Semenya, M R;

Senokoanyane, D Z; September, C C; Shaik Emam, A M; Shope- Sithole, S C N; Sibande, M P; Sisulu, L N; Siwela, E K; Skosana, J J; Skwatsha, M; Smith, V G; Sotyu, M M; Surty, M E; Thomson, B; Tleane, S A; Tobias, T V; Tseke, G K; Tseli, R M; Tshwete, P; Tsoleli, S P; Tsotetsi, D R; Tuck, A; v R Koornhof, N J J; Van Der Merwe, L L; Van Schalkwyk, S R; Williams, A J; Xasa, T; Xego, S T; Yengeni, L E; Zokwana, S.

NOES - 65: Alberts, A; America, D; Atkinson, P G; Bagraim, M; Baker, T E; Basson, L J; Bergman, D; Boshoff, H S; Bozzoli, B; Brauteseth, T J; Breytenbach, G; Cardo, M J; Chance, R W T; De Freitas, M S F; De Kock, K; Edwards, J; Esau, S; Figg, M J; Figlan, A M; Groenewald, P J; Groenewald, H B; Grootboom, G A; Horn, W; Hunsinger, C H H; James, L V; James, W G; Jongbloed, Z; Kalyan, S V; Kohler, D; Kopane, S P; Kruger, H C C; Krumbock, G R; Lees, R A; Lorimer, J R B; Lotriet, A; Lovemore, A T; Mackenzie, C; Majola, T R; Malatsi, M S; Marais, S J F; Marais, E J; Masango, B S ; Matsepe, C D; Mazzone, N W A; Mbhele, Z N; Mhlongo, T W; Mulder, P W A; Mulder, C P; Ollis, I M; Rabotapi, M W; Redelinghuys, M H; Robertson, K P; Robinson, D; Schmidt, H C; Shinn, M R; Stubbe, D J; Tarabella Marchesi, N I; Topham, B R; Van Der Walt, D; Van Der Westhuizen, A P; Van Dyk, V; Volmink, H C; Vos, J; Waters, M; Wilson, E R.

Vote accordingly agreed to.

Vote no 10: Public Service and Administration - put

*Declaration(s) of Vote:*

Ms A T LOVEMORE: The public service has its own Chapter 10 constitutional oversight body, the Public Service Commission. The Supreme Court of Appeal and the Constitutional Court recently found that the recommendations of the Public Protector cannot be ignored. If this is the case, neither can the recommendations of the Public Service Commission – a very uncomfortable position for many less ―fan ethical‖ public servants.

The Public Service Commission runs the government‘s Anti- Corruption Hotline it also leads the National Anti-Corruption Forum. In addition, it investigates for corruption and unethical practices in the public service and it generates an annual fact sheet on financial misconduct. The Public Service Commission fights to ensure that tax payers money does not end up in the coffers of criminals and ends up servicing the poor people, the 8,9 million unemployed South Africans.

The commission is still independent; it still manages to do its investigations and report its very inconvenient findings without fear or favour. So, just when we have a Constitutional Court judgement that should have the effect of sharpening the teeth of the Public Service Commission, it has its wings clipped. The budget for the Public Service Commission‘s investigative and development work specifically on leadership has been reduced.

Even more troubling is the reduction in the budget for anticorruption activities. We cannot support a budget that so plainly does not support the crucial fight against corruption.

Mr M L D NTOMBELA: Hon House Chair, the ANC supports this Budget Vote. The Department of Public Service and Administration with its entities played a crucial role in building a state that is capable of realising its developmental and transformative role. The National Development Plan, NDP, highlighted key areas that the department must focus on in the building of the Department of Public Service and Administration of as a career of choice for all the 1,5 million public servants that are recruited into the administration machinery.

Given our historical background as a country, one would have never thought for a moment that the Department of Public Service and Administration would be what it is today. This should be a

feather in the cap of the ANC. It is indeed a feather in the cap of the ANC although the architects of this system of the homeland system that was supposed to have been amalgamated want us to forget where we come from which is not going to happen.

It is without doubt that the portfolio committee noted the progress made in implementing and coordinating interventions aimed at achieving an efficient, effective and developmental orientated public service.

1. think one should have an advice for the DA that it is time for members of the DA particularly, join the yoga because they always complain. That is the best thing that the DA can to, to complain. So it is about time they join the yoga so that they think positively rather than allowing their minds to wonder into million directions tapering into one thing; negativity. I think it is about time.

Hhayi, niyasihlupha. [Kwaphela isikhathi.] [You are giving us a problem. [Time expired.]]

Vote accordingly agreed to (Democratic Alliance dissenting).

Vote No 11: Public Works - put

*Declaration(s) Of Vote:*

Ms D KOHLER-BARNARD: Under the current government and because... [Interjections]

HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Order! hon members.

Ms D KOHLER-BARNARD... and because of the current government, we have 8,9 million people who do not have jobs, who live without dignity, without independence and without freedom in South Africa today and it is obvious that the ANC has no intention of implementing the structural reforms necessary to boost economic growth and create jobs. But there are work opportunities provided through the Expanded Public Works Programme, EPWP, which can make a difference to the lives of the unemployed.

In the ANC controlled parts of the country fighting corruption and the EPWP should be a priority for the Minister. I have proved to him that what was referred to as rumour is in fact the truth. Those who cannot produce an ANC membership card are turned away and this happens nation wide. Is the purpose of the EPWP to provide job opportunities to those in need or is to allow ANC councillors to offer unfettered and unmonitored largesse to unknown thousands?

These job opportunities should be available for all not just ANC cadres. The DA-led government in Cape Town has created tens of thousands of work opportunities winning praise and acclaim even from the current national government. We have made great progress in rooting out corruption and nepotism in the allocation of EPWP work opportunities using a fair database system, a system through which the private sector will also be able to recruit job seekers proving further opportunities for training and future employment.

The Auditor-General has questioned the department‘s EPWP data because it seems the same group of ANC cadres are given these jobs day after day year after year in ANC controlled areas. We can ensure a fair system and use the EPWP to give dignity and opportunity to those without jobs by the amendment of adding R1,2 billion to provide approximately 180 000 more work opportunities in 2016-17, but as you won‘t... [Inaudible.] [Time expired.]

Mr M L W FILTANE: House Chair, the UDM does support this budget but there are red lights flickering. The budget from monitoring has been reduced and this is likely to compromise the effectiveness of such an important division of the department. Mthatha High Court still needs attention, I must reiterate. The

recent events around the country, and in particular Vuwani, points us in one direction and that is the urgent and absolute need for the department to begin to think seriously on two aspects, the first one being alternative building materials that are more fire resistant. I know that it is not something can be implemented this very year but begin to think in that direction. Secondly, the appointment, permanently of social facilitators – I nearly said social workers – who will be in the immediate precincts of all government structures. That will help for people to have a sense of ownership of government precincts.

Transformation report of the Construction Industry Development Board, CIDB, points in one direction that there is very little transformation taking place in the space of public works and this needs urgent attention.

Lastly, you need to have closer working relationship with the municipalities, especially in the sphere of the bad use of the Expanded Public Works Programme budget by municipalities. It need closer attention, otherwise you are not going to have positive results come end of this financial year. I thank you.

Mr B A D MARTINS: Hon House Chairperson the ANC supports Vote

11. The Department of Public Works‘ turnaround strategy of

stabilisation, efficiency, enhancement and sustainable growth continues to yield positive results. The department maintained its unqualified audit opinion in the 2014-15 financial year.

The department continues to execute its mandate to ensure decent employment through inclusive economic growth. Secondly, the provision of strategic leadership and the regulation of the construction and property sectors to promote economic empowerment and skills development. Thirdly, to ensure good corporate governance to support effective and efficient service delivery. Fourthly, to ensure an efficient competitive and responsive accommodation infrastructure network and lastly to contribute towards comprehensive rural development. I thank you.

Division demanded.

The House divided.

AYES - 196: Abrahams, B L; Adams, F; Adams, P E; Basson, J V; Bekwa, S D; Beukman, F; Bhengu, P; Bhengu, F; Bhengu, N R; Bilankulu, N K; Bogopane-Zulu, H I; Bongo, B T; Boroto, M G; Brown, L; Buthelezi, N S; Capa, R N; Capa, N; Carrim, Y I; Cebekhulu, R N; Cele, B H; Cele, M A; Chauke, H P; Chikunga, L S; Chiloane, T D; Chohan, F I; Chueu, M P; Coleman, E M; Cronin,

1. P; Cwele, S C; Didiza, A T; Dirks, M A; Dlakude, D E; Dlamini- Dubazana, Z S; Dunjwa, M L; Ebrahim, E I; Faku, Z C; Filtane, M L W; Fubbs, J L; Gamede, D D; Gcwabaza, N E; Gigaba, K M N; Gina, N; Goqwana, M B; Gordhan, P J; Gumede, D M; Jeffery, J H; Johnson, M; Kalako, M U; Kekana, H B; Kekana, P S; Kekana, C D; Kekana, E; Kekana, M D; Kenye, T E; Khoarai, L P; Khosa, D H; Khoza, T Z M; Khoza, M B; Koornhof, G W; Kubayi, M T; Lesoma, R M M; Loliwe, F S; Luzipo, S; Maake, J J; Mabasa, X; Mabe, B P; Mabe, P P; Mabija, L; Mabilo, S P; Mabudafhasi, T R; Madella, A F; Madlopha, C Q; Maesela, P; Mafolo, M V; Mafu, N N; Magadla, N W; Magadzi, D P; Magwanishe, G; Mahambehlala, T; Mahlalela, A F; Mahlangu, J L; Mahlangu, D G; Majola, F Z; Makhubela-Mashele, L S; Makhubele, Z S; Makondo, T; Makwetla, S P; Malgas, H H; Maluleke, J M; Maluleke, B J; Manana, D P; Manana, M N S; Mandela, Z M D; Mantashe, P T; Maphatsoe, E R K; Mapulane, M P; Martins, B A D; Masango, M S A; Masehela, E K M; Mashego- Dlamini, K C; Mashile, B L; Masondo, N A; Masuku, M B; Maswanganyi, M J; Mathale, C C; Mathebe, D H; Matlala, M H; Matshoba, M O; Matsimbi, C; Mavunda, R T; Maxegwana, C H M; Mbalula, F A; Mchunu, S; Memela, T C; Mjobo, L N; Mkhize, H B; Mmemezi, H M Z; Mmola, M P; Mmusi, S G; Mnganga - Gcabashe, L A; Mnguni, P J; Mnguni, D; Mnisi, N A; Mogotsi, V P; Mokoto, N R; Molebatsi, M A; Molewa, B E E; Morutoa, M R; Mothapo, M R M; Motimele, M S; Motshekga, M A; Motshekga, M S; Motsoaledi, P A;

Mpumlwana, L K B; Mthembu, J M; Mthembu, N; Mthethwa, E M; Mudau, A M; Nchabeleng, M E; Ndaba, C N; Ndongeni, N; Newhoudt- Druchen, W S; Ngcobo, B T; Ngwenya-Mabila, P C; Nkadimeng, M F; Nkwinti, G E; Nobanda, G N; November, N T; Nqakula, C; Ntombela, M L D; Nxesi, T W; Nyambi, H V; Oliphant, M N; Oosthuizen, G C; Pandor, G N M; Patel, E; Phaahla, M J; Phosa, Y N; Pikinini, I A; Pilane-Majake, M C C; Radebe, B A; Radebe, J T; Radebe, G S; Ralegoma, S M; Ramaphosa, M C; Ramatlakane, L; Ramatlhodi, N A; Rantho, D Z; Raphuti, D D; Semenya, M R; Senokoanyane, D Z; September, C C; Shaik Emam, A M; Shope-Sithole, S C N; Sibande, M P; Sisulu, L N; Sithole, K P; Siwela, E K; Skosana, J J; Skwatsha, M; Smith, V G; Surty, M E; Thomson, B; Tleane, S A; Tobias, T V; Tseke, G K; Tseli, R M; Tshwete, P; Tsoleli, S P; Tuck, A; v R Koornhof, N J J; Van Schalkwyk, S R; Williams, A J; Xasa, T; Yengeni, L E; Zokwana, S.

NOES - 58: America, D; Atkinson, P G; Bagraim, M; Basson, L J; Bergman, D; Boshoff, H S; Bozzoli, B; Brauteseth, T J; Breytenbach, G; Cardo, M J; Chance, R W T; De Freitas, M S F; De Kock, K; Edwards, J; Esau, S; Figg, M J; Figlan, A M; Groenewald, H B; Grootboom, G A; Horn, W; Hunsinger, C H H; James, L V; Jongbloed, Z; Kalyan, S V; Kohler, D; Kruger, H C C; Krumbock, G R; Lorimer, J R B; Lotriet, A; Lovemore, A T; Mackay, G; Mackenzie, C; Majola, T R; Malatsi, M S; Marais, S J

F; Marais, E J; Masango, B S ; Matsepe, C D; Mbhele, Z N; Mhlongo, T W; Ollis, I M; Rabotapi, M W; Redelinghuys, M H; Robertson, K P; Robinson, D; Schmidt, H C; Shinn, M R; Stubbe, D J; Tarabella Marchesi, N I; Topham, B R; Van Damme, P T; Van Der Walt, D; Van Der Westhuizen, A P; Van Dyk, V; Volmink, H C; Vos, J; Waters, M; Wilson, E R.

Vote accordingly agreed to.

Vote 12 - Statistics SA - put

*Declarations of vote*:

Mr E J MARAIS: Chairperson, some good news on my right hand site, the DA supports Budget Vote 12: Statistics SA. Statistics SA plays a central role in the implementation of the National Development Plan by the government. So, the proper functioning of Statistics SA is of the crucial importance for South Africa‘s future.

Transforming the economy and creating sustainable expansion for job creation means that the right of economic growth need to succeed 5% a year on average. It is clear our growth is stuck at less than 2%. The biggest challenge our country faces is not

better statistical reporting, but government‘s lack of way to actually implement the National Development Plan, NDP.

Statistics SA can deliver the method; an indicator to inform that progress is inadequate. The NDP must implement to address economic infrastructure to boost economic growth and to address unemployment, 8,9 million people are unemployed. There must be greater signage between the NDP, Statistics SA, strategic plans and the allocation of the budget to departments for South Africa to move forward. Thank you. [Applause.]

Ms Z S DLAMINI-DUBAZANA: Hon House Chair ...

... u-ANC usukumela ukubonga kwi-DA ukuthi kukhona nokho into abayivumayo ukuthi cha ivoti unombolo ishumi nambili mayibekhona ngoba impela awukho uHulumeni ongaphatha ngaphandle kobufakazi obunokwehla, okuwulwazi. Ngakho siwuKhongolose sithi siyabonga bandla kusho ukuthi sekukhona uguquko ngoba besidinga nina.

Siyabonga. *(Translation of isiZulu paragraph follows.)*

[... we as the ANC rise to thank the DA for supporting Budget Vote 12 because no government can lead without the empirical evidence which is the data. Therefore, as the ANC, we are saying

thank you; this means that there is change because we needed you. Thank you.]

Vote accordingly agreed to.

Vote 13 – Women – put

*Declarations of vote*:

Ms D ROBINSON: While the DA supports the mandate of the Department of Women in the Presidency in securing women‘s rights, gender equality and the development of women socio- economic opportunities, we cannot support a budget that will not allocate resources effectively.

An amount of R69,9 million is transferred to the Commission for Gender Equality, leaving the department with the small operating budget of R127 million, unfortunately and misguidedly, 70% of this operating budget and 71% of personnel are allocated to administration instead of focusing on improving the plight of women at grassroots level. As a result, the core mandates of Programmes 2 and 3 are neglected.

The gender mainstreaming framework and gender responsive budget have still not been completed. So how can the progress of other

departments be evaluated. This department is failing the women of South Africa. Even the dyer state of the economy, the high rate of unemployment and the devastating increase in food prices, the DA feels that the budget allocated to the Department of Women could be used more effectively to increase social grants, which provide a life lunch over 17 million citizens.

The ANC voted against the constructive budget amendments by the DA that would improve the lives of people who was struggling to survive. Vulnerable South Africans deserve a better deal than the ANC is prepared to give them.

The budget of the Department of Women can be utilised to better effect to increase social grants and help the poor. We reject Budget Vote 13. [Applause.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Are there any further declarations?

Ms P BHENGU: Yes, ANC.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): I am just waiting for the members of the NFP. May I request members who want to make

declarations to move to the waiting benches please? It saves time. Please continue.

Mr A M SHAIK-EMAM: Hon Chairperson, the NFP supports this budget. Emancipation of women is very important. Protecting our women is very important. So supporting this budget is very important. So, I don‘t understand what my colleague is complaining about. Be that as it may.

The NFP calls the department to take responsibility and ensure that they accelerate the emancipation of women in South Africa. One out of every four women in South Africa is in an abuse of relationship. Every six days a woman in South Africa is murdered by an intimate partner.

Every 25 seconds, a woman or girl is raped in South Africa. Nothing has happened for 300 years. Somebody says nothing is happening right now. It is the socioeconomic conditions under which our people live after having been oppressed for 300 years. This is the society we are living.

So, a lot has to be done and we must appreciate; only so much can be done in 22 years. What we find is the issue of maintenance seems to be a serious problem, especially in those

that are self employ and do not able to trace that income. And we find that our girls and ladies have to go repeatedly to these courts – there are long queues and spend a hell of time there, often men for not wanting to pay maintenance end up saying it‘s not my child – it‘s unaffordable for them to do test. And I am sure the Minister of Health is here. He is sitting and listening and he is going to do something about it.

The NFP will support this, but calls on the department to do a lot more to protect our women and the rights of our women. Thank you very much.

Ms P BHENGU: Chairperson, the Portfolio Committee on Women in the Presidency having considered the Annual Performance Plan, APP, and budgets of the department to responsible for women for 2016-17 as well as the Commission of Gender and Equality‘s Annual Performance Plan respectively.

According to the department‘s policy priorities for 2016-17, the department has indicated and is focus over the medium-term will be directed on three core areas, which is analysing and monitor policy and providing knowledge, mainstreaming women socioeconomic empowerment, awareness raising an outreach programme. As a department, we will host the number of awareness

initiatives through the country on a quarterly annual and once off basis such as 365 days of violence against women.

The department has only received a budgetary allocation of R196 million for 2016-17 financial year. Of this R69 million goes to the Commission on Gender Equality, CGE, with the department left with the operating budget of R127 million.

Although there is a R6 million more than in the previous financial year, but this department needs more money so as to employ more personnel so as to make sure that it monitor all the budgets and programmes in all the departments to ensure that all the lives of women are improved through service rendered by this ANC-let government and to monitor at provincial district and local municipalities that women issues are taken serious.

So what the DA hon Robinson is saying is grandstanding as we all members of the committee, we upgrade that the department needs more funding to fulfil its mandate and meets its target. So, the ANC supports the budget. Thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon members, I now put the vote. Are there any objections? [Interjections.] No objections.

Mr M WATERS: Yes.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): There is an objection. I now put the question. Those in favour will say Aye. [Interjections.] And those against will say Noe. [Interjections.] I think the Ayes have it.

Mr M WATERS: Chairperson, please note the objection of the DA. Thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): The objection will be noted and the vote is thus agreed to.

Vote 14 – Basic Education – put.

*Declaration(s) of Vote:*

Ms D VAN DER WALT (DA): House Chair, the huge unemployment rate amongst the youth, the decline in the 2015 matric results and the collapse of education in Limpopo, Eastern Cape and KwaZulu- Natal, KZN, is proof that we are going backwards. The jobs for cash report indicates that six out of nine provincial departments have been captured by Sadtu and if the Minister does not limit the power of Sadtu immediately, the government will continue failing to deliver on education.

We note that in 2017-18 the School Infrastructure Grant will shift to the Education Grant and funds will be transferred to provinces. We will continue to plea that such funds be conditional and that the spending thereof be closely monitored due to a very poor delivery history on projects. The growing inequality between our quintile one and five schools must be addressed with urgency. We have our misgivings about Operation Phakisa as we do not know where the money is going to come from for all the ICT projects.

We saw new schools bought and completed through the Accelerated Schools Infrastructure Delivery, Asidi, 171 now down to 136.

Sanitation is down from 410 and water provision is also down. We see no growth in programme three which works and deals with the improvement of the quality of teaching and learning to enhance accountability. We have some concerns about the increased expenditure for consultants, legal fees, travel and subsistence and there is no adequate plan nor allocation for disasters such as the one we recently experienced in Vuwani, Limpopo. The business as usual approach is not going to solve our country‘s education crisis and we cannot support this budget. [Applause.]

Mr M L W FILTANE (UDM): I come here for one message to the Minister of Basic Education. Your co-operation is critically

important in the development of sports in this country. So far the reports we are getting in another vote are that your department is not coming to the party. We have gone past the stage of asking why, we insist that you need to reshape your programmes such that your department comes to the party. Sport is suffering because your department is just not coming to the party, however, the UDM will still support.

Ms A M SHAIK-EMAM (NFP): Hon House Chair, the NFP supports the Budget Vote. [Applause.] Hon Chair, we just have a few challenges and I am glad that the Minister is here. Minister, one of the things that we found is that the quintile system seems to be marginalising certain learners because you may be in a privileged area but you may still be coming from an underprivileged background. I will give an example of Wentworth, Austerville in Durban which is a very underprivileged area and you will find that there are learners there who come from townships but because the school does not qualify, those kids are deprived. So, I think that is one of the things we need to look at.

I also think of the issue of nutrition tenders which seems to have been a challenge. But we do welcome your announcement that one school will be delivered every week. We also call on a co-

ordinated effort between the Department of Health, the Department of Education including the Department of Sport so that we can develop these learners into full grown youths that will some day become an asset to this country; in saying that the NFP will support this vote. [Applause.]

Nk N GINA (ANC): Sihlalo siwuKhongolose siyalusekela uhlahlo- zimali olubekwe phambi kweNdlu. Silusekela ngezizathu ezilandelayo: Emlandweni wethu siqala ukubona ukuthi uMnyango Wezemfundo uzama ukuvala igebe phakathi kwabantu abahluphekayo nalabo abadla izambane likapondo. Okokuqala lapho sibona izikole zethu zakhiwa ziba seqophelweni ezakhiwa ngalo okusho ukuthi laba abaphikisayo bangeke bakuthande ngoba angeke bakuthokozele ukuthi baficwe lapho bekhona.

Sibona izikole zethu kulolu hlahlo-zimali sazi ukuthi lezo zikole ezihlwempu ziyadla ukuze izingane zethu zihlale zisesikoleni. Sihlalo, siyabona imiphumela yezemfundo ikhuphuka ngendlela ongakaze uyibone. Siyabezwa abantu abathanda ukuphikisa njalo bezobuka amaphesenti kodwa uma ubuka inani kanye neqophelo lemiphumela esiyikhiphayo njengamanje siyiNingizimu Afrika, iyabonisa ukuthi lolu hlahlo-zimali lusafuna ukuthi luthathe izwe lethu liye phambili ukuze siqhubeke sikwazi ukushintsha izimpilo zabantu, siqhubeke

sikwazi ukufinyelela la kunezidingo khona ikakhulukazi kulabo bantu abahlala ezindaweni zasemapulazini kanye nalabo bantu abakade besalele emuva iminyaka eminingi.

Lolu hlahlo-zimali esize ngalo namhlanje yilelo esithi ngempela lizokwazi ukusithatha siyephambili njengezwe, yilelo esithi liyakwazi ukuhambisana nomqulo wenqubekelo phambili yenthuthuko i-NDP yaseNingizimu Afrika. Siyabona ukuthi ngo-2030 uma njengezwe singalandela lolu hlahlo-zimali, silandele izinhlelo umnyango oza nazo, izwe lethu siyobe silibeke phambili bese ngaleyo ndlela sikwazi ukushintsha izimpilo zabantu zibe ngcono ngokwezemfundo ngoba siyazi ukuthi izwe elingafundile, izwe elingakwazi ukunakekela intsha yalo alisoze laqhubekela phambili. Sithi nje siyalusekela kakhulu lolu hlahlo-zimali esihlangene ngalo namhlanje. Ngiyabonga. [Ihlombe.] *(Translation in isiZulu paragraph follows.)*

[Ms N GINA (ANC): Chairperson, we as the ANC, supports the Budget Vote that is presented in this House. We support it due to the following reasons: It is the first time in history where the Department of Education closes the gap between the poor and the rich students. It is the first time where our schools are built in a high quality which means that the opposition parties

would not like this because they don‘t want to be reached where they are.

In this Budget Vote we see the poor schools now having feeding schemes in order for our children to be always present at school. Chairperson, we see education results increasing than before. People that always oppose us would look at the percentage but if you look at the number and the quality of the results that we produce in South Africa now, this is an indication that this Budget Vote our country should take it further to change the peoples lives, and to assist where there are needs especially to those people who still live in the farms and those who were left behind for many years.

This Budget Vote that we are debating about today, will take us further as a country, it is the one that we are saying it goes together with the National Development Plan (NDP) of South africa. We see that by 2030 if we use this budget review, and use the programmes that the department is introducing, we would move our country forward and change the people‘s lives to be better through education, because we know that a nation with no education, is a nation that cannot take care of their youth, it can never move forward. We accordingly support this Budget Vote. Thank you. [Applause.]]

Division demanded.

The House divided.

AYES - 203: Abrahams, B L; Adams, F; Adams, P E; Basson, J V; Bekwa, S D; Beukman, F; Bhengu, P; Bhengu, F; Bhengu, N R; Bilankulu, N K; Bogopane-Zulu, H I; Bongo, B T; Boroto, M G; Buthelezi, N S; Capa, R N; Capa, N; Carrim, Y I; Cebekhulu, R N; Cele, B H; Cele, M A; Chauke, H P; Chikunga, L S; Chiloane, T D; Chohan, F I; Chueu, M P; Coleman, E M; Cronin, J P; Cwele, S C; Didiza, A T; Dirks, M A; Dlakude, D E; Dlamini-Dubazana, Z S; Dlulane, B N; Dunjwa, M L; Ebrahim, E I; Esterhuizen, J A; Faku, Z C; Filtane, M L W; Fubbs, J L; Gamede, D D; Gcwabaza, N E; Gigaba, K M N; Gina, N; Goqwana, M B; Gordhan, P J; Gumede, D M; Holomisa, S P; Jeffery, J H; Johnson, M; Jonas, M H; Kalako, M U; Kekana, H B; Kekana, P S; Kekana, M D; Kekana, E; Kekana, C D; Kenye, T E; Khoarai, L P; Khosa, D H; Khoza, T Z M; Khoza, M B; Khunou, N P; Koornhof, G W; Kubayi, M T; Lesoma, R M M; Loliwe, F S; Luzipo, S; Maake, J J; Mabasa, X; Mabe, B P; Mabe, P P; Mabija, L; Mabilo, S P; Mabudafhasi, T R; Madella, A F; Madlopha, C Q; Maesela, P; Mafolo, M V; Mafu, N N; Magadla, N W; Magadzi, D P; Magwanishe, G; Mahambehlala, T; Mahlalela, A F; Mahlangu, J L; Mahlangu, D G; Majola, F Z; Makhubela-Mashele, L S; Makhubele, Z S; Makondo, T; Makwetla, S P; Malgas, H H;

Maluleke, J M; Maluleke, B J; Manana, D P; Manana, M N S;

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Mandela, | Z M D; Mantashe, P T; Maphatsoe, E R K; | Mapulane, M P; |
| Martins, | B A D; Masango, M S A; Masehela, E | K M; Mashego- |

Dlamini, K C; Mashile, B L; Masondo, N A; Masuku, M B; Maswanganyi, M J; Mathale, C C; Mathebe, D H; Matlala, M H; Matshoba, M O; Matsimbi, C; Mavunda, R T; Maxegwana, C H M;

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Mbalula, F A; Mchunu, S; | Memela, T C; Mjobo, L | N; Mkhize, | H | B; |
| Mmemezi, H M Z; Mmola, M | P; Mmusi, S G; Mnganga | - Gcabashe, | L | A; |
| Mnguni, P J; Mnguni, D; | Mnisi, N A; Mogotsi, V | P; Mokoto, | N | R; |
| Molebatsi, M A; Molewa, | B E E; Morutoa, M R; | Mothapo, M | R | M; |

Motimele, M S; Motshekga, M A; Motshekga, M S; Motsoaledi, P A; Mpumlwana, L K B; Msimang, C T; Mthembu, J M; Mthethwa, E M; Mudau, A M; Nchabeleng, M E; Ndaba, C N; Ndongeni, N; Newhoudt- Druchen, W S; Ngcobo, B T; Ngwenya-Mabila, P C; Nkadimeng, M F; Nkwinti, G E; Nobanda, G N; November, N T; Nqakula, C; Ntombela, M L D; Nxesi, T W; Nyambi, H V; Oliphant, M N; Oosthuizen, G C; Pandor, G N M; Patel, E; Phaahla, M J; Phosa, Y N; Pikinini, I A; Pilane-Majake, M C C; Radebe, B A; Radebe, J T; Radebe, G S; Ralegoma, S M; Ramaphosa, M C; Ramatlakane, L; Ramatlhodi, N A; Rantho, D Z; Raphuti, D D; Semenya, M R; Senokoanyane, D Z; September, C C; Shaik Emam, A M; Shope-Sithole, S C N; Sibande, M P; Sisulu, L N; Sithole, K P; Siwela, E K; Skosana, J J; Skwatsha, M; Smith, V G; Surty, M E; Tleane, S A; Tobias, T V; Tseke, G K; Tseli, R M; Tsenoli, S L; Tshwete, P; Tsoleli, S P;

Tsotetsi, D R; Tuck, A; v R Koornhof, N J J; Van Der Merwe, L L; Van Schalkwyk, S R; Williams, A J; Xasa, T; Xego, S T; Yengeni, L E; Zokwana, S.

NOES - 58: America, D; Atkinson, P G; Bagraim, M; Baker, T E; Basson, L J; Bergman, D; Boshoff, H S; Bozzoli, B; Brauteseth, T J; Breytenbach, G; Cardo, M J; Chance, R W T; De Kock, K; Edwards, J; Esau, S; Figg, M J; Figlan, A M; Groenewald, H B; Grootboom, G A; Horn, W; Hunsinger, C H H; James, L V; James, W G; Jongbloed, Z; Kalyan, S V; Kohler, D; Kopane, S P; Kruger, H C C; Krumbock, G R; Lees, R A; Lorimer, J R B; Lotriet, A; Lovemore, A T; Mackay, G; Mackenzie, C; Majola, T R; Malatsi, M

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| S; Marais, | S J F; Masango, | B S ; Matsepe, C D; Mbhele, | Z | N; |
| Mhlongo, T | W; Ollis, I M; | Rabotapi, M W; Redelinghuys, | M | H; |
| Robertson, | K P; Schmidt, H | C; Shinn, M R; Steenhuisen, | J | H; |

Tarabella Marchesi, N I; Topham, B R; Van Damme, P T; Van Der Walt, D; Van Der Westhuizen, A P; Van Dyk, V; Volmink, H C; Vos, J; Waters, M.

Vote accordingly agreed to.

Vote 15 – Higher Education and Training – put.

*Declaration(s) of Vote*

Prof B BOZZOLI (DA): The ANC wants us to become a developmental state like the Asian tigers. However, the development state idea is not going that well because of the many failures of government that we see all around us. One of these failures is in the field of higher education. Today, the leading example of a developmental state is China. But China spends 3% of its DGP on higher education. This has enabled China to move from a position where no universities exited tour after the Cultural Revolution to one where today its top universities compete on an equal basis with the best of the world.

Our higher education budget by contrast fails miserably. The public knows that we spend a lot on basic education but as far as higher education is concerned, we spend a mere 0,76% of DGP on universities and 1,55% of GDP on all higher education institutions and student loans. We are no where near the proportion required by developing countries and let alone a developmental state. Of that budget a stagnation proportion is allocation is allocated to universities while far too little is provided for student loans and bursaries. Is it any wonder that our universities are burning? We have tried to be constructive and we proposed amendments to the main budget to put an additional R2 billion into student funding as well as an

additional R730 million into university subsidies. These amendments are being rejected by the ANC and committee.

We are appalled that the ANC government would rather let our universities burn and our students go hungry than giving the extra resources that we proposed. This country will never develop without the higher level person power produced in higher education institutions. The DA unequivocally rejects this budget. [Applause.]

Mr A M SHAIK-EMAM (NPF): Hon House Chair, by rejecting the budget I would imagine that no students will go to university next year and so nobody will go forward. So, I do not understand the logic behind it but anyway. [Applause.] Hon Chairperson, one of the concerns we have with regards to the National Student Financial Aid Scheme, NSFAS, funding is that I think the issue of collecting loans that have been issued needs to be managed a lot better. The other challenge that I think we want to express on is the issue of the curriculum. We find that a lot of the curriculum in tertiary institutions is not based on the skills- needs of the country.

Just yesterday we heard the President talk about R19 million or so in the health sector for nurses and medical professional jobs

that we will need by 2030. I think that we need to encourage tertiary institutions to take in learners based on the curriculum needs of our country so that we can address skills shortage and also export those skills so that we can reduce the unemployment rate that we seem to be having. In line with that the NFP believes that this budget must be supported because it is in the interest of every learner that is going to tertiary institutions. So, we support it. Thank you. [Applause.]

