

**WEDNESDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2016**

---

***PROCEEDINGS OF THE NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES***

---

The Council met at 14:02.

The Chairperson took the Chair and requested members to observe a moment of silence for prayers or meditation.

**ANNOUNCEMENTS, TABLINGS AND COMMITTEE REPORTS** - see col 000.

**NOTICES OF MOTION**

Mr C HATTINGH: Hon Chair, I hereby move on behalf of the DA that on the next sitting day:

The Council -

- (1) notes that the 2015 trends in international mathematics and science study, the Timms, was released yesterday, in which it was revealed that South Africa was still one of the world's worst education systems;

- (2) also notes that South Africa ranks second last out of 48 countries for Grade 4 and Grade 8 mathematics, and stone last for Grade 8 science out of 38 countries;
- (3) realises that to make matters worse, the South African results are likely to be inflated because the Grade 4 tests were written by Grade 5 learners, and the Grade 8 tests were written by Grade 9 learners; and
- (4) debates the impact of the deteriorating education system on the future of South Africa in an increasingly competitive international arena.

**COUPLE SENTENCED LIFE TERMS FOR ABUSE AND BRUTAL OF THEIR CHILD**

(Draft Resolution)

Ms T MOTARA: Chair, I hereby move without notice:

That the Council -

- (1) notes the sentencing of Itumeleng Telekwa and her lover, Charles Monare to an effective life term in the South Gauteng High Court, sitting in Palm Ridge, for the abuse and brutal killing of their four-year old child Neo Telekwa in 2013;

- (2) further notes that little Neo Telekwa was viciously assaulted by her stepfather while her mother was away at work on 30 August 2013 in their shack in Rockville, in Soweto, and her mother deliberately turned a blind eye to the persistent abuse and violence against little Neo for approximately a year until she was finally killed by her mother's lover who used every trick to shield her abuse and violent lover from being arrest; and
- (3) takes this opportunity to welcome the sentencing as a clear and decisive message to other parents who continue to shield perpetrators of violence against children that their days will also come.

Motion agreed to in accordance with section 65 of the Constitution.

**CHIEF WHIP OF THE NCOP FAILS TO EXECUTE HER RESPONSIBILITIES**

(Draft Resolution)

Ms T J MOKWELE: Chair, I rise on behalf of the EFF to give a motion without notice:

That the Council -

- (1) notes that the office of the Chief Whip of the NCOP is failing to execute the responsibility assigned to it by the Constitution and Rules that govern this Council;
- (2) also notes that the Chief Whip of the NCOP, in her capacity, is failing to communicate or assign members to committees and do other responsibilities as required by the Rules;
- (3) further notes that lately, there were allegations that she accused hon Parkies of trying to rape her;
- (4) realises that in numerous sittings of this House, we have experienced administrative and procedural flaws that her office has made, for example, assigning hon Mampuru to be the Duty Whip while the member was absent in the House;
- (5) acknowledges that passing wrong resolutions by taking Whips on an international trip to India that was never communicated at any relevant platform, on its own, is a fruitless and wasteful expenditure of public funds; and
- (6) therefore recommends, as EFF does, that a disciplinary action against the Chief Whip of the NCOP be implemented as a matter of urgency.

The motion was not agreed to.

Therefore, the motion without notice will become a notice of motion.

**SARS COLLECTS MORE THAN TRILLION RANDS IN 2015-16 FINANCIAL YEAR**

(Draft Resolution)

Mr C J DE BEER: Hon Chairperson, I hereby move without notice:

That the Council -

- (1) notes that the SA Revenue Service, Sars, collected just more than R1 trillion in the 2015-16 year, which is R82,7 billion or an 8,5% increase from the previous year;
- (2) further notes that the tax-to-gross domestic product ratio increased from 25,5% in 2014-15 to 26,2% in 2015-16, slightly below the peak of 26,4% achieved in 2007-08, just before the onset of the global recession;
- (3) also notes that Sars processed 99,9% of all returns electronically, assessing 92,4% of them within three seconds with 93,28% of refunds totalling R15,5 billion in tax refunds having been paid to taxpayers within 72 hours; and
- (4) takes this opportunity to congratulate all South Africans for ensuring that that their tax returns were filed on time.

Motion agreed to in accordance with section 65 of the Constitution.

**MPUMALANGA PROVINCIAL GOVERNMENT FAILS TO MEET EPWP TARGETS**

(Draft Resolution)

Mr F ESSACK: Chairperson, I move without notice on behalf of the DA:

That the Council -

- (1) notes that yet again, the Mpumalanga Provincial Government failed to meet its targets for the Expanded Public Works Programme, EPWP, for the 2015-16 financial year, failing to create much needed job opportunities;
- (2) also notes that unemployment in Mpumalanga is at a shocking 41,1% while 57 EPWP jobs were promised by the Mpumalanga Provincial Government;
- (3) further notes that EPWP jobs decreased down to 25 340, even with an increased budget of R16 million in this last financial year;
- (4) insists that the EPWP should and must benefit as many people as possible instead of continuously being used for political patronage under the ANC; and

- (5) recommends that the Mpumalanga Province should look to the comprehensive EPWP rollout in the DA-led Western Cape, where job allocations are done on a fair and transparent basis with an impartial EPWP jobs allocation database.

The motion was not agreed to.

Therefore, the motion without notice will become a notice of motion.

**SEVEN YEARS SINCE MURDER OF CLLR MOSS PHAKOE IN RUSTENBURG**

(Draft Resolution)

Ms N P KONI: Chairperson, I rise without notice on behalf of the EFF:

That the Council -

- (1) notes that this years marks seven years since Cllr Moss Phakoe has been murdered in Rustenburg Local Municipality;
- (2) also notes that the murder came after Cllr Moss handed a dossier that implicated high profile leaders of the ANC with corruption activities within the said municipality and the province of North West;

- (3) further notes that the case was brought before court and Mr Matthew Volmarans and his former bodyguard, Enoch Matshaba, were later charged and sentenced accordingly;
- (4) eventually notes that they were later both released after an appeal;
- (5) realises that up to now, the provincial legislature and the leadership of the ANC are silent and reluctant to assist the Phakoe family to find closure on the matter;
- (6) recognises that the ANC pushed for the children of the deceased to be released or fired from their employment as they were working as officials in Rustenburg and Vryburg Municipalities;
- (7) also recognise that they even forced that the house in which they live be repossessed; and
- (8) recommends that the House assist the Phakoe family in whatever they could;

The motion was not agreed to.

The motion without notice will become a notice of motion.

**BLACK DOLLAR SCAM AT CRESTA, JOHANNESBURG**

(Draft Resolution)

Mr D L XIMBI: Chairperson, I move without notice:

That the Council -

- (1) notes with great disgust that three women were rescued from a house in Cresta, Johannesburg, where they were held against their will and tortured after they fell victims to a scam;
- (2) acknowledges that police received information about kidnapping and arrived at an abandoned house in the suburb around 18h00 on Tuesday evening and rescued three women and arrested eight men; the women had sustained burn wounds and it appeared they were tied up;
- (3) realises that the women were apparently approached at a mall and fell victim to a black dollar scam that involved the victim giving money to the scammer with the promise that they will get it back, multiplied several times and at some point the women were kidnapped and taken to the house;

(4) admits that this case was a break through as it fell within the 16 days of activism for no violence against women and children; and

(5) applauds the police on their dedication in fighting crime and save lives. I so move.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon Ximbi, you were right on point because I was just about to tell you that your time had expired. Are there any objections to this motion? None.

Motion agreed to in accordance with section 65 of the Constitution.

**LONG WAIT FOR THE PEOPLE OF QWAQWA FOR THE RETURN OF THEIR LAND**

(Draft Resolution)

Mr M M CHABANGU: Chairperson, I move without notice:

That the Council -

(1) notes that the free state people, in particular former homeland QwaQwa, people and surrounding towns, like Harrismith and Kestell have been waiting for far too long for the land which was taken from their forefathers by the regime in the 1860s to be given back to them in a form of

compensation like the other tribes who have been given back what is due to them in a form of money or land;

- (2) regrets that people have died with the hope that they would be paid what is due to them, and therefore urge the present reigning government to speed up the matter; and
- (3) warns that people would do to the ANC what Tata Mandela said they should do to the ANC if it does the same as apartheid did to them. I so move.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Thank you; are there any objections to the motion? Yes. In light of the objection, the motion may not be proceeded with. The motion without notice will now become notice of a motion.

