

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 1

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

PROCEEDINGS OF THE NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

The House met at 10:00.

The House Chairperson Ms M G Boroto took the Chair and requested members to observe a moment of silence for prayer or meditation.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: House chair, thank you for the opportunity, we move that this House approves the draft notice and schedule received from the President dated 28 November 2017, determining the rate at which salaries and allowances or benefits are payable to Constitutional Court judges or judges annually with effect from 01 April 2017 in terms of section (1)(a) of the Judges Remuneration and Conditions of Employment Act as amended by section 15 of the Judicial Officers Amendments. We so move.

Agreed to.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 2

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: House Chair, we again move that this House approves the draft notice and schedule received from the President, dated 28 November 2017, determining the rate at which salaries and allowances or benefits are payable to magistrates annually, with effect from 01 April 2017 in terms of section 12(1) (a) of the Magistrates Act as amended by section 3 of the Judicial Officers Conditions of Service Act. We so move.

Motion agreed to.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: House Chair, I am just hopeful that I will also get a bonus after this.

[Laughter.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Christmas present.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: House Chair, on a serious note we move that this House suspends Rule 290(2) (a), which provides *inter alia* that the debate on the Second Reading of a Bill may not commence before at least three working days have elapsed since the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 3

committee's report was tabled, for the purposes of conducting the Second Reading debate today on the Adjustments Appropriation Bill. We so move.

Declaration(s) of vote:

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: House Chair, we do not usually oppose wavings of three day rules in this House because generally we recognise that we do need to find consensus and find each other in this House. However, this particular matter, the handling of the budget as well as this matter, the Adjustments Appropriations Bill cannot go without comment and the expression of our reservations with the manner in which both the budget process as well as the Adjustments Appropriations Bill has been handled by this House.

Last year we raised similar concerns around the processing of the budget and the Adjustments Appropriations Bill both in this House and in the NCOP. You will recall that several letters were written to you and concerns were raised. We decided last year to let it go because we were under the express understanding that in the intervening period measures are going to be put in

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 4

place to improve the way this parliament has processed its finances, the budget and the Appropriations Bill.

Unfortunately that has not been the case. In fact what we have seen this year is a far worse process that we even had last year. It is very clear that the process this year for the budget as well as the Adjustments Appropriations Bill are being rushed through and railroaded precisely to ensure that this House rises in time for the ANC to start campaigning for their internal elections and it is not acceptable. [Applause.]

It is not acceptable that this House is forced to rise and rush through its business, the people's business in order to meet an internal party deadline. Unacceptable. Just yesterday we had a discussion by the high level panel that presented themselves before the National Assembly. One of the chief concerns that they raised was precisely this fact that Parliament itself is not expressing, shaping or adjusting the budgets to suit the people's needs. The high level panel has recognised that this Parliament is far too beholden to the executive when

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 5

it comes to the budgeting, too subservient to the Executive when it comes to adjusting.

What we need to see and what the High level panel is calling for is for a Parliament that is far more activist in its approach, that is actually looking very carefully at the budget and not just simply sitting back and accepting whatever the executive throws into this House without questioning it instead just rushes it through the processes. The chairperson of the finance committee bullying and intimidating Members of Parliament on the finance committee when they are just trying to do the job that the people of South Africa sent them here to do which is to exercise influence and oversight of the budget.

We cannot accept a process this year where the process ... [Interjections.] ...

Ms L M MASEKO: So what?

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: ... and you ask, so what? You ask so what? I hear the hon member at the back

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 6

saying, so what. Well, I will tell what, it is precisely what the High Level Panel said. It said that you are not doing your job as a Member of Parliament if you are just accepting what is coming this way from the executive.

[Applause.] That is so what.

How can you in good conscience go back to your communities and tell them that you have done good by them, that you have examined this budget and that you really stood up for the people that sent you here. You are not doing that, you are simply rolling over onto your back and letting the executive scratch your tummy and acquiescing to their every command. That is an abrogation of your duty. [Applause.] It is a failure and dereliction of Members of Parliament to do the job that they were sent to this House to do. That is why it is so what and if you do not take your job seriously please do not stand in the way of Members of Parliament who do take their job and responsibility seriously. [Applause.] That is so what.

We cannot allow again in this House for deadlines to be set, this budget should have been subjected to far more

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 7

scrutiny. It is probably the most important budgeting process that we have had since 1994. This country is in tremendous trouble. This government has steered our economy into the rocks. It should be this Parliament's responsibility to fix the sails change the directions and start steering us away from the rocks. Instead what the ANC wants to do is say to the executive, well you have smashed the ship onto the rocks we are going to reverse a little bit and let you smash it on to the rocks again.

That is a failure of our responsibility. We should not be cutting short our responsibility to this House. We should not be cutting with jobs. I thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon member from the ANC could you please take your seat by your side. Hon Singh, is that a declaration?

Mr N SINGH: Yes, it is a declaration.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Oh, you just didn't want to come here?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 8

Mr N SINGH: Yes

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): It is fine. Thank you very much. Hon member are you comfortable there or would you like to take your seat back there and you will come back?

Mr N SINGH: Chair, I do not mind if the hon ANC member goes before me so that I can rebut what he says, however, House Chairperson, to the extent that the hon Chief Whip of the Opposition has spoken about the role of Parliament to monitor budgets. I think that we are failing in that regard because as Parliament we do not really do our job in terms of legislation that we have passed to oversee a budget that the executive presents to us. That is not solely our fault, it is because we have passed legislation in this House where the timeframes have not been adequately addressed. I was part of the founding committee when the hon Nene looked at this piece of legislation. [Interjections.]

Chair, I really can't hear myself with the noise behind me.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 9

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon members, please allow the hon Singh to make his declaration. You all have representatives in the House who can respond to what he is saying. Continue, hon Singh.

Mr N SINGH: I was one of the members on the original committee when this parliament voted that we should establish a committee to look at what is our constitutional right. I think that in drafting that legislation we accepted that the time frames we put there for portfolio committees to look at the budgets and go back to Ministers and get the Standing Committee of Appropriations to also make submissions was not adequate.

My appeal is and I have made this appeal in another forum is that we as parliament need to relook at that legislation that we ourselves have passed in this House, look at the timeframes to make it reasonable enough for us to influence a budget that the executive presents to us. So, to that extent I think that the hon Steenhuisen is right but we have no objection with us proceeding and we will support the suspension of the three day rule today. Thank you.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 10

IsiZulu:

Mnu N E GCWABAZA: Sihlalo ohloniphekile, angikubalule ukuthi lo Mthethosivivinyo ...

English:

... of the Adjustments Appropriations Bill was processed by the committee ...

IsiZulu:

... ngesikhathi esivumelekile ngomthetho wama-Money Bills. Akukho lapho ikomidi leqe khona isigama sokuqxilonga lo Mthethosivivinyo. Izolo ikomidi ligcobe laphinde lamukela umbiko okade oxilongwa sonke lesi sikhathi. Kodwa mangikubalule ukuthi ngoLwesibili ...

English:

... we did effect some amendments to the budget, to the Adjustment Appropriations Bill and at that point the DA and that is why the hon Steenhuisen is so agitated. The DA never made any proposals on the adjustments.

[Interjections.] Yes, they never made any adjustments. At the time when we were processing the adjustments that were presented to us by both the National Treasury and

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 11

the Department of Home Affairs, only yesterday morning at about 10:00 they sprung up 58 amendments and wanted to push those amendments through the committee. The only reason why they did that is that they wanted to delay the passing of this Bill. [Interjections.]

I have a response to what you are saying. That is the only reason. This issue was consulted on among the political parties and I am informed that it is only the DA which did not agree to the waving of the three days rule. [Applause.] The other parties agreed and the only reason why you disagreed was: Firstly, because you wanted to push through your unreasonable amendments within a short space of time to delay the process to well beyond Christmas possibly. The second reason is that you care nothing about our people. [Applause.] That is the reason why you do not want us to pass these adjustments so that government can continue to deliver services to our people efficiently and productively.

We cannot as the ANC be bullied by yourselves as the DA. The people of this country cannot be bullied by the DA. I must add that there is a process of amending the Money

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 12

Bills which should be put through Parliament early next year and some of these issues which all of us are concerned about in terms of time frames are being dealt with and you are part of that process of amending the money Bills. You come here and pretend as if you do not know that there is a process of amending the Money Bills. You have displayed for all to see your disdain for our people. Your refusal to get the Adjustment Appropriations Bill passed so that government can continue to provide services to our people and grow the economy. Thank you.

[Applause.]

Division demanded

The House divided

AYES - 201: [TAKE IN FROM MINUTES]

NOES - 75: [TAKE IN FROM MINUTES]

Motion accordingly agreed to.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 13

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: House Chair, we move that this House, in terms of Rule 120(2) which provides *inter alia* that the House may amend or rescind a previous resolution approved or rejected by it during the same annual session, amends the title of the Report of the Portfolio Committee on Trade and Industry on Oversight visit to National Regulator for Compulsory Specifications, as it appears in the Minutes of Proceedings of 24 October 2017 to:

The Report of Portfolio Committee on Trade and Industry on Oversight visit to Gauteng.

It's just the title of that report that we are appealing that the House should agreed to. Thank you, Chairperson.

Motion agreed to.

**CONSIDERATION OF REPORT OF AD HOC COMMITTEE - ON FUNDING
OF POLITICAL PARTIES**

Mr V G SMITH: Chairperson, hon members, comrades, fellow South Africans, good morning.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 14

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon members, please, I said, let's lower our voices. I think ...

Mr V G SMITH: Sixth months ago, this august House, established the Ad Hoc Committee with the mandate to review the Public Funding of Represented Political Parties Act of 1997. The Constitution in section 236 states that in order to enhance multi-party democracy, the national legislation must provide for the funding of political parties participating at national and provincial legislatures in equitable and proportional basis.

The report of the Ad Hoc Committee that has been table today is philosophically informed by the desire to ensure that the country has a comprehensive system of public funding of represented political parties in the different spheres of government as part of strengthening the tendency of our democracy.

In this regard, it is our view that accountability, transparency and the sovereignty of South Africa be key pillars of any proposed new legislation.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 15

In executing our mandate, Chairperson, we invited comments from all stakeholders which comments were dully considered.

The committee also review the current legislation and its regulations. This process let to the conclusion that the existing legislation be repealed and that a new framework to address the weaknesses identified be developed.

Whilst it must be clarified that today we are tabling the committee report for consideration, the committee has concluded its work on the draft Bill and regulations, which are attached to this report and are simultaneously introduced.

We request that this House scheduled the debate on the Bill as soon as it is legally permissible to do so.

We also, on the advice of the legal unit, suggest that this Bill be tagged as a section 75 Bill.

Chairperson, all members of the committee agree that the need a transparency in the funding of political parties is long overdue. South Africans need to know who funds

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 16

political parties and extends of policy influence if any that such donors exercise on party policy choices.

In this regard, the proposal is that the regulation of private funding should be fully disclosed above a certain threshold of monies received and funder's details.

Secondly, all donors that are listed on the Johannesburg Securities Exchange must be required also to disclose the fact that they make donations to multi-party and directly to the parties.

Furthermore, Chairperson, we proposed that political parties be prohibited from accepting donations from organs of state, state-owned enterprises, government departments or from the proceeds of crime.

In an effort to protect our sovereignty, there is across the board support that foreign governments and their agencies be prohibited from directly funding political parties and the entire multi-party democracy fund.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 17

Furthermore, we suggest that a ceiling of R15 million per annum, per donor be agreed to. We believe that in doing so; we will be protecting and enhancing the democracy of our country. It will also mean that the world of political party supporters and the citizenry will always prevail over the private narrow interest of those with deep pockets or those with close proximity to political power. Our democracy must be safeguarded at all costs from being sold to the highest bidder.

With regard to the fund management, the existing represented political party fund as well as the multi-party democracy fund should be managed by the Independent Electoral Commission, IEC. The committee also believe that the draft Bill will ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Unfortunately, your time has expired.

Mr V G SMITH: The committee submits that the report be considered and accepted by this House. I thank you.

[Applause.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 18

Declarations of vote:

Mr R A LEES: Madam Chair, today we are debating the report of the Ad Hoc Committee on political party funding and not the Bill that the committee has recommended, they introduce to regulate party funding and require its disclosure. But the reports at the recommended Bill are inexplicably links. There seems to be an automatic assumption amongst the commentarial that the disclosure of funds to political parties is a good thing and that when it comes to politicians there is no such thing as an incorruptible politician

The public, they so argue, have a right to know who funds parties and that this will somehow stop corruption.

Disclosure is good; confidentiality is bad like Snowflake and George Orwell in *Animal Farms* said four legs good, two legs bad. Like all simplifications, there is both truth and naivety in these believes.

But in the era of state capture and the Gupta looters, it is difficult to oppose disclosure. But not every politician has a scandal, not every donor wants a favour. In 40 years of raising money for the DA and its

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 19

predecessors, no donor has ever asked me for a favour in their businesses.

Where we add was in the Hawk's affair and this cost us. It damaged the reputation and made it extremely difficult to raise money for years thereafter. It reinforced our view that it was essential to act ethically when fundraising and we developed a code which fundraisers have to follow.

Madam Chair, there are some parties represented in this House, who raised funds by simply tendering money from government all spheres via third parties. We are discovering this as we uncover and interdict corruptions in the government in that three metros that we took control in 2016.

This report does not deal with these criminal activities, nor does the recommended Bill. There are some parties represented in this House, who buy votes in the run-up to elections by abusing state resources. We all know this. This report does not deal with these criminal activities, nor does the recommended Bill. Till these malpractices

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 20

are effectively prohibited and the perpetrators prosecuted, the recommended Bill will not stop corruption nor state capture. What the recommended Bill will do is to make it more difficult for honest parties to raise money honestly. But then perhaps that was the purpose of all along. Thank you, Madam Chair. [Applause.]

Declarations:

Mr T RAWULA: The EFF is categorically opposed to the Bill as proposed because it reproduces political power imbalances. We also believe that it is unconstitutional. The EFF will take the whole Bill to judicial review if it is passed in this current form. The EFF has from its inception and its founding manifesto has for total transparency and disclosure of political funding and the ANC Caucus refused.

The Political Funding Bill is years too late but we welcome that it will finally come into law despite objections we have. For too long monopoly capital, in both South Africa and abroad, has been able to determine policy direction and position of political parties in this country without the knowledge of the people of the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 21

parties they claim to represent. The Bill will help to bring an end to this or at least make South African people aware of who is funding the party they are voting for. However, the first Political Funding Bill since it was introduced in 1997 was highly unconstitutional as it did nothing to strengthen democracy and only reinforce the *status quo* of 90-10 funding redistribution role.

The Constitution of South Africa highlights that; political funding must be available to enhance multiparty democracy and not to reproduce political power for the ruling party. The reason why the new one has been rushed is because the ANC was going to be taken to court for its unconstitutionality. The funding mechanism for political parties that this new Bill comes up with is inadequate and in many respects unconstitutional mirroring what they already had in place. This was a system that gave disproportionate amount of funding to the ANC with no constitutional or legal basis. It was this very same system which saw the ANC receiving over R988 million of taxpayers' money since 1998 yet no major changes are seen in this Bill.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 22

Many members of this House compromised themselves in the writing of this Bill forgetting that they are not only politicians who must compromise but law makers who must uphold the Constitution and protect the interests of the people. This, they failed to do. In determining how the funding should be shared in the future, the redistribution formula of this Bill will have to be amended if it is going to have a long term meaningful impact.

In fact political parties should learn from the EFF. Because the EFF is unable to attract investors, it relied on its soldiers on the ground and its members to make sure that it is able to sustain itself so that it does not owe any capital, business and therefore its policy direction is not determined by anyone sitting anywhere busy playing with his balls. Amandla.

Mr N SINGH: As the chairperson of our committee, a very able chairperson hon Vincent Smith and other members have said that today we are debating the report and not the Bill. However, one cannot resist the temptation, may be to make references to certain aspects of the Bill that

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 23

are contained in the report. It is often said that money is the milk of politics and this is the unfortunate but veritable reality of the matter. The logical question that must follow must be how do we best ensure that money is not the sole determinant and variable affecting the outcome of democratic elections? That is the need to examine sources of funding. Are they legitimate? Are they aligned to democratic processes and the rule of law?

NGOs and in particular My Vote Counts have gone to court to request all political parties to disclose their sources of funding. I want to thank them for being present at all our meetings and having a very keen interest in what transpired in those meetings. Their objectives for us to disclose our sources of funding have now been met.

In trying to level that political playing field and compensate for private funding surpluses that one or two parties may currently enjoy, this Bill seeks to create a further distribution of funds allocated in terms of the represented political party funding administered by the Independent Electoral Commission, IEC. Hon members, hon

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 24

Rawula spoke about the 90-10 split which is the current Bill and 90-10 refers to proportional and equitable. Well, 10% can never be equitable but 50 % is equitable. However, in discussions that we had during the committee some of us were able to live with the 70-30 split. It is much better than 90-10 split.

What is very exciting about this bill and its provisions is the establishment of the multiparty democracy fund because now the corporate sector would be able to contribute to this fund that will be distributed amongst all political parties on an agreed to formula. This is a significant move from what we have previously although there were provisions in the original Bill for anybody to contribute but there is going to be acceleration and marketing of the new provisions of the Bill to allow corporate sector to contribute.

We know that sometimes the corporate sector only wants to contribute to the ruling party because they get contracts and other favours and if they give to us, smaller parties, they fear that if the name is disclosed then they will be in trouble with the ruling party. We will

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 25

prevent that kind of fear this year that corporate may have and they could be fairer in the distribution.

I want to thank the hon chairperson, hon Vincent Smith and all the members of the committee for the way we conducted the affairs of the committee. In particular, I would like to thank the legal advisor Mr Michael Prince assisted by Prof Halton Cheadle in allowing us to arrive at this particular point. We support the report.

Prof N M KHUBISA: Hon Chairperson and hon members we understand that the aim of the Ad Hoc Committee on the Funding of Political Parties was essentially to authenticate accountability, transparency and openness which is congruent with the ethos of an open and democratic society as espoused by the our Constitution.

We understand that the discourse around the funding of political parties has been with us for quite some time from 1994 up to the fact that it was taken to the High Court by certain organisations and they won. Let it be known that when it was taken to the High Court, already

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 26

the Ad Hoc Committee has started with the debate on how political funding has got to be done.

It is also noted that Chairperson the report as such is trying to come closer to assisting the smaller parties who were hitherto not getting the funding that the bigger parties were getting. We also note that the report as such and the Bill that will be debated later on speak to the issue of the multipart democracy fund which I think is a new phenomenon in this regard that will be managed by the IEC and the fund that was already used by the political parties.

The report also speaks to the issue of the donations that come and how they will be regulated. The report as such also speaks to the issue of proportional allocation as well as the equitable distribution. We believe that these caviars come with a new phenomenon to the issue of funding the political parties but of course we understand that it could be an ongoing debate but at least there were parties that were benefiting whilst the smaller parties were not benefiting and when you bring in the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 27

issue of equitability we hope then that the smaller parties will a get a share.

The report indicates that the committee consulted comprehensively and public hearings afforded a wide variety of individuals and organisation ample opportunity to make submissions and contribute to shaping the structure and the content of the Bill. The proceedings affirm that public participation during the formulation of legislation is the cornerstone value which this Parliament is increasingly embracing which the NFP supports.

What is evident from the proceedings is that there was general consensus among participants that public funding to political parties should be increased so as to promote and strengthen democracy and that this increase should be aligned to affordability for the purse of the state. There was also agreement that private funding should be permitted to prevent overreliance on public funding. I have alluded to the fact that how it should be regulated. The NFP supports the report.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 28

Mr N L S KWANKWA: The UDM supports the report of the Ad Hoc Committee on Funding of Political Parties. The bottom line is that let us not beat around the bush. The bottom line is that the ANC did not decide to amend this legislation for altruistic reasons. They did so because, let us be honest, President Zuma has messed up the ANC. No one wants to fund the ANC from the private sector. [Interjections.] That also includes their Broad-Based Black Economic Empowerment, BBBEE people except obviously for the Deputy President here. There is no one who wants to fund you. That is the reason why we are here today.

The UDM has been tilting at this windmill as far as 10 years ago in fact. I remember at one point, Deputy President, at Idasa, there was a panel discussion between your secretary general and my president. It was facilitated by Judith February and your secretary general was opposed to amending political party funding. All of a sudden, now because you have been captured by the Guptas, a certain section of the ANC has been captured by the Guptas, you have learnt your lesson and now you decide to talk to talk about protecting our democracy. Indeed you are doing a right thing by saying you are protecting

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 29

democracy because if we do not fund our democracy, someone else will. It is a fact.

IsiXhosa:

Kufuneka niyive inyaniso nokuba ningayiphikisa nithini na, nithethe ngesela. Silapha nje namhlanje...

English:

... is because you have allowed yourselves to be captured by thieves. Remember we have been cautioning you for many years on this particular matter Deputy President. Even in that debate my President made that point. He argued that the private sector interest groups will capture you if you do not protect our democracy. I think this is an important step in the right direction.

IsiXhosa:

Nangoku nithetha ngamashishini karhulumente ancedisa imibutho yopolitiko kodwa ebengancedisi UDM koko bezinika nina mali kakade. Amashishini abucala ebencedisa eminye imibutho eyinika imali kodwa ibinganiki i-UDM. Eyona nto apha yeyokuba niyazilungisa ngokwenu kuba niyabona ukuba ngowama-2019...

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 30

English:

... you will lose power if you do not address this issue because if a wrong faction of the ANC happens to lose or win elections in December it means that your private sources from the Guptas will dry up for instance. We thank you very much. [Applause.]

Dr C P MULDER: Hon Chairperson, we all belong to political parties and as members that belong to political parties we contest and debate with one another but there comes a time when we have to rise above party political arguments and dealing with this matter is one of those instances. If members in the House listen to what is being said in this debate you will get the impression that it was a very acrimonious conflict-ridden process when this process was done in the last six months is simply not true and I find in a little bit sad that when some of us come to the House today, we find it necessary to grandstand for the cameras and ... [Inaudible.] it is absolutely unnecessary. This Bill and this report deals with something very essential namely, to enhance multiparty democracy and to protect our democratic system of government that is what it is about. [Applause.] So,

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 31

we can make quick political points, I understand that but I think it is unfair to the process that we went through, the colleagues who were in that committee for the last six months worked in a very constructive and a very positive manner and I can tell you when we come to the debating of this Bill, the House should be proud of this Bill because it will protect democracy, it will bring transparency to our system and I think it is absolutely essential. [Applause.] On a personal level I want to say to the ANC, when you are going to elect your new leadership - whoever that may be in December - I want to recommend that, to whoever gets elected, remember the name of the chairperson of this committee, Vincent Smith, for the simple reason, Vincent Smith, if you want to get the job done, ask what you will call comrade, ask Mr Vincent Smith for the simple reason, he steered this committee in a very professional and very correct way and I want you to remember that. [Applause.]

The FF Plus will support this report and we will support the Bill when the time comes. If we are serious in terms of enhancing multiparty democracy, if we are serious in protecting our democratic processes, if we are serious in

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 32

terms of transparency, then any person with common sense will support the report and will support the Bill. A wonderful new innovation is the creation of a Multiparty Democracy Fund which means that corporates and individual citizens can now contribute for the enhancement of democracy without having to support any specific political party. I appeal to members and to all parties; let us rise above party political interests and support ... [Interjections.]

Ms M S KHAWULA: Point of order!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon Mulder, please take your seat. On what point are you rising on hon member?

Ms M S KHAWULA: Rule 42. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Continue hon member.

IsiZulu:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 33

Nk M S KHAWULA: Ngiyabonga. Sihlalo, nginephuzu lokukhalima okuphambukayo. Bengithi mina ake ngibonge kumhlonishwa, ngiyaqala ukubona eshayelwa ihlombe kusho ukuthi naye uyavuma ayi ...

English:

... something happened.

IsiZulu:

Nk M S KHAWULA: Ngiyabonga.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon member! Hon member that is not a point of order and Rule 42, if you want to be schooled, it is about the working days and hours of sittings. [Laughter.]

Dr C P MULDER: Hon Chairperson that is exactly why that if the EFF takes this Bill to court, you will get less than 42% and you will fail. The fact of the matter is this needs to be supported, this needs to be implemented, it is in the interest of democracy, it is up to all of us to sometimes rise above party political interests and this is the day. Thank you. [Applause.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 34

Ms D CARTER: Chairperson, the issue of political party funding and its impact on political accountability and democracy is a vexatious issue worldwide. There is no universally accepted model for political party funding that ensures accountability, transparency whilst maintaining ability of political parties to carry out their functions. Now while there are some issues around the public funding of political parties ...

[Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Order! Hon members! The noise!

Ms D CARTER: ... the main area of concern has been private funding. With limited public resources available, all parties endeavoured to raise some money from private donors. However, there are obvious concerns about the influence that private donors to political parties can have on eventual government policies and decisions including decisions relating to procurement. Now this is more acute in the South African context given our exposure to corruption on a grand scale, state capture and what transpired within the ANC with the likes of its

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 35

Chancellor House and its insider trading with government. Now, the way in which these issues are managed will have an impact on the trust South Africans will have in political parties and their faith in the political process and hopefully reduce corruption. Now, it is with both of these in mind that Cope supported the establishment of the ad hoc committee which was mandated to inquire into and to make recommendations relating to the funding of political parties represented in national and provincial legislatures.

The Cope supports the observations and recommendations of the ad hoc committee on the funding of political parties specifically the intended repeal of existing Public Funding of Represented Political Parties Act and its replacement with the Political Party Funding Bill. We also welcome moves towards a more equitable distribution of funds from the Represented Political Parties' Fund; this will benefit and provide some relief financially to all other parties. Cope also welcomes the establishment of the Multiparty Democracy Fund which will allow for private sector donations to be distributed amongst parties. We are also pleased that when donating funds to

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 36

a particular party will no longer be permitted above a certain threshold and hopes that this will resolve in those wishing to donate large sums having to do so through the Multiparty Democracy Fund. We welcome the Independent Electoral Commission, IEC, being charged with being the curator and managing both funds. Cope believes that this reform of party political funding will benefit our democracy, result in better transparency and accountability, reduce corruption and create conditions for good, clean and progressive governance as a whole. Thank you.

Mr N T GODI: House Chair, comrades and hon members, the APC - the revolutionary party - stands to support this report before the House. We acknowledge the leadership from the chair comrade Vincent Smith, Cindy-Joy Balie and her colleagues in the support team. We also appreciate the collegiality amongst members of the committee. The APC wishes to salute the Azanian People's Organisation, Azapo and Black First Land First, BLF, for coming through and make submissions on the Bill as most often it is the capitalist roaders who influence legislative processes to the detriment of the people.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 37

The APC appreciates that Parliament has sought through the ad hoc committee to make the funding of represented political parties responsive to Section 236 of the Constitution to support multiparty democracy. We particularly welcome the regulation on private funding especially securing all sovereignty by not allowing foreign governments and agencies to interfere or influence our political processes through funding and the correction in the regulations of how equity and proportionality are applied in a manner now consistent with the letter and spirit of Section 236. The APC - the party of revolution - looks forward to the debate and adoption of the Bill as soon as possible. I thank you

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon members! Hon members! I am pleading with you. Hon members, please lower your voices. You can confer very softly please.

Rev K R J MESHOE: Hon House Chair, the ACDP welcomes the approval of the Political Party Funding Bill of 2017 by the ad hoc committee on the funding of political parties which was established by a resolution of the National Assembly on 6 June 2017 in terms of the rules. We would

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 38

like to thank the multiparty committee for the work done in this regard. It is our understanding on the basis of feedback from other party representatives that most parties are committed to finding each other in order to make resolutions that will be acceptable to all.

The ACDP knows that having reviewed the Party Public Funding of Representative Political Parties Act of 1997, and its regulations, the committee has recommended that the existing legislation be repealed and a new framework be put in place to address the weaknesses identified.

The ACDP supports the report in which the committee recommends that the represented political party funds and the proposed multiparty democracy fund be managed by the Independent Electoral Commission and that the two funds should be managed by a separate business unit with its own chief executive. The ACDP has often calls for transparency in matters of funding and for a singular model of public and private funding for political parties regulating of private funding in all its forms including investment entities own by political parties. It is recognised by most to be a necessity.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 39

The ACDP congratulates all political parties involved in this progressive move which shows a commitment finally to transparency and accountability in party finances. Thank you.

Mr D M GUMEDE: Hon Chairperson, the report on this Bill seeks to promote sovereignty of our motherland and to advance national interest as the chairperson has illustrated and as other members that participated has said before.

IsiZulu:

Lo mthetho ubhekela ukuthi izwe lobabamkhulu lilawulwe ngendlela ezofesa izinhloso zamadoda namadodakazi alo. Hhayi izinhloso zamanye amazwe. Uvimba ukuthi imali ephuma emazweni anamandla ingasetshenziswa ukulawula izwe lethu ngokuthenga abaholi bamaqembu ethu ngoba bengenayo imali yokubheka izidingo zabantu abazisebenzelayo noma abasebenzela lamaqembu ngoba zona zithandwa abantu abahlwempu. Izokwenza ukuthi sazi ukuthi imali nezinsiza amaqembu ayitholayo iphumaphi, ayinikezwa ngobani ukuze siqiniseke ukuthi awagqibi izidingo nezinhloso zabantu

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 40

baseNingizimu Afrika ebe efeza izidingo zabezizwe nezidingo zabadla izambane likapondo.

Lo mthetho esibika ngawo sixoxisane ngawo namaqembu onke ngokukhulu ukuhloniphana nangokukhulu ukubambisana ukwazi ukuthi izwe lethu lihamba phambili ngaphezu kwezinjongo zethu ngabanye ngabanye. Sifike ke sinezidingo zethu njengo-ANC sinezwi lokaKhongolose, salalela ke ukuthi athini amanye amaqembu nanokuthi abafaka uvo lwabo emhlanganweni bathini ama-submissions aphuma ezinhlanganweni ezihlukene. Nebala ke sizibekile nathi ezethu salalela nezabanye siyithakasela nemibono yabo.

Siyathokoza ke ukusho ukuthi nezethu izinkokheli kuKhongolose ziye zazimisela ukuthatha eminye imibono eyakhayo eqhamuke ezinhlanganweni eziningi nakwamanye amaqembu azimisele ngokwakha leli lizwe. Siyabonga kulabo ebekade bewamele lawo maqembu ngomoya wabo nangendlela abakade bekhulumisana ngayo, nathi nanamanye amaqembu nangemibono futhi nangendlela abenze ngayo, bezwa imibono eminye, abavumelanayo neminye beyiphikisa neminye.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 41

Akuyiwa ke nganxanye njengamanzi. Kube khona abangalaleli, abangakungeni ukubambisana nathi kanye namanye amaqembu ukuze sakhe isizwe esiqinile, esibumbene nesinekusasa eliqhakazile ukuze abantwana besizwe sethu babe nendlela ekhanyayo. Kulabo sithi: hamba juba bayokucutha phambili. [Ubuwelewele.] Thina sizosukuma sakhe izwe lethu. Izwe lamaqhawe namaqhawekazi e-Afrika.

Xitsonga:

Hosi katekisa Afrika. Xitimela xa Afrika xa famba.

IsiZulu:

Uvuma noma ungavumi. [Ihlonbe.] Kulawo maqembu amanye abeke imibono ayibekayo angizukuwalandela. Ngizobonga nje ekuthini emhlanganweni siye sabambisana. Awazange enze lokhu akwenza njengoba sesikhona la. Okusho ukuthi asethunywe ngabanye. Thina ezinkokhelini zethu zithe noma zizwa ukuthi kukhona imibono engahambelani nazo, zasilalela, zayilalela leyo mibono zaphendula ngendlela yenhlonipho, ngendlela eyakhayo nangendlela ezoqinisa leli lizwe. Siyabonga ezinkokhelini zika-ANC nasezinkokhelini lezo ebesikade sinazo. U-African National Congress uyawuxhasa lo mbiko ngoba uwubona

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 42

ngokuthi uyindlela eya phambili ezikwakha intando yeningi yeNingizimu Afrika iqhakaze, inothe ibenokubambisana. Ngiyabonga.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY:

Motion agreed to.

Report accordingly adopted.

**REQUEST FOR APPROVAL OF CANDIDATES FOR APPOINTMENT TO
COUNCIL OF INDEPENDENT COMMUNICATIONS AUTHORITY OF SOUTH
AFRICA**

Mr R M TSELI: House Chairperson, the Portfolio Committee on Communication having considered the request from the Minister of Communications to approve the appointment of three persons to fill three vacancies in the Independent Communications Authority, Icasa, council reports as follows: a letter dated 23 November 2017 was received from the Minister of Communications requesting approval by the National Assembly for appoint of Ms Nomonde

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 43

Gongxeka-Seope and Ms Thembeke Simane to the ICASA council.

In terms of section 5(1) (b) of the Icasa Act, Act 13 of 2000 as amended to serve as councillors for a period of four years. The Minister further requested that the National Assembly approves the appointment of Mr Rubben Mohlaloga as councillor and chairperson of council for a period of five years.

On 28 November 2017, the committee considered the request from the Minister of Communications and recommends that the National Assembly approve the appointment of Ms Nomonde Gongxeka-Seope, and Ms Thembeke Simane as councillors for a period of four years and Mr Rubben Mohlaloga as councillor and chairperson of council for a period of five years.

This is a product of a very transparent process and thorough engagements amongst the parties represented in the portfolio committee and we are convinced as the committee that the candidates have vast experience, expertise and skills necessary to can take the regulator

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 44

to a higher level and as the committee we would like to wish all the recommended candidates everything of the best. I therefore table the report for consideration. Thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): The Whips please assist me with the noises. Can I now request the whips to assist me? You can hear they don't even hear what I am saying.

Declarations of vote:

Ms P T VAN DAMME: Chairperson, the DA will not be supporting this report, for one main reason. The Minister has recommended for appointments as Chairperson of the Icasa council Mr Rubben Mohlaloga.

It is our belief that cadre deployment is one of the main causes of the problems facing state-owned enterprises and with Mr Mohlaloga having previously served as the Member of Parliament, MP, for the ANC and the Deputy President of the ANC Youth League. He is just that.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 45

We do hope Mr Mohlaloga will prove us wrong and will demonstrate leadership that will be independently minded and focus on taking Icasa to greater heights. The biggest task facing Mr Mohlaloga would be an inquiry that the DA has requested into payments made by MultiChoice to ANN7 and the SABC.

Yesterday, the DA revealed the SABC board's minutes which suggested that MultiChoice sought to pay the SABC R100 million for its twenty four news channel in exchange for the public broadcaster's political influence over digital migration. This notion has this morning but confirmed by the former Minister of Communications, Yunus Carrim who is quoted in the media saying that and I quote:

"Multi choice was seeking to change government policy to serve its own interest and that he felt it is wrong for a private company to seek to buy government policy in this way so it could retain its 98% percent dominance in the pay TV sector".

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 46

This is very serious indeed and Icasa must exercise the very broad powers given by Icasa Act to investigate. It is Icasa's duty to take this matter up in the public interest and in particular on behalf of those hard working South Africans who use their hard earned money to pay subscription fees for DStv.

It can't be that their hard earned money is used by MultiChoice to grease Gupta accounts. In addition, it is a very important for us as Parliament to do the same. The Communications Committee must discharge of its duties to conduct an enquiry into allegations of state capture relating to the former Minister of Communications, Ms Faith Muthambi as was requested by the Deputy Speaker of this House.