Mr C D KEKANA (ANC): Chair, the ANC supports this Budget Vote. First of all right from the beginning it must be clear that the ANC stands for a philosophy of a socioeconomic approach. In other words we stand for nothing else but poverty that has been caused by two people: The DA and the National Party. [Applause.] Because we want to say that poverty is as high as it is because of our past caused by the DA and the National Party, there will never be peace in South Africa.

Poverty is the cause not of the ANC ... [Interjections.] ... – we are going to support this budget unlike the DA that opposes the budget. All the burnings that are talking place at universities, all the social maladjustments like juvenile delinquency and crime throughout the country is caused by poverty as a result of inferior education and the oppression of

apartheid that we come from. [Interjections.] To address that there is a 9% increase on the budget which brings the budget to a total of R67 000 billion and that is going to be used for poor students through NSFAS. Last year for NSFAS and poor students were allocated R7 billion out of R9 billion. The ANC supports this budget because we are mopping up the mess that was created by the people on my right. Thank you very much. [Applause.]

Division demanded.

The House divided.

AYES - 206: Abrahams, B L; Adams, F; Adams, P E; Basson, J V; Bekwa, S D; Beukman, F; Bhengu, P; Bhengu, F; Bhengu, N R; Bilankulu, N K; Bogopane-Zulu, H I; Bongo, B T; Boroto, M G; Brown, L; Buthelezi, N S; Capa, R N; Capa, N; Carrim, Y I; Cebekhulu, R N; Cele, B H; Cele, M A; Chauke, H P; Chikunga, L S; Chiloane, T D; Chohan, F I; Chueu, M P; Coleman, E M; Cronin, J P; Cwele, S C; Didiza, A T; Dirks, M A; Dlamini-Dubazana, Z S; Dlulane, B N; Dunjwa, M L; Ebrahim, E I; Esterhuizen, J A; Faku, Z C; Filtane, M L W; Fubbs, J L; Gamede, D D; Gcwabaza, N E; Gigaba, K M N; Gina, N; Goqwana, M B; Gordhan, P J; Gumede, D M; Holomisa, S P; Jeffery, J H; Johnson, M; Jonas, M H; Kalako, M U; Kekana, H B; Kekana, P S; Kekana, M D; Kekana, E; Kekana, C

D; Kenye, T E; Khoarai, L P; Khosa, D H; Khoza, T Z M; Khoza, M B; Khunou, N P; Koornhof, G W; Kubayi, M T; Lesoma, R M M; Loliwe, F S; Luzipo, S; Maake, J J; Mabasa, X; Mabe, B P; Mabe, P P; Mabija, L; Mabilo, S P; Mabudafhasi, T R; Madella, A F; Madlopha, C Q; Maesela, P; Mafolo, M V; Mafu, N N; Magadla, N W; Magadzi, D P; Magwanishe, G; Mahambehlala, T; Mahlalela, A F; Mahlangu, J L; Mahlangu, D G; Majola, F Z; Makhubela-Mashele, L S; Makhubele, Z S; Makondo, T; Makwetla, S P; Malgas, H H; Maluleke, J M; Maluleke, B J; Manana, D P; Manana, M N S; Mandela, Z M D; Mantashe, P T; Maphatsoe, E R K; Mapulane, M P; Martins, B A D; Masango, M S A; Masehela, E K M; Mashego- Dlamini, K C; Mashile, B L; Masondo, N A; Masuku, M B; Maswanganyi, M J; Mathale, C C; Mathebe, D H; Matlala, M H; Matshoba, M O; Matsimbi, C; Mavunda, R T; Maxegwana, C H M; Mbalula, F A; Mchunu, S; Mdakane, M R; Memela, T C; Mjobo, L N; Mkhize, H B; Mmemezi, H M Z; Mmola, M P; Mmusi, S G; Mnganga - Gcabashe, L A; Mnguni, P J; Mnguni, D; Mnisi, N A; Mogotsi, V P; Mokoto, N R; Molebatsi, M A; Molewa, B E E; Morutoa, M R; Mothapo, M R M; Motimele, M S; Motshekga, M A; Motshekga, M S; Motsoaledi, P A; Mpumlwana, L K B; Msimang, C T; Mthembu, J M; Mthembu, N; Mthethwa, E M; Mudau, A M; Nchabeleng, M E; Ndaba, C N; Ndongeni, N; Newhoudt-Druchen, W S; Ngcobo, B T; Ngwenya- Mabila, P C; Nkadimeng, M F; Nkwinti, G E; Nobanda, G N; November, N T; Nqakula, C; Ntombela, M L D; Nxesi, T W; Nyambi,

H V; Oliphant, M N; Oliphant, G G; Oosthuizen, G C; Pandor, G N M; Patel, E; Phaahla, M J; Phosa, Y N; Pikinini, I A; Pilane- Majake, M C C; Radebe, B A; Radebe, J T; Radebe, G S; Ralegoma, S M; Ramaphosa, M C; Ramatlakane, L; Ramatlhodi, N A; Rantho, D Z; Raphuti, D D; Semenya, M R; Senokoanyane, D Z; September, C C; Shaik Emam, A M; Shope-Sithole, S C N; Sibande, M P; Sisulu, L N; Sithole, K P; Siwela, E K; Skosana, J J; Skwatsha, M; Smith, V G; Surty, M E; Thomson, B; Tleane, S A; Tobias, T V; Tseke, G K; Tseli, R M; Tsenoli, S L; Tsoleli, S P; Tsotetsi, D R; Tuck, A; v R Koornhof, N J J; Van Der Merwe, L L; Van Schalkwyk, S R; Williams, A J; Xasa, T; Xego, S T; Yengeni, L E; Zokwana, S.

NOES - 60: America, D; Atkinson, P G; Bagraim, M; Baker, T E; Basson, L J; Bergman, D; Boshoff, H S; Bozzoli, B; Brauteseth, T J; Breytenbach, G; Cardo, M J; Chance, R W T; De Freitas, M S F; De Kock, K; Edwards, J; Esau, S; Figg, M J; Figlan, A M; Groenewald, H B; Grootboom, G A; Horn, W; Hunsinger, C H H; James, W G; James, L V; Jongbloed, Z; Kalyan, S V; Kohler, D; Kruger, H C C; Krumbock, G R; Lees, R A; Lorimer, J R B; Lotriet, A; Lovemore, A T; Mackay, G; Mackenzie, C; Majola, T R; Malatsi, M S; Marais, S J F; Masango, B S ; Matsepe, C D; Mbhele, Z N; Mhlongo, T W; Ollis, I M; Rabotapi, M W; Redelinghuys, M H; Robertson, K P; Robinson, D; Schmidt, H C;

Shinn, M R; Steenhuisen, J H; Stubbe, D J; Tarabella Marchesi, N I; Topham, B R; Van Damme, P T; Van Der Walt, D; Van Der Westhuizen, A P; Van Dyk, V; Volmink, H C; Vos, J; Waters, M.

Vote accordingly agreed to.

Vote 16 – Health – put.

*Declaration(s) of Vote:*

Dr W G JAMES (DA): House Chair, the Department of Health budget is a reason and a response to our disease burden and our national priority. An amount of R1 billion more is set aside for the expansion of the ARV programme, R740 million added to strengthen out TB programmes and 4, 5 billion for revitalising our facilities and more funds set aside for new substance abuse treatment centres in the Northern Cape, Free State, Western Cape and the North West. It is a rational thing to support the budget and we do but the Minister has to take both steps.

Two weeks ago I visited Mangaung hospitals and found out that none of them had hot water. It has been like that for three years. In both KZN and Free State life support medical equipment has not been serviced for the last two years. Clinics and hospitals are desperately understaffed; medical waste systems

are dysfunctional in the Free State, Gauteng, Limpopo and the North West. I petitioned the Auditor General, AG to investigate. AG Makwetu decided to include medical waste governance in provincial audits.

Today I wrote to the office of the health standards compliance to do a performance audit at the very moment when medical waste washed out overnight on the beaches of Durban. It does not help Minister, to call our overworked nurses white devils. The health professionals are your strength. Your weakness is the inability of the ANC MECs to spend health budget honestly and diligently. The DA supports this budget but it is time that the Minister summons the courage to call the ANC MECs to order. I thank you.

Mr A M SHAIK-EMAM (NFP): Hon House Chair let me start off by commending the Minister of Health for the job well done. [Applause.] You know Minister one must have outmost respect for you when you say that I can go out there and put dialysis mechanic throughout the country but my people will still die. I don‘t want them to die; I want to know why they are dying. And your principle of prevention rather than cure must be welcomed hon Minister. [Applause.]

Your intervention Minister with regard to the rollout of ARVs to now almost 4 million people in the country which has also reduced the new infection rate clearly indicates that your department is moving in the right direction. Your further intervention with regard to TB, HIV and now the stunts with respect to diabetics which will not only take in this particular country but in the Southern African Development Community, SADC region and in Africa and again it must be welcomed.

Yourself and together with global TB, the job that you seem to be doing there, again it must be welcomed. I think you must be congratulated on your commitment and dedication in trying to create a healthy life for our people. [Applause.] The introduction of the sugar tax hon Minister, I want reiterate, and we must ensure that a lot of that money goes toward preventing diabetics and awareness on the challenges that our country faces in terms of diabetics. We don‘t want that money now to be lost fiscus for every other thing other than diabetics. The NFP supports this budget. [Applause.]

Ms M L DUNJWA (ANC): Hon House Chair, we stand here as the ANC to support Vote 16. We support it precisely because the Department of Health led by the Minister, has managed in the

last financial year to have 2000 *Ward based Outreach Teams*. We are saying this ...

... kuba siyayazi ukuba xa sime apha, inkangeleko yezibhedlela neeklinikhi ivuselelwe (revitalisation.). Namhlanje abantu bema apha bathi oko kwaphatha i-ANC yaba bubutyobo. Eli sebe lilungisa kanye obo butyobo kuba kaloku abanye abantu babeqeqeshwa, besongiwa ngokwebala labo. Siyabacela abantu ukuba bayazi into yokuba iSebe lezoNyango eMpuma Koloni, Freyistatha nakwaZulu-Natal, lakhe iiklinikhi zoluntu ezingama-24 namaziko okuqinisekisa ukuba abongikazi baqeqeshwa ngokufanelekileyo. *(Translation of isiXhosa paragraph follows.*

[... because we know when we stand here, the appearance of hospitals and clinics is revitalised. Today people stand here and say since ANC took over it is a mess. This department is fixing exactly that mess because some people were trained, cared for by looking at the colour of their skin. People must please know that Department of Health in Eastern Cape, Free State and KwaZulu-Natal, has built 24 community clinics and institutions to ensure that nurses get proper training.]

It has 167 health facilities which are currently under going revitalisation; these are earmarked to be completed in 2017.

Uyabona ke mna ndingowaseBhayi, ... [I am from Port Elizabeth,

...]

... If you go to Dora Nginza, you have what you call the state of the art paediatric hospital. We also have the state of the art psychiatric hospital there.

Siyabacela abantu bakuthi ukuba bangalahli imbo yabo ngophoyiyane. ISebe lezeMpilo liyazama ukulungisa izinto ezininzi ngemadlana engekhoyo. Sicela uMphathiswa, uPravin ukuba akhe athi kratya kuba kaloku ngale madlana siye siqinisekise ukuba senza okukhulu ngayo kuba sifuna ukutshintsha ubomi babantu bakuthi. Siyabalungiselela kwezempilo. *(Translation of isiXhosa paragraph follows.)*

[We are asking people to please not to give up on their good thing. Department of Health is trying to improve a lot of things with a small budget. We ask hon Minister, Pravin to please increase the budget because with the small budget we ensure that we do a lot because we want to change our people‘s lives. We make plans for them in the health sector.]

The ANC supports Vote 16.

Vote accordingly agreed to.

Vote 17 – Social Development – put.

*Declarations of vote:*

Ms B S MASANGO: Hon House Chair, the ANC had the opportunity to increase social grants by R2,2 billion as proposed by the DA, but the ANC said, ―No.‖ Social grants are a life line for over

17 million South Africans. Recent reports reveal that close to

9 million South Africans are without jobs which render them dependent on family members who receive grants. This vulnerable people are clearly not a priority to the ANC-led government. The Budget speech by the Minister of Finance earlier this year, when the 6,4% increase in grant was announced, falls short of the just released CPI figures on food-price inflation which sits at 11%.

Since then the DA has called for an increase of social grants to meet the ever increasing food prices that were exacerbated by, among others, the current crippling draught and our country‘s ailing economy. My colleagues in the Finance Portfolio Committee have gone further and proposed amendments to the Appropriation Bill because the DA believes that the reprioritisation of the

lives of vulnerable South Africans is crucial. This too has fallen on deaf ears.

South Africans can see for themselves that to ANC-led government mostly black vulnerable lives do not matter. [Interjections.] We reiterate our call to the government to prioritise the millions of South Africans‘ lives by increasing social grants. The ANC has failed the poor and as such the DA will not be party to a budget which has not gone far enough to address the needs of the poor South Africans. Thank you. [Applause.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): The IFP?

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: House Chair, may I address you please.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Yes, hon member.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: I would like to address you in terms of Rule 63 of the Rules. Every time a DA Member of Parliament gets up to speak, the hon member under the pillar there is shouting the word ‗sell-out.‘ This is deeply offensive and I don‘t think if we want to start trading personal insults in the House ... We can go that route, but I don‘t think it is

appropriate. And I ask a ruling from you whether the word sell- out is appropriate in the parliamentary context.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Your point is noted. Hon members, order! Let us refrain from referring to each other in a dishonourable manner. While interjections ... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF SPORTS AND RECREATION: But yesterday you called the President a joke.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon Minister, did not recognise you.

The MINISTER OF SPORTS AND RECREATION: You are sell-outs too!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon Minister! Order, hon members. Order! No, no, no, no!

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: On a point of order!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon Radebe, sit down. Hon Minister, you should ask to be recognised. You shouldn‘t just switch on the mic and address the House. Yes, hon member?

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Hon House Chair, when I said it said it, the President owned that from the podium. But the hon member is unparliamentary by calling me a sell-out. And he must withdraw as well. [Interjection.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon member.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Otherwise I can start talking about his twitter accounts.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): No, hon member. No, no, no. Order! Order, hon members! Hon members, hon members, over the last period of time a number of unparliamentary words have been used by some Members of Parliament when referring to other Members of Parliament. Yesterday was once again such a case.

As the presiding officers we are looking at what was being said and updating the list of unparliamentary words, and we will return to the House and engage the chief whips of all political parties to remind ourselves on which words are unparliamentary.

Let us not make use of words that can be deemed offensive or even gestures. There are quite a few things that I have observed from where I am sitting this afternoon that can be impropriated

very negatively. So let us just refrain from doing so. Let us maintain the decorum of the House. And we will come back, hon Steenhuisen, once we have done that.

Hon members, I think we are in the last ... Order! Order! Let us now give the member at the podium the opportunity to continue with her declaration.

Mrs L L VAN DER MERWE: House Chairperson, despite the Minister of Social Development trying to put a positive spin on matters that her department is seized with during her Budget Vote debate, the facts speak for themselves. As our economy grinds to a hold we are faced with a severe social crisis. Government is losing the war against gender-based violence and we are losing the war against substance abuse.

Then each month million of school girls are missing a week of schooling each month simplify because they do not have access to sanitary products. The IFP continues to call on this department and government at large to ensure that free sanitary products for all those who need them became a reality. We have also called for the removal of VAT from these items. If we can provide freedom condoms, hon Minister of Health, we can also provide free sanitary products. Despite all these the Minister

of Social Development offered no answers to the issues we raised; notably she also had nothing to say about the legal and immoral deductions from SA Social Security Agency, Sassa, grant recipients. Instead we were chided by the ANC Members of Parliament saying that the matter is still *sub judice*, but only a few days later the Minister briefed the media about the steps that she is taking to resolve the matter, not Parliament.

I also remain concerned that the Minister‘s role as the ANC Women‘s League is severely compromising her role as the Minister of Social Development. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Order, hon members.

Mrs L L VAN DER MERWE: The incident in Port Elizabeth cannot be swept under the carpet. How can the very Minister who is supposed to protect the most vulnerable people in our society threaten people with violence?

Finally, despite constant denials by many leaders, the Public Protector has confirmed that distributing of food parcels at party events is an abuse of state resources and contravenes our Constitution. It is now up to Social Development and Sassa to arrest this practice as we approach the municipal elections.

This are issues of grave concern, however this budget looks after the most vulnerable in our society. The IFP will therefore support this budget but not the way it is administrated.

Mr A M SHAIK-EMAM: Hon House Chair, the NFP supporters this budget. This is the department which is designated to work with victims of rape and abuse to facilitate foster care and HIV/Aid outreached programmes and as such must rely on interdepartmental co-operation. It is also the department which is responsible for counselling traumatised victims of abuse, drug addiction and crime and facilitate care for the aged and destitute.

Unless we as the country and as government address the imbalances that our people have suffered from the passed oppression over 300 years, it is going to be very difficult to address the challenges that our people are facing. The conditions under which our people live, the kind of housing unit that were built prior 1994 – blocks of flats with no recreational facilities – drug abuse, high unemployment rate, all clustered together.

These are some of the reasons why our people are living under such conditions. That is why the challenges of abuse of drugs and alcohol, teenage pregnancies, HIV and Aids continue to

accelerate. So we need to look at these collectively in order to be able to address them.

I know it is not easy in 22 but I think we are getting there; a lot of work is being done. However, there are still very serious challenges. I want to urge the department to look at the different challenges our people face in those areas holistically and try to change that; improve the kind of houses we built for them in those areas by ensuring that there a proper recreational facilities.

The NFP will support this Budget Vote.

Nksk R N CAPA: Sihlalo weNdlu ohloniphekileyo neNdlu iphela, ndiphakamela ukuthi i-ANC kunye nekomiti ziyaluxhasa olu Hlahlo- lwabiwo-mali. Yiyo loo nto iqela leDA lingenamdla wokuba le mali mayifumaneke kuba kaloku ingenza ukuba kunciphe nabafazi abasebenza kwiifama zabo. Kaloku xa bathe banemali abayifumanayo, ukuya kusebenza efama bebeleke abantwana kuye kunciphe. Ngxe, ngokuba sibanike imali, siya kuhlala sibanika ukuze ubomi babo bubengcono, nivuma ningavumi.

Umama uMasango ohloniphekileyo wale Ndlu undidanise kakhulu kuba okoko sihamba kunye kwade kwaba ngumzuzu wokugqibela khange

aphakamise nelimdaka elichasayo. Ndiyabona mhlawumbi ukuba ikhona into enokumehlela ukuba angathetha inyaniso kule Ndlu. Olu Hlahlo-lwabiwo-mali lwenza ukuba oomama bakwazi ukuphucula izakhono kuba umntwana usukile emqolo waya esikolweni sabantwana abaselula.

Abantwana xa bethunyelwe kula maziko okufundisa abantwana abaselula bahlala ixesha elide esikolweni kuba bayatya loo nto yenze ukuba ingqondo ikhule, sitsho silingane. Singalingani nje kungokuba thina sakhula ngamanzi neenkobe bona besitya kamnandi. Yiyo le nto ingathi ibuhlungu le nto yokuba sibe kule Ndlu. [Uwelewele.] Ndiyaphinda ndithi olu Hlahlo-lwabiwo-mali lwenza inguqu. Abasebenzi bayayazi loo nto kuba xa besebenza emigodini nakwiindawo ezinzima oonina babantwana babo bahoyiwe yile mali. Kaloku bayayamkela inyanga rhoqo ngaphandle kwale kota eyayifunyanwa emva kweenyanga ezintathu. [Kwaphela ixesha.] [Kwaqhwatywa.] *(Translation of isiXhosa speech follows.)*

[Mrs N CAPA: Honourable Chairperson of this House and all honourable members present in this House, I rise to say that the ANC and the Committee supports this Budget Vote. The reason the DA is not showing any interest in supporting this Budget Vote is because it may lead to the decrease of the number of women working on their farms. When they get money, the need to go to

work on the farms with their babies on their backs is not a must. My apologies for giving them money; we will always be giving them money so that they can enjoy a better life, whether you like it or not.

Honourable Mrs Masango, who is a member of this House, disappoints me because for a long time we have been singing the same song but up to this minute she did not mention a single word to indicate that she is opposed to this Budget Vote. I sense that something might happen to her if she tells the truth in this House. This Budget Vote made it possible for women to improve their skills and there are no children on their backs; they are attending the early childhood development centres.

When children are sent to these early development centres, they stay there for a long time because they get food and that develops their minds and that brings us to the same level of understanding. The reason we are not at the same level is because we were not enjoying the same benefits and privileges; we grew up eating mielies and drinking water while other people were enjoying nutritious food. That is why our presence in this House is painful to others. [Interjections.] I repeat: this Budget Vote brings a change. When workers are working far from their homes in the mines and in other areas where they work very

hard, they know that their wives and children are being taken care of by receiving this money. They receive this money every month rather than that old system of getting it quarterly, which is after three months. [Time expired.] [Applause.]]

Vote accordingly agreed to (Democratic Alliance and Freedom Front Plus dissenting).

Vote No 18 — Correctional Services — put.

*Declaration(s) of Vote:*

Mr W HORN: House Chair, Correctional Services has an integral role to play in the criminal justice system of our country. The 2005 White Paper on Corrections in South Africa stated boldly that:

... the final fundamental break with a past archaic penal system, and ushers in a start to the second decade of freedom where prisons become correctional centres of rehabilitation and offenders are given new hope and encouragement to adopt a lifestyle that will result in a second chance towards becoming the ideal South African citizen.

More than a decade later this ideal has not been realised. To be fair, it‘s not solely the result of the budgetary allocation to the department over the years. In fact, overcrowding and corruption within the ranks of the administration of the department has contributed largely to the inefficiency in the department, specifically in respect of programmes aimed at rehabilitation.

The continued underspending by the department on its capital budget aimed at the increase in the number of bed spaces at our correctional facilities is a blight on the efforts of the many committed officials within the department.

As in the past our other concern with the budget of the department is that it does not sufficiently resource the programmes dealing with community corrections and social reintegration of ex-offenders, therefore preventing the optimal use of measures other than incarceration.

While we therefore support this budget, we do so very hesitantly. If underspending and corruption is not curbed substantially in this financial year, in future we may be forced to vote against the budget of the department as a vote of

disapproval to the lack of progress in addressing these serious issues. I thank you.

Mr S N SWART: Thank you, Chairperson. The ACDP will support this Budget Vote, notwithstanding certain reservations that we have.

The Auditor-General has persistently raised concerns about the department‘s internal audit and control environment, and its perennial audit qualifications. We note that the internal audit subprogramme does not have any significant performance indicators through which to measure progress made. An amount of R95,286 million is allocated to this programme and we in the ACDP support the committee‘s recommendations to improve the internal audit indicators.

We note that President Zuma has issued a proclamation for the Special Investigating Unit to investigate irregularities in the awarding of a tender for the electronic monitoring system. We also commend the steps taken by National Treasury‘s chief procurement officer in earlier instructing Commissioner Modise to cancel an irregular tender worth R378 million.

The department has been unable to meet its targets for additional bed spaces and we know the department is the receiver

of the criminal justice system. However, this has largely been due to long delays in the completion of capital infrastructure projects. Regrettably, discussions between the Minister and the Minister of Public Works have borne little fruit and the result of that is that we see overcrowding and diseases, particularly tuberculosis.

We particularly support the increase in the number of restorative justice programmes and this we see by the increase in the number of victims, parolees and probationers that are attending these programmes. This together with the rehabilitation budgets cannot be underfunded and we really need to see that as it has a direct impact on the reintegration of offenders into society. The ACDP has always supported restorative justice programmes; so the ACDP will support this Budget Vote.

Dr M S MOTSHEKGA: House Chairperson, the ANC supports this budget because in the past few years we have seen improvements in the work of the department. In fact, the department is succeeding in transforming the prisons into correctional centres as it‘s properly called.

We also find that the department is turning these correctional centres into centres of excellence. The ex-offenders that come out of these centres have skills and the department has a programme to plough these skills back into society. That enables the department to effectively bring about rehabilitation and social integration in our communities. We also know that the department has been building halfway houses which contribute to this social reintegration.

So as the ANC we would call on this Parliament to do everything possible to support this department, bearing in mind that the majority of the young people are in the correctional centres and we do not want to have a situation where recidivism continues.

We want these young people to come out as productive citizens so that they can contribute to the creation of a better life for all our people.

We know that some of our people in this Parliament on my left have been critical of the work of the department because their interest is in the tenders. The department does not exist for tenders but for service. Thank you very much. [Applause.] Question put.

Vote accordingly agreed to.

Business suspended at 16:52 and resumed at 17:28.

Vote No 19 — Defence and Military Veterans — put.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon members, I now put Vote No 19: Defence and Military Veterans. Are there any objections? There are objections. Declarations have been requested.

*Declarations of vote:*

Mr P G ATKINSON: Chairperson, this budget represents confusion and contradictions of political strategies, government policies, defence force needs and National Treasury allocations, clearly to prioritise the interests of President Zuma at the expense of the Defence Force and our citizens. The Minister admitted herself with this budget we will be shutting down the Defence Force earlier that expected.

The total budget is declining in real terms, and less money is appropriated to strategic expenses, for instance, Force flying hours, patrol vessels, equipment in support of our troops and airlift capabilities in the support of land and marine border patrol. We have seen last week how our ocean economy has been

exploited by the Chinese invaders which should have been prevented with regular air and sea patrol solstice.

We know that the Defence Review remains a dream, and not even Milestone A can be funded. This could have been corrected if it was not for the persistence to procure the new VIP jet with the value of R3,6 billion and obviously more flying hours and money appropriated for the VIP jet. Wasteful expenditure continues, for example, persons employed and paid as military judges cannot officiate in courts because the Minister has not confirmed their appointments as judges.

The Department of Military Veterans is handicapped with incompetent and underqualified staff, lack of information and communications technology, ICT, support, incomplete and unapproved media access units, MAUs, and service level agreements and incomplete database and a lack of leadership. Supporting this budget would be irresponsible and will imply that we negate our fiduciary duties.

The number of beneficiaries from the 57 000 military veterans on the database also remains a mystery. The department continues to underperform and to underspend on all the performance indicators

and targets. There is no way that one can perform and support this budget in the best interest of our troops. I thank you.

Dr P J GROENEWALD: Agb Voorsitter, sedert 1994, het die Vryheidsfront Plus nog elke keer hierdie Begrotingspos ondersteun, want ons weet dat die Suid-Afrikaanse nasionale weermag op hierdie oomblik geld nodig het. Die verwagtinge wat die regering aan hom stel en dit wat hulle vir hom gee om te spandeer maak nie sin nie.

Op die oomblik is die Verdedigingsbegroting ongeveer 1% van die *Bruto Binnelandse Produk, BBP*. Ons weet om hulle verpligtinge soos die vredesoperasies en die patrolering van die Mosambiekkanaal na te kom, het hulle minstens 1,6% van die BBP nodig. So, die weermag het geld nodig. Daar is nie eens genoeg geld om te verseker dat ons vlieëniers genoeg vlugure kan opstel om hulle behoorlik op te lei nie. Op ‘n stadium was dit so erg dat daar nie eens genoeg geld was om genoeg ammunisie aan te koop vir ons soldate om behoorlike opleiding te doen nie. So, die weermag het dit nodig.

Dan kom die agb Minister egter en sy sê dat hulle voortgaan om ‘n presidensiele straler uit die Verdedigingsbegroting te koop. Dit is totaal onaanvaarbaar – R4,3 miljard. Die agb Minister het

eintlik in die begrotingsdebat probeer vra: Wie sê dit is R4,3 miljard? Waar kom die mense aan hierdie bedrag? Sy sê dat

daar nog nie eens ‘n behoorlike tender is om te kan sê dat dit R4,3 miljard is nie.

Agb Minister, as u gaan kyk na die spesifikasies wat gestel word vir die presidensiële straler, sê daardie spesifikasies en vereistes dat jy in ‘n sekere klas moet beweeg, byvooorbeeld dat dit minstens 10 000 kilometer en meer aaneen moet kan vlieg. Dan praat jy van ‘n Boeing 787. Dit gaan meer as R4,3 miljard kos.

Die Vryheidsfront Plus sal dus nie hierdie jaar, vir die eerste keer, die begroting ondersteun nie. *(Translation of Afrikaans speech follows.)*

[Dr P J GROENEWALD: Hon Chairperson, since 1994 the Freedom Front Plus had on every occasion supported this Budget Vote, because we know that the South African national army do need money. That which government expects of the army do not relate to the amount which they allocate to them, neither does it make sense.

At the moment the Defence Budget represents only 1% of the gross domestic product. We know, in order to perform their duties like peace operations and patrolling the Mozambique channel, they

need at least 1,6% of the gross domestic product. So, the army needs money. There is not even enough money to ensure that our pilots get enough flight hours to train properly. At one stage the situation was so bad that there were not enough money to buy ammunition to train the soldiers properly. So, the army needs it.

The hon Minister, however, comes here and tells us that they are going ahead with plans to buy a presidential aircraft from the Defence Budget. It is totally unacceptable to spend R4,3 billion on a presidential aircraft. The hon Minister even tried to pose the question: According to whom is the amount R4,3 billion?

Where did the people get this amount? According to her, there is not even a proper tender yet to indicate that it will in fact be R4,3 billion.

Hon Minister, when you look at the specifications that were set for the presidential aircraft, those specifications and requirements demand that it must fall into a certain category, for example that it must be able to fly for at least 10 000km or even further, nonstop. In that case, we talk about a Boeing 787. It will cost more than R4,3 billion. The Freedom Front Plus will, therefore, for the first time, not support the budget, this year.]

Mr S N SWART: Chairperson, this is the one Budget Vote that all Members of Parliament are in agreement with and that is because the Defence budget is totally underfunded. Whenever we sit and debate the Budget Vote and we have all the generals and all the officers there, we stand and we wring our hands and say, ―Oh, this budget is underfunded, there must be more funds be given, it must be at least 2% of GDP, it is only 1% of GDP,‖ and we stand there. As I said in the Budget Vote, ―Can we as Members of Parliament - in good conscience, look at those officers in their eye when we have the power to amend the budget?‖

Today we passed the Committee Report on the Appropriation Bill and it is significant that on page 8 it says that no formal submissions were received from committees in terms of the subsections. That gives us the power as the Portfolio Committee on Defence to approach the Appropriations Committee and to shift funds away. When we say the presidential jet is not yet costed - if you look at the operational leases, suddenly they increased by almost a billion rand for every year over the next three years. So, you can see money has been taken away from our airforce and navy to fund these aspects.

The navy has 20% of its operating oil. How can it possibly operate with that? I would implore members to relook at this; to

reprioritise that and to use the powers that we have in terms of the Act to reprioritise funds. The ACDP will regrettably not support this vote because remember what the soldiers have said. They said: ―Ours is not to reason why, ours is but to do or die.‖ That is the poem from the Charge of the Light Brigade and we need to support our soldiers and our man in uniform. I thank you.

Mr M A MNCWANGO: Hon Madam Chairperson, the IFP supports the budget. However, we are concerned about the lack of implementation of the Defence Review. There is an urgent need to face this in at a cost-affordable pace to the country. Any further delay will surely result in the astronomical escalation of the cost to implement the Defence Review.

We would also like to urge the Minister to fast-track the implementation of the national service for we believe that this will assist in tackling youth unemployment. We are concerned about the continued public parading of the former members of uMkhonto weSizwe, MK, in ANC political events because we believe that that runs contrary to the prescripts of the Constitution and the law, for no political party is allowed to have a private army.

MK was demobilised and is part of the military veterans catered for in the national fiscus and we believe that this practice must actually stop for it is not only a threat to the stability of the country but to our democracy as well. Let there be one National Defence Force in this country. I thank you.

Mr M S MOTIMELE: Hon Chairperson, the ANC supports this Budget Vote. The brouhaha I hear from those parties that do not support the budget, I find it very much irresponsibility and self- defeating. Those parties are talking with a forked tongue.

Ba bolela ka maleme a go raragana ... [They are talking with twisted toungues ...]

... because you cannot say that you want to promote peace and stability in the country and in the region but you still reject the budget that is supposed to promote what you aspire. You cannot say that you have interest and pride in the military veterans and also say you reject the budget that should give them houses, education and not only them but also for their beneficiaries and their dependants. Now, the ANC stands for a well-equipped and a well-trained Defence Force. The ANC stands for the better life for all military veterans.

Ga go na motho yo a swanetšego go theeletša batho ba ka gore tše ka moka di bolelwago ke ditšiebadimo. [Nobody should listen to these people because what they are saying doesn‘t make sense.]

The ANC supports this budget. Thank you.

Division demanded.

The House divided.