#### **FATAL CRASH OF BRAZILIAN AEROPLANE IN COLUMBIA**

(Draft Resolution)

Mr E MAKUE: Chairperson, I move without notice:

That the Council -

- (1) notes with a great sense of shock and sadness the fatal crash of a Brazilian aeroplane in Columbia; and that it was

carrying more than 76 passengers from a Brazilian national soccer team;

- (2) acknowledges that this tragedy represents a blow not only to the sports loving nation of Brazil but the entire international community; and
- (3) takes this opportunity to join the international community in expressing our heart-felt condolences to the people of Brazil during these trying and difficult times. I so move.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Thank you; are there any objections to the motion? No objection.

Motion agreed to in accordance with section 65 of the Constitution.

#### **SALUTATION OF UNIVERSITY MANAGEMENT ON STUDENTS WRITING EXAMS**

(Draft Resolution)

Ms L L ZWANE: Chairperson, I move without notice:

That the Council -

- (1) notes with pride the relative success that continues to characterise the writing of the final examinations in most

institutions of higher education, especially universities and colleges;

- (2) observes that despite difficulties and challenges associated with the recent disruptions of learning in our higher education institutions, the majority of students have demonstrated a resolute will and courage to write their final examinations;
- (3) takes this opportunity to salute the university management, student leadership in various institutions of higher learning and other private sectors of civil society for their steadfastness of principle and visionary leadership; and
- (4) calls on the Department of Higher Education to take all necessary steps to create conducive environment for learning and tuition in the year 2017. I so move.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Thank you; are there any objections to the motion? Yes. In light of the objection, the motion may not be proceeded with. The motion without notice will now become notice of a motion.

**KWAZULU-NATAL SAPS ARREST TWO SASSA OFFICIALS**

(Draft Resolution)

Mr M K CHETTY: Chairperson, I move without notice:

That the Council -

- (1) recognises and complements the SAPS in KwaZulu-Natal for the arrest of two SASSA officials in the Bombay Civic Centre Offices for defrauding the community and denying the poorest of the poor much needed grand funding;
- (2) admits that the DA has previously laid complaints regarding the abuse of SASSA food voucher at the Bombay Civic Centre offices during government elections;
- (3) calls on the Minister of Social Development to brief the Select Committee on Social Services on what measures she is implementing to ensure that this fraud does not occur in the SASSA centres;
- (4) further calls on the Minister of Police to brief the Select Committee on Security and Justice on the progress of Operation "Project Granny" which commenced in August this year. I so move

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Thank you; are there any objections to the motion? Yes. In light of the objection, the motion may not be

proceeded with. The motion without notice will now become notice of a motion.

**LARGE SCALE CLINICAL TRIAL OF AN HIV VACCINE**

(Draft Resolution)

Ms L C DLAMINI: Chairperson, I move without notice:

That the Council -

- (1) notes that a day before World Aids Day and for the first time in seven years, the scientific community is embarking on a large-scale clinical trial of an HIV vaccine, the product of years of study and experimentation by launching a major study to test the efficacy of a vaccine to prevent HIV infection by the National Institute of Allergy and Infectious Diseases, Niaid, funded HIV Vaccine Trials Network;
- (2) acknowledges that the large-scale early-stage HIV vaccine clinical trial aims to determine if an investigational HIV vaccine regiment is safe, tolerable and effective at preventing HIV infection among South African adults; and takes this opportunity to join the rest of the global community in observing World Aids Day and the launch of the

HIV vaccine trials as a major step in the fight against the HIV and Aids scourge in our country. I so move.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Thank you; are there any objections to the motion? Yes. In light of the objection, the motion may not be proceeded with. The motion without notice will now become notice of a motion.

Is there any other member who has a motion without notice?

Mr S J MOHAI: Chairperson, for me it is not a motion without notice, I wanted to ask the Chair for indulgence on a motion that was raised earlier. Notwithstanding that the motion was objected to but my view is that the statement that makes serious allegation against another member in the House. I want to ask the Chair as to how do we deal with such statements, particularly in the light that the Rules enjoins us that if there are such allegations they can be brought to the attention of the presiding officer for necessary investigation. So, please Chair, if possible I would request that we have a manner of dealing with such statements or motions which cast aspersions against another member.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Thank you, hon member. The matter referred to in the motion you are quoting has come to our attention. It was brought to our attention by the hon Parkies after the sitting we held in the Eastern Cape. We are giving it proper attention, in

fact, during the course of today; I will be referring the same matter to the relevant structures for investigation.

**PRINCIPAL WHO ADMITTED HE WAS SLEEPING WITH A 17-YEAR-OLD GIRL CHILD**

(Draft Resolution)

Ms T K MAMPURU: Chairperson, I move without notice:

That the Council -

- (1) notes with utmost concern and apprehensiveness the admission made by a principal who owns the Johannesburg high school that he had been sleeping with a 17-year-old Grade 11 pupil who is a learner at the school;
- (2) queries that the principal claims, despite the age of the learner, that the learner seduced him and that he wanted to stop her from sleeping with other men;
- (3) takes this opportunity to condemn in the strongest possible terms this incident and the continued emotional and sexual exploitation of learners in our schools; and

- (4) calls on the Department of Education and the South African Council of Educators to ensure that the principal is suspended from teaching with immediate effect. I so move.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Thank you; are there any objections to the motion? Yes. In light of the objection, the motion may not be proceeded with. The motion without notice will now become notice of a motion.

#### **FAILURE OF THE CHIEF WHIP TO EXERCISE HER DUTIES**

(Draft Resolution)

Ms T J MOKWELE: Chairperson, I move without notice:

That the Council -

- (1) notes the continuing inequality and poverty in South Africa 20 years after democracy;
- (2) further notes that the apartheid economic and racial discrimination were based on amongst other things jobs reservation and cheap labour of black people in general;
- (3) Acknowledges that the wage continue to serve as a source of perpetuating and the dehumanisation of the majority of our

people, blacks in particular including in the professional sector;

- (4) admits that South African wages have remained stagnant with the medium low wage increasing by only 2,9% between 1997 and 2013;
- (5) recognises that more than 60% of South African blacks are paid less than R3 000 per month and that the introduction of the R3 500 as a minimum wage will not change any life as the increase of R500 would not put any bread on the table of a domestic worker, security officer, or a gardener as things are expensive and are unaffordable;
- (6) calls on Parliament to re-evaluate the implementation of this minimum wages taking into consideration socioeconomic conditions of the majority of our people. I so move.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Thank you; are there any objections to the motion? Yes. In light of the objection, the motion may not be proceeded with. The motion without notice will now become notice of a motion.

**SUSPENSION OF RULE 239(1)**

(Draft Resolution)

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE COUNCIL: Chairperson of ... [Inaudible.] ... opportunity. Our draft resolution reads as follows: That Rule 239(1), which provides inter alia that the consideration of a Bill may not commence before at least three working days have lapsed since the committee's report was tabled, be suspended for the purposes of consideration of the Division of Revenue Amendment Bill [B 15 - 2016] National Assembly, section 76 Bill.

Question put: That the motion be agreed to.

IN FAVOUR: Free State, Gauteng, KwaZulu-Natal, Limpopo, Mpumalanga, Northern Cape, North West, Western Cape.

Motion accordingly agreed to in accordance with section 65 of the Constitution.

**DIVISION OF REVENUE AMENDMENT BILL**

(Consideration of Bill and of Report of Select Committee on  
Appropriation thereon)

Mr S J MOHAI: Hon Chairperson and hon members, the rest of the world is celebrating one of the greatest revolutionaries of the 20th century. What makes him great is that in the 20th century and into the 21st century he was the biggest inspiration in the struggles of

the oppressed and the poor against global capitalism for a just and equal society.

Comrade Fidel taught us that international solidarity is indispensable to build world order that puts the interest of the majority who are poor first, and also that independence of small countries in pursuing their own socioeconomic models is possible and is the only sustainable way.

The 2016 Division of Revenue Amendment Bill report is tabled at a time when the country is going through credit rating review process by major credit rating agencies. The committee, however, welcomes the decision by two major credit rating agencies, Fitch and Moody's to keep the country's credit rating unchanged.

This provides a window to build confidence and improve economic prospects for the next review. The decision by these credit rating agencies further has a potential to boost investors' confidence in our country. Once more, as a committee we wish to congratulate the democratic government and in particular the Minister of Finance and his deputy for a job well done.

The 2016 Division of Revenue Amendment Bill was tabled in Parliament on 26 October 2016 by the Minister of Finance during the presentation of the 2016 Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement and was referred to the committee on 22 November 2016 for consideration and

report. The committee received a briefing on the Bill from National Treasury and also had submissions from SA Local Government Association, Salga, and the Financial Fiscal Commission. The committee also received inputs from Parliamentary Budget Office.