We believe that an inquiry, the following people must be summoned: the former Communications Minister, Ms Faith Muthambi, Yunus Carrim and Dinah Pule. The former CEO of MultiChoice, Imtiaz Patel, Multichoice Executive Chairman Mr Nolo Letele, Naspers Ceo Mr Bob van Dijk, former SABC Chairperson Ellen Tshabalala and the former CEO of the SABC Lulama Mokhobo.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 47

We look forward to feedback from Icasa about this and also from the current Minister OF Communications who has thus far remain silent on the payment that Multichoice made to SABC and indeed we don't know what her views are about the encryption of set up boxes. What will it be, encrypted or unencrypted? We need to know.

Mr M N PAULSEN: Chairperson, the EFF is cautious of uncritical acceptance when appointing councillors to Icasa. The EFF has fundamental concerns about Ms Nomonde Gongxeka-Seope and we are very uncomfortable with her performance during the interview but also a silence and inability during difficult times at the SABC to speak out against corruption, SABC capture and violation of journalistic rights and the broadcasting policy.

When others at the SABC spoke out, putting their lives and careers on the line and stood for what was constitutional and morally correct and they pay the price but Ms Nomonde Gongxeka-Seope remained silent and as such we don't even know if she did anything to fight the capture of the SABC.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 48

In the era of capture, poor governance and the looting of state resources, Icasa is an important institution to ensure journalistic rights, the independence of the public broadcaster and the need to have an independent SABC. Icasa councillors must have the ability to speak when it is not fashionable and difficult and if needs be to also speak out externally. On that basis we solemnly oppose the nomination of Ms Nomonde Gongxeka-Seope and we call upon this House to adopt the committee recommendations with the exception of Ms Nomonde Gongxeka-Seope. Thank you very much.

Ms L L VAN DER MERWE: Hon House Chairperson, let me start by thanking the people of Umlazi who overwhelmingly voted for the IFP in yesterday's by-election. We thank them for voting us. Thank you for trusting us. We thank them for affording the opportunity to lead ward 10 which belonged to the ANC before and we thank our leader, Mr Mangosuthu Buthelezi for leading us to victory in that ward.

It is my hope that Icasa as our communication's regulator will keep a clean eye on the SABC to ensure that the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 49

story of the IFP and other opposition parties rising will be adequately told on our TV screens.

Unfortunately, over many years of ANC misrule, we have to learn that the ANC has a very strong appetite for abuse of power and reshuffling and recycling cadres between SOEs, the boards and management. Some examples are these: Dudu Myeni, Hlaudi Motsoeneng, Dr Ben Ngubane, Prof Maguvhe, Ellen Tshabalala, Brian Molefe and Pearl Bengu at Sassa.

It is this ANC cadre deployment that has brought the SABC to its knees. It is this ANC cadre deployment that has brought Eskom, Transet, Sassa and SAA to its knees and it is this cadre deployment that has brought our country to its knees. Again today we are expected to approve names for an Icasa council. Again these names are ANC cadres. Again they are not suitable for the job. Again suitable candidates were over looked. Mr Rubben Mohlaloga is the ANC cadre activist and he is also a fraud accused.

So, the IFP says no to more cadre deployment. We say no to reshuffling and recycling fraud, crooks and

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 50

undesirables to our chapter 9 institutions and our SOEs. We say no, enough is enough and we reject this candidates and this report. I thank you.

Mr W M MADISHA: Chairperson and members, having participated in the interviews for all these members to find appropriate persons to lead Icasa, one rises with confidence to say yes indeed all those persons that have been selected are appropriate. We therefore wish to recommend to the House that they be taken appointed to the Icasa board.

I want to emphasise that, yes, what we have been able to see there, there is a great deal of experience and kindly let us all agree but I want to emphasise one other point which one couldn't finish the other day on the stage and that is the SABC. I say SABC because if you talk of Icasa, you talk about Media Development and Diversity Agency, MDDA, and SABC. You are talking about the same thing and I want to emphasise as I go down that you have in SABC at this stage workers who have risen to say that they get R5000 a month and you have the executives who get millions and millions per annum as salaries and those

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 51

persons include for example Hlaudi who are part from the millions that he got per annum. He was even given R11 million and he was going to get another R30 million as a bonus.

Now, this are the kind of problems and I hope that Icasa when its board comes in will look inter alia into some of this particular things and ensure that we are able to move forward but I think we should take this names and say that Mr Rubben Mohlaloga indeed must be the chairperson. Thank you.

Prof N M KHUBISA: Chairperson, as we said earlier when we were making a declaration, the NFP supports the candidates that are nominated to sit on the board of Icasa but of course like we did before we are also excited that the new board that has come in within the SABC has taken the job with the necessary vigour to ensure that the SABC becomes an entity of state that is doing its job correctly. That it is indeed a public broadcaster that is transparent and works to fulfil its mandate that is legislated to be an open transparent

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 52

organisation that speaks as the voice for the people of South Africa.

Of course, we spoke about many things like the MultiChoice deal and it is also excellerating to find that the SABC board is trying its best to ensure that the deal is dealt with together with other deals that were found to be doggy because SABC like all other state-owned enterprises needs to clean and needs to be the voice of the people that we want it to be.

We have also said as the NFP that it is sacrosanct that the critical positions, especially the management positions are filled, so that the broadcaster is able to work accordingly. Therefore, as the NFP we support the report as such. Thank you very much.

Mr N L S KWANKWA: House Chairperson, we debated this matter at great length the last time it was introduced and we made a declaration.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon Kwankwa, can you please wait? I am sorry kids. I didn't welcome you to

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 53

Parliament. I was still waiting for your school's name. However, we want to appreciate you having come here. Thank you very much and good bye. [Applause.]. Thank you, continue hon Kwankwa.

IsiXhosa:

Mnu N L S KWANKWA: Sihlalo asiyithandi into yokuba sibe siziphindaphinda thina ngathi sisi ...

English:

... stuck record as a results we are saying we would like to take this opportunity to wish all the best to all the candidates recommended for the appointment at Icasa. Best wishes to them and help us to fix these institutions. Thank you so mush.

Mr M U KALAKO: Chairperson, the ANC supports the appointment of the candidates. I think now it is becoming a broken record thing from the DA around the cadre deployment but I think let us as the ANC say that we are very proud that most of South Africans support ANC and they happen to apply for positions and we are very happy

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 54

that they must not hide their membership of the ANC because of the DA.

In fact, the DA comes here and complained about Rubben. They were the first actually to praise Rubben when he was the Acting Chairperson of Icasa dealing with the problem of the SABC. They praised him here in these rooms during committee meetings. Now, they come here and grandstand and talk about him as if they don't know him. No. he is going to disappoint you as you were saying. Hon Phumzile my friend, he is going to disappoint you. Don't be worry.

On state capture, again, the ANC-led committee leads them to say when we come back next year; we are going to look into terms of reference in response to the letter from the Speaker on the state capture. Now, they make it as if it is something which is being hidden somewhere and we don't want to do it. I can't believe how they think.

On Nomonde, chief, I am sure Dr Mbuyiseni Ndlozi will be so angry. That is misrepresentation. Dr Mbuyiseni Ndlozi was praising Nomonde.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 55

Mr T RAWULA: Order, Chairperson.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon Kalako, please take your seat. What is your point of order, hon member?

Mr T RAWULA: The EFF is not hon Ndlozi.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Okay, hon member.

Mr T RAWULA: The EFF is EFF.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon member, thank. That is not the point of order.

Mr T RAWULA: So, don't divide us by a portion today to individual.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon member, thank. That is not the point of order. I am going to switch-off your microphone.

Mr T RAWULA: The EFF today belongs to the EFF.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 56

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Thank you, continue, hon Kalako.

Mr M U KALAKO: ... because Nomonde is one of the best who performed to the satisfaction of everybody, a young woman.

Well I know, sometimes some of old people when young people come in these committees, and they take them on, and they happen to be more knowledgeable than them. They turn to have an inferiority complex. I think this is what is happening here. Eh, eh, eh, but rest assured. She is a very independent thinking young woman. We are very confident of her.

Well I won't talk about the IFP because they hardly come to the committee. They could have asked me to brief them. They could have called me to their caucus to brief them about what we were discussing. No IFP, we know you are coming from us we can do that.

Point of Order:

Mr M HLENGWA: On a point of order Madam Chair!

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 57

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): On what point of order are you rising hon member?

Mr M HLENGWA: On Rule 92.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Rule 92 allows you ... [Interjections.] Hon member, I'm still talking.

Mr M HLENGWA: Hon Chair, the hon member knows that in this House we are allowed to raise any matter on anything, whether we are there or not. So it is mischievous of him to do what he is doing. He will comment on all matters so let us be genuine.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon member, you know that's not a point of order. Continue hon member.

Mr M U KALAKO: Thank you Chair. I want to thank parties which are consistent in the committee, who actually you have seen them here showing their support; even those who rejected at least you could see there are attending.

Those who do not attend committee meetings they will tend to have this problem.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 58

Chair, let me comment on the Minister's sharp and quick response on the MultiChoice thinks, and that is a very correct response when you said Minister that the issue you are so taken aback and embarrass by it; but as a government those are contractual matters between private companies. Private companies can deal with that. You have done your part with checking with the SABC.

So don't worry about hon Phumzile Van Damme with her crew. Do your work. We comment you as a committee in that work. Thank you, Chair. [Applause.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon members, the question before the House is that the following list of candidates be approved for appointment as councillors to the Independent Communications Authority of South Africa, Icasa: Ms Nomonde Gongxeka-Seope, Ms Thembeke Semane as councillors for a period of four years; and Mr Rubben Mohlaloga as councillor and chairperson of the council for a period of five years.

Declarations of vote made on behalf of the DA, EFF, IFP, Cope, NFP, UDM and ANC.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 59

Division demanded.

The House divided.

Voting:

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Order hon members!

Please take your seats.

I would like to remind members that they may only vote from their allocated seats. When requested to do so, members must simply indicate their vote by pressing the appropriate button.

If a member inadvertently presses the wrong button, the member may, thereafter, press the correct button. The last button pressed will be recorded as the member's vote when the voting session is closed by the Chair.

The question before the House is the approval of the recommendation for the appointment of Ms Nomonde Gongxeka-Seope, Ms Thembeke Semane and Mr Rubben Mohlaloga as councillors to fill the vacancies on the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 60

Council of the Independent Communications Authority of South Africa, Icasa.

Are all members in their allocated seats? Voting will now commence. Those in favour should press the "yes" button; those against should press the "no" button and those wishing to abstain should press the "abstain" button. Have all members voted? The voting session is now closed.

[TAKEN FROM THE MINUTES.]

Question agreed to.

Ms Nomonde Gongxeka-Seope, Ms Thembeke Semane and Mr Rubben Mohlaloga accordingly recommended for appointment to the Council of Independent Communications Authority of South Africa.

I thank you.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: House Chairperson, I would like to address you in terms of rule 208, if I may?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 61

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Continue hon Steenhuisen.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: House Chairperson, business of the NA is decided by the NA Programming Committee and they determine what Bills are put on to the Order Paper and there is a process for determining that.

The only power that the Chief Whip has, to put something on to the Order Paper that was not agreed to by the Programming Committee, falls under section Rule 44(1), which states that if there is no consensus in the first instance and in fact all of the Programming Committee has not made a detailed determination for any sitting day; but first of all, they cannot say the consensus matter falls away because we haven't had a meeting of the Programming Committee since Thursday last week.

Secondly, I would submit to you House Chairperson that the Programming Committee last week agreed on a detailed determination for the sitting, this Bill was not part of that.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 62

We were approached yesterday to say whether we would support this, we don't support it there is no consensus then in the matter; and secondly, to make matters worse the Programming Whip did not make contact with us yesterday evening to let us know that this was even going to be on the Order Paper.

We have got to work this morning to find the Order Paper. Now this is a completely unsatisfactory state of affairs, and should not be how this business of the House is programmed.

It is completely unfair to blindside parties in the House and members in the House in this manner; and I would submit that you make a ruling on it please.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Before I make a ruling can I allow the Chief Whip to speak.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: Chair, you know in the absence of a Programming Committee sitting - and that is in the guidelines and guide to procedure in this Parliament; but also in our rules.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 63

The Rule 44, including Rule 210, says, we can consult with parties; and after having consulted if there is consensus - of course, including the leader of government business. That's what the rule says, and the Speaker. After having consulted a matter through consensus - and the catch word is consensus, it can then be put on the programme of Parliament.

Now we have. We have consulted with all parties, yesterday and a day before yesterday. All parties have agreed on this matter. The only party that did not agree is the DA. All other parties have agreed.

Now House Chair, how many parties are in this House? This House has 13 parties, if 12 parties are in agreement, is that not sufficient consensus? Thank you House Chair.

[Applause.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon Steenhuisen, I believe that you raised a point of order ...

[Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 64

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Then, House Chairperson, I would like to make a further one in terms of Rule 44(1) [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Is it still on the issue here?

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: The rule is clear, the consensus comes in, and it says if no consensus could be reached in the Programming Committee, no Programme Committee was held.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon Steenhuisen, firstly hon members, it was agreed that there won't be any Programming Committee for this week.

Secondly, Rule 210 as stated by the Chief Whip of the Majority applies; we talk of 210(3) which says, if a decision is made the parties will be communicated with; and according to what we have just heard all parties were communicated with.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 65

So hon members, I'm going to say that we continue with the item on the Order Paper. Can I ask the secretary to read the Third Order?

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: House Chairperson! Ja let's wait for her to take the seat. That's a good idea.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): No, no, hon Steenhuisen, I think I have ruled and I'm not going to accommodate ... [Interjections.]

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: I'm not challenging your ruling, I'm trying to make a second point of order.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): No, on a different ... [Interjections.]

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: On a separate matter, yes.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): But now we are dealing with item on the Order Paper.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 66

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: No, I would like to make a point of order if I may.

House Chairperson, earlier last week the Deputy Speaker of the NA authorised a debate of urgent public importance in terms of the rules into the fees report, feeling that it was an important debate for this House to have given the fact that we are about to face a crisis with the student again in January; and it was very strange that this House would not consider that.

I would like to ask you why this Bill has been prioritised over a debate of national importance that was agreed to by the Deputy Speaker.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon member! Hon Steenhuisen, thank you. Thank you very much.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: I would like to get an understanding from you why this debate has been prioritised over a debate that we have on fees that are going to affect students in January.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 67

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Thank you hon member. Hon member, I think you are asking the wrong person, the wrong question. We have agreed. We are working on the Order Paper hon members. You can ask that question somewhere you will get the answer. Thank you very much. Can we continue, secretary please read the Third Order? [Applause.]

**CONSIDERATION OF REFUGEES AMENDMENT BILL AND OF REPORT OF
PORTFOLIO COMMITTEE ON HOME AFFAIRS ON AMENDMENTS
PROPOSED BY NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

Mr B L MASHILE: House Chair, hon members, it should be noted that the Department of Home Affairs has developed an International Migration Policy White Paper. This new policy will lead to major overall of the Refugee Act as well as the Immigration Act. The current Refugees Amendment Bill is a stopgap attempt to effect resolution of administrative challenges and processes within the Department of Home Affairs.

The National Assembly passed the Refugees Amendment Bill [B12-2016] on 15 March 2017. The Bill was sent to the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 68

National Council of Provinces for concurrence. The NCOP considered the Bill on 08 November 2017 and passed it with amendments. Majority of the amendments are clearing out in relation to referrals and clarification of meanings of particular phrases without change of the substance or meaning. The only substantial amendment is on clause 15. The amendment seeks to ensure that every asylum seeker, who enters our country, reports to our Refugee Reception Centre and an appropriate official assist the asylum seeker.

The committee considered these amendments and it is convinced that their constructive and helpful. We therefore resolved to recommend to this House to pass the Bill with these amendments. Members of the committee agreed that there is no need for a debate because there is no substance in the Bill that will require any further debate over and above the debate that we had initially in this House.

The Portfolio Committee on Home Affairs therefore presents this report for adoption in this House. I thank you.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 69

The Chief Whip of the Majority Party moved: That the Bill, as amended, be passed.

Declarations of vote made on behalf of the Democratic Alliance, Economic Freedom Fighters, Inkatha Freedom Party and African National Congress.

Declaration(s) of vote:

Mr M H HOUSEN: Hon Speaker, can I firstly just say that the reason why we are in this mess in the first place. [Interjections.] When you have government in power that cannot even organise and plan its own business, what hope do you inspire in the people of South Africa? [Applause.] It is for that reason that this ANC-led government is such a disgrace to this country. [Applause.]

Hon Speaker, when this Bill was before the House last time, the DA through my colleague, hon Natasha Mazzone have communicated what our views are on this Bill. This Bill is the cornerstone of South Africa's framework on the entry requirements and treatment of refugees in our country. It cannot be argued that our borders must be maintained responsibly and diligently and we must always

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 70

be aware of our domestic responsibilities to the challenges faced by our citizens. We must though never forget that we have the finest Constitution in the world, we have one of the most progressive Constitutions in the world and as such we must never lose sight of what our Constitution means, not only for South Africans but for those also within our borders.

Whilst there are many proposals in the Bill, they are welcomed and necessary. It is the view of the DA that the Bill fails in four key areas:

The first shortcoming is the Bill's definition of what a dependant is. It has limited definition and seriously prejudicial to asylum seekers who are most in need of protection. We must always remember that no one wants leave their home, no one wants to travel in unsafe environments to an uncertain future to reach the state of requiring refugee status. We must understand and have great empathy of the desperation experienced by these asylum seekers.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 71

The Bill does cater for minor biologically related children however. The Bill does not consider the case of formally or informally adopted children, nor does it consider the entire class of dependence, be it on minor children, spouses and parents. It is in fact silent on the other relations that maybe disabled, indigent or suffer from some other form of disability. The very purpose of the Bill is betrayed by limiting definitions.

The second shortcoming is the Bill's definition of marriage. There is unconstitutional double standard playing out with this definition while domestically both marriages and civil partnership are acknowledged, this is not the case for civil partnership considered in foreign countries.

We are a progressive and proud nation with strong and entrenched constitutional values. These values cannot count only for South African citizens. The clause flies in the face of our Constitution and it cannot be permitted to remain in our law when we have it within our means to change it.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 72

The third shortcoming is the fact that the Bill currently withholds qualification for the refugee status in the event of a schedule to crime having been committed within the Republic. None of us can pretend to understand the implications of being denied asylum. The asylum that refugees seek in South Africa is often means the difference between life and death. To return someone to their homeland, from which they are fleeing, has the potential to be a death sentence. It is simply beyond comprehension that we as South Africans could impose death sentence for a crime committed within our borders.

We spare our own citizens this fate and have legislated against this. Why would we deny refugee the rights and privileges of a fair criminal justice system?

The fourth shortcoming of the Bill is the fact that upon Ministerial decree, refugee status may cease. There is no qualification for test for this session.

As in all matters of human dignity and the right to life, power over the lives of asylum seekers should not be granted lightly. There should be a highly qualified test

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 73

for such circumstances or at the very least; it should be based upon reasonable grounds.

The Bill before us today is admirable in its intentions but it falls short of the acceptable mark. We have no fundamental opposition to the Bill; in fact, we think that such legislation is imperative. But not like this and not in its current form. It is our opinion as the DA that this Bill does not conform to our constitutional mandate nor does it comply with international best practice. For these reasons hon Speaker, the DA cannot support this Bill. Thank you very much. [Applause.]

Declarations of Vote

Dr S S THEMBEKWAYO: Hon Speaker, when we did the second reading debate of the Bill here sometime back, we rejected it based on fundamental principled grounds. None of those issues have been addressed to date and the EFF still rejects this Bill.

Our opposition to the Bill is at a more fundamental level that it does nothing to insulate the asylum process from corruption and it is a legislative piece that perpetuates

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 74

hatred of other Africans because in the main, it is Africans seeking refugees in the country.

As it is, the Bill is open to abuse and opens up this straight asylum seekers to be subjected to the whims of the refugee status determination officer, RSDO, who is only accountable to the proposed standing committee.

It gives the RSDO discretionary power to decide on the faith of asylum seekers and does not provide for watertight oversight over the office. It gives more power to the RSDO to even refuse refugee status if the RSDO has reason to believe that the asylum seekers has committed any of the acts listed in the Bill.

This is against the principles of fairness guaranteed by our Constitution because the Bill does not say anything about the type of information that will be relied on RSDO to come to such conclusion. This is inhumane and out of sink with the reality of trauma that most asylum seekers have undergone. It is nothing but an attempt to legislate xenophobic attitudes in the country. On a light and a very positive note. Eff...

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 75

Setswana:

...e leboga batho botlhe ba ba e boutetseng kwa Metsimaholo. Re a leboga. [Legofi]

Mr N SINGH: Hon Chairperson, when this Bill was debated on the 14th March this year, the member of the IFP that spoke to the Bill supported the Bill. We don't see any reason now why we should not support the amendments. Because the amendments seek to improve sections of the Bill in particular, the time frame being given to refugees to report to these refugee reception offices.

However, having said that I think and now that the hon Minister of Finance is in the House and he was Minister of Home Affairs before, he needs to seriously reconsider the budget that is allocated at the Department of Home Affairs. Because if they have these additional responsibilities and they have to deal with these asylum seekers that come into our country at a fast and furious pace then they need to have the necessary administrative human and financial resources to be able to treat these asylum seekers as well as they would treat any South African citizen. I know if he was still the Minister of

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 76

Home Affairs, he would be standing before the Minister of Finance - who ever that was to say, give us more money we need to look after our asylum seekers, they need to be respected and well respected.

So, my appeal to you hon Minister of Finance, as you present your budget next year, give this department more money so that our asylum seekers can be treated fairly and they can be more offices where they can get access to apply for whatever requirements they need. We support the report. Thank you.

Mr D M GUMEDE: Hon Speaker, firstly, let me put this into context, there is a backlog of two years in matters of refugees and asylum seekers and this amendment tries to address that situation by simplifying the structure instead of having five people... the situation being addressed by five people at a time into a situation where you can have one lawyer and therefore, multiply the resources that the department is having by five times. Therefore, reduce the delay from two years to a more unacceptable period of waiting. That is the first point.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 77

The second point is that, we have agreed that this is an ad hoc measure. It is an ad hoc measure because already the department is developing a comprehensive policy on migration matters because, we are constantly in a situation of transit in these measures. A lot of countries are having something new to learn on migration given the upheavals in many parts of the world. That is why we wanted to address this matter comprehensively.

Thirdly, it is very dishonesty and unpatriotic of the DA to come here to Parliament and say 'the ANC does not deliver' the ANC is responsible for the delay in asylum seekers at the national level. Whilst its mayors and Johannesburg and Tshwane are shouting 'it's ANC home affairs' while the ANC home affairs is trying to address the matter at the national level. At the national level the DA is disrupting. It is not attending meetings.

If you look at the attendance register of the last meeting there was no DA member that attended. There was no EFF member that attended and we were addressing this very important matter. They do not care, they are dishonest and they are not worth of anybody's trust.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 78

As we move forward, we implore the DA and the EFF to participate more constructively, to try and work together with all South Africans to build a great nation - not a nation where you have everybody fighting each other. And the fights always are having been started by the DA and EFF. We want co-operation. We want to work together with everybody. We want to be more effective. We want a great nation. We want South Africa to the best country it can be. And you are disrupting. You are making sure that we cannot perform.

Please, please, please. Try and be with all the people. We want to promote orderliness, law and you are promoting anarchy, you are promoting xenophobic conditions and blame xenophobia on the ANC. This is not acceptable. We, together have to construct this nation. South Africa is a new nation, only 23 years old. It is important for us to work together. The ANC is always prepared to listen, it is always prepared to appreciate the views of all the parties that we have in South Africa and respond. It doesn't keep quiet. It doesn't run away from meetings. It doesn't start debates here in Parliament and when the time to vote comes then you start moving out.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 79

It is totally dishonest. How can we trust you? You start a debate and when the time to vote on that matter comes you run away. Then you say to the voters, you are representing them. But when hot matters come to Parliament you run away. This is dishonesty! This is dishonest. Come, let us build one nation. It is a big task. The ANC cannot do it alone. It needs everybody in South Africa.

However, if you do not want to participate, we will move on with those who are prepared to participate. With those that are prepared to have a united, democratic, non-sexist and non-racial and prosperous nation.

This is what we are building. You are trying to stop it and we shall not allow you to do that. We shall move forward.

Xitsonga:

Xitimele xa Afrika-Dzonga xa famba.

English:

Question put.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 80

Division demanded.

VOTING:

Ms M S KHAWULA: Point of order Speaker!

IsiZulu:

USOMLOMO: Iphuzu lokukhalima okuphambukile lani mama?

Nk M S KHAWULA: Somlomo, nginephuzu lokukhalima okuphambukayo. Ayi, ngiyabonga, awumuhle wema.

USOMLOMO: Mhlonishwa uKhawula ngicela uhlale phansi.

Nk M S KHAWULA: Awume kancane nje.

USOMLOMO: Mama uKhawula!

Nk M S KHAWULA: Awungilalele, sisuka nawe le eThekwini.

[Ubuwelewele.] Ngeke ungilahle e-Cape Town.

USOMLOMO: Mama uKhawula ngiyakucela uhlale phansi.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 81

Nk M S KHAWULA: Uzwile ukuthi kwenzekani le e-Metsimaholo?

English:

The SPEAKER: Hon Khawula, please take your seat.

IsiZulu:

Nk M S KHAWULA: Zawa indonga zeJerikho

USOMLOMO: Cha!

FAREWELL TRIBUTES TO DR P W A MULDER, MP

THE MINISTER OF SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY: Madam Speaker, it is a privilege and honour for me to have an opportunity to bid farewell on behalf of the ANC to the hon Mulder. The hon Mulder has served in Parliament; I see from my goggling of his name for 28 years and is probably the longest serving Member of Parliament, MP, in the House at present. [Applause.]

From our perspective as the ANC, he has been in Parliament since the dawn of democracy in 1994 and has I

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 82

believe served in accordance with the oath he swore at the start of each of the new Parliament, since the dawn of democracy.

He played a part in the drafting of our Constitution. I am sure that he will be probably be among the first to say his party did not get all that it wanted out of the process of drafting of the new Constitution. Nevertheless, he is one of the authors of the supreme law of our land. [Applause.]

I recall the role he played in formulating and arguing for clause 185 on the Commission and the Protection of Linguistic, Religious and Cultural Communities. Again at that time not a full victory, but I am sure he would say and advance on his and his party's ideas on how a democracy may address concerns of a formerly oppressive minority faced by a new democracy and a majority enjoying freedom for the first time.

I wonder, when he looks back how the hon Mulder, would weigh the changes and progress we have achieved in our 23 years of democracy. Along with all of us he can mark the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 83

introduction of compulsory education for all children by the ANC-led government from 1995, a first in the history of our country.

He again surely with all of us must recall and celebrate that many more young South Africans enjoy access to higher education, to postgraduate studying and to opportunities that they had never had before the ANC came into office in our country. [Applause.]

I am sure with all of us he will appreciate the free health care available to the poorest in our country and while with all of us he would call for higher improvement in quality he would mark that access as an advance.

He also with all of us is party to millions of people having homes that they never had a hope of having before. He is witness to millions of people enjoying access to water that they never had before. He is witness and party to millions of people having access to energy. He is witness and party - there are of course colleagues to my left who are shouting - not Mulder! Not Mulder! Well, we

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 84

are in one Parliament and whatever we pass is a responsibility of all of us. [Applause.]

He is part of us achieving free association and he is part of us achieving free expression for South Africa. He may not share all that we believe in with respect to equality and affirmative action, but nevertheless he was part of a Parliament that has as its mandate to achieve that. So, to me Dr Mulder is a true South African. [Applause.]

We do not always agree on all issues, but I have not had cause to doubt his commitment to our country. He may balk at the implementation of a number of our agricultural programmes as well as policy in that regard. He differs fundamentally with us in the ANC on the need to ensure greater ownership of land by the black majority through means including expropriation. This disagreement is of course acceptable in our democracy and our Parliament.

He has been first to acknowledge that part of what you should have in a Parliament is a robust debate, but also

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 85

an awareness that in the end we have a responsibility for the future and the character of our nation. [Applause.]

We celebrate with the hon Mulder, the fact that our struggle for freedom gave life to an open and robust democracy. We celebrate that we had great leaders who were able to reach a *rapprochement* among them was Gen Constand Viljoen, who the hon Mulder replaced as a leader of FF Plus. We also celebrate that we had leaders such as Mr Mandela, and the leader we celebrate this year Oliver Reginald Tambo, who are the authors who laid the foundation of the Constitution that we enjoy today.

As the ANC, we recall the hon Mulder as leader of the FF Plus and as an MP of that party. We of course wish that as he retires, we will finally see a woman occupy the National Assembly benches of the FF Plus. [Applause.]

Of course, we live in hope, but we hope that that hon Mulder will happen. I noted with great interest that when the hon Mulder commented on his departure recently in the public domain, he said that his party is well established, it is without debt and it has branches and

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 86

structures in all provinces. Well, I am not quite sure about the branches and structures, but he is very fortunate not to have any debt whatsoever.

We also wish him exceptionally well in his retirement. I note that he is a former academic having being a professor of communication at Potchefstroom University. I am sure he is not returning to a life of academia.

However hon Mulder, you have served your party the FF Plus well. I believe and you did duty to a country as the Deputy Minister of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: The hon Minister, your time has expired.

The MINISTER OF SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY: ... and you have been, I think a patriot and a true South African. We wish you well. [Applause.]

Afrikaans:

Mev A M DREYER: Speaker, ons kollega dr Pieter Mulder het 'n lang pad geloop tot vandag waar hy hier sit en ons nou van hom afskeid neem. Daardie reis gaan terug al die pad

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 87

tot in Randfontein. Toe ek destyds kiesafdelingshoof was vir Mogale City aan die Wes-Rand met Randfontein as naburige kiesafdeling het ek sy spore daar raakgeloop, sy spore daar gesien. Hy het inderdaad diep spore getrap. Dit het hom op die ou end gebring tot by hierdie Huis waar hy een van die mees senior lede is, indien nie die langsdienende lid van hierdie Huis nie.

Hy het werklik deel geword van die institusionele geheue van hierdie Parlement. As 'n mens inligting wil hê oor iets wat gebeur het op enige stadium, kan jy maar vir Pieter Mulder gaan vra, en hy sal vir jou 'n storie kan vertel.

Een van die bydraes wat Pieter Mulder gemaak het, was in terme van minderheidsbelange. In 'n diverse land soos Suid-Afrika is die beskerming en verdediging van minderheidsbelange van groot belang, en daar het Pieter sy bydrae gelewer.

Hy het egter ook 'n fout of twee gemaak - as jy nie omgee dat ek dit noem nie, Pieter - toe hy in Zuma se Kabinet gedien het as Adjunkminister, maar Pieter het sy fout

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 88

raakgesien. Op die ou end het hy toe nie verder daarin gedien nie, maar hom aangesluit as 'n lid van die koalisieregerings, eers in Kaapstad, toe in Johannesburg en Pretoria, en daarna in ander plekke soos Modimolle en Mookgopong waar hulle gewaardeerde koalisievennote is.

Vandag is nie 'n dag vir politieke debatte nie. Ek sal verkies om eerder op die mens en meer persoonlik te fokus. As 'n professor in kommunikasie is Pieter inderdaad 'n meester van kommunikasie. Hy is 'n man wat van 'n goeie storie hou. As jy in 'n tou staan by die lughawe om aanboord te gaan of by die eetsaal in die Marx-gebou, het Pieter 'n staaltjie reg. Ek is seker hy het sy studente vermaak met talle stories toe hy klasgegee het by die universiteit. Ek glo hy sal nou kans kry om sy kleinkinders te vermaak met die talle stories wat hy reg het om te vertel.

Pieter het hierdie kundigheid as kommunikeerder ook gebruik in die debatte. Ek was bevoorreg om enkele kere direk as 'n teenstaander saam met Pieter op te tree. Ek sien hy glimlag en knik sy kop daar. Tydens elke verkiesing hou die verskillende radiostasies debatte

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 89

tussen verskillende politieke partye. In Afrikaans is dit dan op Radio Sonder Grense, RSG, en ook Pretoria FM. So het ek dan talle kere teen Pieter te staan gekom. Ook op Kerkplein, onthou ek, onder die streng blik van Paul Kruger, met Cobus Bester as gesprekkeleier, het ek saam met mnr Terror Lekota - ek weet nie of hy vandag hier is nie - Andries Nel, wie ek netnou hier gesien het, en Pieter Mulder aan 'n debat deelgeneem.

Dikwels het Pieter ingebel na RSG en dan luisteraars ook vermaak met sy stories. Soms het my kollega Desiree van der Walt my gebel of in 'n SMS gesê: Pieter is op RSG. Anchen, bel gou in. Ons het dit nie altyd reggekry nie, maar dit wys dat ons sy bydraes as belangrik geag het, en ons het gesorg dat ons ons deel van die saak ook sou bring. In Café Riche, ook op Kerkplein, waar ons eenmaal in 'n warm debat vir radio was, sal ek nooit vergeet hoe dit 'n uiters warm debat was en Pieter die volgende vir my gesê het nie: Anchen, jy baklei soos 'n tierwyfie! Ek weet nie of hy dit so goed bedoel het nie, maar ek het dit beslis as 'n kompliment gesien, so dankie daarvoor, Pieter.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 90

Dan op kultuurgebied vind die Afrikaanse kunstefees Aardklop jaarliks in Potchefstroom plaas, en ek besoek dit graag. Toe ek eendag daar aankom en tydens etensuur by een van die kerke se terrein gaan kos koop, was my verbasing groot toe ek vir Pieter agter een van die toonbanke raakloop waar hy koffie, tee, en koeldranke bedien. Ek het inderdaad by Pieter, as kelner, 'n koppie koffie gekoop, en dit was inderdaad baie lekker. Ek dink dit wys ook op Pieter se nederigheid en sy bereidwilligheid om te dien, letterlik en figuurlik.

Daar word gesê 'n man wat aftree, tree nie werklik af nie. Hy verander net van werk. Waar jy nou in die Parlement gewerk het, gaan jy nou by die huis op jou vrou se senuwees werk. Ons hoop nie dis werklik so nie, maar ons wens jou voorspoed in die nuwe era voor, en ons hoop dat jy vir jou kleinkinders baie stories sal vertel tot hul vermaak. Gaan wel en totsiens. [Applous.]

English:

Mr M N PAULSEN: Chair, at some stage, we all have to pay for our sins, so this is my payment. [Interjections.]

Before I start, on behalf of the EFF I would like to

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 91

thank again the people of Metsimaholo who turned out in their numbers to vote out a kleptocratic ANC.

Afrikaans:

Ek wil nou graag 'n woorde met Dr Mulder deel. Ek verneem dat daar altyd 'n Mulder in hierdie Parlement was. Daar was nooit 'n regering wat 'n program van geregtigheid vir die oorgrote meerderheid van die mense van die land gedryf het nie. Baie mense het hier gestaan en gepraat oor wat Doktor in die verlede gedoen het.

Nou, as 'n Suid-Afrikaner, wil ek graag vir Doktor sê wat ek wil hê Doktor in die toekoms moet doen. U familie was altyd deel van hierdie Parlement, so u skuld ons, u familie skuld ons - julle skuld die land.

English:

You must help us create a South Africa where there is justice.

Afrikaans:

Almal in die land wil vryheid hê, maar nie ten koste van geregtigheid nie. Geregtigheid beteken dat dié land aan

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 92

almal van ons behoort. Ons wil nie blanke mense wegwens nie. Ek wil julle nie wegwens nie. Ons sal julle mis. Julle is deel van die land. Julle het nêrens om te gaan nie, so ek dink in u aftrede, Doktor, moet u aan alle Afrikaners - ag, julle is nie regtig die oorspronklike Afrikaners nie ...

English:

You appropriated the language and the culture, but you must tell other Afrikaners ...