AYES - 202: Abrahams, B L; Adams, F; Adams, P E; Basson, J V; Bekwa, S D; Beukman, F; Bhengu, P; Bhengu, F; Bhengu, N R; Bilankulu, N K; Bogopane-Zulu, H I; Bongo, B T; Brown, L; Buthelezi, N S; Capa, R N; Capa, N; Carrim, Y I; Cebekhulu, R N; Cele, B H; Cele, M A; Chauke, H P; Chikunga, L S; Chiloane, T D; Chohan, F I; Chueu, M P; Coleman, E M; Cronin, J P; Cwele, S C; Didiza, A T; Dirks, M A; Dlakude, D E; Dlamini-Dubazana, Z S; Dlulane, B N; Dunjwa, M L; Ebrahim, E I; Esterhuizen, J A; Faku, Z C; Filtane, M L W; Frolick, C T; Fubbs, J L; Gamede, D D; Gcwabaza, N E; Gina, N; Goqwana, M B; Gordhan, P J; Gumede, D M; Jeffery, J H; Joemat-Pettersson, T M; Johnson, M; Jonas, M H; Kalako, M U; Kekana, H B; Kekana, P S; Kekana, M D; Kekana, C D; Kekana, E; Kenye, T E; Khoarai, L P; Khosa, D H; Khoza, T Z M; Khoza, M B; Khunou, N P; Koornhof, G W; Kubayi, M T; Lesoma, R M M; Loliwe, F S; Luzipo, S; Maake, J J; Mabe, B P; Mabe, P P;

Mabija, L; Mabilo, S P; Madella, A F; Madlopha, C Q; Maesela, P; Mafolo, M V; Mafu, N N; Magadla, N W; Magadzi, D P; Magwanishe, G; Mahambehlala, T; Mahlalela, A F; Mahlangu, J L; Mahlangu, D G; Majola, F Z; Makhubela-Mashele, L S; Makhubele, Z S; Makondo, T; Makwetla, S P; Malgas, H H; Maluleke, J M; Maluleke, B J; Manamela, K B; Manana, M N S; Manana, D P; Mandela, Z M D; Mantashe, P T; Maphatsoe, E R K; Mapulane, M P; Martins, B A D; Masango, M S A; Masehela, E K M; Mashego-Dlamini, K C; Mashile, B L; Masondo, N A; Masuku, M B; Maswanganyi, M J; Mathale, C C; Mathebe, D H; Matlala, M H; Matshoba, M O; Matsimbi, C; Mavunda, R T; Maxegwana, C H M; Mchunu, S; Memela, T C; Mjobo, L N; Mkhize, H B; Mmemezi, H M Z; Mmola, M P; Mmusi, S G; Mncwango, M A; Mnganga - Gcabashe, L A; Mnguni, P J; Mnguni, D; Mnisi, N A; Mogotsi, V P; Mokoto, N R; Molebatsi, M A; Molewa, B E E; Morutoa, M R; Mothapo, M R M; Motimele, M S; Motshekga, M A; Motshekga, M S; Motsoaledi, P A; Msimang, C T; Mthembu, J M; Mthembu, N; Mthethwa, E M; Mudau, A M; Nchabeleng, M E; Ndaba, C N; Ndongeni, N; Newhoudt-Druchen, W S; Ngcobo, B T; Ngwenya- Mabila, P C; Nkadimeng, M F; Nkwinti, G E; Nobanda, G N; November, N T; Nqakula, C; Ntombela, M L D; Nyambi, H V; Oliphant, M N; Oliphant, G G; Oosthuizen, G C; Pandor, G N M; Patel, E; Phaahla, M J; Phosa, Y N; Pikinini, I A; Pilane- Majake, M C C; Radebe, B A; Radebe, J T; Radebe, G S; Ralegoma, S M; Ramaphosa, M C; Ramatlakane, L; Ramatlhodi, N A; Rantho, D

Z; Raphuti, D D; Semenya, M R; Senokoanyane, D Z; September, C C; Shaik Emam, A M; Shope-Sithole, S C N; Sibande, M P; Sithole, K P; Siwela, E K; Skosana, J J; Skwatsha, M; Smith, V G; Sotyu, M M; Surty, M E; Thomson, B; Tleane, S A; Tobias, T V; Tseke, G K; Tseli, R M; Tsenoli, S L; Tshwete, P; Tsoleli, S P; Tsotetsi, D R; Tuck, A; v R Koornhof, N J J; Van Schalkwyk, S R; Williams, A J; Xasa, T; Xego, S T; Yengeni, L E; Zokwana, S.

NOES - 68: America, D; Atkinson, P G; Bagraim, M; Baker, T E; Basson, L J; Bergman, D; Boshoff, H S; Bozzoli, B; Brauteseth, T J; Breytenbach, G; Cardo, M J; Chance, R W T; De Freitas, M S F; De Kock, K; Dreyer, A M; Edwards, J; Esau, S; Figg, M J; Figlan, A M; Groenewald, P J; Groenewald, H B; Grootboom, G A; Horn, W; Hunsinger, C H H; James, L V; James, W G; Jongbloed, Z; Kalyan, S V; Kohler, D; Kruger, H C C; Krumbock, G R; Lees, R A; Lorimer, J R B; Lotriet, A; Lovemore, A T; Mackay, G; Mackenzie, C; Majola, T R; Malatsi, M S; Marais, S J F; Marais, E J; Masango, B S ; Matsepe, C D; Maynier, D J; Mbhele, Z N; Mhlongo, T W; Mulder, P W A; Mulder, C P; Ollis, I M; Rabotapi, M W; Redelinghuys, M H; Robertson, K P; Robinson, D; Schmidt, H C; Shinn, M R; Steenhuisen, J H; Stubbe, D J; Swart, S N; Tarabella Marchesi, N I; Topham, B R; Van Damme, P T; Van Der Walt, D; Van Der Westhuizen, A P; Van Dyk, V; Volmink, H C; Vos, J; Waters, M; Wilson, E R.

Vote accordingly agreed to.

Vote No 20 – Independent Police Investigative Directorate – put.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): We now continue to Vote No 20: Independent Police Investigative Directorate. Are there any objections? No objections. Agreed to.

Mr M WATERS: Chairperson, we did indicate that we would like to make a declaration. It should be there, and our speaker is here. Thank you.

*Declarations of vote*:

Mnr M H REDELINGHUYS: Voorsitter, die DA ondersteun met huiwering die Onafhanklike Polisie-ondersoekdirektoraat se begrotingspos. Ons ondersteun dit, omdat die direktoraat ‘n belangrike grondwetlike rol het om te vervul deur ... *(Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.)*

[Mr M H REDELINGHUYS: Chairperson, the DA is hesitant to support the budget of the Independent Police Investigative Directorate. We support it, because the directorate plays an important constitutional role by ...]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Order!

Mnr M H REDELINGHUYS: ... die Suid-Afrikaanse Polisiediens aanspreeklik te hou. [Tussenwerpsels.] Dit is dus belangrik dat die direktoraat wat ‘n sleutelrol speel in die handhawing van openbare vertroue in die polisie behoorlik befonds en ondersteun word. Ek sê egter ―met huiwering‖, omdat die begroting nie naastenby genoeg is vir dit wat die direktoraat aangevra het om sy rol betekenisvol te vervul nie. Daar is nie genoeg personeel nie, en die Tesourie het die fondse geweier wat aangevra is om die Marikana-aanbevelings te implementeer. *(Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.)*

[Mr M H REDELINGHUYS: ... holding the South African Police Force accountable. [Interjections.] Therefore, it is important that the directorate which plays a key role in maintaining public trust in the police be financed and supported properly. However, I say this ―hesitantly‖, because the budget is not nearly enough the cover for the expenses as requested by the directorate to fulfil its role in a meaningful manner. There is not enough staff, and the Treasury turned down the funds which were requested to implement the Marikana recommendations.]

South Africans deserve police that protects and a watchdog that bites.

Die regering van mnr Zuma het egter stelselmatig die direktoraat se tande getrek en uitgeskop, beginnende met die heksejag teen die uitvoerende direkteur. [However, the government of Mr Zuma systematically extracted and kicked out the teeth of the directorate, when they started with a witch-hunt against the executive director.]

Hands off the police watchdog and let it do its job. Investigate police criminality without fear or favour even if the targets are Mr Zuma‘s best friends.

Ek wil ook graag aan die NVP-lid die begrotingsproses verduidelik en hoe ‘n meerderheid, wat die ANC het, werk om hul eie begroting deur te voer en te implementeer. Of die DA dit nou ondersteun of nie, dit is julle werk om jul eie begroting deur te druk, en ons stem duidelik nie saam met aspekte daarvan nie.

Daar is wel ‘n baie goeie Afrikaanse woord wat die lid van die lid van die NVP beskryf, en ek sien hy is nou oppad na die podium om presies dit te kom doen. In Afrikaans noem ons sulke gedrag en sulke mense baie blatant ―gatkruipers‖. [Gelag.] Baie

dankie, Voorsitter. [Applous.] *(Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follows.)*

[I would would like to explain the budget process to the member of the NFP and how a majority, which the ANC has, operates to carry its budget through and implement it. Whether the DA supports it now or don‘t, it is your task to push your own budget through, and we clearly don‘t agree with aspects therof.

There is indeed a very good word in Afrikaans which describes the member of the NFP, and I notice that he is now on his way to the podium to do this precisely. In Afrikaans we call such behaviour and such people very blatantly ―gatkruipers‖ (arse lickers). [Laughter.] I thank you, Chair. [Applause.]]

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Chairperson, there is no ... it clearly shows that that member‘s ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Order, hon members! Order!

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: Chair ...

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: ... sense of ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Order! Hon Shaik Emam, would you please sit?

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: Chairperson, my sincere apologies to hon Shaik Emam, but is it parliamentary to call a Member of Parliament a ―gatkruiper‖ [brown-noser]? [Laughter.] [Interjections.] Is it parliamentary? I do not think it is parliamentary and, in my view, it should be withdrawn.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Please allow me to ask for assistance, as I do not know the word. [Interjections.] The hon member from the DA, I am informed that, and the translation has been given to me, that word is unparliamentary. Would you please withdraw it?

Mr M H REDELINGHUYS: Voorsitter, dit is net soos wat hierdie Huis ... [Tussenwerpsels.] [Chairperson it is just as this House

... [Interjections.]]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon member, I am not asking for an explanation. Will you please withdraw?

Mr M H REDELINGHUYS: Daar is ‘n duidelike aanslag op Afrikaanse spreekwoorde in hierdie Huis. [Tussenwerpsels.] Selfs woorde

soos ―sies‖ mag nie in die Huis gesê word nie. [There is a clear attack on Afrikaans idioms in this House. [Interjections.] Even words such as ―sis‖ may not be used in the House.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon member, you can teach me next time, but I trust what my advisers are saying.

Mr M H REDELINGHUYS: Dit is baie moeilik om ... [Tussenwerpsels.] ... dit te onttrek. [It is very difficult to

... [Interjections.] ... withdraw it.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon member, please! Please! Will you please withdraw? [Interjections.]

Mnr M H REDELINGHUYS: I cannot withdraw the truth, Chairperson.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Thank you.

Mr M W L FILTANE: On a point of order, Chair ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): What is it?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: House Chairperson,

withdrawal of the word shouldn‘t be conditional.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): I cannot hear.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: He didn‘t withdraw it at all. [Interjections.] He should withdraw the word. He cannot undermine us like that.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon member, would you please stand?

Mr M W L FILTANE: Can I proceed?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon Filtane, let me deal with the point of order first. I will come back to you.

Mr M W L FILTANE: You will come back to me? Thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon member?

Mr M H REDELINGHUYS: Yes, Chairperson.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Would you please withdraw the word, which is unparliamentary, that you used in this House?

Mr M H REDELINGHUYS: Chairperson, for me to call someone a

―gatkruiper‖ [brown-noser] ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon member, please! [Interjections.] I don‘t want to be schooled.

Mr M H REDELINGHUYS: I withdraw, Chairperson.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (MS M G Boroto): Thank you. [Interjections.] Hon Filtane?

Mr M W L FILTANE: Chair, I think to clear the air of this ambiguity, we need to have a typical parliamentary dictionary. [Interjections.] That‘s what will sort things out because sometimes the Chairperson allows something and, when it is a different party, they say it is not alright. [Interjections.] We should have a parliamentary dictionary – finish and klaar. That controls it!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon member, I think that is a good suggestion, although it is not a point of order. It is not a point of order, but it is a good suggestion. [Interjections.] Hon members, we continue with the ANC. Oh, you are still here. I am very sorry. Apologies! Thank you, continue.

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Chairperson, let me remind that hon member that I am where I am because I was elected by the people, not because of my colour but because of my service to the community.[Applause.] [Interjections.] So, if your party chooses you because of your colour and nothing else, that is your problem, not mine. [Interjections.]

Let me add, with regard to the Independent Police Investigative Directorate, Ipid, we think that, under the circumstances, you are doing a very good job, and we urge you to continue ...

An HON MEMBER: It is the same speech every time!

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: With regard to the issue of the senior managers, we urge you to try and fill these positions as soon as possible. We also want to caution with regard to collusion.

There is one issue that we want to emphasise, and that issue is cases that are repeatedly handled by the same investigating officers and where you may find that the criminals and those dockets that the officers handle are exactly the same criminals that are repeat offenders. We urge the department to investigate into that to identify whether there is some pattern that the same officers may be investigating the same criminals and that,

as a result thereof, they may be getting away without being convicted. That, for us, is a challenge.

The other thing that we would like to recommend the department do is a survey between the police officers in the different police stations with regard to their protection at the police stations, with regard to what they know about corruption or collusion. There are some challenges on the ground, and I think police officers are sometimes scared to come forward. So, those are our recommendations but, otherwise, the NFP will support the budget. [Time expired.] [Interjections.]

Mr F BEUKMAN: House Chairperson, the ANC supports Vote No 20: Independent Police Investigative Directorate. The Ipid gives effect to provision of section 206(6) of the Constitution, which provides for the establishment of an independent police complaints body to investigate any alleged misconduct of or offense committed by a member of the police.

The R246 million allocated in the current year will facilitate the independent and impartial investigations of identified criminal offenses allegedly committed by members of the SAPS and municipal police. Over the medium term, the directorate will further strengthen its investigative capacity through the newly

established national specialised investigative team. The team‘s mandate is to conduct specialised investigations and facilitate the training of investigators on systemic corruption and other specialised investigations.

The ultimate goal of the compliance and stakeholder management programme, which has a budget of R15,5 million over the medium term, is to increase the number of disciplinary and criminal convictions secured by the directorate and its recommendations for the Police Service and the National Prosecuting Authority, thus ensuring that the Police Service rids itself of corruption and nonprofessional officials.

Another important item is awareness training for police officers on key provisions of the Independent Police Investigative Directorate Act. The training sessions are aimed at ensuring that police officials are fully aware of and compliant with provisions of the Act, their reporting obligations on crimes committed by police officials, and important recommendations by the directorate reflected by the police service. The Ipid plays an important role in the professionalising of the SAPS through conducting investigations and appropriate recommendations.

Finally, the police committee has recommended in its budget report that Ipid should continue to strengthen its oversight ability over the SAPS and the metro police service to ensure that the vision of the National Development Plan to create a more professional Police Service, both the SAPS and metro police service, that enjoys the full trust of the communities is realised. I thank you. [Applause.]

Vote accordingly agreed to.

Vote No 21 – Justice and Constitutional Development – put.

*Declarations of vote*:

Adv G BREYTENBACH: Madam House Chair, hon members, the provision for Budget Vote No 21 is, by and large, barely sufficient to properly support the administration of justice in this country. It is bound to have a detrimental effect on the fight against crime and corruption, specifically in the light of the failure of the political leadership of both the department and the country to demonstrate a commitment to our Constitution and the rule of law.

The success rate of the National Prosecuting Authority, NPA, in dealing with crimes affecting ordinary South Africans has

declined in the last two years, when we saw bigger budget increases than we see this year. For this, the blame needs to be put squarely on the shoulders of those who have been manipulating the appointment, removal and replacement of the National Director of Public Prosecutions. It was inevitable that this would have a ripple effect down to the lowest level of the criminal courts.

Simultaneously, the purse-strings held by the executive in respect of what is now the de facto corruption-busting institution of South Africa, the Office of the Public Protector, are being used to muzzle and render ineffectual this office, which has, along with our courts, been shown to act without fear, favour or prejudice. The continual refusal to properly fund the Public Protector in line with the structure already approved during the Fourth Parliament, unfortunately, has the effect that the complaints of many ordinary South Africans cannot properly be attended to by this Office. This, in turn, is used by her detractors to support their argument that she is not doing her job.

We are of the firm belief that this country needs a fully resourced Office of the Public Protector. The DA has proposed a

way to make this possible. The ANC has refused to do so. We cannot support this Budget Vote. Thank you.

Mr S N SWART: Chairperson, this is a crucial, crucial budget, but we see, again, a significant budget cut totalling

R1,7 billion over the medium term. This, obviously, has an impact on our NPA, on the functioning of courts, and on justice in our nation.

The two Chapter 9 institutions that report to this portfolio committee are the Human Rights Commission and the Public Protector. One of the major issues facing us was the treatment of the Public Protector by the justice committee - to the extent that even the Speaker of Parliament admitted that the manner in which the Public Protector was handled by the committee was regrettable. Regrettably, there was no apology forthcoming to the Public Protector, in view of the vindication of her Office by the Constitutional Court.

1. support the view that the Office of the Public Protector is underfunded. I understand the fiscal constraints. However, in order for her to do her work, particularly in view of the Nkandla judgment and the fact that many departments are taking

her decisions on review now, is, obviously, a severe constraint on her Office.

The further significant aspect of the Public Protector‘s Office is the reports of threats against her life. Now, in the previous Parliament, we, in the justice committee, when there was what was perceived to be an illegal raid on her Office, immediately invited her to the portfolio committee to brief us on her concerns, which she then did. I would ask, then, that we, in the justice committee, invite the Public Protector on an urgent basis, to explain these threats against her, and to ensure that we, as Parliament, are protecting her institution. Not only is she a vulnerable woman, but she is an important institution that requires protection from this House.

In view of these budgetary constraints, the ACDP will, regrettably, not be able to support this Budget Vote. I thank you.

Ms M C C PILANE-MAJAKE: Hon House Chair, during the EPC debate, the hon Swart actually withdrew the statement he made about the Speaker of Parliament. I don‘t know why he is actually repeating it today.

On the Traditional Courts Bill, I would like to say ...

... go magoši a rena ... [Tšhwahlelo.] [... to our traditional leaders ... [Interruptions.]]

... it will soon be introduced*.*

Mr S N SWART: Chairperson, on a point of order: I indicated that the Speaker did not apologise, but the Speaker issued that she regretted the way the committee dealt with it. Thank you, Chair. Go magoši a rena re rata gore ... [We want to inform our traditional leaders that ...]

... the Traditional Courts Bill will soon be reintroduced in Parliament. We know that there is a lot of concern out there because traditional courts continue to exist and they do not have any legislative framework to guide them.

When it comes to business, especially with multinationals, they have been very worried about the information regulator in terms of the Protection of Personal Information Act. We want to say that we will soon establish the Office of the Information Regulator. We are very advanced in the process of recruiting the Information Regulator and its four members.

We continue to create an environment for business. At the same time, however, we want to see business, itself, benefiting South Africans by continuing to create jobs. Through the NPA, the Special Investigating Unit, SIU, and the Public Protector, we will continue to fight corruption.

Incidentally, corruption is not something that has only started now. Corruption has nothing to do with the ANC. Corruption is about South Africans that become corrupt. Even during apartheid, we had corruption but we didn‘t have any institutions. So, we will continue to support those three offices I mentioned.

One more thing is important. We must start looking at the private sector and the corruption that takes place there. You must start interrogating the banking business, insurance, and retail because what we hear only is suspicions – that in government departments there must be corruption. In addition, there are insinuations made that government only employs ANC people, when, in actual fact, South Africans are employed in government ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Thank you very much. Thank you, hon member. Thank you.

Ms M C C PILANE-MAJAKE: The ANC supports the Budget Vote. [Time expired.]

Division demanded.

The House divided.

AYE - 206: Abrahams, B L; Adams, F; Adams, P E; Bam-Mugwanya, V; Basson, J V; Bekwa, S D; Beukman, F; Bhengu, P; Bhengu, F; Bhengu, N R; Bilankulu, N K; Bogopane-Zulu, H I; Bongo, B T; Buthelezi, N S; Capa, R N; Capa, N; Carrim, Y I; Cebekhulu, R N; Cele, B H; Cele, M A; Chauke, H P; Chikunga, L S; Chiloane, T D; Chohan, F I; Chueu, M P; Coleman, E M; Cronin, J P; Cwele, S C; Didiza, A T; Dirks, M A; Dlakude, D E; Dlamini-Dubazana, Z S; Dlulane, B N; Dunjwa, M L; Ebrahim, E I; Esterhuizen, J A; Faku, Z C; Filtane, M L W; Frolick, C T; Fubbs, J L; Gamede, D D; Gcwabaza, N E; Gigaba, K M N; Gina, N; Goqwana, M B; Gordhan, P J; Gumede, D M; Holomisa, S P; Jeffery, J H; Joemat-Pettersson, T M; Johnson, M; Jonas, M H; Kalako, M U; Kekana, H B; Kekana, P S; Kekana, M D; Kekana, E; Kekana, C D; Kenye, T E; Khoarai, L P; Khosa, D H; Khoza, T Z M; Khoza, M B; Khunou, N P; Kilian, J D; Koornhof, G W; Kubayi, M T; Lesoma, R M M; Loliwe, F S; Luzipo, S; Maake, J J; Mabasa, X; Mabe, B P; Mabe, P P; Mabija, L; Mabilo, S P; Mabudafhasi, T R; Madella, A F; Madlopha, C Q;

Maesela, P; Mafolo, M V; Mafu, N N; Magadla, N W; Magadzi, D P; Magwanishe, G; Mahambehlala, T; Mahlalela, A F; Mahlangu, J L; Mahlangu, D G; Majola, F Z; Makhubela-Mashele, L S; Makhubele, Z S; Makondo, T; Makwetla, S P; Malgas, H H; Maluleke, J M; Maluleke, B J; Manamela, K B; Manana, M N S; Manana, D P; Mandela, Z M D; Mantashe, P T; Maphatsoe, E R K; Mapulane, M P; Martins, B A D; Masango, M S A; Masehela, E K M; Mashego- Dlamini, K C; Mashile, B L; Masondo, N A; Masuku, M B; Maswanganyi, M J; Mathale, C C; Mathebe, D H; Matlala, M H; Matshoba, M O; Matsimbi, C; Mavunda, R T; Maxegwana, C H M; Mchunu, S; Memela, T C; Mkhize, H B; Mmemezi, H M Z; Mmola, M P; Mmusi, S G; Mnganga - Gcabashe, L A; Mnguni, P J; Mnguni, D; Mnisi, N A; Mogotsi, V P; Mokoto, N R; Molebatsi, M A; Molewa, B E E; Morutoa, M R; Mothapo, M R M; Motimele, M S; Motshekga, M A; Motshekga, M S; Motsoaledi, P A; Mpumlwana, L K B; Msimang, C T; Mthembu, J M; Mthembu, N; Mthethwa, E M; Mudau, A M; Nchabeleng, M E; Ndaba, C N; Ndongeni, N; Newhoudt-Druchen, W S; Ngcobo, B T; Ngwenya-Mabila, P C; Nkadimeng, M F; Nkwinti, G E; Nobanda, G N; November, N T; Nqakula, C; Ntombela, M L D; Nyambi, H V; Oliphant, M N; Oliphant, G G; Pandor, G N M; Patel, E; Phaahla, M J; Phosa, Y N; Pikinini, I A; Pilane-Majake, M C C; Radebe, B A; Radebe, J T; Radebe, G S; Ralegoma, S M; Ramaphosa, M C; Ramatlakane, L; Ramatlhodi, N A; Rantho, D Z; Raphuti, D D; Semenya, M R; Senokoanyane, D Z; September, C C;

Shaik Emam, A M; Shope-Sithole, S C N; Sibande, M P; Sithole, K P; Siwela, E K; Skosana, J J; Skwatsha, M; Smith, V G; Sotyu, M M; Surty, M E; Thabethe, E; Thomson, B; Tleane, S A; Tobias, T V; Tseke, G K; Tseli, R M; Tsenoli, S L; Tshwete, P; Tsoleli, S P; Tsotetsi, D R; Tuck, A; v R Koornhof, N J J; Van Schalkwyk, S R; Williams, A J; Xasa, T; Xego, S T; Yengeni, L E; Zokwana, S.

NOES - 60: America, D; Atkinson, P G; Bagraim, M; Baker, T E; Bergman, D; Boshoff, H S; Bozzoli, B; Brauteseth, T J; Breytenbach, G; Cardo, M J; Chance, R W T; De Freitas, M S F; De Kock, K; Dreyer, A M; Edwards, J; Esau, S; Figg, M J; Figlan, A M; Grootboom, G A; Horn, W; Hunsinger, C H H; James, W G; James, L V; Jongbloed, Z; Kalyan, S V; Kohler, D; Kruger, H C C; Krumbock, G R; Lees, R A; Lorimer, J R B; Lotriet, A; Lovemore, A T; Mackay, G; Mackenzie, C; Malatsi, M S; Marais, E J; Masango, B S ; Matsepe, C D; Maynier, D J; Mbhele, Z N; Mhlongo, T W; Mulder, C P; Ollis, I M; Redelinghuys, M H; Robertson, K P; Robinson, D; Schmidt, H C; Shinn, M R; Stubbe, D J; Swart, S N; Tarabella Marchesi, N I; Topham, B R; Van Damme, P T; Van Der Walt, D; Van Der Westhuizen, A P; Van Dyk, V; Volmink, H C; Vos, J; Waters, M; Wilson, E R.

Vote accordingly agreed to.

Vote 22 – Office of the Chief Justice and Judicial Administration – put.

*Declarations:*

Mr W HORN: Chairperson, the fact that today we are dealing with the second budget of the Office of the Chief Justice as a separate department must serve as a timely reminder of a country in vision by the founders of our constitutional democracy. This is an open and democratic society where every citizen is equal before the law; especially as this is the year when we celebrate the 20 years of our Constitution. A Constitution which not only guarantees the independence of the judiciary but also places the responsibility of ultimate oversight over compliance with our Constitution by the other arms of state in the hands of our judiciary and specifically in the hands of our Constitutional Court.

Given the fact that the judiciary are dependent on the other two arms of state for its operational expenses, it needs no special insight, therefore to realise that this is an inherent danger that budgetary allocations may be used to try and manipulate or even intimidate the judiciary into being differential to the executive.

Fortunately, we see no evidence of this in this year‘s budget. However, this does not mean that there is no really that this might happen in the near future. The way in which the governing party increasingly with would clearly on one side that it accept judgement against the executive only to turn around and then question the legitimacy of the judiciary sharply raises the question whether the ANC really see the supremacy of our Constitution and the principle of the rule of law as the principle transcending policy and politic for generations to come.

Therefore, we are in full support of the continued efforts of our judiciary to affect further involvement of our constitutional order to insolate and safeguard our judiciary against efforts to intimidate or manipulate it by not funding it properly. Thank you. [Applause.]

Adv B T BONGO: House Chair, the ANC supports this budget vote and we support this budget vote because it responds directly to Chapter 8 of the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa. We also support this budget vote because the office of the sergeant is also committed now to deal with the education and constitutional education to traditional leaders and to our communities.

We hope that very soon our communities are not going to be misled by anyone about what constitute a state. We support this budget vote also because it promotes access to justice and deals with the overall issue of transformation. For the first time in

22 years the people in Limpopo and in Mpumalanga will have access to justice there are high courts that have been built in those two provinces. [Applause.]

As the ANC our agenda of building a nonracial and nonsexist democratic and a prosperous country is on course. Sishoda ngani ngalapha. (We are short of you this side). Thank you very much.

Vote accordingly agreed to.

Vote 23 – Police – put.

Declarations of vote made on behalf of the Democratic Alliance, National Freedom Party, United Democratic Movement, Inkatha Freedom Party and African National Congress.

*Declaration of votes:*

Mr Z M MBHELE: Hon Chairperson, The DA will not support Budget Vote 23 on Police for two reasons ...

Okokuqala, sizibuze ukuthi ingabe lesabelomali sizosiza yini ukwandisa ukuphepha kwabantu bethu eNingizimu Afrika, impendulo esobala ithi cha. [Firstly, we asked ourselves if this Budget Vote is going to assist in increasing protection services for the people in South Africa, a clear answer is no.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Order, hon members!

Mr Z M MBHELE: This is our assessment because the higher level neglects incompetence and wrong priorities that underpin the chronic poor performance of our police service are not being addressed. Instead, as an example, of one such wrong priority the VIP Protection Service benefiting primarily the bloated elite in the executive is receiving an above inflation increase of 14% since the previous financial year.

Okwesibili, asisixhasi lesi sabelomali ngoba akusona isabelomali ebesizobekwa nguMnyango Wamaphoyisa kuHulumeni we-DA, uHulumeni we-DA ozayo kuleli Phalamende. [Ubuwelewele.] *(Translation of isiZulu paragraph follows.)*

[Secondly, we do not support this Budget Vote because it is not the Budget Vote that was going to be allocated by the Department

of Police of the DA-led government, the DA government is in coming government in this Parliament. [Interjections.]]

We would have allocated an additional R500 million to establish a much needed specialised unit to fight gang, drug and crime. We need more sustained expertise based on an intelligence-led approach to tackling local level syndicate crime which the usual investigations are constrained to address effectively.

Yesterday, the ANC had an opportunity to support our proposal to allocate an additional half a billion rand to the police budget in order to provide for a specialised gang and drug units. The ANC voted no. In so doing, the ANC voted against a more effective fight against crime and that is why we reject this budget.

Ngiyabonga. [Thank you.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON: (Ms M G Boroto): (Nks M G Boroto): Sibonge. Ngiyanicela malungu ahloniphekile eNdlu, umsindo sewuba phezulu, ngiyanicela, ake sehliseni. [Thank you. Hon members of this House, there is too much noise, please keep it down.]

Mr A M SHAIK-EMAM: Hon Chairperson, one of the reasons, in fact the NFP also yesterday in the Appropriation Committee did not

support the recommendation by the DA because there was no clarity whether the SA Police Service, SAPS, had the capacity to redeploy members from one struggling department to the other and whether it was necessary to now go on an appropriate a further R500 million to create a special unit. Therefore, in the absence of any knowledge on that we thought it was really not in our interest to do that and we did not refer to the actual document, the strategic plan.

One other challenge that we have is, and I want to refer this to the Minister being here present today. I think there was an intervention by hon Deputy President and the Minister of Health in Johannesburg recently with regards to the sex workers and the so-called harassment by police officers. I have this afternoon sent you an email to try and intervene in the matter because it is putting a lot of our people at risks. Therefore, there is an email at your table to try and address those challenges to ensure that the sex workers, despite performing unlawful activities, but they need not to be harassed and intimidated and would some of the staff taken away. So, that is one of the issues which we have.

The issue of gang violence, especially in the Western Cape, and drug is a serious challenge and I think we have discussed about

this. I know hon Minister has said that these are some mechanism that he is putting in place and we are asking for this to be actually accelerated so that we can get our people to live in a safe environment. Having said that, the NFP believes that policing is under good hands and we will support this budget.

Thank you very much.

Mr M W L FILTANE: Hon Chairperson, the UDM fully supports the budget but, hon Minister, the problem is that some of your station commanders in the country are deliberately suppressing the crime rates as reported so that they can earn points and get promotions. Typically, and you know that as I wrote you a letter two weeks ago and we are still expecting your reply, Madeira Police Station in Mthatha, two police men are serving suspension without pays since February. Their problem is that the station commander was not happy when they reported that a Pakistani without a driver‘s license accidentally killed someone in the dead of the night and the head of the police there was not interested in that case being investigated. Therefore, they were being suppressed.

Therefore, we say that we need this budget, but please look after all the police men not only station commanders who want to keep the records low so that they earn points and gain

promotions. This is very, very rampant in that part of the country. Thank you.

Mr M A MNCWANGO: Madam Chairperson, the IFP supports this budget. In doing so however we would like to raise the following points and say that the political appointments to the office of the National Police Commissioner have not worked, Mr Minister, and we hope that the Minister and the ANC have finally taken lessons from what has happened in this office in recent times.

We sit with a long list of disgraced casualties of this failed police such as Mr Comrade Selebi, who was accused of supping and dining with criminals, Mr Bheki ―shoot to kill‖ Cele and Ms Riah Marikana ... [Interjections.]

Mr G S RADEBE: Point of order, Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon Mncwango, please sit. Hon member!

Mr G S RADEBE: Chair, I think hon Mncwango must respect all members. You cannot put a nickname that we do not even know because it is like an insult when you call hon Cele ―shoot to kill‖. What is that? Hon Mncwango, please.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon Mncwango, we know the Rules. We call members honourable members with their correct surnames. Can you withdraw that?

Mr M A MNCWANGO: Well, hon Bheki Cele, Ms Riah Marikana Phiyega

... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon Mncwango, I do not expect such from you. Will you please withdraw? I cannot rule and you continue to do that.

Mr M A MNCWANGO: I withdraw, Madam.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Thank you very much. Continue.

Mr M A MNCWANGO: ... to the Acting National Commissioner, Lieutenant-General Phahlane ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Order, hon members!

Mr M A MNCWANGO: ... to the Acting National Commissioner, Lieutenant-General Phahlane, I just have least to say; your back-to-basics approach is a breath of fresh air. Please keep it

up. The logistical equipment and infrastructure, Mr Minister, particularly in rural areas needs immediate attention and your intervention and the case in point here is the holding cells at KwaNongoma that are falling apart and in many instances ...