To facilitate public participation, the committee published adverts in print media in all 11 languages from 28 to 31 October 2016. Submission was received from Rural Health Advocacy Project. In view of the fact that this is a section 76 Bill, the committee, in processing the Bill, had to comply with section 7(b) of the Mandating Procedures of the Provinces Act, Act 52 of 2008.

For this purpose, members of the committee were released to provide briefings to the respective provinces. This was followed by the submissions for negotiating as well as final mandates from provinces. The Bill provides for changes in the equitable shared division of nationally raised revenue among the sphere of government, adjustments to provincial allocations, adjustments to local government allocations and changes to conditional grant frameworks.

Revisions to the 2016-17 main budget allocations to the national government resulted into a total decrease of R5,4 billion. This includes revised allocations of R1,9 billion to national departments. Provinces, however, continue to face funding challenges over the Medium Term Expenditure Framework, MTEF, period, mainly as

a result of 2015 public sector wage settlement which increased compensation costs above budgeted amounts.

In addition, fiscal consolidation and reprioritisation affects all spheres of government. Selected revisions to the Division of Revenue Bill include an additional amount of R212 million which were allocated to a new indirect component of Comprehensive Agriculture Support Programme. This will enable the national Department of Agriculture Forestry and Fisheries to provide relief to farmers affected by ongoing draught.

This relief to farmers will go a long way in strengthening food security and agricultural competitiveness as envisage by the National Development Plan, NDP. The National Development Plan initiatives to sustain and accelerate improvement to school performance include the investment in school buildings and maintenance to address backlogs, replace inappropriate buildings and meet minimum standards to sanitation and school facilities. For this reason, an amount of R177,1 million has been allocated to the education infrastructure grant for the rehabilitation of damaged school infrastructure. The funds will also be used to provide mobile classrooms while damaged school infrastructure is being rehabilitated.

In addition, an amount of R53,6 million has been added to the national school nutrition programme grant in order to cover the

shortfall costs by high inflation of food prices. Within the local sphere of government, the allocation for indirect water service infrastructure grant increased by R50,6 million in the 2016-17 financial year to fund the provision of emergency water supplies to draught affected communities including providing water tankers and storage tanks.

On the other hand, the allocation of the bucket eradication programme grant is increased by R72 million to allow the Department of Water and Sanitation to complete bucket eradication projects that the department has already identified and committed to implement.

As already indicated in processing the Bill, the committee received valuable inputs from various stakeholders including provinces. The committee has made some recommendations and acknowledges the financial pressures faced in provinces. The committee will ensure that some of the matters raised form part of its continuous discussions during the budget process as well as during its oversight work.

I must indicate that members of the committee engaged in constructive, robust discussions above narrow party political affiliation and all members of the committee were satisfied that the proposed amendments are reasonable, there was no grandstanding and they are justified and support the Bill without any amendments.

Thank you, Chairperson. [Applause.]

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: That concludes the debate. I shall now put the question, and the question is that the Bill be agreed to.

[Interjections.]

Ms C LABUSCHAGNE: Chairperson ...

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Do you want to come in now?

Ms C LABUSCHAGNE: Chair, I want to rise on a point of order, yes.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: It is a point of order, please proceed ma'am.

Ms C LABUSCHAGNE: Chairperson, I wrote to you a letter with regards to the processes and procedures of this Bill and I received your reply today. Thank you for that. However, I want this House to note our concern about the Bill: Although in your letter you indicated that province have voting mandates, but that procedure has not been followed as there are four provinces that did not have their final mandate on the Bill. We are concerned about the fact that processes and procedures have not been followed and we just want the House to take note of that.

This was addressed in the committee but the committee decided to continued with the process as is. The procedures and processes were

not followed due to time constraints as the Bill was not passed on the originally scheduled date in the NA. Thank you.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: I did receive a letter from the hon Labuschagne yesterday which outlined the issues she is outlining now. In terms of Rule 159(2) of the Joint Rules, the Chairperson is required to refer a draft Bill before introduction to the relevant select committee and the provincial legislatures, to enable them, amongst others, to acquaint themselves with the contents of the Bill and to develop their positions thereon.

At any stage after the introduction of the Bill, not just Members of Parliament but members of the public may comment on the Bill. To put it simple, once the hon Minister, Pravin Gordhan, has introduced the Bill there it is free for all across the world on that. A provincial legislature may, however, not commence formal consideration of any Bill until it has been properly referred to the provincial legislature.

Depending on the House of introduction, formal consideration may only commence after the Bill has been transmitted to the next House. In other words, in this particular Bill, the formal consideration by the provincial legislature could only happen after we have received the Bill, after it was dealt with by the NA and I had formally referred it to the provinces. That has been done. This Bill has followed that route; once it had passed through the NA, the Bill was

formally transmitted not only to the provincial legislatures but also to SA Local Government Association, Salga.

The question here is whether a validly conferred mandate is not valid, merely because a provincial legislature was not briefed on a Bill. In terms of the Act, all the provincial legislature is required to do is to demonstrate that it has validly conferred a mandate. The Act does not provide for the negotiating mandate as a prerequisite for a final mandate; it requires merely that the provincial legislature, at a relevant stage, confer such a relevant mandate.

A mandate will be valid for as long as it was validly conferred and in compliance with the requirements of the Act. In other words, after we have transmitted, did the legislature confer? Did the legislature have public hearings? Did the legislature transmit to us their final mandate? Did it have a negotiating mandate?

And perhaps, hon Labuschagne, the question is, what is the difference between a negotiating mandate and a final mandate? Whether a negotiating mandate is therefore a prerequisite and qualifies the final mandate of a province. I wish to say that it is very open. A negotiating mandate should enable the provincial delegations and provinces to have, in simple English, "I am open, you can convince me, but I am also going to convince you." That is what we understand a negotiating mandate to be.

A final mandate should be what worries us - if a province does not have a final mandate. I want to say that as we were deciding on this question, we had only one province that said it was not given a mandate. Therefore, I would want to submit, hon Labuschagne, that the points you raise are valid and must be taken into consideration but that they also take us back to a question we have been half considering and have not actually gone back to. It is whether or not we have enough space to consider Money Bills with the provisions of the Act as they are.

I think that we should, as the NCOP, continuously be alive to the challenges that we have because we might want to take the latitude and say we want to drag this process over, but again, the same Act puts us in prison because it says that by a particular period you must have passed.

So, I want to say that I take what you are saying ma'am. I tried to deal with the matter and I am hoping that in the committees hon members are busy trying to convince one another to deal with this as honestly as possible, but also be able to convince and be convinced on this matter. If you agree, ma'am, I would like then to proceed with the business?

*Declarations of vote:*

Mr O S TERBLANCHE (Western Cape): Hon Chairperson, you addressed the House on some of the concerns that were raised by the hon

Labuschagne. The Western Cape province has a number of procedural concerns with this Bill. There was insufficient time for briefings and public hearings in the provinces. Most of the briefings and hearings which did commence were procedurally flawed and/or lacked meaningful public participation. Four negotiating mandates were not procedurally compliant and two were outstanding.

Furthermore, the Eastern Cape provincial legislature did not submit its final mandate before the select committee commenced yesterday. Twice, we appealed to the Chairperson of the NCOP that we be provided with the legal opinion on the procedural problems that have occurred throughout this process. That did not happen.

Furthermore, we had a number of concerns about the content of this Bill including the national allocation which, with this adjustment, has now been adjusted downwards from R855 billion to R849,6 billion, a decrease of R5,4 billion. In some municipalities, deductions in the allocation for the bucket eradication grant are going to have huge ramifications as this is crucial or critical.

Many municipalities continue to be in financial distress and are still not able to service their Eskom accounts. The Minister has alluded to the fact that there will be extra cash the tune of R26 billion to allow for growth in government spending over the next two financial years. This effectively means less money for national, provincial and local government. This will affect service delivery

to our communities. Cadre deployment, also known as jobs for pals, in local municipalities continues to cost taxpayers' year on year.

It needs to be made clear that, while the Western Cape province spent its previous budget in a responsible manner by focusing on service delivery for the poorest of its communities - which is why we will be supporting this Bill - this does not occur in the other provinces. There remains no doubt that, under ANC government, this country is heading towards a fiscal klap. [smack]

The Western Cape is committed to service delivery and a corruption-free government. We aim to continue delivering a clean government with our budget allocation and therefore the Western Cape supports this Bill. I thank you.

Ms T MOTARA (Gauteng): Chairperson, the main purpose of Division of Revenue Act, Act 3 of 2016 is just for ... [Interjections.] ... [Inaudible.]

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Order, members!

Ms T MOTARA (Gauteng): ... allocation to provinces and municipalities. The schedule also addresses the following changes. It adjusts the equitable share of the national sphere of government. It changes the conditional grants to provinces and municipalities. It also changes gazetted frameworks. It is worth noting that only

the equitable share of the national sphere of government was adjusted. The equitable shares for the local and provincial spheres of government remain unchanged.