Afrikaans:

... ons wil hê dat die land gedeel moet word met almal wat hier bly, dat nie een Suid-Afrikaner meer reg tot hierdie land het as enige ander nie. [Tussenwerpsels.]

In die toekoms, Doktor, hoop ek dat 'n Mulder in hierdie Parlement sal praat oor geregtigheid vir alle Suid-Afrikaners. Baie dankie, en vaarwel.

Mr N SINGH: Hon Speaker, it is great pleasure to represent the IFP and my leader, hon Buthelezi to bid farewell and give our greetings to a colleague that we

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 93

have worked with for many years, in particular my leader who has been here from 1994. I got a bit worried when I saw the image on the screen, and I noticed that it was the other Mulder that you were showing. There are two Mulder brothers and it is a Mulder at the back who is retiring. I am sure they have corrected that.

As we've heard, the Mulder family has been involved in politics in our country in different forms for decades now. I just hope that the current lot of Mulders have somebody down the hereditary line that could come into politics when they are not around.

Having said that, we have heard that Dr Mulder has been a former lecturer at Potchefstroom University and he occupied a seat for the Conservative Party when we won a by-election in 1988. Then, in 1994 when I became a member of the Senate representing IFP, Dr Mulder was here with his younger brother in the National Assembly. It is from that time that I have had an association with the Mulder brothers.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 94

In 2009, he was appointed to the executive, serving in the capacity of Deputy Minister of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries. I am told that he is going to be writing a book during his retirement. I am looking forward to the chapter which speaks about his relationship with the ruling party and himself when he was a Deputy Minister. That is something I am looking forward to, Dr Mulder. You can write about it after you leave this House.

A very important factor that we often overlook is the fact that Dr Mulder has five children and he has been married for 40 years, to the same wife. [Applause.] Same wife for 40 years! The reason I am emphasising this is that it is far too often to occur. We as members of this House forget to acknowledge our partners - whoever they are - and our families, for the support that they give us to enable us to continue doing the work on behalf of the people of this country. [Applause.]

I want to pay tribute to Mrs Mulder and her family for being the pillar of strength to Dr Mulder. I pay tribute to all our family members for being there to support us

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 95

whenever we need that support. Without them, we would never be here. [Applause.]

In conclusion, and on behalf of my leader, the hon Buthelezi and members of the IFP Parliamentary Caucus, we wish you farewell colleague and Godspeed as you enter this new and blessed phase of your life. Retirement just means doing the same things but doing it at your own pace. You won't be called to order by the Speaker as I will be called just now because my time is gone. You can do things; your wife will call you to order at home. All the best! Godspeed! Thank you. [Applause.]

Mr S C MNCWABE: Hon Speaker, greetings to colleagues. The NFP joins this august House today to bid farewell to our colleague. Hon Mulder, you have served South Africa well, both as a Member of Parliament in your capacity as Leader of the FF-Plus, and as the Deputy Minister of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries from 2009-2014.

Whilst we did not always agree with the views you represented, we acknowledge and commend the dignified way in which you conducted yourself here in the House and in

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 96

the corridors. The political arena is not for the faint of heart. It is robust and often brutal. Not only did you survive but you become a veteran, one of the few remaining members of this House to have served in both the previous and current dispensations.

That, Hon Mulder, takes stamina, conviction, integrity and determination. You have displayed all these qualities and more. We respect the way you have steadfastly stood by your beliefs and convictions, stating your position clearly whilst vigorously engaging in debate. You are a fine example of a gentleman in the true sense of the word: Courteous at all times and exuding calmness, even when the going got tough.

As the NFP, we are honoured to have served alongside you here in this House. We wish you prosperity, good health and joy in your retirement. We trust that your family will be delighted in having more of your quality time available now. On behalf of the NFP and of behalf of my leader and my caucus: We wish you well.

Afrikaans:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 97

Baie dankie.

Mnr N L S KWANKWA: Speaker, aan die agb Mulder: Beste Doktor Mulder, baie dankie vir die werk wat jy vir Suid-Afrika gedoen het oor die jare. Dit was werklik 'n voorreg om saam met jou te werk.

English:

Hey, that Afrikaans is difficult but I tried. [Applause.] On behalf of the UDM and on behalf my leader, I am personally honoured to bid farewell to you Dr Mulder as you decide to go on retirement. I agree with a comment you made to me earlier that there comes a time in life when we have to retire and focus on other challenges.

As you retire though, I want to urge you, call upon you and remind you that we as people never leave from contributing to the welfare of the nation. I say we are honoured because today we say farewell to a leader whose leadership attributes could not go unnoticed, even at Riebeeck High School in Randfontein where he was head boy and Victor Ludorum in athletics.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 98

Dr Mulder, as an academic lecture at that Potchefstroom University was promoted to head of the university's communications department. This means that he contributed to the development of the country even within that space. We believe, as the UDM, that each period or epoch defines its specific challenges of national progress and leadership. Because it does so, it does it in an environment that recognises that no man is an island.

During the period shortly before our transition and shortly after our transition, we understood that no man is an island. Together we had to try and map a new way forward to build the South Africa in which we could look to the sunrise of our tomorrow.

We thank you very much, sir, for your contribution and the role you played during this period. One of the things that I am going to miss about you and perhaps a role and the qualities of your organisation, the FF-Plus, is that we always know where you stand. We always know you stand even in instances where we don't agree on issues.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 99

The nice thing about your political party is that you stand for something rather than leaders that don't stand for anything. The other issue is that we fought for your right to say whatever you want to say, even when we disagree. As politicians and leader we must appreciate and understand that we are not always going to agree.

As we bid you farewell, I remember that I recently spoke to your younger brother, Corné Mulder, during the Black Monday protest and I said to him that I was concerned about the deafening silence of the voice of the Afrikaaner leadership during that period. I thought he was going to protest it, but in your style, he admitted and said, "Yes, we could have done more; and in future we will do more!" That is what leadership is about. We thank you very much.

IsiXhosa:

Uhlale kakuhle Mhlekaazi.

English:

And be taught a bit of African languages as well. Thank you kindly. [Applause.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 100

Afrikaans:

Dr P J GROENEWALD: Agb Speaker, ek staan met gemengde gevoelens hier. Dit is 'n besondere voorreg om ook hulde te bring aan die voormalige leier van die VF Plus, dr Pieter Mulder. Dit is ook 'n voorreg dat sy vrou, Triena, vandag hier in die galery is.

Pieter Mulder is 'n gebore leier. Op skool was hy hoofseun. Op universiteit was hy voorsitter van die studenteraad. Iets wat u dalk nie weet nie is dat hy nogal goed kan sing, want vir etlike jare het hy in die welbekende Alabama-sanggroep van die Potchefstroomse Universiteit vir Christelike Hoër Onderwys gesing. Hy het nog altyd, sy hele lewe lank, 'n aktiewe rol gespeel in die ontwikkeling van sy medemens.

As ons gaan kyk na sy stokperdjies, waarvan u dalk ook nie weet nie, is dit, onder andere, die geskiedenis en die sterre. U kan hom baie vrae vra oor die geskiedenis. Baie keer sê ons as jy saam met Pieter Mulder die Voortrekkermonument gaan besoek, of selfs hierdie Parlement, en jy vra vir hom 'n vraag, gaan jy doodseker

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 101

wees jy gaan 'n antwoord kry. Partymaal gaan jy 'n lang antwoord kry!

U kan hom ook oor die sterre en die name daarvan vra. Dit sê ook dat Pieter Mulder se horisonne ver en vooruit strek. Hy het altyd gesê dat in die politiek 'n goeie politikus 'n persoon is wat oor die bult kan kyk om behoorlike politieke ontledings te kan doen. In daardie opsig is ek bevoorreg om te kan sê dat hy my mentor was in die politiek.

Hy is nie verlore vir Suid-Afrika nie. Ek dink dit sal dom wees as die media en die radiodienste hom nie sal gebruik in die toekoms as 'n politieke ontleder nie, want sy analyses was nog altyd korrek. U kan maar gaan kyk. Sy voorspellings van opvolgstryde wat betref politieke leiers was nog elke keer korrek.

Gesien in die lig dat almal boeke skryf, hy is 'n persoon wat alreeds in 2008 'n boek geskryf het met die titel, *Kan Afrikaners toyi-toyi?* Dit was in 2008, en die titel kom vanaf sy gesprekke toe hy juis die saak van die Afrikaner destyds by President Nelson Mandela gevoer het.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 102

President Mandela het vir hom gevra, Jy sê nou dis wat die mense wil hê, maar kan die Afrikaner toyi-toyi? Ek kan u verseker dat hierdie boek, wat soos ek gesê het, reeds in 2008 gepubliseer is, bevat verskeie staaltjies juis van die Parlement.

Onder sy leiding het die VF Plus gegroei met meer as 15% en ons sê vir hom baie, baie dankie. Ons gaan jou mis, Pieter. Jy was die langsdienende lid in hierdie Parlement. Jy sit die vaandel nou oor die kop van jou broer, dr Corné Mulder, wat nou, na jou uittrede, die langsdienende lid sal wees - nog steeds in die VF Plus.

Van die VF Plus, en veral die Afrikaner, baie dankie vir jou onbaatsugtige diens, saam met jou vrou, Triena.

[Applous.]

Mnr M G P LEKOTA: Agb Speaker, namens Cope is ek bly om deel te neem aan die welvaring van die Mulder-familie. Beste wens aan dr Mulder en sy familie vorentoe. Hy is een van die spesiale mense wat Suid-Afrika vandag het. Hy vertrek nadat hy die laaste dae van apartheid gesien het, hy deelgeneem het aan die skryf van ons Grondwet, en dan

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 103

ook die pad voorberei het vir almal om in hierdie Huis in te kom om watter probleme ons ookal het hier te bespreek.

Mense moet altyd onthou dat Pieter Mulder deel was van daardie groep generale, soos Constand Viljoen en Tienie Groenewald, wat die jong Afrikaners wat bo geveg het, gesoebat het om deel te wees aan die onderhandelingsproses. Daardie manier het gehelp wys dat nie alle probleme tussen Suid-Afrikaners, veral, benodig geweld om op te los. Deur hier deel te wees van die werk wat ons oor die jare heen gedoen het, het hy ook 'n voorbeeld geskep wat nie een van ons mense nie kan raaksien nie.

Daar is wel baie van ons mense wat Suid-Afrika verlaat het omdat hulle onseker was van wat die toekoms sou hou. Hulle het geglo dat geweld openlik sou uitbars en almal se huise vernietig sou word, en vroue en wie ook al doodgemaak sou word. Hy het toe gewys dat hy so sterk in die toekoms van die Afrikaners tussen al die Suid-Afrikaners geglo het dat hy gebly het, en aangebly het tot nou nog. As gevolg daarvan is daar heelwat Suid-

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 104

Afrikaners in Australië, Nieu-Seeland, Kanada en die hele wêreld oor, wat dit nou oorweeg om terug te kom.

Pieter, jy het vir ons 'n baie groot geskenk gegee. Ons kan hulle voetstappe hoor soos hulle terugkom. Hulle kan nou sien dat Mandela se versoening om 'n nuwe Suid-Afrika te skep hier is, en hulle kom. Soos hulle stappe dreun, moet ons oor en oor die woorde van C J Langenhoven herhaal:

Ons sal antwoord op jou roepstem,
Ons sal offer wat jy vra:
... ons vir jou, Suid-Afrika.

Ek dank u.

AGB LEDE: Hoor! Hoor! [Applous.]

Mr S N SWART: Agb Speaker, dit was vir ons in die ACDP 'n groot eer om saam met dr Pieter Mulder in die Parlement te kon dien. Ons leier, die agb Meshoe, het saam met hom vanaf 1994 gedien. Hulle was saam betrokke gedurende die

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 105

grondwetlike onderhandelinge wat tot die ontstaan van ons Grondwet gelei het.

Ek en die agb Dudley het vanaf 1999 saam met dr Mulder en sy kollegas van die VF Plus gedien. Ons is baie jammer dat hy nou gaan uittree, maar het begrip dat elkeen van ons seisoene het - seisoene om te dien.

Dr Mulder het ook in President Zuma se Kabinet gedien, as Adjunkminister van Landbou, Bosbou en Visserye. Daar is vele kritiek teen hom en sy party gelewer toe hy daardie posisie aanvaar het. Ons het saam na die tyd daardie aspek bespreek, en ek is oortuig daarvan dat dit die regte besluit was.

Ons, as gelowiges, is geroep om sout en lig te wees, waar ook al ons onself bevind - ook in die Kabinet. Hy het daar, sonder twyfel, 'n belangrike rol gespeel en soos ek verstaan het, met nederigheid bygedra het met beide kennis en, wat meer belangrik is, met wysheid.

Ons insiens is daar 'n ontsettende leemte aan wyse leiers, en dit is jammer dat dr Mulder ons nou gaan

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 106

verlaat. Ons het egter begrip vir sy besluit en die geweldige opofferings wat hy reeds moes maak. Ons bedank hom, sy vrou, Triena, en sy familie vir daardie onbaatsugtige opofferings.

In 2 Korinthiërs 5:18, lees ons dat Christus ons die bediening van versoening gegee het. Dr Mulder het beslis 'n belangrike versoeningsrol in ons nasie gespeel. Dr Mulder en genl Constand Viljoen se rol destyds met die vreedsame oordrag na die nuwe Suid-Afrika kan nie onderskat word nie.

Hy en genl Viljoen is uit die destydse Afrikaner Volksfront geskors weens hulle betrokkenheid by Codesa. Hulle het net voor die 1994-verkiesing die Vryheidsfront gestig. Dit kon heeltemal anders uitgedraai het indien hulle nie die houding ingeneem het van vredemakers nie. Ons is dankbaar vir daardie rol. Geseënd is die vredemakers - en ons eer dr Mulder daarvoor.

Ons van die ACDP wens dr Mulder, Triena en sy familie alle sterkte toe met sy uittrede uit die politiek. Dokter, jy het diep spore getrap en 'n belangrike

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 107

nalatenskap gelos. Ons sê vir u baie dankie. Dankie, agb Speaker. [Applous.]

Afrikaans

Mnr L M NTSHAYISA: Agb Speaker, ja, ek kan ook Afrikaans praat, ...

English:

... but not this time of the day. When I heard that hon Mulder is retiring, having been here for 40 years, I thought that I would perhaps approach him to just ask for 0,7% of the big pension that he is going to get.

[Laughter.]

Dr Mulder is a seasoned politician. As the AIC, we are aware of his political role in this country. The 40 years experience that he gained as a Member of Parliament is saying a lot. Although he has not been in Parliament for all these years, we have heard, seen and even noticed his contribution to this Parliament.

We have just been together with him in this Parliament for a period of three and a half years, but we appreciate

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 108

the manner in which he was trying to maintain the decorum of the House, pleading with the members to behave. So, whatever positive or negative debate or contribution you made in this Parliament is highly appreciated.

We also say that you must go home and rest. We know, of course, that a man will never rest until he dies. Now you are just going to pause. I am sure that you are going to be engaged with somewhere.

So, we appreciate the contributions that you have made and the experience that you gained will never be in vain. Dr Mulder, I know that you have some skills that you would like to impart to these young ones because of the experience - political and otherwise. We would like you to impart those skills and teach our young ones how to behave and how to engage in politics. We hope you are going to do a lot for the country even though you are leaving Parliament and even though you have done a lot.

Thank you very much for your contribution. Have a good rest at home. Farewell.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 109

Mr N T GODI: Hon Speaker, comrades and hon members, the African People's Convention, the revolutionary party, congratulates, bids farewell and wishes Dr Mulder well, as he takes his deserved rest from Parliament.

We do so appreciating that we stand on opposite poles of the ideological spectrum. I represent the forces of African nationalism, whilst I think he stands for Afrikaner nationalism. These two forces have historically represented the thesis and antithesis in the political, social and cultural milieu in our country.

These contradictions have not been properly resolved by the liberal consensus of Kempton Park in 1993. It has been the longstanding ideological position of us Pan-Africanists that the resolution, the synthesis of these contradictory forces is our common Africanness - Africanism, where all those who owe their morality to African and accept the democratic rule of the African majority are regarded as Africans.

Dr Mulder is a gentleman, well-mannered, always courteous to all and his character always shines beyond his

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 110

politics. His ability to articulate his party's position in a composed manner, always playing the ball and not the man is commendable.

The ability to do your politics without shouting, insulting anybody or grandstanding carries lessons for all of us in this House. It has been so, especially in the Fifth Parliament where shouting, insults, gross disorder, disregard for the decorum of the House have become associated with this House.

We wish you well for the future. Go with your quiet dignity.

Izwe lethu. I-Africa. [Our land] [Applause.]

Dr P W A MULDER: You must not do that. Hon Speaker, I am honoured by this debate and all the contributions. I really wish I could react to every speaker. There is an old saying: "All political careers end in tears." With my decision to voluntarily resign as a Member of Parliament, I am trying to avoid that.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 111

It does, however, not mean that I am going to stop being actively involved. I believe that I still have a role to play in my community and in various other spheres of society.

Allow me to say a few words and express my gratitude. What have I learned in this House? There is limited time. I have learned that my truth and your truth might differ, but that we can still debate with each other and still respect each other.

I have learned that I have not persuaded someone just because I have silenced him or her. I have learned that anger is a wind that blows out the lamp of the mind. I have learned that politicians with talent are discovered in this place, while others are found out in this place.

I have learned that if you make a mistake, the media likes to portray you in cartoon with your foot in your mouth. I have also learned that in this House, a closed mouth at the right time, gathers no feet. [Applause.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 112

I have learned, and it is very important, that no one can make you feel inferior without your own consent. I have learned that the hallways and corridors of Parliament are the only place in the world where stories and sound travel faster than light. [Laughter.]

I have learned to be careful to wish for the departure of an opponent because there is always the risk that the replacement is even worse. [Laughter.]

I have also learned that in South Africa, identity is a highly debated topic. Are you a South African or a Christian? You must debate that. Are you a Zulu or a South African? I believe that we sometimes really complicate this matter unnecessarily, as we all have a number of identities.

My own identities ripple outwards like concentric circles. Firstly, I am a family man and a father to my children, but I am also an Afrikaner and part of the greater Afrikaans community. I am also a South African because I only have one passport and I know only one

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 113

continent as home - Africa. In that sense, I am also an African and I am a Christian at the same time.

All these identities have a role to play, depending on where you find yourself. As a Christian, I believe that I played my role here as a humble instrument in God's hand.

In my identity as a South African, I served as a Deputy Minister for five years. At that time, I was the only Minister that was not a member of the ANC. The Afrikaners said, Piet Retief is weer in Dingane se kraal [Piet Retief is again in Dingane's kraal]. [Inaudible.] At that stage, my FF Plus youth leader resigned because I done that. Another Member of Parliament and several other members of the FF Plus also resigned. I still believe that taking the job was the right decision, as it allowed me to contribute to making South Africa a better place for all of us. [Applause.] I said it more than once that if this South African ship goes down, we all go down together, not one alone.

As Deputy Minister, I had the privilege to address African leaders at the African Union in Addis Ababa in

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 114

Ethiopia. Assuming the identity of an African that is concerned about my continent, I was able to point out that neither the West nor the East really cared about Africa, since the Cold War ended. My message was that we are going to have to solve our own problems from now on.

Right from my first day in Parliament, my belief as an Afrikaner was that minority rights and self-determination must form part of the permanent solution of South Africa's problems and you know that I argued that accordingly.

I also maintained throughout that all the official languages in South Africa should be treated equally, just like the Constitution prescribes. It took us nearly seven years of debates before we were able to establish an interpreting service for all 11 official languages in this House. If we want to help people in South Africa regain their dignity - a very important part after 1994 - the first thing we need to do is to stop treating some languages as inferior to other. That goes for all 11.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 115

Allow me a few acknowledgements. First of all, I would like to thank my supporters who supported me in seven consecutive elections and who made it possible for me to represent them in Parliament for nearly three decades, 29 years to be exact.

I would also like to thank the Freedom Front Plus and my colleagues here in Parliament, over there. We made a good team and I believe we often contended out of our league.

Thank you to all the other colleagues here in Parliament for the debates and talks during which we formed one another. That is part of this House. A special thanks to the members of the committee for the spirit in which we were able to go about our business.

A heartfelt thanks to the Freedom Front Plus staff and I want to mention them because they are sitting up there: Dalien Steyn, Pieter Swart, Wanda Marais, Amanda Hughes and Carien Nefdt, and others who often worked under pressure, kept to deadlines and who made it possible for me to be smart and to do my job.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 116

I would like to express my gratitude to the Speaker, behind me for her job and the other presiding officers for the role they played and for the extra 10 seconds that they often gave me during all my different speeches. [Applause.] [Laughter.] Thank you for that. I may just add that no Speaker, during my 29 years, had the privilege to send me out of this House and to ask me to leave the House. They have never done that.

To all the parliamentary staff, the administrative staff, the police out here and the restaurant staff who work so hard behind the scenes, my sincerest thanks. Often, amid all the political frustration in this place, my lunch and their friendly service was the highlight of my day.

I have the greatest appreciation for my mother who has always supported me. She is 90 years old and she keeps telling me to leave politics. She said that it is very dangerous. Yet, she still watches the parliamentary debates every afternoon on television. Then she phones me afterwards to tell me that I need a haircut and that my shirt and tie did not match. [Laughter.] [Applause.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 117

As a family man, I would like to thank my family for all the sacrifices they made over the years. Thank you to my wife, Triena, in particular, who worked in the North West and who often had to raise the children on her own while I was here at Parliament. She was here, sitting in the gallery, when I was inaugurated, 29 years ago and she is here again today. [Applause.] We have been married for 44 years, but she says that I was away from home at Parliament for political meetings so often that if she counts the days that I was at home, it only adds up to seven years of marriage. [Laughter.] So, I will have to make up now, going back there.

Thank you very much, everybody. May God bless us all as well as for South Africa. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon members for the very heartfelt tributes from members from different parties. I wish to thank Dr Mulder's wife, the family and the office for all the support to him over the years that he was here. Dr Mulder, I wish to remind you of the occasion on which you led a delegation to the head offices of the African National Congress. These are some of the things

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 118

that happen behind the scenes. What struck me that day was that you led the FF Plus to come and express to the majority party that you were coming to pledge your willingness to be part of building the future of this country. [Applause.]

You shared with us perspectives, information and understanding of the community that you come from, which we found very valuable. I want you to know that and I want South Africa to know that we should agree that the biggest task that we have, as South Africans and South African leaders, is indeed, at the end of the day, to make sure that we can leave a legacy that we did our bit during the time we were honoured to serve, in order for us to build a better South Africa.

On a couple of occasions, I have called you, Dr Mulder, right here in Parliament, to my office to contribute to a role that we are often called upon - I think hon Buthelezi often is - to be an elder of this country. We serve, but for only a short time and we must always make the best of it.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 119

We thank you for doing it. We hope that you will indeed enjoy the rest of your time. You have often talked about your grandchildren; enjoy them thoroughly. Of course, it will be strange to only see one of the Mulder brothers sitting in the bench over there, but we wish you good luck. Thank you, hon members and farewell to you, Dr Mulder, on behalf of the presiding officers. [Applause.]

The business of the House is suspended until 14:00.

Business suspended at 13:02 and resumed at 14:01

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Afternoon hon members and welcome again back to the House.

**CONSIDERATION OF REPORT OF STANDING COMMITTEE ON
APPROPRIATIONS - 2017 MEDIUM-TERM BUDGET POLICY STATEMENT**

There was no debate.

The Deputy Chief Whip of the Majority Party moved: That the Report be adopted.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 120

Motion agreed to (Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Report accordingly adopted.

**CONSIDERATION OF REPORT OF STANDING COMMITTEE ON
APPROPRIATIONS ON ADJUSTMENTS APPROPRIATION BILL [B25 -
2017]**

There was no debate.

The Deputy Chief Whip of the Majority Party moved: That
the Report be adopted.

Motion agreed to.

Report accordingly adopted (Economic Freedom Fighters and
Democratic Alliance dissenting).

DEBATE ON 2017 MEDIUM-TERM BUDGET POLICY STATEMENT

ADJUSTMENTS APPROPRIATION BILL

(First Reading Debate)

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 121

Mrs Y N PHOSA: Hon Chair, hon Deputy President in absentia, hon Ministers and Deputy Ministers, hon members, guests in the gallery and fellow South Africans, the ANC supports the report. Hon Chair, the aftermath of the economic global crisis is still with us, eight years after subprime crisis hit the financial sector in the USA.

This proves the assertion that the economic crisis emanating from the financial meltdown takes longer to correct. This is even worse for emerging economies like ours. The bruises that we suffered as South Africa are still not healed. We now know that economic growth has been revised downwards from 1,2% to 0,7% as shared by the Minister of Finance in the Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement, MTBPS. This has impacted on many economic and fiscal ratios negatively. Without shared economic growth, we cannot deal with poverty.

Hon Chair, allow me to borrow the wise words of the founding father of our democracy, Dr Nelson Mandela when he said:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 122

Overcoming poverty is not a task of charity; it is an act of justice. Like slavery and apartheid, poverty is not natural. It is man-made and it can be overcome and eradicated by the actions of human beings.

Hon Chair, our struggle today is to end racism in politics, society and the economy. Comrade Mandla Nkomfe, one of the ANC intellectuals says:

Closing an economic inequality gap and changing of racial attitudes are essential in combating racism in the long term.

I repeat, changing of racial attitudes.

The Freedom Charter says: "South Africa belongs to all who lives in it, black and white." The ANC-led government's national agenda is to ensure that all South Africans have benefits from its prosperity. Economic freedom is thus essential in addressing the needs of all South Africans for economic emancipation to rise.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 123

Presently, the ANC-led government is accelerating the implementation of the National Development Plan, NDP, as the overall plan that will reignite inclusive economic growth, create jobs and reduce poverty. The economic growth strategy is implemented through the Nine-Point Plan adopted by the ANC-led government.

As the ANC, we remain positive. I repeat positive, and we have hope that with the double efforts by all of us to support the 14-point action plan for economic boost, the economic growth will turn around. The action plan emanates from the dialogue between government and business.

We congratulate the Minister for his maiden Medium-Term Budget speech on 25 October 2017. We strongly believe that this Mid-Term Budget is reasonably inspiring confidence by the private sector, with the possibility of a turnaround in our sluggish economic growth.

The Minister was forthright with the impact of the present economic situation on the fiscal framework and what government wants to do. It is illustrated through

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 124

expenditure cuts, greater efficiencies in government supply chain management, and greater vigour in fighting corruption at all levels of government's fiscal activities inclusive of State-Owned Entities, SOEs, tax morality.

The Minister did not mince his words when articulating the credibility of the National Development Plan, NDP, Vision 2030; the ANC government's commitment to it; and the mandate paper as developed by the Department of Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation and the National Treasury to strengthen the alignment of the Medium-Term Expenditure Framework, MTEF, Budget to the NDP goals for the realisation of Vision 2030.

The policy statement is an important part of South Africa's open and accountable budget process. It empowers Parliament and society at large to discuss and shape government's approach to the budget. The MTBPS includes among others: The spending priorities of government for the next three years; the proposed division of revenue between national, provincial and local government for the next three years; any substantial proposed adjustments to

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 125

conditional grant allocations to provinces and local governments; and a review of spending by each national department and provincial government between 1 April and 30 September of the current financial year.

On higher education, we welcome the MTBPS's proposal that government plans to allocate R11,1 billion over the medium-term framework for infrastructure projects at higher education institutions. We also welcome the indication that R51 billion in revenue from the Skills Development Levy will support programmes expected to produce qualified artisans and create work-based learning opportunities through learnerships, internships and apprenticeships. Partnerships - I repeat that partnerships are critical for ensuring that skills-based activities of the economy improve.

On health, the NDP envisages a strong public health system that works for everyone, and a sharp reduction in the disease burden. The government also aims to provide a social safety net for all South Africans, particularly the young, elderly and the disabled. Spending priorities include rolling out of National Health Insurance, NHI,

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 126

expanding provision of antiretroviral treatment, but also tuberculosis, TB, and malaria treatment. Continuing early childhood development and building an integrated community health worker programme.

Of course, the present environment of a fragile low growth makes it difficult to tackle the socioeconomic challenges of unemployment, poverty and inequality. The country needs a new cycle of inclusive development which requires intervention to stimulate activity; ensure effective regulation; improve competitiveness of manufactured exports; promote localisation; and reindustrialise the economy together with renewed attention to the capacity of the state.

For the first time in the budget process we had both Minister in the Presidency, Mr Jeff Radebe and Minister of Finance, Mr Malusi Gigaba coming to brief the Money Bills Committee on the MTBPS. This working together of these two leading departments is important for the budget process.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 127

The 2017 MTBPS was tabled before the introduction of the Mandate Paper prepared by the Department of Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation which aims at strengthening alignment of the national Budget, the Medium-Term Strategic Framework, MTSF, and the National Development Plan during the remaining term of the current administration. Furthermore, while priority setting is an essential planning task of the Mandate Paper or Budget Prioritisation Framework, it is important that the House notes that budget allocations are, and remain the domain of National Treasury as outlined in the PFMA.

The budget process is a broad and inclusive process, and entails a number of structures such as the MTEC, functional groups consisting of departments organised in the National Treasury Clusters, Medium-Term Expenditure Committee, MTEC of Directors-General and the Minister's Committee on the Budget. I am trying to show you how involved this process is. You can't skip a stage. You must follow the procedure to the letter.

In fact, the committee members were unanimous that irregular, unauthorised, fruitless and wasteful

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 128

expenditure will no longer be tolerated. This is not just a talk shop. [Interjections.]

Mr D J MAYNIER: [Inaudible.]

In fact, in response - I said shop - to this firm stance by the committee ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon Maynier!

Mrs Y N PHOSA: ... it is a pleasure to present to the House the Standing Committee on Appropriations' first risk statement. The committee's risk statement serves to identify and focus attention to programmes that display planning and implementation weaknesses. These programmes provide critical services to the public. Programmes identified will be considered for making their allocations conditional or amended in the following years. The committee will consult with all parliamentary committees in this regard.

In our expenditure hearings held with various committees of Parliament, chairpersons of a number of portfolio

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 129

committees have expressed their firm intolerance of irregular, fruitless and wasteful expenditure. They called for allocations to be stopped or diverted from wasteful programmes and redirected to those that are performing. Overall, we support the Medium-Term Expenditure proposals of 2018 MTF allocations which will make a substantial contribution to transformation and inclusive growth.

In terms of the budget adjustments, I am happy to report that there are improvements in budget executions with total government spending approximately equal to the norm of 50% for the first half of the 2017-18 financial year. I think we need to give ourselves a big round of applause. Spending by all votes approximates the 49% mark. However, we are concerned with the declared unspent funds and projected underspending. Hon Chair ...
[Interjections.]

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Must we applaud for that?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 130

Mrs Y N PHOSA: Yes, please. This is indeed a historic day. You must listen carefully now.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order, you have 57 seconds left.

Mrs Y N PHOSA: Today, we have in the House the first ever budget amendments effected by the Parliament since the dawn of democracy. Amending Money Bills is seen as an important expression of Parliament's independence and a powerful tool to exercise oversight over the executive. The amendment relates to the reallocation of R100 million which is from National Treasury to the Department of Home Affairs for the information and modernisation system.

We thank both the leadership of the Ministries of Finance and Home Affairs for their full participation and co-operation in this amendment process. I would like to thank all the NGOs which participated in the public hearings but I would also like to thank the hon members for their hard work as we were preparing for this report, and also the staff members for their excellent work.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 131

Indeed, they must keep up the good work. Thank you. [Time expired.]

Mr D J MAYNIER: Chairperson, the Minister of Finance Malusi Gigaba's maiden Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement was a disaster and it exposed the full horror of President Jacob Zuma's mismanagement of the economy in South Africa. The fact is it is the politics that is killing the economics in South Africa. The poor are getting poorer in South Africa. In fact, the only two countries in the world where the poor are getting poorer at a faster rate than South Africa is Qatar which was under siege and Venezuela which was destroyed by a mad left wing dictator, Hugo Chávez.

The finance committee chairperson, Unice Kareem, who sheer nastiness, pettiness and prejudice was on display this week, and who likes to think of himself as belonging to the good ANC, when we all know that he was the fellow traveller who greased the wheels to shut down the scorpions on President Jacob Zuma's orders. [Applause.] Now he likes to say the ANC stands and supports the poor, well let's have a look at that statement by taking a deep

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 132

dive into this budget, which you will all see is dripping in wasteful expenditure.

Strike one; the ANC claims to care about the poor, but because of their mismanagement of this economy, there is now an R86 billion hole that is opened up in the budget, which at the end of the day, will be financed and extracted in part, from the poor.

Strike two; the ANC claims to care about the poor, but this budget makes provision for a R10 billion bailout for zombie state-owned enterprise, South African Airways. And what makes this bailout even worse is that a R350 million under spent on child grants and disability grants has been rolled into and used to fund R10 billion bailout for South African Airways, it is an economic crime.

Strike three; the ANC claims to care about the poor, but this budget makes provision for 13 brand new luxury ministerial vehicles at a cost of R11,8 million.

When people are struggling, when people are battling to put bread on the table, we have the Minister of Public Works, buying not one, but two luxury vehicles, a luxury

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 133

R1,26 million Toyota Land Cruiser and a luxury R1,22 million Mercedes-Benz. We have the Minister of Small Business, buying not one, but two luxury vehicles, a R1,1 million Mercedes-Benz and a R900 000 Lexus.

Mr P J MNGUNI: House Chair, on a point of order: The hon member is really casting aspersion on the Ministers and you could only do so in a form of a subjective motion. Thank you. We ask for your ruling House Chair.

[Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order hon members! I will have to reflect on that because I thought he is referring to the budgeted items that are on the adjustment estimates. [Applause.] [Interjections.] Order! Proceed hon member.

Mr D J MAYNIER: Thank you. We do not need to reflect on that point of order it simply proves that the member is a factory fault.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order! Proceed with the speech.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 134

Mr D J MAYNIER: I was saying Chairperson ...

Mr P J MNGUNI: House Chair, obviously, a point of personal privilege. It may never be acceptable and I don't accept that hon Maynier may refer to me in such a manner. In actual fact, I present myself and ask him to see if he can match me in any other manner. I am not a factory fault. [Interjections.] I am not a factory fault. [Interjections.] I am a party representative. Thank you. [Interjections.] [Laughter.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon members, order! Hon Maynier, I think we should approach each other in a manner that is acceptable so that nobody feels bad in this meeting. [Interjections.] Proceed, hon member.

Mr D J MAYNIER: Chairperson, I am really not sure what that member is proposing maybe he is proposing swords at dawn, in which case I will be happy to meet ...

[Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 135

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order! Hon members, I have not heard any one of you. Can you please make a point of order?

Mr H P CHAUKE: Deputy Speaker, the manner in which the hon member has referred to another hon member there, by saying he is a factory fault is unparliamentary and he must withdraw and apologise. It cannot be that we accept for members to be addressed like that. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon Maynier, did you refer to hon Mnguni as a factory floor?

[Interjections.]

HON MEMBERS: Fault!

Mr D J MAYNIER: No Chairperson, I referred to him as a factory fault.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Can you please withdraw that because you know that it is unparliamentary? [Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 136

Mr D J MAYNIER: I withdraw. Chairperson I was saying, and we have now while we are the question of luxury vehicles a Deputy Minister, not even a Minister, a Deputy Minister of Communications buying not one but two vehicles, a luxury R756 000 Mercedes-Benz and R800 000 Jaguar Ghetto Sport. The fact is the ANC has been reduced to fighting poverty from the comfort of their luxury ministerial vehicles in South Africa; that is the truth.

Strike four; the collection of pensioners and political cadavers deployed by the ANC to the appropriations committee care so much about the poor that they refused to even consider a proposed amendment to increase the appropriation of Vote 23 by R300 million to provide for the fight against drug-related crime.