... ziyavalwa, bese iziboshwa zithathwe zisiwe kwaHlabisa naseNhlwathi ... [... are no longer in use, the criminals are then taken to KwaHlabisa and to Nhlwathi ...]

... you know about that, Minister, I do not need to elaborate much about that. Thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Technicians, please take care of the screens something is very wrong. Any member? No, thank you. Hon member in the ANC. Please assist me because I cannot see the clock. Okay, thank you. Continue.

Mr F BEUKMAN: Hon Chairperson, the ANC supports Vote 23, Police to ensure that the SA Police Service to continue to strengthen the criminal justice system and professionalising the police service. In addition, the department will focus on transforming the police service and capacitating the public or the units. The budget will contribute to building safer communities as outlined in the Chapter 12 of the National Development Plan, NDP,

Outcome 3 of the 2014-2019 Medium-Term Strategic Framework, MTSF, ensuring that all people in South Africa are and feel safe.

Similar to the previous financial year, the SAPS received the second largest Budget Vote, 11,23% of the total budget, appropriations included. The implementation of the back-to- basics programme by the Acting National Commissioner and his new management team is contributing in turning around the effectiveness of SAPS in fighting serious crime. The strategic objective to retain SAPS to deal with its core-mandate of prevention, investigation and combating of crime includes the following: Enhance visibility, thoroughly and responsive investigation of every crime, utilisation of resources in support of the investigation of crime, crime intelligence in support of active policing and targeted deployment of resources and a collaborative consultative approach to policing.

The implementation of the White Paper on policing by SAPS jointly with the Civilian Secretariat for Police will further contribute to a more professional, accountable and crime ... [Inaudible.] ... police service. The transformation of the SAPS and the response on the Farlam Commission recommendations is vital to strengthen trust between the community and the police.

In closing, the factor fighting of crime can only be achieved by effective community participation in safety and crime prevention. The projects undertaken by the Civilian Secretariat for Police in terms of outreach and working with Community Police Forums should be supported by all citizens. Together we shall fight crime in communities. I thank you. [Applause.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Thank you, hon member. I put the Vote again, are there any objections?

Mr J H STEENHUISEN: Chairperson, the DA calls for a division. Thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): A division has been called for; the bells will be rung for one minute.

Division demanded.

The House divided.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Thank you, hon members. I would like to remind you that the members may only vote from their located seats. When requested to do so members must simply indicate their vote by pressing the appropriate button below the

yes, no or abstain signs. If a member in avertedly presses the wrong button, the member may thereafter press the correct button. The last button pressed will be recorded as the member‘s vote when voting session is closed by the Chair. The question before the House is that Vote 23 be agreed to. Are all members in their allocated seats? Voting will now commence. Those in favour of the Vote being agreed to should press the ‖yes‖ button. Those against should press the ―no‖ button. Those wishing to abstain should press the ―abstain‖ button. Have all members voted? Voting is closed.

AYES - 209: Abrahams, B L; Adams, F; Adams, P E; Bam-Mugwanya, V; Basson, J V; Bekwa, S D; Beukman, F; Bhengu, P; Bhengu, F; Bhengu, N R; Bilankulu, N K; Bogopane-Zulu, H I; Bongo, B T; Booi, M S; Brown, L; Buthelezi, N S; Capa, R N; Capa, N; Carrim, Y I; Cebekhulu, R N; Cele, B H; Cele, M A; Chauke, H P; Chikunga, L S; Chiloane, T D; Chohan, F I; Coleman, E M; Cronin, J P; Cwele, S C; Didiza, A T; Dirks, M A; Dlakude, D E; Dlamini- Dubazana, Z S; Dlulane, B N; Dunjwa, M L; Ebrahim, E I; Esterhuizen, J A; Faku, Z C; Filtane, M L W; Frolick, C T; Fubbs, J L; Gamede, D D; Gcwabaza, N E; Gigaba, K M N; Gina, N; Goqwana, M B; Gordhan, P J; Gumede, D M; Holomisa, S P; Jeffery, J H; Joemat-Pettersson, T M; Johnson, M; Jonas, M H; Kalako, M U; Kekana, P S; Kekana, H B; Kekana, M D; Kekana, C D; Kekana,

E; Kenye, T E; Khoarai, L P; Khosa, D H; Khoza, T Z M; Khoza, M B; Khunou, N P; Kilian, J D; Koornhof, G W; Kubayi, M T; Lesoma, R M M; Loliwe, F S; Luzipo, S; Maake, J J; Mabasa, X; Mabe, B P; Mabe, P P; Mabija, L; Mabilo, S P; Mabudafhasi, T R; Madella, A F; Madlopha, C Q; Maesela, P; Mafolo, M V; Mafu, N N; Magadla, N W; Magadzi, D P; Magwanishe, G; Mahambehlala, T; Mahlalela, A F; Mahlangu, J L; Mahlangu, D G; Majola, F Z; Makhubela-Mashele, L S; Makhubele, Z S; Makondo, T; Makwetla, S P; Malgas, H H; Maluleke, J M; Maluleke, B J; Manamela, K B; Manana, M N S; Manana, D P; Mandela, Z M D; Mantashe, P T; Maphatsoe, E R K; Mapulane, M P; Martins, B A D; Masango, M S A; Masehela, E K M; Mashego-Dlamini, K C; Mashile, B L; Masondo, N A; Masuku, M B; Maswanganyi, M J; Mathale, C C; Mathebe, D H; Matlala, M H; Matshoba, M O; Matsimbi, C; Mavunda, R T; Maxegwana, C H M; Mchunu, S; Mdakane, M R; Memela, T C; Mjobo, L N; Mkhize, H B; Mmemezi, H M Z; Mmola, M P; Mmusi, S G; Mncwango, M A; Mnganga - Gcabashe, L A; Mnguni, P J; Mnguni, D; Mnisi, N A; Mogotsi, V P; Mokoto, N R; Molebatsi, M A; Molewa, B E E; Morutoa, M R; Mothapo, M R M; Motimele, M S; Motshekga, M A; Motshekga, M S; Motsoaledi, P A; Mpumlwana, L K B; Msimang, C T; Mthembu, J M; Mthembu, N; Mthethwa, E M; Nchabeleng, M E; Ndaba, C N; Ndongeni, N; Newhoudt-Druchen, W S; Ngcobo, B T; Ngwenya-Mabila, P C; Nkadimeng, M F; Nkwinti, G E; Nobanda, G N; November, N T; Nqakula, C; Ntombela, M L D; Nyambi, H V; Oliphant, M N;

Oliphant, G G; Pandor, G N M; Patel, E; Phaahla, M J; Phosa, Y N; Pikinini, I A; Pilane-Majake, M C C; Radebe, B A; Radebe, J T; Radebe, G S; Ralegoma, S M; Ramaphosa, M C; Ramatlakane, L; Ramatlhodi, N A; Rantho, D Z; Raphuti, D D; Semenya, M R; Senokoanyane, D Z; September, C C; Shaik Emam, A M; Shope- Sithole, S C N; Sibande, M P; Sithole, K P; Siwela, E K; Skosana, J J; Skwatsha, M; Smith, V G; Sotyu, M M; Surty, M E; Thabethe, E; Thomson, B; Tleane, S A; Tobias, T V; Tseke, G K; Tseli, R M; Tsenoli, S L; Tshwete, P; Tsoleli, S P; Tuck, A; v R Koornhof, N J J; Van Der Merwe, L L; Van Schalkwyk, S R; Williams, A J; Xasa, T; Xego, S T; Yengeni, L E; Zokwana, S.

NOES - 63: America, D; Atkinson, P G; Bagraim, M; Baker, T E; Basson, L J; Bergman, D; Boshoff, H S; Bozzoli, B; Brauteseth, T J; Cardo, M J; Chance, R W T; De Freitas, M S F; De Kock, K; Dreyer, A M; Edwards, J; Esau, S; Figg, M J; Figlan, A M; Grootboom, G A; Horn, W; Hunsinger, C H H; James, L V; James, W G; Jongbloed, Z; Kalyan, S V; Kohler, D; Kruger, H C C; Krumbock, G R; Lees, R A; Lorimer, J R B; Lotriet, A; Lovemore, A T; Mackay, G; Mackenzie, C; Majola, T R; Malatsi, M S; Marais, S J F; Marais, E J; Masango, B S ; Matsepe, C D; Maynier, D J; Mazzone, N W A; Mbhele, Z N; Mhlongo, T W; Mulder, C P; Ollis, I M; Redelinghuys, M H; Robertson, K P; Robinson, D; Schmidt, H C; Shinn, M R; Steenhuisen, J H; Stubbe, D J; Tarabella Marchesi, N I; Topham, B R; Van Damme, P T; Van Der Walt, D; Van Der

Westhuizen, A P; Van Dyk, V; Volmink, H C; Vos, J; Waters, M; Wilson, E R.

Vote accordingly agreed to.

Vote 24 – Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries – put.

*Declarations of Vote:*

Ms Z JONGBLOED: Chair, there are a number of reasons for the DA not support this budget. First, is the ANC government‘s refusal to intervene and declare our worst drought on record a national disaster. Just R305,3 million has been made available for drought relieve while requests for emergency funding amounting to R4,2 billion has already been received.

Food prices are rising as I speak and we know South Africa may need to import about six million tons of grain in order to meet the population‘s food requirements. The DA asked for a budgetary increase of R2,73 billion to provide for immediate drought relieve to stricken communities, but this has been rejected by the ANC government.

Secondly, is the fact that for the second year running this department‘s budget has been cut by R181 million and

R40,6 million respectively in the sectors of agricultural production, health, food security and agrarian reform.

Thirdly, it is the inability of fisheries to effectively patrol and protect our marine resources. Worst of all, is the case with abalone where the department has admitted to its inability to protect the resources against the brazen poachers who now have fleets of Chinese vessels seemingly waging war on our marine resources and pillaging our fishes while those appointed to protect are watching helplessly.

Madam Chair, I think I need to remind the department of an Afrikaans idiom that says,

Meng jou met die semels, dan vreet die varke jou op. [If you get mixed up with bran, the pigs will eat you.]

Prince N R CEBEKHULU: House Chair, let me start by saying that the IFP supports the budget, but there are two things to point out. The Chinese fishing vessels sailing through South Africa‘s exclusive economic zone area raises questions. To have foreign vessels within 20 nautical miles of our coastal transiting in lucrative fishing grounds where they have no authority to be fishing in the first place, is of great concern.

Out of a number of these vessels only one was intercepted and brought into the port for inspection. Minister, should we still trust that our waters are well-guarded and patrolled? Could we be made to believe answers given that our coast is safe from illegal fishers fishing in our waters taking away what belong to us as a country? The question is: what happened to the rest of the vessels which ended up not brought into the port for inspection?

Okwesibili, mhlonishwa Ngqongqoshe, esabelweni ebesikhishelwe ukusiza abalimi ngenxa yesomiso, sihlangabezana nokuthi lezo zinkampani ezinikezwe umsebenzi wokuthi ziphakele abafuyi, kunesinqumo ebasithatha sokuthi uma ngabe umuntu enikezwa u- R12 000 bona bamnikeza isabelo sika-R6 000 bese bethi alindele ukuyothola enye ingxenye yesabelo uma umnyango uphinde waphosa ngokulandelayo. Ngabe konke lokhu kuyiqiniso ukusiza umphakathi? Noma ekugcineni le mali egodlwayo ukusiza laba bantu abampofu kuba imali egcina yehle ngemilenze? Lowo umbuzo oyodinga impendulo. Ngiyabonga. *(Translation of isiZulu paragraph follows.)*

[Secondly, hon Minister, the budget that was allocated to assist the farmers because of the draught, we encountered that the companies that were given this task of funding the farmers, took

a decision that if a person is given R12 000 they will give him R6 000 and they tell him that he will receive the remaining balance when the department sends funds again. Is this the correct way of helping the community? Or at the end this money that is reserved for helping these poor people is embezzled?

This is a question that needs to be answered. Thank you.]

Mr M W L FILTANE: Chair, as much as the UDM supports this budget, there are four critical points that we would earnestly request the department to take a serious look at.

Firstly, all round transformation in this sector is lacking. Suppliers of equipments and inputs remain outside of this colour. That is a critical point.

Secondly, please, accelerate the modernisation of the wheels of implementing agricultural programmes in order to maximise production as well as to enhance soil preservation. The methods that are being used in most of the rural projects are very very old and they are not helpful.

Thirdly, budget cut is seriously decried by the UDM. We wish there could be more money availed to agriculture. If we had that and we are planting as much as the nation need - remember we

have over five million people who don‘t even have jobs - some of them could be employable as they may be. But because that is not happening a lot of people become clients of the Police department and clients of the Health department as they need hospitalisation. If our agriculture was really thriving those people would be saved.

Fourthly, better relations with provinces will help optimise assistance given to emerging farmers.

Lastly, yesterday, the President gave me a reply to the fact that the reason for some Ministers not doing their job efficiently is because of apartheid. Be an exception to that. We have a history of utilising land and being productive. Our agricultural progress was not that much hit by apartheid. Just remember that and be an exception. Don‘t take that as a reason. Thank you.

Mr A M SHAIK-EMAM: Hon Chairperson, the NFP supports this budget. Let me start off by saying to the hon Minister, as you are present today, that there is a challenge at eThekwini, in Durban, with regard to the fishermen. There is about 30 000 strong fishing community who have been refused permission to fish. This is what they rely on for income. They were removed in

2010 during the time of the World Cup and they were promised that they will be able to fish there again. We urge you to intervene in this matter to ensure that these people are allowed to go and fish there again because for generations they have been performing that.

We also want to welcome the support that the department is giving to the farmers especially in terms of animal feeds and things that you are providing to the farmers. We also want to welcome the assistance that you have been giving to all these drought-stricken farmers and we would like to urge you to continue doing that good work.

We know that based on the situation in this country in terms of drought, there could be a need for greater assistance and we feel that the Treasury can come in at that stage if necessary to compliment the needs that we may have in terms of finance.

We also want the department to encourage taking advantage of the relationship we have in the SA Development Community, SADC, region and in Africa to try and export our citrus fruits and more of that in order to supplement the income in terms of the grain. In light of that the NFP supports the budget.

Moh M R SEMENYA: Modulasetulo le maloko a Ntlo ye e hlomphegago, re le ba ANC re dumelelana le tekanyetšo ye ya Kgoro ya tša Temo, Dithokgwa le Dihlapi. Se se bolelwago ke leloko la DA sa gore mmušo ga se nke o thuše nakong ye ya komelelo, ga se nnete. Se se lego gona ke gore R2 bilione ye ba bolelago ka yona - le a gopola gore mohl Bheki Cele o le boditše gore e ya kae, akere?

Nka se sa le botša ka gore ke ya bona; ga se ya balemi.

Go tšwa go tekanyetšo ya R6,3 bilione ya kgoro**,** R4 ya dibilione e ile diprofenseng go thuša balemipotlana ka diterekere, dipeu le manyora, gomme R2,3 bilione ye e šetšego e thušitše Lekgotla la tša Temo la Dinyakišišo. Seo se ba dirago gore ba se thekge tekanyetšo ye ke ka lebaka la gore e thuša balemipotlana. Le a gopola re tlile mo ra bolela gore Lekgotla la tša Temo la Dinyakišišo le kgonne go tšweletša peu ye e tlilego go kgona go lwantšhana le komelelo, ya hloga go dutše go na le komelelo. Tše di bolelago ke ba ba DA, ga di phele; ke ditšiebadimo.

Bjale, rena re le ba ANC, re re Tona e tšwele pele e thekge balemipotlana, temo e gole, go be le dijo mo Afrika-Borwa. Se bohlokwa ke gore re leboga ge mmušo wo o ile wa tšeela taba ya tšhireletšego dijong godimo wa e iša ka ofising ya Motlatša Tona gore a kgone go hwetša thekgo go tšwa dikgorong ka moka gore

tlala le bodiidi di fele mo Afrika-Borwa. Ke a leboga. [Tšhwahlelo.] *(Translation of Sepedi paragraphs follows.)*

[Mrs M R SEMENYA: The Chairperson and members of the honourable House, the ANC supports the budget for the Department of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries. The statement by the member of the DA that the government has never landed a helping hand during the drought is not true. The truth is that the R2 billions they are talking about – do you still remember that hon Bheki Cele has explained to you what the money will be used for? I am not going to talk about this again because it belongs to them; it is not meant for the farmers.

From the R6,3 billion allocated to the department**,** R4 billion went to the provinces to help the new farmers with tractors, seeds and compost. The remaining R2,3 billion was directed to the Agricultural Research Council. They won‘t support the budget because the money is going to help the new farmers. I would like to believe that you still remember that the Agricultural Research Council has come up with a seed that will fight drought, it will grow even in the midst of drought. The DA members are not telling the truth; they are lying.

As members of the ANC, we are encouraging the Minister to continue giving support to the new farmers and help grow the agricultural industry so that there is enough food in South Africa. We would like to thank this government for taking the food security issue seriously by escalating it to the office of the Deputy Minister so that he gets the support from all other government departments and combat hunger and poverty in South Africa. Thank you. [Interruptions.]]

Division demanded.

The House divided.

AYES - 213: Abrahams, B L; Adams, F; Adams, P E; Bam-Mugwanya, V; Basson, J V; Bekwa, S D; Beukman, F; Bhengu, P; Bhengu, F; Bhengu, N R; Bilankulu, N K; Bogopane-Zulu, H I; Bongo, B T; Booi, M S; Brown, L; Buthelezi, N S; Capa, R N; Capa, N; Carrim, Y I; Cebekhulu, R N; Cele, B H; Cele, M A; Chauke, H P; Chikunga, L S; Chiloane, T D; Chohan, F I; Chueu, M P; Coleman, E M; Cronin, J P; Cwele, S C; Didiza, A T; Dirks, M A; Dlakude, D E; Dlamini-Dubazana, Z S; Dlulane, B N; Dunjwa, M L; Ebrahim, E I; Esterhuizen, J A; Faku, Z C; Filtane, M L W; Frolick, C T; Fubbs, J L; Gamede, D D; Gcwabaza, N E; Gigaba, K M N; Gina, N; Goqwana, M B; Gordhan, P J; Gumede, D M; Holomisa, S P; Jeffery,

1. H; Joemat-Pettersson, T M; Johnson, M; Jonas, M H; Kalako, M U; Kekana, P S; Kekana, H B; Kekana, M D; Kekana, E; Kekana, C D; Kenye, T E; Khoarai, L P; Khosa, D H; Khoza, T Z M; Khoza, M B; Khunou, N P; Kilian, J D; Koornhof, G W; Kubayi, M T; Lesoma, R M M; Loliwe, F S; Luzipo, S; Maake, J J; Mabasa, X; Mabe, B P; Mabe, P P; Mabija, L; Mabilo, S P; Mabudafhasi, T R; Madella, A F; Madlopha, C Q; Maesela, P; Mafolo, M V; Mafu, N N; Magadla, N W; Magadzi, D P; Magwanishe, G; Mahambehlala, T; Mahlalela, A F; Mahlangu, D G; Mahlangu, J L; Majola, F Z; Makhubela-Mashele, L S; Makhubele, Z S; Makondo, T; Makwetla, S P; Malgas, H H; Maluleke, J M; Maluleke, B J; Manamela, K B; Manana, M N S; Manana, D P; Mandela, Z M D; Mantashe, P T; Maphatsoe

, E R K; Mapulane, M P; Martins, B A D; Masango, M S A; Masehela, E K M; Mashego-Dlamini, K C; Mashile, B L; Masondo, N A; Masuku, M B; Maswanganyi, M J; Mathale, C C; Mathebe, D H; Matlala, M H; Matshoba, M O; Matsimbi, C; Mavunda, R T; Maxegwana, C H M; Mbalula, F A; Mchunu, S; Mdakane, M R; Memela, T C; Mjobo, L N; Mkhize, H B; Mmemezi, H M Z; Mmola, M P; Mmusi, S G; Mnganga - Gcabashe, L A; Mnguni, P J; Mnguni, D; Mnisi, N A; Mogotsi, V P; Mokoto, N R; Molebatsi, M A; Molewa, B E E; Morutoa, M R; Mothapo, M R M; Motimele, M S; Motshekga, M A; Motshekga, M S; Motsoaledi, P A; Mpumlwana, L K B; Msimang, C T; Mthembu, J M; Mthembu, N; Mthethwa, E M; Nchabeleng, M E; Ndaba, C N; Ndongeni, N; Newhoudt-Druchen, W S; Ngcobo, B T; Ngwenya-

Mabila, P C; Nkadimeng, M F; Nkwinti, G E; Nobanda, G N; November, N T; Nqakula, C; Ntombela, M L D; Nxesi, T W; Nyambi, H V; Oliphant, M N; Oliphant, G G; Pandor, G N M; Patel, E; Phaahla, M J; Phosa, Y N; Pikinini, I A; Pilane-Majake, M C C; Radebe, B A; Radebe, J T; Radebe, G S; Ralegoma, S M; Ramaphosa, M C; Ramatlakane, L; Ramatlhodi, N A; Rantho, D Z; Raphuti, D D; Semenya, M R; Senokoanyane, D Z; September, C C; Shaik Emam, A M; Shope-Sithole, S C N; Sibande, M P; Sisulu, L N; Sithole, K P; Siwela, E K; Skosana, J J; Skwatsha, M; Smith, V G; Sotyu, M M; Surty, M E; Thabethe, E; Thomson, B; Tleane, S A; Tobias, T V; Tseke, G K; Tseli, R M; Tsenoli, S L; Tshwete, P; Tsoleli, S P; Tuck, A; v R Koornhof, N J J; Van Der Merwe, L L; Van Schalkwyk, S R; Williams, A J; Xasa, T; Xego, S T; Yengeni, L E; Zokwana, S; Zulu, L D.

NOES - 62: America, D; Atkinson, P G; Bagraim, M; Baker, T E; Basson, L J; Bergman, D; Boshoff, H S; Bozzoli, B; Brauteseth, T J; Cardo, M J; Chance, R W T; De Freitas, M S F; De Kock, K; Dreyer, A M; Esau, S; Figg, M J; Figlan, A M; Grootboom, G A; Horn, W; Hunsinger, C H H; James, W G; James, L V; Jongbloed, Z; Kalyan, S V; Kohler, D; Kruger, H C C; Krumbock, G R; Lees, R A; Lorimer, J R B; Lotriet, A; Lovemore, A T; Mackay, G; Mackenzie, C; Majola, T R; Malatsi, M S; Marais, S J F; Marais, E J; Masango, B S ; Matsepe, C D; Maynier, D J; Mazzone, N W A;

Mbhele, Z N; Mhlongo, T W; Ollis, I M; Rabotapi, M W; Redelinghuys, M H; Robertson, K P; Robinson, D; Schmidt, H C; Shinn, M R; Steenhuisen, J H; Stubbe, D J; Tarabella Marchesi, N I; Topham, B R; Van Damme, P T; Van Der Walt, D; Van Der Westhuizen, A P; Van Dyk, V; Volmink, H C; Vos, J; Waters, M; Wilson, E R.

Vote accordingly agreed to.

Vote 25 Economic and Development – put.

*Declarations:*

Mr J VOS: Thank you, House Chair. When the Department of Economic Development was launched in 2009, its mission was clear. The Department of Economic Development was going to bring coherence to economic policy making and implementation across state departments, but it has failed to do so. The Department of Economic Development was going to promote inclusive growth but it has failed to do so, and the department was going to break the back of unemployment by accelerating job creation; but it has failed to do so.

In fact, despite the efforts of a committed Minister and his team on every one of these indicators policy coherence, economic

growth, and employment, the ANC government has failed. This year, according to the international monetary fund, South Africa would be lucky to grow at 0,7% while the rest of the Sub Saharan Africa will grow at 0,4%. In 2009 there were 6,7 million South Africans without a job. Today, there are 8,9 million unemployed South Africans.

With every passing quarter the national development plans 2 030 target or 0,5% growth, which is 11 million jobs, and 0,6% unemployment recede further into the horizon. Clearly, we are not getting enough bangs from the economic development department‘s R675 million bucks. That is why the DA believes that the economic development department should be shutdown and its budget channelled to the other departments.

Its economic planning and co-ordinating functions should go to Treasury, its support services to the Presidential infrastructure; its co-ordinating commission should go to the Presidency; and its oversight functions of the IDC to Hi-Tech; and its competition authorities should go to the Department of Trade and Industry. For these reasons, the DA will not support this budge. Thank you. [Applause.]

Ms E M COLEMAN: Modulasetilo, ke rata go go dumedisa le maloko otlhe a a tlotlegang. [Chairperson, I would like to greet you and all hon members.]

The DA has a repetition; it is tired, and has unsubstantiated complaints about this department. This is irrespective of the fact that when you are in the department the Minister talks to these issues, you applaud and praise the Minister but when you come here you grandstand. [Interjections.] You have been calling for this department to be scraped for quite sometime now. And this is the same department that we have seen in the report that they have given you Dr, and you also have agreed to their performance and that they have exceeded their target and you know it.

They continue to do that. [Interjections.] May be that is why in your proposal that you tabled in the appropriations committee you said they must cut the department‘s budget by R13 million.

What does that mean? Therefore, it means that they must cut the allocation towards infrastructure; towards competition; towards industrial funding and trade. What does that mean to the voters out there? It means if the DA government would lead this country their lives are not safe in your hands.

I wish to point out that the departments‘ budget is mainly for the transfers; and only R146 million is meant for the department‘s core business. The ANC supports this budget. Ke a leboga. [I thank you.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): I now put the Vote again; are there any objections? In the light of the objection, I now put the question: Those in favour will say, eye.

Hon MEMBERS: Eye!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Those against will say, no.

Hon MEMBERS: No!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): I think the eyes have it.

Division demanded.

The House divided.

AYES - 211: Abrahams, B L; Adams, F; Adams, P E; Bam-Mugwanya, V; Basson, J V; Bekwa, S D; Beukman, F; Bhengu, P; Bhengu, F;

Bhengu, N R; Bilankulu, N K; Bogopane-Zulu, H I; Bongo, B T; Booi, M S; Brown, L; Buthelezi, N S; Capa, R N; Capa, N; Carrim, Y I; Cebekhulu, R N; Cele, M A; Cele, B H; Chauke, H P; Chikunga, L S; Chiloane, T D; Chohan, F I; Chueu, M P; Coleman, E M; Cronin, J P; Cwele, S C; Didiza, A T; Dirks, M A; Dlakude, D E; Dlamini-Dubazana, Z S; Dlulane, B N; Dunjwa, M L; Ebrahim, E I; Esterhuizen, J A; Faku, Z C; Filtane, M L W; Frolick, C T; Fubbs, J L; Gamede, D D; Gcwabaza, N E; Gigaba, K M N; Gina, N; Goqwana, M B; Gordhan, P J; Gumede, D M; Holomisa, S P; Jeffery, J H; Joemat-Pettersson, T M; Johnson, M; Jonas, M H; Kalako, M U; Kekana, P S; Kekana, H B; Kekana, C D; Kekana, M D; Kekana, E; Kenye, T E; Khoarai, L P; Khosa, D H; Khoza, T Z M; Khoza, M B; Khunou, N P; Kilian, J D; Koornhof, G W; Kubayi, M T; Lesoma, R M M; Loliwe, F S; Luzipo, S; Maake, J J; Mabasa, X; Mabe, B P; Mabe, P P; Mabija, L; Mabilo, S P; Mabudafhasi, T R; Madella, A F; Madlopha, C Q; Maesela, P; Mafolo, M V; Mafu, N N; Magadla, N W; Magadzi, D P; Magwanishe, G; Mahambehlala, T; Mahlalela, A F; Mahlangu, D G; Mahlangu, J L; Majola, F Z; Makhubela-Mashele, L

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| S; Makhubele, Z S; Makondo, T; Makwetla, S P; Malgas, | H | H; |
| Maluleke, J M; Maluleke, B J; Manamela, K B; Manana, M | N | S; |
| Manana, D P; Mantashe, P T; Maphatsoe, E R K; Mapulane, | M | P; |

Martins, B A D; Masango, M S A; Masehela, E K M; Mashego- Dlamini, K C; Mashile, B L; Masondo, N A; Masuku, M B; Maswanganyi, M J; Mathale, C C; Mathebe, D H; Matlala, M H;

Matshoba, M O; Matsimbi, C; Mavunda, R T; Maxegwana, C H M; Mbalula, F A; Mchunu, S; Mdakane, M R; Memela, T C; Mjobo, L N; Mkhize, H B; Mmemezi, H M Z; Mmola, M P; Mmusi, S G; Mncwango, M A; Mnganga - Gcabashe, L A; Mnguni, P J; Mnguni, D; Mnisi, N A; Mogotsi, V P; Mokoto, N R; Molebatsi, M A; Molewa, B E E; Morutoa, M R; Mothapo, M R M; Motimele, M S; Motshekga, M A; Motshekga, M S; Motsoaledi, P A; Mpumlwana, L K B; Msimang, C T; Mthembu, J M; Mthembu, N; Mthethwa, E M; Nchabeleng, M E; Ndaba, C N; Ndongeni, N; Newhoudt-Druchen, W S; Ngcobo, B T; Ngwenya- Mabila, P C; Nkadimeng, M F; Nkwinti, G E; Nobanda, G N; November, N T; Nqakula, C; Ntombela, M L D; Nxesi, T W; Nyambi, H V; Oliphant, G G; Pandor, G N M; Patel, E; Phaahla, M J; Phosa, Y N; Pikinini, I A; Pilane-Majake, M C C; Radebe, B A; Radebe, J T; Radebe, G S; Ralegoma, S M; Ramaphosa, M C; Ramatlakane, L; Ramatlhodi, N A; Raphuti, D D; Semenya, M R; Senokoanyane, D Z; September, C C; Shaik Emam, A M; Shope- Sithole, S C N; Sibande, M P; Sisulu, L N; Sithole, K P; Siwela, E K; Skosana, J J; Skwatsha, M; Smith, V G; Sotyu, M M; Surty, M E; Thabethe, E; Thomson, B; Tleane, S A; Tobias, T V; Tseke, G K; Tseli, R M; Tsenoli, S L; Tshwete, P; Tsoleli, S P; Tuck, A; v R Koornhof, N J J; Van Der Merwe, L L; Van Schalkwyk, S R; Williams, A J; Xasa, T; Xego, S T; Yengeni, L E; Zokwana, S; Zulu, L D.

NOES - 61: America, D; Atkinson, P G; Bagraim, M; Baker, T E; Basson, L J; Boshoff, H S; Bozzoli, B; Brauteseth, T J; Cardo, M J; Chance, R W T; De Freitas, M S F; De Kock, K; Dreyer, A M; Edwards, J; Esau, S; Figg, M J; Figlan, A M; Grootboom, G A; Horn, W; Hunsinger, C H H; James, L V; James, W G; Jongbloed, Z; Kalyan, S V; Kohler, D; Kruger, H C C; Krumbock, G R; Lees, R A; Lorimer, J R B; Lotriet, A; Lovemore, A T; Mackay, G; Mackenzie, C; Majola, T R; Malatsi, M S; Marais, S J F; Marais, E J; Masango, B S ; Matsepe, C D; Maynier, D J; Mazzone, N W A; Mbhele, Z N; Mhlongo, T W; Ollis, I M; Rabotapi, M W; Redelinghuys, M H; Robertson, K P; Robinson, D; Schmidt, H C; Shinn, M R; Steenhuisen, J H; Stubbe, D J; Topham, B R; Van Damme, P T; Van Der Walt, D; Van Der Westhuizen, A P; Van Dyk, V; Volmink, H C; Vos, J; Waters, M; Wilson, E R.

Vote accordingly agreed to.

Vote 26 – Energy – put.

*Declarations of vote:*

Mr W HORN: Sihlalo [Chair.], it may yet be too soon to start referring to the Minister of Energy as ―Accused Number 2‖, but should the ongoing legal action against the Minister go as poorly for the Minister as is expected, the Minister faces years

of legal challenges to the point where it may be cheaper for the taxpayer were the President and the Minister of Energy to carpool from their official residences at Bryntirion to their various high courts.

The simple fact of the matter is that, in her overzealous attempts to meet or do the bidding of Accused Number One, and despite protestations to the contrary, the Minister has seriously bungled the nuclear deal on various procedural grounds. Despite the Minister and her department‘s best attempts to frustrate the current inquiry into what South Africans can only refer to as #EpicFail, sufficient information now exists to demonstrate that the Minister has not applied her mind or acted rationally – although I doubt this is a surprise to anyone – that the Minister has violated the Constitution by deliberately bypassing Parliament despite being in possession of an opinion by the state law advisor clearly indicating the need for Parliament‘s consideration and approval of any intergovernmental agreements regarding nuclear, and that the Minister is in violation of her statutory obligations under the Electricity Regulation Act, which requires that both the decision to procure and process must be taken prior to the commencement of the procurement process itself.

Her failure to adhere either to the Constitution or her statutory obligations means that the nuclear deal, like most of the government‘s other policy objectives, is now in a state of undefined limbo. However, on this rare occasion, government‘s ineptitude is a virtue and not a vice.

A recent report by the Energy Research Centre at UCT posits, that avoiding Mr Zuma‘s nuclear deal may save 75 000 jobs for South Africans and be a boost to economic growth. South Africa does not need unaffordable nuclear deal that only serves to enrich one man and one man only - of course, ―Accused Number One‖.