The global economy and world politics are in a state of flux characterised by high levels of uncertainty. South Africa, as part of the global village, is not immune to these conditions. The Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement was presented at the time when South Africa was undergoing a difficult economic transition. The economic growth estimate for 2016 has been revised down to 0,5% from 0,9% and National Treasury predicts a moderate recovery over the next three years with gross domestic product, GDP, growth reaching 2,2% in 2019.

Gauteng is in favour of the Bill but raised the following issues, however.

National Treasury should re-ensure that there is value for money for public resources exceeding R1 trillion per year. National Treasury should avoid the low growth trap through its engagements with the Reserve Bank by ensuring that fiscal and monetary policy are supportive of economic recovery. National Treasury in its allocations of conditional grants to municipalities must ensure that the Rand West City Local Municipality is financially provided for to guarantee a seamless merger of the Randfontein and Westonaria local municipalities. This comes as a result of lessons learned with the

merger of the former *Metsweding* municipality into the Tshwane Metropolitan. National Treasury should assist the Gauteng Department of Health in recouping money owed to it by other provincial and national departments. Lastly, National Treasury should facilitate that interprovincial debt is paid within the same financial year in which the debt was incurred.

With these issues raised, Gauteng votes in favour of the Bill. Thank you.

Mr J P PARKIES (Free State): Chairperson, the Free State supports this Bill, but we want to raise few issues on the basis of our support because it is a huge resource that supports infrastructure in our communities. It is a resource that needs to deal with bucket system eradication in the Free State. It is a resource that is supposed to deal with drought. We believe that the level of our work on rural development will be seriously affected by the drought in our province.

There are issues that relate to education. We believe that education is the heartbeat of our development and of our revolution. We need to deploy reasonable resources for education.

We believe that an integrated society is the main issue that we need to deal with. Therefore, the infrastructure development in our communities becomes very central to the development of our society.

We are exponents ... fervent exponents of democratic accountability by officials and authorities that are deployed in positions of power and authority to handle and be responsible for dealing with the resources that are meant to benefit our people.

We support the Bill.

Mr L P M NZIMANDE (KwaZulu-Natal): Chairperson, the province of KwaZulu-Natal, in its processing of the Bill, raised issues that you ably dealt with by providing clarity. A communiqué has been sent to your office as well as to the Chair of the Appropriations Committee. The response received from the committee concerning this helped to provide the basis of the support for the commitment of the committee to put in its programme the processes that we would start looking into the long-discussed and awaited amendments to the Bill.

Furthermore, the adjusted amounts for the province, particularly on the roll-over on road maintenance for the province would help us to deal with the continuous challenges experienced by the road networks in the province.

Also, the money received and adjusted to deal with agriculture and school nutrition in the province will go a long way towards addressing the backlog and to continue providing services to the poor people of the province.

We also take note of the fact that some of the issues we raised at the budget council include the unfunded mandate that provinces sometimes incur. For instance, the money that we need to resolve the issues of paying the iNdunas [chiefs.] ...

We also are thankful for the money that we have received as an adjustment fund to the National Health Insurance, NHI, programme because it goes a long way towards dealing with the issue of HIV and AIDS. Therefore, the adjustment is indeed positive for the province as it helps it to deal with issues that pertain to the backlog in services. Thank you.

Mr T C MOTLASHUPING (North West): Hon Chairperson, I need to confirm that the North West province was duly briefed on 16 November and on 24 November. The provincial legislature executive met and gave us the final mandate. On 16 November, there were public hearings in the North West province of which I also attended. Therefore, all processes were followed. All the legal aspects were covered. There was nothing illegal at the level of the committee. As befitting a legal entity, we dealt with the issues in terms of the law.

Now, one area that I think needs emphasis is the fact that the North West province is quite a rural province. One area that has been a hindrance in the province is water shortages. The area where I come from, Mamusa, has been hindered by a shortage of water. People have to go for days without water. We are happy to announce that

R3,4 million had been budgeted for the people of Mamusa for the purposes of water supply. That is a very good step in the right direction to address issues that affect our people.

I am also happy to announce that there is an amount ... because young people would always go astray and end up doing wrong things ... but there is an amount of R5 million for the wonderful town of Mamusa and Schweitzer-Reneke that has been allocated for a new sports ground. That is a positive development.

There is also an amount of R585 million that has been allocated to the North West for human settlements and to address the issues of having our people housed in mines. That issue has been addressed and we are happy that the Bill addresses such issues. [Interjections.]

We are also happy to announce that R402,7 million has been allocated for the school nutrition programme. [Interjections.]

Mr F ESSACK: Chairperson, I rise on a point of order. Through you Chairperson, with due respect to my colleague who sits with me on the Select Committee for Finance: All these details he is spelling out to the House are printed in detailed format in the Division of Amendment Bill. So, I do not know why he is wasting the time of the House. With due respect madam, it is in the Division of Amendment Bill and for everybody. ... [Interjections.] ... It is on the

website, and it is national. It is there for national consumption. He is wasting the time of the House. With due respect, Chairperson.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Thank you, hon Essack. [Interjections.] Order, hon members. Hon Essack, that was not a point of order. Hon members, declarations of vote enable members to say whatever they want to say on whatever matter is in front of them. This is a mini debate and therefore, anything goes. [Interjections.] Please continue, hon Motlashuping.

Mr T C MOTLASHUPING (North West): I know, hon Chair, that hon Essack is always out of order and irrelevant. [Interjections.]

All the townships ... in terms of addressing issues of water in the North West at Iketleng, Moses Kotane, Ratlou Tswaing ... [Interjections.]

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon Motlashuping, you should have not wasted your time by responding to hon Essack because your time has now expired. You had only three minutes to make ...

Mr T C MOTLASHUPING (North West): The North West supports the deal. Thank you.

Mr C J DE BEER (Northern Cape): Hon Chairperson, the Division of Revenue Bill is based on the sound fiscal policy followed by the ...  
[Interjections.]

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES: Order, hon Motlashuping!

Mr C J DE BEER (Northern Cape): ... is based on the sound fiscal policy followed by the ANC-led government since 1994. Economic growth will lead to more revenue collected, which will result in more funds that can be divided to address more set priorities.

Referring to the Northern Cape municipalities, there was an allocation of R135,3 million in the Bill and some of that money is allocated for bucket eradication. Why? To improve the dignity of our people. There is also R25 million for drought relief and R2,1 million for the school nutrition scheme. The Northern Cape is grateful for these allocations.

Lastly, the Northern Cape province followed the set procedure to process the Bill as full. Thank you.

Question put: That the Bill be agreed to.

In Favour: Free State, Gauteng, KwaZulu-Natal, Limpopo, Mpumalanga, Northern Cape, North West, Western Cape.

Bill accordingly agreed to in accordance with section 65 of the Constitution.

**ORATION OF CONDOLENCES ON THE DEATH OF FORMER PRESIDENT OF CUBA,  
HIS EXCELLENCY FIDEL ALEJANDRO CASTRO RUZ UNDER THE THEME -  
FAREWELL TO A GREAT REVOLUTIONARY AND AN INDOMITABLE LEADER OF THE  
CUBAN REVOLUTION AND THE GLOBAL STRUGGLE AGAINST IMPERIALISM**

Ms T MOTARA: Hon Chairperson, hon members, special delegates, ladies and gentlemen, a fierce and ferocious giant and an indomitable leader of the Cuban revolution and global struggle against imperialism, the former President and Prime Minister of Cuba Commandant Fidel Alejandro Castro Ruz, has evaded our eyes. As the ANC, we join the people of Cuba in mourning the loss of a formidable and legendary revolutionary whose name will forever remain engraved in our hearts and the history of our struggle for freedom and democracy.

Commandant Castro was an ultimate revolutionary who was fully aware of his essential historic leadership in the revolution amongst the international community. Just as important was his guidance in building both the Communist Party as well as the socialist revolution in the world. He continued to inspire people who would fight no matter the adversities, together his counterparts being Ernesto Che Guevara and Camilo Cienfeugos, amongst others.

Comrade Castro's determination and victory over American imperialism, helped revive socialism in Latin America and across the globe. Many national liberation struggles in Latin America, Africa and Asia gained strength from the assistance of revolutionary Cuba.

When Africa was being scrambled for her resources, Cuba took sides with the liberation movements. Cuba's involvement in Africa went beyond the ideological standoff between right and left to a real helping hand, sending soldiers, doctors and teachers when postcolonial Africa was at its most vulnerable historical epoch and still continues to do so to this day.