The DA says yes to more money to fight the crime, the ANC says no. They refuse to consider an amendment to increase the Higher Education Vote by R780 million, to support poor students. The DA said yes to more money for poor students, the ANC said no.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 137

The fact is the ANC's greatest legacy after 23 years in government is to have racked this economy and to have institutionalised and then industrialised the scale of corruption in South Africa. That is why more people, especially more poor people, are voting for freedom, fairness and opportunity in South Africa. I thank you.
[Time expired.] [Applause.]

Mr T RAWULA: The EFF warned South Africa against a microeconomic policy that is meant to satisfy Moody's, S&P and Fitch in New York while our people continue to live in poverty. It is misguided, unsustainable and will lead this country into serious crisis.

All the austerity measures, privatisation of state owned companies, outsourcing of government services and putting a premium price on basic service such as water and electricity will only condemn the poor to life of misery.

The budget policy statement suffers all forms of credibility, it suffers the revenue credibility unless Sars deals with all tax leakages, in particular tax

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 138

leakages because of illicit financial flows, government will continue to lose billions every year.

It suffers the Minister's credibility. Mr Gigaba worked day and night to handover state owned companies to the Gupta family. He cannot be trusted with anything ...

[Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order! Hon member ... [Interjections.]

Mr T RAWULA: ... let alone public place ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon Rawula? [Interjections.]

Mr T RAWULA: ... he is a disaster of ... waiting to happen.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon Rawula?

Mr T RAWULA: Yes ...

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 139

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Can you please withdraw the statement you made about the Minister because you casting aspersions. If you want to bring it as a substantive motion, you need to do so. Can you please withdraw that?

Mr T RAWULA: Which one? The one of handing over the fiscus to ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Yes, you need to withdraw that.

Mr T RAWULA: You saying I must withdraw?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order! Hon member, can you please withdraw.

Mr T RAWULA: Okay, withdrawn. The budget policy also suffers policy coherent credibility, everywhere in the world people are starting to move away from neoliberal policies including great advocates of such policies but the Treasury is hell-bent on unworkable and unsustainable policies.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 140

Then there is Eskom, a crisis that is reaching a looming climax unless we take decisive and concrete steps to stabilise the power utility. This cannot be done through an increase of 19,9 tariff. We need to stop all payments to corrupt Gupta linked companies and not only at Eskom but all other government departments and state owned companies.

In Eskom, the Guptas have not only captured state owned company but have captured the whole country's fiscus and they have the potential to collapse the entire fiscus. If we do not intervene now we will soon find ourselves paying billions of debt which state has guaranteed lenders when Eskom went to borrow money they did not need.

Then there is Telkom, why sell a government shares in a company that is making profit and starting to contribute billions into the national revenue fund. Not only is this illogical, but it smells of corruption and given that it is Mr Gigaba responsible. We are not jumping a gun to say it is a corrupt deal to sell Telkom.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 141

Then there is the PIC, workers's money that must be invested in a sound and responsible manner but it is being threatened to be used as government guarantees. We are warning the Treasury to stay away from workers' money. The PIC has been doing a sterling job and with political guidance from Parliament democratic shareholders, the PIC can play a vital and central role towards transformation of our financial sector and overall economy. We call on all South Africans to defend workers' pension money.

We have now learned that Guptas are now waging war against the people of South Africa through a Gupta linked company called Tegeta. They are now cutting the coal supply to Eskom with an intention to plunge the country into a deliberate and wilful loadshedding. They have no sense of shame or patriotism after they have ripped the fiscus into a skeleton, look at them, it is of course what we have always said that the bringing of Guptas illegally through an ill informed naturalisation is plunging the country into crisis; they are ripping the fiscus and now they are attracting Eskom, the supplier of coal they are pretending to be ... [Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 142

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: House Chair, on a point of order: Rule 92

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order! Hon member, can you take your seat? What is the point of order, sir?

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: House Chair, we just wanted to get clarity on what is patriotism.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order! If the member wishes to clarify then he can.

Mr T RAWULA: No ... [Laughter.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Proceed with your minutes hon member.

Mr T RAWULA: You are making sense of patriotism. Thank you very much House Chair.

Mr M HLENGWA: Madam Chair, overall after listening to the statement delivery by the Minister of Finance on the medium term budget policy and giving him credit as to the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 143

frank and open way in which he described the many challenges that South Africa is faced with.

We must note, though, that he did not present any solution. For example, he mentioned the need for the structural change in our economy but there was no detail in this microeconomic structural reform that he mentioned that we require to stimulate our economy.

It would seem that this was a policy statement copped together just to take us through the ANC December conference with the surprises then said to arrive in the February 2018 budget.

Looking at the statement though, what was of concern to us is that debt as a proportion to GDP is said to rise from 40% to 60% with interest payment and servicing debt by 2021 comprising 15% of our fiscal revenue. Tax revenues have reduced, which can be understood by the current high levels of unemployment we see and the reduction in corporate profits.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 144

In short, what the Minister failed to do was to provide the business sector with the necessary confidence that South Africa remains an attractive investment opportunity and destination. The MTBS has unfortunately fallen far short in providing any real solutions.

Coupled with all this, are the glaring supply chain management and compliance concerns we have in government and our state owned enterprises. Until these have been successfully corrected, we simply cannot allocate more fiscal funding as this would amount to nothing more than additional wasteful expenditure tantamount to throwing financial solutions to non financial problems.

What is of particular concern to the IFP is that South African Airways, our national carrier which was the national asset has become a national liability and it has become a huge drain on fiscal funds and have recently, in addition to the R5,2 billion allocated to them by the Minister of Finance, have been further allocated another R4,8billion to SAA.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 145

Add this to the R3,7 billion to the South Africa Post Office and you have a total of R13,7billion which in anyone's language is a huge drain on the national fiscus.

Corrective action must be taken posthaste and the current mismanagement and wasteful expenditure at our state owned enterprises and this must be dealt with decisively. This can be achieved additionally by selling some of these state assets and by doing away with some of the state owned enterprises. Many of them should be closed down or alternatively partnership sorted private enterprise as many of the functions and services they provide can be provided ably and profitably by the private sector.

In summary, the Minister of Finance did not provide South Africa with hope in his MTBS as nothing in terms of policy, was presented to take the country forward. I thank you.

Prof N M KHUBISA: House Chairperson and hon members, the Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement, MTBPS, was delivered in a context of limited economic growth, declining budget revenues and rising poverty and inequality. We agree that

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 146

it was an honest assessment, hiding nothing from the public and we thank the Minister for breaking even with us.

The bare facts of the MTBPS are grim with a confirmed tax revenue shortfall of R50,8 billion and the budget deficit will stretch to 4,3% of the Gross Domestic Product, GDP, against the target of 3,1%. To compound the economic misery, growth for 2017 is forecast to be no more 0,47%.

We have to face the reality; ours is a country facing unprecedented structural inequalities. There's a huge gap between the rich and the poor; between the few who have more than enough and many who have nothing.

Our current economic situation is dire; just consider that poverty and unemployment levels grew to 27% in the last quarter of this year. Our economy has become more fragile, subdued, slow and sluggish. Industries such as mining, manufacturing and infrastructure industries could not succeed in creating jobs, instead, they shed thousands for the past year.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 147

Most of our emerging businesses are collapsing, in particular our small and medium-sized enterprises; government debt is growing exponentially, draining government coffers; and irregular, wasteful and fruitless expenditure and corruption has mushroomed at all levels of government.

The NFP is concerned about the underspending of more than R15 million for infrastructure backlog grants, especially when we have so many hospitals, clinics, schools and roads that are in a bad state. We are also concerned about an additional R237 million underspend on the job front. Having said that, to add to this, we have to consider the poor performance by most of our SOEs.

As far as SAA is concerned, we were pleased this morning when we saw the chief executive officer pledging to work hard to bring about a turnaround within the SAA. We hope that that will work. As far as the magnitude of state capture revelations and the general culture of impunity is concerned, we are faced with this reality and we need to ask ourselves what possible solutions may help transform our economic landscape.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 148

The NFP, first and foremost, believes that we must ensure that our education curriculum - both at the basic and tertiary level - is career-oriented and that the state provides free quality education for all.

Secondly, the NFP believes that government should foster a close working relationship with the private sector to create an environment that encourages entrepreneurs to invest in the township- and rural-based economy.

We believe that government must put in place well-consolidated fiscal and monetary policies and also assist emerging businesses to obtain financing from banks and ... [Time expired.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Let's allow hon Madisha to move from his seat. Hon Kwankwa was supposed to be here, but he is not here.

An HON MEMBER: Go Willie!

Mr W M MADISHA: Chairperson, the Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement presented by the Minister a month ago

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 149

was an unmitigated disaster. As a sequel to that, both Moody's and S&P Global have resolved that South Africa can never recover economically. The possibility of further credit ratings downgrades might cause South Africa to fall out of the Citigroup World Government Bond Index.

Having missed a prime opportunity to take decisive action in developing and presenting the Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement the penny now seems to have dropped. It now seems that fiscal consolidation is back on the table, given the kneejerk statement from the Presidency earlier this week promising to restore fiscal sustainability and stabilise debt.

So, where will the spending cuts be made? On our bloated civil service that is crowding out expenditure in other areas? Or our infrastructure budgets, including those of municipalities to face the knife?

On the revenue side, will we see a rise in the VAT rate, or an increase in personal income tax? The unfortunate reality is that after years of recklessness,

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 150

irresponsibility and irrationality, the gross mismanagement and abuse of the state, the corruption and destruction of the efficacy of our SOEs, poor policy choices that negate a recovery in economic growth, the rest of the world is recovering while we have reached a point where austerity measures are required. The problem is that this will certainly damage our economic growth prospects. Without urgent interventions to restore growth, we face being caught in a cycle of low growth and rising debt in the face of rising unemployment, poverty and need.

The rest of the world is in economic recovery, whilst we oscillate between recursion and stagnation. We need brave political leadership ... [Time expired.] ... and in the ANC, that we shan't have.

Mr S N SWART: Chairperson, The ACDP shares concerns that projected economic growth is down from 1,3% to 0,7% of GDP and this will impact negatively on the fiscal outlook, on job creation and on poverty alleviation.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 151

In February's budget then-Minister Pravin Gordhan stated that the central fiscal policy objective is to stabilise the national debt to GDP ratio by closing the budget deficit. The Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement, which we are considering today presents a shocking state of public finances. The projected reduction of tax revenue of R50,8 billion in this financial year will result in a fiscal slippage we were warned against. However, the figures snowball in the outer years, with tax revenue projected to fall short of projections by R69,3 billion in 2018-19 and R89,4 billion in 2019-20. We know debt service costs remain the fastest growing budgetary item, said to be R163,3 billion for this tax year. Now this is a matter of great concern and it is not sustainable in the long run, given the relatively low and small tax base in the country. It will also crowd out other socioeconomic spending priorities.

We also know that SOEs and particularly Eskom present significant threats to the fiscal outlook, given the substantial government guarantees that have been granted. Yet we see ongoing wastage and irregular expenditure such as been unearthed in the Eskom inquiry. Eskom appears

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 152

totally reliant on an increase in tariffs to sustain it; yet, why should the requested 19% tariff increase be granted, given what appears to be significantly poor governance and state capture at the SOE.

It is no wonder then, and sadly, that S&P Global further downgraded South Africa's credit rating to full junk status last week, while its counterpart, Moody's, has placed the country on a review for a downgrade. This followed a similar sentiment by Fitch. The Moody's decision to put the country under review is a small but significant reprieve and we as South Africans need to take full grasp of where we are. It saved the country from being booted out of the Citigroup World Government Bond Index, which would have resulted in obligatory capital outflows from South Africa of between \$10 billion and \$14 billion - and you can imagine what impact that would have had on our currency.

Moody's stated that both low investor confidence and limit progress on structural reforms are rooted in the uncertainty created by the fluid and unpredictable political environment. We need to sort out policy

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 153

uncertainty and we need to sort out political environment. The ACDP believes that this is one way to solve our problems. [Time expired.]

Ms N M S MANANA: Chairperson, Ministers, Deputy Ministers, Members of Parliament and fellow South Africans, the 2017 Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement, MTBPS, asserts that restoring South Africa's potential growth rate requires additional policy measures. Rapid implementation of a range of microeconomic reforms, as outlined in the National Development Plan, NDP, would boost confidence and provide support to the economy. At the heart of the 2017 MTBPS and adjustment process is the importance of efficiency and productive spending. This is the focus of my speech this afternoon.

The Minister of Finance announced a revenue shortfall amounting to R50,8 billion in 2017-18. There is no opportune moment to talk about this importance of efficient and productive spending than this one.

Difficult situations like these should humble, unite and propel us to find efficient and productive ways of spending.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 154

Government has made significant investment in our state-owned enterprises, especially the SA Post Office and the SA Airways, SAA. Through this Budget, SAA receives R10 billion to meet its debt obligations and to facilitate its recapitalisation. The committee examined this process robustly, especially through the invaluable inputs from stakeholders. The committee has committed itself to hold regular and robust meeting with the new board at SAA to ensure that the R10 billion allocation yields tangible results. The committee will go at length to ensure that this allocation helps SAA to meet its debt obligations and become profitable.

The Department of Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation, DPME, outlined the principles and criteria for the priorities of the mandate paper as an instrument for funding the National Development Plan goals. The mandate Paper's objective is to establish the strategic framework for decision-making on budget priorities that are required to advance the goals of the National Development Plan. We welcome the proposed number of efficiency measures which form part of the mandate paper as approved by Cabinet in August 2017. We are of the view that the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 155

mandate paper and the mid-term budget propose tangible and concrete measures that will yield positive efficiency gains and value for money. Some of these measures include the following: cut noncore and nonperforming programmes; limit use of consultants; and improve returns and value for money on state infrastructure.

The Budget proposed specific measures that will help to resolve the challenge of backlogs in title deeds and bucket system. There is a proposed dedicated grant for the eradication of backlogs of title deeds and a grant to fund responses to emergencies in line with housing policy. We welcome these efficiency measures and we will help to ensure that the Department of Water and Sanitation succeeds its eradication of the bucket system, and that the Department of Human Settlements succeeds in dealing with the backlog of title deeds.

Government has committed to spend R300 billion each year on infrastructure projects per year. The mid-year Budget was very frank about challenges of inefficiency on infrastructure spending. It is in this context why we welcome the Budget facility for infrastructure, which is

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 156

intended to resolve shortcomings in the planning and execution of large infrastructure projects.

We continue to applaud the Budget for its ability to promote efficiency while at the same time protecting spending that deliver services to low income household. This is even more important given that 27,7% of our people are unemployed, whilst more than 30 million South Africans live on less than R1 000 per month. It is in this context that we welcome the input and recommendations by the United Nations Children's Fund, Unicef, in respect of ensuring that the Budget continues to protect the rights of children.

The United Nations Children's Fund welcomed the fact that despite revenue challenges government planned to grow the three key social sector - basic education, health and social protection - budgets by an average of almost 2% in real terms over the 2018 Medium-Term Expenditure Framework, MTEF.

We are aware that a lot of work is underway and that the 2018 national Budget will announce additional measures

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 157

for promoting efficiency and productive spending. We await these measures and we will examine them and pledge our support in due course. Efficient and productive spending means that spending of public resources must be with as little waste as possible; must touch and improve the lives of as many South Africans as possible; and must improve the quality and speed at which service delivery reached our people.

The Public Service Commission, PSC, proposed measures to ensure effective and efficient performance within the Public Service in the medium-term. These measures include: addressing duplications between departments; secondment programme for underperforming departments or where there are capacity constraints; empowerment of officials at service delivery points with the necessary delegations to swiftly deal with obstacles; review of the reporting arrangements of public entities to make them more accountable; appointment of suitably qualified individuals on boards, based on merit; and enactment of a single overarching Act - the State Owned Entities Act.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 158

In conclusion, I wish to close by re-emphasising that this is our country, this our economy and this is our Budget. Let us pull together and pull to the same direction. Let us support the 2017 Adjusted Appropriation Bill. The ANC supports this Bill. I Thank You.

[Applause.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Those of you who have worked as trade unionists, you know that when shop stewards have been negotiating, there is a point at which they must report back. Your shop steward wishes to thank the employer for meeting the workers halfway and indeed the agreement has been reached. You will have your Christmas. [Applause.] You will see the media statement of how such negotiations were concluded. I wish to thank the members of the Committee on Members' Interest for having worked hard, even to threaten that they were not going to vote for some adjustments today if this matter was not resolved. But I wish that you now withdraw the threats and do what is honourable. Thank you very.

Dr C Q MADLOPHA: There is no point of order but I would like to know how much your commission is.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 159

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): It is in the statement. I would now like to recognise hon McCloughlin.

Mr A R MCLOUGHLIN: Hon House Chairperson, members of the opposition in this House are regularly told by members of the ruling party who their constituencies are. However, when I go to my constituency I find it strange that I see none of those people referred to by the ANC. What I do see are ordinary everyday South Africans, mostly poor people, mostly those who are referred to by the hon Minister of Finance as the marginalised majority. People who the ANC claim to care for.

If one were to look at the 2017 Adjustments Appropriation Bill, one would expect to find provisions in the adjustments to the Appropriation of State Resources that would reflect as claimed care for the poor. However, having done so myself, I regret to report that I am sadly disappointed to see that my constituency were not considered when the hon member applied his mind to this Bill.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 160

It has been said that the path out of poverty lies along the road of education. If we had seriously addressed the long term goal in eradicating poverty, we must surely start with basic education. Our children need schools that are conducive to learning, staff by educators who are passionate about education.

This Bill reflects this government is indifferent to the future of our children. A downward revision of R415 million can only illustrate that this department is floundering. This government has in the past repeatedly boasted about how much it spends on basic education. It is true, why then do we achieve such poor result? For a start, if you visit a public school, you will find toilets that are in an appalling state. Broken bowls and cisterns, water if there is any, leaking everywhere, floors splattered with excrement, broken doors and windows, broken desks, no sport facilities, no libraries, paint peeling off the walls, weeds growing through the paving stones, in short, dilapidation and disrepair. What child would be inspired to be educated under such conditions?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 161

How, hon Minister does the reduction in the budget for basic education help the poor? The poor people of this country rely on social grant to stave off the ravages of hunger and to preserve their human dignity. The DA has lowered the ground system that we have in place and hon Karen Jooste is our ardent advocate for substantially higher grounds for the deserving and needy. You, hon Minister, have decided that the reduction of this department's budget by R350 million is a good idea. You and the Cabinet have clearly forgotten what it is to struggle, to make ends meet, to feed hungry children or pay outstanding school fees or clothing account. How does the reduction in the budget for the Department of Social Development help the poor?

The largest number of crime victims in this country is to be found amongst the ranks of the marginalised majority. It is those who have the least to other most vulnerable and the most needing or effect to an efficient policing. The rape statistics in this country are staggering. Our policing of rape are so inadequate that there is only two out of every 100 rapists that will ever serve jail time for their crimes. Isn't it surprise that rape is such a

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 162

prevalent crime in South Africa? South Africa has an average of 52 murders per day and in any country this must surely be unacceptable. And hardly needs saying but it is always the poor who are the most likely people to become the victims of rape and murders. How hon Minister, does the reduction of R264 million in the budget for the police help the poor?

Health care is also of prime importance to the country's poor and needy. All those who cannot afford to pay a doctor have no choice but rely on the state for medical services. Although the health budget is being cut, it has certainly not been given a serious consideration either. An increase of just less than R20 million will hardly solve the problems experienced in every hospital and clinic in the land.

We all make mistakes, however, when the Department of Health incurs unbudgeted expenditure of more than R1,2 billion paying out claims for professional negligence, some drastic action is surely called for. What we get - blame shifting. It is all the fault of the lawyers who overzealously pursue their clients' claims. If this issue

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 163

alone were properly addressed, the department will be far better funded and able to carry out its mandate. How, hon Minister does this increase in the budget of health help the poor?

However, it is also necessary to look at the other side of the coin. If the money that is being taken from certain budgets was then being applied to address more deserving issues, it would make sense. So, where is the money going? My colleagues, hon Alf Lees and hon David Maynier have addressed the issue of the huge bailout of SA Airways and presented our position. My question is: How many of the marginalised majority will ever have the opportunity to use these services provided by SAA? How hon Minister does giving SAA the mindboggling sum of R10 billion help the poor?

Who else benefits? The SA National Defence Force is one beneficiary. This Bill allocates an additional R381 million for the compensation of employees to defence force that pays millions of rand every year for the hiring of security guards because it is unable to guard

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 164

its own installations. How hon Minister does this increase in the defence budget help the poor?

So, here we are again, being asked to condone yet another avoidance of carrying out our core functions of giving effect to the Bill of Rights and holding the Executive to account. We are in a fact asking those whom we represent, mainly the poor, to give up their skins and hope of retaining their bones. How hon Minister will this help the poor?

It is time for a new beginning; it is time for a DA-led government in South Africa. I thank you. [Applause.]

Mr N E GCWABAZA: Hon House Chairperson, the ANC rises to present to the House and support the Adjustment Appropriation Bill 2017.

IsiZulu:

Asikubalule ukuthi le mali eyabiwa kabusha njengoba unyaka wezimali ngowezi-2017-18 uphakathi akuyona imali entsha etholwe nguhulumeni kodwa imali ebikade ivele

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 165

ikhona eMnyangweni eyahlukene futhi ekade iziqhuba izinhlelo zokusebenza kule Minyango.

Kukhona iMinyango eveze ukuthi ibingakayisebenzisi ingxenye yale mali eyabelwa yona ekuqaleni kwalonyaka wezimali ngoNhlolanja 2017. Ngakho ke kufanele le Ndlu enkulu yesiShayamthetho kuZwelonke ivume ukuthi le Minyango ebalwayo kuloMthethosichibiyelo isebenzise imali kwezinye izinhlelo eziphuthumayo.

English:

This adjustment to appropriation is the demonstrations of the ANC commitment to efficient delivery of social services such as education, health, housing, water and Sanitation, and social grants. It is a demonstration of the ANC's commitment to the process of providing free postschool education and training to poor and working class students, hon Manier, as envisaged in the Freedom Charter. This will ensure a better educated and better skilled generation of young South Africans capable of lifting the economy and social standards to higher levels.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 166

More importantly, it demonstrates that the ANC government is committed to turning the economy towards faster and inclusive growth in order to create decent jobs as a direct response to the current difficult fiscal and economic environment, which the Minister of Finance spoke about frankly and honestly during his Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement on 25 October.

IsiZulu:

Kukhona ivesi ebhayibhelini elithi laNkulunkulu ethi khona "abantu bami bayabhubha nmgexa yokuswela ulwazi." Thina ke singuKhongolose asizifihli izinto eziyingqinamba kubantu bakithi senze sengathi konke kuhle kanti kukhona okungahambi kahle. Kungaleso sizathu i-ANC ibone kukuhle ukuthi isibeke isimo njengoba sinjalo kodwa ingagcini lapho. Iqhubeke ibeke imibono nemigomo ezilandelwa ukuze lesi simo sishintshe ngokushesha kwakhiwe umnotho.

English:

To this end, the process of land expropriation must be expedited and the implementation of radical economic transformation cannot be delayed. The ANC cannot allow radical economic transformation to be ridiculed by those,

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 167

whose economic fortunes were bestowed to them through colonial, and apartheid oppression, exclusion and exploitation of the black majority. [Applause.]

While we rebuild business and consumer confidence in the economy and in governance and as we act speedily to create policy certainty, we cannot bend to those who want to dictate, what and who should sit at the epicentre of our fiscal and economic policies and thus relegate radical transformation and inclusive growth and development of the economy to a pipe dream.

The ANC government recognises the importance of the manufacturing sector, which forms a basis of a modern economy, has the potential to raise productivity levels and drives innovation and structural change. Therefore, it is important to incentivise this sector so that it expands and contributes to sustainable growth and creating decent work. In this regard, a matter that requires urgent attention is an observation by some experts that both government and business have reduced overtime investment in research and development. The result is that domestic production methods in the big

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 168

sectors of our economy, such as mining, manufacturing and agriculture are lurking behind those of other developing countries due to paucity in knowledge and IT economy and innovation. These two, they say, has an effect on how soon we can get out of the low economic growth.

IsiZulu:

Ukuze umnotho uthuthuke ngokushesha futhi ukhule ngokusabalala kufanele uhulumeni aqinise ukuxhasa osomabhizinisi abancane ama-SMMES kanye nalaba abenza ibhizinisi ngokubambisana [co-operatives] kakhulukazi amabhizinisi entsha kanye nomama. Futhi kuthuthukiswe ezomnotho ezindaweni zasemakhaya. Ukwanda kwabantu abasebenzayo kuzokwandisa abantu abakhokha intela bese kuxazulula inkinga yokuncipha kwentela. Lokhu okwenzeke kulo nyaka ophezulu. Ukwanda kwemali yentela kwenza uhulumeni akwazi ukufeza izidingo zomphakathi ngokwanelisayo kodwa kufanele sikuveze nokuthi kukhona abanikazi bezimboni ezinkulu abashushumbisa imali yalapha eNingizimu bayoyifihla emazweni angaphandle ngenhloso yokungayikhokhi intela. Ngalokho bakhinyabeze uhulumeni kanye nabantu balapha eMzansi. [Ubuwelewele.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 169

Le mali ethukuswa ongxiwankulu emazweni angaphandle yakhiwa yizithukuthuku zabesebenzi bakuleli lizwe. Ingqondo yenu igcwele ama-Gupta ...

English:

... to the extent that you can't even think outside that and see the reality.

Mr T RAWULA: On a point of order, Chair. No, he is casting aspersion. He says ... [Inaudible.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order, hon members! Hon member, can you please take your seat.

Mr T RAWULA: He says our brain is full of the Guptas.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Can you take your seat.

Mr T RAWULA: Your brain is full of the Guptas.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Proceed, hon member.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 170

IsiZulu:

Mnu N E GCWABAZA: Asevelile amagama ezinye zezinkampani ezinkulu ezenza le mikhuba.

Ms M S KHAWULA: Point of order.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): What is the point of order, hon member?

Ms M S KHAWULA: The point of order is the Rule 45.

[laughter.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon member, can you take your seat.

IsiZulu:

Nk M S KHAWULA: Cha, ngicela ahoxhise le ndaba ukuthi ingqondo igcwele ama-Gupta. Usengumphrofethi noma useyisangoma sikaZuma. [Ubuwelewele.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon member, I have a right to switch off your microphone if you just stand up and talk without being recognised.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 171

IsiZulu:

Nk M S KHAWULA: Ngiyayaxolisa. Sengicela ukukhuluma.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): There is no one that was referred to except "abantu" which was not actually specifically saying who. It was generally as you also made a statement on your own. Can you please take your seat, mam' uKhawula.

IsiZulu:

Nk M S KHAWULA: Ukhona obekhuluma ngapha emuva. Akasho ukuthi usho bani.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Can you please take a seat. Proceed, hon member.

IsiZulu:

Mnu N E GCWABAZA: Siyakuthokozela ke thina bakaKhongolose ukuthi selizophenywa ngokuphuthumayo lolu daba lokufihlwa kwemali emazweni angaphandle ukuze kunqandwe labo somabhizinisi ababaleka nemali yentela kule lizwe.

English:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 172

Obviously, the DA in the person of hon Manier did not hear that the manufacturing sector as applauded the Minister of Finance, hon Gigaba for pointing out the need to incentivise this sector so that it can help create jobs and grow the economy. The DA has not heard also that the Business Leadership SA took a decision a few months ago to invest in job creation in collaboration with government. They also have not heard that there is a new R1 billion investment in South Africa's economy and that the Ford Company has also added a new investment in the manufacture of their cars. All they see is gloom and doom. [Interjections.]

Now, the state-owned enterprises, for instance, the SA Airways, SAA, has a new Board and a new executive. It is stabilising and it has embarked on the turnaround strategy. [Interjections.] Let us inform you that SAA has reported that in the next few years, it is going to create more than 53 000 jobs. [Interjections.] Does that sound like a zombie, hon Manier? [Interjections.] Eskom ... yes, you are rubbish. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order!

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 173

Mr N E GCWABAZA: Eskom ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order, hon member!

Can you please talk a bit lower so that all of us can hear? I am talking to all of you, hon members. Hon member, you can proceed.

Mr D J MANIER: You are talking rubbish.

Mr N E GCWABAZA: Yes, all of you are rubbish.

[Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): No, no, hon member. Order! Hon Gcwabaza, can you please withdraw that. It's unparliamentary.

Mr N E GCWABAZA: Hon House Chairperson, I sincerely withdraw and I apologise.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Thank you very much.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 174

Mr M N PAULSEN: Chairperson, I note the inconsistency. Yesterday, I said rubbish and you called me to order. Today, an individual here, hon member has said rubbish and you are saying nothing. He is reacting only because he is being provoked here.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Thank you, hon Paulsen, I haven't heard. Hon Manier, can you please stand up. Did you say rubbish to the hon member on the podium?

Mr D J MAYNIER: Speaker, I have said rubbish to the hon member and I think it's justified.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Can you please withdraw?

Mr D J MAYNIER: I withdraw.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon members, I think really at times, let's just behave in an honourable manner.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 175

Mr N E GCWABAZA: Eskom has just announced that in the next three years, it will create 10 000 jobs in the Mpumalanga province and they are in the process of consulting communities on how these communities can participate. The ANC supports the Adjustments Appropriation Bill. Thank you. [Applause.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon members, there used to be a programme, may be some of you were still young or you never bothered, which said 'Mind your language'. Can I remind you, mind your language? Just remember what is parliamentary and not parliamentary.

IsiZulu:

USolwazi N M KHUBISA: Sihlalo weNdlu kube kwaba nokuphazamiseka okuncane okwenzekile kulungu elihloniphekile uKhawula ngoba simkhonzile, kodwa manje ucaphune u-Rule 45 kanti u-Rule 45 ukhuluma ngokuhlangana kwethu nje lapha.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): That is why hon member I said it has nothing to do with Rule 45 on what she was saying.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 176

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Chairperson, many among the opposition today has wasted a golden opportunity to engage on the serious and urgent issues facing our nation with regard to our economic and fiscal outlook.

[Interjections.]

The hon Maynier chose to ignore the grim facts we presented in relation to inequality - the high concentration of wealth in white hands in our country - by focusing on side issues that will neither grow the economy nor create jobs. In a manner typical of the lame grandstander that he is, he failed to put forward a consistent and comprehensive response to what was acknowledged as a very frank Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement. [Interjections.]

This Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement did not only end at highlighting the difficult outlook, but also extensively outlined our plans for industrialisation and for igniting our manufacturing sector ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon members, could you please talk in a soft way, if possible, so that you

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 177

don't drown out the speaker. Don't scream at a member who is at the podium. Hon Minister, you can proceed.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: The Medium-Term Budget Policy Statements, MTBPS, did not only end up highlighting a difficult economic and fiscal outlook, but also extensively outlined our plans for industrialisation and reigniting our manufacturing sector. It dealt with public procurement reforms, reforms of state-owned companies and made proposals on how to address the challenges faced at municipal and provincial government levels.

The MTPBS also addressed infrastructure investments, outlining R948 billion infrastructure expenditure over the Medium-Term Expenditure Framework, constituting 5,9% of GDP. It outlined plans to improve tax administration, and also dealt with transformation of the financial sector, which includes the insurance Bill passed on Tuesday by this very House, but opposed alone by the DA, that bulwark of the status quo and racial inequality in our country. [Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 178

In the MTBPS, we announced that given the fiscal outlook we presented, there was a need to bear in mind two things. First, we must act urgently to boost confidence and grow the economy by applying the levers at our disposal, many of which involve implementing structural reforms.

Second, we announced that in order to confront our challenges, government had agreed on a presidential fiscal committee which would focus ... [Interjections.] Firstly, in terms of offsetting revenue shortfalls and reducing borrowing, the contingency reserve was pared down to R16 billion over the next three years. Secondly, it would consider fiscal efforts - a mix of expenditure cuts and revenue increases - to address some of the revenue shortfall over the MTEF period. Thirdly, we announced that over the medium term, government would maintain the ceiling of noninterest expenditure. And, fourthly, government recognised that the best way to ensure the sustainability of public finances was to achieve higher economic growth.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 179

All of this that we have said has been curiously, if not mysteriously, ignored by several opposition leaders who claim we did not outline plans to stabilise the debt. The hon Madisha presented a hopeless untruth in his speech. To imagine that he used to lead our revered Cosatu leaves one frustrated with disappointment. I am indebted to the hon Swart of the ACDP for enlightening the hon Madisha that Moody's didn't downgrade us and that we have not been excluded from the World Government Bond Index. Evidently, our fractious politics are robbing our people of the chance to get the leadership they deserve from those they voted as their public representatives, especially on my left side.

The economic slowdown requires a united response to grow our economy inclusively and create jobs. And, towards that end, we will have to embark on fiscal consolidation measures to cut expenditure by R25 billion, enhance revenue by R15 billion, implement fee-free higher education in a fiscally sustainable manner, and implement, at the same time, economic stimulus measures that will reignite our economy.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 180

Everybody knows that we announce on Budget day the detail of these measures. Our economy will turn around. We will not always be in this situation. A brighter day beckons for our country and people. South Africans must simply brush aside the message of despondency and gloom that the main opposition are trying to spread across the country.

We must pool our efforts and resources together to lift our country out of the difficult situation in which we currently are. Even in our bleakest moments, we must not tear ourselves apart or drown ourselves in our own message of doom and gloom. It is important for our people to remain focused on the tasks before us to boost confidence and grow the economy.

It is important for our people to understand that when you are in a situation as difficult as the one you are in, it's necessary to remain positive and to act in unison to address the challenges that you are facing and to ensure you lift yourself out of that difficult moment.

The message we have spread and that we have communicated to investors during the international road show and that

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 181

we have spread to the ratings agencies is that we are prepared to take the tough decisions and that those tough decisions do not have to wait until the national conference of the ruling party. The difficult decisions are being taken now even as we speak.

As we outline the framework of some of the decisions that need to be taken, those decisions are being taken and will be taken. However, it is not fiscal consolidation and more fiscal consolidation that we need to focus all our efforts on. Rather, we need to focus all our efforts on growing our economy by implementing structural reforms, which include reforms of state-owned companies, and by addressing the challenges in the mining and telecommunications sectors and in the entire fiscal framework. This includes implementing the much-required public procurement reforms that will ensure that we can support growth in our economy, in the SMME sector and in the corporative sector, and so that we can transform the ownership patterns of our economy to ensure we bring on board the large majority of our people who remain excluded from economic participation.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 182

Ultimately, implementing radical economic transformation will take us to where we need to be as the economy. Thank you very much. [Applause.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Thank you, hon Minister. That concludes the debate on the 2017 Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement and the First Reading debate on the Adjustments Appropriation Bill.

Hon Kwankwa?

Mr N L S KWANKWA: House Chair, I want to apologise. I know my name was called earlier. I was held up in a meeting elsewhere and I ended up losing track of time. You must respect the House. You must.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Thank you very much for respecting the House. Unfortunately, you missed your slot. Thank you, hon member.

Are there any objections to the Adjustments Appropriation Bill being read a first time?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 183

HON MEMBERS: Yes.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): I now put the question as there are objections. Those in favour will say aye.

HON MEMBERS: Aye.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Those against will say no.

HON MEMBERS: No.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): I think the ayes have it.

Mr M WATERS: Chairperson, the DA calls for a division. Thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): A division having been called, the bells will be rung for five minutes.

[BELLS RUNG FOR FIVE MINUTES.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 184

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order, hon members! I would like to remind members that they may only vote from their allocated seats. When required to do so, members must simply indicate their vote by pressing the appropriate button below the yes, no or abstain signs. If a member inadvertently presses the wrong button, the member may thereafter press the correct button. The last button pressed will be recorded as the member's vote when the voting session is closed by the Chair.