Mr J A ESTERHUIZEN: Madam Chair, the Minister of Energy encourages the private sector to get involved in renewable energy technologies and treat it as an opportunity. Two years ago the grid parity price for example, wind energy, was wandering at 15p/KWh and solar at R2, 85. Through this continuous involvement the prices fell down.

Die prys van sonkrag is tans beskikbaar teen ongeveer 65 tot 75c per kilowatt-uur en dis alleenlik deur mededinging. Dit is die regte pad vir die bevordering van alternatiewe energiebronne, want vooruitgang in die ekonomie kan nie alleenlik gemeet word

aan ons handelsbalans en gemaksone van ons minerale hulpbronne nie, maar ook aan die energiebehoeftes van almal in Suid-Afrika. *(Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.)*

[The price of solar energy is currently available at approximately 65c to 75c per kilowatt hour and this is solely thanks to competition. This is the right road for the promotion of alternative energy sources, since progress in the economy cannot be measured only in terms of our balance of trade and the comfort zone of our mineral resources, but also in terms of the energy needs of everyone in South Africa.]

Siyasemukela lesi sabelomali. [Ihlombe.] [We support the Budget Vote. [Applause.]]

Mr F Z MAJOLA: House Chair, the ANC supports Budget Vote No 26. We do this so that the ANC-led government can continue to expand energy access to millions of our people and to the industry. If you were not born in a shack or mud house in a village or in a match-box house in a township, you will not understand the remarkable progress that the ANC has made since 1994. [Applause.] In 1994 only 36% of households had access to electricity – mainly white households and those in urban areas -

today 88% of households are electrified and an increasing number of this is in rural areas. [Applause.]

The DA is too obsessed with nuclear. We do know that they are not going to be in a position to provide a cogent and scientific argument against the nuclear. Their difficulty is that, you can‘t have a nuclear expansion programme under a black government. This is the problem that the DA has. Thank you very much, House Chair. [Applause.]

Division demanded.

The House divided.

AYES - 208: Abrahams, B L; Adams, F; Adams, P E; Bam-Mugwanya, V; Basson, J V; Bekwa, S D; Beukman, F; Bhengu, P; Bhengu, F; Bhengu, N R; Bilankulu, N K; Bongo, B T; Booi, M S; Brown, L; Buthelezi, N S; Capa, R N; Capa, N; Carrim, Y I; Cebekhulu, R N; Cele, B H; Cele, M A; Chauke, H P; Chikunga, L S; Chiloane, T D; Chohan, F I; Chueu, M P; Coleman, E M; Cronin, J P; Cwele, S C; Didiza, A T; Dirks, M A; Dlakude, D E; Dlamini-Dubazana, Z S; Dlulane, B N; Dunjwa, M L; Ebrahim, E I; Esterhuizen, J A; Faku, Z C; Filtane, M L W; Frolick, C T; Gamede, D D; Gcwabaza, N E; Gigaba, K M N; Gina, N; Goqwana, M B; Gordhan, P J; Gumede, D M;

Jeffery, J H; Joemat-Pettersson, T M; Johnson, M; Jonas, M H; Kalako, M U; Kekana, H B; Kekana, P S; Kekana, M D; Kekana, E; Kekana, C D; Kenye, T E; Khoarai, L P; Khosa, D H; Khoza, T Z M; Khoza, M B; Khunou, N P; Kilian, J D; Koornhof, G W; Kubayi, M T; Lesoma, R M M; Loliwe, F S; Luzipo, S; Maake, J J; Mabasa, X; Mabe, B P; Mabe, P P; Mabija, L; Mabilo, S P; Mabudafhasi, T R; Madella, A F; Madlopha, C Q; Maesela, P; Mafolo, M V; Mafu, N N; Magadla, N W; Magadzi, D P; Magwanishe, G; Mahambehlala, T; Mahlalela, A F; Mahlangu, D G; Mahlangu, J L; Makhubela-Mashele, L S; Makhubele, Z S; Makondo, T; Makwetla, S P; Malgas, H H; Maluleke, J M; Maluleke, B J; Manamela, K B; Manana, M N S; Manana, D P; Mandela, Z M D; Mantashe, P T; Maphatsoe, E R K; Mapulane, M P; Martins, B A D; Masango, M S A; Masehela, E K M; Mashego-Dlamini, K C; Mashile, B L; Masondo, N A; Masuku, M B; Maswanganyi, M J; Mathale, C C; Mathebe, D H; Matlala, M H; Matshoba, M O; Matsimbi, C; Mavunda, R T; Maxegwana, C H M; Mbalula, F A; Mchunu, S; Mdakane, M R; Memela, T C; Mjobo, L N; Mkhize, H B; Mmemezi, H M Z; Mmola, M P; Mmusi, S G; Mnganga - Gcabashe, L A; Mnguni, P J; Mnguni, D; Mnisi, N A; Mogotsi, V P; Mokoto, N R; Molebatsi, M A; Molewa, B E E; Morutoa, M R; Mothapo, M R M; Motimele, M S; Motshekga, M A; Motshekga, M S; Motsoaledi, P A; Mpumlwana, L K B; Msimang, C T; Mthembu, J M; Mthembu, N; Mthethwa, E M; Nchabeleng, M E; Ndaba, C N; Ndongeni, N; Newhoudt-Druchen, W S; Ngcobo, B T; Ngwenya-Mabila,

P C; Nkadimeng, M F; Nkwinti, G E; Nobanda, G N; November, N T; Nqakula, C; Ntombela, M L D; Nxesi, T W; Nyambi, H V; Oliphant, M N; Oliphant, G G; Pandor, G N M; Patel, E; Phaahla, M J; Phosa, Y N; Pikinini, I A; Pilane-Majake, M C C; Radebe, B A; Radebe, J T; Radebe, G S; Ralegoma, S M; Ramaphosa, M C; Ramatlakane, L; Ramatlhodi, N A; Raphuti, D D; Semenya, M R; Senokoanyane, D Z; September, C C; Shaik Emam, A M; Shope- Sithole, S C N; Sibande, M P; Sisulu, L N; Sithole, K P; Siwela, E K; Skosana, J J; Skwatsha, M; Smith, V G; Sotyu, M M; Surty, M E; Thabethe, E; Thomson, B; Tleane, S A; Tobias, T V; Tseke, G K; Tseli, R M; Tsenoli, S L; Tshwete, P; Tsoleli, S P; Tuck, A; v R Koornhof, N J J; Van Der Merwe, L L; Van Schalkwyk, S R; Williams, A J; Xasa, T; Xego, S T; Yengeni, L E; Zokwana, S; Zulu, L D.

NOES - 59: America, D; Atkinson, P G; Bagraim, M; Baker, T E; Basson, L J; Boshoff, H S; Bozzoli, B; Brauteseth, T J; Cardo, M J; Chance, R W T; De Freitas, M S F; De Kock, K; Dreyer, A M; Edwards, J; Figg, M J; Figlan, A M; Grootboom, G A; Horn, W; Hunsinger, C H H; James, L V; James, W G; Jongbloed, Z; Kalyan, S V; Kohler, D; Kruger, H C C; Krumbock, G R; Lees, R A; Lorimer, J R B; Lotriet, A; Lovemore, A T; Mackay, G; Mackenzie, C; Majola, T R; Marais, S J F; Marais, E J; Masango, B S ; Matsepe, C D; Maynier, D J; Mazzone, N W A; Mbhele, Z N;

Mhlongo, T W; Ollis, I M; Rabotapi, M W; Redelinghuys, M H; Robertson, K P; Robinson, D; Schmidt, H C; Shinn, M R; Steenhuisen, J H; Stubbe, D J; Topham, B R; Van Damme, P T; Van Der Walt, D; Van Der Westhuizen, A P; Van Dyk, V; Volmink, H C; Vos, J; Waters, M; Wilson, E R.

Vote accordingly agreed to.

Vote No 27 — Environmental Affairs — put.

*Declaration(s) of Vote:*

Me J EDWARDS: Joni Edwards. Ek kan nie anders as om te begin met die skokkende werkloosheidsyfer wat weerins gestyg het sedert my begrotingsdebattoespraak slegs twee weke gelede nie. Daar is tans ... *(Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.)*

[Ms J EDWARDS: Joni Edwards. I can‘t help but start with the shocking unemployment rate that has once again risen since I delivered my budget vote debate only two weeks ago. Currently there is ...]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon members, please!

Ms J EDWARDS: My tyd! Daar is tans ‘n totaal van 8,9 miljoen werklose mense in Suid-Afrika. [My time! Currently there is a total of 8,9 million unemployed people in South Africa.]

The DA believes that this department can be more proactive and progressive in numerous ways and at the same time create hundreds of thousands of jobs. Instead of dumping millions of tons of waste on landfills, not mentioning the illegal dumping sites that pop up everywhere, this government should put proper incentive programmes in place. We should seriously start by creating less waste at home. We should become a recycling society and we should start by doing away with plastic shopping bags.

Furthermore, we should work with provinces and local spheres of government to set stronger air quality standards, monitor emissions properly and provide incentives for investments that will lead to cleaner air and healthier communities.

Dit is onaanvaarbaar dat die pragtige klein dorpie van Hartbeespoort in die Noordwesprovinsie amptelik nou die vuilste lug in Suid-Afrika het. [It is unacceptable that the beautiful little town of Hartbeespoort in the North West province officially now has the dirtiest air in South Africa.]

When it comes to conservation in South Africa this government should start taking a strong stand and make drastic changes in its strategy to combat poaching.

Dit is total onaanvaarbaar en absoluut kommerwekkend dat 88% van die gestroopde renosters in Afrika op Suid-Afrikaanse grond plaasgevind het. [It is totally unacceptable and absolutely worrying that 88% of the poached rhinos in Africa happened on South African soil.]

Minister, stop pussyfooting around and act now. Do better, be bold and be brave.

Die DA kan nie hierdie begroting ondersteun nie. [The DA cannot support this budget.]

Mr A M SHAIK-EMAM: Hon Chairperson, the NFP believes that the hand of the department should be strengthened through increased funding if we wish to make sustainable development a reality.

Currently our environment is being pillaged with virtual impunity. We see an increase in illegal poaching of our marine resources.

In light of the environmental ills facing our country, we welcome the increase in the allocation for programme 2 which deals with the legal authorisation and compliance enforcement aspects of the department‘s mandate. This programme needs to be expanded if the department is to intervene effectively.

With the Minister being present, I just want to express my concern on behalf of the NFP on the areas of the Bluff, Merewent, Jacobs and Austerville with the high level of pollution created by these conglomerates of Engen, the SA Pulp and Paper Industries, Sappi, Mondi and the SA Petroleum Refinery, Sapref. It appears that there is a very high level of lung infections and cancer victims in that area. So we would urge the department to conduct some survey or some investigation

... some research ... into that area to see if we do have a serious problem and act accordingly. The NFP supports this.

Mr Z S MAKHUBELE: Hon House Chairperson and hon members, may I start off by indicating that the Department of Environmental Affairs is in fact one of the high performing departments in the country by any standards. This is evidenced by its ability to carry out all the seven programmes in pursuit of the constitutional mandate in terms of section 24 which states that:

Everyone has the right to an environment that is not harmful to his or her health or wellbeing ... to have the environment protected, to the benefit of present and future generations, through reasonable legislative and other measures that prevent pollution and ecological degradation, promotes conservation and secures ecologically sustainable development and use of natural resources while promoting justifiable economic and social development.

This department has consistently managed to achieve unqualified audit opinions. This requires continuous expanding of its knowledge base to find better, effective and efficient ways of accomplishing more with less financial resources. It should be noted that this is a highly scientific department by its nature. There is a need for intensive scientific research to develop appropriate systems and programmes. All this is done to fulfill our historic responsibility bequeathed upon us by the Freedom Charter that was adopted in 1955.

The department‘s strategic priorities are geared towards the achievement of outcome 10 and its suboutcomes of the National Development Plan, namely ecosystems are sustained and natural resources are used efficiently; an effective climate change mitigation and adaptation response; an environmentally

sustainable low carbon economy resulting from a well-managed just transition; ... [Inaudible.] ... government systems and capacity. We are confident that all this shall be achieved with distinction by the ANC government. The ANC supports this budget. [Applause.]

Question put.

Vote accordingly agreed to (Democratic Alliance dissenting).

Vote 28 – Labour – put.

*Declarations of vote:*

Mr I OLLIS: Chairperson, I don‘t happen to believe personally in reincarnation but when I see the hon Bhoola from the NFP, I have to wonder if we are not seeing déjà vu in this parliament. But I must ask the ANC, how much it costs to buy an imbongi [praise singer] these days? A political party which comes to sing your praises, how much does it cost? I noticed the APC is not here to defend you today, did their cheque bounce? However, let‘s turn to labour, the DA cannot support this Labour Vote for ... [Inaudible.] [Interjections.]

Mr A M SHAIK-EMAM: Chair, the hon member, who is what he is – I don‘t know. But he is trying to grandstand. He has made aspersions indicating that a member is perhaps bought by the ANC

... [Inaudible.] [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon member, that is not a point of order, continue hon Ollis!

Mr I OLLIS: We cannot support the Labour Vote because of a number of reasons: firstly, the failure of the Minister of Labour to run an internal disciplinary enquiry into the corruption that happened at Nedlac and instead promoted one of the culprits; secondly, the President seems to interfering with the Minister in the registration of the workers association union. A labour union that does not qualify in terms of the Act to be a union, but number one has insisted that it gets registered; thirdly, the service delivery failure at the Unemployment Insurance Fund, UIF, and the Compensation Fund, particularly with the computer system that is offline two days a week in every labour centre in the country; fourthly, failure to implement any measures, Minister, to deal with strike violence in the Republic of South Africa; fifthly, the illegal firing by the Minister of the registrar of labour relations because Cosatu said so. The court said the Minister didn‘t apply her mind, sis!

sixthly, the failure of the parliamentary labour committee under its chairperson to hold this Minister accountable. She has visited the committee ones in six years for 13 minutes and answered two questions. That is not accountability, chairperson. You need to hold this Minister to account. We have been waiting two years and every time we ask, you delay, you say no or you obfuscate. Three months ago you said, within three months you will get this Minister to be accountable, you still haven‘t ... [Time expired.]

Ms F S LOLIWE: Chair, the ANC supports this Budget Vote. The Minister and hon Shaik, what you must understand is that when it is full moon, all the dogs keep barking at the moon but the moon never looses its light nor moves a bit from its position. What we need to understand is that the ANC is like that moon. We are not shaken by detractors. What we understand the department to be doing is that the UIF is the always the best performer and being the best performer, it has even extended its scope because they are labour activation programmes that see to it that former beneficiaries as well as a particular quantity of the youth are taken through re-skilling so that we break the poverty line.

I am standing here boldly to even say Compensation Fund, which is struggling has now presented a clear programme showing how

they are going to overcome their challenges. We just want to say to our own colleagues, who were just here that in the committee we had an opportunity to engage extensively with this particular Budget and we agreed that there is progress and also that Compensation Fund is not a red light anymore because the new action plan is taking us somewhere.

We are impressed by the commitment shown by the Department of Labour because it makes every entity be the best performer.

There are clear programmes, as the ANC, we are saying siyaqhuba [lets move forward]. Thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon members, I put the Vote again, are there any objections? In light of the objections, I put the question. Those in favour will say aye, [Interjections.], those against will say noe, [Interjections.]. I think the ayes have it.

Mr M WATERS: Chair, the DA calls for a division. Division demanded.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon members, I just want to remind you that only vote from your allocated seats. When requested to do so, members must simply indicate their vote by

pressing the appropriate button below the ―yes‖, ―no‖ or abstain signs. If a member inadvertently presses the wrong button, the member may, thereafter, press the correct button. The last button pressed will be recorded as the member‘s vote when the voting session is closed by the Chair.

Are all members in their allocated seats? [Interjections.] The question before the House is that Vote 28 be agreed to. Voting will now commence. [Interjections.] Those in favour of the vote being agreed to should press the ―yes‖ button. [Interjections.] Those against should press the ―no‖ button and those wishing to abstain should press the ―abstain‖ button. Have all members voted? [Interjections.] The voting session is now closed.

Division demanded.

The House divided.

AYES - 211: Abrahams, B L; Adams, F; Adams, P E; Bam-Mugwanya, V; Basson, J V; Bekwa, S D; Beukman, F; Bhengu, P; Bhengu, F; Bhengu, N R; Bilankulu, N K; Bogopane-Zulu, H I; Bongo, B T; Booi, M S; Boroto, M G; Brown, L; Buthelezi, N S; Capa, R N; Capa, N; Carrim, Y I; Cebekhulu, R N; Cele, B H; Cele, M A; Chauke, H P; Chikunga, L S; Chiloane, T D; Chohan, F I; Chueu, M

P; Coleman, E M; Cronin, J P; Cwele, S C; Dirks, M A; Dlakude, D E; Dlamini-Dubazana, Z S; Dlulane, B N; Dunjwa, M L; Ebrahim, E I; Esterhuizen, J A; Faku, Z C; Frolick, C T; Fubbs, J L; Gamede, D D; Gcwabaza, N E; Gigaba, K M N; Gina, N; Goqwana, M B; Gordhan, P J; Gumede, D M; Jeffery, J H; Joemat-Pettersson, T M; Johnson, M; Jonas, M H; Kalako, M U; Kekana, H B; Kekana, P S; Kekana, M D; Kekana, E; Kekana, C D; Kenye, T E; Khoarai, L P; Khosa, D H; Khoza, T Z M; Khoza, M B; Khunou, N P; Kilian, J D; Koornhof, G W; Kubayi, M T; Loliwe, F S; Luzipo, S; Maake, J J; Mabasa, X; Mabe, B P; Mabe, P P; Mabija, L; Mabilo, S P; Mabudafhasi, T R; Madella, A F; Madlopha, C Q; Maesela, P; Mafolo, M V; Mafu, N N; Magadla, N W; Magadzi, D P; Magwanishe, G; Mahambehlala, T; Mahlalela, A F; Mahlangu, D G; Mahlangu, J L; Majola, F Z; Makhubela-Mashele, L S; Makhubele, Z S; Makondo, T; Makwetla, S P; Malgas, H H; Maluleke, J M; Maluleke, B J; Manamela, K B; Manana, M N S; Manana, D P; Mantashe, P T; Maphatsoe , E R K; Mapulane, M P; Martins, B A D; Masango, M S A; Masehela, E K M; Mashego-Dlamini, K C; Mashile, B L; Masondo, N A; Masuku, M B; Maswanganyi, M J; Mathebe, D H; Matlala, M H; Matshoba, M O; Matsimbi, C; Mavunda, R T; Maxegwana, C H M; Mbalula, F A; Mchunu, S; Mdakane, M R; Memela, T C; Mjobo, L N; Mkhize, H B; Mmemezi, H M Z; Mmola, M P; Mmusi, S G; Mncwango, M A; Mnganga - Gcabashe, L A; Mnguni, P J; Mnguni, D; Mnisi, N A; Mogotsi, V P; Mokoto, N R; Molebatsi, M A; Molewa, B E E;

Morutoa, M R; Mothapo, M R M; Motimele, M S; Motshekga, M A; Motshekga, M S; Motsoaledi, P A; Mpumlwana, L K B; Msimang, C T; Mthembu, J M; Mthembu, N; Mthethwa, E M; Nchabeleng, M E; Ndaba, C N; Ndongeni, N; Newhoudt-Druchen, W S; Ngcobo, B T; Ngwenya- Mabila, P C; Nkwinti, G E; Nobanda, G N; November, N T; Nqakula, C; Ntombela, M L D; Nxesi, T W; Nyambi, H V; Oliphant, M N; Oliphant, G G; Pandor, G N M; Patel, E; Phaahla, M J; Phosa, Y N; Pikinini, I A; Pilane-Majake, M C C; Radebe, B A; Radebe, J T; Radebe, G S; Ralegoma, S M; Ramaphosa, M C; Ramatlakane, L; Ramatlhodi, N A; Rantho, D Z; Raphuti, D D; Semenya, M R; Senokoanyane, D Z; September, C C; Shaik Emam, A M; Shope- Sithole, S C N; Sibande, M P; Sithole, K P; Siwela, E K; Skosana, J J; Skwatsha, M; Smith, V G; Sotyu, M M; Surty, M E; Thabethe, E; Thomson, B; Tleane, S A; Tobias, T V; Tseke, G K; Tseli, R M; Tsenoli, S L; Tshwete, P; Tsoleli, S P; Tuck, A; v R Koornhof, N J J; Van Der Merwe, L L; Van Schalkwyk, S R; Williams, A J; Xasa, T; Xego, S T; Yengeni, L E; Zokwana, S; Zulu, L D.

NOES - 58: America, D; Atkinson, P G; Baker, T E; Basson, L J; Bergman, D; Boshoff, H S; Bozzoli, B; Cardo, M J; Chance, R W T; De Freitas, M S F; De Kock, K; Dreyer, A M; Edwards, J; Esau, S; Figg, M J; Figlan, A M; Grootboom, G A; Horn, W; Hunsinger, C H H; James, L V; Jongbloed, Z; Kalyan, S V; Kohler, D; Kruger, H C C; Krumbock, G R; Lees, R A; Lorimer, J R B; Lotriet, A;

Lovemore, A T; Mackay, G; Mackenzie, C; Majola, T R; Malatsi, M S; Marais, S J F; Masango, B S ; Matsepe, C D; Maynier, D J; Mazzone, N W A; Mbhele, Z N; Mhlongo, T W; Ollis, I M; Rabotapi, M W; Redelinghuys, M H; Robertson, K P; Robinson, D; Schmidt, H C; Shinn, M R; Steenhuisen, J H; Stubbe, D J; Topham, B R; Van Damme, P T; Van Der Walt, D; Van Der Westhuizen, A P; Van Dyk, V; Volmink, H C; Vos, J; Waters, M.

Vote accordingly agreed to.

Vote 29 - Mineral Resources - put

*Declaration of vote*:

Mr J R B LORIMER: We lost 10 000 mining jobs in the first quarter of this year, but some measures that‘s another 100 000 South Africans who have lost the breadwinner. Mining production was down by 5,5% in January, down by 8,7% in February and down a record by 18% in March.

The chances of saving those 32 000 up risk mining jobs are residing. The department is highly politicised, they come and present to the committee, and they say it‘s all a fault of local commodity prices. It ignores the industry, which says it can survive low prices; it can‘t survive low prices and bad loss.

The Minister then delivers a new version of the Mining Charter calling for strict to black economic empowerment, BEE. Don‘t worry, says the government on being challenge for writing a suicide note for the mining industry, we will have meetings on job losses. They have the meetings and shout to the industry telling them not to cut jobs. There is no knowledge or understanding that half of the members of the Chamber of Mines are losing money. Why is it this government think that all the big mining houses are leading South Africa?

This department doesn‘t stop illegal strike mining. It doesn‘t maintain a working cadastral system. It doesn‘t answer parliamentary questions properly. It doesn‘t keep to time lines on processing licences. What does it do? Will it does appear to take bribes. It does close mines for spurious reasons. It does favour BEE lollygags of a mining communities.

The truth is, the ANC only cares about the jobs of its friends. Always 10 000, they lost jobs are dispensable. The ANC has morally broken, institutional corrupt and too lazy to learn basic economics. Any money spent on this department is money spent on destroying the mining industry, which means the life prospects of hundreds of thousands of South Africans. We will not approve one cent of that. [Applause.]

Mr S LUZIPO: Chairperson, the hon Deputy President, protocol observed, let me start on this one. I really appreciate the fact that in Parliament we created committees. And is always my understanding that the contributions that are made in committees, the intention are to assist to move the country forward.

Now I get worried because we are talking of a department here that both the department and its entities had received unqualified audit reports. We were told sitting here that we must respect Chapter 9 institutions. The Auditor-General, AG, said they couldn‘t come to the committee and report to the committee about the department because the department has met all the concerns that it has risen.

And today, we can have people who will undermine the AGs opinion on the performance of the department. If we treat Chapter 9 institutions as institutions that must be respected, we must also treat them as equal, not on the basis of which one we prefer to dance with. I think it is important also to say this.

I find it very strange because I never receive the report that there is politicisation of the department. I welcome it because is reported in the House. Please, give it to me. We always open

and we will take that one, but as a strong witness, you are reporting the case in the wrong place.

If you know of any bribes that are done, go to the nearest police station and report crime that that has been committed. We will support you on that one.

Lastly, I think I must speak to the ANC, and say as the ANC, we have a task to provide leadership, to govern in the best interest of the nation. Nothing else will guide the ANC, except to focus at the task at hand. Thank you very much. We support the budget obviously. It‘s ours. [Time expired.] [Applause.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON: (Ms A T Didiza): I now put Vote No 29: Mineral Resources. Are there any objects. [Interjections.] There are objections. [Interjections.] I now put the question. Those in favour will say aye. [Interjections.] And those against will say noe. I think the ayes have it.

Mr M WATERS: Chairperson, the DA calls for a division, Thank you.

Division demanded.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON: (Ms A T Didiza): Order, hon members! I would like to remind members that they may only vote from their allocated seats. When requested to do so, members must simply indicate their vote by pressing the appropriate button below the

―yes‖, ―no‖ or abstain signs. If a member inadvertently presses the wrong button, the member may, therefore, press the correct button. The last button pressed will be recorded as the member‘s vote when the voting session is closed by the Chair.

The question before the House is that Vote 29 be agreed to. Are all members in their allocated seats? [Interjections.] Voting will now commence. [Interjections.] Those in favour of the vote being agreed to should press the ―yes‖ button. [Interjections.] Those against should press the ―no‖ button and those wishing to abstain should press the ―abstain‖ button. Have all members voted? [Interjections.] Thank you. The voting session is now closed.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON: (Ms A T Didiza): Order, hon members! Authorise votes to vote is 399.

Division demanded.

The House divided.

AYES - 207: Abrahams, B L; Adams, F; Adams, P E; Bam-Mugwanya, V; Basson, J V; Bekwa, S D; Beukman, F; Bhengu, P; Bhengu, F; Bhengu, N R; Bilankulu, N K; Bogopane-Zulu, H I; Bongo, B T; Booi, M S; Boroto, M G; Brown, L; Buthelezi, N S; Capa, R N; Capa, N; Carrim, Y I; Cebekhulu, R N; Cele, B H; Cele, M A; Chauke, H P; Chikunga, L S; Chiloane, T D; Chohan, F I; Chueu, M P; Coleman, E M; Cronin, J P; N R; Bilankulu, N K; Bogopane- Zulu, H I; Bongo, B T; Booi, M S; Boroto, M G; Brown, L; Buthelezi, N S; Capa, R N; Capa, N; Carrim, Y I; Cebekhulu, R N; Cele, B H; Cele, M A; Chauke, H P; Chikunga, L S; Chiloane, T D; Chohan, F I; Chueu, M P; Coleman, E M; Cronin, J P; Cwele, S C; Dirks, M A; Dlakude, D E; Dlamini-Dubazana, Z S; Dlulane, B N; Dunjwa, M L; Ebrahim, E I; Esterhuizen, J A; Faku, Z C; Filtane, M L W; Frolick, C T; Fubbs, J L; Gcwabaza, N E; Gigaba, K M N; Gina, N; Goqwana, M B; Gumede, D M; Jeffery, J H; Joemat- Pettersson, T M; Johnson, M; Jonas, M H; Kalako, M U; Kekana, P S; Kekana, H B; Kekana, M D; Kekana, E; Kekana, C D; Kenye, T E; Khoarai, L P; Khosa, D H; Khoza, T Z M; Khoza, M B; Khunou, N P; Kilian, J D; Koornhof, G W; Kubayi, M T; Lesoma, R M M; Loliwe, F S; Luzipo, S; Maake, J J; Mabasa, X; Mabe, B P; Mabe, P P; Mabija, L; Mabilo, S P; Mabudafhasi, T R; Madella, A F; Madlopha, C Q; Maesela, P; Mafolo, M V; Mafu, N N; Magadla, N W; Magadzi, D P; Magwanishe, G; Mahambehlala, T; Mahlalela, A F; Mahlangu, J L; Mahlangu, D G; Majola, F Z; Makhubela- Mashele, L

S; Makhubele, Z S; Makondo, T; Makwetla, S P; Malgas, H H; Maluleke, J M; Maluleke, B J; Manamela, K B; Manana, M N S; Manana, D P; Mandela, Z M D; Mantashe, P T; Maphatsoe, E R K; Mapulane, M P; Martins, B A D; Masango, M S A; Masehela, E K M; Mashego-Dlamini, K C; Mashile, B L; Masondo, N A; Masuku, M B; Maswanganyi, M J; Mathebe, D H; Matlala, M H; Matshoba, M O; Matsimbi, C; Mavunda, R T; Maxegwana, C H M; Mbalula, F A; Mchunu, S; Mdakane, M R; Memela, T C; Mjobo, L N; Mkhize, H B; Mmemezi, H M Z; Mmola, M P; Mmusi, S G; Mncwango, M A; Mnganga - Gcabashe, L A; Mnguni, P J; Mnguni, D; Mnisi, N A; Mogotsi, V P; Mokoto, N R; Molebatsi, M A; Molewa, B E E; Morutoa, M R; Mothapo, M R M; Motimele, M S; Motshekga, M S; Motsoaledi, P A; Mpumlwana, L K B; Msimang, C T; Mthembu, J M; Mthembu, N; Mthethwa, E M; Nchabeleng, M E; Ndaba, C N; Ndongeni, N; Newhoudt-Druchen, W S; Ngcobo, B T; Ngwenya-Mabila, P C; Nkadimeng, M F; Nkwinti, G E; Nobanda, G N; November, N T; Nqakula, C; Ntombela, M L D; Nxesi, T W; Nyambi, H V; Oliphant, M N; Oliphant, G G; Pandor, G N M; Patel, E; Phaahla, M J; Phosa, Y N; Pikinini, I A; Pilane-Majake, M C C; Radebe, B A; Radebe, J T; Radebe, G S; Ralegoma, S M; Ramaphosa, M C; Ramatlakane, L; Ramatlhodi, N A; Rantho, D Z; Raphuti, D D; Semenya, M R; Senokoanyane, D Z; September, C C; Shaik Emam, A M; Shope-Sithole, S C N; Sibande, M P; Sisulu, L N; Sithole, K P; Siwela, E K; Skosana, J J; Skwatsha, M; Smith, V G; Sotyu, M M;

Surty, M E; Thabethe, E; Thomson, B; Tleane, S A; Tobias, T V; Tseke, G K; Tseli, R M; Tsenoli, S L; Tsoleli, S P; Tuck, A; v R Koornhof, N J J; Van Der Merwe, L L; Van Schalkwyk, S R; Williams, A J; Xasa, T; Yengeni, L E; Zokwana, S; Zulu, L D.

NOES - 58: America, D; Atkinson, P G; Bagraim, M; Baker, T E; Bergman, D; Boshoff, H S; Bozzoli, B; Brauteseth, T J; Cardo, M J; Chance, R W T; De Freitas, M S F; Dreyer, A M; Edwards, J; Esau, S; Figg, M J; Figlan, A M; Grootboom, G A; Horn, W; Hunsinger, C H H; James, L V; James, W G; Jongbloed, Z; Kalyan, S V; Kohler, D; Kruger, H C C; Lorimer, J R B; Lotriet, A; Lovemore, A T; Mackay, G; Mackenzie, C; Majola, T R; Malatsi, M S; Marais, S J F; Marais, E J; Masango, B S ; Matsepe, C D; Maynier, D J; Mazzone, N W A; Mbhele, Z N; Mhlongo, T W; Ollis, I M; Rabotapi, M W; Redelinghuys, M H; Robertson, K P; Robinson, D; Schmidt, H C; Shinn, M R; Steenhuisen, J H; Stubbe, D J; Topham, B R; Van Damme, P T; Van Der Walt, D; Van Der Westhuizen, A P; Van Dyk, V; Volmink, H C; Vos, J; Waters, M; Wilson, E R.

Vote accordingly agreed to.

Vote No 30 – Science and Technology – put.

*Declarations of vote*:

Dr A LOTRIET: Voorsitter, regoor die wêreld is dit slim en voorskouende nasies wat grootliks belê in navorsing, innovasie, en hoër onderwys. Hierdie nasionale beleggingstrategieë begryp ‘n fundamentele waarheid oor die toekomstige voorspoed en ekonomiese groei van ‘n land. Hierdie lande besef dat navorsing en innovasie sentraal staan tot nasionele ekonomiese krag, werkskepping en globale mededingendheid. *(Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.)*

[Dr A LOTRIET: Chairperson, across the world it is smart and forward-looking nations that largely invest in research, innovation and higher education. These national investment strategies understand a fundamental truth about the future prosperity and economic growth of a country. These countries realise that research and innovation is central to national economic power, job creation and global competitiveness.]

This is the kind of approach to research and development and innovation that should play an important role in government and funding priorities, given the major problems we have in this country in terms of economic growth.

We have also had to deal with the devastating reality that we now have 8,9 million people who are unemployed, and the tragic part of this is that our youth is the most affected. Beside all the other problems, this alone should make science and technology and the budget of Science and Technology a priority on par with education and health.