It was perhaps Cuba's willingness to fight side by side with Africans that made Commandant Castro such a towering figure and an embodiment of the struggle for freedom and liberation on the continent. In 1975, as Angola gained independence from Portugal, it was Cuba who offered a safe haven to then liberation movements hunted in their own countries. The ANC and Namibia's South West Peoples Organisation as well as uMkhonto weSizwe, MK, are some of the organisations that were housed in Angola.

When the South African apartheid government, aided by the United States of America, cowardly and viciously attacked Angola, it was Commandant Castro who came to the rescue of the people of Angola. He sent troops and succeeded in pushing the South African soldiers back while at the same time training African fighters to defend their

border as well as supplying the military equipment against imperialism.

Hon Chairperson, it is true that many factors have led to the demise of apartheid, including courage of the people of South Africa and the worldwide movement to impose sanctions against South Africa. However it is without any doubt that the defeat of the South African army by the joint People's Movement for the Liberation of Angola *Movimento Popular de Libertação de Angola*, MPLA, and later the People's Armed Forces of Liberation of Angola, *Forças Armadas Populares de Libertação de Angola*, Fapla, and the Cuban forces in the battle of Cuito Cuanavale played a major role; it brought the border war to an end and led to the peace negotiations that saw the withdrawal of SA Defence Force and uMkhonto weSizwe and the Cuban forces from Angola and Namibia and led to the independence of Namibia.

This as illustrated in the United Nations, UN, resolution on the withdrawal of the liberation armies from Angola and for the freedom of Namibia which began the negotiating process towards our own freedom.

Mam Gertrude Shope who was one such an outstanding MK commander was one such woman who fought in this battle. This is clearly illustrated as well in the words of our former commander in chief and President Nelson Mandela on his visit to Cuba in 1991 when he

said, and I quote, "We only came here with a sense of great debt that is owed to the people of Cuba. What other country point to a record of greater selflessness than Cuba has displaced in his relations to Africa."

I am one of the countless millions who drew inspiration from Commandant Castro's formidable life. My very first political action, the first thing that I ever deed that involved an issue or a policy or politics, was to learn about the role of Cuba in aiding the revolution throughout the world and the struggle for freedom and democracy in our country. Like so many around the globe, I cannot fully imagine life without the example that Commandant Castro set and so long as I live I will do what I can to continue to draw inspiration from the courageous life he lived and the people of Cuba.

I am in no doubt that South Africa today, would not be free, had it not been the role that the Cubans had played sacrificing their own for the likes of our African people. Therefore allow me hon Chairperson, to take this moment to convey our profound and heartfelt condolences to the people of Cuba for their immense loss. As the ANC, the people of South Africa and the African Continent, we mourn together with the people of Cuba for the loss of an illustrious giant and one of the most outstanding revolutionaries in history. As he wants declared, when he said, and I quote, "I am a Marxist Leninist and I will be one until the last day of my life."

May this great Marxist and Leninist rest in peace. Aluta continua.  
*Hasta la victoria siempre.* Thank you. [Applause.]

Ms C LABUSCHAGNE: Hon Chairperson, the death of Fidel Castro has been a global event creating debate and discussions on the legacy of the former Cuban President and the ideals for which he stood.

This debate in the NCOP today provides us with a unique opportunity to contribute to this discussion by reflecting on our own country, our values, our principles and what we stand for.

Fidel Castro played a role in our painful history and has been duly acknowledged for this. But when considering this motion, we must not just stop there; we must look further and consider what he did in his own country. The truth, fellow members, is that Fidel Castro's reign in Cuba was the fundamental antithesis of the constitutional values that we love in South Africa.

Mr Castro was a dictator. He jailed or executed his opponents. He persecuted people on the basis of their sexual identity. There were no elections. If you spoke out against Castro, you were an enemy of the state. These are the very things which so many of our people fought against in South Africa.

Fellow member, it is important that we consider all these facts, because if don't ... [Interjection.]

Ms T J MOKWELE: Ke a leboga, Modulasetilo. Ke ne ke rata go itse go tswa go sebui gore a se ka tsaya potso? [Thank you, Chairperson, I just wanted to ask if the speaker can take a question?]

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon Labuschagne, would you take a question?

No, she's not prepared ma'am.

Please continue ma'am.

No, no, she's not prepared hon Mokwele.

Ms C LABUSCHAGNE: Fellow members, it is important that we consider all these facts because if we don't, and merely glance over the brutality, hatred and fear, we make it easier for these own horrid values to return again.

South Africa stands for democratic elections not tyranny. South Africa stands for freedom of expression and association not fear and violence. And South Africa stands for the rights of all our people not the persecution of people based on their identity.

As a nation, we should never forget what we believe in, what values we strive and fight for. Let us use the death of Fidel Castro to re-commit to our own democratic values, to our Constitution which

respects the rights of all and to the principles of freedom, dignity and equality for all. Let us work hard to spread this message in other places around the world. Let it shape our foreign policy and animate every interaction we have. And let us share our own experiences overcoming ... [Interjection.]

Ms T J MOKWELE: Modulasetilo, ke ne ke batla go boelelela sebui gore gore a bo a kgona go bua jaana gompiono ... [Chairperson, I would like to tell the speaker that the reason she is able to speak here today ...]

... is because of the contribution that Fidel did to our country. She must never ever discredit that man. We are who we are because of him. Thank you.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon Mokwele, that was not a point order. And we don't have points of information in the House.

Please proceed.

Ms C LABUSCHAGNE: Chairperson, with your permission can I ask the member who tried to ask me a question the question in saying hon member I want you to think and think very carefully, under the reign of Fidel Castro if the EFF with the values they have at the moment would be able to be free in that country?

Let us work hard to spread this message ... [Interjection.]

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon Mokwele, take your seat. Hon Mokwele.

Ms C LABUSCHAGNE: Let us work hard to spread this message in other places around the world. Let it shape our foreign policy and animate every interaction we have. And let us share our own experience of overcoming authoritarianism with the Cuban people so that they too can create a freedom-loving, rights-based democracy. I thank you.

Ms N P KONI: The member on the podium is howling, she's making noise instead of sending condolences to the progressive *Comandante*. Thank you, Chairperson.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: That was not a point of order. Hon Labuschagne, have you finished? Thank you ma'am.

Ms G M MANOPOLE: Hon Chair, hon Chief Whip, delegates, especially ...

Moh T J MOKWELE: Modulasetilo, ga se ka mowa o o maswe, ke ne ke re fela go tswa go leloko la kwa Kapa Bokone go ya go le lengwe la Kapa Bokone re amogele mme jaaka *Ginger* wa rona wa NCOP. (*Translation of Setswana paragraph follows.*)

[Ms T J MOKWELE: Chairperson, it is not in bad faith, I was just saying, from one member of the Northern Cape to another member of the Northern Cape, we welcome our *Ginger* in the NCOP.]

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: That is not a point of order. Please continue hon Manopole.

Ms G M MANOPOLE: Ke a leboga Modulasetulo. [Thank you Chairperson.]

The ANC today joins 11,2 million Cubans both in Cuba and across the world in mourning the loss of a beacon of hope, a father, a friend, a giant gallant fighter, an icon of socialist revolutionary, an internationalist par excellence and a former President of Cuba. We mourn with billions of the working class and the poor who are marginalised, exploited and kept in the dungeons of poverty, inequality and unemployment by imperialism and monopoly capital.

In expressing our sincere condolences to the Castro family and people of Cuba on the passing away and the loss of El Comandante Fidel Castro, allow me to borrow from the words of Che Guevara: "the true revolutionary is guided by a great feeling of love."

[Applause.]

Fidel Castro had this love for his people and it saw expression through a genuine people's revolution.

In mourning, we join the peoples of Africa, Guinea-Bissau, Congo, Angola, Namibia etc.

The ANC thus commemorates one of our true friends and comrades in arms who played a significant role in the defeat of apartheid. In particular, we reminded ourselves of the contribution made by his people in preparing for and contributing towards arming, training, funding and even paying the highest price of death during the Battle of Cuito Cuanavale when they fought for the liberation of our country.

Today, the enemy of the socialist ...

Mme T J MOKWELE: I want to check whether the member is aware that the party she represents has betrayed the Comandante by allowing capitalism in the country.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon Mokwele, you did not ask whether the member wanted to take a question and therefore the member did not grant you permission to ask that question. Hon Manopole, please proceed.

Ms G M MANOPOLE: Today, the enemy of the socialist revolution believes what the DA member said before that it can draw certain conclusions from Comrade Fidel's death. Comrade Fidel was a master

of warfare. He was an artist of guerrilla struggle and a sound tactician. And he showed that an infinite number of times.