Order! The question before the House is that the Adjustments Appropriation Bill be read a first time. Are all members in their allocated seats?

HON MEMBERS: Yes.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Voting will now commence. Those in favour of the Bill being read a first time should press the yes button. Those against should press the no button. Those wishing to abstain must press the abstain button. Have all members voted? Have all your

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 185

things been working? [Interjections.] I must just check.
Thank you. The voting session is now closed.

Order! The results of the division are as follows:

[TAKE IN FROM MINUTES.]

Question agreed to.

Bill accordingly read a first time.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): The Secretary will
now read the 9th Order.

The MINISTER OF SMALL BUSINESS DEVELOPMENT: A point of
privilege, Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): What's the point
of privilege, hon member?

The MINISTER OF SMALL BUSINESS DEVELOPMENT: This is a
point of privilege, Chair, which I think is also of
national interest. The DA walked out, but now they have

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 186

come back so maybe they might explain to us why one of their members says that Patricia de Lille speaks nonsense.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Well, hon member, I'm not sure whether that point of privilege ... [Interjections.] ... the Chief Whip of the DA would like to respond to.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: I don't quite know how to respond because I don't think it is a point of privilege. But, perhaps, the Minister would like to tell us why the Deputy President says that his President talks rubbish. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Well ... Order, hon members! I think those points of privilege and responses are not relevant to the day and in terms of what we have to do.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Thank you very much. The secretary will read the Ninth Order.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 187

The MINISTER OF COMMUNICATIONS: On a point of privilege, Chair!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): What is the point of privilege, hon member?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNICATIONS: Here is my point of privilege, which I think is also of national interest: Since the DA walked out and now they came back, maybe they might explain to us why their member says Patricia De Lille speaks nonsense.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Well, hon member, I am not sure whether the Chief Whip of the Opposition would like to respond to that point of privilege.

The CHIEF WHIP OF OPPOSITION: I don't quite know how to respond because I don't think it is a point of privilege. However, perhaps the Minister would like to tell us why the Deputy President says that his President talks rubbish!

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 188

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order, hon members. I think those points of privileges and responses thereof are not relevant for the day and in terms of what we have to do. [Interjections.] Order, hon members! The secretary will read the Ninth Order.

VOTING PROCEDURE ON ADJUSTMENTS

(Objections, Questions and Declarations)

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon members, I wish to thank the parties for advising the staff on which Vote they will record their objections and on which they intend dividing. This information will greatly assist the process for this session. I must just warn you: It is going to be a very long session.

Hon members, the proceedings will initially take the form of a question and answer. I shall put each Vote in respect of which adjustments have been made and in turn, members will have the opportunity to ask questions to the relevant Minister in respect of these adjustments. Each party has been allocated a global time for all Votes.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 189

Members of the executive have up to two minutes to respond to a question.

There have been requests from some parties that in some instances they will use their allocated time to make declarations instead of asking questions. This will be allowed. Naturally, where a declaration instead of a question has been made, there will be no expectation for a reply from a member of the executive.

Once a party's time has expired, they will not be allowed to put further questions. Members must please press the top button if they wish to ask a question. Hon members should please wait until I recognise them before putting their question. Can I ask the NA Table to clear the speakers' list?

Order, hon members. We were just sorting out the technology here so that we don't confuse what was the list of the speakers. Hon Kubayi!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNICATIONS: House Chairperson, it is Kubayi-Ngubane!

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 190

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Kubayi-Ngubane, Mrs!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNICATIONS: Thank you! Chair, just to verify for clarity, so that we are very clear from Ministers' side: You are saying that there are certain members who have requested to make declarations or statements without questions. Will Ministers be able to respond as well? This is because sometimes in the declarations insinuations are made that may need clarification. They can't be left unclarified.
[Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Yes, hon members, that is why I said there is no expectation but if a member of the executive wish to respond, he/she has an opportunity to do so. I now put Vote 1 ...
[Interjections.] Order! Hon Chief Whip.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: My apologies, Chair! Just to be clarified: I hope the Table staff has the necessary capacity to accurately allocate time in all the slots of the various parties here so that we don't

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 191

sit here until next week. I know that as the ANC, we have 45 minutes allocated to all 37 votes. Equally, other parties have their allocated time too. I hope that we have the capacity to manage the times.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Certainly we do, hon Chief, and I will really advice parties to remember that they have got global time. So, once your time is finished, you will not be given any slot.

ADJUSTMENTS APPROPRIATION BILL

(Consideration of Votes and Schedule)

Vote No 1 - The Presidency - put.

Declaration(s) of vote:

Mr S C MOTAU: Hon Chair, there are at least nine million reasons why the DA must object to the adjusted appropriation of R500 million for Budget Vote 1: The Presidency. The latest junk status rating by Standard and Poor's and Moody's is placing South Africa on downgrade review amounting to a vote of no confidence in the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 192

mysterious Presidential Fiscal Committee, Mr Jacob Zuma and Minister of Finance, Malusi Gigaba.

Why should we in this House approve budgets so that Mr Zuma and his large band of bodyguards can throw their weight around the corridors of this precinct in the name of security? They must know that as members of this National Assembly, we do not report or account to Mr Zuma. On the contrary, he, as the so-called President of South Africa must report and account to Members of this Parliament. We do not support this appropriation.

[Applause.]

The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY: Chair, it is totally misleading that Vote 1 wants R500 million adjustments. It is totally untrue. It is only R6 million required for employees' initiated severance packages. The rest, which is about R5 000 is a shifting of funds from one province to the other province. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon members, can you please talk lower so that we can hear the replies as well. [Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 193

The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY: So, that's the crunch of my reply that it is not R500 million but R6 million - one, two, three, four, five, six! That is for the payment of severance packages.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon members, Vote 2: Parliament, has not been adjusted ... [Interjections.]

Mr M WATERS: On a point of procedure, Chair. Are you going to put the question about the vote?

[Interjections.] Not, yet; at the end?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Not yet.

[Interjections.] That is why I explained earlier, that you are going to be here for a long day. We are starting with the question, and then after we finish with the question, we come back for the decision on votes.

Mr M WATERS: Okay!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Yes!

[Interjections.] Unfortunately these are the proceedings

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 194

for today. Hon members, order! Vote 2 has not been adjusted. In fact it ... [Interjections.]

Ms D CARTER: Chair! Chair, I have heard my hand up for a question.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): For which vote did you have your hand up?

Ms D CARTER: For Vote 1!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Vote 1; sorry ma'm. I will allow you to ask your question but I asked members to please press their talk button.

Ms D CARTER: I did!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Well, it didn't reflect here. You can proceed.

Ms D CARTER: It is still showing. Okay! Chairperson, the purpose of this vote includes enhancing the integrity of the state which has been soiled by state capture. What

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 195

actions are proposed to re-establish the integrity of the Office of the Presidency and the state?

The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY: That comment has nothing to do with the issue of the adjustment. This session is the adjustment of funds from the department. So, I won't respond to that question.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): IFP, you had indicated an interest earlier on the list. If you are waiving your right, it is okay. The ANC! You are also waiving your right ...

Mr M HLENGWA: Sorry madam! What are you on about?

IsiZulu:

Ngoba manje ngikubona uya phambili, futhi usiya emuva. Angisazi ukuthi siphil.

English:

What's your clarity? [Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 196

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order, hon members! I did indicate ... [Interjections.] I did indicate that parties have given us indication of where they would want to speak. However, I also asked members to press their talk button so that I can recognise them because within parties, it could be different members that take different votes. Hence, we asked you to please press your talk button. So, when I didn't see any, I moved to Vote 2.

Hon members, Vote 2 has not been adjusted. In fact, it is not even reflected on the schedule for the Bill. I know move to Vote 3.

Vote No 3 - Communications - put.

Questions/Declarations of vote:

Prof N M KHUBISA: Chairperson, we will use our minute on the next order.

Ms D CARTER: Chair, Parliament is elected to represent the people and to ensure government by the people under a Constitution. Do you believe that Parliament is

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 197

sufficiently capacitated financially and other to carry out its functions, duties and responsibilities to the people?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNICATIONS: House Chair, she is talking about Vote No 2, not Vote No 3!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Thank you. The DA!

Ms P VAN DAMME: Chair, this department reminds me of the song, *Akanamali, kodw' uthanda yonke, yonke into engeyiyo!* This is a department that came in the beginning of the year and said ...

IsiZulu:

... abanamali! Abanamali yokwenza umsebenzi wabo.

Abanamali yokuvala izikhwewu zemisebenzi yabo, kodwa ke

...

English:

... a few months later, R2 million was spent on buying two fancy cars for the Deputy Minister: A Jaguar XF 2017; and a Mercedes Benz 250. We are not saying that Ministers

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 198

must not drive cars. You must not be driving fancy cars. The Premium of the Western Cape drives a VW Kombi, so can you! We will not allow that people's money would be spent on fancy cars. If you want a fancy car, use your own money. We are not supporting the Vote! [Applause.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNICATIONS: Are you South African? Clearly, hon Van Damme is missing her days in clubbing. [Interjections.] I mean that is what precise clubbing people do. Chair, in terms of the adjustment: It is R11,3 million for Digital Terrestrial Television, DTT, specifically. Hon Van Damme, I think you missed it: Digital Terrestrial Thing! [Interjections.]

So, that is the adjustment! [Interjections.] Yes, it is the adjustment, not for the cars. That is what is done. Indeed, Chair, we welcome this adjustment because it is very critical in terms of our migration project. It is very critical for us to be able to move as South Africa, from analogue to digital. Hence, we are very appreciative of the adjustment from Treasury. Thank you very much.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 199

Vote No 4 - Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs - put.

IsiZulu:

Usolwazi N M KHUBISA: Sihlalo bengifisa ukubuza uNgqongqoshe ukuthi udaba lolu lukagesi olukade lukhulunywa nguSalga noMnyango kanye noMgcinimafa KaZwelonke luyalunga yini?

English:

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS (Mr A C Nel): Chairperson, clearly the question does not relate to the adjustments, but I would just like to say that the question of the debt owed by municipalities to Eskom is indeed a very serious matter. It is something that is being attended to by the interministerial committee on Eskom debt. We have reported to the portfolio committee on that and we have also recently had a very intense engagement with the portfolio committees on Water and Sanitation and Co-operative Governance as well as members of the Finance committee to also deal with the question of the water debt. Thank you very much.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 200

Vote No 5 - Home Affairs - put.

Mr N SINGH: Hon Chairperson, I note in the adjustments here R191 million for upgrading of offices and I've raised a question of poor infrastructure at some of the Department of Home Affairs offices before; and then an amount of R879,4 million for production and issuing of passports. This morning I raised a question of the Refugee Amendment Bill and Facilities for Asylum Seekers. I would just like to know from the department whether or not the funds that have been allocated to them, including the adjustments, are sufficient to meet their constitutional obligations. Thank you.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS: House Chair, the hon Singh has raised the matter related to the historical underfunding of the department over and over again. Just to give you an idea of how underfunded we have been, historically, if you consider that Correctional Services, for example, has 22 000 staff members and their clients are the just under 200 000 inmates in our prisons, and Sars has 15 000 personnel and theirs is a tax payer population. Home Affairs has as its client base

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 201

55 million South Africans and foreign nationals who are in the country, all of them - those who wish to come to the country - as well as all our banks, our insurance companies and very many government departments. For all of that we only have 9 800 personnel. So, historically, this underfunding is quite a huge issue. But, luckily, on 1 March 2017 Cabinet approved the business case which will allow, hopefully, Home Affairs to fulfil its full mandate.

Let me just say, with this adjusted appropriation we have also been given R264 million by the SAPS for the Automated Biometric Identification System, Abis, which will enhance the Crime and Justice Security cluster.

As far as the appropriations are concerned, of course we have a trading account which we get back the money that we generate for documents that we produce in order to pay for those productions. So, we obviously thrilled that that money is coming back to us, but also that the National Treasury has revised the R100 million earmarked for authorisation that will be coming back to us. Thank you.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 202

Vote No 6 - International Relations and Cooperation -
put.

Mr B L MASHILE: I have pressed the talk button there on Home Affairs and I have been ignored.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Let us just use the show of hands because it does seem that there is a problem with the talk button. I'm sorry hon member I will allow you the time.

Mr B L MASHILE: House Chair, the Department of Home Affairs has received and improved audit opinion. The question that needs to be responded to is: How does the department's performance compare to that improved audit opinion and how have they fared in terms of the target. Thank you very much.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS: We have empirical instruments that we use to measure our performance targets. I might add that our performance targets have systematically improved since 2014 when we met 70% of our targets, 81% in the next year and this year a whopping

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 203

84%, but the real measure of our success can be found in the myriad of the compliments that we get. I've got four pages of compliments that we have received from the members of the public just this year and I may add that they come from across section of the citizenry. We are very pleased that we can use this as our measure of success.

One such message I might just want read to the House it is from Mr Lucky Maringa who went to our offices in Pretoria and he says, "it took me less than 15 minutes to collect my identity document, ID, card including all the admin; well done for great service". Thank you very much.

Vote No 7 - National Treasury - put.

Mr S P MHLONGO: Madam Chair, the EFF would like to make a declaration.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): You can make it from where you are.

Declarations of vote:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 204

Mr S P MHLONGO: The EFF rejects the budget adjustments for Budget Vote No 7 on National Treasury. Minister Gigaba had a spectacular opportunity to free himself from the influence of Mr Zuma and the Gupta family when he got appointed as Finance Minister. He could have insisted on the independence of the National Treasury by refusing all attempts to have this important institution captured by these toxic individuals in the form of Zuma and the Guptas. However, he now proved to all and sundry that he is an integral part of that corrupt network. Just a few weeks ago ... [Interjections.]

Mr B A RADEDE: Chairperson, on a point of order: I am rising on Rules 84 and 86. The member has cast aspersions on the President of the Republic and the Minister himself. Please.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon member, in your statement you state it as fact without putting it in a substantive statement. Can you please withdraw? You know that in order to do that, you have to do it in a substantive statement. Also, you cannot cast aspersions on members.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 205

Mr S P MHLONGO: Madam Chair, will you please clarify what I should withdraw?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon member, you made a statement about the Minister. You also made a statement about the President.

Mr S P MHLONGO: No, but the statement about the President is a common fact. The President remains a fugitive.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon member, there is no common fact about the President, unless it ...

Mr S P MHLONGO: I will withdraw, madam Chair. Let me withdraw. I withdraw.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: House Chair, I rise on a point of order: Based on Rules 84 and 85 as well, the President is not a fugitive in this country.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): That is why I said the member must withdraw, and he has withdrawn.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 206

Mr S P MHLONGO: Madam Chair, just a few weeks ago the Treasury budget had resigned, citing massive influence and interference by Mr Zuma and the Guptas in aligning the budget of the country.

Under his leadership our country has recently been downgraded to junk status, which will make it even tougher for South Africans to eke out a living. We have an unemployment rate of almost 36%; almost 45% of young people are unemployed. We need a radical, well-thought-out plan to revive our economy, create jobs and feed our people. We don't have the slightest chance of doing that if our budget is still controlled by the Guptas through Minister Malusi. We reject this budget adjustment. I thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon member, again you made a statement which casts aspersions in terms of Rule 84, particularly your last sentence about how the Guptas are controlling the budget through the Minister. You know that is casting aspersions. Can you please withdraw?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 207

Mr S P MHLONGO: Madam Chair, I am failing to understand. When all evidence is out there ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon member, can you please withdraw?

Mr S P MHLONGO: However, I'll withdraw in the interest of progress.

Mr T RAWULA: Chair, on a point of order: I think you must take us through a workshop. How must we raise things?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): We will take you through a workshop indeed. [Interjections.]

Mr T RAWULA: No, because the reality is that the Ministers are at the door of corruption. [Interjections.] How must we phrase those things? [Interjections.] You see? What must we do? Stop protecting corruption!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon member, I commit indeed that, through the Chairperson of the Rules Committee, hon Mdakane, we will again organise another

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 208

workshop so that we take members through the Rules in order for them to understand it.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Chair, I thought the hon member had no question to ask, so ...

Mr S P MHLONGO: Madam Chair, on a point of order:

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... there is nothing to respond to as he was only waffling.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Yes, hon Minister, the reason I called you is because we had agreed earlier that Ministers may want to respond to declarations. If you don't wish to respond, that is okay.

Mr M WATERS: Chairperson, just on a point of clarity: ...

Mr T RAWULA: Chair ...

Mr M WATERS: May I rise on a point of clarity?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 209

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): There was somebody on a point of order first.

Mr T RAWULA: Chair ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): No, there is hon Mhlongo behind you.

Mr S P MHLONGO: Madam Chair, could you please call the Minister of Small Business, ma-kiep-kiep, [Popcorn] not to insult us ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order, hon member. You want me to call ...

Mr S P MHLONGO: No, man. I cannot take that thing. She's completely out of order!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order, hon Mhlongo. You want me to call ...

Mr S P MHLONGO: You're completely out of order, wena [you].

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 210

IsiZulu:

... asizukubhedelwa nguwe wena la ...

English:

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon Mhlongo ...

IsiZulu:

... Njomane ...

English:

You can't request a point of order and you too do something wrong in the process. Hon Waters, can I take the point of order that you have already given?

Mr T RAWULA: I stood up before he did. I also have a point of order.

Mr M WATERS: Chair, just on a point of clarity: As far as the ministerial responses are concerned, we know they have got two minutes. I was under the impression that the members would ask the Ministers a question or give a statement by way of a declaration. And at the end of that process, once all the parties have completed asking

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 211

questions, then the Minister would be given an opportunity to reply. I would just like to get some clarity, because if it's ... [Interjections.] ... no. Because, if it's for each single member, then it will be two minutes per reply and we are going to be here for a very long time.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order! Hon members, that's why I said in the beginning that you will be here for a long time. The Minister has two minutes for each question. That's the procedure. [Interjections.] Yes. It's not like members' statements.

Mr T RAWULA: Chair, on Rule 84. The Minister has just ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): I have not recognised you yet, hon Rawula. I'm still ... [Interjections.] Order! Can you take your seats? I'm still giving clarity on a question. Hon members, in respect of that question, hon Singh, do you want to pursue the question?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 212

Mr N SINGH: Hon Chair, yes. My understanding is the same as that of hon Waters, that in the committee we decided, and I think the Chief Whip of the ANC can confirm this, that the Ministers will be given a maximum of two minutes to respond - not per question, but to all the questions that arise out of that Budget Vote. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order, hon members. You don't sit in the Chief Whips forums, so allow the member to raise his point.

Hon member, it's two minutes per question. If there was a different understanding, then members of the Chief Whips forum have an opportunity to consult with each other outside. As for now, we shall proceed like this.

Hon Rawula, what is your point of order?

Mr T RAWULA: Chair, on Rule 84. The Minister just referred to hon Mhlongo as "waffling" and that is in contravention of Rule 84. If he proceeds like that he should be called to order.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 213

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon member, I will look at Hansard and rule thereafter.

The MINISTER OF SMALL BUSINESS DEVELOPMENT: Chairperson, I also have ... Chairperson. No, no, no.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon member, what is the point order?

The MINISTER OF SMALL BUSINESS DEVELOPMENT: Chairperson ...

IsiZulu:

... uyabona uma sila kule Ndlu le akukho-right ukuthi ...

English:

Mr T RAWULA: Order, Chair, she must state the rule. Which rule is she rising on?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon Rawula, please take your seat.

Mr T RAWULA: Which rule?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 214

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon Rawula, please take your seat. You are not presiding.

IsiZulu:

UNGQONGQOSHE WEZOKUTHUTHUKISA AMABHIZINISI AMANCANE:

Kuyahlonishwa la eNingizimu Afrika uma ungayazi inhlonipho uzofundiswa.

English:

Hon Chair ...

Mr T RAWULA: Which rule are you rising on?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon Rawula!

The MINISTER OF SMALL BUSINESS DEVELOPMENT: Hon Mhlongo, no matter how angry you can be ...

IsiZulu:

... la endlini akakwazi ukuthi athi "voetsek". Akakwazi ukusho njalo, akakwazi futhi kumele ahoxise. Akakwazi ukuthi "voetsek"

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 215

English:

Mr S P MHLONGO: Chairperson, on a point of order:

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon Mhlongo, did you use that word in the House?

Mr S P MHLONGO: No.

IsiZulu:

Angikaze Sihlalo. Ngisukume lana ngacela ukuthi ...

[Ubuwelewele.] ... uyangethuka lo mama lo. Awuzange umkhuze, uLindiwe uthetha ngathi kukwakhe la ...

English:

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order! Please take your seat, hon member.

IsiZulu:

Mnu S P MHLONGO: ... qha, ayilungile lento leyo.

English:

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order! Please take your seat, hon member. Hon members, unfortunately, seated

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 216

here, I could not hear the statement. And in terms of the rule you have to first ask a member whether he or she has made the statement referred to. Otherwise, we will check the Hansard to see whether we can pick it up from the recording. Unfortunately, seated here, with the noise levels, one may not always hear some of the things you say to one another.

Mr X MABASA: Chairperson, on a point of order: Hon Mhlongo should not refer to the Minister as Lindiwe. According to Rules 82 and 84, it is unacceptable and unparliamentary to refer to members in that manner.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon Mhlongo, can you refer to the Minister as honourable or Minister?

Mr S P MHLONGO: Is it parliamentary for that Minister to insult me?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): It is not and that is why I said ...

Mr S P MHLONGO: She must then withdraw!

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 217

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): No, hon Mhlongo. I said that because it was between the two of you I did not hear and I would have to reflect on the recordings and hear what ... [Interjections.] Hon members! The hon member on my left side who is making a noise, I did not give you the opportunity to speak. [Interjections.] No, he knows himself.

So, hon Mhlongo, on the matter between yourself and the hon Minister, I said I will reflect on the recordings, because I did not hear who said what between the two of you. In respect of calling a member by name, I think all of us know that you say Mr, Ms or hon. That's what we are asking you to withdraw.

Mr S P MHLONGO: For that I apologise and I withdraw.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Thank you very much.

Mr R A LEES: Chair, the appropriation for National Treasury includes the R10 billion proposed for South African Airways, SAA. This appropriation is a bailout

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 218

which only partly funds the R20 billion losses over the past five years plus the current year. Further bailouts of R3 billion are planned for next year. This R13 billion could have paid for ... 390 new schools, 56 000 3year bursaries for under graduates students. The Minister invoked seemingly for the first time in history section 16 of the Public Financial Management Act, to pay these funds to SAA, in advance. This, according to the parliamentary legal department was illegal and so we leave it to the Auditor-General to have an opinion.

We really urge that to avoid any further political interference with the new board which has such promise and a new executive which has indeed equally great promise that SAA be placed under business rescue and thereafter once stabilised be privatised. Thank you.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Chair, in the first instance, the hon member knows very well that invoking Section 16 of the Public Financial Management Act, PFMA, was not illegal. It is within the powers of the Minister to invoke Section 16 when an emergency arises which requires that a particular allocation be made.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 219

Secondly, the decision to pay... hon Chair, Mr Maynier says what I am saying is rubbish.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon Maynier, we can't continue in that fashion, can you please withdraw? Allow the Minister to respond. You have made a statement as a party.

Mr D J MAYNIER: Chairperson, the Minister is talking rubbish because a legal opinion...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): hon Maynier, hon Maynier, hon Maynier, can you withdraw. You know hon Maynier... we will have to take you out of this House if you continue with that attitude.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: secondly Chairperson, had we not acted in invoking section 16 it would have triggered other lenders at the SAA and even other state owned companies to also call their loans. We needed to act as expeditiously as we did in order to avoid that consequence and prevent the type of action which would

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 220

have created a serious and dire financial situation, Not only for the fiscus but for the country as a whole.

Thirdly, there are more than 10500 employees at SAA whose jobs were threatened by the risk of a default. These hon members did not want us to act to protect those jobs because they want to reduce the asset value of SAA so that it can be privatised at a pitted. They would be no privatisation of SAA.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order! You know when you all talk we can't hear. But you can all sing we will hear the melody.

Hon members, I wish to recognise the ten young school girls sitting in the gallery with their two coaches from African grassroots [16:08] who recently visited the USA for the sport diplomacy programme. You are welcomed to Parliament. [Applause.]

I am happy that you have decided to waive because I was going to call you to order that you don't clap hands when

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 221

you sit in the gallery. You are welcomed, you can take a sit.

Hon Member, earlier on after the point of clarity was raised on the amount of time for the executive to respond to the question I said if the Chief Whips consult they would then advise me. I am informed that the Chief Whips have consulted outside and they do indeed agree that in the meeting that they held on this matter they had agreed that questions will be asked by a number of parties who wish to make a question or a declaration and the member of the executive will respond in two minutes. They said.. yes. They said it was unfortunately the NA table that misunderstood that decision. So, you saw the Chief Whip of the Majority Party and all other Chiefs they went outside, they consulted amongst themselves and they come back. But I think also it would save the time for all of us because at this rate you can come out at midnight. hon member, I will recognise you.

Mr T RAWULA: Chairperson, for the record...

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 222

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon Rawula, you are not the only person who raises a point of order in this House. Hon Nel had already raised his hand.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: Chairperson, I think not to contest either the agreement or your ruling. But I just want to point out that I think it would be problematic that if this were to be taken as a precedent henceforth because in theory, you could ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): order, hon members, don't say why. He is still explaining why.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: In theory you could have 13 members from 13 different parties asking questions to a single Minister, who must then answer in two minutes. I think that is indeed problematic.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): I have noted that, hon Deputy Minister. I'm sure the Chief Whips will have to reflect on the issue that you have raised.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 223

Mr T RAWULA: Speaker, I raised my hand ahead of her. May I speak?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Please take your seat.

Ms M R SEMENYA: Chair, I want to concur with the Minister. We can't expect all parties to speak and allow the Ministers to respond in two minutes. That's unfair. If there is a need to vote on that, I propose that we vote.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon members, I don't think I will allow for any vote on that issue, because that in consultation among parties, including the Chief Whip of the Majority Party. They have all agreed on this.

Mr T RAWULA: Chair, firstly, we want to put on record that we have not been consulted; and secondly, we do not expect a response from a Minister when we are making declarations. We expect a response when we are asking questions. For the record, we have not been consulted as

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 224

the EFF. You must indicate which parties he has consulted with, because we would have sponsored that view in the Chief Whips Forum. Otherwise, as things stand, we were/have not been not consulted on that view.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order, hon members. Please take your seats.

Prof N M KHUBISA: Chairperson, I am not contesting the ruling, because we agreed upon it at the Chief Whips Forum, outside and also in ATC. However, I must also point out that I was not consulted with regard to the meeting that was held recently. I just wanted to point that out.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon members, can I just clarify. I am just explaining that, because there was a question of clarity raised in respect of a decision that was taken in the Chief Whips Forum together in the programming committee, the NA Table gave us a different guide seated/cited here in terms of how the process will be followed. That is why I said that the members of the Chief Whips Forum must go and consult. I hear some

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 225

members indicating that they were not consulted, but in terms of the decision that was made in the Chief Whips forum and in the programming committee was that in each and every vote when questions are asked they will be asked by those who wish you ask questions and those who wish to make a declaration and the member of the executive will then respond in two minutes. Yes, I take note the question that is being raised by hon Nel and it is not the first time the members of the executive have raised the same point even in respect of the member statements that such a process undermines the possibility of members of the executive to respond fully to a number of questions or statements that have been made. I want to say, as Presiding Officer, we will request that the Chief Whips together with the rules committee if necessary reflect on this issue that has been tabled from the executive's side. But for now, can I get your agreement that we proceed in the manner that has just been clarified? [Interjections.] I know it may not be so good for now, but it might be good for time for all of us who are here. I know that, hon Mokonyane, it is actually not a very nice one for the executive and I've noted that.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 226

Vote No 8 - Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation - agreed to (Democratic Alliance and Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Vote No 9 - Public Enterprises - put.

Declarations of vote:

Mr T RAWULA: The EFF rejects the budget adjustment to budget Vote No 9 on Public Enterprises. The current parliamentary enquiry on state capture has revealed more than anything that Minister Lynne Brown has been a primary enabler of corruption of our state enterprises for a long time.

It was under her watch that the mess at Eskom has escalated to the extent it has. She enabled Dudu Myeni Zuma, who was a Chair of SA Airways to dictate terms of what should happen at Eskom in order to ensure that the Gupta network of corruption spreads its corrosive tentacles around every reach of Eskom.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 227

It was under her watch that SA Airways has sunk deeper and deeper into ups of corruption, mismanagement and dysfunctional.

It was under her watch that the Transnet was captured by the network of corruption by the Gupta family. As a reward, she has had her partner bought expensive cars by the Gupta dynasty and treated to holiday in Dubai.

Lynne brown has sold her soul, her liberation credential for a slice of curry. The EFF cannot trust her. For even one day at the helm of state enterprises, we reject this budget adjustment.

Ms N W A MILEHAM: House Chair, the department of Public Enterprises is the shame of the nation. Under this department and under the watch of Minister Brown, our state-owned entities had been broken up into by such chance. So, it's easier for the monster that is state capture to divide it.

The Gupta emails handed up by me in this very House, to the Speaker and all implicated Ministers on 22 June 2017,

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 228

during a presidential questions session even implicated the Director-General of Public Enterprises, many referring to her as the boss. South Africa needs to know the truth. This department takes its instruction from nowhere other than Saxonworld. The Gupta brothers determine its cause of action and until such time as we take back control of our country, we simply cannot support the budget adjustment made by this department. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES: The Department of Public Enterprises has received a clean audit. We welcome the adjustment. It will enable the department to carry out its responsibility. Thank you. [Applause.]

Vote No 10 - Public Service and Administration - put.

Declarations of vote:

Mr W M MADISHA: Cope is concerned at the size of our bloated administration that crowds out a funding for other worthy causes. Secondly, Cope is concerned at the lack of action within the public service to detect,

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 229

prevent and combat corruption within the public service as evidenced by the extent of state capture.

Ms D VAN DER WALT: Chairperson, this outdated for ever in a never process of being amended ministerial handbook of 2007 must now more than ever be amended and finalise to take into consideration the current economic crisis in South Africa, specifically chapter five, dealing with vehicles for Ministers and their Deputies.

In March this year, we revealed that a staggering R41,9 million was spent on cars since 2014. This week, another R12 million spent on bling cars in the past six months became public. This total sum of R54 million spent on bling wheels for those earning between R1,9 million and R2,3 million per annum could have provided child support grant to 11 798 for one year or build 448 RDP houses or employ 299 SAPS officers or 215 additional nurses per year.

Driving around in porsches, costing the tax payer R1,3 million and other luxury vehicles has proven absolute non commitment to poor South Africans and to

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 230

cost containment measures. Bling cars, hon Sisulu, do not change the lives of poor people, jobs and service delivery does. [Applause.]

Vote No 11 - Public Works - put.

Declaration of vote:

Dr M J FIGG: Hon House Chair, we note that only 520 000 work opportunities have been created thus far in 1917-18 against a target of 1 406 736, R53 million in unspent funds has been declared, of which R38 million is in compensation of employees due to non filling of vacant posts. This poor performance comes at a time when 9,4 million South Africans are unemployed and struggling to survive.

The department has implemented a learnership programme that is an initiative to develop contractors and supervisors in the construction industry.

The department is thrilled that the programme that has been implemented since 2004 has developed a whole 578 contractures. It is also exited that the whole 34% of

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 231

these contractors trained through the programme have remained in business for three years or more. The department has also prioritise the spending of R2,49 million on two vehicles for the Minister. How can we support the frivolous and extravagance spending of funds that will only stop when the DA takes over in 2019? [Applause.]

The MINISTER OF PUBLIC WORKS: Hon Chairperson, I think the points expressed by the DA are noted in so far as the issue of the Expanded Public Works Programme, EPWP, targets against the performance below the targeted figure and so on. But that issue is being addressed precisely because it relates also to issues of institutional capacity which are matters that we are addressing.

The same issue also with regards to the issue of unspent funds and that is more to do with the question of vacant posts. That matter has been attended to and very soon, we will also be appearing before the portfolio committee for further updates on that particular issue.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 232

On the question of vehicles, that also is point to be noted and there is nothing one can say about it. Thank you.

Vote No 12 - Statistics South Africa - agreed to.

Vote No 13 - Women - put.

Declarations of vote:

Ms L L VAN DER MERWE: Hon House Chair, this department received an operating budget of only R128 million and because of its top heavy structure, it's only able to pay salaries with that money. Its core programmes are under funded and therefore ineffective.

It has its core mandate that of monitoring and evaluation. But it doesn't have a monitoring or evaluation tools. So, one is not sure what they are monitoring or evaluating. It has very little to know impact in the lives of women. The IFP can therefore not support this budget vote. I thank you.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 233

Ms P BHENGU-KOMBE: Chairperson, I can see that the Minister is not in the House but I have a question. Since the budget of women is not enough, the adjusted appropriation for 2017-18 is R206 million from R107 million in 2016-17, a positive step towards transformation agenda on women and socioeconomic empowerment. The department indicates that expenditure in 2016-17 for the first six months was 49% and 2017-18 same period is 46,8%.

In this 46,8%, how much of the expenditure budget has been used in programmes to fight the scourge of women violence in the country and what are those programmes apart from those in partnership with communities? Thank you very much, Chairperson.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Are there any further questions or interventions? Which member of the executive is responding in the absence of the Minister of Women in the Presidency? There is no Minister who is responding to that.

Vote 13 - Department of Women in the Presidency

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 234

Vote No 14 - Basic Education - put.

Declaration of vote:

Mr I M OLLIS: Hon Speaker, we take budget away from the departments that are not performing and we give money to those that are performing. When we consider the Department of Basic Education we note that the spending patterns have dropped in the last three years. In 2015 R160 million went unspent; 2016 R490 million went unspent Finance Minister and now this past year R937 million remains unspent. This is because the Minister, the Deputy Minister and the Director-General took their eyes off the ball and we see evidence in service delivery.

Of the 620 schools you were supposed to connect to electricity you connected zero. Of the 280 schools you were supposed to connect to water, you connected only 10. We have 6000 school teachers with inadequate or no qualifications. Under those circumstances we will not give you more budget as the DA until you can spend the budget you already have. Thank you.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 235

The MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION: Hon Chair, I always advise a member to either go for induction or orientation because he is always off the target. We are talking about an Adjustment Budget here and as a department we have not made any request. We have pushed funds around in the budget to look into areas where there is pressure. So, we have taken money from the programmes which are not so much of a pressure because we have big pressures in the compensation of employees' budget. That is what we are talking about and not what he is talking about. I have advised him and offered to orientate him around basic education because I do not know what he is talking about. He is offline and I will not respond to things which are not on the table. We are talking about an Adjustment Budget.

Vote No 15 - Higher Education and Training -put.

Declarations of vote:

Prof B BOZZOLI: Chair, this budget has not been adjusted enough. Our proposal to adjust it by R783 million to help poor students was rejected yesterday by the ANC. The whole sector is left in ignorance as to what is going to

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 236

happen in 2018. Students are concerned about free increases and universities are running at a loss.

The President tried to bully the Treasury to accept his way of schemes to fund students ignoring his own commission of enquiry. This department is like a battered woman, left reeling at the end of two years of chaos under this disastrous government. It is now abandoned to the winds of 2018. We cannot support this neglected and inadequately adjusted budget. Thank you.

Ms C C SEPTEMBER: Hon Chair, we must congratulate the students from universities, colleges and all the other institutions that have chosen to complete their academic year this year. They have chosen to complete their academic year despite the fact that many have attempted to let the students go out on marches. So, we must congratulate them for choosing to complete their academic year and not be persuaded otherwise. [Applause.]