However, the budget for the department has been decreased by 6,86%. Cabinet has also approved reductions of R414 million in three critical programmes. This should let the alarm bells ring. The entities are struggling. It is getting worse for them; they are struggling to get funding for research, and now they also have to cope with an additional cut of R414 million and a salary cut of R52,9 million over the medium term.

The current budget creates tremendous challenges for the department, and this budget is proof that the ANC government just does not get the role and importance of science and technology in innovation. However, the DA will support this budget. [Applause.]

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Chairperson, let me start off by saying to the member of the DA who referred to me as Mr Bhoola, another Bhoola, it appears to smack of racism. He referred to me as ―Mr

Bhoola‖ because, like me, Mr Bhoola is of Indian descent. [Interjections.] I am not surprised at the racism by the DA, and the other member who commented earlier on seems to be an expert on that part of the human body. He seems to be using it extensively. [Interjections.]

Chairperson, let me thank the Minister of Science and Technology for the compassion and the support she has given the president

of the NFP, Zanele Magwaza-Msibi. Indeed, we are very grateful. Thank you very much.

The Department of Science and Technology, under the leadership

of the hon Minister, is indeed doing a fantastic job. Let us all admit that. We regret the decrease in the allocation, and we

hope that in the next financial we will appropriate much more money for the kind of work you are doing in your department. We

also want to encourage a process in the school curriculum to

encourage learners to take up science and mathematics, which both of which are very important. We believe there is a process

in place, but we need to accelerate that.

The NFP believes that with the limited budget at its disposal, we should support the budget of the Department of Science and

Technology. Accordingly, the NFP supports it. Thank you very much. [Applause.]

Mr M D KEKANA: Chairperson and Minister Naledi Pandor, the ANC supports the Budget Vote. We all agree that the Department of Science and Technology is underfunded, but it does not mean that we should not pass the budget. Let‘s pass the budget to produce more human capital and innovation and continue to do this with passion, as that is what drives the ANC government.

As the ANC, we agree that the budget must go through. We all know, including the members on the left, that since the Department of Science and Technology has operated under this democratic government, we have achieved a lot. We have many black children, and white, with PhDs and master‘s degrees. That is a big achievement. I thank you. [Applause.]

Vote accordingly agreed to.

Vote No 31 – Small Business Development – put.

*Declarations of vote*:

Mr R W T CHANCE: Chairperson, this department can rightly be accused of fiddling whilst South Africa burns. The DA will

support all efforts and money spent on policies and programmes that deliver real, measurable and positive returns. The Department of Small Business Development does not yet demonstrate these returns. Therefore, we cannot support the budget.

Minister Zulu‘s announcement on Friday to the Standing Committee on Appropriations that she has initiated a review of government funding for small businesses is an admission that all is not rosy in this department – and small business development in general. Is this recognition, at last, that unemployment of

8,9 million people is a national disaster, Deputy President?

The performance of the Small Enterprise Finance Agency, Sefa, shows consistently and worryingly high levels of loan impairments, whilst its job-creating impact is woefully short of what the economy needs to make a significant contribution to the economy.

The Small Enterprise Development Agency, Seda, which consumes half the department‘s budget is unable to report on the impact of its half a billion rand expenditure. All it can report is how many businesses it has supported in its various programmes.

There is crucial information missing from both Sefa and Seda‘s budgets, as well as the department‘s budget as a whole.

Where is the impact of their beneficiary performance in real, tangible things like new enterprises formed, turnover and profits generated, taxes paid, new products developed, patents registered, export earnings achieved, jobs created, salaries paid, and so on? This information must track each beneficiary over time so that the long-term impact of financing can be assessed. Until this is done, it will be impossible to say whether Minister Zulu‘s department is spending money wisely.

Other shortcomings of the budget are the inadequate provisions for red tape reduction. The strategic review of the department released in November puts this as a top priority, though, to date, the department has not recognised this. For these reasons, the DA cannot support this budget. I thank you. [Applause.]

Ms N R BHENGU: Chairperson, the ANC supports Budget Vote No 31: Small Business Development. We believe that the Department of Small Business Development is very important in achieving radical economic transformation.

The budget will develop small businesses and co-operatives. Those who commercialise the misery of poor people by renting them and transporting them in trucks designed to transport animals and goods would not support this budget because it would liberate the poor from the shackles of poverty.

Lapha ngiphethe umkhiqizo, nawu umkhiqizo wesivuno senkampani yomndeni wakwaMnchunu e-Fawn Leas KwaZulu-Natali endaweni yasemakhaya kugaywa u-soya beans kuhlanganiswe nokherothi neklabishi no-anyanisi. Lenkampani le izokwenza ukuthi laba abatshalayo bazuze ngokuthumela kuyona ukuthi igaye. Yinkampani yokuqala yabantu abamnyama egaya ukudla. [Ihlombe.]

Abezitolo zesipaza bazokwazi ukuthenga ebantwini bakubo bakwazi ukwakha omasibambisane babo ukuze bazokwazi ukuba yizikhungo ezisabalalisa umkhiqizo ... [Ubuwelewele.] ... imali ijikeleze kumuntu omnyama waseNingizimu Afrika. Laba abathi abaseseki lesi sabiwomali yingoba phela abafuni kuphume iqatha emlonyeni. [Ubuwelewele.] Phela bajwayele ukudla bodwa bengabokufika kulelizwe. Siyaseseka lesi sabiwomali. [Kwaphela isikhathi.] *(Translation of isiZulu paragraphs follows.)*

[The product that I have here is the product from the harvest of Mchunu family in Fawn Leas in KwaZulu-Natal in the rural areas,

they process soya beans and carrots as well as cabbages and onions. This company will benefit the farmers by sending to them for processing. This is the first black owned processing company. [Applause.]

Spaza shop owners will be able to buy from their own people and form co-operatives with them so that they can be able to be the distribution centres ... [Interjections.] ... money must rotate amongst the black people of South Africa. Those who are not supporting this Budget Vote are those who do not want to lose what has always been theirs. [Interjections.] They are used to benefiting alone and they are from outside this country. We support this Budget Vote. [Time expired.]]

Division demanded.

The House divided.

AYES - 207: Abrahams, B L; Adams, F; Adams, P E; Bam-Mugwanya, V; Basson, J V; Bekwa, S D; Beukman, F; Bhengu, P; Bhengu, F; Bhengu, N R; Bilankulu, N K; Bogopane-Zulu, H I; Bongo, B T; Booi, M S; Boroto, M G; Brown, L; Buthelezi, N S; Capa, R N; Capa, N; Carrim, Y I; Cebekhulu, R N; Cele, B H; Cele, M A; Chauke, H P; Chikunga, L S; Chiloane, T D; Chohan, F I; Chueu, M

P; Coleman, E M; Cronin, J P; Cwele, S C; Dirks, M A; Dlakude, D E; Dlamini-Dubazana, Z S; Dlulane, B N; Dunjwa, M L; Ebrahim, E I; Esterhuizen, J A; Faku, Z C; Frolick, C T; Fubbs, J L; Gamede, D D; Gcwabaza, N E; Gigaba, K M N; Gina, N; Goqwana, M B; Gordhan, P J; Gumede, D M; Jeffery, J H; Joemat-Pettersson, T M; Johnson, M; Jonas, M H; Kalako, M U; Kekana, H B; Kekana, P S; Kekana, M D; Kekana, E; Kekana, C D; Kenye, T E; Khoarai, L P; Khosa, D H; Khoza, T Z M; Khoza, M B; Khunou, N P; Kilian, J D; Koornhof, G W; Kubayi, M T; Loliwe, F S; Luzipo, S; Maake, J J; Mabasa, X; Mabe, B P; Mabe, P P; Mabija, L; Mabilo, S P; Mabudafhasi, T R; Madella, A F; Madlopha, C Q; Maesela, P; Mafolo, M V; Mafu, N N; Magadla, N W; Magadzi, D P; Magwanishe, G; Mahambehlala, T; Mahlalela, A F; Mahlangu, D G; Mahlangu, J L; Majola, F Z; Makhubela-Mashele, L S; Makhubele, Z S; Makondo, T; Makwetla, S P; Malgas, H H; Maluleke, J M; Maluleke, B J; Manamela, K B; Manana, M N S; Manana, D P; Mantashe, P T; Maphatsoe, E R K; Mapulane, M P; Martins, B A D; Masango, M S A; Masehela, E K M; Mashego-Dlamini, K C; Mashile, B L; Masondo, N A; Masuku, M B; Maswanganyi, M J; Mathebe, D H; Matlala, M H; Matshoba, M O; Matsimbi, C; Mavunda, R T; Maxegwana, C H M; Mbalula, F A; Mchunu, S; Mdakane, M R; Memela, T C; Mjobo, L N; Mkhize, H B; Mmemezi, H M Z; Mmola, M P; Mmusi, S G; Mncwango, M A; Mnganga - Gcabashe, L A; Mnguni, P J; Mnguni, D; Mnisi, N A; Mogotsi, V P; Mokoto, N R; Molebatsi, M A; Molewa, B E E;

Morutoa, M R; Mothapo, M R M; Motimele, M S; Motshekga, M A; Motshekga, M S; Motsoaledi, P A; Mpumlwana, L K B; Msimang, C T; Mthembu, J M; Mthembu, N; Mthethwa, E M; Nchabeleng, M E; Ndaba, C N; Ndongeni, N; Newhoudt-Druchen, W S; Ngcobo, B T; Ngwenya- Mabila, P C; Nkwinti, G E; Nobanda, G N; November, N T; Nqakula, C; Ntombela, M L D; Nxesi, T W; Nyambi, H V; Oliphant, M N; Oliphant, G G; Pandor, G N M; Patel, E; Phaahla, M J; Phosa, Y N; Pikinini, I A; Pilane-Majake, M C C; Radebe, B A; Radebe, J T; Radebe, G S; Ralegoma, S M; Ramaphosa, M C; Ramatlakane, L; Ramatlhodi, N A; Rantho, D Z; Raphuti, D D; Semenya, M R; Senokoanyane, D Z; September, C C; Shaik Emam, A M; Shope- Sithole, S C N; Sibande, M P; Sithole, K P; Siwela, E K; Skosana, J J; Skwatsha, M; Smith, V G; Sotyu, M M; Surty, M E; Thabethe, E; Thomson, B; Tleane, S A; Tobias, T V; Tseke, G K; Tseli, R M; Tsenoli, S L; Tshwete, P; Tsoleli, S P; Tuck, A; v R Koornhof, N J J; Van Der Merwe, L L; Van Schalkwyk, S R; Williams, A J; Xasa, T; Xego, S T; Yengeni, L E; Zokwana, S; Zulu, L D.

NOES - 57: America, D; Atkinson, P G; Baker, T E; Basson, L J; Bergman, D; Boshoff, H S; Bozzoli, B; Cardo, M J; Chance, R W T; De Freitas, M S F; De Kock, K; Dreyer, A M; Edwards, J; Esau, S; Figg, M J; Figlan, A M; Grootboom, G A; Horn, W; Hunsinger, C H H; James, L V; Jongbloed, Z; Kalyan, S V; Kohler, D; Kruger, H C

C; Krumbock, G R; Lees, R A; Lorimer, J R B; Lotriet, A; Lovemore, A T; Mackay, G; Mackenzie, C; Majola, T R; Malatsi, M S; Marais, S J F; Masango, B S ; Matsepe, C D; Maynier, D J; Mazzone, N W A; Mbhele, Z N; Mhlongo, T W; Ollis, I M; Rabotapi, M W; Redelinghuys, M H; Robertson, K P; Robinson, D; Schmidt, H C; Shinn, M R; Steenhuisen, J H; Stubbe, D J; Topham, B R; Van Damme, P T; Van Der Walt, D; Van Der Westhuizen, A P; Van Dyk, V; Volmink, H C; Vos, J; Waters, M.

Vote accordingly agreed to.

Vote No 32 – Telecommunications and Postal Services – put.

Declarations of vote made on behalf of the Democratic Alliance, and African National Congress.

*Declarations of vote:*

Mr C MACKENZIE: Hon House Chairperson, this budget is bigger on promises, smaller on delivery and completely at odds with Minister Pravin Godhan‘s direction to stop borrowing what you cannot repay. At the conservative estimate, R69 billion is needed just to effectively fund the SA Connect, Broadcasting Digital Migration programmes over the next three years.

However, with the 0,6% economic growth the state cannot fund this, but private-public partnerships, PPPs as outlined in the National Development Plan can. Minister Gordhan said and I quote:

The report of the Presidential Review Commission on state- owned entities notes our infrastructure financing requirements are huge and require effective cofunding arrangements between state-owned companies and other investors yet there are no other private-public partnerships, or other private incentives in this Budget that if applied can help deliver the much needed communications infrastructure in urban and rural areas.

Two years ago, Minister Cwele said the government would meet the June 2015 deadline for switching on digital terrestrial television and switching off analogue. That is now been postponed to 2020. A year ago Minister Cwele said SA Post Office, Sapo, would lose only R102 million this year. Instead it lost a massive R1 500 billion. Now we are asked to believe it would show profit in 2018, but only with the help in billions more in taxpayer bailouts no PPPs insight here.

There is no information on National Electronic Media Institute of SA, Nemisa, and Broadband Infraco, but we must accept that all is well and just sign a blank check. [Interjections.]

An HON DA MALE MEMBER: Never!

Mr C MACKENZIE: Hon Kilian of the National Party ... I mean of Cope ... I mean of the ANC! [Laughter.] [Interjections.]

Dis partykeer die hele Nasionale Party koukus wat hier sit! [Sometimes the entire caucus of the National Party sits here!]

... bemoan the fact that the DA has not supported a single telecommunications budget. She is right and here is another reason why: Every stakeholder in the national Information and Communication Technology, ICT, forum has all said the same thing. Telecommunications and communications should have never been split into two Ministries. Given this unnecessary, pointless and wasteful split we have lost faith. We do not support this budget. [Time expired.] [Applause.]

Ms M T KUBAYI: Hon House Chair, the ANC supports the Budget Vote. Hon Mackenzie of ANC or by the way DA, funding of SA Connect has been clearly outlined in terms of private

partnership incentives. It very clear because the Minister has been following what Minister Pravin Gordhan has said. There is no funding and therefore they have found a mechanism to solve the problem. So, I do not understand what you are looking for because it is in the document. Oh, by the way, it is the same way you misunderstood the chairperson to be the other one.

I think you have made a mistake again, where you said National Electronic Media Institute of SA, Nemisa‘s chair was somebody who was still there now you say somebody else. The Broadcasting Digital Migration, BDM, project does not belongs to telecommunications. It belongs to the Department of Communications. Minister Muthambi is the one who is responsible for that. Now you are asking issues which belongs to another portfolio to another one. No, I am not so sure if you looked at the right portfolio. You looked at the right budget to start with to be here. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order!

Ms M T KUBAYI: Unfortunately, hon member, I would like to refer you back to the right budget, the right Appropriation Bill and the report, so that you can make a valuable input, because this one is really out as you followed the wrong one.

On SA Post Office, Sapo, it is very clear, the plans are exactly what we have recommended. Previously we said go and reconsider the funds that are there and the mechanisms. We said as the committee; let us support Sapo in terms of business not only in terms of bailout and that is the planning and the turnaround strategy.

I am not so sure what you are referring right to now. So, it shows clearly hon Mackenzie that you have not really done the homework this time. Apologies I really understand it is very late at night; possibly you have been affected by the sugar levels. Let see you next time. Thank you. [Applause.]

Division demanded.

The House divided.

AYES - 200: Abrahams, B L; Adams, F; Adams, P E; Bam-Mugwanya, V; Basson, J V; Bekwa, S D; Beukman, F; Bhengu, P; Bhengu, F; Bhengu, N R; Bilankulu, N K; Bogopane-Zulu, H I; Bongo, B T; Booi, M S; Boroto, M G; Brown, L; Buthelezi, N S; Capa, R N; Capa, N; Carrim, Y I; Cele, B H; Cele, M A; Chauke, H P; Chikunga, L S; Chiloane, T D; Chohan, F I; Chueu, M P; Coleman, E M; Cronin, J P; Cwele, S C; Dirks, M A; Dlakude, D E; Dlamini-

Dubazana, Z S; Dlulane, B N; Dunjwa, M L; Ebrahim, E I; Faku, Z C; Frolick, C T; Fubbs, J L; Gamede, D D; Gcwabaza, N E; Gigaba, K M N; Gina, N; Goqwana, M B; Gordhan, P J; Gumede, D M; Jeffery, J H; Joemat-Pettersson, T M; Johnson, M; Jonas, M H; Kalako, M U; Kekana, P S; Kekana, H B; Kekana, M D; Kekana, C D; Kekana, E; Kenye, T E; Khoarai, L P; Khosa, D H; Khoza, T Z M; Khunou, N P; Kilian, J D; Koornhof, G W; Kubayi, M T; Lesoma, R M M; Loliwe, F S; Luzipo, S; Maake, J J; Mabasa, X; Mabe, B P; Mabe, P P; Mabija, L; Mabilo, S P; Mabudafhasi, T R; Madella, A F; Madlopha, C Q; Maesela, P; Mafolo, M V; Mafu, N N; Magadla, N W; Magadzi, D P; Mahlalela, A F; Mahlangu, D G; Mahlangu, J L; Majola, F Z; Makhubela-Mashele, L S; Makhubele, Z S; Makondo, T; Makwetla, S P; Malgas, H H; Maluleke, J M; Maluleke, B J; Manamela, K B; Manana, M N S; Manana, D P; Mandela, Z M D; Mantashe, P T; Maphatsoe , E R K; Mapulane, M P; Martins, B A D; Masango, M S A; Masehela, E K M; Mashego-Dlamini, K C; Mashile, B L; Masondo, N A; Masuku, M B; Maswanganyi, M J; Mathebe, D H; Matlala, M H; Matshoba, M O; Matsimbi, C; Mavunda, R T; Maxegwana, C H M; Mbalula, F A; Mchunu, S; Mdakane, M R; Memela, T C; Mjobo, L N; Mkhize, H B; Mmemezi, H M Z; Mmola, M P; Mmusi, S G; Mnganga - Gcabashe, L A; Mnguni, P J; Mnguni, D; Mnisi, N A; Mogotsi, V P; Mokoto, N R; Molebatsi, M A; Molewa, B E E; Morutoa, M R; Mothapo, M R M; Motimele, M S; Motshekga, M A; Motshekga, M S; Motsoaledi, P A; Mpumlwana, L K B; Mthembu, J M;

Mthembu, N; Mthethwa, E M; Nchabeleng, M E; Ndaba, C N; Ndongeni, N; Newhoudt-Druchen, W S; Ngcobo, B T; Ngwenya-Mabila, P C; Nkadimeng, M F; Nkwinti, G E; Nobanda, G N; November, N T; Nqakula, C; Ntombela, M L D; Nxesi, T W; Nyambi, H V; Oliphant, M N; Oliphant, G G; Pandor, G N M; Patel, E; Phaahla, M J; Phosa, Y N; Pikinini, I A; Pilane-Majake, M C C; Radebe, B A; Radebe, J T; Radebe, G S; Ralegoma, S M; Ramaphosa, M C; Ramatlakane, L; Ramatlhodi, N A; Rantho, D Z; Raphuti, D D; Semenya, M R; Senokoanyane, D Z; September, C C; Shaik Emam, A M; Shope-Sithole, S C N; Sibande, M P; Siwela, E K; Skosana, J J; Skwatsha, M; Smith, V G; Surty, M E; Thabethe, E; Thomson, B; Tleane, S A; Tobias, T V; Tseke, G K; Tseli, R M; Tsenoli, S L; Tshwete, P; Tsoleli, S P; Tuck, A; v R Koornhof, N J J; Van Schalkwyk, S R; Williams, A J; Xasa, T; Xego, S T; Yengeni, L E; Zokwana, S; Zulu, L D.

NOES - 56: America, D; Atkinson, P G; Baker, T E; Basson, L J; Bergman, D; Boshoff, H S; Bozzoli, B; Brauteseth, T J; Cardo, M J; Chance, R W T; De Freitas, M S F; De Kock, K; Dreyer, A M; Edwards, J; Esau, S; Figg, M J; Figlan, A M; Groenewald, H B; Grootboom, G A; Horn, W; Hunsinger, C H H; James, L V; Jongbloed, Z; Kalyan, S V; Kohler, D; Kruger, H C C; Krumbock, G R; Lees, R A; Lorimer, J R B; Lotriet, A; Lovemore, A T; Mackenzie, C; Majola, T R; Malatsi, M S; Marais, S J F; Masango,

B S ; Matsepe, C D; Maynier, D J; Mbhele, Z N; Mhlongo, T W; Ollis, I M; Rabotapi, M W; Redelinghuys, M H; Robertson, K P; Robinson, D; Schmidt, H C; Shinn, M R; Steenhuisen, J H; Stubbe, D J; Topham, B R; Van Damme, P T; Van Der Walt, D; Van Dyk, V; Volmink, H C; Vos, J; Waters, M.

ABSTAIN - 6: Cebekhulu, R N; Esterhuizen, J A; Mncwango, M A; Msimang, C T; Sithole, K P; Van Der Merwe, L L.

Vote accordingly agreed to.

Vote No 33 – Tourism – put.

Declarations of vote made on behalf of the Democratic Alliance and African National Congress.

*Declarations of vote:*

Mr J VOS: Madam Chair, against the backdrop of prolonged strikes in other key sectors and economic downturns, tourism is the only major industry parking the trend. Therefore Madam Chair, the DA supports this Budget Vote because we believe that tourism has the ability to create jobs for the 8,9 million unemployed South Africans.

Therefore, the mere fact that tourism takes place does not imply that the money trickles down to the poor. Our debate must focus on actions required to deal with the current discourse between tourism and poverty alleviation. We need real measures to ensure that tourism does reduce poverty.

Now, turning to the international sector: The truth of the matter is that the visa requirements are still proving to be a very serious obstacle for people wanting to visit our country. And its impact on our economy is severe. Just imagine if these regulations were subjected to any regulatory impact assessments prior to implementations, we could have avoided these disastrous consequences.

And I am saying this because presently on average, 40 people a day are still being turned away from travelling to South Africa because of the continued confusion surrounding the requirement of the unabridged birth certificates for minors travelling to our country. I am quoting statistics received from the SA Airways, SAA.

The solution is to scrap the unabridged birth certificate and implement electronic visas. These measures will streamline tourist facilitation to our country before every 12

international tourist visiting South Africa, one job is created. So in the end, given the job loses in the mining and the manufacturing sectors we need tourism to keep South Africans working. Thank you. [Applause.]

Nk B T NGCOBO: Sihlalo, uKhongolose uyasixhasa lesi sabiwomali sezokuvakasha. Usixhasa ikakhulukazi ngoba kuya qala ngqa ukuthi isabelomali sezokuvakasha sifinyelele ku-R2 billion selokhu ezokuvakasha zaba khona eNingizimu Afrika. UKhongolose aphinde axhase ezokuvakasha njengoba eseshilo ongaphesheya komfula ukuthi lapho umnotho ulele ngesisu ezokuvakasha ziyawusimamisa umnotho. Lokho okunye akushoyo siyazi ukuthi i-IMC, Integrated Marketing Communication, ibekiwe ukuthi ibhekele lezo zimo ezisasilele ngemuva. Ngakho-ke singuKhongolose siyasixhasa isabiwomali sezokuvasha. Ngiyabonga. [Ihlombe.] *(Translation of isiZulu paragraph follows.)*

[Ms B T NGCOBO: Chairperson, the ANC supports this Budget Vote on Tourism. We support it because it is the first time for the budget on tourism to be at R2 billion since the establishment of the Department of Tourism in South Africa. The ANC supports this Tourism Budget Vote because, like the hon in the opposition has alluded to that, when the economy is sinking tourism boosts the economy. With regard to what was mentioned, we know that the

IMC, Integrated Marketing Communication, has been employed in order to deal with the outstanding issues. Therefore, as the ANC, we support the Tourism Budget Vote. Thank you. [Applause.]]

Vote accordingly agreed to.

Vote 34 – Trade and Industry – put.

Declarations of vote made on behalf of the Democratic Alliance and African National Congress.

*Declarations of vote:*

Mr B R TOPHAM: Hon House Chair, in objectively assessing this department‘s budget, we must assess it using the following three critical criteria: Firstly, economic growth. Whilst the international community and the general worldwide economic climate have been used as an excuse to explain the South African stunt at growth, the fact remains that our country has slipped from the largest economy in Africa to the third largest. Our neighbours have all faced similar challenges, yet they have grown and we have shrunk. The department has failed in its role to help grow our economy.

Secondly, it is a common course that too little progress has been made in transforming the economy through the constructive interventions needed to reduce the gap between the different demographic groups in South Africa. Despite this, the department remain focused on applying policies aimed at empowering a few chosen elite rather than ensuring the upliftment and empowerment their broader community of ordinary South Africans. The department has failed in its role here too.

Thirdly, living without employment or living in poverty remains the ultimate violation of human‘s rights and dignity. This department has failed to owe it in growing our economy. More must be done to aid and promote business to be able to employ the 8,9 million South Africans who are unemployed. Failure in this regard, means our country fails and the fundamental economic reforms we need to implement to take South Africa forward cannot be implemented.

This budget shows no fundamental changes from the previous failed budgets. We cannot support a budget which fails economy. A budget which does not support empowerment of the broader South Africans and we cannot support a budget that fails to enable the creation of jobs to give dignity to all South Africans. The DA

votes against this budget destined to fail South Africa. [Applause.]

Mr J A ESTERHUIZERN: Madam Chair, if you imagine First National Bank, FNB, or Ellis Park Rugby Stadium crammed to the brim with

70 000 people and now imagine five stadiums put together that is the magnitude of the drop of employment in South Africa in just the first three months of this year. If you multiply those

350 000 new jobless people by five dependants each - which is a conservative estimate - you have the real figure of 1,7 million people in three months needing welfare assistance.

Through special grants and other measures, government desperately wants to create new jobs, but these intentions are crippled by policies and practices that were designed to achieve other political ends. Until we can wipe away those we will not see any meaningful shift in the unemployment rate and we will be failing the people of this country. The IFP support this budget. Thank you.

Ms J L FUBBS: Good afternoon, Chairperson. South Africans, the ANC support this bold decisive budget. [Applause.] It is a programme of action by the Minister of Trade and Industry, Dr

Rob Davis, Director-General, DG, Mr Lionel October and his team driving a faster and more inclusive economic growth.

There is the industrial policy action plan, instruments of procurement, beneficiation of minerals, manufacturing value- chain and all of this will cut dependence. We were able then through this to overcome the downward pressures on price on our commodity prices. We will use this platform to leverage the economic capacity of both the private and the public sector.

This R10,3 billion of the budget of the Department of Trade and Industry, DTI, will create an enabling environment to facilitate investment and job creation. Billions have come in, in the country and one of the remarkable programmes is the auto sector which has drown in so much investment.

As matter of fact, this is a country of choice for investors. We are globally number 10! [Applause.] Yes, and to all of those who were telling me that oh! We are going to drop etc. The DTI budget will do what it is expected to do; grow employment and the economy. Just to say one other thing, with regard to the National Regulator for Compulsory Specifications: We will not allow them to be pressured to open up the floodgates to

substandard goods, not under our watch. No! Because we want to protect consumers and our people.

Finally, let me say this: We are creating 10 special industrial zones in former homelands, the depressed areas. So, we are not forgetting any one.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order, hon member. Your time is up.

Ms J L FUBBS: The ANC supports this budget. Thank you. [Applause.]

Division demanded.

The House divided.

AYES - 210: Abrahams, B L; Adams, F; Adams, P E; Bam-Mugwanya, V; Basson, J V; Bekwa, S D; Beukman, F; Bhengu, P; Bhengu, F; Bhengu, N R; Bilankulu, N K; Bogopane-Zulu, H I; Bongo, B T; Booi, M S; Boroto, M G; Brown, L; Buthelezi, N S; Capa, R N; Capa, N; Carrim, Y I; Cebekhulu, R N; Cele, M A; Cele, B H; Chauke, H P; Chikunga, L S; Chiloane, T D; Chohan, F I; Chueu, M P; Coleman, E M; Cronin, J P; Cwele, S C; Dirks, M A; Dlakude, D

E; Dlamini-Dubazana, Z S; Dlulane, B N; Dunjwa, M L; Ebrahim, E I; Esterhuizen, J A; Faku, Z C; Filtane, M L W; Frolick, C T; Fubbs, J L; Gamede, D D; Gcwabaza, N E; Gigaba, K M N; Gina, N; Goqwana, M B; Gordhan, P J; Gumede, D M; Jeffery, J H; Joemat- Pettersson, T M; Johnson, M; Jonas, M H; Kalako, M U; Kekana, P S; Kekana, H B; Kekana, C D; Kekana, M D; Kekana, E; Kenye, T E; Khoarai, L P; Khosa, D H; Khoza, T Z M; Khoza, M B; Khunou, N P; Kilian, J D; Koornhof, G W; Kubayi, M T; Lesoma, R M M; Loliwe,

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| F S; Luzipo, S; Maake, J J; Mabasa, X; Mabe, B P; Mabe, | P | P; |
| Mabilo, S P; Mabudafhasi, T R; Madella, A F; Madlopha, | C | Q; |
| Maesela, P; Mafolo, M V; Mafu, N N; Magadla, N W; Magadzi, | D | P; |
| Magwanishe, G; Mahambehlala, T; Mahlalela, A F; Mahlangu, | D | G; |

Mahlangu, J L; Majola, F Z; Makhubela-Mashele, L S; Makhubele, Z S; Makondo, T; Makwetla, S P; Malgas, H H; Maluleke, J M; Maluleke, B J; Manamela, K B; Manana, M N S; Manana, D P; Mandela, Z M D; Mantashe, P T; Maphatsoe, E R K; Martins, B A D; Masango, M S A; Masehela, E K M; Mashego-Dlamini, K C; Mashile, B L; Masondo, N A; Masuku, M B; Maswanganyi, M J; Mathebe, D H; Matlala, M H; Matshoba, M O; Matsimbi, C; Mavunda, R T; Maxegwana, C H M; Mbalula, F A; Mchunu, S; Mdakane, M R; Memela, T C; Mjobo, L N; Mkhize, H B; Mmemezi, H M Z; Mmola, M P; Mmusi, S G; Mncwango, M A; Mnganga - Gcabashe, L A; Mnguni, P J; Mnguni, D; Mnisi, N A; Mogotsi, V P; Mokoto, N R; Molebatsi, M A; Molewa, B E E; Morutoa, M R; Mothapo, M R M; Motimele, M S;

Motshekga, M A; Motshekga, M S; Motsoaledi, P A; Mpumlwana, L K B; Msimang, C T; Mthembu, J M; Mthembu, N; Mthethwa, E M; Nchabeleng, M E; Ndaba, C N; Ndongeni, N; Newhoudt-Druchen, W S; Ngcobo, B T; Ngwenya-Mabila, P C; Nkadimeng, M F; Nkwinti, G E; Nobanda, G N; November, N T; Nqakula, C; Ntombela, M L D; Nxesi, T W; Nyambi, H V; Oliphant, M N; Oliphant, G G; Pandor, G N M; Patel, E; Phaahla, M J; Phosa, Y N; Pikinini, I A; Pilane- Majake, M C C; Radebe, B A; Radebe, J T; Radebe, G S; Ralegoma, S M; Ramaphosa, M C; Ramatlakane, L; Ramatlhodi, N A; Rantho, D Z; Raphuti, D D; Semenya, M R; Senokoanyane, D Z; September, C C; Shaik Emam, A M; Shope-Sithole, S C N; Sibande, M P; Sisulu, L N; Sithole, K P; Siwela, E K; Skosana, J J; Skwatsha, M; Smith, V G; Sotyu, M M; Surty, M E; Thabethe, E; Thomson, B; Tleane, S A; Tobias, T V; Tseke, G K; Tseli, R M; Tsenoli, S L; Tshwete, P; Tsoleli, S P; Tuck, A; v R Koornhof, N J J; Van Der Merwe, L L; Van Schalkwyk, S R; Williams, A J; Xasa, T; Xego, S T; Yengeni, L E; Zokwana, S; Zulu, L D.

NOES - 55: America, D; Atkinson, P G; Baker, T E; Basson, L J; Bergman, D; Boshoff, H S; Bozzoli, B; Brauteseth, T J; Cardo, M J; Chance, R W T; De Freitas, M S F; De Kock, K; Dreyer, A M; Edwards, J; Esau, S; Figg, M J; Figlan, A M; Groenewald, H B; Grootboom, G A; Horn, W; Hunsinger, C H H; James, L V; Jongbloed, Z; Kalyan, S V; Kohler, D; Kruger, H C C; Krumbock, G

R; Lees, R A; Lorimer, J R B; Lotriet, A; Lovemore, A T; Mackay, G; Mackenzie, C; Majola, T R; Masango, B S ; Matsepe, C D; Maynier, D J; Mazzone, N W A; Mhlongo, T W; Ollis, I M; Rabotapi, M W; Redelinghuys, M H; Robinson, D; Schmidt, H C; Shinn, M R; Steenhuisen, J H; Topham, B R; Van Damme, P T; Van Der Walt, D; Van Der Westhuizen, A P; Van Dyk, V; Volmink, H C; Vos, J; Waters, M; Wilson, E R.

Vote accordingly agreed to.

Vote No 35 – Transport – put.