However, now, after his death, some people attempt to rebuff the truth and the value of his concepts. The revolutionary intellectual and internationalist may die, but what will surely never die is his convictions to which he dedicated his life. The Cuban leadership will continue with his legacy and will defend the revolution. That is true; there is no doubt about that. It shows their faith in their people, faith in Comrade Castro's ideas, and faith in his example.

We fully appreciate the value of example. We are absolutely convinced that many people will strive to live up to his example and that people like him will emerge. It is not easy to find a person with all the virtues that were combined in Comrade Fidel.

The ANC admires not only the intelligence, but also the person capable of performing great the triumphs of what he did and what he was doing. The very fact of his rising up with a handful of men against an army that had been trained by capitalists and indoctrinated with greed and sent in by imperialism, remains in and of itself an extraordinary masterstroke.

As we search the pages of history, it is unlikely that we will find another case in which a leader of such a small number of men had set about a task of such importance: going into battle with a small

number of against a large force located 80 miles away. Such proof of confidence in him, such proof of the confidence of his people, such confidence and faith of his men in his ability can be looked for in the pages of history, but such will never be found.

Today, the enemy believes his ideas - his socialist concepts, his belief in nationhood and the right to self-determination - have been defeated. They have failed to accomplish that over 306 times. They have attempted to assassinate him, and they have attempted to invade Cuba. Overall, what makes me marvel is the Bays of Pigs incident and the way they tried to poison his favourite cigar and his capsules.

The death of Comrade Fidel is indeed a hard blow, a tremendous blow for all revolutionary movements across the world because it deprives the movement, without a doubt, of its most experienced and able leader - a leader of an historic epoch.

But those who boast of his death as a victory are mistaken. They are mistaken if they think that his death is the end of his ideas, the end of his tactics, the end of his socialist construct concepts, and the end of his theory. He is a person who fell as an immortal. He faced bullets several times as a soldier and a leader, and was a thousand times more able than those who wanted overthrow the progressive movement of Cuba.

Even after the disappearance of Soviet Union aid, after the collapse which resulted in the hard times for the Cubans known as the special period - the tight rationing of food, fuel, and consumer goods - the people of Cuba did not succumb to the pressure of the economic blockade.

However, how should we as revolutionaries face this serious setback? How should we face this loss? We want to argue that if Comrade Fidel could express an opinion on this point, he would give an opinion expressed by his long time friend and Comrade Che Guevara when he wrote in his message to the Tricontinental Latin American Solidarity conference that:

"If death surprised him anywhere, it would be welcomed as long as his battle cry had reached a receptive ear and another hand reached out to take up his rifle."

As new leaders emerge, they too will learn from Fidel Castro about the important things of the revolution, those being ideas, objectives, sentiments and virtues. Apart from his other virtues, it is in that field - the field of ideas, the field of sentiments, the field of revolutionary virtues, the field of intelligence - that we will feel the tremendous loss that his death means to the revolutionary movement of the world.

His extraordinary character was made up of virtues that are rarely found together. He stood out as unsurpassed by any action. His was a visionary intelligence that embraced a broad culture. He was a profound thinker. He was a man of ideas and a man of action combined. If we wish to express an expectation of our leaders and the people of the world, we must say, without hesitation, that they should be like El Comandante Fidel Castro. If we wish to say that we want our children to be educated, we must say without hesitation that we want them to be educated like El Comandante Fidel Castro.

Therefore, the ANC believes that our people are sensitive, grateful people who know how to honour the memory of the brave - that our people recognise those who served them. This demonstrates the people's solidarity with the revolutionary struggle and how this people will rise aloft and maintain ever higher lofty revolutionary banners and revolutionary principles today. In this moment of remembrance, let us lift up our spirits with optimism in the future, with absolute optimism in the final victory of our peoples and say to Fidel, and to the heroes and heroines who fought and died for us in the battle of Cuito Cuanavale, hasta la vista. Thank you, Chair.  
[Applause.]

Ms D B NGWENYA: Chairperson, special delegates, ladies and gentlemen, the EFF is saddened by the passing away of the former President of Cuba, Comandante Fidel Castro Ruz, who passed away late on Friday, 25 November. Comandante Fidel Castro was an outstanding

leader and world icon who under the Cuban Communist Party government made Cuba a great country that continued to contribute to the total liberation of the oppressed masses of the world despite illegal and inhumane sanctions.

His refusal to succumb to capitalism as a system that promotes greed and profit at the expense of people's development as a whole should be celebrated by all who love justice, peace and equality for all in human race and it should inspire strength to continue the struggle for socialism.

We all know that Comandante Fidel Castro's 90 years of existence touched the lives of many in the world, particularly socialist militants who are still fighting capitalism and imperialism. We pass revolutionary condolences to them as well, hoping and wishing revolutionary peace to their painful hearts.

The passing of this Comandante is a loss to us in the African continent as well, for we benefited from his leadership and the revolution he led on behalf of his people. This revolution, the Cuban Revolution, is the greatest human gift of the 20<sup>th</sup> century because through it and because of it, the people of the global South benefited from the example, the benevolence, selflessness and generosity of the Cuban people.

After they inaugurated as socialist order, they did not focus only on their wellbeing, but continued and in many instances, to their own detriment, to contribute to the freedoms of others in the world. Had it not been for the Cuban presence in Africa and in particular Angola, led by Comandante Castro, the history of Africa would have never been what it is now, and this not only indebt us to the Cuban people, but makes us special friends with these beautiful people of Cuba.

Comandante Fidel Castro addressed South African Parliament in 1998, where he encouraged us to be a model of more justice and more human future, to symbolise more independent and sovereign South Africa beyond the atrocities of colonial and apartheid past. When he addressed a mass rally called by the Cuban Youths, students and workers on the May Day 2000; Comandante Castro argued that: "Revolution means to have a sense of history. It is changing everything that must be changed. It is full equality and freedom. It is being treated and treating others like human beings. It is achieving emancipation by ourselves and through our own efforts. It is challenging powerful dominant forces from within and without the social and national. It is defending the values in which we believe at the cost of any sacrifice ... [Interjections.]

Mr C HATTINGH: Chairperson, on a point of order, I would like to know if the hon member would take a question on the issues she is now addressing?

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon Ngwenya, do you want to take a question?

Ms D B NGWENYA: I don't have the time now he should know the history by now.

The DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: No. Thank you, sir. Proceed hon member.

Ms D B NGWENYA: As I was quoting our Fidel Castro our Comandante:

Revolution means unity; it is independence, it is fighting for our dreams of justice for Cuba and for the world which is the foundation of our patriotism, our socialism and our internationalism.

This is what informs the basis for the EFF Founding Manifesto when it says; "EFF is guided by revolutionary internationalism and solidarity that defined the politics of the July 26 movement. The EFF will continue the struggle in this Southern tip of the African continent to free our people from poverty and underdevelopment and from the shackles of capitalism".

Hon Chair, in his honour, we say long live the Cuban Revolution: "Hasta la Victoria Siempre." May the spirit of Comandante Fidel

Castro Ruz, rest in perfect revolutionary peace. I thank you.

[Applause.]

Ms MOKWELE: Chairperson, on a point of order, you know, hon Hatting is showing me videos where they used to kill our people. And on a serious note that video has ...

... e ntshositse, Modulasetilo. Ka jalo, ke kopa gore o bue le ene gore a tlogele go re bontsha ... [... scared me, Chairperson. Therefore, can you ask him to stop showing us ...]

... those violent videos because when we react to what he is doing it is not going to be right.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Thank you, ma'am. The point you are making - hon Hattingh, are you showing hon members videos in the House?

Mr C HATTINGH: I was showing the hon member Fidel Castro's Firing Squads.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Okay. Order hon members! I have addressed this House before on the decency of condolences and on the need to reflect respect; not only to those who are departed but to their people, their families and friends. I think it is absolutely

out of order! Hon Hattingh, if you want to take issues with Fidel do it outside of this House.

At this moment you are not even supposed to be showing each other whatever pictures. So, I ask you to behave and give the Chairperson the chance to introduce the next speaker on the podium. Hon Dhlomo.  
[Applause.]

Dr S M DHLOMO (KwaZulu-Natal): Hon Chair, select committee members present and hon members, today, marks ground breaking HIV vaccine trial that is started in 15 sites in the country. It is the world's first HIV vaccine looking into the efficacy of that product.

This HVTN 702 study will establish whether this vaccine safely prevents HIV infection among South African adults. The studies conducted as collaboration amongst National Health Insurance, NHI, the Bill and Melinda Gates Foundation and our own South African Medical Research Council, MRC.