We must equally congratulate the leadership at these institutions who too have done the best to make sure that the academic year can be completed in the very many

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 237

different ways that they have done. We must thank them for having trust in the ANC-led government for allowing this government to negotiate; consult; and take into consideration that the fees commission that was tabled required considerable discussions amongst many because indeed, education is a societal matter.

We welcome the Minister of Finance's indication in the adjustment budget of ensuring that something will be attended to, come the next budget, we trust in February. Our view, as the ANC is that special emphasis must be placed and bias must be towards the working class and the poor and indeed the missing middle that we referred to. That broad consultation will make sure that we will have the best results that will be in the interest of South Africa's people and for education and learning. We must appeal to the rich to pay. [Applause.]

Ms D CARTER: Hon Chair, it is more a declaration than a question. Cope agrees that the budget has not been adjusted sufficiently. If we cut our bloated Cabinet and administration and implement strict government supply

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 238

chain management policies we can afford free higher education for all. Thank you.

The MINISTER OF HIGHER EDUCATION: Hon Chairperson, I think hon members' views on the low adjustment levels of the department are appreciated. I just to emphasise one point that with the R68,949 billion we have been able to start a process of differentiating programmes in different divisions like the Tvet Colleges. This is very important for ensuring that we allow high numbers of young people to get through the system of acquiring critical skills for the economy. Nevertheless, I fully agree with hon members that we can do more with extra adjustments.

Vote No 16 - Health - put.

Declarations of vote:

Ms L V JAMES: Hon House Chair, the Department of Health has a challenge of a massive 38 000 vacancies in the public healthcare system and sadly these vacancies are always in the primary healthcare level where the poor of the poorest have to attend whether they like it or not.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 239

Sadly, this department has a huge burden of paying more than R2,6 million on the litigations towards this department. We link this with understaffing and not really listening to the people on the ground. As a result these litigations are now taking away the money that is supposed to be used for primary healthcare and for making sure that the hospitals are...

IsiXhosa:

... ziyalungiswa. Le mali iya ematyaleni yimali ephinda isokolise isibhedlela ekufumaneni oogqirha noomongimakazi ukuze kuhoywe abantu. Yiyo le nto sisithi siyi DA asikwazi ukuba sinixhase. Ingxaki yeyokuba sekukho impehla ngaphakathi etya kanye le mali, ngala matyala, ekufanele ukuba inceda abantu. Siyabulela. [Kwaqhwatywa.]

English:

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Chairperson, we also do not like the issue of litigation and nobody likes it. We have made it very clear that the litigation that the country is experiencing is grossly abnormal and you are aware that the lawyers who have entered this litigation are the lawyers who have bankrupted Road Accident Fund, Raf. In

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 240

the past they were making their billions of rands in Raf. Now that Raf has changed the Road Accident Fund, they rushed into hospital and clinics. There is a belief here when people get excited because of the carelessness in the public sector.

This litigation is also there in the private sector. Gynaecologist are closing their offices in private and leaving because of this litigation. So, it is not something to celebrate because it is very destructive. At the beginning of this year I was told that all the four private gynaecologists in Worcester have closed their practice and left because of this litigation.

So, we have set with the Department of Justice, brought together all the stakeholders and the medical council to try to find solution to this. I do not want people to celebrate it because it is very destructive and it will destroy the health system and all of us. The only people who benefit in this litigation are the lawyers and not even the patients.

VOTE NO 17 - Social Development - put.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 241

Declarations of vote:

Ms B S MASANGO: Hon Chair, according to the 2017 adjusted estimates of national expenditure the Department of Social Development declared R350 million unspent funds that had been earmarked for Social Grants Programmes. An amount of R200 million was taken from the Disability Grant while R100 million was declared unspent from the Child Support Grants.

The Department of Social Development claims that it under spent due greater efficiency in an eligibility assessment. This could mean that grant applicants were rejected due to ineligibility. This while, 1,8 million infants and adolescents remain without access to grants. A further R384 million, also from social grants was used to right off debts owed to the Department of Social Development which means that over R700 million is not being used to access the poor. Why does the ANC insist on taking money from the poor and vulnerable to bail out SAA? [Applause.]

Ms L L VAN DER MERWE: Hon House Chairperson, under the leadership of Minister Bathabile Dlamini the Department

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 242

of Social Development is floundering from one crisis to another. There was the SA Social Security Agency, SASSA gate crisis, Foster Care Grant crisis, the crisis which is gender-based violence and the crisis with social workers and there is almost no support for people with disabilities.

For as long as Minister Bathabile Dlamini continues to engineer one crisis after another we cannot support this budget being in the hands of a wrecking ball. I thank you.

Ms D CARTER: Cope cannot support this Vote when it is headed by the Minister who is clearly being intend on derailing SASSA. SASSA was established specifically to undertake the function and yet 20 years later is not in the position to pay grants. Thank you.

Vote No 18 - Correctional Services - put and agreed to.

Vote No 19 - Defence and Military Veterans - put.

Division demanded.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 243

The House divided.

[Take in from minutes]

Question agreed to.

Vote accordingly agreed to.

Vote No 20 - Independent Police Investigative Directorate
- put and agreed to.

Vote accordingly agreed to. (Economic Freedom Fighters
dissenting).

Vote No 21 - Justice and Constitutional Development -
put.

Declarations of vote:

Ms G BREYTENBACH: We do not support this adjustment
Budget principally because the majority targets reported
on have been removed or adjusted downwards and even then,
most have not been met.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 244

The NPA in the face of overwhelming evidence of corruption and racketeering on a grand-scale both public and private has failed to institute even one credible prosecution. The Minister of Justice continues to fail dismally in his duty to accept overall political responsibility for the department and the entity is at fall under his auspices but does find time for dubious meetings with the National Director of Public Prosecutions at Luthuli house. [Applause.]

Mr S N SWART: House Chair, the ACDP remains concerned about the Budget allocation to this department. It must be remembered that its main core function is to run civil and criminal courts from regional magistrate courts to the Supreme Court of Appeal and the Constitutional Court.

Nevertheless, we are grateful that the judiciary remains steadfast and independent with the Constitutional Court even giving Parliament guidance when it came to the recent secret ballot and of course, stepping in on the Sassa debacle.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 245

The NPA's Asset Forfeiture Unit and the Special Investigating Unit also fall under this Budget. They, in our view do fall short and were particularly concerned about the implementation of the Public Protector's remedial action, which was referred to the NPA and the Hawks for investigation and a year later, we see no progress in this matter. Thank you, House Chairperson.

The MINISTER OF JUSTICE AND CORRECTIONAL SERVICES: House Chairperson, let me first indicate that none of the comments relate to the adjustments which relate to compensation and infrastructure. Just on the question of an accusation which is of course frivolous and does not deserve any response, safe to say that people who live in glass houses should not throw stones.

Ms Breytenbach knows that she is facing serious charges that the prosecuting authority has successfully prepared against her because she sought to have those quashed ...

[Interjections.]

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: On a point of order, House Chairperson!

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 246

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon Minister, will you take your seat, please?

The MINISTER OF JUSTICE AND CORRECTIONAL SERVICES: ... but the Regional Court made it very clear that she has a case to answer and she would rather be addressing us on that ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon Minister, will you take your seat, please?

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: House Chairperson, it is on Rule 85. Every time that the opposition raises the issue about the charges being faced by President Zuma, we are told to bring a substantive motion to the House. The hon Minister wants to raise allegations against hon Breytenbach and her integrity, he should do so by way of a substantive motion brought to the House. So, I will ask him to withdraw that. [Applause.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon members, the hon Minister has responded to a declaration that has been made and has referred to a case that is currently pending

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 247

somewhere else. There is nothing wrong in referring to the case as long as the hon member does not get into the detail of what that is about. The sub judice Rule does not apply. The hon Minister has now responded.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: House Chairperson, I wasn't raising [Inaudible.] a sub judice Rule. It was about casting aspersions on a member of the House. It has nothing to do with the ... it is the same Rule that the ANC has sustained every time when somebody attacks hon Zuma.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): That's why I request the hon Minister not to go into the details or any matters around it. There is a case and that's it. Hon Minister, would you conclude now!

The MINISTER OF JUSTICE AND CORRECTIONAL SERVICES: Yes, and that's precisely what I said. I never alluded to what is the nature of the charges and never casted any aspersions, I simply said she should focus on the matter that is before her and stop harassing the prosecuting authority - abusing her position as a Member of

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 248

Parliament. In fact, she should recuse herself from the Portfolio Committee on Justice ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): No, hon Minister, will you take your seat?

The MINISTER OF JUSTICE AND CORRECTIONAL SERVICES: ... while the prosecuting authority is presenting that.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon Minister, will you take your seat? Yes hon member!

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: House Chairperson, again, the hon Minister is not referring to the hon member in respectful terms and he cannot accuse a member that's doing their job of abusing their position as a Member of Parliament. It is casting aspersions on a member of the House.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon Minister, will you withdraw the remark that the hon member is abusing their position as a Member of Parliament?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 249

The MINISTER OF JUSTICE AND CORRECTIONAL SERVICES: House Chairperson, I withdraw.

Vote No 21 - Justice and Constitutional Development - put and agreed to. (Democratic Alliance, Economic Freedom Fighters and African Christian Democratic Party dissenting).

Vote No 22 - Office of the Chief Justice and Judicial Administration - put and agreed to.

Vote no 22 - Office of the Chief Justice and Judicial Administration

Vote No 23 -Police - put.

Declarations of vote:

Mr Z N MBHELE: The shoddy state of the police is well-known. At the bottom, we have chronic understaffing and underresourcing. In the middle, we have crime intelligence in crisis and detectives in distress. At the top, we have had a serial crisis of top management.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 250

Street robbery has increased by 38,6% over five years and was up five percent last year. House robbery was up by 7,3% and business robbery was up by five percent. Most shockingly, car hijacking is up by 77,5% in the past five years, almost doubling an increase of 14,5% in 2016-17.

Clearly, the police are loosing the war against organised crime. The DA will not support a loosing Budget.

Rev K R J MESHOE: I wish to welcome and congratulate General Khehla Sithole on his appointment as the new National Police Commissioner. We trust that his wealth of operational and management experience will help restore the trust that communities lost in our police.

Does the Minister have a new strategy that he is going to use with the police with this adjusted Budget to make sure that our streets, communities and trains are safer?

Mr F BEUKMAN: House Chairperson, on behalf of the ANC, we want to welcome the adjusted Budget and also welcome the appointment of the new National Police Commissioner. Our question to the Deputy Minister is in light of the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 251

downward adjustments of the compensation budget: Whether the SAPS will still be able to service all the communities and ensure that everybody in South Africa is and feel safe?

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF POLICE: House Chairperson, let us welcome the comments from all the parties present here, especially their congratulatory remarks on the appointment of the new Commissioner of Police. I think the comments raised support the work that we are doing at the police rather than debating the adjustment. The only one that is debating the adjustment is the question of the compensation budget.

We are engaging with Treasury around this particular question because we said that we want more police boots on the ground in order to fight crime. However, we can do with what we have now but the battle of ideas with regard to negotiations is still continuing in the outer years.

So, we accept this and we are doing that as you said about top management. We are breaking down top management into lower structures of the police service and give

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 252

effective command on the ground - in the street where the crime is.

We are trying to compensate what the compensation budget says with regard to taking all our forces on the ground but we accept for this year, Finance Minister. Thank you very much.

Division demanded.

The House divided.

[Take in from minutes]

Question agreed to.

Vote accordingly agreed to.

Vote 24 - Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries - put.

Declarations of vote:

Inkosi R N CEBEKHULU: House Chair, to the hon Minister of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries, since the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 253

agriculture comprehensive programme funds have been moved to this portfolio, how much of these funds have been spent? How many small-scale farmers and the one-home-one hectare programme have benefited?

Lastly, out of R40 million additional funds allocated to combating the outbreak on Highly Pathogenic Avian Influenza, what progress has been made with regard to that? I thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Does any member has a question or interventions?

Mr M N PAULSEN: House Chair, no questions no interventions except to register our objections to this Budget.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): We will get to that later, hon member.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, FORESTRY AND FISHERIES: House Chairperson, I would start at the end. The meetings and discussion with the farmers, especially

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 254

in the Western Cape, who have suffered largely when it comes to influenza are continuing and working on the exact areas of intervention. We have started working on that and surely very soon we will finalise. We aren't just intervening on what has happened but also trying to work on the prevention. The prevention is quite expensive because you have to cull even those healthy birds so that they don't spread.

The small-scale fish distribution has been finalised in Northern Cape and Eastern Cape. We are still continuing in KwaZulu-Natal and Western Cape. As soon as we are done, the Minister will make the final announcement. The question is that there are appeals that we are still dealing with. It will be difficult to make an announcement while appeals are still in progress. Thanks.

Division demanded.

The House divided.

[Take in from minutes.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 255

Question agreed to.

Vote accordingly agreed to.

Vote No 25 - Economic Development - agreed to (Democratic Alliance and Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Vote No 26 - Energy - put.

Declarations of vote:

Mr G R DAVIS: House Chairperson, we all know that the former Minister of Energy Tina Joemat-Pettersson sold of our strategic oil reserves at bargain-basement prices in a doggy deal and then lied about it in Parliament. However, instead of holding her accountable for her actions this adjusted suggested budget wants to reward the former Minister with a 2,1 million once-off gratuity. To make matters worse, this 2,1 million is to be deducted from the renewable energy projects. So, my question is: why should we give Minister Joemat-Pettersson a 2,1 million golden hand shake when she personally authorises theft of our oil reserves at the cost of

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 256

R2 billion to the economy. Now the good news is this adjusted budget is very clear that only Parliament can approve this 2,1 million gratuity. Therefore, we should use the power we have as Parliament and we should reject this 2,1 million payout to the Minister and keep the money for renewable energy instead. Thank you.

[Applause.]

Ms N P SONTI: Chairperson, the EFF rejects the Budget Adjustment for Budget Vote 26 on Energy. We do so because we acknowledge that energy is the lifeline of our economy and needs to be managed properly in a manner that benefits the rest of our country. However, it has been captured by a small cliche of corrupt and unscrupulous people in the form of the Gupta and Zuma family. They have completed their capture of this portfolio by having their trusted person, Minister David Mahlobo, to lead this portfolio to make it easy for them to capture the proposed nuclear energy deal that will basically corrupt our country.

Despite many utterances from the Minister of Finance indicating that the country cannot afford nuclear energy

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 257

as proposed now. Minister Mahlobo has been very adamant in pushing ahead because they know that they made deals on behalf of the Gupta-Zuma dynasty for contracts to supply nuclear power stations. Minister Mahlobo, Minister Van Rooyen and Minister Mosebenzi Zwane, they all belong to the same WhatsApp group of Gupta and Zuma corruption that threatens to collapse our country. We reject this Budget Adjustment.

IsiXhosa:

Okukugqibela ndibulela bonke abantu base Metsimaholo abathe bavotela i-EFF ngexesha loNyulo lovalo-lwesikhewu. Siyabulela. Amandla!

Ms H H MALGAS: Point of order:

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Yes, hon member, what is your point of order?

Ms H H MALGAS: she is casting aspersions, it can be 86 and we can look at 84 because you are speaking about the Ministers that are in the same WhatsApp group when it comes to the Guptas.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 258

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): No, I don't know what is happening in that WhatsApp group. [Laughter.] But the hon member made remarks about the three Ministers and was indeed casting aspersions and was also imputing improper motives on behalf of those Ministers and that part hon member of your intervention is out of order and you must withdraw it.

Ms N P SONTI: I withdraw, Baba.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Thank you.

Question agreed to.

[TAKE IN FROM MINUTES]

Vote accordingly agreed to.

Vote No 27 - Environmental Affairs - agreed to
(Democratic Alliance and Economic Freedom Fighters
dissenting).

Vote No 28 - Labour - put.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 259

Division demanded.

[TAKE IN FROM MINUTES]

The House divided.

Question agreed to.

Vote accordingly agreed to.

Vote No 29 - Mineral Resources

Declarations of vote:

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): On which Vote is that hon member?

Mr W M MADISHA: Vote 29: Thank you, Cope cannot support this vote as long as Minister Zwane serves as its political head. Currently the Minister is ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon member, I asked you which vote and you said you want to respond to,

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 260

is it number 28 or 29. Vote No 28 is Labour; 29 yes continue hon member.

Mr W M MADISHA: So, I was correct, I will go back and start from the beginning.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): It is your time.

Mr W M MADISHA: Thank you, alright. I say Cope cannot support this vote as long as Minister Zwane serves as its political head. Currently the Minister is being interviewed by the minerals resources portfolio committee regarding the state capture although instead of attending those interviews, he purports to be unwell and does not attend. Secondly, under his watch our mining sector is being designated and we believe purposefully that the Minister must go so that South Africans can be saved.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Are there any further questions or interventions? That was a declaration or statement that the member made and it has nothing to do with the adjustment in the budget.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 261

Division demanded.

[TAKE IN FROM MINUTES]

The House divided.

ABSTAIN - 1: Lekota, M G P.

Question agreed to.

Vote accordingly agreed to.

Vote No 30 - Science and Technology.

Vote No 31 - Small Business Development - agreed to
(Democratic Alliance and Economic Freedom Fighters
dissenting).

Declarations of vote:

Rev K R J MESHOE: There are officials in the Department
of Small Business and Co-operatives who are being
investigate now for defrauding both the department and

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 262

intended beneficiaries. What I want to know from the Minister is that with the current adjusted budget what has been put in place to ensure that all the individuals and the co-operatives, who have applied for assistance are not defrauded but they are developed as it is the mandate of this department to help develop small businesses and co-operatives?

Ms N R BHENGU: It is not only the responsibility of the Department of Small Development to deal with issues of fraud and corruption as that is a societal matter. The portfolio committee has taken a decision to investigate this matter further and it has engaged with the office of the Auditor-General; it has approached the office of the House Chairperson and that process is in place to show the seriousness of Parliament and also of the portfolio committee in uprooting corruption where it exist.

The Department of Small Business is a very strategic department in as far as ensuring that we reduce dependency of poor families on government hand-out and social grants. It is important for people to understand this department and allocate adequate resources that will

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 263

enable the small businesses and co-operative to create 90% of 11 million new jobs by 2030 and develop sustainable communities. Thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon Minister you are back now, the hon Meshoe had a very specific question. I'm going to ask the hon Meshoe just to repeat the question so that you can respond to that if needed.

Rev K R J MESHOE: Thank you Chairperson, the question to the Minister was, in the light of the investigations that are taking place within the department, investigating those that have defrauded intended beneficiaries of the loans that should have received, what new measures are in place to ensure that with the new budget that those who are intended recipients, because of their needs to be developed, are not defrauded as it has happened? Are all those people who have defrauded people who should have received help and development and funds from the department not going to be part of those that will be helping to develop new individuals and also co-operatives?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 264

The MINISTER OF SMALL BUSINESS DEVELOPMENT: Thank you, hon Chair an apology I had some small businesses people sitting outside. Yes, they are small business they are going to be big business tomorrow. The issue here is that as the department we seriously and sincerely do not take kindly to people who rob small and medium enterprises. I will start from the there.

Secondly, we do have accountability systems and processes but I must confess that sometimes it takes long to really find the people who are doing the wrong. However, as soon as we find those that do wrong the law will take its course first and for most. We cannot afford at any moment to have people who have been found to be guilty of that kind of action. They cannot be pat and parcel of a future Department of Small Business Development; once the processes because we also have to be just with the process and make sure that when we take action we take on the basis of facts and everything on the ground. They cannot be part of our department. I thank you.

Vote 32 - Telecommunications and Postal Services

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 265

Mr J L MAHLANGU: Chairperson, first of all we would like to welcome the interventions by the department to ensure connectivity in Albert Luthuli Local Municipality, Mpumalanga, the new roll-out of 619 sites which includes schools and clinics in O R Tambo District Municipality and the planned roll-out at Impendle, Umgungundlovu District Municipality, KwaZulu-Natal and Nyandeni Local Municipality in O R Tambo District Municipality which is part of the adjustment that the department is receiving. So we would like to know, from the Minister, whether we can expect more roll-outs but also there is a general complaint on the delivery of postal services to households, can we expect something to happen in that regard? Thank you, comrade Chair.

The MINISTER OF TELECOMMUNICATIONS AND POSTAL SERVICES: Chairperson, the roll-out of the broadband budget as the member may know has been reduced because of the delays we had in the previous year but we are continuing with the current budget which has been allocated to roll out in all the districts. As we answered the questions here yesterday, yes, we have completed the 609 sites in the O R Tambo district. We are continuing with the Broadband

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 266

Infraco, BBI, and State Information Technology Agency, Sita, with the phase 1 and we did give the progress on how we are trying to expedite this programme.

With regard to the post office, we are continuing to improve the service delivery, the R3,7 billion which has been adjusted for the post office is unfortunately there the cost of borrowing, we are very grateful to Minister Gigaba. That is the money that we are owing the banks so ...

IsiZulu:

... sizokhokha isikweletu nje ngale ekhona manje kodwa sibe siwuqhuba umsebenzi. Siyabonga.

Agreed to (Democratic Alliance and Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting)

Vote No 33 - Tourism - agreed to (Democratic Alliance and Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Vote 34 - Trade and Industry

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 267

Declaration(s) of vote:

Ms J L FUBBS: It is in a nature of a comment thank you, my question, because as you know the Minister is busy doing his work and trade overseas and so is the Deputy Minister, we should say, thank you, thank you because he is bringing money in. how many jobs did we create? We exceeded the 3 000 number target by another 3 000. Now, what does that say? And why does that happen? It is because we have introduced an investor-friendly programme and policy and people are interested in coming and only today I was having lunch with the Canadians and they can not wait to come in.

Then we have also as you know the transfers going all over in the Special Economic zones, SEZs, I mean, what would the Western Cape be without the SEZs alright, Saldanha Bay and the rest and then the trade and investment policies, R9 million in that in order to do research towards global and regional industrialisation. And may I say, this is one department that the Auditor-General loves to audit loves to audit. It is so clean, everything is there but what is even better is that the transparency in the paperwork links directly to the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 268

allocation and expenditure. What more do we want? So people of South Africa are really very happy when they hear the word, "trade and industry", their eyes light up ... [Interjections.] and the investors can not wait to come in. actually the Minister, I am sure he will listen to this on YouTube somewhere, he will wish he was here in this House to respond to the questions because he looks for the opportunity to sell our country regionally and ... [Inaudible.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon member, speak into the microphone.

Ms J L FUBBS: ... Thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Are you done?

Thank you. [Applause.]

Ms J L FUBBS: Thank you.

AN HON MEMBER: Point of order Chair!

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 269

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Who is rising now on a point of order? Yes, hon member.

The MINISTER OF SMALL BUSINESS DEVELOPMENT: Chairperson, I have a point of order. I think I do want to say, happy birthday to hon Fubbs first but my reason for ... [Applause.] yes, happy birthday, the longest and the smartest.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): What is the point of order Minister?

The MINISTER OF SMALL BUSINESS DEVELOPMENT: Chair, on a point of order: The point of order is Rule 84, unparliamentary and unacceptable language or gestures. Chairperson, I had wanted to raise this issue for a very long time. The fact of the matter is that members who do not understand ...

IsiZulu:

... "uncuncuncu" ukuthi usetshenziswa nini ...

English:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 270

... in our language and in our space.

IsiZulu:

Ngicela ukuthi sibazise sibafundise ukuthi "uncuncuncu"
owezinja ekhaya, la ...

English:

... in the Chamber ...

IsiZulu:

... azikho izinja ... [Ubuwelewele.]

English:

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Thank you.

IsiZulu:

UNGQONGQOSHE WEZOKUTHUTHUKISWA KWAMABHIZINISI AMANCANE:
Ngaphandle uma zikhona esingazazi.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): No, hon members,
let us be sensitive to the different interpretations that
can be attached to these gestures and other sounds and
things that are being made and let us maintain the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 271

decorum of the House - Hon member, I am busy addressing the House - and stick to being polite to each other at all times. You can be robust but let us not descend into another form of doing things that are unacceptable. That was an intervention from the hon Fubbs it was not a question so I move on.

Vote No 35 - Transport - put.

Questions:

Mr M F DE FREITAS: House Chair, under the leadership of this Minister the transport sector continues to be in dire straits. The Minister continues to demonstrate no leadership as he does little to deal with crisis after crisis. The ridiculous tug-of-war between Transnet and Passenger Rail Agency of South Africa, Prasa, continues despite all parties agreeing that this situation is untenable and there are no signs to changes. Road safety death figures continue to be sky high yet nothing is done to fix this, in fact strategies have been used in road safety that do not speak to the cases of high road carnage. Billions have been squandered by the corrupt, captured Prasa deals yet there is a clear cover-up to

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 272

protect those who are involved. SA National Roads Agency, Sanral, continues to ignore the Gauteng motorists' opposition to e-tolls even as millions get wasted every month. With all these and other issues being just a tip of the iceberg, the DA cannot support this adjusted budget.

IsiZulu:

Mnu M P SIBANDE: Mgcinisihlalo nendlu yeSishayamthetho, inhlango ka-Khongolose i-ANC iyasisekela lesi sabelomali ngaphandle kokungabaza. Into nje engingayisho wukuthi-ke kuye uNgqongqoshe wethu, Ngqongqoshe, zotha usasezingeni elifanele, usendleleni eyiyo. Ungakhohlwa ukuthi uma imbongolo uyigibele uyifaka ama-hoorklap ukuthi ibheke le, ngesilungu bathi ama-hoorklap. Kukhona-ke amabhoxongwana ogomba etsheni abangeke baze bakubonge ngaso sonke isikhathi izinto esizenzayo siwu-ANC.

Ngqongqoshe, ngenhlango ka-ANC sicela usisize ukuthi, ngabe yini inqubekela-phambili laphaya e-Nigel e-Dunnottar la kunenkampani eyenza izitimela ngoba phela lokho i-ANC ingalusheshisa lolo hlelo lizokwazi ukuthi lisilekelele kwezemisebenzi kwizakhamuzi ezihlala

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 273

komakhelwane, ikakhulukazi e-East Rand nayo i-Nigel kanti futhi nakuzwelonke lizokusilekelela? Ukuthi uNgqongqoshe uma nje angasitshela kanjalo kodwa ungabanaki laba abanye ngoba, ehambayo ziyayikhonkotha. Ngiyabonga.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT: Chairperson, there is no crisis in the Department of Transport. The Department of Transport has an improved audit outcome from qualified to unqualified audit opinion. The Department of Transport has improved performance from 90% to 94,3%, so I do not know what crisis you are taking about. With regard to the Nigel plant, there is progress. We have employed almost 900 people to do the construction of the plant. As of the first quarter next year we will start manufacturing the first train which at the end, after 15 years or so we would have manufactured 580 trains. The first 20 trains have arrived from Brazil and the rest of the 580 will be manufactured here. So, this thing that there is a crisis is a figment in the head of Mr De Freitas. I thank you.

Vote 36 - Water & Sanitation - put.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 274

Mr L J BASSON: Chairperson, the department started the 2017/18 financial year with a cruse 17:13:08 of R3.7 billion not paid in the previous financial year. This places the current budget under pressure. Despite the shortage of funds, the second quarter report shows that the department underspent by more than R400 million. This is the result of poor management with most senior officials acting or under investigation. I thank you.

Mr M HLENGWA: Hon Chair, this is one department where in terms of accruals commitments they are just failing to manage those accounts and we think that something needs to be done moving forward. The question to the Minister is why there has been a delay in the spending for the water, infrastructure development programme because there is an under spending there of about 5.6%.

Hon Minister, take us into your confidence, you are making grave threats to the citizenry that you are going to cut water services to about 20 municipalities. In principle that is fine but the citizens have paid their dues, why must they suffer for the incompetence of municipal officials who are not doing their jobs and

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 275

paying. You are sending people into Christmas without water, into holidays without water and yet you say that water is life. Why punish the citizens when it is the municipal officials and councils who have not done their job?

IsiZulu:

Ngqongqoshe, lungisa le nkinga ngoba sengathi usuyasihlohloloza siwumphakathi ukuthi uzosincisha amanzi kanti sikhokhile njengomphakathi, senziwani ebhasini sikhokhile?

Mr M JOHNSON: The ANC will always support any budget that seeks to improve the lives of our ordinary people. We always wonder though as to why some South Africans continue to support and vote for parties and people that oppose such transformation budgets. Our message to those South Africans is, wake up and begin to think and reason before you put your cross next time as these parties and people do not have your interest at heart. Granted, the budget of the department is constrained like other departments and this is a situation that brings an opportunity for new innovations that call for lesser

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 276

spend all in the name of doing more with less. The ANC is on record for not condoning any wrong doing by any one including irregular expenditure, fruitless or wasteful expenditure.

In this draught situation we are calling on all South Africans to use our water resource sparingly especially during the December vacation period. Water is life it must be saved and descent sanitation must be expedited for our people's dignity. I thank you.

The MINISTER OF WATER AND SANITATION: Chair, thanks for the comments that have been made. Just on the first one indeed there has been serious challenges around the spent especially in the infrastructure. Amongst other things that have been an issue are matters that are related to the increase in terms of the escalating costs of infrastructure development just like in any other infrastructure sector. It is on those basis that we have also received additional resources to the tune of R200 million for Goedertrouw as well as R300 million for Butterworth and we do believe that that will help us to move forward.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 277

On the issue surrounding the under expenditure, yes, we are precisely because our budget has not been increased save for those two adjustments that have been made. On the cuts, what we have been able to stomach as government is the debt that has run over a period of seven years but thanks again to leaders such as the hon member Buthelezi of the IFP who has actually encouraged the mayor of the KwaNongoma District to come forward and pay because he has been one of the culprits including Zululand that has also been called. I am seeing him tomorrow morning because he has not been paying but under spending on his conditional grants. We do believe that there is money in local government, R53 billion found through treasury is what we will now work together with National Treasury to ensure that municipalities pay. The target is not the end user.

Thanks to the hon Lulu Johnson from the ANC. Indeed, let us do more with less but let us also make sure that we give certainty to investors that we are in a position to own our commitment by paying what is due to the water boards. Thank you. [Applause.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 278

Vote 38 - Human Settlements - put.

Mr T Z HADEBE: House Chair, the proposed adjustments for this department are really a ticket for balling 17:18:36 because nobody balls like this department. To contextualise it, the department spent 99% of its budget but only achieved 57% of their budgeted targets whilst 51% may seem like a good job in the ANC's vocabulary, it is simply not good enough. The department spent R1 million on t-shirts and caps and one wonders why would the Department of Human Settlements be doing by spending one million on t-shirts and caps? It spent a further 100 000 on gifts sets; we wonder whether the Minister and the department were playing Santa Claus here. An additional R10 000 on mugs and R380 000 on renting and exhibition stands in South America no gaal.

None of these items have anything to do with the core function of the department which is to build houses. In addition, the Minister wasted R1.2 million on leasing a new vehicle despite the fact that the official ministerial vehicle was still in good use and this was even condemned by the Auditor-General. Could it be

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 279

perhaps that the Minister needed a new set of wheels for her presidential campaign travels? Only time will tell. It will be a betrayal of the aspirations of South Africans who are still stuck in the housing waiting list or those who are still waiting for a title deed to affirm ownership of their houses through to support these adjustments. So, we don't. Thank you House Chair.

[Applause.]

IsiXhosa:

Nks N N MAFU: Sihlalo, siyi-ANC siyalwamkela ulohlehlengiso kuba lujongene nomcimbi wezazisi zobumnini-mhlaba [title deed] into enzima kakhulu apha kweli sebe. Abantu baseMzantsi Afrika, ngakumbi abo bafumana izindlu phambi konyaka wama-1994, abanawo amaqweqwe angqinayo ukuba bangabanini bezindlu. Ngoko ke, oluhlehlengiso lujongene nalo mcimbi. Into ebalulekileyo kuthi yeyokuba umntu ohlala endlini kufuneka ayazi into yokuba uhlala endlini yakhe kwaye unazo impepha ezingqina oko.

Siyabacela abantu bakuthi ukuba xa benikwe izindlu ngurhulumente, mabangazithengisi ingekapheli iminyaka

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 280

esibhozo kuba lowo amthengiseleyo akazoba nalo ilungelo lokuba ngumnini-mhlaba. Yiyo loo nto ufumanisa ukuba abantu abaninzi abahlala ezindlini zezibonelelo abakwazi ukufumana isazisi sobumnini-mhlaba.

Singumbutho ke wesizwe, i-ANC, silihalalisela ngakumbi olu hlengahlengiso sisithi maluhambe lubheke phambili liqinisekise ukuba abantu baseMzantsi Afrika bafumana izazisi sobumnini-mhlaba. Siyabulela.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Hon Chair, I would like the hon member from the DA to acquaint himself with matters of human settlements a little more. A few months ago he put out a statement which was picked up by News24, the most misleading statement possible. News24 has had to apologise to me and withdraw that statement from its media, I have also taken the opportunity to take that matter up with the ethics committee because the member must make sure at all times that his statements are correct.

Firstly, I want to respond to him on the matter of advertising outside this country. South Africa has

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 281

produced more houses than any other country anywhere therefore we were given the biggest space in Quito at the UN habitat to showcase what we are doing in South Africa. We are very proud of that and that is where most of the resources went to. We advertise South Africa in Central America and we are recognised as the best delivery of human settlements anywhere in the world and we will do it again and again. Thank you very much. [Applause.]

Vote 39 - Rural Development and Land Affairs - put

Declarations of vote:

Mr B R TOPHAM (DA): Hon Chair, the DA objects to this item. We do not believe that the provision of private property rights to the poor is truly prioritised by this department. We do not believe that the budget reflects the real priority that Rural Development should be getting. Thank you. [Applause.]

IsiZulu:

Inkosi N R CEBEKHULU (IFP): Ngiyathokoza Sihlalo, Mhlonishwa Ngqongqoshe kunento ekhathazayo lapha engicela ukuthi usichazele ngayo. Njengalokhu uMnyango wakho

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 282

Mhlonishwa uphume umkhankaso wokwelekelela ekubuyisweni komhlaba owaphucwa abantu bakithi. Kunomhlaba ongamapulazi abekhiqiza, angasasebenzi njengamanje. Lawo mapulazi asathengwa umbuso, asengakahulumeni. Amanye awo ayingxenye yamapulazi awela ngaphansi kwezimangalo zomhlaba lapho kukhona ingxenye ethile yamapulazi ebuyisiwe ebantwini - kubuyiswe amancane kwashiywa ngaphandle amanye. Ngabe yini evimba uMnyango ukuthi ushicilele nje ngokusayina ukuthi umhlaba ongowawo uwunikezele ebantwini ukuze bakwazi ukuqala bebe bezisebenza kuwo, ngaphezu kwalomhlaba abanikezwe wona izinkampani ezithile ukuthi mabawusebenze besazama izimali ukuze bakwazi ukuziphathela umhlaba wabo. Ngiyabonga.

Prof N M KHUBISA (NFP): Yes, Chairperson. Minister, we do understand that the department is busy with the programme of land redistribution and restitution, but at the same time I know that you need to intensify your partnership with the Department of Agriculture. Many of these upcoming farmers, who have had the farms restored to them, have their farms lying waste. The reason being that, perhaps, they need these training, mentorship and

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 283

coaching skills, whilst we applaud the work the department is doing, but we believe that more needs to be done in that regard. Most of these people get land but they don't have skills to utilise the land. Therefore, as NFP, we call upon the department, we know that it may not be falling directly within the purview of the department but working in tandem with the Department of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries our people can be assisted in that regard. Thank you very much, Chairperson.