*Declarations of vote:*

Mr M S F DE FREITAS: Madam House Chair, it is quite clear that the lack of leadership and presence from the Minister - as she is evidently not here - and the disappointing lack of guidance expected from the Department of Transport have led to the despondent situation in the transport sector. Most of the programmes are concept driven instead of completion driven.

Sporadic new ideas now have to make up for serious seismic deficiencies. Only four of the 12 entities can survive financially without being bailed out from time to time.

The DA‘s decision not to support Budget Vote No 35 on Transport is based on the following factors. Firstly, there is no sense of urgency. The majority of progress reports are cluttered with excuses, like extended public participation. How can this be?

Secondly, there is no sense of reality. No entity presented their strategic and annual performance plans with a regard for physical constraints we are entering, seemingly under the impression that this is temporary in nature and that some Big Brother Department of Transport or Treasury will bail them out. The cost of employment in our Public Service, nationwide, is close to R500 billion, which is unsustainable. Yet, 8,9 million people remain unemployed, with the government doing nothing about it.

Thirdly, there is no sense of consequence. Where procurement and tender inaccuracies occur, the dust settles with little effort after the capital recovery. Worst of all, new policies on prevention land in the bottom drawer.

Fourthly, there is no sense of concern. The reaction from leadership on uncovering corruption and fraud demonstrates a greater regret for having been discovered than for the crime itself.

Lastly, there is confusion. Former prioritised projects simply disappear from one financial year to another. An example of this is the single transport economic regulator. I thank you.

Mr K P SITHOLE: Hon House Chair, the impact of e-tolls on road users that cannot afford them is shocking. E-tolling is harming the poor and working class, who are already struggling with the higher cost of living in South Africa. During the public hearings on e-tolls, it was made loud and clear. No parties at the hearings wanted e-tolls. Public outcry was deafening, yet, we still have e-tolls.

The ANC Gauteng Chairperson Mashatile even said:

Government agencies must know they do not run this country. We do. The SA National Roads Agency Ltd, Sanral, cannot tell us what to do. We will tell them what to do.

He said he, as the ANC Chair, was unrepentant in its opposition towards e-tolling. Not even the ANC in Gauteng wants e-tolling. Yet, we have it. Our roads are paid for by other means. E-toll fees collected are sent overseas.

The IFP feels strongly that e-tolls must be reconsidered and a user-pays system be used. This system has functioned in South Africa. They do well and we have all used them. E-tolling must fall and must never implemented.

Hon Minister, what systems have you put in place to curb the tragic and horrific car crashes on our roads? People are not being arrested and it seems to be getting worse. Drunk driving and reckless driving in unroadworthy vehicles are not helping. We, as the IFP, want to see more visible policing on our roads.

Inhlangano yeNkatha yeNkululeko iyaluxhasa lolu hlahlo-mali. [Ihlombe.] [The IFP supports this Budget Vote. [Applause.]]

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Hon House Chair, the NFP supports this Budget Vote. You know, we talk of fraud and corruption but I, again, see the high level of hypocrisy. According to a Western Cape High Court judge, the DA has been responsible for R113,5 million in corruption in the Western Cape. [Interjections.] R113,5 million!

Let me also talk about the soccer stadium – corruption, again! Let me talk about the bus route in the Blouberg area – corruption, again! [Interjections.] How can you sit here and

talk about corruption? You talk about fraud. You‘re responsible. You‘re involved in drugs. You‘re involved in fraud. You‘re involved in corruption. You‘re involved in poor service delivery and then you say you are giving South Africans a better future! [Interjections.] What future are you giving the people? This is hypocrisy on the part of the DA.

Let me tell you what it is. With regard to the issue of transport, we find that many of these accidents are caused in the early hours of the morning. We believe it is not necessarily caused by speeding but fatigue when drivers fall asleep in the early hours of the morning. I think some legislation must be put in place to control that and to protect our people on the roads.

The other challenge you have is this. If one takes the Western Cape - Cape Town, in particular - and the motorcyclists, they are reckless in the mornings, especially in the mornings and late in the afternoon, going through the traffic and not even following the rules. We need to put some legislation in place in order to protect our road users. So, this is, generally, the challenge.

However, my colleagues here must get their act together. You can‘t be corrupt and call somebody else corrupt! You can‘t be stealing and then say somebody else has been stealing.

The NFP supports this Budget Vote. [Time expired.] [Interjections.] [Applause.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order! Order! [Interjections.] Order, hon member! Order, hon members! Can we allow the hon Radebe to give his declaration?

Mr G S RADEBE: Chairperson, the ANC, indeed, supports the Budget Vote, as we continue, as South Africa, to produce job opportunities through the rolling stock. We have produced 8 000 direct jobs and 33 000 indirect jobs, that we continue to produce.

Indeed, since 1994, South Africa has continued to introduce roads, even in the rural areas.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order, hon members! Will you please speak more softly?

Mr G S RADEBE: We continue to provide big, safer roads that are accessible to everybody. For example, if you go to the Eastern Cape, the road is now bigger and can be accessed by everybody else. We also want to assure our communities there that we are doing our utmost best to ensure that the Moloto Road becomes a reality so that all our lives can be safe.

At the moment, we also agree that traffic officers should be able to work for 24 hours so that they can ensure our roads here are much safer. We must also ensure that we congratulate the Railway Safety Regulator, RSR; Airports Company South Africa, Acsa; the Air Traffic Navigation Services, ATNS; the SA Civil Aviation Authority, Sacca; and the Road Accident Fund, RAF, on their high performance and for getting their clean audits, enabling them to do a better job. Indeed, the RAF has made sure that it assists our own rural areas when people come to claim their money, by cutting out the middle man – the lawyers, who are always eating the money of the poor people. The poor are now going to get their money direct.

There is something shocking about the opposition parties. They have just learnt to get a bigger virus. Their virus is the opposing of all budgets, something that they have never, ever

done before. So, they decided to be copycats, to go and copy from the red overalls.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order, hon member, your time has expired.

Mr G S RADEBE: They are probably going to come and wear blue overalls in the House. We support the Budget Vote. [Time expired.]

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Chairperson, on a point of order: There is no going backwards from being the Mampara of the Week, but we actually have supported budgets today. We haven‘t opposed every single budget. The Tourism Budget Vote is one example. [Interjections.] So, the hon member is misleading the House and living up to the moniker that the *Sunday Times* gave him.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order, hon member. Thank you very much. I have noted your concerns. Order! Hon Chauke?

Mr H P CHAUKE: Hon Chairperson, is it parliamentary for a member of the DA to say that we are not stealing, we are taking? [Interjections.] That member, there.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon member, I will have to check on that one and come back to you.

Division demanded.

The House divided.

AYES - 212: Abrahams, B L; Adams, F; Adams, P E; Bam-Mugwanya, V; Basson, J V; Bekwa, S D; Beukman, F; Bhengu, P; Bhengu, F; Bhengu, N R; Bilankulu, N K; Bogopane-Zulu, H I; Bongo, B T; Booi, M S; Boroto, M G; Brown, L; Buthelezi, N S; Capa, R N; Capa, N; Carrim, Y I; Cebekhulu, R N; Cele, M A; Cele, B H; Chauke, H P; Chikunga, L S; Chiloane, T D; Chohan, F I; Chueu, M P; Coleman, E M; Cronin, J P; Cwele, S C; Dirks, M A; Dlakude, D E; Dlamini-Dubazana, Z S; Dlulane, B N; Dunjwa, M L; Ebrahim, E I; Esterhuizen, J A; Faku, Z C; Filtane, M L W; Frolick, C T; Fubbs, J L; Gamede, D D; Gcwabaza, N E; Gigaba, K M N; Gina, N; Goqwana, M B; Gordhan, P J; Gumede, D M; Jeffery, J H; Joemat- Pettersson, T M; Johnson, M; Jonas, M H; Kalako, M U; Kekana, P S; Kekana, H B; Kekana, C D; Kekana, M D; Kekana, E; Kenye, T E; Khoarai, L P; Khosa, D H; Khoza, T Z M; Khoza, M B; Khunou, N P; Kilian, J D; Koornhof, G W; Kubayi, M T; Lesoma, R M M; Loliwe, F S; Luzipo, S; Maake, J J; Mabasa, X; Mabe, B P; Mabe, P P; Mabija, L; Mabilo, S P; Mabudafhasi, T R; Madella, A F;

Madlopha, C Q; Maesela, P; Mafolo, M V; Mafu, N N; Magadla, N W; Magadzi, D P; Magwanishe, G; Mahambehlala, T; Mahlalela, A F; Mahlangu, D G; Mahlangu, J L; Majola, F Z; Makhubela-Mashele, L

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| S; Makhubele, Z S; Makondo, T; Makwetla, S P; Malgas, | H | H; |
| Maluleke, J M; Maluleke, B J; Manamela, K B; Manana, M | N | S; |
| Manana, D P; Mandela, Z M D; Mantashe, P T; Maphatsoe, E | R | K; |
| Mapulane, M P; Martins, B A D; Masango, M S A; Masehela, E | K | M; |
| Mashego-Dlamini, K C; Mashile, B L; Masondo, N A; Masuku, | M | B; |
| Maswanganyi, M J; Mathale, C C; Mathebe, D H; Matlala, | M | H; |
| Matshoba, M O; Matsimbi, C; Mavunda, R T; Maxegwana, C | H | M; |
| Mbalula, F A; Mchunu, S; Mdakane, M R; Memela, T C; Mjobo, | L | N; |

Mkhize, H B; Mmemezi, H M Z; Mmola, M P; Mmusi, S G; Mncwango, M A; Mnganga - Gcabashe, L A; Mnguni, P J; Mnguni, D; Mnisi, N A; Mogotsi, V P; Mokoto, N R; Molebatsi, M A; Molewa, B E E; Morutoa, M R; Mothapo, M R M; Motimele, M S; Motshekga, M A; Motshekga, M S; Motsoaledi, P A; Mpumlwana, L K B; Msimang, C T; Mthembu, J M; Mthembu, N; Mthethwa, E M; Nchabeleng, M E; Ndaba, C N; Ndongeni, N; Newhoudt-Druchen, W S; Ngcobo, B T; Nkadimeng, M F; Nkwinti, G E; Nobanda, G N; November, N T; Nqakula, C; Ntombela, M L D; Nxesi, T W; Nyambi, H V; Oliphant, M N; Oliphant, G G; Pandor, G N M; Patel, E; Phaahla, M J; Phosa, Y N; Pikinini, I A; Pilane-Majake, M C C; Radebe, B A; Radebe, J T; Radebe, G S; Ralegoma, S M; Ramaphosa, M C; Ramatlakane, L; Ramatlhodi, N A; Rantho, D Z; Raphuti, D D; Semenya, M R;

Senokoanyane, D Z; September, C C; Shaik Emam, A M; Shope- Sithole, S C N; Sibande, M P; Sisulu, L N; Sithole, K P; Siwela, E K; Skosana, J J; Skwatsha, M; Smith, V G; Sotyu, M M; Surty, M E; Thabethe, E; Thomson, B; Tleane, S A; Tobias, T V; Tseke, G K; Tseli, R M; Tsenoli, S L; Tshwete, P; Tsoleli, S P; Tuck, A; v R Koornhof, N J J; Van Der Merwe, L L; Van Schalkwyk, S R; Williams, A J; Xasa, T; Xego, S T; Yengeni, L E; Zokwana, S; Zulu, L D.

NOES - 55: America, D; Atkinson, P G; Baker, T E; Basson, L J; Bergman, D; Boshoff, H S; Bozzoli, B; Brauteseth, T J; Cardo, M J; Chance, R W T; De Freitas, M S F; De Kock, K; Dreyer, A M; Esau, S; Figg, M J; Figlan, A M; Groenewald, H B; Grootboom, G A; Horn, W; Hunsinger, C H H; James, W G; Jongbloed, Z; Kalyan, S V; Kohler, D; Kruger, H C C; Krumbock, G R; Lees, R A; Lorimer, J R B; Lotriet, A; Lovemore, A T; Mackay, G; Mackenzie, C; Majola, T R; Marais, E J; Marais, S J F; Masango, B S ; Matsepe, C D; Maynier, D J; Mazzone, N W A; Mbhele, Z N; Ollis, I M; Redelinghuys, M H; Robertson, K P; Robinson, D; Schmidt, H C; Shinn, M R; Steenhuisen, J H; Van Damme, P T; Van Der Walt, D; Van Der Westhuizen, A P; Van Dyk, V; Volmink, H C; Vos, J; Waters, M; Wilson, E R.

Vote accordingly agreed to.

Vote No 36 - Water and Sanitation – put.

*Declarations of vote:*

Mr L J BASSON: Chairperson, the mandate of the Department of Water and Sanitation is set out in the National Water Act. This ensures that the country‘s water resources are protected, managed, used and controlled to deliver effective water supply and sanitation. This is done in accordance with the requirements of the water policies and legislation, critical for the delivery of the people‘s right to have access to sufficient food and water, transforming the economy and eradicating poverty.

Let‘s measure this department‘s performance to this mandate. A total of 84% of sewer plants are categorised as critical risk, high risk, or medium risk. Millions of litres of untreated or inadequately treated sewage are illegally discharged into our rivers and streams every day. There is a shortfall of

R63,4 billion per year in the funding for infrastructure, needed to avoid a full-scale water crisis over the next four years.

A total of 627 towns and 47 dams ran out of water. Political interference stopped the raising of the Clanwilliam Dam wall by the department‘s construction unit. The completion of the Bucket Eradication programme shifts from one year to the next, despite

the Minister‘s commitment that it would have been completed by December 2015.

Once again, like in the Cuban appointments, it seems that the desalination agreement with Iran is more important to the ANC- led government than creating jobs for the 8,9 million South Africans by using local companies.

In conclusion, National Treasury indicated that this department is the worst when it comes to the spending of allocated funds. The DA does not support this Budget Vote.

Inkosi R N CEBEKHULU: House Chair, departmental budget rollovers continue to rob our people of service delivery. All over the country, we see infrastructure backlogs, breakdowns in infrastructure and slow, almost stagnant, roll-out of new services. Budget rollovers are depriving our people of these prime and essential basic services. Better planning, accountability and oversight is what is urgently required, hon Minister.

In respect of our livestock and their access to water, South Africa is now in its fifth consecutive year of dryer-than- average weather. Our livestock is suffering and dying, due to

lack of access to water. In the provinces, drinking water for animals remains a matter of grave concern. In this regard, we suggest the development of animal watering holes to be built adjacent to dams. I thank you.

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Hon House Chair, the NFP supports this Budget Vote. Let me start off by saying that when somebody says they are not stealing, they are taking, that is their understanding; that is what we‘ve been doing all along. We‘ve been stealing, and so we say we‘ve been taking. [Interjections.]

Let me go on to say let us never be fooled by a clean audit. It is how you manipulate the system to show that you‘ve got a clean audit. That is what is important.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: House Chair, I would like to establish if the member of the NFP would be prepared to take a question. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order! Order!

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: If I have time after I am finished, hon Chairperson.

Since a lot of them come here to do grandstanding, let me do some grandstanding too. [Interjections.] If you want to see water and sanitation delivery, go to Zululand, which the NFP cogoverns with the ANC, and see for yourself.

I received a call from Komaggas in the Northern Cape, where a DA councillor is. For one week, the people of Komaggas had no water to drink or to shower in – nothing at all. After just one e-mail to the Minister of Water and Sanitation and one message, one phone call, to the Gift of the Givers, there was 100 000 litres of water delivered. [Applause.] Four boreholes were sunk immediately and animal feed was provided to the farmers, as well. [Interjections.]

Ms L L VAN DER MERWE: Chairperson, on a point of order: I want to establish whether the hon Shaik Emam has ever been to Zululand, because there is no water. He is misleading the House. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order! Order!

Ms L L VAN DER MERWE: Has he ever been to Zululand? [Interjections.] There is no water there! [Applause.] [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order, hon members! [Interjections.] Hon members, can I remind you, again, of the Rules of the House? If a member wants to ask a member a question, he or she goes through the Chair. That having not been done, I will allow the member to continue. Hon Shaik Emam, can you continue?

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Hon Chairperson, I have, indeed, been to Zululand, many times, and I can assure you we are at work. There is no doubt about that.

Mr M WATERS: Chairperson, will the hon member please take a question? [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order! I think the hon Shaik Emam has indicated to the Chief Whip of the Opposition that he will take a question when he has time – and he only has

23 seconds now, so I think we should allow him to finish his declaration, like everybody else has.

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Hon Chairperson, I would just like to make a suggestion to the Department of Water and Sanitation. These pipes that we are using on a daily basis to provide water to the poorest of the poor in the country seem to come from India,

China and America. Together with the Department of Trade and Industry, I think we need to work together to create an industry in this country where we can produce these things - create jobs and also make our own pipes. The NFP supports this Budget Vote. [Time expired.] [Applause.]

Mr M JOHNSON: Chairperson, the ANC supports the R15,2 billion Budget Vote No 36. [Interjections.] This is a Budget Vote that seeks to increase the access of a number of South Africans to clean water and dignified sanitation. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order! Order, hon members! Hon members, you have a speaker at the podium. Hon members of the DA! Hon members!

Mr L JOHNSON: This is a budget that seeks to increase access for a number of South Africans to clean water and dignified sanitation and to improve their lives for the better. This budget addresses the needs of the people in Khayelitsha, Mitchells Plain, Seshego, Nandoni, iLembe, all of whom have rights to such basic services, as enshrined in our Constitution.

Fellow South Africans, we want you to know that the DA is hypocritical. They want your votes but they don‘t want your

lives to be improved for the better. [Interjections.] Hence, more black DA members are joining the ANC. [Interjections.] A case in point, for your information, as of tomorrow, one of the provincial leaders of the DA is going to leave the DA and join the ANC. [Interjections.] This is going to take away the dream of capturing the Nelson Mandela Bay Municipality.

Fellow South Africans, on 3 August, continue to vote for your liberator, the ANC, towards a steady improvement of our people‘s lives for the better. I repeat, as of tomorrow, a black DA leader in one province is going to join the ANC. Mark my words. It is a shame on you, who will continue to be racist forever.

You have been exposed. You are hypocritical. The people of South Africa have now gotten to know who you are. You are exposed, once again. Thank you, Chair. [Applause.]

Mr H P CHAUKE: Chairperson, I rise on a point of order: The stand-off by the DA that we saw earlier in the House after the hon Shaik Emam had spoken needs to be addressed. It was pure intimidation. It cannot be allowed in the House. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Thank you, hon member, for bringing that to my attention. [Interjections.] Order!

Order, hon members! [Interjections.] Order! Hon members, can we please be in order?

Vote accordingly agreed to.

Vote No 37 – Art and Culture – put.

*Declaration(s) of vote:*

Dr G A GROOTBOOM: Agb Voorsitter, ek wil net vir die vorige speker, agb Shaik-Emam sê dat hy nie die DA moet blameer vir ‘n swakbeheerde ANC-munisipaliteit nie. [Hon Chairperson, I just want to say to the previous speaker, hon Shaik-Emam, that he must not blame the DA for a poorly managed ANC municipality.]

The DA wants to see South Africa working. The budget allocated for the Mzantsi golden economy ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order hon member please take your seat. Hon member, what is your point of order?

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Hon House Chair, on a point of order: I am sorry to do this to you again, but the hon member by the pillar there has again now shouting sell out despite being warned earlier by the House Chair. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order!

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Now, my member was asked to

...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON: (Ms A T Didiza): Order, order hon members.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: My member was forced to withdraw the word *gatkruiper.* I would say to that, sell out is far more offensive and I would ask you to again caution the member who is deliberately now defying an earlier request from the Chair. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order, hon members, order, hon members, I think we all would like to have this process finished as early as we can. Can we please be respectful of one another and not use language that is unbecoming and offensive? Can I appeal to you again? Can you make the role of the Chair easier so that I can regulate the functioning of this House? Hon member, you may proceed.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Madam House Chair, I respect your Ruling but I do want to point out that when it is a member

of the opposition, like hon Redelinghuys, he is forced to withdraw. Why are ANC MPs allowed to say what they like in the House and are not forced to withdraw? [Interjections.] It is not acceptable that the hon member had the courage that she would stand up and says that admits to what she had said in this House. This is really not fair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order, hon members. Who is the member that actually ... order hon member.

Mr G S RADEBE: Chair, I am just wondering if the blue overalls are referring to me or not because I never said anything. I said Selina. So, I do not know what they are talking about. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order, hon members, who is the member at the back who actually said sell out? Order, hon members I will ask the Whips of the ANC to actually check for me and then report. [Interjections.] Order, hon member.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: We know who she is.

Mr M WATERS: Chairperson, She has got a pink top on, sitting next to a gentleman.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon Manana, hon Manana, hon Manana, can you please stand up? Did you say the name as it is referred to you? [Interjections.] Hon Manana, can you please get to the microphone? [Interjections.] Order hon members.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Useless. You are a liar.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order hon members, you cannot do the wrong as well. Hon member, there has been an allegation that you mentioned the name sell out from the back to the speaker on the podium.

Ms N P MANANA: No House Chairperson. [Interjections.]

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Useless. You are a liar.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon members, again can I please appeal to all of us that we treat these proceedings in the manner in which we should? Can hon member proceed?

Mr G A GROOTBOOM: Hon Chair, the DA wants to see South Africa working. The budget allocated for the Mzantsi golden economy is wholly inadequate to create a 30 000 jobs envisaged hence the economic development and the so-called radical economic

transformation will simply not happen. Although libraries are being built, South Africa is not reading. The libraries remain ill resourced. Why, because monies are not spent. The lack of leadership in Pan South African Language Board, PanSALB to oversee the implementation of the language policies has led to language revolutions at our institutions of learning.

Agb Voorsitter, ek wil dit aan die agb Minister voorhou dat sy departement weinig doen om nasiebou en maatskaplike kohesie te bevorder. Hierdie plan is nie uitgestippel in sy begrotingsdebat nie. Die DA derhalwe ondersteun nie die begroting nie. *(Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.)*

[Hon Chairperson, I want to put it to the hon Minister that his department has done little to promote nation building and social cohesion. This plan is not outlined in his budget vote. The DA therefore does not support the budget.]

Mr T MAKONDO: Hon Chairperson, the ANC supports this budget because it supports outcome 14. The department and its entities will ensure that social cohesion, nation-building and promotion of our national identity are high on our agenda. This budget will also create employment through Mzantsi golden economy by sending more artists in our schools and also expand on the

implementation of the liberation heritage route which would seek to honour those who sacrificed their lives in the liberation of our country. We will also make sure that this budget creates more monuments in honour of these gallant fighters.

This budget will make sure that our country holds community conversation which the process of healing wounds of the past is strengthened. We will also make sure that in honouring those who sacrificed for us to be liberated and especially those hon Grootboom he was with in the struggle, even though he is sitting on the left, are honoured. Thank you, Chairperson.

Vote No 37 – Arts and Culture – put and agreed to. (Democratic Alliance dissenting.)

Vote 38 – Human settlement – put.

*Declarations:*

Ms T E BAKER: Madam Chair, let me say at the outset that the DA objects to this budget. We do so because we believe that the people of South Africa deserve more than just empty promises from the Minister. We object because this budget does not address the corruption in the allocation of houses or the problems of the waiting list.

This budget does nothing more than paying a lip service to the upgrading of the informal settlements. Even after 22 years of democracy, our people continue to live in squalor in the informal settlements with no hopes of change any time soon, keeping millions of South Africans trapped in poverty, Minister.

It does little to address the upgrading of hostels and it continues to allow provinces to waste money in the name of rectification projects, money which could well be sent on more worthwhile projects. Very little is done is done to hold contractors guilty of shoddy work accountable.

This budget does very little to create jobs and alleviate the suffering of the 8,9 million unemployed South Africans. We object to this budget as the ANC stopped caring about our people. Why is the ANC still building houses according to the apartheid spatial plans? Why is the ANC not enriching our people by giving them the title deeds to their homes? Why? I am asking you. The DA does not support this budget, thank you. [Applause.]

Mr K P Sithole: Hon House Chair, the IFP supports the budget but the Department of Human Settlements is failing to plan according to the needs of those living in the informal settlements, backyard dwellers and in hostels. The Minister had said that by

2019 the department would build 1,5 million houses for those that need shelter. This is not achievable, surely. The development of houses is in decline in South Africa. What system is the hon Minister using to implement and see this dream comes true?

The department is failing to provide title deeds timeously as there is a backlog in the system. Owners are stuck into selling their homes because they do not have title deeds. How is this going to be resolved? There is sufficient monitoring in place for the safety of RDP houses. There is a concern that the RDP houses are not being sold back to government and houses are even sold before the eight-year waiting time period to sell the property. Why is there no system to monitor this? Our people are landless and homeless because of lack of systems that are less adequate for properties. I thank you.

Mr A M SHAIK-EMAM: Hon House Chair let me once again talk about service delivery and now we are talking about the houses. We talk as if we are caring but you are building 62 houses when there are 400 000 people in Cape Town looking for houses. [Interjections.] Yet you claim to be caring about the people.

There are 400 000 people families looking for houses but you sold land in Sea Point in an irregular manner. You sold this

land for a school yet you claim to be caring for people. Maybe what I need for my colleagues is to join me. Let us go for a drive to Haynes Park, Philippi, Khayelitsha, Manenberga and Hanover Park and see the conditions under which our people are living and then you can come back to tell me that you care about the poorest of the poor. [interjections.] You certainly would not. [Intejections.]

One of the things we should, I believe need to be addressed in terms of pricing, especially in the Western Cape is the foreign investment property which has dire effects on the lives of our people in this province. With these pounds and dollars and what they pay for the houses in Cape Town, it is just not affordable for any man or woman in the streets to be able to buy a house in this place. I think something must be done to protect our people. [Applause.]

The NFP wants to also recommend, given the fact that we have limited budget, maybe we need to enter into some kind of agreement with private institutions and banks and foster the agreement we got with the four or five major banks to ensure that they give credit facilities to all the poorest of the poor so that they can all engage in buying their own houses rather

than all of us depending on the state as well. Thank you hon Chairperson, the NFP supports the budget. [Applause.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Thank you hon member, the ANC. Order hon members, order! Hon members, can you please allow the speaker on the podium to make her declaration?

Nks N MAFU: Enkosi Sihlalo weNdlu, umbutho wesizwe ukhongoloseuluxhasa ngokupheleleyo oluHlahlo-lwabiwo-mali lezokuHlaliswa koLuntu oluzizigidigidieziphaya kuma-R30 billion. Phofu xa sijongilesiyikomitisifumanisa ukuba ama-97 ekhulwiniayaemaphondweninakoomasipalaabambaxa. Xa sijongile kwakhona, kule minyaka mithathu edlulileyo, uMasipalaoMbaxawesiXekosaseKapaakayisebenzisiayigqibe le malisibanika yona. Iminyaka mithathu, ilandelelana kodwa iminyaka ngeminyaka abantu abalapha eKapa bahlalaebugxwayibeni. Abantu balapha eKapa kuyekufunekeurhulumnente lo unikeeliKapa imali, ibe nguyeobaleka emva elungiselela aba balapha eKapa.

Kaloku bona abayisebenzisi le malibayinikiweyo kwezi ndawo zabantu abantsundu kuba bona bahlalaeBishop Court nakwezi ndawo kumnandi kuzo koomaConstantia.

Sithi thina kulula kubo ukuthi abaluxhasioluhlahlo-lwabiwo-mali kuba kaloku bathiasizikhuphiiitayitile.Le nto

yeetayitileisukelakwinto yokuba zangesazinikwakwantlandlolo ngexesha lobandlululo.[Uwelewele.]Ezi hostelebathetha ngazo zenziwa ngabo kwaye ke ngoku silungisazona ngoku baze apha besixelela ukuba abaluxhasi uhlahlo-lwabiwo-mali.[Uwelewele.]

Siyaluxhasa ke thina kuba siyayazi ukuba lutshintshaiimpilo zabantu boMzantsi Afrika kwaye siyayazi into yokuba abantu boMzantsi Afrika bayalazi ukuba eli sebe lenzaiimpilo zabo zibengcono. Yiyo loo nto nangoku ngomhla we- 3 kweyeThupha bahambebayekuvotela lo mbuthongenxeni yokuba besazi ukuba ubakhathalele.Siyabulela. [Kwaqhwatywa.] *(Translation of isiXhosa paragraphs follows.)*

[Mrs N MAFU: Thank you House Chairperson, the ANC fully supports this Budget Vote of Human Settlements which amounts to R30 billion. In fact, when we look at it as committee members we notice that 97% is allocated to provinces and metropolitan municipalities. When we checked the period of the past three years, we noticed that the metropolitan municipality of the City of Cape Town is not utilising all the money which was allocated to them. This has been happening for three consecutive years, but the citizens of Cape Town are still staying in underdeveloped areas.

The national government, who allocated money to the City of Cape Town, is the one who has to take the responsibility of making sure that the citizens are well supported. The municipality of Cape Town does not use the allocated money to develop black people, because they themselves stay in developed areas like Bishops Court and Constantia.

That is why it is easy for them to say that they are not supporting this Budget Vote because they are saying we are not giving them title deeds for their houses. They have forgotten that the problem of not getting title deeds is not new - it emanates from the fact that we were never given title deeds by the apartheid regime during their time. [Interjections.] The hostels they are complaining about were built by them, but now we have the responsibility of developing those hostels and they come here to say that they are not supporting the Budget Vote. [Interjections.]

We therefore support the Budget Vote, because we know it changes the lives of South African citizens and we know that the people of South Africa recognises the good work done by the department in respect of improving their lives. That is why on the 3 August 2016 they will go to the voting stations and vote for the ANC,

because they know that the ANC cares for them. We thank you. [Applause.]]

Vote accordingly agreed to (Democratic Alliance dissenting).

Vote 39 – Rural Develiopment and Land Reform – put.

*Declaration(s) of Vote:*

Mr T W MHLONGO: Chair, the DA rejects this budget because this does not reflect of freedom, fairness and opportunity.

Abantu bethu abasebenzi, abantu-8,9 million abasebenzi abantu bethu. Inkohlakalo izipha amandla, ukuntuleka kwenkululeko Abantu bethu abalibambi iqhaza kumnotho ... (*Translation of isiZulu paragraph follows.)*

[People are unemployed, 8,9 million of our people are unemployed. Corruption and the lack of freedom is taking its tall. Our people do not participate in the economy ...]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON: (Ms A T Didiza): Order hon members, can you please have our conversations a bit lower.

Mr T W MHLONGO: Transfer of ownership,

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: Chair, on a point of order: Again, sorry to the hon member, my apologies. Hon members, I think all of us are expected to behave as Members of Parliament, MPs. We cannot have the Presiding Officers repeatedly requesting us to lower our voices. It is just unparliamentarily but it demeans the status of this House, I am therefore requesting, particularly members of the ANC caucus, to respect this House please. Thank you very much. [Applause.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON: (Ms A T Didiza): Thank you hon Chief Whip.

Mr T W MHLONGO: Sihlalo, abantu bethu abakwazi ... [Chairperson, our people are unable ...]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON: (Ms A T Didiza): Order hon members, can we allow the member on the podium to be heard.

Mr T W MHLONGO: ... ngoba abanawo amatayitela. Ngokwesibonelo, nilanda [claim] ngokuthi uhlobo lobandlululo. [... because they don‘t have tittle deeds. For example, you claim that it is part of the apartheid legacy.]

It is your apartheid-style. Apparently in Johannesburg they do not have title deeds.

Abantu bethu nanamhlanje basaqasha emizini yabo. Uhulumeni we- ANC uhlulekile futhi unamaqhinga obandlululo ukuthi bangawatholi amatayitela. [Our people are still leasing their homes even today. The ANC government has failed and it has the tactics of the apartheid by causing the people not get their tittle deeds.]

There is no fairness. There is no fairness to our farmers. There is no fairness to our farm workers because of...

Kunokungqubuzana kwi-ANC. [There‘s a conflict within the ANC.]

They do not support our poor people.

Kunenkinga yokuthi abantu anifuni ukuthi bazimele. [The problem is that you don‘t want the people to be independent.]

That is why for example ...

... ama-CPA awasebenzi ngoba kunomkhonyovu omningi. [... the CPAs are not functional because there‘s a high level of fraud

...]

The budget allocated for is not used accordingly. There are no opportunities because of the failure of the ANC. We do not support this budget because ...

... I-ANC ihlulekile. [... the ANC has failed.]

It is election time; they are now talking about agri-parks.

Amapaki akhona bazopha abantu ukudla. [These agri parks will supply people with food.]]

Now, we do not support this budget. I thank you. [Applause.]

Mr M L W FILTANE: Chair, the UDM prefers to support this budget hon Minister. South Africa needs more that just this pittance, R9,6 billion is not going to take us far. The political aspirations and frustrations of this nation hinge on the success and failure of this department. The reason is, all development happens on and in land. Land defines us as a nation, we need more. So, hon Minister, I accordingly suggest one more time that you allow your wisdom to persuade you to bring to this House legislation that revises Section 25(7) of the Constitution, that is the 1913 clause and go three centuries back, we need that land. We will support that piece of legislation.