The whole world is waiting for the results, ironically, they won't come early, but a small country with a big heart, like Cuba does not have grabble the problems of HIV, TB, maternal deaths, infant mortality, under 5 mortality, because the policies that were put in place in that country since 1959 focused largely on health and education.

Amongst the very first countries that President Nelson Mandela, visited when he left prison in 1991 was Cuba. It was to take stock of the victories of our struggles of the people of world while also reflecting on the future plans.

The ANC has actually prioritised education and health, and we believe that it had influence with the discussions that President Nelson Mandela had then with Fidel Castro, because we notice that in 1994 the very first task that was given to Dr Nkosazana Dlamini-Zuma, the first Minister of Health in this country was to go to Cuba and implement an agreement that had been realised from the discussions between late President Fidel Castro and President Nelson Mandela where we were attempting to address the serious challenges in the production of medical doctors in our country.

The collaboration in the health field between South Africa and Cuba enabled South Africa to recruit doctors from Cuba whilst also sending young aspirant students doctors from our poor communities for medical training in Cuban universities.

The South African medical schools were not yet ready to produce reasonable numbers of medical doctors in particular within the context of the country's health demands. There are only eight medical schools in the country with the population of 52 million and in Cuba there are 22 medical schools with the population of 11 million. This implies that Cuba trains more students with a

better yield in any given timeframe. Cuba invested on education and medical training, hence they have over 100 000 doctors and 20 000 of those are practicing medicine outside Cuba including our country.

In order to supplement the number of medical doctors required, South Africa has therefore embarked on this very noble programme of partnership with Cuba. Their training is primarily focussed on primary health care, which is the main issue that we want to drive in this country through the NHI. Furthermore, the target group of students that we sent to Cuba are the young, black African males and females, who come from previously disadvantaged communities, and therefore not only do they come back and become good doctors, but also they become breadwinners of families that otherwise would not have doctors in their communities.

From the commencement of this programme, a total of 940 students have been to Cuba doing this training just from one province alone and that is KwaZulu-Natal. Our province constitutes the majority of the students that we have in Cuba. There are 104 that have come back and now practicing in various hospitals while 743 are still in Cuba practicing there.

On several visits that I have made to Cuba, I sat and ask Cubans, but why are you doing these good things to us? And their response has been to say and I quote: "You are part of us. Our origins are in Africa. We do it to ourselves when we do it to you".

And therefore, it actually confirms what President Fidel Castro did in Cuito Cuanavale, and I quote amongst other things that President Fidel Castro said like many other imperialist that came here and did whatever they did. President Fidel Castro has this to say and I quote: "We did not take back from Africa any gold or any diamonds, but we took bodies of our fallen soldiers to go and bury".

The department will therefore continue its relationship with Cuba and will continue to benefit as we have done, because there are many and serious challenges. We have an ageing population of doctors in our country and we will continue needing them.

It is therefore imperative that scholars and activists reassert the importance of the battle of Cuito Cuanavale and not only for the sake of historical accuracy, but also to honour the memory of those who fought and died for the liberation of Southern Africa.

Cuito Cuanavale was the largest military confrontation on African soil since the Second World War allies in Northern Africa. It marked the beginning of the end of white minority domination in Southern Africa, the dismantling of the apartheid system, and the total liberation of Africa from European occupation. It shattered the myth of white supremacy, that was the ideological foundation of apartheid regime, and the entire European colonial project. It was a profound demonstration of Pan Africanism - which scholars used to call

reverse diaspora - as over 50 000 Cubans returned to the land of their ancestry to read the continent of racists rule.

Finally, it was a testament to international solidarity as revolutionary Cuba to always recognised a historic debt it owes Africa and sent best of its best and materials to fight against apartheid living itself vulnerable to attacks by the US, while expecting and receiving absolutely nothing in return for its sacrifice.

In a speech to tens of thousands in Cuban soil that hon Mandela made in 1991, he had amongst other things this to say and I quote:

We have long wanted to visit your country and express the many feelings that we have about the Cuban revolution, about the role of Cuba in Africa, Southern Africa, and the world. The Cuban people hold a special place in the hearts of the people of Africa. The Cuban internationalists have made a contribution to African independence, freedoms, and justice, unparalleled to the principles and selfless character. Your crushing defeat on the racist army at Cuito Cuanavale was a victory for the whole of Africa.

Today, visitors to Freedom Park in Pretoria will see included on the list of anti-apartheid martyrs the names of the over 2 000 Cubans who lost their lives in Angola. There is no greater authority than

those who suffered under apartheid, including our Mandela himself, on the question of the significance of the Battle of Cuito Cuanavale.

We have therefore learnt greatly, that such a great leader and a great giant should actually be commemorated, and his life has been a life that we all need to commend and say, viva comrade Fidel Castro, viva Cuba. I thank you.

Ms T J MOKWELE: Without wasting the hon Gaehler's time, I want you to take note that the white DA members of this House are out. That is a clear indication that they don't respect the El Comandante as I might put it. It must be noted that they do not respect the democracy that we are fighting for.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon Mokwele - please take your seat, sir - that is not a point of order. The sentiments are registered but that is not a point of order. Hon Julius, what are you rising on?

Mr J W W JULIUS: Chairperson, exactly on the sentiments.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Yes, please then take your seat.

Mr J W W JULIUS: I don't think you can guess what the sentiments are.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Please, take your seat. Whatever you are going to say on a point of order that I have said is not a point of order, will be out of order. Please, accept that. I have ruled on the hon Mokwele, and we are proceeding. The hon Gaehler is on the floor.

Mr L B GAEHLER: Chairperson, The UDM joins the people of the world in mourning and celebrating the life of a remarkable and the indomitable revolutionary of our time. Indeed, Fidel Castro was a sincere and reliable friend of the poorest of the poor world over. His theory and action was a reflector of a rare creature who embodied the high ideals of a true politician, round citizen, patriot and leader of the helpless from birth to death.

Fidel Castro was born from a wealthy family but chose to dedicate his life fighting for the most impoverished citizens of the world. His well recorded and unparalleled contribution towards the liberation and the improvement of the lives of the many neglected in a world are well recorded in the history of the nations. He, together with many other revolutionaries, defeated the world that is dominated by a cruel system of capitalism.

The world and in particular the poor has lost the wisest revolutionary of the 20th century. It is not anyone that defeats a dictatorship that is supported and assisted by the imperialist regimes led by the United States of America, USA, with only 20 men.

He defeated illiteracy, reduced infant mortality rate from 42% to 4%, ensured every citizen has access to a quality health with a high rate of doctors per capita in the world. He made his country to have a population whose life expectancy was 79 years from birth.

Fidel Castro supplied medical doctors to the many poor citizens of the world with a first class training and expertise. He abolished child malnutrition. He got a 100% of schooling and created a country where no single child will sleep on the street. He also created a country which fulfils the ecological sustainability.

Indeed, Fidel Castro has left a legacy of a true revolutionary and leader that all who are left behind should emulate.

Aba bangazange baye ... - [Those who never went ...]

Luckily Chairperson, I went to Cuba in 2006. Cuba was poor but one thing about Cuba, its land and economy belong to the Cubans. They had the best agriculture in the world; hard-working people and the best that you can ever get. For that matter, if I could, I would have lived in Cuba because it was well governed. I thank you.

[Applause.]

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: You are protected, Mr [Ntate] Gaehler.

Mr M KHAWULA: Sihlalo ohloniphekile ... [Hon Chairperson ...]

... the IFP joins the millions of the people of goodwill citizens of the world in expressing our sincere condolences to the people of Cuba on the passing on of the leader, Fidel Castro. Born in 1926 and passing on in 2016 at the age of 90, Fidel Castro made a memorable contribution to the people of Cuba and the world. There is a saying in English that, "you can't be everything to everyone." This fits perfectly well in relation to who Fidel Castro was to many in the world.

As a revolutionary and freedom fighter, he made friends, comrades and revolutionaries with many like-minded leaders and supporters around the world. In the IFP, we acknowledge that we may not have subscribed to his ideals, but value that his contribution in many ways also assisted some of our brothers and sisters in the country and the continent in our own struggle for liberation in South Africa. The IFP has always acknowledged that there may be many roots leading to a particular destination. Therefore, wrangling about which route is the best instead of looking at arriving at the destination is of secondary importance.

Fidel Castro provides but one good example to many in the world. That is, if you believe in something, stand by it and fight for it to the bitter end. Fidel Castro so much believed in his revolutionary and communist ideals that no measure of European and American supremacy was able to shut him down. Right at the doorstep of the USA, he was able to resist American influence, which he

believed was not good for his country and stood by his conviction up to the bitter end.