Ms M P C NGWENYA (ANC): Hon Chairperson, it will be good if we focus on the adjustment but nothing else. The virement that has been done on Agricultural Land holdings Account of about 71,2 million to one hectare one household programme is mostly welcome and supported. It will assist in ensuring that rural people, especially women have access to land. This amount must be used effectively and efficiently to improve the lives of rural people. As land acquisition and development is one of the core mandate of the Department of Rural Development and Land Reform, but too much virement sometimes compromise the implementation of some programmes whose budget has been decreased. The recap has been implemented by the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 284

department successfully to provide skills, mentoring and other infrastructural development. Those who reject this Adjustment Budget deprive our people access to land, ...

IsiZulu:

... ngoba bafuna ukuba ngabobhongoza kulo mhlaba wokhokho bethu. Siyaseseka le sabelomali. Ngiyabonga. [Ihlombe.]

The MINISTER OF RURAL DEVELOPMENT AND LAND AFFAIRS: Hon Chair, ...

IsiXhosa:

... bahlekazi le nto niyithethayo ibaluleke kakhulu kwaye ifuna ukulandelwa kanye ngoluya hlobo. Ingxaki yethu idla ngokuba ngelinye ixesha siye sithathe ithuba elide ukugqibezela ibango libe selibhengezwe ngokusemthethweni. Xa umhlaba ubhengeziwe la mntu womhlaba naye uye ayeke ukuwusebenza umhlaba siphela sithatha ithuba elide ngolo hlobo. Ngoku xa sesiwuthenga umhlaba emva kweminyaka eli-10, sifumanise ukuba awusasebenzi nabantu bakuthi abanye sebemkile baya

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 285

kuhlala ezidolophini kuba abasenayo into yokusebenza. Zingxaki esijongene nazo ezo kwaye ndiyibulela kakhulu le ndlela; ingathi singanencoko nokuba kusemva koku bahlekazi ukuze sithethe ngalo mcimbi. Ndingavuya kakhulu kuba nitsho kuwo kanye entloko.

English:

Hon Chair, no, this whole thing about title deeds regarding rural areas, there is no problem. It is the people themselves who must make that choice. Take for an example the one household one hectare thing is a household thing. So, it means if the people choose to have title deeds, what we have done in the bill that is going to come before this House on the Communal Land Tenure Bill. We are saying there, that we must institutionalise the land use rights of people in communal areas. Now in the form of institutionalisation it will mean that a land use right certificate will be given to household, which makes it permanent for people to use and occupy that land. The course is going to be provided for in the law, it

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 286

It will be protecting particularly women in those rural areas, but ensuring that the whole communality of the ownership of the land remains. Thank you very much.

Division demanded.

The House divided.

AYES - 207: Abrahams, B L; Adams, F; Adams, P E; Basson, J V; Bekwa, S D; Beukman, F; Bhengu, P; Bhengu, F; Bhengu, N R; Bilankulu, N K; Booi, M S; Boroto, M G; Capa, R N; Capa, N; Carrim, Y I; Cele, B H; Cele, M A; Chauke, H P; Chiloane, T D; Chohan, F I; Chueu, M P; Coleman, E M; Cronin, J P; Cwele, S C; Dambuza, N B; Didiza, A T; Dirks, M A; Dlakude, D E; Dlamini-Dubazana, Z S; Dlodlo, A; Dlomo, B J; Dlulane, B N; Dube, J J; Dunjwa, M L; Ebrahim, E I; Faku, Z C; Fubbs, J L; Gamede, D D; Gcwabaza, N E; Gigaba, K M N; Gina, N; Gordhan, P J; Gumede, D M; Hlengwa, M; Holomisa, S P; Johnson, M; Kalako, M U; Kekana, H B; Kekana, P S; Kekana, C D; Kekana, E; Kekana, M D; Kenye, T E; Khoarai, L P; Khosa, D H; Khubisa, N M; Khunou, N P; Kilian, J D; Koornhof, G W; Koornhof, N J J v R; Kota-Fredricks, Z A; Kubayi, M T;

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 287

Kwankwa, N L S; Landers, L T; Lesoma, R M M; Loliwe, F S;
Luzipo, S; Maake, J J; Mabasa, X; Mabe, B P; Mabija, L;
Madella, A F; Madlopha, C Q; Maesela, P; Mafu, N N;
Magadla, N W; Mahlalela, A F; Mahlangu, D G; Mahlangu, J
L; Mahumapelo, J M K; Maila, M S A; Majola, F Z;
Makhubela-Mashele, L S; Makhubele, Z S; Makondo, T;
Makwetla, S P; Malgas, H H; Maloyi, P D N; Maluleke, B J;
Manamela, K B; Manana, M N S; Manana, D P; Mantashe, P T;
Maphanga, W B ; Mapisa-Nqakula, N N; Mapulane, M P;
Martins, B A D; Masango, M S A; Masehela, E K M; Maseko,
L M; Mashego-Dlamini, K C; Masondo, N A; Masuku, M B;
Maswanganyi, M J; Mathale, C C; Mathebe, D H; Matlala, M
H; Matshoba, M O; Matsimbi, C; Mavunda, R T; Maxegwana,
C H M; Mbete, B; Mbuyane, S H; Mchunu, S; Mdakane,
M R; Memela, T C; Meshoe, K R J; Mfeketo, N C; Mfulo, A
T; Mjobo, L N; Mkhize, H B; Mkongi, B M; Mmemezi, H M Z;
Mmola, M P; Mmusi, S G; Mncwabe, S C; Mnganga - Gcabashe,
L A; Mnguni, P J; Mnguni, D; Mnisi, N A; Mogotsi, V P;
Molebatsi, M A; Molewa, B E E; Morutoa, M R; Mothapo, M R
M; Motimele, M S; Motshekga, M A; Motshekga, M S;
Motsoaledi, P A; Mpanza, T K; Mpumlwana, L K B; Mthembu,
J M; Mthembu, N; Mthethwa, E N; Nchabeleng, M E; Ndaba,
C N; Ndongeni, N; Nel, A C; Newhoudt- Druchen, W S;

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 288

Ngcobo, B T; Ngwenya-Mabila, P C; Ngwezi, X; Nkadimeng, M F; Nkonzo, T M; Nkwinti, G E; November, N T; Nqakula, C; Nxesi, T W; Nyambi, H V; Oliphant, M N; Oliphant, G G; Oosthuizen, G C; Pandor, G N M; Patel, E; Phaahla, M J; Phosa, Y N; Pikinini, I A; Pilane-Majake, M C C; Radebe, B A; Radebe, J T; Radebe, G S; Ralegoma, S M; Ramaphosa, M C; Ramatlakane, L; Rantho, D Z; Raphuti, D D; Semanya, M R; Senokoanyane, D Z; September, C C; Shope-Sithole, S C N; Sibande, M P; Singh, N; Sisulu, L N; Sithole, K P; Skosana, J J; Skosana, G J; Skwatsha, M; Smith, V G; Swart, S N; Theko, L C; Thomson, B; Tleane, S A; Tobias, T V; Tolashe, G N; Tom, X S; Tongwane, T M A; Tseke, G K; Tseli, R M; Tshwete, P; Tsoleli, S P; Tsotetsi, D R; Tuck, A; Van Der Merwe, L L; Van Schalkwyk, S R; Wolmarans, M J; Xasa, T; Zulu, L D.

NOES - 78: America, D; Atkinson, P G; Bagraim, M; Bara, M R; Basson, L J; Bozzoli, B; Brauteseth, T J; Breytenbach, G; Bucwa, H; Cachalia, G K Y; Cardo, M J; Carter, D; Cassim, Y; Chance, R W T; Davis, G R; De Freitas, M S F; Dreyer, A M; Edwards, J; Esau, S; Figlan, A M; Gqada, T; Hadebe, T Z; Hill-Lewis, G G; Hoosen, M H; Huogo, R; Hunsinger, C H H; James, L V; Jooste, K;

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 289

Ketabahle, V; Khawula, M S; King, C; Kohler, D; Kruger, H
C C; Krumbock, G R; Lees, R A; Lekota, M G P; Lorimer, J
R B; Macpherson, D W; Madisha, W M; Majola, T R;
Malatsi, M S; Marais, S J F; Marais, E J; Masango, B S ;
Maynier, D J; Mazzone, N W A; Mbabama, T M; Mbhele, Z N;
Mcloughlin, A R; Mhlongo, T W; Mhlongo, S P; Mileham, K
J; Motau, S C; Ollis, I M; Paulsen, M N; Purdon, R K;
Rabotapi, M W; Rawula, T; Robertson, K P; Robinson, D;
Ryder, D R; Schmidt, H C; Shinn, M R; Sonti, N
P; Stander, T; Steenhuisen, J H; Steyn, A; Stubbe, D J;
Thembekwayo, S S; Topham, B R; Van Damme, P T; Van Der
Walt, D; Van Der Westhuizen, A P; Van Dyk, V; Vos, J;
Walters, T C R; Waters, M; Wilson, E R.

Question agreed to.

Vote accordingly agreed to.

Vote No 40 - Sport and Recreation South Africa - put and
agreed to (Democratic Alliance and Economic Freedom
Fighters dissenting).

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 290

The House Chairperson Mr C T Frolick gave a ruling on unparliamentary gestures made by Mr M A Dirks and directed him to leave the House for the remainder of the day's sitting.

The member thereupon withdrew from the Chamber.

Schedule - put.

Division demanded.

The House divided.

AYES - 203: Abrahams, B L; Adams, F; Adams, P E; Basson, J V; Bekwa, S D; Beukman, F; Bhengu, P; Bhengu, F; Bhengu, N R; Bilankulu, N K; Booi, M S; Boroto, M G; Capa, N; Capa, R N; Carrim, Y I; Cele, B H; Cele, M A; Chauke, H P; Chiloane, T D; Chohan, F I; Chueu, M P; Coleman, E M; Cronin, J P; Cwele, S C; Dambuza, N B; Didiza, A T; Dlakude, D E; Dlamini-Dubazana, Z S; Dlodlo, A; Dlomo, B J; Dlulane, B N; Dube, J J; Dunjwa, M L; Ebrahim, E I; Faku, Z C; Fubbs, J L; Gamede, D D; Gcwabaza, N E; Gina, N; Gordhan, P J; Gumede, D M;

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 291

Gungubele, M; Holomisa, S P; Johnson, M; Kalako, M U;
Kekana, H B; Kekana, P S; Kekana, M D; Kekana, E; Kekana,
C D; Kenye, T E; Khoarai, L P; Khosa, D H; Khubisa, N M;
Khunou, N P; Kilian, J D; Koornhof, G W; Koornhof, N J J
v R; Kota-Fredricks, Z A; Kubayi, M T; Kwankwa, N L S;
Landers, L T; Lekota, M G P; Lesoma, R M M; Loliwe, F S;
Luzipo, S; Maake, J J; Mabasa, X; Mabe, B P; Mabiya, L;
Madella, A F; Madlopha, C Q; Maesela, P; Mafu, N N;
Magadla, N W; Mahlalela, A F; Mahlangu, J L; Mahlangu,
D G; Maila, M S A; Majola, F Z; Makhubela-
Mashele, L S; Makhubele, Z S; Makondo, T; Makwetla, S P;
Malgas, H H; Maloyi, P D N; Maluleke, B J; Manamela, K B;
Manana, M N S; Manana, D P; Mantashe, P T; Maphanga, W B
; Mapisa-Nqakula, N N; Mapulane, M P; Martins, B A D;
Masango, M S A; Masehela, E K M; Maseko, L M; Mashego-
Dlamini, K C; Mashile, B L; Masondo, N A; Masuku, M B;
Maswanganyi, M J; Mathale, C C; Mathebe, D H; Matlala, M
H; Matshoba, M O; Matsimbi, C; Mavunda, R T; Maxegwana, C
H M; Mbuyane, S H; Mchunu, S; Mdakane, M R; Memela, T C;
Mfeketo, N C; Mfulo, A T; Mjobo, L N; Mkhize, H B;
Mkongi, B M; Mmemezi, H M Z; Mmola, M P; Mmusi, S G;
Mncwabe, S C; Mnganga - Gcabashe, L A; Mnguni, P J;
Mnguni, D; Mnisi, N A; Mogotsi, V P; Molebatsi, M A;

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 292

Molewa, B E E; Morutoa, M R; Mothapo, M R M; Motimele, M
S; Motshekga, M A; Motshekga, M S; Mpanza, T K;
Mpumlwana, L K B; Mthembu, N; Mthembu, J M; Mthethwa, E
N; Nchabeleng, M E; Ndaba, C N; Ndongeni, N; Nel, A C;
Newhoudt-Druchen, W S; Ngcobo, B T; Ngwenya-Mabila, P
C; Ngwezi, X; Nkadimeng, M F; Nkonzo, T M;
Nkwinti, G E; November, N T; Nqakula, C; Nxesi, T W;
Nyambi, H V; Oliphant, M N; Oliphant, G G; Oosthuizen, G
C; Pandor, G N M; Patel, E; Phaahla, M J; Phosa, Y N;
Pikinini, I A; Pilane-Majake, M C C; Radebe, B A;
Radebe, J T; Radebe, G S; Ralegoma, S M; Ramaphosa, M C;
Ramatlakane, L; Rantho, D Z; Raphuti, D D; Semenya, M R;
Senokoanyane, D Z; September, C C; Shope-Sithole, S C N;
Sibande, M P; Singh, N; Sisulu, L N; Sithole, K P;
Skosana, G J; Skosana, J J; Skwatsha, M; Smith, V G;
Swart, S N; Theko, L C; Thomson, B; Tleane, S A; Tobias,
T V; Tolashe, G N; Tom, X S; Tongwane, T M A; Tseke, G K;
Tseli, R M; Tshwete, P; Tsoleli, S P; Tsotetsi, D R;
Tuck, A; Van Der Merwe, L L; Van Schalkwyk, S R;
Wolmarans, M J; Xasa, T; Zulu, L D.

NOES - 78: America, D; Atkinson, P G; Bagraim, M; Bara, M
R; Basson, L J; Bozzoli, B; Brauteseth, T J; Breytenbach,

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 293

G; Bucwa, H; Cachalia, G K Y; Cardo, M J; Carter, D;
Cassim, Y; Chance, R W T; Davis, G R; De Freitas, M S F;
Dreyer, A M; Edwards, J; Esau, S; Figg, M J; Figlan, A M;
Gqada, T; Hadebe, T Z; Hill-Lewis, G G; Hoosen, M H;
Hugo, R; Hunsinger, C H H; James, L V; Jooste, K;
Ketabahle, V; Khawula, M S; King, C; Kohler, D; Kruger, H
C C; Krumbock, G R; Lees, R A; Lorimer, J R B;
Macpherson, D W; Madisha, W M; Majola, T R; Malatsi, M S;
Marais, S J F; Marais, E J; Masango, B S ; Maynier, D J;
Mazzone, N W A; Mbabama, T M; Mbhele, Z N; Mcloughlin, A
R; Mhlongo, T W; Mhlongo, S P; Mileham, K J; Motau, S
C; Ollis, I M; Paulsen, M N; Purdon, R K; Rabotapi, M
W; Rawula, T; Robertson, K P; Robinson, D; Ryder, D R;
Schmidt, H C; Shinn, M R; Sonti, N P; Stander, T;
Steenhuisen, J H; Steyn, A; Stubbe, D J; Thembekwayo, S
S; Topham, B R; Van Damme, P T; Van Der Walt, D; Van Der
Westhuizen, A P; Van Dyk, V; Vos, J; Walters, T C R;
Waters, M; Wilson, E R

Question agreed to.

Schedule accordingly agreed to.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 294

ADJUSTMENTS APPROPRIATIONS BILL

(Consideration of Votes and Schedule)

Vote No 1 - The Presidency - put.

Division demanded.

The House divided:

AYES - 200: [TAKE IN FROM MINUTES]

NOES - 84: [TAKE IN FROM MINUTES]

Question agreed to.

Vote accordingly agreed to.

Vote No 3 - Communications - agreed to. (Democratic Alliance and Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Vote No 4 - Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs - put.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 295

Division demanded.

The House divided.

AYES - 207: [TAKE IN FROM MINUTES]

NOES - 79: [TAKE IN FROM MINUTES]

Question agreed to.

Vote accordingly agreed to.

Vote No 5 - Home Affairs - agreed to.

Vote No 6 - International Relations and Co-operation -
agreed to (Democratic Alliance dissenting).

Vote No 7 - National Treasury - put.

Division demanded.

The House divided.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 296

AYES - 209: [TAKE IN FROM MINUTES]

NOES - 77: [TAKE IN FROM MINUTES]

Question agreed to.

Vote accordingly agreed to.

Vote No 8 - Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation - agreed to. (Democratic Alliance and Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Vote No 9 - Public Enterprises - put.

Division demanded.

The House divided.

AYES - 202: [TAKE IN FROM MINUTES]

NOES - 85: [TAKE IN FROM MINUTES]

Question agreed to.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 297

Vote accordingly agreed to.

Vote No 10 - Public Service and Administration - put.

Division demanded.

The House divided.

AYES - 204: [TAKE IN FROM MINUTES]

NOES - 77: [TAKE IN FROM MINUTES]

Question agreed to.

Vote accordingly agreed to.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): May I ask the service officers to ensure that the doors are closed when the bell stops ringing.

IsiZulu:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 298

Nks M S KHAWULA: Sengishaywa uvalo khona manje. Kukhona invilophu elokhu ingena la iphinde iphume. Kanti kwenzakalani ngale nvilophu? Sicela ukuyibuka phakathi, eyakabani?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): No, hon member. Hon member, that is not a point of order. Please, take your seat. Hon members, let us get back to the business of the House. Order!

AN HON MEMBER: House Chair, just before you put the next Vote, I am not sure whether it is my ears or what. Are you saying voting session or voting station?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): It must be your ears, hon member.

Vote No 11 - Public Works - put.

Division demanded.

The House divided.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 299

AYES - 207: [TAKE IN FROM MINUTES]

NOES - 79: [TAKE IN FROM MINUTES]

Question agreed to.

Vote accordingly agreed to.

Vote No 12 - Statistics South Africa - agreed to.

Vote No 13 - Women - agreed to. (Democratic Alliance, Economic Freedom Fighters, Inkatha Freedom Party and African Christian Democratic Party dissenting).

Vote No 14 - Basic Education - put.

Division demanded.

The House divided.

AYES - 214: [TAKE IN FROM MINUTES]

NOES - 71: [TAKE IN FROM MINUTES]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 300

Question agreed to.

Vote accordingly agreed to.

Vote No 15 - Higher Education and Training - put.

Division demanded.

The House divided.

AYES - 212: [TAKE IN FROM MINUTES]

NOES - 70: [TAKE IN FROM MINUTES]

Question agreed to.

Vote accordingly agreed to.

Vote No 16 - Health - put.

Division demanded.

The House divided.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 301

AYES - 213: [TAKE IN FROM MINUTES]

NOES - 71: [TAKE IN FROM MINUTES]

Question agreed to.

Vote accordingly agreed to.

Vote No 17 - Social Development - put.

Division demanded.

The House divided.

AYES - 203: [TAKE IN FROM MINUTES]

NOES - 79: [TAKE IN FROM MINUTES]

Question agreed to.

Vote accordingly agreed to.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 302

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Order! hon members. Hon members, there is too much noise.

Vote No 18 - Correctional Services - agreed to.

Vote No 19 - Defence and Military Veterans - put.

Division demanded.

The House divided.

AYES - 211: [TAKE IN FROM MINUTES]

NOES - 69: [TAKE IN FROM MINUTES]

ABSTAIN - 1: [TAKE IN FROM MINUTES]

Question agreed to.

Vote accordingly agreed to.

Vote No 20 - Independent Police Investigative Directorate
- agreed to (Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 303

Vote No 21 - Justice and Constitutional Development - agreed to. (Democratic Alliance, Economic Freedom Fighters and African Christian Democratic Party dissenting).

Vote No 22 - Office of the Chief Justice and Judicial Administration - agreed to.

Vote No 23 - Police - put.

Division demanded.

The House divided.

AYES - 207: [TAKE IN FROM MINUTES]

NOES - 78: [TAKE IN FROM MINUTES]

ABSTAIN - 1: [TAKE IN FROM MINUTES]

Question agreed to.

Vote accordingly agreed to.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 304

Vote No 24 - Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries - put.

Division demanded.

The House divided.

[Voting take in from minutes]

Question agreed to.

Vote accordingly agreed to.

Vote No 25 - Economic Development - put and agreed to
(Democratic Alliance and Economic Freedom Fighters
dissenting).

Vote No 26 - Energy - put.

Division demanded.

The House divided.

[Voting take in from minutes]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 305

Question agreed to.

Vote accordingly agreed to.

Vote No 27 - Environmental Affairs - put and agreed to
(Democratic Alliance and Economic Freedom Fighters
dissenting).

Vote No 28 - Labour - put.

Division demanded.

The House divided.

[Voting take in from minutes]

Question agreed to.

Vote accordingly agreed to.

Vote 29 - Mineral Resources - put.

Division demanded.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 306

The House divided.

[Voting take in from minutes]

Question agreed to.

Vote accordingly agreed to.

Vote No 30 - Science and Technology - put and agreed to.

Vote No 31 - Small Business Development - put and agreed to (Democratic Alliance and Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Vote No 32 - Telecommunications and Postal Services - put and agreed to (Democratic Alliance and Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Vote No 33 - Tourism - put and agreed to (Democratic Alliance and Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 307

Vote No 34 – Trade and Industry – put and agreed to (Democratic Alliance and Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Vote No 35 – Transport – put.

Division demanded.

The House divided.

[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Chair, order! Is it possible for you to amend the time? The two minutes will be too short.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Okay, I will amend it to five minutes.

An HON MEMBER: I think the Deputy President must intervene. Here's a fight here. These people are fighting. CR17, you must deal with this thing.

[Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 308

An HON MEMBER: CR17? [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Why is she crying? [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Order hon members! Will you please take up your allocated seats? [Interjections.] Order hon members, will you take up your allocated seats? [Interjections.] Hon members, we want to continue with the business of the House. Will you take up your seats? [Interjections.] Hon members, including the Whippery, will you take up your seats? [Interjections.] Order hon members! Will you take up your allocated seats? [Interjections.] Order hon members! Order! [Interjections.] Order hon members! Hon members, don't aggravate the situation. You are childish! [Interjections] Don't do that! Order! [Interjections.] Order! Hon members, order!

An HON MEMBER: Order Chair!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): The question before the House is that Vote No 35 – Transport be agreed to.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 309

Mr T RAWULA: Chair, I'm raising an order!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): ... [Inaudible.]

... comments. Those in favour of the Vote ...

[Inaudible.] ... the yes button ...

Mr T RAWULA: Chair, I'm raising an order! Chair?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): ... those against the no button and those wishing to abstain should press the abstain button. Have all members now voted? The voting session is closed.

[Voting take in from minutes.]

Question agreed to.

Vote accordingly agreed to.

Mr T RAWULA: Chair, Chair!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon members, I now put Vote No 36 – Water and Sanitation. Are there any

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 310

objections? [Interjections.] There are objections. I put the question. Those in favour will say aye.

[Interjections.]

Mr T RAWULA: ... [Inaudible.] ... switch off my microphone!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Those against will say no. [Interjections.] I think the ayes have it.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Chair ... [Inaudible.] Hello? The DA calls for a division.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): No, there seems to be a problem with the sound system. It's certainly not off here. Can you just check what the situation is?

An HON MEMBER: It's off. [Interjections.]

Mr T RAWULA: Chair, I rise on Rule 31 and Rule 92 – the question of privilege and a point of order. For some reason we are being held ransom by the caucus of the ANC ... [Interjections.] ... and we cannot just pass through

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 311

that as if nothing happened. We are expecting you to reign in this House because we have been held ransom by the fight of the ANC. So we are expecting you to reign in the House. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Thank you hon member, please take your seat now. Please take your seat.

Mr T RAWULA: Chair, I'm still on the floor. The second point is that I feel unsafe in the House. If blows are going to be exchanged in the House and people beat each other, how can you guarantee my safety as a Member of Parliament in this House? I expect you to rule on that.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Order hon members! Hon member, you have made your point. We are continuing now with the voting session.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Chairperson?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon members ... No, just wait please; just wait. Hon members, there seems to be a problem with the system in the House, as well as

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 312

the electronic voting system. I will now suspend business for 10 minutes so that the system can be restarted.

Business suspended at 18:20 due to technical problems and resumed at 18:34.

Business suspended at 18:20 due to technical reasons and resumed at 18:34.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Will hon members now take up their seats? We want to proceed with the programme of the day.

Take up your seats now, please. I wish to remind you that we were in the middle of a session where we are considering the Votes and Schedule. Order, hon members! We were busy putting Vote No 36 to the House. However, the Chief Whip of the Opposition rose on a point of order.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: House Chair, I would like to address you in terms of Rule 69(e), read with Rule 69(f). Just before the House adjourned, the hon

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 313

Dirks at the back of the Chamber was seen - and I saw him with my own eyes - visibly attempting to strike one of the members sitting next to him ... [Interjections.] ... one of the female members sitting next to him.

[Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Order! Order, hon members! Order! [Interjections.] Yes?

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: House Chairperson, not only is this unacceptable against a female member of the House ... [Interjections.] ... I would submit to you that the hon Dirks has violated Rule 69(e) and (f) of the House. For the safety of the members there and for the decorum of the House, I really think that he should be removed from the House, in terms of Rule 70, so that we can continue with the business of the day. [Applause.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Order, hon members! Order! The hon Chief Whip of the Majority Party? [Interjections.] Hon members, order!

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 314

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: House Chair, serious allegations have been made against a member of this House by members in that corner and we have, indeed, escalated these allegations to the head of the institution, the Speaker. Amongst those allegations are firstly, that serious insults have been thrown at our female members at the back, there. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Order, hon members!

Secondly, threats and gestures of assault have been made against members at the back, there. We have therefore asked those members to put in writing all those allegations so that we can, indeed, formally put them before the Speaker and the processes of Parliament - including the disciplinary processes of Parliament - can be brought to bear on anybody who has threatened any member of this House. Thank you very much. [Applause.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Thank you. Before I recognise you, hon Chief Whip of the Opposition, I would like to recognise the hon Singh.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 315

Mr N SINGH: Hon Chair, notwithstanding what the Chief Whip of the Majority Party has said, I think there is prima facie evidence that a member of this House threatened another member in a manner that is certainly not acceptable ... [Interjections.] ... and these Rules ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Order, hon members! Order!

Mr N SINGH: ... and these Rules, hon Chairperson, apply in the House, while we are here. While we appreciate what is going to happen after this, I think you should act and use your discretion from the Chair to act, in this House, in terms of the Rules. Thank you. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Order, hon members! I want to conclude this matter now. Yes, hon Steenhuisen?

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: House Chairperson, I accept what the Chief Whip of the Majority Party has said. However, this is a very serious matter.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 316

[Interjections.] It's not something that's a matter of here or there. This is a woman, a member of the House who has been threatened and had an attempted assault on her.

[Interjections.]

This is also aggravated by the fact that ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Order, hon members! Order!

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: It's aggravated by the fact that Mr Dirks is already before the Powers and Privileges Committee of Parliament for another event, when he undermined the authority of the Chair and disrupted the House. [Interjections.] I would submit that, in this instance, the appropriate sanction would be for the member to be asked to withdraw from the House in order for us to proceed. [Interjections.] I think it sends out a terrible message.

We all have our internal processes, but here, in the Chamber, the Rules must apply. I would really ask you to ask Mr Dirks to withdraw from the House so that we can

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 317

continue and the ANC can then follow whatever procedures they want to thereafter. [Interjections.] [Applause.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Before I recognise the EFF, I want to recognise the hon Minister of Defence and Military Veterans.

The MINISTER OF DEFENCE AND MILITARY VETERANS: Comrade Chair, hon members, if there has been a threat made against a woman in this House, right now, and if there is evidence of that, I think you should make a ruling. At the very least, you can make an undertaking that you will go and investigate that matter. [Interjections.] We are marking the 16 Days of Activism for No Violence against Women and Children campaign. [Applause.] We cannot have a man who is going to threaten women in this Chamber ... [Applause.] ... let alone to strangle her. I am sorry, Chair. [Applause.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Thank you, hon members. You may take your seats. You may take your seats. The EFF?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 318

Mr T RAWULA: Chair, the Rules of the House, in terms of the procedure, state that if there is ambiguity, the member should perhaps rise ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon member, I am chairing this session. I know the Rules.

Mr T RAWULA: No, that's fine.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Take your seat.

Mr T RAWULA: The point I want to make, Chair, is that the decorum of the House has been disturbed. As a result, we suspended proceedings in this House and wasted time, unnecessarily, because of his conduct. I wish to suggest that the member withdraw from the House.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Let's not repeat what other members have said simply to be heard.

Mr T RAWULA: Remove him.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 319

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Say something new to me.

Ms D CARTER: Chair, Cope also concurs with what everyone else has said. Thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon members, from where I was sitting, I did not see the incident occurring at the back. [Interjections.] No, no. I am the presiding officer. Unfortunately, you are not. [Interjections.] I did not see the incident that occurred there. I noticed there was a commotion in the area, there.

What I am going to do now is to ask the hon Dirks if these allegations that are being made of his conduct are correct, or not. Hon Dirks?

An HON MEMBER: Don't lie again!

Mr M A DIRKS: Hon Chairperson, the allegations made against me by the racist DA ... [Interjections.] ... and the cronies of the DA, of the IFP, the EFP cronies of the DA are not correct. [Interjections.] I have never been

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 320

involved in any altercation with any member at the back, here. Those allegations are devoid of any truth. The racist DA wants to make these allegations in the House. They want to do what they want to do, here.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Thank you, hon member. You have answered my question, and you know, we rely on the integrity and honesty of members in the House ... [Interjections.] ... No, no, no, hon members.

In light of the proposal that was made by the Chief Whip of the Majority Party - and let's keep the following in mind for all members. It is quite serious, if you are given the opportunity to give your side of the story. While this is not a disciplinary committee, it is quite serious if the information that ultimately comes forward is something different.

I don't want to conduct a disciplinary committee hearing from where I am sitting. I now want to proceed with the business of the day. Since the Speaker is here, I am going to request that we deal with this matter immediately after this sitting.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 321

Mr M WATERS: Chairperson, may I address you?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Yes.

Mr M WATERS: I just want to make two, quick points.

Firstly, you haven't asked the member in question who has been threatened what... [Interjections.] ... No! Why not?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Order! Order, hon members! Order!

Mr M WATERS: Why must the just perpetrator get a chance to speak?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon Waters, will you address me, please? [Interjections.] Order, hon members!

Mr M WATERS: Yes, Chair. If you're going to be fair, the member that has been threatened should be given an opportunity to present her case, firstly.

[Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 322

Secondly, we cannot continue with the proceedings in this House as if nothing has happened, while one member is being threatened at the back. [Interjections.] The hon Dirks is not even in his correct seat. I don't know why he is sitting at the back. He's deliberately trying to threaten an individual there.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon Waters, thank you for your input. [Interjections.]

Ms M S KHAWULA: Sorry ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): No, hon members, I have made a ruling now and that is how we are going to continue.

Ms M S KHAWULA: Sorry ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): I am not going to run ... Take your seat, hon member. I am not going to run disciplinary procedures out of a sitting here, in the Chair. It is incorrect, it is improper, and it will divert us from the business of the day. [Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 323

So, we are going to continue. What is your point of order, hon member?

IsiZulu:

Nk M S KHAWULA: Sihlalo, nginephuzu lokukhalima okuphambukayo. Khona ningakhuluma, inkathazeko yami iyodwa, eyokuthi lapho, njengoba uhlezi njengomshayeli kufanele Sihlalo usibhekelele ukuthi kukhona okwenzakalayo la, iyangimangaza uma uthi awubonanga futhi okwesibili, wumuntu wesifazane lo, asikwazi ngapha sitshelwe enye into ngapha kwenzeke enye into. Mina ngizocela ukuthi ngempela ukuthi masivikeleke la ngoba kusho ukuthi asiphephile lana. Kuyimanje kukhona laba okuthiwa, akwenzakalanga lutho. Sicela lolu daba niluthathele phezulu ngoba kusho ukuthi ayikho into esiyihlalele kuleliya komidi.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Thank you. You may now take your seat. Hon member I have made a ruling in that regard and we will continue like that.

Vote No 36 - Water and Sanitation - put.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 324

Mr P J MNGUNI: Sorry House Chair, on procedure ... I am here next to the main door. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon member.

[Interjections.]

Mr P J MNGUNI: House Chair, can you please listen to me?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): What is the point of order?

Mr P J MNGUNI: The systems are not working for some of the colleagues. Thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Okay. Hon members, you will notice that some of the screens may be blank. It has nothing to do with the voting system; the voting system that we will utilise is detached from the screen on your system and it has been designed in such a way that even if the screen in front of you is not working, the voting system will be operating. I hope that satisfies the point of order that you raised, hon member. Thank you.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 325

Division demanded.

The House divided.

[Voting take in from minutes]

Vote No 37 - Arts and Culture - put and agreed to
(Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Vote No 38 - Human Settlements - put.

Mr M N PAULSEN: House Chair, you must stop being in a hurry. I know you want to go on a holiday but we have an objection to the previous vote.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon member, if you are the person in charge of raising objections you must follow proceedings. Your objections to Vote No 37 - Arts and Culture, are you objecting to that Vote?

Mr M N PAULSEN: Yes.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 326

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Your objection will be recorded.

Vote No 38 - Human Settlements - put and agreed to (Democratic Alliance and Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Vote No 39 - Rural Development and Land Reform - put.

Division demanded.

The House divided.

Ms A STEYN: Hon House Chairperson, sorry, the hon - if I can call him that - Dirks has just shown a middle finger in our direction. All of us saw that. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon members, order! Order! Hon members! Hon members, the bells are ringing; I will deal with that point of order after we have completed the Vote. [Interjections.]

Dr M J FIGG: House Chairperson?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 327

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): No, hon member, I am not going to take points of order now; I want to put the Vote to the House and thereafter you can raise your point of order.

Dr M J FIGG: House Chair, it is not a new point of order.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): No, hon member, take your seat now. I want to complete the voting process. We are in the middle of a voting session.

[Voting take in from the minutes]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon Gungubele, I am busy with the voting session. I will take your point also after I have completed the voting on this.

Question agreed to.

Vote accordingly agreed to.

Ms D CARTER: House Chairperson, while you were busy, just before you gave the results, hon Dirks, showed the middle

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 328

finger again. [Interjections.] I have personally seen him three times. I don't believe that's the behaviour of a member. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Order! Hon members, order! Hon Dirks ... Order! Order! Hon members. Hon Dirks, these members are making allegations that you are showing the middle finger to them. What is your response?

Mr M A DIRKS: Hon House Chairperson, the DA camera there was focused on me all the time ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Did you or didn't you ... [Interjections.]

Mr M A DIRKS: No, let me explain to you ...
[Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): No, I don't want an explanation hon member, just say to us "Yes, I have done it" or "No, I have not done it".

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 329

Mr M A DIRKS: Those neoliberals are getting mad in their heads. They are mad!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon member, what is your response?

Mr M A DIRKS: I am saying that they are getting mad in their heads ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): No, you are not answering me, hon member. Did you show your middle finger to the hon members or not? [Interjections.]

Mr M A DIRKS: I am talking to my friend and those liberals are getting mad. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon member, you are not replying to my question. Have you shown the middle finger to the hon members or not?

Mr M A DIRKS: Why should I show a middle finger to liberals? [Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 330

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon member, it is a simple yes or no. [Interjections.]

Mr M A DIRKS: I will never show a middle finger to neoliberals! They are neoliberals, they are racist! Why should I show a middle finger to them? [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon member, take your seat. [Interjections.]

Mr M A DIRKS: They are racist! [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon member, there, you have just done it now. [Interjections.]

Mr M A DIRKS: I am asking you why should I ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon member, will you leave the House, please? [Interjections.] [Applause.]