No underexpenditure this year. It rose from R5 million underexpenditure the other year right to just below R60 million last year, it is just not fair when there is so much need for development and more land to acquired. You promised to finalise some land claims in the financial year 2015-16, that did not happen to all the promises. I need not repeatedly remind you about the ones where there was a shortfall but I want to assure you that communities which rather impatiently now will need those land claims to be finalised. Thank you.

Mr A M SHAIK-EMAM: House Chair, the NFP supports this budget. [Applause.] Let me start off by saying land is a very important issue in the lives of people. Table View in this city, Cape Town, for 13 years the people of Table View, the Muslim community, have been calling for a mosque. For 13 years, the City of Cape Town has been rejecting it. [Interjections.] For 13 years – let me go on further – the people of District Six – we all know and understand restitution was in process – we know that that had to take place, the City of Cape Town continued transferring that land and selling that land knowing very well that that land needed to be returned to the people of District Six but they failed, they did not protect it. [Interjections.]

AN HON MEMBER: Liar!

Mr A M SHAIK-EMAM: Ask them to tell us the land that they sold, how much of money they got? Who they sold it to and what did they do with the money and who they colluded with in order to sell that land? Let them tell you. Have they responded to the people of District Six? Not to date. They have failed to do that that is the people. The issue of land is sensitive and I urge the department to accelerate the process of expropriation if need be to ensure that our people, the poorest of the poor, get their land. It shall not remain in the hands of a few rich and elite, it must be returned to the poorest of the poor. [Applause.] The NFP will support this budget. Thank you very much. [Applause.]

Ms P C NGWENYA-MABILA: Chairperson,

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON: (Ms A T Didiza): Order! Order! Order!

Ms P C NGWENYA-MABILA: ... and hon members. Hon Mhlongo,

Angazi ukuthi labantu okhuluma ngabo ukuthi abantu benu abangenawo amatayitela ukuthi usho obani ngoba bonke laba abahlezi la banamatayitela. [Ubuwelewele.] Abantu abangenawo amatayitela yithi. [Ihlombe.] [Ubuwelewele.] *(Translation of isiZulu paragraph follows.)*

[I don‘t know which people are you referring to when you say that they are your people who don‘t have tittle deeds because all these people who are here have tittle deeds. [Interjections.] It‘s us who don‘t have tittle deeds. [Applause.] [Interjections.]

I just want to indicate that in most case you are talking about promotion and protection of the Constitution but...

... sibuya laphaya emapulazini khona la eNtshonalanga Kapa lapho abantu bakithi bencishwa khona amanzi. [... we come from the farms in the Western Cape where our people are not given water.]

Water is a basic right. It is a constitutional right but...

... ekugcineni nibancisha amanzi ngakolunye uhlangothi nithi nihlonipha uMthethosisekelo. [... at the end you don‘t give them water on the other hand you claim to respect the Constitution.]

Which one? The other thing is that you‘re talking of restitution which is going slow.

Nisho kahle ngoba lomhlaba wethu nawuntshontsha, nawuthatha mahhala kodwa namuhla nifuna ukuthi sikhokhe izizumbulu zemali

ukuthola lowo mhlaba. *(Translation of isiZulu paragraph follows.)*

[You are right because you stole this land, you took it for free but today you want us to pay exorbitant amounts of money in order for us to get it back.]

Mr T W MHLONGO: Chair, on a point of order: Chairperson...

... isikhulumi esilapho phambili sikhuluma ... uyaphosisa, asiwuntshontshanga umhlaba. [Ubuwelewele.] Ubani ontshontshe umhlaba? Asintshontshanga mhlaba, uyaphosisa. [... the speaker on the podium ... that‘s not true, we did not steal the land. [Interjections.] Who stole the land? We did not steal the land, you‘re not telling the truth.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON: (Ms A T Didiza): Order! Order! Order, hon member, do you debate that as a reference to the DA?

Nks P C NGWENYA-MABILA: Ngicabanga ukuthi nawe uhlala le e- Orlando, mhlonishwa uMhlongo, umkhulu wakho bamuthathela umhlaba. Ulapho ukhona khona iqiniso uyalazi, limsulwa. Nimatasa nithi nihamba la emakhaya manje ngoba sekuyovotwa, nithi ninakekela abantu bakithi, nihamba nikhomba izigcobho zamanzi

kube nasishiya le emakhaya singenawo ugesi, singenawo amanzi, singenawo umtholampilo namuhla nizozenza engathi kukhona okungcono enizosenzela khona. *(Translation of isiZulu paragraph follows.)*

[Ms P C NGWENBYA-MABILA: If I am not mistaken, hon Mhlongo, you‘re also from Orlando; and your grandfather‘s land was also taken. You know the honest truth from where you‘re seated.

You‘re busy saying that you‘re taking care of our people. You always capitalise on the water issue whereas you left us in the rural areas with no electricity, water and clinics but now you come here and speak as if you can deliver better services for us].

This department is the one that has improved the lives of rural people. That is only the ANC. [Applause.] *(Translation of isiZulu paragraph follows.)*

Abantu bakithi la emaplazini aseNtshonalanga Kapa abahlala laphaya emaplazini, nibafuna ngenkathi benamandla. Uma sebephelelwe amandla sebeqala ukuguga niyabaxosha laphaya emaplazini. Niyabahlukumeza ngendlela yokuthi uma benabantwana abeneminyaka engamashumi nesishiyagalombili kumele bakhoke ikhulu namashumi amabili amarandi ngalezo zingane. Kuyini khona

lokho. Nikubiza ngani khona lokho? Yihlazo. [Kwaphela isikhathi.] Siyasisekela lesi Sabelomali samashumi amathathu nesishiyalolunye soMnyango. [Ihlombe.]

[Our people that are here in the Western Cape who work and dwell in farms, you need them when they still have strength. When they are weak and getting sick you chase them out of the farms. You abuse them by making them pay R120 for their 18 year old children. What‘s that? What do you call that? It‘s a shame. [Time expired.] We support Budget Vote 39. [Applause.]]

Question put.

Mr M WATERS: Chair, the DA calls for a division. Thank you.

Division demanded.

The House divided:

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order! In terms of the rules, the Chair can actually ask for the bells to be rung for

15 seconds and that is what I will ask for now. The bells will be rung for 15 seconds. I would like to remember members that they may only vote from their allocated seats. When requested to

do so, members must simply indicate their vote by pressing the appropriate button below the yes, no or abstain button. If a member inadvertently presses the wrong button, the member may thereafter press the correct button. The last button pressed will be recorded as the member‘s vote when the voting session is closed by the Chair.

AYES - 211: Abrahams, B L; Adams, F; Adams, P E; Bam-Mugwanya, V; Basson, J V; Bekwa, S D; Beukman, F; Bhengu, P; Bhengu, F; Bhengu, N R; Bilankulu, N K; Bogopane-Zulu, H I; Bongo, B T; Booi, M S; Boroto, M G; Brown, L; Buthelezi, N S; Capa, R N; Capa, N; Carrim, Y I; Cebekhulu, R N; Cele, B H; Cele, M A; Chauke, H P; Chikunga, L S; Chiloane, T D; Chohan, F I; Chueu, M P; Coleman, E M; Cronin, J P; Cwele, S C; Dirks, M A; Dlakude, D E; Dlamini-Dubazana, Z S; Dlulane, B N; Dunjwa, M L; Ebrahim, E I; Esterhuizen, J A; Faku, Z C; Filtane, M L W; Frolick, C T; Fubbs, J L; Gamede, D D; Gcwabaza, N E; Gigaba, K M N; Gina, N; Goqwana, M B; Gordhan, P J; Gumede, D M; Jeffery, J H; Johnson, M; Jonas, M H; Kalako, M U; Kekana, H B; Kekana, P S; Kekana, M D; Kekana, E; Kekana, C D; Kenye, T E; Khoarai, L P; Khosa, D H; Khoza, T Z M; Khoza, M B; Khunou, N P; Kilian, J D; Koornhof, G W; Kubayi, M T; Lesoma, R M M; Loliwe, F S; Luzipo, S; Maake, J J; Mabasa, X; Mabe, B P; Mabe, P P; Mabija, L; Mabilo, S P; Mabudafhasi, T R; Madella, A F; Madlopha, C Q; Maesela, P;

Mafolo, M V; Mafu, N N; Magadla, N W; Magadzi, D P; Magwanishe, G; Mahambehlala, T; Mahlalela, A F; Mahlangu, J L; Mahlangu, D G; Majola, F Z; Makhubela-Mashele, L S; Makhubele, Z S; Makondo, T; Makwetla, S P; Malgas, H H; Maluleke, J M; Maluleke, B J; Manamela, K B; Manana, M N S; Manana, D P; Mandela, Z M D; Mantashe, P T; Maphatsoe, E R K; Mapulane, M P; Martins, B A D; Masango, M S A; Masehela, E K M; Mashego-Dlamini, K C; Mashile, B L; Masondo, N A; Masuku, M B; Maswanganyi, M J; Mathale, C C; Mathebe, D H; Matlala, M H; Matshoba, M O; Matsimbi, C; Mavunda, R T; Maxegwana, C H M; Mbalula, F A; Mchunu, S; Mdakane, M R; Memela, T C; Mjobo, L N; Mkhize, H B; Mmemezi, H M Z; Mmola, M P; Mmusi, S G; Mncwango, M A; Mnganga - Gcabashe, L A; Mnguni, P J; Mnguni, D; Mnisi, N A; Mogotsi, V P; Mokoto, N R; Molebatsi, M A; Molewa, B E E; Morutoa, M R; Mothapo, M R M; Motimele, M S; Motshekga, M A; Motshekga, M S; Motsoaledi, P A; Mpumlwana, L K B; Msimang, C T; Mthembu, J M; Mthembu, N; Mthethwa, E M; Nchabeleng, M E; Ndaba, C N; Ndongeni, N; Newhoudt-Druchen, W S; Ngcobo, B T; Ngwenya-Mabila, P C; Nkadimeng, M F; Nkwinti, G E; Nobanda, G N; November, N T; Nqakula, C; Ntombela, M L D; Nxesi, T W; Nyambi, H V; Oliphant, M N; Oliphant, G G; Pandor, G N M; Patel, E; Phaahla, M J; Phosa, Y N; Pikinini, I A; Pilane- Majake, M C C; Radebe, B A; Radebe, J T; Radebe, G S; Ralegoma, S M; Ramaphosa, M C; Ramatlakane, L; Rantho, D Z; Raphuti, D D; Semenya, M R; Senokoanyane, D Z; September, C C; Shaik Emam, A

M; Shope-Sithole, S C N; Sibande, M P; Sisulu, L N; Sithole, K P; Siwela, E K; Skosana, J J; Skwatsha, M; Smith, V G; Sotyu, M M; Surty, M E; Thabethe, E; Thomson, B; Tleane, S A; Tobias, T V; Tseke, G K; Tseli, R M; Tsenoli, S L; Tshwete, P; Tsoleli, S P; Tuck, A; v R Koornhof, N J J; Van Der Merwe, L L; Van Schalkwyk, S R; Williams, A J; Xasa, T; Xego, S T; Yengeni, L E; Zokwana, S; Zulu, L D.

NOES - 56: America, D; Atkinson, P G; Baker, T E; Basson, L J; Bergman, D; Boshoff, H S; Bozzoli, B; Brauteseth, T J; Cardo, M J; De Freitas, M S F; Dreyer, A M; Edwards, J; Esau, S; Figg, M J; Figlan, A M; Groenewald, H B; Grootboom, G A; Horn, W; Hunsinger, C H H; James, L V; Jongbloed, Z; Kalyan, S V; Kohler, D; Kruger, H C C; Krumbock, G R; Lees, R A; Lorimer, J R B; Lotriet, A; Lovemore, A T; Mackay, G; Mackenzie, C; Majola, T R; Malatsi, M S; Marais, S J F; Marais, E J; Masango, B S ; Matsepe, C D; Maynier, D J; Mazzone, N W A; Mbhele, Z N; Mhlongo, T W; Ollis, I M; Redelinghuys, M H; Robertson, K P; Robinson, D; Schmidt, H C; Shinn, M R; Topham, B R; Van Damme, P T; Van Der Walt, D; Van Der Westhuizen, A P; Van Dyk, V; Volmink, H C; Vos, J; Waters, M; Wilson, E R.

Vote accordingly agreed to.

Vote 40 – Sports and Recreation South Africa – put.

*Declarations of vote*:

Mr M S MALATSI: Chairperson, those of us who know, hon Manana, and I mean very well know that she has a reputation for saying and doing things and lacking the courage to own them up, so that is not a surprise. But let‘s talk about the budget.

We will start supporting this budget when it makes extensive funding for school sport. We will start supporting this Budget when the Minister intervenes to force South African Football Association, SAFA, to implement equal pay between Banyana Banyana and Bafana Bafana.

We will start support this Budget when the department stops giving money to federations whose leaders squander tax payer‘s money on fat cats and business class flights.

We will start supporting this Budget when Boxing South Africa stops sanctioning fights while boxer‘s purse monies have not been paid.

We will start supporting this Budget when the only anti-doping centre in South Africa which has been closed is opened to

conduct doping test, as for now, no. We don‘t have any reason to support it. As for the hon...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms AT Didiza): Order hon members.

Mr S MALATSI: As for the hon Emam, he must be the only person in the world who unlike good one immature with ages, because every time he comes to this podium, he decent into political immaturity. Thank you.

Mr M L W FILTANE: Hon Chair, the UDM will always support a sporting budget. We welcome the increase. Sport plays a very critical role in the emotional, physical, and social wellbeing of the nation. It sharpens the competitive attitude of the participants and element much needed by our developing nation. We therefore, wish our Rio team a success.

Hon Minister, you need to find a working formula to ensure the cooperation of the provinces. Your department has pointed out that indeed some of the provinces has just stop playing ball and we want to urge you to find a way, where they can cooperate and come to the party and make it work.

We understand that, yours at national is a regulatory role, theirs is to implement and if they don‘t play ball at

implementation level, that could be cause of the failure and this has an impact on the national teams.

You have dropped a bombshell on four sporting codes. Our findings since you made the announcement are that, in some of them it is some provinces not necessarily just the national teams that are a draw back. And we employ you to take that into account as observe the progress of these four sporting codes in course of time like you promised when last we debated your Budget Vote.

This is our appeal to you and we understand you brought the power and authority, but there is a difference between authority and power. You need take that into account. Don‘t fall between the two cracks, power one hand and authority on the other hand. But just play your game well.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms AT Didiza): Order, hon member. Your time is up.

Mr M L W FILTANE: We want success for South Africa. Thank you.

Mr A M SHAIK-EMAM: Hon Chairperson, let me start of by making a recommendation to the Minister. I know the department is

performing well, but what we are asking is greater intervention with regard to the schools, Department of Basic Education.

Because what we find is that, I have been addressing hundreds of the youth in Paarl, they are begging for assistance from this DA to try and provide them with sporting facilities, but they will to do that. They just won‘t do it, because they serve the elite. They don‘t serve the others. That is the problem.

So, we are saying there should be a great engagement with the Department of Basic Education with the Department of Sports and Recreation. Because what orderly happens is those poorest of the poor, that cannot afford to go to those schools that got facilities they can‘t really be left out, but I think you have got some processes in place with that and I am sure that will be taken into consideration.

I don‘t know what is happening with the latest development with regard to this fraud and corruption on that fixed tender with the price of the new stadium. Maybe we need to look into that as well, because at the end of the day it‘s taxpayers money.

But let me also add and say something very important here, and this message I want to give out to every Muslim member of the Western Cape and other parts of the country. You cannot vote for

the DA at any cost. They oppress you here, they oppress you out of the country and I call on all my Christian brothers and sisters to reject the DA whose believes and the principles are based on oppression of anybody else.

Let us reject them totally in this election and unless we do that, remember like the member says, we are not stealing, we are taking. She is the principal.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms AT Didiza): Order, hon member. Your time is up.

Mr A M SHAIK-EMAM: That is the quote of the day. As the NFP, we urge the people not support the DA and we support this Budget Vote.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms AT Didiza): Order, hon member. Your time is up.

Mr A M SHAIK-EMAM: Thank you.

Mr S M RALEGOMA: House Chair, hon members, the ANC support the Budget Vote 40, because of the following reasons: Under the ANC government, the youth continue to have more access to sporting

facilities and sporting codes. More sport codes participate internationally and we have hosted in two decades, Rugby World Cup in 1995, Africa Cup of Nations in 1996, Cricket World Cup in 2002, and FIFA World Cup in 2010 and we will be sending a well oiled team South Africa to Brazil Olympics in August.

The ANC continue to lead in transformation sports in South Africa. SAFA got a clean audit from the commission dealing with transformation and the member from the DA cannot come here and claim to be a champion on transformation. We will remain champions of transformation, because you can see the benches in the ANC side that they are totally transformed. Look at the benches on our left, they are male whites.

The department is well run and has received two clean audits consecutively. Boxing is back in out TV screens and Boxing South Africa is being turned around. The ANC will continue to test and mitigate against drug usage in sports.

In conclusion, the ANC will continue to be the champions of ordinary people in South Africa. There is no way that the DA will dislocate the ANC.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms AT Didiza): Order, hon member. Your time is up.

Mr S M RALEGOMA: Thank you very much.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms AT Didiza): I put the vote again. Are there any objections? [Interjections.] There had been objections. I now put the question. Those in favour will say Aye. [Interjections.] Those against will say Noe. [Interjections.] I think the Ayes have it.

Mr M WATERS: Chair, please note the objection of the DA. Thank you.

Vote accordingly agreed to (Democratic Alliance dissenting).

Schedule - put.

Division demanded.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms AT Didiza): Order, hon members. I would like to remind members that they may only vote from their allocated seats. When requested to do so, members must simply indicate their vote by pressing the appropriate button below the

yes, no or abstain signs. If a member inadvertently presses the wrong button, the member may then after press the correct button. The last button pressed will be recorded as the member‘s vote when the voting session is closed by the Chair. The question before the House is that, the whole schedule of the vote be agreed to? Are all members in the allocated seats?

Voting will now commence. Those in favour of the Vote being agreed to should press the yes button. Well I am sorry, let me repeat again. Those in favour of the schedule being agreed to should press the yes button and those against should press the no button and those wishing to abstain should press the abstain button. Have all members voted? Voting is now closed.

Division demanded.

The House divided.

AYES - 212: Abrahams, B L; Adams, F; Adams, P E; Bam-Mugwanya, V; Basson, J V; Bekwa, S D; Beukman, F; Bhengu, P; Bhengu, F; Bhengu, N R; Bilankulu, N K; Bogopane-Zulu, H I; Bongo, B T; Booi, M S; Boroto, M G; Brown, L; Buthelezi, N S; Capa, R N; Capa, N; Carrim, Y I; Cebekhulu, R N; Cele, B H; Cele, M A; Chauke, H P; Chikunga, L S; Chiloane, T D; Chohan, F I; Chueu, M P; Coleman, E M; Cronin, J P; Cwele, S C; Dirks, M A; Dlakude, D

E; Dlamini-Dubazana, Z S; Dlulane, B N; Dunjwa, M L; Ebrahim, E I; Esterhuizen, J A; Faku, Z C; Filtane, M L W; Frolick, C T; Fubbs, J L; Gamede, D D; Gcwabaza, N E; Gigaba, K M N; Gina, N; Goqwana, M B; Gordhan, P J; Gumede, D M; Jeffery, J H; Joemat- Pettersson, T M; Johnson, M; Jonas, M H; Kalako, M U; Kekana, P S; Kekana, H B; Kekana, M D; Kekana, C D; Kekana, E; Kenye, T E; Khoarai, L P; Khosa, D H; Khoza, T Z M; Khoza, M B; Khunou, N P; Kilian, J D; Koornhof, G W; Kubayi, M T; Lesoma, R M M; Loliwe, F S; Luzipo, S; Maake, J J; Mabasa, X; Mabe, B P; Mabe, P P; Mabija, L; Mabilo, S P; Mabudafhasi, T R; Madella, A F; Madlopha, C Q; Maesela, P; Mafolo, M V; Mafu, N N; Magadla, N W; Magadzi, D P; Magwanishe, G; Mahambehlala, T; Mahlalela, A F; Mahlangu, D G; Mahlangu, J L; Majola, F Z; Makhubela-Mashele, L S; Makhubele, Z S; Makondo, T; Makwetla, S P; Malgas, H H; Maluleke, J M; Maluleke, B J; Manamela, K B; Manana, M N S; Manana, D P; Mandela, Z M D; Mantashe, P T; Maphatsoe, E R K; Mapulane, M P; Martins, B A D; Masango, M S A; Masehela, E K M; Mashego-Dlamini, K C; Mashile, B L; Masondo, N A; Masuku, M B; Maswanganyi, M J; Mathale, C C; Mathebe, D H; Matlala, M H; Matshoba, M O; Matsimbi, C; Mavunda, R T; Maxegwana, C H M; Mbalula, F A; Mchunu, S; Mdakane, M R; Memela, T C; Mjobo, L N; Mkhize, H B; Mmemezi, H M Z; Mmola, M P; Mmusi, S G; Mncwango, M A; Mnganga - Gcabashe, L A; Mnguni, P J; Mnguni, D; Mnisi, N A; Mogotsi, V P; Mokoto, N R; Molebatsi, M A; Molewa, B E E;

Morutoa, M R; Mothapo, M R M; Motimele, M S; Motshekga, M A; Motshekga, M S; Motsoaledi, P A; Mpumlwana, L K B; Msimang, C T; Mthembu, J M; Mthembu, N; Mthethwa, E M; Nchabeleng, M E; Ndaba, C N; Ndongeni, N; Newhoudt-Druchen, W S; Ngcobo, B T; Ngwenya- Mabila, P C; Nkadimeng, M F; Nkwinti, G E; Nobanda, G N; November, N T; Nqakula, C; Ntombela, M L D; Nxesi, T W; Nyambi, H V; Oliphant, M N; Oliphant, G G; Pandor, G N M; Patel, E; Phaahla, M J; Phosa, Y N; Pikinini, I A; Pilane-Majake, M C C; Radebe, B A; Radebe, J T; Radebe, G S; Ralegoma, S M; Ramaphosa, M C; Ramatlakane, L; Rantho, D Z; Raphuti, D D; Semenya, M R; Senokoanyane, D Z; September, C C; Shaik Emam, A M; Shope- Sithole, S C N; Sibande, M P; Sisulu, L N; Sithole, K P; Siwela, E K; Skosana, J J; Skwatsha, M; Smith, V G; Sotyu, M M; Surty, M E; Thabethe, E; Thomson, B; Tleane, S A; Tobias, T V; Tseke, G K; Tseli, R M; Tsenoli, S L; Tshwete, P; Tsoleli, S P; Tuck, A; v R Koornhof, N J J; Van Der Merwe, L L; Van Schalkwyk, S R; Williams, A J; Xasa, T; Xego, S T; Yengeni, L E; Zokwana, S; Zulu, L D.

NOES - 56: America, D; Atkinson, P G; Baker, T E; Basson, L J; Boshoff, H S; Bozzoli, B; Brauteseth, T J; Chance, R W T; De Freitas, M S F; Dreyer, A M; Edwards, J; Esau, S; Figg, M J; Figlan, A M; Groenewald, H B; Grootboom, G A; Horn, W; Hunsinger, C H H; James, L V; James, W G; Jongbloed, Z; Kalyan,

S V; Kohler, D; Kruger, H C C; Krumbock, G R; Lees, R A; Lorimer, J R B; Lotriet, A; Lovemore, A T; Mackay, G; Mackenzie, C; Majola, T R; Marais, S J F; Marais, E J; Matsepe, C D; Maynier, D J; Mazzone, N W A; Mbhele, Z N; Mhlongo, T W; Ollis, I M; Rabotapi, M W; Redelinghuys, M H; Robertson, K P; Robinson, D; Schmidt, H C; Shinn, M R; Steenhuisen, J H; Topham, B R; Van Damme, P T; Van Der Walt, D; Van Der Westhuizen, A P; Van Dyk, V; Volmink, H C; Vos, J; Waters, M; Wilson, E R.

Question agreed to.

Schedule accordingly agreed to.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order, hon members. There has been a discussion amongst the whipery on the business that we will have to continue with right now. I will ask the Chief Whip of the Majority party to actually make a statement.

The CHIEF WHIP OF MAJORITY: House Chair, I move that precedence be given to Order No. 1, second reading debate Appropriation Bill under Further Business on the Order Paper.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Are there any objections?

The CHIEF WHIP OF OPPOSITION: House Chair?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Yes, Sir.

The CHIEF WHIP OF OPPOSITION: We are in agreement, but in a non- precedential basis.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): What does that mean?

The CHIEF WHIP OF OPPOSITION: It means that, given the unique circumstances which we find ourselves in having finished earlier, we exceed to have been brought above the line. But in ordinary circumstances we reserve our rights on this type of matter. Thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms AT Didiza): The Secretary will read the second order.

Question read accordingly.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms AT Didiza): As there is no list of speakers, are there objections to the bill being read a second time? [Interjections.]

There was no debate.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): There been objections, I now put the question. Those in favour will say Aye and those against will say Noe. I think the Ayes have it.

Mr M WALTERS: Chair, the DA, calls for division. Thank you.

Division demanded.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): A division having been called, the bells will be rung for 15 seconds. Order, hon members, I would like to remind members that they may only vote from their allocated seats. When requested to do so, members must simply indicate their vote by pressing the appropriate button below the yes, no or abstain signs. If a member inadvertently presses the wrong button, the member may then after press the correct button. The last button pressed will be recorded as the member‘s vote when the voting session is closed by the Chair. The question before the House is that, the bill should be read the second time? Are all members in the allocated seats? Voting will now commence. Those in favour will say aye.

Sorry. Those in favour will press the yes button and those against will press the no button and those wishing to abstain

press the abstain button. Have all members voted? Voting is now closed.

Question put: That the Bill be read a second time.

Division demanded.

The House divided.

AYES - 212: Abrahams, B L; Adams, F; Adams, P E; Bam-Mugwanya, V; Basson, J V; Bekwa, S D; Beukman, F; Bhengu, P; Bhengu, F; Bhengu, N R; Bilankulu, N K; Bogopane-Zulu, H I; Bongo, B T; Booi, M S; Boroto, M G; Brown, L; Buthelezi, N S; Capa, R N; Capa, N; Carrim, Y I; Cebekhulu, R N; Cele, B H; Cele, M A; Chauke, H P; Chikunga, L S; Chiloane, T D; Chohan, F I; Chueu, M P; Coleman, E M; Cronin, J P; Cwele, S C; Dirks, M A; Dlakude, D E; Dlamini-Dubazana, Z S; Dlulane, B N; Dunjwa, M L; Ebrahim, E I; Esterhuizen, J A; Faku, Z C; Filtane, M L W; Frolick, C T; Fubbs, J L; Gamede, D D; Gcwabaza, N E; Gigaba, K M N; Gina, N; Goqwana, M B; Gordhan, P J; Gumede, D M; Jeffery, J H; Joemat- Pettersson, T M; Johnson, M; Jonas, M H; Kalako, M U; Kekana, P S; Kekana, H B; Kekana, M D; Kekana, C D; Kekana, E; Kenye, T E; Khoarai, L P; Khosa, D H; Khoza, T Z M; Khoza, M B; Khunou, N P; Kilian, J D; Koornhof, G W; Kubayi, M T; Lesoma, R M M; Loliwe,

F S; Luzipo, S; Maake, J J; Mabasa, X; Mabe, B P; Mabe, P P; Mabija, L; Mabilo, S P; Mabudafhasi, T R; Madella, A F; Madlopha, C Q; Maesela, P; Mafolo, M V; Mafu, N N; Magadla, N W; Magadzi, D P; Magwanishe, G; Mahambehlala, T; Mahlalela, A F; Mahlangu, D G; Mahlangu, J L; Majola, F Z; Makhubela-Mashele, L S; Makhubele, Z S; Makondo, T; Makwetla, S P; Malgas, H H; Maluleke, J M; Maluleke, B J; Manamela, K B; Manana, M N S; Manana, D P; Mandela, Z M D; Mantashe, P T; Maphatsoe, E R K; Mapulane, M P; Martins, B A D; Masango, M S A; Masehela, E K M; Mashego-Dlamini, K C; Mashile, B L; Masondo, N A; Masuku, M B; Maswanganyi, M J; Mathale, C C; Mathebe, D H; Matlala, M H; Matshoba, M O; Matsimbi, C; Mavunda, R T; Maxegwana, C H M; Mbalula, F A; Mchunu, S; Mdakane, M R; Memela, T C; Mjobo, L N; Mkhize, H B; Mmemezi, H M Z; Mmola, M P; Mmusi, S G; Mncwango, M A; Mnganga - Gcabashe, L A; Mnguni, P J; Mnguni, D; Mnisi, N A; Mogotsi, V P; Mokoto, N R; Molebatsi, M A; Molewa, B E E; Morutoa, M R; Mothapo, M R M; Motimele, M S; Motshekga, M A; Motshekga, M S; Motsoaledi, P A; Mpumlwana, L K B; Msimang, C T; Mthembu, J M; Mthembu, N; Mthethwa, E M; Nchabeleng, M E; Ndaba, C N; Ndongeni, N; Newhoudt-Druchen, W S; Ngcobo, B T; Ngwenya- Mabila, P C; Nkadimeng, M F; Nkwinti, G E; Nobanda, G N; November, N T; Nqakula, C; Ntombela, M L D; Nxesi, T W; Nyambi, H V; Oliphant, M N; Oliphant, G G; Pandor, G N M; Patel, E; Phaahla, M J; Phosa, Y N; Pikinini, I A; Pilane-Majake, M C C;

Radebe, B A; Radebe, J T; Radebe, G S; Ralegoma, S M; Ramaphosa, M C; Ramatlakane, L; Rantho, D Z; Raphuti, D D; Semenya, M R; Senokoanyane, D Z; September, C C; Shaik Emam, A M; Shope- Sithole, S C N; Sibande, M P; Sisulu, L N; Sithole, K P; Siwela, E K; Skosana, J J; Skwatsha, M; Smith, V G; Sotyu, M M; Surty, M E; Thabethe, E; Thomson, B; Tleane, S A; Tobias, T V; Tseke, G K; Tseli, R M; Tsenoli, S L; Tshwete, P; Tsoleli, S P; Tuck, A; v R Koornhof, N J J; Van Der Merwe, L L; Van Schalkwyk, S R; Williams, A J; Xasa, T; Xego, S T; Yengeni, L E; Zokwana, S; Zulu, L D.

NOES - 57: America, D; Atkinson, P G; Baker, T E; Basson, L J; Bergman, D; Boshoff, H S; Bozzoli, B; Brauteseth, T J; Chance, R W T; De Freitas, M S F; Dreyer, A M; Edwards, J; Esau, S; Figg, M J; Figlan, A M; Groenewald, H B; Grootboom, G A; Horn, W; Hunsinger, C H H; James, L V; James, W G; Jongbloed, Z; Kalyan, S V; Kohler, D; Kruger, H C C; Krumbock, G R; Lees, R A; Lorimer, J R B; Lotriet, A; Lovemore, A T; Mackay, G; Mackenzie, C; Majola, T R; Marais, S J F; Marais, E J; Matsepe, C D; Maynier, D J; Mazzone, N W A; Mbhele, Z N; Mhlongo, T W; Ollis, I M; Rabotapi, M W; Redelinghuys, M H; Robertson, K P; Robinson, D; Schmidt, H C; Shinn, M R; Steenhuisen, J H; Topham, B R; Van Damme, P T; Van Der Walt, D; Van Der Westhuizen, A P; Van Dyk, V; Volmink, H C; Vos, J; Waters, M; Wilson, E R.

Question agreed to.

Bill accordingly read a second time.

The House adjourned at 20:59.

# ANNOUNCEMENTS, TABLINGS AND COMMITTEE REPORTS

**ANNOUNCEMENTS**

**National Assembly and National Council of Provinces**

**The Speaker and the Chairperson**

1. **Assent by President in respect of Bills**
	1. **Division of Revenue Bill** [B 2 – 2016] – Act No 3 of 2016 (assented to and signed by President on 17 May 2016).

# Classification of Bills by Joint Tagging Mechanism (JTM)

* 1. The JTM in terms of Joint Rule 160(6) classified the following Bill as a section 76 Bill:
		1. **National Land Transport Amendment Bill** [B 7 – 2016] (National Assembly

– sec 76).

# National Assembly

**The Speaker**

1. **Membership of Committees**
	1. Ms CC September has been elected as the Chairperson of the Portfolio Committee on Higher Education and Training with effect from 18 May 2016

# COMMITTEE REPORTS

**National Assembly**

**1. Report of the Portfolio Committee on Higher Education and Training on the Higher Education Amendment Bill [B36 – 2015] (National Assembly – sec 75), dated 18 May 2016:**

The Portfolio Committee on Higher Education and Training, having considered the subject of the ***Higher Education Amendment Bill* [B36 – 2015]**, referred to it and classified by the Joint Tagging Mechanism as a section 75 Bill, reports the Bill with amendments [B36A – 2015].

The Committee further reports:

1. After deliberations, the Committee approved the Bill.
2. Whilst the Bill enjoyed support of the majority, the Democratic Alliance (DA) objected to the following clauses: clause 1, 16, 25, 28 and 37. The Economic Freedom Fighters

(EFF) objected to clause 37.

1. The DA also objected to the Bill as a whole.

Report to be considered.