The people of South Africa in general and KwaZulu-Natal in particular have benefitted from the health programmes of Cuba designed by Fidel Castro. KwaZulu-Natal has many young doctors in our hospitals today, who are a product of the Cuba-KwaZulu-Natal programme. [Applause.] One thing that the hon Dr Dhlomo, my colleague, did not say was that the programmes he was talking about started when the IFP was in control of KwaZulu-Natal.

[Interjections.] In IsiZulu we say ... [Interjections.]

Abantu abayi nganxanye bengemanzi. [People don't view things in the same light.]

This is one aspect of democracy that we still need to instil to this House, South Africa and elsewhere.

In the spirit of ubuntu, a principle firmly grounded in the principles of the IFP, we mourn the loss of a human being and a leader in Fidel Castro. He has many students of revolution that he created amongst many leaders in our country. That, in itself, is an influence and a contribution that cannot be overlooked.

Where he stands out as a giant is in actually practising what he was preaching. He would not, on a single day, have been found preaching

socialism, denouncing capitalism and yet living the life of a capitalist. The leader of the IFP, Prince Mangosuthu Buthelezi, is a product of the ANC mentored by the likes of Inkosi Albert Luthuli, Pixley Ka Isaka Seme and others. That is why in founding the IFP, he consulted and borrowed from leaders like Julius Nyerere, a socialist, Hastings Banda another socialist and others.

Therefore, in a way, Commandant Fidel Castro was at a distance but not very far from the ideals that founded the IPF. Therefore, we say rest in peace leader, Castro! Thank you.

Mr J P PARKIES: Chairperson, hon members, we stand here to celebrate a well lived life of a genuine revolutionary. A symbol of the working class internationalism, a symbol of a practical and active solidarity with the world oppressed nations. A leader who has survived 368 assassination attempts by US Citizenship and Immigration Services, USCIS.

His legacy will be with us forever. His example ought to be emulated by all those who regard themselves as revolutionaries. The example of moral integrity and authority, the example of living with strength of conviction and maintenance of principle and a firm believer in the relevance of socialism. Fidel Castro, the commander in chief, he denounced racism but propagated human race.

We need to send a message to the DA, Castro represented a total liberation of the people black and white. He assisted and contributed to our continent. For the fact that DA leave the House when we celebrate and give our last tribute to this great leader of the working-class internationalism, it shows and gives an expression that they remain fervent believers of the apartheid system and all its vices. [Applause.] [Interjections.]

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: hon Parkies, please take your seat?

Mr J W W JULIUS: Chairperson, on a point of order, I mentioned it earlier that no speculation can be made that the DA left because of this. There are many ANC members that are not here ...

[Interjections.]

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon Julius, what is your point of order?

Mr J W W JULIUS: ... and on any day, there are about 20 ANC members who would also not be here on important dates. Hon Parkies cannot make assumptions.

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon Julius, your point is sustained.

Mr J P PARKIES: Chairperson, as long as I am a member of this House, I shall constantly assert that within DA you will find incorrigible racist elements.

Fidel Castro represented abhorrence against US-led imperialism and all its vices. He was the voice of the poor and underdeveloped nations and exploited. He challenged disruptive caprices of imperialism. Under his leadership, the Cuban Revolution was defended and its sovereignty through its unity of the great masses. The Cubans understood their international obligation to help assist and contribute with their skills and a variety of expertise and to contribute to all reviled nations of the underdeveloped world.

The Cuban masses never experienced and suffered from the profligacy of his leadership and engorged vampire elite. In the face and the mist of inhumane economic blockade foisted by US and its allies, he defeated and defended the course of socialism and never compromised the principle.

This was a communist leader with resiliency, who defied calamitous rule of monopoly capitalism, the system that destroys our lives, the system that destroys the scores of people, the system that destroys our environment and dignity of our people, the system which is ruthless, nefarious system that concise workers and demean their human dignity. Fidel Castro extol not the system and its sordid values and cultural knowledge. This international figure of its own

category and autodidact intellectual struggled for egalitarian decency and social justice and defeated despotic dictator in Cuba.

He constantly criticized nebulous blind laws of market fundamentalism in the midst of these ideological climate, he remained sanguine about the future of socialism as a rational system, humane and egalitarian social system with progressive moral virtues. Its impact and impressions in Cuba will not have any ephemeral effects in the lives of ordinary people.

We want to say, let the red flag under which we fight be the sacred course of liberation of humanity. We honour his indomitable service to the cause of the revolution and his selfless sacrifice. Thank you. [Applause.]

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Order, members! It is interesting that amongst us here are four of us who are probably still alive because of Fidel. I do know that when Nova Katengue was attacked and poisoned, I was one of the survivors, simply because Fidel flew in a planeload of doctors to save us from the poison.

I am a multiparty democrat, not a Communist. I believe, though, I will always owe my life to those Cuban doctors. I believe that when I look at the hon Mlambo, I know that his first uniform was from the Cubans. I believe that I do know that we are what we are - amongst us, very straight; amongst us, very crooked - and that, in fact, it

was the contribution of Cuba to the liberation struggle of this country, that whatever we may want to say, we must give credence, respect, and a good salute to the commander of the people.

Debate concluded.

**STATEMENT BY CHAIRPERSON ON REFERRAL OF A MATTER TO STANDING  
COMMITTEE ON POWERS AND PRIVILEGES**

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: Hon members, I do have to deal with a little matter that arose during the day but which was also brought to my attention last week. During the sitting on 18 November 2016, in the Eastern Cape, a member of our House was heard making allegations of rape against a member who was at the podium at the time, debating.

Now, due to the seriousness of the remarks and the implications on the decorum of the House, I have decided to refer this matter to the standing committee, in terms of section 12(1) of the Powers, Privileges and Immunities of Parliament and Provincial Legislatures Act of 2004. The committee should inquire into the matter and present its report in terms of section 12(3) of that Act. In that way, we will get to deal with issues of decorum of the House, deal with the impugning of the member who was at the podium and also deal with the veracity, or not, of those allegations.

The Council adjourned at 16:00.

---

**ANNOUNCEMENTS, TABLINGS AND COMMITTEE REPORTS**

**MONDAY, 28 NOVEMBER 2016**

**ANNOUNCEMENTS**

**National Assembly and National Council of Provinces**

**The Speaker and the Chairperson**

**1. Draft Bills submitted in terms of Joint Rule 159**

- (1) **Communal Property Associations Amendment Bill, 2016**, submitted by the Minister of Rural Development and Land Reform.

Referred to the **Portfolio Committee on Rural Development and Land Reform** and the **Select Committee on Land and Mineral Resources**.

**TUESDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2016**

**ANNOUNCEMENTS**

## National Council of Provinces

### The Chairperson

#### 1. Message from National Assembly to National Council of Provinces in respect of Bills passed by Assembly and transmitted to Council

(1) Bill passed by National Assembly and transmitted for concurrence on 29 November 2016:

(a) **Taxation Laws Amendment Bill** [B 17B – 2016] (National Assembly – sec 77).

The Bill has been referred to the **Select Committee on Finance** of the National Council of Provinces.

(b) **Tax Administration Laws Amendment Bill** [B 18 – 2016] (National Assembly – sec 75).

The Bill has been referred to the **Select Committee on Finance** of the National Council of Provinces.

(c) **Rates and Monetary Amounts and Amendment of Revenue Laws Bill** [B 19 – 2016] (National Assembly – sec 77).

The Bill has been referred to the **Select Committee on Finance** of the National Council of Provinces.

(d) **Rates and Monetary Amounts and Amendment of Revenue Laws (Administration) Bill** [B 20B – 2016] (National Assembly – sec 75).

The Bill has been referred to the **Select Committee on Finance** of the National Council of Provinces.

## **COMMITTEE REPORTS**

### **National Council of Provinces**

**Please see pages 25–57 of the ATCs.**

**WEDNESDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2016**

## **ANNOUNCEMENTS**

### **National Assembly and National Council of Provinces**

#### **The Speaker and the Chairperson**

#### **1. Bills passed by Houses – to be submitted to President for assent**

(1) Bill passed by National Council of Provinces on 30 November 2016:

(a) **Division of Revenue Amendment Bill [B 15 – 2016]** (National Assembly – sec 76).

## **TABLINGS**

### **National Assembly and National Council of Provinces**

## **1. The Speaker and the Chairperson**

- (a) Report of the Auditor-General on Performance Audit of the management of pharmaceuticals at the departments of Health [RP 313-2016].
- (b) Report of the Auditor-General on Performance Audit on water infrastructure at the Department of Water and Sanitation [RP 314-2016].
- (c) Education Sector Report for 2015-16 of the Auditor-General South Africa [PR 360-2016].

## **COMMITTEE REPORTS**

### **National Council of Provinces**

**Please see page 94 of the ATCs.**