IsiZulu:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 331

Nk M S KHAWULA: Ufuna amagobongo lo. Ufuna ukwenzelwa uphawu lo. Ufuna amagobongo lona, nesiphandla. Isiphandla siyadingeka lana. [Ubuwelewele.]

English:

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Order! Hon members, take your seats now. Order! [Interjections.]

Ms D CARTER: House Chairperson?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Order! Hon members, take your seats. Why are you rising now, hon member?

Ms D CARTER: Hon House Chairperson, I honestly believe that we need to get a breathalyser done because he is under the influence; He has been sitting at Barney's the whole day. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): No, hon member, take your seat. Your comments are completely inappropriate for a Member of Parliament. Let us not accuse each other of things that we are not sure of.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 332

Let's just lower the temperature a bit. I put Vote No 40
... [Interjections.]

Ms D CARTER: House Chair, it is not the temperature ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Please take your
seat, I have not recognised you. [Interjections.]

Ms D CARTER: ... he's been sitting in Barney's the whole
day. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Take your seat. I
have not recognised you.

Vote No 40 - Sport and Recreation South Africa - agreed
to (Democratic Alliance and Economic Freedom Fighters
dissenting).

Schedule - put.

Division demanded.

The House divided.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 333

[Voting take in from the minutes]

Question agreed to.

Schedule accordingly agreed to.

ADJUSTMENTS APPROPRIATION BILL

(Second Reading)

There was no debate.

Question put: That the Bill be read a second time.

Division demanded.

The House divided.

[TAKE IN FROM MINUTES]

Question agreed to.

Bill read a second time.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 334

FAREWELL SPEECHES

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: House Chairperson, I think is very sad that we have to end what has been a rather productive year on the note that we have ended it.

Just last week, the ANC benches burst into applause when I disciplined one of our caucus members who was in violation of the Rules. I would have expected the same from the ANC Whippers today, as this Parliament was denigrated in the way it was by Mr Dirks. We must all maintain discipline of our own parties, as well as discipline in the House. The behaviour we witnessed today, on the back of the 16 Days of Activism for No Violence against Women and Children campaign, was disgraceful.

Another year has passed, as quickly as the last. The year 2017 has been tumultuous, not only for Parliament but for South Africa as well. In February, Minister Dlamini brought the SA Social Security Agency, Sassa, to the brink of collapse, imperilling the lives of the 17 million of our countrymen and -women who rely on this

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 335

important social safety net. In March, the President for the second time dumped the country into crisis when he reshuffled his Cabinet, removing Minister Pravin Gordhan and his deputy, Mcebisi Jonas, together with 20 other changes that sent the markets crashing. Many couldn't work out what was behind these changes but, as the state capture dots are joined, the motives become clear for all to see.

In May, the #GuptaLeaks scandal laid bare the sheer scope and scale of state capture, revealing the rot at the heart of government and exposing billions of rand of people's money looted from the public purse in the biggest smash-and-grab in our democratic history. In August, the President survived his eight motion of no confidence and, with a secret ballot having been granted, the House witnessed the largest backbench rebellion, with 177 members of this House voting for his removal. In October, the Finance Minister tabled a budget full of doom and gloom but not a single solution, policy shift or bold new initiative to get us out of the mess or to create jobs for the 9,8 million of South Africans who do not have the dignity of work.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 336

In November, the President was allowed to blatantly ignore a straightforward question. As we head into December, we do so as an economy that has been junked by the ratings agencies because the executive is so completely incoherent that South Africans and the international community have lost hope in the ANC's ability to get their act together even after their conference. We find ourselves exiting 2017 with Mr Zuma still in the Union Buildings - the downgraded President of a downgraded economy.

Despite all this, there have been highlights: the stellar work done across all parties by the ad hoc committee on the SABC board inquiry, the portfolio committee's handling - across all parties - of the Sassa crisis, and this goes for Scopa as well; of course, the decision by the Speaker to allow a secret ballot; the portfolio committee's stellar work in the Public Enterprises Eskom inquiry; the consensus that has characterised our work in programming and the Chief Whips' Forum; and the wonderful celebrations we had around our Constitution.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 337

Perhaps all these challenges that we faced in 2017 have underscored more than ever before the important and essential role that this Parliament should be playing. We - all of us in this House - really are among the last watchmen left on the walls of our democracy. Never in the democratic history of our nation has this role been more essential or crucial. American slavery abolitionist Wendell Phillips bequeathed us the well-known quote that "eternal vigilance is the price of liberty". He went further to say that-

... the hand entrusted with power becomes, either from human depravity or *esprit de corps*, the necessary enemy of the people. Only by continual oversight can the democrat in office be prevented from hardening into a despot: only by unintermitted agitation can a people be kept sufficiently awake to principle not to let liberty be smothered in material prosperity.

The reality is that state capture did not emerge overnight. It didn't just spring up. It was a carefully planned process, a process that developed slowly,

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 338

methodically and with maximum malice – and it happened in full view of those in the executive who should have been watching, and who should have known better, and who should have, when the opposition raised the alarm, acted sooner.

Our vigilance has never been more important than it is now. This is a task no member of this House should take lightly or devalue, no matter the party t-shirt that they wear. We have seen, all of us, first hand the deceitful forces that have captured key institutions of our state, subverting these institutions' original intentions to serve, benefit and protect the people of South Africa instead of transforming them into ATMs and bodyguards for the connected few. We have seen the State Security Agency being turned into a political gossip factory that misses every single attack on our sovereignty and security as a nation yet is never short of smears or crudely drawn intelligence reports to taint a political rival or a handy break-in at an opponent's premises.

We have seen the elite corruption-busting Scorpions castrated and replaced by the tame and caged Hawks. They

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 339

are so captured, corrupted and compromised that we should rename them the "Lovebirds" instead. We have seen Sars go from an internationally respected and acclaimed collections agency to a veritable rogue's gallery of insiders and captured individuals whose only aim is to ensure their rich buddies get away with even more public money than they have already stolen. That is why we, all of us, are called upon to now break the cynical cycle of corruption and capture.

Since we have now passed the halfway mark of this Fifth Parliament's life, it is a good time to examine the role of the House and its place in our democracy. There can be no better stimulus for this discussion than the recently released high-level panel assessment of key legislation and the acceleration of fundamental change. It is a welcome body of work, and I really do hope that members, after the events at Nasrec, will spend their Christmas recess studying it closely. I do think that we should pause and ask ourselves, as members of this House, the following: Why?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 340

Why was it that a high-level panel had to find that 0,4% of our GDP is spent on land reform and this last year saw the lowest amount of land transferred since 1994? It is a fact that 13 974 tourists or investors were denied boarding on South African-bound flights because of the disastrous unabridged birth certificate policy. Thanks to this policy, we are likely to lose 578 000 tourists per year, a loss of over R7,51 billion. I bet the former Home Affairs Minister and current Finance Minister could really do with that R7 billion right now. Who knows how many jobs have been lost. It also found that Parliament remains far too dependent on the executive, which operates in silos, to draft law. This manifests a lack of integrated approach. The truth is that we should have been doing this work, we should have been doing the monitoring, and we should have been doing the engagement. We can only do this if we are empowered as Members of Parliament to do so.

We have been set as watchmen on the wall by the people of South Africa. It is their interest we must always safeguard. Our duties have been assigned to us by the Constitution of the Republic, and we must always meet

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 341

them, for it is us that will be held accountable if the walls of democracy are breached by the forces of evil and tyranny.

Ezekiel 6:3 says the following: If the watchman sees the enemy coming and doesn't sound the alarm to warn the people, he is responsible for their captivity, and he will be held accountable. We have much work to do in 2018 to improve our vigilance and resolve to transform this House into a true arena of accountability, a people-centred institution and one that genuinely advances the interests, hopes, dreams and aspirations of all our people.

Let me end by thanking all of those people who operate behind the scenes, who keep our Parliament running. Let me also extend a very big thank you to the National Assembly Table for their hard work, long hours and dedication, as well as Mr Xaso, Mr Mahlangu, and Mr Mbanga and their offices for their patience and always-unfailing willingness to assist. I think we should also extend a thank you to the Acting Secretary to Parliament, Mrs Penny Tyawa, who stepped into her position in very

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 342

difficult circumstances and has, in the short time she has been there, transformed the draconian and oppressive management style that existed before.

To my opposite number the Chief Whip Jackson Mthembu and his deputy Doris Dlakude, thank you for your leadership of the Whippery of the House. Thanks to the chief whips of the other opposition parties who have worked so hard and so well this year and for the terrific co-operation. I think we should remember specifically, as we close this annual session, the honourable Tim Khoza and the honourable Tarnia Baker who both lost their lives in service of this House and their nation. We remember them today with respect and affection.

I wish you well during this Christmas period and hope you to enjoy your time away with your families. Come back rested and well. We have a lot of work to do in 2018. We look forward to seeing you all when we resume the people's business. As I end with a quote from a poem by our very own Joanmariae Fubbs' latest collection, *Humanity's Covenant with Life*, we must remember the people are:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 343

Waiting and waiting
For a new tomorrow
The clouded horizon
Is pierced by silent hope
That seeks beyond today

Thank you. [Applause.]

IsiZulu:

Nk M S KHAWULA: Ngiyabonga Sihlalo, egameni le-EFF asibonge ukuthi uNkulunkulu noma izinyanya zethu zikwazile ukusigcina saze safika ekupheleni walo nyaka sisaphila, noma nje abanye bethu ebesibathanda ebesisebenza nabo behambile, basishiya emhlabeni sithi abaphumule ngoxolo.

Kunomyalezo engithanda ukuwedlulisa la ukuthi njengoba silapha kufuneka sazi ukuthi akekho owahamba wayofunda ethi ufundela ukuba yilungu lePhalamende. Njengoba ulapha ukhonjwe umunwe kaNkulunkulu ukuthi sizohlangana lapha sisebenze - sisebenzele isizwe sakithi esintulayo esasicindezelwe iminyaka ngeminyaka. Namanje okutholakala ukuthi noma sithi kukhona inkanyezi ekhona kodwa

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 344

akukafiki nokukodwa esingakubala - abantu basacindezelekile.

Ngiphinde ngicele ukuthi abantu bakithi abafunde ukonga imali. Kungathi ngoba wuKhisimuzi uthathe imali yakho uyothenga lezi zinto ezishibhisiwe, ukhohlwe ukuthi ngoMasingana izingane zibuyela esikoleni. [Ubuwelewele.] Uze uzokhuluma iphutha uthi uKhisimuzi uyidle wayiqeda imali yami. Ukhisimuzi awukaze wadla mali yamuntu. [Ubuwelewele.] Nguwena osebenzise imali ngokungacabangi.

Ngiphinde ngixwayise laba abathinta amanzi amponjwana ngoba izingozi zingaka nje emgwaqeni ubudedengu bokuthi ukuze uthole ubumnandi kufuneka uphuze into ezokudida umqondo - utshwala. Okokuqala nje ugcina manje usufile, ngaleyo ndlela ubulale umndeni wakho obuthembele kuwe ngoba ubukade ufaka isinkwa manje awusasifaki. Ubulala nabantu abaningi osubashayisile ngokuhluleka nje ukulandela imithetho yomgwaqo ibe izimpawu zomgwaqo zikhona. Ngiyajabula ukubona amaphoyisa esebenza.

Ngizoke ngikhulume nje la eWestern Cape lapho engangithunyelwe khona mangithi ngiyadlula, hhayi bo,

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 345

nayi itekisi lilayishe abantu abanye baze bema ngezinyawo. Ngivele ngathandaza ngaso lesosikhathi ngathi Nkulunkulu sengathi kungavela amaphoyisa. Mangithi nanka amaphoyisa, ngathi Jehova ngiyabonga ngoba yonke into iyenzeka. Amaphoyisa ehlisa abantu abangama-30 etekisini. Imoto nemoto inesikali esishoyo ukuthi ithatha abantu abangaki. Nawe Ngqongqoshe Wezokuthutha ngicela ulungise le KwaMaphumulo, emakhaya izikhukhula ziqedile imigwaqo.

Ngiphinde futhi ngizoxwayisa wena obusuhlele ukuthi ngoZibandlela uzohamba uyobulala umuntu. Uzibandlela noma uKhisimuzi akuwona wokubulala, inyanga leyo yokuthi sithandane noma bekade singezwani - asithandaneni. Ake wenze ukuthi uma umakhelwane wakho eceleni akanako ukudla ubukade uxabane naye, zama ubuyele namhlanje engakafiki uKhisimuzi uthi: Sawubona, ubheke ukuthi unani bese umthengele ukudla. Ukhisimuzi isikhathi esihle sobumnandi, sokuphana izipho, hhayi sokuthenga izibhamu.

Bese ngithe okokugcina bakithi khona into eningayazi.

Yabona, njengoba silapha singomama asifuni ukubona noyedwa umuntu ehluke omunye. Ngaleyo ndlela sinifisela nani eniya laphaya kuNgqungquthela yenu

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 346

nihambe noNkulunkulu. Vese kakade uma singabosopolotiki ngeke sivume ngazwi linye, imibono iyohlukana. Phansi izibhamu! Izibhamu azingeni kwipolitiki, sekuwukuphupha kwayo. Ngiyabonga. [Ihlombe.]

Mr N SINGH: Hon Speaker, it is a pity that after all the hard work that has been done during the course of the year and in the last few weeks, the headlines in tomorrow's newspaper could read; ANC conference tension plays itself out in Houses of Parliament.

Hon Speaker, to say that this year has been taxing, tumultuous and fraught with challenges would be to understate its complexity as well as the sheer volumes of the parliamentary workload we have navigated. The portfolio committees, their members and staff, political parties, their members and staff have been all been taxed to the nth degree, but in credit to us all, we have risen to the challenge. Our country is currently seized by the cancer of state capture with its promise of sheer devastation to our economy and people if not timeously arrested by this parliament.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 347

Certain family names associated with state capture, two in particular, are now internationally famous or infamous, depending on which side of house you come from.

The year of; two Cabinet reshuffles, a motions of no confidence which saw members of the ruling party breaking away from their party and voting for a motion of no confidence, a year when South Africans marched to the Union Buildings and a hundred ANC stalwarts called on President Zuma to step down.

This was the year of economic downgrades, endless allegations of corruption but however this was also a year of hope, a year of promise and it was a year of South Africans taking action for their futures and making their voices heard through the channels of active citizenry. It has also been the year for medical innovation ... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF SMALL BUSINESS DEVELOPMENT: A point of order, Chair.

IsiZulu:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 348

USOMLOMO: Hawu! Angikaze ngiyizwe ku-farewell speeches pho. [Uhleko.]

English:

Yes, hon Minister, what is the point of order?

The MINISTER OF SMALL BUSINESS DEVELOPMENT: The point of order, Chairperson, is that hon Khawula has just made a real hope and everything for us all here. Then, why do we have to have farewell speeches that are not farewell speeches but political statements? Why must we seat here and listen to people who are not doing that ...

[Interjections.]

IsiZulu:

USOMLOMO: Cha, kulungile Sisi.

The MINISTER OF SMALL BUSINESS DEVELOPMENT: ... but who are insulting us in the House. Why should we listen to that? ...

The SPEAKER: Minister, it is okay. It is okay, Minister, it is their farewell speeches let them deliver them.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 349

IsiZulu:

UNGQONGQOSHE WEZOKUTHUTHUKISWA KWAMABHIZINISI AMANCANE:

Hhayi, asifuni ama-farewell speeches abhedayo njengalento abayikhulumayo.

The SPEAKER: Please, please, hon Minister ...

[Interjections.]

IsiZulu:

UNGQONGQOSHE WEZOKUTHUTHUKISWA KWAMABHIZINISI AMANCANE:

Nami ngishaya eyami i-farewell speech. Niyabheda!

[Ubuwelewele.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, please, take your seat.

Please, proceed, hon Singh.

Mr N SINGH: Hon Speaker, one thing we have learnt in this democratic order is freedom of choice. If certain members don't want to listen the doors are open. There is nobody

there to lock the doors, please, leave if you want to.

Hon Deputy President, give them the advice. Chair, you will have to give me some extra time here.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 350

It has also been the year for medical innovation with the coming into regulation of all the objects as contained in the IFPs medical innovation Bill, first proposed by Dr Ambrosini. The IFP has felt the loss and absence of our Secretary General, hon Nkomo, whose health has prevented her from attending Parliament for some time. We will continue to pray for her full recovery. We have welcomed new members this year and said goodbye to some members that we have redeployed in order to ensure the resolute success of the party in the 2019 National Elections.

It has been a year as well of further education and learning for some of us Members of Parliament and I hope that Member of Parliament does some further learning, myself included, where we undertaking further tertiary studies. Many of us have had books published as well, the late Dr Ambrosini with his posthumous book entitled, *The Prince and I*. To our very special chairperson and birthday lady, Ms Joan Fubbs, who published a book on poetry, well done, hon Fubbs.

In closure and on behalf of the IFP, I wish to thank each and every one of you seated here and all the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 351

parliamentary staff and personnel for the camaraderie and for the good spirit in which we have collectively engaged in issues before this House. I wish you and your families a very happy, healthy, safe festive season, a joyous and successful 2018. I thank you, hon Speaker. [Applause.]

Prof M N KHUBISA: Hon Speaker and hon members, the time of year has finally come where families unite in a shared fellowship, a time of friendship, warmth, rest and peace. However, Speaker, we cannot walk away from 2017 without taking a last look back upon the year that was. It has been a year with ups and downs but when all is said and done, we are thankful that all efforts and actions were and still are geared towards nation building.

During 2017, our economy remained underperforming and of course it is still underperforming. In fact, our economy remains in the grip of political contestation and is battered by credit downgradings which impact negatively on our ability to nurture economic growth. We have also seen that corruption continues to flourishing because we have a serious lack of sound financial control in most of our departments and state-owned entities. High

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 352

unemployment continues to haunt us and poverty levels are increasing slowly but surely.

However, all is not doom and gloom, Speaker. We have made major strides here in Parliament this year in holding the executive to account if we compare to the past years.

There is a new breeze blowing through the corridors of power here in Parliament, a breeze that speaks of the spirit of the people moving us closer to the ideals of transparency and accountability. For some time now Parliament has operated in the shadow of the executive, but that is about to change. The breeze of change is blowing indeed.

We have also witnessed Parliament closing ranks in the face of pernicious maladministration at the SABC and other entities in a rare display of how Parliament should be operating. For once again, we got it right asserting the powers vested in us as public representatives and sending out a strong signal that Parliament has got teeth and will bite if necessary. It is our wish as the NFP, that this spirit of unity and co-operation will be carried through in the new year when we return to face

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 353

the challenges that await us in 2018. As we head for the festive season with this joy and laughter, family fellowship and gives sumptuous meals, let us pause for a moment and remember that for many, this will not be a time of festivities and joy.

Many of our people will continue to be hungry, they will continue to be poor and they need our care. We can change that if we unite in a common concern for the people if we put differences aside and take hands to help build a better 2018 for all our people. Finally, the National Freedom Party wishes all members of the House, Yourself hon Speaker, the Secretary of Parliament and all officials and workers of Parliament a blessed and peaceful holiday season. May you all find happiness over the festive season and may your new year be prosperous. Thank you very much. [Applause.]

Mr N L S KWANKWA: Hon Speaker, I think the critical question we must ask ourselves and Deputy President, and in particular, the members of the ANC is whether we want to continue to turn Parliament into a congress floor or rather that focussing on the issues that are important to

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 354

the nation. We tend to turn it into a forum for factional battles. This centres on the issue of ensuring that we provide value-based leadership in everything that we do. We must as leaders here, ensure that everything we do is guided and underpinned by the values of honesty, openness, compassion, long term perspective and human rights.

The nice thing about values, you can add a long list here, is that they transcend context and party political differences. I would like at this point to quote what Rosabeth Moss Kanter, professor at Harvard Business School, a chair and director of Harvard Advanced Leadership Initiative, at what she says on this issue of values she says:

In the face of turbulence and change, culture and values become the major source of continuity and coherence of renewal and sustainability. Leaders must be institution-builders who imbue the organisation with meaning that inspires today and endures tomorrow. They must find the common purpose and universal values that unite highly diverse

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 355

people while still permitting individual identities to be expressed and enhanced.

That is the kind of leadership in our view that we should be expressing in trying to building a better South Africa for all. However, to the African National Congress and maybe to the rest of us here in this House, I want to say, quoting from what Woodrow Wilson once said in 1907, because this accurately captures the state of our nation at the present moment and what is happening in the African National Congress, he said and I quote:

We live in an age disturbed, confused, bewildered and afraid of its own forces, in search not merely of its road but even of its direction. There are many voices of counsel, but few voices of vision, there is much excitement and feverish activity but little concert of thoughtful purpose. We are distressed by our own ungoverned, undirected energies and do many things, but nothing long. It is our duty to find ourselves.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 356

I think that is important as you go to even your elective congress. Fellow South Africans, I want to remind us again, of this important task that we all have an individual and collective responsibility to build a citizen centric, united, nonracial, nonsexist and democratic South Africa that is able to take its rightful place as a sovereign state in the family of nations. Good luck to you the African National Congress as you go to the elective congress. South Africa needs you as we continue towards 2019, to build a South Africa in which we all look forward to the sundries of our tomorrow. May you all have a joyous festive season and a prosperous new year. We thank you.

Dr C P MULDER: Hon Speaker, hon members, we have come to the end of another long political year in South Africa. It was not an easy year; it was a difficult year, to a certain extent. I think it is important that we all realise, as members, that, in the end, it is not about us.

It should never be about us, as individual members. We should never forget that we are all representing millions

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 357

of South Africans out there, jointly, who put their faith and trust in Parliament as an institution and in us to represent them and their interests. Sometimes, I get the idea that we sometimes forget that, and that we do not focus on what is in the best interest of the electorate out there who sent us here to represent them.

Afrikaans:

Aan die einde van die jaar, wil ek baie dankie sê aan al die partye en al die kollegas met wie ons saamgewerk het. Dit was 'n moeilike, lang jaar met hoogtepunte en laagtepunte.

English:

What we should understand is that trust is built and it takes years to build it in an institution like Parliament. However, we can destroy that trust in a very short span of time, if we do not behave in an explicated manner, to the best interest of everybody out there.

I know that there are a lot of conflict and critique on the presiding officers. I understand that, but I think we should also be fair. I don't think that we have seen any

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 358

other presiding offices since 1994 that had to deal with things that have happened in this House during this fifth Parliament.

We have had things that we had to deal with here that we have never experienced before. So, it is easy to say that this and that is wrong, but we should also be honest and recognise that reality.

Afrikaans:

Ons gaan weg van hier om te gaan rus. Ek dink dit is goed dat ons gaan rus, want ons almal weet dat volgende jaar die jaar is voor die verkiesing.

English:

I have an idea that 2019 is going to be some election. Everything indicates that it will be some real hard election. So, next year, the political climate will be much more elevated than it was even now. So, I would suggest that we all go home and rest well and come back refreshed for the new year.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 359

I want to say thank you to all the colleagues. Thank you to the parliamentary personnel, the protection services, the catering services, the press and everybody that is looking after us, and last, but not least, to the people out there who put their faith in us and who sent us here to represent them. We should never let them down. It is not about us; it is about them. Thank you. [Applause.]

Ms D CARTER: Speaker, it was the best of times, it was the worst of time; it was the age of wisdom, it was the age of foolishness; it was the epoch of belief, it was the epoch of incredulity; it was the season of light, it was the season of darkness; it was the spring of hope, it was the winter of despair.

The opening stanza to Charles Dickens's *Tale of Two Cities* sums up the tale of this House this year.

We have witnessed the foolishness, incredulity, darkness and despair of rampant corruption, looting, state capture and a seemingly inability of this House to collectively exercise oversight and to hold the executive to account.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 360

More recently, however, there has been a glimmer of hope, a season of light. The Congress of the People thanks this House for the collective action taken to commence a process to address the scourge of state capture.

We hope that this is the beginning of an age of wisdom, an epoch of belief that Parliament will begin to assert itself and take on its role of ensuring government by the people under the Constitution.

Speaker, I wish you, all the members of this House and all the staff the best of times, wisdom, belief, light and hope during this festive season. I thank you.

[Applause.]

Rev K R J MESHOE: Speaker, it has indeed been a very busy, tiring year with many challenges. We in the ACDP are grateful that we have been able to end this year on a particularly high note, with hon Cheryllyn Dudley's historic private members' Bill on Paternity Leave being unanimously accepted by this House. It shows that we can work together across political party lines to legislate

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 361

for the common good. This, we believe, brings hope to the nation. We are deeply grateful for the support.

This coming week, some members will still be busy with the Eskom inquiry, while others will be preparing for a significant conference. It is necessary to pray for this ANC conference for the will of God to be done. Political stability and peace in the land will depend on its outcome to a certain degree.

I wish to thank the Speaker, Deputy Speaker, House Chairs and parliamentary staff. Without their assistance, we could not perform our constitutional obligations. We also wish to thank all media representatives who keep the nation informed and bring Parliament to the people.

Sadly, a number of Members of Parliament have passed away this year, two of whom tragically died, whilst performing their parliamentary duties - Tim Khoza of the ANC and Tarnia Barker of the DA. Let us remember their families in our prayers this Christmas season, as they will be without a father and a mother. Let us also be mindful of how fragile and short life is.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 362

This December, we celebrate the 50th anniversary of the first heart transplant in the world. It took place at Groote Schuur Hospital right here in Cape Town. As we reflect on the significance of this event, let us pray and trust the Lord for a new heart for our nation, and that hard hearts of stone will be replaced with hearts of flesh, and that we would see love, peace, and joy, in our nation.

There have been many prayers of repentance for our nation, including right here in Parliament. Let us be instruments of love, joy and peace, and agents of reconciliation and nation-building. Let us use our words carefully and wisely, as they have the power of life and death.

Lastly, as I wish all members well and I will now invoke the Aaronic blessing on us all:

May the Lord bless you and keep you. May the Lord make His face shine upon you and be gracious to you. May the Lord lift up his countenance upon you and give you peace.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 363

The ACDP wishes you all a blessed Christmas with your families and a prosperous New Year.

Mr M A PLOUAMMA: Hon Speaker, hon members, on behalf of the AIC, myself and Mr Mahomapelo, I wish you all a good and peaceful festive season. Those who are going to their conference do not through chairs at each other or injure one another.

I urge them not to elect the President Zuma puppet, in order to avoid a Grace Mugabe scenario. If you want a woman President, the Speaker is available. [Applause.]

To the Speaker, hon Baleka Mbete, you have made history this year by allowing a secret ballot. [Applause.] You truly deserve a holiday. You once allowed democracy to win.

To those who voted to keep President Zuma, use this festive season for repentance and soul-searching.

[Laughter.] You made a historic mistake.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 364

To the Deputy Speaker and all presiding officers, you have done your duty with unimaginable patience.

To hon President Zuma, give us a Christmas present and resign this festive season.

To the Guptas, I wish you to leave this country voluntarily. May your festive season be filled with the suffering of our people and the struggle of the unemployed youth.

To all the staff of Parliament, thank you to all your assistance. To all South Africans, please take care and drive safely during this festive season. I thank you.

[Applause.]

IsiZulu:

USOTSWEBHU WEQEMBU ELIBUSAYO: Siyabonga Somlomo, sibonge nakuleNdlu yesiShayamthetho saseNingizimu Afrika, mayelana nomsebenzi omuhle esikwazile ukuwenza sibambisene. Umhlonishwa u-Fubbs, wusuku lwakhe lokuzalwa namhlanje. [Ihlombe.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 365

English:

She is 73-years-old. Happy birthday! Happy birthday!

[Applause.]

The House singing a happy birthday song. [Laughter.]

Of course again, she has made us proud by publishing a book of 47 poems. Congratulations. [Applause.]

Speaker, we extend our well wishes to members of this Parliament as they wrap up their parliamentary work for 2017. We salute our public representatives for the dedicated and selfless service. You know I always tell people and speak from my heart that you know most of the time; we are away from our families, away and away from our loved ones and away from our kids. We spend most of our time here. All of us except those of course who come from Cape Town. However, many of us do not come from Cape Town. We spend our time here, day in and day out in service of our people. [Applause.]

In fact, we must thank our families for allowing us to do this national task. We must thank them. We hardly thank

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 366

them. So, that is why we are saying as we end this third year of the fifth democratic Parliament, we must during this festive season, go back to our families and indeed be closer to them and once again bond with them.

Hon Speaker, we end the year of 2017 as other colleagues have said, having lost three serving members of this Parliament. We remember the contributions of the hon Timothy Khoza and the hon Trevor Bonhomme of the ANC, both ANC Members of Parliament and indeed the hon Tania Baker of the DA. May their sole rest in peace and may their lives remain a beautiful memory in our hearts and minds.

We would like to wish the hon Pieter Mulder of the FF Plus well as he takes retirement from Parliament. We had wonderful ululations about the 28 to 29 years that he has given to the people of South Africa as a Member of Parliament, MP. I think once again, we can give him a round of applause. [Applause.]

Hon Speaker, the realisation of the ANC's policies and programmes that are designed to radically improve the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 367

material conditions of our people require robust and fearless parliamentary oversight over the executive. Members of Parliament have, as the representatives of the people, actively engaged and intervened in matters affecting the state and the public at large.

We know that we have intervened on the SA Social Security Agency, Sassa matters. Decisively as Parliament, we have intervened and wanted to know from the Health Minister, what was happening or what happened at the Life Esidimeni? For we are public representatives. We engaged with those matters.

We are also intervening on the matters of state-owned entities, SOEs, in particular Eskom. Through the SA Broadcasting Corporation, SABC, enquiry, Parliament played a critical role in stopping the rot at that institution and repositioned the public broadcaster as a national asset that serves our people.

The parliamentary inquiry currently underway into Eskom is unearthing governance failures which have had a dire impact on our power utility. We thank the members of the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 368

Portfolio Committee on Public Enterprises for their ongoing and outstanding work and look forward to their report in the New Year. We condemn acts of intimidation to members and staff of this committee has been subjected to. These acts of intimidation only prove that greater oversight is necessary at this state-owned company.

The ANC study groups where Ministers and their Deputies participate as ANC MPs, have served as a platform where difficult questions are asked by MPs to right wrongs, even before matters are dealt with by portfolio committees. However, similar questions were advanced with the necessary fierceness and boldness on both the portfolio committees and House plenary platforms. We are confident that the good examples of effective parliamentary oversight will carry through until the end of this Fifth Parliament.

We observed ongoing positive engagement between members of the executive and Parliament. The executive as led by the President of the Republic Comrade Jacob Zuma and the Deputy President, Comrade Cyril Ramaphosa in his capacity as Leader of Government Business, regularly interacted

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 369

with both Houses of Parliament to ensure accountability to Parliament.

These appearances include the state of nation address, Sona, responses to the Sona debate, Budget Votes, appearances in the National Assembly, NA, and the NCOP for responses to oral questions. Through these mechanisms, we have been able to inform our people about our government in areas of the economy, peace, security, social transformation and governance.

As part of its law-making function, Parliament processed over 26 Bills in the National Assembly and the National Council of Provinces during this year. We successfully engaged in the process of the Appropriations Bill and the Adjustment Appropriations Bill which sets to appropriate money from the National Revenue Fund for the requirements of the state for the 2017-18 financial year.

Other crucial Bills passed are the Financial Intelligence Centre Amendment Bill, the Financial Sector Regulation Bill and the Insurance Bill. This House also recently adopted the interim report on the transformation of the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 370

financial sector which aims to ensure that the financial sector benefits all classes and strata, but primarily the poor and lower income earners and contribute to the reduction of inequalities.

Through its Standing Committee on the Auditor-General, AG, Parliament is proposing the Public Audit Amendment Bill, an important Bill. This Bill empowers the AG to refer undesirable audit outcomes to an appropriate body for further investigation. It will also empower the AG to issue a certificate of debt to recover losses in certain instances against the accounting officer or accounting authority accountable for those losses.

The ANC salutes the late Dr Mario Oriani-Ambrosini of the IFP, who was the first member to introduce a Private Members' Bill in the National Assembly. Though his Medical Innovation Bill will not enter the Statute Book, his dying wish to have the use of cannabis legalised for medical and research purposes have been achieved through Parliament's rigorous engagement with the Department of Health and guidelines developed by the Medicines Control Council. [Applause.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 371

This year also saw the historic passing of a Private Members' Bill by the National Assembly. We congratulate hon Cheryllyn Dudley of the ACDP who authored the Labour Laws Amendment Bill to enable all of us as fathers to take more days on paternity leave. Amandla! [Applause.]

In June this year, Parliament set up an ad hoc committee to inquire into political party funding in South Africa. This was informed by the ANC's desire to ensure that the country has a comprehensive system of public funding of representative political parties in the different spheres of government in order to strengthen, support and promote democracy. In this regard, the ANC has advanced that accountability and transparency be the key principles that guide this process.

The committee was tasked with considering a model of public and private funding for political parties and the need for, and possible means of, regulating private funding in all its forms as well as investment entities owned by political parties.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 372

We thank the members of this committee who worked tirelessly in the past six months to ensure that the ANC's congress resolutions are implemented. We express our profound gratitude to the individuals, organisations, and stakeholders who participated in this process, and contributed to the development of the Political Party Funding Bill.

Hon Speaker, let us end by saying, you know hon members, as the parliamentary year ends, we would like to wish each an every one of you a Merry Christmas and a happy New Year. Please, just spend some time with your families. You know, we might be everywhere else, but when push comes to shove people who will be with us when we need people around us, are our families. Speaker, thank you, very much. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members, I wish to make a few remarks just before we adjourn. We commenced the year with our year long reflection and celebration of the 20th year of our Constitution and the establishment of the NCOP. Collectively, we underscored that the Constitution continues to be the bedrock of our society. The

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 373

production of the rest of the theme committee books is progressing well as the continuation is still underway.

A big thank you to the portfolio committees that managed their work with great care and diligence despite the vast amounts of work.

Hon members, for your holiday reading, I urge you to read the High-Level Panel Report on the Assessment of Key Legislation and Acceleration of Fundamental Change, which was released on 21 November 2017 and which was workshopped yesterday here in Parliament. [Applause.] We thank the panel for the good work done.

We also continue to keep gender on the national agenda and hosted an International Women's Conference in our Parliament.

Hon members, we were shocked and deeply saddened by the tragic loss of the three hon members whose names have already been mentioned. We shall keep their loved ones in our thoughts and prayers.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 374

A word of appreciation to the President, the Leader of Government Business and the rest of the executive.

[Applause.] I also wish to thank the Chief Whips of political parties for your support of the parliamentary business as well as the Members of Parliament. I know the Chief Whips are having a tour of other parliaments in January. We hope that you will enjoy the bonding and that Parliament, will indeed gain from your bonding.

[Laughter.]

Much appreciation to the Deputy Speaker Lechesa Tsenoli and the House Chairpersons, Mr Frolick, Ms Didiza and Ms Boroto for assisting me to ensure the smooth running of Parliament through their focussed work on their delegated areas. [Applause.]

I wish to extend my gratitude to the Acting Secretary to Parliament, Ms Baby Tyawa and the National Assembly Secretary, Mr Masibulele Xaso for their tremendous support throughout the year. We thank all the staff for their hard work for making our lives much easier. We must highlight the fact that we appreciate the fact that as a workplace we finally quietened the labour rumblings and

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2017

Page: 375

continue with a focus programme to improve good relations between staff and management.

Of course, a special word of thanks and appreciation to my team. Thank you for putting in the long hours sometimes amidst very trying circumstances.

Hon members, it is my pleasure to conclude the business of the House for 2017. Please enjoy your much needed break and time for your families and loved ones. Above all else be safe on the roads as we need you to be invigorated and ready for 2018. Hon members that conclude the farewell speeches and the business for this session.

[Applause.]

The House adjourned at 19:49.